



IPEC Evaluation

Fighting the worst forms of child labour in Costa Rica: Support to the Time Bound Programme on the worst forms of child labour in Costa Rica

Phase I and II:
COS/02/P50/CAN; COS/03/P03/CAN

An independent final evaluation by a team of external consultants

Costa Rica

November 2005

NOTE ON THE EVALUATION PROCESS AND REPORT

This independent evaluation was managed by ILO-IPEC's Design, Evaluation and Documentation Section (DED) following a consultative and participatory approach. DED has ensured that all major stakeholders were consulted and informed throughout the evaluation and that the evaluation was carried out to highest degree of credibility and independence and in line with established evaluation standards.

The evaluation was carried out a team of external consultants *. The field mission took place in August 2005. The opinions and recommendations included in this report are those of the authors and as such serve as an important contribution to learning and planning without necessarily constituting the perspective of the ILO or any other organization involved in the project.

* Lic. Violeta Ruiz, with the colaboration of Lic. Josette Brawerman

TABLE OF CONTENTS

ABBREVIATIONS	4
EXECUTIVE SUMMARY	5
INTRODUCTION.....	9
2. METHODOLOGY	10
2.1. CONTEXT AND OBJECTIVES OF THE EVALUATION	10
2.2. METHODOLOGICAL APPROACH.....	10
3. DESIGN: RELEVANCE AND COHERENCE	12
3.1. THE FORMULATION PROCESS	12
3.2. RELEVANCE AND SUITABILITY OF THE PROJECT'S STRATEGY	14
4. MAIN FINDINGS.....	17
4.1. IPEC'S ROLE	17
4.2. PROCESSES AND OUTCOMES RELATED TO THE 4 TBP COMPONENTS ...	19
4.3. SUSTAINABILITY	35
5. CONCLUSIONS.....	37
5.1. EFFECTIVENESS AND EFFICIENCY IN ITS PERFORMANCE.....	37
5.2. REGARDING THE AWARENESS OF THE KEY ACTORS AND POPULATION AS A WHOLE	37
5.3. REGARDING THE DEVELOPMENT OF POLICIES AND LEGISLATION.....	38
5.4. REGARDING THE STRENGTHENING OF KEY ACTORS' CAPACITIES.....	39
5.5. REGARDING THE ACHIEVEMENTS AND OBSTACLES OF THE LOCAL STRATEGIES.....	40
5.6. LESSONS LEARNED AND GOOD PRACTICES	41
6. RECOMMENDATIONS	44
7. BIBLIOGRAPHY	47
ANNEXES	48

ABBREVIATIONS

ATAPS	Asistentes Técnicos de Atención Primaria en Salud
CCSS	Caja Costarricense del Seguro Social
CDN	Comité Directivo Nacional para la Prevención y Erradicación Progresiva del Trabajo Infantil y la Protección del Adolescente Trabajadora en Costa Rica
CMTC	Central del Movimiento de Trabajadores Costarricense
CODECAN	Consejo de Desarrollo Cantonal
COREBRUNCA	Consejo Regional de Desarrollo de la Región Brunca
CTRN	Confederación de Trabajadores Rerum Novarum
DNI	Defensa de los Niños y de las Niñas Internacional
EHPM	Encuesta de Hogares de Propósitos Múltiples
ESCI	Explotación Sexual Comercial Infantil
FICOSA	Fideicomiso de Osa
FIFA	Federación Internacional de Fútbol
FIS	Ficha de Información Social
FODESPIA	Fondo de Esperanza y Protección Infantil y Adolescente
FUNDAOSA	Fundación Comunal de Osa
IMAS	Instituto Mixto de Ayuda Social
INA	Instituto Nacional de Aprendizaje
INEC	Instituto Nacional de Estadística y Censos
IPEC	Programa Internacional para la Erradicación del Trabajo Infantil
MAG	Ministerio de Agricultura y ganadería
MEP	Ministerio de Educación Pública
MIDEPLAN	Ministerio de Planificación
MTI	Grupos de Monitoreo del Trabajo Infantil
MTSS	Ministerio de Trabajo y Seguridad Social
NNA	Niños, niñas y adolescentes
OATIA	Oficina de Atención y Erradicación del Trabajo Infantil y Protección del Trabajador Adolescente
OIT	Organización Internacional del Trabajo
ONG	Organización no Gubernamental
PA	Programas de Acción
PANI	Patronato Nacional de la Infancia
Paniamor	Fundación Paniamor
PAO	Programación Anual Operativo
TBP	Programa de Duración Determinada
PFTI	Peores formas de Trabajo Infantil
RMTI	Redes de monitoreo del Trabajo Infantil
SIPO	Sistema de Información de la Población Objetivo
SITI	Sistema Regional sobre Trabajo Infantil
TCU	Trabajo Comunal Universitario
TI	Trabajo Infantil
UCCAEP	Unión Costarricense de Cámaras y Asociaciones de la Empresa Privada
UCR	Universidad de Costa Rica
UNAFUT	Unión de Clubes de Fútbol de Primera División

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

The **purpose** of this final evaluation is to determine if the projects are meeting the proposed objectives, and to explain the reasons for achieved targets or deviations from the targets. The purpose is also to identify aspects and lessons learned that might be of interest for the more general application of the TBP concept, and to formulate recommendations that allow sustaining its achievements.

The **methodological approach** used was qualitative and included the perspective of stakeholders, including IPEC staff, executive and technical representatives of governmental entities and institutions and non-governmental organizations which were involved in the issue of CL and in the development of the project and its action programs, parents and children who have benefited from the project as well as other relevant actors. It involves the utilization of diverse techniques and sources to evaluate the aspects of the projects.

After analyzing the information, the evaluation **concludes:**

Regarding the project design

The design has been pertinent and suitable to the characteristics of the political and institutional context of Costa Rica.

It reflects the Costa Rican reality and sets priorities and needs identified by the institutions themselves.

It was relevant from the point of view of the national strategies for poverty reduction, childhood protection, and education.

It is internally coherent from the point of view of integrality and articulation of its components. The first phase of preparatory activities and the TBP support project itself at the national and local levels are clearly interrelated in their strategies and utilization of potential synergies.

The assumptions have been realistic and adequate in terms of the strategies adopted. The national scenario and the accumulated experience allowed identifying the conditions to carry out the TBP: stable political context, possibility to cooperate with national health, education, and protection authorities and involving the relevant actors at the national level. But the premises regarding institutional decentralization, in particular of OATIA, have not been sustained and this is one of the main failures of the design.

Regarding the advances and outcomes reached in the main TBP areas

Effectiveness and efficiency in the performance

The performance has been effective as almost all scheduled actions have been complied with as well as the goals proposed. It has also been effective in the generation of a favorable scenario for the development of a national TBP, and it contributed to placing the issue of child labor on the public agenda, to promote national legislation on this matter, and to incorporate specific aspects for the eradication of child labor in the public policies.

Regarding its efficiency, the outcomes reached justify the global investment made. At the local level, the strategies adopted allowed generating synergies with national initiatives carried out at the same time as the TBP.

Awareness of key actors and the overall population

It managed to involve all important actors and it has advanced toward the achievement of tangible commitments in terms of resources allocated for the eradication of the WFCL. The issue of CL and its worst forms is seen by all those actors as a national social problem that has to be approached with an integral perspective. The population as a whole is clearly informed about this matter. A very important advance is the training and raising of awareness at the mid-levels of the ministries. Most of them have tenure and will remain in their positions after the government changes.

For the topic not to get lost among the multiple social problems the country is facing, it is necessary to have permanent presence in the media. It is necessary to continue disseminating to educate and create active awareness about the topic, in particular about the differences between CL and the protection of adolescents' work. In addition, it is necessary to continue working with the decision-making levels of governmental organisms that are part of the CDN, in particular to include the topic in the electoral discourse and in the priorities for the new administration.

Development of legislation and policies:

Progress was made regarding a proposal for a legislation on the WFCL, which updates the "Rules for Labor Contracts and Occupational Health Conditions of Adolescents", and it is in the complementary agenda of the legislative assembly. The formulation and approval of the Second National Plan is an important achievement which demonstrated the possibility of building inter-sectoral policies as well as involving MIDEPLAN in the monitoring of the allocation of resources for CL eradication actions.

What is still pending is to further disseminate the existing national laws and international commitments in order to increase awareness about the rights and the obligation to enforce them. It is also necessary to implement policies according to the guidelines in the Second National Plan, and to insure their continuity in the next administration.

Strengthening of key actors' capacities:

It has been possible to raise the awareness and train officers of many governmental entities at the central and local levels as well as members of trade unions and employers' organizations. The technical assistance provided by IPEC helped to establish meetings, exchange mechanisms, working tools such as intra and interinstitutional protocols, and to create some monitoring and evaluation entities for realized activities and outcomes. The formulation of the Second Plan contributed to the creation of a Technical Committee of the CDN. Moreover, new protagonists are appearing in the fight against CL, such as PANI, which are starting to assume responsibilities.

Unfortunately, it has not been possible to decentralize the actions and institutional resources in the most needed areas. Although OATIA, as the office that specializes in CL, continues to be technically strengthened and leads the inter-institutional actions with the support of IPEC in the areas of the TBP, it is necessary to reinforce the development of activities at the local level.

Action Programs:

The intervention model developed in the Brunca Region may be replicated in other regions of the country. The following outlines the lessons learnt and good practices that can be extracted from this experience. Other significant achievements that are important to mention are:

- Raising awareness on the issue of Child Labour and the problem by different local stakeholders.
- The development of inter-sectoral instances that collaborate in the building up of monitoring networks for child workers and the affected families.
- The institutional learning of the implementing agencies.
- The introduction of innovative aspects such as the use of participatory diagnostic methodologies.
- The possibility of linking research and action based on initiatives from the UCR.

An important unexpected outcome of the established collaboration is the recent implementation of the component on professional education, with local contributions from IMAS.

Time has been scarce for the implementation of the APs, and at the time of withdrawal, more time is needed to strengthen inter-institutional linkages, to empower the CL monitoring networks, to consolidate the recently created base committees, to generate new funds, etc.

Lessons learned and good practices

- The participatory approach in the formulation of the Second Plan because of its outcomes regarding the identification of linkages and the need for intersectorial work
- Intersectorial collaboration as a practice among traditionally isolated institutions
- The communication strategy as cross-sectional practice in all actions done by the TBP
- The decision of choosing well known institutions (such as UCR and the Catholic Church) at the national and regional level to implement local projects
- Having set priorities in only one region for the intervention and carrying out all the initiatives there
- The collaborative management model which promoted the cooperation of the implementing agencies, empowered their actions, and contributed to the social recognition of the project as a whole.
- The support role of the AP performed by the local IPEC coordination.
- The utilization of the regional and local interinstitutional decision-making spaces related to the national development and poverty-reduction policies.
- The creation of the basis for a community child-labor monitoring system.

Regarding the sustainability of the actions

From the point of view of **social sustainability**, it may be affirmed that it made it possible for the population and main key actors to recognize CL as a social problem, which the country has to fight against. There are still some sectors that need further awareness and training, especially about the implications of the WFCL and the role that each actor has to play to contribute to their eradication.

From the point of view of **economic sustainability**, the main achievement is the inclusion of actions and funds for the eradication of CL in the AOP of all public institutions. Yet, to guarantee their allocation, the Ministry of Finance should be included in the CDN because it is the entity that ultimately makes the allocation of resources to each entity.

From the point of view of **institutional sustainability**, the consolidation of the interinstitutional coordination role of CDN and, in particular, its Technical Committee and its coordination with MIDEPLAN, implies certain guarantees to continue the policies. At the local level, the activities to promote and strengthen the

social network may assure the continuity of the programs once IPEC withdraws, but these networks need to be consolidated and there is little time left in the AP to do so. The central issue is that it is not clear what institution will take charge.

IPEC's strategy to achieve the sustainability has been to relate the issue with poverty and insert it in the Vida Nueva Plan and the Development Plan of this administration. The arrival of a new government, whose priorities are not yet known, poses new challenges.

Based on all of this, the final evaluation **recommends**:

Regarding awareness-raising activities

To prevent the issue from getting lost among the many social problems the country is facing, it is necessary to keep the dissemination and awareness actions open both to educate on this matter and to raise awareness about the problem.

Regarding policies and legislation

Since the government will change soon, the last tract of the electoral campaign should be taken as an opportunity to position the issue among the candidates and their teams in order to look for their public commitment with this issue and to include it in their campaign. The role of CDN, trade unions, and employers' associations is to lobby as needed to achieve this. On the other hand, the presence that the issue would acquire in the next few months would be useful to raise awareness among other social actors who are not yet well informed.

Regarding institutional strengthening

To try to institutionalize the issue of CL, it is required to continue the training of line officials, to be aware and learn about the problem and transmit the information to all strata of the governmental institutions involved in the eradication of the WFCL.

A specific aspect of the institutional capacities transfer refers to the access and management of diverse financial sources; what is usually referred to as fund raising.

Regarding the direct action programs

At the local level, it is recommended to systematize the experience, especially the reflection and evaluation process that allows identifying the success and failure conditions of the integral attention of withdrawn children.

It is also recommended to carry out a strategic planning exercise that aims at preparing a gradual withdrawal strategy that takes advantage of the existing collaboration, and that aims at empowering the public institutions.

Recommendation for IPEC – how to exit

Taking into account these considerations, the responsible people for the TBP in IPEC should do a strategic planning exercise with the Technical Committee of the CDN to transfer their role of support, technical assistance, and "engine" of activities. They should share the outcomes and recommendations of the evaluation and based on this, they should build together the continuity strategy, thus establishing responsibilities, time frames, and necessary resources.

