

WORKPLACE EDUCATION PROGRAMME ON HIV/AIDS AND THE WORLD OF WORK

EXECUTED BY THE INTERNATIONAL LABOUR OFFICE

**FINANCED BY THE UNITED STATES
DEPARTMENT OF LABOR (USDOL)**

INDEPENDENT EXTERNAL FINAL EVALUATION

9 - 13 OCTOBER 2006, Togo



Cover painting by Dr. Akaya, NPC Togo with authorization of the author. The painting is in the NPC's office in Lomé.

By: Christian BUGNION, Director Subur Consulting S.L., Team Leader



Dr. John K.D. Agbodjavou, National Consultant

Accompanied and supported by Josée Laporte: ILO/AIDS Geneva

First draft report: 28 October 2006

Final revised report: 8 January 2007

Observations: The content of this report reflects the opinions of the evaluation team and not necessarily those of the ILO.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	<i>page</i>
Foreword	3
Executive Summary	5
List of Acronyms	8
I. Background & project description	9
II. Purpose of the final evaluation	10
III. Final evaluation methodology	11
IV. Project status	12
V. Findings, conclusions and recommendations	14
VI. Lessons learned	29
VII. Summary of potential areas for further investigations and implications for the global strategies	30
Annexes	
1. TOR	
2. List of interviews	
3. Bibliography	
4. Presentation of preliminary findings to PAB	
5. Interview protocols	

FOREWORD

This foreword has been added after receiving comments from USDOL and does not exist in the original report.

Point 1: Sustainability

USDOL comments make reference to the fact that some of the findings and recommendations regarding sustainability are not consistent. This issue needs to be clearly explained. The report indicates that a definition of “sustainability” was not given either in the project document or in any other technical document. ILO uses the Development Co-operation Directorate (DAC) definition of sustainability: “the continuation of benefits from a development intervention after major development assistance has been completed. The probability of continued long-term benefits. The resilience to risk of the net benefit flow over time.”¹

As sustainability is interpreted differently by different people, USDOL and ILO must be aware of this weakness and must provide the corresponding technical inputs from the beginning of the project, to ensure consistency and coherence in understanding and project implementation from all stakeholders. In Togo and Benin, sustainability was essentially perceived as a search for additional funding for a continuation of the project or its activities, something which does not match the DAC definition. Therefore according to the understanding of the NPC and the PAB the issue of sustainability was essentially related to funding. In Togo the political history and limited access to external funding meant that this was obviously a major issue.

In addition according to the latest DAC evaluation guidelines of 2006, “because sustainability is concerned with what happens after development activities are completed they are measured ideally some years afterwards. It is difficult to provide a reliable assessment while activities are still underway, or immediately afterwards”².

As mentioned in the report and as supported by all key informants interviewed including the NPC, three years to implement Behaviour Change Communication (BCC), is certainly not enough time and therefore the project life cycle was originally too short to reach its stated objectives within the defined time-frame.

As a result the interpretation that sustainability was a fund-raising exercise to obtain additional funding in both countries (Togo and Benin), cannot be considered as a mistake since no clear definition was given as to what sustainability was in the context of this project. More technical support and local capacity building would have been necessary. The problem is not in the term “sustainability plan” but in the definition of its contents.

¹ ILO Evaluation Guidance, Planning and Managing Project Evaluations, draft, April 2006, p. 15.

² Ministry of Foreign Affairs of Denmark, Evaluation Guidelines, November 2006, p. 54

Point 2. Conclusions and recommendations

The evaluation places special focus on *constructive positive change*, in line with the core values and methodology of Subur Consulting S.L. which can be viewed on Subur's website www.suburconsulting.org

In line with this approach we do not believe that every finding needs a conclusion or a recommendation. It is widely accepted in the evaluation world and documented in many evaluation manuals that recommendations have to be few and targeted. A recommendation is a difficult exercise which requires sufficient contextual, technical and cultural knowledge and expertise as well as a knowledge of the constraints of the project to be valid and useful. As a result, the evaluation report contains conclusions and recommendations and, where and when necessary and essentially as a means to add value, it has not sought to bring out a conclusion or recommendation³ on every single point mentioned under findings.

Point 3. Finalization of the evaluation report.

While it was foreseen that all consolidated comments would be sent in a timely fashion to the evaluator, only ILO's comments were received on time and incorporated in a first final report of 2 December 2006. However subsequently USDOL comments and comments from the two project countries were received. In order to address these additional comments as requested by ILO, three additional days were necessary, particularly given the existence of two versions of the evaluation report, one in English (translated by the ILO's services) and the original report written in French. As a result some reconciliation between the reports also proved necessary to ensure consistency, hence three unforeseen additional days of work.

The evaluator has no responsibility for the wording of the English version of the report except for the executive summary, which was originally written in both English and French.

³ In line with the view that recommendations should be feasible, realistic and targeted in order to be applicable.

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

« *Everybody has a craving for this project* » Katari Foli-Bazi, Togo Minister of Labour,
9 October 2006

1. The evaluation mission

This report covers an independent and external evaluation of the HIV/AIDS Workplace Education Programme which took place from 9 to 13 October 2006 in Togo. The evaluation mission was made up of an international external evaluator with substantial evaluation expertise (some forty evaluations) including three ILO evaluations (as team leader), who was recruited by ILO Geneva; as well as a national evaluator and medical expert on HIV/AIDS recruited locally. The mission also received the support and participation of Josée Laporte, from the ILO/AIDS programme in Geneva, as observer and resource-person from 11 October 2006.

The purpose of the final evaluation as defined in the enclosed terms of reference is to:

- a) determine if the project has achieved its stated objectives and explain why/why not;
- b) assess the impact of the project in terms of sustained improvements achieved;
- c) document best practices that could be used as models for activities in other projects; and
- d) recommend to the ILO, donors, and national stakeholders the next steps to ensure the sustainability and future effectiveness of project interventions.

2. Relevance of the project strategy and objectives

All key informants, both tripartite constituents and workers in their workplace, have confirmed the relevance of the project strategy and the approach followed. At national level and for the first time, the strategy has led the state, employers and workers to discuss at the same table the issue of HIV/AIDS in the workplace. The strategy has led the tripartite constituents to:

- Take note of the importance and the need to have a specific programme regarding HIV/AIDS in the workplace, rather than considering it as alien to the company,
- Sign a tripartite declaration on 28 July 2004 on this specific subject,
- Influence the text of the new law promulgated in 2005 in order to include workers' protection at their workplace,
- Work jointly to recognize and incorporate this aspect in the new national strategic framework 2006 – 2010 which is currently being finalized.

Within partner companies, the strategy was also seen as very good given that:

- It filled a gap. HIV/AIDS problems did exist, but no one knew how to include this problem at the workplace – and therefore there was no company policy or other relevant framework,

- It also raised awareness of the importance and need for a specific HIV/AIDS education programme in the workplace of all partner companies, involving all staff from the managers to the casual workers,
- It led to the development of policies and action programmes within the enterprises, and gave sufficient flexibility to be adapted to each company's specific needs despite the difference amongst sectors and companies (mining, hotels, and brewery). A group of workers from the informal economy (garages in the Lomé area) also benefited from an HIV/AIDS programme.

The interviews confirm the validity of the strategy even in the current context, three years after the project was launched. There is a clear need and demand for extending the project in the country.

