

ILO Sub Regional Office for Eastern Africa
Addis Ababa, Ethiopia

**Final Evaluation
Of the
Poverty Reduction through Decent Employment
Creation in Ethiopia Programme
(TC Code ETH/06/50M/NET)**

Final report
May 2010

BIRGITTE WOEL

P.O.Box 3671-00200
Nairobi,
Kenya

Mobile: + 254 722 562 484
Email: qmkenya@yahoo.com

Fact Sheet

Final Evaluation
on behalf of the
INTERNATIONAL LABOUR ORGANIZATION (ILO)
of the
MULTI-BILATERAL PROGRAMME OF TECHNICAL
COOPERATION

TC code:	ETH/06/50M/NET
Project Title:	Poverty Reduction through Decent Work Employment Creation in Ethiopia
Period Covered:	January 1 st , 2007 - April 30 th , 2010
Total Budget:	Initial: <u>USD 3,249,824</u> , reduced to <u>USD 2,803,824</u>
Start Date:	January 1 st , 2007
End Date:	April 30 th , 2010
Implemented by:	ILO Country Office – Addis Ababa
Donor:	The Netherlands Government
Place:	Addis Ababa, Ethiopia
Key evaluation data:	Final Independent Evaluation
Overall coordination:	ILO Regional Office Addis Ababa, Ethiopia
Evaluation period:	March 8 th to April 2 nd , 2010
Evaluators:	Dr. Birgitte Woel
Submission date:	Final report on June 8 th , 2010

LIST OF CONTENTS

Executive Summary	3
List of Acronyms	5
1. Background and context	8
1.1. National context	8
1.2. National response to poverty	8
1.2.3. PASDEP	8
1.2.4. UNDAF	8
1.2.5. Decent Work Country Programme	9
2. Programme design	10
2.1. Organisational framework	10
2.2. Programme components	10
2.2.1. The four components	10
2.3. Cross cutting issues	11
2.3.1. HIV/AIDS	11
2.3.2. Gender	11
2.4. Organisational framework	12
2.5. Administration	12
2.6. Organisation of the work	12
3. Purpose of the evaluation	14
4. Evaluation methodology	16
5. Programme status	17
6. Findings and conclusions	18
6.1. Overall findings and conclusions	18
6.2. Relevance and strategic fit	18
6.2.1. Findings	18
6.3. Programme progress and effectiveness	19
6.3.1. Findings and conclusions	24
6.4. Efficiency and use of resource	24
6.4.1. Findings	24
6.4.2. Conclusions	24
6.5. Effect of management arrangements	25
6.5.1. Findings	25
6.5.2. Conclusions	26
6.6. Impact and sustainability	26
6.6.1. Findings	26
6.6.2. Conclusions	27
6.6.3. Recommendations	34

7. Lessons learned	28
8. Recommendations	30

ANNEXES

Annex 1:	TORs	32
Annex 2:	ILO Evaluation Policy	42
Annex 3:	Work plan	
Annex 4:	List of people met	
Annex 5:	Definitions	
Annex 6:	Detailed analysis of achievements against outputs	
Annex 7:	Questionnaire	

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

The programme entitled “Poverty Reduction through Decent Work Employment Creation in Ethiopia” was funded by the Netherlands Government in January 2007 and approved by the GoE-MOFED in August 2007. It launched the implementation in December 2007. The programme had a budget of \$3,249,824, but experienced a budget cut of \$446,000 in November 2008 due to under-spending of funds. The programme expired on April 15th, 2010 and was therefore due for final evaluation, which took place from March 8th- April 2nd, 2010

The programme aimed to support the GoE national strategy for poverty reduction, the Plan for Accelerated and Sustainable Development to End Poverty (PASDEP). In response to PASDEP the United Nations Country Team (UNCT) in Ethiopia has formulated the United Nations Development Assistance Framework (UNDAF) for the period 2007-2011 to which DWCP delivers. The objectives of the programme are in tandem with those of DWCP, which covers the following five areas: 1: Poverty Reduction through creating decent employment opportunities for men and women; 2: Expansion of social protection and mitigating HIV/AIDS in the workplace and 3: Improving governance, social dialogue and compliance with International Labour Standards. The programme addressed all three priority areas mentioned in the Decent Work Country Programme, 2009-2012.

The overarching aim of the programme was to contribute to poverty reduction through establishment of increased income and/or job opportunities deriving from workplaces practising decent work conditions. Three sectors were chosen, namely: flower farms, cotton/textile industry and solid waste management. Child labour, which was initially a cross-cutting issue, became an independent component. Decent work components: gender, HIV/AIDS, OSH, social dialogue and ILS were cross-cutting issues in all four components.

Following a completion of the programme an independent evaluation took place assessing relevance of activities, achievements and impact of the same in all components and all geographical areas. The evaluation met with upstream, meso level and downstream stakeholder including the social partners. The evaluation concluded in a validation workshop the outcome of which is included in this report.

The objectives of the evaluation were to:

- To assess progress made on the implementation towards achieving the objectives set out in the project document and identify impacts of the programme that can be sustained and scaled-up;
- To identify and share lessons learned regarding the soundness of the approach and the relevance of the methodological and institutional arrangements for promoting employment within the national development framework, and for reinforcing the capacities to promote decent work;
- To identify and explain any difficulties or challenges, specific to the context or overall implementation, and suggest ways of addressing these in the future;
- To assess to what extent recommendations of the mid-term evaluation have been incorporated; and
- To verify funds were used effectively and efficiently to deliver results.

- To assess to what extent the programme has contributed to the overall development goals of the country (i.e. contribution/alignment with the PASDEP and UNDAF).

The audience of the report is programme staff, tri-partite constituents, Technical Working Groups and Task Forces, the technical units in ILO Headquarter and the donor.

The evaluation was carried out applying quantitative methods, but emphasised on qualitative methods such as semi-structured interviews, focus group discussions, record reviews and website data since qualitative data provide insight explaining the quantitative data. The composition of methods made it possible to validate data using triangulation. The short time for the field exercise made it impossible to have structured focus groups discussion with ultimate beneficiaries such as children withdrawn for WFCL and labourers benefitting from better working conditions.

Overall the evaluation found that the achievements were 88% by end 2009, which was slightly higher at completion. Under the given circumstances including late programme launching and budget cut in 2008 the programme has performed very well.

Major achievements in the four components are the following:

Child labour:	Has in place a National Action Plan, MoU ready for signature and 320 children withdrawn from commercial sex and traditional weaving against the planned 300.
Flower farms:	52 flower farms comply with the programme developed Code of Practices and have received certification opening export opportunities, Template Farm Policy on OSH produced and distributed among farms, training in Modern Labour Inspection System organized and attended by all labour inspectors in the country.
Cotton/textile:	Development of Competitiveness Plan for the sector, development and implementation of Action Plan for Business Development Services, 5 garment factories received WRAP certification and thus access to export markets, 88% female employment.
Solid Waste Mgt.	776 waste collectors trained on basic OSH skills with 66% female participation, 112 women and men (99% women) were trained in 6 categories of handicraft recycling skill, OSH action manual developed.

The achievements are significant at meso and downstream level, while the capacity of the tripartite constituents has not been built in a manner and to a level, where they can maintain and disseminate DW practices in a sustainable manner. This is in accordance with programme objectives and outputs. The budget cut and late launching of the programme further shortened the time for implementation and thus the finalisation of several activities, especially printing and publishing of a wide range of materials on DW issues.

It can be concluded that:

1. The programme has significantly contributed to development and introduction of procedures for DW practices and certification of the same. The result is increased employment and significantly so if procedures and materials are reviewed, introduction up-scaled and combined with streamlined, professional marketing and purposeful collaboration within each of the two export sectors.
2. The social partners need well-sequenced institutional capacity building together with hand-over of responsibility for programme implementation before having capacity and systems in place to manage and further disseminate and monitor the achieved standards.

Accordingly,

1. To secure presence of sustainable institutional structures and capacities, it is strongly recommended that the programme be given another three-year phase. This should be used for fine-tuning of measures for introduction and up-scaling of DW practices¹ across all three sectors and for completion of the development of systematic prevention of WFCL. Sustainability after another three years is preconditioned by a sequential, high-priority institutional building of the tripartite constituents. Immediate efforts should be made to find funding with the aim to avoid long time interruption of ongoing activities at downstream level.

¹ Explained in chapter 2.1.5

LIST OF ACRONYMS

AAEPA	Addis Ababa Environmental Protection Authority
AACA	Addis Ababa City Administration
ADLI	Agricultural Development Led Industrialisation
AGOA	African Growth and Opportunity Act
ART	Antiretroviral Treatment
BDS	Business Development Services
BPR	Business Process Reengineering
CBO	Community Based Organisation
CETU	Confederation of Ethiopian Trade Unions
COP	Code of Practise
CTA	Chief Technical Advisor
DW	Decent Work
DWCP	Decent Work Country Programme
EEF	Ethiopian Employers’ Federation
ENDA	Environmental Development Action
EPHEA	Ethiopian Horticulture Producer Exporters Association
ETGAMA	Ethiopian Textile and Garment Manufacturers Association
DWCP	Decent Work Country Programme
FEMSEDA	Federal Medium and Small Enterprise Development Agency
FIP	Factory Improvement Program
GoE	Federal Democratic Government of Ethiopia
HCT	HIV Counselling and Testing
HIV/AIDS	Human Immune Virus/Acquired Immune Deficiency Syndrome
HQ	Head Quarter (ILO)
IEC	Information Education and Communication
ILO	International Labour Organisation
ILS	International Labour Standards
IMT	Intermediate Transport
IPEC	International Programme fro Elimination of Child labour
ISWM	Integrated and Sustainable Solid Waste Management
ITC	International Training Centre
MDG	Millennium Development Goals
MoARD	Ministry of Agriculture and Rural Development
MoFED	Ministry of Finance and Economic Development
MoH	Ministry of Health
MoLSA	Ministry of Labour and Social Affairs
MoTI	Ministry of Trade and Industry
MoWA	Ministry of Women affairs
MoU	Memorandum of Understanding
MSE	Micro and Small Enterprises
NAP	National Action Plan
NGO	Non-Governmental Organisation
NPC	National Project Coordinator
OSH	Occupational Safety and Health
PASDEP	A Plan for Accelerated and Sustained Development to End Poverty
PLHIV	People Living with HIV/AIDS

PMTCT	Prevention of Mother to Child Transmission
SD	Social Dialogue
SDPRP	Sustainable Development for Poverty reductions Program
SME	Small and Medium Enterprise
SP	Service Providers
SRO	Sub-Regional Office
SYWCB	Start Your Waste Collection Business
SW-IEO	Solid Waste Informal Economy Operators
SWMA	Solid Waste Management Agency (Addis Ababa City Administration)
SWM	Solid Waste Management
TVET	Technical Vocational Education and Training
TWG	Technical Working Group
UNCT	United Nations Country Team
UNDAF	United Nations Development Assistance Framework
VEGA	Volunteers for Economic growth
WEDGE	Women Entrepreneurship Development and Gender Equity
WFCL	Worst Forms of Child Labour
WIND	Work Improvement and Neighbourhood Development
WRAP	Worldwide Responsible Apparel Production
WTO	World Trade Organisation

1. BACKGROUND AND CONTEXT

1.1. NATIONAL CONTEXT

Ethiopia is a land-locked country with the second largest population in Sub-Saharan Africa at 73.9 million² people. It is ranked among the poorest countries in the world with a per capita income of US\$280³ placing Ethiopia as number 204 out of 210 countries. Ethiopia ranks number 151 in the Human Development Index⁴. The annual population growth was 2.6%⁵ and the average economic growth rate 10.1% with agriculture growing 6.4%, industry 9.9% and services 14.0%.

The country is rich in natural resources such as: Potash, salt, gold, copper, platinum, natural gas (unexploited) and do thus have a potential for sustainable, economic growth.

1.2. GOVERNMENT STRATEGIES

1.2.1 PASDEP

The PASDEP carries forward important strategic directions pursued under the Sustainable Development and Poverty Reduction Program (SDPRP). Foremost among them is a major focus on growth in the coming five-year period with a particular emphasis on greater commercialization of agriculture and enhancing private sector development, industry, urban development and a scaling-up of efforts to achieve the MDGs⁶. The eight pillars in PASDEP are the following: 1: Building all-inclusive implementation capacity; 2: A massive push to accelerate growth; 3: Creating the balance between economic development and population growth; 4: Unleashing the potentials of Ethiopia's women; 5: Strengthening the infrastructure backbone of the country; 6: Strengthening human resource development; 7: Managing risk and volatility; and, 8: Creating employment opportunities. PASDEP is regarded as the vehicle towards reaching the MDGs.

1.2.2. UNDAF

In support of PASDEP the United Nations Country Team (UNCT) in Ethiopia formulated a coherent United Nations Development Assistance Framework (UNDAF) for 2007-2011. UNDAF focuses on five strategic areas, namely: 1: Humanitarian Response, Recovery and Food Security; 2: Basic Social Services and Human Resources; 3: HIV/AIDS; 4: Good Governance and 5: Enhanced Economic Growth. Across these five themes are several cross-cutting issues: Gender, Good Governance, Population, HIV/AIDS, and Information and Communications Technology (ICT).⁷

² CSA Population Census Commission: *Report of the 2007 Population and Housing Census*, Addis Ababa, December 2008

³ World Development Indicators database, World Bank, 2009

⁴ UNDP: Human Development Report, 2009

⁵ UNFPA: Summary and Statistical Report of the 2007 Population and Housing Census Results

⁶ Ethiopia: Building on Progress - A Plan for Accelerated and Sustained Development to End Poverty (PASDEP) (2005/06-2009/10). Ministry of Finance and Economic Development (MoFED), September 2006

⁷ UNDAF in Ethiopia – 2007-2011 Programme document. UNCT, Ethiopia

The programme delivers to output 5, Enhanced Economic Growth, and to the two cross cutting issues: HIV/AIDS and gender.

1.2.3. Decent Work Country Programme

Ethiopia joined the International Labour Organisation (ILO) in 1923. At the signing of the MoU for the DWCP the GoE had ratified a total of 21 ILO Conventions including all the eight core conventions. Out of the 21 ratified conventions 20 are in force⁸. However, Ethiopia had not ratified any of ILO’s priority conventions⁹.

The DWCP is a results-based framework for Ethiopia that addresses few time-bound and manageable priorities identified by the constituents. The programme was designed for the period 2009-2012 with following priorities: 1: Poverty Reduction through creating decent employment opportunities for men and women; 2: Expansion of social protection and mitigating HIV/AIDS in the workplace and 3: Improving governance, social dialogue and compliance with International Labour Standards.

