



Combating the Exploitation of Child Labor in the Footwear Industry of the Vale dos Sinos, Brazil



Brasilia, April 2002

An Ex-post Evaluation by Independent Evaluators

**Combating the Exploitation of Child Labor
in the Footwear Industry of the Vale dos Sinos, Brazil**

International Programme on the Elimination of Child Labour (IPEC)

Brasilia, April 2002

Copyright © International Labour Organization 2004

Publications of the International Labour Office enjoy copyright under Protocol 2 of the Universal Copyright Convention.

Nevertheless, short excerpts from them may be reproduced without authorization, on condition that the source is indicated. For rights of reproduction or translation, application should be made to the ILO Publications Bureau (Rights and Permissions), International Labour Office, CH-1211 Geneva 22, Switzerland. The International Labour Office welcomes such applications.

Libraries, institutions and other users registered in the United Kingdom with the Copyright Licensing Agency, 90 Tottenham Court Road, London W1T 4LP [Fax: (+44) (0)207631 5500; e-mail: cla@cla.co.uk], in the United States with the Copyright Clearance Center, 222 Rosewood Drive, Danvers, MA 01923 [Fax: (+1) (978) 7504470; e-mail: info@copyright.com] or in other countries with associated Reproduction Rights Organizations, may make photocopies in accordance with the licences issued to them for this purpose.

ISBN softcover: 92-2-116665-1

ISBN PDF: 92-2-116666-X (web version)

First published 2004

Cover photograph: ILO, J. Maillard

The designations employed in ILO publications, which are in conformity with United Nations practice, and the presentation of material therein do not imply the expression of any opinion whatsoever on the part of the International Labour Office concerning the legal status of any country, area or territory or of its authorities, or concerning the delimitation of its frontiers.

The responsibility for opinions expressed in signed articles, studies and other contributions rests solely with their authors, and publication does not constitute an endorsement by the International Labour Office of the opinions expressed in them.

Reference to names of Firms and commercial products and processes does not imply their endorsement by the International Labour Office, and any failure to mention a particular firm, commercial product or process is not a sign of disapproval.

ILO publications can be obtained through major booksellers or ILO local offices in many countries, or direct from ILO Publications, International Labour Office, CH-1211 Geneva 22, Switzerland. Catalogues or lists of new publications are available free of charge from the above address.

Printed by the International Labour Office, Geneva, Switzerland

P R E F A C E

This report is part of a series of ex post evaluations that ILO/IPEC is carrying out as part of building the knowledge base on sustainability and long term impact of action against child labour. The intention is for the outcome of this report to be used for further development of effective and durable strategies and models of intervention.

This report has been prepared by independent evaluators¹ based on Terms of Reference developed by ILO/IPEC. It has been reviewed by outside stakeholders concerned with the project.

The opinions and recommendations included in this report are those of the authors, although the views of the stakeholders involved in the review are reflected. The content of the report does not necessarily reflect the views of ILO or any other organization involved in the project.

The ex-post evaluation process was managed by ILO-IPEC's Design, Evaluation and Documentation Section (DED), with support from the IPEC team in Brazil.

Funding for this ex post evaluation was provided by the United States Department of Labor. This report does not necessarily reflect the views or policies of the United States Department of labor nor does mention of trade names, commercial products, or organizations imply endorsement by the United States Government.

¹ Paulo Henrique Lustosa (*Team Leader*), Casturina Jaira da Silva and Tamára Cecília Karawejczyk

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	Pg
INTRODUCTION	1
PART I – THE SCENARIO AND ITS CHANGES	5
The Economic Background and its Evolution	5
Social Indicators	7
Political Scenario	10
Cultural Questions	11
PART II – THE CHILD LABOUR PROBLEM	13
Child Labour in the Footwear Industry, Today and Yesterday	13
Institutional Framework and Civilian Society Organisation	17
The Business Sector's Perception	19
The perception of children and their families	22
	25
PART III – PROJECT ASSESSMENT	
Its Relevance	26
Its Sustainability	26
Mainstreaming	29
Synergies Produced	35
Off-shoots and other effects observed	36
PART IV – FINAL CONSIDERATIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS	38
Recommendations for Action and Lessons Learnt	41
<i>Annexes</i>	
Annex I – Methodological Considerations	44
Annex II – Research with Children and their Families	64
Annex III – Prevalence of Child Labour according to Work Locale and Type of Workshop	70
Annex IV – Project for the Child's All-Round Development	72
Annex V – Child Labour Eradication Programme in Novo Hamburgo	73
Annex VI – Social Indicators and Reference Tables	74
Annex VII – List of Participants in the IPEC/ASBEM Programme	82
Annex VIII – Map of Child Labour Indicators (RS)	85

Introduction

In December 1996, the Action Programme for the Fight against Child Labour in the Footwear Industry in the Vale dos Sinos Region was officially started. This action programme is the result of a co-operation agreement signed between the International Programme for the Eradication of Child Labour (IPEC) on behalf of the International Labour Organisation (ILO) and the Association for the Well-Being of Minors in Novo Hamburgo in the State of Rio Grande do Sul (ASBEM - Associação do Bem Estar do Menor de Novo Hamburgo no Estado do Rio Grande do Sul).

With a budget of US\$ 195,700.00, the action programme had its final execution date set for the end of 1998 and its main objectives were: (a) to remove at least 120 children from child labour in the footwear and leather industry in the Novo Hamburgo and Dois Irmãos municipalities; (b) to establish and strengthen institutionally the Permanent Forum for the Eradication of Child Labour in the aforementioned cities; and (c) to negotiate a commitment and concrete actions with the organised sectors of the footwear and leather sector, especially on the part of the business people, in order to deal with the child labour problem.

For the action programme's implementation, two local based institutions were chosen as the executing agencies: ASBEM¹, heading the entire process and Novo Hamburgo Diocese supporting the work, given its good operational system in the neighbouring municipality of Dois Irmãos.

Monitoring studies, reports, and evaluations carried out during the programme's implementation phase by the aforementioned institutions, identified the following immediate results:

- a) In terms of mobilising society, vis à vis the problem, the following deserves special attention: the creation of fora for the eradication of infant labour in the two municipalities, in 1995, as a preparatory phase for the action programme; the conducting of seminars with a view to alerting society as to the infant labour problem in the region and placing the same on the municipalities' political agenda; and drawing the media's attention to the child labour issue.
- b) Another development worth mentioning is the elaboration of an *Assessment of Child Labour in Novo Hamburgo and Dois Irmãos* by a team of researchers from the Rio Grande do Sul Federal University (UFRGS – Universidade Federal do Rio Grande do Sul), which had as its point of reference research carried out in the aforementioned locations in May 1997; and,
- c) The removal of children from child labour in the footwear and leather sector. This action reached 84 (eighty-four) children in Novo Hamburgo and 87 (eighty-seven) in Dois Irmãos, totalling 171 (one hundred and seventy one) children and teenagers who benefited in the region.

¹ Created in 1976, ASBEM is a public interest civilian organisation geared towards the infant and youth sectors. It is a non-profit entity whose mission is to manage free educational assistance for the region's children and young people.

In 1999 the Action Programme in Novo Hamburgo and Dois Irmãos was the focus of another assessment regarding its impacts on child labour. This assessment, coordinated by Andrea Ruthner, concluded that the programme was **very successful, particularly in terms of the following aspects:**

- a) Awareness raising on the child labour problem by opinion makers and the aforementioned municipalities' society;
- b) The "effective contributions brought to the 170 children and teenagers assisted"; and,
- c) The incorporation of actions for the eradication of child labour in municipal public policies, particularly the creation of the Nucleus for the Child's World in Vila Iguaçu in Novo Hamburgo and the extension of the **Global Project** in Dois Irmãos.

Nevertheless, the same assessment pointed out the need to incorporate other projects and additional measures in order to improve sponsored actions such as:

- supplementing the income of those families whose children have been removed from child labour;
- offering vocational training for young people over 14 years of age;
- better structuring of the project in the municipalities; and,
- the expansion of the action programme's coverage both in terms of the number of the children assisted as well as in terms of investments for society's and families' participation.

It also signalled the need to systematise and propagate the project's model in "future actions"; to invest in the growing involvement of employers and the vocational training of parents and teenagers. This training should be linked to the programmes for income enhancing.

Two years after this assessment there is a further assessment process that seeks to identify to what extent the results and impacts identified in the past can still be perceived in the communities reached by the action programme.

Taking as a point of reference, the fact that IPEC action programmes were elaborated with a view on providing solutions to problems related to child labour exploitation and that these solutions should be developed in such a way as to be felt even after IPEC's technical and financial participation has ended, it is expected that the programmes included a strategy for sustaining the same. Moreover, to be considered sustainable, the situation created should outlive the investment phase.

This present study serves to substantiate the results of an ex-post evaluation and has as its general aim to assess the relevance, sustainability, mainstreaming, synergies identified, eventual repeats and long term effects of IPEC's efforts in the Vale dos Sinos

Region geared towards child labour elimination in the footwear industries, especially those located in residences².

In order to respond to the set of questions proposed in the terms of reference of this study, the evaluation team opted to adopt a methodology³ seeking to articulate objective information and the perception of the actors involved. There was strong focus on this perception given the series of interviews with persons involved directly or indirectly with the child labour problem in the region.

Emphasis on a subjective approach comes, as will be better explained in the unfolding of this study, from the methodological difficulty in basing subjective evaluations on aspects privileged by the evaluation required⁴. This is due principally to the absence of quantitative indicators on these aspects relative to the action programme's main outlook.

By taking as a point of reference the information present in the project's proposal submitted in 1995 to the IPEC/ILO; the data and conclusions from the research on child labour co-ordinated by the Universidade Federal do Rio Grande do Sul for the action programme in 1997; the impact evaluation reports elaborated in 1999; and the research, interviews and surveys carried out in 2001, it was possible to reconstruct the scenario and its changes and based on these trends to make some considerations on the aspects demanded by the assessment.

Considering that sustainability is a dynamic and not a state, the assessment could not be based upon a mere comparison of the state of the problem before the action programme and how it is today. This would have implied doing a "retrospective assessment" which would hardly contribute to the programme's administrators' and sponsors' speculations and intentions.

Thus, more than being a pre and post assessment, although it is this as well, the work presented here seeks to bring together the observations made by the various actors involved in the action programme and the child labour problem at four stages – hence, the emphasis on the subjective. This interconnection seeks to identify how and if the eventual benefits brought to the region due to the IPEC action programme are still felt.

Finally, in order to facilitate reading this document, it must be pointed out that it is divided into 4 (four) sections, structured according to the following contents and articulations geared towards this assessment's objectives:

The first section, **The Scenario and its Changes**, aims to provide the reader with a quick overview of the background to the child labour problem in the municipalities and how this problem has been evolving over the years, this being the study's objective. In light of this, the section presents information on the economic

² The "locus" of infant labour exploitation and the concept of "home based shoe industries" are central to this analysis and so will need to be better defined in this study related to the child labour situation.

³ In annex 1 of this work, the reader can find out in more detail about the assessment methodology proposed and the procedures and difficulties faced in its application.

⁴ We consider "privileged aspects" to be the following concepts that have already been mentioned: relevance, sustainability, mainstreaming, synergies identified, eventual repeats and long-term effects.

context, emphasising its repercussions on the footwear-leather sector, the social and political changes as well as spotlights the region's cultural aspects.

In the second section, this work discussed more specifically how the child labour problem in the region has evolved. In order to develop this analysis, it looks at the evolution of the problem in the Footwear Industry; the evolution of the institutional machinery geared towards dealing with child labour; organised civilian society's work, among others. The section ends by analysing how businessmen, beneficiaries and experts involved in the child labour eradication programmes used to envisage the problem and its evolution in recent years.

The third section deals with the assessment of the action programme itself. It seeks to analyse it in terms of its relevance, sustainability and mainstreaming in changing the social profile identified in the region. It also aims to identify the possible synergies and other effects that can be linked to benefits and results from the implementation of the IPEC programme.

This work's fourth and last section makes some general considerations as to the assessment's results and offers some recommendations not so much with respect to the executive programme in itself but rather related to the organisational learning process experienced by IPEC. This refers to how lessons learnt through the research process can be used to reinforce and empower interventions from the ILO and its partners in dealing with child labour in the Country and perhaps in other regions.

Finally, the annexes to this document allow the reader to have a better understanding of some of the methodological resources used, the difficulties experienced as well as provides some tables and statistics that were used to support some of the analyses and conclusions presented throughout the discussion.

PART I – THE SCENARIO AND ITS CHANGES

The data collection carried out by the evaluation team for the Child Labour Eradication Programme in the Novo Hamburgo and Dois Irmãos municipalities' Footwear Industry signalled significant and perceptible changes in the manner in which the local community regards and positions itself in relation to child labour. This thus allowed for anticipating positive and sustained results for the work supported by IPEC in 1996/1997.

Nevertheless, the results identified may be linked to the action programme's success or to some initiatives supported by the same, but at the same time can be the result of changes in the economic and socio-political scenario of the region in focus.

In light of this, the initial part of this study seeks to present the backdrop against which the initiatives supported by the IPEC evolved. Its main purpose is to look at the changes that could have generated positive or negative impacts on the child labour issue in the two municipalities. Further, it attempts to measure the relative importance of these impacts on the medium and long-term objectives of the action programme in question.

Thus, social, political and economic aspects related to the region and the Footwear Industry are analysed with a view to contextualising changes that could have impacted the child labour issue. This overview ends with a quick discussion of cultural issues, which play a pertinent role in the communities' perception of child labour.

1. The economic background and its evolution

Any study on the issue of child labour in any sector of the economy cannot be made without considering the changes that occurred on the economic scenario and more specifically in the trends in the economic variables associated with the sector of the economy focused in the work.

A better understanding of the changes in the economic scenario is necessary in order to comprehend the level of correlation between such variables. The emphasis in this study being to observe the relation between these changes and the number of working children in the Footwear Industry in the Dois Irmãos and Novo Hamburgo municipalities.

In other words, it would be feasible to suppose that the industry's level of activity shows a high correlation with the rate of child labour exploitation in the sector/region in focus. Thus, it should affect any evaluation on the impact of the IPEC action programme on the problem. In this sense, the variations in the number of children working in the industry would be better explained based upon the economic situation in the sector rather than on any other variable. However, the studies conducted do not ratify this hypothesis.

A brief overview of the situation in the Footwear Industry in the Vale dos Sinos during the nineties shows that in the first years activity was at its peak. Using as a basis,

the information presented in the research report *Diagnosis of Child Labour in Novo Hamburgo and Dois Irmãos* it can be observed, among other things, that in 1988 there were 303 footwear businesses in the Region. In 1991, this number was 480 footwear businesses, equivalent to approximately 70 thousand workers.

In the two municipalities studied, the situation is not much different from the Region's. In Novo Hamburgo, in 1992, there were 1799 establishments in the footwear-leather cluster, with 40 thousand persons employed.

From 1994, given the strong valuation of Brazilian currency and the consequent loss in competitiveness of Brazilian export products, a downturn in the growth trend was observed and provoked strong negative impacts on the sector's performance.

A study carried out during that period (Zimmermann, 1994) shows that the footwear-leather sector laid off 20 thousand workers in the Vale dos Sinos Region during that period. Only in Novo Hamburgo 31 companies went into bankruptcy or suspended their operations firing more than 5,000 workers. In Dois Irmãos 04 establishments went out of business and 423 workers lost their jobs. These numbers are significant given that in 1992 the sector employed 5000 people in Dois Irmãos.

In 1996/1997 when the action programme for the eradication of Child Labour was started, the footwear-leather sector was still in crisis due to the reduction in footwear shipments, although the main effects on the level of activity in the sector had already been felt.

This period also corresponds to the time in which several industries in the region transferred their production units to other regions in the Country, especially to the Northeast Region, drawn by fiscal incentives and the cheaper labour force.

From 1999, motivated by the Brazilian currency's devaluation and the launching of the Rio Grande do Sul State Government's programme, exports and the industry's level of production retook its upward trend and recovered dynamism and competitiveness.

Studies realised by the Federation of Industries for the State of Rio Grande do Sul signal a "strong recovery" by the sector and praise the US\$ 1.6 billion mark in exports in the year, a little below however, than the US\$ 2 billion of 1993.

In terms of the number of jobs in this sector, the current 130000 workers in the industry is a far cry from the 150000 at the start of the decade. This is in spite of the fact that the number of establishments has increased. The FIERGS referred to the existence of "approximately 3000 companies" in the footwear and leather sector. The table presented below allows for a better understanding of the evolution of the industry's indicators in the State:⁵

⁵ The lack of reliable historical sources on the industry's production in the municipalities under study led to the adoption of state indicators. Given that the footwear industry in Rio Grande do Sul is mainly concentrated in the Vale dos Sinos and that state indicators tend to be reproduced at municipal level, it would seem valid to use such indicators as a reference for an analysis of the scenario.

**TABLE I – EVOLUTION OF THE FOOTWEAR INDUSTRY'S INDICATORS
IN RIO GRANDE DO SUL
(1991/2000)**

Indicator	1991	1992	1996	1998	1999	2000
Commercial establishments ⁶	1.821	NA	NA	1.924	2.119	3.000 ⁷
Employees ⁸	153.400	NA	NA	95.525	107.634	130.000
Millions of Pairs Exported ⁹	NA	158,1	142,6	131,0	137,1	162,5
Export Income ¹⁰	NA	1.408	1.567	1.330	1.277	1.546

Taking as a point of reference this table, proving the hypothesis would mean showing the increase of the child labour problem in the footwear-leather industry between the start of the action programme (1996) and the present moment due to the turnabout in growth in economic activity in the footwear sector from the end of 1999.

Never the less, on the one hand, the diagnosis conducted by Rio Grande do Sul Federal University in 1996/1997 identified 422 cases of children in child labour situations, 80% of whom worked in workshops, on the other hand, surveys in 2001 did not register any indication of child labour in these production units.

What supports this assessment is the fact that the data from the State Government's Labour and Social Assistance Secretary indicates that whilst in 2000 there was a target to be met within the context of the Child Labour Eradication Programme (PETI), 70 children from the sector in Novo Hamburgo, for 2001 there was no plan to expand these targets although this did occur in other municipalities.

2. Social indicators

If the changes on the economic scenario are not sufficient to explain the trend observed in the child labour problem in the Footwear Industry in the two municipalities being studied, it is wise to look at patterns of other variables – especially the social indicators - in order to try to identify possible relations between them and the problem in question.

Once again the hypothesis is based upon whether or not the results finally identified are better related to the social changes observed than to the efforts and offshoots from the programme's implementation.

Among the aspects that can be related to the action programme, education will have preferential attention given that there are evidently competing interests between this policy and the problem at hand. However, it is pertinent to start this report with the “social context”, by providing brief information on the two municipalities' demography.

⁶ Number of commercial establishments for the footwear- leather industry in Rio Grande do Sul. Source: RAIS/MTb.

⁷ Approximate value, according to estimates from the Federation of Industries for State of Rio Grande do Sul (FIERGS). The same is valid for the data referring to the number of persons employed in the footwear industry.

