



International Labour Organization

IPEC

International Programme on the Elimination of Child Labour

IPEC Evaluation

National Programme for the Elimination of Child Labour in Lebanon

LEB/00/P51/FRA

P 26 503 516 051

An Final Independent Project Evaluation

by Mahmoud Masri

Evaluation Consultant

March 2004

1.	Objective of the report.....	1
2.	The IPEC Programme in Lebanon	1
2.1	Short recap of the IPEC in Lebanon	1
2.2	General objectives of the program.....	1
2.3	Activities of the IPEC project.....	5
3.	Child labour in Lebanon.....	9
3.1	The nature of the child labour problem in Lebanon	9
3.2	Size of the Problem.....	9
3.3	Difficulties concerning child labour	11
4.	The evaluation of the program	12
4.1	Basis of evaluation of the program	12
4.2	Methodology of the evaluation	13
4.3	Criteria of the evaluation	15
5.	Evaluation results	15
5.1	Difficulties that the program faced	15
5.2	Results obtained since the launch of the program	17
5.3	Effectiveness of the program	18
5.4	Success of the program	21
5.5	Impact of the program.....	23
6.	Lessons learned & good practices	24
7.	Conclusions/Recommendations	25

1. Objective of the report

Based on the agreement between the ILO and the IPEC (National Program in Lebanon) on one hand and M. Mahmoud Al-Masri writer of the report on the other hand, the Terms of Reference for the evaluation report are as following:

- Short recap of the IPEC in Lebanon.
- Field Meetings and interviews with the program's partners in order to prepare the draft report.
- Organizing a workshop for the Lebanese partners to present the preliminary results in order to get feedback.
- Presenting the final draft of the evaluation report before the 31st of December 2003.

2. The IPEC Programme in Lebanon

2.1 Short recap of the IPEC in Lebanon

The Agreement memorandum, between the Lebanese government and the ILO/IPEC, was signed beginning of November 2000 with funding from the French government. The National program contains many projects some of which are national others are local with the collaboration of:

- Official institutions (ministries of Labour, Interior, education and the muhafazats).
- Municipalities.
- Broad Civil society organizations (General Confederation of Labour and the Lebanese Industrialists Association, and specialized associations in Nabattieh, the North, and the Northern Cost of Metn).

2.2 General objectives of the program

A- Awareness raising:

- Raising the general awareness concerning child Labour in Lebanon through campaigns focusing on the problem, its causing factors and its predicted impacts; and this action should also focus on all the actors

(public institutions, NGOs, Civil Society, ILO and the National program) that could play a positive role in solving this issue.

B- Capacity building:

- Contributing, coordinating and participation in specialized seminars concerning child labour and how to fight this phenomenon through empowerment and capacity building of the diverse actors.
- Capacity building of the relevant ministries.
- Capacity building of the labour related organizations.
- Capacity building of municipalities.

Capacity building program for the ministry of Labour through:

- Training the Labour inspectors.
- Creating an anti-child labour unit.
- Geographical realm: national level.
- Start of the program: 15 September 2001.
- Length of the program: 15 months.
- Implementing party: labour ministry.

Capacity building program for the ministry of the interior and the municipalities concerning street-based child labour:

- Geographical realm: Beirut.
- Start of the program: 1 November 2001.
- Length of the program: 15 months.
- Implementing party: the ministry of the interior and the municipalities.

Prevention, rehabilitation and worst kinds of child labour eradication program in Bab Al-Tabaneh (Tripoli):

- Geographical realm: North Lebanon
- Start of the program: June 2002.
- Length of the program: 10 months.
- Implementing party: Municipality Federation of Al-Fayha' (Tripoli, Mina and Al-Badawi).

Prevention, rehabilitation and worst kinds of child labour eradication program in the Muhafazat of Nabattieh:

- Geographical realm: the Muhafazat of Nabattieh.
- Start of the program: 15 September 2001.
- Length of the program: 12 months.
- Implementing party: Ministry of education.

Capacity building program in certain regions:

- Geographical realm: Metn du Nord
- Start of the program: 30 November 2001.
- Length of the program: 15 months.
- Implementing party: Lebanese Industrialist Association.

Capacity building program for the General Confederation of Labour in preventing the worst kinds of child labour in Lebanon:

- Geographical realm: National Level.
- Start of the program: 30 November 2001.
- Length of the program: 17 months.
- Implementing party: General Confederation of Labour.

