



International Programme on the Elimination of Child Labour (IPEC)



International
Labour
Office

IPEC Evaluation

Combating the Worst Forms of Child Labour in Indonesia. Supporting the Time Bound Programme for the Elimination of the Worst Forms of Child Labour in Indonesia.

**INS/05/P50/USA
P270.08.326.051—P270.08,326.052**

An independent final evaluation by a team of external consultants

January 2008

This document has not been professionally edited.

NOTE ON THE EVALUATION PROCESS AND REPORT

This independent evaluation was managed by ILO-IPEC's Design, Evaluation and Documentation Section (DED) following a consultative and participatory approach. DED has ensured that all major stakeholders were consulted and informed throughout the evaluation and that the evaluation was carried out to highest degree of credibility and independence and in line with established evaluation standards.

The evaluation was carried out a team of external consultants¹. The field mission took place in January 2008. The opinions and recommendations included in this report are those of the authors and as such serve as an important contribution to learning and planning without necessarily constituting the perspective of the ILO or any other organization involved in the project.

Funding for this project evaluation was provided by the United States Department of Labor. This report does not necessarily reflect the views or policies of the United States Department of Labor nor does mention of trade names, commercial products, or organizations imply endorsement by the United States Government.

¹ Clarence Shubert, Ph.D., International Consultant
with support of Lamtiur Tampubolon, Ph.D., National Consultant and
Antiani Arna, National Consultant for the Policy Impact Study

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Executive Summary	iv
Acronyms	vii
Project Description.....	1
Principal Findings	2
How the project did in meeting its immediate objectives.....	2
Support to Enable Policy and Structural Changes:	4
Policies on Law Enforcement in Relation to the WFCL	8
Capacity Building:	9
Awareness Raising and Research:.....	13
Survey of Attitudes to Child Labour and Education	13
Rapid Assessments to support Direct Action Projects	14
Surveys on Children in the Labour Force	14
Developing Risk Indicators for Child Labour.....	15
Direct Action Projects for Withdrawal from or Prevention of the WFCL	15
Preventing Trafficking and Commercial Sexual Exploitation of Children (CSEC)	15
Withdrawal of Children and Hazard Reduction in the Foot Wear Industry	18
Services for Children in or at risk of Illegal Drug Trafficking	19
Services for Children in or at risk of Off-Shore Fishing.....	21
Services for Children in or at risk from the Informal Mining.....	23
Services for Children at Risk of the WFCL in Aceh and Nias.....	24
Comparative Cost-Effectiveness of Different Types of Direct Services:	27
Comparative Cost-Effectiveness of Project Supported Direct Services	27
Increasing the Effectiveness and Sustainability of Capacity Building	29
Efficiency of Project Management	29
Lessons Learned.....	30
Recommendations.....	31
Annexes.....	33
1. Report of the National Evaluation Workshop	33
2. Report of the Evaluation Workshop in Aceh.....	45
3. Good Practice Case Studies	53
4. List of Attendance	103
5. Terms of Reference	117

Executive Summary

The methodology used for this Final Evaluation of the IPEC Project in Support to the Time Bound Programme on Elimination of the Worst Forms of Child Labour (WFCL) in Indonesia followed the TOR prepared by the IPEC-DED and conforms to the ILO-IPEC guidelines for evaluation. Following a desk review of relevant documentation, a field mission by the team of a national and international consultant was made to Jakarta and four provinces from 13 to 26 January 2008. A Policy Impact Study was done concurrently but independently by another national consultant, and some of the main findings of the study are incorporated in this report.

The Project in Brief

At the conclusion of this project it has achieved all of the objectives set out at the beginning, particularly in terms of changes in the policy environment and institutional capacity building. It has also reached the overall targets for withdrawal of children from the five selected types of the WFCL and prevention of trafficking of children into the WFCL. The only targets not reached in withdrawal of children from drug trafficking and mining were in part due to unrealistic targets established before full assessment of the situation on the ground. The illegal and intractable nature of drug trafficking makes this the most difficult type of WFCL to overcome.

The addition of assistance to Aceh following the tsunami put added burdens on project management and staff, but that assistance has also reached its targets and has generated a number of modules on life skills and pre-vocational education as well as one on establishing combined elementary and junior high school “one roof schools”. However, the Aceh Provincial Action Committee has not yet been established which has hampered interagency coordination and monitoring.

It is important to remember that this project is in support of the first phase of a 20 year National Plan of Action for the Elimination of the WFCL. In that context, the strategic design and extremely flexible methods for implementation of the project was entirely appropriate. The strategy of a two pronged approach with support to the policy environment through advocacy, capacity building, research and public awareness raising complemented by a wide variety of small pilot projects for direct services with many different partners was very appropriate for this first phase support. The mechanism of identifying, training and then short-term contracts with partners enabled the project to identify strong partners, strengthen weaker partners, and try out many different models for withdrawal of and services for children in or at risk of the WFCL in a wide variety of settings.

Linking Policy Development and Direct Action Projects

One aspect of the strategy is to link the direct action projects with policy and institutional development. This has been done particularly well in the most important area of educational policy and institutions. The direct services support included: introducing and developing modules on child rights, child labour and the WFCL and field testing teaching methods improvement in cooperation with the local education offices and teachers unions; facilitating pilot projects for open and “one roof” junior high schools; introducing and developing modules on life-skills and pre-vocational education; and supporting the use of non-formal education Packet B in community learning centres and children's creative centres. The most important recent development is a large conditional cash transfer programme called Hope for Families that is funded by the national government with a Rp. 40 Billion (US\$ 4.4 million) budget. As a result of ILO-IPEC advocacy, it specifically links grants to poor families with the requirement that school age children stay in or rejoin school rather than work. The projects for withdrawal and services for children in the WFCL have also been

linked to development of Integrated Services Centres providing integrated legal, health and counselling services.

Key Findings and Conclusions

1. IPEC has played a key role in support of the GOI's NPA to eliminate the WFCL, it has worked closely with the national government to support policy and institutional development and with government and NGOs for direct action projects.
2. The most successful interventions have combined policy and regulatory initiatives with direct-action, community-based projects coordinated by provincial and district action committees with broad government and NGO membership.
3. Action Committees for Elimination of the WFCL are needed to empower and coordinate government and NGO partners, but are more effective if placed under the Commission for the Protection of Children headed by a representative of the local government.
4. IPEC has helped initiate and field test many GOI policies to expand access to and improve formal education at the Junior High School level to prevent school drop out and entry into the WFCL. Field experiences have shown that the most effective interventions are:
 - Grants for education related expenses piloted by IPEC which are now supported in MoNE (BOS) and many local government budgets (BOSD) and will be expanded through the GOI conditional cash transfer programme Hope for Families;
 - Remedial education and tracking of drop outs and at risk students supported by IPEC in many locations;
 - Teacher training on life-skills, child rights, and risks of child labour using modules developed by IPEC partners and extension of the MoNE's PAKEM teaching method;
 - Adding junior high teachers and classrooms to existing elementary schools in remote areas to create "One Roof Schools" which was supported by IPEC in Aceh and East Kalimantan and is now being implemented by MoNE nationwide.
5. On the other hand, non-formal education using Packet B and informal Open Junior High Schools, also field tested with IPEC support, are not working well and are not accepted as equivalent to formal education.
6. Involvement and support of local governments and community organizations with NGO projects is necessary both for effective implementation and sustainability.
7. Peer educators and counsellors are cost-effective but must be carefully selected, trained and monitored by professional staff, and may not be suitable in some cases.
8. IPEC's direct management of many small, short-term contracts was appropriate for the first phase but not as suitable for institutional development and sustainability in the next phase.

Recommendations for the Next Phase of Support to the NAP

Funding from USDOL for the next phase of the project of support to the NAP is assured, and continuation of the work begun in Aceh will be part of the new EAST Project. However, in the second phase project supported activities should be increasingly institutionalized within the national and local governments, non-government, employer, workers and community organizations. This can be supported by:

1. Developing long-term contracts with a few partners that can mentor, monitor and assist reporting by small project implementers;
2. Supporting MoMT to set up Action Committees to eliminate the WFCL in the remaining 12 provinces and districts where local government budgets can be mobilized;

3. Working with MoMT and MoWE to draft a decree to encourage establishment of a Commission for Protection of Children in every province and district and to place the Action Committees for elimination of the WFCL and related Action Committees under it.
4. Working with the national teachers union and MoNE to more widely disseminate modules on child rights, child labour and life-skills;
5. Working with JARAK to increase their training and monitoring capacity and to improve their website to become a repository for materials generated through the project;
6. Working with APINDO to link private company “social responsibility programmes” to vocational and pre-vocational training;
7. Working with partners to develop more systematic training and monitoring of peer educators and counsellors and initiating systematic networking among them;
8. Doing DME training with all new partners and short refresher training workshops for all previous partners focusing particularly on the monitoring and evaluation aspects.
9. Focusing on the most cost-effective methods and reducing support for those that are less cost-effective or not sustainable.

However, in the new types of the WFCL being addressed in the next phase (children on plantations and in domestic work) there is a need for independent studies to better define the extent, location and nature of the problem, and campaigns to raise public awareness. There is also a need for highly flexible small contracts to initiate and develop new methods in this area. For these new areas the current system of numerous short-term contracts remains appropriate.

The new GOI funded conditional cash transfer (CCT) programme, Hope for Families, being introduced in 7 provinces addresses the single largest cause of school drop out. This will have a major impact on the reduction of child labour and potentially the elimination of the WFCL. The IPEC project should work closely with this new programme, particularly in monitoring the impact on the WFCL. Linked to this is the survey of child labour to be undertaken by the Central Bureau of Statistics. The project should provide support to the survey especially in the provinces where the CCT is being started and where project activities are being implemented.

Acronyms

APINDO	The Indonesian Employers Association
BAPPEDA	National Development Planning Board
BOS	Assistance for Operational Costs of Schools
BPS	Central Bureau of Statistics
CCC	Children's Creative Centre
CCT-PKH	Conditional Cash Transfer called Hope for Families
CL	Child Labour
CLMS	Child Labour Monitoring System
CRC	Convention on the Rights of the Child
CSEC	Commercial Sexual Exploitation of Children
CTA	Chief Technical Advisor
DED	Design Evaluation and Documentation Section of IPEC
DME	Design, Monitoring and Evaluation Training
EAST	Education and Skills Training for Youth in Indonesia
ENABLE	Enabling Communities to Combat Child Trafficking through Education
ENABLE/Aceh	Enabling Aceh to Combat Exploitation through Education
ILO	International Labour Organization
IPEC	International Programme for the Elimination of Child Labour
JARAK	NGOs Network for the Elimination of Child Labour
KPAD	Provincial or District Commission for Protection of Children
LPA	Provincial or District Foundation (NGO) for Protection of Children
MoMT	Ministry of Manpower and Transmigration
MoNE	Ministry of National Education
NAC	National Action Committee for elimination of the WFCL
NGO	Non-Governmental Organization
NPA	National Plan of Action on Elimination of the WFCL
Packet B	Non-formal education package intended to be equivalent to junior high school
PAKEM	Active, Creative, Effective and Enjoyable teaching method
SD	Elementary School
SMP	Junior High School
SMA	Senior High School
SPF	Strategic Programme Framework
TBP	Time Bound Programme for the Elimination of WFCL
USDOL	United States Department of Labor
WFCL	Worst Forms of Child Labour

Project Description

The IPEC project supports the implementation of the first phase of the twenty year National Plan of Action (NPA) and Time Bound Programme (TBP) for the Elimination of the Worst Forms of Child Labour (WFCL) in Indonesia. It has two major components: strengthening the enabling environment, and targeted, direct interventions. The assistance focused on the enabling environment included support for the formation of provincial and district action committees, support to educational policy innovations, capacity building within government and NGO partners and support for research and public awareness raising.

The direct interventions for withdrawal from or prevention of the WFCL were focused on children involved in prostitution, illegal drugs, the footwear industry, mining and off-shore fishing. The project works through a large number of small short-term contracts with government and non-government partners. Overall there were more than 40 different partner organizations widely dispersed over five provinces with many partners having two or more short sequential contracts.

The project had nine immediate objectives for the end of the project plus the addendum in response to the tsunami in Aceh and Nias:

1. Provincial and district development plans will include child labour concerns;
2. Education and training policies will be more responsive to the needs of children in or at risk the WFCL.
3. The knowledge base on child labour will be enhanced and used to monitor trends and assist in development and implementation of national, provincial and district policies;
4. The legislative framework will be enhanced and better enforced;
5. Behaviour and attitudes towards the WFCL will have changed;
6. Enhanced capacities of national, provincial and district level stakeholders to plan, monitor, implement and evaluate actions to prevent and eliminate the WFCL;
7. Detailed information on the extent and nature of the WFCL in targeted provinces and districts will be available and will have been used for programming interventions;
8. Children will have been withdrawn from the WFCL and prevented from entering such work through direct services supported by the project; and
9. Poor families will have been provided with opportunities to increase their incomes.
10. Following the tsunami, in early 2005 the project added assistance for non formal education and vocational training in schools and community learning centres in Aceh and Nias.

Principal Findings

How the project did in meeting its immediate objectives

All of the immediate objectives were met, but results in some could be further enhanced as indicated in the findings and recommendations.

1. At the end of 2007, 21 provinces and 69 districts had established Action Committees for the elimination of the WFCL. IPEC assisted MoMT to support provinces and districts to establish committees, by decrees or legislation which, in most cases, also provided operational budgets for the committees. Local legislation or regulations are continuing to be developed that conform to the national laws and international conventions related to child labour and the WFCL. However, the Action Committees have not been established in Aceh. Also further mobilization of local government budgets for elimination of the WFCL can be obtained if heads of local governments are more directly involved.
2. Eight educational policy initiatives to make junior high school more accessible, relevant and affordable for children at risk from the WFCL were piloted or field tested with IPEC support. Six of these were effective and are being replicated on a wider scale by the MoNE. However, the non-formal education packet B and the informal Open Junior High Schools were shown to be less effective.
3. IPEC conducted a Survey of Attitudes to Child Labour and Education at the outset of the project to establish a base of information to help guide both policy support and direct action projects. IPEC also supported six rapid assessments to provide a base line of information in each of the areas for direct action to eliminate the WFCL (trafficking, CSEC, footwear industry, trafficking of illegal drugs, informal mining, and off shore fishing). In 2006 IPEC commissioned a study on “Indonesia's Youth Labour Market and the Impact of Early School Drop Out on Child Labour”. These studies have all been published by ILO and have significantly enhanced the knowledge base on child labour in Indonesia generally and in the target provinces in particular. IPEC has also worked with BPS to include child labour questions in the national labour market and household surveys. However more needs to be done to internalize research on the WFCL and information dissemination within the GOI and NGO network.
4. National legislation on child protection, child labour, and the WFCL was in place at the start of the project but has been supplemented by Act No. 21 in 2007 on prevention of human trafficking. Implementation of the laws on child protection has been enhanced through formation of a National Commission on Child Protection and National Plans of Action on elimination of CSEC, WFCL, and trafficking. Each NPA establishes National Action Committees and calls for establishment of provincial and district action committees. IPEC assistance has been instrumental in supporting implementation of the NPA on elimination of the WFCL and in establishing the Action Committees on the WFCL. **It is recommended that IPEC work with GOI to resolve remaining conflicts in laws pertaining to children involved in prostitution and drug trafficking, and to draft a decree to encourage local governments to place Action Committees under a Commission for Protection of Children.**
5. Observations during field work, reports in the press and discussions with media leaders indicate that there is now much more information and concern about child labour among the general public. **It is recommended that a follow up study on attitudes to child labour and education, similar to the one done in 2004, be conducted to quantitatively define the extent and nature of changes in**

public attitudes and behaviour on child labour.

6. The DME training provided to Action Committees on elimination of the WFCL, local government agencies and NGOs has resulted in improved project proposals, as well as better implementation and monitoring. Improved monitoring of the extent and risk of child labour as well as direct action projects is needed. Only the Aceh partners did not receive the DME training and consequently have weaker implementation monitoring and Aceh has not yet established the Provincial Action Committee. **It is recommended that DME training be provided to all new partners and refresher training workshops focusing on trends and risk monitoring and evaluation be conducted with current partners.**
7. IPEC supported six rapid assessment studies by independent universities or research institutions to develop a detailed information base on the WFCL in the targeted provinces. These were ground breaking studies in difficult areas but most were high quality. These studies were used and further enhanced through information gathered during project planning and implementation by project partners and local governments. **It is recommended that follow up rapid assessments be done by independent researchers in the targeted provinces to quantify changes in the situation of the WFCL and provide a base-line for the next phase.**
8. According to the September 2007 TPR reports the targets and achievements for withdrawal from, prevention of and services for children in the WFCL are as follows:

Category of Child Services	Target	Achieved	Percent
Withdrawn from the WFCL	2,900	2,514	87%
Prevented from entering the WFCL	28,550	27,078	95%
Provided non-formal education	4,160	8,419	202%
Mainstreamed in formal education	3,690	14,022	380%
Provided vocational education	4,860	3,708	76%

9. According to the September 2007 TPR, 9091 families have been “provided economic opportunities”. This exceeds the target of 7500, but among these only 14% had substantially increased their incomes until the last report when it suddenly jumped to 30%. This jump in effectiveness was not explained. Micro credit seems to have been the most effective part of this intervention. The vocational skills trainings observed have seldom been sufficient to actually equip anyone for a new line of work, and entrepreneurial training is weak. **Conclusion: If IPEC and its partners continue to work on family and community poverty reduction, they should focus on facilitating establishment of micro-credit organizations, particularly credit unions.**
10. The project has supported pre-vocational training in 2 government and 3 Muslim boarding schools in Aceh city, one roof school development through a local NGO in 2 remote villages and pre-vocational and life skills training in 11 rural schools through Save the Children US. This work has been documented in modules on pre vocational training and on development of one roof schools. However, the DME training was not done in Aceh and the Action Committee has not yet been established at provincial or district levels.

Support to Enable Policy and Structural Changes:

Support to legislation and regulatory reform related to the WFCL

Most of the national legislative reform was done prior to the commencement of this project. The major drivers of that reform were the ratifications of the Convention on the Rights of the Child through Presidential Decree No. 36 in 1990, ILO Convention 138 on Minimum Age for Employment through Act No. 20 in 1999, and ILO Convention No. 182 on Elimination of the WFCL through Act No. 1 in 2000. These have been further reinforced in Indonesian law through Act No. 23 on Child Protection in 2002, Act No. 13 on Labour Force in 2003 and Act No. 21 on Trafficking in 2007. Despite the advances of Act 21 in 2007, there are still some conflicts in the laws pertaining to the treatment of children involved in drug trafficking and prostitution which need to be worked out. In the penal code they are still subject to prosecution as criminals while under the newer laws they are viewed as victims and provided services for rehabilitation. Advocacy to resolve these conflicts in the law will be an important aspect of the next phase of support to the NPA.

The Policy Impact Study, done concurrently with this evaluation, was only available after the first draft of this report was complete. It provided the above information and makes the important point that the change in the content of the law is only the first step in implementation. The second step is to reform the structural institutions and apparatus to administer these changes and the third step is to reform the culture, perceptions, attitudes and behaviour of the community to conform to these laws.

The implementation of the new laws on child protection is being done through a series of National Plans of Action: 1) NPA on Human Rights, 2) NPA on elimination of CSEC, 3) NPA on elimination of the WFCL, 4) NPA on elimination of human trafficking, and 5) NPA for Indonesian Children. Each of these NPAs calls for establishment of Action Committees. This has created a complex set of institutional arrangements at national, provincial and district level.

An important objective of the current IPEC Project is to support the reforms related to the NPA on elimination of the WFCL in the institutions and regulations at the provincial and district levels. The primary means for this has been the support to the MoMT to set up Action Committees for the Elimination of the WFCL. However, it is important to consider not only these committees but also how they relate to, overlap with and reinforce the other Action Committees on CSEC and Trafficking within the local government structure.

Formation of and support to Action Committees on WFCL:

The IPEC project has provided support through the Ministry of Manpower and Transmigration (MoMT) to establish and train Provincial and District Action Committees for Elimination of the WFCL in the 5 targeted provinces. In fact the Provincial Action Committees were established with IPEC support prior to the start of the project in East and West Java and North Sumatra. Provincial Action Committees have now been formed in 21 Provinces based on the guidance agreed on between IPEC and MoMT. District Action Committees have been formed in 69 districts with all 38 districts in East Java having formed action committees. This exceeds the targeted number of action committees anticipated to be formed in this period. However, the nature, placement and effectiveness of the committees have varied by province and district.

The Action Committee on elimination of the WFCL itself is normally chaired by the head of the Provincial or District Office of Manpower which also provides the supporting secretariat. The Action Committees are comprised of representatives of the relevant provincial or district offices (education, health, police, social

affairs, etc.); important non-government organizations concerned with child labour such as labour unions, employers association, foundation for the protection of children (LPA) and other child welfare organizations; local universities or research institutions and some representatives of the media. The committee's functions are to assess the situation regarding the WFCL, monitor trends affecting the WFCL, and review and monitor policies and proposed action projects for elimination of the WFCL.

Because they are not chaired by a representative of the head of local government, Action Committees on WFCL may find it difficult to influence local development planning, obtain local government funding or get local legislation and regulations passed. It works better, as it is in East Java, where it is a sub-committee of the Provincial or District Commission for the Protection of Children (KPAD) which is chaired by the head of the planning departments (BAPPEDA) or the executive secretary of the local government (SEKDA). In the context of the local government in Indonesia, this is very important because BAPPEDA is the coordinating body for planning and budgeting and SEKDA has executive power and represents the head of local government. This also assures that the other related Action Committees for Trafficking and CSEC, which have overlapping memberships and interests with the Action Committee for elimination of the WFCL, will be reinforcing each other.

It is recommended that IPEC work with MoMT, MoWE and other relevant GOI authorities on a presidential or ministerial decree to encourage establishment of a Commission for Protection of Children in every province and district and to place the Action Committees for elimination of the WFCL as well as the Action Committees on Trafficking and CSEC under it.

The Action Committees are the main means not only to coordinate but also to empower government and non-government stakeholders in their actions to eliminate the WFCL. This is clearly illustrated by the contrasts in coordination and empowerment of agencies in Aceh, where the action committee has not yet been formed, and East Java, where the Provincial Action Committee for elimination of the WFCL has been formed under the Provincial Commission for the Protection of Children and 38 District and City Action Committees have also been formed. The formation of the Action Committees is done through local government decrees or legislation which usually commits local government funds for its operation and by definition indicates that the local government development plans have incorporated child labour issues.

All of the provinces which were the original focus of the project (East, Central and West Java, East Kalimantan, and North Sumatra) report that substantial funding (US\$ 30,000 to \$100,000) from local development budgets are also being used to support actions to eliminate the WFCL. The IPEC project has supported the Ministry of Manpower and Transmigration in the formation of and training for the provincial and district committees in the selected provinces. The project staff has also worked closely with provincial and district Action Committees in the selected provinces. The MoMT is keen to set up Action Committees in the remaining 12 provinces and many more districts in the next phase of the NAP and requests IPEC support for this. It is recommended that IPEC support this even though direct action projects can only be supported in targeted provinces and districts. In the context of decentralization following the 1999 law on regional autonomy, many provinces and districts have large development budgets that can be mobilized if the action committees are formed and appropriately integrated into the local government structure.

Support to Educational Policies Affecting the WFCL

Many recent developments in educational policy in Indonesia, as stated in the 2005-09 Strategic National Education Plan, are expected to make education more accessible for children at risk of the WFCL. Prior to the start of the project in 2004 the government of Indonesia had already decided to make education compulsory for nine years until completion of Junior High School (SMP). However, there were many constraints in achieving the goal of nine years of education. Not only are families unable to pay the cost of education (which averages Rp. one million (US\$ 110) per year for junior high school) but there are also not

enough junior high schools particularly in remote and poor areas. During the four years of this project many policy innovations were introduced to help achieve this goal (Conditional Cash Transfer, Open Schools, One Roof Schools, enriched curriculum, expanded non-formal and special education, and community learning centres). The IPEC project has helped to initiate and implement pilot projects in most of these educational policy innovations. Achieving universal junior high school education would keep all children out of the labour force until at least age 15 and would be perhaps the most important factor in reducing child labour and eliminating the WFCL.

Box1 on International cooperation for policy advocacy:

During the mission we had the opportunity to meet with UNICEF, the US Labour Attaché and Save the Children among others. We heard that there is a regular consultative group among international agencies on issues related to child protection, trafficking and child labour. It is useful for the IPEC CTA to regularly attend meetings of this group to advocate on issues for a common approach on issues related to child labour and support for educational policies. While this group which includes World Bank, ADB, UNDP and others cannot set policy, they can harmonize their support for the GOI and thereby have a better chance of influencing national policy

In 2007 a Conditional Cash Transfer (CCT) programme called Hope for Families (PKH) funded by the national government budget was introduced in seven provinces. PKH grants funds to women who care for children in poor families and requires them to seek prenatal care, vaccinate infants and enrol their school-age children in schools. It is specifically intended to help low-income families withdraw school age children from work and return them to school. This explicit linkage to child labour was achieved through close collaboration of ILO-IPEC with government policy makers; although no IPEC project funds have been used to support the CCT. Nevertheless, this is an international innovation in the use of CCTs. How effective this will be in supporting the withdrawal of children from work and the prevention of child labour should be carefully monitored in the next phase of the IPEC project. **It is recommended that IPEC work with BPS and MoNE to establish a system for monitoring the impact of the CCT-PKH on school drop out and on child labour in the seven affected provinces.**

Assistance for operation expenses (BOS) is provided to schools on a per student basis to cover books, maintenance, examination and registration fees, fees for temporary teachers and staff, and school activities. This is also supplemented in some districts with local government funds referred to as BOSD. Some of the earliest IPEC project activities foreshadowed BOS by providing direct support for books, bags and uniforms to children who were withdrawn from the WFCL or who were at risk of dropping out of school to join the labour force. This was one element in projects for tracking drop outs or working children and providing remedial education to reintegrate them into junior high schools. **Conclusion, this was very effective in IPEC funded pilot projects but required regular funding to be sustained. With both the national budget (BOS) and local budgets (BOSD) being provided for this it seems it will be sustained.**

Open schools with more flexible schedules, no uniforms and other adjustments for poor and working children have not been well accepted. Observations by the evaluation team during the field work and previous experiences documented in the project (see attached good practice cases in East Kalimantan and Aceh) indicate that Open Junior High Schools are not well accepted by communities and may quickly revert to formal schools. In both East Kalimantan and Aceh the initial support to open schools was changed to support the “one roof” school idea. **Conclusion, the project support helped to make a determination that the Open Junior High School concept is not well accepted.**

Box2 on Formal vs. Informal Schools

A major part of the formal education experience is the requirement to regularly and punctually attend classes, be properly dressed and have the right books and materials. Without the formality it no longer instils the discipline even if the curriculum is conveyed. In an emerging industrial country like Indonesia the discipline of formal school is nearly as important as the curriculum content. This is recognized by parents, teachers, and employers and even by children. For this reason the informal open schools and non formal education are not being well accepted.

A policy of “one roof” schools that add rooms and teachers for junior high schools (SMP) to existing elementary schools (SD) was introduced in 2005. This is particularly directed at remote areas where there are existing elementary schools but not enough junior high schools to accommodate all graduates from elementary schools. IPEC has assisted in advocacy and organizational support for creation of one roof schools in East Kalimantan and Aceh where a module on this has been developed. The costs of construction of the additional classrooms are funded by block grants from national education budgets but operational costs are expected to be funded from local government budgets. **Conclusion, project support to facilitate this has shown that this is a cost-effective way to expand formal education to the full nine years in remote areas, and to share the cost between MoNE and local governments.**

IPEC has supported pilot projects in pre-vocational and life skills education within junior high schools in Aceh and Nias. There has been some attempt to link the pre-vocational training with income generating activities as well but this has not been systematic. Up to now the pre-vocational training has only been done where external funding has been available. In Aceh we were told that expansion of the pre-vocational training would be funded from the provincial budget. However, it is unlikely that it will be expanded nationwide unless a regular source of external funding is found. **It is recommended that IPEC work with APINDO and MoNE to systematically link private sector business, through their Corporate Social Responsibility programmes, to support pre-vocational training and to support MoNE to mainstream training on computers in secondary schools.**

Another effort to reduce the number of drop outs is the “active, creative, effective and enjoyable” (PAKEM) teaching method. PAKEM training was previously developed by the Ministry of Education but has been supported by the IPEC project in several locations in cooperation with the local education office and teachers union. This was also part of projects to provide remedial education to reintegrate school drop outs and working children in the formal school system. This training seems to have been very effective and much appreciated. It is relatively low cost as it requires no additional personnel or facilities. It also builds resources in the form of trained teachers who pass on their training through informal networks. **It is recommended that IPEC continue to support PAKEM training in the selected provinces.**

The most cost-effective intervention in education that specifically addresses the WFCL is training on child rights, child labour and the dangers of trafficking for the WFCL. The multi-year module on this developed and field tested in 8 schools by the teachers union in Sukabumi seems to be well structured and effective. The project has also supported remedial classes for school dropouts and training on the dangers of child labour in schools in Bogor and in East Kalimantan. These have been effective in part because of funding to support costs of schooling such as uniforms, books and bags for children who dropped out and are returning to school. (The module developed in Sukabumi is described in more detail on page 24.)

Enrichment of curriculum in junior high schools is an important element of educational policy to prevent children from dropping out. IPEC has supported four types of enrichment activities: life-skills training, pre-vocational training, training on child rights and child labour, and PAKEM teaching methods. Modules on life skills and pre-vocational training have been prepared in Aceh and a module on child rights, child labour and prevention of trafficking was prepared in Sukabumi under the project. **It is recommended that IPEC support (PGRI) the national teachers union and MoNE to disseminate and train teachers**

on the child rights, child labour and life-skills modules, initially in the targeted provinces and wider if resources permit.

The Non-Formal packet B has been less effective. IPEC has supported the use of Packet B in North Sumatra in the context of Children's Creative Centres and in East and West Java in the context of Community Learning Centres (PKBM). One problem is that the packets can only be provided for a minimum group of 25 to 40. It was also reported by three different project partners that the local non-formal education offices required them to cover 25 percent or more of the costs of the Packet B. There have also been delays in receiving the various modules. Finally, experience from the projects, observations from the field visits, and comments at the evaluation workshops indicate that status of Packets A, B and C as equivalent to formal schools has not been accepted by the public. Although Packet A may still be an effective way to teach basic literacy and numeracy, Packet B and C are not an effective alternatives to formal schooling because they: 1) are not accepted as equivalent to formal education; 2) require large groups in fixed locations; 3) require substantial "counterpart" funding; and 4) do not appear to be effective. **It is recommended that IPEC reduce support for non-formal education, except in unusual circumstances.**

Special Education definitions and funding has now been broadened to include children disabled as a result of poverty, remote location, or being a cultural minority. How this recent policy development will work in relation to expanding access to education and reduction of child labour is still not clear and needs to be explored in the next phase. Apparently there is an adequate national budget for this so the IPEC project would primarily be helping to identify and focus this type of assistance in the areas where other direct action projects are being carried out. **It is recommended that IPEC work closely with the Special Education Directorate in the MoNE to assure that this programme reaches children at risk of the WFCL in the selected provinces.**

Through their project support IPEC and their partners have been influential in initiating or field testing many of these educational policy changes. The direct assistance for the development and use of life skills and pre-vocational training modules in Aceh and for the development and use of modules on child rights and the dangers of the worst forms of child labour in Sukabumi will help bring these into the mainstream of junior high school education in Indonesia.

Conclusion: the IPEC project has provided valuable support for pilot projects and field testing of the above mentioned educational policy innovations. This assistance has been extremely important in improving education policy and expanding education for children in the 12 to 15 age group and thereby keeping them out of the worst forms of child labour.

Policies on Law Enforcement in Relation to the WFCL

With ratification of the Convention on the Rights of the Child in 1990, ILO convention 138 on minimum age for employment in 1999 and ILO convention 182 on elimination of the worst forms of child labour through Act No. 1 in 2000, the worst forms of child labour became illegal in Indonesia. However, the main intent of the laws is not only to punish offending employers but rather to withdraw and prevent children from entering the WFCL. In fact, one of the problems is the conflict between earlier laws that define children as criminals to be prosecuted and more recent laws that define children as victims to be assisted when they are involved in drug trafficking or prostitution. The role of police and law enforcement has become more complex as the rights of children, particularly those involved in illegal activities such as prostitution and illegal drugs have become more known. **It is recommended that IPEC hire a legal consultant to work with relevant authorities to develop legislation to resolve the current conflicts in laws related to children exploited in prostitution and drug trafficking.**

One important policy and institutional change has been the development of Integrated Services Centres (PPT) for women and children that bring together health, counselling and legal services in a single centre. The legal basis for the establishment of the PPTs was a joint agreement among the Ministries for Women, Health, Social Affairs, and the National Police in 2002. In addition to the excellent one visited in Surabaya, there are 26 similar centres in most major cities and it is intended to be developed nation-wide. The IPEC project has supported training for the police on child rights and the WFCL and, along with their partners, has been supportive of these Integrated Service Centres. This policy builds on the previously established facilities for special services for women and children within the National Police. Because this is a joint inter-ministerial policy and has the support of both national and local budgets, it is highly cost-effective and sustainable for IPEC to encourage and facilitate the creation of more PPTs by supporting the training for their staff. The PPTs are perhaps the best way to institutionalize the counselling and rehabilitation of the most severe cases of children withdrawn from trafficking, prostitution, and trafficking of and addiction to narcotics. The PPT's case monitoring has also become an important source of information in the WFCL monitoring system. **It is recommended that IPEC work with POLRI, MoH, MoSA, and all cities in the selected provinces to encourage them in setting up PPTs and supporting training for their staff as needed.**

In addition to the National Action Plan and Action Committee on the WFCL, there are closely related NPAs on trafficking and commercial sexual exploitation of children (CSEC). These NPAs and their committees are supported through the State Minister for Women Empowerment (MoWE) and receive international support through UNICEF for CSEC and several international donors and NGOs on trafficking. These NPAs also create action committees at the provincial and district levels. There is considerable overlap in the work of these committees and in their membership. For this reason, the umbrella of the Commission for the Protection of Children is extremely important at national, provincial and district levels for coordination and to link all of the action projects to the provincial and district planning and budgeting processes. (see above recommendation on page 4)

Capacity Building:

The project has provided support for organizing and training the Action Committees on Elimination of the WFCL in the targeted provinces and districts. Implementation of the training and organizing of the Action Committees in the targeted provinces was funded by the project but provided through the Ministry of Manpower and its offices at the provincial level. Where these local committees were designated as implementers for local activities they were also given the design, monitoring and evaluation (DME) training or were given intensive assistance to develop project proposals. In instances where they were given contracts to support awareness raising, coordination of activities among other partners and monitoring and data collection, they were funded directly by the project. Individual government agencies at the provincial and local level were also provided direct assistance under the project and in those cases they participated in DME training and received technical assistance in the preparation of proposals as well.

In addition to the governmental coordinating and action committees there are also several non-government organization networks. There are national and provincial level foundations for the protection of children (LPA) which act as umbrella organizations for NGOs working on child protection. There is also a specific network for NGOs working on child labour called JARAK.

JARAK has worked closely with the IPEC project and has been an important resource for the selection and training of NGO partners for the direct action projects. JARAK currently has 116 member NGOs and is self-sustaining through the dues paid by member organizations and fees earned for its role in training and capacity building on behalf of IPEC and other agencies. JARAK has been the main partner of IPEC in organizing and running the Design, Monitoring and Evaluation (DME) training not only for NGOs

but also for government partners. **It is recommended that IPEC continue and expand its support for JARAK to increase its capacity for training and monitoring trends in child labour; and to update and improve its website to become the repository for materials generated by the project.**

DME training was provided to all of the project partners in the early stages of the project with about 90 persons from 40 partner organizations trained. About 60 percent of trainees were from NGOs and the remainder from government partners. The training was for a week and covered project design (including logical framework and strategic planning methods), project monitoring (including the rather complex reporting system on children benefiting from the projects and the financial report system) and internal evaluation. The training was conducted with prospective partner organizations to help them develop and refine their proposals before contracting with them. Although it was primarily seen as a way to assure good quality project proposals, it has proven to be even more important for establishing effective systems for monitoring and reporting on project implementation. **It is recommended that DME training should be provided to all new project partners in the next phase and provide short refresher training workshops on monitoring and evaluation with all previous partners both to improve their skills and facilitate networking and learning from each other.**

Box 3 on monitoring methods:

IPEC requires that each organization supported for direct action projects keep track of individual beneficiaries for each type of service provided. For children living at home, in school, institutions and in fixed places of work this is not too difficult. However, for street children involved in drug trafficking and CSEC this is more difficult and may require staff or peer counsellors to individually monitor them. One important but difficult aspect is monitoring children that are no longer receiving services from the project. Most project partners do not do this and were not required to by the reporting system.

Action Committees at provincial and district levels are also charged with monitoring trends in the WFCL in their areas. This is difficult unless regular studies are being conducted. They can also monitor sentinel sites such as villages in the footwear industry, prostitution localization areas, fishing ports, etc. Perhaps the best monitoring for risk of child labour is through school attendance and school drop out. While it may be possible for children to work and go to school, it is much less likely that the work will be excessive and hazardous if they are in full time school attendance. This is another reason that non formal and informal education systems may not be as effective in withdrawing children from the WFCL. It would be good to develop a simple composite set of indicators for risk of child labour using existing data and survey results. (ie. Birth registration, school attendance, family status, etc.) This could be used by Action Committees to track trends and by project partners to target interventions.

In Aceh and in the later stages of the project with new partners the DME training was not done. Project officers worked directly with the new partners in Aceh to carefully prepare their project proposals. This was described as “very intensive technical assistance going through many revisions of their project proposals”. While this process did result in good proposals, it seems that the monitoring systems for the Aceh projects were not as well developed as in other areas which may be a result of the lack of DME training. Because of the emergency programming environment of Aceh following the tsunami, it is easy to understand why this was not done, but it does give a good lesson on the importance of DME training, especially for assuring a good monitoring system. **It is recommended that the ILO, through the EAST Project, provide DME training to its partners in Aceh.**

Box4 on the EAST Project:

ILO EAST is a very large four year project funded by the Government of Netherlands that aims to improve the employability and capacity for entrepreneurship among young women and men through high-quality education and technical training and also contribute to elimination of child labour by keeping children at risk in education programmes. The pre-vocational training supported by the IPEC project in Aceh is a good starting point for the EAST Project in that province. Geographic coverage of EAST is Papua, West Papua, East Nusa Tenggara, Maluku, South Sulawesi and NAD (Aceh) provinces.

Some partners are very sophisticated in their respective fields of work while others are weak. For example, in East Java the Hotline organization not only has a capacity to withdraw children from CSEC it also provides highly professional counselling and has a capacity for high quality research and documentation. In addition, they are linked to a well developed community development organization to work within the sending communities to prevent children from being trafficked into CSEC. Contrast this with Bandung Wangi that works with CSEC in East Jakarta. They have good rapport with the children concerned, but weak relations with both the local government and community organizations, and have limited capacity for monitoring, evaluation and research.

The teachers unions (PGRI) at the local level have been key partners for curriculum enrichment on child rights, child labour, life skills training and on the PAKEM method in many locations. Perhaps this can be expanded more widely during the next phase through the national teachers union. On the other hand non-formal education in community centres has been generally less effective, less supported by MoNE and not sustainable without substantial counterpart funding.

The credit union observed in our visit to North Sumatra is very good and has the support of a group with professional training and experience in credit union development. On the other hand, some micro-credit activities that were not formally organized were seen to be weak and not sustainable.

