



International Programme on the Elimination of Child Labour (IPEC)



International
Labour
Office

IPEC Evaluation

Supporting the Time-Bound Programme on the Elimination of the Worst Forms of Child Labour in the Republic of the Philippines

**PHI/02/P50/USA
P.270 07 343 051**

An independent final evaluation by a team of external consultants

July 2007

This document has not been professionally edited.

NOTE ON THE EVALUATION PROCESS AND REPORT

This independent evaluation was managed by ILO-IPEC's Design, Evaluation and Documentation Section (DED) following a consultative and participatory approach. DED has ensured that all major stakeholders were consulted and informed throughout the evaluation and that the evaluation was carried out to highest degree of credibility and independence and in line with established evaluation standards.

The evaluation was carried out a team of external consultants¹. The field mission took place in July 2007. The opinions and recommendations included in this report are those of the authors and as such serve as an important contribution to learning and planning without necessarily constituting the perspective of the ILO or any other organization involved in the project.

Funding for this project evaluation was provided by the United States Department of Labor. This report does not necessarily reflect the views or policies of the United States Department of Labor nor does mention of trade names, commercial products, or organizations imply endorsement by the United States Government.

¹ John F. A. Krijnen, Angelita Resurreccion

TABLE OF CONTENTS

ACRONYMS AND ABBREVIATIONS	4
1. EXECUTIVE SUMMARY	5
2.0 INTRODUCTION	11
2.1 Child labour in the Philippines	11
2.2 Background information on ILO-IPEC and Support Project to the TBP	12
2.3 Programme information.....	13
2.4 Scope and purpose of the Expanded Final Evaluation	14
2.5 Evaluation Methodology	15
3.0 VALIDITY OF DESIGN	17
3.1 Problem analysis	17
3.2 Description of target group	18
3.3 Development and immediate objectives	20
3.4 Internal and external logic	20
3.5 Indicators	20
3.6 Critical assumptions	21
3.7 Project Strategies	22
3.8 Duration	23
4. DELIVERY PROCESS	24
4.1 Initial delays in implementation	24
4.2 Factors affecting project execution	25
4.3 Management	25
4.4 Follow-up of recommendations MTE 2005	26
4.5 Future adjustments	28
5.0 IMPLEMENTATION ARRANGEMENTS	29
5.1 International inputs	29
5.2 National inputs	29
6. PERFORMANCE	30
6.1 Relevance	30
6.2 Effectiveness	30
6.3 Efficiency	35
6.4 Sustainability	36
6.5 Causality.....	38
6.6 Alternative strategies.....	38
7. TARGET GROUP IMPACT ASSESSMENT	40
7.1 Scope of work	40
7.2 Sources of data	40
7.3 Sampling of the survey.....	41
7.4 Profile of the respondents	42
7.5 Involvement in the programme.....	43
7.6 Impact of the programme	45
7.7 Comments by External Final Evaluation Team.....	50
8. CONCLUSIONS	52
8.1 Project design	52
8.2 Delivery process.....	52
8.3 Implementation arrangements	53
8.4 Performance.....	53
9. RECOMMENDATIONS	58
9.1 Project design	58
9.2 Delivery process.....	58
9.3 Performance.....	59
10. GOOD PRACTICES AND LESSONS LEARNED	60
10.1 Best practices.....	60
10.2 Lessons learned.....	60
ANNEXES.....	62
ANNEX 1. Terms of Reference	62
ANNEX 2: SPECIFIC QUESTIONS ASKED IN THE TERMS OF REFERENCE.....	80
ANNEX 3: STAKEHOLDER WORKSHOP	88

ACRONYMS AND ABBREVIATIONS

A & E	Accreditation and Equivalency
ABK	Education Initiative Project
ALS	Alternative Learning System
AP	Action Programme
AWFCI	Association for the Welfare of Filipino Children
CDW	Child Domestic Work
CERD	Centre for Rural Development
CLMS	Child Labour Monitoring System
CSEC	Commercial Sex
CTA	Chief Technical Adviser
DepEd	Department of Education
DOLE	Department of Labour and Employment
ECOP	Employers' Confederation of the Philippines
EFE	Expanded Final Evaluation
IA	Implementing Agency
ILO	International Labour Organization
IM	Instructional Manager
IPEC	International Programme for the Elimination of Child Labour
LGU	Local Government Unit
MTE	Mid-Term Evaluation
NCCL	National Committee for Child Labour
NCR	National Capital Region
NCS	National Survey on Children
NPACL	National Programme Against Child Labour
OHS	Occupational Health and Safety
PoS	Project of Support
PRODOC	Project Document
PTBP	Philippine Time Bound Programme
QK	Quidan Kaisahan
SIFI	Sugar Industry Foundation Inc.
SPIF	Strategic Programme Impact Framework
TBP	Time Bound Programme
TESDA	Technical Education and Skills Development Authority
TPR	Technical Progress Report
USDOL	United States Department of Labour
WFCL	Worst forms of child labour

Acknowledgements

The consultants would like to express their sincere gratitude to the ILO-IPEC and ILO sub-regional offices, the PoS Project team, as well as to the involved partner organizations for their cordial and dedicated support, which created a convenient atmosphere for a thorough analysis of the entire programme in the little time which was available.

1. EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

1.1 Introduction

In 2001, there were about 4 million economically active children in the Philippines, aged 5 to 17 years, which constitutes 16.2% of the total population of children in the same age group. Sixty percent, or 2.4 million children, were exposed to hazardous working conditions. As compared to 1995 figures an increase in absolute numbers has been observed of 12%. Impressive educational enrolment rates have not translated in higher productivity and incomes. In the absence of reliable data, it is estimated that there are 155,000 children who work in the six priority areas of the National Programme against Child Labour (NPACL). At the onset of the project, ILO-IPEC has commissioned a number of rapid assessments and baseline studies which provide a profile on the magnitude of these six priority areas.

During the past decade and with the Philippines' ratification of ILO Convention 182, in 2000, the goal of eliminating the WFCL has become a priority in the country's development agenda. In June 2002, the Philippine Time Bound Programme (PTBP) was launched, which forms a major component of the NPACL. Phase I of the Project of Support to the PTBP started on 30 September 2002, and was extended beyond the initial completion date of 31 December 2006, by another eight months. The project is addressing two strategic components: (1) Strengthening the enabling environment for the elimination of the WFCL and (2) Reducing the incidence of selected WFCL through direct action for child labourers and their families.

The Timebound Programme as a whole is responsible for 44,500 children, where ILO-IPEC was responsible for withdrawing 19,000 children and preventing 2,500 children from exploitative labour, for a total of 21,500. A breakdown of this figure shows that the Project of Support was to provide 14,500 children (2,500 at risk and 12,000 working children) with transitional education services or vocational training. Additionally, 7,000 working children aged 15-17 years were expected to be withdrawn from hazards and abuse at work. The Project Document stipulates that the project will be implemented in tandem with the USDOL-funded Education Initiative (ABK). ABK is responsible for another 23,000 children.

ILO-IPEC has fielded the present Expanded Final Evaluation (EFE) mission to (1) determine if the project achieved its stated Immediate Objectives, (2) build off the findings and recommendations of the 2005 Mid-Term Evaluation, (3) provide guidance and scope and design of a second phase, and (4) field a separate Target Group Impact Assessment Study, the results of which will be integrated into the EFE.

1.2 Project design

The excellent problem analysis of the project document indicates to what extent child labour is correlated with poverty and how modestly especially the rural poor have access to affordable and good quality education, which is preparing the children for skills in demand on the labour market. ILO-IPEC's holistic approach, strengthening the livelihood conditions of households with working children, or children at risk, through livelihood skills and social safety nets, as a compensation for the "loss of an economical asset" is an appropriate solution to tackle the root causes of the problem. However convincing this holistic approach, given the relatively limited resources and very short-term interventions, in face of the magnitude of the problem, it can hardly be expected that the project is in a position to provide a "*most significant contribution to the elimination of the WFCL*" as stated in the Strategic Programme Impact Framework. Merely first experiences can be tried out which, when proven successful, can be validated and scaled up. In order to make solutions work, considerable political commitment is needed in favour of

equitable development and legislation in various fields. Many of these frame-conditions are beyond the management capacities of the ILO.

The decision to make AP implementation conditional on the establishment of a master-list of potential beneficiaries by external research teams did not prove to be a judicious one. The use of different formats and imprecision have led to lengthy delays in the implementation of APs and, moreover, it became a source of conflict between the two projects, ABK and ILO-IPEC PoS. The master-list did not contain information on household economy and for that reason this has, at times, led to insecure selection of beneficiaries (not systematically based on poverty criteria) and to a split in the mutually supportive approaches which, according to the Strategic Programme Impact Framework, were supposed to be implemented in conjunction: targeting members of the same household simultaneously through education services and strengthening of incomes.

It would be appropriate to pay tribute to the way in which the project document, progress, status reports and APs scrupulously respect the ILO-IPEC logical framework structure. In this way, it potentially becomes an effective instrument for monitoring progress and for steering implementation strategies, provided that the therefore required resources and capacity are made available and that planned activities are allowed to be readjusted through activity monitoring. In fact, in the monitoring of the project and its constituent APs more attention was given to quantitative monitoring of outputs than to the measurement of sustainable outcomes. Critical assumptions which were a necessary condition for success were mainly formulated at a macro level but were lacking at field level. Detailed activity planning, sometimes four years ahead has no sense.

In order to effectively contribute to the elimination of the WFCL, the two project strategic components need to be intrinsically linked. On the one hand, in order to create awareness on the relevancy of child labour policies and legislation, the later need to be fed with concrete experiences. On the other hand, direct action should be placed in an appropriate legal framework in order to legitimate action, and should be complemented by policies contributing to tackling the root causes of child labour (equitable development, poverty alleviation, access to affordable basic services, etc.). In spite of a high commitment to child labour, this interrelated aspect has not been respected everywhere because certain APs were allowed to be developed and implemented in isolation and were not always addressing the direct action components in a holistic manner.

The question of adequate duration is difficult to answer. According to the logical framework methodology, immediate objectives ought to be defined in such a way, that they can be fully achieved within the implementation period and by doing so the project contributes to the development objective. In the present case, the immediate objectives have been defined as if they were development objectives. The only time-bound standard set (in the TBP) is 2015 by which the 75% reduction in WFCL should be achieved, but no process and time-bound steps have been incorporated in the formulation of the project's immediate objectives.

1.3 Delivery process

Two major aspects have caused constraints and delays in project implementation: (1) the master-listing of project beneficiaries, and (2) the linkage with the ABK project. The two are interrelated. To this we would like to add the early resignation of the first CTA. By the time of the MTE, in November 2005, only nine APs were under implementation and another 31 in the pipeline. In order to achieve the project targets, USDOL approved to extend the project duration by eight months. Given, on the one hand, the apparent need to develop, under time pressure, many APs and, on the other hand, the intensive screening by ILO-IPEC, this resulted

in several APs which were cut short in duration and which, thereby, proved to be too ambitious for the remaining time-span.

The big challenge during project implementation was to aim for sustainable outcomes, by creating synergies and complementarities between the outputs of both sets of strategic components. Given the huge time-pressure and relatively limited absorption and implementation capacity of implementing agencies, resulting in relatively modest funding, this highly time and energy absorbing coordination effort was not given the attention, which was needed. Because of a lack of active field monitoring and strategic project steering, as well as due to pressure for achieving numerical targets, various agencies rather concentrated on outputs than on outcome. Methodological flaws were not always sufficiently corrected and opportunities for synergy not sufficiently availed. The better quality programmes were found with (1) the more professional and development-oriented organizations with a long term presence and thereby well-established constituencies and alternative sources of funding, (2) with enlightened leaders, and (3) where inter-agency collaboration was coordinated best. Also many community-based organizations demonstrated commitment but lacked matching funds to sustain activities initiated under the auspices of the project.

The project has been innovative in creating an enabling environment at a meso level. In this manner an approach was chosen, in line with the national policy on decentralized governance. Apart from a few very successful examples, time dedicated to direct action has been too short to be conclusive on the long-term suitability and affordability of solutions. Moreover, many APs have been developed and implemented in relative isolation and lack external and internal coherence. A future project will, therefore, have to build synergies between mutually supportive actions within the context of the two strategic components. By its sheer nature such a holistic approach should be regionally packaged and coordinated.

1.4 Implementation arrangements

International and national inputs have been of good quality. The ILO-IPEC team is extremely motivated. IPEC partnership in the Philippines works through a broad-based and strongly committed alliance of government, employers, workers, non-government and civil society organizations. Many of these partnerships had been developed well before the PoS was launched, during IPEC's work in programmes on trafficking, mining/quarrying, domestic services, agriculture plantations, pyrotechnics, deep-sea fishing and prostitution.

1.5 Performance

Relevance: The country continues to suffer from the problems that have given rise to child labour: widespread poverty, high unemployment rates, high costs of going to school, lack of access to school system, unfriendly school and learning environments, curriculum not relevant to local socio-economic and cultural environments, and parents themselves lacking and not valuing education. Therefore it can be said that the problems which gave rise to the project still exist. At the same time, the project has been instrumental in modestly trying out first experiences to tackle the root causes through APs at meso and micro level, which ought to be brought to maturity before considering scaling up to a policy level.

Effectiveness: The project's specific contribution was especially to support the NCLC to take down child labour friendly policies and legislation to the regional level. This had led to the creation of child labour committees at provincial, municipal and local levels. The project has also been very instrumental in making education policies more responsive to the needs of child labour, working children and children at risk. The project has been particularly effective in creating an enabling environment (immediate objectives 1 to 5) and it has boosted ILO-IPEC's

ongoing work in this field. With regards to “direct action” experiences are varied. Many APs have been too short to prove the appropriateness and affordability of solutions, whereas again others have been very convincing. The later were mostly implemented by implementing agencies with a long-term field presence or where there was a strong inter-agency coordination. Child labour monitoring systems developed at various administrative levels vary in quality and frequently do not go beyond a simple listing of child beneficiaries. High commitment for child labour is hardly ever matched by corresponding funds which make a sustained continuation of activities initiated under the project questionable.

With regards to enhancing family income and access to social safety nets, the experience is just as varied. A small number of implementing agencies managed to develop self-financed schemes of micro-credit and micro-health insurance, avoiding external dependencies on donor funding. Such credit schemes were linked to market-oriented skill training. Again other agencies contributed marginally to the strengthening of livelihood and entrepreneurial skills by providing training in skills with a questionable market potential and added value. Many parents interviewed, appreciated this training but did not find access to productive investments. Often livelihood strengthening and educational support did not target the same families, breaking the magic of the holistic approach. AT odds with our limited field observations, the April 2007 TPR mentions 4,471 adult family members reporting increased incomes.

With regards to actions in primary, vocational and non-formal education and other non education related services for children, it has been observed that the USDOL target of 21,500 was exceeded by 37%. All 29,388 children effectively reached were supported through education-related services. The composition between boys and girls was perfectly balanced.

The unique contribution of the project was in Alternative Learning Systems, helping working children to reintegrate the formal schooling system through the so-called Accreditation and Equivalency Programme. Low passage marks can be explained by a too short duration of these weekend courses (longest contract observed in impact assessment was six months). Experiences in vocational training (e.g., SIFI and the Balacod City Government) show how market-oriented skill training can be effectively linked to job placement.

Sustainability: Institutional and financial sustainability varied over regions and partners. The biggest challenge at the level of communities and households is the mobilization of financial resources for school fees. The continued use of external subsidies maintains a dependency on donors and sponsors which does not appear to be a model apt for replication. The country’s decentralization policy provides an opportunity to levy local taxes to guarantee that there will be affordable education for all. An alternative is the development of a self-financed savings-credit scheme, as successfully practiced by AWFCI.

1.6 Target Group Impact Assessment

A separate Impact Study has been implemented according to ILO-IPEC’s Tracer Methodology. Its results show that the project has modestly contributed to a decline in child labour and an increase in formal school enrolment. During the implementation of the programme it self, the number of children in the fishing sector who continued to attend school is still high. There are fewer children enrolled in school in the mining and quarrying sector but the number of cases is minimal. Compared to children working in the fishing industry, there are lower numbers of beneficiaries who continued to attend school in the pyrotechnics sector and in commercial sex. In addition, with regards to former beneficiaries, it is noteworthy that after attending all programmes or receiving services, a significant number of respondents have continued or decided to attend formal school. 41% of the adult respondents reported an improvement in health conditions and 55% said that the economic condition of the family had improved. A

majority of respondents in mining and CSEC believe that work is acceptable for children below 12.

Positive assessments on “ALS helping children facilitate their re-entry in school” and “increases in household” income have not been substantiated by the mission’s own observations.

1.7 Recommendations

Project design

- Complement studies on child labour by the use of the so-called “participatory livelihood assessments” at a household level.
- Detailed activity planning to be finalized as APs progress, even as Project immediate objectives and expected results are respected.
- Quantitative targets to be set as a function of implementing and absorption capacity of IAs.
- Indicate process indicators: a critical time path linked to a minimum of time-bound results.

Delivery process

- Develop a standardized CLMS to be coordinated at regional level, with support of all partners.
- Livelihood and education support should not be shorter than two years.
- While maintaining the present status quo with ABK, reinitiate coordination for shared learning and creating synergy.
- Capacity strengthening of staff and partners in participatory planning, monitoring and learning systems, as well as in livelihood assessment.
- Pursue an institutional learning culture. Systematically validate and share experiences with partners. Accept weaknesses as an opportunity.
- Solicit ILO support in enterprise promotion and micro-credit.
- Put emphasis on the development of institutionally and financially sustainable solutions. Gradually increase counterpart contribution in order to avoid external donor dependency.
- Follow a packaged regional approach of mutually supportive APs under DOLE coordination, in a limited number of regions.

Performance

- Avail the opportunity to match training in market-oriented livelihood and entrepreneurial skills with financial capital generated through savings and credit schemes (see AWFCI).
- Support to strengthening livelihood/enterprise skills and credit to be made conditional on effective willingness to withdraw children from WFCL and to join an educational support programme.
- Match vocational training with job placement through coordination with private sector.
- Sidetrack non performing implementing agencies during implementation according to commonly agreed minimal quality criteria.
- Aim for economies of scale: create a critical mass of beneficiaries to justify overheads.
- Support decentralized government in levying decentralized and progressive school taxes in order to complement user fees and achieve affordable education for all.
- Avoid strong peaks in formulation, approval and monitoring of APs: distribution in time.
- ILO to link up to equitable development policies (collective bargaining, continued agrarian reform).

1.8 Good practices and lessons learned

Good practices: (1) AWFCI in micro-credit and micro-health insurance, (2) QK in agriculture extension on land obtained after agrarian reform, (3) SIFI in linking vocational training to job-placement, and (4) BIDLISIW in child and family healing, recovery and re-integration.

Lessons learned:

- Quantitative targets to be based on implementation capacity of implementing agencies.
- Identification of beneficiaries to be an integrated part of mandate to implementing agencies.
- Integration of “participatory livelihood assessment” throughout beneficiary identification.
- Use of standardized, regionally managed CLMS, instead of master-listing, gradually fed with results of participatory livelihood assessments.
- Strategic project components to be implemented in a mutually supportive way.
- Elements constituting ILO-IPEC’s approach to be implemented in a holistic way; focus on households.
- Packaged regional approaches provide better synergy.
- Match self-financed saving-credit schemes with training in entrepreneurial skills.
- The elimination of the WFCL should be accompanied by measures of equitable development (collective bargaining, continued agrarian reform, progressive taxation).

2.0 INTRODUCTION

2.1 Child labour in the Philippines

The children of the Philippines work so that poor households can diversify their portfolio of income sources, as an insurance against fluctuations in adult income or unforeseen losses in income that may threaten the survival of the households.

According to the most recent National Survey on Children (NCS, 2001) there were about 4 million economically active children in the Philippines, aged 5 to 17 years, which constitutes 16.2% of the total population of children in the same age group. Out of the 4 million child workers, about 60% or 2.4 million were exposed to hazardous working conditions. As compared to the 1995 NCS, an increase in absolute numbers has been observed of 12% (from 3.6 to 4.0 million) and a slight proportional increase (from 16.0 to 16.2%). Half of the working children are aged 10 years and below. The relative proportion of working children in the age group 10-14 years has increased from 44.7% (1995) to 48.1% (2001). An analysis across industries has disclosed that more than half of the working children were engaged in agriculture, hunting and forestry, 5.2% in fishing, around 18.0% in trade-related activities, 5.7% in private households and 4.6% in manufacturing enterprises (cumulative subtotal approximately 84% of child labour). Additionally to this, the Project Document states that a significantly large (non-specified) number of children are working in mining, quarrying and construction work. Almost half of the working children work more than 5 hours per day.

In spite of impressive educational enrolment rates this has not translated to higher productivity and incomes for many Filipinos. Educational opportunities are unequally distributed especially among the poor in the rural areas, where almost two-thirds of the poor people of working age failed to reach high school. Families that can afford to shoulder the cost of education are effectively subsidized, thus dissipating limited government resources that could have been used for improving the quality of education and to support poor students.

According to the 2001 NCS, one out of every three working children has dropped out from school, whereas almost a quarter reported that their work seriously interfered with school performance. This is particularly the case in the WFCL, like deep sea fishing, mining/quarrying and sugar cane plantations. It is obvious that children involved in domestic work and prostitution cannot combine work with schooling. Work hazards are compounded by the fact that many children are found working in the informal sector where they are beyond the protective reach of labour legislation, inspection and enforcement.

In the absence of reliable and verifiable data, in the project document it is estimated that there are 155,000 children² who work in the WFCL in the six priority areas of the National Programme against Child Labour: (1) child labour in sugarcane plantations, (2) Mining and quarrying, (3) pyrotechnics, (4) deep-sea fishing, (5) domestic work, and (6) child prostitution. . At the onset of the Project, ILO-IPEC has commissioned a number of rapid assessments and baseline studies which provide a profile on the magnitude of the problem in the six priority areas of WFCL.

² Source: Project Document, chapter 1.1, page 5.

2.2 Background information on ILO-IPEC and Support Project to the TBP

Since the adoption of the Philippines-ILO Indicative Framework for Action, ILO-IPEC has focused on the Elimination of the Worst Forms of Child Labour, through a succession of country programmes which started in 1995 and lasted until 2002. During this period, ILO-IPEC equally implemented a number of sector-specific projects in small-scale mining in Camarines Norte, funded by the Government of Finland and the USDOL-funded sub-regional programme in the Fishing and Footwear sector, in Oriental Negros, Binan and Laguna, respectively.

During the past decade and with the Philippines' ratification of ILO Convention 182 (1999) in November 2000, the goal of eliminating the Worst Forms of child Labour has become a priority on the country's national development agenda. On 28 June 2002, the Philippine Time-Bound Programme was launched, which forms a major component of the National Programme against Child Labour (NPACL), through which a commitment has been made to achieve a 75% reduction in the Worst Forms of Child Labour (WFCL) by the year 2015. The Government of the Philippines has integrated child labour as a priority issue in the 2001-2004 Medium-Term Development Plan, as well as through the 2002 National Programme against Child Labour, which serves as the overall national framework for action against child labour.

As part of its Direct Action, and in line with the Letter of Understanding signed by the ILO and World Vision (December 2004), the PTBP Supporting Project is collaborating with the ABK Initiative in the provision of education and vocational training services to 37,000 children. Of this, IPEC is responsible for providing direct educational/vocational training services to 14,500 children. Additionally, 7,000 children (15-17 years) will be provided direct services to be withdrawn from hazardous and abusive work, making IPEC's direct services target equivalent to 21,500. Additionally, the strengthening of local capacity to monitor and manage action against the worst forms of child labour, local advocacy, social mobilisation, provision of access to social safety nets, and creation of economic opportunities for the benefit of vulnerable families and communities form parts of the integrated interventions aimed at reducing the worst forms of child labour.³

The Project of Support started on 30 September 2002 and was extended, beyond the initial completion date of 31 December 2006, by another eight months, until 31 August 2007. The present phase, (ILO Project Code: PHI/02/P50/USA) officially became operational on 1 January 2003. The mid-term evaluation of the first phase was conducted in October/November 2005, by a team of international and national evaluators.

The Project of Support was revised on three occasions: (1) *January 2004*: to make budget-line shifts to accommodate increased official rental costs due to security concerns; (2) *February 2006*: for approval of an eight months, no additional-cost extension, to expand the target group to include agriculture (in addition to sugar cane plantations), fishing (in addition to deep sea diving) and children identified by the ABK Education Initiative, who were not reported in the baseline surveys; and (3) *July 2006*: to de-link the Project from the ABK Initiative in providing direct action on education for child beneficiaries. In each of these occasions the budget was revised at no cost.

³ Source: Project Revision Form d.d. 16 December 2005, Resubmitted in February 2006.

2.3 Programme information

The Project is implemented in support of the NPACL, in order to achieve the 75% reduction in the WFCL by 2015. On the one hand, the Project is expected to focus on strengthening the NPACL by leveraging resources and establishing linkages with relevant national policies, legislation and programme frameworks. On the other hand, the Project has been designed to *significantly* reduce the incidence of six priority-WFCL that have been identified by the National Child Labour Committee (NCLC) and other stakeholders.

The project “Supporting the Time-Bound Programme on the Elimination of the Worst Forms of Child Labour in the Republic of the Philippines” was designed to serve as a support project to the NPACL. As such, it was supposed to address two strategic components: (1) Strengthening the enabling environment for the elimination of the WFCL at the macro-level and (2) Reducing the incidence of selected WFCL through direct action for child labourers and their families at the meso and micro levels.

With regards to the first strategic component (strengthening the enabling environment), the Project is expected to sponsor new research and policy discussions to improve the knowledge base and capacity of involved institutions. It is aimed to mainstream child labour into macroeconomic policies on poverty alleviation, related to employment, labour and social policies. Moreover, the Project is expected to develop education and training policies, responding to the needs of working children and those at risk, as well as to promote new legislation against child labour and to strengthen national capacity for its enforcement. Last but not least the Project will aim for increased public awareness and social mobilization against the WFCL.

With regards to the second strategic component (direct action for child labourers and their families), the Project is expected to focus on the strengthening of local capacity to monitor and manage action against the WFCL and to emphasize advocacy and social mobilization at the meso level. In order to compensate for economic loss resulting from the withdrawal of child labour by households and communities most vulnerable to the WFCL, the Project will equally provide for social safety nets and economic opportunities. To ensure that children withdrawn from work will not go back to work, the Project is to provide good quality educational alternatives, building on existing work of ILO-IPEC and partners in the Philippines.

The six target groups of the Project are (1) child labour in sugar-cane plantations, (2) mining and quarrying, (3) pyrotechnics, (4) deep-sea fishing, (5) domestic work and (6) child prostitution. The project is implemented in six regions of the Philippines, covering a total of eight provinces: namely Bulacan, Metro Manila, Camarines Norte, Iloilo, Negros Occidental, Negros Oriental, Cebu and Davao.

For the entire Project duration, per GPRA/USDOL agreement a target has been set to withdraw 19,000 children working in the WFCL from their workplace or exposure to hazardous conditions. The Project (ILO-IPEC and partners) are expected to support these children through the provision of “meaningful alternatives” such as counselling, health care, education and services for healing/rehabilitation and reintegration with their families. As per same agreement, another 2,500 children at risk have been targeted for prevention from entering into work. This category includes younger siblings of working children and girl children. A variety of support activities and services has been developed for this category, like awareness-raising and additional educational support.

The Project Document stipulates that the Project will be implemented in tandem with the USDOL funded Education Initiative, implemented by a coalition of international NGOs (World

Vision, Plan International, ERDA Foundation and Christian Children's Fund). The goal of the project is to reduce the engagement of children in six worst forms of child labour in eight provinces in the Philippines through increased access, quality and relevance of education for working and at risk children.⁴ As indicated in the Letter of Understanding, that the Project of Support would be implemented in tandem and in close coordination with the ABK Initiative, particularly in the direct action component, to create maximum synergy between the policy and implementation level, and to make IPEC's database available for the selection of beneficiaries.

The Project of Support is equally expected to work closely together with partners from ILO's tripartite constituencies (government, workers and employers' organizations), multilateral and bilateral donors, NGOs, the media and civil society organizations.

The immediate objectives (IO) of the Project of Support are:

At the end of the project →

Strategic Component 1

- IO-1: There is an enhanced knowledge base on WFCL for policy development and implementation in the Philippines
- IO-2: There is an enhanced and better enforced legislative framework
- IO-3: National development and social policies include child labour concerns
- IO-4: Enhanced education and training policies can effectively respond to the needs of girls and boys in child labour and to children at risk
- IO-5: Attitudes towards child labour have changed among national partner agencies

Strategic Component 2

- IO-6: The capacity of local governments and civil society to monitor and manage action against the WFCL will be strengthened
- IO-7: Families affected by the WFCL will have been provided with new opportunities for enhanced income and access to social safety nets
- IO-8: Children at risk and in the WFCL will have access to primary, vocational or non-formal education, including alternative and flexible learning systems
- IO-9: All major local-level actors and institutions have become aware of the problem of the WFCL and are mobilized in the battle against it.