Prevention, rehabilitation and elimination of worst kinds of child labour in Sein Al-Feel and Burj Hamoud:

- Geographical realm: Southern eastern suburbs of Beirut.
- Start of the program: 15 September 2001.
- Length of the program: 12 months.
- Implementing party: Holy Cross aid association and the Coordination committee of the Sein Al-Feel and Burj Hamoud association.

C- Legal and legislative level:

- Change Lebanese legislation so it could be more in conformity to International agreement and to issue implementation directives to safeguard them.

- Contribute in expanding the role of civil society organizations by raising its awareness and its advocacy skills to pressure for the signing of the two special ILO conventions: 138/ pertaining to the specification of the lower age threshold for employment; 182/ pertaining to the eradication of the worst kind of child labour.
- Contribute in strengthening the law pertaining to the obligatory free primary education, which helps in limiting child labour.

D- Coordination:

- Creating structures of cooperation between Labour unions, employers associations, NGOs and public institutions.
- Creating structures of cooperation between ministries, central governments institutions in the regions, municipalities and civil society organizations.
- Creating structures of cooperation between the diverse specialized units in the pertaining ministries.

E- Studies and statistics:

- Encouraging research and studies on the child labour phenomenon
- Creating a database linked to the phenomenon of child labour; because of the lack of any statistics on the subject. The most recent study containing statistics on the subject dates from 1997 was done by the ministry of social affairs and the UNDP, on a 'wild' sample of 70 000 families representing approximately 10% of the population.

F- General policy:

- Participation in the development of public policies concerning child labour.
- Effort to guaranty the adoption of a national strategy, which will prioritize the issue and adopt a working plan.
- Initiating pioneering pilot projects that include public administration and civil society organizations in order for them to become a springboard for nation-wide projects.

2.3 Activities of the IPEC project

The IPEC in Lebanon has implemented a series of projects with the public administration and NGOs as we previously mentioned, which is considered as a pioneering program serving as a start for future projects. These projects have long-term objectives as well as short-term ones both could be categorized along:

- Qualitative.
- Quantitative.

It should be noted that the short-term objectives were clear, precise and measurable, as well as producing a certain number of indicators that measure how much the program attained its objectives:

A) Ministry of Labour project:

- Creation of a specialized anti-child labour unit within the ministry with support from administrative infrastructure.
- Training and capacity building of the unit's members.
- Change and development of Lebanese legislation in order to conform to international legislation.
- Pressure in order to sign to ILO agreements (138 & 182).
- Organizing a raising awareness campaigns.
- Organizing a national conference on the international agreement 182.
- Finding coordination paths between the different IPEC projects in Lebanon.
- Publishing booklets on the subject.
- Effort to include local community.
- Collecting citizen's complaints and queries about the non-implementation of laws regarding child labour.
- Creation of a national Database.
- Creation of a web site concerning the issue.
- Reforming vocational training programs
- Adoption of a national strategy and contribution in the development of public policies.
- Supervising the all-inclusive national study on the issue as well as legal and technical implementation plans for its proposals.

B) Nabatiyeh project:

A pioneering project that include public administrations, NGOs and Municipalities in its implementation supervision framework.

- Permanent census in Schools in the region on potential school dropouts.
- Formulation of an educational aid program to help these potential dropouts.
- Organizing awareness raising conferences
- Succeeding to include labour unions and employer associations in the project.
- Number of children extracted from the labour market and their replacement with adult workforce.
- Social aide to these extracted children.
- Extraction of 500 working child in hazardous environments by educating and training them.
- Aiding 500 families of working children.
- Extracting 500 children below 15 years and educating them.

C) Ministry of interior project:

- Creation of a specialized anti-child labour unit within the ministry.
- Institutionalization of this unit.
- Organizing a small follow-up committee to transfer working children to the relevant services.
- Training of a group of policemen on the means of handling of street children.
- Forming of a joint supervising Structure that include ministry personnel and other human resources (social workers and NGO activists).
- Raising general awareness to the problem.
- Capacity building for the municipalities.
- Extraction of 500 street children and insuring schooling, rehabilitation and social services for them and their families.
- Airing TV Spots on the issue.
- Training the prefects on the means of implementation of the laws and international agreements.

