



# FINAL EVALUATION

**Turkey**

Thematic window  
Youth, Employment and Migration

## **Programme Title:**

Growth and Decent Work for all: National Youth Employment Programme and Pilot Implementation in Antalya

# Prologue

This final evaluation report has been coordinated by the MDG Achievement Fund joint programme in an effort to assess results at the completion point of the programme. As stipulated in the monitoring and evaluation strategy of the Fund, all 130 programmes, in 8 thematic windows, are required to commission and finance an independent final evaluation, in addition to the programme's mid-term evaluation.

Each final evaluation has been commissioned by the UN Resident Coordinator's Office (RCO) in the respective programme country. The MDG-F Secretariat has provided guidance and quality assurance to the country team in the evaluation process, including through the review of the TORs and the evaluation reports. All final evaluations are expected to be conducted in line with the OECD Development Assistant Committee (DAC) Evaluation Network "Quality Standards for Development Evaluation", and the United Nations Evaluation Group (UNEG) "Standards for Evaluation in the UN System".

Final evaluations are summative in nature and seek to measure to what extent the joint programme has fully implemented its activities, delivered outputs and attained outcomes. They also generate substantive evidence-based knowledge on each of the MDG-F thematic windows by identifying best practices and lessons learned to be carried forward to other development interventions and policy-making at local, national, and global levels.

We thank the UN Resident Coordinator and their respective coordination office, as well as the joint programme team for their efforts in undertaking this final evaluation.

MDG-F Secretariat

*The analysis and recommendations of this evaluation are those of the evaluator and do not necessarily reflect the views of the Joint Programme or MDG-F Secretariat.*

**Evaluation of the UN Joint Programme Growth and Decent Work for all:  
National Youth Employment Programme and Pilot Implementation in Antalya  
(UNJP YEM)**

Frank Kavanagh  
Labour Market Consultant  
Dublin  
December 2012

## **Acknowledgements**

Thanks go to all the staff in ISKUR for their cooperation and assistance during the course of this evaluation. Particular thanks also go to the UNDP, ILO, IOM and FAO staff for their support and willingness to supply all information requested by the evaluator.

The evaluation was very ably managed by Bulent Acikgoz (UNJP) with the support of Ozan Cakmak (ILO); Ceren Gokce (UNJP); Ali Emre Yilmazturk (FAO); Yelda Devlet Karapinar (IOM) and Pelin Rodoplu (UNDP).

The help and support of the Employers and Trade Union Groups, Chamber of Commerce, ASBIAD, PEVTB, BAKA, KOSGEB and in particular the Programme Management Committee (Mehmet Aslan , Ozkan Ozturk , Veli Tekkanat, Halide Caylan , Mustapha Sinaceur, Matilda Dimovska , Meera Sethi , Umit Efendioglu , Aysegul Akin), is also acknowledged.

Finally, the overall guidance of the Resident Coordinator of the UNDP Mr. Shahid Najam is gratefully acknowledged.

**Evaluation of the UN Joint Programme Growth with Decent Work for All:  
National Youth Employment Programme and Pilot Implementation in Antalya  
(UNJP YEM)**

**Table of Contents**

	<b>Page No.</b>
<b>Executive Summary</b>	<b>5</b>
<b>1. Introduction</b>	<b>10</b>
<b>2. Relevance and Strategic Fit</b>	<b>11</b>
<b>3. Validity of Design</b>	<b>13</b>
<b>4. Progress and Effectiveness</b>	<b>15</b>
<b>5. Efficiency of Resource use</b>	<b>20</b>
<b>6. Effectiveness of Management arrangements</b>	<b>21</b>
<b>7. Impact and Sustainability</b>	<b>24</b>
<b>8. Conclusions and Lessons Learned</b>	<b>26</b>
<b>9. Recommendations</b>	<b>28</b>
<b>Appendix 1 UNJP Key Achievements</b>	<b>32</b>
<b>Appendix 2 PES Course in Guidance and Counselling</b>	<b>33</b>
<b>Appendix 3 Labour Market Profiling of Disadvantaged</b>	<b>35</b>
<b>Appendix 4 Mission Agenda</b>	<b>39</b>
<b>Appendix 5 Evaluation criteria and questions</b>	<b>41</b>

## Acronyms

<b>ALMPs</b>	Active Labour Market Programmes
<b>ASBIAD</b>	Antalya Free Zone Businessmen Association
<b>BAKA</b>	West Mediterranean Development Agency
<b>BATEM</b>	Akdeniz University and West Mediterranean Agricultural Research Institute
<b>EU</b>	European Union
<b>FAO</b>	UN Food & Agriculture Organization
<b>HAK-IS</b>	Confederation of Turkish Real Trade Unions
<b>ILO</b>	International Labour Organization
<b>IOM</b>	International Organization for Migration
<b>IPA</b>	Instrument of Pre-Accession
<b>ISKUR</b>	Turkish Public Employment Service (PES)
<b>KOSGEB</b>	SME Development Agency
<b>M&amp;E</b>	Monitoring and Evaluation
<b>MDG</b>	Millennium Development Goals
<b>MDG - F</b>	Millennium Development Goals Achievement Fund
<b>NSC</b>	National Steering Committee
<b>NTT</b>	National Technical Team
<b>NYEAP</b>	National Youth Employment Action Plan
<b>PEVTB</b>	Provincial Employment and Vocational Training Board
<b>PMC</b>	Programme Management Committee
<b>RC</b>	UNDP Resident Coordinator
<b>TISK</b>	Turkish Confederation of Employer Associations
<b>TOR</b>	Terms of reference
<b>ToT</b>	Training of Trainers
<b>TURK-IS</b>	Confederation of Turkish Trade Unions
<b>TURKSTAT</b>	Turkish Statistical Institute
<b>UNDAF</b>	United Nations National Development Assistance Framework
<b>UNDP</b>	United Nations Development Programme
<b>UNJP</b>	United Nations Joint Program
<b>UNJP - YEM</b>	UN Joint Programme on Youth, Employment and Migration

# **Evaluation of the UN Joint Programme Growth with Decent Work for all: National Youth Employment Programme and Pilot Implementation in Antalya (UNJP YEM)**

## **Executive summary**

The UNJP is a Millennium Development Goals Achievement Fund (MDG-F) financed Joint Programme of four UN Agencies (UNDP, ILO, FAO, IOM) in collaboration with ISKUR, the Turkish Employment Agency. Its main aim is the adoption and implementation of employment policies benefiting the most vulnerable groups in the labour market within the context of Turkey's east-west migration.

At the national policy level, the UNJP had the ambition to develop a National Youth Employment Action Plan (NYEAP) which includes concrete targets and actions to promote women's participation in the labour force (MDG Target 3.2) and to reduce poverty among the most vulnerable in the labour market including recent migrants by adopting decent work targets for the youth (MDG Target 1.B.6). At the local level the UNJP set out to ensure focus on both labour supply and demand through the effective delivery of employment, youth and migration management interventions that benefit the most vulnerable in the labour market and young women while bolstering the dynamics of demand for labour in Antalya (being one of the provinces with the highest rate of inward migration in the country). At the policy level, the primary beneficiaries would be the policy makers, civil society and those responsible for delivery of employment services to youth and women. At operational implementation level in Antalya, the primary beneficiaries of the UNJP were to be the young men and women (age 15-24) who are unemployed, cannot access or benefit from placement services and who do not have the employability skills for joining the formal labour market.

Impacts have been substantial and potentially long lasting. They occurred both on National Institutional and Local Operational levels. The UNJP has encouraged and facilitated good vertical, horizontal and local integration. A high level of ownership by the main players was evident during the evaluation. This was achieved in part by the development of fully representative National Steering and Management Committees and at local level, strong coordination among the relevant players was driven by good local management of the joint programme by the UNJP coordinator/manager on the ground in Antalya, and by the full engagement of the Provincial Employment and Vocational Training Board (PEVTB) and ISKUR in the implementation of the UNJP.

### **Validity of Design**

The joint programming approach was ambitious but succeeded in producing the NYEAP at national level; and a series of interventions by the four UN Agencies involved in the project, produced high-impact results at local level. The design therefore met the demands of the original project Terms of Reference (TOR). The four Agencies brought their individual expertise to bear on and all contributed to the development of National Youth Employment Action Plan (NYEAP), the development of which was coordinated by the ILO. Locally, the ILO ensured the delivery of Active Labour Market Programmes (ALMPS) to the main target groups,

the IOM introduced basic life skills training for migrant workers, the UNDP provided support for the development of the local economy through the development of sectoral clustering initiatives and the FAO brought its expertise to bear on the issue of decent work for migrants in the agricultural sectors. The design of some of the ALMPs could however have been more ambitious and more targeted at the most disadvantaged.

### **Progress and Effectiveness**

Despite the need to replace the local Antalya-based programme site manager and the change of manager at central level, many of the planned outputs were achieved in a timely manner by the steady addition of activities over the life of the programme. The workplan of the UNJP programmed the ALMPs in the second year. However the scheduling of the Labour Market analysis might have come earlier in the programme and thus the ALMPS to meet the labour demand could have started earlier. The target to deliver employability training and skills to 1200 unemployed has been met. This consisted of the delivery of 36 VET courses to unemployed young people designed by the ILO, FAO and IOM in collaboration with ISKUR. A new approach to entrepreneurship training for young people was also piloted. The FAO delivered some innovative training to women working in the agricultural sector that will contribute to both the local economy and the provision of decent work for women and migrants. The IOM launched an innovative Basic Life Skills two-day training module to a large group of migrant workers through a cascaded delivery. More than 1200 young people benefited from the Basic Life Skills training to date. The employment needs of People with Disabilities (PWD) were addressed to a certain extent and a number of approaches were taken to reach PWD such as sms and telephone calls. However methods to reach this target group need to be improved and developed.

The high level of stakeholder active engagement in the UNJP at local and national levels was notable, as was the development of clustering initiatives in the Yacht building, Cut flower and Health tourism sectors. Indeed the clustering investment by the UNJP has produced high dividends for the local economy and has attracted major funding from the Ministry of the Economy.

