



International Programme on the Elimination of Child Labour (IPEC)



International
Labour
Office

IPEC Evaluation

**“Combating child labour through
education and training, Phase II.”,
and
“Support to the Time-Bound
Programme on the elimination of the
worst forms of child labour in
Pakistan”**

**PAK/02/03/SDC PAK/04/01/DAN -
P.270.06.342.003 - P.270.06.342.004**

**An independent joint final evaluation of linked projects by a
team of external consultants**

May 2008

This document has not been professionally edited.

NOTE ON THE EVALUATION PROCESS AND REPORT

This independent evaluation was managed by ILO-IPEC's Design, Evaluation and Documentation Section (DED) following a consultative and participatory approach. DED has ensured that all major stakeholders were consulted and informed throughout the evaluation and that the evaluation was carried out to highest degree of credibility and independence and in line with established evaluation standards.

The evaluation was carried out a team of external consultants¹. The field mission took place in May 2008. The opinions and recommendations included in this report are those of the authors and as such serve as an important contribution to learning and planning without necessarily constituting the perspective of the ILO or any other organization involved in the project.

Funding for this project evaluation was provided by the Swiss and Danish Governments. This report does not necessarily reflect the views or policies of the SDC, nor DANIDA, nor does mention of trade names, commercial products, or organizations imply endorsement by any Government.

¹ **Nina Louise Frankel and Fawad Usman Khan**

TABLE OF CONTENTS

List of Abbreviations	iv
<i>Executive Summary</i>	v
<i>1. Introduction</i>	9
<i>2. Project Description</i>	10
<i>3. Evaluation Purpose and Methodology</i>	14
<i>4. Findings</i>	15
4.1 Project Design	15
4.2 Relevance.....	17
4.3 Implementation.....	18
4.4 Effectiveness.....	22
4.5 Sustainability and Replicability.....	25
4.6 Potential Partnerships	28
4.7 Special Concerns, External Factors, Causality.....	29
<i>5. Conclusions</i>	29
<i>6. Recommendations</i>	30
<i>7. Good Practices</i>	33
<i>8. Lessons Learned</i>	34
Annex 1 Specific Recommendations for SDC and DANIDA Future Programming	35
Annex 2- Draft National Education Policy 2008 Proposed Policy Actions Specific to Child Labour.....	36
Annex 3 – Evaluation Schedule	37
Annex 4 – List of Contacts and Meetings	41
Annex 5 – Targeted Outputs vs Achievements (SDC Component)	46
Annex 6--Targeted Outputs vs Achievements (DANIDA Component)	47
Annex 7- SDC Action Programmes	48
Annex 8 - DANIDA Action Programmes	49
Annex 9 - SDC Aide Memoire	51
Annex 10 - SDC DAC Evaluation Abstract	60
Annex 11 - Independent Evaluation Terms of Reference	63

LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

AP	Action Program
APMC	Action Program Management Committee
APSO	Action Programme Summary Outline
CCB	Citizens' Community Board
CLC	Child Labour Cell at DICL
CLSTA	Child Labour Skill Training Academies
CCL	Combating Child Labour
CRC	Convention on the Rights of the Child.
DANIDA	Danish International Development Agency
DICL	Directorate of Industries, Commerce and Labour
DLG	De Laas Gul Welfare Society
DSL	Directorate of Schools and Literacy
DMTE	Directorate of Technical Education and Manpower Training
EFA	Education for All
FATA	Federally Administered Tribal Areas
I/O	Immediate Objective
ILO	International Labour Organisation (Geneva)
IPEC	International Programme on the Elimination of Child Labour
IP	Implementing Partner
JCDS	Jobs Creating Development Society
MPC	Multipurpose Centre
NTBP	National Time Bound Program
NFE	Non-formal Education
NGO	Non Government Organisation
NWFP	North Western Frontier Provinces
OSH	Occupational Safety and Health
PCISIR	Pakistan Council of Scientific & Industrial Research
PILER	Pakistan Institute of Labour Education and Research
PITE	Provincial Institute of Teachers' Education
PPA	Pakistan Paediatric Association
PRSP	Poverty Reduction Strategy Paper
Paradise	Paradise Environmental Welfare Society
RC	Rehabilitation Centres
RCMC	Rehabilitation Centre Management Committees
SCREAM	Supporting Children's Rights through Education, Arts, and Media
SDC	Swiss Development Cooperation - Swiss Agency for Development and Cooperation
SPARC	Society for the Protection of the Rights of the Child
TPA	Teacher Parents Association
UNICEF	United Nation International Children and Education Fund
WERWS	Workers Education & Research Welfare Society
WFCL	Worst Forms of Child Labour

Executive Summary

Background and Context

A joint final independent evaluation of the Swiss Development Cooperation (SDC)- supported ILO-IPEC Combating Child Labour through Education and Training Project (CCLET) and Danish International Development Agency (DANIDA)-funded ILO-IPEC Project of Support to the National Time Bound Programme in Pakistan's Northwest Frontier Province was conducted in April 2008. The projects fall under the broader framework of the ILO-IPEC support to a national Timebound Programme in Pakistan to eliminate the Worst Forms of Child Labour.

According to a 1996 Labour Force Survey, an estimated 3.3 million children in Pakistan are classified as child labourers, an unspecified number of whom work in the worst forms of child labour. At the time of the survey, about a third of the total working children in Pakistan were concentrated in the Northwest Frontier Province (NWFP). The current magnitude of child labour in NWFP is likely to be much higher because the numbers do not reflect children in the tribal areas, nor Afghan refugees. Children, especially girls, face formidable challenges in accessing education and skills training, thereby leaving them vulnerable to exploitation.

The SDC funding and implementation cycle comprised three phases. Phase I initiated in 1998, with project activities in two districts of NWFP, and was evaluated in 2001; In Phase II, which started in 2003 and was evaluated in 2006, the project was extended to additional districts. Phase III started in 2007 and will finish at the end of 2008. Replicating on the infrastructure of the SDC project, the DANIDA-funded Project of Support to the National Time Bound Programme began in 2004 for an eighteen month period, and was subsequently extended through April 2008. Like the SDC project, its multi-pronged approach comprised provision of non formal education, skills training, awareness raising, and support to institutional development and policy action. Both projects marshal a cross sectoral alliance of government and non-government partners.

The Immediate Objectives of the two projects are similar and can be summarized as:

1. Better understanding of the child labour problem developed in the project area among rights holders and duty bearers and strengthened capacity of policy makers, law enforcement agencies, trade unions, associations and employers organizations to implement child labour laws and exchange information on child labour laws.
2. Mechanisms for provision of quality education to working children and their siblings made functional and institutionalized and school environments improved to increase retention rates.
3. Meaningful alternatives provided to children and their families though skills development avenues improved, institutionalized and integrated into the technical training system.

At the time of the evaluation, the projects' strategies were predicated on three main Sub-Programmes implemented through partners: 1) Strengthening of Policy and Institutional Development, 2) Promoting Social Mobilization and Strengthening the Enabling Environment, and 3) Provision of Social Services.

The evaluation encompassed the SDC project (May 2007-December 2008) and the DANIDA project (2004-2008). The evaluation methodology included briefings before and after with SDC and ILO, document review, field visits and interviews and focus group discussions with stakeholders and beneficiaries. Due to security constraints, the evaluation team was not able to visit any DANIDA-supported project sites, and the project was covered through a desk review and partner meetings. On the ground, the implementing agencies operate as a common partnership with shared goals.

Summary of Findings

Design

Both projects propose a logical matrix of outputs to achieve stated objectives and take into account gender and cultural challenges. The DANIDA project was introduced to complement and build on the infrastructure of the SDC project thereby enabling the interventions to be rolled out to additional districts. The successful replication of the DANIDA project affirms that the basic project design was sound and applicable to different parts of the province despite the conservative social environment and poor infrastructure of the new project districts. The projects bring together a broad constituency of partners and capitalize on their respective strengths, but fall short in institutionalizing their interventions. Both project designs overlook the crucial link between large family size and child labour. The log frames are not entirely consistent with the project documents in terms of outputs and activities described. The sheer number of indicators for the SDC project is cumbersome and there is a lack of baseline data for measuring impact.

Relevance

Both projects are highly relevant in dovetailing with the strategic direction of the ILO-IPEC framework of support to the national Time Bound Programme and in supporting national and provincial strategies and action plans to combat child labour and improve access to education. They bring together a broad constituency, thereby, providing leadership in addressing child labour as a cross cutting problem and are in harmony with ILO's commitment to Decent Work for All.

Implementation

Both projects have made good use of capitalizing on the comparative advantage of the different partners involved and sequencing activities logically. They have been able to maintain a forward momentum and work within the budget, although the truncated time period for SDC's Phase III may preclude full achievement of all output targets especially with respect to Institutionalization and Policy Development. The strong community ties and commitment they have engendered have helped weather external security and political challenges. The inclusion of Afghan children in target groups stands as testimony to its commitment to non-discrimination. The relationships the project partnership has cultivated with provincial authorities portends well for future capacity building interventions. The database developed is a valuable management and planning tool. Coordination is strong at the field level and communication smooth between the project partnership and the IPEC Office in Islamabad.

Effectiveness

The projects' awareness activities have been highly effective in enhancing understanding of child labour across the board. They are helping women have a greater say in their children's future and be more empowered over their own lives. The project's NFE and skills training models have served to inform policy makers. The concept of afternoon schools and skills training for younger ages now feature in the new Draft Education Policy. The major responsibility for preventing child labour still remains with parents, as the macro level interventions have yet to be institutionalized.

Sustainability

The projects have created a rich legacy including opening educational opportunities to working children, marshalling broad-based constituencies at different levels, and indirectly influencing policy makers to take action against child labour. Notwithstanding a high degree of government partner enthusiasm for the project's outputs and achievements, substantive steps have yet to be taken to ensure that the momentum will continue once the project cycle ends.

Overall Conclusions

Policy and Institutional Development

Government entities and policy frameworks are gradually taking child labour into consideration in planning and policy (afternoon schools, teachers training on Child Labour, IPEC's curriculum on Supporting Children's Rights through Education, Arts and Media (SCREAM), and Child Labour needs factored into new education and skills training policies).

Promoting Social Mobilization and Strengthening the Enabling Environment

By developing innovative, replicable and culturally-sensitive models, the project has made great headway in fostering a greater awareness of child labour and other occupational safety and social welfare issues at different levels. It has significantly improved the knowledgebase on child labour in the NWFP and enhanced the capacity of duty bearers at all levels.

Provision of Social Services

The project has been for the most part successful in reaching targets to divert children from child labour by enrolling them in non-formal education and offering them formal education and skills training alternatives. It has been successful in bridging gender gaps arising from the infrastructural and cultural constraints compromising girls' access to schooling.

Recommendations

Strengthening of Policy & Institutional Development (incl. Capacity Building of Partners)

Continue efforts to strengthen the capacity of the Provincial Child Labour Cell to coordinate partners working on child labour and child protection, and to mobilize resources for greater government ownership and scaling up of project models. Continue to advocate at the national level to incorporate action on child labour into poverty reduction and education plans.

Institutionalization of Project Interventions

Standardize NFE syllabus/ training program developed by PITE. Advocate with the Directorate of Industries, Commerce and Labour (DICL) to make child-specific skills training programs a part of regular training offered by their institutes in the province. Support provincial consultations and a participatory review of curricula for adaptation of the Teachers Information Kit and SCREAM training into Pre-Service teacher training.

Promoting Social Mobilization and Strengthening the Enabling Environment

Motivational strategies should be built into all training for teachers to ensure that the participants actually implement their learning and that those tasked additionally with social mobilization are better equipped to deal with family resistance and traditional values.

Provision of Social Services

Services to students enrolled in government NFE activities should be expanded. Quality of government afternoon schools should be improved and advocacy for their adoption by the Department of Schools and Literacy be carried out. Future initiatives addressing child rights should include linkages with health and family planning awareness and services. Explore opportunities for expanding on UNICEF-ILO collaboration such that child labour can benefit from child protection services through ensuring that children in protective custody and their custodians are made more aware of child labour issues and provided with access to non-formal education.

Enhancing the Knowledge Base

A baseline study should be conducted prior to the project inception. Conduct an impact study to follow up on government teachers training. Ensure that all future training workshops include a standardized means for pre, post and follow up assessment to measure impact. Document the working models that the project has put in place in a manual for marketing to government and non-government agencies.

Good Practices

- Adaptation of the Teacher Training Information Kit and SCREAM in collaboration with government partners and involving them in the training has created a strong sense of ownership.
- Extending pre-vocational and vocational training to working children and mothers to provide income alternatives to child labour, has served to create role models
- Using common curriculum, teaching materials and information systems by various implementing partners both facilitates quality control and potential for mainstreaming and scale up.
- The strategy to start afternoon classes in government schools is a proactive measure to demonstrate that NFE can be successfully implemented in the government environment.

Lessons Learned

- Future initiatives must recognize the long term investment required to build institutional capacity.
- Involving local stakeholders and government departments in the development of project materials and strategies imbues ownership.
- The key to developing interdependency between government departments, NGOs and social partners is selecting the right partners and creating an environment of trust among them.
- Sustainability mechanisms and exit strategies need to be better spelled out in project and programme designs.
- Monitoring mechanisms should be factored into training inputs.
- Impact measurements are difficult to report on in the absence of baseline studies and sufficient data on child labour.

1. Introduction

A final independent evaluation of the joint SDC-DANIDA supported ILO-IPEC Combating Child Labour Through Education and Training Project (CCLET) and Combating Child Labour Through Education and Training ILO-IPEC Project of Support to the National Time Bound Programme in NWFP in Pakistan was conducted in April 2008.

Child Labour in Pakistan

Child labour is defined as “work that is done by children which restricts or damages their physical, emotional, intellectual, social or spiritual growth as children, and which denies them their basic human rights as enshrined in the United Nations Convention on the Rights of the Child to fully develop, to play or go to school”.² It is a problem of epidemic proportion in Pakistan with many children engaged in the Worst Forms of Child Labour³. The labour pool is almost inexhaustible owing to the country’s high population growth rate, growing poverty and an education system that can accommodate only about a half of school age children. Pakistan is one of the world’s most populous countries, with an estimated population of 161 million growing at an annual rate of 2.3 %. About 34% of the population lives below the poverty line. The overall literacy rate is 49% (62% males, females 35%).

The only government survey to date on child workers conducted in 1996, found more than 3.3 million children working on full time basis. A major portion of child labour, about 2.1 million, was found in the 10–14 year age group. Each year many children enter the labour force, where they compete with adults—often even with their parents—for what little work is available. In many parts of the country, the surplus of cheap child labour has depressed the already inadequate adult wage to the point where a parent and child together now earn less than the parent alone used to be able to earn. The data on child labour overlook those children working in family and small businesses that are not registered with the government, and girls who are confined to labour at home.

In addition to poverty, the country’s cultural context and mindset play a significant role in driving child labour. Traditionally, children in Pakistan are expected not only to honour and obey their parents, but also to assist them financially. Work is often regarded as part of a child’s normal socialization even if exploitative conditions exist. Child labour is thus accepted as part of the landscape, thereby making the problem largely invisible. That work is often seen at the best form of education is another cultural factor that propels children into the labour market and deprives them of their basic human right to education. Gender discrimination and the low value placed on girl children and women figure among the most powerful forces contributing to child labour in Pakistan. Girls are subjected to domestic chores from an early age, their mobility is restricted and the males of the families, including younger brothers have decision making power over their lives. As a result, they are especially vulnerable to child labour and other exploitation, including sexual abuse.

² ILO Convention 182 Worst Forms of Child Labour Convention, 1999

³ Defined as all forms of slavery or practices similar to slavery, use, procuring or offering a child for prostitution, hazardous work that exposes them to physical, psychological or sexual abuse, work underground, at dangerous heights or in confined spaces; work with dangerous machinery or tools or that includes heavy loads; work in unhealthy environments that may expose children to hazardous substances, temperatures, noise or vibrations, and work under particularly difficult conditions such as long hours, during the night or where a child is confined to the premises of the employer (which could be construed to include girls confinement at home), and any work, which by its nature or the circumstances in which it is carried out, is likely to harm the health, safety or morals of children

⁴ This study was conducted with the support of the Statistical Information and Monitoring Programme on Child Labour (SIMPOC), which is the statistical arm of IPEC. SIMPOC assists countries in the collection, documentation, processing and analysis of data relevant to child labour. A SIMPOC-supported study Labour Market Survey is currently being planned in Pakistan and will be implemented 2009, with results expected for 2010.

Low levels of literacy and lack or restricted access to education often leave children with little choice than to look for work at an early age. Young boys may be found working in such sectors as automobile workshops and in brick kilns. Young girls typically work in households, in domestic servitude, or agriculture work and their work is largely hidden and discounted, if valued at all. The inadequacies of the education system, including weak infrastructure, poor teaching quality, lack of qualified teachers, teacher absenteeism, harsh attitudes in the classroom including corporal punishment and lack of learning materials discourage children from attending school and parents from sending them. Without education, working children are less likely to grow up into productive adults, and their children are more likely to fall victim to child labour. Thus the unfortunate dynamic between poverty and child labour is perpetuated. Increasing children's access to education and skills training and improving the quality of education helps to break this vicious cycle and give children a better chance at childhood.

International Labour Standards and Child Labour in Pakistan

Since its independence in 1947, Pakistan has been a Member State of the ILO and has participated in ILO's International Programme for the Elimination of Child Labour since 1994. It has ratified six of ILO's core conventions that have bearing on Child Labour:

- C29 Forced Labour Convention, 1930 (1957)
- C105 Abolition of Forced Labour Convention, 1951 (1960)
- C87 Freedom of Association and Protection of the Right to Organize Convention, 1948
- C98 Right to Organize and Collective Bargain Convention, 1949
- C111 Discrimination (Employment and Occupation) Convention, 1958
- C182 Worst Forms of Child Labour Convention, 1999 (2001)
- C138 Minimum Age Convention, 1973 (2006)

In 1998, the Government of Pakistan, with the technical support of ILO, constituted a Task Force on Child Labour with the mandate to formulate policies and strategies for the elimination of child and bonded labour in Pakistan. The National Policy and Plan of Action (NPPA), promulgated in May 2000, calls for progressive elimination of child labour, immediate eradication of the Worst Forms of Child Labour, a monitoring system to implement the NPPA, and prevention of child labour by offering educational alternatives and ensuring primary education and skill training to children at risk of child labour. Following ratification of ILO Convention 182 in 2001, and its accompanying Recommendation 190 that calls for "effective and time bound measures to remove children from the Worst Forms of Child Labour, the Government of Pakistan requested ILO technical assistance to fulfil its commitment through a National Time Bound Programme (TBP). The main thrust of the TBP is to withdraw children from labour by improving access to education and creating a more enabling environment for policy action and social mobilization to reduce child labour.

2. Project Description

Combating Child Labour Through Education and Training and Combating Child Labour through Education and Training Project of Support to the National Time Bound Programme in NWFP are a joint SDC-DANIDA supported initiative executed with the technical support of the ILO's International Programme on the Elimination of Child Labour (IPEC). They contribute to the elimination of the Worst Forms of Labour in Pakistan, within the broader framework of the ILO-IPEC Project of Support to the Time Bound Programme in Pakistan and human rights based approach. Both projects operate in the same province of Pakistan with similar management structures and goals. They aim to gradually eliminate child labour practices in Pakistan's Northwest Frontier Province (NWFP) in line with internationally agreed standards

through strengthening the capacity of government entities, civil society and trade unions to combat child labour in four districts of NWFP and providing direct services, principally better access to education and skills training to children at risk and their family members, using non-formal education as an entry point. In applying a Human Rights Based Approach, the projects embrace a focus on changing the perception and attitudes of duty bearers towards child labour and strengthening their capacity to play a role in ratifying and implementing ILO child labour conventions.

The Immediate Objectives of the two projects are similar and can be summarized as:

1. The provincial government (Labour Department) capacitated to formulate, implement and coordinate Child Labour interventions.
2. Better understanding of the child labour problem developed in the project area among rights holders and duty bearers and strengthened capacity of policy makers, law enforcement agencies, trade unions, associations and employers organizations to implement child labour laws and exchange information on child labour laws.
3. Mechanisms for provision of quality education to working children and their siblings made functional and institutionalized and school environments improved to increase retention rates.
4. Skill enhancement avenues for working children (12~18 yrs) improved, institutionalized and integrated into technical training system.
5. Working conditions of the target group improved by protecting them from occupational accidents and diseases.

CCLET PROJECT DURATION AND BUDGET (\$US)					
SDC			DANIDA		
Phase I	Sept 1998-Dec 2002	\$769,237	Phase I	April 2005-May 2008	\$1,313,403
Phase II	Jan 2003-Dec 2006	\$2,160,829			
Phase III	Jan 2007-Dec 2008	\$1,533,743			
Districts served: Peshawar, Nowshera, Mardan & Charsadda			Districts Served: Swat, Lower Dir		

The SDC funding and implementation cycle of the project comprised three phases. Phase I initiated in September 1999 and was evaluated in 2001; Phase II started in 2003, and was evaluated in 2006. In 2004, building on the SDC experience, the project was scaled up and extended to additional districts with support from DANIDA to implement the Combating Child Labour Through Education and Training, ILO-IPEC Project of Support to the National Time Bound Programme in NWFP.

International inputs

The projects are funded by the Swiss Agency for Development and Cooperation (SDC) and DANIDA with a total budget of \$US 5, 799, 212 over the period September 1999-December 2008 and executed through ILO's International Programme on the Elimination of Child Labour, under broader framework of support to the National Timebound Programme to Reduce the Worst Forms of Child Labour in Pakistan

National Inputs

NGO and government implementing partners provide human resources and facilities to the two projects, with in kind contributions amounting to about 10 percent of donor support.

Project Components

Initially, the projects focused on Social Mobilization and Provision of Social Services. At the time of the final evaluation, the combined project comprised of three sub-programmes. The Policy and Institutional Development Sub Programme was added to the SDC Phase III, in response to the recommendations of the second evaluation of the SDC project and to the 2007 revision of the DANIDA project.

1. **Strengthening of Policy and Institutional Development** through capacity strengthening of the Child Labour Unit, production of the Unit's annual operational plan, strengthening child labour monitoring mechanisms, and capacity development at the district, *tehsil* and union council levels;
2. **Promoting Social Mobilization and Strengthening the Enabling Environment** by mobilising teachers, parent-teachers associations, youth, policy makers, law enforcement agencies, trade unions, associations and employers' organisations to combat child labour, and creating an acceptable working environment through occupational safety and health related to progressive withdrawal strategy and by expanding the knowledge base on child labour;
3. **Provision of Social Services** through Multi Purpose Centres established by NGOs to provide non-formal education and counselling to working children and siblings, operationalization of afternoon classes for working children in formal educational institutions, development and implementation of teachers' training programmes for non-formal schools, empowerment of communities, counselling services, developing and institutionalizing a skills training approach, creating alternatives for families and introduction of an apprenticeship scheme.

