



INTERNATIONAL LABOUR ORGANIZATION
MULTI-BILATERAL PROGRAMME OF TECHNICAL COOPERATION

Project RER/00/M05/ITA

EVALUATION REPORT

Project Title: **Skills Development for the Reconstruction and Recovery of Kosovo (Phase I and II)**

Project Number: **RER/00/M05/ITA**

Project Site: **Pristina and other locations in the UN Administration of Kosovo**

Project language: **English**

Executing agency: **International Labour Office**

Government counterpart: **Ministry of Labour and Social Welfare, Employment Department**

Starting Date: **February 2001**

End Date: **June 2007 (revised)**

Total Budget: **US\$ 2,617,028 (revised)**

Evaluation Date: **September 2007**

ILO Department: **Skills and Employability Department (EMP/SKILLS)**

Donor: **Government of Italy**

Acknowledgements

We wish to express our sincere thanks to all those who helped and facilitated our tasks as evaluators of this project, namely all the persons who kindly made themselves available for interviews (see Annex 2); the representatives of the Department of Labour and Employment of the Ministry of Labour and Social Welfare, Mr. Ylber Shabani, Mr. Hafiz Leka and their staff; the Senior Employment Specialist of the ILO Sub-Regional Office, Mr. Gianni Rosas; the Skills and Employability Department, particularly Ms Jenny Sang, who assisted the project throughout its life time.

A special acknowledgement goes to the experts in charge of the project, Ms Valli Corbanese, Mr. Sokol Elshani and Mr. Fatmir Burjani, who assisted us during the whole evaluation mission as well as Mr. Visar Rexha who provided interpretation services during interviews and meetings.

Table of contents

Abstract.....	1
Background and context	1
Main findings and conclusions	3
Main recommendations and lessons learned	4
1. Brief background on the project and its logic	8
1.1 Phase I: Skills development	8
1.2 Phase II: Youth employment	9
2. Purpose, scope and clients of the evaluation	9
3. Methodology	10
4. Review of implementation	11
4.1 Phase I: Skills development	12
<i>4.1.1 Network of eight regional VET providers</i>	12
<i>4.1.2. Employment counselling and career guidance</i>	13
<i>4.1.3. Self-employment and income generation</i>	14
4.2 Phase II: Youth employment	15
<i>4.2.1 Youth employment policy development</i>	15
<i>4.2.2 Active labour market programmes targeting disadvantaged youth</i>	16
<i>4.2.3 Capacity building of labour market institutions</i>	17
5. Presentation of findings	18
5.1 Relevance and strategic fit	18
5.2. Validity of design	20
5.3 Project progress and effectiveness	21
5.4 Efficiency of resource use	23
5.5 Effectiveness of management arrangements	23
5.6. Impact orientation and sustainability	24

6.	Conclusions	24
7.	Recommendations	25
8.	Lessons learned	26
9.	Annexes	30
	Annex 1	Terms of reference
	Annex 2	Agenda of meetings
	Annex 3	List of policy and research papers, training tools and material developed by the project
	Annex 4	List of pilot projects
	Annex 5	Summary of achievement of project's indicators

Abstract

Quick Facts

Country:	UN administered Province of Kosovo
Mid-Term Evaluation:	February 2003, July 2005
Mode of Evaluation:	Independent
Technical Area:	Employment
Evaluation Management:	Skills and Employability Department (EMP/SKILLS)
Evaluation Team:	Anthony J. Twigger Fetah Kasumi
Project Start	February 2001
Project End	June 2007
Project code:	RER/00/M05/ITA
Donor:	Italy (US\$ 2,617,028)

Background and context

Summary of the project purpose, logic and structure

Financed by the Government of Italy with a contribution of US\$2.6 million, the project *Skills Development for the Reconstruction and Recovery of Kosovo* had an initial duration of three years. The project was implemented by the ILO in two distinct, albeit interconnected, phases that went beyond the originally planned timeframe. The first phase (2001 – mid 2004) supported the establishment of labour market institutions (i.e. the Ministry of Labour, the Public Employment Service and a network of regional training institutions), while the second (end 2004 – mid 2007) focused on the development of a youth employment policy and action plan as well as on the piloting of active labour market programmes targeting disadvantaged youth.

The reconstruction and recovery of Kosovo was considered, at the time of project formulation, a pressing issue and an essential contribution to lasting peace and stability of the Balkans. To maximize the employment impact of the reconstruction and recovery

programmes, a provision was made for integrating demand-driven, employment-oriented training into the overall recovery strategy. The aim was to tackle the depleted stock of human capital inherited from the previous decade, during which stronger demographic pressures, a low skills-base, and strategies favouring low employment-absorbing sectors made the employment levels of Kosovo the lowest of former Yugoslavia.

Building on prior achievements, the second phase of the ILO project revolved around the strengthening of the capacity of labour market institutions and the social partners to tackle the youth employment challenge. Technical assistance was provided in the design, monitoring, and evaluation of youth employment policies and programmes, as well as the pilot-implementation of active labour market measures targeting disadvantaged youth. The project established an employment and training fund that sponsored a number of school-to-work transition programmes (apprenticeships, internships and in-company training) as well as wage- and self-employment measures.

Purpose, scope and objectives of the evaluation

The purpose of the evaluation was to assess the performance of the two phases of the project in a comprehensive, systematic and objective manner in terms of relevance, effectiveness, efficiency and impact. The evaluation assessed the relevance of project objectives and identified the extent to which the project strategy had proved efficient and effective. Particular emphasis was placed on the review of project sustainability and impact, as well as on possible innovative technical cooperation features in employment and training. Given the particular context and the project duration, the evaluation also looked into the relevance of ILO's approaches to rapidly evolving situations (from post-conflict to institutional set up, institution building and policy development). It also assessed the effectiveness of pilot programmes (direct assistance) and their instrumentality to the institution building and policy development processes.

Methodology of evaluation

Given the nature and length of the project, the methodology of the evaluation was based on quantitative and qualitative methods and included the analyses of various sources of information including desk review of survey data and project files; interviews with governmental counterparts and project partners, direct beneficiaries, partner agencies, project management and staff; and direct observation.

Main findings and conclusions

Findings

The evaluation team was given access to stakeholders, beneficiaries, project partners and other people and organizations associated with the project. Team members found universal acclaim for the project in terms of achievement of objectives and outputs, as well as management style and timeliness of response. There was ample evidence to show that the project achieved leverage far in excess of its relatively modest funding and that it became a model that the Government expects other projects to follow. In this regard, some specific examples of the project's good practices include:

- Extensive technical assistance provided to labour market institutions, including the social partners, and other organization involved in human resource development and employment areas;
- Leverage on limited financial resources through the establishment of co-sharing and partnerships.
- The provision of technical advice regarding workers with disabilities, not only to the Government, but also to local and international NGOs;
- The approach to human resource development and capacity building whereby national staff were trained and encouraged to use their newly acquired expertise to the benefit of their organizations as well as project activities;
- The success in combining education, training and employment in a coherent whole.

Conclusions

The project was able to achieve its objectives partly because, since its inception, it has upheld a clear vision and mission –the establishment of an employment and training infrastructure – that has never wavered. The project's intervention logic has been both realistic and coherent; the implementation approach adopted allowed the project to be flexible and thus to retain its relevance to Kosovo's rapidly changing needs.

The evaluation team concluded that other key features of the success of the ILO project concerned: (i) its catalytic role, which resulted in other donor agencies mainstreaming their assistance within the institutional framework of the Ministry of Labour and Social Welfare (MLSW); (ii) the capacity to work with a number of ministries, agencies and donors; and (iii) the advice provided on policy and legislation, which affected not only Government' policy-making, but also the scope of other technical cooperation projects on vocational education and training and employment.

Recommendations and lessons learned

Main recommendations

During the evaluation meetings, stakeholders expressed the hope that the ILO project would continue its activities in some form or other. The project has committed to finalize and disseminate, with the remaining funds of the project budget, the publications of the last policy documents prepared under the project aegis, namely the school-to work transition survey of Kosovo, the Country Review of Employment Policy and the Kosovo Employment Strategy. The following recommendations stem from the discussions held with the Ministry of Labour and Social Welfare and are based on the challenges that lie ahead for the same Ministry.

- There is a need to strengthen the capacity of labour market institutions to deliver on the objectives of the Kosovo Employment Strategy, currently being finalized.
- The Labour Code and the Employment Promotion bills are expected to be passed by Parliament fairly soon. Once in force, the Ministry would need technical assistance to design relevant by-laws and enforcement procedures.
- The following areas of labour administration are in need of further strengthening: (i) the capacity of the Employment Department to coordinate its operational structure at regional and local levels; (ii) the completion of the reform of the employment services and the creation of a National Employment Agency; and (iii) the strengthening of the labour inspectorate capacity to tackle the informal economy and to effectively protect workers.

In the youth employment field, areas of unfinished work include:

- The need to strengthen the governance system at both central and local level for the implementation of the outcomes envisaged by the Kosovo Youth Employment Action Plan. The drafting of an Action Plan on youth employment was a necessary but not sufficient condition for achieving youth employment outcomes. Kosovo would need further assistance in implementing the Action Plan, especially during the monitoring and evaluation phases when lessons learnt need to feed into policy re-formulation and/or adjustment.
- Such governance system would also be instrumental in aligning the objectives set by economic and social policies – especially the Kosovo Development and the Employment strategies, to youth employment objectives;
- The setting up of social pacts on youth employment at regional level to facilitate the translation of broad youth employment policy objectives into concrete projects that addresses needs of young disadvantaged youth in different labour markets.

Important lessons learnt

- The formulation of appropriate and realistic objectives aligned to the particular country situation is of the essence. Objectives should be accompanied by realistic performance indicators. At the same time, however, it is necessary to adopt during project implementation a flexible approach that enables the project to take account of, and adapt to, changing national circumstances.
- Another key feature of success is to ensure that the project stakeholders, partner institutions and other organizations directly associated with the project, are constantly involved in the planning and implementation of activities. The extensive dialogue established by the project with the many national and international actors present in Kosovo – albeit time-consuming– did yield results in terms of visibility, leverage and impact.
- The practice to seek co-financing and in-kind contribution from many stakeholders in order to leverage on the funds available is a lesson that could be mainstreamed in most technical cooperation projects. Despite the considerable time investment that such practice entails, it does pay off in terms of quantity and quality of outputs, stakeholders’ and beneficiaries’ satisfaction as well as response capacity of the project to emerging needs.
- Capacity building of partner institutions should be a key component of any project strategy, as it guarantees sustainability and helps plan and administer exit modalities that strengthen – instead of weakening – the sustainability of project’s activities.

2) Skills development

- Core employability skills (e.g. learning competence, communication, teamwork, client-orientation, quality awareness, etc.) should be integrated into competency-based curricula development since the very beginning to ensure the responsiveness of vocational training courses to the changing requirements of the labour market. The integration of such skills into the curricula at a later stage, e.g. once the vocational and technical components have been developed, may cause the overlooking of those mix of competencies that make the difference between success and failure in the labour market.
- The promotion of decentralization of decision-making and social dialogue on training at regional level was partly offset by the fact that most of the administrative and financial competencies were retained at central level. Thus, while most of the knowledge and experience on the management of training institutions and vocational training programmes has been acquired at the regional level, the administrative and financial decisions (specifically on human resource

recruitment, good and service procurement and disbursements of funds) rested with various Departments of the MLSW, with no knowledge on the specific requirements of the VET system.

- Gender mainstreaming approaches can result insufficient in contexts where gender imbalances in employment and training are rather significant. Positive action could be an alternative to raise awareness and take action on the promotion of gender equality in the world of work.
- To improve effectiveness in reaching the quantitative and qualitative indicators of the project, a monitoring system was developed that included the assessment of vocational trainers performance, quality control of the competency-based training material produced and placement rate of individuals trained. However, such a system entails the investment of substantial human and financial resources, not always readily available. The lack of consistent monitoring may put the overall performance of the training system as well as the attainment of policy objectives at risk.
- In circumstances where the national salary scale compares unfavourably with wages in the private and international cooperation sectors, it is extremely difficult for projects working in partnership with national public institutions to ensure that staff included in human resource development programmes remains attached to those institutions. To guarantee the return-on-investment and sustainability of staff development activities it is necessary to assist public institutions in establishing their own human resource development structures.

3) Youth employment

- Substantive technical support is required to enable national institutions to effectively tackle the complexity of youth employment policy design, monitoring and evaluation. To this end assistance should be made available at all stages of the policy cycle (design, implementation, monitoring and evaluation).
- The involvement of social partners can bring focus on issues (e.g. informal economy, working conditions, youth discouragement and inactivity, the promotion of socially responsible enterprises) that are not always in the government's agenda. The design in a project document of separate components can help strengthen the capacity of the social partners and empower them vis-à-vis the government.
- One of the success factors of ALMPs targeting youth at risk of exclusion is the availability of baseline data detecting the main determinants of labour market disadvantage and the establishment of sound targeting mechanisms for the administration of programmes. The ALMPs implemented in Kosovo

demonstrated once more that the effectiveness and impact of these programmes is greater for those groups of the population that are facing multiple disadvantages in the labour market.

