



International Programme on the Elimination of Child Labour (IPEC)



International
Labour
Office

IPEC Evaluation

**Panama Country Programme to fight the
worst forms of child labour**

**P 260.08.241.050
PAN/02/P50/USA**

An independent final evaluation by an external consultant

February 2006

NOTE ON THE EVALUATION PROCESS AND REPORT

This independent evaluation was managed by ILO-IPEC's Design, Evaluation and Documentation Section (DED) following a consultative and participatory approach. DED has ensured that all major stakeholders were consulted and informed throughout the evaluation and that the evaluation was carried out to highest degree of credibility and independence and in line with established evaluation standards.

The evaluation was carried out a team of external consultants¹. The field mission took place in February 2006. The opinions and recommendations included in this report are those of the authors and as such serve as an important contribution to learning and planning without necessarily constituting the perspective of the ILO or any other organization involved in the project.

Funding for this project evaluation was provided by the United States Department of Labor. This report does not necessarily reflect the views or policies of the United States Department of Labor nor does mention of trade names, commercial products, or organizations imply endorsement by the United States Government.

¹ **Sylvia Matos**

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Acronyms and Abbreviations	4
1.Executive Summary	5
2.Introduction	10
2.1. Background	10
2.2. Purpose and users of the evaluation	11
2.3 Methodology of the evaluation	12
3. Design of the project.	14
3.1 General design of the project	14
3.2 Indicators	16
4. Main findings of the evaluation	19
4.1. Beginning process of the project	19
4.2. Achievements in the increase of diffusion on child labour issues	20
4.3 Achievements in the creation of capacities	25
Coordination between the country program and other interventions of the IPEC	38
4.5. Achievements in the development of a national plan	39
National Plan for the Eradication of Child Labour	39
4.6. Achievements in the improvement of the legal framework	40
4.7. Achievements within rural and urban action plans	42
4.7.1. Selection for regions of execution and implementing agency	42
4.7.2. Action Program proposals' design	43
4.7.3. Beginning of direct action programs:	45
4.7.4. Achievements in the separation of one thousand children form dangerous child labour, ant their regular assistance to school with total attention:	46
4.7.5. Achievements in the access of parents to alternative means of income:	49
4.7.6. Achievements in the sensitization and mobilization of local organizations against child labour.....	51
5. Sustainability:.....	55
6. Pertinence:	56
7. Conclusions	56
8.Lessons learned and good potential practices	59
9. Recommendations considering a possible second phase:	61

Acronyms and Abbreviations

APSO	Guía Sumaria del Programa de Acción (Summary Guide of the Action Plan)
CETIPPAT	Comité Nacional para la Erradicación del Trabajo Infantil (National Council for the Eradication of Child Labour)
CONATO	Consejo Nacional de Trabajadores Organizados (National Council of Organized Workers)
CNP	Consejo Nacional de Periodismo (National Council of Journalism)
CONEP	Consejo Nacional de la Empresa Privada (National Council for the Private Industry)
EMT	Evaluación de Medio Término (Mid-Term Evaluation)
ESCN	Explotación Sexual Comercial Infantil (Commercial Child Sexual Exploitation)
EPFTI	Erradicación de las Peores Formas de Trabajo Infantil (Eradication for the worst forms of Child Labour)
IFARHU	Instituto para la Formación y Aprovechamiento de Recursos Humanos (Institute for the training and use of Human Resources)
INAFORP	Instituto Nacional de Formación Profesional (National Institute for Occupational Training)
MEDUCA	Ministerio de Educación (Ministry of Education)
MIDA	Ministerio de Desarrollo Agropecuario (Ministry of Agricultural Development)
MIDES	Ministerio de Desarrollo Social (Ministry of Social Development)
MINSA	Ministerio de Salud (Ministry of Health)
MITRADEL	Ministerio de Trabajo y Desarrollo Laboral (Ministry of Labour and Work Development)
NNAT	Niños, niñas y personas adolescentes trabajadoras (Boys, Girls and Teenage Workers)
PAD	Programa de Acción Directo (Direct Action Plan)
PADU	Programa de Acción Directa Urbana (Urban Direct Action Plan)
PADR	Programa de Acción Directa Rural (Rural Direct Action Plan)
PD	Plan de Divulgación del Programa País de EPFTI (Country Program Publishing Plan of EPFTI)
PFTI	Peores Formas de Trabajo Infantil (Worst Forms of Child Labour)
SIMPOC	Programa Estadístico de Información y Monitoreo de Trabajo Infantil (Child Labour Statistical Information and Monitoring Program)
SPIF	Marco Estratégico del Impacto del Programa (Strategic Framework for the Impact of the Program)
TI	Trabajo Infantil (Child Labour)
TIP	Trabajo Infantil Peligroso (Dangerous Child Labour)
TID	Trabajo Infantil Doméstico (Domestic Child Labour)

1. Executive Summary

The present document is the result of the evaluation of the program to eradicate the worst forms of child labour in Panama, which took place between January and February of 2006. The first part of the evaluation mission was dedicated to the systematic review of documents produced by the program, documents of program execution, and documents of the design of the program. The second part was oriented to the collection of first source information in Panama through personal interviews and focus groups with different people connected to the program throughout its execution, as well as visits to the execution areas. The evaluation mission finished with a workshop for the interested parts in which the first results of the evaluation were presented, the reached objectives were discussed and the contributions of the attending people were collected in synthesis.

Among the main conclusions of this report we would like to point out, first, that the main advances of the Project are the information publishing and diffusion work within the Panamanian society, which is sensitized with child labour and includes sectors that have taken a stand and have generated a consensus on the necessity of the EPFTI. An important commitment on the subject has been achieved among the mass media, and the society is being informed regularly on both the situation of child labour and the advances of the country program.

Second, the advances are related to the interinstitutional coordination, field in which there have been quick advances due to the success of the diffusion campaign. The official restructuring of the CETIPPAT, its high level launching and its organic life, constitute the most important achievements, even if the current commitment level of the different public organisms is heterogeneous and there is a lot to be done for the public institutions committed to the solution of PFTI to develop concrete actions that will reveal their institutional commitment with this issue.

A very important third level of advance in the country program came with the enlargement of the legal framework with the proposal of the law for the protection of childhood and adolescence, today waiting to be approved. The entire previous process of discussion among several institutions of COLPINA contributes to the legitimacy of this norm and probably will subscribe to its observance. At the same time, the country's effort to define the worst forms of child labour in a consensus way is another very important element to sustain the laws. There has been no advance in the training of justice attorneys, as it only started at the end of the program.

As far as the training and skill generation to face the EPFTI, the country program shows, as far as we are concerned, smaller achievements. The training actions were not focused on specific people, but were given to several participants in a heterogeneous manner and not in a systematic one. The evaluation considers that there was an advance in the development of capacities and skills specifically among the staff of professionals and technicians who has worked very closely with the country program or has received technical assistance directly from it. This situation would change with the implementation

of the UDELAS training program, although the necessary measures should be taken to obtain the active and beneficial institutional participation in the program.

As far as the topic of the initiatives from different social actors, the country program has received two important initiatives, with the public commitments signed by the organized workers and with the journalists, but there is no public commitment from the employers. The public institutions have shown important initiatives in the field of the EPFTI, such as the INFARHU scholarship program, but today others seem more formal than real.

Without a doubt, one of the achievements of the country program is the restructuring and launching of the CETIPPAT, which is recognized among the institutions involved in child labour, and it is considered a success by the same participants. However, there are limitations for the fulfillment of the acquired commitments by the participants, and there is an unbalanced level of commitment with the issue, even if the participation is assured by the presence of the first lady.

One of the most important objectives of the country program was not achieved: the creation of National Plan of the EPFTI, due to the same difficulties with disallowed the launching of the CETIPPAT. Both incidents point to the necessity to consider, when a program is designed, the level of the country's context for the definition of results and the datelines assigned to obtain them.

The execution of the direct action programs suffered an excessive delay due to a long process of program proposal approval, the high formal demands of the country program to approve them, the lack of training in the filling of report formats for the financial agencies, the changes in them, the prerequisites of the financial organizations which were different from the local ones, the delay on the initial payment (in the rural area), the presentation of a monitoring data base unknown to the implementing agency and not oriented to the population, and difficulties in the collection of base lines. We conclude that it was due to the lack of a previous appropriate evaluation of the characteristics of the local institutional profile, the political context, and the level of cognitive and institutional resources of the communities.

The direct intervention on the population still shows weaknesses in the achievement of its most important results: the separation of NNAT from forms of dangerous child labour and the creation of income opportunities for parents. The population helped include an important percentage of children that are not part of the profile of the NNAT in the PFTI, but it was a population with a big educational shortage. On the other hand, the worst aspect for the PADs was the creation of alternative means of income for the parents of the NNAT, which shows that the initial design planned excessive goals due to an inappropriate evaluation of the real resources and to the complexity of the employment problem. Only 11 self-management projects were created for 11 parents in the urban areas and 12 projects for 128 parents in the rural areas. The task was especially difficult for the urban area due to its high dependency on the institutional support of public institutions committed to it. Both in the urban area and the rural area this absence generated an informal strategy to resort to personal contacts. In this line of action there

was a big evidence of the fragility of the institutional commitment of some of the members of the CETIPPAT. In spite of this, there are very good perspectives in the rural areas to advance in the self-management projects.

The sensitization of the participants in the local level is a relative achievement because there was no specific work done with the participants to whom the workshops were designed for. Even though there was a population objective in the design of these workshops there was a heterogeneous assistance, with the parents of the NNAT one of the most numerous. There is much work to be done with the assistance of key authorities and with the specific focus on each kind of participant. Despite everything an important number of workshops were organized (20 in urban areas and 20 in rural areas).

From the collected information and what it was observed in the field, the evaluation makes several recommendations for the program, based on the Immediate Objective 1 and the Immediate Objective 2. First, the extension of the country program is recommended for at least two years to obtain continuity and sustainability on the achievements reached to this point, and not to abandon the population who has been benefited and who has expressed a wish to continue with the program. At the same time, it is recommended to enlarge the country program work team maintaining a national coordination but assigning responsible technicians for the two immediate objectives. There is a special recommendation to include a person in charge of the supervision, monitoring and technical assistance for the direct action programs.

It is also recommended to apply a process monitoring on the direct action plans, in order to provide periodical information to help making decisions and correcting problems at the time they occur. There should be an exchange of experiences between the rural and urban action programs, and between them and the Panama team, since the latter one should be highly linked to the execution of the direct action programs, both for monitoring purposes and to strengthen its own interinstitutional coordination work with field information.

Regarding the immediate objective 1, it is recommended to work on the internal strengthening of the CETIPPAT, developing an operative plan that will show clearly the institutions and their responsibilities, and assuring that the institutions included in the committee will develop the necessary mechanisms to fulfill the acquired commitment to fight against the PFTI. It is specially recommended to integrate the population organizations (urban Neighborhood councils and rural defense committees) as very important subjects inside the CETIPPAT, and to develop with them an institutional strengthening work for the autonomous defense of their communities and methodological training to face child labour.

At the same time, it is recommended to work on the strengthening of the commitment on the EPFTI from social organizations, because they can be a guarantee for the issue to stand beyond political changes in the country.

On the operative level, it is recommended to prioritize on the elaboration of a national plan for the EPFTI. Equally important, to continue and extend its second phase, the

training of specialized participants, such as judges, prosecutors, magistrates, legislators, and civil servants involved in the direct attention of child labour. Finally, it is recommended to insist on working with employers, which was originally planned but it is a field which has no professional commitment yet.

Regarding the immediate objective 2, it is recommended to consider a revision of the prerequisites to fill information on the advance reports (ITA), to make them fit for the characteristics of the population, and an appropriate training in the correct filling of the forms to avoid delays from the country team. Also, it is recommended to create guides to design PAD which will be useful for IPEC, for the implementation agency and for the users, just like the EMT announced.

There is a series of recommendations related to the generation of information for the programs, such as taking part on the lifting of base lines; revision of the information collection files by the IPEC technical team to guarantee the appropriate process, and to avoid changing of the information registers in the middle of the program. At the same time, it is recommended the use of the SPSS package to make a monitoring data base due to its versatility when providing systematized information. It is also recommended that the technical team of the IPEC should monitor closely all the population included in the attention service, so it can adjust to the population objective profile of the program.

On the other hand it is recommended to redefine the strategies for generating alternative means of income for the parents of the NNAT, especially in the urban area, insisting on the adaptation of the public institutions which provide educational or financial services to the needs of the population objective. Also, it is recommended to reinforce the connection with fathers and not only with mothers, specially in the urban area; this should be linked to the development of topics associated with gender and family so the families can process the changes introduced by the elimination of child labour. Finally, it is recommended to prioritize the participants on the sensitization and training work to be done on authorities and institutions on the local level, so these training activities are not dispersed on a heterogeneous public.

Among the learned lessons during the execution of the country program for the eradication of the worst forms of child labour, the need to consider in future programs a line of work oriented to achieve the necessary coordination to press for changes in the institutional level is pointed out. It is clear that the increase of the institutional capacity and the quality of the response before the EPFTI, depends not only on the publishing, training, coordination, planning and legal framework but also on the internal structure of the public organisms.

It is also pointed out the need for a quick previous analysis of the starting point concerning the knowledge and familiarity that society has on child labour issues in order to establish a base for the rest of the work, since it has happened that the levels of coordination, planning and legal development which can be aspired to depend on the success of the previous diffusion work.

A fundamental learned lesson is the necessity to contact the public through its representative organizations, present the project and evaluate the possibility to include some of the community members. This strategy has given very good results when implementing the plans of direct action, particularly in the indigenous area where the levels of organization are high.

At the same time, the experience has shown that the separation of children from the working world and their reintegration to the educational system not only depends on monitoring, diffusion and social mobilization but also on the level of consolidation of the institutional background on the communities. Finally, another important lesson has been the need to make a complete evaluation of the context and the political conditions at the beginning of the Project to avoid unnecessary delays.

2.Introduction

In December 2005 the necessary actions were taken to organize the evaluation of the country program to eradicate the worst forms of child labour in Panama, utilizing an external consultancy to do so. This consultancy has been a written revision stage and a mission evaluation which took place in Panama between the 8th and the 22nd of February 2006. As a result of the analysis of the information collected during these activities the present document was elaborated which presents the main observations and conclusions.

The analysis has been divided into five aspects referring to the design of the Project, the reached advances, the sustainability analysis, pertinence, conclusions, and the recommendations and lessons learned from the experience. This document has used part of the information within the midterm evaluation to summarize the Program and its main records. The present report dialogues frequently with the objectives obtained through this document, and it explains, in relation to them, the last observations about the country.

2.1. Background

The Project “Country Program to fight the worst forms of child labour in Panama” was launched in September 2002 in order to contribute in the eradication of the worst possible forms of child labour (PFTI) in Panama. It is financed through a contribution from the Secretary of Labour of The United States for a total of US \$1,000,000 and a local contribution of US \$ 599,659. The project was expected to be finished by December 2005, but its execution has been extended until March 2006.

The project was designed based on an analysis of problems by the IPEC and the national institutions and taking into account the results of a workshop with all the involved parts. Through this method, a general framework was elaborated on the national level which identifies the following components which are essential to eradicate the worst forms of child labour in Panama: training for institutional response, application of the laws, support, health and education for boys and girls, attitudes of the society and income of the families of working children.

As far as the country, the program focuses on: 1) strengthening of the national capacity to develop programs and policies to prevent and eliminate the worst forms of child labour (PFTI) and 2) improvement of the mechanisms for the application of the law. It looks for ways to strengthen the inter-institutional coordination and provide support on the creation of the National Plan for the Eradication of Child Labour.

Locally, the program is supporting intervention models to prevent and separate children and teenagers from the worst forms of child labour. The direct action in the local level focuses on three areas: i) registration and retention of children in the education system, ii) changes in family values, program objective and to mobilize the community, and iii) improve the family admission. To obtain this objective, two programs are being implemented by a NGO, an Action Program (PA) in the rural areas and another one in the

urban area. It is expected that these action programs will validate intervention models to be copied in the future by the country.

