



International Programme on the Elimination of Child Labour (IPEC)



International
Labour
Office

IPEC Evaluation

Labour Rights: Preventing trafficking for labour exploitation in China (CP-TING Phase II)

P.270.13.318.010 / CPR/09/01/CAN

An independent final evaluation by a team of external consultants

Pilot Provinces: Anhui, Yunnan, Hunan, Jiangsu, Fujian and Guizhou.
Guangdong and Sichuan were not covered due to a reduced project focus on these provinces
over the course of the project

May 2013

This document has not been professionally edited.

NOTE ON THE EVALUATION PROCESS AND REPORT

This independent evaluation was managed by ILO-IPEC's Evaluation and Impact Assessment section (EIA) following a consultative and participatory approach. EIA has ensured that all major stakeholders were consulted and informed throughout the evaluation and that the evaluation was carried out to highest degree of credibility and independence and in line with established evaluation standards.

The evaluation was carried out by a team of external consultants¹. The field mission took place in April 2013. The opinions and recommendations included in this report are those of the authors and as such serve as an important contribution to learning and planning without necessarily constituting the perspective of the ILO or any other organization involved in the project.

Funding for this project evaluation was provided by The Canadian International Development Agency. This report does not necessarily reflect the views or policies of The Canadian International Development Agency nor does mention of trade names, commercial products, or organizations imply endorsement by the Canadian Government.

¹ Ms. Asmita Naik, Independent International Consultant and Team Leader and Ms. Li Ping, Independent National Consultant.

Table of Contents

Abbreviations	iv
Executive Summary	v
Background	v
Purpose and scope of evaluation	v
Evaluation methodology	v
Key findings	vi
Effectiveness	vi
Sustainability	vi
Relevance	vii
Facilitating or constraining factors	vii
Main conclusions and recommendations	vii
Short-term recommendations for implementation by project end in June 2013 and aimed at the project:	viii
Long-term recommendations for any organisation involved in the follow-up, continuation or replication of project initiatives:	viii
Long-term recommendations that ILO should take into account in the design of any potential future projects on related areas:	ix
1. Introduction	1
1.1. Project Description	1
1.2. Context	3
1.3. Evaluation background	3
1.3.1. Evaluation purpose	3
1.3.2. Evaluation methodology	4
1.3.3. Evaluation limitations	6
2. Findings	7
2.1. Evaluation criteria	7
2.1.1. Effectiveness	7
2.1.2. Sustainability	17
2.1.3. Relevance	21
2.2. Facilitating and constraining factors	23
2.2.1. Project design	23
2.2.2. Strategy	25
2.2.3. Management	28
3. Conclusions and recommendations	31
3.1. Conclusion	31
3.2. Recommendations	32
3.2.1. Short-term recommendations	32
3.2.2. Long-term recommendations	33
Annex 1: Terms of Reference	36
Annex 2: List of Documents Reviewed	53
Annex 3: Evaluation Questionnaires	55
Annex 4: CP-TING Final Evaluation Schedule	58
Annex 5: List of Persons Consulted	62

Abbreviations

ACWF	All-China Women's Federation
CAD	Canadian dollars
CCP	Chinese Communist Party
CIDA	Canadian International Development Agency
CP-TING	The Project to Prevent Trafficking for Labour Exploitation in China
CTA	Chief Technical Adviser
DFID	Department for International Development (United Kingdom)
DWCP	Decent Work Country Programme
EIA	Evaluation and Impact Assessment section of ILO/IPEC
IEC	Information, education and communications materials
ILO	International Labour Organization
IPEC	International Programme on the Elimination of Child Labour
MoHRSS	Ministry of Human Resources and Social Security
MPS	Ministry of Public Security
MoR	Ministry of Railways
MTR	Mid-term Review
NPA	National Plan of Action on Combating Human Trafficking
NPC	National Project Coordinator
PSB	Public Security Bureau
PCC	Political Consultative Conference
PPA	Provincial Plan of Action
PPO	Provincial Project Office
PSC	Provincial Steering Committees
SC-UK	Save the Children, United Kingdom
TICW	Trafficking in Children and Women
ToT	Training of Trainers
ToR	terms of reference
UNESCO	United Nations Education, Scientific and Cultural Organization
UNIAP	United Nations Inter-Agency Project on Human Trafficking
UNICEF	United Nations Children's Fund
WF	Women's Federation
WFCL	Worst Forms of Child Labour

Executive Summary

Background

This is a final independent evaluation of the ‘Labour Rights: Preventing Trafficking for Labour Exploitation in China (CP-TING) project Phase II which runs from January 2010 to June 2013. The project aims to reduce trafficking for labour exploitation among children and young women and builds on strategies developed in the phase 1 project (2004-2010), that was implemented by ILO/IPEC with support from the United Kingdom’s Department for International Development. The focus of the project is on internal rather than cross-border population movements. It is being implemented by the International Labour Organization (ILO) in close collaboration with the All-China Women’s Federation (ACWF). Financial support amounting to US\$3,936,138 (CAD 4 million) comes from the Canadian International Development Agency (CIDA). The project is being implemented against the backdrop of huge levels of internal migration. Latest figures from 2011 show there are 253 million migrant workers, 20 million of whom are children.

CP-TING II aims to address the following ‘Immediate objectives’:

1. Improved policy framework to prevent trafficking for labour exploitation
2. Improved implementation of trafficking prevention measures in pilot provinces
3. Increased ability of women and children to protect their rights and migrate safely.

These objectives feed into ‘Intermediate objective’ of ‘Reduced trafficking for labour exploitation in China’ and then the ‘ultimate goal’ of ‘Enhanced protection of labour rights in China, consistent with international rights and standards’.

The project operates at the national and provincial level, with pilot activities in Anhui, Yunnan, Guizhou and Hunan as sending provinces and Jiangsu and Fujian as receiving provinces. Its focus is preventive; it aims to provide a safe migration environment by mitigating risk factors for young women and children and by building their capacity to migrate safely. The target groups are under 16 year olds and those aged 16-24. Key project activities include policy advocacy at different levels of government; public awareness-raising campaigns, and the piloting of various initiatives such as Life Skills education in schools, the strengthening of Women’s Homes to provide services to migrant women, as well as work with employers’ and workers’ groups in select locations.

Purpose and scope of evaluation

As an end of project evaluation, priority attention is given to outcomes - whether the project was effective in achieving its objectives, and to what extent its interventions are sustainable. The evaluation seeks to understand the factors that facilitated or constrained implementation (including project design, strategy, and management). The relevance of the project is reviewed and the evaluation takes forward lessons learned for the future. This evaluation closely follows the internal mid-term review (MTR) completed just nine months previously. As such, field visits were carried out to three provinces pre-selected by the International Programme on the Elimination of Child Labour (IPEC) - two provinces not visited by the MTR – Anhui and Yunnan; and one province - Fujian - which was visited by the MTR team. The evaluation adhered to standard principles. As an independent evaluation, it was carried out by two independent consultants, one international and one local expert.

Evaluation methodology

The evaluation team was accompanied by All-China Women’s Federation (ACWF) project staff and an IPEC CP-TING project assistant who provided translation support. The evaluation was participatory in terms of planning; and in obtaining inputs from the full range of stakeholders, though

the evaluation report itself was prepared independently. In order to safeguard impartiality, the evaluation team ensured that service providers (teachers, trainers, Women's Home staff etc.) did not participate in evaluation meetings with direct beneficiaries (children and women).

The evaluation used a qualitative methodology and drew on existing quantitative data collected by the project after verifying the process for such data collection. The evaluation used several techniques including desk review of internal and external documents; individual and group meetings with key informants including project staff, key stakeholders and international partners; focus group meetings with direct and indirect beneficiaries comprised of children, women, teachers, staff and volunteers from Women's Homes etc.; direct on-site observation of Life Skills classes and Women's Homes' activities; and stakeholder meetings at national and lower levels to receive information on the project and to share initial findings. The evaluation used three instruments tailored to different groups. The evaluation consulted 169 persons in total, 69 of whom were women and children constituting direct beneficiaries.

Key findings

Effectiveness

- Objective 1 - the project has made important contributions to the policy framework alongside other UN actors, especially in terms of mainstreaming the concept of trafficking for labour exploitation into national policy. It has also influenced the practice in Women's Homes nationwide. Its Life Skills work has been integrated into the school curriculum at provincial level in Anhui but not at the same level elsewhere. The project attributes the passing of regulations on the protection of student workers in Jiangsu to its research and policy advocacy work. Its impact on other areas of government policy (labour, policing etc.) is more variable. The project far exceeded its own targets for strengthening the policy framework by training 1,855 decision-makers, 333 journalists and 8 research institutes, and by holding several forums and seminars.
- Objective 2 - the project has made a valuable contribution to building the capacity of individuals on trafficking, labour exploitation and related issues. The project provided training to some 5,000 indirect beneficiaries comprised of service providers such as school teachers, as well as staff and volunteers from Women's Homes. The institutional capacity of ongoing partners of the project has also been strengthened. The development of a number of technical tools has been central to this capacity building process. Key good practices include the way the project has worked with civil society (Happy Family Children's Club/Anhui and Wang Jiaqiao centre/Yunnan) and the private sector (Clivia beauty school/Fujian) to deliver Women's Homes' services to migrant women.
- Objective 3 - the project methodologies, its Life Skills training and services provided in Women's Homes have proved their worth and are undoubtedly effective in giving beneficiaries the tools, knowledge and skills needed to better protect themselves. The project reached more than double the amount of direct beneficiaries originally intended. 146,171 people benefitted from the Life Skills and Women's Homes interventions, while the greater majority were female (96,560), the numbers were more balanced in the Life Skills in schools services which are specifically designed to target boys and girls under 18 years of age (40,440 girls to 36,863 boys). The project also counts 2,297,054 indirect beneficiaries of its mass information campaigns.

Sustainability

The signs are positive for sustainability of project concepts, approaches and activities, a real achievement for a development project. Sustainability for the project's approach to Women's Homes

is promising. The picture is less secure for the project's Life Skills work (except in one province). A review of the project's Life Skills work suggests sustainability might have been better secured by taking a more strategic approach towards policy integration and dissemination.

Relevance

CP-TING has played and continues to play a relevant and necessary role in advocating for Chinese legislation and policy to come in line with international conventions. The substance of the project's work is highly relevant to the context. The scale of internal migration is huge, government authorities faced with these challenges, especially at the receiving end, have shown themselves to be receptive to good ideas and willing to fund and continue them.

Facilitating or constraining factors

Project design – a number of aspects proved very beneficial to project implementation particularly the project approach to partnerships and its choice of ACWF as a partner; its participatory approach; and the emphasis on evidence-based research and advocacy. In terms of targeting: the efforts to include boys in this phase is on course though further efforts can be made to equalize numbers; some initiatives were well-targeted towards the most at risk groups e.g. Life Skills in schools but others such as services in Women's Homes seem to serve an older demographic in virtually all provinces and may be missing young women at the most vulnerable time in their lives. The geographical and thematic scope of the project in the original design proved overly ambitious and had to be trimmed back in the course of implementation.

Strategy – the project approach to influencing policy could have been more strategic. The project consciously took a bottom up approach, in the belief that good practices would "trickle up". It worked at multiple levels and with different sectors; this was positive but interventions sometimes appeared haphazard. The lack of strategies for internal and external information and communications; as well as for marketing and disseminating pilots, was a disadvantage. The project enjoyed political support from the Women's Federation but the interest of other government agencies was sometimes difficult to garner and appears contingent on finding mutual interests in project objectives.

Management – the project was managed very well, it delivered what was expected in a timely way and is well regarded within the organisation. It was also very cost-efficient, delivering concrete benefits to large numbers of beneficiaries at a low rate per head. The project was one professional staff member short for much of the implementation period. This had a hidden cost in terms of lack of time and space to focus on strategic aspects of refining and promoting the project's work, looking forward, and networking with other players. Modern management tools were diligently applied. The project clearly amassed a great deal of data under its monitoring framework but it is not clear that it was able to make optimum use of this information by consolidating and presenting its analysis of this data in a way that showed evidence of project outcomes.

Main conclusions and recommendations

The project has been a success; it has met its objectives and serviced a high number of beneficiaries in a cost effective way. Its methodologies have proved highly effective in improving the ability of beneficiaries to protect themselves and in building the capacity of practitioners. While the project's impacts are impressive, it perhaps had the potential for even wider policy effects. It piloted a number of good practices which are very relevant to China's stage of development. The project was managed very well but the ongoing staff shortages had a hidden cost - the lack of time and space available to focus on strategic issues and promotion appears to have held the project back from realising its optimum potential.

The project clearly has much to offer and could do useful work in a future phase. However, given the current funding climate with many donors withdrawing from China (including CIDA the current donor), the recommendations are not premised on the basis that there will be a follow-on phase. Instead the evaluation proposes short-term recommendations for implementation before the end of the

project in June 2013 and long-term recommendations to be picked up by any organisations involved in continuing or sustaining project initiatives or in devising potential new projects addressing similar issues.

Short-term recommendations for implementation by project end in June 2013 and aimed at the project:

1. Develop sustainability plans with project partners specifying what is to continue, when and how.
2. Ensure the proper handover and continuation of the project website to ILO or ACWF.
3. Ensure project products, tools, manuals etc. are available on the website in a downloadable and adaptable format, including, if possible, offshoots such as the Life Skills chapters adapted for the school curriculum by Anhui Provincial Education authorities.
4. Revise the draft ‘good practices and lessons learned’ document to take account of learning from the final evaluation.
5. Review the project monitoring framework and document lessons learnt on whether the indicators developed by the project were appropriate; the experience of data collection, management and analysis and whether this could have been improved in any way; and how the data could have been better consolidated and presented so as to give a more accessible picture of progress being made by the project.
6. Review the draft Decent Work Country Programme and ensure it adequately captures the terminology and focus of the project.

Long-term recommendations for any organisation involved in the follow-up, continuation or replication of project initiatives:

Promotion, replication and scaling up

7. Promote the project approach for improving migrant services through Women’s Homes to local authorities in migrant receiving areas.
8. Engage implementing partners who are recognised as having carried out good practices either by this report or other studies (e.g. Anhui education department, Happy Family Children’s Club NGO, Heart to Heart Community Care NGO, Clivia Beauty School etc.) as advisors for replication and scaling up pilots elsewhere.
9. Increase dissemination of Life Skills in vocational schools as a key approach given the suitability of the content to the age group of older adolescents, as well as the fact that such schools come under the remit of departments of labour.
10. Extend Life Skills education to parents and community members with an emphasis on passing this on to younger people.
11. Disseminate Life Skills modules and training to social workers and social work institutes.

Outreach and dissemination of information

12. Improve the use of new media and technologies (e-learning, internet, chat rooms, CDs, audio and video etc.) for disseminating information to stakeholders, beneficiaries and staff.
13. Engage target groups (especially children and young people) when designing information strategies to better understand their interests and preferences.

Measuring impact

14. Find ways of measuring the impacts of prevention activities, for instance tracer studies, or tracking of beneficiaries.

Reaching target groups

15. Reach younger migrants at the most vulnerable time of their lives through Life Skills in vocational schools, mobile Women's Homes, outreach by older users of Women's Homes, summer clubs, youth organisations.
16. Continue to strive towards achieving as optimum and proportionate a gender balance as possible among beneficiaries under the age of 18 to ensure that both vulnerable boys and girls are reached.

Research

17. Continue expanding the knowledge base through targeted research projects.

Long-term recommendations that ILO should take into account in the design of any potential future projects on related areas:

18. Consider reframing the project in a broader way in order to better capture the substance of the work that needs to be done in relation to the labour rights of young migrants; this would do better justice to the range of prevention and integration activities that the project has actually carrying out and safeguard future projects from being undermined by a lack of data on selective target groups.
19. Ensure the geographical and thematic scope of the project is realistic and doable.
20. Keep an emphasis on innovation, piloting, technical advice and capacity building in keeping with China's stage of development, rather than re-doing and re-visiting old approaches which have not been taken up despite best efforts.
21. Place more emphasis on ILO's traditional counterparts – labour departments, workers and employer's groups.
22. Ensure an advocacy and dissemination strategy for pilot projects is prepared in a timely way, taking into account, for example: where and how a pilot might best be integrated with existing policy; ensure pilots are strategically placed in order to take maximum advantage of policy-making and political structures; how training for pilots can fit into existing systems; the use of flexible printing formats like Word/PDF for easy adaptation and replication; collaboration with other international and local players interested in the same objective.
23. Develop an information and communications strategy to enable effective sharing of information internally and externally.
24. Place greater attention to the development of the results framework at the planning stage to ensure the inclusion of realistic targets, outcome indicators, precise outputs, coherence between outputs and outcomes, as well as appropriate data collection, management and presentation methodologies.

1. Introduction

1.1. Project Description

1. This is a final independent evaluation of the ‘Labour rights: Preventing Trafficking for Labour Exploitation in China (CP-TING) project Phase II which ran from January 2010 to December 2012 with an extension till June 2013. The project aims to reduce trafficking for labour exploitation among children and young women by supporting the improvement of the legal policy framework, building institutional capacity, and raising awareness public awareness. The project is implemented by the International Labour Organization (ILO) in close collaboration with the All-China Women’s Federation (ACWF). The Canadian International Development Agency (CIDA) provides financial support amounting to US\$ \$3,936,138.
2. This project follows on from an earlier ILO/IPEC-implemented project, the ‘Project to Prevent Trafficking in Girls and Young Women for Labour Exploitation’ that was implemented from 2004–2010 with funding from the United Kingdom’s Department for International Development. Models developed under this earlier phase, and shown to be effective, are expanded in the current project to more of China’s high migration regions.
3. The project is primarily concerned with internal migration rather than cross-border movements. It operates at the national and provincial level, with pilot activities in Anhui, Yunnan, Guizhou and Hunan as sending provinces and Jiangsu and Fujian as receiving provinces. Sichuan and Guangdong were also part of the original design but activities in these provinces were later restricted during the course of the project due to lack of capacity. Its focus is preventative; aiming to provide a safe migration environment by mitigating risk factors for young women and children and by building their capacity to migrate safely. The target groups are under 16 year olds and those aged 16 to 24. Gender issues are factored into the design taking into account risk factors; both boys and girls benefit from the project up to the age of 18 years, thereafter the project targets young women. It neither encourages nor discourages migration for at-risk groups aged 16-24, but aims to stop the abuses inherent in migration. For children under 16, the project discourages migration and promotes prolonged education and Life Skills training.
4. It has a three-pronged strategy aimed at addressing the following ‘Immediate objectives’:
 1. Improved policy framework to prevent trafficking for labour exploitation.
 2. Improved implementation of trafficking prevention measures in pilot provinces.
 3. Increased ability of women and children to protect their rights and migrate safely.
5. These objectives feed into ‘Intermediate objective’ of ‘Reduced trafficking for labour exploitation in China’ and then the ‘ultimate goal’ of ‘Enhanced protection of labour rights in China, consistent with international rights and standards’. The overall design is very much in line with other IPEC projects around the world.
6. The project employs a multi-level, multi-sectoral partnership approach. With ACWF as the primary partner; it works with other local stakeholders through Provincial Steering Committees (PSC), and builds the capacity of local institutions, such as schools and Women’s Homes, and also coordinates with the international development sector. It follows on from CP-TING Phase I (2004 – 2008), which had similar objectives and was also implemented in partnership with the ACWF. The final evaluation of CP-TING Phase I recommended the continuation of the project and suggested new strategies: firstly, to address the demand-side of trafficking in migrant-receiving communities as well as work in migrant-receiving areas; secondly, to expand coverage to include boys, as both males and females can be victims of trafficking; and thirdly, to engage workers’ and employers’ associations in trafficking prevention.

7. The project's main interventions are as follows and each one is designed to impact on each of the objectives – policy, capacity building and beneficiary self-protection:
8. **Life Skills training** – this Life Skills course was mainly piloted in schools but also deployed in other places such as vocational schools for young people and Women's Homes. The aim was to enhance the self-protection capacity of young people in their communities before they embark on the world of work. CP-TING developed two separate training packages for Life Skills in schools and in Women's Homes with the aim of building the confidence and problem solving skills of beneficiaries by using a participatory approach. It addresses topics relevant to adolescents, such as: safe migration, rights at work, self-esteem, managing finances, health education, and gender equality. The methods include games, theatre, group discussions, and problem-solving scenarios. Teachers are trained in the new methodology to deliver Life Skills programming in middle school classrooms.
9. **Women's Homes** – these are in fact information/community centres (not residential homes) which ACWF already runs around the country. CP-TING developed a methodology for professionalizing a select number of pilot homes to improve their capacity for supporting migrant women through access to information and basic social services. A 'Manual for Migrant Women's Homes', including operational information, training content and monitoring methodology, and shared experiences and innovative practices from other Women's Homes, was developed in conjunction with a Training of Trainers (ToT) methodology for disseminating training to other Women's Homes managers.
10. **Awareness-raising campaigns** – these are mass information campaigns conducted at peak holiday periods such as the Spring and Summer Festivals, traditionally times of high migration, as well as global days such as the World Day Against Child Labour. The project worked with the Ministry of Public Security, the Ministry of Railways, ACWF and local partners to improve the targeting of existing campaigns e.g. locating them in railway stations, including messages on trafficking for labour exploitation etc. At railway stations, for example, the project distributed colourful information, education and communications (IEC) materials, streamed videos, hosted safe job fairs, offered legal aid services, and engaged rail and bus passengers through quizzes and surveys.
11. **Rights-based events** – these are forums which bring together beneficiaries, children in particular, with the combined purpose of promoting child participation and carrying out policy advocacy. Forums were held in all provinces resulting in recommendations for decision makers.
12. **Employers' groups** – outreach has involved developing two manuals: 'Safety and Protection for Young Workers: A Guide for Small Enterprises'; and 'A Guide for Rights and Safety at Work for Young Workers'. Employers in certain locations were also trained on the requirements of the law on special protection for young workers between the ages of 16-18 years.
13. **Civil society** - capacity building efforts included, for instance, training staff and volunteers on CPT-TING approaches at the Wang Jiaqiao Centre in Kunming city/Yunnan, and the Fengyi Community Association in Sanlijie district/Hefei/Anhui as two sites identified for the delivery of Women's Homes services.
14. **Workers' organizations** – cooperation has developed recently and involved a training course for Labour NGOs, including, 'Little Bird', an NGO that has been defending migrant workers' rights since 1999 through mutual aid and hotlines. In addition, CP-TING with United Nations Inter-Agency Project on Human Trafficking (UNIAP) and World Vision, are funding the New Workers Troupe (a group of migrant worker musicians) to write and perform ten original songs on trafficking and exploitation based on true stories.

