



## **INTERNATIONAL LABOUR ORGANIZATION (ILO)**

### **Decent Work Team and Country Office for Eastern Europe and Central Asia**

#### **FINAL TECHNICAL AND SELF-ASSESSMENT REPORT**

Project No: **RER/08/10/FIN**

Project Title: **Occupational Safety and Health (OSH) in Central Asia**

Country/Subregion/  
Region **Central Asia**

Countries covered **Kazakhstan (KAZ 155), Kyrgyzstan (KGZ 152), Tajikistan (TJK 154),  
Uzbekistan (UZB 127), Sub-regional SMM code SMO 152**

Period Covered: **July 2010 – December 2011**

Total Budget: **400,000 euro**

Starting Date: **01.01.2009**

End Date: **31.12.2011**

Implemented by: **Decent Work Team and Country Office for Eastern Europe and  
Central Asia**

Responsible ILO  
Official **Wiking Husberg, Senior Occupational Safety and Health Specialist  
through Evgueni Davydov, Director DWT/CO Moscow**

External  
implementing  
partners **Uzbek Centre for OSH and Normalisation  
Kazakh OSH Institute  
Kyrgyz and Tajik Labour Inspection  
Social partners in countries of Project implementation**

Collaborating ILO  
Units/Offices **SafeWork**

Donor: **Ministry for Foreign Affairs, Finland**

Prepared by: **W. Husberg, O. Gerasimova, E. Kudriavtseva , M. Ouchi**

Place: **Moscow**

06.03.2012

---

---

## **SUMMARY OF PROJECT OBJECTIVES/OUTCOMES**

### ***EXPECTED IMPACT/ DEVELOPMENT OBJECTIVE***

The main objective is to support social sustainable development and promote the Decent Work Agenda focusing on the improvement of the working conditions and by introducing occupational accident and disease insurance (OADI) for men and women at work.

Sustainable social development is further supported by facilitating social dialogue, aiming at consensus building, among employers, workers and government services, and including sustainable improvement on working conditions and accident and disease insurance to people in both formal and informal sectors. The project approach is based on the balance of prevention and protection and therefore the elements of OSH, OADI and HIV/AIDS are effectively combined.

### ***IMMEDIATE OBJECTIVE / PROJECT OUTCOMES***

1. The countries will systematically develop and coherently implement national OSH systems, both on national and enterprise level, based on tri-partite cooperation. Model examples of modern preventive systems adapted for each country will serve to upgrade legislation and methodologies for prevention, inspection and self-improvement in a tri-partite context. The countries will consistently integrate HIV/AIDS prevention into national OSH systems development and implementation.
2. Based on the principle of supporting the improvement of internal security, the Ministry of Labours will create a stable platform of social safety net by developing occupational accident and disease insurance legislation, incorporating the views based on the social consensus, expressed by the social partners and expert organisations. The principles of OADI stipulated in legislation will be implemented through regional OSH centre structures and national/regional social-security related institution structures.

---

## Introduction

This is a final report on the project which covers the whole duration of the project in all the operational areas and all the countries covered by the project, with the exception of Turkmenistan, where no activities have been possible. The report summarizes the results achieved and provides a self-assessment of the project's efficiency and effectiveness.

The project was managed by a team of DWT/CO Moscow specialists (Senior OSH Specialist, Senior Social Security Specialist, HIV/AIDS Focal Point). The project implementation team included one programme assistant, one Moscow-based project coordinator and one coordinator in Tashkent/Uzbekistan.

## I. Country information and developments

### In the region

The project operated in a complex environment, which was affected by the overall economic and political developments in the region. The political unrest and violent events in Kyrgyzstan in spring 2010 have caused disturbances in the region, but the stabilisation of the Government is now taking place. Despite the difficult context, the project has been able to continue activities in all countries; activities in Kyrgyzstan were resumed in autumn 2010. Year 2011 has been allocated for capacity building of new partners in the Trade Union and employers organisations.

In Kazakhstan the closer trade and diplomatic contacts between Kazakhstan and Finland have had a positive impact, now Kazakhstan has the capacity to develop the OSH system, based on its own resources and it is used as an example in the region.

The tasks and resources of the Ministry of Labour in Uzbekistan have been further decreased as a part of internal organisational changes; the cooperation with the social partners has continued unabated. OSH specialists from Uzbekistan have supported the ILO OSH Team to build capacity in Tajikistan, which still is in need of substantial capacity building.

The social partners in Kyrgyzstan and the technical experts in the Government have continued cooperation with the project, even if the political decision-making level has been absent most of the time.

Kazakhstan and Tajikistan have renewed their DWCPs, reconfirming the need for assistance in the OSH field of the project. The DWCP renewal process in Kyrgyzstan has started in end 2010, and is still on-going.

