

# **Independent End-of-Project Evaluation Report**

## **ILO Project Combating Forced Labour and Trafficking of Indonesian Migrant Workers (INS/06/M10/NOR)**

**September – October 2008**

**Prepared by Steven Schmidt– Independent Evaluator**

**October 2008**

## **Table of Content**

Acronyms and Abbreviations .....	- 3 -
1. Executive Summary.....	- 5 -
2. Brief Background on the Project and it's Logic.....	- 7 -
2.1 Current Status of Labour Migration Placement and Protection.....	- 8 -
2.2 The Development Impact of Labour Migration.....	- 10 -
2.2.1 Employment.....	- 10 -
2.2.2 Income Generation/Foreign exchange .....	- 11 -
2.2.3 Poverty Reduction.....	- 12 -
2.2.4 Work Ethic .....	- 13 -
2.2.5 Protection: Paralegal, Pre-departure and Worker Rights .....	- 13 -
2.2.6 Maximising the Development Impact.....	- 14 -
3. Purpose Scope and clients of evaluation.....	- 15 -
4. Methodology .....	- 16 -
5. Review of Implementation.....	- 16 -
5.1 Project Start-up Delays .....	- 16 -
5.2 Project Finance .....	- 17 -
5.3 Regulation and Institutional Changes.....	- 18 -
5.4 Other Implementation Constraints.....	- 19 -
5.5 Activities Implemented Throughout the Project.....	- 19 -
5.6 Project Outputs.....	- 20 -
5.7 Expected Outcomes.....	- 20 -
5.8 Information Management and Reporting .....	- 21 -
5.9 Impacts.....	- 21 -
5.9.1 Policy and Legislative Protection .....	- 21 -
5.9.2 Awareness Raising .....	- 22 -
5.9.3 Capacity Building.....	- 22 -
5.9.3 Direct Assistance and Service Provision .....	- 23 -
5.9.4 Targeted Research and Documentation.....	- 26 -
5.9.5 Gender.....	- 27 -
5.9.6 Public Service Training .....	- 27 -
6. Presentation of findings regarding project performance .....	- 28 -
6.1 Relevance of CFLTIMW .....	- 28 -
6.1.1 Indonesia Decent Work Country Program.....	- 28 -
6.1.2 DWCP Priorities and Outcomes.....	- 29 -
6.1.3 The ILO and Domestic Work .....	- 30 -
6.2 Project Logic .....	- 30 -
6.3 Validity of Design.....	- 31 -
7. Conclusions .....	- 33 -
8. Recommendations .....	- 35 -
8.1 Program Management & Implementation.....	- 35 -
8.2 Implementation and Future Action .....	- 35 -
9. Lessons Learned .....	- 37 -
Appendix 1 CFLTIMW Project Activities.....	- 38 -
Appendix 2 CFLTIMW Project Outputs.....	- 42 -
Appendix 3 Publications.....	- 45 -
Appendix 4 Priority Program Enhancements .....	- 47 -
Appendix 5 Terms of Reference of the Evaluation .....	- 49 -
Main tasks and Outputs.....	- 53 -
Appendix 6 Evaluation Interviews and Meetings.....	- 56 -

## Acronyms and Abbreviations

Term	Meaning	Definition (for Non English Terms)
ADWA	Asian Domestic Workers Alliance	
APINDO	<i>Asosiasi Pengusaha Indonesia</i>	The Association of Indonesian Employers
ASPEK	<i>Asosiasi Serikat Pekerja Indonesia</i>	The Association of Indonesian Trade Union
BNP2TKI	<i>Badan Nasional Penempatan dan Perlindungan Tenaga Kerja Indonesia</i>	The National Board of Workers' Placement and Protection Authority of the Republic of Indonesia
BP3TKI	<i>Badan Provinsi Penempatan dan Perlindungan Tenaga Kerja Indonesia</i>	Provincial Offices of BNP2TKI
CFLTIMW	Combating Forced Labour and Trafficking of Indonesian Migrant Workers Project	
DFA	Department of Foreign Affairs	
DWCP	Decent Work Country Programme	
GOI	Government of Indonesia	
ILO	International Labour Organisation	
ILO ROAP	ILO Regional Office for Asia - Pacific	
<i>Komnas Perempuan</i>	<i>Komisi Nasional Anti Kekerasan Terhadap Perempuan</i>	National Commission on Violence Against Women
KOPBUMI	<i>Konsorsium Pembela Buruh Migran Indonesia</i>	The Consortium for the Advocacy of Indonesian Migrant Workers
MDGs	Millennium Development Goals	
<i>Menko Ekuin</i>	<i>Kementerian Koordinator Bidang Ekonomi, Keuangan dan Industri</i>	Coordinating Ministry for Economic, Finance and Industry Affairs
MFLM	Multilateral Framework on Labour Migration	
MOMT	Ministry of Manpower and Transmigration	
MW/DW	Migrant Worker/Domestic Worker	
NGO	Non Government Organisation	
PJTKI/PPTKIS	<i>Perusahaan Jasa Tenaga Kerja Indonesia/Perusahaan Pengerahan Tenaga Kerja Indonesia Swasta</i>	Private Employment Agency of Indonesia
PPSW	<i>Pusat Pemberdayaan Sumberdaya Wanita</i>	Center for Women's Resources Empowerment
PRsS	Poverty Reduction Strategies	
RENSTRA	<i>Rencana Strategis</i>	Strategic Planning
RPJM	<i>Rencana Pembangunan Jangka Menengah</i>	Medium Term Development Plan
SBMI/IMWU	<i>Serikat Buruh Migran Indonesia</i>	Indonesian Migrant Workers

		Union
<i>SMS</i>	<i>Solidaritas Migran Scalabrini</i>	Scalabrini Migrant Solidarity
SIYB	ILO Start & Improve Your Business Programme	
<i>SPPQT</i>	<i>Serikat Paguyuban Petani Qaryah Thayyibah</i>	<i>Qaryah Thayyibah</i> Peasants Union
UNDAF	The United Nations Development Assistance Framework	
TKI	<i>Tenaga Kerja Indonesia</i>	Indonesian migrant worker/s
TOT	Training of Trainers	
UN	United Nations	

## 1. Executive Summary

1. Indonesia currently has approximately 4,000,000 documented migrant workers (MW) who are primarily engaged as domestic workers (DW) working overseas, and an estimated number of undocumented MW as high as 12,000,000 which make it the second largest formal exporter of labour and perhaps the largest informally from an international perspective.
2. Protection and regulation for MW/DW still needs extensive improvement in Indonesia, and it is within this context that the ILO has formed the partnership with the GOI under the *Combating Forced Labour and Trafficking of Indonesian Migrant Workers Project* (CFLTIMW) through working with its relevant organizations as follows:
  - a. Coordinating Ministry for Economic, Finance and Industry Affairs (*Menko Ekuin*)
  - b. Department of Manpower and Transmigration
  - c. National Agency for Placement and Protection of Indonesian Migrant Workers (BNP2TKI)
  - d. Ministry of Foreign Affairs
  - e. National Committee of Violence Against Women (*Komnas Perempuan*)
  - f. Indonesian Migrant Workers Union (SBMI)
  - g. Other Migrant Workers Organizations in Indonesia, Malaysia, Singapore and Hong Kong
  - h. NGOs and CBOs concerned with Domestic Workers, Migrant Workers, Forced Labour and Trafficking.
3. Although systemic improvements have been made, MW/DW are still plagued by the following issues:
  - Lack of legal protection
  - Abuse and exploitation during recruitment and placement
  - Abuse in the workplace
  - Claiming rights and freedom of association
  - Forced labour and trafficking
  - End of contract abuses
  - Re-integration challenges
  - Child labour
  - Lack of pre-departure planning and preparation (financial and other)
  - Remittance management
  - Unclear remuneration structures

In general there still exists an urgent need for governments to prepare, ratify and enforce legislation on domestic work, which is unregulated and informal, and therefore lacks both social and legal protection.

4. Migrant workers, especially domestic migrant workers represent a high potential resource that if managed well can bring significant earning power to bear on the development of the local and national economy of Indonesia. Migrant and domestic work provides an avenue through which to ameliorate a significant amount of unemployment, generate income and foreign exchange, reduce poverty, develop the national work ethic and increase the national response to globalization.

5. This evaluation was undertaken from September to October 2008 and has the following objectives:
  - a. review the achievements of the Project by assessing to what extent the stated objectives and major outputs have been achieved.
  - b. review the efficiency and effectiveness of the project implementation framework and links to national policy and programme frameworks, as well as the potentials for doing so in a potential new project phase.
  - c. review the efficiency and effectiveness of the project implementation framework and links to national frameworks
  - d. assess if the project has reached a state of maturity at the end of the current project phase so that project-initiated activities may be sustained without further external financial and technical support
  - e. review to what extent the programme is still relevant and is continuing to meet the needs of its direct target group – migrant and internal domestic workers in the project countries
  - f. draw conclusions in terms of the progress made and make recommendations for future actions beyond the end of the project (i.e. what is the scope and potential for activities being sustained without technical assistance by the ILO, and what is the scope for another phase of the project?)
6. The evaluation consisted primarily of a desk study of relevant documents, focus group discussions, interviews and site visits to a sample of its activities in local/rural areas. The project was advised during inception that an impact analysis would not be cost effective and due to the short implementation period of two years is unlikely to have created any measurable impact at the time of the evaluation. The evaluation therefore examines proxy indicators and stakeholder perceptions to describe the current rate of progress toward its objective which is “to contribute to the eradication of discrimination and exploitation of Indonesian migrant workers in Indonesia and selected main receiving countries in Southeast Asia”.
7. The CFLTIMW Project was initially beset by a number of implementation constraints including start up delays, funding shortfalls and regulation and institutional changes. However commendable action was taken by the project to overcome these initial constraints by rescheduling and intensifying activity implementation, identifying and accessing other funding sources and exploiting synergies with other projects. The project still deals with resistance to change among stakeholders due to their perspectives on domestic work and its informal nature, and poor capacity of partner institutions, especially in reporting and preparation of TORs/proposals.
8. Regardless of delays and funding shortfalls the activities have all been accomplished in an effective and efficient manner and have resulted in an impressive array of outputs, which combine with the lessons inherent in the implementation experience to strengthen the position of MW in terms of development of policy and legislative protection, and the capacity of the participating organizations and individuals to better manage migrant workers. The project has also been beneficial in that it has lifted the profile and publicised the conditions under which MW work. It has also established base and sustainable capacity to empower MW in the pursuit of better working conditions and response to abuses, and enhanced livelihoods through the provision of direct assistance and services. However the level of underdevelopment is such that the project has only scratched the

surface of the problems and challenges of the sector and begun the journey along the long road to fair and just treatment of migrant and domestic workers.

9. Trade unions and community organizations have responded well to the capacity building activities but they still suffer major capacity gaps, not least in financial resources. These organizations find it difficult to attract members and members find it difficult to pay dues, which is a major problem and it is this problem that makes the current status of this component in terms of maturity unsustainable. More work is required to build the capacity of these organizations. One way to address this problem is to find ways for these organizations to access financial resources through earning money from provision of services such as training and consulting. In order to attract more paying members, these organizations' capacity needs to be further improved to improve their marketability by providing quality services to their constituents.
10. The project has delivered well on gender equality overall, however some minor issues suggest further attention to gender equality is warranted in a small number of locations.
11. The project has been, and remains relevant to current and future directions of the ILO and other development organizations and in line with the mandate of the ILO. It is especially relevant to the Indonesia Decent Work Country Program, and supports the current policy direction on domestic work.
12. The project logic and validity of design are sound, however some minor improvements and changes need to be arranged to bring it into line with the new approaches and reformulated objectives of the next phase.
13. The outreach, protection, livelihood activities and reintegration services is the area directly relevant to the relationship between the ILO's work and development. The normative task of the ILO is to monitor labour issues and provide solutions to labour related problems by working with partner organizations in developing countries. Recently however, it has become clear that MW is likely to become a major source of development for local communities and the nation as a whole. While development donors are traditionally not interested in providing funding for normative tasks, the existence and development potential of MW indicates that the ILO can now ostensibly access a broader range of donors to increase its footprint with regard to MW/DW matters. It can do this by up-scaling project action and mainstreaming migration and forced labour/trafficking concerns into the Indonesian development framework to strengthen the migration-development nexus.
14. A full set of recommendations is provided in section 8 (page 31 of this report)

## **2. Brief Background on the Project and it's Logic**

Indonesia currently has approximately 4,000,000 documented migrant workers (MW) who are primarily engaged as domestic workers (DW) working overseas, and an estimated number of undocumented MW as high as 12,000,000 which make it the second largest formal exporter of labour and perhaps the largest informally from an international perspective.

Destination countries for migrant workers are mainly located in Asia and the Middle East, including Hong Kong, Taiwan, Malaysia, Singapore, Brunei Darussalam, Saudi Arabia, Kuwait, UAE, and Yemen. In discussions with NGOs during the evaluation it was also revealed that

many MW find themselves in other countries through both informal undocumented activities, and re-routing and changing of destination after being formally assigned to certain countries. One NGO recently assisted a group of MW who found themselves in Iraq. Anecdotal evidence also suggests others have been as far a-field as the USA, Australia and other developed countries.

As concluded in a recent ILO report “ due to the multitude of vulnerabilities experienced by domestic workers both in their own countries and while working overseas, protection and regulation of domestic work should be a priority for policy makers”<sup>1</sup> The current issues include lack of legal protection, with some countries persistent in not ratifying international conventions. In Indonesia, while DW get some basic protection from existing laws, there is no law dedicated directly to them. Cultural factors also inhibit the use of the law in settling any disputes that may occur in relation to domestic workers<sup>2</sup>. There are still gaps between Indonesian law and current international standards and best practises<sup>3</sup> even though the protection of migrant workers has been high on the agenda of successive national development plans.

Protection and regulation for MW/DW still needs extensive improvement in Indonesia, and it is within this context that the ILO has formed the partnership with the GOI through working with its relevant organizations as follows:

Department of Manpower and Transmigration  
National Agency for Protection and Placement of Indonesian Migrant Workers (BNP2TKI)  
Ministry of Foreign Affairs  
National Committee of Violence against Women  
Indonesian Migrant Workers Union  
Other Migrant Workers Organizations in Indonesia, Malaysia, Singapore and Hong Kong  
NGOs and CBOs concerned with Domestic Workers, Migrant Workers, Forced Labour and Trafficking.

## **2.1 Current Status of Labour Migration Placement and Protection**

A number of factors contribute to the persistent lack of ability of MW/DW to advocate for their own rights and protection, and make prudent choices with regard to migrating for work, including environmental socio-economic vulnerabilities such as:

- Poverty
- Low levels of education and literacy
- Social pressure to “advance”

And systemic poor administration exacerbated by:

- Unethical placement services providers

---

<sup>1</sup> Overview of Key Issues Related to Domestic Workers in Southeast Asia, International Labour Organization, Jakarta, June 2006: 27.

<sup>2</sup> The Regulation of Domestic Workers in Indonesia: Current Laws, International Standards and Best Practices, International Labour Organization, Jakarta, June 2006: 9.

<sup>3</sup> Ibid: 39



- The existence of unregistered “calo”<sup>4</sup> or middlemen who “gather” and channel MW/DW (through both formal and informal frameworks)
- Cultural factors that attach very low social status to migrant workers
- Underdeveloped regulatory and legal foundations

During discussions with officials and leadership of the recently established National Board of Workers Placement and Protection (BNP2TKI - the leading authority on placement and protection of Indonesian migrant workers that reports directly to the President) it was made clear that the government intends to promote expansion of the MW/DW force into the future as a way to reduce unemployment and generate foreign exchange earnings, however, at this stage the focus is on skilled workers<sup>5</sup>.