2.4 Scope and purpose of the Expanded Final Evaluation

As stated in the Terms of Reference for the present assignment (see annex 1), the main purposes for which the Expanded Final Evaluation should be conducted are to:

- Determine if the Project achieved its stated Immediate Objectives (including specific targets) and explain why or why not; to assess the overall and specific outcomes and

⁴ Source: www.worldvision.org.ph/abkinitiative/sp_abk_about.html

impacts of the project in terms of sustained improvements; and to identify lessons learned and good practices to inform future projects.

- Build off the findings and recommendations of the midterm evaluation to assess if suggested recommendations were implemented and gauge the success of any revised activities and interventions.
- Provide guidance on the scope and design of a second phase if donor funding became available. Specifically, in what ways, if any, should procedures, activities, and areas of focus be revised?

The object of the evaluation is the ILO-IPEC Programme of Support (PoS) to the TBP in The Philippines. Therefore the evaluation will review what has been done for mobilizing national action on child labour, what type of actors have been prioritized, what is involved in the process of design, managing and implementing a TBP support process and how the Project has contributed to the process.

A list of detailed questions and answers relevant for the present evaluation is attached as annex 4.

As this programme is one of the first generation programmes of support to the TBP approach, formulated as a comprehensive framework for implementation the provisions of Convention 182, the final evaluation will be expanded to include a target group Impact Assessment Study (a qualitative survey of a sample of the beneficiaries complemented with limited focus group discussions and collection of information on external and contextual factors. The result of the Impact Assessment Study will not only be integrated in the final evaluation, it will also feed into ILO-IPEC's larger Impact Assessment Framework (testing the possibility of conducting repeat baseline studies). To the extent possible, in order to demonstrate clear attribution of impact, the assessment will either integrate the ABK activities, or attempt to distinguish between project interventions.

The Terms of Reference (ref. Annex 1) emphasize the use of a result-based framework for evaluation related to the nine Immediate Objectives using data from the logical framework indicators.

2.5 Evaluation Methodology

The external independent consultant was commissioned by the ILO-IPEC Office in Geneva. Following an initial briefing session with ILO-IPEC staff on 23 May, and a desk-review from 4 to 7 June, followed by another briefing session on 8 June, this time dedicated to ILO-IPEC's Tracer Methodology.

The field mission consisted of two distinct parts. The first part was conducted from 11 until 15 June. During this period the external international and national evaluators were briefed by the director and staff of the ILO sub-regional office, as well by project staff in Manila. Apart from a continued desk-review, emphasis was put on the recruitment, preparation and briefing of a national agency which was to implement an impact assessment, according to ILO-IPEC's Tracer Methodology.

The second leg of the field assignment took place from 23 July until 4 August. Until 1 August, implementing agencies were visited in four different geographical areas and on 2 August, a Stakeholder Workshop was organized, during which the External Evaluation Team presented its first impressions and during which opportunities and next steps were discussed. The programme and minutes of the Stakeholder Workshop have been attached as annex 2.

The consultants have made use of the following methods in order to prepare for their assignment and to assess the progress of the project and its programmes:

1. The Desk Review took place at the respective home offices of the members of the External Evaluation Team and at the Project Office in Manila. This initial phase consisted of a preliminary reading of relevant ILO-IPEC and programme documents (ILO-Conventions, TBP, PRODOC, Progress and Status Reports) and DED guidelines on evaluation and gender;
2. For the international consultant, an initial briefing session took place at ILO-IPEC (Geneva), during which contractual issues were discussed with ILO-IPEC-DED, valuable inside information was received from the responsible DED Senior Evaluation Officer, and methodological issues on Tracer Study Methodology were discussed with another DED senior staff member. The national consultant was recruited and briefed by the sub-regional ILO office in Manila.
3. During the first leg of the field assignment, a courtesy call was made to the Director of the ILO Sub-regional Office. The external consultancy team was briefed by Project Management, Project field coordinators and senior ILO-IPEC staff of the sub-regional office. During this time, the external evaluation team held discussions with institutions which were potential candidates for the Impact Assessment Study. Once the research organization was finally selected, discussions were held on the terms of reference according to ILO-IPEC's Tracer Methodology. These discussions were finalized by conference call during the week following the first part of the field assignment.
4. In between the two distinct parts of the field assignment, the international consultant had a lengthy telephone conversation with the responsible desk-officer at USDOL in Washington, USA. This provided a useful perspective from a donor's point of view.
5. During the second leg of the field assignment, group meetings were held and one-on-one interviews with project-staff, representatives of implementing agencies (counterpart departments, NGOs, community-based organizations, employers and trade unions), other government agencies, partner organizations at national, provincial, district and community level, as well as with beneficiaries at community level. A meeting was equally held with the head of the political division of the United States Embassy, in Manila. Unlike extrajudicial executions, during this meeting the importance of children rights was by far not addressed as a priority issue.
6. Field visits/trips to observe the beneficiaries' environment, their working and living conditions, as well as to assess the progress of community-based project activities (social protection measures); group discussions and individual interviews with working children, withdrawn children, their siblings and parents, local government, field-based implementing agencies and community-based organizations;
7. Review of all Summary Outlines for Action Programmes; Selective reading of Progress Reports for AP's;
8. Stakeholder workshop in Manila, during which the external evaluation team's first impressions were fed back and discussed. Presentation and discussion of working group outputs on future opportunities and next steps in the plenary session (see annex 2);
9. Debriefing session with Project staff in Manila;
10. Debriefing session with ILO-IPEC's Design, Evaluation and Documentation Section in Geneva.

3.0 VALIDITY OF DESIGN

3.1 Problem analysis

The Project Document states that the Strategic Programme Impact Framework was introduced at a very late stage in the design process of the Project. Therefore, its Immediate Objectives, Outputs and Activities are not organically linked to either the Strategic Area of Impact Framework, or to the Strategic Country Framework, which are both of a more recent date. Instead, it was decided to use the Medium-Term Philippine Development Plan (2001-2004) and the National Programme against Child Labour as the initial strategic framework to identify the linkages between the Project and these two frameworks. It was assumed that the two strategic Project components (creation of an enabling environment for the elimination of WFCL and direct action) would provide the first and most significant contribution to the elimination of the WFCL.

The excellent and very elaborate problem analysis of the Project Document indicates to what extent child labour is correlated with poverty and how modestly especially the rural poor have access to good quality education, which is preparing children for skills in demand on the labour market. Apparently, and this was underlined in many field interviews, formal public education entails added costs that makes it hardly affordable to all and does not sufficiently prepare children for a brighter future. High School graduates do unskilled jobs and the few college graduates in the rural areas, might end up as workers in a fast-food chain in town. None of the children interviewed has the ambition to stay in the rural areas. All of them want to work in town. Given the pseudo-feudal conditions generally found e.g. in plantation agriculture, this is not surprising. In such conditions poor parents, even if they could afford, do not always perceive the added value of education. This is even more the case if one realizes that for the poor masses of the population child labour is part of a survival strategy. If a sugar cane worker earns P 60 per day (approximately USD 1.30) an additional P 50 from child labour is most welcome. Figures on school drop outs, impact of long working hours on school performance and persistent non-availability of funds for schooling demonstrate how deep the problem is embedded in society. Awareness rising in itself can only be expected to be effective if the economic conditions become more favourable for a more equitable growth and if education is affordable, of good quality and market oriented.

As rightly stated in the project document for the present phase, child labour cannot be analyzed without considering the economic crisis which hit the Philippines in 1998 and which has forced a large number of workers into the informal sector. One effect of low technology level and low level of profitability, which are both features of the informal sector, is a high demand for unskilled, cheap labour, such as that supplied by children. Apart from this, the project document recognizes the deeply rooted practice of apprenticeship in the informal sector (often family businesses), a lack in public awareness of child labour hazards, as well as the high drop-out rate at High School level, as factors contributing to child labour. The project strategy, aiming at social protection of withdrawn children and their families, as well as the prevention of children at risk (e.g. siblings) from prematurely entering the labour market through a multitude of compensatory and preventive activities, is a genuine effort to tackle the above mentioned root causes of child labour. This rather innovative ILO-IPEC approach not only creates a critical mass of institutions in raising the awareness of those directly involved and influence public opinion on the issue of child labour, but also provides ample space for testing preventive measures.

ILO-IPEC is fully conscious of the complexity of the child labour problem, hence the complementary approach, strengthening the livelihood conditions of households with working children, or children at risk, through livelihood skills and social safety nets, as a compensation for the loss of an “economic asset”. The emphasis on reintegration in formal education and especially on alternative learning systems makes sense. The relevance of the direct action programmes is particularly high, where enabling conditions are created for child-friendly and equitable development oriented policies and legislation, at macro and meso level, which is the major strategic component of the TBP.

However convincing this holistic approach, given the relatively limited resources and very short-term interventions, it can hardly be expected that the project is in a position to provide a “*most significant contribution to the elimination of the WFCL*”, as stated in the Strategic Programme Impact Framework. The magnitude of the problem is such that, given budgetary and time constraints (among others caused by considerable delays in Project implementation), merely first innovative experiences can be collected which, only when proven successful, can be considered for scaling up to a policy level. In order to make such solutions sustainable, considerable political commitment is needed to reach equitable development and for notification and enforcement of relevant legislation. It goes without saying that this is the outcome of a lengthy political process and that many frame-conditions are beyond the management capacity of the ILO.

The project document, and in particular the sub-programme for social protection, reflects an impressive multitude of, generally speaking, relevant, education, and vocational training and livelihood activities. There is, however, a clear opportunity to put these activities into a more pronounced qualitative perspective by indicating the frame-conditions for a successful implementation. The project and programme staff is lacking time and sometimes subject-matter knowledge to accompany and monitor the Action Programmes. Implementing agencies, in turn, despite their impressive commitment, at times lack analytical capacities, subject-matter knowledge and facility for innovation.

The complexity of solutions necessary to tackle the problems, as reflected in the project document, shows that there was a deliberate choice of an approach which addresses the causes of child labour from different angles. Such an approach is ambitious but nevertheless sound, provided that relevant expertise and capacity is made available within the project and programme teams or that professional support is received from outside specialized organizations (international NGOs, multilateral organizations, etc.) in order to effectively monitor the implementing agencies. The implementing agencies themselves ought to be organizationally and professionally strengthened, create synergies between themselves, actively participate in professional networks of development-oriented grass-roots based organizations and try to imagine a continued activity upon completion of the project.

3.2 Description of target group

The target group profiles, as reflected in the Project Document, are based on a decade of studies, surveys and projects. For the sake of identification of child labourers, these studies were completed by rapid assessments and baseline studies. The later have provided a general idea about the family background of working children, about the hazards at work, about difficulties to combine work and school and, especially about the non availability of funds for continued education.

Through the baseline studies, detailed general information is available on working conditions, health hazards, household income, approximate numbers of working children and children at risk, and geographic location, per priority sector of WFCL. During an interview, ABK management expressed reservations regarding the quality of the master-list of child labourers and siblings. Approximately one third of the children was said to be not affected by child labour or not belonging to poor families. During the mission, we were provided with twelve different master-lists, following different structures, lacking household data and recorded in different software programmes. Because of this scattered information, the APs frequently were found to concentrate on either children or households but often these target groups were de-linked. Whereas, in principle, the ILO-IPEC wants to emphasize a holistic approach, targeting both children and (at the same time) their households (to compensate for the economic loss caused by their withdrawal), in practice this was not often respected. Frequently, we observed children beneficiaries whose parents did not receive Project support. The converse was also true: we observed households receiving support without their children being targeted.

According to MTE report, the commitment, as reflected in the Project Document, that the “*extremely rough estimate...of potential child beneficiaries ... will need to be refined at the outset of the Project*”, was never followed up. Referring this task to the implementing agencies would have meant an even further reduction in implementation time and an enhanced risk of falling short of achieving targets.

Having the benefit of hindsight, it may now be said that for the sake of quality monitoring it would have been more desirable to establish a standardized and actively managed Child Labour Monitoring System right from the outset of the Project, instead of supporting local government, communities, DOLE and implementing agencies in establishing their own data-bases according to different formats and often insufficiently reflecting household economics. We maintain that it is only against the backdrop of an improved household economy that the problem of child labour can be solved in a sustainable manner. For that reason both should be tackled simultaneously.

An opportunity might have been missed out to provide some more analysis on the economical benefit of child labour for the household income. This could be compared to the value added by further education and training.⁵ This would have enabled the project to more directly target an improvement of the sending household’s income as a whole.

No detailed individual socio-economic data are available on the families from which child labour originates but their identities are known at a community level. Although a major cause, poverty does not seem to be the only explanation for young children prematurely joining the labour market but also boredom with village life and school and the desire to be (financially) independent which is natural for an adolescent. Again, it would be interesting to look into the financial contribution of child labour to household income, to analyze the relevance, quality and costs of the formal and informal education system, and, last but not least, to look into the correlation between poverty and magnitude of school drop-outs. This could help to focus programme interventions on the most relevant causes, instead of working on all possible causes at the same time. An effective child-labour strategy should not only be based on preventing those children at risk in the direct surroundings of children withdrawn from hazardous WFCL,

⁵ The present state of the art methodology in assessing the economic and social function of, among others, child labour is the participatory livelihood systems analysis, which is studying the household asset basis and each household member’s contribution to deliberate strategies in order to cope with poverty and stress. The method is not apt to be utilised in all sending villages but, if applied in selective settings, it could provide valuable insight into the strategic place of child labour in the household economy, into the specific local development potential and future opportunities for absorption of labour in the local and regional labour market, as well as into the way in which education is contributing to that.

but ought to pro-actively identify households at risk in its area of operation, susceptible of sending children to any possible worst forms of child labour.

3.3 Development and immediate objectives

It would be appropriate to pay tribute to the way in which the project document, progress, status reports and Action Programmes scrupulously respect the ILO-IPEC logical framework structure. In this way it potentially becomes an effective instrument for monitoring progress and for steering implementation strategies, provided that the required resources and capacity are made available and that planned activities are allowed to be readjusted through activity monitoring.

To the opinion of the evaluators, with regards to the Immediate Objectives referring to the second strategic component (direct action) the logical framework is very detailed and ambitious, especially at the output and activity level. Quantitative targets for direct action were already well defined well before APs had been finalized and that might have contributed to an emphasis on achieving quantitative targets, at times at the expense of process monitoring and mutual learning.

3.4 Internal and external logic

The Project Document reflects a clear logical structure, stated in unambiguous terms. The internal logic of the framework is respected. The successful implementation of activities leads to the achievement of Outputs which, at their turn lead to the achievement of Immediate Objectives and thereby contribute to the Development Objective. The only critical remark that should be made here is the high degree of detail in activity planning at times more than four years ahead, without clear feedback mechanism to correct the activities at the intervention level. This is even more valid if the implementation period of APs is sincerely shortened by a multitude of obstacles (as in the present case). In planning, the radius of action should never be allowed to bypass the radius of foresight, and therefore it is recommended to plan activities only for a year's period and to re-plan following activity plans at regular intervals as a function of feedback from process, context, activity and quality monitoring.

As stated above, Immediate Objectives, Outputs and Activities are not organically linked (external logic) to either the Strategic Area of Impact Framework, or to the Strategic Country Framework, which are both of a more recent date. The Medium-Term Philippine Development Plan (2001-2004) and the National Programme against Child Labour served as the initial strategic framework to identify the linkages between the Project and these two frameworks. During Project implementation, the Strategic Programme Impact Framework was used by the Project to measure progress but as observed in the Mid-Term evaluation report, the partners were never prepared in applying this tool and lacked ownership because they had not been associated to its preparation. Apparently because of this confusion and lack of ownership the tool was hardly used in activity monitoring and progress reporting by the implementing agencies.

3.5 Indicators

According to the result oriented planning method, indicators need to be defined at both levels, immediate objectives and expected results (outputs), which are SMART: specific, measurable, appropriate, realistic and time-bound, (monitoring at an activity level merely serves as an

internal management instrument and hereby the timely use of inputs is measured). Indicators referring to the immediate objectives, as reflected in the logical framework, lack most of these criteria and are, therefore, difficult to measure and put a heavy work load upon Project management, in view of its limited capacity for analysis and review of policies, legislation, change in attitudes, etc. Yet, this open formulation is preferable over purely quantitative indicators, found in so many other projects, which are rather output oriented than reflecting outcomes. Progress reports show that additionally to the achievement of quantitative targets, due attention was paid to the Project's contribution to the enabling environment, mostly in terms of activities and to a lesser extent in terms of outcome. Heavy workload, lacking personnel capacity and time pressure may explain this.

Also in AP Progress Reports there is a tendency to emphasize quantitative indicators at an activity level. Many Implementing Agencies neglect qualitative information on sustainable outcomes but appear explicit on numbers of beneficiaries served.

3.6 Critical assumptions⁶

The logical framework enumerates five assumptions critical for an achievement of the Immediate Objectives. The evaluation team has monitored whether these assumptions still prove to be valid. The major observations can be summarized as follows:

3.6.1 The elimination of the WFCL remains a national priority

- The Philippines is the first country to present model legislation reflective of ILO' Convention 182. The Anti Child Labour Law (Republic Act 9231) was passed on December 19, 2003.
- The 1987 Philippine Constitution's Article 14, Section 2 provides that the State shall encourage non-formal, informal, and indigenous learning systems, as well as self-learning, independent and out of school study programmes, particularly those that respond to community needs. Annex 3 mentions a number of policies and legislations favourable to making schooling more accessible for working children, like e.g., the Education for All-Philippine Plan of Action, the Non-Formal Education Accreditation and Equivalency System etc.

3.6.2 Partners are committed to implement the Project

- Trade Unions, Employers Organizations and Government have expressed continuing commitment to extend more focused action to eliminate child labour in agriculture, particularly the worst forms, according to the Department of Labour and Employment (DoLE).
- During the field assignment, the mission was impressed by the enormous goodwill and enthusiasm found among all segments of society, tripartite partners, implementing agencies and population alike, in favour of eliminating the WFCL. Over a decade of ILO involvement has prepared the ground for this and without any doubt the Project has contributed to the development of a critical mass of institutions at national level and in regions of intervention to take the cause of child labour forwards. However this does not always mean that such institutions have either the political will to enforce legislation, the financial means to undertake necessary action, or to influence the root causes of child labour.

⁶ The monitoring of critical assumptions is further substantiated in Annex 4.

3.6.3 There will be improvements in the macro parameters such as economic growth and poverty levels that will be favourable to the achievement of the overall objective of reducing child labour incidence in the medium term

- The Philippine economy looks set to grow above 5.0% for the fourth consecutive year in 2007. Official estimates put growth at 6.1-6.7% this year.
- Remittance inflows continue to be a major feature of the Philippine's landscape, and are tipped to reach yet another record high this year.
- The Philippines is rapidly becoming an increasing popular place to do business, as the country's macroeconomic fundamentals continue to improve and new initiatives to entice foreign companies to the country continue to bear fruit.
- No data are available on the distribution of the growth and hence its contribution to poverty alleviation. With 61% of the population still earning USD 2 per day, or less, it is nevertheless remarkable that 91.2% of the children between 6 and 12 years are enrolled in elementary school and 77% between 13 and 16 years in high school.

3.6.4 Continued political will of relevant Government structures to combat child labour

- In all regions visited, NCR, Bacalod, Bulacan, Cebu and Dumaguete, local Government Units, Social Welfare Departments, Departments of Labour and Departments of Education are involved, in some form or another, with the elimination of child labour. Even in cases where APs already had come to an end, funds were modestly made available to sustain actions initially started under, and financed through Project funds. Multiple examples were observed where Local Government Units at the Barangay level had sustained action, in collaboration with the Departments of Education and Social Welfare. In all regions visited regional legislation was in place to combat WFCL, in which DoLE in Region VII has played a lead role by inspiring the other regions in which the Project is active. DoLE has recently finalized a Child Labour Monitoring System. The mission was not in a position to check its validity. It is believed that a few hundred child labourers are part of the data-base. In most of the regions visited, actions were not sufficiently institutionalized and were insufficiently funded but rather depended on the great enthusiasm of certain enlightened individuals.
- On the other hand, several cases demonstrate continuing political will to sustain the combat against child labour. This is exemplified by the Provincial Government of Bulacan, which has pledged to continue to collaborate with different agencies and institutions to stop child labour in the province.

Other assumptions, at a meso and micro level which form a necessary condition for achieving project results are found missing, e.g., the feasibility of withdrawing children from hazardous working conditions or the affordability and added value of education as compared to a continued contribution to the household income. Another assumption would be the respect of the holistic approach to direct action at a household level, working simultaneously on pulling and pushing factors (schooling and livelihoods/social safety net strengthening).

3.7 Project Strategies

The two strategic components, "creating an enabling environment" and "direct action" form an integrated part of ILO-IPEC's approach and are intrinsically linked. On the one hand, in order to create awareness on the relevancy of child labour policies and legislation, the later need to be fed with concrete experiences. On the other hand, direct action should be placed in an appropriate legal framework in order to enforce legitimate action, and it should be complemented by policies contributing to tackling the root causes of child labour (equitable

development, poverty alleviation, access to affordable basic services, like education, health, drinking water, etc.).

The mission disagrees with the observation of the MTE that the Project would be lacking gender sensitivity. At all levels of government, implementing agencies, community organizations and the Project itself most meetings took place with women, very vocal on the subject of child labour. Children beneficiaries were more or less equally divided over both genders with a majority of girls in CSEC and domestic work, with a majority of boys in agriculture, mining, and fishing and both genders equally distributed in pyrotechnics. This distribution has more to do with the physical requirements of the job than with gender blindness.

3.8 Duration

Immediate Objectives are stated in relative terms, like “enhanced knowledge base”, “enhanced and better enforced legislative framework”, “policies include child labour concerns”, “enhanced education and training policies can effectively respond to the needs of girls and boys..”, “attitudes have changed”, capacities strengthened”, “families provided with enhanced income”, “actors have become aware”, and that the corresponding indicators are defined in an open way: “number of”.

May it be true that this is a support project for a Time Bound Programme, except for quantitative targets on children to be withdrawn and prevented and the Millennium Development Goal of 75% by 2015, the immediate objectives in the Project Document do not set quantitative and time-bound standards but merely qualitative and gradual ones. Had it not been for delays in implementation, in principle, the time-frame for achieving the above mentioned quantitative targets would have been adequate. According to the logical framework methodology, immediate objectives should be defined in such a way that they can be fully achieved within the implementation period and by doing so the project contributes to the development objective. In the present case, the immediate objectives have been defined as if they were development objectives and therefore the question on adequate duration for achieving immediate objectives does not appear to be relevant.

One thing is certain, since 1994 ILO-IPEC has been instrumental in creating an enabling environment and the Programme of Support is yet another logical and important step, neither the first one, nor the last one, in contributing to the long term goal of 75% reduction in the elimination of the WFCL. To what extent the PoS has brought this long term objective closer, will be analyzed in the following chapters.

4. DELIVERY PROCESS

4.1 Initial delays in implementation

As already mentioned in the Mid-Term Evaluation report, two major aspects have caused constraints and delays in the implementation of the project. The first is the master-listing of beneficiaries prior to the development of APs. The second is the linkage with the Education Initiative Project. With regards to the master-listing, at first the geographical areas were defined containing important numbers of child labourers working in the WFCL. The second stage consisted of a listing of beneficiaries in each of the selected target areas. Given the numbers of targeted beneficiaries for the two projects, (44,500) this proved to be an extremely complex task which was contracted out to 12 different organizations with variable professional capacities and using different survey methodologies. The surveys did not contain questions on poverty levels, which led to frustration with ABK and its partners. ABK was first served with the list for beneficiary identification and reported that part of the listing had to be redone, whereas an approximate 22'000 children figuring on the original list were effectively selected. ILO-IPEC, moving somewhat slower towards direct action (not directly implementing action and therefore passing through contractual arrangements with implementing agencies) found itself with a list from which the majority of children had either been retrieved, or removed and found itself equally in a position where part of the identification of target children had to be repeated. Altogether, the duration of the entire process of establishing a master-list, prior to the formulation of APs varied between 6 months and two year. In the meantime no active management of the contents of the list was pursued, which caused over-aged children qualifying and youngsters not being included.

Ever since, the relation between the management teams has remained tense, although the working relations between field staff were described as cordial. In spite of a recommendation from the MTE to maintain the status-quo, the two projects, initially expected to work in tandem, were formally de-linked in July 2006. Not in all cases have the projects succeeded in working in a complementary manner. During certain field visits, we had difficulties understanding whether we were dealing with ABK or ILO-IPEC beneficiaries.

We ignore whether the above discussed lack of timely and corrective action at a management level has something to do with the resignation of the former CTA. Fact is that the new CTA needed some time to put the house in order. By the time of the MTE only nine APs were under implementation with a little over one year left.

In order to achieve the Project targets, in February 2006 USDOL approved an extension of eight months, from 1 January until 31 August 2007. At that particular moment in time, certain implementing agencies saw their contracts extended, whereas others still needed to develop new proposals altogether. Given, on the one hand, the apparent need to develop under time-pressure many APs and, on the other hand, the intensive screening by ILO-IPEC (caused by relative immaturity and limited implementation capacity of certain potential implementing agencies, and weak proposals), as well as the respect of the final closure date of the project, this resulted in many APs which proved to be too ambitious for such a short time-span. This went at the expense of professional support in implementation and quality monitoring, whereas “target-hunting” almost became an obsession. In defence of Project Management, it should be put on record that it was the expressive wish of the donor to emphasize the achievement of quantitative targets.

4.2 Factors affecting project execution

The big challenge during implementation was to aim for sustainable outcomes, by creating synergies and complementarities between expected outputs of both sets of strategic components, as stated in the logical framework. Given the huge time pressure and relatively limited financial and human project resources, coordination proved to be a time- and energy-absorbing task. This is even more the case if one realizes to what extent relatively modestly financed APs were geographically scattered over the country. On the one hand, this has facilitated the creation of a critical mass of institutions for which the necessity to eliminate the WFCL has been fully internalized. On the other hand, and in spite of the fact that many workshops and frequent training events have been organized by the Project in order to strengthen their partners' capacities in various fields, the Project had insufficient capacity to actively monitor the field implementation of APs in such a short time-span. This left a lot of initiative to the IA themselves but in most cases it has been observed that they have worked on the issue of child labour with motivation. However, because of a lack of active field monitoring and strategic Project steering, as well as due to the pressure for achieving numerical targets, various implementing agencies rather concentrated on output than on outcome, methodological weaknesses were not sufficiently corrected and experiences were not sufficiently validated and shared between partners and implementing agencies. In short, ILO-IPEC has not matched its means to its ambitions.

The better quality programmes were found with the more professional and development-oriented organizations with a long-term presence and thereby well-established constituencies and sources of funding. Also many community-based initiatives showed to what extent e.g. Local Government Units (LGUs) have internalized the issue of child labour. Every now and then it was observed that at local level Local Children Committees were successful in claiming funds from the barangay councils for alternative learning activities or that the DepEd staff committed itself to make qualified personnel available, so that children can continue their involvement in alternative learning systems beyond project termination. Existing programmes, structures and institutions dealing with child labour are tapped and linked to the interventions of the project, e.g., the child labour programme of DOLE, non-formal and special education courses of the DepEd, vocational training courses of TESDA, the sugar amelioration programme, STD-HIV projects of OSHC and DOH, etc. Mechanisms to sustain or magnify the effects and impact of the APs will continue to depend on inter-agency collaboration, a sustained continuation of which depends on willingness and commitment of provincial and local government to coordinate these linkages and on commitment to match corresponding actions with funds. There have been reported instances when an implementing agency (e.g., DOLE Regional Office III) reported that it wished that a declaration of support from the LGU Chief Executive was matched by concrete action.

In many encounters with parent-teacher committees it became clear that external support for schooling fees would be a condition for a continued involvement of children in the ALS programme. Whereas ILO-IPEC and ABK subsidize school fees, the magnitude of funds generated by government and communities appears to be modest only. There is a risk that children, presently supported via these projects will drop out again if no institutionalized solutions are found to follow-up project activities.

4.3 Management

The resignation of the first CTA, after less than one year, and the recruitment and appointment and of a new CTA have led to a considerable delay in the initial stages of project implementation. As described here above, a multitude of obstacles had to be overcome: notably

the decision to make AP formulation and implementation dependent on the establishment of a master-list, the difficult relation with ABK, the relative immaturity of IA in AP preparation and, at times, lengthy and complex administrative procedures, etc. At the time that the MTR was fielded, only 8 APs were under implementation with, then, hardly one year left. Project management deserves praise for the effective manner in which in spite of all this, finally 38 AP could be implemented. That would not have been possible without USDOL's comprehension and willingness to extend project duration by eight months.