In November 2004 the mid term evaluation of the country program was made. The information obtained and analyzed allowed the possible identification of several achievements and some key elements in the implementation and administration of the project. Taken the evidence achieved, an adjustment was made in the project so as to assure the pertinence of the intervention.

2.2. Purpose and users of the evaluation

There was a final independent evaluation at the end of the Project which was contemplated in the initial formulation of the Project and it turned into an order agreement for the final document and the donor. Through this they wanted to obtain a much deeper analysis of both the generated process and the effects produced by the intervention among the benefited people, as well as an estimate of the added value given by the project in the field for the eradication of the worst forms of child labour.

The general purpose of the final evaluation is to provide an analytical and independent analysis of the results obtained in relation to the objectives. More specifically, the evaluation is considered as an opportunity to: 1) analyze the applied strategies and the models developed by the intervention; 2) document the achievements, the learned lessons and the knowledge accumulated with the eradication of the worst forms of child labour; 3) provide feedback to the involved parts according to the developed process and the reached achievements; 4) suggest possible orientations for future work. Particularly, this evaluation will provide important information for the design of a possible second stage of the program in Panama.

Conceptually, the evaluation covers the interventions which have been implemented under the Project in Panama, in the national and local levels. This includes an analysis of the project as a whole, as well as the two PAD as part of the Project. As we have pointed out this final evaluation considered as a very important factor the group of discoveries and recommendations from the mid term evaluation, as well as the documentation related to the interventions in the region.

The evaluation is of special interest for the donor, the administrators of the Project and for the IPEC in general, for their capacity to provide knowledge on the achievements and the limitations of the Project and to derive the learned lessons that could be used to improve future interventions on child labour.

The main users of the evaluation will be the technical team committed to the execution of the intervention, government organizations and NGOs involved directly and/or indirectly in the intervention, the members of OIT/IPEC, USDOL and other international organizations in the country, as well as parents, boys, girls and teenagers. The evaluation included the active participation of the users previously mentioned.

2.3 Methodology of the evaluation

The Regional office in Lima Peru decided to organize the present exercise as an external evaluation. The evaluation was performed by an external consultant who is an expert on evaluating without previous participation on the planning or implementation of the project. The evaluation was handled by the Design, Evaluation and Documentation (DED) section of the IPED in Geneva. The methodology of the evaluation included the following three main steps:

a) Document analysis:

This step included a revision of the document of the Project, specially in the logic framework, the documents of specialized studies developed within the program framework, registry information materials and all the other documents related to the execution of the action plans (advance reports, other documents produced throughout the Project, seminar and workshop reports, registry forms, data bases and matrix and report graphics among other produced material). The respective bibliography is provided in the annexed section of this evaluation report.

b) Field work.

The evaluator traveled to Panama City between the 8th and the 22nd of February and made several individual interviews, as well as group discussions with the following people: IPEC personnel, current and former personnel of the relevant ministries, members of The National Committee for the eradication of child labour, civil servants of the Judicial and Legislative Powers, different NGO personnel, investigators and consultants, local authorities, both political and traditional, people from the mass media, parents, boys, girls and teenagers of the population who benefited from the Project. 43 people were interviewed, and 9 focus groups were made, during more than two weeks. A complete list of the interviewees is provided in the annexed section of this evaluation report.

c) Stakeholders' Workshop.

The main purpose of the workshop provided for the interested parts was to discuss the preliminary discoveries with the main interested people. This was achieved through the presentation of the initial discoveries and a subsequent planning discussion. 23 people participated in the workshop. A complete list of the participants is provided in the annexed section of this evaluation report.

Observations of the process of evaluation.

It is important to mention the time restrictions of the evaluation when you evaluate externally a Country Program. To accomplish the objectives, the collaboration of Mrs. Briseida Barrantes, of the IPEC Office in Panama, was of great help, she was kin enough to coordinate our agenda. Even with the time restrictions, it was accomplished to talk with a considerable number of people linked with the program in a short period of time. Other important aspect throughout the evaluation mission was the revision and reading of documentary material produced within the project framework.

The stakeholders' workshop was particularly useful to advance in the systematization of the evaluation of the program, as well as getting to know the attitudes of the participants involved in it and to validate the first observations of the evaluation. This allowed the project to sharpen its main proposals.

We consider it very valuable the fact that the evaluation was carried out by personnel outside the IPEC and the Country Program, since this allowed a great level of independence in the appreciation and value of the different developed actions. This also permitted a rich exchange of information with the main office of the IPEC and the field personnel of the direct action programs while we assumed the necessity to explain meticulously certain details of the process. At the same time, this external position resulted as a major and important factor for the definition of the evaluator roll before the population who benefited from the Project.

3. Design of the project.

3.1 General design of the project

The program was designed in 2002 based on the discoveries of the Child Labour National Survey of Panama of 2000 of the SIMPOC, as well as other studies carried out in Panama, such as the measurement survey of life standards of the World Bank (LSMS) and the poverty survey of the World Bank of the year 2000.

In July of 2002 a survey was carried out among the interested parts to validate the preliminary design of the Project. More than 40 interested people from the Ministry of Labour and Work Development (MITRADEL), Ministry of Education (MEDUC), Ministry for the Youth, Women, Childhood and Family (MINJUMNFA), Employers Organizations (CONEP), Workers Organizations (CONATO) and other important interested people of government and civil society organizations took part in the workshop. The main element of the workshop was a strategic planning exercise using the SPIF methodology.

The Country Program was proposing the following immediate objectives, which were identified during the strategic planning exercise:

Immediate Objective 1: At the end of the program the institutional capacity and the quality of the responses to act against the worst forms of child labour will be strengthened.

- Increase of the popularization and the training in child labour matters for the mass media, employers, authorities and civil and community organizations.
- Improvements on the coordination mechanisms at both national and regional levels, mainly by supporting the National Committee for the Eradication of Child Labour, as the main responsible organization of the inter-institutional coordination.
- Development of a National Plan for the Eradication of Child labour.
- Expansion and fulfillment of the legal framework.

Immediate Objective 2: By the end of the program 1000 children will have been separated from the worst forms of child labour in Panama and reintegrated into the education system.

- Adaptation of the education system to the needs of child workers.
- Increase of the popularization and mobilization at community levels.
- Establishing of a local monitoring system at a local level.
- Improvement of the employment conditions for adults and teenagers between the ages of 15 and 17.

The analysis of this structure of objectives and results, as well as of the logical framework of the Project, permits several observations. Even if the strategy of the project is clear and it seems viable, under the analysis of the subsequent it would have been important to have more precision in the definition of what can be understood as the “increase of the popularization and training” and “improvements on the coordination mechanisms”. This absence gave room to different interpretations depending on different points of view.

On the other hand, in the first expected result for the Immediate Objective 1, some of the participants that later are mentioned specifically in the structure of the indicators are not included: the judges, prosecutors and legislators, and the civil servants of the ministries. At the same time, “workers” are also not included, and when they are mentioned in the indicators it is not specified that the Project was focused on the organized workers.

At the end of the program the question is raised whether the proposed strategy to obtain objective 1, the increase of the institutional capacity and the quality of the response through the proposed results before the EPFTI (diffusion, training, coordination, planning and legal framework) is sufficient or not. A line of action that was not considered and which showed necessary was the work with the internal structure of the public institutions for the initiatives to be fulfilled. On the other hand, a bigger analysis of the knowledge level of the Panamanian society on child labour at the beginning point, would have lead to the design giving a more specific weight to the diffusion process and being more realistic in the training aspect.

As far as Objective 2, the result of 1 should have considered the situation of the teenagers who could still be reintegrated to the education system and finish it. During the execution of the PAD this absence in the original design brought some doubts. On the other hand, even if the strategy of the project was based on the discoveries of the SIMPOC 2000², and therefore the design of the Project was relevant for the situation of child labour in Panama, the experience seems to show that in separating children from the work market and their reintegration in the education system not only the monitoring, the diffusion and the social mobilization are important, but also the level of consolidation of the communities’ institutional base.




On the other hand, this evaluation observes that generally speaking there was a lack of an adequate valuation of the local abilities for the implementation of the country program. This is appreciated in the difficulties to find a national coordinator for the program, a potential implementing partner, and the difficulties to make the Eradication Committee work effectively, as well as the difficulties to contact the people who are benefited in the urban areas, difficulties to coordinate institutional actions to train parents and teenagers and to generate alternative means of income for the parents of the people directly benefited. In that sense, the initial design was not very viable

¹ According to the SIMPOC survey (2000), the majority of children working in Panama they do it in agriculture.

3.2 Indicators

According to the value of the indicators to monitor and measure the impact of the direct action program, 7 indicators were formulated for the immediate objective 1.

Table 1: Indicators for the immediate objective 1

Indicators for the immediate objective 1		
1 Number and content of articles on child labour, Especially in the worst forms, published or broadcast. diffusion		Increase of
2 Number of ONG, employer organizations and workers that design and implement initiatives to eliminate the worst forms of child labour, outside of the reach of the project.		Institucional capacity and quality of the response
3 Number of public institutions that have incorporated initiatives to eliminate the worst forms of child labour in their programs, coordinating their work with the national plan		
4 Percentage of the coverage amplified in social programs, which want to reach those areas where child labour is a problem, according to the national plan.		
5 Number of proposals for legal reforms, approved o being discussed in the legislative assembly.		Policies and legislation
6 Capacity and knowledge inside of institutions in relation to the problem of child labour, including the current legislation.		
7 Number of complaints presented and applied sanctions in relation to the child labour exploitation.		

We coincide with the EMT in which “these 7 indicators formulated for the immediate objective 1 are valid to provide information in the key areas for the project, that is: increase of the diffusion, institutional capacity and institutional responses towards child labour, and policies and legislation on child labour”. However, it would have been necessary to introduce several clarifications; indicator 1 is not enough to measure de increase of information on the general public about the topic, which was very important to reach a consensus about the EPFTI.

Indicator 2 includes the NGOs, those which are not included in the formats of the USDOL report. On the other hand, the EMT pointed out the need to precise the sentence “outside of the reach of the project” (indicator 2) because it was vague and gives room for different interpretations. Generally, for indicators 2 and 3, the sentence “initiative for the EPFTI” is not clear enough which allowed the reporting of a series of activities with heterogeneous meaning, as it is later explained.

In relation to indicator 4, it was necessary to define what was understood by “amplified coverage”, was it the population, the number of implemented services of the programs or the increase of attention sites.

In relation to the base line of indicator 6, the mid term evaluation recommended the use of the study “Knowledge and training needs” about child labour in Panama, (2003)³, as a base line because it was very useful for the knowledge and training of different sectors involved in child labour when this project started. However, this observation has not been paid attention to by the program, making it difficult to value the advances in the training level. Generally, there is a need in the reports of the project, an estimate of the initial situation to value the advances correctly.

About indicator 7, the EMT predicted that the experience of the project showed that it was difficult to report statistical information specifically by MITRADEL as a responsible entity and it recommended to “include other means of verification such as judicial administrator reports (once they are trained) to improve the report of this indicator”. This observation was not paid attention to either and the reports of this indicator are difficult to evaluate.

In relation to the value of the indicators to monitor and measure the impact of the Direct Action Program, 5 indicators are formulated for the immediate objective 2.

Table 2. Indicator for the immediate objective 2

- | |
|--|
| <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Number of children separated from the worst forms of child labour. 2. Percentage of children reintegrated in schools that still remain and are completing the school year until the end of the project. 3. Number of teenagers between the ages of 15 and 17 that remain and successfully complete the vocational training programs. 4. Number of parents whose children have been separated from work and have increased their income through alternative means. 5. Capacity and knowledge of the objective groups related with the issue of child labour. |
|--|

Indicators 1, 2, 3 and 4 were clear, but it must be pointed out that the reports of the program have not considered completely the fulfillment of indicator 1 which refers specifically to the “worst forms” of child labour. As it is indicated in this report, the attended population was not necessarily part of these kinds of activities. The same happens with indicator 2 which mentions the “reintegration” in the education system when a high percentage of the attended population “remained” in the system rather than reintegrating.

³ The evaluations of the training needs are a result of the project. The study is based on primary information obtained through interviews with 112 civil servants and main participants from 68 state agencies, NGOs, merchant associations and business organizations from the province of Panama.

As far as indicator 3 the project did not look at the situation for the teenagers who could still be reintegrated into the education system and only predicted programs of vocational training, which were very difficult to coordinate in both urban and rural areas.

In relation to indicator 5 the EMT recommended to specify how and when the evaluations of the training activities would take place, because “if these actions include certain kinds of activities or surveys it is necessary to plan and budget them according to it”. This recommendation was taken into consideration by the PAD and entry and exit testes were made in the main training activities within the execution framework. But it was not taken into consideration as much to evaluate the actions of the activities with institutional participants. It would have been necessary to specify that it had to be understood as “capacity” and “knowledge”, making some kind of minimum reference to it.

4. Main findings of the evaluation

4.1. Beginning process of the project

The project was initially launched in September 2002 but it faced considerable difficulties to hire a coordinator. The main reason was the lack of appropriate candidates in the country. OIT IPEC Publisher the job opening three times without finding a candidate who could 1) fulfill the profile and 2) have the disposition to work under the OIT IPEC conditions.

The current coordinator of the project assumed responsibilities in June 2003. Until then, IPEC personnel in Panama who were assigned to other projects (commercial sexual exploitation and domestic child labour), IPEC personnel in San Jose and other OIT (OIT /SIAL) personnel had been supporting and working in the project. The infrastructure of the office was established in October 2003. A technical assistant and a secretary were added to the project between November and December of 2003. The capacity limitations from June until November 2003 affected the general execution of the project because the coordinator was busy hiring personnel and establishing the infrastructure of the office with much less time for the technical work.

On the other hand, in September 2002 only the office of the first lady supported the country program at government level; after 2003 other civil servants started to participate, especially from MITRADEL and MINJUMNFA, but as individual people rather than institutional commitment. At the end of that year the most recent electoral process began, making everything more complicated and making the continuance of some civil servants more uncertain, therefore they decided that it was more appropriate to wait for the changes to come before starting the training process.

It can be said that both the political context and the lack of personnel of IPEC in the initial stage can be considered key factors for the delay in the activities to follow inside of the work plan.

With the government change, the new authorities were much more interested in the issue of child labour and in its eradication. At the same time they were much better trained and skilled in social work. However, the speed in which project actions started because of the government change is considered by the evaluation a factor that damaged the obtained achievements, because it seems that it only advanced when the government supported, and therefore it would be easy for the project to decline when their interest changed.

We have pointed out that since it was a weakness of the design not to consider the characteristics of the local environment (at professional, infrastructure resources and political levels) to define the starting moment.

4.2. Achievements in the increase of diffusion on child labour issues

The country program pretends to change the social attitudes toward the creation and diffusion of information on the magnitude and characteristics of the worst forms of child labour. The predicted activities included the projection and diffusion of the investigation reports as well as a series of workshops with different audiences such as the government, employers, workers, public institutions, NGOs and the mass media.

On the use and diffusion of technical information about child labour in Panama, the EMT informed in November 2004 that the Project reported a certain amount of press notes which used the OIT IPEC studies, such as the National survey on child labour in Panama (2000) and the survey on urban base line. According to the register on the distribution and use of the information about child labour in Panama of the IPEC office, it was found that from February to November 2004 an average of 16 people per month asked for information on child labour, specially the 138 and 182 conventions of the OIT, the national summary of the child labour survey in Panama, the quality analysis of child labour situation in Panama, in depth analysis of the child labour survey in Panama⁴ and the synthesis and analysis of child labour in central America and the Dominican Republic⁵.

According to the registers of the IPEC office between March 2005 and February 2006 there were 45 users attended, half of which belonged to the public sector, especially ministries. It is pointed out that these institutions utilized the information for research, training, communication and development of policies and programs. The used documents during this period are indicated in the annexed section 10.6. The child labour survey was distributed to 24 users, among which there are 14 public institutions, 3 means of communications, and a representative of the civil society.

