

# **FINAL EVALUATION REPORT**

**ILO PROJECT**

**TUR/08/01/RBS**

**Pilot Project on Active Labour Market Policies for Advancing Gender Equality  
through Decent Employment for Women in Turkey**

**Ankara, Gaziantep, Konya – Turkey**

**Ayşe Şule Çağlar**

**March 2010**

## Table of Contents

ABBREVIATIONS	2
EXECUTIVE SUMMARY	3
1. BACKGROUND AND PROJECT DESCRIPTION	5
1.1. Turkey's Development Context	5
1.2. Gender Profile in Turkey	5
1.3. Project Description	7
1.4. Major Outcomes	11
2. PURPOSE, SCOPE AND CLIENTS OF THE EVALUATION	13
2.1. Purpose	13
2.2. Methodology	13
3. DESCRIPTION OF THE PROJECT AND ITS IMPLEMENTATION: PROJECT STATUS	14
3.1. Knowledge Building	14
3.2. Mainstreaming the Issues of Women and Employment into the Provincial Employment and Vocational Education Boards	16
3.3. Capacity Building	17
3.4. Vocational Training	18
3.5. Women's Human Rights Education Programme for Women (WHREP)	19
3.6. Training on Job-Seeking Skills	21
3.7. Entrepreneurship Training for Women	21
3.8. Job Placement	22
3.9. Awareness-Raising	22
3.10. Project Monitoring	22
3.11. Project Management	23
4. FINDINGS, LESSONS LEARNED	23
5. CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS	24
5.1. Conclusions	24
5.2. Recommendations	28
ANNEXES	31
Annex I Project Document	31
Annex II Terms of reference	41
Annex III List of persons consulted	49
Annex IV Women Human Right Education Programme Evaluation Notes	55

## ABBREVIATIONS

ALMP	Active Labour Market Policies
CEDAW	Convention on the Elimination of all Forms of Violence
EC	European Union
EU	European Commission
GDP	Gross domestic product
HAKİŞ	Confederation of Real Trade Unions
HDI	Human development index
İBBK	Employment Brokerage Agency
İŞKUR	Turkish Employment Agency
ILO	International Labour Organization
ITC	International Training Center
KGSM	General Directorate on the Status of Women
MOLSS	Ministry of Labour and Social Security
MoNE	Ministry of National Education
PEVEB	Provincial Employment and Training Boards
PSC	Project Steering Committee
PES	Public Employment Services
OECD	Organization for Economic Co-operation and Development
TİSK	Confederation of Turkish Employers
TÜRKİŞ	Confederation of Turkish Trade Unions
TURKSTAT	Turkish Statistical Institute
SHÇEK	General Directorate of Social Services and Child Protection
SMEs	Small and medium size enterprises
UNDAF	The United Nations Development Assistance Framework
WHR	Women's Human Rights
WHREP	Women's Human Rights Education Programme
WWHR-New Ways	Association of Women for Women's Rights-New Ways

## EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

The evaluation was conducted in March 2010 to assess the project entitled “Active labour market policies for advancing gender equality through decent employment for women in Turkey”, which was launched in January 2009 to contribute to promoting women’s employment in the project provinces of Ankara, Gaziantep and Konya through active labour market policies and awareness- raising on gender equality and women’s human rights. The project reached hundreds of women through different project activities, in line with targets of the project. The Turkish Employment Agency (İŞKUR) was the main beneficiary of the project.

Information for the evaluation has been drawn from four main sources: a desk-based review on selected documentation; interviews with those knowledgeable about the project; and, field missions to Ankara, Konya and Gaziantep, where a total of 58 people were interviewed. The purpose of the evaluation was to provide an independent assessment of approaches taken and progress being made, and to identify lessons learned to inform further strategy development. The evaluation is forward-looking and includes recommendations to help focus priorities, and strengthen strategies.

The evaluation found that the project was very well managed, especially in view of the complexity of the project, the small budget, and the fact that it was carried out in three very different provinces. The project was very effective in creating synergies with partners. The project is commendable for building on technical competence that was already available in the provinces. The evaluation finding showed that the project employed an impressive range of effective techniques and generated many provincial level successes, primarily as pilots over the last 12 months. Even though the project had to operate with a very modest budget and little time – in relation to the scope of its work – the resource and time management deserves substantial praise. Results have been quite encouraging.

With the support of Provincial Directorates of İŞKUR, vocational courses in 13 different occupations such as three-dimension graphic design, sales consultancy, computerized accounting and child care for ages 0-6 have been organized in target provinces and hundreds of women trainees have thus benefited within the context of the project. As a second component of the project, in collaboration with the General Directorate for Social Services (SHÇEK) and the Association of Women for Women’s Rights-New Ways (WWHR-New Ways), training on women’s human rights under the “Women’s Human Rights Education Programme” (WHREP) was organized for the women trainees undertaking vocational courses organized by İŞKUR and who will eventually enter the labour market. Training seminars on “Analyzing Public Employment Services from a Gender Perspective” were provided by the ILO International Training Centre (ITC) in Gaziantep and Ankara to increase the capacity of İŞKUR’s staff and social partners at provincial level in the area of active gender-sensitive labour market policies. The project played a key role in developing a greater understanding of the problem through knowledge-generation efforts. The project supported and investigated the basis for publication of three major reports; i) Preliminary Steps and Recommendations for Promoting Women’s Employment in Three Cities of Turkey ii) Labour Markets in Crisis Conditions from a Gender Perspective iii) The Factors that Affect the Labour Market Entry of Women with recommendations for the Provincial Employment and Vocational Training Boards.

Another component of the project, seminars on “Job-seeking Skills and Smoother School-to-Work Transition”, were organized for university students in cooperation with Konya Selçuk University and Gaziantep University. “Entrepreneurship Training” was provided to women trainees in the context of training on “Build Your Own Business” which is organized by the Şahinbey Municipality in cooperation with İŞKUR in Gaziantep.

The project which reached women from different educational backgrounds, not only contributed to increasing their employability, but also instilled awareness on women’s human rights which is expected to last as a lifelong guide for them. Good cooperation among different stakeholders was also an important factor that ensured good implementation of the project. Most noteworthy is the contribution made by the project in the mainstreaming of women and employment issues into the Provincial Employment and Vocational education Boards (PEVEB). One of the evaluation findings revealed that there is now a better understanding of gender and its challenges in the area of employment.

One other very important outcome of the project was in the area of awareness-raising. Meetings, conferences and panel discussions were organized at the provincial level at the beginning and at the end of the project which reached a large number of stakeholders. The main topics discussed in these meetings mainly involved: the facilitation of equal access for women to resources, employment, markets and trade; the circumstances of female employment – the sectors where women work, the types of work they do, the relationship of women to their jobs, the wages they receive; and monetary, social and structural blockages to women’s employment. In terms of efficiency, a large number of projects were made possible despite the modest amount of the average grant. The evaluation appears to indicate that the programme has targeted the right groups of people - unemployed women, as well as those who work and who need new skills.

Substantial gains were made in creating awareness of women and employment issues both at the national and local levels. The project conducted a systematic social and political dialogue as a critical element to ensure the continued visibility of the issue. Innovative and comprehensive approaches were adopted for awareness-raising.

The project has made considerable achievements in all the intended outputs with very small resources and under time constraints. There is good evidence of progress towards all three outcomes. The programme has significantly contributed to making women and employment issues better known among large and diverse groups of stakeholders in all three participating provinces and among selected provincial organizations. It has contributed to strengthening various aspects of national partners’ capacities that are relevant in terms of more effective and comprehensive implementation of employment policies to increase women’s participation.

Although the project endorsed effective capacity development principles and practices, capacity development is a long-term process and many project initiatives were of short duration. Therefore, the evaluator highly recommends another phase for this project in order to effectively build on partnerships, experiences and achievements created to date. This evaluation also offers an opportunity to identify some specific recommendations areas which may be considered with a view to further successes.

## 1. BACKGROUND AND PROJECT DESCRIPTION

### 1.1. Turkey's Development Context

Turkey, in its unique position bridging Europe and Asia is an upper middle-income country. The population of Turkey is 73 million with an annual population growth rate of 1.2 per cent per year. Turkey is a country with a young population with 28 per cent of the population between the 0–14 age group, and half of all Turkish people below the age of 28. Some 66.5 per cent of the population is aged between 15 and 64, and 70.5 per cent live in the cities (TurkStat, 2008). The total fertility rate has declined to 2.1 lifetime births per woman; however, there are marked regional disparities in the total fertility rate, and life expectancy at birth has risen to 70 years for males and 75 for females.

Turkey has made significant strides in improving its socio-economic infrastructure. According to the Human Development Index (HDI) 2009, between 1980 and 2007, Turkey's HDI rose by 0.93 per cent annually, from 0.628 to 0.806 today. HDI scores in all regions have increased progressively over the years although they have all experienced periods of slower growth or even reversals.<sup>1</sup> The Human poverty value of 8.3 per cent for Turkey, ranks 40<sup>th</sup> among 135 countries for which the index has been calculated. Its economy is among the world's 20 largest, with GDP per capita reaching US\$ 8,000 in 2009. Extreme poverty is low, at about 1 per cent (TurkStat, 2009).

The ongoing global economic downturn has hit Turkey hard. GDP growth in 2008 was 1.1 per cent, implying stagnant per capita income, with the Turkish economy contracting in the fourth quarter by 6.2 per cent relative to the previous year. Year-on-year quarterly growth fell further to -13.8 per cent in the first quarter of 2009 and, despite signs of the recession bottoming out in mid-2009, the Turkish economy is expected to shrink by more than 5 per cent in 2009. Unemployment in the period April – June 2009 was 13.6 per cent (higher than at the peak of the 2001 crisis), and more than one in four young workers is unemployed. The government's response has combined monetary policy easing with foreign-exchange liquidity and confidence building measures in the financial sector. Some employment measures and temporary tax cuts are also in operation.

During the last decade strong efforts have been made which have brought about substantial progress in raising the primary school enrolment rates and improving the quality of education. In the 2008–2009 academic years, the nation-wide primary education enrolment rate was 96.49 per cent: 96.99 per cent male and 95.97 per cent female (MoNE, 2009). Major success has also been achieved in closing the gender disparities in education, reducing the dropout rates and increasing the enrolment rates at secondary school level.

### 1.2. Gender Profile in Turkey

One of the main issues facing Turkey is that of serious gender disparities. Over recent decades, successive Turkish governments have shown that they comprehend the importance of gender equality. The key Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Violence (CEDAW) was ratified by Turkey as early as 1985, and a General Directorate on the Status and Problems of women was established in 1990. The ratification of CEDAW and of the

---

<sup>1</sup> [http://hdrstats.undp.org/en/countries/country\\_fact\\_sheets/cty\\_fs\\_TUR.html](http://hdrstats.undp.org/en/countries/country_fact_sheets/cty_fs_TUR.html) Human Development Report 2009

Optional Protocol (enabling individuals to file complaints at the international level), as well as the legal changes amending women's human rights to bring Turkish laws and procedures in line with CEDAW and with the Copenhagen Criteria (for accession to the European Union) led the Government of Turkey to enact a number of legal reforms to end discrimination against women and expand their human rights. Over the past ten years, Turkey has made further strides in advancing the cause of women and promoting their rights.

Turkey approved the articles 16 and 8, and sub-clause 3 of article 4 of the European Social Charter. Sub-clause 3 of article 4 of the European Social Charter states that "the Parties undertake (...) to recognize the right of men and women workers to equal pay for equal work". Article 16 regulates "the right of the family to social, legal and economic protection", and article 8 regulates "the right of employed women to protection during maternity".

The Turkish National Programme on the Adoption of the EU Acquis, which came into force after its publication in the Official Gazette of 24 July 2003 (No. 25178), aims at the dissemination and active implementation of egalitarian policies as well as to harmonize and align these policies with the Acquis Communautaire regarding equality between women and men in the labour market. By the Council of Ministers' decision of 3 February 2003 (No. 2003/5224; published in the Official Gazette on 21 February 2003, No. 25027) Turkey acceded to the Gender Equality Community Programme, one of the Social Policy Programmes of the EU. Initiated in 1982 by the EU, this Gender Equality Community Programme aims to secure equal treatment for men and women in terms of employment, vocational training, promotion, and labour conditions. The Turkish National Programme of 2003 aims to ensure alignment with the (international) directives on equality between women and men in the labour market

The Turkish government has already taken a tougher stand on violence against women. The Law on Family Protection adopted in 1998 introduced some protection for victims of domestic violence. Over the past ten years the Turkish National Assembly and the Supreme Court have abolished or annulled discriminatory paragraphs in a range of laws. The new Penal Code bill passed by Parliament on 26 September 2004 contains much improved protection of women's human rights. Through a directive issued in 2006, it was communicated to the Provincial Directorates of İŞKUR that activities should be implemented for the benefit of private enterprises and other employers in order to raise awareness that no sex discrimination is allowed in the workplace unless the nature of the job makes it justifiable based on biological reasons. According to the Unemployment Insurance Act, all provisions regarding unemployment insurance (social security) including contributions to be paid and the level of the contributions and benefits should be the same for women and men.

Maternity leave and related issues are regulated by the Civil Servants Law, as amended in 2004, and the Labour Act of 2003, with female employees and female civil servants now subject to the same regulations. The By-Law on the Employment Terms for Female Employees in Night Shifts states that female workers are not allowed to work night shifts from the moment a pregnancy is diagnosed by a medical practitioner until the date of birth and -if breastfeeding- for the six months immediately after the date of birth. This latter period can be extended up to one year, if deemed necessary for the health of the mother and/or the child upon recommendation of an office medical practitioner, an office health unit, an outpatient health clinic, or, when the aforementioned are not available, by a social security organization, healthcare centre, or with a report prepared by a medical officer or district practitioner.

But changing legislation doesn't necessarily lead to changed behaviour. The European Commission's (EC) 2008 progress report pointed to problems in Turkey such as women's rights and employment. This indicates a need for training and better awareness of the rights and responsibilities of both sexes. Under a new law (referred to as the "Employment Package") which was recently passed in May 2008, the Government will subsidize the insurance premiums of newly employed women and employees between the ages of 18 and 29 for five years in declining installments. In their first year of employment, 100 per cent of the insurance premiums for this group will be paid by the Treasury via the unemployment fund. The subsidy rate will drop by 20 per cent each year for the next four years. The new law also reduces the employers' overall share in insurance premiums by 5 per cent.

The General Directorate on the Status of Women<sup>2</sup> has prepared The National Action Plan Gender Equality 2008-2013 in the framework of the Twinning Project Promoting Gender Equality, implemented by the General Directorate on the Status of Women (KSGM) and the Ministry of Social Affairs and Employment of the Netherlands with the financial assistance of the European Commission. This National Action Plan was prepared with the scope of covering the areas of Women and Education, Women and Economy, Women and Poverty, Women and Health, Women and Power and Decision-making Processes, Women and Environment, Women and Media, Women's Human Rights, Girl Children, and Institutional Mechanisms for the Advancement of Women which are among the critical areas determined in the Beijing Action Platform. With the aim of promoting gender equality in the mentioned areas, objectives and implementation strategies have been established with the participation of all the relevant parties in order to constitute a base for the development and implementation of the public policies.