The Project-team, consists of a CTA, a senior programme officer, an administrator and a secretary, supported by four regional field coordinators. All of the above are very efficient and effective in the accomplishment of their tasks. Given the enormous magnitude of administrative, supervisory and representative tasks, undertaken by the Manila-based core-management team, field supervision was mainly delegated to the field coordinators. In line with the overall project emphasis on the achievement of outputs, at times also the field coordinators shied away from quality monitoring. We would disagree with the MTE qualifying this as the result of "remote administrative control" it rather reflects the dominant management culture biased in favour of achieving targets.

Critical MTE remarks on a lack of delegation of tasks by the CTA appear no longer valid, since she is now assisted in a professional way by a senior programme officer. Lengthy procedures in AP preparation and approval appear to be caused by both, limited capacities of implementing agencies as well as by a certain administrative slowness. In extreme cases the entire procedure took over one and a half year but the average was rather situated around 3 to 4 months.

Valuable support is received from the ILO sub-regional office's senior staff, especially from the director and the senior communication officer (who has been instrumental in the production of good quality video films and documents on child labour). The Project has excellent relations with the sub-regional multidisciplinary teams and is equally supported by HQ multidisciplinary teams (e.g. training on child labour monitoring and OHS on health hazards).

4.4 Follow-up of recommendations MTE 2005

a. To extend the lifetime of the project.

The lifetime of the project has been effectively expanded by a period of eight months, so that more than 30 action programmes could still be implemented.

b. Strengthening the enabling environment in the regions/provinces.

The suggested championships approach was effectively used be it somewhat late (during the exit workshop).

c. Take measures for improved communication with partners and adopting an attitude of "nurturing" these partners towards sustainability.

Whereas the Project has developed cordial relationships with its partners no emphasis was given to institutionally and financially sustainable approaches. If such happened nevertheless, it was rather because of initiatives of well-experienced partners or enlightened individuals within partner organizations.

d. Allocate more time to work with the National Child Labour Committee .

Relations with the partners were found to be cordial, encounters frequent and cooperation formalized through APs at national and regional level committees.

e. Flexibility in identifying children.

Remedial action has been taken to speed up the withdrawal and prevention of children according to the initial target. No signs of flexibility were found in identifying new children, except for the additional baseline needed because the number of child labourers included in the ABK project proved so important that the number remaining on the master-list had become too small. However, the relative distribution of the targeted beneficiaries over geographical areas and priority sectors was respected throughout the entire project duration. The project has chosen not to go for easy solutions in order to fulfil quantitative targets.

f. The review of APs in the pipeline should be completed as soon as possible.

In the period following the MTE, the AP approval procedure was sped up, which has led to another 31 being approved. A drawback was that for certain proposals the duration had to be cut back in line with the remaining project duration. The cluster approach, proposing a geographical integration of individual APs, does not appear to have been emphasized.

g. The relationship with the ABK project should be kept as it is.

At odds with the suggestion of respecting the status quo at national level and seeking strengthened collaboration at regional level, the projects were formally de-linked in July 2006. In spite of this, regional field coordinators of both projects continue to maintain cordial working relations and try to avoid overlaps in beneficiaries served.

h. The Project Management should receive assistance from other ILO-IPEC departments to overcome programme delays and improve internal communication with office and field staff.

ILO has, most of all, sped up the AP approval procedure. Staff capacity has been expanded in order to overcome delays. Face to face communication between project management and field staff has become more frequent.

i. The Project should make work of introducing gender concerns.

The mission ignores whether the situation has dramatically changed since the MTE. Anyway, no gender-blindness was observed in any of the APs visited or it should be interpreted in the reverse way notably that the women were frequently more vocal than men and visibly played a more active role in fighting against child labour. A number of suggestions made by the MTE tend to be moralistic. Implementing agencies working on CSEC rightly avoid a moralistic attitude which would jeopardize their credibility. Agencies involved in psycho-social care do not seem to discriminate on gender and treat boys and girls equally. Studies on worldviews, as suggested, are not expected to contribute to designing better programmes as compared to the ones currently under implementation in the CSEC sector which, generally speaking, comply with high professional standards (e.g. BIDLISIW).

4.5 Future adjustments

Because of various delays, discussed here above, the implementation time of the majority of AP hardly exceeded one year. Many experiences have yet to mature, before they can be validated and shared in a meaningful way. Laws and ordinances need to be meted and/or enforced. Financially and institutionally sustainable solutions need to be developed to effectively eliminate child labour. Simultaneously, livelihood systems need to be strengthened, as well as the productive capacity of small and micro enterprises. Innovative education systems preparing children for skills in demand on the formal and informal labour market need to be logical complement of such an approach.

The PoS has given the TBP a modest boost but it is felt that a second phase is absolutely necessary to contribute more effectively and efficiently to the long-term development objective. Apart from a few exceptions, time dedicated to direct action has been too short to be conclusive on the long-term suitability and affordability of solutions. Moreover, APs have been developed and implemented in relative isolation and therefore lack external and internal coherence. A future project will, therefore, have to build synergies between mutually supportive actions within the context of the two strategic project components. By its sheer nature, such an approach should be concentrated in a limited number of prioritized geographical areas in a few programmes, instead of being thinly scattered around.

Other priorities for the future include:

- The development of a standardized, country-wide and dynamic child labour monitoring system for all forms of WFCL containing socio-economic data at a household level, to be managed under the auspices of DOLE.
- As in other countries of operation, the national counterpart contribution in project implementation should be gradually increased, in order to resemble the “after-the-project” situation.
- The need to organizationally, institutionally, technically and methodologically strengthen the counterpart organizations.
- The need to institutionalize multi-partner networks for coordinated action and learning.
- The establishment of a disposition fund for quick action, with disbursement authority vested with the sub-regional ILO office.
- Strengthening of project staff capacity in sustainable livelihoods assessment, participatory planning, monitoring and learning methods.

5.0 IMPLEMENTATION ARRANGEMENTS

5.1 International inputs

ILO-IPEC headquarters in Geneva is responsible for technical guidance and overall programme supervision. According to the project document, the overall responsibility and financial authority is with the ILO sub-regional office in Manila. Together with her support staff, an international CTA is coordinating the entire project at national level. ILO-IPEC headquarters and the Multidisciplinary teams located at the Bangkok regional and Manila sub-regional offices, provide support in technical issues (e.g. training in Occupational Safety and Health related matters or in Design of Child Labour Monitoring). APs need to be sanctioned by ILO-IPEC in Geneva.

After (optional) technical advice from the Bangkok Regional Office (only on certain technical issues), final approval for APs is granted by headquarters, and disbursement and accounts are dealt with by the ILO sub-regional office. Semester-wise progress reports are submitted to the ILO according to the Project Monitoring Plan, following the logical framework structure of the Strategic Programme Impact Framework.

The programme is financed by the United States Department of Labour's International Child Labour Programme (USDOL-ICLP) with a total budget of US\$ 5,199,198 for a period of 59 months. Alternating with the Technical Progress Reports, the project provides USDOL-ICLP with semester-wise Status Reports, in which basically a similar lay-out is used. From the donor's comments to these reports it can be concluded that, also from that side, the project is actively followed.

5.2 National inputs

In developing the PoS for the Time Bound Programme, the international and national ILO-IPEC staff, including the programme staff, has been in close contact with the National Committee for Child Labour (NCCL), led by the Bureau of Women and Young Workers (BWYW) of the Department of Labour and Employment (DOLE). Without any doubt, ILO-IPEC has substantially contributed to create an environment which has been conducive for the ratification of Convention 182 and the subsequent development of the National Programme against Child Labour. The basic objective of the NPACL is to prevent children from engaging in the WFCL and to withdraw, rehabilitate and reintegrate those found working in the most inhuman and intolerable circumstances. As a strategic component of the NPACL the so called *Sagip Batang Manggagawa*, an inter-agency quick action programme, has been adopted for the conduct of rescue operations and the immediate removal of children found in the WFCL. Since it began, in 1994 until 2002, in the entire country 355 rescue operations were mounted reaching out to approximately 1,200 minors.

IPEC partnership in the Philippines works through a broad-based and strongly committed alliance of government, employers, workers, non-government and civil society organizations. Many of these partnerships had been developed well before the PoS was launched during IPEC's work in programmes on trafficking, mining/quarrying, domestic services, agriculture plantations, pyrotechnics, deep-sea fishing and prostitution.

6. PERFORMANCE

6.1 Relevance

The country continues to suffer from the problems that have given rise to child labour: widespread poverty, high unemployment rates, high costs of going to school, lack of access to school system, unfriendly school and learning environments, curriculum not relevant to local socio-economic and cultural environments, and parents themselves lacking and not valuing education. Therefore it can be said that the problems that gave rise to the project still exist. At the same time, the project has been instrumental in modestly trying out first experiences to tackle these root causes through APs at a meso and micro level which ought to be brought to maturity before considering scaling up to a policy level.

The project was an appropriate response to the problem of child labour since it was the first in its sort which has the ambition to tackle the elimination of child labour in a holistic manner while, at the same time legitimizing direct action through relevant policies and legislation at national and regional levels. This has resulted in remarkably increased awareness at all administrative levels.

Given the very short implementation period in most of the APs, caused by long delays in beneficiary selection, proposal preparation and approval procedures, conclusive solutions on such a complex problem can hardly be expected and therefore the project needs to be extended with a second phase. The project is still appropriate to the identified problems but corrections have to be applied in the design aiming at the use of regional packages of APs, contributing to increased synergies, quality and sustainable institutional and financial impact.

The priorities given to the basic components of the project have not changed. Both strategic components need to be implemented simultaneously and in mutual support. The holistic approach applied in direct action needs to be respected and no individual elements should be allowed to be implemented in isolation. The further development of ALS, the economic strengthening of household livelihoods and the establishment of social safety nets needs further enhanced professional skills. A standardized CLMS needs to be developed, reflecting for each child in the WFCL his educational and his family's economical background.

6.2 Effectiveness

Table 1 summarizes the "achievement" of the immediate objectives according to the project's latest progress report. While assessing the validity of this self-evaluation it should be realized that:

1. Most of the activities undertaken by the Project form a logical follow up of almost a decade of ILO-IPEC's work, undertaken since 1994. A considerable effort has been made to put legislation in place, prior to the inception of the Project. The specific contribution of the Project was especially to support the NCCL to take down child labour friendly policies and legislation to the regional level. This has led to the creation of child labour committees at provincial and local levels. Regional government has also been supported in designing child labour monitoring systems, where DOLE Region VII is playing a lead role. The Project has also been very instrumental in making education policies more responsive to the needs of child labour, working children and children at risk.

2. On the other hand, a multitude of actions has been experimented referring to either one or the other strategic project component. With regards to the “creation of an enabling environment” reference should be made to (1) the enhancement of the knowledge base, (2) passing of anti-child labour solutions, (3) inclusion of child labour concerns in national development and social policies, (4) policy reforms and formulation of educational strategies responsive to the needs of working children, as well as enhancing the capacity of service providers, and (5) awareness raising campaigns. At this level the Project has been particularly effective. The PoS has boosted ILO-IPEC’s ongoing work in this field and approaches have proved effective and ready for extension to other regions.
3. With regards to direct action to reduce the WFCL: due to the innovative character of APs, delays in implementation and at times insufficient supervision and support, many have been too short in duration to claim that they haven proven to provide the appropriate solutions to eliminate the WFCL in a sustainable manner. Variations are found in quality between the implementing agencies, which will be further analyzed here below. Particular reference is made to objectives like (6) strengthening local capacity to monitor and manage action against WFCL, (7) enhanced family income and access to social safety nets, (8) access to primary, vocational, or non-formal education, and (9) awareness rising on WFCL. Be it true that awareness has been raised at a national level and in all visited regions, but this has by far not yet led to an institutionalization of solutions and means. The systematic validation of gained experiences, field strategies and actions, should be viewed as a learning experience. The basic question to be asked is then to what extent these strategies and actions potentially or effectively contribute to the elimination of WFCL.
4. Strengthening local capacity to monitor and manage action against WFCL: The Project has strengthened the capacity of DOLE Region VII in establishing a child labour monitoring system. To that effect the ILO supported the training of DOLE staff on CLM and the engagement of services by an external consultant to help develop a manual for the system.. A DOLE staff member has recently finalized the accompanying data-base, which is said to contain over 26,890 children in WFCL. Unfortunately, the regional director did not have access to the data-base, because of the recent resignation of the data-base expert. It is believed that at present the data-base is not being utilized. It was understood that it had served the Quick Action Team in rescuing a small number of children. The biggest problem for these children was the lack of funds, with the Social Welfare Department, to further taking care of them in so-called half-way houses.

At barangay level also simple child labour monitoring systems have been developed which mainly consisted of lists of working children, child labourers and children at risk. These proved to be simple lists which enumerate children with, in the best case, educational level and work status. No information is included providing socio-economic backgrounds of the sending families and therefore it is difficult to prioritize children from poor families and to design tailor-made activities for strengthening family income and social safety nets. As it seems, these lists are not always maintained in a dynamic way.

Local ordinances have been developed or are under development to legitimate direct action at community level. Most barangay councils and child labour committees are very vocal about the necessity of direct action, whereas only a few make funds available for continuing the payment of fees for formal schooling and alternative learning systems.

5. Enhanced family income and access to social safety nets
During field visits to villages and towns in four different regions, where approximately 10 APs were visited, a good example has been found of a community based micro-finance and health

insurance system, corresponding to high professional standards (AWFCI, the only IA visited working on social safety nets). In another programme (Quidan Kasahan) located in the sugar cane plantations of Negros Occidental, agricultural extension was given to small farmers, owners of small plots of land, distributed after the agrarian reform, which equally contributed to increase in incomes. Both organizations have in common that they are development-oriented NGOs, with a long-term presence in their areas of operation, with well organized constituencies and not dependant on short running AP finances. In other programmes so-called livelihood activities were observed, like in Bulacan, where TESDA had trained a number of community members in “cosmetology” (manicuring, hair-cut, etc.). In other communities visited, members have been trained in food processing.

However, in most of the visited implementing agencies, this sort of training was not followed up by credit for enterprise development, in line with USDOL policy of not providing cash capital. It is for this reason that many adults have been trained with skills which can not be applied and/or for which it is not known whether there is a market-potential.

According to the March 2007 TPR, 4,471 adult family members would have reported increased incomes, as a result of gaining access to the livelihood and income-generating support provided by the project such as micro-credit schemes, basic literacy and vocational training, as well as technical, non-financial assistance in starting small enterprise and income-generating activities. No data could be made available to substantiate these figures, which seem to be at odds with observations in the field.

6. Access to primary, vocational, or non-formal education

6.1 Quantitative aspects

Figures on effectively “withdrawn and prevented children” provided with either “education related” or “non education related services” vary between several lists provided by the project. Apparently, reporting by implementing agencies has not followed a standard format, which makes it extremely difficult to keep track with quantitative achievements against targets. At the time of the EFE, only 12 IA had submitted their final lists of beneficiaries. For our purposes, the best bet for beneficiary counting had been the list attached to the TPR covering the period September 2006 to March 2007. Relevant figures from this list are the following:

Table 1: Achievement of numerical targets⁷ USDOL Support to TBP (IPEC and ABK)

Children (Direct Beneficiaries)	Part A			Part B			Total
	Education Related Services			Non-Education Related Services			
	Male	Female	Total	Male	Female	Total	
Targets	21,500			23,000			44,500
Withdrawn	19,000						
Prevented	2,500						
Achievements	15,404	13,984	29,388	5,304	6,499	11,803	41,191
Withdrawn	9,353	8,072	17,425	2,848	3,601	6,449	
Prevented	6,051	5,912	11,963	2,456	2,898	5,354	
% of Target	137%			51%			93%

Boys reached : 50.3%

Girls reached : 49.7%

⁷ Source : Philippines TBP USDOL TPR March 2007, pages 51-52

Table 2: Attainment of objectives

Immediate Objective for eliminating WFCL	Achievements ⁸
1. Enhanced knowledge on WFCL for policy development & implementation in the Philippines	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Researches, studies and surveys on WFCL • Support to NSO and research organizations enhanced capacity for gathering reliable info on child labour • Statistics and indicators are now included in the Labour Force Survey, Annual Poverty Index Survey and the national labour and employment reports <p>Examples: Girl Child Labour in Commercial Sexual Exploitation in the Philippines: A Rapid Assessment The International Labour Organization (ILO), through the International Programme on the Elimination of Child Labour (IPEC) and the Statistical Information and Monitoring Programme on Child Labour (SIMPOC), commissioned the Institute for Labour Studies to conduct Rapid Assessment Studies on girl-children in commercial agriculture, commercial sexual exploitation and domestic work.</p> <p><i>This paper was presented during the 3rd DOLE Research Conference "DOLE at 70: Breaking Old Mindset Through Research" at Occupational Safety and Health Centre, Diliman, Quezon City on 27 November 2003 by Ms. Ahmma Charisma Lobrin, OIC, Workers Welfare Research Division, ILS.</i></p>
2. Enhanced & better enforced legislative framework	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • National – RA 9231: law against child labour • Local – Children’s Welfare Codes • Increasing number of LGUs passing anti-child labour resolutions and ordinances • Increasing stakeholder capacity to implement and enforce legal instruments for eliminating CL.
3. National development & social policies include child labour concerns	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Child labour concerns are included in the MTPDP 2004-2010, EFA National Action Plan 2004-2015, National Plan of Action for Decent Work Common Agenda 2005-2007, UNDAF Annual Work Plan 2006-2009. Elimination of WFCL is included as an outcome in the ILO-Decent Work Country Programme 2006-2007. The results of the assessment of NPACL will form the basis for the NPACL Framework for 2007-2015 and the NPACL Strategic Plan for 2007-2010.
4. Enhanced education and training policies can effectively respond to the needs of girls and boys in child labour and to children at risk	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The network of government agencies, local governments, workers’ groups (including teachers’ unions), employers’ organizations and NGOs exerts all-out efforts through campaign, advocacy and policy advice for the realization of PTB Education Agenda. These efforts have contributed to policy reforms and formulation of new strategies that are responsive to the needs of working children, such as the Alternative Learning System (ALS), tutorials and accreditation and equivalency programme of the DepEd. • Capacity of education service providers (such as Instructional Managers) to deliver these alternative modes of education have

⁸ ILO-IPEC Technical Progress Report (TPR) – Philippines, September 2006-March 2007.

	been built in collaboration with the DepEd, LGUs, civil society organizations and the concerned communities.
5. Attitudes towards child labour change among <u>national</u> partner agencies	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Awareness of the negative effects of child labour has been raised and attitudes towards the problem have been changed through both mass and targeted advocacy campaigns. This has been evident from the results of the opinion surveys and the countrywide celebrations of the World Day against Child Labour (WDACL), with full participation of the public, stakeholders, and the media.
6. The capacity of local governments and civil society to monitor and manage action against the WFCL will be strengthened	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Child labour committees, councils for children's welfare, as well as task forces have been established at all levels and their capacity has been strengthened for effective planning, implementation and monitoring of anti-CL initiatives. Capacity for CLM has been enhanced thru establishment of CLM mechanisms such as databases, as well as thru production of tools such as manuals, training modules and guidebook.
7. Families affected by the WFCL will be provided with new opportunities for enhanced income and access to social safety nets	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> The project has withdrawn and prevented 29,388 children through the provision of education related services. These children also benefit indirectly from the livelihood and income generating alternatives provided to their families. As of March 2007, 4,471 adult family members have reported increased incomes as a result of gaining access to the livelihood and income-generating support provided by the project such as micro-credit schemes, basic literacy and vocational training, as well as technical, non-financial assistance in starting small enterprise and income-generating activities.
8. Children at risk an in the WFCL will have access to primary, vocational, or non-formal education, including alternative and flexible learning systems	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> With regards to actions in primary, vocational and non-formal education and other non education related services for children, it has been observed that the USDOL target of 21,500 was exceeded by 37%. All 29,388 children effectively reached were supported through education-related services. The TBP as a whole (including ABK) remained 49% short (11,197) of the non-GPRA target of 23,000. The composition between boys and girls was perfectly balanced.
9. All major local-level actors and institutions have become aware of the problem of the WFCL	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Local level stakeholders (local government executives, community leaders, NGOs, people's organizations, parents, the media, as well as the children themselves) are now highly aware of the problems relating to WFCL.

According to a spreadsheet provided to the mission (bearing neither title nor date), 31 implementing agencies have altogether been dealing with 341 geographical locations. The degree of detail of these geographical locations varies from communities, for certain agencies, to provinces for others. In practice this means that there must have been more than 500 communities in which the programme has been implemented. It goes without saying that, given the magnitude of field activities and their strong geographical dispersion, a very strictly respected standardized monitoring system would have been necessary to keep track of field

implementation. A Child Labour Monitoring System, like the one used in other ILO-IPEC programmes elsewhere, would have served that purpose.⁹

6.2 Qualitative aspects

The unique contribution of the project was in Alternative Learning Systems, helping working children to reintegrate the formal schooling system through the so-called Accreditation and Equivalency Programme (equivalent of high school). In two APs visited, the proportion of working children enrolled in this programme, which passed the threshold proved to be extremely low. In one IA (CERD), none of the students passed the A&E exam, whereas in another (Quidan Kasahan) approximately one third passed (the highest observed). In Bulacan and other regions visited, children did not yet pass the exam. Be it true that the DepEd maintains high passage marks, this is done on purpose to avoid that children will drop out from High School in order to take the “easy shortcut”. Since in the majority of cases observed “withdrawal” should be understood as: working children follow ALS in addition to their work activity, courses were mostly organized during the weekends. This meant an extra burden for the children who nevertheless appeared very motivated. One can imagine that the widespread failure among test-takers scattered many dreams among the children and it is therefore recommended that the Project and the implementing agencies should thoroughly check whether the children are up to the required competency level before registering them for A&E exams.

Experiences in vocational training, like the ones undertaken by SIFI (Sugar Industry Foundation Inc.) and the Bacolod City Government are worthwhile mentioning. In the former, working children were effectively withdrawn from hazardous labour in order to provide them with training in vocational skills in demand on the local labour market. This was financed via a social fund to which the sugar planters contribute a fixed percentage.

7. Awareness rising on WFCL

The Project has significantly contributed to raise the awareness on WFCL among local level stakeholders: local government executives, community leaders, NGOs, people’s organizations, parents, the media, as well as the children themselves. Child labour is not longer a taboo but can be discussed openly, even in vulnerable sectors like CSEC.

6.3 Efficiency

For the entire TBP a total of 41,191 child beneficiaries of direct assistance have been reported by the project (TPR March 2007), at a total cost of US\$ 1,873,368. Thus, cost of direct assistance is calculated to an amount of US\$ 45.48 per child.¹⁰ This is relatively high according to international standards, even more so, if one realizes that, especially in the PoS the majority remains in work and follows ALS during the weekends.

The expected project results continue to justify the cost incurred if efficiency measures are taken:

⁹ See e.g., WACAP in West-Africa (Ghana) or Fishing and Footwear in Indonesia, now used by the respective departments of labor.

¹⁰ Based on an internal document entitled: “TBP Philippines, Historical Cost of Interventions, dated July 9, 2007. In West Africa an amount was found around US\$ 20 but that was for full-time elementary education (J. Krijnen, C. Tesar: MTE-WACAP, 2005).

- Side-tracking implementing agencies during project implementation, if certain minimum standards are not respected and/or if a minimum set of expected results are not achieved in a well-defined time-frame.
- A certain minimal quality output would be desirable in order to justify the sometimes relatively high administrative and monitoring cost per beneficiary; (example one community in which initially ten children were targeted for ALS of which six dropped out, four registered for the exam and two passed; this is not cost effective).
- It would be preferable to package individual APs in a limited number of regions, in order to increase administrative efficiency and quality through synergies between multidisciplinary stakeholders.
- In the end it is all a matter of cost effectiveness (relation between quality and cost). One could imagine investing in means of transportation for field supervisors through which it is expected that the quality of APs will be better monitored. Without any doubt the added value in quality will justify the initial expense in hardware.

6.4 Sustainability

What will contribute to sustainability? The Project has made an effort to stress the following actions susceptible to further institutional sustainability:

1. Multiple partners working in different sectors

All activities were carried out by partner organizations working in various sectors, including:

- a) *For Enabling Environment*: Trade unions, employers' association, farmers' groups, the media, policy makers and key government agencies most notably the Department of Labour and Employment (their labour inspectors), the Department of Education, and Department of Health, including their provincial/municipal and barangay (village) units, local businesses and health workers, academic/research/training institutes and UN agencies.
- b) *For Direct Action*: Parents and families, community leaders and organizations, groups or committees, teachers, schools, parent-teachers' associations, NGOs and skills training providers.

The various partners from the different sectors brought with them different mandates, experiences, specializations, and networks. Having multiple partners served to enlarge the pool of programme supporters and human resources, as well as broadened the programme's perspectives, expanded its networks, and also reduced resistance and possible opposition - thus ensuring broad-based collaboration.

2. Sharing power and sharing responsibilities through multi-sector committees.

The project has established various committees at village, municipal, provincial and national levels. These committees consist of representatives from various sectors not only as a strategy to share power and responsibilities, but also to develop joint ownership. While not every representative or every committee may work effectively, each committee includes representatives from the relevant sectors who are mandated to work on the issues of child labour at the particular level, and that each representative is a decision-maker in his/her organization. This was to ensure that each committee would be able to translate commitments into concrete decisions, resource mobilization and action.

3. Strengthened capacity of partner individuals and institutions

Various capacity building efforts were undertaken to enhance the capacity of partners to combat WFCL in various levels and sectors. The types of capacities developed were based on identified needs:

- a) Government agencies- strategic planning, participatory planning, skills training (according to their mandates) and child labour monitoring
- b) Implementing Agencies- developing project proposals, provision of direct services such as counselling, training of trainers, skills training and child labour monitoring
- c) Media

4. Knowledge management mechanisms and processes

The Project has defined mechanisms and processes so that partners would assess and evaluate their own work, summarizing lessons learned from the experiences, sharing their lessons with others in and across projects, and using lessons learned from their own or from other projects and programmes to revisit and revise their current work. A number of partners have well documented their valuable experiences whereas again others lack a self-critical attitude or take pride from experiences which have not yet proved to be conclusive.

5. Good communications, common understanding and genuine partnerships

As the action programmes worked with many partners at various levels, involving various components over a considerable period of time, it was imperative that all parties ranging from IPEC staff, implementing agencies and action programme staff, to other partners and stakeholders, develop a shared understanding of common goals and expectations, have respect and positive attitudes for each other, see each other as equal partners and develop a genuine partnership based on equality and trust instead of adhering to a donor-recipient relationship, and develop joint ownership over the work they commit themselves to. In order to arrive at all these, stakeholders developed participatory mechanisms and processes for promoting good communications, common understanding and genuine partnership from the beginning and make efforts to nurture them throughout. During field visits and stakeholder workshop the mission generally found a mutual respect and a willingness to share knowledge and experiences between multiple stakeholders but also high level civil servants were met who rather favoured to remain in control.

6. Promoting community participation and community ownership

After large-scale awareness-raising and education campaigns to sway public opinion against WFCL, implementing agencies promoted local participation and ownership at the community level. This strategy ensured that child labour and child rights were not abstract concepts to community people or relegated as 'other people's problems'. Rather child labour issues were grounded in community realities, concerns, and actions.

7. Resource mobilization

Translation of commitment into resource mobilization varied between regions and communities and depended very much on the personal commitment of "enlightened leaders". As in other countries of operation, in a future phase the relative proportion of counterpart funds needs to be increased in order to gradually resemble the after-project situation and to avoid that activities will come to a grinding halt upon project completion. The biggest challenge at the level of communities and households is the mobilization of resources for school-fees. Seen the magnitude of the problem, subsidizing via project funds or individual sponsors will always be

welcomed by parents but this does not provide a model which can be scaled up to a more general level. The country's decentralization policy provides an opportunity to levy local taxes to guarantee that there will be affordable education for all. Progressive taxing is strongly recommended. Institutional and financial sustainability mechanisms need to be institutionalized at different administrative levels.

6.5 Causality

Factors and events that have effected project results in a positive way:

- ILO-IPEC had already eight years of experience working on child labour and the WFCL, which has substantially contributed to the ratification of convention 182 and the formulation of a TBP, including a NPACL;
- Before the Project was designed ILO-IPEC had already implemented 60 APs in sectors relevant for, and in regions with a high prevalence of WFCL; This has enabled the development of a well-functioning network of tripartite partners, civil society organizations and academia;
- The integration of child labour in major development policies, like the Medium-Term Philippine Development Plan and Education for All;
- An excellent problem identification;
- The decentralization of governance provided an opportunity to emphasize the development of regional and local policies and ordinances;
- Development oriented professionally specialized implementing agencies with a long-term field presence proved to have a comparative advantage over others;
- A critical mass of partner institutions has boosted the awareness on WFCL.

