



International
Labour
Office

'Decent Work in the Green Economy' Global Internal Evaluation Report for China, Mexico & Turkey

Prepared for the International Labour Organization (ILO)
by Development Analytics



June 17, 2015

For Internal Use Only

Acronyms by Country

| | |
|------|--------------------------------------|
| ILO | International Labour Organization |
| UNEP | United Nations Environmental Program |

CHINA

| | |
|--------|--|
| CDM | Cleaner Development Mechanism |
| GSHP | Ground Source Heat Pump |
| GBO | Green Business Opportunities |
| HVAC | Heat, Ventilation and Air Conditioning |
| ILO | International Labour Organization |
| MOHRSS | Ministry of Human Resource and Social Security |
| NDOCC | National Directory of Occupations Classification of China |
| NVSTIC | Nanjing Vocational and Skills Technical Instruction Centre |
| ONU | United Nations |

MEXICO

| | |
|-----------|---|
| EV | Empleos Verdes |
| CROC | Revolutionary Confederation of Workers and Farmers |
| NECC | National Institute of Ecology and Climate Change |
| INEGI | National Institute of Statistics and Geography |
| INMUJERES | National Institute for Women |
| SEMARNAT | Ministry of the Environment and Natural Resources (in Mexico) |
| STPS | Ministry of Labour and Social Security |
| SENER | Ministry of Energy |

TURKEY

| | |
|---------|---|
| TISK | Turkish Confederation of Employers Associations |
| TUIK | Turkish Statistical Institute |
| Turk-Is | Confederation of Turkish Trade Unions |

Acknowledgments

The internal evaluation report was prepared by a team at Development Analytics led by Ergem Senyuva Tohumcu. The evaluators who have contributed to the report are Dr. Zhou Shengkun for China, Laura Champa for Mexico and Ergem Senyuva Tohumcu for Turkey

Contents

| | |
|---|----|
| Acronyms by Country..... | 2 |
| 1. Project Background..... | 4 |
| 1.1 Project Context..... | 5 |
| 1.2 Project Objective | 5 |
| 1.3 Funding Arrangements | 7 |
| 1.4 Organizational Arrangements..... | 7 |
| 2. Evaluation Background | 9 |
| 2.1 Purpose of Evaluation | 9 |
| 2.2 Scope of Evaluation..... | 9 |
| 3. Methodology..... | 9 |
| 3.1 Evaluation Criteria | 9 |
| 3.2 Evaluation Questions..... | 10 |
| 3.3 Evaluation Methods..... | 11 |
| 3.4 Relevance of Methods..... | 12 |
| 3.5 Sources of Information | 12 |
| 3.6 Limitations of the Study | 14 |
| 4. Main Findings..... | 15 |
| 4.1 Strategic Fit | 15 |
| 4.2 Project Design | 18 |
| 4.3 Project Progress and Effectiveness..... | 20 |
| 4.4 Project Management and Resources | 26 |
| 4.5 Sustainability | 28 |
| 5. Conclusions..... | 30 |
| 5.1 Main Conclusions by Country..... | 30 |
| 5.2 Lessons Learned..... | 32 |
| 5.3 Good Practices..... | 33 |
| 5.4 Recommendations..... | 33 |

Executive Summary

In June 2012, the United Nations Conference on Sustainable Development, known as Rio +20, took place in Brazil, drawing attention to the need to build a green economy to achieve sustainable development, lift people out of poverty; and to improve international coordination for sustainable development. As part of this agenda, and with an estimated 600 million jobseekers to enter the labour market over the next decade, it is crucial to understand the employment and social aspects of a global transition to the green economy. The ILO project 'Decent Work in the Green Economy' focuses on the employment aspects of national efforts during the transition stage. At national level, awareness raising, capacity building and green job assessments were conducted to provide the ground for designing national strategies. On the global level, country activities were shared on a global knowledge sharing strategy providing access to information and policy guidance for countries. The pilot projects were launched in three emerging markets, China, Mexico and Turkey between 2013-2015.

This report provides an overview of the project in the above-mentioned countries, and an evaluation of the project outputs based on assessment criteria. The first part of this report offers a background on the overall project context and project details in each of the three countries. The second part focuses on the methodologies and tools used to evaluate the project outcomes and how the assessments were carried forward. The third part presents the main findings of the evaluation with respect to its (i) strategic fit and project design considering country specific circumstances, (ii) budget efficiency, (iii) effectiveness of the project and impact on stakeholders and finally (iv) the sustainability of the project after its termination.

Overall, we find the project highly successful in terms of raising awareness and engaging counterparts on the theme of decent jobs in the green economy. We also make recommendations for adjustments and ways to continue and expand the project..

1. Project Background

1.1 Project Context

“Decent Work in the Green Economy” project, undertaken by ILO, focused on the employment aspects of national efforts to transition to a green economy in three select countries, China, Mexico and Turkey. At national level, awareness raising, capacity building and green jobs assessments paved the way towards the design of national strategies that focus on the creation of decent work for women and men in green or greened economic sectors. Country level activities were reinforced by a global knowledge sharing platform providing stakeholders access to up-to-date information and policy guidance and strengthening networks and cooperation among countries and international institutions.

1.2 Project Objective

With the emerging development of transition to green economy, national governments have been working on developing national and sector policies to support this agenda. Nevertheless, with a growing number of unemployed -or underemployed- people, there is a pressing need for greater opportunities for productive and decent employment. The main challenge lies in designing policies and strategies that will deliver income and livelihood for workers and their families while preserving the environment and offering decent jobs.

At a global scale, shifts in labour markets caused by transitions to green economies seem manageable, but at national level impacts demand systematic strategies to ensure an inclusive and socially just transition. It is important to develop policies and strategies uniquely addressing the needs and circumstances of each country since labour markets and social structures vary widely. Thus, tripartite stakeholders needed awareness and research-backed knowledge about employment challenges and opportunities in their own countries. ILO's systematic approach at national level proved to be a useful tool to answer the demand for general and specific knowledge as well as the demand for guidance. Furthermore, skill gaps and shortages were recognized as drawbacks in a number of sectors. This required education and vocational systems to be aware of the changes and develop training systems accordingly. The ILO met this demand by developing and pilot testing skills for green jobs training manuals. Along with capacity building and awareness raising, came the need to share knowledge on a global level. Thus this project put special emphasis on knowledge management and knowledge sharing

For the project, a two level strategy (national – international) aimed to strengthen the ability of national stakeholders to design strategies for decent work in prioritized sectors/areas and to expand their policy initiatives for green jobs to other sectors/areas, seeking coherence and collective efficiencies among ministries and social partners.

The project set out three objectives related to capacity building, collaboration and policy development:

1. To improve the ability of governments' and social partners' in Mexico and Turkey to assess the scope for green jobs and to formulate, monitor and review relevant policies and programs

2. To improve the ability and commitment of stakeholders in China to formulate and implement skills for green jobs development strategies
3. To create an expanded knowledge base on green jobs, accessible for ILO constituents and relevant international organizations for use in policy and program development

In China, in line with this vision and mandate, ILO and the Ministry of Human Resource and Social Security (MOHRSS) initiated the 'Skills for Green Jobs Project' as part of 'Decent Work in the Green Economy' project, focusing on green skills assessment and green jobs monitoring in the building energy efficiency sector in Nanjing city, where the sector was booming with innovations in building technologies, but there was a clear need for skills building. The project objective was to improve ability and commitment of stakeholders in China to formulate and implement skills for green jobs development strategies. As part of this project, training curriculum and trainer's guide were developed with MOHRSS. Following a pilot testing of the training materials, the material would be disseminated for use.

In Mexico, the project objective was to improve the capacity of the government agencies and their partners in social and private sectors to assess the potential for green jobs, as well as to design and implement policies and actions that promote the creation of green jobs. The main outputs of the project were that (i) national stakeholders received training on issues related to decent work in the green economy, (ii) ILO constituents and staff had access to knowledge and knowledge sharing facilities, (iii) the potential of green jobs was evaluated, (iv) national constituents developed and submitted strategies for the promotion of decent jobs. All of these outcomes to achieve the project objective were concluded as part of the project.

In Turkey, the project objective was to improve the ability of stakeholders, namely government agencies and NGO partners, to assess the scope for green jobs and to formulate, monitor and review relevant policies and programs. To achieve these project objectives, a task force comprised of stakeholders was formed. The task force identified key outputs and objectives for the transition to green economy through awareness building on the definition and the promotion of green jobs. It was important to analyse and understand the skills gap to develop appropriate policies and strategies. To this end, the project also aimed to assess green jobs potential in Turkey, as well as apprehending the existing conditions and circumstances in the green economy. The project also focused on training of the task force members, which enhanced their ability to devise the necessary strategies for the transition to a green economy.

All of the above mentioned national activities were to be strengthened by a global knowledge-sharing facility that provided up-to-date information and policy guidance and enabled cooperation among countries and international institutions. The objective of the knowledge sharing facilities is to provide knowledge on green jobs creation to ILO constituents and ILO staff via ILO Green Jobs Programme web page, Green Jobs Knowledge Sharing Platform and networks.

The ILO Green Jobs Programme web page was launched as a joint effort between the Green Jobs Programme and ILO's Communication Department for users to have access to all ILO material related to green jobs from one website. The website was made user-friendly and comprehensive in scope, including news, articles, training, projects, publications and multimedia. Content is regularly updated and articles are published online on a frequent basis to showcase activities undertaken by ILO Green Jobs Programme. There is also a new section called "Learn more on green jobs" on the main page, to explain the concept of green jobs and FAQ. This section has been made available in English, French and Spanish as well as other articles and publications featuring in other languages to for a greater outreach.