**Table 3 Documents given by the country program in Panama
March 2005-February 2006⁶**

Types of institutions	Users	Nº
Public Institutions	MIDA, Ministry for social development, Ministry of labour and work development, office of the first lady, social cabinet, Ministry of Health, Ministry of education, Institute of agricultural commerce, Ministry of commerce and industry, general controller's office, Institute for the formation and use of human resources, National institution for vocational training, National members of parliament, Judicial organism and University of Panama, University of the Americas.	24
International organisms	UNICEF	1
Civil society	Telefónica Móviles, S.A., Kreciendo, S.A	2

⁴ Between February and March 2004 the child labour survey in Panama was distributed to 10 public institutions, 4 NGOs, 2 international organizations, 3 embassies, and 5 other organizations such as universities and worker organizations, as well as professionals (lawyers).

⁵ Source: Panama IPEC office registers.

⁶ Source: Panama IPEC office registers.

Social Organizations	FENASEP, National council of organized workers, National council of journalism.	3
NGOs	Casa Esperanza (Hope House), IDEMI, Indigenous childhood protection network, Creative Associates Int.	5
Means of communication	Televisions: MEDCOM S.A., Del Otro Lado-TVN program, Zona Franca-RTV; Diarios Mi Diario, El Siglo, Panamá América.	6
Others	IPEC consultants	4
		45

The reports of the program indicate that between December 2004 and January 2006 the national child labour survey and the urban base line were the most important consulting material, as well as the manual on child labour for journalists and steps to eliminate child labour. These material were used by the main newspapers of the country such as Diario La Prensa, El Panamá América, Crítica, Día a Día, El Siglo and La Estrella de Panamá; the urban base line has been cited when child labour has been related with negative consequences such as illnesses on children and teenagers who work and are separated from the education system. The national survey on child labour constituted the main information to elaborate the proposals of the direct action programs. The technical department office of the NSC used reference information from the IPEC to formulate the preliminary rough draft to modify and strengthen the decree generated by the NSC⁷.

On the other hand, the methods of the IPEC for the base line studies were used by the Casa Esperanza (Hope House) to prepare the terms of reference for the base line study of the rural direct action program. The IFARHU used the information provided by the office to elaborate its proposal on the scholarship program for the ETI. In the elaboration of the law project for the total protection of childhood the use of the study “legal considerations on child labour in Panama”⁸ was intense. The study “knowledge and training needs around child labour in Panama 2003” was also used as a source for the design of the UDELAS title. All the material was used for the planning and interventions (action programs), as a reference in policy documents, as a reference in legal proposals (law project for the total protection of childhood and adolescence), as well as research and training activities for university students, among others.

Regarding the moment of the mid term evaluation, and which had 16 users per month, the demand for the use of information declined after March 2005, reaching only an average of 4 users per month. But the users of this information are specialized and have used it for specific actions related to the initiatives of the EPFTI. The observation made by the EMT about the permanent use made by the country program of the material produced by the IPEC-SIMPOC project is maintained, so “both programs continue to complement each other in relation with the production and diffusion of the child labour information”.

The EMT report pointed out that “...*there is comparatively little information within the country program and diffusion material produced by the country program*”. In this sense

⁷ Se hace referencia a dicho borrador de documento en un artículo periodístico en el que se entrevista a la Primera Dama de la República, Presidenta del NSC, en el diario El Panamá América, el 21 de enero de 2005.

⁸ Elaborado por la consultora Paula Antezana, agosto 2005.

we can appreciate that the situation has changed very little, the information that we have presented points out a more frequent use of the national survey and less of other studies which have been elaborated within the framework of the program even if this use has been more intense in specialized sectors, such is the case of the legal consideration study of COLPINA and the study of training needs by UDELAS. However, there is a big field to extend the use of these specialized studies on the general public, and especially among the key participants of the program (government, employers and organized workers).

As far as the visibility of the program and its subject matter, in the EMT report it was already pointed out that the Project was made very visible within the context of the activities on June 12th 2004 (international day against child labour), due to the diverse actions taken which generated an important impact on the Panamanian society⁹, however, in 2005 the presence of the media was much bigger as a result of the campaign developed by the program. At the same time, the USDOL report from March to August of 2005 showed a significative increase of reports on child labour, which goes from 47 articles and reports in February of 2005 to more than 300 from March to December of the same year. Thanks to this, the issue took its place within the media and created a climate of debate and social position taking against child labour, even if during that time there was another issue of great importance for the Panamanian society being discussed¹⁰.

Table 4: USDOL report on the diffusion indicator

Indicators	Period 1 10-1-2002 - 28-2-2003	Period 2 1-3-2003 - 31-8-2003	Period 3 1-9-2003 - 29-2-2004	Period 4 1-3-2004 - 31-8-2004	Period 5 1-9-2004 - 29-2-2005	Period 6 1-3-2005 - 31-8-2005	16-10-2005 - 1-12-2005 ¹¹
1. Number and contents of articles and reports on the subject of child labour, especially in its worst forms, published or broadcasted	0	5	10	10	15	5	
		14	39	40	47	234	100

The interviews and groups of discussions made during the mission evaluation¹² confirmed that, just like the EMT, “the Panamanian society is aware, more everyday, of the issue of child labour”. In our case, all the interviewees coincide on that “the issue is all the more present in the mass media and public discussion than 5 years ago”.

Regarding the quality of the information handled by the public opinion the observation of the EMT is maintained and strengthened EMT, which pointed out that the information, tends to improve its quality. During the last period, from December 2005 to January 2006,

⁹ The program installed an organization committee in which the technical office of the NSC, NGOs, and union and business organisms participated. Several activities were developed at a national level: a walk in Panama city, and another one in Santiago de Veraguas, a walk and human chain in David, Chiriquí; an informal training workshop was organized on child labour with a group of journalists, as part of the communications commission of the organization committee of June 12th; a forum on child labour in the province of Chiriquí was organized with Casa Esperanza (Hope House); several articles were published in the local newspapers on the issue of child labour: the written, television and radio media opened up their spaces for reports and interviews, there were articles and messages by the national authorities such as the sub regional coordinator of the OIT, journalists and other members of the OIT-IPEC/Panama.

¹⁰ The month of June was marked by a context of strikes and workers protests for the reforms of the law Caja del Seguro Social, which dominated the public agenda for a while.

¹¹ Source: Third report on the diffusion plan.

¹² Go to the annexed section for the list of interviewed people and the focus groups made.

the public not only knows the causes and consequences of child labour in Panama but it associates the issue rapidly to the abandoning of the education system and the long term consequences derived from that both locally and nationally, reinforcing the objectives of the direct action programs.

The most important change in the diffusion aspect from December 2004 to January 2006 was the execution of the diffusion plan (PD). The objective was to support the consciousness and social mobilization, the strengthening of the key participants competent in the eradication of child and adolescence labour, and to bring harmony into the national legal framework with the 138 and 182 agreements of the OIT, ratified by Panama. By September of 2004 there was an elaborated plan; the document presents a clear definition of the specific objectives, activities and steps to implement them, as well as a monitoring plan of the predicted activities¹³. The plan also defines clearly its public objectives and the strategic work design of each one of them. The monitoring plan has been developed effectively, and captured in 3 different advance reports delivered to the national IPEC office¹⁴.

The diffusion plan was executed from February 2005 and can be considered a great advance in the objective to support the consciousness and social mobilization¹⁵ through activities such as: the visit to media owners (25) and the providing of diffusion material, the periodical contact with the media to deliver information for reports and news on child labour cases, and the permanent contact with journalistic programs that touch the issue of child labour (such as “Prensa Libre y Responsable” free and responsible press of the national council of journalists). The final outcome is the publication of 8 reports on the eradication of child labour, 347 press notes in written media and 2 reports on TV; 17 representations by people of the IPEC, Casa Esperanza (Hope House) or CETIPPAT; 52 press notes on the activities of the CETIPPAT and 36 pieces of news on ETI¹⁶. The advances in the diffusion work were present on the celebration of the 12th of June, in 2005, when almost 2 thousand people participated in the different events; the biggest diffusion was also expressed in the covering by the media of activities such as the proclamation of the approved modification of the creation decree of the CETIPPAT, made in the Barú in Chiriquí, on the 21st of June; the installation of its members by the first lady of the republic¹⁷, made in the Casa Amarilla (yellow house) of the presidency of the republic on the 23rd of June; and the first meeting of the CETIPPAT on the 3rd of august at the presidency.

The PD had limitations to complete with its objective 3 (to support the diffusion of the objectives, achievements and activities of the committee) because its installation was just

¹³Diffusion plan of the country program to fight against the worst forms of child labour in Panama.

¹⁴First report of the development of the consultancy “diffusion plan of the country program to fight the worst forms of child labour in Panama” from the 15th of February to the 15th of June 2005; Second report of the development of the consultancy, from the 16th of June to the 15th of October 2005, and third report of the development of the consultancy, from the 16th of October to the 15th of December 2005, elaborated by Mayté Zachrisson V.

¹⁵ The PD has served first of all to develop the Basic material for the diffusion work, giving the office an institutional image. Diffusion material has been elaborated and delivered (brochures, stickers y banners) to the 27 sections of the CETIPPAT, a material inventory of reference has been elaborated of the OIT-IPEC on child labour and worst forms of child labour, as well as a contact list updated monthly; a power point presentation of the country program was also shown. The diffusion actions of the 12th of June demanded a more extensive use of the communicative and informative materials such as posters of the date, banners, radio announcements for the province of Chiriquí, and information manuals among others.

¹⁶ GO to the third diffusion plan report.

¹⁷ Vivian Fernández de Torrijos.

done in June 2005. Nevertheless, there was a journalistic coverage of the activities of the country program, such as the presentation of two research studies on the worst forms of child labour in Panama published by the country program¹⁸, of the workshop seminar “sensitizations and handling of the journalistic information on PFTI” and the presentations of the video on child labour elaborated by the OIT-IPEC for the 3rd year students of the social communication school of the UMA, events with more than 96 people¹⁹. However, there was an objective which was not met, that is 450 state institutions, labour unions, businesses, NGOs, and media did not receive at least one copy of the mentioned studies (LBU delivered to 56 people).

Finally, the PD also proposed to support the harmony of the legal framework, even if it was only to provide information to less than half of the people than originally proposed (194 out of 450, of whom attended the presentations of the study of legal considerations on child labour in Panama and the people who were benefited with in formations distributed by COLPINA) and could not count with an institutional brochure of harmony for the legal framework for diffusion. Nevertheless, media coverage was achieved of the activities related with the law Project for the total protection of childhood and adolescence, more than expected (73 press notes vs. the last 5 planned, and a wide journalistic coverage of the press conference in which the beginning of the discussion of the Project was announced)²⁰.

The diffusion plan aimed at workers and employer organizations, media, the national committee and others, however, through the reports of the diffusion plan and the interviews made during the mission, there was a lot more work with the media than with the rest of the participants (all of them were visited, there was a workshop seminar, a video presentation and there was an agreement signed). This evaluation recommends that, as it is told in the objectives, the fulfilled activities with the PD must be informed with all the predicted participants to evaluate objectively the level reached in every one of them. This is important because the objective of the country program is to focus on the key participants to increase their knowledge, abilities and skills to face the problem.

Generally, it can be said that the achievements in the matter of diffusion have been significative as far as the positioning of the topic within the public opinion, the information handled by the public in general, the internal communication at the CETIPPAT level, as well as the achievement of the support of important sectors of the population to fight the worst forms of child labour, which has given a great visibility to the project and has guaranteed that the activities will continue. However, there has not been a sustained advance in the objective to give systematic and relevant information to key participants such as employers, workers, legislators and judges, as it was planned in the program. At the same time, we could not collect evidence of the inclusion of diffusion of non traditional members like the private sector and the churches, like the EMT recommended²¹.

¹⁸ “Build a future, invent in a childhood: economic study of costs and benefits of eradicating child labour in the regions of AC y RD” and “urban child labour in Panama: a base line”.

¹⁹ Third report of the diffusion plan.

²⁰ Third report of the diffusion plan

²¹ The third report of the diffusion plan does not include reference to this participants.

4.3 Achievements in the creation of capacities

One of the important indicators to measure the strengthening of the institutional capacity and the quality of response of action against the PFT was the number of organizations of employers and workers who designed and implemented initiatives to eradicate the worst forms of child labour outside of the field of action of this Project (**Indicator 2**). We have pointed out before that there are differences between this formulated indicator in the logic framework of the country and the report indicator of the USDOL reports which include NGOs, and which gives room to some problems to evaluate the advance.

On this subject the main achievement of the program was without a doubt the CONATO policy declaration among labour unions to prevent and eradicate child labour in Panama (September 2005), which urges the affiliated workers organizations to develop joint actions to intensify and to demand the eradication of child labour. This declaration includes an operative plan among labour unions (Operative plan for labour unions against child labour, document approved by CONATO, according to the 165-04 note on the 26th of October 2004), with the following lines of action:

Table 5: Lines of action for the CONATO operative plan of action

1. Research and training
2. Sensitization and social mobilization
3. Collective negotiation
4. Improving of the laws and policy and program impulse for their implementation, through the three way structures
5. Support service channeling
6. Promoting the formation and decent work opportunities for fathers and mothers of working children
7. Labour union structure organization to eradicate child labour

At the end of the program it is possible to say that CONATO is one of the most firmly involved participants in the issue of ETI proved in which Mrs. Marta Martínez de Castillo (Delegate of CONATO for child labour, and Delegate of FENASEP), interviewed in the course of this evaluation, recognized the direct relation with the technical advising provided by the Country Program. There has not been evidences found of similar initiatives in the business sector, except the particular donations of banks and of the business sector itself (Global Bank, Banco General, Movistar) for the support to public or civil programs to fight child labour (training and child employment, small scholarships) between March and August 2005. Likewise, about August 2005 Casa Esperanza (Hope House) manages, with a patient work, to involve some agricultural producers of Coffee plantations in its Programs of Integral Attention. In spite of this important advance, similar a labour union announcement has not existed similar to the one made by CONATO which can influence the level of sustainability of these initiatives in the medium term, beyond the signing of an agreement of current work with Casa Esperanza (Hope House). This evaluation considers that being the business sector one of the main participants' objective of the Country Program, at the end of this one, the sector should

give more samples of initiative in the area of the EPFTI²², especially, in a labour union and institutionalized way.

Due to the difference in the writing of indicators, the Program has reported at this point other several initiatives corresponding to the academic area, NGOs, mass media and the Church. It is possible to estimate that by August 2004 there were registered few initiatives, but from 2005 they increased significantly (from 4 to 31)²³. Among them it stands out, because of its relevance, the signing of the Letter of Commitment between the National Council of Journalism (CNP) and the CETIPPAT represented by the Minister of Social Development (November 18th 2005). Such an initiative can be considered another important achievement in the sense of generating commitment among key participants of the Panamanian society. This letter compromises to this labour union to approach the issues of child labour from a perspective of rights, to support the development of campaigns of social business responsibility, to denouncing and to follow-up the processes of investigation of the cases of NNAT labour exploitation, to make an informative respectful and complete coverage, with the suitable investigation and follow-up, which allows to reveal the records, the reasons and the context in which child and teenage labour takes place; and to visualize the actions of the CETIPPAT²⁴.

Other institutions reported as having a certain level of initiative were:

²² The collaboration with the Casa Esperanza (Hope House) programs was obtained through a great work of this NGO but not as a direct initiative of the business sector, even if there was a strong diffusion campaign.