### **Efficiency of Resource use.**

The UNJP management and governance structures were efficient and effective and were operationalised through the National Steering and Programme Management Committees (NSC and PMC), the programme implementation group composed of the UN focal points, active management and operational delivery by ISKUR and the key role of the site manager. The PMC executed its advisory and guidance role very effectively. Monitoring and evaluation frameworks operated in an efficient and effective manner. There was however room for improvement in the tracking of the delivery and targeting of the ALMPs. But having said that, the placement outcomes from the ALMPs are good at 59%. Women were more represented than men on the VET programmes which is a significant improvement on the representation of women on ISKUR VET programmes nationally where 41% of participants were female in 2011. Targeting of vulnerable disadvantaged jobseekers locally was good but it would have been preferable to have more focus on the lower educated cohort,

as 57% of trainees had secondary level education and 26% had primary level. 15% were of degree level.

This issue of targeting is underlined by a recent note from the World Bank which indicates that “about 74% of ISKUR trainees (nationally) have at least secondary education, being significantly better educated than even the working 20-34 year olds in the population (let alone the jobless). This is a reflection of both the demand for such courses and their supply, as many of these courses are designed for people with medium levels of education, and training providers tend to select individuals with higher levels of education. And yet 52% of the working age population (15-64) in Turkey has less than basic education (lower secondary education), accounting for 64% of the jobless and 65% of informal workers. Even among 20-34 year olds, the proportion with less than high school is 57%, accounting for 53% of the jobless and 54% of the informal in that age group<sup>1</sup>”

### **Impacts and sustainability**

Impacts have been substantial at both national and local levels through the efforts of the four UN Agencies, Employers, Trade Unions and ISKUR. Government employment policy has been significantly influenced by the NYEAP, the development of which was led by the ILO<sup>2</sup>. This is one of the most significant highlights of the project and has the potential to impact positively on the employment prospects of 12 million young people. Locally the PEVTB and ISKUR are working in a more efficient and collaborative way. The mainstreaming of decent agricultural work by the FAO means that ISKUR are now engaged in this area for the first time. The ALMPs have impacted significantly on the employment prospects of 1200 young people, many of whom are disadvantaged and from the migrant cohort. Many of the outputs have high sustainability potential and a task force has been established by the UNJP to ensure that sustainability and an efficient hand-over of the programme’s successful outcomes and the durability of impacts.

### **Conclusions and Lessons Learned**

The UNJP set out to support the adoption and implementation of employment policies benefiting the most vulnerable groups (young people and women from migrant families) in the labour market within the context of Turkey’s east-west migration. It is clear that the UNJP has gone a long way towards achieving this aim.

The achievements at National and Local levels as set out in this evaluation are impressive. The project has provided a firm basis for achievement of Millennium Development Goals 1 and 3 in Turkey and in particular the position of women in the workforce and the provision of decent work for youth. The range and scope of both national and local outputs and the potential payback in terms of economic and policy development and individual placement into decent work for the target groups are impressive and potentially self-sustaining. The adoption of the NYEAP by Government is an outstanding achievement.

---

<sup>1</sup> Personal Communication from the WB, in the context of their as yet unpublished survey of VET in Turkey

<sup>2</sup> The original template for this is the ILO’s “Guide for the Preparation of National Action Plans on Youth Employment” and which was adapted to the national context during the preparation of the NYEAP.

There are now opportunities for scaling up of activities piloted in Antalya such as sectoral and rural development studies, the professionally designed and executed labour market surveys and skills analysis and migration studies in the labour market context. ISKUR now has an extensive toolkit, which can be further developed and replicated nationally. Job counsellors trained under the UNJP can act as the local agents to sustain the lessons learned from their engagement with the UNJP. On a local level particularly, significant opportunities created by the UNJP are in the area of the sectoral development projects which have successfully leveraged very substantial public financing for the sectors, such as the yacht building and seed processing.

The initial placement outcome from the ALMPs (59%) is good. This indicates that the alignment of the ALMPs to labour market needs was very good. This was guided by the labour market survey conducted under the project by the ILO. A pilot 3-stage entrepreneurship-training course targeted vulnerable disadvantaged groups including women and PWD. The total number of PWD participants (7 out of 46) who attended the course exceeded the target set prior to the launch of the course. The type of ALMPs might also have been varied to provide new pilot initiatives designed to engage directly with more very vulnerable disadvantaged jobseekers rather than using mainstream VET courses already available through ISKUR. However a new Basic Life Skills module inserted into the ALMPs was specifically designed to address some of their needs. It would also have been useful to allocate more of the budget towards initiating such new pilot initiatives for highly vulnerable disadvantaged jobseekers early on in the programme.

The addition of the IOM Basic Life-Skills modules to VET courses was commendable, innovative and worthy of replication on a wide scale in western Turkey in particular, which has a high level of inward internal migration. The development of a web-enabled animation of a Rights at Work Handbook by the ILO is also worthy of note and ISKUR is committed to introducing it to all VET beneficiaries during the first day of VET Courses and intend to integrate it in ISKUR's website.

## **Recommendations**

- The UN Multi-Agency delivery model of the UNJP should be promulgated within the UN as a best practice example of how the MDGs can be achieved. The Sustainability and Exit Strategy Task Force should also be sustained and resourced for 12 months after the programme end in order to consolidate the significant successful impacts and outcomes from the UNJP.
- A more structured tracking of outcomes using a combination of robust database tracking and the commissioning of a follow-up survey of ALMP participant outcomes will improve the measurement of the UNJP impacts. A follow-up survey has been already commissioned by the ILO in cooperation with ISKUR and its findings will be incorporated into a report, which will be completed by mid-December 2012. The report will have a concrete set of recommendations for ISKUR management to mainstream such follow-up surveys in ISKUR's operations.

- The programme provided a suite of training to new job counsellors<sup>3</sup> but there is also a need to professionalise the work of PES staff to bring them more in line with the skills sets available to professional employment counsellors. More detail on this recommendation is set out in section 9 further on in this report.
- The introduction of a more scientific system of client profiling in ISKUR is recommended. This would allow for more accurate identification of the target groups. Suggestions in this regard are included in Appendix 3 attached.
- Earlier engagement (in the first year of the programme) with individual jobseekers through the initial identification of skills and worker shortages in Antalya would have been preferable despite the fact that the original programme document envisaged this in the second year. A more individualised engagement with disadvantaged jobseekers is recommended though measurement of individual competency deficits of individuals related to those skills shortages identified in the economy. The recent recruitment of a significant number of new job counsellors will facilitate this approach.
- Sectoral clustering studies and activities have proven to be one of the most cost-effective aspects of the programme and the model should be extended to other Provinces.
- The IOM Basic Life Skills for Migrant workers training course has proven to be a huge success and should be available to all ISKUR jobseekers and ALMP participants in high migrant- receiving Regions. Such an initiative not only supports the migrant workers' inclusion in the labour market, but also encourages them to integrate in urban living
- A People with Disabilities (PWD) awareness programme and training should be provided for all ISKUR staff with a view to increasing the placement rate for PWDs.
- Finally, FAO/ISKUR pilot initiatives to formalise work and provide certification to rural agricultural workers are to be commended and are worthy of widespread replication. Health and Safety are central to providing decent work in all occupations but are particularly important in agricultural work. This needs to be reinforced in the cut-flower and seed sectors which were supported by the FAO/UNJP.

---

<sup>3</sup> This covered covering effective matching and placement in job counseling/public employment services (ILO), Regional development and clustering (UNDP), Basic Life Skills Training for Migrant Youth and Service Provision for Disadvantaged Groups (IOM) Best Practices of FAO on Rural Development and Employment in Antalya (FAO) and Statistical Literacy (UNDP).

# **UN Joint Programme Growth with Decent Work for all: National Youth Employment Programme and Pilot Implementation in Antalya (UNJP YEM)**

## **Evaluation**

### **1. Introduction**

The overall objective of the Joint Programme (UNJP) as set out in the original programme document is the adoption and implementation of employment policies benefiting the most vulnerable groups in the labour market within the context of Turkey's east-west migration. It is a joint programme of four different UN Agencies (UNDP, ILO, FAO and IOM) in strong collaboration with the national Turkish PES (ISKUR). Programme delivery was achieved by the Agencies themselves but also mainly by and through ISKUR. This configuration of the Programme made coordination a central driver and presented its own challenges. The programme also afforded an opportunity to field-test the effectiveness and efficiency of the approach, to examine and explore it and to test its replication and sustainability. The programme is funded in the main through the Millennium Development Goals Achievement Fund (MDG-F) and financed through MDG-F by the Government of Spain (by way of a cooperation agreement with the Government of Spain and the UN system).

The UNJP aims to reduce youth unemployment among vulnerable young members of migrant families and increase the participation of young women in the labour force. This to be achieved at national and local levels through improved capacities to design and implement employment interventions for vulnerable communities, and by taking into account gender balance.

#### *Overall Goal of the Evaluation*

The Monitoring and Evaluation Strategy and the Implementation Guide for Joint Programmes under the Millennium Development Goals Achievement Fund stipulate that all joint programmes will commission and finance a final independent evaluation.

This current final evaluation focuses on measuring development results and potential impacts generated by the joint programme<sup>4</sup>, based on the scope and criteria included in the Terms of Reference (TOR) for this evaluation.

#### *Objectives*

The TOR stipulates that this final evaluation has the following specific objectives:

- To measure to what extent the joint programme has contributed to solve the needs and problems identified in the design phase.

---

<sup>4</sup> i.e. The set of components, outcomes, outputs, activities and inputs that were detailed in the joint programme document and in any associated modifications made during implementation.

- To measure the joint programme's degree of implementation, efficiency and quality of outputs and outcomes, against what was originally planned or subsequently officially revised.
- Measure to what extent the joint programme has attained development results for the targeted population, beneficiaries, participants whether individuals, communities, institutions, etc.
- To measure the joint programme contribution to the objectives set in their respective specific thematic windows as well as the overall MDG fund objectives at local and national level. (MDGs, Paris Declaration and Accra Principles and UN reform).
- To identify and document substantive lessons learned and good practices on the specific topics of the thematic window, MDGs, Paris Declaration, Accra Principles and UN reform with the aim to support the sustainability of the joint programme or its components.

### *Overall approach*

A pragmatic approach has been adopted for the evaluation, based on both qualitative and quantitative methods. The following data sources and data collection methods were used:

- A comprehensive analysis of various sources of information including a desk review of programme files, including the programme documents, technical and policy papers produced by the programme; work plans; progress reports and minutes of Management and Steering Committees' meetings, annual and monthly reports and the mid-term review/evaluation.
- Interviews and meetings with governmental counterparts and programme partners, direct beneficiaries, partner agencies, programme management and staff.
- Particular attention was paid to the multi-agency dimension of the programme implementation in order to assess the usefulness, effectiveness and the efficiency of that approach to programme implementation. This included an examination of the replicability of the multi-agency approach and its relevance to delivery of similar UNDP-led Programmes in other countries.