Management of MW/DW falls largely to commercial recruitment and placement agencies that often operate illegally to exploit DW. Many employers share a similar view to that of the recruitment agencies and do not concern themselves with international standards of decent work. Although systemic improvements have been made, MW/DW is still plagued by the following issues:

- Lack of legal protection
- Abuse and exploitation during recruitment and placement
- Abuse in the workplace
- Claiming rights and freedom of association
- Forced labour and trafficking
- End of contract abuses<sup>6</sup>
- Re-integration challenges
- Child labour
- Lack of pre-departure planning and preparation (financial and other)
- Remittance management
- Unclear remuneration structures

In general there still exists an urgent need for governments to prepare, ratify and enforce legislation on domestic work, which is unregulated and informal, and therefore lacks both social and legal protection.

Governments still have an urgent and important role to play in setting up national and international MW/DW regulation structures. To do this they need to work together meaningfully with employer’s representatives, trade unions, civil society, recruitment and placement agencies and empower the MW/DW themselves.

As mentioned above, according to recent estimates as many as 16,000,000 migrant workers are presently working overseas, many working outside the system and receiving very meagre levels of

---

<sup>4</sup> The Indonesian word “calo” has very negative connotations in Indonesian language and culture, and is used consistently in discussions at all levels to describe the middlemen who’s initial motivations are also likely to be among the above list of vulnerabilities.

<sup>5</sup> The most recent profile document of the National Board for the Placement and Protection of Indonesian Overseas Workers (BNP2TKI) while providing a good general overview of the organization and its constituents promoting workers for the hospitality, health services, mining oil and gas, agriculture and plantations, transportation, maritime, construction, manufacturing and information technology industries, fails to mention domestic workers.

<sup>6</sup> See above document Overview of Key Issues Related to Domestic Workers in Southeast Asia for a thorough explanation of the persistence of abuses

support and protection. Many more, as internal migrant workers often rural-urban migrants also experience sub-standard protection and support within the borders of Indonesia.

*Pak Pong<sup>7</sup> was a farmer initially, but travelled to Jakarta and worked in a factory before the crisis in 1997-1998. When the source of employment dried up in Jakarta, he was forced to return home to the village and rethink his strategy, and eventually contacted a placement company and found employment in Korea. He experienced many hardships including paying Rp. 7.5 million in formal fees to the placement agency, followed by another 7.5 million in informal (illegal fees). This meant he had to work the first six months just to pay the agency. There were other fees that he also had to pay to the employer in Korea which meant he didn't start earning money for himself until after another six months (12 months total). Although he had a contract before he left, it was not worth the paper it was written on. He said that while he was there he saw many workers come from Indonesia only to be quickly sent home. He felt that there was a collusion between the owners of the businesses and the PJTKI such that both sides made money purely from the employment process, and that only those MW who were willing to face hardships like this would succeed. He eventually worked for a further two years, before coming home with a reasonable sum. The PJTKI that organized his employment in Korea then encouraged him to use his money to learn Japanese, and they would then find him better employment in Japan. He paid them Rp. 12 million but did not succeed in learning Japanese or getting employment in Japan. Eventually he used the remainder of his money to repair his house and start a small business.*

Source: Evaluator Interview with Pak Pong. This anecdote demonstrates both the undesirable unethical elements of migrant work, but also the great potential for personal and economic development.

Migrant workers are by and large domestic workers, and while domestic work is not formally recognised as employment the migrant workers will always be subject to abuses, lack of protection and support. It is a widely recognised fact within and outside of the ILO. New research, published since the 300<sup>th</sup> Session, confirms that “the non-recognition and lack of social protection that is characteristic of domestic work is a major obstacle to achieving the International Labour Organization’s (ILO) goal of Decent Work for all men and women”.<sup>8</sup>

## **2.2 The Development Impact of Labour Migration**

Labour migration has the potential to provide the most significant development impact in terms of the employment opportunities it offers, income generation, poverty reduction and development of the “work ethic”.

### **2.2.1 Employment**

In August 2007 (the latest available statistics) open unemployment was approximately 9% and underemployment was approximately 27% of the labour force. Approximately 36%<sup>9</sup> of the Indonesian labour forces were seeking employment and income earning opportunities in 2007. If the labour force is split into urban and rural components the levels of unemployment and underemployment in rural Indonesia become somewhat more alarming, with 42% underemployed and 8% unemployed. Approximately 50% of the rural population in Indonesia were seeking work in August 2007. In Indonesia 75% of the underemployed population originate in rural areas and 72% of rural underemployed have primary school level education or less.

---

<sup>7</sup> Not his real name

<sup>8</sup> ILO : Domestic Work : Better jobs, better care. A review of ILO policies and programmes, January 2008.

<sup>9</sup> All quoted statistics in this section are calculated from official Depnakertrans labour statistics website at <http://www.nakertrans.go.id>

The majority of MW/DW are from rural areas, and generally have relatively low education levels. The indication is that the characteristics of the majority of underemployed and unemployed are such that is a good match for this type of employment and labour migration. Migrant work, and especially domestic work, has the potential to provide a significant development impact in terms of the employment potential it provides. It is important also to realise that this is employment that can be accessed with minimal national expenditure. The fact that a much larger proportion of MW/DW in Indonesia is informally contracted without government assistance attests to this untapped and underdeveloped potential.

## 2.2.2 Income Generation/Foreign exchange

In line with employment, the second important development impact to be discussed here is the income generation and foreign exchange potential that the prudent management of MW/DW as a national development resource holds. The income earned in overseas locations provides important personal benefits for Indonesian MW/DW and their families, while providing a significant contribution to the national and local economies. Remittances of migrant workers have become an item of growing importance to governments as inflows of remittances boost GNP. In 2007, it is estimated that remittances from MW/DW reached almost USD\$6 billion and Indonesia accounts for around 10% of international total remittances from this source.<sup>10</sup> However, the remittances are also problematic in that for a number of reasons they are often not utilized effectively and without regard for sustainability.

From an economic development perspective the MW/DW sector appears to have great potential to provide much needed decent work opportunities for Indonesians as individuals, and create valuable inflows of foreign funds to the Indonesian economy. However, under the current conditions these inflows of funds are not always utilized effectively to promote personal local and national development. Often the psychological pressures of relative poverty and cultural norms<sup>11</sup> drive those with newfound wealth to relative conspicuous consumerism.

Data from a recent study indicates that while remittances are utilized in different ways in different geographical locations, on average they are used in the following ways:

Savings:	17%
Routine family expenditure	65%
Purchase assets	12%
Develop/expand business	1%
Finance family education	4%
Other	1%

Source: see footnote 12



A house under construction in a village near Cirebon – self funded by a MW. It provides employment for several labourers and tradesmen

<sup>10</sup> Final Report, *Protecting and Leveraging Earnings of Migrant Domestic Workers Remittances: Scope for Improving its Leverage for Development*. Micra/ILO, Jakarta, Indonesia July 2008 p. 5.

<sup>11</sup> Respondents interviewed in Sukabumi, West Java explained that MW/DW returning home often are drawn into competitive consumerism driven by what other people own, and salesmen who are just concerned with sales rather than the livelihood needs of the MW/DW. Examples were given of MW/DW returning home and using up all of their surplus cash to purchase parabolas for satellite TV reception. In one or two months the MW/DW is forced to sell the parabola at a much reduced price in order to pay the electricity bills etc.

<sup>12</sup> Final Report, *Protecting and Leveraging Earnings of Migrant Domestic Workers Remittances: Scope for Improving its Leverage for Development*. Micra/ILO, Jakarta, Indonesia July 2008 p. 53.

Perhaps more so than at any time in the past, due to the growing inflows of migrant worker remittances, interventions are urgently required to build awareness of prudent remittance management among MW/DW and their families, and provide improved remittance services and investment advice.

### 2.2.3 Poverty Reduction

Poverty is still widespread in Indonesia as was evidenced by deaths caused by stampedes at Muslim based Ramadhan related food distribution points in East Java on 15<sup>th</sup> September. From 2004 until 2006 in Indonesia poverty increased from 16.66% to 17.75% of the population, during this period the macro-economic situation was such that the inflation rate fluctuating between 6% and 17% far outstripped the growth rate of GDP which hovered around 5%<sup>13</sup>. In rural Indonesia from 2005 to 2007, the total amount of population living below the poverty line increased from 22.7 million to 23.6 million. While this is not encouraging news from the macro-economic perspective, these numbers are likely to increase further in line with recent events in the global economy that indicate a world recession is imminent, invoked by economic downturn in the United States. The fuel price rises in Indonesia, the most recent being on 25 May 2008, are also exacerbating the already difficult position of those in poverty. The almost 30% price increase resulted in protracted protests and demonstrations, especially in Surabaya.

From the micro-economic perspective the poverty is exacerbated by two main economic factors in rural Indonesia, the ever shrinking access to good farming land at the grassroots level brought on by increasing urbanization and population. Between 1973 and 1993 the average farm size in Indonesia declined from 1.1 ha to 0.9 ha. In Java current small farm size is approx 0.66 Ha<sup>14</sup>. From 1994 to 2004 in Indonesia, the total amount of wetland rice paddy <sup>15</sup>area declined from 6,411,226 ha to 5,509,236 Ha. However, these aggregate statistics mask the real picture in rural areas. Discussions with NGOs and village residents during the evaluation indicate that many farmers do not own land, or have extremely small plots often less than ¼ hectare. Many rural residents work as farm laborers or share croppers and struggle to meet subsistence needs only. It is the families of these farmers that make up the vast majority of unemployed and underemployed in rural areas. Apart from the obvious need to find alternative sources of employment and income to reduce this form of poverty which is widespread, the remittances from those who find employment as migrant workers need to be brought to bear on the economic development imperative in rural areas of Indonesia.

Coastal fishing communities have also been thrust into a sustained economic decline. Especially for small scale operators, already living in relative poverty, the fuel price hikes significantly reduce their income earning capacity. The current state of the Indonesian fishery is in decline, the total number of population employed in fishing each year increases, while the total catch decreases on an annual basis. Fishermen need to travel further in less time to access productive fishing grounds, and the expansion of the fishing industry combined with the declining resource base means average per capita total catch is also in decline. The fuel price rises and bleak economic outlook for the short to medium term will only exacerbate this situation.

---

<sup>13</sup> Central Bureau of Statistics important macro economic indicators leaflet, December 2007 (latest Available) at <http://www.bps.go.id/leaflet/leaflet-desember-07-ind.pdf>

<sup>14</sup> Small Farms – Current Status and key Trends at [http://www.ifpri.org/events/seminars/2005/smallfarms/sfproc/Appendix\\_InformationBrief.pdf](http://www.ifpri.org/events/seminars/2005/smallfarms/sfproc/Appendix_InformationBrief.pdf)

<sup>15</sup> Arguably Indonesia's most important crop

The low levels of education of the poor, and the bleak economic outlook mean that families caught in this situation may need to rely on their children or other family members to provide necessary economic support by seeking work as domestic or migrant workers and become locomotives of local development. From a national competitive perspective the notion that Indonesia needs to increase the skills of its migrant workers is widespread and popular, and makes for attractive political rhetoric, but is undeniably an important goal from a *longer term economic* development perspective. However increasing the skills of migrant workers is a costly process, provides no guarantee of mass employment in a competitive market and requires a relatively high level of base education requirement for participants to succeed. It is also a time consuming process. Domestic workers are ready to begin work now.

With that in mind, consideration needs to be given to the main current need of the Indonesian economy, which is to stabilise and reduce poverty with a minimum of national expenditure. The short to medium term development priority is to find mass employment opportunities for the masses with low levels of education and ensure decent working conditions and protection. At present there is only one sector with this potential and that is the Migrant Domestic Worker sector. In this context, it is necessary to continue the current ILO approach in its current form, but with a fresh set of activities which are complimentary and build on past activities.

#### **2.2.4 Work Ethic**

During discussions with stakeholders, more anecdotal evidence points to another important trend that is occurring among MW/DW on returning from working overseas. The actual experience serves as an on the job training and experiential learning process. As explained by NGOs, the Indonesian work ethic is generally characterised by the Indonesian idea of being “polite” and “passive” in many situations, and general acceptance of the status quo. The overseas experience often instils an urgency in them that displaces the former character traits, and personal economic development takes precedence over politeness and passiveness in the workplace. This trend was expressed in a very positive manner by the NGOs interviewed and indicates what is perhaps an unintended benefit, that can contribute significantly to cultural change and development if MW/DW is managed well. It was noted also that in other social interactions outside the workplace these workers maintained a culturally acceptable stance and the NGOs saw this as something to be proud of; a more assertive Indonesian worker. It is important to realize also that the work ethic is not the only thing that MW brings home. They also learn new approaches to old problems, and appreciation for different cultures, all important in responding to globalisation.

#### **2.2.5 Protection: Paralegal, Pre-departure and Worker Rights**

Protection is an important element of MW management as a development resource. As can be seen from the above analysis, MW have a huge potential to develop themselves and influence the development of the national economy, however, the key to development is efficiency. In order that efficiency be improved MW/DW need to be protected to ensure abuses<sup>16</sup> are eliminated and the sector can become a more attractive employment option for more workers. The pre-departure training for MW is important to make them aware of the pitfalls and hurdles in their way that could prove costly if not considered and acted on thoroughly before departure. Even such things as personal hygiene and health awareness can have significant impacts on the efficient use of incomes. Medical attention is expensive in relative terms and insurance is rare. Paralegal

---

<sup>16</sup> Many inefficiencies are introduced through illegal fees, employer’s refusal to pay full contracted amounts and other abuses that have significant financial implications for those with relatively low income employment, please see section 2.1 above (interview with Pak Pong) as a sample of the evidence of inefficiencies.

training is also important to ensure all understand their rights and obligations and can confidently seek assistance to when abuses occur. This section only briefly deals with protection paralegal, pre-departure and worker rights and their impacts on development. There are many more examples of abuses and exploitation that reduce the efficiency of Migrant Work as a development resource. Within the context of development all these forms of protection are also essential.

### **2.2.6 Maximising the Development Impact**

In order to ensure that the development impact is maximised the following items need increased attention:

The overall supply, demand and cost effectiveness of Migrant Domestic Workers needs to be assessed.

From a national or local perspective (some regions may have comparative advantage in exporting DW) the costs and benefits of the migrant worker process needs to be examined to explore opportunities to make the process more efficient, and to examine to what extent each occupational category of MW contributes to development from a personal, local and national perspective. Which categories require the least inputs to generate the best outcomes in terms of development? Which categories are the priorities from an Indonesian perspective in terms of responding to globalization? Which occupations provide the most impact in terms of quality and quantity of employment, income generation, poverty reduction and other benefits? Are there emerging labour markets that may demand a different type of worker? And so on. There are many questions but few concrete and well researched answers. Due to the informal nature of domestic work and migrant work, information is scarce. Statistical data on MW/DW characteristics is essential, as well as comparing public expenditures made on all migrant worker occupational categories and comparing them with the benefits generated by each occupational category.

The legal, regulatory, administrative and policy framework needs to be developed further to ensure that:

1. Pay levels are sufficient so that domestic work is profitable, and domestic workers are able to build savings. Minimum wages should be enforced.
2. Minimum skills levels and healthy attitudes need to be ensured so that a reputation of quality MW/DW is built
3. Working conditions need to be conducive to the maintenance of good health, both physical and psychological
4. Reliable, efficient and easy to access financial remittance systems need to be established and maintained for domestic workers (especially in overseas locations where language and or cultural barriers prevent MW/DW from accessing them), remittances, bank accounts, etc.

