



International Programme on the Elimination of Child Labour (IPEC)



International  
Labour  
Office

## ***IPEC Evaluation***

### **Skills Training Strategies to Combat WFCL in Urban Informal Sector in Sub-Saharan Anglophone Africa**

**RAF/04/P50/CAN**

**P. 340.04.100.050**

**An independent final evaluation by a team of external consultants**

**Ghana, Kenya and Tanzania**

October 2007

**This document has not been professionally edited.**

## **NOTE ON THE EVALUATION PROCESS AND REPORT**

This independent evaluation was managed by ILO-IPEC's Design, Evaluation and Documentation Section (DED) following a consultative and participatory approach. DED has ensured that all major stakeholders were consulted and informed throughout the evaluation and that the evaluation was carried out to highest degree of credibility and independence and in line with established evaluation standards.

The evaluation was carried out a team of external consultants<sup>1</sup>. The field mission took place in October 2007. The opinions and recommendations included in this report are those of the authors and as such serve as an important contribution to learning and planning without necessarily constituting the perspective of the ILO or any other organization involved in the project.

---

<sup>1</sup> **Dominic Pealore**

**National reports for Ghana: Dominic Pealore**

**Kenya: Charles Kiura**

**Tanzania: Winnie Bashagi**

## **TABLE OF CONTENTS**

Executive Summary .....	1
1.0 INTRODUCTION .....	7
1.1 Background .....	7
1.2 The Objectives of the Project .....	8
2.0 EVALUATION OBJECTIVES.....	8
3.0 EVALUATION METHODOLOGY.....	9
4.0 LIMITATION OF STUDY .....	9
5.0 THE CONTEXT OF CHILD LABOUR IN THE THREE PROJECT COUNTRIES.....	10
5.1 The Ghana Situation .....	10
5.2 The Tanzania Situation. ....	11
5.3 The Kenya Situation. ....	12
6.0 FINDINGS OF THE EVALUATION .....	13
6.1 Main Findings on Project Design .....	13
6.2 Relevance of Project Objectives and Strategy.....	15
6.3 Relevance of project to National Policies and Programmes .....	16
7.0 Main Findings on the Quality of Project Performance and the Achievements.....	17
7.1 Achievements of project in relation to the objectives and indicators .....	17
7.2 Gender Mainstreaming.....	24
7.3 Project contribution to capacity building .....	24
7.4 Project contribution to networking awareness raising, linkages with other child labour interventions.....	25
7.5 Effectiveness And Efficiency of project implementation .....	26
7.6 Management issues and institutional set up .....	27
7.7 Stakeholder involvement.....	28
7.8 Organisational implementation capacity.....	28
7.9 Usefulness of the Strategic Planning Impact Framework, planning workshops, and Interventions.....	28
8.0 Challenges.....	29
9.0 Sustainability. ....	30
10.0 Lessons Learnt.....	31
11.0 Identified Potential Good Practices .....	32
12. Conclusions.....	33
13. Recommendations .....	34

## **Executive Summary**

The skills training strategies to combat worst forms of child labour (WFCL) in the urban informal sector in the sub-Saharan Anglophone Africa project was implemented in Ghana, Kenya and Tanzania as part of the ILO / IPEC support to the National Plan of Action on Elimination of child labour.

The project aimed at addressing child labour concerns through direct actions, policy dialogue, capacity building and awareness and sensitization of different stakeholders. It also complements the ILO / IPEC programme of support to the Time Bound Programme in the three countries.

### **Project Design**

The project design was successful in linking the problem with the objectives as well as the strategy adopted. Stakeholders noted that the resource allocations were inadequate with the budget lines such as the trainer's fee falling below the market rates. The project is also in line with governments' development plans and interventions in the three countries such as Poverty Reduction Strategies.

### **Implementation Process**

The project was successfully implemented due primarily to the capacity building of the Implementing Partners / Agencies. Most of them implemented their Action Programmes effectively. However there were delays in implementing few activities either as a result of staff turnover (resignation of coordinator in Ghana and delay in appointing a coordinator for Tanzania) or delays in submission of financial reports.

In sum, the project targets were however achieved. In Kenya, 137 children were reached, in Ghana, 109 children and in Tanzania, 158 children were rehabilitated – 107 withdrawn and 51 – prevented. These enrolment figures in the 3 countries exceeded the targets in the project design. This was as a result of efficiencies in utilisation of project resources.

### **Quality of Project performance and achievements**

Under the project training component, manuals for the informal sector and youth business clinic manuals were revised in Kenya. In Ghana, training manuals were developed but not put into action because of delays. Gender tools and gender documentaries were also developed. In Tanzania, awareness raising and training workshops were conducted in all districts. Cultural behavioural change and advocacy materials were developed and disseminated. Gender was also mainstreamed in the project design and implementation.

### **Lessons Learnt**

This evaluation notes that the skills training project provided a learning opportunity for the stakeholders. Some of the most significant lessons drawn from this project include:

#### **Identification of Children**

- Identifying the children using community committees and locating and talking to them at their resting places was very useful as it allowed their maximum attention to listen to you.

### **Training**

- Training of artisan service providers in handling child labourers was very useful in preparing them for the training. The informal sector is a strong engine in the elimination of child labour. There are many child labourers in this sector and the artisans are important entry points in the urban communities in combating child labour.
- Skills training leads to decent work through gainful employment or self employment. Post training is required to nurture the young graduates less than 18 years to prevent them from going back to WFCL.

### **Funding**

- The amount of money for the project activities related to the training and placement is inadequate. However, it is clear from the project that limited resources can get children out of child labour through the informal sector.
- Provision of health care for trainees should be taken into consideration to ensure that their health care needs are guaranteed during training. Trainees who fell sick during the training needed to be attended to.

### **Policy environment and other support**

- The Project is relevant and could be replicated but cultural sensitivity must be taken into consideration. Strategies must respond to the local needs of participants.
- Networking with specialized government/ non governmental agencies to provide support was very necessary in counseling and providing diverse support to the project. Effective coordination of all interventions taking place at local level is important because it maximizes resources mobilization, minimizes overlapping and avoids duplication of interventions. Multisectoral child protection committee at national, regional and district levels leads to effective implementation of existing policies that promote children rights.
- Gender awareness and mobilization can change attitude of community, employers and girls towards girls entering male dominate trades.
- The use of participatory approaches in the whole project cycle i.e. from project design, implementation to evaluation has helped to increase ownership and commitment to the project

### **Identified Potential Good Practices**

These are practices that have contributed to the efficiency and effectiveness in project implementation. They are good because, either in full or in part they have contributed to the success of this project. The rationale for documenting good practices is that, it helps to improve future interventions, mainstreaming it in policy, interventions and replication in other projects. Good Practices identified in a project promotes sustainability of the project.

1. Establishment of a counseling centre in Ghana where the children meet every fortnight to share ideas, and experiences, learn about adolescent reproductive, rights and responsibilities of children, social harassment issues etc was very effective. Expert counselors are invited to teach the children. The centre has also given visibility for the project in the community which attracts people to learn about the project. This development has created a good image for the programme.
2. Monthly socialization exchange programmes/study visits by trainees to their peers at other locations/sites helped to reinforce and sustain their interest in training. Each trainee was made to tell his or her stories to enable others to learn from it.

3. The use of professional counselors in specialized agencies to counsel the children to accept to withdraw and undergo training was highly rated. A considerable amount of time was needed to counsel the children to prepare them for the training. Counseling should continue throughout the training.
4. Training of artisan service providers in handling child labourers was very useful in preparing them for the training. The identification and training should be preceded by the withdrawal of children and who will have selected specific trade areas. This will enable the right artisans to be selected for the project. Further the development and use of curriculum for the training was useful because it will facilitate effective and efficient training.
5. Networking with specialized government/ non governmental agencies made significant contributions in counseling and diverse support to the project. Effective coordination of all interventions taking place at local level is important because it maximizes resources mobilization, minimizes overlapping and avoids duplication of intervention. Multisectoral child protection committee at national, regional and district levels lead to effective implementation of existing policies that promote children's rights.
6. The involvement of community based artisan training service providers was very useful because it was based on the use of local resources in the training which helped keep the trainees in their localities.
7. A good targeting and selection strategy was the identification of beneficiaries through referrals by members of the community and community based organisations. The strategy ensured that the community had an opportunity to identify the most needy and vulnerable in society.
8. Giving withdrawn children an opportunity to choose the vocational skills they want to acquire ensured that, the courses offered under the skills training project were demand driven rather than supply driven. This helped to sustain the interest of the trainees in the project and to complete the training.
9. Keeping records on the performance of each trainee helped in monitoring the progress of the training as well as the specific needs of each trainee. This enabled specific solutions to be found for individual problems.

## **Conclusions**

### **Relevance:**

The problem of child labour was adequately analysed to determine the magnitude before the project was designed. The Project is relevant and in line with the poverty reduction strategies of the three countries. The issue of child labour elimination is a felt need in the project countries and there exists high awareness in the project countries on the objectives and usefulness and relevance of the project. The project is relevant to the national policies and programmes, to the children and their families and addressed the issue of poverty as one of the main factors causing child labour. The project therefore enjoys support from Government, Social Partners, NGOs and CSOs, Implementing Partners, Artisans, and beneficiary parents and children who agreed on the concepts and the methodology for implementation. The project addresses the issue of child labour, supports and complements past and existing child labour initiatives in Ghana, Kenya and Tanzania. It is both a preventive and curative intervention in eliminating the WFCL.

The set objectives were viable solutions to the identified problems. In addition the indicators set were useful in measuring progress in the project. However, the financial resources allocated were inadequate. The overall approach in this project was correct taking cognisance of the need to build capacity of all stakeholders. The assumptions stated in the log frame were also valid. Skills training and employment for

withdrawn children very useful because it provides them with life long skills, which will create a better future for them and their children, breaking the vicious cycle of child labour and poverty. Gender was well mainstreamed in the implementation

#### Project Implementation and achievements:

The results of the evaluation indicated that, a total of 404 children were withdrawn (Compared to the target of 400) and were either trained or still undergoing training in various vocational skills. Out of the total 218 are boys and 186 girls. A total number of 11 drop outs was recorded in Ghana. The project also prevented 122 as against 250 as the target in Ghana and Tanzania. In total, 52 girls were trained in male dominated trade areas and 20 boys trained in female dominated trade areas. This shows that, the gender strategy has been very useful and efforts should be intensified to maintain the gender mainstreaming in vocational skills training.

The project has resulted in increased awareness on child labour issues as well as capacity building of stakeholders who participated in the project.

The strategy of using informal sector master artisan training service providers was very appropriate and meets the aspiration of stakeholders. Though the implementation period is too short, the objectives are being achieved.

A major problem which has to be addressed is the provision of adequate resources to meet the trainees' requirements and their start up capital. Adequate local resource mobilization which is very crucial for the project was also lacking. Strategies to enhance the economic status of parents to support their children were also lacking. In spite of all these shortcomings, some potential good practices have been identified in project implementation.

At the stakeholders' workshop, it was agreed that the project be extended beyond the planned ending date of December 2007. The design should take into consideration extension to the district level.

The project has been effective. It has provided the children with training in skills of their desirable trades and life skills leading to a sense of purpose in their existence, self assertion and self confidence. The project also enhanced creativity, networking and cooperation among children. These are crucial for children who are being prepared to take on their youth and adult roles. This allowed exchange and sharing ideas that resulted in enhancing implementation. The project supported and complimented the TBP and acted as a bridge between child labour and youth employment.

Gender was well mainstreamed in the project design and implementation This has stimulated a change in attitude towards girls entering the traditional male dominated trades thus increasing girls employment opportunities and reducing discrimination of girls at work in certain trades.

The project has also contributed to the development of a sound knowledge base and generic tools on combating the worst forms of child labour. A lot of information has been documented under this project and in addition the artisans were also trained on pedagogical training modules.

Finally this evaluation concludes that this project was a lesson to many, including the ILO/IPEC. Potential good practices were also identified.

## Recommendations

1. The evaluation found in the three countries that all stakeholders agreed that, the project is very relevant to address the needs of the countries, and it supports the poverty reduction strategies as well as youth development and employment policies of these countries. It will therefore be very useful to extend and expand the project beyond the planned end date of December 2007. It is worth considering the implementation as a programme, not a project which will be much more sustainable. This will call for the leadership of the Ministries responsible for labour, youth and employment and mainstreaming implementation into the development plans of participating countries. The development of implementation action plans could be done in collaboration with local authorities to enhance ownership. This will enhance local/community level empowerment and ownership. Demand driven skills training should be promoted.
2. In the design of the expansion phase, cultural sensitivity must be taken into consideration. Local involvement in the design of the next phase of the project should be enhanced to ensure that the strategies respond to the local needs of participants. The length of the training should be determined by the trade skills being pursued by the trainees.
3. The resources provided for the training were adequate to cover basic training in the selected trades but not enough to support the transition from training to employment/ self employment. The project provided funds for payment of training fees, stipend for transport and feeding. Though this is good, it is not sufficient. It is therefore recommended that, other strategies like the economic empowerment of parents and mobilisation of local resources to support the programme be taken into consideration in expanding the project. This may include linking parents to micro financial service providers to access support to improve upon their economic circumstances and thereby support their children.
4. It is also worth considering the implementing project in the rural areas from where the youth migrate as another alternative. The justification is that most of the child labourers migrate from the rural areas. The implementation of the project in the rural areas will be a preventive measure which will also be cheaper and cost effective. Transportation costs, accommodation costs for trainees will be avoided.
5. The initial funding for the expansion could come from the development partners (ILO). Funding should be phased such that, the local authorities would contribute a percentage from their budget from the start, as sign of commitment. The quantum should progressively increase such that, by the end of the project, the local authorities assume full responsibility for funding to enhance ownership.
6. The roles of the National Steering Committees and the Core Technical Committee should be reconsidered. The NSC should be reactivated, their capacity should be built, and regular meetings should be held, and their involvement in the monitoring and evaluation of project should be enhanced.
7. To ensure marketability of trainees, arrangements should be made with well established firms to absorb them to polish up their skills.



8. Identification and training of artisan training service providers should be preceded by the withdrawal of children and identifying trade areas. This will ensure that, only needed artisans are selected and trained. The artisans should be well trained in the use of curriculum for training which should become a culture in informal apprenticeship training.
9. The identified good practices in this pilot should be incorporated into the design.
10. The Gender tool developed should be incorporated in the design of the expanded programme.
11. The age of children withdrawn as well as the length of training for vocational skills training should be taken into consideration before placement to ensure that on completion the child will be in the legal age for employment.
12. Provision of health care for trainees should be taken into consideration to ensure that their health care needs are met during training. Trainees who fell sick during the training needed to be attended to.
13. Networking with specialized government/ non governmental agencies to provide support was very useful in counseling and diverse support to the project. Effective coordination of all interventions taking place at local level is important because it maximizes resources mobilization, minimizes overlapping and avoids duplication of interventions.
14. To avoid the gaps in the training time table, the training programmes that require trainees to sit the grade tests, should be planned in such way that they match the programme of the grade tests administrators. This will avoid the time-gaps witnessed in this project, where trainees finished their courses three months before the grade tests.
15. There is need for this project to develop a tracking system for children who have been withdrawn and prevented from child labour through the skills training project. This is the only sure way to establish whether the initiative is paying off or not in terms of the impact. Tracer studies should therefore be conducted periodically by the responsible Ministry.

# 1. INTRODUCTION

## 1.1 *Background*

The International Labour Organisation (ILO) and the International Programme on the Elimination of Child Labour (IPEC) have developed a technical cooperation programme to progressively eliminate child labour, especially its worst forms. IPEC's action is based on a government's commitment and political will to address child labour, in cooperation with employers' and workers' organisations, and other relevant parties in society. Support by IPEC at the country level is based on a phased, multi-sectoral strategy. The strategy includes strengthening national capacities to deal with this issue, through legislation harmonization, improvement of the knowledge base, raising awareness on the negative consequences of child labour, promoting social mobilisation against it, and implementing demonstrative direct Action Programmes (AP) to prevent children from child labour and to remove child workers from hazardous work and provide them and their families with appropriate alternatives.

The rapid growth in sub-Saharan Africa's urban population has contributed to growth in urban poverty and the higher incidence of child labour including its worst forms. Given that the majority of migrants from the rural to urban areas have little or no education, they tend to have limited opportunities for gainful employment. They also tend to engage in informal economy activities with low returns and high job insecurity, which traps them in poverty and/or makes them vulnerable to exploitation, economic shock, food insecurity and diseases. However, the informal sector also provides potential possibilities for young people to learn skills and increase their income-earning opportunities. Governments have come to realise that, the informal sector will be a permanent and highly significant element in their national economies and most of them have therefore engaged in strongly supportive policies towards the informal economy within their poverty reduction strategies. In spite of this new interest, the sector is constrained with many obstacles including the lack of capital, poor infrastructure, absence of sources of credit, and many others including operating in hazardous or risk environment in many of the informal economy activities in the three countries.

According to the most recent studies, in the three participating countries in this project, Ghana, Kenya and Tanzania it was estimated that 40% of all children in Ghana are engaged in some form of economic activity including the worst forms of child labour; in Tanzania, nearly 40% of all children aged between 5 and 17 are working children; and, in Kenya, these figures are slightly less with just over 17% in Kenya. Studies on economic activities of children in the informal economy in the region also show that, they commonly contribute about 20 to 25% to household budget.

As a follow up to the studies, a Technical and Vocational Skills Training Project was initiated to combat the Worst Forms of Child Labour (WFCL) in Ghana and other 3 Anglophone African countries. The Project involved developing effective strategies for preventing worst forms of child labour, withdrawing and rehabilitating young children engaged in the urban informal economy and protecting older children above the minimum working age from hazardous working conditions and exploitation.

Prior to this project, a number of initiatives were implemented in these countries aimed at addressing the issue of child labour. These include Capacity Building Programme, Time Bound Programme, Education

programme in Kenya and Tanzania, and LUTRENA- a programme on trafficking and Cocoa and Commercial Agricultural project in Ghana.

## **1.2 The Objectives of the Project**

The Development objective is to reduce the incidence of child labour in the urban informal economy in the participating countries through non-formal low-cost skills training and ensuring access to facilitating services to decent(self) employment.