INTRODUCTION

IPEC's purpose is to progressively eliminate child labor (CL), with priority given to the eradication of its worst forms. The support that IPEC has provided to the region's countries is based on a strategy that includes raising awareness about the negative consequences of child labor, promoting social mobilization against this phenomenon, strengthening the national capabilities to fight against child labor, as well as implementing Action Programs (AP) of an illustrative nature in order to prevent CL, to withdraw working children from dangerous occupations, and to provide them with adequate alternatives.

IPEC has been developing activities in Costa Rica since 1996. At present, this country is implementing a Time-Bound Program (TBP) to fight against the Worst Forms of Child Labor (WFCL) within the framework of Convention N° 182. The ratification of this Convention implies that activities be taken in order to immediately eradicate the WFCL.

A TBP is essentially a strategic framework of policies and programs which are closely coordinated to prevent and eliminate the WFCL in a given country within a specific period of time. TBPs stress the fight against the deeply rooted causes of child labor, integrating program actions with national development efforts, particularly the economic and social poverty reduction policies and universal basic education.

The critical point in all TBPs is that the responsibility for their implementation is with each country. The development of a plan to eradicate or reduce the worst forms of child labor within a specific period of time implies a commitment to mobilizing and designating national human and financial resources to combat this problem.

The IPEC Project in Costa Rica essentially consists of assisting the government in this process through the identification and the support of programs, measures, interventions, resources, institutional mechanisms, and associations. It comprises two strategic components: the first is focused on raising awareness and on the mobilization of society as a whole, as well as the development of capabilities for the implementation of projects and enforcement of the law. The second has the purpose of creating intervention models designed to withdraw children from the WFCL and to bring about the prevention of child labor in the Brunca region.

The Project has been developed in two phases. The first phase started in July 2002. This phase consisted of a series of preparatory activities meant to create favorable conditions for the implementation of the TBP; these activities were related to the establishment of a solid knowledge base, the strengthening of capacities of relevant institutions, the mobilization and raising of awareness of the public as a whole, and the establishment of public policies. The second phase, the TBP itself, started in July 2003, and it has been developed at two levels: national and local. At the national level, policy formulation, along with inter-institutional coordination, legislation enactment, as well as the training of public and private officials, all continued to be promoted and strengthened. At the local level, the project focused on achieving the eradication of the worst forms of child labor in the Brunca Region through a direct attention model for child workers and for the victims of commercial sexual exploitation (CSE).

2. METHODOLOGY

2.1. CONTEXT AND OBJECTIVES OF THE EVALUATION

Taking into consideration that the project's implementation period is now about to end, the TBP evaluation will emphasize the provision of reliable information about the achievement of the immediate objectives, while trying to identify the factors that either made this possible or that were constraints, as well as the current progress in the promotion of the local appropriation of the project and the sustainability of the activities initiated.

In this sense, although this document provides information about the implementation of the activities and the processes unleashed after the design and implementation of the projects, it mainly focuses on the outcomes achieved. It also includes elements that contribute to strengthening the actions started, as well as the recovery of the lessons learned from the experience, so as to be able to suggest possible orientations for future projects against CL in the country.

Keeping this in mind, the **purpose** of the final evaluation is to provide criteria in order to determine if the projects are meeting the objectives proposed, and to explain the reasons for their targets hit or deviations from the mark. Therefore, the objectives were:

- To examine the validity of the design/strategy, including its pertinence for the country's context
- To review the project's implementation to date, including institutional structure and implementation capacity
- To evaluate the ties generated between ILO/IPEC's project, governmental agencies, trade unions, and employers' organizations as well as other related organizations and to review the cooperation strategies.
- To review the level and nature of the TBP contribution to the sustainability of a favorable or adequate environment for the elimination of the WFCL in the country.
- To identify issues and lessons that may be of interest for the more general application of the TBP concept.

2.2. METHODOLOGICAL APPROACH

This is an external and independent evaluation done by an international consultant. The consultant aimed at assessing the processes and outcomes from a "outside" perspective, which is essential in this case in order to appraise the situation at the time of ending the project so as to be able to evaluate the exit strategy and to recoup those issues that may be useful for other experiences.

The methodological approach used was qualitative and included the perspective of the main actors involved, including the use of various techniques and sources to evaluate the same issues of the reality studied.

During the fieldwork, held between the 3rd and 11th of October, the consultant carried out intensive work with professionals and directors from the IPEC office in Costa Rica involved in the formulation and/or implementation of the TBP. Twenty interviews¹ were held with executive and technical representatives of the governmental entities and institutions and non-governmental organizations which

¹ See Annex 1 for a list of the interviewees

were involved in the issue of CL and in the development of the project and its action programs. A stakeholders' workshop was organized; this workshop was attended by representatives from all organisms and organizations in the country which are involved in the eradication of the WFCL². In addition, the Brunca Region was visited in order to learn about the AP in progress. Interviews were held there with the technical teams of the implementing agencies, local representatives, and with the parents of children benefited from the actions of these programs.

On the other hand, to comply with the TOR of the evaluation, the formulations of the two phases of the TBP and the AP visited were analyzed according to the outcomes obtained.

The following observations and comments are derived from the analysis of all this information.

² See Annex 1 for a list of the participants in the stakeholders' workshop.

3. DESIGN: RELEVANCE AND COHERENCE

This chapter is based on the evaluation of the original documents of the project, the midterm evaluation, the systematization of the experience, the testimonies that were collected and recorded from the interviews held with IPEC's teams regarding the formulation process of the projects, along with the opinions expressed in the stakeholders' workshop.

3.1. THE FORMULATION PROCESS

The projects' design (the preparatory and support activities for the TBP) was effected within a national **context** that was characterized by:

A high degree of institutionality due to Costa Rica's democratic tradition and the opportunity that this situation created for proposing policies that would cover terms that are longer than those in other countries in the region. The State responded to the needs proposed, even to the point of establishing a reputation for itself in this sense as a pioneer in Latin America. At the time that IPEC started its activities in the country, some international NGOs were starting to deal with children's issues (Save the Children, DNI, and Visión Internacional, among others).

The existence of public institutions in the area of childhood and adolescence that, although affected by complex bureaucratic processes, have policies, programs, and funds, made it possible to insert the issue into the public agenda with good sustainability perspectives. This insertion also includes the existence of inter-institutional entities that may operate as discussion, coordination, and planning arenas at the national level: the National Directive Committee (CDN), the Council for Childhood and Adolescence, the Commission against Commercial Sexual Exploitation, and the Office for Attention to Child Labor and Adolescent Workers (OATIA), the executive secretariat of CDN. This institutional framework made it possible in 1998 to formulate the first National Plan for the Prevention and Gradual Elimination of Child Labor, and the Protection of Working Adolescents.

With a strong regulatory development regarding child labor, at the beginning of the TBP Costa Rica already had all the necessary legal instruments. Already in January 2001, by decret the norm "Rules for Labor Contracting and the Occupational Health of Adolescents" was approved, that determined hazardous activities and prohibited and restricted some tasks. As it will be explained in the next chapter, during the implementation of the project the normative framework was updated, and a format was given to the law.

With respect to the previous experience of employers' organizations and trade union, the Costa Rican Workers Movement Central (CMTC), with IPEC's support, opened a daycare center for the children of the informal street vendors in downtown San José, the center serving as a tool to prevent child labor. On the other hand, the UCCAEP employers' association organized a project to develop social, economic, and educational strategies in this business sector in order to contribute to the elimination of child labor.

The existence of IPEC's Regional Office, plus the direct interventions in the country and others aimed at creating a knowledge base, all were significant since the signing of the Letter of Understanding (in 1997 and its 2003 renewal), IPEC had experience working with the government of Costa Rica. Some of the prior actions that became input for the TBP include the following:

- Gradual eradication of commercial sexual exploitation of children (1998-2000)

- Creation of a Community Network for the Detection, Attention to, and Eradication of Child Labor in 25 cantons (1999-2000)
- Gradual eradication of child labor and protection of working adolescents in the Central Market and the Farmers' Fair of Cartago (1999-2001)
- Progressive elimination of child labor in the extraction of shellfish and in fishing activities in the Gulf of Nicoya (1999-2001)
- Study about Child Labor in the Brunca Region (2001)
- Child and Adolescent domestic labor in Costa Rica (2002)
- Training to OATIA employees
- Introduction of a Module on Child Labor in the Multipurpose Household Survey (1998 y 2000)

The design of the **Project of Preparatory Activities** in 2002 was a process organized by a group of professionals from IPEC who were familiar with the country's reality, and who were also aware of its strengths and weaknesses; they cooperated closely with representatives of the national institutions.

Taking advantage of the experiences developed in other countries by IPEC, the preparatory activities were undertaken with the purpose of achieving favorable conditions for the TBP, as well as for establishing a solid knowledge base and strengthening the relevant institutions' capacities, with a special emphasis placed on the MTSS and OATIA, and on those institutions that comprise the CDN, along with mobilizing and raising the awareness of the public, and creating public policies. Above all, the preparatory activities were conceived as a platform and initial phase of what was expected to be a short TBP with well-defined axes.

The design of the **Support Project for the TBP** (2003) was done a year later with the support of a strategic planning methodology, the participation of "well-informed country stakeholders" (Interview) and through using studies and consultancies as well as trainings and awareness raising activities, realized under the framework of preparatory activities. The implementation of this first phase was useful not only to become more familiar with the problem and better understand it, but also to transfer information to those in charge of the institutions who, in this way, "knew about child labor well enough to know what to do about it" (Interview).

The main axes of the TBP of Costa Rica were focused on strengthening the institutions and generating a favorable scenario by keeping in mind the following problems of the national situation that were identified as being related to the issue:

- The magnitude of the CL problem in the country
- The difficulties to effectively fight the worst forms of child labor, in particular, commercial sexual exploitation
- The limitations in entities such as the National Directive Committee which barely met
- The need to strengthen and legitimize a more strategic role of OATIA.
- The lack of knowledge about the child-labor phenomenon among key institutions such as PANI, IMAS, MEP, INA, etc.
- The nonexistence of a clear concept about child labor, which was even culturally accepted as necessary in children's preparation for their future adult life
- The little impact of the First Plan to Eradicate Child Labor and Protect Adolescent Workers and the evidence gathered through its evaluation³ of the

³ Sánchez Esmirna y Rodríguez, María Luisa: Evaluación General. Plan Nacional para la Prevención, Eliminación Progresiva del Trabajo Infantil y la Protección de la Persona Adolescente Trabajadora

coordination problems, efficiency and Effectiveness that affect the public institutions responsible for taking actions in this matter.

The formulation of the **Action Programs**, though delayed in terms of the times originally scheduled, was a process in line with the strategies employed at the national level. Priority was given to political and technical feasibility and to institutional strengthening. Thus, the selection of the Brunca region responded to situations of need and disadvantage identified from the child-labor and the poverty perspective. On the other hand, efforts were concentrated in the areas given priority by the government as part of the Nueva Vida [New Life] Plan for poverty reduction; the government also had installed the needed institutional capacity for these efforts to respond to the problems posed.

3.2. RELEVANCE AND SUITABILITY OF THE PROJECT'S STRATEGY

The project's design was based on the conceptual and operational framework of the Time-Bound Program (TBP) methodology⁴ for the gradual elimination of the WFCL, a framework which predefines standardized general guidelines and basic strategies.

Based on the elements presented above and on the outcomes being obtained, it may be said that the design was pertinent and appropriate with regards to the characteristics of the political and institutional context of Costa Rica:

1. The project **reflects the Costa Rican reality** and the priorities and needs identified by the institutions themselves. The experience developed by IPEC in the country was capitalized on. With the exception of the activities and consulting that were carried out in order to determine which jobs were most hazardous, no new information was generated. The diagnoses resulting from prior efforts were used and enriched by the same participatory formulation process. The lessons which had been learned in other countries were also taken advantage of in order to utilize a comprehensive strategy based on a geographic area (instead of an approach based on a problem, such as in El Salvador), thus dealing with several problems that affect the region as well as incorporating activities geared toward the local sustainability of the program. On this basis, the purpose of the AP is thought of as an "experimentation" field that allows for the identification of intervention models which lend themselves to being expanded or replicated in other regions of the country.

Nationally, the strategy was focused on the design efforts to create the conditions for the national appropriation of the TBP, taking into account that the role of the state in the country, its institutional development, and the regulatory progress regarding child labor, all made it possible from the beginning to insert the CL issue into the agenda of the decision-makers with a vastly more accurately focused capacity for continuing the policies than in any other area of the country. Therefore, the project also gave priority to public institutions, rather than to the non-governmental organizations which, given the state's tradition, are not significantly developed.

These were the conditions which would make it possible to give priority to the institutional strengthening and the generation of a favorable scenario for the gradual elimination of the WFCL. Such axes required an accumulation of efforts for the issue of CL to stop "being part of the scenery" among the population and governmental employees, and they are reflected in the action lines undertaken,

⁴ ILO/IPEC: Guide Book II: Time-Bound Programmes for Eliminating the Worst Forms of Child Labour. An introduction.

in particular the training, technical assistance, mobilization, and awareness-raising actions.

The strategy for the local level of the TBP was to coordinate the institutions' actions through the creation of a regional committee and local committees for the eradication of CL. The existence of COSORE (Social Regional Council), later COREBRUNCA (Regional Council for the Brunca Region) and COSOL (Local Social Council), then CODECAN (Canton Development Council) forced the strategy to be modified and one created that would allow for incorporating these already existing inter-institutional structures. In fact, this made it possible for all institutional actors at the regional and local levels to be made aware of and to commit themselves to the TBP and to the AT actions.