It is recommended that these and other leading partners be mobilized through long-term contracts to mentor, monitor and provide technical assistance to weaker project partners.

Capacity building is also supported by the development of good practice examples and by the development of modules for replication on a wider scale. Twelve good practice examples that were prepared by IPEC project consultants are attached as Annex 3. This type of documentation is an important contribution toward the implementation of the NAP in Indonesia. Although these cases are not evaluative and focus only on the positive aspects, they do provide easily read examples of what can be done. They also highlight the importance of good working relations between the local government agencies, NGOs and community organizations. **It is recommended that they be consolidated, edited and published as a single set of case studies and disseminated to project partners.**

Several methods that were developed by project partners have been documented as modules to be disseminated for wider use. Those provided to the evaluation team include the following:

- Module for Guidance and Counselling for Prevention of the Worst Forms of Child Labour and Child Trafficking for Junior High School (SMP) and Package B Students, prepared by the Indonesian Teachers Association of Sukabumi District with the support of the District Office of Education, issued in October 2007, printed by ILO Jakarta.
- Module to Raise Awareness of Students to Prevent Trafficking of Children: Hand Book for Facilitators, prepared by Hotline Surabaya under the Programme to Prevent Trafficking of Children from Banyuwangi, printed by ILO Jakarta in November 2007

- Module on Development of One Roof Schools, which documents the process used in Aceh for building community support and working with the Provincial Office of Education and teachers to launch the combined elementary and junior high school in two remote areas.
- Module on Life Skills and Pre-vocational Training for Junior High Schools in Aceh, which will eventually include modules on: Information Technology and Computers; Silk Screen Design and Printing; and Gardening and Landscaping.
- Module on Business Entrepreneurship, this module was also developed in Aceh and is based on the ILO material Know About Business.

The modules from Aceh are still under finalization before printing and were only available in Bahasa Indonesia. The continuation of project activities in Aceh under the ILO EAST Project (Education and Skills Training for Youth in Indonesia) is expected to review, validate and document the modules on pre-vocational education and entrepreneurship for wider use in the EAST Project areas and elsewhere.

Several other activities observed may produce materials that could have wider use as well. The “thematic training” in the projects in fishing villages in North Sumatra described below on page could be documented and reviewed for possible wider use. Also the experience with the credit unions in North Sumatra seems worthy of careful documentation. Although there are many modules available internationally on credit union development, documentation of this particular case could be helpful in the context of Indonesia. There is much value in micro-credit programmes for raising incomes of poor families. However, the methods for micro-credit are not so clearly known and observations in the field indicate that no specific model is being followed in small credit schemes. **It is recommended that modules be developed on the “Thematic Training Method” and on credit union development in North Sumatra.**

One area which needs careful attention is the training on entrepreneurship and small business management. Despite the preparation of the module noted above, most government, NGO and project staff members are not qualified to teach others about how to start and run a business. The EAST Project is expected to do entrepreneurial training starting from an international module and linked to the more formal vocational training for youth. This is one area in which local employers could provide valuable technical support and perhaps could partner with vocational training institutions. A good example of this was observed in relation to the silk screen printing being done at a Muslim junior high school in Aceh. Apprenticeships with private business already being facilitated by IPEC cooperation with APINDO are also an effective way to approach this. However, carefully drawn agreements and monitoring would be required to assure that production of products for commercial sale does not interfere with the education of students. **It is recommended that IPEC work with APINDO and the EAST Project team to develop an appropriate methodology.**

One aspect of capacity building often overlooked in programmes for children is the capacity of children themselves to become important agents for change. In the IPEC project many of the activities have included the selection and training of peer educators and peer counsellors. However, this does not seem to be systematically done, and many of the project partners monitoring systems do not monitor children who have grown up or moved on. **It is recommended that IPEC work with partners to develop peer educator and counselling networks and systems to track and network among the children assisted to develop this resource for the long-term elimination of child labour in Indonesia.**

Awareness Raising and Research:

The third step in implementation of the laws on the protection of children and the elimination of child labour exploitation is to change the cultural perceptions, attitudes and behaviour of the general population. The IPEC project has specifically focused on increasing understanding on and changing public perceptions regarding the worst forms of child labour.

The IPEC project has received strong support from the ILO media officer and their partners in raising awareness on the issue of child labour. All types of media have been used including four films on the WFCL (trafficking, CSEC, off-shore fishing, and the foot wear industry) which have been aired nation wide on SCTV. They have also made use of the ILO's one hour weekly interactive radio broadcast to highlight the issues of the WFCL. Press kits, posters and media campaigns have been carried out with government and NGO partners. Even live theatre performed by youth previously involved in the worst forms of child labour has been used to get out the message.

Observations in the field, newspaper articles, and interviews with leading media figures, clearly show there has been a substantial increase in public awareness on the issue of child labour and against the exploitation of children in the worst forms of child labour. However, we will only be able to quantify this change in awareness and attitudes when a follow up survey on attitudes toward child labour has been carried out. Unfortunately this was not included in the project plans, but it should be one of the first activities in the next phase. **It is recommended that IPEC in cooperation with the MoMT and MoNE commission a follow up study on attitudes toward child labour and education.**

Survey of Attitudes to Child Labour and Education

The survey Attitudes to Child Labour and Education in Indonesia, published by ILO was carried out by a leading international market research company in early 2005 using a stratified, cluster, random sample in 6 districts and cities and a purposively selected sample in districts where IPEC project activities will be carried out. Using this method they were able to generate statistically reliable results for those areas with a relatively small sample size. Some of the key findings of the survey were:

1. One fifth of junior high school aged children were not attending school;
2. The average annual cost of junior high school education is about Rp. One million (US\$ 110) or about two months pay for low-income families;
3. The high cost of education was the reason for 71% of school drop outs;
4. Over 90% of parents felt that education was extremely important for their children's future but only 70% were willing or able to pay for education;
5. Only half the respondents knew that compulsory education had been raised to 9 years;
6. 60% felt it was acceptable for children below age 15 to work more than four hours per day;
7. Over 90% agreed that children below age 18 should not be allowed to work in prostitution or drug trafficking; but
8. Only about 25% of respondents felt that children should be excluded from other types of hazardous work such as off-shore fishing, lifting heavy loads or exposure to hazardous chemicals.

There were some regional differences that may affect the persistence of child labour in some areas. For example, in Asahan, North Sumatera two thirds of parents would let their school age children work if it was not hazardous, and half said it was common practice for school age children to work. Surprisingly Bogor district near the capital city Jakarta had the highest school drop out rate of 30 %.

Rapid Assessments to support Direct Action Projects

The information base for the direct services projects was generated through six rapid assessments done by various universities or independent research institutions. Most of these studies were well done and used reliable methods for gathering and analysis of information. In most of the WFCL there was little existing statistical information or even reliable qualitative information. Therefore these studies were ground breaking contributions toward better understanding of both the scope and nature of the WFCL in Indonesia. Most relied on literature reviews, small purposive sample surveys combined with individual and focus group interviews.

Studies could be more systematic where children were working in defined locations such as the footwear industry, informal mining or even “localized” areas for prostitution. However, street children involved in drug trafficking and prostitution were more difficult to identify and track. For these groups often the only method available was to directly approach and engage them. Consequently, the numerical targets for withdrawal of children in these areas were difficult to determine in advance and some of the targets set for withdrawal of children were too ambitious. **In the next phase, it is recommended to engage independent university social science researchers, particularly anthropologists, to study the new types of WFCL being added, children in plantations and children in domestic service.**

One fundamental problem in identification and tracking of children is the lack of birth certificates. Although it is said that birth certificates are needed for entry into school and for other government services, they are seldom required and can be falsified. This problem arises from the fact that many children are born at home and the birth certificates can only be issued by government offices in larger towns or cities. As a result, 30% of all children and up to 80% of children in some remote areas do not have birth certificates. As expected, children in remote areas from poorer families are least likely to have been registered at birth and are also the most vulnerable to exploitation in trafficking or child labour. **It is recommended that IPEC initiate a coalition of international and national organizations (ILO, UNICEF, Save the Children, Commission and Foundation for the Protection of Children, etc.) to support the government in improving birth registration and making it a more decentralized and completely free service.**

Surveys on Children in the Labour Force

Unfortunately the evaluation team was not able to meet with the person in the BPS that has been taking the lead on getting child labour data into the regular census and household surveys conducted by the Bureau. We were told that he had been transferred to another office. The BPS has done a labour survey in 2005 that covered children from 10 to 17 years of age. It showed that 57% were working in agriculture, 20% in industry and 23% in services. BPS has also included a question on working children in the latest household survey. The National Socio-Economic Survey showed that 1.5 million children between 10 and 14 are in the labour force and another 1.6 million are out of school working at home. **It is recommended that IPEC work with BPS to assure that a special survey on child labour and secondary education participation will be done during the next phase starting in provinces where IPEC is working and in the seven provinces where the CCT is being introduced.**

To supplement these national government studies, IPEC commissioned a study by a market research company titled “Indonesia’s Youth Labour Market and the Impact of Early School Drop Out on Child Labour”. The study, conducted in early 2006, confirmed many of the findings of the earlier studies. High cost was the main reason for failing to complete secondary education. Although 33% of the sampled youth

had dropped out before finishing junior high school, 71% in the 15-17 age groups were unemployed. Clearly they drop out without much prospect of actually getting work. It was also found that those who did finish school had incomes an average of 56% higher than those who dropped out. **In the event that the BPS surveys are delayed or need to be supplemented, a re-survey similar to this should be carried out in the concerned provinces.**

Developing Risk Indicators for Child Labour

In addition to the survey on child labour, it would be useful to develop a composite set of risk indicators drawn from existing household survey and other government data. Among other indicators of risk these might include birth registration specifying gender and paternity, immunization to indicate health service access, school registration, school drop out before age 15, and some measure of family status and poverty. Much of this information is already collected by different government agencies but it would need to be brought together and analyzed as a composite set of indicators for risk of child labour exploitation. **It is recommended that risk indicators, similar to those developed by Hotline Surabaya, be developed for tracking the number of children at risk of child labour on a local, provincial and national level and also for use by project partners in better targeting the direct action projects.**

Direct Action Projects for Withdrawal from or Prevention of the WFCL

Preventing Trafficking and Commercial Sexual Exploitation of Children (CSEC)

In East Java the joint government, NGO and community based efforts to eliminate the trafficking and commercial sexual exploitation of children has been extremely effective. Their first step was to establish Commissions for the Protection of Children at the Provincial and District levels. Then the Action Committees for elimination of the WFCL along with Action Committees for Trafficking and CSEC were established as subcommittees under the Commission. The Provincial Commission has an annual budget of Rp. 256 million (US\$ 28,400). Other provincial plans and budgets for 2006 to 2008 have also been influenced to help eliminate WFCL through better access to education particularly in poor and remote areas and through alleviation of poverty. Through this coordinating structure they have also been able to carefully allocate international assistance as well with IPEC funding for mapping of the WFCL including CSEC, Save the Children funding anti trafficking activities and UNICEF supporting the Integrated Services Centre (PPT). The umbrella of support provided by the government structure and coordinated international funding and local budgets has enabled the work of both government offices and strong local NGOs that had been working on trafficking and child labour issues previously. **It is recommended that the work on trafficking and CSEC in East Java be carefully documented as an international good practice case.**

Hot Line Surabaya links its withdrawal and counselling activities with community and school based prevention in the sending area of Banyuwangi. Hotline started in the early 90s working on HIV/AIDS prevention among prostitutes in Surabaya. Its professional staff of psychological counsellors and an anthropologist were very effective in reaching out to and communicating with prostitutes eventually working with over 600. Despite their professional qualifications they found the problems too complex and conducted an epidemiology cluster survey of 200 prostitutes to better understand it. They found that despite their knowledge of its importance, they often did not use condoms. They had wrongly assumed that those in prostitution are a close knit community, but found they were not and were highly dependent on the broader

community. They needed continuing guidance and support from all members of the community including brothel managers to practice safe sex.

Therefore they feel that the peer counsellor approach should not be used with prostitutes. The use of former prostitutes was not effective in the face to face role. However, they did form two theatre groups composed of former prostitutes who were HIV positive. This was both a form of group therapy and an effective way to raise awareness on the dangers of prostitution. Another realization was that nearly all programmes focused in the city and few were working on prevention in the sending areas. They began to work with the communities in Banyuwangi which is a source of trafficking of girls for both Surabaya and Bali. Their community development work was done in cooperation with NU one of the largest Muslim religious movements in Indonesia.

Hotline's work on commercial sexual exploitation of children (CSEC) began through partnership with IPEC. Although the main technical assistance given was the standard DME training, the new focus on children and the emphasis on detailed monitoring and tracking of children helped improve their monitoring and information systems. Because of their previous work and connections with community development professionals, they could start rapidly to create a community and school based system for prevention of trafficking for CSEC in Banyuwangi. They used a set of indicators to assess risk of trafficking for CSEC including birth registration, single parent family, poverty, school drop out and siblings who work. They have documented some of their experience in prevention in a Module for Raising the Awareness of Students to Prevent Trafficking of Children: A Hand Book for Facilitators, Edited by Hotline Surabaya, and Published by ILO-IPEC. Some of the lessons learned are that 1) staff members who work in a community should live in the community, 2) care is needed in selection and guidance of volunteer workers, 3) record all children who receive any service, 4) it is important to build networks with local government offices and community leaders.

Yayasan Abdi Asih in Surabaya runs a drop in centre in the largest localization area for prostitution called Dolly and Jarak with 450 establishments. It provides counselling, a small temporary hostel and some vocational skills training to girls withdrawing from CSEC. It has developed a network of 60 people within the community including leaders from 5 adjoining neighbourhoods (RWs) who monitor the situation to identify and withdraw underage girls from working in the area. They ran a 3 day workshop for the members and developed a small "Handbook for the Local Network". They have obtained the cooperation of police and even establishment owners and managers who realize that CSEC is not only illegal but very bad for business if the police are called. As a result the 68 underage girls initially identified at the start of the project in 2004 was reduced to 8 in 2006 who have also now been withdrawn.

Genta drop in centre provides services to street children and girls involved in CSEC. It started in 1999 as a study group and began working with street children assisted by Save the Children US in 2001. They began to work with prostitutes on HIV/AIDS prevention with assistance from Family Health International (FHI) in 2002. In mid 2004 they participated in DME training at the request of the Surabaya Commission for Protection of Children and began working with IPEC in 2005. Their initial mapping on girls exploited in prostitution found 100 persons. They provided rehabilitation, recovery and empowerment counselling. They also provide short-term training in skills such as embroidery, silk screen printing and hair and makeup. Training is too short and there is no management or financial support for starting a business. They did receive support from the Vocational Training Centre (BLK) to provide longer term training to 8 children on embroidery. The best of these 8 students was in the meeting with us and she had still not found employment. Most children go back to their families and to school or get married. There is no formal system for training of peer counsellors. Some of the lessons learned by Genta were: 1) it is important to involve the police, health centre and other government offices and to network with other NGOs, 2) one and a half years is not long enough to effectively provide withdrawal and rehabilitation services, and 3) coordination by the Child Protection Commission and the Action Committee for prevention of WFCL are very helpful.

Bandung Wangi in East Jakarta runs a drop in centre for girls who work in CSEC either as street children or as drink sellers in small establishments. It provides counselling and life planning sessions to build up their self confidence and then some short-term skills training in sewing or hair and beauty treatment. Two girls at the meeting stated that they had taken the training but it did not give them the capacity to find work. Most girls return to families in their villages. Their initial assessment found that 60% of the girls came from Indramayu and only 10% from nearby areas in East Jakarta. They do not have the capacity to monitor them after they return to their villages outside Jakarta, and most of the girls do not want their families and community members to know what they have been doing.

They began working with IPEC after the DME training. Their assessment was through direct contact which identified over 100 girls in their area of operation. They ended up working with about half of them and provided training to 45. Two have stayed on as informal cadre but have not received any formal training or status as peer counsellors.

Bandung Wangi does not seem to have a strong connection to community organizations or local government. For example, there was no mention of an action committee or any contact with village leaders. They also seemed to have little connection to the NGOs or community organizations in the main sending areas of Indramayu and Sukabumi which have been a focus of anti trafficking and CSEC work by many NGOs and international organizations. They also lack systematic monitoring and evaluation or research capacities. **If IPEC continues to work with Bandung Wangi, it is recommended that they are mentored by Hot Line Surabaya and provided stronger guidance from the project staff. It is also recommended that Action Committees be established and supported in the Jakarta districts.**

Prevention of Trafficking in Sukabumi is done through the combined efforts of local authorities, the teachers union and NGOs for women and family planning. Many young people, especially girls, migrate out of the area to work in garment factories, domestic work, or CSEC. Several years ago IPEC approached different concerned groups in the area to find ways to prevent trafficking. This area was chosen in part because the main sending area of Indramayu has several other organizations working there, and Sukabumi is also a known area for trafficking of young girls.

The teachers union PGRI developed a set of modules on child labour and trafficking for use in Junior High Schools and trained 30 teachers in 8 schools to use it. It starts with training on child rights in the first year, information on child labour in the second year and the risks of trafficking and how to prevent it in the third year course. These modules are designed to be integrated with the regular curriculum and would not require special arrangements or additional sessions outside of regular school hours. This seems to be a very low cost yet effective way to bring the issue of child labour and prevention of trafficking into the formal school system. The modules have been printed for wider distribution by ILO Jakarta. **It is recommended that MoNE and PGRI be given long term contracts to field test and adapt these modules in a much wider area so that they can be mainstreamed on a nation-wide scale in all Junior High Schools.**

The women's group PPSW does advocacy on child labour prevention, but also proactively orients young migrants on the risks of child labour and trafficking. PPSW also organizes savings and loan groups and provides training in skills and small business management for low income families. IPEC supports their work on advocacy for child labour prevention and anti-trafficking but does not provide capital for the savings and loan activities. With IPEC support PPSW also led a group of other organizations to successfully advocate with the local government to pass the Sukabumi District Anti Trafficking Regulation.

For young people determined to leave Sukabumi, they provide orientation on their rights as workers, problems to expect, contracting procedures and obligations and guidance on how to avoid being trafficked. This orientation provided for young migrants is refreshingly proactive. Many groups tend to equate

migration with trafficking and therefore seek to discourage any form of migration. The reality is that ambitious young people in poor, remote areas anywhere in the world will migrate to find better work opportunities. This orientation training for young migrant workers should be developed as a module to be provided to NGOs and the Offices of Manpower in other areas with a large out migration of young people. **It is recommended that a consultant should be contracted to develop the module for orientation of prospective migrant youth workers. It could then be field tested with NGOs and Manpower Offices under contracts with MoMT and JARAK.**

The family planning group PKBI worked with formal schools but also with community learning centres in isolated villages to provide information and social mobilization to prevent trafficking using local culture and art forms. They collaborated with KBPP to obtain and allocate a special Governors (BOSD) fund to provide books, bags and uniforms to encourage drop out children to return to school. They have also trained peer educators to help conduct their anti trafficking awareness raising among young people.

The family planning group KBPP provided skills training to young people with courses on sewing, motor bike repair, and computers. As with other organizations, this is very short-term training and does not usually develop sufficient skill to actually find a job. They also had a community learning centre and encourage school drop outs to do the Packet B non-formal classes. However, they stated that this is a three year course and with IPEC support only for the first year they are likely to drop out. Most of their activities ended when the IPEC support stopped. However, the local government is supportive and provides funds for anti trafficking activities.

The representative of KBPP noted that trafficking is often based on falsified birth certificates, health certificates and passports. Because the central government authorities were unable or unwilling to deal with it, they felt that local authorities would be better able to manage this process since they know the background of potential migrants. **It is recommended that IPEC work with MoMT and MoH to consider decentralizing functions such as checking birth certificates and issuing health certificates for migrant workers to the district level. Perhaps it could be combined with the pre-migration orientation recommended above.**

Conclusion: The great contrast between the work on prevention of trafficking and CSEC in East Java and in East Jakarta highlights the importance of local government coordination and community involvement both in withdrawal of children from CSEC and prevention of trafficking. Also in Sukabumi the prevention of trafficking has involved good local government coordination and support from communities and schools. The lesson to be drawn from this is that NGO action alone for either prevention of trafficking or withdrawal from CSEC is neither effective nor sustainable. Therefore, it is recommended that IPEC and MoMT increase efforts to organize and activate the Action Committees for elimination of the WFCL in the Jakarta districts, and encourage NGO partners to work with the Action Committees and community organizations in their areas.

Withdrawal of Children and Hazard Reduction in the Foot Wear Industry

IPEC is working with groups in Ciomas in Bogor District and also with groups in Tasik Malaya to remove children from hazardous work in the foot wear industry. Bogor has already created a District Action Committee to guide these activities but there is not yet a committee in Tasik Malaya. Due to time constraints, the evaluation team was not able to visit the site in Tasik Malaya but did meet with all the project partners in Ciomas.

The meeting was convened in the Parakan village office and opened by the village chief who noted that out of the 31 children working at the start of the project only 2 are still working and they are only doing

packaging. District offices for planning, health, education, manpower and religion were all represented. The teachers union, business women's association, a trade union and an NGO were also represented.

There are 45 small household workshops making footwear in the village. One of the women owners noted that they used to employ children in the industry, but she now has no workers below age 18. She herself started working in her family's factory at age 13 while continuing her education. When she finished senior high school she began working full time and now has taken over the business. A second woman owner noted that she used to employ her sons part time in the factory but not her daughters. She now keeps both her sons and daughters of school age in school. She also noted that technology improvements such as a cutting press, steel tables and chairs provided by IPEC, and brushes for applying glue have helped reduce work place hazards, and improved quality and productivity. Regarding production costs they noted that adult workers could work more efficiently for longer hours and therefore earned substantially more than the children used to even though they pay them on the same piece rate. A third owner confirmed that there are no children working in the factories except in packing finished products.

The health department representative stated that workers had been troubled by skin and respiratory problems caused by the strong glues used in making footwear. In response to a question, they noted that there seemed to be no problem with glue sniffing among children although it is the same type of glue that addicts street children in many parts of the world. The health department has worked with owners to reduce hazards by improving ventilation, using brushes to apply glue, and IPEC has provided steel tables and benches so that workers do not have to squat on the floor. Certificates were issued to factories that introduced these measures. The health department representative mentioned that the reporting required under the project was very difficult in part because initially it had been required in the English language.

Both the public and religious schools in the area noticed substantial declines in drop out rates in junior and senior high schools. This was in part due to an earlier IPEC supported effort to reach out to those at risk of dropping out with remedial education as well as supplementary feeding and support for books and bags. The ending of child employment in the footwear industry also removed a major incentive for children to drop out of school. This illustrates the importance of a multi-pronged approach to these complex problems.

Some initial problems were noted with coordination among the partners because the planning and funding was done directly with individual offices or organizations. It was suggested that planning should be done with the local authorities to assure coordination even if funding flows directly to individual NGO contractors. This was resolved after the District Commission for Protection of Children convened a forum to improve coordination in 2005. There was also a comment that the reporting system was difficult and they had sought the support of university students to complete it.

It is recommended that, because of the complex and detailed reporting required by both USDOL and IPEC, some systematic support for the reporting function be provided by lead partners and the project staff, particularly the preparation of summary reports in English.

Conclusion: The employment of children in the cottage foot wear industry has been nearly eliminated and, through hazard reduction, it has in effect ended this form of the WFCL in the village visited. This has been achieved by a well coordinated multi-pronged, community-based approach involving of all relevant government offices in the district, the teachers union, an NGO, community leaders and business owners.

Services for Children in or at risk of Illegal Drug Trafficking

The evaluation team met with six NGO groups working with children involved in drug trafficking in East Jakarta. Most of these groups work in a small area such as a village or sub-district but others such as PKBI

primarily works with children in the detention centre and YKAI and YCAB are both working on prevention through formal schools. SEKAM runs three homes for street children. A women's group (PPSW) is working with families as well as children through micro credit and skills training to improve their incomes.

Children in the detention centre are often involved in drug trafficking and about half are addicted to illegal drugs. PKBI has been working with children in the detention centre since 2001. They have used peer counsellors who often still take months to reach some of the children. Initially counselling focuses on health and HIV/AIDS prevention and music therapy but gradually moves to life skills and some vocational skills training, particularly the use of computers. PKBI has also been working with the families of children in the detention centre.

YPI also provides counselling through peer educators to children who become involved in trafficking of drugs. They found that most of the children were initially unaware of the risks. They have been receiving support from the Education Office and the Narcotics Board for providing counselling for social workers and paramedics. They use different approaches for counselling and awareness raising depending on the age of the children, using dolls for children below ten and films for older children.

SEKAM approaches children living on the street and entices them to join in ball games as a way to establish a relationship. They invite them to the centres where they provide opportunities to play music, painting and work with computers. They have developed three centres or shelters for street children in East Jakarta. They also teach English classes and some handicrafts. Once they received funds from the Education Office to identify street children provide some skills training and then follow up with non-formal education package programmes. Their shelters are still operating and they have been able to get enough other sources of support to keep their programme going.

YCAB focuses on prevention through special events in junior and senior high schools. They reached 3,700 students through a mass campaign in 5 schools and attracted 350 students to join in workshops. The workshops begin with questionnaires to assess the risks and potential for students on an individual basis. They are then given information on the risks of drug use and drug addiction. They are also taken through a process of self analysis and life skills training. Of the 350 who participated in the workshops, 50 were selected for intensive training as peer educators. They have also formed clubs for drug abuse prevention which have helped keep students interested in the programme. They have piloted this method for prevention of drug trafficking in 5 schools which had not had programmes on this. Schools are now helping fund these programmes.

YKAI had initially worked with communities and then school students using a peer educator approach. They also developed a module on how to tackle narcotics in schools. However, they found that anyone involved in narcotics was expelled from school so to meet their goal of withdrawing children from drugs they had to work with children in the detention centres.

In Klender PPSW works with the children and with their families, particularly in developing micro-credit groups. They also provide training in the use of computers, English for children and other skills with the Vocational Training Institute (LKP). Parents are often the ones who bring children to the “base camp” to help protect them from involvement in the drug business.

In response to questions about gender balance in these programmes they noted that 80% of the children in detention centres and 75% of street children are boys. This is a counter balance to the CSEC projects where nearly 100% of the affected children are girls. There are also differences in the programmes for girls as well as separate sleeping facilities in hostels. The counselling methods are quite different for girls and the types of skills training selected by girls are also different. It was noted that it is also necessary to have grouping by age in counselling groups for example.

Although several of these NGOs have received support from the National Narcotics Control Board (NBB) or worked with other government agencies there did not seem to be a strong connection with village and district levels of government. For example, there was never a mention of Action Committees or other systems for government and NGO coordination. Surprisingly there was also little discussion of working with police. Although there was a reported incident in which the police, tipped about an NGO meeting with children involved with drugs, took the opportunity to arrest a number of them. In the project document the role of police and conflicts in laws pertaining to the role of children in drug trafficking was a concern which seems to be a continuing problem. Without these links to community organizations or coordinating structures in government, there is not a mechanism for expansion, replication or sustainability of these efforts on a large scale.

Peer educators and counsellors in several of these programmes are given training and are paid for their work. They also arrange bimonthly meetings of the peer educators and counsellors to exchange experiences and upgrade their skills. It is not clear how effective this has been, but it does provide a base on which to develop networks of peer educators and counsellors. **It is recommended that a formal system be set up for peer educator and counsellor training and mentoring, and that networking among them be facilitated by, for example, joint inter-organization, inter-city workshops, newsletters, etc.**

Conclusion: More effort is needed to develop and activate the Action Committees for prevention of the WFCL within Jakarta districts to better support and coordinate local government action with these NGO initiatives. It is particularly important to improve relations with the police and community organizations. It would also be good to identify NGO and government partners in other large cities in the target provinces to start work on children involved in drug trafficking in those cities. This remains the most intractable form of the WFCL which is recognized in the modest NAP/TBP goals.

Services for Children in or at risk of Off-Shore Fishing

The evaluation team had the opportunity to visit two villages in Tanjung Balai and Asahan Districts on the East coast of North Sumatra where a number of NGOs were providing services to children who previously worked in off-shore fishing or were at risk of it. During the long drive we had the opportunity to review the history of child labour in the province with the project officer. He noted that it began in the early 90s on the issue of children on off-shore fishing platforms. NGOs were very active on this and developed several models for dealing with it. The government was however less active and it took intensive advocacy to finally get the 2004 Provincial Regulation No. 5 on the Prevention and Elimination of the WFCL.

The local governments have now become strong partners through the process of creating action plans and setting up the Provincial Action Committee and 5 District Action Committees through provincial and district decrees. He noted that in addition to off-shore fishing there are child labour issues in the large plantation sector in the province and trafficking issues which could be focused on in the next phase. In 2007 the provincial budget allocated Rp. 500 million (US\$ 55,500) for programmes to eliminate trafficking of women and children.

In Tanjung Balai the IPEC project took the opportunity to work with strong NGOs such as the Fishermen's Union (SNSU) and Community Economic Development Foundation (KAKAR) that organizes credit unions, and the recently created Children of Fishermen Group (KAIL) and the Forum for Community Improvement (FORMAT). We met with representatives of these groups in their Children's Creative Centre and Library.

The SNSU has been involved in this from earlier work on the children on fishing platforms. Under the contract with IPEC they extended their concern to study children's involvement in all aspects of the industry

both on boats but also on shore in warehouses and fish processing. They regularly monitor the work of children in the industry and cooperated with the other NGOs in providing “thematic training” to 900 children.

Thematic training is a method to engage children in self reflection about their lives starting with themselves and then extending it to their families, their community, their schools, their livelihood, and eventually to their environment and nation. It seems to be an effective method for engaging children at risk and introducing life skills education. No formal module has been prepared on this but the IPEC project officer seems to know a great deal about it and could probably find the right person to prepare a module. **It is recommended that IPEC hire a consultant to prepare a module on thematic training.**

KAIL is a consortium of community groups such as: fishermen, wives of fishermen, environmentalists, youth and others. Some of the group from KAIL had earlier worked with local elementary schools to develop more participatory education to keep children from dropping out of school. KAIL sought IPEC assistance to establish Children’s Creative Centres (CCC) to provide a place for children to play and study after school hours as another means to encourage children to stay in school. They engage children in sports and dance to attract them but also do literacy training and teach English as well as help them with homework. In the case of Tanjung Balai, the CCC seems to have enough support from the community and NGOs to be sustained after the project is finished.

FORMAT focused on establishing community libraries to complement the CCC and was able to get others to support this. The local water company provided land and a building in one of the neighbouring communities for a library and many different individuals and groups have provided books. This seems to be an activity that has generated sufficient support from the communities so that it can be sustained.

KAKAR has extensive experience in developing credit unions. They started credit unions in the surrounding area in 1997. They were engaged by IPEC to create and build credit unions in this and neighbouring communities. The initial target was one thousand members and the target for the second contract was to expand it to 2000. At the time we visited they had 2800 members. They described a deliberate process of screening and training potential new members. All of the capital is provided by members and only the organizing and training for the initial groups was covered by the project. The credit unions provide three types of loans (productive, personal and social) with interest of 3% per month on the declining balance. This may seem high, but in the context of Indonesia it is reasonable and about half what money lenders charge. Also profits are redistributed to the membership at the end of the year. This seems to be a well developed credit union that will continue to serve its members and grow without additional assistance. **It is recommended that this be documented as a good practice, and the KAKAR group could be used as a mentor to others who are setting up saving and lending groups.**

Perhaps because it was a weekend we did not meet with government officials other than the village chief who dropped in on our meeting. He was newly elected and was interested to learn more about the activities of these groups. However, we note in the project records that the Tanjung Balai Municipal Secretariat and Teachers Union were given contracts to support improvements in education, skills training and community actions. This included remedial classes for at risk children, training of teachers on the PAKEM method, and skills training in cell phone repair, audio-visual equipment repair, silk screen printing, and paper flower making. It also included establishing a computerized data-base in the Office of Manpower. We also noted in the mid-term evaluation that the Action Committee for Tanjung Balai District has been active in planning and coordination. However, we did not hear of these activities from the NGO groups who seemed to think the local government was not active or supportive.

We did meet with a member of the North Sumatra Provincial Action Committee during the workshop in Aceh. He was very helpful in explaining the committee's usefulness and the process of forming the

committee for those in Aceh where the committee had not yet been formed. He also discussed with us the areas of concern on child labour in North Sumatra, particularly trafficking and children working on plantations which will be addressed in the next phase.

In Asahan District there had also been contracts with the District Government and the Office of Religion to improve education through remedial education for children at risk and also for PAKEM training of teachers. They also did training of 300 children on traditional cloth making, fish net making and repair, and local handicrafts. However, the evaluation team did not hear of these activities during the visit but were told only of the NGO activities at the Children's Creative Centre.

The house for the Children's Creative Centre in Bagan Asahan has been rented by the IPEC contracted NGO. They have used the thematic education process with 95 children involved in or at risk of off-shore fishing. They have had some music competitions to attract children and have done some training on life-skills and environmental issues. They did form a small savings group though not apparently well organized.

We discussed the problems of school drop outs and they noted that there was an attempt to create an open junior high school in their village. However, the community had decided to move it toward a formal school by requiring uniforms. Some parents were unwilling or unable to pay for uniforms so their children were withdrawn.

Several of the older boys who act as peer mentors to the younger group had set up a small business to sell oil to fishermen but it went bankrupt when they extended credit and were not repaid. They are currently doing flower arrangements as a business and are pricing their arrangements at 30% less than their competitors. Apparently this does not cover the overhead costs so they will have to seek other accommodations now that the rent for the centre is no longer paid by IPEC.

The contrast between the two sites visited is striking. It provides a good example of the importance of proper organization of the savings and lending groups as well as the risks of setting up small businesses without proper training and experienced leadership. It also shows that short-term contracts with weak partners are not likely to lead to sustainable results.

Conclusion: The IPEC project support in North Sumatra has succeeded in substantially reducing the work of children on fishing vessels and removed children from work on fishing platforms. In part this is due to the effectiveness of previous efforts to reduce school drop outs but also because of the monitoring by the Fishermen's Union and the activities of the NGOs. The combined effect has been very positive despite the weaknesses in some activities as indicated above. The support of the community in Tanjung Balai indicates that the project activities will be sustained, but the NGO supported CCC in Bagan Asahan is likely to be discontinued without project support. Although the Provincial Action Committee is formed and active, apparently some district level action committees are not yet working well. This could explain the weak coordination between the NGOs and the local governments. This could be facilitated by the IPEC project ensuring that contracts for direct action projects with NGOs are previewed by the action committees in the districts concerned and that NGOs are routinely invited to participate in the District Action Committees.

Services for Children in or at risk from the Informal Mining Industry

Due to time constraints the evaluation team did not have the opportunity to visit the project sites in East Kalimantan which would have required a minimum of 4 days. Therefore these observations are based on the written material provided and brief discussions with the NGO and government representative from East Kalimantan during the final workshop in Jakarta. The mid-term evaluation noted that the informal gold panning industry has been greatly reduced and that few children are now involved in it.

IPEC supported a rapid assessment on child labour in 2002 which stimulated the District of Kutai Kartanegara to launch a Child Labour Free Zone in November 2002. It subsequently issued a District Regulation that imposes penalties on those who drop out of school before age 15. They also set a target for all children to have 12 years education by 2012. To implement this they set up a Child Labour Free Zone Committee. It is in this context the IPEC project has provided support.

The IPEC direct services projects in East Kalimantan focused on improving education and thereby reducing dropouts in the three villages where informal mining was important at the time. In two villages in Paser District IPEC worked with the District Education Office, the Education Council, the Health Centre, NGO Realitas and local journalists. The main activities were the PAKEM training of teachers, remedial education for children at risk of dropping out, health monitoring and education, and improving school libraries. In addition the Family Planning Association PKBI developed Children Youth and Community Resource Centres where they trained peer educators and provided several types of vocational training. Apparently these efforts were quite effective so that the drop out rate declined sharply and the pass rate on national examinations increased by 32% in the schools involved in the project.

In the other remote village in West Kutai there was no junior high school so the IPEC assistance was initially to help create an Open Junior High School in the village. However, it only met on weekends due to the remote location and using teachers from other schools. This was not adequate for education and also did not withdraw children from their work in the mines. Finally it was decided to create a “one roof” school by adding rooms and teachers to the existing elementary school. This was done with a central government grant through the Provincial Education Office and an agreement that District Government would provide the running costs from its budget. This has apparently been successful and the one roof school now provides junior high education not only for this village but also attracts children from neighbouring villages.

Conclusion: This is the first province in Indonesia to attempt to reach 12 years of compulsory education. Apparently they have large Provincial and District Budgets based on income from the formal mining sector and they feel that they can afford higher levels of support for education than other provinces. The provincial government has allocated One Billion Rupiah (US\$ 111,000) in 2008 to operate 32 one roof schools. Although IPEC is not expected to have direct services activities in the province in the next phase, it would be good to monitor how these bold initiatives are in fact impacting the child labour situation. Preliminary indications are that child labour has already declined from 11,623 in 2002 to 3,102 in 2005.

Services for Children at Risk of the WFCL in Aceh and Nias

Following the tsunami it was felt that the disruption of lives, communities and educational services in Aceh and Nias would put many children at risk for exploitation through trafficking or other worst forms of child labour. Emergency programming by the IPEC staff led to a number of activities some of which are still continuing. Initially these services included temporary learning centres in the camps for the displaced and even some limited feeding activities. Because of the urgency of the situation the normal processes of identifying potential local partners, conducting the DME training and then helping local partners prepare proposals was not followed. Also the establishment of the Provincial Action Committee was not given high priority.

The evaluation team had only one day to review activities in Aceh and met with the Provincial Office of Education, the Provincial Manpower Office, Save the Children US, and the new Officer in ILO for the EAST Project. We also had the opportunity to visit one of the Muslim Jr. High Schools where life skills and vocational training was being provided. The Director for Jr. High Schools met with us along with the staff

assigned to work with IPEC. They told us that despite the destruction of the tsunami, which included destroyed schools and the deaths of many teachers, they had managed to restore facilities and even graduate an adequate number of students from the junior high schools.

With IPEC support they are providing life skills and pre-vocational training in 2 government schools (SMP) and 3 Muslim boarding schools (MTS). They are also working with an NGO PKPA in setting up two “one roof” schools in remote communities. In this context they mentioned the problems of coordination with the NGO and noted that they had not been paid to monitor the NGO activities. They noted that others are supporting the activities in some of the schools: the Chinese government is helping one with computers, one has Telkom support for computers and multi-media equipment, and some have support from local private businesses. They are quite proud of the modules for life skills and pre-vocational education that are currently being prepared for publication by ILO in Jakarta. The pre-vocational education currently offers three types of training: computers, gardening and silk screen printing.

They noted that there is a lot of assistance from abroad and they also a large provincial budget for education. In fact the problem is how to use it effectively. In addition, there will be a merger of the elementary and junior high school divisions within the office. They asked if ILO could support staff training and technical assistance to increase the capacity of the office. It was also suggested that it would be good if the pre-vocational training could be supplemented by small start up funding so students could start their own businesses.

The Director of the Provincial Manpower Office seemed unaware of many things about the project but his staff informed us of the current status. In 2006 IPEC assisted training for older students (15 to 17) on sewing, computers and gardening which was done by the Vocational Training Centre that is under the Manpower Office. These courses were for 200 hours each and had about 15 or 20 students in each class. They said that after the training they lost track of these students and that they did not have a monitoring system set up to track them.