3. Project management and implementation

Project management and implementation are proceeding correctly. The NPC is closely following his plan of action, and the Project Advisory Board (PAB) includes a number of champions who support the project with genuine interest and enthusiasm. It needs to be said that key informants mentioned the NPC's capacity for persuasion and his dynamism as one of the fundamental factors which contribute to the project's success. The NPC had no trouble accessing and discussing directly with the general directors of the partner companies, being aware that the best policy is the one that has the commitment and support of the general director. Sensitization and education on HIV/AIDS has therefore been carried out from the general director's level down to the workers' level, encompassing all the intermediate levels of the hierarchy.

The only difficulty has been some delay in administrative and financial arrangements. The project staff has been trained in administrative and financial regulations, but only in July 2006. However it is anticipated that there will be no further problems in the future. According to the UNDP administrative officer, a change in procedures and workload in addition to the training provided to project staff, should avoid further problems.

4. Impact on project beneficiaries

Direct project beneficiaries, e.g. workers and partner companies as described in the strategic framework, have clearly had a positive reaction to the introduction of this project in partner companies and in the informal sector. However substantial time was necessary to establish the structures (Joint Committees or JCs), train workers and develop a specific policy and plan of action in the partner companies. This, coupled with a slow start to the project for reasons identified in the internal mid-term evaluation, indicates that only a few months have passed since the peer educators have been trained. However it did not keep the JCs from carrying on with their plans of action and already undertaking a number of activities. Nonetheless it may be too early to speak of impact at this stage, although the results from the impact survey do show an important quantifiable, positive change in knowledge, attitude and behaviour. Although the positive change has equally

taken place in the informal sector, it is more difficult to appraise to what degree this has happened.

5. Results and achievements

The evaluation recognizes that the project has reached practically all of the objectives mentioned in the strategic framework. Details by objective and sub-objective are developed in the body of the report. But the project has also obtained some results which are not directly covered by the strategic framework, or in the Performance Monitoring Plan (PMP), although these results have enhanced the support from the State administration. Furthermore, a strong demand and a yearning for an extension of the project from other sectors has been felt. The NPC has a list of 34 other companies from different sectors which show the interest that the project has raised.

6. “Best” practices⁴

The project has been showing a number of good practices at the various levels of the project cycle, which has enhanced its achievements. These good practices range from the nomination by ministerial decree of the PAB members to the inclusion of worker’s protection at their workplace in the new law promulgated in 2005. Examples of good practices are detailed in the body of the report.

7. Sustainability and recommendations

The project has foreseen from the beginning a sustainability plan. The mid-term evaluation had already identified the efforts undertaken, which have since been increased. A sustainability workshop was held in August 2006 which led to a number of recommendations endorsed by the PAB, including the creation of a Project Sustainability Committee (PSC). Despite all efforts, at the time the present evaluation is being undertaken, there is no additional funding to ensure the continuation of the project or part of the project activities. Therefore in the final two months priority must be given to ensuring the continuation of the project, as it is too early to cease the activities and expect the tripartite constituents to ensure the continuation of the project activities. Although some of the activities, particularly those undertaken within partner companies, may be able to continue beyond the end date of the project, it is strongly recommended that the project continues for a new period in order to consolidate its achievements.

8. Conclusions

The ILO/USDOL HIV/AIDS Workplace Education Project in Togo represents a model for the inclusion of the HIV/AIDS problem at the workplace. There is no doubt that the project fills a need. The quality of the project strategy, the intelligence with which the project was elaborated and implemented, as well as the quality of the relationships with

⁴ The term “best” has been kept at the request of USDOL as part of the organizational vocabulary used. However the consultant does not endorse the term “best” which is normative and narrow. In French only “good” practices is used. There is an on-going debate in the evaluation world regarding this issue.

| project partners₂ are just some of the factors which are likely to raise this project to the level of standard-bearer for ILO activities in this country.

LIST OF ACRONYMS

AIDS	Acquired immunodeficiency syndrome
ART	Antiretroviral therapy
ARV	Antiretroviral
BCC	Behavior change communication
CBO	Community-based organization
CCM	Country Coordinating Mechanism (of the GFATM)
CGCT	Confédération Générale des Cadres du Togo (workers' organization)
CNLS	National AIDS Council
CNP	National Employer's Council (organization of employers)
DAC	Development Co-operation Directorate of the Organization for Economic Co-operation and Development (OECD)
FOTOBE	Fondation Togolaise pour le Bien-être (NGO)
GFATM	Global Fund to Fight AIDS, Tuberculosis and Malaria
HIV	Human Immunodeficiency virus
ILAB	International Labor Affairs Bureau (USDOL)
ILO	International Labour Organization
MSI	Management System International
NGO	Non-governmental organization
NPC	National Project Coordinator
PAB	Project Advisory Board
PLWHA	Persons living with HIV and AIDS
PNLS	National AIDS Programme
PMP	Performance Monitoring Plan
STD	Sexually Transmissible Disease
TOR	Terms of reference
TPR	Technical Progress Reports
UNAIDS	United Nations Joint Programme on HIV/AIDS
UNDP	United Nations Development Programme
USAID	United States Agency for International Development
USDOL	United States Department of Labor

I. BACKGROUND AND PROJECT DESCRIPTION

1. Country background

According to the report on the review of the national strategic framework to combat HIV/AIDS/STD 2001-2005 published in June 2006, the prevalence of HIV in the sexually active population of Togo averaged 4.7% in 2003 and 4.5% in 2004. Due to lack of financial resources, the Sentinel surveillance could not be implemented in 2001, 2002 and 2005. Moreover, these figures are an average and mask big differences between regions, with a prevalence of almost 7% in the maritime region, while in the savannahs, the prevalence is only slightly over 2%. Among sex workers in Lomé and the surrounding area, the prevalence fell from 54% in 2003 to 45% in 2005, while the prevalence among clients remains high at 13%, three times higher than the sexually active population. It is also almost twice as high among clients aged over 30 years (23.6%).

Nationally, Togo established a national plan to combat AIDS (PNLS) which covered the period 2001-2005. A new strategic framework was prepared for the period 2006-2010 with the involvement of all the stakeholders and should be launched officially by the end of the year. National efforts are coordinated through the National Council for the Prevention of AIDS (CNLS), chaired by the Head of State and with the Prime Minister and Minister of Health as co-vice chairmen. A permanent secretariat is responsible for the functioning of the CNLS and implementation and monitoring of its decisions.

Various stakeholders are represented in the CNLS, including all government ministers, civil society, people living with HIV/AIDS, the private sector and the National Programme for the Prevention of AIDS, which is the sectoral programme of the Ministry of Health.

In addition, the UN Theme Group on HIV/AIDS provides coordination between United Nations agencies and the authorities and bilateral partners. It should be noted that the problem of HIV/AIDS in the workplace was not included in the old national strategic framework, but has been included in the preparation of the new national framework 2006-2010 thanks to the efforts of the project. Indeed, the project raised awareness among government leaders and the stakeholders, so that the inclusion of the workplace is one of the key elements in the fight against HIV/AIDS in this new national strategic framework.

