



International Programme on the Elimination of Child Labour (IPEC)



International
Labour
Office

IPEC Evaluation

**Preventing trafficking in girls and
young women for labor exploitation
within China (CP-TING)**

CPR/04/01P/UKM

**An independent mid-term evaluation by a team of external
consultants**

**Geographical coverage: China, especially Beijing project office, Hunan, and
Guangdong Provinces**

APRIL 2007

This document has not been professionally edited.

NOTE ON THE EVALUATION PROCESS AND REPORT

This independent evaluation was managed by ILO-IPEC's Design, Evaluation and Documentation Section (DED) following a consultative and participatory approach. DED has ensured that all major stakeholders were consulted and informed throughout the evaluation and that the evaluation was carried out to highest degree of credibility and independence and in line with established evaluation standards.

The evaluation was carried out a team of external consultants¹. The field mission took place in April 2007. The opinions and recommendations included in this report are those of the authors and as such serve as an important contribution to learning and planning without necessarily constituting the perspective of the ILO or any other organization involved in the project.

¹ Michael Midling, Shengkun Zhou

TABLE OF CONTENTS

SUMMARY OF FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATIONS.....	III#
1.# Brief description of the subject being evaluated	iii#
2.# Purpose and objectives of the evaluation	iii#
3.# Brief description of methodology and limitations.....	iv#
4.# Major Findings.....	iv#
5.# Key recommendations.....	vii#
I.#INTRODUCTION	1#
A.# PROJECT BACKGROUND.....	1#
B.# EVALUATION METHODS	2#
C.# ORGANIZATION OF THE REPORT.....	3#
II.#PROJECT DESIGN	3#
A.# PROJECT OBJECTIVES	3#
B.# RELEVANCE OF DESIGN TO SOCIO-ECONOMIC CONTEXT	4#
C.# APPROPRIATENESS OF STRATEGIES	6#
1.# Intervention strategy.....	6#
2.# Partnership strategy	7#
III.# PROJECT MANAGEMENT.....	8#
A.# ORGANIZATION AND MANAGEMENT	8#
B.# MANAGEMENT IMPLEMENTATION.....	9#
C.# PLANNING INSTRUMENTS	11#
D.# MONITORING, EVALUATION, AND REPORTING	13#
IV.# PROJECT IMPLEMENTATION.....	15#
A.# DEVELOPMENTS DURING IMPLEMENTATION	15#
B.# PROJECT ACTIVITIES AND OUTPUTS.....	16#
1.# Knowledge base, Advocacy, and Mobilization.....	17#
2.# Direct Assistance.....	20#
3.# Institutional and Policy Framework	21#
V.#PROJECT PERFORMANCE	23#
A.# MAJOR ACHIEVEMENTS.....	23#
B.# GOOD PRACTICES.....	26#
C.# LESSONS LEARNED AND CHALLENGES	27#
1.# Lessons learned	27#

VI.#	CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS	28#
A.#	CONCLUSIONS.....	28#
B.#	RECOMMENDATIONS	30#
1.#	Project Management	30#
2.#	Project Implementation	31#
VII.#	APPENDICES	36#
A.#	TERMS OF REFERENCE.....	36#
B.#	SITE VISIT AGENDAS (HUNAN AND GUANGDONG).....	62#
C.#	NATIONAL LOGICAL FRAMEWORK.....	71#
D.#	MEMBERS OF NSC AND COLLABORATING AGENCIES.....	77#
E.#	RESEARCH QUESTIONS (ENGLISH AND CHINESE)	78#

SUMMARY OF FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

1. Brief description of the subject being evaluated

The overall development objective of the *Project to prevent trafficking in girls and young women for labor exploitation in China* (CP-TING) is to contribute to the elimination of labor exploitation of children and women, and in particular the trafficking in girls and young women in China. Three specific project strategies were defined as follows:

- 1) the mobilization of key stakeholders and the development of a knowledge base on trafficking and exploitative labor practices;
- 2) the creation of models of direct assistance for migrant girls and young women; and
- 3) contributing to the development of national and sub-national policy frameworks and implementation capacity for the prevention of trafficking and labor exploitation.

The project has its antecedents in an earlier project implemented under the auspices of International Labor Organization's International Program on the Elimination of Child Labor (ILO/IPEC). That project, the *Greater Mekong Sub-regional Project to Combat Trafficking in Children and Women* (TICW), was implemented in 2000 in five countries in the Mekong river area. TICW project activities in China were conducted in Yunnan province and were implemented with the All-China Women's Federation (ACWF) acting as the lead Chinese organization.

The anti-trafficking activities of CP-TING have occurred during a period of an improving policy environment on a number of important fronts related to trafficking. These improvements include the increasing recognition of migration as an important strategy for poverty reduction and income generation for rural workers; a loosening of legal restrictions on residence; the development of policy and legal instruments that further strengthen legal protections for migrant workers; the extension of access to education and adoption of dropout prevention programs; and participation in an intergovernmental collaborative agreement regime against trafficking.

2. Purpose and objectives of the evaluation

The purpose of this mid-term evaluation is to: 1) determine whether the objectives of the project were achieved by comparing the intended outputs with the actual outputs; 2) review and analyze factors contributing to or hindering the project's success; and 3) assess the overall impact of the project. The evaluation also analyzes the strategies and models of intervention used, documents lessons learned and potential good practices, and provides recommendations on how to integrate these into planning processes and implementation of future IPEC activities in China. This evaluation is intended to serve as a learning tool for stakeholders involved in trafficking prevention programs, in particular in China.

3. Brief description of methodology and limitations

Two evaluators, one from China and one from the U.S., began by conducting a desk review of project materials and telephone interviews with ILO-Geneva staff. After the desk review and prior to site visits, the evaluators prepared an evaluation instrument outlining the key questions for the evaluation. In November 2006, evaluators met with project staff and key partners in Beijing for three days and conducted other telephone interviews with ILO regional and headquarter staff. For logistic and financial reasons, site visits were limited to Guangdong and Hunan. Therefore, most of the conclusions and findings of this report are based on discussions during these relatively brief site visits. A stakeholder workshop was held at the end of the field visits and input was collected for the report. A draft report was circulated in December 2006 to key stakeholders and this report integrates their comments.

4. Major Findings

Relevance of design to socio-economic context. From the time of the project conception through the present, the basic design of the project continues to be highly relevant in the Chinese context. Project designers correctly acknowledge both the positive contributions of migration to economic development as well as the social and economic problems that have accompanied large-scale migration. Regarding the latter, rapid and massive migration of rural laborers, and the risks of trafficking of girls and young women for labor and sexual exploitation that accompanies such migration, continue to be important social problems. Project design principles also fit within the framework of key partners' efforts. These include the many recent major policy, implementation, and enforcement initiatives, which are increasingly being undertaken by the Chinese government agencies at various administrative levels.

Appropriateness of strategies. The project document adopts a logical and coherent approach in addressing trafficking and labor exploitation based on a three-pronged approach: capacity building and policy development; information, mobilization and advocacy; and direct assistance. Drawing heavily on the experiences of the Mekong project, the project designers emphasized a process-based approach based on creating an enabling environment at the national and provincial levels within which direct service activities would be undertaken. They also outlined mechanisms for keeping higher-level stakeholders informed of the project, for participatory monitoring by girls and young women at-risk, and documentation of learning for replication and mainstreaming into policy frameworks. The project design also recognized the need to develop partnerships and advocates within the government and with influential mass organizations to strengthen its impact. To this end, the design encompasses both a multi-level and multi-sectoral strategy, as well as coordination with a variety of other international and bilateral agencies and organizations and branches of the ILO.

Management implementation. Although the project encountered some initial difficulties during startup, such as difficulties related to issues such as language

barriers, the introduction of new management tools and processes, and the lack of data related to trafficking, in general, these problems were adequately addressed during the implementation period. Also, in part due to a perception that communication should be improved between the ACWF and the ILO project office, in June 2006, the project underwent a reorganization that established a joint national project office and offices under provincial Women's Federations.

The project has strong financial commitment for the project both from both international and Chinese partner agencies. The project has also effectively capitalized on a variety of links, synergies, and complementarities. In each province, steering committees were comprised of representatives from a number of line agencies and organizations with a vice-governor as the chair. This format was also replicated with leading groups at city and county levels chaired by vice-mayors. These structures played a strong role in mobilizing government and political will, incorporating as well as guiding the incorporation of trafficking into the work of key agencies such as labor, education, public security, railroads, and media and research organizations. In addition to developing in-country technical expertise, the Bangkok regional IPEC office at the regional level has provided project oversight and input into the project.

Planning instruments. The project adopted a planning structure using a hierarchy of four planning and management tools. Logical frameworks are used as planning and management tools for internal project management; provincial or national programs and work plans are intended to guide project implementation; and small project plans are tools for planning and managing concrete activities. Each province has an action program on research, and these findings are intended to inform policy change at the provincial level. There are also action plans for coordination, mobilization and capacity building within each province, as well as outreach action plans that target girls through a particular set of interventions.

Monitoring, evaluation, and reporting. Small project reports and provincial reports are consolidated into biannual reports and we noted a high quality of documentation of project activities at all levels, and consistent progress in the documentation of learning in small projects describing specific processes and outcomes. Monitoring tools for measuring services to direct beneficiaries were also recently developed or modified, and these include a beneficiary card for each assisted girl; a zero and end measurement form; and participatory monitoring tools.

Knowledge base, advocacy, and mobilization. Enhancing conceptual understanding of issues related to trafficking and labor exploitation and improving the knowledge base on trafficking through research were two key outputs of the project. Building conceptual clarity around broader definitions was initially difficult, but small projects financed through CP-TING have strongly contributed to building greater understanding through the following: establishment of provincial steering committees; an analysis of Chinese criminal code and labor law and a comparison of these with international norms and conventions; local focal point training that emphasized key conceptual concepts as well as objective-oriented project planning for grassroots activities; publicity events, materials, and manuals; and awareness raising activities

v

that involve students, governmental leaders, and the general public. Research activities were undertaken to strengthen the knowledge base related to trafficking. Information stemming from this research will be used to increase broader understanding and awareness of the problems as well as to mobilize the government and mass organizations to creating an enabling policy environment. Research components included secondary data analysis, which was instrumental in selecting target areas; and primary research in each of the five targeted provinces. Full details of research findings were not available at the time this research was conducted, but preliminary findings include important information on the relatively safety of formal versus non-formal channels and major types of exploitation encountered by young female migrant workers.

Direct assistance. The project has only recently begun delivering direct assistance to direct beneficiaries. Although we note some potentially promising practices, models are only beginning to emerge. In all five provinces, direct assistance activities were conceived to deliver services to girls and young women to lower their risk of becoming victims of trafficking. Many of these grassroots projects were implemented in combination with other government-funded projects, and in most cases, the project sought to support existing efforts and helped beneficiaries identify existing government social services. Development and implementation of a range of focused direct assistance interventions include publicity activities in schools; trafficking prevention measures within target counties, township and villages; employment and training center-based activities; community center activities; and employer-based initiatives.

Institutional and policy framework. This objective encompasses two parts: institutional capacity building and achieving wider policy impact by improving existing policies and institutional frameworks. ACWF played a key role by ensuring that steering committees, particularly at provincial levels, were comprised of high level officials. The national steering committee has focused primarily on trafficking as it relates to issues of national policy and legal frameworks through a series of seminars and workshops with national steering committee members. One of the key activities of these workshops was the identification of common ground between international and national legal frameworks on trafficking. National level officials from line ministries and commissions also maintained contact with their provincial counterparts throughout the project and this too contributed to advocacy and mobilization efforts that are leading to policy change.

In terms of policy impacts, many recent changes in policy are documented in this report that demonstrate greater awareness of the problems and risks associated with massive migration, including greater attention to the special needs of young girls with low education levels. CP-TING has contributed to practical understanding of the international definition within key ministries, and there is some likelihood that these concepts will be promoted for legislation in future years. Moreover, successive drafts of the National Plan of Action to Combat Trafficking have increasingly recognized the labor exploitation dimensions, and the CP-TING project has helped to incorporate several aspects of trafficking prevention into the current draft document.

Inter-provincial collaboration. Because of its design, which targets both sending and receiving provinces, the project has contributed to the understanding that more inter-provincial cooperation is necessary to combat trafficking and promote safe migration for decent work for girls aged 16 and up and education for those under 16. Important efforts have been undertaken through regional bodies to establish a rights protection system for rural migrant workers, to abandon discriminative regulations on rural migrant workers, and to jointly establish a social security system for rural migrant workers. Links between labor bureaus at various administrative levels in both sending and receiving areas have also been established including links between receiving employment centers and some vocational schools in sending areas.

Enhancement of capacity. The capacity of Women’s Federation staff and some key implementing partners has been strengthened. There is now a better understanding of social development planning, process management and reporting. In particular, there is now a stronger understanding of logical-framework based planning and the documentation of learning in reporting.

Good practices. This report identifies several good practices, including its recognition of the government as a driving force for social change and its integration within the context of other governmental initiatives. The project has gained strong political support from the government, and in particular from vice-governors and vice-mayors at provincial, municipal and county levels, who head steering committees and leading groups, which help to coordinate activities and guarantee the involvement of relevant sectors in the project. The project has used a bottom-up and open approach to promote involvement of project partners from grassroots to higher levels in developing project ideas and activities into action programs. The project funder has also been supportive and flexible in allowing the project to adjust to new situations and has provided management a “sounding board,” offering helpful advice throughout the implementation period.

Lessons learned and challenges. An important lesson for all partners was the need to work consistently to overcome substantial language barriers as well differences in cultural practices and management styles. Other important lessons include the need for systematic technical backstopping at various levels, streamlined planning tools and methods, and research methods that take into consideration the substantial obstacles to collecting data.

5. Key recommendations

Key recommendations in this report deal with issues of communication and coordination; project management; awareness raising and education; research, direct services, and technical backstopping; and a focus on policy impacts. These are briefly summarized below.

Communication between program partners. Regular internal communication between the project’s partners should be strengthened. Project managers need to proactively address issues as they arise, and managers need to

proactively integrate the comments of provincial and local implementers into the planning process.

Coordination with international partners. We recommend developing a rotating “roundtable” format to improve communication with international partners working on issues of migration, protection of women workers, and the prevention of trafficking. CP-TING should take the lead role for organizing regular roundtables, which can serve as a basis for information sharing among all relevant parties.

Streamlining procedures and training for management. We noted excellent project documentation, but were concerned that management requirements could act as a potential barrier to involvement of partners. We recommend a thorough participatory and consultative technical review of management procedures for future streamlining of these requirements, with the goal of continuing to ensure current levels of accountability and transparency while at the same time allowing for flexible implementation. At the same time, we also recommend further training in management for program partners, to better ensure understanding of the requirements of internationally-funded programs.

Awareness raising. We have noted strong efforts in awareness raising and strong support from television and other media in getting project messages across. We suggest that these efforts continue and have suggested additional strategies for reaching wider audiences.

Education. We recommend that the use of the project’s pilot materials, which are currently used as part of safety education in one province be further expanded to include all of the areas covered by CP-TING and similar projects. Moreover, to expand the impact, the project should work with education bureaus and teacher training colleges to develop a train-the-trainer model to expand in-service and pre-service teacher training on issues related to trafficking, safe migration, and workplace protection.

Research. We do recommend the dissemination of existing qualitative and quantitative research in a format that can serve the needs of policy makers and social organizations. Such research should include a systematic review of previously conducted research and other secondary data sources.

Direct services and technical backstopping. The project needs to devote more resources to strengthening direct services and developing replicable models through community centers, Women’s Federation village level outreach, and schools. The project should develop mechanisms to engage provincial backstoppers in more systematic ways and emphasis should be placed on developing a strengthened role for technical advisors in the development of outreach and social service models. Such models should identify needs and provide direct services and follow-up to the most vulnerable populations.

Engaging employers. In receiving provinces, these should include the development of corporate social responsibility activities and inclusion of employers in direct service pilot projects. Continuing this approach with more employers can create a win-win situation for employers and employees.

Strengthening inter-provincial linkages. Project partners should seek to actively participate in regional dialogue. Further efforts should be made to support the formalization of currently informal labor bureau links between sending counties and receiving cities, emphasizing the potential contributions to safe and orderly migration for decent work and combating trafficking.

Strengthening national and provincial steering committees roles. Project staff should periodically review direct service activities with the steering committee in the form of data, learning papers and presentations. Sharing this information with key stakeholders can contribute to further emphasizing core messages, changing attitudes, and improving government policies. Steering committees should also seek more active collaboration from line agencies and should seek to further integrate skills training with anti-trafficking through this project.

More focused work on policy impacts at the national level. CP-TING should more closely work with key partners of Women's Federation, the NWCCW, and the public security, labor and education ministries to monitor and follow up developments after the submission of the National Plan of Action for Anti-trafficking to the State Council. Further, the project should coordinate on a more formalized basis with international partners as well as National People's Congress and key ministries to conduct a series of activities aimed at policy impacts.

I. INTRODUCTION

A. PROJECT BACKGROUND

Antecedents of CP-TING. The *Project to prevent trafficking in girls and young women for labor exploitation in China* (CP-TING) has its direct antecedents in an earlier project implemented under the auspices of International Labor Organization's International Program on the Elimination of Child Labor (ILO/IPEC). That project, the *Greater Mekong Sub-regional Project to Combat Trafficking in Children and Women* ("Mekong project" or TICW), was implemented in 2000 in five countries in the Mekong river area. TICW project activities in China were conducted in Yunnan province and were implemented with the All-China Women's Federation (ACWF) acting as the lead Chinese organization.² The Mekong project made several important contributions to the conceptualization of anti-trafficking measures.

The Mekong project sought to complement the existing law enforcement efforts, to introduce concepts related to the prevention of trafficking, and to promote cooperation between police and those taking preventive measures. During the project's first phase in Yunnan, it became increasingly apparent that many persons, particularly young women, became victims of domestic trafficking, and that there was an important relationship between trafficking and migration from less economically developed inland regions to the more developed coastal areas. TICW project implementers learned that targeting trafficking only in the migrant sending communities was insufficient, and that strategies for dealing with the problem in receiving areas should also be developed.³ The Mekong project actively engaged the Chinese government as its primary partner, providing a strong role for a vice-governor as chair of a provincial steering committee, and engaging government and ACWF leaders as advocates for the project within the provincial government.

Designing the CP-TING project. In late 2002, representatives from ILO and ACWF met to consider strategies for replicating some of the good practices of the TICW Mekong project, including lessons learned from a Dutch Education initiative that operated in Yunnan under the TICW project, which focused on getting

ethnic minority girls back in school and in improving the school curriculum and teacher training.

² Countries participating in TICW are Cambodia, China, Laos (Lao PDR), Thailand, and Vietnam. During the first implementation phase (2000-2003), two rural counties in China's southwest Yunnan Province were involved. Both of these areas were categorized as migrant-sending areas from which people were migrating primarily to cities in Yunnan, other parts of China, or other countries in the Mekong sub-region.

³ During the second phase of TICW (2003-2008) more rural counties were added, together with two migrant receiving counties in Kunming, Yunnan's provincial capital.

TICW staff were intimately involved in the design of the China project, visiting Guangzhou and Hefei, providing numerous documentary materials that they had developed, and arranging for study tours so that Chinese partners could see TICW activities in other areas. In September 2003, TICW staff, with input from other ILO staff and national partners, began to design a similar project to address domestic trafficking issues. This design work was completed in a relatively short time-frame with the active support by ACWF at national level.

The CP-TING proposal was approved by the donor agency, the United Kingdom's Department for International Development (DfID) for implementation of a four year project beginning in 2004.⁴ CP-TING covers five provinces of China, including three labor-sending provinces (Anhui, Henan, and Hunan) and two receiving provinces (Guangdong and Jiangsu).