**Immediate objective 1:** By the end of the project, global poverty reduction strategies and sector policies in each of the participating countries in the field of Technical and Vocational Education and Training (TVET) will include provisions to ensure access of children working in the urban informal economy to the planned services, in the fields of technical and vocational education and training.

**Immediate objective 2:** By the end of the project, at least 400 working children in the urban informal economy will be withdrawn from worst forms of child labour through non-formal low-cost skills training appropriate to their age. In addition, 250 children will be withdrawn from entering into worst forms of child labour in the urban informal economy through these same services.

**Immediate Objective 3:** By the end of the project, a sound knowledge-base and generic tools on combating worst forms of child labour through non-formal low-cost skills training will have been developed.

In order to reach these objectives, the project activities focus on the following components:

- Policy support
- Direct targeted action with working children and their environment
- Education and skills training
- Capacity building
- Building a knowledge base on combating the WFCL through non-formal low-cost skills

## **2. EVALUATION OBJECTIVES**

The primary purpose of this evaluation is to assess the overall achievement of the Objectives of the Project at the Policy level, Organizational (partner)level, beneficiaries, community and household levels. The evaluation should also assess the cost-effectiveness and relevance of the project, assess the operational/implementation and management efficiency at both IPEC and Implementing Agency level, analyse model of interventions used and document lessons learnt and potential good practices.

The evaluation is also expected to examine the possibility and desirability of extending the project activities beyond the planned ending date in December 2007, examine the form the extension will take and provide recommendations.

### **3. EVALUATION METHODOLOGY**

The evaluation adopted a participatory and consultative approach for data collection by employing a combination of the following:

The first activity was a preparatory desk review through the analysis of relevant project documents such as project formulation document, progress reports, policy documents, implementing agency progress reports, status reports as well as evaluation reports of earlier national child labour programmes in the three countries. This activity enabled the consultant to develop an interview guide/questionnaire for data collection.

The second series of activities were interviews with key stakeholders including, Project Coordinators, ILO/ IPEC project staff, Implementing Agencies and beneficiary children and their parents and artisan trainers. Field visits and focus group discussions as well as individual interviews with beneficiaries were also carried out. Withdrawn children under training and their trainers were also visited and interviewed.

Interviews were also held with government officials, Social Partners (Employers Associations and Workers Associations) and other stakeholders to examine their opinion on the implementation of the project. The perspective of stakeholders was also examined on the planning process adopted in the project preparation and implementation.

The views of all categories were triangulated to enable more accurate conclusions to be drawn on the various issues under consideration in the evaluation.

National stakeholder validation workshops were held in the three project countries to discuss and validate the draft evaluation reports and conclusions reached used to finalise the draft reports.

The methodology called for country reports to be drawn up by national consultants. One of the consultants was designated team leader and has the responsibility of developing the present synthesis report based on the national reports.

After the evaluation exercise in the three countries, the three country reports were then synthesised into this report.

### **4. LIMITATION OF STUDY**

As a result of the limited time allotted for the assignment, it was not possible for the consultant to visit Kenya and Tanzania to facilitate the evaluation and the workshops. Besides, the visits to Kenya and Tanzania were not part of the terms of reference of the Team leader. This report is therefore based on the evaluation reports sent by the consultants in these countries.

## **5. THE CONTEXT OF CHILD LABOUR IN THE THREE PROJECT COUNTRIES.**

As indicated in the background, the project is being implemented in the three countries by ILO/IPEC as a result of a survey that was carried out. The problem of child labour has also been identified in the survey in the three countries where child labour elimination interventions are being implemented. All three countries have implemented the Capacity Building Programme, and currently implementing the Time Bound Programme. The three countries are also currently participating in the Poverty Reduction Strategy Paper (PSRP) process (a global policy framework) launched by the International Monetary Fund (IMF) and the World Bank. Addressing child labour issues forms an integral part of this strategy.

### **5.1 *The Ghana Situation***

Ghana's labour laws and regulations prohibit child labour, putting the minimum age for employment at 15 years. The 1992 Ghanaian Constitution guarantees the child protection from engaging in any work that is considered injurious to his or her health, education and development. In December 1998, the Government enacted a comprehensive Children's Act which seeks to protect the rights of children, including the right to education, health and shelter. Ghana ratified the ILO Worst Forms of Child Labour Convention, 1999 (No. 182) in 2000. The ratification called for immediate, effective, time-bound measures and a programme of action to progressively eliminate all forms of Child Labour. Ghana has also ratified the OAU Charter on the Rights of the Child.

According to the 2001 Ghana Child Labour Survey (GCLS), 2.47 million Ghanaian children aged 5 – 17 years (nearly 40 % of the age group) were economically active, with about 1.27 million in activities classified as child labour. Large numbers of children are in activities regarded as WFCL, including child domestic work, fishing, head porters, commercial sexual exploitation, customary or ritual servitude, small-scale mining and quarrying, and commercial agriculture. Significant numbers are found in the urban informal economy, in transportation, traditional restaurants, begging and, especially, petty trading, with street children becoming an increasingly visible phenomenon in the main cities. The GCLS estimated that more than 242,000 children are engaged in hazardous child labour. The number of child labourers aged below 13 is estimated at 1,031,220.

The Government of Ghana ILO collaboration on child labour dates back to 2000 when a Memorandum of Understanding (MOU) was signed. This was followed by the formation of a National Steering Committee on child labour chaired by the Ministry of Manpower, Youth and Employment (MMYE). A Child Labour Unit was also established in the Department of Labour in the MMYE. Workers, employers and civil society organisations formed a coalition on the elimination of child labour.

A collaborative effort among stakeholders including, Ministry of Manpower, Youth and Employment, the National Development Planning Commission, Ministry of Women and Children Affairs, the Trade Unions Congress, the Ghana Employers' Association and Civil Society Organisations and development partners targeted at eliminating child labour resulted in to a number of actions. These actions are targeted at prioritised areas for action such as: Fishing, quarrying and small-scale mining (galamsey), commercial agriculture, head porters, child prostitution, child trafficking, child domestic servitude, ritual servitude (trokosi).

At the policy level, the Growth and Poverty Reduction Strategy (GPRS) II has integrated Child Labour issues into the Government development agenda. In the GPRS, Child Labour has been identified as a major problem of vulnerability and exclusion; Awareness raising on children's rights, enforcement of laws; Prosecution of Child Trafficking offences, tackling commercial sexual exploitation; and the design of ILO/ IPEC programmes to address child labour in Ghana.

The Ministry of Manpower, Youth and Employment has also developed and is currently implementing a National Cocoa Child Labour Elimination Programme as a follow up to the WACAP.

A National Plan of Action is also being developed under the TBP.

## **5.2 The Tanzania Situation.**

Tanzania ratified ILO conventions along with recommendation No 190 in 1978 and 2003. Tanzania ratified numerous international conventions including the Child labour conventions number 182 on the Worst Forms of Child Labour of 1999 and ILO minimum age convention number 138 of 1973.

The integrated labour force and Child labour survey in Tanzania presented the general status of child labour in Tanzania as follows:

- 43.1 % of children age 5-7 years do not attend school and the majority of these children are in rural areas.
- 39.6 % of children aged 5-17 years are economically active, most of them are in rural areas.
- 79.9 percent of the working children are agriculture, forest and fishing sector and
- 34 percent of working children aged 5-17 years work for more than 30 hours per week while 22.4 percent work for more than 40 hours per week.

Between 2000 and 2004 the International Programme on Elimination of Child Labour (IPEC) commissioned a variety of studies in Tanzania to assess the nature and extent of child labour. The findings from these studies revealed that 4.1 million out of the estimated 10.2 million children aged between 5 and 14 years were attending school (ILO/URT.2001). Nearly 4 million out the latter number were engaged in economic earning activities or housekeeping. The studies also revealed that only 40% of the children aged 5 to 9 years were attending school. For the age 10 to 14 years and 15 to 17 years the corresponding figures were 78 and 59 respectively. In total, 58% of the estimated 12.4 million children aged 5 to 17 years were at school at the same time, 53% of the 7.3 million school children aged 5 to 17 years were involved in economic activities whilst 48% of working children were enrolled in school. This implies that working and schooling at the same time can have serious negative consequences on children performance in school.

These studies showed that child labour was common in the informal sector, domestic household's economy, small holder peasant agricultural farming as well as in commercial plantations/ estate farming. It was also present in stone quarrying, small scale mining, and fishing and also in construction industry. There are also studies that confirm the existence of children, particularly young girls involved in commercial sex work. It is increasingly becoming evident that child labour is rampant in Tanzania and has reached alarming proportions.

To address the issue of child labour, in 2000 the Government of Tanzania devoted itself to eliminate the worst forms of Child labour through a ten year programme of action. ILO-IPEC supplement these efforts through various interventions, among which were: the Time Bound programme, Capacity building programme and the skill training programme. Links have also been made with other national interventions on poverty reduction and education expansion. Numerous actors are also involved in the drive to extract children from the worst forms of child labour. A child labour unit was also created in the ministry of Labour and Youth Development to address child labour in Tanzania.

The Ministry of Labor, Youth Development, and Sports has primary responsibility for enforcing the country's child labour laws. The Ministry's Child Labour Unit works with other government ministries and networks with other stakeholders.

The Government of Tanzania is working with ILO's International Program on the elimination of Child Labor (IPEC) to implement a Time bound Program (TBP), with the goal of eliminating the worst forms of child labor in the country by 2010, including exploitative child labor in commercial agriculture, domestic service, mining, fishing, and prostitution.

The Government of Tanzania's Poverty Reduction Strategy Paper (PRSP) includes the elimination of child labor as an objective and established the Poverty Monitoring Master Plan (PMMP) The National Strategies for Growth and Poverty Reduction includes specific references to elimination of the worst forms of child labor and the provision of skills training and educational alternatives for children and their families.

Tanzania's Development Vision 2025 and its Poverty Eradication Strategy 2015 both identify education as a strategy for combating poverty and the country's poverty eradication agenda includes ensuring that, all children have the right to basic quality education. The Government of Tanzania receives funding from the World Bank and other donors under the Education for All Fast Track Initiative, which aims to provide all children with a primary school education by the year 2015.

### **5.3 The Kenya Situation.**

An integrated Labour Force Survey report published in 2001 by the central bureau of statistics in Kenya shows that, there were 1.9 million working children aged 5 to 17 years, 51.8% of whom were boys and 48.2% were girls. In terms of age distribution, 43.6% were in the 10-14 years age cohort, 30.1% in 15-17 years cohort and the remaining 26.3% were below age 10. A total of 76.8 % of the working children had attained primary school education, 3.2% secondary education and 12.7% had no formal education. Of the children who have reported to be working, 79% were unpaid family labourers, 19.4% were working for pay and 1.6% were running own businesses. The survey indicated that, approximately 1.3 million children were out of school and part of child labourers in Kenya. In terms of the sector of work, 34% were engaged in commercial agriculture and fisheries, 23.6% were engaged in subsistence agriculture and fisheries, and 17.9% in domestic and related activities. Other sectors employed the remaining 24.5%. Poverty, socio-cultural and economic factors as in many other countries remains the major causes of child labour in Kenya.

In Kenya, child labour persists despite numerous efforts by government, development partners and civil society organization (Kiura, 2006). The problem is further exacerbated by lack of comprehensive and accurate data which would assist in designing viable interventions. The government has however

developed various policies that have strong bearing on child labour. These include the Child Labour Policy, Children's Act, Employment Act, Micro and Small Enterprises Bill, National Youth Policy and National Policy on Orphans and Vulnerable Children. In its development plans (Poverty Reduction Strategy Papers (PRSP), Economic Recovery Strategy Paper for Wealth and Employment Creation (ERSPWE), National Development Plans, fiscal plans and budgets etc, all look at the needs of children but from a wider perspective. Other sectoral plans and various government commissioned reports on education, free primary education policy and Kenya education sector support programme attempt to address the plight of children more closely. However actions stemming from these government initiatives have been slow and inefficient and insufficient.

Other development partners have similarly been in the fore front, this time addressing more action oriented and direct programmes to address issues on child labour. Actions by these organisations have included awareness creation, lobbying for better policies, withdrawing and preventing children from child labour and social mobilisation against child labour and its worst forms. The players have also been instrumental in adding to the level of knowledge on child labour through various empirical investigations

Kulundu (2006), writing a review of legal framework and policies that have a bearing on skills training for working children notes that a free primary education policy only benefits children in the formal schools, nor does it support skills training. Children in informal schools such as the Non-formal education centres were left out, yet they are in almost all cases, the poor and the ones likely to be involved in or likely to fall in child labour. It is noted that the non formal education centres play a crucial role in education and skills training of such vulnerable children, while contributing immensely in meeting the government's goals of Universal primary Education and Education for All. Informal sector training remains the most affordable and accessible to the urban poor and particularly those in child labour. It allows for flexibility in training, it is cheap and it offers low cost short courses suitable for children who by necessity have found themselves as bread winners. It should therefore be encouraged. In so doing the need to mainstream child labour concerns in national policies is paramount if the war on child labour should be won. The skills training project is one of the important initiatives in addressing the needs of working children and those vulnerable to fall into child labour and worst forms of child labour.

## **6. FINDINGS OF THE EVALUATION**

### **6.1 *Main Findings on Project Design***

The evaluation revealed that, the problem analysis was adequately carried out in the participating countries. Information gathered from the three countries revealed that the project design was adequate to fulfil the intended objectives. It was based on findings from baseline surveys conducted in the countries. The design clearly spelt out the background, the key elements, the scope and purpose, the project objectives, the key stakeholders and their roles. However, stakeholders in the three countries reported that, the design was done at the ILO headquarters in Geneva without their involvement. This situation did not allow for local socio cultural considerations to be incorporated into the design of the Implementation strategy



In the preparation process for the development of Implementation Action Plans, however, a series of meetings were held to sensitize stakeholders (Implementing Partners, MDAs, CSOs, and Artisans etc) and to determine the implementation in the three countries.

Gender considerations in the design were very useful. After identifying the problem of women stereotyped trades which are low paying and limit women entry into the gainful employment trades, the project considered gender awareness raising and advocacy for cultural and behavioural change towards girls entering male dominated trades to increase girls' employment opportunities. The details are shown in appendix 1

**In Tanzania**, the research carried out prior to the project was reported as useful by the steering committee members interviewed. They said that it facilitated the identification of the problem. The review of the research findings led to the design of the skills training project. It also served as a baseline on which the implementation of the project is monitored.

Further to the study conducted, it was reported that consultative meetings were held with leading ministries and tripartite partners (government, employers and workers association) to ensure that what is contained in the project does not conflict with the national interest. During the study, the children and parents were also contacted and this revealed the magnitude of the problem. According to explanation from project task force members and IPEC staff, the design of the project reflected the needs raised by stakeholders through stakeholders workshop where the country study was disseminated.

The design of the project recognized the roles of parents, community members and district local authorities. In recognition of their roles, SIDO the implementing agency of the project was to facilitate creation of awareness on causes and effects of child labour to holistic development of the child, to increase gender awareness and organize short courses on entrepreneurship and basic business management skills to the selected family members of the target children. This was planned with the view of changing attitudes and behaviours towards engaging their children in the WFCL.

The available information on the socio-economic, cultural and political situation was taken into consideration in the design of the project. This is evidenced by the projects compatibility with many policies and programmes including a major national programme, MKUKUTA. Further, at the start of the project implementation a review of policies and programmes that influence the development of urban informal economy skills was carried out.

Gender was taken into account in the design. After identifying the high problem of women stereotyped trades which are low paying and limit women joining gainful employment trades. The project considered gender awareness raising and advocacy for cultural and behavioural change towards girls entering male dominated trades to increase girls' employment opportunities.

**In Kenya**, the review concluded that the problem analysis was clearly in line with the needs of the country and more so, the interests of stakeholders. Employment creation and the role of the informal sector is an important issue for the government as outlined in the ERS paper as well as the Kenya vision 2030. Stakeholders however reported that they were not directly involved in the formulation of the problem analysis. Even though, they confirmed their involvement in sharing the project document before the implementation process began. In addition, it was evident from this evaluation that the project problem analysis and design benefited from baseline reports on studies carried out to inform the local situation of child labour, informal sector and skills training. It emerged that stakeholders had an

opportunity to provide input into the problem statement and into the project design through the baseline survey and consultations. Further, they had an opportunity to cross-check and validate the project design in the workshops that preceded project implementation.

Stakeholders were involved at different levels in the design stage. The tripartite partners were for instance instrumental as key informants in the baseline surveys conducted in the formative stages of this project. The informal sector players also provided input into the baseline surveys as well as the follow-up workshops. Notably, a majority of the stakeholders were satisfied that their concerns were taken into consideration in the planning stage.

This evaluation thus concludes that the project design adopted a strategy that was appropriate for the problem being addressed. The design offered a diverse set of action programmes that mirrored the immediate needs and interests of different players. The strategy was therefore a multidimensional and a multi-sectoral one, and in line with child labour dynamics.

**In Ghana**, the desk review, interviews as well as the stakeholders' forum conducted during the evaluation revealed that the problem analysis was adequately carried out.

The design clearly spelt out the background, the key elements, the scope and purpose, the project objectives, the key stakeholders and their roles. However, the design was done at the ILO headquarters in Geneva without any involvement of the stakeholders. This situation did not allow for local socio cultural considerations to be incorporated into the design of the Implementation strategy. For example in Ghana, matriculation and graduation ceremonies are part of apprenticeship programmes but no provision was made in the design for such ceremonies. Further, the time available for the Implementing Partners to develop their Action Programmes was also limited. This did not allow them to do a more detailed analysis of resource requirements to inform their budgets. As a result, some challenges were met in the implementation due to the short comings of the Action Programmes.

In the preparation process for the development of Implementation Action Plans, series of meetings were held to sensitize stakeholders (Implementing Partners, MDAs, CSOs, and Artisans etc) and to determine the implementation in Ghana. This process was followed by a process of consultation with stakeholders on the implementation. The Project operating plan was developed through national stakeholder consultation and Implementation Action plans developed by four (4) Implementing Partners.

The project design should have considered broadening it to other Regional capitals and the district level instead of concentrating in Accra and Tema. A good number of children in the worst forms of child labour migrate from the rural areas in Northern Ghana. It would have been very useful if the design rather targeted the source from where they migrated rather than the destination.