Project activities have been integrated with other DWT/CO Moscow project activities ("From the Crisis towards Decent and Safe Jobs" project) funded by the Ministry for Foreign Affairs of Finland; "Improving Occupational Safety and Health (OSH) systems in Central Asia – phases 3-5" funded by the Government of Korea) for maximum impact and efficiency. Due to the long term cooperation of the ILO and the partner countries as well as due to the full agreement of the importance of the suggested systematic approach, some of the partners and enterprises are implementing the project activities on their own cost, but also with their own time table (Kaz and Uzbek). Other partners are suffering from lack of capacity and major changes in personnel, which hamper the progress.

### Kazakhstan

Kazakhstan (along with Russia) has one of the most developed national OSH systems in the region. The Labour Code (LC) was adopted in 2007, replacing the previous OSH law. OSH

---

Management Systems and mandatory bi-partite safety committees were included in the update in 2011.

The country has done a tri-partite national OSH profile in 2008 and the Ministry has included OSH in its National Strategy on Labour for 2009-11. After the TUs changed their attitude the requirement to create mandatory bi-partite OSH committees at enterprises was included in the LC.

The implementation of OSH management systems (OSH MS) at big enterprises based on GOST 12.0.230-2007 (ILO-OSH 2001) is continuing; the percentage of enterprises that have introduced OSH MS is an indicator in the plan of action for the MinLab National Strategy. Four detailed national standards for assisting in the practical implementation have been approved.

The National OSH Institute and other organisation used to provide training for OSH specialists, LI and enterprises in introducing ILO-OSH 2001 (GOST 12.0.230-2007), social dialogue and risk assessment at enterprises. Experts from the institute established private OSH centres, one of which (jointly with the Federation of TUs) is providing eight seminars in the regions and for selected industrial sectors.

Kazakhstan organised in 2011 for the first time ever a National OSH Exhibition and Conference linked to the World Safety Day 28 April.

Two major seminars on OSH MS and related issues, focusing on the oil and gas industry, were organised by the Government with ILO, Norwegian and int'l enterprise participation in Nov 2010. However, there are still some enterprises with poor working conditions, which led to wild strikes in summer 2011. Follow-up training is planned for 2012.

Based on the situation mapping on Occupational Accident and Disease Insurance (OADI) carried out in 2009, an informative brochure on OADI was prepared in English and Russian. In this brochure, information on international examples of OADI experience-rating systems is also included. Understanding that Kazakhstan is the only country where the functional OADI system is in place, strongest focus of action in 2010-11 was given to a dissemination of necessary OADI information to the individual level. Based on the discussion with the social partners, the informative booklet explaining Kazakh OADI system and concrete procedure for receiving the compensation was prepared in collaboration with the Kazakh TU. It is targeted to their TU members as well as the workers in the regions in Kazakhstan. Follow-up capacity building and dissemination seminar financed by another Finnish TC project was completed in April, 2012.

## **Kyrgyzstan**

The appointment of a new Chief LI in 2009 enabled capacity building of the LI, in spite of the turmoil in the country. The development of the LI and the OSH system in the country is based on a ten point programme, which is step-by-step supported by the ILO and the Project.

The crucial deficiency in OSH capacity in the country was addressed when OSH MS and RA training were organised by the ILO Moscow OSH Team and finally Training of Trainers for two LI staff (Deputy CLIs) was provided in Oct 2010. The LI has in end 2011 used its capacity to organise two OSH and risk assessment courses (Sept 11 in Osh and Dec 11 in Bishkek) fully relying on national resources.

An OSH information and training centre has been established with minor support from the Project. The impact of the centre is already felt, as it provides training, consultations, brochures and leaflets. The centre is still in need of strengthening.

Capacity building in OSH has been provided in several events, which has led to increased interest and readiness among the Employers' Organisations (EO) to start introducing OSH MS in big enterprises (Memorandum of Understanding with three major enterprises have been signed by the LI) and selected. A MoU between the EO and TU has been signed with the same objective. The

---

Guild of Directors (EO) has identified five new enterprises, which are interested in introduction of OSH MS.

The social dialogue in OSH has proceeded in a positive spirit, involving Ministry, LI, TU and EO. The collective agreement and MoU between LI, TU and EO is providing an opening for the introduction of OSH MS at selected enterprises. However, the risk of restructuring the government agencies based on a neo-liberal model (Georgia) is emerging, which may even lead to the elimination of the LI.

The Kyrgyz WIND Programme has temporarily been halted, as a major element of the programme was cooperation with the local administration. The local administration has been in turmoil in 2010, but started to stabilise as of early 2011. The work on re-establishment of the WIND network has started in second part of 2011. The WIND manual has been upgraded and new training system for future WIND trainers has been tested during 2 ToTs.