### *Constraints*

The absence of a follow up survey of ALMP participants meant that the full evaluation of the effectiveness and net impact of the measures was not possible during the period of the evaluation. However I understand that the survey is now in progress and results will be available in December 2012. Other than that aspect, there were no other obvious constraints experienced by the evaluator.

## **2. Relevance and Strategic Fit**

According to the original UNJP document, the United Nations Development Assistance Framework (UNDAF) for Turkey committed the UN to support the Government of Turkey in formulating and activating social and economic development policies in favour of the poor, through partnerships with civil society and the private sector and to assist the integration of Small and Medium-size

Enterprises (SMEs) in local and global chains by means of clustering, entrepreneurship and business development services. The UNJP is the UN system's programmatic follow up of this UNDAF commitment. Consequently, the overall objective of the UNJP is the adoption and implementation of policies benefiting the poor (vulnerable groups in the labour market) and women within the framework of decent work and social integration (UNDAF 2.1).

At the national policy level, the 9<sup>th</sup> National Development Plan of Turkey (2007-2013) sets out to ensure that equal employment opportunities will be provided for women, the young, and the long-term unemployed, the disabled and former convicts, who encounter difficulties in the labour market. With the aim of increasing the participation of women in the labour force and employment, their access to childcare and other similar services will also be facilitated. Programmes will also be developed to provide the young with experience in the labour market. Within that context, the UNJP had the ambition to develop a National Youth Employment Action Plan (NYEAP) which includes concrete targets and actions to promote women's participation in the labour force (MDG Target 3.2) and to reduce poverty among the most vulnerable in the labour market including recent migrants by adopting decent work targets for the youth (MDG Target 1.B.6). The ultimate result would be a policy environment which enables linkages between national policy and local action geared towards steady progress in MDG 1 and MDG 3, measurable by the quality of policy instruments of the Ministry of Labour and Social Security, and ultimately designed and budgeted in order to facilitate the implementation of a National Youth Employment Action Plan.

At the local level the UNJP would ensure focus on both labour supply and demand through the effective delivery of employment, youth and migration management interventions that benefit the most vulnerable in the labour market and young women while bolstering the dynamics of demand for labour in Antalya (being the province with the highest rate of inward migration in the country). Results at the local level would be measured by the percentage increase in the placements made by the national employment agency (ISKUR) in Antalya and the percentage of women among them. Placement by ISKUR is equivalent to decent work through formal employment with full social security provision due to the legal provisions of ISKUR. If successful the pilot model in Antalya would contribute directly to the realisation of the localised targets for MDG 1. B.6 and MDG 3.

At the policy level, the primary beneficiaries are the policy makers and planners responsible for delivery of employment services to youth and women. These include the National Employment Service (ISKUR), which is attached to the Ministry of Labour and Social Security; and other national authorities as well as civil society, which were involved in the formulation of the NYEAP. At operational implementation level, the primary beneficiaries of the UNJP are the young men and women (age 15-24) who are unemployed, cannot access or benefit from placement services and who do not have the employability skills for joining the formal labour market. The UNJP placed particular emphasis on young women and those youth who migrated to Antalya in search of jobs. These direct beneficiaries were expected to number about 1200 young men and women. In addition, indirect beneficiaries of this UNJP would be some 12 million young men and women in Turkey, through the adoption and implementation of the NYEAP

A high level of ownership by the main players was evident during the evaluation. This was achieved in part by the development of fully representative National Steering and Management Committees and the National Technical Team (NTT). At local level, strong coordination among the relevant players was driven by good local management of the joint programme by the UNJP coordinator/manager on the ground in Antalya, and by the full engagement of the Provincial Employment and Vocational Training Board (PEVTB) and ISKUR in the implementation of the UNJP.

The Programme was a good fit with Partners' profiles. This is demonstrated by 1) the UNDP having a management and development role in the programme, 2) the labour market focus of the ILO, 3) the importance of the FAO's role in rural employment and 4) the migration management focus of the IOM. The Programme also linked in with other donors such as the EU Instrument of Pre-Accession (IPA) programme where three labour market related programmes located in ISKUR (PES-2011, Women's PES-2011 and the recently commenced Youth Programmes) benefited from the lead given by the UNJP.

### **3. Validity of Design**

While the joint programming approach was ambitious, the design turned out to be effective in meeting the challenges outlined in the original programme document. At national level the main output was the development of the National Youth Employment Action Plan (NYEAP) and the joint Agency approach enriched the formulation of the NYEAP. For example the issue of decent training and jobs for young migrants in the agricultural sector was highlighted by the FAO involvement in the NYEAP formulation.

On the local level, the characteristics of the labour market in Antalya and the structure of industry and commerce provided an opportunity for the IOM to bring its expertise in migration issues to bear on the migrant work-force. The low-level of education and skills amongst a sizeable portion of the workforce and the high-level of informality was an ideal framework within which the ILO could operate jointly with the IOM. The significant percentage of agricultural work in the community meant that the FAO could bring its expertise to bear on up-skilling the rural and migrant labour force, mentioned above. The central driver of the UNDP allowed for an overarching policy view to be taken and implemented at national and local levels. The development mandate of the UNDP also provided an opportunity to make a longer-term intervention in the Antalya labour market by the introduction of the "clustering" approach to industrial development and coordination, which is designed to ultimately add decent and quality jobs to the local labour market.

The Planned outcomes were realistic, if also tempered by the need to ensure that the four Agencies and the other programme partners all jointly mobilised their resources in a coherent and effective way. As the programme comes towards completion, it is clear that most planned outcomes and outputs have been achieved but there remain some issues about the depth of some interventions and their timing, which if addressed in a timely fashion, might have produced a more measurable and robust result. This also relates to some of the indicators set out in the programme document, in particular the reference to the expected increase in the ISKUR placement rate over

the period of the programme. It was not clear how an increase in placement rates could be directly linked causally to the programme outputs, and that needed to be examined early on.

If we restrict that placement indicator to the outcomes from the ALMPs funded by the UNJP through ISKUR, then we may have a more measurable result. Since the VET course provision came relatively late in the programme (May 2011-Oct 2012) we don't have a sufficiently long time series with which to measure the long-term placement sustainability from all the VET interventions. Such a calculation will have to wait until the end of the guaranteed employment period (for between 20-50% of participants) stipulated in VET contracts funded by ISKUR. It would be possible to get some reliable data from outcomes 7 months post-training. This could measure the true placement rate from the VET courses. The scheduling of ALMPs and outcomes is discussed further on in this report.

### International experience of ALMP Design

A wide range of measures and solutions are in use by PES worldwide to tackle the complex issues of youth unemployment. PES have tended to differentiate between early school leavers, those young people without vocational training, immigrants/minorities and the rest of the cohort. The first three groups have tended to experience the most difficulties entering the labour market.

The OECD Employment Outlook 2006 pointed out that “Youth in all countries face an above-average risk of unemployment, as they attempt to find a foothold in the labour market. For many youth, this is only a transitional difficulty. However, youth who are persistently unemployed (or who experience multiple spells of joblessness) may develop disadvantages that seriously compromise their long-term career prospects. It is thus a matter of major policy concern to develop young people's employability and ensure their successful entry into the labour market and subsequent access to career ladders.”

The authors go on to emphasise that the cost-effectiveness of ALMPs for youth “needs to be monitored closely, especially in terms of their success at helping the most disadvantaged youth find jobs. These programmes should focus on job-search assistance activities which are often found to be the most cost-effective measures for youth”, providing positive returns on both earnings and employment. Where training is envisaged, it should be designed with employers' hiring requirements in mind. Good targeting and tight work availability requirements are also important design features to help contain overall costs, while guaranteeing focus on the neediest.”<sup>5</sup>

The UNJP follows the above approach to training and is a model of good practice. The focus on job search and counselling of the unemployed needs to be reinforced in Turkey and PES staff development is crucial in order to implement the most

---

<sup>5</sup> OECD Employment Outlook 2006 Chapter 4

successful ALMP which is Jobseeker action planning, guidance and counselling. The UNJP managed VET ALMPs and the training of PES staff, provide a basis and foundation in this regard but work needs to be done to embed new and enhanced counselling skills in the PES (See Appendix 2).

#### 4. Progress, Process and Effectiveness

The progress of the UNJP is set out in the twice-yearly reports and latterly also in the monthly reports. They confirm the steady addition of activity from the commencement of the programme and the timely delivery of targeted outputs such as the NYEAP at national level and clustering at local level. While not scheduled as such in the original programming plan document, ideally the local Antalya labour market survey (LMS) and analysis (LMA), while completed in a timely manner in line with the original programme document, could have come at the beginning of the programme and this could have allowed the earlier identification and implementation of relevant VET courses that would match the skills and supply deficits set out in the LMS and LMA. This would have given us in turn, a longer time-series of placement outcomes from the main ALMPs supported by the programme. It would have also allowed for more scope to adjust the ALMPs if required. However having said that, in general the progress was very good and even more so considering that four UN Agencies and ISKUR were all collaborating to achieve the common results.

The Programme set out to achieve a series of planned outputs and at the time of this evaluation, delivery of those outputs is on target. A significant number of outputs/products has been achieved as set out in Table 1 below and a breakdown by UN Agency is also set out in Appendix 1, attached. They include the National Youth Employment Action Plan; National Occupational Outlook; capacity building for local stakeholders; local Antalya labour market survey and analysis; research on local monitoring of migration impact on youth unemployment; specialised agri-business training for migrant workers; specialised training on supporting of basic life skills of migrant youth; clustering initiatives in the yacht-building; cut-flower and seed production and health tourism sectors; training courses for jobs counsellors designed and delivered and a number of seminal publications produced.