### **1.3. Project Description**

In Turkey there is a large volume of data and legal framework supporting the importance attached to women's employment. Turkey has previously ratified ILO Conventions Nos. 100, 111, 122, and 142<sup>3</sup>. Turkey has not yet ratified ILO's Maternity Protection Convention, 2000 (No 183). On 10 February 2009, a Memorandum of Understanding on the Decent Work Country Priorities was signed by the Ministry of Labour and Social Security and the ILO in Lisbon. The Government of Turkey and the ILO reaffirmed their decision to implement a Decent Work Country Priorities, which includes the objective of "improvement of women's employment and gender equality". Gender issues are also on the agenda of EU-Turkey accession talks. In fact, the EU Screening Report Chapter 19 on Employment and Social Policy emphasizes the low labour force participation rate for women. In addition, the UNDAF for Turkey – the common strategic framework for UN operational activities – commits the UN to support the Government of Turkey to increase political and budgetary commitments and adopt and effectively implement enabling laws, policies, plans and social budgets for women, children and youth (CP Outcome 3.1.)

---

<sup>2</sup> [http://www.ksgm.gov.tr/Pdf/NAP\\_GE.pdf](http://www.ksgm.gov.tr/Pdf/NAP_GE.pdf)

<sup>3</sup> Convention No. 100 concerning Equal Remuneration for Men and Women Workers for Work of Equal Value; Convention No. 111 concerning Discrimination in Respect of Employment and Occupation; Convention No. 122 concerning Employment Policy; C142 Human Resources Development Convention



According to data provided by the OECD's "Education at a Glance/2007", Turkey by far leads the list among 30 OECD member or candidate countries in terms of the high proportion of young girls who are neither employed nor in educational institutions nor seeking employment.

According to the latest TurkStat data (2009): the unemployment rate for women in the age group of 15-29 is 25 per cent, while the non-agriculture unemployment rate for the same group is 32.9 per cent in 2009; labour force participation rate for women is 26 per cent; the unemployment rate for women (+15) is 14.3 per cent; The non-agricultural unemployment rate for women (+15) is 21.9 per cent; and, the employment rate for women (+15), is 22.3 per cent. Socio-cultural factors such as a gender-based division of labour and gender roles built upon this division assign childcare and household chores almost solely to women and therefore largely prevent them from joining the labour force and seeking jobs. The insufficiency of public childcare facilities and elderly care services further aggravates the problem. Women's motivation to work is also curbed by such factors as limited work availability, heavier working conditions and low pay. Furthermore, due to the rapid shrinking of rural employment resulting in internal migration to urban areas, there are fewer jobs for unskilled women who have previously been employed in agriculture. Primary and secondary education in Turkey does not equip young women with skills from which they can benefit in labour markets.

The 9<sup>th</sup> Development Plan of Turkey prepared for the period 2007–2013 aims at equal opportunities for women, youth, and long-term unemployed, persons with disabilities and ex-convicts who face problems in the labour market. Included in the measures will be easier access to child and other care services in order to boost the participation of women in the labour force and employment. Programmes will also be developed to help youth gain work experience. Furthermore, in order to enhance women's participation in economic and social life, greater opportunities for vocational training will be provided to them, increasing their employability.

Taking into account the above employment situation for women and the interest of the Turkish government and social partners to better reach the targets of the 9<sup>th</sup> Development Plan, ILO support was provided to İŞKUR to implement a project aimed at promoting decent work for women.

In 2007, the ILO Ankara office in Turkey supported the publication of the *Situation of Women's Employment in Turkey*<sup>4</sup>, in line with the priorities of the ILO-Turkey's Decent Work Country Priorities. The findings of the report were widely disseminated and the main findings and recommendations of the report and its assessment were presented at a conference held in December 2007. The meeting brought together employers' and workers' organizations, governmental and non-governmental organizations, national and international agencies and universities. The conference created a strategic platform where the issues raised by the report were analyzed and proposals were made for the solutions of the problems that were faced by women and Turkey. At the end of the conference, Turkey identified the need to launch a project targeting women in the 15–29 age groups. As a first step, the preparation of a pilot project was deemed necessary.

---

<sup>4</sup> Prepared by Prof. Gülay Toksöz of Ankara University Department of Labour Economics and Industrial Relations of the Political Science Faculty

The ILO's Decent Work Country Priorities for Turkey and The United Nations Development Assistance Framework (UNDAF) for Turkey provided the "road map" for understanding the context of the current project. In line with the ILO's prevailing policy on the improvement of women's employment and given the fact that women are poorly employed in Turkey, the ILO Ankara Office, in cooperation with İŞKUR, launched a project in January 2009 on enhancing women's employment in Turkey, entitled "Pilot project on active labour market policies for advancing Gender equality through decent employment for women in Turkey" (Annex I).

The project was implemented by the ILO Ankara Office and İŞKUR which was established in 1946 as the Employment Brokerage Agency (İİBK). It was restructured by Law No.4904 (published in the Official Gazette of 5 July 2003) to respond to the changing conditions in the labour market. İSKUR is an authority that is a related agency of the Directorate of Social Security Authority, an affiliate of the Ministry of Labour and Social Security, an autonomous public agency in terms of administration and finance, but is subject to the provisions of private law, as it constitutes a corporate entity.

İŞKUR is active in all provinces. The local organizations are composed of provincial directorates. Branch directorates are established in the districts where the central population numbers 100,000 or more, or where the number of workers affiliated to the social security institution is more than 10,000.

The main responsibilities of İŞKUR are to:

- assist in activities for developing a national employment policy;
- compile, analyze, interpret and publish labour market data;
- analyze labour force requirements;
- implement active and passive labour market programmes;
- mediate in view of finding jobs and employees;
- permit and inspect private employment offices;
- publish the data based on the registration of the Institution in the form of monthly bulletins and annual reports,
- help job seekers to find jobs and help employers to find workers; and
- provide job and career counselling services and training programmes for improving job search methods.

İŞKUR has been implementing projects to improve the employment situation in the country, such as the Certificated Rural Workers Project which has been developed in order to enhance the working capability of rural workers, raise the quality and standards of their services, and create employment for unemployed and poor rural people. Another project it has implemented is the Apprentices Project which has promoted vocational courses designed for unemployed youngsters who are in economic and social deprivation to provide them with technology training in order to place vocational high school and/or high school graduates into SMEs' vacancies.

İŞKUR has been cooperating with the EU, the World Bank and the ILO to improve the labour market participation of Turkish women. These cooperative efforts include: the Active Labour Market Programmes (ALMP)<sup>5</sup> Project (EU), the Privatization Social Support Project (World Bank) the Active Labour Market Programmes Project (ALMPP 2 EU). The total budget of the ALMPP 2 amounts to € 20 Million of which € 16 is allocated to a grant scheme. In the 28 provinces that have been selected, grants will be given out to increase the employability of women and youth. One of the pillars of the project is the institution building component. The objective of the programme is to increase capacity within the eligible provinces to design and implement effective active labour market measures in order to increase the employability of women and youth. It is expected that at least 50 per cent of the target group who benefited from the grant scheme will be employed in the medium term.

The “Pilot project on active labour market policies for advancing gender equality through decent employment for women in Turkey” was carried out between January 2009 and March 2010. Based on criteria including feasibility and effectiveness, the provinces of Ankara and Konya in Central Anatolia and Gaziantep in South-eastern Anatolia were selected to implement this project for the promotion of women’s employment since very low participation of women in the labour force is observed in Konya and Gaziantep. TurkStat (2006) data indicate that for women in the 15-24 age groups, labour market participation is 23.5 per cent in Ankara, 8.8 per cent in Gaziantep, and 15.9 per cent in Konya. One of the reasons for selecting the province of Ankara is that despite being the capital of the Republic, figures for Ankara are very low and reflect a definite need to improve the women’s employment situation. Also, the project would be efficiently and closely monitored and followed up by the ILO-Ankara Office and by İŞKUR as both are located in Ankara.

The project aimed to improve the capacity of İŞKUR’s staff and social partners at provincial level; contribute to the internalization of the gender-sensitive approach to women’s employment; contribute to promoting women’s employment in the project provinces through active labour market policies, and serve as a model for other provinces in realizing gender equality in employment. In the course of this project, the ILO Ankara Office, in association with the ILO International Training Center (ITC), provided technical assistance to enhance the knowledge, technical and partnership skills of the staff not only of İŞKUR, but of social partners as well. Furthermore, direct support was provided to women in the project provinces in order to improve their employability through training on various areas such as women’s human rights, skills required for employability, job-seeking skills, entrepreneurship skills and self-employment.

The project aimed to improve the capacity of İŞKUR’s staff and social partners at provincial level; contribute to the internalization of the gender-sensitive approach to women’s employment; contribute to promoting women’s employment in the project provinces through active labour market policies, and serve as a model for other provinces in realizing gender equality in employment. In the course of this project, the ILO Office, in association with the ILO/ITC, provided technical assistance to enhance the knowledge, technical and partnership skills of the staff not only of İŞKUR, but of relevant ministries and social partners as well.

---

<sup>5</sup> Active labour market policies (ALMPs) aim at averting lay-offs, easing the pathway back to work for those who are displaced and, in general, reducing unemployment and underemployment. ALMPs include a wide range of approaches to improve workers’ prospects of finding gainful employment or increasing their earnings capacity e.g. matching workers to jobs, enhancing workers’ skills, providing employment incentives, and targeting assistance to disadvantaged youth, persons with disabilities and other groups typically disadvantaged in the labour market.

Furthermore, direct support was provided to women in the project provinces in order to improve their employability through training on various areas such as human rights, skills required for employability, job-seeking skills, entrepreneurship skills and self-employment.

The project also worked very closely in the selected provinces with the Provincial Employment and Vocational Education Boards (PEVEB). The PEVEBs were established in 2008 (Official Gazette dated October 21, 2008, Issue: 27031). These boards are cornerstones that can contribute immensely to enhance employment and vocational training at the provincial level. Their major responsibilities include:

- the formulation of employment and vocational training policies at the provincial levels;
- the creation of employment and vocational training opportunities;
- enhancement of efficiency and productivity of vocational training and employment at the provincial levels;
- planning and decision making on relevant matters;
- recommendations to the related institutions; and
- labour market analysis in order to determine the labour markets and vocational training needs.

The boards meet every three months under the auspices of the Provincial Governor. The members of the boards include: the Provincial Director of Education, the Mayor, the General Secretary of the Special Provincial Administration, the Provincial Director of Trade and Industry, the Provincial Director of İŞKUR, the Head of the Chambers of Trade and Industry, Representatives of employers' and workers' organizations, the Head of the Chambers of the Confederation of handicrafts and tradesmen, the Head of the Organization of the Handicapped, as well as academicians from universities as identified by the Governor.

Within the context of the project, a Project Steering Committee (PSC) was established. The PSC met quarterly and was mainly responsible for coordinating and reviewing the implementation of the project. This involved assessing progress made, obstacles encountered, ensuring cooperation and coordination in activities relating to the implementation of the project, making recommendations for actions, and ensuring information flow among organizations. The PSC was composed of representatives of the Confederation of Turkish Trade Unions, (TÜRK-İŞ), the Confederation of Turkish Real Trade Unions (HAK-İŞ), the Confederation of Progressive Trade Unions (DİSK), Turkish Confederation of Employer Associations (TİSK) and İŞKUR; and the ILO was an observer.

The project also worked very closely with the UN Gender Thematic Group in Turkey. This Group (comprised of UNFPA, WHO, UNDP, FAO, IOM, UNICEF and ILO) meets regularly to integrate women in the development process. The project coordinator regularly briefed the team and received feedback on project implementation.

#### **1.4. Major Outcomes**

The project outcomes in terms of impact at policy, capacity building and individual levels are briefly described below.

Firstly, Active Labour Market Policies (ALMPs) specifically targeting women's employment and labour force entry are designed and implemented by İŞKUR in the project provinces through enhanced technical capacity. The project achieved this outcome through two outputs: (a) an analysis of labour market needs in target provinces; and (b) the enhancement of knowledge, as well as the enhancement of the technical and partnership skills of staff of İŞKUR and social partners enabling them to contribute to the promotion of women's employment.

The activities carried out to achieve these outputs included: assessment of women's employment and social development in target provinces; sharing the results of the assessment of women's employment with Provincial Employment and Vocational Education Boards in target provinces; setting up of a national level project steering committee that will meet regularly to monitor project achievements; organization of a national conference on women's employment held with relevant stakeholders, and a workshop to identify ALMP strategies, particularly for women in the target provinces.

Secondly, at the level of local governance of the institutions in the pilot provinces (Ankara, Gaziantep, Konya) mechanisms for increasing the knowledge and rights-based governance of women's employment are designed and supported. The project achieved this outcome through two outputs: (a) inter-institutional coordination mechanisms and consultative bodies were supported in Ankara, Gaziantep and Konya so that they could monitor the employment situation, with a focus on women's entry into the labour force; and (b) the technical and administrative skills of İŞKUR were enhanced to allow women to benefit from Active Labour Market Policies.

The project carried out the following activities in order to achieve these outputs: assessment of the knowledge and of the statistical information needs of the Provincial Employment and Vocational Training Boards for monitoring women's unemployment and the reasons for women's exclusion from labour markets; conducting awareness-raising meetings on women's employment in the target provinces; formulating recommendations to be submitted to the PEVEBs; setting up and delivering training for İŞKUR officials to achieve better rates of women's employment by improving the match between the unemployed and open vacancies (training by ITC, Turin); development of a consolidated package of services for women job seekers to be provided by İŞKUR.

Finally, at the individual level, targeted young women enter and remain in the labour market. The project achieved this outcome through enhancing the skills, knowledge and attitudes of women in the target provinces in order to better position them to enter selected sectors of the labour market.

This involved the following activities: training the target group on women's human rights; training the targeted women on basic skills required for employability such as written and oral communication and basic life skills training; provision of specific skills and vocational training to targeted women in the identified areas based on the report produced by the project "*Preliminary Steps and Recommendations for Promoting Women's Employment in Three Cities of Turkey*"; provision of training, with the collaboration of the education faculties of universities, on job-seeking skills and smoother school-to-work transition (for women in the 15–29 age group); and training young graduates on entrepreneurship skills and self-employment.

## **2. PURPOSE, SCOPE AND CLIENTS OF THE EVALUATION**

### **2.1. Purpose**

The evaluation was designed to assess the overall programme performance and outcomes of the “Pilot project on active labour market policies for advancing gender equality through decent employment for women in Turkey” (TOR Annex II). The evaluation covered the following areas: (a) determine whether the project has achieved its stated objectives and outcomes and explain why/why not; (b) provide recommendations on programme improvement and further action; and (c) where necessary, identify the possible need to refine strategy.