²³ Source: USDOL report

²⁴ Compromise setter of the National Council of Journalism

Table 6: Institutions which reported initiatives on EPFTI by December 2005

ACDE	Work proposal before the USDOL for the Project DESTINO.
Fundación Nueva Vida, FUNDAMUJER, Casa Esperanza	Executor organizations of the Project DESTINO
MOVISTAR, Programa PRONIÑO	Support programs and scholarships for working children
Universidad de Chiriquí	Students of the education faculty support the social and educational programs of Casa Esperanza (Hope House).
Alcaldías	Initiatives to control the entering of under age children to work in public markets and garbage dumps
Policía de menores y Policía Nacional	It detects child labour cases and reports them to MIDES, Direction of childhood, for its particular attention
Defensoría del Pueblo Escuela de Periodismo de la Universidad de Panamá;	It works with the issue of domestic child labour and commercial sex exploitation, with studies and diffusion campaigns, laws and public events.
Unión Nacional de Abogadas	Legislative initiatives which promoted the revision of the minimum working age, under the constitutional reform framework
CEPAS	UDELAS title
Movimiento de Mujeres de Panamá	Includes compromises with the issue of child labour under gender focus treatment in the III Women's national pact with the candidates to the presidency of the Panamanian republic.
Iglesia Católica	Reading of the speech "some considerations on child labour under the social doctrine of the church" June 12th 2005.

To them all 16 mass media that developed articles in the frame of the commemorative activities of June 12th would be added (Rila Publicidad, Channel 13, TVN, Channel 5, Channel 11, RCM, several radio stations, Bulletin of the State Secretary of Communications, Panorama Católico, Día a Día, Mi Diario, Crítica, La Estrella, El Siglo, La Prensa y el Panamá América).

However, on this report that Program does, it is necessary to do the observation that the level and the quality of the initiatives of each one of these participants is not homogeneous: the publication of television reports can be considered an "initiative" in a certain sense for the EPFTI, whereas the Operative Plan of CONATO represents an initiative of concrete work and a labour union commitment in this field. In the same sense we can compare the meaning of the message from the Catholic Church (which has not been accompanied by other actions of position taking or of concrete work) with the commitment signed by the National Council of Journalists. This evaluation considers that a detailed and rigorous analysis of the different initiatives would reduce in a great manner the advances reported in this important indicator.

**Table 7: USDOL report on the initiative indicator of NGOs, employers and workers.
December 2005.**

Indicators		Period 1 (*) 10-1-2002 - 28-2-2003	Period 2 1-3-2003 - 31-8- 2003	Period 3 1-9-2003 - 29-2- 2004	Period 4 1-3-2004 - 31-8- 2004	Period 5 1-9-2004 - 29-2- 2005	Period 6 1-3-2005 - 31-8- 2005
		Target	0	0	1	1	1
2. Number of NGOs, employer and worker organization that are designing and implementing initiatives to eliminate the worst forms of child labour, outside the scope of this project	Actual		2	3	4	6	25

As for the number of public institutions which have incorporated initiatives for the EPFTI (**Indicator 3**) we have that in August 2004 only three public institutions had developed them: the MINJUMNFA (today MIDES), with its program to assist working girls employed as domestic service and the national youth policy; the MITRADEL, with its inspection programs; and the Office of the First Lady with its help programs. By March 2005 it was possible to observe a bigger participation of institutions of the new government and a more fluid interaction among them; six public institutions developed initiatives: the Office of the First Lady, the MINJUMNFA; IPACOOOP; Municipal Mayor of Panama; the ministry of Education with Casa Esperanza (Hope House); and the Public Defender office with UNICEF. By August 2005 the number of public institutions with specific initiatives in the EPFTI increased in a major way, going on to 17 institutions, among them Alcaldías de David, La Chorrera, Santiago y Panamá; the Legislative Assembly, the Office of the First Lady, the public defense office, the government of Chiriquí, IFARHU, the ministry of Education, MITRADEL, MIDA, MIDES, National Police, and Youth Police. At the same time, it is necessary to emphasize the initiative²⁵ of the Indigenous Authorities Ngöbe and Junta Comunal de San Miguelito on allowing the development of the services of Casa Esperanza (Hope House) in their communities and to offer facilities for it.

The started activities were based on:

- The creation of the Department of Attention and Protection Street Children and in State of Exploitation that includes labour exploitation; to install and to start a help phone line for children and teenagers including cases of labour exploitation (MIDES); the creation of the site “Coordination of Actions in favor of childhood and Adolescence”, to attend situations of commercial sex exploitation, physical disappearances and minors trade (MIDES with the Inter-American Institute of the Child); to restrict minors' entry to garbage dumps of different municipalities of the country (MIDES with Municipalities).

²⁵ Once again, the exact definition of “initiative” is necessary: in the work framework of Casa Esperanza (Hope House) it has been this NGO who has summoned and sensitized the communal authorities to commit with the EPFTI work. In this sense, the actions taken by them within the direct action program framework are not strictly “initiatives”.

- To establish a policy on juvenile work and to promote training and decent employment to both rural and urban levels; sanctions to 11 coffee plantations that had under 14 year old workers (MITRADEL);
- Project proposal of agricultural self management for parents of rural child workers (MIDA);
- Accomplishment of an orientation day and medical attention to children and young pepenedores of Cerro Patacón (Capital District, MINSA);
- Accomplishment of inspections and regulations of the government of Chiriquí to control the use of indigenous children ngöbe to beg for money David-Chiriquí;
- The signing of a letter of commitment to unite efforts against child commercial sex exploitation (National Commission for the Prevention of Sex Exploitation Crimes, CONAPREDES with the National Council of Journalism and with the support of OIT-IPEC).

For its importance as a mechanism that assures the overcoming of child labour to medium term, this evaluation emphasizes specially the formulation of the Project of Educational Assistance through scholarships for the ETI (IFARHU). This Institute proposes "to develop a program of economic educational assistance directed to the population in conditions of vulnerability and child labour risk" and "to stimulate boys and girls so they can continue with their academic studies, reaching a point of equity and importance of education". The program is directed to the economically active population of children and teenagers, it will support economically students of limited economic resources so they can continue with their academic studies in official educational centers of the country in basic primary level. The Investment for this subprogram will be of B/.1,050,000.00; which corresponds to the total amount of the benefit for three (3) years, to attend a student population of 1,000 children. Its quantity will correspond to B/35.00 per month, and its duration will be for three years, in a period of 10 months to the year. The annual amount of the benefit ascends to B/.350,000.00. 94 scholarships will be destined to the province of Chiriquí and 284 to Panama City. At the same time, 204 scholarships will be destined to the indigenous zone.

**Table 8: USDOL report on the initiative indicator of public institutions.
December 2005**

Indicators		Period 1 (*) 10-1-2002 - 28-2-2003	Period 2 1-3-2003 - 31-8- 2003	Period 3 1-9-2003 - 29-2- 2004	Period 4 1-3-2004 - 31-8- 2004	Period 5 1-9-2004 - 29-2- 2005	Period 6 1-3-2005 - 31-8- 2005
		Target	Actual	Target	Actual	Target	Actual
3. Number of public institutions which have incorporated initiatives to eliminate the worst forms of child labour into their programs, in coordination with the National Plan	Target	0	0	3	3	4	6
	Actual		0	3	3	6	17 ²⁶

The advance in initiatives of public institutions for the eradication of child labour has been important and gives an idea of the level of involvement of the state institutions in this issue. Nevertheless to value adequately the achievement of this indicator it is necessary to take into account that during the mission evaluation many of the interviewed civil servants did not know the advances in their respective areas and they commented that the material and human resources being destined to this issue are scarce in the majority of Ministries. At the same time, it is necessary to consider that in the daily work of the PAD teams, there were no more than three public institutions that, beyond their word, gave true and permanent support to the actions for the eradication of child labour (MITRADEL, MINSA, and INAFORP)²⁷. In the majority of cases this was due to the fact that the civil servants did not adapt to the type of work developed by Casa Esperanza (Hope House) (for example, the difficult urban areas to locate minors working - MIDES gave up this task and only a civil servant of the MITRADEL accompanied them systematically-), due to the lack of institutional resources (for example, MIDA does not have personnel assigned to the rural area of intervention of the project), due to the lack of involvement (for example, even if the school teachers accepted to work the educational complementary services with their students, there were very few of them who managed to do derivations and some of them tended to delegate part of their educational responsibilities to the teachers of Casa Esperanza (Hope House). This qualitative information does not invalidate but it raises some questions on the level of real involvement of the public institutions in the fight against the PFTI that has been achieved up to this moment. This evaluation considers that even if there have been important advances as far as public initiatives, these seem to be more formal than real today, more sanctioning than preventive and still located in a high hierarchic level before a technical daily work.

Regarding the percentage of extended coverage in social programs, which try to reach areas where child labour is a problem (**Indicator 4**), the Program has not presented numbers, however it is known that it had an important intervention in the formulation of a proposal of the National Government (Social Cabinet) to create a "System for the social integration and human development of the families in extreme poverty".

²⁶ In the USDOL report of march-august 2005 33 institutions are present in this indicator adding the private media to the public institutions which we consider incorrect.

²⁷ Source: interviews of the coordinators and work teams of PADU (Saturday 11th, Tuesday 14th, and Tuesday 21st of February) and PADR (Wednesday 15th and Saturday 18th of February).

In section 3-H of Family Corresponsability, article about Work, the proposal establishes that "no child under 15 must leave his/her studies to work", as a condition for the families to be included in the social programs. The Country Program had here an important intervention since it recommended the First Lady to determine the help to the families depending of the retirement of their sons and daughters from child labour (and associated to educational insertion), and to consider this condition in any other program or national policy of fight against poverty, suggestion that was recaptured in the offer. However, this evaluation did not have quantitative information that allows measuring the advance at this point.

As for the development of the capacity and knowledge of the institutions in relation to child labour, including the applicable legislation (**Indicator 6**) the program has done important advances through a technical consultancy in the production and management of training proposals of the Universidad Especializada de Las Américas, first with CEFA (Centre for Family Studies) in the production of a module on child labour between its courses of January 2005 and then with CETIPPAT in the Program of Constant Training to prevent and eradicate child labour in Panama.

The degree in Methodological Strategies for the Prevention and Eradication of Child Labour of the UDELAS, was carried out in January 2005 and was directed to civil servants of all three Organs of the State, community leaders, worker of NGOs, members of labour unions and employer organizations, and other public and civil institutions (including social networks) linked to the work with childhood in general, and particularly to those dedicated to the EPFTI. Also to professionals of social, economic, health, education and legal sciences and specialists in social communication (journalists, publicists and broadcasters among others). Because of its extension, this degree was still very distant from the objective to train civil servants related to the EPFTI appropriately.

The Program of Constant Training came to fill an emptiness of the Country Program in the area of child labour training and it represents a suitable closing of the training efforts that had been done up to the moment in a less organic and systematic way. The Program has been planned in two forms: *the degree strategies for the prevention and eradication of child labour in Panama*, with three modules and a duration, approximately, of three months (192 hours) and *the free courses on prevention and eradication of child labour*, with a duration of 20 hours. These disciplines attend to different needs: a) to develop formation programs directed to those who can plan, execute and evaluate the projects destined to the EPFTI, like universities GOs, NGOs, labour unions, local authorities, and member of the technical department of the CETIPPAT among others; B) to develop actions that tend to sensitize and to train people linked with child labour from other spaces, such as businessmen and employers, parents, churches, and social communicators among others. In the first discipline the objective is to strengthen the knowledge, aptitudes, attitudes, skills and competency for the appropriate planning, management and intervention for the prevention and eradication of child labour; in the second discipline it is a question of developing in the participants the knowledge and attitudes that will allow them to understand the most notorious causes and the most probable consequences of

child labour, and to act in consequence. The *degree* would attend to 70 people of Chiriquí and Panama and the *free courses* to 430 persons attended in the provincial extensions of UDELAS, in Chiriquí, Veraguas, Coclé, Panama and Colon.

At the moment of this evaluation mission there was a draft of agreement between UDELAS and the Office of the First Lady to formalize the proposal and the technical team in charge was in an activity planning stage

This initiative represents a great advance in the training of key participant involved in issue of child labour and is most importance its accomplishment to obtain one of the most important objectives of the program. The evaluation considers that the efforts of the Country Program should have been directed from the beginning to the achievement of this academic work and a very valuable time was wasted make it concrete. This explains itself because of the need, in the Panamanian society, to divulge and to generate a consensus on the topic²⁸, however, this period could have been more intensive and short to overview the main issue which was training. This evaluation recommends not ruling out the execution of short specific training workshops for specialized participants (civil servants, legislators, judges, employers and workers) since not all of them will be in conditions to take extensive courses. At the same time it is recommended to analyze the real possibilities of participation of civil servants to coordinate actions with public institutions which can facilitate and encourage group participation and other forms of institutional enrichment.

Outside of the previous one, some of the main training activities organized within the framework of the Country Program during the last year of execution have been²⁹:

Table 9: Main training activities, December 2005

	Activity ³⁰	Date	Number of participants	Type of Participants
1.	Sieca regional seminar, International norms on the issue of child labour	Panama, 15th y 16th of march 2005	25	Technical civil servants of the ministries of labour of CA, Caribbean y Panama
2.	Childhood and adolescence total protection conference.	Panama, 8th of April 2005	18	Called up by the women's commission of the national assembly, for directors, judges an technicians
3.	Mapping workshop TIP, Herrera y Los Santos	Panama, 8th of April de 1005	40	Directors and coordinators of the MIDA, MINSA, MIDES, MEF, MITRADEL, judicial organism (judge and prosecutor), University of Panama, local authorities and the private sector
4.	Mapping workshop TIP Panamá, Darién, Kuna Yala y Colón	Panama, 5th of may 2005	49	Directors and coordinators of the MIDA, MINSA, MIDES, MEF, MITRADEL, judicial organism (judge and prosecutor), University of Panama, local authorities and the private sector
5.	Labour union plan elaboration workshop	Panama, 9th of may 2005	5	Labour union directors: Dirigentes sindicales: FENASEP, CNTP, CGTP

²⁸ Pointed out in the interested parts workshop on the 20th of February, Group 2.

²⁹ Source: Consolidated register of meetings, seminars, workshops, discussions, and other events made in the country program. IPEC Office in Panama. Self elaborated chart

³⁰ In 2005 there were 3 activities related to the diffusion of information on domestic child labour, which are not included in this chart (meeting TID in the people defence office, 8th of june 2005; TID workshops of strategic action with key sectors for the promotion of legal reforms, 16th of June 2005; training workshops for TID data managing, 29th of June

6.	Labour union plan elaboration workshop	Panama, 13th of may 2005	4	Labour union directors: Dirigentes sindicales: FENASEP, CNTP, CGTP
7.	Labour union plan elaboration workshop	Panama, 14th of may 2005	4	Labour union directors: Dirigentes sindicales: FENASEP, CNTP, CGTP
8.	Subregional seminar "workers organizations and fight against child labour: strengthening the joint action to eradicate child labour"	17th and 18th of May 2005, San José, Costa Rica	Not mentioned	Not mentioned
9.	Legal study validation workshop "legal considerations..."	Panama, 30th of June 2005	31	Members of parliament of the national assembly
10.	Legal study validation workshop "legal considerations..."	Panama, 1st of July 2005	51	MIDES: directors, commission president, assessors, delegates, Police officer, magistrate, member of parliament, prosecutor and news writer
11.	National workshop to determine the TIP ³¹	8th of July 2005	39	Magistrates, sub director of the police, work inspectors, institution directors, CONEP, local authorities, ONG directors and consultants
12.	Formative workshop to present preliminary proposals of legal reforms on the issue of child labour	13th of October 2005	40	Government sector MIDES (directors, coordinators, department directors), consultants
13.	Presentation of the study "build a future, invest in childhood", economic study of benefits to eradicate child labour y en the sub region AC and the Dominican Republic	16th of November 2005	56	Public institutions, childhood supreme court, national assembly, local governments, NGOs, University of Panama and the press
14.	Presentation of the economic study of benefits to eradicate child labour y en the sub region AC and the Dominican Republic	17th of November 2005	80	UDELAS, directors and technicians of the government sector, and civil society
15.	Workshop seminar sensitization and handling of journalistic information about	18th of November 2005	23	Media directors, journalism students, department directors, supplement coordinators, writers, university professors, labour union presidents
16.	Video Debate on child labour in the communications fair of the USMA	24th of November 2005	17	USMA Journalism students
17.	Seminar: "the challenges of the transversal topics in the vocational training institutions of Central America, Panama and the Dominican Republic"	Guatemala, from the 27th to the 30th of November 2005.	8	Government sector, directors and Project directors and departments
			490	

The prior information analysis allows us to observe that:

" Except journalists and organized workers, training has been little focused on specific participants in a systematic way (for example, only one workshop was organized for members of parliament)

" It was given through workshops and seminars to a heterogeneous public (for example, magistrates, judges and prosecutors received information together with editors of news)

" For the previously mentioned the contents were necessarily general to adapt to a varied public, which did not fulfilling the objective of the training

" It has occurred in several cases, in the shape of presentation of research reports (where topics are also necessarily presented in a general way)

" In them, the use of entry and exits tests to evaluate objectively the profit of knowledge was not systematic

³¹ Determine work that because of its nature or its conditions can be harmful to health, security and working children morality.