⁸ Number of persons employed in the footwear industry in Rio Grande do Sul. Source: RAIS/MTb

⁹ Number of pairs of shoes exported by Rio Grande do Sul. Source: ABAEX

¹⁰ Value in millions of United States dollars (US\$ 1.000.000,00) for footwear exports from Rio Grande do Sul. Source: ABAEX

Although this study does not have additional information to better evaluate the link between population and child labour, the data relative to the populational trends in both municipalities in the nineties does not allow for establishing any correlation between variations in the resident population and the incidence of child labour in the municipalities studied.

As can be seen in the annexes, between the years 1991 and 2000 the municipalities' population grew around 15% and 18% in Novo Hamburgo and Dois Irmãos, respectively. This gives an average annual rate around 1.5% in both cases. This shows that this variable cannot explain any trend relative to transformations in child labour in the region's Footwear Industry vis à vis the trend towards reducing the problem that is being detected.

The data collection conducted in 1997 by the Federal University also indicates that the main reason for children's involvement in labour activities is the need to contribute to increasing the family's income, as 48% of the children interviewed responded.

In light of this, it can be deduced that income or variations in family income in the municipalities in focus would be a variable in explaining the trends in indicators related to child labour exploitation better than efforts linked to the programme.

In fact this analysis would apparently be confirmed given that during the period of crisis in the sector (1994 to 1999), the increase in unemployment and the outsourcing of labour brought about a reduction in families' average income in the municipality¹¹. Further, based upon the interviews carried out, they produced an impact in terms of the number of children and teenagers on the street and or working.

All the same, an increase in the problem **was not verified** in the Footwear Industry. According to specialists who work with children and teenagers in the two municipalities studied, the child labour problem continues to bother them and to demand special attention from the Public Power, however the Footwear Industry is no longer a priority focus in actions to stop child labour exploitation given that the problem has not been verified in the sector.

The same study by UFRGS gives as a second reason for the incidence of child labour in the region, again coinciding with the interviews conducted, the fact that the children do not have a place to stay while their parents are working (35% of those interviewed replied such). That is another important variable for analysis, since if it was not the complementary activity provided by the action programme, what would the children be doing in their spare time?

An answer that is almost automatic and associated with the solving of this problem, is the observation that the municipality's educational policy is fulfilling its function in support of the eradication of child labour in the municipalities.

¹¹ As example, the GDP *per capita* in the Novo Hamburgo municipality which was US\$ 5.682 in 1991 reached US\$ 6.815 in 1994 but in 1996 had already dropped to US\$ 6.054.

Analysis of the municipalities' education performance indicators shows¹² that in the period from the project's implementation phase in 1996 up to 1999, the failure and school drop-out indicators continued to be relatively stable and did not show any type of trend that could justify greater "attractiveness" of the municipalities' education system for the children and their families in both municipalities.

At the same time however, the number of enrollment figures in Novo Hamburgo as well as in Dois Irmãos shows, to say the least, an interesting trend. The table presented below shows the trend in these numbers during the period 1997/2001.

TABLE II – ENROLLMENT NUMBERS IN ELEMENTARY EDUCATION IN NOVO HAMBURGO AND DOIS IRMÃOS AND SCHOOL-AGED POPULATION 1997 to 2001

Year	Novo Hamburgo		Dois Irmãos	
	Registration	Population	Registration	Population
1997	34.395	34.998	2.946	2.557
1998	34.678	Not available	3.148	Not available
1999	39.316	Not available	3.528	Not available
2000	38.057	Not available	3.419	Not available
2001	39.475	36.544 ¹³	3.619	2.812 ¹⁴

In both localities the number of students enrolled in primary level shows a change in the level between 1998 and 1999. There was an increase by 13% in Novo Hamburgo and 12% in Dois Irmãos, stabilising at this level from then onwards.

A possible explanation for this jump would be the adoption, by the State Government elected in 1998, of an action geared towards guaranteeing the minimum wage for families if they kept their school-aged children registered in Primary School, based upon the *Bolsa Escola* model. Moreover, such an increase can be associated with other governmental efforts towards universal access to Elementary Education, such as through the programme *All Children in School* sponsored by the Federal Government.

In considering efforts for universalising access to elementary education, although full statistics are not available, it can be seen that for the 7 to 14 age group, the gross schooling rate¹⁵ in Novo Hamburgo was above 98% and 115% in Dois Irmãos. For both cases, the data represents improvements for the 1997 to 2001, so that at present, these figures are at 108% for Novo Hamburgo and 128% for Dois Irmãos.

From the data presented, it is possible to affirm that if part of the 7 to 14 age group is not attending school, the cause of absenteeism must be due to other causes and

¹² Annex VI

¹³ Estimate value.

¹⁴ Estimate value.

¹⁵ The gross school rate can present a value above 100% given that registration at elementary level of students over 14 years have not been excluded. The best indicator to assess the level of universalising of elementary education among the 7 to 14 age group would be the net schooling rate in the municipalities. However, this data is not available. According to INEP for the Ministry of Education, net schooling rate for the State of Rio Grande do Sul exceeded 97% in 1999. This allows to infer that there is a high level of coverage of these types of services for the population considered in this study.

not to restrictions in the availability of elementary education, given that in both cases the number of registrations exceeds the resident population for the 7 to 14 age group.

The initiatives mentioned work in interaction with the child labour eradication actions fostered by the Programme for Eradication of Child Labour (PETI - Programa de Erradicação do Trabalho Infantil) and would possibly empower government initiatives to deal with the problem and to provide alternative mechanisms for children to remain in school.

At any rate, in considering these three variables as a basis for analysis – populational growth, variations in family income and the development of occupational alternatives for the children – none of them can be pointed out as the only variable responsible for the impacts, be they negative or positive, that have been identified in the eradication of child labour in the Footwear Industry in the Novo Hamburgo and Dois Irmãos municipalities. This is except for the impact resulting from the adoption of the *Bolsa Escola* programme and, more recently, the initiation of PETI in the region.

3. The political scenario

The evaluation of the IPEC action programme that will be carried out also seeks to verify to what extent the actions and ideas recommended by the programme on its implementation continue to be present on the municipalities' "political agenda" both in terms of consensus regarding the issue as well as in terms of priority that the public agents give to it.

It is evident that no discussion geared towards this aspect of the analysis can be done without looking at the changes on the political front in which the problem is found. In other words, society's actions and movements triggered by actions as those foreseen in the IPEC action programme influence and are influenced by the political scenario. This political scenario underwent sensitive changes over the period spanning the programme's elaboration phase (1995), its implementation (1996/19998), the evaluation of its results (1998/1999) and the present moment.

During this span of time, there were presidential elections as well as state government elections. There were also State and Federal Legislative elections (1998) and two municipal elections in 1996 and 2000. Thus, it is reasonable to suppose that the eventual changes identified can be associated with the changes perceived in representation of the child labour problem, especially in the Footwear Industry and its importance on the municipal political agenda.

In spite of visible changes that can be identified, President Fernando Henrique's re-election at the Federal level guaranteed certain stability in the correlating of political forces. At the State level however, there was significant change in the leading of the Executive Power with the election of a governor from the Labour Party (PT – Partido dos Trabalhadores) in opposition to the former governor from the Brazilian Democratic Movement Party (PMDB - Partido do Movimento Democrático Brasileiro) and also to the Federal Government itself.

In the municipal arena, there were two municipal elections covering the programme's state and the present evaluation phase (1996 and 2000). There were some modifications on the political scenario in the municipalities being studied.

All the same, despite changes on the political-party scenario in the municipalities and in the State, in both municipalities studied, the governments maintained their efforts and even strengthened their efforts in combating child labour at all its levels and more specifically in the footwear-leather sector.

From this analysis, it can be inferred that child labour is an issue present on governments' political agendas regardless of their party affiliations and this allows for guaranteeing a greater level of policy stability and sustainability for the actions developed.

4. Cultural issues

As shown in the introductory part of this paper, it is not possible to discuss the issue of work, production, social and economic relations in the Vale dos Sinos Region without taking into account the strong presence of German culture and tradition¹⁶.

Both cities were founded by small business craftsmen or tradesmen who came from Germany in the middle of the XIX, it being the case that the influence of German tradition today is more visible in Dois Irmãos than in Novo Hamburgo, probably due to this city's more cosmopolitan air.

With respect to the impact of cultural aspects on the region's child labour issue, it is possible to observe a strong valuing of work as an instrument for educating, socialising and preparing children for the work market when they become adults.

The data collected in 1997 already showed that both in Novo Hamburgo as well as in Dois Irmãos, 35% and 40% of the total number of children who worked, explained that they did this because of *"not having anything else to do"* in contrast with the 45% who stated that they worked out of economic necessity.

Furthermore, in the analysis of how these children saw child labour, when asked about what was good about working, around 30% in Dois Irmãos and slightly less than 40% in Novo Hamburgo, told the interviewer that learning and professional training were the best parts of the work.

In these children's view, their fathers and mother generally found it "good and encouraged" them to develop work activities so much so that less than 20% of the children interviewed in the municipalities informed that their parents found it bad that

¹⁶ In the project's document for the Eradication of Child Labour in the Novo Hamburgo Prefecture, drawn up in October 2000, there is the following quotation: *"The concept that work is ennobling, that it is by the sweat of one's body that one is saved. In essence, work through its moral characteristics makes and made societies not take the child labour issue seriously and as an issue that requires public policies Novo Hamburgo municipality is not any different from this description. Having a population whose majority is made up of descendents from German immigrants, many parents and guardians – data from the assessment of the ILO-IPEC/1998 programme – when questioned about the effects of child labour on children, in most instances do not take into account the harm caused by child labour. They see work not as harmful but as educational and as protection against situations of social and personal risk.."* (pg.02)

they were working. In Novo Hamburgo, only 7.5% of the children stated that their mothers thought it was bad for them to be working at an early age.

In its study, the UFRGS team, in comparing these results with the number of children whose families were from Novo Hamburgo and/or Dois Irmãos, raised the hypothesis that the stimulus for child labour could have originated from a “markedly cultural” factor. That is, “the majority of parents migrated from regions having mainly agricultural activities, and where it is common to incorporate child labour” (pg. 07).

Although this is a plausible and defensible hypothesis, the same data can be read in another manner, that is, they can be seen as reinforcing the markedly cultural nature of child labour exploitation in the Region. If we observe the data, we shall see that out of the total number of children, 40% come from families born in the studied municipalities. Coincidentally, the number of children who work *because of not having anything else to do* also fall into the same range of 35% to 40%. This allows us to put forward the following hypothesis:

Based upon the premise that parents left other municipalities for Novo Hamburgo and Dois Irmãos in search of work and income opportunities; and considering that the percentage of children who affirm they work out of economic necessity, it can be proposed that in general, the local families being studied, send their children to work much more to occupy and educate them rather than out of economic necessity.

This hypothesis however explains, but does not solve the problem. If the cultural factor is more linked to the Lutheran tradition or to the influence of agricultural background of the families, is a less important matter. What the 1997 study and the previous data collection prove is that, at least, a third part of the problem has its roots much more in issues of a cultural nature than in questions related to the children's and their families' material survival, demanding strategies focusing this kind of problem.

It is in light of this backdrop that we intend to analyse the offshoots and the sustainability of this project's effects on child labour eradication implemented by IPEC in partnership with ASBEM and other social organisations in Novo Hamburgo and Dois Irmãos.

PART II – THE CHILD LABOUR PROBLEM

1. Child labour in the Footwear Industry, today and yesterday

For the purposes of this analysis, it was presupposed that the child labour problem in the region's Footwear Industry could be perceived as a dynamic with a positive evolution whose trend could have occurred independently of the IPEC action programme. The implementation of this project intensified in a relevant manner this dynamic, placing it at a level much higher than expected – and this is what the study is trying to show – helping it to be upkept at this level even after the transfer of resources and technologies from the action programme were closed off.

Based upon the principle that a detailed and adequate description of the previous dynamic can be found in the Child Labour Diagnosis for Novo Hamburgo and Dois Irmãos written up by UFRGS in 1997, this was used substantially in the initial part of

the research studies, serving as a point of reference for the base-line to be adopted for the evaluation of the action programme's results and sustainability.

In order to describe the present situation, the statements of six ASBEM specialists who had participated in the action programme were considered in addition to the field surveys conducted. Statements from the Regional Labour Subdivision's representative for Vale dos Sinos and members of the Novo Hamburgo and Dois Irmãos' Business Owners' and Workers' Unions were also considered.

Before continuing with the analysis of the data observed and in the trends studied, the present study requires a better definition of some variables pertinent to understanding the problem, especially in terms of the treatment given to *home based shoe industries*.

Both in the analysis of the child labour problem in the Footwear Industry carried out in 1995, which formed the basis for IPEC's support for the action programme as well as in the 1997 UFRGs study, what deserves special attention from researchers is the issue of outsourcing and subcontracting of stages in the industrial process as a relevant variable for explaining child labour.

In the project's proposal the following was already affirmed

"The growing importance of child labour in this region is due, amongst other factors, to developments in the organisation of production, implying automation on one hand and subcontracting of work, on the other. Large shoe producing companies give sub-contracts to so-called "footwear work shops" which again sub-contract the production of certain parts to home based informal industries".

Moreover, according to observations made, it would be in these informal residences that the major part of child labour exploitation occurs.

The Federal University's research, conducted two years later elaborates three chapters dealing specifically with footwear workshops, sub-contraction, outsourcing and its impact in creating precarious work relations (p. 39 to 44). Based upon these analyses, this research studies this process and its impact on the child labour problem, establishing a typology of workshops, summarised in the table that follows and to which we refer to better focus this current analysis.

TABLE III – TYPOLOGY OF WORKSHOPS
Diagnosis of Child Labour in Novo Hamburgo and Dois Irmãos (UFRGS)

Type of Workshop	Profile of Activities	Profile of Labour Force
Home	Manual operations	Women, the aged and children
Micro-enterprise	Mediation and supervision of outsourcing and sub-contracting.	Ex-workers from the big companies.
Small Enterprise ¹⁷	Carrying out of production processes.	Contracted workers.

¹⁷The 1997 UFRGS study already demonstrated that it was this type of workshop that most reflected growth in that period.

This typology is very useful in order to better define the “home based” category since, except for the small enterprises, both the cottage workshops as well as the micro-enterprises can operate – and in some cases do operate – in residences and at a not formal level.

This typology will help understanding information to be presented later on in the same diagnosis with respect to data gathered on the work place from the children interviewed by the University team. In fact, as the researchers used different classification criteria for the work places for children from Dois Irmãos and Novo Hamburgo for this present analysis it was necessary to refer to some work organisational mechanisms¹⁸.

Based upon the Tables presented in the 1997 study, the conclusion made at the time was that while only 13% of the children interviewed confirmed that they worked in their homes (cottage workshops), 41% informed that they worked in units, classified as small enterprises and the majority (46%) told the interviewer that they worked in micro-enterprises.

By using as a reference this table from the 1997 study, which already indicated signs of improvement in relation to the previous situation at the start of the IPEC action programme, the first conclusion that can be drawn from the interviews conducted by the specialists involved with the issue in discussion, has to do with the elimination of child labour in the Footwear Industry in Novo Hamburgo and Dois Irmãos. For them, there exists neither in the footwear industry nor in the workshops the hiring of minors, which characterises child labour.

With specific reference to the relation between the programme and the problem's reduction, the statement from the Vales dos Sinos' Regional labour Subdivision was categorical in affirming that *“the IPEC/ILO project helped in raising awareness among the Footwear Industry's business sector and in the creation of a code of ethics in conjunction with outsourced services (workshops), in addition to encouraging other projects such as the Pro-Child/Azaléia, in the city of Parobé, projects developed with SENAI and SENAC, for young people's professional training “.*

Other programmes have also been developed regarding child labour outside of the Footwear Industry sector. ASBEM itself runs the Centre for Professional Development, having computer, carpentry, cutting and sewing courses, etc., for young people between 14 and 18 years of age. It also offers assistance to children in risk situations and in child labour situations in other areas such as street vending or cardboard collecting.

This is the second element of great pertinence for this study. If child labour was directly eliminated in the Footwear Industry sector, the same cannot be affirmed in relation to other economic activities in the municipalities studied.

¹⁸ In Annex III of this report the methodology adopted to calculate the prevalence of child labour rate as per type of workshop in the Dois Irmãos and Novo Hamburgo municipalities can be found.

Although the studies carried out were not concerned on verifying if in fact this problem occurs in other sectors of the region's economy and what is the problem's dimension, the interviews conducted alert to the phenomenon. And so, it is possible to suppose that a study with this aim may point to the existence of children working in other sectors of the economy.

Moreover, still based upon the interviews carried out, cases and our speculations were mentioned about the existence of child labour in quarrying work, apple cultivation, fumigation, acacia extraction, potato cultivation, street work (as vendors or rubbish or card board collectors), precious stone extraction and refining, furniture industry, galvanise industry or in family farming production. The map indicating child labour in the South Region and elaborated in September 2000 by the Regional Labour Division for the State of Rio Grande do Sul, validates in a way such inferences and speculations.

A third relevant finding drawn from the study refers to the cottage labour problem or work in residences. Many of the interviewees identified this issue as a new phenomenon, which is beginning to characterise the region. However, there is a lack of empirical and theoretical data on this matter. This is particularly so because inspection of child labour exploitation outside the workshops – or outside the professional context – can only occur if there is a report of the same.

From the Footwear Industry's perspective, an increase in the child labour problem in the home environment is very much associated with the already mentioned phenomenon of *sub-contracting* of some services that are outsourced. In the IPEC/ILO study document drawn up in August 1995 this sub-contracting practice in parts of the production process in informal production units based in the residents of the subcontracting parties was already identified.

In a general sense the perception is that the child labour problem in the Region can be characterised as having been reduced in quantity given the effective eradication of child labour in formal enterprise units, including workshops.

At the same time, the possibility of its occurrence in the sub-contracting process is still questioned and reflects certain logic. Yet, it cannot be confirmed that it occurs and much less its gravity at the present moment cannot be defined. Considering the situation in 1997 and bearing in mind the changes proposed at the start of this chapter, the following table can be drawn up:

TABLE IV - RATE OF CHILD LABOUR INCIDENCE ACCORDING TO PRODUCTION UNIT IN NOVO HAMBURGO AND DOIS IRMÃOS
(Situation in 1997 and Alternatives for 2001)

PRODUCTION UNIT	1997	2001 ^A	2001 ^B
Cottage Workshop	13%	100%	22%
Micro-enterprise	46%	0%	78%
Small Enterprise	41%	0%	0%
TOTAL	100%	100%	100%

By using as a point of reference, the information on the problem's incidence per type of production unit, two readings can be made:

- a) If we consider that at the time, child labour in homes made up 13% of the problem in the Footwear Industry sector and we consider the specialists' opinion who are working at present on the problem, we can deduce that there has been an up to 87% reduction in the prevalence of the problem in this sector for the participating municipalities;
- b) However, if we adopt a more conservative stance, we can consider that both the work in the cottage workshops as well as in the micro-enterprises would fit into the "domestic labour" category and that the drop would not be so significant but that it would be around 40%.

Nonetheless, the benefits in child labour eradication in "public" production spaces (in juxtaposition with the private context of homes) are in themselves a positive and sustained development from the IPEC programme. Thus, these benefits need to be considered in any evaluation process.