Country context. The China anti-trafficking activities of CP-TING have occurred during a period of an improving policy environment on a number of important fronts related to trafficking. First, the Chinese government has increasingly recognized migration as an important strategy for poverty reduction and income generation for rural workers, and has loosened legal restrictions on residence. Second, a variety of policy and legal instruments have been developed to further strengthen legal protections for migrant workers and to ensure that workers from rural areas have the same protections as urban workers. Third, the government is seeking to extend access to education through middle school and prevent dropouts throughout the nation. Fourth, China participates in the Coordinated Mekong Ministerial Initiative against Trafficking (COMMIT), a government process based on a signed MOU among the six Mekong governments to collaborate and cooperate in building a sustainable system of sub-regional cooperation against trafficking.

B. EVALUATION METHODS

Methods. Two evaluators, one from China and one from the U.S., began by conducting a desk review of project materials and telephone interviews with ILO-Geneva staff. After the desk review and prior to site visits, the evaluators prepared an evaluation instrument outlining the key questions for the evaluation. In early November 2006, evaluators met with project staff and key partners in Beijing for three days and conducted other telephone interviews with ILO regional and headquarter staff. Over the next week, they conducted visits to provincial capitals and project sites in Hunan (three days) and Guangdong provinces (four days). A stakeholder workshop was held at the end of the field visits in mid-November. At this workshop, the evaluation team presented major findings and recommendations and collected further input for the present report.

⁴ The ILO-IPEC proposal to DfID-Beijing, 20 January 2004, *Project to prevent trafficking in girls and young women for labor exploitation in China* is referred to as the 'project document' in this report.

Limitations of this report. The evaluation team was able to review materials from Anhui, Henan and Jiangsu and met with project staff from these sites at the stakeholders meetings. However, most of the conclusions and findings of this report are based on discussions during relatively brief site visits to Guangdong and Hunan. Although it was possible to draw a number of conclusions from these limited site visits with a relative degree of confidence, it is important to note that the sample of counties and cities visited represent only a portion of the implementation sites. A draft report was circulated in December 2006 to past and present project managers, IPEC's Design, Evaluation and Documentation Section in Geneva, relevant ACWF staff, and to the funder, the Department for International Development (DfID) of the United Kingdom. This current report integrates the comments received from key stakeholders.

C. ORGANIZATION OF THE REPORT

In the following chapters we describe the project and present our findings. In chapter II, we discuss the project design, paying particular attention to the logic and relevance of project objectives and the appropriateness of intervention strategies. In chapter III, on project management, we discuss the project's organization, its planning tools and methods, the formation of its management structure as well as issues related to monitoring, evaluation, and reporting. Chapter IV deals with project implementation in terms of its three intermediate objectives: 1) improving the knowledge base, advocacy efforts, and mobilization of partners and the community; 2) direct assistance to beneficiaries; and 3) improving the policy and institutional framework for the prevention of trafficking. Chapter V discusses project achievements, good practices, lessons learned, and challenges ahead. In chapter VI, we discuss our recommendations and conclusions.

II. PROJECT DESIGN

A. PROJECT OBJECTIVES

The overall development objective of the project is to *contribute to the elimination of labor exploitation of children and women, and in particular the trafficking in girls and young women in China.*⁵ Based on what can be termed an iterative logical model, information and knowledge bring about direct action and advocacy, and both in turn contribute to the development of an enabling policy environment for change.

Based on this logical model, three specific strategies were defined as follows: 1) the mobilization of key stakeholders and the development of a knowledge base on trafficking and exploitative labor practices; 2) the creation of models of direct assistance for migrant girls and young women; and 3) contributing to the development of national and sub-national policy frameworks and implementation capacity for the

⁵ For the purpose of the project, girls are defined as 10-15 years old; young women are 16-24 years old.

prevention of trafficking and labor exploitation. Stated in the form of intermediate objectives to be achieved by the end of the project, these strategies are as follows:

1. Key stakeholders will have been mobilized effectively to prevent trafficking in girls and young women for labor exploitation.
2. Integrated, effective and sustainable responses to trafficking in girls and young women for labor exploitation are in place both in sending and receiving areas and serve as models for future use.
3. National and sub-national policy frameworks and implementation capacity to prevent trafficking in girls and young women for labor exploitation will have been strengthened.

B. RELEVANCE OF DESIGN TO SOCIO-ECONOMIC CONTEXT

From the time of the project conception through the present (Dec. 2006), the basic design of the project continues to be highly relevant in the Chinese context. Project designers correctly acknowledge both the positive contributions of migration to economic development as well as the social and economic problems that have accompanied large-scale migration. Regarding the latter, rapid and massive migration of rural laborers,⁶ and the risks of trafficking of girls and young women for labor and sexual exploitation that accompanies such migration, continue to be important social problems.

The project document makes references to specific inter-provincial migration trends, and correctly targets activities in both migrant-sending and migrant-receiving areas. This is an important innovation in the design of trafficking projects, because it recognizes the important links between less economically developed sending areas and more economically developed coastal areas. Designers of the project document clearly specify the links between project objectives to a context in which rural to urban migration has dramatically changed the demography and social structure of contemporary China's rural and urban areas.

⁶ About 120 million rural migrant workers are employed in major urban areas in China, and if rural laborers working in towns and townships are included, the total number of rural migrant workers who have left home to find employment should be about 200 million, according to data released by the Research Office of the State Council in March 2006 based on a survey conducted in 11 provinces and municipalities over a period of ten months in 2005. According to the survey, rural migrant workers account for about 58 percent of the total number of employees in China's industries and the construction sector. The survey showed that 68 percent of employees in manufacturing and 80 percent of those working in the construction sector are rural migrants. 74.6% of migrant workers surveyed reported that they did not have any training; and pay was low, 30% with a pay of 300-500 yuan, 40% were paid at 500-800 yuan, and only 28% were paid 800 yuan or higher (~USD 100). Their working hours were mostly longer than 8 hours, with 40% of them worked between 8-9 hours a day, and 23% of them worked between 9-10 hours a day and 22% more than 10 hours. 60% of them used personal network of acquaintances or relatives, only 14% used job matching intermediaries, 12% found jobs themselves; Source: Xinhua News Agency (16 April 2006).

Project design principles also fit within the framework of key partners' efforts. These include the many recent major policy, implementation, and enforcement initiatives, which are increasingly being undertaken by the Chinese government agencies at various administrative levels. From the point of view of Chinese policy toward migrant workers from rural areas, there is a fit between the project goals and increasing government emphasis on promoting orderly migration, the expansion of formal systems of job-training and job-matching services, and the regulation of these sectors. Specific regulations for the protection of migrant worker rights have been strengthened, and there is an increasing policy emphasis on social protection and legal aid for migrants. At the same time, there are also major efforts to expand compulsory middle school education throughout the country and to reduce school fees for poor families. These governmental efforts are complemented by the work of the All-China Women's Federation to increase the social status and protection of women and children, and in particular their work with female migrants that continue to face difficult working conditions.⁷ The project capitalized on the many new policy opportunities by arguing consistently for a specific focus on those most vulnerable – i.e. young girls, in particular school dropouts with limited job opportunities.

Gender dimensions are clearly reflected in the specific emphasis on girls and young women. The project document discusses the role of preferential treatment of sons over daughters in the Chinese context and the resulting gender imbalances. It also recognizes the potential vulnerability of women using non-formal channels or ill-prepared “blind” migration in addition to “traditional” forms of trafficking such as trafficking for brides and illegal adoptions.

The project was also designed to incorporate several elements of the ILO's standards- and rights-based approach, with particular reference to implementing key principles of the Palermo Protocol;⁸ ILO Convention 182 on the worst forms of child labor and its accompanying Recommendation 190; the major tenets of ILO Employment Policy Convention (No. 122) emphasizing rights to “full, productive and freely chosen employment”; as well as to ILO's ongoing efforts in China to promote the ratification of Forced Labor Conventions (Nos. 29 and 105) aiming to eradicate “all work or service which is exacted from any person under the menace of any penalty and for which the said person has not offered himself voluntarily.”

⁷ According to a recent survey by the ACWF, half of female migrant workers in China are in irregular employment and most are employed in low-skilled jobs, which require physical strength and a young age. 40% of women migrant workers have signed labor contracts with their employers and very few of them have social insurance (23.8% have medical insurance; 19.1% have occupational injury insurance; 5.8% have pension insurance, 8.1% have unemployment insurance and 6.7% have maternity insurance). Source: China Youth Daily (22 November 2006).

⁸ Formally known as *The Supplementary Protocol to Prevent, Suppress and Punish Trafficking in Persons, Especially Women and Children*.

The trafficking project fits with, and contributed to the shaping of, the current draft ILO Decent Work Country Program⁹ both in terms of the Program's "promotion of safe migration channels to avoid situations of forced labor and trafficking in persons for labor," as well as to related issues of gender mainstreaming, the promotion of respect for fundamental labor rights of migrant workers, and integration of rural and urban labor markets contained in the Country Program. The project document is also explicitly linked to the DfID policy framework within the context of the Millennium Development Goals of poverty alleviation and promotion of sustainable livelihoods, investment in education, gender equality and empowerment of women.

C. APPROPRIATENESS OF STRATEGIES

The project document adopts a logical and coherent approach in addressing trafficking and labor exploitation. Drawing heavily on the experiences of the Mekong project, the project designers emphasized a process-based approach based on creating an enabling environment at the national and provincial levels within which direct service activities would be undertaken. They also outlined mechanisms for keeping higher-level stakeholders informed of the project, for participatory monitoring by girls and young women at-risk, and documentation of learning for replication and mainstreaming into policy frameworks.

Key elements of this approach included participation of all stakeholders from national to village levels, a holistic integrated approach linking awareness building, creating conceptual clarity regarding trafficking, and the generation of activities that contribute to goals of eradication of trafficking. The designers integrated gender components involving gender analysis in research, a child-focused strategy in which the views of girls, young women and their families are used in designing direct interventions, and mainstreaming gender issues into policy frameworks. In the paragraphs below, we discuss the main elements of the intervention and partner strategies.

1. Intervention strategy

The CP-TING model is a process-based approach through interventions in three main categories: capacity building and policy development; information, mobilization and advocacy; and direct assistance. Each of these categories corresponds to three distinct intervention strategies, namely *enabling*, *inclusive*, and *focused* strategies, as described below:

Enabling strategies of capacity building and policy development are designed to create an environment in which it becomes more feasible to effectively combat trafficking. At various administrative levels, enabling strategies include investment in developing frameworks, structures and coordinating mechanisms at

⁹ The project made presentations that were integrated into the Country Program during a meeting with the Chinese Government, workers organizations, employers' organizations, and key staff of ILO in mid-December 2005.

various levels of government, as well as training in a variety of subjects related to anti-trafficking and participatory methods. Examples of enabling strategies to combat and prevent trafficking include the identification of common ground between international and national legal frameworks on trafficking; strengthening of the capacity of Women's Federation staff and key implementing partners; the development of national policy frameworks; and strengthening of inter-provincial collaboration for improved migration management that benefits girls and young women at risk of trafficking.

Inclusive strategies of information building, mobilization, and advocacy are designed to increase the knowledge base on trafficking and labor exploitation, and mobilize partners within government and society to act as “change agents.” Information, mobilization and advocacy activities aim to harness knowledge and understanding to promote action, attitude change and commitment to combating trafficking at all levels. The targets of such activities include politicians and policy makers; discrete, identified target groups at national and sub-national levels; and families and communities at risk. Examples include the establishment of provincial steering committees; an emphasis on key conceptual concepts; the development of publicity events and materials that provide information on preventing trafficking; the integration of anti-trafficking materials into the educational curriculum; and research activities intended to strengthen the knowledge base related to trafficking.

Focused strategies for targeted community action at the grassroots level, through a series of participatory and context-driven activities designed to emphasize retaining girls under 15 in school, and promoting themes of safe migration for decent work for older girls (16-24 year old). The project was designed to clarify needs of beneficiaries, implementing partners, and government officials put a lot of effort into clarifying their different needs, and in the various forms (e.g. BEN) that were developed. Grassroots projects were designed to leverage and support existing government efforts, including labor exchange projects, vocational training, and education projects that supports girl students and helps to return dropouts back to school. The project seeks to work with after-school and community centers; employment and training centers; and employer-based education and training initiatives for migrant workers.

2. Partnership strategy

The project design recognized the need to develop partnerships and advocates within the government and with influential mass organizations to strengthen its impact through the guiding principle of “government at the center, the project as catalyst.” To this end, the design encompasses both a multi-level and multi-sectoral strategy, as well as coordination with a variety of other international and bilateral agencies and organizations and branches of the ILO. These are briefly summarized below:

- **Multi-level, multi-sectoral approach.** The project is ambitious in its design for the involvement of actors in at least five administrative levels. At the national level, the project works in partnership with the ACWF which is

a mass organization, and by extension involves the National Working Committee for Children and Women (NWCCW) under the State Council. It has a steering committee structure which involves 16 member units of which 14 are key line ministries including Education, Labor and Social Security, Public Security, with media and academic organizations included as observers.¹⁰ Similar coordinating structures were also developed at the provincial and municipal levels, with direct interventions implemented by sectoral partners at various levels through the district/county levels to township and village levels.

- **Coordination within the international development sector.** The project design calls for sharing of information and coordination among partners. These include international and non-governmental organizations such as Save the Children (UK), UNICEF, UNESCO, and the UN interagency project on trafficking (UNIAP), as well as other ILO projects involved in work related to domestic and international trafficking such as TICW, as well as forced labor, migration, HIV-AIDS education, and the protection of women's rights at the workplace. The project collaborated with UNICEF in conducting baseline surveys in receiving provinces; with UNESCO, UNICEF and the World Bank in the context of the Education for All Conference; and UNICEF, Save the Children (SC-UK), the UN Inter-Agency Project on Human Trafficking in the Greater Mekong Sub-Region (UNIAP)¹¹, and UNAIDS in inter-agency meetings on trafficking in China hosted by the National Working Committee on Children and Women; participated in an IOM meeting on migration and development in China, with a particular focus on internal migration; and with UNICEF and SC-UK co-financed the translation and printing of handbooks on participatory research methods and child participation. There has also been regular informal contact with the other projects against trafficking, particularly UNICEF, UNIAP, and SC-UK.

The project design reflects considerable planning and consultation with implementing partners. Although as we discuss below, the project encountered some delays at startup and during implementation, the goals and strategies outlined in the project document continue to be relevant and appropriate.

III. PROJECT MANAGEMENT

A. ORGANIZATION AND MANAGEMENT

As implemented in the first two years, and following the project design, ILO provided overall implementation and technical guidance for project management and financial and technical reporting to the funder. A chief technical advisor had overall project management duties, and was seconded by a national project coordinator from

¹⁰ See appendix for full listing of Steering Committee members.

¹¹ This project is also the Secretariat to the Coordinated Mekong Ministerial Initiative against Trafficking (COMMIT).

the Women's Federation. In addition to project staff in a national office within ILO-Beijing, five field offices were established, each with a provincial project coordinator and a project assistant. The Deputy Director of the ILO office participated in all recruitments, and the project was able to recruit very competent staff. Provincial project coordinators are Women's Federation staff, and project assistants were recruited primarily from the private sector as ILO staff.

In July 2004, a national management office was in place in ILO's Beijing offices and in five provincial offices established on the premises of provincial Women's Federations. By the end of 2004, provincial steering committees were operational and in March 2005, a national steering committee was established and held its first meeting. The national steering committee is chaired by the vice-president of the ACWF. Its major functions are: to provide policy guidance for anti-trafficking interventions; advice on priority areas for project activities; to work toward mainstreaming issues related to preventing trafficking; to integrate project interventions into other national anti-trafficking efforts; to review and endorse action programs for submission to ILO for final approval; to provide support and guidance for activities conducted by implementing agencies; and to facilitate the sharing of information between the national and provincial levels.

In each province, steering committees were comprised of representatives from a number of line agencies and organizations with a vice-governor as the chair. This format was also replicated with leading groups at city and county levels chaired by vice-mayors. According to all respondents, these structures played a strong role in mobilizing government and political will, incorporating as well as guiding the incorporation of trafficking into the work of key agencies such as labor, education, public security, railroads, and media and research organizations.

The project has also sought to establish a system of 'technical backstopping' in each of the provinces, and these efforts are discussed in a later section. In addition to the in-country technical expertise, the Bangkok regional IPEC office at the regional level provides project oversight. Technical assistance to the project has been provided by child labor, gender, international labour standards, education, disability, and research specialists. ILO units such as IPEC-Geneva's vulnerable groups, forced labor, and migrant units, also provided technical expertise to the project.

B. MANAGEMENT IMPLEMENTATION

The project encountered some initial difficulties during startup, many of which were fairly common in new projects. Early difficulties related to issues such as language barriers, the introduction of new management tools and processes, and the lack of data related to trafficking. In general, these problems have been adequately addressed during the implementation period, although the third issue, related to data

collection and analysis, is still being addressed. This section also briefly discusses small project¹² financing and a recent project reorganization.

Translation and interpretation. At the project's startup, managers realized that there were insufficient staff for the relatively heavy translation and interpretation requirements of the project. This problem was fairly quickly remedied as a result of the funder's rapid approval for an additional bilingual staff member at the Beijing project office. Soon after project startup, project design and financial reporting guidelines were also written in Mandarin. For example, the project translated the IPEC Program Operations Manual and adapted it when possible to the Chinese context, by adding standard forms and by adding explanatory notes.

Project design and planning frameworks. Partners were initially unfamiliar with logical framework planning and its focus on objectives, indicators and targets as opposed to activities planning. To remedy this, the project office developed a set of design guidelines in English and Mandarin emphasizing logical framework planning and objectives. In the second half of 2004, project staff also conducted a series of training workshops on themes such as project design, project management, participatory approaches to development, a review and discussion of relevant international and national laws against trafficking, and the development of core project messages. The guidelines were put into use in October 2004, when partners met to further develop provincial logical frameworks and work plans with an initial list of interventions, and a monitoring framework. By June 2005, the project was in full implementation, and with nearly 50 small projects approved and begun, the project began receiving wide media coverage.

Lack of accurate data on the magnitude of girls at risk of trafficking. In early 2005, with technical support from ILO statisticians, CP-TING staff worked with statisticians and researchers from each province to agree on research objectives, questionnaire design, and survey enumeration areas in both sending and receiving areas. Data collection under the baseline surveys covering 8,700 households in the five provinces was undertaken. Progress on these studies was delayed due partly to project reorganization, as well as to other factors. The research contents and methods in design were not fully compatible with the Chinese context and appeared complicated to local women's federations and their partners who lacked relevant experiences. Moreover, limited funding from the project made local women's federations' coordination with some partners difficult. Despite these delays, local project staff and partners were able to submit research results in January 2007. The research has given the Women's Federations and their partners the opportunity to gain experience, to fill some gaps in data and in overall design of the project, and to contribute as useful reference materials for the sustainability of the project.

¹² The term *small project* in this document covers the range of funding mechanisms used by the CP-TING project to finance activities, including action programs (AP), mini programs (MP), special programs (SP), service contracts (SC), and external contracts (EX).

Financing small projects. In general, there is strong financial commitment for the project both from ILO and from Chinese partner agencies. As of June 2006, the last period for which aggregate financial data was available, Chinese contributions totaled over \$US 750,000, which substantially exceeds the planned levels of financial contribution. In one province, Guangdong, local funding has matched donor funding at a 1:1 ratio. Disbursement of funding has been relatively smooth, although some small project funding for action programs in particular, have often undergone several rounds of revisions, a process that can take as long as three months.