This assessment was based mainly on:

- interviews with key people for the project coordination and search of existing technical documents, reports, and briefings;
- visits, meetings and interviews with consultants and staff related to the project results; and
- the closing seminar of the project in Konya.

The evaluation was carried out by an external consultant. All major stakeholders were consulted and informed throughout the evaluation and its independence was not compromised during the process. The evaluation covered the project in the three target provinces of Ankara, Gaziantep, and Konya. It served the following - external and internal - clients’ groups: the ultimate beneficiaries of the project – young women from the ages of 15 to 29; the ILO tripartite constituents and national project partners; the ILO management at HQ and at the country office; and the project staff. The list of people interviewed is attached as Annex III.

### **2.2. Methodology**

The evaluator had prepared interview guidelines including the major issues to be discussed with each of the types of interviewees. The interviews themselves were carried out using a semi-structured interview format to allow for spontaneous consultations. Discussions tended to start with free-ranging responses to general questions, followed by more specific questions on topics not yet covered. The method was successful in putting the interviewees at ease and resulted in frank and free answers.

The evaluator reviewed the background materials of the project<sup>6</sup> before conducting interviews or trips to the region. The evaluator had a pre-trip consultation with ILO representatives and the project team in Ankara. The objective of the meeting was to reach a common understanding regarding the status of the project, the priority of assessment questions, the

---

<sup>6</sup> Decent work country priorities, country briefs, national policy documents, project document logical framework, work plans, TORs, surveys, studies, analytical papers produced, reports on specific activities, training tools and service packages used and/or produced, publications and promo materials.

available data sources and data collection instruments and an outline of the final assessment report. The following topics were covered: status of logistical arrangements, project background and materials, key evaluation questions and priorities, data sources and data collection methods, roles and responsibilities of the assessment team, outline of the final report.

Individual or group interviews were conducted with the following: project staff, the ILO Director in Ankara, and other relevant ILO staff representatives from the following groups: National Project Steering Committees members and constituents, Government staff who have worked with the project and a few representatives of the target group (e.g. young women looking for jobs who benefited from the project). The list of people interviewed is attached as Annex IV.

The evaluator visited Ankara, Gaziantep, and Konya. Meetings were scheduled in advance of the field visits by the ILO project staff, in accordance with the evaluator's requests and consistent with the terms of reference. On the final day of the field visits, the evaluator presented preliminary findings, conclusions, and recommendations to the constituents and the ILO field staff. The draft report was subsequently shared with the ILO field staff and constituents for comment.

Upon completion of the report, the evaluator provided a debriefing to the ILO Ankara office on the evaluation findings, conclusions and recommendations.

### **3. DESCRIPTION OF THE PROJECT AND ITS IMPLEMENTATION: PROJECT STATUS**

The "Pilot project on active labour market policies for advancing gender equality through decent employment for women in Turkey" which was launched in January 2009, aimed to contribute to promoting women's employment in the project provinces of Ankara, Gaziantep and Konya through active labour market policies and awareness-raising on gender equality and women's human rights. This project aimed to improve the capacity of the İŞKUR staff and social partners at the provincial level and in turn to contribute to enhancing women's employment in the project provinces by increasing women's labour force participation and referring women to active labour market programmes. In order to reach this objective, the project adopted three strategies that are cohesively related and supportive of each other.

The project targeted the following groups: 35 İŞKUR staff in the targeted provinces received capacity building in gender matters; 746 women benefited directly from the vocational training; 731 women taking the vocational training benefited from a women's human rights education programme; 112 women benefited from entrepreneurship training; 162 students benefited from training on job-seeking skills; and 60 PEVEB members in the three provinces were reached for networking and policy inputs.

The project outcomes are listed below.

#### **3.1. Knowledge Building**

The first objective of the project was to enhance capacities at the provincial levels by generating information through research and data collection; mainstreaming and advocacy; and training for capacity building. First, the project provided technical and financial support for conducting three important researches which led to knowledge-building on women and

their employment situation in the selected cities. This information was shared with İŞKUR and the PEVEBs in the targeted provinces. The accurate and updated knowledge obtained on women and their employment status was then used for policy and advocacy. İŞKUR's capacity was also enhanced through the training of its staff regarding gender and employment. The project has been effective in producing a vast number of knowledge products of excellent quality and thus played a key role in developing a greater understanding of the problem through knowledge-generation efforts.

*Preliminary Steps and Recommendations for Promoting Women's Employment in Three Cities of Turkey* (Yıldız Ecevit, June 2009). This study was undertaken to investigate the reasons for low labour force participation of women in Ankara, Gaziantep and Konya and to discuss what initiatives can be taken to promote women's employment. Based on the findings, the research concluded that labour market analyses were of significant importance and should be regularly conducted by İŞKUR. Additionally, it emphasized that all information collection, storing and analysis of work in relation to the issues of employment and unemployment should be gender-based. The evaluation reveals that the study is an important source of information for İŞKUR and the PEVEBs. If these institutions are to operate in a more consistent and strategic fashion and construct sound and coherent policies on women and employment, regular analyses of the labour market — by sector, by occupation, and level of skill — are needed in order to be able to assess demand trends and the likely requirements for women. The interviews also pointed out that this report helped partners to gain knowledge on the analysis of labour market performance for policy formulation purposes with a gender perspective, and on understanding gender stereotypes affecting women's access to the labour market.

*Labour Markets in Crisis Conditions from a Gender Perspective* (Gülay Toksöz, December 2009). The purpose of this study was to address the effects of the crisis on the labour market from a gender perspective and to reveal how differently the crisis affects males and females in terms of access to employment, forms of employment and unemployment. It also examines the impacts of the crisis on labour markets specifically in the provinces of Ankara, Konya and Gaziantep from a gender perspective. The report includes comprehensive recommendations for enhancing the employment of women in these provinces. It emphasizes the crucial role that İŞKUR should play and stresses the important responsibilities of the Chambers of Industry and Commerce, the Chambers of Artisans, and women's organizations in this regard. The evaluation findings strongly suggest that the study be used as a centerpiece in İŞKUR's efforts to adjust policies, strategies, approaches and methods in order to achieve optimal success in enhancing the employability of women in Turkey.

The factors that affect the labour market entry of women with recommendations for the Provincial Employment and Vocational Training Boards (Hakan Ercan, Ayşe Gündüz Hoşgör and Özlem Yılmaz, January, 2010). This third research emphasizes the low rates of women's participation in the labour market and proposes strategies to remedy the situation. The research has led to a better understanding of the factors that affect the labour market entry of women in Turkey and has helped to provide an analysis of the relations and effects of macro-economic policy and inequality. The outcome findings and recommendations are important and need to be considered in the formulation of new programmes. The evaluation recommends that a concerted effort be made to bring the results of this study into policy and strategy development, for example through workshops, with the participation of PEVEBs and relevant partners in which the findings and their implications would be discussed.



The three reports produced by the project are particularly striking and of great benefit to partners as they increase the understanding of gender and highlight the importance of improved gender equality at work and in the community. The evaluation found the reports very beneficial in looking for the goal of gender equality in the world of work and identify where and why blockages to labour market equity continue to exist. The project deserves praise for the production of three comprehensive reports of very good quality, a high level that was achieved despite the relative short duration of the project

### **3.2. Mainstreaming the Issues of Women and Employment into the Provincial Employment and Vocational Education Boards**

The mainstreaming of women and employment issues into the PEVEBs is the most noteworthy contribution of the project. The issue of gender and employment was brought to the fore in meetings of the PEVEBs in all three provinces, namely, Gaziantep, Konya and Ankara. These boards serve as a consultative and coordination body and aim to provide bottom-up policy advice. They have tripartite attributes with representatives from the government (İŞKUR), employers' and workers' organizations and are sustainable governance mechanisms for effective coordination as they have access to knowledge and data about vocational education and employment. These types of boards as organizational structures with capacities for participatory planning at district and local levels are an effective strategy for increasing and promoting women's employment. This multi-sectoral platform provides the opportunity for all concerned agencies to involve local stakeholders and local administrators who are responsive to locally articulated needs, while working within national policies and strategies.

Realizing the crucial policy role of the PEVEBs, the project took strategic steps to mainstream the issues of women and employment into these boards. The strategic aim of this was to create an opportunity for a convergence of efforts which would result in the generation of local policy environments which would be supportive of employment for women. The objectives of this strategic approach were: a) to ensure that the problems of women and employment are addressed in a multi-sectoral and integrated manner; b) to achieve programme objectives on a sufficiently large scale through the creation of a supportive institutional and policy environment; and c) to enhance regional capacity to analyse the situation of women and employment, draw up programmes and provide follow-up and coordination for all matters related to this issue. Great advances have been made in the commitments of the PEVEBs to create employment for women, and these commitments, which can be translated into resources and improved local programmes, have been a major success. The project's efforts are commendable, and even outstanding, for mainstreaming the issues of women and employment into these local mechanisms and processes. Findings of the evaluation reveal that there is now a better understanding of gender and of the challenges it faces in the area of employment.

Stakeholders have also stressed that a second outcome of working with PEVEBs was the launch of sound cooperation among different stakeholders, an important factor which helped to ensure effective implementation of the project. The interviews conducted in the three provinces demonstrated that all stakeholders at province levels, as well as the beneficiaries, cooperated well in project activities. The stakeholders were also satisfied with the good coordination provided by the project which is expected to lead to success in mobilizing human, financial and technical resources. Collaboration was smooth in most instances although the project did need to address some inter-project concerns. Overall, the evaluation

finds that despite the short period of its duration, the project played a key role in generating collaboration among partners, enhancing capacity in gender-issues and awareness-raising.

One very significant outcome of the project is related to the increased participation of women's organizations in the PEVEBs. Consulted stakeholders pointed out that the project encouraged the women's organizations to attend the PEVEB meetings which they had previously not done. Their active involvement in a local policy-making body is a step in the right direction for which the project deserves praise.

### 3.3. Capacity Building

The project basically aimed to build and enhance capacities at all levels. The term "capacity building" is used here in its broadest sense to include all initiatives that contribute to enhancing both human and institutional capacities, i.e. awareness, vision, skills and knowledge, infrastructure, resource mobilization, etc., which are needed to create an enabling social, economic and political environment in dealing with the issue of women and employment. Training seminars on "Analyzing Public Employment Services from a Gender Perspective" were provided by The ILO International Training Centre in Gaziantep and Ankara to increase the capacity of İŞKUR's staff and social partners at provincial level in the area of gender-sensitive active labour market policies. In all, 35 İŞKUR staff members were trained in Ankara and Gaziantep, with Konya, İŞKUR staff members joining the training in Ankara. The workshops' general aims were: to examine how public employment services contribute to the economic, social and educational policy of Turkey; how a gender sensitive approach could help promote employment by contributing to the reduction of the mismatch between skills supply and demand in the labour market; and, understand the decent work agenda and how to contribute to this ILO goal. Sessions were designed with a focus on Public Employment Services (PES)<sup>7</sup> on the following topics: 1) The role of PES: Current trends in PES best practices and recommended areas of intervention, such as job broking job or training placement, vocational and "institutional" guidance, interview techniques and simulation exercises; 2) Gender mainstreaming approach: stereotypes and discrimination based on gender in the world of work, gender concepts, access and constraint, direct and indirect discrimination stereotypes in the world of work; 3) Training on the use and management of labour market information: active labour policies and local employment trends, basic concepts of labour market information, labour market analysis and labour market policies, practical exercises, vocational and institutional guidance.

This strategy of building the capacity of İŞKUR staff was very relevant and the project's focus on capacity building has shown to be correct. As a result of the enhanced capacity, İŞKUR staff will be enabled to implement similar programmes on a larger scale and further enable local leaders to sustain the impacts of the project. The increased capacity was also demonstrated in the ownership of objectives and achievements of the project by provincial İŞKUR staff. The staff interviewed in Ankara, Gaziantep and Konya presented a clear understanding of the importance of the issue and demonstrated a high-level of commitment to objectives and achievements of the project. The ownership shown by provincial İŞKUR staff was extremely strong and most impressive. Even though the duration of the project was quite short, its design could have paid more attention to the creation of an effective network among

---

<sup>7</sup> The basic purpose of *public employment services* (PES) in all economic climates is to facilitate the adjustment of firms and individuals to changing labour market conditions. In these challenging times, PES are trying to increase job-matching services to help the larger number of workers seeking jobs to find the jobs that become available, implement public-private partnerships to boost investments in training, and work with employers and workers to find mutually agreed arrangements for work-sharing

trained staff. Such a network could have offered participants a chance to support each other and share good experiences in the application of their new skills in their individual work.

### 3.4. Vocational Training

The project's second aim was to enhance the employability of women. In order to achieve this, vocational courses in 13 different occupations were organized with the support of the Provincial Directorates of İŞKUR in target provinces and 746 women trainees have benefited. Capacity building was not only confined to skills training but also included consciousness-raising regarding women's human rights and gender issues in the world of work among women and men. This increased the beneficiaries' awareness of their gendered condition and unequal relations, thus sowing the seeds of change towards gender equality in households, communities and at work. Beneficiaries received new and increased knowledge and skills in several areas and this has created strategic opportunities for the future of the women participants.

In total, 746 women benefited from the vocational training course, 62 per cent in Ankara, 22 per cent in Gaziantep and 16 per cent in Konya. The age group 15 – 29 made up 71 per cent of the participants, and 82 per cent of the total group had an education level that was above high school level. The courses were organized as follows: **Ankara:** television video editing, beautician training, sales consultancy, computerized accounting, three-dimension graphic design (Tridimeks), medical secretary employment, sewing machine operator, child care training; **Gaziantep:** advanced secretarial skills, computerized accounting, carpet design, sales consultancy, office management; **Konya:** clothing stylist, sales consultancy, office management and secretarial and computerized accounting.

One very important aspect of the project design was that the strategies were built on nationally owned schemes. İŞKUR already has a big nationwide occupational training programme implemented in 81 provinces in Turkey. The programme has its own budget and is carried out in close cooperation with the Ministry of Education. The current project took this opportunity to use this training programme as the basis for action and expanded İŞKUR courses to include the Women Human Rights Education Programme. The project mobilized people from the existing structure of local government instead of creating a new structure for skills training, and took advantage of locally available financial and technical resources. The successful mobilization of resources and commitment of community officials are extremely commendable. The project made efficient use of the short amount of time available for implementation of the vocational training component through the use of İŞKURs existing mechanisms. A good model for producing synergies between partners has been created by working with and through local institutions as partners.

The project worked on developing technical skills of women in a number of key sub-sectors with local employment potential. However, a fundamental lesson to be drawn from the project is that a solid two – three years is necessary in order to assess the results and outcomes of vocational training, as several issues which take time, such as support and follow-up, influence the quality of the impact of such training and need to be considered. For example, there was not enough time to provide support to women in their search for a job, to monitor them, help them create support networks or provide follow-up training. The very short period of the project's duration has thus hampered the evaluation of the effectiveness of its results.