“ A specialized use of the Study of Training Needs 2003 was not evident in them but general information about the topic was continued being given on child labour, although the studies developed by the Program³² were presented and diffused

With all of this there was a big gain in the general knowledge area on child labour, but not necessarily in the development of capacities and skills for specific participants. This evaluation recaptures the appreciation done in the EMT on the importance of *"the training being completely designed, geared and adapted to the needs of the different hearings. In contrast to this, if the training activities are organized in an ad-hoc way, the same ones can have as an effect an increase of diffusion but not necessarily an effect of training, with insufficient guides for specific participants (ministers, NGOs, etc.), in potential methods of fight against child labour"*. In this sense, this evaluation considers that at the end of the country program there was a considerable amount of work to be done in the development of the capacity and knowledge of the key institutions in relation with child labour in Panama³³. This has been recognized in the interested parts workshop framework, where it was pointed out the necessity of the training to be “specific and geared towards the problem”, since “we know that, for example, the members of parliament do not have time but cover specific areas”. The assistants believe that the void in these types of trainings will be filled by the UDELAS program.

On the other hand, within the framework of the final evaluation mission, the interviews to several civil servants who received training reveal that in a great number of the cases this was not replied and extended to the interior of the institutions due to time restrictions of the civil servants and to the lack of policy and strategy to obtain it. In this manner, we can ask ourselves how much we have advanced in the sense proposed by the EMT: *“training should provide quality methodology and tools to the participants that will allow them to work as multipliers, and put them in a position in which they can eventually train others on child labour. Training must be sufficiently useful to allow its replication”*.

Finally, the program has revealed a lot during our evaluation mission, the high educational value of the technical consultancies provided by the CETIPPAT, and other institution which it came in contact with, such as:

- National union of women lawyers, for legal initiatives that promoted the revision of the minimum age to work, within the constitutional reform framework;
- UDELAS, for the elaboration of the training activities previously mentioned,
- CONATO for the elaboration of its operative plan;

³² There were workshops organized to present the results of the study to a wider public.

³³ For example, in the interview to the legal assessor of the women's commission, children's rights, youth and the legal assembly family, this professional brought up the need to work deeper with the members of parliament who represent mainly the rural areas in which the issue of child labour does not constitute an urgent demand and therefore does not belong to their political circuit. There would be a very specific line of work to do for the members of parliament to take conscience of the importance of the issue and to introduce it in their circuits; the topic to work on would be the Member of Parliament's roll on the prevention of child labour.

- COLPINA for the elaboration of the law proposal for the protection of childhood and adolescence;
- IFARHU for the elaboration of education assistance program;
- Office of the first lady, within the CETIPPAT framework and in the consultancy of social programs;
- Casa Esperanza (Hope House), for the series of technical achievements for the formulation of direct action program proposals, the implementation of consulting workshops to validate of the proposals to key participants, and the follow up and monitoring of the advances in the direct action programs.

These technical consultancies have allowed the realization of concise products in the fight against EPFTI and we have been able to check that they are highly valued by the representatives of the mentioned institutions, which were interviewed through the course of the mission evaluation. However, we have to point out that the systematic training was the planned activity within the country program, and not the individual technical consultancy.

Regarding the number of complaints presented and applied sanctions related to the labour exploitation of children (**Indicator 7**), the program started collecting information from department of attention for working minors, attached to the national inspection direction of the ministry of labour and work development. At the end of the project we can observe that the proposed goals are very different to reach: there have been a total of 21 complaints, and there haven been an average of 60 complaints per period; only 6 sanctions have been applied, and 4 are in process, 10 per month being the goal at the beginning of the Project and 30 at the end. We also have to point out that in March 2005 the initiatives at MITRADEL were reactivated to identify dangerous child labour, as a consequence of the diffusion campaign of the program. At the same time, this source of information is not the most adequate and trustworthy. For this reason, the EMT recommended including other means of verification such as the judicial administrators report, but this has not happened yet because it needed previous training which was not done.

Table 10: USDOL report on the complaint and sanctions indicator

Indicators		Period 1 (*) 10-1-2002 - 28-2-2003	Period 2 1-3-2003 - 31-8-2003	Period 3 1-9-2003 - 29-2-2004	Period 4 1-3-2004 - 31-8-2004	Period 5 1-9-2004 - 29-2-2005	Period 6 1-3-2005 - 31-8-2005
7. Number of complaints presented and sanctions applied relative to labor exploitation of children	Target	60 10 monthly	60 10 monthly	60 10 monthly	120 20 monthly	150 25 Monthly	60 30 monthly
	Actual		6 complaints: 2 sanctions applied, 4 sanctions in process	5 complaints 2 sanctions		6 complaints: 2 sanctions applied, 1 sanctions in process	4 complaints 4 sanctions in process

4.4 Achievements reached with coordination mechanisms.

The National Committee for the Eradication of Child Labour

According to the document of the Project, the main component to improve the coordination mechanisms both nationally and in provinces was to provide support to the National Committee for the Eradication of Child Labour (CN), as the main organization responsible for the interinstitutional coordination. As we know the CN in Panama was created in 1997 through an executive decree number 25 with the following objectives:

- Advise on policies and programs that tend to improve social and working conditions of the working minor.
- Contribute to the elaboration, supervision, and evaluation of the national plan of action for the elimination of child labour.
- Strengthen the coordination among public and private institutions as well as national and international to find alternatives and strategies to eliminate the main causes of child labour.

According to this decree, the CN included 25 representatives from different institutions and the technical secretary office, CN's operative arm, which included 6 government institutions: The office of the first lady, MITRADEL, MINJUMNFA (today MIDES), MEDUC, MINSA and MIDA.

After a period of low operative level, which was analyzed by the EMT in November 2004, the government change opened space for a restructuring process of the national committee which finished on the 21st of June 2005 with the signing of executive decree number 37 which modified number 25³⁴. The 22nd and 23rd of June, massive events of very high institutional³⁵ profile framed the firm of this decree and made it official. In decree 37 there is a new denomination for the CN: "Committee for the eradication of child labour and protection of the adolescent person", CETIPPAT, reaffirmed as the permanent organism and its functions enlarged to "the prevention, attention, protection, and watchfulness of the working conditions of people of minimum working age". At the same time, responding to the necessity to make this organism more representative, its composition was widened to 27 members, among them civil society organizations (NGOs), workers organizations and employers of the private sector as well as other public institutions active in the fight against child labour. We also have to point out the lack of representation of the indigenous authorities of different regions, which is important because these areas represent the highest rates of child labour.

An initial difficulty for the CETIPPAT was its adscription, because there were different opinions between MIDES and MITRADEL which delayed the approval process of the new executive decree, as well as the new committee. The program had an important part in this process through the absolutions of queries of the MITRADEL to the OSR and the dialogue management between the ministry of labour and the minister of youth to reach an agreement. Finally, the issue was resolved with the establishing of three way

³⁴ This decree had already been modified before by the executive decree number 9 of the 21st of April 1998 and number 18 of the 19th of July 1999.

³⁵ These events were presided, respectively, by the president Martin Torrijos and the first lady of the republic.

responsibility in the technical secretary office of both ministries and the office of the first lady. The composition was enlarged to include, besides MINSA, MEDUC y MIDA, the superior court of childhood and adolescent, a representative of IPEC-OIT and a representative of the civil society organizations working directly on the eradication of child labour and protection of working adolescent people. We have advanced on the achievement of a bigger representation of the committee and its technical secretary office.

Another important change has been the creation of the Consultive advisory council in which the IPEC-OIT has a representative, along with UNICEF, the public defense office for children's rights and the population fund of the United Nations. This double participation of the IPEC-OIT in the CETIPPAT can be considered as an admission of the important technical consultancy work that the country program has been developing for this organizations, sharing good strategies and learned lessons of other experiences related to the role and functioning of the national committee, such as the first sub regional three way meeting of national committees promoted by the IPEC and which took place in Tegucigalpa, Honduras, in march 2004.

After its installation, the technical secretary office of the committee started to have an important level of organization with the weekly meetings from July 2005, and its first plenary session, and high technical level in august 2005. From then on, until December 2005, 10 meetings with CETIPPAT³⁶ have been organized in which its mandate has been established, they have worked on the elaboration of an agenda and work schedules, and they are currently working on the design of the annual operative plan and the elaboration of a data base of working children which will unify the information of different institutions. The ST has been directly connected with the creation of scholarship programs of FARHU y and the UDELAS training program. We can consider that there has been a very significative achievement in the task of coordinating interinstitutional actions to fight against child labour.

Nevertheless, we must point out that through the interviews made to the representatives of the office of the first lady, MITRADEL, MIDES and other public and private institutions within the CETIPPAT we could see that there are important internal problems such as:

- The lack of human resources and capacity to obtain more effective commitment from representing institutions (for example, the low participation on the execution of commitments from institutions such as MEDUC³⁷ and other public institutions in which the civil servants already are very occupied).
- The lack of continuity of the civil servants which also means lack of use of the obtained training.

³⁶ There were two meetings in august, 3 in October, 3 in November, and two in December. Source: "consolidated register of meetings, seminars..." document previously mentioned.

³⁷ On this subject there is a coincidence between the technical secretary office of the committee and the PADU team of Casa Esperanza (Hope House).

- The lack of a budget in CETIPPAT and the dependence on the institutional budgets to take on actions against child labour, in a context in which those budgets have already been assigned.
- The lack of integration of the information from different institutions obstructs the knowledge of the resources.
- The current focus prevail, those which privilege normative and punitive actions in some public institutions and there is a necessity to redefine them, incorporating preventive actions and other actions oriented to social recognition.
- Certain discrepancies in relation to positions and responsibilities (in the interviews to the representatives of the MITRADEL and MIDES we could observe discrepancies as far as the adscription of the committee).

The different interviewees recognize that the CETIPPAT finds itself in a crucial moment to define its mid term and long term consolidation; it is also recognized the necessity of a group to sustain the integration efforts. On the other hand, this evaluation considers that the organic life of this organism is still very much linked to political and personal factors: the fact that the restructuring of CETIPPAT has only been possible with the arrival of a new government (with a larger vision and technical capacity), and the personal interest of the first lady on the children's issue (after more than a year that the previous government did not support the issue). This situation raises the question on the sustainability level of the committee before a government change. Coinciding with the interviewed program consultants, this evaluation mission³⁸ considers necessary a wider work with the organization of the civil society that can sustain all the advanced up to this moment. The assistants to the workshop of interested parts agreed that despite the current difficulties "we feel that what we have achieved up to this point is a success", they are conscious of the dependence on the office of the first lady but they believe that "in the second stage they must let go" and demand regularity from the public institutions, "at least they must maintain people" they pointed out.

Coordination between the country program and other interventions of the IPEC

Other IPEC interventions in Panama are the SIMPOC project, the project on commercial sex exploitation (ESC), and the project on domestic child labour (TID). Regarding the relation with the country program this evaluation affirms the observation of the EMT that "the program has been an instrument of dissemination of the results of the SIMPOC project among key national institutions in Panama and there are clear synergies created by both projects".

Regarding the ESC³⁹ and TID⁴⁰ projects that operate since the year 2000, the EMT pointed out that "there have been important achievements obtained in Panama in relation with the diffusion and allocation of the issue of child labour in the public agenda"- Following the recommendation of the EMT of incrementing the coordination level for the activities related to communication, social mobilization and creation of capacities, the

³⁸ Interview with Clara de Souza and Silma Pinilla, Wednesday February 8th.

³⁹ This Project is part of a sub regional Project to fight against the commercial sex exploitation (financed by USDOL).

⁴⁰ This Project is part of a sub regional Project to fight against domestic child labour, financed by Canada.

country program during the last year of Project execution has continued coordinating actions related to the TID project through the participation in diffusion actions of TID issues with the public defense office, in the legal reform promotion workshops and the training workshop for the management of TID data, organized with the MITRADEL, allowing a more efficient use of the resources.

4.5. Achievements in the development of a national plan

National Plan for the Eradication of Child Labour

As it was pointed out by the EMT, the national plan for the eradication of child labour is considered the fundamental development tool of policies to define programs directed to prevent en retire boys, girls and teenagers of the PFTI. Its main objective is to focus on social policies (education, health, attention of poverty, etc.) that concern children and adolescents who work to integrate them into social programs developed by the government.

The national plan requires regulation mechanisms to monitor the PFTI, in particular in informal sectors, being the first step to define the worst forms of child labour, followed by a process of a three way consulting both nationally and in the provinces, and including government agencies, employers, workers, civil society organizations, international cooperation agencies and others.

In Panama, the consulting process on the PFTI started in the provinces of Veraguas and Coclé, it was proposed during the last electoral process of the country and retaken during the months of April and May 2005 with the mapping workshops TIP of Herrera, Los Santos, Chiriquí, Panama, Darién, Kuna Yala and Colón, and the three way national workshop to validate the results, process in which 128 people were involved approximately with directors and coordinators of MIDA, MINSA, MIDES, MEF, MITRADEL, the judicial organism (judges and prosecutors), University of Panama, local authorities, and the private industry among others.

As a result of this great consulting process the document “determination of the work that by its nature or by the conditions under which is developed it will probably harm the health, the security and the morality of children (Art. 3d agreement 182 of the international labour organization OIT) within the framework of the worst forms of child labour” was elaborated and finished in October 2005. The results of the base line study on dangerous child labour in the urban areas of Panama City⁴¹ provide data to define the PFTI in Panama. Counting with this socially validated study, the CETIPPAT has assigned a technical commission to coordinate actions to prepare for a national plan.

It is important to emphasize that the delay on the elaboration of the plan is directly related to the internal processes of the Panamanian society such as the political difficulty to

⁴¹ “Study to determine the base line of dangerous child labour in urban areas”, completed in may 2004.

restructure and reinstall the CETIPPAT, the necessity to generate a consensus around the definition of PFTI, and the political processes (elections) that delayed the execution of the consulting. All of this emphasizes the necessity to consider, in the design of the programs, the level of the country context in which the definition of the results and the terms of achievement will be established.

4.6. Achievements in the improvement of the legal framework

The legislation relative to childhood in Panama is regulated through different frameworks such as the political constitution, the family code, work code, agricultural code, etc. These frameworks only cover partially the international obligations that Panama has acquired through the ratifications of the 138 and 182 conventions of the OIT, including the respective recommendations 146 and 190. In many cases, there are contradictions and inconsistencies among the legislations, for example between article 66 of the political constitution and article 716 of the family code relative to issue of work in agriculture and homes.

The fulfillment of the legislation in Panama is limited due to the restrictions in the capacity of the government institutions. The fulfillment of the legislation and monitoring of child labour is a challenge particularly in the informal sector, where the majority of children work in Panama.