## **6.2 Relevance of Project Objectives and Strategy**

This section of the report highlights the relevance of project objectives and strategy at different levels. The main objective of the project was to contribute to the reduction of the incidences of the worst form of child labour in the urban informal economy in the three project countries through non-formal cost effective skills training and ensuring access facilitating services to decent (self) employment.

The strategy of focusing on skills training in the informal sector which has been identified in the three countries as a major sector which gives employment to majority of non- skilled and semi-skilled migrants

from the rural areas is relevant for the needs of the project countries. Further vocational skills training is a poverty reduction strategy as expressed in the Poverty Reduction Strategy Papers in the project countries. The project design has linked the problem, the objectives and strategies effectively. The strategy of targeting the involvement of Government Departments and agencies, Social Partners, Community based organisations(Implementing Partners),Community members , parents and children in the implementation of the intervention is very appropriate. Skills training and employment for withdrawn children is very useful and appropriate because it will provide them with life long skills which will create a better future for them and their children, breaking the vicious cycle of child labour and poverty.

The analysis of the findings also shows that, the project objectives were relevant to the needs of the three countries in their efforts to fight poverty. Child labour is seen to be both a cause and consequence of poverty, thus any efforts to eradicate poverty will inevitably result in a reduction of child labour incidences. The project strategy also targeted support for parents and guardians of the beneficiary children which, as a strategy for fighting poverty at the household level should translate to less children falling into child labour.

In general the design of this project is valid and logically linked to the objectives, outputs, and indicators. The design began with an analysis of a set of outcomes and identification of causal links as a desk review using the Strategic Programme Impact Framework Methodology (SPIF). The project was further shared with the different stakeholders drawn from different sectors involved in issues on child labour. This was followed by the identification of appropriate implementing agencies based on their areas of expertise. Each of the implementing agencies identified were required to draw up a work plan showing very clearly the activities to be implemented, resources required, expected outputs, time frame and the means of verification.

Though the strategy of selecting and training artisan trainers to prepare them for the project was very useful, the time limit for the preparation, the development of training manuals for the training was not adequate.

### **6.3 Relevance of project to National Policies and Programmes**

In the three countries, the relevance is demonstrated with the projects congruence with the National Poverty reduction strategies as well as national policies on technical and vocational education and training. It contributes greatly towards the Agenda on Youth Employment, Technical Vocational Education and Training (TVET), Informal sector support and Poverty Reduction.

In Ghana, it supports the Growth and Poverty Reduction Strategy, New Education Reform Policy, Youth Policy and the National Employment Policy

In Tanzania it is in line with the Tanzania Development Vision (TDV) 2025 and fits well into NSGRP (MKUKUTA) 2005-2010. Both TDV 2025 and NSGRP emphasizes that a nation's development should be people centred, based on sustainable and shared growth and be free from abject poverty. It also supports the National Youth Development Policy National Employment policy (NEP) of 1997 and the Youth Employment Plan and child development policy.

In Kenya, it supports the Poverty Reduction Strategy and the Youth Development and employment policy.

Information collected from all categories of stakeholders indicated the relevance of the project as indicated in the matrix of the three countries in table 1 in appendix 1.

## **7. Main Findings on the Quality of Project Performance and the Achievements**

The section addresses the quality of project performance by examining the extent to which the objectives and indicators were achieved in: policy development, capacity building, networking and awareness creation. It also addresses sustainability measures and potential good practices identified, and the challenges faced. The evaluation revealed varying degrees of achievement in project implementation in the three countries.

### **7.1 Achievements of project in relation to the objectives and indicators**

The project document stated the objectives as follows:

#### **Objective 1**

“By the end of the project, global poverty reduction strategies and sector policies in each of the participating countries in the field of Technical and Vocational Education and Training (TVET) will include provisions to ensure access of children working in the urban informal economy to the planned services, in the fields of technical and vocational education and training.”

A number of Government interventions being implemented in project countries reinforce the relevance of the project. Though the project has not initiated policy reviews or development in participating countries, it reinforces government policies on Vocational Education and Training and policy in relation to skills training and mainstreaming. Outcomes of the project interventions may have contributed in shaping up these policies. The three countries are PRSP participants. Poverty reduction strategies have taken into consideration vocational skills training and the development of the informal sector. Other ILO and development partner intervention have focused on the development of the informal sector as a viable employment sector for a large number of people in the project countries.

The level of policy development in the project countries is indicated below.

**In Ghana**, a number of Government interventions being implemented reinforce the relevance of the project. These are

- Mainstreaming Child labour interventions in the Growth and Poverty Reduction Strategy II (GPRS II)
- A Technical and vocational Education and Training (TVET) Policy has been developed to give direction to vocational skills training in Ghana
- Apprenticeship programme has also been developed as part of the Council for Technical Vocational Education and Training (COTVET). This programme is also developing a curriculum for training informal sector artisans as well as introducing standardization into their operations

- A new Education Reform Programme on apprenticeship for Junior High School Graduates who are not able to enter the Senior High School is being implemented to provide skills training.
- National Youth Employment Programme which has a skills training component is being implemented at the District level.
- A Draft National Employment Policy has been developed which includes issues on child labour.
- A social grant scheme called Livelihood Empowerment against Poverty (LEAP) Programme has been developed for implementation as part of an overall National Social Protection Strategy. One of the conditionality's for households to access this grant is that, a beneficiary household should not have any child in the worst forms of child labour including trafficking.
- Informal sector artisans' associations exist and are providing support to their members who are involved in the training of withdrawn children. They were trained and sensitized on child labour issues

**In Kenya**, the project feeds into the PRSP which outlines several measures to improve education, health and labour which have a bearing on child labour. The National Employment Policy was revised in 2006 to include child labour mainstreaming issues. A Child Labour Policy also gives clear objectives and strategies on mainstreaming child labour issues into national development. Other policy support measures that relate to child labour include the revision of the Session Paper No 7 of 2005 on National Employment Policy and Strategies for Kenya to include child labour issues, reviewing of the labour laws, including a section on protection of children which was introduced highlighting issues on child labour and worst forms of child labour. This section is one of the sections in the Employment Act that are criminalized.

The evaluation also revealed that a number (350 artisans) of informal associations of crafts men and women were trained on pedagogical skills and or sensitised on child labour issues.

In Tanzania, Interaction of ILO/IPEC projects in influencing national policies, debates and institutions working on child labour featured out strongly. Child labour issues are reflected in the National Strategy for Growth and Poverty Reduction (MKUKUTA) Monitoring Framework matrix. Also are reflected in the Child Development Policy (final Draft) and in the new Labour Laws (2004) particularly Labour Law NO. 6 of 2004

Although this project did not result in a new policy and legislation, there were already policies and legislation in place that supports the project however these policies had not been well operationalised. These policies are:

- Industrial Development Policy 1996 to 2020.
- National Youth Development Policy of 1996 which emphasises employable skills.
- National Employment Policy of 1997 which emphasises provision of technical and entrepreneurial skills in the informal economy

## Objectives, Output, Activities and Indicators Matrix

The Development objective of the project is to reduce the incidence of child labour in the urban informal economy in participating countries through non-formal low-cost skills training and ensuring access to facilitating services to decent (self-) employment

Objectives	Output	Activities	Achievements
<p><b>Immediate objective 1</b></p> <p>By the end of the project, global poverty reduction strategies and sector policies in each of the participating countries in the field of Technical and Vocational Education and Training (TVET) will include provisions to ensure access of children working in the urban informal economy to the planned services, in the fields of technical and vocational education and training.</p>	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. Project operating plan is developed through national stakeholder consultations in each participating country.</li> <li>2. Reform proposals to relevant legislation, including education and skills training, and informal sector services drafted in each country.</li> </ol>	<p>Identification of stakeholders and providing them with technical support to develop and support the implementation of project</p>	<p><b>In Ghana</b>, a TVET policy and a Council for Technical and Vocational Education (COTVET Act 718), A new Educational policy on vocational skills training for graduates of Junior High Schools who are not able to proceed to senior high school established. An Informal sector apprenticeship training programme established.</p> <p><b>In Kenya</b> The Project has led to important policy reviews such as the MSE bill to include child labour issues.</p> <p><b>In Tanzania</b> The project has helped to operationalized available policies and identified gaps in the informal sector TVET programmes.</p>

**Objective 2** of the project stated that by the end of the project, “At least 400 working children in the urban informal economy will be withdrawn from the worst forms of child labour through non-formal low cost skills training appropriate to their age. In addition, 250 children will be prevented from entering into worst forms of child labour in the urban informal economy through these same training services”

The results of the evaluation indicated that, a total of 404 children were withdrawn (Compared to the target of 400) and were either trained or still undergoing training in various vocational skills. Out of the total, 218 are boys and 186 girls. A total number of 11 drop outs was recorded in Ghana. The project also prevented 122 as against 250 as the target in Ghana and Tanzania. In total, 52 girls were trained in male dominated trade areas and 20 boys trained in female dominated trade areas. This shows that, the gender strategy has been very useful and efforts need to be intensified to achieve further gender mainstreaming in vocational skills training.

It is very difficult on the surface to identify the number of children prevented. One way could be the number of children who may have entered some vocational training as a result of the impact the programme has made on beneficiaries.

In spite of this achievement, the trainers have reported that, the time limit and the funding level available has given the basic skills to the beneficiaries but not enough to enable them to go into self employment. However, some of the trainees in Tanzania and Kenya have formed associations to help themselves while others have gone into attachment programmes to enhance their skills. This development has confirmed the need to consider extending the duration of training depending on the skill being acquired as well as increase the level of funding. There is also the need to develop post basic training strategies to enhance skill acquisition

Results of the evaluation, showing varying degrees of achievement of this objective in the three countries is shown below.

In Ghana, the project targeted the withdrawal of and training of 100 Children in vocational skills as well as preventing 50 children. Four (4) Action Programmes were implemented.

However, One Hundred and nine (109) children were withdrawn for training. Seven (7) completed the training, 91 were still under training and at various stages of completion, but 11 dropped out of the total of 102 who were under training at the time of the evaluation . The gender disaggregation indicated that, 11 girls were trained in male dominated trades while 3 boys trained in female dominated trade.

Though the withdrawn children were to be placed in vocational skills, MIHOSO (one of the implementing partners) withdrew and placed 5 children in school (with support from their families) because they were too young for the skills training project. In addition, MIHOSO also prevented 71 children from child labour through their educational and sensitisation programmes. The other implementing partners found it difficult to report on prevention. However it was believed that, through the sensitisation of the communities on the dangers and adverse effect of child labour on children, some may have been prevented.

## Achievements: Withdrawal & Placement

IP	Enrolment			Completed	Not Comp.	Female in Male Dominated Trade	Male in Female Dominated Trade	Drop Out
	M	F	T					
Partners in Dev	7	17	24	1	23	5	1	-
MIHOSO	7	18	25	6	19	0	2	
CENCOSAD	16	17	33	0	27	6	0	6
FIT Ghana	13	14	27	0	22	0	0	5
<b>Total</b>	<b>43</b>	<b>66</b>	<b>109</b>	<b>7</b>	<b>91</b>	<b>11</b>	<b>3</b>	<b>11</b> <small>22</small>

In Kenya, The evaluation revealed that in total, 137 children (68 boys and 69 girls) were reached compared to the targeted 120. Out of the 137 children 50 were taking short courses and have duly completed their training. Some of them are already attached to different enterprises as employees. The other 87 were taking examinable courses. They continue to attend both practical and theory classes as they await their grade test in early December. Notably, there were 23 girls in male dominated courses and about 3 boys in female dominated trades. This objective was overachieved.

In Tanzania, the action programmes designed under the project have assisted 158 children. One Hundred and seven (107) children were withdrawn and 51 were prevented from the WFCL as shown in Table 3. Out of the total of 107 children withdrawn for training, 10 dropped out.

**Table 3: Number of children withdrawn and prevented from WFCL in Tanzania.**

<i>Number of children assisted (withdrawn &amp; prevented)</i>		<i>Prevented</i>		<i>Withdrawn and under training</i>		<i>Drop outs</i>	
<i>boys</i>	<i>girls</i>	<i>boys</i>	<i>girls</i>	<i>boys</i>	<i>girls</i>	<i>boys</i>	<i>girls</i>
107	51	28	23	70	37	6	4

The evaluation revealed that the withdrawn children have developed a sense of purpose in their existence and self assertion. The participating children are no longer shy as the project has created self confidence in children who participated in training. These are crucial for children who are being prepared to take on their youth and adult roles. The project also enhanced creativity, networking and cooperation among children. The bamboo craft, food processing and batik making groups were found making various types of products trying to create new products that would attract more sales.



The children's group involved in bamboo making were found making their products at SIDO premise. They reported that they had received some orders for making various types of products (Table mats. Lamp shades and waste baskets). They were able to participate and market their products in the International Trade Fair organized by the Tanzania Board of External Trade in July 2007.

The project has stirred up children's aspirations. While conducting interviews with stakeholders', one girl trained in decorations reported that she had teamed up with another three girls to form a decoration group to enhance their chances of getting jobs. At the time of this evaluation their group had acquired three decoration tenders since the completion of their two months skills training. Her aspiration has been to become a big entrepreneur in providing decoration services to various celebration parties (weddings, birthdays, funerals etc).

The implementation of the designed programme activities resulted in raising awareness on child labour and changing the attitude of community members and employers towards girls entering the male dominated trades.

Some girls were found to have been trained in the male dominated trades such as bamboo craft and vehicle mechanics. Training girls on male dominated trades that was accompanied with gender awareness creation for employers, parents and community members have increased opportunities for the girls who for quite a long time were crowded in few female stereotyped jobs. The artisans in Arusha, parents and the children in Temeke interviewed said that awareness raising seminars conducted at district level have increased their awareness on worst form of child labour and changed their cultural attitude towards gender stereotyping trades. Although the girls had started entering male dominated trades thus widening the girls decent work opportunities, the number of girls in those trades still remains low.

During this project a total of 158 children were enrolled out of which 135 completed their training in various skills as indicated in Table 4

**Table 4: Trade Areas**

Trade	Enrolled			Dropped out		
	boys	girls	total	boys	girls	Total
Bamboo Craft	26	15	41	8	6	14
Food Processing	6	11	17	0	1	1
Batik making	8	18	26	0	1	1
Hair dressing	0	12	12	0	2	2
Decorations	0	18	18	0	0	0
Mechanics	41	3	44	3	1	4

The children were trained in their selected trades. Additionally, they were also trained in life skills, occupational safety and health at work place; and gender aspects on girls participation in employable skills and technical trades with a view to breaking the cultural and social barriers that culminate into changing attitudes of individual children themselves, their families and the larger society around them about gender stereotyping trades. However, due to the delay in the start of the project in Tanzania, the support to the non formal education programme through a Complementary Basic Education in Tanzania(COBET) that was originally planned was dropped. As a result only those children who could read and write benefited from the project.

The project has also facilitated to solve the problem of girls early marriages. Girls reported that keeping girls in training and there after engaging in decent work, makes them not rush into getting married at an early age thus addressing the problem of early child bearing.

### Objectives, Output, Activities and Indicators Matrix

Objectives	Output	Activities	Achievements
<p><b>Immediate objective 2:</b></p> <p>By the end of the project, at least 400 working children in the urban informal economy will be withdrawn from worst forms of child labour through non-formal low-cost skills training appropriate to their age. In addition, 250 children will be withdrawn from entering into worst forms of child labour in the urban informal economy through these same services.</p>	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. Strategies developed and mainstreamed in each participating country to enable girls to enter into training for traditional male dominated areas.</li> <li>2. Tripartite and other partners involved in traditional apprenticeship training are supporting the pilot projects to ensure access of working children above minimum working age to a reformed system of traditional apprenticeship, including linking the target group to a pre- and post training support services.</li> </ol>	<p>Undertake activities to motivate girls to train in traditionally male dominated trades</p> <p>Undertake activities to identify tripartite partners to develop and implement action programmes</p>	<p><b>In Ghana:</b></p> <p>109 children were withdrawn (43 boys 66) girls, 7 completed training, 91 under training. 11 girls trained in male dominated trades and 3 boys in female dominated trade.</p> <p>71 children were prevented.</p> <p><b>In Kenya:</b></p> <p>137 children were withdrawn and undergoing training (68 boys and 69 girls) 23 girls in male dominated courses and 3 boys in female dominated trades.</p> <p><b>In Tanzania:</b></p> <p>107 children were withdrawn(70 boys 37 girls)</p> <p>18 girls were trained in male dominated trades and 14 boys in girls dominated trades. 51 were prevented from the WFCL</p>

**Objective 3** of the project stated that by the end of the project “A sound knowledge base and generic tools on combating worst forms of child labour through non-formal low cost skills training will have been developed”.

The project has contributed to increase in knowledge of stakeholders in participation on child labour issues particularly in the area of withdrawing and rehabilitation of child labourers. National Steering Committees, Implementing Partners, artisan trainers and community members and parents reported increase in knowledge on child labour issues. The capacities of these stakeholders have been increased as well as tools and strategies developed in dealing with child labour issues.

**In Ghana** as part of the implementation, a gender tool and documentary on gender mainstreaming has been developed. However due to the time limit in this project, this document was not used. In addition, a manual and curriculum for use by artisan training service providers’ was developed but not extensively used. The culture of curriculum in the informal sector is new. It will therefore take some time before it becomes part of the culture in this sector.

**In Kenya**, one of the most important objectives of this project was the reform of the informal sector through training to ensure elimination of child labour in that sector. One strategy for achieving this was the development of manuals for skills training. The manual developed in this project had 6 modules i.e. HIV/AIDS, Gender, Occupational Health and Safety, Workers rights and Child Labour etc. The Business manual of the MLHRD was also revised to include child labour elimination. This project saw the revision

of a training manual on youth business clinics manual. The youth business clinics manuals are based on the theme of energising entrepreneurship in Kenya and were revised to integrate child labour issues. On the other hand training of the artisans was done using the manuals that have an optimal relevance for adolescents who also happen to be former child labourers. The manual was developed based on the inputs from a consultative training needs assessment under the skills training project.