Both projects target as direct beneficiaries relevant government institutions, worker and employer organizations, parents, teachers and community members (duty bearers) and working children and their siblings (rights holders) aged 6-16 vulnerable to hazardous work.

Management and Coordination

At the national level, the projects operate within the broader framework of the ILO-IPEC Time Bound Programme to Eliminate the Worst Forms of Labour. In theory, it reports to the National Steering Committee (NSC), which is responsible for coordinating and monitoring the TBP in accordance with established guidelines and conventions. In practice, however, the NSC has not met in the last five years.

At the Provincial Level, a Project Advisory Committee coordinates the projects. The Chairperson is the Secretary to the Government of NWFP, Department of Commerce, Industries and Labour or his designate, with membership drawn from the government and non-government implementing partners and workers organizations.

Partnership

Provincial Government (Both DANIDA and SDC)

- Child Labour Unit in the Directorate of Labour and Manpower;
- Directorate of Schools and Literacy, Directorate of Industries, Commerce and Labour
- Directorate of Technical Education & Manpower Training
- Provincial Institute of Teachers' Education
- Provincial department of the Pakistan Council of Scientific & Industrial Research
- Provincial Education Department and Provincial Labour Department

Phase I through Phase III NGO partners

- Pakistan Paediatric Association (PPA),
- De Laas Gul Welfare (DLG),
- Jobs Creating Development Society (JCDS); (DANIDA-supported from 2004)
- Paradise Environmental Welfare Society (PEWS). (DANIDA-supported from 2004)

Partners added in Phase III

- Workers Education Research Welfare Society
- Brick Kiln Owners Association

SDC and DANIDA share the cost of the office facilities and equipment, including vehicles; the bulk of staff salaries are covered by SDC. All project staff are national and based in Peshawar. On the ground, the implementing agencies, most of which are the same under both projects, do not make a distinction as to their funding source, and operate as a common partnership with shared goals.⁵

Socio-economic and cultural context

The North West Frontier Province (NWFP) has a population of 18 million (Census 1998), representing 13.4% of the national population. It has a very low industrial base, and a predominantly rural economy. Only 7.2 percent industrial units of the country are located in the NWFP, employing 8.2 percent of the total labour force.⁶

Socio-economic indicators for NWFP lag far behind the rest of the country. Literacy disparities are considerable between urban and rural areas (38% to 13%) and between men and women (51.4% to 18.8%). School enrolment rates for girls are rising faster than for boys, but at 58% for boys and 41% for girls at the primary level and 68% and 31% respectively at the secondary level, the disparities are still significant.⁷ Although NWFP has a Compulsory Education Act on the books that applies up to grade five, the Act is not enforced. Moreover, the inadequate school infrastructure, low level of professional teaching skills, overloaded curricula and poor teaching material impede effective learning and lead to high repeat and drop out rates and low educational achievement. The economic constraints, inadequate education system and the lack of employment opportunities in the NWFP contribute to large-scale incidence of child labour in the province. It is difficult to quantify or monitor the magnitude because the bulk of it is in the informal sector including home confinement for girls.

Following 9/11, a new influx of Afghan refugees further pressurized the labour market. Inadequate funding for Afghan refugees resulted in the closure of primary schools and basic health units serving them. Many of the Afghan refugees who were repatriated in 2003 returned to the NWFP due to lack of facilities, employment opportunities and the civil war in their home country, but without UNHCR refugee status. With reduced access to education, they face increasing risk of child labour, including its worst forms.

According to now outdated government figures, 1, 058 million children in NWFP⁸ are classified as child labourers, which constitutes almost a third of the child labour in Pakistan. These figures do not include the FATA region, five Frontier Regions, Malakand Division and the Afghan refugees. Human rights groups claim the number to be considerably higher than government figures bely, and more recent Labour Force surveys substantiate this. The numbers are likely increasing due to high inflation and rising unemployment and cost of living, low market value of education, and market forces contributing to growing poverty. The principal

⁵ In the first SDC phase, JCDS and Paradise were the NGO implementing partners; they were subsequently shifted to the DANIDA-supported project and PPA and DLG continued under the SDC project.

⁶ NWFP Economic Report-GoNWFP/World Bank 2005

⁷ NWFP Department of Schools and Literacy Annual Statistical Report 2006-07

⁸ 1996 Labour Force Survey

formal industries employing child labour in NWFP are automobile workshops (a high demand industry due to large scale international relief and development programmes in the area as well as cross border commerce) and brick kilns. The majority of working children are employed informally in family businesses, agriculture, and in the case of girls, at home. At the time of the Labour survey, 66.8 percent of the employed child work force was illiterate, with predictably higher rates among girls than boys. As a result of prevailing traditional values, reinforced from 2002-2007 by a conservative provincial government, girls in NWFP have much more limited access than boys to education and skills training. A promising development is that the recently installed Provincial Government in NWFP is more open-minded about girls' schooling than its predecessor.

3. Evaluation Purpose and Methodology

The purpose of the evaluation was to evaluate both the SDC and DANIDA supported components, with a focus on their achievements and contribution to national and provincial efforts to achieve the elimination of WFCL especially within the context of the national TBP framework. The evaluation looked at the projects as a whole.

The scope of the evaluation included all SDC and DANIDA project activities to date including Action Programmes (APs) and considered project design, relevance, effectiveness, lessons learned, Good Practices and recommendations. For the SDC project, the primary focus was on Phase III as the previous phases had already been evaluated. For both projects, the evaluation focused on the extent to which they were able to achieve their intended objectives and how the lessons learned and potential good practices could inform future SDC, DANIDA and ILO programming. The timing of the evaluation which coincided with the end of the DANIDA project was before the SDC project had implemented all the prescribed activities for Phase III.

The evaluation team consisted of one international and one national consultant with an even gender balance. The methodology included document review, discussions with ILO-IPEC management in Islamabad, project staff in Peshawar, and implementing partners including government officials. The team held individual and focused group discussions with teachers and children at multipurpose centres (MPCs) and government schools and vocational training facility, project management committees and beneficiaries of the various awareness raising and skills training activities, including employers and community members.

Group discussions and individual interviews were also held with participants of trainings on the SCREAM, Teacher Training Kit and an employers' awareness session on occupational health and safety. Due to security considerations, time in the field was very limited. Field visits were made only to project sites in Peshawar and Nowshera. The evaluators had very little time to review the quality and completeness of the project's database. Briefings were held before and after the field visits with SDC in Islamabad to discuss SDC-specific concerns, namely the progress made with respect to institutional development and the lessons learned for subsequent programming. The team met with DANIDA-supported partners in Peshawar but was unable to visit any of the districts covered by DANIDA, nor to meet with DANIDA representation in Pakistan. Preliminary findings of the evaluation were presented at a stakeholders meeting in Peshawar. At that time, the team had the opportunity to present the project to the newly appointed Minister of Education for the province. Project staff accompanied the team on field visits and provided a female local language translator who was a tremendous asset in helping the team maximize its compressed time in the field.

4. Findings

4.1 Project Design

Validity of Design

The design for SDC's Phase III takes into account recommendations from the second project evaluation to focus more specifically on institutional capacity building, as reflected in Sub Programme I, Policy and Institution Building. The budget however does not reflect its priority stature and expecting that the project could achieve the outputs delineated under the Sub Programme over a two year period (which ultimately turned out to be less anyway because of contractual delays) was not realistic. The DANIDA project was intended to complement and scale up the SDC project, and is thus similar in structure and was revised in 2007 to include a Policy and Institution Building component, also with an unrealistic time frame.

In general, the relationship between objectives, outputs and activities is clearly defined in both LFAs. Given the multitude of issues that drive child labour; the multi-pronged strategies embedded in the original project documents and expanded in subsequent phases are well conceived.

The design of the project partnership capitalizes on the respective strengths including ideological commitment and official mandate of partners to raise greater awareness of child labour among duty bearers and rights holders alike, through targeted Action Programmes.

Response to Socio-Economic Context

The socio economic and child labour situation in NWFP and in Pakistan is described in detail in the SDC and DANIDA project documents with specific reference to issues that drive child labour including its non-visibility, poverty, inadequate education systems, traditional values and stereotyped social roles that prevent girls especially from going to school, and the health and social consequences of child labour. However little mention is made of the political situation in NWFP, perhaps because of the sensitivities involved.

The Action Programmes directly address some of the outstanding access barriers to education (including affordability and quality) and skills training in a complementary matrix, using non formal education as an entry point. The incentive schemes built into the provision of NFE and skills training encourage children to maintain regular attendance, and through PITE and SCREAM Teachers Training, the project strives to enhance the quality of education available. Each AP project document follows a logical sequence with a clear situation analysis, including attention to cross cutting issues such as gender inequity and proposes a strategic framework to address identified problems.

Although the project documents both make reference to Pakistan's rapid population growth and the pressure it imposes on land use and the labour market, the frameworks do not include activities which directly address the well established linkages between large family size and the burden of growing population density on available resources that force children into the labour market. Significantly, the project's tracer study quotes target families as stating that, in addition to poverty, large family size is one of the factors contributing to child labour. The findings also highlight that the health and hygiene awareness component has improved health conditions of families. If these factors are taken into account, including the participation of Lady Health Visitors in outreach activities could reinforce the awareness component and link the families, especially women, with health and family planning services, thus addressing one of the underlying root causes of child labour.

Gender Sensitivity

The project design addresses the social constraints underlying gender disparities in education and the importance of positive discrimination in favour of girls. For instance, separate MPCs managed by female teachers were established, and government transport was arranged for children to participate in skills training programs. Mothers were mobilized to form Management Committees of MPCs. In Lower Dir, the implementing NGO managed to mobilize and register a Citizen Community Board comprising entirely of women. Mothers were included in the Skills Training Program, a move that would be perceived by the community as very positive not only in terms of income generating potential but also as a confidence building measure. Six women/girls have been linked with the First Women Bank for provision of credit. Women are well represented among the master trainers and trainers from the Education Department. The project guidelines on addressing gender issues are quite clear and they have been taken into account by the implementing agencies in their planning, implementation and reporting processes. In individual meetings with implementing NGOs, it was quite obvious that they were very conscious of gender issues and were integrating them into their project activities.

Adequacy of Problem Analysis

The problem analysis in both project documents gives a detailed account of the demographic and socio-economic picture of the NWFP province. The analyses cite specific figures to compare the extent to which NWFP is lagging behind the rest of the country in various sectors and underscore the role that family poverty plays in driving child labour. There is reference to the fresh influx of Afghan refugees who are no longer being supported by the UNHCR, thereby providing a strong justification for the inclusion of Afghan children under various project interventions. Analysis of the child labour situation questions the validity of surveys that under-represent girls since most of their work is “invisible”. The state of school education is well articulated and major problems are clearly highlighted including wide gender gaps in terms of schools, teachers and enrolment. Reference is also made to the health consequences of child labour, and the documents provide an overview of the provincial government’s plans to upgrade community welfare and decentralize monitoring of child labour in line with the 2001 Local Government Ordinance.

A salient gap in the problem analysis is that the impact of high population growth rate and large family size in NWFP in perpetuating poverty and driving child labour is overlooked. A mention of this factor in the problem analysis could provide a sound justification of promoting population welfare messages among the target communities as a part of the project activities.

Other findings

As mentioned in the methodology section, the team had very limited time to review the data base in detail. However the sheer volume of indicators appeared cumbersome, thereby likely imposing an undue data collection burden on partners who may not have the appropriate training or capacity in data collection and analysis. Some of the impact indicators such as increase in enrolment in government schools make sense, but there should be fewer in number and tools and data sources should be identified on how to collect data for them. Some of the qualitative indicators are challenging to measure and not all appear to be reported on anyway.

The baseline survey indicated as imperative in both the first and second evaluations covers only selected ⁹ project areas and the analysis has yet to be completed such that it is difficult to measure impact. In the Project Document for Phase III, there are some indicators for which baseline data can be collected even at this stage (The Education Department, for example, reportedly maintains the relevant statistics on enrolment, even if not on completion.).

⁹ The Baseline study includes data only from Lower Dir and Swat.

Although the overall project design factors in an important element of sustainability through inputs to enhance partner capacity, and many of the Action Programmes themselves include measures (albeit perhaps ambitious in the short term) for cost recovery and continuity, the project document itself does not adequately address sustainability.

With the limited amount of time available to the team to review the data, it was difficult to discern whether the project's implementing agencies worked with a single or multiple cohorts of children in the MPCs. The project database does not indicate multiple cohorts but it does seem that even if children were categorized as a single cohort, the enrolment actually was staggered and spread over several reporting periods.

Summary of Findings on Design

The projects' designs propose a logical matrix of outputs to achieve its stated objectives and takes into account gender and cultural considerations and challenges. They bring together a broad constituency of partners and capitalize on their respective strengths, but fall short in proposing a specific strategy for institutionalizing its interventions. They also overlook the crucial link between large family size and child labour. The log frame is not entirely consistent with the project document in terms of outputs and activities described. For instance, Capacity Development at District, Tehsil and Union Council Levels, Mainstreaming of Child Labour in Provincial and National Development Programme, Policy study on Child Labour and the Legal Framework, and Apprenticeship Scheme described in detail in both Project Documents do not find a place in the respective log frames. The sheer number of indicators is cumbersome, many are difficult to quantify, and there is a lack of baseline data for measuring impact. For SDC's Phase III, the implementation period is too circumscribed for realistic achievement of the project's objectives with respect to institutional and policy development.

4.2 Relevance

The two projects address Millennium Development Goals 1, 2, 3, 6, and are in line with Pakistan's Poverty Reduction Strategy and the Government's commitment to the Convention on the Rights of the Child through Pakistan's National Plan of Action for Children.

The projects are supportive of the National Time Bound Programme and the broader ILO goal of Decent Work for All, and are assisting the Government of Pakistan to fulfil its commitments to national and international conventions on child rights and child protection.

The CCLET project's skills training component developed in conjunction with Department of Training and Manpower and replicated with the DANIDA project support Pakistan's Vision for the National Skills Strategy 2008-2012. The two projects are also in line with 2008 National Education Policy that promotes linkages between formal education with industry and internship programmes, and vocational skills training centres, and stipulates that Government schools initiate non-formal education stream for child labourers with flexible timings and need-based schedules, special literacy skills programmes for older child labourers and use of school buildings for adult literacy after school hours.

Through establishing MPCs and providing children with non-formal education and the possibility of mainstreaming, the projects are bringing children into educational settings who for various reasons such as age and competing demands, are not able to adapt to formal school requirements. They are thus helping move forward the government of Pakistan's Education For All agenda which cannot be reached without taking into account the special needs of working children. They are further supporting EFA goals as well as cross cutting development themes of SDC, DANIDA and ILO through their emphasis on bridging gender gaps, especially in the education sector.

In offering functional literacy and skill training to older children, the projects' strategy complies with Pakistan's National Policy and Plan of Action to Combat Child Labour. This is an extremely relevant component insofar as a preference for skills learning over general education is one of the factors often cited for child labour by both children and parents.

Child Labour is highlighted in the draft PRSP II as a manifestation of poverty and recognized as a problem that Pakistan has been grappling with for a long time. One of the PRSP thrust areas is human resource development to promote employment and self enterprise. The project is supporting this objective through skills training and the establishment of community based service outlets and also fits into the National Social Protection Strategy through its investment in human capital to interrupt the intergenerational cycle of poverty.

By providing children with learning opportunities, relief from work, recreational and social opportunities, that's to say, a chance to enjoy a childhood otherwise being denied, the projects are fully in line with SDC's Cooperation Strategy 2006-2010 for Pakistan and Human Rights Based Approach to development and to DANIDA's longstanding commitment to poverty reduction and popular participation in development.

Summary of Findings on Relevance

The two projects compliment and reinforce each other. The revised DANIDA project replicates and expands on the SDC infrastructure and more fully incorporates a human rights based approach. Both projects dovetail with the strategic direction of the ILO-IPEC framework of support to the national Time Bound Programme and in support national and provincial strategies and action plans to combat child labour and improve access to education. They bring together a broad constituency of government and non-government partners, thereby, providing leadership in addressing child labour as a cross cutting problem and in fulfilling ILO's commitment to Decent Work for All.

4.3 Implementation

The abbreviated time framework for SDC's Phase III relative to the other phases, coupled with a late start up due to contractual delays unduly prejudices meeting a number of project objectives. Among them are those under the Policy and Institutional Development Sub Programme, and integration of RC Management Committees into Citizen Community Boards as well as for mainstreaming Phase III students from non-formal to formal government schools¹⁰, reaching vocational training and training of government school teacher targets and establishing community based skills outlets. However, the SDC project has been successful in achieving, and in some cases, exceeding, many of its direct service delivery targets for Phase III, and was successful in meeting many of its output targets in previous phases, especially with respect to establishing MPCs, enrolling children in NFE and providing them with access to primary health care.

Likewise for DANIDA supported partners. The project was extended initially in 2005 on a no-cost basis because of start up delays and extended again for a year in 2007 with additional funding to incorporate improved strategies and more closely support and replicate the SDC infrastructure. A subsequent no cost extension was granted to carry the project to termination in April 2008. From 2007 onwards there was a significant increase in extremist attacks throughout NWFP targeting government officials and military installations with accompanying collateral damage. At certain points, especially in the DANIDA areas, the project was counselled by local authorities to lower its profile, such that the pace of activities had to be temporarily reduced. Strong community support helped weather these challenges without major ado, although

• ¹⁰ Mainstreaming targets achieved by the project up to March 31, 2008 are lower than planned due to the late start. Mainstreaming decisions are made in August and project management estimates target achievement of 85% by the end of the project.

ultimately they made it difficult for the project to reach some of its training and mainstreaming targets. DANIDA-supported partners also fell short in reaching institution building objectives and had to reschedule informal organizing and some teacher training activities, but were otherwise able to meet and in some cases, exceed many project targets in spite of the extremist presence, natural disasters and working in districts with extremely poor infrastructure and communications. The overall budget for the DANIDA project was ultimately reduced from \$1,336,454 to \$1,313,403 to reflect the forced reduction in scope of activities.

Contractual delays forced NGO implementing partners to use their own funds for four months to keep project activities afloat—testimony to their commitment to the project. In some cases, this required temporary downsizing of staff resources, but seems, for the most part, not to have seriously impeded project momentum or morale. However, it is important that donors are sensitive to how funding cycle demands and turnover play out in the field.

Project Management and Capacity Building of Partners

The project has generated a synergy amongst partners, capitalizing on and enhancing their respective capacities. The implementing NGOs demonstrate a good understanding of the issues involved and also how their work on the micro scale can contribute to changes at the macro level. They have improved professional skills as well, for instance, they are managing the project database for reporting on their own. Both PPA and DLG were working on child labour issues even before the inception of this project. JCDS is committed grass roots NGO which was taken on board in Phase II because of its track record working in difficult areas, and it is conceptually clear on its objectives and how to go about it. Likewise, the government partners show an increased understanding of child labour issues, and have gained a better appreciation of the needs of working children through their association and collaboration with the NGOs on the ground.

The team gleaned generally good coordination and complementarily among stakeholders, timely implementation of inter-dependent outputs (such as the development of the NFE teacher training module and training by PITE followed by NFE classes through the NGOs trained) and a common understanding of project targets and objectives that has helped keep the project on course.

The Project Review Committee has created a sense of solidarity among partners and serves as an efficient forum for troubleshooting and sharing lessons learned.

Within the project management itself, there is a clear understanding of roles and responsibilities and a common sense of purpose. This can be attributed to high staff retention and the Project Manager's previous experience in government and his flexible attitude towards all the implementing partners.¹¹ Likewise, the management within the NGOs appeared cohesive and their field staff demonstrated a strong sense of commitment and pride in the project and empathy with their beneficiaries.

The project management has been regularly meeting other ILO project managers in both formal and informal meetings for experience sharing.

Provision of Social Services

Targeting of beneficiaries and selection of locations for MPCs by the NGOs has been done based on union council level surveys to narrow down their selection to areas of high child labour density, and based on their established presence, prior knowledge and visits to potential areas. This has proved effective in marshalling community involvement in project activities and commitment to sustaining them.

¹¹ The Project Manager was taken on during the first phase of the SDC project and subsequently assumed responsibility for the DANIDA project when it was introduced.

NGO implementing partners have established 67 MPCs in areas where previously there was no venue for non-formal education and have set up afternoon NFE centres in 19 government schools. Currently, these NFE centres are being managed by government school teachers paid by the Project.

The vocational training programme for children and mothers is being implemented exclusively through DMTE training institutes. So far a total of 2202 children and 254 mothers have received either pre-vocational or vocational training in various skills.¹²

Afghan children comprise a moderate proportion of the target beneficiaries in several of the project sites. According to concerned authorities, Afghan children are eligible for mainstreaming into government schools, at least at the primary level. They are ethnically similar to the local population, and many have either been born in Pakistan or have no intention of going back. Almost all the Afghan children in project areas communicate in Pushto and Urdu like their Pakistani counterparts such that language is not an issue. By including them in MPC activities, the project is upholding Article 2 of the Childs Rights Convention prohibiting discrimination in providing services to both Pakistani and Afghan children at risk of child labour in those targeted communities. It is also helping to uphold their CRC right to education, as due to their tenuous status in Pakistan, they have especially limited access to education in their own milieu.

The team had no time to judge the quality of the education being provided at either the MPCs or the government schools. It did, however, observe a lack of clear criteria for deciding whether to mainstream children into government schools or direct them towards skills training. These criteria, however flexible, need to be clear to implementers at all levels. Discussions at various levels indicate the mainstreaming to government schools generally occurs in Grade-3, and the option for skills training seems to be limited to children who are beyond that age. Likewise, the team was unable to confirm that functional literacy was essential to transitioning to skills training. It encountered some students who were attending pre-vocational and vocational training but were not literate at all, even though they were engaged (or had been in) in MPC activities.

No formal mechanism appears to be in place either at the project or government level for following up on whether government teachers are actually using project-supported training in the classroom and the absence of baseline data in the indicators makes it difficult to ascertain the actual impact of the project on formal school enrolment and retention rates.

Enhancing the Knowledge Base

The projects have been partially successful in overcoming the paucity of statistics on working children in NWFP highlighted in both the first and second evaluations. As noted above, the baseline study of children in the project areas was delayed and remains a work in progress. Per recommendation of the SDC Phase II evaluation, the project, under SDC aegis, conducted a tracer study of 350 project beneficiaries using methodologies developed by IPEC. As one of the first of this type of study to be conducted in Pakistan, it represents a significant achievement and stands to provide useful data for shaping and fine tuning future interventions to divert children from child labour. Likewise, the project's study on occupation hazards in the workplace carried out in collaboration with the Pakistan Council of Scientific & Industrial Research, has served to develop training materials and inform policy makers.