The Provincial Action Committee to eliminate the WFCL had still not been established, but it was said that it was in draft awaiting the governor's review. It is expected that the Director of the Manpower Office would chair the committee and his office will act as the secretariat for the committee. The Director noted that until the committee is established they are powerless to do much about the various types of child labour such as in sand dredging that is going on. It was noted that the committee is much needed to help coordinate among the government offices but even more importantly with the NGOs. They also noted that the Aceh provincial budget is very large due to the natural gas industry in the region. Therefore they anticipate that once the committee is set up it will have adequate funding for activities. No city or district action committees had been formed as yet although workshop participants noted their intention to make the capital a “city for children”.

Save the Children US has been doing life skills and pre-vocational training in 11 schools mostly in rural areas. They have been using the same modules for the training on computers and gardening but they have also developed a module on fish cultivation which is more suitable for rural areas. Their implementation has been a bit slower because the schools are in scattered areas and also they directly manage the funds rather than give them to the schools. Although they had not received the DME training they had regular meetings with the IPEC project officer especially during the early stages of the project. All of the schools receiving the training were evaluated in October 2007 and they think the Education Office has decided to expand the programme with provincial budget funds to 30 additional schools.

Another Save the Children project called ENABLE/Aceh is setting up Community Learning Centres (PKBM) and using the non-formal education Packet A and B in rural areas. They are trying to reach 10,000 children and have funding to build, equip and stock the Community Learning Centres. Unfortunately,

the project officer for ENABLE/Aceh (Enabling Aceh to Combat Exploitation through Education) was unavailable during our short visit. This is another USDOL funded project that we were asked to contact during the evaluation. We also missed the opportunity to meet with the larger ENABLE project (Enabling Communities to Combat Child Trafficking) in Jakarta because their senior staff were either sick or on field missions during our time in Jakarta. This is a US\$ 6 million project that works in five provinces and targets 19,432 children for withdrawal or prevention from trafficking. There was apparently not much connection between the IPEC project and either of the ENABLE projects. They do not work in the same areas and therefore there is little risk of double counting of children affected under these projects.

The ILO Project Officer for the EAST Project noted that the pre-vocational training activities supported by IPEC would be brought under the EAST Project. He noted some concerns about how it was being done and said that it would be carefully reviewed. He assured us that the IPEC work was an integral part of the EAST project strategy and saw it as basic first step that would be linked to more advanced vocational training which would then be completed by adding entrepreneurial training.

We discussed some of the concerns we had after observing the pre-vocational training in the Muslim boarding school. It is important to remember that this is only a very basic level of training intended to prevent or retrieve school drop outs. It is not full vocational training. There is also concern that private businesses are contracting to obtain and sell silk screen products in the school observed. Although this is potentially very good it could also lead to exploitation of students if it is not monitored and organized carefully. This would particularly be a concern if the vocational training was made compulsory.

The involvement of businesses in the pre-vocational training does provide an opportunity to make this type of training available on a larger scale supported by the private sector. However it needs to be done carefully with organizations such as APINDO and the local Education Office and Action Committees to provide supervision and monitoring. **It is recommended that IPEC work with APINDO and MoNE to mobilize, monitor and mentor private businesses to support pre-vocational training in secondary schools, particularly computer skills training.**

We discussed the formation of the Action Committee for elimination of the WFCL. They have established a coordination committee for the EAST Project which the Provincial Planning Board (BAPPEDA) chairs and other major donors such as UNICEF, IOM and Save the Children are members. This could become the basis for a Provincial Commission for the Protection of Children like the one in East Java. In view of the relative weakness of the Office of Manpower that is expected to chair the Action Committee, it would be good to have the Action Committee come under a stronger Commission or other coordinating body.

The evaluation team had the opportunity to discuss IPEC activity in Nias with a representative of the NGO Pusaka and FKPI who participated in the workshop in Aceh. They had been working with community learning centres PKBM to bring in non-formal education through Packet A, B and C. Although he said it is a good project, he thought that there should be a clearer focus on the particular situation of Nias. He noted that there are several child labour problems in Nias including sand mining for construction, plantations, and even CSEC. He suggested that any future IPEC work in Nias should be channelled through North Sumatra as it is actually part of that province rather than Aceh. It has been put together with Aceh only because they had both been badly hit by the tsunami.

Conclusion: The project support in Aceh and Nias provides a valuable lesson. Even in an emergency programming process, it is important to take the time to train project partners on project design, monitoring and evaluation. This is needed not only to convey the planning, monitoring and evaluation concepts, but also as a means to understand the local government and community context, and build teamwork among local partners. Despite intensive technical support during the project planning, the projects in Aceh are struggling with issues of inter agency cooperation and monitoring project results

and participation.

Comparative Cost-Effectiveness of Different Types of Direct Services:

Many different types of interventions and services on behalf of children in the WFCL have been provided or assisted through the IPEC project. They can generally be grouped as primarily preventive, primarily to enable withdrawal and some are both for prevention and withdrawal. It is also helpful to consider how they are focused, how effective, the relative cost to the project and their sustainability after the project is no longer supporting them. Using these variables we have attempted to estimate their relative cost-effectiveness in reducing and eventually eliminating the WFCL.

The table below is based on the materials provided and field observations of the team. The cost refers only to the direct cost to the project and does not include counterpart funds from national or local government budgets. Therefore facilitating one roof or open schools and integrated services centres are low cost while funding community centres more costly. How well an intervention can be sustained is determined by the availability of national or local government funds or support from communities to continue the work after project funds are no longer available.

Comparative Cost-Effectiveness of Project Supported Direct Services

Type of Intervention, Activity or Services	Focus	Effect	Cost	Sustainable
Primarily Prevention				
Facilitate Open Jr. High School	Schools	Low	Low	Low
Facilitate One Roof Primary and Jr. High	Schools	High	Low	High
Improve Teaching Methods (PAKEM)	Teachers	High	Medium	High
Life Skills Training	Students	High	Medium	Medium
Pre-Vocational Training	Students	Medium	High	Low
Info on Child Labour and Risk of WFCL	Students	High	Low	High
Community Learning Centres	Community	Medium	High	Low
Children's Creative Centres	Children	Medium	High	Low
Micro-Credit and Credit Unions	Community	Medium	Medium	Medium
Vocational and Entrepreneurial Training	Community	Low	Medium	Low
Both for Prevention and Withdrawal				
Remedial Education	At Risk	High	Medium	Low
Grants for school books, uniforms, and bags	At Risk	High	Medium	High
Non-Formal Education Packet B	At Risk	Low	High	Medium

Life-Skills Thematic Training in Centres	At Risk	High	Medium	Medium
Vocational Training in Community Centres	At Risk	Low	High	Low
Primarily for Withdrawal from WFCL				
Counselling by professionals	Individual	High	High	Medium
Counselling by peers	Individual	Medium	Low	Medium
Drop in Centres	At Risk	High	High	Low
Hostel and Treatment Centre	Individual	High	High	Low
Facilitate Police Integrated Services Centres	Individual	High	Medium	High

We welcome project staff, policy makers and project partners to reflect on this, to correct our misperceptions or to disagree with the ranking in terms of effectiveness, cost or sustainability, but hopefully it will provide a useful and thought provoking framework for comparative analysis of these interventions.

Based on the above comparisons, it appears that the most cost-effective interventions for prevention are:

1. providing information to students on child rights, child labour and the risks of trafficking,
2. life-skills training in schools,
3. improving teaching using the PAKEM method, and
4. facilitating the creation of one roof elementary and junior high schools.

For withdrawal of children from the WFCL it seems that the most cost-effective methods are:

1. Peer educators and counsellors (with professionals to train and supervise them),
2. Facilitating creation of Integrated Services Centres (legal, health and counselling), and
3. Drop in Centres linked to community organizations to sustain them.

For preventing at risk children entering the WFCL and reintegrating children withdrawn from the WFCL into schools it seems that the most cost-effective methods are:

1. Life skills and Thematic Training
2. Remedial education
3. Grants for books, bags and school uniforms (now funded by BOS)

Of course this does not mean that the other types of interventions are not needed, but there are questions regarding their focus, effectiveness, cost and sustainability.

- In some cases, professional counselling is absolutely necessary, but it would be most sustainable if provided through the Integrated Services Centres.
- Community learning centres serve many functions and may be desirable, but as a means to prevent the WFCL they are not well focused, cost-effective or sustainable. Schools are the learning centres where the GOI and IPEC should concentrate their efforts.
- Pre-vocational training enriches the school curriculum and provides an activity for withdrawn children, but it is expensive and does not give adequate skills to find a job unless it is integrated with an existing business or followed by extensive vocational and entrepreneurial training. One exception might be basic training on computers which is popular among children and a fundamental skill for modern life.
- Documentation, observations in the field and comments in the workshops all indicate that the informal open school concept and non-formal education are not working well and are not accepted as a substitute for formal education.

- Micro-credit, especially if it is organized systematically as in a credit union, is extremely effective for poverty reduction, but it does not directly address the WFCL.

Increasing the Effectiveness and Sustainability of Capacity Building

Observations in the field and the review of documentation indicate that the design, monitoring and evaluation (DME) training has been very effective. Where it has not been done, even if the project design has been adequate as a result of intensive assistance by project staff, monitoring has not been as effective. Although separate DME training for government and NGOs might be more targeted and easier, having them take the training together is helpful in team building and bridging the gaps in understanding and attitudes between them.

There seems to be a feeling among some NGOs that they are not sufficiently respected by government partners and a similar feeling among some government partners about NGOs. This could be eased if NGOs are routinely invited to Action Committee meetings and the projects of NGOs are previewed and monitored by the local Action Committees. On their side, the NGOs should always acknowledge and inform local government offices and community leaders when working in their areas. Some excellent examples of how effective this can be are the projects related to the foot wear industry near Bogor and the work in Surabaya and Sukabumi on prevention of trafficking and CSEC.

Several of the smaller partners indicated that they had difficulty maintaining monitoring and reporting systems required by the project. Perhaps this can be overcome by having stronger partners or a network organization provide guidance and support for this. It is good that all forms, instructions and reporting are now in Bahasa Indonesia. English summaries for international partners can be prepared by the project staff or by lead partners or network organizations.

The rapid assessments were prepared by a variety of researchers and two of the six were methodologically weak. This is an area in which professional competence is necessary. Universities with social science faculties that include anthropologists should be contracted to conduct the initial rapid assessments in new areas. This will be important in understanding the new types of WFCL in the next phase, particularly for children in domestic service.

The experience of the many different partners is not being adequately shared. Although the project has prepared good practice case studies, study reports, media material and has helped document modules for several of the activities, there is still no repository except within the ILO office. The main government partner MoMT has said they do not have the capacity to develop and maintain a web site for this purpose, although they reported in 2004 that they were setting it up. JARAK, the NGO network on child labour, has a website that is admittedly “not up to date”. **It is recommended that IPEC assist JARAK to expand and up date its web site to become the repository for the information generated by the project partners.**

Efficiency of Project Management

The IPEC project is managed by an experienced and dedicated team currently headed by a senior national officer as the CTA. There have been three different CTAs during the course of the project. The first CTA helped design the project and supervised the strategic planning process with key government and NGO partners. He managed the project for nearly three years and there was a smooth transition to another

international CTA who managed the project for about one year. For personal reasons, that CTA had to leave and it was handed over to the current national officer who has been very effective.

Throughout these changes in leadership there has been a stable team of experienced national officers to handle the project. The administrative assistant has been with ILO for many years and has a capacity to handle a very complex set of small sub-projects and the reporting that it requires. This has enabled the project to manage everything well despite having a very complicated process that requires all project proposals to be sequentially approved by IPEC Jakarta, the NAC, and IPEC headquarters in Geneva. Contracts over US\$ 20,000 must also be approved by the procurement committee in Geneva. This is made even more complicated by the policy of initially working with partners on one year contracts and then preparing new contracts if additional work is desirable. Despite this complicated procedure, the time from proposal to approval is only two months for small contracts although some large contracts have taken as long as five months. This is a testament to the efficiency of the IPEC team in Jakarta.

The reporting work on this project is also substantial because of the USDOL requirements to identify and track all beneficiaries separately for withdrawal and prevention activities for each of the services. This is particularly difficult with hidden and mobile populations such as is found in CSEC, trafficking and illegal drug trafficking. Nevertheless the project has managed to maintain good records as is displayed in their quarterly reports. The main weakness identified was that some partners had not developed systems to maintain contact with children assisted after they had left the project. Monitoring trends in the WFCL and in the risk of the WFCL has also been too dependent on the various studies supported by the project. More effort is needed to internalize trend monitoring within the provincial and district action committees. Developing a set of risk indicators based on existing government data would be helpful for this.

Lessons Learned

1. Despite the illegal and secretive nature of the worst forms of child labour, a determined government cooperating with activist NGOs and supportive communities can effectively deal with most of these problems, although tracking and withdrawing street children involved in drug trafficking remains very difficult.
2. The most successful efforts have combined policy and regulatory initiatives with direct action community-based projects coordinated by action committees with broad government and NGO membership.
3. Expanding access to and improving formal secondary education is the most effective way to prevent child labour exploitation. Direct assistance that is most effective includes:
 - grants to poor families and students for education related expenses;
 - remedial education for at risk students;
 - teacher training on active, creative, effective and enjoyable methods;
 - training on life-skills, child rights and the risks of child labour; and
 - combined elementary and junior high in one roof schools in remote areas.
4. Non-formal education using packet B and informal Open Junior High Schools are not working well and are not accepted as equivalent to formal education.
5. Involvement of community organizations and local governments with NGO projects is necessary both for effective implementation and to increase sustainability.
6. Peer educators and peer counsellors are cost-effective but may not be appropriate in all cases and require careful selection, training and guidance by professional staff.

7. Provincial and district Action Committees for Elimination of the WFCL are needed to empower and coordinate government and NGO partners, but can more effectively influence local government planning and budgeting if they are under the Commission for the Protection of Children chaired by a representative of the head of the local government.
8. The project's direct management of many small, short-term contracts was appropriate for the first phase but may not be suitable to support the institutional development and sustainability required in the next phase of support to the NPA.

Recommendations

Because this is a final evaluation, these recommendations are intended for consideration during the implementation of the second phase of IPEC assistance to the NPA/TBP.

- Develop long-term contracts with a few key partners that can mentor, monitor and report on the small project implementers. Among others this could include the teachers union PGRI, APINDO, the relevant Directorates in MoMT and MoNE, JARAK, Hotline Surabaya, etc. For the new areas of work it still may require small short-term contracts with new partners, but most of the work should be done through the key partners.
- Provide several weeks per year of a senior adviser to support the CTA who is a national officer. This is needed particularly during finalization of the project planning and to facilitate high level policy advocacy. It is also helpful to maintain close relationships with ILO headquarters and regional offices, assure good relations with other international organizations and linkage between evolving global and national policies.
- Do DME training for all new partners and do a short refresher training workshop with previous partners focusing particularly on the monitoring and evaluation aspects. This is also a means to build this network and facilitate information exchange among them.
- Develop an explicit programme, possibly through APINDO, to link private sector companies to vocational and pre-vocational training as part of their “corporate social responsibility” with the aim of improving the relevance of the training, linking it to future employment opportunities, and obtaining financial and technical support from the private sector.
- Work with BPS, and researchers to develop a cluster of indicators based on existing survey data for tracking trends and identifying areas, communities and individuals at risk of trafficking or exploitative child labour similar to the one used by Hotline Surabaya.
- Work with MoMT, MoWE on a decree to encourage establishment of a Commission for Protection of Children in every province and district and to place the Action Committees for elimination of the WFCL and the Action Committees on Trafficking and CSEC under it.
- Support MoMT for activation of the remaining 12 Provincial and more District Action Committees, particularly in provinces like Aceh and East Kalimantan where local government budgets are available and no external funding is needed.
- Work with the national teachers union and MoNE to disseminate modules on life-skills, child rights, child labour and the risks of the WFCL, and to encourage use of the PAKEM teaching method in

other parts of Indonesia.

- Work with JARAK to update, expand and improve their website so that it can become a repository for all reports, modules, media materials, and research generated by the project and the NPA on elimination of the WFCL.
- Work with partners to develop a system for training, supervising and monitoring peer educators and counsellors, and initiate systematic networking among them.
- Get a consultant to work with the women's group in Sukabumi to develop a module based on their pre-migration orientation training for young workers, and field test this with MoMT offices and NGOs in other sending areas.

Annexes

1. Report of the National Evaluation Workshop

**International Program on the Elimination of Child Labor
Tripartite Room, Ministry of Manpower and Transmigration
24 January 2008**

Welcome Address

Mr. Alan Boulton, Director of ILO Jakarta acknowledged the success of the program is due to the strong partnership between GoI, NGOs, Trade Unions, Employer associations and IPEC staff that have been involved in combating child labor in Indonesia. He appreciated participants and organizations for their commitment in combating the Child Labor.

Key points of Mr. Boulton's Welcome address

- The profile of child labor has been increasingly clear since the beginning of the TBP for elimination of the WFCL in 2004.
- Education plays an important role to reduce child labor
- A new program has been developed by GoI to reduce child labor through PROGRAM KELUARGA BAHAGIA which is a CCT (conditional cash transfer).
- ILO aims to support GoI to tackle child labor through policies development, support National Action Plan and direct interventions at the local level
- The final evaluation will help to assess the progress that have been made and draw lessons from the experiences

Mr. Stanley Harsha, First Secretary and Labor Attaché, US Embassy in Jakarta appreciated participants and all organizations that have been collaborating to tackle the issue of child labor in Indonesia. He emphasized the important role of NGOs in combating child labor and reminded participants to work with them more.

Mr. Harsha highlighted that US Government put high priority on activities related to protecting workers in Indonesia and it includes protecting children from working. He said that due to this priority, US Embassy would like to be more involved in the implementation of projects tackling child labor in Indonesia.

Mr. I Gede Made Arka, Directorate General of Labor Protection, MoMT congratulated everybody who have been working hard and were committed to combat child labor. He acknowledged ILO support to the program through technical assistance support, direct intervention as well as economic development. The workshop was officially opened and he hoped that the workshop would give insightful feedback for the future program in tackling child labor in Indonesia.

Key points of Mr. Arka's Speech

1. GoI has strong commitment in tackling child labor and in protecting our children as the future depends on the children
2. Child labor issues occurred because of various reasons, including poverty. So, it is important to also target the family in combating this issue.
3. GoI would like to collaborate more, not only with the ILO but also directly with US Embassy on tackling child labor issues, and other issues concerning workers.

4. It is important to support the development of the local level structure in combating child labor such as Provincial and District Action Committees

Presentation on Findings Session

The workshop began with a brief presentation from Mr. Clarence Shubert, Independent Evaluation Consultant for IPEC Jakarta, regarding preliminary findings on the Project.

Key points of the findings

- Changes in policy, legislation and regulations affecting WFCL:
 - The Education policy is the most significant change in policy during the life of the project particularly on BOS scheme and PKH (*Program Keluarga Harapan*) and the policies to expand the access of education through One-roof schools, Open Junior High School, Non Formal Education and Special Education Services
 - The police department has developed integrated service centers dealing specifically with women and children.
 - The extensive development of provincial and district action committees
 - National Action plans for women and children in trafficking, CSEC and violence.
- 2. Capacity building on WFCL
 9. The project has supported GoI and NGOs through different approaches including an enormous increase in the number of Provincial and District Action Committees
 10. An extensive networking of NGOs on child labor issues through JARAK
 11. The development of modules on child labor and pre-vocational training and the support of peer educator and counselor capacities.
- 3. CSEC Trafficking
 - A particularly effective integrated community based approach in East Java to prevent and withdrawal CSEC.
 - The project in Jakarta was found less effective due to the lack of coordination with government agencies and integration with the community.
 - Modules on the Danger of Child labor for teachers and counsellors was developed in Sukabumi and can be replicated in other areas.
- 4. Street children involved in Drugs Trafficking
 - Withdrawal is targeting children in detention center as most children in detention are involved in drugs.
 - Prevention is more effective through schools based activities
 - Peer educators are found to be the most cost-effective
 - Need to collaborate with police to ensure a safe environment
 - Tackle families that are involved in drugs trafficking through income generating activities
- 5. Footwear industry
 - The project has effectively withdrawn children from footwear industry through community participation and limiting the children to packaging work.
 - The conditions of work has been addressed by the Health department
 - The children were taken out of the footwear industry and put back in school

6. Off-shore Fishing

- The program was implemented through community based NGOs
- Micro-credit plays an important role and need to be well structured
- There is a lack of access to schools but the creative children center and library may become alternatives for educating the children.

7. Aceh Projects

- Life skills and pre-vocational program are important to prevent the children from working.
- The program has developed modules that can be implemented in other areas.

Working Group Session

The participants were split to three working groups:

Working group 1: Policy, Legislation and Regulations

Working group 2: Capacity building and Coordination

Working group 3: Awareness raising, research and documentation

Working Groups 1

Ibu Wowong (YKAI) presented the discussion for working group 1.

The group identified several policies, legislations and regulations in national as well as provincial level, which were endorsed during 2004 – 2007. The endorsed policies, legislations and regulations clearly reflect that efforts toward elimination of the worst forms of child labor have increased.

The group listed the policies changes in the last four year and clarified the policies under various Ministries:

- Policy development has started since 1999 by ratification of ILO Convention 138 and followed by ratification of ILO Convention 182
- Article 3 of ILO convention was inserted as article 74 of National Law no. 13/2003 on manpower
- The policies had been followed up by various regulation as follows:
 - Decree of the Minister of Manpower and Transmigration of Indonesia No. 235 Y 2003 concerning jobs that jeopardize the health, safety and morals of children.
 - Decree of Minister of Home Affairs No. 5 Y 2004 on the tackling of child labor
 - Decree of the Minister of Manpower and Transmigration No. 115 Y 2004 on talent and interest development of children
- National Law No. 23 Y 2003 on Child Protection
- National Law No. 21 Y 2007 on Trafficking Bill.
- National Action Plan on CSEC (2002), on Trafficking (2002)

Ministry of Home Affairs:

- In 2005, declared that child protection includes protection from the worst forms of child labor in a statement circulated to the Governors and Mayors

Police Department of RI

1. Police Regulation No. 10/2007 on women and children services unit
2. This regulation directed to all member of police department to give special services space for women and children, and to guarantee protection to both
3. Regulation at the Provincial /Municipality

The group also noted the policies developed by Governor's and District's decrees on the elimination of child labor in West Java, East Java, Central Java, North Sumatra, East Kalimantan etc, such as:

- Local Law on Child Labor Free Zone of Kutai Kartanegara

- Governor of East Java Decision No.013/2003 - East Java Commission of Child Protection which established 3 sub committees: WFCL, CSEC and Trafficking
- In West Java: Local Action Plan on CSEC and on WFCL (Governor Decree)
- Sukabumi will issue a Local Law on Trafficking in Person
- Sukabumi District regulation No. 4/07 on a Center of Integrated Services
- Socializing trafficking issue at school and community.

Bogor District:

1. In 2005 the District Action Committee on the WFCL was established
2. Local Action Plan on WFCL is being finalized

The group also discussed the support from ILO project and following are the key points:

Sukabumi District Office of Family Planning and Women Empowerment

- The office benefited from the program
- Collaboration has been conducted to empower the family economy of street children through direct action with partner of MoWE in 5 provinces, including west Java (Sukabumi – Family Planning and Women Empowerment) and East Java (Surabaya – Centre of Integrated Services)

Inputs on the Provincial Action Committee

- Based on the evaluation, it was found that ILO needs to strengthen the coordination with Provincial and District Action Committees, especially on direct actions with NGO partners

Bogor District

- ILO increased the awareness and direct action on the elimination of WFCL
- The local government budget has allocated some funds to support activities which focused on child labor through inspection activities on employers who employ children, and their work places
- ILO needs to improve their role in order to advocate for the child labor issue in the government budget to be a priority
- District level has initiated a Law on District Action Plan. Action Committee on the Elimination of Child Labor in WFCL in Bogor is involved actively.
- It has been included in the regional budget for policy in general

In relation with contribution of the project to the policy development, the group also acknowledged the role of ILO in developing those regulations. They admitted that discussions, workshops, and other technical assistances' activities strengthened stakeholders' knowledge on child labor related international laws/conventions. To make it more effective, in the future, ILO is recommended to increase the number of activities and improve coordination.

In terms of policy or regulation conflicts need to be addressed in regard to child labour, the group identified several conflicts among policy and regulations. The group concluded that there is different definition on child labor policy such as

- different on age definition
- No integrated socialization. Socialization on child labor policy implemented separately. It depends on the internal policy of each department

The group also identified that several policies that are conflicting as follows

1. Child drug trafficker classified as a drug user is caught by police and expelled from school. This situation clearly reflects a conflict between Law No. 13/2003 on manpower, Law on National Education System and Law on child protection
2. There is a conflict between Criminal Laws and Laws on Child Protection

3. In general, there is also conflict between most regional Laws and the Convention on Child Rights
4. This situation is almost the same with the situation faced by children in conflict with other laws

Although the group identified activities and projects which tried to solve the conflicts, they recommended that the second phase of National Action Plan work to harmonize these legal conflicts.

From Police:

- Guidance book produced by Police Department and UNICEF, Law on Child Protection and ILO Convention on the WFCL and migrant workers was recently socialized at provincial, regional Police Departments, but did not reach the district level yet.
- Therefore awareness raising to socialize the law is necessary to increase the knowledge of the members, especially for field officers

From Education Department

- Skill training is available for Children in LAPAS (Juvenile Correctional Centre), inclusive education school in 16 LAPAS

The group also identified that the coordination within departments is very important and following are their recommendations:

1. Synchronization on the policy is necessary, including inter departmental synchronization
2. All policy makers need to sit together to solve the problem
3. Synchronization of all activities or policies can be integrated organized through the Action Committee on Child Labor

The group also recommended that Action Committees on elimination of WFCL should play a more important role to synchronize the laws. To support the role, the national government should confirm which agency would be a leading sector for implementation of policies, regulation, and legislation related to child labor.

Working Group 2

Ibu Clara (BMS) presented the result.

The group found that each member had different opinions on the action committee such as whether or not the committee should be formed, whether their function is as coordination or as a technical team, and who the committee should be responsible to at national and local level.

The group provided various views.

From East Kalimantan, the action committee should be:

- Attached to the assistant of the governor and report to the Governor
- Units responsible for its operation should be a technical department or an implementing regional NGO
- Financially supported by Regional Budget
- Endorsement through Governor Decree

From Anna (IOM)

- Rather difficult to build new institution due to the budget required
- Structurally assigned in the unit which already has a budget allocation

From Sukabumi

- Independent but within the structure that has a budget allocation.

From Jarak

- The characteristic of this structure is ad hoc, independent from the existing structure; the main tasks and functions need to be clarified in the guidance

Therefore, the group concluded that where we have to place the committee in the local government structure depends on what works in each local area.

In the second slide, the group identified various trainings that have been conducted by ILO for their partners:

- DME
- Counseling
- Case Management

In discussing capacity building, the group advised ILO to first conduct need assessment of ILO's partners and should schedule the trainings in line with the needs of the partners. Training subjects could include advocacy, negotiation skill, capacity building for cadre or community. The group also suggested that an AP (action program) should consist either advocacy activity only or direct intervention only as most organizations could not do both. (However, PPSW from Sukabumi acknowledged that they did not have any problem in implementation although their action program had both direct intervention and advocacy activities.)

In improving relationship among NGO and Government Institutions, the group advised the following points:

1. To identify the right personal
2. Intensive communication, provide appropriate information, RIGHT communication (constructive)
3. Establish any possible informal network
4. Establish the same vision & mission in discussing certain issues (child protection), (Innovation)
5. Reduce a negative assumption and judgment between Government and NGOs

In ensuring sustainability of the program after ILO's support, the group suggested that the program developed be community based. So the community may continue the program when ILO support finishes. It is suggested to have a phase out strategy in preparing communities and cadres and these should be included in the APSO (action program summary outline). It is also advised to consider funding mobilization from the private sector or government budget but all of these have to be clear at the outset.

Comments:

Bapak Adi (ELSPAT) commented that it is a burden for the committee if they are not independent. It would be much better if the committee was funded by local government.

Bapak Marzuki (JARAK) commented that the issue on child labour is very localized and depends on the priority of each province (see the case in East Java where the issue of child labor is included in Startegic Plan) thus it becomes a challenge for those areas that do not considered child labor as their priority.

Working Group 3

Bapak Herman (Rumah Kita) presented the result

The group discussed the effectiveness of the research and assessment that have been conducted during the life of the program. The group highlighted that the language used on the research documentation was not easy for the public to understand. The group also suggested to collect all the best practices and share them among the agencies.

The group also presented various activities that have been implemented and can be replicated in other areas.

- Dissemination of information using Multilevel Marketing approach

- Music campaigns
- Approaches to schools
- Approaches to parents through saving and loan cooperative activities
- Theater performance and scripts are produced by children
- Sports activity
- Routine discussion on trafficking è established focal point
- Counselling
- Peer to peer education
- Documentary film on their daily lives with children
- Joint campaigns among institutions that are working in similar activities

There are plenty type of awareness raising that can be used on child labor awareness raising including: Films, Leaflets, Stickers, Posters, Books, Calendars, Agendas, Talk shows, Print and electronic media, Musical activities, community counseling, and the regular programs in media which are supported by ILO (such as community services, talk shows, etc)

Comments:

Ibu Arum (ILO) clarified that the research was promoted and shared through press conference and sent the publications through various stakeholders. She suggested that it would be useful if the group could advise whether or not the approaches in research results dissemination were effective and efficient.

Bapak Adi (ELSPAT) commented that many research and publication were not shared with respondents or the local areas. So he suggested that ILO research and publication should also be shared with the communities where the research has been conducted.

Bapak Abdul (ILO) clarified that it is not only for ILO's research but also applies to other research in general.

Bapak Marzuki (JARAK) noted that in the research reports there are lots of good recommendations but how are these recommendations conveyed to the public, communities, policy makers, etc. Second, he noted that using ambassadors or spoke persons in awareness raising is pretty effective to reach local communities.

Ibu Lamtiur suggested to collaborate extensively in promoting research.

Bapak Haryono (APINDO) highlighted that children are our future and the child labor problem links to poverty, culture, health and etc. Thus, it is important to have a coordination among various sectors in tackling the problem.

Bapak Clarence suggested to disseminate research through a website.

AFTERNOON Working Group session

The participants were split to three working groups:

Working group 4: Education to prevent child labor

Working group 5: Withdrawing children from WFCL

Working group 6: Community based prevention and withdrawal from WFCL

One additional working group with children and youth as the beneficiaries of the project.

The children group was represented by Saifudin (17yo) from Yayasan Rumah Kita.

The group explored the best ways to keep children from dropping out.

- Provide free school

- Refurbished damaged schools
- counseling place/section is available in every schools
- Non abusive teaching method
- Provide extra curricular
- Teachers are polite
- Convenient learning environment

Job opportunities for parents are provided to avoid child exploitation

- Improved Economic conditions
- Parents live in harmony
- Counseling room is available for students
- Enough pocket money
- Sufficient school facilities

In principle, Saifuddin highlighted that children should go to school.

11. Skill training has to be conducted at schools
12. Skill training: in accordance to the talent of the children and work place
13. Package B and C: learning process should be equal to formal school
14. Communities trust to the ex juveniles
15. Skills provision
16. Job opportunity post-training

The group also explored who are the best persons/place to share with their problems and views through drawings. Drawings showed: the Moon, Stars, Sun, Crescent moon, Flowers, Diary, Mirrors, Close friend, Brother/sister, Social workers, Friends of PKBI Jakarta (one of the NGOs), mother.

The children provided inputs on the training needs for peer educators:

- Convention on Child Rights
- The dangers of and prevention of drugs
- Information on the dangerous drugs
- Knowledge on becoming a peer group member
- Knowledge on HIV/AIDS

Comments:

Bapak Herman (Yayasan Rumah Kita) concerned that sometimes children did not take opportunities provided for them such as they quit the training course they attended, etc.

Saifudin (Yayasan Rumah Kita) responded that they like to go to school but parents and families force them to work. He noted that it is important for parents to have better work.

Oji (Yayasan Rumah Kita) responded that in the non-formal classes the teachers did not come to schools when they are at school.

Desi (YCAB) responded to provide free education for all children.

Ibu Kurniawati (PPSW) asked what the children need from parents.

Bapak Ade (Dinas Keluarga Berencana dan Pemberdayaan Perempuan, Kab. Sukabumi) concerned that schools are not free and DEPNAKER should take seriously on creating job opportunities.

Working group 4

Bapak Firman (KSBSI) presented the result.

The group elaborated the alternative education for children where school access is not sufficient and also highlighted that teachers play an important role in doing this.

- Develop education system *Inclusive Education* (which is organized in the formal schools that is based on the needs of the children)
- Special Education Services, there is formal education plus skill training (based on the needs of the children)
- Package B
- One Roof School
- Open Junior High School
- PKBM Community Learning Center
- Mobile teachers
- Elementary schools for poor community (voluntary teachers)
- Home Schooling (given related task with subject concerned)

The group was also concerned that they were not aware of the educational materials used in informing children about the danger of child labor and pre-vocational module and suggested to do more socialization on the materials to others. In addition, there are NGOs that have developed useful materials on education and it would be good to be replicated in other areas.

11. Peer teaching methods can be more acceptable by other peers
12. Socialization of the materials on Child Labor
13. Adjust materials to the needs of the children as students (Student Centre)
14. Teaching method more joyful and friendly

In the life skills, the group agreed that life skill is very important for children as it includes character building as well as skills. The group highlighted that the vocational skill should be identified based on the children interest as well as the market needs. The quality of the training should also be considered carefully.

In relation with PKH, the group agreed that PKH should be provided for a very poor family and linked to education.

Comments:

Farida Hanum (Hotline Surabaya) concerned that the recommended alternative school i.e. Sekolah Rakyat (School for People) for children from poor families is discriminative to children. She also advised and suggested to have a ministerial collaboration between MONE and MOMT for schools to provide pre-vocational training as extra-curricula.

Bapak Ade (Dinas Keluarga Berencana dan Pemberdayaan Perempuan, Kab. Sukabumi) noted that GoI provides total free education and alternative schools are provided only for remote areas.

Ibu Betty (PLSB, MONE) informed participants that PLSB has issued MoU within training providers association.

Bapak Marzuki (JARAK) reminded participants on the quality of education to prevent children from dropping out. Secondly, he noted the content of alternative education should respond to future needs of the children.

Working group 5

Devi (PKBI) presented the result to participants.

The group identified various indicators based on the working categorization.
CSEC

10. Life styles
11. Approaches Pimps and AYLA (outreach)
12. Can not be seen from life styles
13. Prostitution locations, amusements centers (out reach)
14. Data assessment (from legal institutions, medical services)
15. Observation on areas that produced AYLA, employers, etc.

Children in Drug Trafficking

- Observations (Drug user, key person)
- Potential areas of drugs trafficking (schools , children dwellings)
- Amusement places
- Permissive environments

The group identified various approaches that can be used.

- Outreach
- Counseling
- Using Role Model (ex user)
- Education
- Services provided in accordance with the needs of the children
- Peer Group , Peer Educator

The group noted that police should be involved in advocacy program, collaborate with other government institution such as BNP (Provincial Narcotics Boards), RPK (Ruang Pelayanan Khusus Perempuan dan Anak) in the program as well as harmonization between repressive and rehabilitation approach.

In using Non Formal Education and Special Education, the group identified following key points to withdraw children.

1. Education and skills training should be provided in accordance with the children's talent and potential area
2. The post training should also consider carefully business opportunities (market opportunities) for older children
3. There is a need to increase networking on business opportunities
4. Vocational Skills Training play an important role for older children
5. Access to the Human Resources

The group noted that parents and communities should be involved in the program.

During the initial approach (prevention), the community leaders can be involved in:

- socializations
- Program participation
- parenting education
- family economic empowerment

The group highlighted that parents should also receive services together with children.

Working group 6

Ibu Clara (BMS) presented the result to participants

Should NGOs be required to work through community organizations (Desa/RW)? the group highlighted key points:

- YES and NO
- Consider its situation, It should be flexible
- From the point of view of social analysis, stakeholders play an important role and assist to solve the problem/ activities are implemented
- Involvement of local organization is important, so they could participate more actively into the program and not only deal with the permit.
- Grass-root advocacies (RT, RW, Kelurahan)
- As an efforts of sustainability

The group agreed that the committee should be formed whether or not there is any support project in the concerned area. They agreed that micro credit is important but need to be carefully built such as empowering the parents, etc.

- POSITIVE, have to be established
- Committees always exist as long as child labor issue is still there

The group also identified various actions to convince parents who employ children to eliminate WFCL.

SOCIALIZATION:

- provide information and knowledge on the hazardous work of WFCL (footwear), health impact on the used of chemicals through brochure, leaflet, discussion
- Research (problem mapping or impact assessment of child labor or WFCL)
- LEGAL LAW: uphold legislation
- Approaches of APINDO to:
 - Employers: emphasizing that productivity of adult workers is higher than child workers
 - CHILD: It is not to stop all children involvement in work but it should be in accordance to the legislations (light work, only three hours a day, education right provided, etc)
 - Recruiter
- Through religious approach: Child as a gift of God. This approach is easily accepted in the religious environment

The group suggested that the community development workers can be found in NGOs or community by providing capacity building.

The group agreed that micro credit approach is a very effective approach to families. However, there should be a capacity building to families such as providing business management training, entrepreneurship, and providing stimulants to the families.

CLOSING REMARKS

Bapak Clarence highlighted that the evaluation result will be used in the development and implementation of the next phase project. According to him, weaknesses and strengths were normal in the first stage and it could be improved in the next phase. He also suggested to have the some of the same monitoring and evaluation indicators within all partners so the projects are able to track the problems of working children and progress of the program that the participants are working on.

He remarked the children group was as usual the most creative group. He also remarked on working with the employers association in providing the vocational training at schools and within the community.

Ibu Nur Asiah, Director of Labor inspection norms on women and children, MoMT, appreciated the workshop and everybody involved in combating WFCL.

She said that the program has not tackled the root of the program of child labor namely poverty, however, these programs have been a great support to combat child labor in Indonesia.

She highlighted the PKH program that is to support very poor families. MOMT will be heavily involved in this program and responsible to withdraw children through counseling and referral system to schools both formal and non formal schools in MONE. MOSA will provide services for families to strengthen them economically. She also informed that PKH will work in 7 provinces and is currently preparing the program. She hoped that this program will be one of the solutions in responding to child labor problems.

She advised participants strongly to inform local governments in implementing ILO programs and coordinate with local government during the implementation. She also suggested that partners may present their APSOs themselves during the steering committee meeting. She also advised ILO to support the data collection in the local areas and for ILO to assist in workshops with local committees which are not effective in their work. She reminded everybody that GOI is working on Protecting Domestic Workers Bill and suggested ILO to facilitate meetings to discuss the issues of Child Domestic Workers for inputs to the above Bill.

She appreciated ILO Jakarta to facilitate the workshops and the independent team who evaluated the programs. She hoped that the weakness in the first phase can be solved for the next phase and thanked you all participants who have been attending the workshop.