Due to the political instability in the country, the activities on OADI in Kyrgyzstan were suspended in 2010. The new ministerial structure completed in late 2010 did not define the responsible institution/authority on the OADI in the country, the OADI issues need to be raised at the roundtable/workshop to the various Ministry officials and institutions to start national discussion. Follow-up activities will be conducted by another Finnish TC project.

## **Tajikistan**

OSH law was updated in 2009, but has still very many elements of the old system (however, the implementation is not very effective). A law on Inspection services (Gosslushba) and reform was done in 2009, covering labour inspection, employment and social protection

The Tajik partners have set up a working group (including the President's Office) to prepare a national OSH Programme (expected to be ready in 2012).

The functioning of Gosslushba is hampered by the frequent change of Chief Labour Inspectors (CLIs); the long-term Deputy CLI in the end of 2011 was replaced with a competent person from the President's Office. The LI part of the Gosslushba is in need of capacity building and training. The OSH Team has been building OSH training capacity in the Agricultural University and Adult Training Centre, in addition to the constituents, with the long-term aim to raise national resources for OSH MS training.

The partners in Tajikistan have been exposed to extensive capacity building in the form of the creation of an OSH information centre (under LI), adaptation and translation of training material, a series of 8 OSH seminars and consultations coming from OSH colleagues from ILO Moscow and Uzbekistan. This has been followed up by ToT of the FTU, construction trade union and LI. The FTU and LI organised 2 seminars in Dushanbe in end 2011. The focus of training and capacity building has moved to the Khujand region.

The local administration in the Khujand region (an industrialised region) has provided good support for on-going training in 2011. Capacity building is continued, in cooperation with the construction trade union in Khujand; introduction of OSH MS and RA is planned for brick production industry, glass jar factory, construction and other high-risk enterprises. The training planned for end 2011 was postponed to beginning of 2012 due to technical obstacles (financial transfers).

Sharing of experience and cooperation with Uzbekistan has strengthened capacity building. Training manuals (three manuals) and best practice from Uzbekistan has been translated and adapted for Tajikistan. Promotion of modern OSH MS and extensive capacity building will be necessary to change the present practices into more modern practices. The ILO trainer in Uzbekistan is working intensively with the Khujand region.

---

The WIND Programme (honey project) has continued, and plans to expand the activities of the centre towards local economic development have been discussed. Marketing survey of Tavildara region has been conducted with the aim to find possible ways to expand activities and ensure sustainability in the region. The activities of the centre, promoted by the Dekhan farmers Association, have been supported by the project and the Finnish MinFor in a streamlined effort. An article of the centre was published in [Kehitys-Utveckling 4.2010](#). The experience of Tavildara region is going to be multiplied in Yavan.

As part of the balanced social protection approach HIV prevention issues were incorporated into capacity building activities in the country along 2010. In particular OSH linked to HIV became a major focus for TOT held in April 2010. A 2-days national workshop for health care workers with the participation of health specialists from all regions of the country especially targeted questions of occupational safety of medical workers as a vulnerable group in regard to HIV infection. A training session on post-exposure prophylaxis (PEP) in line with the ILO/WHO Guidelines on HIV/AIDS for health care services was arranged to increase capacity of health care workers in Tajikistan to ensure occupational safety at the workplaces.

Sharing of practical experience from Finland through dissemination of info materials and publications provides tangible examples in the discussions and a high visibility of the Finnish Donor.

### **Uzbekistan**

The Uzbek Government has not been actively involved into cooperation with international organisations, the staff, tasks and duties of the MinLab have been decreased in the last years. However, among the social partners and enterprises as a result of the long-term activities of the ILO Moscow OSH Team, a network of highly motivated OSH specialists has been built. The demand for training and capacity building at the enterprise level is increasing, also in relation to the ongoing expansion of international business contacts.

The OSH activities are promoting social dialogue and democratic processes in the field of OSH, which is deemed to have an impact on the democratisation process.

The development of a modern OSH approach is continuing the successful capacity building process aimed at industrial sectors and enterprises using a four step approach to (i) build general OSH capacity in enterprises; (ii) provide informative seminars; (iii) provide instructive seminars; (iv) provide practical assistance to set up OSH management systems (ensuring the introduction of main elements of OSH MS at the enterprise level). Uzbekistan, being the pilot country for integrated OSH-HIV approach, continued to incorporate health aspects of occupational safety into trainings. Updated modular training materials where HIV and health were printed and used by the ILO project coordinator at trainings to build capacity of enterprise-level specialists.

This approach has proved very effective at the selected enterprises and led to increased requests for training and capacity building. In 2011 the OSH coordinator organised 49 seminars with in total 2200 participants. The focus of the training is shifted more and more towards practical hands-on training at enterprises. Two local trainers are participating in the process to provide sustainability.

