



Evaluation Unit (EVAL)

Evaluation Title Page

- **Project Title:** ILO/ LUXENBOURG PROJECT ON CAPACITY BUILDING OF OCCUPATIONAL SAFETY AND HEALTH TRAINING
- **TC/SYMBOL:** VIE/05/01/LUX
- **Type of Evaluation:** FINAL INDEPENDENT
- **Country(ies):** VIETNAM
- **Project End:** 30TH JUNE 2009
- **Evaluation Manager:** SHAFINAZ HASSENDEEN
- **Administrative Unit :** ILO HANOI
- **Technical Unit:** ILO SUBREGIONAL OFFICE BANGKOK
- **Evaluation Team:** INSTITUTE FOR ENVIRONMENT AND SUSTAINABLE DEVELOPMENT
ASSOCIATE PROFESSOR.
HA HUY THANH
MS. LE MANH HUNG
MR. PHAM TOAN
MS. NGUYEN THI NGOC THANH
- **Date Evaluation Completed:** DECEMBER 2009 (evaluation report completed)
- **Key Words:** Occupational safety and health training, Small enterprises National Occupational safety and health system, ILO standards, Participatory approaches.

GENERAL PROJECT INFORMATION

Project Title: ILO/Luxembourg project for enhancing capacity of occupational safety and health training in Vietnam

Project Short Title: OSH training

Project code: VIE/05/01/LUX

Duration: August 2006 – June 2009

Executing Agency: International Labour Organization

Government implementing agency: The Ministry of Labour, Invalids and Social Affairs (Bureau for Safe Work)

Other Cooperating Agencies: Ministry of Health Vietnam General Confederation of Labour
Other concerned agencies

Budget: US\$ 530,000

Funding Agency: The Government of Luxembourg

Government contribution: 53,000 USD (in-kind)

TABLE OF CONTENTS

ABBREVIATIONS.....	3
FOREWORD	4
EXECUTIVE SUMMARY	6
 Part I: GENERAL INTRODUCTION.....	 8
I. PROJECT SUMMARY	8
II. INTRODUCTION OF THE EVALUATION	10
Part II: EVALUATION OF THE PROJECT IMPLEMENTATION.....	13
1. Effectiveness and results of the project.....	13
2. The linkage and relevance of project strategies	18
3. The efficiency of resource utilization.....	20
4. Project organization, management and coordination	23
5. Lessons drawn and issues to be improved	25
6. Opportunities	27
7. Project's impact assessment	28
7.1. Project's impact on beneficiary	28
7.2. Project's impact on triangle and multilateral coordination.....	30
7.3. Project's impact on gender equality.....	30
7.4. Project's impact on applying international standards of occupational safety and health.....	31
7.5. Project's impact on environmental protection.....	32
7.6. Project's sustainability: impact assessment and long-term effect of the project after accomplishment.....	32
Part III: CONCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATIONS.....	34
I. CONCLUSION.....	34
II. RECOMMENDATIONS.....	36
Annex 1: List of Reference documents	39
Annex 2: Project's results compared to expected objectives.....	40
Annex 3: List of interviewees.....	43
Annex 4: Terms of Referece.....	45

ABBREVIATION

OSH	Occupational safety and health
PMU	Project Management Unit
PAC	Project Advisory Committee
OD	Occupational disease
MoLISA	Ministry of Labour, Invalids and Social Affairs
CECEM	Communal Ability Development Center
BSW	Bureau for Safe Work
SME	Small and Medium sized enterprises
IESD	Institute for Environment and Sustainable Development
ILO	International Labour Organization
PAOT	Participatory Action Oriented Training
PAC,	Project Advisory Committee
PMU	Project Management Unit
PPP	Public Private Partnership
DoLISA	Department of Labour, Invalids and Social Affairs
SPSS	Statistical Package for Social Sciences
TOT	Train-of-trainers course
WIND	Workplace Improvement for Neighborhood development
WISE:	Workplace Improvement for small Enterprises
VGCL	Vietnam General Confederation of Labour

FOREWORD

The Project for **“Enhancing capacity of Occupational Safety and Health Training in Vietnam” (VIE/05/01/LUX)**, funded by the Government of Luxembourg and executed by the ILO with the main partners being MoLISA has been implemented for 3 years during September, 2006 – June, 2009.

The objective of the project is to strengthen occupational safety and health performance, helping reduce occupational diseases and accidents at work, improve social partners among the State administrative agencies, representative organizations of employers and employees by enhancing capacity of the Occupational Safety and Health Training Centre, consolidate the OSH training system, developing OSH training policies and services for social partners to ensure occupational safety, protect the health of workers and working environment in the course of socio-economic development and competitiveness improvement of Vietnamese goods.

The Project conducted its mid-term evaluation in September, 2008. Results for the mid-term evaluation showed that the implementation of the project met the social needs and the project was on the right track to achieve its long-term and short-term objectives.

According to the progress and requirements of the project, the ILO Hanoi Office collaborated with the IESD to carry out the final evaluation for the project. The objective of this evaluation was to focus on the effectiveness of the project’s results (immediate objectives and its intended and unintended effects) to beneficiaries and its organizational partners over the last 3 years. In addition to evaluating its effectiveness and impacts, the evaluation also aimed at recommendations so as its impact can be sustainable as defined in the project document.

The evaluation lasted from 11th May 2009 to 18th June, 2009 in Hanoi, Da Nang and Binh Duong. However, as on the project document it was not focus the project on any specific provinces, this evaluation will cover all targeted areas and regions in the activities implemented in the project.

This report has been developed based on the findings of the evaluation team (ET) based on site surveys of implementation of the project at central, provincial and local levels as well as direct participation in the workshops of the project in targeted provinces and discussion with relevant stakeholders. The findings and results of the mid-term evaluation have also been referred to by the ET in consolidating the general recommendations.

The report consists of 3 main parts:

- 1 Part I: General introduction of the project and the evaluation
- 2 Part II: Evaluation the organization, management, and implementation of the project
- 3 Part III: Conclusions and Recommendations.

The Evaluation Team takes the opportunities to express our sincere thanks to Project Management Unit, Project Advisory Committee, ILO Hanoi Office, ILO experts, staff of the OSH Training Center, participants in the project's training workshops for their active supports to create favorable conditions for the our team to participate in the workshops, to discuss and provide useful information so as we can fulfill the assignment.

Hà Nội, June, 2009

On behalf of the evaluation team

Associate Professor Hà Huy Thành

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

This report was developed based on the findings of the evaluation team through the survey on the implementation of project activities at central and local levels and its direct participation in workshops of the project in targeted provinces as well as through analysis, summarizing the judgments and evaluation by the experts and staff managing and implementing project activities. Main findings of the evaluation include:

- The Project enhanced the capacity on OSH training, meeting the needs of improved OSH training for Vietnam and has achieved its immediate objectives, contributing to the realization of the long-term objective specified in the project document;
- The Project was evaluated to be of high productivity through the use of its resources in improving capacity, skills for human resources development; integrating project activities with related national and international program and projects, saving the times and efforts while extending the project's beneficiaries; attracting resources from enterprises under the PPP: Public – Private Partnership model; mobilizing qualified staff and officer to participate in the project implementation;
- The project was well managed by assigning and selected experienced and enthusiastic staff in for management of project activities; work plan and monitoring plan were prepared since the starting to the final step of each activity;
- The project activities were closely coordinated and supervised from the central to local levels through its compliance to the principle of enhancing ownership of the implementing partners; investing in development of criteria for selection of personnel and trainers; being flexible in integrating activities and balancing the interests of different stakeholders;
- Lessons learnt from the project include: development of legal framework for duplication and use of project results and outputs; being flexible and proactive in management and coordination; paying attention to the savings and effective use of resources; mobilizing the participation of social partners, particularly of enterprises; ability to mobilize diversified resources;
- Points need to be improved in organization and implementation of project activities: it is necessary to have many resources for enhancing the diversification of communication strategy and promotion of project's products; strategy and ability to attract the participation of small enterprises; attention should be paid to the ages of trainers to ensure the harmonious exchanges of conventional experiences and ability to access new information.

- Challenges of the project are also the challenges to OSH training, including: training quality; criteria and organization to measure the impacts and usefulness of involving in OSH training and the ability to meet the needs and; changes in investment to upgrade training units;
- Through enhancing capacity for OSH Training Center, the project has created great impacts on beneficiaries from the central to local levels and on social partners; enhancing tripartite cooperation, promoting gender equality and improving capacity for trainers who are staff and officers in localities, OSH officers, State management officers, enterprises and workers;
- The Project ensured its sustainability as it directly supported one of the key objectives of the national program on OSH; outputs of the project will continue to be maintained and duplicated thanks to the national budget and other resources. Activities of the project which are universal can create condition for effective maintenance of the project activities.

The evaluation team has proposed recommendations for promoting OSH training activities including the improvement of awareness of OSH training service; promotion OSH training service toward meeting the real needs of customers; improvement of training quality; expansion of international cooperation, linking the training with OSH trainers; integrating OSH training activities toward balancing the interests of all parties and paying attention to the quality of the activities' outputs, diversifying training materials; continuing to include OSH training in the national program on OSH in the next phase.

The evaluation report has provided Recommendations for the next activities including the proactive development of some project proposals to mobilize financial resources to promote OSH training; setting up strategy for approaching potential donors; assigning staff to involve in developing future projects and program in preparation process and managing the project upon its operation as well as for monitoring and evaluating the project in order to ensure the sustainability and expansion of cooperation in the field.

Part I: GENERAL INTRODUCTION

I. PROJECT SUMMARY

1. Background of the project

OSH training is an important solution to ensuring safety and health for workers. Enhancing OSH is an important policy of the Communist Party and of the State of Vietnam which was manipulated in the Resolution, Labour Code and other relevant laws (the Law on Protection of People's Health, Law on Protection and Fighting against Fire and Explosion), in under-law documents regulating the implementation of the laws and Government's programmers. The management and implementation of OSH activities at different levels, sectors, organizations and production units in recent years have made many changes, contributing to the renovation process and the socio-economic development of the country. However, with the needs of economic development in the renovation stage, particularly in the context of international economic integration, the implementation of OSH in many enterprises, especially in small and medium-sized and private enterprises, has faced with many obstacles and shortcomings of which OSH training has not been fully paid attention to while the awareness of workers of OSH has been still limited.

Training in occupational safety and health for employers and workers is a mandatory requirement for enterprises under the law in most of the countries in the world, including Vietnam. An effective OSH training strategy and policy will significantly contribute to minimizing occupational accidents and diseases, to strengthening State management on OSH, improving quality of human resources, creating more values for enterprises, promoting and workers' capability and motivation to working and improving the competitiveness of the enterprises and of the nation. However, OSH training is a typical training service which requires investment in infrastructure for practice, including machine, equipment, human resources and training capacity which is very costly. The targeted groups and coverage of OSH training is diversified which requires large investment in terms of both in human resource and materials.

One of the important solutions for promoting OSH training policy and strategy is investment and development of OSH Training Center (in facilities and equipment, personnel and strong financial mechanism) to be capable of providing training services for different targeted groups.

Based on such awareness, OSH Training Center under the MoLISA was established in August, 2004.