### 3.5. Women's Human Rights Education Programme for Women (WHREP)

As an integral part of the vocational training, women trainees were provided with the Women's Human Rights Education Programme for Women (WHREP). The main objectives of this training were to enable women to gain awareness of their rights as equal citizens, support women in developing strategies for the implementation of their legal rights in daily life and raise women's consciousness of how customary practices, i.e. 'unwritten' laws, often limit or violate their rights. The trainers of the General Directorate of Social Services and Child Protection Association (SHÇEK) conducted the training. A total of 731 out of 746 participating women joined the training.

The Women's Human Rights Training Programme<sup>8</sup> was developed by Women for Women's Human Rights – NEW WAYS, through a series of pilot applications between 1995 and 1997, first in the shantytown areas of Istanbul, then in the southeastern region of Turkey. The main hypothesis underlying this programme is that if women are given the opportunity to learn their rights and acquire the necessary skills to take action, they might begin to “do something” individually and/or collectively, such as speak out against an infringement of their rights. This programme aims to equip women for social change by helping them become “citizens” who hold the government accountable and who work as “partners” with other actors in civil society and the public sector towards meaningful participation in a democratic society. The goals of the programme are: a) to create awareness of global norms and national laws on human rights and women's human rights; b) to encourage social action leading to the remedy of violations of women's human rights, as well as to promote greater respect and application of those rights by both the state and society; c) to fill the gap left by the limited efforts of the state in creating awareness and education programmes on human rights and women's human rights.

For the first time in Turkey, a module of women's human rights (WHR) was added to vocational training. The course addressed a broad range of issues related to WHR and the topics of the training included: presentation of women's human rights; needs analysis and women's human rights, constitutional and civil; violence against women; domestic violence and strategies against violence; women's economic rights; communication skills; gender sensitive parenting and rights of the child; women and sexuality; reproductive rights; women and politics; and, feminism and women's movements.

The evaluator was able to interview a total of 30 women who participated in the WHREP. A focus group discussion in Gaziantep was also held with the 20 participants. The comments made during focus group discussions and interviews demonstrated that overall the participants increased their knowledge and understanding of their rights and were gratified to learn that there were global and national networks that support these rights. They also benefited from a better understanding of gender and improved gender equality at home and in the community, and it was evident that women's participation in decision-making increased in their families and communities. Both the questionnaire results and the focus groups discussions indicate

---

<sup>8</sup> Since 1998, this programme is being implemented with the collaboration of a Turkish governmental agency, the General Directorate for Social Services and Child Protection (SHÇEK). WWHR-NEW WAYS has expanded the training programme to women living in seven different regions of Turkey through the Directorate's community centres. WWHR-New Ways has conducted trainer training for the social workers of the community centres who in turn have started offering training to women at the community centres under close supervision and monitoring of WWHR-New Ways. The cooperation proved to be very yielding. The partnership created the possibility for the sustainable and widespread implementation of the Women's Human Rights Training Programme at the grassroots level.

that the women participants became more visible and vocal in their families and communities. At the end of the course an evaluation was conducted and selected notes are attached as Annex IV

One of the most important changes reported repeatedly by respondents was their awareness of gender-based discrimination. They said that they began to understand that their problems are not just individual problems attributable to their own faults, but stem from gender roles rooted in particular societal and historical contexts. They indicated how relieved they were to see that many women had similar concerns and that coming to the training felt like “therapy”, experiencing solidarity with them. Most of the participants interviewed said that the project deserves praise for setting up the WHREP. They have gained an overwhelming amount of self-confidence, raised their awareness of gender-based discrimination and developed a positive attitude towards solidarity with other women. Some typical statements in each of the cities included the following:

- I have learned about our rights and now know where to go for remedy.
- I have learned about the new Civil Code.
- I have learned that we can seek our rights and that we can do it with knowledge and awareness.
- I now have knowledge and understanding of women’s human rights.
- I have changed how I perceive myself as a woman and my self-identity, in attitudes and perceptions of gender relations in the family and within the community.
- I have increased self-confidence and awareness of gender-based discrimination.
- I have learnt how to say I am a woman. I exist and I am here.
- I was able to break out of my box and see the world from a different angle.
- I knew we had rights but they seemed so far away; now I know they are real and close to me.
- Relations are more peaceful in the family.

Project partners as well as the trainers found the WHREP extremely useful, appropriate, and interesting. Trainers were enthusiastic about the participative aspects of the training and noted that the observable change in the women was incredible. Many staff members of the agencies were aware of the changes in the women as well. The trainers who were interviewed believed that the sustainability of the impact on women beneficiaries would likely be evident when the women apply what they learn to improve their lives. They have observed that most women have applied the new knowledge and skills successfully, gained confidence in them and developed a strong motivation for new learning.

There were cases, however, where the partners were worried that a full benefit of the training would not be derived from such a limited number of hours spent on such complex issues. It is also difficult to evaluate impact in the long term and they suggest the need for follow-up activities to sustain interest, as well as possible refresher programmes.

Some also noted that the project did not use a clear monitoring tool to gather information on the outcomes of the WHREP training activities. This meant that the project could not track the extent to which participants had absorbed the contents of the training and the obstacles they encountered in the application of new skills and concepts. Refresher training is essential. It is also not clear how the project could check this without the use of a thorough monitoring tool.

### **3.6. Training on Job-Seeking Skills**

Additionally, seminars for university students aimed at increasing skills for job searching and for written and verbal communication were organized in Konya Selçuk University and Gaziantep University. These were given by Human Resources Management and Corporate Communications Consultant/Trainer within two-day training programmes at the above universities. The aim of the training was to equip graduate or graduate-level students with necessary skills to make a professional start before they face the labour market and support them in a smoother school-to-work transition. A total of 59 students from Selçuk University and 103 students from Gaziantep University studying at different departments actively participated in this two-day training. Following a brief introduction on the ILO Ankara Office and the women's employment project, the content of the training included the following topics: Responsibilities of working life; Various job-finding tips; How to prepare a curriculum vitae; Making a professional impression; How to dress for a job-interview; Interview techniques and interview types; Behaviour codes in working life; Expectations in working life; Behaviours in new working places: and, New rules in working life.

The students found these seminars to be extremely relevant to their needs and suggested the expansion of the seminars to all universities. The project indeed developed significant ties with the universities, but due to the short duration of the training period these ties may lack continuity. İŞKUR could therefore play a very positive role by developing related strategic long-term institutional and programmatic arrangements with these and other universities.

### **3.7. Entrepreneurship Training for Women**

Within the context of the project, entrepreneurship training for women was provided by the ECORYS research and Consulting Company to a total of 112 women who lived in 12 different neighborhoods in the area of the Şahinbey Municipality in Gaziantep. The course managed to ensure 100 per cent attendance rate. The course content was designed and tailor-made based on the visits made to these neighborhood and on the profile of the targeted women. The courses lasted 15 hours and the topics included were: Raising self-confidence; Knowing yourself; Developing business ideas; Getting to know the market; What to do to start your own business; Introduction to business management; Marketing skills; Customers relations and sales; Production and operation; Planning for finances; and, Starting your own business

Most of the women had a primary school diploma and they all came from poor backgrounds. The courses were designed in a participatory manner and the course materials used were adapted to their educational levels. The focus was on the production of home-made goods (food, handicrafts etc.). Women also talked about the blocks they face in starting their own business which are attributable to traditional sex roles and pressure from families. Ten of the women definitely wanted to start their own business, 30 per cent stated that that they could start their own business after further training, and 80 per cent wished that the course had been longer. The sessions on raising self-confidence were the most popular among the participants. During the evaluation interviews the municipality staff strongly recommended that raising

self-confidence should be an integral part of any training given to women with a view to increasing their employability. They also pointed out the need to scale-up and intensify these efforts. The evaluation also found that the project has made an impact on the lives of women by raising awareness on gender equality, and by providing technical training for entrepreneurs. Those activities were very valuable in bringing together women who live in disadvantaged communities. However, an intensified focus is needed to develop local capacity to support, track and follow up on the work that has been carried out with these women.

### **3.8. Job Placement**

The project targeted young women to enter and remain in the labour market. In the target provinces this was achieved through improving their skills, knowledge and attitudes to better position them to enter selected sectors of the labour market. At inception, it was envisaged, based on İŞKURs estimates, that approximately 183 women would be placed into the job market upon the completion of the vocational training courses (124 in Ankara, 49 in Konya and 10 in Gaziantep). Currently the figures are lower than projected. At the time of the evaluation, 61 women in Konya, 12 in Gaziantep and 21 in Ankara were working. The stakeholder's interviews gave several reasons for this. First, the people interviewed are of the opinion that women in Turkey are adversely affected by economic crises. They are often affected by the negative consequences of economic crises in different ways than men, owing to their joint responsibilities at work and in the home. Moreover, as they are more likely than men to be in low-paid, precarious employment, they face a higher risk of immediate poverty when they become unemployed. Secondly, due to the very short period of the project, the evaluation came immediately after the completion of the vocational training courses. It was very unfortunate that the time of the evaluation coincided with the completion of the courses. This did not allow enough time for the trainees to be placed in the job market. The evaluator strongly believes that the short time constraints the accuracy of the employment figures. As the trainees are still completing their final preparations to look for jobs and are just gaining their confidence to go on to the job market, there will be no accuracy in the evaluation of the numbers of women employed. Therefore, for these two reasons, more time would be needed to achieve the results expected

### **3.9. Awareness-Raising**

Apart from ensuring and coordinating the involvement of all the actors at provincial levels the project played a key role during the implementation by advocating and facilitating dialogue amongst local actors in targeted communities and community-based organizations. The ILO Gender Campaign Brochures were translated into Turkish and widely distributed. At least six provincial and one national meeting were held each attending more than seventy people. These meetings attracted a lot of media attention particularly in Konya and Gaziantep. These events had a snowball effect which the evaluation believes resulted in reaching more beneficiaries than originally anticipated.

### **3.10. Project Monitoring**

The monitoring of the project was carried out through almost daily contact with the ILO Ankara Office, and mainly the PC and İŞKUR Provincial Offices. The PCs monitored activities of the project in each city and with regard to each partner with regularity, as evidenced in the comments from partners. The reports covered the main issues. The evaluation finding revealed that the project made intensive efforts to ensure continuous and

timely flow of relevant information between decision-making institutions and the micro-level. The success of these arrangements required better linkages, communication channels and cohesion between local, provincial and national levels. Project results were systematically exchanged between and among different levels. This was crucial for achieving the outcomes and goals.

### **3.11. Project Management**

Most of the partners interviewed for the evaluation reported that the excellent leadership and strategic direction provided by the ILO and İŞKUR team was a major success factor. Partners believe that the ILO /İŞKUR team worked well, had a good communication style, transparent decision-making, and excellent knowledge-sharing skills. The team's people-coaching and mentoring skills, empowerment and partnership approaches, mobilization of expertise, as well as knowledge and technical skills were highly praised during the interviews. The team conducted effective policy dialogue with government officials and ensured the inclusion of women and employment concerns in the PEVEB agenda and development frameworks, and created and built strategic partnerships with NGOs, donors, and other key stakeholders and partners. According to the partners, the effective communication facilitated by the ILO/İŞKUR team was one of the determining factors of the success of this programme. This positive communication approach allowed stakeholders to be aware of their responsibilities towards the programme, and even in some cases to be aware of their ownership of it, which in the longer term led to sustainability.

## **4. FINDINGS, LESSONS LEARNED**

Some of the key lessons learned include:

The project activities were fully tailored to the local context which led to the extensive participation of all interested local stakeholders. Moreover, the initiatives undertaken by the project were based on ongoing activities of partner organizations (İŞKUR and PEVEB) in the selected target communities. The project allowed for the creation of a project's implementation structure, which was comprised of a truly balanced and sustainable local policy and which supported the key local players. The fact that required knowledge of local reality and dynamics already existed was an important success factor.

Adopting gender lenses all through the project processes, developing and adapting relevant tools to guide action in this area, as well as intensive policy dialogue at the provincial level greatly facilitated gender mainstreaming in employment promotion by using gender perspectives.

The participatory approach adopted by the project played a catalytic role in the development of a culture of participation and partnership in the provinces. As a result, the project was able to promote a common definition of priorities, strengthen local capacities, search for synergies through networking practices, and provide the local women's groups with a voice and an opportunity.

The project had the mandate and expertise to carry out the objectives laid out, but naturally lacked the full leverage to bring about the policy, institutional and philosophical change needed without more support from key influential institutions at regional and national levels. To mainstream women and employment issues throughout requires influencing major PEVEB governmental and nongovernmental actors in order to change policies and practices.



In many instances, the work of the project has been catalytic in that it has enabled processes to take place that were otherwise unlikely to occur. While acknowledging achievements and progress to date, stakeholders who were consulted also widely agreed that the full implementation of gender sensitive employment policies across sectors and levels of society is a long term process that will require considerable time.

Although progress has been made, a great deal more needs to be done with regard to ensuring policy development. A potential second phase of the project should try and expand work to include other ministries which are important for increasing labour market participation of women.

The evaluator has noted that much has been learned over the course of the project about the technical issues concerning vocational training. Vocational training is more beneficial to women if it is accompanied by personal and social skills development.

The project used a conceptual framework which divided project activities into three categories: macro-level initiatives including the involvement of the NSC at the national policy making level, meso-level initiatives including capacity strengthening at institutional level in provinces (İŞKUR, PEVEB), and micro-level actions with individual women. The use of this three-pronged approach was useful to ensure that the issues of women were addressed simultaneously at each level.

If there is one key lesson to be learned from these case studies, it is the value of partnership between men and women. It is not women or men working alone who can end gender-based discrimination in employment. Rather, it is the partnerships between them that have the greatest impact and reach.

## **5. CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS**

### **5.1. Conclusions**

This project aimed to provide technical assistance on improving the existing capacity to design, develop and implement policies to attract and retain more women in employment particularly by increasing labour participation of women. This was realized by designing local strategies to increase the promotion of women's employment and to develop a model; to produce labour market analysis and to identify employment opportunities accessible to women's groups; and, to enhance career information, and awareness-raising. Substantial gains were made in creating awareness of women and employment issues both at the national and local levels. Innovative and comprehensive approaches were adopted for awareness-raising. Developing strategic partnerships with a broad range of actors and partners was given priority, including ministries and government sectors, employers' and workers' and civil society organizations, non-governmental organizations, the private sector, as well as bilateral and multilateral agencies. The project strived to ensure active involvement and support of stakeholders in sustained partnerships among organizations, with each bringing to the partnership a distinct set of capabilities, strengths and comparative advantages.

The evaluation arrives at a positive overall assessment of the implementation of the project. The ILO, in cooperation with İŞKUR, has been able to effectively and efficiently manage a complex project with a small budget and high time constraints (pressure) without major deviations from the intended results or budget. There is considerable evidence of achievements and progress at both output and outcome levels. The overall approach of the

implementation of the project has been positively acknowledged by consulted stakeholders with regard to its responsive and partner-oriented nature, and key programming choices have been found to be appropriate and effective.