The programme supports the DWCP Outcome 1: Institutional framework and gender sensitive policies in place to implement the decent work agenda, and DWCP Outcome 3: Increased productivity, competitiveness and employment creation capacities of priority sectors

⁸ Decent Work Country Programme document

⁹ The four priority Conventions are Convention No. 81 on Labour Inspection, Convention No. on 129 Labour inspections (Agriculture), Convention No. 144 on tripartite consultations (International Labour Standards) and Convention No. 122 on Employment Policy

2. PROGRAMME DESIGN

2.1. PROGRAMME FRAMEWORK

As a vehicle for delivery to PASDEP the GOE in collaboration with ILO-SRO and its social partners has initiated a program entitled “Poverty reduction through Decent Employment Creation in Ethiopia”. It falls under the Decent Work Country Programme. It was a three-year programme amounting to \$3.25 million funded by the Netherlands Government.

2.2. PROGRAMME COMPONENTS

The programme aimed to address decent work deficits and promote productivity and innovation in three sectors prioritised by the tri-partite partners, namely: Cotton and Textiles, Floriculture and Solid Waste Management (SWM) with Child Labour (CL) becoming an independent fourth component at a later stage. The initial three components incorporated gender, child labour and HIV/AIDS into their activities. The design of the components occasioned collaboration with ILO/IPEC, FIP and the WIND project.

2.2.1. The four components

The three sectors were chosen after due considerations.

The cotton and textile sector was chosen, because it both directly in the industry, and indirectly in the agricultural sector has a large proportion of the labour force. The international competitiveness is, however, threatened by domestic under-production of cotton. Vast areas in Ethiopia are suitable for cotton production, wherefore this should be encouraged, possible through redesigning the approach.

These enterprises and house hold traditional weavers are located in Addis Ababa, Gambella, Arbaminch, Bahir-Dar, Combolcha, Awassa and Nazareth

The floriculture industry is relatively new, but has huge potential at the export market. The staffing in the sector is female dominated, but required better working conditions with regard to e.g. use of pesticides and insecticides. The export potential and absorption of women as labour force made it an interesting sector for ILO to engage in. These farms are located in close vicinity to Addis Ababa in Sebeta, Holeta, Debre Zeit and Ziway

Both floriculture and cotton and textile enjoy the benefit of the GoE efforts in attracting foreign investors through favourable investment conditions.

Solid waste management for the city of Addis Ababa was a sector for which the GoE asked for support. The component has multiple opportunities for employment through waste collection, handicraft from recycled waste and compost production. The sector typically engages children and women both of which are of specific DWCP concern.

Because of the need for more concerted efforts within *Child Labour*, it was decided to make this an independent and thus stronger component. Ethiopia has ratified the two ILO core conventions on child labour (i.e., Minimum Age Convention No. 138 and Elimination of Worst Forms of Child Labour Convention No. 182), and protocols and procedures for implementation came in place during the programme period. The GoE asked for assistance to formulate and implement a National Action Plan against child labour, which was achieved under this component. Only the signing of MoU is yet to come.

2.3. CROSS CUTTING ISSUES

2.3.1. HIV/AIDS¹⁰

The GoE joined UN Member States in June 2006 at the UN General Assembly to issue the Political Declaration on HIV/AIDS, which included a commitment to move towards the goal of universal access to HIV prevention, treatment, care and support by 2010. Since that commitment was made, Ethiopia has updated its planning framework with ambitious targets, and it has launched a “Millennium AIDS Campaign” that has catalysed more rapid scale up of key prevention and treatment programs.

The commitment of the Ethiopian Government is seen in a broad range of achievements.

Poverty, high rate of unemployment, wide-spread commercial sex work, gender disparity, illiteracy, population movements, rural–urban migration, harmful cultural and traditional practices, stigma and discrimination are the underlying factors influencing the spread of the epidemic in Ethiopia.

2.3.2. Gender

Gender inequality often manifests itself in the form of differential access to resources and opportunities (UNDP 2001). In this context gender is understood as conscious development of jobs and decent work conditions for women in the industrial sector.

Women in Ethiopia are traditionally the centre of the household being responsible for the comfort of all household members. Rural households rely heavily on mixed small-scale farming. A majority of farming activities are carried out by women resulting in early attrition. However, Ethiopia of today has comprehensive legislation benefitting and equalising women through initiatives supported by Ministry of Women, which has representing Bureaus at grass-root level ensuring women access to land, credit etc.

The DCWP supports gender mainstreaming activities promoting gender equality and gender mainstreaming implemented through partnerships.

¹⁰ Federal Democratic Republic of Ethiopia: Report on Progress towards Implementation of the UN Declaration of Commitment on HIV/AIDS. March, 2008.

2.4. ORGANISATIONAL FRAMEWORK

As a vehicle for delivery to PASDEP the GOE in collaboration with ILO-SRO and its social partners has initiated a program entitled “Poverty reduction through Decent Employment Creation in Ethiopia” (TCRAM). It falls under the Decent Work Country Programme. It was a three-year programme amounting to \$3.25 million funded by the Netherlands Government.

The programme is tri-partite with Government of Ethiopia, Ethiopian Employers Federation and Confederation of Ethiopian Trade Unions as the tri-partite partners, and Ministry of Labour and Social Affairs MoLSA, Ministry of Trade and Industry (MoTI), Ethiopian Horticultural Producers and Exporters Association (EHPEA), Ethiopian Employers Federation (EEF), Confederation of Ethiopian Trade Unions (CETU), Addis Ababa City Administration and Federal Micro Enterprise Development Agency (FeMSEDA) as implementing partners. A wide range of ministries and organisations worked as collaborating partners inclusive of Ministry of Agriculture (MoA), Ministry of Finance and Economic Development (MoFED), Ministry of Health (MoH), NGOs, CBOs and UN agencies.

Each of the three initial components was supervised by a Technical Working Group (TWG) chaired by a representative of the lead government department/agency as outlined above, while the CL component had a Task Force, whose sole role was to develop the National Plan of Action for CL. The TWGs were meant to be the instrument through which the government and the social partners would exercise ownership of the design, implementation, monitoring and evaluation of the programme. The TWG also approved work plans of the individual projects¹¹.

2.5. ADMINISTRATION

ILO’s implementing partners at macro and meso levels were the Ministry of Labour and Social Affairs (MoLSA), Ministry of Trade and Industry (MoTI), Ethiopian Horticulture Producers and Exporters Association (EHPEA), Ethiopian Employers Federation (EEF), Confederation of Ethiopian Trade Unions (CETU), and the Sanitation, Beautification and Parks Development Agency of the City Government of Addis Ababa.

The four components constituted one programme implemented by four National Project Coordinators (NPCs) and no programme manager/CTA. The four NPCs were responsible for each their component. The NPCs were placed in the office of their respective lead partners. Sub-regional ILO expert staff provided technical support in the design and implementation of the programme. The programme was administered by the sub-regional office (SRO).

2.6. ORGANISATION OF THE WORK

The work was implemented by GoE through a tri-partite body¹². Immediately after signing of Memorandum of Understanding (MoU) between GoE and ILO in August

¹¹ TCRAM Project Document

¹²

2007 the tri-partite constituted a National Steering Committee (NSC) comprising of MoLSA, EEF, CETU, MoTI, ETGAMA, Addis Ababa City Administration, EHPEA. The NSC was jointly chaired by State Minister for Labour and Social Affairs (MoLSA) and State Minister for Trade and Industry (MoTI).

Each of the three initial components was supervised by a Technical Working Group (TWG) chaired by a representative of the lead government department/agency as outlined above, while the CL component had a Task Force, whose sole role was to develop the National Plan of Action for CL. The TWGs were meant to be the instrument through which the government and the social partners would exercise ownership of the design, implementation, monitoring and evaluation of the programme. The TWG also approved work plans of the individual projects¹³.

The work was organised at three levels: upstream addressing the tri-partite capacity building and new legislation, NAPs, Code of Operations etc; a meso-level involving the sectors, which came to play a lead role in the achievements in all three sectors; and the downstream level involving for example NGOs in testing protocols and procedures for withdrawal of children from WFCL.

¹³ TCRAM Project Document

3. PURPOSE OF EVALUATION

This is a final evaluation aimed at assessing whether the programme has met its goals and objectives. The evaluation also defines lessons learned and impacts that can be scaled up. To be able to draw the required conclusions the final evaluation looked into all activities implemented in the four target sectors of the Programme¹⁴ from August 2007 to date. As this is an integrated programme the evaluation equally looked at the links between the four different components and analysed progress made as a whole.

The evaluation was carried out in accordance with the ILO Evaluation Policy (2005) that provides for a systematic evaluation of programmes and projects in order to improve quality, accountability, transparency of ILO’s work, strengthen decision/making process and support constituents in furthering decent work and social justice.

To assess the above the evaluation thoroughly looked at progress made under the seven immediate objectives, which in the analysis¹⁵ has been broken down to achievements on output level to determine possible weaknesses and/or gaps. The objectives were:

1. Productivity and competitiveness of the cotton/textiles and floriculture sectors are improved to enhance export earning, with due consideration to the needs of women;
2. Industrial relations in cotton/textile and floriculture sectors is improved through collective bargaining and social dialogue, including adequate gender representation;
3. National OSH policy developed and used together with the ILO-OSH 2001 guidelines in improving OSH awareness, compliance and management techniques;
4. To reduce environmental degradation in the city of Addis Ababa and to create new job opportunities by promoting partnership between municipal services and the private sector with due attention to gender representation at all levels;
5. Awareness of child labour issues increased among key stakeholders, and a policy framework in place for effectively tackling the problem in the cotton/textiles and solid waste sectors;
6. Compliance with relevant International Labour Standards and national labour legislation is improved;
7. Knowledge of HIV/AIDS prevention and protection will have increased and HIV/AIDS workplace policies/guidelines in place in all sectors.

Hence the specific objectives of the evaluation were:

- To assess progress made on the implementation towards achieving the objectives set out in the programme document and identify impacts of the programme that can be sustained and scaled-up;
- To identify and share lessons learned regarding the soundness of the approach and the relevance of the methodological and institutional arrangements for promoting employment within the national development framework, and for reinforcing the capacities to promote decent work;

¹⁴ SWM, Cotton and Textile and Flower Farms

¹⁵ Detailed analysis in Annex 6 and cross-cutting analysis in chapter 6.

- To identify and explain any difficulties or challenges, specific to the context or overall implementation, and suggest ways of addressing these in the future;
- To assess to what extent recommendations of the mid-term evaluation have been incorporated; and
- To verify funds were used effectively and efficiently to deliver results.
- To assess to what extent the programme has contributed to the overall development goals of the country (i.e. contribution/alignment with the PASDEP and UNDAF).

4. EVALUATION METHODOLOGY

The evaluation took place from March 8th -April 2nd. 2010. The time for country visit was short, which limited the choice of methods. To be effective therefore the data were collected through:

- a) Studies of relevant literature, reports, materials, DVDs and others;
- b) Web studies;
- c) Interviews with relevant ILO staff,;
- d) Interviews with social partners;
- e) Interviews and discussions with other partners and service providers;
- f) Field visits meeting beneficiaries doing small tracer studies, and
- g) Site visits seeing work and results on the ground.

A list of people met is found in annex 3.

The evaluator was provided with all documentation from all four components and with overall and cross-cutting documentation including programme document, progress reports, materials developed and power point presentations from implementing partners. Supplementary information was gathered from web-sites.

The work plan¹⁶ contained a number of key informant interview for which the evaluator had prepared a format that was used for discussions¹⁷. As there had been unforeseen challenges time was required for looking into these aspects, too.

Interviews and discussions with other partners focused partly on the past, but also on the future, especially where a meeting was with representatives from the sectors e.g. EHPEA, ETGAMA and AACAA. Intention here was to establish whether an extension was relevant. It has to be noted that only sectors with a potential to expand are relevant in this programme context.

The field visits covered all four components, but only the geographical areas within or neighbouring Addis Ababa. The evaluation covers beneficiaries in all targeted areas.

The evaluation concluded with a debriefing meeting at the ILO office with high stakeholder representation.

¹⁶ Annex 3

¹⁷ Annex 6

5. PROGRAMME STATUS

The “Poverty Reduction through Decent Employment Creation in Ethiopia” programme was funded by Netherlands Government in January 2007 and approved by the GoE-MOFED in August 2007. It had a budget of \$3,249,824, but experienced a budget cut of \$446,000 in December 2008. The programme aims to support the GoEs national strategy for poverty reduction, PASDEP through the Decent Work Country Programme. Strategically the programme fits other PASDEP supportive initiatives under UNDAF and DWCP. The programme expires on April 15th and was therefore due for final evaluation. The programme had reported 88% achievement by end 2009, which is estimated to be slightly higher at programme expiry due to continued, but slow, progress in all components. It should be noted that the budget cut was carried out without consultation with the social partners.

The programme faced some challenges in terms of delay in implementation due to late signing of MoU between GoE-MoFED/ILO. The programme developed an emergency plan, which enabled it to deliver considerably to all outputs. Some activities were, however not concluded, because of the budget cut and rigid ILO procedures, which do not allow for situational adjustments in implementation, for example other order of activities or delay in activities to have all implied stakeholders onboard without risking a budget cut due to alleged low performance.

The programme had a mid-term review in November, 2008, which provided precise and relevant recommendations. The programme has managed to incorporate many of these, especially at downstream and meso level¹⁸.

The programme design did not pay sufficient attention to the need for institutional building of the tri-partite partners with the view to build a foundation and framework for sustainable partner-based continuation of activities. The tri-partite partners have not had the opportunity to develop sufficient capacity and a supportive institutional framework for taking over an effective and sustainable up-scaling.

Further, the lack of a programme coordinator resulted in less efficient and effective use of funding and other resources.

The programme has carried out substantial and impactful work at meso and downstream level for up-scaling of introduced DW practices. Some activities, for example introduction of Social Dialogue and support of families of withdrawn children, need to have more time for testing and extended training before being ready for up-scaling. Materials produced for training and information should also be reviewed after the first dissemination to assess the applicability.

¹⁸ More details in annex 6

6. FINDINGS AND CONCLUSIONS

6.1. OVERALL FINDINGS AND CONCLUSIONS

The programme has delivered almost fully¹⁹ on all outputs despite the shortened period for implementation due to untimely budget cut. There is significant evidence of development of systems that can ensure increase in number of workplaces, enhanced export opportunities, safer handling of SW, profitable use of solid waste and legislative interventions against WFCL. However, support of the tri-partite constituents was insufficient to build the required capacities and institutional structures ensuring a sustainable and continued up-scaling of the introduced practices.