The ILO/Luxemburg Project for “Enhancing Capacity of OSH Training in Vietnam” funded by the Government of Luxembourg, executed by the ILO and implemented by the MoLISA has directly supported the efforts of the Government of Vietnam in developing and realizing the national policy on OSH training, strengthening the capacity of OSH Training Center, contributing to minimizing occupational accidents and diseases, promoting sustainable development.

2. Objectives of the project

Development Objective

To strengthen occupational safety and health performance, helping reduce occupational diseases and accidents at work, improve social relations among the State administrative agencies, representative organizations of employers and employees by enhancing capacity of the Occupational Safety and Health Training Centre, consolidate the OSH training system, developing OSH training policies and services for social partners to ensure occupational safety, protect the health of workers and working environment in the course of socio-economic development and competitiveness improvement of Vietnamese goods

Immediate objectives

- To make a strategy and long term plan of OSH training aiming at realizing Vietnamese laws. An occupational safety and health training system competent for analyzing and assessing training needs, designing training curricula and providing OSH training for instructors, trainers, employers, workers and occupational safety and health officers should also be formed.
- The OSH Training Centre will conduct training courses for trainers and instructors; and provide refresher training for labour protection officers and social partners on a fee-for-service basis.

3. Beneficiaries of the project:

Direct beneficiaries were OSH Training Center and its staff; staff, trainers from participating Ministries, Sectors and provinces participating in the project activities.

Indirect beneficiaries were enterprises and workers.

4. Management structure:

The MoLISA was the implementing agency, holding the positions as members in Project Advisory Committee (PAC), Project Management Unit (PMU) at central level and in Provincial Support Committee. The ILO Office in Vietnam and Bangkok were executing and backstopping agencies of the project.

5. Other implementing agencies:

Other ministries and sectors implementing the project included: Ministry of Health, Confederation of Labour; Universities, vocational colleges and enterprises. These agencies and organizations collaborated with the MoLISA at central level and Department of Labour Invalids and Social Affairs (DoLISA) at provincial level and other local agencies to implement the project activities. ILO Office in Vietnam was the office to provide backstopping for the implementation of the project.

6. Targeted provinces of the project: The project implemented OSH training for labour inspectors, OSH staff nationwide and conducted TOT training courses on WISE/WIND for trainers in 19 provinces/cities in 3 region: North – Center – South of Vietnam.

II. INTRODUCTION OF THE EVALUATION

According to the monitoring, evaluation plan of the project, after the mid-term evaluation report carried out in September, 2008, the independent Evaluation Team (ET) of the Institute for Environmental and Sustainable Development was invited by the ILO Office in Vietnam to undertake the final evaluation starting from 11th May, 2009 until 18th June, 2009.

1. Objective of final evaluation

The project's mid-term evaluation focused on design and delivery factors while this independent final evaluation will focus on project outcomes, in other words the effects of the project's results (immediate objectives and its intended/unintended effect) on the project's intended beneficiaries and institutional partners over the past three years. While assessing the effectiveness, efficiency and impact of the project so far, the evaluation will be forward looking and develop recommendations on the existing OSH training strategy and means of institutionalizing good practices. The core evaluation concerns for assessing project performance are:

- Relevance and strategic fit of project strategies
- Effectiveness and outcomes
- Efficiency
- Sustainability, replication and institutionalization of good practices

2. Scope and Focus

The final evaluation will focus on, but not be limited to, the following areas:

- Identification of the Project's good practices, lessons learned, successes and challenges
- Assessment of the Project's performance in term of achieving the immediate objectives
- Identification of any unintended outcomes, results, and impacts
- Identification of opportunities that have contributed to the successful implementation of the Project
- Identification of constraints, if any, that have affected the effectiveness of the Project

3. Outputs

Final evaluation provides lessons, alerts and recommendations of possibilities for next period.

4. Evaluation team and evaluating methodologies

4.1 Members of the Evaluation Team

The ET included 4 members under the leadership of Assistant Professor, PhD Hà Huy Thành. Other members of the ET included:

Engineer Phạm Toàn, OSH expert, part-time trainer of the OSH Training Center

MA. Lê Mạnh Hùng, independent consultant

BA Nguyễn Thị Ngọc Thanh, researcher

4.2 Evaluation methodologies

The ET combined qualitative and quantitative methodologies.

Relating to the qualitative methodology: the ET studied relevant documents provided by the project office and partners of the project; intensive interviews with targeted groups (beneficiaries and implementers) of the project. The ET also participated in achievement workshops organized in Da Nang and Binh Duong provinces; interviewing participants of the TOT courses who are labour inspectors, lecturers in vocational training college in Central and Southern provinces, employers of the WISE participating enterprises.

Relating to the quantitative methodology, the ET designed a quantitative questionnaire to quickly collect information relating to the awareness and evaluation of the project activities, the quality, effectiveness and sustainability of the project, learning the strength, difficulties and impacts of the project on participating groups. The Sample Analytical Framework of the ILO had also been referred to by the ET in designing the questioners.

Due to limitation of time and as the project had been undergone mid-term evaluation in September, 2008, the ET used the qualitative survey to TOT participants and representatives from enterprises ((58/66 participants) participating in Central and Southern region, and in the North. The project activities under consideration and evaluated in the mid-term evaluation was referred to during the final evaluation.

After collecting the information, the ET used the SPSS program to process the quantitative information to figure out the evaluation indicators according to the expected objectives.

Sample Analytical Framework of ILO has been referred to by evaluation team to design research form and interview.

In addition to the above mentioned quantitative survey a number of key stakeholders were consulted interviewed during the evaluation process.

The evaluation manager of this evaluation was Ms. Shafinaz Hassendeen Senior Programme Officer ILO Hanoi , the ILO evaluation officer at the Regional Office –Bangkok provided overall support and oversight and quality control of the evaluation process. Mr. Nguyen Ba Lam, National Project Coordinator, and Ms. Le Thanh Ha, Administrative Assistant of the Project provided administrative and logistic support to the evaluation process, and made available relevant documentations to the evaluation team.

The draft evaluation report was circulated to relevant stakeholders for comments, a workshop was also held, where the findings were presented for comments and validation. The comments received were incorporated wherever possible into the final report.

Part II: EVALUATION OF THE PROJECT IMPLEMENTATION

1. Effectiveness and results of the project

The effectiveness and results of the project will be evaluated through assessing the levels of immediate and development objectives achieved by reviewing the project's outputs.

After 3 years of implementation, the project has fulfilled most of the activities set up in the project document and other activities arising during the collaboration and linkage with related programs and projects.¹

Activities, products and outputs of the project have directly or indirectly support the development of policies on OSH training, capacity building of training needs assessment, designing OSH training programmers and organization of OSH training courses for targeted groups; enhancing capacity for OSH Training Center of organization of TOT courses; training staff from social partners.

Some major outputs of the project include:

1.1 Establishment, educating and building capacity for a cadre of instructors, part-time and fulltime trainers, collaborators of OSH for OSH Training Center and OSH training units nationwide. Particularly:

A cadre of trainers and collaborators of the OSH Training Center was established and trained with 100 trainers and 300 collaborators nationwide, particularly:

- A network of more than 300 participants who are staff and officers from the Bureau for Safe Work, labour inspectorate, verification centers, preventive health centers nationwide have been trained and improved in advisory skills and on OSH, including 160 from the Labour Inspectorate; 62 from Bureau for SafeWork including 35 from OSH Training Center, 27 from verification centers and 70 provincial preventive health centers (all numbers is head-counted).
- In addition to the full-time trainers of the OSH Training Center, 94 trainers/participants from the above network, after attending the TOT course were selected to join the part-time trainers' network for the training activities provided by OSH Training Center in 3 regions: Hanoi, Da Nang, and Ho Chi Minh City. The list of trainers has been categorized by professional fields, occupational fields, regions and types of enterprises that they can provide lectures for.
- Besides organizing the above TOT and refresher training courses, the project also supported the participation of trainers from OSH Training Center in improving teaching skills.

Although it is still necessary to carry out programmers and measures for building capacity relating to teaching methodologies and skills, and training capacity for staff of the OSH Training Center² as well as for trainers in related ministries, sectors, the foundation of a cadre of full-time and part-time OSH trainers is a good investment. This is the fundamental and key basis for expansion of OSH training. This cadre is an important source for implementing OSH training strategies and policies. The ET shares the viewpoint of PAC Chairwoman that training of trainers is a *key* solution in enhancing capacity for OSH Training Center. It creates the conditions for strengthening the ownership of the center. This is more meaningful in the context of increasingly

¹ See Annex 2 for the summary of project activities

² Mid-term evaluation, page 16 and 17

higher pressure from the OSH training needs.

1.2. Strategies on occupational safety and health training for relevant targeted groups have been accomplished, including: OSH training policies which propose to develop the standards for establishment of OSH training institutions to ensure the quality; to invest in the OSH Training Center to enable it to be the National OSH Training Center. An advisory report on OSH training policies was prepared during the project and has been in consultation with the government, employers' and employees' representatives before being approved by BSW for submitting to ministerial level. Besides, a 2-year and 5-year Strategy has been developed for the Center; quarterly and yearly training programmed for Center; and especially an advisory report for OSH training. Once approved, the advisory report will serve as an important tool in directing the development of OSH training. The availability of an OSH training strategy will create conditions for the OSH training center to mobilize domestic and international resources for development.

1.3. Consolidation of the training curricula package and basic training methodologies on OSH to be suitable with the practical needs and have the mechanism for updating training materials. A set of 4 professional training curricula for four high hazardous industries including construction, electricity utilization, mechanical production and mining, a package of 8 OSH training films were elaborated. 8 contents specified in the Circular no. 37/2005/BLĐTBXH dated 29/12/2005 issued by the MoLISA was developed. Two ILO's manuals including "Improving working condition and productivity in garment industry" and "WISE- Work Improvement in Small Enterprises - Package for Trainers" were translated into Vietnamese. There were some different ideas relating to the diversification and typical manner of the OSH training materials, according to the evaluation by the PMU and the findings of the ET, these training materials are considered good materials for references which can support enterprises, particularly SMEs to directly apply in their working environment.³

1.4. The OSH Training Centre capable of conducting training courses for trainers and instructors; Provision of refresher training for labour protection officers and social partners on a fee-for-service basis have been established and developed which is one of the important result of the project.

By the end of 2004, the Center had organized training courses for 251 participants. In 2006, when the project started, the Center organized 66 training courses for 6,174 participants. Totaling from Sep. 2006 to Jun. 2009, the Center organized 387 training courses for 23,079 accumulated participants from enterprises⁴ in which 100% of the 2008 participants attended on a fee-for-service basis which is a clear proof of the project's success. The ability of the OSH Training Center in organization of training and provision of consultation on OSH for employers, labour protection officers of enterprises for supporting and on a fee-for-service basis is shown in the following aspects:

(i) The linkage between the Center and enterprises in promoting working conditions improvements, enhancing OSH training in a closer manner through training courses provided by the project, particularly through organization of WISE/TOT, and other TOT courses in provinces; conducting training and consulting activities in different types of enterprises; and contributing to

³ Interviewing Ms. Doan Minh Hoa, Head of PAC

⁴ In 2007, the Center organized 150 training courses with 8,705 head-counted participants while the number in 2008 was 171 and 8,200 respectively – statistics from the OSH Training Center

improving working conditions and minimizing occupational accidents and diseases at enterprise level. Information on improvements made in enterprises after attending training courses organized by the Center was incentives to the Center, enhancing the consultation capacity for the Center.