**Table 1**

<b>Overall Expected Results (Outcomes &amp; outputs)</b>	<b>Achieved?</b>
<b>OUTCOME</b>	
Employment policies benefiting the poor (vulnerable groups in the labour market) and women implemented within the framework of decent work and social integration (Country Program Outcome 2.1.2, UNDAF)	YES
<b>OUTPUTS</b>	
<i>Joint Program Output 1:</i> A National Youth Employment Action Plan prepared and adopted by ISKUR.	YES
<i>Output 1.1</i> Necessary groundwork and preparations in place to facilitate drafting of National Employment Action Plan.	YES
<i>Output 1.2</i> National capacities developed for preparation of a National Youth Employment Action Plan through a participatory process	YES
<i>Output 1.3</i> Migration in youth employment aspects included in the Youth Employment Action Plan and National Technical Team trained on migration management	YES
<i>Output 1.4.</i> Rural youth employment aspects included in the Youth Employment Action Plan and NTT trained on rural youth employment potentials	YES

<b>Output 1.5.</b> Capacities developed for statistical monitoring of youth (un) employment and migration with focus on young women's participation in the labour force by the National Statistical Agency (TURKSTAT)	YES
<b>Output 1.6</b> Analytical knowledge base of policy makers developed for incorporation of employers' labour demand in policies and programs for youth employment and young women's participation in labour force	YES
<b>Joint Program Output 2:</b> Local authorities have the capacities and systems in place to increase employment of vulnerable youth including young women and migrants in Turkey's top migration receiving city (Antalya)	YES
<b>Output 2.1</b> Technical and coordination capacities of the local stakeholders involved in implementation and monitoring of youth employment in Antalya developed	YES
<b>Output 2.2</b> Technical and administrative capacities of Antalya ISKUR developed for implementation of active labour policies, including provision of services tailored to enhance the capabilities of the most vulnerable in the labour market	YES <sup>6</sup>
<b>Output 2.3</b> Local authorities put specific interventions in place to address the employment and	YES
<b>Output 2.4</b> The potential of the local economy to absorb migration induced labour and to grow in a	YES
<b>Output 2.5</b> The labour absorption capacity of the agricultural value chain in Antalya enhanced through improved services of Provincial Directorate of Agriculture and Kepez Municipality in coordination with relevant local actors	YES

### **ALMPs**

The ILO have managed the delivery of ALMPs in the form of ISKUR mediated VET courses for 653 jobseekers (382 females and 221 males in 15 different occupations). A further 144 have been trained in entrepreneurship (50% female) and another 46 jobseekers have recently completed an enhanced pilot entrepreneurship course. They also conducted the baseline Antalya Labour Market Survey and Labour Market Analysis in cooperation with TurkStat and ISKUR and this was fundamental for the proper targeting of the ALMPs. The IOM have provided a Train the Trainers Program for İŞKUR staff on Basic Life Skills Training for young migrants and this had been delivered in turn to 1200+ migrant jobseekers. The IOM also commissioned the Antalya Household Survey on Migration and Youth Employment and have conducted baseline research on local monitoring of human mobility impacts on the labour market and youth employment.

The FAO has designed and managed the delivery of pilot training courses mediated by ISKUR, for 41 unskilled migrant workers in collaboration with the cut-flower business association. These courses have a high percentage of women participants and have been of duration between 3-6 months. The FAO has also provided a 3-day training for c.300 women family-farmers covering plant production, pesticides, agri-business management and marketing. Additionally, the FAO conducted research on the structure of rural employment in Turkey and on the effectiveness of agricultural vocational training in Antalya Region

The local ISKUR mediated ALMPs aspects of the programme were predicated on the January 2011 Antalya Labour Market Survey, which was conducted in cooperation with TURKSTAT and ISKUR to identify labour demand and skills shortages in the Antalya labour market. Based on the results of the Survey and further analysis of demand, the VET courses to meet that demand were identified by the UNJP team together with İŞKUR-Antalya. In May 2011 the first three VET Courses in Patient & Elderly Care Companion, Secretary and Cashier commenced in Antalya.

<sup>6</sup> The type of ALMPs might have been varied somewhat in order to provide new pilot initiatives designed to engage directly with a higher proportion of very vulnerable disadvantaged jobseekers.

### **VET Courses funded by the Programme**

<b>Title</b>	<b>Participant Numbers</b>
Assistant Service Personnel	75
Assistant Cook	88
Computer-Aided Accounting	23
Logistic Agent	63
Customer Services Representative	39
Tour operator Transfer Agent	24
Patient & Elderly Care Companion	65
Secretary	38
Cashier	43
Housekeeping	19
Reservation Agent	25
Computer Network Systems & Routing	44
Assistant Account	21
Sales Agent	46
Entrepreneurship	144
Pilot Entrepreneurship course	50
Cut Flower Production (FAO-3/6 months on and off job)	41
Farm management/plant production (3days)	300
Basic Life and Social Skills for Migrant workers (IOM) (2 days)	c. 1200

#### ***Entrepreneurship/ Start Business***

ISKUR has provided general entrepreneurship training for mainly older jobseekers over the past number of years and collaborate with KOSGEB (SME Agency) regarding course design and delivery. According to ISKUR the business survival rate of participants on that course has been less than impressive. The UNJP via the ILO agreed in 2012 to enhance the training by a new selection process targeting young people, the addition of new modules and the provision of post-training mentoring for the business start-ups. The additional modules consist of 12 hours addressing sustainability, ICT, new financial supports and labour relations/decent work modalities. This activity is ongoing and a visit to the training allowed the evaluator to assess the individual satisfaction rate, which was reported to the evaluator by the participants to be quite high. A significant number of women and some people with disabilities are attending the new courses. The 12-day training course will be followed by the 5 days post training mentoring to be provided over a period of

months. The ILO supplied their business start-up guidance material and this enriched the content of the training programme.

The new courses were advertised through local media and a significant number of participants reported to the evaluator that they had got the information from the Internet. About 15% were referred by ISKUR directly, which is a somewhat disappointing figure. Some disabled candidates were contacted directly by the training provider by using ISKUR-Antalya's database of disabled job seekers. The age profile is < 29 and this is a new factor in the entrepreneurship training provided by ISKUR where many participants are older. The initiative has the potential to provide self-employment to young jobseekers within the target group but needs follow-up over the next year in order to establish impact. It would have been useful if this activity had started earlier in the UNJP so that impact could be measured within the life of the Programme. Having said that, the initiative was worthy of support and has potential for both the participants' long-term prospects and provides ISKUR with a best practice model of delivering small-business training to young people.

### ***Gender/Informality***

The gender balance throughout the ALMPs is good and in line with the programme targets (58% of the participants on the main VET courses are women). According to ISKUR, women's representation in VET courses is 41%, which is much lower than their representation in VET courses supported by UNJP-YEM (58%). The ILO crucially promoted women's participation in the VET courses and their employment. The placement by ISKUR of a percentage of post-vet course jobseekers into guaranteed work has ensured that decent work standards have been supported by the programme. This is also reflected in the agricultural-based training where placement is into the formal economy. Generally the agricultural sector has a very high level of informal workers and the FAO/ISKUR pilot initiatives to formalise and provide certification to rural agricultural workers are to be commended and are worthy of widespread replication.

### ***Migrants***

The programme was designed inter-alia to address the needs of migrant workers and the IOM initiatives in that regard have been particularly well received by all actors in the programme. Besides providing inputs to the NYEAP process, IOM has provided a two-day training module in life and social skills for migrant workers in Antalya. The module can be delivered alone or as part of VET courses. It was also delivered as part of the ISKUR job counsellors' training course facilitated by the programme<sup>7</sup>.

---

<sup>7</sup> This entailed the delivery of the following training to newly recruited job counsellors in the first fortnight of June 2012:

- Effective matching and placement in job counseling/public employment services (ILO)
- Regional development and clustering (UNDP)
- Basic Life Skills Training for Migrant Youth and Service Provision for Disadvantaged Groups (IOM)
- Best Practices of FAO on Rural Development and Employment in Antalya (FAO)
- Statistical Literacy (UNDP)

To date more than 1200 individuals have benefited from the cascaded training. ISKUR management in Antalya attach a high value to the Basic Life Skills module and would like to see the two days expanded to four to go into even more depth in order to address the needs of migrant workers. The cascading effect of such training to the migrant participants' colleagues and families will provide the wider migrant community with a better understanding of their rights, supports available and job possibilities.

### ***People with Disabilities (PWD)***

PWD have taken part in some VET courses but reaching PWD has proven to be problematic. One VET course organiser reported that it was necessary to contact PWD directly by telephone in order to get them involved in training (the pilot entrepreneurship training exceeded the target that at least 10% of participants would be PWDs through contacting PWDs by phone and e-mail). This also proved difficult because the contact data held by ISKUR for some PWD was reported by the same course organiser to be out of date and inaccurate. The programme document set out to deliver 6-month training courses targeted at 90 youth with disabilities. At the time of writing the budget for this activity has not been spent. This is partly because it was felt during the delivery of the UNJP that isolating PWD on their own specific training courses was undesirable. This is in line with international best-practice for providing labour market measures for PWDs.

### ***Stakeholders***

A significant feature of the programme is the extent of national and local involvement of stakeholders. In that regard the four UN Agencies and ISKUR demonstrated a high level of interaction and mutual commitment to delivering the programme. The 22 person National Technical Team (NTT) represented the social partners and other key players such as TURKSTAT and worked extremely well and efficiently together in order to deliver the NYEAP in a consensual manner and the NYEAP has subsequently been fully endorsed by Government. At local level, the UNJP proved to be a significant catalyst and broker for local actors to come together in order to deliver a coherent package of mutually supportive actions and initiatives. This is effectively demonstrated by the opinion of some PETVB members, that the quality of operations and decision-making by the PEVTB has improved over the life of the programme. New members such as TURKSTAT have been co-opted on to the Board as a result of the programme activities.

### ***Sectoral Clustering***

The development of the sectoral clustering concept by the UNDP has also proven to have been a major catalyst in encouraging local business sectors to come together for the first time to develop a common sectoral approach to developing and supporting markets and to improving production techniques. This increased stakeholder involvement is demonstrated for instance in the yacht-building sector. Sectoral Studies funded under the Programme indicated a number of potential areas for clustering of industries and the partners decided to concentrate on the Cut Flower and the Yacht Building sectors. In relation to the latter, ASBAID the Antalya Free Zone Business Association collaborated with the initiative. A Clustering and Road Map study was commissioned by the UNDP. It was completed within 8 months at low cost.