Conclusion:

It is concluded that the programme has established systems and procedures that have proved to contribute positively to increase in and stabilisation of decent jobs through new and /or extended export opportunities.

6.2. RELEVANCE AND STRATEGIC FIT

6.2.1. Findings

With an overall aim of GoE to achieve the MDGs through PASDEP, the programme is found relevant, as it complemented the various GoE efforts²⁰ in reducing poverty through increased DW-based employment. The programme work fell within goal 1 and 3 in the MDG²¹. In response to PASDEP the United Nations Country Team (UNCT) in Ethiopia has formulated the United Nations Development Assistance Framework (UNDAF) for the period 2007-2011, which has five priority areas. The three areas are incorporated into DWCP covering: 1: Poverty Reduction through creating decent employment opportunities for men and women; 2: Expansion of social protection and mitigating HIV/AIDS in the workplace and 3: Improving governance, social dialogue and compliance with International Labour Standards. The programme addressed all three priority areas mentioned in the Decent Work Country Programme, 2009-2012.

The programme complemented other ILO initiatives. Especially the SWM component, added to the Women Entrepreneurship Development and Gender Equity (WEDGE) programme by training 112 women in making business from solid waste – a very successful business, indeed.²²

The initiative in combating WFCL was in tandem with International Programme for Elimination of Child labour (IPEC) which aims at withdrawing and rehabilitating children through education and capacity building of parents all of which was practised in the pilot test of procedures and guidelines for withdrawing children from Worst Forms of Child Labour (WFCL).

¹⁹ Detailed listing and analysis of outcomes against outputs, annex 6. Further, 88% achievement was reported by end 2009.

²⁰ Chapter 1.2.7

²¹ Chapter 1.2.1

²² Achievements against outputs, annex 6

The programme also fitted well with other PASDEP supporting programmes such as AGOA with its FIP activities and the Engineering Capacity Building Project (ecbp)²³. The conducive investment environment provided by the GoE combined with other parallel project/programme activities have no doubt contributed positively to the open attitude towards introduction of DW practices.

The social partners do not have capacity to take continue and efficient and sustainable scaling-up of programme activities. The insufficient institutional building of the social partners is explained when reviewing the logframe, which had two outputs only (6.1. and 6.2.) directly addressing capacity building of the upstream level. Both outputs concern technical training/awareness, which does not provide the institutional building required for practicing the acquired knowledge and awareness.

6.3. PROGRAMME PROGRESS AND EFFECTIVENESS²⁴

6.3.1. Findings

The programme design emphasises too much on building downstream systems for DW, while forgetting to build the capacity of the actors, who shall support dissemination of the systems. EFF and CETU do not have enough paying members to continue the excellent work, and do even less have the institutional and HR capacity to do so. Finally, the objectives in the logframe are rather outputs than objectives, which is why the wider scope of needs/requirements gets lost

Objective 1

Analysis of the component achievements show significant results in the targeted industries. Objective 1 was meant to target needs of women, which both sectors managed to do through having facilities in place accommodating women, having contracts that secure employment and through equal opportunities at the work place. The following has been achieved:

OBJECTIVE	SECTOR	ACHIEVEMENTS
1.Productivity and competitiveness of the cotton/textiles and floriculture sectors are improved to enhance export earning, with due consideration to the needs of women	Cotton and Textile	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 5 industries have been WRAP certified • Competitiveness Plan Developed for Weavers, Knitters and Garment producers cluster • Implementation of Action Plans of the BDS delivery to the selected enterprises
	Flower farms	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 52 flower farms comply with the programme developed Code of Practices and have received certification opening export opportunities

²³ The activities of which are described in chapter 1.2.7

²⁴ Details of achievements against outputs are found in annex 6

The newly received WRAP certification cannot yet show details on employment²⁵. There is, though, a considerable potential contribution towards poverty reduction through export. There will be a continued need for support to have the potential positive effect of WRAP materialise.

Objective 2

OBJECTIVE	SECTOR	ACHIEVEMENTS
2. Industrial relations in cotton/textile and floriculture sectors is improved through collective bargaining and social dialogue, including adequate gender representation	Cotton and Textile	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Development and introduction of social dialogue and collective bargaining mechanism in five textile and garment enterprises. • Advanced training on social dialogue, international labour standards and national labour law; and • Improved negotiation skills and conciliation of labour disputes in the cotton/textile and floriculture sectors in Ethiopia.
	Flower farms	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • A template Collective Bargaining Agreement (CBA), Contract of Employment and Rules and Procedures for Collective Bargaining specifically targeting the floriculture sector were produced with the participation of the social partners. But systems not in place due to cut in funding of pilot project • Extensive training at levels have been delivered

Achievements: Piloting of bipartite social dialogue couldn’t start as a result of time and budget constraints. Systems for introduction are in place in the Cotton and Textile sector, while wanting in the flower sector. Implementation is overall wanting. The visited industries emphasised on the general inability to practice social dialogue. The lack of implementation shows in the fact that although the two sectors have around 90% female employment, in average 1-2 women in each industry/farm are engaged in work related tasks other than those relating directly to production.

Conclusions: The implementation is half-way in the process and needs further programme support to be internalised.

Objective 3

OBJECTIVE	SECTOR	ACHIEVEMENTS
3. National OSH policy developed and used together with the ILO-OSH 2001 guidelines in improving OSH awareness, compliance and management techniques	Cotton and Textile	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • OSH policy developed and implemented in five textile and garment enterprises. Manual developed and disseminated

²⁵ Ibid, annex 6

		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Trained 20 ToTs for WIND project and developed manual for Work Improvement
--	--	--

The targeted industries have put in place systems for OSH among others purchased fire fighting equipment and trained personnel in handling it and availed free HIV/AIDS testing and treatment. The introduction of OSH is recent and not completed, while the ability to handle it and the further impact is yet to be seen.

Objective 4

OBJECTIVE	SECTOR	ACHIEVEMENTS
4. To reduce environmental degradation in the city of Addis Ababa and to create new job opportunities by promoting partnership between municipal services and the private sector with due attention to gender representation at all levels	Solid Waste Management	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 776 door-to-door waste collectors trained with 63% female participation. • 112 extension workers trained • 112 women and men (99% women) were trained in 6 categories of handicraft recycling skills; • 440 (60% women) door-to-door collectors from all 10 sub-cities in Addis Ababa trained on small scale composting skills

Achievements: The SWM component has fully delivered activities to this objective. There were, however, unresolved issues concerning payment for the garbage, which made almost half the trained people leave SWM as income generating activity. The discussion was still ongoing during the evaluation. Further, the work often starts at night or late evening, which makes it difficult and dangerous for women to engage - difficult because of their household chores, and dangerous because movements in slum areas at night are not safe. Finally, the hand carts are very heavy to push. This includes the new design.

The use of waste for handicraft production has been very successful and is under expansion. The trained women are voluntarily engaging in training of others on request from neighbouring women.

Production of compost has a huge potential for income generation. It does, however, need proper studies and detailed design to come to work. The way it is practised by in a present pilot project by an international NGO is not viable big-scale. Further, it requires systems for household sorting of waste to have safe separation.

Conclusions: The work is commendable and has an obvious potential for generating income at various levels. However, to comply with ILS and address the needs of women there need to be a re-design taking payment, physical and social factors into account.

Objective 5

OBJECTIVE	SECTOR	ACHIEVEMENTS
5. Awareness of child labour issues increased among key stakeholders, and a policy framework in place for effectively tackling the problem in the cotton/textiles and solid waste sectors	Child labour (Covering all components)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • MoU ready for signature • National Action Plan in place • Pilot project on NAP withdrawing 320 children against the planned 300 from commercial sex work and traditional weaving

Achievements: Due to lack of resources the programme failed to develop Sectoral Action Plans for commercial agriculture, cotton and textile and WFCL. The pilot project developed a structured way of withdrawing children which includes capacity building of the families or of the child with the view to provide them with skills for stable and safe income generation. Due to cut in funds the component did not manage to complete the test, as families were given opportunities for skilled training.

Conclusions: National systems for combating CL are in place, while sectoral plans and completion of the test are still to be concluded. There is thus not yet a system for handling of CL.

Objective 6

OBJECTIVE	SECTOR	ACHIEVEMENTS
6. Compliance with relevant International Labour Standards and national labour legislation is improved	Cotton and Textile	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 4-days of advance training on international labour standards and national labour law for 30 trade unions and workers from the 7 targeted enterprises • Enterprise level policies, procedure and operating manuals revised and modified as per the International and National labour standards and audited and certified by international institute
	Flower farms	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Support provided to MOLSA towards the initiative of revising the existing labour law • In relation to the COP 77 farms are implementing some of the provisions of the national labour law and that of the ILS, which amount to 90% of the exporting flower farms • GoE is in the process of legislating on COP so it becomes mandatory

Achievements: Systems for making industries comply with ILSs are in place or about to be developed. Recent completion in the Cotton and Textile sector cannot show impact.

Conclusion: It is expected that the sector will need continued support, when challenges arise. Formalisation of ILS in the flower sector still needs support, so does MOLSA to conclude the work on a national framework that is compliant with ILS.

Objective 7

OBJECTIVE	SECTOR	ACHIEVEMENTS
7. Knowledge of HIV/AIDS prevention and protection will have increased and HIV/AIDS workplace policies/guidelines in place in all sectors.	Cotton and Textile Flower farms	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> No special efforts. HIV/AIDS was introduced under OSH
	SWM	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Draft HIV/AIDS workplace policies for solid waste enterprises have been developed; HIV/AIDS is mainstreamed in the SYWCB, composting and OSH programmes; Issues of HIV/AIDS incorporated in the draft ISWM strategy for the SWM sector

Achievements: HIV/AIDS has not yet been paid full attention in the two export industries, although the visited flower farm addressed the problem directly as mentioned under objective 1.

Conclusions: Support is required for formalisation of HIV/AIDS mainstreaming in the two sectors.

All programme components have made commendable achievements under the circumstances delivering satisfactory to all meso and downstream level outputs. All geographical areas have engaged successfully in programme activities and have equal achievements.

The programme has established a solid foundation for increase in employment through certification of industries, which is a precondition for entering export markets. Both flower farms and garment industry produces for export.

Contrary to these downstream achievements the social partners felt limited ownership due to blurred programme management. For example lack of programme coordinator and the gradually lower efficiency of TWGs made participatory management render difficult. Further, the tri-partite were rarely informed about changes in implementation, e.g. cutting of the budget, which added to the general feeling of not being included in programme implementation. It is fact that the implementation was carried out with the programme as the lead actor resulting in diversified perceptions of involvement and communication. All parties, though, were involved in the programme design, which had no focus on building upstream capacities. Only outputs 6.1 and 6.2. address upstream capacity through awareness training, while strengthening of the institutional capacity of the tri-partite constituents is not all addressed.

All sectors and geographical areas have delivered equally to the respective objectives.

6.3.2. Conclusions

After launching of the emergency plan, the programme managed to speed up the implementation of activities and deliver notably to the agreed objectives and outputs. The widespread introduction of DW practices has shown that it is possible in the targeted sectors to achieve DW labour standards resulting in certification and export opportunities. The strong NPC support is a key factor for these achievements.

The least achievements were found at the upstream level in terms of lack of capacity and commitments, which is partly due to the limited timeframe and partly due to lack of emphasis on this factor in the logframe. There is no correspondence between the ILO/UN strategy aiming at partners taking over programmes and the content of the logframe, which focuses almost solely on meso level and downstream achievements. It was not defined anywhere in the programme document, what the social partners should be able to manage and/or implement after programme expiry. Nor was it stated which inputs were required to build the institutions and human resources of partners to ensure adequate capability to continue programme activities.

Alternatives are suggested under “Recommendations”.

6.4. EFFICIENCY IN USE OF RESOURCES

6.4.1. Findings

The *programme design* was complex and comprehensive, which will implicitly challenge the efficiency. The division into four components with each their NPC resulted in a management vacuum with no single coordinating personnel. Each of the three components had separate budgets. Each of the three components allocated funds for the fourth component, CL. Despite individual budgets, neither the NPCs nor the tripartite constituents had a clear overview over component expenditures against programme budget. The SRO has later employed two new staff members in financial department ensuring a constant overview over financial status.

Funds are overall well utilised and the programme has delivered in accordance with available funds. Disbursement of funds and other support functions have been timely and professional. The cutting funds showed that a complete delivery is not possible with less funding, as the programme tried to complete all planned activities

6.4.2. Conclusions

Employment of a programme manager/CTA would have contributed significantly towards optimum utilisation of the funding, as one person would have had an overview over the total situation and would have been able to support and intervene when and as needed.

6.5. EFFECTIVENESS OF MANAGEMENT ARRANGEMENTS

6.5.1. Findings

Due to *lengthy start-up* process after signing with the Government of the Netherlands early 2007, followed by signing of MoU with GoE August 2007, which was further followed by delay in establishment of necessary logistics due to bureaucratic ILO procedures, the components were not ready for implementation until February-April 2008. This cut fifteen months of the time for implementation. Further, the cut in funds in December 2008 resulted in a gradual slow-down of activity implementation. Already when realising the delay in implementation the SRO developed an emergency plan to speed up activities at down stream level, which proved to be effective.

Monitoring and reporting was timely. It was carried out by the NPCs and not by the implementing partners. Traditionally recipients of ILO support report on progress against agreed outputs and work plan, which forces useful reflection. There was no structured analysis of data or input to management decisions, which would have helped in discovering the gradual loss of commitment from upstream level.

The NSC met three times, while the TWGs met more frequently. Overall members of the TWGs found that they could have been more effective although all developed NAPs and practices for implementation of DW in their respective sectors. The child labour task force managed to prepare an MoU on CL, which is now ready for signature. Further, various stakeholders sent different people to the meetings making it more difficult to have continuity. The re-structuring in the GoE from mid 2008 till mid 2009 was perceived by the wider group of stakeholders as a factor that contributed to low level in NSC performance.

MoLSA, CETU and EEF have received capacity building in terms of training and study tours, all of it relating to their daily business and to building of their institutions. The support was not part of a structured, sequential planning ensuring a step-by-step capacity building of their institutions and individuals with the aim to create a solid, complementary foundation for taking over up-scaling of programme activities. Thus the programme support was partially inadequate. The social partner understanding of the programme strategy was in tandem with ruling UN values making governments the implementing partner, while this programme had ILO as the implementing partner. The different understandings adversely affected the communication and partner support of the programme.

The four components involved *sub-regional expertise* at the design. Four specialists served as focal point for each of the components, while ILS and communication were less involved. Both sub-regional advisers and NPCs informed that when need arose, the sub-regional specialists were often out of office assisting programmes elsewhere, which made the NPCs find other solutions. Gender expertise was sought and successfully implemented.