Project Reorganization. In part due to a perception that communication should be improved between the ACWF and the ILO project office, in June 2006 the project underwent a reorganization that established a joint national project office (JNPO) and offices under provincial Women's Federations. Important objectives of restructuring were to allow the ACWF to give a better guidance to the project, to fulfil its rights and obligations to the project management, and to ensure that the project operated in line with the Chinese context. At the national level, ILO's chief technical advisor and the national project coordinator now share joint responsibilities for management of the project, including technical input and guidance, project activity approval, and progress monitoring and reporting. Overall project supervision is to be jointly shared by the ILO-Beijing director and the Director-General of the ACWF's International Division. Provincial project offices will be responsible for overall management and implementation of provincial projects within previously agreed planning frameworks. Women's Federation provincial project coordinators will remain in their current posts, but project secretaries, originally hired under direct contract with the ILO, may now be hired through an agreement with provincial women's federations as part of action programs.

Project synergies. Although the project encountered some start-up difficulties, it has effectively capitalized on a variety of links, synergies, and complementarities. Examples include a high-level Education for All meeting in which the project established a link with the Ministry of Education that later resulted in the publication of a handbook on life skills that is being pilot tested in Anhui, Henan and Hunan; its assistance in bringing greater attention to migrant workers as reflected in State Council documents; its contribution to drafts of the National Plan of Action; its collaboration with UNICEF and Save the Children, which resulted in joint funding of translation and printing of two widely used handbooks that on action-oriented research and child participation as well as joint funding of baseline surveys in Guangdong and Jiangsu with UNICEF.

C. PLANNING INSTRUMENTS

The project adopted a planning structure using a hierarchy of four planning and management tools. *Logical frameworks* (logframes) are used as planning and management tools for internal project management; *National and provincial programs* and *work plans* are intended to guide project implementation; and *small project plans* are tools for planning and managing concrete activities. Each of these planning tools is briefly described below:

- **Logical Frameworks.** As with most ILO projects, CP-TING used a logical framework as its basic planning tool. A logical framework matrix for the entire project was developed during the proposal processes and updated over the course of project implementation. In late 2004, the national office provided two separate logical framework templates for each of the provinces, one for sending and the other for receiving provinces. Based on these templates, each of the provinces then developed their own matrices, tailoring them to local conditions and priorities. These matrices linked to the overall project by allowing each of the five provinces to develop province-specific local frameworks that contributed to a national framework, increasing provincial-level “ownership” and understanding of the project.
- **National and Provincial Programs.** Based on their own logical frameworks, provincial partners created provincial programs that spell out core activities over a 4 year period in order to facilitate better understanding and easier implementation. A national program was developed in 2005 and updated in August 2006.
- **Work Plans.** Project partners developed national and provincial work plans, which were generally intended to coincide with biannual or annual reporting periods.
- **Small projects plans** for discrete sets of activities were planned and implemented by Women’s Federation and other partner agencies such as labor, education, railroad bureaus, and research institutions with coordination and technical support from provincial or national project offices.¹³ All planned projects through 2006 have been implemented.

Most ILO projects use logical frameworks, work plans, and small project plans, but national and provincial programs are used to convert the logical framework matrices into a more readily understandable format for local implementers. We view the logframe planning approach as essential for enhancing partner organization’s capacity, and believe that further efforts in training and facilitating Chinese partners to use this important planning methodology at the macro-level continue to be necessary.

The various provincial action plans are linked to each other. Each province has an action program (AP) on research, and these findings are intended to inform policy change at the provincial level. There are also action plans for coordination, mobilization and capacity building within each province, as well as outreach action plans that target girls through a particular set of interventions. In sending provinces, there are APs for education that include an outreach component, using the life skills training manual, and teacher training; there are AP dealing with an integrated set of other interventions such as girls’ homes, village recreational activities, regular

¹³ Each small project also used a logical framework approach to develop its overall goal, intermediate objective, outputs and concrete activities, and has its own budget. There are distinct requirements, budget limitations, and approval process for each type of small project.

awareness raising, monitoring and skills training, and safe migration management). In receiving provinces all outreach interventions are integrated in one AP. The integrated APs for outreach and direct assistance generally have a component of drop-in centers for migrant girls.

Integrated APs in both sending and receiving provinces are designed so that girls who are trained and then migrate safely from the sending province are placed in decent work in one of the target cities in the receiving province, where their conditions are monitored. Many other small initiatives feed further into this set of interlinked APs. For example, educational materials such as the *Xiao Yu* and *Xiao Wei* booklets are intended to both make for safer migration and to stimulate debate in the ACWF and MOLSS on shortcomings in current service levels. Similarly, participatory monitoring tools are intended to help partners develop and improve responses based on learning by doing.

We did however note that there was room for further streamlining the AP process. For example, each small project also uses a mini-logframe planning method, which may not be necessary. As an example, all of the Action Programs use nearly the same introduction and background sections, and most contain similar justifications. There are now 22 action programs, and each of these entails a substantial investment time and energy to meet formal requirements. This has caused complaints from the provincial offices that an inordinate amount of time is consumed with “paperwork,” leaving less time for field work on the ground and potentially detracting from more important work of providing a solid local vision for, and ownership of, the project. Although we believe that explicit links should be made in small project application to logframe objectives, and that small projects should be specific in their descriptions of activities and the roles of implementers, this process can be further streamlined.

In terms of budget planning for small projects, ACWF indicated that they felt that preliminary budgeting was overly prescriptive, and that certain types of expenses that are fairly typical in project and research work, such as offering research participants small gifts or nominal sums of money for participation, were also generally not allowed costs. Although careful budgeting is important within a context of limited resources, the extreme case of “over-designing” during the budgeting process can reduce the flexibility of partners in implementing activities. While we strongly support the need to continue to ensure current high levels of accountability and transparency through supportive documentation of reasonable costs, we believe that during the budgeting phase of small projects, a more generalized line-item system can allow for more flexible implementation.

D. MONITORING, EVALUATION, AND REPORTING

Project reporting. Several sources, including small project reports and provincial reports are consolidated into biannual reports for ILO-Geneva and DfID. In general, we noted a high quality of documentation of project activities at all levels, and consistent progress in the documentation of learning in small projects describing specific processes and outcomes. We believe that this reflects both the substantial

efforts of project management and a strong sense of local “ownership” of activities at local levels. However, implementing partners currently perceive some reporting requirements, particularly those for small projects, as time consuming. In at least one case, a provincial office was unable to recruit an important partner in their activities because of that partner’s perception of reporting as onerous relative to the proposed funding amount.¹⁴

Project monitoring and evaluation. Monitoring tools for measuring services to direct beneficiaries were developed or modified for use by the project in 2006, and include (1) a beneficiary card for each assisted girl; (2) a ‘zero and end measurement form; and (3) participatory monitoring tools.

- **Zero and end measurement** is intended to provide a snapshot of conditions in the locality before and after the direct assistance interventions have been conducted, and are to include data on the population at risk, the existing figures on trafficking and other risk factors, and examines capacity development in the project partners.
- **Beneficiary cards (BEN)** are intended to assess risk, to calculate the number of girls and young women that have received assistance, and to assess the effectiveness of assistance by monitoring over time the degree to which these individuals are at risk of trafficking.
- **Participatory monitoring tools** use techniques to engage the projects’ target groups and gauge their views, knowledge and awareness on issues related to trafficking and safe migration and data are intended to aid in the design and shape more effective direct assistance.

Because these tools have only recently been introduced for project use, we are not able to fully assess their utility. We do however note the following general concerns with project monitoring:

- BEN data are intended to be used for two primary purposes: 1) developing direct assistance activities appropriate to beneficiaries; 2) providing information for monitoring beneficiary services and outcomes. According to the project design, direct assistance experiences would then be reviewed and good practices extracted in the development of working models for replication. Perhaps partly because beneficiary cards have only recently been adopted, local implementers have not yet relied heavily on data from the BEN cards in the design of direct services.
- In sending provinces in particular, because intervention areas are comprised of relatively large administrative villages, distances can be large, and transportation is a major issue in tracking and monitoring beneficiaries.

¹⁴ The provincial coordinator in Anhui had wanted to recruit the railway bureau in publicity activities, but was unable to do so because of reporting requirements.

High mobility among beneficiaries adds to the difficulty in longitudinal tracking and follow-up in both receiving and sending provinces.

- Some numerical indicators reported lack obvious meaning, and it is often difficult to make direct or causal connection between numbers of beneficiaries served or reached and social impact in terms of anti-trafficking. If qualitative methods such as the participatory tools recommended by the project are more fully utilized, this problem may be alleviated.

IV. PROJECT IMPLEMENTATION

A. DEVELOPMENTS DURING IMPLEMENTATION

To a much greater extent than when the CP-TING project proposal was being prepared in 2003, several important policy events have created an improved policy environment for trafficking prevention.

- In 2004, six ministries¹⁵ jointly launched the “sunshine training project” (laodongli zhuan yi yangguang gongcheng) to provide training for the large number of surplus rural laborers migrating to cities and towns. Since the launch of the project, a total of 8.3 million rural migrant workers have been trained with 7.2 million of them employed, an 87% success rate. Trained workers have an average salary of 833 yuan, an estimated 200 yuan higher than those without training.¹⁶
- In 2005, The Ministry of Labor and Social Security announced that free employment centers for rural laborers would be established in urban areas across China, as part of a “Spring Breeze Action” that designated public employment service centers and cracked down on illegal employment intermediaries.
- Also in 2005, the Ministry of Education released its “Guidelines on further promoting a balanced development of compulsory education,” with the aim of mobilizing more local government revenues for compulsory education in rural, poor and mountainous areas. The government promised fee exemptions for 30,000 families in 592 of the poorest counties and allocated 10 billion yuan (US\$ 1.2 billion) to build 7,730 boarding schools in 955 counties across the country to accommodate the 2 million students. Vocational schools were scheduled to increase enrolment by one million annually for three years.

¹⁵ Ministries of Labor and Social Security, Education, Agriculture, Science and Technology and Finance.

¹⁶ Source: People's Daily, November 11, 2006.

- In some receiving areas, such as Guangdong, public security bureaus have established local rental management offices for the regulation of rental housing, most of which are rented to migrant workers.
- The Chinese government has reiterated its ban on employment of child laborers and the issue of protecting the rights of women and underage employees. Moreover, it has called for equal treatment of migrant workers, respecting and safeguarding their legal rights, and removing discriminating regulations and systematic obstacles in order to enable them to enjoy the same rights and responsibilities as their urban counterparts. In March 2006, the State Council put forward several proposals for addressing social protection issues relevant to rural migrant workers and established a Leading Group on Migrant Workers.
- In the State Council Resolution No. 5 of April 2006, the Council recognized the major problem of safeguarding the rights of these workers who face the problems of low and often delayed pay, long working hours, poor safety conditions, lack of social security, occupational diseases and industrial accidents and injuries, and difficulties in training, the schooling of children of migrants, and living conditions. Trade unions were also urged to protect rights of migrant workers.
- An Inter-Ministerial Committee on Migrant Workers, located within the Ministry of Labor and Social Security, was established to oversee the extension of social security and social services to migrant workers. The focus of the leading group and office is to establish a social protection regime for migrant workers including a critical examination of deficiencies in existing arrangements and a study of proposals that have been offered by the Chinese government and international lending agencies for extending social security coverage. Specific issues to be addressed include: labor market integration and social protection; migrant participation in social security schemes; migrant alternatives to state-sponsored social protection; and migrant working conditions, salaries and wage arrears. In some receiving provinces, migrant worker offices have been established from the provincial level down to the county and district levels.

The project took these developments as opportunities. Within the context of these government opportunities, the project argued consistently for attention to young girls with a low level of education, distinguishing between the needs of girls under 16 and those aged 16-24, and the creation of separate educational and informational materials for these groups (e.g., ‘Xiao Yu’ and ‘Xiao Wei’ booklets targeting different age groups). A project web site also includes information in English and Mandarin and with visuals and short bits of text, and the ACWF web site now also has information on trafficking and the CP-TING project.

B. PROJECT ACTIVITIES AND OUTPUTS

The development objective and intermediate objectives as conceived in the project proposal have remained fixed throughout the implementation period. Each of the six logical frameworks and programs (in each of the five provinces and at the

national level) developed somewhat different outputs and activities within the context of the project's objectives.

In the sections below, we present an aggregated description of the various outputs and activities at both national and provincial levels. Although component activities can contribute to several objectives, for ease of exposition and analysis, we describe outputs and activities in terms of the project's three intermediate objectives. As one example, awareness raising, although it is most explicitly treated under the first intermediate objective, also plays an important role in the delivery of services to beneficiaries and in creating a changed policy environment.

1. Knowledge base, Advocacy, and Mobilization

Two key outputs, enhancing conceptual understanding of issues related to trafficking and labor exploitation as well as improving the knowledge base on trafficking through research are discussed below.

a) Conceptual understanding

The traditional concept of trafficking in China involves the abduction and sale of human beings, especially women for marriage and children for illegal adoption. This is certainly still an important issue in China. In the current society however, much of the trafficking is for labor and sexual exploitation. The project has added important new dimensions to this traditional understanding by introducing the international definition of trafficking within public discourse.¹⁷ However, one of the obstacles to promoting a broader conceptual understanding of the problem is linguistic. Because the two character Chinese word used to translate the English word 'trafficking' literally means 'abduction and sale,' building conceptual clarity around broader definitions was initially difficult. However despite this obstacle, small projects financed through CP-TING have strongly contributed to building greater conceptual understanding through the following illustrative activities:

- **Provincial steering committees** were established early in the project as one means of promoting wider inter-sectoral understanding of trafficking as involving labor and sexual exploitation. These are chaired by Vice-Governors, who play a crucial role of the in mobilizing key actors within each province.
- **Analysis of Chinese Criminal Code and Labor Law.** During a September 2004 meeting in Guangzhou, project staff and approximately 45 officials discussed conceptual issues in an analysis Chinese Criminal Code and Labor Law in light of the three core elements that constitute trafficking in the Palermo Protocol. They learned that there is much more common ground between international and Chinese understanding of these issues

¹⁷ The international definition of trafficking includes the labor dimension, and an understanding that trafficking can take place in a broader labor migration where "blind" or non-informed migration may result in trafficking.

than previously thought, and this contributed to further government mobilization.

- **Local focal point training** has emphasized key conceptual concepts as well as objective-oriented project planning for grassroots activities.
- **Publicity events** such as Women's Conferences (e.g., in Hunan), and those held during International Migrant's Day, International Women's Day, and most importantly the Spring Festival, which is the heaviest travel period for most migrants, have received wide media coverage and have been documented in great detail at provincial project offices.¹⁸
- **Publicity materials** that include information on preventing trafficking and telephone hotlines for reporting trafficking incidents have been published and widely distributed at key transportation hubs such as railway and bus stations, particularly during the periodic campaigns described above.
- **In sending areas**, manuals for potential migrants have been distributed to girls and young women; informal and formal links have been established with receiving areas; and partner round table meetings have been organized to develop models for replication.
- **Educational materials** in the three sending provinces, have integrated an anti-trafficking chapter into the safety and life skills curriculum. This has been piloted province-wide in at least one province (Anhui).
- **Awareness raising activities** have involved students, governmental leaders, and the general public in both sending and receiving areas in a variety of activities including plays and skits, designing posters and other art work, and contests in singing, speech, racing, and calligraphy.
- **Participatory monitoring with target group girls** had a two-fold purpose. Not only did it contribute to monitoring efforts, but developed a sense of empowerment and active engagement among girls. Prior to the design of several direct assistance action programs, project staff conducted focus group discussions and engaged children through a series of events in discussing how they perceived trafficking problems and solutions. As a result, girls in Anhui and Guangdong put forward suggestions on reaching out to out of school children.

¹⁸ The project has documented several hundred separate media reports, including television broadcasts, website articles, newspaper articles, and other special publications. These are documented in biannual reports, and each provincial project office maintains a detailed archive of media coverage. Shenzhen, for example, implemented a large-scale awareness raising event on trafficking prevention for women and children at the railway station, bus stations and labor markets. During this period, volunteers distributed 126,000 copies of various brochures on trafficking free of charge and provided counseling for more than 10 thousand rural workers. About 100 migrant women filled in the feedback forms offering a variety of suggestions for direct assistance.

b) Research

Research activities were intended to strengthen the knowledge base related to trafficking. Information stemming from this research can be used to increase broader understanding and awareness of the problems as well as to mobilize the government and mass organizations to creating an enabling policy environment.

The project began with secondary data analysis, which was instrumental in selecting target provinces, counties, cities, townships and villages. This was done prior to the government developing its Spring Breeze program, which sought to strengthen public employment service centers and discourage illegal employment intermediaries, and many of the cities selected for this program correspond with those under the project. There were also in-depth studies on the opinions of migrant girls regarding formal versus informal channels, which were intended to help shape the available services in such a way that they would become more needs-based.

The project has also implemented two research projects in each of the five targeted provinces: one quantitative and the other qualitative. In Hunan and Guangdong, the two provinces the evaluation team visited, research was conducted by government institutions and academic institutes. Although project reorganization during the first six months of 2006 delayed research activities, as of the mid-term evaluation in November 2006, the first draft of research findings and recommendations had been submitted to the provincial project office and were awaiting technical appraisal at the provincial government level. Full details of research findings are not yet available, but preliminary findings include important information on the relatively safety of formal versus non-formal channels and major types of exploitation encountered by young female migrant workers.¹⁹

Despite these advances, major gaps in knowledge about trafficking and labor exploitation still remain. Some of these gaps are certainly beyond the scope of any one project to fill, and research in both sending and receiving areas will likely require

¹⁹ Guangdong researchers shared some preliminary findings at the level of the four focal point areas, but were not prepared to discuss aggregated findings at the time our site visit. During our site visit to Hunan, researchers indicated that their survey research (319 completed surveys out of 350) demonstrated that 63% of the women in their sample used 'non-formal' migration channels, and showed no statistically significant difference in the relative safety of "formal" and "non-formal" channels of migration. Among the 40% of women indicating having encountered some form of harm (38.4% of those using non-formal channels; 44% using formal channels), 74% cited sexual harassment, 52.7% cited wage arrears, and 47.3% cited poor working conditions. The Hunan data, particularly if similar findings are made in other locations, has very important policy implications. Before their research was undertaken, it was hypothesized that women would be more at risk using non-formal channels. Contrary to this hypothesis, the Hunan research, which also included 15 in-depth interviews, demonstrated women's bad experiences and mistrust of formal channels, and their belief that informal networks based on friendship or kinship relations can often provide better support. This research therefore suggests a need to: 1) expand and better regulate formal channels; 2) provide formal support to women using informal migration channels; and build linkages between these two types of migration channels.

major concerted funding efforts. However, once the current round of research has been carefully analyzed, there are likely to continue to be important research contributions that the project can make, including analysis of other research through careful literature review, and identification and implementation of further ethnographic and sociological research that can serve as models for larger research projects.

2. Direct Assistance

In all five provinces, direct assistance activities were conceived to deliver services to girls and young women to lower their risk of becoming victims of trafficking. Although major activities were originally planned for the second and third implementation years, because of delays due in part to project reorganization, some activities are at an earlier stage than originally anticipated.

Many of the grassroots projects visited by the evaluation team were implemented in combination with other government-funded projects. In most cases, the project sought to support existing efforts, including labor exchange projects, vocational training including the “Sunshine” project, and education projects such as the Women’s Federation-sponsored “Spring Bud,” which supports girl students and helps to return dropouts back to school. An important element of project efforts, and one which was built into the beneficiary card system, is helping to identify existing government social services for the target group and improving access to those services.