The Green Jobs Knowledge Sharing platform, an internal platform for knowledge sharing and communication amongst ILO colleagues, was launched in 2014. This platform has 5 main sections: Literature (external resources to the ILO), green pages, internal documents, multimedia and discussion forum.

In addition, the Green Jobs Programme coordinates an HQ-based Green Jobs Network and two regional networks in Africa and Latin America, via video conference or in person, providing a space for colleagues to share updates on their work related to green jobs. ILO Green Jobs programme is also facilitating the activities of The Green Jobs Assessment Institution Network (GAIN), a network of policy research institutions and experts on green jobs assessments. GAIN's objective is to improve and share knowledge on assessment methodologies and results and to build capacities of existing GAIN members. As this project revealed, GAIN is an invaluable tool for transition to green economy where countries need capacity building and knowledge for green jobs assessments

1.3 Funding Arrangements

The project was funded by the Government of Flanders; and the total budget of project was 598,452 USD. Throughout the project, the project budget was allocated to the key activities that were in line with the project objectives to achieve project outputs. For instance, the project budget from international consultant for research was partly moved to support training activities in Turin (12.000 USD). The training budget (including also national workshops and conferences) was reduced slightly to allow for other country activities. The budget of the global project coordination was extended by 2 months. Activities at national level were supported by additional funds. The detailed project budget is shared in ANNEX I and also included in Section 4.4 below under each country budget analysis.

1.4 Organizational Arrangements

The project was centrally managed and coordinated by Kees van der Ree, Coordinator and Dorit Kemter, Technical Officer of the Green Jobs Programme at ILO Headquarters. At the national level, ILO country offices determined the country specific needs, enabled the tailoring of the project based on those and facilitated it at country level.



The organization chart above provides a list of project officers in charge of the project in each case country. In China, the project had three consecutive project officers who changed over the course of the project. They included, Ms Cheng Qian, coordinator for the project on around November 2012 to July 2013. Ms Huang Qingrui, coordinator from 2013 to July 2014, she is now working at the regional ILO office at Bangkok and finally Ms. Pei Hongye was the last officer to coordinate the project from September 2014 onwards.

2. Evaluation Background

2.1 Purpose of Evaluation

The purpose of this internal evaluation is to assess the overall project from the project design to process execution and the delivery of outputs and outcomes of the project.

2.2 Scope of Evaluation

The period, which this evaluation covers, is the project period starting January 2013 ending March 2015. The project evaluators mainly focused on the completed project activities and their impact with respect to the goals of the project.

The clients of the evaluation were the 'Decent Work in the Green Economy' project team in the HQ and field offices as well as tripartite members involved in project activities at national level.

Each country was appointed an evaluator to conduct desk reviews and field work. Per the terms of reference, the country evaluator for Turkey had the lead in providing a set of questions that would act as a guiding tool for assessment for all evaluators for their fieldwork. Each evaluator used the global set of questions and tailored them to their own needs to effectively assess the projects.

3. Methodology

3.1 Evaluation Criteria

The terms of reference requested the evaluation to assess the project along the following six standard evaluation criteria:

1. Relevance and strategic fit of the intervention
2. Validity of intervention design
3. Intervention progress and effectiveness
4. Efficiency of resource use
5. Effectiveness of management arrangements
6. Impact orientation and sustainability of the intervention

The evaluation criteria took an in-depth analysis of the project.

- **The relevance and strategic fit** criteria evaluates how appropriately the project was designed based on the feedback and remarks provided by the participants from stakeholders, taking into consideration the current conditions of green economy at national level. For these criteria, the evaluators provided an overview of each country's current state to consider if the project was designed appropriately to reach its objective.
- **Validity of intervention design** is a primary consideration for the project because it seeks to establish a causal relationship between objectives of the project and its outcomes.

- **Intervention progress and effectiveness** observes how smoothly the project progressed and whether the project intervention had been effective.
- **Efficiency of resource use** required the evaluators to analyse into the budget allocation and whether they were allocated in line with achieving the objectives of the project.
- **Effectiveness of management arrangements** criteria revealed the effectiveness of the management for the overall execution of the project.
- **Impact orientation and sustainability of the intervention** assessed whether the project activities yielded the expected impacts and the project would be sustainable in the future.

The project evaluators used a set of questions mentioned below to provide an assessment of the criteria.

3.2 Evaluation Questions

The project has been implemented in three different countries, namely China, Mexico and Turkey. The project implementation at national level differed due to challenges and needs of each country; therefore it was challenging to come up with a unified set of questions that would apply to all countries. A questionnaire was prepared which would help the evaluators address the assessment criteria. Thus, each country evaluator had to tailor them based on their observations to maximize the outcome of their evaluation. Furthermore, the questionnaire had to be created separately for ILO staff, governmental organizations and non-governmental organizations. Despite small variations, questions were aligned for all stakeholders.

The questions in the questionnaire had been formulated addressing each criteria separately.

Relevance and strategic fit

Guiding questions:

- In the context of the project, has the promotion of green jobs supported the national development and main stakeholder priorities?
- Have the project strategies been identified in a participatory manner and in line with similar efforts implemented at national level?

Stakeholders were asked questions addressing their organization's position with respect to transition to green economy, the challenges they face and whether these challenges were adequately addressed by the project. Moreover, they were asked to provide an assessment of stakeholder participation, questions were prepared to analyse their own participation as well as other stakeholders' participation.

Efficiency

Guiding questions:

- Has the project been designed adequately?
- Is there a causal link between outputs and intended outcomes?
- Have financial resources been used adequately?

Questions were formulated to understand stakeholders' view of if project activities were aligned with project objectives. The stakeholders were also asked what would be their action steps if they were also allocated a project budget. This question enabled the evaluator to understand if

the stakeholders would prioritize other activities to achieve the project objectives, providing a fair view from their angle despite their lack of knowledge of the project budget.

Effectiveness

- Have project activities resulted in the expected outputs?
- Is the quality of these outputs satisfactory?

Questions focused on whether the project identified the challenges and opportunities of transition to green economy and whether the capacity building workshops had achieved their expected outcome. Furthermore, the interviewees were asked about their level of cooperation and engagement among stakeholders and such collaboration affected the outcomes. The evaluators also asked questions on whether information was shared effectively.

Impact

- Have stakeholders been involved in the project implementation and could they contribute to the outputs and outcomes?
- Have stakeholders benefitted from the project activities?

The evaluators asked about what impact they consider the project had on their own work and agenda. The weaknesses and strengths of the project design were also discussed here with stakeholders. In each country, stakeholders were asked to present the achieved impacts of the project with respect to their organization.

Sustainability

- Is there a sense of ownership among national stakeholders and is there a capacity to carry forward the achieved results?
- Can the project achievements be maintained or even scaled-up?
- Has the project succeeded in increasing capacity and commitment among national institutions?

The stakeholders were asked how they were going to cooperate and implement policy change after the project is concluded. It is vital to assess under what circumstances the engagement will continue for stakeholders for transition to green economy.

The detailed list of questions in the in-depth interview questionnaire can be found in Annex II.

3.3 Evaluation Methods

The evaluation methods consisted of mainly desk reviews and interviews. For the desk reviews, the evaluator systematically analysed existing documentation provided by ILO staff, including information about the national and global activities, their outputs and outcomes, project documents, progress reports, work plans and their evidence, including related work by other agencies, to assess ILO's position within the national effort. The guiding questions for the desk reviews focused on what the projected outcome of the project were, and what activities had been conducted to reach the objectives. Furthermore, an in-depth look into the documentation of country documents to formulate the questions for the interviews proved to be beneficial for the evaluation. While evaluating the impact of the project, the two areas of focus are policy making and capacity building among stakeholders.

On a national level, the evaluators conducted in-depth interviews with the project stakeholders (identified by ILO staff) as well as the ILO project staff in each country. The national-level evaluators followed the guiding in-depth interview questionnaire developed at the global level for the study, and tailored the questionnaire for interviews in order to address country specific activities. Stand-alone country reports were generated based on the answers provided to the interview questions. The evaluators analysed the answers to the interview questions with regard to project's evaluation criteria and drew conclusions. The global report was then prepared bringing together the findings from the country reports also looking assessing the activities at the global level.

3.4 Relevance of Methods

The above mentioned methodology was considered as the relevant means of fulfilling the objectives of this evaluation, since it provides a combination of desk reviews based on reports produced for the project as well as input from stakeholders.

3.5 Sources of Information

In each country, the interviewees were composed of ILO officers at field offices, stakeholders from public and private sector depending on activities in that particular country.