The successful Uzbek best practice and training materials from Uzbekistan and Finland are adapted and widely used in Tajikistan and the coordinator has provided training support for Tajikistan.

After the first tripartite roundtable on new OADI legislation in Uzbekistan, country-based activities have been temporarily halted due to difficult political climate.

---

## **Turkmenistan**

For the reasons beyond the influence of the project, the project was not able to organise any OSH or OADI-related activities in Turkmenistan.

### **Sub-regional (general developments and impact)**

As a result of the project sub-regional cooperation has been increasing (as a part of the political and economical sub-regional cooperation) among the Labour inspectorates. Two Regional Alliances of Labour Inspectors (RALI) are operating in the region: RALI of South-East Europe, Ukraine and Azerbaijan and RALI of CIS countries and Mongolia. The RALIs are operating under the auspices of the International Association of Labour Inspectors (IALI).

The RALIs address both LI and OSH issues and will be instrumental in organising the events related to the IALI Conference at the end of 2012 in Moscow. The Project has ensured the participation of inspectors from the project target countries in the RALI meetings and training events.

The ILO Moscow OSH web site and the electronic network of OSH specialists is further improving cooperation and sharing of experiences.

### **Best practices**

The Kazakh example, an outcome of long-term cooperation and consultations with ILO Moscow OSH Team, of a national OSH system, includes active promotion of OSH awareness, introduction of OSH MS and training targeting enterprises. Kazakhstan, being a country in the region, serves as a model and as a best practice (local example) for the neighbouring countries.

Uzbekistan has developed a variety of OSH training manuals, adopting the modular approach. The range of manuals spans from OSH MS to risk assessment, labour inspection, HIV/AIDS issues, OSH organisation at enterprises, as well as sectoral OSH issues. These manuals, as well as the four step approach, have been adapted and translated for Tajikistan.

The Finnish manuals, available in Russian, are used in trainings in the region. They have been included in the DVD Biblioteka Bezopasnogo Truda (Safework library).



## II. Outputs obtained versus performance plan

|  | Project Output indicators   | Results   |
|--|---|---|
| <b><u>Immediate objective 1:</u></b><br>The countries will systematically develop and coherently implement national OSH systems, both on national and enterprise level, based on tri-partite cooperation. Model examples of modern preventive systems adapted for each country will serve to upgrade legislation and methodologies for prevention, inspection and self-improvement in a tri-partite context. The countries will consistently integrate HIV/AIDS prevention into national OSH systems development and implementation. |   |   |
| <b><u>Output 1.1</u></b><br><br>Modern OSH systems are developed and implementation started  | 1.1.1 Establish plan of activity and country focus  | Done  |
|  | 1.1.2 National OSH programmes are developed and implementation started  | <u>Kaz:</u> Strategic plan of the MinLab approved – in implementation process<br><br><u>Kyr:</u> General Agreement is ready. Kyr LI “Ten step action plan” and MoU between EO and TU. National Programme is postponed due to political unrest and political restructuring<br><br><u>Taj:</u> WG is set-up. Draft National Programme is ready in mid 2012<br><br><u>Uzb:</u> only concept is ready |
|  | 1.1.3 Selected enterprises start implementing modern OSH management systems providing best practices for prevention in the countries  | Nationwide implementation on-going (Kaz); on-going in three high-risk industrial sectors (Uzbek); LI made agreements with five major enterprises and EO has chosen 5 pilot enterprises in end 2011 (Kyr); enterprises of the construction sector in Khudjant area are involved in the process in end 2011 (Taj)   |
|  | 1.1.4 Capacity building of OSH centres and institutions (trainers, material developers, advisory capacities) is developed   | On-going in all countries.<br><br>Kyr and Tajik OSH centre in connection with LI; Kyr center provides trainings to enterprises. Establishment of a new OSH center in Kaz, organises training activities with FTU. Uzb preparations with universities and 3 trainers from TU and LI  |
|  | 1.1.5 OSH training material (OSH management systems, risk assessment) and course curricula are developed and taken into use for a variety of target groups utilising EU and Finnish manuals | Done and continuing in all countries<br><br>30-40 events in Uzb annually; In Kaz, Kyr, Tajik partners started to implement activities with their own resources (with a support of a project).<br><br>Use of Finnish Risk assessment training material, ILO Mow 3 training modules, EU RA material, KOSHA.   |



|  |  |   |
|--|--|---|
|  |  | Uzbek modules translated and adapted for Tajik. Finnish ELMERI taken into use in three Uzbek industrial sectors.  |
|  | 1.1.6 Labour inspection and OSH specialists are better trained and strengthened in OSH and HIV/AIDS issues | <p>At the country level: training of LI in OSH done by the country itself (Kaz, started in Kyr); ILO and national partners organized trainings (Kyrgyzstan, Tajikistan, Uzbekistan, sub-regional conferences). 2 Regional Allies of Labour inspections created (SE Europe and CIS+Mongolia) to share LI experience.</p> <p>HIV/AIDS mainstreamed in trainings for LI and OSH specialists in Uzb at a regular basis, An agreement has been reached with the Tajik partners to integrate HIV/AIDS into standard training curricula for labour inspectors. HIV/AIDS was part of the agenda of the regional training for LIs, where top LIs from all 4 countries of the project participated.</p> |