2. The project, then, was not only adapted to the local reality, but also has been relevant from the point of view of a national strategy for the reduction of poverty, for the protection of children, and for fomenting their schooling.

The TBP has the Childhood and Adolescent Code as its legal framework for the protection of children and education; it even includes the prohibition of child labor, and it provides for the protection of adolescent workers.

Starting with the design, it promoted the formulation process of the "Second National Plan for the Prevention and Eradication of Child Labor, and the Special Protection of Adolescent Workers 2005-2010⁵," which is coherent with the National Development Plan and also overcomes the lacks, mostly of an institutional nature, which were identified in the evaluation of the first plan. As will be seen later, the achievements in this area have been important and innovative.

On the other hand, the local-level strategy of joint work, support, and strengthening of the COREBRUNCA and CODECAN process is also part of the government's strategy to fight poverty, not just because the Brunca region is one of the priority attention areas of the Vida Nueva Plan for "Poverty reduction and development of human capacities," but also because, together with the National Development Plan, it has reactivated these regional and canton-wide planning entities which had formerly stopped working in 1988.

Regarding educational policies, it did not seem necessary to devote additional efforts to an Educational Initiative, as had been done in El Salvador or the Dominican Republic. Elementary education is massively carried out in Costa Rica, and there are no serious accessibility problems. On the other hand, the Ministry of Education already had a program for identifying working children and for reinserting them in elementary school. The system's deficiencies are found at the middle level: insufficient high schools, access obstacles for those most prone to enter the labor market quickly, and difficulties in retaining adolescents in classes; it is precisely in this group where the lag and school desertion problems⁶ are found.

3. The design's **present internal coherence**: The objectives are clearly formulated and are coherent with the global strategic framework from a perspective that allows for approaching the problems holistically. The outcomes consistently reflect the products to be reached based on the scheduled activities, even when these seem ambitious in terms of the time proposed, as evidenced in their development course. Applying the guidelines for project

⁵ Hereafter to be referred to as the Second National Plan.

⁶ Midterm evaluation by UCR

design of IPEC/ILO, indicators and verification means⁷ have been set for each of the immediate objectives. The indicators may be considered appropriate for evaluating outcomes at this level. They have been used for the biannual follow-up of the progress made toward the achievement of the objectives, as well as to identify deviations, but the indicators contribute more to a periodic report preparation routine than to an actual follow-up performed by the implementing agencies. Nor has it been possible to identify their application in the evaluation of the project's impact.

The project's coherence as a whole is especially derived from the **comprehensiveness and consistency of its components**. The preparatory activities are just the initial kick-off for the development of the national-level axes of the TBP itself. The local level strategy again takes up these axes and implements them during the work carried out with the institutions and for the specific problems identified. Unlike other experiences, the project strategy focuses on creating and strengthening the capacities of the group of public institutions in order to confront them, and this is one of the main axes created at the local level.

4. The **assumptions have been realistic and adequate** in terms of the strategies adopted. The national scenario and the experience accumulated made creating the conditions to implement the TBP possible, this being done based on the premises for which it had already been created: a stable political context, the possibility of coordinating with the national health care, education, and protection policies, and involving the relevant actors at the national level.

However, the Costa Rican institutions traditionally have been centralized, and the issue of CL needs decentralization and needs to be worked on at the local and community level. This matter is acknowledged in the project's design by proposing at the beginning that the CDN be decentralized, which as was quickly noticed, was not feasible during the time proposed. So, the aim was then switched to decentralizing the OATIA instead.

Until the time of undertaking this evaluation, the decentralization of OATIA had not been possible, and as will be explained later, this is considered necessary for the future development of activities at the local level. During the meeting held with the Minister of Labor and Social Security, the evaluator was told that there was leeway for some of the current members of the office to start working in the capital cities of the country's provinces, as in fact has been happening in Puntarenas for several years. Due to budget reasons until now it has not been possible to create new jobs, and with the existing resources in OATIA only two important positions have been covered: one of these is in Alajuela, and the other in Liberia.

⁷ Depending on each situation, these are secondary sources or specific ad hoc data gathering and information analysis techniques.

4. MAIN FINDINGS

In this chapter, we stress the main processes developed and outcomes obtained during the implementation of the TBP. The data that follows is based on the interviews held and the observations made during the fieldwork, the analysis of the documents produced by the consultants that were hired to assess the various aspects that the Program had to deal with, dissemination materials and general information, the TBP (first draft), and the opinions gathered during the Stakeholders Workshop. It should be pointed out that this report does not detail the characteristics of the activities carried out by each action line, since the Systematization document as well as the numerous AP progress reports and those of the consultants hired already do so.

The present chapter is divided into three main points. First, it appraises the role of IPEC as far as its technical advisory capacity and the support it provided to the actions taken. The second point analyzes the processes and outcomes based on the four axes of the TBP in Costa Rica. Finally, the third section presents a reflection on the progress made regarding the sustainability of the achievements reached.

4.1. IPEC'S ROLE

▪ IPEC's team

Two circumstances have contributed to making it possible for the team in charge of the coordination and management of the TBP to assume characteristics that are different from those of other national teams in the region. On the one hand, there is the pre-existence in San José of the Sub-regional Office headquarters, and, on the other, the particularities of the national project, which is shorter and has fewer resources.

Thus, a small team was created, initially composed of only two members. Then, in early 2004, the coordinator in charge of the Brunca region also joined them. Instead of a CTA, a general coordinator and a technical assistant were appointed. Experts for specific activities were hired, depending on the activity scheduled. Therefore, among others, a social communication consultant collaborated with the project, first as an external consultant, and later as a member of the Sub-regional Office. Another consultant was hired to support the formulation of the Second National Plan for the Eradication of Child Labor and the Protection of Adolescent Workers, as well as a consultant hired to prepare the intra- and inter-institutional protocols, along with a professional who was in charge of systematizing the experience.

The financial and administrative aspects were easily articulated with the administrative chief of the Sub-regional Office, taking advantage also of other personnel and material resources (instructional and information) available in that Office.

It is important to stress the professional quality and commitment of the three persons in charge of the TBP, all of whom organized, coordinated, and assumed their chores efficiently. They worked together and collaborated well as a team: the coordinator delegated responsibilities adequately, and the chores were divided so as to allow for multiplying the actions and injecting dynamism into the management.

The TBP team's efficiency was also verified from the point of view of the coordination done with other institutions at the national and local levels. This was made possible by the coordinator's implementation of a joint management system with the implementing agencies of the AP, which bore positive results (see section 4.2.d). In addition, the core team's periodic presence in the field and its constant contact with the local coordinator also contributed to this collaboration. The logistical support problems that arose (especially for transportation of staff) were overcome by taking advantage of the resources of local institutions.

- **Working strategy: supporting processes**

From the beginning, the technical team embraced the philosophy of the TBP: the program's development and implementation is mainly the responsibility of the government and of its institutions, so they are the ones who should appropriate it. Thus, IPEC's protagonist role decreased as the TBP was implemented.

"The principle of a TBP is that it is a country's project supported by IPEC; thus, this country's project has to be a project which is led by the country, and a project that counts on the country's commitment. Somehow, IPEC manages to jump on the train just as it is leaving, and simply adds some coal to keep it going." (Interview)

"IPEC has been very clear since the beginning about the point that this is the country's commitment, and that the country has to take charge." (Interview)

In general, as has already been mentioned, to carry out this mission the team strengthened the public organizations, and the actions undertaken with the civil sector and its organizations were mainly channeled through the trade unions and employers' associations, while other actions were effected with key opinion leaders at the same time. At the national level, the team constantly interacted with professionals and representatives from institutions, had contact with the heads of the organisms involved or yet to be involved—especially the CDN—and provided direct technical assistance and logistical support to the OATIA.

They also strengthened and proposed decentralizing the OATIA for it to be able to assume the leadership role both at the national level (as with the CDN Secretariat) and at the local level in the intervention model development processes in the Brunca Region. From the beginning of the preparatory activities, attempts were made to consolidate processes with OATIA by involving its staff in the visits to the provinces and in the consultation with local institutions of the Brunca Region, and intense efforts were made to achieve its decentralization.

Another element of the working strategy used by IPEC's team was to support the processes, with the understanding that technical assistance means supporting the organizations' work and not taking this work over or overloading them. At all times, they were careful about keeping the institutions' dependency and their own protagonist role low.

Thus, they tried to adapt to and respect the political and bureaucratic situation of the partner and ally institutions, clearly aware that the pace set by governmental and social entities does not match those in the plans and programs. They aimed at establishing the bases for sustainable processes more than to obtain products in the terms scheduled when these seemed unattainable. This position impacted the gaps and lags observed in the implementation of the preparatory activities, and the late startup of the Action Programs.

"It is necessary for the process to respond to the degree of commitment of the government... To produce changes, it is more important to internalize the processes than to achieve products." (Interview)

"It might have been possible to comply with the calendar, but the products would have had a weak basis." (Interview)

Nevertheless, it is impossible to ignore the fact that it assumed an active role and leadership role especially in the Brunca Region, taking into account the difficulties that were due to the lack of a permanent presence of OATIA in the region.

"Along the way, we have discovered that in being just one more that is supposedly helping the country, you find yourself alone pulling the whole train on your own." (Interview)

"IPEC had to assume [this role] in the Brunca region. And in San José, the institutions there, with the exception of the Ministry of Labor, somehow expect someone to keep pushing the oxcart." (Interview)

At present, while IPEC's technicians estimate that they have constructed the needed conditions for the country to assume its commitment, some stakeholders expressed in the stakeholders workshops and in some of the interviews⁸ that even after the obtained results, the subject has not yet reached enough priority in the public agenda and can dilute without the behalf of someone to back it, specially in a political context of government change.

4.2. PROCESSES AND OUTCOMES RELATED TO THE 4 TBP COMPONENTS

The TBP components in Costa Rica may be summarized as follows:

- Raising of awareness and social mobilization
- Legislation and policies
- Institutional strengthening
- Development of Direct Action Programs

Below are the processes and outcomes obtained for each of these axes.

4.2.a. Awareness raising and social mobilization

The development of a TBP implies generating an ample consensual social basis regarding the importance that the elimination of CL has for the country, particularly eradicating its worst forms. To do so, a key strategy is the raising of awareness and mobilization of the population as a whole, especially of children and their families and the most relevant actors: the central government and the local governments of the communities where the AP are implemented, teachers, health care workers, employers' organizations, trade unions, and NGOs.

The awareness-raising actions started in Costa Rica even before the Preparatory Activities started. During the implementation of the awareness-raising actions, good progress was made which favored the later development of the TBP. In this sense, the outcome has been more than satisfactory if this is understood as

⁸ In both instances it was questioned if the country was prepared to continue without the support of IPEC. These were the responses from technicians of PANI, MEP, trade unions, employers and implementing agencies, amongst others.

making the problem of CL visible, and that the issue is assumed by relevant governmental and non-governmental actors.

The dissemination and communication action and training activities for several social actors resulted in the issue being considered a problem rather than “part of the landscape” or as “natural” and “necessary” for children’s rearing, as some of the interviewees have stated. The strategy that was used was cross-sectional; that is, it was ensured that communication would be present in each activity held related to the TBP. Beyond this idea, the communication campaign was carried out in four areas: mass communication campaigns, training sessions for the media, awareness-raising activities for students in related majors (journalism, social communication, etc.), and the production of materials for specific audiences, especially institutions.

The **mass-communication campaigns** had the goal of reaching the general population, but also tried to raise the awareness of and mobilize the media. Within the framework of the two phases of the TBP, the most important campaigns were the following:

- “Movilízate Costa Rica, di no al trabajo infantil” [Wake up, Costa Rica: say No! to child labor], which ended with the signing by 15 well-known people in several national arenas of the “Manifiesto contra el Trabajo Infantil y por la eliminación inmediata de sus peores formas en Costa Rica” [Manifesto against CL and for the immediate eradication of its worst forms in CR]
- “Tarjeta roja al trabajo infantil” [Penalty card for child labor] which was organized together with FIFA and was aired in several countries. In Costa Rica, this campaign was implemented thanks to an agreement reached among the IPEC, UCAEP, and UNAFUT during the 2004-2005 soccer championship under the slogan “Juguemos limpio: saquemos tarjeta roja al trabajo infantil” [Let’s play fair: give CL a penalty card]
- Celebration of the World Day against Child Labor on June 12, 2005, in Golfito, where the “Festival for our children’s lives” was organized. This was an activity that had repercussions in the media both nationally and locally. The activity involved an intense mobilization of the community, but also had the presence of the Ministry of Labor and representatives from other institutions, as well as the Bishop of the area’s Catholic diocese. In this regard, it should be pointed out that because of this celebration, the Catholic Church issued a public announcement expressing its concern about child labor, and inviting the governmental authorities and the civil society to commit themselves to defending the rights of children and adolescents.

Although it is believed that the efforts achieved the desired impact, the campaigns themselves were never evaluated as such, and there was no continuity in terms of periodic messages. However, this was compensated by the development in the other axes.

The **work with the media** started with a training program for journalists from the media with nationwide coverage, and then another with those representing local media. Workshops were organized, and specific materials, such as the Journalists’ Manual that discusses basic issues such as to how to approach the topic, were produced. Moreover, a **workshop for students** from majors in communication, public relations, journalism, and advertising was also held in order to raise their awareness while in training, and ensure their commitment to the issue of CL. At the time of the final evaluation, a new guide, whose costs were underwritten by the Canadian Embassy, was being edited. This is especially geared toward students, and has the purpose of reinforcing the awareness of this audience as future opinion makers.