### Objectives, Output, Activities and Indicators Matrix

Objectives	Output	Activities	Achievements
<p><b>Immediate Objective 3:</b></p> <p>By the end of the project, a sound knowledge-base and generic tools on combating worst forms of child labour through non-formal low-cost skills training will have been developed.</p>	<p>A compendium of project experiences in the form of good practices is produced in each participating country.</p> <p>Generic tools and strategies are developed for replication in other countries and programmes.</p>	<p>Collate, document and disseminate evaluation reports on project.</p> <p>Procure consultancy services to develop generic tools and strategies for replication.</p>	<p><b>Number of good practices identified.</b></p> <p>A total of 9 good practices were identified and document in the evaluation report.</p> <p><b>Number of tools developed.</b></p> <p>A gender tools, a video documentary, and a training manual and curriculum for artisans have been developed in Ghana.</p> <p><b>Kenya</b></p> <p>A manual for skills training, business manual revised to include child labour issues</p>

### 7.2 Gender Mainstreaming

In terms of mainstreaming gender considerations in project implementation, about 34 girls were trained in male dominated trades and 6 boys trained in female dominated trades. In Ghana, a gender tool for the project was developed to help the project to demonstrate that, girls have the capacity to acquire skills in male -dominated trades and boys in female- dominated trades. The tools have helped to demystify the notion that, girls can not acquire skills in male dominated trades and vice versa. A documentary was also produced. In total, 52 girls were trained in male dominated trade areas and 20 boys trained in female dominated trade areas.

### 7.3 Project contribution to capacity building

Capacity building and usage is very important for the successful implementation of any project. This evaluation notes that capacity building was one of the main objectives of this project and is one of the achievements in this project which cut across all stages in the implementation. Indeed it was entrenched in almost all the activities and the stakeholders in this project. The capacities of implementing partners, National Steering Committees, artisan trainers, community members and parents were built.

In Ghana, a sound knowledge-base and generic tools on combating the worst forms of child labour through non-formal low-cost skills training was developed. The capacity of all stakeholders particularly the implementation partners, communities and artisan training service providers have been built through training and sensitization programmes on child labour. Social mobilization was carried out in

implementing communities through sensitization programmes and the formation of child labour monitoring committees. Potential good practices were identified, gender tools developed and a documentary on gender dimensions of vocational skills training developed.

In Kenya, trainees were for instance capacitated by acquiring skills that they will use to make a living. Further, the trainees were sensitised and trained on issues on child labour as well as other social issues that affect their welfare. Trainers and other artisans also benefited in capacity building initiatives addressing child labour issues, occupational health and safety, pedagogical skills, rights of workers and policy issues. Besides the direct sensitisation and training that they received, the project also made the artisans realise their potential to train on skills they specialise in. Government officials working in the Ministry of Labour and Human Resource Development as well as senior officers from other line Ministries had an opportunity to attend workshops addressing issues on child labour. Additionally, senior policy makers from six line ministries attended a workshop on child labour and the legislative and policy frameworks affecting operations in the urban informal sector.

Implementing agencies similarly had an opportunity to strengthen their project management skills. They were for instance involved in reviewing the baseline surveys that informed this project.

In Tanzania, capacity building was undertaken in the informal sector operators associations in the five districts. An average of 10 associations were mobilised to form District Networks of Informal Sector Associations. In Temeke district, a Network has been formed, constitution developed and registered with the district authorities. In Arusha municipality the process of formulating the network is ongoing. At least network leaders have been elected. In Iringa and Dodoma regions informal sector operators have been mobilised and sensitized to form associations. In all regions, the associations have received basic training in association formation, business management and networking. The network and associations will enable them to prepare constitutions and register thus making them formal.

#### **7.4 Project contribution to networking awareness raising, linkages with other child labour interventions**

The networks among government agencies, implementing partners and project participants at the community level were very useful in the implementation. Though some level of networks were developed in project countries, they were not very effective. There were no clear linkages between the project and the TBP which is running in some of the project countries. In Ghana, there exists a network among government agencies through the National Steering Committee on child labour. However the TBP pilot districts were different from the project districts hence there is no linkage at the community level. In Tanzania there exists a linkage with IPEC Project of support TBP I. The project thus resulted in strengthening these networks and not establishing new ones.

In Kenya, the skills training project immensely contributed to awareness raising and social mobilisation. All the workshops with stakeholders, trainers, trainees and the beneficiaries aroused interests in all these groups in addition to sensitising them on child labour dynamics. Specifically, this project triggered a number of networks. First, NATTET was able to bring together policy makers from six line ministries who among other things agreed that there is need for action against child labour and worst forms of child

labour. Part of the outputs of that workshop was the constitution of a 12 member inter-ministerial committee whose role was to follow up on the recommendations of the workshop. The recommendations were summarised in a joint proposal and forwarded to the chairman of the NSC (Vice President). One of the key recommendations was that each ministry should mobilise resources to sponsor more children for skills training.

The Ministry of Home Affairs through funding from JICA contracted NATTET to implement yet another skills training project for children in rehabilitation schools. Reports from NATTET indicate that children who benefited from the training were already utilising their skills to produce goods for sale to communities around their schools.

### ***7.5 Effectiveness And Efficiency of project implementation***

Efficiency and effectiveness in project implementation and management are very useful measures in determining the value of a project to stakeholders. This section examines the effectiveness and efficiency in project implementation in the three countries. Efficiency measures how economically inputs (funds, expertise, time etc) are converted into outputs under the project and effectiveness measures the extent to which the project attains its objectives at the goal or purpose level.

#### **7.5.1 Effectiveness**

With regards to the training component the project has succeeded in withdrawing 453 children and training 404 compared to the targeted 400 in various vocational skills. Out of the total, 218 are boys and 186 girls. In total, 52 girls were trained in male dominated trade areas and 20 boys trained in female dominated trade areas. The project also prevented 122 as against 250 as the target in Ghana and Tanzania. This shows that, the gender strategy has been very useful and efforts need to be further intensified to maintain gender mainstreaming in vocational skills training. Though the training is not complete, there are high indications that the apprentices will complete their training. Children participating in the programme have shown a lot of promise for making a more decent living after the training.

The results of the evaluation in Tanzania revealed that the project has produced desirable results. It was evident that after attending the skills training the children (trainees) have acquired desirable basic skills in selected trades for decent jobs. The skills acquired have created a path to self employment of the trainees. The bamboo craft; food processing and batik making groups were found making various types of new products that would attract more sales. They reported that they had received some orders for making various types of products (Table mats, lamp shades and waste baskets). They were able to participate and market their products in the International Trade Fair organized by the Tanzania Board of External Trade in July 2007. One girl trained in decorations reported that she had teamed up with another three girls to start a decorations group. At the time of this evaluation their group had secured three decoration tenders after their two months of skills training. Her aspiration has been to become a big entrepreneur in providing decoration services to various celebration parties (weddings, birthdays, funerals etc).

With regards to awareness creation, in the Tema project in Ghana, the creation of a counselling centre in a commercial and busy area has given a lot of visibility for the project. This has attracted many parents and children to enquire what the project was about and the desire to be part of the project. The project has raised awareness on child labour in participating communities. The implementation of the designed programme activities resulted in raising awareness on child labour and changing the attitude of community members and employers towards girls entering the male dominated trades.

Apprenticeship manuals were also developed for training the artisans service providers engaged on the project. A gender tool and a documentary were developed in Ghana to facilitate attitudinal change towards girls' inclusion in traditional male dominated skills in the informal sector with the view of ensuring the acceptance of girls by all stakeholders. Skills training manuals and youth business clinic manuals were also developed in Kenya to facilitate the training of the youth. The modules in the manual include gender, child labour, Occupational Safety and Health, HIV AIDS and Workers rights.

### **7.5.2 Efficiency**

Withdrawing and training children requires a lot of time. The withdrawal and counselling component took a considerable length of time (on the average 4 months), leaving little time for the training. Although some of the children who were trained in skills which have relatively short periods have completed their training and are working, others who chose long duration skills were still undergoing training. In Ghana for example trainers reported that the limited training time gave the trainees only the basic skills but not enough to help them go into self employment. They will require longer time or post training attachment programmes to enable them enhance their skills. Further, the age of children who completed their training before the minimum working age in the respective countries should be taken into consideration.

Efficiency of the project has not been fully achieved because of the one year duration which is too short for mastery in skills acquisition. Effective competency requires 2 to 4 years of apprenticeship. Additionally funds are inadequate for the start up capital required by trainees to help them establish their own micro enterprises. Further in view of the world view of the withdrawn child labourers, the time and resource requirements available for counselling the withdrawn children in the project to change are not enough to have the desired impact. The trainers need adequate time to re-orient them properly. Parents were also not economically endowed to support the children during the training. Support for parents to be economically empowered to enable them support their children during the training is also paramount.

## **7.6 Management issues and institutional set up**

The institutional set up and management and of the project indicated that, at the national level a National Steering/Inter Sectoral Committee was established to provide policy direction for the management of the Project in the project countries. The committees were chaired by the Ministry of Labour and Employment and membership was drawn from Government Organisations, the private sector, Social Partners' and Non Governmental and Civil Society Organisations. Core technical committees were also formed to facilitate the implementation of the project. Quarterly meetings of the National Steering Committees provided a platform for discussion of the project implementation and related policy implementations. The NSCs established links with other government programmes as well as provided guidance geared to improve the implementation of the project.

Monitoring and evaluation mechanisms were in place. The coordinators and implementing agencies were submitting reports to the National Task Forces that comprised members of the tripartite partners.

Project Implementation was done by Implementing Partners. The ILO/IPEC Project coordinators provided a coordination role and technical support.

Though the NSC was perceived to have played their role well in Tanzania and Kenya, the Ghana NSC was not very effective because of organisational and logistical support constraints. There is the need therefore to address these issues.

In Ghana at the operational (ILO/IPEC) level, the project was implemented as a separate project at the ILO Project office. In spite of this, there was collaboration with other child labour projects.

The project has a monitoring and evaluation framework which required quarterly submission of technical and financial reports by implementing partners. This facilitated project implementation in the first and second quarters.

Unlike the delay in implementing the project in Tanzania due to the late appointment of a coordinator, (October 2005), the Ghana project though started in August 2004 however suffered a major setback when the project coordinator resigned in October 2006. This situation caused a major delay in project implementation. It was not until February 2007 that the project management responsibility was given to a project staff of the TBP as additional responsibility (without any additional remuneration at the time of the evaluation) that submission of reports resumed.

### **7.7 Stakeholder involvement**

The evaluation revealed that all stakeholders (ILO/IPEC staff, National Steering Committees (NSC), government departments and agencies, social partners, implementing partners, artisan service providers, beneficiary children and parents and communities) played significant roles in the implementation of the project.

The ILO/IPEC staff were involved in the sensitisation and in the development of action programmes as well as managing and monitoring the implementation of action programmes. The NSCs, government departments and agencies, social partners all provided policy and technical direction for the implementation of the project. Specialised government provided psycho-social support to the children through counselling. The implementing partners and artisan service providers played a major role in facilitating the entire process through guidance and counselling and skills training.

### **7.8 Organisational implementation capacity**

Organisational capacity for project implementation is very crucial. The capacities of various stakeholders, ILO/IPEC staff, National Steering Committees, implementing partners, and artisan trainers have been enhanced in project implementation. Though a few lapses were observed in the implementation of the project the minimum capacity requirements for all stakeholders were met. However there is the need for continuous capacity building to enhance project implementation.

### **7.9 Usefulness of the Strategic Planning Impact Framework, planning workshops, and Interventions.**

The stakeholder strategic planning workshops organised to sensitise stakeholders and to facilitate the development of Action Programmes was found to be very useful. It has helped to prepare the various

categories of stakeholders to appreciate and understand the logic and the linkage between the various components of the project and the roles each stakeholder was expected to play in the implementation.

The planning workshops apart from raising awareness also created ownership for the project among stakeholders. Implementation Action Plans were developed by implementing partners. For the implementing agencies, it helped to understand the project leading to successful implementation and achieving the desired outcomes.

The gender component was described to be very innovative. Gender was well mainstreamed in the project design and implementation. In Ghana, a gender tool was developed as part of the implementation of the project.

## **8. Challenges**

### **Policy environment:**

The implementation of the project faced the following challenges. While in Ghana and Kenya, the policy environment existed and supported vocational skills training in the informal sector however the situation is different in Tanzania. According to the Tanzanian integrated labour force survey 2000/2001 almost 90 percent of the labour force in the informal sector acquired skills while working through the traditional apprenticeship system or just on-the-job trial and error learning. Due to lack of policy to guide informal apprenticeship the sector faces the following problems:

- There is no uniform training system nor training plan which ensures the transfer of a set of relevant skills from master craft people to apprentices.
- Training is not a priority and master crafts people lack the pedagogical skills required.
- Skill transfer is limited to technical skills, it does not include business skills or knowledge about occupational safety and health.

### **Duration of Training:**

The evaluation revealed that the time frame for training in some of the vocational skills is limited. The trainers reported that the duration of training was just enough to give the trainees the basic skills but not enough to help them go into self employment. Further, considerable amount of time was also spent in counselling the children to prepare them for the training as well as during the training.

### **Funding:**

It was extensively reported by stakeholders that the funding allocated for the training activities was inadequate. Fees demanded by trainers are far above what was paid to them (Lower than what other organisations pay in the market) and this may have affected the quality of training. Implementing partners did not consider some cost implications such as counselling fees and the actual training charges (market fees) by the trainers in their budgets, thus creating problems for the implementation. Implementing agencies noted that limited funds made it difficult to sustain trainees during the training, especially where they were not getting any food for lunch. Clearly, they noted that, many guardians faced problems in raising transport fares and pocket money for the trainees.



Adequate funding for start up capital was another challenge faced in the implementation of the project. This project also could have looked more into the social component, yet trainers realised that they did spend a lot of time talking to trainees on issues concerning their well being. This problem especially affected girls getting into male dominated trades. The implementing partners spent a lot of time and resources to integrate the girls into the male dominated environment. Local resource mobilisation strategies were not included in the project design.

In the case of Ghana, delay in the release of funds coupled with the perceived cumbersome financial reporting format delayed project implementation

## **9. Sustainability.**

Sustainability of an intervention is one key measure for the success of the intervention

### **Policy environment**

There are strong indications from this evaluation that the possibility of sustaining this project is high. This project is and continues to be relevant in addressing the needs of implementing countries in the areas of youth employment and child labour. High potentials exist for sustainability of the project because of the appropriate policy environment as well as a lot of goodwill among partners in line with the objectives of the project. Capacity building of partners though identified was not adequately addressed in the implementation.

What was lacking in the project strategy was local resource mobilization. There should have been a conscious effort to link parents of withdrawn children to micro financial service providers to access support to improve upon their economic circumstances and thereby support their children. Parents could also be supported with training in alternative income generation activities to improve their economic capacity.

### **Training**

This evaluation established that the trainees who performed well were more likely to be retained at the workshops where they trained. This was already happening to a number of them. In addition, those that were given limited start-up capital either in tools or cash or both stood better chances of starting up their own small scale enterprises, or at least negotiate their attachment to already established enterprises. This may have a significant multiplier effect since it will demonstrate the usefulness of the project and the likelihood that, they may also turn out to be training others in the future. The issue however is the adequate start up capital for the trainees who graduate.

### **Social mobilisation**

One clear conclusion from this evaluation is that, this project has generated interest from different players and stakeholders in child labour, such that the awareness and community action level actions have inevitably moved to another level. The project has sensitised many players on child labour issues.

### **Capacity Building**

One of the most important aspects of the project is the capacity building for sustainability. Stakeholders at all levels have received some form of capacity enhancement for the project implementation. The training of informal sector artisans, implementing partners and community members will support the sustainability of the initiative beyond this pilot, given the availability of financial resources to support the programmes.

The use of opinion leaders in communities to influence parents to release their children for training was useful and the role of community child labour monitoring committees established to work with implementing partners was very useful. These committees serve as watchdogs to prevent more children from engaging in child labor as well as the withdrawn children from slipping back.

## **10. Lessons Learnt**

This evaluation notes that the skills training project provided a learning opportunity for the stakeholders. Some of the most significant lessons drawn from this project include:

### **Identification of Children**

- Identifying the children using community committees and locating and talking to them at their place of residence was very useful because it is the ideal time to get the desired attention from them.

### **Training**

- Training of artisan service providers in handling child labourers was very useful in preparing them for the training. The informal sector is a strong engine in the elimination of child labour. There are many child labourers in this sector and the artisans are important entry points in the urban communities in combating child labour.
- The age of children withdrawn as well as the length of training for vocational skills training to be taken into consideration before placement to ensure that, the child will be in the legal age for employment on completion of the training.

### **Funding**

- The amount of money for the project activities related to the training and placement is inadequate. However, it is clear from the project that additional resources can get children out of child labour through the informal sector.
- Provision of health care for trainees should be taken into consideration to ensure that their health care needs are taken into consideration during training. Trainees who fell sick during the training needed to be attended to.
- Costing of implementation action plans should be carefully done to ensure that, all cost elements including counseling, and market price training fees etc are included in the budget to facilitate smooth implementation.