2. Recent information concerning the project

Since the internal assessment a year ago in September 2005, the project has maintained a high level of activity and new achievements documented in the ensuing technical and monitoring reports. Among the principal results, it is worth noting the on-going training - especially of labour inspectors, the impact Knowledge Attitude and Practices (KAP) study in August 2006 on behaviour change in the project partners (eight partners including two mining companies, one of them at two sites, three hotels, one brewery and

a group of workers from the informal sector employed by garages located in Lomé) which confirms that the project's objectives have been achieved. The results are included in the last technical report submitted by the project. A sustainability workshop was held in August 2006 to find ways of maintaining the stakeholders' dynamism, extending the project activities to other sectors of the economy, and finding the funds necessary for that purpose.

II. PURPOSE OF THE FINAL EVALUATION

In accordance with the terms of reference which are annexed to this report, the purpose of the final evaluation is to:

- a) determine if the project has achieved its stated objectives and explain why/why not,
- b) assess the impact of the project in terms of sustained improvements achieved,
- c) document good practices that could be used as models for activities in other projects; and,
- d) recommend to the ILO, donors, and national stakeholders the next steps needed to ensure the sustainability and future effectiveness of project interventions.

The final evaluation will:

1. Evaluate the validity of the project strategy,
2. Evaluate the quality and impact of project activities on the target groups, including:
 - a. Needs assessments process and reports and their use by the project and its stakeholders,
 - b. Accomplishments and effectiveness of Project Advisory Board (PAB) with respect to promotion of HIV/AIDS policies,
 - c. Employer and worker understanding of HIV/AIDS at the targeted enterprises,
 - d. Effectiveness of the BCC model, ease of use by enterprise trainers, impact of the peer educator training,
 - e. Stakeholder understanding and capacity to address HIV/AIDS in the workplace through workshops and other mediums,
 - f. Quality and use of the materials developed by the project and partner NGOs (who trained the peer educators),
 - g. Scope, content and effectiveness of outreach campaigns conducted to promote HIV/AIDS workplace education and BCC policies.
3. Evaluate the current management structure of the project, including the adequacy of ILO's supporting services both in Geneva and in the region, its staff and the services it has provided.
4. Evaluate the project's sustainability plan. Are project activities/ improvements likely to be sustained after project completion, and by whom?
5. Evaluate the linkages between the project and the Ministry of Labour and the CNLS.

6. Evaluate the value of the project in the context of other HIV/AIDS activities in Togo. Has the project been able to link with other activities? Are there overlaps or duplication of effort?
7. Assess whether the monitoring system for collecting performance data is appropriate for systematically measuring impact of project performance. Are there sufficient staff to collect the data and is the data reliable? Are there sufficient resources allocated for consultants.
8. Assess whether the project addressed issues highlighted by the mid-term assessment.
9. Assess level of stakeholder commitment to the project (NGOs, the Togolese Government, trade unions, workers, enterprises, the ILO, the US Embassy).
10. Assess the relationship between the ILO National Project Coordinators in Togo and Family Health International, NGOs providing training for the BCC.
11. Determine how effective implementation of activities has been as a result of the strategic framework.
12. Assess the sectors targeted for assistance. Why were they chosen? Was the project able to meet the needs of the different sectors effectively?
13. How has the project been able to link with other projects implemented in the country by the ILO?
14. Assess the effectiveness of the project in fostering the tripartite constituents' involvement and in promoting social dialogue.
15. Assess whether and how the project approach and its results have been extended or replicated.
16. Assess how the choice of partners has been strategic in implementing the strategy.
17. Evaluate how the project has addressed gender dimensions.

III. FINAL EVALUATION METHODOLOGY

In accordance with point VI of the terms of reference, the evaluation team used a multi-criteria method which includes:

- a) a review of the relevant documents provided by ILO and the project, a complete list of which is annexed to the evaluation report;
- b) pre-trip consultations with ILO experts in Geneva and with USDOL experts by telephone;
- c) individual and group meetings with key informants and peer educators in the field, in accordance with interview checklists as annexed and interview agendas prepared by the NPC at the request of the ILO in accordance with the evaluation methodology;
- d) observation in the workplace.

The analytical framework relating to the various persons interviewed is as follows:

Number and selection of key informants interviewed by the team								
Who	<i>Government</i>	<i>Donor</i>	<i>NGO</i>	<i>Trade unions</i>	<i>Employ-ers</i>	<i>UN Agencies</i>	<i>Peer educators</i>	<i>ILO</i>
Level	Politician and expert minister managers inspector	U.S. Ambassador	FOTOBE Espoir vie La grâce	CGCT	CNP	UNAIDS + UNDP	CIMTOGO IFG-K ASPAT-CL Sarakawa	NPC + assist.
Questions	Per interview checklist – see annex						Per checklist, see annex	Per TOR
Preparation of the trip								
Who	<i>USDOL-ILAB</i>	Conference call			<i>ILO/GE</i>	Meetings in Geneva		

In all, 19 interviews were held, 16 individual and 3 group interviews, with 32 key informants, as follows: 6 tripartite constituents, 6 members of the PAB, 3 NGOs, 3 companies (CIMTOGO, IFG-K and the Sarakawa Hotel) involving 9 people (5 peer educators and 4 advisory committee members), plus representatives of the partner from the informal sector (ASPAT-CL) with 4 informants – of which 3 peer educators- plus 4 focal points in workplaces. (6+6+3+9+4+4=32)

The average length of the interviews was 50 minutes, but longer for the three group meetings in the partner enterprises. In all, the evaluation team conducted a minimum of 1000 minutes or over 16 hours of interviews.

Feedback was presented to the PAB and NPC on the last day of the trip. The presentation is annexed to this report, together with the checklists for the meetings with key informants and peer educators.

The evaluation team consisted of two people: an independent international evaluator with long experience in evaluation (40 carried out) and experience of three evaluations of ILO projects financed by USDOL, but without previous experience in Togo or evaluation of an HIV/AIDS project. The second person is a national consultant, an expert in HIV/AIDS with the necessary technical, background and cultural knowledge. The evaluation trip was supported by Josée Laporte, an ILO/AIDS staff member, from 11 to 13 October as observer and resource-person.

IV. PROJECT STATUS

The project started operations in February 2004, six months later than the planned start date of July 2003 shown in the Project Document. As was identified in the mid-term evaluation, “delays in recruitment held up the start of project activities which had an ambitious objective, namely to coordinate the stakeholders in the field in a country where the ILO is not present on the ground”. Since the mid-term internal evaluation in September 2005, the project has maintained dynamic progress in delivering the activities set out in its action plan.

As the project was conceived in three separate stages, the action plan for the period September 2005 – October 2006 includes the activities of both the second and third stages. In the case of the second stage, these activities were essentially as follows:

- Training of trainers of peer educators, in November 2005;
- Training of peer educators, from January to March 2006;
- Training of labour inspectors;
- Ongoing advocacy vis-à-vis various actors and stakeholders to raise awareness of the problem of HIV/AIDS in the workplace;
- Monitoring of implementation of the activities by the joint committees and activities of peer educators in enterprises;
- Development/production of promotional and educational material (gadgets, T-shirts,...);
- Promotion of the new national policy and legal framework as regards to HIV/AIDS and the world of work (dissemination of the tripartite declaration and the HIV/AIDS law of 2005);
- Continuation of radio and television broadcasts by the NPC and launch of a newspaper with the NGO FOTOBE.