2. Report of the Evaluation Workshop in Aceh

Minutes of IPEC TBP I Evaluation Workshop

Kualaraja Hotel, Banda Aceh, Friday - 18 January 2008

Waktu / Time	Agenda
09:15 – 10:00	<p>Opening session:</p> <p>12. Opening prayer: Mr. Rajab Nasution – Disnaker NAD staff</p> <p>13. ILO remarks : Riska E – ILO</p> <p>14. Opening remarks : Mr. Syamsuddin Daud, head of Provincial Manpower Office of NAD</p> <p>15. Brief Findings: Mr. Clarence Shubert – ILO Evaluator</p>
10:30	Coffee Break
10:45 – 11:00	Background information and introduction to workshop process : Mr. Clarence & Ms. Lamtiur Tampubolon – Evaluation Team
11:00 – 12.10	<p><u>Session – Working Groups & Presentation</u></p> <p>The participants are divided into 4 groups, each with the following topics:</p> <p>Grup 1: "Policies, Legislations and Regulations"</p> <p>Grup 2: "Capacity Building and Coordination"</p> <p>Grup 3: "Awareness Raising, Research and Documentation"</p> <p>Grup 4: "Hopes from children as beneficiaries"</p> <p>Group 4 consisted of a few children who attended the workshop in the morning as they were on holidays.</p> <p>Group I: The questions are:</p> <p>1) <i>What policy changes have been made in education services related to working or at risk children? Consider SMP, Paket B, Special and Technical Education.</i></p> <p>2) <i>How has the ILO project direct actions for children influenced policies or regulations?</i></p> <p>3) <i>Are there policy or regulation conflicts that need to be addressed in regard to child labour?</i></p> <p>The results:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • There are some policies made such as in education: 9 years school obligations for children; scholarships for drop-out children from poor families; and BOS (School Operational Fund); and in aceh governor made program actively involved the Dayah or local religious dormitory schools. however still in general not specifically targeted child labours directly or for the elimination of WFCL.

In general these education policies are good indirect supporting policies. For this to become effective in supporting elimination of WFCL, they need to benefit the informal sector as well. At present the “BOS” policy only benefits the formal sector, and cannot be used in informal sectors like PKBM (Community Learning Center).

- As the informal sector provides a significant portion of employment in Aceh, Sumut and Nias, the ILO needs to determine how these policies can be made to also target and benefit the informal sector.

The ILO is requested to support these actions:

2. In Aceh, ILO can actively advocate “Qanun” (Islamic laws) in employment-related issues. It is important that these qanun not be contra-productive to efforts for elimination of WFCL. The verses of these Qanuns should emphasize coordination with other policies and efforts. This can also be an entry point for The Provincial Action Committee (KAP) to push the implementation of policies.

- Encouraged the establishment of KAP and the KAK (The District Action Committee) for elimination of WFCL in NAD / Aceh province. They will actively push for these activities to be on the local government agenda and be supported by APBD (local government budget).

Mr. Ariefani, Head of Daily Operation of KAP Sumut, shared what has happened with their program. To have the KAP be effective and efficient and have good planning took about two years. Especially as the Head of KAP is usually a prominent or high level official (Governor assistant / head of Social Welfare office) who is very busy. Thus, they created a position of Head of Daily Operation who hold responsibility to ensure the smooth implementation of the work plan. At present, their activities successfully got support from APBD. For 2006: Rp 150 million; 2007: Rp 200 million; & 2008: Rp 450 million.

- Aceh Besar District has launched a campaign to become “KOTA RAMAH ANAK” / Children City. The head of district is actively involved in this program and supported the establishment of KAK.
- In Aceh, Nias and Sumut so far there are no contra productive policies related to elimination of WFCL. There are KPAID, Yayasan Peduli Anak, PKPA, and other NGOs with children-focused concerns. Some points to be considered are:
 - The limitation and unavailability of employment inspectors. Thus monitoring the areas with high CL cannot be done properly. The number of these inspectors are far less than the number of areas need to be supervised. Furthermore, their capacities need to be enhanced to work properly. In many regions, they also have other jobs, such as in Nias where the inspector is also the head of sub-district.
 - Government policy such as the requirement of having birth certificate to access the public services are hampering the children especially the poor in obtaining these services.

Group 2:

15. *What should be the composition of the Provincial Action Committee on Child Labour?*

16. *How has the ILO/IPEC project helped build capacity within GO, NGO and Employer and Workers organizations?*

17. *How can cooperation between government and non-government organizations be improved?*

18. *How can the services provided with ILO support be sustained when this support ends?*

The result:

1. Composition of KAP should be representatives of MONE, Manpower Office, Social Welfare, Syariah (only for NAD), BAPPEDA (local government planning agency), police office, DPR, and NGOs related to CL.

2. The IPEC can contribute to build capacity the local government in terms of :

5. Socialization of child labour related Islamic laws
6. TOT delivery
7. Funding support
8. Encourage the establishment of KAP
9. capacity building and funding support for acceleration of employment related Islamic laws.

3) NGOs are valuable partners but still need to build their capacity further.

For employers and workers' union: so far the ILO actions/projects have not directly benefited building their capacity. ILO should be more proactive in building their capacity to support IPEC programs.

4) Inputs for collaboration and coordination:

- clear and firm mechanism and policies
- regulation (government) as a basis
- clear authority
- coordination

While for the sustainability of ILO program:

16. So far the program been conducted already benefited the communities

17. Programs need to be socialized

18. Raising community awareness to support ILO programs

Inputs from participants:

- Sulaiman – PKPA NAD: in fact, the local NGOs such as PKPA are already actively involved in setting up the KAP. Workers unions and employers already have been invited but they have not been helped much.
- ILO only supported the discussion of qanun (islamic law) on employment not children

because it has been covered by UNICEF.

- Pak Tarmizi – Head BLK: This working groups should invite resource persons who could provide insights on what ILO has done before conducting discussions. The time limitation required further discussion for specific topics.

Group 3:

What research has been done to document the extent and distribution of child labour? Is more research needed?

What models appropriate for replication have been revealed by monitoring and documented?

What materials, media presentations or public forums have been used to raise awareness of child labour issues among the public?

What more should be done to raise awareness?

Results:

1. In NAD province:

2. Year 2006:

1. "Street Children Profile in Banda Aceh"
2. "Child Labors in fishery sectors in 7 Districts (with BRR)
3. "Street Children in Lhoksemauwe (with UNIMAL)

3. Year 2007:

1. "Involvement of Children in Cocaine planting in Ace Besar District (with ILO)"
2. "Trafficking' (UNSYIAH)

In SUMUT:

9. 2007:

1. "Children in Prostitution"
2. "CL in mining sector (stone)"

2) Based on experiences, the approaches that can be replicated are in the sectors:

- Child Labors in construction, building and illegal logging
- CL as domestic workers
- Trafficking

Also, the One Roof School policy for children in remote areas and the pre-vocational training programs.

3. Peace action to raise public awareness of Street Children through : brochure, pamphlet. Celebration of Anti-Child Labor Day, Film presentation and modul development and dissemination of CL.

PKPA NAD with Social Welfare office and local government create media campaign to raise awareness for not giving money to children in the street, to reduce their numbers.

What is needed now is the monitoring and evaluation of the programs. PKPA and local partners plan to conduct monitoring to see the effectiveness of this project.

In “SUMUT”

- Child Labor Day celebration
- Modul of Elimination of CL
- Film presentation

- There should be an institution who coordinates, and monitors the implementation and action on CL. Continuous and stimulating publications to sustain public awareness. In Aceh, the One Roof School program needs to be replicated.

Children Group

”Hopes from the Children”

Result of discussion:

- Our hopes that this program can be continue in the future.
- We are very grateful and happy with this pre vocational programs
- We could obtain valuable skills for our future.

Lesson Learnt:

4. Many people do not have enough funds to initiate nor continue the pre vocational program
5. With this pre-voc program, many children in Indonesia, esp. In Aceh, can be benefited by the applicable skills provided.
6. This program should be continued forever because then we can prepare our future with obtained skills.
7. Because there is no donor to continue this program so it is really a regret that still many children not benefited.

Input from participants:

9. PKPA – Sulaiman

In Aceh Besar district, as mentioned, they are already setting up KAK which will be launched in Feb 2008 by the Head of District as well as the program of”kota ramah anak”. This district will be a district free of Child Labor as it was previously known as place for CL in fishery and illegal logging sectors.

10. Rotation of capable and already trained government staff made the CL work postponed or difficult to be implemented.

11. Rotation of ILO Staff also hampered the smooth continuation of the program.

12. There are 17,000 children in 226 Dayah or boarding schools in Aceh. Thus ILO needs to consider this fact in designing its program, especially the pre-vocational. ILO can actively provide advice to the local government on how best to conduct a program for elimination of WFCL.

	<p>Summary from Clarence:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Many facts have been revealed during the workshop which had not been revealed by direct interviews yesterday. • Many good inputs for the ILO • The idea of accelerating the Action Committee establishment at the provincial and district level is really good. • It is good to invite resource persons for the next workshop.
12:00 – 14:00	Luncheon and Prayer Break
14:00 – 14:15	Briefing on Working Groups by Bp. Clarence Shubert/Ibu Lamtiur Tampubolon
14:15 – 16.00	<p>Group I – “Vocational Education”</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • <i>Should vocational training be limited to SMK and BLK or also be offered in SMA and PKBM?</i> • <i>Which courses are most popular or useful in pre-vocational training?</i> • <i>What should be the role of employers and private business in vocational training?</i> • <i>Should entrepreneurship training be included and, if so, who should teach it?</i> <p>Resut:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1.It can be included in Extra curricular activities 2. Training materials should be adapted to local culture and geography, plus Achievement Motivation Training should be added. 3. Facilitate it with on the job training. Efforts should be made to have more involvement of corporate social responsibilities fund in the pre-vocational training. 4. The trainers should be practitioners from: entrepreneurs, government institutions dealing with entrepreneurship and others. <p>Group II - :Non Formal & Special Education”</p>

How can non-formal and special education be used to withdraw children from the worst forms of labour and prevent them from entering them?
If Packet B is cheaper, more flexible and more interesting to children than SMP, does it encourage children to drop out of SMP?
Should special education funds be available for children who are not disabled?
Are children who are poor, from cultural minorities, or living in remote areas disabled?

Result:

1. For point 1:

Provide understanding and awareness to the public that both kinds of education, formal and non formal, have the same status in regulations and law.
Close assistance to families with children in non formal education
Pre-vocational program for non formal school. It is important to have them not so monotone.
Cultural and sport programs
Building capacity of teachers in how to deliver the course and maintain special treatment for children.

2. NO. There is a public perception that formal schools are more prestigious.

3. There are, such as: retrieval fund, BOS and remedial fund

4. It is already included.

Group III – “Formal Education”

17. *What has been done to raise awareness of the risks and dangers of the worst forms of child labour within SMPs and MTS?*
18. *Should pre-vocational education be voluntary or compulsory in SMP and MTS?*
19. *Should contracting of work by students for private companies be permitted, and, if so how should it be monitored and regulated?*
20. *Is pre-vocational education likely to cause students to drop out and join the work force?*

	<p>Result:</p> <p>21. Important to raise awareness of risk of WFCL in secondary schools, through:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Socialization of WFCL to schools. 2. Socialization through media such as brochure and radio show. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ pre vocational training in SMP needs to be responsive to demand. ▪ Direct contract of businesses with students is forbidden, needs to be conducted by institutional arrangement only. ▪ Coordination with Manpower office (labor inspectors) for monitoring. <p>Group of Youth and Children:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • <i>Should pre-vocational training be compulsory in SMPs or MSTs?</i> • <i>What kind of skills are most important for you?</i> • <i>What did you think about the pre-vocational and life skills training, and how can it be improved?</i> • <i>Should students be paid for their work if the products are sold to private businesses?</i> • <i>Does pre-vocational education encourage you to leave school and begin working full time?</i> <p>Result:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. For us, this pre-voc program is necessary to enable people like us, especially those who cannot afford to obtain this course, to have this skill. It is also needed to support the schools without sufficient funds to continue the programs. Some of us think that this pre-voc is not necessary and should be based on voluntarism and eagerness of the children 2. All skills are considered important, especially to prepare us for competition for jobs after finishing our schooling. 3. Pre-voc is important and life skill is not only for secondary students but for all Indonesian children, especially the poor and abandoned. If we are aware of this fact, we will set up an institution that can provide this skill continuously. 4. There is 2 opinion from us: <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. The children who trained need to be paid. The money then will be used to obtain other kinds of life skills. 2. The children do not need to be paid as we are still learning. The money can be given for those less fortunate than us, to provide them also with life skills.
16:00 – 17:00	<p>Wrapped up and Closing - Bp. Clarence Shubert/Ibu Lamtiur Tampubolon</p>

3. Good Practice Case Studies

Good Practice Case Studies

Prepared by IPEC Project Staff

Remedial Course and Provision of Supplementary Food and School Supplies

Increasing the participation of schools in eliminating child labour in Ciomas, Bogor

Overview

The first phase of Indonesia's National Action Plan on the Elimination of the Worst Forms of Child Labour has specified five forms of child labour which should be tackled as priorities, one of which is the child labour in the informal footwear sector. To support NAP, ILO-IPEC developed several programs in a number of sub-districts in West Java. Prior to the implementation of the program, several studies² were conducted to collect relevant data on the magnitude of the problem, areas to focus on, and the most suitable intervention.

Ciomas is known as a centre of footwear production in the Bogor district. This area is currently in a state of transition, becoming an urban area rather than a rural one, due to the fact that the majority of farmers have switched to work in footwear factories/ workshops in order to increase their earnings. A Rapid Assessment undertaken by the ILO-IPEC in 2003 revealed a high number of child labourers working in the footwear-production sector, especially in the village of Parakan in the Ciomas Area. The baseline survey carried out in 2004 identified three other villages as footwear-production centres, namely Mekarjaya, Pasir Eurih and Sirnagalih. As many as 575 children (478 boys and 97 girls) under the age of 18 were found working in footwear workshops. As many as 62 children were under the age of 12 (11%), 76 were 13 years old (13%) and 79 were 14 years old (14%). Half of the total number of child labourers in the footwear sector were to be found in Parakan village. This situation is closely related to the rate of dropping out from school among those children.

Taking this into account, The Office of Religious Affairs for the Bogor Regency³ in collaboration with ILO-IPEC took an initiative to increase children's participation in schooling and prevent child labourers from returning to work, through the means of several activities, namely: Remedial Courses Program, the Supplementary Food for School Children (PMTAS) and the provision of school supplies. The main aim of these activities was to motivate children at elementary school level (Madrasah Ibtidaiyah, Islamic elementary school) to continue with their schooling, to improve their educational performance, and to prevent children from dropping out of school to work in footwear workshops. The target group for the program were students in three elementary MI schools in Ciomas Area, Bogor Regency. Through this programme, the Bogor Office of Religious Affairs was successful in preventing 112 children (77 boys and 45 girls) from working in footwear production after school hours (thus eliminating the risk of dropping out of school) and in preventing 727 children (358 boys and 369 girls) from being involved in work in that sector (which falls into the category of the worst forms of child labour). The three MI schools that participated in the program were MI Al Furquon in Mekar Jaya village, MI Al Inayah and MI Anwarul Hidayah in Parakan village. All of them are within the Ciomas Area, in the Bogor Regency.

² A rapid assessment in 2003 and a baseline study in 2004.

³ In implementing this program, the Board of Islamic Education (MAPENDAIS) and a number of school inspectors worked together with the Madrasah Ibtidaiyah Working Group (KKMI) under the coordination of the Head of KKMI.

How the program has helped to prevent or withdraw children from WFCL.

- The remedial program facilitated children to stay at school ‘longer’ and thus they did not consider going to work in the footwear sector.
- The program increased children’s internal motivation to continually achieve more, as they began to enjoy the ‘rewards’ of observing their own progress, not only academically but also in the fields of sports and the art.
- Both remedial and supplementary food programs increased people’s (particularly parents’) awareness of the importance of education for their children and of chemical hazards in the kind of work in footwear workshops that their children were undertaking. The program involved parents, usually mothers, to be active participants in preparing the extra food. Through this activity, they learnt how to prepare cheap but nutritious food and increased their own knowledge about children education and rights.
- The program enhanced the commitment of various parties regarding the issue of child labour. It was acknowledged by principals of the schools involved in the program that their schools had benefited enormously as the children participating in it had improved their performance in many different areas.

“The children’s ability to understand lessons has improved. We just need to look here (the Principal’s office) to see how many trophies they’ve won recently: dancing, drawing, activities with Scout groups.”

“So long as there is the remedial program and the PMTAS program, children can be taken out of employment; they don’t work...”

“We used to have parents who didn’t understand. They would come to school and ask: why does my child have to stay at school until late afternoon? My kid used to work and now they are studying so how am I supposed to give them money for snacks and stuff? But after they were told about the hazards of working with glue and such like, they finally understood.”

(Interview with the Principal, MI Al Furqon)

Pre-conditions

The majority of those within the community were of the view that children should help with their parents’ work (for financial reasons). Taking this fact into account, The Office of Religious Affairs for the Bogor district undertook a awareness-raising program about the importance of children’s education, aimed at parents. As the first step in this awareness-raising campaign, various meetings were held to facilitate the next steps in the program.

Realising the need for supports, Bogor Office of Religious Affairs worked closely with various parties. Parents of school children were enlisted to help with cooking and preparing supplementary food (such as milk, vegetables, fruit, jelly and so on) for children in MI schools, classes 1-6. Thirty teachers were trained as facilitators for the Remedial Courses and awareness raising programs about the worst forms of child labour. The training sessions were facilitated by the Office of Religious Affairs, the ILO and ILO partners. In relation to health issues, the Bogor Office of Public Health and local health clinics provided instructions about nutrition and about the worst forms of child labour to parents involved in the Supplementary Food Program. The idea was to change parents’ attitude so that children would no longer required to work in footwear workshops.

Main Activities and Results

16. **The remedial courses were** given three times a week to all children in years 4, 5 and 6, after-school hours between 13.00-15.30. The total number of children from the three MI schools joining the program was 344. They received extra-tuition in all subjects tested in mid-semester and end of semester exams. The students targeted for this program were those who most struggled in lessons. Through participation in the program, students were able to improve their performance and no longer thought about rushing home to help their parents work in footwear workshops.
17. Some schools had run The Supplementary Food Program for School Children (PMTAS) in the past but it had had to be stopped due to funding problems. With the support of this ILO-IPEC program, PMTAS was revived. Supplementary food was given regularly once more, three times every week. The objective of PMTAS was to improve concentration and educational performance on the part of participating students. Each school enlisted parents to prepare food together and to distribute it to students in years 1-6, in all three MIs. As a result of their involvement, parents were able to increase their own knowledge about how to prepare nutritious food at low cost and about the importance of nutrition for children. They also developed an understanding about why working in the footwear sector is hazardous to children's health and counts among the worst forms of child labour. With this deepened understanding, it was hoped that parents would motivate their children to continue with their studies and improve their performance.
18. **The provision of uniforms and school books** - was implemented to ensure the program achieve its objectives: motivating students to continue with their schooling and to leave employment in footwear workshops. Uniforms and school books have been to all students in the three MIs in question since 2005.
19. In collaboration with Dinamika Edukasi Dasar (Dynamic Elementary Education, an organisation based in Yogyakarta), Kelompok Kerja Guru (Teachers Working Group) of Ciomas and Taman had given various training programs for teachers and facilitators to strengthen their capacity and increase their understanding of WFCL. This training was designed to upgrade the quality of teachers which, in turn, would serve to motivate pupils to stay at school. This program included, amongst other things, training on teaching methodology, and issues related to child labour.
20. **All of the above activities were supported by a number of other activities**, such as (a) strengthening Koperasi Usaha Bersama (KUBE Cooperative) to help fulfill the needs of families of students at risk of becoming child labourers; (b) disseminating information about hazardous chemicals to teachers and parents; (c) organising regular meetings between parents and teachers to enable parents to assist with their children's studies; and (d) organising an intensive short term Islamic course (*pesantren kilat*) during the fasting month to prevent children from returning to work in footwear workshops. (Note: the numbers of those returning to work usually increases towards the Lebaran holiday at the end of the fasting month when the demand for goods increases sharply).

Elements of Good Practice

1. The extra-curricular and remedial program makes it necessary for children to remain at school until 15.30, three times a week. This means that those children who participate no longer have the chance to work or to help their parents in workshops.
2. The implementation of PMTAS has two main benefits: one is that it involves parents in preparing the supplementary food and thereby increases their understanding about nutritious food and the ways to prepare it cheaply. At the same time, students who received supplementary food experienced a direct

increase in their energy levels, and thus their ability to concentrate longer. This, it is hoped, will in turn lead to an improvement in their academic performance.

3. The trainings given to teachers to become tutors/facilitators of extra-curricular and remedial programs serve two purposes. They not only enhance teaching skills but also increase their knowledge / understanding about the worst forms of child labour and the importance of withdrawing children from such forms of employment to go back to school.
4. Regular meetings between parents and teachers enable both parties to understand the children/students' situation. Better understanding enables them to find the best ways to motivate children to study and continue their schooling (and thus prevent them from dropping out).
5. This program strengthens the network among ILO partners, and thus provides MI students with better access to general knowledge and other information. Many MI students have also benefited from the children creativity centre (Saung Sararea) and the library operated by another ILO's partner (ELSPPAT). Some of the children even took part in a film-making activity in that centre.

Lessons learned

8. The remedial program and the Supplementary Food Program (PMTAS) proved to be effective in decreasing the number of child labourers and in increasing the rate of school attendance. The program will be even more effective if the activities always involve parents of child labourers and other parties in a more organised way.
9. Activities that involve bringing several parties together need to be more thoroughly organised and planned. As the implementation Remedial Program and the Supplementary Food-Intake Program involve many parties, intensive communication among them is crucial to ensure that all activities are coordinated, efficient and punctual.
10. The issue of the worst forms of child labour - which includes employment of children in footwear workshops where hazardous chemicals are used - is a sensitive one. Most parents in the program's location work in footwear workshops and they have limited financial means. Helping parents with this work after school has become a common practice, or even a norm in this community. It is particularly true during the times when the number of orders increases. Children are expected or even 'compelled' to stay out of school in order to help. Given this situation, more capacity building in entrepreneurship and micro financial management is needed among parents of those children employed in the footwear sector. Capacity building in these areas can further increase the numbers of children participating in the education process (including in MIs), and thus decrease the numbers of children employed in this sector

The Way Forward

22. Information to increase understanding about hazardous chemicals in workshops and the importance of education for children needs to be provided not only to parents, but also to other key figures in the relevant community groups. They may include the informal local authority leaders (RT/RW) or religious figures who are able to influence and change parents' attitude so that they no longer require their children to work in footwear production. It is hoped that raising the awareness of key community figures about the importance of education for children and about WFCL will help decrease further the numbers of drop outs.
23. Programs whose implementation requires the involvement of various parties need to focus on the

commitment of each party. The commitment of educational institutions is particularly crucial to ensure that any programs already in operation and have proven to have a positive impact, will continue. In this respect, the Office of Religious Affairs needs to strengthen its network of partners (in particular, with the Education Office) and demonstrate its commitment to continue those programs which have already been implemented, particularly the ones aimed at reducing the number of school drop outs.

24. In order to overcome financial limitations, especially in relation to the Supplementary Food-Intake program, schools need to find supports from the private sector in seeking the provision of nutritious food.
25. Comprehensive and integrated materials need to be developed and provided for teachers in order to increase their understanding of the Convention on the Rights of the Child - particularly about Child Protection, the worst forms of child labour, hazardous chemicals and the importance of children's education.

The Remedial Course and Extra Curricular Program

Increasing the role of teachers in preventing children from working in the footwear sector in the sub district of Tamansari, Bogor

Overview

The first phase of Indonesia's National Action Plan on the Elimination of the Worst Forms of Child Labour has specified five forms of child labour which should be tackled as priorities, one of which is the child labour in the informal footwear sector. To support NAP, ILO-IPEC developed several programs in a number of sub-districts in West Java. Prior to the implementation of the program, several studies⁴ were conducted to collect relevant data on the magnitude of the problem, areas to focus on, and the most suitable intervention.

Based on the data, Tamansari sub district in Bogor was selected to be one of the targeted areas for the implementation of an education focused program to prevent and withdraw school children from child labour. As shown by the data from Tamansari Education Office, three villages in this sub district identified as footwear centres had eleven elementary schools and three Madrasah Ibtidaiyahs (Islamic Elementary Schools); seven of which had the greatest concentration of child labourers. Data collected by PGRI revealed that 376 out of a total 2,303 students in the seven schools were directly involved in footwear production in their respective houses after school hours.

These children had first become involved in production at the age of nine; some as young as seven or eight. As a result - aside from being exposed to work related hazards - they were more likely to drop out of elementary school and those who managed to finish elementary school preferred working to continuing their study.

Taking this into account, PGRI Bogor in collaboration with ILO-IPEC developed a program to prevent children from dropping out of school, namely the remedial and extra curricular program. The program was designed to help those schools with a high absenteeism rate due to sickness, working long hours in shoe-production, or other unexplained reasons. The remedial courses provided extra tuition on subjects examinable in the national exams for child labourers who had been identified at risk of dropping out. The extra curricular activities, on the other hand, gave students a chance to be involved in sports and the arts, in

⁴ A rapid assessment in 2003 and a baseline study in 2004.

accordance with their respective interests. These activities were offered after regular school hours, for two hours, three times a week. The duration and frequency of the programs were designed to ensure that the participants remained longer at school and spent less time working.

How this practice has helped to prevent children from the worst forms of child labour.

“Lots of the parents actually wrote to thank the teachers for helping their children because they had become much more motivated to study.” (*Interview with a teacher – member of PGRI*)

“Teachers reported that there were no longer any children who still worked. I also asked the owners of the workshops and they said that there weren’t any more.” (*Interview with a PGRI committee member.*)

The Girls Volleyball team from the State Elementary School 02 Pasir Angsana, which was made up of students participating in the remedial and extra curricular program (and who had frequently been involved in shoe-production), represented the Tamansari area in Sports and Arts Week for the whole of the Bogor District.” (*Development Report, PGRI, Bogor*).

26. The remedial courses facilitated children to spend more time studying at school, and thus they did not think of rushing home to work.
27. On the whole, the local community came to appreciate the importance of education for children and encouraged the children to study more actively (or certainly for longer than they had been doing before the program started). This appreciation arose after the children began to feel the benefit of the program and the teachers conducted awareness-raising campaign about the importance of education for children.
28. Trainings given to teachers had increased their awareness of WFCL, helped them adopt more creative teaching methods and altered their approach to their students, thereby motivating children to focus more on their study.
29. Home visits, particularly to children who were often absent from school and whose grades were below average, gave the teachers opportunity to meet with parents and increase the parents’ appreciation of the importance of education for their children, as well as their understanding about the worst forms of child labour.
30. Principals of those schools that took part in the program acknowledged that the school had benefited greatly from the fact that many of the students who took part came out with good results in the national exams, and gained achievements in sport.

Preconditions

31. The majority of the local community were of the view that that education was not important. Many of them argued that there were lots of people who had proven to be successful in business despite not having been educated. Taking this situation into consideration, awareness raising campaign was conducted prior to the main program.
32. PGRI compiled basic data about those students who also worked in shoe-production. The data showed that each month an average of 19 students in every school were absent due to sickness, with the highest number being those from the state elementary school Pasir Angsana 02. Aside from that, an average of three students a month were absent with permission and 52 without explanation (the highest number being those from the state elementary school Pasireurih 05). These children were considered at risk of dropping out of school and were thus targeted for the remedial program.

Main activities and results

33. The remedial courses were given two or three times each week for all students in the four state elementary schools and one Islamic elementary school selected for the program, from which a total of 825 students took part. The learning material was compiled by teachers and based on the actual needs of each student, particularly their ability to understand material and solve specific problems. The extra tuitions were given by the subject teachers. The lessons included subjects that were examinable in the national exams, as well as those in which extra training was considered necessary.
34. The extracurricular activities available in the schools before this program was initiated had consisted only of scout group (pramuka). In the new program, a variety of other activities were offered two or three times a week, after school hours. These activities, which included dancing lessons, volleyball practice, and self defence arts, were available to students in grade 3-6. Teachers and students worked together to select the activities that would be available, by considering the hobbies, interests and skills of those involved. These activities were proven to have several benefits. Students voluntarily stayed at school longer, and thus they had less time or chance to



Self defense art



Volley



Dance

work in workshops. Their performance in sports and arts improved, and thus they became more motivated to take part in the activities.

35. Related to the overall program, the local government had cooperated to find a venue which could be used as a local library in each respective village. The library program helped to increase the amount of time students spent studying and, thus, decreased the amount of time they spent working in shoe-production.

Elements of good practice

36. The program has helped to improve students' academic performance, as well as in the field of sports. Many of the students participating in the program got good results in national exams. One school was able to put together a sports team to represent local government in a regional sports event.
37. In both of these programs, the teachers were directly involved and were thus well-placed to observe the improvement of each individual student directly. Home visits enabled teachers to meet and counsel those parents who faced obstacles in helping with their children's education, such that the children's performance had been adversely affected.

38. The approach that teachers adopted during teaching on the remedial and the extra curricular activity programs was different to the old approach taken during regular lessons. This new approach helped students to trust their teachers more and motivated them to work harder. Teachers were more open and informal so that the atmosphere of the class was more relaxed and fun.
39. A climate of democracy was created by virtue of the fact that teachers and students worked together to select extra curricular activities suitable for them.

Lessons learned

40. Teachers need to set a number of choices for extra curricular activities so that students are not suggesting too many different things, based on their own individual interests. Limiting choices will help everyone to focus on what are feasible and will actually make it easier for students to actually make a selection.
41. In a community where parents allow their children to work, or indeed require them to do so even to the extent that they are not aware of their children being involved in hazardous work, child labour has not become an issue. Despite the difficulties, an awareness raising campaign about the importance of education for children and the urgency of tackling the worst forms of child labour is crucial to any programs. Home visits, particularly to those children with poor academic performance and low school attendance, did have a direct positive impact on both the children's performance and parents' awareness about the problem in question. This approach can be an effective strategy to prevent child labour in footwear sector.

The Way Forward

42. Remedial courses are especially necessary for those students who need special help and support, and in most cases, it means child labourers. Considering their difficulties to take part, this kind of support should be planned together with the children in question in the way in which the program is run. In other words, participants should be encouraged to make a plan and a kind of learning contract regarding the schedule, place and target that they wish to achieve.
43. Teachers involved in the remedial program need to receive training on teaching methods and creative thinking, as well as issues related to the Convention on the Rights of the Child, the worst forms of child labour and the importance of education for children. Through this training, it is hoped that they can create a different atmosphere in the remedial classes and extra curricular, so that students find these activities more enjoyable.
44. Giving rewards and opportunities to show what they have achieved in remedial or extra curricular activities is one way of encouraging them to work harder and think more positively about their school experience.
45. The home visit program needs to be carried out more intensively and also needs to involve the school committee. This approach needs to be further strengthened by encouraging teachers to give the parents information about the issue of child labour in an assertive way – direct but not threatening or embarrassing.

Awareness Raising on Child Trafficking among Students of Formal Schools in Four Villages in Banyuwangi District (East Java)

Overview

Following the ratification of ILO Convention No. 182, the Government of Indonesia set up the National Committee for the Elimination of the Worst Forms of Child Labour. The Committee prepared a National Action Plan for the Elimination of WFCL which specified five forms of child labour to be tackled as priorities, one of which is the trafficking of children. To support NAP, ILO-IPEC developed several programs in a number of sub-districts in East Java, where trafficking of children occurs. Various information from NGOs working in the issue of prostitution in East Java reveals that Banyuwangi District is one of those areas where children are most vulnerable to trafficking.

Licin, Segobang, Tamansari and Jelun are among the many villages in Banyuwangi which have been identified as the sending area of trafficked children for prostitution. The vulnerability of these children to trafficking is due to a wide range of economic and socio cultural factors, with poverty, lack of education and low level of awareness of the issue being the most prominent causes.

Many female children dropout of school at junior-high (SMP) level and marry young (younger than 15 years of age). As an illustration, it is estimated that in Licin village approximately 60% of children who graduate from elementary school (SD) do not continue to junior-high school, and that 30% of those who continue to junior-high school either drop out or do not continue their studies to high school (SMA) level.

Awareness raising on child trafficking among school children in the four villages in question is a program strategy of capacity building campaign to combat child trafficking. These activities are intended to increase school children's understanding of issues such as teenage reproductive health, trafficking and unsafe migration, which in turn will motivate them to keep on attending school.

In implementing this awareness raising program, Yayasan Hotline Surabaya (YHS) Banyuwangi worked with the District Office of Education and Unit Pelaksana Tingkat Daerah (the Local Administration Unit at sub district level) as well as with national and Islamic (Madrasah) schools. The main target groups for the program were pupils at elementary (SD) and junior-high school (SMP) level. YHS initially trained specific subject teachers to become facilitators, and trained pupils who were on OSIS (the Committee of the Student Body) to become peer educators. It was expected that having facilitators and peer educators in the same school would lead to synergy in awareness-raising activities in the target schools.

How the program has helped to prevent or withdraw children from WFCL

46. In so far as these activities provided in-depth knowledge about trafficking, especially to children at junior high-school level, they can be said to have been relatively successful in *alerting pupils and teachers to the problem*, thereby preventing it.
47. Involving and training peer educators meant that awareness about and understanding of *issues related to trafficking could be passed-on quickly to other students*, through the use of language that all students were able to understand.
48. By providing training for teachers it was hoped that teachers could become a core team with a role in the socialization of issues related to trafficking. A number of teachers in various junior high schools *were able to identify children who were at risk of becoming victims of trafficking*.
49. On their own initiative, those teachers who had already received training were successful in *spreading information about trafficking to various groups within the community, so that various attempted trafficking incidents were actually prevented*.

As well as training teachers to be facilitators, we also made books available for use by anyone interested in being involved in the efforts to prevent child trafficking. This did not exclude the possibility of students being trained to use these books to share information with their peer group. In this regard, students took the role as *peer educators*

The involvement of students, or children, as a medium for delivering knowledge was considered important because children always listen to what their friends say. Students themselves say “*when we’re with our friends we feel OK about sharing things. Sometimes with teachers we feel scared, especially if the teachers aren’t close to the kids.*”

(Awareness Raising Training Module on child Trafficking: Instructions for facilitators).

Pre-conditions

50. YHS worked together with the Education Office in the relevant area, particularly with Unit Pelaksana Tingkat Daerah (the Local Administration Unit) at kindergarten/elementary and junior-high school level. This cooperation was facilitated by 2 PGRI (Indonesian Teachers Association) board members who held positions as the Head of the Curriculum Section and the Head of the Junior-High School Section. As a result of this cooperation, ***YHS received a lot of assistance in the selection of schools to be involved in the awareness-raising program.*** In addition to this, the invitations issued by UPTD had ensured the participation of the selected teachers in the facilitator training.
51. As a result of previous work with ICMC/ACILS, YHS had identified a number of problems faced by teenagers in Banyuwangi, particularly those in the village of Licin. The data had assisted YHS in the implementation of the first phase of ILO-IPEC Action Program and enabled YHS to develop a module on the prevention of trafficking (this module being, at that stage, a first/initial draft). Through Phase Two of ILO-IPEC Action Program, YHS adapted and finalised the training module to be used in its awareness raising activities among students at elementary (SD/MI) and junior high (SMP/MT) level.
52. Field workers from YHS were local people who knew about the local conditions. This made it easier for YHS to work together and implement outreach for specific parties, in particular school children and teachers.

At first, the books were prepared for teachers who had already been trained to deliver information to students. Initially, students who participated in the program were from years 5 and 6 of elementary school. Subsequently, students from junior-high school took part in the program. We think that the information in the books was principally for those between the ages of 11 and 18. However, in practice we did not involve students at high school level, for a number of reasons. As a result we focused on those at elementary and junior high-school level. We invited 15 elementary schools and 20 junior high schools in the Banyuwangi district to participate in the pilot project for the module that we had developed.

(Awareness Training Module on Child Trafficking: Instructions for Facilitators)

Main activities and Results

53. **Training on the Module to raise student awareness and to prevent child trafficking: Guidance for Facilitators:** This training was given to 22 teachers from 9 elementary schools and 48 teachers from 20 junior high schools. Each group was trained separately so that feedback related to the specific environment and level in the participants' respective schools could be obtained. This feedback was used to improve the implementation of the module so that it fit to the condition of each school. For junior-high level (SMP/MTs), teachers of specific subjects such as Natural Sciences, Social Sciences, Guidance and Counselling, Religious Studies and Sports were selected for training. The purpose was that they could present the contents of the module at an appropriate time and integrate whatever topic in the module in the lessons they were teaching in their respective classes. This training was carried out in two stages: the first stage covered facilitation techniques, issues of trafficking and safe migration, reproductive health and participatory education. The second, follow-on stage provided participants with an understanding of Child Protection Legislation, The Convention on the Rights of the Child, the worst forms of child labour and techniques of victim support, as well as information about victim support networks. YHS involved various partner organisations in the provision of this training, including the Department of Health, Ruang Pelayanan Khusus Polres Banyuwangi ([Special Services Department of Banyuwangi Police) and Forum Penanggulangan Trafiking Perempuan dan Anak (Forum for the Prevention of the Trafficking of Girls and Children) in Banyuwangi.
54. **Awareness raising and information dissemination to students.** Teachers who had already trained as facilitators then put these facilitation skills into practice by undertaking various awareness-raising activities among students in their respective schools (SD/MI and SMP/MTs). This process was facilitated by YHS through the provision of various teaching aids / media related to the topics being delivered by the teachers. At this time, YHS staff were also present to monitor the awareness-raising activities in progress. Overall the teachers were able to reach 152 elementary school pupils and 970 junior-high school pupils and deliver, at the very least, one of the basic materials in the module. An interesting outcome, and what may be termed as an unexpected by-product, was that a number of teachers /facilitators also managed to distribute the information to groups other than the target group such as, members of the community in the area where the teachers lived, students' parents, members of the teacher's own family, and even high school (SMA/SMEA) students (as the teachers in question also happened to teach at high school level).
55. Training of peer educators took place in those schools from which teachers had already been trained as facilitators. The peer educators consisted of 42 members of the Student Body (OSIS) from 14 different junior-high schools. Through this training it was hoped that schools would have the necessary tools for awareness-raising: Teachers, as facilitators, could reach a wider number of students. Students as peer educators have a strategic position to reach members of their peer group, give them an in-depth understanding of the issues and even identify those of their peers at risk of becoming victims of trafficking. Training for peer group educators was given to members of OSIS in each school. The training material was basically the same as that given to teacher-facilitators. It included issues of teenage reproductive health, trafficking, safe migration and violence towards children and was supplemented by training about the principles of peer education, voluntary service, and effective information media. OSIS members were particularly interested in training about developing effective information media and chose a number of methods that they considered suitable for their peers, such as posters, bulletin boards, drama, campaigns via SMS and the internet, counselling and correspondence. Some of the members even came up with the creative suggestion of making a school radio.

Elements of Good Practice

“I teach biology so I’m more focused on reproductive health issues involved in preventing trafficking. Because I couldn’t devote any time specifically to teaching material from the module, I managed to fit material from the module into my biology lessons.” (*Interview with a teacher of a state owned junior-high*).

“In Madrasah Tsanawiyah (MTs /Islamic junior high schools) the target material was included in the local based lessons over the course of two hours every week set aside for this purpose. This is because the timetable was already full so that the material could not be delivered in the course of normal lessons” (*Interview with a teacher at an Islamic junior-high school*)

56. Teachers taking part in the facilitator training demonstrated a commitment to delivering the material well and finding ways/strategies that were suitable for their students; for example by integrating issues from the module into their lessons. These strategies were effective because teachers were able to choose topics and issues to fit in with their lessons.
57. The Module on Student Awareness was designed to be delivered in a flexible way, such that facilitators are able to choose the issues/topics that they consider can be effectively integrated into their subject lessons at any given time. Each issue within the module was deliberately to enable facilitators to prioritise whichever one they feel should be studied in more detail, at an appropriate time.
58. The training made use of adult education techniques, firstly by eliciting personal experiences to be expressed through words or pictures, and then by analyzing these to reach a joint understanding (conclusion). With this approach, students themselves were the most important resource and, at the same time, had the chance for their personal experiences to be ‘heard’.
59. Teacher who had been trained as facilitators became more alert and able to identify students who were at risk of becoming victims of trafficking. A number of cases of attempted trafficking were even successfully identified and prevented. As a result of this heightened awareness, teachers also freely shared information with other groups within the community and their surroundings.
60. The peer group training helped motivate students to develop a number of creative ideas for getting the message across to their peer group members. This peer group training also encouraged other students to share their experiences, be more open and to solve problems together.