## **Policy environment and other support**

- The project was useful and could be replicated but cultural sensitivity must be taken into consideration. Strategies must respond to the local needs of participants.
- Networking with specialized government/ non governmental agencies to provide support was very useful in counseling and diverse support to the project. Effective coordination of all interventions taking place at local level is important because it maximizes resources mobilization, minimizes overlapping and avoids duplication of interventions. Multi-sectoral child protection committee at national, regional and district levels leads to effective implementation of existing policies that promote children rights.
- Gender awareness and mobilization can change the attitude of communities, employers and girls towards girls entering male dominate trades.
- The use of participatory approaches in the whole project cycle i.e. from project design, implementation to evaluation helped to increase ownership and commitment to the project

## **11. Identified Potential Good Practices**

These are practices that have contributed to the efficiency and effectiveness in project implementation. They have been deemed “good” because, either in full or in part, they have contributed to successful impact on this project. The rationale for documenting good practices is that, it helps to improve future interventions, mainstreaming it in policy, interventions and replication in other projects. Good Practices identified in a project promotes sustainability of the project. The identified good practices are as follows:

- Establishment of a counseling centre in Ghana where the children meet every fortnight to share ideas, and experiences, learn about adolescent reproductive rights and responsibilities of children, social harassment issues etc was very useful. Expert counselors were invited to teach the children. The centre has also given visibility for the project in the community which attracts people to learn about the project. This development has created a good image for the programme.
- Monthly socialization exchange programmes/study visits by trainees to their peers at other locations/sites helped to reinforce and sustain their interest in training. It is therefore recommended that such programmes be maintained in future projects. Each trainee was asked to tell his or her stories to enable others learn from it.
- The use of professional counselors in specialized agencies to counsel the children to accept to withdraw and undergo training was very useful. A considerable amount of time is needed to counsel the children to prepare them for the training. Counseling should continue throughout the training.
- Training of artisan service providers in handling child labourers was very useful in preparing them for the training. The identification and training should be preceded by the withdrawal of children and who will have selected specific trade areas. This will enable the right artisans to be selected for the project. Further the development and use of curriculum for the training was useful because it facilitated effective and efficient training.
- Networking with specialized government/ non governmental agencies made significant contributions in counseling and diverse support to the project. Effective coordination of all interventions taking place at the local level is important because it maximizes resources mobilization, minimizes overlapping and avoids duplication of intervention. Multi-sectoral child

protection committees at national, regional and district levels lead to effective implementation of existing policies that promote children rights.

- The involvement of community based artisan training service providers was very useful because it was based on the use of local resources in the training which will help keep the trainees in their localities.
- A good targeting and selection strategy was the identification of beneficiaries through referrals by members of the community and community based organisations. The strategy ensured that the community had an opportunity to identify the most needy and vulnerable in society.
- Giving withdrawn children opportunity to choose the vocational skills they want to acquire ensured that, the courses offered under the skills training project were demand driven rather than supply driven. This helped to sustain the interest of the trainees in the project and to complete the training.
- Keeping records on the performance of each trainee helped in monitoring the progress of the training as well as the specific needs of each trainee. This enabled specific solutions to be found for individual problems.

## 12. Conclusions

Relevance:

The problem of child labour was adequately analysed to determine the magnitude before the project was designed. The Project is relevant and in line with the poverty reduction strategies of the three countries. The issue of child labour elimination is a felt need in the project countries and there exists high awareness in the project countries on the objectives and usefulness and relevance of the project. The project is relevant to the national policies and programmes, to the children and their families and addressed the issue of poverty as one of the main factors causing child labour. The project therefore enjoys support from government, social partners, NGOs and CSOs, implementing partners, artisans, and beneficiary parents and children who agreed on the concepts and the methodology for implementation. The project addresses the issue of child labour, supports and complements past and existing child labour initiatives in Ghana, Kenya and Tanzania. It is both a preventive and curative intervention in eliminating the WFCL.

The set objectives were viable solutions to the identified problems. In addition the indicators set were useful in measuring progress in the project. However, the financial resources allocated were inadequate. The overall approach in this project was correct taking cognisance of the need to build capacity of all stakeholders. The assumptions stated in the log frame were also valid. Skills training and employment for withdrawn children were very useful because it provides them with life long skills, which will create a better future for them and their children, breaking the vicious cycle of child labour and poverty. Gender was well mainstreamed in the implementation.

### **Project Implementation and achievements:**

The results of the evaluation indicated that, a total of 404 children were withdrawn (compared to the target of 400) and were either trained or still undergoing training in various vocational skills. Out of the total 218 are boys and 186 girls. A total number of 11 drop outs was recorded in Ghana. The project also prevented 122 as against 250 as the target in Ghana and Tanzania. In total, 52 girls were trained in male dominated trade areas and 20 boys trained in female dominated trade areas. This shows that, the gender

strategy has been very useful and further efforts need to be strengthened to maintain gender mainstreaming in vocational skills training.

The project has resulted in increased awareness on child labour issues as well as capacity building of stakeholders who participated in the project.

The strategy of using informal sector master artisan training service providers is very appropriate and meets the aspiration of stakeholders. Though the implementation period is too short, the objectives are being achieved.

A major problem which has to be addressed is the provision of adequate resources to meet the trainees' requirements and their start up capital. Adequate local resource mobilization which is very crucial for the project was also lacking. Strategies to enhance the economic status of parents to support their children were also lacking. In spite of all these shortcomings, some potential good practices have been identified in project implementation.

At the stakeholders' workshop, it was recommended that the project be extended beyond the planned end date of December 2007. Any future design should take into consideration extension to the district level.

The project has been effective. It has provided the children with skills in desirable trades and life skills leading to sense of purpose in their existence, self assertion and self confidence. The project also enhanced creativity, networking and cooperation among partners and children. These are crucial for children who are being prepared to take on their youth and adult roles. This allowed exchange and sharing ideas that resulted in enhancing implementation. The project supported and complimented the IPEC's projects of support to TBP and acted as a bridge between child labour and youth employment.

Gender was well mainstreamed in the project design and implementation This has stimulated a change in attitude towards girls entering the traditional male dominated trades thus increasing girls employment opportunities and reducing discrimination of girls at work in certain trades.

The project has also contributed to the development of a sound knowledge base and generic tools on combating worst forms of child labour. A lot of information has been documented under this project and in addition the artisans were also trained on pedagogical training modules.

Finally this evaluation concludes that this project was a lesson to many, including the ILO/IPEC.

### **13. Recommendations**

- The evaluation found that in the three countries that all stakeholders agreed that the project was very relevant to address the needs of the countries, and it supports the poverty reduction strategies as well as youth development and employment policies of these countries. It will therefore be very useful to extended and expanded beyond the planned end date of December 2007. It is worth considering the implementation as a programme, not a project which will be much more sustainable. This will call for the leadership of the ministries responsible for

labour, youth and employment and mainstreaming implementation into the development plans of participating countries. The development of implementation action plans could be done in collaboration with local authorities to enhance ownership. This will enhance local/community level empowerment and ownership. Demand driven skills training should be promoted.

- In the design of the expansion phase, cultural sensitivity must be taken into consideration. Local involvement in the design of the next phase of the project should be enhanced to ensure that the strategies respond to the local needs of participants. The length of the training should be determined by the trade skills being pursued by the trainees.
- The resources provided for the training were adequate to cover basic training in the selected trades but not enough to support the transition from training to employment/ self employment. The project provided funds for payment of training fees, stipend for transport and feeding. Though this is good, it is not sufficient. It is therefore recommended that other strategies like the economic empowerment of parents, and mobilisation of local resources to support the programme be taken into consideration in expanding the project. This may include linking parents to micro financial service providers to access support to improve upon their economic circumstances and thereby support their children.
- It is also worth considering the implementation of the project in the rural areas which is where the youth migrate from as another alternative. The justification is that most of the child labourers migrate from the rural areas. The implementation of the project in the rural areas will be a preventive measure which will also be cheaper and cost effective. Transportation costs and accommodation costs for trainees will be avoided.
- The initial funding for the expansion could come from the development partners (ILO). Funding should be faced such that the local authorities would contribute a percentage from their budget from the start, as sign of commitment. The quantum should progressively increase such that, by the end of the project, the local authorities assume full responsibility for funding to enhance ownership.
- The roles of National Steering Committees and the Core Technical Committee should be reconsidered. The NSC should be reactivated, their capacity should be built, and regular meetings should be held, and their involved in the monitoring and evaluation of project should be enhanced.
- To ensure marketability of trainees, arrangements should be made with well established firms to absorb them to polish up their skills.
- Identification and training of artisan training service providers should be preceded by the withdrawal of children and identifying trade areas. This will ensure that only needed artisans

are selected and trained. The artisans should be well trained in the use of curriculum for training which should become a culture in informal apprenticeship training.

- The identified good practices in this pilot should be incorporated into any future design.
- The gender tool developed should be incorporated in the design of the expanded programme.
- The age of children withdrawn as well as the length of training for vocational skills training should be taken into consideration before placement to ensure that on completion the child will be in the legal age for employment.
- Provision of health care for trainees should be taken into consideration to ensure that their health care needs are met during training. Trainees who fell sick during the training needed to be attended to.
- Networking with specialized government/ non governmental agencies to provide support was very useful in counseling and diverse support to the project. Effective coordination of all interventions taking place at local level is important because it maximizes resources mobilization, minimizes overlapping and avoids duplication of interventions.
- To avoid the gaps in the training time table, the training programmes that require trainees to sit the grade tests should be planned in such away that they match the programme of the grade tests administrators. This will avoid the time-gaps witnessed in this project where trainees finished their courses three months before the grade tests.
- There is need for this project to develop a tracking system for children who have been withdrawn and prevented from child labour through the skills training project. This is the only sure way to establish whether the initiative is paying off or not in terms of the impact. Tracer studies should therefore be conducted periodically by the responsible ministry.

ANNEXES

Table 1a . Findings on relevance of project (Ghana)

Subject	ILO Staff	Government	Social Partners (Employers and Workers Associations)	Implementing Partners	National Steering Committee	Beneficiary Children and Parents	Artisan Service Providers (Trainers)
<b>Relevance of Objectives</b>	Complementary to other Interventions Such as Capacity Building Programme, TBP, WACAP and LUTRENA	It is in line with Government policy on Employment and Skills Training (TVET &New Education Reforms and GPRSII	Relevant because it is a poverty reduction measure that meets our expectations and aspirations. It also complements other Child labour Interventions	Relevant because it provides skills and enhances employment	It is in line with government policy on employment and skills training (TVET &New Education Reforms	Very relevant because the children are being prepared for the future.	Useful because the children will get work to do and not involve in social vices
<b>Adequacy of Design</b>	The objectives, outputs and activities as well as indicators and means of verification are appropriately linked and clearly understood.	Objectives, outputs and activities as well as indicators and means of verification appropriately linked and clearly understood.	Problem Analysis and design good but limited time for implementation	Good but implementation time too short	Not Involved in design and implementation time too short.	Good but implementation time too short.	Implementation time too short. Cultural values not considered
<b>Relevance of Strategy</b>	Complementary to other child labour interventions	It is complementary to government policy on vocational skills training and poverty reduction	It is both preventive & curative measure for child labor interventions	It is relevant skills training program to create employment for the youth	Youth employment creation through skills training is a relevant strategy	Strategy is relevant because the children are getting skills that will make them employable	Relevant because it will take the youth off the street and prevent them from engaging in social vices.



**Table 1b:**

**Main findings on project design (Kenya)**

Item	ILO Staff	Government	Social Partners (Employers and Workers)	Implementing Agencies	Steering Committee	Beneficiaries (Children and parents)	Artisan service Providers
<p><b>Relevance of the project objectives</b></p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Related to the NPA to eliminate child labour</li> <li>• Key strategy in addressing the immediate needs in the country</li> <li>• Informal sector is the largest employer in the country</li> <li>• Took cognisance of the fact that the knowledge base on child labour issues is poor</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Efforts aimed at skills impacting</li> <li>• Channel for creation of more job opportunities</li> <li>• Objectives feed into the governments efforts on poverty reduction</li> <li>• Objectives relevant and related to national efforts to support the informal sector as an engine of growth</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Good basis for reaching out to the informal sector by both COTU and FKE</li> <li>• Related strongly to the Employment Act, a key point of reference for the two organisations</li> <li>• Objectives seen as a build up to efforts aimed at addressing child labour that were being carried out by COTU</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Objectives aimed at addressing issues similar to what Undugu Society of Kenya was doing</li> <li>• To KCJAA, project objectives were a pointer to the eventual recognition of the informal sector both as contributing to the fight against child labour, and in the training of Kenya's Human resource</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Steering committee draws membership from stakeholders in child labour issues</li> <li>• It is a gazetted structure, chaired by the permanent secretary in the Ministry of Labour, which houses the child labour department.</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Objectives provided alternatives for children in child labour and those that were vulnerable</li> <li>• Objectives aimed at improving the welfare at the household level.</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Objectives focused on the area of artisans concern</li> <li>• Assisted to improve their capacity and knowledge levels</li> </ul>

Table 1 c.

## Main findings on project design (Kenya)

Item	ILO Staff	Government	Social Partners (Employers and Workers)	Implementing Agencies	Steering Committee	Beneficiaries (Children and parents)	Artisan service Providers
<b>Adequacy of the Design</b>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Design was adequate for addressing the stated objectives</li> <li>Was logically linking inputs and outputs</li> <li>Needed to include a social component</li> <li>Required more funds for a more comprehensive approach</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>project designing was thorough and adequate</li> <li>Target coverage was narrow. There is need to target more people.</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Design was inclusive and comprehensive in approach.</li> <li>Inputs were adequate for stated objectives but too few for existing problems</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Allowed for participation of all stakeholders from the initial stages.</li> <li>There was much more that could not be accomplished due to shortage of financial resources</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Design was participatory and well thought of</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Beneficiaries were hoping that the design allowed them to further their training</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>The design was well done safe for the fact that the training fee given was way below the market rate</li> </ul>
<b>Relevance of the strategy</b>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Strategy was based on extensive consultations</li> <li>Strategy took cognisance of the need to build capacity of participating partners in their areas of operations</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Strategy was in line with country objectives of fighting urban poverty and creating employment through the informal sector.</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Gave opportunity for both FKE and COTU to gain entry to the informal sector, but failed to facilitate the process</li> <li>Touched on primary areas of concern for both organisations</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Strategy was in line with the implementing partners areas of operation</li> <li>Gave them an opportunity to build on their capacity.</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Strategy brought on board committee members</li> <li>Allowed for participation of organisations from different sectors</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Strategy came to fill the gaps that kept the target beneficiaries away from economic activities</li> <li>It took into consideration the unique nature of the beneficiary lifestyles</li> <li>Aimed at mainstreaming child labour issues in to policies</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Recognised their ability to train</li> <li>Aimed at addressing policies that affect their operations</li> <li>Aimed at improving their capacity in areas of operation</li> </ul>

Table 1d.

## Main findings on project design (Tanzania)

Item	ILO staff	Government	Special partners (employers and workers associations)	Implementing partners	Steering committees	Beneficiaries Children and parents	Artisan and service provider
<b>Relevance of project objectives</b>	Complements IPEC- TBP .	In line and support many policies & programmes -Tanzania development vision 2025, -NSGRP, -- NEP, -Sustainable Industrial development policy - National Youth Development policy -Child Development policy 1996 - Women and gender development policy	complementary project they are also involved in IPEC –TBP  Demand driven project	Raised awareness on child labour although they were formerly dealing with youths this was an eye opener to them.	-In line and support many policies & programmes -complementary project they are also involved in IPEC –TBP	-decent life assure livelihood & self esteem products	Recognizes the role of informal sector by providing it with entrepreneurial base.
<b>Adequacy of design</b>	Objective , output and indicators clear to the staff	Problems and stakeholders needs were adequately considered	- objective and output clear linked with MKUKUTA	-Staff turn over lost their track	objective and output clear	-Need for a further phase to improve competitive	-Limited facilities to absorb many children - no guarantor for apprentices
<b>Relevance of strategy</b>	-acting as a bridge between Child labour and youth decent employment	-Skill training intensive efforts of creating environment for self employment -withdrawal protection rights (safety) of children	-Job creation - availability of skilled labour in informal sector	Facilitated them to impart skills to withdrawn children	Implemented within MKUKUTA	given Children potential skills for their economic development -Life skills and occupational safety and health at work. -Emphasize practical training -enhance creativity, networking and group formation - A tool for behavioural change.	- capital and business skills - facilitated to the national exhibitions - increases skilled labour supply.



**International Programme on the Elimination of Child  
Labour**

**ILO/IPEC**

**Final version**

**Terms of Reference**

**For**

**Independent Final Evaluation of Regional Project for Skills Training Strategies to  
Combat WFCL in the Urban Informal Sector in Sub-Saharan Anglophone Africa**

ILO Project Code	RAF/04/P50/CAN
ILO Project Number	P.340.04.100.050
ILO Iris Code	12372
Country	Ghana, Kenya and Tanzania
Duration	41 months
Starting Date	August 2004
Ending Date	December 2007
Project Locations	National level and selected districts
Project Language	English
Executing Agency	ILO-IPEC
Financing Agency	Government of Canada
Donor contribution	US \$ 1,147,122

---

---

## I. Background and Justification

---

---

1. The International Programme on the Elimination of Child Labour (IPEC) is a technical cooperation programme of the International Labour Organization (ILO). The aim of IPEC is the progressive elimination of child labour, especially its worst forms. The political will and commitment of individual governments to address child labour – in cooperation with employers’ and workers’ organizations, non-governmental organizations and other relevant parties in society – is the basis for IPEC action. IPEC support at the country level is based on a phased, multi-sector strategy. This strategy includes strengthening national capacities to deal with this issue, legislation harmonization, improvement of the knowledge base, raising awareness on the negative consequences of child labour, promoting social mobilization against it, and implementing demonstrative direct action programmes (AP) to prevent children from child labour and to remove child workers from hazardous work and provide them and their families with appropriate alternatives.
2. The rapid growth of Sub-Saharan Africa’s urban population has contributed to an increase in urban poverty and a higher incidence of child labour, including its worst forms. The majority of migrants from rural to urban areas – including children – engage in informal economy activities where returns are low, job insecurity is high, labour standards are virtually not enforced and risks of exposure to hazards are substantial. However, the informal sector also provides potential possibilities for young people to learn skills and increase their income-earning opportunities. Governments have come to realize that the informal sector will be a permanent and highly significant element in their national economies and most of them have therefore engaged in strongly supportive policies towards the informal economy within their poverty reduction strategies.
3. Training for work in the informal economy has become an important issue of these policies, among others in Ghana, Kenya and Tanzania. In this context, Technical Vocational Education and Training (TVET) policies, including traditional apprenticeship training schemes, have been reviewed in order to adapt them to the needs of the informal economy. The idea behind this is that improving basic education and TVET facilities, as well as the access to those facilities by the poor population, are among the key strategies to assist people to “work themselves out of poverty” and, in connection to this, to combat child labour.
4. Key elements of the TVET reform include:
  - improving its relevance to the informal economy
  - making it more demand-driven
  - integrating business skills into technical skills training
  - reforming traditional apprenticeship training
5. From a gender perspective, many trades are dominated by male workers, due to traditional attitudes and behaviour among parents, consumers and society in general. Reforms of the TVET can bear the potential of providing girls with opportunities to enter into traditionally male-dominated trades. Next to gender mainstreaming and the training of girls in these trades, a powerful communications strategy is critical to overcome traditional attitudes and behaviour.
6. The participating countries take part in the Poverty Reduction Strategy Paper (PRSP) process launched by the IMF and the World Bank. The PRSPs constitute the global policy framework of the countries over the next few years. Making sure that an adequate

identification of the child labour problem and of proposed solutions at all subsequent stages of the PRSP process are taken into consideration is an important element of any proposed strategy to combat child labour. Combating worst forms of child labour through TVET is intimately linked to general sector policies as well as to global poverty reduction policies and strategies.