As regards training, the three-day course for the 17 trainers of peer educators from 21 to 23 November 2003 covered:

Partner	Mines	Hotel/brewery	Informal	NGO	Total
names	Cimtogo 3 IFG-K 3 IFG-H 3	Sarakawa 1 2 Février 3 Brewery 2	ASPAT-CL (garage owners) 1	FOTOBE 1	
Total trainers	9	6	1	1	17

For the training of peer educators from January to March 2006, the number of staff trained as peer educators during three days plus two days in the work place supervised by the NGO FOTOBE is as follows:

Partner	Mines	Hotel/brewery	Informal	Total
Names	IFG-H 42 IFG-K 38 Cimtogo 28	Sarakawa 24 Ibis 10 2 Février 29 Brewery 29	ASPAT-CL 29	
Total peer educators	108	92	29	229

The activities in the workplace to create and support the joint workplace committees in the target groups took place as planned in the programme.

The last stage of the project had three main pillars:

- Preparation and implementation of the second quantitative impact KAP survey (August 2006) of a sample of 391 workers, 52 of them in the informal sector. The total number of workers in the 8 target partner enterprises is 4,271. The survey

thus covered a sample of 9.1 per cent. The results of the survey were shared with the evaluation team;

- A sustainability workshop to analyse with the PAB the options for continuing the project, which it was unanimously agreed by the members (August 2006) needed to be extended, and formation of a project sustainability committee (PSC);
- Preparation of the final evaluation and lessons learned for the workshop planned for October 2006 in Cotonou.

Almost all the planned activities, therefore, were carried out or should be completed by December 2006. The planned activities which could not be implemented were those relating to the integration of teaching about the HIV problem in the programmes of vocational training schools. In general, these activities fall into the realm of sustainability and sustainability strategies. It should be noted that despite efforts to ensure the sustainability of the project, at the time of the final evaluation, no additional funds are assured for the project. The NPC and the PAB members therefore need to work together to find alternative financing with the technical support of the ILO.

V. FINDINGS, CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS⁵

1. The project strategy

Findings

The project strategy was judged to be excellent by the key informants interviewed. This is based on:

- a) a strong technical and conceptual approach, with important supports (such as the strategic framework, the Performance Monitoring Plan (PMP) developed with the support of Management Systems International (MSI), the work plan, etc.) which give the strategy a sound base;
- b) knowledge of and adaptation to the specific context of Togo, with an open and participatory methodology which allowed the stakeholders to take ownership of the strategy, while leaving room for it to be adapted within each enterprise as appropriate;
- c) realistic targeting of beneficiaries, taking into account the innovative and pilot nature of the project and the limited budget.

This, then, is one of the project's strengths. It should also be recalled that the project strategy led to discussions and agreements with the tripartite constituents, which is a first in Togo, since never before this project did the tripartite constituents meet round a table to discuss the problem of HIV/AIDS in the workplace. It is thus a pioneering strategy for Togo in the fight against HIV/AIDS in the workplace. This strategy has helped to raise collective awareness at all levels (State, trade unions, employers, workplace).

Conclusions

⁵ Not every point has a corresponding conclusion and/or recommendation, as mentioned in the foreword

The project strategy remains valid in the present context. However there is a strong demand from government authorities, trade unions and, indeed, employers to extend the strategy to many other sectors of activity. While this project targeted eight pilot enterprises with an aggregated workforce of 4,271 workers, the NPC received requests from 34 other enterprises in the formal sector, which shows the interest and possibility of considerable cover of all the sectors by replicating the project strategy with other stakeholders.

Recommendations

In the absence of financing to continue the project or its activities three months before it ends, it is difficult to make recommendations, as their applicability depends on the level of resources available. However, the validity of the strategy and the approach adopted by the project suggest that, if possible, it should extend its activities to a larger number of sectors of activity including other groups in the informal economy. This will enable the project's achievements to be consolidated and a better assessment made of its real sustainable impact.

2. *Quality and impact of project activities on the target groups*

Many activities were carried out during the life of the project. Essentially, these include:

- Awareness raising, mobilization and advocacy
- Guidance/training on the HIV/AIDS problem in the world of work
- Preparation of HIV/AIDS policies and action plans
- Preparation of BCC strategies and documents
- Training of trainers
- Training of peer educators
- Qualitative and quantitative studies
- Monitoring and evaluation

The quality of all these activities was judged good to very good by the workers interviewed, whether they were peer educators, trainers of peer educators or focal points. The evaluation team met the enterprises which were the most committed to the project, thus the best examples. It seems that the commitment of workers and their taking ownership of the project, are directly linked to the visible results achieved in a short space of time within enterprises, thanks to the training and support provided by the project, as well as the joint workplace committees' own activities within each company.

In terms of impact, it must be borne in mind that the peer educators were only trained in 2006⁶. It is thus too soon to speak of a sustainable impact. Nevertheless, the interviews in four enterprises (Cimtogo: 3 workers, comprising 1 focal point, 1 peer educator

⁶ Comment from the ILO HIV/AIDS programme: "The joint committees have been in place since the very beginning (end of 2004) and have played a key role in developing the policy and programmes which are a pre-requisite to the peer education training. Peer education is only one means of implementing the workplace policy and programme".

trainer and 1 peer educator; IFG-K 9 workers, 4 of them joint workplace committee members, 2 peer educator trainers, 2 peer educators and 1 coordinator; Sarakawa – 1 peer educator in an individual interview and several informal meetings with 5 workers; informal sector interview with 3 members of ASPAT-CL, all peer educators, and the representative of the chamber of trades, focal point for the group of workers from the informal sector) show that the project has contributed visibly to a change in knowledge, attitudes and behaviour.

Among the examples given, in two enterprises, people are no longer afraid to eat in the canteen with people suspected of being HIV-positive, whereas before the project, such people were largely shunned by their colleagues. There have been other changes too, concerning the willingness to undertake voluntary confidential counselling and testing. In one enterprise, everyone was counselled and tested during the project period. In another, a peer educator talked openly of his HIV positive status with his colleagues. It seems that people affected by HIV/AIDS were the victims of considerable stigmatization related to the lack of knowledge of channels of transmission. When the workers understood the risks better and learned how to manage them, the marginalization of HIV-positive workers was greatly reduced. This is also picked up in the KAP study (from 78% acceptance of sero-positive workers in the baseline survey to 89% in the current survey).

In addition to the target group of workers, the project persuaded members of the PAB, and thus representatives of various government ministries, trade unions and employers on the PAB, of the need and justification for a National Tripartite Consensus Statement on HIV/AIDS in the workplace.

Conclusions

The quality of the activities is seen as very good. Training is one of the highlights together with the visibility of the results in the short term. The changes in knowledge, attitudes and behaviour observed and documented show positive results. However, it is not yet possible to determine if these changes are sustainable or merely temporary.

Recommendations

In order to evaluate the sustainability of the impact, partner enterprises should have a budget line to finance the administration of the same questionnaire in three years. It might perhaps be possible to ask the CNLS to carry out this study provided that funds are available.

2a) Needs assessment process

The needs assessment process was judged useful and validated by the key informants. It is always necessary to carry out a needs assessment to ascertain the starting situation and compare it with the situation at the end of the project. It is thus justified and necessary to allocate resources for needs assessments.