Development and implementation of a range of focused direct assistance interventions observed or discussed during the site visit include the following:

- **In schools in sending and receiving provinces**, publicity activities include speech contests, calligraphy contests for government workers, the general public and students; education initiatives incorporating anti-trafficking into safety and life skills in-class training; and activities supporting the return of dropouts back to school. This effort has been particularly strong in Guangdong, where the Women’s Federation has adopted the motto “One more child in school, one less child in the factory.”
- **In targeted areas within sending provinces**, trafficking prevention measures within target counties, township and villages have included appointing village women leaders to work part-time for trafficking prevention in the village. Sharing of information on trafficking and training has also been instituted for Women’s Federation representatives at the village level. After-school and community center women and girls’ “homes” have been established; and publicity and mobilization for trafficking prevention for villagers including the production of entertainment shows with traffic prevention messages.
- **Employment and training centers.** Training and employment centers in both of the provinces visited have integrated trafficking and safety messages into their curriculum. Project support leverages government investment

through the Sunshine project (Hunan employment and training center) and private investment (employment center in Shenzhen).

- **Community activity centers in receiving provinces** (shequ huodong zhongxin) publicize traffic prevention, conduct training sessions for volunteers and community center staff, and are in the early stages of building a participatory monitoring network for the follow-up of identified beneficiaries.
- **Employer-initiated education and training for migrant workers in-factory women's colleges** (luidong funu xiexiao). In one shoe factory that we observed in Shenzhen, management has initiated training programs in which safety, legal and anti-trafficking messages are integrated into technical degree education (zhongzhuan and dazhuan).
- In Guangdong, the **Female Entrepreneurs Association**, using a large matching contribution from employer funds, created and distributed a brochure "Things Migrant Women Workers should know" with feedback cards for migrant girls and young women. They collected 800 cards detailing migrant women's expectations of enterprises and government.

As discussed earlier, Action Programs are often linked to each other. For example, education programs typically include an outreach component, use the life skills training manual, and teacher training; these activities are also often part of an integrated set of other interventions involving girls' homes, recreational activities, awareness raising, monitoring and skills training, and safe migration management. In receiving provinces, there are also usually drop-in centers for migrant girls.

The project has only recently begun delivering direct assistance to direct beneficiaries. Although we note some potentially promising practices, particularly in the identification of beneficiaries and in the awareness-raising components of direct assistance, more work is required to conceptualize social service models for providing individualized social skills and job-related counseling services to young migrant women in both sending and receiving areas. Although the project design had called for the development of working models of service delivery in years 2 and 3, models are only beginning to emerge, and direct service activities need to be further refined before these experiences can be consolidated into lessons learned for the next two years of project implementation.

3. Institutional and Policy Framework

The third project objective encompasses two parts: institutional capacity building and achieving wider policy impact by improving existing policies and institutional frameworks at national, provincial and sub-provincial levels.

In an earlier section on project management, we described the nature and function of provincial and sub-provincial level steering committees and leading groups, which have met twice a year since 2004. The project partners established links and leveraging resources in a number of ways. ACWF played a key role by sending a letter to the five provinces to establish provincial steering committees

comprised of high level officials. Provincial Women's Federations contributed by encouraging Vice-Governors to chair these committees, which helped to mobilize all key departments at the provincial level. Provincial Vice-Governors then wrote similar letters to target cities and counties, and in most cases also asked for financial contributions to complement forthcoming government funding. Research findings, exposure to field projects and initiatives, participation in trainings and meetings helped to clarify key concepts – e.g. links between education, migration management and trafficking, or the role that railway bureaus could play in fighting trafficking. National level officials from the NWCCW, the Ministries of Education, Labor, and Public Security also maintained contact with their provincial counterparts after meeting with project staff at the national level and this contributed to advocacy and mobilization efforts that are gradually leading to policy change.

During the project's first year, technical backstoppers were identified, and have organized training sessions to sensitize committee members on trafficking prevention, process management, and gender issues. More such training is also envisioned in the next period of implementation, and will include the establishment of management and service mechanisms for safe migration between sending and receiving provinces; establishing information centers and information-sharing mechanisms on trafficking and related issues; and further promoting government to issue relevant policies to ensure safe migration of girls and young women. The national steering committee has focused primarily on trafficking as it relates to issues of national policy and legal frameworks through a series of seminars and workshops with national steering committee members. One of the key activities of these workshops was the identification of common ground between international and national legal frameworks on trafficking.

As a result of these actions and participation in the project, the capacity of Women's Federation staff and some key implementing partners has been strengthened. There is now a better understanding of social development planning, process management and reporting. In particular, there is now a stronger understanding of logical-framework based planning and the documentation of learning in reporting. In terms of policy impacts, many recent changes in policy that have been documented in previous sections of this report, although not directly attributable to the project, have resulted in greater awareness of the problems and risks associated with massive migration, including greater attention to the special needs of young girls with low education levels. There have not yet been any specific changes in the legal definition of trafficking, but there are positive signs, including government policy documents and public statements, that the increased knowledge and awareness at various key levels of society and government will lead to further legislative and policy reforms.

Inter-provincial collaboration. Because of its design, which targets both sending and receiving provinces, the project has contributed to the understanding that more inter-provincial cooperation is necessary to combat trafficking and promote safe migration for decent work for girls aged 16 and up and education for those under 16.

Important discussions on this topic included a December 2005 Changsha meeting on safe migration as alternative to trafficking, which was a collaborative initiative between ACWF and ILO and included participation of the Labor Ministry, railway bureaus, Women's Federation bureaus and private sector, and helped pave the way for the spring festival campaign and involvement of railway bureaus.

Other important efforts have been undertaken through regional bodies such as the Pan-Pearl Delta Cooperation Conference), and in November 2006, 29 cities along the Yangtze River Basin signed an agreement to establish a rights protection system for rural migrant workers, to abandon discriminative regulations on rural migrant workers, and to jointly establish a social security system for rural migrant workers. Links between labor bureaus at various administrative levels in both sending and receiving areas have also been established including links between receiving employment centers and some vocational schools in sending areas. Some Hunan counties, for example, have established such links in receiving municipalities in Guangdong through existing local government representation (banshichu) in major rural migrant receiving cities such as Shenzhen and Dongguan. These local offices provide migrants with help with difficulties including labor conflicts.

National Policy Frameworks. The examples of inter-provincial cooperation represent important progress toward the protection of migrants. However there still remains a need for social security systems to be developed at the national level so that migrant workers can contribute to and receive benefits from the system, in either the province in which they work or their home provinces. There is also some remaining work to be accomplished within the legal framework. Whereas the international definition of trafficking includes a labor dimension and recognition that trafficking can take place within a broader labor migration framework, there have not yet been any changes in definitions of trafficking within Chinese law. CP-TING has, however, contributed to practical understanding of the international definition within key ministries, and a key individual within the NPC legal commission has stated his personal acceptance of the international definition and may promote these concepts for legislation in future years.

Although it is difficult to ascertain the project's specific contribution to strengthening China's rights protection system, it has consistently emphasized the need to reach out to vulnerable groups, and that rights do not only include rights of victims to protection, but also the broader rights to development opportunities to prevent girls from becoming victims of trafficking. Moreover, successive drafts of the National Plan of Action to Combat Trafficking have increasingly recognized the labor exploitation dimensions, and the CP-TING project has helped to incorporate several aspects of trafficking prevention and the labor exploitation dimension into the latest draft.

V. PROJECT PERFORMANCE

A. MAJOR ACHIEVEMENTS

To date, the project has made substantial contributions to the prevention of trafficking along several closely related dimensions. These include developing

conceptual clarity related to broadening the concept of trafficking; building general awareness of the problem; contributing to the knowledge base on trafficking and related issues of labor exploitation; building institutional capacity for the prevention of trafficking; and contributing to policy change.

Conceptual clarity. Through the organization of a variety of campaign and publicity activities targeted to government, employers, the general public and direct beneficiaries, the project has substantially contributed to shifting the focus of traditional trafficking concepts to address new dimensions of trafficking in young women and girls for labor exploitation. This new focus fits with the country's current social realities related to the increasing migration of rural laborers, a large percentage of whom are young women. Government representatives from various sectors of national, provincial, and lower levels, as well as representatives from the communist party, mass organizations, and academic institutions, demonstrated a very good understanding of new dimensions of trafficking and of the general seriousness of the problems faced by women and other migrant workers, and that trafficking interventions should not only focus on rescue of victims and prosecution of traffickers, but also on devising effective prevention and rights protections measures for rural migrants.

Awareness raising. Adequately addressing the problem of trafficking requires a substantial shift in attitudes as well as actions through awareness raising, information and skills training, and other social services. Awareness raising, through the effective mobilization of government officials and the media, has certainly been one of the most important and successful outcomes of the project within a relatively short period, and is closely allied with the growing consensus linking trafficking and labor or sexual exploitation. Additionally, drawing on some of the key concepts developed during project implementation, Women's Federations, Working Committees on Women and Children, and labor and education ministries and bureaus at national, provincial, and municipal levels have all increasingly provided public information through their websites on topics related to employment opportunities, safe migration, and trafficking. The knowledge base and information campaigns supported by the project have contributed to wide publicity exposure and awareness raising on trafficking within both the government and the general public. Moreover, there has been strong media involvement, particularly tied to specific periodic campaigns. The breadth of media coverage in terms of number of newspapers and television channels, as well as the depth of coverage, both in the provinces that we visited as well as within other target provinces, is impressive.

Knowledge and Information. In each of the five targeted provinces, the project commissioned quantitative and qualitative research studies. Although the findings and recommendations of these studies were still in the technical review and appraisal process at the time of this evaluation, research teams visited as part of the current evaluation have already identified some important findings on the relation between channels of migration and risks of exploitation. Although research findings have not yet been completely analyzed in all provinces, based on the data that was available at the time of this evaluation, we anticipate that the findings from research in five provinces will contribute to greater understanding about migrants' age, sex,

migration channels, destinations, experiences with trafficking or labor and sexual exploitation, and will provide deeper insight into the views of young women migrants.

Institutional Capacity. At provincial and lower levels, overall capacity of the Women’s Federation and some key implementing partners, especially labor and education bureau staff, has been strengthened. In addition to a stronger awareness of the new dimensions of trafficking in China’s migration context, these partners, and Women’s Federation staff in particular, have developed a better understanding of social development planning, process management, and reporting. Specifically, there is now a stronger understanding of logical-framework based planning, and an increasing capacity in monitoring and evaluation, and the documentation of learning in reporting.

The project also developed simple guidelines in a range of areas aimed at building capacity at different levels. Examples include a “Rights, Responsibilities and Representation” (3R) manual on gender issues for social workers that deal with target group children and includes a clear focus on trafficking. This manual, which was developed by the ILO gender specialist in Bangkok with the contribution of funds and technical expertise by four projects including CP-TING and TICW, includes participatory exercises which are designed to empower youth to make better decisions regarding migration, jobs, sex, and relationships. Other guides cover topics such as child participation, dealing with media, basic data collection, participatory project design, advocacy, and process management.

At national level, the ACWF has strengthened its capacity to devise strategies, policies and laws to combat trafficking. Through their involvement in a number of steering committee meetings, seminars, and workshops related to trafficking, the National Working Committee on Women and Children, the Ministry of Education, the Ministry of Public Security, and the National People’s Congress have also deepened their understanding of issues related to gender and exploitation. However, other ministries including Labor and Agriculture are somewhat less involved, and continued efforts should be made to more deeply involve these potentially key ministries in forging an anti-trafficking coalition.

Policy impacts. Although it is certainly not possible to directly attribute policy impacts to the project, we believe that the CP-TING project has substantially assisted in raising the profile of exploitative and trafficking practices and has contributed to government awareness of the need to promote safe and orderly migration and protection of rural migrants’ labor rights. Moreover, although there have not yet been any specific changes in the legal definition of trafficking, there have been many encouraging signs, including important national and provincial government policy documents and official public statements on issues related to the safe and orderly migration, labor management, migrant’s children education, and the protection of migrant’s rights and interests.

For example, a National Plan of Action on Trafficking is currently being drafted, and other policy documents have been introduced to raise awareness of the

need for social protection of children and women in Chinese society. These include National Plans of Action for children and women respectively, and provisions to expand social security and social services for rural residents and migrants. The development of this national plan, which has been submitted to the State Council for approval, indicates both a political will and a desire on the part of the government to deal seriously with trafficking issues, particularly within the context of rural to urban migration. A further promising sign is that members from the Law Commission of the National People's Congress have, albeit unofficially, acknowledged their understanding and acceptance of international definitions of trafficking, providing an indication that reform of legal definitions may follow in the coming years. Another direct contribution from this project was its technical assistance and comments on various drafts of the national plan of action to combat trafficking submitted to the State Council for approval by the Ministry of Public Security and other key ministries.

B. GOOD PRACTICES

“Government at the center” and the five-layer network. The project has correctly recognized the government as a driving force for social change. Through changes in policy and public statements, government can promote change among employers, rural migrants, and the public at large. The project has used several ways to approach the government. Horizontally, the project persuaded government sectors to form steering committees or leading groups; it directly involved various sectors as partners to carry out project action programs and mini-programs; and it incorporated its activities into government-funded projects in labor exchange, education and training. Vertically, the project helped to construct an effective network spanning five administrative layers from the national level through provincial, municipal, county and community levels to directly work with the project in dealing with issues of trafficking and migration of rural migrants. This network approach links grassroots demonstration learning to higher level policy interventions to produce a converging force to combat trafficking.

Integration of the project with other governmental initiatives. Many of the project's action programs build on and provide additional support for existing and new governmental initiatives. Examples include the integration of trafficking and safe migration messages within the labor exchange, “Sunshine” (yangguang gongsheng) rural migrant vocational training, and schools targeting migrant children in receiving areas and children in sending areas. This integration of the project helps to mobilize community involvement and to involve a variety of partners in raising awareness of several facets related to trafficking, deceptive practices, blind migration, illegal employment, violation of migrant worker's rights and interests at the workplace, and the problem of school dropouts.

Political and financial support. The project has gained strong political support from the government, and in particular from vice-governors and vice-mayors at provincial, municipal and county levels, who head steering committees and leading groups, which help to coordinate activities and guarantee the involvement of relevant sectors in the project. Further evidence of strong support is the commitment of

substantial funding by government, ACWF, and employers for implementation of project activities.

Bottom-up and open approach. The project has used a bottom-up and open approach to promote involvement of project partners from grassroots to higher levels in developing project ideas and activities into action programs. This approach promotes a fit between activities and local situations and “ownership” of these activities among local implementation partners. However, there is still some room for the project to more deeply involve direct beneficiaries’ participation in the design of programs.

Awareness raising and media coverage successfully contributed to the promotion of project core messages. Although awareness raising is by itself an important objective, it has also played a key role in furthering other project objectives, particularly in influencing policy. The involvement of media in awareness raising has further strengthened the outcome by reaching wider areas than the geographic areas the project covered. Students and parents that we interviewed in one sending province indicated that coverage of the topic of trafficking in television and other media has substantially increased awareness of the topic down to the village level. We believe that the combination of a wide range of publicity and mobilization activities, combined with media coverage, has exceeded the expectations of the project design.

Donor role. The project funder, DfID has been supportive and flexible in allowing the project to adjust to the realities it has encountered, including hiring of extra staff to help with translation and interpretation, as well as providing management a “sounding board,” and offering helpful advice throughout the implementation period.

C. LESSONS LEARNED AND CHALLENGES

1. Lessons learned

Overcoming language and cultural differences. The project re-organization in 2006 was to a significant extent caused by language barriers and differing cultural and management practices and styles. To avoid similar problems in the future, due attention needs to be given to devising strategies to overcome these problems at the earliest possible time, including ongoing consultation on management practices and the roles, responsibilities, and concerns of all parties. In particular at the national level, projects operating in China should not underestimate these barriers, and in their design should make adequate provisions for recruiting professional staff with proficient language and facilitation skills to promote interactions between international and Chinese partners. Particularly in a project with many field activities in several provinces, regular two-way communication should be strengthened.

Careful planning of systematic backstopping. Backstoppers at the provincial and lower levels have been trained in project planning and monitoring methodologies, but because there are no longer-term contract mechanisms, they are often unavailable to facilitate the design and implementation of local small projects. During the second

half of project implementation, a review of future potential contributions of backstoppers is suggested.

Planning Tools and Methods. For many ILO and other international projects, the logical framework has become the basic planning tool. In this project, and most projects, unless the national and local partners already have experience with the logframe development process, the formulation of logframes tends to be a difficult and time-consuming task, and in the case of the CP-TING one that took several months to develop. However, in most projects including CP-TING, national and local partners may already have substantial experience with planning processes. In the case of the CP-TING project, provincial partners had experience in developing program plans to develop activities, although in this process, activities may not necessarily be *explicitly* linked to desired outcomes. One lesson that we can draw for international projects in general, is that rather than beginning immediately with the logical framework process, which is the current international practice, it would be have been more efficient for planners (in this case particularly at the provincial level, which was the major focus of planning activities in the early stages of project implementation) to present and discuss local planning processes before the logical framework concept is introduced. Only after all planning partners have thoroughly understood local planning models, the logical framework concept can be introduced, and partners could jointly explore commonalities and differences in these approaches.

Simplifying action planning. Based on the information from the field, a typical action program required 3 to 4 rounds of proposal drafting, revising and finalizing and took about 3 months for planning, design and approval. Provincial project offices had to spend considerable time and energy to get the right content and correct formatting of their proposals. An extreme case of an AP containing 11 outputs and 50 more individual activities made it difficult to achieve even during a one year implementation period.

Challenges with data collection. Due to the remoteness of target villages in sending provinces and high mobility among female rural migrants, data collection for these direct beneficiaries is a challenging task that requires considerable effort and transportation costs. Other aspects of data collection are even more challenging—for the five provinces in which the project is operating, there is still a dearth of data on the seriousness of trafficking for labor and sexual exploitation, and on what progress and impacts the project has made to date. To answer these questions, more sociological research is needed.

VI. CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

A. CONCLUSIONS

Overall project implementation has been relatively smooth, and has closely mirrored the project's design as well as subsequent logical frameworks, work plans and small project plans. Although project reorganization in early 2006 caused some delay in implementation of research and certain action programs, the effects of these delays have been minimal and the project is back on track. The reorganization is not likely to affect achievement of project goals and objectives, particularly if

communications between Joint National Project Office and provincial offices continue to improve.

The project continues to be very relevant within the context of government priorities of better serving the needs of rural migrant workers and their families in terms of promoting safe and orderly migration; protecting migrant worker rights in general and those of women as a vulnerable group in particular; and promoting expansion of coverage of compulsory education, especially for the children of migrants and poor rural families.

Although the evaluators did not conduct a formal efficiency analysis, the project, with substantial local contributions was able to successfully implement a wide range of project activities and garner excellent media coverage. Project effectiveness varied depending on the objective. We found the project highly effective in raising awareness of the problems of trafficking among government, research organizations, and the general public in target regions. Its multi-layer, multi-sectoral approach promoted awareness raising among institutions including cooperating partner agencies and organizations, as well as among the broader public and direct beneficiaries. Also, in terms of institutional and policy frameworks, we found that government bodies have been mobilized through the steering committee structure, and that recent policy changes, as well as government statements and public speeches that indicate further change in policies and legal frameworks are very positive.

However, we also note that the project has been weak in providing pilot services to beneficiaries based on their needs and views, although we do anticipate that services will improve as the direct assistance components of the project mature and the findings of the qualitative surveys and beneficiary cards can be applied. Moreover, we still see a need for further research to generate more knowledge about trafficking and anti-trafficking developments, which in turn may encourage further policy impacts.

In terms of sustainability, we see a strong likelihood that actions undertaken by the project and participating agencies and organizations will continue after the project is phased out. The sense of “ownership” of the project is high, particularly among the key political and economic sectors including the Women’s Federation, as well as labor, education, and public security bureaus, enterprises and unions. Although there is still a need for further capacity building in project management and sharing of information among service providers, the Women’s Federation and other key stakeholders have internalized the key concepts and are extremely likely to continue this work after the implementation period ends.