The overall design of the project has been appropriate and relevant in its general intent and in terms of key choices such as its provincial scope, its multi-stakeholder approach, and its intention to address substantive issues that face women at work. In terms of relevance, ample evidence has been produced to show that the programme is highly relevant as a mechanism to increase the employability of women. The project has also been found highly relevant in the respective local contexts of all three participating provinces as it has targeted some of the key challenges. The relevance of the project at the provincial level derives from the fact that, at programme onset, there were no other mechanisms or facilitators able to bring together the diverse players around the common theme of women and employment.

Government and NGO partners in all three provinces who did not previously know about gender and employment issues do so now. Stakeholders who had already known about women's human rights have a deeper understanding of how the rights relate to their own work and life. The project has contributed to increasing the amount of available relevant information and evidence on the situation of women's human rights, discrimination and gender equality and women's employment in each of the provinces. It has also drawn attention to persisting data gaps in these areas. Further, the work of the project has contributed to a larger number of stakeholders in all three provinces now discussing gender equality as a human rights issue, rather than as a question of individual preference, good will or political choice.

One of the strengths that has enhanced the performance of the project has been the responsive and partner-oriented approach of the programme implementation that reflects and corresponds to the principles of a human rights-based approach. In all three provinces the project has been able to strategically contribute to enhancing the pool of knowledge and experiences related to women's human rights issues.

The evaluation had the opportunity to interview 35 participating women in depth. The project activities have definitely improved women's specific knowledge of skills and of their rights which were introduced to them through training activities. The training courses on WHREP have created a motivation to learn for women. For many, it was the first time they attended a training course on their rights and after the training, women gained confidence and their awareness on gender equality improved. Women can see how their lives are shaped by socially prescribed gender roles and how they can change. They have learnt that they can change the situation they are in, and no longer need to attribute gender inequality and the low status of women to fate. They also talk to their friends, mothers and sisters about the importance of gender equality and reported much improvement at home and in their relationships. Many women share that after attending the gender trainings, they have improved their communication skills with their husbands and, instead of complaining or being passive, they start asking their husbands to share housework in a positive and confident way. Finally, the project has contributed to the improved lives of women in the family and community. After the WRHEP, they began to attend social activities. As a result, women became more confident in social skills. Women are very proud that they now wear gender lenses when they watch TV and point out the gender messages in the TV programmes that trap women and men in their gender roles. They show these to their friends and families and tell them how wrong these messages are. Because of their self-confidence and improved knowledge, they feel that they have gained their husbands' respect. The husbands started

listening to them and their relationships improved. A sharp increase in their motivation to work and to build a career has also been observed in the participating women as can easily be detected from their comments. Almost all women interviewed by the consultant expressed their desire to work and make money.

Here are some of statements made by the women themselves at the project closing meeting in Ankara.

- My aunt could not get divorced because she did not have financial freedom. I told her she could get a lawyer from the bar association. Now she is getting divorced.
- Nothing is a block in my life anymore; I now know that I am not too late for anything in life. I will take the university entrance exams.
- I want to put up my candidacy for a muhtar (chief of a neighbourhood).
- My courage is back. I will now start a women's solidarity movement.
- I have gained courage to start my own business. I will only recruit women.
- I want to finish high school and be a policewoman and stand on my own two feet.
- I now know that my work is valued more outside, than the work I do at home.
- I am so angry that I know that life has been so unfair to me.
- I used to be so sad that they did not let me to go to school. After this course I am very angry that they were so unfair and did not to send me to school. I will definitely continue my education.
- I am so happy that I have learned about my rights. I am so confident that will defend my rights.
- I have never been given the opportunity to finish high school I am now married and have children. I want to finish high school now and I will apply for a scholarship.
- We are 21 brothers and sisters: one father, two mothers, six boys and 15 girls. I live in a family where most of the inheritance goes to men as if women do not exist. I have learnt in this course that I have legal rights as a woman. I will now defend them.
- I will apply what I learnt in this course at every opportunity I get. I will defend my right to work and my economic rights.

Recognizing the good work that has been achieved, there are still areas where improvements could be made. For example, it would also have been beneficial to train officials from organizations that are involved in vocational training of women: İŞKUR, PEVEB and selected media members, on the Women Right Education Programme.

Even though the duration of the project was quite short, the design could have paid more attention to the creation of an effective network among participants, and participating

provinces. Such a network could have offered participants a chance to support each other and share good experiences in the application of their new skills in their own work.

The evaluation findings have shown that the initial programme scope was slightly overambitious, requiring the programme team to overwork in order to achieve its outcomes. Challenges have also been posed by the short duration of the project. Due to the short period of time, the required support to the women who completed vocational training could not be given. Another issue that became apparent is the need for a systematic follow-up system. The short duration of the project has not allowed to systematically follow up the women and to see the long-term impact of the WHREP and the vocational training they received.

The evaluation looked at the effectiveness of the project in terms of organizational goals, institutional criteria and approaches, such as policy advice and advocacy. Although it endorsed effective capacity development principles and practices, including the recognition that capacity development is a long-term process, many of its initiatives were of short duration.

There is still a need to train İŞKUR officials on how to manage gender-sensitive local contracting and tracking of women's job placement methods. There is also need for more regular gender disaggregated reporting on participation rates of women at local levels in pilot projects; more explicit incorporation of gender aspects in the work of PEVEB, İŞKUR and vocational training centres; and, more pro-active recruitment of women for professional project and programme staff positions in order to improve the gender balance.

In terms of sustainability, the evaluation observed that, in fact, the project employed a wide range of different approaches that are likely to have contributed to the sustainability of results. The evaluation is based on the understanding that sustainability of results implies the continuation, as well as the dynamic adaptation, of what has been achieved during a project's or programme's lifetime. The main programme approaches adopted by the project that contributed to sustainability include: involving key stakeholders in the implementation, thereby enhancing the potential for sustainable human development; undertaking a multi-sectoral approach by involving the government as a key partner in the entire planning and implementation process; following a process-oriented implementation modality leading directly to long-term, self-reliant capacity building rather than to immediate short-term performance improvement; and addressing socio-cultural issues.

To date, the national and provincial partners of the project have acquired the knowledge, skills and motivation to independently continue and adapt a variety of positive changes that have been brought about with the project's support, in particular in relation to providing information on women and employment issues to others, developing related materials, and integrating gender in advocacy initiatives. Some processes that the project has helped to bring about – e.g., exchange among government stakeholders at the provincial levels – are likely to be continued with PEVEB. Overall, the consultative and responsive approach adopted by the project to planning and implementation, which aimed to build on interests, priorities, needs and respective strengths of partners, created and enhanced local ownership of results. The project also made significant contributions to the sustainability by ensuring that project achievements were relevant to what respective partners (İŞKUR and PEVEB) were already doing, thus improving the potential for them to continue/keep up the momentum for change. The project also encouraged and supported the use of local resources and the development of local capacity wherever possible (in particular in relation to İŞKUR). The emphasis on using and further strengthening local resources contributed to limiting dependency on international

resources while, at the same time, strengthening ownership of and commitment to locally generated achievements.

The project enhanced partners' access to relevant knowledge, experiences and resources (people and materials) on gender. The evaluation observed that with regard to the application of these (i.e., the practical use of knowledge, skills, resources, broadened partnerships and networks in new settings) there is evidence of considerable progress. However, financial support from other sources is likely to be required for activities such as the provision of further WHREP sessions or training. In areas where the ILO has contributed to initial progress, but where achievements to date are limited to individual events and/or small groups of partners (e.g., training, job skills training and ITC training ), more support – both technical and financial – will be required in order to achieve substantial results.

## 5.2. Recommendations

The experience drawn from the implementation of the project during the period under evaluation points to several recommendations that could enhance the future implementation of similar programmes aimed at addressing women and employment. These recommendations are discussed below.

### **Strengthen the capacity of Provincial Employment and Vocational Education Boards:**

The establishment of these boards creates an excellent opportunity for the promotion of decent work for women in Turkey. With their high profile and cross-cutting mechanisms and direct links to the Governors' offices, the boards stand to have a significant impact on promoting women's employment and eliminating gender imbalances in the world of work. In order for this success to continue, interventions will require continuous advocacy, follow-up, and on-going capacity building within these boards. Their ability to organize and to become increasing vocal advocates for women in national and provincial forums can be enhanced through stronger technical support. Indeed, these local mechanisms (boards) can become more effective and efficient by further increasing their capacity to pursue a national policy on gender and promote equality of opportunity and treatment in respect of employment and occupation. Despite encouraging developments during the implementation of the project, a systematic integration of gender concerns and dimensions in all PEVEB policies, structures and programmes is still far from reality. Therefore, it will be beneficial to conduct trainings for the members of the boards on gender equality perspectives and policies, and on how local government legislation can be used for the benefit of women.

Strategic priorities and choices of the PEVEB will need to be adjusted as more information and knowledge relevant to the nature and dynamics of women and employment issues is acquired, and as further experience and insight are gained about effective ways to handle the problem. Partnerships will undoubtedly expand, possibly modifying dynamics which will need to be taken into account. Revisiting regularly the role and memberships of these boards will therefore be indispensable and strategic priorities will need to be redefined as time goes on. Increasing the representation of women's organizations and women's NGOs in these boards is also strongly recommended. The General Directorate of Social Services and Child Protection should also be a permanent member of these boards.

**Strengthen the capacity of the Turkish Employment Agency to integrate gender concerns and dimensions in all policies, structures and programmes:** İŞKUR will continue to play a critical role in increasing employment for women based on its comparative advantages and its defined mandate. However, stronger efforts are needed for İŞKUR to adopt

a more effective approach by moving away from demand-driven and project-oriented support towards a more strategic and focused approach to ensure cohesive decent work for women. Moreover, İŞKUR needs to amplify its role in promoting, identifying, collating and disseminating good practices, replicable models and lessons learned on increasing the labour market participation rates of women. İŞKUR is a vital link in the chain of communications from local to national, and from national to global level, and closer attention therefore needs to be paid to its advocacy and communication role on gender and the world of work. Despite encouraging trends, we are still far from a systematic integration of gender concerns and dimensions in all İŞKUR policies, structures and programmes. The mainstreaming of gender equality concerns all programme areas of İŞKUR and constitutes a critical challenge towards achieving the aims of raising consciousness of gender issues at all levels. The ability of İŞKUR to integrate the gender dimension into programming activities and strategy formation needs to be developed and complemented with an emphasis on institutional reform in order to achieve gender equity and equality. This will involve mainstreaming gender concerns into national and provincial programmes of İŞKUR, as well as the implementation of gender-sensitive and action-oriented policies in all relevant sectoral areas. Gender mainstreaming in İŞKUR was positively reported but there are some areas where improvements could be made: increasing the role of women as programme staff, contractors and managers; training of officials in how to manage gender-sensitive local contracting; more explicit incorporation of gender and vulnerability aspects in the gender- and -disaggregated reporting, how to make labour markets and policies more attuned to a broader paradigm of gender equality.

**Increase the involvement of employers' and workers' organizations in closing the gender gap in labour force participation rates:** During the implementation of the project both employers' and workers' organizations were represented in the Project Steering Committee at the national level and in the PEVEBs of the three provinces. Both these organizations could make more significant contributions towards closing the gender gap in labour force participation rates. It is highly recommended that a similar project in the future obtains employers' organizations inputs for a focused strategy which would identify gaps in the institutional policies, as well as the skills, incentives or practices that are required to provide opportunities for women. This could be a niche to encourage contractors or business managers to engage more fully, or encourage training for certain types of skills, that aim to support government employment policies on gender equality and women's empowerment, eliminating gender biases which are embedded in society and the labour market. Workers' organizations should similarly identify niches they can fill, such as support of affiliations of women's groups, advice on labour standards and job opportunities for women through networking with other groups, local monitoring of gender contracting and procurement and advocating for closing the gap between women and men in terms of job opportunities and quality of employment, according to a new report by the International Labour Organization.

**Create a pool of experts/trainers on WHREP at the provincial level:** Data collected during the evaluation interviews indicate that a pool of national WHREP resource persons/trainers is needed. To date, knowledge about available experts/trainers appears to be largely housed within SHCEK which may limit the use of the existing potential for further networking and local ownership. The evaluation would recommend enhancing the capacity at the provincial levels through creating a pool of trainers on WHREP in close cooperation with Provincial Directorates of SHCEK, women's organizations and universities. This will create a cascade effect create so that WHREP training can be given to women who are attending İSKUR vocational training courses as well as girls and women who are attending non formal education vocational training courses and formal centers for vocational training courses.

**Ensure that experiences, good practices and lessons learned on women and employment are exchanged with respective agencies and organizations at regional levels:** All the programme partners who were consulted and who had participated in regional activities (workshops, meetings, and seminars) stated that they had found the respective events highly interesting, and most of them wanted to share information with colleagues in the other provinces who would be going through similar experiences. Platforms should be created and opportunities should be provided for İŞKUR staff and trainers, as well as the women who are trained, so that they can exchange experiences, good practices and lessons learned with respective agencies and organizations in other provinces. They should also participate in seminars, workshops and conferences in order to present the perspective of their respective specialties and also to present and discuss the progress made in their provinces toward gender equality in the world of work. This sort of sharing and systematic social and policy dialogue is a critical element to ensure the continued visibility of the issue. In order to maximize their impact these provincial gatherings should also increase their focus on multiple delivery channels by partnering with local media (including radio and TV stations) and civil society. More effective materials detailing the project's aim, objectives and outcomes such as audio-visual aids, printed promotional materials, posters, and booklets should be produced and widely distributed.

**Extend project duration:** The very short period of project duration has prevented the full evaluation of the effectiveness of its results. A fundamental lesson from the project is that a solid two-three years are necessary in order to assess its results and outcomes. Time limitations of the project underline the importance of having a highly focused programme. Unless there is significant time, it would be better to limit the number of activities in order to enhance the reach and depth as well as the coherence of the programme. Although palpable advances have been made, it was difficult to make a detailed and concrete evaluation of the implementation due to the short period of project time (less than a year). It should be noted that these advances occurred mostly due to the dedication of İŞKUR and ILO staff and managers.