2b) Accomplishments and effectiveness of the Project Advisory Board (PAB) with respect to promotion of HIV/AIDS policies

The members of the PAB, who were appointed by ministerial decree, were provided with information by the NPC. The PAB played a key role in promoting HIV/AIDS policies, especially the three aspects which were developed with a contribution from the project, namely:

- a) the National Tripartite Consensus Statement of July 2004;
- b) the 2005 Act on the protection of people living with HIV/AIDS in the workplace;
- c) the inclusion of the world of work in the National Strategic Framework 2006-2010.

The PAB thus helped to influence national policy on HIV/AIDS and the inclusion of the world of work in this problem.

2c) Employers' and workers' understanding of HIV/AIDS at the targeted enterprises

This is one of the strengths of the project. The employers identified by the PAB to participate in the project were duly sensitized by the NPCs, and the formation of joint workplace committees, training of peer educators and establishment of policies and actions programmes in enterprises is one of the project's success stories. All the staff of the target enterprises, from management down to workers, are committed to the project as it has contributed to a better understanding of the HIV/AIDS problem, to such an extent that 34 other enterprises have asked the project to run the same activities in their enterprises (see annexed list).

2d) Effectiveness of the BCC model

The workers interviewed, especially the peer educators and trainers of peer educators, found the model well suited to their needs. The additional training organized for trainers of peer educators, helped to reinforce the BCC model. There were no negative comments about the BCC model. The model involving peer educators is widely used in the country and the subregion. Regular and periodic refresher training of peer educators should be emphasized so as to maintain and strengthen their capacity and motivation.

2e) Stakeholder understanding and capacity to address HIV/AIDS at the workplace through workshops and other mediums

The joint workplace committee members interviewed all those who participated, (together with the representatives of their management), in the development of a policy and programme within the enterprise. They found that because of production constraints and the difficulty of holding workshops in the workplace, the formula most frequently adopted by peer educators was presentations to small groups of workers during meal or rest breaks. As the project advances and shows positive results, both the interest of workers and the number of consultations from peers will increase. Apart from the official launch days in enterprises, the joint workplace committees do not have the

resources to hold workshops in the workplace. The training is therefore done in small groups and little by little. Given that 239 peer educators were trained for enterprises employing 4,271 people, it can be seen that each peer educator is responsible for educating some 20 workers. The joint workplace committees also take advantage of International AIDS Day to organize awareness raising campaigns in their enterprises.

2f) Quality and use of the materials developed by the project and partner NGOs

According to the interviews, the quality of materials is considered satisfactory. However, the evaluation found that there are few training materials due to the limited budget. The distribution of male condoms is especially appreciated, and several requests were made to the evaluation team to provide female dummies (anatomic models of the female pelvic basin) to joint workplace committees and female condoms to enterprises.

Recommendations

It would be desirable to develop this pillar a little more in order to provide more educational support to peer educators and trainers of peer educators, and partner NGOs.

2g) Scope, content and effectiveness of outreach campaigns conducted to promote HIV/AIDS workplace education and BCC policies.

At national level, the project does not have a specific budget for outreach campaigns, which has limited the development of a media strategy which would have been extremely useful in publicizing the project. Nevertheless, the NPC participated and continues to participate actively in radio and television broadcasts, which gives the project some degree of visibility. In enterprises and target groups, the campaigns were effective due to workers' keen interest in matters of HIV/AIDS education. By way of example, in an HIV/AIDS education meeting in the informal sector organized by ASPAT-CL for apprentice garage mechanics and people from surrounding communities, (21 persons including 6 girls), the national consultant was bombarded for half an hour with questions on HIV/AIDS, by both participants and members of ASPAT-CL, which shows the high level of interest among target groups in learning more about HIV/AIDS.

Recommendations

It would be useful to include a public relations strategy, including the media and particularly radio, to make the project known. The visibility of this type of project, to judge by the consequences in terms of national legislation, is important in order to allow the Ministry of Labour, which does not generally receive the largest slice of the State budget, to demonstrate its commitment to the fight against HIV/AIDS in the workplace. Joint trips with members of the PAB, especially the tripartite constituents, should be considered in order to continue the close collaboration in outreach campaigns. The visibility of the project through its media exposure contributes directly to its sustainability by facilitating financing options with donors, especially in this project which is regarded as a model of the genre.

3. Management structure of the project, including support received

Findings

The structure of the project is very thin and requires a high level of commitment by the NPC with only three staff: the NPC, an administrative assistant and, more recently, a driver. The workload is high and does not allow the NPC to concentrate exclusively on essential activities, which may result in a certain lack of focus. Despite everything, the project was able to work satisfactorily. The training on UNDP administrative procedures came belatedly in July 2006 and certain difficulties should be noted in meeting the administrative deadlines for settlement of invoices and services used by the project.

In support terms, the project did not make use of the subregional office or the regional office. On the other hand, the two trips prior to this evaluation by members of the ILO/AIDS team in Geneva greatly facilitated the NPC's work. The Community Zero web platform was of limited use given that the weak information technology (IT) skills of the NPC, were not compensated by high IT skills from his assistant. As a result the resources of Community Zero and contributions to it, were not sufficiently exploited. Low IT skills in an NPC should not be a limiting factor and should be compensated by the IT skills of the NPC's assistant, something which is not the case in Togo⁷.

Conclusions and recommendations

In the first stage of the project, the structure was only just adequate. If the project can be extended with additional financing to other sectors and its presence in the informal sector intensified, it would be wise to recruit a programme assistant for the NPC. This would allow the NPC to concentrate on high level contacts and ensure the mobilization of the stakeholders, while the assistant would be responsible for dealing with joint workplace committees in enterprises, and also monitoring and evaluation of activities.

4. The project's sustainability plan and continuation of activities after project completion

Findings

The sustainability plan is one of the good practices identified by the evaluation. From the outset the project has been concerned to ensure the sustainability, if not of the project, then at least of the process. And it is indeed the process that must be safeguarded. The project held a sustainability workshop in August 2006 with the members of the PAB, the outcome of which was a series of recommendations and the creation of a Project

⁷ Comment from ILO HIV/AIDS programme: "SRO-Dakar only provided administrative backstopping as regards to staff issues (recruitment, contract, etc.) while an ACTRAV specialist went to Lomé on mission and participated in a sensitization workshop with the workers' organizations".

Deleted: BSR

Sustainability Committee (PSC). The PAB and the NPC have therefore made considerable efforts to ensure the sustainability of the process begun by the project. However, it must be said that at the moment no financing has been put in place, and the US Embassy does not appear to have any additional funds available for the project. All the key informants recognized the importance of the work done to ensure the sustainability of the project, but also consider that the length of the project, less than three years, is too short to ensure sustainability at this stage. Although the process has been launched and shows a certain dynamism, the evaluation team considers that an extension in time is necessary to bed the process in, since it is still fragile and somewhat dependent on additional financing.

The difficulties related to obtaining additional financing stem both from the particular structure of HIV/AIDS programmes which are now largely centralized in three funding mechanisms (the Global Fund, PEPFAR and the World Bank) and the particular relationship between Togo and donors. Given that the number of donors present in Togo is rather fewer than in other countries in the region, it is probably more difficult to obtain financing.

Conclusions and recommendations

Considerable work has been done on sustainability, but effective alternative scenarios need to be developed to allow the continuation of the process begun by the project, and to ensure that HIV/AIDS in the workplace is included on the agendas of State authorities, trade unions and enterprises. The project has shown its potential and its persuasive ability through its results, but the fragility of the organizations which have been created require a long-term framework. The project must identify for itself a scenario which allows Togo to take ownership of the process in a time scale of four years at most. The PAB and the NPC must make more “aggressive” use of the will and commitment of the new Minister of Labour to optimize the chances of available local resources.