The study was very well received by the yacht cluster enterprises and was used as a scoping document for a cluster approach to the Ministry of Economy. This then prompted the Ministry to pledge funds for the development of a number of programmes related to areas such as technical best practice in boat building, health and safety, quality standards (ISO) for 15 shipyards, support for marketing, sales attendance at boat fairs and technical peer reviews. This is supported by a Government commitment to co-fund the initiatives up to 75% of a \$ 2 million fund. The UNDP intend to provide further support though an NGO collaborative agreement with ASBIAD. A similar process was undertaken with TSUAB (Seed Producers Sub Union) for seed producers in Antalya. The cluster analyses and cluster roadmap was again submitted to Ministry of Economy and USD 1.6 million national funds mobilised for the sector development activities in seed sector in Antalya.

*The cost/employment benefit ratio of this UNJP intervention is likely to be very favourable in the medium to long term and is one of the outstanding initiatives undertaken by the Programme.* Combined with an existing VET/Internship programme for jobseekers in the Yacht industry run by the Chamber of Commerce (ATSO), the long-term decent work effect for young people may be significant.

#### ***Alternative Strategies***

Achievements have been substantial and robust. There was some scope for improvement in the delivery of ALMPs to the targeted 1200 jobseekers direct beneficiaries. As set out above, although not envisaged by the programming, earlier engagement (in the first year of the programme) with individual jobseekers through the initial identification of skills and worker shortages in Antalya would have been preferable. A more individualised engagement with disadvantaged jobseekers through measurement of individual competency deficits of individuals related to those skills shortages could have taken place. This would be followed by direct matching of the jobseeker with potential employers prepared to provide highly structured on the job training (designed by expert trainers) to address the individual's competency deficits. This approach has been successfully implemented in some other MDG-funded youth programmes. It might have been useful to introduce such a pilot approach as part of the effort to place 1200 disadvantaged jobseekers.

#### **5. Efficiency of resource use**

While the risks of adopting a multi-agency approach may seem higher than a single-agency approach, in practice the multi-agency approach has proven to be extremely effective. Successful coordination at national and local levels has allowed for an efficient joint allocation of resources and in some cases (such as the clustering activities and Labour Market Survey/Analysis set out above), the potential payback from small investments by the programme has proven to be substantial. The Multi-agency approach led by the ILO, was effectively applied to the development of the NYEAP. It was also particularly effective in delivering ALMPs in the Antalya Region. The UNDP provided the management and development skills, the ILO brought labour market expertise, the IOM brought migration expertise and the FAO brought their skills to bear on the horticultural and agricultural ALMPs. The funding of ALMPs was efficient and was helped by the system already in place in ISKUR

and thus standards/monitoring could be assured. The no-cost involvement of the PEVTB and ISKUR ensured that the VET courses were properly targeted and geared towards decent work opportunities for the young unemployed disadvantaged jobseekers. However the actual targeting of the jobseeker participants could have been better and is discussed further on in this report.

The overall budget for the programme is \$3.980,000 and this has been disbursed across the wide range of activities in an efficient and targeted manner. Good results have been achieved on both national and local levels. The amount committed directly to the ILO managed ALMPs delivered in partnership with ISKUR was in the region \$592,000. This represents 15% of the total budget. The original programme document set out “at implementation level to support the primary beneficiaries of the programme (which) are the young men and women (age 15-24) who are unemployed, cannot access or benefit from placement services and who do not have the employability skills for joining the formal labour market.” Particular emphasis was to be placed on migrants and these direct beneficiaries were expected to number 1200. While this target of 1200 has been met it may have been desirable to apply a higher percentage of the total budget to providing more for this group and to deepen the engagement further with highly disadvantaged youth with either no or primary education. This is discussed further in the Impacts section below.

## **6. Effectiveness of management arrangements**

The UNJP management and governance structures were efficient and effective and were operationalised by the UNJP team through the National Steering and Management Committees, the programme implementation group, the administrative support of the UNDP, active management and operational delivery by ISKUR and the key roles of the UNJP Ankara based manager and the local Antalya site manager. Despite the departure of the first local site manager half way through the programme and his replacement, continuity was maintained, thus underlining the efficient and sustainable overall management structure. The Programme Management Committee (PMC) executed its advisory and guidance role very effectively. The evaluator had the opportunity to attend the final PMC and members interviewed rated highly the work of the Committee and their ownership of the process. Communications channels among the programme partners and other agencies functioned very well and in an open manner. The programme made good use of coordination and collaboration opportunities whenever they arose. The National steering Committee provided a global oversight and supported the PMC. The Programme had the full backing of all senior officials of the Ministries and of the Public Employment Service-ISKUR.

### ***Monitoring and Evaluation***

Monitoring and evaluation frameworks were in place and allowed for measurement of outputs and expenditure against the programmed activities. Progress was monitored by the programme management and evaluated through various tools (reports, consolidated work plans etc.) and overseen by the regular PMC meetings.

<b>Mid-term evaluation recommendations</b>	<b>Improvements made</b>
<i>Promotion of partnerships</i>	PMC, PEVTB (triple helix), consultation meetings w/ the local stakeholders, UNJP-YEM e-mail group, monthly coordination meetings

<i>Design Training of Trainer sessions for the İŞKUR staff and the key local stakeholders</i>	ToT on Basic Life Skills ToT on Sectoral Development and Clustering ToT for the newly recruited Job Counsellors on Effective Matching and Placement Services
<i>Assess the effectiveness and impact of the capacity building programs</i>	Ex-post evaluation tools applied after each and every capacity building program
<i>Revisit the existing communication strategy</i>	Improved Communication Strategy Institutional actions on advocacy of NYEAP
Regular reporting to the beneficiary	Monthly progress reporting, Dissemination of the minutes to the PMC members
Establishing a monitoring and evaluation function	The progress is monitored and evaluated through various tools (reports, consolidated work plans etc.)
Development of a Sustainability and Exit Strategy	A fully fledged Sustainability Strategy developed

The monitoring and evaluation was questioned by the mid-term evaluator, however in the view of the present evaluator the deficit in this area relates mainly to the tracking of ALMPs outcomes. While İSKUR follow-up course participants on a regular basis, the UNJP felt it necessary to introduce a pilot monitoring tool in the form of a spreadsheet for completion by the İSKUR staff in order to address a perceived lacuna in the monitoring of ALMPs participants. This improved the monitoring capacity. A report is currently being formulated describing the difficulties of extracting disaggregated data from İSKUR and Social Security databases and providing recommendations for improving the situation.

The currently available data is as follows:

<b>Total VET Numbers recorded by İSKUR</b>	<b>656</b>
<b>Educational Level (Participants)</b>	
<i>Primary</i>	26%
<i>Secondary</i>	57%
<i>Degree</i>	17%
<b>Male</b>	<b>41%</b>
<b>Female</b>	<b>59%</b>
<b>Total Placed in jobs</b>	<b>59%</b>
<i>Of which Male</i>	44%
<i>Female</i>	56%
<i>Of which Education level Primary</i>	21%
<i>Of which Education Level Secondary</i>	64%
<i>Of which Education Level Degree</i>	15%

The above figures show a good placement rate into jobs from the VET courses but a proportion of those jobs could be guaranteed jobs. The targeting of disadvantaged youth appears on the face of it, to be mixed. Only 26% of the total cohort in the İSKUR training has Primary education and 17% have a degree level qualification. One would have expected a higher level of primary level participants and less or no degree level participants. The gender targeting is good and is reflected in the placement rate into jobs. The highest placement rate is for those with Secondary

level education and the lowest for Primary. However it is too early to make any definitive judgement of placement into sustainable jobs.

It was not clear either that the ISKUR general placement targets set out in the original programme documents were actively and closely monitored. The current position has been established to be as follows:

**Table 2.**

<b>Category</b>	2008	2009	2010	2011	2012 (6 mnths)
Registered Job-Seekers*	14.219	20.866	28.366	39.715	65.496
New Jobseekers year on year (flow)	n/a	6.647	7.500	11.349	25.781(6 months)
Open Vacancies*	8.806	10.496	21.740	39.518	31.921
Placement into jobs*	2.251	4.338	6.868	14.285	7.840
Job Placement Rate of stock of Jobseekers %	<b>16</b>	<b>21</b>	<b>24</b>	<b>36</b>	<b>12</b>
Placement into VET* Courses	86	4496	2172	3215	2305
Total Placement into Jobs and VET (%)	<b>17</b>	<b>43</b>	<b>32</b>	<b>44</b>	<b>16</b>

Data\* from ISKUR Oct 2012 (analysis mine)

The Data supplied by ISKUR, as set out in Table 2 above, is limited and does not give a complete picture. For example, placement into public works programmes is not included. However “placement rates” are normally defined as the number of jobseekers placed into jobs. Based on the above figures the placement rate into jobs has improved by 100% from 2008 to 2011. Since this is the same period as the programme, some of this increase must be attributed to the programme. Another factor is the massive increase in PES staff in Antalya over the past two years.

The placement rate of the stock of jobseekers into jobs ranges from 16% to 36%. This is substantially lower than the target set out in the original programme document. However if we exclude the stock figure and consider the flow figures, the placement rate would be substantially higher if just measured against the flow figure for jobseekers. More data is required to see what the actual placement rate of new jobseekers is year on year. It should be noted that a significant proportion of the stock would be longer-term unemployed who are more difficult to place. Some may be not available for work and may have registered for social benefits and not primarily for work.

Another remarkable feature of the above data is the exponential increase in job vacancies notified to ISKUR. Between 2008 and 2011 the number of vacancies increased by over 250%. The increased profile of the PES generated by the UNJP programme and its professional communication/visibility activities must be part of the reason for this, coupled with the staff increase and the new focus on contacting employers.

It would have been perhaps preferable to establish early on in the programme, a more robust monitoring system to include ISKUR placement rates and more particularly the outcomes and impacts from the ALMPs. This could have been done by developing a more structured tracking of outcomes using a combination of robust

long-term database tracking and commissioning a follow-up survey of ALMPs participants. A follow-up survey can also provide information on the quality of work and the level of informal placement, post-training. This is important in a programme dedicated to decent work opportunities. This deficit was raised by the evaluator during the field visits and it is understood that a survey has now been commissioned and results will be available by December 2012.

### ***Financial Management***

The PMC had good oversight of financial management and reviewed the position every 6 months. In strong collaboration with the focal points of the partner UN Agencies, the joint programme manager in Ankara undertook operational financial management of the budget effectively and efficiently. The total budget has been committed, according to the latest figures in Table 3 below. Although all outputs are delivered, there may be some underspend.