D) Association of Lebanese Industrialists project:

- A study on the conditions of working children and their families in the shoe and the clothes industry in the southern and northern suburbs.
- Creation of an information unit within the Association of Lebanese Industrialists.
- Data collection on working children in industry and taking the relevant action to remedy that.
- Raising awareness campaigns for industrialists specialized in the dangers children face in industry.
- Publication of a pamphlet to raise awareness aimed at employers.

E) Burj Hamoud/Sin El-Feel project:

- Collection of Data on 900 potential dropouts and potential enterers in the labour market.
- Data collection on the families of these children.
- Insuring social and medical services for these children
- Insuring an educational aide program for potential school dropouts.
- Specialized center for rehabilitation of children working in the drug trade.
- Insuring training services for working children that cannot go back to school.
- Working with working young girls in order to protect them from sexual exploitation and working in prostitution.
- Help children so they can go back to school.
- Social Aid to the children and their families.
- Raising awareness programs aimed at working children and their families.
- Raising awareness programs aimed at employers in the informal sector.
- Creation of job opportunities for the families of working children.
- Creating leisure projects for these children.

F) Bab Al-Tebaneh Project:

- The aim of the project is long-term: to stop children labour [under 15 years] in the informal industrial sector and to train children between 15 to 18 years.
- Extraction of 200 children (150 boys and 50 girls) from the labour market.
- Preventive programs for siblings of working children.

- Insuring social aide and income increasing program for 200 families of working children.
- Replacing children with adult laborers.
- Cooperation between the private sector and the NGOs in order to formulate a clear policy concerning the issue.
- Raising the number of families, recipient of social aide.
- Campaign to pressure for the implementation of free obligatory primary schooling.

G) Labour union project:

- Capacity rising of labour unions so they can face the problem of the worst kinds of child labour.
- Capacity building of labour union cadres.
- Raising the awareness of decision makers into improving the condition of working children.
- Formulating a national strategy for labour union to stop children labour.
- Aid to all sectors of society to stop children labour.
- Circulation of data from the region to the national institutions.
- Pinpointing the whereabouts of working children and telling the authorities.
- Formulating new initiatives not included in the program that will be implemented by labour unions.

3. Child labour in Lebanon

3.1 The nature of the child labour problem in Lebanon

The phenomenon of child labour in Lebanon is one of the issues that threaten children's rights in the context of increasing socio-economic crisis, of paralysis of the educational system and the absence of any national policies on the issue. The child labour situation in Lebanon, quite similar to that of the neighboring countries, which can be divided into four categories:

- Children working for a salary.
- Children working without a salary.
- Children working seasonally.
- Children working full time.

With regard to the impact of the children's work on schooling:

- Children continuing their schooling while working.
- Children not continuing their schooling while working.

3.2 Size of the Problem

A) The number of working children aged between 10 and 17 was estimated by the UNDP/ministry of social affairs report at **31 716** distributed gender-wise as follows:

- 86% males.
- 17,9% females.

B) Nationalities of working children:

- 92,6% **Lebanese.**
- 3,6% **Syrian**
- 3% **Other Arab nationalities.**
- 0,8% **other nationalities.**

C) Geographical distribution based on a study done by the Central National Statistic Bureau, with the aid of UNICEF, in 2000:

- 47% **in the North.**
- 24% **in Mount Lebanon.**
- 12% **in the Bequaa.**
- 11% **in the South.**
- 6% **in Beirut.**

D) Distribution according to trade sectors:

- 45,3% **working in informal trade sector.**
- 44,7% **working in the private sector.**

Concerning the nature of the work:

- 52,5% **working in handicraft, industry and construction.**
- 16,5% **working as sellers.**
- 15,6% **working in agriculture.**
- 6,2% **working as domestics and cleaners.**

Concerning length of work:

- 64,2% **working full time.**
- 15% **working intermittently.**
- 13,3% **working seasonally.**
- 7,5% **working part time.**

Concerning salaries:

- 46,8% **of those working full time or part time are paid less than 200 000 L.L.**
- 35,30% **of the above less than 100 000 LP.**

E) Health services for working children:

- 93,3% **have no Health services.**
- 6,7% **are linked to the social security of the working parents.**

F) Level of education of working children:

- 95,4% **dropped out of school.**
- 3,8% **have never joined school.**
- 0,8% **still go to school.**

Concerning those that have left school:

- 79,2% **because of high school fees.**

Concerning their school level:

- 70% **reached primary education.**
- 26,2% **reached complementary education.**
- 3,8% **are illiterate.**

3.3 Difficulties concerning child labour

- A) Lack of database or any nation-wide statistical data.
- B) Non-implementation of the law on obligatory free primary education.
- C) Rise of the number of dropouts.
- D) Lack of sufficient public schools in peripheral poor areas.
- E) Weakness of the educational system.
- F) Unevenness in quality between private and public schools.
- G) High school fees.
- H) High unemployment in Lebanon.
- I) Increase in poverty, decrease in income and direct impact on children.
- J) Lack of social safety net.
- K) Uneven development in Lebanon's regions.
- L) Non-implementation of laws and international conventions
- M) Non-prioritizing of children problems.
- N) Lack of a national strategy on the issue.
- O) Difficulties in adaptation of civil society organizations.
- P) Lack of serious projects concerning the issue of child labour.

4. The evaluation of the program

4.1 Basis of evaluation of the program

Introduction: An evaluation is an assessment reached through the answering of the following questions:

- Is the program running well?
- Are the objectives being met?
- Are the objectives relevant and adequate?

This means that the evaluation should be made:

- During the implementation of the project (implementation phase).
- At the completion of the projects and the program (results phase).

That is why the evaluation process is based on the consideration that it could give us an objective judgment based on the following facts:

- The implementation of joint projects of IPEC and its partners
- The projected and the actual results of the project.

Thus the importance of evaluating the program and its projects to show:

- The Successes.
- The failures.
- The determining factors that led to these results.

Considering that the culture of evaluation is neither rooted in governmental work nor in NGOs work in Lebanon, work was done with all partners to reach bases and rules necessary for the evaluation process to succeed:

- Involvement of all project participants in the evaluation process.
- The understanding by all partners of the importance of the evaluation for the good implementation of the present and future programs.
- Reaching of a common perception of a number of benefits that will be reached if these projects remain.
- Presence of the need and the capacity to learn in order to benefit from this evaluation.

4.2 Methodology of the evaluation

- Individual Discussion.
- Group Discussion.
- Review of reports.
- Observation.
- Statistical data.
- Interviews:

List of persons interviewed:

1. Mr. Jean Baptist (first secretary)
Mrs. Nada Fatouh
French Embassy.
2. Mrs. Khawla Matar, IPEC Project coordinator.
3. Mrs. Hayat Ossieran, IPEC National Coordinator.
4. Mr. Boutros Saade, General Confederation of Lebanese Workers (CGTL).
5. Mr. Hisham Abou Jawdeh, Association of Lebanese Industries.
6. Mrs. Suzy Sagharian, (Coordinator) of the Programme of Prevention, Rehabilitation and Elimination of Worst Forms of Child Labour in the Sein El Feel- Burj hamoud Area.
Mrs. Siham Abou Jawdeh Member of the Committee
7. Mr Fawzi Hajj Hasan, Ministry of Labour
Mrs. Nazheh Chalita (Coordinator of Child Labour Unit in MOL)
8. Mrs. Raja Mansour, Ministry of Interior and Municipalities
(Coordinator of Child Labour Unit)
9. Mr. Kassem Shietani, (Coordinator of NGOs Committee in Nabbattiye Programme)
Mr. Ahmed Mroweh (Coordinator of Nabbattiye Center)
10. Mr. Bassem Assaf, (Coordinator of NGOs Committee in Tripoli Programme)
Mr. Nabil Chander Member of the Committee
Mr. Rami Ladkanni, (Coordinator of Bab el Tibbani Center)
11. Mrs. Souhiala Khatib, (Coordinator of Ain Helwa Programme in the Palestinian Camp, North Lebanon)

- **Field visits**
- Anti-child labour unit's center in the ministry of labour.
- Anti-street child labour unit's center in the ministry of the interior.
- Association of Industrialist project.
- Ministry of education's project (Nabatiyeh)
- Anti-child labour unit's center at the GCL
- Burj Hamoud / Sein Al-Feel project.
- Faihaa Municipality federation's project.
- Anti-child labour center in the Palestinian refugee camp of Ein Al Helweh
- French Embassy
- Information bureau of ILO in Beirut.
- Coordinating office of IPEC in Lebanon.
- Meetings with local administrations, NGOs and volunteers/workers in the program.