At the same time, the major advances perceived occurred in the very change in the way of understanding the child labour problem by the various social actors. This change certainly generated positive impacts in dealing with the problem in many different forms. As an example, the ASBEM specialists who worked in the 1996 programme and who were interviewed for this study, support this perception of change based upon the following aspects:

- a) A greater number of projects created to assist children and adolescents;
- b) Greater partnership with the region's business sector;
- c) Reflections in the community on the child labour concept; and,
- d) Greater awareness on the part of children on the importance of school. .

Finally, when questioned as to whether or not these changes could be associated with the IPEC/ILO action programme, the majority gave a positive response. This response was also positive for the international policies to combat child labour. All this was already identified in the assessment of the project's impact.

2. The institutional framework and its evolution

Although the strengthening of existing institutional mechanisms in dealing with the child labour issue in the two municipalities was not a main objective in the IPEC action programme – these mechanisms' influence is apparent in the support given in the setting up of Fora for the eradication of child labour – this aspect was introduced as a variable in the analysis of this study for two reasons.

As a matter of fact, this study identifies a greater capacity of the institutions analysed, as well as, of the public sector, to deal with the issue. However, the evolution of the national e state institutional apparatus, namely, the growing coverage of PETI, do indicate how important this issue became all over the country.

Therefore, one can conclude that, although IPEC/ILO action programme's results, the changes on the institutional framework were extremely favourable to the consolidation and sustainability of the action programme.

The favourable effects from the changes on the national scenario may or may not have encountered fertile ground in the municipalities for their development and consolidation. In this sense, in the interviews and field studies on the programme's effects at the institutional level, the evaluation team sought to make the interviewees focus upon associating the results identified with IPEC's action.

The corpus for the interviews was made up of representatives from government and non-governmental organisations. These interviewees made a positive evaluation of the programme and its impacts. Initially when asked about the results which could be concretely associated with IPEC's initiative in the municipalities and which could still be seen, the interviewees pointed out the following:

- a) Greater awareness and valuing of education on the part of families and children;
- b) The rise in initiatives geared towards child labour eradication such as the Dois Irmãos GLOBAL Project and the Novo Hamburgo CIP (ASBEM). This latter is mentioned by some of the interviewees as an off-shoot of the IPEC/ILO action programme; and,
- c) The elimination of child labour in industries and workshops in the Footwear Industry.

At the same time, the state institutions interviewed¹⁹ do not manage to identify a "government policy" directed specifically towards the issue, so much so that some affirm the non-existence of concrete policies in the fight against child labour whilst others refer to the existence of bills and laws that protect children and adolescents. They highlighted the Federal Government's PETI and the Family Citizenship Programme implemented by State government for Rio Grande do Sul.

The interviews inform that lacks greater integration among the various institutions that could operate directly or indirectly in projects aimed towards working children and adolescents. In particular, only Novo Hamburgo's Secretary for Children and Adolescents and the Dois Irmãos Rights Council stated that they have adopted a pro-active stance in relation to dealing with the problem whilst the majority of those interviewed alleged that they work in response to complaints and requests.

Other aspects in turn reinforce the persistence of the child labour issue on municipal governments' agendas, and these can be highlighted as other issues:

¹⁹ The following organisations were interviewed: the Secretaries of Education for Novo Hamburgo and Dois Irmãos, Novo Hamburgo's Municipal House of Counsellors, Regional Labour Subdivision for Vale dos Sinos, Novo Hamburgo's and Dois Irmãos' Guardianship Councils, Dois Irmãos Secretary for Social Action, Novo Hamburgo's Health Secretary's Division for Assistance to Children and Adolescents and Novo Hamburgo's and Dois Irmãos' Children's Rights Council .

- a) The expansion of efforts in partnership with the private sector, as can be seen through the 1998 convention signed between the Dois Irmãos Prefecture and the Industries' Social Service (SESI) in order to upkeep and extend the *Programme for the Child's GLOBAL Development*²⁰;
- b) The publication of the Municipal Decree 644/2000 dated October 2000, through which the Novo Hamburgo Municipal Council created the Municipal Commission for Child Labour Eradication and nominated its members. This Commission has broad representation from organised civilian society²¹;
- c) The implementation of the **Child Labour Eradication Programme** in the Novo Hamburgo municipality in October 2000, in interaction with the other programmes developed by the Municipal Council, especially the socio-educational Support Programme on a flexible basis²², having as its goal to reach 150 children;
- d) The creation, in 1999, of the Dois Irmãos Guardianship Council with decisive participation for the Municipalities' Footwear Industries' Union; and,
- e) A greater awareness of child labour by the Judicial Power in the Municipality through a reduction in mandates allowing children in the 14 to 16 year age group to work, although the problem still persists.

Finally, when asked about the difficulties encountered by the institution in the fight against Child Labour, the interviewees highlighted the following:

- a) The region's cultural factor;
- b) The lack of financial resources and partnerships in promoting extra-class activities; and,
- c) The judicial power that still authorises security mandates for young people in the 14 to 16 year age group to work or prohibits at other times what by law is not permitted.

The research and studies carried out indicate that both the public institutions involved in the child labour eradication policy, here understood as the legal and institutional apparatus available to the public agents, as well as the government

²⁰ The programme for the *Child's Global Development* is an initiative from the Dois Irmãos Municipal Council. It receives support from the Dois Irmãos' Footwear Industries' Union and SESI. It was set up in 1997 as an offshoot of IPEC/ILO initiatives. For further details see annex IV.

²¹ Among the non-governmental organisations that participate in the Council, the following deserve mention: ASBEM and the SEMEAR Foundation, both considered as offshoots of IPEC's programme in the Region.

²² Social-educational Support Programme on a Flexible Basis (ASEMA - O Programa de Apoio Sócio-educativo em Meio Aberto) seeks to assist children and adolescents during the period outside of school time with a view to developing preventive work in relation to socially vulnerable situations. For future details see annex V.

programmes and initiatives directed towards dealing with the problem, underwent an undeniable empowering process.

In essence, it seems clear that although the IPEC action programme has a considerable share in being responsible for this strengthening, as the offshoots coming from its intervention indicate. It is also evident that its efforts have not only been sustained but have been potentialised, but what cannot be lost from sight is that all this has been occurring in an extremely favourable national and state context.

3. Organised civilian society and its work

It is more and more evident that overcoming the child labour problem only becomes feasible based upon civilian society's involvement and the extension of its work on the issue through interaction with the Public Power, especially with the Municipal Government. In this sense, the strengthening of civilian society and the manner in which it works in relation to the issue of child labour is one of the aspects of great relevance to be included in the results of IPEC's action programme in the region.

Before moving forward in considering the interviewees and observations that can be drawn from this work, it must be pointed out that civilian society's work in the municipalities can be organised around two bases: action and awareness.

On the one side, one initiative is dealing with the problem itself, through the offer of compensatory actions that lead to the removal of the child from work and his/her return to the school environment (or participation in extended school day activities) or through the inspection of companies, workshops and other contracting institutions.

On the other hand, there are complementary activities to the aforementioned ones. There are those entities and initiatives that are geared towards awareness raising of society as a whole in relation to the child labour problem and its harm to individuals and society. In this category, awareness raising actions such as talks carried out in schools, Fora and the Global March²³ against child labour can be highlighted.

In light of the above, it is possible to look at the changes that occurred due to the implementation of IPEC's project and in relation to the persons who work in civilian society organisations committed to the fight against child labour.

What is interesting to observe is that in the interviewees' answers there is the perception that changes in fact occurred and that such changes were positive in terms of a reduction in child labour in the region, due to the "rise in discussions on the theme". The interviewees also frequently highlighted as a positive aspect, the improvements in relations between institutions that work in this area. Among these institutions, the State is featured.

What also deserves special focus is the labour unions' which, as a result of the action programme, have invested in inspection of what goes on in industries as well as

²³ Movement carried out among various partnerships including the Semear Foundation, the business sector, the Ministry of Public Affairs and other sectors interested in fighting against child labour in the Region.

in the relationship between industries and workshops. This is a crucial issue in overcoming the problem as was already highlighted in the 1995 project and in the UFRGS diagnosis in 1997.

Another positive consequence identified and which is directly linked to the initiative being studied, is institutional strengthening and the boosting in society's vision of organisations that have been involved in implementing the programme. ASBEM has been pointed out as being the entity most directly involved throughout the process and has managed to recover its role as a support institution for children and teenagers both in the eyes of the Novo Hamburgo's Municipal Prefecture as well as in society's.

The statement that follows is representative of the advantages perceived by the actors interviewed of this change. For them, "due to the project financed by the ILO, ASBEM was reactivated around 1996 and today practically assumes all the assistance work in Novo Hamburgo through partnerships".

In addition to ASBEM, another institution from the third sector which has had noted participation in dealing with issues related to child labour in the region is the SEMEAR Foundation²⁴. This foundation also had its rise and consolidation associated with the implementation of IPEC's initiative as an answer from the region's production sector.

The institutional strengthening of organisations from the third sector, which were involved in the process, is also visible. It is also interesting to identify the types of actions such organisations have been developing in the region.

According to data collected, the main programmes/projects that have been developed were precisely those presented by the Semear Foundation which in partnership with the Abrinq Foundation (Programa Empresa Amiga da Criança - the Child-Friendly Company Programme) sought to sensitise a significant group of companies against child labour. During the period 1997-2000 they received adhesion from 112 companies (85% from the Footwear Industry) situated in nine municipalities in the Vale do Sinos.

Another measure indicated by the institution's chairman was the mobilisation of companies in conjunction with SESI in order to offer extra-class activities for children and teenagers in social and personal risk situations. They managed to reach 1000 children. Today the Semear Foundation continues to upkeep the assistance programme to 350 children and teenagers in the seven to eighteen year age group, through extra-class activities.

For the institutions that work in projects geared towards assisting the children and teenagers at risk, as well as those institutions focused upon raising awareness about the problem and in defending their rights, the main results of this effort which can still be seen in the communities are:

²⁴ Already in the "final report" on the programme, produced in December 1998, the creation of the SEMEAR Foundation was highlighted. It is a non-governmental organisation sponsored by Novo Hamburgo's Business and Industrial Association and is the result of an exchange of experiences promoted by IPEC. This had as its reference base work developed in França/SP (pg. 5).

- a) Greater awareness from the business sector of the child labour issue;
- b) Experience in mobilising companies and social organisations regarding the child labour issue and which received recognition from the World Bank in the latter's representatives' visit to the region to see the project; and,
- c) The upsurge in new social actions for the benefit of children and teenagers.

The evaluation also sought to identify from the social actors' perspective what are the difficulties that still remain in the attempt to fight against child labour and what are the obstacles, needed to be overcome.

For some, the rhetoric is still much more evident than the reality. For them, if governments and social organisations did more and spoke less, more concrete results could have been obtained over the years of the work.

For others, the difficulties to break culturally with the myth "that it is good for the child to work from early because he/she cannot be idle" continue. At the same time, others state that the press could value more concrete actions achieved on the issue and could tone down the sensationalist tendency that is many times applied in articles related to the theme.

Furthermore, the dispute among organisations both among the government sector as well as among the third sector was pointed out as a difficulty to be overcome. For, according to those interviewed, "the tendency towards self projection hampered actions and dialogues with important sectors in society".

What was also spotlighted were the difficulties in obtaining financial resources, in forging partnerships, in dealing with government bureaucracy, especially in official banks. The lack of policies aimed towards child labour eradication within the scope of the municipal public power in order to discuss as well as provide solutions to the problem, was also pointed out.

Lastly, an institution highlighted the lack of ability on the part of some persons linked to organs dealing with the issue such as the DRT/RS (Regional Labour Division for Rio Grande do Sul) and the State Forum for Child Labour Eradication, has raised unnecessary difficulties.

As a last question, the interviewee was asked about his/her knowledge of the IPEC action programme in partnership with ASBEM. Out of the entire survey, only one stated that he/she did not know about the programme. All the others responded positively, it being the case that the Semear Foundation and ASBEM have broad knowledge about the theme, and also forged partnerships in order to help in developing the same.

Just as the empowering of the state apparatus directed towards dealing with the problem was perceptible, the IPEC action programme's results regarding civilian society organisations that work in the fight against child labour also continue to be quite visible.

Never the less, it must not be forgotten that the action programme's results or their sustainability in the long term were potentialised due to a context favourable to such initiatives. They were favoured both in terms of actions geared specifically towards child labour eradication due to governments' decision to give support to third sector²⁵ organisations and to extend participation by these institutions in the directing of federal public policies.

4. The business sector's perception

Another sector from which it was essential to obtain its perception on the child labour issue, on the initiatives that have been set out in dealing with it, on the performance of organisations involved in these processes and on the IPEC action programme was the business sector.

From the first diagnoses and actions developed by the programme, the fundamental importance of investing heavily in awareness raising and support from business people in the footwear-leather industry in child labour eradication was apparent. If companies and or their subcontractors were the main focus for hiring child labour in the region, the adoption of mechanisms to prevent this practice was essential in eliminating the problem.

Moreover, by taking into account the profile of the sector's undertakings and the incidence of the problem in different degrees given the companies' size, the interviews were conducted and analysed in terms of if the companies were big, small or medium-sized.

Initially, it was interesting to trace how the business sector was perceiving market changes, already pointed out as being positive in light of the research studies conducted on the footwear-leather industry's economic situation. Whilst representatives for the big companies confirmed the improving trend felt in the last 5 years, the small and medium-sized groups referred to the growing market instability for their products and services²⁶. In any case, most of their production was oriented to international market²⁷.

In terms of production outsourcing, it is noted that the market is more active among the small and medium companies. Around 10% of production is outsourced, particularly sewing work. At the same time, according to interviewees, in any type of

²⁵ Reflective of the Federal Government's option was its approval in 1999 of legislation directed towards regulating governments' relations with *civilian society public interest organisations (OSCIP)*, thus giving legal support to partnership actions between the first and third sectors.

²⁶ It is important to note that the number of workers in the companies studied does not represent a parameter for the entire region although it does partially reflect the variety of situations encountered. In the corpus, there are companies, with worker numbers ranging from 38 up to 3300.

²⁷ Initial data collection allows for supposing that the difference in perception on market trends is linked to the fact that as the large companies have mechanisms to downsize their costs and to pass down eventual changes in the sector, the small enterprises are at these fluxes and refluxes in a market that is more and more internationalised and subject to changes entirely out of their control.

company in the corpus studied, the existence of strong control over workshops and the type of work carried out²⁸ is definite.

The interviews conducted also identified the existence – or what continues to exist – of a *code of ethics* that obliges company owners to not contract child labour and gives them the responsibility for control of workshops subcontracted by them. At any rate, according to those interviewed, labour costs both for minors as well as for those 18 and over are the same and so contracting minors is not worth it. Contracting of apprentices is also considered to be hardly efficient by company owners.

This code cannot be characterised as a formal agreement between businesses for not contracting child labour. Nevertheless, as mentioned before the region's policy is to not contract minors under 18. Moreover, business owners guarantee that they do not accept workshops, which have minors among their staff. They point out however that they do encounter difficulties in controlling the problem in situations in which there is sub-contracting of work, that is, when it is passed on from the workshops to families.

This judgement by the business owners reinforces their opinion regarding the incidence of the problem. For, they ratify information obtained in other interviews that, *in general*, if there are children working in the municipalities they are no longer operating in the footwear-leather industry sector. The problem's prevalence is now in street labour, among paper collectors and other activities in which inspection by the public power is less efficient or in its initial stages.

These same business owners confirmed that in the past, in fact, there were minors working in companies in the region. They pointed out that at that time even judges granted mandates for children to work²⁹. One of the business owners interviewed also informed that he was one of these cases, having worked since twelve years of age and having an official work card.

This reinforces the notion that this attitude was considered acceptable practice both by business owners as well as by families. In many instances, this hiring reflected an attempt to collaborate with poor families that sought work or a trade for their children instead of leaving them up to the mercy of their own luck. For the aforementioned business owner however, there is today an implicit agreement among businesses to not hire child labour. Today, families know as well that the reality is different.

The initiatives highlighted by the business sector were the efforts started by the SEMEAR Foundation and considered to be important in eradicating child labour in the region. They stressed also that the municipal councils – through laws and bills – and the Ministry of Public Affairs, that has come to adopt a more collaborative stance, were of great importance in resolving the problem.

²⁸ Considering that both in the 1995 project as well as in the 1997 assessment, outsourcing and sub-contracting were factors associated with the child labour problem, the interviewees sought to verify that after the project's implementation, there was concern on the part of those who use outsourcing to set control and repression mechanisms regarding this practice.

²⁹ As was mentioned before, local culture and the argument about needy families led judges many times to grant authorisation for 12 year old minors to work to help out with family expenses.

In reference to changes in the region, those that can be considered to deserve attention due to their impact on the child labour problem, the interviewees, regardless of the size of their companies identified the following:

Firstly, the fact that there is today a partnership between companies and the Ministry of Public Affairs so that business owners know that if there is some company in the sector exploiting child labour or there is some company operating irregularly they themselves can file a complaint. This possibility does not only work in terms of the social problem in itself but also because if some irregularity were to occur it would mean unfair competition because, who works with cheap labour, child labour or badly paid labour can reduce costs and this is unfair practice³⁰.

Secondly, the relationship between companies and workshops is more professional and not just a matter of trust as before. This change in relations allowed for the institution of more rigid control instruments, permitting inspection “in loco” of the workshops’ working conditions.

Thirdly, the region’s businesses are more and more aware that clients come first and they do not want to buy products coming from anti-ethical business policies such as child labour exploitation, slave labour, “badly paid” work or subjection to sub-human work conditions. For some business people, it was just this attitude by consumers that made companies, especially exporting ones, to pay attention to the child labour problem and to set up mechanisms to control outsourcing in their production processes in a more rigid and effective manner.

Finally, business people state that there is greater awareness on their part in not contracting minors. It cannot be said though that in backyard³¹ businesses there do not exist policies different from the great majority’s practices.

5. The perception of children and their families

Of 170 children who participated in the IPEC/ILO project, it was seen that 52 children abandoned the programme before its end. For the objectives of this evaluation, it was initially planned to interview 20 children or teenagers together with their families. The intention was to interview 12 children or teenagers who remained in the programme until its end (age limit to leave: 14) and 8 who abandoned the programme at some moment.

In reality, only 8 interviewees were obtained from children or teenagers and out of these, 6 families agreed in replying to the questionnaire³². One of the possible obstacles found in carrying out the interviews was due to these families geographical

³⁰It is interesting to point out that by one of the interviewees identifying the ethics issue and unfair competition this affirmed that many businesses do not revert to child labour for fear of being discovered and of being labelled as “black sheep” in the sector.

³¹An expression used to qualify micro-enterprises where work is done informally. In fact, they are factory units that are in many instances not registered as companies. They are practically clandestine units. In the typology proposed at the beginning of this evaluation they would be cottage workshops.

³² Annex II provides a profile of the interviews, both of the children as well as of their families.

location³³. Many of them do not remain in the Novo Hamburgo and Dois Irmãos municipalities due to the high level of rotation in labour in the Footwear Industry, mainly in the workshops and in sub-contracting.