The other axes included awareness-raising activities for more specific audiences who joined the training sessions organized. Printed materials were systematically distributed; these included brochures, manuals, and posters, among other types of informative materials.

On the other hand, specific activities were also organized at the **institutional level**, in particular in all the organisms that are part of the CDN. The purpose of these training activities was to raise the awareness of the mid-level officials and the officials from local governmental institutions, trade unions, and employers' organizations which are considered strategic partners in the efforts to eradicate the WFCL. This was considered fundamental so as to be able to transcend the situation of "only a few people being aware" to the generation of "institutions committed to the elimination of CL."

All the activities developed by the TBP were disseminated through multiple forms of media: press releases, announcements sent out to journalists, interviews, etc. On the other hand, IPEC developed the Regional Information System on Child Labor (SIRTI) as an innovative tool and specialized system for this problem. This is a database that gathers all the information available about child labor: publications, releases, monthly bulletins, news reports, etc., which may be accessed by a restricted audience (3200) considered key, as being *"committed to the child labor issue."* (Interview)

A sort of evaluation of these strategies consisted in an exploratory study to learn what the issue's presence was in several sectors. The analysis showed that at the media level, there are outcomes in a number of areas. On the one hand, it has been possible to place the issue—nonexistent one decade earlier, on the agenda of the media as a problematic matter. An analysis was done of the publications on this issue released in 2003 and 2004, and practically none of them discuss the matter in any way other than as a social problem. In a country that used to view child labor as something normal, this is certainly an achievement. On the other hand, everybody knows about the existence of IPEC and its role to eradicate child labor in the country. The same study showed that promoting the analysis of this issue is still pending. Of the 46 press articles analyzed, only two were reports. Their content was basically informative in nature, with little interpretation or opinion.

The effort made in this sense by IPEC has been relevant due to its ongoing presence ("...maybe like a drop of water that falls and falls until it makes a hole" -- Interview) by means of high quality materials, invitations, and promotion of training sessions, as well as through the persistence of its messages and actions. Although this presence, both physical and financial, has been fundamental to raise awareness about the problem, what has not been perceived is who might be taking over this role. The organisms consulted stated that they have no funds to assume or continue the dissemination tasks, and they say that they fear that with the emergence of other problems, the issue of CL might be diluted without IPEC's economic and logistical support.

The same study mentioned earlier also revealed that most of the information that is published is that which has been prepared by IPEC, and that many of the news stories published mention IPEC as their sole source. From the point of view of sustainability, this information is of great concern.

A final issue to take into account in this section is related to the generation of information about the magnitude and characteristics of CL and the WFCL in the country. In this sense, Costa Rica had made notable progress before the implementation of the TBP, since it had already included specific modules on CL in

the Multipurpose Household Surveys (EHPM) prepared by INEC in 1998 and 2002. The information revealed on both occasions made it possible to find out about the magnitude of the problem to be faced, as well as about its geographic location and the characteristics of the affected population. During the TBP implementation, some specific studies were done to identify the WFCL and to learn about their characteristics:

- Dangerous child labor in Costa Rica (IPEC-2003)
- Adolescents' perception about hazardous jobs: National consultation on their identification (Paniamor-2003)

However, the country has not yet managed to determine the periodicity with which the information should be updated in order to learn about the progress of the eradication of CL, particularly its worst forms. This means that INEC's scheduling of the EHPM does not include provisions about this matter and, therefore, no resources—physical, human, or financial—are allocated in its budget.

4.2.b. Legislation and policies

As stated in Chapter 3, Costa Rica's legislation on this matter was already very advanced before the implementation of the TBP. The main milestones, in addition to the signing of the international conventions (138, 182), include the following:

- 1998: approval of the Childhood and Adolescence Code that set 15 as the minimum age for legal employment, and created special measures to protect adolescents over 15 and under 18 years old.
- 1999: approval of the law against sexual exploitation of children, which set sanctions for the various types of commercial exploitation.
- 2001: publication of the regulation for contracting adolescent workers, and their occupational health and safety conditions.

In this sense, the process of ratification of the Convention 182 by Costa Rica, which was mainly supported by the employers sector, resulted long and complicated. A group of deputies that was against it finally accepted the ratification saying that only through a law could hazardous activities be defined. This meant that, a requirement that in other countries and even here, was resolved by simply creating a set of regulations, namely the subject of Labor Contracts and Occupational Health Conditions for Adolescents, needed a complicated procedure such as the creation and approval of a new law.

Thus, despite the fact that access to employment by people over 15 years was outlined in the Regulation, some progress was made during the TBP to advance in the discussion and to update the WFCL in Costa Rica. Finally, the law to regulate this aspect was drafted. At the time of this evaluation, the bill was waiting to be discussed and approved at the International Affairs Commission of the Legislative Assembly. The legislative advisors interviewed during the fieldwork believed that it was likely to be discussed during the upcoming extra sessions.

In any event, it should be stressed that those who participated in the drafting of the law took advantage of the opportunity to include innovative and even revolutionary issues in its text, such as the prohibition of domestic labor, which may be prohibited not due to its nature, but because of the conditions in which it is carried out.⁹

⁹ For instance, child domestic workers have to live and stay overnight at their workplace, thus preventing them from studying or having time for entertainment and play.

Another aspect to take into account is that there is nothing in the regulations of this law or in the legislation regarding the protection of adolescent workers which refers specifically to the informal sector, and that encompasses this sector's particular features. It is precisely in this sector where most of the irregularities and problems related to the contracting and labor conditions of children and adolescents are found. Although this problem is not exclusive to Costa Rica, given the magnitude of child labor in all of the countries in the region, the actors interviewed on this matter agree that beyond the legislative advances that could take place, the Children's Affairs Office (PANI) and the municipalities should be the ones that take a protagonist role. But these entities show gaps regarding the enforcement of the law, as well as their specific responses to the problems of working children and their families.

On the other hand, with respect to the definition of policies on child labor, the main activity held during the implementation of the TBP was the formulation of the Second National Plan. This is, in itself, an important outcome intended to both make the institutions' commitments more effective, and to include the issue of CL in the National Development Plan and the poverty reduction plan, "Vida Nueva."

This point is essential since the concept of the TBP assumes that in order to eradicate CL it is necessary for the scheduled actions carried out to be integrated into larger plans that include policies to fight against poverty which are incorporated in the government's social policies, in particular in the areas of education, health, employment, and income generation.

The Second Plan tried to overcome the lacks of the first. The drafting process, done with an active inter-institutional participation, allowed mid-level and top officials from all the institutions involved (that is, members of CDN) to become aware of the severity of the problem, and of the need to include it in their policies, plans, and projects. In this sense, the reflection and debate process led by the consultant in charge showed that including the issue in the discourse was necessary, but not sufficient by itself. For each institution to really assume its responsibilities, it was indispensable to define the areas, projects, and resources that could incorporate the issue, to then translate these definitions into the goals and activities of their Annual Operational Plans (AOP), and, finally, to determine the budgetary allocations so as to be able to implement the scheduled activities.

On the other hand, the wide participation generated during the definition of the main strategies of the Second Plan forced the institutions involved to think about short-, medium-, and long-term actions, along with those indicators and variables through which MIDEPLAN could verify whether the goals had been reached in the time allotted. The new budgetary and planning law foresees that all the budgets of public institutions, not only the ministries', but also the decentralized entities, are to be reviewed by MIDEPLAN. These are the entities that are in charge of reviewing the AOP of each institution, and approving its budget. This has meant creating a link that had not been proposed, which, by virtue of the new regulation, turned into a strategy. The work of MIDEPLAN implied raising the awareness and involving the officials who receive and review the AOP. That is, these officials had to be made aware of the judicial framework regarding CL, and regarding the protection of working adolescents, so this could all be reflected in the AOP. If these conditions were not complied with, they returned the AOP for review, or rejected them if they did not include activities and budgetary allocations to fight against CL.

At the time of carrying out the final evaluation, most of the institutions had sent their AOP for the year 2006, including some action lines related to CL or CSEC, as needed. There are still some deficiencies in the definition of adequate indicators

and variables, since most of those that had been included were related to very short-term specific actions. The officials of MIDEPLAN who were interviewed agreed on the need to keep working on these matters.

It should be pointed out that an unexpected result, the development of the Second Plan, required that several institutions start a reflection process regarding their role in the eradication of the WFCL. In particular, the process started by PANI is worth mentioning; this has led some of its officials to review their protective role and, with the approval of the authorities, they began an institution-wide change aimed at including a rights approach in the organization's operation. This does not mean that this restructuring was not already in the minds of those who had to make the change, but the participatory and consultation methodology during the formulation of the Second Plan greatly contributed to accelerating this process.

Another unexpected outcome were the new dynamics adopted by the National Directive Committee. This occurred because the formulation of the Second Plan forced each institution that is part of the CDN to appoint technical liaisons that had to become involved in the discussion of strategies and actions to be included in it. This outcome resulted in the creation of a Network Technical Committee comprised of representatives from each institution who could make decisions; these representatives were made aware of the issue and really became involved in this matter. They also started acting as multiplying agents within their organizations. One of the last training activities organized for the Technical Committee was attended by 27 liaisons. It is also important to stress that based upon IPEC's suggestions, a technical representative of the Ministry of Agriculture and Livestock became part of CDN.

Finally, the methodology used to prepare the Second National Plan was relevant in order to generate reflection about the impossibility of dealing with children's issues in general, and child labor in particular, as matters which had to be approached by a single institution or with a single perspective. The need to create networks and inter-institutional collaboration arose as the key to achieve the objectives proposed. This is discussed below, together with other aspects.

4.2.c. Strengthening of key actors' capacities

Institutional strengthening is one of the central axes for the development of a TBP which requires the support not only of the governments, but also of trade unions, employers' organizations, NGOs, community organizations and leaders, research institutes, and society as a whole. In Costa Rica, the activities that IPEC had previously carried out provided a suitable framework for undertaking a TBP. However, this also required implementing several action lines so that the addition of will and commitment from all the sectors that in one way or another should be interested in the elimination of the WFCL would form a comprehensive vision of the problem that could allow multiple aspects related to the existence of child labor to be faced.

The emphasis on institutional strengthening was first placed on the Ministry of Labor and Social Security (MTSS), natural counterpart of IPEC, in particular the OATIA, and on the institutions and organizations that comprise CDN. The activities were implemented by using two basic lines of action: the promotion of inter-institutional cooperation, and by their strengthening through training and technical assistance provided.

Interinstitutional cooperation

Undoubtedly the characteristics inherent to the bureaucracy of the public sector and, in particular, to its fragmented culture and closed spaces, are restrictions for the establishment of fluid and sustainable relations over time. The core entity for this inter-institutional cooperation should be the CDN. Although the participation of all key actors had been achieved, it was not until the formulation of the Second National Plan that, as mentioned earlier, the Networking Technical Committee was created. It was during the discussions about the commitment that each actor had to assume within this Committee that the other institutions began to seriously think about their role with regards to CL. That is, the MTSS stopped being the only institution responsible for undertaking concrete actions, and the other institutions' intervention areas were defined.

Thus, at the end of the TBP, PANI, the regulating body for childhood and adolescence, is now being subjected to a deep restructuring whose axis is the transformation of its actions from a protective perspective to one of defending children's rights. And the project was part of this restructuring process in a number of ways. The training sessions held, along with the strong involvement of a group of technicians with direct access to the institution's directorate during the discussions of the Second Plan, made this organism start considering CL as any job held by a person under 15 years of age. Thus, they started dealing with these cases accordingly. Moreover, this meant both the active participation of PANI and its assuming those responsibilities that, according to the institutional regulatory framework, are inherent to it.

Regarding the Institute of Social Welfare (IMAS), the technicians consulted agree that inter-institutional work, although needing reinforcement, allowed professionals who were interested in the eradication of CL to meet one another. It is believed that more awareness and commitment is necessary at the middle institutional levels in order to be able to work cooperatively and to prevent the invisibility of CL and SCEC. Specifically, during the implementation of the TBP, it was possible to modify the Social Information Card (FIS) along with the instructions for completing it, and the staff in charge of recording data on the beneficiaries was trained. In the Brunca Region, the card was being used successfully.

The Ministry of Public Education (MEP), during this period, became aware of the need to raise the awareness of technicians and teachers, the necessity for making CL visible, and, especially, for including strategies to approach the problem in its everyday work at both the central level as well as locally at the nation's schools. The coordination carried out with the governmental institutions and the need to include non-governmental institutions and the civil sector on the treatment of CL is highly valued.

Although the National Learning Institute (INA) was one of the actors present since the beginning, it has been very difficult to coordinate actions, basically because it has been somewhat inflexible at the time of attending to the educational and training needs of child workers. In fact, INA's requirements include that trainees be older than 15 and have a minimum educational level to have access to its vocational training options, requirements that many school dropouts do not meet. Moreover, *"courses are often offered according to employers' demands, rather than based on those of the unemployed or underemployed adolescents"* (Interview)

Moreover, both MEP and PANI and the MSP have opened offices dealing with childhood and adolescence, which in all cases include CL and CSEC as central issues, which require inter-sectorial coordination for their attention.

On the other hand, there is agreement that coordination is fundamental at the local level, too. At this level, in the communities of Golfito and Corredores, this is a true outcome in which the OATIA, as mentioned in the next section, could not be involved to a wide enough extent. The reasons for this lack of involvement were that it was not possible to decentralize the OATIA itself, nor for it to send a delegation to the Brunca Region. One of the main effects of the jointly carried out work has been the formulation of inter-institutional networks which, although they still need to be consolidated and improved, are becoming very useful when monitoring CL, detecting the victims of SCEC, following up on the children and their families, and granting loans, among the other activities in which they have been involved.