According to the EMT, the main elements of the legislation in Panama in relation to child labour were:

- The ratification of the children's rights convention, November 1990.
- Understanding memorandum between the OIT and Panama, June 1996, renewed in March 2004.
- The ratification of the OIT conventions 138 and 182 in the year 2000.
- Approval of the executive decree number 25 in April 1997, which allowed the creation of the committee for the eradication of child labour and the protection of working adolescents, under the sponsorship of MITRADEL.
- Approval of the national strategic plan for childhood and adolescence (2015), November 2003. The sixth strategic area of the plan "respecting and restoring rights" includes general concepts to eliminate child labour and monitor teenage work.
- With the support of the IPEC ESC project, the law 16 has been elaborated and approved in March 2004. It includes specific measures to prevent and typify crimes against the integrity and sexual freedom, and modifies and adds articles to the penal and judicial codes. The approval of the law 16 represents an important step in the fulfillment of the international conventions and the protection of childhood rights.
- With the support of UNICEF, several proposals "total protection law for childhood and adolescence" were elaborated.

In November 2004 the EMT found the following advances in the field of the improvements of the legal framework obtained by the country program:

- Representatives of Panamanian institutions participated in the interparliamentary sub regional workshop to revise the legal framework C.182⁴². A major result of the project “Tegucigalpa declaration” on the issue of child labour and which asks for more collaboration among the parliaments of the sub region; legal reforms within the context of C. 182 and C.138; a minimum working age of 15 and the establishing of a list of dangerous works in agreement with C. 182.
- Strengthening of the women’s movement of Panama alliance through the inclusion of the elimination of child labour in the third national Woman and development pact (2003). This pact was seeking to promote institutional processes to reduce discrepancies among social and economic policies in Panama under a gender perspective. It could also be considered a joint result of the Woman and Development forum, the organization coordinator for the total development of women (CODIM), the national committee of indigenous women of Panama and the national union of women lawyers. The pact was signed by the presidential candidates in March 2004 and includes a formal commitment which is being attended by the current government.

To these advances we can add:

- The approval of the executive decree number 37, on the 21st of June 2005, by which some articles of decree 25 are modified.
- The national mapping and dangerous child labour determination workshop promoted by MITRADEL-OIT IPEC which provides a list of dangerous child labour that will serve as a base for the approval of an executive decree with a legal base.
- The representation and debate on the study “judicial considerations on child labour in Panama” with members of parliament of the legislative assembly (promoted by the commission of child and youth affairs of the OIT-IPEC) and with competent participants of the public and civil sectors, promoted by MIDES.
- The creation and installation of the commission to elaborate a law proposal for the total protection of childhood and adolescence, COLPINA (MIDES-UNICEF), with 27 public and private institutions and international organisms as advisors (among them OIT-IPEC). This commission took the previous study as a base to elaborate the law proposal of total protection.
- The delivery of the final document of the law proposal for total protection to the minister of the MIDES and to ask for her approval in the national legislative assembly, activity that is still to be done at the moment of this evaluation.

We must point out that the program had planned not only to obtain improvements in the legislation of child labour but also provide technical assistance for the design of training modules for judges and magistrates, as well as the training of judges, administrators of

⁴² The workshop took place in March 2004 in Tegucigalpa, Honduras.

justice, legislators and work inspectors on the laws and regulations of child labour, specially in its worst forms. Currently there is a consulting firm for the formulations of a child labour training guide for solicitors and attorneys, necessary within the framework to renew the existing legal one and for the generalized lack of knowledge and fulfillment of the laws in the matter of child labour. The objective is to provide the national justice system with a work tool that will support the training process for knowledge, application and interpretation of the legal norms on the issue of child labour. It is a methodological guide that will be utilized by trainers of such system.

Similarly, there is a consulting firm to train attorneys of justice in the matter of child labour, whose objective is to drive training processes to personnel of the national justice system for the knowledge, application and interpretation of the judicial norms on the issue of child labour, through the training of trainers of such system. The organizations of 2 training workshops is predicted (rural and urban) for trainers of the justice system and the elaboration of a training plan to be established in the urban and rural levels.

Both activities represent a significative advance in the issue of specialized training and it would have been of most importance to drive this work with justice operators much sooner. The delay in the fulfillment of this objective is explained in part by the diffusion stage but also by the time invested in the institutional coordination.

4.7. Achievements within rural and urban action plans

4.7.1. Selection for regions of execution and implementing agency

The process to select geographical areas for direct action programs started in the middle of 2003, through searches between the national and sub regional personnel of the IPEC and national authorities. The EMT reports that the criteria to select the objective regions which guided the particular discussion with the national committee were the following:

- Poverty level
- Child labour incidence
- Capacity in the community level (diffusion level, human resources, etc.)
- Infrastructure in the community level (health, education, nutrition)
- Existence and capacity of government institutions and NGOs
- Government strategy (intervention area priority, them affair priority, political will to provide resources, conditions to intervene in specific areas, etc.)
- OIT-IPEC strategy (existence of previous studies, cost to remove or prevent each child, etc.)

As a result of these discussions in June 2003 the province of Chiriquí and Panama City were selected as objective areas for direct intervention. This evaluation considers that such criteria were pertinent to make the selection; however, its valuation at the moment of initiating the programs of direct action was not completely exact, which delayed the execution. For example, the diffusion capacity and human resources in the community

level is pointed out as criteria, however in the urban area there was no knowledge of communal assembly network in the Panama and San Miguelito districts until after the program had started. Also the existence and capacity of government institutions in the execution areas is also pointed out as a criteria, however only when the programs were functioning was noticeable that some key institutions to coordinate with had no presence in the area (for example MIDA and AMPYME).

The program had difficulties to locate an implementing agency for the PAD. Initially Fe y Alegria (faith and happiness) NGO was selected, but due to capacity reasons in September 2003 this agency retired from the rural area, as a consequence Casa Esperanza (Hope House) was identified as the potential implementing agency for the rural action program and in November 2003 the IPEC program was successful in beating the resistance of the national committee to work with Casa Esperanza. Fe y Alegría also withdrew from the urban area when, through the urban base line (august 2003), it was clear that the objective population was geographically more dispersed than originally assumed. In December 2003 IPEC and the national committee reached an agreement with Casa Esperanza in both the urban and rural areas.

This evaluation observes that in the design of the country program there was no adequate valuation of the local capacities to implement the action programs. This is revealed in the difficulties to find a potential implementing partner with the necessary profile, capacity and experience of the local organizations. At the same time, there was a need to evaluate the political factor relevance: the negative of the members of the national committee (integrated by the government party) to work with the NGO Casa Esperanza (Hope House) became a considerable delay. On the other hand, even if the criteria to select objective regions could be considered relevant, there was no adequate evaluation of the resource level of the communities at that moment.

4.7.2. Action Program proposals' design

Casa Esperanza (Hope House) started to elaborate proposals for the rural and urban direct action programs at the beginning of 2004. As introductory initial material, the NGO received the document of the project, the DED lines for project designs and copies of summary guides of action programs elaborated in the context of IPEC in Nicaragua.

In January 2004 Casa Esperanza presented its first draft proposals for both action programs, based on available information such as investigations made by themselves and previous studies made by the University of Panama and the Panamanian institute for labour studies (IPEL), for example “the youth packers in supermarkets”, among others. The results of the urban base line study were not available at that time⁴³ but the work experience of the NGO with street children in urban areas and indigenous population in rural areas was highly relevant to elaborate interesting proposals.

⁴³ The final report of the urban base line was delivered in may 2004. The base line is sustained by interviews with 529 children and 222 parents, and people responsible for children, as well as interviews made in health centres and schools.

IPEC Panama revised the proposals using a verification list of 148 technical criteria which derived from the DED lines for project design. A total of 7 versions of the program summary guide of rural action and 4 versions of the program summary guide of urban action were presented by the implementation agency. The following were the main readjusted topics:

- Selection of appropriated indicators.
- Explanations of the budget and differentiation between local contribution and IPEC.
- Inclusion of gender issues.
- Consideration of the three way structure of the OIT.
- Use of charts about benefited people.
- Differentiation between the benefited people, the directly benefited people and the members.
- Consideration of the labour situation and creation of means of income for parents of working children.
- Evaluations of the existing legislation on education.
- Synergy with other projects and members of the.

The process of elaboration and revision of the proposals was excessively long due to various consulting rounds which were made between the program and Casa Esperanza. The explanatory factors are, on one side, the lack of technical training on the methods of the implementing agency program, and on the other, the great demands in relation to the design of the Project by IPEC. However, we must point out that the PADU and PADR teams coincide that the observations to their proposals received from the central office of the program were of a formal character rather than design and content.

Once these proposals were approved by the program, three consulting and validating workshops were organized in April 2004:

1. Two day workshop in David, Chiriquí, to validate the proposal for the rural direct action program. The specific objective of this workshop was the diffusion among key participants at the local level (representatives of indigenous communities of the Ngobe Buglé region, government and NGOs), to discuss the intervention model and obtain appropriation and commitment. According to the questionnaire of the evaluation, at the end of the workshop the participants were very satisfied about content, methodology and relevance.
2. Workshop for coffee farmers of the region of Boquete.
3. Workshop in Panama City in June 2004 to present and validate the intervention model of the urban direct action program.

This evaluation considers that even if the proposal consulting workshops were very relevant to inform and involve the rural population on the Project execution, their reach

was limited when generating commitments on the urban population⁴⁴. In this sense, a learned lesson is the necessity to value the differences in the institutional scheme among populations, a topic which was not predicted in the design of the country program and was not totally valued in the formulation of the PADU proposal, and which delayed the execution.

At the end of the process we can say that the final PAD documents were of very high quality. The interviews made during this evaluation confirm that the implementation agency appreciates the experience of the technical learning, specially the methodologies for the four month planning and for the revision of advanced technical reports (ITA) which favored the organization and direction level of the action programs, as well as a careful organization of the information on activities, results and objectives. However, as we pointed out before, the agency missed a more clear and timely technical orientation on these proceedings.

Generally, this evaluation considers that the process of revision of the proposals was excessively long and considers that for future action plans the amount of time used for the elaboration and revision of the PAD must be limited. We agree with the EMT on that “the quality prerequisites of the IPEC must be carefully balanced with the necessity to formulate efficient and timely action programs”. We join the recommendation of the EMT to elaborate useful design guides of PAD at the IPEC level, at the implementation agency level and at the level of the users; the inclusion of training activities in the design of action programs would be of great utility considering the technical capacities of the country where the program is being implemented.

4.7.3. Beginning of direct action programs:

The delay in the proposal approval process meant an important delay on the beginning of the action program execution, which was evaluated as a negative factor by both work teams (PADU and PADR). We have to consider also that both execution teams (PADU and PADR) point out that they did not receive an adequate consultancy from the country program central office to fill out appropriately the report formats of the program. There is also the perception that these formats changed during the course of the first months which was confusing. Anyway, this evaluation observed that there was some confusion between the action program execution teams and the central office of the program at beginning of the Project, which delayed the start of the direct action programs. An important drawback caused by this delay was the loss of personnel hired and trained by the PADR to execute the program.

Another delay factor was the nature of the prerequisites of the financial reports, which did not adapt to the life conditions of the population of the Project (the demand of service receipts which are non existing in the rural areas, or the impossibility to write cheques in the name of natural persons, which took away efficiency from street educators in the

⁴⁴ The mid term evaluation was more optimistic in its appreciation of the consulting workshops: “the participating method during the workshops in april and june 2004 contributed significantly to improve the understanding and commitment of the interested parts. This commitment will be crucial as far as the sustainability of the interventions”.

urban areas). At the same time, the delay on the payment of the first part of the budget in the case of the PADR meant that Casa Esperanza Chiriquí had to assume the initial expenses, which generated certain crisis inside the team.

A factor that both programs felt was the delivery of a monitoring and report data base of the Project that corresponded to a different benefited population (domestic child workers) and which was elaborated under an unknown statistical package for the executing agency. This evaluation has been able to check that the data base provided information which is not relevant for the program and, on the contrary, does not permit the inclusion of other relevant variables. Both teams agree that when a consultancy was asked for to understand the functioning of the base, even if the IPEC showed disposition, this was never appropriate. This fact partly explains that the PADU had done a very little use of this base to find more information, which took away access possibilities to valuable information for the monitoring process and decision making. The PADR team, on the other hand, hired a specialized computing service to adapt the delivered data base to the prerequisites of the program. Thanks to this, they were able to use their information systems intensely and were able to access valuable information to evaluate the result of the intervention.

This evaluation consider having delivered this data base to the execution teams a mistake, because the monitoring systems require the construction of an ad-hoc data base based on the report indicators of the specific Project. The execution teams lost a valuable time trying to understand and adapt a base made for another purpose. We can observe that this technical capacity process of the Panama team did not allow to give an adequate consultancy and to make an evaluation of the problem to provide an immediate technical alternative.

4.7.4. Achievements in the separation of one thousand children form dangerous child labour, ant their regular assistance to school with total attention:

The great achievement in the fulfillment of this objective has been that in December 2005 the direct action programs in the urban and rural areas had reached and attended more than one thousand working children and adolescents. The population included in the direct action programs has received in a systematic way a very important educational support by reincorporating and maintaining them into the school system, supply of school materials, school reinforcement and extracurricular formative workshops. At the same time, it has been benefited with food services, and when it has been necessary, with health services (medical attention management and supply of medicines) and legal services (for example birth registration management).

Nevertheless, it is very important to point out some observations as a result of an analysis of the data base of the benefited population of both programs and the interviews with focus groups. First of all, unlike PADR, the PADU had great difficulties to contact the benefited population of the program. The work team of this program said more than once during this evaluation mission that a great deal of these difficulties came from the errors

detected in the area of the urban base line, which IPEC demanded to be implemented in PADU. Such errors were the incorrect registration of the addresses of the interviewed children (the team attributes this to the lack of experience of the interviewers with this type of population), and the incorrect registration of non working children as working children, in the concentration of working children of the service sector (supermarket packers specifically) when their work experience in the street told them that there were other child occupations of bigger incidence.

This evaluations has verified that the LBU reports 40% of children and adolescents working as supermarket packers⁴⁵, while the national survey of child labour in Panama points out clearly that in the urban area the predominant occupation is street vendor (50.9%) followed by vendor in commerce and markets (26.5%) and by artisans (7.7%)⁴⁶. The LBU should have done samplings of the NNAT population respecting this occupational structure, and it was not like this. In this sense, this evaluations points out that there was a starting problem with the population that PADU included as being benefited.

However, we must point out that the strategy of the urban team was very relevant because it substituted the non contacted NNAT of the LBU with contacted NNAT in the area of economic activities with more people (for example, garbage dumps and markets). The team is aware that they should have taken into account the “street level” of the children, that is, those who were in the street permanently and those who were not in the street but could return (prevented in the program terminology), but it tried to maintain itself within the orientation lines of the country program.

The contact with the benefited population in the urban area was difficult but we had the effective support of the department of labour inspection of MITRADEL, although not with the equivalent department of MIDES. Under these circumstances, an additional strategy which has positive results was the contact with the communal assemblies of each district, who helped reaching the NNAT quota. The support of these organizations had less impact on the execution of the program; the urban area population we worked with was characterized by its low organizational level.

On the contrary the PADR strategy of contacting NNAT through the committees for the defense of children’s rights whose presidents were indigenous leaders allowed a fast contact with the benefited population and a quick implementation of the service through indigenous teachers. This strategy annulled the effect of geographical distance which was so negative for PADU (since the teachers were natives and lived in the communities). A key differential factor regarding the urban area was the level of social organization and previous training (for example UNICEF) which has been reached today with the indigenous communities. We have mentioned that this evaluation recommends, looking forward to the elaboration of following programs, to take into account the institutional level of each geographical area of execution, which can favor or difficult the advance and achievement of objectives.

⁴⁵ Urban base line, page 4. The following occupational structure is reported, very different form the structure in a population level: Supermarket packer (40%), Pepenador/a (11.8%), street vendor (10.7%), bus secretary (9.2%), fixed position vendor (6.4%), car wash (5.0%), shoe polisher and/or window cleaner (4.7%), load carrier (3.3%), others (8.9%)

⁴⁶ National report of the child labour survey results in Panama, 2003, page 80.