The project has developed a highly sophisticated and user friendly comprehensive data base for Action Programme partners that over time has been decentralized and is being used for tracking

¹² This number includes those enrolled in both DANIDA and SDC Phase III pre-vocational and vocational training. It cannot be discerned from the data made available how many participants actually graduated as compared to those currently enrolled at the time of the evaluation

project beneficiaries and building a broader knowledge base on child labour. More importantly, the database is being regularly updated and used to generate numbers and tables required for developing various project reports. Information reporting appears to be largely on schedule.

Linkages with Other ILO Projects, UN organizations and NGO partners

At part of IPEC's Project of Support to the National Time Bound Programme, master trainers (NWFP education department government officials) have replicated the Teacher Information Kit training for government school teachers in six districts located in all four provinces of Pakistan.

ILO is planning a child labour project with the EC, also under the framework of support to the national TBP. The planning teams visited the project and the design for the EC funded project will incorporate and scale up good practices from the project.

The project's successful demonstration of direct services and afternoon classes for child labour in government schools were included in the new 2008 Education Policy. Project management participated in ILO countrywide consultations to formulate recommendations for the new Education Policy and successfully managed to advocate for these inclusions.

The NFE Life Skills module includes training materials and methodologies developed by UNICEF to teach about HIV/AIDS, health and hygiene and other social issues. The DANIDA supported partners, JCDS and Paradise, have also extended services to vulnerable populations in Peshawar and the earthquake areas covered by UNICEF. Independent of this direct collaboration, UNICEF is engaged in various complimentary activities to improve the quality of education which indirectly benefit project beneficiaries and provide added value to project inputs in teaching quality. These include constructing barriers and sanitation facilities for girls to enhance school attendance, providing sports equipment, transporting female teachers to help overcome mobility barriers, and supporting mobilization of Parent Teacher Associations. The team did not have an opportunity to explore in depth the project's interaction with UNICEF nor discuss options for expanded collaboration.

Likewise, it had no direct exposure to SPARC, aside from observing the prodigious display of SPARC materials in all project facilities and government offices visited. It was informed that SPARC staff have been included in trainings on OSH and Child Labour Law and that there is regular cross fertilization of ideas in government and NGO forums.

The team did not get the impression that the project management has thoroughly explored available opportunities for linkages and collaboration with other government institutions offering safety nets to the poor, such as Pakistan Bait-ul Mal and Zakat.

Summary of Findings on Implementation

In spite of contractual delays, funding gaps and external political and security challenges, both the SDC and DANIDA projects have been able to maintain a forward momentum, stay within budget and meet, and in some cases, exceed targets. Both projects might have been able to run smoother, however, had the initial implementation periods been longer and included more preparation time as the transition from one project phase to another took a toll on project momentum. The projects have made efficient use of resources by capitalizing on the comparative advantage of the different partners involved and sequencing activities logically. The inclusion of Afghan children in some of the target communities does not seem to have diluted the project partnership's mission, and stands as testimony to its commitment to non-discrimination. The data base that the partnership has developed is a valuable management and planning tool. The truncated time period for SDC's Phase III has contributed to disparities in NGO service delivery targets and may preclude full achievement of other output targets by the end of the project, especially with respect to Institutionalization and Policy Development. That said, the projects have cultivated fruitful relationships over time with provincial and local

authorities, and with partners outside of the immediate project alliance including UNICEF and SPARC that portend well for future collaboration and capacity building interventions. Coordination is strong at the field level and communication smooth between project management and the IPEC Office in Islamabad.

4.4 Effectiveness

Strengthening of Policy and Institutional Development

Phase I and II, the project cultivated a relationship with the Directorate of Industries, Commerce and Labour (DICL), whereby the focal point of the Child Labour Unit (CLU) served as the Chairman of one of the Project's Review Committee, and DICL together with the Workers Education & Research Welfare Society (WERWS) implemented an AP to raise awareness of child labour laws. In light of the leadership role expected of the CLU in addressing child labour concerns, the second evaluation of the SDC project recommended strengthening its capacity. This was added to the SDC project in Phase III and to the revised DANIDA project under the Policy and Institutional Development Component and formally initiated in May 2007. Since then, only limited progress has been made towards consolidating the CLU as a provincial focal point for Child Labour responsible for stakeholder coordination, planning and awareness raising.

At the time of the evaluation, the CLU remained understaffed, with only a Director and a statistician and was still lacking basic office infrastructure. According to project management, three labour inspectors and two management staff (Deputy Director & Statistical Officer) have been trained as Master Trainers for awareness on child labour laws. Other labour officials have been trained, but inspections are still haphazard. Further staffing and direction of the unit are contingent on completion of an institutional assessment that has yet to be initiated, notwithstanding technical inputs from the project to jumpstart it. Of the six stakeholder meetings it was to convene during Phase III, only one had taken place by the time of the evaluation, although the CLU openly acknowledged the lack of coordination among stakeholders and the need for greater coordination. On a positive note, the CLU has marshalled modest government support--it has been allocated 1.9 million rupees by the government to undertake a study of working children in Mardan and to support motorcycles and running costs in the field for labour inspectors. The instruments for the survey have been prepared with assistance from the project, but have yet to be piloted in the field. The survey, whilst an independent initiative of the CLU separate from its obligations under the project framework, is an outgrowth of the project's longstanding informal ties with the DICL, and the designated focal point for the Child Labour Unit, and testifies to the project's ability over time to marshal greater government involvement in fighting child labour.

Among the many challenges of combating child labour in Pakistan and upholding Decent Work standards is that the multiplicity of labour laws makes them hard to enforce. A potentially promising development reflective of the government's growing commitment to better labour standards is that the Federal Ministries of Law and Labour are currently in the process of combining all labour related laws into one code. This will include standardizing the minimum age for working children, which currently varies from one law to another. Secondly, C138 and C182 may be incorporated into the labour law. Once the consolidation of laws is formalized, all child labour projects in Pakistan will have to be aligned with the new code, which theoretically, will facilitate enforcement. The project has indirectly contributed to the consolidation process through the active participation of ILO-NWFP and the ILO-IPEC office in Islamabad in policy level dialogues and regional consultations, and through supporting the CLU. It has also helped inform policy and support the enforcement of laws on workplace safety and child labour through the development of training manuals on child labour laws and a study on occupational hazards.

Institutionalization of Project Interventions

The project has helped sensitize DMTE staff in skills training centres to the specific needs of younger working children and to develop needs based training materials that give more emphasis to practical hand-on rather than theoretical learning, and is helping DMTE to think out of the box. The following are examples of institutionalization so far:

- The materials developed by the project in conjunction with different partners, the Teacher Information Kit, adaptation of SCREAM, the PITE training for MPC teachers and the Skills Training modules are being widely used and appreciated, and in some cases, replicated in six other ILO projects elsewhere in the country, but still remain to be formally mainstreamed.
- Thanks to DLG lobbying efforts, the government is now providing free books to all DLG MPCs and four PPA MPCs. 13
- The project is helping to empower mothers and bridge the gender gap through increasing their access to education and skills training, linking them with credit, promoting greater gender awareness and social mobilization and supporting the registration of a female MPC management committee as a Citizen Community Boards¹⁴--no mean feat when the motivational efforts are taken into account. Women's participation in MPC committees (which includes exposure to basic business skills) has improved their mobility and allowed them to have a greater say concerning their children's futures.
- The government has endorsed the projects' model of afternoon schools and non formal education in its new Education Policy, but has yet to move forward on adopting the MPCs as part of its broader commitment to increasing access to school facilities.

Promoting Social Mobilization and Strengthening the Enabling Environment

The capacity building of teachers in the formal educational sector through SCREAM training and the Teacher Information Kit is helping improve classroom conditions, including changing attitudes, if not always practices, towards corporal punishment.

Many of the teachers interviewed reported that the project trainings opened their eyes to child labour, such that they no longer take it for granted, and are more sensitive to the needs of working children. Others interviewed noted that prior to their involvement with the project, they were providing free extra curricular NFE tutoring to children in their communities, and were pleased that the project was offering more institutionalized opportunities for this. Albeit anecdotal, stories like these testify to the project's effectiveness in marshalling greater recognition of child labour and commitment to prevent it through education.

Field interviews with both duty bearers and rights holders indicated an enhanced understanding of child labour issues and a sense of greater empowerment and commitment to address them. Significantly, children interviewed report that the community mobilization component of the project has helped overcome parental reluctance to let them go to school. Some employers who received the training conducted by the trade union partner reported that they have changed the nature of work assigned to young children in auto workshop to lighten their burden; one said that he had stopped verbally abusing his child workers.

In terms of mobilizing duty bearers, parents are still left holding the bulk of responsibility to ensure service delivery to right holders. They are sending girls regularly to attend the MPCs and/or skill centres and taking on their share of household chores and redistributing the workload amongst the remaining members. Parents are allowing boys working in informal

13 Noteworthy is that the Director of DLG served as the Education Minister during the recent interim government who capitalized on her tenure to spotlight child labour issues and the agenda of the SDC and DANIDA projects.

14. An all female RC Management Committee was converted to a CCB in Lower Dir.

establishments to take out time from work to do the same. When boys take out time from work, they are losing out on income. Very few employers would allow them to attend MPCs or skill training centres with full pay. The employers are also taking the risk of losing semi trained and “cheap” labour force. The government departments undertaking responsibilities that are part of their mandate are being subsidized by the project. It is quite evident as to who is doing more for the right holders and that the balance of responsibilities is tilted towards the disadvantaged groups. Because of this lopsided sharing of responsibility, the grassroots duty bearers cannot be taken fully on board and their ownership falls short. The project has made tremendous inroads into trying to reverse this balance of power, but can only do so much in the absence of significant changes in social, political and economic factors that control the macro picture.

The team had no opportunity to meet with children confined at home, but frequently was told in interviews that family resistance and traditional values continue to hinder access to education, especially for girls.

The effectiveness of awareness programs for government school teachers, participants of workshops organized by trade union partner, and the impact of life skills component in MPCs cannot be assessed without the availability on pre and post activity studies, or through a comparative study on the perceptions of target and non target groups.

Provision of Social Services

The strategy of providing NFE with flexible hours and friendly environments through the MPCs and afternoon schools is empowering working children, especially girls who would otherwise be confined at home, to take advantage of learning opportunities that hitherto did not exist, thereby contributing to improved self esteem, increased opportunities for generating income, attitudinal and behavioural changes. Through participating in MPC activities and transitioning either to formal schooling or skills training, the working hours of children have effectively been reduced and they are more aware of occupational hazards. Thanks to the Life Skills health awareness components, children are reporting improved home environments and health status.

For younger children enrolled in MPCs, both working children and siblings, the preferred strategy for diverting them from child labour is non formal education followed by mainstreaming to government schools from Grade-3 onwards. Once mainstreamed to government schools, children are considered completely withdrawn from child labour as it becomes impossible for them to get involved in child labour after attending full time schools. Likewise, non working siblings who are mainstreamed to government schools are effectively prevented from entering the child labour market. It is not possible to ascertain from the total figure of mainstreamed children as to exactly how many working children were fully withdrawn and how many non working siblings were effectively prevented from entering the child labour market.

Mainstreaming of older children can be difficult because they fall outside of government school age standards, and are not always made comfortable by their younger counterparts. The project is working to overcome this by offering them functional literacy training at MPCs followed by an appropriate pre vocational training program that provides skills in non hazardous sectors and also orients them in OSH practices. The majority of these children, both working children and their siblings, may end up switching occupations and going into less hazardous trades, or keep working in the same trades more aware of occupational hazards or going into income generation activities on their own.

The community based service outlet centres established under the project are supporting girls and mothers in generating income, thereby at least partially withdrawing the children involved from child labour as well as helping to increase women’s mobility and independence.

The team observed a few cases in which children are giving up immediate revenue generating activities in especially hazardous work such as scavenging to learn vocational skills, such as

auto mechanics on the premise that in the long term, they will have greater growth and earning potential. Albeit anecdotal, it suggests that the project is proving helping imbue children with the skills needed to reduce their risks in the labour market. Noteworthy is that the project has introduced pottery and fibreglass products into the Skills Training centres, thereby expanding on the range of options, especially for girls who were previously limited to tailoring and embroidery.

Enhancing the Knowledge Base

The tracer study, conducted by the project, gives some dimension to how the project has affected its beneficiaries. Almost half of those beneficiaries interviewed reported an improvement in their families' income to varying extent as a result of their involvement with the project. This is significantly higher than what has been reported in similar projects in other parts of the country. Slightly over half said that as a result of their involvement with the project, they had the option to stop working. However, two thirds of children interviewed were still working, but fewer hours than before.

This suggests that while economically it is simply not realistic for children not to work at all; there is a greater appreciation for making sure they also have time for education or skills training. 93% of those children mainstreamed were still in school at the time of the survey and about a third reported that the non formal education and skills training they had received through the project had helped them get a job in the formal sector. 69% of children over 12 felt that project interventions had improved their school environment and almost three quarters of children interviewed reported improvements in their health as a result of project awareness activities on health and personal hygiene. As noted earlier, many parents interviewed perceived large family size to be a cause of child labour, underscoring the importance of linking efforts to reduce child labour with information and options on fertility regulation. Although girls constituted over half of the project's beneficiaries, they are still bearing the burden of household labour at the expense of recreational activities or outside remunerative employment in the case of older girl children.

Summary of Findings on Effectiveness

Because of the limited baseline information available to serve as a basis for impact analysis, it is difficult to quantify the change in awareness among the various beneficiaries of the project (duty bearers and rights holders alike). Nevertheless, testimonies gathered through field interviews indicate that awareness activities have been highly effective in enhancing understanding of child labour across the board. Through fostering a shift in attitude and providing alternatives to child labour through skills training, non-formal education and mainstreaming, the projects are effectively contributing to a more enabling environment for withdrawing children from the labour force and gradual elimination of the Worst Forms of Child Labour.

They are also helping women have a greater say in their children's future and be more empowered over their own lives thanks to increased mobility and skills training. The projects' NFE and skills training models have served to inform policy makers. The concept of afternoon schools now features in the new Draft Education Policy, and the Government has acknowledged the need to extend skills training to younger ages. The NWFP CLU, whilst still in an embryonic capacity stage, has marshalled modest government support. The bulk of responsibility for keeping children out of child labour, however, still remains with parents, as the macro level interventions to shift it have yet to be institutionalized.

4.5 Sustainability and Replicability

Sustainability can take several forms among them, physical sustainability of the facilities established under the project and cost-recovery schemes, institutionalization and capacity building, replication and scale up of strategies and approaches proven successful and linking

with other partners to leverage resources. Of foremost significance with respect to replicability is that the initial achievements of the SDC-supported project served as an impetus to DANIDA to initiate a complimentary project to replicate and expand on the SDC models, thereby increasing the scope of support to the National Time Bound Programme.

Strengthening of Policy and Institutional Development

The projects' successful experience in supporting non formal education and afternoon schools in NWFP has helped the ILO fulfil its mandate to get child labour concerns addressed at the national level. Following country-wide consultations which heralded the success of the CCLET projects and other NFE interventions, the Federal Government endorsed afternoon classes and non formal education for working children and for the first time ever, incorporated these concepts into the new draft National Education Policy 2008 (see Annex).

Institutionalization

The project established 67 MPCs providing non formal education and counselling services to over 5000 children. The idea was that the MPCs would serve a single cohort of children who would be tracked throughout the project duration using a database regularly updated by the implementing partners and compiled by the ILO Project Office in Peshawar. Some of MPCs are expected to be taken over by local community groups. Others will be closed when all children graduate from there. The project has also set up afternoon NFE centres in 19 government schools. Currently, these NFE centres are being managed by government school teachers paid by the Project. The Project is advocating with the DSL to institutionalize these NFE centres by taking financial responsibility for them. Once covered under official budget lines, these centres would be sustainable.

The project is advocating similarly with DMTE to adopt the skill programmes designed for young literates (especially child labour) and mothers on a long term basis such that these programmes are integrated into the regular skills training offerings. The previous government of NWFP had accepted the concept and was in the process of including it in the annual budget, and seemingly the new government plans to follow suit.

Replication and Scaling up

The FATA Directorate of Education has expressed an interest in replicating project models for non formal education as part of a broader effort to combat child labour.

JCDS and DLG reported capitalizing on the NFE experience gained through the CCLET project to leverage resources for expanding their activities to additional localities.

Capacity Building

Through providing awareness training on OSH and child labour, the projects are opening opportunities for trade unions and worker associations to organize workers in the informal sectors to stand up for their rights in the long term.

It was a new and challenging experience for the DMTE to develop training programs for younger, barely literate children most of who were already working elsewhere. The paradigm shift from conventional skills programs to cater adequately to a new group with completely different credentials, attitudes and aptitudes could not have been an easy task by any means. The DMTE had to make the skills programs more hands-on with reduced content of theoretical knowledge because children unfamiliar with technical terms and untrained in basic applied math could not be expected to enrol in conventional programs. The DMTE capacity has been enhanced and its flexibility in dealing with a new clientele is praiseworthy. Its test, however, will be adoption of the new skills programs in its regular calendar of events.

Cost Recovery

In terms of cost recovery, earning from sales of goods produced and sold on site at the vocational training centres are used to support the facilities, goods produced subsequently by children who have completed the programme are generating revenue for them, and a cost sharing programme has been worked out whereby former trainees can use centre facilities and share the profits from sales of goods made. Although this is in the very nascent stage, it has the potential to create greater business acumen and self reliance among project beneficiaries, though at the same time, opens up the risk of local market saturation.

Gaps

With respect to PITE and the Education Department, the project has taken them up more as implementing partners with the necessary expertise rather than in terms of enhancing their capacity. What is required is advocacy with the Education Department that Education for All goals cannot be achieved without inclusion of working children and that the project provides demonstration models on how to go about it. An initial start has been made with the inception of afternoon classes in government schools for working children and taking on their full responsibility will demonstrate the commitment of Department.

An exit strategy still remains to be fully articulated. Although the project has achieved written agreements with several government entities to take over some of the project components, it has had to contend with frequent staff transfers of key officials and inadequate communication between and among government counterparts.

Despite the enthusiasm for the Teachers Training Information Kit, which has been a project output since early on, no concrete steps have yet been taken to incorporate it into pre-service teacher training.

The project envisaged that the beneficiary communities would ultimately take responsibility for the MPCs by converting the MPC management committees to Citizen Community Boards which would open access to government resources. However, the conversion process alone has proven more onerous and time consuming than anticipated. Mobilizing communities to get organized into a CCB, fulfilling the registration formalities, building up the CCB capacity to design project proposals and mobilizing local resources (20% equity) followed by advocacy with the district government to approve proposals and release funds to the CCB is a formidable challenge. Even once this is accomplished, the CCBs require further handholding to implement their projects in a transparent manner.

Summary of Findings on Sustainability and Replicability

DANIDA's leveraging on the SDC infrastructure to extend outreach to additional districts testifies to the credibility and replicability of the SDC's early phase interventions. The ensuing value added and synergy of the two projects have created a rich legacy including opening educational opportunities to working children, marshalling broad-based constituencies at different levels, and indirectly influencing policy makers to take action against child labour.

The Education Department has picked up the concept of afternoon classes, the Directorate of Technical Education and Manpower Training has bought into skills training for younger children, the Department of Schools and Literacy and Pakistan Institute of Teacher's Education have expressed an interest in mainstreaming some of the project materials. There have been discussions with district governments about accessing resources to continue the MPCs. The challenge remains as to support and sustain replicating these interventions, especially in light of the current tenuous economic, political and security climate of NWPF. Notwithstanding a high degree of government enthusiasm for building on the project, there is still little evidence that substantive steps are being taken to ensure that the momentum will continue once the project cycles end. Concerted advocacy will be required to ensure implementation of these commitments. The conversion of MPC management committees into self-sustaining CCBs has

proved to be more of a challenge and time consuming than envisaged within the prescribed project period; likewise institutional capacity building proved difficult to achieve in the short term.

4.6 Potential Partnerships

The team found that the project has yet to capitalize on potential opportunities for expanding government partnerships and forging stronger links with other UN agencies and NGO partners. Some opportunities for further leveraging and scaling up the project include:

- Pakistan Bait-ul-Mal, under the National Commission for Child Welfare and Development (NCCWD) has initiated a national project to remove children from hazardous employment through education, and the development of linkages between community health services and recreational packages. It has established 150 centres around the country that divert children from labour, along the same lines of the project model, by providing them with NFE. Children are given a daily stipend of PRs 10 as an incentive, in addition to uniforms, shoes, other clothing and means during school hours and parents are paid a stipend to compensate for the loss of children's income. In project areas where Pak BTM does not already exist, the project could market its MPCs as an opportunity for PAK BTM to extend outreach without the need to establish new infrastructure, and thereby ensure continuity of service.
- The Elementary Education Foundation (EEF), a government corporation established in 2004 with a mandate for supporting Literacy for All is currently operating non-formal schools with flexible hours to extend education to out of school children, including working children in 19 districts in NWFP. Although the project has approached EEF about the possibility of taking over some of its facilities and activities, it has been difficult to move this initiative significantly forward because of the time required to comply with bureaucratic prerequisites and government staff turnover.
- A Child Protection Bureau was recently established, under the Social Welfare Department in NWFP with the responsibility to take care of vulnerable, and often out of school children in fixed facilities. This represents an opportunity in conjunction with UNICEF, which works closely with the Social Welfare Department, for leveraging the project's experience by introducing short term functional literacy training to children under the responsibility of the Department. Such collaboration with UNICEF would have the added benefit of linking ILO project beneficiaries to child protection activities provided through UNICEF and the Social Welfare Department, including increased access to the government social safety nets available through Zakat and Bait u Maa, extension of medical facilities for child labourers, and pre-vocational/vocational programmes for women and girls.
- SPARC is the leading national NGO in Pakistan on child rights with strength in advocacy and lobbying for child rights through documentation and dissemination of information through reports, magazines, leaflets, conferences and seminars. ILO could build on the SDC and DANIDA projects current collaboration with SPARC by capitalizing on SPARC's countrywide network to project its child labour agenda.
- ILO in collaboration with UNESCO, the World Bank and other international partners recently launched a Global Task Force on Child Labour and Education for All to elevate the issue of child labour on the political agenda. Insofar as there are plans to replicate the structure of the GTF at national levels, the experience of the SDC and DANIDA projects provide a strong justification for piloting this new mechanism in Pakistan to enhance inter-ministerial collaboration to tackle child labour through education.

4.7 Special Concerns, External Factors, Causality

The success of the NFE activities has created an unfortunate paradox in that many students and their families are reluctant to transition to government schools for fear that they will experience a drop in education quality and negative social and physical environment. This phenomenon is not unique to CCELT schools, but highlights one of the unfortunate artefacts of the project approach in general, whereby parallel systems of service delivery are created. Overcoming this requires a stronger government commitment to institutionalization and quality standardization of project interventions than is currently in evidence.

The frequent transfer of government staff and lack of communication within and between government ministries has hampered project efforts to build capacity and move forward government ownership of project components.