7. All the countries participating in the project – Ghana, Kenya and Tanzania – have ratified the ILO Convention No. 182 on the Worst Forms of Child Labour. In all three countries, there are ongoing projects of IPEC to support time-bound programmes or national plans of action for the elimination of the worst forms of child labour. These projects are:
  - “Support for the implementation of time-bound measures for the elimination of the worst forms of child labour in Ghana” (start: September 2004, planned end: January 2009)
  - “Supporting the national plan of action for the elimination of the worst forms of child labour in Kenya” (start: September 2004, planned end: September 2008)
  - “Support for the Time Bound Programme on the worst forms of child labour in Tanzania (Phase II)” (start: September 2005, planned end: December 2008)
8. IPEC started its project on “Skills training strategies to combat worst forms of child labour (WFCL) in the urban informal sector in sub-Saharan Anglophone Africa” in Ghana, Kenya and Tanzania in August 2004. The duration is scheduled to be 41 months so that the project will be completed on 31st December 2007. While the main focus of the project is on skills training and youth employment as a strategy to combat WFCL in the urban informal sector it also links to education as the key element in prevention of child labour. This project had decided to use the sub-regional approach as many of the worst forms of child labour are common to these countries and as the sub-regional approach has the advantage that resources and expertise can be pooled for meeting common needs in several countries.
9. The project interventions will include the implementation of pilot projects, the development of a more comprehensive, integrated skills training strategies for each of the countries and the development of a common informal sector skills training policy for the sub-region based on common problems, policy contexts and opportunities.
10. The Strategic Programme Impact Framework methodology was used to analyse a set of outcomes and to identify the causal links as a desk review exercise in HQ to prepare for the design of the programme. Three major objectives were identified in the course of stakeholder consultation and through the SPIF exercise:

**Immediate Objective 1: By the end of the project, global poverty reduction strategies and sector policies in each of the participating countries in the field of Technical and Vocational Education and Training (TVET) will include provisions to ensure access of children working in the urban informal economy to the planned services.**

**Immediate Objective 2: By the end of the project, at least 400 working children in the urban informal economy will be withdrawn from worst forms of child labour through non-formal low-cost skills training appropriate to their age. In addition, 250 children will be prevented from entering into worst forms of child labour in the urban informal economy through these same training services.**

**Immediate Objective 3: By the end of the project, a sound knowledge-base and generic tools on combating worst forms of child labour through non-formal low-cost skills training will have been developed.**

In order to reach these objectives, the project activities focus on the following components:

- Policy support
- Direct targeted action with working children and their environment
- Education and skills training
- Capacity building
- Building a knowledge base on combating the WFCL through non-formal low-cost skills training

#### **Decent Work Country Programme**

11. From the perspective of the ILO, the elimination of child labour is part of its work on standards and fundamental principles and rights at work. The fulfilment of these standards should guarantee **decent work** for all adults. In this sense the ILO provides technical assistance to its three constituents: government, workers and employers. This tripartite structure is the key characteristic of ILO cooperation and it is within this framework that the activities developed by the project should be analyzed.
12. ILO Decent Work Country Programmes (DWCPs) are being introduced in ILO to provide a mechanism through which to outline agreed upon priorities between the ILO and the national constituents partners within a broader UN and International development context. For further information please see <http://www.ilo.org/public/english/decent.htm>
13. The DWCP defines a corporate focus on priorities, operational strategies as well as a resource and implementation plan that complements and support partner plans for national decent work priorities. As such DWCP are broader frameworks to which the individual ILO project is linked and contributes to. DWCP are beginning to gradually be introduced in various countries. The DWCP documents for Ghana, Kenya and Tanzania are available on the ILO-Intranet website: (Please note that the DWCP documents for Ghana and Kenya are draft versions that are currently being appraised by ILO colleagues before finalisation.)  
[http://www.ilo.org/intranet/english/bureau/program/dwcp/download/dwcp\\_ghana.pdf](http://www.ilo.org/intranet/english/bureau/program/dwcp/download/dwcp_ghana.pdf)  
[http://www.ilo.org/intranet/english/bureau/program/dwcp/download/dwcp\\_kenya.pdf](http://www.ilo.org/intranet/english/bureau/program/dwcp/download/dwcp_kenya.pdf)  
[http://www.ilo.org/intranet/english/bureau/program/dwcp/download/dwcp\\_tanzania.pdf](http://www.ilo.org/intranet/english/bureau/program/dwcp/download/dwcp_tanzania.pdf)

#### **Background to Final Evaluation**

14. The project will be evaluated in accordance with ILO/IPEC policies and procedures on evaluation of projects and in line with the agreed evaluation process in the project document.
15. Action Programmes implemented by local partners are subject to a regular self-evaluation process depending on duration and size. Action Programmes supply regular progress reports to the project. Regular progress reports have been prepared by the project as a whole.
16. In ILO/IPEC evaluations of its projects are carried out to enhance organisational learning. As per IPEC procedures, a participatory consultation process on the nature and specific purposes of this evaluation was carried out three months prior to the scheduled date of the

evaluation. The present Terms of Reference are based on the outcome of this process and inputs received in the course of the consultative process.

---

---

## II. Scope and Purpose

---

---

### Scope

17. The evaluation will cover the IPEC project in Ghana, Kenya and Tanzania. The evaluation should **focus on all the activities that have been implemented since the start of the projects to the moment of the field visits.**
  
18. The scope of the present IPEC evaluation covers all project activities to date including Action Programmes. The evaluation should look at **the project as a whole** and address issues of project design, implementation, lessons learnt, replicability and give recommendations for future projects and ILO/IPEC in the area of education and skills training.

### Purpose

19. The primary purpose of the present evaluation should be to assess in how far the objectives of the project were achieved. The evaluation should assess the overall achievement of the project at different levels such as the policy level, organizational (partner) level, the level of beneficiaries, community level and household level. The evaluation should try to assess the effectiveness of the project operation/implementation and management both at the implementing agency level and at IPEC level. It should analyze strategies and models of intervention used, document lessons learned and potential good practices, and provide recommendations on how to integrate these into planning processes and implementation of future child labour interventions in the field of education and skills training. A particular focus should be on identifying elements of effective models of intervention including their potential use and their strengths and weaknesses.
  
20. Furthermore, one purpose of the evaluation is to assess the possibilities and desirability of extending the project activities beyond the planned ending date in December 2007 and to examine in which form this could possibly happen.

---

---

## III. Suggested Aspects to be Addressed

---

---

21. The evaluation should address the overall ILO evaluation concerns such as **relevance, effectiveness, efficiency** and **sustainability** as defined in the *ILO Guidelines for the Preparation of Independent Evaluations of ILO Programmes and Projects*. For gender concerns see: *ILO Guidelines for the Integration of Gender Issues into the Design, Monitoring and Evaluation of ILO Programmes and Projects, January 1995*.
  
22. In line with the results-based framework approach used by ILO-IPEC for identifying results at global, strategic and project level, the evaluation will focus on identifying and analysing results through addressing key questions related to the evaluation concerns and the achievement of Immediate Objectives of the project using data from the logical framework indicators.



23. The following are the broad suggested aspects that can be identified at this point for the evaluation to address. Other aspects can be added as identified by the evaluation team in accordance with the given purpose and in consultation with ILO/IPEC Geneva's Design, Evaluation and Documentation Section (DED). The evaluation instrument prepared by the evaluation team will indicate further selected specific aspects to be addressed. The evaluation instrument should identify the priority aspects to be addressed in the evaluation.
24. The evaluation should be carried out in adherence to the ILO Evaluation Framework and Strategy, the ILO-IPEC Guidelines and Notes, the UN System Evaluation Standards and Norms, and the OECD/DAC Evaluation Quality Standard.

### **List of Suggested Aspects to Address**

#### **25. Design and Planning**

- Assess whether the project design was logical and coherent and took into account the institutional arrangements, roles, capacity and commitment of stakeholders.
- Assess the internal logic (link between objectives achieved and implementation of activities) of the project and the external logic of the project (degree to which the project fits into existing mainstreaming activities that would impact on child labour).
- Were the linkages between inputs, activities, outputs and objectives clear and logical? Do the action programmes designed under the project provide clear linkages and complement each other regarding the project strategies and project components of the intervention? Specifically regarding:
  - Policy development and legislation
  - Direct support for withdrawal, prevention and rehabilitation
  - Awareness raising and social mobilization
  - Capacity building
  - Education and training
- Were the time frame for programme implementation and the sequencing of project activities logical and realistic?
- How useful were the research studies produced prior to the project for each participating country? In how far have they been taken into account during the design phase of the project?
- Were lessons learnt from past IPEC interventions in Ghana, Kenya and Tanzania or from past IPEC interventions on education and skills training incorporated into the project design?
- Analyze whether available information on the socio-economic, cultural and political situation in the project countries was taken into consideration at the time of the design and whether these were reflected in the design of the project.
- How well did the project design take into account existing capacity and local efforts already underway to address child labour and promote educational opportunities (including skills training) for targeted children?
- What was the benefit of designing this project as a regional project for Anglophone Africa (as opposed to conducting separate, country-based projects in Ghana, Kenya and

Tanzania)? To which degree has there been cooperation and coordination between the project activities in the different participating countries?

- Assess whether problems and needs of the beneficiaries were adequately analyzed during the design phase of the project and determine whether the needs, constraints, resources and access to project services of the different beneficiaries were clearly identified taking gender issues into concern.
- Have practical and strategic gender needs been adequately addressed in the project design? Was gender equality adequately promoted in the strategy?
- To what extent were external factors and assumptions identified at the time of design?
- Was the strategy for sustainability of impact defined clearly at the design stage of the project?
- How relevant were project indicators and means of verification? Please assess the usefulness of the indicators (including relevant breakdowns by sex, age, etc.) for monitoring and measuring results.
- Were the objectives of the project clear, realistic and likely to be achieved within the established time schedule and with the allocated resources (including human resources)?

#### **26. Achievements (Implementation and Effectiveness)**

- Examine the delivery of project outputs in terms of quality and quantity. Were they delivered in a timely manner?
- Assess whether the project has achieved its intended outputs at this time in project implementation and whether it will be possible to achieve its objectives.
- Assess the effectiveness of the action programmes implemented so far and their contribution to the immediate objectives of the project.
- Assess the efficiency of the project i.e. compare the allocated resources with results obtained. In general, did the results obtained justify the costs incurred?
- Assess the criteria for selecting beneficiaries for the project. Has the entire target population been reached?
- Assess the progress of the project's gender mainstreaming activities. Identify whether actions have been taken to ensure the access of girls/other vulnerable groups to services and resources.
- How effective is the project in raising awareness about child labour and in promoting social mobilization to address this issue?
- How effective has the project been in stimulating interest and participation in the project at the local and national level?
- Examine any networks that have been built between organizations and government agencies working to address child labour at the cross-country, national and local levels.
  - Who were the key stakeholders and what were their roles? How were they involved in the project?
- How are local management structures (e.g. National Steering Committees) working in each country? Assess the participation of different relevant actors in those structures (e.g. government ministries and departments; trade unions; employers' organizations; implementing agencies etc.)
- How are these structures participating in project implementation? How does this participation contribute to progress toward the project's objectives?

- Assess the results of the relationship between the NSC and the implementing agencies. What is their collaboration?
- Examine the capacity constraints of implementing agencies and the effect on the implementation of designed action programmes.
- To what extent do project staff, implementing agencies, and other stakeholders have a clear and common understanding of definitions used by IPEC for identifying a child as prevented or withdrawn from child labour?
- Which are the mechanisms in place for project monitoring? Please assess the use of work plans and project monitoring plans (PMPs), processes or systems.
- Assess the process for documenting, disseminating and replicating/up-scaling pilot projects.
- How did factors outside of the control of the project affect project implementation and project objectives and how did the project deal with these external factors?
- Identify unexpected and multiplier effects of the project.
- Analyse how IPEC activities in the context of the project and other IPEC projects in the participating countries coordinate with each other and with sub-regional initiatives (e.g. IPEC's support to time-bound programmes on the elimination of the worst forms of child labour in Tanzania and Ghana or IPEC's support to the national plan of action for the elimination of the worst forms of child labour in Kenya)? Are interventions complementary or competitive? Are there synergies of impact and resource sharing initiatives in place?
- Examine how the ILO/IPEC project has interacted with and possibly influenced national level policies, debates and institutions working on child labour.
- How successful has the project been in mainstreaming the issue of child labour into ongoing efforts in areas such as education and employment promotion, and in particular in the countries' poverty reduction strategies?
- Assess the influence of the project on national data collection and poverty monitoring or similar processes.

#### **27. Relevance of the Project**

- Examine whether the project responded to the real needs of the beneficiaries. Does the strategy address the different needs, roles, constraints and access to resources of the target groups?
- Assess whether the problems and needs that gave rise to the project still exists or have changed.
- Assess the appropriateness of the target groups and locations chosen to develop the project based on the findings of baseline surveys.
- How does the strategy used in this project fit in with national education and anti-poverty efforts, and interventions carried out by other organizations in Ghana, Kenya and Tanzania?
- Assess the validity of the project approach and strategy and their potential to be replicated.

## 28. Sustainability

- Assess to what extent a phase out strategy has been defined and planned and what steps are being taken to ensure sustainability. Assess whether this strategy has been articulated/explained to stakeholders.
- Assess what contributions the project has made in strengthening the capacity and knowledge of national stakeholders and to encourage ownership of the project among partners.
- Identify and assess the long-term commitment and the technical and financial capacity of local/national institutions (including governments) and the target groups to continue to work to eliminate child labour.
- Are there any plans or possibilities for having some tasks of the project taken over / been incorporated in the time-bound programmes / national plans of action on the worst forms of child labour in Ghana, Kenya, and Tanzania after the end of the project?
- Examine whether socio-cultural and gender aspects endanger the sustainability of the programme and assess whether actions have been taken to sensitize local institutions and target groups on these issues.
- Which are the possibilities of replicating all or a part of the project in a different location or at a bigger scale? Are there emerging good practices and models in terms of effectiveness, efficiency, sustainability and relevance that can be replicated by ILO/IPEC and other development partners?

## 29. Special Aspects to Be Addressed

- Assess the implications of a regional approach versus a national approach.
- Examine whether sharing of experiences between countries took place as had been envisioned in the project design.
- Examine whether the project was able to develop a common informal sector skills training policy for the sub-region based on the sharing of lessons, experiences and good practices.

## IV. Expected Outputs of the Evaluation

30. The expected outputs to be delivered by the evaluation team are:
- Desk review
  - Evaluation instrument prepared by the evaluation team reflecting the combination of tools and detailed instruments needed to address the range of selected aspects to address and considering the need for triangulation
  - Questionnaire to be used by all three country evaluations
  - Field visits to Ghana, Kenya and Tanzania
  - Draft evaluation report. The evaluation report should include findings from desk review and field visits by evaluation team
  - Final Report including:
    - ✓ Executive Summary with key findings, conclusions and recommendations
    - ✓ Clearly identified findings
    - ✓ Clearly identified conclusions and recommendations
    - ✓ Lessons learnt
    - ✓ Potential good practices and effective models of intervention.
    - ✓ Appropriate Annexes including present TORs

- ✓ Questionnaire on which the country evaluations are based
  - ✓ Standard evaluation instrument matrix
31. The total length of the report should be a maximum of 30 pages for the main report, excluding annexes; additional annexes can provide background and details on specific components of the project evaluated. The report should be sent as one complete document and the file size should not exceed 3 megabytes. Photos, if appropriate to be included, should be inserted using lower resolution to keep overall file size low.
  32. All drafts and final outputs, including supporting documents, analytical reports and raw data should be provided both in paper copy and in electronic version compatible for Word for Windows. Ownership of data from the evaluation rests jointly with ILO-IPEC and the consultants. The copyright of the evaluation report will rest exclusively with the ILO. Use of the data for publication and other presentations can only be made with the written agreement of ILO-IPEC. Key stakeholders can make appropriate use of the evaluation report in line with the original purpose and with appropriate acknowledgement.
  33. The final report will be circulated to key stakeholders for their review. Comments from stakeholders will be consolidated by the Design, Evaluation and Documentation Section (DED) of ILO/IPEC Geneva and provided to the team leader. In preparing the final report the team leader should consider these comments, incorporate as appropriate and provide a brief note explaining why any comments might not have been incorporated.

## V. Evaluation Methodology

34. The following is the proposed evaluation methodology. While the evaluation team can propose changes in the methodology, any such changes should be discussed with and approved by DED provided that the research and analysis suggests changes and provided that the indicated range of questions is addressed, the purpose maintained and the expected outputs produced at the required quality.
35. The evaluation team will be asked to include as part of the specific evaluation instrument to be developed, the **standard evaluation instruments** that ILO/IPEC has developed for documenting and analyzing achievements of the projects and contributions of the Action Programmes to the project.
36. The methodology for the evaluation should consider the multiple levels involved in this process: the framework and structure of the national efforts to eliminate the WFCL in Ghana, Kenya and Tanzania and IPEC's support to this process through this project. Data gathering and analysis tools should consider this methodological and practical distinction.
37. The evaluation will be carried out using a desk review of appropriate material, including the project documents, progress reports, outputs of the project and action programmes, results of any internal planning process in Ghana, Kenya and Tanzania and relevant materials from secondary sources. At the end of the desk review period, the evaluation team leader will draw up a questionnaire to be used by all three country evaluations for data collection.