- **Presentation of results of the workshop of all the partners held in the 19th January 2004.**

List of the participants:

1. Project Coordinator of IPEC programme, Dr. Khawla Matar
2. National coordinator of IPEC programme, Mrs. Hayat Ossieran
3. Mr. Boutros Saade, General Confederation of Lebanese Workers (CGTL).with two members from the CGTL
4. Mr. Hisham Abou Jawdeh, Association of Lebanese Industries.
5. Mrs. Suzy Sagharian the coordinator of Sin El Fil- Borj hammoud Programme with members from the committee (9 members).
6. Mrs. Nazheh Chalita (Coordinator of Child Labour Unit in MOL).
7. Mrs. Raja Mansour, Ministry of Interior and Municipalities (Coordinator of Child Labour Unit).
8. Mr. Ahmed Mroweh (Coordinator of Nabbattiye Center).
9. Mr. Rami Ladkanni, (Coordinator of Bab el Tibbani Center)
10. Mrs. Souhiala Khatib, (Coordinator of Ain Helwa Center)

4.3 Criteria of the evaluation

These criterias permitted us to have an evaluative judgment on the IPEC program in Lebanon.

Criteria of the evaluation:

- Effectiveness: measuring the effectiveness by comparing the objectives with the actual results
- Success: measuring the success, by comparing the results with the means and resources used.
- Impact: accessing the economic impact, the social impact, the environmental impact, the cultural impact and the psychological impact.
- Relevance: By reviewing the objectives and the strategy, was the strategy adequate? Did the program fulfill the expectancies of those concerned? What is the impact on the target group?

The aim of the evaluation in accordance with the ILO / IPEC's TOR is not the evaluation of the program but the evaluation of the implementation and its impact, based on the information needs of the funders, the partners and the project workers.

- How did things work out?
- Did the program meet its objectives?
- Is there a future need of changes in the program?

5. Evaluation results

5.1 Difficulties that the program faced

The difficulties encountered can be grouped as follows:

General policy level:

- Lack of a clear national strategy on the issue.

Legislative level:

- Non-implementation of international conventions and agreements.
- Non-implementation of the law on free obligatory primary education.

- Lax implementation of labour laws.
- Non-integration of the agricultural sector and the domestic workers sector in the scope of the labour law.
- Lack of reinforcement of the role of labour inspectors.

Information level:

- Lack of interest of the media to cover the subject.

Structural level:

- Lack of previous infrastructure pertaining the tackling of children labour.
- Lack of previous experience.

Awareness level:

- Low awareness, both governmental wise and civil society wise, on the scope of the problem and its negative impacts.

Knowledge of the law level:

- Weak knowledge of the laws.

Institution weakness level:

- Institutional weaknesses among some of the partners.

Cooperation level:

- Lack of cooperation between the different concerned ministries.

Planning level:

- Non-formulation of alternatives if funding ceased.

Family awareness level:

- Lack of awareness among working children families on the dangers faced.

Financial level:

- Because of the national economic crisis, unemployment and lack of knowledge of the scope of the problem a lot of the partners thought that the program's budget was low.

Dropping out level:

- Higher level of school dropping out than the targeted number for aid.

Specialized centers level:

- Lack of Specialized centers.

Bureaucratic level:

- Bureaucratic red tape slowing down work and hindering cooperation.

Clarity of Objectives level:

- Lack of clarity of some objectives for some partners and lack of relevance of the program with a lot of civil society organizations programs (service based and not development based). The program in itself does not lack relevance neither does its objectives it is the civil society organizations that have yet to “become” adequate to the needs of the program by adapting themselves to the strategical shift from caritative/service organizations to organizations that are proponents of sustainable development .

5.2 Results obtained since the launch of the program

The program managed to speed things and prioritize the issue of child labour, both on the public and private level as well as national and international levels.

The program obtained good national as well as local results, which could be considered as a contribution to the sensitization of the general public to this subject, which is absent from governmental and citizen for years after the end of the civil war. This “contribution” did not limit itself to sensitization but served as an electroshock to quick start the child labour prevention action.