Inflows of funds need to be utilized effectively,

Often MW/DW have low levels of education and poor financial planning skills which results in inefficient use of savings or even loss of savings

1. DW/MW need to have access to savings and investment services
2. DW/MW need to have access to investment advice
3. DW/MW need to have access to micro credit schemes

5. DW/MW need to have access to small business opportunities
6. DW/MW need to have access to insurance products

At present in Indonesia, there are only small pockets and isolated instances in which the labour migration placement, protection and economic development, and sustainable income issues are being addressed, and where in some cases these issues are addressed by local standards, none are addressed in an internationally acceptable comprehensive and sustainable manner. The Combating Forced Labour and Trafficking of Indonesian Migrant Workers project represents an evolutionary extension of previous projects rallied around the vision of decent work for all. Although significant enhancements to the system have been made through past interventions, forced labour and trafficking of Indonesian migrant workers and the related development shortcomings are a persistent challenge that require a protracted but flexible evolutionary approach to mitigate. This would by default include a normative stance with regard to domestic work, so the project needs to continue pushing the domestic work and migrant worker frontier in order to make domestic worker status formal, it also needs to explore ways to maximise the development impact from domestic/migrant workers.

### **3. Purpose Scope and clients of evaluation**

This evaluation was undertaken in September – October 2008, and was based on the priorities outlined in the Terms of Reference for an Independent End-of-Project Evaluation (Appendix 5), and follows the format and guidance in the ILO publication “ILO Evaluation Guidance – Planning and Managing Project Evaluations”.

The project’s mid-term evaluation, which took place in Nov-Dec. 2007, thoroughly reviewed the results and impact of specific project activities implemented, in view of the problems and needs of the target group. It also made specific recommendations for the project focus and implementation strategies for the remainder of the period, and recommended a new project phase in order to address the magnitude of the problem.

The end-of project evaluation, is to assesses the project objective, design, strategy, results and impact within the wider context of relevant Indonesian national and local policy and programme frameworks and stakeholder configurations. The evaluation will draw lessons from the implementation of the project and identify opportunities and priorities for future action, including the prospect and appropriateness of up-scaling project action and mainstreaming migration and forced labour/trafficking concerns into the Indonesian development framework, strengthening the migration-development nexus. To the extent that the project objectives are found to remain relevant, the evaluation results will feed into the objectives, design, strategy and planned output of a new project proposal.

Generally, the evaluation will:

1. review the achievements of the Project by assessing to what extent the stated objectives and major outputs have been achieved.
2. review the efficiency and effectiveness of the project implementation framework and links to national policy and programme frameworks, as well as the potentials for doing so in a potential new project phase.
3. review the efficiency and effectiveness of the project implementation framework and links to national frameworks

4. assess if the project has reached a state of maturity at the end of the current project phase so that project-initiated activities may be sustained without further external financial and technical support
5. review to what extent the programme is still relevant and is continuing to meet the needs of its direct target group – migrant and internal domestic workers in the project countries
6. draw conclusions in terms of the progress made and make recommendations for future actions beyond the end of the project (i.e. what is the scope and potential for activities being sustained without technical assistance by the ILO, and what is the scope for another phase of the project?)

The evaluator will hold meetings with the ILO Jakarta management, the backstopping officer, project CTA and project staff. The evaluator will hold meetings in Jakarta with i) national and local stakeholder counterparts and key implementing partners, ii) and make field visits to action programmes in Indonesia.

A detailed draft itinerary was developed by the Project and presented to the evaluator for comments and suggestions before embarking on interviews in Indonesia, as was relevant information and documents about the project.

## **4. Methodology**

The evaluation will utilise a combination of participatory monitoring and evaluation (through focus Group Discussions and interviews and desk study of project documents. The desk study will examine project progress reports, budget allocations, objectives and logic, to build an overall picture of the project, its relevance and activities, outputs and expected outcomes and impacts. This information will then be set against the background of perceptions of key community members and groups and stakeholders. During the evaluation, staff will also be on the lookout for good news stories. The good news stories would be in the form of anecdotes about positive spin-offs the project may have created for certain groups or individuals. The inclusion of these personal experiences will add further credibility to statements about evaluated benefits and achievements of the project.

The final output will consist of a report that establishes the final situation and project background regarding objectives against which the outcomes should be evaluated. It will, where possible, also include the actual outcomes in terms of quality and quantity, community perceptions of outcomes (good or bad), any negative impacts and a summary of appropriateness with regard to good outcomes. Negative impacts and any undesired/unexpected outcomes will be recorded as lessons learned and treated with a set of recommendations to help avoid recurrence in future projects.

A list of stakeholders interviewed during the evaluation is available in Appendix 6.

## **5. Review of Implementation**

### **5.1 Project Start-up Delays**

The project was originally intended to commence in September 2006, however, due to delays in signing the MOU between GOI and ILO the project did not officially commence until May 2007. Although the formal commencement of the project was 7 months late, the interim time period was used effectively to undertake thorough preparations. Ultimately however the delays did not impact on the work plan which was implemented fully in a more intensive manner than originally planned. As mentioned in the Mid Term Evaluation Report, “the team and counterparts should



be commended for their commitment to ensuring that this delay has not caused the project timeline to deviate greatly, nor has it resulted in any reduction in the number or quality of activities undertaken”.

## **5.2 Project Finance**

The original budget proposed for the project was USD\$1.8 million from the Government of Norway, however a funding shortfall was evident, in that the final amount allocated was USD\$1.453 million. However, the project staff and leaders should be commended for their work in securing additional funding from alternative sources. Additional funding in the amount of USD\$291,469 was secured from other sources as follows:

1. The Jakarta-based SYB, ILO Jakarta office, the regional office in Bangkok and the ILO HQ social finance dept, used for co-funding for studies, co-funding for entrepreneurship training, co-funding for 3 trainings for BNP2TKI staff (USD\$106,701).
2. Funds & materials received from the EU/ILO project based in Bangkok for one consultation for Indonesian & Korean government officials on labour migration to Korea, and one training activity for pre-departure service providers who assist migrant workers going to Korea (USD\$9,052)
3. ILO/Japan project based in Bangkok for the East Java component of the Combating Forced labour and trafficking of Indonesian Migrant Workers Project which consisted of TOT & Training in the standard topics presented in other local areas of the CFLTIMW Project (USD\$175,715), See Section 5.4 below.

In kind contributions to the SYB training program were also secured from SEAFAST to strengthen the SYB outcomes by providing technical inputs to production processes to improve processing efficiency and hygiene by way of training. The outputs of this training are explained below.

At the time of the evaluation, USD\$1,364,029 from the budget allocation of USD\$1,453,109 had been committed to activities. From this amount USD\$1,010,952 has been expended, leaving USD\$353,077 committed but not yet expended, and USD\$ 89,080 uncommitted from the original allocation. The alternative sources more than filled the funding gap.

Due to the late signing of the MOU between GOI and ILO, expenditure in 2006 was quite low, reflecting the low level of activities implemented. Eight percent of the total allocation (USD\$115,044) was approved for 2006, 32% (USD\$466,234) approved for 2007, and the remaining 60% (USD\$871,831) approved for 2008.

The project has utilized funds in an efficient manner. Although there were initial funding shortfalls, these have been overcome by exploiting synergies with other projects and generally identifying and finding other sources. The project should be viewed not only by the current outputs and impacts, but also in terms of the longer term impacts and the multiplier effects it will generate into the future. It has built internal capacity in a number of government and non government organizations by training and coaching their members. It has also produced guidelines, handbooks and modules that will continue to provide sustainable benefits for years to come. The

A relatively large proportion of the budget was devoted to international technical experts, collaborators, and sub-contracts however, this is essential on this type of project where there is a need for a broad international perspective to drive program oversight and network with other international organizations. There is also a need to tap into international and national expertise to

produce international best practice documents and high impact research, as well as to drive international concepts forward, where such concepts may seem foreign and unwanted in a developing country context. The project is at the frontline of the migrant worker protection process which is complex and not always characterised by easygoing acceptance among stakeholder organizations.

Although this budget component is large and essential, there are ways to reduce it in a proportional sense to create efficiencies through exploiting improved economies of scale. The ILO may wish to expand the volume of work done by the project, especially in the local areas to make more efficient use of funds spent on consultants at central level. One way that this could be done is to utilize the current funding allocations by dedicating them fully to the Policy and Legislative Protection, Awareness Raising and Advocacy, Capacity Building of Key Stakeholders and Research/Data Collection and Dissemination Systems components within the normative ILO framework which by default require higher cost national and international consultant inputs, and separate the Outreach, Protection, Livelihood Activities and Re-integration Services into a separate component to be funded under a development framework that would stand alone as a separate intervention. Other project configurations could also be explored to find a way to increase efficiency and effectiveness while up-scaling project action and mainstreaming migration and forced labour/trafficking concerns into the Indonesian development framework.

### **5.3 Regulation and Institutional Changes**

The National Board for the Placement and Protection of Indonesian Overseas Workers (BNP2TKI) and its local representative offices (BP3TKI) was established based on National Law No. 39/2004 and Presidential Decree No 81/2006. Prior to this all matters related to Indonesian Migrant Workers were handled by the Department of Manpower and Transmigration.

The establishment of the BNP2TKI has however created some lack of clarity with regard to the roles and functions of the two organizations, and there still appears to be some friction between the two with regard to mandate and funding allocations. Discussions with Disnaker staff in Cirebon indicates that the two organizations do not share information and in some ways, still compete with each other rather than work together toward a common goal of protection and placement of migrant workers. This has resulted in families losing contact with members overseas. It appears as though Depnakertrans has a vested interest in the relationship with PJTKI that it does not want to let go. However, this lack of clarity in the relationship provides an opportunity for the ILO to play a more definitive role in creating opportunities to bring the two organizations together. The general lack of clarity and indeed the general incompleteness of the legal and regulatory framework as pertains to migrant and domestic workers demonstrate the existence and broad based opportunities and necessity of further inputs to the process by ILO. The regulatory and institutional framework surrounding migrant and domestic workers is both a product of past advocacy and awareness raising and fertile ground for future continued development

Although challenges still exist in this area, this move by the GOI to create a specialized institution is a positive indication of the political will to take a more serious stance in relation to the management of MW/DW, and is a likely indicator of the positive impact of the prior phase of the project in advocacy and awareness raising about MW/DW issues. BNP2TKI is an institution in its infancy and was established after the major planning was initiated for this phase so it is unlikely that this phase would produce any major impact on this institution without further work. However, some useful staff training capacity building and awareness raising has been carried out.

However, having said that, it is also important to point out that current leadership of BNP2TKI is passionate about the placement and protection of MW/DW and in a relatively short period of time has initiated several activities. One important activity that is currently being promoted by BNP2TKI is the preparation of the Migrant Worker Manifesto, expected to begin December 18, 2008. The ILO should make use of this momentum to advocate and build awareness for formal recognition of Domestic Workers and ensure that the Manifesto is inline with international best practises and standards.

The friction between government agencies in relation to MW is related to unethical “turf protection” behaviour on the part of some organizations. The ILO should continue to work with the relevant organizations according to analysis of, and in line with the relevant and most authoritative laws, decrees, regulations and instructions. A review of this legal situation should be undertaken to define more clearly the roles and scope of each organization to determine mutually exclusive fields of operation and eliminate overlap and conflicts.

#### **5.4 Other Implementation Constraints**

Several other constraints were evident during implementation as follows, for a more in depth description please see project progress reports.

1. Stakeholders’ perspectives on domestic work and migrant labour cause delays through resistance to change on the part of all stakeholders, and difficulties related to the informal nature of the work.

2. Slow submission and drafting process of project proposals and poor reporting A large number of counterparts have taken undue time to submit technically adequate proposals, due to low capacity in drafting proposals fulfilling ILO’s technical cooperation requirements which constitute standard requirements for international organizations (written proposal with clearly defined objectives, purposes, results, activities, indicators of measurement, etc. and detailed budget). In many cases, additional technical meetings and drafting assistance by project staff has been required.

The first of these constraints is “par for the course”, being active as an agent of change, especially in a country with such diversity of culture with entrenched traditions and norms, the ILO would expect resistance of this nature. The second mentioned is related to recent reform in Indonesia and decentralization. They are constraints that will continue to impede projects in the future. It is however, a good sign that indicate that new participants from a broader cross section of society are now involved in project activities, communities are implementing programs rather than just government agencies. The way to overcome them is to factor these constraints into project preparations at the outset and ensure that staffing structure is adequate to respond to these needs.

#### **5.5 Activities Implemented Throughout the Project**

Eighty four (84) out of eighty seven (87) separate activities have been successfully completed during the two years of the project. The three planned activities still incomplete at the time of the evaluation are (i) the local ordinance activities which are currently in the final stages of drafting and are expected to be completed within the month of October, (ii) the National Stakeholder Consultations on Indonesian Employment Services for Migrant Workers that is to be conducted 28 October 2008 and (iii) the Abu Dhabi component of

the Department of Foreign Affairs Training for Consular Staff on the Protection of Migrant Workers which is scheduled to be conducted in Abu Dhabi before the end of October. Given the time and funding constraints mentioned above, the project has done very well in implementing these activities which have generated an impressive array of outputs.

Please note that in the following list of activities the total number has been condensed by reducing step down training activities into subject groups which means that several activities with the same objectives and content conducted in a range of locations are presented as one activity. This is in order to more efficiently present the information. The activities and outputs from the East Java “Japan Migration” Project are presented separately below. (Appendix 1)

## **5.6 Project Outputs**

In relation to the above activities the list of project outputs attests to the effectiveness of the project implementation and also indicates that although the project was constrained by a funding shortfall of approximately USD\$400,000 and was subject to inception delays no noticeable negative impact is observable. All activities<sup>17</sup> from both a qualitative and quantitative perspective have been completed successfully. This is also supported by the fact that all respondents interviewed, and attendees at focus group discussions had very positive perceptions of the projects activities and outputs. The outputs generated include participants of various training programs, workshops, seminars and meetings that have increased skills levels and understanding in several important areas related to the projects objectives among government officials, MW/DW and their representative organizations, and employers. Public awareness of MW/DW issues has been raised through artwork and publications, MW ambassadors and concerts, and radio talk shows with important leaders and local figures. Sustainability has been addressed through development of manuals, guidelines and training modules, and further enhanced by training partner organization staff as trainers for outreach and livelihood programs and as front line operatives in the fight against trafficking and abuse. Others have been trained as trainers to instill counseling skills as response to abuses and provide support to MW/DW through help desks, accessible hotlines and shelters. Further strengthening of sustainability has been achieved through development of Domestic and Migrant Worker associations and laying the foundations of grassroots networks. Legal and regulatory analysis, background papers, and draft regulations and ordinances have been prepared and promoted for adoption by local and national governments. Finally, the local and indeed national and international knowledge base has been expanded with relevant and urgently required research and analytical publications. In general it can be stated that the project has prepared an impressive list of outputs that responds holistically to the current and future needs of the migrant worker community within the framework of decent work for all and more specifically combating forced labour and trafficking of Indonesian Migrant Workers. Please find a more comprehensive list of outputs below (Appendix 2)

## **5.7 Expected Outcomes**

The following items do not produce tangible outputs, so expected outcomes are mentioned here to draw the readers attention to the possibilities inherent in the activities. Time and budgetary limitations prevent the accurate and quantifiable measure of the outcomes within this evaluation, so we draw on the reader to consider possible impacts from each of these activities that were conducted in a highly professional and focused manner.

---

<sup>17</sup> Apart from the three activities that are to be completed in the next two months.