Considering the efforts made in this assessment to try to observe how children and their families envisage the child labour problem and how this vision has been changing over the period, it was decided to return to the starting point of the UFRGS diagnosis and to a certain extent reproduce the questionings made at that time.

One of the first aspects to be focused upon is that among the ILO children interviewed only two reported that they returned to work in the industry after having left the programme. The association of this indicator with the results of the 1999³⁴ evaluation, seems to ratify that the programme was successful in its attempt to remove children from work in the industry even considering the fact that the programme did not offer any alternative for supplementing family income.

The evaluation of the interviewees' questionnaires shows that out of those that were located, their families have parents whose age group varies between 46 and 55 years. It shows also that the majority declare themselves to be Catholic, they work in housing construction or in other domestic activities. It also shows that these children's parents in the majority are illiterate and have a family income less than the monthly minimal wage for a family of 5 to 6 persons.

This profile of the data can be justified because contrary to what was identified in the UFRGS surveys, the majority of children interviewed relate that economic factors led them to work at an early age. Further, practically all the children interviewed stated that their parents would be in favour of them working in the industry.

Even so, when a similar question is posed to the parents, that is, more specifically on what they think about child labour, half of them identify other causes that are not economic to justify the problem³⁵. This perception is supported by the fact, still according to the children interviewed, that out of the money earned, half was for them, that is, the income was not channelled to the family budget, although it did ease up the situation as the children began to take on some of their own expenses.

The cultural factor associated with the child labour problem can also be traced in the statement made by half of the children interviewed that for them it was good for their future to work since childhood. All the same, what weighs in this statement is that the children affirmed unanimously their liking to study and to go to school.

In short, although the number of children and families interviewed does not allow for making sound generalisations, what remains evident is the influence of the cultural aspect in explaining the problem and in the difficulties in overcoming and

³³ One of the evaluation team's efforts that generated a sub-product in this work was the attempt to recover the records of participants in the programmes. In Annex VII there is a list of participants whose identification the team managed to recover. However, the great majority was not found at the addresses given.

³⁴ According to the 1999 report, 118 children out of 170 were still attending the action programme when it ends, that represents a drop out rate of around 30%. The relation 6 in 8 found in the 2001 sample, indicates a 25% of evasion.

³⁵ See annex II, Table 14.

eradicating this problem. It is evident moreover that the gains in understanding the problem and the need to overcome it are much more visible among the institutions than among the families.

PART III – ASSESSING THE PROJECT

1. Its relevance

The assessment of the project in terms of its **relevance** must be considered from a dynamic perspective in order to verify if a project with a similar strategy would be relevant at this present moment. In other words, if an intervention identical to the one implemented in 1996 is no longer necessary, this would allow to suppose that the benefits generated from the project have remained and that the project offered a sustainable solution to the child labour problem.

From this perspective, the project's success can be considered in terms of the loss of relevance of an identical solution. The surveys and research carried out showed that although some benefits were generated, an intervention proposal in the fight against child labour in the Novo Hamburgo and Dois Irmãos municipalities must present a different strategy from the previous one.

From one angle, it can be observed that as at the State level, the municipal governments for Dois Irmãos and Novo Hamburgo brought the debate on child labour to the centre of discussions, thus committing resources and efforts in dealing with the problem not only in the Footwear Industry sector, but especially in this sector.

The investment made by the Dois Irmãos Prefecture to the **GLOBAL** project deserves special focus because it does not only structure the municipality's intervention in this area but it also recognises the IPEC/ILO's initiative in its conception. In fact, the GLOBAL initiative is an activity in partnership with the State and Society and was structured in order to meet the "great demand for children and adolescents working at an early age" although this is not only in the footwear-leather sector.

What is also evident is the Municipal Councils' concern in keeping themselves in line with the Federal Government's initiatives in the fight against child labour. Reflective of this submission to these initiatives, is the elaboration on the part of the Novo Hamburgo Municipal Council of the Child Labour Eradication Programme only seven months after the announcement by the State's Social Assistance Secretary (SEAS) of the Federal Government's programme and the creation of the ***Municipal Commission for Child Labour Eradication***, allowing for participation from Government and Organised Civilian Society Organisations.

At the state level, response to initiatives promoted by the Federal Government is quite explicit although slightly delayed. Even so, already in May 2001 the State Government of Rio Grande do Sul set up through Law 11.620, the Programme for Guaranteeing the Minimum Family Income which established through item II of Article 4, that the families benefiting from the programme will be those with children or dependants from 0 to sixteen years of age. The families who will receive preference are those "***with children carrying out child labour***".

Finally it must be stated that if the indicators identified in the research show that child labour exploitation in industries and workshops in the footwear-leather sector is no longer present, this does not mean that the problem faced by the municipalities does not

require technical and financial support from external agencies. Yet, the conclusion that it does not seem advisable to repeat the format tried in 1996 is restated here.

In general terms, what is frequent in the interviewees' observations is the fact that the focus of the child labour problem in the municipalities should no longer be centred exclusively on the Footwear Industry sector. Although they do not present data to validate this argument, the majority of those interviewed warn that there is greater occurrence of child labour in the *rubbish dumps*, in the streets and in other forms of begging.

In reference specifically to the Footwear sector, the challenge is in the fight against child labour cases in *sub-contracting*. This situation requires a different and specific strategy for dealing with the cause of the problems identified since it does not show similarity with the child labour exploitation cases in the factories and production lines.

One aspect that demands specific treatment regarding this problem is the difficulty in identifying and proving that child labour goes on in homes. For, this also hampers the Ministry of Public Affairs' and the Regional Labour Division's work.

Another aspect that cannot be forgotten is that child labour practised in the home environment makes the phenomenon closer to *domestic labour* than other more explicit and evident forms of child labour exploitation. Intervention would therefore require much more attention to cultural aspects as well as information and education for needy families. It will not just be a question of initiatives that supplement family income and or extend the school day³⁶.

A further aspect to be considered has to do with the problem of young people over 14 years and under 16 since they can no longer participate in the traditional child labour eradication programmes – especially those that supplement family income. Yet, they face legal and practical difficulties in entering the work market³⁷.

Finally, from the data gathered it could be deduced that working strategies should give more attention to child labour eradication policies in order to go beyond giving assistance to working children and adolescents. In this sense, it must be noted that the majority of investments need to be made in the municipal legislatures and the social assistance and or attention for children and teenagers municipal secretariats with a view to equipping to them for managing child labour eradication policies which ensure continuity, coherence and sustainability in the long term.

The equipping of the Municipal Public Power both the Executive members as well as the Legislature's should bring to light the need to understand the child labour problem or to deal with it. This depends on efforts to interlink public policies, that is, making them see the problem beyond direct action programmes and projects.

³⁶ Although the traditional strategies for income supplementation and extending the children's school day have significantly contributed to reducing child labour, as the IPEC experience itself has shown, the lack of further information on how home labour operates, leads to supposing that children and teenagers still end up becoming involved with work that their parents take home.

³⁷ It is important to remember that for many parents early entry to the work market is an important strategy for ensuring access to work at a later age. That is, the risk of having difficulties to find work in the future is incentive for putting the child on the work market once the first opportunity arises.

The need to direct projects for “inside homes” by reinforcing initiatives to restrict domestic labour basically through activities of an educational and social nature for parents. This is also identified as being of supreme importance for any post IPEC initiative proposed.

In essence, although financial and technical support for traditional projects in dealing with child labour, such as the extended school day or income supplementing, continue to be needed in the Novo Hamburgo and Dois Irmãos municipalities, **at present**, a programme based upon the model developed for the footwear-leather industry is hardly effective. This supports the 1996 programme’s success and the sustainability of its results given the programme’s loss of relevance criterion.

2. Its sustainability

Assessing the project’s sustainability implies analysing its results in relation to its immediate objectives. In light of this, the assessment will seek to establish if the results attained were kept up or continued over this period and to identify which factors explain the IPEC/ILO Programme’s sustainability or lack of sustainability.

The first aspect to be studied regarding the project’s sustainability is the tendency to consolidate child labour eradication efforts boosted by the project during the 1996/1997 period. This is not only indicated through the effective eradication of child labour in industrial units (factories and workshops) but also through the identification of an entire control and repression system for child labour use.

According to the diagnosis carried out by the Federal University of Rio Grande do Sul for the ILO in 1997 around 87% of children identified in a child labour situation in the Footwear sector worked in the industries and the workshops³⁸. This is no longer seen in the Novo Hamburgo and Dois Irmãos municipalities.

In other words, the removal of children from the work context in the sector’s factories was one of the project’s expected results. In spite of the project’s coming to an end, this result continues. One of the reasons for such a result is the effort made by the business sector to set up control and repression mechanisms against child labour exploitation in the companies themselves and in outsourced units.

The interviews conducted prove the existence of a tacit agreement for suppressing child labour in the industries and workshops in the municipalities studied. This agreement is considered a **code of ethics** by the business class. This code is represented through the existence of contractual clauses, in agreements between companies and their suppliers, which establish control and punishment mechanisms for those units, which exploit child labour.

Although this consequence was a result expected from the IPEC project on its elaboration in 1995 and an impact recognised in the *ex-post* assessment, what cannot be forgotten is that much of this sustainability is due to consumer pressure, mainly from international importers.

³⁸ See annex III where the sector’s factory unit typologies and the prevalence of child labour per unit type are discussed.

In essence, perhaps the programme would not have been so successful in terms of the sustainability of this code of ethics and the incorporation by the business sector of strict practices in using child and teenage labour if it were not for the market's negative reaction to products and companies associated with child labour.

With respect to the programme's sustainability in terms of building and empowering existing institutional apparatus in the municipalities in order to deal with the problem, it is observed that not only were the goals proposed met, for example through the creation of the Municipal Councils for Child Labour Eradication, but also that these councils are active and are extending their scope of attention beyond the sector.

Other substantially significant effects, which prove the programme's results' sustainability, are:

- ◆ Extension of assistance to children and teenagers through the GLOBAL Project in the city of Dois Irmãos;
- ◆ Institutional empowering of ASBEM in Novo Hamburgo by expanding its operation and adding new support and partnerships, especially in the private sector³⁹;
- ◆ The Novo Hamburgo's Council's adhesion to the Federal Government's Child Labour Eradication Programme (PETI - Programa de Erradicação do Trabalho Infantil do Governo Federal), in accordance with the project drawn up in 2000;
- ◆ Greater involvement from organised civilian society in dealing with the problem as the following shows: support from the Industries' Social Service (SESI) for the GLOBAL project; creation and upkeep of the SEMEAR Foundation by the Commercial and Industrial Association; support by the National Service for Industrial Training (SENAI) and the National Service for Commercial Training for actions developed by ASBEM, among others.

In terms of the programme's and the results' sustainability, this institutional empowerment and the adherence of new actors to the proposal divulged by IPEC as well as by governments has facilitated in the generating of more resources for financing initiatives in the fight against child labour. This thus guarantees financial sustainability for the various projects and actions that are being implemented.

This also increases local governments' ability to offer greater counter options to investments offered by other government spheres as well as by external investors. This creates therefore a virtuous circle, which has led to the consolidation of practices in the fight against child labour originally proposed by the IPEC action programme and the

³⁹If at the start of the programme in 1996, the Council was the main source of financing for ASBEM's activities, the organisation's institutional reports show now that in addition to transfers from the public sector, the institution now relies upon support from 31 private enterprises (share-holding companies), the majority from the footwear sector.

linking of these practices with other actions such as family income supplementation for families who remove their children from work and keep them at school.

Furthermore, the analyses made concerning discussion of the social context, especially those analyses relative to the offer of public education services, indicated a substantial increase in the number of places at elementary level in the two municipalities studied. This serves in a way, to characterise local governments' efforts in ensuring a safeguard for their assistance policies to children and teenagers in the aforementioned communities.

Such an effort however cannot be statistically related to the programme's results since differences in scale⁴⁰ would not cater for making any value judgement based upon numbers. So, although it has been observed that municipal governments invested in extending access to elementary education, it is not possible to show – in numbers – that part of this expansion was in response to child labour eradication efforts undertaken.

This favourable scenario to the evaluation of the sustainability of the programme's effects does not hide or should not hide the problems and difficulties detected in the past and which continue to be the focus of frequent complaints by the social actors involved in the implementation of projects and actions aimed at fighting child labour exploitation.

For some, the lack of resources to increase the number of places on the extended school day or to extend assistance is a difficulty that still continues, although as has been pointed out this measure would reach children and teenagers working in other sectors and not in the Footwear Industry⁴¹.

The problem of assistance coverage is made graver, according to interviewees, for the 14 and 16-year public since from this age the benefits associated with government programmes, especially those for income supplementation are closed off. Moreover, as already stated, the business sector is avoiding hiring apprentices thus making these young people's legal entry onto the work market difficult.

Further, according to specialists interviewed, this type of "limbo" to which young people are subjected when they reach 15, ends up leading them back to hardly recommended work conditions.

Lastly, specialists continue to fear as a danger to the continuation of progress achieved the "slight political commitment to projects and programmes" and the "lack of continuity in administrations". This is not a recurring concern among specialists and

⁴⁰ If the number of children and teenagers assisted both by the IPEC's programme's actions as well as by present initiatives by the councils is taken (approximately 300 beneficiaries and compare this with the number of students registered at elementary level in the municipalities (more than 40000 persons), it will be seen that it does not make sense to compare them or to try to make any other co-relation.

⁴¹ Using as a reference the fact that the programme's aim was to deal with the child labour problem in the Footwear Industry, the assessments put forward here focus on the problem in this sector of the municipalities' economy. This does not mean that actions which broaden the programme's scope as well as that of local initiatives to assist children and teenagers who work in other areas or other sectors are not relevant or necessary.

analyses previously made do not support them, since in spite of where or how political changes occurred, the efforts to deal with the child labour issue have continued.

One explanation for this concern from specialists may lie in eventual changes in programmes. These programmes without major changes to their scope or aims may have their administrators (for political motives), their names and logos (in order to take on the new government's identity) or their implementation strategies changed.

In any one of these cases, the harm to the project's progress is undeniable since such alterations will require "adaptation periods". Yet, in terms of child labour eradication policy, in general, the principles and bases are maintained, thus not implying a lack of sustainability for initiatives set up.

3. Mainstreaming

One of the aims of IPEC's actions has been to establish actions aimed towards eliminating child labour as a central aspect of municipal, state and national governments' social policies. In this sense, questions relative to the institutional apparatus, financial and budget contributions to governments' programmes and actions need to be studied.

The mainstreaming of the child labour eradication policy can also be seen in the existing mechanisms geared towards monitoring and controlling the problem. In addition to the Councils for the Defence of Rights and Guardianship Rights, in the municipalities studied, the Ministry of Labour and Employment through its Regional Labour Subdivision and the Ministry of Public Affairs have proven to be quite active in vigilance activities and in response to complaints.

One of the mechanisms which had its creation motivated, as well as supported, by the IPEC action programme was the Municipal Forum for Child Labour Eradication⁴² which came into being and has its base in Novo Hamburgo and a branch in Dois Irmãos. Thus it was the only forum operating in the two municipalities involved in the programme. Its attributes were to monitor cases of child labour exploitation and to collaborate in the drawing up of proposals and initiatives aimed at dealing with the problem.

After the culmination of the IPEC programme, the Fora have continued to operate and what influences their operation since the project's culmination and the present moment is the meeting of the directorship's whenever "some issue is not going very well".

At the time of their creation the Fora had quite a broad representation from society, which in theory it continues to have, with representatives from the Regional Labour Subdivision, ASBEM, SENAI, the Workers' Union for the Footwear Industry, Churches, Novo Hamburgo and Dois Irmãos Councils, Technical Centre for Leather, Footwear and Related Products, SESI and various other non-governmental organisations.

⁴² Originally they were intended to be called fora, but at present only the National Forum holds this denomination. As a rule, the municipalities have Municipal Commissions for Child Labour Eradication as the one in Novo Hamburgo created in accordance with municipal decree in 1999.

The Child Labour Eradication Commission which had its members nominated by the Novo Hamburgo Council in accordance with decree 644/2000, also has had substantial representation from government and non-governmental organisations and in a way maintains practically the same groups of organisations that made up the forum during IPEC's action programme.

The question that is raised given the setting up of the Commission, apparently linked to the municipality's adhesion to the Federal Government's PETI is how the apparent overlapping of attributes between the Forum and the Commission is being handled. For, in spite of sporadic meetings, the Forum continues to exist and what will be the outcome in Dois Irmãos since the Forum was meant to operate in the two localities.

The Guardianship Councils in both municipalities are operating in accordance with what is set out in the Law although they do encounter difficulties in carrying out their tasks of removing children from the work place and directing them to their families in response to complaints and investigations.

The interviewees state that the aforementioned councils still face some difficulties of a material nature in order to completely meet their attributes, as well as such difficulties as little time, the children's families socio-economic condition, the difficulties in restoring attitudes of affection among family members and as always the cultural barrier.

Moreover, in accordance with the interviewees, a better structure is needed for the counsellor's work such as transport and support networks, a rehabilitation centre and shelter for the children and even a vocational training centre in order to teach the minors a trade. Yet, all recognise that the structure for facing the problem improved in a marked way with the start of the IPEC action programme and this trend has been kept up.

The Municipal Councils for Child Labour Eradication have also been active with respect to the aforementioned problems related to the availability of few resources. Moreover, what cannot be forgotten is that in the case of the footwear sector, the very companies maintain their teams of "inspectors" given the already mentioned code of ethics. The teams make periodic visits to workshops and subcontracted production locales in order to check for working children.

Also, given the interaction between the footwear-leather industry with initiatives in the fight against child labour, institutions working in an interactive way with the sector have received technical and financial support. This has led to the consolidation of practices for controlling, monitoring and handling of the problem.

One of the actions foreseen by the IPEC action programme was the strengthening and broadening of assistance to children and teenagers through the spreading of assistance centres set up in the Dois Irmãos and Novo Hamburgo municipalities. The data gathered now in 2001 shows that in the two municipalities the assistance actions were not only upkeep but also expanded and reinforced although IPEC's financial support was closed off.

In the case of the Dois Irmãos municipality, the local council through the GLOBAL Project offers extra-class activities to children and teenagers who work prematurely and/or who remain alone at home while their relatives work. As such, the Council maintains an extra-class educational centre between 7 a.m.–5 p.m. and offers to its beneficiaries:

- Pedagogical support;
- Food programme
- sports practice;
- theatre, creative dance, German and gaucho folklore workshops;
- typing and computer courses; and,
- Traffic and health education workshops,

In addition, some sub-projects are developed in the centre, including children and teenagers' participation. Some worth mentioning are: Community Gardening, Carpentry, Choir and Music, Live Pharmacy, Waste Recycling and Environmental Education.

According to information drawn from ASBEM's programme's final report, in the Novo Hamburgo municipality, two centres for assisting children removed from dangerous work were set up through support from the aforementioned organisation. One (Roselândia) has the capacity to assist 31 (thirty one) children and another centre in the Vila Iguaçu where the other 53 (fifty three) children assisted by the programme were housed.