Political uncertainty has been a serious problem throughout most of Phase III, and from October 2007 to the end of March 2008. The lawyers' civil disobedience movement, incessant terrorist activities, completion of government tenure and arrival of the caretaker government, the murder of Benazir Bhutto, national and provincial elections and the installation of new government in March 2008 have all contributed to an environment where no policy decisions or planning could be realistically expected. Moreover, from 2002-2007, the project was operating against a backdrop of very conservative traditional government that was retroactive concerning girls education and gender disparities.

Between 2003-2004, the government of NWFP discontinued pre-service teacher training due to an excess of already trained teachers relative to schools. Consequently, the project target of training 500 pre-service teachers became inapplicable and the project was not able to find an alternative to this external challenge.

The CCBs are predicated on district devolution, which is far from a fait accompli. Currently it stands at risk of being dissolved by the new government which is unhappy about its implications for power and resource sharing. Should that occur, the CCBs established under the project, as well as the institution itself as a means of mobilizing government funds at the local level will be nullified.

Access to school facilities would seem to be a determining and essentially limiting factor in the project's capacity to withdrawing children from labour. Many children, especially girls, have no convenient access to schools even when they have the liberty and preparation to attend them. This constraint is beyond the scope of the project to resolve.

5. Conclusions

A marked change in commitment to addressing child labour has occurred over the project period. Government entities and policy frameworks are gradually taking child labour into consideration in planning and policy (afternoon schools, teachers training on CL and SCREAM and CL needs factored into new education policy); however due to resource constraints and a panoply of extenuating circumstances, operationalization of this growing commitment remains at a nascent stage.

The project has demonstrated viable models of creating awareness among a wide range of actors, access to education and skill training and potential of mainstreaming successful interventions into government plans. The project interventions have been in line with national instruments like the National EFA Plan, NPPA-CCL, PM's Plan for Skills Training, and the New Education Policy.

The project has successfully experimented with marshalling a diverse range of partners with different approaches and perspectives to work together on child labour issues. It has also shown

that the government departments which are often accused of lethargy can be motivated and mobilized to produce high quality work.

The project has moved in the right direction by taking on institution building of the DICL by strengthening the Child Labour Unit and making it the focal point in the province. Although this component of the project remains a work in progress, due to the long term investment required for capacity building, ultimately, it will contribute to the institutionalization and long term sustainability of successful project interventions.

The project has been able to take advantage of external opportunities like tapping a new funding source for translation of SCREAM Kit and working in collaboration with an on-going UNICEF program. The latter collaboration could lead to closer working relationship in future and add to the project's already impressive list of partners. Since Pakistan is included among the pilot countries for implementing the UN Reforms Programme, the collaboration becomes all the more relevant and significant.

Eliminating child labour in Pakistan requires addressing a broad range of external factors that drive it and hinder access to education, among them, entrenched gender disparities (such as *purdah* imperatives restricting the mobility of women and girls, early marriage, and the low premium placed on girl children), poverty, a shortage of functioning schools, especially for girls and large family size.

6. Recommendations

Strengthening of Policy and Institutional Development (including Capacity Building of Partners)

1. *ILO Project Office, NWFP*: Continue efforts to strengthen the capacity of the Provincial Child Labour Cell to coordinate partners working on child labour and child protection and to mobilize resources for greater government ownership and scale up of project models and initiatives to address it.
 - An important starting point for the CLU would be to identify all child labour projects in the province and organize a conference for mapping the child labour initiatives.
 - Additionally the CLU could benefit from an overview and study of child labour monitoring systems established at six districts under the Project of Support to the National Time Bound Programme.
2. *ILO-IPEC, Islamabad*: *The ILO and other stakeholders working with vulnerable child populations must advocate at the national level with appropriate ministries/ departments/ institutions to:*
 - Update the National Law on Child Labour to incorporate the two conventions on Child Labour.
 - Implement the government commitment to non-formal education, functional literacy and skills training for working children as spelled out in the new National Education Policy 2008 by taking fiscal and managerial responsibility for the NFE centres and expanded vocational training programmes.
 - Involve employer groups, or proxies if need be where formal industry is not present, to ensure that project activities are in line with the ILO tripartite principle.
3. *ILO-IPEC, Islamabad, ILO Project Office, NWFP and other partners*: Organize a national level conference with both ILO and non-ILO implementing agencies across sectors on eliminating child labour in Peshawar for sharing lessons learned and good practices addressing the needs of children at risk.

4. *ILO-IPEC/SDC, Islamabad, DANIDA*: Support national technical advisors fluent in local languages within relevant institutions such as DICL in NWFP to build the capacity of key government partners and to ensure implementation of the commitments made.
5. *ILO Project Office, Peshawar/SDC*: Organize training for project staff and implementing partners on indicator setting, data collection and analysis prior to developing the next phase of the project and endeavour that future project designs include a project monitoring plan.
6. *ILO-IPEC/SDC, Islamabad, DANIDA*: Provide technical support to project staff and implementing partners in developing advocacy strategies at both provincial and national levels to further government operationalization of its child labour commitments. This could be done through expanding on the SDC and DANIDA's current partnership with SPARC and capitalizing on SPARC's country-wide network.

Institutionalization of Project Interventions

7. *ILO Project Office, NWFP, DSL*: Standardize NFE syllabus and training program developed by PITE for government afternoon schools. The standardization will be useful for accrediting all NFE programs in the province and help in certification and transition to government schools.
8. *ILO Project Office, NWFP, DICL, DMTE*: Coordinate with DICL to make children-specific skills training programs (pre vocational and vocational) a part of regular skill training offered by DMTE institutes throughout the province and encourage principals of vocational training institutes under the Directorate of Manpower and Training to capitalize on the expansion of services and capacity gained through the project to reach more students.
9. *ILO-IPEC, Islamabad, ILO Project Office, NWFP, other partners*: Support provincial consultations and a participatory review of curricula to move forward on adaptation of the Teachers Information Kit on Child Labour and Child Rights and SCREAM training into Pre-Service teacher training. This could be done in partnership with UNESCO, perhaps as a pilot project under the aegis of the ILO-UNESCO Global Task Force on Child Labour.
10. *ILO-IPEC Islamabad, ILO Project Office, NWFP, DSL*: Advocate with DSL to operationalize the new National Education Policy's commitment to non-formal education by adopting the projects' MPCs and bringing them under government supervision and funding. Using the new policy as leverage, ILO and SPARC could collaborate on an appropriate advocacy strategy.
11. *ILO-IPEC/SDC, Islamabad, DANIDA*: A stronger advocacy component, perhaps in collaboration with SPARC, should be factored into future interventions to address child labour to ensure that achievements on the ground are translated into policy action and implementation.

Promoting Social Mobilization and Strengthening the Enabling Environment

12. *PITE, NWFP*: Training on motivational strategies should be built into all training for teachers (both formal and informal/MPC) to ensure that the participants actually implement their learning and that those tasked additionally with social mobilization are better equipped to deal with family resistance and traditional values.

Provision of Social Services

13. *ILO Project Office, NWFP, DSL, DMTE*: Students enrolled in government NFE activities should be offered the option of transitioning to skills training centres.

14. *ILO Project Office, NWFP, DSL*: The quality of government afternoon schools should be brought at par with the project's MPCs and strategy should be formulated for their full adoption by the Department of Schools and Literacy.
15. *ILO-IPEC/SDC, Islamabad, DANIDA*: Future initiatives need to give priority to consolidating and strengthening the existing service delivery models and improving their quality and viability over scaling them up.
16. *ILO Project Office, NWFP, SDC, Islamabad, DANIDA*: Future initiatives addressing child rights should include linkages with health and family planning awareness and services. Specifically, explore the feasibility of including Lady Health Visitors in MPC on site and outreach activities
17. *ILO-IPEC, ILO Project Office, NWFP, SDC*: Explore opportunities for expanding on UNICEF-ILO collaboration such that CL awareness can be extended to children in protected custody and other vulnerable situations and that beneficiaries under ILO-IPEC interventions can be better linked to child protection services.

Enhancing the Knowledge Base

18. *ILO-IPEC, ILO Project Office, NWFP*: A baseline study should be conducted at or prior to the inception of any new phase of the project.
19. *ILO Project Office, NWFP, PITE*: Conduct an impact study to follow up on whether teachers are implementing their training in the classroom.
20. *ILO-IPEC, ILO Project Office, NWFP*: Ensure that all training workshops on child labour laws, issues and OSH include a standardized means for pre, post and follow up assessment to measure impact.
21. *ILO-IPEC, Islamabad, SDC*: Document the working models that the project has developed in a manual for marketing to government and non-government agencies within the province and throughout the country working on reducing child labour through education to marshal buy in and facilitate replication.

7. Good Practices

Good practices identified by the evaluation include the following:

- *Adaptation of the Teacher Training Information Kit and SCREAM* in collaboration with government partners and by entrusting them to conduct the training programmes exclusively has boosted their self confidence created a strong sense of ownership and commitment. The government partners have taken on the responsibilities and demonstrated their commitment with timely and quality delivery of the component. The master trainers trained by the project were also given the responsibility of training teachers in six other districts. This practice can be taken forward as a successful example to engage other government departments to play their role in combating child labour.
- *Extending pre-vocational and vocational training to working children and to mothers* to provide income alternatives to child labour is a good practice. Officially, skills training programmes in Pakistan require at least eight years of formal education, such that only older children (12-17) and adults are eligible. The project has successfully overcome that barrier by supporting the DMTE to develop and conduct tailor made skill training packages for neo-literate child labour covered under the project, which includes children below 12. This has enhanced the value of MPCs and provided an opportunity to divert younger children from child labour and to improve children's income generating skills in non hazardous occupations. Including mothers in skills training has improved their mobility and contributed to their empowerment. It has also strengthened their resolve to ensure that their children attend the MPC skill training programmes regularly. Involving the primary grass roots stakeholders can be categorized as a further key good practice.
- *Use of NFE curricula and materials.* In a number of child labour prevention/withdrawal projects, the implementing agencies use their own curricula and diverse training material to conduct NFE, literacy and skills training programmes. The implementing NGOs in the SDC-DANIDA projects have used a common curriculum, training material and methodology, indicators and standards for all the children covered in the four project districts where direct service delivery is being provided. Using common curriculum, teaching materials and information systems by various implementing partners facilitates both quality control and potential for mainstreaming and scale up. It also becomes comparatively easy to assess the performance of each implementing partner. This good practice of the two projects with similar objectives and outputs has the potential to be adapted countrywide.
- *Modelling good practices in NFE.* The strategy to start afternoon classes in government schools is a proactive measure to demonstrate to the Department of Schools and Literacy that non formal education can be successfully implemented in the government environment. Normally Government departments, agencies and NGOs have scoffed at the very idea that NFE can be successfully adopted by the government education departments. The SDC-DANIDA projects have established that if the NFE system is demonstrated to be a bridge rather than a parallel system, it is easier to get it accepted by the government. The approach of this good practice can be applied to other components as well where the government becomes a part of the interventions rather than antagonized that its systems are being by-passed.

8. Lessons Learned

Future initiatives must recognize the long term investment required to build institutional capacity. For instance, the capacity of relevant government institutions to take appropriate measures against child labour cannot be enhanced in a year or two. Achieving this requires awareness and advocacy, engagement in discussion and debate, opening up two way information channels, penetration into the government systems and understanding as to how they work and how they can be challenged and changed, demonstration of good practices and finally integrating the issues into the government agenda. This process requires a long term perspective and cannot be expected to be achieved in the short term.

Involving local stakeholders and government departments in the development of project materials and strategies imbues ownership. This is clearly proven by the successful partnerships managed by the SDC-DANIDA projects. The partnerships not only helped in achieving outputs, they also fostered a common platform and understanding among the various implementing partners coming from a diverse range of approaches – civil society, government etc. These partnerships created a network of linkages that can serve as a foundation for sustaining project interventions. The lesson learnt is bringing partners with a different approaches but bound to a common cause together can create an enabling environment whereby each can contribute productively and respect each other's input.

Sustainability mechanisms and exit strategies need to be better spelled out in project and programme designs. The project has the basic elements in place but these have not been debated comprehensively among the implementing partners with the result that a viable exit strategy is not in place. The lesson learnt is that development projects need to work out sustainability options during the first two years of the project since these strategies often impact the direction of the project, its strategies and actions.

The project has established a database to monitor beneficiary children. The next step would be to share this database with relevant government departments such as the provincial DICL and District Labour Officers in the target districts. The project would need to build the capacity of the relevant government agencies to maintain, expand and update the Child Labour Monitoring System as a routine part of their work. The Child Labour Monitoring Systems established in six districts across the country under the GoP TBP can serve as demonstration models.

Without baseline and impact studies, it is difficult to measure the impact of interventions on the quality of life of the beneficiary population. Since 2005, all IPEC projects in Pakistan include baseline and tracer studies as integral project components. However, they are not always accorded the requisite precedence in the face of other implementation demands, especially baseline studies, and when one is conducted in the absence of the other, its utility may be diluted. The lesson learnt for the projects is to ensure provision of budget and time to conduct the prescribed studies as a priority rather than emphasizing only the targets and timely delivery whose impact is hard to measure.

Annex 1 Specific Recommendations for SDC and DANIDA Future Programming

1. Document the working models that the project has put in place in manual form for marketing to government and non-government agencies within the province and throughout the country working on reducing child labour through education to marshal buy in and facilitate replication.
2. Support Pashto-speaking national technical advisors within relevant institutions (NWFP DICL-CLU in particular) to build the capacity of key government partners and to ensure implementation of the commitments made.
3. Organize training for staff capacity building on indicator setting and data collection for relevant parties prior to developing the next phase of the project and endeavor that future project designs include a project monitoring plan.
4. Provide technical support to project staff and implementing partners in developing advocacy strategies and plans.
5. Future initiatives need to give priority to consolidating and strengthening the existing service delivery models and improving their quality and viability over scaling them up.
6. Future initiatives addressing child rights should include linkages with health and family planning awareness and services. Specifically, explore the feasibility of including Lady Health Visitors in MPC on site and outreach activities.
7. Explore opportunities for expanding on UNICEF-ILO collaboration such that child labour awareness can be extended to children in protected custody and other vulnerable situations and that beneficiaries under ILO-IPEC interventions can be better linked to child protection services.
8. A stronger advocacy component, perhaps in collaboration with SPARC should be factored into future interventions to address child labour to ensure that achievements on the ground are translated into policy action and implementation.
9. In terms of structuring a new Child Rights Programme, a partnership between ILO-IPEC, UNICEF and SPARC would create an opportunity for maximum coverage, service delivery, and synergy and value addition. In view of each partner's area of expertise, it recommended that the programme be structured around a three pillar strategy whereby ILO-IPEC continues to work on prevention of child labour in line with the models and strategies developed through the CCLET strategy, with UNICEF activities focused on protection of especially vulnerable individuals (including incarcerated, abused and street children) and SPARC taking the lead on creating mass awareness and advocating for child rights. Vulnerable children and their families could benefit from improved access to non-formal education and skills training through ILO and its implementing partners while children at risk of child labour would be linked to a range of child protection services through UNICEF's partner networks and Department of Social Welfare social safety nets. UNICEF's expertise in maternal and child health would facilitate linkages with health and family planning awareness, as part of a broader strategy to improve household security and child welfare through education, skills training and micro-enterprise. The advocacy resources and experience of SPARC would serve for further strengthening the enabling environment and marshaling greater government involvement in reducing child labour through improved access to education and other services.

Annex 2- Draft National Education Policy 2008 Proposed Policy Actions Specific to Child Labour

National Education Policy Review

The Ministry of Education recently issued a Draft Education Policy following a review of the National Education Policy (1998-2010) to bring it in line with the devolution reforms, PRSP, Millennium Development Goals, Education for All and Medium Term Development Frame Work of Government of Pakistan. The policy review process was carried out in three stages which included diagnostic stage, perspective and policy development stage. Child labour concerns are reflected into the following recommendations for policy action¹⁵:

1. Government school will initiate non-Formal Education stream for child labourers (boys and girls) at flexible time, and submit annual report on their enrolment status.
2. A system shall be developed to mainstream the students in non-formal programmes between the ages of 11 and 16 into public education system, and a system of equivalence shall be developed to permit such mainstreaming. New literates shall receive formal certification so as to facilitate their entry into government schools.
3. Special literacy skills programmes shall target older child labourers (boys and girls 14-17), while ensuring their linkages with locally available vocational/skills training opportunities
4. Special educational stipends shall be introduced to rehabilitate child labourers
5. Arrangements shall be made to use school buildings for adult literacy after school hours

¹⁵ Draft National Education Policy 2008, 14 April 2008, Ministry of Education, Government of Pakistan

Annex 3 – Evaluation Schedule

List of Visits and Meetings of SDC/ILO Combating Child Labour Joint Evaluation Mission of Ms. Nina Louise Frankel and Mr. Fawad Usman Khan from 19th April to 6th May 2008

Date		Day/Time	Programs and Names of Persons met	Location	Position
19 th	April	Sat; 0910	Travel for Ms. Nina Louise Frankel from Doha Qatar ; Travel for Mr. Fawad Usman Khan from Lahore		
19 th	April	Sat; 1445	Arrival in Islamabad	Islamabad	
21 st	April	Mon	Meetings in SDC office and ILO Area Office in Islamabad	Islamabad	
		0900-1000	Meeting in Area-ILO office with Mr. Sujeewa Fonseka and Mr. Khalid Hassan,	Islamabad	Chief Technical Advisor, CTA of ILO-TBP Program Pakistan and Project Manager, ILO/CCLET Project
		1000-1100	Meeting with Mr. Donglin Li, Director Area office Islamabad	Islamabad	Director Area office Islamabad
		1130-1230	Meeting with Ministry of Labour, Islamabad	Islamabad	Ministry of Labour, Islamabad
		1400-1500	Meeting in SDC office with Ms. Nicole Ruder and Ms. Kaneez Fatima M. Kassim	Islamabad	Deputy Country Director, Senior Program Manager
22 nd	April	Tue	Travel to Peshawar/ ILO/CCL Meetings/Briefing/Introduction to Partners		
		0630-0930	Travel to Peshawar		
		1000-1130	Briefing and Introduction to Implementing Partners & Project Presentation	CCLET Office	All Representative s of all Impl. Partners (SDC & DANIDA)
		1130-1230	Discussion with Partners	CCLET Office	All Representative s of all Impl. Partners (SDC & DANIDA)
		1330-1430	Lunch Break	CCLET Office	
		1530-1700	Field visit of CLSTA Hayatabad Peshawar	CLSTA	Training Coordinators

					SDC and DANIDA
			Night in Peshawar	Peshawar	
23 rd	April	Wed	Field visits to MPCs (DLG & PPA)	Nowshera	
		0800	Travel to Nowshera	Now	
		0900-1000	Visit to working children MPC, PPA	Now	Field Coordinator, Teachers
		1100-1200	Visit to community MPC, DLG	Now	Field Coordinator, Teachers
		1200-1300	Community Meeting (Female)	Now	Community members
		1300-1400	Visit to the Out-Reach Centre Shereen Kotey , DTE&MT	Now	Training Supervisor Instructors
		1430-1530	Lunch Break		
		1600-1700	Visit of Afternoon Schools		Teachers
		1800	Travel back to Peshawar		
			Night in Peshawar	Peshawar	
24 th	April	Thurs	Field visits to MPCs and meeting with PPA & DLG team	Peshawar	
		0900-0945	Visit to working children MPC , PPA	Peshawar	Field Coordinator, Teachers
		1000-1100	Visit to community MPC, PPA	Peshawar	Field Coordinator, Teachers
		1130-1200	Visit to working children MPC , DLG	Peshawar	Field Coordinator, Teachers
		1230-1330	Meeting with Dr. Tufail Muhammad Khan & PPA Staff	Peshawar	Project Director PPA
		1530-1630	Meeting with Ms. Meraj Humayun Khan & DLG Staff	Peshawar	Chief Executive Officer of DLG
			Night in Peshawar	Peshawar	
25 th	April	Fri	Field visit of Teachers Training of MPCs Teachers and Meeting with PITE and DICL Team	Peshawar	
		0900-1000	Field visit of Teachers Training of MPCs Teachers in PITE	PITE	
		1000-1100	Meeting with Mr. Eid Badshah and PITE Team	PITE	Director, Provincail Institute for Teachers Training (PITE) GoNWFP and PITE Team

		1130-1230	Meeting with Sectary Labour along with Mr. Khalid Jan, Director Labour and Mr. Zahoor Khan In-charge Child Labour Unit	DICL office	Secretary Labour GoNWFP, Director, DICL and Deputy Director, DICL / in-charge Child Labour Unit
26 th	April	Sat	Field visits of Awareness raising Programme and Meeting with DANIDA Partners NGOs	Peshawar	
		0900-0945	Field visit of Training on Child Labour – An- Information Kit (Female)	Peshawar	Master Trainers of Directorate of Schools and Literacy GoNWFP
		1000-1045	Field visit of Training on SCREAM (Male)	Peshawar	Master Trainers of Directorate of Schools and Literacy GoNWFP
		1100-1200	Meeting with Ms. Sarwat Jehan, Director, Directorate of Schools and Literacy GoNWFP	DS&L office	Director, Directorate of Schools and Literacy GoNWFP
		1230-1330	Field visit of Training on National & international Laws and CL Issues (Male & Female) and Meeting with Mr. Gul Rehman, President Mutahida Labour Federation	Peshawar	Master Trainers of Trade Union, President Mutahida Labour Federation
		1400-1500	Lunch Break		
		1500-1600	Meeting with Mr. Ali Akbar, Project Manager, JCDS (DANIDA NGOs component)		Project Manager, Jobs Creating and Development Society (JCDS)
		1600-1700	Meeting with Mr. Sher Muhammad, Project Manager, Paradise (DANIDA NGOs component)		Project Manager, Paradise Environmental and Community Welfare Organization (Paradise)
			Night in Peshawar	Peshawar	
27 th	April	Sun	Exchange among consultant	Peshawar	
28 th	April	Mon	Preparation of Aid Memoire /Preparation for stack holders workshop	Peshawar	

		0900-1200	Field visit and meeting (if desired)		
		1300-1400	Lunch Break		
		1430-1630	Preparation of Aid Memoire /Preparation for stakeholders workshop		
			Night in Peshawar	Peshawar	
29 th	April	Tue	De-briefing & Stakeholders' Workshop	Peshawar	
		0900-1230	Stakeholders' Workshop	PC	Representative s of all Implementing Partners and Staff (SDC & DANIDA)
		1230-1330	Lunch		
		1430-1600	Debriefing with SDC/ ILO-IPEC, ILO-CCLET	Peshawar	
		1630	Travel to Islamabad	Islamabad	
30 th April to 5 th May	April to May		Discussion/Writing - Consultants	Islamabad	
6 th	May	Tues	Travel to Geneva	Geneva	
			Submission of Draft Report to HQ	Geneva	
			Debriefing of Report to SDC HQ and ILO HQ		
			Finalization of report after receiving comments from stakeholders		

Annex 4 – List of Contacts and Meetings

ILO-IPEC Project Evaluation Mission Meetings and Contacts Combating Child Labour through Education and Training¹⁶ Apr-08