**Conduct regular labour market analysis:** Labour market analysis is a generalized concept that denotes the interaction between the supply and the demand and the wage rate. Labour-market analysis considers not only the short-term supply and demand for labour, but their allocation among regions, occupations and industries. It is crucial that İŞKUR regularly continue to conduct labour market analyses and carry out analytical work on women and the labour market. This work should also pay much more attention to the analysis of women in the formal and informal labour market; and to the development of interactive labour market analysis tools which allow the selection and viewing of key labour market facts about an industry or group of industries in terms of many variables, including women and employment and labour productivity, hours worked, turnover rate etc. This will allow İŞKUR to view key facts about women's employment in the selected regions or industry in terms of the factors facilitating it or constraining it; changes in labour markets and the demand for women's labour; and, factors which shape the patterns of women's employment. In this respect, social policies and other political interventions, such as equal-opportunity legislation, and women's labour force participation have increased everywhere. Indeed, there are significant cross-national differences in the policies and politics affecting women's employment

**Implement a second phase:** Based on the experiences from the project to date, the evaluation recommends that a second programme phase continue to operate both at the national and at the provincial levels in order to effectively build on partnerships, experiences and

achievements created thus far, and that it addresses a clearly defined employment policy for women. Suggestions for a potential second phase include: working more broadly and systematically on policy issues regarding women and employment; working intensively with one or more selected line ministries; ensuring increased participation of employers' and workers' organizations; assisting with developing and implementing a comprehensive (model) approach to applying gender issues in a particular sector both at national and provincial levels; supporting and capturing innovative/creative approaches to apply WHREP at the grassroots level; focusing on the development of effective local capacity training of trainers on WHREP, and supporting partners' efforts to raise awareness among organizations and individual women.

**ANNEXES**

**Annex I Project Document**

Proposal form for RBSA allocations

**Pilot project on active labour market policies for advancing gender equality through decent employment for women in Turkey**

*DWCP outcome to which RBSA is proposed*

The RBSA proposal aims to contribute to the achievement of the following CP Outcome through improved gender-sensitive active labour market policies implemented by the Turkish Employment Agency (İŞKUR).

**TUR152 - Promote decent employment for women.**

*Strategy statement on how the RBSA will contribute to the achievement of the outcomes (in developing the strategy statement, please refer to criteria in paragraph 4.1 of the Office Procedure):*

This RBSA proposal aims to improve the capacity of the İŞKUR staff and social partners at provincial level and in turn contribute to enhancing women's employment in the project provinces of Ankara, Gaziantep and Konya by increasing women's labour force participation and referring women to active labour market programmes. (See Annex 1 for background and justification.)

The proposal will help in imparting gender sensitive approaches in relation to women's employment and in identifying those occupations where there is more opportunity in project provinces for more women labour force. The project is expected to serve as a model for other provinces in advancing gender equality in employment.

By the end of the project, the following outcomes are envisaged: (See also Annex 2 for outputs



and indicative activities)

1. ALMPs specifically for women's employment and labour force entry are designed and implemented by İŞKUR through enhanced technical capacity.
2. At level of local institutions in the pilot provinces, mechanisms for knowledge and rights-based governance of women's employment are designed and supported.
3. Targeted young women enter and remain in the labour market.

The ILO-Ankara Office and its Director will be operationally and technically in charge of the proposed project. Technical assistance will be undertaken with the support of Employment Agency İŞKUR of the Ministry of Labour and Social Security in partnership with the General Directorate on the Status of Women of the Prime Ministry. The General Directorate of Non-Formal Education and Apprenticeship Training of the Ministry of National Education, Turkish Statistical Institute and the Small and Medium Industry Development Organization of the Ministry of Industry and Trade will be other collaborating institutions. Employers' and workers' organizations involvement in the project will be secured particularly through their involvement in Provincial Employment and Vocational Education Boards. Member UN agencies of the UN Gender Thematic Group will give awareness raising support.

The RBSA will contribute to achieve the outcome TUR152 by promoting an integrated approach to gender-sensitive employment policy that is integrated into provincial action on employment.

The implementation strategy will be based on an institutional development and a direct assistance component.

Institutional development. Technical assistance will be provided to enhance the knowledge, technical and partnership skills of the staff of İŞKUR, relevant ministries and social partners for contributing to the promotion of women's employment. Women employment strategies will be mainstreamed into provincial action plans and development programmes. Active Labour Market Policies specifically promoting women's employability and labour market entry will be designed and implemented by İŞKUR with ILO's assistance. The tripartite Provincial Employment and Vocational Education Boards, which include representatives of government, worker and employer confederations and other non-governmental institutions, will gain the capacity to design employment strategies and monitor them, with focus on women's employment.

Direct assistance. Direct support will be provided to women in project provinces to improve their attitudes, knowledge and skills to enable them to enter selected sectors of the labour market. Areas of training will be on:

- Women's human rights
- Basic skills required for employability such as written and oral communication and basic life skills training
- Specific skills and vocational training in the identified areas based on the "Occupational Barometer" developed for the provinces
- Job-seeking skills and smoother school-to-work transition, particularly for high school and university graduates.
- Entrepreneurship skills and self employment training for young female graduates.

*Programme and budget immediate or joint immediate outcome to which the DWCP and/or regional or subregional outcome will contribute (brief description on how the RBSA contribution will contribute to the achievement of the targets under the immediate or joint immediate outcome):*

The RBSA will contribute to achieve the targets of the following immediate outcome:

**210175 – Increase member State capacity to develop policies or programmes focused on youth employment.**

**Indicator:** Number of member States that apply ILO technical assistance, data, training, tools or methodologies to develop policies, national action plans or programmes that promote productive employment, rights at work, and/or adequate social protection for young women and men.

**Target:** 8 member States across all other regions (outside Africa).

*Other units involved (headquarters/field/ITC):*

EMP/ELM, EMP/POL, EMP/SKILLS, GENDER (HQ), ILO Office in Turkey and International Training Centre of the ILO.

*Common principles of action which will apply in its strategies and means of action to deliver planned outputs:*

The action will be based on the following main principles:

- **Promotion of gender sensitive employment policies and programmes:** Advocacy and advisory services in the realm of employment policy will address the concerns relating to gender equality in the world of work.
- **Participation of the social partners in the employment policy-making process:** Provincial employers' and workers' organizations representatives will participate through Provincial Employment and Vocational Education Boards. This work on gender-sensitive employment policy formulation and implementation will contribute to social dialogue.

*RBSA amount proposed (breakdown by account and w/ms where headquarters support and/or SRO should be clearly specified. paragraph 4.1 related to inputs and outputs):*

The proposed amount total USD 398,748 allocated to Strategic Objective 2. A summary breakdown by budget line is given in the table below. (See Annex 3 for detailed budget.)

Budget item	Total
1100 – Professional staff costs (1 w/m)	16,348
1700 - National Project staff (NO-A I)	120,000
2300 - Travel	6,400

	3900 - Contractual services	79,500	
	8200 - Training workshops	168,500	
	4900 - Miscellaneous	8,000	
	<b>Grand total</b>	<b>398,748</b>	

*I certify that the above proposal meets the purposes set out in the Director-General's RBSA announcement<sup>9</sup> and the criteria as set out in the RBSA Office Procedure.*

Date:

Regional Director:

Petra Ulshoefer

Europe and Central Asia

**Pilot project on active labour market policies for advancing gender equality through decent employment for women in Turkey**

1. Background and Justification

**1.1. Background**

Following the completion of the report on the “Situation of Women’s Employment in Turkey” prepared by Prof. Gülay Toksöz of Ankara University Centre for Research on Gender Issues, in line with the priorities of the ILO-Turkey’s “Decent Work Country Programme”, the findings of the report

were made public during a conference held in Ankara in December 2007. The issue was addressed from different angles and based on the discussions and seminar report, the need to launch a project targeting women in the 15-29 age group was identified. The present project document is the outcome of this decision.

Despite the recent high rate of economic growth, Turkey has not achieved the same success in employment creation. The rate of unemployment is still around 10 percent while low labour participation rates, large informal sector, high rate of flexible employment, very high rate of youth unemployment and shortage of qualified human capital all stand as significant problems in the Turkish labour market.

Although women's labour force participation and rate of employment are all on the rise throughout the world, the rate of women employment in Turkey is extremely low and still falling. As of 2006, the general rate of employment in Turkey remains around 43.2 percent (in comparison to 46.7 percent in 2000 and 43.4 percent in 2005) while it is high at 64 percent in the EU-25. This situation stems from low rate of labour force participation on the part of women, which is 24 percent compared to 56 percent in the EU-25.

## **1.2. Justification**

In Turkey there is a large volume of data and legal framework supporting the importance attached to women's employment.

According to data provided by OECD's "Education at a Glance/2007", Turkey by far distance leads the list among 30 OECD member or candidate countries in terms of the high proportion of young girls who are neither employed nor in educational institutions nor seeking employment.

The rate of unemployment among young women in Turkey is 47.5 percent for the 15-19 age group; 58.3 percent for the 20-24 age group and 65.8 percent in the 25-29 age group.

About 60 percent of women in the age group 15-29 and 66 percent in the 25-29 age group benefit neither from education nor employment. Socio-cultural factors such as a gender-based division of labour and gender roles built upon this division assign childcare and household works almost solely to women and therefore largely prevent them from joining the labour force and seeking jobs. The insufficiency of public childcare facilities and elderly care services further aggravates the problem. Women's motive to work is also curbed by such factors as limited work available, heavier working conditions and low pay. Furthermore, due to rapid shrinking of rural employment resulting in internal migration to urban areas, there are fewer jobs for unskilled women previously employed in agriculture. Primary and secondary education in Turkey does not equip young women with skills they can benefit from in labour markets.

Targets in the 9<sup>th</sup> Development Plan of the Turkish State Planning Organization for labour force participation are: 50.7 percent for both men and women in 2013; 72.2 percent for men and 29.6 percent for women in 2013; for the 2007-2013 average, 49.8 percent in total (27.8 percent for women). It is estimated that the average annual increase in employment will be by 2.7 percent with measures adopted during the plan period. Labour force participation rate is expected to increase by 2.1 points as a result of factors and interventions such as rising level of education, enhanced employability through active labour market policies and easier entry into labour market. Women are expected to be the determining factor in this improvement.

Under the plan, equal opportunities will be provided to women, youth, long-term unemployed, persons with disabilities and ex-convicts who face problems in labour market. There will be easier access to child and other care services in order to boost the participation of women in the labour force and employment. Programmes will be developed to help youth gain work experience. Furthermore, in order to enhance

women's participation in economic and social life, greater opportunities for vocational training will be provided to them, increasing their employability.

Under a new law (referred to as the "Employment Package") which was recently passed in May 2008, the Government will subsidize the insurance premiums of newly employed women and employees between 18 and 29 years of age for five years in declining installments. In their first year of employment, 100 percent of the insurance premiums for this group will be paid by the Treasury via the unemployment fund. The subsidy rate will drop by 20 percent each year for the next four years. The new law also reduces employers' overall share in insurance premiums by 5 percent. Turkey has previously ratified ILO Conventions 100, 111, 122, and 142. However, in practice, there is still need for improvement of concrete gender-sensitive employment policies.

Though the DWCP is not finalized as yet, in 2007 the government has officially declared their priorities for cooperation with the ILO, among which is the "Promotion of decent employment for women." Gender issues are also on the agenda of EU-Turkey accession talks. In fact, the EU Screening Report Chapter 19 on Employment and Social Policy emphasizes the low labour force participation rate for women. In addition, UNDAF for Turkey – the common strategic framework for UN operational activities – commits the UN to support the Government of Turkey to increase political and budgetary commitments and adopt and effectively implement enabling laws, policies, plans and social budgets for women, children and youth (CP Outcome 3.1.)

Taking into account the above employment situation for women and the interest of the Turkish government and social partners to better reach the targets of the 9<sup>th</sup> Development Plan, the ILO proposes a project aimed for promoting decent work for women.

Very low labour force participation by women in all parts of the regions of Eastern and South-eastern Anatolia and in some parts of Central Anatolia is observed.

TURKSTAT data for 2006 and for women in the 15-24 age group			
	Ankara	Gaziantep	Konya
Labour force participation rate	23.5%	8.8%	15.9%
Rate of employment	19.3%	8.3%	13.5%
Rate of unemployment	17.8%	6.1%	15.1%

Source: TURKSTAT, 2006, Labour Force Status Survey

Based on criteria including feasibility and effectiveness, the provinces of Ankara and Konya in Central Anatolia and Gaziantep in South-eastern Anatolia were selected to implement this project for promotion of women's employment. The table above lists the most recent available data for the selected provinces. One of the reasons for selecting the province of Ankara is that despite being the capital of the Republic, figures for Ankara are very low and reflect a definite need to improve the women's employment situation. Also, the project would be efficiently and closely monitored and followed up by the ILO-Ankara Office and Employment Agency İŞKUR as both are located in Ankara.

Outcome	Indicator	Output	Indicative Activities	Year					
				2008	2009				
				Q4	Q1	Q2	Q3	Q4	
<p><b>OUTCOME 1:</b></p> <p>ALMPs specifically for women's employment and labour force entry designed and implemented by İŞKUR in project provinces through enhanced technical capacity.</p>	<p>- Occupational Barometer at the provincial level developed by mid-2009</p>	<p><b>1.1</b> Labour market needs in target provinces analyzed, resulting in the "Occupational Barometer" for women</p>	<p><b>1.1.1</b> Conduct quantitative and qualitative assessments of women employment and social development in target provinces</p> <p><b>1.1.2</b> Develop questionnaire for employers with the help of İŞKUR and prepare barometer for professions and occupations</p> <p><b>1.1.3</b> Share results of "Occupational Barometer" with Provincial Employment and Vocational Education Boards</p>	X		X			

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Number of local policy instruments designed for women employment</li> <li>- Number of tools and practical measures (methodologies, approaches, training packages and information developed or produced by the project) used to implement women employment strategies</li> </ul>	<p><b>1.2</b> Knowledge, technical and partnership skills of staff of relevant ministries and social partners enhanced for contributing to promotion of women employment .</p>	<p><b>1.2.1</b> Set up national level project steering committee that will meet regularly to monitor project achievements.</p> <p><b>1.2.2</b> Conduct workshop for identification of ALMP strategies particularly for women in target provinces</p> <p><b>1.2.3</b> Promote relevant components of govt. employment package from the perspective of its impact on women labour force.</p> <p><b>1.2.4</b> Hold national conference on women employment with relevant stakeholders at end of project.</p>	X	X			X
<b>OUTCOME 2:</b>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Qualitative improvement in the structure and</li> </ul>	<b>2.1</b> Inter-institutional coordinatio	<b>2.1.1</b> Assess knowledge and	X				

<p>At the level of local governance institutions in the pilot provinces (Ankara, Gaziantep, Konya) mechanisms for knowledge and rights-based governance of women's employment are designed and supported.</p>	<p>capacity of the Provincial Employment Boards to address women employment</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Local Action Plans on women's employment drafted and operational by the end of the project.</li> </ul>	<p>n mechanisms and consultative bodies supported in Ankara, Gaziantep and Konya to monitor the employment situation, with focus on women's entry into labour force</p>	<p>statistical information needs of Provincial Employment and Vocational Training Boards for monitoring women unemployment and reasons for exclusion from labour markets</p> <p><b>2.1.2.</b> Organize awareness raising meetings on women employment in target provinces</p> <p><b>2.1.3</b> Draft local action plans for women's employment (by Provincial Employment and Vocational Training Boards)</p>			<p>X</p>		
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Total number of 50 field staff of İŞKUR trained</li> <li>- Qualitative and quantitative improvement in responsiveness of İŞKUR placement services to unemployed women in</li> </ul>	<p><b>2.2</b> Technical and administrative skills of İŞKUR enhanced for women to benefit from Active Labour Market Policies</p>	<p>2.2.1 Set up and deliver training for İŞKUR officials to achieve better rates of women employment by improving the match between</p>			<p>X</p>		