(ii) The coverage of the Center's activities has expanded. The WISE programme of Project was implemented in 17 provinces including Bac Kan, Thai Nguyen, Lang Son, Hung Yen, Thanh Hoa, Da Nang, Quang Ngai, Thua Thien-Hue, Quang Tri, Binh Dinh, Quang Binh, Binh Duong, Tien Giang, Ba Ria – Vung Tau, Ben Tre, Dong Nai and Tay Ninh. OSH training activities by the Center were carried out nationwide. However, the activities implemented by the Center in targeted provinces of the project for targeted groups were more intensive and diversified.

(iii) Targeted groups for the training on OSH by the Center have been more diversified. With the support of the project, the Center selected and provided OSH training for 30 Trade Union staff; 30 employers and 40 managers in several ministries and sectors and 50 trainers in some universities, colleges and vocational training centers. Training courses have been conducted in 3 regions with number of participants of which 228 head counted staff from ministries, industries, 54 head counted staff from local unions, 157 head counted staff from universities and vocational training centers.

(iv) OSH training contents have been broadened. Particularly, the training content on OSH in agriculture has been implemented with the financial supports of the project. The *WIND/TOT* training course organized in four provinces in the North has received 143 more volunteers and 1,630 farmer households with 8,421 improvements in the one year term of 2008-2009. Furthermore, the updates on OSH issues like the Seoul Declaration on Safety and Health at Work, OSH management systems, the Global Strategy on OSH issued by ILO and OSH culture have been integrated into training programs of the Centre.

(v) The consulting role as well as activities to raise awareness of OSH in the Centre have gradually been improved and diversified, for example, organizing theme seminars on developing OSH training systems at national level (about OSH training policies and plans in the next 5 years); organizing seminars reviewing the implementation results of training programs, seminars fostering the National Week for OSH and Prevention of Firing and Explosion, as well as the World Day for Safety and Health at Work on 28 April 2009 with supports for the "Children Drawing Day on OSH" in the Dai Yen Primary School, Hanoi etc.

(vi) The OSH training effectiveness has been measured and proven by lively evidences in respect of benefits gained from training courses of the Centre. By raising awareness of OSH of worker participants and trainees from vocational schools who are potential labor force, as well as trainers from various ministries and offices, Vietnam's workers have better access to the basic knowledge and culture on OSH, which will make them more professional, leading to higher labor quality and lower risks in labor relationship in domestic and foreign-invested businesses for Vietnamese workers. Additionally, employees' higher skills will help businesses to minimize expenses for preventing and compensating labor accidents, and risks regarding products and business performance due to bad specifications on OSH. The survey report, which was conducted by the ET during the WISE achievement activities in the Center and the South in May 2009, shows that 69% of businesses participating the WISE training course and implementing improvements confirm they have significantly reduced compensation amounts for labor accidents, increased profit and revenues; 31% of businesses say they have saved very large

amount of costs; no business says their expenses for labor accidents have increased. In respect of training work and training materials, 3.4% of businesses say they are necessary and 96.6% say they are very necessary and practical for their performance.

(vii) The building and marketing of OSH Training Center's trademark has been promoted in a professional way, facilitating the access to services in respect of OSH training. A website introducing the OSH work and training activities of the OSH Centre was constructed; A detailed training/educating work plan in 2009 and software for managing training activities of the Center and a profile introducing the Training Center were developed and a list of collaborating OSH trainers divided by professional category, location and by specialized subjects was registered; a quick evaluation of the fitness and effectiveness of using training materials was also developed within the framework of the project; Besides, the project also help produce films on OSH for broadcasting on television to many interested audience nationwide, contributing to improving the effectiveness of the OSH training propaganda

(viii) The facilities of centers (office equipment) are provided to enhance its capacity of training, meeting demands of training center and relating programmes/projects.

There have been many project's activities and products. However, according to the ET, the main products were comprehensive and flexible policies, strategies on OSH training, a cadre of qualified full-time and part-time trainers on OSH who were provided with refresher training, a set of basic OSH training materials updated and tailor-made, an OSH training center capable of OSH training.

According to the evaluation of the PAC, PAC Chairwoman and PMU, up to date, the project has fulfilled all activities as set out in the schedule and achieved all objectives of the project. The project also carried out related activities according to the requirements by the stakeholders of the project. The products of the project have been well received by its social partners as they were developed based on the needs of involving agencies.

Relating to the first immediate objectives of the project, with a comprehensive OSH training policy, the activities on OSH training were included in the National Program as one of its contents. Together with the training activities conducted by the OSH Training Center from the central to local level, the ET shared the judgment of the participating agencies in implementation of the project as well as of the mid-term evaluation report that all project activities aimed to achieve this target⁵ and up to the final evaluation process, the project had achieved its first immediate objective and even went beyond this objective in many aspects. While the first immediate objective limited its target to ensuring the enforcement of legal system of Vietnam, the project activities and products had step by step reached the international standards, contributing to enhancing the human resources of Vietnam to gradually approach international working environment. In addition, the OSH training system was furthermore, expanded to farmers and rural labour.

Relating to the second immediate objective that is the OSH Training Center are capable to organize TOT courses, training for social partners on a fee-for-service basis, the ET realized that with the results achieved by the project, particularly the growth of the Center in organization and implementation of project activities as well as in achieving the indicators on training under the National Program, the project has achieved its second immediate objective and to some extent,

⁵ Mid-term evaluation report, the Project on Enhancing Capacity of OSH Training in Vietnam (VIE.05/01LUX), CECM Evaluation Team (Nguyen Thi Bich Tam – Ngo Thi Thu Hang), October, 2008, page 15

the achievements even went beyond this objective. This is proved by the fact that OSH Training Center is undergoing a process to upgrade to be national OSH Training Center. In addition, the project achievements have provided with necessary conditions for expansion and establishment of more OSH training centers in order to meet increasing OSH training needs. This shows the capacity and the ownership of the center in its development activities.

Relating to the development objective of the project, the ET considers that the enhancement of occupational safety and occupational health, contributing to the reduction of occupational accidents and diseases at enterprise level; promoting social relations between State management agencies, workers' and employers' organizations is a time-taking process, which is affected by many different elements and is the result achieved from the implementation of many program, projects, particularly the reduction of occupational accidents. However, with the project's results, including the participation and benefiting by many social partners from the planning and implementing process, and further more, the fitting between the project objective with the objective of the national program on OSH, the ET shares the assessment of the PAC, PMU and other participating agencies that there have been many proves showing the achievement of the development objective specified in the project document. This is also suitable with the initial evaluation results of implementing the national program during the 2008-2010 periods, including the objective to reduce occupational accidents and diseases.

2. The linkage and relevance of project strategies

The strategies of the project are: developing and implementing a comprehensive occupational safety and health strategy; capacity building for occupational safety and health training centers by training a number of occupational safety and health trainers and lecturers, employers, employees in the 3 areas: Northern, Southern and Central Viet Nam as the foundation for forming a market of quality occupational safety and health services and improving the enforcement of the labor related legislation. The project will contribute to the development of OSH trainer training model with employers, occupational safety managing officers at the enterprise level as the major target groups. The project strategies will be implemented at the central level concerning policies and strategies of training, orientation of training and implemented at the lower levels by services of training centers provided at the local and enterprise level as well as directly for employees.

The above strategies of the project are highly relevant with the objectives of the socio-economic development plan 2006-2010 in the labor and social sector which are *creating quick and sustainable advance in the field of labor and social affairs for gradual international integration; improving the quality and taking effective use of the human resource for the industrialization and modernization of the country; increasing incomes and improving material and spiritual life of the employee.*

They are also in line with the strategy of the government's project for promoting strategies and national policies on occupational safety and health 2006-2010⁶⁶, i.e. To decrease work accidents and occupational diseases, to promote state management capacity in occupational safety and to ensure 80% employees who undertake jobs that have strict requirements for occupational safety and health and all the officials in charge of occupational safety and health are trained on occupational safety and health.

The strategies of the project meet the increasing demand of enterprises for training on occupational safety and health. According to the result of a labor survey, the number of enterprises and businesses has increased quickly to 350,000 enterprises and 3 million individual production households so far. The labor force of Viet Nam has also grown rapidly to about 46 million workers among whom the rate of trained employees is 25%⁷. Training on occupational safety and health is legally required, and enterprises have responsibility to give guidance on organization of occupational safety and health training. The increase in the number of enterprises and labor force leads to an increasing demand for occupational safety and health training. This becomes more pressing as there is a lack of occupational safety and health training facilities and of criteria to define what an occupational safety and health facility is. An occupational safety and health center established with its full capacity will not only help training a number of extended lecturers for training on occupational safety and health but also is a model to share and learn from and be replicated in other localities in order to satisfy the demand of society. In short, it can be said the strategies of the project can meet the increasing demand for training on occupational safety and health even in the future.

The strategies of the project was also to learn from and build on the *inheritance, use, development* and to integrate the accomplishments of other related projects which were implemented prior to or are being implemented at the same time with the project as well as created an opportunity for project expansion. Some lessons that the project learnt from are teaching methodology for the older persons, consultancy skills, training curricula and materials for occupational safety and health, the evaluation method for training needs from project "Safety program and unified labor inspection system (2001-2005)"⁸, or the Participatory Action Oriented Training (PAOT) methodology, WIND programme, method of using verification form etc from Project "ILO/Japan Regional Program on promotion of occupational safety and health capacity in agriculture (2004-2007)", the experience in conducting labor safety related activities in localities, and measures to improve working condition in medium and small enterprises from the component of improving working condition in Project "Assistance to Enterprise Area Program" funded by DANIDA.

The trainees become resource for training activities of other projects and programmes organized by Danida. The project trainers also become resource for supporting locals and industries to meet requests for training on occupational safety and health. In 2008, training documents support nationwide training to meet quota of training on occupational safety and health⁹.

⁶⁶ National programme on labor protection, occupational safety and health approved by the Prime Minister in October 2006.

⁷ Jobs surveys in 2005

⁸ Interviewing results, project coordinator "Safety programme and United labour inspection system" (2001-2005)

⁹ According to report on OSH training activities in 2008, Training center and LUX project have trained 285 trainers, trained in OSH for 920 officers, 5377 employers and 1700 workers. Training center also trains 228 officers from Ministry of Health and Institute for labour health, 339250 employers/safety officers and 195.771 workers from ministries, industries (Ministry of Industry, Ministry of Construction, Ministry of National Defense, Ministry of

The strategies of the project were designed to meet the plans set out in the Decent Work Country Agenda¹⁰ which is *to create many opportunities of decent work for men and women in freedom, equality, safety and secured dignity*. Ensuring occupational safety and health, promoting safety culture, developing and implementing prevention strategies are important contents within the framework of decent work. Project of supporting training on occupational safety and health with the participation of tripartite partners also aims to obtain this objective. The result of the evaluation on the occupational safety and health related activities of Viet Nam in implementing this cooperation framework is considered a lively evidence of the decent work program.

3. The efficiency of resource utilization

The efficiency of resource utilization for project activities is considered through the ability to use resource, time and personnel for the completion of the project

Invested resource has been used mainly for capacity building of skills and competency of staff.