S.No	Organization/ Department/ Venue	Date	Name	Gender	Designation
1	ILO-IPEC	21 April	Khalid Hassan	M	CCLET Project Manager
2	ILO	21 April	Dong Lin Li	M	ILO-Pakistan Country Director
3	ILO-IPEC	21 April	Sujeewa Fonsekha	M	CTA-ILO IPEC TBP
4	SDC	21 April	Kaneez Fatima Muhammad Kassim	F	Senior Programme Officer
5	CRAC-PPA, ILO Office /Peshawar	22 nd , April	Shah Fahad	M	Project manager
6	CRAC-PPA	22 nd , April	Muhammad Basharat	M	Field Coordinator
7	Paradise NGO	22 nd , April	Sher Muhammad	M	Project Manager
8	JCDS NGO	22 nd , April	Ali Akbar	M	Project Manager
9	DTE&MT	22 nd , April	Khola Gul	F	Training Coordinator
10	P.I.T.E	22 nd , April	Eid Badshah	M	Director
11	DTE&MT	22 nd , April	Iqbal Ahmad	M	Dpty Director Technical Education &Manpower
12	CRAC_PPA	22 nd , April	Dr.Tufal Muhammad	M	Chairman
13	De Laas Gul NGO	22 nd , April	Meraj .N.Khan	F	Chief Executive
14	De Laas Gul NGO	22 nd , April	Huma Gul	F	Project Manager
15	WERWS /MLF	22 nd , April	Jehangir Shah	M	Monitoring /PCSIR
16	WERWS/MLF	22 nd , April	S.Liaqat Badshah	M	Chief Coordinator (WERWS)
17	D.I.C.L	22 nd , April	Muhammad L. Khan	M	Field Coordinator

18	Directorate of School and Literacy	22 nd , April	Sarwat Jehan	F	Director
19	European Commission	22 nd , April	Charlotte Blomhammer	F	Programme officer
20	ILO-IPEC	22 nd , April	Waheed Shahzad	M	Database & Monitoring Assistant
21	JCDS NGO	22 nd , April	Ghazala	F	Field Coordinator, JCDS
22	ILO/IPEC	22 nd , April	Salma Gul	F	Program Assistant
23	ILO/IPEC	22 nd , April	Ahmed Jan	M	Monitor
24	ILO/IPEC	22 nd , April	Bilal Ahmad	M	Monitoring Assistant
25	DTEMT Peshawar	22 nd , April	Iqbal Ahmad	M	Deputy director Technical Education & Manpower
26	DTEMT Peshawar	22 nd , April	Munir Gul	M	Assistant director (Apprenticeship Trainng)
27	DTEMT Peshawar	22 nd , April	Khola Gul	F	Training Coordinator (DANIDA)
28	DTEMT Peshawar	22 nd , April	Raana Azam	F	Training Coordinator (SDC)
29	DTEMT Peshawar	22 nd , April	Hassan Din	M	Admin & Finance officer
30	CLSTA	22 nd , April	Sonya	F	supervisor/Instructor
31	MPC 14-15 (De Laas Gul) (Shabara)	23rd April	Muhamad Akbar	M	Teacher
32	MPC 14-15 (De Laas Gul) (Parao Korona)	23rd April	Huma Gul	F	Field Coordinator
33	MPC 14-15 (De Laas Gul) (Parao Korona)	23rd April	Nasreen	F	Senior Teacher
34	MPC 14-15 (De Laas Gul) (Parao Korona)	23rd April	Saima	F	Teacher
35	MPC 14-15 (De Laas Gul) (Parao Korona)	23rd April	Saeeda	F	Teacher
36	MPC 14-15 (De Laas Gul) (Parao Korona)	23rd April	Rahat	F	Teacher
37	Outreach training center Sheeren Kotay (CLSTA)	23rd April	Iqbal Ahmad	M	Deputy director Technical Education & Manpower
38	Outreach training center Sheeren Kotay (CLSTA)	24th April	Raana Azam	F	Training Coordinator (SDC)
39	JICA model school (Evening school)	23rd April	Shaheen	F	Teacher
40	JICA model school (Evening school)	23rd April	Shabana	F	Teacher
41	JICA model school (Evening school)	23rd April	Nadia	F	Principal
42	MPC N0 6(PPA) Scheme Chowk	24th April	Anwar	M	Shopkeeper

43	MPC N0 6(PPA) Scheme Chowk	24th April	Shahzad	M	Mechanic
44	MPC N0 6(PPA) Scheme Chowk	24th April	Nazar Muhammad	M	Driver/Parent
45	MPC N0 6(PPA) Scheme Chowk	24th April	Ali Akbar	M	Electrician
46	MPC N0 6(PPA) Scheme Chowk	24th April	Muhammad Naseer	M	Welder
47	MPC N0 6(PPA) Scheme Chowk	24th April	Muhammad Idrees	M	Senior teacher
48	MPC N0 6(PPA) Scheme Chowk	24th April	Abdul Latif	M	Chairman Committee/ Shopkeeper
49	MPC N0 6(PPA) Scheme Chowk	24th April	Muhammad Ibrahim	M	Mechanic
50	MPC N0 6(PPA) Scheme Chowk	24th April	Yousaf	M	Driver
51	MPC N0 6(PPA) Scheme Chowk	24th April	Mukhtiar	M	Barber
52	MPC N0 6(PPA) Scheme Chowk	24th April	Kifayatullah	M	Medical Practitioner
53	MPC N0 6(PPA) Scheme Chowk	24th April	Muhammad Ismail	M	Teacher
54	MPC N0 6(PPA) Scheme Chowk	24th April	Saleem Muhammad	M	Automechanic
55	MPC N0 6(PPA) Scheme Chowk	24th April	Akhtar Ali	M	Teacher
56	MPC N0 6(PPA) Scheme Chowk	24th April	Lal Muhammad	M	Welder
57	MPC No 13 (DLG)	24th April	Fatima	F	Student
58	MPC No 13 (DLG)	24th April	Zakia	F	Student
59	Amin Hotel Peshawar/ Training on OSH	24th April	Jehangir Shah	M	Scientific officer (PCSIR)/ Trainer
60	Amin Hotel Peshawar/ Training on OSH	24th April	Syed Liaqat Ali	M	VP of Mutahidda Labour Fed of Pakistan
61	Pakistan Paediatric Association (PPA)	24th April	Muhammad Kamran	M	Finance Assistant
62	Pakistan Paediatric Association (PPA)	24th April	Mohsin Rafiq	M	Admin Assistant
63	Pakistan Paediatric Association (PPA)	24th April	Shah Fahad	M	Project manager
64	Pakistan Paediatric Association (PPA)	24th April	Muhammad Basharat	M	Field Coordinator
65	Pakistan Paediatric Association (PPA)	24th April	Amna Noreen	F	Field Coordinator
66	Pakistan Paediatric Association (PPA)	24th April	Dr.Tufail Muhammad	M	Chairman (CRAC-PPA)
67	De Laas Gul (NGO)	24th April	Miraj Hamayun	F	Chief Executive
68	De Laas Gul (NGO)	24th April	Huma Gul	F	Project manager
69	De Laas Gul (NGO)	24th April	Ghulam Mohammad	M	Cluster Coordinator
70	De Laas Gul (NGO)	24th April	Sheeren	F	Administrator
71	De Laas Gul (NGO)	24th April	Mureed Khan	M	Programme Director/ Finance
72	De Laas Gul (NGO)	24th April	Shahab-u-din	M	Data base Assistant

73	De Laas Gul (NGO)	24th April	Muhammad Ali	M	Office Incharge (Mansehra Office)
74	De Laas Gul (NGO)	24th April	Zaffar Ali	M	Field Coordinator
75	De Laas Gul (NGO)	24th April	Khalid Mehmood	M	Project Coordinator
76	DICL-NWFP	25th April	Shah Wali Khan	M	Secretary Labour, Govt. Of NWFP, Pakistan
77	DICL-NWFP	25th April	Khalid Jan	M	Director Labour
78	DICL-NWFP	25th April	Zahoor Khan	M	Deputy Director/Incharge Labour Unit
79	DICL-NWFP	25th April	Farzand Ali	M	Statistical Investigator
80	Provincial Institute for Teacher Education (PITE)	25th April	Eid Badshah	M	Director PITE
81	Provincial Institute for Teacher Education (PITE)	25th April	Aarif Ali Khan	M	Deputy Director
82	Provincial Institute for Teacher Education (PITE)	25th April	Subhan-u-din	M	Instructor PITE (ILO Focal person)
83	PITE (Teachers training of MPCs Teachers)	25th April	Group of Teachers	F	Teachers
84	Govt School Chughal Pura/ Training on child Labour for Female Teachers	26th April	Group of Teachers	F	Teachers
85	Govt School Chughal Pura/ Training on SCREAM for Male Teachers	26th April	Hamid Mehmood	M	Assistant District Officer (circle) Schools & Literacy
86	Govt School Chughal Pura/ Training on SCREAM for Male Teachers	26th April	Muhammad Ayaz	M	ADO
87	Govt School Chughal Pura/ Training on SCREAM for Male Teachers	26th April	Bakhtiar Khan	M	Head Master
88	Directorate of School and Literacy, Peshawar	26th April	Sarwat Jehan	F	Director, Directorate of Schools & Literacy NWFP
89	Directorate of School and Literacy, Peshawar	26th April	Rahimullah	M	Admin & Finance Assistant
90	Jobs Creating & Development Society NGO (ILO Office, Peshawar)	26th April	Asif Ali Shah	M	Vice president, JCDS
91	Jobs Creating & Development Society NGO (ILO Office, Peshawar)	26th April	Tanvir	M	Data Coordinator
92	Jobs Creating & Development Society NGO (ILO Office, Peshawar)	26th April	Riaz Badshah	M	Field Coordinator
93	Jobs Creating & Development Society NGO (ILO Office, Peshawar)	26th April	Muradullah	M	Finance secretary
94	Jobs Creating & Development Society NGO (ILO Office, Peshawar)	26th April	Bakht Bahadar	M	Admin account assistant

95	Jobs Creating & Development Society NGO (ILO Office, Peshawar)	26th April	Farmanullah	M	Genrral secretary
96	Jobs Creating & Development Society NGO (ILO Office, Peshawar)	26th April	Salma Gul	F	Joint secretary
97	Jobs Creating & Development Society NGO (ILO Office, Peshawar)	26th April	Ghazala	F	Field Coordinator
98	Jobs Creating & Development Society NGO (ILO Office, Peshawar)	26th April	Ali Akbar	M	Project Manager, (President)JCDS
99	Paradise Environment and Community welfare Organization (ILO Office)	26th April	Waqar-u-nisa	F	Admin & Finance officer
100	Paradise Environment and Community welfare Organization (ILO Office)	26th April	Zill-e-Huma	F	Accounts Asistant
101	Paradise Environment and Community welfare Organization (ILO Office)	26th April	Sher Muhammad	M	Project Manager, Paradise
102	Paradise Environment and Community welfare Organization (ILO Office)	26th April	Shakila	F	Data Coordinator

Annex 5 – Targeted Outputs Vs Achievements (SDC Component) Note: All these achievements are as of March 2008.						
S.No	Action Programme, Implementing Agency, Duration	Achievements as per I/A reports and as per CCL-Databank			Achievements reported by Project	Est completion by project end
		Immediate Objectives and Planned Outputs (number wise)	Targets	Achievements		
1	Prevention, Withdrawal and Rehab of Children PPA+DLG May 2007 to Dec 2008	I/O 2: Quality edu to working children and their siblings.				
		OP 2.7: MPC	40	38	95%	
		OP 2.8: Children in MPC	3000	3306	110%	
		OP 2.9: Children on Counselling	3000	3306	110%	
		OP2.10: Children Mainstreamed	750	290	39%	Est 75%
		OP2.11: Primary Health	3000	3306	110%	
		I/O 3: Skill trg for children				
		OP 3.1: Pre-voc training	500	416	83%	
		OP 3.2: Voc training	400	114	29%	Est 70%
		OP 3.3: Mothers Training	300	89	30%	Est 60%
		OP 3.4: Children provided with Voc Guidance/Career Counseling	900	530	59%	Est 90%
		OP 3.5: Children/parents on Basic Business Skills	1000	530	53%	Est 80%
		OP 3.6: Community based Service Outlets established.	10	2	20%	Est 60%
		I/O 4: Right holders/duty bears have enhanced understanding				
OP 4.1: MPCMC	40	38	95%			
OP 4.2: MPC into CCBs	0	1	Add'l Output			
3	Teachers Trg Prog in the Project MPCs - PITE Oct 2007 to Apr 2008	I/O 2: Provide quality education to working children				
		OP 2.3: Tchrs & supervisors trained to implement curriculum	80	92	115%	
4	Mobilize Prim Schl Tchrs & PTAs etc to CCL Directorate of Schools & Literacy May 2007 to Dec 2008	I/O 3: Right holders/duty bears have enhanced understanding				
		OP 2.2: Master Trainers trained.	20	20	100%	
		OP 2.4: Prim schl tchrs trained on Tchrs Info Kit	3000	244	8%	Est 60%
		OP 2.5: School teachers trained in SCREAM.	500	112	22%	Est 70%
		OP 2.6: PTA trained in CL issues.	1000	-	0%	Est 25%
		I/O 3: Provision of quality edu to working children				
		OP 3.1: Afternoon Schools introduced in formal schools.	16	16	100%	
5	Mobilize LEA, workers employers orgs to promote enforcement of child labour laws. DICL & Worker Edu Research & Welfare Society May 2007 to Dec 2008	I/O 3: Right holders/duty bears have enhanced understanding				
		OP 2.2: Master Trainers trained.	10	10	100%	
		OP 2.3: Trg for workers, employers, NGOs Staff, govt officials (Labour inspectors, Police, and social welfare officials).	400 on Laws, 400 on OSH, 400 on First Aid	313 on Laws, 326 on OSH and 22 on First Aid	Est 60%	Est 100%

Annex 6--Targeted Outputs Vs Achievements (DANIDA Component) Note: All these achievements are as of March 2008.							
S.No	Action Programme, Implementing Agency, Duration	Achievements as per I/A reports and as per CCL-Databank			Achievements reported by Project	Est completion by project end	
		Immediate Objectives and Planned Outputs (number wise)	Targets	Achievements			
1	Prevention, Withdrawal and Rehab of Children JCDS+PARADISE May 2007 to Dec 2008	I/O 2: Provision of quality edu to working children					
		OP 2.7: MPC		31	31	100%	
		OP 2.8: Children in MPC		2000	2996	150%	
		OP 2.9: Children on Counselling		2000	2996	150%	
		OP2.10: Children Mainstreamed		500	471	94%	
		OP2.11: Primary Health		2000	2996	150%	
		I/O 3: Skill trg for children					
		OP 3.1: Pre-voc training		950	1062	112%	
		OP 3.2: Voc training		750	610	81%	
		OP 3.3: Mothers Training		200	166	83%	
		OP 3.4: Children provided with Voc Guidance/Career Counseling		1700	1672	98%	
		OP 3.5: Children/parents on Basic Business Skills		950	776	82%	
		OP 3.6: Community based Service Outlets established.		6	6	100%	
		I/O 4: Right holders/duty bears have enhanced understanding					
OP 4.1: MPCMC		31	31	100%			
OP 4.2: MPC into CCBs		0	4	Add'l Output			
2	PITE, Develop and Implement Tchr Trg Prog in MPCs - PITE, Oct 2007 to Apr 2008	I/O 2: Provision of quality edu to working children					
		OP 2.3: Tchrs & supervisors trained to implement curriculum		62	62	100%	
3	DS&L, Mobilize Prim Schl Tchrs & PTAs to CCL DSL May 2007 to Dec 2008	I/O 2: Right holders/duty bears have enhanced understanding					
		OP 2.2: Master Trainers trained.		8	8	100%	
		OP 2.4: Prim schl tchrs trained on Tchr Info Kit		2160	1793	83%	
		OP 2.5: School teachers trained in SCREAM.		300	135	45%	Est 70%
		OP 2.6: PTA trained in CL issues.		250	-	0%	Est 25%
		I/O 3: Provision of quality edu to working children					
OP 3.1: Afternoon Schools introduced in formal schools.		8	3	38%	Est 50%		
4	DIDL & WERWS, Mobilize LEA, workers and employers orgs to promote enforcement of child labour laws. DIDL & Worker Education Research and Welfare Society May 2007 to Dec 2008	I/O 2: Right holders/duty bears have enhanced understanding					
		OP 2.2: Master Trainers trained.		10	10	100%	
		Output 2.3: Trg for workers, employers, NGO Staff and relevant govt officials (Labour inspectors, Police, and social welfare officials).		600 laws, 600 OSH and 300 First Aids	645 laws, 606 OSH and 90 First Aids	Est 85%	

Annex 7- SDC Action Programmes

Action Programme	Achievements as per I/A report or statements made by I/A		Achievements as per project management (Comments, additions)	Comments/ Oobservations by evaluation team	Proposed follow-up/ Next steps
	Target Groups	Other Qualitative			
Developing and Implementing Teachers Training Programme in Project Rehabilitation Centers- Provincial Institute for Teachers' Education (PITE), NWFP	92 RC teachers and supervisory staff trained.				
Strengthening Provincial Government Capacity to Address Child Labour through Policy and Institutional Development-Directorate of Industries, Commerce and Labour, NWFP	CLU established; GoNWFP provided funds for child labour survey and motorcycles for inspectors		Institution capacity building difficult to achieve in short term and against backdrop of political flux	Unit still understaffed, institutional assessment pending, no operational plan in place, survey pending	Continue support and advocacy
Mobilizing Primary School Teachers and Parents Teachers Associations (PTAs), Young People to Combat Child Labour-Directorate of Schools and Literacy, NWFP	16/16 afternoon schools in formal schools , 20/20 Master Trainers trained, 244/3000 teachers trained in CL Info Kit, 112/500 teachers trained in SCREAM		Printing of kits and disruption caused by 2008 elections delayed start of training. Project likely to be able to make up most of achievement gap by end of 2008		
Mobilizing Law Enforcement Agencies, Workers and Employers Organization to Promote Enforcement of Child Labour Laws-Directorate of Industries, Commerce and Labour, NWFP, Worker Education Research and Welfare Society	10 Master Trainers trained, 313/400 trained in CL Law, 326/400 trained on OSH, 22/400 trained in First Aid				
Development Training and Implementation of Skills Training Programme-Directorate of Technical Education and Manpower Training, NWFP	416/500 children enrolled in pre-voc training, 114/400/voc training; 89/300 mothers received skills training; 2 Service Outlets established				
Prevention, Withdrawal and Rehabilitation of Children Working in Auto, Furniture, in the Streets and their Siblings-Child Rights and Abuse Committee, Pakistan Pediatric Association (CRAC-PPA)	18/20 MPCs established, 1695/1500 children enrolled in NFE, 208/375 mainstreamed 1 MPC MC converted to CCB			Project evaluated in middle of school year; Decisions for mainstreaming made in May and October	
Prevention, Withdrawal and Rehabilitation of Children Working in Auto, Furniture, in the Streets and their Siblings, De Laas Gul Welfare Programme (DLG)	18/20 MPCs established, 1611/1500 children enrolled in NFE, 82/375 mainstreamed			Project evaluated in middle of school year; Decisions for mainstreaming made in May and October	

Annex 8 - DANIDA Action Programmes

Action Programme	Achievements as per I/A report or statements made by I/A		Achievements as per project management (Comments, additions)	Comments/observations by evaluation team	Proposed follow-up/ Next steps
	Target Groups	Other Qualitative			
Developing and Implementing Teachers Training Programme in Project Rehabilitation Centers-Provincial Institute for Teachers' Education (PITE), NWFP	74 teachers and supervisory staff trained.				
Strengthening Provincial Government Capacity to Address Child Labour through Policy and Institutional Development-Directorate of Industries, Commerce and Labour, NWFP	CLU established; GoNWFP provided funds for child labour survey and motorcycles for inspectors		Institution capacity building difficult to achieve in short term and against backdrop of political flux	Unit still understaffed, institutional assessment pending, no operational plan in place, survey pending	Continue support and advocacy
Mobilizing Primary School Teachers and Parents Teachers Associations (PTAs), Young People to Combat Child Labour-Directorate of Schools and Literacy, NWFP	3/8 afternoon schools in formal schools. 8 Master Trainers trained who trained 1793/2160 teachers trained in CL Info Kit 135/300 teachers trained in SCREAM, 250 PTA members trained in CL		Electoral disruption and security constraints affected project momentum.		Follow up to see if training is being implemented in classroom
Mobilizing Law Enforcement Agencies, Workers and Employers Organization to Promote Enforcement of Child Labour Laws-Directorate of Industries, Commerce and Labour, NWFP, Worker Education Research and Welfare Society	10 master trainers trained 606 trained OSH, 645 trained in CL law, 90 trained in First Aid				
Development Testing and Implementation of Skills Training Programme-Directorate of Technical Education and Manpower Training, NWFP	1672 children enrolled in pre-voc/voc training; 166 mothers received skills training		1672 children enrolled in pre-voc/voc training; 166 mothers received skills training		
Prevention, Withdrawal and Rehabilitation of Working Children and Their Siblings-Jobs Creating Development Society-Lower Dir	17 MPCs established, 1470/1000 children enrolled in NFE, 196/250 mainstreamed, 3 MPC MCs converted to CCBs		17 MPCs established, 1558/1000 children enrolled in NFE, 197/250 mainstreamed into formal education system; 1 MPC MC converted to CCB	Project evaluated in middle of school year; Decisions for mainstreaming made in May and October. very conservative area. IP has been able to marshal outside additional funding based on success of project-supported models.	

<p>Prevention, Withdrawal and Rehabilitation of Working Children and Their Siblings-Paradise Environmental and Community Welfare Society-Swat</p>	<p>14 RCs established, 1438/1000 children enrolled in RCs, 274/250 mainstreamed into formal education system</p>			<p>IP arranged with local government for certification of qualified students to expedite mainstreaming; Linkages established with local philanthropist and ZAKAT committee to provide uniform assistance helped maintain high attendance rates. IPEC project management not able to visit site since Oct 2007 due to security problems</p>	
---	--	--	--	--	--

Annex 9 - SDC Aide Memoire

Aide Memoire
ILO-IPEC Combating Child Labour Through Education and Training Project
Nina Louise Frankel and Fawad Usman Khan
April 2008

Context

A final independent evaluation of the joint SDC-DANIDA supported ILO-IPEC Combating Child Labour Through Education and Training Project (CCLET) was conducted in April 2008 to provide guidance to SDC in planning its next Children's Programme. The SDC funding and implementation cycle of the project comprised three phases. Phase I initiated in 1998 and was evaluated in 2001; Phase II started in 2003, and was evaluated in 2006. It was during this period that the DANIDA-supported component was added. Although this evaluation encompassed the project since its inception, the primary focus was on Phase III, programmed from October 2007-December 2008 and on the DANIDA project cycle. It should be noted that the timing of the evaluation was premature to gauge the degree to which the project had implemented all the prescribed activities for Phase III. The evaluation methodology included document review (albeit time for this was extremely limited), field visits and interviews and focus group discussions with stakeholders and beneficiaries at all levels of the project. Due to security constraints, the team was able to observe project activities of partners working in Peshawar and Nowshera only, and thus not able to visit any DANIDA project sites.