As a result of project work in awareness raising, mobilization and advocacy, the government is now paying greater attention to issues related to trafficking in young women and girls for labor exploitation. Government bureaus of education, labor, public security, and the Working Committee on Women and Children have incorporated anti-trafficking for labor exploitation into their work in skills training, safety education, helping dropouts return to school, as well as in a variety of publicity,

information and legal aid provided to beneficiaries. Moreover, policy and legal frameworks will very likely continue to reform in these areas in the coming years.

The overall performance of the project has been highly satisfactory and the project has a high likelihood of achieving its intermediate objectives and contributing to its long-term development goal. Challenges in addressing the root causes of trafficking including the social instability that has resulted from income gaps within the society will continue to require a multifaceted approach, reinforcement through legal action, and economic action.

The project can contribute to these goals by strengthening its direct assistance activities. The development of effective working models of direct assistance for replication in other parts of China in both sending and receiving provinces should therefore be a major priority for project activities during its second half. Some good examples of outreach and service to beneficiaries are emerging, but more conceptual work is needed to develop workable models to target the most vulnerable and hardest-to-serve beneficiaries. Particular attention should be given to conceptualizing grassroots level direct assistance based on existing and future data obtained from beneficiaries and the development of a social service model with input from experienced social workers, Women's Federation development, counselors, and job and career development specialists. On the policy level, particularly at the national level, more efforts should be made to strengthen advocacy by developing strategies to involve more steering committee members. These two factors will be the key to safeguarding sustainability of the program.

B. RECOMMENDATIONS

1. Project Management

Communications between the Joint National Project Office and provincial offices. Regular communication between the project's national and provincial offices should be strengthened. Project managers need to proactively address issues as they arise, and managers need to proactively integrate the comments of provincial and local implementers into the planning process. As much as possible, important communications should be in Chinese and translations should be made using the resources of project assistants at national and provincial offices in a coordinated way.

International partners. Although there have been several instances of good collaboration between the project and international partners such as UNICEF and Save the Children, we recommend developing a rotating "roundtable" format to improve communication with international partners working on issues of migration, protection of women workers, and the prevention of trafficking. CP-TING could take the lead role for organizing regular roundtables, which can serve as a basis for information sharing among all relevant parties. CP-TING should also provide organizational support for the COMMIT Inter-Ministerial meeting on trafficking, which is scheduled to occur in Beijing in 2007.

Monitoring, Evaluation, Budgeting and Reporting. Although we noted excellent project documentation, reporting requirements should not be so onerous that they act as a potential barrier to involvement of partners; and overly prescriptive preliminary budgeting can reduce the flexibility of partners in implementing activities. We therefore recommend a thorough participatory and consultative technical review of management procedures for future streamlining of planning, budgeting, monitoring, and reporting. Outcomes of the review should respect the need for appropriate information at all levels (DfID; Chinese government; and ILO-IPEC) and the need to continue to ensure current levels of accountability and transparency while at the same time allowing for flexible implementation in line with realities at the provincial and lower levels.

2. Project Implementation

a) Knowledge base, advocacy and mobilization

Awareness raising. We have noted strong efforts in awareness raising and strong support from television and other media in getting project messages across. We suggest that these efforts, which have successfully spotlighted high-level government participation in mobilization campaigns, continue. We also would suggest some additional strategies. Most broadcasts have occurred at provincial and municipal levels, and we believe that at the county and lower levels, local television can also be an effective means of communication to reinforce the project's core messages. Wider audiences interested in popular fashion and trends, may also respond well if in addition to government leaders, high-profile media personalities such as actresses and actors, models, singers, athletes participated as a public service in televised advocacy efforts to protect migrant women's rights. In general, however, the project needs to build on and move beyond its successful awareness raising and publicity work. This success in awareness raising for key stakeholders has attracted attention of the government and yielded some positive signs of policy change related to women and children's protection and worker migration.

Education. Pilot materials have been developed in the three sending provinces and are currently used in Anhui province as part of safety education. We recommend that this practice be further expanded to all of the areas covered by CP-TING and similar projects (including the Mekong project in Yunnan and UNICEF's work in Sichuan). Moreover, to expand the impact, the project should work with education bureaus and teacher training colleges to develop a train-the-trainer model to expand in-service and pre-service teacher training on issues related to trafficking, safe migration, and workplace protection.

b) Research

Although project funded research has made important contributions in some cases, at the time of the mid-term evaluation field work, there were still major gaps in basic knowledge of the depth and breadth of the labor and sexual exploitation and trafficking, although we understand that research projects have since been completed and submitted for review. We are aware that the project is in its final year, and that more in-depth research is not within the scope or budget of the project. We do

however recommend the dissemination of existing qualitative and quantitative research in a format that can serve the needs of policy makers and social organizations. Such research should include a systematic review of previously conducted research (e.g., major research by others on migration has recently been conducted in Shenzhen) and other secondary data sources.

c) **Direct assistance through pilot projects**

Direct Services. The project needs to devote more resources to strengthening direct services and developing replicable models through community centers, Women's Federation village level outreach, and schools. Current efforts in direct services can be best termed as nascent or embryonic models rather than as mature models, and the links between needs assessment and service delivery concept and strategies are relatively weak. For this reason, more research on beneficiaries' views and needs should be conducted, and service activities should be developed based on this information. In addition to strengthening conceptual models for later replication, project management needs to promote intensive consultation with provincial offices and technical backstoppers on the development of services.

Management Training. Project coordinators and assistants should be intimately familiar with both national and international project planning and management practices. There is still a need for more systematic project management training for implementing partners in the areas of planning and implementation, monitoring and evaluation, and impact assessment.

Training would contribute to making the links between international practices and national practices more easily understandable and would increase the likelihood of sustainability of the project approach. We therefore suggest the following four targets for training:

- **High level study tours** on a cost-shared basis for those (vice-) governors and mayors already heavily involved in the project in target areas. This would promote better understanding of how other countries have dealt with trafficking, would potentially widen policy impacts, and would contribute to sustainability.
- **Training in project management** on a cost-shared basis for provincial project staff.
- **Training for provincial steering committee members** in gender theories and principles for gender-sensitive policies. These should include at a minimum training in gender and development and gender planning.
- **Grassroots training.** In targeted sending counties there should be training on trafficking and direct services for Women's Federation representatives down to village levels. In receiving provinces, similar training should be developed for district leaders and educators, managers in charge of in-factory women's colleges (luidong funu xiexiao), and community centers. Emphasis should be placed on development of a better understanding of

wider social-economic context of gender, especially as it relates to trafficking, labor exploitation, and forced prostitution.

- **Learning exchanges.** The project should promote provincial and regional exchanges between service providers among grass-roots service delivery workers both within individual provinces and between sending and receiving provinces with ILO anti-trafficking interventions (5 CP-TING provinces and Yunnan) to share experiences and good practices in direct service delivery.

Technical backstopping. Provincial and local backstoppers played important, if only periodic, roles during the early phases of implementation particularly during publicity and mobilization campaigns. Now that the project is entering into a period which will require a greater emphasis on direct services, a more regular use of the backstopping functions, as opposed to only periodic use, will be essential in helping to plan for effective models of direct service interventions. The project should therefore develop mechanisms to engage provincial backstoppers in more systematic ways. A pool of technical assistants with a good range of qualifications in mobilization and policy implementation should continue to be identified and used. The strongest emphasis, however, should now be placed on developing a strengthened role for technical advisors in the development of outreach and social service models. Such models should identify needs and provide direct services and follow-up to the most vulnerable populations.

Engaging employers. In receiving provinces, these should include the development of corporate social responsibility activities and inclusion of employers in direct service pilot projects. As was demonstrated in the factory we visited in Shenzhen, continuing this approach with more employers can create a win-win situation for employers and employees, helping to reduce recruitment costs due to high rate of employee turnover.

Strengthening inter-provincial linkages for developing models. Formal links are currently being developed in the Pan-Pearl Delta and Yangtze regions. Project partners from Hunan and Guangzhou should seek to actively participate in the Pan-Pearl Delta cooperation conference scheduled for 2007 in Hunan to highlight project goals, and partners from the other three project provinces should explore similar regionally based opportunities. Further efforts should be made to support the formalization of currently informal labor bureau links between sending counties and receiving cities, emphasizing the potential contributions to safe and orderly migration for decent work and combating trafficking.

d) Policy and institutional framework

Strengthening national and provincial steering committees roles. To promote greater and longer-term impacts on Chinese government policies for anti-trafficking, the project needs to strengthen national and provincial steering committee roles in mobilizing the government for improving policy and legal frameworks. Project managers and coordinators should be well prepared to brief steering committees not only on local developments, but also on research and information

about trafficking and combating trafficking developments of target provinces as well as other parts of the world. Project staff should periodically review direct service activities with the steering committee in the form of data, learning papers and presentations. Sharing this information with key stakeholders can contribute to further emphasizing core messages, changing attitudes, and improving government policies. Steering committees should also seek more active collaboration from representatives of Agriculture Bureaus in sending provinces because of their important role as the lead agency for the Sunshine Migrant Training Project, and should seek to further integrate skills training with anti-trafficking through this project. Because of high levels of domestic investment in the Sunshine Project, this could also provide an important source of domestic contribution for relevant project activities and increasing its prospects for sustainability.

More focused work on policy impacts at the national level. The project has made substantial progress in integrating new dimensions into the concept of trafficking in China. Nevertheless there are still legal difficulties in more effectively addressing the issue of trafficking in law enforcement due to the existing definition of trafficking. CP-TING should more closely work with key partners of Women's Federation, the NWCCW, and the public security, labor and education ministries to monitor and follow up developments after the submission of the National Plan of Action for Anti-trafficking to the State Council. Further, the project should coordinate on a more formalized basis with UNIAP, UNICEF, Save the Children, UK, TICW-Yunnan province as well as National People's Congress (Chinese legislative body) and key ministries to conduct a series of activities aimed at policy impacts. These may include information sharing through newsletters, workshops, forums, roundtable meetings. The project should also provide assistance to work with UNIAP in preparation of Inter Ministerial Meeting scheduled to be held in Beijing in 2007, and continue with its planning a side event for children, preceded by provincial level children's forums, to seek children's opinions on problems and solutions.

VII.APPENDICES

A. TERMS OF REFERENCE



**INTERNATIONAL PROGRAM ON THE
ELIMINATION OF CHILD LABOR**

TERMS OF REFERENCE

**Basis for
Contract
October 2006**

FOR

**Independent Mid-Term Evaluation
(October 2006)**

**Preventing trafficking in girls and young women for labor exploitation
within China**

ILO Project code:	CPR/04/P01/UKM
TC Code :	P27013318001 (IRIS : 12326)
Financing Agency:	UK Department for International Development (DFID), China
Type of Evaluation:	Independent Evaluation
Geographical Coverage:	China, in particular Anhui, Henan & Hunan ('sending' provinces) and Guangdong & Jiangsu ('receiving' provinces)
Project Starting date:	1 April 2004
Project Ending dates:	31 March 2008
Date of Evaluation:	October 2006
Total Project Funds of Donor:	GBP 3,075,000

I. Background and Justifications

Project Background

Massive numbers of people migrate within China - given enormous population pressures in rural areas that face 150 million surplus laborers, and rapid economic development along the east coast. The Chinese Ministry of Agriculture estimated that 94 million Chinese farmers migrated for work in 2002. Though men constitute the majority of the migrant labor force, the percentage of women is quickly rising, especially in the younger age group. However, uninformed and ill-prepared migration leaves them vulnerable to being lured into unacceptable work. The girls and young women that have dropped out of school prematurely and that lack the skills to find jobs in rural areas are the most at risk of being trafficked. Trafficking has many faces, but all forms severely violate the rights of children and women, hinder their development, and prevent them from becoming productive adults.

Despite a dearth of data, sources in the Ministry of Public Security confirm an increase in the number of cases of trafficking into the 'entertainment' sector, in particular in the age range 16-20. Provincial data from Anhui, Henan and Hunan confirm that they are major 'sending' provinces that are proposed to be covered by the project, along with two major 'receiving' provinces - Guangdong and Jiangsu.

It was in the context of the growth in trafficking, global recognition of the need for concerted action to combat it and the introduction of instruments in which to articulate ILO's specific strengths and experience, that the project known as TICW (Combating Trafficking in Children and Women in the Greater Mekong Subregion) was launched in February 2000 under the auspices of ILO's International Programme on the Elimination of Child Labor (IPEC). The project covered Cambodia, Lao PDR, Thailand and Viet Nam, and Yunnan province of China. DFID South-east Asia covered the entire budget of USD 4.4 million for the period February 2000 - May 2003.

The TICW-project has been operational in Yunnan Province of China since July 2000 and currently in its second phase. A letter of agreement between the All China Women's Federation (ACWF) and ILO (signed on 20 June 2000) enabled the creation of a project office in Kunming (Yunnan Province) and the start of operations.

Starting from scratch the project facilitated the creation of a provincial steering committee composed of all key bureaus including the Public Security Bureau, Labor Bureau, Education Bureau, ACWF, Agricultural Bureau, Finance Bureau, Statistics Bureau, etc. The committee discusses policy issues, selects target sites for pilot interventions, reviews project proposals for endorsement, and contributes to monitoring of project interventions.

The selected sites for pilot interventions (in the period 2001-2003) were Jiangcheng County of Simao Prefecture and Menghai County of Xishuanbanna Prefecture. The overall strategy of the TICW project was to 'build up a process-based approach through three groups of interlinked interventions (capacity building, awareness raising and direct assistance) and working at all levels: community, district, provincial and central government, in the target areas.

Authorities in Beijing were kept abreast of project progress throughout the period 2000-2003 - amongst others through a liaison officer based in the ACWF in Beijing. The ACWF in Beijing was so pleased with project progress in Yunnan Province that they hosted a 'National Replication Meeting' in October 2002 where Yunnan-based project partners and the TICW-project team presented project learning to an audience of about 150 participants from 8 different provinces and national level. This event that was co-sponsored by the ACWF, signified the

positive commitment of the ACWF to combat trafficking and provides an important starting point for possible expansion of interventions into areas other than Yunnan Province.

Project achievements in Yunnan Province were identified as¹:

1. Mainstreamed trafficking-prevention approach (including inter-ministerial collaboration, improved access to existing services, government financial contributions);
2. Recognition at national level through a replication meeting in Beijing where the Yunnan-based project was asked to present its' way of working and achievements to date, and willingness in five provinces to replicate project experiences;
3. Reduced trafficking in children and women in target communities through awareness raising and mobilization, children participation, and livelihood assistance;
4. Documentation to inform Phase-II;
5. Stakeholders' capacity built on trafficking issue.

An independent mid-term evaluation of the first phase TICW-project took place in November 2001 and amongst others visited China. The Mid-term evaluation concluded that 'the political, procedural and conceptual foundations of the project are strong and that, with some attention to strategic direction and learning, there is considerable potential to achieve purpose within a second phase of five years'.

The mid-term evaluation report and subsequent work with stakeholders in the five countries (including those from Yunnan Province) resulted in a Phase-II proposal covering the same four countries plus Yunnan Province of China. The proposal was accepted by DFID South-east Asia and a budget of USD 9.2 million covering the 4 countries plus Yunnan Province was made available for the period June 2003 – May 2008.

The final evaluation report of phase I of the TICW-project states amongst others that 'the TICW-Project has found that intensive work at district and provincial levels has provided a profitable entry point from which to generate commitment and policy change at national level. This 'functioning middle' also validates and gives weight to pilots carried out at local levels'.

Following three years of pilot interventions in Yunnan Province under the TICW-project and funded by DFID-SEA, the Chinese authorities were keen to apply the learning from Yunnan in the five provinces - Anhui, Henan and Hunan (sending provinces) and Guangdong and Jiangsu (receiving provinces) - and work towards a national policy and implementation framework that is currently virtually absent.

In collaboration with the ACWF, the Ministry of Labor and Social Security, a range of other ministries and representatives from the mentioned five provinces, a new ILO-IPEC project of "The China Project to Prevent Trafficking in Girls and Young Women for Labor Exploitation (CP-TING)" was designed. The CP-TING project is a 4-year partnership between the International Labor Organization (ILO) and Chinese government and non-governmental agencies and is implemented in close collaboration with ACWF. The project is funded by the United Kingdom's Department for International Development (DFID) China.

The project focuses on preventing trafficking into sexual exploitation, forced labor or slave-like practices, such as organized begging, work in sweatshops and illegal factories or domestic service in a poor working environment, or work without pay or freedom. The project is primarily targeted on the most vulnerable group – girls and young women at risk of trafficking for labor exploitation within China.

Within the five provinces, target counties, townships and villages were selected for direct assistance based on their high rates of migration, high drop-out rates and under-developed

¹ See 'ILO TICW-project, Yunnan project good experience notes' (2002) for more details.

education system. It is anticipated that the outcomes, lessons learned and good practices from these pilot interventions will be incorporated into improved trafficking prevention policy frameworks at the local, provincial and national levels.

The project and its partners focus on preventing trafficking and its end results, i.e. labor exploitation and the worst forms of child labor. A multi-dimensional approach is employed to reduce the vulnerability of girls and young women by addressing the shortcomings in human capital, information, support services and managed migration mechanisms.

Interventions vary depending on the intended beneficiaries. Strategies are tailored to meet the specific needs of girls aged 10-15 and young women aged 16-24, in sending and receiving provinces, and according to different local conditions.

For at-risk girls aged 16-24 the CP-TING project does not seek to either encourage or discourage migration, but aims to stop the abuses inherent in migration by developing safe migration channels as an accessible alternative to 'blind' migration. For at-risk girls under 16 the project discourages migration and promotes prolonged education and training.

Project implementation effectively started with the arrival of the CTA in May 2004 at which time a national project management office was set up in ILO premises in Beijing, followed by the creation of five provincial offices in Anhui, Guangdong, Henan, Hunan and Jiangsu.

In line with the project document an internal review of the CP-TING project was held at the end of the first year of operations, in April 2005. The review listed 36 achievements and grouped them under 6 core themes (i.e. set up project infrastructure; training/capacity building; results of training; knowledge base; awareness raising, advocacy and conceptual clarity; results of advocacy). A review of the 36 achievements resulted in identifying the following eight items as most crucial for the project's progress:

1. High level NSC/ PSC/ County Committees (or 'Leading Group') set up;
2. Provincial Planning Frameworks (logical frames) developed;
3. Secondary data analysis conducted;
4. Core messages developed and used;
5. Substantial amount of media coverage;
6. Conceptual clarity on anti-trafficking among stakeholders, which could be classified as:
(1) the concept of "trafficking" gets clarified; (2) awareness in the importance of "trafficking prevention" gets raised;
7. Obtained counterpart funds from the government;
8. Partners/Stakeholders mobilized;

The review also discussed bottlenecks/concerns and challenges ahead, and identified ways of addressing them. During the second year of implementation the project team worked with the documented learning from the internal review.

In recent months the ACWF and ILO negotiated a restructuring of the project management, internally within ACWF and with ILO. The negotiations resulted in an agreement between ACWF and ILO that spells out the new structure and working processes. The major change is the formation of a 'joint national project management office' (JNPO) in the ILO building, with staff of ACWF and ILO that jointly plan and support implementation of project activities, and secondly, the integration of provincial project offices into provincial women's federations under the leadership of Provincial Women's Federation Presidents, and with technical guidance by the JNPO.

Strategic Objective and Immediate Objectives of the Program

Development Objective:

The global objective of all ILO-IPEC projects is the elimination of child labor, giving priority to its worst forms. In pursuit of this, the Development Objective of the project is to contribute to the elimination of labor exploitation of children and women, and in particular the trafficking in girls and young women in China, through the development, implementation and monitoring of effective and integrated national and provincial strategies and actions.