5.3 Effectiveness of the program

Legislative level:

- Signing of the international agreement number 182 pertaining to the worst kinds of child labour on the 2/8/2002.
- Signing of the international agreement number 138 pertaining to the minimal age of work on the 5/8/2002.
- Signing of the special protocol annex to the children rights convention pertaining the exploitation of children, child prostitution and child pornography.

Administrative level:

- Establishment of a specialized child labour unit in the ministry of labour.
- Establishment of a specialized child labour unit in the ministry of the interior.
- Creating and training Government Action Committees Against Child Labour in the different regions of Lebanon. Those committees included representatives of workers and employers organizations, local municipalities, NGO's and ministries of labour, education, health, social affairs etc.)

General level:

- Participation of the ministry of interior, which traditionally is security oriented only.
- Prioritization of the issue by the Muhafizoun
- Participation of municipalities, financially as well as in kind services
- Formulation and finalization of the national policy and programme framework.
- Change in the social infrastructure dealing with the issue, this includes:
- Sensitization of the media towards the issue
- Establishment of two specialized centers for working children, in North as well as South of Lebanon, creation and strengthening of a network of eight specialized organizations in North Eastern poverty belt of Beirut, all dealing with the worst forms of child labour

- Establishment of two child labour units at ministries of labour and interior respectively
- Establishment of “award winning” website at the Ministry of Labour on child labour and all the organizations and programmes working on the issue. This website, won first prize in the category of “governmental websites” by a national competition sponsored by Microsoft in February 2004
- Introducing child labour on the agenda of the parliamentary committee for labour, social affairs and health and the committee for education. Several public meetings were held in the parliament for the purpose.
- Platforms of cooperating NGO’s have been formed in North (Tripoli) and South Lebanon (Nabbattiye), to support the child labour efforts at the respective Governorate levels.
- Creation of an all-inclusive national steering committee.

Mobilization of extra resources for programme:

The project coordinator had mobilized US\$30,000 from a Bahraini donor to buy Tripoli center. The project coordinator had also mobilized US\$20,0000 from UNESCO for a joint awareness programme with ILO.

IPEC Lebanon had mobilized \$32,000 from the British Embassy (Commonwealth Fund) after going through a world wide competition for the Fund. This money went to the Ministry of Interior to complement what IPEC paid (\$27,500) for enhancing the capacity of the Ministry and its personnel to combat the phenomenon of working street children in Lebanon. IPEC Lebanon also mobilized \$18,000 from the British Embassy for a mini- programme established within the Palestinian camp of Ein el-Hilwe for potential school dropouts and working children. IPEC here had only contributed \$4,900.

Governor of Nabbattiye (South Lebanon) and Mayor of Nabbattiye had collectively mobilized over \$30,000 over the past two and a half years for the costs of transportation of working children to and from IPEC established children’s center. Children are usually brought from their workplaces and taken back to their homes at the end of the day after they receive their relevant services from center.

Almost a worth of \$ 100,000 of in kind services have been provided by the participating NGO's collectively from the South, the North and the North Eastern Poverty Belt of Beirut working with the established programmes and centers. Those services include:

- nutritional, health, social services
- loans for income generating activities for families of working children
- educational support programmes
- provision of social workers to work with the respective programmes etc.

Planning for sustainability of some major Programs

There are various important factors for the sustainability of the National program in conjunction with public institutions and Civil society organizations. The child labour issue in Lebanon reached a level of awareness and readiness for all governmental and civil parties, which makes it difficult to go steps backwards even if IPEC ceases its involvement, since concrete steps as well specialized job creation has been taken.

a) On the governmental level: All official institutions, especially the legislative assembly, have had a clear position on child labour, which is expressed in the signing and passing of the international agreements relevant to child labour (what is lacking is the legal directives necessary for implementation). The issuing of a law installing free obligatory primary education, which if implemented well will limit greatly school dropouts in order to enter the labour market.

b) The ministry of Labour: A genuine enthousiasm has been created coupled with the creation of a specialized unit, capacity building of labour inspectors and the start of a national strategy plan.

c) Ministry of education: through institutional and informal vocational education programs for working children.

d) Ministry of the Interieur: A qualitative transformation: child labour issue is now being considered as social problem not a criminal one.

e) The increasingly positive position of municipalities towards the issue and their readiness to take the mantel of the program after IPEC.

f) The enthusiasm and readiness of the NGO sector.

g) After long negotiations, Ministry of Education has offered a three storey building that it owns in Nabbattiye for the IPEC programme (child protection centre). Moreover, they included a small budget for the program last year

h) The Union of el-Faihaa Municipalities, which IPEC Lebanon had created a strong working relationship with, have signed a letter from IPEC to them asking them to allocate LL 25,000,000 (almost \$16,700,000) for the running costs of the program during 2004-2005.