1. A peaceful march of members of SBMI promotes understanding and raises public awareness of migrant worker issues. The march is broadcast on several national TV news reports and through other media.
2. Public awareness raised in several cities through the series of radio talk shows on various issues and with different resources persons (NGOs, government, communities).
3. Stakeholder awareness is raised through meetings for working groups to discuss ordinances, a stakeholder seminar for development of academic background papers in 3 districts, and a stakeholder seminar for development of draft local ordinances in 3 districts.
4. Public awareness is raised through a press conference to explain and socialize the ordinances.
5. Migrant Ambassador Campaign and Concerts raise public awareness of migrant worker issues in .....local and international locations
6. Indonesian Migrant Workers Fair Day, Migrant Workers Art Performance, Indonesian Migrant Workers Good-will Ambassadors Concert and Migrant Workers Photo Exhibitions are attended by at least 250 persons, raising public awareness
7. Public awareness is raised through press conference launching for the “formal recognition of domestic work as work”

## **5.8 Information Management and Reporting**

The project has achieved much in terms of outputs and outcomes, however it lacks a thorough and standardized approach to data and information gathering and reporting. All data and information needs, and reporting seems to have been done in a relatively ad hoc fashion. While all the necessary data and information has been diligently gathered, formatted and updated, it is not provided in a consolidated and accessible standard document. This may have been influenced in part by the delays at the outset, however, preparations for establishment of a monitoring and evaluation system, should be undertaken at the beginning of the project with the establishment of an agreed standard format data reporting system. The ILO may want to consider consultant inputs to establish systems at the beginning of its various projects. The system should then be used as a management tool to motivate qualitative and quantitative progress monitoring within a culture of continuous improvement. Baseline information could also be gathered to underpin more rigid impact assessments through compilation and examination of proxy indicators.

## **5.9 Impacts**

A thorough impact analysis would require dedicated surveys and data gathering to ensure that the actual benefits attributable to project activities or the result of other motivations. Due to the time and budget limitations of the evaluation and indeed the project, this type of approach is not possible, and not cost effective. The project was advised at the outset that trying to determine impact after two years of implementation would lead to unnecessary waste of valuable resources. It is debatable whether the project would create any discernable benefit in a two year period, and is a foregone conclusion when considering that the majority of activities were completed in the final year of the project. With this in mind, main impacts will need to be drawn from community and stakeholder perceptions where possible through interviews and site visits and the use of proxy indicators.

### **5.9.1 Policy and Legislative Protection**

As mentioned above, the Policy and Legislative Protection component has provided many activities and outputs. Many drafts and academic studies have been completed by the project which are described in the activities and outputs section above, and are significant and highly relevant project achievements in themselves. However, policy, laws and regulations need to be enacted and enforced before they generate an impact. Discussions with legal experts in Bandung during the evaluation indicate that many regional legislators do not take the process seriously, do not understand the material and rarely read academic position papers before discussions. This indicates that the achievement of enacted local ordinances and other policy and legislative products may still be sometime in the future. In this regard it is a work in progress. However, the lobbying and awareness building process needs to continue to build public pressure that can be brought to bear on non performing legislators, and ensure that the current work is championed and not wasted. Development is about persistence and incremental advances. Despite these conditions the general perception among evaluation respondents is positive about achievements thus far and the component has moved the development of policy and legislative protection process forward significantly.

### **5.9.2 Awareness Raising**

Awareness raising is inherent in almost all project activities conducted. The sheer volume of activities combined with the fact that these activities are also supplemented by purpose designed awareness raising activities such as radio talk shows and press releases, indicates that the project has most certainly raised the profile of decent work and the plight of migrant and domestic workers in Indonesia. Representatives from MW organizations including SBMI, KOPBUMI, Migrant CARE, and others agreed that the Migrant Worker Ambassador approach was very successful<sup>18</sup> and elicited extensive media coverage. The awareness raising carried out through churches in the Greater Jakarta area was also successful, however Christians are a minority in Indonesia. Although attempts were made by the project through a Moslem organization (Ulama) to do similar activities through Mosques it did not progress to implementation. This is a point that needs more attention in the future. It may be more prudent to approach Mosques through a forward thinking organization such as the Fahmina Institute who promote “non violent” Islam and produce many relevant publications that they circulate to Mosques at Friday prayers. They have produced interesting publications that include analysis of human trafficking from the perspective of Islamic Law. Utilizing an organization such as this would potentially increase the impact of awareness-raising significantly.

### **5.9.3 Capacity Building**

The project aims to strengthen the capacity of stakeholders that have a mandate to ensure protection of migrant and domestic workers. However, the capacity building activities are very basic in nature in the form of training for staff of partner organizations. Organizational capacity is characterised by significant shortfalls in this sector and any form of capacity building is likely to have a significant impact. The only real indicator of impact of capacity building at this stage are as in the case of the previous two components the perceptions of stakeholders who all have positive comments about the project activities. All organizations involved in the capacity building program were impressed with the activities.

Other capacity building activities undertaken include organizational capacity analyses which will have an impact further down the line if and when the recommendations are acted on in future phases of interventions.

---

<sup>18</sup> Especially in Banten, Lampung, Banyuwangi, Brebes and Malang.

### 5.9.3 Direct Assistance and Service Provision

The current direction of ILO international policy is such that direct assistance and service provision is an emerging area of importance. “ILO should do more work on assisting member states to do more work on the positive contribution of migration to development...if we are to advise our constituents on linking migration to development we will have to do a great deal more to develop an understanding of how the relationship works”<sup>19</sup>. This statement is relevant to both the 4<sup>th</sup> and 5<sup>th</sup> components of the project strategy.

The project collaborates with national and local partners that provide outreach, protection, livelihoods and re-integration services to migrant domestic workers in source and destination countries. This includes such things as psychological counselling, help desks, hotlines, entrepreneurship training, remittance services and insurance provision for migrant workers, their families and communities.

#### (1) Protection and Outreach

A focus group discussion was held with representatives of several unions and workers associations in Jakarta including KOPBUMI, ASPEK, SBMI, Migrant CARE and Solidaritas Migran Scalabrini (SMS). In the meetings it became evident that the protection factor has been much enhanced by the ILO activities. Staffs of these organizations have been trained in paralegal and pre-departure, leadership and human rights training so that they can train departing migrant workers and give advice to them, and then handle complaints and concerns arising from them. Several examples of recent cases were given where they had utilized their newly gained skills and achieved positive results through helpdesk, hotline and psychological counseling.

It was not possible to interview any participants of the pre-departure training programs due to the fact that they have since departed for overseas locations. However, again, all stakeholders and counterparts who were interviewed were very positive, particularly the representatives of the unions and NGOs that attended the TOT. Apart from instilling confidence and understanding in MWs, it also strengthened the capacity of the organizations to provide better services to their constituents.

These organizations have also been working with the ILO on higher level matters such as developing synergies with local governments in relation to migrant worker matters, and especially in relation to the preparation of local ordinances. In Jember district of East Java, the community was not open to any interference on MW issues; however, with the correct approach and persistent application KOPBUMI was able to change the attitude of the community so that they are now working together on a local ordinance for protection of migrant workers.

ASPEK and SBMI have been working with local police to investigate employment agencies in response to complaints from MW and trafficking problems. They are very happy with the beneficial relationship and response from the police, which before this project would not have been possible. They have already been involved in a case in which the party responsible for the trafficking was arrested, and is now awaiting prosecution.

#### (1) Re-integration and Livelihoods

---

<sup>19</sup> RO Bangkok Comments on the Draft Office Paper for the 303<sup>rd</sup> Session of the Governing Body: “Independent Evaluation of the ILO’s Strategy for the Protection of Migrant Workers, 2001-07” Bangkok, 18 September 2008.

Site visits were conducted in Salatiga, Sukabumi and Cirebon, and included MW organizations involved in training, and beneficiaries of training programs. All were enthusiastic and felt that great benefits accrued to beneficiaries of the SYB training especially.

Most of the ILO partners are social activist organizations so they tend to want to give business opportunities to everyone, this often results in failure. The SYB approach, is therefore unique in that it provides training only to persons who pass a rigorous entry criteria, and in most cases have former experience in small business. ILO tries to identify people who are highly motivated and have the character and resources to succeed. Unlike many other programs aimed at business development it does not provide seed capital. This is a distinct advantage over other donor programs in the micro-enterprise and finance sector. Many are given training and startup packages that includes capital in the form of loans that are often not repaid. The target beneficiaries are generally very poor and do not have the capacity to sustain the business after the project withdraws. In this case the CFLTIMW project results in a 30% sustainability rate in business startups as a result of the training which compares favorably with other programs<sup>20</sup>. Discussions with officials from the MOMT Lembang Training Center indicated that they have a new business start-up rate after training of around 20%. However, they establish group activities and provide 10 million Rupiah of capital to build (usually agriculture based) infrastructure in the expectation that the business will grow and eventually be able to provide infrastructure and a reasonable income for the whole group. Unfortunately what usually happens is that 80% of the groups gradually drop out, and the stronger more persistent members of the group finish up with a viable small business.



Forum Citamis in Sukabumi, have improved packaging, planning and production processes in their group based business where more experienced members can help newcomers. They have increased their product range and helped members start new business activities

This is the strength of SYB modality, it identifies people to become the catalyst around which other small businesses can learn and develop in a networked group approach, by linking people with no former experience to existing small businesses. It also does not provide the training direct to the business person as beneficiary, but trains members of local community organizations who train the beneficiaries and remain in the community and provide back up business consultation after the program has withdrawn. Both the small business person and the community organization benefit from this process. Community organizations at the local level often find it difficult to sustain their inputs to communities because of the low levels of membership and therefore income by way of dues. The community members, on the other hand, often do not see the value of becoming paying members of the organization when the services provided are not seen as beneficial. When, as in the case of SYB approach, the organization builds capacity and actually provides services that are seen as useful by community members, strong linkages are established between the two entities. The community organizations can build

---

<sup>20</sup> 30% seems low, but the reason for it is because the project does not provide start-up funding, so that many participants, after attending the training where the idea of starting a business is demystified somewhat, often return to work as MW in order to build up savings to start up their own business. Another reason is that the activities are often done in a group approach such as in the Forum Citamis where the business is only registered as a single entity, but a number of new people have joined and participate as new components in an already existing business. For example, Forum Citamis originally was based on woven bamboo products such as baskets and mats, but now have increased their product lines to include processed foodstuffs.



a highly marketable set of capacities to entice more people to become members and establish a mutually beneficial cycle of development. In some cases the organizations may start to charge fees for training and consultation which further enhances the cycle.

The entrepreneurship training program was one sub-component in which tangible benefits were directly observable in the field.

The project was able to exploit synergies with Seafast which serves the community by providing food processing and marketing training. Seafast provided “in kind” contributions to the project with training in food safety and processing to help migrant worker groups to improve their production and packaging skills. Currently, the training has improved production skills of participants, innovation of new food products, which reflect local harvest, and yields plus point impact in establishing new business groups. Currently, the project has linked with a university (Surabaya Technology Institute) to assist the groups on production design especially for product packaging. This makes the products more market oriented and received in all market segments.

During the evaluation the team was able to visit several small businesses that were established/enhanced by the training. Beneficiaries were also very enthusiastic and pleased with what they had learned through the program. All beneficiaries stated that the most helpful part



Cattle Farmer (Beneficiary of SYB program) establishes business with capital earned as MW. Now contemplating expansion.

was the book keeping and business planning skills that they learned from the SYB. Many, prior to this had seen business as a mysterious and risky prospect. The existence of local backstopping capacity, so they could contact the organization that provided the training if a problem came up in their business at a later stage was also seen as a form of insurance to make anyone intending to start a small business more confident about the future. The business planning skills have had a number of positive impacts in this regard. One former MW who started an intensive cattle fattening business (in an unplanned ad hoc manner with 3 beasts), is now contemplating returning to migrant work to increase his capital base and expand the business. Prior to this his

business was built on hearsay experimentation and day by day management, and he could not confidently expand. Now that he understands the planning methods he can see exactly what he needs in terms of inputs, and the results he can expect. This is an area that may benefit from providing linkages to micro-credit providers. Clearly a source of reliable and workable micro-credit would be fruitful if provided to ex-migrant workers who have existing sustainable small businesses to expand.

Ibu Ulis (Tingkir Lor Village) originally went to Jakarta to become a MW, however, when she did the required medical test she found that she was pregnant so she had to return to the village. With limited opportunities for generating income her neighbour encouraged her to start a micro-enterprise but she always had a problem<sup>21</sup> in that if she had money she would spend it all on daily necessities and end up with no capital to continue the business. She feels she has benefited greatly from the SYB training, especially the planning and bookkeeping skills which enable her to understand the financial management aspects of the business. She now makes cakes and soy sauce to sell in the local market, the volumes and income are small, but it is enough of a supplement to the household to keep her child in school. She now also understands that she can easily expand her business if she wants by increasing volume, or even by employing and training an assistant.

---

<sup>21</sup> This problem is quite common among the poor.

One of the most impressive things that was observed during the field trip was the potential for development, and the persistence and determination displayed by the beneficiaries who want to “get ahead” in life. The final example to be presented here is the experience of a family near Salatiga in Central Java.

Ibu Mutia is from Sumberjo Village in Central Java. Together with her husband she attempted to raise quails in an intensive manner to earn a decent income, but their attempts always met with failure.

Eventually, with no other prospects, her husband applied for and got a job in Malaysia. He worked at this job for three years sending money home regularly. In this way they have built a house, bought a motorcycle and put aside enough capital to start a business, but they were not confident and didn't want to lose their capital as had happened with the quail venture. Since the SYB training increased their confidence and understanding of business planning, and explored several ideas during the training they decided to start a mushroom (jamur kuping which translates literally as “ear mushroom”) production business.



Ibu Mutia tending to the mushrooms in the business established with capital from her MW husband. The building and all contents

This time they believe that with their increased skills and understanding, they will be able to sustain the business. They have established the business infrastructure and purchased the inputs with their own capital. Many migrant workers share similar circumstances, they are able to build up savings, but

lack of understanding of, and confidence prevents them from, making investments in business where they are intimidated by the possibility of failure, so they tend to purchase tangible assets like houses, or end up using the savings for daily needs.

In general it can be concluded that the re-integration and livelihoods component has been very beneficial for participants of the SYB training program, and a significant emerging potential for individual, community, local and national economic development has been identified. However although a significant potential for impact exists there is not yet any real quantifiable evidence of impact. Examination of the proxy indicators – i.e. benefits accruing due to progress towards meeting the objectives, however, shows that these programs certainly are beneficial.

In Sukabumi, 24 business groups have been established or helped since 2006, and another 10 groups will be established/trained in the next 3 months. A total of 438 adults and 183 children have been involved or 621 persons. More than 30% of these were previously not involved in, or getting benefit from small business activities.

#### 5.9.4 Targeted Research and Documentation

The complexity of trafficking and forced labour practices combined with the general low level of development of information networks and local knowledge in Indonesia creates a condition in which there are many knowledge and information gaps regarding the migrant worker situation. In order to respond to capacity gaps, and to build awareness, the knowledge and information gaps need to be eliminated and a solid understanding of issues and shortcomings developed. The project is conducting targeted research, policy analysis & assessments, and compiling and



Ibu Ulis can keep her child in school because of the micro-enterprise she has developed with the help of SYB and Seafast.

disseminating information about migrant worker conditions and issues. Several important research and analytical documents have been produced by the project and will contribute to the understanding of important issues surrounding MW/DW. There are two separate impacts of these publications that will be felt only in subsequent activities and projects. The research and recommendations will provide base material to be used in the development and improvement of new programs and activities, and generally build the knowledge base to contribute to the future directions of the ILO, and the manuals, handbooks and guidelines will contribute to the sustainability of the results of current activities and ensure that technical information is available for persons who have not been directly involved in current activities.