**Table 3**

	<b>Year 3 Allocation</b>	<b>Total Allocation</b>	<b>Cumulative Expenditures</b>	<b>Delivery Rate (%)</b>	<b>Delivery Forecast (%)</b>
<b>UNDP</b>	\$421.608,00	\$1.157.768,00	\$ 960.774	83%	100%
<b>ILO</b>	\$534.999,00	\$1,504,206.00	\$1,069,602	71%	91%
<b>IOM</b>	\$286.698,00	\$658.906,00	\$503.488	76%	100%
<b>FAO</b>	\$294.450,00	\$659.120,00	\$ 585.158	89%	100%
<b>TOTAL</b>	<b>\$1.537.755,00</b>	<b>\$3.980.000,00</b>	<b>\$3.120.000</b>	<b>78%</b>	<b>98%</b>

Position at Sept 2012

## **7. Impact and sustainability**

Impacts have been substantial and potentially long lasting. They occurred both on National Institutional and Local Operational levels. The UNJP has encouraged and facilitated good vertical, horizontal and local integration. The development of the NYEAP (led by the ILO) has had a major impact on Governmental Employment Policy and provides a template for any future actions to address youth employment and unemployment. This is perhaps the most significant sustainable National achievement of the UNJP and will potentially have a major impact on the employment prospects of 12 million Youth. Locally, the institutional needs assessment study influenced ISKUR and the PETVB thinking and reorganisation. Both report that institutionally, both are more focussed and that the improvements will be mutually sustained. Collaboration among them and other local Partners has also been greatly improved due to the work and mediation role of the UNJP (e.g. TURKSTAT are now members of the PEVTB and this will be sustained).

The development of local labour market knowledge through the survey and analysis funded by the UNJP/ILO has provided a sustainable template for accurate matching of supply and demand locally and from there to a national context. ISKUR are now also more sustainably involved in the agricultural labour market as a result of the work done by the UNJP/FAO and this has the potential to address both informality

and decent work in that sector. The development of new Basic Skill training modules by IOM for ISKUR to address the needs of migrants is very significant for the promotion of decent work in Antalya. The impact on the future of the local economy has also been significant through the development by the UNDP of the clustering approach. Inter-alia the UNJP collaborated with The West Mediterranean Development Agency (BAKA) to develop a new Health Tourism cluster and has the potential to provide full year round work in the Tourism sector which is normally seasonal, thus potentially providing decent work opportunities. A clustering business plan toolkit was also developed by BAKA.

As already discussed above, the measurement of the impact of the ALMPs supported by the UNJP is more difficult and requires a number of approaches. The simple measurement of short-term placement from training is not enough. A follow-up survey of participants would give more accurate and useful results. This could also be linked into the current World Bank (WB) study on the outcomes from VET. The WB are using a control group approach and impact data for Antalya covering the same UNJP period will be available from the WB for at least two training courses.

A more sustainable measure of impacts and cost benefit analysis is discussed in the OECD Employment Outlook for 2005. The authors propose that PES should track off-benefit, employment and earnings outcomes for programme participants for about five years in order to assess which programmes have genuinely beneficial long-term impact. They suggest that a robust measure of long-term outcomes can be assessed in terms of a “B + tW” formula; where B is the benefit payments saved, t is the tax rate and W is total participant earnings (the product of employment rate and wage rate). They go on to say that “when impacts are measured over long periods, the earnings component in this formula can be relatively large. Effective performance management with outcomes valued according to the (B + tW) formula would not only reduce total unemployment but also increase the delivery of substantive employment services which improve long-term employment and earnings outcomes. It would improve government’s net financial balance, because the (B + tW) criterion means that programmes are selected when the benefit savings and increased tax receipts that they generate exceed their cost”.<sup>8</sup> While unemployment benefit payments are of short duration in Turkey, the model proposed is worthy of consideration and can be part of the post-programme sustained monitoring and evaluation model.

### ***Sustainability***

A Sustainability and Exit Strategy has been developed in collaboration with the General and Provincial Directorates of ISKUR and partner UN agencies. A **Task Force** has been established by İŞKUR General Directorate for the implementation of the Sustainability and Exit Strategy. The first official meeting was held on 24 September 2012

A set of strategies and activities are planned under the following headings: -

---

<sup>8</sup>OECD employment outlook – isbn 92-64-01045-9 – OECD 2005

- Inter-institutional coordination and governance
- Employment strategies and vocational training programs
- Sectoral development, economic competitiveness and employment
- Employment and migration management
- Rural development and vocational training programs
- Communication and visibility

Measures are already in place to ensure the sustainability of the strategic outputs of the UNJP and its key activities. These include:

- Adaptation of the NYEAP into the National Employment Strategy with financial commitment from ISKUR and the Ministry of Labour and Social Security.
- Improved capacities at ISKUR and PEVTB in the form of a well-structured organisation with defined responsibilities, trained staff, technical and managerial capacities.
- Improved decision-making and programming capacities at ISKUR and PEVTB based on reliable statistical information and thorough analysis.
- Core staff and National Technical Team members continue to support the implementation of NYEAP.
- Local ownership by sector representatives to ensure that clustering efforts will continue on priority economic sectors, in coordination with Regional Development Agency.
- Local funding sources (local government; regional development agencies; or private sector etc) encouraged to commit to the implementation of development activities in priority sectors
- Improved quality of monitoring and evaluation system at ISKUR for effective performance assessment of provincial directorate, to ensure effective analysis of the impact of VET programmes, matching and placement services delivered for youth.
- Development of web-based version of the Rights at Work Handbook and its integration to ISKUR website which will reach much larger cohorts of young people across country and ensure long-term sustainability of the awareness-raising on rights at work for young people.

The planned final conference and ongoing UNJP communications and visibility activities such as the programme website, the programme bulletins, use of local radio in Antalya and a programme video currently in production, are well focused and are strategically important for the continued sustainability of the UNJP.

## **8. Conclusions and Lessons Learned**

The UNJP set out to support the adoption and implementation of employment policies benefiting the most vulnerable groups (young people and women from migrant families) in the labour market within the context of Turkey's east-west migration. It is clear that the UNJP has gone a long way towards achieving this aim.

### *Achievements*

The achievements (see Table 1 at page 15 above and Appendix 1 attached) at National and Local levels as set out in this evaluation, are impressive. The programme has provided a firm basis for achievement of Millennium Goals 1 and 3 in Turkey and in particular the position of women in the workforce and the provision of decent work for youth. It has achieved this at both National and Local levels by the impressive multi-agency approach using the resources of four different UN Agencies (UNDP, ILO, FAO and IOM) in strong collaboration with ISKUR.

### *Challenges*

The major challenge of coordination of this multi-agency approach has been met very successfully by the UNJP. This aspect of the programme is an exceptional example of best practice in the use of a UN multi-agency approach and deserves wide dissemination and replication in other countries that are considering the implementation of employment programmes targeted at youth, women and migrant workers.

The successful delivery of the UNJP was achieved despite facing the challenges of the restructuring of ISKUR both at the national and the provincial levels during the lifetime of the UNJP. There were obstacles in accessing some target groups (in particular PWDs) and delays in the mobilisation of the job counsellors. Variations in the operational and administrative procedures of the partner UN Agencies could have been problematic but were successfully overcome. Some stakeholders were unavailable at local level such as the Youth Council but despite this a substantial amount of activity was delivered locally.

### *Range of Outputs*

The range and scope of both national and local outputs and the potential payback in terms of economic and policy development and individual placement into decent work for the target groups are impressive and potentially self-sustaining. The adoption of the NYEAP by Government is an outstanding achievement. The UNJP achieved these outputs despite the need to replace the local and national programme managers during the course of the programme. The central role of the PMC and the Steering Committees in overcoming these operational challenges and keeping the programme on track is impressive.

The programme created a number of opportunities designed to increase the availability of decent work for young people including women and migrants. There is now high-level commitment for the NYEAP at the Ministerial level through the intensive advocacy activities of the UNJP. There are opportunities for scaling up of activities piloted in Antalya such as sectoral and rural development studies, the professionally designed and executed labour market and skills analysis and migration studies in the labour market context. ISKUR also now have an extensive toolkit which can be further developed and replicated nationally. Job counsellors trained under the UNJP can act as the local agents to sustain the lessons learned from their engagement with the UNJP. This can also feed into the activities promoted by the IPA PES programmes funded by the EU to deliver a full range of supports to PES staff and management.

On a local level the UNJP has created the grounds for the institutional sustainability of the programme impacts through the PEVTB, BAKA, ASBIAD, TURKSTAT, KOSGEB and the ISKUR Provincial Directorate. A particularly significant opportunity created by the UNJP is in the area of the sectoral development programmes which have successfully leveraged very substantial Governmental financing for the sectors, such as the Yacht Building Cluster.

#### *ALMPs*

The initial placement outcome from the ALMPs (59%) is good and can be attributed in part to good targeting of courses based on detailed labour market analyses supported by the ILO. Suggestions as to how outcomes can be tracked into the future are included in the recommendations below. Targeting of disadvantaged participants with low levels of education in the main VET programmes (excl. the FAO) delivered by the programme could have been better. In order to meet the needs of the most disadvantaged, the type of ALMP might have been varied to provide new pilot initiatives to engage directly with more very disadvantaged jobseekers. The addition of the IOM Basic life-skills modules for migrants to VET courses was commendable, innovative and worthy of replication on a wide scale in western Turkey in particular, which has a high level of inward internal migration.

#### *Financial*

Financial management and oversight was good and was competently executed by the programme management both locally and national, by the individual UN Agencies and by the PMC. Considering the potential impact of the decent work opportunities for a significant number of young jobseekers in Antalya and Nationally, the investment made by the MDG fund was well targeted, wisely disbursed and subject to good audit control by the individual Agencies and the UNJP management team. It would however have been also useful to allocate more of the budget towards initiating early on in the programme, some new pilot initiatives for highly disadvantaged jobseekers.

Finally, a strong sustainability and exit strategy being implemented by the Task Force rounds off the UNJP through their focus on inter-institutional coordination and governance, employment policies, VET, sectoral development and economic competitiveness leading to increased employment, migration management and rural development. The Task Force will also reinforce strong communication, advocacy and visibility in order to ensure sustainability. This provides a good foundation for the continuity of achievements and opportunities created by the UNJP.

### **9. Recommendations**

1. The UN Multi-Agency delivery model of the UNJP should be promulgated within the UN as a best practice example of how the MDGs can be achieved, as described in this report.
2. The Sustainability and Exit Strategy Task Force should be sustained and resourced for 12 months after the programme end in order to consolidate the significant successful impacts and outcomes from the UNJP. In that context the implementation of the NYEAP and its embedding in the National Employment Strategy should be closely advocated and monitored.