Below is the list of interviewed stakeholders by country:

| CHINA | | |
|--------------------|------------------------------------|--|
| Pei Hongye | ILO Beijing | Project Officer |
| Qingrui Huang | ILO Bangkok | Green Jobs Expert |
| Luraine Villacorta | ILO Southeast, East Asia & Bangkok | Environment & Decent Work Specialist (Green Jobs) |
| Liu Ytong | MOHRSS | Division Chief, Department of International Cooperation |
| Ren | MOHRSS | Deputy Division Chief, Department of International Cooperation |
| Wang Jianjie | NVSTIC | Director of NVSTIC |
| Zhu Jie | NVSTIC | Chief of Technical Section |
| Sun Jun | NVSTIC | Member of Technical Section |
| Yang Fan | NVSTIC | Member of Technical Section |

| MEXICO | | |
|---------------------------------|---------------------|--|
| Regina Galhardi | ILO | Former Employment Specialist, now Specialist in Statistics, ILO office in Geneva. |
| Orly Goldsmith | Green Jobs | Commercial Director. Project Implementation Team |
| Catalina Jáuregui | Green Jobs | Director of Operations, Project Implementation Team |
| Javier Warman Diamant | SEMARNAT | General Director for Planning and Evaluation. Undersecretary of Planning |
| Leticia Manzanera Herrera | SEMARNAT | Director for Integration of Sectorial Policies. Undersecretary of Planning |
| Raúl Figueroa Díaz | INEGI | Director of Satellite Accounts. General Direction of Economic Statistics |
| Cesar Cabrera Cedillo | INEGI | Department for Consolidation of Environmental Accounts. General Direction of Economic Statistics |
| Héctor David Olguín Rojas | INEGI | Department Chief of Environmental Protection Expenses |
| J. Federico González Medrano | INEGI | Under director of Integration of Environmental Accounts |
| Yare Autrique y Maricela García | Chamber of Deputies | President of the Special Commission for Sustainable Development |
| Eugenio del Valle | CROC | Coordinator of Environment and Sustainable Development |
| Rafael Carmona ¹ | Green | Director of Technology |
| María Dolores Barrientos Alemán | UNDP | Representative for Mexico |

¹ *Persons interviewed in addition to those required by the TOR and suggested by the consultant relevant to their participation/influence on the topic.

| TURKEY | | |
|--------------------|--|---|
| Ozan Cakmak | ILO Office for Turkey | Policy and Partnerships Officer |
| Ozgur Dogac Gursel | TISK | Research, Education and External Relations Expert |
| Enis Bagadadioglu | Turk-Is | Research Expert |
| Deniz Koc | Ministry of Science, Industry and Technology | Industry and Technology Expert |
| Hakan Sener Akata | General Directorate of Renewable Energy | Assistant Expert |
| Gizem Cetin | Ministry of Labour and Social Security-General Directorate of Labour | Labour Expert |
| Selen Arli Yilmaz | Ministry of Development | Sustainability Planning Expert |
| Sinem Capan | Ministry of Development | Labour Expert |

3.6 Limitations of the Study

The evaluation had three main limitations:

- 1) **Limited sample of interviewees:** The evaluation relied mainly on qualitative findings from interviews with a limited number of stakeholders, identified by ILO staff. A more comprehensive survey of stakeholders and ministries involved in the project would have given a more thorough assessment of the project. Given the budget of the project, the evaluation was meant to be small and only limited funds could be allocated to undertaking the evaluation.
- 2) **Inability to define quantitative outcome indicators:** Given the small sample size and differences in the level of involvement in project activities of the stakeholders interviewed, it was not possible to generate a set of objective quantifiable perception indicators. Instead, the findings revealed a general tendency of the perceptions of those interviewed. For instance, in China, as per the ToR, the evaluation was designed to be confined to the Nanjing Vocational and Skills Technical Instruction Centre (NVSTIC) and MOHRSS. Interviews were not conducted with other stakeholders such as those participating colleges (as training providers) and enterprises (as users for green jobs and green skills) in Nanjing.
- 3) **Difficulty in harmonizing outcome variables across countries:** Country specific situations required tailored approaches limiting a unified approach: The ‘Decent Work in the Green Economy’ project was tailored to the needs and circumstances in each country where it was implemented, so it was difficult to come up with a methodology and assessment grid that would fit the activities and outcomes of all country cases. The evaluators have designed a global set of interview questions, in order to make the assessment across a varied set of activities more possible.

4. Main Findings

4.1 Strategic Fit

As the below mentioned country specific details will reveal, 'Decent Work in Green Economy' project was designed and implemented based on the needs of each participating country. Though a global project in essence with its vision, the project took into account each country's challenges and opportunities at country level, developed strategies accordingly and thus had been successful in all three countries.

CHINA

The concepts of "green jobs" or "green economy" are highly relevant for the development context in China. The pollution (air, water and soils) and ecologically deteriorating environment are threatening China's environment and becoming a liability for its economy. Given the conventional mode of production and development in the country will be no longer sustainable, the government is aware of this challenging situation; hence it has determined to promote economic restructuring and transformation.

China has been active and innovative in climate change mitigation. In 2006, the China State Council endorsed to set up China Cleaner Development Mechanism (CDM) fund and management centre. In 2007, the CDM Fund was officially established and put into operation to support the Chinese government to cope with the issue of climate change and promote social and economic sustainable developments in the country. In 2013, the fund distributed 2.9 billion RMB concessional loans to support 44 projects for industrial innovations and gave RMB 710 million as grant to support 364 projects in national and local climate change policy research, capacity building and public awareness raising².

The concept of green jobs is rather new in China: the term "green jobs" or "green employment" did not figure on the Ministry of Human Resources (MOHRSS) website at the launch of the project. The concept is still new and little known to both government officials and to the general population of China, although earlier work by the ILO's Regional Office for Asia and the Pacific had initiated a first round of reflections

China was, however, one of the first ILO member states to start technical cooperation on green jobs with the ILO. In a short period of time, four research projects on different issues related to green jobs promotion have been completed³.

The objective of the project was to improve the ability and commitment of stakeholders in China to formulate and implement skills for green job development strategies. To achieve this objective, the project focused on development of a training curriculum in Nanjing expecting that it would be used as a reference and replicated for upscaling at the national level. According to Mr Liu Yutong and Ms Ren, director and deputy of the international cooperation at MOHRSS, the training materials were developed by NVSTIC in Nanjing and will be put into testing in industrial technical schools and vocational colleges in the country.

By focusing on skills development for green jobs, the project (i) pioneered the relevance of the work, (ii) demonstrated how to assess green jobs opportunities, (iii) how to do skills greening and (iv) how to translate them into vocational education for preparing human resources to

² Information was quoted from the website of the Ministry of Finance, China.

³ <http://www.ilo.org/beijing/areas-of-work/green-jobs/lang--en/index.htm>, accessed on 21st April 2015

undertake the green jobs. In this regard, the pilot project, together with other related projects in China provided important direction to future policies and initiatives related to greening of jobs and skills in China.

MEXICO

In 2010, the 16th Conference of the Parties to the Framework Convention of the United Nations on Climate Change took place in Cancun, Mexico. Mexico had a primary role in organizing this convention. Between 2007-2015, Mexico took actions towards transitioning to a low-carbon economy, by developing strategies, making appropriate policies and founding institutes to mitigate the effects and causes of climate change⁴.

Until 2013, Mexico had not formally included the concept of green jobs and made substantial policies focused on a green economy. Therefore, the ILO project had addressed a very important gap in the transition to green economy.

The project was executed in Mexico in line with the planned project activities which included: (i) awareness building and capacity building related to green jobs for stakeholders, (ii), developing the study on the Potential for Green Jobs in Mexico, which provides the key partners and stakeholders access to knowledge and evidence on sectors with green jobs potential, and (iii) creating a mechanism for dialogue focused on development of public action plans and policies on green jobs through the integration of a three-party expanded group and the creation of the Interdepartmental Committee for Green Jobs. Furthermore, a federal public policy was attained by the Ministry of the Environment and Natural Resources (Semarnat).

Based on the preceding, as the stakeholders attested, the ILO Project coincided fully with country priorities to foster transition towards a green economy and was capable of providing inputs (technical and human) valuable for the inclusion of green jobs as a subject in national environmental policy.

TURKEY

Turkey is expected to be one of the fastest growing economies of the OECD members during 2014-2016, with an annual average growth rate of 3.6 percent⁵. The government's 2023 vision sets forth ambitious development goals, including making Turkey one of the world's ten largest economies and completing full membership negotiations with the EU by 2023. Although at the moment, Turkey stands out as a relatively low carbon emission country per unit of GDP, its emissions increased much faster than in other OECD countries in recent decades and aggregate CO2 emissions are estimated to triple by 2030 according to a World Bank study⁶.

While on one side, the country is pressed with needs and consequences of economic growth and necessity to create new employment opportunities, climate mitigation policies and environmental problems require immediate attention since they are posing severe threats to

⁴ Mexico has developed a National Strategy on Climate Change (NSCC), a Special Program on Climate Change (SPCC), a General Law on Climate Change and has formed an Inter-sector Commission on Climate Change (ICCC), the National Ecology and Climate Change Institute (NECCI)

⁵ <http://www.invest.gov.tr/en-us/turkey/factsandfigures/pages/economy.aspx>

⁶ Turkey Green Growth Policy Paper: Towards a Greener Economy
<https://openknowledge.worldbank.org/bitstream/handle/10986/16088/781150ESW0Whit0cy0Paper0FINAL0FINAL.pdf?sequence=1>

the future wellbeing of the country both economically and socially. A detailed environmental health valuation based on air pollution levels and the historical growth and population trajectories suggests that without any intervention, the rise in urban air pollution emissions in Turkey will cost between 1% - 4.5% of GDP from 2010-2030 in the absence of control measures⁷. Thus transition to green economy is essential part of national and international agenda.

Turkey's 10th Development Plan⁸, roadmap for Turkey's policy making 2014-2018, addresses the need to mitigate climate change and attain sustainable practices while maintaining economic growth, however there is a lack of a concrete action plan for the country's transition to the green economy. While the renewable energy sector and clean technologies have been rapidly growing, with government subsidies and supporting policies, the 10th Development Plan refers to 'green growth' and 'sustainable development', but does not mention 'green jobs'. The growing renewable energy market has been an *impetus* for providing new green labour opportunities.

In line project objectives, the project in Turkey created a task force comprised of stakeholders from government, trade unions and academia. The task force was highly engaged during the workshops, where the main problem of 'green jobs' definition and perceptions were discussed. The project also held green jobs training, generated a private sector green jobs case study, and looked into the most possible data collection methods on green jobs despite the lack of up-to-date information on input output matrix. All of these activities resulted in the project raising awareness on green jobs, capacity building and increasing the knowledge base of green jobs for participating stakeholders.

While the concept of green jobs is new and needs to be internalized and applied in the country's growth plans, the interviews with stakeholders reveal that the project successfully targeted the main problems for Turkey's transition to decent work in green economy and sought solutions to them.