NOTE: In this project document, occupational safety and health incorporates HIV/AIDS in the world of work. The preventive aspect of occupational accident and disease insurance is integrated in the OSH training and material.

Training material ready and available, training has started in second part of 2011 and continues into 2012 both in capitals and regions. Due to extreme lack of OSH capacity, the training will be a long process.

|  |   |   |
|--|---|---|
| <b>Output 1.2</b><br><br>Practical technical cooperation projects are providing best practice on self-improvement of living and working conditions | 1.2.1 Safe and ecologically sound work places are supported using vocational training and WIND programmes (multiplying experience from the Tajik honey project) | Tavildara (honey project) experience expanded to Yavan region, jointly with ILO IPEC and anti-trafficking projects. Joint support from ILO and Finnish Ambassador (in 2010).<br><br>Multiplication of the Tavildara experience under consideration in the national investment committee<br><br>In Kyr the success of the WIND programme has led to a new ILO-UNDP project in the framework of the "One UN Fund" |
|  | 1.2.2 The ILO WIND programme is expanded to an integrated approach and tested in selected countries   | S Kaz: WIND programme aimed at farmers and migrant workers; Tajik: broadening the scope from WIND towards local economic development; Kyr: restarted in end 2011 due to the turmoil   |
|  | 1.2.3 The ILO WISE methodology is introduced for small enterprises and trainers   | WISE material available in Russian  |

|  |   |   |
|--|---|---|
|  | trained for national self-reliance  |   |
|  | 1.2.4 The best practice examples achieved are promoted and information disseminated in all Russian speaking countries   | All WIND/rural employment material is compiled by ILO HQ; CIS material disseminated; WIND video (Rus/Eng) produced displaying Kyr and Tajik experience  |
|  | 1.2.5 The above programmes are introduced on the national level aimed for self-sustainability   | Done in Kyr, however, at risk due to political restructuring. Experience of Tavildara supported by Tajik President. WIND included in DWCP in Kaz, Kyr and Tajik   |
|  | 1.2.6. The ILO best practices on introducing HIV/AIDS prevention programmes at workplaces are promoted and dissemination in the project's countries is arranged | The LIs in Kaz, Kyrg, Taj, Uzb received ILO guidelines for LI on HIV/AIDS and world of work in Russian, fact sheets on HIV/AIDS prevention, CDs with ILO best practices and materials. Information on the ILO Recommendation #200 on HIV/AIDS and the World of Work was forwarded to top LIs of Taj, UZB, KYRG and KAZ.; the Uzbek best practices on mainstreaming HIV in OSH programmes were presented to the Tajik Labour Inspection. |

NOTE: The restructuring of the Government agencies in Kyrgyzstan was delaying some activities; the social partners have been supportive.

The lack of OSH capacity and skills was hampering work in Tajik; focus has been placed on the industrialised region of Khujdand.

|  | Project Output indicators   | Results   |
|--|---|---|
| <b>Immediate objective 2:</b> Based on the principle of supporting the improvement of internal security, the Ministry of Labours will create a stable platform of social safety net by developing occupational accident and disease insurance legislation, incorporating the views based on the social consensus, expressed by the social partners and expert organisations. The principles of OADI stipulated in legislation will be implemented through regional OSH centre structures and national/regional social-security related institution structures in the region. |   |   |
| <b>Output 2.1</b><br>OADI legislations confirming the liability of employers with implementable formulation of contribution rates and tariffs defined  | 2.1.1 Clarify country focus based on problem analysis and establish plan of activities on OADI.                                 | Done in all countries in 2009.  |
|  | 2.1.2 The draft OADI laws will be developed by governments and/or parliaments.  | Done in Uzbekistan in 2009. ILO also provided some comments to existing/new OADI legislation in Kaz and Taj in 2009.                              |
|  | 2.1.3 Reporting and registration systems on work injuries and occupational diseases cases as well as HIV/AIDS will be improved. | Capacity building exercise on reporting and registration was provided to Tajik social partners during the Study Tour to Bulgaria on OADI in 2010. |
|  | 2.1.4 Knowledge-transfer and capacity building on OADI will be made to the EOs, TUs and some other stakeholders                 | Done in Uzbekistan in 2009. Comprehensive capacity building on OADI was provided to Tajik   |