### **5.9.5 Gender**

For reasons of efficiency and effectiveness related to constraints on time for this evaluation it is not possible to undertake a full gender analysis. However the project has completed an important part of the process in that it has collected gender disaggregated data in relation to outputs and participation in activities. A summary observation of the data indicates that the project has been successful in overall terms in that it has achieved a female participation rate in training activities of 57%. However when the data is examined more closely a number of trends are evident that will require attention in any further work.

There are two separate trends that may indicate cause for concern. The concept of gender is about equality, and although the main thrust of gender has been “women in development”, it is important to also consider the males, especially when the objective is development. The most advanced businesses that the evaluator observed during the field trip to Central Java appeared to be driven by males. So it is important to have a balance, as it is likely that there are males out there with useful insights and experience that they can bring to the table.

It is noted that while a range of attendance levels and female participation rates were observed in each of the training programs and activities, none were lower than 35%. However, several of the training programs were populated exclusively by females. On one hand, the enthusiasm to include women and the achievements in women’s attendance is commendable, but the achieving the highest possible level of female participation and excluding males is not the goal. The project should strive to achieve a better gender balance in all activities, rather than just maximise women’s attendance.

The project strives to assist migrant workers and their families. Domestic workers are primarily females, and one assumes that these females would have husbands and families. There are likely to be two specific areas of concern when considering families. The first would be related to unmarried domestic workers who help to support their parents, siblings, etc. The second would be married or domestic workers with spouses in which the focus of attention is likely to be on supporting their own family and spouse, and then there is probably many cases that have differing amounts of elements of both types of relationship. The dynamics of the two types of relationship are much different. It was not clear if the project had any activities that specifically addressed the needs of males as partners of MW/DW. It seems that the male partners of domestic workers may indeed have special needs and male spouses seem like an area of interest. Some research should be done into the economic relationships between female MW and their male partners that stay at home, within the broader objectives of exploring the relationship between MW and development. .

### **5.9.6 Public Service Training**

During the evaluation, discussions were undertaken with representatives from the Department of Foreign Affairs (DFA) and BNP2TKI. In both instances these organizations were very thankful for the training they received from the project which included bilateral negotiation skills and migration management training for BNP2TKI personnel, and protection of migrant workers, promotion of migrant workers, decent work and junior diplomat training for Department of Foreign Affairs personnel. However, there was a need expressed for more training but of a different type especially for DFA personnel. According to the respondents, the training consists of lectures on philosophy and concepts surrounding migrant workers which the majority already now know, and capacity has been established within the organization to disseminate these skills. In evolutionary manner, the training now should be expanded to include the practical aspects of how to solve problems in relation to MW, and how to communicate with MW on an appropriate level. In short, the DFA personnel need more training on how to appropriately “serve” the public which in this case is MW. They also need psycho-social counselling services training, and would be very appreciative if the project could assist them with development of modules, training materials and TOT to establish this capacity within the organization.

## **6. Presentation of findings regarding project performance**

### **6.1 Relevance of CFLTIMW**

The ILO as a United Nations Specialized Agency, has a mandate as follows:

*To promote opportunities for all women and men to obtain decent and productive work in conditions of freedom, equity, security and human dignity.*

The Combating Forced Labour and Trafficking of Indonesian Migrant Workers Project (CFLTIMW/DW) fits into the Decent Work Country Programme (DWCP) which seeks to translate the ILO’s mandate by making a contribution at country-level in Indonesia towards the achievements of the Millennium Development Goals (MDGs), Poverty Reduction Strategies (PRSs), the United Nations Development Assistance Framework (UNDAF), and national development strategies. Protection of MW/DW has been a priority in successive national development plans in Indonesia, however while progress has been made, it has not been sufficient to provide thorough and ongoing protection and regulation of MW/DW.

The particular relevance of the CFLTIMW project is that it seeks to address a range of issues that relate directly to migrant workers. It fits specifically into the framework of the DWCP by contributing to the Priority A.2: Improved Labour Migration Management for Better Protection of Indonesian Migrant Workers, especially Migrant Domestic Workers.

#### **6.1.1 Indonesia Decent Work Country Program**

The Indonesia Decent Work Country Programme 2006 – 2010 has been developed with the ILO constituents including:

- Government of Indonesia (GOI);
- Employers’ Organisation APINDO
- the workers represented by their Trade Unions.

It is built on the evaluation of the 2004 – 2005 ILO Jakarta Office Programme, the Indonesia Decent Work Action Plan 2002 – 2005, and previous initiatives undertaken.

DWCPs have two basic objectives. They promote decent work as a key component of national development strategies. At the same time they organise ILO knowledge, instruments, advocacy and cooperation at the service of tripartite constituents in a results-based framework to advance the Decent Work Agenda within the fields of comparative advantage of the Organization. Tripartism and social dialogue are central to the planning and implementation of a coherent and integrated ILO programme of assistance to constituents in member States<sup>22</sup>.

The DWCP is based upon, and aligned with, key policy frameworks of the Government of Indonesia including GOI Medium Term Development Plan 2004 – 2009 (RPJM) and Poverty Reduction Strategy, Ministry of Manpower and Transmigration's Strategic Planning for 2005-2009 (RENSTRA); Regional Autonomy Laws No. 22/1999 and No. 25/1999, National Programme of Action to Mainstream Gender in Development Policies and Programs of Indonesia 2002-2004 (INPRES 9/2000), and the Presidential Decree 59/2002 on National Plan of Action to Eliminate Worst Forms of Child Labour.

It was also developed with consideration of the ILO Strategic Policy Framework and Programme and Budget for 2006-2007; the ILO Multilateral Framework on Labour Migration (MFLM); and the Conclusions of the Fourteenth ILO Asian Regional Meeting (ARM), September 2006, and the United Nations Development Assistance Framework (UNDAF 2006-2010); the Millennium Development Goals (MDGs); and the Ministerial Declaration by the High-Level Segment of the UN ECOSOC 2006.

Inter-connected priorities for realising decent work and poverty reduction in Indonesia during this Asian Decent Work Decade are reflected in the DWCP in which the CFLTIMW/DW project is an integral component<sup>23</sup>.

#### **6.1.2 DWCP Priorities and Outcomes**

- A. Stopping Exploitation at Work
  - 1. Effective progress on the implementation of the Indonesia National Plan of Action on the Worst Forms of Child Labour.
  - 2. Improved labour migration management for better protection of Indonesian migrant workers, especially migrant domestic workers.
- B. Employment Creation for Poverty Reduction & Livelihoods Recovery, especially for Youth
  - 1. Employment targets in the Indonesian Government's Medium-Term Development Plan (RPJM) are underpinned by a set of policies and programmes that emphasise pro-poor employment growth.
  - 2. Effective implementation of employment-intensive and other livelihood programmes for crisis-affected areas, especially Aceh, North Sumatra, and Eastern Indonesia.
  - 3. Education and training systems and policies better equip young people for employment and entrepreneurship.
- C. Social Dialogue for Economic Growth & Principles and Rights at Work
  - 1. Application of labour laws and practices fully in line with fundamental principles and rights at work, including through strengthened labour administration.
  - 2. Employers and unions through bipartite cooperation achieve results on labour market flexibility and job security<sup>24</sup>.

---

<sup>22</sup> ILO DWCP Website Homepage <http://www.ilo.org/public/english/bureau/program/dwcp/>

<sup>23</sup> All of the above information on relevance can be found in the Indonesia: Decent Work Country Programme 2006-2010 document at <http://www.ilo.org/public/english/region/asro/jakarta/download/dwcp07.pdf>

The CFLTIMW project through its various initiatives contributes to all priorities and outcomes A.1, A.2, B.3, C.1 and C.2 of DWCP. From an outcome perspective, the CFLTIMW Project, through strategic component 3. Outreach, Protection, Livelihood Activities and reintegration Services, is also poised to make a significantly relevant contribution to Priority B.1, B.2 and further contributions to Priority B.3. of the DWCP by establishing a sustainable “locomotive” mechanism that would potentially contribute to pro-poor employment growth. The major impact of this component is aimed at reducing costs, and increasing the benefits that accrue to MW/DW through more efficient, effective and appropriate utilization of remittances and other protections and expanded livelihoods activities for MW and their families..

### **6.1.3 The ILO and Domestic Work**

The International Labour Congress is preparing to vote on the adoption of a convention for domestic workers in June 2010. In preparations for the vote research undertaken by the project, and the considerable knowledge base built up as a result of the implementation experience, capacity building, awareness raising and legal and policy development contributes to the understanding and momentum of the migrant workers’ plight which is primarily domestic workers’ plight. The project supports these efforts through its work, and will continue to increase its rate of documentation, advocacy and awareness-raising in favour of a positive vote on the domestic worker convention. As a matter of course, the project will also continue to provide technical support to HQ regarding this matter. A draft document from the March 2008 session on Decent Work concludes with the following:

There is wide recognition that the situation of domestic workers which is currently a source of great concern everywhere will greatly benefit from the development and implementation of international standards that address human rights, fundamental workers’ rights, and general conditions of work. There is also recognition that a move towards that aim is long overdue and would help respond to, and even anticipate, the needs of ILO constituents. Early decision on an item to be placed on the agenda of the 2010 International Labour Conference for standard-setting on decent work for domestic work will enable the Office to start preparatory work, based on the wealth of existing research material. It would also give the Office sufficient time to undertake a comprehensive review of current laws and practices concerning domestic work and background material for the debate. The Governing Body may also authorize the Office to organize a preparatory tripartite experts meeting in 2009 to examine the potential contents of international instruments. Preparatory work will also entail a series of tripartite consultations at regional and global levels.

## **6.2 Project Logic**

The CFLTIMW Project aims to “improve protection for Indonesian migrant workers both in Indonesia and within destination countries including Malaysia, Singapore and Hong Kong, and seeks to contribute to the development of a more effective migrant workers placement system which oversees the protection of migrant workers from pre-departure, throughout placement and upon return to Indonesia”.

---

<sup>24</sup> Ibid



The stated objective is “to contribute to the eradication of discrimination and exploitation of Indonesian migrant workers in Indonesia and selected main receiving countries in Southeast Asia”.

The objective is achieved through a range of programme activities aligned with the five following strategic components that sum up the project strategy:

1. **Policy and Legislative Protection:** The project works with partners to draft and strengthen bilateral agreements, national legislation, local ordinances, administrative regulations and practices, codes of ethics and model contracts. In most countries, domestic workers are currently excluded from labour laws and social protection legislation.
2. **Awareness Raising and Advocacy:** The project supports awareness raising activities to sensitize relevant stakeholders to safe migration and recognition of workers in the domestic sector. It also aims to make employers and domestic workers aware of their rights and obligations, and raise the profile and status of domestic workers so that they are appreciated by the public, the media, the government and trade unions.
3. **Outreach, Protection, Livelihood Activities and Re-integration Services:** The project collaborates with national and local partners that provide outreach, protection, livelihoods and re-intergration services to migrant domestic workers in source and destination countries. This includes such things as psychological counselling, help desks, hotlines, entrepreneurship training, remittance services and insurance provision for migrant workers, their families and communities.
4. **Capacity Building of Key Stakeholders:** The project aims to strengthen the capacity of stakeholders that have a mandate to ensure protection of migrant and domestic workers. Organizational capacity is characterised by significant shortfalls in this sector. Target organizations include Government institutions at national and local levels, and migrant and domestic worker organizations. Capacity is built by way of outreach activities, alliance building with other organizations that support the cause of migrant workers including trade unions.
5. **Targeted Research and Documentation:** The complexity of trafficking and forced labour practices combined with the general low level of development of information networks and local knowledge in Indonesia creates a condition in which there are many knowledge and information gaps regarding the migrant worker situation. In order to respond to capacity gaps, and to build awareness the knowledge and information gaps need to be eliminated and a solid understanding of issues and shortcomings developed. The project is conducting targeted research, policy analysis & assessments, and compiling and disseminating information about migrant worker conditions and issues.

The project logic is solid. While all components are interlinked in an input and feedback network, and complimentary manner, in logical progression component 2 lifts the profile of the MW and their needs among the community at large which enables component 1. Components 4 & 5 feed into components 1 and 3. Targeted research and documentation provides the entry point to build knowledge of problems, challenges and needs. This information is utilized in the preparation of legal products in the policy and legal protection component. The capacity of several relevant organizations is built to respond to policy and enforce legal matters and other social protections and so on.

### 6.3 Validity of Design

The stated primary objective is “to contribute to the eradication of discrimination and exploitation of Indonesian migrant workers in Indonesia and selected main receiving countries in Southeast Asia. This is stated clearly enough, but in terms of describing the solutions to the identified problems and needs it falls a bit short. Ideally a secondary set of objectives related to the 5 strategic components should have been formulated for this purpose and would perhaps have been more clearly presented in the following manner for each objective.

### **Strategic component 1: Policy and Legal Frameworks**

**Problem:** gaps exist in the policy and legislative protection of domestic/migrant workers in source and destination countries that result in inefficient, ineffective management and administration of domestic/migrant workers, and abuses.

**Objective:** to address the gaps in policy and legislative protection of domestic workers in source and destination countries.

**Need:** the project will provide technical input and support to government and non government counterparts to undertake consensus building consultations and knowledge sharing national level workshops for the purpose of debating, reviewing and revising policy and legal frameworks.

### **Outputs:**

1. draft revisions and new drafts of labour law and regulations, immigration law and regulations, labour recruitment and placement, licensing and monitoring regulations, labour training regulations as pertains to migrant and domestic workers
2. effective access to justice for migrant and domestic workers

There are also problems with the logical framework, where the objectives seem to be confused with outputs and description are much too wordy. For example the log frame only describes one objective; the remainder are presented only as Objective 2, Objective 3 and so on. The descriptions of the strategic components are also different to the descriptions in the text of the main document and other later documents which could cause some confusion as to what the actual objectives/strategic components are. The strategic component 5 in the project document is “Research/Data Collection and Dissemination Systems”, which has quite different connotations than “Targeted Research Documentation and Publications” which appears in the later documents. This component is also described differently in the two progress reports. The evaluator was unable to find any written justification for this change or evidence of meetings and discussions of the change or agreement from the donor, which is a generally standard requirement for making substantial changes to project design.

To make another point on outputs, it seems that the outputs in the log frame are outcomes. The outputs are what are expected to be generated directly by activities. For example the output for a training program in SYB would be the participants with improved skills and knowledge. The outcome would be improved business practices and the impact would be improved income and sustainability of the business.

However, this is a minor technical glitch that shouldn’t affect the actual validity of the approach. The experienced staff of the ILO could easily extrapolate the objectives from the strategic component descriptions. However, for any future projects an M&E consultant should be an essential element of the inception period for help with both the logical framework and establishing monitoring systems.



Indicators of achievement are generally clearly defined and describe the changes to be brought about. However, the log frame in this case seems like a pointless document because for a project with a two year timeframe, the expectations inherent in its log frame may also be excessively ambitious.

## **7. Conclusions**

Migrant workers, especially domestic migrant workers represent a high potential resource that if managed well can bring significant earning power to bear on the development of the local and national economy of Indonesia. Migrant and domestic work provides an avenue through which to ameliorate a significant amount of unemployment, generate income and foreign exchange, reduce poverty, develop the national work ethic and increase the response to globalization.

From a management and implementation perspective the project has done well by successfully eliminating the effects of initial start-up delays. Funding shortfalls were addressed by exploiting synergies with other organizations and leveraging resources. Delays were addressed by intensifying implementation in the later stages.

Although some lack of clarity with regard to the role of partner institutions has occurred as a result of recent regulation and institutional changes, and created institutional dissonance among the organizations and ministries responsible for the management of migrant workers, the project has been able to manage relationships and maintain a communications linkage with all relevant players. However, the impact is such that there is some confusion and overlap surrounding the roles and duties of central and local departments and no clear lead organization to champion the needs of migrant and especially domestic workers. The situation is such that it is difficult for the project to engage in a productive manner with its traditional counterpart organization MOMT.