This is the best and most suitable way to use the current available resource. OSH training is a kind of typical training that needs investment in people and equipment. Therefore, to ensure the efficiency of investment in capacity building, the project must have its own plan to harness the internal strength of stakeholders and network with other projects as well as select the right persons for its investment strategy.

The project has applied new standards for trainers which require that the trainers must hold at least University Degree and have 5 years experience in OSH. At local level, trainees for TOT must be active and experienced in OSH training, have basic knowledge about WISE, PAOT or training capacity about WIND or POSITIVE, and commit to organize WISE training for enterprises in their provinces.

The evaluation team deems that the project has initial success in the selection and trains for the OSH training center a generation of professional, active and qualified trainers. This is not only reflected by the number of trainers but also by their ability to perform at enterprises. According to statistics of WISE provinces, trainees are active in giving advices for the improvement of working conditions. For example, in Ben Tre province, after the 2-day training course, the candidates of TOTs were able to network and organize: 5 training courses for enterprises with the participation of 30 people (5 company leaders, 13 supervisors and 12 technicians); 2 visits to enterprises and gain 31 improvements. In addition, all the activities raised by these trainees were supported by enterprises¹¹. All of these activities were carried out in 1 month. This meant all the selected trainees are capable of independently organizing, implementing and expanding their training activities.

The project resource is used for development of OSH training materials

A set of 4 professional training curricula on occupational safety and health for 4 high hazardous industries including construction, electricity utilization, mechanic production and mining were developed. Those are of the very first and official training materials on OSH in Vietnam follow

Agriculture, Ministry of Police) to help ministries to achieve their quota in OSH training.

¹⁰ ILO/Vietnam Decent Work Agendar signed by ILO and the tripartite partners on 13 July 2006.

¹¹

the regulation of the Government on OSH training in Vietnam. The materials are commended as useful, professional and easy for application. The authors of these training materials are all leading experts, who have good qualification and experienced in the fields. Therefore, the training materials are positively welcomed and 97.5% of the interviewees think that the training materials are suitable with current situation for the training of staffs and managers at enterprise. Ms. Doan Minh Hoa, Head of the Project Advisory Committee is the very first and official said *“We have seen a fact that for many years, there is no any standard training material. Therefore, our training is not efficient. Due to the lack of training materials, we have trainings, giving certificates for trainers but at the meantime employment accidents still frequently occurred. This means those training are timely, costly and inefficient. The project has supported for the Training Center to develop a series of training materials for training of employers, employees. The Training Center has made those training materials public for interested individuals, organizations and relevant partners ...”*

Although those are only basic and new training materials that the contents still need to be adapted to suit the Vietnam condition so that they can be useful references for enterprises.

In addition, the Project also supported the development of a package of 8 OSH training films with 8 contents specified in the Circular no. 37/2005/BLĐTBXH dated 29/12/2005 issued by the MoLISA. Two ILO's training materials on OSH including “Improving working condition and labour productivity in garment industry” and “WISE-Improving working conditions in SMEs (Trainers' Book)” were translated into Vietnamese to provide specific technical content and training methodologies for trainers.

According to the rapid assessment by the evaluation team, 85.2% of the interviewed trainees think that the new training materials satisfy the need of information supply and exchange (of which 50.6% said that the information is quite sufficient and 34.6% think the information is really sufficient).

“In our opinion, these training materials are carefully compiled with good quality and the OSH Council as well as MOLISA have accepted and promoted them. We have made sample training which means we base on the training materials to record a real standard training and send this sample to all provinces. This is a fast way to implement the training at local level because with the training materials only, the trainers are still embarrassed so with the sample CDs that the Training Center has used, teachers and trainers can hand over the CDs to all 64 provinces in the past and 63 at present. That's why they are very confident and after they use it to teach, they can have additional comments”¹²¹²

The project is a bridge for expanding training and improving partnership between the OSH training center and enterprises. In combination between the project activities and the plan of OSH training center, in 2007, the Center opened 150 training courses for 8705 trainees, of which 70 courses were given for more than 4,000 employees in Vietnam enterprises. After trainings in OSH training Center, trainees from big corporation, enterprises have come back to invite the Center to train for their company as a whole.

The project has given useful tools to measure benefits after OSH training. Particularly, field trip activities on OSH promotion in enterprises were very helpful. According the reports of enterprises involved, after the training, 73.3% see the working condition and working spirit of

¹² Interviewed part-time trainers

worker are better; 26.7% think much better (this is mostly in enterprises with little improvement in OSH environment in the past). 100% workers at surveyed enterprises confirm that the training and improvements are very feasible. This result have created trustworthy for enterprises about the training and encourage them to eagerly invest in OSH training activities and cooperate with the training center. This is the foundation for the PPP model (Public Private Partnership)

The project has established an efficient inter-sectoral management and implementation organization

The members of the PMU and PSM are not only those who have the real power in the implementation and state management of OSH but also have strong determination and experience in OSH, enterprises, training and PAOT implementation. Therefore, the project is smoothly run. Members of the Advisory Board and the PMU come from MOLISA, MOH, and Vietnam General Confederation of Labour (VGCL), Deans of vocational training schools and Director of the OSH training center. The variety of members from different sectors allows the project to operate easily whether at national or local level. The design of such inter-sectoral management organization shows that the project has seized all the possible opportunities to make its activities go ahead and gain best results even with the limited resource and finally reach the development objective as well as the short term objective of the project. .

4. Project organization, management and coordination

4.1 Project management

The ET judged that the project was well managed with the following points:

Firstly, personnel involving in implementation of the project included experts who were very experienced in project execution. Members of PMU were key officers for the Bureau for Safe Work; the cadre of trainers included senior international specialists, experts who had been working for a long time with the Bureau for Safe Work so that the implementation was smooth and appropriate.

Secondly, the Project had well-planned activities. The monitoring system was clear and effective which had been developed since the start of work plan implementation. The monitoring plan to monitor 12 targeted provinces in the central and southern regions which implemented WISE program contained the monitoring date and carried out by the staff of the OSH training center or from the project and PMU. The monitoring dates was continuously recorded in the *monitoring plan* in comparison with work plan for implementation of the project's activities which showed the regular and updated monitoring conducted by the project. This project's independent, effective monitoring system enabled it to have a close follow-up on its results to adjust the activities to be better operation. This is clearly shown through the level of success in project's activities in terms of both quality and quantity.

Thirdly, the project received the close collaboration and technical backup from the ILO Hanoi Office and Bangkok office during its implementation of the activities as well as for the activities in responses to the national safety week on OSH, the World Day for Safety and Health.

However, the instability of the project personnel (changes of coordinator and head of the PMU) during the implementation of the project has also caused some delays in implementation of the project activities. For example, the report on assessment of OSH training needs, which should

have been completed before conducting any training activity of the project, could only be finalized when the project ended. Although there were objective reasons for changing the personnel of the project, this should be noted during the implementation of the project.

4.2 Coordination – implementation of the project

The ET considered that project coordination was smooth from the central to local levels in terms of the following aspects:

The project was **executed in the principle of enhancing the ownership of the beneficiaries.**

The project was executed through service contract and output management In working with the OSH Training, there was contract with specific requirements of the outputs. In addition, the contract also mentioned the needs for establishment of a group including 6 people responsible for logistic and financial matters of the activities. Such arrangement could allow the OSH Training center (contract signatory as well as the beneficiaries) to have the entire rights to implement the activities. Results showed that the OSH Training Center not only enhanced its training capacity but also building capacity for management, organization and implementation of the project. The 6 members of this group will act as the key and professional staff to implement training activities and organization of other activities of this Training center in the future.

For activities at local levels: according to the initiatives of the National Project Coordinator and the Head of the PMU, each project activity will be contracted to organizer which was Labor Inspectorate in provincial DoLISA. The organizer should be responsible for organizing a range of activities including: organization of the training workshop for resource trainers (labour inspectors, staff of related agencies, sector at provincial level) – from preparation to follow-up activities. After that, 5 resource trainers in each province needed to conduct training for at least 30 participants from 4 – 6 SMEs, each SME needed to send 5-7 people to join the course, including members of the management board; organization of the follow-up visit to the participating enterprise and regularly reported to the project. Such management enabled the project office to quickly and effectively collect final outputs while ensuring that resource trainers could improve the capacity for organization, management, monitoring and implementation of their responsible activities by themselves, in addition to improving their training capacity.

Secondly, **integrating the implementation of project activities with** the related international and national program and project for saving personnel and times of the project as well as of its beneficiaries. This was clearly seen through the organization of the training courses at locality and in enterprises. The following figures on the results of the WISE/TOT organized in the South can show the highly qualified and experienced management skills of the project personnel: 40 enterprises having attended the training courses in locality registered to make nearly 150 improvements within 2 months. However, just within 1.5 months, there were more than 130 improvements made¹³. Inherited from the activities of the Project on “Safe Work and Integrated Labour Inspection (2001 – 2005)”, therefore, the project’s WISE training program was integrated with the activities of the labour inspection on safety to local enterprises. This enabled the project to ensure the quality, the progress, saving the financial resources, time and efforts. Participants were labour inspectors and OSH staff in related sectors and enterprises in 17 provinces/cities participated in the training courses, totaling 642 accumulated people.

¹³ Report of Training center in WISE seminar in Binh Duong on 14 May 2009.

5. Lessons drawn and issues to be improved

The project succeeded in building a legislative frame to facilitate and make use of its results and products such as OSH training policy approved by the government; encourage the other social partners to use the training materials; the appropriate strategies and training policy ensuring the approval of this training program is one of the nation's priorities which could be done by certain national resources and commitment. This also lays a good foundation to attract international resources.

Flexibility and creativeness in the management of the project is one of the good lessons drawn. During the project implementation, the Management Board and the Advisory Board are always actively directing to the building of preventive OSH training strategies, promoting the effective and safety practice, enhancing human resource capacity, product quality, and enterprise prestige; increasing the consensus of other social partners for the fulfillment of the national program on OSH. The evaluation group emphasizes on the 'driving force' role of the project so as to praise the flexibility and creativeness in the project management as it was conducted before the approval of the national program.

The project also succeeded in building criteria for recruitment participants as training-of-trainers. One useful experience to be shared here is that in the trainee recruitment for training centers and local establishments, beside the trainees' profession criterion, it is necessary to pay attention on the gaps between the older and the younger generation, between the experienced trainers and the new ones. Thus, the project not only stresses on training techniques but also on the changes of ways to conduct the training program effectively. According to Mr. Lam, the National Project Coordinator "the young have ability and their ways to "warm up" the training class, as they are suitable to styles and culture of the modern society", which is totally matched with the purposes of WISE to apply PAOT method. Mrs. Hoa, Head of Advisory Board said "This is to avoid the previous passive and boring teaching and learning method, to ensure both the expertise criterion and the expansion of the training courses".

The project was successful in the efficient and cost-effective use of human resource as well as in the mobilizing participation of stakeholders, especially the enterprises, and the collaboration with various parties for the general objectives.

As to the issues needed to be improved, there have not been adequate policies and encouraging strategies to the enterprise. In many project training courses, the enterprise participants have little power and influence, resulting in the lowliness of improvement. The experience shared at the workshops in Da Nang and Binh Duong shows that any enterprise having their leaders trained in the training course, the improvement was conducted very quickly. However, most of the enterprises send representatives to the training course reluctantly and just for pleasing the organizer so the result is not so high.