|  |  |  |
|--|--|--|
|  | through social dialogue.   | social partners through national seminar on OADI and the Study Tour to Bulgaria on OADI in 2010.   |
|  | 2.1.5 The governments and social partners will fully comprehend the principles of C102 and C121 and facilitate the ratification of these conventions in the countries. | Done in Uzbekistan & Tajikistan in 2009. Analysis of draft OADI law with the provisions of C102 (Part IV) and C121 will be provided in 2011.   |
|  | 2.1.6 Gender-aspect on OADI will be reflected in all stages of interventions including accident and disease protection measures for pregnant women.                    | Informative brochure on OADI to sensitize the gender aspect on OADI was produced in 2010.  |
| <b>Output 2.2</b><br>OADI principles stipulated in the legislation are well implemented at national/regional and enterprise levels | 2.2.1 Tools and effective mechanisms for disseminating OADI at regional and enterprise levels will be developed.   | Informative booklet for the workers to explain the practical procedure of receiving compensation is in process in Kaz. After completing the preparation of booklet, it will be widely disseminated through Kazakh TU network in the country. |
|  | 2.2.2 Media-effective materials to facilitate the implementation of OADI principles will be prepared.  | Visual-effective informative brochure on OADI was prepared in 2010.  |
|  | 2.2.3 Sustainable knowledge-sharing network on OADI within CIS countries to be established.  | Knowledge-sharing network was established among Georgia-Armenia-Tajikistan-Bulgaria through Study Tour in 2010.  |
|  | 2.2.4 Publication on international OADI cases, including HIV/AIDS related issues will be prepared for dissemination purpose.   | Informative brochure was prepared for wider dissemination in 2010. Informative booklet for the workers explaining the procedure of receiving OADI was prepared in Kaz in 2011 for wider dissemination.                                       |

### III. Problems/issues materially impairing the achievement of project objectives/outcomes, proposed solutions and actions taken or to be taken

| <b>A. Implementation</b> (include technical as well as management issues; including administrative, financial and budgetary issues)   |   |
|---|---|
| <b>Problem/Issues</b>   | <b>Proposed solutions and action(s) taken or to be taken</b> (If action necessary, identify person responsible)                               |
| <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Problem related to transfer of funds to project partners</li> </ul>  | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Clarification sought with the Tajik banking system</li> </ul>  |
| <b>B. Stakeholders, partners &amp; implementing agencies</b>  |   |
| <b>Problem/Issues</b>   | <b>Proposed solutions and action(s) taken or to be taken</b> (If action necessary, identify person responsible)                               |
| <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Lack of capacity of OSH specialists in the countries</li> </ul>  | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Continuous awareness raising and capacity building activities on national and local levels</li> </ul>  |
| <b>C. External factors</b> (include particularly those external factors identified as being critical assumptions in the project document and/or emerging critical external factors) |   |
| <b>Problem/Issues</b>   | <b>Proposed solutions and action(s) taken or to be taken</b> (If action necessary, identify person responsible)                               |
| <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Political and social unrest in Kyrgyzstan</li> </ul>   | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Activities continue with various partners. Work continuing directly with technical agencies</li> </ul> |
| <b>D. Other major issues/problems</b>   |   |
| <b>Problem/Issues</b>   | <b>Proposed solutions and action(s) taken or to be taken</b> (If action necessary, identify person responsible)                               |
| <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>No</li> </ul>  | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li></li> </ul>  |

---

## IV. Conclusions, Lessons Learned

Below is a recapitulation of the main issues and results by country:

Kazakhstan: the country is developing the national OSH system and introducing OSH MS at enterprises (included in the National Strategy) with their own resources. The country will continue to request international consultations and advice. The project is using the relatively developed OSH and LI system in Kazakhstan as an example in the region in various regional events (for ex RALI/CIS & Mongolia). Thus, the project has found it cost-effective to provide advice and consultation to further develop this best practice in the region.

Kyrgyzstan: the social partners have agreed to jointly promote OSH MS and the capacity of the LI has been developed according to a coherent plan. This process, although interrupted during the events in summer 2010, has continued in 2011 with the technical partners. The Government, due to the disruptive events and restructuring, has not been able to define its OSH policy (nor DWCP) yet. As the country is in huge need of OSH capacity building and infrastructure development, the project has maintained links on a technical level to keep OSH on the agenda of the Government and the social partners. Further, the LI has been invited to regional event to share best practices between the countries in the region.