Lessons learned

- The implementing agency has cooperated with other (governmental or non-governmental) organizations in an informal way. Nevertheless, this cooperation also needs to be strengthened or institutionalised so that in the event of a change of personnel, joint activities are not disrupted.
- Topics/issues related to teenage reproductive health and trafficking are still considered sensitive subjects to be taught in the mainstream school system. This is especially true of reproductive health issues.
- Teacher-facilitators acknowledged that students at junior high-school level already knew a great deal about the reproductive health issues presented in the module. What was of perhaps more interest to those students was learning how to communicate this material effectively to their peers.

- Teachers at both the elementary and junior high levels felt that the training had helped them learn more about themselves, as well as the problems faced by teenagers. Teachers also felt that the methods used and included in the training enabled them to teach critical thinking skills to their students.
- After teachers had already had chance to test the module in their lessons, an evaluation session was held whereby facilitators had an opportunity to share their experiences of delivering the material within their various schools. Out of this evaluation session there arose a great deal of information and useful suggestions which will enable the module to be finalized and which will help teachers to facilitate more effectively.

The Way Forward

61. **Improving the module:** suggestions about how the contents and the language of the module can be adapted to fit with the various members of the target group need to be elicited through discussions with various groups (in this respect, elementary and junior high-school pupils).
62. **Developing interesting media and teaching-aids:** it is clear that many students already know about reproductive health and trafficking. To improve the module, a number of supporting games and activities, films about the issue (whether documentaries or visualisations /simulations) and similar media need to be developed.
63. **Regular discussion forums:** time needs to be set aside for regular discussion forums among facilitators and, separately, among peer educators. These forums can provide an opportunity to update and extend the knowledge of participants about issues of reproductive health, trafficking, migration and violence.
64. **Formation of a special team:** at a number of schools, students and teachers involved in the training have already identified a number of their peers who are at risk of being trafficked, or even those who have already been victims of trafficking. Thus, in the long term, it is necessary to create a special team trained to deal with cases of trafficking in the school environment. This team also needs to receive training about networking and about parties/organizations that they can contact should the need arise.

Being clever needn't cost a lot!

Overview

Following the ratification of ILO Convention No. 182, the Government of Indonesia set up the National Committee for the Elimination of the Worst Forms of Child Labour. The Committee prepared a National Action Plan for the Elimination of WFCL which specified five forms of child labour to be tackled as priorities, one of which is the trafficking of children. To support NAP, ILO-IPEC developed several programs in a number of sub-districts in East Java, where trafficking of children occurs. Various information from NGOs working in the issue of prostitution in East Java reveals that Banyuwangi District is one of those areas where children are most vulnerable to trafficking.

Licin, Segobang, Tamansari and Jelun are among the many villages in Banyuwangi which have been identified as the sending area of trafficked children for prostitution. The vulnerability of these children to trafficking is due to a wide range of economic and socio cultural factors, with poverty, lack of education and low level of awareness of the issue being the most prominent causes.

Many female children dropout of school at junior-high (SMP) level and marry young (younger than 15 years of age). As an illustration, it is estimated that in Licin village approximately 60% of children who graduate from elementary school (SD) do not continue to junior-high school, and that 30% of those who continue to junior-high school either drop out or do not continue their studies to high school (SMA) level.

Taking the situation into account, ILO-IPEC in collaboration with Yayasan Hotline Surabaya implemented an action program to prevent children from being trafficked through awareness raising campaign. The program strengthened the capacity of a community learning centre in Licin village, namely PKBM Remaja Jenggirat Tangi. The CLC was established with the aim of continuing the work already begun by the collaboration of Yayasan Hotline Surabaya (YHS) and ILO-IPEC to raise community awareness and to give children at risk educational assistance, such as Paket B Study Group and KF Program⁵. In setting up the Centre, YHS Banyuwangi only acted as a facilitator to develop the management capacity of the centre's personnel.

Pre existing conditions

“One of the kids on the Paket B program and the skills training program revealed just how likely these kids are to be affected by trafficking, by talking about what they did before these activities were available: mostly they just stayed at home with nothing to do, or went to work in Bali, doing anything that they could and without regular hours.

A discussion with the staff of YHS and teachers in the village reveals that the educational situation in Licin is a cause for concern: there are lots of kids who have dropped out of school, or who don't continue their education. Most people in the community know that this situation is the direct result of the lack of awareness among parents about the importance of their kid's education: and that this is rooted in the traditions and culture of the area: the fact that there is a high rate of marriage followed by divorce, as well as childhood marriage and there are lots of economic problems (all of these things of course mean that trafficking in girls becomes a real threat)” (*Interview with a member of YHS staff and a teacher in Licin village; July 2007*)

65. The Community Learning Centre (PKBM) Remaja Jenggirat Tangi (REJENGT) in Licin was granted official status by the Banyuwangi District Office of Education on the 6 March, 2006 and registered with the reference 421 – 9/04 PKBM/429.102/2006. Official status has strengthened the CLC considerably as it eases the process of obtaining funds for the centre's activities.
66. Cooperation with the District Office of Education, and in particular with the Section Head of Community /Youth Education and Sport, was strengthened. As a result, financial assistance for the centre's activities was granted readily. This included the provision of financial assistance for small business development activities to help low income families cover the costs of schooling for children.
67. People at grass-roots level, religious organizations (Sifa Un'Nisa) and community organizations (Education & Welfare for the Family – PKK) were all involved in the promotion and implementation of the programs. The Centre compiled a list of those children and young people in Licin who had dropped out of school, and this data was used as a basis for the recruitment of centre members. The data was also used by UPTD PLS (the Local Administration Unit of Non Formal Education at sub district level) and sub district authority to outreach and provide educational funding for school drop-outs.
68. The process which enabled those children and young people who had previously dropped out of school to continue their studies at the centre can be used as a model for other similar programs, especially in relation to the way in which support was garnered from among the local community and from teenagers/young people in the area. Teenagers were involved in deciding how activities

⁵ Non formal education program equivalent to junior high school and Functional Literacy Program

should be set up and run, so that a sense of ownership and responsibility was cultivated amongst them, and amongst the local community.

How the program has helped to prevent Child Trafficking

“It’s good to learn more so that I can protect myself from trafficking. Before I joined this centre, I didn’t understand about those things. Now I feel proud to be a member of the centre, ‘cos it’s just as good as formal education!” (*Member of the Paket B Study Group and the Tailoring course*).

“One of the kids on the program was going to be engaged and married off by their parents but they refused and said that they wanted to continue their studies first!” (*Member of the Paket B Study Group*)

- The Community Learning Centre offered a number of programs, including Paket B Study Group and skills training programs, aimed at those who had dropped out of school, the majority of whom were already working in the tourism industry or other sectors. **By taking the programs, these children no longer thought about continuing their work.**
- Paket B Study Group Program run by the Centre helped to motivate and facilitate those who wished to further their studies at high school level.
- Aside from running the ‘Paket B’, the Centre’s tutors also helped centre members learn about issues related to trafficking, reproductive health, and other issues relevant to children and teenagers.
- Skills training programs, and the formation of small production (business development) cooperatives provided alternative economic activities for teenagers who had dropped out of school.
- The Centre was also instrumental in setting up production cooperatives to raise the economic status of families, particularly those with children who had dropped out of school.

Main activities and results

69. YHS facilitated Training sessions to help the centre’s committee members prepare Strategic Planning and Regular Meetings. One outcome from these sessions was participatory planning of the centre’s activities; another was the development of the concept ‘Being clever needn’t cost a lot’ (*‘Pintar Itu Murah’*), which was then adopted as the centre’s motto and used to promote the importance of education (for children) and, in particular, ‘Paket B’ and Keaksaraan Fungsional (KF). During the course of this training, it was agreed to organise regular meetings to increase understanding on the part of the centre’s staff about material related to reproductive health, trafficking and education.
70. Through discussions with groups of teenagers in the village, needs for skills training were identified. The training included tailoring/sewing, screen printing, farming and bamboo crafts. To implement this training, PKBM selected a number of bases close to the target groups in various villages. The bases were the houses of those within the community who were prepared to lend them for the training activities, at pre-arrange times. Each place/training centre was run by the group of teenagers that used it. The total number of children and young people between the ages of 13 and 18 who that took part in this skills training was 96 (84 girls and 12 boys).

71. Alongside these skills training activities, small business units were formed amongst those who took part in the training. There were five such units, each of which consisted of between 8-10 people. They produced:
1. necklaces, bracelets and earrings.
 2. the muslim-headscarfs .
 3. visual aids for Early Childhood Education.
 4. Bags.
 5. And the last one ran a shop selling sewing equipment
72. The Paket B was facilitated by tutors recruited from women and young people in the community. The centre, in collaboration with the Non Formal Education Section of the Education Office, trained tutors of the Paket B program. 'Paket B' comprised 12 different subjects, taught by 6 different tutors. This program was arranged to fit in with the time available to those who participated. Aside from providing Paket B, the centre also assisted a group of grown ups studying Functional Literacy with funding from the local government.
73. The CLC's staff collected data about students who were at risk of dropping out and found 175 SD/MI and SMP/MTs students of this category. Among this number, 100 were selected to receive funding (from the local government) to enable them to take part in national exams, and to meet their other schooling requirements. In selecting these 100 students, the centre's staff visited parents to verify the data. Funding was then given to those who genuinely qualified to receive it.

Elements of good practice

74. The local community supported the centre's activities, including offering their houses for venues. Members of Syifa Un'Nisa (Islamic women organisation) were involved in running the centre and assisting its students.
75. Teenagers involved with the centre felt a sense of ownership and demonstrated a high level of commitment in running the activities in their respective locations. This was due to the fact that they had been involved in the project from the very beginning: in deciding venues and schedule for training, managing budgets, and actually participating in the activities.
76. The centre's activities in each location were offered at flexible schedules, to fit in with the participants' free time. In setting the schedule, both tutors and participants (boys and girls) discussed and suggested appropriate times in accordance with their own situation and conditions. In itself this process entailed a valuable lesson in the democratic process, and also served to open a dialogue between tutors and members.

Lessons learned

- The commitment of the tutors towards ensuring that lessons take place on time has a significant influence on members of the Paket B Study Group, as well as those in the functional literacy and skills training programs. During evaluation sessions facilitated by YHS, it became apparent that tutors' punctuality and consistency had a direct correlation with the numbers of participants.
- Flexibility in setting the timetable for lessons/ training is something that has to be openly discussed with members. Most members of the centre, especially boys, had many other activities, either they helped their parents in the fields, or were already employed elsewhere, so that the time available for studying was limited.
- The teaching methods and the way in which the students are approached are key to the success of Paket B, as well as the centre's other activities. Tutors need to take an approach

that would enable members, who have already dropped out of school and who are, for the most part, already working, to enjoy the lessons. Enjoyable lessons will help them to concentrate for longer periods of time.

- Curriculum design for Paket B presented one of the biggest challenges for tutors. Although the National Education Department (Depdiknas- in this case, Directorate General of Non Formal Education) issued the curriculum of Paket B on time, this was often distributed to the centre (via the local education office, in this case Local Administration Unit of Non Formal Education - UPTD PLS) late, with the result that it did not accord with the time available. In this condition, the centre's tutors need to prepare contingency plans to ensure the learning process is not hindered.

The Way Forward

77. Raising awareness amongst the community (in particular parents) about the importance of education for children needs to be carried out alongside comprehensive and concrete education about the Convention on the Rights of the Child. One example was the program of arranging children's birth certificates. This activity directly raised awareness amongst the community, particularly parents, about the importance of birth certificates as a form of identification which is children's right to have, and which also has the practical benefit of allowing children to register for formal schooling.
78. The implementation of Paket B and C Study Group Program should consider the geographical characteristics and needs of the local community. As an illustration, Department of Education requires a minimum of 40 participants to run this this program. This requirement was a significant obstacle for the Licin area, due to its location and the prevailing local conditions (such as a low level of understanding among the community about the importance of education for children). Because of this, efforts should be made towards seeking the agreement of the District Education Department to a different format of program (such as, a lower minimum number of members, or cooperation between a number of centres in proximity to offer the national exam package)
79. Management of the centre needs to cooperate with organisations of the same type at sub district or district level to develop efforts to raise the economic status of families so that they do not have to struggle with the cost of education. Forms of small scale business groups or cooperatives which make use of revolving capital need to be explored so that initiatives such as this can reach more poor families and prevent migration (particularly of groups of teenagers who feel that they are not able to develop businesses in their own villages).
80. The District Education Department should give a comprehensive support to the staff in managing the CLC, including financial management, recruitment and capacity building, program development and implementation, community-based activities and so on. Such comprehensive support would increase the sustainability of the program because, in the process, it enables the local community to run such programs and activities independently.

INCREASING PARTICIPATION OF CHILDREN IN SCHOOL ACTIVITIES, IN THE SUB-DISTRICTS OF MUARA KOMAM AND BATU SOPPANG, PASER DISTRICT, EAST KALIMANTAN

“PARTICIPATION OF CHILDREN IN BECOMING AUTONOMOUS IN PREVENTING CHILD LABOUR”

BACKGROUND

Informal gold mining activity in the sub-districts of Batu Soppang and Muara Komam in Paser district has occurred and been passed on through generations for over a quarter of a century. Although it is not financially rewarding due to its speculative nature and increasingly depleted gold seams, gold panning by the community continues to be a primary source of livelihood. Among the negative effects emerging from this illegal activity is the increasing number of child labourers directly involved in the mining sites, where they are exposed to a range of hazards.

A baseline survey by the ILO in 2004 revealed that there were 245 children working in the informal mining sector in the two sub-districts above. As many as 17 children were found working in the mining unit and 228 children around the unit. The study also noted that there was a wide range of economic and socio cultural factors behind the situation. Poverty, poor education quality, and the lack of awareness about child labour issue have forced children to drop out of school and start work at a very early age.

The formal school system is not valued by the informal mining community for two main reasons; the poor quality of teaching-learning process and the low opinion of education. Government funds have always been too limited to offer quality education that allows children to enjoy the lessons. Children find immediate income to be much more attractive than studying because in school they have to work at dull subjects, while in the mining sites they are able to find gold which can be used to supplement pocket money. This situation is made worse by teachers who, instead of using more persuasive methods, tend to give punishments to child labourers who miss school or do not perform well.

Considering the immediate need for enhancement of teachers' quality and education process that monitor children's achievement and development, the Education Council of Paser District in collaboration with ILO-IPEC implemented an action program called **“The Prevention of Child Labour by Increasing the Participation of Children in School Activities”**. The 18 month program targeted 810 students (421 boys and 396 girls) in 4 Junior High Schools/Islamic Junior High Schools/Open Junior High Schools and 5 Elementary Schools in the two sub districts. The Elementary School program focused on students from grades 4-6, while the Junior High School program at all grade levels.

OVERVIEW OF BATU SOPPANG AND MUARA KOMAM

Batu Soppang sub-district has 14 villages, 2 of which - Muara Kajang (Legai) and Busui (Mandaru) - are supposed to have a reasonable amount of gold. The Muara Komam sub-district consists of 11 villages, 3 of which, Batu Butok, Uko and Muara Payang, are known to be very active in the informal gold-mining activities. Although there are 8 local and international coal-mining companies providing employment for a reasonably big number of local people, unemployment rate is still quite high and many people still work in informal gold mining. The two sub districts which have their own gold-panning community also receive a flow of migrants from other villages, who do not have the skills, education and potential to enter the competitive labour market.

MAIN PROGRAM

At the beginning of the program, teachers and student organizations were trained for two days. The material

included program orientation, the issue of child labour and technical material such as the remedial program, understanding of the teaching material, developing creative student skills through bulletin board, basic school health care, along with school library development. The training team was made up from the ILO, Education Office of Paser District, Education Council, LSM Realitas (an NGO), Batu Soppang sub-district Health Centre and journalists from the newspaper 'Tribun Kaltim'.

Increasing children's interest in learning by improving the quality of teaching

The low quality of teaching-learning process in schools is a cause of failure among students. In order to increase the quality of teaching-learning process, the Education Council provided training for teachers to improve their teaching skills, their understanding of teaching materials, and their capacity in conducting remedial courses. The training sessions were given using a teaching module developed by the Ministry of National Education, called PAKEM which stands for Pembelajaran Aktif Kreatif Efektif dan Menyenangkan (Active, Creative, Effective and Fun Learning).

The remedial course became the primary approach to increase students' interest because many students had been found struggling in their studies at the regular school sessions due to the lack of effective teaching and their low class attendance. This program was run in the afternoon three times a week after students had a break for 120 minutes. Although all students were involved, the program focused more on children from poor families who had poor academic achievement and were the most vulnerable to child labour. Apart from providing extra tuition and improving students' academic achievement, the remedial program was intended to reduce the amount of time they spent working in the mining sites. As a result of their participation in the remedial program, students did not experience as much difficulty when taking exams and thus they could readily move on up to the next grade level or graduate from school.

As follow up activities of Child Labour Monitoring training by ILO, the teachers in respective schools conducted regular monitoring to ensure the program achieved its objectives. The monitoring, which covered several aspects such as students' attendance in regular and remedial classes, their participation in extracurricular / after school activities (library, bulletin board, and school health) and academic performance, indicated that the program has dramatically increased the number of students who graduated from schools and were prevented from child labour. After the remedial program, the number of students who graduated from the schools targeted for this program increased by 32%.

Improving students' and teachers' competence through alternative activities in schools

School magazines are one of the most effective and easy means to channel the aspirations of students, especially those competent in the area of writing and drawing. In addition, school magazines or bulletin boards, can also be used as a tool for passing on information or messages from school. The ILO-Education Department action program helped students to improve the quality of the bulletin boards which had been rarely utilized, uninteresting and uninformative. Training in creating and improving bulletin boards was given to students and complemented with training for teachers to enable them to help students in the process of managing the bulletin boards. Students also received basic journalism training, which enabled them to use good writing technique and to evaluate the bulletin boards themselves.

In relation to the child labour issue, school bulletin boards are an effective vehicle for the campaign against child labour. The bulletin boards provided captions for pictures or articles which highlight the child labour problem and proved to have opened up a creative path for students. Students became more motivated to get involved in managing the bulletin boards as the contents became increasingly attractive.

Developing a culture of healthy life habits through school based health programs

The program improved the service of Public Health Centre (Puskesmas) of Batu Soppang sub district in assisting the School Health Service (UKS) in the target schools. Health workers from the Puskesmas made monthly visits to check the students' health condition and give advice concerning the health risks of working

in the mining sites to child labourers and those students who were at risk of becoming child labourers. Health workers found many students who had symptoms of illness, for example itching or sunburn, due to working in the informal mining sector.

In addition to working with UKS, the Education Council works side-by-side with LSM Realitas in training student organizations and teachers using the School Based Health Program module. The module consists of discussions about general health, environmental health, food and nutrition, and the health risks of working in hazardous places. Each discussion includes a simple case-study to explore and solve together. Raising the awareness about the hazards of mercury is part of the discussion about the risks of working in the informal gold mining sector.

Varied and enjoyable methods used in the module have enabled children to promote the health campaign to other children in daily interaction at school. This awareness raising campaign about the hazards of working in informal gold mining sector was also implemented through UKS activities and articles or caricatures displayed on the wall magazines. The hazards of working in informal mining sector were also explored in the PE and sports modules. To complement the above activities, materials containing messages about issues of children's education and health in the form of posters, calendars, mugs, cups were distributed to the students and community.

Improving students' interest in reading through the school library program

In order to the students' and teachers' interest in reading, the program improved the quality of libraries in all the targeted schools. The libraries were given text books, educational fiction, maps and teaching aids so that they could serve their function as one of the primary sources of learning for students and teachers. Representatives from the Public Library of Paser District, facilitated some training sessions about the management and organisation of school libraries.

Book donations and library management improvement has increased students' interest in reading, and thus their reading skills. The number of library visits has increased by 400%. As an illustration, in the school year 2005/2006, the library of Batu Soppang Junior High School 1 was visited by an average of 50 people a month, but in the school year 2006/2007 the number of visits averaged 250 people a month.

SUCCESS FACTORS OF THE PROGRAM

1. Junior High School student organizations play an active role in the program.
2. In general, teachers from each school have a high level of dedication, involvement and support for the elimination of child labour through school activities.
3. State Junior High School 1, Batu Kajang, took the initiative to get additional financial support for remedial activities from BOSDA and BOS (Regional and National government's subsidy), as the funding from the ILO was only enough to cover the cost of the remedial activities for students of grade 8 and 9.
4. The strong equal relationships between the implementing agency and the educational institutions on location, including the District Office of Education, PGRI (the Indonesian teachers association) and school committees, helped the program to make good progress.

RESULTS AND RECOMMENDATION

Successes

- By the end of May 2007, as many as 732 children, 350 girls and 382 boys, had taken part in the program, and thus been prevented from child labour.

- The number of students passing the final examination in all junior high schools targeted by the program increased by an average of 32% from the academic year 2004/2005 to 2005/2006.
- There has been an increase of awareness among the teachers about the importance of paying attention to students at risk of child labour and setting up controls in schools. This is indicated by the monthly report from teachers and schools filling in the monitoring form. The teachers have taken the initiative to motivate students to monitor and to protect their peers who are at risk of leaving school to work.
- The students have become more independent in their participation in the prevention of child labour through bulletin boards, library and school based health improvement activities. By taking part in these activities students get more information, knowledge and motivation which encourage them to continue with their schooling and not begin work at an early age.

Challenges

1. Sustaining the program is the major challenge for all stakeholders as the budget available from the central and local government is not yet adequate just to cover basic needs to run these schools. Funding from BOSDA (regional government' subsidy) should be obtained by presenting programs similar to the one being implemented by ILO-Education Committee.
2. Progress in each school varies due to several factors, including the competence and commitment of school principals and teachers, the rotation of teachers involved with student activities to work in different schools or areas, and the limited budget to support and enrich the activities.
3. Without the support from ILO-Education council, the schools have limited capacity to continue monitoring child labour by themselves.

CHILDREN, YOUTH AND COMMUNITY RESOURCE CENTRES IN MUARA KOMAM AND BATU SOPANG, PASER DISTRICT, EAST KALIMANTAN

INTEGRATED EDUCATION FOR CHILDREN, FAMILIIES AND COMMUNITY

BACKGROUND

Informal gold mining activity in the sub-districts of Batu Soppang and Muara Komam in Paser district has occurred and been passed on through generations for over a quarter of a century. Although it is not financially rewarding due to its speculative nature and increasingly depleted gold seams, gold panning by the community continues to be a primary source of livelihood. Among the negative effects emerging from this illegal activity is the increasing number of child labourers directly involved in the mining sites, where they are exposed to a range of hazards.

A baseline survey by the ILO in 2004 revealed that there were 245 children working in the informal mining sector in the two sub-districts above. As many as 17 children were found working in the mining unit and 228 children around the unit. The study also noted that there was a wide range of economic and socio cultural factors behind the situation. Poverty, poor education quality, and the lack of awareness about child labour in the community force children to drop out of school and start work at a very early age.

The program developed by the ILO and the East Kalimantan PKBI (Indonesian Family Planning Association) was to focus on increasing awareness and understanding in the community so that child labour would no longer be seen as a natural event. The program was to establish 'Children, Youth and Community Resource Centre' in which non formal education was offered to help children, who were already working and who had not been in schooling for a long time, to get access to educational activities. It also aimed to prevent children from dropping out of school through awareness raising activities involving children, families and the community.

OVERVIEW OF BATU BUTOK VILLAGE

Batu Butok is a village in the sub-district of Muara Komam, Paser District, in the Province of East Kalimantan. This village has about 400 families of which about 95% work in the informal gold mining sector. Many are migrants, mostly from the neighbouring province of South Kalimantan. Formal schools from Elementary to High School/Islamic High School are available to develop the human resources of Muara Komam, but they are not valued by the informal mining community, which has a low of opinion of education. These schools in general can accommodate the children, but they are not spread evenly, so some areas are not within reach of formal educational facilities. Worse still, parents of the children who rarely or never attend school do not prevent them from working because they too have not been to school and thus do not appreciate education for their children.

STRATEGIES AND MAIN PROGRAM

The action program implemented by PKBI consists of 2 phases and targeted 224 child labourers aged 10-17 years (101 male, and 123 female), 280 children at high risk of child labour age 7-15 years (125 male and 155 female) and 750 families in three villages. The program not only concerned with informal educational activities in the centres, but also touching on health activities, skills training and pre-school education services.

The strategies and approaches which were employed include:

Optimizing the participation of children and families in awareness raising campaign about child labour issues by recruiting and training peer educators

Having peer educators is considered one of the most effective ways to quickly transfer knowledge. Children

accept information from their peers more readily than from an adult, because they use the same language and they can become friends. Working on this assumption, ILO-PKBI East Kalimantan identified potential children, taking into consideration their education and their experience in activities outside school, to be trained as peer educators in the *child to child* mode. In order to make them effective, they were trained for 3 days, in which time they were provided with the means of passing information on to their friends. The training, which was given by trainers from PKBI and YKAI (Indonesian Foundation for Children's Health), used a training module which was made based on PKBI's experience in facilitating groups of peer tutors for reproductive health activities. In this respect, ILO gave advice on modifications appropriate to the training purpose - that is to reduce child labour through the 'child to child' approach. So far, 60 children (24 girls and 36 boys) have already taken part in the peer educator program.

To complete the peer educator team, the ILO-PKBI East Kalimantan also trained a group of adults who were concerned with educational issues and actively involved in organizations such as school committees, so that they can help increase the awareness among adults. Both groups of peer educators were strengthened to enable them to use a simple format for monitoring the progress of the program. Their primary role was to take and record data on the number of children in the location where they work at the beginning of every month. If they found children participating in the program still working, they talked to those child labourers and their families to find solution.

Increasing community awareness about the value of education through the provision of various learning resources

Providing Study Resources for Children and Young People

Using the village meeting room provided by the local government as an activity centre, various simple facilities were provided. A library with a collection of educational resources for all ages and information books about child labour was established. Several computers were provided to give basic computer skill training for interested children and teenagers. Drawing on PKBI's experience, counselling services were offered to help children solve their problems and to build closer relations between PKBI staff and the children.

Establishing Pre-School Education (Kindergarten)

The relevance of early childhood education to child labour issue is not obvious, but on closer examination pre-school age children in the areas where child labour is common are at risk of becoming child labourers in the future. Low educational stimulation among pre-school children is a factor which may lead parents to fail to give their children the opportunity to have formal education. Through the pre-school program and simple learning methods, children will gain knowledge and parents will be exposed to messages about school and child labour.

The involvement of local teenagers as tutors in this program has enhanced the effectiveness of the program and ensured its sustainability. Through their close interaction with the community, the program has influenced the view of parents about education and child labour. It is evident in the increasing number of children who joined pre-school education and the number of parents who have withdrawn their children from work.

Community Health Services

To tackle the worst forms of child labour, such as that in the informal gold mining sector, health service program is strategic. The direct action in the form of health examinations by medical staff from the sub district public health centre (clinic) provided a doorway through which messages about the hazards of working at a young age could be disseminated. To attract the community to use the services, infant and school contests were held jointly between the Office of Education, the Office of Public Health and six elementary schools in the targeted villages.

Skills training for Young People and Adults

Informal gold mining activities not only exposes the workers to a wide range of hazards and causes a large scale damage to the environment, but also gives little financial rewards. The workers earn less and less due to the decreasing amount of gold in the gold seams and the government's plans to close the operations of illegal mines. People cannot find different sources of income or employment because they do not have the required skills. In order to help them find alternative work possibilities, work skills (carpentry) training was given to groups of adults and male young people who had reached the minimum age to work.

The work skills training was designed by both the implementing agency and the group targeted for the training, taking into consideration the local resources and the needs of the community. The trainers were vocational instructors, who had the experience of teaching community groups and the specific expertise in making furniture and educational toys (APE-alat permanen edukatif). This group has already been producing goods, some of which are being used for educational activities in local pre-school. PKBI Balikpapan which already has the experience of producing and marketing the educational toys produced by youth workshops assists the new group in Paser.

In addition to this, training on a variety of skills was given to different groups in the community. In collaboration with PKK (Family Welfare Education) of Paser district, PKBI organised culinary training to teach female groups to make cookies for commercial purpose. Some people were trained to do acupressure or health 'massage' which is locally regarded not only as a method to promote health, but also treatment for illnesses.

SUCCESS FACTORS OF THE PROGRAM

- Various approaches were employed, firstly focused on aspects which have an immediate bearing on the needs of the community, namely health and education.
- The implementing agency had the experience and strong networking with various parties, particularly government and educational organizations.
- In general, the community and the local government supported the program to prevent and eliminate the worst forms of child labour by active participation in all the programs.

RESULTS AND RECOMMENDATION

Results

1. With the support of East Kalimantan Provincial Office of Social Welfare, 6 children who had previously dropped out of school and involved in gold mining activities, were referred back to free formal education in Panti Anak Dharma Anak Samarinda. Despite the small number, these children can become good role models for other children
2. Having participated in the training, the targeted children became more capable of working together in organizations and of passing on information regarding child labour through participative methods.
3. The community has become more awareness of the risks of working in the hazardous sector. It is indicated by the declining number of child labourers and people's active participation in community based groups to increase awareness among parents about sending their children to school and preventing them from child labour.
4. At the end of May 2007, 157 children (88 girls and 69 boys) had been withdrawn from work, and 401 children (175 girls and 226 boys) had been prevented from child labour.

5. The carpentry group has been producing quality products and providing a new source of livelihood.
6. The number of volunteers who work in the centre and help with the program has increased from just 2 people to 6 people.
7. The embryonic form of a local foundation to continue the pre-school educational services has been established through the assistance of PKBI branch in Paser District.

Challenges

8. Pre-school education services will need further funding and other kinds of support from the Office of Education, while the carpentry group will need marketing assistance and further training from the Department of Industry.
9. In order to sustain the program, particularly the process of keeping children to study, to stay away from work, to benefit from the resource centre, the implementing agency needs to transfer its knowledge, expertise, experience and skills to other stakeholders, particularly to the peer educators group. It is not an instant process but might take some time to bring about.

OPEN JUNIOR HIGH SCHOOL IN KALIAN DALAM, WEST KUTAI

RETURNING CHILDREN TO FORMAL SCHOOLING: EFFECTIVE STEPS IN TACKLING CHILD LABOUR

BACKGROUND

Informal gold mining activity in the sub district of Tering, the district of West Kutai, has occurred and been passed on through generations for over a quarter of a century. Although it is not financially rewarding due to its speculative nature and increasingly depleted gold seams, gold panning by the community continues to be a primary source of livelihood. Among the negative effects emerging from this illegal activity is the increasing number of child labourers directly involved in the mining sites, where they are exposed to a range of hazards.

A rapid assessment⁶ by ILO revealed that there were 75 children working in the informal mining sector in the village of Kalian Dalam, subdistrict of Tering, Kutai Barat District. Poverty, poor education quality, and the lack of awareness about child labour in the community force children to drop out of school and work in the informal gold mining sector where they are exposed to a range of hazards. They have to work hard panning gold for more than 10 hours a day, dive under the water without breathing equipment up to 6 meter deep and handle mercury with bare hands. The study also noted that very few children continue their education to junior high school because going to regular high school nearby means enduring a journey of 2-4 hours everyday over land and river.

In order to prevent children from the worst forms of child labour, ILO and Yayasan Pembangunan Sendawar Sakti (a local NGO focusing on education and empowering the community) implemented an action program to set up for Open High School education. The program was formulated through a process of participatory planning with the community and in consideration of the geographical conditions of Kalian Dalam. Open Junior High School is also in line with the government's program of 9 Year Compulsory Basic Education.

⁶ Rapid Assessment by ILO and the Laboratory of Anthropology, University of Indonesia, concerning Child Labour in the Informal Gold-Mining Sector in Kutai Barat, Kalimantan Timur, 2002

OVERVIEW OF KALIAN DALAM

Kalian Dalam is a remote village in the sub-district of Tering, in the district of West Kutai, East Kalimantan Province. This village has 1,356 residents making up 346 households. Around 80% of them are migrants from the islands of Java and Sulawesi, the remainder hail from East Kalimantan or other areas. The data collected in the field up to May 2007 noted 4 heads of households are employed as civil servants, 37 as entrepreneurs, 65 as farmers and 240 as casual labourers/self-employed. More than 90% of them are involved in the informal gold-mining sector with minimal income and are dependent on whether or not they find gold. Their only means of basic formal education is just the State Elementary School 11, Tering, which can accommodate all school-age children 6-13 years in Kalian Dalam. Children who go to junior high schools in the town of the sub district have to take a journey of 2.5 hours by boat or 1.5 hour by land transport when the weather conditions are good.

STRATEGIES AND APPROACH

In efforts to free the village of Kalian Dalam from child labour, ILO supported YPSS in running an action program from November 2004 until January 2006 for the first phase and from March 2006 until June 2007 for the second phase. The action program was intended not only to withdraw children from work, but also to prevent them from the worst forms of child labour in informal gold-mining sector. The two target groups – children who have been working and children at risk - come from families where one or both parents also work in the informal gold-mines. Through phase I and II, this action program has reached:

- 99 female and male children, aged 13-17 years, who became students at Open Junior High School straight after they had finished elementary school or after they had dropped out for some time.
- 212 female and male children aged 6 -12 years at the local elementary school who would continue schooling at Open Junior High School.

Establishing an Open Junior High School to Improve Access to Education

The retrieval program in Kalian Dalam initiated by the Education Office of Kutai Barat had not been very effective due to budget constraints and the remote location of Kalian Dalam. The teachers assigned for this program had to cover a great distance to reach the students. Teaching and learning sessions had taken place only twice a week, on Saturday and Sunday, and this created a situation in which children had plenty of time to work and the learning process was not effective. On the advice of the ILO-YPSS and support from the community, the status of the retrieval program was changed to Open Junior High School from the school year 2005/2006.

Considering the conditions of the area and the human resources available, it was not possible to recruit facilitating teachers / tutors for Open Junior High School with ideal standards. The program recruited six local staff, who were teachers in the local elementary or community members with Senior High School education, to facilitate the students. The local elementary school classrooms were used for the Study Centre four days a week. The community gave positive response to the increase in study time, the availability of local teachers, as well as other means of learning. The frequency of tutors' visits from Junior High School 10, Sendawar Long Iram, has increased from once a week during phase I to twice a week in phase II, despite the fact that the distance from the Induk Junior High School to the Study Centre is a 1.5 hour walk over land in good weather or 2 hours by boat on the river. The high cost river transportation makes walking the preferred alternative, but the conditions of the roads to Kalian Dalam are very poor in the rainy season and increases the journey time to 4 hours.

Increasing the Competence of the Teaching Staff

Bearing in mind that the competence of the teachers determines the quality of the students being taught, a training program was run to increase the competence of the tutors who had limited experience and expertise. The trainer comes from the Regional Administration Unit (UPTD) of the Provincial Education Office, specializing in Open Junior High School. The participants consisting of tutors and visiting teachers from

SMP Induk were trained to develop teaching materials, use the most effective teaching methods, and evaluate students' achievement.

The tutors' competence was further enhanced through an integrated technical training given by the Principal of the Model Open Junior High School in East Kalimantan in May 2005. After the training, participants applied the new information in understanding the subjects, facilitating independent study for students, improving the management in the Study Centre and at Induk Junior High School, and disseminating messages about the risks of working in hazardous sector. ILO also gave training concerning child labour and monitoring, so that the tutors understood the correlation between the Open Junior High School program and the efforts of eliminating child labour.

Increasing Learning Motivation through Learning Resources at the Study Centre

Aside from providing standard learning materials – the program established a library with a collection of educational books, fictions, and also visual aids to support teaching learning process. The teachers managed the library and at the same time taught the students to run it so that they could gradually take over its management. The library, which provided services for elementary school students and open junior high school students, has improved students' interest in reading, their knowledge, and their awareness of the risks of working in informal gold mining sector.

Another extra learning resource was the School-Based Health Program (Program Kesehatan Berbasis Sekolah). The local community health centre and the NGO Realitas developed a module to teach students about healthy life style and gave periodic basic health checks. Through this program, children were given information about the hazards of mercury in a simple and practical way. The module contained discussion about general health, environmental health, healthy food and the health risks of working in dangerous places. Each discussion was complemented by a simple case study to be explored together.

Sustaining the Program by Establishing One Roof Elementary and Junior High School

Through the efforts of all stakeholders in Kalian Dalam, proposal was prepared, land was granted, government's support through the Local Office of Education was obtained to change the status of the current Open Junior High School into Junior High School One Roof starting from the school year 2007/2008.

The agreement concerning the establishment of a Junior High School under One Roof in Kalian Dalam was signed in April 2007 in Tarakan. In accordance with the guidelines for establishing a one roof school, a block grant of Rp.300,000,000,- (three hundred million rupiah) will be given by the central government. In the second year and each year after, the district government will grant the operational funding from the District Budget.

Increasing awareness of parents and community about the risks of working at an early age

Meetings between the implementing agency, the School Committee, the local village government and the community were held regularly to evaluate and discuss the progress of the Open Junior High School. In these meetings messages concerning the hazards of working at early age, particularly in the informal gold mining sector, were passed on.

This awareness raising campaign was strengthened by other activities. In collaboration with the Office of Environment, Kutai Barat District, in conjunction with ILO disseminated material concerning the hazardous effects of mercury to health. Home visits to families of children who had falling grades were used to involve parents as the main force in encouraging children to stay in education. All these awareness raising activities have contributed to the establishment of the Junior High School under One Roof.

SUCCESS FACTORS OF THE PROGRAM

1. Educational intervention is an effective approach to protect the basic rights of children, so that they can reach full mental and spiritual development in the future.
2. The establishment of an Open Junior High School and Junior High School under One Roof was in line with the Government Strategic Plan in the education sector, namely providing 9 year compulsory basic education.
3. Active involvement / participation of the community, stakeholders and the government at all levels is crucial to ensure that the program achieved its objectives.
4. The program had a simple design, but was focused. All activities, from teacher training to awareness raising campaign, were focused on providing children with access to junior high school education.

Results

5. By 31 January 2007, as many as 49 children (24 female, 25 male) had been withdrawn from work, and 260 children (118 female, 142) had been prevented from child labour.
6. The number of children graduating from school and those moving up a grade level was 100% in 3 years in a row, with accumulated grades at the highest average among all the Study Centres administered by SMP Induk.
7. The fact that many new students from villages outside Kalian Dalam entered the open junior high school is an evident of the confidence in the quality of the service.
8. There was an increase in students' self-confidence to continue education to senior high school or similar level (60% of those graduating went on to senior high schools or similar level in Kutai Barat and even Samarinda)
9. There was committed support from the government evidenced by the scholarships to UT (Open University) for 4 out of 6 senior teachers, each of whom got Rp 3 million.
10. There was an increase in awareness among parents and the community about children's rights, followed with concrete steps of preventing children from working in the informal mining sector.
11. The community showed a high commitment to education and were successful in establishing Junior High School under One Roof in Kalian Dalam.

Challenges:

- Although Junior High School under One Roof will soon be established in the school year 2007/2008, the low quantity and quality of the educational staff requires the District Education Office to pay more attention to the new school to ensure the quality of the services equivalent to that of regular schools. Poor quality teaching will deteriorate children's interest in education and there is a concern that this will lead to the children's return to work.
- In order to ensure the sustainability, The Junior High School under One Roof should be independent in terms of management and finance.
- The Junior High School under One Roof should have the capacity to accommodate students graduating from 5 elementary schools in the area around Kalian Dalam to meet the requirement of the District Education Office for changing the status.
- The community economy is still weak and it needs government's support to make an alternative program of employment, for example rubber plantation. Better economic condition will improve access to education.