Experience from organizing training courses given by the Department of Inspectorates shows that to draw the enterprises participation it is needed to organize the training course together with training on policies on OSH in enterprises. This way allows many enterprises to attend and can popularize knowledge to many targets. However, the training program was shorten, and just provided typical introduction; it did not comprise all fields and professions. Therefore, it is necessary to consider the work plan for program integration to ensure the effectiveness.

The project has not been able to diversify the communication and promotion for its products. Traditionally, the project's products are disseminated via administration channel so the result is

not high. On one hand, WISE program is new to enterprises. On the other hand, it has not been widely informed in mass media so the trainers often find it difficult to approach and invite the enterprises to participate in the training course and the improvement program. According to the trainees from TOT, it is better to organize the training courses in places of enterprise clusters to promote for the activities in the training courses.

It is crucial to improve the strategies to attract small enterprises to participate in the project activities. More than 80% of investigated enterprises are not ready to pay for training cost and not active in organizing OSH training course (Almost all SMEs have been recently incorporated). Meanwhile 97% of enterprises say these activities are helpful. This proves that they are now aware of this issue but this awareness is not strong enough to actively implement OSH as one urgent and direct beneficial task to the enterprises themselves. It can be concluded that, the project has paved the way for the first step in socializing OSH training. However, more funds are needed to maintain the project for a certain more period of time so as to make it “mature” to continue the project accomplishment. The participants are mainly the large-scale enterprises with their OSH basis. The medium and small enterprises with affordable infrastructure have not been directed during the project implementation.

Building management system of OSH in Vietnam in training is not good.

6. Opportunities and challenges

The great potential need for services on OSH: Vietnam is now in the international economic integration with increasingly higher requirement for standardized international practice. The improvement of OSH in private economic sectors will give impetus for advantageous competition among enterprises. From the enterprises’ need, the socializing service on OSH and OSH training is a great potential market of the training centers.

The project activities are within the priority policies of the government of Vietnam and the ILO as well as in the collaboration between Vietnam and ILO, that is: toward Decent work for all Vietnamese people and ***therefore providing proactive position for mobilizing resources. The project has been taken care and frequently directed by the OHS Government bodies.*** These facilitate the direction for the actives of the OHS Training center in line with the state administration, approaching to international trends. be suitable to the needs of local companies. Therefore it will support an active move of resource mobilization.

Human resources of the OSH Training Center have been strengthened: At present, there are 642 trainees trained throughout the country. Their awareness is the sustainability of the project as they will maintain the project activities and disseminate OSH training, including WIND and WISE, when the project ends.

The collection of service fee is done from training activity and is not easy to realize: One of the criteria of the project is to socialize the OSH training activities on a fee-for-service basis; however, the participants trained in the projects were inspectors from Labour Departments and officers from ministry and local branches, which are establishments without authorized rights to taking service charge and advisory function. The direct agencies to work with enterprises in this issue now are DO Lisa’s Labour Inspectors and training courses are also integrated in labour inspection’s activities. This leads to great challenge when the Training Centers build up services

and collect service fee. Companies who pay OHS courses are big and experienced on OHS

Most of the enterprises are not prepared to invest in OSH training and no incentives to encourage enterprises to participate in training for workers: Currently, most of the small and medium enterprises in Vietnam have been operating in un-synchronous way with short-term profit businesses. Therefore, OSH has not been much paid attention or just has been done reluctantly. Therefore, enhancing training capacity, raising awareness of enterprises, pushing enterprises to change themselves, directing to OSH services is a long way to go and to “seed” which needs more support from the government, sponsors and the training center itself.

Training quality is still limited. The designing of a training program with reasonable quality and suitable with different types of enterprises is still difficult, particularly relating to the training time and training contents. Enterprises are very limited in time, with unstable labour force as many enterprises hire seasonal workers... This will make it difficult to ask enterprise members to participate fully with an appropriate number as the project requires (5-7 participants).

The ability to meet the needs and investments in upgrading training units are still limited, particularly at grassroots level. Now, the training center has no representative in different localities. Every activities of the center are done via local inspectors. This will lead to the passive and ineffective work of the center at local level.

There are no solutions to coordination with management offices.

Information, website etc. are limited.

Unhealthy market competition is a challenge for training center. At present, there are many training centers. The training center has to pay operation fee for national budget. Consequently, there is competition in price between training centers with others.

7. Project's impact assessment

7.1. Project's impact on the beneficiaries.

7.1.1 Training Center

Firstly, the project enhances capacity for the trainers cadre of the training center. Thanks to the project, the trainers of the OSH Training Center and BSW have been increased in number, enhanced capacity and raised awareness. *The project has trained a key generation of trainers for the Training Center.* It helps to build up a network of trainers on WISE in order to ensure the dissemination and expansion WISE program and PAOT methodology in the training course on OSH.

Secondly, thanks to this project, the Training Center can implement many other training courses to build up a network of experienced trainers in provinces; thus, creates a network of experienced trainers and exchanging training methods and contents.

Thirdly, the project helps the center to supply facility, equipments, including teaching tools.

Fourthly, through the project, the Training Center can work out orientation for the training task in the center in particular and the OSH action program for Vietnam in general. For example: participating in the national weeks.

Fifthly, the project helped the Training Center to collaborate with other programs and projects. As a result, the Center's capacity and functions are enhanced and it is now undergoing a process

to upgrade to be a National Training Center.

“Thanks to the project, the training center participated with other projects in the training on OSH for Vietnam enterprises. We highly appreciate this contribution. Through programs in the project, we see that up to this point, the training center is qualified enough to be a National Training Center for its activities in supporting the country to the training-of-trainers, transferring of training tools and building the training materials.”¹⁴

Sixthly, training documents have gathered training with advising activities in environmental improvement for enterprises in inter-industry relationship.

7.1.2 Group of trainers as officers from local branches

The project has enhanced training capacity to officers and trainers from provincial branches: inspectorates, general labour association, teachers from vocational schools. With the new approach and innovative PAOT training method, the project has boosted the universalization of new teaching and learning philosophy, more practical and effective.

7.1.3 Enterprises and workers

The project helps enterprises to save time in learning innovation and conducting their own innovations.

The project helps enterprises save cost in compensation working accidents and occupational diseases, thus increasing enterprises turnover. According to the estimation, 66.7% enterprises participating in the project stated that they have saved their expenditure on prevention and compensation for occupational accidents and occupational diseases; 30% of the enterprises stated that they have saved much. This means that working conditions have been improved and it may reduce the number of accidents

The project has implemented piloting programs to many forms of enterprises: mechanical production, latex production, ship building, stone for tiling and construction, sugar, wood processing, aluminum working, marine-works repairing, pottery making, electrical appliances.

7.2 Project's impact on tripartite and multilateral

- *The mechanism of tripartite and multilateral cooperation is applied in every activity of the project from the central to the grassroots levels. The Centre and Local Advisory Board are established under tripartite mechanism. All national workshops organized topically are tripartite ones.*
- *The project has contributed to maintain the tripartite and multilateral cooperation. In fact, the tripartite has been formed and developed very well in the State management on OSH. That is a legislative relationship and is ensured by laws. The project activities act as glue to link those relationships because through the forum, many more collaborative projects are done. Many project activities are done voluntarily by individuals rather than by legal bonds. At the first stage of the project, many parties are actively exchanging*

¹⁴ Interviewed Ms. Doan Minh Hoa in Hanoi in May 2009.

information, attracting others to participate in the project work such as training courses, capacity enhancing workshops, partner introduction, increasing power in the network.

- *The project has created the quality improvement in tripartite and multilateral relationship.* Via project, mutual understanding is created; integrated work plan of the enterprise is clarified and oriented.
- *The project has helped strengthen tripartite collaboration for more effective work.* Via project activities, parties can not only solve problems within the project but also boost the management and organization on OSH. This can be seen in the criteria for the recruitment of trainers at local projects, that is: *commit to coordinate with other provincial agencies to conduct activities following the workshop and commit to organize training courses on WISE for enterprises in the province.*

7.3. Project's impact on gender equality

Gender matter is stressed right in the structure of the Advisory Board, Project Management Board, and Project Coordination Board.

- *The project focuses on gender equality through the improvement of working condition for both male and female workers; enhancing training capacity for both male and female officers on OSH or lecturers at colleges or vocational schools, and supporting in the building up of national policy on OSH.* The final target of the project is to ensure OSH conditions for all workers enhance training capacity for both male and female officers on OSH or related to OSH work. In the training course, the contents on OSH training are applied to all participants. Therefore, the project's contribution in building up national policy on OSH has been responsive to working requirements for each gender.
- *The project has created equal opportunities to both male and female participants.* The recruitment of participants, trainers depends on capacity assessment objectively. The decisions made in the project are not affected by decision-makers, whether they are male or female. This can be seen in the criteria for organizing training-of -trainer's course at local projects. The training program and invitation letters state clearly that “ *ILO commit to ensure gender equality in all activities and encourage enterprises to participate, commit that there are at least 30% representative from enterprises attending the workshops, events are male or female accordingly...* ” The much greater proportion of male participants enrolled in the courses due to the fact that those working on OSH in most companies are men.
- *The project appraises fairly the contribution of male and female participants.* There has no distinction in the assessment of participants within the project framework.

7.4. Project's impact on the application of international standards on OSH

- *The project has contributed in the introduction and preparation for the approval of ILO convention 184 on OSH via workshops and training courses.*
- *The project has contributed in the application of international standards on OSH such as*

Seoul Declaration on OSH, OSH management system; global strategy on OSH of the ILO, ILO OSH Promotional Framework for OSH Convention, No 187, Recommendation, No 197, especially the Safety and Health Convention, No 155. These standards are put in the training courses on OSH for workers. Other training program on OSH like WISE is also introduced. Besides, the introduction of ILO Safety and Health in Agriculture Convention, No 184 at the workshops on OSH helped to raise people knowledge on international OSH standards in agriculture.

- *The project has contributed to make OSH into enterprise culture, turning the passive participation of the enterprises which used to be dependent on the outsiders into the more active ones.* This means that participants WISE/TOT can join the training activities by working out initiatives dependently from outside organizations.

7. 5. Project's impact on environment protection

- *The project has contributed its role on environmental protection* through the project objectives to strengthen OSH, reducing work accidents and occupational diseases at enterprise level by improving working conditions after the training course such as installing needle protection plate to avoid the broken needle getting into the workers' eyes, reinstalling electricity grid and wires... Thanks to this improvement, working conditions have also been improved.
- *The project has contributed to protect environment via the introduction of practical models and experience.* Training materials are made for four main aspects: construction, electricity usage, mechanical production and toxic chemicals. In the training classes, a set of standard practice manuals have been introduced. These are very good instruments for environmental protection and safety for workers. Many experiences in waste chemical treatment, workplace rearrangement for convenience, chemical usage under regulation in order to minimize negative impact on environment are also reported.
- *The project has contributed to the protection of balance and growth in working condition.*

7.6 The project's sustainability: impact assessment and long-term effect of the project after accomplishment.

The project ensures the sustainability as it has supported to an important target in the national program on OSH; the project results will continue to be maintained and expanded based on the national fund and other resources. The project has highly popularized activities that help it to keep on functioning easily and concretely.