Factors and events that have effected project results in a negative way:

- Flaws in design of the project document pertaining to the initial development of a master-list after quantitative targets had already been set instead of integrating beneficiary identification in the APs of field-based implementing agencies;
- The resignation of the first CTA had led to a considerable delay in the development of proposals for APs;
- Quality monitoring of a multidisciplinary approach needs a vast spectrum of professional skills, a critical attitude towards standard solutions (in terms of their effective contribution to the elimination of WFCL) and a taste for innovation. At times the above were found lacking in both project staff and staff of implementing agencies (e.g., entrepreneurial skills);
- At times the approval procedure of APs was lengthy. A combination of factors was responsible for that, like procedural slowness and flaws in the quality of proposals;
- Geographically scattered action was not followed up by necessary monitoring capacity; Considerable time and energy of project management was absorbed by administrative issues which went at the expense of quality monitoring;
- Training in livelihood skills was not matched with access to financial capital; Livelihood and entrepreneurial skills were often not market-oriented;

6.6 Alternative strategies

Alternative approaches which might have been more cost-effective:

- Establishment of one standardized Child Labour Monitoring System, centrally designed and managed in a dynamical way at different administrative levels, under supervision of regional DOLE offices and with the support of implementing agencies;
- Respect of the core of ILO-IPEC's holistic approach: keep direct action focused on working children and their households;
- A packaged approach of mutually supportive APs in a restricted number of geographical regions, managed and supervised by the regional DOLE offices;
- A stricter selection of implementing agencies against a list of criteria in which previous sector exposure in fields of intervention (ALS, entrepreneurial skill training) should predominate;
- ILO should link up the issue of child labour to the strengthening of collective bargaining mechanisms in trade unions of e.g., sugar workers. Plantation workers get P 50 per day (well below the legal standards). An equitable negotiation of fair wages might be more effective for the elimination of WFCL than the strengthening of often marginal livelihood activities. The same goes for a continued process of agrarian reform. Unequal distribution of land and feudal practices are at the base of poverty and child labour.

7. TARGET GROUP IMPACT ASSESSMENT¹¹

7.1 Scope of work

Baseline surveys of target children were carried out by 12 partner organizations in eight provinces under the supervision of the SIMPOC and the Philippine National Statistics Office in 2004-2005. This first set of surveys generated a master list of children between 5-17 years old who were targeted for assistance. The master list, however, was provided to another project called ABK or *Pag-aaral ng Bata para sa Kinabukasan* initiative for drawing up target beneficiaries. Only those children left unassisted by ABK were then used by the IPEC project's implementing organizations as beneficiaries of direct services under their specific action programmes. To meet project targets on number of children for prevention or withdrawal from WFCL, the project's partner organizations undertook further baseline surveys to identify additional child beneficiaries. This study will utilize the final list of child beneficiaries provided by these implementing organizations of the project.

The purpose of the target group impact assessment is to measure the changes that have occurred in the lives of a sample of the beneficiaries as a result of the Project. The target beneficiaries come from six sectors of intervention: sugar cane, child domestic work (CDW), commercial sexual exploitation of children (CSEC), fishing, pyrotechnics, mining and quarrying. The project's long-term impact is measured under five indicators: education, employment, attitudes, health, and economic well-being. Data was gathered using both quantitative and qualitative methods.

7.2 Sources of data

A master-list of IPEC-supported beneficiaries from various ILO implementing partners was initially utilized to serve as respondents of the survey. The beneficiaries of IPEC-supported programmes eliminating the six worst forms of child labour were located with the assistance of the following agencies:

Table 3: Agencies involved in the impact assessment

<i>Area</i>	<i>Sector</i>	<i>Implementing Partners</i>
National Capital Region	CSEC	Quezon City Public Employment Service Office
	CDW	National Union of Workers in the Hotel, Restaurant and Allied Industries
		Visayan Forum Foundation, Inc.
Bulacan	Pyrotechnics	Department of Education, Region III- Bulacan Alternative Learning System
		Department of Labour and Employment, Region III
		Lingap Pangkabataan Inc.
Negros Oriental	Sugar Cane	St. Ma Goretti Development Education Foundation
	Fishing	Negros Oriental Institute for Rural Development, Inc.
	CDW	Association for the Welfare of Filipino Children, Inc.
		Visayan Forum Foundation, Inc.
Negros Occidental	Sugar Cane	Education for Life Foundation
		Sugar Industry Foundation, Inc.
		Provincial Government of Negros Occidental

¹¹ Extract from the Target Group Impact Assessment, August 2007.

Davao City	CSEC	Kaugmaon Centre for Children's Concerns
Compostela	Mining and	Federation of Free Workers
Valley	Quarrying	Municipal Government of Monkayo

Implementing partners from both the government and non-government agencies were tapped to locate the beneficiaries. With the last-minute inclusion of Davao City, the assistance of an NGO was immediately sought to avoid the long process of seeking permissions.

7.3 Sampling of the survey

The sample size for each group of respondents was derived at from a consolidated list of child beneficiaries taking into consideration the high percentage of child labour in the selected areas. Time constraint has also compelled the study to follow the Tracer Study Methodology Manual whereby the minimum requirement of respondents per strata is set at 150. The target population falls under two strata or groups: (1) children withdrawn from exploitative work or working children, and (2) children prevented from exploitative work or at-risk. The number of respondents per area and sector was estimated proportional to the number of beneficiaries per area and sector based on the initial lists provided by ILO.

As mentioned earlier, the study focused on the six worst forms of child labour in the Philippines: CSEC, CDW, and children working in sugar cane plantations, children involved in (deep-sea) fishing, children working in the pyrotechnics industry, and children working in the mining and quarrying sector. It was assumed that children entered the IPEC-supported programme at age 15 when the project commenced in 2003, so the survey focused on children under the age of 19. Children above 19 years of age were also considered if the availability of those under 19 was limited.

Based on initial reports,¹² male children outnumbered female children in almost all areas. However, in terms of sector, females dominated in CSEC and domestic work. In this case and considering the time allotted for this study, it was estimated that 47% of the sample are girls (representing CSEC and domestic work) and 53% of the sample are boys (representing the other sectors). This estimation varied at the end of the actual survey.

In addition, from the 20% of the child beneficiary sample, a household member was made to answer the household beneficiary questionnaire, thus, the number of household member was rounded off to 60. Since no adjustment for proportion was made based on the number of child sample, the 20% household sample is evenly distributed.

The study made use of purposive sampling. A list of beneficiaries was initially consulted in order to locate the beneficiaries. However, there were unanticipated problems with the list and so it was suggested that a purposive sampling be employed instead.

In the table on the following page is the actual number of beneficiaries surveyed for each area and sector.

The initial target of child beneficiaries was 317 but it was reduced to 293 because of a lack of respondents from the CSEC sector. Almost half of the targeted CSEC beneficiaries were not accounted for due to various reasons. In this case, the Informant Questionnaire was utilized to resolve the non-accounted beneficiaries but resulted only to 22 reported ones.

¹² Time-Bound Programme (TBP) Baseline Survey. Listing and Enumeration of Households and Profiling of Children, Integrative Report. Draft Report, No Date.

Household members particularly the mother was made to answer the household questionnaire. It was earlier assumed that the child beneficiary lives with his or her family or relatives with the exception of CSEC and CDW cases. In this case, the possibility of not being able to reach the expected number of household respondents particularly in the CSEC cases was expected. The initial target of household beneficiaries of 60 was reduced to 55.

Table 4: Sampling frame

Sector	Child Beneficiaries						Household Beneficiaries	Informants	Total
	CSEC	CDW	Sugar Cane	Mining & Quarrying	Fishing	Pyrotechnics			
Area									
NCR	15	45					0	22	82
Bulacan						38	12		50
Negros Oriental		38	32		38		12		120
Negros Occidental			33				12		45
Compostela Valley				30			14		44
Davao City	24						5		29
Total	39	83	65	30	38	38	55	22	370

7.4 Profile of the respondents

This section presents a descriptive statistics of the results of the first part of the BQ and HQ questionnaires.

Child Beneficiaries. The Beneficiary Questionnaire was conducted to a total of 293 child respondents divided by area and sector as follows:

Table 5: Child Beneficiaries by Area and Sector

Sector	CSEC	CDW	Sugar Cane	Mining & Quarrying	Fishing	Pyrotechnics	Total
Area							
NCR	15	45					60
Bulacan						38	38
Negros Oriental		38	32		38		108
Negros Occidental			33				33
Davao City	24						24
Compostela Valley				30			30
Total	39	83	65	30	38	38	293

Initially, the target number of respondents under the CSEC sector in NCR was 74 but due to the nature of the work and non-access of enumerators to respondents living in an institution, the number was reduced to 15. In order to compensate for the loss, the research shifted and looked

for beneficiaries in Davao City¹³ with the assistance of Kaugmaon Centre for Children's Concerns. Even so, only a small number of beneficiaries were surveyed due to the limited time allotted for data gathering.

Gender: 52% of the respondents were males and 48% were females..

More female respondents were surveyed in NCR because most of the beneficiaries come from the CDW and CSEC sectors (Table 5). In contrast, many of the respondents in Davao City were males because the implementing agency was generally providing support to male CSEC. It is interesting to note too that the respondents in Bulacan, all from the pyrotechnics industry, have an almost equal number of respondents by gender.

With the exception of NCR, a big percentage of the respondents are still living with both parents (Table 6). In the case of NCR, 35 or 58.3% of the beneficiaries do not live with either of their parents. It is plausible that most of the beneficiaries, CDW and CSEC, were trafficked or have migrated from the provinces to the NCR for economic sustenance; hence, leaving their parents and families behind.

Table 6: Number of Respondents Living with both parents

Status	NCR	Bulacan	Negros Oriental	Negros Occidental	Davao City	Compostela Valley
Living with both parents	17	27	81	27	16	22
Percent	28.3	71.1	75.0	81.8	66.7	73.3

Household Beneficiaries. The Household Questionnaire was conducted to a total of 55 household members mostly with the mother. There was no household beneficiary surveyed in NCR because none of the implementing agencies offered direct services to the families of the child beneficiaries. The household beneficiary in Davao City was limited to 5 respondents, again due to time constraints.

7.5 Involvement in the programme

Child respondents entered the programme at various periods in time. Some joined the programme or received the services as early as 2003 while others have just participated in the programme or began receiving services as late as July 2007.¹⁴ The average age of joining the programmes are as follows: NCR – 15.2, Bulacan – 11.16, Negros Oriental – 11.2, Negros Occidental – 12.3, Davao City – 14.7, and Compostela Valley – 12.3 years old.

Many of the young respondents received various programmes and services from the different implementing agencies. The respondents enumerated the following services and programmes:

¹³ According to a baseline report conducted in 2005, there was high concentration of CSEC in NCR, Davao City and Compostela Valley.

¹⁴ The date of entry depends on the time the Action Programme was implemented.

Table 7: Services enumerated by beneficiaries

<i>Alternative Learning System or ALS</i>	A non-formal education where beneficiaries are taught by Instructional Managers (IMs) on weekends. Children discuss various subject matters including value formation with a use of a module. Children between the ages of 8 and 17 can attend the ALS programme. ¹⁵ Depending upon the agreement between the partner agency and the ILO/IPEC, the ALS is implemented for at least 1 ½ months to a maximum of 6 months. The ALS prepares the children for the Accreditation and Equivalency Examination (A & E). Once a child passes the A & E, the child is said to have graduated from either the elementary or secondary level (depending upon the level at which he or she dropped out from school or stopped attending school).
<i>Educational Assistance</i>	Examples of this are: tutorial programmes, literacy training, provision of school supplies such as notebooks, writing pens, and papers; provision of school uniforms including shoes, and tuition or school fee assistance.
<i>Vocational Training</i>	Examples of this are trainings in cosmetology, reflexology, bag-making, hotel and restaurant, computer, sewing, heavy equipment operation, among others.
<i>Seminars</i>	Examples of this are rights awareness, peer education, life skills (i.e. HIV/AIDS, reproductive health and drug awareness/advocacy programmes), and leadership seminars.
<i>Non-Education Related Activities</i>	Counselling sessions, temporary shelter, day care programmes, nutrition/health programmes, improvement of living conditions, and medical and dental assistances are some examples of this.

There were various reasons why the child respondents joined the programmes but the most frequently mentioned motives are: to continue formal education through the ALS programme, to finish their education, to gain more knowledge, in addition to, learning new skills and livelihood programmes. They believe that the programmes they received or entered into contributed positively to their lives. Such interventions aided them in their studies, facilitated their entry to formal school, and helped them learn more about life and work. The services were rated as follows:

Table 8: Services and Ratings of Services Received by Child Respondents by Area

<i>Area</i>	<i>Programmes/Services</i>	<i>Mean Rate¹⁶</i>
NCR	Educational Assistance	4.35
	Improvement of Living Condition	4.30
	Non-Education Related Services	4.13
	Literacy Training	3.88
Bulacan	ALS	4.71
	Educational Assistance	4.21
Negros Oriental	Tutorial Programmes	4.16
	Educational Assistance (i.e. school supplies)	4.05
	Literacy Training	4.04

¹⁵ The age range can vary depending upon the agreement of the partner agency and ILO/IPEC.

¹⁶ “5” is the highest score, equivalent to “excellent.”

Negros Occidental	ALS and Educational Assistance	4.10
	Day Care Programmes	4.30
	Vocational Training	4.71
Davao City	Seminars	4.36
	Non-Education Related Services	4.52
Compostela Valley	ALS	4.43
	Literacy Training	4.59

When asked what other programmes or services they would like to receive, the answers were varied by area but the most frequently mentioned response is educational assistance until the secondary and/or tertiary level: Bulacan (52.5%), Negros Oriental (49.1%), Davao City (54.2%), NCR (100%), and Compostela Valley (23.3%).¹⁷

As for the household beneficiaries, they also received a range of services and programmes such as micro-credit schemes (microfinance and micro-health insurance), income-generation training programmes such as garment business, meat processing, and rice trading, financial assistance, and various seminars including parent effectiveness, child rights awareness, and life skills. The household respondents also believed that such interventions contributed positively to their families' needs.

7.6 Impact of the programme

The Tracer Study focuses on five major impact areas: employment, education, attitudes, health, and economic well-being. As mentioned earlier, the Beneficiary Questionnaire looks into employment, education and attitude changes among beneficiaries. The Household Questionnaire, on the other hand, looks into the changes in health, economic conditions as well as attitudes of parents on child labour. Changes are discussed from a retrospective point of view. However, the "AFTER" period pertains only to former beneficiaries who have completely left the programme or have stopped receiving services from partner agencies. It does not include those beneficiaries who are still in the programme or continues to receive assistance.¹⁸

7.6.1 Changes in employment and enrolment in formal and informal education

Table 9: Employment changes in respondents

Region	Before		While		After	
	W	NW	W	NW	W	NW
NCR	44	16	30	30	19	21
Bulacan	23	13	13	23	3	12
Negros Oriental	32	74	32	75	24	74
Negros Occidental	15	18	11	22	5	8
Davao City	11	13	10	14	3	7
Compostella Valley	23	4	19	8	-	-
Total	148	138	115	172	54	122

¹⁷ The percentage is based on the frequency of the response. As for respondents in Negros Occidental, 32 out of 33 mentioned "none or no more."

¹⁸ Some of the data are not presented in percentages because of the small number of respondents.

Table 10: Changes in enrolment in formal education in respondents

Region	Before		While		After	
	E	NE	E	NE	E	NE
NCR	32	28	28	32	21	19
Bulacan	17	19	17	19	11	4
Negros Oriental	104	4	103	5	92	7
Negros Occidental	17	16	3	30	7	5
Davao City	19	5	16	8	4	6
Compostella Valley	19	8	4	23	-	-
Total	208	80	171	117	135	41

- With the exception of Negros Oriental, there is an upward trend of non-working beneficiaries from the “before” period to the moment they joined the programme. It is plausible that the decline in working children may be attributed to the programme or services received by the beneficiaries other than the ones previously mentioned.
- With the exception of Bulacan and Negros Oriental, there is a downward trend of school enrollees from the “before” period to when the beneficiaries started to participate in the programme or receive services. Conversely, an upward trend is seen among non-enrollees.
- Even though the sample of former beneficiaries may not be considerable, it is interesting to note that a number of them are non-working and are currently enrolled. In NCR, Bulacan, and Davao City, almost 100% of them are enrolled in formal education. As for Negros Oriental and Negros Occidental, the number of enrolled respondents exceeds the number of respondents in the non-working group. It is possible that a number of these respondents are working and studying at the same time.
- As for vocational and non-formal education, the number is not substantial to merit a trend or impact.

Table 11: Work status across sectors

Sector	Before***	During***	Current/After
CSEC	59.0	33.3	37.5
CDW	62.7	55.4	43.9
Pyrotechnics	63.9	36.1	18.8
Sugarcane	30.8	24.6	19.2
Fishing	18.4	21.1	18.9
Mining**	85.2	70.4	-
All sectors	51.4	39.9	29.0

***Chi-square value is significant at .001 level. **Significant at .01 *Significant at .05

- All respondents are still in the programme

Programmes or services provided by partner agencies particularly for children in the fishing sector have consistently reduced its number. The programmes or services given to children in the mining and quarrying sector, on the other hand, need to be further improved.

Table 12: Enrolment status across sectors

Sector	Before***	During***	Current/After***
CSEC	59.0	48.7	32.0
CDW	77.1	72.3	78.9
Pyrotechnics	47.2	47.2	52.4
Sugarcane	72.3	50.8	75.0
Fishing	100.0	100.0	86.5
Mining**	70.4	(14.8)	-
All sectors	72.2	59.4	70.3

***Chi-square value is significant at .001 level. **Significant at .01 *Significant at .05

- All respondents are still in the programme

() Less than 5 cases

With regards to enrolment status, variation across sectors is significant across all time periods (Table 12). Before the programme was implemented, there were more beneficiaries from the fishing sector attended school and less enrolled children in the pyrotechnics industry. During the implementation of the programme itself, the number of children in the fishing sector who continued to attend school is still high. This signifies that a number of the children remain to be prevented from going back or from engaging in hazardous conditions in the fishing industry. There are fewer children enrolled in school in the mining and quarrying sector but the number of cases is very minimal. Compared to children working in the fishing industry, there are less number of beneficiaries who continued to attend school in the pyrotechnics sector and children involved in commercial sex.

In addition, with regards to former beneficiaries, it is noteworthy that after attending all programmes or receiving services, a significant number of the respondents have continued or decided to attend formal school. This is manifested more so among children in the fishing sector, CDW, and children working in sugar cane plantations as well as those involved in the pyrotechnics industry.

Table 13: Vocational status across sectors

Sector	Before	During	Current/After
CSEC		19	3
CDW	5	10	5
Pyrotechnics	1	3	
Sugarcane		5	
Fishing		1	
Mining	1	1	-
Total	7	39	8

- All respondents are still in the programme.

Table 14: Non-formal education status across sectors

Sector	Before	During	Current/After
CSEC	7	33	10
CDW	9	39	9
Pyro	2	13	5
Sugarcane		17	
Fishing			
Mining	1		-
Total	19	102	24

- All respondents are still in the programme.

With regards to vocational training, the number of responses is too small to merit a cross-sectional analysis. Table 13, nonetheless, shows how much of the respondents have attended vocational training particularly at the “during or while” in the programme stage. The same is true for non-formal education across sectors (Table 14).

Table 15: Household chores across sectors

Sector	Before*	During*	Current/After**
CSEC	92.3	100.0	92.0
CDW	84.3	89.2	89.5
Pyrotechnics	91.7	97.2	71.4
Sugarcane	83.1	84.6	82.7
Fishing	100.0	94.7	97.3
Mining	100.0	100.0	-
All sectors	89.6	92.4	87.5

***Chi-square value is significant at .001 level. **Significant at .01 *Significant at .05

- All respondents are still in the programme

There remain a high percentage of children from all six worst forms of child labour who continue to engage in household chores. It cannot be simply said that the impact have lessened the number of working hours nor the number of chores because household chore is an activity done almost everyday.

7.6.2 Changes in health, socio-economic well-being and attitude towards child labour

Questions on the condition and improvements of family health were asked among household beneficiaries, particularly the mothers. Out of 55 household respondents, 56.4% of them said that there was no difference in the health condition of their families before the programme and after they received the services or left the programme. 41.8% mentioned that there was improvement while only 1.8% said that family health conditions declined.

54.7% of the respondents said that the economic condition of the family improved after they have received services or left the programme. 34% mentioned that there was no difference in their economic situation while 11.3% expressed that it declined after they left the programme.

Table 16: Attitudes on child labour across sector: % agreeing:

Sector	Children gain more skills by working at an early age	Except for light household chores, children under 12 should not work
CSEC	17.9	53.8
CDW	(2.4)	85.5
Pyrotechnics	15.8	92.1
Sugarcane	12.3	86.2
Fishing	(7.9)	81.6
Mining	30.0	56.7
All sectors	11.9	78.8

***Chi-square value is significant at .001 level. **Significant at .01 *Significant at .05

- All respondents are still in the programme

() Less than 5 cases

A considerable percentage of children in the mining and quarrying sector still believe that children gain more skills if they work at a young age. Also, only 53.8% of the respondents in

the CSEC sector, and 56.7% from the mining and quarrying sector believe that working is acceptable for children under the age of 12.

7.6.3 Benefits of the programme

The following presents a summarized assessment of the programmes and services from the point of view of child beneficiaries, household beneficiaries and stakeholders or ILO partner agencies (extracted from the interviews).

Child beneficiaries

- Able to cope well with formal education: The ALS has helped the children facilitate their entry into formal education.
- More courageous in the face of adversity: Aside from increasing their knowledge about child rights, they became more courageous in the face of harmful and abusive conditions.
- More preserving and determined: not were only subject matters increased but also values were taught in facing life's difficulties and challenges.
- Aspire to obtain higher education and work decently: education is valued as an opportunity to reach out for their dreams and live a risk-free and dignified life.

Household beneficiaries

- Varied understanding of child labour in families and communities: According to parents, advocacy programmes and seminars on child labour and child rights have one way or another made the families and communities aware and conscious of the issue. Others stressed that at age 15-17, it is essential that children learn what it means to work by helping them out, for instance in sugar cane plantations and catching fish.
- Empower women to contribute to economic needs of the family: Parents in particular in Negros Occidental and Negros Oriental have shown much appreciation to the income-generating and livelihoods programmes. Not only did they gain knowledge on entrepreneurship, meat processing, fish processing, bookkeeping and household expenses, such programmes have augmented the family's income. Because of these additional sources of income, some parents can now afford to send their children to school.
- Manage a community-based approach to end child labour: Example mentioned: the exceptionally good model developed by AWFCI in micro-credit and health insurance.
- Seek more support and a holistic approach: Few partner agencies have provided a more holistic approach in preventing and combating child labour issues in their respective areas.

Stakeholders or partner agencies

- Placing value on education: According to partner organizations, the ALS and educational assistance have encouraged children to go back to formal school and be withdrawn or prevented from various exploitative works.
- Developing a more community-based approach in preventing child labour: In Region III, DOLE started to advocate the issue of child labour among parents and teachers. Again the outstanding example of AWFCI is mentioned, linking up micro-credit scheme entirely based on members' savings to livelihood training and health insurance. The entire scheme is monitored by the members themselves.
- Providing an enabling environment: In a number of municipalities and communities ordinances and other public and private regulations have been established. In Negros Oriental, through a memorandum of agreement, fishing and operators refrain from hiring

children below the age of 18 in vessels. This is monitored by the Bureau of Fisheries and Aquatic Resources, and the *Bantay-Dagat* or Maritime Police.

7.6.4 Challenges of the programme

- Programmes need to be holistic and sustainable: Only a few partner agencies have addressed the prevention of child labour from a holistic perspective. Educational assistance and ALS, though laudable in its effort to bring knowledge to children, is still not enough. It would be more promising if the whole community is involved and addresses not only economic issues but also on health (positive examples: AWFCI, Visayan Forum and the Government of Negros Occidental).
- Emerging issues on child labour: Though programmes or services have contributed to awareness on child labour issues in the community and value placed on education, partner agencies have expressed that interventions are still limited in scope and time. There are also emerging issues that need to be addressed in relation to the prevention of child labour in particular areas.

In Negros Oriental, concern among children living in the mountains is raised. According to partner agencies, children from the mountains go down to the coastal areas and search for jobs in fishing vessels. No concrete data, however, is available.

In the National Capital Region, it is observed that the demand for domestic work abroad is increasing. The demand for domestic work abroad has somehow enticed younger women (16 or 17 years old) to apply and leave with false documents. In contrary, the absence of adult domestic workers at the local level yields to the employment of younger domestic workers. Again, concrete information about this phenomenon is not available.

Only a few partner agencies have provided a career placement for their beneficiaries. This service, however, is not yet full blown. DOLE Region III linked up with local businesses (i.e., ECOP) to provide beneficiaries who have undergone vocational training for instance in cosmetology with supplies such as manicure sets, scissors, etc. SIFI, on the other hand, has linked up with private companies to allow their beneficiaries who have undergone tractor operation to have an on-the-job training or practicum. Although vocational trainings have attracted the interests of young children with the belief that they will use it for future employment, some of them still could not use these skills because labour law requires employees to be 18 or above.

Finally, the seasonality of a job needs to be taken into consideration when addressing issues on child labour. It is possible that children attend school during off-season jobs but go back to working either in sugar cane fields, in fishing vessels, or in pyrotechnics industry when the season comes. Extensive advocacy and programmes that support families dependent on such industries need to be established.

7.7 Comments by External Final Evaluation Team

In many respects our reading of the figures, as presented in the study, supports the analyses by the research team. We would, however, like to make the following additional comments, partially supportive, partially additional or critical:

Changes in work situation and enrolment for formal education

- Even the maximum duration (6 months) of ALS is too short if one realizes that, in general, children follow two courses of four hours each during the weekend. The maximum of hours

is therefore around 200, which is too short to catch up with sometimes several years out of the formal education system.

- Vocational training: no market potential has been previewed for this skill training. The mission has observed that an entire community in Bulacan was trained through TESDA in cosmetology.
- Except for Bulacan and to a lesser extent NCR no significant changes have been identified in the children's employment situation. The enrolment in formal education has not increased significantly either.
- With regards to vocational and non-formal education it has been reported that no significant trend was observed in reduction in employment and increase in enrolment in formal education (the later is but logical; children are not involved in formal and non-formal education simultaneously).
- Work in most of the sectors has somewhat reduced (exception fishing) but remains relatively high in the mining sector.
- Enrolment in formal education has reduced during the implementation of the APs and decreased for those who are no longer supported. This might be explained by ALS taking over from formal education during project implementation.
- In most cases observed, during project implementation there has been a boost in vocational training and non-formal education. However, there is a trend that upon termination numbers dropped back to the situation before.
- As stated, household chores remain a permanent occupation in spite of project interventions; the magnitude remains more or less stable.

Changes in health, socio-economic well-being and attitudes towards child labour

- Approximately 42% of households reported an improvement in family health and 55% of the respondents stated that the economic conditions of the family had improved.
- Since there was no benchmark for measuring attitudes towards child labour, no changes could be measured. Thirty percent of households in the mining sector are of the opinion that "children gain more skills by working at an early age". This is substantially higher than in the other sectors. Strangely, the lowest percentage of parents agreeing that children under 12 should not work is found in households with children involved in CSEC and, again, in mining.

Benefits of the programme

- The observation that "ALS has helped the children facilitate their entry into formal education" is not substantiated by the mission's observations in the field. It might be that the implementing agencies, which we visited, were not representative.
- It would be useful to have ample information on the magnitude of increases in household income through training in livelihood skills and to what extent that has facilitated parents to send their children to school.

Challenges of the programme

- The mission fully underlines the observation that in the future there is an obvious opportunity to strengthen the holistic approach, used by implementing agencies.
- The same goes for the observation that few partner agencies have provided a career placement for their beneficiaries. Linking up with private companies (see example SIFI) provides the opportunity to receive skill training in line with market demand.

Final comment

Given the extremely short timeframe for the Impact Study and numerous practical bottlenecks encountered, the mission would like to express its highest appreciation to the direction of the Psychosocial Support and Children's Rights Resource Centre for the meticulous work done.

8. CONCLUSIONS

8.1 Project design

- The problem analysis reflected in the Project Document is of an excellent quality. The holistic approach proposed by ILO-IPEC duly reflects the complexity of the child labour problem. The magnitude of the problem is such that, given budgetary and time constraints, merely first innovative experiences can be tried out which, when proven successful, can be considered for scaling up to a policy level.
- Quantitative targets for direct action were already well defined well before master-list and APs had been finalized and that might have contributed to an emphasis on achieving quantitative targets, at times at the expense of process and quality monitoring.
- The Project Document reflects a clear logical structure, stated in unambiguous terms. The internal logic of the framework is respected. With regards to the very detailed activity planning: The radius of action should never be allowed to bypass the radius of foresight.
- The evaluation team has come to the conclusion that the assumptions still prove to be valid. However, they are mainly formulated at a national level. Assumptions, at a meso and micro level which formed necessary conditions for achievement of the Outputs are found lacking.
- The mission disagrees with the observation of the MTR that the Project would be lacking gender sensitivity.
- Immediate Objectives are stated in relative terms. The Project Document does not set time-bound standards (except for the long-term development objective of 75% reduction), but merely gradual ones.