Although no governmental organization disputes the role of OATIA as the entity which should ideally be in charge of both eradicating child labor and protecting the rights of working adolescents, this role is losing strength as other organisms begin to appropriate the issue, and to create local networks which have been providing more efficient responses to the emerging problems.

With regards to the collaboration achieved, a point that deserves special attention is the development of protocols that guide the specifications of the interventions, both at the intra-institutional level within the MTSS, and at the inter-institutional one. Within the TBP framework, both aspects were especially worked on since it had already ascertained that the flow of the coordination depended to a great extent on the personal networks created, rather than on the guidelines that determine the appropriate procedures to follow.

Regarding the coordination between the pertinent areas of the MTSS which were considered relevant, including the directorates of Labor Inspection, Labor Relations, and OATIA, an intra-institutional protocol was approved and was being used. This protocol was prepared by a consultant hired for that purpose.

At the time of the final evaluation, the inter-institutional protocol was already in the hands of the CDN members in order for them to be able to review it and make suggestions. OATIA is the center for collecting information and for following up on this.

Both protocols were consulted with all the technical entities, and were validated in several field tests. The procedure to achieve this validation (in which all participants became actively involved) was essential for achieving a final product. This is an important advance with regard to the need for inter-institutional work. Nevertheless, according to several interviewees, this need *"is much clearer among the technical liaisons of the Technical Committee than among the members of CDN."*

Strengthening through training and technical assistance

The majority of the actions related to the strengthening of each of the governmental organizations that comprise the CDN were focused on providing training and technical assistance to mid-level officials, most of them being professionals or technicians. OATIA has been IPEC's main ally in a large number of training sessions held. In particular, and given the importance it has for the detection of working children, it is worth mentioning the training sessions for the labor inspectors of the MTSS, the Technical Assistants of Primary Health Care (ATAPS) of the Social Security System Authority (CCSS), school teachers, IMAS and PANI officials, workers' unions SEC, Rerun Novarum, CMTC and employers' groups.

On the other hand, the core technical team of the psychology department at the University of Costa Rica (UCR) has been providing specific training on the issue of CSEC, and is providing support and encouragement to a number of public officials studying in the department. These students, having already completed their psychology majors, had not as yet presented their graduation theses, and they have been encouraged to do their research on the issue of CL and CSEC. Such actions have been a strong motivation for professionals and technicians who, due to their affiliation with an institution that today is viewed as *“old, bureaucratic, and anchored in the past” (Interview)*, had low self-esteem and little commitment to what they were doing.

Beyond the training and technical assistance processes that have been taking place in all the governmental spheres related to the issue of CL, similar actions have also been held among non-governmental partners involved in the TBP. Thus, although the trade unions and employers' organizations had been involved to some extent in the issue of CL since before the TBP actions started, the project activities in which they have participated have allowed them to systematize the type of interventions and collaboration that they have engaged in.

In the first case, both the CMTC and the CTRN have collaborated in terms of sharing resources and exchanging information, and have organized activities related to the TBP on matters especially related to awareness-raising and the dissemination of information about the issue of CL. A multiplier effect has occurred, and it has been possible to make the issue of CL known in several contexts such as those related to the trade unions, thus involving their younger members. The outcomes obtained were considered by the interviewees as very good in terms of their involvement and awareness. Both trade unions have also created networks for the detection and referral of specific cases.

With regards to employers, they have reinforced their commitment and have worked intensely to train and raise awareness in different associations belonging to the Costa Rican Union of Private Enterprise Associations (UCCAEP). However, their specific participation has been sporadic. They focused on the Red (Penalty) Card campaign, and they do not seem to be involved in any of the other actions on a permanent basis, despite the availability of resources. On the other hand, a pending matter to be worked on in this sector through its associations, is the policy of some employers' to not hire adolescents between the ages of 15 to 18, in accordance with the special conditions set forth in the regulations.

4.2.d. The direct action programs

The implementation of the direct Action Programs, although responding to the immediate objective of both withdrawing children from the WFCL and preventing child labor in the Brunca Region, aimed at the construction of intervention models that could be replicated in other regions of the country.

As has been seen, the selection of the Brunca Region not only responded to the socioeconomic characteristics of the region (such as high poverty levels and the magnitude of CL in some of its worst forms) but also to political viability criteria, as this region was part of the priority intervention areas of the National Development Plan and the Nueva Vida Plan, in addition to the institutional viability derived from the active presence of public and private organizations related to children's affairs. On the other hand, the fact of having developed AP in a single region allows for better utilization of the available resources, the concentration of efforts made, and the focusing of the actions carried out directly on the target population.

Although the local-level strategy was developed as a successive implementation of three AP implemented by different agencies, in fact each AP was implemented and presented before the institutions and communities as inter-related components of a single project. According to testimonies gathered, this was the result of the lessons learned from prior interventions effected in Costa Rica.

This strategy has been essential so as to be able to obtain achievements in the short amount of time for which the implementing agencies were hired to carry out the actions and to generate synergies in their respective interventions.

Thus, the local-level project was developed as follows:

- Integral Attention to Working Children and their families (OATIA)
- Attention to Victims of CSEC (UCR), started in May 2004. Duration 15 months
- Awareness-raising and social mobilization (Caritas – Pastoral Social) expected to start in August 2004, but which will start in December of this year: 12 months duration
- Production Alternatives (FUNDAOSA) which formally started in April 2005: 8 months duration

The integral attention effort, which was supposed to be a cross-sectional strategy of institutional cooperation for the detection, referral, and follow-up of working children to be led by OATIA, became yet another component due to the role assumed by this office.

The integral attention was developed in different steps: 1. The identification by officials of Action Programs and Schools. 2. The OATIA visits families and interviews the identified boys, girls and adolescents. 3. According to obtained results from home visits and interviews, a report is elaborated in which steps are recommended to be followed, including references to all different Government institutions: MEP, IMAS, PANI, C.C.S.S and others, 4. A month after the reference is made, the institution to where the child is referred to is asked for information regarding the provided support to the child and its family.

Finally, during the last year and thanks to the achieved collaboration, it was possible to undertake a Professional Training project in order to support working boys and girls between the ages of 12 and 17.

Implementing agencies¹⁰

The selection criteria of the implementing agencies of the AP used by IPEC team were their creditability and institutional solidity, as well as their location and experience in the area. These requirements were the reason for the delay in the APs, as it has been pointed out in this report. It was firmly decided not to start implementing the AP *“until the adequate implementing agencies were found”* (Interview).

These factors impacted the decision to work with the University of Costa Rica, whose psychology department had been developing community programs in Golfito, but with little impact. UCR's alliance with IPEC meant the development of a solid withdrawal and SCEC prevention proposal, which took advantage of the intervention model already used by the Regional Sub-project for the Eradication of CSEC in the area of Limon, thanks to the advice provided by the technicians

¹⁰ The OATIA is not included in this section as an implementing agency since it is the Governmental agency responsible for dealing with this subject. As such it has the role of articulating the various APs and coordinating activities together with IPEC.

themselves. It also reflected a strong commitment of the psychology department with the AP of the Brunca Region in terms of quality and number of people assigned, and the strengths of the strategies employed.

The selection of Pastoral Social de Caritas Diocese took into account that this was an organization within the Catholic Church which was interested in this social problem, and which had a parochial structure that was already established in the region. However, its true administrative and managerial capacity was not really assessed, and this led to delays in the start of the AP and to frequent changes in the local referents. Neither were the difficulties that the Project might have in raising the awareness and involving priests as multiplier agents considered. This caused problems from the beginning of the program's implementation, and demanded additional efforts from IPEC and the coordinator. Nevertheless, the joint work strategy of the organizations involved helped to make the achievements of this component significant.

In a context in which there were few agencies that could assume the challenges of the production-alternative component, IPEC opted to choose FUNDAOSA (Foundation for Sustainable Development in the Osa Peninsula). Despite the brief time available, the factors that favored the acceptance of its proposal were FUNDAOSA's total anchorage in and knowledge of the area, its experience in handling rotating loan funds because of its link with FICOSA, and the community and participatory structure of operation of this civil sector organization. On the other hand, the proposal stated taking on as the first beneficiaries the families of the working children already detected, which would then allow a quick startup of the component in April 2005. Although at the time of this evaluation only two loans had already been approved, several applicants were already been analyzed and assessed, and the grant system was being adjusted.

Below is a summary of the strengths and weaknesses of each agency according to the observations made during the visit to Golfito and Corredores, along with the testimonies gathered from key informants¹¹ responsible for each of the components:

Strengths	Weaknesses
OATIA	
Institutional capacity to confront the issue of child labour Acknowledged specific reference to all institutions Knowledge and Expertise in the area of Social-Labour Assessments	Lack of an assigned permanent person in the area
UCR team	
The capacity of the team's coordinator to create flexible, effective, and timely links A highly devoted, motivated, and committed professional team Permanent technical assistance provided by the UCR department of psychology Effective coordination with CODECAN and CODEBRUNCA, which allowed to articulate the responses according to the population's needs	Insufficient personnel to attend 100 children victims of CSEC in a more personalized manner

¹¹ IPEC Coordination in the Brunca Region, interview with the consultant for the systematization, amongst others.

FUNDAOSA team	
<p>The coordinator has vast experience and the professional capacity needed to perform the position's functions</p> <p>A professional team with experience, an adequate profile, motivation, and commitment</p> <p>The technical assistance provided by FICOSA is fundamental due to its experience in managing micro-enterprises in the area</p> <p>Although it does not participate in the other components, CODECAN takes advantage of the contacts made by them in order to establish beneficial links for the project's development</p>	<p>Difficulties in sustaining the actions beyond the funding</p>
Pastoral Social team	
<p>The coordinator is sensitive to the problem, and has a good deal of experience in handling groups and in participatory techniques</p> <p>Strong commitment from the Bishop</p> <p>Open to incorporating other religious groups in the strategy</p>	<p>Unsuitable selection of the hired staff to facilitate the process</p> <p>Lack of monitoring by Pastoral Social</p> <p>Lack of clarity at the beginning of the activities about how to carry them out, and who is to do so in a project of this nature</p> <p>Under-utilization of the church members as multiplier agents</p>

Implementation

Beyond the role assigned to each of the agencies in terms of objectives and activities which had to be complied with, the efforts made were based on the need for *"the action programs not to be carried out by NGOs, as happens in other countries, but to be carried out (or implemented) jointly with institutions"* (Interview), in order to develop capacities in public institutions in the region for direct action with working children.

The contracting in January 2004 of the local consultant of IPEC, supported by OATIA staff, allowed the first diagnostic activities that were carried out to be fostered and enhanced with participatory techniques. These were geared toward promoting the involvement of local actors for the detection of target groups. The Technical Assistants of Primary Health Care (ATAPS) of the Social Security System (CCSS), along with the Ministry of Public Education, were both identified as good interlocutors or go-betweens. These institutions gathered a good part of the important information required after having been trained for that purpose. This is when OATIA had to start evaluating and referring cases of children involved in dangerous jobs.

Each NGO, upon beginning its AP implementation, participated in an induction course taught by IPEC and supported by other NGOs that were already implementing the AP in the project, since all the implementing agencies were to start at different times.

On the other hand, as part of the management strategy, the local coordination of IPEC constantly supported the implementation of the project and the preparation of reports and balances. This supportive role was shared with

OATIA, which also had to provide technical assistance. At all times, IPEC's intention was for OATIA to assume a strong and clear leadership in the local attention processes for the target population.

In Parallel, it was the duty of the local coordination to promote the inter-institutional coordination between existing Government institutions in the area. The entities with local representation, especially PANI and IMAS, have gradually become more and more involved, and at the time of the final evaluation, they have become good supporters to the APs.

The initial idea of creating ad hoc structures was abandoned. Instead, the constant presence of COREBRUNCA and CODECAN, councils that are related at the regional and local levels to the Vida Nueva plan to fight against poverty, was ensured. The directors of all public institutions are involved in this plan. This has made it possible to gain adepts and coordinate with them in order to respond to the needs of the target population.

The implementing agencies exercise a kind of collective leadership, which, with the active participation of IPEC, has created strategic alliances with other institutions. In terms of management of the implementing agencies, the coordinators and technical teams of the AP have created an executive commission that meets monthly to exchange information about the activities held, to assess their progress and needs, and to schedule and organize future tasks together. In April 2005, public organization representatives from PANI, IMAS, MEP, and CCSS, among others, were invited to attend these meetings. Although they expressed some interest, they have not yet attended any meetings.

Based on the progress reports filed, the proceedings and minutes of the monthly meetings, and interviews that were held with key informants, it has been noticed that the joint work of the various components, effectively led by IPEC, has been crucial. This is especially notable given the short time available to schedule collaborative and complementary actions that could make it possible to take full advantage of the resources, capacities, and contacts available at each agency, as well as the existing institutional structures, in order to overcome the obstacles and difficulties that arose along the way.

Advances and outcomes

The activities held in the different components have been intensive, and are detailed in the documentation to which this evaluation had access: the minutes of the monthly meetings, progress reports filed on each AP, and Costa Rica's TBP systematization report, among others. Therefore, the intention here is not to describe them, but rather to raise some specific issues that are significant in terms of the products and outcomes reached.

- **Regarding the integral attention component:**

This component is the entryway and the heart of the whole referral and institutional coordination process. Information was made available by local institutions (in particular, ATAPS and teachers) to detect working children. These children's families were visited by the social workers of OATIA in order to complete the socio-labor study that would allow for identification of the actual referral needs and services or benefits that could contribute to withdrawing the working children from their dangerous jobs. The referrals were encouraged by the CODECAN, which is composed of representatives of the institutions that can respond to the CL issue and which could also do the monitoring (this was achieved in Golfito and Corredores, but not in Puerto Jiménez, since it was not contemplated in the Project

document. However, specific actions were done such as supporting the culture of inter-institutional coordination).