3. The programme has delivered a significant number of VET activities during the life of the programme (36 Courses, 27 ILO and 9 FAO). However due to the initial lack of good monitoring tools by ISKUR, the effectiveness and efficiency of such interventions have not yet been measured over an adequate time scale. This can be achieved by developing a more structured tracking of outcomes using a combination of robust database tracking and by commissioning a follow-up survey of ALMP participant outcomes. Although the UNJP was not required to do so, the former has been addressed by the ILO who have provided a new tracking tool to ISKUR and despite the tight schedule, a newly commissioned follow-up survey<sup>9</sup> by the ILO will address the latter. However the extracts produced for the current evaluation were insufficient to provide adequate qualitative data on outcomes. Work on such a tracking system is currently being done on the IPA PES programme and it is recommended that contact be made with the EU funded programme in order to enrich their work by providing the valuable knowledge gained and tools developed by the ILO under the UNJP in order to advance the development of an adequate monitoring and tracking tool.
4. The programme provided a suite of training to new job counsellors. While this was very welcome, it also provided a forum for staff to voice their needs for more training in how to engage successfully with clients, both unemployed and employers. There is also a need to professionalise the work of PES staff to bring them more in line with the skills sets available to professional employment counsellors. A basic course (part-time over 6 months) could be delivered to all the relevant staff and would consist of an introduction to professional vocational guidance in the PES. The basic level could be put in place quickly. It could be delivered in an open learning format incorporating home based learning materials and workshops. The methodology of the workshops would be based on an experiential approach which encourages people to engage in a critically reflective process of learning. The course would allow an exploration of the models and approaches to guidance and counselling, client case review and reflection on good practice and applied guidance skills (See [Appendix 2](#)).
5. As discussed earlier in this report, the targeting of disadvantaged jobseekers was good and could have been improved as evidenced by the analysis of the participants in the ILO supported ALMPs, above. The introduction of a more scientific system of client profiling in ISKUR is recommended. This would allow for more accurate identification of the target groups. The system could be designed for manual operation using pencil and paper or preferably, computerised systems. It would be based on the available information on the structure and distribution of disadvantage in the population. If necessary a

---

<sup>9</sup> The aim of a follow-up survey would be to assess the effectiveness and impacts of the ALMPs by looking at areas such as placement into decent work, levels of informality (do they have a work contract), educational level, age, gender, prior length of unemployment, migrant status, level of disability, household structure/level of disadvantage, type of training and degree of satisfaction, did they agree an action plan with an ISKUR counsellor, length of time to find a job, where employed, self employed/sector, job permanent/temporary, salary, if they pay tax and so on. This would provide a much more detailed analysis of the effect of the UNJP ALMPs on the decent work prospects of participants and an opportunity to identify the most and least successful interventions.

study of factors creating disadvantage could be undertaken and linked into a prospective profiling system. Appendix 3 gives an outline of how the system could operate.

6. A more individualised engagement with disadvantaged jobseekers through measurement of individual competency deficits of individuals related to identified skills shortages could also have taken place. This would be followed by direct matching of the jobseeker with potential employers prepared to provide a highly structured agreed and professionally designed curriculum of on-the-job training to address the individual's competency deficits. This approach has been successfully implemented in some other MDG-funded youth programmes. It is recommended that ISKUR consider such an approach on a pilot basis.
7. Training of trainers modules have been provided by the programme to a number of ISKUR staff. Limited use has been made of this new resource to date. It is recommended that the UNJP develop a strategy jointly with ISKUR before the end of the programme in order to ensure the use of this resource.
8. Sectoral clustering studies and activities have proven to be one of the most cost-effective aspects of the programme. Considering the potential payback both in terms of economic output and the provision of decent work opportunities, it is recommended that Government take note of the success of the UNJP in this area and that the model be extended to other Provinces.
9. The IOM Basic Skills Training for Unemployed Migrant Youth has proven to be a huge success and should be available to all ISKUR jobseekers and ALMP participants in high migrant-receiving Regions. Such an initiative not only supports the migrant workers' inclusion in the labour market, but also encourages them to integrate in urban living.
10. Reaching out to and placing PWD's has proven to be difficult during the lifetime of the programme. It is recommended that a PWD awareness programme and training be provided for all ISKUR staff with a view to increasing the placement rate for PWDs. It is important that awareness is raised in both staff and employers that disability occurs in structured ways and that the problem of adjustment is one for society, not individuals. The emphasis should shift to analysing, understanding and challenging the ways society disables people. The dominance of a "medical" model of PWD needs has led to a disabling culture while a "social" model facilitates the development of a disability aware culture. ISKUR can be instrumental in fostering an enabling culture for PWDs. The post-VET financial job-support package provided should be examined to see if it is enough and other access and enabling tools be explored in order to support employers to employ PWD.
11. FAO/ISKUR pilot initiatives to formalise work and provide certification to rural agricultural workers are to be commended and are worthy of

widespread replication. Health and Safety are central to providing decent work in all occupations but are particularly important in agricultural work. This needs to be reinforced in the cut-flower and seed sectors which were supported by the UNJP. In particular the use of agro-chemicals, pesticides and fertilisers produced on site (e.g. with Nitric acid) as witnessed by the evaluator needs to be carefully monitored so that the health and safety of workers are not compromised.

## **Appendix 1**

### **UNJP Key Achievements**

#### **Joint Activities**

- National Youth Employment Action Plan (NYEAP)
- Capacity Improvement for the Job Counsellors and PEVTB

#### **ILO**

- Coordination of the entire NYEAP development process and provision of technical support together with contributions from other UN agencies
- Occupational Outlook (developed for the first time)
- Antalya Labour Market Survey and Antalya Labour Market Analysis Report
- Rights at Work Handbook and its web-based animation with mobile and tablet applications
- Intensive support to the delivery of selected vocational trainings programs in Antalya. Their targeted selection was based on a newly elaborated labour demand and supply matching tool, resulting in an increase in placement rates.
- Monitoring and Evaluation Tool for ISKUR regarding the VET participants
- Pilot implementation of a three-phase entrepreneurship training course consisting of pre-training support and selection of participants; delivery of training course with additional modules and post-training support through business coaching/mentoring and regular monitoring of beneficiaries after the course completion.

#### **UNDP**

- Institutional needs assessment of the PEVTB and ISKUR
- Strategic Sector Scan in Antalya Region
- Cluster Analysis and Cluster Development Roadmaps for the priority sectors
- Capacity building events aiming at sectoral development
- Business Plan for West Mediterranean Development Agency (BAKA)

#### **IOM**

- Train the Trainers Program for İŞKUR staff on Basic Life Skills (BLS)
- Intensive capacity building programs for the young migrants on BLS
- Antalya Household Survey on Migration and Youth Employment (2011)
- Baseline Research: Local Monitoring of Human Mobility Impacts on the Labour Market and Youth Employment

#### **FAO**

- Research on the structure of rural employment in Turkey
- Research on effectiveness of vocational training and extensions in Antalya Region
- Vocational Training Programme Module on Ornamental Plants Production based on FAO Farmer Field School Methodology
- Intensive support to the delivery of select vocational trainings programs in the strategic agricultural sectors of Antalya

## Appendix 2

### A PES Course in Counselling and Guidance skills.

The course is designed to be highly interactive with a high involvement of participants through small and large group participation. Course material would include a large number of hand-outs and PowerPoint slides. Further reading by participants would be encouraged. As part of the training, participants could be asked to do homework which can include preparation of case-studies for presentation to the group. These case studies and the group/class response to them can be written up in a two page report by the case study presenter. Short essays may be assigned on particular theories of career development/choice thus reinforcing learning at the previous session, which can then be presented to the group. Role-plays of guidance interviews may be introduced. A *service network audit* may be completed by each participant in which the local network of supports useful in the guidance process is identified and written up as an assignment. Participants would also be asked to maintain a *learning journal*. Some of these assignments and written works may also be used in the certification process for each participant.

#### *Course Outline*

The course would aim to allow PES staff to take a step back from daily work in order to review, evaluate and gain further familiarity with the person centred, process model approach to vocational guidance. It would be designed to be practical but also to provide some insights into the theoretical foundations of our work with Jobseekers in the PES. It would also designed also to allow PES advisers to assess their own professional approach to guidance in the PES and to reinforce it or make changes as you may wish. The course would set out a systematic helping model for jobseekers which supports the modern professional placement service and would be designed to offer an opportunity to look again at the way we work with our clients.

#### *The Course could comprise five modules as follows:*

- Guidance-Counselling Psychotherapy
- The Guidance Interview.
- Dealing with Difficult Clients.
- The Guidance Practitioner.
- The Tools of Guidance.

Workshop themes could include adult development and the guidance process; models of adult guidance; applied guidance skills/IEP/action planning; support systems, contracts and boundaries; change, transition and loss; understanding aggression and conflict; developing a quality of PES advisers' work life.

Assessment procedures can include on the job skills applications/case presentation, learning journal, essays and interview by the trainer. Competencies developed would include interpersonal competencies in skills and strategies used in advising, informing and guidance, assessing information and contacts in the labour market context, working more effectively with others in teams and networks, managing relations and boundaries with clients, defining roles in different situations and settings.

## Appendix 3

### Labour Market Profiling of Disadvantaged and Vulnerable Groups

Profiling is currently one of the key areas of experimentation and study in European Public Employment Services (PES). Profiling in the main is basically a way of identifying those clients in most need when they register with PES so that PES resources are properly and cost-effectively targeted. The idea is that you don't engage with clients who can help themselves but concentrate on the ones that do need help.

There are a number of approaches used (Assessment by counsellor, Group screening, Econometric model) and the one generating the most interest at present is the econometric approach. We can describe the characteristics of each approach as follows:

#### *Assessment by counsellor*

In this approach currently used in PES, the assessment of the risk of long-term unemployment is carried out solely by PES staff on the basis of interviews with the unemployed. The risk assessment can be more or less formalised as regards the use of questionnaires and checklists. The main **advantages** of this approach are that it captures individual, subjective risk factors and a needs assessment is easily established. As to the **disadvantages** the approach is costly and the accuracy of the identification can vary substantially between individual Employment Mediators.