8.2 Delivery process

- Three major aspects have caused constraints and delays in the implementation of the project. The first is the master-listing of beneficiaries prior to the development of APs. The second is the linkage with the Education Initiative Project. Also the resignation of the first CTA led to considerable delays. The general duration of remaining APs was much too short to expect sustainable results.
- The big challenge during implementation was to aim for sustainable outcomes, by creating synergies and complementarities between all expected outputs of both sets of strategic components, as stated in the logical framework. Given the huge time pressure and relatively limited financial and human Project resources, this highly time- and energy absorbing coordination proved to be a difficult task. This is even more the case if one realizes to what extent relatively modestly financed APs where geographically scattered over the country, causing administrative inefficiency.
- We would disagree with the MTE qualifying lack of field monitoring as the result of “remote administrative control” it rather reflects the dominant management culture biased in favour of achieving targets.
- Except for an urge to speed up the approval of AP proposals in the pipeline, the recommendations of the MTE, some of which we assessed as highly relevant (e.g., cluster approach) were not followed up.
- Proposed future adjustments include: (1) the development of a standardized CLMS, (2) increased counterpart contribution, (3) continued capacity building of staff and partners, (4) enhanced knowledge management through institutionalized learning,

8.3 Implementation arrangements

Budget and staff appeared appropriate to contribute to the project objectives in a meaningful way. The monitoring capacity of project staff and implementing agencies needs to be strengthened in technical fields such as market-oriented skill and livelihoods training as well as child labour monitoring.

8.4 Performance

Relevance

Problems that gave rise to the project still exist. The project has been instrumental in modestly trying out first experiences to tackle root causes through APs at a meso and micro level which ought to be brought to maturity before considering scaling up to a policy level. The project was an appropriate response to the problem of child labour since it was the first in its sort, with the ambition to tackle the elimination of child labour in a holistic manner while at the same time legitimizing direct action through relevant policies and legislation at national and regional levels. This has resulted in remarkably increased awareness at all administrative levels. The project is still appropriate to the identified problems but corrections have to be applied in the design.

Effectiveness

- The specific contribution of the Project was especially to support the NCLC to take down child labour friendly policies and legislation to the regional level. This has led to the creation of child labour committees at provincial and local levels. Regional government has also been supported in designing child labour monitoring systems, where DOLE Region VII is playing a lead role. The Project has also been very instrumental in making education policies more responsive to the needs of child labour, working children and children at risk. The PoS has boosted ILO-IPEC's ongoing work in this field and approaches have been proven effective and ready for extension to other regions.
- With regards to direct action to reduce the WFCL: due to the innovative character of the APs, delays in implementation and at times insufficient supervision and support, many have been too short in duration to claim that they have proven to provide the appropriate solutions to eliminate the WFCL in a sustainable manner. Remarkable variation is found in quality between the implementing agencies. Be it true that awareness has been raised at a national level and in all visited regions this has by far not yet led to an institutionalization of solutions and means.
- Strengthening local capacity to monitor and manage action against WFCL: Variable experiences have been observed between the regions served in child labour monitoring. Community-based approaches appear promising but because of lack of funds approaches to support withdrawn children have not been sufficiently institutionalized beyond project-initiated and funded initiatives.
- Enhanced family income and access to social safety nets: Two organizations visited were working in this field and showed impressive results, whereas others appeared much weaker. AWFCI has developed an excellent savings-credit model, ready for scaling up. In most of the implementing agencies visited, however, livelihood training was not followed up by entrepreneurial credit. It is for this reason that many adults have been trained with skills which can not be applied and/or for which it is not known whether there is a market. In most cases observed there was no linkage between a simultaneous targeting of children (in

education) and strengthening of their family's income, which is the major working assumption in the holistic approach reflected in the Strategic Programme Impact Framework.

- With regards to actions in primary, vocational and non-formal education and other non education related services for children, it has been observed that the USDOL target of 21,500 was exceeded by 37%. All 29,388 children effectively reached were supported through education-related services. The project remained 49% short (11,197) of the non-GPRA target of 23,000. The composition between boys and girls was perfectly balanced. One can imagine that the failure marks in the A&E exam have scattered many dreams and it is therefore that the Project and the implementing agencies should thoroughly check whether the children are up to the required level before registering them for A&E exams. Experiences in vocational training, like the ones undertaken by the Sugar Industry Foundation Inc. (SIFI) and the Bacolod City Government are worthwhile mentioning.
- Awareness rising on WFCL: The Project has significantly contributed to raise the awareness on WFCL among local level stakeholders: local government executives, community leaders, NGOs, people's organizations, parents, the media, as well as the children themselves. Child labour is not longer a taboo but can be discussed openly, even in vulnerable sectors like CSEC.

Efficiency

- A total of 41.191 child beneficiaries of direct assistance have been reported by the project (TPR March 2007), at a total cost of US\$ 1,873,368. Thus, cost of direct assistance is calculated to an amount of US\$ 45.48 per child.¹⁹ This is relatively high according to international standards, even more, if one realizes that the majority remains in work and follows ALS during the weekends.
- The expected project results continue to justify the cost incurred if efficiency measures are taken: (1) sidetracking non-performing agencies, (2) reach a critical mass of beneficiaries per unit of intervention in order to reduce the administrative costs, (3) follow a regional package of individual APs to increase administrative inefficiency, and quality through synergies between multiple stakeholders, (4) gradually introducing an increased financial counterpart contribution.

Sustainability

- What will contribute to sustainability? The Project has made an effort to stress the following actions susceptible to further institutional sustainability: (1) Multiple partners working in different sectors, (2) Sharing power and sharing responsibilities through multi-sector committees, (3) Strengthened capacity of partner individuals and institutions, (4) Knowledge management mechanisms and processes, (5) Good communications, common understanding and genuine partnerships, (6) Knowledge management mechanisms and processes, and (7) Promoting community participation and community ownership.
- In order to further financial mobilization, the biggest challenge at the level of communities and households is the mobilization of resources for school-fees. Seen the magnitude of the problem, subsidizing via project funds or individual sponsors will always be welcomed by parents but this does not provide a model which can be scaled up to a more general level. Decentralized governance provides an opportunity for levying decentralized and progressive taxes.

¹⁹ Based on an internal document entitled: "TBP Philippines, Historical Cost of Interventions, dated July 9, 2007.

Causality

- Factors and events that have affected project results in a positive way: (1) ILO's previous working experience, (2) Government commitment to prioritize child labour in development policies, (3) decentralized governance, (4) a long-term presence of development-oriented NGOs, (5) an excellent problem analysis and (6) a critical mass of partner institutions.
- Factors and events that have effected project results in a negative way: (1) favouring the use of a master-list over process-oriented beneficiary identification by partners, (2) the resignation of the first CTA, (3) lack of certain subject matter skills and critical attitude lacking, and therefore weak monitoring, (4) procedural slowness and flaws in formulation and approval of APs, (5) geographically scattered action, insufficient economies of scale, (6) training in livelihood skills not sufficiently market-oriented and not matched by access to means of production.

Alternative strategies

- Alternative approaches which might have been more cost-effective: (1) Establishment of one unique Child Labour Monitoring System, used at all levels, (2) a packaged approach of mutually supportive APs in a restricted number of regions, (3) a stricter selection of implementing agencies against professional criteria, (4) ILO could link up the project to equitable development measures, like collective bargaining in sugar cane plantations and agrarian reform in order to more effectively tackle the root causes of poverty and hence child labour.

Target group impact assessment

- The Tracer Study focuses on five major impact areas: employment, education, attitudes, health, and economic well-being. The Beneficiary Questionnaire looks into employment, education and attitude changes among beneficiaries. The Household Questionnaire, on the other hand, looks into the changes in health, economic conditions as well as attitudes of parents on child labour.

Changes in employment and enrolment in formal and informal education

- It is plausible that the decline in working children may be attributed to the programme or services received by the beneficiaries other than the ones previously mentioned.
- Programmes or services provided by partner agencies particularly for children in the fishing sector have consistently reduced its number. The programmes or services given to children in the mining and quarrying sector, on the other hand, need to be further improved.
- With regards to enrolment status, variation across sectors is significant across all time periods. There are fewer children enrolled in school in the mining and quarrying sector but the number of cases is very minimal. Compared to children working in the fishing industry, there are less number of beneficiaries who continued to attend school in the pyrotechnics sector and children involved in commercial sex. In addition, with regards to former beneficiaries, it is noteworthy that after attending all programmes or receiving services, a significant number of the respondents have continued or decided to attend formal school. This is manifested more so among children in the fishing sector, CDW, and children working in sugar cane plantations as well as those involved in the pyrotechnics industry.

Changes in health, socio-economic well-being and attitude towards child labour

- Questions on the condition and improvements of family health were asked among household beneficiaries, particularly the mothers. Out of 55 household respondents, 56.4% of them said that there was no difference in the health condition of their families before the programme and after they received the services or left the programme. 41.8% mentioned that there was improvement while only 1.8% said that family health conditions declined.
- 54.7% of the respondents said that the economic condition of the family improved after they have received services or left the programme. 34% mentioned that there was no difference in their economic situation while 11.3% expressed that it declined after they left the programme.
- A considerable percentage of children in the mining and quarrying sector still believe that children gain more skills if they work at a young age. Also, only 53.8% of the respondents in the CSEC sector, and 56.7% from the mining and quarrying sector believe that working is acceptable for children under the age of 12.

- Benefits of the programme

The following presents a summarized assessment of the programmes and services from the point of view of child beneficiaries, household beneficiaries and stakeholders or ILO partner agencies (extracted from the interviews).

Child beneficiaries: (1) Able to cope well with formal education, (2) More courageous in the face of adversity, (3) More preserving and determined, and (4) Aspire to obtain higher education and work decently

Household beneficiaries: (1) Varied understanding of child labour in families and communities, (2) Empower women to contribute to economic needs of the family, (3) Manage a community-based approach to end child labour, and (4) Seek more support and a holistic approach

Stakeholders or partner agencies: (1) Placing value on education, (2) Developing a more community-based approach in preventing child labour, and (3) Providing an enabling environment

- Challenges of the programme

- Programmes need to be holistic and sustainable
- Emerging issues on child labour: partner agencies have expressed that interventions are still limited in scope and time.

- Additional remarks EFE

- The observation that “ALS has helped the children facilitate their entry into formal education” is not substantiated by the mission’s observations in the field. It might be that the implementing agencies, which we visited, were not representative.
- It would be useful to have ample information on the magnitude of increases in household income through training in livelihood skills and to what extent that has facilitated parents to send their children to school.

- The mission fully underlines the observation that in the future there is an obvious opportunity to strengthen the holistic approach, used by implementing agencies.
- The same goes for the observation that few partner agencies have provided a career placement for their beneficiaries. Linking up with private companies (see example SIFI) provides the opportunity to receive skill training according to expressive needs on the labour market.
- Given the extremely short timeframe for the Impact Study and numerous practical bottlenecks encountered, the mission would like to express its highest appreciation to the direction of the Psychosocial Support and Children's Rights Resource Centre for the meticulous work done.

9. RECOMMENDATIONS

9.1 Project design

- It is recommended to complement studies on child labour with the so-called “participatory livelihoods assessments”²⁰ at a household level and to integrate this method throughout the APs and not to have them implemented upfront by research organizations. This will help to make implementing agencies accept a more holistic approach in tackling child labour. Livelihoods assessment can draw on local information, such as those provided by rural health workers and teachers (see e.g. St. Maria Goretti’s & AWFCI experiences in Negros Oriental). The need for staff and partner training in this methodology is obvious.
- Detailed activity planning should be finalized in function of proposed APs (which should respect immediate objectives and expected results as formulated in the project document) and should be fine-tuned at regular intervals in function of progress measured. The feedback loop should be actively used instead of detailing activities for the entire implementation period upfront.
- In relation to the above: quantitative targets should be set in function of the absorption capacity of implementing agencies. This means that a preliminary assessment of organizational/institutional maturity and subject matter knowledge should be given due attention.
- Critical assumptions for a successful project implementation need to be formulated at all administrative levels of intervention, addressing both strategic project components.
- The issue of gender can be integrated into the “participatory livelihoods assessments”. It would be interesting to make an analysis of the distribution between, productive, reproductive and representative tasks between the two genders, in order to target the interventions more specifically.
- It is recommended to set during the time planning of the project and the APs a number of process indicators: a critical time path linked to a minimum of time-bound results.

9.2 Delivery process

- Instead of using upfront a master-list (implemented by external research institutions) and to make direct action depend upon its finalization, it is proposed that a standardized child labour monitoring system will be developed, which will be managed at regional level, under the auspices of the regional DOLE offices. Results from the “participatory livelihood assessment” will be gradually fed into the data-bases.
- Direct action programmes supporting education and livelihoods activities will not have a shorter duration than two years.
- While maintaining the de-linked status between the two projects, active coordination between meetings ABK and ILO-IPEC PoS need be reinitiated in order to avoid overlap, to create synergies and promote mutual learning.
- The methodological capacity of project staff and partners will be enhanced, including participatory planning, monitoring and learning methods and subject matter knowledge in innovative education and livelihoods-oriented activities.

²⁰ See e.g., <http://www.livelihoods.org/>

- An active learning culture will be pursued, in which project experiences will be validated and disseminated and where weaknesses should be viewed as opportunities for improvement.
- Support is solicited from ILO's multidisciplinary teams in market-oriented enterprise promotion and the introduction of saving-credit schemes.
- A next phase should last at least four years. During the tendering of the project the donor is requested to favour implementing agencies with demonstrated comparative advantages in creating an enabling environment and having long-term institutionalized involvement with tripartite partners, relevant international conventions, and relevant subject matter knowledge for direct action.
- Emphasis will be put on the development of institutionally and financially sustainable mechanisms for the elimination of the WFCL. The national counterpart contribution in project implementation should be gradually increased, in order to resemble the "after the project situation".
- The cluster approach, as proposed by the MTE, is wholeheartedly supported. Hereby it is expected that synergies will increased, contributing to ILO-IPEC's holistic approach to the elimination of child labour, to an increased administrative efficiency and quality monitoring as well as to increased ownership.

9.3 Performance

- Activities undertaken in strengthening the "enabling environment" need to be brought to scale and institutionalized for replication in other regions. The regional directions of DOLE and the provincial child labour committees should have the overall supervision of all activities.
- There is an obvious opportunity to match training in market-oriented livelihood and entrepreneurial skills with financial capital generated through savings and credit schemes (see experience of AWFCI).
- Additional income generated by enhanced household income should be substantiated as important enough to make parents refrain from sending their children into child labour and to afford their schooling expenses. Support to activities deemed viable should be made dependent on willingness to effectively reintegrate children into either formal or non-formal education ("their part of the deal").
- As stated in the Impact Assessment, few partner agencies have provided a career placement for their beneficiaries. Needs for vocational training can be matched with opportunities for job placement in close coordination with employers' organizations such as SIFI.
- Non-performing implementing agencies should be sidetracked during project implementation according to a set of commonly agreed minimal quality criteria.
- Create a critical mass of beneficiaries in order to justify monitoring and administrative costs (not too effective beneficiaries as observed in one of the communities). Aim for economies of scale.
- Decentralized governance provides an opportunity for levying decentralized and progressive taxes to complement user fees for schooling.
- Reduce procedural slowness and flaws in the formulation and approval of APs. Try to distribute the inception of APs over time, in order to avoid strong peaks in workload for approval and monitoring.
- Proposed alternative strategies: ILO should link up the project to equitable development policies like collective bargaining in the sugar cane plantations or continued agrarian reform in order to more effectively tackle the root causes of poverty and hence child labour.

10. GOOD PRACTICES AND LESSONS LEARNED

10.1 Best practices

By far the most convincing field experience was observed in the AP implemented by AWFCI in Negros Oriental. This organization has successfully circumvented USDOL's policy of not availing credit for entrepreneurial skills by initiating a savings-credit scheme. Participants to the scheme are only allowed credit once a certain level of savings has been achieved. This credit is being used for productive investments. Moreover, a separate micro-health scheme has been developed according to the same principle. The two schemes are entirely run by women from the community. The programme is well designed and does away with dependency on external funds and is entirely self-financed. This kind of programmes substantially contributes to a sense of self-worth and to alleviate poverty without creating external dependencies. Last but not least the programme is actively linked to the elimination of child labour in fishery and agriculture (the communities in questions are situated on the sea-shore).

Another practice was observed in Negros Occidental, where Quidan Kaisahan, is actively involved in providing work and education in the sugar cane areas. QK provides innovative agriculture skills to communities of sugar cane workers on the land received through the agrarian reform. In contrast to many other rural-based implementing agencies (in which all children only have one dream: to find work in town), QK shows farmers and children that a decent living can be made from agriculture. Education curricula help children to become better farmers.

Also the experience of SIFI (Sugar Industry Foundation Inc.) in Negros Occidental needs to be mentioned. Sugar cane planters contribute a fixed percentage of their margin to a social fund, from which vocational training is paid for young boys in skills which are demand in the local sugar industry (e.g. tractor mechanic or operator).

In Cebu, BIDLISIW was visited and found involved in withdrawing and preventing children from commercial sexual exploitation through the child and family healing and recovery approach. The mission was impressed by the professional quality of the psycho-social care, provided to the children and their parents.

10.2 Lessons learned

10.2.1 Project design

- Quantitative targets reflecting numbers of children to be withdrawn and reflected should be based on the implementation and absorption capacity of implementing agencies, instead of defining them upfront.
- Instead of using external research institutions, implementing agencies themselves should be involved in identifying the beneficiaries. They are field-based and better versed in the socio-economic field realities.
- Beneficiary identification should go beyond the simple listing of child labour and should incorporate socio-economic background information on the sending households. Child labour is a complex issue and cannot be tackled by removing the symptoms. It is therefore proposed to use the so-called "participatory livelihoods assessment" through which causes and effects can be related, i.e., the household's asset base can be taken into account.

Resulting analytical data could be gradually fed into a standardized Child Labour Monitoring System. Beneficiary identification is part of the implementation of the APs.

- Instead of using a master-list approach a standardized CLMS should be used which should be dynamically managed at lower administrative levels by all implementing agencies, under supervision of the Provincial Child Labour Committees.
- The two strategic components of ILO-IPEC's approach, i.e., "enabling environment" and "direct action" should be implemented in a mutually supportive way.
- The elements constituting ILO-IPEC's direct action approach should be implemented in a holistic manner: it is the same households with child labour or children at risk (targeted for direct action in formal and informal education) which will be, simultaneously, subject to strengthening of livelihood and entrepreneurial skills and social safety nets.

10.2.2 Delivery process

Better quality programmes are found with the more professional and development-oriented organizations having a long-term field presence and thereby well-established constituencies and more varied sources of funding, as well as where inter-agency collaboration is best developed. Enhanced synergies between strategic components can be increased through a packaged approach in a limited number of geographical regions, coordinated at a regional level.

10.2.3 Performance

- The development of independently run and self-financed saving-credit schemes has the potential of avoiding external dependencies and to provide financial capital for productive investments and social safety nets (e.g., health insurance, school fees). This provides a better opportunity for asset strengthening and income generation than the emphasis the training of livelihood skills with neither access to financial capital, nor an obvious market potential.
- The elimination of child labour should be accompanied by measures of equitable development, like e.g., collective bargaining and continued agrarian reform.

ANNEXES

ANNEX 1. Terms of Reference



**International Programme on the Elimination of Child
Labour
ILO/IPEC**

Final

Terms of Reference For

***Expanded Final Evaluation of* (Evaluation of Phase I + Target Group Impact Assessment Study)**

Supporting the Time-Bound Program on the Elimination of the Worst Forms of Child Labour in the Republic of the Philippines

PHI/02/P50/USA

June – August 2007

ILO Project Code:	PHI/02/P50/USA
Project Code	P.270 07 343 051
Country:	The Philippines
Starting date:	Sept 2002
Ending dates:	Aug 2007
Programme location:	The Philippines
Programme language:	English
Executing agency:	ILO-IPEC
Financing agency:	USDOL
Donor contribution	US\$5.199.198

Background

1. The aim of IPEC is the progressive elimination of child labour, especially its worst forms. The political will and commitment of individual governments to address child labour — in cooperation with employers' and workers' organizations, non-governmental organizations and other relevant parties in society— is the basis for IPEC action. IPEC support at the country level is based on a phased, multi-sector strategy. This strategy includes raising awareness on the negative consequences of child labour, promoting social mobilization against it, strengthening national capacities to deal with this issue and implementing demonstrative direct action programmes (AP) to prevent children from child labour and remove child labourers from hazardous work and provide them with appropriate alternatives.
2. From the perspective of the ILO, the elimination of child labour is part of its work on standards and fundamental principles and rights at work. The fulfilment of these standards should guarantee decent work for all adults. In this sense the ILO provides technical assistance to its three constituents: government, workers and employers. This tripartite structure is the key characteristic of ILO cooperation and it is within this framework that the activities developed by the TBP should be analyzed.
3. ILO Decent Work Country Programmes (DWCPs) are being introduced in the ILO to provide a mechanism through which to outline agreed upon priorities between the ILO and the national constituent partners with a broader UN and international development context. For further information please see <http://www.ilo.org/public/english/decent.htm>
4. The DWCP defines a corporate focus on priorities, operational strategies as well as a resource and implementation plan that complement and supports partner plans for national decent work priorities. As such DWCP are broader frameworks to which the individual ILO project is linked and to which it contributes. DWCP are beginning to be gradually introduced in various countries planning and implementing frameworks and in The Philippines.
5. In the context of the ILO Convention No.182, the Republic of the Philippines is currently implementing a Time Bound Programme (TBP) on the Worst forms of Child Labour (WFCL). The convention requires ratifying states to implement time-bound measures to eliminate the worst forms of child labour. A Time Bound Programme is essentially a Strategic Programme Framework of tightly integrated and coordinated policies and programmes to prevent and eliminate a country's worst forms of child labour within a defined period of time. TBPs emphasize the need to address the root causes of child labour, linking action against child labour to the national development effort, with particular emphasis on the economic and social policies to combat poverty and to promote universal basic education.
6. The most critical element of the TBP is that it is implemented and led by the country itself. The countries commit to the development of a plan to eradicate or significantly diminish the worst forms of child labour in a defined time period. This implies a commitment to mobilize and allocate national human and financial resources to combat the problem. The Philippines has demonstrated its commitment

by integrating child labour as a priority concern in the Medium-Term Philippine Development Plan (2001 – 2004) and through the new National Program Against Child Labour that has been designed as an overall framework for action against child labour. The TBP forms a major component of the National Program Against Child Labour

7. The Development Objective of the project is to support the Government of The Philippines in achieving its goal of reducing the worst forms of child labour by 75 percent by 2015. The nine Immediate Objectives (IO) that will lead to the accomplishment of the Development Objective can be found below. Each IO is paired with the corresponding results from the independent midterm evaluation that was carried out in October 2005.
8. IO1 There is an enhanced knowledge base for policy development and implementation in the Philippines.

“The first objective calls for enhanced knowledge base for policy development and implementation. This has been achieved through the commission of various studies about the target group and their situation. The technical support by the Project to Committee members, both at the national and local level has also contributed to this base. However, in how far this knowledge has been used for child-labour oriented planning and development beyond the Project is not known. There is still much to learn about the situation and conditions of child labourers but the Project seems not to have plans to commission further studies.”

9. IO2 There is an enhanced and better-enforced legislative framework.

“The establishment of the legislative framework started many years before the Project, in particular with the ratification of ILO Convention 182. Building upon this cornerstone the Project has contributed to the enabling of a legislative environment that on the national level is almost complete. The Project has put efforts in establishing the legislative framework on the regional/provincial levels and this has now taken form but still needs to be moulded to fit to the demands of the TBP and NPACL. The Project has achieved what was intended for the national level and to a degree for the local levels. However, the Project will not achieve a comprehensive legislative framework in each of their target areas unless more action programs aimed at building the legislative framework will be approved and the Project will get an extension until end of 2007.”

“The enforcement of the child-labour legislation is mainly done through the labour inspectorates of the Departments of Labour and Employment (DOLE) in the regions and provinces. In some of the Project target areas the DOLE is making a serious effort to encourage families to comply with the law and force employers to comply if they do not so voluntarily. The Project is actively supporting the DOLE only in some target areas and there is enforcement improved. There are also community actors involved in the enforcement, for example in some mining ‘barangays’ the mayor put in place ordinances that punishes parents who send their children to work in the mines. This local law seems to be enforced rigidly. The Project will have achieved enforcement of child-labour legislation to some degree by the end of the Project but there remains much to be done.”

10. IO3 National development and social policies include child labour concerns.

“The IPEC’s previous programs have already achieved much in the area of including child-labour and child labour statistics in national development and social policies. The Project has built further on this work through its support to the NCACL. The main contribution of the Project to this is that through the focus on child-labour activities in various regions the national attention for child-labour issues remained high. If the Project continues and increases support to the Committee there will be no doubt that the objective will have been achieved by the end of the Project.”

11. IO4 Enhanced education and training policies can effectively respond to the needs of girls and boys in child labour and to children at risk.

“The task of the Project to achieve that through ‘Enhanced education and training policies’ girls and boys in child labour or for children at risk will get (better) access to public and/or non-formal education is one of the most difficult ones. August 2003, the project supported the Department of Education’s National Level Consultative Assessment and Action Planning Workshop on Education Initiatives for Child Labourers. The main output of the workshop was the PTBP Education Agenda which is now being pursued by the Education Sub-Group of the National Child Labour Committee, of which the Project is an active member. The Project was also active in the advocacy efforts for the inclusion of child labourers in the Education for All National Action Plan. Additionally, the project collaborated in the implementation in the Philippines of the APEC Education Awareness Raising project which aims to enhance education policies at all levels for the benefit of child labourers. Achieving its goals the Project requires cooperation with those agencies that provide or projects that support education. One such project is of course the ABK project and although there were constraints between the parties in effect many child labourers have benefited from the relationship and have enrolled in education. The Project has also assisted and supported ABK in creating contacts and forging links with the relevant institutions dealing with the education of child labourers, particularly the Education Sub-Group of the National Child Labour Committee and other social partners involved in anti-child labour initiatives through education. However, the Project was not actively involved through action programs or technical support in enhancing or developing education and training policies. In that sense the Project has thus not achieved its objective, but one might argue that this is the mandate of other projects, like ABK.”

12. IO5 Attitudes towards child labour have changed among partner agencies.

“There is a profound child-labour orientation among the government and civil society partners of the Project. However, the Mission was not able to determine in how far this was due to the Project or to the process put in motion by IPEC years ago. Some more work can be done by the Project in the area of gender sensitivity and promoting sexual education policies (a sensitive issue in the Philippines but essential for the health of adolescents who are promiscuous).”

13. IO6 The capacity of local government and civil society to monitor and manage action against the worst forms of child labour will be strengthened.

“The capacity to monitor the worst forms of child labour has been strengthened in particular regions/provinces and nationally. The National Statistics Office child labour survey initiative was sustained and further developed by the project. Similarly, the management of activities against child labour has been strengthened in those areas where action programs are implemented. But again, for lack of standards and baselines the Mission is not able to determine the degree of this strengthening. There are stronger and weaker agencies and organizations that are partner of the Project. It would be a good initiative if the Project would mobilize the stronger partners to assist and guide the weaker partners, in the process transferring skills.”

14. IO7 Families affected by the worst forms of child labour will have been provided with new opportunities for enhanced income and access to social safety net.

“The Project through its partners has provided livelihood and other support that will positively affect the beneficiary families. The degree in which this has been achieved is however not very high in view of the many proposed direct action programs that are not yet implemented. Without an extension until end of 2007 the Project will likely not have achieved what was envisaged. In terms of gaining access to social safety nets the Mission could not obtain significant information.”

15. IO8 Children at risk and in the worst forms of child labour will have access to primary, vocational or non-formal education, including alternative and flexible learning systems.

“The Projects’ partners involved in the direct action programs aim to get from hazardous labour withdrawn children into non-formal education/flexible learning systems, vocational training and/or public school. It is thus evident that the Project has achieved this objective to a certain degree. However, like above without more direct action programs the Project will not achieve its full objective.”

16. IO9 All major local-level actors and institutions have become aware of the problem of the worst forms of child labour and are mobilized in the battle against it.