The problem of projects which suddenly stop at the end of their life cycle is due to the fact that the possibility of a gradual transition and cost-sharing was not envisaged during the preparation of the project. The evaluation recommends that the sustainability committee, while looking at all conceivable scenarios, should examine the possibility of approaching donors with a request for financing over four years on the following basis:

year	External funds	Funds generated by PAB/NPC action
1 budget year 1	80% of budget proposal	20% of budget proposal
2 revised year 1 budget	60% revised year 1 budget	40% revised year 1 budget
3 revised year 2 budget	40% of revised year 2 budget	60% of revised year 2 budget

4 revised year 3 budget	20% of revised year 3 budget	80% of revised year 3 budget
5 end of appropriation	0%	100% of annual budget year 4 revised for fifth year

5. Linkages between the project and the Ministry of Labour and the CNLS

Findings

The linkages between the project and the Ministry of Labour are excellent. Despite the change of Minister, the new Minister met the evaluation team on two occasions to express his interest and personal support for a project which, in his own words, “arouses everyone’s enthusiasm”. The project is also one of the new Minister’s priorities, and he made a verbal commitment during the evaluation interview to support it actively. In the Department of Labour, the former contact person is now the Deputy Director General and chairman of the PAB, while the former chairman is now adviser to the Minister. Both the PAB chairmen (the former and the new) are key supporters of the project in the Ministry. It is important that they should stay there in order to continue to give their active support to this project⁸. Moreover, the visibility which the project has given to the Ministry of Labour, both through the official project launch covered by the press and television, and to a lesser extent the general publicity activities (radio broadcasts) and the activities in the Ministry, such as training of labour inspectors, has also helped to raise the profile of the Ministry as this is the only project which addresses HIV/AIDS in the workplace.

The CNLS also maintains good relations with the project, and the CNLS is represented on the PAB. During the feedback session in the PAB, the workers’ representative delegated by the CNLS, clearly indicated his commitment and personal support for the project. In addition the head of monitoring and evaluation in the CNLS permanent secretariat commended the work done by the project, even going so far as to say that the PMP was used by the CNLS for the indicators in the informal sector.

Despite these good relations, it is still necessary to mention certain institutional shortcomings at the level of national coordination directly related to the lack of financial resources. For example, certain members of the permanent secretariat of the CNLS are only working part-time.

Conclusions

The project has maintained good relations with the Ministry of Labour and the CNLS. The visibility which the project has given to the Ministry of Labour through media

⁸ Comment from the ILO HIV/AIDS programme: “However, neither the project nor the ILO has any control over this”.

coverage, is seen in a very good light because the Ministry does not usually receive such large budget allocations from the State as other ministries and has had a lower profile.

In the CNLS, it is now clear that the world of work needs an HIV/AIDS programme and that the project has filled a gap in this sense. The new national strategic framework 2006-2010 is also filling this gap, since the workplace is now included thanks to the efforts of the NPC and the project partners.

Recommendations

Despite ministerial changes, it would be useful to retain “champions” who have been trained in the Ministry of Labour in order to continue to provide a framework and to encourage and support the activities initiated by the project. Changes in staff typically accompany a change of Minister.

6. Value of the project in the context of other HIV/AIDS activities

Findings

The project is the only one in Togo which targets the issue of HIV/AIDS in the workplace. It is thus unique and fills a gap. In the opinion of all the interviewees, this project is a necessity because it has made all those concerned aware of the importance of the subject in enterprises. Thus there is no duplication or overlap with other projects, as none specifically target the workplace and none use the methodology based on the tripartite agreement between State, employers and workers specific to the ILO. The only other project with a workplace component is an activity by PSI under the name of, “HIV and the workplace”, but the content of this is not yet well known. The Minister has therefore sent a ministry official to attend one of its sessions to assess it.

Conclusions

The project has an intrinsic value because it is unique in its approach, strategy and targeting. It thus makes a decisive contribution to strengthening the global struggle to fight HIV/AIDS in the workplace. If nothing is done to ensure its continuation and the consolidation of its achievements, other stakeholders could be tempted to claim its authorship and results.

7. Monitoring system for collecting and measuring performance data

Findings

The performance monitoring plan (PMP) is clearly excellent for collecting data. It should be noted that the project strategic framework and the PMP were developed with the support of MSI which held workshops to develop these tools. The PMP and the strategic

framework are also complemented by quantitative studies (initial and final, the KAP survey of December 2004 and August 2006) which allow the project's performance to be assessed in quantitative terms.

The indicators identified are appropriate and therefore the data is reliable. The system is thus effective in assessing the overall performance of the project, to such an extent, indeed, that even the permanent secretariat of the CNLS recognized the value of the PMP and has drawn inspiration from it for its own monitoring and evaluation needs.

However the monitoring system focuses on quantitative information and lacks comparatively useful qualitative information.

Conclusions

The monitoring system is quantitatively adequate at project level and is easy to use. The data provide a quantitative view of the programme performance. Allied with all the studies done (needs assessment, KAP studies), it is an excellent system. However, it does not foresee tools for reporting on the *qualitative* character of the project.

Recommendations

The monitoring system is quantitatively good at project level. Within enterprises, however, it would be useful if the framework provided by the NGO FOTOBE could also include development of a monitoring and evaluation plan in each partner enterprise, in order to: a) evaluate the activities of joint workplace committees; and b) quantify the indicators at enterprise level in order to assess the individual progress of the stakeholders. Additionally the project could task the partner enterprises with identifying and recording three or four positive life-stories, protecting the anonymity of the worker, in order to supply some illustrative and qualitative evidence on how BCC has taken effect amongst peer workers.

8. Addressing issues highlighted by the mid-term assessment

Findings

The mid-term assessment took place in July 2005, 15 months before the final evaluation. The difficulty of obtaining additional funds and the question of sustainability largely took centre stage with regard to the last stage of the project. Despite the positive results, both at the level of the tripartite constituents and in enterprises, the project did not appear to have access to new sources of financing at the time of the final evaluation. It was therefore difficult to take stock of certain recommendations of the mid-term assessment, especially those which involved additional cost or envisaged activities not included in the budget (such as, for example, a two-level strategy to extend the number of partner enterprises and geographical coverage). In the situation of financial uncertainty in which the project finds itself, the final evaluation is of the opinion that it would only be possible

to implement those recommendations to the extent that additional financing would be available for a second phase of the project. On the other hand, certain other recommendations were covered by the project and successfully implemented (strengthening the partnership, continued efforts to advocate inclusion of HIV/AIDS in laws, policies, institutions, organizations and programmes relating to the workplace, etc.). It can be concluded therefore, that recommendations which did not involve additional expense were addressed by the project.

Conclusions

Some of the recommendations of the mid-term assessment could only be implemented with new expenditure not envisaged in the budget, such as, “Consider the extension of the project to further sectors and geographical areas” or, “Develop ‘tailor-made’ guidelines for trainers, so that they have a tool to take away from ToT activities, and translate core materials into local languages”. Bearing in mind that new financing is not always guaranteed despite the good results, the project was only able to cover those recommendations which did not have any budgetary implications.