Management capacity on OSH: Experience on management: prioritized strategies, satisfaction of the targets' needs (observation, investigation, finding and meeting demands for OSH learning for OSH officers, training center members, inspectors, lecturers at universities, colleges and vocational schools); Other experience will then become long-term capacity of the managing bodies and will be passed on to the next generations of managers.

The collaborating trainers are qualified and work voluntarily. The collaborating trainers in the project are promoting their abilities. They will be the core figures in the future as the need for OSH training in other localities keeps increasing.

The curriculum and training materials on OSH keeps being used. The appropriate materials are published widely (films, website etc.) so as to expand the training activities to other targets.

Objectives of the operation and development of the project comes along with those of the training center. When building draft for project document, experts at OSH Department aimed at enhancing training capacity on OSH in Vietnam. The OSH Training Center is the professional training unit of MoLISA and is now being invested to become National Training Center by 2010.

The contents, targets and scopes are focused in order to gain sustainable results. The project concentrates on the training-of-trainers as labor inspectors from ministries, localities, OSH officials from ministries and branches, lecturers on labour protection at universities, colleges and vocational schools, assessment officers. Improvement at enterprises also directs to sustainable development.

Participants are key figures at localities, ministries, branches and schools. After the training course, they are equipped with knowledge, skills and training methods and play a very important role in training for employers, OSH officials at their places..

The project activities are popularized. All programs in the project are now being applied nationwide, which are done not only at the training center but also at local level¹⁵.

¹⁵ Interviewed Ms. Doan Minh Hoa

Part IV: CONCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATIONS

I. CONCLUSION

1. At present, Vietnam is accelerating its modernization and industrialization process, integrating into the international economy. During this process, thousands of small and medium enterprises have been and are being established, millions of workers participate in production and business in factories, small and medium enterprises. Therefore, there is a need of OSH as occupational accidents and diseases are increasing. Effective OSH training will contribute to improving working conditions, minimizing occupational accidents and diseases, enhancing State management on occupational safety, improving the quality of human resources, promoting workers' ability and motivation to work and the nation's and enterprises' competitiveness. OSH training is a typical service which requires concrete OSH training strategies and policies with adequate investment.
2. The Project for "Enhancing capacity of OSH Training in Vietnam" met the needs of enhancing capacity of OSH training in Vietnam and was in line with the objectives of the socio-economic development of Vietnam and with the goals and objectives of the National Program on Labour Protection, Occupational Safety and Occupational Health for the period of 2006-2010, particularly the objective to ensure training on OSH for 80% of OSH officers. The project helped the OSH Training Center to gather outstanding trainers from central to local regions. This is a valuable resource for the training center as they are doing regular training.
3. By the time of final evaluation, the project had fulfilled activities defined in the project document and other activities arising during the collaboration linkage with other related program and projects.
4. The Project has achieved its short-term objectives and contributed to the realization of its development objective. Some project's results achieved went even beyond its short-term objectives. Main products of the project included: comprehensive and flexible policies, strategies on OSH; a cadre of qualified full-time and part-time trainers on OSH who were provided with refresher training course; a set of basic OSH training materials regularly updated and flexibly used; an OSH training center capable of organizing OSH training courses under the framework of the project; training course in linkage with enterprises and training courses on a fee-for-service basis. The project's products have been well received by the participating agencies and social partners as they were developed based on their needs.

5. The project was evaluated to have a high performance through its effective use of resources for investment in enhancing capacity and skills, in human resource development and personnel; effectively integrating the project's activities with related national and international program and projects, saving the resources and time of the project and of its beneficiaries; attracting resources from enterprises on the PPP (Public-Private Partnership) model; mobilizing qualified staff in implementation of the project's activities.
6. The project has been well managed thanks to the arrangement of enthusiastic staff who are experienced in management and its monitoring system and program from implementation of the plan to the fulfillment of the activities;
7. The project's activities have been smoothly coordinated from the central to local level by complying with such principles that enhanced the ownership of implementing partners; investment in development of criteria for selection of trainers; flexibility in integrating activities and balancing benefits of related partners.
8. Good lessons learnt of the project include (1) development of legal framework for duplicating and using project's results and products such as the policy on OSH training being submitted to the Government for approval; encouraging social partners to use set of training materials; being flexible and proactive in organization, management and execution; (2) paying attention to saving resources; (3) mobilizing the participation of related social partners, particularly of the enterprises; (4) ability of mobilizing and attracting various resources.
9. Points that could have been improved in organization and implementation of the project (1) further develop a better corresponding policy and more attractive mechanism to encourage beneficiaries (enterprises), for example, people with influence should be sent to attend project training ; (2) Synchronize the principle of integrating activities, balancing benefits to gain high effectiveness; (3) To use more resources to promote the project's products; (4) further develop a vision and its schedule for the Center to the year after 2015 so as to become a regional and international training center by 2020 and 2025 respectively; (5) further develop strategy and ability for mobilizing the involvement of small enterprises; (6) pay more attention to the age criteria in selection of trainers to ensure the inherit among generations, harmonized traditional experiences and ability for approaching new information; (7) ensure next projects should be executed sooner to remain sustainability. (8) find out solutions to approaching governmental management offices. (9) provide more information and update the website on regular basis.
10. The project had advantages for realizing its activities: (1) aiming at solving issues given priority and invested by the Government; (2) there were many related program and projects which created opportunities for inheriting, bringing into play and creating; (3) there were great demands for OSH training.

11. The project's challenges were also the challenges currently facing OSH training in Vietnam, which were (1) training quality (comparison between training needs and ability to meet the needs, inadequate attention by workers as they did not want to pay high fee for good quality service, cadre of trainers (both quality and quantity), effective and efficient training methodologies, training contents, training materials); (2) developing criteria and assessing the impacts and benefits of participating OSH training were still challenges, leading to difficulties in encouraging employees to participate in OSH training programs; (3) ability to meet the demands and to invest in upgrading training units;
12. Through enhancing capacity for training center, the project has created great impacts on beneficiaries from central to local levels and its social partners; strengthening tripartite collaboration, promoting gender equality and enhancing capacity for trainers who are staff from local agencies, OSH officers and State management officers, enterprises as well as workers.
13. The project ensured sustainability as it provided direct support to one of the important objective of the National Program on Occupational Protection, Safety and Health; the project's results will continue to be duplicated and remained by using national budget and other resources. The project activities were very appropriate which created conditions to be maintained in an advantageous way.

II. RECOMMENDATIONS

1. General recommendations

- 1.1 For the Bureau for Safe Work, it is necessary to pay more attention to promoting OSH training as a valuable service which needs to have appropriate investment as this investment is wise and will gain much more (such as in terms of productivity etc.) than the investment made.
- 1.2 For the OSH Training Centre of MOLISA, it is necessary to promote OSH training services toward serving customers' needs in a convenient manner; gradually meeting the needs; and user-friendly for different targeted group, particularly the SMEs. Cooperating and linking program with big enterprises following Public-Private Partnership (PPP) model is also in need. Paying attention to quality of activities and outputs is most important.
- 1.3 Improve the training quality, paying special attention to enhancing capacity for cadre of trainers in the Center. Update training materials to suit different social needs; finalizing the materials and dividing them by targeted groups: employers, employees... and studying modern training method.
- 1.4 Expand international cooperation, linking educating with other OSH Training Centers in other regional countries such as the Philippines, Singapore, Malaysia, Hong Kong and Korea. This is a training form that big enterprises, corporation can join.
- 1.5 Build a long-term vision for the future of the OSH Training Center and develop a roadmap for realizing the vision to the year after 2015 with the aim of becoming a regional and international training center. The evaluation team shares the viewpoint of

the mid-term evaluation report that the Center needs to identify its long-sighted future to define its goals to be achieved. In addition, there have been many OSH training models in the region which can provide good experiences and lessons learnt. Therefore, developing a long term vision from a local OSH center to a regional and international center is something necessary for consideration.

- 1.6 Improving propaganda activities for training on OSH and website utilization. Training management software should come into use sooner. It is necessary to diversify media strategy and mode of promotion for project's products, especially training materials.
- 1.7 Continuing to include OSH training in the second National Program on Labour Protection, OSH

2. Recommendations for future's activities

- 2.1 There have been great demands for continuation of project activities toward sustainability through the project "Enhancing capacity of OSH training working places" executed by ILO and sponsored by Japanese Government.

For the Ministry of Labour and specifically the Bureau for Safe Work in collaboration with the International Cooperation Department, it is necessary to have strategy for approaching potential donors including Denmark, Germany through promotion of dialogues for sharing information with related partners in development of OSH training. In visible time, it is necessary to promote the project: Assistance to OHS training in mining of stone and coal and production of cement 20133/Mining under the sponsor of the Government of Germany

- 2.2 It is necessary for the Bureau for Safe Work to Prepare potential personnel for participating in development, preparation and management in the next phases as well as monitoring and evaluation processes to ensure the stability as well as to expand cooperation.
- 2.3 The OSH Training Center needs to proactively develop some project proposals and projects to mobilize different sponsored resources for promoting OSH. Some suggestions of these proposals can be listed as follows:
 - Enhancing PPP in promoting OSH training;
 - Promoting OSH training – as a profession
 - OSH training in mines and quarries OSH training in construction
- 2.5 The OSH Training Centre should also continue the introduction of the training programs on OSH on the daily TV as knowledge dissemination to ensure the OSH information and activities are popular.
- 2.6 The OSH Training Centre should also continue the implementation, evaluation and finalization of the process for implementation of extended training courses and the evaluation of trainers' quality after training and employing.
- 2.7 The OSH Training Center should update trainers with knowledge every year and organize meeting/seminars to exchange experience between them. It should have a strategy to encourage present 94 voluntary trainers in order to develop training activities in the future.

Annex 1: References

1. WISE training schedule.
2. Report of OSH Training center in seminar on Achievement of WISE programmed in Binh Duong.
3. Mid-term evaluation report of project “ Enhancing capacity of OSH training in Vietnam” (VIE/05/01/LUX), evaluating team Nguyen Thi Bich Tram – Ngo Thi Thu Hang.
4. Report on OSH training for farmers in agricultural production 2008. Farmer Association of Vietnam, April 2009.
5. Report on demand for OSH training in Vietnam, Training center (revised on 20 May 2009).
6. Report on result of labour protection, OSH in agricultural production.
7. Report on result of training course for core trainers in improving working conditions of small and medium enterprises in the south. OSH Training center 13 February 2009.
8. Report on result of training course for core trainers in improving working conditions of small and medium enterprises in Hue, OSH Training center 12 March 2009.
9. Report on executing WISE programme in Binh Duong, Ben Tre, Dong Nai, Tay Ninh, Vung Tau, Tien Giang, Hue, Da Nang, Quang Ngai, Quang Tri, Binh Dinh.
10. Develop Strategy of OSH training center.
11. National Programme on occupational protection, safety and health (BHLĐ, ATLĐ, VSLĐ) 2006 - 2010.
12. List of training courses from VIE/05/01/LUX.
13. List of participants from VIE/05/01/LUX, kept by ILO Hanoi Office.
14. Schedule of inspecting WISE programme executing in provinces of the central region and the south.
15. Implementing schedule from January to July 2009.
16. Job Survey Result in 2005.
17. Cooperating frame between ILO and Vietnamese partners on long-term jobs signed by ILO with the third party on 13 July 2006.
18. Conventions and Recommendations by ILO, Society and Labour Publisher.
19. Project’s Activities till December 2008.
20. Process of open training courses, Department of OSH.
21. Society and Labour Magazine, April 2009.
22. Terms of Reference (TOR) for independent end-term evaluation.
23. Project Document.