“The Projects objective is that all major local-level actors and institutions have become aware of the problem of the worst forms of child labour and are mobilized in the battle against it. It is evident that many institutions, agencies and actors are aware of the problem. However, the Mission is not able to ascertain whether this includes all major actors and institutions. The objective is obviously too ambitious regarding mobilization and the Mission has not found proof that a majority of government agencies or actors from civil society are mobilized and do ‘battle’ to eradicate the worst forms of child labour.”

17. Below are the recommendations that were included at the conclusion of the mid-term evaluation report.
- To extend the lifetime of the Project with at least one more year until end of 2007.
 - Strengthen the enabling environment in the regions/provinces using innovative approaches like ‘championships’ (see under Good Practices) and maximizing the input by the field coordinators.
 - Take measures for improved communication with partners and adopt an attitude of ‘nurturing’ these partners towards sustainability.
 - Allocate more time to work with the National Committee on Child Labour in order to assist them to strengthen/form regional/provincial committees on child labour.
 - Investigate and follow-up with action any delays in action programmes have the possibility of adversely impacting the number of children withdrawn from or prevented from entering hazardous work.
 - The review of Action Program proposals in the pipeline for completeness and, whenever feasible, consider the integrated nature of the proposals.
 - The relationship with the ABK project should be kept as it is, trusting on the status quo for the rest of the Project lifetime. However, collaboration on the regional/provincial levels should be encouraged and strengthened.
 - The Project management should receive assistance from other ILO-IPEC departments in order to overcome the action program delays and to improve the internal communication with office and field staff.
 - The project monitoring system should be reviewed and improved, including some of the Project indicators that are less measurable.
 - Specialized staff from ILO-IPEC departments should together with the CTA review what elements of the Project management should be improved in order to facilitate the satisfactory completion of the Project.
 - Finally, the Project should make work of introducing gender concerns in existing and new action programs. Special training sessions and specific research could reduce the gender-blindness of the current agenda.
18. Reviews of the TPRs that have been prepared since the midterm evaluation was conducted give an indication as to the current status of the program of support. The March 2006 TPR reported that the Time Bound Education Agenda for the elimination of the worst forms of child labour continued to be pursued at the national and local levels. The project also worked for the mainstreaming of child labour data and information in national statistics such as the Annual Poverty Index Survey (APIS) and Labour Force Survey (LFS). Through participation in technical discussions and public debates on child labour issues, the project contributed to the enactment in 2004 of the new law against child labour (Republic Act 9231), as well as in the promulgation of local government ordinances against the worst forms of child labour, most notably the Quezon City Ordinance on child domestic work.
19. The institutional framework for addressing the child labour problem was put in place at the national, regional and provincial levels of the government structure in the form of child labour committees (CLCs) and committees on the welfare of children (CWCs). As of the reporting period a total of 10,912 children had been withdrawn and prevented from child domestic labour, commercial sexual exploitation, mining, deep sea fishing and sugar cane plantations through the provision of various services such as non-formal education/ alternative learning

systems, vocational training, psycho-social counselling, legal assistance, basic health care, and other education support for enrolment in schools.

20. Child labour concerns were incorporated in national development plans such as the Medium-Term Philippine Development Plan (2004-2010), National Plan of Action for Decent Work Common Agenda (2005-2007) and Education for All (EFA) National Plan (2004-2015).
21. One of the main findings of the mid-term report was that there was a shortfall in the number of children provided with direct services in order to withdraw and prevent 44,500 of them from the six priority WFCL sectors. In light of this, ILO-IPEC requested a no-cost extension of the project until August 2007 in order to fully achieve the project objectives. As of the reporting period, there were 18 action programs implemented by various government, workers, employers and civil society organizations in different project areas within the eight Provinces covered by the project. Five action programs were in the pipeline including alternative learning systems, child labour monitoring, capacity building and media advocacy.
22. The March 2006 TPR reported that the ILO's tripartite constituents comprising the government, workers' groups and employers' organizations played highly significant and very active roles in combating child labour by implementing programs and adopting concrete measures within their respective mandates and social development roles such as labour inspection, collective bargaining and corporate social responsibility.
23. Networks of government agencies, local government units, workers' groups, employers' organizations, NGOs and the academe had been established and were actively advocating for legislative and policy reforms, particularly in pursuing the realization of the Time-Bound Education Agenda for the elimination of the worst forms of child labour, and in promoting decent work for domestic workers.
24. Through training, workshops and consultations, the institutional framework and structures in the form of child labour committees, committees on the welfare of children, monitoring teams and education task forces were established at the national, regional, provincial and local levels, and their capacities and competencies to address the child labour problem had been developed and enhanced.
25. Awareness-raising and advocacy campaigns fostered changes of attitude toward child labour resulting in growing public demand to urgently address the problem. This was evidenced by the widespread and meaningful celebrations of the World Day Against Child Labour where all social development stakeholders, within and outside the project areas, conducted and participated in a wide variety of events.
26. With the Department of Labour and Employment (DOLE) taking the lead, a child labour monitoring scheme progressively took form. DOLE Regional Office VII prepared an inspection manual on CLM and established a database on child workers in the Central Visayas Region. The database contained information on child workers' demographic profiles, their employers and the services they have received. For their part, the workers' groups focused their child labour monitoring initiative

on improving the implementation of the existing Sagip-Batang Manggagawa (Rescue Child Labourers) program.

27. As of the reporting period, the project had withdrawn from domestic work, commercial sexual exploitation, pyrotechnics production, sugarcane plantation work, fishing and mining a total of 7,339 girls and boys (out of 19,000 targets) and prevented 7,504 girls and boys (out of 2,500 targets) from engaging in these worst forms of child labour. In summary, of the total target for withdrawal through education and training, about 39% was achieved at this stage, while the target for prevention was exceeded by 200 percent.
28. On the whole, 32,893 boys and girls (out of 44,500 total project targets) benefited from various services provided by 38 action programs run by the project's implementing partners in the eight Provinces comprising the Philippine TBP areas. In addition to education and training, the services provided included awareness raising against child labour, psycho-social counselling, rehabilitation assistance, basic health care, legal assistance, as well as support for repatriation and reintegration with families.
29. These children also benefited indirectly from the livelihood and income generating alternatives provided to their families. As of the reporting period, 1,308 adult members of their families had benefited from the livelihood and income-generation support such as micro-credit schemes, basic literacy and vocational training, and technical advice in starting small enterprises and income-generating activities. By getting access to such support and facilities, over 800 families reported that their household incomes increased. Thus, the need for their children to work was removed and replaced by the resolve to send them to school.

Purpose and Scope of the Final Evaluation

30. According the project documents, the nature of the monitoring and evaluation processes will be decided in consultation with partners including US-DOL. The Design, Evaluation and Documentation (DED) Section of ILO/IPEC will coordinate the consultations, planning, and coordination of the evaluations. Appropriate partners, stakeholders, and US-DOL will be involved in the process and will receive a copy of all evaluation reports.
31. At the outset of the final evaluation process, input was solicited from key stakeholders. The main purposes for which the evaluation should be conducted are to:
 - determine if the project achieved its stated immediate objectives (including specific targets) and explain why or why not; to assess the overall and specific outcomes and impacts of the project in terms of sustained improvements; and to identify lessons learned and good practices to inform future projects.
 - build off of the findings and recommendations of the midterm evaluation to assess if suggested recommendations were implemented and gauge the success of any revised activities and interventions.
 - provide guidance on the scope and design of a second phase if donor funding became available. Specifically, in what ways, if any, should procedures, activities, and areas of focus be revised?

32. The object of the evaluation is the ILO-IPEC Programme in Support (PoS) of the TBP in The Philippines—not the TBP itself. There is a subtle, yet very important distinction between the two. Therefore the evaluation will review what has been done for mobilizing national action on child labour, what type of actors have been prioritized, what is involved in the process of design, managing and implementing a TBP support process and how the ILO/IPEC project has contributed to the process.
33. As this programme is one of the first generation programmes of support (the very first in Asia) to the TBP approach formulated as a comprehensive framework for implementation the provisions of Convention 182, the final evaluation will be expanded to include a target group impact assessment study. The target group impact assessment study will consist of quantitative survey of a sample of the beneficiaries complemented with limited focus group discussions and collection of information on external and contextual factors.
34. The purpose of the target group impact assessment study is to obtain more detailed information on the beneficiary target groups and to give a before and after snapshot of the target population after the IPEC programme. The results of the target group impact assessment study will be used as data for the final evaluation. The impact assessment study will also feed into the larger Impact Assessment Framework of IPEC in that it will test the possibility of conducting repeat baseline studies at the end of the programme for evaluation findings.
35. The history of the PoS project is inextricably linked with the ABK Initiative project. In certain areas the two are servicing the same beneficiaries through complementary education and non-education services. In those areas, this linkage will be very clearly addressed in designing and carrying out the impact assessment. Specifically, in order to demonstrate clear attribution of impact (to the extent possible), the assessment will either integrate the ABK activities into the assessment, or attempt to distinguish between project interventions in order to determine impact.

Suggested Aspects to be Addressed

36. The DED section of ILO/IPEC uses a results-based framework for evaluation. Therefore, the final evaluation will answer key questions related to the achievement of the nine Immediate Objectives that were included in the original Pro Doc. The questions will be answered using data from the logical framework indicators. Answers to the key questions will be interpreted in light of relevance, efficiency, effectiveness, and sustainability—core values of ILO-IPEC (please see ILO Guidelines for the Preparation of Independent Evaluations of ILO Programmes and Projects, section 1.2, November 1997).
37. The following are some suggested evaluation questions that have been identified based on the project documents and input from key stakeholders. Other questions can be added as identified by the evaluation consultants in accordance with the given purpose of this exercise and in consultation with DED section. One of the tasks for consultants is to decide, based on the evidence and findings available, which of the following questions are the most important aspects to be addressed in meeting the purpose of the evaluation.

38. IO1 There is an enhanced knowledge base for policy development and implementation in the Philippines.
- How has the PoS promoted the utilization of project-generated information by public institutions and other organizations to develop and implement new programs and projects?
 - What is the quality and accessibility of the information available on WFCL?
 - Lessons learned?
39. IO2 There is an enhanced and better-enforced legislative framework.
- How has the PoS supported the enactment of comprehensive child labour-related legislation? Please interpret the results in light of ILO-IPEC's core values of sustainability.
 - Analyze the labour inspection system used to monitor violations of child labour legislation.
 - Lessons learned?
40. IO3 National development and social policies include child labour concerns.
- How has the PoS supported the implementation of labour and social policies that targeted vulnerable communities, families and children at risk?
 - How has the PoS supported the creation of other poverty, employment, labour and social programs that include child labour as a priority? Please interpret the results in light of ILO-IPEC's core values of sustainability.
 - What is the existence and coverage of NPACL as a strategic program framework?
 - Lessons learned?
41. IO4 Enhanced education and training policies can effectively respond to the needs of girls and boys in child labour and to children at risk.
- How has the PoS supported the inclusion of references to working children and children at risk in new or revised educational policies and plans?
 - How has the PoS supported the creation and utilization of new curricula?
 - Lessons learned?
42. IO5 Attitudes towards child labour have changed among partner agencies.
- How has the PoS supported changes in the knowledge, attitudes and behaviour towards child labour among key national actors?
 - Does it appear that these changes translated into action?
 - Lessons learned?
43. IO6 The capacity of local government and civil society to monitor and manage action against the worst forms of child labour will be strengthened.
- How has the PoS supported monitoring of both the work and enrolment status of all direct beneficiaries?
 - Was the monitoring system appropriate and efficient for monitoring each individual child to ensure that he/she was no longer working in worst forms of child labour and were attending education programs regularly?
 - How many community actions have taken place as a result of detecting cases of exploitation? Please interpret the results in light of ILO-IPEC's core values of

- sustainability.
 - How many local government units (provincial/municipal) have integrated child labour concerns in their local development plans? Please interpret the results in light of ILO-IPEC's core values of sustainability.
 - Has the capacity of the implementing agencies and other relevant partners to develop effective action against child labor been increased as a consequence of the project? Identify and assess the long-term commitment and the technical and financial capacity of local/national institutions (including governments) and the beneficiary groups to continue delivering goods and services adequately.
 - Lessons learned?
44. IO7 Families affected by the worst forms of child labour will have been provided with new opportunities for enhanced income and access to social safety net.
- How has the PoS supported the delivery of high-quality services by individuals and institutions for recovery, healing, and rehabilitation?
 - How many targeted families have access to safety nets, including health insurance schemes, rice subsidies and low-priced medicines? Please interpret the results in light of ILO-IPEC's core values of efficiency and effectiveness.
 - How many households with children at risk or engaged in the WFCL have improved their family income because of the financial and non-financial services provided by the project? Please interpret the results in light of ILO-IPEC's core values of efficiency and effectiveness.
 - Lessons learned?
45. IO8 Children at risk and in the worst forms of child labour will have access to primary, vocational or non-formal education, including alternative and flexible learning systems.
- How has the PoS supported the provision of appropriate recovery, healing, and rehabilitation services to children who have been withdrawn from child labour (see TPR for definition)? Please interpret the results in light of ILO-IPEC's core values of efficiency and effectiveness.
 - Do the enrolment/attendance rates, dropout rates, and percentage of targeted children who were promoted to the next level at the end of each school year, as reported by the project, seem feasible? Please interpret the results in light of ILO-IPEC's core values of efficiency and effectiveness.
 - How many partners have engaged in providing support to the educational needs of child labourers at the community level? Please interpret the results in light of ILO-IPEC's core values of sustainability.
 - Assess the results of provision of education services as a means to withdraw children from child labour. Discuss how a decision was made on what type of education service was most appropriate for individual beneficiaries, and whether or not children were prevented from entering or were withdrawn from labour as a result of the intervention?
 - Lessons learned?
46. IO9 All major local-level actors and institutions have become aware of the problem of the worst forms of child labour and are mobilized in the battle against it.
- How has the PoS supported changes in knowledge, attitudes and behaviour towards child labour among the population in the targeted areas?

- How many initiatives against child labour were promoted by partners and civil society groups without the support of the project at the local level in targeted districts?
- Lessons learned?

47. Cross Cutting Questions

- How relevant was the project design? How relevant was the project to the local situation concerning child labour, specifically the needs of the target groups, the local capacities to address these issues and the national policies and programs in place? How realistic were the critical assumptions and to what extent did other factors outside the control of project management affect project implementation and attainment of objectives/goal?
- Assess the relationships between the project and other child-labour interventions supported by IPEC or by other organizations (most especially, the USDOL-funded World Vision project) in the country. Were synergies and economies of scale created?
- Assess the system established between ILO-IPEC and World Vision to avoid duplication of reporting of direct beneficiaries to USDOL—was it successful? Were beneficiaries who received services from both projects identified and clearly distinguished for tracking and reporting purposes?

48. For the target group impact assessment study, the specific aspects should be based on the impact areas that were covered under the baseline studies in the selected sectors; aspects identified during the further consultation process in these TORs; general considerations of the issues and areas of impact identified as part of the IPEC Impact Assessment Framework; and in particular the methodology for tracing and tracking studies.

Methodology and Time Frame

49. The following is the suggested methodology for the expanded-final evaluation. The methodology can be adjusted by the evaluation team if considered necessary in accordance with the scope and purpose of this exercise as described above. This should be done in consultation with the Design, Evaluation and Documentation Section (DED) of ILO/IPEC.
50. The evaluation team leader will conduct a desk review of appropriate material, including the project documents, progress reports, previous evaluation reports, outputs of the projects and action programmes, and relevant material from secondary sources. This includes baselines and any government documents such as National Plans or documents about the Time Bound Program in The Philippines.
51. The evaluation consultants will prepare a brief document indicating the methodological approach to the evaluation (the “evaluation instrument”), to be discussed and approved by DED after the desk review but prior to the commencement of the first of two in-country missions (see below).
52. The evaluation team leader will carry out two separate in-country missions to The Philippines. During the first mission, the team leader will attend an initial briefing

meeting with ILO-IPEC staff. Later in the mission, he or she will facilitate a working session with the national consultant and a local partner agency that has been selected by DED to implement the target group impact assessment study.

53. During this session, a detailed plan will be prepared outlining the specific approach to the target group impact assessment study. Topics for discussion will include sampling, questionnaires, methodology, agenda for focus groups, and proposed analytical structure for reporting the data for the overall evaluation. The study will be designed using the manual and experience of IPEC on impact assessment in general and tracer studies in particular.
54. Approximately one month later, the team leader will carry out a second in-country mission during which he or she will conduct interviews, focus groups, and other information gathering activities. Information should be solicited from a wide variety of stakeholders, including children, parents of beneficiaries, teachers, government representatives, professionals linked to the targeted sectors, representatives from trade unions and employers' organizations, partners, implementing agencies and all major stakeholders, including the donor representatives.
55. The second in-country mission will conclude with a two-day stakeholders' workshop. During the first day, the preliminary findings, conclusions and recommendations will be presented to IPEC staff and key partners for feedback. The participants of the workshop will include those interviewed during the fieldwork and other key stakeholders of the project. The feedback from the presentation of preliminary findings, conclusions and recommendations should be taken into consideration for the preparation of the draft report. During the second day, participants will consider the implications of the results, and particularly the lessons learned, for future IPEC work in The Philippines.

Sources of Information and Consultations/Meetings	
Available at HQ and to be supplied by DED	Project documents DED Guidelines and ILO guidelines Mid-term country review/evaluation
Available in project office and to be supplied by project management	Progress reports/Status reports Evaluation and similar reports at the action programme level Technical and financial report of partner agencies Other studies and research undertaken Action Programme Summary Outlines Project files National workshop proceedings or summaries Country level planning documents SPIF documents Master list and records of beneficiaries Action Programme Progress Reports Baseline reports and information
To be located as appropriate	Relevant national development programme and policy documents PRPS documents such as strategies, monitoring plans and reports,

	costing Relevant documents on the development situation in The Philippines and context of child labour
--	---

Expected Output and Timeline

56. The evaluation report in draft form and in English should be presented to IPEC DED one week after the finalization of the field mission. The report should conform to ILO-IPEC Guidelines and Notes, to UN evaluation standards and norms, and to the *ILO Guidelines for the Integration of Gender Issues into the Design, Monitoring and Evaluation of ILO Programmes and Projects, January 1995*. The report will be circulated by DED to all relevant stakeholders for their comments. The evaluation consultant should consider the comments for the preparation of the final draft of the report.
57. The length of the report should not exceed 50 pages (excluding annexes). It is suggested to structure the report as follows:
- Executive Summary with key findings, conclusions and recommendations
 - Description of the project
 - Clearly identified findings
 - Clearly identified conclusions and recommendations
 - Lessons learned
 - Potential good practices and effective models of intervention.
 - Appropriate annexes including TOR
 - Standard evaluation instrument matrix
58. The report should include specific and detailed recommendations solidly based on the evaluator's analysis and, if appropriate, addressed specifically to the organization/institution responsible for implementing it. The report should also include a specific section on lessons learned from this project that could be replicated or should be avoided in the future, in the same or in other IPEC projects.
59. Ownership of data from the evaluation rests jointly with ILO-IPEC and the consultants. The copyright of the evaluation report will rest exclusively with the ILO. Use of the data for publication and other presentations can only be made with the written agreement of ILO-IPEC. Key stakeholders can make appropriate use of the evaluation report in line with the original purpose and with appropriate acknowledgement.

Resources and Management

60. The evaluation will be carried out by a team with extensive experience in the evaluation of development or social interventions, preferably including practical experience in assessing comprehensive policy/program frameworks or national plans. The team members should have an advanced degree in social sciences, economics or similar and specific training on evaluation theory and methods. Working experience on issues related to child labour, education and children's welfare will be essential. Full command of English as a working language will be

required. The final selection of the evaluation team and local partner agency will be done by DED.

International Evaluator	
Responsibility	Profile
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Desk review • Analysing the documents, direct observation, interview notes, and information from the questionnaires • Prepare an evaluation plan • Act as independent evaluation consultant for the evaluation of the project and covering other evaluation related issues during a two-week in-country field visit. • Prepare evaluation report 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Extensive experience in evaluation of development projects, in particular with local development projects ▪ Relevant regional experience in the region ▪ Prior experience with or knowledge of the TBP project of support type of projects ▪ Familiarity with and knowledge of specific thematic areas ▪ Experience working with local organisations/local partners agencies ▪ Experience in UN system or similar international development experience ▪ Previous experience in statistical analysis of raw data and/or developing questionnaires ▪ Experience evaluating gender issues.
National Consultant	
Responsibility	Profile
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Accompany international consultant during data collection phase • Assist with the facilitation of the stakeholder workshop • Support the preparation of the final report 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Extensive knowledge of The Philippines's geography and culture • Documented experience in disciplined inquiry • Previous experience with stakeholders workshops and preparation of background reports • Prior knowledge of ILO/IPEC an advantage
Local Partner for Target Group Impact Assessment	
Responsibility	Profile
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Design study, including questionnaire and data collection instrument with support from Technical Support Officer from IPEC/DED • Use the procedures outlined in the methodology to produce a gender sensitive sample of former IPEC beneficiaries (children and families) from programme lists and data sets. • Use the developed instruments to carry out data collection in the field. This will consist of Focus Group Discussions as well as quantitative methods of data collection and will include using a team of enumerators • Develop a systematic method of collating and organising the data collected during the fieldwork stage. • Analyse the data collected and present findings using a report structure provided by the consultants as a guide. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Familiarity with impact assessment debates or experience implementing impact assessment evaluations ▪ Experience in conducting both quantitative and qualitative social research ▪ Experience in data collection (questionnaires, training enumerators) ▪ Experience in analysing raw data and reporting on findings ▪ Experience in fieldwork-based research, such as sampling, household surveys, focus groups and community profiling ▪ Have trained in-house enumerators with experience in fieldwork or have access to a pool of similarly trained enumerators. The group of enumerators should have a balance of men and women. ▪ Experience in training enumerators ▪ Capacity to analyse both quantitative and qualitative data and prepare report as per agreed format, preferably in English ▪ Willingness to travel to the programme sites

	<p>to carry out the fieldwork</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Experience in the field of child labour or a relevant area and familiarity with child focused social research and data collection methods are highly desirable ▪ Be a nationally based organisation
--	--

61. The following are the resources needed for this evaluation:

- Fees for one international consultant during 30 working days
- Fees for one national consultant during 10 working days
- Fees for local study partner during 35 days
- Fees for one translator during 10 working days
- International travel to and from The Philippines
- In-country travel expenses and daily subsistence allowances for consultant during field mission
- Costs of organizing the stakeholders' workshop

62. The DED responsible official in IPEC HQ will manage the evaluation process. In country management and logistics support will be provided by the CTA of the projects and the IPEC team as a whole.

<i>Phases</i>	<i>Tasks</i>	<i>Responsible</i>	<i>Duration</i>	<i>Outputs</i>
Phase One	Briefing with IPEC DED and preparatory desk review (June 2007)	International consultant	Phone-call One week for desk review 4-8 June	Brief inception note on the approach to the Impact Assessment and Expanded Final Evaluation
Phase Two	Design of the Study Plan and Evaluation instrument focusing in particular on a) Overall study plan for the Expanded Final Evaluation b) Impact Assessment Sub-Studies to be carried out by local partner agencies This should involve further consultation with key stakeholders in-country (June 2007) Discussion between Intl. Consultant and DED upon completion of Study Design	International Consultant (lead consultant for expanded evaluation)	One week in-country design 11-15 June	Study design document with identified impact assessment process methodology and identified aspects and sectoral specific study issues
		Local Partner Agency	Two week, including one week design with intl. consultant	
Phase Three	Study design for sub-studies to be finalized and carried out by the local partner agency with technical support by the international consultant. Based on experience from the tracer studies, it is highly recommended that the questionnaires be field tested on a small target group before they are used by enumerators. (June/July 2007)	Local Partner Agency	4 weeks	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Draft Questionnaires (to test on a small sample) and Data Collection Plan and Instruments • Enumerator training • Data collection
		International consultant	Regular support during implementation	
Phase Four	The datasets and results of the sub-studies to be analysed and reported by local partner agency (June/July 2007)	Local Partner Agency	One week	Report
Phase Five	Final evaluation process consisting of <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Consultation with key stakeholder on preliminary findings and to identify further issues for the final evaluation 	International consultant With DED support	2 weeks	Final version of Evaluation Instrument Draft version evaluation report

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Field work, interviews and data collection as part of normal final evaluation - Stakeholder evaluation workshop - Preparation and commenting on reports as per normal procedures - Managed per procedure by DED and carried out by the international consultant including field visits and using information from the impact assessment study. <p>(30 July – 10 Aug 2007)</p>			Final evaluation report
--	--	--	--	-------------------------

ANNEX 2: SPECIFIC QUESTIONS ASKED IN THE TERMS OF REFERENCE

IO-1 THERE IS AN ENHANCED KNOWLEDGE BASE FOR POLICY DEVELOPMENT AND IMPLEMENTATION IN THE PHILIPPINES

How has the PoS promoted the utilization of project-generated information by public institutions and other institutions and other organizations to develop and implement new programs and projects?

Child labor knowledge base has been enhanced through studies and baseline surveys, and child labor data and information mainstreamed in national statistics (Labor Force Survey and Annual Poverty Index Survey). With support of SIMPOC the National Statistics Office (NSO) has piloted tools and methodologies for researching child labor. Other major studies include a situation analysis of child trafficking, a study on employers' demand for child labor in pyrotechnics and fashion accessories industries and on the issue of child labor and indigenous people. National and local level actors from the tripartite constituents and NGOs implement their programs using information resulting from the project. Results of research have been used in designing the TBP and the NPACL. Baseline studies have been used in designing APs. Other projects like ABK, Circle Project have used the information generated by the PoS in selecting beneficiaries and in designing programs.

What is the quality and accessibility of the information available on WFCL?

The quality of the information produced through studies mandated by the PoS is good. The information generated on WFCL is accessible through publications and through the websites of research partners, NCLC and ILO-IPEC. Video-films have been produced on the WFCL in the Philippines which have been widely disseminated.

Lessons learned?

Research and analysis are main ingredients on which the GOP acted by ratifying C.182, designed the NPACL and integrated CL into development and social policies.

IO-2 THERE IS AN ENHANCED AND BETTER-ENFORCED LEGISLATIVE FRAMEWORK

How has the PoS supported the enactment of comprehensive child labor-related legislation? Please interpret the results in light of ILO-IPEC's core values of sustainability?

The PoS has contributed to enacting RA 9231 (on the elimination of child labor), notably to the implementing rules and regulations, (2) Magna Charta for Domestic Workers and (3) the law against Trafficking of Persons, and (4) discussions and hearings on the Domestic Work Bill. The PoS has equally contributed to make the development of children's welfare codes child-friendly and to motivate LGUs passing anti-child labor resolutions and enforce legal instruments.

Analyze the labor inspection system used to monitor violations of child labor legislation.

Since 1993, DOLE has recorded 7 cases of violation of child labor, out of which 4 have been brought to conclusion. DOLE's labor inspection is mandated to act in the formal sector only. However, most of the CL is found in the informal sector. The SBM-QAT (quick-action teams) have "rescued" in 701 rescue operations 2,435 children out of WFCL but hardly any legal measures have been taken (see here above) and hardly any budgetary provisions were available with the Social Welfare Department for follow-up. The Manual of Inspection on CL prepared by DOLE VII with the support of the PoS is now used in other regions (e.g., region III). Given the limited number of inspectors for a vast region, the effect on the elimination of CL seems to be limited.