A database was created; this became a fundamental tool to schedule and do follow-up on the evaluation and referral activities for children. The database shows that the goals related to the beneficiaries have been met in terms of detecting children involved in dangerous jobs. By the time of the fieldwork of this evaluation, the number reached 849, or 85% of the expected target population.

OATIA has participated in the existing inter-institutional spaces (especially the CODECAN) as well as in training sessions and events of other components, and in the coordination and reference to the attention of working boys, girls and adolescents in the Project's prioritized communities.

Despite multiple requests presented to the Ministry of Labor, it was not possible to have a local delegation appointed. Due to the inability to decentralize the Ministry of Labor, it was like an "absent yet informed" entity in the project's implementation. Despite of the fact that the assigned person traveled twice a month; on these visits, she was hardly able to complete the required work¹² to attend to some of the cases that the ATAP, MEP, and other components of the project had identified. On the other hand, OATIA never allowed other technicians to be trained in how to fill out the socio-labor evaluation card for each identified case. The reason for the latter is that this requires an adequate professional eye, apart from a specific training. This resulted in that at the time of this evaluation, it had evaluated 60% of the identified cases, and of these, it had only produced results for about half of them. For the other components, this has been a rough road, because once the cases are reported to OATIA, it was not known how long it would take to get an institutional response for the identified problems, thus generating frustration. It is necessary to find a solution to this situation, either through training a group of professionals based in the area, or through the transfer of professionals to the Brunca Region.

This "absence" has also become problematic in terms of the withdrawal strategy of IPEC: there is no one to assume its role in the everyday management for the preparation and sustainability of the actions carried out. During the fieldwork of the evaluation, it learned that some steps were being taken for one of the social workers of PANI who works in the area to be "lent" to the MTSS so as to comply with the functions of the Ministry of Labor. In the short term, this could be a provisory solution.

▪ **Regarding the awareness-raising and mobilization component:**

The first awareness-raising activities and training sessions for the priests and church members with respect to their dealing with the issue CL, were held with the purpose of their becoming multiplier agents for the community. Although these activities and sessions did not achieve the expected outcomes, some of the priests and church members provided their support to the project.

The component also suffered from management and team assignment problems during the first months of its implementation. But with the support of IPEC and the promotion of the actions that were held within the framework of the other components, several mobilization, dissemination, and community organization activities were started. There was evidence of good local participation. The most outstanding aspects here are the advances achieved regarding the

¹² The process includes visiting homes or workplaces, evaluating the situation to determine if it involves CL, assessing the needs or carrying out a socio-labor study, referring the case to PANI or, depending on the minor's age, another institution, and monitoring.

organization of monitoring groups (MTI) after the completion of 21 participatory diagnoses and the preparation of work plans with groups of community representatives. At the time of this evaluation, 14 child-labor monitoring networks had been created in both communities, and collaboration activities with the CODECAN of Golfito and Corredores had been initiated so they will be able to report to and present requests directly before local organizations.

This promotion has been welcomed in the community, and has translated into its mobilization with regards to CL through multiple actions: recreational, sports, and artistic activities, events and whole day activities, participation in fairs, and dissemination activities in several forms of media (radio, graphs, etc.), training for members of cooperatives and small entrepreneurs, the transfer of participatory methodologies and community motivation (SCREAM) to schools in the area.

According to the testimonies gathered, another aspect worth pointing out is that no problems were noted in the work done by Catholic Church members with people from other faiths, which was facilitated by the open attitude of the Bishop of the Diocese of Pérez Zeledón. In fact, his openness was fundamental for involving the youngsters and raise awareness in several communities, particularly in Puerto Jiménez.

- **Regarding the commercial sexual exploitation component:**

The commercial sexual exploitation component is the one that started first, and is also the one that progressed the most. Taking into account that the problem of SCEC cannot be treated as child labor itself, it was the technical team of UCR that directly assumed the responsibility of making the evaluations and the direct referrals to PANI and IMAS. So far, almost all the underage persons set as the goal have been identified. Moreover, an important number of children and adolescents at risk of SCEC have also been identified: a total of 183 underage persons were attended to (92 victims and 91 at risk). The number of families assisted is also significant (77 families).

This result is the product of a strong effort to prevent SCEC and to protect the victims through direct contact with the institutions involved, awareness-raising action, training activities provided for the representatives of the institutions and the communities, and ongoing motivation of the key officials in charge of identifying the victims (ATAPS and other employees of the health sector). Also carried out was the needed strengthening of the intervention of the institutions in order to guarantee the respect of the rights of underage persons by coordinating with CODECAN, operating from a service platform to detect, attend, and follow-up the victims of CSEC.

At this point, it is necessary to stress a significant element: a model of integral attention that is beyond simple assistance, that is, trying to reconstitute the victim's rights and to focus on the family environment. Thus, in the attention given to the victims by the Project, it was possible to identify a range of activities that included house visits, monitoring of the schooling of the underage persons, support for productive strategies, coordination with FICOSA and MAG for family survival alternatives, and actions to deliver subsidies, scholarships, as well as other benefits and rights, such as personal documentation. All these activities mean intensive work and coordination with multiple institutions and health, education, and integral protection services.

On the other hand, as evidence of the commitment of UCR with the component, the University has promoted a community service project (TCU) among its students focused on SCEC. Students are also encouraged to write their theses

on this matter, thus encouraging research in the field. At present, young students are participating in the design and implementation of several production and training initiatives for families in Golfito and Corredores. Thus, during the first year of the implementation of the AP, five theses related to the issue of CL have been prepared. This is undoubtedly an innovative aspect, and an unexpected effect of the project implementation.

Finally, as a result of the link created with the Regional Subproject for the Eradication of SCEC, the Region's follow-up has been included in the second phase of this subproject.

- **Regarding the production alternative component**

Despite the short time elapsed since its start in April 2005, it may be affirmed that the bases for the operation of the component have been set; its outcomes seem promising in the medium term although it may not happen in the time scheduled.

In fact, the Hope Fund for the Protection of Children and Adolescents (FODESPIA) has been set up as a rotating loan fund. This has a set of regulations approved by IPEC, and it includes the creation of a participatory structure of scholarship committees, which are comprised of community representatives and the Community Boards for Children. The latter are composed of a representative of each committee, the technical team of FUNDAOSA, and representatives of the Local Credit Boards of FICOSA, who have a good deal of experience in the handling of credit. All of these organisms will be responsible for managing the loan program (for example, the presentation and assessment of the applications, and performance monitoring).

Thanks to the adequate utilization of the information generated, the existing coordination, and joint activities of the various components of the Project, it was possible to advance in the raising of awareness and training of the families in order to formulate production initiatives to be developed or strengthened. Several potential candidates are families of the victims of CSEC attended to by the project. Seven base committees¹³ were created that will recommend families who qualify for credit, and these base committees have appointed a representative to the Community Boards in Golfito and Corredores that will be in charge of granting the loans. It is also expected that the Committees will operate as CL monitoring groups as well. In coordination with the awareness-raising and social mobilization component, the Base Committee and Board members, along with the staff of the Foundation, were all trained in issues related to the eradication and prevention of child labor.

- **An unexpected outcome: the Professional Formation component**

As has already been mentioned, this component, which amended the TBP, actually arose from the coordination done throughout the project's implementation, and it is based on the detection in the database of a good number of adolescents between 12 and 17 years of age who have either dropped out of school or simply do not attend classes. This is a particularly vulnerable group because of their difficulties in entering the labor market and getting alternative schooling. These factors include, on the one hand, the fact that these youngsters are subject to the restrictions and limitations of the public educational system: there are very few boarding schools for youngsters from rural areas, and few alternative options such as the special retention programs and achievement improvement programs. On the

¹³ It should be pointed out that there are 6 working adolescents among the 34 members of these committees.

other hand, the requirements of INA do not match the reality of these adolescents. Finally, employers tend not to employ people under 18 years old.

To take advantage of the interest shown by IMAS, a proposal has been presented by which the Institute, through Caritas, will assign funds to train these young people.

This project started with a module about Formation and Training for Life and Study, whose purpose was to increase motivation and to encourage children to start studying and get professional or technical training. At the time of the final evaluation, the first module had already finished, and 85 youngsters had already been trained. In addition, the training of a second group of 135 youngsters was about to begin.

4.3. SUSTAINABILITY

Sustainability is a multidimensional concept, with a socio-communal, economic, and political-institutional meaning. It is an outcome to be achieved as a result of the Effectiveness of the action lines undertaken by the projects.

To guarantee the projects' **social sustainability**, the aim is to bring about changes in the beliefs, concepts, and practices of key actors and the population as a whole. In this sense, enough progress has been made to state that there is a consensus regarding the recognition that CL is a deeply rooted social problem that the country must face.

"I would say that it might not disappear just because there are some journalists who have bought the idea, but I consider the change more difficult; that is, passing from a merely informative to an interpretative level. So, I do not think it will vanish, since it is an issue. Like with inflation: people are already concerned about the rise in prices. People know about CL. Moreover, some journalists have learned to detect it. I do not think it will disappear, but I think the progress to get where we want to be will be slow. There are issues that if no one pushes them, they keep moving toward the edge or start to disappear." (Interview)

In turn, this conviction has encouraged the jointly carried out work of activating the inter-institutional and consultation mechanisms, thus generating synergies among the governmental areas and other organizations. However, there are sectors that require more awareness-raising and training, especially regarding the implications of the WFCL and the role that each actor should play in order to contribute to the eradication of these abuses.

In addition to the financial resources, the **economic** dimension of sustainability include human resources, physical spaces, and equipment. The really great step taken in this direction is related to the inclusion of actions and funds for CL in the AOP of all public institutions. However, in the final discussion of the budget in the legislative assembly, these specifications are not reviewed. According to the interviews held, *"what is approved by the Assembly is not specified"* and another interviewee voiced what is perhaps the most relevant observation, that *"to guarantee the allocations it is necessary to include the Ministry of Finance, which is the one that ultimately decides how much each entity will receive."* (Interview)

Institutional sustainability would be achieved when it is possible to guarantee that the actions, changes, and innovations of the TBP become regular practices or actions carried out by the actors and organizations involved.

In this sense, the actions geared toward the consolidation of the role of the inter-institutional coordination of CDN and, in particular, its Technical Secretariat, are important among the more significant achievements. At the local level, these are actions intended to promote and strengthen the social networks so as to ensure the continuity of the programs when IPEC withdraws. Although in both senses important steps have been taken, it is still necessary to consolidate them. Of special concern is the highly limited amount of time remaining to implement the AP.

The continuity of the SCEC component seems to be ensured with the approval of the Second Phase of the Sub-regional Program for two additional years. This also shows that the selection of UCR was suitable for its credibility, the quality of its technical teams, and its intervention methodologies. On the other hand, there is the intention to take advantage of this second phase in order to support the strengthening of the monitoring groups and the participation of CODECAN.

The AP of Pastoral Social depends on the priests' awareness about their social role and their will to become more effectively involved in the specific tasks that their support for the work of the CL monitoring networks implies, that is, beyond their "spiritual guidance" role.

The experience with FUNDAOSA is potentially interesting. In other countries, it has not even been possible to implement production alternatives beyond some professional training for youngsters. But the development of production alternatives in Costa Rica is still incipient. The start of a rotating loan fund for low-income families requires considerable time until it may be implemented. The horizon of 8 months has been appropriate since the beginning. This was based on the projects' logic: the need to comply with the products and times included in the design.

The new component of professional training is promising and has the advantage (and, at the same time, the disadvantage) that IMAS made a commitment to provide financial support. The crucial matter is whether it will be possible to retain its coordination with the other components so that the trained adolescents have a chance to not become involved in dangerous jobs.

Despite the outcomes obtained in terms of the children assisted and the coordination created, the weak link for the project's sustainability is the integral attention component, which is essential for the whole. The reasons have been explained already. The key question posed is who will assume the role of IPEC and continue the process.

From the point of view of IPEC's technicians, it is necessary for the country to continue alone since the conditions for it to assume its commitments already exist. However, the other relevant actors mentioned before believe that the problem is still "minor" when compared to the other issues in the public agenda and that it can be diluted without the existence of a push such as that provided by IPEC's technical assistance and financial support. And, although IPEC is going to remain in the country, because this is where its Subregional headquarters are located, there are no further projects to be developed in Costa Rica after the TPB concludes in March 2006.

IPEC's proposal for sustainability has been to relate the issue with poverty, and to insert it in the Nueva Vida plan and in this government's development plan. The arrival of a new government, whose priorities are as yet unknown, poses new questions in this sense.

5. CONCLUSIONS

The conclusions of the evaluation can be drawn from the achievements, from what is still pending, from what needs further consolidation, and from what the country should assume in order to be able to meet the goals of the national TBP.

5.1. EFFECTIVENESS AND EFFICIENCY IN ITS PERFORMANCE

The points developed so far show that the TBP has been **effective** overall, since it has complied with the expected plan, including the implementation of almost all the actions proposed, as well as nearly fulfilling the objectives of the original plan.

The TBP has also been effective in terms of generating a favorable scenario for the development of a national TBP, and in contributing to placing the issue of CL on the public agenda. Moreover, it has had an active role in the promotion of changes in the national legislation about the issue, and it has contributed to incorporating some concrete aspects for the eradication of child labor in public policies.

Additionally, the TBP has made a contribution to promoting the actions of public and private institutions. The creation of the offices for children and adolescents at the MET and PANI are evidence of the legitimacy reached by the issue at the governmental level.