⁷ Turkey Green Growth Policy Paper: Towards a Greener Economy
<https://openknowledge.worldbank.org/bitstream/handle/10986/16088/781150ESW0Whit0cy0Paper0FINAL0FINAL.pdf?sequence=1>

⁸ The 10th National Development Plan for 2013-2018, prepared by Ministry of Development
<http://www.kalkinma.gov.tr/Lists/Kalkinma%20Planlar/Attachments/12/Onuncu%20Kalk%C4%B1nma%20Plan%C4%B1.pdf>

4.2 Project Design

For the 'Decent Work in Green Economy', the projects at national level differ significantly due to variances in country cultures and policy making. The projects at national level were designed considering the needs of the country activities and outcomes, taking into consideration country specific circumstances with regard to labour markets as well as necessary tools for policy making. The immediate objective was to make the most impact with the project activities in each country

CHINA

In China, the project strategy opted for working at provincial level in order to test and pilot a green jobs approach, with a view to building the case for national policy reform at a later stage. The project targeted a relatively economically prosperous province. Furthermore, the field office identified the need to build skills in one of China's fastest growing sectors, construction. Due to its size and variances at policy making and governing at provincial level, it was determined that, it would be difficult to persuade the government and the general public to shift to new policies, strategies and actions for green jobs immediately. Therefore to realize the benefits of the project, it was determined attainable to focus on capacity building for green jobs in a select province and run a pilot project for a demonstration purpose, which would, if proved to be successful, have long-term impacts at the national level. The pilot project focused on skills development in the energy efficiency-building sector in the prosperous province of Nanjing, where there was already existing research done on greening buildings.

In Nanjing, the project focused on green jobs and skill gaps assessment, and demonstrating how to develop training curricula based on greening skills for selected occupations in the energy efficiency building sector. According to officials at the department of international cooperation of MOHRSS, once the training materials are finalized developed and tested by NVSTIC in Nanjing, they are to be put into further testing in more industrial technical schools and vocational colleges in the country. At the time of this internal evaluation, the development of the training curriculum and trainer's guide, and its testing in selected TVET institutions were not finalized. This process is scheduled to end by August 2015.

The design of the project was in general appropriate, nevertheless, the project could have involved other technical departments from MOHRSS to provide guidance and ensure that the experience from Nanjing could be tested and replicated in more places in China.

MEXICO

Although the projects in Mexico and Turkey seem similar in terms of their objectives to raise awareness and capacity building, once again country specific dynamics played an important role. Due to the stakeholders' willingness to study green jobs potential in Mexico, the project activity prioritized the statistical study. Also, the project in Mexico developed an online knowledge-sharing platform as part of capacity building.

The interviewed stakeholders believe that the project established a solid base for work and collaboration between governmental agencies, social and private stakeholders. In addition, they agree that the form and quality of work, along with ILO's commitment and implementation team generated an environment of trust and credibility.

Specific actions were planned and executed based on the interaction and response of the stakeholders. Once these actions were established, a detailed planning was observed for each activity. Gender issues were addressed by inviting participation of the agencies in charge of this topic to help define gender criteria in the development of green employment policies. However the green jobs assessment considered this issue in a limited manner, not putting enough emphasis on the gender aspect.

TURKEY

The project was designed around the inclusion and guidance of the task force, which increased engagement of stakeholders and included them in the project process. The project identified the need to create a task force composed of representatives from stakeholders. The stakeholders were identified by ILO Country office staff. The task force met regularly and ILO created a common platform for all stakeholders to voice their concerns, raise questions and construct forward looking plans. The task force actively participated in workshops coordinated and facilitated by ILO to identify problems and create solutions for transition to the green economy.

Due to the necessity for capacity building for the task force members, the project allocated a budget for green jobs training. The task force members indicated that this has been instrumental in raising awareness and helping them to get a better grasp on the issue. One of the most important elements of 'transition to green economy' is capacity building. The stakeholders emphasized that they also need to feel confident in their understanding of what green economy entails and what they can do within their organizations during the transition period.

Lack of data on green jobs has been one of the most pressing concerns for the stakeholders and given the budget constraint on data collection for the project, the only possible option was to conduct an online survey on green jobs.

Although the project did not include the private sector in the task force directly, the private sector was represented by employers' confederation. Furthermore, a green jobs case study in the private sector was conducted for the project. As mentioned above, the private sector has been a major driver of sustainable practices in the green economy, thus the necessity to include the private sector emerges as the case study also revealed their endeavours.

We consider that the project activities were designed consistently with the desired outcomes of the project and with what was possible within the budget constraints of the project.

4.3 Project Progress and Effectiveness

In all three countries, the project evaluators referred to the logical framework matrix for the activities that were to be completed to achieve the outputs in line with the project's objectives. Based on meetings with stakeholders, the project successfully came to close in all three countries, despite minor setbacks that were realized along the course of the project. The projects in all three countries:

- raised awareness on green jobs;
- increased capacity building on stakeholder level; and
- provided tangible outcomes from tripartite member dialogues, creating impact within and among institutions.

There had been some shortcomings due to country specific problems such as the unavailability of meaningful data from the constructed green jobs survey in Turkey, or the change of staff in the ILO Beijing Office. In both of these instances, the implementation team adapted to the needs to effectively allocate the project resources.

In China, the main activity was to develop the training materials. Despite the fact that this activity surpassed its deadline, it was successfully implemented. On the other hand, the projects in Mexico and Turkey, achieved the project activities in line with the timing of the project. Nevertheless, some activities proved to be ineffective in both Mexico and Turkey, and not impactful. For example, a knowledge-sharing platform was created for Mexico, but due to lack of data to track the utilization of the website, the evaluator was dependent on the answers of interviewed stakeholders, thus limiting the capacity of this evaluation to provide a fair assessment. For the project in Turkey it was not possible to conduct a green jobs assessment, because of the input-output matrix since data has not been updated in the past years and therefore did not provide adequate employment data. As a result, a green jobs survey, as second best option, had to be conducted online to keep the budget low, as stated in the report. Unfortunately this did not sufficiently provide the expected results, in addition to a low response rate. This prevented the ILO team to fully use the results of the data collection for a comprehensive, analytical report.

CHINA

From the implementation point of view, most planned activities and outputs were completed, nevertheless, despite the fact that the last group of activities were delayed including training material development and pilot testing⁹. Though the project was closed, with combined funding from ILO regional office at Bangkok, technical support as well as daily coordination from the ILO Beijing will continue after August 2015. This is expected to help ensure a smooth completion of project activities in China.

With regard to project activities, it was found that the pilot project in China followed the planned project implementation activities including, organizing consultation workshops, and developing training materials. Activities such as pilot testing to collect feedbacks for improvement of the training materials, mainstreaming / dissemination of the local experience in Nanjing and development of policy recommendations by constituents are yet to be completed.

⁹ These activities will be due for completion by August 2015. A project contract addendum was made in April 2015 to extend the completion till August 2015.

In addition to the planned activities, the project also contracted the collaborating partners and project task force to carry out other studies, such as preparing reports on occupations and skills assessment in the energy efficiency building sector or green jobs and green skills development. In 2012, "Green jobs assessment focusing on boiler sector" (prepared by Institute of Labour Studies, "Report on occupations and skills assessment in the energy efficiency building sector" (prepared by East South University) and in 2014, "Report on promoting green jobs and green skills development" (prepared by MOHRSS), were very significant information for this project. The first two studies acted as project baseline to assess green jobs opportunities and demand as well as skills gaps in technical and a decision making criteria about which areas the project should focus for skills development as a demonstration. After consultations with project partners, NVSTIC and MOHRSS, the project decided to choose the intelligent building as a sector for training curriculum development.

The interviews and discussions with the NVSTIC showed that they were not aware of the steps or sequence and therefore simply put a huge emphasis on developing training textbooks for training. Thus, it was understood that the project could have provided more methodological guidance for training curriculum development to make the process smoother.

Nevertheless, the project effectiveness can best be reflected in the improved capacities of the participating institutions, where they carried studies and increased their capacities through knowledge building. The stakeholders including NVSTIC, the colleges and enterprises had in general enhanced their capacities regarding assessing green jobs, analysing green skills gaps, developing training curriculum based on required greening skills. Furthermore the leaders of NVSTIC were also following the leads of the project for future projects.

The impact of the project can be observed when the participating stakeholders took a forward-looking view on developing a new service model for the building sector based on the current project. The project's major impact was in the development of new thinking and practice on a new service model, where NVSTIC and the participating colleges and enterprises are developing an "integrated system of technical equipment plus human resource for energy saving, materials saving and low emissions".

The NVSTIC and collaborating colleges and enterprises had already compiled a vocational training textbook on green estate property management, where the training book contains, e.g. equipment management with energy saving added to conventional operations and maintenance. It was the first time that energy saving was integrated into vocational training.

The project officers changed three times during the life of the project. Shortcomings of this arrangement were that it had to take quite some time for the successors to familiarize themselves with all project implementation updates, which was confirmed by the third project officer. This obviously caused low efficiency, even a short coordination "break", as mentioned by NVSTIC.

MEXICO

The project in Mexico was successfully implemented, (i) raising awareness and capacity building among stakeholders related to green jobs and economics, (ii) development of the study on potential for green jobs in Mexico and (iii) creation of a mechanism for dialogue focusing on development of public action plans and policies on green jobs.

The stakeholders pointed out that the project complemented the position on the national agenda on the topic of green jobs and generated the fundamentals for reaching a consensus on a definition of Green and Decent Jobs, while examining the benefits, challenges and opportunities in transitioning to green economy. The stakeholders also considered that the most useful project activity was the establishment of dialogue mechanisms, since it brought together several interested sectors around the topic of green jobs.