Lessons learned?	Increased commitment which translates into enacted legislation needs to be matched by a political willingness to enforcement and by budgetary provisions for effective support measures to rescued children.
IO-3 NATIONAL DEVELOPMENT AND SOCIAL POLICIES INCLUDE CHILD LABOR CONCERNS	
How has the PoS supported the implementation of labor and social policies that targeted vulnerable communities, families and children at risk?	Through advocacy of the PoS, CL is now also included in the MTPDP 2004-2010, in the EFA Action Plan 2004-2016, the NPADW 2005-2007, UNDAF Annual Work Plan 2006, and in ILO-DCWP 2006-2007.
How has the PoS supported the creation of other poverty, employment, labor and social programs that include child labor as a priority? Please interpret the results in the light of ILO-IPEC's core values of sustainability.	Through workshops, e.g., in the National Workshop on CL and Education Challenges among Indigenous People. The PoS continues to update the NPACL Framework The NPACL Strategic Plan was due in July 2007. The outcomes of NPACL and PTBP are reviewed in SPIF Stakeholder Workshop. Children in Armed Conflict have been included as a priority target group.
What is the existence and coverage of NPACL as a strategic program framework?	The framework will have nation-wide coverage. It is not known whether any regular budgetary provisions are or will be made available beyond project funds or what will be sector and region coverage of the new Strategic Plan.
IO-4 ENHANCED EDUCATION AND TRAINING POLICIES CAN EFFECTIVELY RESPOND TO THE NEEDS OF GIRLS AND BOYS IN CHILD LABOR AND TO CHILDREN AT RISK	
How has the PoS supported the inclusion of references to working children and children at risk in new or revised educational policies and plans?	Through campaigning, advocacy and policy advice ILO-IPEC's network of partner organizations contributes to the realization of the PTB Education Agenda. These efforts have contributed to policy reforms and new strategies that are responsive to the needs of working children, such as the ALS, and the A&E program. RA 9231 requires the provision of education through the DepEd, to children in the WFCL.
How has the PoS supported the creation and utilization of new curricula?	Currently, the DepEd is mandated to undertake the formulation of the new CL friendly curriculum. The PoS has supported the developments of a manual for the ALS. This has helped to strengthen the capacity of service providers, like Instructional Managers, DepEd, LGUs and community organizations, to deliver alternative modes of education.
Lessons learned?	The formulation of policies and strategies has to be supported by a feedback from concrete experiences in innovative approaches, as tested under field conditions.
IO-5 ATTITUDES TOWARDS CHILD LABOR HAVE CHANGED AMONG PARTNER AGENCIES	
How has the PoS supported changes in the knowledge, attitudes and behaviour towards child labor among key national actors?	The PoS has raised the awareness and positively influenced the attitudes on CL among a multitude of partner organizations and among the general public through media-exposure and advocacy campaigns. Public opinion surveys indicated increased awareness of CL (30% in 2005, 46% in 2007), In 2007, 38 AP were under implementation. During interviews with stakeholders, involved households and child beneficiaries, the mission was impressed by the verbal commitment to
Does it appear that these changes translated into action?	

eliminate WFCL and to implement externally financed APs. However, as long as attitudes are not supported by genuine financial commitment and by a political willingness to eliminate the root causes of CL (i.e., the deeply rooted poverty) effective change in behavior might not result. CL is often seen as the result of an attitudinal problem, whereas a sociological analysis would demonstrate to what extent there is a strong correlation with the household asset basis.

First comes a full stomach, then comes ethics (B. Brecht: Three Penny Opera).

Lessons learned?

IO-6 THE CAPACITY OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT AND CIVIL SOCIETY TO MONITOR AND MANAGE ACTION AGAINST THE WFCL WILL BE STRENGTHENED

How has the PoS supported monitoring of both the work and enrolment status of all direct beneficiaries?

Most children work in the informal sector, whereas the labor inspection operates in the formal sector. In spite of this, DOLE VII conducted 77 inspections focused on child labor. Its regional director has informed us that he equally wants to include children working in the informal sector. Nation-wide DOLE has 250 inspectors. The major contribution of the PoS was to facilitate the establishment of Child Labor Committees, councils for children's welfare, as well as multi-sector task-forces at all administrative levels. The PoS has strengthened their capacities in planning, implementing and monitoring child labor initiatives. CLM systems have been put in place and manuals, training modules and a guidebook developed. Since the inception of the program, the SBM-QAT has rescued over 700 children. Three quarters of the targeted provinces and all targeted LGUs have incorporated CL in their development plans.

Was the monitoring system appropriate and efficient for monitoring each individual child to ensure that he/she was no longer working in WFCL and were attending education programs regularly?

There is an obvious opportunity to improve the child labor monitoring of project beneficiaries. Generally speaking, there was not sufficient flexibility in dynamically maintaining a list of beneficiaries (children leaving the targeted age group were not removed from the lists and "newcomers" were not added).

DOLE VII's CLMS still needs to be generally applied. The data-base is on non-active since the resignation of the database administrator. Where barangay councils and local child labor committees are active, modestly, CLM activities are implemented at a community level. No systematic records have been shown containing poverty related variables at a household level. Normally simple lists are being used with identities and school status of children. The CLMS are neither appropriate, nor efficient but are compensated by locally generated (but often unconsolidated) knowledge on children's background. Once a child goes out of the locality it is not known where he or she goes, and whether the same child again ends up as worker somewhere else. The program's specificity is in ALS. In most cases observed, children continued to work, while following ALS courses during the weekend. While continuing to work, in communities supported through APs an effort was made to eliminate or to diminish work hazards.

How many community actions have taken place as a result of detecting cases of exploitation? Please interpret the results in the light of ILO-IPEC's core values of sustainability.

How many local government units (provincial/municipal) have integrated child labor concerns in their local development plans? Please interpret the results in light of ILO-IPEC's core values of sustainability.

Has the capacity of the implementing agencies and other relevant partners to develop effective action against child labor been increased as a consequence of the project? Identify and assess the long-term commitment and the technical and financial capacity of local/national institutions (including governments) and the beneficiary groups to continue delivering goods and services adequately.

Lessons learned?

It is estimated that between 400 and 450 communities have been served in one way or another through APs. This has formed a critical mass of partners and beneficiaries addressing CL, which is no longer a taboo. A continued implementation and monitoring beyond the project will mainly depend on the development of mechanisms of financial and institutional sustainability.

As reported by the project, 75% of provincial governments and 100% of the LGUs would have integrated CL concerns in their development plans. Difficult to check to what extent provincial and municipal authorities financially contribute. In certain localities and provinces regular budgetary provisions are made available in compensation to project funding. Enlightened administrators responsible for this are found at various administrative levels but sustainable institutional and financial mechanisms are still lacking. Partners complain that politicians do not match their ordinances with actual budgets and "muscles".

Affirmative: the capacity to develop short-term action has increased. Over the sectors and regions a large variability has been observed in effectiveness. This variability should be placed in the field of tension between, on the one hand, moral indignation and, on the other, a continued dependence on child labor as part of the poor household's survival strategy. Given the extremely short-time and sometimes insufficiently market oriented and marginal livelihoods skill training, the PoS's contribution to strengthening of the asset-base has yet to improve. For the time being, the overall commitment for CL has neither been sufficiently matched by monitoring methods appreciating CLM against the backdrop of the households' asset situation, nor by sustained budgetary provisions. Innovative schemes like the one experimented by AFWCI (self-financed micro-credit and health scheme) provide answers to weaknesses identified here above and need to be considered for validation and dissemination.

The development of one standardized CLMS is to be preferred over the so-called master-listing. Such a system should be managed at a regional level (e.g., by DOLE) and, gradually filled with the help of local partners with relevant information placing CL within a context of household economy and assets. Enumerating the children's gender, age and school and work status does not provide sufficient information to effectively respect ILO-IPEC's holistic approach.

IO-7 FAMILIES AFFECTED BY THE WFCL WILL HAVE BEEN PROVIDED WITH NEW OPPORTUNITIES FOR ENHANCED INCOME AND ACCESS TO SOCIAL SAFETY NETS

How has the PoS supported the delivery of high-quality services by individuals and institutions for recovery, healing, and rehabilitation?

Institutions working in CSEC provide high quality professional support, rather focused on reducing hazards than on withdrawal, which was only implemented in cases of non consensual enrolment. Although CSEC may be an unconditional worst form of child labor, partner organizations working in this sector expressed that they do not necessarily concentrate on withdrawal but rather on reducing the hazards. In the later circumstances, the quality of psycho-social care and healing as observed

How many targeted families have access to safety nets, including health insurance schemes, rice subsidies and low-priced medicines? Please interpret the results in light of ILO-IPEC's core values of efficiency and effectiveness.

How many households with children at risk or engaged in the WFCL have improved their family income because of the financial and non-financial services provided by the project? Please interpret the results in light of ILO-IPEC's core values of efficiency and effectiveness.

Lessons learned?

e.g., in BIDLISIW (Cebu) was found to be up to the highest marks. The mission was also very impressed by the self-financed micro-savings/credit scheme, implemented by AWFCI (see IO-6), circumventing dependence on external donor funding.

Monitoring reports have shown a total of 7,273 beneficiaries in recovery, healing and rehabilitation during the period October 2005 to September 2006. These figures are not further specified. The AWFCI scheme alone has reached out to 895 parents, to 200 children at risk, covered by the health micro-insurance program.

There are 12 APs providing livelihood support to families affected by CL with a total target of 4,195 family members. In the March 2007 TPR 1,533 have been reported increasing their household income. The mission was not impressed by the majority of livelihood skill training programs. Generally speaking, these programs were neither market-oriented, nor supported by entrepreneurial credit (which would have been against the donor policy). There is serious doubt whether a majority of beneficiaries has seen its household income sufficiently increase in order to refrain from sending their children into WFCL (which is the basic assumption behind ILO-IPEC's holistic approach). Strengthening of livelihood and entrepreneurial skills needs to be embedded into a larger approach taking into account, household assets, access to financial capital and marketing potential. The successful implementation of such a program requires corresponding professional skills at supervision and implementation level.

IO-8 CHILDREN AT RISK AND IN THE WFCL WILL HAVE ACCESS TO PRIMARY, VOCATIONAL OR NON-FORMAL EDUCATION, INCLUDING ALTERNATIVE AND FLEXIBLE LEARNING SYSTEMS

How has the PoS supported the provision of appropriate recovery, healing, and rehabilitation services to children who have been withdrawn from child labor (see TPR for definition)? Please interpret the results in light of ILO-IPEC's core values of efficiency and effectiveness.

Do the enrolment/attendance rates, dropout rates, and percentage of targeted children who were promoted to the next level at the end of each school year, as reported by the project, seem feasible? Please interpret the results in light of ILO-IPEC's core values of efficiency and effectiveness.

According to a recent not-yet finalized list, through the APs 23,810 children would have been targeted for educational services (16,755 working children and 7,055 children at risk) and 8,635 for non-educational services (1,780 working children and 6,855 children at risk). From this total target of 32,445 a non-specified number of 26,871 would effectively have been reached. This is 17.2% short of the cumulative targets of the APs and 39.6% of the target of 44,500 mentioned in the project document. The Project explains this shortfall by the limited absorption capacity of implementing agencies.

It has been reported that 80% of the target beneficiaries in formal education has been promoted. The education services provided are outside of the school system. ABK would be better placed to answer these questions but this project was not subject to the present EFE. It has been observed that contracts with IA involved in ALS were too short to expect participating children to successfully pass the high passage marks of the A&E exam set by the DepEd. The highest percentage of children in any particular visited AP that passed the exam was 30% (QK). The project should have better monitored

that children respond to minimum quality criteria before allowing IA to have them registered for the A&E exam, because many failed to pass. In Bulacan, barangay councils and the DepEd continue to provide the necessary resources (beyond project termination) until the quality requirements to successfully pass the A&E exam are fulfilled.

No data have been made available on targets and results regarding attendance rates, drop out rates and promotion levels in formal school. Most of the withdrawn and prevented children were integrated into informal schooling systems. However, from observations in the visited areas it was understood that attendance rates are reasonably high and drop out rates small, except for peak seasons in agriculture and fishery.

How many partners have engaged in providing support to the educational needs of child laborers at the community level? Please interpret the results in light of ILO-IPEC's core values of sustainability.

29 partners are involved in providing support to the educational needs of CL at the community level. Most of these have been involved in the ALS program, whereas again others have been supporting vocational skill training. An outstanding example of the latter is SIFI, which has trained CL in skills in demand in the sugar sector (e.g., tractor mechanic or operator) and the municipality government of Bacolod (computer training). SIFI activities are paid over a social fund to which sugar planters contribute, thus making the model sustainable. The Bacolod municipality government has allotted budgetary provisions from its regular development budget.

Assess the results of provision of education services as a means to withdraw children from child labor. Discuss how a decision was made on what type of education service was most appropriate for individual beneficiaries, and whether or not children were prevented from entering or were withdrawn from labor as a result of the intervention?

On the medium and long-term, good quality formal and informal education will reduce the magnitude of CL. However, much will depend on the absorption of children in the labor market and hence the capacity of the education system to be manpower-oriented. Another contributing factor is the continued affordability of school-fees. Whereas the project subsidizes cost for education, many parent fear that education will be discontinued if no other donors or sponsors will be identified to take over upon project completion.

Lessons learned?

Pre-implementation definition of quantitative targets without involvement of field-based IA does not make sense. In spite of considerable delays in identification of beneficiaries (and hence in AP formulation and identification) this line was followed throughout the project. This has led to an attitude of "target-hunting" at times going at the expense of quality.

IO-9 ALL MAJOR LEVEL ACTORS AND INSTITUTIONS HAVE BECOME AWARE OF THE PROBLEM OF THE WFCL AND ARE MOBILIZED IN THE BATTLE AGAINST IT

How has the PoS supported changes in knowledge, attitudes and behavior towards child labor among the population in the targeted areas?

The PoS has supported changes in knowledge and attitudes by mass-media campaigns and workshops. Behavioral changes have been targeted through direct action programs. All together, this has created a critical mass in the general population, among stakeholders and beneficiaries for awareness on the ethical aspects of the problem. Through APs, the PoS has tempted to tackle the root

How many initiatives against child labor were promoted by partners and civil society groups without the support of the project at the local level in targeted districts?

Lessons learned?

causes of CL (which is a necessary condition to translate increased knowledge and changed attitudes into modified behavior) but, as can be observed here above, with variable and not always conclusive results.

A total number has been reported of 20 government line departments, LGUs and NGOs. The following examples have been mentioned: building of schools (from funds contributed by Filipino overseas workers), anti-CL advocacy and awareness campaign, the provision of free learning material (comics), the extension of ALS services to non-project children, provision of capital for livelihood start-up from the budget of selected LGUs. 7 LGUs and NGOs implement anti-CL initiatives without support from the project. These include the promulgation of anti-CL ordinances, livelihood support to families and training and employment program for working-age children. Attitudes towards CL are a function of economical realities and both have to be tackled simultaneously in order to increase the probability of modifications in behavior.

CROSS-CUTTING QUESTIONS

How relevant was the project design? How relevant was the project to the local situation concerning child labor, specifically the needs of the target groups, the local capacities to address these issues and the national policies and programs in place? How realistic were the critical assumptions and to what extent did other factors outside the control of project management affect project implementation and attainment of objectives/goal?

Assess the relationships between the project and other child-labor interventions supported by IPEC or by other organizations (most especially, the USDOL-funded World Vision project) in the country. Were synergies and economies of scale created?

Assess the system established between ILO-IPEC

It can be said that the problems that gave rise to the project still exist. The project intervention was specific to the local situation and addressed the need for education. However, the urban bias as observed in education contributes to alienate children from the rural areas, even amplifying their dream to go to town to escape from poverty. Moreover, formal and informal education systems do not sufficiently address the manpower aspect and thereby lead to under- or unemployment. It would therefore have been desirable that the project would have contributed more to innovative approaches (like the ones observed in SIFI and QK), providing skills in demand on the market and proud to be a well performing farmer on one's own land (agrarian reform), respectively. Alternative strategies could have been: continued agrarian reform and collective bargaining, as more efficient methods to tackle the root causes of CL. Critical assumptions (macro level) were not formulated as necessary conditions for successful field implementation, but are nevertheless valid. As far as factors outside of project control is concerned: a linkage with equitable development policies could have been more actively promoted by the ILO. The attainment of objectives has been particularly delayed by internal management decisions, i.e. the choice of making the formulation of APs dependent on upfront master-listing.

Synergies and economies of scale were not created. The issue of beneficiary identification has cooled down the relation with the Education Initiative Project (ABK) to such an extent that it was decided to formally de-link both projects. In spite of this, the working relationship and exchange of information at a field level seems to be cordial.

The mission did not have access to the ABK reporting system in order to answer the question on

and World Vision to avoid duplication of reporting of direct beneficiaries to USDOL was it successful? Were beneficiaries who received services from both projects identified and clearly distinguished for tracking and reporting purposes?

duplication. From observations in the field it was understood that both projects sometimes operate in the same community and complement each others: ABK works on formal education and the PoS on the ALS. It is therefore believed that for tracking and reporting purposes both projects have made a clear distinction. During discussions with project staff, partner organizations and beneficiaries, it was confirmed that no overlap has taken place (e.g., the two projects reporting on the same beneficiaries) and that the figures provided to USDOL were those only referring to the support given by the project itself. Both projects identified their beneficiaries based on the master-lists and when, in the case of the PoS, figures of available children fell short of the targets, a new additional identification has been mandated, this time to the partner organizations themselves. The monitoring was done by the AP implementers and reported at regular intervals. Apparently there have been delays in the monitoring of the quantitative targets. One month before project closure the management was still struggling with figures to get the picture right. No particular monitoring system was used for following attendance levels.

While this was true, the separation of the two projects as “them” and “us” made the beneficiaries pit one against the other, so that they often compared the services of one as either better or worse because of the benefits they had received. This kind of arrangement only reinforced the dole-out mentality which the IAs had reportedly aimed to reduce in the people over time.

ANNEX 3: STAKEHOLDER WORKSHOP

Final Project Evaluation Supporting the Time-Bound Programme on the Elimination of the Worst Forms of Child Labour in the Republic of the Philippines



International
Labour
Organization

Sapphire 1 and 2, 2/F Tiara Oriental Hotel
7248 Malugay Street, San Antonio Village, Makati City
2 August 2007

DOCUMENTATION REPORT

1. The Final Project Evaluation Supporting the Time-Bound Programme on the Elimination of the Worst Forms of Child Labour in the Republic of the Philippines Stakeholders Workshop was held on August 2, 2007 at the Tiara Oriental Hotel, San Antonio Village, Makati City (See [Appendix A: Stakeholders Workshop Program](#)). The activity was participated in by representatives from partner agencies, project evaluators and program implementers from ILO (See [Appendix B: List of Participants](#)).
2. Before formally starting the activity, Ms. Angelita “Anji” Resurreccion, facilitator and project evaluator, asked the participants to turn their mobile phones to silent vibrator mode.
3. The activity started at 9:15 am. Ms. Resurreccion led the singing of the Philippine National Anthem and the opening prayer.
4. Ms. Resurreccion welcomed everyone to the activity and called on Director Linda Wirth of the ILO Sub-Regional Office for Asia and the Pacific to give formally welcome the participants.
5. Director Wirth expressed that she was very glad to see the people from various parts of the country taking part in the activity. She emphasized the importance of evaluating what they have achieved in the Program. (See [Appendix C: Welcome Message of Director Linda Wirth](#)).
6. Ms. Resurreccion thanked Director Wirth and proceeded to acknowledging the participants. She turned over the floor to the team leader of the Evaluation Team, Mr. John Krijnen.

7. Mr. Krijnen remarked that Ms. Resurreccion was doing a jolly-good show in facilitating the activity. He presented the overview of the activity (Refer to [Appendix D: TBP Philippines](#)).

For the first impressions, he gave a brief background of the project, how ILO started in the Philippines. He then presented the Terms of Reference for the evaluation, the methodology, results, recommendations and lessons learned. He reminded the group that project evaluation should be done with the objectives as basis. For the ILO-IPEC Project, there are nine objectives which are as follows:

- A. Enhanced knowledge base for policy development and implementation
- B. Enhanced and better-enforced legislative framework
- C. National development and social policies include CL concerns
- D. Enhanced education→responds to CL needs
- E. Attitudes towards CL among partner agencies have changed
- F. Capacity of government and civil society for CLM strengthened
- G. Families affected by WFCL provided with enhanced income and social safety nets
- H. Children at risk have access to primary, vocational or non formal education (ALS)
- I. Major-level actors and institutions aware of WFCL and are mobilized to battle against it.

He then explained why the term “expanded” in expanded evaluation – the term was to indicate that an assessment of impact on beneficiaries was included. He explained that the project evaluators looked at the effectiveness and efficiency of project delivery.

For the final evaluation, the evaluators looked at the context (sociopolitical, etc.), validity of design, delivery process (performance of the project, relevance, effectiveness, if it addresses the real problems), efficiency (extent of how money was used), sustainability (what institutional mechanisms have been designed so that efforts are sustained), and based on all these, they formulate recommendations.

The methodology consisted of desk review, briefing ILO-IPEC, briefing USDOL, in-country design study plan and impact assessment, evaluation of the selection of Action Programs (APs), and stakeholders meeting.

He said that in the evaluation of the selection of APs, Mindanao was ruled out because of security reasons.

The validity of design was presented by Ms. Resurreccion. (Refer to [Appendix E: Validity of Design](#)). She started by saying that the objectives & indicators, together with the solutions to identified problems & needs, were clearly stated in the project's logframe. Since it was assumed that all stakeholders were familiar with that document she directly referred to the assumptions made in preparing the project framework.

The project document (ProDoc) enumerates five assumptions which were found to remain valid at this time:

- a. The elimination of the worst forms of child labor remains a national priority as demonstrated by the implementation of Republic Act 9231 or "The Anti Child Labor Law and Education for All-Philippine Plan of Action (EFA-PPA)
- b. Partners are committed to implement the Project as exemplified by "call to action" on the elimination of child labor in agriculture at the multi-sectoral forum held in Quezon City commemorating the world day against child labor last June 12, 2007.
- c. Improvements in macro parameters (economic growth & poverty levels) – leading to reduced child labor incidence in the medium-term. She said that they believe that the Philippine economy looks set to grow above 5.0% for the fourth consecutive year in 2007, having expanded 5.4% in 2006.
- d. Continued political will of relevant Government structures to combat child labor as exhibited by the establishment of child protection units not only in ILO-IPEC assisted provinces but in other provinces as well.
- e. The USDOL Education Initiative will cooperate with and support the Project as evident by the agreements made by directors of both projects at the national level.

As to design, the evaluation team found the project to be designed well. There were substantial accomplishments in all identified indicators, with some exceptions, such as in the introduction of CL in school curricula. It was reported that lack of accomplishment in this area was due to the fact that the Philippine curriculum, according to the Department of Education (DepEd), is reviewed only every five years. The next review is due in 2008.

8. To continue, Mr. Krijnen reported on the findings on the delivery process. To answer if the process has been effective, he posed this question: Has the overall execution focused on achievement of objectives?

He commented that the objectives are very ambitious given the limited time and the lengthy process of AP approval. He mentioned that the Department of Labor and Employment (DOLE), has an interagency network functioning but meso-orientation gives way to large variations in enforcement and government means are not yet up to the magnitude of problem. Thus, political will should be institutionalized. He added that the opportunity for mutual learning (knowledge management) remained underexposed. He emphasized that there are variations between the regions.

As to the evaluation of efficiency, they did not find objective enough indicators, and decided it can only be measured by the efficiency of use of donor money.

According to him, the government should commit to implement policies. He shared that there are cases of accomplishments inspired by individual leaders in the regions but as to what extent is the institutionalization is not clear. "We want to see institutionalized mechanisms," he added.

Mr. Krijnen said, "We feel that it should be one of the core issues of any organization, of the ILO. We implement our programs in the field. Of course it's imperfect. We make mistakes, our partners make mistakes. We also see pleasant surprises as we have seen in the provinces that are very successful. What do we do? What do we learn from this? The exit conference is more of a learning event."

He then presented the results of the evaluation.

First, what is the relevance of what the program has been doing? He said that they found the project monitoring sometimes scattered, inefficient, non-compelling. On the other hand, there's another community-based monitoring that is promising, that has not yet come to full maturity but is very promising.

The Program has been supporting children in alternative learning systems (ALS). There is the Accreditation and Equivalency (A and E) exam. He asked the participants if they knew what the required score the children are expected to pass. Some participants aired that it was 95 percent. Participants from the DepEd added that the highest score is between 135-140. He continued on that there is one argument used by the Department of Education which is "you should avoid the easy way out for the kids." Like children who

drop out of high school go the easy way and then take the equivalency test. But the threshold for the kids is high. So children who have been actively involved in the worst forms of child labor have been taken out of school and then are taking ALS are having difficulties getting back on track again and then they are expected to pass a very demanding and high passing mark.

According to Mr. Krijnen: "We have discussed this with the Department of Education and they have promised that they will look into the matter. In our opinion, this should be fair to the kids. We see partners in the field where out of 102 children, zero passed. In another region which is considered one of the best, 34 per cent of the kids passed. So we have lots and lots of children, who after their work or during the weekends spending four hours of their Saturdays and four hours of their Sunday for ALS and then having shattered hopes, scattered dreams. I think we need an educational policy where you lower the threshold to make the kids accepted."

For the next question as to what extent do existing education systems provide skills which are in demand on labor market, he said that it is a good policy to withdraw the kids and refrain them from going into child labor. Education is the issue. Education should prepare the kids to acquire skills which are in demand in the labor market. Families will lose economically from the withdrawal of their children in child labor but they will be ready to do that if the investments have greater benefits. Education should provide children the opportunity to get better jobs.

A similar question, in spite of the ILO-IPEC approach, the loss of a child labor is compensated by strengthening of the household economy and by providing social safety-nets. He mentioned that they have not seen too many social safety-nets. For example, an adult who works in a sugar cane plantation gets 60 pesos a day, a child will get 50 pesos. That is a reason to go for children: 10 pesos more profitable than an adult.

For the performance of the project, they look at effectiveness and presented their evaluation as to what extent the objectives have been achieved.

There's a variable degree of technical expertise among implementing agencies and field coordinators: education, enterprise development, safety nets, CLM. It's so complex and each is a very specialized issue. We have seen a number of implementing agencies which are not up to the magnitude of the problem. But accomplishments have been achieved. One of the huge results of this project is that there's a lot of dynamic network being done. The issue which used to be a taboo, child labor, can be openly discussed.

To what extent has education prepared children for the labor market? Through Alternative Learning System (ALS), the number of drop outs has reduced significantly. Example, children would be working from Monday to Friday but on Saturdays and Sundays, they will be working on tutorials.

“One issue we saw is that USDOL as a donor has been supporting trainings in livelihood skills but they don’t provide any capital,” he added.

On efficiency, the lengthy procedures for the approval of action programs lead to too short implementation periods. Another issue is that project management is so much involved in the working environment that they don’t always find adequate time to monitor. That’s a weakness of the program and project management especially field coordinators are recommended to take the necessary corrective actions.

“For the financial efficiency, it’s difficult to draw conclusions but in general, I think its efficient use of donor money but of course the difference is between one implementing agency and the other,” he said.

Then regarding the models, which models can be brought up to scale? There are about more than four million child laborers here in the Philippines and the program is investing money to reach 44,500 and half of it is working children. There are successful schemes that can be brought to scale, the ones that are efficient and effective.

“In terms of sustainability, we would like to look at the institutional and financial dimensions of sustainability. May I say quite a few of these approaches have been institutionalized meaning as long as the donors are there, things are fine. But who is going to take this over? Even though in certain communities, we see their willingness to pay for it and to incorporate the CLM livelihood activities into the barangay development plans and we hope this could be sustained in the future. If there is guarantee that the education we offer will bring better opportunities for kids to get better jobs, parents will be willing to withdraw their kids.”

Despite their willingness to incorporate continued CLM in local development planning, this will depend on demonstrated added value of (1) improved education (successfully preparing children for labor market) and (2) improved livelihoods (sufficiently compensating families for the loss of CL) and (3) financial provision in local development budget.

On special concerns, according to the collective bargaining, the minimum wage for a sugar cane plantation worker is Php 150.00 and the child gets only

PhP 50.00, then they have no choice but to send their child to school. So this is why we talk about enabling environment is very much an issue.

Recommendations

- ILO to continue strengthening tripartite bargaining on decent work and wages
- ILO to negotiate with DepEd lower passage & admission thresholds for reincorporating children victims of WFCL into formal and non formal education.
- ILO to strengthen GOP capacities for manpower planning, matching future demand and offer on the labor market (formal & informal sector) → required skills to be addressed through educational system.
- CL to figure more predominantly in poverty reduction strategies
- USDOL: competitive bidding for next phase? What is the difference in comparative advantages between ILO and international NGOs in creating an enabling environment?

Lessons learned

- If you don't have development experience, it is difficult, so look for implementing agencies that have experience
 - Monitoring system should not only look at the status of the child if he/she is in school or out of school but should also reflect the household conditions.
 - External evaluations should be done to precede future planning
9. The facilitators decided to have a working break. Thus, snacks were served while Ms. Resurreccion proceeded with her presentation.
10. Ms. Resurreccion presented the team's evaluation of action on Micro Enterprise Development (See [Appendix F: Microenterprise Development](#)). "Mr. Krijnen already mentioned that the project design did not include provision of capital to the families. We believe that child labor is very much linked to poverty as the root cause of it all. The reason why parents are unable to stop their children in engaging in child labor even after partners have already assisted them, and even if children had undergone ALS and technical skills training, is probably because the action programs were not adequate in helping the families cope with the constraints very common in informal sector engaging in livelihood activities. Many of the partners that we went to were engaged in some form of livelihood training but overall our observation was that these were not sustainable livelihood activities. There

were a few efforts that we found very nice,” and these we found to have the following features:

- There was a shared responsibility in the village. It was not just the responsibility of ILO-IPEC nor by the implementing agency but by the villagers themselves.
- The parents, mostly women, because the men have to work, were grouped together into self-help groups to identify and solve problems on their own.
- They also solved their problem on capital by grouping together and having a savings program. They pointed out that the efforts of the implementing partner were the key factors why they succeeded in mobilizing capital.
- They were also helped to access resources in the area, not just to ILO-IPEC, but to other projects as well.
- Village leaders & residents continue to work together to address poverty issues

She shared that among the areas they visited, they found out that there were more children withdrawn when village leaders, the parents, and the implementing partners had an effective working relationship.