- The need to carry out impact evaluation of active labour market programmes cannot be underestimated. Not only such evaluations allow the assessment of which programme work best and for whom, but they also provide insights in the performance of the institution mandated to their administration and in the planning of financial and human resource allocation necessary to achieve policy objectives.

1. Background on the project and its logic

The project *Skills Development for the Reconstruction and Recovery of Kosovo* was implemented by the ILO in two distinct, albeit interconnected, phases. The first phase of the project (2001 – mid 2004) supported the establishment of labour market institutions (i.e. the Ministry of Labour, the Public Employment Service and a network of regional training institutions), while the second (end 2004 – mid 2007) focused on the development of a youth employment policy and action plan as well as on the piloting of active labour market programmes targeting disadvantaged youth. The following paragraphs outline the main strategic components of the two project phases. A summary of key results and main activities is reported in Section 4.

1.1. Skills development

The reconstruction and recovery of Kosovo was considered, at the time of project formulation, a pressing issue and an essential contribution to lasting peace and stability of the Balkans. To maximize the employment impact of the reconstruction and recovery programmes, a provision was made for integrating demand-driven, employment-oriented training into the overall recovery strategy. The aim was to tackle the depleted stock of human capital inherited from the previous decade, during which stronger demographic pressures, a low skills-base, and strategies favouring low employment-absorbing sectors made the employment levels of Kosovo the lowest of former Yugoslavia. The main problems identified during the formulation of the project were: lack of infrastructure for delivering adult training; limited capacity to provide employment-oriented, competency-based training programmes, as well as lack of curricula and relevant training material; the absence of a system for the training and retraining of trainers and training managers; limited capacity to provide alternatives to wage-employment — such as self-employment, micro-entrepreneurship training and related assistance; weakness of labour-related institutions mandated to assist job-seekers (counselling, guidance and job-placement); and the absence of linkages between training and the labour market (active measures).

Against this backdrop, the project assisted the Kosovo authorities in establishing a vocational training system for adult unemployed and workers, in building the capacity of labour market institutions in the provision of counselling, guidance and other assistance to job seekers, and in developing a system for the promotion of self-employment through vocational education and training (VET) institutions and the employment services. The main problems identified were addressed through: (i) the setting up of a network of training institutions, delivering employment-oriented and competency-based training programmes; (ii) building the capacity of the Public Employment Services (PES) to assist job seekers through the provision of career information, counselling and guidance services; and (iii) developing self-employment options, micro-entrepreneurship training, and follow-up assistance.

The project strategy was built upon institutional development and direct support components. The first component aimed to build the capacity of labour market institutions to design, monitor, and evaluate training and employment measures while the second revolved around the establishment of a network of regional VET providers (facilities, equipment, and training methodologies), the piloting of skills development programmes and the provision of employment services for selected target groups of beneficiaries. The direct project recipients were managers and practitioners of training institutions and employment services as well as employers' and workers' organizations. All activities were developed and implemented through the Ministry of Labour and Social Welfare (MLSW) and with the participation of social partners, both at the central (National Tripartite Board and Steering Committee) and local levels (Regional Management Training Boards).¹

1.2. Youth employment

The second phase of the project focused on the promotion of youth employment. Building on prior achievements, this phase of the ILO project revolved around the strengthening of the capacity of labour market institutions and the social partners in the design, monitoring, and evaluation of youth employment policies and programmes, as well as the pilot-implementation of active labour market measures targeting disadvantaged youth. The project established an employment and training fund that sponsored a number of school-to-work transition programmes (apprenticeships, internships and in-company training) as well as wage- and self-employment measures. The institutional capacity building component comprised technical assistance and advisory services to the MLSW and the social partners, but also to the Ministry of Culture, Youth and Sport (MCSY), to the Ministry of Education (MEST), the Ministry of Economy and Finance (MEF), and the Office of the Prime Minister.

2. Purpose, scope and clients of the evaluation

The purpose of the evaluation is to assess the performance of the two phases of the project in a comprehensive, systematic and objective manner in terms of relevance, effectiveness, efficiency and impact. The evaluation assesses the relevance of project objectives and identifies the extent to which: (i) the project achieved its planned objectives, (ii) its strategy had proved efficient and effective, and (iii) the project is likely to have a long-term impact. The evaluation looks at the project as a whole, with a view to

¹ Prior to 2002, the Project counterpart was the Department of Employment and Labour of the UN Mission in Kosovo

identify good practices and lessons learnt to be used as a knowledge base for developing future technical assistance packages.

Particular emphasis is placed on the review of project sustainability and impact, as well as on possible innovative technical cooperation features in employment and training. Given the particular context and the project duration, the evaluation also looks into the relevance of the ILO's approaches to rapidly evolving situations (from post-conflict to institutional set up, institution building and policy development). It also assesses the effectiveness of pilot programmes (direct assistance) and their instrumentality to the institution building and policy development processes. Finally, the evaluation reviews the relevance of the:

- Initiatives aimed at mainstreaming gender in technical cooperation;
- Involvement of the social partners;
- ILO's integrated approach and methodology for the development of youth employment policy and national action plans;
- ILO's employment-oriented approach to skills development (introduction of competency-based modular training, delivery of employment services and promotion of self-employment);
- Technical assistance to the reform of the PES and to the introduction of active labour market programmes (ALMPs);
- Communication and awareness-raising strategies introduced by the project;
- Partnerships and alliances established by the project.

The final clients of the evaluation report are:

- Policy makers, managers and practitioners of labour market and other institutions that partnered with the project at central and local levels, as well as the social partners and the donor;
- Project management, the technical Department (EMP/SKILLS), the Youth Employment Programme, the ILO Sub regional Office for Central and Eastern Europe and, ultimately, the Technical Cooperation Committee of the ILO's Governing Body.

3. Methodology

A pragmatic approach has been adopted for the evaluation based on both qualitative and quantitative methods. The following data sources and data collection methods were used by the evaluation team:

- a) A comprehensive analysis of various sources of information including desk review of survey data and project files, including the project document, technical

- and policy papers produced by the project; work plans; progress reports and minutes of Steering Committees' meetings;
- b) Interviews and meetings with governmental counterparts and project partners, direct beneficiaries, partner agencies, project management and staff. To that purpose a mission was fielded to the UN Administered Province of Kosovo from 29th August to 9th September 2007.

4. Review of implementation

Financed by the Government of Italy with a contribution of US\$2.6 million, the project had an initial duration of three years. A second phase of the same project was approved for the period 2004-2006. The government counterpart at the time of project formulation was the Administrative Department of Labour and Employment (DoLE) of the United Nations Interim Administration Mission in Kosovo (UNMIK). The new constitutional framework established the Ministry of Labour and Social Welfare (MLSW), which became the project counterpart as of 2002.² Since 2004 the project has been progressing through two interconnected phases, as reflected by the project document and its addendum: Phase I on *Skills Development* (US\$1.8 million) and Phase II on *Youth Employment* (US\$0.8 million). In 2004, the Italian Government granted a further financing of US\$534,443 to continue project activities until June 2005. An addendum to the project, centred on the strengthening the capacity of labour market institutions to address the youth employment challenge, was developed in August 2004 and another agreement was signed between the ILO and UNMIK (on behalf of the PISG-MLSW) in October 2004. In 2005 the Italian Government granted an additional US\$265,252 to expand ongoing technical assistance to youth employment policy and programme development.

The progress of the project was internally evaluated twice. A mid-term review was carried out in February 2003, while a tripartite review was held in July 2005 to assess achievements, lessons learned and outstanding issues relating to the youth employment phase. With the additional financial contributions received in 2005 and by re-allocating the savings accrued, the project continued activities until June 2007.

For easy reference, the key outputs achieved by the project are summarized under the two separate headings skills development and youth employment.

² UNMIK Regulation 2001/19 *On the Executive Branch of the PISG*,

4.1 Skills development

4.1.1. Network of eight regional VET providers

Four Regional Vocational Training Centres (in Pristina, Peja, Gjakova and Prizren), were refurbished and provided with modern equipment to deliver training programmes to adult unemployed in priority occupations, according to the ILO competency-based modular approach that was adopted by the MLSW as the delivery mechanism for adult training in Kosovo. The ILO project introduced learning methodologies and invested in the development of human resources (i.e. training managers, methodologists and trainers) to improve labour market relevance, efficiency and effectiveness of adult training. Institution and capacity building of the MLSW, initially supported by the ILO only, brought about other donor agencies that were encouraged to mainstream their assistance within the institutional framework of the MLSW. Accordingly, the competency-based modular approach was extended to four additional adult training institutions sponsored by the Danish Technical Cooperation Agency (DANIDA) and to other private training providers that joined the Ministry's network. The ILO provided technical assistance to support the MLSW in the development of the methodological aspects related to trainers', methodologists' and managers' competencies. The Management of Training Institutions programme, that combined periodical training workshops with work-based learning, was extended to the managers and training providers working under the Ministry's aegis.

Project activities increased along the expansion of the MLSW regional network of training providers. The project specifically supported: (i) the development of communication and promotional tools for the MLSW services, (ii) the training of MLSW newly-recruited trainers and the continuous upgrading of trainers' competencies, (iii) a training and development programme for improving access of vulnerable groups to skills development and employment services, and (iv) the development of training policies. At the request of the Penal Management Division (PMD/Kosovo Correctional Services) and of the MLSW, the ILO project provided technical assistance to establish vocational education and training programmes within correctional facilities. Since 2004, employment and training services available under the MLSW network are offered to detainees. The outcomes of Phase I of the project were discussed in the Tripartite Steering Committee of July 2004. The main areas of concern and relevant recommendations for the delivery of vocational training were synthesized in the policy paper *Challenges and Opportunities of Skills Development in Kosovo*.

4.1.3. *Employment counselling and career guidance*

The counselling and guidance component of the project was developed on the basis of an *ad-hoc* strategy that focused on the design of programmes and tools reflecting the ILO approach to human resources and training, as well as the principles outlined in the international labour standards. The staff development programmes designed under this heading comprised: (i) a training needs analysis workshop to identify core areas and elements for the design of the counselling and guidance strategy of the project; (ii) an international fellowship to provide practitioners with comparative information on career development policies and programmes, and to introduce counselling and guidance skills to PES staff, and (iii) a number of training activities targeting PES practitioners to introduce individual employment counselling techniques in all regional and municipal employment offices. Particular emphasis was placed on addressing the needs of the most disadvantaged groups of the population and the ways to identify and “treat” them with employment services. Project activities under this heading touched upon a number of areas. First, the activities resulted in the establishment of a new framework for the registration of unemployed individuals and vacancies. This new procedure was accompanied by the development of an electronic registration system (SIMPS) — now operational in the Regional Employment Offices — capable of aggregating administrative data along the requirements of a reliable and timely Labour Market Information System (LMIS). Second, an approach to sequence the services available in the employment services and to target individuals at risk of labour market exclusion was trial-tested with unemployed persons with disabilities (PWDs). PES staff were trained and coached in the provision of the service to this target group, in assessing occupational skills and types/levels of disability for vocational training purposes and in administering an incentive scheme designed to place PWDs in private enterprises.³ Third, the 2004 assessment of career guidance services in Kosovo pointed to the urgency of establishing a career information and guidance system in schools.⁴ In this respect, work focused on the piloting of a training programme for 9th grade school teachers on career guidance services in compulsory education.

The lessons learned during the implementation of the counselling and guidance component of the project highlighted the need to develop a training tool for employment counsellors and PES trainers addressing: a) career development skills to improve the effectiveness of counselling services; b) equity and social inclusion principles and practices; c) the need to build and/or strengthen the training skills of those entrusted to replicate training; and d) the use of information and communication technology (ICT) for

³ The incentive system designed by the ILO Project was jointly financed by the MLSW and an Italian NGO (CICA).

⁴ The EU-sponsored Project (KOSVET) conducted pilot training activities in 2004, which aimed at mainstreaming career information and guidance into basic education. This work was undertaken with the support of the trained personnel of the Ministry of Labour and Social Welfare

collecting information and/or delivering the service. The training tool was published in the Albanian language and is available in the Kosovo employment services (see annex 3 for a list of policy and research papers, training tools and materials developed). The main achievements in the counselling and guidance component of the project were assessed in the report *Improving Public Employment Services in Kosovo* that highlights improvements in service delivery and the challenges ahead (e.g. human resources development, establishment of a labour market information system, and the monitoring and evaluation of service performance).