#### *Group screening*

In this approach the risk is determined on the basis of an individual's belonging to one or more at-risk target groups; typically identified by statistical analysis. The main **advantages** of the approach are low costs and objectiveness, as the assessment is counsellor independent. The **disadvantages** of the approach relate to the lack of subjective criteria and inflexibility as the assessment is based on group characteristics only.

#### *Econometric (Statistical) model*

In an econometric model individual characteristics are fed into a mathematical model based on statistical indicators and knowledge of causal relationships. Subsequently a risk measure is calculated. The main **advantages** include low costs, objectiveness and a combination of theory and empirical data. As to **disadvantages** of the model one can point to the risk of inflexible decision rules as well as to the complexity of building the model, which requires access to statistical data that must be regularly updated.

*The Australian Job Seeker Classification Instrument (JSCI)* is based on the Econometric model and computes the risk of becoming long-term unemployed on the basis of a number of individual characteristics. Based on their JSCI results, job seekers are referred to the level of Job Services Australia assistance that best suits their needs. Where barriers are identified through the JSCI that indicate a potential need for the most intensive Job Services Australia assistance or participation in Disability Employment Services (DES), the job seeker will undertake an additional

comprehensive Job Capacity Assessment (JCA) before referral to the most suitable specialised service.

The JSCI computes the risk of becoming long-term unemployed on the basis of 18 individual characteristics as follows:

1. Age and Gender
2. Work Experience
3. Job Seeker History
4. Educational Attainment
5. Vocational Qualifications
6. English Proficiency
7. Country of Birth
8. Indigenous Status
9. Indigenous Location
10. Geographic
11. Proximity to a Labour Market
12. Access to Transport
13. Contractibility (e.g. telephone)
14. Disability/Medical Conditions
15. Stability of Residence
16. Living Circumstances
17. Criminal Convictions
18. Personal Factors

Only job seekers with a high risk are counselled immediately by their case managers, whereas low-risk job seekers are eligible for job search training only after a few months.

#### *Factors creating Disadvantage in Turkey*

We have good information on which factors are likely to create disadvantage in the Labour market. We can develop a simple and easy to use profiling tool based on our present knowledge of the factors likely to create barriers to labour market entry. For example, being male increases the probability of having a job. These Gender issues in the labour market need to be explored further in order to better understand the mechanisms through which the labour market might exclude females thus making them more prone to vulnerability. Education and work experience have a strong impact on increasing employment. Experience can have a larger impact than education. For each year of experience, the probability of having a job increases.

In some countries being male and having children increases the probability of employment, however when children is interacted with females, we find out that it reduces the probability of employment. This shows that not only are females responsible for child-care, but also their probability of employment is reduced most probably as a result of taking time out of the labour market as a result of child bearing and rearing responsibilities. As mentioned above, children increase the probably of employment for males, supporting the findings in the literature that married men with children are perceived as more productive in the labour market. As with poverty, living in the Eastern areas compared to the other areas reduces the probability of employment

### *A Profiling Model for the Turkish Labour Market*

We can combine the factors creating disadvantage in Turkey with the most common variables used by the profiling models of various countries to compute risk of disadvantage and unemployment such as: age and gender; educational attainment; geographical location; family status and income; disability/medical condition; unemployment history and access to transport (or proximity to the labour market). Each factor can be assigned a numerical weight (score), indicative of the average contribution the factor makes to the difficulty of the individual in the labour market based on the research. For example, a scale 0 to 10 scale may be used, with “0” indicating no difficulty and “10” the highest possible difficulty. An individual’s score obtained by summing all the separate weights for that person, would indicate the overall employment difficulty in comparison with others. For example, an individual scoring less than 20 in the scale is classified as at low difficulties (Stream 1), another scoring between 21 and 29 (Stream 2) is at medium difficulty in the labour market, while individuals scoring between 29+ (Stream 3) are categorised as the most disadvantaged and vulnerable.

We can explore these categories and factors in more detail as follows:

- **Age.** This factor measures the labour market perception of age as an employment barrier. Older workers, for instance, are more likely to become unemployed compared to prime age workers. Young people are less likely to find a job due to their lack of work experience or qualifications that are relevant for the labour market. Based on analysis by age-group it is possible to assign different weights to different age-cohorts. For example, if youth employment data reveal that teenagers are twice as likely to be employed in low earning jobs compared to young adults, the score assigned to the age-group 16-19 will be more than that assigned to young adults.
- **Gender.** In certain countries, gender alone is only marginally associated with disadvantage, while other factors, such as educational attainment and family status are more relevant for computing risks. However, Turkish data points to clear gender-related differences.
- **Literacy:** the data of many countries point to a clear correlation between low levels of literacy and numeracy and labour market disadvantage.
- **Educational attainment.** Low education levels are associated with higher vulnerability through low income and job insecurity. Research indicates that children from low education families are at higher risk of acquiring low education themselves and therefore at higher risk of remaining vulnerable
- **Vocational qualifications.** The probability of having poor employment outcomes is also related to the lack of vocational or occupational qualifications. Such qualifications may be gained through school, or work experience or a combination of both.
- **Family status.** This refers to the position of individuals within families of different types. Disadvantaged and vulnerable women live on average in larger households than non-vulnerable women. Due to lower education,

lower work experience, more child-care responsibilities, and larger distances to primary schools and public transportation, vulnerable women are at much higher risk of exclusion from the labour market than the other group.

- ***Geographical location.*** This factor measures the disadvantage arising from living in a particular geographical location. The condition of the economy in the region of residence has a great influence on the probability of finding decent work. Being located in Eastern Turkey creates extra barriers to gaining employment.
- ***Transport (proximity to the labour market).*** The chances of an individual of having decent employment outcomes are directly related to his/her ability to physically access the labour market.
- ***Disability/medical condition.*** People with disabilities (PWD) face economic as well as social constraints, which places them in a vulnerable position. In cases when they are capable for work, they may be excluded either because of discrimination, or because work places do not accommodate their special needs.
- ***Work experience.*** Individuals with no or inadequate work experience are generally considered disadvantaged in the labour market. Research indicates that in some countries experience has a larger impact than education.
- ***Duration of unemployment.*** Employment prospects deteriorate as the duration of unemployment grows. Significant deterioration occurs around the 6 month mark, when motivation to search for work start to decline; around the 12 month period the impact of unemployment sets in with skills, work experience and work habits having already deteriorated considerably.
- ***Roma Communities.*** The Roma community in most countries is characterised by very low levels of employment, very high levels of unemployment, and lack of employment opportunities. The reasons for this are various, complex and interconnected and include aspects such as discrimination, low level of education and qualification, poor housing conditions and lack of employment and training programmes targeting Roma.

## Appendix 4

### Mission agenda

The mission agenda focused on face-to-face interviews with the UN agencies, İSKUR, other key actors and final beneficiaries. The main criteria were to test in a mutual participatory and honest fashion, the reported outcomes against the original programme document and to develop a detailed understanding of the programme achievements, actual lessons learned and sustainability, in accordance with the MDG-F goals and thematic windows.

The mission was conducted between the 1<sup>st</sup> to 10<sup>th</sup> Oct 2012 as follows:

<b>September 30<sup>th</sup> 2012 / Sunday - Ankara</b>
Arrival in Ankara
<b>October 1<sup>st</sup> 2012 / Monday</b>
Meeting with the UNJP Team at UN House
Meeting with UN RC at UN House
Meeting with İŞKUR at İŞKUR General Directorate
<b>October 2<sup>nd</sup> 2012 / Tuesday</b>
Meeting with the UNDP DRR at UN House
Meeting with IOM Chief of Mission at UN House
Meeting with ILO Director at ILO premises
Programme Management Committee Meeting at UN House
Meeting with FAO Assistant Representative at UN House
Transportation to the Airport for Antalya Flight
<b>October 3<sup>rd</sup> 2012 / Wednesday-Antalya</b>
Breakfast with the UNJP team
Briefing about UNJP activities on the site
Meeting with İŞKUR Provincial Director
Meeting with the Deputy Governor
Meeting with TURKSTAT
<b>October 4<sup>th</sup> 2012 / Thursday</b>
Meeting at ASBIAD (FTZ Assoc.)
Meeting at BAKA (RDA ISO)
Visit to KOSGEB Entrepreneurship training
Meeting at ATSO (Chamber of Commerce)

**5 October 2012 / Friday**

Visit to a VET at the city centre

Visit to the cut flower VET at Aksu

Wrap Up with the Antalya UNJP Team

Flight to Ankara

**8 October 2012 / Monday**

Debrief with UN Resident Coordinator

**9 October 2012 Tuesday**

Debrief and wrap up with UN Agencies  
PMC Meeting

**10 October 2012 Wednesday**

Debrief with ISKUR

## Appendix 5

### Initial Evaluator Identification of dimensions of analysis and possible areas for research

#### General approach

Relevance and Strategic Fit for the needs of final and National beneficiaries and the Millennium Development Goals

- Needs analysis?
- Ownership of concept etc by stakeholders e.g steering groups etc
- Alignment with National Strategies
- Fit with Partners' profiles and other donors work

#### Validity of Design

- Was joint programming the best approach to meeting the challenges outlined in the original programme document?
- Planned outcomes realistic?
- How appropriate are the indicators. Can outcomes be tracked...how?

#### Progress/Process and effectiveness

- Progress sufficient
- Outputs satisfactory (male/female, disabled), poverty reduction, strengthening of social partners, labour standards and decent work
- Local ownership and issues
- National ownership and involvement of stakeholders
- Geographical/sectoral areas...greatest achievements
- Areas of least achievement / alternative strategies...how could they have been formulated

#### Efficiency of resource use

- Resources applied strategically to achieve outcomes
- Joint nature of programme more efficient than single agency (e.g. ILO)
- Cost effective support
- Could it have been done cheaper
- Funds and activities delivered on time
- Mid-term evaluation –any impact

#### Effectiveness of management arrangements

- Management adequate?
- Programme Governance
- National partners support?
- PM and NS committees....how effective?

- Communications between programme team and all others
- UN Agencies collaboration
- Monitoring and evaluation system..how effective/data collection then management decisions?
- Collaboration with other in-country programmes such as the IPA PES, Women and Youth Programmes

#### Impact and sustainability

- What are the impacts..changes in attitudes etc. (ISKUR et al)
- Long-term impact
- Decent work and poverty
- Exit strategy and hand-over to national partners
- Has capacity been built and the programme taken over?
- Results durable?
- Replication?
- Unintended results