15. **Peer to peer support** – this is integrated into different initiatives in various sites e.g. some schools carrying out the Life Skills pilots engaged in-school children to reach out to school drop-outs; elsewhere, some Women's Homes ran a 'Big Sisters' initiatives whereby long-standing users supported newcomers arriving at the centres.

1.2. Context

16. The project is being implemented within the context of huge levels of internal migration, primarily from rural to urban areas, and representing the largest labour migration in human history. Out of a total population of around 1.34 billion people, latest figures from 2011 suggest that the total internal migrating population in China comprises 253 million migrant workers, 158 million (63%) of whom migrate outside their own provinces. This figure includes 20 million children. Females are estimated to make up half of the 16-25 age group and a third of migrants overall. Most migrant workers are young, have low levels of education, and rely on informal channels to migrate. They are ill-prepared for the challenges that working in cities present. These factors contribute to the risk of being trafficked, risks which are particularly acute for young female migrants. Trafficking for forced labour and sexual exploitation is reported to be on the rise in the context of huge migration.
17. The national anti-trafficking policy environment has undergone substantial change in recent years. Trafficking for labour exploitation and child labour used to be regarded as highly sensitive issues. The project reports that over time, efforts by ILO and other sister United Nations (UN) agencies have helped change these attitudes. China has begun to recognize the labour aspects of trafficking. In 2009, China formally ratified the Palermo Protocol and subsequently made further changes to the legal system, including amendments in 2010 to the Chinese Criminal Law on articles related to forced labour. There are still aspects of the Chinese legal system which require amendment e.g. there are a lack of operational indicators for trafficking for labour exploitation.

1.3. Evaluation background

1.3.1. Evaluation purpose

18. The evaluation remit was set out in the terms of reference (TOR) (annex 1) and further clarified by an inception report prepared by the evaluation team at the outset of the process. As an end of project evaluation, priority attention was given to outcomes - whether the project achieved its objectives and to what extent its interventions are sustainable. It sought to understand the factors that facilitated or constrained implementation (including project design, strategy, management etc.). The relevance of the project was reviewed and the evaluation looked forward to the future based on learning from the project. Gender issues were also taken into account.
19. The evaluation TORs listed indicative questions and required the following main categories set out in the ILO Evaluation Policy Guidelines (2012) to be covered:

- Design: the extent to which the design is logical and coherent.

Effectiveness: the extent to which the intervention's immediate objectives were achieved, or are expected to be achieved, taking into account their relative importance.

Relevance: the extent to which the objectives of a development intervention are consistent with beneficiaries' requirements, country needs, global priorities and partners' and donors' policies. The extent to which the approach is strategic and the ILO uses its comparative advantage.

Sustainability: the strategic orientation of the project towards making a significant contribution to broader, long-term, sustainable development changes. The likelihood that the results of the intervention are durable and can be maintained or even scaled up and replicated by intervention partners after major assistance has been completed.

Effectiveness of management arrangements: The extent to which management capacities and arrangements put in place support the achievement of results.

Special aspects: included specific questions on the follow-up to the mid-term technical review; the process for disseminating pilot projects; the mobilization of tripartite constituents and others; assessing support in the implementation of provincial anti-trafficking plans; intersection with ILO's Decent Work Agenda; lessons in cross-border trafficking; and support to the Government of China's work plan under the Coordinated Ministerial Mekong Initiative against Trafficking (COMMIT).

20. The evaluation was able to touch on all these issues to a greater or lesser degree except the last two issues under 'Special aspects' since these concern cross-border issues and regional cooperation whereas the project's priority is internal migration. The report highlights key good practices and lessons learned in the course of narrating the findings; the aim is not to highlight everything as the project has already commissioned its own document on good practices, but rather to spotlight issues which genuinely strike the evaluation team as substantive features of the project worth noting. The project is also encouraged to review the report carefully and pick up on new aspects for inclusion in its good practices/lessons learned publication.
21. This evaluation closely followed a comprehensive internal mid-term review (MTR) completed just 9 months previously. As the MTR involved visits to four provinces (Hunan, Jiangsu, Fujian and Guizhou) and written inputs from two others (Anhui and Yunnan), the final evaluation was designed not to duplicate this earlier work. The final evaluation comprised national interviews and field visits to three provinces pre-selected by IPEC - two provinces not visited by the MTR – Anhui and Yunnan; and Fujian which was visited by the MTR team. Findings are primarily based on new evidence collected by the final evaluation; where findings are based on the project's own self-assessment, this is made clear in the reporting. The evaluation found all three provinces visited to be on a similar footing, making for limited opportunity to contrast stronger and weaker examples of implementation. As such the evaluation referred back to the MTR particularly for such information.
22. The evaluation adhered to the main evaluation principles set out in the ILO Evaluation Policy Guidelines (2012): usefulness; impartiality; independence; quality; and competence. It also abided by the principle of 'Do no harm' to vulnerable beneficiaries and took account of the principle of the 'Best interests of the child'. As an independent evaluation, it was carried out by two independent consultants, one international and one local expert. The evaluation team was managed by an evaluation manager from ILO/IPEC-EIA headquarters who was responsible for overseeing technical and methodological issues. IPEC project officials and the ILO Office in Beijing provided administrative and logistical support during the evaluation mission. The evaluation team was accompanied in its visit by ACWF project staff and a CP-TING project assistant who provided translation support.

1.3.2. Evaluation methodology

23. The evaluation TOR encouraged participation in planning; and inputs from the full range of stakeholders though the evaluation report itself is required to be independent. Recognising the tension between the opposing objectives of 'independence' and 'participation' in an evaluation, and in order to safeguard the principle of impartiality, the evaluation team had planned to ask provincial project staff not to participate in meetings with stakeholders. However, in practice, most meetings with official counterparts were large and formal and it seemed inappropriate to ask provincial project staff to step aside, and it is unlikely that this would have made a difference. It's also worth recalling that the evaluation team was accompanied by two national level project staff in all meetings (one from IPEC and one from ACWF) and as such did not conduct private meetings with individual provincial staff or partners which may have inhibited responses and affected the type of information collected. The evaluation team did ensure that immediate service providers (teachers, trainers, Women's Home staff etc.) did not participate in focus groups with direct beneficiaries (children and women).

24. The evaluation used a qualitative methodology in order to facilitate a deep and rounded insight into the functioning of the project. The evaluation did not collect any new quantitative data but did use the project's data to supplement analysis after reviewing a sample to confirm that such data was in fact being collected. The evaluation used several techniques to examine the views of a range of stakeholders in order to triangulate findings:
- **Desk review:** analysis of existing project documentation and external reports (see annex 2 for list of documents reviewed). An in-depth analysis of the project's technical progress reports and action programme and other documents was carried out.
 - **Key informant interviews:** these were semi-structured individual and group interviews with project staff; ACWF representatives; Non-governmental organisation (NGO) representatives; researchers and consultants involved in the project; government stakeholders; donor representatives; and international partners. Loosely structured telephone interviews were also carried out in the preparatory phase with ILO/Headquarters and regional backstopping officials.
 - **Focus groups:** semi-structured group discussions were held with direct and indirect beneficiaries defined as follows²:
 - Direct beneficiaries were those who have received services, training or community support i.e. children and young women from the following types of groups – young migrants, migrant children, drop-outs, poor rural youth, ethnic minorities, left-behind children (i.e. children of parents who have migrated and have been left behind in the care of relatives or the local school etc).
 - Indirect beneficiaries comprised partners and volunteers who have received training (direct recipients) in order to build their capacities to provide better services, and carry out advocacy and development activities e.g. agencies, teachers, social partners, community leaders etc. This group also involve other interested parties e.g. parents. The evaluation team did not meet community members, factory owners, social partners etc.
 - The evaluation team provided guidance to the project on the sampling of focus group participants i.e. groups should be comprised ideally of around 10 persons and give a fair representation of the project in terms of gender, age, ethnicity, religion and other social characteristics.
 - **Direct On-Site Observation:** the evaluation team observed a class in one school as well as activities in Women's Homes.
 - **Stakeholder meetings:** these were meetings with key officials and stakeholders. The provincial level meetings took the form of round-tables designed to obtain information and to share emerging findings. The national level final evaluation workshop took a participatory approach and used interactive methodologies to explore participant opinions; to share and test initial findings; and to jointly consider appropriate recommendations.
25. The evaluation consulted 169 persons (see list of persons consulted in annex 5) broken down as follows: ILO and ACWF staff (17); national, provincial and county level stakeholders (46); researchers (4); and teachers (29); beneficiaries (69 of which 18 were girls and 5 were boys under 18 years of age; there were a further 20 male and female senior school students of non-specific age; the remaining 31 beneficiaries were adult women). Although listed in the TOR and requested by the evaluation team in the inception report, the project did not organise meetings

² These terms are sometimes defined differently in project documents but an agreement to use these terms in accordance with IPEC guidelines was established in email communications between the evaluation team and IPEC.

with representatives from the media, from workers' or employers' groups, from other migration/trafficking programmes (except for UNIAP), or any national level ministries (Ministry of Public Security (MPS) or Ministry of Railways (MoR) – the former due to the non-availability of key officials and the latter due to restructuring of the ministry). Also despite guidance given in advance on sampling, most focus groups of direct and indirect beneficiaries were of variable size and composition. There was a proportionate gender breakdown in most cases where the project targeted both males and females, except for one instance where a focus group representing the 'Life Skills in schools' component comprised only girls despite the fact that boys were also receiving this training, presumably on the assumption that girls were most at risk. The team met a range of ages, and vulnerable groups e.g. children from migrant families or those left behind at home while their parents migrated for work etc. There was no information on other social characteristics such as ethnicity.

26. The evaluation used three different instruments (see annex 3); one for the policy community; another for indirect beneficiaries who received training and capacity building; and one for direct beneficiaries. The language, content and questions were applied in a flexible way and adapted to each group. Care was taken not to ask leading questions. The evaluation instruments were translated and shared in advance with respondents to help them prepare.
27. The project developed in schedule (see annex 4 for final schedule) with guidance from the evaluation team. Despite the fact that the project sampled the beneficiaries and the evaluation instruments were shared in advance, the evaluation team was confident in basing its findings on the responses of the focus groups and stakeholder meetings; the groups were probed at length, all participants had the space to speak as individuals, and were usually able to answer new and different questions in a thoughtful and animated way.

1.3.3. *Evaluation limitations*

28. A number of limitations facing the evaluation have already been discussed in the preceding section. In summary, the scale of the project versus time and budget constraints made it necessary to focus on certain areas. A sample of three field sites were identified by the project; while these sites gave a good breadth of coverage, they missed some important interventions such as work with tripartite partners which could not be verified first-hand by the evaluation team. In addition, the evaluation found all three provinces visited to be on a similar footing, making for limited opportunity to contrast stronger and weaker examples of implementation. In retrospect, a province facing more challenges e.g. Guizhou, might have made for a more representative sample. There were also language barriers as the team leader did not speak Chinese; but this was compensated for by the involvement of a national consultant, and the support of a translator.
29. The evaluation was already planned before the team leader came on board leaving little room for alterations to the evaluation design³. As such, despite writing a detailed inception report with guidance on planning and structuring the evaluation, it was too late to put some of these suggestions into operation. For instance, the inception report guidance on sampling and setting up focus groups was not always followed.
30. One key question raised in the inception report was on how to ensure the required independence of the evaluation. The terms of reference called for an independent evaluation; it was to be carried out by two independent consultants; it allowed for participation of project staff in planning which is not an issue; and stated that the report writing should be independent. However, it was silent on whether evaluation activities i.e. research, interviews and meetings, should involve staff. In practice, the evaluators were accompanied in all meetings by two project staff; while accompanying staff conducted themselves in a non-intrusive way, their

³ The team leader substituted the previously appointed team leader at the last minute.

participation may nonetheless have affected responses from provincial project staff or from external stakeholders and could be construed as a conflict of interest. All meetings with provincial stakeholders were large and formal which anyway limited the ability to probe interviewees or to triangulate information obtained from different sources. Meetings with direct beneficiaries (children and women) were held independently of service providers but the size of the evaluation delegation (4 persons) did not make for an informal approach.

31. These limitations have not seriously compromised the evaluation and the team was able to adapt and make adjustments as necessary. However, it does highlight the importance of defining more clearly at the outset what type of evaluation is to be carried out, the extent to which it is independent or participatory, and then making plans accordingly in accordance with ILO/IPEC definitions of different types of evaluations.

2. Findings

2.1. Evaluation criteria

2.1.1. Effectiveness

2.1.1.1. *Immediate Objective 1 – Improved policy framework to prevent trafficking for labour exploitation*

32. The outcomes at policy level involve a consideration of what results were achieved in terms of changes to legislation, government policy or government practice. Policy change is a complex, multi-faceted and long-term process in most political systems and no less so in China. It is difficult to engineer change or to claim responsibility for change when it occurs when policy decisions are influenced by multiple political, social and economic factors. Establishing a causal link requires, at the very least, insights into the motivations of key decision-makers, and even this is not fool proof.
33. The evaluation is therefore realistic in its expectations of change, aiming to understand if change has happened and if not, which factors under the project's control might have made a difference. Outcomes at this level depend not only on the effort made or the quality of work; political interests and resource availability are often decisive. Also worth noting that in a country as large as China, policy change in one province alone can impact tens of millions of lives and this constitutes a significant achievement. On the other side, the report is also careful in crediting the project as being responsible for change: referring instead to the project's contributions to policy providing these are acknowledged by an external source or validated by objective data. The examples cited below constitute policy achievements to date; the section on 'Sustainability' cites future policy commitments.

Trafficking for labour exploitation

- Key role in changing government attitudes to trafficking for labour exploitation. This was seen as a taboo subject when CP-TING first started work in 2004; acceptance has now reached a stage where these terms are used in legal and policy documents. CP-TING is also credited with fostering greater openness from government on related issues, for instance, the September 2012 High Level dialogue between ILO Geneva and government included discussions on child labour, a hitherto relatively unacknowledged issue. Such changes are attributed to both phases of CP-TING and it is not possible to isolate the impact of CP-TING II in particular.
- The project gave inputs, through the United Nations Inter-agency Project on Human Trafficking (UNIAP) and along with other UN agencies, to China's second National Plan of Action against Human Trafficking (NPA) (2013-20). The project's

recommendations on the promotion of community services through Women's Homes and Life Skills; and awareness-raising through railway campaigns were accepted, with the ACWF being given an enhanced role in these aspects. Other calls by CP-TING and other UN players for more research on the issue, and stronger monitoring of the NPA were not adopted.

- Helping to institutionalise awareness-raising campaigns on trafficking for labour exploitation and related issues. Officials frequently cite this as a lasting legacy of CP-TING's work. CP-TING's role was to enhance existing campaigns carried out by ACWF and MPS by including messages on trafficking for labour exploitation specifically and by finding new and innovative ways of carrying out such campaigns e.g. using the railway network. Officials from various provinces, levels and departments (police, ACWF, education, labour etc.) are involved in these broad-based campaigns which cover many different subjects (e.g. drug abuse, HIV/AIDS) and run during annual holidays and periods of high migration. These approaches are now integrated into national policy through the NPA and led by MPS, ACWF and MoR.

Life Skills in Schools

34. Contribution to the expansion of Anhui province's curricular course on 'Safety Education' to include components of Life Skills education related to trafficking and labour exploitation. This was an achievement of CP-TING phase I which has continued into phase 2 through funding for further integration. The new versions of textbooks on safety education for primary, middle and high school students include chapters relating to trafficking prevention. The provincial government paid for the publication and distribution of these books which are available to schools on demand. They have been distributed to 18,830 schools so far, an estimated 60% of the schools in the province, reaching over 9 million students. This policy decision was taken by the provincial education department. Officials describe the process as a merging of mutual interests; the province already had a strong commitment to safety education and was working on its course books when CP-TING I approached it in 2005 with the idea of expanding these courses to cover trafficking and labour exploitation.
35. Integrating Life Skills into policy in the other five provinces is a work in progress. The project hopes for significant results in Hunan where it is seeking a regulation by the Provincial People's Congress (decision-making body) - if successful, this would mean an even higher degree of integration than Anhui since it would form part of the legislation. In Fujian, officials say that some Life Skills materials have been integrated into new safety education books which are soon to be distributed to schools. Since this announcement was made for the first time during the evaluation visit, and without the knowledge of the CP-TING Provincial Project Office (PPO), its implication is unclear. There are no policy developments in the other three provinces as yet.

Women's Homes

36. ACWF is to publish the Women's Home manual (which sets out the project approach to providing services for migrant women) and distribute it to 670,000 Women's Homes nationwide. ACWF jointly implements the project with IPEC; it is the largest women's NGO in China with a nation-wide structure and outreach to both the upper and lower levels of society through its connections to the Communist Party. It is not a government agency with administrative power and its commitment to disseminate the work on Women's Homes does not count as public policy; nonetheless, this achievement is listed here given the significant reach of ACWF. The decision to disseminate project learning nation-wide goes beyond the remit of ACWF's liaison unit for CP-TING and therefore counts as an impact on organisational policy.
37. The project approach has been piloted in specific sites but certain Women's Federation (WF) provincial offices report using this methodology in non-pilot sites and in other sectors of work. For instance, Provincial WF branches in Anhui and Fujian say the approach is used in non-

project activities such as children's clubs, activities for left behind children, and in parenting classes.

38. Local authorities are making a financial contribution to Women's Homes in some pilot sites e.g. Sanlijie CCP Neighbourhood Affairs Work Committee provided 500,000 RMB to upgrade the Fengyi migrant centre in Hefei, Anhui run by the NGO Happy Family Children's Club as a compliment to the technical skills provided by CP-TING. They say they have learnt much from the project approach and are already implementing the approach in non-pilot sites, e.g. Sanlijie district council/Anhui is replicating in Tian Chang Lu sub-district; CP-TING itself reports expansion in Yunnan through mobile centres although this was not further verified during the field visit by external stakeholders or by the project itself through the provision of more specific information such as site names, for example.

Other sectors

39. Policy change in other sectors varies from place to place and department to department. The labour department tends to be the least engaged in the project's work as compared to other ministries. Nonetheless, there are significant outcomes in certain places. The project reports that the change in provincial regulations (Jiangsu) on student workers was due to CP-TING's study on Student Workers as well as policy advocacy work assisted by the Jiangsu Provincial Labour department. The MTR found that the afore-mentioned study had also motivated the labour department to step up its labour inspections. In another example, the Yunnan project office says it persuaded the local labour department to set aside quotas for migrant people in vocational schools. In terms of practice, the evaluation itself heard from the labour department/Fujian province which acknowledged that its support to migrant women through job fairs and work on child labour has intensified as a result of trainings given by the project.
40. The police department is heavily engaged in anti-trafficking work across the board, although much of these efforts are unrelated to the project e.g. cross-border trafficking, trafficking for other purposes such as adoption, or forced marriage of women over 18, COMMIT process and international cooperation etc. Nonetheless, police officers in Fujian and Yunnan habitually credited the increased emphasis on prevention in police work (e.g. publicity campaigns, awareness-raising at grassroots level) to CP-TING as opposed to the traditional focus on investigation and prosecution.
41. The Provincial Working Committee of Women and Children in Yunnan says the project has influenced a revision of the Committee's own working indicators which it develops annually in line with State Council directives and guidelines; as well as its approach to children's homes.
42. In Licheng sub-district/Fujian, the political leadership issued instructions for the engagement of a number of departments in the local steering committee which was put under the chairmanship of the 'Comprehensive Administration Unit' in order to coordinate the work of various sectors. The awareness-raising days in Fujian and Yunnan, for instance, have both involved hospitals offering free medical services to migrant women.