4.1.4. Self-employment and income generation

The self-employment and income-generation component of the project was based on a two-level approach. The first level related to the promotion of self-employment through orientation seminars and entrepreneurship animation days to be included in learning events as part of the curricula of both last year secondary technical schools and adult training institutions/programmes, and career counselling sessions organized by the staff of the PES. The second level focused on the development of an in-depth self-employment training programme delivered by VET institutions to those who had shown potential and initiative in setting up their own economic activity or business. By June 2004, more than 850 jobseekers had received induction training in self-employment and 173 had completed a fully-fledged training programme and developed their business plan. The delays in achieving the project indicators were due mainly to the late recruitment of self-employment trainers by the MLSW. This component of the project also tested the feasibility of measures targeting the most disadvantaged groups. In cooperation with the World Health Organization and the Ministry of Health and Mental Health Service, the ILO project designed an integrated training and self-employment scheme for previously institutionalized persons with mental disability. By April 2004 these persons were able to perform the basic tasks of the *Garden design, ornamental plants and landscape maintenance* occupational profile. The related income-generating activity received a six-month micro-credit from KOS-Invest (sponsored by World Vision International), which was fully re-paid by December 2004. Pending the development of an appropriate regulatory framework, this *de-facto* social cooperative was given the legal status of non-government organization. Such a pilot initiative, however, was discontinued as the management of the Gjakova Hospital did not extend the detachment period of the manager of the NGO, who could combine the management of the organization with nursing skills.

To identify entrepreneurship promotion practices from other countries, especially those targeting young people, the project and the International Training Centre (Turin) co-sponsored a fellowship programme to Poland. The programme focused on the role of public and private institutions in promoting self-employment programmes. Three main lessons were drawn by participants: i) to improve the relevance and effectiveness of (self-

)employment counselling and career guidance services targeting youth, ii) to improve the quantity and quality of education and training services for self-employment and entrepreneurship development, and iii) to establish the legal and financial mechanisms for promoting self-employment for youth.

To summarize, by June 2004 — when the first phase of the project was concluded — the four ILO-sponsored vocational training centres had provided competency-based courses to 1,609 unemployed; the trained staff of the PES and of the four VET institutions provided employment and training services to almost 25,000 job seekers. The number of jobseekers involved in training programmes that were developed according to the ILO's methodology was even greater, when considering the other VET centres of the MLSW as well as private providers where this methodology was introduced. The project also: (i) developed 25 staff development programmes, (ii) conducted 1,800 participant/days of training and 50 group and individual coaching sessions, (iv) designed a number of training tools and packages covering the thematic areas of the project and (v) undertook a social marketing campaign on employment issues. In order to promote research and animate debates in the employment and social fields – as well as to assist the Provisional Institutions of Self-Government (PISG), the MLSW, the social partners, and other governmental institutions in policy design and programme development – the project prepared and/or commissioned a number of reports and policy papers on: i) the Kosovo skills development system and public employment services, ii) VET provision in correction facilities, iii) the establishment of an Institute of Labour and Social Studies, and iv) the gender dimension of vocational education and training. It also provided technical assistance and advisory services for the design of a number of key employment-related laws including the law on vocational education and training, the law on adult training, and on National Qualifications Framework (NQF). The project also prepared a backgrounder for a feasibility study on the introduction of a system for Recognition of Prior Learning.

In the employment area, it conducted a review of employment policies and provided technical inputs and coordination to the work on the elaboration of the employment strategy of Kosovo.

4.2 Youth employment

The key outputs and main activities of the second phase of the project are described in the three headings below.

4.2.1 Youth employment policy development

The project organized, from September 2005 to December 2006, a capacity-building programme for the development of the Kosovo Action Plan on youth employment. The programme comprised four main components: i) a series of thematic

seminars on youth employment (September 2005-April 2006); ii) a training workshop on youth employment policy development (April 2006); iii) a number of follow-up and promotional activities (May-November 2006); and iv) policy endorsement (December 2006).

The thematic seminars brought together policy-makers from seven ministries, employers' and workers' organizations and youth organizations to discuss policy options to address youth employment. Two working groups were established to devise strategies concerning labour demand and labour supply. The results of the work carried out by the ILO project in Kosovo (review of the adult training system, career guidance, self-employment opportunities, baseline data and analyses of the youth labour market, preliminary assessment and lessons learnt from the implementation of ALMPs) were discussed by these working groups.

The main objective of the training workshop "*Developing an Action Plan on Youth Employment*" was to strengthen participants' capacity to develop an Action Plan by: (i) getting a better understanding of national practices and lessons learned with regard to labour market policies and programmes affecting young people; (ii) developing a framework to ensure a comprehensive and coherent approach to youth employment policy development; and (iii) identifying and discussing the objectives, targets and outcomes of the Action Plan as well as the respective responsibilities of line Ministries. The last leg of the capacity-building programme related to the finalization of the Plan, its dissemination among representatives of local government and youth organizations, and its endorsement by the PISG of Kosovo during a national conference organized in December 2006. The main outcomes of the Kosovo action plan on youth employment are now embedded in the draft Kosovo Development Strategy.

4.2.2 Active labour market programmes targeting disadvantaged youth

This component revolved around building the capacity of labour market institutions to design, administer, monitor and evaluate programmes to enhance the employability and employment prospects of disadvantaged youth. The objectives of the active labour market programmes were to address the specific disadvantages of young labour market entrants. Most of the pilot programmes were enterprise-based training (in-company training and apprenticeship) and work placement schemes. The initiatives were implemented on the basis of the guidelines, models and tools developed by the project. The latter are now being consolidated in a number of regulatory instruments.

The project provided technical assistance to the staff of the PES in order to set up a monitoring and evaluation mechanism to assess the impact of the ALMPs and to check, through randomized trials, whether substitution effects and other distortions occurred when implementing these programmes. The evaluation yielded interesting lessons in terms of versatility of the targeting mechanisms and employment impact. The measures appeared to be particularly effective for the long-term unemployed youth coming from

low-income households and ethnic minorities facing multiple disadvantages (low educational attainment, low family income, and longer unemployment spells coupled with mobility constraints and stereotyped attitudes in recruitment).

4.2.3. *Capacity building of labour market institutions*

Besides the capacity building work involving the Ministry of Labour, other line ministries and the PES, the project continued the assistance to vocational training experts in advancing the work on VET methodologies to improve the relevance of training to labour market requirements. One of the key policy recommendations highlighted in the review of the adult training system focused on the need to periodically monitor outcomes of the vocational training system and continuously assess impact.⁵ Technical assistance was provided to training methodologists in the design and implementation of tracer studies. The main difference between the tracer study conducted in 2006 and those carried out in 2002 and 2003 consisted in the design of a statistically significant sample covering the whole network of training centres. Baseline data gathered by the project pointed to an increase in the number of young workers in informal and casual employment. In 2005, the project conducted a number of capacity-building activities to increase the understanding of labour market institutions on issues pertaining to the informal economy and to devise strategies addressing informal employment. A capacity building workshop was conducted to review modern labour inspection techniques and raise awareness on the issues relating to informal employment. The capacity building of the Labour Inspectorate was perceived as instrumental for the achievement of the project objectives since the service plays a key role in the control and promotion of labour law enforcement. The workshop offered also the opportunity to assess medium- to long-term technical assistance needs of the Inspectorate and to formulate a set of recommendations. Decent work deficits and the magnitude of the informal economy in Kosovo were also discussed during a roundtable organized by the Federation of Independent Trade Unions (BSPK) – with the support of the International Confederation of Free Trade Unions (ICFTU) and the ILO project. The proceedings and background material prepared, as well as the recommendations stemming from the meeting, were published by the project.

Another strand of the work of the Youth Employment project relates to capacity-building activities benefiting the social partners, especially with regards to the design, monitoring, and evaluation of youth employment measures. These activities focused on the collection of baseline information on working conditions of young workers and their participation in trade unions, the implementation of a campaign on youth rights at work and the preparation of the statute of the Youth Network of the Confederation of Independent Trade Unions of Kosovo.

⁵ Challenges and Opportunities of Skills Development in Kosovo: An assessment for Strategy Preparation.

A number of activities were implemented with the Chamber of Commerce to promote self-employment among young people. These activities included the analysis of the environment for the establishment of businesses and the identification of possible red tapes that could affect self-employment opportunities for the youth. This work resulted in the development of an information booklet entitled “*Biz Up: Starting your enterprise - A to Z directory for youth*” and the opening of an information desk and a mentoring system for young entrepreneurs within the Chamber of Commerce.

To conclude, the work on youth employment aimed at fostering inter-ministerial coordination and the involvement of social partners in policy design and implementation; addressing the identified efficiency gaps in the provision of employment and vocational training services; and providing a solid management base for up-scaling and diversifying active labour market policies and programmes. Such work generated a number of spin-off effects, including the decision of the government to continue, with major funding from the UNDP, the implementation of ALMPs for young unemployed at risk of labour market exclusion.

5. Presentation of findings

The findings recorded in this section of the evaluation report are listed under the headings: i) relevance and strategic fit; ii) validity of design; iii) project progress and effectiveness; vi) efficiency of resource use; v) effectiveness of management arrangements; vi) impact orientation and sustainability.

5.1. Relevance and strategic fit

All documents reviewed and the stakeholders contacted confirmed that the project had been highly relevant to the needs of the post-conflict Kosovo. The needs analysis carried out at the beginning of the project reflected the various needs of the different project partners. To adequately address the needs and priorities of the transition period, the strategy of the project was built upon a direct support and institutional development component.

Direct support was provided for the establishment of a network of regional training centres tasked with the delivery of both theoretical and practical training in priority occupations. Due to the institutional vacuum of the post-conflict period and the lack of economic development strategies, a constant and direct feedback with the labour market was ensured by the project management and the employment service to avoid the delivery of redundant training programmes. The multi-sectoral approach adopted by the international community for the reconstruction and recovery of Kosovo at the time was indicative of the skills required in the short and medium run.

The institutional development component related to building the capacity of labour market institutions in identifying and implementing training and related employment measures. In this respect, the activities of the project contributed to the introduction of policies and measures pertinent to the transition context and to the re-orientation of the training system. This component targeted the key labour market players, such as managers and trainers of training institutions, local government, employers' and workers' associations, as well as the employment services.

The underpinning strategy of second phase of the project considered employment not only in terms of unemployment of young people, but also their predominance in precarious and poor quality jobs in the informal economy. In this respect, core labour standards and other ILO instruments of particular significance for youth employment were used to benchmark governance and fairness of the youth labour market. The other assumption was that strategies to improve employment opportunities for young people had to be part of broader economic and social policies that translated into more and better jobs. Concurrently, to address and overcome the specific difficulties faced by disadvantaged youth in entering and remaining in the labour market, the project designed and implemented targeted interventions. The lessons learned from the implementation of active programmes reverted into the development of policies and strategies.

The institutional development component of the second phase of the project aimed at increasing the effectiveness of labour market and other institutions, including the social partners, in addressing the youth employment challenge. This component comprised the development of a combination of knowledge and tools for advocacy and services. The involvement of several stakeholders fostered a more coordinated and holistic approach to youth employment, combining the initiatives of different ministries and between central and local agencies. The project strategy also succeeded in bringing the social partners closer to the decision making process, thus ensuring broader participation in policy and programme design.

The direct support component focused on the implementation of demonstration activities aimed at improving effectiveness and targeting of youth employment programmes. The first phase of the project had brought to light the limited institutional capacity in targeting the most disadvantaged young jobseekers. Thus, the second phase supported targeted programmes for youth at risk of poverty and social exclusion, as well as redressed gender inequalities in access to employment and training services.

The project established close links with all the stakeholders and these links, together with the decisions taken at the regular meetings of the Steering Committee, ensured that the needs were continuously checked for relevance throughout the life of the project. As new needs emerged, the project addressed them and found ways of encompassing them into project activities.

There was ample evidence to show that all stakeholders, including the social partners, had taken ownership of the project concept and approach since the design phase.

The project achieved particular positive notoriety by offering advice and assistance to all Ministries and organizations involved in skill development and employment issues, thus supporting many cross-cutting and sectoral activities. The project also established good working relation with the IPEC project on the elimination of child labour in Kosovo, which started in 2004. The two ILO projects shared premises and coordinated activities involving the MLSW civil servants (employment service counsellors, social workers and labour inspectors). Participation to active labour market measures of the end beneficiaries of the IPEC projects (children withdrawn from hazardous child labour and victims of trafficking) was planned, but failed to materialize due to the late start-up of IPEC re-integration activities. However, the two projects succeeded in guaranteeing priority access for youth 15 to 18 years old to the vocational training courses offered by the network of the Ministry of Labour and partner institutions.

The project has pioneered some ILO policies and practices in the region.⁶ For instance, the process used for the development of an action plan on youth employment as well as the approach to competency-based training are now being extended to other countries in the region. The project has complemented and linked with activities of other donors at the local level and has been influential in setting the policies and practices of projects financed by other donors. Examples include the Don Bosco Training Centre, a private training provider, and the Penal Management Division. Both adopted the competency-based methodology to provide vocational training services to disadvantaged youth and to persons serving prison sentences, respectively.