38. The evaluation team will moreover prepare a brief document indicating the methodological approach to the evaluation in the form of the evaluation instrument, to be discussed and approved by DED prior to the commencement of the field mission
39. The evaluation will be carried out using a desk review, field visits to selected representative project locations in Ghana, Kenya and Tanzania to interview project staff and project partners, beneficiary girls and boys and other key stakeholders based on the questionnaire prepared by the evaluation team leader.
40. The evaluation team leader will interview the donor representative and ILO/IPEC HQ and regional backstopping officials through a conference call early in the evaluation process, preferably during the desk review phase.

### **Composition of the evaluation team**

41. The evaluation will be carried out by a national evaluation consultant (team leader) that previously has not been involved in the project and two national consultants (evaluation team members). The evaluator is responsible for drafting and finalizing the evaluation report. The evaluation team leader will have the final responsibility during the evaluation process and the outcomes of the evaluation, including the quality of the report and compliance with deadlines.
42. The background of the **evaluation team leader** (national consultant) should include:
  - Relevant background in social and/or economic development.
  - Experience in the design, management and evaluation of development projects, in particular with policy level work, institution building and local development projects.
  - Experience in evaluations in the UN system or other international context as team leader
  - Relevant regional experience preferably prior working experience in Ghana, Kenya and/or Tanzania
  - Experience in the area of children's and child labour issues and rights-based approaches in a normative framework are highly appreciated.
  - Experience at policy level and in the area of education and legal issues would also be appreciated.
  - Experience in the UN system or similar international development experience including preferably international and national development frameworks in particular PRSP and UNDAF.
  - Familiarity with and knowledge of specific thematic areas.
  - Fluency in English.
43. The evaluation team leader will be responsible for undertaking a **desk review** of the project files and documents, draw up a questionnaire and undertake **field visits** to the project locations in one of the project countries. The evaluation team members will also undertake a desk review and field visits, each one in one country.
44. The evaluation consultants will be responsible for **drafting** the respective parts of the evaluation report. Upon feedback from stakeholders to the draft report, the team leader will be responsible for **finalizing** the report **incorporating** any comments deemed appropriate.

45. The evaluation will be carried out with the technical support of the IPEC-DED section and with the logistical support of the project offices in Accra, Dar Es Salaam and Nairobi with the administrative support of the ILO HQ in Geneva. DED will be responsible for consolidating the comments of stakeholders and submitting it to the team leader.
46. It is expected that the evaluation team will work to the highest evaluation standards and codes of conduct and follow the **UN evaluation standards and norms**.

### Timetable and Workshop Schedule

47. The total duration of the evaluation process including submission of the final report should be within two months from the end of the field mission.
48. The evaluation team leader will be engaged for 25 work days and the two other evaluation team members will be engaged for 10 days. Out of these, 5 days will be in country in Ghana, Kenya and Tanzania respectively (each evaluator in one country). The timetable is as follows.

Phase	Responsible Person	Tasks	Duration and Dates
I	Team leader          Evaluation team members	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>○ Telephone briefing with IPEC DED</li> <li>○ Desk Review of project related documents</li> <li>○ Preparation of questionnaire based on desk review</li>   <li>○ Desk Review of project related documents</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>○ 15 -19 October 2007 (5 work days for evaluation team leader)</li>   <li>(? work days for evaluation team members)</li> </ul>
II	Evaluation team with logistical support by project	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>○ In-country to Ghana, Kenya and Tanzania for consultations with project staff</li> <li>○ Data gathering based on questionnaire</li> <li>○ Consultations with project staff /management</li> <li>○ Field visits</li> <li>○ Consultations with girls and boys, parents and other beneficiaries</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>○ 22 -26 October 2007 (5 work days)</li> </ul>
III	Evaluation team (leader plus members)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>○ Draft different parts of report for each country, based on consultations from field visits and desk review in evaluators' home countries</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>○ 29 October – 2 November 2007 (5 work days)</li> </ul>
IV	Evaluation team leader	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>○ Synthesize the three country-specific parts in order to prepare one overall evaluation report</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>○ 5 – 9 November (5 work days)</li> </ul>
V	DED	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>○ Circulate draft report to key stakeholders</li> <li>○ Consolidate comments of stakeholders and send to team leader</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>○ Ca. 2 weeks</li> </ul>
VI	Evaluation team leader	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>○ Finalize the report including explanations on why comments were not included</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>○ One week in December (5 work days)</li> </ul>
TOTAL WORK DAYS			<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>○ TOTAL WORK DAYS</li> <li>○ 25 days for evaluation team leader</li> <li>○ 10 days for the two other evaluation team members</li> </ul>

## Sources of Information and Consultations/Meetings

Available at HQ and to be supplied by DED	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Project document</li> <li>• DED Guidelines and ILO guidelines</li> </ul>
Available in project office and to be supplied by project management	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Progress reports/Status reports</li> <li>• Technical and financial reports of partner agencies</li> <li>• Direct beneficiary record system</li> <li>• Good practices and Lessons learnt report (from TPR)</li> <li>• Other studies and research undertaken</li> <li>• Action Programme Summary Outlines Project files</li> <li>• National workshop proceedings or summaries</li> <li>• GPRS</li> <li>• Any other documents</li> </ul>

Consultations with:

- Project management and staff
- ILO/HQ and regional backstopping officials
- Partner agencies
- Social partners Employers' and Workers' groups
- Boys and Girls
- Community members
- Parents of boys and girls
- Teachers, government representatives, legal authorities etc as identified by evaluation team
- National Steering Committee

### Final Report Submission Procedure

49. For independent evaluations, the following procedure is used:
- The evaluator will submit a draft report to **IPEC DED in Geneva**
  - IPEC DED will forward a copy to **key stakeholders** for comments on factual issues and for clarifications
  - **IPEC DED** will consolidate the comments and send these to the **evaluator** by date agreed between DED and the evaluator or as soon as the comments are received from stakeholders.
  - The final report is submitted to IPEC DED who will then officially forward it to stakeholders, including the donor.

## VI. Resources and Management

### Resources

50. The resources required for this evaluation are:
- For the evaluation team leader:
    - Fees for a national consultant for 25 work days



- Fees for local DSA in project locations per field visit schedule (5 days) and in accordance with ILO regulations and rules.
- For the evaluation team members
  - Fees for each national consultant for 10 days
  - Fees for local DSA in project locations per field visit schedule (5 days) and in accordance with ILO regulations and rules.
- For the evaluation exercise as a whole:
  - Fees for local travel in-country
  - Any other miscellaneous costs.
  - A detailed budget is available separately.

### **Management**

51. The evaluation team will report to IPEC DED in headquarters and should discuss any technical and methodological matters with DED should issues arise. IPEC project officials in Accra, Dar Es Salaam and Nairobi will provide logistical support and the ILO HQ in Geneva will provide administrative support during the evaluation mission.

**- DRAFT -**

**Final Evaluation of Regional Project for Skills Training Strategies to Combat  
WFCL in Urban Informal Sector in Sub-Saharan Anglophone Africa**

**Question Guide For Data Collection**

**Design and Planning.**

*IPEC Staff*

- What was the project planning and design process like? Was it participatory (including stakeholders and beneficiaries) and does it reflect country priorities?
- What roles were played by all stakeholders in the design of the project?
- Were the needs of stakeholders taken into account in the design?
- Is the project design logical and coherent, taking into account the institutional arrangements, roles, capacities and commitments of stakeholders?
- To what extent is the project linked to other child labour interventions?
- What are the inputs, activities, outputs and objectives? And are the linkages between inputs, activities, outputs and objectives clear and logical?
- Are the action programmes designed under the project linked to
  - o Policy development and legislation?
  - o Direct support to withdrawal, prevention and rehabilitation?
  - o Awareness raising and social mobilisation
  - o Capacity building and
  - o Education and training
- Are there any Policy support measures developed by Government for vocational Training in the informal sector?
- What direct action programmes were implemented?
- What education and skills training programmes initiated as part of the implementation of the project
- What capacity building programmes were implemented as part of the project
- What low-cost non-formal skills training projects were implemented
- Is there a common understanding of what constitute vocational skills training under the project?
- What was the timeframe for programme implementation and sequencing of activities? Are they logical and realistic

- How useful was the research carried out prior to the project? Was it used in the design of the project?
- To what extent were available information on socio-economic, cultural and political situation taken into consideration in the design of the project?
- To what extent have the three countries cooperated (networked) in the implementation of the project?
- To what extent was gender considerations taken into account in the design of the project?
- Has the project design identified direct beneficiaries of the outcomes of the project?
- Has the design included the preparation of a monitoring and evaluation plan including the indicators and mile stones?

*Government , Social Partners,Implementing Agencies and beneficiaries*

- To what extent have you as IPEC partner participated in the design of the project?
- what was the project planning and design process like? Was it participatory (including stakeholders and beneficiaries) and does it reflect country priorities?
- What roles were played by all stake holders in the design of the project?
- Were your needs as stakeholders taken into account in the design?
- Is the project design logical and coherent, taking into account the institutional arrangements roles, capacities and commitments of stakeholders?
- To what extent is the project linked to other child labour interventions?
- What are the inputs, activities, outputs and objectives? And are the linkages between inputs, activities, outputs and objectives clear and logical?
- Is the project design feasible/realistic for achieving the objectives?
- Are the action programmes designed under the project linked to
  - o Policy development and legislation?
  - o Direct support to withdrawal, prevention and rehabilitation?
  - o Awareness raising and social mobilisation
  - o Capacity building and
  - o Education and training
- Are there any Policy support measures developed by Government for vocational Training in the informal sector?
- What direct action programmes were implemented?
- What education and skills training programmes initiated as part of the implementation of the project?
- What capacity building programmes were implemented for you as part of the project?
- What low-cost non-formal skills training projects were implemented
- Is there a common understanding of what constitute vocational skills training under the project?
- What was the timeframe for programme implementation and sequencing of activities? Are they logical and realistic?
- How useful was the research carried out prior to the project? Was it used in the design of the project?
- To what extent were available information on socio-economic, cultural and political situation taken into consideration in the design of the project?
- To what extent has the three countries cooperated (networking) in the implementation of the project?
- To what extent was gender considerations taken into account in the design of the project?

- Has the design included the preparation of a monitoring and evaluation plan including the indicators and mile stones?

### **Project Implementation (Achievements /Implementation Efficiency,and Effectiveness)**

#### ***IPEC Staff, Government and Social Partners,***

- What are your experiences in terms of the efficiency and effectiveness in the implementation of action plans?
- To what extent were the objectives and outputs of the project spelt out in the logframe met?
- How will you assess the implementation in terms of,
  - o coordination and information sharing with other IPEC projects in the country in terms of synergy and
  - o information sharing with the other two participating countries?
- Was the delivery of project outputs by implementing partners in terms of quality and quantity timely?
- How adequate in terms of output and the resources allocated?
- Has the project achieved its intended output? and to what extent?
- Does the results justify the cost incurred?
- Was there any delay and what are the reasons and the consequences? How were these addressed?
- What are the capacity constraints of implementing partners?
- How did it affect the implementation of designed action programmes?
- What is your level of satisfaction of the performance of implementing partners? What explanation can you give for the differences in the level of performance?
- What role did the ILO's tripartite partners including the steering committee play in the implementation? How effective were the child labour units,
- Has the project generated interest among stakeholders in participating in the project at the local and regional level?
- Who are the stakeholders and what are their roles? And how were they involved in the project?
- How effective was the steering committee members (Government, trade unions and employers organisation)in performing their roles?
- What were the main problems in the development and implementation of Action Programmes
- To what extent is gender mainstreaming taken into account in project implementation?
- Was the project effective in raising awareness on child labour and in promoting social mobilisation to address the issue?
- What networks were built between organisations and government agencies on child labour issues?
- Were there monitoring and evaluation mechanisms in place? How useful/effective were they?
- How useful were the workplans in monitoring?
- Were there any mechanisms for documenting , replicating and up-scaling the project?
- Were there any external factors that affected progress in project implementation? and How were these problems solved?
- What are the synergies in project implementation in relation to other IPEC programmes such as the Time-bound Programme in terms of resource sharing etc.

- Were these initiatives complementary or competitive?
- What is the level of interaction of ILO/IPEC projects in influencing national policies, debates and institutions working on child labour/
- How useful has the project been in mainstreaming child labour issues in areas such as education and employment promotion and poverty reduction strategies
- Has the project influenced national data collection and poverty monitoring?
- How successful has the project been in mainstreaming child labour issues into government poverty reduction strategies?

***Implementing Agencies and beneficiaries***

- What action programme did you implement?
- What is the level of implementation? Completed or not if not why)
- How many children were withdrawn?
- How many children were prevented?
- Were there any drop outs?
- What were the reasons
- disaggregate data on number of beneficiary children by gender
- What awareness creation, education and skills training programmes were implemented?
- What were your major challenges in the implementation of the action programme?
- How can these challenges be addressed.
- What networks were built between organisations and government agencies on child labour issues?
- Were there any major changes or delays in the implementation of action programmes? If so what were the reasons and consequences?
- how can dalays be reduced and delivery rate increased?
- How satisfactory is the level of involvement and commitment of government and other agencies?
- If not satisfactory, How can the situation be improved?
- How do you rate the level of support of IPEC project coordinators in the development and implementation of action programmes?
- If not satisfactory what are your suggestions?
- Were there any dificulties in the development and approval of action programmes
- Were there monitoring and evaluation mechanisms in place? How useful/effective were they?
- How useful were the workplans in monitoring?
- Were there any mechanisms for documenting , replicating and up-scaling the project?
- 
- Were there any external factors that affected progress in project implementation and how were these problems solved?
- To what extent were the objectives and outputs of the project spelt out in the logframe met?

**Beneficiary Parents and children**

How did you come into this project?

Which skill area were you/your child trained?

How useful was the training?

Has she/he completed the training?

Have you (child) completed the training?

If the training is not completed, why? What was the problem?

How do you think this problem could have been solved?

Were there any challenges in the training project?

What support did you provide as a parent?

Would you recommend that the training be expanded to other beneficiaries (parents and their children)

Give reasons for recommending the expansion of the project

**Artisan Training Service Providers (Master craft persons)**

What service did you provide to the project?

What preparation did you go through before the start of your service provision (training)?

Give a breakdown of the number of children you have trained by sex?

What challenges did you face?

How were these challenges addressed?

What recommendations will you give if this programme is expanded to cover more beneficiaries?

**Relevance of the Project**

*IPEC Staff, Government, Social Partners, Implementing Agencies and Beneficiaries*

- Was the project relevant to the needs of the country?
- Why do you say so?
- How relevant?
- Does the need which gave rise to the project still exist? Explain?
- How useful were the various action programmes implemented. (use list of action programmes) in addressing the needs of the country?
- How relevant is the project to the needs of stakeholders?
- Does the strategy used in the project fit into the national educational and poverty reduction efforts?
- Are the interventions carried out by implementing partners useful? How useful are they?
- How valid is the project approach?
- Would you recommend the extension of the project beyond the pilot?
- Give reasons

**Lessons Learnt**

*IPEC Staff, Government, Social Partners, Implementing Agencies and Beneficiaries*

- Are there any lessons learnt?
- Are there any Policy support measures developed by Government for Vocational Training in the informal sector?
- What are the major challenges?
- How were they resolved?
- Are there any good practices? And were they documented?
- How can they be replicated?

## **Identified potential Good Practices**

What are the potential good practices identified in this Project?

- Document good practices by  
Government ,  
  
Social Partners,  
  
Implementing Agencies and beneficiaries
- What are the strengths and weaknesses of the good practices?

## **Sustainability**

*IPEC Staff, Government , social Partners and Implementing Agencies*

- Are there any sustainability measures in place?
- What are these measures?
- How effective do you think they are?
- What contributions has the project made in strengthening the capacity of stakeholders (*Government , social Partners and Implementing Agencies*) in terms of knowledge base to encourage ownership?
- What is the level of commitment, technical and financial capacity of partners including government to continue programmes on the elimination of the WFCL.
- Are there any plans or possibilities for a take over/ continuation or incorporation of all or some aspects of the project into the time-bound project?
- Does the socio-cultural and gender conditions endanger the sustainability of the project or otherwise?
- Are local institutions sensitised well enough on the project?
- Are there possibilities of replicating all or part of the project in different locations or on a bigger scale?
- What good practices have you identified in terms of efficiency, effectiveness, sustainability and relevance? Can they be replicated by ILO/IPEC or other partners? Mention them and how it could be done.

## **Recommendations**

Document recommendations according to :  
Government ,  
Social Partners,  
Implementing Agencies and  
beneficiaries

## **NOTE FOR NATIONAL CONSULTANTS:**

### **1. Cross tabulate the findings on the following issues across stakeholders IPEC Staff, Government, Organised Labour, Employers Association, implementing partners and beneficiaries as a means of triangulating findings**

- *Relevance*
- *Effectiveness of implementation strategies and action plans*
- *Sustainability*
- *Identified good practices*
- *Implementation and Efficiency and Effectiveness*

### **2. Please provide list of interviewees.**

### **3. Note on Evaluation Methodology**

In terms of the methodology, the evaluation adopts a participatory approach for data collection by employing a combination of semi structured interviews with key informants, implementing agencies and IPEC project staff, focus group discussions as well as individual interviews with beneficiaries and preparatory desk reviews. The later will include the analysis of relevant project documents, technical progress reports, status reports as well as evaluation reports of earlier national child labour programmes. Interviews will also be held with government officials, social partner representatives and other stakeholders to examine their opinion on project partners and IPEC constituents. The perspective of stakeholders on the planning process adopted in the project preparation and implementation will also be examined..

On the basis of the interviews, desk reviews and conclusion of the national workshops, consultants will prepare a draft evaluation report as a major output. Based on ILO evaluation methodologies, the structure of the report will reflect the suggestions contained in the TOR and address general evaluation criteria such as relevance, effectiveness, efficiency and sustainability and gender considerations. It will also include an assessment of the quality of project design and its implementation performance, achievement of objectives and outputs. The report will also include good practices identified and the conditions for their replicability. The report should follow the reporting format in the TOR.

.