At present, according to the information presented in the council's project for PETI, dated October 2000, as well as information provided by ASBEM's specialists, 7 (seven) assistance nuclei are maintained on a flexible basis. These are: the Dom Quixote nucleus in the São Jorge district; Monteiro Lobato nucleus in the Canudos district; Pequeno Príncipe nucleus in the Rondônia district; Mundo da Criança nucleus in Vila Iguaçu; Bem Viver nucleus in the Guarani district; Primavera nucleus in the district having the same name; and the Roselândia nucleus.

As the Novo Hamburgo Council project's document well defines, the "socio-educational support nuclei constitute an alternative preventive space for children and adolescents from seven to seventeen years, during the period alternative to the regular school time-table. These children and teenagers come from the popular classes and are sent by the community, schools, the Guardianship Council or by the Child and Juvenile Court".

Although neither the council informs on the project's assistance capacity in all the nuclei identified nor do the specialists interviewed have information on the same, only for the Federal Government's PETI, the project caters to a total of 150 children, that almost doubles the number of children assisted by the IPEC programme in 1996.

In addition to the pedagogical support activities, recreation, sports, material recycling, gardening and craft workshops are offered at the Novo Hamburgo nuclei.

Moreover, the partnership between the Council and ASBEM guarantees the teenagers' access to Cutting and Sewing, Carpentry, Administrative Services and Computer Courses that are given by the Association's Professional Initiation Centre.

4. Synergies produced

Since its conception, the IPEC programme has held in its scope a clear direction for the construction of partnerships and the strengthening of already existing ones in order to produce synergies which extend the work of all the social actors involved. This also makes the task of eradicating child labour in the footwear-leather industry more feasible.

As a result of this stance, the results observed with respect to the creation of partnerships and supposedly the generation of synergies favourable to the programme and interested partnerships were already quite promising in the evaluations on the project's end and the programme's impact carried out at the end of 1998 and the middle of 1999.

The interviews and field surveys carried out prove that since the programme's end, the concern to strengthen partnerships and to create synergies has been quite frequent among the majority of actors and institutions studied.

In taking ASBEM as a most representative example, by its involving private organisations, sector entities, public organs and individuals in the effort to protect children and adolescents at social risk, it can be said that only here the programme can be considered successful in relation to maintaining and creating synergies.

The vision is lost however of other very significant advances such as for example the approximation between private enterprises, the Ministry of Public Affairs and the Regional Labour Subdivision.

According to the majority of those interviewed, if in the past some looked with mistrust at the other, at present, institutions are seeking to work in partnership so much so that auditing of State organs strengthens the bases of the business sector's **code of ethics**. This sector in turn, reports and directs the Ministry of Public Affairs' action when necessary.

The footwear-leather sector's involvement has brought as partners, SENAI, SESI and SENAC which have added technical and financial support. This has therefore boosted government initiatives and better positions the sector in relation to the consumer market by allowing these organisations from the so-called "S System" to incorporate a new clientele to its initiatives. This is a clear case of a partnership with good synergy results.

Lastly but not least, the actions triggered by local society in partnership with the IPEC programme established good ground to add new initiatives in dealing with child labour through the reduction of effects regarding income. Thus, programmes such as the Federal Government's School Stipend and the State Government's Family Citizen are being associated with initiatives already in being. Once again the ASBEM's project is

representative – empowering initiatives and at the same time giving faster and more precise answers to policies produced at other governmental levels.

5. Offshoots and Other results observed

In addition to the results identified or the sustainability of results even after the ending of IPEC's work in the two municipalities, other positive offshoots associated to the project were identified in interviews and surveys conducted.

In a sense, the child labour issue in the Footwear Industry and the need to develop repression mechanisms for this arm of child labour exploitation surpassed the limits of the Novo Hamburgo and Dois Irmãos municipalities and became the focus of concern for business people and institutions throughout the Vale dos Sinos Region.

According to a representative from the Region's Ministry of Labour and Employment and the Dois Irmãos Council for the Defence of Rights, other initiatives of a similar nature have been taking place in other municipalities in the zone such as the project in the municipality of Sapiranga⁴³, having participation from the Abrinq⁴⁴ Foundation and the Ayrton Senna⁴⁵ Institute. The IPEC action programme's influence on the creation of the *ProChild/Azaléia Project* in the municipality of Parobé⁴⁶.

A partnership with the Abrinq Foundation allowed during the period between 1997/2000 for the Foundation SEMEAR to sensitise 112 companies (85% of the Footwear Industry in the region) to adhere to the effort to eradicate child labour. This partnership proved to be more intense in the Três Coroas⁴⁷, Igrejinha⁴⁸, Parobé, Sapiranga and Novo Hamburgo municipalities. SESI was also involved in this effort. According to the interviewee, at the height of the mobilisation more than 1000 were being assisted in these localities.

Given the demobilisation regarding the issue, brought about by the restructuring of the *Programa Empresa Amiga da Criança*, many companies are withdrawing from the Abrinq Foundation. This represents a step backward in the process. In like manner, SESI had to reduce its investments in the area, thus decreasing coverage and the number of children and teenagers assisted.

Another result to be spotlighted, the focus of pride for some of the interviewees was the fact that the Dois Irmãos Council GLOBAL Project received international recognition in 2000, having been classified for a competition in Spain as one of the 15 best projects directed towards child labour eradication.

⁴³ Municipality in the Region that borders Dois Irmãos and which has a population of over 80000 inhabitants.

⁴⁴ The Abrinq Foundation is a non-governmental organisation, created by the Brazilian Toy Industries Association, having strong involvement in the elimination of child labour. It is responsible for the "stamp" *Empresa Amiga da Criança - Company Friend of the Child*.

⁴⁵ The Ayrton Senna Institute is a non-governmental organisation founded by relatives of a famous Brazilian racecar driver and works mainly in the development of educational programmes for children and adolescents. It places special emphasis on initiatives aimed towards the reduction of the age/grade gap among students in the public education network.

⁴⁶ Municipality in the region that borders with Sapiranga. It has a population of approximately 50000 inhabitants.

⁴⁷ Municipality in the Vale do Rio dos Sinos region with a population around 20000 inhabitants.

⁴⁸ Municipality in the region with a population of approximately 30000 inhabitants.

This result not only supports how sustainable the IPEC experience in the municipality is but it also illustrates that initiatives were set up in an institutional space that fostered improvement, expansions and consequently greater effectiveness in the municipal effort to eradicate child labour.

Discussion of the problem in the footwear sector also brought to light the hard reality in municipalities in the Vale dos Sinos Region. Although they are richer than a good number of other Brazilian municipalities, they face more and more the problem of impoverishment and exclusion of parts of their populations. This results in the child labour problem going beyond the industries, the footwear sector and spreading at present to the streets, the dumps and more and more to residences.

For the Regional Labour Subdivision, one of the positive consequences of this awareness raising process was the fact that the pilot project in the footwear sector brought positive results. This made it spread to other areas, thus practically eliminating child labour in the third sector, only remaining now in the case of sub-contracting and in informal environments.

From the data collected, it is possible to evaluate the programme positively in reference to the positive offshoots and collateral effects coming from its implementation. Likewise, it is possible to check that these offshoots have also managed to be self-sustaining even after the ending of the IPEC/ILO intervention in the municipalities and in the region.

PART IV – FINAL CONSIDERATIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

The final part of this evaluative work is made up of the development of a summarised assessment of the continuation of the results caused by the implementation of IPEC's programme in the Region. It looks at the targets reached as well as eventual failures with a view to producing a set of criticisms and suggestions that contribute to improving actions in the fight against child labour supported by the ILO and or by agencies with which there is some type of partnership.

All the same, this summarised assessment requires certain criteria for structuring the evaluation's aims and the conclusions to be drawn from the same. Although, in the third part of this study numerous evaluations have already been proffered, other criteria can also be used in orienting this evaluation, given the aspects required in this study's terms of reference.

In 1999, a team of ILO consultants carried out an **Assessment of the Programme's Impact** and for such established another set of aspects to be analysed. Although these do not conflict with the demands of the terms of reference, they allow for generating a view of the programme's results and their sustainability in relation to the relative actors. This is different from the second part of this document that sought to avoid value judgements from the evaluation team.

The document for the evaluation of the impact assessed the programme in terms of its contributions on eradicating child labour; the difficulties experienced in its implementation; participation in partnerships; impacts on participating children and adolescents and on their families.

From this reference base, discussion of the project's end, the sustainability of its effects on children and their families can be initiated. The surveys conducted, although precarious show that the importance and valuing of the school have been sustained. This therefore strengthens the assessment made then on *“awareness raising as to the priority and importance of school in all individuals' education”*.

At the same time, what seems to have got lost along this trajectory, is the new perception that parents had about their children. According to the then report they became aware *“of the need for their children and adolescents to live out the experience of being a child: to study, to play and to do activities characteristic of their own age.”*

Both in the statements made by students, relatives and other interviewees, the idea of work persists as a pedagogical and socialising influence for children and teenagers. Moreover, the difficulty is observed in seeing creative play as different from being idle and unoccupied, as being the pathway for a more healthy process in the child's socialisation and integration in life.

What is also perceived and this had already been seen in the 1999 evaluation is, ***“work dressed up in the form of help”*** as the discourse, making it possible and acceptable for children and adolescents.

The programme’s impacts on family’s living conditions, if it is that they could have been seen then, cannot be seen now given that the programme generated a loss in income and commitment – although it was circumstantial – in those families’ financial situation because their children came off the market.

In the 1999 evaluation’s conclusions, the team highlighted as a positive outcome of the IPEC programme the ***creating of awareness about the child labour problem*** in the municipalities and indicated the start of a broad discussion on the theme together with its various social sectors.

This awareness and the ***incorporation of actions for the eradication of child labour through municipal public policies were*** also perceived in the surveys made now in 2001. This thus confirms the sustainability of the advances made and their spread to other municipalities in the Vale dos Sinos Region and to other economic sectors in the region.

At the same time, the studies carried out find a Municipal Legislative Power still hardly open to the problem. This leads to the understanding that the discussions relative to the issue are not so present in the local legislature’s debates as it is in the Executives’ actions.

According to one of the interviewees, a representative from a non-governmental organisation, the legislatures are still not concerned with the child labour issue. Consequently, they do not play a more specific, preventive and aware role. Within this area, it is also difficult to break down the myth that it is good for the child to work from early so that he/she does not remain idle.

Statements made by one of the counsellors interviewed, a member of the Human Rights Commissions, reflect the legislature's incompatibility with IPEC's proposal. In his statements, he emphasises the importance of guaranteeing liberty of choice for children in relation to this issue and does not condemn child labour. In his opinion, work should not be prohibited at any age, mainly if it is to help out with the family budget. He states however, that education cannot be neglected and can be offered during the night period.

These statements suggest the need to develop strategies for a new working space for IPEC programmes in Brazil. These would involve taking to the Municipal Council of Representatives the discussion on child labour and other forms of child abuse and exploitation by promoting seminars, workshops, discussions and better training counsellors to carry out the role of monitors, normally reserved for the Legislative Power.

This fact as well as the numerous statements from the interviewees which show the depth of cultural roots in child labour in the Country, especially in the Region in

study cannot be reached with one time, ephemeral actions⁴⁹ such as the action programme supported by the IPEC/ILO. When associated however with relevant external factors, the programme provides the dynamic and guidance necessary for local actors to produce more significant results in dealing with the problem.

In the case of the footwear-leather sector, the relevant external factor was precisely the consumer market's refusal to give preference to products from companies that directly or indirectly use any form of labour exploitation, mainly child labour.

In essence, by associating the risk of market loss to one of the most dynamic sectors in the economy of the municipalities in focus to a strategy (although still one time and ephemeral) in dealing with the child labour issue, the results were significant in the short term as the 1999 impact evaluation showed. These were also kept up in periods subsequent to the programme's end given the fact that the relevant actors remained committed to the strategies and initiatives agreed to during the programme's implementation.

Here a brief discussion is appropriate on the observation previously made and which in principle suggests a tendency that can be strengthened by interventions supported by IPEC, these would be: to seek to stimulate an attitude of rejection of industries and economic activities that exploit child labour on the part of consumer markets.

This strategy is limited and this will be discussed later on. Yet, once child labour exploitation prevention and control instruments become developed, they bring organised civilian society to participate in the process. Thus child labour exploitation moves out of formally established groups and works in informal situations, in residences and in spaces where market consumer pressures are not perceived or not included by economic agents.

The child labour exploitation situation in the Footwear Industry is enlightening in this analysis. All those interviewed by the evaluation team, independently of the sector in which they worked, affirmed that it is no longer possible to find children or teenagers working in Footwear industries or workshops or in outsourcing locales.

Some of those interviewed recognise however the possibility that there may exist cases in which "outsourced" agents can exploit their sons and daughters labour in a home environment given the fact that they work in homes and according to production volume. The informality of these work relations, affect the operation of companies, their controllers, the Guardianship Councils, the Ministry of Public Affairs and the Ministry of Labour.

Based upon the evaluation of IPEC's programme for the Footwear Industry, the aforementioned statement that child labour exploitation is closer to cottage labour than

⁴⁹ The programme assisted 120 children in a universe of more than 400 identified in a child labour situation. Moreover, all the interviews as well as the initiatives carried out by the Councils show that the programme's coverage was insufficient since that period. At the same time, social change requires initiatives that exceed the offer of services and financial support for children/families found working at an early age.

to other forms of work, will also require a reformulation of operation strategies from the programme and the ILO.

The cultural issue once again receives special attention in the interventions from programmes sponsored by IPEC/ILO, since in the Brazilian case, actions that have been considered in the existing programmes (extended school day, supplementing of income, pedagogical monitoring, professional family training) have proven to be adequate in overcoming the material causes of the child labour problem.

By using Sampaio's and Ruiz's (1996) proposal as the ILO's working directive, that is, to resolve the early child labour problem it is necessary to "delegitimise ideologically child labour, neutralise it as an economic necessity and rediscuss its pedagogical sense", IPEC's strategy in the next years for the Footwear Industry and for the Vale dos Sinos Region should be focused precisely on ideological and pedagogical issues.

Recommendations for Action and Lessons Learnt

Given the above discussion presented above and the demands put forward by the parts interviewed, it is advisable for the programme to establish follow-up action in the Novo Hamburgo and Dois Irmãos municipalities:

- a) More input or investments should be made with respect to changing family attitudes *vis-à-vis* child labour, specifically regarding the need for children to live the once in a life time experience of being a child. This action should be taken up by the Municipal Public Power as well as by civilian social organisations involved in the issue;
- b) Municipal legislatures should become more involved, especially in motivating discussions on child labour eradication policies and the impacts of the same on children and on development prospects in the municipalities. This initiative should be led and supported by an entity that has extensive municipal operation, such as the State Government or mainly the State Forum for Child Labour Eradication;
- c) Entities that support projects should not have factories and the business sector as their main point of focus but rather their focus should be more and more on the home and the family as their main point for intervention strategies in the region; and,
- d) Public agents, especially Municipal Administrative organs should invest in greater integration and articulation of social support programmes in the municipalities so that, for example: families benefiting from the support programme for income generation should also be part of programmes that encourage children to remain in school.

These are the recommendations that apply specifically to the Dois Irmãos and Novo Hamburgo municipalities. They can however be applied to other similar municipalities. There are also other general recommendations that can be applied to

any policy geared towards combating child labour. From the lessons learnt⁵⁰, special attention should be given to the following:

- a) Economic constraints are pertinent *vis-à-vis* the business sector's and working classes' efforts in child labour eradication. In light of this, once this issue is raised in these organised sectors of the economy, consumer market and union involvement are also of fundamental importance. Thus, child labour eradication actions should take into account these segments of society as mechanisms in order to guarantee sustainability;
- b) The strengthening or empowering of social civilian organisations and state apparatus in eradicating child labour. Although this strategy is fundamental, it is limited given the "privacy of the home", which serves as a barrier to its interventions. This can only be overcome though work to foster changes regarding perception of the problem by children and their families. Thus, actions undertaken should include initiative to seek out greater involvement of families in the process, especially in stages, following the withdrawal of the financing organisation;
- c) projects and programmes geared towards dealing with the problem in a specific sector of the economy or in a specific geographic zone should add to their analysis methodologies tools which allows for identifying eventual changes in child labour points, that is movements from one locale to another⁵¹;
- d) Linking up with programmes that supplement family income and which base this supplement upon the child remaining in school. This should be a pertinent criterion in initiatives supported IPEC/OIT. Strategies which serve to link up or bring together other social or economic development programmes should also be considered;
- e) Finally, the Novo Hamburgo/Dois Irmãos experience showed that the sustainable results of the action go beyond the removal of a number of children from work situations. For the most important and sustainable actions are seen in the institutional framework involved. Thus actions with these types of results should become more and more the focus of IPEC programmes and initiatives for dealing directly with children in labour situations should be left to local public agents.

⁵⁰ It is important to point out here that the lessons learnt and mentioned in this item, refer to the learning experience produced by the assessment process, that is, regarding the sustainability of actions after the final project and not in terms of immediate impacts which were the focus of the 1999 assessment.

⁵¹ The case of the IPEC programme in Novo Hamburgo/Dois Irmãos is representative of this gap. Although there has been a reduction in the occurrence of the problem in the footwear and leather sector, its continuation in other economic activities has been observed. There is no instrument that allows for analyst to correlate these two phenomena. Thus, it is possible that undesirable effects are not being detected in assessments carried out.

ANNEXES

ANNEX I

METHODOLOGICAL CONSIDERATIONS

This annex discusses the methodological approaches used in the development of this document as well as the direction followed in data collection, analysis and interpretation based upon a comparative study of the state of the problem existing before the project's implementation in the Novo Hamburgo and Dois Irmãos municipalities and its current state.

1. Type of Study

According to Tripodi (1981) and Triviños (1987), this study is classified as a type of exploratory study, which allows for increasing the researcher's experience on the specific question. The main idea of exploratory studies is to develop ideas and hypotheses relative to the object in focus, mainly for working with a post-facto evaluation. At the same time, it can be said that data collection, even the study itself can be considered for Triviños (1987), as descriptive. For it uses qualitative, quantitative, documentary information as well as questionnaires and semi-structured interviews.

In the case of this document, the main objective was to evaluate the effect of the project's implementation in fighting child labour in the footwear-leather industry in the Vale dos Sinos, proposed by IPEC/ILO and in partnership with Novo Hamburgo's Asbem. What Tripodi (1981, p.56) classifies an assessment programme as:

"Assessment studies of programmes are those quantitative-descriptive types that seek out a specific programme's or method's effects in lending help/service. Such programmes can have a variety of objectives relative to health, education and well being. The hypotheses may not be explicitly declared and frequently are derived from the objectives of the programme under analysis, and instead of from the theory. Such studies can use a variety of procedures in order to focus on an experimental project".

2. Trajectory covered in data collection, analysis and interpretation

This study was carried out in various steps related to data collection, analysis and interpretation. These steps will be described in the subsequent items.

2.1 Initial planning in the data collection process

The first step took place on 1st and 2nd October of this year (2001) when at a co-ordination meeting the planning of this study's activities as well as the elaboration of a reference document for this paper *Fight against child labour exploitation in the Footwear Industry in the Vale dos Sinos, Brazil – Preliminary references for an ex-post assessment* were carried out.