The development of the AP has been more than satisfactory because of the achievements obtained given the insufficient time available to implement the expected actions, as well as taking into account the magnitude of the goals set.

Regarding its **efficiency**, it may be stated that the outcomes reached widely justify the global investment made. The budget for the project proved to be well balanced with regards to both the adequate development of the activities proposed as well as the achievements expected.

The handling of the available resources was also effective. Especially in the Brunca Region, the inter-institutional coordination processes and the utilization of the existing institutional resources (including the regional and local policy coordination structures) were adequate in terms of the generation of synergies with national initiatives being developed at the same time as the TBP.

The difficulties that usually arise from administrative processes at ILO/IPEC were moderate in this case because of the advantage of having the Sub-regional Headquarters of ILO in the same country as the technical team responsible for the implementation of the TBP. Both parties knew how to make good use of this situation, and they agreed on the suitability of the support provided by the Sub-regional Office and the office in Geneva. Yet, all agreed to emphasize the excessive additional time required for the approval of the AP, and the difficulties generated by this situation.

5.2. REGARDING THE AWARENESS OF THE KEY ACTORS AND POPULATION AS A WHOLE

It may be concluded that the actions taken by the projects have been effective in order to both generate a suitable environment for eradicating the WFCL and to collaborate in order to establish the basis for the development of the

national TBP policies. The outcomes of the **awareness-raising** efforts are satisfactory. It has not only been possible to involve all the important actors, but progress has also been made to generate tangible commitments regarding the allocation of resources for the eradication of the WFCL. On the other hand, the issue of child labor and its worst forms is seen by all actors as a national social problem that should be eliminated in a comprehensive fashion.

The achievements related to the commitment assumed by the key actors to treat CSEC are also important, especially the involvement of UCR and the experience acquired to treat this problem.

The population as a whole is clearly informed about this matter. Through the media, people have learned that CL is a problem that has a wide enough dimension to be considered a social problem. The population as a whole also knows that a large part of the problem is related to extreme poverty, although some cultural traits about child labor are also acknowledged.

Nevertheless, all the actors consulted agreed that for the issue not to become diluted among the multiple social problems the country is facing, it is necessary to continue moving ahead. It is especially necessary to recognize the responsibilities of individual citizens and society as a whole on this matter, and to reflect on the rights of working children and their families, and on the tools that have to be activated in order to be able to prevent children from working. Education and awareness about this matter are necessary.

In this sense, it is necessary to overcome the lack of a communication strategy at IPEC, which is the failure to differentiate between CL and the protection of adolescent workers in campaigns in the media. A result is that companies in the formal market do not hire adolescents between 15 and 18 years of age. The population needs to be aware that the law does allow for this under certain conditions.

On this same note, there was wide agreement that it is necessary to continue working at the decision-making levels of governmental organizations that comprise the CDN, especially because of the upcoming elections and foreseen change in the national government, in order to integrate the CDN into the political discourse and the priority actions of the new administration.

However, the progress achieved in the training and awareness raising at the intermediate levels in the ministries is very important since most of the tenured officials will continue on, regardless of changes in the country's administration. In Latin America state policies are few, and most of the time governmental policies arise and then die with each outgoing administration. The only guarantee that the actions against the WFCL and child labor in general will continue being part of the governmental agenda is to generate commitment and experience on this issue among these tenured employees.

5.3. REGARDING THE DEVELOPMENT OF POLICIES AND LEGISLATION

Unlike most countries in the region, at the beginning of the TBP, Costa Rica had updated practically all the necessary legislation the country needed to face the problem. As has already been mentioned, the only pending matter was the actualization of the WFCL and the formulation of the corresponding law. During the fieldwork of the final evaluation, this law was waiting to be endorsed, and it is very likely that it will be discussed in the next extraordinary sessions.

This is a very important and unique starting point¹⁴ that required some reflection. During the fieldwork, several actors consulted indicated that *“in Costa Rica we have all the laws, the problem is enforcing them”... “the law does not matter; its enforcement does”... “nobody here knows or enforces the laws.”* In some way these actors were expressing their disappointment in the legal framework which in of itself guarantees neither the implementation of policies nor compliance with the regulations. However, for these achievements to be sustainable over time, it is necessary to have laws. When they exist, rights are made available. Even when a law does not guarantee the exercise and effectiveness of these rights, their mere existence facilitates public demand for these rights. In countries such as those of Latin America, this is a huge issue. What is missing may be to further disseminate the laws and international commitments, and to be aware that all citizens have the rights and duties of enforcing them.

Regarding the progress of the policies, undoubtedly, the formulation and approval of the Second National Plan for the Eradication of CL is an important achievement, and one that demonstrated the possibility of building policies for an issue from an inter-sectorial agreement. Another significant advancement is that MIDEPLAN has become involved in, and has committed to, monitoring compliance of the allotment of resources for activities carried out to eradicate the WFCL set forth in the AOP of the governmental organisms under its supervision.

In this sense, it is still necessary to implement policies in agreement with the guidelines posed in the Second National Plan, and for them to remain in effect after the upcoming change of government administration. As mentioned earlier, lobbying with the presidential candidates and their campaign teams is fundamental at the time of establishing public commitments. On the other hand, it should also be pointed out that a strategy to incorporate the Ministry of Finance within the CDN and the Technical Committee is also missing. The purpose of such a strategy would be to get its commitment in order to guarantee the availability of funds for the various activities aiming at the elimination of the WFCL within the allocated budget.

5.4. REGARDING THE STRENGTHENING OF KEY ACTORS' CAPACITIES

In this sense, the stakeholders of the final evaluation acknowledged the contribution of the training and technical assistance they had received. The OATIA role in the training has been central and highly satisfactory. It has been possible to raise the awareness and train officials in several governmental areas at the central and local levels. For the trade unions, their recognition as multipliers was *“very important”* as well as their access to several meetings at the national and international levels. Another important achievement was the training of their affiliates. Among the employers, the training helped to transform the ideas and expectation regarding CL and encouraged the reflection about their own practices and ways to collaborate.

The technical assistance, mostly provided by IPEC, helped also to create the appropriate meeting environment, instruments to exchange ideas and information and to encourage some follow-up and evaluation entities for the activities held and the outcomes obtained.

Nevertheless, the main achievement regarding institutional strengthening deals with the inter-sectorial entities developed to collaborate in the creation of monitoring and follow-up networks of children and their families.

¹⁴ Other countries in the region had more legal reforms pending at the beginning of the TBP

It has been very difficult to decentralize the activities and resources of most of the institutions. Although they might be carrying out activities in the most needed areas, in some cases they have no offices in these places, and if they do, their staff is not very numerous. Therefore, some of the premises posed at the local level have been hard to sustain. However, the strategy for the implementation of the AP contributed to gradually involving governmental institutions that had representatives in the Brunca Region; some agreements were reached regarding the intervention and referral of cases.

This has also stressed the evident lack of decentralization of OATIA. It is indispensable to progress in this sense since there is political will from the Minister of Labor to open delegations in each of the provinces.

5.5. REGARDING THE ACHIEVEMENTS AND OBSTACLES OF THE LOCAL STRATEGIES

It has already been mentioned before that the TBP at the local level was effective and efficient since practically all planned goals have been achieved. It is also necessary to point out other achievements and some obstacles that were identified at the local level.

It was possible to make the issue of child labor visible and present it as a problem. Child labor has been placed “on the mat” through the awareness-raising and dissemination actions which have contributed to making the communities stop considering child labor and CSEC as something “normal” and to consider the victims of SCEC as subjects with rights.

“The community has understood that it is child labor, that it is [not] a formative activity.” (Interview)

“The victims are no longer blamed. Doctors know that it is a problem.” (Group interview)

The contact made by each component with the involved public organizations and the coordinations of CODECAN contributed to the appropriation of the rights by the local institutions, in particular PANI, MEP, and CCSS through the active participation of the ATAPS in the identification of working boys and girls.

Another important achievement at the local level is the institutional learning by the implementing agencies. A well-known aspect recognized by all is the experience of the inter-institutional cooperation. For UCR, it meant appropriating a theoretical, methodological, technical, and instrumental framework to work with and approach the victims of commercial sexual exploitation, and the emphasis on human rights. In the case of Caritas, the value of a social project that made them reflect about their actions and placed the issue of the eradication of child labor as “a priority in the theological foundations, so they are not only concerned about spirituality but also about an unfair social reality” in which they should become involved. Regarding FUNDAOSA, it is a new project that could have greater social impact than other projects developed by the institution since they are working directly with the families and not with organizations.

On the other hand, it should be mentioned that innovative aspects for local practices were introduced. This refers to the utilization of participatory diagnostic methodologies and the dissemination of instruments such as SCREAM. In addition, the possibility of relating research and action is being explored through the initiatives taken by UCR, which has promoted the participation of its students in the design and implementation of projects. Finally, the SCEC project is creating theories for an interdisciplinary approach from a rights perspective and

systematizing the experience of attending victims, to identify the success conditions of this approach.

Undoubtedly, time has been a scarce resource for the TBP in Costa Rica, especially at the local level. The late start of the various components, although due to strong reasons, has left little time for its implementation. Nevertheless, an important community and institutional mobilization process took place which demonstrated that time is needed to strengthen the inter-institutional links, to empower the child-labor monitoring networks so they can assume their functions independently; to consolidate the recently created base committees; to request new funds (for instance, from IMAS); for the rotating credit fund to be self-sustainable.

Although the terms have been extended, there is awareness that this does not solve the problems. This is due to the "project" logic which means specific outputs in specific times. Most of the products committed were obtained and have contributed to achieving the proposed objectives. Yet, empowerment processes take long. Public institutions work with bureaucratic time frames which may not be made more flexible. Within the communities, these processes are even more complex. Awareness and willingness require resources, stimuli, and/or structural modifications to be translated into concrete sustainable commitments over time.

The lack of decentralization of the institutions, in particular, OATIA, with the resulting inexistence of a permanent presence has hindered the implementation process both for the needs derived from the integral attention process and the coordination role of the project as a whole. There have been delays in the assessment and in the referral of cases. Although the locally assigned personnel had presence in COREBRUNCA and has participated in the activities of the components, it is clear that this is not enough to guarantee the sustainability of the processes in place.

Finally, there is no adequate withdrawal strategy which at the beginning expected OATIA to assume the leading role. When this premise failed, no alternative strategy appeared other than extending the terms, which as mentioned, does not solve the problem. There are steps that may be taken so that future cases of CSEC may be referred to PANI, and to provide continuity and follow-up after the second phase of the Subregional CSEC project. But there seems to be no integral solution.

5.6. LESSONS LEARNED AND GOOD PRACTICES

Being a final evaluation, extracting the lessons learned and good practices is fundamental for the development of sustainable intervention models that may be replicated in other contexts and experiences. The TBP in Costa Rica has been rich in this aspect too. Below is a summary of the most significant:

- The preparation model of the Second National Plan was conceived as participatory and was based on permanent consultation with technicians who have decision-making power. This mode has been essential to achieve linkages and to generate the need for different sectors to work coordinately.
- The intersectorial collaboration as a practice among institutions that are traditionally isolated in their own interests and objectives has allowed the involved entities to obtain, on the one hand, benefits for the own institutions, and, on the other, a better understanding of the multiple facets of the elimination of CL.

- The communication strategy as a cross-sectional practice in all activities of the TBP, and the raising of awareness and social mobilization as a permanent activity that needs to be developed first of all at the local level where the direct action programs will be implemented
- The decision of choosing well known institutions at the national and regional levels for the implementation of the local experiences, including UCR, the Catholic Church, and FUNDAOSA (because of its relationship with FICOSA) provided initial credibility to the project, "opened doors," and facilitated getting the support of officials from other institutions. It also allowed assuring some continuity.
- Having prioritized a single region for the intervention and developing all the initiatives in this region has proven very useful to generate synergies, integral intervention models, and an important mobilization of the social forces. Specifically, this strategy has generated direct attention models focused on the interinstitutional coordination, bringing all institutions together at the same table and generating greater possibilities of solving the operational and logistic difficulties. It has also improved the possibilities for the outcomes to become visible more quickly.
- The management model promoted by IPEC's local coordination encouraged the collaboration among the implementing agencies, increased their actions and contributed to the project's social recognition as a whole. Having promoted that *"the project in the Brunca Region was one composed of several components with a single objective that required walking together, sharing experiences, human resources, and materials"* (Stakeholders' Workshop) has benefited everyone. The permanent contact of IPEC's coordination will all the technical teams and their periodic meetings allowed taking advantage of the synergies that were detected. An example is the identification of the opportunity to turn the created base committees within the production alternatives component into monitoring groups. This allowed them to organize joint activities with the awareness-raising and social mobilization component. Some families of the victims of CSEC (as part of the components' work) were referred as potential beneficiaries of the loans granted by FUNDESPIA.
- The utilization of existing regional and local interinstitutional spaces for decision making related to the national development and poverty-reduction policies, as well as the permanent presence of representatives of the project at the meetings of the councils related to the Vida Nueva Plan made the process dynamic and increased the interest on the issue by relating it to poverty.

"A very important task of showing that it is possible to take specific actions for the improvement of the quality of life of the poorest in so little time and with so few human resources" (Stakeholders' Workshop)

The technical teams are aware that it is necessary to push these interinstitutional coordination processes to sustain the commitments assumed.

- The creation of the foundations of a community monitoring system of child labor: the monitoring groups belong to the community and this is one of the main achievements of the awareness-raising and mobilization component. Moreover, they are found in almost all the communities in which the project worked. This is also true of the base committees created within the framework of the production alternatives, which should participate in the process to grant loans and also function as monitoring networks. The initiatives related to CODECAN for the attention of the CL and CSEC cases detected are starting. All

of this is part of a network already embedded in the community, that needs to be strengthened and empowered.