**Main findings, on the quality of project implementation and management. (Stakeholder views)(Ghana)**

<b>Subject</b>	<b>ILO Staff</b>	<b>Government</b>	<b>Social Partners (Employers &amp; workers)</b>	<b>Implementing Partners</b>	<b>Steering Committee</b>	<b>Beneficiary Children and parents</b>	<b>Artisan Service providers</b>
Effectiveness	Objectives being achieved but implementation time is inadequate	Objectives being achieved but implementation time is inadequate	Objectives being achieved but implementation time is inadequate	Objectives being achieved but implementation time is inadequate	Objectives being achieved but implementation time is inadequate	Objectives being achieved but implementation time is inadequate	Objectives being achieved but implementation time is inadequate
Efficiency	Cost sharing problems in the use of facilities at ILO offices	Fairly Satisfactory	Fairly Satisfactory. Limited involvement	Not satisfied with Financial /reporting system, management and release of funds	Weak participation. Limited (non permanency of members)and Not very Active	-	Inadequacy of funding
Management	Cost sharing problems in the use of facilities at ILO offices	Satisfactory	Satisfactory. But limited involvement	Not satisfied with Financial /reporting system, management and release of funds	Weak Participation. Limited (non permanency of members)and Not very Active	-	Inadequacy of funding to meet requirements of training
Organisational implementation capacity	Not adequate human resource capacity for implementation (shared responsibility)	Capacity exists but not fully utilized	Capacity exists but not fully utilized	Capacity still being built	Limited capacity due to non permanency of members and Not very Active	Capacity is limited and still Being built	Capacity is limited and still Being built
Usefulness of SPIF and Planning workshops	Very useful	Very useful	Very useful	Limited Involvement but useful	Very useful	Not involved	Limited Involvement but useful

**ANNEX 6**

**Main findings on the quality of project implementation (Kenya)**

<b>Subject</b>	<b>ILO staff</b>	<b>Government</b>	<b>Social Partners</b>	<b>Implementing partners</b>	<b>Steering Committee</b>	<b>Beneficiaries</b>	<b>Artisan service providers</b>
<b>Effectiveness</b>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Quality of out put was good</li> <li>• There is always room for improvement</li> <li>• Education on social issues and social support would have added value to the training</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Project achieved its intended goals</li> <li>• Awareness levels have evidently improved</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Would have been better if workers and employers unions were facilitated to reach out to the informal sector</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• The project achieved more than was envisaged</li> <li>• Project leaves more hopeful people</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Committee through the taskforce was satisfied with the quality of output</li> <li>• Work plans were realistic and adequately achieved</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Beneficiary parents noted that the can see changes in their activities that were supported and lots of hopes for their children, some of whom were already earning</li> <li>• Beneficiary children were confident that they could stand on their own. Many would not mind more training</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• The project has greatly improved their capacities and knowledge levels</li> <li>• They made sure trainees did not leave the workshop before gaining adequate skills even if it was after the contracted period.</li> </ul>
<b>Efficiency</b>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Outputs were delivered on time</li> <li>• Slight delays resulted from a few logistical problems</li> <li>• Savings in resource utilisation resulted in over achievement of some outputs</li> <li>• Social support would perhaps have made the training better</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Outputs were delivered on time</li> <li>• Task force efficiently oversaw the project</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Task force ensured timely and quality outputs</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Resources could not allow much to be achieved</li> <li>• Organisations had to chip in from their own resources</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Resources could not match the expectations, but sound management led to achievement of the goals</li> <li>• ILO/IPEC was timely is funds disbursement</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Parents were happy with the training and the speed at which the support reached them</li> <li>• The training was very helpful and equipping.</li> <li>• Need to consider social support in the future</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Disbursement of funds was timely</li> <li>• Financial resources were in adequate, and below the market rate</li> <li>• Besides skills training they also taught the trainees on other social issues that affect their day to day life.</li> </ul>

### Main findings on the quality of project implementation (Kenya)

Subject	ILO staff	Government	Social Partners	Implementing partners	Steering Committee	Beneficiaries	Artisan service providers
<b>Management</b>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Project managed by a committee of experts (Task force)</li> <li>Quarterly reports played a key role.</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Managed was participatory involving people from the private, government and the civil society</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Many stakeholders were well represented through out the process.</li> <li>Need to find ways to bring in more people on board.</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Used exiting structures or formed project implementation committees</li> <li>Project was soundly managed</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Committee of Experts (Taskforce) ensured sound management of the project</li> <li>Information sharing among the IA made implementation faster</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>They had a chance to choose what they wanted to train in</li> <li>Relationship with trainers was cordial</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>The project was well managed by the respective agencies and ILO/IPEC</li> </ul>
<b>Organisational Implementation Capacity</b>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>I.A had the capacity, required</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>All the stakeholders involved had the capacity given their areas of operation</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Organisations involved were not new in the field. They had prior experience</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Each organisation had the capacity required to implement their areas under the AP</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>There were no doubts on the capacity of the implementing organisations to deliver.</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Trainers are experts in their work</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Artisans selected to train the children were those with adequate experience</li> </ul>
<b>Usefulness of the SPIF and Planning workshops</b>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>SPIF was very important in design and establishing causal effect in the different variables</li> <li>Planning workshops to get feed back and lean more ideas</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>SPIF methodology developed the initial design</li> <li>Workshops used to share and validate the design</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Methodology used to develop the project proposal</li> <li>Workshops were a forum to study the proposal and give input on it</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Planning workshops gave us an opportunity to study and input on the planning process</li> <li>They were also very informative</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>SPIF methodology developed the design of this project</li> <li>Workshops used to validate the design, including the objectives</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Workshops informed them of what to expect and gave children an opportunity to choose the course they wanted</li> <li>For parents the workshop taught them business skills and saving methods</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Workshops were used to share with them the strategy</li> </ul>

## Findings on Stakeholders view on Quality of Project achievements (Ghana)

Subject	ILO Staff	Government	Social Partners (Employers & workers)	Implementing Partners	Steering Committee	Beneficiary Children and parents	Artisan Service providers
Achievement of project in relation to the objectives and indicators	All three immediate objectives are being satisfactorily achieved, though training is still in progress.	All three immediate objectives are being satisfactorily achieved, though training is still in progress.	Objectives are being achieved. There is room for improvement. NSC will have to be strengthened.	Objective of withdrawing and training children is being achieved. The problem of dropout should be addressed.	Objectives are being achieved	We are being equipped with skills	Objective of training being achieved. Training Logistical problems to be addressed.
Contribution to policy development on TVET/ country PRSP policy in relation to skills training and mainstreaming	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Child Labour mainstreamed in the GPRS</li> <li>New educational policy on apprenticeship developed.</li> <li>TVET policy on apprenticeship in place.</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Child Labour mainstreamed in the GPRS</li> <li>Informal sector Skills training part of the GPRS</li> <li>New educational policy on apprenticeship developed.</li> <li>TVET policy on apprenticeship in place.</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Informal sector Skills training part of the GPRS</li> <li>New educational policy on apprenticeship developed.</li> <li>TVET policy on apprenticeship in place.</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Very happy with government policy and commitment to apprenticeship training in the informal sector</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Informal sector Skills training part of the GPRS</li> <li>New educational policy on apprenticeship developed</li> <li>TVET policy on apprenticeship in place.</li> </ul>	Government focus on training our children is very good	Very happy Government has recognised our work and is involving us in training the youth.
Project contribution to capacity building	Implementing Partners, NSC, and Social Partners, capacity enhanced. Beneficiary children empowered, Gender tool developed	Policy makers' capacity enhanced, and children empowered.	Capacity on child labour elimination strategies increased.	Capacity /skills on child labour elimination strategies increased.	Capacity /skills on child labour elimination strategies	Children have acquired skills to make them employable.	Knowledge base to deal with child labourers increased.

## Findings on Stakeholders view on Quality of Project achievements (Ghana)

Subject	ILO Staff	Government	Social Partners (Employers & workers)	Implementing Partners	Steering Committee	Beneficiary Children and parents	Artisan Service providers
Project contribution to networking, awareness raising, linkages with to other child labour interventions	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>networks established government, and other project partner</li> <li>Collaboration with TBP and other ILO projects useful</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Collaboration with the informal sector and NGOs has helped enhance government, informal sector and NGO/ civil society relationship.</li> <li>Networking among stakeholders useful</li> </ul>	Project linkage with informal sector very useful for the capacity building and the development of the very important sector.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Our collaboration with government departments and agencies in counselling and placement of children</li> <li>Partnership with artisans useful.</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Inter sectoral collaboration in dealing with child labour very useful.</li> <li>Development of curriculum through collaborative effort very useful</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Awareness on dangers of child labour increased.</li> <li>Visit to other trainees has reinforced the children interest in the training</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Project has taught us how to handle child labourer</li> <li>We are now aware on the need to have curriculum for training</li> </ul>
Sustainability	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Apprenticeship training part of New Educational Policy</li> <li>Curriculum developed</li> <li>Support systems Networks established</li> <li>Linkage with TBP</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>As a result of Govt. Policy review, apprenticeship training is now part of New Educational Policy</li> <li>Curriculum developed on apprenticeship</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>A lot of goodwill and support exist from social partners</li> <li>There is the need for support for</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Establish of community child labour monitoring committees,</li> <li>Strategy of children selecting</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Need for capacity building of NSC.</li> <li>Longer time required for effective training</li> </ul>	Enhancing opportunities for self employment for trainees	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Good will exist for support.</li> <li>Government partnership with informal sector very welcome.</li> </ul>

## Findings on Stakeholders view on Quality of Project achievements (Ghana)

Subject	ILO Staff	Government	Social Partners (Employers & workers)	Implementing Partners	Steering Committee	Beneficiary Children and parents	Artisan Service providers
Sustainability	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Awareness created for social mobilisation</li> <li>TVET policy supportive of apprenticeship training</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Project in support of GPRSII</li> <li>Support systems and Networks established</li> <li>Awareness created for social mobilisation will help sustain programme</li> </ul>	Parents to enhance their economic capacity to support children.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>their own trainers</li> <li>Received adequate training on handling child labourers</li> <li>Need for start up capital to set up trained children</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Enhancing the role of other government department to support the training process</li> <li>Need for start up capital for trainees</li> </ul>		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Support for development of standards in training and product.</li> <li>Need for the provision of adequate financial resources and equipment for training</li> </ul>
Challenges/problems to be addressed	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Short coming design and implementation have to be addressed</li> <li>Training period too short</li> <li>Inadequate financial resources</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Short coming design and implementation have to be addressed</li> <li>Training period too short</li> <li>Inadequate financial resources</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Local resource mobilisation to support training</li> <li>Training period too short</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>inadequate budgetary support</li> <li>Prompt release of funds.</li> <li>Cumbersome financial reporting procedures</li> <li>Local resource mobilisation to support training</li> <li>Training period too short</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Sustaining membership of NSC and building capacity of members</li> <li>Enhancing economic capacity of parents of withdraw children</li> <li>Local resource mobilisation to support training</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Start up capital for children</li> <li>Our Economic capacity to support training</li> <li>Training period too short.</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Supporting us to acquire equipments.</li> <li>Supporting us through training to use curriculum and how to handle child labourers</li> <li>Start up capital for trained children</li> <li>Local resource mobilisation to support training</li> <li>Inadequate financial resources for training</li> </ul>

## ANNEX 8 a

### Findings on Stakeholders view on Quality of Project Achievements (Kenya)

Subject	ILO staff	Government	Social Partners	Implementing Partners	Steering Committee	Beneficiaries	Artisan Service providers
<b>Achievements of project in relation to objectives and indicators</b>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Project has done very well sometimes surpassing the immediate objectives</li> <li>There is much more to be done</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Set objectives are being achieved as per the set indicators</li> <li>Slight delays occasioned from logistical hitches</li> <li>There is need for more actions</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Set objectives were adequately achieved</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Objectives have been satisfactorily met, but much more needs to be done</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Project has achieved more than was planned, there is much more that needs to be done to meet the development objective</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Project has assisted them a lot.</li> <li>More children need to be reached</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>The project did very well given the limited resources</li> </ul>
<b>Contribution to policy development of TVET country PRSP in relation to skills training and mainstreaming</b>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Project has led to important policy reviews such as the MSE bill</li> <li>Training in the informal sector in targeted areas moved to another level</li> <li>Training and business support will improve family well fare</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Project led to massive social mobilisation and awareness creation on child labour</li> <li>MSE Bill was reviewed to include child labour issues</li> <li>Project directly contributing to poverty reduction in the household</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Project was a good effort towards reaching out to the informal sector</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Project was a recognition that the informal sector can also train artisans</li> <li>Major breakthrough in highlighting the need for gender equality in the informal sector</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Project triggered interests from policy makers on the need to mainstream child labour issues in informal sector</li> <li>Informal sector needs support given that it's the largest employer</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>To children, this gave them an opportunity to decently earn a living</li> <li>To the parents the project improved earnings and general well being of the family</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>With this project there is need for stronger linkages between the informal sector and the formal training programmes.</li> </ul>



## ANNEX 8 b

### Findings on Stakeholders view on Quality of Project Achievements (Kenya)

Subject	ILO staff	Government	Social Partners	Implementing Partners	Steering Committee	Beneficiaries	Artisan Service providers
<b>Project contribution to capacity building</b>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Stakeholders are more informed about child labour issues</li> <li>Artisans trained on pedagogical skills</li> <li>Children empowered to earn decent living</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Policy makers and civil servants in line ministries well informed about child labour</li> <li>Children who did not have skills now have skills to help them earn</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Project improved the capacity of workers and Juu-Kali associations to train and manage projects</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Have acquired experience in project design, implementing and documenting</li> <li>Linked them with other social partners (networks)</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Members gained experience in overseeing development project</li> <li>Members of the committee more informed on child labour issues</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Children have acquired life long skills</li> <li>Parents are earning more incomes from their businesses</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Training skills were improved</li> <li>Gave recognition to individual workshops</li> </ul>
<b>Project contribution to networking, awareness raising and linkages to other child labour interventions</b>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Different networks were established with donors, government, local leaders etc</li> <li>Strongly linked to the TBP and the skills training projects by ILO, Undugu and others</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Triggered interests in sister ministries such as Ministry of Home Affairs</li> <li>Strengthened the links with the private sector and specifically the informal sector</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Has opened up linkages with the informal sector</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Has linked us to other players and leaders</li> <li>Other stakeholders more aware of potential in the informal sector</li> <li>Our members and staff more informed on child labour issues.</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Offered an opportunity for interaction and exchange of ideas by the different members of the committee</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Project has created awareness on the hazards of child labour and that there are viable options</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Project has improved our skills on how to handle children in the informal sector</li> </ul>

## ANNEX 8 d

### Findings on Stakeholders view on Quality of Project Achievements (Kenya)

Subject	ILO staff	Government	Social Partners	Implementing Partners	Steering Committee	Beneficiaries	Artisan Service providers
<b>Sustainability</b>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Training manuals were a step towards sustaining the efforts</li> <li>• Policy reviews will result to mainstreaming of child labour issues in the informal sector</li> <li>• Start-up capital to some children will enable them start of on their own.</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Policy reviews are good in ensuring sustainability</li> <li>• There is need for a clear plan of action after the pilot.</li> <li>• Awareness created will sustain social mobilisation for action against of child labour</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• There is need to elaborate plans to assist the children establish themselves after the training</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Some of the trainees have or will be absorbed into the workshops</li> <li>• Need to mobilise more funds to assist the many who are out there</li> <li>• Support to beneficiaries will assist to improve the family welfare and prevent others children from falling into labour.</li> <li>• Need to start-up a revolving fund in order to assist more children</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Start up capital is important but was not available for all</li> <li>• Need to outline the role of Ministry of Labour and Human Resources Development and the Ministry of Trade on who has the mandate</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Would not mind more support to start up or build their businesses</li> <li>• Children would want further training to make them more competitive</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Start up capital is important</li> <li>• Need more time to make them more equipped</li> </ul>
<b>Challenges/problems faced</b>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Writing of work plans was problematic</li> <li>• The quality of reporting was weak at the beginning</li> <li>• Resources were inadequate</li> <li>• Lacked standard instruments for monitoring</li> <li>• Convincing government to support such children.</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• There are so many other children who would benefit from such support</li> <li>• Funds were however very limited</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Its challenging to gain entry into the informal sector, where actors are not well organised</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Poverty problem that made guardians and parents not to fully meet their obligations</li> <li>• Fee paid to trainers was below market rate</li> <li>• Proposal development was a challenge to some</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Members turnover</li> <li>• Non attendance by some key stakeholders</li> <li>• Members doubled up as implementing agencies</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Girls had problems fitting in male dominated trades</li> <li>• Stigmatisation of the girls in initial stages</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• High illiteracy and ignorance levels on some who dropped out of school long ago</li> <li>• Absenteeism</li> <li>• Loss and or damage of tools</li> </ul>

**ANNEX 9: Findings on Stakeholders view on Quality of Project Achievements (Tanzania)**

<b>Subject</b>	<b>ILO staff</b>	<b>Government</b>	<b>Special partners (employers and workers associations)</b>	<b>Implementing partners</b>	<b>Steering committees</b>
<b>Achievements of project in relation to objectives and indicators</b>	The objectives and expected outputs were achieved	- outputs realized - operationalized policies	- outputs realized -gender mainstreaming facilitated	- Output realized - children programmes adopted	- The objectives and expected outputs were achieved
<b>Contribution to policy development on TVET country PRSP policy in relation to skills training and mainstreaming</b>	Operationalized available policies and identified a gap of informal sector TVET	Operationalized available policies and identified a gap of informal sector TVET	-	-	Operationalized available policies and identified a gap of informal sector TVET
<b>Project contribution to capacity building</b>	Increased Experience and knowledge through exchange of ideas	- increased Knowledge level of staff involved	-business management skills and occupational health knowledge	Gender mainstreaming	Increased project management skills.
<b>Project contribution to networking awareness raising linkages with other labour interventions</b>	Exchange of information between three countries	Linked to IPEC and informal apprenticeship	Associations and networks formed	Linked with other VET in implementation of skill training	Formed a link between The project and government policies
<b>Sustainability</b>	Linked to TBP	Existing Structures were used to implement the project	Skills acquired	Experience gained and willingness to retain trained children	The NSC of TPB and the institutions related to child labour programmes
<b>Challenges / Problems to be addressed</b>	Timeframe short Problem still rampant	- policy and legislations on age, informal sector	Problem still rampant	Exist of trainees not well established	Problem still rampant Time frame short