Given the already mentioned analysis structure and the objectives of each section proposed for this document, the data base to be used was defined for the projects document's development and thus referred at least to the following information sources:

- a) **Reference Documents:** These are understood to be basic input on the IPEC programme, its object of study and what should form the basis for the majority of discussions and the analysis, more specifically:
- The Child Labour Diagnosis in Novo Hamburgo and Dois Irmãos – Research Report drawn up by the UFRGS team in 1997;
 - The study giving an evaluation of the impact of the Programme for the Eradication of Child Labour in Novo Hamburgo and Dois Irmãos, presented in April 1999 at the meeting of the Permanent Forum for the Eradication of Child Labour in Novo Hamburgo and Dois Irmãos municipalities; and,
 - The proposal in the Project for the Fight against Child Labour in the Footwear-leather Industry in the Vale dos Sinos made to IPEC/ILO in August 1995.
- b) **source of secondary data and statistics produced by outsourcing,** this should serve to give an overview, only a general one of the context in which the IPEC is situated, the following was thus used:
- Demographic data based on the 1991, 2000 censuses and their projections during that period;
 - Information on the Vale dos Sinos Region's GDP, using as a reference base, studies published in the State and Region for the period 1991 to 2000;
 - Establishment distribution and the number of people employed in the Region's Footwear Industry, using as a reference base information from the State's Secretary of Finance for the period 1991 to 2000;
 - Annual nominal earnings by the head of household per region during the period 1991/2000, using a reference base information from the IBGE Census;
 - Initial School registration per level in the region, State Secretary of Education during the period 1994 to 2000;
 - Information relative to repetition and evasion rates in Elementary Level Education in the municipalities, using as a reference base data from the State Secretary of Education for the period 1994 to 2000;
 - Employment and unemployment research data in the Region during the period;
 - Sales trends in footwear manufactured in the State in the period 1991 to 2000, DECEX (Departamento de Operações de Comércio Externo – Department for External Trade Operations), ACI-NH (Associação Comercial, Industrial e de Serviços de Novo Hamburgo – Commercial, Industrial and Service Association for Novo Hamburgo) ABAEX – Associação Brasileira dos Agentes de Exportação de

Couro, Calçados e Afins – Brazilian Association of Leather, Footwear and Related Products Export Agents);

- The Footwear Industry's place in Rio Grande do Sul's exports during the period 1995 to 2000;
- Main footwear producers in the State of Rio Grande do Sul during the period 1995 to 2000, Source ABAEX;
- Size of the footwear-leather complex in Rio Grande do Sul in the period 1995 to 2000, Source ABAEX;
- Brazilian footwear producers and suppliers as per State, 1995 to 2000, Source CTCCA (Centro Técnico do Couro, Calçados e Afins – Technical Centre for Leather, Footwear and Related Products);
- Vale dos Sinos' workers monthly income, IBGE;
- Bankruptcies and closures in the Footwear Industry, in the period 1994 to 2000, Source Secretary of Finance;
- Participation of workshops and other forms of outsourcing in footwear-leather production in the Region;
- Number of children resident in the municipalities according to age group, Source IBGE;
- Offer of pre-school vacancies in the municipalities during the period 1995 and 2000.
- Survey of the region's newspaper and periodical articles in order to identify the number and tone of articles relative to issues in the region during the period 1998 to 2000.
- Research on the legislation and law bills, relative to the issue in 1995, 1997 and 2000.
- Research on the existence and operation of fora, rights councils and guardianship councils for children and teenagers during the period 1995 to 2000.
- Identification of other third sector organisations that work on the issue of child labour and or in the defence of children and adolescents with a view to analysing the level of importance given to the child labour issue in their discussions, work and in the financing of their activities.
- Data collection on similar programmes in other municipalities in the Region, their size and reach.
- Data collection on the presence (absolute and partial) of child labour eradication programmes in the State and municipalities' budget in the period 1995 and 2000.

Data collection on the number of programmes existing in the municipalities geared towards this cause, in particular geared towards supplementing family income.

c) source of primary data comes mainly through semi-structured interviews with various government and organised civilian society representatives, interviews with business people from the footwear-leather sector, children and families assisted by the Programme *Fight against Child Labour in the Footwear Industry in the Vale dos Sinos presented to IPEC/ILO in August 1995* and with specialists involved in this project. For each group of representatives chosen, specific semi-structured interviews were developed (see Annex 02). For the children and families assisted a questionnaire was drawn up. This questionnaire (see Annex 02) had as its point of reference the *Child Labour Diagnosis in Novo Hamburgo and Dois Irmãos – Research Report drawn up by the UFRGS team in March 1997*.

The aim of this primary data collection was to supplement the secondary data and information gathered from the studies of existing documentation through the perceptions of the actors involved and or interested in the issue studied here. The emphasis given to the actors' perceptions comes from the strong subjective nature expected from the sustainable results of IPEC's proposal. In other words, considering the programme's small representativeness from a quantitative perspective⁵², greater expectation exists regarding the action's sustainability in terms of changes in the actors' behaviour, perception and attitude regarding the child labour problem.

Thus, the limiting of the participant sample from the data collection occurred mainly due to the relation of the actors involved in the project and local effort to deal with the child labour problem in the Footwear Industry. For this study, the interviewees were classified into two types, the institutional interviews and personal ones.

c.1) Institutional Interviews: An important aspect of the assessment process is understanding how the institutional apparatus worked since the project's implementation in the region. The interviewees were subdivided into organised civilian society and State. The initial planning of who would be interviewed is described below:

- **Organised Civilian Society:** ASBEM, Dois Irmãos Diocese, SEMEAR Foundation, AMECAR, Fora for the Eradication of Child Labour in the Municipality, Novo Hamburgo Commercial and Industrial Association, SESI – Industries' Social Service, Workers' Union for the Footwear Industries in Novo Hamburgo and Dois Irmãos, Footwear Industry Union for Novo Hamburgo and Dois Irmãos, Child Crèche Commission, Cáritas Diocese, the Travessão Residents' Association, Chairman of the Commission for Social

⁵²The attempt to focus upon an analysis of the programme's sustainability in the removal of children and adolescents from child labour in the footwear-leather industry (or from child labour as a whole) came up against the problem of the magnitude of the work to be undertaken. Just for the record, the programme assisted 170 children out of a total of 400 identified in the two municipalities. This number is not very representative however when compared with the approximately 10000 youngsters, identified in a child labour situation through data collection activities carried out prior to the programme and with a population of over 30000 people in the 7 to 14 age group resident in the two municipalities. The effects in terms of the effective reduction of the problem are hardly perceptible and from a methodological perspective its demonstrability is hardly likely. The trends in any other variable could explain the quantitative reduction in the problem with the same coherence as the action sponsored by IPEC.

Affairs of the Municipal Houses of Counsellors for Novo Hamburgo and Dois Irmãos.

- State: Ministry of Public Affairs, Municipal Secretaries for Social Action, Municipal Secretaries for Education, Guardianship, Child and Teenage Rights Council and the Regional Labour Division.

c.2) **Personal Data:** In addition to obtaining an overview of how institutions react and reacted regarding the child labour issue, the evaluation sought to envisage how people's perceptions changed regarding the issue in focus. At first, there was a tendency to repeat the 1997 diagnosis in its entirety but this provoked an important methodological effect in terms of the evaluation: the lack of control on the variables could have affected the groups studied during that period and this had no relation to the project's scope and or its capacity for intervention.

In essence, by not working directly with the actors involved in the project, there was the risk of evaluating the present situation independently of IPEC's intervention - and this was already being done through the secondary research and data collection. Besides, working independently would not have helped to establish a link between the project's results and the eventual changes observed. In light of this situation, the evaluation team opted to focus in the personal interviews upon individuals who had more directly experienced the project's effects and actions in order to try to construct some links with the general results observed based upon these individuals' experiences and observations.

In reference only to the evaluation of the business sector's perception - more than the representation of one sector - as a good way of seeing how the vision of an important part of society may be changing in dealing with the problem, it was decided to work with samples, according to convenience through the selection of interviewees by the research group.

- Children Assisted: By considering a universe of 170 assisted by the project and considering moreover that out of this total 52 dropped out of the programme, the methodology intended to interview 20 children: 12 from those who remained and 8 who abandoned the programme. Identification of the children depended on the existence in ASBEM of the minimum necessary information to locate them and their families who would also be part of the interview.
- Families: The families of these 20 children would also be interviewed by the evaluation team.

This set of questions would permit the evaluation team to draw up the profile of the children and their families. When compared with the results of the diagnosis made by UFRGS 1997, this profile would allow for verifying the project's main impacts on these families' condition and on individuals as well as its offshoots regarding the child labour issue.

- Business sector: the idea would be to interview 6 business people, 3 from each municipality and company size, that is: small, medium and large in order to identify their perception of the child labour exploitation problem; their work in dealing with the problem, if they had any information on business people or companies that exploit child labour and their impression as well as how their company sees companies' "social responsibility".
- Specialists involved in the project: Specialists from ASBEM and the Dois Irmãos Diocese who took part in the project would be interviewed in order to find out about their perception about the project, its successes and its difficulties as well as their assessment as to how the initiative brought about by the work in which they were involved served to give greater mainstreaming and relevance to the issue of child labour exploitation in the footwear-leather industry in the municipality and in the Region.

2.2 Carrying out the data collection

Carrying out the data collection according to the initial planning followed the work methodology below:

At a meeting on 6th October of this year, the evaluation team divided up the planning tasks for data collection in the following manner. One group would carry out the collection of secondary data and one group would collect the primary data. The data collection process started on 8th October and ended on 24th October. The work was divided into the following groups:

- i) Group 1, Eduardo Rocha - collection of secondary data;
- ii) Group 2, Mônica, Mariângela and Caroline - collection of primary data through interviews and questionnaires in the two municipalities; and,
- iii) Group, C. Jaira and Tamára, interviews with business people in the two municipalities.

Some difficulties in identifying and gaining access to possible interviewees and or to those who would have been preferred by the co-ordination as interviewees led to the replacement of some or even made unfeasible the collection of some opinions and ideas. What follows is the description of alterations made to the initial planning of the data collection.

- a) In relation to the source of secondary data and statistics produced by third parties, more information pertinent to the theme in order to supplement the data analysis was added to the initial list;
- b) In relation to the primary data source: institutional interviews with Organised Civilian Society, the Dois Irmãos Diocese, Commission Pastoral da Criança and Cáritas Diocesana due to their non participation in the programme's

implementation, working only as data collectors in the preparing of the Child Labour Diagnosis for Novo Hamburgo and Dois Irmãos – Research Report, developed by the UFRGS research team in March 1997; Municipal House of Counsellors for the Dois Irmãos Municipality, at which it was not possible to contact the counsellor responsible. In terms of the State interviews were not conducted with the Novo Hamburgo Council for Child and Teenage Rights due to lack of time to meet with the research group. The following were added to the list of interviewees: Forum for Child Labour Eradication and CEPAF. In relation to the children and families assisted, it was only possible to interview 8 children and 6 families due to the geographical mobility of the same in this region;

- c) For the other interviewees, outside of the cases referred to in items a & b above, there were no problems in conducting the interviews.

On 20th October there was a meeting with all the researchers in order to analyse research progress. On this occasion, doubts were cleared up as to access to places from which up to that day it had been difficult to obtain information. We agreed upon data collection strategies for children assisted since up to that date few had been interviewed.

On 26th & 27th October a new co-ordination meeting took place. This time, it involved the participation of all the researchers in the work in order to carry out an initial analysis of the data collected and in order to draw up the lines of argument of this present study as well as to identify information and gaps still existing in the elaboration of the final report. The first draft, giving an idea of the main part of the data collected was drawn up at this meeting.

On 1st. November, C. Jaíra and Tamára held a meeting to analyse the final interviews held with the business people and with civilian society participants. At this meeting, e-mails were sent to some business people and the Semear Foundation due to a previous request to contribute to the analysis of the report. On 5th November the final writing up of the document was started.

2.3 Data analysis and interpretation

In order to analyse the data collected three strategies were adopted: analysis of content, narrative analysis and frequency distribution. For the State public, the civilian society organisations, business sector and specialists, content analysis was used. This was based upon bibliographical references from Orlandi (1996) and Triviños (1987).

Use of content analysis strategy was done in the following manner: as soon as the interviews were conducted, the results for each question according to each public were grouped: State, civilian society organisations, business sector and specialists. The differences and similarities in all of the answers were compared in order to write up a summary of the questions. It was perceived in all the questions analysed that there was the predominance of homogeneity instead of a disparity in the answers.

At the same time, for the interviews conducted with the business sectors in the Region's two municipalities, narrative analysis was adopted Pahl (1997) in order to verify if there was any discrepancy in the data from the statements obtained. Thus, all

the interviews were obtained in typed form. With this information in hand, it was possible to state that the actors from the big companies, showed more homogeneity in their answers in comparison with those from the small and medium enterprises. For example, among the business people from the big companies there was a type of agreement, although informal, to not hire minors.

The third data collection strategy was with the children and their relatives. In this part there were more difficulties in obtaining information in contrast with the other publics. These difficulties are as follows:

- a) As was mentioned in other parts of this study, the children do not always come from families with mother and father. The great majority only live with their mother and belong to a very low economic and social class. This leads the mother to move from one region to another in search of better means of sustenance. Thus it became difficult to locate those assisted by the programme;
- b) Another difficulty encountered was the lack of precise records to locate families and children; and,
- c) Also the time allotted for the data collection must also be considered. If there had been more time, probably more children could have been contacted, but the time limit made it difficult to locate a greater number of informants.

Of those who participated, it was proven that the great majority of those assisted by the programme, see it as a positive fact in their lives. Some dropped out of the programme out of their own volition because they had no interest in continuing.

At the start of the interviews, it was noted that there was a defensive attitude to the questions. The answers were given in a way as to justify their own actions. After we talked with some people who worked on the project and they saw that its results were positive, the process became easier. They therefore introduced us to others and the tension was reduced.

It is important to point out that in some institutions it was noticed that some persons did not know about the research theme and directed in good faith to those who could help in some way to obtain information. In this sense, it was proven that there was interest in wanting to find out about the issue.

Easy access and even a certain enthusiasm were perceived in some people. We can refer to the case of the Núcleo Mundo da Criança representative who showed him/herself to be very willing in helping to find children to participate in the project.

Another case was with the AMENCAR representative who gave suggestions as to improving the questionnaires for future research. According to him/her, in future research we could elaborate questions that were more directed to the theme since he/she considered that the questions were very open and very subjective, thus giving them numerous interpretations.

Extremely different points of view on child labour were perceived among the groups studied. If on the one hand, some persons showed a complete lack of knowledge on the matter, even if the interviewee belonged to the government, others showed themselves to be pessimistic and indifferent to the problem, by stating that they did not know about the issue or thought that it was unsolvable. On the other hand, many interviewees showed a real commitment to the problem in some statements.

Another fact verified is that few interviewees are in touch with reality. The majority are elaborating projects but not applying them. They have little contact with the reflections of these projects in the community. They have a far-reaching vision that takes into account a worldwide socio-economic panorama in contrast with the region's. They are concerned with resources and partnerships.

Those who have greater contact with the population have their vision turned to the problems and difficulties that are closer to the same such as misery and drugs. The cultural factor in the Region is pointed out practically in all the statements. Although they have experienced many initiatives and actions since the IPEC Programme's work, many of the interviewees point out a lack of attention from the press and legislators regarding child labour. This is attributed as one of the causes for the problem's persistence.

With reference to government policies, programmes such as Family Citizen (State government project), PETI (federal government programme for child labour eradication) and the School Stipend (also a federal government initiative in order for children not to stop attending school).

In relation to programmes existing in the region, such as the CIP (Novo Hamburgo) and the GLOBAL Project (Dois Irmãos), the interviewees agree that they are valid projects. However, these projects do not meet the region's entire demand. Moreover, several interviewees put forward the need to develop new projects for minors between 14 and 16 years such as apprentices in companies, which can receive fiscal incentives from the government.

It must be taken into account that the interviewees directed their statements in a way as to clearing up that child labour does not only exist in the region's typical activity (footwear-leather industry) but also with greater frequency in informal business and on the street as for example with paper, glass, beer tins, cardboard collectors, fruit, flowers, sticker, ice-cream and other similar products vendors. Some point to a lack of IPEC's positioning as an uncontrolled defect.

Among the main difficulties faced by the research team in conducting interviews and applying the questionnaires proposed, the following can be identified:

- a) It was necessary to make many contacts in order to obtain data. This allowed for speculating as to unavailability or unwillingness to cooperate in the research on the part of the interviewees. Telephone calls, e-mails were sent various times without obtaining a satisfactory response. One fact that contributed to this difficulty was to the lack of more precise records regarding contacts or the invalidity of some records for contacts. This led in many of the institutions researched to the interviewers not having any preliminary indication on who should be approached;

- b) Another problem verified at the moment of the interviews was a defensive posture taken in relation to the interview questions and the questionnaires. Some institutions' representatives responded to the questions as in a way to justifying their own actions, this hampered the directioning of the interview for the aims proposed. These reactions probably are associated with the relevant political treatment that has been given to the child labour issue in the Vale dos Sinos Region. This makes "stakeholders" concerned about preserving their positions and their proposals for action;
- c) In the case of some of the business people too, it was difficult to do interviews with many given that they are always busy. A small group of Novo Hamburgo were resistant to the interview and alleged that they already support ASBEM and the Semear Foundation and so they did not see any motive in talking about the matter because it is already an old issue in the Region and that child labour does not exist in the footwear-leather industry; and,
- d) Some representatives of organisations interviewed, requested copies of the report in exchange for their contribution that they would be offering to the work by responding to the team's questions. This led to a compromise so that the report's preliminary version was sent to these persons or at least a summary.

- *The research and its relevance to our professional growth*

We, as teachers and researchers already know of the issue but even so this study opened up to us new horizons in relation to other research as well as actions that can be carried out in the Region as well as in other municipalities in the State. It is appropriate to remember that this problem can be graver in other states in the country and about which we still do not have knowledge.

For the other participants in the team who also had a notion of the problem at hand, their knowledge was broadened and this led them to generate new knowledge of the theme. Through the interviews, this knowledge was developed into yet another theme for new studies, especially for those who had their first contact with the research reality.

The procedures in collecting the primary and secondary data and the evaluation of the interviews, questionnaires and the results helped to sharpen our critical vision not only on child labour but also as to other social issues in the Region.

For the History students in the course this work was the first contact with the interview technique and so it helped them in learning about one of the most used techniques in the Course, that is, data from oral sources.

Undoubtedly this work served to consolidate knowledge acquired at university and to enrich our professional experience as future researchers. The perceptions and perspectives of the interviewees will serve to show the problem's dimension in the Vale dos Sinos.

2.4 Bibliographical References⁵³

ROCHE, Jean. *História do Rio Grande do Sul*. 4^a ed., (*History of Rio Grande do Sul*. 4th Ed.) Porto Alegre: Nova Dimensão, 1993.