Immediate Objectives (IOs):

The Project has three Immediate Objectives designed to contribute to the development objective. Each objective revolves around a specific category as follows:

Category 1: Knowledge base, advocacy and mobilization (inclusive)	IO 1	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ By the end of the project, key stakeholders will have been mobilized effectively to prevent trafficking in girls and young women for labor exploitation.
Category 2: Direct assistance through model interventions (focused)	IO 2	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ By the end of the project, integrated, effective and sustainable responses to trafficking in girls and young women for labor exploitation are in place both in sending and receiving areas and serve as ‘models’
Category 3: Policy & institutional framework (enabling)	IO 3	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ By the end of the project, national and sub-national policy frameworks and implementation capacity to prevent trafficking in girls and young women for labor exploitation will have been strengthened

These Immediate Objectives are to be achieved through six key outputs, which will result in the establishment and further development of sustainable and replicable mechanisms and services to combat trafficking in China - subject to the risks and assumptions specified in the Logical Framework (see the Project Document).

The six key outputs are:

IO 1	Output 1.1	Strategy developed and implemented within each project province and nationally for sound conceptual understanding of trafficking¹ and its effective interventions by key stakeholders
	Output 1.2	Gaps in research and information relating to trafficking in girls and young women for labor exploitation identified (including baselines for focused interventions), and responses to these identified and addressed by key stakeholders
IO 2	Output 2.1	Pilot projects of community-owned preventive interventions undertaken and monitored for impact, evaluated, and documented for replication within sending provinces (Anhui, Henan and Hunan Province)
	Output 2.2	Pilot projects of ‘city neighborhood-owned’ preventive interventions undertaken and monitored for impact, evaluated, and documented for replication in urban centers of Jiangsu and Guangdong Province (receiving provinces)

¹ This should include common understanding of the international definition of trafficking including the labor dimension, and an understanding that trafficking can take place in a broader labor migration framework where ‘blind’ or non-informed migration may result in trafficking.

IO 3	Output 3.1	Provincial and lower level policy frameworks, structures, processes and staff skills to prevent trafficking in girls and young women for labor exploitation reviewed and improvements suggested – including sound migration management arrangements between sending and receiving provinces ¹
	Output 3.2	National policy framework, structures, processes and staff skills to prevent trafficking in girls and young women for labor exploitation reviewed and improvements suggested - based on sub-national experiences and realities (output 3.1) and new conceptual understanding (output 1.1)

There are inevitable overlaps and linkages among the three categories, since the project is designed holistically within an overarching strategic framework. Given the experience with the TICW-project it is expected that strong links among the three objectives will help to materialize the development objective of the project. Efforts have hence been made to cross-reference activities in the section below.

Under the above three inter-linked objectives, there are four cross-cutting themes:

Cross-Cutting Themes
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Effective pro-poor government policies and initiatives (including vertical and horizontal linkages; linkages among sending and receiving areas; and a perspective that trafficking is a multi-faceted issue that should be understood in a broader labor migration framework)
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Mainstreaming and sustainability with a view to Chinese stakeholders increasingly assuming leadership to prevent trafficking;
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Child and youth centered approaches where their views and needs are considered at all stages of project implementation for needs-based responses.
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Gender equality considerations in both approaches and actions.

Background to the Mid-Term Evaluation

The project is half way through the current phase and would greatly benefit from a mid term evaluation of progress made towards achieving its objectives. This evaluation needs to be conducted as agreed in the project document and is mandatory for ILO-IPEC projects. DFID is also required to undertake a mid term review at this juncture to determine project progress and its continued support.

The evaluation will be an opportunity to assess progress, and assess whether the project is still relevant, capitalizes on opportunities and moves in the right direction. Also, it offers an opportunity for learning from experiences and considering suggestions for improvement.

¹ I.e. between Anhui and Henan & Jiangsu; and between Hunan & Guangdong.
Preventing trafficking in girls and young women for labor exploitation within China (CP-TING)

II. Scope and Purpose

Scope

The scope of the evaluation includes all project activities from April 2004 to date including Action Programs. The evaluation should look at the project as a whole and address issues of project design, implementation, lessons learned, possible replicability and recommendations for the future of the project. It should also focus on the interaction of the project with the broader context, both locally, provincially, nationally and institutionally (within ILO and the UN system). The midterm evaluation should also look at the extent to which the project is contributing to discussions on human trafficking and migration.

Purpose

The purpose of the mid-term evaluation should be to:

- whether the objectives of the project were achieved by comparing the intended outputs with the actual outputs;
- review and analyze factors contributing or hindering the project's success (including their nature and magnitude);
- the overall impact of the project at different levels such as at policy level, beneficiaries level, community level and household level

It should also analyze strategies and models of intervention used, document lessons learned and potential good practices, and provide recommendations on how to integrate these into planning processes and implementation of future IPEC activities in China. A particular focus should be to identify elements of emerging effective models of intervention and suggest ways to further strengthen and document these.

The results of the MTE are furthermore expected to serve as a learning tool for stakeholders involved in trafficking prevention programmes, in particular in China.

III. Suggested Aspects to be Addressed

The evaluation should address the overall ILO evaluation concerns such as **effectiveness, efficiency, relevance** and **sustainability** as defined in the *ILO Guidelines for the Preparation of Independent Evaluations of ILO Programs and Projects* and for gender concerns see: *ILO Guidelines for the Integration of Gender Issues into the Design, Monitoring and Evaluation of ILO Programs and Projects, January 1995*.

The followings are the broad suggested aspects that can be identified at this point for the evaluation to address. **Other aspects can be added as identified by the evaluation consultant in accordance with the given purpose and in consultation with DED.** The evaluation instrument prepared by the evaluation team will indicate further selected specific aspects to be addressed.

The evaluation will be conducted following UN evaluation standards and norms.

Project Design (Validity of Project)

- How logical and coherent is the project design? Given project resources, will the project be able to achieve its goals and targets?
- To what extent do the strategies address the root causes of trafficking (i.e. gender inequality, poverty, perceived inequality, inadequate safe migration channels, lack of education)?
- How relevant are project indicators and means of verification? Please assess the usefulness of the indicators for monitoring and measuring impact
- Assess internal logic of the project (logical framework, links between inputs, activities, outputs and objectives), quality and usefulness of the selected indicators and means of verifications for program monitoring and evaluation, including relevant breakdowns by sex, age, etc
- Assess external logic of the project in terms of contribution to broader work in the provinces and country (especially if a formal strategic planning process such as the Strategic Program Impact Framework —SPIF— was used for planning the intervention), links with other interventions, synergies and economies of scale created, etc.
- Assess how the project used the previous experience and lessons learned of TIC-W project to inform design and implementation
- Assess whether the project document provided adequate guidance on how the intervention would address the relevant gender issues among the target groups
- How well chosen are the target groups (sub-groups, age, socio-economic status etc. ‘Poor’ or ‘Women’ may be too broad of a category and must be broken down) and do they include the socially excluded? Determine if more details are needed to better target interventions
- How have gender aspects been integrated in the project? Where gender analysis used appropriately throughout the interventions? What were some of the difficulties encountered and how were these dealt with?
- Are they key partnerships chosen at the various levels appropriate?

Achievements of the Project (Effectiveness and Efficiency)

- How effective are action programs to date, and how are they contributing to the project meeting its immediate objectives?
- How effective is the project in raising awareness about child labor and trafficking and in promoting social mobilization to address these issues?
- Has the project contributed to changes in the cultural perception of child labor among men, women, girls and boys?
- How has the capacity of the implementing agencies and other relevant partners to develop effective action against child labor been enhanced as a result of the project activities?
- How effective are local management structures (e.g. National Steering Committee; provincial and lower level steering committees; Secretariats, National and provincial project offices; Focal point mechanisms, ‘back stoppers’)?
- What are the key achievements of the project per province and nationally? What contributed to these achievements and what hindered them?
- Identify unexpected effects on the target groups or in other sectors of the population

47

- To what extent are factors outside the control of project management affecting project implementation and attainment of the objectives/goal?
- Did the intervention reach the expected target population?
- To what extent did the project contribute to conceptual clarity? How effective has the project been in mobilizing stakeholders and forming partnerships? Are project partners and other stakeholders clear about trafficking prevention and do they know their role?
- Has the project been able to effectively collaborate with other agencies (governmental, international and mass organizations) in its efforts to combat trafficking at the various levels? Has the project been able to effectively collaborate with other technical departments within the ILO?
- Assess the participation of different relevant actors - in particular the ACWF and its provincial and lower level branches - but also MOLSS, Ministry of Public Security, Ministry of Education, National Working Committee on Children and Women (and their lower level equivalents)? How are these structures participating in project implementation, and how does this contribute to progress towards achieving project objectives?
- What is the frequency and quality of cross-sharing of information? Are the tools, guides and learning papers 'needs based', relevant, and adapted and fitting to the local context? And to what extent does the project contribute to the knowledge base on trafficking in China?
- To what extent have participatory approaches (including child participation) been used and to what extent have they been adapted to the local context? What is the effect of these methods to date? Which important target groups have been engaged/involved?
- Were specific models of intervention developed? Are there possibilities for replication? Under which circumstances?
- What is the level of government commitment to and support for the project nationally, and within target provinces? Does the project capitalize on policy opportunities; does it have an impact on policy? To what extent have policy makers focused and increased their commitment? What is the level of effectiveness of the Steering Committees at various levels?
- How closely is the project adhering to its work plan? Also assess the quality and the use of work plans and monitoring plans.
- Are project funds being committed and disbursed in an efficient and timely manner to ensure the on-time completion of project activities?
- Are financial and time resources being used efficiently in the collection of data and measurement of project indicators?
- How efficient (i.e. speed) and effective (i.e. quality) has the technical backstopping to the programme been (including backstopping and monitoring of Mini and Action Programmes and other contracts, development and monitoring of provincial programmes, training workshops, missions, etc)
- How effectively are strategies for child labor monitoring being implemented? Is the Child Labor Monitoring system (CLMS) likely to be sustainable?
- Are there any lessons learnt for the second half of the project?
- How is the project – as part of ILO and ACWF – working to its comparative advantage on gender, labor, and migration within China?

Relevance of the Strategy

- Were different strategies used for delivering project interventions to the different target groups? Were the strategies culturally and gender sensitive? (i.e. different times for training activities for working women versus non-working women, separating classrooms for girls and boys)?
- Does the program address practical and strategic gender needs? Was gender equality adequately promoted in the strategy?
- How does the strategy fit with national, provincial and lower level policy developments in particular in the area of education, labor, migration, and poverty alleviation? Where has progress on developing an enabling policy environment for anti-trafficking been relatively fast and where relatively slow? How has the project adapted its policy advocacy strategy to respond to different opportunities and constraints for policy influence?
- How does the project relate to ILO's decent work country programme, IPEC's global programme (i.e. results based framework), the UN programme in China, and work against trafficking by other organizations?
- Were alternative strategies considered?
- Assess the relationship between the project and other child labor and child-trafficking interventions supported by ILO-IPEC (in particular the TIC-W and the work in Yunnan province) or by other organizations working in China.
- Are the project strategies effectively integrated and linked to provincial and national contexts of trafficking prevention and migration?

Sustainability of the Project

- What are the learning so far and how the planned interventions need to be changed?
- How effective has the project been to date in promoting local and national ownership of the program and promoting long-term sustainability? Has the idea of a phase-out strategy for the project been clearly articulated and progress made toward this goal?
- Assess the degree of ownership of and participation in the project / program both institutionally and individually, considering boys and girls, women and men.
- What are the long-term prospects for local/national institutions (including governments) and the target groups to build on the achievement of the project once it ends?
- Assess the sustainability of the program, i.e. its longer-term impact after withdrawal of external support
- Which are the possibilities of replicating all or part of the project / program in a different location or at a bigger scale?
- Have child labor issues been mainstreamed into the policy environment and in relevant institutions?
- Examine whether social-cultural and gender aspects endanger the sustainability of the project and assess whether action has been taken to sensitize local institutions and target groups on these issues.

Special Aspects to be Addressed

- How has the relationship with DFID been managed? Particularly in relation to:
 - Budgeting and financial reporting;
 - Progress reporting and lesson learning;
 - Contributions to global ILO-DFID partnership; and
 - How could DFID, ILO, and ILO/IPEC do things differently to strengthen the partnership?

IV. Expected Outputs of the Evaluation

- 1) A desk review
- 2) An evaluation instrument prepared by the evaluation team prior to the field visits
- 3) Consultation with project management and key partners at the national level
- 4) Field visits to each of the project sites
- 5) A stakeholders' workshop at the end of the field visits where the consultants will present their major findings and recommendations, further information collection at the national level and take part in a discussion about options for the future.
- 6) Debriefing with ILO China office and the project management
- 7) Draft evaluation report including stakeholder workshop proceedings, findings from field visits by evaluation team, and all the annexes
- 8) Final Report including:
 - Cover Page including the proper project title and the project number
 - Table of Contents
 - Acronyms (All acronyms used for the first time in the report must be spelled out.)
 - Executive Summary including recommendations
 - Clearly identified findings
 - Clearly identified conclusions and recommendations
 - Lessons learned
 - Potential good practices and effective models of intervention.
 - Appropriate Annexes including the present TORs
 - Standard evaluation instrument matrix

The total length of the report **should be a maximum of 30 pages for the main report, excluding annexes; additional annexes can provide background and details on specific components of the project evaluated.** The report should be sent as one complete document and the file size should not exceed 3 megabytes. Photos, if appropriate to be included, should be inserted using lower resolution to keep overall file size low.

All drafts and final outputs, including supporting documents, analytical reports and raw data should be provided both in paper copy and in electronic version compatible for Microsoft WORD for Windows. Ownership of the data from the evaluation rests jointly with ILO/IPEC and the consultant. Use of the data for publication and other presentation can only be made with the agreement of ILO/IPEC. Key stakeholders can make appropriate use of the evaluation report in line with the original purpose and with appropriate acknowledgement.

The final report will be circulated to key stakeholders (those participants present at the stakeholder evaluation workshop will be considered key stakeholders) for their review. Comments from stakeholders will be consolidated by the Design, Evaluation and

52

Special Aspects to be Addressed

- How has the relationship with DFID been managed? Particularly in relation to:
 - Budgeting and financial reporting;
 - Progress reporting and lesson learning;
 - Contributions to global ILO-DFID partnership; and
 - How could DFID, ILO, and ILO/IPEC do things differently to strengthen the partnership?

IV. Expected Outputs of the Evaluation

- 1) A desk review
- 2) An evaluation instrument prepared by the evaluation team prior to the field visits
- 3) Consultation with project management and key partners at the national level
- 4) Field visits to each of the project sites
- 5) A stakeholders' workshop at the end of the field visits where the consultants will present their major findings and recommendations, further information collection at the national level and take part in a discussion about options for the future.
- 6) Debriefing with ILO China office and the project management
- 7) Draft evaluation report including stakeholder workshop proceedings, findings from field visits by evaluation team, and all the annexes
- 8) Final Report including:
 - Cover Page including the proper project title and the project number
 - Table of Contents
 - Acronyms (All acronyms used for the first time in the report must be spelled out.)
 - Executive Summary including recommendations
 - Clearly identified findings
 - Clearly identified conclusions and recommendations
 - Lessons learned
 - Potential good practices and effective models of intervention.
 - Appropriate Annexes including the present TORs
 - Standard evaluation instrument matrix

The total length of the report **should be a maximum of 30 pages for the main report, excluding annexes; additional annexes can provide background and details on specific components of the project evaluated.** The report should be sent as one complete document and the file size should not exceed 3 megabytes. Photos, if appropriate to be included, should be inserted using lower resolution to keep overall file size low.

All drafts and final outputs, including supporting documents, analytical reports and raw data should be provided both in paper copy and in electronic version compatible for Microsoft WORD for Windows. Ownership of the data from the evaluation rests jointly with ILO/IPEC and the consultant. Use of the data for publication and other presentation can only be made with the agreement of ILO/IPEC. Key stakeholders can make appropriate use of the evaluation report in line with the original purpose and with appropriate acknowledgement.

The final report will be circulated to key stakeholders (those participants present at the stakeholder evaluation workshop will be considered key stakeholders) for their review. Comments from stakeholders will be consolidated by the Design, Evaluation and

Documentation Section (DED) of ILO/IPEC Geneva and provided to the team leader. In preparing the final report the team leader should consider these comments, incorporate as appropriate in the report and provide a brief note explaining why any comments might not have been incorporated.

V. Evaluation Methodology

The following is the proposed evaluation methodology. While the evaluation consultant can propose changes in the methodology, any such changes should be discussed with and approved by DED provided that the research and analysis suggests changes and provided that the indicated range of questions is addressed, the purpose maintained and the expected outputs produced at the required quality.

The evaluation consultant can be asked to use the **standard evaluation instruments** that ILO/IPEC has developed for documenting and analyzing achievements of the projects and contributions of the Action Programs to the project.

The evaluation will be carried out using the following main methodological elements

- A desk review to establish the specific evaluation instrument
- Field visits to project sites for consultations with project staff, project partners, beneficiaries and other key stakeholders.
- Provincial and national level discussions with key stakeholders and other informants
- National level stakeholder workshop to present their major findings and recommendations, further information collection at the national level and take part in a discussion about options for the future. This workshop will have participation from key stakeholders in China and from ILO/IPEC sub-regional and HQ (if possible)

Qualifications and Responsibilities of the Evaluation Team

The evaluation team will consist of two evaluation consultants who previously have not been involved in the project and who has no current employment or contractual relationship with the ILO or DFID. One of the consultants will be the team leader. The other evaluation team member will be a national consultant.

The background of the **evaluation team leader (International Consultant)** should include:

- Experience in the design, management and evaluation of development projects, in particular with local development projects.
- Relevant background in social and/or economic development
- Experience in evaluations in the UN system, preferably as team leader
- Relevant regional experience preferably prior working experience in China
- Experience in the area of children's and child labor issues and rights-based approaches in a normative framework are highly appreciated.
- Experience in the area of education and legal issues would also be appreciated
- Experience in the UN system or similar international development experience
- Familiarity with and knowledge of child labor, trafficking and labor exploitation
- Fluency in English. Local language skill is an asset.
- Experience facilitating workshops for evaluation findings
- Familiarity with DFID policy and strategy would be appreciated.

The background of the **evaluation team member (National Consultant)** should include:

- Experience in evaluation of development projects, in particular with local development projects.
- Relevant background in social and/or economic development
- Experience in the area of children's and child labor issues and rights-based approaches in a normative framework in the Chinese context would be highly appreciated.
- Fluency in the local language and English
- Experience facilitating workshops for evaluation findings.

The evaluation team will be responsible for undertaking a desk review of the project files and documents undertake field visits to the project locations, facilitate the workshop.

The team leader will be responsible for drafting the evaluation report with inputs from the national consultant. Upon feedback from stakeholders to the draft report, the evaluation consultant will further be responsible for finalizing the report incorporating any comments deemed appropriate. The team leader will have the final responsibility during the evaluation process and the outcomes of the evaluation, including the quality of the report and the compliance with deadlines.

The evaluation will be carried out with the technical support of DED and with the logistical support of the project office in China and with the administrative support of the ILO office in China. DED will be responsible for consolidating the comments of stakeholders and submitting it to the team leader.

It is expected that the evaluation team will work to the highest evaluation standards and codes of conduct.

Timetable and Workshop schedule:

The total duration of the evaluation process including submission of the final report should be within two month from the end of the field mission.

The team leader will be engaged for 25 days, and the team member will be engaged for 15 days (both funded by the project funds through ILO). It is expected that during the process the evaluation team will be in contact as appropriate. The timetable is as follows.

Detailed Schedule and Duration

Evaluation will be undertaken in October-November 2006 (Further dates will be confirmed.)