Project monitoring data

43. Project data on progress towards objective 1 is summarised in table 1. The project far exceeded its own targets in most respects (e.g. 1,855 decision-makers, 333 journalists and 8 research institutes trained, 8 forums held, 1 seminar held and inputs into NPA, and 6 provincial plans made). Project indicators are largely at the level of outputs rather than outcomes e.g. numbers trained or events held which suggest policy-making capacity has been strengthened but do not necessarily show changes to the framework. Nor are the indicators always clear or precise e.g. indicator 1 targeted 300 decision-makers for training, 1,855 persons were trained but it is not known if they were actual 'decision-makers'; indicator 3 refers to 'strategic mechanisms' but

the reporting is all about capacity building activities; indicator 2 refers to ‘provincial plans’ which sound like high level provincial plans involving the entire policy-making architecture when in fact they are project plans for the province which engage certain government departments etc.

Summary on effectiveness on immediate objective 1

44. The project has made important contributions to the policy framework especially in terms of mainstreaming the concept of trafficking for labour exploitation into national policy, and in influencing future practice towards migrant women in Women’s Homes nationwide. The impact of its Life Skills activities on education policy and its work on other areas of government policy (labour, policing etc.) vary from place to place and the reasons for this are discussed in later parts of the report (see discussion under ‘Facilitating and constraining factors’). The project is effective on the basis of its own monitoring which assiduously tracks beneficiary numbers as well as the evaluation which measured the project against a higher standard of outcomes and found it to have achieved definitive results.

Table 1: Summary of Project Monitoring Data on ‘Immediate Objective 1 Improved policy framework’⁴	
Indicators	Baseline, target and result
1. Number of decision makers trained and able to work in inter-agency collaboration	Baseline: Limited understanding of comprehensive nature of trafficking Target: 300 Decision makers trained and able to work in inter-agency committees to establish plans and monitor actions Result: 1,855 trained
2. Monitoring plan at provincial level	Baseline: Provincial monitoring plan does not exist Target: Provincial monitoring plan exists Result: Baseline data collected and monitoring plans made in all provinces.
3. Mechanisms for implementing strategic measures	Baseline: Mechanisms for implementing strategic measures do not exist Target: Mechanisms for implementing strategic measures are replicated in non-pilot sites. Result: Capacity built of 840 ACWF county presidents, 6 research institutions; and education departments in sending areas.
4. Number of Technical and research inputs on ratification and implementation of key international instruments and frameworks	Baseline: ILO initiatives on trafficking and child labour conventions are known and acknowledged by relevant ministries Target: 2 national policy level events targeting 50 decision makers; New policy developments reflect project priorities. Result: EU seminar; also recommendations to new NPA
5. Key research organizations trained demonstrate an understanding of trafficking concepts, data collection methodologies and international good practices. Number of researchers engaged to analyse topics of interest to decision makers and communities	Baseline: Currently very limited Target: By project end, 2 national research organizations are providing policymakers with information on trafficking Result: 190 researchers from 2 national research institutions and 8 provincial research institutions were involved
6. Number of trained media that report more completely, and in victim centred manner	Baseline: Trafficking cases focus on cracking down, provide limited information, and do not address victim needs Target: By project end, 20 major media outlets in pilot provinces will report more completely and in a victim-centred manner Result: 950 articles have appeared in TV, radio, newspaper, bulletin boards reports; and 333 Journalists were trained and involved.
7. Number of rights-based events held for the target group and CSOs to facilitate policy dialogue with decision-makers (i.e., <i>migrant women’s forum</i>)	Baseline: No regular process of consultation Target: Annual roundtables with 2 CSOs Result: 6 provincial forums and 1 national forum in 2010 and 1 provincial forum in 2012

⁴ Based on Technical Progress Report 6 dated 8 February 2013 and project email response to the evaluation team dated 12 April 2013

2.1.1.2. *Immediate Objective 2 – Improved implementation of trafficking prevention measures in pilot provinces*

45. Project efforts to improve implementation of trafficking prevention measures were centred on building the capacity of individual professionals and practitioners as well as institutions in the key pilot interventions of Life Skills, Women's Homes and publicity campaigns. The evaluation sought evidence of improved knowledge and skills, changes to behaviour and implementation of activities in the anti-trafficking sphere.

Individual level

46. The project is consistently effective in building capacity at individual level; all focus groups met by the evaluation team, whether they were teachers, staff and volunteers at Women's Homes, or government officials, were unanimous that their skills and knowledge had increased to the benefit of their work.
47. **Increased knowledge** – one of the main benefits is increased understanding of trafficking, labour exploitation and related issues. Teachers from the Clivia beauty and hairdressing school Quanzhou/Fujian said the Life Skills training had opened their eyes to risks facing their students in the entertainment sector. The police in different provinces said the project had widened their understanding of trafficking to cover labour exploitation instead of the traditional focus on trafficking for marriage and adoption. They also better understood the importance of prevention as well as the links between migrant integration, public security and their day to day work. Researchers too confirmed their knowledge of trafficking and labour exploitation had increased. One group that is notably missing from this awareness-raising work is parents; this evaluation confirms the findings of the MTR about parents being an under-engaged group who merit more attention.
48. **Increased skills** - professionals report enhanced skills in other ways too. Teachers involved in the Life Skills training for schools like the participatory methodology very much, they find it compatible with new teaching methods which are being promoted through the teacher reform process, and report putting this to use in their own classes. Staff from Women's Homes say that project trainings have helped enhance their management capacities, particularly their ability to plan and monitor implementation. New methodologies are popular too, one police officer in Licheng district/Fujian was particularly impressed with the notion of brainstorming, "[this is] very new to us, classrooms here are led by teachers, this type of training is interesting and useful...brainstorming and discussions are especially beneficial".
49. **Improved relationships** - Teachers perceive a change in their role and attitude to teaching (seeing themselves more as facilitators rather than masters) following the Life Skills training, and find improved relationships with pupils, and in some places e.g. schools in Funan county/Anhui, improved relations within the staff team. They admit the methodology can be challenging to start with and seems to require more effort than traditional rote learning but eventually class management and teaching is made easier.

Institutional level

50. **Institutional profiles** – the reputations of partners is enhanced in some cases which in turns impacts on their ability to carry out anti-trafficking work. The project is strongly associated with ACWF and has helped to bring it to the greater attention of more people, for instance, young women at the Clivia beauty school in Fujian said they now recognise its logo, and know what it's about and what it has to offer them e.g. grants. Other partners have also seen their visibility rise. The project approach implemented by the NGO partners in Sanlijie district/Hefei/Anhui and Kunming city/Yunnan has helped garner positive feedback including funding from local authorities – the Fengyi Women's Home in Sanlijie received 500,000 RMB for upgrading its

infrastructure from local government, Wang Jiaqiao centre in Yunnan receives the same amount from the local civil affairs department. Although it must be said this is also largely due to the long-standing work of these NGOs and the support of other donors. Infact in the case of Sanlijie Happy Family Children's Club, CP-TING is the beneficiary of earlier work funded by Save the Children UK (SCUK), which attracted national attention, including publicity in Hong Kong newspapers – a legacy which prompted local government to support the centre at project start-up.

51. **Good practice:** In any case, the project's work to highlight the role of civil society in a country where NGO activity is very restricted should be regarded as a good practice. Moreover, the support of CP-TING has enabled local partners to grow and develop; NGO partners said they had a better understanding of labour issues related to their target group; and were also able to expand their services to new target groups, for instance, Fengyi Women's Home used to support migrant children in its earlier work with SCUK, and the support of CP-TING in 2010 enabled an expansion of its services to young migrant women. NGO partners have also increased their capacity to develop materials and technical tools on their own; the work led by ACWF with the Heart-to-Heart Community Centre and others on the training manual for Women's Homes is an example of this. The project approach of supporting and empowering local partners through awareness-raising and capacity building, rather than simply relating to them as implementing agencies, has been central to this type of formative development.
52. **Institutional capacities** – Ongoing partners of the project have seen their institutions strengthened through their involvement in the project. WF branches in different provinces find their knowledge of project management has improved to the benefit of other activities. There are unexpected positive consequences too. The privately-run Clivia beauty school in Fujian saw its profits increase after it started providing Life Skills trainings as it was regarded as having more interest in its students and giving added value relative to its competitors. Individual lecturers in the school also said their earnings were up since they are paid by student numbers and their class popularity had increased. **Good practice:** the Clivia beauty school is a model intervention for the project's Life Skills work showing that corporate social responsibility pays, literally - it targets at-risk groups in terms of gender, age and sector, with age appropriate material in a conducive environment.
53. Capacity building of ILO's tripartite constituents has been more limited partly due to time constraints as the project was over-stretched by the number of different interventions committed to in the project design but also because of the difficulty of finding suitable entry points. ILO's official workers' representative is the All-China Federation of Trade Union (ACFTU) and it is either quite weak or completely absent in the type of enterprises where young migrant workers are found. The project has therefore tried to engage some other more relevant partners such as the Textile Enterprises Association in Wuxi. Training of workers' groups has just recently taken place so it is early days in terms of seeing visible impacts on capacity. A recent initiative in spring 2013 was a workshop for 'Little Bird'; a national labour rights civil society organisation comprising some 30 local organisations. CP-TING along with UNIAP is also funding the New Workers Group, a troupe of musicians, to write and perform songs containing messages on labour exploitation and trafficking prevention.
54. ILO's official employers' representative is the China Enterprise Confederation (CEC) whose members are all large state-owned enterprises while the project targets young migrants who are largely employed in small and medium-sized labour intensive industries. The MTR describes a pioneering intervention in Jiangsu involving training activities and the distribution of resources such as the 'Working with Youth' training package which are said to be well-received by employers. In terms of the overall project, staff conceded that intervention with employers was behind schedule partly because these are new approaches for CP-TING and the project is still trying to find effective ways of working with this group; and also because of the necessity of

being selective about the type of interventions carried out in different places due to the size of the project.

Project monitoring data

55. Project data on objective 2 is limited to the number of trainings it provided; in total 5,061 indirect beneficiaries were trained, far exceeding the project's original target of 100 – although it must be said that this seems unrealistically low. But aside from that, the project does not appear to have consolidated qualitative data on what difference the trainings made to the knowledge, skills or behaviour of beneficiaries. The project carried out extensive pre and post training questionnaires, and used these for internal learning but did not go to the higher level of meta-analysis to identify overall trends across the project. In terms of other monitoring indicators, the project fell slightly short on indicator 1 as there were high level statements in 4 provinces out of 6 and most of these were from the WF. There was no clear data on indicator 2, and the inter-provincial agreement target (indicator 4) was dropped.

Summary on effectiveness on immediate objective 2

56. The project has made valuable contributions to building the capacity of individuals on trafficking, labour exploitation and related issues and its own monitoring data shows it reached a far higher number than anticipated. Institutional capacity of ongoing partners has also been strengthened. The project is broadly effective against its own monitoring indicators where data exists but importantly, the evaluation assessed project outcomes more deeply in terms of changes to knowledge, skills and behaviour among indirect beneficiaries across different sites and found a consistent pattern of improvement.

Table 2: Summary of Project Monitoring Data on 'Immediate Objective 2'⁵	
Indicators	Baseline, target and result
1. Number of provincial leaders actively supporting trafficking prevention initiatives	Baseline: In CP-TING pilot provinces, leaders have already made statements and commitments, but not in 'new' provinces Target: By project end, 2 high level officials in each pilot province will have made statements to mobilize support for trafficking prevention measures Result: There were statements in 4 out of 6 provinces; the majority were from the leadership of the Women's Federation rather than other government departments.
2. Number and variety of relevant services for the target group, under provincial programs.	Baseline: Some local areas have begun work in this area, but most services are far from effective or sustainable Target: There will be a year on year increase in, the proportion of officials and users that rate the services to be "good" or better. Result: No clear monitoring data.
3. Number of service providers displaying better knowledge of required services	Baseline: Some local areas have begun work in this area, but most services are far from effective or sustainable Target: 100 trainers, volunteers and backstoppers trained to support service providers Result: Educators/Trainers trained - 2,702; Women's Home and Community Center Managers and Staff trained - 1,150; Employers Trained – 252; Volunteers trained or involved – 957
4. Number of Inter-provincial events and agreements for safe and orderly migration	Baseline: Links to trafficking prevention in existing inter-provincial frameworks not well understood Target: 3 agreements by project end Result: Activity dropped due to expense and alternate strategies

⁵ Based on Technical Progress Report 6 dated 8 February 2013 and project email response to the evaluation team dated 12 April 2013.

2.1.1.3. *Immediate objective 3 – Increased ability of women and children to protect their rights and migrate safely*

57. Outcomes here were measured by evidence of beneficiary increase in knowledge and skills with regards to trafficking for labour exploitation as well as evidence of change in behaviour. The project's direct beneficiaries benefit from the project's Life Skills work in schools and other locations as well as services provided in Women's Homes.
58. These activities show very positive effects across all sites visited by the evaluation team. The focus groups of children, young people and women were confident, lively, engaged and able to articulate very clear and specific learning and impacts. There is little doubt that the content and participatory methodology of the Life Skills courses works. The children find the methodology appealing, frequently commenting for example, that Life Skills classes are more interesting than the *"usual boring lessons"*.
59. **Increased knowledge** - This knowledge on trafficking and labour exploitation issues is age appropriate, for example, younger children know to be wary of strangers, not to accept food in case it is drugged; young teenagers are aware they should always walk home with others, tell people where they are going, and older adolescents are aware of their labour rights - labour contracts, working hours, rights to payment etc. In one school, a teacher in a vocational school said his *"students [were] starting to act like lawyers, checking background information etc"*. In one location, teenagers from migrant families, not only had awareness about issues in China; they had a surprising degree of international knowledge about certain issues in India and Africa. The Life Skills courses end up touching on an array of subjects and beneficiaries appeared highly knowledgeable about all sorts of issues from lottery scams, to drinks being spiked with drugs, HIV/AIDS, reproductive health and so on.
60. **Increased skills** - In Women's Homes, beneficiaries receive help with finding decent jobs, help with claiming wages (e.g. Wang Jiaqiao centre in Kunming city/Yunnan) or tips on how to resolve problems with employers (e.g. Fengyi centre/Anhui, staff give advice on what to say and how to raise issues with employers given that legal routes are so convoluted). Migrant women learn new skills, one woman said she used to be illiterate until she came to the Woman's Home, others find new ways of earning a living, for instance, Wang Jiaqiao centre/Yunnan is piloting a scheme to train migrant women in making clothes and bags for sale using recycled cloth. The centres also help women integrate, make friends with each other and get to know the local community. A positive feature of the centres visited is that they reach out to the host community as well and thereby help prevent resentments and jealousies being fuelled e.g. Fengyi centre/Anhui holds debating forums and other activities to bring migrants and host communities together; while the Wang Jiaqiao centre/Yunnan provides help to elderly people from the local area.
61. **Improved relationships** - Children reported that relations with parents had improved since the Life Skills course, for instance, left behind children who do not often see their parents said they were more inclined to phone them or felt better able to communicate with them after the course. Many pupils also said they felt *"closer"* to their teachers, one said *"we feel we are more like friends...before we felt we had to look up to them, now we feel more equal"*.
62. **Changed behaviour** - The impact of the project methodology on behaviour was directly observable, virtually all children were confident to speak at length in all groups met by the evaluation team and with much animation and credibility – this is not regarded as the norm in school systems which still use traditional teaching methods and rote learning. There were also anecdotal reports of changed behaviours e.g. pupils who had changed their minds about leaving school early to migrate, or others who had left and come back. In one school in Anhui, drop out numbers had declined, but as the teachers pointed out themselves, this could not necessarily be attributed to the Life Skills course since they had not analysed the data. Beneficiaries in

Women's Homes said they were more likely to seek work through formal employment agency than personal contacts.

63. Beneficiaries also report passing on information to friends and family members. Some children said they'd tried to persuade other children not to drop out of school. In Ningyuan county, Hunan, the MTR found Life Skills had successfully been integrated into student retention programmes as students shared personal stories about the importance of education in order to persuade migrant drop outs to stay at school. Elsewhere, children had passed on information to their parents. In one case a father reported that he stopped smoking after being told by his son that it was bad for his health (this was considered a plausible example in the Chinese context). The project reports that in another site, a pupil shared information about labour rights with her migrant parents working in brick kilns who used this information to organise with other workers and force their employer to provide written contracts. Some also expressed a wish to do more to help protect others in vulnerable situations.
64. **Rights-based events** - The project has held a number of rights-based events with the aim of bringing policy makers and children and women together. The evaluation is not in a position to make much assessment of this but learnt that there are questions about how the process can be managed in a way that is cost-effective and ensures proper representation of beneficiaries. These rights-based events enable beneficiaries to put policy recommendations directly to policy-makers. Aside from Yunnan where policy advocacy work involving beneficiaries is said to have had some success, there are no obvious direct impacts on policy. In any case, such events will have increased the awareness of decision-makers of beneficiary experiences and they are likely to have had a very real impact on beneficiary self-empowerment. The positive effect of the participatory approach promoted by the project were readily visible in the visit to Wang Jiaqiao centre/Yunnan where both women and children take responsibility for running the centre's activities e.g. children took the lead in a photo exhibition or in running the centre library. In Hunan, rural middle school children were involved in identifying 12 tips for trafficking prevention which were later incorporated into awareness-raising campaigns, according to the MTR.
65. **Awareness-raising campaigns** – The beneficiaries of these campaigns are very indirect and remote as compared to other project beneficiaries. The campaigns have proved popular among government departments though some stakeholders question the value of such campaigns since the impacts can't be measured. The project estimates that well over 2 million beneficiaries have been reached in this way; and according to the MTR all provinces met or exceeded their targets except for Guizhou which it put down to a shorter running time relative to others. However many beneficiaries were reached, it is impossible to say whether this information has penetrated and impacted on behaviour. Nonetheless, these campaigns now have the stature of broad-based government public information campaigns covering an array of subject in addition to trafficking and labour exploitation (e.g. drugs, HIV/AIDS) and engaging all government departments. Public information is a responsibility of all governments and impacts of such campaigns are an issue the world over⁶. ACWF has made some efforts to capture the responses of recipients.
66. Some interviewees suggest there could be further efficiencies e.g. producing materials centrally and allowing for essential localisation such as language only, but others assert the importance of giving freedom for adaptation given the diverse culture and context in China. The project has tried the innovative use of new technologies like micro-blogging and instant messaging for sharing information and communication although this has not always worked well e.g. ACWF reported that its efforts to use micro-blogging during awareness-raising campaigns had not had as much take-up from beneficiaries as hoped, possibly because such interactive methodologies may work better with more controversial subjects.

⁶ See for example, Coffman J., *Lessons In Evaluating Communications Campaigns Five Case Studies*, 2003, Harvard Family Research Project, Harvard University Graduate School of Education

67. **Entertainment shows** – the initiative by UNIAP, World Vision and CP-TING to raise awareness about trafficking issues by commissioning a group of musicians, the New Workers' Art Troup (NWAT), to write and perform songs based on real life trafficking cases in worthy of mention here. The audience for such a one off performance would usually be regarded as a very indirect beneficiary experiencing indiscernible benefits. However, a research study commissioned by UNIAP involving pre and post event questionnaires provided quantifiable data showing significant changes in knowledge and attitude.

Project Monitoring data

68. The monitoring data show that the project reached double its intended target of direct beneficiaries: 146,171 people benefitted from the Life Skills and Women's Homes interventions, while the greater majority were female (96,560), the numbers in Life Skills services specifically designed to target boys and girls under 18 years of age were more equal (40,440 girls to 36,863 boys). The project also counts 2,297,054 indirect beneficiaries of its mass information campaigns, double the original number intended, though it is not clear how the project can be so specific or what tangible and lasting benefits people get. The project records high satisfaction with access to services and indicates where peer networks have been set up. Again as with other data, the wording of the indicators are output oriented, they show numbers reached but not how self-protection increased, despite the fact that the project may well have collected such data, for example through beneficiary cards which tracked changes after receiving Life Skills training. It would have been helpful to analyse and consolidate this data to give a project-wide view of trends in terms of improvements to self-protection.

Summary on effectiveness on immediate objective 3

69. The project methodologies, its Life Skills training and services provided in Women's Homes, have proved their worth and are undoubtedly effective in giving beneficiaries the tools, knowledge and skills to better protect themselves. The project far exceeded its target of numbers of beneficiaries. The evaluation finds very positive outcomes for beneficiaries directly participating in the project.

Table 3: Summary of Project Monitoring Data on 'Immediate Objective 3'	
Indicators	Baseline, target and result
1. Number of children and young migrant workers that receive information about rights, safe migration and decent jobs under campaigns.	Baseline: 0 Target: 1 million more migrants and their families have increased awareness Result: Breakdown of numbers reached (excluding those reached through media reports) is as follows: Campaigns at bus and train stations: 1,106,453 (757,558 female, 348,895 male); Thematic campaigns: 1,129,303 (568,121 female, 561,182 male); Other public events: 61,298 (30,333 female, 30,965 male). Combined together, campaigns have reached 2,297,054 people. The estimated audience of media reports on TV, Radio, Newspaper and the internet is approximately 139,166,944.
2. Number of target group members receiving project services	Baseline: 0 Target: 75,000 target group members receive services Result: 146,171 beneficiaries (96,560 female and 49,611 male) according to TPR 6 summary, including: 77,303 students had been trained through Life Skills education programmes (40,440 girls, 36,863 boys); 66,053 migrant women and children had benefitted from Women's Homes services (53,639 girls, 12,414 boys); 2,815 migrant women and children had benefited from the other support services (2,481 female, 334 male)
3. Extent to which target group says services are relevant and accessible (services revised according to feedback).	Baseline: Services are not easily accessible to target groups. Target: 0 Result: Site visits, evaluations by students and feedback from teachers; quotes and stories collected in internal review indicates high satisfaction.
4. Degree of interest in forming and expanding peer programming Number of peer-to-peer support network programs established	Baseline: 0 Target: 3 peer-to-peer programs ready for replication Result: The use of peer-to-peer support networks is more of a strategy that CP-TING mainstreams through all its activities. Formal peer-to-peer support networks were established in 'big sister' and 'peer networking' programs in a handful of pilot sites in 4 provinces.