Recommendations

The recommendations of the assessments should be targeted, prioritized and indicate clearly by whom and with what resources they are to be implemented. All recommendations of the mid-term assessment start with a verb, “Develop, support, encourage”, but they do not specify who is responsible for implementing them.

9. Level of stakeholder commitment to the project

Findings

The commitment of the tripartite constituents is considerable. The same degree of enthusiasm and support was expressed by the Ministry, the employers and the workers. It must also be recognized that never prior to this project had the tripartite constituents sat down together to discuss HIV/AIDS in the workplace. It is thus with considerable interest that the constituents committed themselves to the project, and this interest has grown constantly in the light of the project’s results, especially when the partner enterprises have engaged in their activities (development of an enterprise HIV policy and action plan). With respect to the tripartite constituents, the national tripartite declaration was the critical factor in unleashing their support. This support was reflected, at government level, by the inclusion of workplaces in the new law of 2005 on protection of persons living with HIV/AIDS, with heavy sanctions in the case of violations. In addition, the new National Strategic Framework now includes workplaces in the approach to the fight against HIV/AIDS for the first time.

This same realization dawned among employers and trade unions, with certain differences depending on the sector and the section of the partner enterprises involved in

the project. From the outset, NGOs were the partners of choice and they were initially trained by FHI which was sub-contracted by the ILO as a project partner before the ILO used NGOs as project partners to train peer educators.

The United States Embassy is a member of the PAB and in that capacity was invited to participate regularly in meetings of the PAB. However, given the turnover of Embassy staff, there have been three different Embassy representatives on the PAB since the start of the project and only on three occasions were Embassy representatives able to attend PAB meetings. As a result there is limited institutional memory of the project within the US Embassy and a more pro-active approach in support of the project would be desirable. The project did on repeated occasions send information and proposals for the extension of activities (as part of the sustainability plan), to the US Embassy but no formal written answer was given.

Conclusions

The tripartite constituents have clearly taken ownership of the project, especially because, even before the final evaluation, it was seen as a good project which achieved its objectives and delivered very positive results. The involvement of other partners was generally good, although in certain cases staff turnover meant that relations had to be re-established with new representatives of the partners

10. Relationship between the NPC and FHI and the NGOs

Findings

FHI is not represented in Togo, and the training provided took place in Benin, although FHI is not represented in either Togo or Benin. There has therefore been no direct relationship between the NPC and FHI since this BCC training. The NGOs were also trained by FHI in Benin, which gave them the necessary grounding to provide a framework for enterprises in Togo, especially in the training of peer educators. The relations between the NPC and FOTOBE, the NGO responsible for providing a framework for enterprises are extremely cordial.

Conclusions

The relationship with FHI did not continue after the training in Benin in 2004, as FHI does not have an office in Togo. The relations with the NGO FOTOBE are cordial. The NPC also played a guidance and support role with respect to FOTOBE.

11. Strategic framework and effectiveness of its implementation

Findings

The quality of the strategic framework is undeniable, and it is clear that it contributes much to the vigour of the approach and the soundness of the project strategy. On the other hand, it is much more difficult to determine to what point it influenced the effectiveness of implementation. The first factor in the effectiveness of the project is undoubtedly the dynamic, persuasive and tenacious character of the NPC. Without the NPC's ability to mobilize and the quality of his contacts, the support of the strategic framework would have been merely theoretical. But added to the quality of the human resources recruited by the project (NPC), the framework certainly helped to facilitate the implementation of the project and, thereby, its effectiveness. Although well handled tools contribute to a project's effectiveness, they are only useful if the user knows how to use them.

12. Sectors targeted, selection criteria and needs met

Findings

The sectors were chosen on the basis of the needs assessment by the PAB which provided information on the situation in Togo. The discussion of sectors led to a considerable number of proposals, but it was also a case of involving several sectors and representation of the informal sector, as mentioned in the project document. After a long working session, the sectors chosen seem to have met the criteria, namely sectors with a higher prevalence and higher exposure to the risk of infection, and the desire to participate in a pilot scheme (at the time when the choice of sectors and partner enterprises was made, there was as yet little enthusiasm for the project and it was rather difficult to find committed employers). For the informal sector, initially other activities were considered (hairdressers, for example), but finally the garage mechanics association was chosen because it had a better organizational structure and was represented by an association, the *Chambre des Métiers* (the representative of the Chamber was the focal point for the informal sector).

Conclusions

To meet the needs of different sectors, a more ambitious project would have been necessary. Bearing in mind the resources available, the project, with the PAB, targeted its activity on a limited number of enterprises (8 partners – 3 mining sector, 3 hotel sector, 1 brewery, 1 garage mechanics' association from the informal sector), comprising 4,270 workers in all. However, a list of 34 enterprises requesting to participate in the project was drawn up by the NPC, and official requests were seen by the evaluation team. Against this background, it is evident that the size of the project could not meet all the needs of the different sectors. But its role as a catalyst certainly worked, and there is a genuine demand on the part of enterprises to participate in the project activities.

13. Links with other ILO projects concerning HIV/AIDS

Findings

There are two other ILO projects in Togo. One is the PAMODEC project of the ILO/DECLARATION, and the other the IPEC project. PAMODEC contributed to the visibility of the ILO/USDOL project by allowing the NPC to participate in a television broadcast which was fairly successful. There were thus synergies with the project. On the other hand, there were no formal contacts with the IPEC project. Elsewhere, the Togo project had a certain number of exchanges with its sister project in Benin.

14. Involvement of the tripartite constituents in promoting social dialogue

Findings

The project played a decisive role in involving the tripartite constituents. The tripartite declaration signed in July 2004 is witness to that. Furthermore, the inclusion of workplaces in the new National Strategic Framework 2006-2010 and the promulgation of the law specifically protecting HIV-positive persons in the workplace are also clear examples of the project's catalytic role at the level of the tripartite constituents. Despite a difficult start hedged about with uncertainty, the project managed to create a network of key players among the tripartite constituents who are actively committed to the project activities. Moreover, it is very heartening to see the extent of the importance that the Government attaches to this project, with the two meetings granted by the new Minister to the evaluation team (on its arrival and at the end of the evaluation after the feedback session). In addition, the establishment of joint workplace committees in the partner enterprises has contributed considerably to strengthening social dialogue between employers, workers and trade unions.

15. Extension and replication of the project approach and its results

Findings

As the Minister indicated, this project arouses everyone's enthusiasm. The project regularly receives requests from new enterprises and the informal sector to extend its activity, both at sectoral level and in terms of geographical coverage. Although the peer educators have been trained only a few months ago while workplace committees have been in place since 2004, there have been initial successes. Without a new source of financing to continue the project, which is seen as a success, there is a risk that it will be taken over by others who have more considerable financing, claiming the ILO/USDOL project for their own, by incorporating its strategy and approach, both among the project's strengths.

It should be noted that during the evaluation trip, the banking union asked the NPC to help organize and facilitate an HIV/AIDS workshop financed by itself. This again shows the interest aroused by the project and the potential for replication and genuine taking ownership if sufficient financial resources are mobilized.

Conclusions

The project approach was judged very good by the key informants interviewed, especially because of:

- its targeted character, which avoided loss of focus;
- its flexibility, which allows it to be adapted to the national context, and even individually at enterprise level;
- the number of studies and tools (needs assessment, KAP survey, strategic framework, PMP, etc.) which give the project a sound base.