Another difficulty at the start of the service was the information about the benefited population. The PADR team proceeded to a quick check of information on the NNAT through the application of a survey form. The collected information through this form is very important because it allows analyzing in detail the occupational situation of the working child. However, this form was only applied on one part of the final benefited population and later was replaced by another one that only has very general questions about the labour issue. On the other hand, PADU also has a registration form of the attended population with very little emphasis on the collection of occupational information. This evaluation considers that it is necessary collect this information and its absence generated distortions on the benefited population of the program.

Specifically, the PADU included in the benefited population a proportion of children dedicated to beg and some cases dedicated to collect leftovers in the markets. At the same time, as a result of the predominance of packers in the LBU, the PADU has a big percentage of adolescents, and on the other hand as a result of its contact strategy with the benefited population, the PADR has a minimum proportion of adolescents; and included NNAT who at the moment of contact were not working (but their brothers were working), NNAT who worked in domestic labour in their own home (sweeping, washing, etc.), or who worked in agriculture inside their family; in these last two cases it was observed that the amount of hours sometimes was not bigger than one or two per day, and that the amount of working days was not bigger than two per week. During the course of this evaluation we revised more than 10% of the total quantity of survey forms from the PADR (61 forms), and we based this observation on them.

Even if the PADR team said that the NNAT in this situation were included because they were potential workers because they were temporary migrates' sons and daughters⁴⁷, and PADU points out that begging is only another stage of the chain that leads to the informal commerce, this evaluation observes that a more exhaustive analysis of the population would have eliminated some of the included cases. In this sense, they missed a technical consultancy and a tighter general orientation on the benefited population to the execution teams by the country program. This absence can be explained by the same lack of technical experience of the Panamanian team and by its high concentration on the institutional coordination work. At the same time, the small size of the team (2 members) was clearly insufficient to attend the two big immediate objectives

Finally, in relation to the objective of reintegration into the educational system we have to say that there were important advances in the maintaining of the NNAT inside the system and their improvement of their school performance (for example, the percentage of school failure was reduced, and the children's grades improved⁴⁸). This evaluation considers that the 12 year experience of Casa Esperanza in total attention service for vulnerable children and the advances thanks to destine project (Proyecto Destino), were a very important factor to achieve this objective. Nevertheless, we have to remember that

⁴⁷ To collect coffee in the farms.

⁴⁸ Thanks to the adaptation of the PADR of the monitoring data base, this program has excellent information on the level of educational advance of attended children. It would be very recommendable to systematize this information to value the achievements appropriately in the total attention centres.

the initial objective of the program was the reintegration into the educational system and to separate children from child labour, but in the final execution there was a big proportion of children who maintain themselves inside the educational system since they were already separated from child labour or they were never in it.

4.7.5. Achievements in the access of parents to alternative means of income:

At the end of the program this objective presents a much lower advance level in comparison to the previous one. In the urban area only 39 family fathers accessed the training programs of the INFAFORP, PMR (11 in computers; 28 in curtain confection courses, hair cuts, Basic English, gypsum design and structure, electronics, and Basic painting) everything to acquire knowledge and abilities to be able to generate possible means of income. Only 11 projects of self management were approved in activities such as selling food such as tamales, duros, emparedados, frituras and oranges (10 mothers and 1 father). The access to the labour market was achieved on only 9 mothers.

In the rural level the training of 100 families was achieved by INAFORP in courses to learn to breed chickens, organic agriculture, and technical courses by the hour on mechanics, plumbing and construction. 12 projects of self management micro businesses were accomplished (11 chicken farms and 1 traditional clothes making workshop) to benefit 128 families of different communities. We have to point out that even if Casa Esperanza donated the chickens and the food to begin this Project, it was designed in such a way that it generates a fund to create more projects in other communities.

Both the urban and the rural teams had serious limitations to obtain access of the parents to the training courses within the educational system predicted for these purposes (INAFORP, MITRADEL, direction for family training, MIDA), as well as financial aid systems (AMPYME, Mi Banquito, MultiCredit Bank⁴⁹). This was because these institutions do not attend the benefited population of this project: adult population with a low educational level, very little enterprising, with cultural differences in the case of Chiriquí and living in very remote areas far away from the working places of these institutions. The implemented strategy by the teams which provided very good results to obtain training was to look for personal contact with civil servants of the INAFORP who provided a special institutional attention. Both teams admit that this previous personal contact was determinant to access the system. Additionally, because of the low resources of this institution PADR had to share the financing the training (INAFORP donated the food for the chickens and put the facilitator; Casa Esperanza donated the chickens and the medicines; as far as the technical courses Casa Esperanza (Hope House) assumed the costs of transport of the benefited participants.).

Within the PADU the access to opportunities of generation of means of income was strongly linked to the cooperation of the mentioned institutions, specially, another

⁴⁹ En el caso de MIDA, MultiCredit Bank y la Gerencia de Capacitación a Familias del MITRADEL se tenía cursos de capacitación o programas orientados a familias de escasos recursos pero los equipos rural y urbano informan que estas instituciones nunca contestaron su solicitud de cooperación.

institution in this matter was MITRADEL, but since they could not obtain cooperation from these institutions, they turned to other strategies:

- a) A fund from the Project was destined to the finance of small projects of self management; in this field they should have created a whole new methodology for this activity which was not predicted.
- b) They went directly to the job employment office of the MITRADEL to manage the CVs of family mothers (no job was achieved through this method).
- c) They tried to find direct jobs for parents in some companies (El Machetazo, El Campeón, Almacenes de Ropa Titán, Tropical Service, in total 10 companies), only temporary jobs were accomplished (December) for 9 mothers.

This evaluation considers an important strength the adaptation capacity that the direct action programs implementation teams showed during the course of the execution, as well as the level of personal commitment of these professionals in the achievement of the proposed objectives and the previous work experience (in the street, urban areas, native population and rural areas) and institutional contacts. Without these elements, the objective achievement level as they were originally designed would have been much lower. The expected objectives on the labour issue were excessive and there was no adequate valuation of the real institutional resources they had or the complexity levels which mean employment generation.

.

4.7.6. Achievements in the sensitization and mobilization of local organizations against child labour

From January 2005 until December PADU was able to organize more sensitization and training workshops than originally planned:

- » Four workshops with masters and teachers.
- » Two workshops with MINSA (one in each region even if the Project included only one workshop) and two on dangerous child labour.
- » Three workshops with MIDES (the first one was the presentation of the program but they had to reorganize it because they changed the civil servants).
- » One with MITRADEL.
- » One with employers and contractors of minors.
- » One with labour unions and workers associations.

There were no similar workshops with authorities even if they were summoned to the presentation of the program in the Panama City hall (not in San Miguelito). On average there was an assistance of 20 people per workshop, mainly civil servants. The evaluations of the workshops indicate that the assistants believed these to be of great use to clarify many issues, specially legal ones.

PADR was able to sensitize and train 133 civil servants and workers of public institutions and local social organizations through 20 workshops of sensitizations and training to the committees for the defense of children's rights organized in each one of the communities where the program was applied. Among the authorities and civil servants trained we found school directors, teachers from the national art and culture institute, health assistants of MINSA, presidents and members of handicraft committees, presidents of defense committees, and members of MINGO, the secretary office of MINGO, family clubs, and associations of producers among others. During the evaluation mission there was the chance to revise some documents about the implementation of each one of these workshops checking the levels of frequency and content, considering the sensitization and training objective significant advances within local organizations. However, the lack of reports on the kind of participants of the workshops (of heterogeneous assistance) makes an exact appreciation of their achievements difficult, which would be necessary to analyze this objective.

Both programs contacted with employers through work meetings with human resource directors of the supermarkets (El Machetazo, El Rey, El Extra) and the owners of some coffee plantations (fincas de Arkapal, Café Olé, Clavo de Oro, Kotowa, Los Alpes, Santa Teresa, Café Eleta, Carmen State, Hermanos Janson, La Panda, Los Cantares, La Esmeralda and La Laguna). While in the urban area the level of commitment obtained at the end of the program have been uneven, in the rural areas we have been able to obtain the commitment of some of the estates to participate in the total attention program of Casa Esperanza.

In the sensitization of the participants both action programs recognize an important contribution of publicity campaign started by Casa Esperanza to diffuse the programs. In

this framework there were communicative materials produced such as radio and television commercial breaks, posters and art work for different media. The diffusion was made through important radio stations, newspapers, and poster distribution among state institutions, community assemblies, schools, health centres and supermarkets. The field work teams pointed out that the posters (which portrayed children working and the idea of education loss) particularly had a great impact on the population. The fact that all the activities of the workshops were advertised through press notes had a very important impact on the assistance. Additionally, there were promotional activities such as the rock concert in Chiriquí (which was not part of the initial project) which also has a positive effect on people's attitude towards the direct action programs⁵⁰.

In spite of these activities, this evaluation has collected information that indicates that the advanced steps on the sensitization and mobilization objective of local institutions and organizations on the issue of child labour is not enough⁵¹. The PADU team has said that the mayors of the program execution districts (Panama and San Miguelito) are not really sensitized with the issue (in San Miguelito for example the mayor is the administrator of a garbage dump); although externally they show an agreeing image. The same thing happens with some of the communal assemblies (for example, the assembly of Mañanitas forbade its population to enter the program). In the rural areas our interviews with authorities showed that the level of commitment of mayors and other honorable representatives is very scarce, while the level of involvement and knowledge of the traditional authorities is more evident, for example the presidents of the committees for the defense of children's rights⁵².

On the other hand, both programs have been very explicit to point out the lack of commitment of key public institutions (MIDES, INAFORP, some departments of MITRADEL, MIDA) expressed in their program of no cooperation for the specific activities of the program. At the same time, we have mentioned that there is a minority who have cooperated and have manifested their commitment (MINSA⁵³ and labour inspection direction of MITRADEL). MEDUC was another public institution which advanced in the sensitization since it offered support from all the regional school directors and teachers, but mainly in the local level, feeling that there is still a lot of work to be done with the national educational authorities. This level of contact among schools is attributed by PADU to the previous work carried out in the sector by Casa Esperanza.

Other sensitized sector in the urban level through the work of PADU have been several communal meal centres such as the ones in Santa Ana, Juan Díaz and Pedregal (PADU

⁵⁰ The publicity campaign was delayed due to the lack of specific technical capacity in Panama: they wanted a professional who could combine publicity with sensitivity to transmit a social message. An achievement which was not predicted was the training and development of abilities to professional with this profile. Another problem was the fact that the team in charge had to develop the campaign at the same time for another program developed by Casa Esperanza.

⁵¹ The consulting company in charge of the programs, which had a better contact with the execution, had the same appreciation.

⁵² In fact, in the focus group with authorities of San Félix, on Friday the 17th of February, the presidents and school teacher asked for a bigger involvement and commitment with the issue of the eradication of child labour and educational services for the most vulnerable children.

⁵³ The level of sensitization and mobilization indicators: the fact that the directions were sustained from the highest to the lowest levels (for example, the regional direction arranged to attend any working child in the health centres regardless of the area where they lived, which was fulfilled), and was the only institution which was able to unite all its health centre directors and the regional directors of the metropolitan area to get involved in the program, even asking for two or three extra meetings; under the framework of these meetings all their support was given even when the regional director was changed the same line of work was followed.

identified families that needed food in places where there were no attention centres and these meal centres gave them food); and the evangelic meal centres (faith tabernacles which facilitated a place for training and meal in Kurundú). The contact with the Catholic Church was not the same, because they do not have an institutional presence in poor areas where the project is implemented.

The advances at the sensitization level of the family parents of the benefited population in the area of child labour have been important in both the urban and rural areas. In the urban area there were ten personal social development workshops and ten more on child labour and children's rights, both with parents. The urban work team is aware that it was necessary to develop a more numerous and frequent training work to obtain an adequate sensitization and training of the parents in the issue of child labour, however this strategy was affected by the great limitations of this team: the small personnel, the great distances that had to be traveled in the areas of residence of the benefited population and the lack of material resources to travel the distances more efficiently.

The rural team organized 20 workshops of sensitizations and training on child labour with parents, one in each community attended by the program and training 344 parents (more than 200 were women). This evaluation has been able to check that the application methodology of the workshops and the topics covered were very pertinent and well planned. These workshops included entry and exit tests that allowed an exact evaluation of the use level of the participants.

As far as the monitoring of the parents to give them orientation and motivation inside the framework of total attention for the children, the PADU was able to do so only for a percentage of the parents (102 families) due to their limited personnel. On the other hand, the PADR, thanks to its communal and indigenous work strategy, was able to monitor families and communities more closely. This team has a register of the monitoring visits made to parents by the promoters of the team (for example, from March to June 2005 only one promoter had made 76 visits to homes in 14 different communities).

Both teams, but mainly the PADU, made contact and coordinated perfectly with the mothers of the families before the men, introducing, without doing it on purpose, a separation of gender in the execution of the program reinforcing the interior of the domestic family unit which are the women who watch over the educational development of the children. This was not observed in the interviews we had with some of the parents during the course of the evaluation mission (Saturday 11th of February), since the women were much more aware of the characteristics of the program and some of the men did not even know what to answer. Only mothers attended the focus group with parents which took place in the PADU (Tuesday 14th of February). The team explained that it could be due to the time of the meeting, mid afternoon, but probably this time factor has an effect on a lower attendance to the program by the fathers.

This evaluation recommends that in the second stage there should be a strengthening of the work with the fathers, mainly in the urban area. Also the program should consider developing topics related to gender and family issues to contribute to the capacity of the family unit to process changes in its internal dynamic to eliminate child labour.

Coordination with other initiatives different from those of the IPEC at a local level.

In relation to other local initiatives in the area of child labour and education, the program has run parallel to the execution of Project “Destino”, with USDOL educational initiative funds, coordinated by Creative Associates and implemented by Casa Esperanza (Hope House). Project “Destino” has duration of 4 years and started in 2004, after a preparatory stage of three months. The objective is rural areas and includes similar components to those of IPEC program, tutoring and educational support for working children. However, this one covers different communities, and under the perspective of Casa Esperanza it allows a wider coverage.

The direct action programs have been coordinated by the same personnel in Panama City, which has allowed a direct feedback and experience exchange among projects. As far as the concrete execution activities there have been different teams. Inside the country program framework there have been coordination meetings with the Project “Destino” to identify contact points in the logical frameworks, and to share information. IPEC collaborated in the providing of documentation to Casa Esperanza (whose executive presidency directs the Project “Destino”), for the elaboration stage of the proposal they use to compete against USDOL.

In general terms, the technical execution team of Casa Esperanza has recognized the contribution of everything learned within the framework of Project “Destino” for the execution of the country program. This one has benefited from the experience of the team on the training methodologies, on the production of educational materials and the development of measure instruments to increase capacities.

5. Sustainability:

The CETIPPAT's organic life is still associated to the political and personal changes of the government. Its restructure was promoted only by the arrival of a new government and the interest of a political figure of great influence such as the first lady. We must ask ourselves which incidence level will have in its organic life a new change, with the consequent renovation of civil servants. At the same time, the level of internal commitment with the eradication of the worst forms of child labour from the key participant of the CETIPPAT, like the ministers, has been put to the test in the execution of the direct action programs, with not very encouraging results.

However, we can appreciate the strengthening of the commitment level of some important sectors, mainly the organized workers and the organized sector of journalists. At the same time, in the academic level, there has been a serious involvement of some universities, UDELAS for example, and inside the public sector there are concise initiatives such as the scholarship program of IFARHU. The commitment level and involvement of these institutions support the sustaining in the mid and long term of the advances of the program.

On the other hand, the achieved advances on the formation of the public opinion seem to be very sustainable in time. In this area it seems not to be possible to return in the Panamanian society. The level of information has permitted the generation of a favourable opinion on the EPFTI which should be taken advantage of as soon as possible to step on to a second stage of specific skill development of key participants. The programs had assured advances in this area at the end of this evaluation, through the UDELAS training plan.