2.1.2. Sustainability

70. Sustainability can be defined in different ways: the continuation of project initiatives and activities; the implementation of laws and policies instigated by the project; continuing changes to beneficiary behaviour; and influences on organisational learning and conduct. In this case, as a project which sought to carry out demonstration projects with the aim of wider replication, the evaluation particularly looked for evidence of the continuation and expansion of pilots.

Policy mechanisms

71. The legal and policy changes made at national level will of course stay on the books and the project's contributions to the NPA will sustain for a number of years to come. In terms of mechanisms for project follow-up, these are mainly at the provincial level. Arrangements have been made to situate project follow-up in existing provincial mechanisms. These structures are existing committees with much wider remits, large memberships (sometimes of 30 or so government departments), and infrequent meetings (for example, once a year). Infact, in five provinces, the project is already merged with these committees - the Yunnan project for example, is linked to two committees, one dealing with women and children, the other with anti-trafficking. In Fujian, the project set up a separate project steering committee in Phase II, which gave renewed focus for a period, this committee will disband when the project ends with

⁷ Based on Technical Progress Report 6 dated 8 February 2013 and project email response to the evaluation team dated 12 April 2013

issues then being raised in the Liaison Committee on Safeguarding the Rights of Women and Children run by the WF, and also the Provincial Anti-trafficking committee run by PSB. In Anhui, the work will fall under a new WF Safeguarding Rights Liaison Committee.

72. The MTR found a model provincial steering committee structure in operation in Jiangsu where inter-agency collaboration was working very well, and despite high staff turnover, the relevant departments were able to mobilise effectively over joint action, for example on student workers' regulations. By contrast, it was not working so well in Guizhou; the MTR found that as an under developed province with little experience in international cooperation, the project encountered some problems in interesting local officials in the work of the PSC though matters were later said to be improving. In any case, the key point for all provinces is that the project is not always an agenda item on such committees, even now, unless a specific invitation is issued e.g. presentations to the Provincial Security Board (PSB) led Provincial Anti-trafficking committee in Fujian and Anhui were made by high level WF officials. Although these mechanisms exist, any continued discussion of project-related issues will depend on the initiation of such discussions, particularly by WF members.

Life Skills in Schools

73. In Anhui, aside from the inclusion of certain aspects of the Life Skills contents into the safety education curriculum, education officials say the participatory methodology will be integrated into teacher training as part of the teacher reform process which has been going on since the early 2000s. The province is also setting up a Safety Education Association in May 2013 which will be another avenue for promoting project content. In another example, the international NGO, World Vision, is using the Life Skills modules in new project sites.
74. Generally speaking, the project's Life Skills modules and training are not being absorbed wholesale into mainstream teaching. Pilot schools are left with the discretion to continue or not – some said they would, others that they would not. One school in Funan county/Anhui said it would continue. The project reports that Hunan county (Yanling and Ningyuan) would also continue. It says that skills were integrated into country level curriculums in Hunan province or in school level programmes like the receiving city of Wuxi in Jiangsu Province.
75. Reasons commonly given for not continuing with Life Skills training include:
 - Time pressures in schools especially for older students who are preparing for college enrolment, this is despite the fact that some students want to continue with Life Skills classes and find them a “relaxing” diversion from exams. During the pilot phase, schools found difficulty in finding time in the school day and adapted to this in different ways; some set aside specific hours in the day, others carried out the classes after hours. Teachers also selected topics relevant to their context, in Kunming city/Yunnan they did this as a group, elsewhere it was left to individual teachers;
 - Lack of materials and resources – teachers said they had run out of booklets and training materials, there were no funds to buy any more which restricted their ability to run new classes;
 - Lack of support from the education department was mentioned in different provinces particularly in the context of budgets needed for buying additional materials, and the fact that training certificates were issued by the WF and not the education department;
 - Project's Life Skills material requires adaptation which in turn means time and resources – there seem to be issues about the appropriateness of content – one official expressed the view that the content was suitable for older pupils but the methodology for younger ones concluding that the approach was useful to them but not the information; another said that

some of the information might be too “dark” for certain age groups, stressing the importance of giving children a balanced view of life.

- Children in two different provinces remarked that the classes could be more participatory which highlights the problem of maintaining teaching standards once the courses are over.
76. Nor is replication of the training in non-pilot schools likely to occur save for a couple of ad hoc instances in Fujian province. Teachers expressed disappointment that the coverage was limited with so few schools benefitting from the training because the education authority was not investing in disseminating this training further. Although official follow-up is weak, teachers who participated in the programme find much benefit in it and say they would seek to integrate both the methodology and content into their daily work.

Women's Homes

77. The outlook for Women's Homes is more positive and there appear to be various ways in which the approach is to be sustained and replicated.
- The approach in pilot homes visited by the evaluation team will continue – the two NGOs (Happy Family Children's Club in Anhui and Heart to Heart in Yunnan) receive substantial funding from local government and other donors which goes towards infrastructure and is set to continue. Staff from the homes, ACWF and local government are committed to continuing project methodologies.
 - The privately-run Clivia beauty school in Fujian which implements the Life Skills training developed for Women's Homes is a very positive example. The school is so impressed with the dividends of this approach at many different levels that it is prepared to pay for trainers itself to give Life Skills training to new students. Good practice: This is a further demonstration of the way in which the Clivia beauty school Life Skills intervention is a good practice. The school is classed as a vocational school – such schools come under the Fujian labour department which provides subsidies for technical education but does not fund Life Skills courses. As such it is particularly important that financing is secured in other ways. Teachers from this school are also willing to share lessons with other enterprises indicating the potential for replication.
 - Commitments were also made to replicate and expand the approach to Women's Homes elsewhere. Sanlijie local authorities' (Street Office) support to replicate the approach to non-pilot areas in Hefei/Anhui has already been noted, and the manager of the women's home has been invited by officials from the political and legal committee to give training on trafficking prevention. The WF in Fujian province also plans to train staff from non-pilot sites. In Funan county/Anhui, the Women's Federation plans to upgrade 100 Women's Homes, earmarking 50,000RMB per home with the project approach incorporated into that exercise. There was also mention in Anhui of integrating the approach into 345 Women's Homes.
 - As stated before, ACWF plans to publish and distribute the project approach to Women's Homes (contained in the project manual) although training will still be required to embed the approach and assure sustainability.
 - There is also potential for the inclusion of Life Skills training into other activities e.g. WF is already including this in some parenting classes in Fujian and Life Skills modules are used by Wang Jiaqiao centre/Yunnan social workers in non-pilot sites. The use of Life Skills for training parents and social workers are very good ideas for expansion and sustainability.

Other policy areas

78. The sustainability of work carried out by other departments is sporadic. The labour department in Fujian said it would continue its activities in support of migrant women (job fairs and employment services). The evaluation did not collect information on the labour department in other provinces though the project reports that its workplace intervention in Jiangsu augurs well for sustainability. In addition, the passing of regulations protecting the rights of student workers in Jiangsu gives a good foundation for continuation. There may also be some other beneficial spin offs e.g. WF in Funan/Anhui says it worked with trade unions at county level to secure collective contracts from 90% of state owned enterprises. The police in all locations are committed to continuing publicity activities.
79. An important point worth noting is that a number of players indicated that resources were not a constraint e.g. police in Fujian said they received extra money from central government for anti-trafficking work as they had done well on national performance tables; WF Fujian also expects to receive increased funds from the provincial government allowing it to continue its work; local authorities in Sanlijie/Anhui said they had allocated funds to continue the work.

Individual level

80. At an individual level, it is anticipated that the depth of learning provided by the project will stay with direct beneficiaries (children and women) for life. Many already gave concrete examples of changes in behaviour and cite instances where they'd tried to intervene to protect others, friends and family. They also talk of passing this knowledge on in the future e.g. their own children, or for those setting up businesses in the beauty industry, to apply to their own employees. Professionals and practitioners trained by the project will also likely retain some learning and skills for future application to their work.
81. The challenge at institutional level is in replenishing training to maintain levels of knowledge and service offered especially in situations of high staff turnover.

Summary on sustainability

82. The signs are positive for a sustainability of project concepts, approaches and activities. Sustainability is a holy grail in development work and to have any commitment to continue project activities is a real achievement and a distant dream for most projects. Local officials also indicated the availability of resources from central and local government for some initiatives. Sustainability for the project's approach to Women's Homes is promising; there seem to be a number of actors, including WF branches, local authorities and NGOs who are keen to see this work move forward. The project's Life Skills work in Anhui province has also been integrated into the school curriculum and will move forward. The picture is less secure for the project's Life Skills work elsewhere, as the education departments and schools have not taken this on fully, albeit some take-up at county level in certain places. There is therefore some difference in the uptake of these two project interventions; and a review of the project's Life Skills work suggests sustainability might have been better secured by taking a more strategic approach towards policy integration and dissemination - see further discussion under 'Facilitating and constraining factors - Strategy'.
83. The main distinction in terms of sustainability is between thematic areas rather than provinces. The six provinces are on a similar footing when it comes to progress; there may be some variation in achievements based on local interests, for instance Anhui on Life Skills in schools or Jiangsu on student workers regulations but on the whole, they operate at similar levels. Of all the provinces, perhaps Guizhou faces the most challenges; its work on Life Skills in Schools at county level and Women's Homes is said to be progressing but provincial level take-up has faced obstacles as noted above. The project puts this down to various reasons: context and lack

of exposure of local stakeholders to international cooperation; the relatively shorter implementation period; staff turnover; and lack of local project capacity.

2.1.3. Relevance

Relevance to context

84. CP-TING, since its inception, has played a relevant and necessary role in advocating for Chinese legislation and policy to come in line with international conventions. Over time, through dialogue and behind-the-scenes advocacy, it has slowly been able to influence attitudes in government circles. From this perspective, the project has the same relevance today, as international thinking continues to evolve, and there remains a need to support the Chinese government to bring policy in line with the latest developments.
85. There is no doubt that the substance of the project's work is highly relevant to the context. The scale of internal migration is huge, local authorities faced with this influx are particularly in need of help and are receptive to good ideas and willing to fund them, as shown by district level authorities in Sanlijie/Anhui and Licheng/Fujian who say they see much similarity and overlap in the objectives of their work and the project. The attitude of the Chinese authorities to internal migration is said to have changed in the last 5 years; from an emphasis on cracking down to recognition that urbanisation is central to the country's economic development and there is a consequent need to manage its social consequences. Experts say that as China increasingly focuses on social development and expanding its social services, their need for technical advice and capacity building remains high; traditionally central government has been good at setting policy but not in assisting lower levels of government with guidelines and implementation.
86. Not only is the substance relevant, this type of project, which focuses on piloting, technical advice and capacity building rather than service delivery, is also very much in tune with national needs. The Chinese authorities have shown themselves receptive to good ideas, and willing to fund and replicate worthwhile initiatives as indicated above. They are also discerning, making a critical judgement as to whether a practice adds value and fits their own agenda, as seen by the response to the project's 'Life Skills in schools' pilots.
87. The project is responding to very real needs on the ground with the mainstay of its work being to prevent abuses in the labour market. The project's baseline study carried out in 2010 found labour exploitation to be a commonplace experience with some 60% of respondents reporting labour exploitation experiences. This was confirmed by the evaluation as well with such situations being the most frequently reported – not being paid, working without contracts, having identity documents withheld, not being paid overtime, being cheated/scammed by false job advertisements etc.
88. What is less known is the extent of trafficking for labour exploitation specifically. Baselines carried out under CP-TING I and II have been unable to find cases which fit with international definitions. The methodology used by the baselines (last baseline involved a large-scale quantitative study of 6000 respondents) is not necessarily adept at teasing out such cases. The lack of cases was also mentioned by police officials in different provinces during the evaluation visit. In some places e.g. Kunming city/Yunnan, beneficiaries and service providers associate trafficking in that context with child abduction for adoption rather than labour exploitation.
89. The difficulty in finding data is due to various reasons: government does not have data or will not share it; there are restrictions on the ability of international agencies to carry out research; these are hard to research, hidden populations which require special research methods. The project in conjunction with UNIAP is now conducting a qualitative study which uses purposive sampling methods to look for cases and to better understand the experience of trafficking for labour exploitation as well as risk factors. The study has researched 50 cases so far. Emerging

findings therefore confirm that trafficking for labour exploitation exists in China, as it does in nearly all countries in the world. An earlier media study carried out in 2006-7 also confirmed the existence of cases.

90. There is no clear evidence on the scale of the problem, however, and the scale is important to know as it affects the strategy adopted e.g. small-scale hidden problem may benefit from more targeted awareness-raising of at-risk groups rather than general public awareness-raising, or more emphasis on investigation, rescue and prosecution. It seems fair to assume that trafficking for labour exploitation is not as commonplace as labour exploitation on its own. In any case, such research problems are shared by practitioners in other countries too. The latest trend at international level is to refocus the emphasis on a comprehensive understanding of the needs and rights of children on the move rather than being caught up sub-categorising different movements, see for example, 2010 ILO Conference on 'Children on the Move' http://www.ilo.org/ipecc/Events/WCMS_145302/lang--en/index.htm
91. Some stakeholders at different levels argue that the project title does not properly reflect what the project is about; the title refers to a subset target group with a very specific legal meaning, whereas the project is actually dealing with a broader set of labour rights issues. There are historical reasons for this; the project grew out a sub-regional project, *'The Mekong Sub-regional Project to Combat Trafficking in Children and Women for Labour Exploitation' (TICW Project)* which was funded under a DFID funding stream for anti-trafficking projects. When CIDA started funding the Phase II, it had a stronger policy interest in labour rights. All in all, an important consideration for any potential future projects is how they should be reframed – it seems better to have a broader title to encompass a range of sub-categories and labour market abuses e.g. young migrant workers, trafficking for labour exploitation, trafficking as a type of the Worst Form of Child Labour (WFCL), trafficking for sexual exploitation, forced labour etc. This does better justice to the range of prevention and integration activities that the project is actually carrying out and also safeguards the project from being undermined by a lack of data on selective target groups.

Relevance to key stakeholders

92. The project is highly relevant to the priorities of key partners, ACWF in particular, with its strong emphasis on the protection of women and children. It's work is relevant to other government departments to differing degrees as discussed above, depending on the extent to which the project has had the time and scope to engage with their agendas.
93. The work remains relevant to the ILO Beijing office; it is the main project with an explicit emphasis on labour rights. Linkages are made with other work in the office as required e.g. the project was asked to participate in the training of labour inspectors on child labour and trafficking. However, it appears that the office currently operates through a series of separate projects rather than a cohesive country programme of which the project forms one part, although this is a tentative conclusion since the evaluation did not have much opportunity to explore this aspect much. The issue of trafficking for labour exploitation is included in the draft Decent Work Country Programme. It is beyond the scope of this evaluation to analyse in detail how and where the issue is integrated into the draft Decent Work Country Programme (DWCP) although it can point out two specific points requiring attention: (1) ensure that the wording is wide enough to cover trafficking in 'women and children' in order to be consistent with CP-TING policy, as some references appear only to refer to girls – the 2nd NPA now refers to 'human trafficking' in fact; (2) given the broader base of the project's work, which goes beyond the specific category of labour exploitation, it is important that the main substance of the project's work (e.g. labour rights of young migrants; integration of migrant workers in receiving areas etc.) is adequately reflected in the DWCP. Finally, from the donor perspective, the project was highly relevant to CIDA's strategy when it was initiated but priorities have since changed and CIDA is pulling out of funding further programmes in China as of this year.

2.2. Facilitating and constraining factors

2.2.1. Project design

94. This section looks at a variety of factors related to project design, strategy, management and external circumstances to consider how they have affected implementation and the degree to which they have played a facilitating or constraining role.

2.2.1.1. Scope

95. The scope of the project in both geographical and thematic terms has been problematic. It was overly ambitious, covering too many provinces and too many subject areas and activities. The scope of the project according to the project document (page 10) was as follows: *“Direct assistance models will be implemented in eight provinces. In addition to the above mentioned, Guangdong and Sichuan will participate in employers’ initiatives, and life skills programs respectively. Following the analysis of baseline data, there is the possibility of including one more receiving province...”*
96. The project struggled to keep up and eventually had to trim down activities in two provinces (Sichuan and Guangdong), and also to be selective in the issues it chose to focus on in different places. For instance, Life Skills in schools and Women’s Homes were implemented in most places but cooperation with other departments, and employers, workers organisations was carried out in selective places. The idea of working in both sending and receiving areas is considered positive however, and was replicated as a good practice in a UN inter-agency project on youth migration which was set up subsequently. In any case, although permission was not required from the donor to make changes to the original design, it would have been helpful to document and justify any amendments in order to keep a proper record of the evolution of the project and to keep the donor informed – it should be noted for example, that the MTR cover page still lists 8 provinces as part of the project coverage (as does this evaluation report) despite the fact that the project reduced its coverage to 6 provinces.

2.2.1.2. Partnerships

97. Project partnerships have worked very well and facilitated implementation greatly. The selection of partners was well made on the basis of complementarity in skills with ILO/IPEC and common objectives and interests. The marriage of ILO/IPEC with its technical expertise and ACWF with its wide outreach both geographically and through all levels of administrative structure, its policy connections and strong commitment continued to be the ideal arrangement for project implementation. Activity partners for specific interventions such as Happy Family Children’s Club/Anhui and Heart to Heart Community Centre/Yunnan, government agencies like the education department in Anhui and private organisations like Clivia beauty school in Fujian were also carefully selected. It’s worth noting that the MTR finds collaboration with CSOs to be a challenging area; though the final evaluation did not see enough examples directly to elaborate on this aspect, aside from noting that outreach to workers’ groups is only just taking off. The project has also worked well with other UN agencies and international organisations; it has a number of joint projects with UNIAP for example in terms of advocacy on national policy, media training and funding of workers’ troupe of musicians.
98. The project was successful in dovetailing established programmes with limited amounts of funding to add technical value e.g. Wang Jiaqiao migrants centre in Yunnan is heavily funded by major donors such as Oxfam Hong Kong, the Global Fund for Children as well as the local department of civil affairs which support its infrastructure but the project was able to add value with seed money to support trainings for staff and volunteer development. ILO/IPEC’s low key participatory and egalitarian approach to partnership was also appreciated by other stakeholders. The fact that the project is widely identified as belonging to ACWF rather than ILO is a

testament in itself to local capacity building. The participatory approach of the project at all levels was highly appreciated. It proved very effective in working with beneficiaries as discussed earlier in the report and also in working with partners.

2.2.1.3. Research

99. The project adopted a strategy of evidence-based research and invested heavily in many different studies and research projects. The project has made a significant contribution to increasing the knowledge base through timely and targeted, well-researched studies e.g. report on the situation of Child Migrants in Chengdu by the Women's Federation has proven helpful in understanding the risk factors of migrant children or the Nanjing Normal University study on student workers which was used to advocate for changes to provincial labour regulations. This approach has tracked through to local partners who have also adopted an evidence-based approach, for instance the interventions in the Fengyi centre/Fujian and Wang Jiaqiao centre/Yunnan were based on sound needs assessments by local partners. In addition, the project has translated and adapted IPEC global reports and tools like the 'Working with Youth' training package, albeit that this is a time-consuming process.

2.2.1.4. Gender

100. There has been a conscious effort in this phase of the project to focus on boys as well in line with the recommendation of the final evaluation of Phase I. The project was extended to boys and the issue was also taken up in discussions on the NPA which is now renamed to cover all human trafficking. The project has strived to maintain a balance in its work with schools, and is moving towards equal distribution in its Life Skills work in schools (direct beneficiaries comprise 40,440 girls and 36,863 boys). The MTR uncovered some unintended consequences resulting from efforts to achieve a greater gender balance in schools. It found higher drop-out rates among boys; as girls out-performed them in class, boys felt the need to compensate by entering the work force more early. It found local cultural and environmental factors to have differential effects e.g. boys were reported to be less confident than girls in Hunan while the reverse was true in Guizhou. The MTR highlighted the importance of taking a contextualised approach to gender equality in project implementation.
101. The Women's Homes by definition attract women although they do occasionally assist some men. Beneficiaries often raised the question of assistance to men saying they are also vulnerable to the same abuses and were cheated in the same way. The work with Women's Homes inevitably takes the overall balance in numbers in favour of females but this seems justified on the basis that women are more at risk to certain forms of exploitation, plus the project needs a focus and a target group as otherwise it would end up covering all migrants. Efforts could continue to ensure a proportionate participation of boys and girls in schools and vocational schools but work with Women's Homes will always sway the numbers in favour of females. Another aspect raised by one interviewee was the need to give gender-awareness training to members of the provincial steering committee as there seemed to be little understanding of the links between gender and the risks of trafficking and labour exploitation.