VOCATIONAL TRAINING FOR MEMBERS OF PKBM (COMMUNITY LEARNING CENTRE) IN NANGROE ACEH DARUSSALAM PROVINCE (NAD)

BACKGROUND

The earthquake and tsunami in Nanggroe Aceh Darussalam (NAD) on 26 December 2004 was estimated to have killed more than 118,000 people. Many children were orphaned or separated from their parents. Homes, schools and other community facilities were destroyed and about 500,000 were made homeless. The local economy was shattered, the local administration decimated, and much of Aceh's infrastructure razed to the ground. Many families lost their established sources of income and livelihood and were forced to rely on aid from various sources.

In the immediate future as well as in the longer term, the loss of family livelihoods will have many negative consequences for children. Experience in disaster zones elsewhere in the world has shown that when families lose livelihoods, children are often likely to drop out of school and start to work. These children are very vulnerable to becoming involved in the worst forms of child labour. An additional risk in Aceh was the enrolment of children in armed conflict between separatist groups and the Indonesian government.

In order to prevent vulnerable children entering the worst forms of child labour, ILO and the Provincial Office of Education implemented an action program which provided vocational training through PKBMs (Community Learning Centres) in Aceh to help children who had previously dropped out of school find decent work opportunities.

OVERVIEW OF PKBMs (Community Learning Centres) IN NAD PROVINCE

To answer the need for education facilities, The Ministry of Education facilitated the establishment of PKBMs which are managed and organised by the local communities to provide non formal education. A unit of PKBM can provide a range of education and training services, from Pendidikan Anak Usia Dini (PAUD-Early Childhood Education) Taman Kanak-Kanak (TK - Kindergarten), Paket A, B, C (Non formal education equivalent to primary, junior and senior high school), language courses, life skill training, business units, to libraries. The Local Education Office in the respective area records and gives accreditation to each PKBM.

NAD has a considerable number of PKBMs, but only 11 of them are managed well and still play their role to provide education services⁷. One of these eleven is PKBM PKPS which has successfully exported their products to Japan. However, most other can only subsist and have very limited capacity due to various constraints - limited funding from the local Education Office, difficulties in marketing their products, unprofessional management, the lack of understanding about PKBMs' visions and missions among the members, and the lack of service variety offered to the communities. In spite of this, PKBMs can become a potential channel to deliver education and training services for children outside the formal education system.

MAIN PROGRAM

The PKBMs targeted for this program are located in Banda Aceh, Aceh Besar, and Aceh Utara. The program strategy was strengthening the capacity of these PKBMs through coordinating regular meetings among local and international organisations supporting the PKBMs, developing PKBMs models, and organising vocational training to enable participants to set up their own business, to organise business groups or to become self employed. The program also aimed at increasing the number of PKBMs which can manage, finance and develop their own business.

Carpentry Training

The four week carpentry training, which was held at PKBM Mobile Mandiri Banda Aceh and PKBM Tunas

⁷ Interview with the Head of Community Education Section, the Office of Education of NAD, 03 08 2007.

Bangsa Lhoksemawe, taught the members of the PKBM's members to make wooden cabinets, tables, chairs, and souvenirs. These products were chosen after an observation that there has been a high demand for them. Each carpentry training course in each respective PKBM trained 20 participants aged 16-19. The trainers come from the respective PKBM or from nearby regions such as Banda Aceh, Lhoksemawe, and Aceh Utara. After the training, PKBM Mobile Mandiri received orders for wooden cabinets and chairs from several government institutions. The wooden products of PKBM Tunas Bangsa are not only sold to public but also used internally.

Dress-making Training

The eight-week training taught female participants to make women's dress, Acehnese men's Moslem hat, umbrellas, and embroideries. Many PKBMs offering this kind of training can be found in Banda Aceh and Aceh Besar. Some training held in PKBM PKPS and Yayasan Pendidikan Indonesia Banda Aceh also taught skills of making paper patterns, patterned seaming, cutting and finishing. The products are sold in Indonesia and exported as well.

Motorbike Repair Training

The motorbike repair training which was organised by PKBM PKPS Banda Aceh involved mainly Junior and Senior High graduates recruited by PKBM PKPS. The training was implemented in two batches, each of which accommodated 15 participants who attended a three hour session every weekday for three months. The trainers were experienced mechanics from motorbike repair stations which repair popular motorbikes such as Japanese Hondas and Italian Piagios. When this report was written, the three-month course had been completed but the participants were still allowed to practise in PKBM PKPS, which provided two motorbikes for that purpose.

Capacity Building

The capacity building of the targeted PKBMs was achieved through monthly 'coordination meetings' among PKBMs in NAD which were attended by the representatives of ILO-IPEC. Apart from this, there were 'on the spot discussions' and monitoring by the Community Education Section of NAD Education Office and ILO-IPEC. All of these activities allowed every stakeholder to observe the development of the program, to solve problems faced by each individual PKBM, and to exchange new information and ideas. Such meeting were usually held at the Office of Education and chaired by the Head of Community Education Section.

Success Factors of the Program

- Capacity building through monthly coordination meetings at the Local Office of Education and 'on the spot discussions' is one of the keys to ensure the sustainability of the program.
- The PKBMs' ability to respond to market demand, to take every business opportunity, and to build a network with other stakeholders, including financial institutions, determines the sustainability of the program.
- The PKBM management's ability to expand business and to focus on a certain business that the market demand provides income generating activities to ensure the sustainability of the program. Examples of this good practice are found in PKBM PKPS, YPI, Mobile Mandiri, and Tunas Bangsa.
- The situation and condition in NAD Province after the earthquake and tsunami have motivated the participants to seriously learn practical skills such as the ones offered by the PKBMs. Participants of embroidery and weaving course at PKBM PKPS and YPI, motorbike repair course at PKBM PKS, and carpentry course at PKBM Tunas Bangsa admitted that the adverse situation had increased their motivation to learn.

Results

- PKBM management realized the importance of having the capacity to design a curriculum and provide quality training. PKBMs have trainers to teach entrepreneurship and to facilitate various business groups.

- PKBM Tunas Bangsa Lhokseumawe was able to enlist some convicts who had the skills to become carpentry trainers there.
- PKBMs have succeeded in producing quality crafts. This success has attracted other organizations which enabled the managers of PKBM PKPS to learn more about entrepreneurship in Japan. The management of PKBM PKPS and YPI focusing on Acehese weaving and embroideries have succeeded in penetrating the markets in Japan, Malaysia, and Saudi Arabia.
- PKBMs in NAD Province have equipped a lot of teenagers with vocational skills such as dress-making, embroideries, motorbike repair, carpentry.
- The success of PKBM Mobile Mandiri is its ability to create new furniture businessmen, some of whom have participated in some project tenders and received orders in large quantities.

Challenges

- Ongoing capacity building is still necessary to enable PKBMs to build a strong network required for business expansion, and in this respect, coordination meetings and on-the-spot discussions will not be adequate. PKBMs need to get new idea from comparative studies.
- New staff members of PKBMs need managerial training, as well as entrepreneurial and vocational ones with the orientation of local and international marketing.

Preventing child Labour through the Retrieval Program and the Vocational Education Program in the Province of Aceh Darussalam

BACKGROUND

The earthquake and tsunami in Nanggroe Aceh Darussalam (NAD) on 26 December 2004 was estimated to have killed more than 118,000 people. Many children were orphaned or separated from their parents. Homes, schools and other community facilities were destroyed and about 500,000 were made homeless. The local economy was shattered, the local administration decimated, and much of Aceh's infrastructure razed to the ground. Many families lost their established sources of income and livelihood and were forced to rely on aid from various sources.

In the immediate future as well as in the longer term, the loss of family livelihoods will have many negative consequences for children. Experience in disaster zones elsewhere in the world has shown that when families lose livelihoods, children are often likely to drop out of school and start to work. These children are very vulnerable to becoming involved in the worst forms of child labour. An additional risk in Aceh was the enrolment of children in armed conflict between separatist groups and the Indonesian government.

After the tsunami, school-age children (whether at elementary, junior high or senior high level) found it increasingly difficult to enter the education sector, because the tsunami and the earthquake had caused the loss of infrastructure, and teachers. The Indonesian government, supported by local and international organisations, has tried to ease access to education through the rebuilding or renovating of infrastructure, and by increasing the number of teachers. To support these efforts, The Education Department of Nanggroe Aceh Darussalam and ILO-IPEC initiated an action program to prevent children from dropping out of school and entering worst forms of child labour. The program focused on strengthening The Retrieval Program initiated by the Ministry of National Education and improving pre vocational skill training in formal and non formal education units.

Overview of Junior-High School Education in NAD

Before the tsunami, according to Syabuddin AR⁸, an official with the Aceh Department of Education, approximately 20,000 children at junior high school level had dropped out of school. After the tsunami and

⁸ Serambi, 27 March 2003.

the earthquake struck, that number is estimated to have increased further. Children within this age group who had dropped out were targeted for the Retrieval Program to rejoin the education system at junior high school level or were recruited by The Office of Education into non-formal education programs equivalent to junior high school, namely Paket B and open junior high schools.

Even though pre vocational education program is an important tool to prevent children from entering the worst forms of child labour by giving them the necessary skills to find decent work opportunities in the future, it is not included specifically in the curriculum which applies to all junior high schools, formal or non formal. Handicrafts are taught as a subject, but it has been of secondary importance because it is not examinable within the national examination and is not focused on preventing children from WFCL.

Teachers had not been trained to teach pre vocational training. In short, pupils in years 1 and 2 (grades 7 and 8) of junior-high school had not received pre vocational training, even though the schools could have made use of local natural resources to offer such training.

C. STRATEGIES AND MAIN PROGRAMS

The Retrieval Program and Bridging Course targeted 120 children between the ages of 13-15 who had already dropped of the school system to return to school, whether by joining state schools (SMP) or Islamic schools (MTsN) in the district of Aceh Besar. To improve the relevance of the junior high -school curriculum in a local context, pre vocational training was offered to students.

Workshop for the Retrieval and Pre Vocational Programs

A two day workshop on the Retrieval Program and the Pre Vocational Program, involving the staff of 8 schools and some officials of the Provincial and District Offices of Education, was held in Banda Aceh. The workshop was preceded by a number of meetings between the Provincial Office of Education and the Banda Aceh District Office of Education to determine the workshop's objectives. The Provincial Office then drafted the terms of reference for workshop. The objectives of the workshop were to give teachers, school principals and educational officials a deeper understanding of the benefits of the Retrieval and Vocational Programs.

Prior to the implementation of the program, several coordination meetings were held between educational stakeholders, in particular the Office of Education. A one day workshop was organised to prepare training modules for teachers and this workshop was then followed by a three day program of teacher training, aimed at those who would be involved in the Bridging or Remedial Program.

Implementation of the Retrieval Program and the Bridging Course

The Retrieval Program was successful in bringing about the return of 120 children, who had previously dropped out of the education system, to junior high-school. These children were distributed between 8 junior-high schools, each of which took 15 students from their surrounding area. These participants were identified and selected by representatives from the participating junior high-schools and were then given books, bags, uniforms, pocket money and transportation money in the hope that they would be motivated to do well at school. In order to help the Remedial Program participants catch up with their studies (given that they not been at school for some time), they were given supplementary lessons in the form of a 50-day remedial course; with remedial lessons lasting two hours each day. The Remedial Program was taught by subject teachers for languages, mathematics, IPA (Natural Sciences) and IPS (Social Sciences).

The educational progress of the children involved was monitored once a month by the ILO and the Education Department. A report on each student's progress was given by the teachers, reporting directly to the monitoring team.

Implementation of the Pre Vocational Training Program

One of the aims of the Pre Vocational Training Program was to increase the relevance of the junior high-school curriculum in the local context. In this respect, it was first necessary to train those teachers who would be involved as tutors on the Pre Vocational Training Program. This teacher training was carried out over the course of three days at State Junior-High School Banda Aceh 19. The trainers on this program comprised a number of local school teachers (who had been selected by school representatives), as well as a number of trainers from outside the schools. The schools that participated in this training program were Banda Aceh State Junior High 19, Babun Najah Junior High, Al Manar Junior High, Babussalam 1 State Junior High and Islamic Junior-High Montasik.

The training program covered various topics, namely multi-media studies, computer studies, gardening, screen-printing and tailoring. After the program was concluded, each school chose one topic and proceeded to plan and implement a pre vocational training program for students as part of their skills-training or after-school (extra-curricular) program. The students who took part in this vocational training were those from years 2 and 3 (grade 8 & 9), and the number of students varied between each school.

D. Success Factors of the Program

1. Working through the Department of Education, the government has already made efforts to improve the quality of its citizens in terms of basic education by a program known as '*Wajib Belajar Sembilan Tahun*' (nine years of compulsory schooling, in which children should finish elementary and junior high school). This program is carried out through regular junior-high schools, Islamic junior high schools, open junior high-schools, non-formal education programs and within Elementary/Junior High schools under the same roof. To this end, a significant amount of funding has been provided by APBN or APBD (National Budget or Provincial Budget). The Retrieval Program, however, was funded by the local government.
2. The Retrieval, Remedial and Vocational Training Programs offered children an enjoyable educational experience, such that they were likely to remain at school for longer than they would have done had they been involved in an instructive program.
3. Those children who had dropped out had a strong internal motivation to return to formal schooling.
4. The workshop and vocational training for teachers were only able to take place as a result of support from various quarters (such as school principals, teachers, trainers from outside of the schools and the Department of Education). The workshop was a learning process for those involved because it offered participants the opportunity to be involved in planning the program.

E. RESULTS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

1. As many as 120 children targeted for The Retrieval Program have continued their education at junior high level (within both state-run and Islamic schools) with an average attendance rate of 85%. Approximately 70% of the participants were girls. Both boys and girls followed the lessons well and generally enjoyed the chance to return to school.
2. Students from five junior high schools (4 state schools and 1 Islamic school) took part in the Pre Vocational Training Program at their various schools.

In the **multimedia training program** (offered at State Junior-High School 19), students were given the chance to develop their journalistic skills through the production of magazines and written articles and by using the Internet as a learning tool and a source of information.

In the **computer** training, students learnt to touch-type using Microsoft Word, to edit and print photographs, to use PowerPoint and to present information in an interesting way. In addition, they learnt to write letters and compile financial reports, use Excel and generally increase their understanding of technology.

In the **gardening course**, students learnt how to create a garden. They also learnt about fertilizer, different species of plants, how to grow from seedlings, mix fertilizer and create a pond. These students also took part in an inter-class competition to make the best leaf-compost and also learnt about ways to make liquid compost which can be used as a substitute of EM4 (Effective micro organisms), with the help of an expert from outside the school. The students also learnt how to grow spinach, and the importance of spinach as a source of nutrition for children.

In the **tailoring course**, students learnt to measure, cut and sew clothes, as well as how to embroider various patterns onto umbrellas, bags and HP cases. The students also learnt about teaching their juniors and studied various aspects of occupational health & safety in the workplace. Students on this course also took part in practical training in tailoring outlets near to their school.

In the **screen-printing course**, the students learnt that screen-printing has wide application and has many business opportunities. They learnt how to screen-print using water, how to make name cards, and how to make stickers from paper, cloth and plastic. The students also learnt about how to design T-shirt logos as well as how to start their own business.

- Those teachers who were selected to offer tuition on the Remedial Program, Bridging Course and Vocational Program worked hard and their motivation improved as time went by. Teachers also received an extra income from the bridging program. In the multi-media training program, teachers were able to design their lessons on the computer and deliver their lessons through projector.
- Due to the fact that students on the Pre Vocational Training Program enjoyed their lessons, the NAD Education Department has been able to put forward several junior high schools as models for the development of vocational education. The Pre Vocational Training Program recognises that, although formal education is the most important, training in pre vocational skills and learning to do business are also necessary for the sake of the children's future. As a result, school principals and committees have made a commitment to include pre vocational education programs in the junior high-school curriculum.

Challenges

1. Special efforts are needed to increase the attendance of students on the Retrieval Program. This can be achieved in several ways, such as by undertaking home visits to discuss the program with the students/parents in the hope that the parents will take a more active role in supporting and advising their children to continue with their schooling.
2. Schools need to give children the opportunity to participate more in teaching pre vocational skills to their juniors. Each school needs to document the vocational training module that was offered, extend the training for its teachers and empower senior students.
3. The Retrieval Program and the Bridging course are essential components of the overall efforts to enforce the policy of '9 years of compulsory education' for students in the NAD province, considering the big number of students dropping out of school in this area.

THE PROGRAM TO SUPPORT THE ESTABLISHMENT OF ELEMENTARY AND JUNIOR HIGH SCHOOLS UNDER ONE ROOF IN THE PROVINCE OF ACEH

A. BACKGROUND

The earthquake and tsunami in Nanggroe Aceh Darussalam (NAD) on 26 December 2004 was estimated to have killed more than 118,000 people. Many children were orphaned or separated from their parents. Homes, schools and other community facilities were destroyed and about 500,000 were made homeless. Widespread trauma affecting children and adults will remain a problem for a long time. The local economy was shattered, the local administration decimated, and much of Aceh's infrastructure razed to the ground. Many families lost their established sources of income and livelihood and were forced to rely on aid from various sources.

In the immediate future as well as in the longer term, the loss of family livelihoods will have many negative consequences for children. Experience in disaster zones elsewhere in the world has shown that when families lose livelihoods, children are often likely to drop out of school and start to work. These children are very vulnerable to becoming involved in the worst forms of child labour. An additional risk in Aceh was the enrolment of children in armed conflict between separatist groups and the Indonesian government.

After the tsunami, school-age children found it increasingly difficult to enter the education sector, because the tsunami and the earthquake had caused the loss of infrastructure, and teachers. Geographical factors also influence the participation of children in education, particularly at junior high school. A big number of children live in remote, isolated and dispersed areas where junior high schools are not available. These factors frequently result in the discontinuance of study at school level.

The Indonesian government, supported by local and international organisations, has tried to ease access to education through the rebuilding or renovating of infrastructure, and by increasing the number of teachers. However, building education infrastructure in such areas is very inefficient in terms of time and resources. In order to address these issues, the Indonesian Government has initiated the program of 'Two Schools under One Roof'. In this program, elementary and junior-high schools are managed jointly; elementary school teachers are trained to teach in grades 7-9 and lessons at junior-high level are carried out either in the elementary school buildings or in a place near the elementary school. The implementation of this 'Two Schools under One Roof' policy does, however, present major challenges.

As a result of an initiative of the NAD Provincial Department of Education, the Two Schools under One Roof Program has been introduced in the areas of Lhoksimeulu (in Montasik sub district, Aceh Besar district) and in Tangse (in the Pidie district). It is hoped that children in these districts will be able to continue their education to junior high school level, without difficulty.

ILO-IPEC has worked in conjunction with the NAD Provincial Office of Education to implement an action program to support the Two Schools under One Roof Program so that underprivileged children are able to receive a good standard of education and avoid becoming involved in the worst forms of child labour. These efforts to improve access to and participation in school and to realise the right of all children to a good standard of education have been supported by teachers, the community and local government.

B. Overview of education in Montasik and Tangse

Communities in the villages of Kayee Kuyet, Makmur, Prumpee, Umpebata, Cot Bagi and Bakdilip in the sub district of Montasik, the district of Aceh Besar, for the last few years, have been waiting for the establishment of a junior high school. There are six elementary schools in this area, but 20% of those who graduate from elementary school do not continue on to junior high school due to the time and cost they have to spend on travelling to the junior high schools. At present children go to school by public transport or bicycle, and the nearest high school is 6 km away from their village. As a result, the community, local government and DPRD have formed a committee to prepare for the establishment of a junior high school, and have tried to obtain consent to the establishment of such school which consent has, however, not been forthcoming due to the fact that schools do not have enough space for building.

Scarcity of junior high schools also occurs in the sub district of Tangse, the Pidie district. During the period

of armed conflict in this region, five elementary schools and one junior high school were burnt down. Despite the conflict situation, the community retained a strong desire to educate their children and finally, the government did build several elementary schools. Nevertheless, no junior high schools have yet been built. Although the government's policy is compulsory education for nine years, children have experienced difficulty accessing junior high schools because they have to spend a lot of time and money on transport. Children from five villages (Blang Tengoh, Layan, Peunalom 1, Peunalom 2 and Krueng Meria) in this sub district have to walk or ride a bicycle for at least to 4 km to their nearest junior high school. The Local Office of Education has already established SMP Terbuka (Open Junior high schools) to help children gain access to junior high school, but the public are generally of the view that the schooling offered in this type of school is of poor or questionable quality, because children only study for 3 days a week.

The idea of setting up elementary schools and junior-high under one roof has been supported by the community, because 99% of the children have been identified as potential students for class 1 (grade 7) of junior high. Many of them are in the age group of those who are or soon will be eligible class 1 of junior high school.

C. MAIN PROGRAMS

The program strategy to prevent children from being involved in the worst forms of child labour includes involving the community so that they support the schools established under the Two Schools under One Roof Program. The program also aims to make these schools ones which children actually enjoy attending, and which are well managed. It aims to help teachers to prepare inclusive and enjoyable lessons (which take into consideration the various physical and psychological factors of the students) and to improve the capacity of children themselves through 'from children for children' activities. By improving teachers, school committee, and local government, it is expected that 150 children between the ages of 13-15 years old will participate in the Two Schools under One Roof Program and 500 underprivileged children between the ages of 10-15 years will be given an opportunity to optimise their potential and creativity through the program 'From Children for Children' which has been facilitated peer educators.

A Memorandum of Understanding between the Local Office of Education for the sub districts of Aceh Besar and Pidie, the ILO, and **the Centre for the Child Learning and Protection (PKPA)** was drawn up with regards to joint efforts towards capacity building in the context of the Two Schools under One Roof program in Montasik and Tangse. This was done within the framework of the overall initiative to create a system of education which is friendly, enjoyable and of high quality and which, ultimately, is designed to prevent children dropping out of school.

Training workshop about the Future Search for Two-Schools under One Roof

The training workshop about future search was designed to enable participants to determine the vision, mission, strategies and program activities for the Two Schools under One Roof program. The training, which used a participatory approach, took place in Banda Aceh over the course of 5 days, between the 25 February and 1 March 2007, and involved a total of 30 participants drawn from among the community, parents, teachers, school principals, school committees, local government and local education departments. Participants came not only from the Tangse and Montasik sub districts, but also from other towns and districts in the NAD province, such as Biruen, Meulaboh, Sabang, Aceh Timur, Aceh Selatan, Aceh Singkil and Nagan Raya.

Workshops in Tangse and Montasik

Following the training workshop in Banda Aceh, a future search workshop in Tangse and Montasik was held to unify the perception of all stakeholders in the Two Schools under One roof program. The workshop was carried out in schools and involved teachers, school principals, community members and members of the Department of Education. During the course of the workshop, a committee for the Two Schools under One Roof program was formed and a work plan developed. These committee members took part in training so as to implement their role as school partners and held regular meetings with the school principals and other parties involved with the Two Schools under One Roof program.

Training in ‘Inclusive and Enjoyable Education’

The training in Inclusive and Enjoyable education was designed to enable teachers to create and teach lessons in a fun way, regardless of the potential of the students. Before the training could take place, a training module had first to be developed and this was based on the module already designed by the National Department of Education and UNESCO-UNICEF, which was adapted to fit with the context and culture of Aceh. The training module was compiled by PKPA, the ILO and other training facilitators. The training itself, which was carried out in Banda Aceh and involved school principals and subject teachers, was preceded by the development of a training timetable by the provincial and district Office of Education. Teacher training included a period of field work in Inclusive and Enjoyable education. Monitoring and evaluation to assess how effectively the training was implemented in practice were conducted by the ILO, the Office of Education and PKPA.

‘From Children for Children’ Activities

As many as 500 children at elementary and junior-high schools in Tangse and Montasik enjoyed “from children to children approach” lessons in the fields of art, culture, music, life skills and vocational skills training. This approach was preceded by peer educators training in Montasik and Tangse, a process of orientation and consultation with peer educators to plan the implementation of the approach, and the formation of implementation committees in various schools. Subsequently, ILO, PKPA, school principals and village leaders undertook a review of the planning, and organised funding for the activities. The activities were assisted by subject teachers at times arranged between the teachers and students. Monitoring was conducted regularly in monthly meetings between principals, teachers and those students who were involved as peer educators.

D. SUCCESS FACTORS OF THE PROGRAM

- Taking into account the prevailing local conditions in NAD - the fact that the villages are remote, isolated and dispersed, as well as the number of those who continue on to junior high school after graduating from elementary school – the ‘Two Schools under One Roof’ program in the NAD province is the most suitable approach because it only requires the building of new classrooms. It will be a very good idea if the provincial government of NAD adopts and replicate the practice in other areas of NAD which have similar characteristics to the areas targeted by this program.
- The formation of an elementary and junior-high school under one roof in these two areas has only been possible with cooperation between the ILO, the Office of Education for NAD and PKPA. The joint effort has increased the capacity of teachers, educators, managers, school committees and local governments so that ‘Two Schools under One Roof’ program can offer basic education that is enjoyable and to create a sense of ownership of the school among the local community.
- Previously, in establishing new schools, the local government has not undertaken a program of capacity building to create an understanding and sense of ownership on the part of the community and parents towards the new school. The action program carried out by ILO-IPEC, however, has developed the capacity of schools, fit within the overall aims and objectives of schools, and worked to strengthen the relation between the school committee and other stakeholders. In particular, the school committee has successfully enlisted support from stakeholders to provide land for building new classrooms: in Tangse approximately 700m² of land; and in Montasik approximately 2,000m².

Results

1. School principals, committees and teachers have begun to realize the establishment of ‘SD-SMP Satu Atap’ through the preparation school development plan. Principals, teachers and school committees in Tangse and Montasik have implemented a part of this plan, particularly through the securing of land for the location of the school, and have already built 3 classrooms in Tangse and 6 classrooms in Montasik.
2. Subject teachers for IPA, IPS and languages have already been involved in teaching class 7, whilst SMP teachers in the nearest areas have taught classes 8-9. The participation of elementary school teachers in teaching class 7 has been implemented under the guidance and oversight of the school principal.
3. Recognising the necessity of such a school for future generations, Community and Religious figures

have supported the establishment of the elementary and junior-high under one roof. This support has included the contribution of ideas, materials, labour and land for setting up the school. There is awareness amongst the local community about the importance of education for children in preventing children from delinquency and losing the right to compulsory education.

4. Children have a new perception that their teachers are not the only sources of knowledge, but members of the wider community and their peers as well.

Challenges

5. Establishing new schools in Tangse and Montasik takes more than the building of new classrooms but also requires the building of awareness among community members, school committees, local government and pupils about the importance of ensuring the access of young people to quality and enjoyable education.
6. Coordination between the Department of Education, local government, school committees, school principals and stakeholders is still needed to create the school that is wished for.
7. Teachers are aware that their role in helping children to learn is a very important and a heavy burden of responsibility. This awareness came about after teachers had taken part in training about inclusive and enjoyable education.
8. There is no reason why teachers should adopt a less enjoyable approach to teaching, or take their lessons less seriously, just because their pupils have differing abilities. Teachers therefore need to continue to work on building up their knowledge and understanding about inclusive and enjoyable education. Capacity building among teachers, school principals, school committees and local education officials is needed not only in relation to the management and development of elementary and junior-high schools under one roof, but is also needed for the long existing schools, so that those schools too are able to plan education which is enjoyable for the young generation, in accordance with the expectations of the Indonesian government.
9. The model of capacity building for educational stakeholders that was implemented in developing the Two Schools under One Roof program in NAD province needs to be continued over the next few years to ensure that education within the NAD province can make significant progress in quality, quantity and relevance.
10. The Two Schools under One Roof program in the NAD province has shown several signs of shifting from the original concept towards the idea of establishing regular junior high school. Consequently, the effectiveness and efficiency of the Two Schools under One Roof program needs to be monitored intensively by the local government and Department of Education.
11. There are many local natural resources which children do not yet know how to utilise/manage and which thus gives rise to the need for a program of vocational and pre-vocational training.

RETURNING CHILDREN TO FORMAL EDUCATION (JUNIOR HIGH SCHOOL) IN NIAS DISTRICT, PROVINCE OF NORTH SUMATRA

BACKGROUND

The earthquake and tsunami in Nias was estimated to have killed more than 800 people. Many children were orphaned or separated from their parents. Homes, schools and other community facilities were destroyed. The local economy was shattered, the local administration decimated, and much of Nias' infrastructure razed to the ground. Many families lost their established sources of income and livelihood and were forced to rely on aid from various sources. In the immediate future as well as in the longer term, the loss of family livelihoods will have many negative consequences for children. Experience in disaster zones elsewhere in the world has shown that when families lose livelihoods, children are often likely to drop out of school and start to work. These children are very vulnerable to becoming involved in the worst forms of child labour.

Three years after the Tsunami, according to a report from the Office of Education, Nias District (North and South), 302 out of 755 schools (40%) have been repaired or rebuilt by local and international organizations.

Along with efforts to repair infrastructure, educational organisations have worked hard from the beginning of 2006 to coordinate and run a 'Back to School' campaign. UNICEF helped the local Education Office to survey and identify children who had dropped out of school.

In order to prevent vulnerable children entering the worst forms of child labour, ILO and the Nias Office of Education implemented an action program in the sub-district of Mandrehe aimed at supporting the 'Back to School' Campaign. The program targeted 45 children aged 12-15 years who had previously dropped out of school to be returned to school. The program also developed life skills and pre-vocational skills in the current education system so that 700 children of grade 1 and 2 junior high school benefited from the improved pre vocational training.

OVERVIEW OF NIAS

Nias is an island rich in natural resources. Its primary natural resources are in the farm and fishery sector. Some of the primary products include fish, cocoa, coconut, rubber, sand and stone from rivers and seas. However, these natural resources are not fully managed to their potential, because of a lack of capital and skills. In the long term, it is hoped that increasing education and business capital will develop the human resources of Nias.

A year before the Tsunami, as reported by the Aceh and Nias Reconstruction and Rehabilitation Body, income per capita of the population of Nias was just US\$ 360 (compared to the Indonesian average of US\$ 1,191) and 62% of households fell into the category of pre-welfare or living under the poverty line. The population had difficulty accessing services; only 27% of households had electricity, only 7% of households owned TV, average distance from the local clinics or city hospitals was between 11 and 52 km respectively, just 20% of people received piped water connection service. Attempts to repair and rebuild Nias are predicted to take a long time due to these pre-tsunami conditions.

Access to education had been low, about 25% of children aged 13- 15 years did not attend school prior to the Tsunami. The level of junior high school education for the population of North Nias and South Nias was just 12.17% and 9.09% respectively. This means the number of children reaching the compulsory 9 years of education was very low. The lack of education access among the local population was due to economic inability, insufficient education facilities provided by the government and the perceived irrelevance of education to their life issues. The Tsunami and earthquakes, which had damaged or destroyed 755 schools, threatened to further worsen the already poor access to education. More children were not able to attend schools, and were therefore at increased risk of being involved in child labour.

MAIN PROGRAM

Conducting Retrieval Program and Bridging Course

A total of 45 children (15 male and 30 female) aged 12 – 15 years who had previously dropped out of school in the sub-district of Mandrehe could return to school through the Retrieval Program and Bridging Course. This program was coordinated by the Office of Education in the sub district and district of Mandrehe. Preparation was carried out in coordination with other organizations to socialise the idea of the Retrieval and Bridging Course (Remedial) as a part of the 'Back to School' campaign and to mobilise financial support from the local government in the form of BOS (Bantuan Operasional Sekolah – school assistance funds/government's subsidy). As many as 45 children were identified and selected to take part in the program. They were provided with school uniforms, stationery, books and all they needed to return to study in State Junior High School 1 and 2 Mandrehe, and State Junior High School 1 in Idanogawa. Because these children had not been in formal schooling for some time, they were given remedial or bridging courses for a period of 50 days, 2 hours per day. In this program they received extra tuition which included the subjects of Science, Social Studies, Indonesian and Mathematics from the subject teachers selected from the three junior high schools. These activities were monitored in turns by FKPI (ILO's partner) and the Nias Office of Education. The Retrieval, Remedial (bridging course) and monitoring activities have given a new facet to the

educational activities in Nias District Office of Education. No program like this has been run before although many children have dropped out or at risk of dropping out of up school.

Life Skills and Pre-vocational Education Workshop

In order to build the capacity of the stakeholders in supporting the implementation of the action program, a Life Skills and Pre Vocational Education workshop was organised among the education stakeholders in the Nias District and Mandrehe sub-district. The workshop, which was set up by Nias District Office of Education, ILO-IPEC, FKPI, Junior High Schools 1 and 2, Open Junior High Schools and 2 CLCs, was intended to develop the plans for life skills and pre vocational training in Junior High schools and Community Learning Centres. The workshop ran for 7 days - 2 days in class for theory, 3 days to prepare workshops in the schools/CLCs, and 2 days in class for the work group to complete the program to be presented to the Nias Office of Education. In the workshop teachers, school principals and school committees were trained in how to facilitate participatory planning with the community and to make the documentation and report on the results of the workshop. In coordination with USAID-DBE, the children targeted for the program were prepared as apprentices to be sent to Chevron Polytechnic and funds were allocated to set up a small workshop as the learning medium for those who take part in the life skills and prevocational skills program.

Life Skills and Pre-vocational Skills Training

This program aimed to improve the relevance of the educational curriculum in the local context. In the long term, the program helps reduce the numbers of students dropping out of school, improve the quality of life and help break the cycle of poverty. The 3 day life skills training was intended to train teachers from the sub-district of Mandrehe. Trainers for this course included teachers selected by the schools and external supports chosen by the Office of Education.

In this training, the participants set up the life skills training program and scheduled meetings with FKPI, the Mandrehe sub district Office of Education, State Junior High School 1 and 2 in order to discuss more detailed plans for carrying out the program. The training modules were prepared after the implementation strategy was agreed. Once the training modules finished and the necessary material was prepared, the next step was to undertake the participatory training concerning pre-vocational skills. After this training, all the teachers trained drew up action plans for each school to ensure that children from grade 1 and 2 in Junior High School would receive the competencies they require for life in the community. Theoretical lessons on life skills were fit into the regular practical skills lessons in each school and the practical sessions were held in the afternoon.

D. Success Factors of the Program

1. The government has made many efforts to bring about the Program of nine year compulsory study through regular Junior High School, Islamic High School, Open Junior High School, SMP Kecil, Paket B, SD-SMP under one roof. Despite the fact that the government has spent a considerable amount of fund for the programs above and also non formal education such as Paket A,B,C, and Community Learning centres, in general people are still questioning the effectiveness and efficiency of those programs. The reason for this is that the public are of the view that proper education can only be attained in regular Junior High Schools, thus school principals, teachers and school committees agreed that children should study until the 3rd year of Junior High School. The main source of funding at present is through BOS (budget for school operation costs). The Local Office of Education should increase the number of children targeted for the retrieval program with funding from the Budget of The Education Office or the Budget of Nias District.
2. Through a well-designed workshop and training course, children had enjoyable learning experiences, which have a longer lasting effect when compared to a pressured learning situation. The Department of Education, school Principals, teachers and school committees should create this situation to raise the quality of basic education in the future. The quality of education should not only be regarded from the academic aspect, but also from non academic aspects in the form of life skills.
3. In order to prevent children from child labour, it is important to identify early on children who are at

risk of dropping out of school. The Retrieval Program and the Bridging Course offer a new a new variation to achieve the program of 9 year compulsory study in Indonesia, so the effectiveness and efficiency should be evaluated (in terms of their administration and academic achievement) in comparison to Paket B, SMP Kecil, Open Junior High School, and others.

4. The life skills and pre-vocational skills training was conducted with the support of several parties (the Nias District office of Education, sub-district of Mandrehe, school principals, Junior High Schools, Open Junior High School, CLCs and the local community). Everyone involved in the process were also learning as they were involved in participatory program planning.

Results

- The attendance rate of children who have returned to study in the three State Junior High Schools averaged around 74%. They were very pleased to be studying again because it's free and they get the opportunity to study with their peers. It is evident from from statements of theirs, such as, "Sir, I am asking that you continue giving help to us because my mother and father at home can't afford to pay for me to go to school." "Sorry sir, the reason I stopped going to school is that my parents' finances aren't enough." "Sir, don't stop giving help to us so that we can finish Junior High School, and we won't forget your kindness." "We are happy as it is like getting a prize and it makes it easier for us to go back to school."
- The parents of children targeted for the Retrieval Program are pleased because their prayers have been answered, that is, their children are back at school again. These parents have been encouraging their children to study seriously.
- There are a number of children targeted for the Retrieval Program who have been very successful in the class. Those children who had stopped studying for some time and fallen behind were helped to study in regular classes by means of the bridging course
- The business groups developed by the participants of 'Paket B' clearly gained concrete results in horticulture, freshwater fisheries and nursery farming. These income generating activities have increased their confidence in non formal education.
- State Junior High School 1 and 2 teachers in the Mandrehe sub-district were able to develop the life skills and pre-vocational skills modules adapted to their particular areas.

Challenges

1. In order to ensure a common vision among stakeholders concerning '*why*' this program is needed and '*what*' is expected from the program, it is essential to organise intensive coordination meetings prior to the implementation. Detailed participatory planning should be carried out to ensure all stakeholders are actively involved and understand *how* the program can be implemented successfully.
2. The Retrieval Program and Bridging course need to be mainstreamed as a support for the compulsory 9 years basic education program in Indonesia, because they assist children to study at regular junior high school. Through these programs teachers can identify children with the potential of dropping out of school.
3. Life skills and pre-vocational skills training which involves all stakeholders and takes into consideration local resources need to continue, because it improves the non academic aspect of education. Regulation No. 20, 2003, Article 32 para. 2 and 3 sets out the necessity for distinctive education services, particularly in rural areas affected by natural disasters.
4. In order to ensure the sustainability of the current program, it is necessary to increase the competence and capacity of officers and staff of the district and sub-district education offices, school principals, and school committees. As the Local Office of Education needs to perform regular *monitoring and producing documentation/ reports*, supervisors in the Office of Education need to be trained in documentation techniques and compiling reports on the progress and results of the program.
5. So far, life skills education has been given in formal and non formal education institutions, but the offices of education do not have enough data of participants who have become entrepreneurs to validate the effectiveness of the program.

COLLECTIVE LEARNING TO PREVENT CHILD LABOUR IN OFF SHORE FISHING IN TANJUNG TIRAM, ASAHAN DISTRICT, NORTH SUMATRA

A. BACKGROUND

Following the ratification of ILO Convention No. 182, the Government of Indonesia set up the National Committee for the Elimination of the Worst Forms of Child Labour. The Committee prepared a National Action Plan for the Elimination of WFCL which specified five forms of child labour to be tackled as priorities, one of which is the child labour in the off shore fishing sector. In line with the NAP, the provincial government of North Sumatra has enacted Regional Regulation No.5 / 2004 and set up the Provincial Action Plan for the Elimination of WFCL.

Child labour in the offshore fishing sector has existed in the coastal areas of North Sumatra for a long time because of various economic and socio cultural factors. Poverty, lack of education and low level of awareness of child labour issue have made these vulnerable children start work at a very early age before they complete 9 year compulsory education.