Out of the 14 recommendations from mid-term evaluation the programme has implemented six of the recommendations. Most of the recommendations that were not implemented fell outside the direct scope of the programme. The following was not implemented: More training of social partners, employment of a programme

manager/CTA, strengthening of the M&E system, reviewing of outputs that depend on GoE inputs, factoring in of time and resources for capacity building of GoE and other social partners (recommended twice) and weak coordination.

6.5.2. Conclusions

The *shortage of time and resources* and the absence of a coordinating manager made the implementation more hectic with deliverables as a major issue. Further, situations vary considerably from programme to programme, wherefore *ILO procedures* for implementation with regard to timeliness of various steps in implementation can hamper rather than support effective programme implementation. A low spending in the first year, while preparing mind-sets at all levels followed by for example expenditures of 70% of the total implementation budget in the following year is not easily approved, although it may be the most adequate disbursement for programmes working with attitude change

The lack of involvement of partners in *progress reporting* implicitly denied these the opportunity to reflect over own efforts and approach and consider changes, which is part of good programme management practices. However, the time available for implementation needs to be considered in this programme.

The programme managed to include all of the *mid-term review recommendations* relating to delivery to outputs. Recommendations requiring involvement of and goodwill from other parties were not adequately attended to. However, a response to all recommendations might have jeopardized the programme with a possibility of being drowned in organisational adjustments, which may have affected the level of deliverables negatively.

The programme was administered very well under the circumstances and in accordance with the logframe.

6.6. IMPACT AND SUSTAINABILITY

6.6.1. Findings

The component specific achievements concerning development of procedures for introducing and practising of DW resulting in WRAP and COP certification can no doubt be ascribed to the programme. Parallel activities in other national projects and programmes²⁶ have enforced the effect of the programme, but the WRAP and COP certification of the included factories and flower farms would not have happened without the programme. In the SWM component the pre-collection would not have been organised and made safer without the SWM component, as also the IGAs based on recycling of waste would not have taken off. Further, considerable attention is now paid to CL issues from employers, government and the community at large. HIV/AIDS and gender are of daily concern in the involved sectors and beyond. All of this would not have happened without attitude change.

²⁶ Examples described in chapter 1.2.7

The adopted practices and preventive interventions²⁷ are sustainable as practises applied in the target enterprises. Institutional capacity among partners and stakeholders at all three levels, which can ensure an efficient and sustainable up-scaling covering the entire sector, is yet to be developed.

The cut in funding made exit strategy render superfluous, since implementation had to stop abruptly. There has, therefore, been no gradual handing over of responsibilities at upstream and meso levels, while the industries and their associations naturally take responsibility. The social partners have expressed great commitment to support of a second phase, if being involved as implementing partner and provided with the required capacity building.

The sectors are all committed to extension of DW practices.

In accordance with objectives and outputs the programme has not built the capacity of social partners, who can therefore not continue programme activities.

6.6.2. Conclusions

The adoption of DW practices²⁸, awareness of the importance of preventing WFCL, and HIV/AIDS and gender awareness in the involved farms, factories and cooperatives is of lasting impact and can be replicated. It will, however, require completion of national frameworks²⁹ providing guidelines and legal systems within which to handle offences.

Since functioning structures in the tri-partite offices determine the efficiency, effectiveness, impact and sustainability of programme activities and such structures are not fully in place, it is concluded that the impact is achieved at individual, but not yet at systemic and legislative level.

A stop in implementation would be fatal at this stage, where meso and downstream levels have taken ownership, but are not yet competent enough to introduce remaining and stabilise existing DW practices, and where social partner capacity has not at all been built to take ownership.

²⁷ OSH, gender mainstreaming HIV/AIDS, CL and adherence to labour laws

²⁸ Details in chapter 1.2.5.

²⁹ Referred to in chapter 3

7. LESSONS LEARNED

1. The design of the programme focused on implementation of DW practices at downstream level forgetting that such practices cannot become sustainable if not being supported by the required procedures, institutional framework and human resources for implementation. The lack of institutional building and measures to make the social partners become implementers resulted in low commitment, which added to the low involvement. The lessons learned is that for sustainability reasons project designs should emphasise more on capacity building of future implementers than on the very implementation.
2. The start of this programme took time, among others because stakeholder readiness was not in place (in-house resources, mind-set, engagement in other activities, suspicion concerning DW practices etc). The huge engagement in activities in the second year of implementation made the programme catch up and surpass the work plan. This shows that ample time for establishment of a common ground pays excessively.
3. A programme designed to have three-years duration is contrary to the overall intentions and framework of ILO, which aims at capacity building of the three social partners, support of legislation promoting decent work conditions and exemplary introductions of the practices. Collaboration with governments in transition, which have limited capacity, will require time for establishment of common ground for each project/programme and formation of functional structures which are a prerequisite for sustainable changes at field level. Achievements in terms of policies, protocols and procedures, institutionalisation of the same and then implementation at downstream level takes more than three years to accomplish. Interruption after three years awaiting decisions of possible programme extension disrupts the work and current motivation, which may be difficult to restore.
4. The lack of a coordinator also contributed to social partner feeling of being excluded, since there was no single person to communicate with for clarifications or who could support certain functions, e.g. the NSC work. Having different explanations from different people at managerial level, because each of them have a part-picture of the programme, makes it difficult to collaborate and find own share in the work. The experiences from this programme show that it can have critical consequences not to have the same, fully informed programme representative.
5. It was observed that motivation at implementation level, where rewards are direct at hand, e.g. export opportunities for industries, better working conditions for employers, have fast and presumably lasting impact which makes the activity motivating. Impact at political/upstream level comes at long-term and does not directly benefit the people making extra efforts to have e.g. policies passed, procedures formulated etc. Policy work is thus less motivating. This substantiates that stakeholder motivation, which is crucial for impact and sustainability, is not a uniform entity that can be nurtured equally at all levels of operation. Programme planning therefore ought to incorporate factors motivating individuals at short term at upstream level.

6. Introduction of DW practices and ILS can be swift and successful, when targeting specific industries intensively. The reward is felt in terms of certification that opens doors to export markets. The systematic approach working with industries while developing Action Plans, procedures and guidelines have proved effective and can be a strong tool in fighting poverty. Completion and publication of National and Sectoral Action Plans will help other programmes learn from this approach.
7. Turning SWM into various IGAs is a thinking that needs further development in a world of massive consumption and thus waste production. Handicraft based on recycled waste can be directly adopted by other programmes, while the two other activities need time for further refinement. The materials produced on handling of SW can already at this stage be used by other programmes.

8. RECOMMENDATIONS

Based on conclusions made in chapter 6 and lessons learned the following is recommended:

1. To secure presence of sustainable institutional structures and capacities, it is strongly recommended that the programme be given another three-year phase. The three years are suggested to accommodate time for connection between phase I and II, two years for implementation and 9-12 months for exit. Immediate efforts should be made to find funding with the aim to avoid long interruption of ongoing activities at field level. Stronger involvement and building of the capacity of social partners is consistent with output 7 in DWCP 2009-2012.
2. To focus phase II on (i) strengthening of the HR and institutional capacity of the social partners, (ii) handing-over of responsibility for implementation in preparation for gradual phasing out, (iii) finalisation of interventions left hanging in phase I, (iv) scaling-up of tested systems from phase I, and (v) development of systems for sustainable implementation and up-scaling of DW practices. Sustainability after another three-year phase is preconditioned by a sequential, high-priority institutional building of social partners.
3. The programme design and duration should allow for a preparatory phase with ample time for developing common interests at the detailed level among the three social partners and ILO without fear of budget reduction or other pressures to deliver swiftly. When a project/programme is well consolidated, progress will be fast and sustainable. All projects/programmes should therefore (i) be given time to find a common ground and (ii) be designed to have a longer perspective, for example 3 + 2 years with an initial plan and budget covering all five years instead of the present 3 years as standard. Release of funds for the last two years could depend on deliveries after two-and-half years concluded in a mid-term evaluation. Alternatively programme periods could be made flexible to suit the time required for individual achievement of sustainable results.
4. To formulate programme strategies/logframes with ample focus on capacity building of social partners and stakeholders at meso level before investing extensively in downstream activities. The adequate support from the two levels will ensure efficient and impactful implementation at downstream level.
5. To develop a well-defined, sequential building of the social partners that ensures that any training/input relates to the previous.
6. The above should result in social partners being programme implementers, who are made responsible for time implementation, reporting etc. This could be done through establishment of a support-secretariat manned and placed by the social partners, but financially approved and supported by ILO.
7. To develop incentives for stakeholders at upstream level e.g. in terms of equipment of offices, monthly allowances (maybe \$50) for using own mobile, using public means for participation in meetings etc.

8. To have regular planning meetings involving NPCs and social partners with the aim to have a joint going-through of expenditures and budgeting for the next three or six months’ activities. Full financial insight at all levels should be a part of the general programme management enabling staff and partners to take and handle responsibility.
9. To build capacity (institutional, technical, managerial) of meso level stakeholders. Knowledge about marketing and foreign market needs is critical for development of sustainable industries. Further, the ability to unite across industries and across sectors will help in negotiating e.g. import tax criteria and other shared challenges.
10. To have programme coordinators in all programmes securing a constant and complete overview over programme status. Further, the person will be *the* programme representative, whom all stakeholders will be familiar with and who will discover needs and gaps in time for swift amendments. Changing attitude is a process which requires mutual confidence and qualified support.
11. To establish a joint programme – or similar collaboration - with for example FAO, UNIDO, UNIFEM, WHO, UNICEF, IOM and UNEP to have concerted and complementary efforts supporting implementation of PASDEP.
12. To develop systems for gradual and sustainable up-scaling of the good DW practices.

ANNEXES

ANNEX 1

TERMS OF REFERENCE

TERMS OF REFERENCE FOR FINAL EVALUATION

Project Title: Poverty Reduction through Decent Employment Creation in Ethiopia

TC Code: ETH/06/50M/NET

Duration:

Budget:

Responsible administrative unit: ILO Subregional Office in Addis Ababa

I. Introduction and rationale for evaluation

The evaluation of the TCRAM Programme is planned in line with the programme’s plan for a final evaluation to be carried out at the end of its implementation period. The evaluation will also be carried out in accordance with the ILO Evaluation Policy (2005), which provides for a systematic evaluation of programmes and projects in order to improve quality, accountability, transparency of the ILO’s work, strengthen the decision-making process and support constituents in forwarding decent work and social justice.

Hence, the purpose of the final evaluation is to assess if the programme has met its goals and objectives and identify key lessons learnt and impacts that can be scaled up. The evaluation will be conducted fromFebruary 2010 by an external independent evaluator.

II. Background of the Programme

The Programme entitled “**Poverty Reduction through Decent Employment Creation in Ethiopia**” is a project funded by the Netherlands Government with a total initial budget of USD 3,249,824. However, a few months through its implementation period the budget was cut down to USD 2,803,591 for various programmatic and administrative reasons. This programme is aimed at addressing decent work deficits, promoting productivity and innovation in three priority sectors identified by the tripartite partners in line with the national development strategy. These priority sectors are (a) cotton /textiles, (b) floriculture and (c) solid waste management in the city of Addis Ababa. The TCRAM Programme is a culmination of a series of consultations between SRO Addis Ababa and government, social partners, target beneficiaries, researchers and ILO HQ colleagues. Thus, the programme has three components, namely:

- Promoting decent work in the cotton and textiles sector and making it nationally and internationally competitive;
- Enhancing Productivity, Competitiveness and Market Access through Decent Work in the Floriculture Sector of Ethiopia; and
- Employment Creation through Sustainable Solid Waste Management Services in Addis Ababa.

The ultimate beneficiaries of the programme are workers (including child workers), employer, managers and cooperative members in all the three priority sectors. Moreover, the direct beneficiaries of the programme are meso and macro institutions who will receive capacity building support. These include MoLSA, EEF, CETU, Textile and Clothing Association, EHPEA, the Addis Ababa city Administration, line ministries and relevant NGOs.

Women represent the main work force in each of these three sectors, empirical evidence showing that they are disadvantaged vis-à-vis their male counterparts in terms of levels of salary, working conditions, access to facilities, etc. Therefore, particular attention is paid to giving them equal opportunities at all levels of the project in order to promote gender equality.

A National Steering Committee (NSC), chaired by the Ministry of Labour and Social Affairs (MOLSA) and co-chaired by the Ministry of Trade and Industry (MOTI) has been set up to provide overall policy guidance, ensuring that the programme objectives and implementation are in line with the national development objectives. The technical cooperation and implementation of the programme is carried out by three National Programme Coordinators (NPCs) for each component and one NPC working on Child labour issues across all three components. Each NPC reports to the Director ILO SRO Addis Ababa through technical specialists within the SRO designated as technical backstopping focal persons for each component and for child labour. Furthermore, three technical working groups have been established for the cotton and textile, floriculture and solid waste management sectors chaired by the MoTI, MOLSA and EHPEA and the Addis Ababa City Administration (AACAA) respectively.

ILO’s implementing partners at the sectoral and macro levels are the Ministry of Labour and Social Affairs (MoLSA), Ministry of Trade and Industry (MoTI), Ethiopian Horticulture Producers and Exporters Association (EHPEA), Ethiopian Employers Federation (EEF), Confederation of Ethiopian Trade Unions (CETU), and the Sanitation, Beautification and Parks Development Agency of the City Government of Addis Ababa.

The planned final evaluation will be the second evaluation to be conducted for this programme. A mid-term evaluation of the programme undertaken in November 2008 revealed that “key notable outcomes have been achieved in all three components” while progress in some objectives is still lagging and faces a number of challenges. Some of the challenges identified by the mid-term review are very low level of capacity of national counterparts and social partners to undertake key tasks associated to this programme; the current government reform and restructuring process; lack of incentives for government partners, and high employee turnover in floriculture.

As of December 2009, the delivery rate of the Programme was 88%.

III. Purpose, scope and clients of the evaluation

Purpose

The purpose of the current final evaluation report will be to identify achievements made by the programme and recommend ways for sustaining/scaling up the impacts. The evaluation will thoroughly look at progress made under the 7 immediate objectives set and evaluate to what extent the programme has met its overarching development objective. Hence, the specific objectives of the final evaluation are:

- To assess progress made on the implementation towards achieving the objectives set out in the project document and identify impacts of the programme that can be sustained and scaled-up;
- To identify and share lessons learned regarding the soundness of the approach and the relevance of the methodological and institutional arrangements for

promoting employment within the national development framework, and for reinforcing the capacities to promote decent work;

- To identify and explain any difficulties or challenges, specific to the context or overall implementation, and suggest ways of addressing these in the future;
- To assess to what extent recommendations of the mid-term evaluation have been incorporated; and
- To verify funds were used effectively and efficiently to deliver results.
- To assess to what extent the programme has contributed to the overall development goals of the country (i.e. contribution/alignment with the PASDEP and UNDAF).