The objective of the CCLET project is to gradually eliminate child labour practices in Pakistan's NWFP in line with internationally agreed standards through strengthening the capacity of government entities, civil society and trade unions to combat child labour in four districts of NWFP and providing direct services, principally better access to education and skills training to children at risk and their family members. At the time of the evaluation, the SDC-supported component comprised of three sub-programmes:

- Policy and Institutional Development;
- Promoting Social Mobilization and Strengthening the Enabling Environment
- Provision of Social Services

DANIDA-supported activities similarly focus on direct service delivery and social mobilization to improve access to alternatives to child labour and increase overall awareness of the issue among concerned parties at all relevant levels. Both projects target as direct beneficiaries relevant government institutions, worker and employer organizations, parents, teachers and community members (duty bearers) and working children and their siblings (rights holders) aged 6-16 vulnerable to hazardous work.

CCLET PROJECT DURATION AND BUDGET (\$US)

SDC			DANIDA		
Phase I	Sept 1998-Dec 2002	\$769,237			
Phase II	Jan 2003-Dec 2006	\$2,160, 829	Phase I	April	\$1,313,403
Phase III	Jan 2007-Dec 2008	\$1,533,743		2005-May 2008	
<i>Districts served: Peshawar, Nowshera, Mardan & Charsadda</i>			<i>Districts Served: Swat, Lower Dir</i>		

PRELIMINARY FINDINGS

Design

- The design for Phase III takes into account recommendations from the second project evaluation to focus more specifically on institutional capacity building, as reflected in Sub Programme I, Policy and Institution Building. The budget however does not reflect its priority stature and expecting that the project could achieve the outputs delineated under the Sub Programme over a two year period (which ultimately turned out to be less anyway because of contractual delays) was not realistic.
- In general, the relationship between objectives, outputs and activities is clearly defined in the LFA and given the multitude of issues that drive child labour; the multi-pronged strategy embedded in the original project document and expanded in subsequent phases is well conceived.
- The project design capitalizes on the respective strengths of all the partners to raise greater awareness of the issue to address some of the outstanding access barriers to education and skills training, and factors in sustainability through inputs to enhance partner capacity.
- The social constraints underlying gender disparities in education and the importance of positive discrimination in favor of girls are addressed in the project design.
- Changes in terminology over the course of the project seem to have created some confusion among stakeholders (and posed a challenge to the evaluation team!)
- Some of the log frame indicators are generalized and hard to measure. The log frame lacks means of verification to measure the impact of qualitative inputs. The sheer number of indicators is cumbersome, thereby imposing an undue data collection burden on partners. In the Project Document for Phase III, benchmark data and baseline years for comparing quantitative changes in some of the indicators are absent, although the Education Department reportedly maintains the relevant statistics.
- The project design is not fully in line with the ILO Tripartite model as the involvement of employers' associations is not clearly spelled out. Likely this reflects the high profile of the informal relative to the formal sector in NWFP in general and dearth of formalized industry in the specific project areas, such that involving them in this particular context may not have been realistic.¹⁷

Relevance

- The project addresses Millennium Development Goals 1, 2, 3, 6 and is line with Pakistan's Poverty Reduction Strategy. It is also supportive of the ILO-IPEC framework of support to the National Time Bound Programme and is assisting the Government of Pakistan to fulfill its commitments to national and international conventions on child rights and child protection.¹⁸
- The project's skills training component developed in conjunction with Department of Training and Manpower supports Pakistan's Vision for the National Skills Strategy 2008-2012. It is also in line with 2008 National Education Policy that promotes linkages between formal education with industry and internship programmes, and vocational skills training centers, and stipulates that Government schools initiate non-formal education stream for child labourers with flexible timings and need-based schedules, special literacy skills programmes for older child laborers and use of school buildings for adult literacy after school hours
- By providing children with learning opportunities, relief from work, recreational and social opportunities, that's to say, a chance to enjoy a childhood otherwise being denied, the project is fully in line with SDC's commitment to a Human Rights Based Approach to development.
- The 1996 survey found 3.3 million child labourers between 5-14 years old. Based on 2005 Labour Force survey, there are three million working children between 10-14 alone plus another four million in the same age group classified as 'idle', and therefore vulnerable to exploitation. As evidence suggests that child labour in Pakistan is on the rise, the project's relevance becomes ever more noteworthy.

Implementation

- Due to a late start up of Phase III as a result of contractual delays, as well as its short duration, not all project components for this phase are likely to be completed, nor all targets met. Consolidating the Child Labour Unit has proved especially challenging and is unlikely to be achieved before the end of the project because of the long term investment required for capacity building.
- Despite the truncated time period, security constraints and formidable challenges in the operating environment including political disruption, economic hardship and social rigidity, the project has been successful in achieving, and in some cases, exceeding, many of its direct service delivery targets for Phase III, and was successful in meeting most of its targets in previous phases.
- Between 2003-2004, the government of NWFP discontinued pre-service teacher training due to an excess of already trained teachers relative to schools. Consequently, the project target of training 500 pre-service teachers became inapplicable and the project was not able to find an alternative to this external challenge.
- The selection of locations for RCs/MPCs has been done on the basis of where implementing partners have identified high child labour density and already have an established presence. This has proved effective in marshaling community involvement in project activities and commitment to sustaining them.
- RCs are upholding Article 2 of the Childs Rights Convention prohibiting discrimination in providing services to both Pakistani and Afghan children at risk of child labour in those targeted communities. According to concerned authorities, Afghan children are eligible for mainstreaming into government schools, at least at the primary level. Language is not an issue as ethnically they are similar to local ethnic groups anyway, and many have either been born in Pakistan or have no intention of going back. Almost all the Afghan children in project areas communicate in Pushto and Urdu like their Pakistani counterparts. In either case, the project is helping to uphold their CRC right to education.
- According to one of the project's partners, the Education Department has expressed a willingness to take over some of the project MPCs, but the team was not able to verify this with the appropriate personnel. In fact, its frustrated efforts to do so highlighted some of the challenges in communication between and among government partners and the confusion in respective accountability that the project has had to contend with trying to mainstream its agenda. Frequent transfers of key government officials and the need to re-orient new officials have taken a toll on the pace of the project as well.
- It has proved more onerous and time consuming than anticipated to convert RC management committees into Citizen Community Boards (CCB), let alone mobilize funds. Mobilizing communities to get organized into a CCB, fulfilling the registration formalities, building up the CCB capacity to design project proposals and mobilizing local resources (20% equity) followed by advocacy with the district government to approve proposals and release funds to the CCB is a formidable challenge. Even once this is accomplished, the CCBs require further handholding to implement their projects in a transparent manner.
- Children interviewed report that project staff outreach efforts have helped to overcome parental reluctance to participate in project activities. The team had no opportunity to meet with children confined at home, but frequently was told in interviews that family resistance and traditional values continue to hinder access to education, especially for girls.
- Project-generated curriculum guidelines and complimentary teaching materials are serving to standardize non-formal education among the various implementing partners.
- The team observed a lack of clear criteria for mainstreaming children into government academic channels or directing them towards skills training. The team had no time to judge the quality of the education being provided. These criteria, however flexible, need to be clear to all implementers at various levels. It did come out in discussions at various levels that majority of the mainstreaming to government schools was done in Grade-3.

- The Project Review Committee has created a sense of solidarity among partners and seems to be serving as an effective forum for troubleshooting and sharing lessons learned. The team found that for the most part good coordination between stakeholders and a common understanding of project targets.
- The training materials on health/hygiene awareness with a focus on HIV/AIDS were prepared by UNICEF and the project collaborated with UNICEF to use the materials as part of its Life Skills programme component in MPCs. Use of UNICEF Life Skills materials in ILO trainings represents a small but significant collaborative opportunity for the next phase of SDC's support to vulnerable children. Since Pakistan is included among the pilot countries for implementing the UN Reforms Programme, the collaboration becomes all the more relevant and significant.
- The Department of Schools and Literacy has continued training teachers using ILO materials. According to one of the project's partners, the DSL has expressed a willingness to take over some of the project MPCs, but this could not be verified within the DSL itself.

Efficiency

- As a result of contractual delays, implementing partners had to use their own funds for four months to keep project activities afloat—testimony to their commitment to the project. In some cases, this required temporary downsizing of staff resources, but seems, for the most part, not to have seriously impeded project momentum or morale. However, it is important that donors are sensitive to how funding cycle demands and turnover play out in the field.
- Whilst the team observed a high level of cooperation, understanding and effective coordination between the ILO Project Office and its implementing partners, it gleaned less evidence of substantive interaction with other ongoing activities in the province to address child labour and child protection beyond use of some training materials developed outside of the project.
- A Child Labour Unit has been formally established in the Department of Labour; however, it has yet to be fully staffed or equipped. CCELET Project staff have made a concerted effort to jumpstart the institutional assessment to further the Unit's capacity, but have been able to make little headway due to institutional competing demands, lack of capacity and staff turnover.
- The project has developed a highly sophisticated (albeit user-friendly) comprehensive data base for Action Programme partners that over time has been decentralized and is being used for tracking project beneficiaries and building a broader knowledge base on child labour. More importantly, the database is being regularly updated and used to generate numbers and tables required for developing various project reports. Information reporting appears to be largely on schedule. Whether the level of detail of the data collected is really necessary was difficult to determine because of the strong sense of collective ownership that it has engendered among the partners.
- The abbreviated time framework for Phase III relative to the other phases unduly prejudices meeting a number of project objectives including those under the Policy and Institutional Development Sub Programme, and integration of RC Management Committees into Citizen Community Boards as well as for mainstreaming Phase III students from non-formal to formal government schools or other institutions, reaching vocational training targets and establishing community based skills outlets.

Effectiveness

- Project has helped sensitize DMTE staff in skills training centers to the specific needs of working children and to develop needs based training materials that give more emphasis to practical hand-on rather than theoretical learning, and is helping DMTE to think out of the box.
- Small business owners and workers who have received training in occupational safety and health report making changes in their workplaces and work habits to reduce risks for

children and others. Children enrolled in the MPCs report working fewer hours and being more aware of occupational hazards, as well as health and hygiene.

- The project has helped to empower women and bridge the gender gap through increasing their access to education and skills training, linking them with credit, promoting greater gender awareness and social mobilization and supporting the conversation of female management committees into Citizens Community Boards¹⁹.
- According to the tracer study, almost half of those beneficiaries interviewed reported an improvement in their families' income to varying extent as a result of their involvement with the project. This is significantly higher than what has been reported in similar projects in other parts of the country.
- The materials developed by the project in conjunction with different partners, the Teacher Information Kit, adaptation of SCREAM, the PITE training for MPC teachers and the Skills Training modules are being widely used and appreciated, and in some cases, replicated in six other ILO projects elsewhere in the country, but still remain to be formally mainstreamed.
- The team observed a few cases in which children are giving up immediate revenue generating activities in especially hazardous work such as scavenging to learn vocational skills, such as auto mechanics on the premise that in the long term, they will have greater growth and earning potential.
- Thanks to the flexible hours and the friendly environments offered at MPCs, working children, especially girls who would otherwise be confined at home, are able to take advantage of learning opportunities that hitherto did not exist, thereby contributing to improved self esteem, increased opportunities for generating income and attitudinal and behavioral changes.
- The capacity building of teachers in the formal educational sector through SCREAM training and the Teacher Information Kit is helping improve classroom conditions, including changing attitudes, if not always practices, towards corporal punishment. (The evaluation team was privy to an incident of corporal punishment at a school where a Teachers Information Kit training was taking place).
- It is not clear that standardized criteria for mainstreaming students from non formal to formal education are being used or that non-formal education includes functional literacy training. The team encountered some students who were attending pre-vocational and vocational training but were not literate at all, even though they were engaged (or had been in) in MPC activities.
- No formal mechanism appears to be in place either at the project or government level for following up on whether government teachers are actually using project-supported training in the classroom and the absence of baseline data in the indicators makes it difficult to ascertain the actual impact of the project on formal school enrolment and retention rates.

Linkages with Other ILO Projects

- The project master trainers (NWFP education department government officials) were assigned to conduct training for government school teachers in six districts located in all four provinces of Pakistan under the Government's National Time Bound Programme (and the Project of Support-ILO to the national TBP).
- ILO is planning a child labor project with EC. The planning teams visited the project and their design for the EC funded project is essentially based on the same framework and design as the CCL-ET.
- The project's successful demonstration of direct services and afternoon classes for child labor in government schools were included in the new Education Policy 2008. Project management participated in ILO countrywide consultations to formulate recommendations for the new Education Policy and successfully managed to advocate for these inclusions.
- The project management has been regularly meeting other ILO project managers in both formal and informal meetings for experience sharing.

Sustainability

- Government partners were enthusiastic about project materials and training methods and have shown a high degree of commitment to the project. The involvement of government partners in the development and adaptation of project training materials and use of government staff as master trainers/trainers has created a strong sense of ownership and commitment to continuing the project.
- Sales of goods produced and sold on site are contributing to cost recovery for the skills training center, and goods produced subsequently by participants are generating revenue for them, and a cost sharing programme has been worked out whereby former trainees can use center facilities and share the profits from sales of goods made. Although this is in the very nascent stage, it has the potential to create greater business acumen and self reliance among project beneficiaries, though at the same time, opens up the risk of local market saturation.
- The linkages of the different activities have strengthened collaboration between government and non-government players in NWFP and created a stronger lobby to advocate for elimination of child labour.
- Through providing awareness training on OSH and child labour, the project is opening opportunities for trade unions and worker associations to organize workers in the informal sectors to stand up for their rights in the long term.
- JCDS reported capitalizing on the NFE experience gained through the CCLET project to leverage resources for expanding their activities to additional localities.
- The project's successful experience in supporting non formal education and afternoon schools in NWFP has helped the ILO fulfill its mandate to get child labour concerns addressed at the national level. Following country-wide consultations which heralded the success of the CCLET projects and other NFE interventions, the Federal Government endorsed afternoon classes and non formal education for working children and for the first time ever, incorporated these concepts into the new draft National Education Policy 2008.
- The FATA Directorate of Education has expressed an interest in replicating project models for non formal education as part of a broader effort to combat child labour.
- It appears the skills training models have a potential to be picked up by the government and rolled out to additional sites. The previous government had accepted the concept and was in the process of including it in the annual budget, and seemingly the new government plans to follow suit. The decision about this will be made in May 2008 when the budget is finalized.
- Notwithstanding a high degree of government partner enthusiasm for the project's outputs and achievements, there is little evidence that substantive steps are being taken to ensure that the momentum will continue once the project cycle ends. Although the project has achieved written agreements with several government entities to take over some of the project components, it has had to contend with frequent staff transfers of key officials and inadequate communication between and among government counterparts.
- Despite the enthusiasm for the Teachers Training Information Kit, which has been a project output since early on, no concrete steps have yet been taken to incorporate it into pre-service teacher training.
- An exit strategy still remains to be fully articulated.

External Factors, Special Concerns and Causality

- The success of the NFE activities has created an unfortunate paradox in that many students and their families are reluctant to transition to government schools for fear that they will experience a drop in education quality and negative social and physical environment. (This phenomenon is not unique to CCLET schools, but highlights one of the unfortunate artifacts of the project approach in general.)
- The frequent transfer of government staff and lack of communication within and between government ministries has hampered project efforts to build capacity and move forward government ownership of project components.
- There does not seem to be a clear concept among implementing partners as to the definition of a working child or child labour and distinctions being made among children at risk as to whether they are "ILO children" or "government children" obfuscates the fact that all children are vulnerable to child labour.

- Political uncertainty has been a serious problem throughout most of Phase III, and from October 2007 to the end of March 2008, an interim government was in place and no real policy decisions were taken.
- The project is providing direct service to child labor employed in the informal sectors. Employers' associations in the formal sector are naturally not amongst the project partners. However a trade union partner is involved in awareness activities for workers and informal sector employers (such as auto workshop owners) and full implementation of the ILO tripartite principle will be visible once the informal sector is formalized.
- The CCBs are predicated on district devolution, which is far from a fait accompli. Currently it stands at risk of being dissolved by the new government which is unhappy about its implications for power and resource sharing. Should that occur, the CCBs established under the project, as well as the institution itself as a means of mobilizing government funds at the local level will be nullified.

OVERALL CONCLUSIONS

Policy and Institutional Development

- A marked change in commitment to addressing child labour has occurred over the project period. Government entities and policy frameworks are gradually taking child labour into consideration in planning and policy (afternoon schools, teachers training on CL and SCREAM and CL needs factored into new education policy); however due to resource constraints and a panoply of extenuating circumstances, operationalization of this growing commitment remains at a nascent stage.
- Child Labour cannot be eliminated through the project approach alone. It is critical that relevant government players have not only the political will, but also the resources and leverage to take action. In the absence of sustainable institutions, continued project efforts to reduce child labour will remain limited, and the long term effect of their interventions will be merely cosmetic.

Promoting Social Mobilization and Strengthening the Enabling Environment

- By developing innovative, replicable and culturally-sensitive models and materials to reduce child labour through social mobilization, awareness raising and direct service delivery, the project has made great headway in fostering a greater awareness of child labour and other occupational safety and social welfare issues among at the local, district, and provincial level. It has also significantly improved the knowledge base on child labour in the NWFP and enhanced both the enabling environment and capacity of duty bearers at all levels to take a more holistic approach to addressing the problem.

Provision of Social Services

- The project has been for the most part successful in reaching targets to divert children from child labour by enrolling them in non-formal education and providing them with viable skills training and formal education alternatives. It has also improved home and work environments through health education activities and family welfare by offering mothers skills training opportunities. Noteworthy has been its success in helping to bridge gender gaps in education arising from the infrastructural, cultural and human resource constraints compromising girls' access to schooling throughout Pakistan.
- Eliminating child labour in Pakistan requires addressing a broad range of external factors that drive it and hinder access to education, among them, entrenched gender disparities (such as purdah imperatives restricting the mobility of women and girls, early marriage, and the low premium placed on girl children), poverty, a shortage of functioning schools, especially for girls and large family size.

Lessons Learned

- Future initiatives must recognize the long term investment required to build institutional capacity.
- Involving stakeholders in the development of project materials and strategies imbues ownership.
- Sustainability mechanisms and exit strategies need to be better spelled out in project and programme designs
- Monitoring mechanisms should be factored into training inputs

Preliminary Recommendations

1. Continue efforts to strengthen the capacity of the Provincial Child Labour Cell to coordinate partners working on child labour and child protection and to mobilize resources for greater government ownership and scale up of project models and initiatives to address it.
 - An important starting point for the CLU would be to identify all child labor projects in the province and organize a conference for mapping the child labor initiatives.
 - Additionally the CLU could benefit from an overview and study of child labor monitoring systems established at six districts under the Government's National Time Bound Programme (through the Project of Support-ILO)
2. The project has working models in place that should be documented in a Good Practices manual form for marketing to government and non-government agencies within the province and throughout the country working on reducing child labour through education.
3. In any new phase, the project need not cover additional districts or establish new MPCs or skill training centers. A better strategy would be to consolidate and strengthen the existing models, and improve their quality and viability.
4. The ILO and other stakeholders working with vulnerable child populations must advocate at the national level with appropriate ministries/ departments/ institutions to:
5. Incorporate action on child labour into the National Poverty Reduction Strategy Paper
6. Implement the commitment to non-formal education, functional literacy and skills training for working children as spelled out in the new National Education Policy 2008.
7. Involve employer groups, or proxies if need be where formal industry is not present, to ensure that project activities are in line with the ILO tripartite principle.
8. Place technical advisors within relevant institutions to build the capacity of key government partners and to ensure implementation of those commitments made.
9. Incorporate training in motivation and social mobilization into project training outputs and awareness raising to strengthen provider and community capacity to overcome social and cultural constraints that continue to drive child labour and hinder children's access to education.
10. Students enrolled in government NFE activities should be offered the option of transitioning to skills training centers. The quality of government afternoon schools should be brought at par with the project's MPCs and use of government schools in afternoon hours should be extended to include literacy training for older child laborers as recommended in the new Education Policy 2008.
11. The project should advocate budget allocation for government afternoon schools for child labor.
12. Support provincial consultations and a participatory review of curricula to move forward adaptation and incorporation of the Teachers Information Kit on Child Labour and Child Rights and SCREAM training into Pre-Service teacher training.
13. Improve and standardize NFE syllabus and training program developed by PITE for government afternoon schools. The standardization will be useful for accrediting all NFE programs in the province and help in certification and transition to government schools. The project may seek partnership with UNESCO to provide another instance of inter-UN agency collaboration in Pakistan.
14. Coordinate with DICL to make children-specific skills training programs (pre vocational and vocational) a part of regular skill training offered by DMTE institutes throughout the province and encourage principals of vocational training institutes under the Directorate of

Manpower and Training to capitalize on the expansion of services and capacity gained through the project to reach more students.

15. Endeavor to ensure that future initiatives addressing child rights strengthen linkages with health and family planning awareness and services.
16. Organize a national level conference with both ILO and non-ILO implementing agencies across sectors on eliminating child labor in Peshawar for sharing lessons learned and good practices addressing the needs of children at risk

Annex 10 - SDC DAC Evaluation Abstract

DONOR	SDC
REPORT TITLE	Independent Final Evaluation of ILO-IPEC Combating Child Labour through Education and Training (CCLET)
SUBJECT NUMBER	leave blank; will be assigned by I/D - SDC
GEOGRAPHIC AREA	Pakistan
SECTOR	Child Labour, Child Rights, Human Rights
LANGUAGE	EN
DATE	2008-05
COLLATION	70 pages, 11 annexes
EVALUATION TYPE	Completion (Final) Evaluation of ILO-IPEC project to reduce child labour in Pakistan Effectiveness
STATUS	C
AUTHORS	Nina Louise Frankel and Fawad Usman Khan, Independent Consultants

SUBJECT DESCRIPTION:

Final evaluation of joint SDC-DANIDA initiative to combat child labour in Northwest Frontier Province in Pakistan through improved access to education, social mobilization, strengthening of the enabling environment and policy and institutional development.

EVALUATION METHODOLOGY:

The purpose of the evaluation was to evaluate both the SDC and DANIDA supported components of the project, with a focus on their achievements and contribution to national and provincial efforts to achieve the elimination of the Worst Forms of Child Labour, especially within the context of the national Time Bound Programme framework.

The scope of the evaluation included all SDC and DANIDA project activities to date including Action Programmes (APs) and considered project design, relevance, effectiveness, lessons learned, good practices and recommendations. The primary focus of the SDC component was on Phase III as the previous phases had already been evaluated.