5.2. Validity of design

Despite the uncertainties and institutional vacuum prevailing at the time of design, the project established a clear vision and mission – the creation of an effective training and employment infrastructure – that has never wavered during the course of the whole project. The intervention logic was coherent and realistic, and was appreciated by the Ministry of Labour and the social partners. Outputs were causally linked to the intended outcomes (immediate objectives) that linked to broader impact (development objective). The overall project design was plausible and achievable.

The three specific objectives of the first phase of the project (network of self-sustainable training centres; employment offices able to provide vocational counselling and guidance; establishment of a self-employment training system) were undoubtedly achieved by mid 2004. This was confirmed during the interviews with key informants and by the physical verification carried out during the evaluation mission.

The second phase of the project followed logically, and built on the results of the previous phase in a well-designed, seamless fashion. All three specific objectives designed in the addendum to the original project document – namely the strengthening of

⁶ See list of pilot projects in Annex 4.

the capacity of the Government and social partners in youth employment policy development; and the introduction of pilot programmes to enhance the employability and decent work opportunities of disadvantaged youth – were reached.

Each phase contributed to the central theme of the project (the creation of an effective training and employment infrastructure). The list of partner organizations was impressive, each phase producing new partners to add to the list. Many ministries and governmental agencies became partners, as did other projects focusing on human resource and employment issues. This factor underlined the basic approach of the ILO project management – creating leverage through partnership. One specific example illustrates this point: one of the first phase objectives was to establish a network of three vocational training providers. By partnering with other organizations, the project contributed to the expansion of the training network of the MLSW to eight public providers. Other organizations were attracted to the ILO project because of the widely-acknowledged success of its activities. The competency-based training arrangements and their link to labour market requirements were universally acclaimed as best practice, thus attracting other training providers to join in the training network. This process extended the influence of the ILO project and concurrently increased its overall delivery.

The post-conflict situation of Kosovo meant that many assumptions had to be made at the project proposal stage. The assumptions proved to be realistic: the socio-political situation did not worsen, the network of vocational training centres was included in the national framework and public expenditure provision was made to cover the counterpart's commitments towards the project. Project involvement in the drafting of bills relating to human resource and employment-related matters contributed to the standing of the project and it also minimized the risk that such laws might have had if their content had not reflected the realities of the new economic situation.⁷

Indicators of achievement contained in the project document were realistic and were exceeded in many instances. The project records were good and comprehensive. This facilitated the measurement and verification of the project performance indicators (see annex 5 for a summary of indicators' achievement). Gender issues were tracked, more so as the project progressed beyond the first emergency reconstruction phase.

5.3. Project progress and effectiveness

All stakeholders and partners contacted throughout the evaluation mission stressed the high quality of the project outputs, the high level of services provided by the project staff and management, as well as the timeliness of technical inputs. The project achieved its objectives and in many instances exceeded its performance indicators. By

⁷ See list of papers and documents produced by the project in Annex 3.

mid 2004 – at the conclusion of the first phase of the project – the overall number of people trained in the four ILO-assisted training centres was 1,609 individuals (compared to the planned 1,500), of which approximately 80 per cent subsequently found work as an outcome. At the time of the final evaluation of the project the overall number of people who had participated to competency-based training courses totalled 13,926 individuals (see annex 5).

Examples of project success that were consistently mentioned to the evaluation team were in the fields of self employment, employment counselling and career guidance, social and development policies, curriculum development, training of public sector staff, and the publication of researches and policy papers on human resource and employment topics (see annex 3 for a list of the project researches, policy papers and training tools). The efforts of the project in the development and dissemination of training materials, management tools and policy guidelines in the local languages have to be commended. They are a key value added of the overall project.

Another particularly successful output was the Kosovo youth employment policy and action plan. The policy design follows the ILO guidelines and is already being used as a model for other countries in the region. Also impressive, in the youth employment field, was the extent of project activities targeting disadvantaged youth through active labour market programmes. The placement rate for participants on the programmes was 46 per cent overall (20 per cent for women and 27 per cent for men). This compares very favourably with the placement rates for non-participants (control group), which were less than 10 per cent overall (2.3 per cent for women and 7.6 per cent for men).

The project extensively engaged the social partners in all areas of activities, thus improving overall social dialogue. A striking example of social partner cooperation was the strengthening of the youth network of the trade unions in raising young people awareness on their rights at work and the establishment of a youth network of the Chamber of Commerce, with the aim of familiarizing youth with self-employment and entrepreneurship development opportunities. Both sides admit that more remains to be done, but an effective start has been made through project's activities.

The project has achieved its success through the constant mainstreaming of ILO strategies and principles into its activities. Examples include the attention to gender equality and decent work principles, the use of best practices in the design, monitoring and evaluation of active labour market policies and in human resource development. Wherever appropriate, compliance with ILO labour standards has been assured.

Stakeholders were intensely proud of what they continually refer to as “their” project indicating that this had succeeded in ensuring local ownership. The share of ownership was not limited only to stakeholders – virtually all the people who met the evaluation team expressed their feeling that the project was “their” project. The project was impressively responsive to the needs of the Kosovo constituents and their priorities, as well as to economic and institutional changes.

5.4. Efficiency of resource use

Resources (funds, human resources, time and expertise) were allocated strategically to achieve outcomes. The financial situation was constantly monitored and, wherever possible, external funding or co-sharing was sought. It was in this way that the project managed to get the leverage that is apparent in the project outcomes and impact.

There was widespread agreement amongst stakeholders and others involved in the project that funds were used in an extremely effective way and that both project funds and activities were delivered in a very timely manner. This contributed to the achievement of the good results and to an efficient delivery of outputs.

5.5. Effectiveness of management arrangements

The management difficulties the project experienced at inception were quickly corrected and, since mid 2001, the project has been managed in a very professional manner, with timely delivery of technical inputs.

Despite the many difficulties, the Kosovo Government delivered most of the promised human resources, provided the funds to refurbish the training centres and co-financed the employment and training fund for the implementation of active labour market programmes.

The project governance was well founded and active. The project had the full backing of all senior Government officials from the Minister of labour down. There appeared to be a clear understanding of the roles and responsibilities of all parties involved and the project received adequate support from its national partners. Implementing partners provided the inputs needed for effective project implementation, albeit with some delays in certain instances. The project Steering Committee had a good grasp of the project strategy and its contribution to the success of the project was significant.

Internal ILO relationships during project implementation were exemplary. The project received adequate administrative, technical and political support from the relevant ILO Headquarters departments and from ILO specialists. Communications between the project and all other agencies were also very good.

Project management monitored project performance closely and had appropriate systems to do so. Cooperation with project partners was effective and the project made good use of coordination and collaboration opportunities whenever they arose. This includes the ILO IPEC project in Kosovo, but it also applies to other donors and projects – for instance the European Agency for Reconstruction-financed project *Technical Assistance for Vocational Education Training Programme in Kosovo* and the Norwegian-financed UNDP Project on *Employment Generation*.

5.6. Impact orientation and sustainability

The impact of the project exceeded expectations. The leverage effect from a relatively modest financial investment by the Government of Italy has been exceptional. The project succeeded in:

- setting up the training and employment infrastructure of the Ministry of Labour and Social Welfare, comprising a network of training centres delivering competency-based programmes and self-employment training, as well as decentralized employment offices offering job search assistance, counselling and placement services to the unemployed;
- contributing to the drafting of labour, employment and education laws as well as relevant policies and strategies;
- supporting the Government of Kosovo in the design of a coherent youth employment policy and action plan.

These are just some of the major achievements of the project, but they illustrate the enormous impact the project has had on the development of post-conflict Kosovo. The long-term impact of the project on human resources development is very clear: the basis has been established for decent work opportunities and for a reduction in poverty levels.

The project has concentrated on capacity building in the partner organizations and this has enabled a realistic exit strategy to be enacted. Partners are able to continue with the work thanks to the outcomes of the ILO project. The beneficiaries, including the Ministry of Labour and Social Welfare, appreciate the positive impact that the project has had, but they also realize that more needs to be done. However, there is universal acclaim that this project has done a remarkable job with the resources put at its disposal.

6. Conclusions

The project was able to achieve its objectives partly because, since inception, it has upheld a clear vision and mission –the establishment of an employment and training infrastructure – that has never wavered. The project’s intervention logic has been both realistic and coherent; the implementation approach adopted allowed the project to be flexible and thus to retain its relevance to Kosovo’s needs.

The evaluation team concluded that other key features of the success of the ILO project revolved around: (i) its catalytic role, which resulted in other donor agencies mainstreaming their assistance within the institutional framework of the MLSW; (ii) the capacity to work with a number of ministries, agencies and donors; and (iii) the advice

provided on policy and legislation, which affected not only Government' policy-making, but also the scope of other technical cooperation projects on vocational education and training and on employment.

The team also considers that it had been a privilege to evaluate such a well-run project, in which all the actors played their parts with enthusiasm and vigour. The project has achieved remarkable results and has laid a path for Kosovo to follow to further its development. It has enhanced the ILO image and has put ILO strategies and principle of human resource development and decent work at the forefront of economic advancement. It fully deserves the award given to it by the Ministry of Labour and Social Welfare as the model for other projects to follow.

7. Recommendations

During the evaluation meetings, stakeholders expressed the hope that the ILO project would continue its activities in some form or other. The project has been completed so this action is not feasible. However, the groundswell of calls for the continuation of the project was so strong that the following recommendations attempt to build on project successes. The following recommendations stem from the discussions held with the Ministry of Labour and Social Welfare and are based on the challenges that lie ahead for the same Ministry.

- Firstly, there is a need to strengthen the capacity of labour market institutions to deliver on the objectives of the Kosovo Employment Strategy, currently being finalized.
- Secondly, the Labour Code and the Employment Promotion bills are expected to be passed by Parliament fairly soon. Once in force, the Ministry would need technical assistance to design relevant by-laws and enforcement procedures.
- Thirdly, the following areas of labour administration are in need of further strengthening: (i) the capacity of the Employment Department to coordinate its operational structure at regional and local levels; (ii) the completion of the reform of the employment services and the creation of a National Employment Agency; and (iii) the strengthening of the labour inspectorate capacity to tackle the informal economy and to effectively protect workers.

In the youth employment field, areas of unfinished work include:

- The need to strengthen the governance system at both central and local level for the implementation of the outcomes envisaged by the Kosovo Youth Employment Action Plan. The drafting of an Action Plan on youth

employment was a necessary but not sufficient condition for achieving youth employment outcomes. The Government of Kosovo would need further assistance in implementing the Action Plan, especially during the monitoring and evaluation phases when lessons learnt need to feed into policy reformulation and/or adjustment.

- Such governance system would also be instrumental in aligning the objectives set by economic and social policies – especially the Kosovo Development and the Employment strategies, to the youth employment policy objectives;
- The setting up of social pacts on youth employment at regional level to facilitate the translation of broad youth employment policy objectives into concrete projects that addresses needs of young disadvantaged youth in different labour markets.

8. Lessons learned

Virtually all the lessons learned from the project are positive ones. The lessons learnt with regard project design, planning, implementation and evaluation are reproduced below under the first heading, while those relating to the specific technical areas covered by the project, i.e. skills development and youth employment, are reported under heading two and three.

1) Project design, implementation and evaluation:

- The formulation of appropriate and realistic objectives aligned to the particular country situation is of the essence. Objectives should be accompanied by realistic performance indicators. At the same time, however, it is necessary to adopt during project implementation a flexible approach that enables the project to take account of, and adapt to, changing national circumstances.
- Another key feature of project success is to ensure that the project stakeholders, partner institutions and other organizations directly associated with the project, are constantly involved in the planning and implementation of activities. The extensive dialogue established by the project with the many national and international actors present in Kosovo – albeit time-consuming– did yield results in terms of visibility, leverage and impact.
- The practice to seek co-financing and in-kind contribution from many stakeholders to leverage on the funds available to the project is a lesson that could be mainstreamed in most technical cooperation projects. Despite the considerable time investment that such practice entails, it does pay off in terms of quantity and

quality of outputs, stakeholders' and beneficiaries' satisfaction as well as response capacity of the project to emerging needs.

- Capacity building of partner institutions should be a key component of any project strategy, as it guarantees sustainability and helps plan and administer exit modalities that strengthen – instead of weakening – the sustainability of project's outcomes.
- The establishment of stringent project management control and monitoring procedures is only apparently in contradiction with the need of maintaining a flexible approach during project implementation. In fact, close management control and monitoring ensures that the governance system of the project at field level is transparent, equitable and technically sound.