2.2.1.5. Targeting

102. The targeted age groups are under 16 year olds and 16-24. The evaluation finds that the Women's Homes tend to attract older women - in one site in Anhui, the women were the older end of the targeted age group in their mid 20s; and in another site in Yunnan, the project was also providing services to middle aged women with young children. The MTR also found middle aged women to be the main beneficiaries in Guizhou and Fujian and put this down to changing demographics. However, it may be that Women's Homes inevitably attract older women because of their character and location e.g. one Women's Home visited was in a residential area rather than an industrial zone where young workers might be found. The same

pattern involving the attendance of older participants was found in the employer cooperation initiative in Jiangsu according to the MTR.

103. The Women's Homes provide important services to migrants but it is a concern that they may be missing young women at the most vulnerable time in their lives. For instance, focus group participants shared experiences of when they had first left home and migrated and ended up in situations where they were not paid, had their identity documents held, were cheated out of money applying for fake jobs etc, but these were all experiences they had long before coming to the Women's Home. This suggests a need to reach out more to young migrants at the most vulnerable time of their lives. In terms of the Life Skills in schools pilots, these seemed well targeted to the most vulnerable groups such as migrant children, left behind children, rural areas etc.

2.2.2. Strategy

2.2.2.1. Multi-level

104. The project was designed to operate at all levels. The project is indeed working in a multi-level way though points of intersection vary from place to place.
- There seems to be a gap in working with national level ministries. The project has found it challenging to engage with national stakeholders and was unable to set up a national steering committee. In any case as the emphasis of the project was at a grassroots level, with a bottom-up approach, more efforts were invested at lower levels. In addition, the donor CIDA asked for policy impact at local and provincial levels rather than a focus on the national level.
 - The policy chain of command from top to bottom is not always maintained as the project intersects at different levels in different places. There may be good reasons for this in terms of site selection but it can mean a break in consistency from national through provincial down to city/district levels and so on. For example, in Fujian, the project has set up a project steering committee in Licheng district but not in the administrative city under which it comes i.e. Quanzhou city (due to lack of funds). A more coordinated approach which maintains a linear policy connection may help raise the profile of the project and aid dissemination.
105. The project design emphasised a grassroots bottom up approach with the idea that good practices would “trickle up” and influence policy that way instead of the usual top down initiatives. As a large country, with a vast population, bottom up is not enough, it is necessary to operate at all levels to some extent including top-down and in between. Clearly it would be expensive to work at all levels all the time, and it is also not feasible; for example, officials may not want a purely rubber-stamping role. It is not necessary to work at the same intensity at all levels, but it seems important to engage at all levels in some way, at least to network, and share information about initiatives, in order to facilitate scaling up. As a pilot project aimed at demonstration and replication rather than service delivery, it has to come to the attention of those beyond its immediate stakeholders. One local official explained that replication of good policy initiatives in China can happen in three ways: through proposals to the people's congress at provincial, city or municipal level; through work reports to higher authorities; or due to the profile of being involved in an international project.

2.2.2.2. Multi-sectoral

106. Multi-sectoral cooperation is also not a composite picture and the departments with which the project works vary from place to place. Connections are a bit haphazard depending on local needs and the interest of different stakeholders. The ACWF as a project partner shows strong engagement everywhere including by WF departments and branches which are not funded by

the project. The involvement of the education department is variable despite the fact that education pilots were carried out in all provinces. Anhui is the strongest. The project reports strong cooperation with the Hunan provincial education department also. The involvement of other departments, like labour, police etc. vary from place to place. The lack of consistent engagement with the labour department for an ILO project is a particular issue given that this is normally the principal counterpart for the organisation. This has partly been due to lack of time; reservations on the side of labour ministry at national level and labour departments at some provincial levels; and the difficulty of finding common ground in prevention activities. Work with employers' and workers' groups has also been limited due to lack of time and the availability of suitable partners.

107. A positive aspect is that stakeholders in different provinces say that the project approach has facilitated cooperation and helped integrate resources and approaches between different government departments e.g. police in Licheng district/Fujian said it was easier to get support from other departments through the project. Officials in Yunnan also said the project had facilitated inter-departmental cooperation.

2.2.2.3. *Information and communication*

108. The project was disadvantaged by not having a clear information strategy either for internal or external communications. It was a struggle to enable participants to exchange between themselves, whether between different provinces, or between different pilots. There were also communication issues between headquarters and the provinces e.g. messages from Beijing did not always pass down the chain. There were some exchanges held of pilots and occasional cross-provincial exchange e.g. Women's Home forum involving managers, local government, social work department and academics or the Funan county/Anhui exchange meeting for teachers involved in Life Skills pilots. But on the whole such mechanisms were limited; the MTR noted the need for much improvement in the area of inter-provincial exchange as only one example could be found and that involved exchanges between Jiangsu and Yunnan on the Women's Homes manual.
109. External stakeholders felt they lacked information and written information was not handled well. Newsletters were issued by provinces but in cumbersome printed formats e.g. each provincial project office issued hard copy reports every quarter. More centralised information management would have helped the situation e.g. central newsletter produced in a flexible format like word or PDF which could be emailed or printed as necessary and circulated in English and Chinese to stakeholders at different levels. There were complaints about the project website especially from teachers who said they could not find project materials for replication, they also called for more e-learning materials. The project updated its website in 2011 and it is not clear when these complaints relate to. The PPC in Fujian appears to have had some success in using new technologies e.g. a QQ chatroom was set up to help teachers exchange experiences; and its micro-blogging site, (Min Jiejie or sisters in Fujian) is reported to have received 2 million hits. Hunan also used the QQ platform according to the MTR to share information among grassroots, county and provincial stakeholders.

2.2.2.4. *Advocacy*

110. Another point which reinforces the need for a more strategic approach to influencing policy is suggested by the project's outcomes in relation to its key interventions. As noted in the section on 'sustainability' the prospects for continuation of the project approach differs between Life Skills in schools and Women's Homes, the latter has a stronger prognosis than the former. An examination of the difference in these two experiences indicates that the project would have benefitted from a stronger advocacy and dissemination strategy.

111. Overall the continuation of the project's Life Skills approach in schools is loose; it is mainly down to individual teachers and aside from the province of Anhui, does not appear to have a systematic take-up at policy level. The project suggests that this may be due to lack of time as Life Skills in schools was only started in CP-TING Phase II in certain provinces. However, this alone is not a convincing explanation, since there was instant take-up by Anhui province in CP-TING Phase I.
112. Rather, the main obstacle seems to be how the Life Skills course can integrate into daily teaching. The province of Anhui due to its prior commitment to the issue, and with funding support from the project, was able to make adaptations and incorporate the work into its regular teaching activity but others, who are less interested in the issue or lack funds, may not take these additional steps to incorporate Life Skills training into the curriculum.
113. Sustainability might have been better solidified by having a clearer integration strategy at the outset e.g.
- Understanding national policy in more detail to start with in order to see where Life Skills might best fit. 'Safety education' emerges as a key candidate. It appears to be a longstanding national policy e.g. National Safety Education day has been celebrated since 1996 followed by a National State Council Executive Order in 2007 but implementation can be uneven between provinces. In all provinces visited by the evaluation, the subject benefits from set teaching hours and a budget, and is therefore a useful platform for Life Skills work. It is often assumed that safety education is only about earthquakes and accidents but in practice it covers diverse subjects e.g. drug use, helping the elderly and disabled, being a good citizen, visits to detention centres etc. Education officials met by the evaluation team themselves identified the link between the project's Life Skills course and safety education but project staff appeared less aware of the importance of this connection. There may well be other entry points, for instance, in Hunan, the education department is said to find the course more relevant to their drop-out prevention programmes in rural schools. The main issue is whether the project could have identified entry points better in advance and tailored the materials to the curriculum and national directives in the first place. The project has attempted to lobby the Ministry of Education at national level e.g. it made a strong recommendation along with UNICEF and UNESCO on the inclusion of Life Skills into the national 10 year plan for education reform and development. The project says it has been difficult to interest the national ministry and believes it is reluctant to issue directives to provincial governments. Contacts between the project and national ministries happen through ACWF. The issue of Life Skills was raised by ACWF with the Ministry of Education while attending a COMMIT meeting in Bangkok and followed up afterwards although it was stated that cooperation in Beijing between the two institutions prior to that encounter was limited. The process at national and provincial levels might have been facilitated by using the language of the national curriculum.
 - Once entry points were identified, the materials could have been designed to better fit that curricula or to look like additional modules in order to encourage their use e.g. calling them something more similar such as 'personal safety and Life Skills' and also emphasising aspects which are relevant to as many contexts as possible, for instance, Life Skills training was carried out in receiving areas among at-risk groups – education authorities may not have seen 'trafficking' as a general concern although 'labour rights/exploitation' clearly is;
 - Training could have been done within the existing safety education framework so that teachers would have continued to teach actual sessions they'd learnt rather than leaving them to devise ways of integrating the methodology into other classes;

- Making materials more easily modifiable and replicable by education departments and teachers through the use of Word/PDF formats instead of traditional printing;
 - The project has already linked with other international agencies, for instance, a recommendation was made for the education reform plan on integrating Life Skills. A closer collaboration between interested agencies (e.g. this might have entailed additional modules such as child abuse) and an advocacy strategy on Life Skills promotion at national and provincial level may also have helped.
114. In conclusion, a more strategic approach, using safety education as a vehicle, would likely have made it easier to market the product to government departments and to facilitate expansion. As it is, too much is left to the recipients to do. There is a considerable advantage to be had in trying to better link to existing national policy in terms of budget, time allocation and modalities for inspection and enforcement. **Lessons learned:** There is a very important lesson learned here in terms of thinking ahead to how pilots can best fit into policy in order to facilitate replication and expansion.
115. By contrast the outlook for the project's methodology for Women's Homes is more positive. Sustainability is better assured for the project approach to Women's Homes. There are various reasons for this:
- ACWF is a partner of the project and directly responsible for and in control of follow-up. Nevertheless the enthusiasm for the project approach goes beyond the ACWF unit involved in the project which is a very positive indication for sustainability;
 - There are no overlaps with existing policies so no work is required to integrate the project approach, China's development of its social services model is still an open book;
 - The project approach has proved especially relevant to receiving areas, where local authorities appear to be on the look-out for ideas and solutions for dealing with the influx of migrants. In this sense, the project has filled a 'gap in the market'.
116. The key challenge for replication and sustainability is dissemination of the project approach to Women's Homes is letting other areas who need this information know about it. At least in receiving areas, there must be other districts which have the funds available to implement the project approach but need the know-how and technical advice.

2.2.2.5. *Political support*

117. This varies from place to place. The evaluation team directly observed strong support from the Women's Federation at all levels. This is confirmed by the project's own monitoring data which shows statements in support of the project approach by the ACWF in 4 provinces. Having this support is a bonus for the project as top ACWF officials are also part of key decision-making structures e.g. WF president in Fujian is also the deputy director of the Fujian People's Congress and in charge of policy advocacy on women and children. Local government officials in Fujian (Licheng) and Anhui (including Sanlijie and also Funan county) also reported good political support for specific initiatives. The evaluation team cannot gauge the full extent of political support but notes that it does vary considerably and staff themselves acknowledge the difficulty of engaging a wide spectrum of players. What seems evident is that political support depends on how interested or impressed decision-makers are with the work of the project rather than political support for the sake of it.

2.2.3. *Management*

2.2.3.1. *Efficiency*

118. The project has been managed very well and with efficiency, in the sense that it delivered what was expected of it on time and with quality. It has a good reputation within ILO for this; plus

the project's own detailed monitoring shows it to be on track and to have achieved its targets. Relations between ILO/IPEC Beijing and other parts of the organisation, headquarters and regional office Bangkok work well; the project feels well-supported when it needs advice or guidance from other parts of the organisation; other parts of the organisation are kept informed and consulted if needed.

119. It has also proved cost-efficient; a simple equation shows that the cost per direct beneficiary worked out to CAD 26/per individual (i.e. project budget CAD 4 million/146,171 direct beneficiaries and around 2000 indirect beneficiaries at least receiving tangible services), this is very good value for money given the in-depth support and teaching received by children and women through the Life Skills work and Women's Homes. This is not even counting the indirect beneficiaries (teachers, staff, volunteers, government officials) who received training or the indirect recipients of awareness-raising campaigns.

2.2.3.2. *Human resources*

120. The fact that the project was completed successfully is not to be taken for granted. It faced the challenge of being short of one professional staff member for most of the implementation period – two Chief Technical Advisers came and went, recruitment procedures were protracted and eventually abandoned. There were also staff turnover issues in some provincial offices which impeded implementation.
121. Being short-staffed is generally not thought to have made a difference, as the project continued to be implemented on course. However, there was a hidden cost; the increased burden on staff left little time for less tangible activities – there was no time and space left for keeping a strategic overview, thinking about how to ensure the demonstration projects could be disseminated for wider influence; networking at the national level and with other levels of government; making contacts with the wider UN Country Team and other international agencies despite good interaction with UNIAP; and planning for the future.

2.2.3.3. *Management tools*

122. The overall project design is coherent and logical with work at different levels (policy, capacity building and beneficiary self-protection) working towards the ultimate goal of preventing trafficking for labour exploitation. The project has an impressive range of monitoring tools, which thoroughly track activities and outputs, as well as feedback, quality control, individual progress etc.
123. A more detailed examination of the monitoring plan suggests there may be room for improvements in defining indicators, and in data management and analysis. The project appears to have collected an enormous and possibly overwhelming amount of data and appears not always able to analyse and present this in a way that shows the progress being made in its technical progress reports or mid-term review. For instance, these reports show the numbers of people trained but they do not reveal that the project in fact carried out extensive pre and post training questionnaires to examine changes in knowledge and skills or consolidate findings from these questionnaires. It would be a useful exercise for the project to reflect on its monitoring plan in order to arrive at lessons learned before project end; the issue is not what the project actually did but how well it planned for and predicted what it could do; and whether the monitoring framework was easy to use and effective in capturing the project's results. As discussed in the section on 'Effectiveness', the wording of indicators is sometimes imprecise and ambiguous; data produced to show results does not match the indicator or target; initial targets were sometimes unrealistic in terms of being too low or too high; indicators may have been too many or not the right ones - the project collected very precise data on beneficiary numbers and outputs but struggled to compile data on outcomes. It may want to consider whether it was possible to develop indicators for outcomes. The evaluation did not find much in

the project monitoring data in terms of verified and consolidated qualitative information useful for the final report.

124. While it is possible to see outcomes for all three project objectives i.e. changes at policy level, capacities and beneficiary self-protection, the system does not track whether the project managed to actually 'prevent trafficking for labour exploitation', the intermediate objective of the project. This is impossible to know with any certainty since it involves proving a future event; nonetheless similar prevention programmes have sought to harness such impacts by collating anecdotal accounts of prevention of labour exploitation at least e.g. people saying they took a different and less risky course of action as a result of the project or through a system of tracer studies to track impacts on beneficiaries after they have left the project.
125. These results-based management techniques were implemented at all levels. There were some complaints from project partners about ILO procedures e.g. lack of flexibility and difficulty; cumbersome monitoring; payments coming too late for activities; the difficulty of writing proposals for action programmes etc. The project sought to simplify the procedures as much as possible whilst adhering to ILO's international standards. The project may consider ways of adapting e.g. realistic timeframes based on how long it takes to send out funds. On the other hand, a number of partners recognised the benefits of the project, the opportunity to learn from an international project and to improve their own management e.g. for instance, some WF offices reported applying these methods to other projects.

2.2.3.4. *Internal mid-term review follow-up*

126. The project carried out a full assessment of the project through an internal mid-term review. This was very comprehensive but the timing of it was delayed due to staff constraints at IPEC Geneva leaving little time for adjustments prior to project end. The mid-term review made limited findings on qualitative outcomes; it focused more on describing activities and processes. It did not consider attribution, some activities jointly carried out with other organisations are not described as such; nor does it adequately refer to the evidence on which its findings are based. The short time lapse (9 months only) between the two mid-term review and final evaluation did not allow time for significant changes on the ground in between. Nonetheless, the project has attempted to address certain recommendations of the MTR, namely:
 - Recommendation that CP-TING project should continue or expand field research and analysis pertinent to trafficking for labour exploitation. Project response - A specific case study on labour trafficking victims was launched after the mid-term review; Following Student Worker Research in Jiangsu, CP-TING carried out another literature review on student workers in order to map out the general situation of student workers in China as a whole.
 - Recommendation that CP-TING project should ensure that more time and attention is devoted to improving the quality of provincial level trainers, particularly in financial and management training. Project response - A standardized training package on project management has been compiled, which included presentations, information kits and other materials regarded as good by partners.

2.2.3.5. *Funding*

127. Funding is a major challenge facing development projects in China. The donor CIDA, along with other bilateral donors, are pulling out on the basis that China is now sufficiently economically developed to manage by itself. However, there continues to be a need for technical support, as shown by the alacrity with which some of the project's pilots have been seized by local government. The time constraints facing the project mean that future prospects and sustainability issues have not received much attention as yet.

3. Conclusions and recommendations

3.1. Conclusion

128. The project has been a success; it has met its objectives and far exceeded its targets for beneficiary services. Its methodologies have proved highly effective in improving the ability of beneficiaries to protect themselves and in building the capacity of practitioners. There have also been important contributions to policy. Building on the success of CP-TING I, the project has continued to help ensure that preventive approaches to trafficking for labour exploitation have a place in national policy.
129. Its pilot approach to strengthening the capacity of Women's Homes in providing services for migrant women has had a warm reception from Women's Federation branches around the country, local government, and NGO partners and shows good promise for future sustainability and replication. The pilot project on Life Skills education in schools has also been taken up by one province, Anhui, and integrated into the school curriculum. Elsewhere, prospects for the continuation of the project's Life Skills work are less certain. Key good practices include the way the project has worked with civil society (Happy Families Children Club/Anhui and Xiamen centre/Yunnan) and the private sector (Clivia beauty school/Fujian) to deliver Women's Homes' services to migrant women (see Box 1).

3.2. Lessons learned

130. While the project's impacts are impressive; it perhaps had the potential for even wider policy effects. It piloted a number of good practices which are very relevant to China's stage of development; government authorities have shown themselves to be receptive, on the look-out for good ideas and willing to fund and continue worthwhile practices. A more strategic approach to the promotion and dissemination of pilots would have been beneficial. For instance, a consideration of how best to integrate the Life Skills work into the existing national education curriculum might have helped facilitate take-up. As far as Women's Homes are concerned, the project methodology is ready for use; the challenge is getting this information out to those who need it. Pilot projects require both testing as well as showcasing for successful replication. The Life Skills programme needs refinement but the project approach to Women's Homes and other practices is well developed and in need of promotion. Key lessons learned are the need for strategies to refine pilots, to integrate them into policy, and to disseminate good practices that work.
131. The fact that this did not happen so effectively can perhaps partly be explained by staff shortages. The project was one professional staff member down for two-thirds of the project period – it is not immediately obvious that this had negative effects as the project was managed efficiently and continued to deliver but a hidden cost was the lack of time and space available for the type of strategic guidance and promotion which might have helped the project realise its optimum potential.

3.3. Potential good practices

132. Key good practices include:
- The way the project has worked with civil society (Happy Families Children Club/Anhui and Heart to Heart Community Care centre/Yunnan). In both places, the project has worked with local NGOs to build capacity on their understanding and ability to deal with labour exploitation and trafficking issues; it has helped them expand to new issues and target groups; and empowered them to increase their own capacity through the development of technical tools. Aside from the quality of the work carried out by local partners; the impact on beneficiaries; and the positive nurturing relationship between CP-

TING and these local stakeholders, there are other ways in which this represents a good practice. This approach highlights the role of civil society in a country where NGO activity is very restricted. It is also an excellent model of sustainability; CP-TING has piloted the work and local government is stepping in with financial support in places to ensure this approach can be continued and replicated in other sites.

- A parallel example from the private sector is the project's work with the Clivia beauty school/Fujian, a private college which delivers the Women's Homes' Life Skills training to its students. Again, what makes this a good practice is reaching out to non-traditional partners by matching what the project has to offer with the needs of the college - especially as its students are likely to be entering parts of the job market which are high risk for labour exploitation and trafficking. The quality, enthusiasm and commitment of the teaching were much in evidence; as was the impact on beneficiaries in terms of greater knowledge, skills and tangible changes in behaviour. An unintended but welcome consequence of the project intervention was that the provision of Life Skills training had enhanced the college's reputation as it was seen as showing more care for its students and giving added value compared to similar teaching establishments. This in turn led to increased profits both for the institution and for individual teachers – showing that corporate social responsibility can pay, literally. The school commits to continuing the Life Skills course in years to come at its own cost as it can readily see the benefits for itself and its students.

3.4. Recommendations

133. As an end of project evaluation, the recommendations are divided into short-term recommendations for implementation before the project ends in June 2013, and longer term recommendations relevant to any continuation of project initiatives or for any potential future project. No doubt the project could continue useful work in another phase, but given the uncertainty of the funding climate, the long-term recommendations are intended as learning from CP-TING to be taken forward by any actors who continue this work in whatever shape or form. The recommendations below are from the evaluation team and linked directly to the findings of the report. Box 1 lists recommendations made by key project stakeholders at the final national evaluation workshop; these recommendations were made by people who know the project very well and should be reviewed in any future action.