5.4 Success of the program

Cooperation:

IPEC program played a pivotal role in starting the cooperation between the different partners.

Establishment of specialized research and statistics:

- National Policy and Programme Framework under the ministry of labour.
- Study by the association of Lebanese industrialists on the garment and footwear sector in the poverty belts of Beirut and publishing of a booklet on the health hazards faced by working children in industries aimed at the employers.
- Study completed by the ministry of the interior on “working street children in Lebanon”.
- Creation of a web-site at Ministry of Labour with results of different studies published by different partners in Lebanon on child labour
- Conceptual study on “Gender, Education and Child Labour” financed by HQ
- Provision of orientation by IPEC- Lebanon and Ministry of labour to students in order for them to research this issue.
- Rapid assessment carried out by ILO/IPEC Lebanon on Children working in the Tobacco plantations in South Lebanon (carried out by Consultation and Research Institute)

- Study on the neurotoxicity effects on children working in hazardous establishments in the poverty belts of Tripoli (American University of Beirut, Faculty of Health sciences).
- A small baseline data on the children in a fishing seaside city in South Lebanon carried out by two independent social workers

Training and rehabilitation level:

- Introducing the program to all implementation partners.
- Training of the social workers involved in the program.
- Training of police officers.
- Training labour inspectors.
- Training of labour union personnel.
- Training school principals and teachers.
- Employers on the manual produced for health and safety hazards in the factories
- Training of Governorate Committees on Child Labour and its effects and what can they do in that respect
- Special trainings were carried out in Tripoli for employers and checklists for working places were produced and tested (for the first time).
- Several types of training took place for Labour Inspectors:(TOT in labour inspection, labour inspection in child labour and on how to use the checklists produced and the child labour manual which was translated into Arabic by the Ministry of Labour
- The Child labour Units at the Ministry of Interior and Ministries of Labour were also trained

Sensitization and raising the awareness of the public on the issue of child labour

- The interest of the media grew tremendously in the issue of child labour. Almost 30 TV interviews and almost 70 small and long newspaper articles were carried on child labour (with IPEC NPM, ILO focal point, respective IPEC partners and targeted working children)
- IPEC-Lebanon programme was chosen as one of the best seven programmes in Lebanon targeting marginalized groups. It was chosen by a joint committee of UNDP and Beirut International Marathon Committee.

Therefore, 500 working children selected from IPEC partners were sponsored to run in the International Marathon that took place in Beirut in October 2003. They all had STOP CHILD LABOUR on their back. In addition, on the same day of the Marathon, where the whole country was following the news, a famous Lebanese and satellite TV channel (LBC) made a 5 minute news report about IPEC during the news broadcast. This represented very good media and sensitization on the issue of child labour to almost the whole Republic

- A T.V spot was prepared on C.182 and the Health hazards of early child labour. This spot was sponsored by a company who manages all the TV screens in waiting rooms of almost 26 hospitals in Lebanon (public and private). The spot was shown every hour/day for 3 months and therefore seen by almost 7,000 parents.
- Brochures and leaflets on the respective IPEC programmes and on C.182 were printed by the different IPEC programmes and distributed to not less than 10,000 persons altogether
- A T.V spot produced jointly between IPEC and the Ministry of Interior on how to deal with working street children, will soon be aired on Lebanese TV.