The evaluation will comply with evaluation norms and standards of the ILO and ethical safeguards will be followed. The attached documents on UN Evaluation Norms and Standards and OECD/DAC Evaluation Quality Standards can be referred for further information.

Scope

This final evaluation will look into all activities implemented in the three sectors of the Programme from August 2007 to date. As this is an integrated programme the evaluation should look at the links between the three different components and analyse progress made as a whole.

The evaluation will cover all the sites included in the scope of the programme. Specifically;

- For the floriculture component flower farms purposefully selected by the industry to represent different geographic conditions, form of ownership, size of farms, product type and number of years in operation will be included. These farms are located in close vicinity to Addis Ababa in Sebeta, Holeta, Debre Zeit and Ziway.
- Cotton farms, ginneries and traditional weavers will be considered for the cotton and textile component. These enterprises and house hold traditional weavers are located in Addis Ababa Gambella, Arbaminch, Bahir-Dar, Combolcha, Awassa and Nazareth.
- Finally, the geographic scope for the Solid Waste Management component will be limited to waste collection and segregation sites in the Addis Ababa City Administration.

Specific sites for the evaluation will be further worked out with the respective NPCs for each component during the actual planning of the evaluation process.

Clients

The clients of the evaluation and main audiences of the report are:

- Relevant staff members of the ILO SRO Addis Ababa who are involved in the day to day activities of the Programme;
- The TCRAM Programme coordinators and technical backstopping specialists who will be able to adapt the strategy of the programme implementation and readjust programme delivery if needed;
- The tripartite constituents, namely MoLSA, EEF and CETU as they are the direct beneficiaries and partners in this programme; Technical working Groups or specific

Task Force active during programme implementation(for the child labour component)

- ILO technical units in Headquarters who will adjust their support to the programme according to the evaluation results and benefit from lessons learnt and good practices; and finally
- The donor who will receive copy of the evaluation and be informed of the programme performance in terms of effectiveness, efficiency, impact, relevance and sustainability.

IV. Key Evaluation Questions / analytical Framework

The evaluator will examine the following key issues for all three components including child labour:

Relevance and strategic fit

- Has the programme addressed the relevant need and decent work deficit in the country? Have new, more relevant needs emerged that the project should address?
- Have the stakeholders taken ownership of the project concept?
- To what extent did the programme contribute to the PASDEP, UNDAF, and DWCP goals and priorities?
- How well does the programme complement and fit with other ongoing ILO programmes in the country.

Project progress and effectiveness

- Has the programme made sufficient progress towards its planned objectives?
- Have the quantity and quality of the outputs produced been satisfactory? Do the benefits accrue equally to men and women?
- How do the outputs and outcomes contribute to the ILO's mainstreamed strategies?
 - How do they contribute to gender equality?
 - How do they contribute to the strengthening of the social partners and social dialogue?
 - How do they contribute to poverty reduction?
 - How do they contribute to strengthening the influence of labour standards?
- How have stakeholders been involved in programme implementation? How effective has the programme been in establishing national ownership? Is the programme management and the implementation participatory and is this participation contributing towards achievement of the programme objectives? Has the programme been appropriately responsive to political, legal, economic, institutional etc. changes in the programme environment?
- Has the programme produced demonstrated successes?
- In which areas (geographic, sectoral, issue) does the programme have the greatest achievements? Why is this and what have been the supporting factors? How can these achievements be scaled-up?
- In which areas does the programme have the least achievements? What have been the constraining factors and why? How can they be improved?
- What, if any, alternative strategies would have been more effective in achieving its objectives?

Efficiency of resource use

- Have resources (funds, human resources, time, expertise etc.) been utilized strategically to achieve outcomes? Have activities supporting the strategy been cost-effective? In general, do the results achieved justify the costs? Could the same results be attained with fewer resources?
- Have project funds and activities been delivered in a timely manner? If not, what were the bottlenecks encountered?
- What are the financial results of the project? (Look at commitments versus disbursements and projected commitments).

Effectiveness of management arrangements

- Were management and implementation capacities adequate?
- Did programme governance facilitate good results and efficient delivery? Was there a clear understanding of roles and responsibilities by all parties involved?
- Did the programme receive adequate political, technical and administrative support from its national partners?
- Did the members of the National Steering Committee and Technical Working Groups have a good grasp of the project strategy? How did they contribute to the success of the project?
- How effective was the communication between the programme team, the field office, the regional office, the responsible technical department at headquarters, CODEV and the donor? How effective was communication between the programme team and the national implementing partners?
- Did the programme receive adequate administrative and technical support from the ILO office in the field, field technical specialists and the responsible technical units in headquarters?
- How effectively did the programme management monitor programme performance and results?
 - Was a monitoring and evaluation system in place and how effective is it?
 - Have appropriate means of verification for tracking progress, performance and achievement of indicator values been defined?
 - Were relevant information and data systematically collected and collated? Is data disaggregated by sex (and by other relevant characteristics if relevant)?
 - Was information regularly analysed to feed into management decisions?
- Has cooperation with programme partners (and among the different component of the programme) been efficient?
- Has relevant gender expertise been sought? Have available gender mainstreaming tools been adapted and utilized?
- Has the programme made strategic use of coordination and collaboration with other ILO programmes and with other donors in the country/region to increase its effectiveness and impact?
- Were recommendations of the mid-term review significantly addressed?

Impact orientation and sustainability

- Can observed changes (in attitudes, capacities, institutions etc.) be causally linked to the programme's interventions?
- In how far is the programme making a significant contribution to broader and longer-term development impact (look at sustainability and local ownership of the programme)?

- What are the realistic long-term effects of the programme on the poverty level and decent work conditions of the people?
- How effective and realistic is the exit strategy of the programme? Is the programme gradually being handed over to the national partners? Once external funding ends will national institutions and implementing partners be likely to continue the programme or carry forwards its results?
- Are national partners willing and committed to continue with the programme? How effectively has the programme built national ownership?
- Are national partners able to continue with the programme? How effectively has the programme built necessary capacity of people and institutions (of national partners and implementing partners)?
- Has the programme successfully built or strengthened an enabling environment (laws, policies, people's attitudes etc.)?
- Are the programme results, achievements and benefits likely to be durable? Are results anchored in national institutions and can the partners maintain them financially at end of programme?
- Can the programme approach or results be replicated or scaled up by national partners or other actors? How would the scaling-up / replication be supported?
- Have any unintended or unexpected positive or negative effects be observed as a consequence of the programme's interventions? If so, how has the programme strategy been adjusted? Have positive effects been integrated into the programme strategy? Has the strategy been adjusted to minimize negatives effects?
- Should there be a second phase of the programme to consolidate achievements?

Accordingly, the following analytical framework is suggested for the final report:

1. Title page (1 page)
2. Table of Contents (1 page)
3. Executive Summary (1 page)
4. Acronyms (1 page)
5. Background and Project Description (1-2 pages)
6. Purpose of Evaluation (1 page)
7. Evaluation Methodology (1 page)
8. Project Status (1 page)
9. Findings, Conclusions, and Recommendations (no more than 15 pages)

This section's content should be organized around the TOR questions, and include the findings, conclusions and recommendations for each of the subject areas to be evaluated.

10. Annexes: including the terms of reference, evaluation workplan and any other relevant documents.

V. Main Outputs of the Evaluation

The evaluator will be expected to deliver:

- A draft report of the final evaluation to be shared with concerned ILO SRO staff and relevant stakeholders;
- An evaluation summary according to the ILO's template for summaries of independent evaluation reports;

- A final evaluation report incorporating comments made on the draft report; and
- A compilation of lessons learnt and good practices.

The quality of the report will be determined by conformance with the quality checklist for evaluation reports.

VI. Methodology

The evaluator will collect secondary data from desk review and verify them with primary data from field visits, interviews and workshop. During the process of data gathering the evaluator will compare, validate and cross-validate data of different sources (programme staff, programme implementing partners and beneficiaries) and different methodologies (desk review, site visits and interviews). All Data collected should be sex-disaggregated and different needs of women and men should be considered.

Desk Review

Before conducting field visits, the evaluator will review the programme document, quarterly progress reports, work plans and emergency work plans, mission and workshop reports, baseline surveys, monitoring data, country data and previous evaluation reports etc.

Individual interviews with ILO staff and field interviews

The evaluator will communicate with the ILO HQ staff of technical units (via e-mails and phone calls) and the field technical specialists and programme staffs that are involved in the management and implementation of the TCRAM Programme in Ethiopia. Specific individuals to be consulted include:

- ILO HQ Staff:
- ILO Programme Staff: Mr. Shumet Chanie (Floriculture Component), Mr. Tewodros Yilma (Cotton and Textile component), Mr. Tadesse Gebreselassie (Solid Waste Management) and Mr. Alemseged Woldeyohannes (Child labour in the three components).
- ILO SRO Technical Backstopping Specialists (during the period under review) and the current SRO Director: Mr. George Okutho, Mr. Kwaku Osei-Bonsu, Mr. Jean Nzenzako, Mr. Franklin Muchiri, Mr. Yaw Ofosu.
- ILO SRO Programming Unit
- The Ministry of Labour and Social Affairs (MoLSA), the Confederation of Ethiopian Trade Unions (CETU), the Ethiopian Employer’s Federation (EEF) and other relevant partners, stakeholders and beneficiaries.
- Task Force members for the development of National Action Plan on child labour

Field visits

The discussions and interviews will be complemented with field visits to the actual sites of implementation. Discussion will also be held with relevant organisations involved and/or benefiting from the programme’s interventions in those sites in accordance with the evaluator's requests and consistent with the terms of reference.

Debriefing

The evaluator will present preliminary findings, conclusions and recommendation to representatives of constituents and ILO SRO Addis staff. The draft report will subsequently be shared for comments before finalization.

VII. Management Arrangements, workplan and time frame

The evaluation focal person for the ILO SRO Addis is Brooknut Tecola. The evaluator will thus be able to ask for any support and reports directly to the evaluation focal person of the SRO.

The evaluation will be implemented by one international evaluator.

The Regional Office for Africa in Addis Ababa in consultation with EVAL will provide the necessary guidance on the process and in reviewing the draft evaluation report.

A total amount of USD 15,000 has been allotted for the final evaluation process. The evaluation will be done in 20 working days from February..... A detailed workplan specifying each partner’s contribution to the evaluation process is attached.

VII. Documents that will be shared with evaluators

- Decent Work Country Programme (DWCP)
- Ethiopia’s Plan for Accelerated and Sustained Development to End Poverty (PASDEP)
- United Nations Development Assistance Framework (UNDAF)
- Programme document and logical framework
- Programme work plans
- Progress reports (and presentations on progress and achievements)
- Publications and promotional materials
- Baseline survey for the TCRAM Programme
- Reports on specific activities
- Mid-term evaluation report

ANNEX 2

ILO EVALUATION POLICY

ANNEX 3

WORK PLAN

8-12 March 2010			
	Desk Review	SRO Programme Unit / Nairobi	All the necessary documents for the desk review will be shared with the evaluator.
Monday 15 th March 2010			
9:00 – 9:30	Meeting with the SRO Director	SRO Programme Unit	
9:30 – 10:30	Introduction / logistical/ programme briefing for the evaluation with SRO Director, Focal Points, Program Unit and all National Programme Coordinators (NPCs)	SRO Program Unit Venue: Director’s Office	
10:30 - 11:30	Meeting with the Child Labour component focal person and NPC.	Alemseged Woldeyohannes (Child labour NPC) Venue: ILO Office (6 th Floor Room # 612)	
11:30 – 12:30	Meeting with the Cotton and Textile component focal person and NPC.	Jean Ndenzako (Focal Person) and Tewdros Yilma (NPC) Venue: ILO Office (6 th Floor Room # 610)	
12:30 – 2:00	Lunch Break		
2:00 – 3:00	Meeting with the Solid Waste Management Component focal person and NPC.	Tadesse Gebreselassie (NPC) Venue: ILO Office (6 th Floor Room # 614)	
3:00 – 3:30	Meeting on Cross cutting issues – International Labour Standards	Christina Holmgren, ILS Specialist Venue: ILO Office (3 rd Floor room # 602)	
3:30 – 4:00	Meeting on Cross cutting issues – Communications	Rahel Kebede, Communications Officer Venue: ILO Office (6 th Floor room # 346)	
4:00 – 5:00	Meeting with the Floriculture component focal person and NPC.	Shumet Chanie (NPC) Venue: MoLSA	