Taking the above situation into account, ILO-IPEC in collaboration with Format foundation developed an action program to prevent and withdraw children from hazardous work in the off shore fishing sector by providing a place where they can improve their education. In October 2004, Format Foundation established a Children Creativity Centre (CCC) in Bogak Village, Tanjung Tiram Sub district, which was intended to improve the children's education and knowledge through various learning activities. Collective Learning was used as an approach to build the children's awareness about the issue of child labour. In addition to this, the foundation established a network with the local government, using CCC as the medium of awareness raising campaign and obtaining (financial and social) supports for child labour related activities.

B. OVERVIEW OF BOGAK VILLAGE, SUB DISTRICT OF TANJUNG TIRAM

Bogak is a village situated in a coastal area of Tanjung Tiram Sub district, Asahan District, North Sumatra Province. The majority of the population work as fishermen, others as merchants, small-scale entrepreneurs, casual labourers. The baseline study by ILO-IPEC in 2003 found that 75 boys aged 14-16 worked in big boats in the off-shore fishing sector. On average, they worked eight hours a day at sea; some of them even had to work more than ten hours a day. Only two of them still went to junior high school. 43 children did not continue their education beyond elementary school and many had dropped out in the first and second year of Junior High school.

In this village, a lot of children went out to the sea with their parents or other adults, such as the owners of jermal (traditional fishing platforms). These were considered as normal activities, but they led them to disregard their rights to education. Until 2004, the community's awareness and knowledge about child labour, child rights, WFCL was very poor as they had never heard of any information about child labour before. Moreover, the central government, the local government, and other institutions had not mainstreamed the issue properly.

C. MAIN PROGRAM

ILO-IPEC, in conjunction with Format Foundation, implemented an action program for fifteen months, targeting 300 children to be prevented from WFCL, 700 children to receive information concerning child rights, and 200 children (including siblings of child labourers) to benefit from the activities in the CCC. The program included the following activities.

Managing a Library:

Every morning and afternoon children visited the CCC, in which a library was set up to provide reading materials for both school children and drop outs. The Local Water Supply Company granted their old building to be used for Format office and the library. A 4 by 4 meter room was used for book storage; a 3 by 7 meter room for reading; and the remaining space for administration office. The books were obtained from various sources – some were donated by individuals or institutions, and some bought from bookstores.

Through the Education Office of Asahan District, the local government granted 200 books to the library.

Thematic Learning Activities

Thematic learning methods which integrate 3 primary focuses: literacy, numeracy, and practical skills were used in the CCC to facilitate elementary school children. There were two stages in the implementation of thematic learning method.

Preparation Stage

The preparation stage started with a staff meeting in which tutors were selected. These selected tutors were then given 3 day training and assigned to certain tasks. Regular meetings were scheduled for those tutors to discuss the thematic learning system and learning themes, which were determined through the process of brainstorming and analysis, taking into account the conditions of the environment where the children lived. Some of the themes are '*Me, My Family, My friends, My Village, My Sea, and Work.*' The learning hours started at 3 pm after regular school hours and consisted of two learning sessions. After spreading the information about the learning program to the community, children were enlisted, and learning facilities - chairs, tables, and other learning equipment- provided.

Implementation Stage

The implementation stage started with allocating the learning period into five cycles, each of which targeted 60 children and lasted for three months. The thematic learning activities were carried out in accordance with the agreed schedule and the progress was monitored every day. Data on the improvement and achievement of each individual were collected and compared with their academic performance at school. In order to evaluate the progress, Format and the tutors held a meeting once every two weeks. At the end of every learning cycle the activities were documented and reported. In addition to the thematic learning, the children were also given practical skills training by the tutors or other external supports Format could obtain.

Encouraging members of CCC to take Paket B or to join Open Junior High School

Most members of CCC are children who had previously dropped out of school, usually in early years of Junior High School. In order to facilitate the members to continue with their schooling, the CCC was entrusted by the community and local government to send them to the Education Office of Tanjung Tiram Sub district so that they took Paket B or studied in Open Junior High School. Within the last two years the CCC has sent 5 members to take Paket B and 7 to study in Open Junior High School.

D. SUCCESS FACTORS OF THE PROGRAM

1. The chairperson of Format Foundation is a local figure who has shown his commitment to increasing the welfare of the traditional fishermen, even though he sometimes had to go against the local authority. The courage and seriousness of the chairperson and the staff in fighting for the people's rights have made them socially influential. Their credibility has led the community to give full support for CCC programs.
2. The learning process and atmosphere at the CCC are different from that at regular school, because CCC tutors treat the members as friends, select practical themes directly related to children's everyday life, and continuously encourage them in many ways. The tutors set up the general and specific objectives of each learning theme to ensure that it is focused, relevant to the children's interests and yet related to the lessons at school.
3. Through meetings with parents, informal community leaders and local officials (in which they were given information and materials on the issue of child labour), the community developed a sense of belonging towards the CCC.
4. 6 tutors were given 5 day training on thematic learning by the coordinator of ILO-IPEC program, Mr.Edy Sunarwan, who happened to have the experience in thematic learning. The competence and commitment of the tutors was further enhanced by discussions with the trainer and fellow tutors, in which they shared their experience of implementing the thematic learning program.

Results

- The children targeted for this program enjoy various learning activities in the CCC. They have become more involved at school as indicated by the fact they take part more actively in the lessons by asking and answering questions, and thus improve their academic achievement. The most outstanding improvement is that they have become more confident to speak in public and to make a dialogue with other people. They used to be unwilling to talk about their future goals but now they are able to express them.
- The CCC was successful in encouraging these children to continue their education in formal or non-formal schools. 5 and 7 children who had previously dropped out of school are now taking non formal education programs, namely Paket B and Open Junior High School respectively. Now there are no more students in CCC that do not go to school.
- The sustainability of the CCC is very crucial in tackling child labour in off shore fishing sector. Within the last three years, the number of children working in the big boats has decreased significantly while the number of those continuing their education to Junior High Schools in Tanjung Tiram has increased from 75 to 87%. Parents no longer expect their children to go fishing with them any more.
- The CCC has become an educational institution that can accommodate children with special learning needs (due to mental retardation and alienation). In the CCC, these children get more attention than they do in regular (elementary) schools.
- The CCC has become some sort of crisis centre where people come for advice to solve various problems, from household conflicts, legal matters to child trafficking.
- The community has developed increased awareness about the issue of child labour and the importance of education. The people of Tanjung Tiram have developed a strong sense of belonging towards the centre. Some fishermen said to Mr. Azmi, Format chairperson, 'We entrust you to educate our children and let us alone go to the sea'. Some other parents are even willing to finance the preschool activities for their children and to volunteer in special events, such as open market festivals, arts exhibition and other children's activities.
- The thematic learning method, the tutors' friendly way of approaching and motivating the children, the selection of the themes relevant to their daily life have proven to be able to increase their motivation to learn.

CHALLENGES

1. After conducting various activities that the community considered relevant to their life, Format has gained more confidence from the community to the point that people confide their personal problems unrelated to child labour. This increased confidence may become a challenge in the future.
2. Local government's supports in any forms - funds, ideas and expertise – need to be obtained to ensure the sustainability of the program.

CHILDREN CREATIVITY CENTRE IN THE COASTAL AREA OF BAGAN ASAHAN, NORTH SUMATRA PROVINCE

A. BACKGROUND

Following the ratification of ILO Convention No. 182, the Government of Indonesia set up the National Committee for the Elimination of the Worst Forms of Child Labour. The Committee prepared a National Action Plan for the Elimination of WFCL which specified five forms of child labour to be tackled as priorities, one of which is the child labour in the off shore fishing sector. In line with the NAP, the provincial government of North Sumatra has enacted Regional Regulation No.5 / 2004 and set up the Provincial Action Plan for the Elimination of WFCL.

Child labour in the offshore fishing sector has existed in the coastal areas of North Sumatra for a long time due to various economic and socio cultural factors. Poverty, lack of education and low level of awareness of child labour issue have made these vulnerable children start work at a very early age before they complete 9 year compulsory education.

Taking the above situation into account, ILO-IPEC in collaboration with Serikat Nelayan Sumatra Utara (North Sumatra Fishermen Union) implemented an action program to prevent and withdraw children from hazardous work in the off shore fishing sector through Children Creativity Centre. The program was expected to prevent 700 children aged 12-15 from WFCL and to increase the awareness of the community about the issue of child labour and education for children

B. OVERVIEW OF BAGAN ASAHAN

Bagan Asahan, which was once the most densely populated area in South-East Asia, consists of three villages. A big number of children in this area do not complete their nine year compulsory education. On yearly average, about 300 children finish elementary school, but only 270 (70%) continue to study in Junior High School. Bagan Asahan has one National Junior High School and one Islamic Junior High School which can accommodate 120 and 80 new students, respectively. The remaining elementary school graduates either go to school in other sub districts, which cost a lot of time and money, or just drop out of school. These children who drop out of school (70% male and 30% female) usually work in off shore fishing sector such as in big boats or in fish processing industry. In addition to this, the majority of students still spend time working in the afternoon or during the holiday to help their families.

The majority of parents (about 90%) work as fishermen and have very low level of education (most of them did not continue their education beyond elementary school). They have to subsist on what they get from the sea as other forms of employment are limited. The community - including children - are of the view that fishing is the only livelihood, now and in the future.

C. MAIN PROGRAMS

The action program implemented by SNSU was intended to prevent 700 children in Bagan Asahan from WFCL and working in off shore fishing sector. 360 children were targeted to take part in thematic learning activities in the CCC, in order to increase the community's awareness about the issue of child labour and the importance of education.

Thematic Learning Activities in CCC

The CCC in Bagan Asahan has served its function as a place where local children do various learning activities. In order to strengthen the CCC, thematic learning activities focusing on literacy, numeracy and practical skills were introduced under this program. This learning system was selected because of its relevance to the children's life and its convenience to perform.

Preparation Stage

The preparation stage started with a staff meeting in which tutors were selected. These selected tutors were then given 3 day training and assigned to certain tasks. Regular meetings were scheduled for those tutors to discuss the thematic learning system and learning themes, which were determined through the process of brainstorming and analysis, taking into account the conditions of the environment where the children lived.

Some of the themes are ‘*Me, My Family, My friends, My Village, My Sea, and Work.*’ The learning hours started at 3 pm after regular school hours and consisted of two learning sessions. After spreading the information about the learning program to the community, children were enlisted, and learning facilities - chairs, tables, and other learning equipment- provided.

Implementation Stage

The implementation stage started with allocating the learning period into five cycles, each of which targeted 60 children and lasted for three months. The thematic learning activities were carried out in accordance with the agreed schedule and the progress was monitored every day. Data on the improvement and achievement of each individual were collected and compared with their academic performance at school. In order to evaluate the progress, Format and the tutors held a meeting once every two weeks. At the end of every learning cycle the activities were documented and reported. In addition to the thematic learning, the children were also given practical skills training by the tutors or other external supports Format could obtain.

During the implementation of the program, SNSU was assisted by the ILO-IPEC coordinator in obtaining various resources to improve the management of CCC: materials on thematic learning, reading, writing, calculation, and environmental education. Before thematic learning method was introduced in the CCC, it had been hard to increase children’s motivation to learn, but it changed as soon as thematic learning was introduced.

Improving the Library in CCC

In order to support the thematic learning activities, the library in the CCC was made more effective by improving the collection. More books, magazines and materials on child labour were obtained from individuals, publishers, or bookstores. Members of the CCC were trained to make full use of the available collection to improve their knowledge.

Encouraging children to take Paket A and B

Most members of CCC are children who had previously dropped out of school, usually in early years of Junior High School. In order to facilitate the members to continue with their schooling, the CCC was entrusted by the community and local government to send them to the Education Office of Bagan Asahan Sub district so that they took Paket A and B. Within the last two years the CCC has sent 7 members (5 male and 2 female) to take Paket B and 10 members (7 male and 3 female) to take Paket B. Some of them have completed the program and the remaining are still working on them.

Tutor Training

In order to improve the commitment and competence of tutors and volunteers so as to enable them to support CCC activities, new volunteers were recruited and given training. Today there are about 28 students or graduates of Junior and Senior High School who work as tutors and run daily activities in the centre. Their tasks include documenting the activities, preparing reports, and organising monthly meetings in which the progress of each member is evaluated.

Disseminating Information about the Worst Forms of Child Labour

The residents of Bagan Asahan have had very limited information about WFCL and thus low awareness regarding the issue. In order to increase their awareness, a system of information exchange was developed based on inputs from all stakeholders. Some members of the community were enlisted and trained to run the system, which technically will disseminate information about the risks of working at an early age and WFCL through various media: leaflets, booklets, films, data, radio programs, etc. The system was also designed to elicit feedback from parents and the community regarding children at risk of dropping out of school and becoming child labourers, so that early measures can be taken to prevent it from happening.

Commemorating the World Day against Child Labour

As a part of the awareness raising campaign, SNSU and the CCC organised a children festival to commemorate World Day against Child Labour. The festival or carnival which was held on the main street of Bagan Asahan involved the local government, informal leaders in the community, and students’

organisations.

E. SUCCESS FACTORS OF THE PROGRAM

1. In spite of the fact that total elimination of child labour in fishing sector has not been achieved, parents and children in Bagan Asahan have shown increased awareness of WFCL. A significant number of children have stopped working in big boats, and chosen to help their parents in fish drying which is less hazardous.
2. The community have shown increased awareness about the importance of education for their children to prevent delinquencies. Taking the examples of volunteers in CCC, some members of the community established kindergartens to provide early childhood education services.
3. The community have shown increased awareness about WFCL as indicated by the fact that many parents, especially mothers, encouraged their children to join the CCC. These mothers were happy to have their children in CCC and even contributed in early childhood education services. 'Our children learn with their big brothers. I am happy. This centre is very useful for us.' one of them said.
4. The volunteers are also happy because the children and their parents respect them even more, which is an unexpected but positive by-product of the program.
5. Local officials including the staff of village administration and other informal community leaders have supported the CCC activities in many ways.
6. The children's motivation to learn and willingness to spend time learning / being mentored in CCC has increased as indicated by their confidence to ask questions to their teachers at school.

RESULTS

- Thematic learning activities have enabled children to understand themselves, their future goals, and what it takes to bring them about. They have become more motivated to learn: their school attendance reached 92.5 % and homework was done with very little help
- The children have had future goals they want to achieve, such as becoming the owner of fish canning factory.
- The children have changed their mind set about their life as indicated by stronger motivation to have higher education.
- The children are more capable of organising themselves as shown by their participation in art and music festivals, cooperatives, and football competition.
- The number of local people who become volunteers in CCC has increased beyond expectation. 28 volunteers have been given peer education training and have been monitoring children's activities in the field.

CHALLENGES

1. The sustainability of the program depends on SNSU's capability of networking with local officials, institutions and individuals concerned with child labour issue in this area.
2. Thematic learning method has been proven to be able to encourage children to learn longer hours in the centre, but tutors should work continuously to develop different themes suitable for different ages and situations.
3. Some members of the community were sceptical towards SNSU and the CCC for having hidden agenda, such as 'influencing the people to vote for a certain candidate in the local election.'
4. The thematic learning modules need to be documented in a more organised way for the benefit of visitors and new volunteers.
5. The centre no longer has enough space to accommodate increasing activities and members. New premises will be needed in the near future.

“Let’s go back to School!”

Mainstreaming the Issue of Child Labour in the Education System of Tasikmalaya

Overview

The first phase of Indonesia’s National Action Plan on the Elimination of the Worst Forms of Child Labour has specified five forms of child labour which should be tackled as priorities, one of which is the child labour in the informal footwear sector. To support NAP, ILO-IPEC developed several programs in a number of sub-districts in West Java. Prior to the implementation of the program, several studies were conducted to collect relevant data on the magnitude of the problem, areas to focus on, and the most suitable intervention.

A rapid assessment study carried out in 2004 revealed a total of 217 children (boys and girls) working in the footwear-production sector in 8 villages in the Tasik region. Taking this fact into account, ILO/IPEC in conjunction with the Tasikmalaya Office of Education have made efforts to return these child labourers to the world of education with funding from the Government Subsidy called the School Assistance Fund (Bantuan Operasional Dana – BOS) and the Free Schooling Card System (Kartu Bebas Biaya Sekolah – KBSS). Both the School Assistance Fund and the Free Schooling Card System are local government assistance programs aimed at elementary school-age children. The ILO/IPEC program was designed to strengthen BOS and KBSS for those child labourers who had dropped out of school.

In particular, the program aimed to improve the competence of teachers at selected schools with regards to teaching methodology that enabled them to attract those who had previously dropped out back to school. Another strategy of the program was to raise awareness among the community in general about the importance of education for children. In this respect, program stakeholders were actively involved in drafting the Local Government of Tasikmalaya Regulations about education system for the area, which came into effect in June 2007.

How were these efforts able to help return school drop-outs to school?

1. The ILO-IPEC worked together with Local Administration Unit (UPTD) of The Tasikmalaya Office of Education identified 28 drop outs. These children were successfully returned to school with the help of funding from KBSS. Aside from this, as many as 903 children from 20 elementary schools and 4 junior high schools were successfully prevented from dropping out.
2. As a result of the assistance to return to formal schooling, those ex drop outs developed more self-confidence and improve their motivation to study, and thus they were encourage to stop work. This was evidenced by the fact that the level of absence from school was reduced from 21% to 12% of total school days.
3. The program successfully initiated a ‘Back to School’ campaign through the distribution of calendars and exercise books. This campaign was then adopted by the Mayor of Tasikmalaya to target those who had dropped out of school. The enactment of the Local Government Regulations about the education system in Tasikmalaya is one sign that the ‘Back to School’ campaign has worked. The regulations which came into effect in June 2007 gave ex drop outs the opportunity to return to school by virtue of the allocation of funds from the local government of Tasikmalaya.

Pre-requisites

3. In order to put together the framework for local regulations regarding the education system, the Office of Education facilitated a number of discussions with various parties, including internal representatives of the Office and those involved in the local education system, legal organisations and practitioners, academics, Bappeda (Local Planning Board), PGRI (Indonesian Teachers Association), consultative bodies from private tertiary education institutions, groups working within the field of human rights and groups of school principals.
4. The Office of Education monitored the distribution and use of funds from the BOS and KBSS to ensure that funding was used for its intended purpose, particularly to support ex child labourers who had been returned to school.

5. The Tasikmalaya Department of Education ran a 'Back to School' campaign by distributing calendars and exercise books to all elementary and junior high schools, as well as all UPTD in sub district offices. This campaign was designed to bring attention to and increase awareness on the part of the local community about the importance of education for children.

Main activities and results

4. **Returning children who have dropped out of school to formal education.** In order to achieve this objective, the Office of Education worked together with a local NGO (PKBI Tasikmalaya) to first identify and register the number of children who had dropped out of school, or who were at risk of doing so (because they were working). Based on the data, a number of children were selected for further follow-up, which took the form of finding out more about their family situation and requesting permission from their families to return them to formal schooling. In connection with these efforts, the Office of Education then worked with SMP/MTs (state and Islamic junior high schools). During the first stage of the program, 28 children who had dropped out of school (16 boys and 12 girls) were identified and subsequently enrolled in junior high school with the help of funding from BOS and KBBS. BOS (School Assistance Fund) is central government subsidy to pay for the costs of enrolment in school, exam registration, extra-curricular activities, school-building upkeep, teacher bonuses and teacher training, school equipment - including books, and transportation of students from poor families. KBBS (The Free Schooling Card System) provides funding for uniforms (including sports uniforms), school bags and shoes, school equipment, transportation and monthly school fees.
5. **Encouraging the development of local regulations to guarantee education for all.** The Tasikmalaya Office of Education encouraged the municipal government to develop specific regulations about the education system in the area. These regulations were designed to guarantee equal access to education for all children of school age (those for whom schooling is compulsory). Meetings and joint efforts between various parties were facilitated with the aim of speeding up and otherwise supporting the enactment of the regulations. The Local Regulations Bill has been drafted and approved by the Mayor of Tasikmalaya, and only awaits formal approval from the DPRD (Local Parliament) before coming into effect this year.

Elements of good practice

- The Office of Education brought together various parties to conduct studies and compile written drafts which were then used as the basis for the local government regulations.
- Convincing local government to draft local regulations about the education system in the relevant area involved a process of advocacy/lobbying and would not have been possible at all without the support of various parties in the community.
- Individual approaches to parents of those children who had dropped out of school, aimed at bringing about the return of these children to formal education, was a form of direct awareness raising within the community (in this case among parents) that should be further developed because of the positive results it produced.
- The assistance available from ILO-IPEC in the form of capacity building among teachers to outreach drop outs and oversee the allocation of funds from BOS and the KBBS was well-used by the Tasikmalaya Office of Education. This made a significant contribution to improving basic education at elementary and junior high level, as it was evident in the increase of APM (attendance rate) at junior high-schools from 63% to 70.3% and at elementary schools from 71.6% to 81.2%. With this achievement, Tasikmalaya increased its ranking from eighteenth to third place for the academic year 2005-2006.

Lessons Learned

1. The issue of returning those who have dropped out of school to the formal education system is still a sensitive one. From the point of view of parents or the community as a whole, children who have

dropped out of school and worked regular hours have become an ‘asset’ to the family that is difficult to let go. Parents feel that they have to pay the opportunity cost if their children return to school. Aside from this, the children themselves are often reluctant to go back to formal schooling because they feel too old and thus inappropriate to return to formal schooling. The “Back to School” campaign, effected by the distribution of IEC (Information, Education and Communication) material in the form of exercise books and calendars with interesting pictures, proved to be an effective way of attracting the general public’s attention, and indeed that of the local government, particularly the mayor, to give priority to education for children.

2. In order to retain the attendance of children at school, further efforts – apart from monitoring the allocation of BOS, KBBS and other forms of funding - need to be made. One aspect of the ILO-IPEC program was the effort of improving teachers’ competence and the quality of remedial lessons. As a result of this, teachers improved their ability to motivate students to study harder and remain at school longer.

The Way Forward

- Children who have already dropped out of school need to undergo a period of adjustment and adaptation if they are to be returned to the formal school environment. Taking this into consideration, advocacy needs to be carried out to get supports from all parties: the children themselves, their parents and representatives of schools accepting children who had previously dropped out.
- In order to guarantee the full involvement of all relevant parties in the ‘Back to School’ campaign, especially that of the school committees, it is necessary to give training in advocacy skills and in understanding material connected with the program (such as understanding of CRC, the school environment/supportive education, and other issues related to the ‘Back to School’ campaign.).
- In the meantime, the pilot projects of returning child labourers to school, such as that undertaken by the Office of Education and ILO-IPEC, (which project was also accommodated for within the framework of the Local Government Regulations) need to be extended and implemented in other areas.

4. List of Attendance

**National Stakeholders on the Final Evaluation Workshop
Tripartite Room – Ministry of Manpower and Transmigration
24 January 2008**

JAKARTA (Child Trafficking for Prostitution and Drugs Trafficking Sector)

1. Beti Mc
Project Coordinator
Bangun Mitra Sejati (BMS)
Jl. Raya Setu No. 9
Cipayung
Jakarta Timur
Tlp/Fax: 021 84991705
Email: bmsdsw@cbn.net.id

2. Gina Rosalina
Assistant Manager
Yayasan Perkumpulan Bandungwangi
Jl. Pisangan Lama Raya No. 7
RT 04/02
Jakarta Timur 13230
Tlp/Fax: 021 4712866

3. Henny
Pelita Ilmu Foundation
Jl. Tebet Timur Dalam VII Q No. 6
Jakarta Selatan

4. Muktiqoh
Pelita Ilmu Foundation
Jl. Tebet Timur Dalam VII Q No. 6
Jakarta Selatan

5. Agus Sulaiman
Pelita Ilmu Foundation
Jl. Tebet Timur Dalam VII Q No. 6
Jakarta Selatan

6. Winarti S
Director
The Indonesia Child Welfare Foundation
Jl. Tebet Barat Dalam V No. 26
Jakarta 12810

7. Ni Ngh Yustina
Yayasan Cinta Anak Bangsa (YCAB)
Sunrise Garden
Jl. Surya Mandala No. 1 8d
Kedoya Utara
Jakarta 11520
8. Kurniawati
The Centre for Women's Resource Development
(Pusat Pengembangan Sumber Daya Wanita/PPSW)
Duren Sawit Asri Kav. 1 No. 1A
Jl. Lapangan 1
Swadaya Raya – Rawa Domba
Duren Sawit
Jakarta 13440
Tlp/Fax: 021 86603789
9. Herman Mustamin
Ruma Kita Foundation
Jl. Pedati RT 013/04 No. 26
Kebon Nanas
Jakarta Timur
Tlp: 021 92849810
10. Wiyani Devita
Secretary
The Indonesia Family Planning Association DKI Jakarta
(Perkumpulan Keluarga Berencana Indonesia DKI Jakarta)
Jl. Pisangan Baru Timur No. 2A
Jakarta Timur
Tlp/Fax: 021 85909885
11. Heri S
The Indonesia Family Planning Association DKI Jakarta
(Perkumpulan Keluarga Berencana Indonesia DKI Jakarta)
Jl. Pisangan Baru Timur No. 2A
Jakarta Timur
Tlp/Fax: 021 85909885
12. Ahmad Marzuki
The Network on the Elimination of Child Labor
(Jaringan Penanggulangan Pekerja Anak - JARAK)
Jl. Kayu Manis III Baru No. 21
Jakarta Timur
Fax: 021 8505391
Mobile: 62 811 816078

BOGOR (Footwear Sector)

13. Anton Andi
Director
ELSPAT (Institute for Sustainable Agriculture and Rural Livelihood)
Jl. Kalasan No. 15
Kompleks Cimanggu Permai I
Bogor
Tlp: 0251 323089
Fax: 0251 325605
14. Dellianie U
The Regional Planning and Development Bureau Bogor
(BAPEDA Kabupaten Bogor)
Jl. Segar No. 3 Kav 2
Kompleks Perkantoran Pemda Cibinong
Bogor 16914
15. Dwi H
The Regional Planning and Development Bureau Bogor
(BAPEDA Kabupaten Bogor)
Jl. Segar No. 3 Kav 2
Kompleks Perkantoran Pemda Cibinong
Bogor 16914
16. Drs. Istiati S
Ministry of Health Bogor District
Jl. Kedung Halang Talang No. 150
Bogor 16710

SUKABUMI (Child Trafficking for Prostitution)

17. Metty Setiawati
Head of Women Empowerment
The Family Planning and Women Empowerment Sukabumi District
Jl. Pelabuhan II Km 5 No. 171
Kabupaten Sukabumi
Tlp: 0266 226988
Mobile: 0816 4204566
18. Yayah Sobariyah (Yayuk)
The Centre for Women's Resource Development
(Pusat Pengembangan Sumber Daya Wanita/PPSW)
Sukabumi

SURABAYA (Child Trafficking for Prostitution)

19. Nimal Baroya
Assistant Manager
Hotline Foundation Surabaya
Jl. Indrapura 17
Surabaya
Jawa Timur
Tlp. 62 31 3566232
Email: did@indo.net.id

20. Indah Lutfianti
Project Coordinator
Genta Foundation Surabaya
Duku Kupang Barat II No. 23
Surabaya
Tl/Fax: 62 31 5681454
Email: genta_surabaya@indo.net.id

KALIMATAN (Mining Sector)

21. Sumadi Atmodihardjo
Director
The Family Planning of Indonesia - East Kalimantan
(PKBI Kalimantan Timur)
Jl. Let jen Suprpto No. 1
Samarinda
Kalimantan Timur
Tlp/Fax: 62 541 734751
Mobile: 62 813 46393327

PROVINCIAL ACTION COMMITTEE ON ELIMINATION OF WFCL

22. Sigit Priyanto
Ministry of Manpower Office Surabaya
Jl. Dukuh Manunggul 124 – 126
Surabaya

23. Maman Suherman
Provincial Action Committee on the Elimination of WFCL of West Java
Ministry of Manpower and Transmigration office of West Java Province
Jl. Sukarno Hatta No. 532
Bandung

DONOR AGENCY

24. Stanley Harsha
Embassy of the United State of America
Jl. Medan Merdeka Selatan
Jakarta Pusat
25. Ade Budiningshi
Embassy of the United State of America
Jl. Medan Merdeka Selatan
Jakarta Pusat

INTERNATINAL ORGANIZATION

26. Fitriana Noor
Internatinal Organization for Migration
Surya Building
Jl. M.H. Thamrin
Jakarta Pusat

MINISTRY OF MANPOWER AND TRANSMIGRATION

Jl. Gatot Subroto Kav 51
Jakarta Selatan

27. Ms. Nur Aisah SH
Director
Labour Norms Inspection of Women and Children
28. Ibu Erwina
Head of Legal Bureau
29. Hendry Wijaya
30. Warsini
Head of Sud Directorate Inter Sectoral Cooperation for Women and Children
Directorate of Labour Norms Inspection of Women and Children
31. Yuli Adiratna
Section Head of Norms Inspection
32. Laurend Sinaga
Head of Sub Directorate Child Protection
Directorate of Labour Norms Inspection of Women and Children
33. Tajudin Noor
Manpower and Transmigration Office of East Kalimantan
Jl. Basuki Rahmat

Samarinda
Kalimatan Timur

MEMBER OF NATIONAL COMMITTEE ON THE ELIMINATION OF WFCL

34. M. Firman
Vice Chairman
Confederation of Indonesia Prosperity Union
Jl. Cipinang Muara No. 33
Jakarta
35. Helmy Salim
Confederation of All Indonesia Workers Indonesia
Jl. Pasar Minggu Km 17
Jakarta Selatan
36. Harfini Suhardi
Vice Secretary General
Teachers Association of the Republic of Indonesia
Gedung Guru
Tanah Abang III
Jakarta Pusat
37. Wiyani Devita
Teachers Accusation of the Republic of Indonesia
Gedung Guru
Tanah Abang III
Jakarta Pusat
38. Dr. Harjono
Coordinator of Social Affairs
APINDO
Plaza Great River, Fl 15th
Jl. HR Rasuna Said X-2 Kav 1
Jakarta 12950
39. Mahatmi Saronto
Head Sub Directorate of
Labour Market Support and Employment Opportunity Development
Jl. Taman Suropati 2
Jakarta
40. Edana Betty
Special Education Services
Ministry of National Education
Jl. RS Fatmawati
Jakarta Selatan

41. Tb Arifin
Special Education Services
Ministry of National Education
Jl. RS Fatmawati
Jakarta Selatan
42. Dian H.M
Community Education
Building E, 6th Fl
Jl. Jend Sudirman
Jakarta
43. Haniff Asmara
Director
Improvement of Child Welfare
Ministry of Social Affairs
Jl. Salemba raya no. 28
Jakarta Pusat
Fax: 3103612
Hp: +62-813-6036-6123
44. Sri Wahyuni
Rural Community Development
Ministry of Home Affairs
Jl. Raya Pasar minggu, Km 19
Jakarta Selatan
45. Sri Sardjiati
Division Head of Youth, children and Women
Community Development Division
The Indonesia National Police of republic Indonesia
Jl. Trunojoyo, No. 3,
Kby Baru,
Jakarta Selatan,
HP: +62-816-1155187

SECRETARIAT National Action Committee

46. Yuli Adhiretna, SH, MH
Directorate of Labour Norms Inspection for Women and Children
Jl. Gatot Subroto Kav. 51
Jakarta Selatan
Fax: 5276887
47. Anggun Sintana, MSi
Directorate of Labour Norms Inspection for Women and Children
Jl. Gatot Subroto, Kav. 51, Jakarta Selatan
Fax: 5276887

ILO AND EVALUATION CONSULTANTS

48. Arum Ratnawati
ILO
49. Dedeshinta Soedono
ILO
50. Abdul Hakim
ILO
51. Sri Hadiarti
ILO
52. Clarence Schubert
International Evaluator
53. Lamtiur Tampubolon
National Consultant for Evaluation
54. Antarini Arta
National Consultant for Impact Study

CHILD BENEFICIARIES

55. Ratih M – Yayasan Pelita Ilmu
56. Kendar – Yayasan Pelita Ilmu
57. Syaifudin – Yayasan Rumah Kita
58. MairiSurroji – Yaysan Rumah
59. Wiwi – Yayasan Bangun Mitra Sejati
60. Siska – Yayasan Bangun Mitra Sejati

61. Saimira – Yayasan Cinta Anak Bangsa
62. Doti - Lapas
63. Tati – Yayasan Bandungwangi
64. Indah – Yayasan Bandungwangi

ESCORT

47. Yuyun – Yayasan Bandungwangi
48. Bluri - LAPAS

**Itinerary of Final Evaluation
Support to the Indonesian National Plan of Action and the Time Bound Programme for the Elimintion of the WFCL**

13 - 26 January 2008

Mr. Clarence Schubert (International Consultant)

Ms. Lamtiur Tampubolon (National Consultant)

Day and Date	Time	Location	Persons to Meet	Subject or Sites to Visit	
Mon, 14.01.2008	09:00 - 12:00	ILO Jakarta Office Menara Thamrin Building, 22nd flr Jl.M.H. Thamrin Kav 3 Jakarta Pusat			
	09:10 - 11:00	Director's Room	Alan Boulton Director ILO Jakarta Office	Courtesy Call	
	11:00 - 12:30	ILO IPEC Office Declaration Meeting Room	Arum Ratnawati & staff	CTA Overview Briefing & Itinerary	
	14:00 - 17:00	Ministry of Manpower and Transmigration Jl. Gatot Subroto Kav 51 Jakarta Selatan			
		Directorate General of Labour Inspections	I Gusti Made Arka Director General	Courtesy Call	
		Directorate of Labour Norms Inspection of Women & children	Nur Asiah Director	Initial interview on TBP and IPEC suppo	
			Warsini Head of Sub-Directorate of Sectoral Cooperation of		

			Women and Children	
Tue, 15.01.2008	9:00 - 10:00	Directorate of Special Education Ministry of Education Jl. R.S Fatmawati Jakarta	Eko Djatmiko Sukarso Director	Education policy and child labour
	11:30 - 12:30	Office of Yay Perkumpulan Bandungwangi Jl. Pisangan Lama Raya No. 7 RT 04/02 Jakarta Timur	Meeting partners: - Bandungwangi and Bangun Mitra Sejati (BMS) and child beneficiaries	Withdrawal of trafficking victims/children
	14:00-16:00	Office of Yayasan Pelita Ilmu Klender Jakarta timur	Meeting with partners: - Yayasan Pellita Ilmu (YPI) - Perkumpulan Keluarga Berencana Indonesia (PKBI) Jkt - Pusat Pengembangan Sumber Daya Wanita (PPSW) Jkt SEKAM Foundation - Yayasan Kesejahteraan Anak Indonesia (YKAI) - Yayasan Cinta Anak Bangsa (YCAB)	Prevention of children in drug trafficking
	09:00 - 09:30	Depart to Ciomas		Visit workplace
	10:00 - 12:00	Saung Sararea (Children Centre) Desa Parakan Bogor	Meeting with partners: - Education Office Bogor Health Office Bogor - Manpower Office Bogor - Religious Office Bogor (MoRA) - ELSPPAT - BAPPEDA - PGRI Taman Sari - PGRI Ciomas - IWAPI SPN - Village Office	Withdrawn and prevented children (boys shoe/sandal making
	13:00	Depart to Sukabumi		

	15:40 - 17:00	Office for Family Planning and Women Empowerment (KBPP) Jl.	Meeting with partners: - KBPP - Pusat Pengembangan Sumber Daya Wanita (PPSW) - PKBI Jawa Barat (Sukabumi) -Indonesian Teacher Assosiation/PGRI Sukabumi Chapter	Prevention of child trafficking
Thu, 17.01.2008	07:05 - 09:50	Depart from Jakarta and arrive in Aceh		
	17:30 - 18:00 (5)	East Project Jl. Mata I'e Lr. Iklas No. 6 Desa Laambheu Barat Aceh Ketapang II Nanggroe Aceh Darussalam	Nura Dirgantara EAST Provincial Programme Coordinator	Briefing on linkages of previous IPEC in Project in Aceh
	10:00 - 12:30 (1)	Provincial Office of Education Jl. Teuku Daud Beureuh No. 10 Jl. Timur Tala Gedung SPG Lama Nanggroe Aceh Darussalam (NAD)	Sukarni Head of Junior Secondary Division	Education for the prevention of child labour project and Save the Children
	15:00 - 16:00 (3)	Provincial Office of Manpower Jl. Kesatria No. 5 Geuceu Komplek Banda Aceh - NAD	Syahrul Head of Labour Inspection Unit	
	14:00-15:00 (2)	Aceh Besar Dist.	SMP Al Manar	School visit on pre vocational programme
	16:30 - 17:30(4)	Save the Children		Cooperation on pre vocational programme
Fri, 18.01.2008	09:00 - 16:00	Banda Aceh	Evaluation Workshop	Aceh: Education for prevention of Child

			Participants of the workshop: Aceh: - Manpower Office (Disnakertrans) - Yayasan Anak Bangsa - Educaiton Office(Dinas Pendidikan) - Pusat Kajian dan Perlingudngan Anak (PKPA) Banda Aceh & Nias - Balai Latihan Kerja (BLK) - UNICEF Save the Children - Children Centre (COTE) - Dinas Sosial Forum Kemanusiaan dan Persaudaraan Indonesia (FKPI) Nias; North Sumatera: - Serikat Nelayan Sumatra Utara (SNSU) - Kumpulan Anak Anak Pesisir Laut (KAIL) - Format Foundation Provincial Action Committee North Sumatera	North Sumatra: withdrawal from and ser off-shore fishing
	18:45 - 19:45	Depart from Banda Aceh to Medan	Check in at Hotel Novotel	stay over night in Medan
Sat, 19.01.2008	07:00 11:00 - 12:00 14:00 - 15:00 16:00 - 17:00	Depart from Medan to Asahan Depart from Asahan to Medan	SNSU, KEKAR KAIL FORMAT	Site visits as time permits over night in Medan
Sun, 20.01.2008	06:35 - 11:20	Depart to Medan for Surabaya via Jakarta (transit in Jkt for an hour)		over night in Surabya and write up works

Mon, 21.01.2008	09:00 - 10:30	Genta Office	Meeting with Ms. Diyan, Director of Genta and Project Staff and Child Beneficiaries	Withdrawal of child trafficking victims
	11:00 - 12:30	Hotline Surabaya Office	Meeting with Ms. Esthi and Project Staff	Prevention of Trafficking
	15:00 - onward	Yayasan Abdi Asih , Surabaya	Meeting with members of local network to monitor child trafficking	Receiving area of child trafficking
Tue, 22.01.2008	09:00 - 10:30	East Java Provincial Action Committee on WFCL	Mohammud Roem	Provincial role in combatting WFCL in g
	11:00 - 12:00	East Java Child Protection Commission	Agus Bambang Legowo	Provincial role in combatting child traffi
	14:00 - 15:20	Return to Jakarta		
Wed, 23.01.2008	14:00-15:00 (3)	Min on Women	Deputy on Child Welfare	Role of Ministry in prevention of the WF
	09:00 - 09:30 (1)	ILO Office	Media Officer: Gita Ahmad Marzuki, JARAK	
Fri, 25.01.2008	08:00 - 09:00	BAPPENAS	Rahma Iryanti Director of Employment	Youth and child employment
	11:00-12:00	UNICEF	Astrid and Byrn	
	14:00 - 15:00	ILO-IPEC Office	Patrick Daru 15:00: Antarini Arna (Rino) Consultant 16:00-17:00 with Alan Boulton and Peter	Policy Impact Study findings
Thu, 24.01.2008	08:30 - 16:00	Jakarta	Evaluation Workshop (at MoMT)	Overall evaluation of results, problems, i

5. Terms of Reference



International Programme on the Elimination of Child Labour

**Independent Final Evaluation
(Expanded Final Evaluation)**

Combating the Worst Forms of Child Labor in Indonesia -Supporting the Time-Bound Program for the

Elimination of Worst Forms of Child Labor in Indonesia

ILO Project Code	INS/05/P50/USA
ILO Project Number	P270.08.326.051- P270.08.326.052
ILO Iris Code	10639
Country	Indonesia
Duration	51 months
Starting Date	September 30, 2003
Ending Date	December 31, 2007
Project Locations	Indonesia- East Kalimantan, North Sumatra, Greater Jakarta, West Java, East Java, Central Java, Yogyakarta, Aceh.
Project Language	English
Executing Agency	ILO/IPEC
Financing Agency	US DOL
Donor contribution	USDOL: US \$5,565,000 ILO: US \$10,000

Background

1. The aim of IPEC is the progressive elimination of child labour, especially its worst forms. The political will and commitment of individual governments to address child labour — in cooperation with employers' and workers' organizations, non-governmental organizations and other relevant parties in society— is the basis for IPEC action. IPEC support at the country level is based on a phased, multi-sector strategy. This strategy includes raising awareness on the negative consequences of child labour, promoting social mobilization against it, strengthening national capacities to deal with this issue and implementing demonstrative direct action programmes (AP) to prevent children from child labour and remove child labourers from hazardous work and provide them with appropriate alternatives.
2. ILO Decent Work Country Programmes (DWCPs) are being introduced in the ILO to provide a mechanism through which to outline agreed upon priorities between the ILO and the national constituent partners with a broader UN and international development context. For further information please see <http://www.ilo.org/public/english/decent.htm>
3. The DWCP defines a corporate focus on priorities, operational strategies as well as a resource and implementation plan that complement and supports partner plans for national decent work priorities. As such DWCP are broader frameworks to which the individual ILO project is linked and to which it contributes. DWCP are beginning to be gradually introduced in various countries planning and implementing frameworks and in Indonesia.
4. One of the outcomes of Indonesia's DWCP is the effective progress on the implementation of the Indonesia National Plan of Action on the Worst Forms of Child Labour. For this particular DWCP outcome, there are two performance targets:
 - Incidence of child labour is reduced - the target: Child Labour Survey in 2008 reports reduction of worst forms of child labour incidences by 25% (over 2005)
 - ILO constituents and stakeholders apply tools and methodologies developed under the Time-Bound Programme (TBP) in the implementation of the NPA on the Worst Forms of Child Labour; and - the target is ILO constituents and stakeholders in over 20 'new' districts design and implement new initiatives to withdraw and prevent girls and boys from the worst forms of child labour.
5. From the perspective of the ILO, the elimination of child labour is part of its work on standards and fundamental principles and rights at work. The fulfilment of these standards should guarantee decent work for all adults. In this sense the ILO provides technical assistance to its three constituents: government, workers and employers. This tripartite structure is the key characteristic of ILO cooperation and it is within this framework that the activities developed by Time Bound Programmes (TBP) should be analyzed.