2) Skills development

- Core employability skills (e.g. learning competence, communication, teamwork, client-orientation, quality awareness, etc.) should be integrated into competency-based curricula development since the very beginning to ensure the responsiveness of vocational training courses to the changing requirements of the labour market. The integration of such skills into the curricula at a later stage, e.g. once the vocational and technical components have been developed, may cause the overlooking of those mix of competencies that may make the difference accessing and remaining in the labour market.
- The promotion of decentralization of decision-making on training at regional level was partly offset by the fact that most of the administrative and financial competencies were retained at central level.⁸ Thus, while most of the knowledge and experience on the management of training institutions and vocational training programmes has been acquired at the regional level, the administrative and financial decisions (specifically on human resource recruitment, good and service procurement and disbursements of funds) rested with various Departments of the MLSW, with no knowledge on the specific requirements of the VET system.
- Gender mainstreaming approaches can result insufficient in contexts where gender imbalances in employment and training are rather significant. Positive action could be an alternative to raise awareness and take action on the promotion of gender equality in the world of work.

⁸ The law on public procurement and financial accountability de facto impedes the Ministry of Labour to decentralized these vital functions to the training centres.

- A participatory approach involving stakeholders, and especially service providers, is the best method to achieve sound, consistent, efficient and sustainable results. Any extemporary intervention imposing a non-tailored system is bound to fail.
- To improve effectiveness in reaching the quantitative and qualitative indicators of the project, a monitoring system was developed that included the assessment of vocational trainers performance, quality control of the competency-based training material produced and placement rate of individuals trained. However, such a system entails the investment of human and financial resources that the Ministry of Labour can not always afford. Furthermore, the need of committing resources to this end is poorly understood by the Finance and Human Resource Department of the Ministry of Labour. This has resulted in sporadic and sluggish monitoring of the whole training system performance and it makes the implementation of impact evaluation studies that go beyond the intended beneficiaries (e.g. family members, communities, etc.), unlikely in the near future.
- In circumstances where international organizations and NGOs offer salaries that are much higher than those established in the national salary scale, it is extremely difficult for projects working in partnership with national public institutions to ensure that staff included in human resource development programmes remains attached to those institutions. The best approach is to develop the capacities of a core group of trainers able to mainstream knowledge and expertise to newly-recruited staff. Such group needs to be large enough to guarantee the return-on-investment and sustainability of staff development activities.

3) Youth employment

- Substantive technical support is required to enable national institutions to effectively tackle the complexity of youth employment policy design, monitoring and evaluation and assistance should be made available also during the implementation phase.
- The involvement of social partners can bring focus on issues (e.g. informal economy, working conditions, youth discouragement and inactivity, the promotion of socially responsible enterprises) that are not always in the government's agenda. The design in a project document of separate components can help strengthen the capacity of the social partners and empower them vis-à-vis the government.
- One of the success factors of ALMPs targeting youth at risk of exclusion is the availability of baseline data detecting the main determinants of labour market disadvantage and the establishment of sound targeting mechanisms for the administration of programmes. The ALMPs implemented in Kosovo

demonstrated once more that the effectiveness and impact of these programmes is greater for those groups of the population that are facing multiple disadvantages in the labour market.

- The need to carry out impact evaluation of active labour market programmes cannot be underestimated. Not only such evaluations allow the assessment of which programme work best and for whom, but they also provide insights in the performance of the institution mandated to their administration and in the planning of financial and human resource allocation necessary to achieve policy objectives.



INTERNATIONAL LABOUR ORGANIZATION
MULTI-BILATERAL PROGRAMME OF TECHNICAL COOPERATION

TERMS OF REFERENCE
EXTERNAL FINAL EVALUATION

Project Skills Development
for the Reconstruction and Recovery of Kosovo

Skills and Employability Department
International Labour Office, Geneva



**INTERNATIONAL LABOUR ORGANIZATION (ILO)
MULTI-BILATERAL PROGRAMME OF TECHNICAL COOPERATION**

Project Number: **RER/00/M05/ITA**

Project Title: **Skills Development for the Reconstruction and Recovery of Kosovo (Phase I and II)**

Project Site: **Pristina and other locations in the UN Administration of Kosovo**

Project language: **English**

Executing agency: **International Labour Office**

Government counterpart: **Ministry of Labour and Social Welfare, Employment Department**

Starting Date: **February 2001**

End Date: **June 2007 (revised)**

Total Budget: **US\$ 2,617,028 (revised)**

Evaluation Date: **July 2007**

ILO Department: **Skills and Employability Department (EMP/SKILLS)**

Donor: **Government of Italy**

1. Introduction and rationale for the evaluation

The International Labour Office (ILO) has implemented the Project *Skills Development for the Reconstruction and Recovery of Kosovo* during the period February 2001- June 2007. Financed by the Government of Italy with a contribution of US\$2.6 million, the Project had an initial duration of three years. A second phase of the same Project was approved for the period 2004-2006. The government counterpart at the time of project formulation was the Administrative Department of Labour and Employment (DoLE) of the United Nations Interim Administration Mission in Kosovo (UNMIK). The new constitutional framework established the Ministry of Labour and Social Welfare (MLSW), which became the counterpart as of 2002.⁹ Since 2004 the Project has been progressing through two interconnected phases, as reflected by the project document and its addendum: Phase I on *Skills Development* (US\$1.8 million) and Phase II on *Youth Employment* (US\$0.8 million). In 2004, the Italian Government granted a further financing of US\$534,443 to continue Project activities until June 2005. An addendum to the Project, centred on the strengthening the capacity of labour market institutions to address the youth employment challenge, was developed in August 2004 and another agreement was signed between the ILO and UNMIK (on behalf of the PISG-MLSW) in October 2004. In 2005 the Italian Government granted an additional US\$265,252 to expand ongoing technical assistance to youth employment policy and programme development.

The progress of the Project was internally evaluated twice. A mid-term review was carried out in February 2003, while a tripartite review was held in July 2005 to assess achievements, lessons learned and outstanding issues relating to the youth employment phase. With the additional financial contributions received and by re-allocating the savings accrued, the project will be able to continue activities until the end of June 2007.

The rationale of the evaluation is specified in section G of the project document, which envisaged that the programme would be subject to a post-project evaluation to be carried out within six months from termination. Such an arrangement was reiterated in Section F of the Project Addendum. The first document indicated two studies to be undertaken in order to inform both the mid-term and final evaluation reports. The progress of the Project and the constraints in the achievement of outcomes were continuously documented through policy-papers, studies, and researches prepared by the ILO. Such documents cover all the areas envisaged to be part of the final studies required under Section G of the project document (see Annex 3 for a detailed list of the studies undertaken and reports produced by the Project).

⁹ UNMIK Regulation 2001/19 *On the Executive Branch of the PISG*,

Against this backdrop, and in compliance with ILO evaluation policy, the Skills and Employability Department of the ILO and the Sub-regional Office for Central and Eastern Europe (SRO Budapest) have commissioned an independent, external evaluation of the Project *Skills Development for the Reconstruction and Recovery of Kosovo* according to the terms of the reference specified henceforth.

2. Description of the project

The Project Skills Development for the Reconstruction and Recovery of Kosovo was implemented by the ILO in two distinct, albeit interconnected, phases. The first phase of the Project (2001 – mid-2004) has supported the establishment of labour market institutions (i.e. the Ministry of Labour, the Public Employment Service (PES) and a network of regional training institutions), while the second (end 2004 – mid 2007) has focused on the development of a youth employment policy and action plan as well as on the piloting of active labour market programmes targeting disadvantaged youth. The following sections outline the main components, strategy and results of the two project phases.

2.1 Phase I: Skills development

The reconstruction and recovery of Kosovo was considered, at the time of Project formulation, a pressing issue and an essential contribution to lasting peace and stability of the Balkans. To maximize the employment impact of the reconstruction and recovery programmes, a provision was made for integrating demand-driven, employment-oriented training into the overall recovery strategy. The aim was to tackle the depleted stock of human capital inherited from the previous decade, during which stronger demographic pressures, a low skills-base, and strategies favouring low employment-absorbing sectors made the employment levels of Kosovo the lowest of former Yugoslavia. The main problems identified during the formulation of the Project were: lack of infrastructure for delivering adult training; limited capacity to provide employment-oriented, competency-based training programmes, as well as lack of curricula and relevant training material; the absence of a system for the training and retraining of trainers and training managers; limited capacity to provide alternatives to wage-employment — such as self-employment, micro-entrepreneurship training and related assistance; weakness of labour-related institutions mandated to assist job-seekers (counselling, guidance and job-placement); and the absence of linkages between training and the labour market (active measures).

Against this backdrop, the Project assisted the Kosovo authorities in establishing a vocational training system for adult unemployed and workers, in building the capacity of labour market institutions in the provision of counselling, guidance and other assistance to job seekers, and in developing a system for the promotion of self-employment through

VET institutions and the PES. The main problems identified were addressed through: i) the setting up of a network of training institutions, delivering employment-oriented and competency-based training programmes; ii) building the capacity of the PES to assist job seekers through the provision of career information, counselling and guidance services; and iii) developing self-employment options, micro-entrepreneurship training, and follow-up assistance.

The project strategy was built upon an institutional development and direct support components. The first component aimed to build the capacity of labour market institutions to design, monitor, and evaluate training and employment measures while the second revolved around the establishment of a network of regional VET providers (facilities, equipment, and training methodologies), the piloting of skills development programmes and the provision of employment services for selected target groups of beneficiaries. The direct project recipients were managers and practitioners of training institutions and employment services as well as employers' and workers' organizations. All activities were developed and implemented through the MLSW and with the participation of social partners, both at the central (National Tripartite Board and Steering Committee) and local levels (Regional Management Training Boards).¹⁰

The key outputs and main activities of this phase of the Project are grouped under the three headings below.

2.1.1. Network of eight regional VET providers

Four Regional Vocational Training Centres (in Pristina, Peja, Gjakova and Prizren), destroyed by the conflict, were refurbished and provided with modern equipment to deliver training programmes to adult unemployed in priority occupations, according to the ILO competency-based modular approach that was adopted by the MLSW as the delivery mechanism for adult training in Kosovo. The ILO Project introduced learning methodologies and invested in the development of human resources (i.e. training managers, methodologists and trainers) to improve labour market relevance, efficiency and effectiveness of adult training. Institution and capacity building of the MLSW, initially supported by the ILO only, brought about other donor agencies that were encouraged to mainstream their assistance within the institutional framework of the MLSW. Accordingly, the competency-based modular approach was extended to four additional adult training institutions sponsored by the Danish Technical Cooperation Agency (DANIDA) and to other private training providers that joined the Ministry's network. The ILO provided technical assistance to support the MLSW in the development of the methodological aspects related to trainers', methodologists' and managers' competencies. The Management of Training Institutions programme, that

¹⁰ Prior to 2002, the Project counterpart was the Department of Employment and Labour of the UN Mission in Kosovo.

combined periodical training workshops with work-based learning, was extended to the managers and training providers working under the Ministry's aegis.

Project activities increased along the expansion of the MLSW regional network of training providers. The Project specifically supported: i) the development of communication and promotional tools for the MLSW services, ii) the training of MLSW newly-recruited trainers and the continuous upgrading of trainers' competencies, iii) a training and development programme for improving access of vulnerable groups to skills development and employment services, and iv) the development of training policies. At the request of the Penal Management Division (PMD/Kosovo Correctional Services) and of the MLSW, the ILO Project provided technical assistance to establish vocational education and training programmes within correctional facilities. Since 2004, employment and training services available under the MLSW network are offered to detainees (see the implementation strategy designed by the Project listed in Annex 3).

The outcomes of Phase I of the Project were discussed in the Tripartite Steering Committee of July 2004 (see Project Progress Report 2004). The main areas of concern and relevant recommendations for the delivery of vocational training were synthesized in the policy paper *Challenges and Opportunities of Skills Development in Kosovo*.

2.1.2. Employment counselling and career guidance

The counselling and guidance component of the Project was developed on the basis of an *ad-hoc* strategy that focused on the design of programmes and tools reflecting the ILO's approach to human resources and training, as well as the principles outlined in the international labour standards. The staff development programmes designed under this heading comprised: i) a training needs analysis workshop to identify core areas and elements for the design of the counselling and guidance strategy of the Project; ii) an international fellowship to provide practitioners with comparative information on career development policies and programmes, and to introduce counselling and guidance skills to PES staff, and iii) a number of training activities targeting PES practitioners to introduce individual employment counselling techniques in all regional and municipal employment offices. Particular emphasis was placed on addressing the needs of the most disadvantaged groups of the population and the ways to identify and "treat" them with employment services.