Despite several constraints including the general low capacity of partner organizations, particularly NGOs in production of TORs and reporting, and the general level of apathy and resistance to change related to stakeholders perspectives of the informal nature of domestic work and migrant labour, good progress has been made and all activities have been, or will be completed in the final month of the project.

The independent end of project evaluation has found that the project objective, design, strategy, results and impact (as shown through proxy indicators that assess the progress) within the wider context of relevant Indonesian national and local policy and programme frameworks and stakeholder configurations is appropriate to the current conditions surrounding MW and their communities.

The activities have all been accomplished in an effective and efficient manner and have resulted in an impressive array of outputs, which combine with the lessons inherent in the implementation experience to strengthen the position of MW in terms of development of policy and legislative protection, and the capacity of the participating organizations and individuals to better manage migrant workers. The project has also been beneficial in that it has lifted the profile and publicised the conditions under which MW work. It has also established base and sustainable capacity to empower MW in the pursuit of better working conditions and response to abuses, and enhanced livelihoods through the provision of direct assistance and services. However the level of underdevelopment is such that the project has only scratched the surface of the problems and challenges of the sector and begun the journey along the long road to fair and just treatment of migrant and domestic workers.

The project has responded commendably to gender equality; however there are isolated cases where the overenthusiastic approach of partner organizations to include women has caused a problem in that some activities have been attended exclusively by women. Males may have experience that they can contribute to the project so the objective is to try to maintain gender equality, rather than just maximise the participation of women. It also seems that there are two main gender relationship dynamics occurring among MW, (i) the MW/parent/sibling/extended family dynamic and (ii) the MW/Spouse/new family dynamic. The second mentioned here may represent a rarely recognised social phenomenon and may make an interesting and useful study, especially in cases where male spouses may be attending to newly established family needs at home.

The project is and remains highly relevant to the current direction of development of MW and the overall goals and objectives of the ILO within the scope of the mandate “*to promote opportunities for all women and men to obtain decent and productive work in conditions of freedom, equity, security, and human dignity*”, and especially within the Indonesia Decent Work Country Program, and compliments the work of many other development organizations and aims. It is also extremely relevant to, and has made, and will continue to make a meaningful contribution to development of the knowledge base, advocacy and awareness raising in favour of a positive vote on the domestic worker convention, and will continue to provide technical support to HQ on this matter.

Trade unions and community organizations have responded well to the capacity building activities but they still suffer major capacity gaps, not least in financial resources. These organizations find it difficult to attract members and members find it difficult to pay dues, which is a major problem and it is this problem that makes the current status of this component in terms of maturity unsustainable. More work is required to build the capacity of these organizations. One way to address this problem is to find ways for these organizations to access financial resources through earning money from provision of services such as training and consulting.

In order to attract more paying members, these organizations’ capacity needs to be further improved to improve their marketability by providing quality services to their constituents.

The findings of the targeted research are very useful in many respects, and the recommendations from them should feed into the next phase of the project.

The outreach, protection, livelihood activities and reintegration services is the area directly relevant to the relationship between the ILO’s work and development. The normative task of the ILO is to monitor labour issues and provide solutions to labour related problems by working with partner organizations in developing countries. Recently however, it has become clear that MW are likely to become a major source of development for local communities and the nation as a whole. While development donors are traditionally not interested in providing funding for normative tasks, the existence and development potential of MW indicates that the ILO can now ostensibly access a broader range of donors to increase its footprint with regard to MW/DW matters through. It can do this by up-scaling project action and mainstreaming migration and forced labour/trafficking concerns into the Indonesian development framework to strengthen the migration-development nexus.

Future Priorities identified by partner organizations should also feed into the future design of any new activities. The following list of priorities was identified through workshops run by the project involving high level staff from partner government organizations<sup>25</sup> (Appendix 4)

## **8. Recommendations**

### **8.1 Program Management & Implementation**

1. The project should consider additional staff members, especially a position dedicated to M&E support and Project MIS development. The additional staff member could handle all matters relating to information management for the project including preparing standard report formats and providing assistance to building capacity for reporting and production of TORs in partner organizations. The project should also consider employing an M&E specialist at the outset to work with an MIS assistant to develop systems and a more rigorous approach to recording outcomes and keeping track of progress and gathering data and information into a consolidated, standard easily digestible periodical report.
2. The selection process of participants for the SYB program could be modified with an additional instrument to collect information and data for purposes of measuring proxy indicators of outcomes and impacts at the micro level.
3. The project should pay more attention to gender balance in activities, rather than just maximise the participation of women

### **8.2 Implementation and Future Action**

1. The policy and legal frameworks component should continue in its current form, however it should start in any new phase with a review of the current status to identify potential areas where delays are occurring, identify the reason for delays and formulate strategies for expediting the process. A compilation of all current laws and regulations should be undertaken and updated. Possibly through consultation with a Ministry of Justice, legal product register if such a register exists.
2. The policy and legal frameworks component together with the targeted research component should undertake a comprehensive review of current laws and practises surrounding domestic work to feed into the future activities and the debate on a DW convention.
3. The project should attempt to engage better with MOMT through establishing a mutually beneficial task around which the two organizations can cooperate, build relationships and move ahead. This could be in the form of a pilot project developed around an important mutual need.
4. A coordinated information flow on migrant workers needs to be developed between the organizations involved in the management of MW including national and local entities.
  - a. Jobseeker information (supply)
  - b. Placement information (demand)
  - c. Migrant worker profile and LMI database
5. Local (camat) and village officials should be brought into this process and maintain databases of local MW potential and placements.

---

<sup>25</sup> CONSULTANT'S REPORT MENKO EKUIN Planning Session (Coordinating Ministry for Economic Affairs) May 8-10, 2008, Grand Aquila Hotel, Bandung, Indonesia

6. Research should be undertaken on the possibilities of establishing standard placement costs to different countries and a minimum set of standards to apply to accreditation of PJTKI. The project should work closely with BNP2TKI on this matter.
7. A MW “calo” registration process should be explored; this would be best coordinated with local sub-district (camat) and village administrations. It could ostensibly be used to establish geographical boundaries for “calo” and enforce more responsible and accountable treatment of MW.
8. The project should explore the possibility of preparing village regulations for migrant workers.
9. An inter-departmental working group needs to be established to address the issues of relationships between central and local government and identify mutually exclusive areas for contribution to MW management and eliminate overlap and obfuscation.
10. The MW sector is growing in importance and its relationship to development is also becoming clearer, however, information is still limited. A cost benefit analysis should be conducted on the MW sector to establish the balance between costs and benefits and clarify the most productive sectors and what real contribution is made to the Indonesian economy from each.
11. The current awareness raising campaign and advocacy should be extended to mainstream Indonesia through funding awareness campaigns aimed at Islam in the manner that the Fahmina Institute currently operates. Leaflet production and other publications explaining the status of human trafficking and migrant work from an Islamic perspective.
12. The targeted research and publications program has produced many recommendations. These recommendations should be summarized in a document and fed into an action plan for the next phase.
13. Research needs to be undertaken to identify the status and potential, problems and profile of male partners of DW/MW and their special needs.
14. The ILO may wish to expand the volume of work done by the project, especially in the local areas to make more efficient use of funds. One way that this could be done is to utilize the current funding allocations by dedicating them fully to the Policy and Legislative Protection, Awareness Raising and Advocacy, Capacity Building of Key Stakeholders and Research/Data Collection and Dissemination Systems components within the normative ILO framework which by default require higher cost national and international consultant inputs, and separate the Outreach, Protection, Livelihood Activities and Re-integration Services into a separate component to be funded under a development framework that would stand alone as a separate intervention under the CFLTIMW project. Other project configurations could also be explored to find a way to increase efficiency and effectiveness while up-scaling project action and mainstreaming migration and forced labour/trafficking concerns into the Indonesian development framework.
15. Alternative methods of awareness raising and advocacy should be developed to increase the horizontal and vertical scope of impacts.
  - a. Development of a migrant domestic worker icon in the form of an animated character that could be used on national TV to boost awareness of MW issues through short duration commercials
  - b. Documentaries on the positive good news stories of MW
  - c. Sinetron with MW themes
16. The project should re-examine the training programs it provides and identify new training products to apply to MW management:
  - a. Practical problem solving skills for consular staff
  - b. Psycho-social counselling for consular staff
  - c. Communication skills (for communication with MW)

## **9. Lessons Learned**

A recurring issue throughout the evaluation was the relatively ad hoc approach to data and information gathering. This problem occurs because from an implementation perspective it is not a priority and related professional inputs were not provided at inception. It is also an indication that administrative personnel have their hands full with implementation issues and not enough time to devote to the management of data and reporting. For such a complex project that maintains implementation relationships with a broad range of organizations, more personnel are required (see section 8.1 above).

## Appendix 1                      CFLTIMW Project Activities

1. International Migrant Day Celebration on 18 December 2006
2. A series of radio talkshows with Smart FM on migrant workers and broadcasted at national level in various cities over Indonesia throughout 2007 and 2008
3. Developing local ordinance in three areas (Banyuwangi, Lampung and Cirebon) Currently in finalization stages of the drafts.
4. “Migrants ‘Ambassador Field Campaign and Concert in sending areas (Banten, Brebes, Jember, Malang, Lampung) activities continued throughout 2007 and 2008.
5. Project Advisory Committee (PAC) Meeting 27 June 2007
6. Entrepreneurship Training for Migrant Workers Communities (TOT Start Your Business<sup>26</sup>) conducted 23 July – 1 August 2007.
7. Training of Entrepreneur (TOE) SYB for Migrant Worker Communities (Stepdown SYB was conducted in the following communities starting 26 August and finishing 17 November 2007.
  - a. Cirebon, Indramayu and Sukabumi in West Java
  - b. East Lombok and Mataram in NTB
  - c. Semarang, Wonosobo and Boyolali in Central Java
  - d. Metro in Lampung.)
8. Entrepreneurship Training for Migrant Workers Communities (TOT SYB plus GET Ahead Training) conducted from 26 to 30 November 2007.
9. Paralegal Capacity Building for Indonesian Migrant Worker Organizations in Sending Areas (TOT) conducted from 21 November to 2 December 2007
10. Project on strengthening Indonesian migrant workers organisations and migrant workers community organisations in basis and transit areas, training conducted from 7 to 24 March 2008 in the following locations
  - a. Perbaungan (North Sumatra)
  - b. Jember (East Java)
  - c. Sei Rempah (North Sumatra)
  - d. Selong (NTB)
  - e. Serdang Bedagai (North Sumatra)
11. Step down Paralegal Training was conducted for Migrant Worker Communities in the following Sending Areas from 11 April to 25 June 2008:
  - a. East Lombok in West Nusa Tenggara
  - b. Subang in West Java
  - c. East Lampung in Lampung
  - d. Kebumen in Central Java
  - e. Serang in Banten
12. Pre-Departure Training for Indonesian Migrant Worker Organizations in Sending Areas (TOT) was conducted from 18 November to 2 December 2007
13. Stepdown Pre-Departure Training for Migrant Worker Communities was conducted in the following sending areas from 8 March 2008 to 4 April 2008
  - a. Wonosobo in Central Java
  - b. Sukabumi in West Java
  - c. Batam
  - d. Jambi in Riau
  - e. Sumbawa in West Nusa Tenggara

---

<sup>26</sup> This is the initial national level training program to train partner staff so that they can then train MW/DW in their local locations.

14. Research on “The Indonesian Placement and Protection System for Indonesian Migrant Workers: Analysis of Legal Framework, Policies and Measures” was undertaken from 28 May to 27 August 2007
15. Research on “Utilizing Migrant Workers’ Remittances for Productive Investments: Analysis and Recommendations” was undertaken from 7 November 2007 to 4 January 2008
16. Research on “Enhanced Employment Services for Migrant Workers: Needs Assessment, Analysis and Recommendations” was undertaken from 24 September to 1 December 2007
17. Memorandum of Understanding Frameworks and Bilateral Negotiation Skills Training for BNP2TKI staff conducted from 28 to 30 November 2007
18. Labour Promotion and Marketing Training for BNP2TKI staff conducted from 4 to 6 December 2007
19. Labour Migration Management Training for BNP2TKI personnel conducted from 10 to 14 December 2007
20. National Capacity-Building on Indonesian Migrant Workers Rights, Migration Management, and Advocacy Activities for Indonesian Migrant Workers Organizations (TOT Migrant Worker Rights) conducted from 24-26 July 2007
21. National Capacity-Building for Indonesian Migrant Workers Rights, Migration Management, and Advocacy Activities for Indonesian Migrant Workers Organizations (Leadership TOT for Migrant Worker Organisations) conducted from 2 to 5 August 2007
22. Celebration of International Migrant Workers Day, promoting the existence and status of migrant workers conducted 18 December 2007
23. Panel Review on the findings of the Study on Indonesian Laws, Policies and Practices Concerning Indonesian Migrant Workers: A Situational Review and Set of Recommendations conducted 19 December 2007 in Jakarta.
24. BNP2TKI High Level Officer Planning Session in Bandung to strengthen organizational structure and capacity, and planning for the future conducted 29 February to 2 March 2008.
25. Second Project Advisory Committee (PAC) Meeting convened 12 March 2008
26. Department of Foreign Affairs Training for Consular Staff on the Protection of Migrant Workers (for service personnel assigned to newly established service centers in main destination countries) conducted from 31 March to 4 April and 21 to 25 April 2008.
27. Food Processing/Production Skills Training conducted from 15 April to 15 July in the following locations to improve small business development in migrant worker communities:
  - a. Mataram, East Lombok and Central Lombok in West Nusa Tenggara
  - b. Salatiga, Boyolali and Semarang in Central Java
  - c. Sukabumi and Cirebon in West Java
28. Strengthening the Asian Migrant Domestic Workers’ Regional Alliance (The 2<sup>nd</sup> Domestic Workers Assembly) through forum and discussions on 29 and 30 April 2008.
29. Strengthening the Asian Migrant Domestic Workers’ Regional Alliance (Regional Campaign Launch for the “Recognition of Domestic Workers as Work”) included a press conference and Migrant Workers goodwill ambassadors concert on 1 May 2008
30. Strengthening an Asian Migrant Domestic Workers’ Regional Alliance (Crisis Services and Direct Assistance Workshop) conducted 2 May 2008.
31. Department of Foreign Affairs Training for personnel on the Promotion of Migrant Workers conducted 6 to 8 May 2008.
32. Department of Foreign Affairs Decent Work Based Promotion of Migrant Workers TOT conducted 14 to 16 May, 2008.
33. Department of Foreign Affairs Junior Diplomat Training conducted 16-17 July 2008.