- The fact that IPEC's coordination does not work as a supervisor but as a partner in the process of the various AP has generated more productivity at the local level institutions.

6. RECOMMENDATIONS

As a final evaluation, this report aims to emphasise the results of the implementation of the project as well as analysing the reasons for the achievements and changes. These recommendations aim to offer directions on questions related to sustaining the achievements and to experiences that could be replicated in similar situations. The suggestions regarding adjustments in the management of the Project of Support to the Costa Rica TBP are few, since the project is close to finalizing, and there are no anticipated extensions or new phases.

It is clear that it is impossible to affirm that the above mentioned aspects have been incorporated in practice by the institutions or society, since there was no sufficient time for it. The TBP in Costa Rica has been very short. When one is working with an issue considered as natural (like it is child labour) rather than as a problem and the aim is to modify behaviors and the ways in which bureaucratic organizational structures operate, numerous complex processes require several changes and time to be developed and assimilated.

For the transformations in the population and institutions to hold strongly and for the learning to become embedded into practice, it would be necessary to sustain the project for some more time, at least with technical assistance. However, this does not seem to be possible. Therefore, many of the recommendations below aim at looking for possible alternatives for the sustainability and continuity of the national TBP.

The recommendations are geared towards the CDN in general, under the assumption that it is within this instance that the responsibilities of each member institution should be discussed. This would include defining the necessary steps so that the MTSS can concentrate its efforts on the relevant tasks as one of the trustees in the issue.

Regarding awareness-raising

To prevent the issue from getting lost among the multiple social problems the country is facing, it is necessary to keep the dissemination and awareness-raising lines open, both to educate about the problem and to create active awareness about the issue.

Given the importance of the Second National Plan to implement CL policies, it is necessary to create a dissemination strategy. This strategy should be thought of in two senses. On the one hand, bottom-up at the decision-making levels in all contexts and top-down with the population in general and at the schools in particular, to inform them about agreements, goals, and commitments. The dissemination and discussion of the Second Plan in several contexts is a way to generate consensus and make its implementation viable. The dissemination process itself should be subjected to scheduling and preparing specific, clear, simple documents aimed at specific audiences.

As a support strategy for awareness raising, and as incentive for the business sector to hire adolescents between 15 and 18 years who need to work, it is recommended to think about some incentive system to "help" the members of this sector not to elude their responsibility with this age group. In this sense, it is recommended, for instance, to offer tax exemptions if they comply with certain predetermined requirements, or to establish some code of conducts related to CL that allows them to differentiate from their competitors. For instance, after verification of compliance through inspections, they could indicate in their product packaging that they do not use child labor, that they are committed to the

eradication of the WFCL, or that they employ adolescents in accordance with the regulations in place.

On the other hand, and responding to the needs to keep the information up to date, it is recommended to request the authorities of INEC to include the CL module periodically in the EHPM. To do so, it would be necessary to estimate the necessary resources and establish the adequate interval to gather the information.

Regarding policies and legislation

Since the government will change soon, the last tract of the electoral campaign should be used as an opportunity to position the issue among the candidates and their teams, in order to look for their public commitment with this issue and to include it in their campaign. The role of CDN, trade unions, and employers' associations is to lobby as necessary to achieve this. On the other hand, the presence that the issue would acquire in the next few months would be useful to raise awareness among other social actors who are not yet well informed.

In addition, it is suggested to propose a strategy to sustain the budget resources which have started to be allocated in the AOP, and to start delineating the way to incorporate the Ministry of Finance in the CDN and in the corresponding Technical Committee.

Regarding institutional strengthening

To try to institutionalize the issue of CL, it is required to continue the training of base officials for them to be aware and learn about this problem and transmit the information to all the strata of the governmental institutions involved in the eradication of the WFCL. The most effective strategy that may be used is to train trainers among those already committed to be multipliers in their own contexts. In this sense, there is a set of materials and methodologies developed within the framework of the project, including protocols, tools for the educational sector and the labor inspectors that could be transferred by IPEC during the remaining time.

It is indispensable to involve the mid-level employees in the areas not yet reached and those that work at the local delegations.

This strategy should also include the workers of trade unions and employers' organizations who have not yet been made aware. In the latter case, the strategy should focus on their role in the protection of adolescent workers.

A specific aspect of the institutional capacities that should be transferred refers to the access and management of diverse financial sources, what is usually referred to as fund-raising capacity.

Due to the immediate need for the country to assume the responsibilities that IPEC would leave in the short term, it is necessary to identify new donors that can collaborate in the funding of some activities that can give continuity to some of the projects that are being carried out, especially the APs. Especially, these programs require identifying additional funds to sustain the efforts, that are multiple and positive, a little longer. In this sense, the continuity of the CSEC component through the sub-regional project is very positive.

This is why it is recommended to develop a specific action line to look for economic help. The activities could include the identification and permanent updating of a list of national and international organizations that support initiatives

addressed to children and teenagers, in general, and those related to child labor, in particular. Institutions that loan funds or that are willing to finance specific activities and projects should also be identified. Moreover, the organization and development of activities that allow raising funds, such as donations from companies and organizations, should also be undertaken.

Regarding the direct action programs

At the local level, it is recommended to systematize the experience, especially the reflection and evaluation process that allows identifying the success and failure conditions of the integral attention of the withdrawn children. All actors should be part of this systematization as it is very important for the resulting document to reflect the opinions and expectations of all those involved, especially if there is a possibility to replicate these experiences.

It is also recommended to carry out a strategic planning exercise that aims at preparing a gradual withdrawal strategy that takes advantage of the existing collaboration and that aims at empowering the public institutions. This exercise should be done with IPEC, the actors of the implementing agencies, public officials, and representatives of the RMTI in the Brunca Region aiming at identifying priorities for the remaining period. Undoubtedly, the strengthening of the RMTI and its relationship with CODECAN is one of these strategies.

Recommendation for IPEC – how to exit

Taking into account these considerations, the responsible people for the TBP in IPEC should do a strategic planning exercise with the Technical Committee of the CDN to transfer their role of support, technical assistance, and “engine” of activities. They should share the outcomes and recommendations of the evaluation and based on this, they should build together the continuity strategy, thus establishing responsibilities, time frames, and necessary resources.

On the other hand, and more specifically, the meeting planned for January¹⁵ with representatives of the mass media could be used as a starting point for the issue to continue in the agenda. The meeting is aimed at appraising the realized efforts and identify what is missing and what needs to be done in the short-, medium-, and long-term regarding social communication. In this sense, it is suggested to also invite the technical liaisons of the Technical Committee of CDN. Together and after the presentation of outcomes, they can work on the strategies to continue the effort, on the identification of diverse actors that could take charge of new awareness-raising campaigns; on strategies to differentiate the prohibition of CL from the protection of adolescents’ work; on the follow-up of the enforcement of the Hazardous Job Act; on the creation of a work plan with assigned responsibilities; and other issues that could contribute to keep CL and CSEC in the public agenda.

Finally, given the imminent mobilization of some of the OATIA technicians to the capital provinces, it is recommended to insist on reorienting their intervention strategies. It would also be necessary that these people assumed the direct action interventions so that they can gradually assume a role of consultancy, collaboration, and promotion of coordination and evaluation networks; in other words, they can assume a multiplying and empowerment role for interventions on CL made by other organizations. This reorientation would contribute to expanding the coverage reached so far. It is also recommended to retake some of the issues proposed in the Institutional Evaluation of OATIA done in 2003.

¹⁵ Meeting planned by the social communication area of the Sub-regional Office, as proposed during the interview with the evaluator

7. BIBLIOGRAPHY

Convenios 138 Sobre la edad mínima – Conferencia General de la OIT -1973

Convenio 182 Sobre las PFTI – Conferencia General de la OIT - 1999

ILO/IPEC: Guide Book II: Time-Bound Programmes for Eliminating the Worst Forms of Child Labour. An Introduction

ILO/IPEC Guidelines: Strategic Programme Impact Framework, First Version, May 2002, Prepared by the Design, Evaluation & Documentation (DED) Section of IPEC

Nirenberg O., Brawerman J. y Ruiz V.: Evaluar para la Transformación. Paidós. Buenos Aires. 2000

Nirenberg O., Brawerman J. y Ruiz V.: Programación y evaluación de proyectos sociales. Paidós. Buenos Aires. 2003

Documentation Consulted

- Buenas prácticas de la organización sindical para el desarrollo de políticas contra el trabajo infantil y la protección de la niñez y de la adolescencia. Proyecto Soletico, Red de monitoreo del TI, CMTC
- Código de Niñez y adolescencia de Costa Rica
- Manifiesto contra el trabajo infantil y por la eliminación inmediata de sus peores formas en Costa Rica del 25 de abril del 2003
- Manual de formación para inspectores de trabajo para contribuir a la prevención y erradicación del TI y protección del trabajador adolescente – 2005
- Manual de reflexión y la acción para erradicar el TI – Manual para formadores, OIT-IPEC - 2004
- Manual para periodistas – Cómo informar sobre trabajo infantil desde la ética profesional, OIT-IPEC, 2003¿Qué puedo hacer para combatir la explotación sexual comercial? – Guía de información básica y Carpeta de apoyo para la capacitación, OIT-IPEC, 2005
- Paso a paso - Ejemplos de cómo los países determinan TI peligroso OIT – IPEC , Volumen 1
- Pasos para eliminar el TI peligroso OIT – IPEC , Sugerencias para lograrlo
- Percepciones adolescentes sobre trabajos peligrosos: consulta nacional para su identificación, OIT-IPEC 2003
- Propuesta sobre el tema “Niñez, adolescencia y juventud” aprobado en el V Congreso Nacional de la CMTC, 2002
- Proyecto Formación para la Vida y el Estudio, Región Brunca - 2005
- Sistematización del Programa de Duración Determinada de Costa Rica – Informe Preliminar - 2005
- 2º Plan Nacional de Acción – CDN – 2005-2010
- Viaje al planeta de las cosas perdidas. Guía metodológica para maestros ¿Para contribuir con la erradicación del TI 2003, 2005-10-11
- Viaje al planeta de las cosas perdidas. Guía para estudiantes ¿Para contribuir con la erradicación del TI 2003, 2005-10-11

ANNEXES

Interviews held during the fieldwork:

1. Allen María Marta - PANI
 2. Antezana, Paula – Consultant hired to deal with legislation and systematization issues of the TBP
 3. Barrientos, Milena – Local coordinator of the TBP for IPEC
 4. Brealey, Ana Mercedes – Consultant hired for the formulation of the Second National Plan
 5. Claramunt, María Cecilia – CSEC Consultant, UCR
 6. Dorado Castro, Ingrid – Administrator of IPEC Sub-regional Office
 7. Esna, Tyrone - RERUN NOVARUM Union
 8. Godínez, Alexander – Consultant for the preparation of protocols
 9. Len, Italy – Head Municipality of Corredores
 10. Maxera, Rita Advisor, Legislative Assembly
 11. Monge, Jhonatan - CMTC Union
 12. Padilla, Aura – Curriculum Department, MEP
 13. Pignataro, Eugenio - UCCAEP
 14. Pinto. Alely – Consultant, communication area, IPEC Sub-regional Office
 15. Quiñónez, Alberto – TBP Technical Assistant
 16. Rodríguez, María Luisa - TBP Coordinator
 17. Sánchez, Esmirna – Head of OATIA
 18. Trejos, Fernando – Minister of Labor
 19. Umaña, Alexandra – GATIA officer
 20. Varela, Javier – Officer institutional strengthening at IPEC Sub-regional Office
 21. Víquez, Sara – MIDEPLAN
-
22. Meeting with the technicians and professionals involved in the various components of the Brunca Region project
 23. Meeting with adolescents of Puerto Jiménez

PARTICIPANTS IN THE STAKEHOLDERS' WORKSHOP

1. Allen, María Marta	PANI
2. Alegría, Kathia	FUNDAOSA
3. Arias, Dionisio	FUNDAOSA
4. Jiménez, Virginia	CARITAS
5. Barrientos, Milena	IPEC
6. Begueri, Marita	INEC
7. Edgerton, Lilly	Embajada de Canadá
8. Labelle, Chantal	ACDI
9. Zamora, Rafael	MIDEPLAN
10. Josip, Margetic	IPEC
11. Hernández, Eugenia	IPEC
12. Arce, Laura	MEP
13. San Millán, Tatiana	IPEC
14. Gómez, Omar	MEP
15. Murillo, Jenny	MTSS
16. Sanchez, Esmirna	MTSS – OATIA
17. Umaña, Alexandra	MTSS – OATIA
18. Morera, Georgina	UCR
19. Elizondo, Virginia	IPEC
20. Vega, Lilliana	Rerum Novarum
21. Quiñónez, Alberto	IPEC
22. Abustini Marselli, B	IMAS
23. Méndez B, Rosibel	MS
24. Dema, Guillermo	IPEC
25. Vargas, Jeremías	MTSS
26. Peter, Nicole	IPEC
27. Maxera, Rita	Asamblea Legislativa
28. Hidalgo, Adrians	IPEC
29. Astorga, Rigoberto	IPEC
30. Martinez, Manuel	Escuela Psicología, UCR
31. Pinto, Alely	IPEC
32. Vazquez, Margarita	IMAS
33. Espinoza, Anabelle	CARITAS

Opening of the Workshop by:

Jeremías Vargas, Vice minister of Work and Social Security
Mario Lagüe, Canada Ambassador
Miguel del Cid, Associate Director of the SRO of the ILO