6. A TBP is essentially a strategic program framework of tightly integrated and coordinated policies and initiatives at different levels to eliminate specified Worst Forms of Child Labour (WFCL) in a given country within a defined period of time. It is a nationally owned initiative that emphasizes the need to address the root causes of child labour, linking action against child labour to the national development effort, with particular emphasis on the economic and social policies to combat poverty and to promote universal basic education. This implies a commitment to mobilize and allocate national human and financial resources to combat the problem.
6. ILO, with the support of many development organizations and the financial and technical contribution of the United States' Department of Labor (USDOL) has elaborated this concept based on previous national and international experience. It has also established innovative technical cooperation modalities to support countries that have ratified C. 182 to implement comprehensive measures against WFCL.⁹
7. The most critical element of a TBP is that it is implemented and led by the country itself. The countries commit to the development of a plan to eradicate or significantly diminish the worst forms of child labour in a defined period. The TBP process in Indonesia is one of approximately 20 programme frameworks of such nature that are being supported by IPEC at the global level.¹⁰
8. In recent years there has been growing recognition in Indonesia of the need to develop a new approach to tackling child labour. The Government of Indonesia demonstrated its commitment to the elimination of child labour by joining ILO/IPEC in 1992. Since then ILO/IPEC, in close cooperation with the Government, has implemented Country Programs in Indonesia. These country programs focused on awareness raising, capacity building, knowledge acquisition, and related policy development on child labour. In June, 1999, Indonesia ratified ILO Convention 138 on the minimum working age. Then, in March 2000, Indonesia became the first Asian country to ratify ILO Convention 182 on the Elimination of the Worst Forms of Child Labour,
9. Indonesia has the fourth largest population in the world and almost thirty percent of the population is below the age of 15. While significant progress has been made in expanding access to education at the elementary level, data from the Central Bureau of Statistics indicates that more than four million children of junior secondary school age (13-15) do not attend school. The National Socio-economic Survey indicated that 1.5 million children between the ages of 10-14 are already in the

⁹ More information on the TBP concept can be found in the Time Bound Program Manual for Action Planning (MAP), at <http://www.ilo.org/childlabour>.

¹⁰ The term "national TBP" normally refers to any national programme or plan of action that provides a strategic framework for or plan for the implementation of Convention 182 on the worst forms of child labour. TBP is a generic term for such frameworks and for a concept or proposed general approach which will be used in different ways in different national contexts. In many cases the terminology TBP is not used even though the process and the framework will have many of general characteristics of the approach. ILO/IPEC has formulated the TBP concept and approach based on the work of ILO and partners. ILO/IPEC is providing support to the TBP process as in the different countries through "projects of support", which is seen as one of the many component projects, interventions and development partner support to the TBP process.

labour force and not attending school. The same survey found a further 1.6 million children were not attending school but were working in the home¹¹.

10. Many girls and boys who are not in the educational system are at risk of becoming involved in the worst forms of child labour. ILO/IPEC has estimated that over 1.5 million children between the ages of 10-17 are working in the agricultural sector. An ILO and Human Rights Watch report estimates that there are some 700,000 domestic workers below the age of 18 and a large number of these below the age of 15, the legal minimum age of employment. A rapid assessment commissioned by ILO-IPEC in 2002 estimated that there were more than 21,000 children (under 18) in prostitution in Java. The Department of Social Affairs has estimated there are almost 47,000 street children in major urban centres.
11. Against this background, the ratification of ILO Convention 182 was extremely important. As a follow up to the ratification, Presidential Decree No. 12/2001 established a National Action Committee on the Elimination of Worst Forms of Child Labour. The main task of the Committee was to prepare a National Plan of Action on the Worst Forms of Child Labour. In August, 2002, a National Plan of Action was endorsed through Presidential Decree No. 59/2002. The National Plan of Action was operationalized through the development of a time-bound National Action Programme (NAP/TBP). The National Plan of Action covers five years and currently there is a stock-taking exercise looking at the achievements of the Plan to inform the development of the next five year plan.
12. To assist the government of Indonesia in the implementation of the NAP/TBP ILO-IPEC obtained funding from USDOL and for a Project of Support (PoS). One of the PoS's first activities was to commission six Rapid Assessments (RAs) in five sectors including trafficking of children for prostitution; the sale, production and trafficking of drugs; fishing; footwear; and mining. Three analyses were also carried out of policies, good practices and the capacity of potential partners. Finally, a gender review was conducted to ensure that the NPA/TBP addressed gender concerns.
13. Following the completion of the Rapid Assessments, five regional stakeholders meetings were organized to discuss the reports. These meetings provided valuable feedback both on policy issues and tactics for removing children from the WFCL. The regional meetings culminated in a workshop with national stakeholders in July, 2003. The workshop was organized by the Ministry of Manpower and Transmigration with support of ILO/IPEC. The goal of the workshop was to develop a Country (Strategic Program) Framework and to identify required Areas of Impact, which would contribute to tackling the WFCL. The Country Framework is an important tool for the implementation of the NAP/TBP.
14. The IPEC Project supports the implementation of NAP/TBP by two major components: Component 1 is *strengthening the enabling environment supporting the elimination of the worst forms of child labor*. This component focuses on promoting change in the policy and enabling environment through which progress can be made in eliminating the worst forms of child labour. This includes work on promoting child labour in national and local policy frameworks, improving the

¹¹ SUSENAS, 2004

knowledge base, harmonizing and enforcement of laws, awareness raising and advocacy, and building the capacity of stakeholders. Component 1 has six immediate objectives:

- **Immediate Objective 1:** At the end of the project, national, provincial and district development plans and policies include child labour concerns.
- **Immediate Objective 2:** At the end of the project, education and training policies are responsive to the needs of boys and girls involved in, or at risk of, the WFCL.
- **Immediate Objective 3:** At the end of the project, the knowledge base on child labour and its worst forms is enhanced and is being used to monitor child labour trends and to assist in the development and implementation of national, provincial and district policies.
- **Immediate Objective 4:** At the end of the project, the legislative framework for child labour is enhanced and better enforced.
- **Immediate Objective 5:** At the end of this project, behaviour and attitudes towards the WFCL have changed among national and local stakeholders as well as the community at large.
- **Immediate Objective 6:** At the end of this project, capacity of national, provincial and district level stakeholders to plan, monitor, implement and evaluate action to prevent and eliminate the WFCL will have been enhanced.

15. Component 2 is *targeted, direct interventions to tackle the worst forms of child labor*. This component involves direct targeted interventions in five sectors identified by the National Action Plan as priority areas for the elimination of child labour. Through programs in these areas the project aims to remove children from the worst forms of child labour and prevent other children entering such work. The intention is that these interventions provide models, which can be used by national, provincial, and local governments in their own efforts to implement the National Plan of Action. Component 2 has three immediate objectives:

- **Immediate Objective 7:** At the end of the project, detailed information will be available on the extent and nature of the WFCL in the targeted provinces and districts, and the information will have been used as a basis for programming of separate interventions.
- **Immediate Objective 8:** At the end of the project, children will have been withdrawn from the WFCL, and prevented from entering such work through direct services provided by the project.
- **Immediate Objective 9:** At the end of the project, poor families will have been provided with new socio economic opportunities leading to increased income.

Addendum

16. In December, 2004, an earthquake and tsunami had its epicentre off the coast of Nanggroe Aceh Darussalam (Aceh), Indonesia. It was estimated that the disaster caused the deaths of some 118,000 in Aceh and orphaned or separated from their parents more than 35,000 children. Homes, schools and other community facilities were destroyed. Three quarters of a million people, or 20 percent of the Acehnese

population, was made homeless. The international aid effort sought to meet the immediate emergency needs of the population.

17. ILO-IPEC adopted a somewhat different strategy and proposed an addendum to meet the medium and longer term needs of the children of Aceh. IPEC sought to increase the overall budget of the NAP/TBP by US\$1.5 million to support the extension of the geographical scope to cover the province of Aceh. In addition, the addendum would support the provision of services to an additional 3,000 targeted beneficiaries. In August 2005, a project revision was approved by USDOL to adjust elements of the strategy, and activities in Aceh began toward the end of February.
18. The proposed addendum did not require any change to the development and immediate objectives already set for the ILO-IPEC Project of Support to the NAP/TBP. Most of the outputs and activities proposed for the addendum were in line with those of the original project. However the logical framework was revised to provide information about the specific nature and extent of the additional outputs and activities.

Mid-Term Evaluation

19. In December, 2005, a mid-term evaluation of the POS was conducted. The scope of the evaluation was the project as a whole including Action Programmes. The evaluation addressed issues of project design, implementation, lessons learned, replicability and recommendations for future programs and any specific recommendations for use in the Project of Support to the TBP in Indonesia.
20. The evaluation found that the project was successful in facilitating the establishment of a legal and policy-making environment on the national level that is child-labour oriented. There were also signs that such a child-labour oriented environment was being established at the provincial and in some cases the local levels. The PoS was also successful in mobilizing influential government agencies on national and provincial levels to incorporate child labour issues in development plans and government budgets, while at the same time spreading the concept to beyond the project target areas.
21. Furthermore the evaluation found that the PoS achieved its qualitative objectives through direct interventions. However, it could not always reach the intended target figures for prevention and withdrawal. A conclusion of the evaluation was that the implementing partners had the managerial capacity to reach the target figures. Not reaching intended target figures appeared to be more of a problem linked to the characteristics and circumstances of the target groups than it was to an operational problem.
22. The evaluation found that the PoS was well managed, action programs were on track and there were no major constraints. The main recommendation was to continue as before and bring the PoS to a good conclusion. However, the following strategic and operational recommendations were made to improve the final outcome of the PoS.
 - Focus on strengthening the enabling environment in the provinces using innovative approaches.

- Take measures for improved communication between partners and encourage complementary approaches on the provincial levels.
- Allocate more time for technical support to partners, including the National Committee on Child Labour.
- Refocus on target areas. Due to changed conditions in or situations of certain target populations.
- Should the project not reach its target figures, it should focus on increasing target numbers in more accessible target populations.
- Finally, the PoS should make work of facilitating the transfer from theory of gender mainstreaming into application in existing and new action programs.

Current Status of Project

23. Following the mid-term evaluation, the project continued to develop work at multiple levels. The Technical Progress Reports stated that the project was very effective in reaching its target groups and was on its way to achieving its objectives, in terms of both upstream policy objectives and practical action preventing and removing children from the worst forms of child labour.

24. In January 2007, a new CTA took over after the transfer of the CTA to ILO-IPEC HQ in September 2006. To ensure a smooth hand-over, the CTA was provided with background information and informed of major decisions and pending issues immediately after being informed of her selection for the position. The new CTA was invited to ILO HQ for a comprehensive technical briefing programme and had regular contact with the previous CTA.

Final Evaluation of Project of Support to Time Bound Programme

25. The final evaluation is required by ILO/IPEC policies and procedures as well as per donor requirement. It is intended to serve as key tool for planning and learning and in particular in view of both the innovative nature of the TBP process and the underlying focus on facilitating and supporting the further action on child labour where solid documentation and analysis of the experience from current support initiative are important.

26. Final evaluation of ILO/IPEC projects of support to TBP are done as expanded final evaluation which includes specific impact studies to for instance provide clear quantified data on broader and longer term changes for direct beneficiaries or detailed review of mainstreaming efforts. This evaluation will include a sub-study in the form of Policy Impact Study carried out as a desk review on the impact of the work of the project at the policy level, in particular on the mainstreaming of child labour in to relevant policies. As one of the implementation of a Policy Impact Study as part of an expanded final evaluation, the study will help inform the approach to other such studies and to the development of a methodology as part of the Impact Assessment Framework project of ILO/IPEC.

27. As the one of the first implementations of a final evaluation of full phase of a project of support to TBP, the design of this evaluation has been influenced by the initial work on the development of a standard framework for the evaluation of TBP

projects of support. It is expected that the expanded final evaluation and others of the first generation will allow for the full development of such evaluation framework to be used for sub-subsequent generations of TBP projects of support.

Purpose and Scope of the Final Evaluation

29. The nature of the evaluation processes will be decided in consultation with partners including US-DOL as the donor. The Design, Evaluation and Documentation (DED) Section of ILO/IPEC will coordinate the consultations, planning, and coordination of the evaluations. Appropriate partners, stakeholders, and US-DOL will be involved in the process and will receive a copy of all evaluation reports. At the outset of the final evaluation process, input was solicited from key stakeholders.
30. The main purposes for which the evaluation should be conducted are to:
 - Determine if the project and addendum achieved its stated immediate objectives (including specific targets) and explain why or why not
 - Assess the overall and specific outcomes and progress towards impact of the project in terms of sustained improvements and contribution to the NAP/TBP and broader national process;
 - Identify lessons learned and potential good practices to inform future action on child labour in Indonesia, including particular possible future support.
31. The evaluation should assess if suggested conclusions and recommendations from the midterm evaluation were implemented and gauge the success of any revised activities and interventions. The evaluation should also try to avoid duplication of resources devoted toward collection of basic, unchanging information collected during the midterm evaluation.
32. It would be useful if the evaluation would identify possibly key outcomes or achievements that can be considered the “project legacy” that the project will be remembered for in the broader efforts on eliminating child labour in Indonesia.
33. The object of the evaluation is the ILO-IPEC Programme in Support (PoS) of the TBP in Indonesia—not the TBP itself. There is a subtle, yet very important distinction between the two. Therefore the evaluation will review what has been done for mobilizing national action on child labour, what type of actors have been prioritized, what is involved in the process of design, managing and implementing a TBP support process and how the ILO/IPEC project has contributed to the process
34. Given that the broader TBP approach is relatively young (since 2001), the innovative nature and the element of “learning by doing” of the approach should be taken into account. The TBP concept is intended to evolve as lessons are learned and to adapt to changing circumstances. The identification of specific issues and lessons learned for broader application for the TBP concept, as a whole, would be a particular feature of this evaluation.
35. The Policy Impact Study will focus on assessing the impact at the policy level in mainstreaming child labour into policies and plans at different levels. This would in particular focus on how the project has worked to bring about the outcomes

regarding IO1 (child labour concerns in national, provincial, and district development plans and policies) and IO2 (responsiveness of education and training policies to needs of children at risk). The assessment will focus on identifying how such policies and plans have incorporated child labour issues and are working on child labour related aspects; and how this can be attributed to ILO/IPEC project and ILO efforts. .

Suggested Aspects to be Addressed

36. The evaluation should address the overall ILO evaluation concerns such as relevance, effectiveness, efficiency and sustainability as defined in the ILO Guidelines for the Preparation of Independent Evaluations of ILO Programmes and Projects and for gender concerns see: ILO Guidelines for the Integration of Gender Issues into the Design, Monitoring and Evaluation of ILO Programmes and Projects, January 1995.
37. In line with results-based framework approach used by ILO-IPEC for identifying results at global, strategic and project level, the evaluation will focus on identifying and analysing results through addressing key questions related to the evaluation concerns and the achievement of the Immediate Objectives of the project using data from the logical framework indicators. Answers to the key questions will be interpreted in light of relevance, efficiency, effectiveness, and sustainability—core values of ILO-IPEC.
38. Annex 1 contains the broad suggested aspects that can be identified at this point for the evaluation to address in the context of the evaluation concerns and immediate objectives of the project. Other aspects can be added as identified by the evaluation team in accordance with the given purpose and in consultation with ILO/IPEC Geneva's Design, Evaluation and Documentation Section (DED). The evaluation instrument prepared by the evaluation team will indicate further selected specific aspects to be addressed. The evaluation instrument should identify the priority aspects to be addressed in the evaluation.
39. For the policy study, the suggested aspects will in particular focus on those listed for the DWCP/TBP level, IO 1 and IO 2 and questions related to mainstreaming.

Methodology and Time Frame

40. The following is the suggested methodology for the final evaluation (See below for details on the Policy Impact Study). The methodology can be adjusted by the evaluation team if considered necessary in accordance with the scope and purpose of this exercise as described above. This should be done in consultation with the Design, Evaluation and Documentation Section (DED) of ILO/IPEC
41. The evaluation team will be asked to include as part of the specific evaluation instrument to be developed, the **standard evaluation instruments** that ILO/IPEC has developed for documenting and analyzing achievements of the projects and contributions of the Action Programmes to the project.

42. The methodology for the evaluation should consider the multiple levels involved in this process: the framework and structure of the national efforts to eliminate the WFCL in Indonesia and IPEC’s support to this process through this project. Data gathering and analysis tools should consider this methodological and practical distinction

The evaluation should include a **desk review** of appropriate material, including the project documents, progress reports, previous evaluation reports, outputs of the projects and action programmes, and relevant material from secondary sources. This includes baselines and any government documents such as National Plans or documents about the Time Bound Programme in Indonesia. The impact assessment sub-study on policy outcomes of IO1 and IO2 will be carried out as a separate desk review. The policy impact study will be provided to the international consultant as an important input for the evaluation.

43. Sources of Information are identified as follows:

Available at HQ and to be supplied by DED	Project documents DED Guidelines and ILO guidelines Mid-term country review/evaluation
Available in project office and to be supplied by project management	Progress reports/Status reports Evaluation and similar reports at the action programme level Technical and financial report of partner agencies Other studies and research undertaken Action Programme Summary Outlines Project files National workshop proceedings or summaries Country level planning documents SPIF documents Master list and records of beneficiaries Action Programme Progress Reports Baseline reports and information Reports, reviews and related material relevant to the National Plan of Action and the NAP/TBP
To be located as appropriate	Relevant national development programme and policy documents PRPS documents such as strategies, monitoring plans and reports, costing Relevant documents on the development situation in Indonesia and context of child labour

44. The evaluation will include **field-work** in selected locations of Indonesia, where interviews with governmental agencies, trade unions and employers’ organizations, and NGOs at national, provincial, and district levels. It will also include site visits to Action Programs that are currently being implemented or have been closed.

45. The evaluator is required to interview donor representatives through conference call early in the evaluation process. The evaluation team will also interview key people from the IPEC team, such as the SRO Director, in the regional office in Bangkok, Thailand. Both will preferably happen during the desk review phase.

46. In interviews, focus groups and other information gathering exercises, the evaluation consultant should solicit the opinions of a wide variety of stakeholders, including

children, parents of beneficiaries, teachers, government representatives, professionals linked to the targeted sectors, representatives from trade unions and employers' organizations, partners, implementing agencies and all major stakeholders, including the donor (e.g., USDOL project managers, representatives of the US Embassy in Jakarta including the Labour Officer and USAID. In addition, the evaluator should interview the managers of other child labour projects being funded by USDOL in Indonesia and implemented by Save the Children.)

47. The evaluation process will include two, one-day **stakeholder workshops** to present the preliminary findings, conclusions and recommendations to IPEC staff and key partners for feedback. The participants of the workshop will include those interviewed during the fieldwork and other key stakeholders of the project. The results of this meeting should be taken into consideration for the preparation of the draft report.
48. Some elements of the Strategic Programme Impact Framework (SPIF) approach can be used.
49. Proposed participants at the workshop will be the direct key stakeholders in the project of support but should to the extent possible also include other national partners in the TBP framework as of the feedback, including international development partners.
50. Project management will provide a list of key stakeholders for possible participation in this workshop. This list will also serve as list of potential key informants to consult. Project management will prepare a suggested schedule of visits. The final list of participants, interviews and visits will be determined by the evaluation team in consultation with DED.
51. The first workshop will take place in Banda Aceh and will be attended by stakeholders from the region. The focus of this workshop will be on the objectives (prevention only) and focus area (education) of the Aceh Addendum. This workshop will be held in conjunction with the field visit to Banda Aceh. The second stakeholder workshop will take place in Jakarta at the conclusion of the consultant's mission. It will be attended by national level stakeholders and participants.
52. The evaluation should be carried out in adherence with ILO-IPEC Guidelines and Notes, to **UN System Evaluation Standards and Norms**, and to the *ILO Guidelines for the Integration of Gender Issues into the Design, Monitoring and Evaluation of ILO Programmes and Projects, January 1995*.
53. The evaluation consultants will prepare a brief document indicating the methodological approach to the evaluation (the "evaluation instrument"), to be discussed and approved by DED prior to the commencement of the field mission.

Methodology for the Policy Impact Study¹²

54. The following is the suggested approach to the Policy Impact Study
- (a) Based on these TORs and initial desk review of relevant policy documents both from the ILO/IPEC project directly and other relevant policy documents, an initial annotated outline and analytical framework (study design) is prepared. This should indicate the policy areas of analysis as related to the work of the project and the identified policies to mainstream child labour into; the methodology to be used in the analysis and the relevant sources of information, including key informants to talk
 - (b) The study design will be discussed with ILO/IPEC Indonesia, sub-regional office in Bangkok, IPEC HQ and the ILO/IPEC DED; and revised based on received comments
 - (c) Further desk review and data collection will take place through study of policy documents, follow-up interviews etc as per agreed analytical framework
 - (d) Interviews will be conducted with a list of key informants to be agreed upon by the national consultant, ILO/IPEC Indonesia and DED.
 - (e) The national consultant will participate in the national stakeholder evaluation workshop as an observer.
 - (f) Consultations will be held with the overall evaluation team during the in-country work of that team. This will include adjustment in the analytical framework to provide key information and analysis for the evaluation on policy.
 - (g) A revised annotated outline will be presented immediately before the first analysis for quick comments
 - (h) An initial presentation of key analysis and findings will be prepared in time for use by the overall evaluation team for the first draft of the report on the expanded final evaluation.
 - (i) A more comprehensive first draft is presented for comments by the functions indicated in bullet point (b).
 - (j) Based on those comments a final report can be prepared for final review and final technical sign-off by DED.

Expected Output and Timeline

55. The evaluation report in draft form and in English should be presented to IPEC DED one week after the finalization of the field mission. The report should conform to ILO-IPEC Guidelines and Notes, to **UN evaluation standards and norms**, and to the *ILO Guidelines for the Integration of Gender Issues into the Design, Monitoring and Evaluation of ILO Programmes and Projects, January 1995*. The report will be circulated by DED to all relevant stakeholders for their comments. The evaluation consultant should consider the comments for the preparation of the final draft of the report.
56. The length of the report should not exceed 30 pages (excluding annexes). It is suggested to structure the report as follows:

¹² The Policy Impact Study will be carried out with funding from ILO-IPEC by a consultant who is not the international consultant hired with USDOL funding.

- Executive Summary with key findings, conclusions and recommendations
 - Description of the project
 - Clearly identified findings
 - Clearly identified conclusions and recommendations
 - Lessons learned
 - Potential good practices and effective models of intervention.
 - Appropriate annexes including TOR
 - Standard evaluation instrument matrix
57. The report should include specific and detailed recommendations solidly based on the evaluator's analysis and, if appropriate, addressed specifically to the organization/institution responsible for implementing it. The report should also include a specific section on lessons learned from this project that could be replicated or should be avoided in the future, in the same or in other IPEC projects.
58. As an expanded final evaluation of a project of support to TBP in the context of the work on the TBP approach in ILO/IPEC, a standard outline for the evaluation report will be provided. This outline is in principle to be used but the evaluator can provide suggestions to revise this in the form of an annotated report outline provided at the end of the field work.
59. Ownership of data from the evaluation rests jointly with ILO-IPEC and the consultants. The copyright of the evaluation report will rest exclusively with the ILO. Use of the data for publication and other presentations can only be made with the written agreement of ILO-IPEC. Key stakeholders can make appropriate use of the evaluation report in line with the original purpose and with appropriate acknowledgement.
60. The impact assessment sub-study will provide an initial analytical report to use for the overall final evaluation, focusing on key achievements. A separate report can be prepared upon the completion of the final draft of the overall evaluation report and as technically approved by ILO/IPEC DED. .

Resources and Management

61. The evaluation will be carried out by a team with extensive experience in the evaluation of development or social interventions, preferably including practical experience in assessing comprehensive policy/program frameworks or national plans. The team members should have an advanced degree in social sciences, economics or similar and specific training on evaluation theory and methods. Working experience on issues related to child labour, education and children's welfare will be essential. Full command of English as a working language will be required. The final selection of the evaluation team will be done by DED.

International Evaluator	
Responsibility	Profile
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Desk review • Analysing the documents, direct observation, interview notes, and information from the questionnaires • Prepare an evaluation plan • Act as independent evaluation consultant for the evaluation of the project and covering other evaluation related issues during a two-week in-country field visit. • Prepare evaluation report 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Extensive experience in evaluation of development projects, in particular with local development projects ▪ Relevant experience in the region ▪ Prior experience with or knowledge of the TBP project of support type of projects such as national level evaluations involving policy level work, institutional building. Linkages, partnerships and integrated programmes ▪ Familiarity with and knowledge of specific thematic areas ▪ Experience working with local organisations/local partners agencies ▪ Experience in UN system or similar international development experience ▪ Experience evaluating gender issues. ▪ Experience with policy analysis, strategic planning and design of country programmes desirable
National Consultant	
Responsibility	Profile
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Accompany international consultant during data collection phase • Assist with the facilitation of the stakeholder workshop • Support the preparation of the final report 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Extensive knowledge of Indonesia's geography, culture and language • Documented experience in disciplined inquiry • Previous experience with stakeholders workshops and preparation of background reports • Prior knowledge of ILO/IPEC an advantage
National Consultant for Policy Impact Study	
Responsibility	Profile
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Conduct the policy impact study through a desk review, preparation of an annotated outline and analytical framework, interview with key informants, participation in national evaluation stakeholder workshops, analysis and preparation of initial analytical findings; and preparation of first and second (final) draft of report on Policy Impact Study, 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Experience with policy analysis, strategic planning and design of country programmes • Familiar with the development policy set-up in Indonesia; knowledge of the specific policies is desirable • Experience in policy level evaluation or assessment • Relevant regional experience in the region • Familiarity with and knowledge of specific thematic areas • Experience in UN system or similar international development experience • Experience evaluating gender issues.

62. The following are the resources needed for this evaluation (for detailed information see the Evaluation Timeline below):

- For overall final evaluation
 - Fees for one international consultant during 25 working days
 - Fees for one national consultant during 12 working days
 - Fees for one translator during 12 working days
 - In-country travel expenses and daily subsistence allowances for consultants during field mission
 - Costs of organizing the stakeholders' workshop
- For policy impact study
 - Fees for policy impact consultant
 - Local travel

63. The DED responsible official in IPEC HQ will manage the evaluation process, including the policy impact assessment study. In country management and logistics support will be provided by the CTA of the projects and the IPEC team as a whole.

64. A detailed budget is available separately

Evaluation Timeline for overall Expanded Final Evaluation

<i>Phases</i>	<i>Tasks</i>	<i>Responsible</i>	<i>Dates</i>	<i>Outputs</i>
Phase One: Preparatory	<p>Briefing with IPEC DED and preparatory desk review</p> <p>Design of the evaluation instrument</p> <p>Input to Policy Impact Study</p>	International consultant with DED support	10-14 Dec, 2007 (5)	Evaluation instrument
Phase Two: Data collection	<p>Field work, interviews and data collection as part of normal final evaluation</p> <p>Stakeholder evaluation workshops</p> <p>Consultation with national consultant</p>	<p>Evaluation team (International and national consultant, with DED support)</p> <p>National Consultant to support international consultant</p> <p>Translator to support evaluation team</p>	<p>14-25 Jan, 2008 (12)</p> <p>18 & 25 Jan, 2008</p>	<p>Data</p> <p>Feedback preliminary findings, conclusions and recommendations</p> <p>Available first analytical results of policy impact study</p>
Phase Three: Report writing	<p>Preparation and commenting on reports as per normal procedures</p> <p>Consultation with key stakeholder on preliminary findings and to identify further issues for the final evaluation</p>	International consultant with DED support	<p>Report writing: 28 Jan - 1Feb, 2008 (5)</p> <p>Submission of draft report: 4 Feb, 2008</p> <p>Revisions: 18-20 February, 2007 (3)</p> <p>Submission of final version report: 22 Feb, 2008</p>	<p>Draft version evaluation report</p> <p>Final version evaluation report</p>

ANNEX I of TOR: Suggested Aspects

Suggested Aspects linked to Indonesia's DWCP and to the national TBP in Indonesia

How did the PoS help the TBP make progress in achieving its 2008 targets on reducing the incidence of child labour?

How did the PoS help the TBP constituents and stakeholders in over 20 'new' districts design and implement new initiatives to withdraw and prevent girls and boys from the worst forms of child labour?

Suggested Aspects linked to Specific Results from the Project

IO1 At the end of the project, national, provincial and district development plans and policies include child labour concerns.

- How many development plans—at national, provincial and district level—identify child labour as a priority or use child labour related indicators?
- How did the PoS contribute to making the sections of national, provincial and district government development plans and policies that deal with child labour issues more coherent?
- How did the PoS contribute to making the sections of national, provincial and district development plans that deal with child labour issues more consistent with international standards?
- How many new programme initiatives address working or at risk children and their families?
- How did the PoS support the new programme initiatives?

IO2 At the end of the project, education and training policies are responsive to the needs of boys and girls involved in, or at risk of, the WFCL

- What progress was made towards national targets for participation in school that was linked with MDG targets?
- How did the PoS support progress towards national targets for participation in school that was linked with MDG targets?
- How many references to working children and children at risk appeared in new or revised educational policies and plans?
- What role did the PoS have in helping relevant ministries revise educational policies and plans?
- How many schools are using models to identify children of risk of dropping out as a means to keep them in school?
- How did the PoS support the dissemination and implementation of new models to schools?
- How many schools and vocational training centres used new curricula?
- How did the PoS support the development of new educational and training curricula?
- How did the PoS support the implementation of new curricula?

IO3 At the end of the project, the knowledge base on child labour and its worst forms is enhanced

and is being used to monitor child labour trends and to assist in the development and implementation of national, provincial and district policies.

- What was the quality and accessibility of data and other information on child labour?
- How did the PoS help to improve the quality and accessibility of information?
- What new information was used as a basis for formulating and monitoring national and regional policies?
- What was the PoS's role in determining what new information would be used as the basis for formulating and monitoring national and regional policies?
- What child labour monitoring models proved most effective and generated the most reliable data?
- How did the PoS support child labour monitoring?
- What was the increase in published and unpublished research on child labour from universities and research institutes?
- How did the PoS support research on child labour from universities and research institutes?

IO4 At the end of the project, the legislative framework for child labour is enhanced and better enforced.

- How many standardised training programmes for law enforcers included a module on child labour?
- How did the PoS support training programmes for law enforcers?
- How many violations of child labour legislation were recorded?
- How many provinces have signed decrees on the WFCL into laws?
- How did the PoS support the signing of decrees on WFCL into law?

IO5 At the end of this project, behaviour and attitudes towards the WFCL have changed among national and local stakeholders as well as the community at large.

- What changes in behaviours and attitudes towards the WFCL were documented among national as well as local stakeholders and the community at large?
- How did the PoS support changes in the behaviour and attitudes of stakeholders?
- What was the experience with Knowledge Attitude and Behaviour surveys and studies?
- How many groups independently started to address issues related to the combat of hazardous child labour?
- How did the PoS mobilize groups to independently address child labour issues?
- What was the extent of activity of WFCL by key stakeholders?
- How did the PoS support key stakeholder activity?

IO6 At the end of this project, capacity of national, provincial and district level stakeholders to plan, monitor, implement and evaluate action to prevent and eliminate the WFCL will have been enhanced.

- What was the capacity of the NAC WFCL, NSC and local level government and social partners to better implement, monitor and evaluate child labour programmes has increased?
- How did the PoS help to increase the capacity of the NAC, NSC and local level government?
- How many and what percentage of targeted workplaces are regularly inspected and/or monitored?
- How did the PoS support targeted workplace inspections?

- How much did monitoring of WFCL increase outside the workplace?
- How did the PoS encourage monitoring outside the workplace?
- How many integrated monitoring teams were there?
- How did the PoS help form integrated monitoring teams?
- How many documentation systems includes both workplace and school surveillance?
- How did the PoS help set up workplace and school documentation systems?
- Were there any opportunities to harmonize these systems?
- How many activities were undertaken and/or agreements for participation in and support to the programme from governmental agencies, trade unions and employers' organizations, at national, provincial, and district levels?
- What was the PoS role in these activities and agreements?
- How many provincial and district level committees on the WFCL?
- How did the PoS help with the formation of WFCL committees?
- How did the PoS support WFCL committee activities?

IO7 At the end of the project, detailed information will be available on the extent and nature of the WFCL in the targeted provinces and districts, and the information will have been used as a basis for programming of separate interventions.

- What was the quality and accuracy of the baseline surveys?
- How did the PoS contribute to the quality and accuracy of the baseline surveys
- How was new information used to plan separate programme components/action programmes?
- How did the PoS facilitate the use of new information for planning?

IO8 At the end of the project, children will have been withdrawn from the WFCL, and prevented from entering such work through direct services provided by the project.

- How many working children and children at risk were withdrawn or prevented from WFCL?
- How did the PoS support withdrawal and prevention?
- How many working children and children at risk received services under the social protection programmes?
- What kind of social services did the PoS help to provide?
- How many participants were mainstreamed into formal education?
- How did the PoS help to mainstream participants into formal education?
- How many participants took up employment in the area in which they received vocational training?
- What kind of placement services did the PoS help provide?
- How many participants gained an acceptable income from livelihood programmes?
- How did the PoS help facilitate livelihood programmes?
- How many participants have received counselling, health and rehabilitation services to successfully reintegrate them into their home communities?
- What kinds of reintegration services did the PoS help provide?
- How many workplaces adopted hazards elimination schemes?
- How did the PoS help facilitate adoption of hazards elimination schemes?
- How many children above the age of 15 have benefited by the hazards elimination schemes?

IO9 At the end of the project, poor families will have been provided with new socio economic opportunities leading to increased income.

- How many poor households participated in programme activities?
- How did the PoS reach out to poor households and get them to participate in programme activities?
- The number of poor households that have improved their income and ensured a sustainable alternative income?

Cross-cutting Questions

Relevance, Design and External Factors

- Was the project relevant to the local situation concerning child labour, specifically the needs of the target groups, the local capacities to address these issues and the national policies and programs in place?
- How realistic were the critical assumptions and to what extent did other factors outside the control of project management affect project implementation and attainment of objectives/goal?

Synergies, Linkages and Networking

- Assess the relationships between the project and other child-labour interventions supported by IPEC or by other organizations (most especially, the two USDOL-funded Save the Children projects) in the country. Were synergies and economies of scale created?
- Was the project successful in terms of raising awareness on the child labour problem and on promoting social mobilization to address this issue? Please assess the effectiveness of the project in building sustainable networks between organizations working to address child labour on the national and local levels.
- Were other development partners mobilised as part of the support from the project?

Targeted Intervention – beneficiaries

- Assess the effectiveness and efficiency of the education and non-education services being provided to beneficiaries. Discuss how a decision was made on what type of service was most appropriate for individual beneficiaries; the impact on beneficiaries of receiving both series of services versus receipt of only one type of service
- Assess how the project monitored both the work and education status of all direct beneficiaries, discussing whether or not the system was appropriate and efficient in monitoring each individual child to ensure that they were no longer working and/or that work conditions were no longer hazardous, and were attending education programs regularly. Also, for relevant sectors and districts, assess the system established between ILO-IPEC and Save the Children to avoid duplication of reporting of direct beneficiaries to USDOL—was it successful? Were beneficiaries who received services from both projects identified and clearly distinguished for tracking and reporting purposes?

Capacity Building and enabling action

- Has the capacity of the implementing agencies and other relevant partners to develop effective action against child labour been increased as a consequence of the project?

Targeted interventions – models

- Assess the effectiveness of the different action programs implemented and their contribution to the immediate objectives of the program. Assess the lessons learned from these APs and the possibilities for replication.

Sustainability and basis for further action

- Identify and assess the relevancy, coherence, adequacy and effectiveness of strategies adopted by the project and the Action Programs to ensure sustainability.
- Assess the process of promoting local ownership of the program and promoting long-term sustainability. Specifically, assess how the idea of a phase-out strategy for project components was addressed during the projects' design and implementation, as well as the actual efforts to phase out activities or to transfer responsibilities to local partners as a means of promoting sustainability.
- Were the Action Programs well-rooted within the communities in which they operated? What is the likelihood that the partner organizations involved in the project will continue to work to eliminate child labour after the project ends?

Support and facilitation of the TBP process in Indonesia:

- Examine the extent and nature to which the ILO/IPEC project of support has provided key technical and facilitation support to the further development, enhancement and implementation of the NAP/TBP.
- In addition to the general lessons learned and recommendations provide specific lessons and recommendations on how to integrate the lessons from the project into planning processes and implementation for the NAP as a TBP approach in Indonesia, particularly focusing on identifying elements of emerging effective models of interventions
- How was the Strategic Programme Impact Framework or similar strategic planning process used?

Other aspects to address normally part of the TBP process

- Mainstreaming of child labour and anchoring in national development frameworks and other efforts, such as decentralisation
- Support to national institutional framework for broader action on child labour
- Contribution to building sound knowledge based for evidence based analysis and further action