3.4.1. Short-term recommendations

134. The project should implement the following recommendations before the end of the project in June 2013:
 1. Develop sustainability plans with project partners specifying what is to continue, when and how.
 2. Ensure the proper handover and continuation of the project website to ILO or ACWF.
 3. Ensure project products, tools, manuals etc. are available on the website in a downloadable and adaptable format if possible, including offshoots, for example, Anhui provinces adaptation of the Life Skills module to the school curriculum.
 4. Revise the draft 'Good practices and lessons learned' document to take account of learning from the final evaluation.
 5. Review the project monitoring framework and document lessons learnt on whether the indicators developed by the project were appropriate; the experience of data collection, management and analysis and whether this could have been improved in any way; and how the data could have been better consolidated and presented so as to give a more accessible picture of progress being made by the project.

6. Review the draft Decent Work Country Programme and ensure it adequately captures the terminology and focus of the project.

3.4.2. Long-term recommendations

135. These technical recommendations are intended for any organisation involved in the follow-up, continuation or replication of project initiatives:

Promotion, replication and scaling up

7. Promote the project approach for improving migrant services through Women's Homes to local authorities in migrant receiving areas.
8. Engage implementing partners who are recognised as having carried out good practices either by this report or other studies (e.g. Anhui education department, Happy Family Children's Club NGO, Heart to Heart Community Care NGO, Clivia Beauty School etc.) as advisors for replication and scaling up pilots elsewhere.
9. Increase dissemination of Life Skills in vocational schools as a key approach given the suitability of the content to the age group of older adolescents, as well as the fact that such schools come under the remit of departments of labour.
10. Extend Life Skills education to parents and community members with an emphasis on passing this on to younger people.
11. Disseminate Life Skills modules and training to social workers and social work institutes.

Outreach and dissemination of information

12. Improve the use of new media and technologies (e-learning, internet, chat rooms, CDs, audio and video etc.) for disseminating information to stakeholders, beneficiaries and staff.
13. Engage target groups (especially children and young people) when designing information strategies to better understand their interests and preferences.

Measuring impact

14. Find ways of measuring the impacts of prevention activities, for instance tracer studies, or tracking of beneficiaries.

Reaching target groups

15. Reach younger migrants at the most vulnerable time of their lives through Life Skills in vocational schools, mobile Women's Homes, outreach by older users of Women's Homes, summer clubs, youth organisations.
16. Continue to strive towards achieving as optimum and proportionate a gender balance as possible among beneficiaries under the age of 18 to ensure that both vulnerable boys and girls are reached.

Research

17. Continue expanding the knowledge base through targeted research projects.
136. ILO should take account of the following recommendations in the design of any potential future projects on related areas:
 18. Consider reframing the project in a broader way in order to better capture the substance of the work that needs to be done in relation to the labour rights of young migrants; this would do better justice to the range of prevention and integration activities that the

project has actually carrying out and safeguard future projects from being undermined by a lack of data on selective target groups.

19. Ensure the geographical and thematic scope of the project is realistic and doable.
20. Keep an emphasis on innovation, piloting, technical advice and capacity building in keeping with China's stage of development, rather than re-doing and re-visiting old approaches which have not been taken up despite best efforts.
21. Place more emphasis on ILO's traditional counterparts – labour departments, workers and employer's groups.
22. Ensure an advocacy and dissemination strategy for pilot projects is prepared in a timely way, taking into account, for example: where and how a pilot might best be integrated with existing policy; ensure pilots are strategically placed in order to take maximum advantage of policy-making and political structures; how training for pilots can fit into existing systems; the use of flexible printing formats like Word/PDF for easy adaptation and replication; collaboration with other international and local players interested in the same objective.
23. Develop an information and communications strategy to enable effective sharing of information internally and externally.
24. Place greater attention to the development of the results framework at the planning stage to ensure the inclusion of realistic targets, outcome indicators, precise outputs, coherence between outputs and outcomes, as well as appropriate data collection, management and presentation methodologies.

Box 2 – Recommendations by key stakeholders at final evaluation workshop

Short-term recommendations

- Either ILO or ACWF to take over the website so that resources could still be used by people interested (The CP-TING website will be accessible after project ends (find no-cost way))(ILO to take over CP-TING website)
- Develop a plan to properly disseminate good practices at the final stage
- Study on the behaviour change/beneficiary cards of the beneficiaries
- Communication with government, UN/INGO, LINGO
- Document good practices of involving labour authorities

Long-term recommendations

- Expand the scope and depth of cooperation with employers' initiative
- Continue Women's Homes/Life Skills practices in more areas
- Continue to build knowledge base in areas of student workers, forced labour etc. in China
- Protection of the labour rights of the vulnerable groups falls under the core areas of ILO – promoting ILO labour standards, so ILO should continue in this area
- Harness peer networks to identify most vulnerable communities
- Use of social media for horizontal inter-provincial cross-provincial exchange and discussion i.e. QQ
- Sustain employer cooperation projects
- Expand Life Skills education in vocational schools
- Distribute e-resources amongst Life Skills and Women's Homes pilots
- Women's Home – Full-time social worker recruited and funded by county/provincial government for professional support
- Continued advocacy for Life Skills training to education departments
- Networking and holiday activities among young women for safe migration and decent work through awareness-raising and self-protection skills
- Support more capacity building such as training on international labour standards, labour inspection, child labour etc.
- Replication of Women's Homes (CP-TING) by ILO and ACWF
- Integrate CP-TING into GM programme of ILO 3+1
- Experience sharing by the pilot project like Hunan, Anhui
- Material sharing from CP-TING
- Promote cooperation between education and labour in Life Skills training
- Strengthen labour inspections on child labourers and minor workers
- Improve information sharing and marketing through professionals
- More rights projects in ILO in China
- More localisation and adaptation of ILO technical tools for Chinese context
- More holistic and integrated ILO technical cooperation projects
- More labour situation analysis of China by ILO
- Focus on employers
- Focus on priorities of government partners
- Focus on labour authorities

Annex 1: Terms of Reference



International Labour Organisation- International Programme on the Elimination of Child Labour ILO/IPEC

Terms of Reference For Independent Final Evaluation

Final
15 March 2013

Labour Rights: Preventing Trafficking for Labour Exploitation in China (CP-TING)

ILO project code	CPR/09/01P/CAN
ILO project number	P270.13.318.010
ILO iris code	102013
Financing agency	Canadian International Development Agency (CIDA)
Geographic coverage	China (8 project provinces: Anhui, Fujian, Guangdong, Guizhou, Hunan, Jiangsu, Sichuan, and Yunnan)
Type of evaluation	Independent Final Evaluation
Duration	42 months
Project starting date	01 January 2010
Project ending date	31 June 2013
Executing agency	ILO/IPEC
Project language	English
Date of evaluation	March 2013
Total Donor Project Funds	Canadian dollars 4,000,000

List of Abbreviations

ACWF	All China Women's Federation
AP	Action Programme
C182	ILO's Worst Forms of Child Labour Convention, No. 182 of 1999
CL	Child Labour
CP-TING	Labour Rights: Preventing Trafficking for Labour Exploitation in China project
DBMR	Direct Beneficiaries Monitoring and Reporting
DWCP	Decent Work Country Programme
EIA	Evaluation and Impact Assessment section of ILO/IPEC
FGD	Focus group discussion
HQ	Headquarters
IA	Implementing Agency
ILO	International Labour Organisation
IO	Immediate Objective
IPEC	International Programme on the Elimination of Child Labour
NPA	National Plan of Action
NC	National consultant
NGO	Non-governmental Organisation
PRSP	Poverty Reduction Strategy Paper
SIMPOC	Statistical Information and Monitoring Programme on Child Labour
TBP	Time Bound Programme
TL	Team leader
UN	United Nations
UNDAF	United Nations Development Assistance Framework
UNICEF	United Nations Children's Fund
WFCL	Worst Forms of Child Labour

I. Background and Justification

1. The aim of the International Programme on the Elimination of Child labour (IPEC) is the progressive elimination of child labour, especially its worst forms. The political will and commitment of individual governments to address child labour - in cooperation with employers' and workers' organisations, non-governmental organisations and other relevant parties in society - is the basis for IPEC action. IPEC support at the country level is based on a phased, multi-sector strategy. This strategy includes strengthening national capacities to deal with this issue, legislation harmonization, improvement of the knowledge base, raising awareness on the negative consequences of child labour, promoting social mobilization against it, and implementing demonstrative direct action programmes (AP) to prevent children from child labour and remove child workers from hazardous work and provide them and their families with appropriate alternatives.
2. The operational strategy of IPEC has over the years focused on providing support to national and local constituents and partners through their projects and activities. Such support has to the extent possible been provided in the context of national frameworks, institutions and processes that have facilitated the building of capacities and mobilisation for further action. It has emphasized various degrees of a comprehensive approach, providing linkages between action and partners in sectors and areas of work relevant for child labour. Whenever possible specific national framework or programmes have provided such focus.
3. IPEC has promoted the development and implementation of National Plans of Action (NPAs) as such national frameworks. A NPA is a strategic framework of integrated and coordinated policies and initiatives at different levels to achieve certain objectives usually related to the elimination of the Worst Forms of Child Labour (WFCL) in the country including child trafficking. (In China the NPA addresses trafficking in women and children and not child labour.) NPAs are nationally owned initiatives that emphasize the need to address the root causes, linking action against child labour and trafficking to the national development effort, with particular emphasis on the economic and social policies to combat poverty and to promote universal basic education. The International Labour Organization (ILO), with the support of many development organizations has elaborated this concept based on previous national and international experience. It has also established innovative technical cooperation modalities to support countries that have ratified the ILO's Worst Forms of Child Labour Convention, No. 182 of 1999 (C182) to implement comprehensive measures against WFCL.
4. The most critical element of a NPA is that it is implemented and led by the country itself. The countries commit to the development of a plan to eradicate or significantly diminish the worst forms of child labour in a defined period. This implies a commitment to mobilize and allocate national human and financial resources to combat the problem. IPEC has over the years implemented a number of country specific projects of support of multi-year duration and focusing both on policy and institutional support through the enabling environment and on direct support to communities, families and children through targeted interventions.
5. The experience with NPAs has suggested a range of approaches to establish and implement national frameworks to provide the comprehensive approach, the linkages and the mechanisms for developing the knowledge, mobilising the actors, institutions and resources; and to plan effective coherent national action as part of the broader national development. The experience also showed that the degree of support needed to get this process going in different countries can vary and that specific strategic initiatives can be identified as often key to the process, focusing on influencing important policies and processes.

6. From the perspective of the International Labour Organisation (ILO), the elimination of child labour is part of its work on standards and fundamental principles and rights at work. The fulfilment of these standards should guarantee decent work for all adults. In this sense, the ILO provides technical assistance to its three constituents: government, workers and employers. This tripartite structure is the key characteristic of ILO cooperation and it is within this framework that the activities developed by the Programme should be analysed.
7. ILO Decent Work Country Programmes (DWCPs) have subsequently been developed and are being introduced in the ILO to provide a mechanism to outline agreed upon priorities between the ILO and the national constituent partners within a broader UN and International development context. For further information please see :
<http://ilo.org/decentwork>
8. The DWCP defines a corporate focus on priorities, operational strategies, as well as a resource and implementation plan that complements and supports partner plans for national decent work priorities. As such, DWCPs are broader frameworks to which the individual ILO project is linked and contributes to. DWCPs are beginning to be gradually introduced into various countries' planning and implementing frameworks. The most recent DWCP for China (2006 – 2010) can be found at:
<http://www.ilo.org/public/english/bureau/program/dwcp/download/china.pdf>
 A new DWCP for 2013 – 2015 is currently under preparation.

Programme Background

9. The ILO estimates there are 2.45 million cases of trafficking into forced labour and exploitation worldwide, with more than half occurring in the Asia-Pacific region. Human trafficking is not a new phenomenon, but since the early 1990's a number of factors have conspired to increase it world-wide. In China, most trafficking occurs within the context of mass rural-to-urban internal migration in search of employment. Poverty is the root cause, but not the only factor. Additional factors include gender preference for boys, strains on education and decent work opportunities, young people leaving home at a young age (even dropping out of school), and the opportunity for unscrupulous employers to exploit their vulnerability. The Project to Prevent Trafficking in Girls and Young Women for Labour Exploitation, CP-TING, (2004-2008), found that there are substantial risks involved in this 'blind migration.' The project implemented and documented several good practice models on both the supply and demand side, and established effective process-based approaches for partner action and mainstreaming. It also provided technical inputs in aid of establishing China's National Plan of Action in Combating Trafficking in Women and Children (December 2007).
10. The current project to be evaluated follows on from the first CP-TING project, incorporating recommendations from the evaluation of the earlier project. It addresses the needs of China's young migrant population in the economic downturn, and expands good project models to cover more of China's high migration regions. It supports the implementation of provincial level Plans of Action in trafficking prevention. Provinces include: Yunnan, Anhui, Hunan, Guizhou, Sichuan, Fujian, and Jiangsu.
11. The project to Prevent Trafficking for Labour Exploitation in China (CP TING) began in January 2010 and is scheduled to continue to June 2013. The goal is to reduce trafficking for labour exploitation, particularly among children and young women. To achieve this goal, the project assists in improving the legal policy framework, builds institutional capacity and raises public awareness of the issues, risks and mitigation strategies to prevent trafficking for labour exploitation. The project is being implemented by the International Labour Organization (ILO) in close collaboration with the All-China Women's Federation (ACWF) and financial support from the Canadian International Development Agency (CIDA).

12. The CP TING project supports the Government of China's efforts to implement international conventions such as: ILO Minimum Age Convention, 1973 (No. 138); Worst forms of Child Labour Convention, 1999 (No. 182); the UN Convention on the Rights of the Child and the Convention against Transnational Organized Crime (Palermo protocol). These international standards have been endorsed by the Government of China and their implementation is supported by the Constitution of the PRC and laws including the Law on the Protection of the Rights and Interests of Women, the Law on the Protection of Minors, Criminal Law and the Labour Law of the People's Republic of China. The Project promotes and supports China's National Plan of Action on Combating Trafficking in Women and Children (2008 – 2012).
13. Girls and young women most at-risk of being trafficked have a low level of education and few skills, limited awareness of their rights, lack self-protection skills and have limited access to support services. Based on the conviction that the most effective long-term solution to eradicate human trafficking is to prevent girls and young women from becoming victimized in the first place, CP TING supports school and community-based initiatives to raise awareness and to provide services. The 8 provinces included in the CP TING project are among the highest migrant-receiving and migrant-sending provinces in China.
14. The ultimate project goal of the project is consistent with Canada's interest in supporting China to improve human rights, rule of law, labour rights and the rights of ethnic minorities. The Project was designed in a manner consistent with CIDA's China program priorities and approach to labour law by engaging ILO's tripartite constituents as well as women's organisations in implementing the project.

The Ultimate outcome of the project is: *Enhanced protection of labour rights in China, consistent with international rights and standards*. The Intermediate outcome is: *Reduced trafficking for labour exploitation in China*.

15. The immediate outcomes of the project are:
 1. *Improved policy framework to prevent trafficking for labour exploitation*
 2. *Improved implementation of trafficking prevention measures in pilot provinces*
 3. *Increased ability of women and children to protect their rights and migrate safely*
16. Direct recipients of project services are agencies, social partners, and community leaders, that are enabled to carry out advocacy and development activities. The ultimate beneficiaries are women (19-24) and children (boys and girls under 18) at risk of being trafficked. Those at high risk include: young migrants (including migrant children), drop-outs, poor rural youth, ethnic minorities, and left-behind children. At the end of the project 75,000 direct beneficiaries will be prevented from being trafficked (that is, a target group member receives a project service, and is tracked as a beneficiary).
17. Provincial programs will be aimed at the delivery of services to beneficiaries. These models will be implemented in the migrant-sending provinces of Anhui, Guizhou, and Sichuan, the migrant-receiving provinces of Fujian and Jiangsu, and the migrant sending and receiving provinces of Yunnan and Fujian. Models include:
 - Life Skills Training: rights-based training for students to help them prepare for work and/or migration.
 - "Hand-in-Hand" Outreach (and other peer-led services): peer support services delivered by peers (e.g. regular visits by classmates to students who have dropped out to share life-skills information).
 - Employment Services: information on safe migration, labour rights, and referral of reputable placement agencies, support agencies, hotlines, and good employers through labour bureaus.

- Transit Worker Training: training of transit workers, and those who work in various transportation industries, to mainstream trafficking prevention into their regular work.
 - Migrant Women's Homes Services and Network: services to migrant women, such as information on jobs, training for skills development, and creation of a peer support network.
 - Employers' and Enterprise Initiatives: promotion of good employment practices, through such activities as the implementation of a code of conduct to combat trafficking and the development of vocational training.
18. The project will support the implementation of provincial anti-trafficking action plans in six provinces. While the plans have been promulgated, there is not yet consensus by responsible organizations on how to implement them, how to coordinate effectively, or how to manage inter-provincial arrangements.
19. At the national level, the project will provide specific technical assistance to facilitate ratification and implementation of international instruments, effectively promoting a comprehensive anti-trafficking framework. The project will provide technical inputs to the Government of China's work plan under the Coordinated Ministerial Mekong Initiative against Trafficking (COMMIT) – particularly in relation to the prevention of exploitative brokerage practices (with China's Ministry of Human Resources and Social Services). The project will also work with key civil society actors, including research institutes, NGOs, the media, as well as target group members to contribute to the drafting of policies based on sound information and needs of beneficiaries.

Evaluation background

20. ILO considers evaluation as an integral part of the implementation of technical cooperation activities. Provisions are made in all projects in accordance with ILO evaluation policy and are based on the nature of the project and the specific requirements agreed upon at the time of the project design and during the project as per established procedures. The Evaluation and Impact Assessment (EIA) section of ILO/IPEC provides an independent evaluation function for all ILO/IPEC projects.
21. Evaluations of ILO/IPEC projects have a strong focus on utility for the purpose of organisational learning and planning for all stakeholders and partners in the project. As per ILO/IPEC evaluation approach, a participatory consultation process on the nature and specific purposes of this evaluation was carried out to determine the final Terms of Reference. The present Terms of Reference are based on inputs from key stakeholders received by ILO/IPEC-EIA in the consultation process and on standard issues to be covered by a project final evaluation.
22. The project has undergone an internal mid-term technical review in July 2012. The review team composed of ILO and ACWF, paid field visits to Hunan, Jiangsu, Fujian and Guizhou provinces. Anhui and Yunnan also contributed and provided feedback. The technical review made for the improvement of the project in its remaining operational period and for any future projects with similar objectives.

The project document states that a final independent evaluation will be conducted at the end of the project implementation. The project is planning a national experience sharing meeting in May 2013 and the key stakeholders have suggested that the report on the final evaluation is available for that meeting.

II. Purpose and Scope

Purpose

23. The main purposes of the Independent Final Evaluation are to:
- Establish the relevance of the project design and implementation strategy;
 - Determine the implementation effectiveness and efficiency of the project;
 - Assess the extent to which the project has achieved its stated objectives at outcome and impact level and to identify the supporting factors and constraints that have led to this achievement or lack of achievement;
 - Identify unintended changes, both positive and negative at outcome and impact levels, in addition to the expected results;
 - Assess the relevance of the sustainability strategy, its progress and its potential for achievement, identifying the processes that are to be continued by stakeholders;
 - Identify lessons learned and potential good practice, especially regarding models of interventions that can be applied further;
 - Provide recommendations to project stakeholders to support the completion, expansion or further development of initiatives that were supported by the project.

Scope

24. The evaluation will focus on the ILO/IPEC programme mentioned above, its achievements and its contribution to the overall national efforts to prevent trafficking in China. The evaluation should focus on all the activities that have been implemented since the start of the project to the moment of the field visits. (i.e. action programmes/projects).
25. The evaluation should look at the programme as a whole, including issues of initial project design, implementation, lessons learnt, replicability and recommendations for current and future programmes.
26. The evaluation should identify intended (i.e. planned) and unintended results in terms of outputs and outcomes. Some of the unintended changes could be as important as those planned. Therefore, the evaluation team should reflect on them and identify lessons learnt.
27. The analytical scope should include identifying levels of achievement of objectives and explaining how and why they have been attained. The purpose is to help the stakeholders to learn from the on-going experience.

III. Suggested Aspects to be Addressed

28. The evaluation should be carried out in adherence with the ILO Evaluation Framework and Strategy; the ILO Policy Guidelines for Results-Based Evaluations; the specific ILO/IPEC Guidelines and Notes; the UN Evaluation Group Norms and Standards, Ethical Guidelines, Code of Conduct; and the OECD/DAC Evaluation Quality Standard.
29. The evaluation will address the overall ILO evaluation concerns of relevance, effectiveness, efficiency and sustainability to the extent possible as defined in the ILO Policy Guidelines for Results-Based Evaluation: Principles, Rationale, Planning and Managing for Evaluations, January 2012 http://www.ilo.org/eval/Evaluationguidance/WCMS_168289/lang--en/index.htm
30. Gender concerns should be addressed in accordance with ILO Guidance note 4: “Considering gender in the monitoring and evaluation of projects” http://www.ilo.org/eval/Evaluationguidance/WCMS_165986/lang--en/index.htm. All data

should be sex-disaggregated and different needs of women and men and of marginalized groups targeted by the programme should be considered throughout the evaluation process.