Phase	Responsible Person	Tasks	Dates
I	Team Leader (international consultant)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Telephone briefing with IPEC DED ▪ Telephone briefing with IPEC HQ ▪ Desk Review of project related documents ▪ Evaluation instrument based on desk review 	October 30 – November 3 (5 work days)
	National Consultant	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Desk Review of project related documents 	October 30 – November 1 (3 work days)
II	The evaluation team with logistical support by the project management	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ In-country briefing with ILO China (the country director and the Project Management) and DFID-China ▪ In-country or telephone briefing with the relevant key ILO officials ▪ Consultations with project staff ▪ Consultations with Beijing-based project partners 	November 6-8 (3 work days)
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Field visit Hunan ▪ Consultations with PSC, lower level committees & partners, visit county/township ▪ Consultations with girls and boys, parents and other beneficiaries 	November 9-11 (3 work days)
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Field visit Guangdong ▪ Meeting with PSC, lower level committees & partners, visit city/community township ▪ Consultations with girls and boys, parents and other beneficiaries 	November 12-15 (4 work days)
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Debriefing with ILO China office and the Project Management 	November 16
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Workshop with key stakeholders (i.e. provincial levels, key ministries + project staff) 	November 17
III	Team Leader (with inputs from national consultant)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Draft report based on consultations from desk review, field visits, and the stakeholders' workshop. 	November 18-22 (5 work days)
	national consultant	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Inputs for the draft report to the team leader 	November 18-19 (2 work days)
IV	DED	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Circulation of the draft report to key stakeholders ▪ Consolidate comments of key stakeholders and send to the evaluation consultant 	2 weeks
V	Team Leader	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Finalize the report including explanations on why comments were not included 	December 6-8 (3 work days)

Project management will prepare a detailed schedule with proposed dates for visit to specific project locations.

Desk Review Materials and Other Sources of Information

<Prepared by the Project Management>

- Project Document
- Progress Reports
- Technical and Financial report of partner agencies
- Action Program Summary Outlines (APSOs)
- Tools and guidelines developed

- Project files
- Reports of meetings, trainings, seminars
- Project related media coverage
- Other relevant documents about the project or produced by the project and partners

<Prepared by DED>

- IPEC DED Guidelines and ILO Guidelines
- TICW evaluation reports

Consultations/Interview with:

- Project management and staff (Sub-regional -Bangkok and countries), previous project manager
- ACWF and other partner agencies
- Relevant Government Ministries
- Social partners Employers' and Workers' groups
- Boys and Girls
- Community members
- Parents of boys and girls
- Teachers, government representatives, legal authorities etc as identified by evaluation team
- DFID Beijing (and London (i.e. previous Social Development Advisor)
- IPEC Geneva and Bangkok (desk officers, TICW project)
- ILO Special Action Programme to Combat Forced Labor (SAP-FL)
- ILO Sub-Regional Office (Director / Deputy Director, child labor specialist)
- ILO Area Office (for China and Mongolia)
- Provincial Steering Committees, and NSC members
- Possible others to be identified

A detailed list of possible institutions and individuals for consultation and interviewing will be prepared by project management

Final Report Submission Procedure

For an independent evaluation, the following procedure is used:

- The evaluation consultant will submit a draft report **directly to IPEC DED in Geneva** IPEC DED will forward a copy to **key stakeholders** for comments on factual issues and for clarifications
- **IPEC DED** will consolidate the comments and send these to the evaluation consultant by the date agreed between DED and the evaluation consultant or as soon as the comments are received from stakeholders.
- The final report is submitted by the evaluation consultant **directly to IPEC DED in Geneva** who will then officially forward it to stakeholders, including the donor (DFID).

VI. Resources and Management

Resources:

The resources required for this evaluation are:

For the evaluation team leader:

- Fees for an international consultant for **25** work days
 - International travel lump sum from consultant's home to Beijing in accordance with ILO regulations and policies
- Preventing trafficking in girls and young women for labor exploitation within China (CP-TING)

- Fees for local DSA in each project location as appropriate

For the National Consultant

- Fees for a national consultant for **15** work days
- fees for local DSA in each project location as appropriate

For the evaluation exercise as a whole:

- Fees for local travel in-country
- Stakeholder workshop expenditures
- Any other miscellaneous costs

Management:

The evaluation consultant will report to and discuss any technical and methodological matters **directly with DED** should issues arise. IPEC project officials in China will provide administrative and logistical support during the evaluation mission.

B. SITE VISIT AGENDAS (HUNAN AND GUANGDONG)

Tentative Agenda

Hunan visit, Mid-term Evaluation

9 ~11 Oct., Hunan

8 November, 2006

From Beijing to Changsha (Flight No.:)

Airport pickup (arranged by PPO)

18:00 Dinner

9 November, 2006

8:30~10:30 Meeting with PPO

Topics:

- Achievement to date
 - Challenge / future intervention
- Participants: Consultant, PPO

10:30~11:30 Meeting with key members of PSC (LSSB and EB)

Topics:

- Understanding of trafficking for labour exploitation
- Close cooperation between PSC member and project
- Future cooperation planned
- Mainstreaming and sustainability of trafficking prevention

Participants: Consultant, PPO, key members of PSC, staff of secretariat to PSC

11:30~12:00 Meeting with (deputy) director of PSC

Topics:

- Support of provincial government to the project
- Mainstreaming and sustainability of trafficking

62

prevention

Participants: Consultant, PPO, staff of secretariat to PSC

12:00~13:30 Welcome lunch with (deputy) director of PSC

13:30~19:00 From Changsha to Ningyuan

19:30 Dinner

10 November, 2006

8:30~10:00 Meeting with Ningyuan WF

Topics:

- CP-TING project in Ningyuan
- Future interventions

Participants: Consultant, PPO, county WF

10:00~10:30 Visit to vocational skill training center of LSSB (a place to hold vocational training for migrants, county Integrated AP)

10:30~11:30 Meeting with key members of county committee (EB and LSSB)

Topics:

- Understanding of trafficking for labour exploitation
- Close cooperation between PSC member and project
- Future cooperation planned

Participants: Consultant, PPO, key members of county committee, county WF

11:30~12:00 Meeting with vice county mayor, director of county committee

Topics:

- Support of county government to the project
- Sustainability of trafficking prevention in Ningyuan

12:00~14:00 Welcome lunch with county committee

14:00~14:30 From Ningyuan county township to Girl's Activity Center of Lengshui Township

14:30~17:00 Visit of Girl's Activity Center of Lengshui Township

Topics:

- Presentation of activities arranged in the center (14:30~15:00)
- Performance on trafficking prevention by girls / boys (15:00~15:45)
- Coffee break (15:45~16:00)
- Meeting with boys / girls (16:00~17:00)

Participants: Consultant, PPO, county WF, chief of Girls' Activity Center

17:00~18:00 Back to Ningyuan

18:00 Dinner

11 November, 2006

8:00~13:00 Ningyuan ~ Changsha

14:30~15:30 Meeting with Social Science Academy / Hunan Women Cadre's School

- Introduction of Qualitative research, and mainstreaming of result.
 - Plan of Hunan Women's Cadre's School in mainstreaming of trafficking prevention
- Participants: Consultant, PPO, secretariat of PSC, SSA, HWCS

15:30~17:00 Meeting with provincial WF

Topics:

- How project work is integrated into work of provincial WF (sustainability)
- How provincial WF coordinate PSC members and trafficking prevention network
- Future cooperation

Participants: Consultant, PPO, provincial WF, secretariat of PSC

17:00~17:30 Wrap-up meeting with PPO / secretariat of PSC

Participants: Consultant, PPO, secretariat of PSC

18:00 Dinner

12 November, 2006

From Changsha to Guangzhou (Flight No.:)

Airport send-off (arranged by PPO)

Guangdong, China

November 12-15, 2006 (Draft)

November 12, 2006

Am Changsha – Guangzhou (Flight no.:)

Airport pickup arranged by PPO

12:30—13:30 Lunch

Check in Guangdong Hotel

15:00~17:30 Focus group discussion with PPO and focal points of target cities

Topic for discussion:

- Presentation of progress made by CP-TING Project to date
- Presentation of implementation of Direct Assistance AP in target cities
- The achievements made on Objective of Mobilization and Awareness Raising
- Reviewing project materials, awareness raising materials, media reports and VCD, etc.

Participants: evaluators, PPO staff, PSC secretariat, Presidents of target cities in charge of CP-TING project, focal points.

18:00~19:00 Dinner hosted by Guangdong Women's Federation

November 13, 2006

9:00~11:00 Focus group discussion with some of the PSC members and focal points

Topic for discussion:

Brief introduction on main work and achievements of PSC members on

CP-TINGproject

- Understanding on trafficking issues
- Cooperation between PSC members and the Project
- Evaluation of the Project and suggestions
- Mainstreaming of trafficking prevention and sustainability

Participants: evaluators, PPO staff, PSC secretariat, Judicial Department, Labor Bureau, Education Bureau, Public Security Bureau, Trade Unions, Industrial and Commercial Federation, Guangdong Academy on Social Sciences

11:30~12:00 Vice Governor/Chair of PSC meet with evaluation team

Topic for discussion:

- Support on CP-TING project from provincial government
- Mainstreaming of trafficking prevention and sustainability

12:00~13:30 Lunch hosted by Chair of PSC

14:00~15:30 Focus group discussion of partners' representatives and backstoppers

Topic for discussion

- Understanding on trafficking issues
- Cooperation between partners and the Project
- Evaluation of the Project and suggestions
- Mainstreaming of trafficking prevention and sustainability

Participants: evaluators, PPO staff, PSC secretariat, Guangzhou Railway Public Security Bureau, Zhong Shan University, Guangdong Women Occupational Technology College, Guangdong Female Entrepreneur Association, Guangdong Women's Federation Women Issue Study Center, Media.

16:00~19:00 Leave for Shenzhen by train, check in Wuzhou Hotel, Shenzhen

19:30~20:30 Dinner

November 14, 2006

8:00~9:00 Go to Longguan District by car

9:00~10:00 Focus group discussion with Shenzhen Zhongnan Human Resource

Catena Organization

Topic for discussion

- The effect of internal staff training on trafficking prevention and how to use the knowledge to serve the target group
- How to provide employment service for migrant young women and the good approaches
- Suggestions on protecting the migrant young women for safe employment

10:00~11:00 Leave for migrant women's school by car

11:00~12:00 Focus group discussion on effect of migrant women's school in

Longcheng Ailian Ciyu Footwear Factory

Topic for discussion:

- Understanding on trafficking issues
- What they have learned from attending the migrant women's school and impact on oneself.
- How will the volunteers in the school become advocator of trafficking prevention in the community
- Evaluation of the Project and suggestions for migrant women's school

Participant: evaluator, City Committee Secretariat, 8 young migrant women worker

12:30~13:30 Lunch

13:40~14:00 Leave for Longgang Ailian Community by car

14:00~15:10 Focus group discussion in Individually-operated primary school in

Longgang Ailian Community

- Headmaster's brief introduction
 - Watch the participatory activity
 - Meet with migrant children (boys and girls)
- 15:30~16:30 Field visit to Longgang Ailian Community
- Site visit to Ailian Community's environment, work in the community and service provided for target group
 - Meet with 3-4 community staff and cadre of resident's committee
 - Meet with 3-4 parents of beneficiary
- 16:30~18:00 Focus group discussion with person-in-charge of Longgan District,
target communes and Ailian Community

Topic for discussion:

Brief introduction on what has been done and how it was done

- Understanding of trafficking prevention issue (Awareness raising)
 - How to provide direct assistance to target group
 - Impact of CP-TING project on target group and community
 - Impact of CP-TING project on capacity building for staff at grass root level
- 18:30~19:30 Dinner hosted by leaders from Longgang District

November 15, 2006

- 8:30~9:00 Leave for meeting place
- 9:20~11:20 Focus group discussion with Shenzhen Steering Committee members

Brief introduction of work in the city and playing VCD

3 key members' introduction

Topic for discussion:

- Brief introduction on main work and achievement of members on trafficking prevention
- Understanding on trafficking issues
- Cooperation between members and the Project
- Evaluation of the Project and suggestions
- Mainstreaming of trafficking prevention and sustainability

Participants: evaluators, PPO staff, Shenzhen Committee Secretariat, Shenzhen Steering Committee members

11:30~12:00 Vice Mayor/Chair of Shenzhen Committee meet with evaluation team

Topic for discussion:

- Support on CP-TING project from city government
- Mainstreaming of trafficking prevention and sustainability

12:00~13:30 Lunch hosted by Vice Mayor/Chair of Shenzhen Committee

13:30~14:30 Wrap up for provincial and city project staff and evaluator

14:30~15:30 See the evaluation team off to Beijing (at Shenzhen Airport)

Shenzhen—Beijing (Flight no.)

C. NATIONAL LOGICAL FRAMEWORK

OVERALL OBJECTIVE (GOAL)	OBJECTIVELY VERIFIABLE INDICATORS (OVIs)	MEANS OF VERIFICATION (MOV)	RISKS/ ASSUMPTIONS
To contribute to the elimination of labour exploitation of children and women, and in particular the trafficking in girls and young women for labour exploitation in China, through the development, implementation and monitoring of effective and integrated national and provincial strategies and actions.			<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • No recurrence of SARS • Socio-economic stability in urban areas despite migrant influx combined with local lay-offs from State Owned Enterprises
IMMEDIATE OBJECTIVE (PURPOSE) 1 [Advocacy & Mobilization]	OVIs	MOV	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • RISKS/ • ASSUMPTIONS
By the end of the project, key stakeholders will have been mobilized effectively to prevent trafficking in girls and young women for labour exploitation	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Statements by policy makers and policy documents that refer to the down-side of migration (including trafficking) and include trafficking for labour exploitation; • Workers & Employers organizations initiatives that address trafficking; • Government initiatives that address trafficking beyond kidnapping of babies and trafficking for marriage; • Media interest in trafficking for labour exploitation (quantity and quality) See form III-C for more details • Perspectives of girls and young women appreciated by policy makers 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Public statements and press coverage • Partner progress reports • Project progress reports, NSC committee minutes • Media coverage • Policy statements, speeches 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Willingness within the Chinese government to broaden their trafficking understanding (and their recognized definition) • Continued commitment at national and provincial level to work with the project

<p>Output 1.1</p> <p>Strategy developed and implemented within each project province and nationally for sound conceptual understanding of trafficking²⁰ and its effective interventions by key stakeholders</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Composition of National Steering Committee (rationalized/enlarged) • Functioning Provincial Steering Committees • Functioning inter-ministerial arrangements on trafficking (in particular between PSB, MOLSS and ACWF) • Collaboration with Ministry of Education on trafficking • Approved research plans focus on the down-side of migration • National officials that report on target site visits in meetings 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Pilot project progress reports; • Speeches & public statements • NSC minutes • PSC minutes and PM&E • Minutes of relevant inter-ministerial meetings; • Reports by focal points • Research plan • Minutes of meetings 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Cooperation of NSC members to co-opt new members • Interest and engagement of workers and employers • National and Provincial financial contributions for coordination •
<p>Output 1.2</p> <p>Gaps in research and information relating to trafficking in girls and young women for labour exploitation identified (including baselines for focused interventions), and responses to these identified and addressed by key stakeholders</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Baseline on incidence, situation of trafficking in girls and young women for labour migration in selected sending areas documented and disseminated to concerned parties • Sex and age disaggregated data on trafficking for labour exploitation; • Perspectives of girls and young women that are included in research findings • Baseline on incidence, situation of trafficking in girls and young women for labour migration in selected receiving areas that are documented and disseminated to concerned parties • Quality information on migration dynamics including role of recruitment agencies that is used by planners • Number of national and provincial meeting held to share experience and discuss on the research and information 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Progress reports of partners, PM&E • Data sets • Available research reports • Progress reports of partners, PM&E • Policy papers, minutes of meetings • Minutes of meetings 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Sufficient support and clearance for good quality research on the sensitive issue of trafficking • Cooperation of target audiences in receiving and sharing information • Government officials appreciate perspectives of target groups • Government officials appreciate good qualitative information

²⁰ This should include common understanding of the international definition of trafficking including the labour dimension, and an understanding that trafficking can take place in a broader labour migration framework where ‘blind’ or non-informed migration may result in trafficking.

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> that has become available New information on trafficking for labour exploitation that is accessible and used by policy makers at different levels 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> NSC/PSC minutes, PM&E, Government policy documents, Migration publications by MOLSS, State Planning Commission, CASS, etc 	
IMMEDIATE OBJECTIVE (PURPOSE) 2 [Direct Assistance]	OVI s	MOV	RISKS/ ASSUMPTIONS
By the end of the project, integrated, effective and sustainable responses to trafficking in girls and young women for labour exploitation are in place both in sending and receiving areas and serve as 'models'	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Pilot projects that address trafficking for labour exploitation Interest in pilot tested models by non-target counties and non-target prefectures within target provinces National and/or other provinces interest in replicating the models that has been developed Other organizations' interest in documented project learning as expressed in meetings and communications 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> APSO/MP proposals and progress report Documented requests and/or exposure trips by non-target counties and prefectures for project learning; Documented requests by non-target provinces and national government officials for documented project learning; Reports of exposure trips/study tours to project target sites Inter-agency meeting minutes 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Partners' commitment to documented learning and learning through sharing continues and barriers are not erected Partner agencies are willing to improve access by girls and young women to existing services (including education, training, and credit facilities) Vast numbers of girls and young women will continue to want to migrate to urban centers along the east coast given current population pressures and economic development Partner agencies develop sufficient understanding of the role of pilots as catalysts for changes in larger frameworks
Output 2.1 Pilot projects of community-owned preventive interventions undertaken and monitored for impact, evaluated, and documented for replication within sending provinces	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Number of girls & young women assisted preventively in target counties See form III-B for more details Community initiatives and volunteer mechanism that prevent trafficking Outreach of existing government services to girls and young women at risk Awareness and understanding on the risk of traffickers among girls, young women and parents groups 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> PM&E, (updated) baselines Partner progress reports PM&E 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Community members support a specific focus on girls and young women Sufficient information available to make informed decisions on target sites Stakeholders agree to work in most problematic geographical (sending) areas Cooperation of target audiences in receiving and sharing of information

(Anhui, Henan and Hunan Province)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Number of target group girls at risk reached by project information activities (a) already living in migrant communities, and (b) arriving at bus/train stations during the project Functioning partner backstopping mechanisms; Documented learning quoted and used by policy makers 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Partner progress reports Policy statements and speeches 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Communities and local officials willing and able to work holistically (linking services)
Output 2.2 Pilot projects of 'city neighbourhood-owned' preventive interventions undertaken and monitored for impact, evaluated, and documented for replication in urban centers of Jiangsu and Guangdong Province (receiving provinces)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Accessibility of existing government services to girls and young women at risk Statements from public figures concerning non-employment of under-age girls and decent employment for young women Worker & employer initiatives that prevent trafficking; PSC awareness of pilot initiatives Functioning partner backstopping mechanisms; Volunteer mechanisms that prevent trafficking in girls and young women; Documented learning that is quoted and used by policy makers 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> PM&E Public statements & speeches W&E progress reports Minutes of PSC meetings Partner progress reports PM&E Policy documents and statements 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Sufficient information available to make informed decisions on target sites Stakeholders agree to work in most problematic geographical (receiving) areas Cooperation of target audiences in receiving and sharing of information Workers and Employers organizations are willing to reach out to the informal sector Local informants are able to reach out to victims of trafficking without jeopardizing their safety
IMMEDIATE OBJECTIVE (PURPOSE) 3 [Capacity Building]	OVI	MOV	RISKS/ ASSUMPTIONS
By the end of the project, national and sub-national policy frameworks and implementation capacity to prevent trafficking in girls and young women for labour exploitation will have been strengthened	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> National policies (and lower level policies) against trafficking reflect commitments under ILO Worst Forms of Child Labour Convention (No.182), Forced Labour Convention (No.29), and Palermo Protocol on trafficking National and provincial governments that commit budget allocations and other resources (staff, time, information) to prevent trafficking for labour exploitation See form III-D for more details Extent to which prevention of trafficking is addressed in national and provincial policy plans 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> National policy documents and Plans of Action Government plans and budgets 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> National Government abides by the spirit of ratified International Conventions (e.g. CRC, TNC, ILO C182 and 29) Cooperation of other agencies (eg UNICEF, donors) in lobbying for development of National plan of action MOU between ILO and MOLSS is widely acknowledged ILO role on labour issues is widely acknowledged National Steering Committee recognized at highest policy making