Awareness and skills development was one of the most important objectives, and was completed successfully. The first step, undertaken by project implementation team, was to identify project participants, from federal public sector, labour unions, academia, diplomatic sector, as well as technical and financial international cooperation. Based on stakeholder feedback, there were an excellent variety of stakeholders in terms of institutions and actors with knowledge and/or influence on the subject of green jobs and economy were appropriately selected for the project. It was possible to obtain participation from the federal public sector, labour unions, academia, diplomatic sector, as well as technical and financial international cooperation. Thus this represents the support and interest from the stakeholder institutions on the subject and a greater possibility of assuming responsibility, within these institutions.

Throughout the project, training activities were conducted. Based on the outcome of the interviews, the stakeholder participation in capacity-building activities was greater than originally expected. The stakeholders said that the topics were adequate and the speakers were of high quality, but they also added that they would welcome an environment which would support an informal dialogue between the participants. As part of the activity of identifying gaps in knowledge and recognition of the interests of learning of stakeholders, the stakeholders stated that they would welcome a formal consultation process to jointly design the process.

Further to the above mentioned activities, as part of awareness and skills development, the Virtual Green Jobs Knowledge Sharing Platform (www.empleosverdes.mx.ilo.org) was created¹⁰ and operated from August 1, 2013 to September 20, 2014. According to the operation report for the Webpage, the site had 2,104 hits in the month of November 2013, however, for this evaluation, a report of total visits was not available, as well as documents integrated and downloaded during the period the Webpage was active. Online discussions and consultations through the platform to discuss the findings of the Study were not available due to lack of staff to carry out activities. From effectiveness point of view, there is not enough data on how the stakeholders utilized this platform. Half of those interviewed commented that they made very little use of the virtual platform, while the rest of those interviewed indicated that they did not access the Webpage. All those interviewed considered that the platform was of little use and unnecessary and only one person indicated that the contents were mostly focused on newsletters that were already arriving through e-mail.

The study of Green Jobs Potential in Mexico was a significant outcome of the project. Two studies on the potential for green jobs in Mexico were conducted, one with a national scope and the other referring to a specific sector. The activity of raising awareness of the study was accomplished by making the preliminary results of the study known at the National Forum on Green Jobs and at several meetings with the participants. Participating stakeholders unanimously considered the study as a good start to quantify green jobs and initial input for Mexico to have an estimation methodology. As part of the project, the ILO headquarters provided assistance to develop a methodology towards this study, and this will provide a basis for future endeavours as well as save time to generate similar information at institutions. The

¹⁰ Developed by the firm Media Factory.

ILO Project First Progress Report indicated that the study outcomes were presented at a national and international level.

The project created a social dialogue-oriented design and implementation of action plans. The tripartite group was created to include the public, private and labour union sectors, as well as the social, international cooperation and academia sectors. Representation of each sector averaged out to 50% for the public sector, 26% private sector and 24% the other sectors (social, unions and national and international environmental organizations and financial cooperation institutions).

The tripartite group formalized and structured its operation through the creation of the Inter-sector Committee for Green Jobs, created with resources provided by Green Jobs through the Prosperity Fund of the British Embassy in Mexico and had the backing and participation of ILO.

Most of those interviewed commented that the committee functioned very well in fostering dialogue, but suggested that in the future, it should focus on developing projects and/or specific actions, where participating institutions would have specific responsibilities.

The stakeholders commented that although participation of Ministry of Labour did not result in specific development actions or policy making, it affected the effectiveness of the project results because of its influence on regulation of labour relations, promotion of work productivity and the development of capabilities within the work force.

Also, both consultants and stakeholder interviewed, considered critical the absence of active participation from several agencies that were key to achieving the generation of green jobs, namely representatives from the Ministry of Economy, National Council on Science and Technology and Ministry of Energy¹¹.

This indicates that despite Ministry of Environment's leadership on the subject of green jobs, a cross-sectional participation is required among agencies to be effective in the development of all the elements needed in the political cycle for generating green businesses and jobs. The interviews incentivized stakeholders to re-establish contact to work jointly.

It is important to consider the development of action plans and/or public policies to evaluate the project's impact. The Ministry of Environment included a measure to generate 1 million green jobs by 2018 in Environmental Sector Program 2013-2018. Training and awareness activities were created on green jobs for agencies/organizations in the public sector and labour unions, in relation to quantification of green jobs. Another vital impact of the project has been its impact on stakeholders, whose vision has broadened on the concept of green jobs. Furthermore, the fact that an international organization such as ILO supported this project validated the importance of the project.

TURKEY

All stakeholders interviewed declared that the project had successfully completed its activities, providing a common platform for stakeholders to engage in constructive dialogues. All interviewed stakeholders mentioned that they benefited from being part of the task force, attending training, engaging in productive dialogues over definitions and action plans in defining green jobs in Turkey. The project had provided a common ground for stakeholders to

¹¹ Organic Law of Public Federal Administration. DOF 30/7/2014.

work together, included the stakeholders effectively, and stakeholder engagement was satisfactory. Moreover, the project activities led to awareness building among stakeholders and tangible impacts. According to the stakeholders, the problem with green jobs data collection is two-fold, one that focuses on definitions of green jobs and the other on the data to be gathered on green jobs.

All stakeholders clearly identified the immediate need to collect data on 'green jobs'. The word "data" was mentioned a total of 53 times in 8 interviews with regard to the challenges the stakeholders are facing in terms of developing necessary actions and policies without appropriate and meaningful data. Concerns with data availability were mentioned by all of the stakeholders interviewed for the evaluation. In June 2013, a workshop was conducted with 19 participants where one of the activities was to define green jobs, especially for statistical and measuring purpose, according to the report on Green Jobs Training in Turkey.

The lack of data on green jobs is one of the most important drawbacks for analysis and policy making. The ILO project realized the importance of the data component and made an attempt to initially collect data. However due to lack of up-to-date data in the input-output matrix, it was impossible to base any findings on the outdated data. Therefore the best option was to devise a survey and collect data online due to budget constraints and as part of the project, an online survey was collected on green jobs. However unfortunately there was a very low response rate and the number of observations captured in the online survey was too small to publish any results. This undertaking had to be dismissed due to the low response rate to the online survey. Therefore, the pressing need for data collection is still relevant and should probably be taken on in later stages of the project with an expanded budget or involvement of stakeholders such as Eurostat and TURKSTAT.

Definition of 'what is green job vs. what is green economy': In Turkey, there is a need to clearly define the 'jobs' in the 'green economy'. The lack of definition about what is a green job was mentioned 51 times by all interviewees in a total of 8 interviews. The ILO held a 3-day course in June 2013, which identified this problem. During the workshops stakeholders declared that they spent a great deal of time agreeing on definitions. In particular, the difference between concepts like green growth and green economy were discussed in great length, during which participants agreed on the need to have a theoretical clear distinction. Although there has been progress for the stakeholders for capacity building, these definitions must be made part of national curriculum so that they will serve as basis for data collection and policy making.

Due to needs to remain competitive in the global market place, Turkish government effectively employed policies to enable and support renewable energy and clean technologies. Furthermore, the private sector has adopted clean technologies to comply with European Union directives and requirements. Therefore there have been initiatives undertaken by the government to encourage environmentally friendly and sustainable practices. The 10th Development Plan, the overarching action plan for the foreseeable future and the development of policies, clearly identifies renewable energy and clean technologies, but does not lay out concrete actions for green jobs. The interviewees mentioned the 10th Development Plan 13 times during the interviews and the Plan was mentioned by 5 of 8 interviewees in the study. The emphasis on the 10th Development Plan is important because it is deemed as the roadmap for Turkey's economic and political agenda. Therefore integrating concepts or definitions to this national plan is an indication that it is going to become part of national curriculum.

The stakeholder engagement has been successfully done during the project. The participants, who were interviewed after project completion, implied that the fact that the project has been facilitated by an international organization such as ILO had made the project highly productive and created a non-political common platform, thus all stakeholders participated without any reservations. They also realized that the transition to green jobs requires an inter-disciplinary approach, thus participation of an array of stakeholders in goal setting and policy making. All participants mentioned that they would have expected representatives from Ministry of Environment to be more engaged and to participate during the task force meetings. Aside from this remark that was mentioned by all interviewees, they considered that the stakeholder engagement was very positive.

One of the main objectives of the project was to raise awareness on green jobs and the stakeholders identified that the project has been extremely instrumental in awareness building. Most of the participants said that the concept of green economy has not been an issue they have looked into until participating in this project. The project's instrumentality in awareness building came up 13 times during discussions with all of the stakeholders. Perhaps this has been the most visible impact of the project, where the stakeholders can now identify what green jobs are and feel more confident with their level of knowledge.

One of the most visible impacts of the project has been the stakeholders' recommendations for the 10th Development Plan and integrating the output of the 'Transition to Green Economy' project into documents prepared for policymaking. With respect to the impact on the project on the 10th Development Plan, it has been mentioned 11 times by the interviews and 5 of 7 stakeholders mentioned that the project had an impact on decision-making by policy makers. After participating in trainings, the stakeholders ensured to insert the concept of 'green jobs' into the discussions and documents for state planning. Although it may not seem a direct effect on policy making, it will surely create a triggering impact at institutional in the future.