Annex 2: Project results comparing to expected objectives

Objective	Activities	Results (as of May 2009)
First short-term objective	* Enhancing capacity of OSH training center is to support training OSH professionals, employers, workers, OSH inspectors and specialists, trade union staffs.	* At the beginning, only one trainer could give lecture in the training center. At present, the number of trainers has increased to 9. The center also has established a network of 300 collaborators nationwide.
	*Comprehensive policy on OSH training for related targets.	*Report on adjustment of OSH training policy proposed to governmental management office.
	Basic syllabus and training method meet actual demand, mechanism to update training materials regularly.	<p> A set of 4 professional training curricula on occupational safety and health for 4 high risk industries including construction, electricity utilization, mechanic production and mining.</p> <p>*A set of discs on OSH training according to circular No. 37/2005/TT-BLĐTBXH)</p> <p>* Two ILO's manuals including "Improving working condition and productivity in garment industry" and "WISE- Work Improvement in Small Enterprises - Package for Trainers" were translated into Vietnamese</p>
	*Enhancing capacity of OSH trainers in three regions.	*Training courses for core trainers and high level courses have been held up for labour inspectors and teachers in three regions of Vietnam.

	*Training center can organize training courses and advise OSH for partners on fee for service basis.	* Training center can organize training courses and advise OSH for partners on fee for service basis. <i>(In 2008, the Center organized 171 training courses for more than 8,200 accumulated participants from enterprises in which 78% of the participants attended on a fee-for-service basis)</i>
	*Promotion of training	*A website has been designed to propaganda activities of OSH training center. Detailed schedule of training for year 2009. *A software to manage training has been designed.
Second short-term objective	*About 90 experienced trainers have been selected to give lecture in OSH in Hanoi, Danang and HCM city.	*642 trainers were trained in 21 courses during 3 year project implementing, of which 300 could give lecture in different type of training courses, including ones organized by OSH training center. * 94 trainers/participants were trained and selected to become trainers who provide training in OSH in 3 regions.
	*Provide advising skills for 300 participants including officers from Bureau for Safe work, MOLISA's labour inspectorate, verification center and preventive health centers.	*Provide OSH training for officers from Bureau for Safe work, MOLISA's labour inspectorate, verification center and preventive health centers of provinces and cities - 160 head-counted staff from labour inspectorate - 62 head-counted staff from Bureau for Safe work, of which 35 head-counted staff from OSH training center - 27 head-counted staff from verification center - 70 head-counted staff from preventive health centers

	*Select and train in OSH for social partners: 30 trade union staff; 30 employers, 40 officers from ministries and industries, 50 teachers from universities.	*Trained in 3 regions; *Number of participants include: - 228 head-counted staff from ministries and industries , - 54 head-counted staff from local trade unions - 157 head-counted staff from universities and vocational schools.
	*OSH training center promote training and advising activities for employers, labour protection officers from enterprises on fee for service basis.	* In 2008, the Center organized 171 training courses for more than 8,200 accumulated participants. * In which 78% of the participants attended on a fee-for-service basis.
OSH training WISE/TOT	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Core trainers are trained in locals; • Implementing in various kinds of enterprises • Lessons learnt • Improving working conditions and reducing occupational accidents, diseases 	Implementing in 17 provinces: Bac Kan, Thai Nguyen, Lang Son, Hung Yen, Thanh Hoa, Da Nang, Quang Ngai, Thua Thien Hue, Quang Tri, Binh Dinh, Quang Binh, Binh Duong, TienGiang, Ba Ria Vung Tau, Ben Tre, Dong Nai, Tay Ninh.

Annex 3: List of interviewees

1.	Ms. Đoàn Minh Hòa	Head of PAC, Director General	Bureau for SafeWork
2.	Mr. Vũ Như Văn	Head of PMU, Deputy Director General	Bureau for SafeWork
3.	Mr. Phạm Gia Lượng		Deputy Director General, Bureau for SafeWork
4.	Mr. Tạ Trung Dũng	Member of PMU, Director	OSH Training Center
5.	Mr. Đặng Châm Thông	Vice Director	OSH Training Center
6.	Ms. Lê Kim Dung	Vice Director	Department of International Cooperation, MoLISA
7.	Mr. Nguyễn Hoàng Hà	Programme Officer	ILO Office in Vietnam
8.	Mr. Kawakami Tsuyoshi	Project Chief Technical Advisor, OSH Senior Expert	ILO Sub-regional Office, Bangkok
9.	Mr. Tôn Thất Khải	ILO Expert on OSH	ILO Sub-regional Office, Bangkok
10.	Mr. Nguyễn Bá Lâm	National Project Coordinator	ILO Office in Vietnam
11.	Mr. Đoàn Ngọc Hùng Anh	Participant	Chief Labour Inspector, DoLISA Đà Nẵng
12.	Mr. Nguyễn Phi Khang	Participant	Tiền Giang Vocational College
13.	Mr. Trịnh Ngọc Kính	Participant WISE/TOT	Đông Hà Garment Company – Quảng Trị
14.	Mr. Phan Thanh Tùng		Kim Huynh Production and Trading, Imex Services Company Ltd, Tây Ninh

List of interviewed

No.	Name	Agency/organization	Province/City
1	Trương Thị Út Lan	Tiền Giang Preventive Medicine Center	Tiền Giang
2	Nguyễn Khánh Long	Lilama 18 JSC.	Vũng Tàu
3	Nguyễn Phi Hùng	DoLISA Bà Rịa-VT	Vũng Tàu
4	Đỗ Minh Hồng	Tiền Giang Confederation of Labour	Tiền Giang
5	Nguyễn Văn Dũ	DoLISA Bến Tre	Bến Tre
6	Phan Thanh Cung	Tây Ninh Vocational College	Tây Ninh
7	Lê Văn Tâm	Bến Tre Sugar Company	Bến Tre
8	Lê Thành Trục	Bến Tre Sugar Company	Bến Tre
9	Nguyễn Thị Thanh Toàn	Đồng Nai Confederation of Labour	Đồng Nai
10	Nguyễn Hồng Quang	Labour Inspector, DoLISA	Đồng Nai
11	Phạm Thị Túy Hồng	Labour Inspector, DoLISA	Đồng Nai
12	Ngô Thị Hiền	Đồng Nai Occupational Health and Environmental Protection Center	Đồng Nai
13	Nguyễn Phi Khang	Tiền Giang Vocational College	Tiền Giang
14	Huỳnh Hữu Công	DoLISA	Tiền Giang
15	Nguyễn Văn Lộc	Bình Dương Vocational College	Bình Dương
16	Nguyễn Can Trường	Labor Inspector, DoLISA	Tây Ninh
17	Tạ Trung Dũng	OSH Training Center, MoLISA	Hà Nội
18	Huỳnh Hữu Hải	Bến Tre Vocational College	Bến Tre
19	Nguyễn Khánh Nguyên	Bến Tre Confederation of Labour	Bến Tre
20	Võ Tấn Tài	Labour Inspector, DoLISA	Bến Tre
21	Phạm Hồng Thái	Bến Tre Preventive Medicine Center	Bến Tre
22	Lê Minh Chung	Occupational Health Faculty, Tây Ninh Preventive Medicine Center	Tây Ninh
23	Lê Vũ Thị Trinh	Bình Định Preventive Medicine Center	Bình Định
24	Trương Văn Nhân	Quảng Ngãi DoLISA	Quảng Ngãi
25	Huỳnh Tấn Trí	Đà Nẵng Vocational College	Đà Nẵng
26	Nguyễn Quang Trung	Thừa Thiên Huế Confederation of Labour	Huế
27	Lê Hùng	Huế Vocational Tourism College	Huế
28	Trần Công Ân	Labour – Wage Division, Bình Định Social Insurance	Bình Định
29	Bùi Văn Thắng	Quảng Trị DoLISA	Quảng Trị
30	Đoàn Ngọc Hùng Anh	Đà Nẵng DoLISA	Đà Nẵng
31	Nguyễn Thị Hồng	Quảng Ngãi DoLISA	Quảng Ngãi
32	Nguyễn Hoàng Vũ	Quảng Bình Vocational College	Quảng Bình
33	Đoàn Xuân Toàn	Quảng Bình DoLISA	Quảng Bình
34	Trương Ngọc Hùng	Socio-Economic Policy Division, Đà Nẵng Confederation of Labour	Đà Nẵng
35	Nguyễn Thu Phương	OSH Training Center, MoLISA	Hà Nội
36	Nguyễn Chí Công	Đà Nẵng DoLISA	Đà Nẵng

37	Trần Quốc Hùng	Thừa Thiên Huế DoLISA	Huế
38	Nguyễn Văn Nhật	Bình Định DoLISA	Bình Định
39	Lê Quang Thuận	Occupational Safety Division, DoLISA	Huế
40	Nguyễn Cư	Quy Nhơn Vocational College	Bình Định
41	Nguyễn Văn Gian	Quảng Trị Preventive Medicine Center	Quảng Trị
42	Đặng Văn Khánh	Labour Protection Dept., VGCL	82 Trần Hưng Đạo, Hà Nội
43	Nguyễn Phương Chi	Labour Protection Department, VGCL	83 Trần Hưng Đạo, Hà Nội
44	Vũ Hữu Kiên	WISE Trainer - MT - ILO	
45	Mai Xuân Khôi	Thanh Hóa DoLISA	Tô Vĩnh Diện - Đông Thọ - Thanh Hóa
46	Lê Khắc Bình	Thanh Hóa Confederation of Labour	37 Lê Lợi - Thanh Hóa
47	Trịnh Thị Thu Hương	Thanh Hóa Industrial Vocational College	Thanh Hóa
48	Đinh Ngọc Quang	Thanh Hóa Preventive Medicine Center	474 Hải Thượng Lãn Ông - TP Thanh Hóa
49	Vương Thị Thu Hương	Bắc Kạn Preventive Medicine Center	Group 10, Nguyễn Thị Minh Khai - Bắc Kạn
50	Dương Văn Hoàn	Bắc Kạn DoLISA	Group 8 Đức Xuân – Bắc Kạn town - Bắc Kạn
51	Bùi Thị Thanh Thủy	Bắc Kạn Confederation of Labour	Trường Chinh – Bắc Kạn town - Bắc Kạn
52	Bùi Bằng Long	Bắc Kạn Vocational College	Bắc Kạn
53	Nguyễn Văn Hình	Hải Dương Preventive Medicine Center	144 Quang Trung - Hải Dương City - Hải Dương
54	Nguyễn Đức Hưng	Hải Dương DoLISA	No. 30 Hồng Quang - Hải Dương City - Hải Dương
55	Nguyễn Văn Kính	Thái Nguyên Preventive Medicine Center	No. 971 Phường Tự Minh - TP Thái Nguyên
56	Trương Văn Xuân	Thái Nguyên DoLISA	No. 2 Đường Cách mạng T8 - TP Thái Nguyên
57	Nguyễn Xuân Trường	Thái Nguyên Metallurgy Vocational College	Thái Nguyên
58	Dương Thị Xanh	Lạng Sơn DoLISA	No. 409 Đường Ms. Triệu P. ĐMr. Kinh - TP Lạng Sơn
59	Đặng Minh Sơn	Lạng Sơn Preventive Medicine Center	50 Trần Hưng Đạo - P. Chi Lãng - TX Lạng Sơn