_____. *Imigração Alemã. 1824-1974*. in. *Revista de Estudos Leopoldenses. (German Immigration. In. Journal of Leopoldian Studies)* São Leopoldo: UNISINOS, 1974. 1990.

DACANAL, José Hildebrando. *RS: Imigração e Colonização. (Immigration and Colonisation)* Porto Alegre Mercado Aberto, 1992.

FAUSTO, Boris. *História do Brasil. (History of Brazil)* São Paulo: EDUSP, 1995.

FLORES, Moacyr. *Dicionário de História do Brasil. (Dictionary of the History of Brazil)* Porto Alegre: EDIPUCRS, Coleção História 8, 1996, p. 393.

HUNSCHÉ, Carlos, *O ano de 1826 da Imigração e Colonização Alemã no Rio Grande do Sul. Porto Alegre. (The year 1826: Immigration and German Settlement in Rio Grande do Sul. Porto Alegre)* Porto Alegre: Metrópole, 1977.

ORLANDI, Eni Pulcinelli. *Discurso e Leitura. (Discourse and Reading)* São Paulo: Cortez, 1996.

PAHL, Ray. *Depois do sucesso: ansiedade e ansiedade. (After the success: anxiety and anxiety)* São Paulo: Fundação Editora da UNESP, 1997.

PESAVENTO, Sandra.. *História do Rio Grande do Sul..* Porto Alegre: Mercado Aberto, 5^a ed, (*History of Rio Grande do Sul* 5th Ed.)

ROCHE, Jean. *A Colonização Alemã no Rio Grande do Sul. (German Settlement in Rio Grande do Sul)* Porto Alegre: Globo, 1969.

TRIPODI, Tony. *Análise da pesquisa social*. 2^o ed. (*Analysis of social research*. 2nd Ed.) Rio de Janeiro: F. Alves, 1981.

TRIVIÑOS, Augusto Nibaldo Silva. *Introdução à pesquisa em ciências sociais. (Introduction to research in the social sciences)* São Paulo: Atlas, 1987.

2.5 Bibliography consulted in writing up the report

- Resenha Estatística 2001 Calçados (Footwear Industry Statistics Review). ABICALÇADOS. Novo Hamburgo: 2001.

⁵³ Translator's note: The translations of the titles in the Bibliographical Reference are merely intended facilitate the reader's understanding of this document).

- IBGE/Department of National Counts. FEE/Social Accounting Nucleus.
- Câmara de Vereadores da Cidade de Dois Irmãos City Council. Composição da Câmara de Vereadores da Cidade de Dois Irmãos (Municipal House of Representatives for the City of Dois Irmãos. Break down of the Municipal House of Representatives for the City of Dois Irmãos) Dois Irmãos, 2001.
- RAIS/Ministry of Labour; CECEX/MDIC and ABICALÇADOS
- Labour and Social Action Secretary. Map of Child and Teenage Labour Indicatives in the Rio Grande do Sul Region (updated in Setemember/2000)
- Novo Hamburgo and Dois Irmãos Municipal Councils
- Sites Consulted
www.abicalçados.com.br, on 7th Oct. 2001.
www.fee.tche.br, on 7th Oct. 2001.
www.ibge.gov.br, on 8th Oct. 2001.
www.fiergs.com.br, on 10th Oct. 2001.
www.inep.gov.br, on 10th Oct. 2001.
www.canaldocalcado.com.br, on 10th Oct. 2001.
www.novoamburgo.rs.gov.br, on 12th Oct. 2001.
www.doisirmaos.rs.gov.br on 12th Oct. 2001.

2.6 Evaluation Team Participants

- Co-ordination:

Paulo Henrique Lustosa, reading for his Master's in Social Service.

Prof. Casturina Jaira da Silva, Master's in Administration and reading for his doctorate in Applied Social Sciences.

Prof. Tamára Cecília Karawejczyk, Master's in Education and reading for her doctorate in Administration

- Support and Research Team

Eduardo Marques da Rocha, B.A. in History

Caroline Pereira Leal, under-graduate History student - UFRGS

Marisângela T. A. Martins, under-graduate History student - UFRGS

Mônica Karawejczyk, under-graduate History student – UFRGS

**Interview on child labour in the footwear-leather industry in Vale dos Sinos –
Novo Hamburgo and Dois Irmãos Municipalities.**

Dear respondent, this interview serves as a form of data collection regarding the assessment of the child labour eradication programme in Novo Hamburgo and Dois Irmãos, financed by the ILO. **Thank you!**

Interview with specialists

1. What was your involvement in the child labour eradication project supported by IPEC/ILO?
2. In your opinion, how does the local society consider child labour?
3. How do you think the business people see the problem?
4. Do you think that any thing has changed regarding child labour in the region?
5. What kind of significant changes have occurred in the region in recent years concerning child labour?
6. In your opinion, how many of these changes can be linked to the project developed by IPEC/ILO?

**Interview on child labour in the footwear-leather industry in Vale dos Sinos –
Novo Hamburgo and Dois Irmãos Municipalities.**

Dear respondent, this interview serves as a form of data collection regarding the assessment of the child labour eradication programme in Novo Hamburgo and Dois Irmãos, financed by the ILO. **Thank you!**

Interview with the business sector.

Work Place: _____

1. What has been the trend on the Footwear market in recent years?
2. How have these changes affected your company? Has this happened with other companies the same size as yours?
3. What proportion of your production is exported?
4. How much of your production is outsourced? How many workers do you employ? How many persons work in the workshops or at home?
5. In your opinion, has child labour dropped in the Region? If it has, is it the result of pressure from authorities or due to local action?
6. How do you think other companies face the problem, is there any agreement to not control the child labour workforce?
7. Do you think anything has changed regarding child labour in the region?
8. What kind of significant changes have occurred in the region in recent years concerning child labour?

**Interview on child labour in the footwear-leather industry in Vale dos Sinos –
Novo Hamburgo and Dois Irmãos Municipalities.**

Dear respondent, this interview serves as a form of data collection regarding the assessment of the child labour eradication programme in Novo Hamburgo and Dois Irmãos, financed by the ILO. **Thank you!**

Interviewee: () Institutional STATE

Name of the Institution he/she

represents: _____

1. In what way has your institution worked to fight against child labour in the region?
2. With respect to your Institution's work in the last 5 years, what has changed? How has it changed?
3. What have been the main difficulties that you have faced in the fight against child labour?
4. In the last 5 years what are the main results that can be pointed out by your institution with respect to child labour?
5. State in your opinion how government policies have dealt with the child labour issue in the footwear-leather industry in the Vale dos Sinos Region?
6. Do you know of programmes or actions that have been implemented to eradicate child labour in the Vale dos Sinos Region? If you do, talk a little about these programmes or actions.
7. Do you know the results of these programmes or actions? If you do, talk about them.
8. Do you know about the IPEC project (international programme for the eradication of supported by the International Labour Organisation) in partnership with ASBEM, which deals with child labour eradication in Novo Hamburgo and Dois Irmãos?

Interview on child labour in the footwear-leather industry in Vale dos Sinos – Novo Hamburgo and Dois Irmãos Municipalities.

Dear respondent, this interview serves as a form of data collection regarding the assessment of the child labour eradication programme in Novo Hamburgo and Dois Irmãos, financed by the ILO. **Thank you!**

Interviewee: () Institutional ORGANISED CIVILIAN SOCIETY – THIRD
SECTOR Name
Institution that it
represents: _____

1. What type of programmes or actions has your organisation carried out to eradicate child labour in the footwear-leather industry in the Vale dos Sinos Region?
2. What are the results of these programmes or actions to eradicate child labour in the footwear-leather industry in the Vale dos Sinos Region?
3. What are the difficulties faced by your organisation regarding programmes or actions for child labour eradication in the Vale dos Sinos Region?
4. Do you know about the IPEC project (International programme for the elimination of child labour supported by the International Labour Organisation) in partnership with ASBEM, which deals with child labour eradication in Novo Hamburgo and Dois Irmãos? Talk about it.

**Interview on child labour in the footwear-leather industry in Vale dos Sinos –
Novo Hamburgo and Dois Irmãos Municipalities.**

Dear respondent, this interview serves as a form of data collection regarding the assessment of the child labour eradication programme in Novo Hamburgo and Dois Irmãos, financed by the ILO. **Thank you!**

Questionnaire for children assisted () in the programme () abandoned the programme.

Motives:_____

Answer the following questions, marking with an x the option that best describes your situation

	Yes	No
After having participated in the project, did you still work in the Footwear Industry?		
Did you fail already at school?		
After you failed, did you repeat that grade?		
Do you like to go to school?		
Do your parents want you to work in the industry?		
Was the money you earned from working for your family?		
Do you think its good for your future to work from a child?		
Do you like to study?		
Is the money you earn from working only for you?		
Was the work place in the industry good or bad?		

Mark with an x the option that best describes your situation

11. The period in which you worked was: a) morning b) afternoon c) night
12. The work place was: a) clean b) dirty c)organised d) nice
- 13.The number of hours you worked was
- a) less than 4hours b) from 4 to 6 hours c) from 6 to 8 hours d) more than 8 hours
14. Did you start to work
- a) because you wanted to have your own money? b) to help out your parents?
- c) to pay for your studies? d) due to a family illness problem?
- d) because you had lots of free time? e) because you like to work in the industry?
- f) because your friends also work? g) due to some other reason?
- 15.Your parents think that it is good for a child to work

- | | |
|--|------------------------------------|
| a) to have his/her own money
family/home expenses | b) to help his/her parents with |
| c) to pay for his/her studies | e) due to a family illness problem |
| d) because he/she has lots of free time
industry | f) he/she likes to work in the |
| f) His/her friends also work | g) Another motive |

Reply:

16. How many times did you fail at school?.....
17. How many times did you repeat another grade at school?.....
18. How many hours a day did you work?.....
19. How many brothers/sisters do you have?.....
20. What don't you like at school?....
21. What do you do when you are not studying?....
22. How old are you?....

**Interview on child labour in the footwear-leather industry in Vale dos Sinos –
Novo Hamburgo and Dois Irmãos Municipalities.**

Dear respondent, this interview serves as a form of data collection regarding the assessment of the child labour eradication programme in Novo Hamburgo and Dois Irmãos, financed by the ILO. **Thank you!**

Questionnaire for the families () **Father** () **Mother** ()
Responsible _____

Reply

1. Father's age
2. Mother's age.....
3. Father's religion.....
4. Mother's religion.....
5. Age at which father started to work for his livelihood.....
6. Age at which mother started to work for her livelihood.....
7. What is the father's occupational activity today.....
8. What is the mother's occupational activity today.....
9. The number of people who live in the home to date

Mark with an x the option that best describes your situation.

10. Father's education

- | | | | |
|---|------------------------------|------------------------------|----------------------------|
| a) illiterate | b) literate | c) primary school incomplete | d) primary school complete |
| e) secondary school incomplete level incomplete | f) secondary school complete | g) tertiary level incomplete | h) tertiary level complete |

11. Do you think that it is good for the child to work because

- | | |
|---|--|
| a) he/she can have his own money? | b) he/she has to help his/her parents with household expenses? |
| c) he/she has to pay for his/her studies? | d) there is a family illness problem? |
| f) he/she has lots of free time? | g) he/she likes to work in the industry? |
| f) his/her colleagues also work? | h) of some other reason? |

12. Identify your family income:

- a) less than one minimum wage b) from 1 to 3 minimum wages c) from 3 to 5 minimum wages
- d) from 5 to 7 minimum wages e) from 7 to 10 minimum wages f) more than 10 minimum wages

13. The child(ren) got work through:

- a) their parents looking for a job b) indication from another child
- c) from the school he/she attends d) from the Church he/she attends
- e) the child him/herself who wanted to work f) from a relative

14. If it were possible for your child not to work, would you like this?

ANNEX II

RESEARCH WITH CHILDREN AND THEIR FAMILIES

8 children and adolescents from the Novo Hamburgo municipality were interviewed for this research. It was not possible to interview any children or adolescents in the Dois Irmãos municipality due to the impossibility to locate them or their families at the time of the project's implementation. According to the authorities responsible for this project, this difficulty is due to high rotativity in the labour force in the sector and in the very municipality⁵⁴. Out of the total number of interviewees, 3 are girls and 5 are boys. Table 1 gives the interviewees' distribution according to sex and age.

Table 1 – Distribution of children and adolescents interviewed

Table 1. Distribution of children and adolescents interviewed						
AGE	SEX					
	Masculine		Feminine		TOTAL	
	N.º	%	N.º	%	N.º	%
11			1		1	12.5
12	1				1	12.5
15	4		1		5	62.5
16			1		1	12.5
Total	5	62.5	3	37.5		

Source: data from questionnaires

The interviewees' family

Of the families interviewed only 6 agreed to answer the questionnaire. The others did not wish to participate. Of the six that participated, 4 were responsible for the child or adolescent and 2 were mothers. Table 2 shows parent distribution according to age group and according to the data collected, indicates the predominance of the 46 to 55 year age group in the distribution.

Table 2 – Distribution according to the parents' age group

Age	Profile	
	Father	Mother
Up to 35 years	-	1
From 36 to 45 years	1	1
From 46 to 55 years	4	3
Over 56 years	1	
TOTAL	6	5

Source: data from questionnaires

Table 3 gives the religion of the parents interviewed. It can be observed that on the whole, the families interviewed are Catholic

Table 3 – Religion of the parents interviewed

⁵⁴ This difficulty was heightened due to the fact that the entity responsible for directing the programme in the municipality was the Novo Hamburgo Diocese. However, during this period between the project's end and the assessment the Dois Irmãos was established and it was not possible to add information from neither one nor the other.

Religion	Father	Mother
Catholic	3	4
Evangelical	1	2
No religion	1	
TOTAL	5	6

Source: data from questionnaires

Regarding the schooling of those parents interviewed, 66% are illiterate and 33% did not complete Primary Education. This information indicates the difficulty faced by these children's and adolescents' parents in order to enter the world of work given the minimum pre-requisites for Complete Primary Education in order to qualify for any vacancy in any sector of economic activity.

Table 4 – schooling of parents of the children and adolescents interviewed

Level of education	Responsible	%
Illiterate	4	66
Primary level incomplete	2	33

Source: data from questionnaires

Table 5 presents the children's and adolescents' parents' current activity. It is observed that among the fathers, the activities carried out are in the housing construction area whilst for the mothers, their activities are related to the home, either as homemakers or as domestic workers.

Table 5 – Parents' current vocational activity

Profession	Father	Mother
Mason	2	
Painter	1	
Retired	2	
Maid		1
Home		4
TOTAL	5	5

Source: data from questionnaires

Table 6 shows the distribution of children and adolescents according to family income. 66% of the interviewees receive less than 1 monthly minimum wage for the family's sustenance.

Table 6 – Family income distribution

INCOME	Nº of children and adolescents	%
Less than 1 minimum wage	4	66
From 1 to 3 minimum wages	2	33
TOTAL	6	100

Source: data from questionnaires

Table 7 indicates the size of family from which the children and adolescents interviewed come. Out of the total sample, 66% of the interviewees live with five or six persons, showing that the size of these families is slightly above the average Brazilian family.

Table 7 - With how many persons the interviewee	Nº of children	%
--	----------------	---

lives Number of persons		
Three	1	17
Four	1	17
Five	2	33
Six	2	33
TOTAL	6	100

Source: data from questionnaires

We concluded that the profile for the families interviewed was: parents in the 46 to 55 age group, they are mainly Catholic, have activities linked to housing construction or domestic activities. The majority is illiterate and has a family income that is less than one minimum wage, which goes for 5 to 6 persons. In terms of these families' sustenance, it is observed that with the family income shown it is almost impossible to meet food, living, school, security and leisure obligations.

Work in these children's and adolescents' lives

Table 8 shows the age at which the children's and adolescents' parents started to work for their upkeep. It can be seen that the average age is between 10 and 14 years of age. This is why perhaps these children's parents do not think that child labour is wrong for their children.

Table 8 – Parents' age when they started working for their upkeep

Age	Father	Mother
Started at 8 years	1	
Started between 10 to 14 years	4	2
Started after 14 years		2
TOTAL	5	4

Source: data from questionnaires

Table 9 presents how the children and teenagers obtained employment in the Footwear Industry. There is a concentration of data related to the family, be it through the parents or through the child's own wanting to work.

Table 9 - How the children got work

Through whom	N.º	%
Through the parents	2	33.33
The child him/herself	2	33.33
They did not answer	2	33.33

Source: data from questionnaires

Out of the motives that led children and adolescents to work, it can be concluded that 87.5% of these motives are related to the families' economic situation.

Table 13 - Motives that lead children and teenagers to work

Motives	N.º	%
To have their own money	4	50
To help out their parents	3	37.5
Problems of illness in the family	1	12.5

Source: data from questionnaires

Table 14 shows parents' thinking on child labour. 50% of those interviewed do not see anything wrong with the child going to work, be it to have his/her own money or to help out at home.

Table 14 – What parents think about child labour

Motives	N.º	%
The child can have his/her own money	2	25
To help out the parents with household expenses	2	25
Other motives	4	50

Source: data from questionnaires

With respect to this item, that is, work in these children's and teenagers' lives, it was verified that their parents started to work at 10 to 14 years of age – they were still of child age. It is perhaps because of this that the parents when questioned on what they think about child labour could not conceive that it is not correct to put their children or teenagers to work before the legally permitted age.

The children and teenagers got their work through their parents or on their own. The main motives for working were economic in nature.

Work: conditions and workday

According to the UFRGS child labour diagnosis, prior to the IPEC/ILO project, work took up a major part in the lives of the children interviewed. Table 9 in the University's report provides an assessment of the children and teenagers who took part in this project.

It must be noted that although the majority of children and adolescents did not work in the Footwear Industry since the IPEC/ILO project, there is encouragement from the parents for them to work.

Table 15 – General Data on what is work for the children and teenagers

	Yes	No
After having participated in the project, did you still work in the Footwear Industry?	2	6
Did you fail already at school?	5	3
After you failed, did you repeat that grade?	5	
Do you like to go to school?	8	
Do your parents want you to work in the industry?	7	1
Was the money you earned from working for your family?	3	4
Do you think its good for your future to work from a child?	4	3
Do you like to study?	8	
Is the money you earn from working only for you?	2	4
	Good	Bad
Was the work place in the industry good or bad?	4	1

Source: data from questionnaires

Tables 16, 17 and 18 present data related to the work carried out by the child or teenager.

Table 16 – Children's and Teenagers' Workday

Daily Hours	N.º	%
Less than 4 hours	3	37.5
From 4 to 6 hours	2	25
More than 8 hours	3	37.5

Source: data from questionnaires

Table 17 presents the periods in which the interviewees worked. There is concentration in one period, in this case, the morning or in complete periods such as the morning and afternoon or afternoon or morning and night.

Table 17 – Children and Adolescents' Working Periods

Periods	N.º	%
Morning	3	37.5
Afternoon	1	12.5
Morning and Afternoon or Morning and Night	3	37.5
Morning, Afternoon and Night	1	12.5

Source: data from questionnaires

In terms of working conditions, 57.14% of the interviewees considered them to be clean.