One of the objectives of the project was to increase capacity building and knowledge sharing at the stakeholder level and identify the right means to achieve this with the task force. While, the stakeholders realize their institutions are still struggling on the definitions and data, they are aware that capacity building and knowledge sharing will equip them with tools to make appropriate policies and projects for transition to green economy. Three of the interviewed 8 stakeholders mentioned the importance of capacity building both at a stakeholder level and later at industrial level. Yet they did not express clear action steps as an output of this project. The problem has two-sides to it. On one side, the stakeholders are aware of their own need to receive additional training on green jobs. On the other side, they aspire to create new employment opportunities and thus need to clearly be able to list the skill set necessary for them. Three out of eight interviewed stakeholders mentioned the importance of capacity building at the organizational level. Two of the stakeholders identified the problems addressing the necessary skills for green jobs, thus preparing the right curriculum. Six of the eight stakeholders mentioned the positive impact of the training in Turin on green jobs. It was evident that the Turin training had a positive impact and was acknowledged as 'informative' and 'eye-opener' by many of the stakeholders in the project.

4.4 Project Management and Resources

The projects in all three countries effectively used the budget. The global project manager at HQ Geneva made timely provisions for budget revisions to increase efficiency. The project teams at country offices focused on the most impactful activities in terms of resources. Challenges due to specific country problems have been overcome by reallocating the project budget across prioritized activities. Thus, with a limited budget, the project for the most part accomplished the set goals.

CHINA

In terms of resource use for this pilot project in China, the main funding came from the Flanders government, which was USD 80,000. Resources had been effectively used for this project focusing the allocation mainly on training curriculum development, consultancy for project implementation and a national conference.

Three different project officers were assigned to the project consecutively through this period. The problem with this arrangement was that it had to take quite some time for the successors to familiarize themselves with all project implementation and updates, which was confirmed by the third project officer. This obviously caused low efficiency, even a short coordination “break”, as mentioned by NVSTIC.

In terms of technical support for capacity building of the main stakeholders the stakeholders believe that the technical support was not enough. There should be more organized trainings and following up backstopping, also with more handout materials to strengthen capacity building. The project could have also provided more experiences from other countries to China for a reference, which was requested by the NVSTIC.

| Total Budget for China | |
|---|-----------|
| First National Conference | \$20,000 |
| Staff Time | \$40,000 |
| Consultancy to prepare for Phase II of project implementation | \$27,000 |
| Training Curriculum Development | \$20,000 |
| First Task Force meeting Nanjing | \$5,000 |
| Travel | \$6,000 |
| TOTAL | \$118,000 |
| ILO RBTC contribution: \$25,000 | |

MEXICO

Overall, the budget was effectively allocated and used for the project, except the virtual green jobs knowledge-sharing platform. One-third of the budget was used for this platform and all stakeholders interviewed contested the necessity and usability of this website. All stakeholders believed that the activities focused on capacities development, dialogue mechanism and the green jobs assessment were equally cost effective.

| Total Budget for Mexico | |
|--|-----------|
| Green Jobs Assessment | \$30,000 |
| Preparation and printing of summary assessment report | \$3,000 |
| Knowledge Sharing Platform | \$30,000 |
| National Workshop on Green Jobs | \$30,000 |
| Sectoral Assessment | \$5,000 |
| National Forum on Green Jobs | \$2,600 |
| Meetings and consultations with stakeholders and task force | \$4,000 |
| Travel | \$9,000 |
| TOTAL | \$113,600 |
| ILO RBTC contribution \$25,000 plus staff time as in-kind contribution | |

TURKEY

In terms of the resources, the stakeholders in Turkey believe the project was efficiently managed. When the budget is analysed, it is evident that the project allocated the resources to activities that were seen as the most binding constraints related to the green economy, namely capacity building and stakeholder engagement.

| Total Budget for Turkey | |
|---|-----------|
| Green Jobs Training | \$17,400 |
| Final Conference | \$15,000 |
| Green Jobs Case Study | \$6,000 |
| Green Jobs Survey | \$8,000 |
| Cost of Project Launch | \$3,000 |
| Participation in inter-agency meeting on green jobs assessment in Turin | \$2,900 |
| Participation in green business conference in 9/2013 | \$3,000 |
| Costs task force meetings | \$3,500 |
| Travel | \$4,000 |
| Staff Costs | \$49,000 |
| TOTAL | \$113,500 |
| ILO RBTC contribution: \$40,000 | |

(i) Task force creation, stakeholder engagement and capacity building efforts comprised 70% percent of the project budget. The project in Turkey allocated the largest portion of the budget to taskforce creation and stakeholder engagement because the success of this project depended on capacity building at the stakeholder level and their engagement throughout the process. The most productive means to increase capacity building is by ensuring to engage the stakeholders in the dialogue, make them part of the process and increase their knowledge. It is evident from the stakeholders' interviews that it is these face-to-face interactions and capacity building efforts were most appreciated by the counterparts throughout the project.

(ii) Data collection efforts comprised 7 percent of the project budget in Turkey. As mentioned above, one of the most vital missing pieces of information is the lack of data for green jobs. The project team had to choose the option of an online jobs survey in order to collect data, since there was a small amount of funding allocated to data collection. The green jobs turned out to be insufficient to aggregate enough data due to its data collection methodology with a limited budget. The stakeholders realize that data aggregation of this magnitude would require a significantly larger budget and that this project did not have the sufficient resources to achieve this outcome.

(iii) A case study covering the endeavours of the private sector has been conducted, allocating 6 % of the project budget. In this study, best practices from private sector were compiled and presented to the task force, which was composed of government and employers' unions. The impact of the case study is not evident from stakeholders view. Nevertheless, it is a clear indication of private sector spearheading green economy measures within their domains. An expert from the Turkey Ministry of Development said that case studies that reveal best practices are always useful, nevertheless they were not sure why this particular set of companies were selected for the case study. She also added that they wondered what kinds of questions were asked and that they would appreciate further transparency with regards to the design of the study and sample selection. Having pointed these concerns out, it is evident that the case study showed the government organizations what kind of initiatives private sector is taking on towards achieving the goal of having sustainable businesses.

(iii) Knowledge Transfer within Institutions: 3 of the 8 interviewees mentioned the high turnover at their organizations and/or other potential problems that limited their participation at task force meetings. From each organization, there were two or three experts and one general manager attending the meetings. Nevertheless, due to occasional events like sickness and pregnancy, some of them could not participate at task force meetings throughout the project duration. The interviewees mentioned that it would be difficult -in any case- for the same staff to consistently attend the meetings. The main issue is to make sure the organization prioritizes green economy in part of work plan, however we believe that the high turnover of staff that engaged in the project meetings may negatively affect the transfer of knowledge within institutions.

4.5 Sustainability

The sustainability of the 'Decent Work in the Green Economy' Project will differ in each country. Of all the participating countries, the project in China lagged behind in timing, but its objective of building a training curriculum is easily replicable and scalable. While in Mexico, the project generated a shared vision and positioned the subject matter as an area of environmental and labour opportunities. In Turkey, the project successfully prepared the groundwork for discussion and future projects for green jobs. Nevertheless, the stakeholders are vague about assuming responsibilities to carry forward the objectives of the project. Both stakeholders in Turkey and Mexico are anticipating ILO to further build on the existing projects and expand on them.

CHINA

Though the concept of green jobs and green skills is new to China, the project clearly showed positive effectiveness (methodological capacity building) and impacts on occupation management as well as on green sectoral transformation. All these indicated a higher likelihood of sustaining the business of promoting green jobs and skills development in China.

The NVSTIC and their collaborating colleges and enterprises were still continuing with the innovative development of a new service model for the building sector. The stakeholders such as NVSTIC and colleges as training institutions and enterprises participating in the project declared that they are likely to continue with the work of training provision and training materials development with greening skills included.

Last but not least, the project focal point from the MOHRSS said that they would treat the achievements in Nanjing as a national success and would put the training curriculum into further testing and replication in more vocational technical schools and colleges in China to draw experience and lessons for national policy development.

MEXICO

The stakeholders stated that this project had an ideal design by integrating the development of capacities, generation of hard facts and establishing a mechanism for dialogue. However, they believe that a mechanism for the project sustainability is absent. They pointed out the need to appoint a standing committee for future tasks. Moreover, they feel that the project ended abruptly, where there was no formal closure with the presentation of the results achieved. The stakeholders wanted to know if ILO was withdrawing from the project or rather establishing the phase 2 of this project.

It should be pointed out that all the stakeholders interviewed continue working on the topic of green jobs in their respective fields, but not within a group, except for the case of Semarnat-INEGI in the development of green jobs accounting. Though, among the participating stakeholders there is inertia and interest for reactivating the Committee. If a second phase were to follow, all those interviewed considered that it should focus on development of pilot projects, in addition to continuing the training and dialogue components.

TURKEY

While the interviewees stated that 'the Decent Work in the Green Economy' project was generally successfully completed, the task force members also mentioned they were anticipating the second phase of this project. Nevertheless, it is important to point out that none of the stakeholders were willing to assume the responsibility to carry forward the project without engagement of another stakeholder or an international organization such as ILO. Although all stakeholders expressed their desire to further work on this project, they said they would "only commit if there was leadership and budget to carry forward with the project", signalling the fact that when the project ends, they will not stay engaged unless there is a similar project.

All the stakeholders believed that international organizations are vital to offer a common non-political platform where all stakeholders can gather together and work. Their experience revealed that in the absence of ILO, it would be very hard for any institution to claim ownership of the project. This has been repeatedly mentioned and the stakeholders clearly expect the ILO to launch another project that will continue to build on the outputs of the existing one.

5. Conclusions

The project was concluded successfully in each of the three countries. Within the same overarching objectives to raise awareness and capacity building at stakeholder level for green jobs, the Decent Work in the Green Economy' project supported specific initiatives at country level adjusted to respond to country context and national priorities..

There were some lessons learned and recommendations to be extracted for future projects. The following section will provide conclusions, lessons learned, best practices and recommendations for respectively, China, Mexico and Turkey.

5.1 Main Conclusions by Country

CHINA

In general, this pilot project in China was highly relevant and impacted the participating stakeholders. The choice to implement the project in one province, Nanjing, and on a select sector, green buildings, narrowed the focus of the project in one of the world's largest economies.