Project activities under this heading touched upon a number of areas. First, the activities resulted in the establishment of a new framework for the registration of unemployed individuals and vacancies. This new procedure was accompanied by the development of an electronic registration system (SIMPS) — now operational in the Regional Employment Offices — capable to aggregate administrative data along the requirements of a reliable and timely Labour Market Information System (LMIS). Second, an approach to sequence the services available in PES and to target individuals at risk of labour market exclusion was trial-tested with unemployed persons with disabilities

(PWDs). PES staff was trained and coached in the provision of the service to this target group, in assessing occupational skills and types/levels of disability for vocational training purposes and in administering an incentive scheme designed to place PWDs in private enterprises.¹¹ Third, the 2004 assessment of career guidance services in Kosovo pointed to the urgency of establishing a career information and guidance system in schools.¹² In this respect, work focused on the piloting of a training programme for 9th grade school teachers on career guidance services in compulsory education.

The lessons learned during the implementation of the counselling and guidance component of the project highlighted the need to develop a training tool for employment counsellors and PES trainers addressing: a) career development skills to improve the effectiveness of counselling services; b) equity and social inclusion principles and practices; c) the need to build and/or strengthen the training skills of those entrusted to replicate training; and d) the use of information and communication technology (ICT) for collecting information and/or delivering the service. The training tool was published in the Albanian language and is available in the Kosovo employment services (see annex 3).

The main achievements in the counselling and guidance component of the Project were assessed in the report *Improving Public Employment Services in Kosovo* that highlights improvements in service delivery and the challenges ahead (e.g. human resources development, establishment of a labour market information system, and the monitoring and evaluation of service performance).

2.1.3. Self-employment and income generation

The self-employment and income-generation component of the project was based on a two-level approach. The first level related to the promotion of self-employment through orientation seminars and entrepreneurship animation days to be included in learning events as part of the curricula of both last year secondary technical schools and adult training institutions/programmes, and career counselling sessions organized by the staff of the PES. The second level focused on the development of an in-depth self-employment training programme delivered by VET institutions to those who had shown potential and initiative in setting up their own economic activity or business.

By June 2004, more than 850 jobseekers had received induction training in self-employment and 173 had completed a fully-fledged training programme and developed their business plan. The delays in achieving the Project indicators were due mainly to the late recruitment of self-employment trainers by the MLSW.

¹¹ The incentive system designed by the ILO Project was jointly financed by the MLSW and an Italian NGO (CICA).

¹² The EU-sponsored Project (KOSVET) conducted pilot training activities in 2004, which aimed at mainstreaming career information and guidance into basic education. This work was undertaken with the support of the trained personnel of the Ministry of Labour and Social Welfare.

This component of the Project also tested the feasibility of measures targeting the most disadvantaged groups. In cooperation with the World Health Organization and the Ministry of Health and Mental Health Service, the ILO Project designed an integrated training and self-employment scheme for previously institutionalized persons with mental disability. By April 2004 these persons were able to perform the basic tasks of the *Garden design, ornamental plants and landscape maintenance* occupational profile. The related income-generating activity received a six-month micro-credit from KOS-Invest (sponsored by World Vision International), which was fully re-paid by December 2004. Pending the development of an appropriate regulatory framework, this *de-facto* social cooperative was given the legal status of non-government organization. Such a pilot initiative, however, was discontinued as the management of the Gjakova Hospital did not extend the detachment period of the manager of the NGO, who could combine the management of the organization with nursing skills.

To identify entrepreneurship promotion practices from other countries, especially those targeting young people, the Project and the International Training Centre (Turin) co-sponsored a fellowship programme to Poland. The programme focused on the role of public and private institutions in promoting self-employment programmes.

Three main lessons were drawn by participants: i) to improve the relevance and effectiveness of (self-)employment counselling and career guidance services targeting youth, ii) to improve the quantity and quality of education and training services for self-employment and entrepreneurship development, and iii) to establish the legal and financial mechanisms for promoting self-employment for youth.

To summarize, by June 2004 — when the first phase of the Project was concluded — the four ILO-sponsored vocational training centres provided competency-based courses to 1,609 unemployed; the trained staff of the PES and of the four VET institutions provided employment and training services to almost 25,000 job seekers. The number of jobseekers involved in training programmes that were developed according to the ILO's methodology was even greater, when considering the other VET centres of the MLSW as well as private providers where this methodology was introduced. The project also: (i) developed 25 staff development programmes, (ii) conducted 1,800 participant/days of training and 50 group and individual coaching sessions, (iv) designed a number of training tools and packages covering the thematic areas of the project (see Annex 3), and (v) undertook a social marketing campaign on employment issues. In order to promote research and animate debates in the employment and social fields – as well as to assist the PISG, the MLSW, the social partners, and other governmental institutions in policy design and programme development – the project prepared and/or commissioned a number of reports and policy papers on: i) the Kosovo skills development system and public employment services, ii) VET provision in correction facilities, iii) the establishment of an Institute of Labour and Social Studies, and iv) the gender dimension of vocational education and training. It also provided technical assistance and advisory services for the design of a number of key employment-related policies including the law on vocational education and training (VET), the law on adult

training, and on National Qualifications Framework (NQF). The Project prepared a backgrounder for a feasibility study on the introduction of a system for Recognition of Prior Learning. In the employment area, it conducted a review of employment policies and provided technical inputs and coordination to the work on the elaboration of the employment strategy of Kosovo.

2.2. Phase II: Youth employment

The second phase of the Project focused on the promotion of youth employment. The main components revolved around the strengthening of the capacity of labour market institutions and the social partners in the design, monitoring, and evaluation of youth employment policies and programme, as well as the pilot-implementation of active labour market programmes targeting disadvantaged youth. The Project established an employment and training fund that sponsored a number of school-to-work transition programmes (apprenticeships, internships and in-company training) as well as wage- and self-employment measures. The institutional capacity building component comprised technical assistance and advisory services to the MLSW and the social partners, but also to the Ministry of Culture, Youth and Sport (MCSY), to the Ministry of Education (MEST), the Ministry of Economy and Finance (MEF), and the Office of the Prime Minister.

The key outputs and main activities of the second phase of the Project are described in the three headings below.

2.2.1 Youth employment policy development

The Project organized, from September 2005 to December 2006, a capacity-building programme for the development of the Kosovo Action Plan on youth employment. The programme comprised four main components: i) a series of thematic seminars on youth employment (September 2005 – April 2006); ii) a training workshop on youth employment policy development (April 2006); iii) a number of follow-up and promotional activities (May-November 2006); and iv) policy endorsement (December 2006).

The thematic seminars brought together policy-makers from seven ministries, employers' and workers' organizations and youth organizations to discuss policy options to address youth employment. Two working groups were established to devise strategies concerning labour demand and labour supply. The results of the work carried out by the ILO Project in Kosovo (review of the adult training system, career guidance, self-employment opportunities, baseline data and analyses of the youth labour market, preliminary assessment and lessons learnt from the implementation of ALMPs) were discussed by these working groups.

The main objective of the training workshop “*Developing an Action Plan on Youth Employment*” was to strengthen participants’ capacity to develop an Action Plan by: i) getting a better understanding of national practices and lessons learned with regard to labour market policies and programmes affecting young people; ii) developing a framework to ensure a comprehensive and coherent approach to youth employment policy development; and iii) identifying and discussing the objectives, targets and outcomes of the Action Plan as well as the respective responsibilities of line Ministries.

The last leg of the capacity-building programme related to the finalization of the Plan, its dissemination among representatives of local government and youth organizations, and its endorsement by the PISG of Kosovo during a national conference organized in December 2006. The main outcomes of the Kosovo action plan on youth employment are now embedded in the draft Kosovo Development Strategy.

2.2.2 Active labour market programmes targeting disadvantaged youth

This component revolved around building the capacity of labour market institutions to design, administer, monitor and evaluate programmes to enhance the employability and employment of disadvantaged youth. The objectives of the active labour market programmes (ALMPs) were to address the specific disadvantages of young labour market entrants. Most of the pilot programmes were enterprise-based training (in-company training and apprenticeship) and work placement schemes. The initiatives were implemented on the basis of the guidelines, models and tools developed by the Project. The latter are now being consolidated in a number of regulatory instruments.

The Project provided technical assistance to the staff of the PES in order to set up a monitoring and evaluation mechanism to assess the impact of the ALMPs and to check, through randomized trials, whether substitution effects and other distortions occurred when implementing these programmes. The evaluation yielded interesting lessons in terms of versatility of the targeting mechanisms and employment impact. The measures appeared to be particularly effective for the long-term unemployed youth coming from low-income households and ethnic minorities facing multiple disadvantages (low educational attainment, low family income, and longer unemployment spells coupled with mobility constraints and stereotyped attitudes in recruitment).

2.2.3. Capacity building of labour market institutions

Besides the capacity building work involving the Ministry of Labour, other line ministries and the PES, the Project continued the assistance to vocational training experts in advancing the work on VET methodologies to improve the relevance of training to labour market requirements. One of the key policy recommendations highlighted in the review of the adult training system focused on the need to periodically monitor outcomes of the

vocational training system and continuously assess impact.¹³ Technical assistance was provided to training methodologists in the design and implementation of tracer studies. The main difference between the tracer study conducted in 2006 and those carried out in 2002 and 2003 consisted in the design of a statistically significant sample covering the whole network of training centres.

Baseline data gathered by the Project pointed to an increase in the number of young workers in informal and casual employment. In 2005, the Project conducted a number of capacity-building activities to increase the understanding of labour market institutions on issues pertaining to the informal economy and to devise strategies addressing informal employment. A capacity building workshop was conducted to review modern labour inspection techniques and raise awareness on the issues relating to informal employment. The capacity building of the Labour Inspectorate was perceived as instrumental for the achievement of the Project objectives since the service plays a key role in the control and promotion of labour law enforcement. The workshop offered also the opportunity to assess medium- to long-term technical assistance needs of the Inspectorate and to formulate a set of recommendations.

Decent work deficits and the magnitude of the informal economy in Kosovo were also discussed during a roundtable organized by the Federation of Independent Trade Unions (BSPK) – with the support of the International Confederation of Free Trade Unions (ICFTU) and the ILO Project. The proceedings and background material prepared, as well as the recommendations stemming from the meeting, were published by the Project.

Another strand of the work of the Youth Employment Project relates to capacity-building activities benefiting the social partners, especially with regards to the design, monitoring, and evaluation of youth employment measures. These activities focused on the collection of baseline information on working conditions of young workers and their participation in trade unions, the implementation of a campaign on youth rights at work and the preparation of a statute of the Youth Network of trade unionists. A number of activities were implemented with the Chamber of Commerce to promote self-employment among young people. These activities included the analysis of the environment for the establishment of businesses and the identification of possible red tapes that could affect self-employment opportunities for the youth. This work resulted in the development of an information booklet entitled “*Biz Up: Starting your enterprise - A to Z directory for youth*” and the opening of an information desk and a mentoring system for young entrepreneurs within the Chamber of Commerce.

To conclude, the work on youth employment aimed at fostering inter-ministerial coordination and the involvement of social partners in policy design and implementation; addressing the identified efficiency gaps in the provision of employment and vocational training services; and providing a solid management base for up-scaling and diversifying

¹³ ILO, Challenges and Opportunities of Skills Development in Kosovo: An assessment for Strategy Preparation, unpublished (2003)

active labour market policies and programmes. Such work generated a number of spin-off effects, including the decision of the government to continue, with major funding from the UNDP, the implementation of ALMPs for young unemployed at risk of labour market exclusion.

3. Purpose, scope and clients of the evaluation

The purpose of the evaluation is to assess the performance of the two phases of the Project in a comprehensive, systematic and objective manner in terms of relevance, effectiveness, efficiency and impact. The evaluation will assess the relevance of Project objectives and approach as well as identify the extent to which: i) the project has achieved its planned objectives, ii) its strategy has proved efficient and effective, and iii) the long-term impact the Project is likely to have. The evaluation will look at the Project as a whole, identify good practices and lessons learnt to be used as a knowledge base for developing future technical assistance packages.

The evaluation will analyze strategies and implementation modalities so as provide recommendations to be integrated in the planning process of ILO's technical assistance in the region. Particular emphasis will be placed on the review of Project sustainability and impact, as well as on possible innovative technical cooperation features in employment and training. Given the particular context and the project duration, the evaluation will also look into the relevance of ILO's approaches to rapidly evolving situations (from post-conflict to institutional set up, institution building and policy development). It will also assess the effectiveness of pilot programmes (direct assistance) and their instrumentality to the institution building and policy development processes (see Annex 4). Finally, the evaluation will review the relevance of the:

- Initiatives aimed at mainstreaming gender in technical cooperation;
- Involvement of the social partners;
- ILO's integrated approach and methodology for the development of youth employment policy and national action plans;
- ILO's employment-oriented approach to skills development (introduction of competency-based modular training, delivery of employment services and promotion of self-employment);
- Technical assistance to the reform of the PES and to the introduction of ALMPs;
- Communication and awareness-raising strategies introduced by the Project;
- Partnerships and alliances established by the Project.