Tuesday 16 March 2010 [Solid Waste Management Component]			
8:30 – 10:00	Field visit to the Addis Ababa Environmental Protection Agency compost site	Tadesse Gebreselassie (SWM NPC) Venue : Compost site	The Solid Waste Management NPC will be responsible for the logistical arrangement for the day. He will provide transportation for the rest of the day.
11:00 – 12:00	Meeting with the National Counterpart for the Solid Waste Management Component – Addis Ababa City Administration Solid Waste Management Agency	Tadesse Gebreselassie (SWM NPC) Venue : Addis Ababa City Administration	
12:00 – 1:00	Lunch Break		
1:00 – 2:00	Meeting with solid waste collectors leaders, start your waste collection business trainers, and push cart beneficiaries.	Tadesse Gebreselassie (SWM NPC) Venue : TBC	The Solid Waste Management NPC will be responsible for the logistical arrangement for the day. He will provide transportation for the rest of the day.
3:00 – 4:00	Meeting with women handicraft producers and FEMSEDA trainers.	Tadesse Gebreselassie (SWM NPC) Venue : FEMSEDA	
4:30 – 5:30	Meeting with project partners on public education on solid waste management	Tadesse Gebreselassie (SWM NPC) Venue : TBC	
Wednesday 17 March 2010 [Floriculture Component]			
9:00 – 10:00	Meeting with the National Counterpart for the Floriculture – Ministry of Labour and Social Affairs (MoLSA)	Shumet Chanie (Floriculture) NPC Venue : MoLSA	The Floriculture NPC will be responsible for the logistical arrangement for the day. He will provide transportation for the rest of the day.
10:00 – 10:30	Meeting with member of the Technical Working Group – Regional Bureau of Labour and Social Affairs (BoLSA)	Shumet Chanie (Floriculture) NPC Venue : MoLSA	
11:00 – 12:30	Meeting with the Ethiopian Horticulture Producers and Exporters Association (EHPEA)	Shumet Chanie (Floriculture) NPC Venue : EHPEA Office	
12:30 – 1:30	Lunch Break		
1:30 – 5:30	Field Visit - Selected beneficiary Flower farm - ET Highland	Shumet Chanie (Floriculture) NPC Venue : Sebeta	The Floriculture NPC will be responsible for the logistical arrangement for the day. He

			will provide transportation for the rest of the day.
Thursday 18 March 2010 [Cotton and Textile Component]			
9:00 – 9:45	Meeting with the Technical Working Group of the Cotton and Textile component (MoTI)	Tewodros Yilma (Cotton and Textile NPC) Venue: Ministry of Trade and Industry	The Cotton and Textile NPC will be responsible for for the logistical arrangement for the day.
10:00 – 11:00	Meeting with the Ethiopian Textile and Garment Manufacturing Association (ETGAMA)	Tewodros Yilma (Cotton and Textile NPC) Venue: ETGAMA Office	
11:30 – 12:30	Confederation of Ethiopian Trade Unions (CETU) Training Center	Tewodros Yilma (Cotton and Textile NPC) Venue: CETU	
12:30 – 1:30	Lunch Break		
1:45 – 2:00	Meeting with beneficiary – Metema Cooperative Leader	Tewodros Yilma (Cotton and Textile NPC) Venue: TBC	The Cotton and Textile NPC will be responsible for for the logistical arrangement for the day.
2:30 – 5:30	Field visit to a beneficiary Garment Factory – Addis Garment Factory	Tewodros Yilma (Cotton and Textile NPC) Venue: Addis Garment	
Friday 19 March 2010 [Cross cutting component - Child Labour]			
9:00 – 10:00	Meeting with the National Counterpart for the Child Labour Components – Ministry of Labour and Social Affairs (MoLSA)	Alemseged Woldeyohannes (Child Labour NPC) Venue: MoLSA	The Child Labour NPCs will liaise with the Solid Waste Management NPCs and provide transportation for the rest of the day.
10:30 – 11:30	Meeting with Mission for Community Development Programme	Alemseged Woldeyohannes (Child Labour NPC) Venue: TBC	
12:00 – 1:00	Meeting with Forum on Street Children in Ethiopia	Alemseged Woldeyohannes (Child Labour NPC) Venue: TBC	
1:00 – 2:00	Lunch Break		
2:30 – 3:30	Meeting with HAPCSO	Alemseged Woldeyohannes (Child Labour NPC) Venue: TBC	The Child Labour NPCs will liaise with the Solid Waste

4:00 – 5:30	Meeting with families with children withdrawn from child labour	Alemseged Woldeyohannes (Child Labour NPC) Venue: TBC	Management NPCs and provide transportation for the rest of the day.
Saturday-Sunday 20-21 March 2010			
	The evaluator will review documents, conduct analysis and write up the findings.		
Monday 22nd March 2010			
9:30 – 10:30	Meeting with the State Minister of MoLSA – Chairperson of the National Steering Committee	SRO Programme Unit Venue: MoLSA	
11:00 – 12:30	Meeting with the Confederation of Ethiopian Trade Unions (CETU)	SRO Programme Unit Venue: CETU	
12:30 – 1:30	Lunch Break		
2:00 – 3:00	Meeting with the Ethiopian Employers’ Federation (EEF)	SRO Programme Unit Venue: EEF	
Tuesday 23 March 2010			
10:30-12:00	Presentation on the preliminary outcomes of the evaluation for the SRO Director, SRO Specialists, all Focal Persons, the Program Unit , the NPCs and implementing partners/ stakeholders.	Programme Unit Venue: TBC	The evaluator will present the preliminary findings, ask questions and get clarifications before finalizing the report.
Friday 26th March 2010			
	The evaluator will submit the draft evaluation report to the SRO.		
Tuesday 30th March 2010			
	The ILO will send comments and inputs and comments on the draft evaluation report to the evaluator.		
Friday 2nd April 2010			
	The evaluator will incorporate the comments and inputs from the ILO and submit the final report.		

ANNEX 4

LIST OF PEOPLE MET

LIST OF PEOPLE MET

ILO	
NAME	POSITION
George Okutho	Sub-Regional Director
Alemseged Woldeyohannes	Child Labour NPO
Jean Ndenzako	Focal person Cotton and Textile
Tewdros Yilma	NPC Cotton and Textile
Tadesse Gebrelassie	NPC Solid Waste Management
Christina Holmgren	ILS Specialist
Rahel Kebede	Communications Officer
Shumet Chanie	NPC Floriculture

SOCIAL PARTNERS	
Zenebu Tadesse	State Minister of Ministry of Labour and Social Aff.
Abebe Haile	Director, MoLSA
Solomon Demissie Yimer	Director, MoLSA
Zerihyn Gezahesne	OSH expert
Kasahun Follo	President, CETU
Negalgne Muleta	EEF
Tadesse Eyassu	EEF

SWM	
Getaneh Gebre	AAEPA
Tadesse Amara	Project Coordinator, ENDA
Mulatu Gebru	General manager, AACA, Cleansing Mgt. Agency
Group of 10 precollectors	
Group of 11 women trained in handicraft from SW	
Tewodros Negash	Journalist for the radio programmes
Edom Kassaye	Radio listener
Kiros Wolde-Glorghis	SOS representative

FLORICULTURE	
Tesfaye Gelagle	TWG member, MoLSA regional Oromaya
Nibretu Genetu	TWG member, MoLSA Amhara
Addis Handino	TWG member, SNNPR Bolsa
Tessema Heramo Bajigo	TWG member, CETU
Tadesse Eyassu	TWG member, EEF
	EHPEA
Glenn Humphries	Training Coordinator, EHPEA
Emebet Tesfaye	Farm Manager, ET Highland Flora

COTTON	
Teklu Kudane	Chief of Part, USAID/VEGA Ethiopia AGOA Prg.
Endalkachew Sime	Secretary General, ETGAMA
Zerihun Gezehegae	Labour Inspection Service, MoLSA
Koniit Debela	Deputy Director AAMSEA
Angesom Gebreyohannes	Head of Education/Training, IFTGLWTU
Yared Mesfer	Expert of Textile and Apparel Institute
Kastro Jimma	UNIDO-CDP
Kassaye Mekuria	President, ETGAMA
?	Addis Ababa Garment Factory

CL	
Mulu Haile	Executive Director, MCDP
Habtomu Haile	Programme Officer
Jafar Mohammed	Coordinator, HAPSCO
Wondviferaw Tena	Officer, HAPSCO
Messeret Jember	Social worker, HAPSCO
Ato Meseret Tadesse	Executive Director, FSCE
Kassa Kere	Project Manager, FSCE
Zewditu Ghiwot	Case Manager, FSCE
Mastewal Biresa	Project Officer, FSCE
Seid Ahmed	Health Officer, FSCE

ANNEX 5

DEFINITIONS

Definitions

Child labour

The term “child labour” is often defined as work that deprives children of their childhood, their potential and their dignity, and that is harmful to physical and mental development.

It refers to work that:

- is mentally, physically, socially or morally dangerous and harmful to children; and
- interferes with their schooling by:
 - depriving them of the opportunity to attend school;
 - obliging them to leave school prematurely; or
 - requiring them to attempt to combine school attendance with excessively long and heavy work.\

In its most extreme forms, child labour involves children being enslaved, separated from their families, exposed to serious hazards and illnesses and/or left to fend for themselves on the streets of large cities – often at a very early age.

Occupational Safety and Health

Occupational health and safety is a cross-disciplinary area concerned with protecting the safety, health and welfare of people engaged in work or employment. The goal of all occupational health and safety programmes is to foster a safe work environment. As a secondary effect, it may also protect co-workers, family members, employers, customers, suppliers, nearby communities, and other members of the public who are impacted by the workplace environment. It may involve interactions among many subject areas, including occupational medicine, occupational (or industrial) hygiene, public health, safety engineering, chemistry, health physics, ergonomics, toxicology, epidemiology, environmental health, industrial relations, public policy, industrial sociology, medical sociology, social law, labour law and occupational health psychology.

The OSH is monitored through hazards and risks assessments.

Social dialogue is defined by ILO to

‘Include all types of negotiation, consultation or simply exchange of information between, or among, representatives of governments, employers and workers, on issues of common interest relating to economic and social policy..... It can be inter-professional, sectoral or a combination of all of these.

The main goal of social dialogue itself is to promote consensus building and democratic involvement among the main stakeholders in the world of work. Successful social dialogue structures and processes have the potential to resolve important economic and social issues, encourage good governance, advance social and industrial peace and stability and boost economic progress”

ANNEX 6

DETAILED ANALYSIS OF ACHIEVEMENTS AGAINST OUTPUT

DETAILED ANALYSIS OF ACHIEVEMENTS AGAINST OUTPUTS

1. GENDER AND HIV/AIDS

The incorporated interventions on gender and HIV/AIDS are treated under each component.

2. CHILD LABOUR

2.1. Aim of the child labour component

Ethiopia has ratified the two ILO core conventions on Child Labour (i.e. Minimum Age Convention 138 and Convention 182 on the Elimination of the Worst Forms of Child Labour). Subsequent to ratification, the Ethiopian government expressed a desire to formulate a National Action Programme to combat Child Labour.

The latest data on child labour in Ethiopia are from 2002 and therefore not relevant for this evaluation. A new survey has been done, but is not yet published. The main sectors for child labour are agriculture, domestic work, weaving and commercial sex.

Especially the cotton/textile attracts children and SWM are attractive to children due to the informal and easy-to-access character. Special attention was therefore paid to these two sectors. The inclusion of child labour also allowed for engaging in development of an MoU with the aim to have GoE develop policies and concrete interventions addressing WFCL.

The procedures developed by the programme were tested in the sectors covered by this TCRAM e.g. in the textile sector, but was also tested in the three main child labour sectors, namely: Traditional weaving and commercial sex work. The intention was to upscale the procedures to cover all sectors after the pilot phase.

Around 320 children were withdrawn during the pilot test some of which were trafficked from the southern part of Ethiopia. The traffickers can be relatives, who promise to educate the child, which never happens, while other children are abducted by traffickers. The CL component worked closely with IOM on development of the NAP and awareness creation.

2.1. Planned and accomplished achievements

The child labour component falls under output 5 in the programme logframe and answers to 5 outputs as follows:

Output 5.1. MoU between the Government and the ILO signed and put into effect

There was no MOU in place at the start of the programme. The work of the Mou has been ongoing throughout the programme period, as it faced some challenges.

In 2001-2003 a Child Labour Survey was carried out by Ministry of Labour and Social Affairs (MoLSA) with ILO/IPEC assistance. There was, however, an unexplained expenditure of \$35,000, which had made the collaboration stall. ILO/IPEC could not resume the collaboration without having the matter settled. After some time of negotiations it was agreed that MoLSA could repay in kind by carrying out a survey on Worst Forms of Child Labour (WFCL) the details of which were specified by ILO/IPEC. The Government of Ethiopia (GoE) in return made requirement on having projects directly related to the MoU, which has resulted in development of a mini-project of \$950,000 outside this programme.

The MoU is now ready for signature.

Output 5.2. Gender sensitive knowledge base on child labour in the cotton/textile and solid waste sectors enhanced

The work comprised of three components:

- Baseline survey of magnitude and extent of child labour in the identified sectors. The survey was carried out at programme level. It helped in development of National Action Plan (NAP) with regard to procedures and protocols.
- Review of legislative, policy and institutional framework, which helped in NAP development defining legal mandate of institutions.
- Assessment of micro-finance situation in cotton/textile industry, which resulted in connecting the micro-finance to the rehabilitation component under output 5.5.

Output 5.3. ILO constituents, partners, parents, children and the general population are sensitized on child labour issues with due attention to gender considerations

The programme had a extensive dissemination of knowledge to the entire scope of stakeholders, namely:

- Different sensitization materials developed. The programme developed 3 posters and 3 brochures, a different set for respectively (i) Confederation of Ethiopian Trade Unions (CETU), (ii) Ethiopian Employers’ Federation (EEF) and (iii) the public.
- Weekly radio programmes broadcasted. Local administration and the public participated in radio programmes parallel to ILO meetings on procedures and protocols in the development of NAP with positive impact in terms of integration of needs and ideas during the process.
- CL focused thematic workshops in selected commercial farms.

Output 5.4. Gender sensitive policy framework and sectoral action plans for the elimination of child labour agreed by the Government, the social partners and other key stakeholders

- A multi-sectoral task force comprising 25 members across ministries, NGOs, relevant UN bodies, Confederation of Ethiopian Trade Unions (CETU) and Ethiopian Employers’ Federation (EEF) was established with the aim to develop the NAP. The programme organised series of meetings and two retreats and had the NAP ready by December 2009. It was thereafter incorporated into local governments’ Action Plan (AP).
Due to cut in funding the programme failed to develop Sectoral Action Plan for commercial agriculture, cotton and textile and WFCL.

National ownership is seen in the development and endorsement of the National Action Plan for elimination of WFCL. The NAP development progress was regularly reported to Council of Ministers paving the way for its effective endorsement.

Output 5.5. Standardized procedures, protocols and guidelines for preventing, withdrawing and rehabilitating, and protecting children from WFCL in the cotton/textile and solid waste sectors developed and made available

The procedures, protocols and guidelines are developed, but not printed and made available due to HQ cut in funding. The late delivery was caused by the necessity to solve the old controversy between MoLSA and ILO/IPEC before the work on the MoU and NAP could start and procedures, protocols and guidelines be developed accordingly.

The programme implemented a pilot project for efficient and impactful withdrawal of children from WFCL in collaboration with service providers (SP), who also carried out an assessment of trafficking in weaving sector. 320 children were withdrawn against the planned 300 children. The children were withdrawn through the pilot project. The work has not yet been scaled up.

Three out of the six SPs were visited during the evaluation, namely:

- Mission for Community Development Programme (MCDP) (formerly Multipurpose Community Development Programme);
- HAPCSO and HIWOT (HIV/AIDS Prevention, Control and Support Organization)
- Forum on Sustainable Child Empowerment (FSCE).

MCDP worked with withdrawal of children in traditional weaving, which are mainly boys. The children live with the weaver and work up to 18 hours per day. They sit in rooms without proper daylight, while working at the traditional weaves for which they are too short. The lack of daylight in combination with constant contact with yarn and consumption of non-nutritious food make some children develop skin diseases. The children were withdrawn and reunited with families where possible and appropriate. MCDP did also introduce better weaves and offered training in use of these together with training of weavers in CL standards.

HAPCSO worked with commercial sex workers. They targeted 64 girls resulting in withdrawal of 55 children out of which (i) 18 are reintegrated, (ii) 25 engaged in small-business development and (iii) 9 are not willing to participate in counselling often due to peer pressure. All girls came from the rural areas coming to Addis Ababa to look for job as house maid, but continuing to the sex industry. The girls were between 14-17 years of age.