They also found that the NGO or the implementing agency’s ability to link ILO-IPEC efforts to a bigger program which always had a capital component in it. So there was access to capital and a sustainability mechanism was present. The parents were not left on their own like orphans after the project is finished. There were mechanisms for counseling, handholding after the project.

Training programs that were found to work made use of local materials, local people (expert farmers were tapped to teach others how to farm instead of importing people from other places); used action-oriented learning through skill-based enterprises in the community; sustained opportunities for learning from experiences of others in regular meetings, rather than in one-shot training deals

What seemed to need attention were the following:

Training programs focused on technical skills with unclear markets (or ideas for effectively marketing products /services) such as cosmetology, massage, *borlology* (fashion accessories) making, and haircutting.

Also, villagers (parents and leaders) remained unable to tap their collective potential for negotiating & bargaining. For example, they were still unable to

approach government officials or institutions with power to set aside budgets, assets/ raw materials or implement minimum wage laws.

Moreover, villagers looked upon the outside world (ILO-IPEC) to solve their problems and subsidize their expenses. They remained more individual- rather than group-oriented in facing life challenges.

She then shared some ideas for next steps. These were:

Education experiences should use familiar contexts (farm-based curricula) so that villagers see & practice taking advantage of opportunities offered by the farm or the sea. For example, when we teach math, we should use examples that are related to what they already do such as farming. One hundred percent of the children they talked to said they will leave their town. They do not realize that we need competent farmers. Much of education inputs alienate them to love the land, etc.

Unlock the potential of people to act on opportunities and constraints in their environment such as generating start-up capital, access and manage resources, how to market, and how to influence the power structures around them. How to influence power structure around them – even if they know 50 pesos is not enough, they don't do anything about it. However, if they are unionized or grouped together, they can collectively address the issues. Dialogue might help unlock their potentials.

11. Ms. Resurreccion opened the floor to some questions from the participants.

12. The first one to give her comments was Dr. Dulce Gust of OSHC.

“One comment that you said is that the training was not very useful for those specific skills. You also said that it is important for them to look at the needs of the market. But that is part of the training. That is not something that comes out of the blue. If they don't know how to market their product, they won't be able to succeed in their micro enterprise. So maybe the training for the skill itself is not what you were talking about.”

“You were not able to see evidence of sustainability. I suppose you have some data of projects that have basis for mainstreaming or no basis for mainstreaming of programs because as long as they remain as action program for mainstreaming, that would be very difficult to maintain the mainstreaming because that requires quite a lot of action. You were talking of CBAs in sugar plantations, you were talking here of big sugar plantations. But

what about those managed by Agrarian Reform Beneficiaries (ARBs), they are still coping with making communities work.”

She also had an impression that the evaluation shows that other government agencies are not doing their job.

“The National program is coming up with goals to look at two very specific strategies on how to protect them and remove them. It’s a good thing that you’re taking a look at the link between the national program and the regional offices concerned. As a member of the national program, we promise to look at it in a more strengthened manner,” she said.

On the lengthy procedure of the AP approval, she opined that much of the delay is from headquarters, Geneva.

She expressed that it is important to see what other stakeholders who are not in the program, who did not implement TBP, are doing.

13. Mr. Krijnen responded first on the suggestion or idea that they are criticizing the government that the impression was not correct. Mistakes have been made but those are shared responsibilities. He emphasized that it is not a shame to commit mistakes because if one sees the challenge of the endeavor of eliminating child labor, it’s very immense. So it’s not bad to commit mistakes as long as the program learns from them.

14. Another question was posed by Director Elias Cayanong of DOLE VII. He clarified if what was presented was that there was no microfinance. He aired that there must have been a misconception. He explained that there is existing microfinance in Region 7 but their clients are those rejected by the banks. The requirements needed to avail of the funds in the banks are too many that people tend to move away from it. Instead, they go to the 5-6.

Mr. Krijnen clarified that if one would look at the action program of the ILO, there’s not much of microfinance issues that have been dealt with.

Director Cayanong also commented on the ALS. He mentioned that they were developing a proposal and were using their Alternative Learning Course but they are tapping the services of academe to conduct a research. Their proposal involves different working hours for children.

Moreover, they are also planning to conduct a research with respect to the sugar industry as this is one of the worst forms of child labor. However, clamors are bounding them. I don’t understand this last statement - Anji

He also asked about the evaluation system.

15. Mr. Bing Baguioro of Children's Lab commented on the A and E mentioned by Mr. Krijnen as having unreasonably high passing score. He said that for them in the education sector, the A and E is the best thing that happened to children in labor. He explained that as a school program it has been given an award by the UNESCO, thus indicating recognition of its value. Before A and E, they were satisfied with the PEPT, a placement test. He stressed that the keyword is ALS particularly accreditation and equivalency. You accredit a person outside of a formal school system so that he or she can be at par with his/her counterpart in the formal education system. A and E is about leveling the playing field. We can't lower standards in this country because they are poor or child laborers. He agrees that nine months may not be enough but he still believes that A and E is the best thing that ever happened to children out of school.
16. Ms. Resurreccion gave a short reaction to the statement. She shared that they have discussed it with DepEd the day before about the lowering of the standards.
17. Ms. Maria Cecilia O. Nayve of DepEd-BALS explained that the test has two levels: elementary and secondary. The test measures the functional level of learners. It is not a shortcut process and they can not just give certificates because they are concerned about the quality of the learners. We must admit that learner needs to undergo tedious learning process because we are concerned about the quality.
18. Ms. May Cinco of ELF, still on ALS, commented that those implementing ALS are within the framework of DepEd. However, for those involved in the project, it is one form of eliminating CL. So it's not about the measurement of the passing of the A and E. It is how child laborer can be developed. She cited that the way they tackle the modules is that they integrate agriculture with mathematics, science, etc. She clarified that this is not to undermine the system of DepEd. "Sometimes we define ALS in the format of formal learning system." There are mothers who go to ALS because they want to support the education of their children. "The kind of education we will give them will encourage them what economic opportunities in their areas and accordingly how we will develop their skills."
19. Ms. Christine Ilayan of DepEd gave explanations on the high passing marks/scores of the A and E. DepEd in consultancy with experts of test construction came up with A and E test. The test went into validation for

possible modification to guarantee the reliability and validity of the test items. This also led to the standardization of the test item. She added that individual differences among children should be taken into account as there are a lot of other factors to consider.

20. Ms. Jocelle Batapa-Sigue from BC-GAD gave a reaction on one of the presentations. She said that she agrees that one of the tools for sustainability is institutionalizing policies. However, she suggested that they revisit RA 9231 since there is no clear mandate on the part of LGU. “No matter how hard we try to separate ourselves from politicians, because we have a decentralized form of government, we cannot take away the role of the LGU. I don’t know if programs can be sustained in LGU without local legislations. Credit should be given to ILO-IPEC for opening our eyes to CLM that’s why there’s been a presentation on an ordinance institutionalizing the CLM because is not a mandate of LGU. I think we have to check RA 9231 because there is no section on the role of LGUs to address CL in order to sustain the efforts.”
21. Ms. May Maguilian shared that one sustainability strategy for the local government is to come up with the Four Gifts for Children: the Local Development Plan for Children, the Local Investment Plan, the Local Code for Children, and the State of the Children Report.
22. Director Wirth thanked the evaluation team and commended them for presenting some very interesting points. There are so many learnings in the Philippines and the whole ILO. She mentioned the connection they made between the child labor and the broader ILO agenda like the issues on wage, the discussion in the education system, quality of education. She mentioned that the DOLE is doing a lot on the job mismatch and trying to decentralize itself. She also agreed on their recommendation for an evaluation before planning the next phase. Also the discussion on livelihood about how it will get rid of CL, what jobs to create at the local level rather than individuals. For the next phase, she shared that they are looking at local employment planning. They are more into looking at the institutional aspect. She said that one thing that surprised her is the statement about adapting education to the local context, pedagogy of the oppressed. But to what extent is their understanding of this in the local level. She also expressed that they had a very good discussion on the threshold and exploring solutions other than lowering the threshold.
23. At this point, Ms. Resurreccion introduced the next session which was a presentation of how the project has really affected the target groups. She called on Ms. Emily Palma of the Psychosocial Support and Children’s Rights Resource Center (PST CRRC) to present the results of the ILO-IPEC Impact

Assessment conducted by her group (Refer to [Appendix G: ILO-IPEC Impact Assessment](#)).

24. Ms. Palma presented the objectives of the study which is to measure the changes that have occurred in the lives of a sample of the ILO/IPEC beneficiaries before, during, and after the implementation of the program.

She explained that there were two questionnaires (one for a child beneficiary and one for a household beneficiary) prepared by the ILO which they administered to 293 respondents in six areas (NCR, Bulacan, Negros Oriental, Negros Occidental, Davao, and Compostela Valley) based on an integrative report given by ILO indicating the areas of the highest number of child labor cases. The survey was conducted involving the six sectors of the worst forms of child labor. She also shared that there were two groups of respondents based on the status of the children; the withdrawn and the prevented. To get the number, they estimated the proportion based on the list that was given to them. They were able to locate the beneficiaries with the help of certain implementing partners.

She cited the limitations of the study as follows:

- 10 days of field work
- Targeted former beneficiaries have migrated to more distant provinces/ places
- Difficult access to respondents
- Short gap between entry and exit of child to and from the program
- Master list of beneficiaries not up to date

She also mentioned that the questionnaires used were in English with Tagalog translation. The enumerators also translated to the local dialect in administering the questions.

She presented the respondents' mean age and the kinds of programs/services they received. Responses included Alternative Learning System, educational assistance, vocational training (computer, sewing, and tractor operation), seminars (Rights Awareness, Peer Education, and Leadership), microfinance and micro health Insurance (for families), counseling, and medical assistance.

She then presented the trends in the employment and education for the six areas and six sectors. (*Refer to slides 8 to 11 of the PowerPoint Presentation*)

Ms. Palma cited some reasons as to why the number of non-enrollees increased in one of the graphs presented. She mentioned some responses, *ie* parents cannot afford school, not interested in school, schools closed down (the audience reacted to this last item).

A participant from the area mentioned asked her to cite the specific school that closed down. He suggested that the research team validate their data first before presenting these.

Other findings cited are:

- Of those who are currently attending school, majority of them did NOT miss school the month before the conduct of survey due to household chores.
- Majority of the respondents expressed the desire to continue with their studies.

She also presented the assessment of household economic condition and the health condition before and after the program as well as the attitude of child respondents and household beneficiary on child labor.

Mr. Emil Paz of POMCAT asked for a clarification on the improvement of the economic aspect specifically on what parameters were used such as increase in income, increase in expenditure, and buying capacity of household.

25. As the floor was opened for more questions and clarifications, some participants posed the following questions and comments:

26. Dr. Gust asked on how the researchers asked questions to CSEC or commercial sexual exploitation children and what value did they give to the answers that the children were no longer in prostitution?

She also asked if the questionnaires contained specific questions on health like exposure to potential hazards and how they were able to relate their health condition.

Dr. Gust also congratulated the researchers for accepting such a task of conducting the study given such a short time. However, she commented on the value that may be given to the findings by policy or program implementers considering the very short time the survey was conducted in contrast to the value that will be given had the study been done in a longer term and a more profound manner.

27. Ms. Palma clarified that the survey was done simultaneously by deploying several teams to cover the six areas.
28. Another participant queried on how the researchers did the sampling within a short span of time particularly in Negros considering that the geographical location of Negros is so vast and the beneficiaries are from very distant locations. Also, a question on how they located the beneficiaries, like were they provided with the names, was posed.
29. Ms. Palma replied that they were indeed provided with the names of the beneficiaries but they found out in some cases that the names were not really active so there were a lot of replacements done based on the suggestions of the partner implementers.
30. Ms. Serenidad Lavador, Chief Technical Adviser of the ILO-IPEC PoS to the Time-Bound Program (TBP) Project pointed out that the ten days mentioned in the presentation was spent solely for field work. The duration does not count the preparation of the questionnaires and the tabulation and analysis of data. She reiterated that there were six teams deployed during those ten days.
31. Dr. Gust requested that the participants be given copies of the report so that it can be better appreciated.
32. Several participants seconded as they all agreed that the results of the findings are very important and should be validated.
33. Ms. Resurreccion announced that once the study has been finalized and accepted by ILO, the report will be available for distribution to the participants.
34. The facilitator announced the instructions for the group workshop. Originally, the groupings were supposed to be by sectors but some participants suggested that the groupings be according to region. Ms. Resurreccion divided the participants into regional groups and assigned the national enabling committee as one group and the ILO-IPEC as another group.
35. Each group was given metacards of two different colors. On the orange card, the groups were to write the opportunities that they see in their program to combat child labor and on the yellow card, the next steps they believe should be taken to sustain their program. Participants were given one hour for the workshop.

36. By 2:00 pm, participants were ready to present their outputs.

Presentation of Outputs

Region 7

Opportunities

- Educational assistance under the scholarship program
- Sustainable organic agriculture (Negros Island as “organic food bowl” in Asia)
- Inclusion of CL program in the Barangay Development Plan
- CLM institutionalized at the community level
- Expansion of identified traditional ILO areas, ie agriculture to include vegetable farming
- Micro-finance intermediation (to support farm production and micro-enterprises – capital)
- Institutionalizing child labor in DOLE program
- Livelihood programs for parents and for youth/CL (out of school 14-17 years old)
- PhP25M livelihood assistance for child labor families
- Social protection- micro insurance
- Enhanced/strengthened networking with different government agencies (tapping their programs/resources and providing referrals for government to communities and for communities to government agencies)

Next steps

- Survey children’s situations in farming communities (other than sugar cane)
- Capacitate barangays to form barangay development councils to use AIP for children’s programs
- CLM institutionalized at the provincial level
- Expansion of MFI outreach to other areas – CL in agriculture
- Capacitate youth and parents to tap various government agencies/LGUs to support their plans/activities
- Expansion of livelihood programs to other CL target areas
- Tap TESDA to adapt their skills training program to the level of community in sugar areas
- To federate organized groups under ILO family for stronger lobbying vis-à-vis LGU/government agencies
- DOLE to include non-formal sector (child labor occurs in this area)

- Institutionalizing child labor on DOLE regular programs

37. Participants agreed that the presentation was very clear.

38. A question was posed by the participants as to where the PhP 25M will come from.

39. The group responded that based in the AO 146, series of 2007 where the Secretary directed on the Usec to allocate 25M for livelihood assistance (to be distributed to all DOLE Regional Offices nationwide). However, the allocation of the budget will vary since some regions are bigger than the others. Moreover, allocation will be based on the program/project proposals of the different regions. Should the budget allocation push through, the group plans to also attend to the informal sector.

40. Another question that was asked was regarding the opportunity to include the establishment of CGMA.

41. The Director responded, "We are transferring "donation" to the sector that needs the most which is the sugar industry (8), pyrotechnics (1), fishing area (1). We are targeting elementary schools."

42. Dr. Gust commented that she didn't realize that the CLM done through DOLE is solely implemented in the formal sector. It should not be because around 99.9% of our children beneficiaries are in the informal sector.

43. Mr. Krijnen clarified that CLM ought to be done in both formal and informal sector.

44. Dr. Gust stressed that it is not when you go to small enterprises, in the informal sector, the approach there is developmental. You do not inspect them. You help develop them. Unless children are in imminent danger in hazardous environment, that's about the worst forms. When we talk of child labor, it is not only enforcement but also developmental. The enforcement is done in three ways; the end result is we want to see compliance to all standards. But you have different types of enterprises and work places and 99.9% of children are in the informal sector.

45. Ms. Krijnen expressed that not one single actor can play the role of development. The government should be there as well as various sectors. Inspection part of partner should be strengthened.

Region 3

Opportunities

- 3.4M Livelihood Assistance (from the Provincial Government of Bulacan) – before they only had PHP 1.7M but during the exit conference, the Board Member came and promised to double the budget to PhP 3.4M.
- Different laws and ordinance Memorandum Circular 2002-0121 LEPC – states also a budget allocation for that
- AO #146 (s of 2007) DOLE 25M livelihood assistance nationwide
- Existence of Functional Provincial Committee on Child Labor and a convergence of resources
- Children's Champ (provincial/municipal/barangay units/NGOs)
- Second phase of ILO-IPEC
- Active participation of LGUs and community organizations
- CGMA project (2 classrooms donated in Bocaue, Bulacan)

Next steps

- Resource mobilization – one of the projects is the temporary shelter
- Awareness-raising on CL among parents, teachers, private schools
- Tapping of PESO services
- Continue/expand CGMA project
- Community organizing – Organizational Development (Peoples Organization/Children)
- Intensive /Effective Parenting Seminars – educate parents so they will not force their children to work
- Provision of Health and *Safety* Services (to include PhilHealth insurance/OSH-WIND training)
- Capability building – PCCL/Municipal Council for the Protection of Children (MCPC)/Barangay Council for the Protection of Children (BCPC); LGU officials
- Regular consultation/Assessment/Planning
- Advocacy and awareness (municipal and barangay LCPCs); Local Development plan (budget allocation)
- TCPs/livelihood assistance
- Microfinance
- Livelihood/employment (Vocational technology training based on needs)
- CLM (Identification, mapping and tracking WFCL and other forms)
- Direct service assistance to in-school children
- Education (organize project SEALS and continue giving ALS)

46. Dr. Gust commented that the provision of health services should include safety. (Provision of Health and Safety Services).

Region 5

Opportunities

- Structures in place (CPCs strengthened down to the barangay level) as Camarines Norte was the first group to implement the action program way back in 1988
- Sustained media advocacy
- Working models (Media Advocacy Group; Barangay Tanggol Bata Patrol; Mine Rescue Team; PGMA; TWSP, a scholarship program designed solely for child laborers; introduction of a gadget to protect child from inhaling fumes from the amalgamation process, program on values formation (done by a church-based NGO)
- Existing community-based child monitoring initiatives – some groups have made effort in monitoring child laborers
- Complementing diverse technical expertise
- Existing community-based CLM initiative
- Functional Alliances for almost nine years

Next steps

- Reinforce and update the structures – reorient newly-elected officials
- Capacity development of media advocacy group and Barangay Bata Tanggol Patrol and other stakeholders
- Institutionalize and strengthen the working models
- Integration and synchronization of CL programs
- Enhancement of community-based CLM System
- Media multi-stakeholders partnership mechanism

47. On the Environmental Program, Mr. Emil Paz explained that their AP covers three areas: (1) Health component for the safety of miners, (2) Appropriate technologies to reduce carbon emission by 50% (they have already introduced a carbonizer which has been proven to reduce carbon emission by 50%), (3) rehabilitate the mining area (financed by ILO).

48. Dr. Gust asked just for information what is happening to the rehabilitation of their area (though it's not their responsibility) which has been polluted by years of mining and mercury.
49. Mr. Paz said that right now there is no rehabilitation happening but they have proposed for a zoning of the barangay so that the residential areas will not be subject to pollution.
50. Dr. Gust probed as to what local action is being done since compressor mining is actually the worst form of CL.
51. Mr. Paz replied that there are efforts to ban compressor mining for health reasons because people can die of suffocation from this activity. The number of children doing this has been reduced because now, children are involved in the panning process but not in the diving. He added that the technology introduced from Africa can prevent the fumes from the amalgamation process from being inhaled and can recover the mercury. The project is funded by the Action Program.
52. Mr. Ronnie added that the intervention started in 1996 when the Occupational Safety and Health Center offered to conduct the health examination on children. They use this for advocacy until they developed partnership with provincial DENR and POMCAT, and DOST in designing the technology.

Region 6

Opportunities

- Newly elected and re-elected officials are supportive of CP
- Presence of various programs and services for child protection
- Presence of initiatives to involve employers in the management of child welfare programs
- Enacted children's code in many localities
- Presence of local legislations especially on child labor
- ILO-IPEC (with USDOL)
- LGUs implemented the Four Gifts for Children
- Issuances and policies
- Available budget for MDG that can be utilized for child welfare
- GAD resources
- Presence of parents associations
- "Enlightened"/"Empowered" sugar planters/owners; OJT for vocational youth training
- Employers organization in sugar plantation are providing OJT for youth

- Presence and implementation of LDPC, LIPC, Local Code for Children and LSCR
- Established Barangay Councils for the Protection of Children to discuss/tackle CL issues
- Presence of child-friendly media

Next steps

- Demand from the LGUs a budget allocation for CL programs and projects
- ILO-IPEC Continuity Fund/Area expansion
- Activate and strengthen barangay councils for the protection of children
- Microenterprise development/Fund
- CLM – Database software program for developing a child monitoring system
- Integrate CL issues and concerns to formal education/curricula
- Localize CL policies in the LGU level/OSH/IS
- Develop IEC materials that are in the dialect (relevant and appropriate to the locality)
- Assist LGUs in preparation for the Local Development Plan and Investment Plan for children; elicit their involvement
- Sustain media involvement
- Organize children's activities for their skills development
- Organize children's associations (they have association of videoke owners that commit not to be instruments of child labor)
- Identify local champions/advocates
- Identify working children involved in agriculture

53. "Local governments included in the list of child abuse, child labor. As advocates, we believe that we should start from there: Making child labor no longer a taboo but already a problem that is existing and we need to find solutions for," Ms. Batapa-Sigue ended the presentation.

54. Dr. Gust asked the presenter to expand how child laborers can have access to legal services.

55. Ms. Batapa-Sigue shared that she has a proposed ordinance on institutionalizing mechanisms to implement effectively RA 9231 at the local level. One of the provisions there is for the City of Bacolod to provide legal, financial, psycho-social services to victims of child labor which may be in the form of tapping local lawyers in the communities (lawyers can give pro bono service) or be institutionalized through the existing Bacolod Women's Center. She added that as far as criminal cases are concerned, they are tapping the

City Prosecutor's Office. They just train the police personnel to properly draft the affidavits, so there is no cost at all to the child victim.

56. Regarding the On-the-Job-Training of sugar workers, Ms. Edith Villanueva explained CL in the sugar industry. She said that the challenge was enticing them to go back to school. Landowners decided to train the children to operate and maintain the tractors (since the kids didn't want to go back to school). They enhance the industry by encouraging the children to love the industry.

On mechanism for justice, Ms. Villanueva stressed that the unit that should be empowered is the barangay council.

57. Mr. Krijnen shared his experience in an area he visited. He emphasized the social welfare approach – legitimate right of people to be well-paid and not be under the graciousness of the landlord.

Region 11

Opportunities

- Increasing awareness on child labor issues and concerns
- Strong collaboration among stakeholders (NGO, GO, TU, FBO)
- Rich pool of trained, experienced, and committed, Instructional managers (IMs), Learning Facilitators (LFs), teachers
- Structures that support children are in place in some areas (BCPC, CLETF, CLMS, MCPC, ABN)
- MOU with Agro planters and mining companies not to hire children
- Developed champions among local legislators and executives
- Organization of children's associations as vehicle of children's participation in local governance
- Stakeholders developed wide range of strategies/services
- Presence of laws, ordinances and legislations that address issues and concerns of CL (Children's Code of Davao City)

Next steps

- Conduct data base to determine effects and impact of action programs

(AP)

- Expand target children to include new forms of emerging CL
- Continuous training for IM, LFs, teachers, and capability-building/strengthening of development workers involved with children
- Help build up capital to assist in marketing of products/services of microenterprises, families of CL
- Encourage LGUs (municipalities, cities, provinces) to vie for recognition as child-friendly LGUs
- Integrate media in all activities
- Consider non-conventional approaches, *ie* lobby for minimum wage, programs for land reform communities
- Assist for the activation of non-functional BCPCs and other formations
- Do a mapping and referral network of all strategies and services for children
- Form organization of local legislators who are champions of children's issues

58. Dir. Elena Caraballo of CWC shared that there has been a training program which produced a manual on the protection of children (3 levels: orientation for local executives, training for those who train local councils and then training for local councils).

59. When asked if they are still working in agrarian reform, Mr. Julius said that the law on Agrarian Reform (AR) was supposed to expire next year but there is a move to extend the law (big haciendas should be distributed among small farmers).

60. Mr. Krijnen expressed that he was shocked that in the Philippines, it is the reality that one man owns 10,000 hectares of land and many people don't even own any. He said AR should not be allowed to expire.

61. Dr. Gust explained that in principle, AR should not go beyond 2008. But focusing on CL program in AR communities, she shared that they help those who are in banana plantations in Iloilo, sugar plantations and rice communities through a particular module, the OSH-WIND. The modules on CL states how they can recognize CL. They give this in partnership with the Department of Agrarian Reform to AR communities.

NCR (QC PESO and NUWHRAIN)

Opportunities

- Access to city college/university
- QC scholarship program
- Business entities
- Dental check-up in social hygiene clinics
- Health centers as CSEC intervention provider
- City Microfinance Program

Next steps

- Monitor city ordinances on SP 1472, s2004; SP 1594, 1721
- Support/follow-up trafficking city ordinance
- Focus efforts on CL in the other (informal) sectors
- SEALS – (Secondary, Elementary Teachers Against Child Labor) in QC
- Training of health center personnel
- Make more aggressive , appropriate and target specific advocacy messages on CSEC
- Engage other cities in NCR to present QC models

62. A question from Dr. Gust: What is your preventive program regarding the CSEC in preventing them to go to that kind of work?

63. Mr. Baguioro explained that Quezon City is active in forming the Sagip Bata Project. He mentioned that as a member of the Cubao Network of Educators, they reflect on their own messages.

64. As to what they do to rescued CSECs, he shared that they are placed in temporary shelters.

65. Mr. Krijnen shared that they have visited prostitution areas in different parts of the country. Most of the parents send the kids (except for runaway kids) to the kind of work as a family business. People are accustomed to high level income that they don't bother about morality anymore.

66. Mr. Baguioro mentioned that the primary intervention that should be done is to teach a child how to protect him/herself (from saying no to protect him/her

from acquiring sexually-transmitted disease) first. Mr. Krijnen said he couldn't agree more.

Enabling Environment (DepEd, DepED-BALS, DOLE, DILG, ERDA)

Opportunities

- Child labor is a priority sector in the comprehensive program on child protection
- Four gifts for children (LGU)
- Existing laws and ordinances/policies
- Existing local structures on children and CL
- USDOL funding
- CGMA
- Strengthened framework of PPACL (from NPACL)
- Possibility of expanded PPACL network
- Presence of a working group to draft a five-year plan of action (DEPED)
- Strong networks on CL
- Administrative-based data generation (DEPED)

Next steps

- Tracer study can be expanded and applied (*other implementers may do the same – issue on the lack of knowledge on what happened to the children after the provision of services. In 1195 NSO survey, 2.2 working children*)
- Put to scale CL best practices
- Inventory of resources
- Mainstream CL agenda in development plans and programs at all levels
- Development of guidelines on allowable work for older children 15-17 years of age)
- Strong support for the action planning of PPACL
- Advocate for the organization of legislators who will champion CL elimination
- Forge alliances with strategic partners (CL has been a movement)
- Set up CL information systems at all levels
- Look into the expansion of sectors and areas
- Advocacy: (1) to improve knowledge-based advocacy activities, including the multi-pronged determinants of the persistence of CL, but also an organized way of disseminating successes; (2) Removal of hazardous work in backyards and homes through advocacy with LGUs to donate a

- place in the community
- Develop a research agenda: (1) Factors determining school performance of children returned and removed from CL; (2) analyze the role of acute and prolonged exposures of children to hazards and risks.

67. Dr. Gust commented that whether you improve work conditions, children will still be exposed. To protect them, take them out. There should be no hazardous element in the home. Award systems – give something good to people who are doing good, recognition.

68. Mr. Krijnen remarked on a statement said that CL has become a movement and this should show in the figures. Although the problems cannot be solved easily by a small action program, this should not be a reason to get discouraged, he reminded the group.

69. Mr. Krijnen also shared that the ILO headquarters in Geneva is equipped with a lot of technical skills. They have a whole division for setting up monitoring CL so there's no need to reinvent the wheel. He said that they can try asking the office for technical assistance in setting up the child monitoring system.

ILO-IPEC

Strengths	<ul style="list-style-type: none">▪ Presence of an enabling environment▪ Effective advocacy against child labor
Opportunities	<ul style="list-style-type: none">▪ Continuation into Phase 2 of the TBP Support Project
Threats	<ul style="list-style-type: none">▪ Uncertainty of the bidding result▪ New team may be engaged to continue implementation
Weakness	<ul style="list-style-type: none">▪ Resources are over-stretched (especially manpower)

70. Mr. Krijnen in his closing message pointed out that program implementers and partners should learn from action programs, learn from each other, and see what strategies worked and what did not work. He also stressed that it is the responsibility of government to explain to donors about the social reality.