The final clients of the evaluation report are:

1. Policy makers, managers and practitioners of labour market and other institutions that partnered with the Project at central and local levels, as well as the social partners and the donor;
2. Project management, the technical Department (EMP/SKILLS), the Youth Employment Programme, the ILO Subregional Office for Central and Eastern Europe and, ultimately, the Technical Cooperation Committee of the ILO's Governing Body.

4. Suggested analytical framework

The evaluation will assess the relevance, effectiveness, efficiency and sustainability of the overall Project. A detailed analytical framework, with suggested evaluation questions, is appended to the ToR as Annex 1. The evaluation team can include other aspects in accordance with the purpose of the evaluation. The key evaluation criteria revolve around the following aspects:

- ***Relevance and strategic fit of the project:*** The evaluation will review the extent to which the objectives of the Project were/are consistent with beneficiary requirements and needs. The evaluation will also assess whether the approach was/is strategic and the ILO used/uses fully its comparative advantage.
- ***Validity of project design:*** The evaluation will review the extent to which the project design was logical and coherent.
- ***Project progress and effectiveness:*** The assessment will measure the extent to which the project's immediate objectives were achieved.
- ***Efficiency of resource use:*** The evaluation will gauge how resources and inputs were converted into results.
- ***Effectiveness of management arrangements:*** The evaluation will note to what extent the management capacities and arrangements put in place supported the achievement of project results.
- ***Impact orientation and sustainability of the project:*** The evaluation will assess the strategic orientation of the project towards making a significant contribution to broader, long-term development changes and it will measure the extent to which the results of the project are durable and can be maintained, scaled up and replicated by partners.

5. Main output

The main outputs of the exercise will be:

- A final report with findings and recommendations addressing the above-mentioned key evaluation criteria. The report shall not exceed 40 pages excluding annexes and it will be structured alongside the format appended in Annex 2.
- A two-pager abstract of the Project Evaluation Report. This abstract will be drafted on the basis of the template developed by the Evaluation Unit of the ILO.

6. Evaluation methodology

The evaluation will be carried out through analyses of various sources of information including desk analysis, survey data and interviews with governmental counterparts and project partners, direct beneficiaries, partner agencies, project management and staff. To this purpose, the evaluation team will undertake a field mission to the UN Administered Province of Kosovo.

The sources of information, information gathering methods and timing are specified below. A complete set of information sources on the project will be made available at the Project Implementation Unit in Pristina.

A) To be dispatched electronically prior to the field mission:

- Project documents;
- Annual progress reports;
- Mid-term and Tripartite review;
- Policy and other key documents produced by the Project;
- ILO's evaluation guidelines.

B) To be made available in the Field Project Office during the mission:

- Quarterly progress reports;
- Training tools, learning packages and other publications;
- Technical and financial reports.

The evaluation will be carried out with the technical support of the Skills and Employability Department, Youth Employment Programme (Employment Sector) and of

the Employment Programme of the ILO Subregional Office (SRO) in Budapest. The logistical support will be provided by the Project Implementation Unit (PIU) in Pristina. The evaluation team will relate to the Senior Employment Specialist of the ILO SRO Budapest for technical matters and to the Officer at ILO headquarters for administrative and financial issues relating to the evaluation mission.

7. Management arrangements, work plan and time frame

The tentative timetable of the evaluation is the following:

1. Desk review	Review of key project documents. (Evaluators)	26-29 June, 2007
2. Field visits	The evaluation team visits project sites, interviews stakeholders and beneficiaries and gathers additional information. (Evaluators, ILO expert and national project coordinator)	2-10 July, 2007
3. Report drafting	The evaluation team drafts the evaluation report. (Evaluation Team Leader)	6 working days
4. Stakeholders comments and feedback	The draft report is circulated to stakeholders for comments and feedback. These are consolidated and sent to the evaluation team. (Evaluation manager and national project coordinator)	5 working days
5. Final report	The evaluation team finalizes the report embedding the comments. (Evaluation Team Leader and evaluation manager)	2 working days

It is expected that the evaluation team will conduct consultations and meetings with representatives of the following institutions:

Ministry of Labour and Social Welfare (MLSW)

- Department of Labour and Employment;
- Employment Division;
- Vocational Training Division;
- Managers and practitioners of the vocational training centres;
- Managers and counsellors of the employment offices.

Social partners

- Independent Confederation of Free Trade Unions of Kosovo (BSPK) and BSPK Youth network;
- Kosovo Chamber of Commerce and its youth network.

Ministry of Education, Science and Technology

- Pre-University Education Department;
- Vocational Education Division;
- Lifelong Learning Unit.

Ministry of Culture, Youth and Sport

- Department of Youth.

Ministry of Justice

- Department of Corrections, Penal Management Division.

Other partner agencies and institutions

- European Agency for Reconstruction: Technical programmes and projects on vocational education and training;
- World Vision, GTZ, Swisscontact, SDC, Don Bosco and Career Guidance Resource Centre.

Evaluation Team

The evaluation team will be composed of a senior employment and training expert - external evaluator - (to be appointed by the ILO), a national evaluator (to be appointed by the Ministry of Labour and Social Welfare), and an evaluator to be appointed by the donor.

The senior employment and training expert will take the role of coordinator of the evaluation team. Each institution will bear the costs (fees, travel and other related expenses) of the evaluator they appoint.

The allowances for internal travel established for government officials in Kosovo will be paid by the Project to the national evaluator. The executing agency and the donor may agree upon a joint appointment of the external evaluator in representation of both the ILO and the Italian MFA.

Project management and staff

The names and contact details of the project management and ILO staff who will be involved in the evaluation are indicated in the table below.

Evaluation manager:	Gianni Rosas, Employment and Skills Development Specialist, ILO, Budapest – tel. 0036147326 57 – email: rosas@ilo.org
Evaluation focal person:	Maria Borsos, Programme Officer, ILO, Budapest – tel. 0036147326 57 – email: borsos@ilo.org
Project management:	Valli' Corbanese (ILO Employment and Skills Development Expert and former Chief Technical Adviser to the Project), Sokol Elshani (National Project Coordinator) and Fatmir Burjani (Training Coordinator), ILO PIU, Pristina – tel. 0038138249166 – email: skillskosovo@ilo.org
ILO backstoppers:	Giovanna Rossignotti (Youth Employment Specialist), James Windell (Skills Development Specialist) and Jenny Sang (Administrative and Financial Officer), Skills and Employability Department – tel. 0041227996981 – email: rossignotti@ilo.org , windell@ilo.org and sang@ilo.org

Evaluation of the Project “Skills development for the recovery and reconstruction of Kosovo” Phase I and Phase II, RER/00/MO5/ITA

Pristina, 29 August – 9 September, 2007

Agenda of the mission

Wednesday, 29 August 2007

- 14.30 – 15.30** Arrival at Pristina airport
Accommodation at Hotel Pristina
- 16.00 -18.30** ILO Project Implementation Unit
Meeting with Mr. Fetah Kasumi (Ministry of Education, Science and Technology- MEST) National expert appointed by the Ministry of Labour
- Meeting with Ms Corbanese, briefing on the Project implementation*

Thursday, 30 August 2007

- 08.30 – 10.30** ILO Project Implementation Unit
Briefing with Mr. Elshani, national expert on employment services
- 10.30 -12.30** ILO Project Implementation Unit
Briefing with Mr. Burjani, national expert on vocational training
- 13.00-14.30** Ministry of Labour, Employment Department
Meeting with Mr. Leka, Head of Employment Division, Ministry of Labour and Social Welfare
- 14.30- 16.30** Ministry of Labour, Employment Department
Meeting with Mr. Gashi, Head a.i. of Vocational Training Division and with Mr. Haliti, responsible for self-employment, Vocational Training Division
- 17.00 – 18.00** ILO Project Implementation Unit
Meeting with Mr. Rosas, Project Manager, ILO SRO Budapest

Friday, 31 May 2007

- 08.30 – 09.30** ILO Project Implementation Unit
Meeting with Mr. Zeqir Shkodra
Confederation of independent trade unions of Kosovo (BSPK)
- 09.30-10.45** Ministry of Youth, Culture and Sport
Meeting with Mr. Morina, Director of the Youth Department and Mr. Burim Leci, Deputy Director , Youth Department, Ministry of Youth, Culture and Sport
- 10.45 -12.15** ILO Project Implementation Unit
Meeting with Youth employment team
Ms Zogu, Youth network, BSPK
Ms Emine Ramosaj Youth network, Chamber of Commerce
- 12.30-14.00** Regional Employment Office, Pristina
Meeting with the Directors of the Regional Employment Services (REOs)
- 14.15- 16.30** Ministry of Education, Science and Technology
Meeting with Mr. Burdunaj, Head of the Pre-university Department and Ms Berishaj, Lifelong Learning Division
- 17.00- 18.00** ILO Project Implementation Unit

Monday, 3 September 2007

- 08.30 – 11.30** Visit to the Regional Vocational Training Centre (Pristina)
Meeting with Mr. S. Sadiku, Director VTC Pristina
- Visit to the Regional Employment Office (Pristina)
Meeting with Mr. Obertinca, Director REO Pristina
- 11.30- 13.00** ILO Project implementation Unit
Meeting with Ms Xhanisare Kepuca, PES trainer
- 13.30- 15.00** ILO Project implementation Unit
Meeting with Mr. Buxhalla, Mr. Gashi, Mr. Lavdim and Mr. Avdyli, training specialists, Ministry of Labour
- 15.00 – 16.30** ILO Project implementation Unit
Meeting with Mr. Mentor Morina and Ms Melvide Shamolli, members of the YE inter-ministerial group

Tuesday, 4 September 2007

- 08.00 – 17.00** Visit to the Regional Training Centre of Prizren
Meeting with Mr. Gashi, Director VTC Prizren and trainers
- Visit to the Regional Employment Office of Prizren
Meeting with Mr. Hozha, Director VTC Prizren and employment counsellors

Wednesday, 5 September 2007

- 09.00 – 11.00** Visit to the Don Bosko Training Centre
Meeting with Don Matteo di Fiore and Anton Gojani
- 11.30-13.00** Regional Employment Office Pristina
Meeting with the Directors of the Regional Vocational Training Centres
- 14.00-17.00** Visit to the Correctional facility of Ljpian
Meeting with Ms Tefta Bytyci and Ms Merita Syla, Penal Management Division
- Meeting with the trainers of the correctional facility of Ljpian and of the Dubrava prison*
- 17.00-18.00** ILO Project Implementation Unit
Debriefing with Mr. Rosas, Project Manager, ILO SRO Budapest

Thursday, 6 September 2007

- 08.30 – 10.30** Ministry of Labour and Social Welfare, Employment Department
Meeting with Mr. Shabani, Director of the Employment Department
- 11.00-11.30** KOSVET Project III
Meeting with Mr. Gutman, acting team leader Project Vocational Education and Training Programme
- 13.00-13.45** Ministry of Labour and Social Welfare
Meeting with the Minister of Labour and Social Welfare, Mr. Selmanaj and Mr. Leci, Deputy Minister of Labour and Social Welfare
- 14.00-14.45** UNDP Employment Generation Programme (EGP)
Meeting with Mr. Levent Koro and Mr. Vedat Macastena, manager of the EGP Programme
- 15.00-16.00** ILO Project Implementation Unit
Meeting with Ms Corbanese, review of training material and tools produced by the Project

Friday, 7 September 2007

- 10.00 – 11.30** ILO Project Implementation Unit
Presentation of preliminary findings of the external evaluation to ILO Project Steering Committee members
- 12.00-15.00** ILO Project implementation Unit
Debriefing with ILO Project team
- 15.00-18.00** ILO Project implementation Unit
Report writing

Saturday, 8 September 2007

- 10.00-18.00** ILO Project implementation Unit
Report writing

Sunday, 9 September 2007

- 13.00** Departure from Pristina airport

LIST OF POLICY AND RESEARCH PAPERS, TRAINING TOOLS AND MATERIAL DEVELOPED BY THE PROJECT

Policy Documents and research

1. Challenges and opportunities of skills development in Kosovo: An assessment for strategy preparation.
2. Improving Public Employment Services in Kosovo.
3. Vocational Education and Training for the correctional facilities of Kosovo - An ILO input to the exit strategy of the Penal Management Division of the United Nations Mission in Kosovo.
4. Gender dimensions of skills development in Kosovo.
5. Improving applied research for policy making in Kosovo – Challenges and opportunities.
6. Principle and practices of modern labour inspection.
7. Guidelines for the development of National Action Plans on youth employment (Albanian and Serbian).
8. V. Corbanese, G. Rosas, "Young people's transition to decent work: Evidence from Kosovo", ILO Geneva, Employment Policy Papers 2007/4.
9. Kosovo Youth Employment Action Plan. A mid-term Policy Framework (2007-2010).
10. Country Review of the Employment Policy of the UN Administered Province of Kosovo.
11. Employment Strategy of Kosovo.
12. Law on vocational education and training (VET).
13. Law on adult training.
14. Draft bill on employment promotion.
15. Draft bill on National Qualifications Framework (NQF).
16. Backgrounder to a feasibility study on the introduction of a system for Recognition of Prior Learning.