The girls are offered life skills training consisting of training in: communication, how to cope up with the challenges, HIV/AIDS and personal hygiene. They are further offered support for start of won business. Each girl receives ETB 2,000 as start-up kit, 2 months house rent paid and a bank account with ETB 2,000, which can only be withdrawn with permission from HAPCSO.

The consultant met with five girls. One girl gave a brief of her background:

Girl A comes from one of rural areas, where she lived with her mother, who is single. The father died. When she was 14 years the brother of the mother and the uncle to the girl, offered to take her to Addis Ababa and employ her as housemaid. After some month she was asked to work as a cashier in a place serving local brew. Her engagement in prostitution started immediately after change of job. She paid the owner for use of the bed and house, which left only little money for the girl to survive from. Before going to Addis she had dropped out of Grade 4. To catch up with education she is now attending evening classes while running her retail shop during daytime. She aims to finalise her education and expand her business. She is still only 14 years old.

Two other of the girls had a child each out of wedlock. The one girl does not know, who the father is. The father of the other child disappeared, when he found out that she was pregnant. The parents do not know their fate, but think that they are housemaids. None of them want to visit their parents until they have their business up running and have considerable savings from which they can comfortably pay for a ticket home. They all find that the present life by far outdo the life as commercial sex worker. The challenge is to make the business work and thus ensuring a lasting outdoing of the previous occupation, where intake of drug (khat) and alcohol is part of the lifestyle. The girls were hesitant to the idea of marriage and emphasised that it cannot at all be considered until they are well established.

FSCE also worked with commercial sex workers and domestic workers. They targeted 50 commercial workers and 25 domestic workers. They managed to withdraw 27 commercial sex workers and 36 domestic workers. Part of the withdrawn children is under skilled training, which represents 21 from commercial sex work and 18 from domestic work. Two girls attend evening classes, one aiming to become a secretary and the other wanting to start own business. The background of the latter is interesting.

Girl B is 17 years old and decided to take to the streets, when the parents of Islamic belief planned to marry her to a man, she does not want to marry. She is now under training in hair dressing and attends evening classes to finalise her school education. She has abandoned the family religion and is now a Christian. The project has contacted the parents, who are ready to support her entry into business of she converts to Islam and marries the man selected for her both of which she forcefully rejects.

None of the parties are likely to given in on their stand at this point in time.

FSCE has not yet started support of the families with the aim to enable a sustainable re-unification.

FSCE has long-term experience with rehabilitation of street children. But where they formerly spent 3 years on rehabilitation, they spend 6-12 months when using the pilot procedures.

2.3. Challenges faced

The programme faced some difficulties in starting up immediately logistics were in place, as MoLSA at that point in time was busy with other planning activities. There was further confusion concerning which role respectively MoLSA and Ministry of Women Affairs should play in this programme. The content of NAP later determined the main actors on specific issues e.g. selection of children for withdrawal, rehabilitation, inspection etc.

The rehabilitation involves local administration in signing contract with parents and in providing family support package which includes: support of income generating activities e.g. provision of a cow and payment of school fees for 1 year. Each SP makes use of the developed procedures although with a local touch.

Some SPs have used own resources to produce materials, which should have been produced by the programme in accordance with the programme documents.

3. COTTON AND TEXTILE

3.1. The aim of involving Cotton, Textiles and Clothing sector

Since poverty reduction through decent work conditions is a cross-cutting factor in the programme the Cotton, textiles and Clothing Sector was viewed as an imminent vehicle for both. The sector has along values chain and is therefore labour intensive ranging from cotton grower to ginneries, mills and garment factories. Only interventions involving all levels of the production chain will therefore result in elimination of WFCL, products that can be certified due to decent work conditions and subsequently opportunities for significant expansion of the export. The value chain is characterised by: (i) child labour with agriculture accommodating 3.4% of WFCL (cotton and textile sector), and 78% in the traditional household weaving sector³⁰; (ii) All levels employ women³¹ as the majority of the labour force and (iii) intensive use of chemicals to have high and good quality production. The character and potential of the industry makes it an obvious target for this programme. The aim was to have the seven targeted factories certified to facilitate export. Five volunteered and four were certified.

³⁰ ILO Survey, 2008

³¹ The industry employs 80% women

As many activities were either not completed due to cut in funds or ended close to this evaluation, it is, with a few exemptions, not possible to assess the outcome or impact of the various legislative and structural changes.

The programme intervened at two levels, namely at policy level and factory level with the aim to enforce labour standards through adequate tripartite support. The programme had many, comprehensive and complex outputs comprising:

Output 1.1.: Institutional support services reviewed and the required improvements in place

- The programme supported the development of a Competitiveness Plan for the Cotton and Textile sector to address the challenges and risks and to identify areas and/or products where Ethiopia has comparative advantage. A study was carried out defining the overall competitiveness and productivity challenges in the newly constructed working shed designated for the SMEs and Competitive Plan, which covers weavers, knitters and garment producers cluster.

Output 1.2.: Competitiveness Plan produced for the Cotton and Textile sector

- Diagnostic study conducted on the overall competitiveness and productivity challenges in the newly constructed working shed designated for the SMEs and competitive Plan Developed for Weavers, Knitters and Garment producers cluster

Output 1.3: Business Development Services (BDS) adapted to the cotton and textiles sector

Business Development Services (BDS) include marketing access, input, supplies, technology and product development, import-export guide etc.

The programme managed to implement the following:

- Gender sensitive needs assessment carried out for selected enterprises in the cotton and textiles sector to determine and prioritise non-financial services. (Marketing access)
- Develop, with the selected enterprises, an Action Plan on how the demand-based services can be delivered in collaboration with competent (BDS) service providers.
- Undertake implementation of the Action Plans of the BDS delivery to the selected enterprises.
- International social and market compliance standard developed and implemented in five garment factories one of which is owned managed by a woman.

Output 2.1.: Social Dialogue in the Cotton and Textile sector addressed

The programme has set the direction for future use of social dialogue through:

- Development and introduction of social dialogue and collective bargaining mechanism in five textile and garment enterprises.
- Advanced training on social dialogue, international labour standards and national labour law; and
- Improved negotiation skills and conciliation of labour disputes in the cotton/ textile and floriculture sectors in Ethiopia.

Output 2.3: Bipartite social dialogue mechanisms established in five pilot enterprises

There was no tradition for employers at any level to have a voice, or even less to be able to influence working conditions through workers’ committees. Therefore, for the social dialogue to work for the implicated parties extensive training had to take place:

- Two days training provided for participants from five garment factories and tripartite partners on worker co-operation with senior, middle and executive management participation. The programme applied a “buy-in” approach by pointing at both worker and manager benefits from social dialogue in terms of impact on the financial bottom-line. The training also addressed core labour principles.
- Three days factory level intensive training, consisting of assessments, development of plans for improvements through and system upgrading on workplace cooperation, human resource management and quality and corporate planning modules. The training was carried out by the team of experts working with successfully implemented factory improvements.
- Four days of advanced training on social dialogue for thirty trade unions and workers of the seven targeted enterprises.

Output 3.1 National OSH policy developed and used in improving OSH awareness, compliance and management techniques

OHS is part of decent work conditions and relate to safe handling of products inclusive of chemicals, correct lifting of heavy items, protection clothes etc. Each sector developed specific OSH policies. To that effect this programme managed to have:

- Background paper for development of the national OSH policy prepared and final document submitted;
- Draft National OSH Policy developed, validated in a two-day workshop and submitted.
- OSH policy manual developed and implemented in five textile and garment enterprises.

Output 3.2.: Working and living conditions of workers in rural small holder cotton farms improved

The industrial value chain starts on the farms and does therefore include safe working and living conditions at the source applying the WIND concept. This was done by:

- Localizing and translating the manual for Work Improvement in Neighbourhood Development (WIND).
- Implement WIND training of trainers programme for 20 ToTs and farmers training programme for 30 small scale cotton farmers and 10 of their spouses.
- Develop WIND Improvement plan, which was implemented by the farmers.
- Organization of evaluation workshop assessing strength and weaknesses of WIND and the pilot training programme.

Output 6.2.: Technical capacities of Ministries and National authorities strengthened to enforce compliance with international and national labour standards, with special attention to gender imbalances in enforcement

Few governments have full and effective systems in place, which can effectively assess compliance with the mentioned standards. Training of inspectors is determining for the success of the implementation of endorsed standards. The programme managed to implement

- 3-days training in social dialogue, international labour standards and national labour law for 20 labour inspectors out of which 50% were women. The inspectors came from five selected regions.

Output 6.3: Targeted enterprises in the cotton and textile sector promote national and international labour standards.

The project had the following deliverables to output 6.3.:

- 4-days of advance training on international labour standards and national labour law for 30 trade unions and workers from the 7 targeted enterprises. The industries were:

Almeda Textile, Combolcha Textile, Bahardar Textile, Maa Garment, Novastar Garment, Nathret Garment and Addis Garment.

- Enterprise level policies, procedure and operating manuals revised and modified as per the International and National labour standards and audited and certified by international institute.

3.2. Challenges faced

The programme worked with MoLSA as one the tri-partite members. But because of its nature it also worked with Ministry of Trade and Industry (MoTI). The ministry has non-coordinated development funding from multiple sources, which is the reason why it took six months to establish the necessary committees, among them a Technical Working Group (TWG), which was later replicated in the other sectors.

With the long chain of programme actors the programme period was far too short to have significant outcomes and impact. To compensate the programme has made extensive use of ILO experiences from other (sub-)sectors.

Upstream the programme experienced suspicion because of ILO’s requirements under the Decent Work programme. This had to be overcome before the macro-level as ready to involve in programme activities.

The sector, too, experiences serious challenges. The evaluation included a visit to Addis Garment Factory, where the situation of the sector was put forward:

The factory is 44 years old and was originally private until it was taken over by the government it was owned by the government 1975. Four years back it was privatized taken over by an Israeli business man.

The factory is producing uniforms mainly of the lighter kind such as security uniforms, smocks, overalls and similar.

They informed that they have orders for 200,000 metres of fabric, but have only received 4.700 metres due to shortage of fabric on the country. The major mills and spinners are governmentally owned, which therefore supply governmentally owned garment factories before the privately owned. New mills are under construction. Presently the factory imports fabric from China, India and Bangladesh, which are the worst competitors in the market. When having to add transport, customs and taxes to the price the competitors pay for their fabric, it becomes difficult for the sector to compete.

400 workers have been trained in social dialogue and the factory has been certified. 95% of the labour force is women, while the few men have managed to take most of committee posts. The US markets has shown great interest after a recent exhibition and there were two unexpected US buyers in the factory during the evaluation. The efficiency of the factory is around 60% of one shift.

Taxation is a hampering factor. Taxation on import is 78% plus 10% on goods that are stored at the end of each month awaiting shipping. This together with the delay that import of fabrics causes the competitiveness of the sector reduce radically.

Ethiopian Textile and Garment Manufacturers Association (ETGAMA) is one of the SPs. The association has 58-62 member factories. It focuses on industrial development and markets. The Decent Work and FIP component is viewed as adding specific value in the weaving sector.

The sector benefitted from four areas of intervention being:

- FIP
- RAP (planned to certify eight factories – four succeeded)
- Exchange visits

The aim was to work with eight factories, but only five were committed.

The situation as it was presented shows that the industry has a huge potential, which could be lost if efficiency of the entire value chain is not addresses. It is a paradox to support an export that depends on a highly taxed import, especially when 70% of the farmland in Ethiopia is suitable for cotton production.

4. FLORICULTURE

4.1. The aim of involving floriculture

Floriculture is a new industry. It is labour intensive and can therefore absorb a considerable labour force. It is further a female based industry, as flowers are delicate and need a gentle hand. It has a huge potential for export, all of which makes it match the intentions of PASDEP. 52 flower farms implement the programme developed Code of Practices (COP), which is flower farm adapted DW practices.

4.2. Achievements³²

The sector was expected to following outputs:

Output 1.2. Institutional support services reviewed and the required improvements in place

The component has made an issue of demonstrating that the involved farms practise DW through a range of information materials:

- More than 20 types of posters, 3 leaflets, 6 booklets, bookmarks, postcards, DVDs, etc. each over 1000 copies distributed to beneficiaries. Besides, 25 DW Bill boards erected at 25 flower farms, explaining in English and Amharic how a given farm practices DW. The bill boards are erected at the gate of the farms informing any business visitor before entry.
- The study on the floriculture sector value chain and directory of stakeholder is complete

Output 1.4. Key stakeholders trained in decent work, including an appropriate number of women

- Seven DW awareness raising trainings held at federal and regional levels targeting social partners, workers, employers, government and community. The training involved tripartite plus partners where over 200 people participated and women accounted for 37%
- Besides managers and owner of 33 flower farms and other higher level officials of CETU, EEF and other organizations have attended a half-day DW orientation workshop organized in Addis Ababa.

Output 2.1. Social dialogue in the floriculture sector addressed

- Baseline survey on the situation of SD in the floriculture sector completed.

Output 2.2 Training manual on industrial relations in the floriculture sector developed and staff trained

³² As indicated by the component

- The SD training manual is produced, translated in two local languages (Amharic and Oromifa) and printed 1000 copies each including in English.

2.3. Bipartite social dialogue mechanisms established in five pilot enterprises in the floriculture sector

- A template Collective Bargaining Agreement (CBA), Contract of Employment and Rules and Procedures for Collective Bargaining specifically targeting the floriculture sector were produced with the participation of the social partners. These templates are in distribution for adaptation and practical use at the farm level. However, piloting of bipartite social dialogue couldn't start as a result of time and budget constraints.
- In collaboration with ITC Turin, the programme organised one-week training on Negotiation Skills and Conciliation of Labour Disputes for social partners. Attendees of this training were government (federal & regional), employers and workers.
- 49 participants drawn from social partners also took part in TOT training, which was implemented over two sessions each lasting ten days.
- The programme sponsored the participation of Team-Ethiopia at the International conference on, “ The Real Cost of Flowers and Vegetables: Promoting workers' and environmental rights in the horticulture industry,” held in Nairobi. The participants were drawn from MOLSA, EHPEA, CETU, EEF, NFFPFATU and ILO.
- In collaboration with NFFPFATU (implementer), training on Collective bargaining, Negotiation skills, Gender and Dispute resolution has been delivered (March 2010) at the two flower clusters for about 80 farm union officials.