The obtained achievements in the development of the direct action program do not seem to be sustainable. Part of it is because they depend on economic contributions such as registration forms, materials, tools, food and medications, provisions that are not easily sustained. The depth of the attitude changes in the population still has to be seen during the next agricultural campaigns and the next school year. Nevertheless, we can say that maybe the advances will sustain themselves more in the rural areas due to the strength of the institutions of the indigenous communities and that there has been a certain impact in this area in the issue of creation of alternative means of income.

The opportunity to maintain themselves in the education system and the improvement in the performance are very valued direct action program achievements by the parents and the children at the end of this school year; this can be an important starting point to obtain their commitment to persevere on the program, abandoning the migration guidelines and the immediate search for resources. However, the lack of opportunities to generate income, an issue in which the Project has not been able to do a lot yet, threatens the sustainability of this achievement in the mid term.

6. Pertinence:

Our main observation on the issue is that the program has not been completely pertinent on the attention of minors involved in the worst forms of child labour. The program has attended an important proportion of children who were not working at the moment of being contacted and who were not necessarily brothers or sisters of children of working children or son of daughters of migrating parents. The program has also attended children who declared doing domestic work inside of their own homes and agricultural work in their family land. Some of this work was sporadic and soft. The program has also incorporated children who were occupied in activities that are not the profile of worst forms of child labour, like the supermarket packers.

This evaluation considers that there should have been a bigger emphasis in the search for working children in the informal commerce sector in the urban areas, just like the occupational profile indicated in the national child labour survey. There should have been a bigger inclusion of the children who work in the garbage dumps, more than the children who are packers.

We consider of great relevant that in a second stage of the program there must be a strict evaluation which persons (children and adolescents) belong to the benefited population, and to clarify the criteria to measure who is a worker, as well as which ones are the worst forms of child labour to be included.

The problem of child labour and children working under the worst possible forms is not a problem that has been solved in the Panamanian society, so it is very pertinent to extend the intervention.

7. Conclusions

In the final evaluation of the Project we have to consider the importance of the factors that delayed a few months its real start. This fact limits in a great way the achievements that could be demanded from the Project. Since it was executed in a very short period of time and in the middle of technical shortage, the general appreciation is that the rate of advance in the consecution of the objectives has been very significative, even more if we take into account the Central American context. The analysis of the process shows that this has been possible thanks to the effort and personal compromise of the country program team, as well as the institutional strengths of the executing agency and the degree of commitment of the team. Both teams have made the Project advance through a great personal effort and this needs to be valued justly.

According to our evaluation the main advances of the Project are, first, in the diffusion and information dissemination work within the Panamanian society. This is an achievement that seems sustainable in the mid and long terms: the Panamanian society is sensitized regarding child labour, there are sectors that have taken a stand and they have generated a consensus on the necessity of EPFTI. There has been an achievement of an

important compromise of the mass media with the issue and the society is regularly informed on both the child labour situation and the advances of the country program.

Second, the advances are placed in the interinstitutional coordination, where a lot of advances were made fast thanks to the success of the diffusion campaign. The official restructuring of CETIPPAT, its high level launching and its current organic life constitute the most important achievements, even if the current level of commitment of different public institutions is heterogeneous. There is still a lot to be done for the public institutions committed to the PFTI to develop concise actions which will reveal their institutional compromise with the issue. There also a lot to be done to achieve measures that will guarantee that these institutions will be truly trained to assume their compromises and use economic resources, human capital, team and infrastructure.

A third level of very important advance for the country program has been made widening the legal framework with the culmination of the law proposal for the total protection of childhood and adolescence, waiting to be approved. All the previous discussion process among different institutions grouped in COLPINA is a richness that contributes to the lawfulness of this norm and will subscribe for observance. At the same time, the effort of the country to define the worst forms of child labour in a consensus is another element of extreme importance for the sustaining of the laws. However, on the operative field of the application of the law, the program has suffered an important delay in the training of attorneys at law, which could have been avoided concentrating on the initial design of the Project. Only now there are actions to train the justice operators.

As far as the training and skill generation to fight the EPFTI, the country program shows, to our understanding, smaller achievements. The training actions were not focused on the training of specific participants but there were in a heterogeneous manner and not systematic for different participants. The absence of a system to evaluate the trainings and the dispersion of the participants impedes making a balance of the achievement of knowledge. This evaluation considers that an important advance has been made in the development of capacities and specific skills mainly on the staff of professionals and technicians who has worked in a close manner to the country program or have received technical consultancy directly from it. The training of participants by itself is does not seem as one of the great achievements of the program. These situations would change with the implementations of the UDELAS training program, although it is necessary to take the appropriate measures to obtain the active and beneficial institutional participation in the program.

On the other hand, the initiatives coming from different social participants, the country program has obtained two important initiatives with the public commitments signed by the organized workers and the journalists, but we have not obtained a public compromise of the employers, even if the public institutions have shown important initiatives in the EPFTI field, such as the scholarship program of INFARHU, but others seem today more formal than real, more sanctioning than preventive, and still located in a high hierarchy level before than technical everyday work. Other institutions have shown initiatives from

the developed work by the program; however it is necessary a theoretical precision because another initiative can be considered.

Without a doubt one of the most important achievements of the country program is the restructuring and launching of the CETIPPAT, which is recognized among the institutions involved on the issue of child labour, and it is considered by the same integrants as a success. However, there are some limitations for the fulfillment of the acquired commitments by the integrants and there is an uneven level of compromise with the issue, even if the participations of the first lady is assured. The CETIPPAT is in a key moments for consolidation once the moment of installation and first meetings passes, and it has the challenge to obtain its own private life beyond the political pressure of the government.

One of the most important objectives of the country program was not achieved: the elaboration of the national plan for EPFTI. This happened because of the same difficulties that impeded the launching of the CETIPPAT. Both facts point out the necessity to consider, in the design of the programs, the context level of the country where we are working to define results and the assigned terms to obtain them. The design did not consider the internal political processes, the political orientations of the government nor the technical capacities of the country, which gave room to several delays in the execution.

The execution of the direct action programs suffered an excessive delay due to a prolonged process of approval of the proposals of the program, the high formal demands of the country program to approve them, the lack of training in the filling of the report forms of the financial agency, the changes in them, the prerequisites of the financial agencies which had different characteristics from local ones, the delay on the initial payment (in the rural area), the delivery of an unknown monitoring data base for the implementing agency, which was not oriented for the benefited population and difficulties in the collections of base lines. We conclude that, in a big way, all these problems were due to the lack of a previous appropriate evaluation of the local characteristics as far as the institutional profile, the political context, the level of cognitive and institutional resources of the benefited communities. At the same time, there was not a stricter technical consultancy of the country program for the difficulties of the implementing agency, due to the low experience in technical aspects.

The direct intervention on the benefited population still shows weaknesses in the achievement of the most important results: the separation of NNAT from the worst forms of child labour and the creation of income opportunities for the parents of the families. The attended population includes an important proportion of children that do not fit the NNAT profile in PFTI, but it was a population with a big educational shortage. A more exhaustive analysis of the population would have discarded some of the cases included but there was a lack of technical advice and a stricter general orientation on the benefited population to the execution teams by the country program. This was probably due to the small size of the national team and its concentration on the issue of institutional coordination.

The least achieved area of the PAD has been the generation of alternative means of income for the parents of the NNAT which shows that the initial design wanted excessive objectives due to an inadequate valuation of the real resources they had and the complexity of the employment problem. It was achieved to generate 11 projects of self management for 11 parents in the urban area and 12 projects for 128 parents in the rural area. The task was especially difficult for the urban area due to the high dependency on the institutional support from organizations committed to it. Both in the urban area and in the rural area this absence created an informal appeal strategy for personal contacts. In this line of action is where there was the biggest evidence of the fragility of the institutional commitment of some members of the CETIPPAT. Despite this situation, in the rural area there are good perspectives to continue advancing in the projects of self management because they have developed a system with fund that renews during the same exercise and has been motivated by INAFORP.

The sensitization of the participants at the local level is a relative achievement because there was no specific work done with the specific participants in the workshops. In the design of these workshops the population objective was specified but they had a heterogeneous assistance, with the parents of NNAT one of the main groups. There is work to be done in this area with key authorities to focus specifically with each participant. Despite this there were a good number of workshops (20 in the urban area and 20 in the rural area)

8.Lessons learned and good potential practices

The experience shows that the increase of institutional capacity and the quality of response on the EPFTI depends not only on the diffusion, training, coordination, planning and legal framework but also on the internal structure of the public organizations. The country program has achieved a relative increase of the institutional capacity and a great development in the coordination levels, but the institutional capacity of response is still weak because of the institutional characteristics of the organizations directly involved in the eradication⁵⁴. The learned lesson is the necessity to consider in future programs a line of work oriented to achieve the necessary co ordinations to pressure changes in the institutional level.

The experience has shown that the levels of coordination, planning and legal development to aspire depend on the success of the previous diffusion work. The experience of the country program shows how through a well organized diffusion campaign in the media can generate a public debate and a consensus when taking decisions related to child labour. The Panamanian experience also shows that when you generate public opinion around the issue the other levels of intervention strategy are facilitated: there is a bigger institutional disposition to train, coordinate and plan. The risk

⁵⁴ Just like the lack of personnel, the one that is available is very busy and not so motivated to assume a new task, the internal functioning that does not favour the multiplication of the received training, the lack of institutional economic resources destined to the EPFTI, the lack of material resources to attend a very disperse objective population at a national level, and the infrastructure limitation among others.

is that all of this is only explanatory if the internal institutional changes do not take place. All the upcoming programs should start from a previous analysis of the starting point as far as the knowledge and familiarity of the society with the issue of child labour for the rest of the work.

In the execution strategy the best practice has been coordinating base organizations to contact the population in the urban areas, and even more to cooperate intensively in the execution of activities in the rural areas. All the upcoming projects, especially in indigenous areas, should be in contact with the population and with their representative organizations, present the project and its actions before them and evaluate the possibility of including some of the communal members in the actions of the project. All of this in a systematic way and favoring the permanent exchange among the different organizations to increase the sense of belonging to a movement of great social reach.

An important lesson learned is that work with base organizations reduces the impact of geographical dispersion of the benefited population; it facilitates the monitoring process to the central team and possibilities better results. The ideal model is a central team that trains and coordinates periodically with educator of the same population. This way the necessity to have a big team and to count with resources to travel all over the area of execution is reduced.

At the same time, the experience has shown that the separation of children from labour and their reintegration in the educational system not only depends on the monitoring, diffusion and social mobilization, but first of all on the level of consolidation of the institutions of the communities. In the urban areas its weakness impeded a more systematic work while in the rural areas its strength and autonomy of the indigenous organizations promoted the service. All the upcoming programs should consider a quick analysis of the communal organizational level in the country and be aware of the heterogeneity among them, because of the cultural composition or the geographical distribution, among other factors of differentiation.

Another important factor is the sensitization and organizational strengthening at the previous training level received by the social organizations from other international organisms. The actions of PADR were benefited by the work that UNICEFF was developing with Casa Esperanza (Hope House) since the year 2000 in the local sensitization, consciousness and education with the objective to promote the access of NNAT to education and health. This work had strengthened the actions of the committees of defense of children's rights, so there was a prepared terrain on which the country program could work.

The program also needed to evaluate completely the context and political and institutional conditions at the beginning of the Project to avoid unnecessary delays. This evaluations must include: "1) the disposition, political will and compromise of the interested parts to support the IPEC in the fight against PFTI; 2) the existence and availability of implementation agencies and institutions that have the necessary infrastructure and experience to carry out successful action plans", as mentioned in the

EMT; in addition, 3) the real existence of institutional necessary resources to execute actions of the project, as well as the political will to observe the assumed commitments by the institutions; 4) the organizational characteristics and the information level on the problem of the objective population.

9. Recommendations considering a possible second phase:

Regarding the design and implementation program:

1. It is recommended to extend the country program at least two more years to give it continuity and sustainability to the achievements up to this point and not to abandon the population since it has been benefited and has manifested its desire to continue.
2. It is recommended to revise the program design to readjust the indicators, making them more exact and to precise concepts. Also make a complete revision of the documents to make sure the program document and the report guides are coherent.
3. It is recommended to evaluate the design previously to check some of the local relevant characteristics throughout this experience. This is important to define realistic objectives and establish the pending intervention sequences.
4. It is recommended to enlarge the work team of the country program maintaining a national coordinator but assigning technical responsibilities about the two immediate objectives. There should be someone in charge of the supervision, monitoring and technical advise of the direct action programs, this includes visits to the intervention areas.
5. It is recommended to apply to the Pad the monitoring process to provide periodical information to take decisions and correct in time the possible problems.
6. It is recommended to favour the Exchange between the rural and urban action programs, and among these and the Panama team. Even if the problems are different in both areas, the objectives are similar and the work strategies could enrich each other. The Panama team should be linked to the execution of the PAD's to monitor and strengthen its own interinstitutional coordination work as well as field work information. An adequate method could be the programming of a meeting every three months to Exchange experiences.

Regarding the immediate objective 1:

1. Work in the internal strengthening of the CETIPPAT and the diffusion of the image and objectives towards the public in general. First, elaborate an operative plan for the first year which shows the institutions and their responsibilities. Second, assure that

the included institutions develop necessary mechanisms to fulfill the acquired commitment in the fight against PFTI.

2. Include in the design of the program the actions oriented for immediate objective 1 (increase the institutional capacity and quality of response), activities of political incidence destined to achieve institutional relevant changes such as the budget, personnel, training, and resources for the interior of the country.
3. Consider specially the institutional strengthening work and the organizations of the population: neighborhood committees in the city and committees of defense and other organizations in the rural areas. These are near the affected population; they know the problems and can help with the actions to eradicate child labour. It is vital and urgent to integrate them in the CETYPPAT, develop work of institutional strengthening with them (especially in the urban areas) for the autonomous defense of their communities and methodological training to fight child labour.
4. Work in the strengthening of the compromise with the EPFT of the organizations of the civil society because they can be the guarantee for the issue to survive the political changes of the country.
5. Prioritize the elaboration of a national plan for the EPFTI.
6. Continue and extend in the second phase, training to specialized participants, judges, prosecutors, magistrates, legislators, and specific civil servants involved in the direct action against child labour. Also develop specific methodology of attention and relation with the users: children, adolescents and parents.
7. Insist in the work with employers, planned initially but does not have labour union commitments.

Regarding the immediate objective 2:

1. As the EMT recommended, elaborate design guides for the PAD useful for the IPEC, implementation agency, and users; include training activities in this design which would be useful considering the technical capacity of the country.
2. Consider a revision of the prerequisites to fill in the report forms of advance (ITA's) to adjust to the characteristics of the benefited population. And for future projects the technical team must consider a proper training to fill correctly these forms.
3. The PAD's must generate information of the objective population as a base line and as a first form to contact them and evaluate their problems they must face during the execution. The forms of information must be revised by the technical team of the IPEC and avoid changing in the middle of the program. It is also recommended to use

the SPSS package. Also there should be an intense training of the executing agencies on the data bases, reports, processes and vital tools for the execution.

4. The technical team of the IPEC must monitor the population included in the attention service, to adjust to the profile of the population objective of the program. It should be aware of the definition problems as a result of the field work, and it should give a theoretical orientation to know when to include certain segments of population.
5. It is recommended for a second stage an urgent preplanning of strategies of generating of alternative means of income for the parents of NNAT, especially in the urban area. It is necessary to work on the adaptation of the public institutions which give educational and finance services for the need of the population objective in both areas.
6. In a second stage the connection with parents should be strengthened, both fathers and mothers and not only in the urban areas. The program should consider developing issues linked with gender topic and family, and to contribute that the family unit can process the changes introduced to eliminate child labour.
7. It is recommended to prioritize participants for the issues of sensitization and training for authorities and institutions at the local level and to avoid the activities and the training to disperse to a heterogeneous public.