16. Choice of partners to implement the strategy

Findings

The choice of partners was wise, and there are many “champions” of the project among the members of the PAB, who were appointed by ministerial decree not personally but in recognition of their quality as representatives or the organizations they came from. The tripartite constituents are well represented, the only weakness being that only one of the six trade union confederations could be included in the PAB in order not to have too large a group of people.⁹ At enterprise level, employers are heavily involved, although the level varies from one enterprise to another. The best results were achieved where the management was most involved. It should also be noted that among the partner enterprises, some experienced major turnover or a reduction in the workforce and even management (e.g. the IBIS Hotel), so that the vigour with which the enterprise pursued its action plan varied.

The project maintained contacts with NGOs which had experience in the sector at the beginning of the project. Two NGOs were trained by FHI in BCC in Benin, and subsequently FOTOBÉ, undertook to provide training and an enterprise framework for peer educators. Bearing in mind the slim structure of the project, with an NPC, and administrative assistant and more recently a driver, it was impossible for the project to take on that task with its own limited staff.

Conclusions

The evaluation considers that the choice of partners was wise, for it was crucial to ensure good representation at sectoral and enterprise level, while taking into account the need to

⁹ To the ILO HIV/AIDS programme this is not seen as a weakness but as a “good tool to encourage coordination among unions”. However this was not supported by the interviews held by the evaluation team.

include informal sector activities. Enormous efforts to persuade and sensitize heads of enterprises by the NPC, who did not hesitate to meet enterprise management personally to convince them of the need for the project, contributed hugely to the commitment of the partner enterprises.

17. Addressing the gender dimension

Findings

The project endeavoured to take account of the gender dimension as far as it could. It should, however, be noted that the mining sector and garage mechanics association have a majority of male workers, and that only the hotel sector employs a significant number of women workers. Nevertheless, efforts were made to achieve a balance in the composition of workplace committees where women's representation is assured, and among peer educators. The specific characteristics of the chosen sectors do not, therefore, give major representation of women. There was no specific training for female peer educators, which might have been useful given the gender-specific characteristics of male and female groups.

Conclusions

The project sought to ensure presentation of the female sector in workplace committees and among peer educators. However, there was no specific training for women, which might have been desirable.

VI. LESSONS LEARNED

The project had a sound structure and strategy, based on a qualitative analysis (needs assessment) and a quantitative analysis (KAP survey). In addition, a well-constructed performance monitoring plan (PMP) and strategic framework were developed with the support of MSI. It is important to recognize the value of an approach soundly based on technical elements which is one of the project's strengths.

Another equally important lesson is to allow participation by the host country partners so that they take ownership of the project, and do not see it as the transposition of something which was done elsewhere in the same way. The flexibility of the BCC methodology allowed each enterprise to adapt its policy and action plan, and develop materials specific to each (e.g. messages on the bottle-openers of the brewery, one of the partner enterprises). In this respect, the adaptability of the approach to the specific characteristics of each player within sectors and enterprises is a worthwhile lesson.

In addition to the technical soundness of the project structure, it needs a coordinator who has the right personal qualities to achieve the project objectives, i.e. someone capable of communication, mobilization and persuasion, which is not everyone's forte. In Togo, the

NPC has these qualities, which made a considerable contribution to the implementation of the project.

Furthermore, despite the abilities of the NPC, the project would not have been successful and achieved the same results without the active participation and taking ownership by the tripartite constituents and the partner enterprises. The participatory process whereby the tripartite constituents were enabled to contribute to the project, the quality and support of the members of the PAB also made a crucial contribution to the NPC's efforts. In the enterprises, the active participation of employers and workers contributed to the results achieved thanks to their involvement from the beginning of the project.

On a less positive note, the project should include a public relations strategy in order to ensure the project's visibility. Visibility is often linked to the capacity to obtain additional financing. For that, however, stakeholders must have sufficient information about the project's achievements. The world of work did not benefit from Global Fund support, despite the efforts made. That is perhaps because decision-makers are not sufficiently informed, which could have been alleviated if a public relations strategy using the mass media had been established as one of the project's components. In the Togolese context, where local financing options are still limited due to the country's political history and the suspension of development aid and World Bank funds, it is all the more important to ensure a visibility which targets potential donors. The project took part in several radio and television broadcasts, but that was at the initiative of the NPC, and not as part of a targeted communication strategy.

Another lesson relates to the concept of sustainability. This was not defined by the project, and gave rise to different interpretations as mentioned in the foreword. The ILO seems often to be regarded as a donor as well as a technical cooperation agency, which reinforces the hope that the ILO might have additional funds for the project (despite the clear statement by the ILO representative that there were scarcely any). This explains the false expectation from stakeholders that the ILO had the capacity to ensure the continuation of the project when the USDOL financing ends. The concept of sustainability therefore needs to be better defined and, thereby, the ILO's role in the project in order not to raise false hopes.

Finally, a fundamental aspect was the change in the tripartite constituents and other stakeholders concerning the need for a specific workplace element in the fight against HIV/AIDS, taking into account the special and difficult character of the world of work. It must be acknowledged that the methodology used by the ILO, which involves the tripartite constituents, is unique and especially well suited to issues of HIV/AIDS in the workplace, since the State, employers and workers agree on the policy and action plan in each enterprise¹⁰. At national level, a fundamental change occurred with the signing of the tripartite declaration, the inclusion of the world of work in the new National Strategic Framework 2006-2011, and the new law on protection of 2005 which also includes the workplace and even provides sanctions in respect of those who violate it.

¹⁰ Comment from ILO HIV/AIDS programme: "This was done in parallel and not chronologically before".

VII. SUMMARY OF POTENTIAL AREAS FOR FURTHER INVESTIGATION AND IMPLICATIONS FOR GLOBAL STRATEGIES

Despite the initial delays in launching the project, the results are mainly judged to be positive by all those involved. The Minister himself set a clear example by his interest thanks to the good results achieved. However, viewed overall, there is some cause for concern regarding the project's future potential and there are implications for global strategies.

At the level of the project, a public relations strategy should be developed at the project design stage. As the ILO is not a donor, it is obvious that it must therefore envisage additional financing for the continuation of its activities. This is because:

- a) the BCC cannot be implemented in such a short space of time (3 years) and should be spread over at least the life of the National Strategic Framework (5 years);
- b) mobilization of funds is not part of the NPC's job description, neither is communication with the media. A specific strategy is therefore needed which includes the public relations component (visibility) and preparation of financing proposals (funds for mobilization) from the outset.

As the search for funds is decentralized to the beneficiary country, it would also be useful to examine the need for a training workshop for NPCs in the region to equip them in the field of fund mobilization. It might also be useful to envisage an expert in project drafting at subregional or national level¹¹ to assist the NPC in drafting new proposals to be addressed to potential donors.

The possibility of co-financing and gradual transfer of resources should also be envisaged, to ensure that the beneficiary country takes ownership, rather than expecting the stakeholders to take ownership of it automatically at the end of the project. All that should be done at the beginning of the project, specifying the share of each during the life cycle of the project, along the lines suggested in item 4 section V of this report.

¹¹ This is to ensure that the expert is also aware of the context and of local cultural and traditional dimensions, in addition to being physically closer to the project which reduces travel costs.