34. Planning Session – Coordinating Ministry for Economic Affairs High Level Officers Planning Session in Bandung, West Java conducted 8 to 10 May 2008
35. Review on Indonesian Human Rights Protection Systems for Undocumented Migrants and Women Migrant Domestic Workers (Komnas Perempuan) conducted from 22 May - 11 June 2007
36. Congress of Indonesian Migrant Workers Union (Serikat Buruh Migran Indonesia - SBMI) convened 11 to 15 August 2008.
37. SBMI & SMS Capacity Building Research and Assessment undertaken 11-15 August 2008.
38. Department of Foreign Affairs Stakeholders Workshop conducted 20-22 August 2008. (The workshop involves Department of Foreign Affairs, BNP2TKI and relevant local government representatives for migration management affairs)
39. National Preparatory Meeting for the Global Forum on Migration and Development (GMFD) Meeting (Organized by Migrant Care, Coordinating Ministry for Economic Affairs, INFID, MFA) conducted 4-5 September 2008.
40. GMFD Preparatory meeting followed up with planning session for Coordinating Ministry for Economic Affairs High Level Officers Planning Session in Bogor, conducted 11-12 September 2008.
41. Workshop on migrant workers (Organized by UNI APRO/UNI MLC/Aspek Indonesia conducted 20-21 September 2008.
42. National Stakeholder Consultations on Indonesian Employment Services for Migrant Workers to be conducted 28 October 2008.
43. National Stakeholder Consultations on Migrant Workers' Remittances, Micro Credit and LED to be convened 30 October 2008.
44. Department of Foreign Affairs Training for Consular Staff on the Protection of Migrant Workers conducted in Singapore 7 to 9 July 2008, and Abu Dhabi 3 to 5 November 2008. Service personnel assigned to newly established Service Centers in main destination countries: (Training in Singapore and United Arab Emirates)
45. "Migrants 'Ambassador Field Campaign and Concert in Hong Kong" on the 61st Indonesian Independence Day Celebration 1 May 2007
46. Targeted Research, Documentation and Advocacy Activities for Improving Protection of Indonesian Migrant Workers in Hong Kong and Indonesia (KOTKIHO & AMC) conducted from 23 August - 30 November 2007
47. Conference: Developing A Comprehensive Policy Framework For Migrant Labour (Bar Council Malaysia) convened 18 - 19 February 2008
48. Direct Assistance and Service Provision for Indonesian Migrant Worker (HOME) from 15 February to 15 August 2008.
49. National Workshop on Improving Recruitment and Preparation of Migrant Workers for Korea 29-30 March 2008.
50. Capacity building workshop: "You can make a difference – Advocating for migrant workers' rights in Singapore" 20 June to 20 July 2008.
51. Department of Foreign Affairs Training for Consular Staff on the Protection of Migrant Workers in Singapore: 7 to 9 July 2008 and to be conducted in Abu Dhabi 3 to 5 November 2008. Service personnel Assigned to newly established Service Centers in Main Destination Countries.

### **East Java "Japan Migration" Activities**

1. Stakeholder Workshop on Migrant Worker at Hotel Hyatt Surabaya 12 April 07
2. Training of trainer Start Your Business from 5 to 15 August 2007
3. Training of entrepreneurs SYB from 2 to 12 September 2007 in:



- a. Banyuwangi
  - b. Jember
  - c. Lumajang
  - d. Pamekasan
  - e. Blitar
4. Training of Trainer Paralegal Malang from 4 to 8 October 2007
5. Training of Trainer Human Rights Malang from 4 to 6 Nov 2007
6. Refresher course Start Your Business from 12 to 16 November 2007
7. Step down paralegal training from 2 November to 5 December 2007 in:
  - a. Malang
  - b. Banyuwangi
  - c. Bojonegoro
  - d. Jember
  - e. Blitar
8. Training of Trainer Pre-departure Malang 1 – 3 Oct 2007
9. Step down Pre-departure training from 11 November to 5 December in:
  - a. Malang
  - b. Banyuwangi
  - c. Bojonegoro
  - d. Jember
  - e. Blitar
10. Seafast Production skill training from 28 April to 29 August in:
  - a. Malang 2 locations
  - b. Blitar 3 locations
  - c. Kediri 2 locations
  - d. Sumenep 2 locations
  - e. Pamekasan 1 location
  - f. Jember 3 locations
  - g. Banyuwangi 2 locations
11. Fertilizer Making Training in Malang on 29 April 2008 1 location
12. Step down Pre-departure training in 3 additional locations from 8 March to 15 April 2008 (no data provided on location).

## Appendix 2                      CFLTIMW Project Outputs

1. Happening art depicting migrant workers situation
2. IEC materials on migrant workers protection-related issues
3. 3 academic background papers for ordinances and 3 drafts of local ordinances for 3 participating districts (local Government)
4. Recommendations from 2 PAC Meetings that ensure smooth running of the project
5. 20 National trainers are trained to apply the ILO-SYB entrepreneurship training system.
6. 185 members of migrant worker communities have learned to develop business plans and are better armed with business knowledge
7. 19 National trainers with increased skills and knowledge to enable delivery of entrepreneurship training.
8. 30 TOT participants from NGOs, TUs, and Migrant Worker-based Organizations with improved understanding of paralegal matters in sending areas.
9. 106 TOT participants from MW/DW organizations in transit areas (Perbaungan and Serdang Bedagai (North Sumatra), Jember (East Java), Sei Rempah (North Sumatra) and Selong (NTB) with improved understanding of paralegal matters
10. 150 members of MW/DW communities with improved understanding of paralegal matters
11. 30 TOT participants from NGOs, TUs, and Migrant Worker-based Organizations with improved understanding of pre-departure knowledge and issues in sending areas.
12. 150 members of MW/DW communities with improved understanding of Pre-departure-related issues in sending areas
13. A comprehensive analysis on current migration management system in Indonesia
14. A comprehensive analysis of existing remittances policy framework and measures in Indonesia
15. A comprehensive analysis on current policies and practices related to employment services for MW/DWs.
16. 24 BNP2TKI personnel with strengthened bilateral negotiation skills.
17. 16 BNP2TKI personnel with strengthened labour promotion and marketing skills.
18. 19 BNP2TKI personnel with master training skills on placement and protection of Indonesian migrant workers.
19. 29 new national trainers from and for MW/DW organizations for training on MW/DW rights supported by appropriate training materials, manual/ handbook for TOT training
20. 29 new trainers from and for MW/DW organizations for training on Leadership of Migrant Worker Organisations.
21. A comprehensive overview of the existing legal framework and practices related to the placement and protection of Indonesian migrant workers including recommendations on policy revisions, law enforcement and monitoring mechanisms to be implemented by governmental institutions and relevant stakeholders.
22. Recommendations for BNP2TKI to strengthen its organizational capacity and planning and implementation of its works
23. 46 Deplu Staffs trained in Protection of Migrant Workers and are mobilized to destination countries
24. 260 Migrant workers with improved skills and knowledge of Food Processing/Production Skills to apply to development of alternative source of family income, in Mataram, East Lombok and Central Lombok in West Nusa Tenggara, Salatiga, Boyolali and Semarang in Central Java, and Sukabumi and Cirebon in West Java
25. Elected Steering Committee of the ADWA with finalized, detailed ToRs for the functions and mechanisms of coordination, implementation, monitoring and documentation of the

- Steering Committee and identified and agreed mechanism for cooperation and coordination among all Alliance members;
26. Leaders of ADWA from among Asian migrants domestic workers leaders
  27. Strengthened cooperation among Asian Domestic Workers, NGOs, Trade Union and other civil society groups.
  28. Finalized and Adopted Plan of Action for the Asian Domestic Workers' Alliance with detailed, concrete output and dates of delivery for all components of the Plan, to be implemented at National, Regional and International levels
  29. Strategy for the Campaign
  30. Media Strategy for cooperation, maximization of coverage and dissemination of messages
  31. Campaign Messages and IEC materials compiled and provided
  32. Campaign Programme for the Good-Will Ambassadors, ADWA members and stakeholders
  33. Increased understanding of how to run shelters, handle cases and provide psycho-social support to victims of abuse among ADWA members and stakeholders
  34. Dialog established among ADWA participating partners about learning outcomes and experiences .
  35. Grassroots networks established among ADWA partners to ensure future cooperation.
  36. Basic common guidelines on the running of shelters and case-handling are established for ADWA partners
  37. 26 Foreign Affairs Personnel trained in promotion of migrant workers
  38. 99 Junior Foreign Affairs staff trained in labour migration and negotiation skills
  39. Recommendations formulated by senior staff of Coordinating Ministry of Economic Affairs to be applied in strengthening the implementation of the reform programs required by Presidential Instruction No. 6/2006
  40. Document including recommendations: Review on Indonesian Human Rights Protection Systems for Undocumented Migrants and Women Migrant Domestic Workers (Komnas Perempuan)
  41. Seminar and Congress of SBMI harmonizing perceptions and understanding of domestic and migrant workers issues among all Indonesian Chapters.
  42. Comprehensive capacity analysis identifying organizational capacity gaps in the structure of SBMI and SMS and related recommendations to strengthen the performance of the organization
  43. Initial networking established between 27 participants as representatives of national and local government resulting in strengthened inter-agency coordination on labour migration and management at local level.
  44. Detailed position paper of the Indonesian CSO for the GMFD meeting
  45. Detailed written recommendations for Indonesian government delegations for GMFD meeting
  46. Coordinating Ministry for Economic Affairs Action plan for reforming coordination of labour migration management.
  47. Compilation of best practices on how trade unions can better serve migrant workers in Malaysia and Indonesia.
  48. Improved understanding of strengths and weaknesses of employment agencies
  49. Improved understanding of migrant worker remittance handling, and improvements required to support easily accessible and reliable international remittance transfer services for migrant workers.



## Appendix 3      Publications

### Domestic Workers Project List of publications (Development Stage of Draft)

<b>Titles (Publications)</b>	<b>Language</b>	<b>Year</b>
Malaysia National Stakeholder Conference: Developing a Comprehensive Policy Framework for Migrant Labour (Compilation of Conference Papers and Presentations)	English	2008
The Indonesian Placement and Protection System for Indonesian Migrant Workers: Analysis of Legal Framework, Policies and Measure	English / Bahasa Indonesia	2008
Utilizing Migrant Workers' Remittances for Productive Investments: Analysis and Recommendations	English / Bahasa Indonesia	2008
Enhanced Employment Services for Migrant Workers: Needs Assessment, Analysis and Recommendations	English / Bahasa Indonesia	2008
Documenting Best Practices of the Project at Local Level (developed by The Jakarta Post)	English / Bahasa Indonesia	2008
A Book on Indonesian Migrant Workers: From Legal Aspect to A Portrait of Migrant Workers Situation (written by Rieke, MW Goodwill Ambassador)—it will be published in two versions (free distribution in pocket book version, and commercial/exclusive version for general public readers)	Bahasa Indonesia only	2008
Underpayment Survey and Excessive Agency Fees in Hong Kong	English / Bahasa Indonesia	2008

<b>Titles (Training Manuals)</b>	<b>Language</b>	<b>Year</b>
Training Manual Paralegal	English / Bahasa Indonesia	2008
Training Manual Pre-Departure	English / Bahasa Indonesia	2008
Training Manual Human Rights and Migration Management	English / Bahasa Indonesia	2008
Training Manual Labour Migration Management	English / Indonesia	2008
Training Manual Labour Promotion and Marketing	English / Indonesia	2008
Training Manual Memorandum Of Understanding Frameworks And Bilateral Negotiation Skills	English / Indonesia	2008
Manual Junior Diplomat Training	English / Indonesia	2008
Trainers Manual Establishing Service Centers	English / Indonesia	2008

## Appendix 4      Priority Program Enhancements

PREVIOUS PROGRAM	PROPOSED ENHANCEMENT
<b>PLACEMENT</b>	
An integrated cross-sector information system (Depdagri/SIAM, Deplu-RI Reps/Job Order, Immigration/Passport, Depkes-Pusdatin, BNP2TKI-SISCO TKLN, Depnakertrans/Bursa Kerja, Dijen Pajak-BFLN)	Build an online system and website to facilitate online processes.
The issuance of an RI Travel Letter for Rp.0,- for the migrant workers as promulgated in the Article 2 par.3, Presidential Regulation Number 19 of 2007 on the Amendment of the PP RI Number 75 of 2005	Review of PP 19/2007
The harmonization and coordination in the implementation of provisions in Citizen's Administration and Immigration on the required documents to make MW's passport, which used to be ID card to SKPLN.	Harmonization of UU 9/92, UU 33/2006, and perpres 35/2008.
An established BLKLN rating based on the availability of instructors, facility and infrastructure and the management of training.	Formation of an accreditation body.
The accelerated issuance of Permenakertrans as follow up to PP Number 31/2006 on Sislakernas.	Clarify the implementation of the government policy.
The issuance of the Letter from the Mendagri on the support of the implementation of BKLN in local administration.	Review the Letter from Mendagri.
The Improved formation of BKLN (Foreign Job Exchange) in the District/City.	Socialization (Information Dissemination) in the districts.
The Optimization of information through the dissemination of job opportunity and registration of the prospective MW at the sub-district level.	Socialization (Information Dissemination) in the districts.
<b>PROTECTION</b>	
Development of an employment planning and information system in the form of the creation of job exchange.	Information system development & job expo to be done in the sub district.
Improvement of local administration in the processing of MW's documents thus their documents could be issued in the place of origin.	Service to be done in the sub district by BNP2TKI, Labor and Immigration.
Improved monitoring on the implementation of recruitment and placement process of MW in each region.	Enhanced monitoring in the district level.
Availability of Hotline services such as the provision of mailbox at the embarkation/debarkation spots.	Likewise provide every recruitment point with a feedback or postal box.
Imposition of sanction towards the officials that are involved in the practice of thugs and illegal middlemen to the MW at the embarkation/debarkation by the authorized institutions.	Sanction to be given is by reducing the MW's payment and by endorsing case to proper law enforcement.
Implementation of the MoU between Menakertrans and Kapolri dated February 12, 2007 on the prevention and taking actions toward the practice of illegal middlemen/sponsor of the MW.	The socialization, explanation and establishment of this MoU.
Establishment of a working group on Law Enforcement under the coordination of the Coordinating Ministry of the politic, law and security.	The immediate formation of this of working group.
Availability of a 24-Hour Hot Line Service in order to facilitate legal aid for the prospective migrant workers and to construct the mechanism of complaint.	The improvement of legal support for MWs and the establishment of complaint services in the villages.
<b>PROTECTION (CONT)</b>	
A comprehensive Information Drive for all prospective migrant workers on their rights of obtaining legal assistance abroad by involving the NGO, civil society and mass media.	The establishment of a means of information in the RI representative offices.

PREVIOUS PROGRAM	PROPOSED ENHANCEMENT
<b>FINANCE</b>	
Information drive on a simplified credit procedure for migrant workers, and the dissemination of Banking Guideline book.	The increase of product dissemination; banking and insurance knowledge through MW training.
Joint training of the MW, especially those who will work abroad, together with the banking institutions and the training center and local administration.	To increase the direct credit for MWs through people's business scheme
The open (public) announcement of the annual evaluation result of the PPTKIS.	Coordinating with BI to increase national banking cooperation with the MW's destination countries.
Facilitation of the agreement between national banking and the MW in the payment of credit installment through corresponding bank and the center of remittance abroad.	To increase the number of remittance service provider
Coordination with Indonesian Central Bank (BI) in providing incentive to the banking institutions to improve their credit for prospective and migrant workers.	The evaluation of MW's Insurance availability in terms of competitiveness of price, also to give MWs freedom to choose the Insurance to be used.
Information drive on the utilization of remittance of MW and their family at the destination countries or at the origin countries.	The expansion of Insurance services to create a better quality of life for the MW.



## Appendix 5                      Terms of Reference of the Evaluation

### Terms of Reference for an Independent End-of-Project Evaluation

#### Background

The ILO Project *Combating Forced Labour and Trafficking of Indonesian Migrant Workers*, INS/06/M10/NOR, for Indonesia, Malaysia, Singapore, Hong Kong, with a project period of September 2006 – October 2008, is funded by the Government of Norway. The project activities are based on earlier activities and cooperation from May 2004 – August 2006, funded by DFID.