	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- target provinces</li> <li>- Number and type of on-the-job training schemes developed by ISKUR for the target women groups</li> </ul>		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>unemployed and open vacancies (training by ITC, Turin)</li> <li>2.2.2. Develop consolidated package of services for women job seekers for provision by iSKUR</li> </ul>			X		
<p><b>OUTCOME 3:</b></p> <p>At individual level, targeted young women enter and remain in the labour market.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Number of women who undergo training in the project who are more knowledgeable about their rights and decide to seek employment</li> <li>- Number of women trained in specific skills enabling them to qualify for open vacancies in the market</li> <li>- Number of trained women who are placed in jobs.</li> </ul>	<p><b>3.1</b> Skills, knowledge and attitudes of women in the target provinces enhanced to better position them to enter selected sectors of the labour market</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>3.1.1. Train target group on women's human rights</li> <li>3.1.2. Train targeted women on basic skills required for employability such as written and oral communication and basic life skills training</li> <li>3.1.3. Provide specific skills and vocational training to targeted women in the</li> </ul>				X	X
								X

			<p>identified areas based on the “Occupational Barometer”</p> <p>3.1.4. Provide training, with the collaboration of the education faculties of universities, on job-seeking skills and smoother school-to-work transition (for women in 15-29 age group)</p> <p>3.1.5. Train young graduates on entrepreneurship skills and self-employment.</p>						X
--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	---

**Annex II Terms of reference**

**TERMS OF REFERENCE  
INTERNAL EVALUATION OF THE PROJECT**

**Project Title: Pilot project on active labour market policies for advancing gender equality through decent employment for women in Turkey**

**Region:** Europe and Central Asia

**Lead Office:** ILO Ankara Office in Turkey

**Duration:** 15 months (January 2009 - March 2010)

**Donor agency:** Regular Budget Supplementary Account (RBSA), Government of the Norway

**Budget:** 398,748 USD

**External implementing partners:** İŞKUR (Turkish Employment Agency) of the Ministry of Labour and Social Security

## **I. INTRODUCTION AND RATIONALE FOR EVALUATION**

The internal evaluation is undertaken in accordance with the project workplan and in line with the ILO Evaluation Policy adopted by the Governing Body in November 2005, which provides for systematic evaluation of programmes and projects in order to improve quality, accountability, transparency of the ILO's work, strengthen the decision-making process and support constituents in forwarding decent work and social justice.

## **II. BRIEF BACKGROUND ON PROJECT AND CONTEXT**

### **PROJECT SUMMARY**

Following the completion of the report on the "Situation of Women's Employment in Turkey" prepared by Prof. Gülay Toksöz of Ankara University Centre for Research on Gender Issues, in line with the priorities of the ILO-Turkey's "Decent Work Country Programme", the findings of the report were made public during a conference held in Ankara in December 2007. The issue was addressed from different angles and based on the discussions and seminar report, the need to launch a project targeting women in the 15-29 age group was identified. The present project is the outcome of this decision.

Despite the recent high rate of economic growth, Turkey has not achieved the same success in employment creation. The rate of unemployment is still around 13 percent while low labour participation rates, large informal sector, high rate of flexible employment, very high rate of youth unemployment and shortage of qualified human capital all stand as significant problems in the Turkish labour market.

Although women's labour force participation and rate of employment are all on the rise throughout the world, the rate of women employment in Turkey is extremely low and still falling. As of 2006, the general rate of employment in Turkey remains around 43.2 percent (in comparison to 46.7 percent in 2000 and 43.4 percent in 2005) while it is high at 64 percent in the EU-25. This situation stems from low rate of labour force participation on the part of women, which is around 24 percent compared to 56 percent in the EU-25.

About 60 percent of women in the age group 15-29 and 66 percent in the 25-29 age group benefit neither from education nor employment. Socio-cultural factors such as a gender-based division of

labour and gender roles built upon this division assign childcare and household works almost solely to women and therefore largely prevent them from joining the labour force and seeking jobs. The insufficiency of public childcare facilities and elderly care services further aggravates the problem. Women's motive to work is also curbed by such factors as limited work available, heavier working conditions and low pay. Furthermore, due to rapid shrinking of rural employment resulting in internal migration to urban areas, there are fewer jobs for unskilled women previously employed in agriculture. Primary and secondary education in Turkey does not equip young women with skills they can benefit from in labour markets.

Targets in the 9<sup>th</sup> Development Plan of the Turkish State Planning Organization for labour force participation are: 50.7 percent for both men and women in 2013; 72.2 percent for men and 29.6 percent for women in 2013; for the 2007-2013 average, 49.8 percent in total (27.8 percent for women). It is estimated that the average annual increase in employment will be by 2.7 percent with measures adopted during the plan period. Labour force participation rate is expected to increase by 2.1 points as a result of factors and interventions such as rising level of education, enhanced employability through active labour market policies and easier entry into labour market. Women are expected to be the determining factor in this improvement.

Under the plan, equal opportunities will be provided to women, youth, long-term unemployed, persons with disabilities and ex-convicts who face problems in labour market. There will be easier access to child and other care services in order to boost the participation of women in the labour force and employment. Programmes will be developed to help youth gain work experience. Furthermore, in order to enhance women's participation in economic and social life, greater opportunities for vocational training will be provided to them, increasing their employability.

Turkey has previously ratified ILO Conventions 100, 111, 122, and 142. However, in practice, there is still need for improvement of concrete gender-sensitive employment policies. On 10 February 2009, a Memorandum of Understanding on the Decent Work Country Priorities was signed by the Ministry of Labour and Social Security and the ILO in Lisbon. The Government of Turkey and the ILO reaffirmed their decision to implement a national decent work program for the country priorities, among which is the "improvement of women employment and gender equality". Gender issues are also on the agenda of EU-Turkey accession talks. In fact, the EU Screening Report Chapter 19 on Employment and Social Policy emphasizes the low labour force participation rate for women. In addition, UNDAF for Turkey – the common strategic framework for UN operational activities – commits the UN to support the Government of Turkey to increase political and budgetary commitments and adopt and effectively implement enabling laws, policies, plans and social budgets for women, children and youth (CP Outcome 3.1.)

Taking into account the above employment situation for women and the interest of the Turkish government and social partners to better reach the targets of the 9<sup>th</sup> Development Plan, the ILO launched a project aimed for promoting decent work for women.

This RBSA project aims to improve the capacity of the İŞKUR staff and social partners at provincial level and in turn contribute to enhancing women's employment in the project provinces of Ankara, Gaziantep and Konya by increasing women's labour force participation and referring

women to active labour market programmes. The project will help in imparting gender sensitive approaches in relation to women's employment and in identifying those occupations where there is more opportunity in project provinces for more women labour force. The project is expected to serve as a model for other provinces in advancing gender equality in employment.

The expected outcomes and strategies to achieve can be briefly summarized as follows:

1. ALMPs specifically for women's employment and labour force entry designed and implemented by İŞKUR in project provinces through enhanced technical capacity;

To achieve this outcome the project is delivering a set of activities (assessments of women employment, workshops, knowledge sharing) for the national constituents in general and for İŞKUR in particular aimed at developing their capacities to initiate and conduct situation analysis on women employment for better understanding women employment and labour market updates and perform an engendered analysis of employment information and strategies.

2. At the level of local governance institutions in the pilot provinces (Ankara, Gaziantep, Konya) mechanism for knowledge and rights-based governance of women's employment are designed and supported;

To achieve this outcome training on public employment services and gender were delivered for İŞKUR officials to enhance technical and administrative capacity of İŞKUR which in turn lead to achieve better rates of women employment by improving the match between unemployed and open vacancies. The project organized awareness raising meetings on women employment to assess the active labour market policies and develop strategies to improve women employment in target provinces.

3. At individual level, targeted young women enter and remain in the labour market.

The project provided skills and vocational training to unemployed women in the identified areas to increase their employability; a special program on Women's Human Rights were delivered to those unemployed women taking vocational training; job-seeking skills and smoother school-to-work transition training were provided to young university students and training on entrepreneurship skills and self-employment were organized.

### III. PURPOSE, SCOPE AND CLIENTS OF THE EVALUATION

The purpose of the evaluation is to:

- a) Determine if the project has achieved its stated objectives and outcomes and explain why/why not;
- b) Provide recommendations on programme improvement and further action;
- c) Where necessary, identify the possible need to refine strategy.

The evaluation covers the project in three target provinces, Ankara, Gaziantep, Konya, to serve the following - external and internal - clients' groups:

- Ultimate beneficiaries of the project – young women at the age of 15 to 29;

- ILO tripartite constituents and national project partners;
- ILO management at the HQ and country office;
- Project staff.

#### IV. EVALUATION QUESTIONS

The evaluation will address the following aspects of the project:

- 1) **Extent of progress to date:** What progress has the project made towards achieving its immediate objectives as per the relevant outcome indicators?
  - a) How have stakeholders been involved in the implementation? Are constituents satisfied with the quality of tools, technical advice, training and other activities, delivered by the project? Have there been any resulting changes in constituents' capacities to create an enabling policy environment for women employment?
  - b) How many young women benefitted from the project, e.g., have been trained, employed, improved skills, etc.?
  - c) What was innovative in the project implementation and/or in the services provided?
  - d) Has there been any additional demand for women employment services created by the project? If so, would it be feasible to meet such demand within the time frame of the project? How would that influence/strengthen the outcomes?
  - e) To what extent is the project contributing to:
    1. implementation of the Decent Work Country Priorities;
    2. partnerships and interagency cooperation with the UN family.
  - f) Has the project been implemented as planned? If not, why?
  - g) Have the resources been used in an efficient manner?
  - h) What is the likelihood of sustainability of outcomes? Are the national partners able to continue with the project after its completion (capacity of people and institutions, laws, policies)? What more should be done to improve sustainability?
  - i) Are there any areas where difficulties are being experienced? What are the reasons? Are there any alternative strategies which would be more effective?
  - j) What are the main lessons learned, good practices, innovations? To what extent are best practices documented or should be documented better?
- 2) **Project's fit with the context:** How the project supports UN Country Programmes, UNDAF? Is there a fit between the project design and the direct beneficiaries' needs? How well does it complement other ILO projects in the countries and/or other donors' activities?
- 3) **Appropriateness of the project design:** Is the design of the project appropriate in relation to the ILO's strategic and national policy frameworks? Is intervention logic coherent and realistic to achieve the planned outcomes? Are the activities supporting objectives (strategies)? Are indicators useful to measure progress?

OECD/DAC Criteria for Evaluating Development Assistance will be used to interpret the answers to the evaluation questions.

#### V. METHODOLOGY

**Document Review:** The evaluator will review project background materials before conducting any interviews or trips to the region:

- Decent Work Country Priorities
- Country Briefs, National Policy Documents
- Project Document
- Logical Framework
- Work plans
- TORs
- Surveys, studies, analytical papers produced
- Reports on specific activities
- Training tools and service packages used and/or produced
- Publications and promo materials

**Planning Consultations:** The evaluator will have a pre-trip consultation with the ILO representatives and project team in Ankara. The objective of the meeting is to reach a common understanding regarding the status of the project, the priority assessment questions, the available data sources and data collection instruments and an outline of the final assessment report. The following topics will be covered: status of logistical arrangements, project background and materials, key evaluation questions and priorities, data sources and data collection methods, roles and responsibilities of the assessment team, outline of the final report.

**Individual Interviews and/or Group Interviews:** Individual or group interviews will be conducted with the following:

- a. Project Staff, ILO Director in Ankara, and other relevant ILO staff
- b. Representatives from the following groups:
  - National Project Steering Committees members and constituents
  - Government staff who have worked with the project
  - a few representatives of the target group (e.g. young women looking for jobs who benefitted from the project)

**Field Visits:** The evaluator will visit Ankara and project pilot provinces (Ankara, Gaziantep, Konya). Meetings will be scheduled in advance of the field visits by the ILO project staff, in accordance with the evaluator's requests and consistent with these terms of reference.

**Debrief in the Field:** The final day of the field visits, the evaluator will present preliminary findings, conclusions, and recommendations to the constituents and the ILO field staff. The draft report will subsequently be shared with the ILO field staff and constituents for comment.

**Post-Trip Debriefing:** Upon completion of the report, the evaluator will provide a debriefing to the ILO/Ankara on the evaluation findings, conclusions and recommendations (possibly, by telephone/or on Skype).

## VI. MAIN OUTPUTS (DELIVERABLES)

- A. Initial Draft Report in English (in electronic format);
- B. Final Report in English (electronically);
- C. Translation of the Final Report into Turkish.

## Suggested Report Format

The final version of the report will follow the below format and be no more than 20-25 pages in length, excluding the annexes:

1. Title page
2. Table of Contents
3. Executive Summary
4. Acronyms
5. Background and Project Description
6. Purpose of Evaluation
7. Evaluation Methodology and Evaluation Questions
8. Project Status
9. Findings, Lessons Learned
10. Conclusions and Recommendations<sup>10</sup>
11. Annexes (list of interviews, meeting notes, relevant country information and documents)

## VII. MANAGEMENT ARRANGEMENTS

### EVALUATION TEAM

The evaluation team will be comprised of one evaluator working under supervision of the ILO specialists in Ankara and Geneva. If feasible, an ILO representative from the HQ technical department (e.g. YEP, EMPENT) will participate in the field research mission.

Interpretation during field research and interviews will be provided by the project, if necessary.

### REQUIREMENTS

#### *Qualifications of the Evaluator*

1. Substantial knowledge of the field of employment and women employment, in particular
2. Experience in evaluation of development interventions
3. Understanding of the ILO's tripartite culture and Decent Work agenda
4. Understanding of gender issues
5. Knowledge of the region and country context
6. Adherence to high professional standards and principles of integrity in accordance with the guiding principles of evaluation professionals associations<sup>11</sup>
7. Advanced degree in social sciences or economics
8. Experience in interviewing
9. Excellent analytical and report-writing skills
10. Full command of English

---

<sup>10</sup> It is advisable to include recommendations on knowledge sharing if appropriate (i.e. documentation of best practices, development of training courses, etc.)

<sup>11</sup> <http://www.eval.org/Publications/GuidingPrinciples.asp>



## 11. Knowledge of Turkish language would be an advantage

### SELECTION

The final selection of the evaluator will be done by the Director of the **ILO Ankara Office in Turkey** based on a short list of candidates from the Evaluation Manager with an approval from the Evaluation Focal Point in the ILO/EUROPE.