31. In line with results-based framework approach used by ILO/IPEC for identifying results at global, strategic and project level, the evaluation will focus on identifying and analysing results through addressing key questions related to the evaluation concerns and the achievement of the Immediate Objectives of the project using data from the logical framework indicators.
32. Annex I contains specific suggested aspects for the evaluation to address. Other aspects can be added as identified by the evaluation team in accordance with the given purpose and in consultation with ILO/IPEC Geneva's Evaluation and Impact Assessment (EIA) section. It is not expected that the evaluation address all of the questions detailed in the Annex; however the evaluation must address the general areas of focus. The evaluation instrument (summarised in the inception report) should identify the general areas of focus listed here as well as other priority aspects to be addressed in the evaluation.
33. The main categories that need to be addressed are the following:
 - Design
 - Achievement (Implementation and Effectiveness) of Objectives
 - Relevance of the project
 - Sustainability
 - Special Aspects to be Addressed

IV. Expected Outputs of the Evaluation

34. The expected outputs to be delivered by the evaluation team are:
 - A desk review of appropriate material resulting in an inception report.
 - Preparation of an evaluation instrument, reflecting the combination of tools and detailed instruments needed to address the range of selected aspects. The instrument needs to make provision for the triangulation of data where possible (to be included in the inception report).
 - Field visit to the project locations in at least three provinces.
 - A feedback session with provincial stakeholders' in each province visited
 - A stakeholder workshop at the national level facilitated by the evaluation team leader
 - Debrief with key stakeholders following the stakeholders' workshop if requested
 - Draft evaluation report in English. The evaluation report should include and reflect on findings from the field visits and the stakeholder workshop proceedings and should include:
 - ✓ Executive Summary with key findings, conclusions and recommendations
 - ✓ Clearly identified findings
 - ✓ A table presenting the key results (i.e. figures and qualitative results) achieved per objective (expected and unexpected)
 - ✓ Clearly identified conclusions
 - ✓ Clearly identified recommendations (identifying which stakeholders are responsible)
 - ✓ Lessons learnt
 - ✓ Potential good practices
 - ✓ Appropriate Annexes including present TORs and a list of those consulted by the evaluation team
 - Final Evaluation report in English incorporating feedback from stakeholders on the draft.
 - Notes with reflections on the process of the evaluation identifying lessons learnt and suggestions for future ILO/IPEC evaluations

35. The total length of the report should be a maximum of 30 pages for the main report, excluding annexes; additional annexes can provide background and details on specific components of the project evaluated. The report should be sent as one complete document and the file size should not exceed 3 megabytes. Photos, if appropriate to be included, should be inserted using lower resolution to keep overall file size low.
36. All drafts and final outputs, including supporting documents, analytical reports and raw data should be provided both in paper copy and in electronic version compatible for Word for Windows. Ownership of data from the evaluation rests jointly with ILO/IPEC and the consultants. The copyright of the evaluation report will rest exclusively with the ILO. Use of the data for publication and other presentations can only be made with the written agreement of ILO/IPEC. Key stakeholders can make appropriate use of the evaluation report in line with the original purpose and with appropriate acknowledgement.
37. The draft final report will be circulated to key stakeholders (those participants present at stakeholder evaluation workshop will be considered key stakeholders), including project staff for their review. Comments from stakeholders will be consolidated by the Evaluation and Impact Assessment section (EIA) of ILO/IPEC Geneva and provided to the evaluation team leader. In preparing the final report the team leader should consider these comments, incorporate as appropriate, and provide a brief note explaining why any comments might not have been incorporated.

V. Evaluation Methodology

38. In ILO/IPEC, evaluations of its projects are carried out to enhance organisational learning. As per IPEC procedures, a participatory consultation process on the nature and specific purposes of this evaluation was carried out three months prior to the scheduled date of the evaluation. Inputs were received from key stakeholders including constituents and implementing agencies. The present Terms of Reference is based on the outcome of this process and inputs received in the course of the consultative process.
39. The following is the proposed evaluation methodology. While the evaluation team can propose changes in the methodology, any such changes should be discussed with and approved by EIA, provided that the research and analysis suggest changes and provided that the indicated range of questions is addressed, the purpose maintained and the expected outputs produced at the required quality.
40. The evaluation will be carried out using a desk review of appropriate materials, including the project documents, progress reports, outputs of the programme and the projects (action programmes), results of any internal planning process, project evaluations and relevant materials from secondary sources. At the end of the desk review period the evaluation consultant will prepare a brief document indicating the methodological approach to the evaluation in the form of the inception report which will include the evaluation instrument. The inception report will be discussed and approved by EIA.
41. The evaluation team leader will be asked to include in the inception report the evaluation instruments that will be used for documenting and analysing the achievements of the project and the contributions of the sub-projects (action programmes) to the programme. Methodological lessons learnt from the mid-term technical review should be taken into consideration (to be supplied by EIA and/or the project).

42. The evaluation team leader will interview the donor representatives and ILO/IPEC HQ and regional backstopping officials through conference calls or face-to-face interviews early in the evaluation process, preferably during the desk review phase.
43. The evaluation team will undertake field visits to the project. The evaluators will conduct interviews and focussed group discussions (FGDs) with project partners and implementing agencies, direct beneficiaries, girls and boys, parents, migrants and teachers. The team will facilitate debriefing sessions at the provincial level and a national level stakeholders' workshop towards the end of the field visits.
44. It is suggested that two 'sending' provinces and one 'receiving' province are visited in addition to consultations in Beijing. Those 'sending' provinces that were not involved in the mid-term technical review (Yunnan and Anhui) are expected to be visited by the evaluation team and one of Jiangsu or Fujian as 'receiving' provinces
45. The selection of the field visits locations within each province should be based on criteria to be defined by the evaluation team. Some criteria to consider include:
 - Locations with successful and unsuccessful results from the perception of key stakeholders. The rationale is that extreme cases, at some extent, are more helpful than averages for understanding how process worked and results have been obtained;
 - Locations that have been identified as providing particular good practices or bringing out particular key issues as identified by the desk review and initial discussions;
 - Representation of the main strategies or interventions used
 - Areas known to have high prevalence of trafficking and labour migration;
 - Locations close to main roads and also locations that are more remote.
46. The stakeholder workshop will be attended by ILO/IPEC staff and key stakeholders (i.e. partners), including the donor as appropriate. These will be an opportunity for the evaluation team to gather further data, present the preliminary findings for verification and discussion, present recommendations and obtain feedback. The workshop will take place towards the end of the fieldwork.
47. The evaluation team leader will be responsible for organizing the methodology of the workshop. The identification of the number of participants of the workshops and logistics will be the responsibility of the project team in consultation with the evaluation team leader.
48. The team leader will be responsible for drafting and finalising the evaluation report. The findings of the evaluation team will incorporate the feedback from the stakeholder workshops. The draft report will be circulated to stakeholders in English for their feedback and comments. A Chinese translation will be prepared by the project and circulated shortly afterwards in order to enable all stakeholders to effectively participate in the consultation process. The team leader will further be responsible for finalising the report incorporating any comments from stakeholders as appropriate.
49. The evaluation will be carried out with the technical support of the ILO/IPEC-EIA section and with the logistical support of the ILO office in Beijing. EIA will be responsible for consolidating the comments of stakeholders and submitting them to the team leader.
50. It is expected that the evaluation team will work to the highest evaluation standards and codes of conduct and follow the UN evaluation standards and norms.

The team responsibilities and profile

51. The evaluation will be carried out by an international evaluation team leader and an evaluation team member (national consultant). The evaluation team leader is responsible for drafting and

finalising the evaluation report. The evaluation team member will support the team leader in preparing for the in-country evaluation mission, during the country mission and in drafting the report. The evaluation team leader will have the final responsibility during the evaluation process for the outcomes of the evaluation, including the quality of the report and compliance with deadlines.

52. The background of the evaluation team leader and the evaluation team member should include:

Team leader (International consultant):

Responsibilities	Profile
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Desk review of programme documents • Development of the evaluation instrument • Briefing with ILO/IPEC-EIA • Telephone interviews with ILO/IPEC HQ desk officer, donor • Technical guidance to national consultant • Undertake field visits in project area • Facilitate stakeholders' de-briefings and workshop • Draft evaluation report • Finalise evaluation report 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • <u>Not have been involved in the project.</u> • Relevant background in social and/or economic development. • Experience in the design, management and evaluation of development projects, in particular with policy level work, institutional building and local development projects. • Experience in evaluations in the UN system or other international context as team leader • Relevant sub-regional experience • Relevant country experience highly preferred • Experience in the area of migration and trafficking issues and rights-based approaches in a normative framework and operational dimension are highly appreciated. • Experience at policy level and in the area of migration and legal issues would also be appreciated. • Experience in the UN system or similar international development experience including preferably international and national development frameworks in particular PRSP and UNDAF. • Fluency in English is essential • Experience facilitating workshops for evaluation findings • Working knowledge of Mandarin is an asset.

National consultant

Responsibilities	Profile
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Desk review of programme documents • Contribute to the development of the evaluation instrument • Organize interviews of stakeholders and field visits in the country • Co-facilitate stakeholder workshop (under the team leader leadership) • Contribute to the evaluation report through systematizing data collected and providing analytical inputs • Others as required by the team leader 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Relevant background in country social and/or economic development. • Experience in the design, management and evaluation of development projects, in particular with policy level work, institutional building and local development projects. • Relevant country experience • Experience in the area of migration and trafficking issues and rights-based approaches in a normative framework are highly appreciated • Experience facilitating workshops for evaluation findings • Fluency in English and Mandarin essential • Knowledge of local languages in the field visit areas an asset • Experience in the UN system or similar international development experience desirable.

Evaluation Timetable and Schedule

53. The total duration of the evaluation process including submission of the final report should be within two months from the end of the field mission.

54. The timetable is as follows:

Phase	Responsible Person	Tasks	No of days	
			TL	NC
I	Evaluation team leader	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> o Briefing with ILO/IPEC-EIA o Desk Review of programme related documents o Telephone briefing with ILO/IPEC, donor, IPEC HQ and ILO regional staff o Submission of inception report 	5	5
II	Evaluation team with logistical support by project	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> o In-country for consultations with programme staff o Consultations with project staff /management o Interviews with project staff and partners o Field visits o Consultations with girls and boys, migrants, parents, teachers and other beneficiaries o Consultations with other relevant stakeholders o Feedback to project partners o Workshop with key stakeholders, sharing of preliminary findings 	18	16
III	Evaluation team leader	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> o Draft report based on consultations from desk review, field visits and workshop o Debriefing as required 	5	3
IV	EIA	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> o Quality check and initial review by EIA o Circulate draft report to key stakeholders o Translation of draft report into Chinese (by the project) o Consolidate comments of stakeholders and send to team leader 	0	0
V	Evaluation team leader	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> o Finalise the report including explanations on why comments were not included o Finalise Chinese version (by the project) 	2	0
TOTAL			30	24

TL: Team leader

NC: National consultant

55. Summary schedule

Phase	Duration	Dates
I Desk review	5 days	28 March – 2 April 2013
II Field mission	16 days	8 – 25 April
III Report writing	5 days	29 April – 10 May
IV Consultation period	3 weeks ¹	
V Final report	2 days	By 11 June

¹Additional week added for translation of draft report into Chinese

56. Sources of Information and Consultations/Meetings

The following sources should be consulted:

Available at HQ and to be supplied by EIA	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• Project document• EIA, ILO and UNEG guidelines
Available in project office and to be supplied by project management	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• Mid-term technical review• Technical progress reports/status reports• Baseline reports and studies• Project monitoring plan• Technical and financial reports of partner agencies• Other studies and research undertaken• Action Programme Summary Outlines• Project files• National Action Plans

57. Consultations/meetings will be held with:

- Project management and staff
- ILO/HQ and regional backstopping officials
- Implementing partner agencies
- Trafficking and migration programs in the country
- Social partners Employers' and Workers' groups
- ACWF representatives at all levels
- NGO representatives
- Researchers and consultants who have worked on the project
- Government stakeholders
- Government representatives, legal authorities etc. as identified by evaluation team
- Policy makers
- Direct beneficiaries, i.e. boys and girls (taking ethical consideration into account.)
- Parents of boys and girls
- Teachers
- Community members as identified by the project management and evaluation team leader
- Factory owners
- Donor representatives

Final Report Submission Procedure

58. For independent evaluations, the following procedure is used:

- The evaluator will submit a draft report to ILO/IPEC EIA in Geneva
- IPEC EIA will forward a copy to key stakeholders for comments on factual issues and for clarification
- IPEC EIA will consolidate the comments and send these to the evaluator by a date agreed between EIA and the evaluator or as soon as the comments are received from stakeholders.
- The final report is submitted to ILO/IPEC EIA who will then officially forward it to stakeholders, including the donor.

VI. Resources and Management

Resources

59. The resources required for this evaluation are:

- For the evaluation team leader:
 - Fees for an international consultant for 30 work days
 - Fees for local DSA in project locations
 - Travel from consultant's home residence to Beijing in line with ILO regulations and rules
- For the national consultant:
 - Fees for 24 days
 - Fees for local DSA in project location
- For the evaluation exercise as a whole:
 - Local travel in-country (air and road) supported by the project
 - Stakeholder workshop and feedback meetings expenditures
 - Translation and interpretation costs
 - Any other miscellaneous costs.

A detailed budget is available separately.

Management

60. The evaluation team will report to ILO/IPEC-EIA in headquarters and should discuss any technical and methodological matters with EIA, should issues arise. IPEC project officials and the ILO Office in Beijing will provide administrative and logistical support during the evaluation mission.

Annex I: Suggested Aspects to Address

Design

- Determine the validity of the project design, in particular whether it assisted or hindered the achievement of the project goals as set out in the Project Document.
- Assess whether the project design was logical and coherent:
 - Were the objectives of the project clear, realistic and likely to be achieved within the established time schedule and with the allocated resources (including human resources)?
 - Were the linkages between inputs, activities, outputs and objectives clear and logical?
 - Was there a need to adjust the design and were any changes made?
 - How relevant are programme indicators and means of verification? Please assess the usefulness of the indicators for monitoring and measuring outcomes.
 - Assess how logical and realistic was the time frame for project implementation and the sequencing of project activities?
 - Were the expectations of the roles, capacity and commitment of stakeholders realistic and likely to be achieved?
- To what extent have key external factors been identified and assumptions formulated in the Project document? Have the identified assumptions on which the project was based proven to be true? Assess the impact of any external factors (expected and unexpected).
- Assess whether the problems and needs were adequately analysed and determine whether the needs, constraints, resources and access to project services of the different beneficiaries were clearly identified taking gender issues into concern.
- How have gender issues been taken into account in the project design in its components and outcomes?
- How has the strategy for sustainability of project results been defined at the design stage of the project?
- How does the project design fit within and complement existing or previous initiatives (by the government or any other organisation) to combat trafficking?

Achievements (Implementation and Effectiveness) of Objectives

- Examine the preparatory outputs of the delivery process in terms of effectiveness of preparation for project implementation.
- Assess whether the project has achieved its immediate objectives.
- How has the project responded to positive and negative factors (both foreseen and unforeseen) that arose throughout the implementation process? Has the project team been able to adapt the implementation process in order to overcome these obstacles without hindering the effectiveness of the project?
- Assess the selection of the implementing agencies for the APs in relation to the project strategy.
- Review the linkages that the project had with other projects and how these effected the achievement of the project objectives. Assess the establishment and contribution of institutional partnerships to project achievements.
- Review the value of technical support, including the effectiveness of communication, received from relevant ILO units (including ILO Geneva, Sub regional and Regional Office).

- Assess the effectiveness of the project's beneficiary identification and targeting strategies and mechanisms. Assess the gender dimensions of these strategies. How did the project expand (in comparison to phase I) to include boys as target beneficiaries?
- How has the capacity of the implementing agencies and other relevant partners (at national and local levels) to develop effective action against trafficking been enhanced as a result of programme activities?
- Examine the role of the project in building any networks that have been developed between organisations and government agencies working to address trafficking on the national, provincial and local levels.
- How effectively has the programme leveraged resources (e.g., by collaborating with non-ILO/IPEC initiatives and other programmes launched in support of the project objectives)?
- Examine how the ILO/IPEC project interacted and possibly influenced national level policies, debates and institutions working on trafficking.

Relevance of the Project

- Examine whether the programme responded to the real needs of the beneficiaries and stakeholders, including specific target groups and sub-national areas.
- Assess whether the problems and needs that gave rise to the programme still exists or have changed.
- Identify and assess any emerging trends that the project responded to (or should have responded to) in order to increase the relevance and impact.
- How did the strategy used in this project fit in with the NPA and interventions carried out by other organisations? Did the project remain consistent with and supportive of the NPA?
- Has the project identified any other constraints or opportunities that need to be accommodated in the design in order to increase the impact and relevance of the project?

Sustainability

- Assess validity of the programme approach and strategies and its potential to be replicated and scaled-up.
- Assess the relevance of the sustainability strategy, its progress and its potential for achievement.
- Assess what contributions the programme has made in strengthening the capacity and knowledge of national stakeholders and to encourage ownership of the programme to partners.
- Examine whether prioritised target group and gender aspects are taking into consideration the sustainability of the programme results and assess whether actions have been taken to sensitize national and local institutions and target groups in these issues.
- Identify potential good practices and assess the models of intervention that could inform future anti-trafficking and migration projects, especially those that the national and provincial partners could incorporate into policy and implement/replicate within the existing project area and in other provinces.
- Identify activities and approaches that can be adopted/replicated by local government, clearly prioritising those that appear most effective.

Specific Aspects to be addressed:

- How has the project addressed the recommendations of the midterm technical review? What has been the impact and if recommendations were not followed what were the reasons?

- Assess the process for documenting and disseminating pilot projects/models of intervention: scale-up, lessons, etc.
- Assess how far the project has been able to mobilize the tripartite constituents (government (at different levels), workers and employers) and other actors (civil society, UN (including ‘One UN’), other development agencies) in the country in action against trafficking and in contributing towards achieving the project’s goals and objectives.
- Assess the achievements of the project in supporting the implementation of provincial anti-trafficking action plans.
- How did the project intersect with other aspects of ILO’s Decent Work Agenda? - such as on working conditions, employment creation, gender equality etc.
- What lessons are there that are relevant to China and neighbouring countries addressing cross-border trafficking?
- Assess the support provided by the project and the effect of technical inputs provided to the Government of China’s work plan under the Coordinated Ministerial Mekong Initiative against Trafficking (COMMIT).

Annex 2: List of Documents Reviewed

Folder	Files	Language	Remarks
1.Project Document	Project Proposal	EN	
	Project Overview for Final Evaluation – PPT	EN	
2.Med-term Technical Review	Mid-term Technical Review	EN & CHN	
3.Technical Progress Report (TPR)	✓ 2010 Jan-Jun	EN	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> TPR is half-year report.
	✓ 2010 July-Dec		
	✓ 2011 Jan-Jun		
	✓ 2011 July-Dec		
	✓ 2012 Jan-Jun		
	✓ 2012 July-Dec		
	✓ TPR 6 Data Collection Summary 2013 04 10	EN	
	✓ Parents Data Sheet April 10	EN	
4.Research	✓ Media Coverage Sheet April 10	EN	
	✓ Baseline Survey	EN & CHN	
	✓ Media research	CHN	
	✓ Research on Student Workers in Jiangsu Province	EN & CHN	
	✓ Research on Migrant Children in Chengdu, Sichuan Province	CHN	
	✓ National Literature Review on Student Worker	CHN	
	✓ Hunan Students Social Survey	CHN	
	✓ Labour Trafficking Victim Case Study-preliminary findings	CHN	
5.Action Programme Summary Outlines	5.1 List of Intervention Programs (Ref 9.10C) - Version 2012 12 11	EN	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> A list of intervention programmes is attached for index.
	5.2AP (Action Program)	EN EN & CHN	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> APSOs are saved under this folder. Technical reports (Final output reports) are saved under the folder “AP (action program) to match the each APSO.
	5.3MP (Mini Program)	EN	
	YN MP001 Output Report of 2011 World Day Against Child Labour Campaign	EN	
	Yunnan WDAFL 2011-Q&A-F-Formatted	CHN	
	YN MP001 Proposal World Day MP-E-2011 clean	EN	
	Hunan MP002 Trafficking Prevention through Parents in Yanling County	EN	
	Hunan MP002 Yanling Output Report Analysis and Comments March 27 2012	EN	
	Hunan MP002 Parents Campaign Output Report	CHN	
	5.4Special program and Seminar (SP and SA)	EN or CHN	
	5.5Service Contracts	EN or CHN	
	Evaluation Result of Fujian Provincial Training Workshop	EN	
	YN LS Monitoring Analysis Report	CHN	

Folder	Files	Language	Remarks
	Fujian LS ToT Analysis Report	CHN	
	Wuxi LS ToT Evaluation report	CHN	
	Reflection on participating the LS training written by Teacher Yang Yefei, Shanming Middle School	CHC	
	My "Trafficking Prevention, My Life written by teacher Zhou Mengyun, Nu. 8 Middle School Lingyan County	CHN	
6.National Plan of Action	National Plan of Action	EN & CHN	
7. Monitoring documents	ME Plan	EN	
	Women's Home BEN Card	CHN	
	LS Monitoring Form	CHN	
	Training needs assessment	CHN	
	Training Workshop Evaluation Form	EN & CHN	
	Awareness Raising Monitoring Form	CHN	
	LS ToT Evaluation Form	CHN	
8. A story of peer influence	Changzhou WH BEN story	CHN	
	I have a dream	CHN	
9. Other Materials	ILO Decent Work Country Programme in the People's Republic of China 2013–2015	EN	
	Good Practices and Lessons Learnt	EN	
	Building modern and effective labour inspection system	EN	
	Understanding trafficking –SYY	CHN	
	ILO Guidelines on evaluation – various documents	EN	
	UNIAP monitoring report on Workers Troupe	EN	

Annex 3: Evaluation Questionnaires

Questionnaire for key informant interviews⁸

1. What is your role and involvement in the project? (Briefly describe)

2. What has the project achieved? Has it achieved its objectives?

(Consider, for example, policy advocacy; capacity development; direct services to beneficiaries)

3. Are these achievements sustainable? Will the activities of the project or its effects continue once the project has finished?