- Project design was appropriate where the learning-by-doing approach helped create a pilot project to be used as a benchmark, given the varying demand for green jobs and green skills from different provinces.
- Project implementation was relatively smooth despite the disruption with the flow of the workload due to changing project officers. Studies on assessing green jobs opportunities and skills gaps were added to the implementation making the training materials development more meaningful.
- Capacity building at NVSTIC, participating colleges as training institutions and enterprises were successfully implemented. Furthermore, following this project, NVSTIC declared that they would be making an effort to develop a new service model. Current work in establishing a new service model by NVSTIC and completion of a training textbook for green estate management service and conducting of the training based on the textbook for an estate management company all add to the likelihood of the sustainability of the business of promoting green jobs and green skills development.
- A new label has been added to the revised version of Directory for Occupations Classification of China, which signals a sustainable impact on future green jobs and green skills.

MEXICO

- The project was implemented during a pivotal time in Mexico due to the actions that the country is implementing to transition towards a greener economy, and we consider that the project was appropriately designed.

- The most visible impact of the project was the design of a public policy at the federal level and the establishment of a multi-sector dialogue mechanism. Despite lack of participation by key institutions such as the Ministry of Economy, the Treasury and the Ministry of Energy, the project had an impact on participating institutions by generating a joint vision on the concept of green jobs, as well as its benefits, challenges and implications. It helped position the topic as an area of environmental and labour opportunity.
- Stakeholders declared that the project ended too suddenly and a formal closure would provide clarity on the future of the three-party group. A positive outcome of the project is that all the stakeholders interviewed, continue to work on the topic of green jobs and their respective fields of action and maintain interest and expectations that the Committee and work with ILO be reactivated.

TURKEY

- The project's implementation in Turkey was very instrumental in giving a start to the discussions among stakeholder on 'transition to green economy'. The project successfully achieved its main objective of awareness building and engaging stakeholders in dialogue over identifying the existing problems that hindered Turkey's transition to green economy and finding solutions.
- The project formed a task force composed of members from ministries, governmental organizations and employers' associations, representing the private sector. The task force regularly met and identified the key problems Turkey was facing for green jobs. It was generally mentioned during interviews that the participation in the task force was high. The governmental organizations also participated at the managerial, which indicates how much importance was given to this particular subject matter.
- Stakeholders received training on 'Decent Work in the Green Economy' and grasped the concept of green jobs. Although there were problems with respect to definition, through workshops and trainings they had been clarified for the participating stakeholders. The task force members evaluated the 'Green jobs' concept in Turkey to the best of their knowledge, despite the lack of data, and identified the steps to be taken to address the challenges.
- A survey to collect data on green jobs was conducted. It was however not successful in generating a sufficiently large sample size due to low response rate on the online survey. activity helped the team realize that a survey of that magnitude would require a significantly higher budget and ownership at a more central level on the part of the government. The project budget was efficiently allocated and the project outputs were delivered within the budget constraint.
- The sustainability of the project is expected to be low without further and on-going involvement of ILO in the future steps of the project.

5.2 Lessons Learned

CHINA

- The project tried to emphasize competency based training curriculum development as well as competency based skills development based on curriculum. At the time of evaluation, the NVSTIC and participating colleges and enterprises did only one module of the curriculum for intelligent building energy efficiency. After reviewing this module, it was found out that the module still follows the conventional structure, in the format of a textbook rather than curriculum. This indicates an insufficient technical advice and guidance to the local partner for training curriculum development.
- The project in China mainly differed because developing a training curriculum at national level was not possible due to country specific policy making challenges. Therefore national assessments were done which slowed down the process at provincial level.
- Another key lesson for the project was the fact that three different officers worked on the implementation over the course of the project. From the perspective of business continuity, this has surely interrupted the flow of the project and decreased its efficiency.
- The project produced quite a number of documents, some are in both Chinese and English, and others are in English or Chinese only. These files were grouped in folders named as Nanjing, national level and project mission. Most files did not specify dates when the activity was conducted and when the document was produced. Nevertheless file management should be improved and strengthened, e.g. files could be grouped by both project stakeholders and also along a timeline.

MEXICO

- The stakeholders repeatedly pointed out the necessity to have an implementation plan for the project and identification of stakeholder needs, as well as validation of proposed activities to ensure the efficient use of resources in activities.
- It is also recommended that a formal project closure activity be conducted with stakeholders in order to make known the results achieved, maintain an adequate image of ILO and continue project sustainability.
- Lastly, it is necessary to establish in the project design a mechanism for project sustainability.

TURKEY

- Extracting data for a relatively large size country like Turkey (with a 75 million population) on green jobs turned out to be an extremely demanding process in terms of resources. Therefore it was understood that data collection requires a larger budget and needs to be handled separately.

- Stakeholders felt the project was able to bring different constituents together because it was led by an international multilateral organization like the ILO.

5.3 Good Practices

CHINA

- Given the size of the country and governance within different provinces, narrowing the focus on one province increased the likelihood of the pilot project to be replicated.
- Moreover, assessing the most attainable goal for capacity building has also helped the project to look into skills gaps in one sector as opposed to providing a broad, but less useful curriculum preparation.

MEXICO

- ILO's leadership in this project strengthened its capacity and leadership capability. Moreover, the implementation team achieved credibility and confidence due to their knowledge of the topic, further summoning the leadership of the project.
- The fact that the project generated tangible facts had been one of the achievements of the project. This project in Mexico was designed very well by integrating the development of capacities, producing hard facts and establishing a mechanism for dialogue.

TURKEY

- Stakeholders particularly enjoyed the three-day course, where concepts on green jobs were explained and developed through workshops, interactive sessions were held on how to make green jobs as part of national curriculum. They also said that the found the site visits very beneficial and liked seeing real world examples first hand.
- The presence of ILO has made a great deal of difference because stakeholders did not look for underlying motivations or any hidden agendas that could be formed between their counterparts.

5.4 Recommendations

CHINA

- There was not much emphasis in project activities on training and awareness raising for promoting the concept of green jobs and green skills. As this is a new concept, which was first proposed by ILO and other related UN organizations around 2007, awareness raising must be done at a larger scale to gain attention and recognition from the government, enterprises, and the general public. It is recommended that future similar projects should spend considerable efforts and energy in communicating with the Ministry of Labour and or other related organizations for sensitizing the new

concept and ideas, as interventions usually follow improved awareness or recognitions.

- Stakeholders mentioned that the technical support was insufficient during training curriculum development. Therefore there must be technical support and training to make sure that training curriculum development for the selected area of energy efficiency or energy saving in intelligent building follows correct structure so that competencies (knowledge, skills and also attitude) are learned and understood.
- To increase effectiveness, the training curriculum development can be optimised; where occupations and necessary occupational standards are first defined, leading to understanding the skills required to meet those standards and finally to the necessary training curriculum development. Although work on the standards was supported by additional activities, more efforts are needed.

MEXICO

- Some of the key stakeholders were not active in the project. Drawing on specific issues that require attention/development for each sector and/or case studies that show the actions that for a certain case a specific sector had to undertake may increase participation from these participants. This shows the importance of creating actionable items.
- As part of the project, sharing best practices and lessons learned on how to foster green jobs should be pursued, considering the inclusion of women and the most disadvantaged. Formally inserting the gender equality issue into the project design, implementation plan, requirements and/or recommendations is advised.
- With Mexico taking a more active role in transitioning to green economy, identifying funds and investment programs specialized in clean technologies will incentivize stakeholder participation. Furthermore including stakeholders, research, and case studies from emerging sectors under expansion will promote the creation of green jobs (such as information technologies, biotechnology, advanced materials, nanotechnology, microelectronics, power electronics). This will lead to creating new job opportunities and supporting emerging sectors. Despite its success, the project outcomes have not been widely shared with the government. It is highly recommended to share those results in the future to increase the project's impact.
- Although stakeholders expressed their expectation for another ILO led project, if that does not take place it would still be possible to undertake specific activities with the Committee to support its operation with backing that had been provided by ILO. Furthermore, conducting a follow-up mechanism of stakeholder participation to foster participation from stakeholders/sectors in project activities will ensure sustainability of the project.

TURKEY

- The project has successfully accomplished the first step in raising awareness and capacity building on 'Transition to Green Economy within some key ministries. As the first of its kind, the project has been successful in igniting a dialogue on 'jobs in the green economy' among participants, leading participating stakeholders to integrate the concept into their agendas.
- It is important to include representative organizations from private sector in the possible future rounds of the project. The stakeholders for the project were selected from ILO counterparts, and therefore the private sector was represented by TISK (Turkish Confederation of Employers Association). TISK, an umbrella organization for the private sector, manages industrial relations on the employer's side, with six employers' organizations and represents over 92,000 enterprises. However only one such organization is still not enough to bring forward the challenges and opportunities that the private sector faces during the transition to green economy.
- The economic incentives can act as galvanizing tools while transitioning to the green economy, thus these have to be studies/activities that involve also the Ministry of Finance. As the task force members mentioned in their interviews, fiscal incentives can be very instrumental in implementing change effectively. The scenario presented above with regards to solar energy is a good example of the impact of fiscal incentives on changing behaviour. The transition to the green economy is seen by the private sector mainly as a "cost" and therefore fiscal incentives will be important in changing/adapting private sector firm behaviour. It is evident that economic incentives can be a driving force for change, yet they need to be calculated and planned effectively. Therefore in the next stages, it is advisable that the Ministry of Finance also be included in the discussions, and works with other stakeholders to study reasonable incentives for private sector.
- Perhaps the most important recommendation for this project is data collection with a field survey. The data component is very important since it is vital for assessing the green jobs potential, creating incentives and policy making. Without this kind of data, collected through face-to-face interviews, it will be difficult to track progress over time so in the next steps of the project, concrete steps to mainstream data collection on green jobs should be introduced if possible.
- TUIK, Turkey's statistical agency is responsible for gathering and analysing data on green jobs. Therefore influencing this organization at the macro level may provide data to all stakeholders for policy making and implementing. The institution generally always follows the steps of Eurostat in data collection efforts. Therefore, Eurostat's push for green jobs statistics can be very instrumental for mobilizing data collection in this field in Turkey at the central level. Focusing lobbying efforts on green jobs data collection with discussions at Eurostat may be the best way to proceed with trying to convince TUIK of the need to collect data domestically on this issue.