### ROLES AND RESPONSIBILITIES

The Evaluator is responsible for conducting the evaluation according to the terms of reference (TOR). He/she will:

- Review the TOR and provide input, propose any refinements to assessment questions, as necessary.
- Review project background materials (e.g., project document, progress reports).
- Develop and implement the assessment methodology (i.e., conduct interviews, review documents) to answer the assessment questions.
- Conduct preparatory consultations with the ILO prior to the field mission.
- Conduct field research, interviews, focus groups, as appropriate.
- Prepare an initial draft report with an input from the ILO specialists.
- Conduct briefing on findings, conclusion, and recommendation of the assessment.
- Prepare final report based on the feedback obtained on the draft report.

The ILO Evaluation Manager is responsible for:

- Drafting the TOR in collaboration with the project coordinator and specialists;
- Circulating the TOR for comments to all the stakeholders (technical specialists at ILO/HQ ILO/EUROPE Evaluation Focal Point, EVAL);
- Finalizing the TOR with input from colleagues;
- Preparing a short list of candidates for submission to the ILO/Ankara Director for final selection;
- Hiring the consultant
- Providing the consultant with the project background materials and ILO evaluation guidelines;
- Facilitating communication with regards to the preparatory meeting prior to the field research and the assessment mission;
- Assisting in the implementation of the assessment methodology, as appropriate;
- Reviewing the initial draft report, circulating it for comments and providing consolidated feedback to the evaluator;
- Reviewing the final draft of the report;
- Disseminating the final report to all the stakeholders;
- Coordinating follow-up as necessary.

The Project Manager is responsible for:

- Reviewing the draft TOR and providing input, as necessary;

- Circulating the draft TOR to the national stakeholders for comments;
- Providing project background materials, including surveys, studies, analytical papers, reports, tools, publications produced;
- Participating in preparatory consultations prior to the assessment mission;
- Scheduling all meetings and preparing a detailed program of the mission;
- Organizing the logistical support throughout the duration of the assessment mission;
- Reviewing and providing comments on the assessment report;
- Participating in debriefing on findings, conclusions, and recommendations.

#### TIMEFRAME

The following is a tentative schedule of tasks and anticipated duration of each:

Tasks	Work Days	Travel Days
Preparatory Research	3	Before trip
Field Research, three provinces	8	
Travel days (depending on residence)		3
Initial Draft Report	6	After trip
Finalization of the report	2	
<hr/>		
Total: 19 + travel		

Overall duration: 3 weeks in February - March 2010

Date of completion of work: 25 March 2010

#### **Annex III List of persons consulted**

Mr. Talip ALTUĞ

Provincial Director of İŞKUR, Ankara

Tel: 0 312 431 02 23 / 02 89

Fax: 0 312 431 02 40

Ms Özlem Yurdanur ÖZGENÇ

Trainer, Job SEARCH

Tel: 0 542 311 38 71

E-mail: [ozlemyurdanurozgenc@yahoo.com](mailto:ozlemyurdanurozgenc@yahoo.com)

Ms. Jülide SARIEROĞLU

HAK – İŞ, Expert, Industrial Relations

Tel: 0 312 417 16 30

Mob tel: 0 535 513 43 25

E-mail: [jsarieroglu@hakis.org.tr](mailto:jsarieroglu@hakis.org.tr)

Ms. Hülya UZUNER

TÜRK –İŞ, Expert, Bureau of Women’s Affairs

Tel: 0 312 433 31 25 / 129

Mob tel: 0 532 670 17 18

E-mail: [hulyauzuner@gmail.com](mailto:hulyauzuner@gmail.com)

Ms. Hilal DERİCİ

TİSK, Expert, Research, Education and Foreign Affairs

Tel: 0 312 439 77 17

Faxs: 0 312 439 75 92–93–94

E-mail: [hderici@tisk.org.tr](mailto:hderici@tisk.org.tr)

Ms. Serpil GÜNEŞ

HTT Computers, Project Director

Mob tel: 0 535 335 75 16

E-mail: [serpilgunes06@hotmail.com](mailto:serpilgunes06@hotmail.com)

Ms. Didem

Trainee, Ankara

Ms. Fatma KARAGÖZ

Trainer, WHREP, SHÇEK

Tel: 0 312 310 24 60 / 13 95

Mob tel: 0 536 474 38 37

E-mail: [fkaragoz64@hotmail.com](mailto:fkaragoz64@hotmail.com)

Ms Aslıhan HAN

Trainer, WHREP, SHÇEK

Mr. İzamettin EKER

Head of the Department, Foreign Relations,

Tel: 0 312 418 44 03

Mob tel: 0 505 620 40 42

E-mail: [izamettin.eker@iskur.gov.tr](mailto:izamettin.eker@iskur.gov.tr)

Besim EVİZ

Provincial Director, Gaziantep

İŞKUR

Tel: 03423212998

E-mail: [besim.eviz@iskur.gov.tr](mailto:besim.eviz@iskur.gov.tr)

Mehmet ÖZCAN

Gaziantep, İŞKUR

Tel : 03423214900

E-mail: [mehmet.ozcan@iskur.gov.tr](mailto:mehmet.ozcan@iskur.gov.tr)

Fatma VAROL

Gaziantep, İŞKUR

Tel: 03423214900

[E-mail: atma.varol@iskur.gov.tr](mailto:atma.varol@iskur.gov.tr)

Mr Semih and Oğuz

Gaziantep, İŞKUR

Tel: 03423214900

Emine DÖKER

Gaziantep,

Tel: 5324705989

E-mail: [edoker@hotmail.com](mailto:edoker@hotmail.com)

Nihal TÜTÜNCÜLER

Gaziantep Women's Platforms

Tel: 5325591670

Email: [nihaltutunculer@hotmail.com](mailto:nihaltutunculer@hotmail.com)

Serpil KARUSERCI

Gaziantep, the Foundation of Entrepreneur Women

Tel: 03422311556

E-mail: [serpilkaruserci@hotmail.com](mailto:serpilkaruserci@hotmail.com)

Şükran Hanım

Gaziantep Municipality

Tel: 5422608833

Arzu ERBAĞCI

Gaziantep

Gazikent Training Company

Tel: 3422327300

Şükriye hanım

Gaziantep , Trainee

Serpil KAYGISIZ

Gaziantep

Elbim Training Company

Tel: 3422211212

Rukiye BASBUG

Trainee, Konya

Tel: 0 506 928 79 50

Hatice UYANIK

Trainee, Konya

Tel: 0 535 623 33 39

Songul DOGAN

Trainee, Konya

Tahsin GUVEN

Konya, IŞKUR

Provincial Director

Tel:3322333564

Email: [tahsin.guven@iskur.gov.tr](mailto:tahsin.guven@iskur.gov.tr)

Şükran DUMAN

Konya, IŞKUR

Tel: 3322333564

Mustafa MANGIR

Konya IŞKUR

Tel: 3322352469

Email : [mustafa.mangir@iskur.gov.tr](mailto:mustafa.mangir@iskur.gov.tr)

Mehmet YILMAZ

Konya, IŞKUR

Tel: 3322333564

Suzan UYSAL

Konya, the Foundation of Entrepreneur Women

Tel 5323210538

Nazife DEMIRHAN

Konya, the Foundation of University Women

Tel: 5325248576

Orhan YILDIZ

Konya, KSMMMO

Tel: 5337335628

Email: [orhanyildiz111@hotmail.com](mailto:orhanyildiz111@hotmail.com)

Ahmet Öztürk

OZBIM Training Firm

Konya

Focus group discussions:

25 women who were trained in Gaziantep

#### **Annex IV Women Human Right Education Programme Evaluation Notes**

- The meanings implied within the confines of two different languages without any bias.



- This project has helped me to gain self confidence. I did not know that I had all these rights which I have learnt whilst being in this project. As women I always thought we were second class citizens and men were always in the right and made the decisions'. But now I have learnt to question this thinking.
- Because of this project I have gained the courage to say we women do not come second we are here and we exist and we are equals.
- Before this course I wanted to go back to school but I lacked the confidence. But now I want to start my own business and only employ women. I hope I can do this.
- At the moment I am learning vocational skills. After completing the course I will work and show all the women around me how much and how well women can do.
- At the moment I am learning vocational skills. After completing the course I will work and show all the women around me how much and how well women can do.
- I was thinking of going to work 3 months before I joined the course. But after the course I am very decisive.
- After this course I will implement what I have learnt in particular my economic rights and my rights at work.
- Because of this course my consciousness as women has been raised and I will never go back to the feeling of low esteem I had before. I will utilise the knowledge gained to redirect my life in the future. I will work and get paid and have my own money and contribute to household.
- This as an excellent course, I have learnt women's rights and how to apply them to my life. I have changed the wrong to the right. This way I will be able to help the people around me.
- The fact that this course was implemented has made me feel important and honoured with the fact that somebody cares enough about me as a women. To understand women's rights and to be able to live like this. To be connected with other women around me has broadened my horizons
- There was an enclosed form around me. It was very difficult to break out of it but this course has helped me to do so. I have changed my attitude to life and broadened my horizon.
- I have started to work for the first time in my life. I was scared to do so before. Now I am working and I always will and contribute to the family.

- I have gained self confidence. Before I could not even leave the house but with help from this course I have learnt things that I did not know before. I used to be very shy but I am not anymore.
- I am a woman going through a divorce. During my marriage I felt helpless in many situations. But now I know that there are a lot of things I can do to help myself. Now if someone is not treating me in a fair way, I will not be quiet. I have also learnt that as a Turkish citizen I have a lot of rights. I have learnt how women can be equal in a society where women are considered as second class citizens, I have also learnt how in marriage women and men have the same rights. I am not helpless anymore. I have learnt how to say I can succeed I have learnt that I can have confidence in myself first and also have confidence in my husband.
- I was aware that I had rights but they were not clear. Now I know what they are.
- I can tell you that there has been major changes in my life, my thinking has changed I think differently now. I used to think that women should stay at home. Now I do not think like that. I used to think that women should not work that is because of my families influence on me. Now I know that I have economical rights. If I keep thinking like this I know one day my life will change.
- I have never been to a court but I have learnt that my husband divorced me; I learnt that I was divorced at the hospital I looked at the hospital records and saw my maiden name. Now that I know my rights I will go to a lawyer. .
- I have learnt more about my rights. If women are aware of her rights she can defend herself and be better equipped for life. Before I joined this course I was very hesitant. I thought that I would be very bored. But I found the course content very useful and the way it was taught very interesting. I will join every course of this type from now on.
- I have learnt about the legislative framework for women's rights. I trust the law more now. I have transferred the knowledge I have gained from this course to the women around me, especially the ones who were not aware of their rights. I think I have helped them a lot. I know how women are perceived in this society. I now know more about women and their issues. Now I feel like I am ready to develop a project to improve their situation.
- I have learnt the rights I have, that I did not know before. I have learnt about women and economy, women and violence and women's sexuality I know what my legal rights are now. I will help other women, my mother, my aunt and the others around me. A lot of men exploit women because we're very tolerant. Now I now I have to stand strong and I have to know my rights. No women are a prisoner of a man. Rather than say I cannot do it now I say I will do it. There is so much more. I have learnt so much and I will make what I learnt real.

- I now look at many things as a woman. I am wearing women's lenses. I evaluate everything I see as a woman now.
- I have now realised that I have internalized all the sexual stereotypes that the TV, books and commercials have taught us. This has been happening unconsciously since I was a little girl.
- I have changed many things and my thinking. Even if I am watching the TV I see it differently now. My thoughts that I could not even name before I have identified now.
- For the first time in my life I realised that I am a woman. I have rights. I am so glad that I have learnt all these things. I can now control my life. I knew that no woman should be a slave to any men. But I did not know how to stand up for my rights. I have learnt this now. I have applied what I learnt in this course slowly, particularly to the men in my family. I will defend gender equality as long I live. I will not only think about myself but will share what I have learnt with other women. I have already started to do so with my mother. My slogan from now on is this, we are different but equal.
- My self confidence has increased. I have learnt that I can comfortably talk about my thoughts and ideas. Now I am not scared of being judged. Nobody has a right to judge me. I am free to say what I want.
- I have been unemployed for the last seven months. Now when I look for a job I will take into account the working conditions and I will be able to discuss my desires.
- I have learnt a lot about women and sexuality. I have never had this education before. I have learnt about my reproductive rights, family planning and how to abort and unwanted pregnancy. I have learnt these not through hear say but from a reliable source.
- First of all the programme has made a big difference in my life. I have learnt the things I knew or thought I knew are not real
- The topic on the economical rights of women has been very beneficial to me. If a woman does not have economical rights she is just like a slave. When she has economical rights she is free.
- The topic on the economical rights of women has been very beneficial to me. I used to be very shy when I asked my husband for money. I thought because I was not working I did not have the right to ask for money. Now I know that I work more than he does. (at home).
- The most important part of the course was that it reminded me of all the things I knew but have forgotten. I have learnt how to be responsive to the issues.

- I have realised that there are many unaware women in our society. I have also realised how much we women can support each other. This programme should be expanded to all women as much as possible. We see many things on the films, women and their life stories. The programme taught me how much we can change our own lives.
- When I learnt the real definition of feminism I realised that I am a feminist.
- I have become aware of the rights I have. I have learnt where to go when I need help. I have learnt how to say stop to exploitation.
- After this programme I have learnt that violence, exploitation, forced marriages are not faith. Women have a right to change all that.
- I have gained self confidence due to this programme. I have learnt things that I did not know before. Now I defend myself against my husband and children because I am first as a mother and a wife. Of course they do not accept everything but I will not give up.
- Because of this programme I have increased myself confidence. I now talk more on the topics that I know. I can discuss myself and my thoughts more freely to my husband and my children. I have proved to my family that I have a right to an opinion.
- I have learnt that although I have responsibilities towards my husband and my children I also have the right to spare time for myself. During this course I talked to my husband and I told them that I have rights. I have told him that we should share household responsibilities. The result was positive. My husband attitude towards me has changed positively. I am a lot happier now.
- I have learnt to defend my rights to my husband. I have learned self confidence. I love working life. To be able to provide my children with pocket money is a beautiful feeling. Having money as women is beautiful. It is beautiful to contribute to the house hold income.
- I have learnt during this programme how to use language. And I used it. This language had a very positive impact on my husband and children. I can say I feel freer towards my husband. I do not ask permission now I just say I am doing, I am going. He now accepts all these changes in me. I wish I had done this course much before, earlier in my life.
- Now I do feel confident. I never used to trust myself. I can now stand on my feet and I have rights. I became more aware. I learnt that nobody can make me do the things I do not want to do. I have learnt that women can also do whatever they want to do. They can overcome any difficulties. As long as women have self confidence they are capable of doing everything that men can do.

- Girls and boys are equal and we should not discriminate. They should be treated as equals.
- I have been married for four years. I am a housewife. I do not want to start work,
- I have learnt to work and have to be strong and stand in my life. I will defend my rights better because of all the things I have learnt in this course.
- At the end of this course I have learnt that every woman can work and stand on her own.
- I always wanted to work as a hobby but after this programme I think differently
- I am a house wife now, I do want to work.