3.1. National OSH policy developed and used together with ILO-OSH 2001 guidelines in improving OSH awareness, compliance and management techniques

- A National OSH Policy was developed and approved through a validation workshop in the presence of all partners and stakeholders.
- 77 flower farms have implemented the code of practice (COP) of EHPEA where 52 have obtained compliance certification by external auditors. This COP has a strong OSH component.
- Promotional materials have been produced and extensively distributed within the flower sector and with relevant other organizations. The 2008 and 2009 World Days for Safety and Health were commemorated with various educational activities at the sites of two flower farms and two documentaries produced for distribution.
- Template Farm Policy on OSH produced and distributed among farms.
- Training in Modern Labour Inspection System organized and attended by all labour inspectors in the country.
- First-aid trainings to 232 farm workers from 57 farms provided.
- 82 safety officers from 41 flower farms attended the internationally recognized “Fire Prevention and Safety” trainings held in Addis Ababa.
- Five members of EHPEA attended the Socially Label Market Study Tour to the UK, Germany and The Netherlands where social and environmental market requirements were thoroughly discussed.

6.1. High-level policy makers, both men and women, sensitized to international labour standards and guided to formulate gender-sensitive elements of national policies in consistency with international labour standards

- Two trainings on the awareness of national labour law and the eight core conventions held targeting participants from social partners. Especially the International Labour Standard (ILS) training was a high level using an expatriate consultant and where senior officials attended.

○

6.2 Technical capacities of ministries and national authorities strengthened to enforce compliance with international and national labour standards, with special attention to gender imbalances in enforcement

- Support provided to MOLSA towards the initiative of revising the existing labour law.

6.3 Targeted enterprises in the floriculture sector promote national and international labour standards

- In relation to the COP 77 farms are implementing some of the provisions of the national labour law and that of the ILS, which amount to 90% of the exporting flower farms.
- GoE is in the process of legislating on COP so it becomes mandatory.

For illustration of floriculture and the work of the programme, the evaluation included a visit to ET Highland Flora 32 km outside Addis Ababa.

The farm is 20 hectares, with 12 hectares green houses. The construction of the green houses started in 2005 under the supervision of the present manager, who is engineer by profession. Each green house covers 0.5 hectare. The farm produces roses for export to Holland..... They ship 60,000-80,000 stems five times a week.

One of the green houses is allocated for exhibition and has one line of each of the varieties of roses grown on the farm. That allows customers to see the size and colour of the rose both as buds and open flowers and to enjoy the scent of each variety.

Each green house has a group of staff, which is responsible for all work. Each agronomist covers 3 green houses.

The farm has an Executive Manager and three line managers for respectively: Irrigation, production and packaging. Every three month the farm sends soil for analysis to determine irrigation and other inputs.

The farm has 430 staff with 80% female employees, as flower handling requires a gentle female hand. The salary starts with ETB 300 per month + performance based³³ on six-monthly assessments. It is possible, though, to have salary increment before end of the six-month periods if the supervisor recommends it. Supervisors are paid ETB 450-900 per month.

The farm has received training in

- Has OSH committee first aid person designated
- Labour laws and regulations
- HIV/AIDS resulting in 400 employees tested. Two are affected and under treatment in the local clinic.

The farm requests more training necessary for building the industry.

The industry is generally focused on production and less on human conditions, which has delayed their entry into the bigger export market. The farm is now certified.

ILO celebrated OSH day on the farm in 2008 involving also schools to make the younger generation understanding the importance of a wider labour context. The limited understanding of basic labour market procedures shows in the worker resistance towards signing of contracts. They assumed that they could be asked to work anytime if “giving away” their working capacity

One of the implementing partners, the Ethiopian Horticulture Producer Exporters Association (EHPEA), was created to provide a forum for exporters of cut flowers. The trade association

³³ The staff is assessed against 10 points some of which are production related (e.g. absenteeism) while others rather assess how a person contributes to a smooth work environment.

currently has 67 member companies out of the 86 operating and it is growing rapidly. The association is available to provide advice and training of local flower producers and their employees and was therefore an evident SP for the programme.

From June 2007 till January 2010 the association has trained 424 first aid staff, 300 of which were trained with ILO funding. 100 people have been trained as farm safety officers and 77 as fire extinction officers. The training was received with some reluctance as employers regarded it an unnecessary extra burden. But, gradually, the sector experienced the advantages of the training and it is now fully supportive.

There is a need for continued training in more specific subjects to provide in-depth knowledge and basic training of committees, which have not yet been trained. There will be need for procedures and protocols for contracts and grievances to support the implementation of Code of Procedures. In addition, bargaining and negotiations are just at the beginning and will need support for institutional building and further training in social dialogue.

EHPEA already addressed HIV/AIDS issues through a local NGO implementing various activities. The programme component, therefore, did not engage further in HIV/AIDS.

4.3. Challenges faced

The TWG faced some problems, as the member organisations were not represented by the same person from meeting to meeting, which made it difficult to gain the common understanding necessary for development of new modes of operation.

5. SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT

5.1. The aim of the Solid Waste Management component

The solid waste management component was initiated mainly to support the privatization of solid waste in Addis Ababa. For the City Administration mitigating the public health problems of inadequate waste collection while creating jobs were the immediate challenges. ILO support came to improve the quality of jobs, i.e. the technical and business management aspects of solid waste, and occupational safety and health of door to door waste collectors. At the same time the management of solid waste must be along the lines of reduce, reuse and recycle strategies.

The Solid Waste Management (SWM) programme was aimed at addressing Occupational Health and Safety (OHS) and environmental degradation while addressing poverty, women and HIV/AIDS. There is need for organised and regular collection of SW, as the city experiences a rapid population growth in Addis Ababa. Moreover, earlier projects failed³⁴ and more recent projects³⁵ did not include SWM in their urban upgrading activities.

Since the start of the project the city has been administratively re-organised, which has resulted in sincere attempts to find solutions to the public service challenges. With the construction intensity and subsequent population growth in the city, it will be a considerable challenge for the City Administration to continuously deliver basic services of which garbage collection is one.

In the better-off parts of the city garbage is collected in lorries by private (male) collectors, who are paid ETB 70/m³, because of their investments in means of transport and direct delivery at the dumpsite. The pre-collectors involved in this programme are paid ETB 30/m³, because they collect at the houses and bring the garbage to certain collection sites, where the garbage is picked by another party and brought to the dump site. The extra costs for collection are deducted from the pre-collector payment. It is a question whether the difference needs to be

³⁴ Addis Abeba Urban II project/World Bank Market towns development project

³⁵ Care Ethiopia Neighbourhood Upgrading Programme

ETB 40/m3. However, the pre-collectors earn when ETB 250-350 per month from six hours’ daily work, which the pre-collectors informed is less than what they earned before organisation of the work. This is also why a considerable number dropped out and found other occupation, probably in construction work, which is booming. The income should be compared with a minimum wage of ETB 330 per month for unskilled labour in the government for 8 hours a day. Compost production could add to the mentioned income, if carried out by the same groups.

5.2. Planned and accomplished achievements

The SWM component was expected to deliver to the following outputs:

Output 3.3.: OSH skills of solid waste management operators enhanced

The component addressed the enhancement of skills through:

- Baseline survey on door-to-door waste collectors and street sweepers conducted;
- OSH action manual developed, but not printed due to cutting in funds.
- 776 waste collectors trained on basic OSH skills. A considerable number have later dropped out of the jobs due to dissatisfaction with the payment. Others have replaced them, but widespread adoption of skills is limited by the drop-out.

Output 4.1.: Solid waste pre-collectors’ cooperatives and enterprises trained in business management and technical skills with due regard account to gender issues

The sector is female dominated although the work conditions are contrary to female labour market standards and interests. In the sub-city 65% of the labour force is women. In two kebeles waste collection takes place at market places when these close not to interfere with business hours. The work therefore has to take place late evenings or early morning from 3 a.m. to 9 a.m. to ensure “ownership” of the waste before other collectors do the job. Further, women working alone even in broad daylight have been exposed to various harassments. Some cooperatives do not let the women work at night to protect them for traumatizing incidents. In other areas the collection typically takes place between 7 a.m. and 1 p.m.

The component has carried out comprehensive training:

- Training manual on Start Your Waste Collection Business adapted and translated into Amharic, but not printed for general distribution.
- 776 door-to-door waste collectors trained with 63% female participation.
- 112 extension workers trained.
- 2 TOT training sessions for 36 MSE extension workers and consultants in Addis Ababa.

Output 4.2.: Entrepreneurs trained in marketable handicraft skills and in production of compost with particular focus on gender issues

The SWM component had an extra component creating income opportunities for 112 women.

The component had the following inputs to this sub-component:

- Rapid market appraisal on marketable recycled handicraft;
- 112 women and men (99% women) were trained in 6 categories of handicraft recycling skills;
- 440 (60% women) door-to-door collectors from all 10 sub-cities in Addis Ababa trained on small scale composting skills;
- Start Your Small Scale Composting Skills training manual developed and pilot tested;
- Buy recycled products: Handicraft exhibition. More than 10,000 people visited the exhibition;
- Intermediate Transport Equipment designed and tested. This concerns lighter push carts for garbage collection, which women can handle. 20 push carts have been given out to the 20 best performing cooperatives;

- ETB 870,000 transferred to Addis Credit and Savings S.C. to buy 100 IMTs for 100 cooperatives. The city chooses the best performing cooperative per sub-city every month and provides the winning cooperative with a push cart. The push cart is still quite heavy, wherefore the design should be further developed.

The evaluation included two site visits: one to a compost site and one two the women making handicraft from recycled waste.

The women were trained in collecting and utilizing solid waste in their neighbourhood and transform the waste into saleable products. They collected for example:

- plastic bags and cleaned them for knitting of small bags;
- milk cartoons which were transformed into small 6-4 bottle crates that can be used when collecting sodas;
- pieces of clothes were made into new clothes as patchwork, and
- wooden waste was transformed into teaching materials fro pre-school children.

A significant number use their skills for income generation and the group of eleven, who participated in the evaluation, all have satisfactory business and want to train other women. The market-demand can accommodate all. The income has changed the life of the women, who can now send children to school or go for medical treatment. The group requested to have further training in new products and in marketing.

Another group was trained in composting:

The project collaborates with Environmental Development Action (ENDA), an international NGO, who has be availed a piece of land by the municipality. ENDA works closely with Addis Ababa Environmental Protection Authority (AAEPA), which is a governmental authority responsible for environmental management in the city. AAEPA established this project as demonstration site for education of people in how convert solid organic waste into a resource. The project is based on 60 households segregating their household waste into organic and non-organic waste.

ENDA is the implementer of the project. The organisation teaches SWM cooperatives how to sort waste into organic and non-organic waste with the aim to use the organic waste for compost. The compost is mixed with soil and used for cabbage and seedling production, which gives opportunities for additional income out of waste management.

The project sees compost as an income opportunity that can add to the payment received for pre-collection.

It is notable that 70% of all waste is organic and will rapidly fill the new dumpsite, which is 13 km out of town. Lesser transport to the dump site will save fuel and other costs for transport, while making the new dump site serve the city longer. In addition, organic waste emits considerable amount of gas, which is contrary to current global bio carbon interventions. Transformation of all organic waste into compost will, however, require that the municipality avails substantial hectares of land in the outskirts of the city or create a dump site specifically for organic waste and rent out the dump site with waste to a number of cooperatives. AACA availed two sites for ILO pilot projects with waste. Unfortunately ILO could not carry on with that part of the programme due to budget cut although all formalities were in place. At long term it might be possible to separate waste at household level and produce compost for household use.

Output 4.3.: Solid waste business associations, workers and cooperatives trained in association building and advocacy skills programmes with due consideration to gender concerns

The following activities were implemented:

- Study of the challenges of formalising informal economy operators (SW-IEO) in the Addis Ababa solid waste stream conducted;
- Stakeholder consultation completed;
- The ILO training manual on managing Small Business Associations adapted and translated into Amharic. Due to cut in funds it is not published and no training has been carried out.

Output 4.4.: Draft long-term gender sensitive strategic plan on integrated and sustainable SWM system developed

With the aim to develop a strategy various stakeholder participated in study tours to learn from experiences elsewhere:

- Tour to Zambia from which the team learned the following:
 - System for sustainable and integrated SWM policy and strategy
 - The solid waste regulatory system management
 - Separation of waste at source
 - Recycling
 - IEC strategy
 - Sanitary landfill design, building and management
- Study tour to Cairo and Alexandria which provide insight into:
 - Best practices for modern waste collection, transport, transfer station, sanitary land fill and informal recycling resulting the participating officials are now constructing five solid waste transfer stations and one sanitary landfill.
 - Visit to Cairo Sanitation and Beautification Authority and the multinational companies operating in the two cities.
 - Visit to the big informal solid waste operators in Cairo.
- 3 staff from 2 partner organization participated in the 2009 ILO/Turin Enterprise Academy and OSH training

The study tours resulted in

- Draft of long term strategy on sustainable and integrated solid waste management for the Addis Ababa City Administration is completed. Consultations will continue for the finalization of the strategy.
- Monitoring and Evaluation system for the SYWCB training programme developed and in place;

Gender initiatives have been mentioned earlier under this component. In addition the following was implemented:

Output 4.5.: Community groups and solid waste collectors sensitized on the benefits of solid waste segregation at source

With the aim to better recycle and reutilise the waste the medium-term plan is to make household segregate their waste at source. To promote waste segregation the component:

- Carried out a baseline study on attitude and behaviour concerning sustainable SWM strategies;
- Developed Information, Education and Communication Strategy for public education on SWM;
- Implemented a print media campaign producing posters, leaflets and prints on shopping bags;
- Broadcasted a total of 62 items on SWM, 20 minutes every Friday afternoon, repeated Saturday morning. It is, however, not known if the listeners are people already

- concerned about environmental issues or if the broadcasts also reach the common public;
- IEC resource CD developed and distributed.

Output 7.1, 7.2, and 7.3: HIV/AIDS interventions

With regard to HIV/AIDS most has been achieved t the more overall level including:

- Draft HIV/AIDS workplace policies for solid waste enterprises have been developed;
- HIV/AIDS is mainstreamed in the SYWCB, composting and OSH programmes;
- Issues of HIV/AIDS incorporated in the draft ISWM strategy for the SWM sector.

5.3. Challenges faced

The major challenges were of administrative and logistic character and are described elsewhere in this report.

QUESTIONNAIRE

ISSUE	WHAT WORKED WELL	OUTCOME/IMPACT	WHAT WAS DIFFICULT	OUTCOME/IMPACT
Relevance of activities				
Institutional functionality (NSC – technical committees)				
ILO support				
ILO administration <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Funding/disbursement - Reporting - Communication - Networking - M&E 				
ILO involvement of partners				
Achievements <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - geography - sector - issues 				
Demonstrated successes/failures				
Partner ability <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - national ownership = political, technical and administrative support capacities 				