5.5 Impact of the program

It is not easy to measure the impact since the program is only two years old and the main challenge is the change of mentalities, which requires substantial time. Nevertheless the need for the program coupled with its relevance and measurable objectives permits us to say that the program through its project succeeded to:

- Pushing public administration in participating side by side with civil society organizations
- Start of formulation of a national strategy
- Creation of the required infrastructure.
- Signing of international agreements.
- Creation of specialized units in the ministries, workers and employers organisations

The factors permitting this outcome is that the IPEC program managed to build the capacity and raise the awareness of the people in the NGOs and in the various ministries, which formed specialized units, in turn these became “the local champions” of the program putting their energies from the bottom up. This internal factor in conjugation with the external factor that is the stature of the ILO, IPEC-Lebanon as well as sometimes UNICEF communicating with the Lebanese government on a near equal footing permitting the government to be receptive to “local champions”

6. Lessons learned & good practices

A good practice in the lebanese IPEC program to the point it can be used as a pilot project is the coordinating example that was set up by IPEC-Lebanon and the muhafez of the South, which raised the awareness of the latter who in turn impulsed the creation of joint committees that eliminated most of the hurdles in front of the launching of the program, as well as secure the presence of the various concerned ministries and trained social workers and financial backing for the projects.

In the North with the enthusiasm of the federation of municipalities a good lesson learned is that partnership, especially partnership with local government, is a key component of success, to the point that the federation committed itself to financially back the project after the withdrawal of IPEC.

A third good practice is the inclusion of the ministry of interior, in it's first non-securative project, which makes it also a pilot project.

The raising of the awareness of the public servants, in the ministry of Labour, is a tangible fact, which permits the issue to achieve a central status in public policy.

The inclusion of municipalities, NGOs and various other civil society organizations, who are “more acceptable” to the privat sector as well as to the general population while at the same time politically covered by governmental institutions.

Another lesson learned is the importance of capacity building for people involved in the program since enthusiasm is not enough to insure the success of the projects. The lack

of institutionalization of the work is a negative factor as with the CGTL, which lacks genuine organization and thus impact.

7. Conclusions/Recommendations

It is necessary that the program continue, which is the sentiment of all partners as well as the target group (working children). But certain extra efforts are needed, which they are the following:

- Making the national committee responsible for the supervision of the projects.
- Reinforcing cooperation in implementing the projects by creating structures of co operations where all partners are represented and form an implementation team. Until now cooperation tended to be more limited to meetings where each side tending to work on its own afterwards.
- Pressuring for the inclusion of the informal sector and the agricultural sector within the scope of labour laws.
- Reinforcing municipality's prerogatives concerning this issue.
- Speed up the implementation of a national strategy
- More special rehabilitation centers (i.e. Beka region).
- Increasing raising awareness action, quantitatively and qualitatively. Television and radio media should be integrated in long-term campaign spots to raise the awareness of the general public, it should be visibly sponsored by the head of state and governmental figures in order to increases its media impact. The campaign spots should target also specific target groups like employers, teachers etc. Ministry of information should be integrated in this aspect of the program since it can best insure the media's cooperation.
- Creation of a social safety net, which requires new legislation and adequate funding: unemployment aid, Social family aid for families with numerous kids and aid for single-parent families. The ministry of Social affairs should push for these new legislations.
- Implementing the laws.
- Passing by the parliament of the signed international agreements (the government signs international agreements but for them to be put into effect the parliament has to ratify them)
- More capacity building of partners.

Concerning the second phase the program should focus on priority regions like the Bab Al-Tabaneh (North) region because of the extreme problems of underdevelopment that it is facing, making it the worst geographical area for working children under 10 years of age. Other geographical areas should be included like the Beqaa Valley and the region of Akkar in the North, where the number of children at very early age working in agriculture, in domestic households and in other sectors is very high.

The second stage should see IPEC pressuring for the formulation of implementation decrees for the passed laws, concerning working children as well as concerning free obligatory primary education [which should be raised to 15 years to compensate the gap with the labour age limit]. The laws have been passed but the challenge for the program is the implementation, the ILO/IPEC will have a pivotal role in concertation with the other partners.

As for capacity building it is a priority issue for the sustainability of the project, so the partners can institutionalize their tasks and insure the continuation of the program on their own.

Conclusion

A meeting was held with the first secretary of the French embassy who informed us that the funding of the IPEC program in Lebanon was initiated by the French ministry of labour and social affairs directly with the ILO in Geneva without passing by the French embassy in Beirut. Nevertheless the relationship with the ILO/IPEC in Beirut was excellent so the perception of the management of the program is excellent because it was possible to initiate a large network of public administrations and civil society organizations. Thus in conclusion the embassy felt the need for the continuation of the program because of its success and the need for it.