(Consider, for example, impacts at the level of policy, national/provincial agencies, communities, families, individual beneficiaries, on the issue of trafficking and labour exploitation etc.)

4. What has the project not achieved? Is there any way in which it has not met your expectations?

5. Have there been any unintended consequences of the project (both positive and negative)?

6. Are there any good practices or lessons learned from this experience?

7. Is the project still relevant?

(Consider, for example, the needs of the Chinese context; fit with national and local policy; fit with international standards, ILO, donor requirements etc.)

8. What factors have helped or hindered the project in its implementation?

(Consider, for example, management, coordination, relationships, project design, systems for administration, monitoring and evaluation, Chinese context - policy, politics, socio-economic issues etc.)

9. Do you have any recommendations for the future?

Interviewer to complete

Date/location of meeting:

Name:

Organisation:

Male/female:

⁸ Individual and small meetings with project management and staff; ACWF representatives at all levels as the implementing partner; trafficking and migration programmes in the country; social partners Employers' and Workers' groups; NGO representatives; researchers and consultants involved in the project; government stakeholders and policy-makers; donor representatives; international partners; media etc.

Questionnaire for focus groups and interviews with indirect beneficiaries⁹

1. What is your involvement in the project? Have you received support from the project e.g. training or capacity building activities? (Briefly describe)
2. What did you think of the support you received? Were you satisfied or could it be improved in any way?
3. As a result of this support, did you take any actions yourself e.g. did you pass on the information you had learned to others? Did you change the way you provide services to beneficiary children and young women?
4. What lasting difference has this support made to you? E.g. improved knowledge, skills etc.
5. What difference have the services you provided as a result of the project made to the beneficiaries (children and young women) that you work with – for example, has it changed their attitude and behaviour? Has it increased their knowledge and skills? Are they at less risk of trafficking or labour exploitation? Has it made a difference to their health, emotional and psychological well-being, their social relationships and their opportunities (e.g. education) and life chances?
6. Are there any unintended consequences of the project (both positive and negative)?
7. Are there any good practices or lessons learned from this experience?
8. If you have a wider knowledge of the project, what has the project achieved? Are these achievements sustainable? Will the activities of the project or its effects continue once the project has finished? What has the project not achieved? What factors have helped or hindered the project in its implementation?
9. Do you have any recommendations for the future?

Interviewer to complete

Date/location of meeting:

Individual interview – give name and state whether male or female:

Focus group – give name of group, number of participants, and breakdown male or female members. Pass round piece of paper to collect names of participants.

Organisation:

⁹ Individual and small meetings with project management and staff; ACWF representatives at all levels as the implementing partner; trafficking and migration programmes in the country; social partners Employers' and Workers' groups; NGO representatives; researchers and consultants involved in the project; government stakeholders and policy-makers; donor representatives; international partners; media etc.

Questionnaire for focus groups and interviews with direct beneficiaries¹⁰

1. How are you involved in the project? Have you received any services or assistance from it?
2. What do you think of the project? What do you like about it and why? What don't they like about it and why?
3. Has the project made a difference to you or not?
 - 3.1. If the project has made a difference to you:
 - 3.1.1. Has it made a difference to your knowledge? Are you more aware of the risks of trafficking and labour exploitation?
 - 3.1.2. Has it changed your behaviour? Will you be doing anything differently as a result of the assistance you received? What measures have you taken to protect yourself from being exploited?
 - 3.1.3. Are there any other beneficial effects? Do you have more skills? Has your health and well-being improved? Has it improved your relationships with other people, your family, friends, neighbours?
 - 3.1.4. Have you had new opportunities as a result of the project e.g. school? What difference has it made to your future?
 - 3.2. If the project has not made a difference to you, do you know why not?
4. Has the project made a difference to other people in your situation? Can you give examples? Has it made a difference to other people you know in terms of changing the way they think and behave e.g. parents, teachers, community members?
5. Should the project be improved in any way?
6. Have you got any suggestions for the future?

Interviewer to complete

Date/location of meeting:

Individual interview – give name and state whether male or female:

Focus group – give name of group, number of participants, and breakdown male or female members. Pass round piece of paper to collect names of participants.

Organization:

¹⁰ Direct beneficiaries will be those who have received services, training or community support i.e. children and young women from the following types of groups – young migrants, migrant children, drop-outs, poor rural youth, ethnic minorities, left-behind children etc.

Annex 4: CP-TING Final Evaluation Schedule

	Date	Event	Venue
Meeting with CP-TING team, national and other relevant stakeholders	8 th April (Monday)	<p>10:30-11:00 Meeting with CP-TING national programme staff Ms. Guo Jia, Project Manager, ILO Ms. Su Yanyan, Project Officer, ILO Mr. Yang Hong, Project Assistant, ILO Mr. Laurence Phillips, Project Consultant, ILO</p> <p>11:00- 12:30 Meeting with ACWF Ms. GUO Ye, Division Chief, Legal Department of ACWF Ms. DUAN Guohui, Deputy Director-General, International Department of ACWF, National Project Coordinator of CP-TING Ms. ZHANG Ying, Deputy Division Chief, International Department of ACWF Ms. ZHANG Huang, National Project Assistant (NPA) of ACWF</p> <p>12:30-13:30 Lunch (with ACWF)</p> <p>15:00-16:00 Meeting with Ms. Farah Chandani, CIDA</p>	<p>ILO Beijing office</p> <p>ILO Beijing office</p> <p>Canadian Embassy in Beijing</p>
	9 th April (Tuesday)	<p>10:00-11:30 Meeting with researchers - Professor Zhou Shengkun, leading researcher for Baseline study. - Ms. Chen Ying, leading consultant for life skills training manuals development, cascade trainings etc. - Ms. Feng Yuan, key researcher in media and CP-TING - Professor Tong Xiaojun, leading researcher on labour trafficking victim case study</p> <p>14:00 – 18:00 Meeting with CP-TING national programme staff</p>	ILO Beijing office
	10 th April (Wednesday)	<p>10:00 – 11:30 Meeting with national stakeholders: UNIAP Ms. HE Yunxiao, National Coordinator</p> <p>14:00 – 18:00 Draft notes. Continuing consultation with project staff</p>	UNIAP office, Beijing
	11 th April (Thursday)	<p>12:25-14:15 Fly to Hefei city of Anhui Province CA1843 (12:25-14:15) Beijing – Hefei</p> <p>14:15 – 14:30 Airport pickup</p> <p>14:30 – 18:30 Travel to project site: Funan County (consultation with project coordinator and assistant during travel.)</p>	<p>Hefei city, Anhui,</p> <p>Funan county Anhui</p>
	12 th April (Friday)	<p>8:30-9:30 Meeting with implementing agencies and key partners</p>	Funan county,

	Date	Event	Venue
		(Funan County Women's Federation, Education Department) 9:50-12:00 Visit project site: Tianji Middle School Meeting with the school principal and teachers 12:00-14:00 Lunch 14:00-16:30 Visit project site: Funan No. 2 Middle School - Meeting with the school principal and teachers - Observation of one participatory life skills training demonstration class - Meeting with students 16:40-20:30 Return Hefei	Hefei city, Anhui
	13 th April (Saturday)	8:30-10:30 Meeting with implementing agency: Sanlijie Sub-district Center. 10:40-11:30 Visit Fengyi Migrant Women's Home Meeting with migrant girls 11:30-13:30 Lunch 13:30 Return hotel Prepare for provincial meeting	Hefei city, Anhui
	14 th April (Sunday)	Prepare for provincial meeting	Hefei city, Anhui
	15 th April (Monday)	9:00-11:30 Provincial meeting with Anhui provincial working level stakeholders (Anhui Provincial Department of Education, Anhui University, Fengyi centre, Anhui Women's Federation) 11:30-13:30 Lunch 15:00-17:45 Go to airport. Fly to Fuzhou city of Fujian Province HU7690 Hefei - Fuzhou (16:20-17:45) 17:45 Airport pickup 19:45 Hotel check in. Dinner	Hefei city, Anhui Fuzhou city, Fujian
Field trip to Fujian	16 th April (Tuesday)	8:30 -10:30 Bus travel to Licheng district of Quanzhou city (Consultation with project coordinator and assistant during travel.) 10:30 – 12:15 Meeting with implementing agencies (Licheng district Women's Federation) 12:30	Quanzhou city, Fujian

	Date	Event	Venue
		<p>Hotel check in and lunch</p> <p>14:30 – 17:00 Visit project site: Quanzhou Junzilan Beauty and Hair Dressing School. Interview beneficiaries.</p> <p>17:00 Return hotel</p> <p>18:00 Dinner</p>	
	17 th April (Wednesday)	<p>8:30 Return Fuzhou</p> <p>10:30 – 11:30 Hotel check in, Draft notes.</p> <p>11:30 Lunch</p> <p>14:30 – 17:00 Visit project site (Xiushan Middle School), - Meeting with principal and teachers - Meeting with students.</p> <p>17:20 Back to hotel</p> <p>18:00 Dinner</p>	Fuzhou city, Fujian
	18 th April (Thursday)	<p>Morning Prepare for provincial meeting</p> <p>11:30 Lunch</p> <p>15:00 – 17:00 Provincial meeting: Meeting with Fujian Provincial Steering Committee (PSC) members (Department of Public Security, Department of Education, Department of Labour, Department of WF)</p> <p>17:00 Back to Hotel</p> <p>18:00 Dinner</p>	Fuzhou city, Fujian
Field trip to Yunnan	19 th April (Friday)	<p>6:00 Go to airport, fly to Kunming city of Yunnan Province MF8427(08:15-12:00)</p> <p>12:40-13:30 Lunch and meeting with Yunnan project staff</p> <p>14:30-15:45 Meeting with migrant students of Yuntong Middle School</p> <p>16:00-17:30</p>	Kunming city, Yunnan

	Date	Event	Venue
		Meeting with teachers of Yuntong Middle School 17:30-18:30 Dinner and meeting with Yunnan project staff	
	20 th April (Saturday)	8:30-10:30 Visit project site Wang jia qiao migrant community, accompanied by staff of Lianxin Care Community Center 10:30-10:50 -Continued consultation meeting (indoor) with staff of Lianxin Care Community Center (done by Li Ping together Duan Guohui and Yang Hong) -Meeting with Professor Xiang Rong (leading consultant on Women's Home Manual) (done by Asmita Naik) 11:00-12:00 Meeting with other stakeholders/partner (volunteers, teachers, Yunnan University Development Research Center) 12:00-13:30 Lunch 14:30-16:00 Meeting with migrant women and parents 16:15-17:30 Meeting with migrant children 17:30-18:30 Dinner	Kunming city, Yunnan
	21 st April (Sunday)	Prepare for provincial meeting	Kunming city, Yunnan
	22 nd April (Monday)	09:00-11:30 Provincial meeting with Yunnan working level provincial stakeholders (Department of PSB, the Office of Working Committee of Women and Children, the formal Director of Rights Department of YWF) 11:30-12:30 Lunch 15:00 Go to airport. Fly back to Beijing CA4173 (16:45-20:10)	Kunming city, Yunnan
Meeting in Beijing	23 rd April (Tuesday)	Prepare for national meeting workshop	Beijing
	24 th April (Wednesday)	Prepare for national meeting workshop	Beijing
	25 th April (Thursday)	9:00 – 10:00 Meeting with Ms. Ann Herbert, Director of ILO for China and Mongolia 10:00 - 17:00 National Meeting Workshop to share preliminary findings	Beijing

Annex 5: List of Persons Consulted

Project Staff at national and provincial levels and ILO head office and regional office staff	
Name	Organization
1.Ms. Guo Jia	Project Manager, ILO
2.Ms. Su Yanyan,	Project Officer, ILO
3.Mr. Yang Hong	Project assistant , ILO
4.Mr. Laurence Phillips,	Project Consultant, ILO
5.Ms. Duan Guohui	National Project Coordinator, Deputy Director-General, International Department of ACWF
6.Ms. Zhang Huang	National Project Assistant of ACWF
7.Mr. Tu Xinquan	PPO of Anhui Provincial Women's Federation (PWF)
8.Ms.Wang Yurong	PPA of Anhui PWF
9.Mr. Li Huihuang	CP-Ting Project Assistant based in Funan Education Bureau of Anhui
10.Ms.Chen Shaofang	PPC of Fujian PWF of Fujian
11.Ms.Wang Tianbing	PPA of Fujian PWF of Fujian
12.Ms.Wu Tao	PPC of Yunnan PWF of Yunnan
13.Ms.Liu Pu	PPA of Yunnan PWF of Yunnan
14.Ms.Ann Herbert	Director of ILO for China and Mongolia
15. Mr Hans van der Lind	Trafficking specialist, HQ
16. Ms. Bharati Pflug	Desk officer, HQ
17. Ms. Simrin Singh	Child labour advisor, RO Bangkok
Project stakeholders/partners at national and provincial levels	
Name	Organization
1.Ms. Guo Ye	Division Chief, Legal Department of ACWF
2.Ms. Zhang Ying	Deputy Chief, International Department of ACWF
3.Ms. Farah Chandani	First Secretary, CIDA
4.Ms. He Yunxiao	National Coordinator, UNIAP
5.Ms. Mo Like,	Chief Director of Legal Department of Anhui Provincial Women's Federation (PWF)
6.Mr. Chen Qigang,	Researcher of Provincial Education Science Institute of Anhui
7.Ms. Dai Caifeng,	Vice Governor, Funan County
8.Mr. Ma Xiaohai,	Vice Head of Funan County Government Office
9.MR. Zhang Hua,	Vice Director of Funan County Education Bureau
10.Ms. Ning Xiaoping,	Chairwoman of Funan County WF
11.Mr. Zhang Ling	Vice Director of Funan County Women and children Working Committee
12.Mr. Liu Min	Vice Chief of Primary Education Department of Funan Education Bureau
13.Ms. Lv Chunhua	Researcher of Teaching & Research Department of Funan Education Bureau
14.Ms. Ang Chaoxia,	Vice Governor of Yaohao District of Hefei
15.Ms. Liu Qun,	Chairwoman of Yaohai District WF
16.Ms. Zhao Min,	Director of Sanlijie Street Office
17.Mr. Hu Junhu	Vice Party-secretary of Sanlijie Street Office
18.Ms. Li Rong,	Head of Migrant Population services Center
19.Ms. Lin Wenxiu	Deputy Director of Fujian PPC, Associate Counselor of Fujian PWF
20.Ms.ZhanYongqiong	Standing Committee Member of Lichen District of Quanzhou, Fujian
21. Wang Yufang	Chairwoman of Lichen District WF, Fujian
22.Ms.Wu Guizhu	Vice chairwoman of Lichen District WF, Fujian
23.Ms.Zheng Caixia	Office Head of Lichen District WF, Fujian
24.Mr.Chao Jianhua	Division Chief of Lichen District PSB, Fujian
25.Mr.Cai Xudong	Division Chief of Lichen District PSB, Fujian
26.Ms.Chen YU	Division Chief, Employment Department of Lichen District HRSS, Fujian
27.Ms.Wu Shanshan	Researcher of Fujian Provincial Education Bureau
28.Ms.Han Rongxia	Researcher of Fujian Provincial HRSS
29.Ms.Zen Hong	Deputy Director of Rights Department of Fujian PWF
30.Ms.Chen Hong	Fujian Provincial PSB
31.Ms.Huang Chenfang	Teacher of Fujian Provincial Women's Cadre School
32. Mr. Li Jun	Director of Lianxin Care Community Center, Kunming, Yunnan
33. Mr.Jia Zhengguo	Staff of Lianxin Care Community Center, Kunming, Yunnan

34. Mr.Zhang Yaowei	Staff of Lianxin Care Community Center, Kunming, Yunnan
35. Ms. Zhang Li	Staff of Lianxin Care Community Center, Kunming, Yunnan
36. Mr. Luo Ronghan	Policeman of Puji Police Station, Kunming
37. Mr. Tao Kaicheng	Teacher of BoHua Migrant School, Wangjiaqiao Community, Kunming, Yunnan
38. Mr. Lan Shuli	Yunnan University
39. Ms. Yan Shuqiong	Director of Neighborhood, Guanyin Community, Kunming, Yunnan
40. Ms. Wang Zhilan	Street Office of Puji, Kunming, Yunnan
41. Ms. Xu Xiaolan	Volunteer of Wangjiaqiao Migrant community
42. Ms.Jian Fengying	Volunteer of Wangjiaqiao Migrant community
43. Ms. Xiang Rong	Yunnan University
44. Ms.He Ping	Former Director of Rights and Interests Department, YWF
45. Ms.Li Shunqiong	Division Chief of Anti-trafficking Office of Yunnan PSB
46.Ms. Wu Wangming	Director of the Office of Yunnan Working Committee of Women and Children,
Researchers	
Name	Research/study conducted
1.Ms. Feng Yuan	Media research
2.Mr. Zhou shengkun	Baseline survey
3.Ms.Tong Xiaojun	Labour trafficking victim case study
4.Ms.Chen Ying	Life Skill training manual/cascade training
Beneficiaries	
Teachers	
Name	School/Women's Home (WH)
1.Mr. Zhang He,	Principal of Miaoji Township Central School
2.Mr. Li Chun,	Vice Principal of Miaoji Township Central School
3.Ms. Wang Dongmei,	Politics teacher of Miaoji Township Central School
4.Ms. Li Xinxin,	Maths teacher of Miaoji Township Central School
5.Ms. Song Qinli,	English teacher of Miaoji Township Central School
6.Ms. Guo Xiuzheng,	Chief of Teaching group, Maths teacher of Miaoji Township Central School
7.Ms. Xu Chunping	Chinese teacher of Miaoji Township Central School
8.Ms. Li Chunnan	Maths teacher of Miaoji Township Central School
9.Mr. Nei Meng,	Vice Principal of Funan Middle School
10.Mr. Gao Haitao	Psychology Lab of Funan Middle School
11.Ms. Li Ying,	Chinese teacher of Funan Middle School
12.Mr. Jiang Runan,	Computer Lab of Funan Middle School
13.Ms. Han Chaoqun.	Politics teacher of Funan Middle School
14.Ms.Huang Shanshan	President of Clivia Beauty Salon School WH
15.Ms.Huang shanru	President Assistant of Clivia Beauty Salon School WH
16.Ms. Chen Lina	Teacher of Nail Beauty at Clivia Beauty Salon School WH
17.Mr.Xiaoyu	Make-up artist at Clivia Beauty Salon School WH
18. Mr.Feng Wei	Chinese Teacher of Xiushan Middle School of Fuzhou, Fujian
19. Mr.Lian Shenbao	Chinese Teacher of Xiushan Middle School of Fuzhou, Fujian
20.Mr.Xie Xiuping	Teacher of ideological and political education of Xiushan Middle School of Fuzhou, Fujian
21. Mr. Xiaofeng	Teacher of ideological and political education of Xiushan Middle School of Fuzhou, Fujian
22. Ms.Xu Yan	Artist Teacher of Xiushan Middle School of Fuzhou, Fujian
23. Mr. Wang Shifa	History Teacher of Xiushan Middle School of Fuzhou, Fujian
24. Mr. Chen Jianxiang	Chinese Teacher of Xiushan Middle School of Fuzhou, Fujian
25.Ms.Wang Shiqing	Head of Teaching Affairs of Yutong Middle School of Kunming, Yunnan
26. Ms. Chen Qinying	Chinese Teacher of Yutong Middle School of Kunming, Yunnan
27.Ms.Zhang Guanyan	Artist Teacher of Yutong Middle School of Kunming, Yunnan
28. Ms.He chao	Chinese Teacher of Yutong Middle School of Kunming, Yunnan
29.Ms.Cui Lianjiao	Chinese Teacher of Yutong Middle School of Kunming, Yunnan

Children and migrant women		
Name	Age	School/Women Home (WH)
20 students	Grade One and Two of Senior School	Funan Middle School of Anhui
9 women	24 to 26	Sanlijie WH
10 women	18 to 30	Clivia Beauty Salon School WH
10 girl students	Grade Eight and Nine	Fuzhou Xiushan Junior High School
7 students (4 girls and 3 boys)	14 - 15	Yutong Middle School of Kunming, Yunnan
6 children (4 girls and 2 boys)	8 to 12	Children representative of Wangjiaqiao Migrant Community, Kunming, Yunnan
7 parents (all female)		Parent representative of Wangjiaqiao Migrant Community, Kunming, Yunnan