Tajikistan: the capacity building of OSH specialists started in 2010 and has given a good response from the local administration, trade unions and employers. This will be continued. Poverty is a major obstacle to make the systems work. However, there is a political will to improve the situation. Thus, the project has identified actors (sectoral trade unions, selected enterprises) to increase the understanding of the link between safe working conditions and productivity by developing model enterprise, where risk assessment is directed towards low cost self-improvement of working conditions. Increased interest and demand for assistance on such a practical approach among all partners can be noticed. The present focus is on OSH capacity building and model enterprises in the industrialised Khudjand region, while the National OSH Programme is being developed in a broad tri-partite working group (thus developing social dialogue in practice). The participation of KOSHA experts in a series of OSH seminars gave a boost to the project activities.

Uzbekistan: the political establishment has a moderate interest in practically oriented interaction with the international community; however, there is high interest in OSH at the enterprises (there is more demand than the project can provide). The social partners and local administration are actively participating in improvement of OSH system development at enterprise level. Over 50 seminars for more than 3,000 participants from high risk sectors (chemical, mining, metallurgy and other) in ten regions of the country have lead to the establishment of OSH committees at enterprises and wide dissemination of knowledge on modern OSH management systems. The modular training manuals developed by the Uzbek experts have been adapted and translated for Tajikistan, as well as OSH system development experience. The use of Finnish OSH and risk assessment training material in Russian language has proved very useful; more publications would be needed in Russian.

### Efficiency of the project

Most of the planned outputs have been delivered on time, with the exception of Turkmenistan, where no action was possible for the reasons outside of the project responsibility, and Kyrgyzstan where the project experienced significant delays, but nevertheless managed to bring activities back on track by the end of 2011.

The overall project efficiency is high. With modest resources split among four countries and sub-regional-level activities, the project managed to deliver a significant number of outputs and produce systemic changes. Project events were organized at low-cost to the project thanks to strong

---

involvement of partners, who contributed their own resources (in-kind contributions, venues at no cost to the project, professional expertise and time).

## **Effectiveness of the project**

The long term presence of the ILO Moscow, supported with the combined resources from several donor funded projects and complemented with the flexibility of the project covering several countries, has contributed to making the Finnish funded OSH in Central Asia project very effective.

The long term effects of the project are numerous: according to the feedback provided by the constituents during the project team missions, the project produced a long-lasting impact by contributing to Regional Alliances (RALIs) creation.

With regards to the integration of the HIV/AIDS component into the national systems, the most important outcome relates to the fact that the project has laid solid grounds for regular work of the national constituents on this issue and partners' commitment has been ensured. The process is going on in the right direction and there are reasons to expect that the process will lead to the sought results in a mid-term perspective.

Effectiveness analysis by immediate objectives:

- 1) **Objective one:** The countries will systematically develop and coherently implement national OSH systems, both on national and enterprise level, based on tri-partite cooperation. Model examples of modern preventive systems adapted for each country will serve to upgrade legislation and methodologies for prevention, inspection and self-improvement in a tri-partite context. The countries will consistently integrate HIV/AIDS prevention into national OSH systems development and implementation.
- Building a National OSH system is a long term process, which is comprised of several steps/elements. With the help of the project the national constituents started to introduce some of those elements, including risk assessment concept, risk management concept, general awareness on OSH, and modernization of legislation. OSH systems have been systematically improved based on the legacy of the USSR. Four countries have upgraded their OSH systems, based on the ILO standards and modern approaches and introduced new elements into their existing systems. Of particular note, Kazakh government issued an Ordinance on the promotion of OSH management systems at enterprises (2011) in line with GOST (in line with ILO OSH 2001). This improvement of legislation in Kazakhstan serves as an example to be followed by other countries.
- These policy changes have been supported with new developments at enterprise level in all the four countries, where new management systems are being tested in practice.
- Significant progress has been achieved in Uzbekistan, where an ever growing number of enterprises (38 enterprises in 2011) are adopting their own OSH management systems in line with the ILO standards.
- In Kyrgyzstan the Labour Inspection took a lead in providing consultations to employers' organizations on how to introduce new systems and approaches. Risk assessment trainings for enterprises are being conducted by the Labour Inspection with their own resources on a regular basis. The Employers organizations are highly interested in receiving technical assistance and signed a MOU with the LI and TUs to start introducing



---

OSH MS at big enterprises. As a proof of the national buy-in and ownership, on 3-4 July 2012, together with the ILO the employers (Guild of Directors) are co-sponsoring a conference, where pilot enterprises will be chosen to serve as an example at the national level.