			<p>levels (i.e. State Planning Commission and Standing Committee of People's Party)</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Continued political commitment to mainstream project approaches
<p>Output 3.1</p> <p>Provincial and lower level policy frameworks, structures, processes and staff skills to prevent trafficking in girls and young women for labour exploitation reviewed and improvements suggested – including sound migration management arrangements between sending and receiving provinces²¹</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Number of key officials in relevant institutions who have received 'process' training use acquired skills Number of joint planning events on safe migration among sending & receiving provinces Inter-provincial migration networks (sending – receiving) that function (with attention to girls aged 16-24) Functioning implementation mechanisms that accompany plans in all project provinces Extent to which opinions/ideas of girls and young women appreciated and used by government departments at provincial and lower levels 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> PM&E, partner progress reports, NSC meeting records Documented communication among provinces PSC meeting records, PM&E Provincial government papers, PM&E 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Continued Provincial Government commitment to prevent trafficking Provincial government budgets available to prevent trafficking Sense of need for collaboration among provinces is stronger than sense of competition among provinces Sending and receiving provinces see collaboration as a 'win-win' situation
<p>Output 3.2</p> <p>National policy framework, structures, processes and staff skills to prevent trafficking in girls and young women for labour exploitation reviewed and improvements suggested - based on sub-national experiences and realities (output 3.1) and new</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Number of key officials in relevant national institutions who have received 'process' training related to trafficking use acquired skills Inter-provincial migration networks (sending – receiving) that function and involve national level National policy that is grounded by pilot learning from 5 selected provinces National policy that recognizes voice of girls and young women at risk of trafficking Job descriptions of ministry focal points reflect 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> PM&E, partner progress reports, NSC meeting records Documented vertical communication with provinces, partner progress reports National policy documents, PM&E Government policy papers, and public speeches Job descriptions of focal points and TORs for national 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Continued National Government commitment to prevent trafficking National authorities respect provincial level perspectives National government budget available to prevent trafficking

²¹ I.e. between Anhui and Henan & Jiangsu; and between Hunan & Guangdong.

conceptual understanding (output 1.1)	responsibilities on anti-trafficking coordination	coordination mechanisms	
--	---	-------------------------	--

D. MEMBERS OF NSC AND COLLABORATING AGENCIES

As of 24 October 2005

The National Steering Committee is composed of 16 member units as follows:

- National Working Committee on Children and Women, State Council
- National social security and management office
- Law and policy research office, the Supreme People's Procuratorate
- Criminal investigation department, Ministry of Public Security
- Social welfare and social assistance department, Ministry of Social Affairs
- General office, Ministry of Justice
- Legal department, Ministry of Labour and Social Security Training and employment department, Ministry of Labour and Social Security
- Grassroots health and women and children health care department, Ministry of Health
- Policy and Law Department, National Commission on Population and Family
- Sector policy and legal department, Ministry of Agriculture
- Private sector supervision department, the State Industrial and Commercial Administration
- Department of Basic Education, Ministry of Education
- Leading Office of Poverty Alleviation, State Council
- Population and social science department, State Statistics Bureau
- Women employee department, All China Federation of Trade Unions
- International Liaison Department, All-China Women's Federation
Development Department, All-China Women's Federation
Legal department, All-China Women's Federation

Other organizations

- China Women's Daily
- China Women's College
- China Labor Security News
- Procuratorial Daily

E. RESEARCH QUESTIONS (ENGLISH AND CHINESE)

1	Design	Project Design (Validity of Project)
2	Logic and coherency	How logical and coherent is the project design?
3		Assess internal logic of the project (logical framework, links between inputs, activities, outputs and objectives), quality and usefulness of the selected indicators and means of verifications for program monitoring and evaluation, including relevant breakdowns by sex, age, etc
4		Assess external logic of the project in terms of contribution to broader work in the provinces and country (especially if a formal strategic planning process such as the Strategic Program Impact Framework —SPIF— was used for planning the intervention), links with other interventions, synergies and economies of scale created, etc.
5	Appropriateness of strategy	To what extent do the strategies address the root causes of trafficking (i.e. gender inequality, poverty, perceived inequality, inadequate safe migration channels, lack of education)?
6		Were alternative strategies considered?
7	Likelihood of achieving goals	Given project resources, will the project be able to achieve its goals and targets?
8	Relevance and utility of indicators	How relevant are project indicators and means of verification?
9		- usefulness of the indicators for monitoring and measuring impact
10	Use of lessons learned	Assess how the project used the previous experience and lessons learned of TIC-W project to inform design and implementation
11	Gender and other target group issues	How have gender aspects been integrated in the project?
12		- Was gender analysis used appropriately throughout the interventions?
13		What types of action has been taken to sensitize local institutions and target groups on these issues.
14		Are there any social-cultural or gender aspects that may impact the sustainability of the project?
15	Usefulness of project document	Assess whether the project document provided adequate guidance on how the intervention would address the relevant gender issues among the target groups
16	Level of specificity of targets	How well chosen are the target groups (sub-groups, age, socio-economic status etc. 'Poor' or 'Women' may be too broad of a category and must be broken down) and do they include the socially excluded ?

17		- Are more details are needed to better target interventions?
	Achievements	Achievements of the Project (Effectiveness and Efficiency)
	<i>Effectiveness:</i>	
18	Action Programs	How effective are action programs to date, and how are they contributing to the project meeting its immediate objectives?
19	Conceptual clarity	To what extent did the project contribute to conceptual clarity ?
20		- Are project partners and other stakeholders clear about trafficking prevention and do they know their role?
21	Core Message	Core messages developed and used;
22	Media Coverage	Substantial amount of media coverage ;
23	Awareness raising	How effective is the project in raising awareness about child labor and trafficking and in promoting social mobilization to address these issues?
24	Changes in cultural perception	Has the project contributed to changes in the cultural perception of child labor among men, women, girls and boys?
25	<i>Efficiency</i>	
26	Management structures	How effective are local management structures (e.g. National Steering Committee; provincial and lower level steering committees; Secretariats, National and provincial project offices; Focal point mechanisms, 'back stoppers')?
27	Appropriateness of key partnerships	Are they key partnerships chosen at the various levels appropriate?
28	Capacity-building	How has the capacity of the implementing agencies and other relevant partners to develop effective action against child labor been enhanced as a result of the project activities?
29	Key achievements	What are the key achievements of the project per province and nationally? What contributed to these achievements and what hindered them?
30	Unexpected effects	Identify unexpected effects on the target groups or in other sectors of the population
31	Factors outside control of project management	To what extent are factors outside the control of project management affecting project implementation and attainment of the objectives/goal?
32	Mobilization and partnerships	How effective has the project been in mobilizing stakeholders and forming partnerships ?
33		Has the project been able to effectively collaborate with other agencies (governmental, international and mass organizations) in its efforts to combat trafficking at the various levels?

34		Assess the participation of different relevant actors - in particular the ACWF and its provincial and lower level branches - but also MOLSS, Ministry of Public Security, Ministry of Education, National Working Committee on Children and Women (and their lower level equivalents)?
35		- How are these structures participating in project implementation, and how does this contribute to progress towards achieving project objectives?
36	Information sharing (Mobilization and Partnership components)	What is the frequency and quality of cross-sharing of information ? Are the tools , guides and learning papers 'needs based', relevant, and adapted and fitting to the local context? And to what extent does the project contribute to the knowledge base on trafficking in China?
37	Participatory approach	To what extent have participatory approaches (including child participation) been used and to what extent have they been adapted to the local context?
38		What is the effect of these methods to date?
39		Which important target groups have been engaged/involved?
40	Government commitment and policy	What is the level of government commitment to and support for the project nationally, and within target provinces?
41	Steering Committees	What role have the NSC/ PSC/ County Committees or Leading Groups played in addressing trafficking issues?
42		What is the level of effectiveness of the Steering Committees at various levels?
43	Policy Environment	Have provincial level planning frameworks been developed and sufficiently tailored to meet local needs?
44		Does the project capitalize on policy opportunities; does it have an impact on policy ?
45		To what extent have policy makers focused and increased their commitment ?
46		Has the project obtained or leveraged counterpart funds from the government (national, provincial, municipal, etc.)? What other kinds of government contributions support the key objectives of the project?
47	Work plan, monitoring, data collection and analysis	Assess the quality and the use of work plans and monitoring plans.
48	Workplan	How closely is the project adhering to its work plan?
49		What elements of the work plan have been easier to implement? More difficult? What are the reasons?
50	Monitoring	How effectively are strategies for child labor monitoring being implemented? Is the Child Labor Monitoring system (CLMS) likely to be sustainable?
51	Secondary Data	What kind of secondary data would be useful for analyzing project outcomes? How, if at all has this data been collected? What steps can be taken to improve collection and analysis of data?

52	Use of resources	Are project funds being committed and disbursed in an efficient and timely manner to ensure the on-time completion of project activities?
53		Are financial and time resources being used efficiently in the collection of data and measurement of project indicators?
54	Technical backstopping	How efficient (i.e. speed) and effective (i.e. quality) has the technical backstopping to the program been (including backstopping and monitoring of Mini and Action Programs and other contracts, development and monitoring of provincial programs, training workshops, missions, etc)
55	Relevance	Relevance of the Strategy
56	Adaptation of strategies to target groups	Were different strategies used for delivering project interventions to the different target groups? Were the strategies culturally and gender sensitive? (i.e. different times for training activities for working women versus non-working women, separating classrooms for girls and boys)?
57	Gender and other target group issues	Does the program address practical and strategic gender needs? Was gender equality adequately promoted in the strategy?
58	Adaptation of strategies to national priorities and policies	How does the strategy fit with national, provincial and lower level policy developments in particular in the area of education, labor, migration, and poverty alleviation?
59	Policy Environment	Where has progress on developing an enabling policy environment for anti-trafficking been relatively fast and where relatively slow?
60	Advocacy	How has the project adapted its policy advocacy strategy to respond to different opportunities and constraints for policy influence?
61	Integration	Are the project strategies effectively integrated and linked to provincial and national contexts of trafficking prevention and migration?
62	Relation of project to UN/ILO programs	How does the project relate to ILO's decent work country program, IPEC's global program (i.e. results based framework), the UN program in China, and work against trafficking by other organizations?
63		Has the project been able to effectively collaborate with other technical departments within the ILO?
64		Assess the relationship between the project and other child labor and child-trafficking interventions supported by ILO-IPEC (in particular the TIC-W and the work in Yunnan province) or by other organizations working in China.
65	Sustainability	Sustainability of the Project
66		What are the learning so far and how the planned interventions need to be changed?

67	"Ownership"	How effective has the project been to date in promoting local and national ownership of the program and promoting long-term sustainability? Has the idea of a phase-out strategy for the project been clearly articulated and progress made toward this goal?
68		Assess the degree of ownership of and participation in the project / program both institutionally and individually, considering boys and girls, women and men.
69	Government and institutional capacity	What are the long-term prospects for local/national institutions (including governments) and the target groups to build on the achievement of the project once it ends?
70		Assess the sustainability of the program, i.e. its longer-term impact after withdrawal of external support
71	Mainstreaming	Have child labor issues been mainstreamed into the policy environment and in relevant institutions?
72	Best Practices Lessons Learned	
73	Models for replication	Which are the possibilities of replicating all or part of the project / program in a different location or at a bigger scale? Under which circumstances?
74	Lessons learned	Are there any lessons learnt for the second half of the project?
75	Comparative advantage	How is the project – as part of ILO and ACWF – working to its comparative advantage on gender, labor, and migration within China?
76	Recommendations	What recommendations would you make to improve the project's overall goals of preventing the trafficking of young girls and women for the worst forms of labor exploitation in terms of :
77		Effectively mobilizing key stakeholders?
78		Developing sound conceptual understanding of trafficking?
79		Improving research and information?
80		The development and monitoring of local community-based interventions in sending and receiving provinces?
81		Strengthening policies at national, provincial, and local levels to combat the worst forms of exploitation of migrant girls and women?

问题领域 例题

- 1 设计
- 2 逻辑性和一致性 项目设计的逻辑性和条理性如何？
- 3 截止目前开展的活动都适合逻辑框架吗？
- 4 项目活动适合国家级、省级和省以下各级确定的重点工作吗？如果有，你会提出什么建议？
- 5 战略的正确性 当前的战略解决拐卖根源问题的程度有多大？
- 6 如果有足够的时间和资源，你会建议哪些其他战略？
- 7 实现目标的可能性 在项目当前的时间框架内，哪些项目目标看起来最有可能实现？哪些存在的问题比较多？
- 8 指标的相关性和实用性 项目指标和鉴定途径的相关性有多大？
- 9 当前的指标实用吗？
- 10 借鉴总结的经验 云南经验影响当前设计的程度有多大？云南项目与在湖南和广东正在实施的项目（对输出省和输入省的案例研究）有哪些不同？
- 11 性别和其他目标人群的问题 重点关注女童和青年妇女是否仍然是最适当的？
- 12
- 13 在所有采取的使当地机构和目标人群敏感起来的措施中，哪些最有效？
- 14 有意料之外的社会文化、政治或性别问题可能影响项目的可持续性吗？
- 15 项目文件的实用性 项目实施两年后，项目文件在指导项目实施过程中的主要优势是什么？了解了你们现在正在做的工作，哪些变化会使项目文件更加完善？
- 16 目标的针对程度 目标人群选择的正确吗？针对面临劳动和性剥削最大风险的女童和青年妇女都做了哪些努力工作？
- 17 如果有的话，当前的方法哪些应该改变？
- 成果
- 有效性
- 18 行动计划 截止目前行动计划的有效性有多高？它们对实现项目的近期目标有何贡献？
- 19 概念澄清 项目澄清概念的程度有多大？
- 20 利益相关者了解大范围的劳动和性剥削问题方面的问题吗？如果都了解了，公众对拐卖的看法有变化吗？
- 21 核心信息 请提供开发和传播项目核心信息的工作的最佳例子。
- 22 媒体报道 哪种媒体战略被证明是最有效的？通过媒体大范围的宣传核心信息有哪些重要障碍？
- 23 意识提高 其它哪些意识提高战略被证明是最有效的？哪些工作可以证明这种有效性？这些其他战略还有哪些重要障碍？
- 24 文化观念上的变化 项目有助于改变在童工问题上的文化观念吗？如果有，有助于改变哪类人群？
- 25 效率
- 26 管理结构 当前的管理和监督结构的优点和缺点都是什么？项目重组影响实施的程度有多大？
- 27 主要合作伙伴的正确性 包含在下面“动员和建立合作伙伴”的问题中
- 28 能力建设 实施机构和其他相关合作伙伴的能力建设工作有效吗？以后主要的工作重点是什么？
- 29 主要成果 项目在国家级的主要成果是什么？在省级（特别是湖南和广东）的呢？哪些因素有助于这些成就的取得？哪些因素阻碍了这些成就的取得？
- 30 意外影响
- 31 不受项目管理控制的因素 不受项目管理控制的因素对项目实施和目标/目的的实现有多大程度的影响？
- 32 动员和建立合作关系 建立项目文件中预期的大范围的主要合作伙伴关系的可能性有多大？已经确定了哪些新的合作伙伴？
- 33 针对右栏问题举几个例子
- 34 针对右栏问题举几个例子

- 35 这些系统是怎样参与项目实施的，以及这有助于在实现项目目标方面取得进展吗？
- 36 信息交流（动员和合作伙伴部分）主要合作伙伴之间的信息交流工作做得怎么样？如果存在的话，都有哪些沟通障碍？项目方法对于开发拐卖弱势女童和妇女问题的指南和增加这方面的知识相关吗？
- 37 参与式方法参与式方法（包括儿童参与）使用的程度有多大？这种方法哪些方面不错？哪些方面不好？
- 38
- 39
- 40 政府承诺和政策 国家级政府部门和目标省政府致力于和支持项目的程度有多大？
- 41 指导委员会 国家级指导委员会/省级指导委员会/县委员会或领导小组在解决拐卖问题中发挥了怎样的作用？
- 42 各级指委员会的有效程度有多大？
- 43 政策环境 省级计划框架的开发充分考虑满足当地需求了吗？还需要做哪些工作？
- 44 项目利用了有利的政策时机了吗、对政策有影响吗
- 45
- 46 在过去的一年里，各级政府加大了对项目目标和活动的财政支持了吗？
- 47 工作计划、监测、数据收集和分析
- 48 工作计划 项目是否遵循其工作计划？
- 49 工作计划哪些部分比较容易实施？哪些部分比较难实施？原因是什么？
- 50 监测 实施童工监测战略的有效性有多大？童工监测系统（CLMS）有可持续性吗？
- 51 二手数据 项目资助的调研工作都取得了哪些进展？还有哪些工作需要做？调研计划近期有变动或修改吗？
- 52 资金的使用确保项目活动按时完成的项目资金的承诺和支付是否及时有效？
- 53 财政和时间资源是否有效地用于数据采集和项目指标的衡量？
- 54 技术支持 项目技术支持效率（即速度）高吗？有效（即质量）吗？（包括对小型项目、行动计划和其它合同的支持和监测；省级规划的开发和监测、培训和出差等）
- 55 相关性
- 56 针对目标人群的战略的适应性 是否使用了不同战略针对不同目标人群提供项目干预活动？你有哪些改进建议？
- 57 性别和其他的目标人群问题
- 58 针对国家级工作重点和政策的战略的适应性 战略适合国家级、省级和省以下各级的政策发展（特别是教育、劳动、人口流动和扶贫）吗？
- 59 政策环境
- 60 倡导 项目是怎样调整政策倡导战略应对政策影响的不同机遇和限制的？
- 61 工作结合 各省（特别是湖南和广东）是怎样联手打击拐卖工作的？怎样才能改进输出省和输入省的工作关系？
- 62 项目与联合国/国际劳工组织项目的关系 项目与其他联合国与拐卖问题有关的工作的合作程度多大？
- 63 项目与 ILO 其他技术部门之间的沟通有效吗？及时吗？
- 64 项目与 ILO-IPEC 项目，特别是云南试点项目合作得怎么样？
- 65 可持续性
- 66
- 67 "拥有意识" 截止目前项目促进地方和国家级的拥有意识和促进长期可持续性的工作有效吗？项目逐步淘汰的战略观点表达清楚了吗？这个目标取得进展了吗？
- 68
- 69 政府和机构的能力 一旦项目结束，地方/国家机构（包括政府）以及目标人群基于项目成果的长期前景是什么？
- 70
- 71 主流化 童工问题是否纳入了政策体制和相关制度中？
- 72 总结的最好的做法和经验

- 73 推广模式 在其他地方或在更大范围内推广项目所有或部分经验的可能性有哪些？在什么情况下推广？
- 74 总结的经验总结的哪些经验可以用于项目后半部分？
- 75 比较优势 作为 ILO 和 ACWF 的一部分，项目是怎样朝着其在性别问题、劳动问题和中国境内的人口流动问题方面的比较优势而努力的？
- 76 建议在下面几个方面都有哪些完善预防以最恶劣形式劳动剥削为目的拐卖女童和青年妇女整体目标的建议？
- 77 有效动员主要利益相关者了吗？
- 78 开发了对拐卖概念的全面理解了吗？
- 79 改进调研和信息？
- 80 在输出省和输入省开发和监测了在当地社区开展的干预活动了吗？
- 81 加强国家级、省级和省以下各级打击对流动女童和妇女最恶劣形式的剥削的政策？