ANNEX I - Project Budget

| <u>ILO Project Costs</u> | |
|--|------------------|
| Program Support | \$67,678 |
| International Expert to backstop Green Jobs Assessments | \$68,000 |
| International Consultant for Research | \$20,000 |
| Coordination of Global Project | \$123,000 |
| Support countries to participate in global training events on green jobs | \$ 15,000 |
| Evaluation | \$10,000 |
| TOTAL | \$303,678 |

| Total Budget for Turkey | |
|---|------------------|
| Green Jobs Training | \$17,400 |
| Final Conference | \$15,000 |
| Green Jobs Case Study | \$6,000 |
| Green Jobs Survey | \$8,000 |
| Cost of Project Launch | \$3,000 |
| Participation in inter-agency meeting on green jobs assessment in Turin | \$2,900 |
| Participation in green business conference in 9/2013 | \$3,000 |
| Costs task force meetings | \$3,500 |
| Travel | \$4,000 |
| Staff Costs | \$49,000 |
| TOTAL | \$111,800 |
| ILO RBTC contribution: \$ 40,000 | |

| Total Budget for Mexico | |
|---|------------------|
| Green Jobs Assessment | \$30,000 |
| Preparation and printing of summary assessment report | \$3,000 |
| Knowledge Sharing Platform | \$30,000 |
| National Workshop on Green Jobs | \$30,000 |
| Sectoral Assessment | \$5,000 |
| National Forum on Green Jobs | \$2,600 |
| Meetings and consultations with stakeholders and task force | \$4,000 |
| Travel | \$9,000 |
| TOTAL | \$113,600 |
| ILO RBTC contribution \$ 25,000 plus staff time as in-kind contribution | |

| Total Budget for China | |
|---|------------------|
| First National Conference | \$20,000 |
| Staff Time | \$40,000 |
| Consultancy to prepare for Phase II of project implementation | \$27,000 |
| Training Curriculum Development | \$20,000 |
| First Task Force meeting Nanjing | \$5,000 |
| Travel | \$6,000 |
| TOTAL | \$118,000 |
| ILO RBTC contribution \$ 25,000 | |

ANNEX II - In-depth Interview Survey Instrument

Interview Questions for ILO staff

Relevance

What are the main challenges in your country towards green economy employment and do you think the pressing challenges were adequately addressed by the project?

How were project activities and strategies selected when you initially started the project?

Think of the main project activities, and assess which ones were most relevant and in the end most useful to project goals.

What would you have done differently today, if you could go back in time and redesign the project?

Efficiency

What was the project budget and how was it allocated across activities?

Do you feel that the project budget was efficiently allocated for this project?

If you were allocated the same budget again today, what would you have done differently?

Given there was continued and additional budget for the next three years, what would you do with the new allocated budget?

Effectiveness

The project focused on capacity building and knowledge sharing. Which of the stakeholders will actively utilize knowledge sharing via the ILO portal or other country specific sources in the future towards green job skills enhancement?

Did all identified stakeholders participate in the project? How did their engagement/or lack there of effect project outcome?

Which sectors were not adequately covered in this project due to misrepresentation? How can those be included in the future?

How would you evaluate cooperation among stakeholders and how do you think this has affected the outcome of the project?

Impact

What would you consider to be the most important achievement of the project?

What do you think were the weakest points of this project and how can those be improved?

How did stakeholder engagement evolve throughout the life of the project and how did this effect outcome and future collaborations?

Capacity building in green jobs seems to be one of the major challenges towards transition. Do you believe the outcome of this project will enhance knowledge sharing and capacity building in green economy and if so, how?

Sustainability

After the project is concluded, do you think the stakeholders will continue to engage with each other and cooperate to implement policy change?

What do you think are going to be the major hurdles towards realizing the goals of the project in the absence of ILO leadership and which stakeholders will actively take the lead in realizing the goals?

What are your and your institutions main take-aways from the project? How, if at all, do you think the project has contributed to the Green Economy agenda in Turkey?

Interview Questions for Non-Governmental Organizations/Trade Unions

Relevance

What is your institution's stand on 'transition to green economy' and where do you see your institution's impact with respect to 'transition to green economy'?

How many people participated in the project from your organization and were all of the participating staff actively engaged throughout the project? How did the staff's engagement affect your organization's participation at the project level?

What do you think are the most pressing challenges from employers' and employee's point of view to transition to Green Jobs? Do you think these challenges were adequately addressed during this project?

What kind of support do you need to transition to green economy and how do you assess cooperation among stakeholders with respect to supporting you?

What are the main challenges in this country towards green economy employment and do you think the pressing challenges were adequately addressed by the project?

Efficiency

Do you believe the activities conducted throughout the life of the project were necessary and how did they fit with respect to the objectives of the project?

Do you think these were worthwhile activities for the project goals and the green economy agenda in Turkey?

If you had a certain amount of budget to spend on a similar project, what would your organization do with respect to the objectives of this project? What would you do differently?

Effectiveness

The project focused on capacity building and knowledge sharing. Do you believe you have the necessary resources to use towards green job skills enhancement? What would your organization need for further capacity building?

Do you think the project successfully identified the challenges and opportunities in transition to green economy? If so, how?

Were the trainings and workshops useful? And how did you/your organization benefit from them?

Was the information effectively shared throughout the project? If it was not, what were the problems?

Did all identified stakeholders participate in the project? How did their engagement/or lack thereof affect project outcome?

Which sectors were not adequately covered in this project due to misrepresentation? How can those be included in the future?

How would you evaluate cooperation among stakeholders and how do you think this has affected the outcome of the project?

Impact

Are you glad to have been part of the project, and how do you feel you and your organization benefited from the project, if at all?

What do you think were the strengths of the project? How could future projects related to Green Economy in Turkey build on these strengths?

How would you evaluate cooperation among stakeholders and how do you think this has affected the outcome of the project?

How did this project affect your organization's vision to transition to green economy?

What do you think were the weakest points of this project and how can those be improved?

What are your and your institutions main take-aways from the project as a participant? How, if at all, do you think the project has contributed to the Green Economy agenda in Turkey?

Sustainability

After the project is concluded, how will stakeholders cooperate and implement policy change? What do you think are going to be the major hurdles towards realizing the goals of the project in the absence of ILO leadership and which stakeholders will actively take the lead in realizing the goals?

Will you continue your engagement - as an individual and/or organization - in the green economy agenda? If so, how?

Questions for Government Institutions/ Ministries

Relevance

What is your institution's stand on 'transition to green economy' and where do you see your institution's impact with respect to 'transition to green economy' on national policy making level?

How many people participated in the project from your organization and were all of the participating staff actively engaged throughout the project? How did the staff's engagement affect your organization's participation at the project level?

What do you think are the most pressing challenges from employers' and employee's point of view to transition to Green Jobs? Do you think these challenges were adequately addressed during this project?

What kind of support do you need to transition to green economy and how do you assess cooperation among stakeholders with respect to supporting you?

What are the main challenges in this country towards green economy employment and do you think the pressing challenges were adequately addressed by the project?

Efficiency

What were the activities that the project budget was allocated to – as far as you can tell?

Do you think these were worthwhile activities for the project goals and the green economy agenda in Turkey?

If you had the budget, what would your organization do with respect to the objectives of this project? What would you do differently?

If you had additional budget for the objectives of this project, how would your organization allocate it?

Effectiveness

The project focused on capacity building and knowledge sharing. Do you believe you have the necessary resources to use towards green job skills enhancement? What would your organization need for further capacity building?

Do you think the project successfully identified the challenges and opportunities in transition to green economy? If so, how?

Were the trainings and workshops useful? And how did you/your organization benefit from them?

Was the information effectively shared throughout the project? If it was not, what were the problems?

Did all identified stakeholders participate in the project? How did their engagement/or lack there of effect project outcome?

Which sectors were not adequately covered in this project due to misrepresentation? How can those be included in the future?

How would you evaluate cooperation among stakeholders and how do you think this has affected the outcome of the project?

Impact

Are you glad to have been part of the project, and how do you feel you and your organization benefited from the project, if at all?

What do you think were the strengths of the project? How could future projects related to Green Economy in Turkey build on these strengths?

How would you evaluate cooperation among stakeholders and how do you think this has affected the outcome of the project?

How did this project affect your organization's vision to transition to green economy?

What do you think were the weakest points of this project and how can those be improved?

What are your and your institutions main take-aways from the project as a participant? How, if at all, do you think the project has contributed to the Green Economy agenda in Turkey?

Sustainability

After the project is concluded, how will stakeholders cooperate and implement policy change?

How would you evaluate cooperation among stakeholders and how do you think this has affected the outcome of the project?

Capacity building in green jobs seems to be one of the major challenges towards transition. Do you believe the outcome of this project will enhance knowledge sharing and capacity building in green economy and if so, how?

What do you think are going to be the major hurdles towards realizing the goals of the project in the absence of ILO leadership and which stakeholders will actively take the lead in realizing the goals

What do you think were the weakest points of this project and how can those be improved?