- In Tajikistan the basis for further progress has been laid down with the project's help. Partners in Tajikistan are yet at the preparatory (training) stage, where orientation trainings are being conducted by the TUs and LI at the enterprises.
  - In Kyrgyzstan, in addition to the promotion of standards and OSH MS, impressive achievements have been reached in Work Improvement for Neighbourhood Development (WIND) programme, which covered 460 ail okmotu (municipal units), with over 35 persons trained in each of the units. According to the chairperson of the Agro industrial TU, the programme brought significant improvements in the lives of people in the villages, exemplified by a decrease in the level of brucellosis, occupational accident rates, more safe practices in manipulating dangerous items and use of agrochemicals, which have been noted almost in all locations. Interest to OSH issues raised significantly. Each okmotu has now a responsible focal point on OSH and veterinary appointed after the training (effect of the ILO work). In the Ministry of Agriculture a new department responsible for OSH & WIND in agriculture was created on the eve of 2010, but this achievement has been unfortunately overthrown by the revolution of spring 2010.
  - Skills and experiences from Kyrgyzstan were successfully disseminated in Tajikistan, where WIND programme attracted the attention and support of the Embassy of Finland. One of the most successful projects generated by the programme – honey project in Tavildara region– is being replicated to other regions of the country, including Yavan region. As an illustration, the Honey Festival organized by farmers in 2011 was supported by President of Tajikistan.
- 2) **Objective two:** Based on the principle of supporting the improvement of internal security, the Ministries of Labour will create a stable platform of social safety net by developing occupational accident and disease insurance legislation, incorporating the views based on the social consensus, expressed by the social partners and expert organizations. The principles of OADI stipulated in legislation will be implemented through regional OSH centre structures and national/regional social-security related institution structures in the region.
- Progress achieved on OADI legislation has been uneven. The capacity building activities and technical comments on the existing and new OADI legislation in Kazakhstan and Tajikistan have helped the countries to improve their legislative frameworks. Technical support provided to Uzbekistan has been offset by the lack of the interest from the government side to make changes in policies and normative frameworks. Since the launch of the project in 2009, the situation has changed and the ILO hasn't been able to promote policy-level intervention on OADI in Uzbekistan. If there is an interest from the Ministry of Labour and relevant authorities, the ILO would be open for dialogue and cooperation to facilitate the implementation of new OADI legislation.



---

## Lessons learned

1. The inclusion of four countries in the project has proved beneficial: it provides space to work in the country, where the environment is most conducive, especially when social unrest is hampering work in specific countries. Secondly, it enables work on different levels of development, thus providing best practices and examples for other countries in the region.
2. The project activities are supported by other DWT/CO Moscow projects using an integrated approach to enhance employment, working conditions and social security (the Finnish funded Decent Work project). The Finnish funded “OSH in CA” project is providing several good integrated pilot projects and a good base for exchange of experience and promotion of local best practices. The Korean funded OSH project is providing Russian language OSH guidelines and audiovisual material. The integration of several donor funded OSH projects and ILO Moscow’s continuous presence provides the base for effective and targeted OSH activities and long term sustainability in the form of consultations and advice.

## Sustainability assessment:

Building sustainability and a stable national resource base in OSH in the impoverished target countries is a long-term process, for which the long-term approach of the Finnish projects has been well suited. The OSH system and labour inspection in Kazakhstan is already sustained by the country itself (and it can provide an example for the region). A critical mass of enterprises have started to introduce OSH MS and OSH specialists have been trained to provide the necessary base, when the political level is ready to introduce a modern legislation with a preventive approach.

The capacity building need to be continued in Tajikistan, although encouraging signs of political will and capacity can be seen. The disruptive events, continuous changes of personnel and some neo-liberal trends in Kyrgyzstan will require massive inputs in OSH promotion and capacity building, although a small core has been developed.

Due to the practical approach of the OSH project, targeting national experts in the capacity building and providing space for a dialogue between all three social partners, there is a strong national ownership in all four countries.

The development of national OSH systems and the introduction of modern OSH MS at enterprises are long term priorities, expressed by the constituents in the DWCPs. The positive approach to workers’ protection from the Soviet time, which was suppressed during the worst moments of the transition period, is returning to most of the countries, which makes the OSH project more and more relevant.

The sustainability of the results of the project is strengthened by the functioning network of OSH specialists in all the countries, who are connected with each other personally and institutionally. These connections are being maintained and nurtured through RALIs, electronic list-serves, online exchange of materials, and the CIS network of OSH centers coordinated by the ILO HQ SAFEWORK. The adoption of Interstate GOST (an inter-state technical standard, which creates the basis of OSH systems creation) by four project countries (Kazakhstan, Kyrgyzstan, Tajikistan, Uzbekistan) is another contributing factor. This GOST serves as guidance for the countries governments, social partners and other non-governmental actors.

And finally the established knowledge base including the OSH library which is available online (Safework library) provides the specialists with regular updates of materials, guidelines, manuals translated into Russian and adapted to the local context.