The evaluation team consisted of one international and one national consultant with an even gender balance. The methodology included document review, discussions with ILO-IPEC management in Islamabad, project staff in Peshawar, and implementing partners including government officials. The team held individual and focused group discussions with teachers and children at MPCs and government schools and vocational training facility, project management committees and beneficiaries of the various awareness raising and skills training activities, including employers and community members. Group discussions and individual interviews were also held with participants of trainings on the SCREAM, Teacher Training Kit and an employers awareness session on occupational health and safety. Due to security considerations, time in the field was very limited and the team was able to visit project sites in Peshawar and Noshwera only. Briefings were held before and after the field visits with SDC in Islamabad to discuss SDC-specific concerns. Preliminary findings of the

evaluation were presented at a stakeholders meeting in Peshawar. At that time, the team had the opportunity to present the project to the newly appointed Minister of Education for the province.

MAJOR FINDINGS:

Design

Both projects propose a logical matrix of outputs to achieve stated objectives and take into account gender and cultural challenges. The successful replication of the DANIDA project affirms that the basic SDC project design was sound and applicable to different parts of the province. The projects bring together a broad constituency of partners and capitalize on their respective strengths, but fall short in institutionalizing their interventions.

Relevance

Both projects are highly relevant in dovetailing with the strategic direction of the ILO-IPEC Time Bound Programme and in supporting national and provincial strategies and action plans to combat child labour and improve access to education. They bring together a broad constituency, thereby, providing leadership in addressing child labour as a cross cutting problem and are in harmony with ILO's commitment to Decent Work for All.

Implementation

Both projects capitalize on the comparative advantage of the different partners involved and sequence activities logically. They have been able to maintain a forward momentum and work within the budget, although the truncated time period for Phase III may preclude full achievement of all output targets. The strong community ties and commitment they have engendered have helped weather external security and political challenges. The inclusion of Afghan children in target groups stands as testimony to a commitment to non-discrimination. The relationships the project partnership has cultivated with provincial authorities portends well for future capacity building interventions. The database developed is a valuable management and planning tool. Coordination is strong at the field level and communication smooth between the project partnership and the IPEC Office in Islamabad.

Effectiveness

The projects' awareness activities have been highly effective in enhancing understanding of child labour across the board. They are helping women have a greater say in their children's future and be more empowered over their own lives. The project's NFE and skills training models have served to inform policy makers. The concept of afternoon schools and skills training for younger ages now feature in the new Draft Education Policy. The major responsibility for preventing child labour still remains with parents, as the macro level interventions have yet to be institutionalized.

Sustainability

The projects have created a rich legacy including opening educational opportunities to working children, marshaling broad-based constituencies at different levels, and indirectly influencing policy makers to take action against child labor. Notwithstanding a high degree of government partner enthusiasm for the project's outputs and achievements, substantive steps have yet to be taken to ensure that the momentum will continue once the project cycle ends.

LESSONS LEARNED:

Future initiatives must recognize the long term investment required to build institutional capacity.

Involving local stakeholders and government departments in the development of project materials and strategies imbues ownership.

The key to developing an inter-dependency between government departments, NGOs and social partners is selecting the right partners and creating an environment of trust among them.

Sustainability mechanisms and exit strategies need to be better spelled out in project and programme designs.

Monitoring mechanisms should be factored into training inputs.

Annex 11 - Independent Evaluation Terms of Reference
INTERNATIONAL PROGRAM ON THE ELIMINATION OF CHILD LABOR

TERMS OF REFERENCE
Independent Final Evaluation
(April 2008)

Final Version
April 9, 2008

Combating Child Labour through Education and Training

Pakistan's Northwest Frontier Province (NWFP)

ILO Project Codes:	PAK/02/03/SDC; PAK/04/01/DAN															
TC Codes:	P.270.06.342.003; P.270.06.342.004															
IRIS Codes	11386; 12376															
Financing Agencies:	Swiss Agency for Development and Cooperation (SDC); Danish International Development Agency (DANIDA)															
Type of Evaluation:	Independent Evaluation															
Geographic Coverage:	Pakistan, North West Frontier Province (NWFP)															
Project start/end dates:	SDC Phase I: Sept. 1998-Aug. 2001 Phase II: Sept. 2002–Dec. 2005 Phase III: Jan. 2006-Dec. 2008 DANIDA: June 2004-Apr. 2008															
Date of the Evaluation:	March-April 2008															
Total Donor Project Funds (USD):	<table><tr><td>SDC</td><td>Phase I</td><td>700,000</td></tr><tr><td></td><td>Phase II</td><td>1,960,328</td></tr><tr><td></td><td>Phase III</td><td>1,533,743</td></tr><tr><td>DANIDA</td><td></td><td><u>1,336,454</u></td></tr><tr><td>Total</td><td></td><td>5,530,525</td></tr></table>	SDC	Phase I	700,000		Phase II	1,960,328		Phase III	1,533,743	DANIDA		<u>1,336,454</u>	Total		5,530,525
SDC	Phase I	700,000														
	Phase II	1,960,328														
	Phase III	1,533,743														
DANIDA		<u>1,336,454</u>														
Total		5,530,525														

I. Background and Justifications

Background

1. The *International Programme on the Elimination of Child Labour* (IPEC) is a technical cooperation programme of the International Labour Organization (ILO). The aim of IPEC is the progressive elimination of child labour, especially its worst forms.
2. *Development partners.* IPEC uses the ILO's tripartite approach, which seeks to engage governments, employer organizations and worker organizations toward the goal of ensuring decent working conditions. The political will and commitment of governments and social partners, including non-governmental organizations and other relevant parties, is the basis for all ILO/IPEC action. IPEC provides a variety of technical assistance to its development partners working toward the elimination of child labour. The political will and commitment of individual governments to address child labour - in cooperation with employers' and workers' organizations, non-governmental organizations and other relevant parties in society- is the basis for IPEC action. IPEC support at the country level is based on a phased, multi-sector strategy. This strategy includes strengthening national capacities to deal with this issue, legislation harmonization, improvement of the knowledge base, raising awareness on the negative consequences of child labour, promoting social mobilization against it, and implementing demonstrative direct action programmes (AP) to prevent children from child labour and remove child workers from hazardous work and provide them and their families with appropriate alternatives.
3. *Integration of child labour interventions within the context of decent work.* From the perspective of the ILO, the elimination of child labour is part of its work on standards and fundamental principles and rights at work. The fulfilment of these standards is meant to guarantee decent work for all adults. ILO decent work country programmes (DWCP) provide a mechanism for focusing on priorities agreed on between the ILO and national constituent partners within broader UN and international development contexts. DWCPs focus on priorities, operational strategies as well as a resource and implementation plans that complement and supports partner plans for national decent work priorities. Further information is available at: <http://www.ilo.org/public/english/decent.htm>.

Pakistan's National Time Bound Programme

4. A Time Bound Program (TBP) is a strategic program framework of tightly integrated and coordinated policies and initiatives at different levels to eliminate specified worst forms of child labour in a given country within a defined period of time. It is a nationally owned initiative that emphasizes the need to address the root causes of child labour, linking action against child labour to the national development effort, with particular emphasis on the economic and social policies to combat poverty and to promote universal basic education. This implies a commitment to mobilize and allocate national human and financial resources to combat the problem. The ILO, with the support of many development organizations and the financial and technical partners has elaborated this concept based on previous national and international experience. It has also established innovative technical cooperation modalities to support countries that have ratified C. 182 to implement comprehensive measures against the worst forms of child labour.²⁰
5. In 2001, the Government of Pakistan ratified the ILO Convention 182 and requested technical assistance from the ILO's International Programme on the Elimination of

Child Labour (IPEC) to assist the Government in fulfilling its international commitment under the Convention. The first support to Pakistan was a preparatory phase to generate sufficient information to initiate the development of a comprehensive National TBP to take immediate measures designed to eliminate Worst Forms of Child Labour within ten to fifteen years and to provide the basis for the design of the first interventions in support of the National TBP in Pakistan. Partners from government, workers' and employers' groups, non-governmental organizations and civil society have been involved actively in the formulation of the National TBP strategy. Stakeholders' involvement in the entire process is to ensure commitment to, and responsibility and accountability for the various Programme components.

6. A National Child Labour survey, conducted in 1996 by the Federal Bureau of Statistics with support from IPEC, found 3.3 million of the 40 million children (in the 5-14 years age group) to be economically active on a full-time basis. Of the 3.3 million working children, 73 per cent (2.4 million) were boys and 27 per cent (0.9 million), girls. Children's contribution to work in rural areas is about eight times greater than in urban areas. The number of economically active children in the 10-14 years age group is more than four times the children in the 5-9 years age group.²¹
7. Rural children were mostly engaged in the agricultural sector (74 per cent), whereas in urban areas, most working children (31 per cent) are engaged in the manufacturing sector. The percentage of girls working in manufacturing and services is higher than that of boys; this indicates that girls are more likely to work in the manufacturing and services sectors as compared to boys.
8. In 2002, National TBP preparatory phase was designed to undertake four broad tasks: (i) Consultations; (ii) Baseline Surveys and Rapid Assessments; (iii) Policy Review; and (iv) Capacity Building and Awareness Raising of Social Partners. The major activities included the mobilization of political and social commitment, development of adequate databases, undertaking in-depth research of policy studies, and consultations on the formulation of the initial framework for Pakistan's National TBP, including the first series of interventions in support of the National TBP. The policy studies, the consultative process, social mobilization and capacity building have helped towards creating an enabling environment for the implementation of the National TBP, while baseline and rapid surveys on different worst forms of child labour have been used to design direct interventions on prioritized worst forms of child labour.
9. Through consultations, a national list of hazardous work for children (below 18 years) was identified. In this regard, the Ministry of Labour, based on tripartite consultations, developed a list of 29 most hazardous occupations for children. This list was recently revised and the list now contains 35 hazardous occupations. Of these occupations and processes, six sectors were identified jointly with the Ministry of Labour to be addressed on a priority basis. A major goal of the preparatory phase was to ensure that the National TBP was consistently formulated within the context of the strategic framework of the National Policy and Plan of Action to Combat Child Labor and of other national socio-economic plans.
10. Since its launch in September 2003, IPEC's Project of Support to the National TBP has been acting as the main technical advisor to National stakeholders in the National TBP. The focus so far has been in interventions relating to knowledge base development, policy development and implementation, and mobilization. Since then, the project has been providing support to the development and functioning of a suitable institutional framework and process for developing and managing the National TBP, such as planning, monitoring and evaluation processes. IPEC's current Project of Support to the National TBP supports the implementation of National Plan of Action/National TBP through two major components:

<p>Component 1:</p> <p>Strengthening the enabling environment supporting the elimination of the worst forms of child labor</p>	<p><i>Promoting change in the policy and enabling environment through which progress can be made in eliminating the worst forms of child labor. This work links with key issues identified in the National Policy and Plan of Action. It includes work on promoting child labor in national and local policy frameworks, improving the knowledge base, harmonizing and enforcement of laws, awareness raising and advocacy, and building the capacity of stakeholders.</i></p>
<p>Component 2:</p> <p>Targeted, direct interventions to tackle the worst forms of child labor</p>	<p><i>Direct targeted interventions in six sectors identified by the National Plan of Action as priority areas for the elimination for child labor. Through programs in these areas the project aims to remove children from the worst forms of child labor and prevent other children entering such work. The intentions is that these interventions provides models which can be use elsewhere by Government at national and local level in their own efforts to implement the National Plan of Action and eliminate the worst forms of child labor.</i></p>

11. Under the National Time Bound Programme, essentially all IPEC projects funded by other donors including the current SDC and DANIDA-funded projects in the NWFP on combating child labour through education and training (which focus on creating education and training opportunities for children, particularly girls), as well as projects funded by NORAD (on creating awareness of the WFCL through the media), USDOL (targeting children in the carpet industry); Holland (an inter-regional project on combating child domestic work); USDOL (a sub-regional project to combat the trafficking of children for sexual and labour exploitation) fall under the National Time Bound Programme.

Background on the Northwest Frontier Province

12. The North West Frontier Province (NWFP) covers an area of 74,500 square kilometres, accounting for 9.4 percent of Pakistan's area. Its estimated population in 1998 was 18 million, representing 13.4 percent of the national population, with a population density is 241 persons per sq km, 43% above Pakistan's average.
13. According to the only survey on child workers conducted by the Government (1996), more than 3.6 million children worked in the formal sector. In NWFP more than one million children ages 5-15 years were estimated to be engaged in child labour. This figure represented nearly 32% of the total child labour population in Pakistan.
14. In terms of child labour, working children face a wide range of problems – from exploitation and different forms of abuse to serious health issues linked to the harsh working conditions and vulnerability to drug and/or substance abuse. Young boys may be found working in such sectors as automobile workshops and in brick kilns. Young girls typically work in households, in domestic servitude, or agriculture work and their work is largely hidden and unvalued or undervalued.
15. After 2001, the influx of Afghan refugees in the NWFP added dramatically to the 2.5 million Afghan refugees already residing in Pakistan, most of whom were in the NWFP. The influx of Afghan refugees resulted in increased pressure on the labour market. Inadequate funding for Afghan refugees has led to the closure of primary schools and basic health units causing epidemics and serious health problems for them. This situation has entailed considerable pressure on the resources of the province, which has increased the vulnerability of the masses to extreme poverty. Some of the Afghan refugees were repatriated back to Afghanistan in 2003. However, many of these

returned to the NWFP due to lack of facilities, employment opportunities and civil war in their home country.

Projects and activities

SDC

16. The Swiss Agency for Development and Cooperation (SDC) carries out development and humanitarian aid programmes in 17 priority countries and runs 8 special programmes. An Agreement for Technical and Scientific Cooperation was signed with Pakistan in 1966. SDC opened a Cooperation Office in Islamabad in 1977. SDC's development policy is enshrined in Switzerland's foreign policy objectives which cover the promotion of peace and security, human rights, democracy and the rule of law, social cohesion and economic welfare and the preservation of the environment. The federal law on development cooperation and humanitarian aid, passed in 1976, provides the legal basis of SDC's work. A salient feature of Switzerland's commitment to poverty alleviation and development is a deeply rooted sense of solidarity with the disadvantaged and excluded. SDC's Cooperation Strategy 2006-2010 for Pakistan is structured around 3 domains: Increasing Income, Improving Governance and Reconstruction and Rehabilitation. Gender and HIV/Aids cut across these domains and the Human Rights Based Approach is the underlying approach.
17. The Combating Child Labour through Education and Training (CCLET) project in the Northwest Frontier Province addresses of the Millennium Development Goals (MDGs) 1, 2, 3 and 6, and Pillar 3 (Investing in Human capital) of the Poverty Reduction Strategy for Pakistan (PRSP). It contributes to the Government's commitment to the Convention on the Rights of the Child (CRC) through Pakistan's National Plan of Action (NPA) for Children. The project is in line with SDC Cooperation Strategy 2006-2010 for Pakistan and fits under the action line "Rights of Women and Children" of its "Improving Governance Domain".
18. This project is executed by ILO/IPEC Project Office based in Peshawar with backstopping from Area Office, Islamabad and IPEC Headquarters, Geneva, and implemented by government departments, NGOs and Employers' and Workers' organisations.
19. In Phase I (September 1998 to August 2001), SDC allocated a sum of CHF 1,080,000- (US\$ 700,000) to the project. This was considered to be a pilot phase with project activities being restricted to only two districts in NWFP. The overall assessment of the project was very positive in terms of staff commitment and competency; relationships among the different partners; and work with the target group, working children, street children and their siblings. Based on this positive evaluation of Phase I, SDC agreed to fund Phase II.
20. For Phase II, September 2002 to December 2005), SDC allocated a sum of CHF 3,140,000- (US\$ 1,960,328) which allowed the project to be up-scaled and replicated in four districts of the North West Frontier Province (NWFP).
21. For the current phase, Phase III, SDC allocated a sum of CHF 2,000,000- (US\$ 1,533,743). Phase III will cover the period 1st January 2007 to 31st December 2008. The reason for supporting the on-going project for only two years (till December 2008) was to bring the end date of CCLET to conform with that of two other SDC-funded projects that focus on child protection (implemented by UNICEF) and juvenile justice and child rights (implemented by a national NGO, SPARC) in order to develop a single programme addressing children issues.
22. *Goal, Purpose and Expected Outcomes of Phase III.* The goal of the project is to gradually eliminate child labour practices in NWFP in line with internationally agreed standards. The purpose is to strengthen systems and capacities among government institutions, civil society and trade unions for combating child labour in line with the Human Rights Based Approach (HRBA) in four selected districts of NWFP. Expected outcomes are (i) reduced child labour violations, through positive attitudinal change of

- duty bearers and enhanced child protection; and (ii) visible shift of children from child labour to education and siblings of working children prevented from going into child labour activities.
23. Planned outputs for SDC-funded activities in Phase III are as follows:
 1. Right holders and duty bearers have enhanced understanding of child labour issues and mobilised to act for combating child labour;
 2. Child labour unit strengthened to act as focal point for combating child labour (together with other duty bearers);
 3. Mechanisms for provision of quality education to working children and their siblings made functional and institutionalised; and
 4. Skill enhancement avenues for working children improved, institutionalised and integrated into technical training system.
 24. The SDC project is divided into three major sub-programmes:
 1. Strengthening of Policy and Institutional Development through capacity strengthening of the Child Labour Unit, production of the Unit's annual operational plan, strengthening child labour monitoring mechanisms, and capacity development at the district, *tehsil* and union council levels;
 2. Promoting Social Mobilization and Strengthening the Enabling Environment by mobilising teachers, parent-teachers associations, youth, policy makers, law enforcement agencies, trade unions, associations and employers' organisations to combat child labour, and creating an acceptable working environment through occupational safety and health related to progressive withdrawal strategy and by expanding the knowledge base on child labour; and
 3. Provision of Social Services through access to education, operationalization of child development centres through NGOs, afternoon classes for working children in formal educational institutions, development and implementation of teachers' training programmes for non-formal schools, empowerment of communities, counselling services, developing and institutionalising a skills training approach, creating alternatives for families and introduction of an apprenticeship scheme.
 25. The project applies a human rights based approach focusing primarily on the duty bearers to change their perceptions and attitudes towards child labour and then strengthen their capacities to fulfil their role in addressing this issue by promoting ratification and effective implementation of ILO child labour conventions. Duty bearers are relevant government entities, workers' and employers' organizations, parents, teachers and community members. Direct beneficiaries (rights holders) are working and exploited children and their siblings in the age group 6 to 18 years in hazardous work (automobile workshops, furniture, pottery, brick kilns, domestic servants/helpers, street children, and those working in agriculture, carpentry and beggary). They will be provided with educational opportunities and skills training, taught occupational safety and health (OSH), and be provided with career counselling and psycho-social support as and when needed.
 26. Complimentary to the above actions, the project will conduct in-depth statistical and qualitative research, policy and legal analysis, and develop child labour monitoring systems and apprenticeship schemes which together will contribute to the accumulation of a vast knowledge base to combat child labour.
 27. The sustainability of the project interventions will largely depend on effective functioning and annual government allocations to the child labour unit, integration of market-oriented skill training courses at the government skill training institute, regularisation of afternoon schools for working children and prevention of siblings of working children in entering child labour workforce.

28. Gender is addressed across the project. While some project components focus exclusively on girls or boys, some others address both genders conjointly. Special care is also taken to ensure that female teachers are recruited, especially for the girls' centres/schools, in keeping with cultural norms. Basic knowledge about HIV/Aids and sexual abuse is imparted to the older children, especially boys, vulnerable to sexual abuse and exploitation. These children then pass on messages learnt to their family members including younger siblings.
29. SDC-funded project geographic areas are Peshawar, Nowsehra, Charsadda and Mardan in NWFP.
30. Beginning 2009 onwards, SDC intends to support a Child Rights Programme. All three projects – CCLET, Child and Adolescents Protection Programme (CAPP) and Children in Difficult Circumstances (CDC) will be undergoing external reviews/evaluations in the second quarter of 2008. Based on the results of these reviews/evaluations, SDC will develop a Child Rights Programme in consensus with its present three partners (and possibly one or two other new partners) and will include components of the on-going projects that are evaluated positively and possibly with new interventions. It is most likely that SDC's present partners – ILO, UNICEF and SPARC will be partners in the new SDC Child Rights Programme.

DANIDA

31. By parliamentary decision, total Danish development assistance (bilateral and multilateral) must constitute 1 percent of Denmark's gross national product. In 1999, this amounted to DKK 11.362 billion (or 1.01% of GNP, and excluding environmental assistance under the Environment, Peace and Stability Fund, EPSF). Danish development assistance, which is allocated as grants, has been conducted under the name DANIDA since 1963, an abbreviation for Danish International Development Assistance.
32. Poverty reduction is a fundamental principle of Danish assistance to developing countries and must be organized in a manner that promotes sustainable economic growth, development of the social sectors (e.g., education and health), and popular participation in the development process.
33. The immediate objectives of the DANIDA-funded projects in the NWFP (located in Districts Swat & Swabi / Lower Dir) , are as follows:
 - Immediate Objective 1: Improved quality, need based and flexible education introduced for working children in project rehabilitation centres and formal education system for prevention, rehabilitation and protection of working children.
 - Immediate Objective 2: Meaningful alternatives provided to children and their families through skills development and effective sensitization regarding institutional skills training culture to combat child labour and enhance family income.
 - Immediate Objective 3: Friendly environment in formal schools created for children increase retention rates.
 - Immediate Objective 4: Better understanding of the child labour problem developed in the project area and strengthened capacity of policy-makers, law enforcement agencies, trade unions, associations and employers organizations to implement child labour laws and exchange information on child labour issues.
 - Immediate Objective 5: Working conditions of the target group improved by protecting them from occupational accidents and diseases.
34. Replicating and building on the earlier experiences within the SDC-funded CCLET project, the DANIDA project proposed a multi-pronged approach to dealing with child

labour issues in the NWFP, including *providing social services* and *promoting social mobilization and strengthening the enabling environment*. These component project strategies are grouped into sub-programmes that are implemented through project partners. These are briefly described below:

35. Combating Abusive and Hazardous Child Labour through rehabilitation and skill training opportunities:
 - *Education*
 - Establishment of Rehabilitation Centres.
 - Non-formal education for working / street children as a Progressive withdrawal strategy.
 - Mainstreaming of working children / street children into regular schools after considering school age and financial status to bear incidental costs.
 - Establishment of RC Management Committees at community level.
 - Counselling strategies for working / street children, parents and adult workers on child rights, international commitments and national laws and role of the society to eliminate child labour practices.
 - Development of need based curriculum and assessment plans.
 - *Occupational Safety and Health (OSH)*
 - Provision of basic health facilities.
 - *Skills Training*
 - Pre and vocational training programmes to develop orientation to skills learning in an institutionalized manner as an alternative to child labour.
 - Establishment of service outlets to provide internship facilities.
36. Creating Opportunities for the Families to Combat Child Labour:
 - *Alternatives for the Families*
 - Development of micro business/enterprise activities for the adult unemployed family members (especially mothers of the working and street begging children), to provide them with economic and social empowerment to be able to enjoy some of the basic child and women rights.
37. Promoting Social Mobilization and Strengthening the Enabling Environment
 - *Teachers & PTA Training*
 - Teachers training workshops.
 - Training workshops for Parents Teachers' Associations.
 - Child Labour days.
 - *Providing access to education*
 - Introduction of Afternoon Schools in the Formal Government School for working and street children.
38. Mobilizing policy makers, law enforcement agencies, trade unions, and associations and employers organizations to implement child labour laws.
 - *Sensitization of Law Enforcement agencies, Trade Union & Employers*

- Awareness workshops and seminars on child labour laws for policy makers, law enforcement agencies, trade unions, and associations and employers organizations.
 - Development of strategies for effective implementation of child labour laws.
 - Develop support for project strategies.
- *Occupational Safety and Health (OSH)*
- Study on occupational hazards.
 - Development of training manual.
 - Training Workshops.
 - Pre- and Post attitudinal surveys.
39. Expanding the Knowledge Base on Child Labour
- Development and implementation of project database.
 - Conduct of Baseline Study.
 - Conduct gender review of project interventions.