Training Tools and Materials

17. Curricula and training packages for selected occupations.
18. The role of Public Employment Service in the changing labour market, ILO, 2001 (Albanian translation).
19. Management of training institutions. Guides and tools for administrators and practitioners.
20. Guide on Contracting Training Procedures.

21. Guidelines and Tools for Evaluating Internal and External Efficiency of Skills Development Programmes.
22. Employment Counselling and Career Guidance: Trainers' Guide for employment service personnel. Glossary of Key Terms on learning and training for work (English, Albanian and Serbian).
24. Biz-Up. Self-employment skills for young people. Facilitator's and user 's guide and toolkit (Albanian and English).
25. Surfing the labour market: Job search skills for young people (Albanian and English) - Facilitator's and user's guide and toolkit.
26. Biz-up! Starting your enterprise. A to Z Directory for Youth.

Other documents and publications

27. The informal economy in Kosovo: Which role for the Trade Unions?
28. Employment and Skills development services. Brochure of the MLSW.
29. Brochures and posters of the campaign "You have rights at work" of the Youth Network of the trade unions.
30. Video (CD-ROM) Youth voices from Kosovo.
31. Kosovo, your business partner; Brochure of the Chamber of Commerce.
32. Brochure "Youth employment: A global goal, a national challenge (Albanian and Serbo-Croatian).

LIST OF PILOT PROJECTS

1. Active labour market programmes (ALMPs) targeting youth through contracting services.
2. Building the capacity of the staff of the Public Employment Service to develop targeted services through individual employment plans (with the UNDP).
3. Vocational Education and Training for the correctional facilities of Kosovo (with Swiss Development Cooperation–SDC).
4. Integrating people with disabilities in training and employment (Kosovo-wide).
5. Income-generating activities for people with special needs (Gjakova).
6. Carer information and guidance in schools (Kosovo-wide).
7. Guarantee fund to promote youth self-employment (Kosovo-wide).

Achievement of Project's indicators

Phase I: Skills Development

Objective 1: At the end of the project a network of three vocational training providers will be self-sustainable and delivering competency-based modular training programmes in priority occupations

Indicators envisaged	Indicators attained
A network of three vocational training centres established and systematically delivering training programmes to adult unemployed and workers in priority occupations	Four priority geographical areas were identified at the inception of the project although 3 were indicated in the project document. The fourth regional training institution was established because of the availability of infrastructure (facilities and partial equipment). Since 2003 the project provided technical assistance also to the 4 additional training centres handed-over by the DANIDA project to the MLSW.
A core group of 18 trainers using competency-based and flexible modular training methodologies	At the conclusion of the first phase of the project in mid 2004, the number of trainers using competency-based and flexible modular training methodologies were thirty
Developed capability to conduct competency-based modular training programmes for potential employment	The competency based training methodology was mainstreamed not only in the network of MLSW providers but also to private providers that partnered with the MLSW
Training programmes and material for 12 priority occupations available for both public and private enterprises	The overall number of priority occupations in mid 2004 was twenty-seven, each with its own set of training material and guidelines for trainers
A Training Information System developed and a data-base available;	The training material produced by trainers was collected, systematized and published for daily use in the training centres. This material also constituted the basis for the development of fully-fledged curricula in core occupations
1,500 women and men unemployed/workers trained/retrained in employment-oriented skills.	At the conclusion of the first phase of the project in mid 2004, the four training centres supported by the Project had trained 1,609 unemployed people. From mid 2004 to the time of the evaluation (September 2007) the network of MLSW training centre had trained 12,317 jobseekers.

Objective 2: The capacity of employment offices to provide vocational counselling, guidance and linkages with the labour market will have been strengthened

Indicators envisaged	Indicators attained
<p>Vocational counselling and guidance methods are introduced and operational as part of the services rendered by the labour offices to their "clients";</p>	<p>Vocational counselling and guidance was introduced in the seven regional employment offices and twenty-three municipal employment offices. Such work resulted in the production of guidelines for PES staff in registering and counselling job seekers and in canvassing employers. Moreover, the Project produced in the local language a training package on counselling and guidance skills.</p>
<p>10 officials of the central and regional employment offices trained in vocational counselling and guidance and fellowships conducted;</p>	<p>The fellowship was conducted for 15 employment services managers and practitioners. This work resulted in the appointment of four core PES trainers responsible for training and re-training employment service staff.</p>
<p>At least one official in each municipal employment office is using counselling and guidance methods, as well as linking with the labour market;</p>	<p>All 164 counsellors and 50 registrars of the Kosovo employment services were trained in counselling and guidance techniques and use them in their daily practice.</p>
<p>6,000 "clients" of the labour offices have received vocational counselling and/or guidance by the end of the project;</p>	<p>By mid 2004 trained staff of the employment service had counselled approximately 21,000 unemployed, while in the period July 2004-September 2007 roughly 105,000 unemployed received counselling and guidance.</p>

Objective 3: A framework for self-employment training and related measures will have been established by the end of the project.

Indicators envisaged	Indicators attained
Self-employment training programmes are part of the regular courses delivered by the three regional training centres;	Despite some delays on the side of the MLSW in the appointment of self-employment trainers, by mid 2004 all training centres offered in their portfolio of training courses self-employment training.
A network of self-employment resource persons is available within the three vocational training centres;	At the conclusion of the first part of the Project, there were eight self-employment trainers delivering both self-employment induction courses and fully fledged programmes lasting on average three months and leading to the formulation of a business plan.
A functional scheme for linking self-employment training with existing micro-credit facilities and/or revolving funds is agreed and adopted by training centres, employment service and credit providers;	Self-employment trainers were supported in making contact with advisory services, micro-credit institutions. Such work resulted in the adoption of procedures for linking training with micro-credit facilities and also in a guide describing commercial and non commercial credit institutions as well advisory services available in each region.
A mechanism for training follow-up assistance in terms of access to micro-credit schemes, business advisory services and business start-ups is operational and regularly provided;	In each region, self-employment trainers created their own resource networks. However, the overall number of individuals who actually receive a loan is rather small, as credit access for start-ups is difficult.
At least 500 people have received self-employment training and follow-up assistance	By mid 2004, 853 unemployed had received self-employment and follow-up assistance, while in the period 2004-2007 approximately 1,100 persons participated to self-employment courses and produced a business plan.

Phase II: Youth employment

Objective 1: Youth employment policy development and coordination of the Ministry of Labour and Social Welfare (MLSW) and other government agencies, as well as the social partners, will have been strengthened by the end of the project.

Indicators envisaged	Indicators attained
<p>Three training workshops are conducted and 15 participants per workshop are trained</p>	<p>The training workshops conducted by the Project for the formulation of the Kosovo Youth Employment Action Plan were ten (held between September 2005 and December 2006). The first workshop (induction workshop) saw the participation of eighteen participants and served to discuss the data on youth employment elaborated in the School-to-Work transition Survey. Following this first workshop, the group was divided into two sub-groups (one for labour supply and one for labour demand). The labour demand group –comprising Ministry of Labour, Education, Youth, the social partners and youth organization– met four times, while the demand side sub-group – comprising Ministry of Labour, the social partners, the Ministry of Trade, of Economy and of Agriculture met twice. The sub-groups were re-conveyed twice in early Spring 2006 to merge their work and to present preliminary findings to the Office of the Prime Ministers and to discuss further technical issues with experts from the World Bank and UNDP. An international fellowship was jointly organized with the International Training Centre of the ILO to refine the work carried out and to prepare the final document. A final workshop was organized in Pristina to fine-tune the costing of the Action Plan and the monitoring and evaluation mechanism. Overall 160 person/day of training were conducted.</p>
<p>Three studies for knowledge and policy development are carried out</p>	<p>The researches carried out by the project for youth employment policy development were four, namely: 1) <i>Challenges and opportunities of skills development in Kosovo: An assessment for strategy preparation</i>; 2) <i>Improving Public Employment Services in Kosovo</i>; 3) <i>Young people's transition to decent work: Evidence from Kosovo</i> and 4) <i>Country Review of the Employment Policy of the UN Administered Province of Kosovo</i></p>

<p>A youth employability strategy is drafted and approved;</p>	<p>The inter-ministerial sub-group on the labour supply side produced a youth employability strategy that was embedded in the Kosovo Youth Employment Action Plan.</p>
<p>A job creation strategy for young people is drafted and approved;</p>	<p>The inter-ministerial sub-group on the labour demand side produced a job creation strategy that was embedded in the Kosovo Youth Employment Action Plan.</p>
<p>An inter-ministerial committee on youth employment is established;</p>	<p>The inter-ministerial group on youth employment was established in March 2007 and comprised representatives of the Ministry of Labour, Ministry of Education, Ministry of Youth and Sport, Ministry of Economy and Finance, Ministry of Trade, Ministry of Agriculture and the social partners.</p>
<p>A youth employment action plan is drafted and submitted;</p>	<p>The Kosovo Youth employment action plan was formally endorsed by the PISG of Kosovo in December 2006.</p>
<p>A national conference on youth employment is conducted.</p>	<p>The conference was held in December 2006 and saw the participation of more than two hundred participants.</p>

Objective 2: Pilot programmes aimed at enhancing employability of disadvantaged young un(der)employed will have been introduced and implemented together with government agencies and the social partners.

Indicators envisaged	Indicators attained
A school-to-work transition survey for programme and policy development is carried out;	The school to work transition survey of Kosovo has been published in the Employment Strategy Papers (2007/4) series of the ILO with the title <i>Young people's transition to decent work: Evidence from Kosovo</i> , downloadable at http://www.ilo.org/public/english/employment/yett/swts.htm
Eight training workshops are conducted and 15 participants per workshop are trained;	The number of workshops carried out for the design and implementation of active labour market programmes to be financed by the Youth Employment and Training Fund were ten with an average number of 18 participants. All Regional and Municipal Employment offices' counsellors were trained in the administration of the measures as well as two trainers for each of the Regional training centres.
An employment and training fund is established and operational;	<i>The employment and training fund started operating in June 2005. By May 2006 the fund had disbursed a total of € 290,956 (€185,160 from the ILO and €105,786 from the MLSW)</i>
A total of 600 disadvantaged youth have participated in school-to-work programmes (apprenticeships, internships and in-company training) and 50 per cent are young women;	The total number of youth 15-24 who participated to active labour market measures were 989 (52.6 per cent men and 47.4 women).
Sixty per cent of disadvantaged youth who participated in school-to-work programmes are employed;	The placement rate of disadvantaged youth who participated in ALMPs was measured six months after the conclusion of the programme and stood at 46 per cent
The number of 2,500 jobseekers are trained by the MLSW network and participating institutions over one-year period;	The total number of jobseekers trained in the MLSW network in 2006 was of 3,455 individuals.
Seventy per cent of trainees trained by the network and participating institutions are aged 15-24;	The share of young people trained in the year 2006 was 72.3 per cent
Two sets of training material (employment counselling and self-employment for young people) are available in the local language.	The two sets of training material were published in the local language under the titles: <i>Biz-Up. Self-employment skills for young people. Facilitator's and user's guide and toolkit</i> ; and <i>Surfing the labour market: Job search skills for young people - Facilitator's and user's guide and toolkit</i> .

Objective 3: Pilot programmes aimed at improving decent work opportunities for young people will have been introduced and implemented together with government agencies and the social partners

Indicators envisaged	Indicators attained
Two training workshops with minimum 15 participants per workshop conducted;	The workshops organized with self-employment trainers (three) were held in July and September 2005. The first workshop regarded guarantee funds (functions and operations) and resulted in the adaptation and translation in local language of the ILO toolkit " <i>Guarantee Funds for Small Enterprises. A manual for guarantee fund managers</i> ". The second and third workshops revolved around the preparation of guidelines for the pilot guarantee fund to be established by the Project.
A set of guidelines for selecting disadvantaged youth and companies are available and used by the PES;	The guidelines prepared in Albanian and Serbian language for PES staff were not only used for project purposes, but they were mainstreamed in the design of the UNDP Employment Generation Project and are now being transformed in a set of administrative instructions of the MLSW for the design, administration and monitoring of all active labour market programmes financed by the Kosovo Consolidate budget.
Employment incentives have created decent employment for 100 disadvantaged youth;	The total number of jobs created through employment incentives amounts to 172.
A guarantee fund is available and supported the creation of 100 jobs – for disadvantaged youth through enterprise development and self-employment during its first year of operation	This indicator failed to be achieved. The reasons for such failure were analyzed by the Project and reported to the MLSW with a set of recommendations to improve the functioning of entrepreneurship promotion programmes in Kosovo. The gaps identified by the Project revolved around the concerted banking practices on interest rates and collateral, that hampered access to commercial credit of young people.