60	Lương Tiến Tùng	Lạng Sơn Confederation of Labour	No. 04 Đường Hùng Vương - P. Chi Lăng - TP Lạng Sơn
61	Đặng Bá Hiếu	Bắc Giang Preventive Medicine Center	Đường Nghĩa Long - TP Bắc Giang - Bắc Giang
62	Vương Văn Thanh	Hòa Bình Confederation of Labour	Đường Trần Hưng Đạo - Thị xã Hoà Bình - Hoà Bình
63	Lưu Thu Hường	Labour and Social Affairs University	43 Trần Duy Hưng - Hà Nội
64	Đỗ Việt Đức	National Institute for Labour Protection	
65	Hoa Xuân Quỳnh	National Institute for Labour Protection	
66	Nguyễn Khánh Long	Lilama 18 JSC.	Vũng Tàu
67	Dương Quang Hiến	Lilama 18 JSC.	Vũng Tàu
68	Lê Văn Tâm	Ben Tre Sugar JSC.	Bến Tre
69	Lê Thành Trực	Ben Tre Sugar JSC.	Bến Tre
70	Phan Thanh Tùng	Kim Huỳnh Production and Trading, Imex Services Company Ltd	Tây Ninh
71	Nguyễn Thanh Tâm	Ben Tre Sugar JSC.	Bến Tre
72	Nguyễn Hồng Việt	Mỹ Hạnh Tân Uyên Co., Ltd.	Bình Dương
73	Trần Hữu Phúc	Phương Minh JSC.	Huế
74	Trần Phước Hùng	Phương Minh JSC.	Huế
75	Trịnh Ngọc Kính	Hoà Thọ Garment Company -Đông Hà-Quảng Trị	Quảng Trị
76	Nguyễn Văn Tuấn	Nam Sơn JSC.	Đà Nẵng
77	Nguyễn Thanh Thuý	22/12 Cooperative, Quy Nhơn Veteran Union-Bình Định	Bình Định

Annex 4: Terms of Reference.

ILO/LUXEMBOURG PROJECT FOR ENHANCING CAPACITY OF OCCUPATIONAL SAFETY AND HEALTH TRAINING IN VIETNAM (VIE/05/01/LUX PROJECT)

Terms of Reference

Final Independent Evaluation

May 2009

Introduction and rational for evaluation

The ILO/Luxembourg Project for Enhancing Capacity of Occupational Safety and Health Training in Vietnam will end in June 2009. A final evaluation is required to assess the achievement of project immediate objectives, the effectiveness, efficiency and sustainability of the project, to document lessons learned and good practices. It is also aimed that the final evaluation will provide recommendations for improved possible future actions. ILO evaluation policy requires at least one independent evaluation for all projects with total budget of more than USD 500,000, the final independent evaluation is therefore proposed. The final evaluation will focus on the effectiveness and efficiency of the project implementation and will cover the full period of the project implementation from September 2006 to June 2009.

The evaluation will comply with the UN norms and standards and the ethical safeguards will be followed.

Background

The continuous economic changes in Vietnam, together with globalization and liberalization of the world economy, with the fast increase in the number of enterprises and the labour force, have created new challenges to occupational health and safety. Occupational safety and health performance nowadays needs commitments from all stakeholders. This is even more necessary in countries with transition economies such as Vietnam. Trade Unions and employers' organizations need to be trained so that they can play an active role in the process of economic development. Therefore, OSH training should be provided not only to labour inspectors but also to employers and employees to ensure the law effectiveness and cooperation in State administration and labour inspection.

The ILO/Luxembourg Project for Enhancing Capacity of Occupational Safety and Health Training in Vietnam has been contributing to the maintenance and development of OSH training in Vietnam through accomplishment of OSH policies and training services. The Project implementation started in September 2006 and will be concluded by June 2009.

- Development Objective of the Project: The Project will strengthen occupational safety and health performance, helping reduce occupational diseases and accidents at work, improve social relations among the State administrative agencies, representative organizations of employers and employees by enhancing capacity of the Occupational Safety and Health Training Centre, consolidate the OSH training system, developing OSH training policies and services for social partners to ensure occupational safety, and protect the health of workers and working environment in the course of socio-economic development and competitiveness improvement of Vietnamese goods.

- Immediate objectives of the Project: (1) The first objective of the project is to make a strategy and long term plan of OSH training aiming at realizing Vietnamese laws. An occupational safety and health training system competent for analyzing and assessing

training needs, designing training curricula and providing OSH training for instructors, trainers, employers, workers and occupational safety and health officers should also be formed. (2) The second immediate objective is that the OSH Training Centre will conduct training courses for trainers and instructors; and provide refresher training for labour protection officers and social partners on a fee-for-service basis.

In September 2008 the mid-term evaluation was carried out in order to assess the project's progress and achievements and seek for recommendations for improvement of the implementation during the last year of the Project. The mid-term evaluation concluded that (i) this project was relevant with the need of the society and contributes to the implementation of the National Strategy on OSH, (ii) the Project was running in the right track to achieving its immediate and long-term objectives. Many results were made under the first immediate objective. Achieving the second immediate objective would be the main focus of the project in the coming period. Specifically, in the remaining period, the project should focus on building training capacity for staffs of the OSH training centre, and/or support the Center in shaping its strategic vision, and developing the strategic plan to achieve that vision, as well as building its core competency.

During the last few months, adjustment have been made to the project implementation following the recommendations made in the mid-term evaluation report, especially focusing on staff development for the OSH Training Center and deeper capacity building for the existing network of OSH trainers.

Purpose

The final evaluation will provide lessons learnt, recommendations and suggestions for the possibilities of a next phase.

Objective of the Final Evaluation

The project's mid-term evaluation focused on design and delivery factors while this independent final evaluation will focus on project outcomes, in other words the effects of the project's results (immediate objectives and its intended/unintended effect) on the project's intended beneficiaries and institutional partners over the past three years. While assessing the effectiveness, efficiency and impact of the project so far, the evaluation will be forward looking and develop recommendations on the existing OSH training strategy and means of institutionalizing good practices. The core evaluation concerns for assessing project performance are:

- Relevance and strategic fit of project strategies
- Effectiveness and outcomes
- Efficiency
- Sustainability, replication and institutionalization of good practices

Scope and Focus

The final evaluation will focus on, but not be limited to, the following areas:

- Identification of the Project's good practices, lessons learned, successes and challenges
- Assessment of the Project's performance in term of achieving the immediate objectives
- Identification of any unintended outcomes, results, and impacts
- Identification of opportunities that have contributed to the successful implementation of the Project

- Identification of constraints, if any, that have affected the effectiveness of the Project

Outputs

- An electronic file via e-mail or diskette and one hard copy of the draft and final evaluation report in both English and Vietnamese. The quality of the report will be determined by conformance with the quality checklist for the evaluation report.
- Evaluation summary in standard ILO format

Methodology

The main sources of data/method of data collection will be:

- secondary data* - review the Project documents and reports
- interviews* - conduct interviews to project stakeholders and also to previous training participants, using an open-ended framework and questionnaire
- product reviews* – conduct survey to review the use of developed products including training materials, website, etc.
- visits and discussions with benefited parties* – visit Bureau of Safework, OSH Training Center and some other stakeholders

Key stakeholders including the donor will be consulted in all steps of the implementation of the evaluation including TOR review and the finalization of the report.

All data should be sex-disaggregated and different needs of women and men should be considered in evaluation process.

An example ILO analytical framework and suggested outline for the evaluation report are attached as Annexes 1 and 2 for reference by the evaluation team.

Management arrangement, workplan and timeframe

The evaluation will be undertaken by a team of independent consultants, with 1 month duration, commencing on May 11, 2009 and completing on June 10, 2009.

Composition of the Final M&E team

1	Consultant 1	Lead M&E Consultant
2	Consultant 2	Consultant
3	Consultant 3	Consultant
4	Consultant 4	Consultant

Consultants' assignments

Tasks	No. of days	No. of persons	No of man.day
1. Desk review of all relevant project documents, progress reports, annual reports prepared by the VIE/05/01/LUX Project; Project progress reports; and final products of all VIE/05/01/LUX Project's	3	2	6

parallel supporting activities.			
2. Prepare a list of the additional secondary information required, if any, and send it to the NPC for further action.			
3. Have a briefing with concerned ILO officials			
4. Prepare the tentative field work program and schedule.			
5. Have a briefing, debriefing and meetings with concerned ILO officials, and high rank officials and/or representatives of Ministry of Labour, Invalids and Social Affairs responsible for the Project, Project Advisory Committee members, OSH Training Center etc.	2	2	4
6. Interact with VIE/05/01/LUX Project's counterpart and VIE/05/01/LUX Project's constituents regarding the implementation of the Project.			
7. Participate in field visits to program areas, including the two WISE achievement workshops in Danang on May 14 and in Binh Duong on May 15, and interactions with Project beneficiaries, implementing partners and relevant government officials involving in the Project to listen to their opinions regarding the Project implementation.	5	2	10
8. Document and analyze all of the information gathered; prepare the draft Final M&E report and send it to the Director of the ILO Hanoi through VIE/05/01/LUX Project Office for comments and suggestions.	5	2	10
9. Finalize the draft Final M&E report incorporating the comments/suggestions from the ILO and submit the final version of the M&E Report to the Director of the ILO Hanoi through VIE/05/01/LUX Project Office.	3	2	6
10. Present findings and recommendations to the VIE/05/01/LUX M&E Outcome Workshop during the first week of June 2009.	1	2	2
11. Discuss with the ILO and BSW on the preparation of the Project M&E Outcome Workshop; and discuss after the Workshop for internal round-up on the conclusion of the meeting with the CTA, the Director of the ILO Hanoi, the NPC..	1	2	2
12. Prepare and finalize the evaluation report of the VIE/05/01/LUX Project in both English and Vietnamese based on the Outcome Workshop and incorporating the suggestions/ comments from the Workshop.	2	2	4
Total number of speed-out days			22
Total number of man.days			44

Qualifications of the External Collaborator

Education: Master's degree in Social Sciences, economics, or its equivalent in professional experiences. Whatever the degree the candidate holds, she or he must have a proven record of understanding and experiences in training activity and training-management project design, monitoring and evaluation

Experiences: At least five years experience in working with training activities and training management issues and social development, and, especially, integrating the OSH training perspective in employment promotion, in project implementation and community development. Familiarity with the occupational safety and health situation and dimensions of Viet Nam during the last 10 years and having good knowledge of OSH training policy development in Vietnam. Experience in the UN system, relations or past contacts with government department and NGOs would be an advantage.

Language: Excellent knowledge of written and spoken English and Vietnamese

Competency: Good skills at doing analysis and writing technical reports. Good audience-oriented communication and presentation skills. Ability to understand and appropriately respond to ILO's requirements.