Previous evaluations

40. The external evaluation of Phase II of the SDC-funded CCLET project gave an overall positive assessment of the project and recommended scaling up to additional districts, inclusion of other government partners and increasing the sectors and number of child labourers to benefit from the project.
41. The achievements of Phase II as stated in the joint SDC-ILO/IPEC independent evaluation of the Phase are the following: Introduction of afternoon schools for working children in formal education system; Development of i) a viable model of rehabilitation services for working children which includes non-formal education, counselling programme and health services, ii) an effective model of occupational safety and health (OSH) for reducing occupational hazards in working environment, iii) a viable model for training policy makers, law enforcement agencies, trade unions, employers and workers organisations, iv) an effective database system for tracking project beneficiaries; and strengthened gender dimensions.
42. Recommendations of the external evaluation of Phase II included: (i) continuation of the project with demonstrated commitment of the Government of the NWFP to address child labour issues; (ii) change in focus from service delivery for working and exploited children to institutional strengthening of relevant actors of the system; (iii) linking the project to the Government of Pakistan's Time Bound Programme and other ILO-IPEC-implemented projects on child labour.
43. There have been no previous evaluations of DANIDA-funded project.

II. Scope and Purpose

Scope

44. Both projects covered by this evaluation operate in the same province of Pakistan, with similar management structure and goals. Because linkages between IPEC projects, particularly those with similar geographic and thematic focuses are an important element in IPEC's strategy, we propose a joint evaluation of these projects. This final evaluation will focus on these projects' achievements and their contribution to the national and provincial efforts to achieve the elimination of WFCL especially within the context of the national TBP framework.

45. The scope of the present IPEC evaluation includes all project activities to date including Action Programs (AP). The evaluation should look at the projects as a whole and address issues of project design, implementation, lessons learned, replicability and recommendations for future programs and any specific recommendations for the project. For the SDC project, the evaluation should have a special focus on Phase III and address issues of project design, implementation, lessons learned, replicability and recommendations for future programmes and any specific recommendations for use in TBP Pakistan.
46. The evaluation should also take into account relevant factors and developments in the national and provincial processes within the broader context of Pakistan's time bound program. The focus of the evaluation will be on the contributions of these IPEC projects in ensuring services to direct beneficiaries and in terms of their relevance within the provincial context.

Purpose

47. The purpose of the evaluation is to document and analyze the extent to which the projects achieved their stated objectives. In doing so, evaluators should compare these objectives with actual project outputs.
48. The intended audiences for this evaluation are project implementers, including IPEC management, ILO technical advisors in the field, and partner organizations, donor agencies; and other key national and international stakeholders. The results of this study will also be used to document lessons learned and potential good practices for application in future IPEC projects and to inform the strategic planning for any subsequent programme phases.
49. The time period covers the period from initial start-up and implementation. For the SDC-funded project, all project and activities since inception are to be considered, with special emphasis placed on Phase III, and the degree to which the project and the implementing partners have integrated and made necessary changes or adaptations to work toward the agreed recommendations of the External Evaluation of Phase II. Shortcomings should be highlighted thus enabling the project to address them during the remaining period of the Phase.
50. For DANIDA's project, the project as a whole and activities from 2004 through the present should be considered.

III. Suggested Aspects to be Addressed

51. The evaluation should address the overall ILO evaluation concerns such as relevance, effectiveness, efficiency and sustainability as defined in the ILO Guidelines on "Planning and Managing Project Evaluations," 2006. These concerns are further elaborated in the "Preparation of Independent Evaluations of ILO Programmes and Projects," 1997. For gender concerns see: ILO Guidelines for the Integration of Gender Issues into the Design, Monitoring and Evaluation of ILO Programmes and Projects, 1995. Further information on the ILO's gender approach is also available at www.ilo.org/gender.
52. The evaluation should be carried out in adherence with the ILO Evaluation Framework and Strategy, ILO Guidelines, specific ILO-IPEC Guidelines and Notes, the UN System Evaluation Standards and Norms, and OECD/DAC Evaluation Quality Standards.
53. In line with the results-based framework approach used by ILO-IPEC for identifying results at global, strategic and project level, the evaluation will focus on identifying and analysing results. This should be done by addressing key questions related to the evaluation concerns as well as the achievement of the programme's immediate objectives using data from the logical framework indicators.

54. The suggested aspects for the evaluation to address are given below. Other aspects can be added as identified by the evaluation team in accordance with the given purpose and in consultation with ILO/IPEC Geneva's Design, Evaluation and Documentation Section and with SDC in Bern. **It is not expected that the evaluation address all of the aspects below.**
55. The evaluation instrument prepared by the evaluation team will indicate if there are other specific aspects to be addressed.
56. **Project Design and Relevance**
- Assess whether the design of these projects was logical and coherent and took into account the validity and practicality of institutional arrangements, roles, capacity and commitment of stakeholders. OKAY ENOUGH
 - Analyse whether available information on the socio-economic, cultural and political situation in Pakistan was taken into consideration at the time of the design and whether these were reflected in the design of the projects.
 - Assess the appropriateness of the sectors/target groups and locations chosen to develop the programme based on the findings of baseline surveys. Examine whether the projects responded to the needs of the beneficiaries as determined at the point of design.
 - Were the linkages between inputs, outputs and results clear and logical? Did the Action Programmes designed under the projects provide clear linkages and complement each other regarding the project strategies and project sub-components of the intervention?
 - Did project documents provide adequate guidance on how the intervention would address the relevant gender issues among the target groups?
 - Assess the relationships between the two projects and other child-focused interventions supported by IPEC and other organizations in the country. Are these project designs relevant according to the other existing interventions? Have synergies and economies of scale been created?
 - How does the strategy used in these projects fit in national development, education and anti-poverty efforts, existing policies and programmes on child labour and interventions carried out by other organizations?
 - How well did the project designs take into account local capacity and efforts already underway to address child labor and promote educational opportunities? How well have the project designs taken into account the involvement and coordination of major partners?
 - Were relevant indicators of achievement and means of verification properly designed? Usefulness of the indicators for monitoring and measuring impact should also be assessed.
57. **Achievements and Implementation of the Projects (Effectiveness)**
- Did the projects make sufficient progress toward immediate objectives? Is the expected number of beneficiaries being reached? Are outputs being delivered on a timely basis, and are they of appropriate quality?
 - To what extent have the projects been effective in introducing working children to non-formal primary education and where possible to take children completely out of child labour and into formal primary schools or afternoon schools?

- To what extent have the projects been effective in training working children to relevant skills which will enhance their earning capacity potentials once they are adults?
- Have the projects been effective in their work with relevant government agencies and non-governmental partners? With which government departments and non-governmental agencies have the projects most successfully collaborated? To what extent has government capacity to develop or implement policies or measures focused on reducing child labour been increased as a result of project efforts?
- To what extent have the projects been effective in getting government training institutions to adopt training packages/programmes in their current training courses?
- How has the capacity of the implementing agencies and other relevant partners to develop effective action against child labor been enhanced as a result of project activities? What have been the tangible impacts of capacity building efforts?
- Assess the level of success the projects have achieved in mainstreaming child labour issues into development planning and programs of the provincial and targeted district governments.
- How effective have the projects been in mobilizing policy makers, law enforcement agencies, trade unions, associations and employers organizations to implement child labour laws? Which efforts in terms of awareness raising and occupational safety and health have been most successful? What impediments have the projects encountered in affecting policy level changes?
- How useful are project indicators? Are the means of verification for monitoring valid? Is monitoring data readily available? Are they useful in assessing project performance?
- How effective are the projects in raising awareness about child labor and in promoting social mobilization to address this issue?
- Given project resources, how successful have the projects been in achieving their strategic objectives and targets? What, if any, were the major constraints to achieving their objectives?

58. **Sustainability**

- A) How effective have the projects been to date in promoting local and national ownership of the program and promoting long-term sustainability? Has the idea of a phase-out strategy for the project been clearly articulated and progress made toward this goal? What steps have been taken to ensure phase out activities and the transfer responsibilities to local partners as a means of promoting sustainability? This discussion should be contextualized within the context of limited revenue resources in the province, its weak industrial base, the lack of widespread irrigated agriculture, high levels of poverty, and a continuing influx of refugees.
- B) Within such a context, assess the extent to which the projects have made sustainable contribution in developing the capacity of partner organizations through awareness raising efforts, material development, training activities, and cost effective strategies to prevent, protect and rehabilitate working children.
- C) Identify and assess the long-term commitment and the technical and financial capacity of local/national institutions including government in relation to continuing to deliver goods and services to target groups beyond 2008.

- D) Examine whether social-cultural and gender aspects endanger the sustainability of the project and assess whether action has been taken to sensitize local institutions and target groups on this issue.

59. **Special Concerns**

- Examine how the projects have interacted and possibly influenced provincial and district level policies, debates, and institutions working on child labor.
- Assess the extent to which the projects have been able to mobilize resources, policies, programs, partners and activities.
- Analyze the NWFP Government's commitment to child labour through specific actions and allocation of resources with a focus on the Child Labour Cell.
- Is there an appropriate balance in the projects between institutional strengthening of responsible duty bearers (relevant government entities, workers' and employers' organizations, parents, teachers and community members) with service delivery to right holders (e.g., working and exploited children and their siblings aged 6 to 18 years in hazardous work)?
- To what extent have the two projects established links and synergies? To what extent have the two projects established links with other child labour projects implemented by ILO? What plans or opportunities exist for joint project efforts in the NWFP?
- Assess the partnership with UNICEF. What if any, has been the added value of the collaboration working together with UNICEF? To what extent has there been collaboration with other implementing agencies (e.g., SPARC)? Is there a possibility of future collaboration with these executing/implementing partners for the betterment of the lives of working children?
- Which components of the projects show progress? Which components warrant further support within the context of future planned interventions such as SDC's future Child Rights Programme?
- To what extent has an exit strategy for the projects been developed and implemented?
- How have the projects contributed to the Provincial Government's child labour initiatives and to the National Plan of Action for Child Labour in light of the Convention on the Rights of the Child?
- How have gender issues have been addressed in recent years, particularly in the past two years? What is the degree of gender mainstreaming at the levels of policies, systems, processes and activities? What are the concrete indicators of this? The analysis and use of gender disaggregated data should be assessed. Evaluators should make concrete and practical recommendations on how the gender dimensions could be further strengthened in future projects/interventions.

IV. Expected Outputs of the Evaluation

60. Depending on security issues in implementation districts, site visits to all of the sites covered by these projects may not be possible. For example, at the time of the drafting of these TORs, none of the DANIDA project-funded districts were accessible according to UN security regulations. Depending on security issues, such districts will be covered through a desk review only. The evaluation will consist of the following elements:
- A desk review of both projects, covering both projects since inception. For the SDC project, particular emphasis will be placed on Phase III.
 - An evaluation instrument prepared by the evaluation team prior to the field visits.
 - Field visits to SDC project sites.
 - One national level workshop for stakeholders and partners including donor agencies, facilitated by the evaluation team in Peshawar.
 - Draft evaluation report including stakeholder/partners workshop proceedings and findings from field visits by evaluation team
 - A Final Report including:
 - Executive Summary
 - Clearly identified findings
 - Clearly identified conclusions and recommendations
 - Lessons learned
 - Potential good practices and effective models of intervention.
 - Appropriate Annexes including present TORs
 - Standard evaluation instrument matrix

For the SDC project:

- Summary according to the DAC format attached. This will be put on SDC's official website.
 - An aide memoir of 3 pages to be sent to ILO Peshawar (for distribution to all stakeholders before the national level workshop in Peshawar), ILO Islamabad and SCOP Islamabad
 - A debriefing session at the end of the field visits with SCOP and representatives of ILO, where the consultants will present their major findings and recommendations (based on the aide memoir and the feedback received from stakeholders at the national level workshop) through a PowerPoint presentation and take part in a discussion about options for the future. This briefing will be held in Islamabad at the SDC office.
 - A debriefing in SDC Bern or ILO Geneva (to be determined; ILO and SDC representatives will attend the debriefing irrespective of where it is held) by the team leader (international consultant), on the basis of the full report submitted to SDC Bern (and ILO Geneva) at least one week prior to the debriefing.
61. The total length of the report should be a maximum of 30 pages for the main report, excluding annexes. Additional annexes can provide background and details on each of the specific projects and components of the evaluated. The report should be sent as one complete document and the file size should not exceed 3 megabytes. Photos, if appropriate to be included, should be inserted using lower resolution to keep overall file size low.
62. All drafts and final outputs, including supporting documents, analytical reports and raw data should be provided both in paper copy and in electronic version compatible for Microsoft Word. Ownership of the data from the evaluation rests jointly with

ILO/IPEC and the funding agencies for these projects. Use of the data for publication and other presentation can only be made with the agreement of ILO/IPEC and the funders. Key stakeholders can make appropriate use of the evaluation report in line with the original purpose and with appropriate acknowledgement.

63. The final report will be circulated to key stakeholders (those participants present at the stakeholder evaluation workshop will be considered key stakeholders) for their review. Comments from stakeholders will be consolidated by the Design, Evaluation and Documentation Section (DED) of ILO/IPEC Geneva and provided to the team leader. In preparing the final report the team leader should consider these comments, incorporate as appropriate in the report and provide a brief note explaining why any comments might not have been incorporated.

V. Evaluation Methodology

64. The following is the proposed evaluation methodology. While the evaluation consultant can propose changes in the methodology, any such changes should be discussed with and approved by DED provided that the research and analysis suggests changes and provided that the indicated range of questions is addressed, the purpose maintained and the expected outputs produced at the required quality.
65. The evaluation consultant will be asked to use the standard evaluation instruments that ILO/IPEC has developed for documenting and analyzing achievements of the projects and contributions of the Action Programs to the project.

Timetable and Workshop schedule:

The total duration of the evaluation process including submission of the final report should be within six weeks from the end of the field mission.

The team leader/international consultant will be engaged for 26 days, which will include two weeks in-country and a de-briefing in Switzerland. The national consultant, funded by SDC will be engaged for 20 work days in Pakistan. It is expected that during the process, members of the team will be in contact as appropriate. The timetable is as follows:

TENTATIVE SCHEDULE

Further dates will be confirmed following inputs from stakeholders

Phase	Responsible Person	Tasks
I	Evaluation Team	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Telephone briefing with IPEC DED, SDC Bern, and DANIDA representatives ▪ Desk Review of project related documents ▪ Preparation of evaluation instrument based on desk review
II	Evaluation team with logistical support by project	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ In-country to Pakistan for consultations with project staff and funders (SCOP/SDC-Pakistan and Danida) ▪ Field visits to project locations ▪ Briefing with funders and IPEC Pakistan ▪ Consultations with project staff ▪ Consultations with project partners ▪ Consultations with girls and boys, parents and other beneficiaries ▪ National workshop with project partners, ILO/IPEC and funding agencies
III	Evaluation team	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Aide Memoir for SDC ▪ Draft report based on consultations from field visits and desk

		review and workshop
IV	DED	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Circulate draft report to key stakeholders ▪ Consolidate comments of stakeholders and send to team leader
V	Team Leader	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Debrief ILO/IPEC and SDC Bern in Switzerland and finalize the report including explanations on why comments were not included

6.3 Schedule and Duration

The total duration of the evaluation process including submission of the final report should be within four weeks from the end of the field mission

The evaluator (international consultant) will be engaged for 26 days, inclusive of travel and including 2 days for stakeholder workshop in Peshawar. It is expected that during the process the evaluator will be in contact with DED as appropriate.

The proposed evaluation schedule is as follows:

Dates	International Consultant (ILO funded/ Team Leader) (Tasks)	Days	National Consultant (SDC Funded) (Tasks)	Days
10-19 April	Briefing and desk review in home country and travel to Geneva. Briefing with ILO and SDC (to be confirmed).		Briefing in Islamabad and desk review in home town Pakistan	
21-29 April	Field visits including briefings and consultations and stakeholder workshop and debriefing		Field visits including briefings and consultations and stakeholder workshop and debriefing	
	Preparing Aid Memoir		Preparing Aid Memoir	
30 April-5 May	Report Writing		Input to report	
8 May (to be confirmed)	Debriefing in Geneva or Bern, Switzerland		Providing input to team leader (via email exchange) as agreed	
5 June	Finalising Evaluation report incorporating comments received from stakeholders		-	
	Total	26	Total	20

Composition of the evaluation team:

66. The evaluation team will consist of two evaluation consultants that previously have not been involved in the project. Following the procedure set out in the project document an international consultant (team leader) will be identified by ILO/IPEC in consultation with SDC, while the national consultant will be identified by SDC Pakistan in consultation with SDC Bern and ILO/IPEC. The team members will work together and separately as appropriate. The national consultant will provide input to the final report as agreed upon with the team leader at the beginning of the evaluation exercise.
67. The background of the team leader (international consultant) should include:
 - Experience in the design, management and evaluation of development projects, in particular with local development projects.
 - Relevant background in social and/or economic development

- Experience in evaluations in the UN system, preferably as team leader
 - Relevant regional experience preferably prior working experience in Pakistan
 - Experience in the area of children's and child labour issues and rights-based approaches in a normative framework are highly appreciated.
 - Experience in the area of education and legal issues would also be appreciated
 - Experience in the UN system or similar international development experience
 - Familiarity with and knowledge of specific thematic areas
 - Experience in gender issues
 - Fluency in English
 - Good report writing skills
 - Experience facilitating workshops for evaluation findings.
68. The background of the national consultant should include:
- Relevant background in social and/or economic development
 - Experience in evaluation of development projects
 - Experience in the area of children's and child labour issues especially in the Pakistani context
 - Fluency in English
 - Good report writing skills
 - Experience facilitating workshops for evaluation findings
 - In addition, the national consultant should have strong local knowledge, including language skills and preferable experience and credibility in working at the local and provincial level.
69. The team leader will have the final responsibility during the whole evaluation process and of the outcomes of the evaluation, including the quality of the report and the compliance with deadlines.
70. The evaluation team will be responsible for undertaking a desk review of the project files and documents, undertaking field visits to the project locations, facilitating the workshop and drafting the evaluation report. Upon feedback from stakeholders to the draft report, the team leader will further be responsible for finalizing the report incorporating any comments deemed appropriate.
71. The evaluation will be carried out with the technical support of the IPEC-DED section and with the logistical support of the project office. DED will be responsible for consolidating the comments of stakeholders and submitting it to the international consultant.
72. The evaluator is responsible for drafting the evaluation report with inputs from the consultations, notes, desk review and stakeholder workshop. Upon feedback from stakeholders to the draft report, the evaluator will further be responsible for finalizing the report and incorporating any comments deemed appropriate.
73. The evaluation will be carried out with the technical support of the IPEC-DED section. The logistical support will be provided by the project office in Pakistan with the administrative support of the ILO offices in Pakistan. The ILO Office in Pakistan will provide support to organizing the workshop (contents and facilitation of workshop will be the responsibility of the team leader). DED will be responsible for consolidating the comments of stakeholders and submitting them to the team leader.
74. It is expected that the evaluator will work to the highest evaluation standards and codes of conduct and follow the UN evaluation standards and norms. The evaluation should be carried out in adherence to the ILO Evaluation Framework and Strategy, the ILO-IPEC Guidelines and Notes, the UN System Evaluation Standards and Norms, and the OECD/DAC Evaluation Quality Standard.

Desk Review Materials and Other Sources of Information

Available at HQ and to be supplied by DED	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Project document • DED Guidelines and ILO guidelines
Available in project office and to be supplied by project management	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Progress reports/Status reports • Technical and financial reports of partner agencies • Direct beneficiary record system • Good practices and Lessons learnt report (from TPR) • Other studies and research undertaken • Action Programme Summary Outlines • Mini-programme documents • Agreements between funders and ILO/IPEC • Project files • Recent national workshop proceedings or summaries • National Plan of Action documents • ILO/IPEC Pakistan Website
To be supplied by project management or SDC	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Credit Proposals for Phase III and earlier Phases • Project Document for Phase III • SDC Pakistan Website • SDC Cooperation Strategy for Pakistan 2006-2010 • SDC 's publications on Human Rights • SDC's Poverty Guidelines • SDC's Gender Policy and Toolkit • State of Human Rights in 2006-HRCP report • SPARC's State of Pakistan's Children 2006 • DAC Format (attached)

75. Consultations will be held with:

- Project management and staff
- SDC Pakistan (SCOP)
- DANIDA
- Partner agencies (provincial government, NGOs, workers and employers' associations, other IPEC projects and donors involved)
- Boys and Girls benefiting from the project
- Community Members
- Parents of girls and boys
- Teachers, government representatives, legal authorities etc.
- Other NGOs working on child labour issues in NWFP

76. Final Report Submission Procedure

For an independent evaluation, the following procedure is used:

- The team leader will submit a draft report **directly to IPEC DED in Geneva** IPEC DED will forward a copy to **key stakeholders** for comments on factual issues and for clarifications
- **IPEC DED** will consolidate the comments and send these to the team leader by the date agreed between DED and the team leader or as soon as the comments are received from stakeholders.
- The final report is submitted by the team leader **directly to IPEC DED in Geneva** who will then officially forward it to stakeholders, including the donors.

VI. Resources and Management

Resources:

The resources required for this evaluation are:

For the international evaluator:

- Fees for an international consultant for 26 work days.
- Air tickets from international consultant's home base to Peshawar, Pakistan, to Geneva and/or Berne, Switzerland, and return to home.
- DSA in accordance with ILO regulations and policies.

For the national evaluator:

- Fees for a national consultant for 20 work days.

For the evaluation exercise as a whole:

- Stakeholder workshop expenditures

A separate budget is available.

Management:

The evaluation consultant will report to and discuss any technical and methodological matters **directly with DED** should issues arise. IPEC project officials in Pakistan will provide administrative and logistical support during the evaluation mission.