The overall objective of the project is to strengthening the protection of migrant domestic workers, whether international migrant domestic workers or internal domestic workers. The project's strategic components are the following:

- Policy and legislative protection
- Awareness-raising and advocacy
- Outreach, protection, livelihood activities and reintegration services
- Capacity-building of key stakeholders
- Research/ data collection and dissemination systems

The evaluation shall review and assess the Project's progress and achievements to date taking as a starting point the objectives and outputs in the project's guiding document by assessing the i) efficiency, ii) effectiveness, iii) relevance, iv) impact and v) sustainability of the project as these are briefly described below:

- **Efficiency** - the productivity of the Project implementation process taken as a measure of the extent to which the outputs achieved are derived from an efficient use of financial, material and human resources.
- **Effectiveness** - the extent to which the project can be said to have contributed to the development objectives and the immediate objectives and more concretely whether the stated outputs have been produced satisfactorily.
- **Impact** - positive and negative changes and effects caused by the Project at the sub-regional, national and provincial levels, i.e. the impact with social partners and various implementing partner organisations
- **Relevance** – the extent to which the objectives are in keeping with sub-regional, national and local priorities and needs, the constituents' priorities and needs and the donor's priorities for the project countries
- **Sustainability** – the extent to which adequate capacity building of social partners have taken place to ensure mechanisms are in place to sustain activities and whether the existing activities are likely to be maintained beyond project completion.

#### 2. Purpose and scope of the evaluation

The project's mid-term evaluation, which took place in Nov-Dec. 2007, thoroughly reviewed the results and impact of specific project activities implemented, in view of the problems and needs of the target group. It also made specific recommendations for the project focus and

implementation strategies for the remainder of the period, and recommended a new project phase in order to address the magnitude of the problem.

The end-of project evaluation, to take place in September 2008, will assess the project objective, design, strategy, results and impact within the wider context of relevant Indonesian national and local policy and programme frameworks and stakeholder configurations. The evaluation will furthermore draw lessons from the implementation of the project and identify opportunities and priorities for future action, also with respect to upscaling project action and mainstreaming migration and forced labour/trafficking concerns into the Indonesian development framework, strengthening the migration-development nexus. To the extent that the project objectives are found to remain relevant, the evaluation results will feed into the objectives, design, strategy and planned output of a new project proposal.

Generally, the evaluation will:

- First, review the achievements of the Project by assessing to what extent the stated objectives and major outputs have been achieved.
- Second, review the efficiency and effectiveness of the project implementation framework and links to national policy and programme frameworks, as well as the potentials for doing so in a potential new project phase.
- Third, review the efficiency and effectiveness of the project implementation framework and links to national frameworks
- Fourth, assess if the project has reached a state of maturity at the end of the current project phase so that project-initiated activities may be sustained without further external financial and technical support
- Fifth, review to what extent the programme is still relevant and is continuing to meet the needs of its direct target group – migrant and internal domestic workers in the project countries
- Finally, draw conclusions in terms of the progress made and make recommendations for future actions beyond the end of the project (i.e. what is the scope and potential for activities being sustained without technical assistance by the ILO, and what is the scope for another phase of the project?)

The evaluator will hold meetings with the ILO Jakarta management, the backstopping officer, project CTA and project staff. The evaluator will hold meetings in Jakarta with i) national and local stakeholder counterparts and key implementing partners, ii) and make field visits to action programmes in Indonesia.

A detailed draft itinerary will be developed by the Project and will be presented to the evaluator for comments and suggestions before embarking on interviews in Indonesia, as will relevant information and documents about the project.

### **3. Project assessment**

The evaluator should address the progress made and the following main effect and impact concerns regarding the project: validity of design, delivery strategy, and performance including relevance, effectiveness, efficiency, sustainability, impact, causality and unanticipated effects, alternative strategies and gender concerns.

Specific questions to be addressed include:

#### **A. Validity of design**

- Are the objectives clearly stated, describing the solutions to the identified problems and needs?
- Are the indicators of achievement clearly defined, describing the changes to be brought about?
- Have the external factors affecting project implementation been identified and assumptions proven valid?
- Is the project document logical and coherent linking the inputs, activities and outputs to each immediate objective?
- Are the roles and commitments of the various partners clearly identified?
- Recommendations?

#### **B. Delivery Process**

- Has the overall execution of the project focused on the achievement of the objectives?
- Has adequate progress been made towards meeting the indicators of achievement?
- Is the delivery strategy established by the project effective?
- Have the various partners contributed to project implementation as planned?
- Have the main partners interacted and coordinated as planned?
- How do the resources invested so far relate to what has been achieved?
- To what extent has the project contributed to the ILO's mission and mandate (Global Employment Agenda, Decent Work Programme, Multi-Lateral Framework on Labour Migration, Forced Labour Agenda, and specific country objectives)?

#### **C. Performance**

##### **Relevance**

- Do the problems/needs that gave rise to the project still exist, have they changed or are there new needs that should be addressed?
- Was the project an appropriate response to the problems/needs that existed when it started?
- Is it still appropriate to the problems/needs?
- Have the priorities given to the basic components of the project, i.e. institutional development versus direct support, changed? If so, why?
- Are the objectives still valid or should they be reformulated?

##### **Effectiveness**

- Has the project made sufficient progress in meeting its objectives?
- Has the project made sufficient progress in conducting activities and producing outputs?
- Did the target group participate in the formulation and implementation of the project?
- Have the benefits of the project accrued to the target group?

##### **Efficiency**

- Do the expected project results continue to justify the costs incurred?
- Have the resources been spent as economically as possible?
- Were the actions of the various partners complementary?
- Are there more efficient ways and means of delivering more and better outputs with the

available inputs?

### **Sustainability**

- What is the likelihood that the project's benefits will be sustained after the withdrawal of external support?
- Do conditions exist to ensure that the project's results will have lasting effects?

### **Impact**

- Has sufficient attention been given to document the impact of the project?
- Have data been collected by the project on the indicators of achievement? Do they provide adequate evidence regarding the effects and impact of the project? Is it necessary to collect additional data?
- Is the impact assessment(s) carried out by the project satisfactorily documenting impact at the entrepreneurial level with regards to enterprise start-up, job creation and livelihoods recovery?
- Can documented impact be attributed to the project?

### **Causality & Unanticipated effects**

- What particular factors or events have affected the project's results?
- Were these factors internal or external to the project?
- What particular factors or events have affected the project's results?
- What could be done to either enhance or mitigate them so that the project has a greater overall impact?

### **Alternative Strategies**

- Is there, or would there have been, a more effective way of addressing the problems and satisfying the needs in order to achieve the project objectives?
- Is the project strategy still valid or should it be reformulated?

### **Gender Concerns**

- Have the different needs of men and women been addressed in the delivery process?
- Have the men and women in the target group benefited equitably from the project activities?
- Have the project gender mainstreamed services, tools and products?

### **Lessons Learned**

- What are the major lessons learnt through the project implementation and what are the implications for future project design?

The evaluator should make conclusions and recommendations based on the above specific questions and based on any other available information and questions that the evaluation may wish to address.

## **4. The evaluator**

The evaluator will be an independent international consultant appointed by the ILO. S/he will have expertise on project evaluations, development and human rights issues, preferably within the UN system and in South East Asia. The evaluator will be expected to undertake fact-finding,

analysis and report writing, and should be fluent in English and, if feasible, proficient in Bahasa Indonesia.

## **5. Timetable and Itinerary**

The field work of the evaluation is foreseen to span over one month. The evaluator will be awarded an External Collaborator Contract from the ILO Jakarta Office. S/he will be engaged for 18 days within the period early September- early October 2007, which will include preparation, field visits and report writing. The project will arrange travels and cover travel costs locally. A detailed itinerary will be provided to the evaluator prior to embarking on interviews.

## **6. Sources of information**

The evaluator will have access to all relevant material on the Project. To the extent possible, key documentation will be sent to the evaluator in advance. The documentation will include the project document, work plans, progress reports and other relevant documents.

## **7. Consultations**

The project will arrange meetings with the ILO Jakarta office management and backstopping officer, project personnel, relevant national stakeholders in Jakarta, local counterparts while on field visits, and key donor representatives. A detailed itinerary will be provided, and meetings organized by the project. A donor representative may participate in the evaluation exercise, as appropriate.

## **8. Presentations & Final report**

The evaluator will make a first presentation on the initial findings to the Project and the ILO Jakarta management towards the end of the evaluation in Indonesia. This will allow the project and the offices to discuss findings and provide additional information, if need be. Subsequently, a final report will be submitted.

The Final Report will follow the Evaluation Template (to be attached as annex to this TOR). The Evaluator will also provide an Evaluation Summary, using ILO template, the content of which will be publicly disseminated.

Upon completion of the evaluation report, the findings and recommendations of the evaluation will be discussed in the Project Advisory Committee.

## **9. Methodology for Evaluation**

Main tasks and Outputs

The evaluators will undertake:

- Development of specific evaluation questions that will elaborate of the listed guidelines in this TOR and finalize the evaluation schedule
- A desk review of the project documents, progress reports and achievements made by project implementation and strategic partners
- Interviews with max 20 national level project stakeholders in total, as well as max. 10 local level project counterparts. All interviewees will be listed by the project.
- Visits to project sites in Indonesia and meetings with local counterparts
- Present the initial findings of the evaluation and facilitate an internal ILO meeting in Jakarta
- Draft the evaluation report

- Incorporate comments of the Project Advisory Committee members/ stakeholders and concerned ILO staff
- Deliver the evaluation summaries as per the ILO summary template and a final report with structure as indicated in annex 2 and 3 of CODEV's and/or EVAL's guidelines for the terms of reference of an independent evaluation & the structure & contents of an independent evaluation report & annexes.
- Annexes required for report: assignment time schedule, interview list, list of documents reviewed, list of participants in joint meetings, report from field visits

#### 10. *Time Schedule and Deadlines for Consultancy*

##### **Working days of consultancy**

3 days Desk study  
 3 days field visits and local travel  
 6 days interviews with stakeholders, ILO  
 4 days drafting of report  
 2 days integration of feedback from ILO and stakeholders  
18 days total work

##### **Deadlines for consultancy work**

12-15 Sept. Desk study  
 16- 24 Sept. Interviews in Indonesia & destination countries with stakeholders, ILO, donor, field visits and local travel in total in Indonesia  
 25- 28 Sept. Drafting of report  
 29 Sept. Submission of report to ILO  
 2 Oct. Reception of feed-back from ILO  
 3 Oct. Integration of feed-back from ILO  
 4 Oct. Submission of revised draft report to ILO  
 10 Oct. Reception of input from stakeholders  
 11 Oct. Integration of input from stakeholders  
 12 Oct. Submission of final revised report to ILO

Schedules for interviews and meetings will be arranged by the ILO/Project team in consultation with the evaluator.

#### **11. Budget for Consultancy**

To be paid by the Project:

- All-inclusive honorarium for 18 working days
- DSA for travel days according to the regulations of the ILO.

ILO will organize all local transport and logistics.

Travel schedules, means of transport and communication subject to prior arrangement with ILO



## Appendix 6 Evaluation Interviews and Meetings

### ILO Jakarta

Name	Organisation	Position	Activity	Date
Lotte Keijser	ILO	CTA/Migrant Workers Project	Interview on the Project activities	15 Sep 2008
Alan Boulton	ILO	Director	Interview on ILO activities/projects	16 Sep 2008
Peter van Rooij	ILO	Deputy Director	Interview on ILO activities/projects	16 Sep 2008
Rolly Damayanti	ILO	Nat'l Programme Coordinator/NICP-JOY	Interview on cooperation between Migrant Worker Project and NICP-JOY Project	17 Sep 2008
Albert Bonasahat	ILO	Nat'l Project Coordinator/Migrant Workers Project	Interview on the Project activities	17 Sep 2008
Irham Ali Saifuddin	ILO	Programme Assistant/Migrant Workers Project	Interview on the Project activities	17 Sep 2008

### Government

Name	Organisation	Position	Activity	Date
Komara Djaja	Ministry of Finance	Expert Staff	Interview on several activities with the Project	18 Sep 2008
Jumhur Hidayat	BNP2TKI (National Migration Agency)	Chair person	Interview on several activities with the Project	18 Sep 2008
Darmansjah Djumala	Ministry of Foreign Affairs	Head of Center for Education & Training	Interview on several activities with the Project	10 Oct 2008
Roostiawaty	Ministry of Manpower	Head of Sub Directorate of Overseas Cooperation	Interview on the Project activities	13 Oct 2008

### Trade Unions / NGOs

Name	Organisation	Position	Activity	Date
Jamal	SBMI	Head of Advocacy	Interview on	17 Sep



		Dep.	several activities with the Project	2008
Anis Hidayah	Migrant Care	Executive Director	Interview on several activities with the Project	17 Sep 2008
Aryo Yudoko	UNI/Aspek	Migrant worker programe officer	Interview on several activities with the Project	17 Sep 2008
Hanggraini	KOPBUMI	Office Manager	Interview on several activities with the Project	17 Sep 2008
Endang Yulianingsih	Solidaritas Migran Scalabrini	Deputy Director	Help Desk / Shelter for Migrant Workers	17 Sep 2008
Tribudi	Plan International – NTB	Migrant worker programe coordinator	Update on migrant worker-related issues covered by Plan International	10 Oct 2008

### Field Interviews

Name	Organisation	Position	Activity	Date
<b>Salatiga District</b>				
Mrs. Ruth Murtiasih Subodro	SPPQT	Vice Executive Director	SIYB and Food Processing Training	20 Sep 2008
Mrs. Asrofi	SPPQT	General Secretary	SIYB and Food Processing Training	20 Sep 2008
Mrs. Nurul	SPPQT	Education and Community Health Dept. / SIYB Trainer	SIYB and Food Processing Training	20 Sep 2008
Mrs. Siti Harsun	SPPQT	Women and Migrant Workers Dept. / SIYB Trainer	SIYB and Food Processing Training	20 Sep 2008
Mrs. Siti Fathimah	SPPQT	Women Group Cadre / SIYB Trainer	SIYB and Food Processing Training	20 Sep 2008
Mrs. Aulani	-	Entrepreneur	SIYB and Food Processing Training	20 Sep 2008
Mrs. Ulis	-	Entrepreneur	SIYB and Food Processing Training	20 Sep 2008
<b>Boyolali District</b>				
Mr. Lisin	-	Entrepreneur/Cow fattener	SIYB and Food Processing Training	20 Sep 2008
<b>Semarang District</b>				

Mrs. Muti'ah	-	Entrepreneur/ Mushroom production	SIYB and Food Processing Training	20 Sep 2008
<b>Sukabumi District</b>				
Mrs. Endah Khodijah	PPSW Pasundan	Officer / SYB Trainer	SIYB and Food Processing Training	21 Sep 2008
10 former SYB step-down training participants	Forum Citamis (member of PPSW)	Entrepreneurs	SIYB and Food Processing Training	21 Sep 2008
<b>Cirebon District</b>				
Mr. Castra Aji Sarosa	FWBMI	Head	Local ordinance	22 Sep 2008
Mrs. Rohenti	SBMI Cirebon Chapter	Head	Local ordinance	22 Sep 2008
Mr. Dadan and his 3 staffs	Disnaker Cirebon (Manpower Office)	Chair person	Local ordinance	22 Sep 2008
Mr. Obeng Nurosyid	Fahmina Institute	Head of Islam and Community Authonimy Improvement	Local ordinance and trafficking issues	22 Sep 2008
<b>Bandung</b>				
Mr. Soetedjo Soekirdjo	Training Center of Ministry of Manpower (BBPPK)	Head of Personnel and External Relationship Dept.	SIYB	23 Sep 2008
Amalia Kusumawardhani	Training Center of Ministry of Manpower (BBPPK)	Staff / SIYB Trainer	SIYB	23 Sep 2008
Inna Junaenah	Padjajaran University, Bandung	Lecturer of Law Faculty	Local Ordinance	23 Sep 2008