Table 18 – Children's and Teenagers' Working Conditions

Conditions	N.º	%
Clean	4	57.14
Dirty	3	42.86

Source: data from questionnaires

In analysing table 15, 16, 17 and 18, it becomes evident that the majority of children who participated in the IPEC/ILO project did not return to work in the Footwear Industry. However when they were questioned about their parents' opinion on this, the majority stated that their parents would like their children to return to work, mainly because of financial reasons.

School Table 19 – What does he/she not like at school?

What does he/she not like?	N.º	%
Teacher	1	12.5
A subject	1	12.5
Class mates	1	12.5
Did not answer	5	62.5

Source: data from questionnaires

In relation to schooling, it is evident through table 15 that the majority of interviewees have already failed at school. Nevertheless all the interviewees (100%) like to go to school and to study.

Recreation

Recreation is still not of major importance for the interviewees since the majority, 62.5% do some type of work, be it in an organisation or domestic labour.

Table 20 – What does the child do when he/she is not studying?

What he/she does?	N.º	%
Works	3	37.5
Stays in the street	1	12.5
Helps at home	2	25
Did not answer	2	25

Source: data from questionnaires

The 37.5% that work are 15 years of age. They did not identify their place of work.

ANNEX III

PREVALENCE OF CHILD LABOUR ACCORDING TO WORK LOCALE AND TYPE OF WORKSHOP IN NOVO HAMBURGO AND DOIS IRMÃOS MUNICIPALITIES IN 1997.

The 1997 study realised by the Federal University of Rio Grande do Sul which focuses on an analysis of children's working conditions in the footwear-leather sector according to work place provides the following information:

- a) In the Dois Irmãos municipality, for the 25 children studied, the distribution according to work place was:

LOCALE	NUMBER	%
Workshop	23	92
At home	01	4
Another Locale	01	4
TOTAL	25	100

- b) For the Novo Hamburgo municipality the classification was slightly different so the results obtained were:

LOCALE	NUMBER	%
Company	04	5.1
Workshop	13	16.6
At home	12	15.3
Others' home	45	57.6
Factory School	02	2.5
Small Factory	02	2.5
TOTAL	78	100

A better understanding of the issue, fundamental for an analysis as to how the problem has evolved, requires the organisation of information based upon the adoption of a single categorisation for both municipalities and which can be reproduced given the arguments and observations noted at present.

By using the typology proposed by UFRGS itself, the structuring of a relational table can be proposed in order to articulate the denominations given by the interviewees and the categorisation put forward by the University's specialists. It must be pointed out that this relation is based upon the interpretation given by the researchers and the informal use of these classifications in these localities' day-to-day. However, they do lack better reliability and it would be necessary to return to the interviewees in order to better qualify their answers but at this present moment this is no longer possible.

Type of Workshop	Profile of Activities	Interviewee's answer
Home	Manual Operations	At home.
Micro-enterprise	Mediation and supervision of sub-contracting.	Others' homes; small factory.
Small Enterprise	Carrying out of production processes	Enterprise; Workshop, Factory School.

By taking this new categorisation of the answers given by the interviewees as acceptable and by adding the distribution of children per work place in the two municipalities, the new table would appear as follows:

LOCAL	NUMBER	%
Home workshop	13	13
Micro-enterprise	47	46
Small Enterprise	42	41
TOTAL	102	100

ANNEX IV

PROJECT FOR THE CHILD'S ALL-ROUND DEVELOPMENT DOIS IRMÃOS – RS

The Project for the Child's Overall Development is a joint initiative by the Dois Irmãos Municipal Council, Dois Irmãos Footwear Industry Union and the Industries' Social Service (SESI), implemented in 1997 as an attempt to consolidate initiatives in the municipality supported by IPEC.

As is explicit in the project's document, the initiative arises out of the awareness that "there was a great group of footwear industries that employed infant and juvenile labour", a problem that shown by the UFRGS research. Once "it was proven that there were teenagers in our municipality working in the industries, ASBEM signed in 1996 a convention with the ILO" so that initiatives could be developed geared towards dealing with the problem.

The Municipal Council's document also stresses that given the "great demand from other children and adolescents working early, others walking in the streets, others simply playing in the streets, others even staying at home alone in villages or districts while their parents were working", the need was felt to develop broader action that would involve the entire community and allow for the eradication of the problem in Dois Irmãos.

The document presents GLOBAL as the successor to initiatives by ASBEM and the ILO in the municipality as it has assumed responsibility for 60 (sixty) children who were still in the IPEC programme as well as of the infrastructure and mechanisms being used.

Already in 1998 when there was the ex-post evaluation of IPEC's programme, the GLOBAL project was already consolidated as a municipal government policy having extended its capacity to assist approximately 80 of the 150 that had been assisted by IPEC, its target being to reach 300.

In terms of activities offered, GLOBAL offered cultural, sporting, education initiatives as well as psycho-social support to children and families. It broadened the scope of its originally implemented programme, thus guaranteeing better assistance to children, teenagers and their relatives.

GLOBAL continues to be a Dois Irmãos Municipal Council initiative. This has been influenced by the electoral process because there has been a certain political continuity in the municipality. Nevertheless, as the interviewees mentioned, the beneficiaries from the programme come less and less from the Footwear Industry.

ANNEX V

CHILD LABOUR ERADICATION PROGRAMME IN NOVO HAMBURGO

The child labour eradication program proposed by Novo Hamburgo's Council aims to "deal with, in partnership with actors from the municipal government and civilian society, the worst forms of child labour in the city". In light of this, it seeks to assist 150 (one hundred and fifty) children as its total assistance capacity. The programme has the following specific objectives:

- a) To obtain a commitment from the various social groups regarding the all-round development of children and adolescents by dealing with factors that lead to early work;
- b) To make children's access to, continuation and success in schools possible through the granting of a supplemental income (The Child-Citizen's Stipend – Bolsa Criança Cidadã) to families with children between 7 to 14 years who go to school;
- c) To provide support and guidance to families benefiting from the offer of social educational activities;
- d) To foster and encourage the expansion of the child's world of knowledge through cultural, sporting and leisure activities during the additional period to the regular school day (Extended School Day/ASEMA Nucleus);
- e) To encourage changes in habits and attitudes with a view to improving families' quality of life in close relation with school and the community
- f) To establish partnerships with public agents that guarantee actions of an intersectoral nature especially regarding the offer of income and work generating programmes and projects such as professional training and qualification for teenagers and adults; and,
- g) To articulate the creation of a Municipal Commission for the Eradication of Child Labour.

The Association for the Child and Teenager's Well-Being (ASBEM -) serves as an indirect executor entity for the programme and is responsible for distributing PETI's resources and accounting for the same's allotment. It is also responsible for receiving at its Centre for Professional Initiation former beneficiaries of the programme.

Among the other institutions and entities that feature as partners in the initiative proposed by the Municipal Council are the following: Literacy Movement for Young People and Adults; the Municipal Secretary for Education and Sport; the Children's Crèche; Women's Support Group; Industries' Social Service (SESI); Municipal Employment Agency; Regional Development, Work and Income Centre; Regional Labour Sub-division; and the Guardianship Council.

ANNEX VI
SOCIAL INDICATORS AND REFERENCE TABLES FOR THE ANALYSES REALISED

**RESIDENT POPULATION AND THE 7 TO 14 YEAR OLD POPULATION IN Novo Hamburgo
AND DOIS IRMÃOS – 1991 - 2000**

Year	Novo Hamburgo	Dois Irmãos
1991	205668	18951
1994	229937	17245
1996	226070	17997
2000	236200	22415

Source: IBGE (Instituto Brasileiro de Geografia e Estatística – Brazilian Institute for Geography and Statistics) (census 1991-2000)

Average nominal earnings (RNM -) of the household head, per region during 1991/2000.

Municipalities (Vale dos Sinos)	RNM 1991	RNM 2000	Projections for the Period
Dois Irmãos	145	Not available	Not available
Novo Hamburgo	511	Not available	Not available

Source: IBGE Census (Census 1991)

**Distribution of students registered according to initial level in the Vale dos Sinos Region, Municipal
and State Network (1997-2001)**

Municipal	Network	Elementary Education	Middle School
Dois Irmãos	State	1.561	709
	Municipal	1.688	0
	Private	279	0
	Total	3.528	709
Novo Hamburgo	State	15010	4918
	Municipal	19535	0
	Private	4771	5576
	Total	39316	10494

Source: School Census 1999, INEP (Instituto de Estudos e Pesquisas Educacionais – National Institute for Educational Studies and Research).

Municipality	Network	Elementary Education	Elementary Education 1 st to 4th Grade	Elementary Education 5 th to 6th Grade
Dois Irmãos	State	1377	488	889
	Municipal	1778	1066	712
	Private	264	140	124
	Total	3419	1694	1725
Novo Hamburgo	State	14385	2220	12165
	Municipal	19091	16352	2739
	Private	4581	1524	3057
	Total	38057	20096	17961

Source: School Census 2000, INEP

Municipality	Network	Elementary Education	Elementary Education 1st to 4th Grade	Elementary Education 5 th to 8th Grade
Dois Irmãos	State	1372	492	880
	Municipal	2002	1.166	836
	Private	245	116	129
	Total	3619	1.774	1845
Novo Hamburgo	State	15301	2.162	13139
	Municipal	19700	16.510	3190
	Private	4474	1.508	2966
	Total	39475	20.180	19295

Source: School Census 2001, INEP

Information corresponding to repetition and evasion rates in Elementary Education based on data from the State's Secretary of Education (1997-1999)

1997 Municipality	Network	Elementary Education 1 st to 4 th Grade (Failures)	Elementary Education 5 th to 8 th Grade (Failures)	Elementary Education 1 st to 4th Grade (Drop outs)	Elementary Education Failures (Drop outs)
Dois Irmãos	State	11,3	25.2	0.7	9.8
	Municipal	12.6	17.1	1.1	6.3
	Private	12.1	22.3	0.0	0.0
	Total	11.3	20.9	0.8	7.8
Novo Hamburgo	State	14.2	19.5	3.6	9.1
	Municipal	10.9	8.1	1.6	4.5
	Private	1.4	3.8	0.2	0.0
	Total	10.5	14.5	1.8	6.5

Source: State (RS) Secretary of Education - Census 1998

1998 Municipality	Network	Elementary Education 1st to 4 th Grade (Failures)	Elementary Education 5 th to 8 th Grade (Failures)	Elementary Education 1st to 4 th Grade (Drop outs)	Elementary Education 5 th to 8 th Grade (Drop outs)
Dois Irmãos	State	12,7	17	0.7	9.8
	Municipal	13.2	13.4	1.1	6.3
	Private	2.9	4.5	0.0	0.0
	Total	12	14.8	0.8	7.8
Novo Hamburgo	State	12.7	17	2.8	8.2
	Municipal	13.2	13.4	2.5	5.8
	Private	2.9	4.5	0.7	0.4
	Total	12	14.8	2.5	6.8

Source: State (RS) Secretary of Education - Census 1999

1999 Municipality	Network	Elementary Education 1st to 4 th Grade (Failures)	Elementary Education 5 th to 8 th Grade (Failures)	Elementary Education 1st to 4 th Grade (Drop outs)	Elementary Education 5 th to 8 th Grade (Drop outs)
Dois Irmãos	State	13.6	19.4	2.6	8.1
	Municipal	12.2	15.1	2.5	6.2
	Private	2.8	4.7	0.6	0.4
	Total	12	16.7	2.4	6.8
Novo Hamburgo	State	13.6	19.4	2.6	8.1
	Municipal	12.1	15.1	2.5	6.2
	Private	2.8	17.9	0.6	0.4
	Total	12	16.7	2.4	6.8

Source: State (RS) Secretary of Education - Census 2000

Pre-school Registration at the municipalities during the period 1999-2001

Municipality	Network	Pre-School
Dois Irmãos	State	90
	Municipal	278
	Private	63
	Total	431
Novo Hamburgo	State	354
	Municipal	4723
	Private	665
	Total	5742

Source: School Census 1999, INEP

Municipality	Network	Pre-School
	State	111

Dois Irmãos	Municipal	308
	Private	47
	Total	466
Novo Hamburgo	State	328
	Municipal	5045
	Private	599
	Total	5972

Source: School Census 2000, INEP

Municipality	Network	Crèche	Pre-School
Dois Irmãos	State	0	111
	Municipal	0	332
	Private	377	365
	Total	377	808
Novo Hamburgo	State	0	316
	Municipal	628	4.876
	Private	223	695
	Total	851	5887

Source: School Census 2001, INEP

Information on the Vale dos Sinus Region's GDP, based upon studies/reference on studies published in the State and Region for the Period 1991 to 2000.

Municipalities (Vale dos Sinos)	1996		1997		1998	
	GDP	GDP per capita	GDP	GDP per capita	GDP	GDP per capita
Dois Irmãos	239142028	13288	284136367.41	14988	261004639.42	13457
Novo Hamburgo	1751794304	7749	1948442114.26	1395	1877453950.62	7982

Source: FEE, Social Accounting Nucleus

Establishment Distribution and the number of employees in the footwear-leather industry 2000.

Establishments	Municipality	Nº. of Employees	Market
Alefi Calçados Artefatos de Couro Ltda (Alefi Footwear and Leather Goods)	Porto Alegre	43	North and South America
Almiro Grings e Cia Ltda (Almiro Grings and Company Ltd.)	Igrejinha	3500	Central America
Antonielle Calçados Ltda (Antonielle Footwear Ltd.)	Novo Hamburgo	185	South America and Europe
Bison Indústria de Calçados Ltda (Bison Footwear Industry Ltd.)	Novo Hamburgo	3000	Central America
Calçados Azaléia SA (Azaléia Footwear SA)	Parobé	16000	All Continents
Calçados Barschibba (Barschibba Footwear)	Rolante	190	North and South American and Europe
Calçados Bebecê (Bebecê Footwear)	Três Coroas	283	North and South America
Calçados Beira Rio SA (Beira Footwear Rio SA)	Novo Hamburgo	4800	South and Central America and Europe
Calçados Bibi Ltda (Bibi Footwear Ltd.)	Parobé	906 direct and 400 indirect	North America, Europe and Asia
Calçados Bortolossi Ltda (Bortolossi Footwear Ltd.)	Farroupilha	102	Central America and Europe
Calçados Botero Ltda (Botero Footwear Ltd.)	Parobé	750	North and South America
Calçados D Rose Ltda (D Rose Footwear Ltd.)	Igrejinha	70	
Calçados Dandara Ltda (Dandara Footwear Ltd.)	Nova Hartz	80	North and South America and Europe
Calçados Dilly Ltda (Dilly Footwear Ltd.)	Novo Hamburgo	300	North and South America and Europe
Calçados Ditaly Ltda (Ditaly Footwear Ltd.)	Taquara	76	South and Central America and Europe
Calçados Elience (Elience Footwear)	Nova Hartz	290	North America and Europe
Calçados Furlanetto (Furlanetto Footwear)	Três Coroas	200	South and Central America
Calçados Kaschelli (Kaschelli Footwear)	Rolante	960	North America and Europe
Calçados Krause (Krause Footwear)	Igrejinha	13	South America

Calçados Maide Ltda (Maide Footwear Ltd.)	Dois Irmãos	2414	North America and Europe
Calçados Marte Ltda (Marte Footwear Ltd.)	Nova Hartz	1800	North and South America, Europe and Oceania
Calçados Miúcha Ltda (Miúcha Footwear Ltd.)	Três Coroas	245	Central America, Europe, Asia and Africa
Calçados Mirabel (Mirabel Footwear)	Sapiranga	780	North and South America and Europe
Calçados Nianso Ltda (Nianso Footwear Ltd.)	Sapiranga	229	North and South America, Asia and Oceania
Indústria de calçados Blip Ltda (Blip Footwear Industry Ltd.)	Teutônia	1800	North America and Europe
Indústria de Calçados Bokalino (Bokalino Footwear Industry)	Farroupilha	185	South America
Indústria de Calçados Carnella Ltda (Carnella Footwear Industry Ltd.)	Novo Hamburgo	300	North America
Indústria de Calçados Dian Pátris Ltd (Dian Pátris Footwear Industries Ltd.)	Igrejinha	17	North America and Europe
Indústria de Calçados e Artefatos Cariri Ltda (Cariri Footwear Industry and Artifacts Ltd.)	Estância Velha	750	North America and Europe
Indústria de Calçados Vanessa Ltda (Vanessa Footwear Industry Ltd.)	Sapiranga	120	Central American and Europe
Indústria de Calçados Wirth CIA Ltda Footwear (Wirth Footwear Industry Comp. Ltd.)	Dois Irmãos	1.400	North and South America and Europe
Indústria e Comércio de Calçados Malu Ltda (Malu Footwear Industry and Trade Ltd.)	Lindolfo Collor	580	North America and Europe
Kilance artigos em Couro & Sintéticos Ltda (Kilance – genuine and synthetic leather goods Ltd.)	Veranópolis	—	South America
Luigi Calçados (Luigi Footwear)	São Leopoldo	130	South and Central America
Maruá Calçados Ltda (Maruá Footwear Ltd.)	Sapiranga	348	North America
Musa Calçados Ltda (Musa Footwear Ltd.)	. Rolante	4500	South America, Europe, Middle East and Asia
Pacific Shoe Indústria e Comércio de Calçados Ltd (Pacific Shoe Industry and Commerce Ltd.)	Sapiranga	107	North America
Pâmela Calçados Ltda (Pamela Footwear Ltd.)	Farroupilha	18	South America
Plusporti Indústria de Calçados Ltda (Plusporti Footwear Industry Ltd.)	Novo Hamburgo	—	North and South America
Proper Calçados (Proper Footwear)	Caxias do Sul	121	South and Central America
Rojana Calçados Ltda (Rojana Footwear Ltd.)	Sapiranga	145	North America
RP Indústria de Calçados e Artefatos (RP Footwear and Artifacts Industry)	Novo Hamburgo	350	South America and Europe
Stebrás Calçados Ltda (Stebrás Footwear Ltd.)	Igrejinha	100	South America
Território Nacional Indústria e Comércio de Calçados Ltda (National Territory Footwear Industry and Commerce Ltd.)	São Leopoldo	200	South America

Verkaufers Indústria e Comércio e Representações Ltda (Verkaufers Industry and Trade and Representations Ltd.)	Sapiranga	150	North America and Europe
Viler Calçados (Viler Footwear)	Novo Hamburgo	100	American Continent, Europe and Oceania

Source: Abicalçados

Number of children and teenagers resident in the municipalities according to age group in the Dois Irmãos and Novo Hamburgo municipalities

Municipality	Age	Less than 1 year	1 year	2 years	3 years	4 years	5 years	6 years	7 years
	Sex								
Dois Irmãos	Masc.	143	161	174	129	139	173	180	163
	Fem	137	157	147	165	171	168	193	151
	Total	280	318	321	294	310	341	373	314
Novo Hamburgo	Masc.	2250	2207	2237	2176	2120	2243	2278	2304
	Fem	2197	2168	2107	2123	2080	2264	2178	2190
	Total	4447	4375	4344	4299	4200	4507	4456	4494

Source: IBGE

Municipality	Age	9 years	10 years	11 years	12 years	13 years	14 years	15 - 19 years	20-24 years	25-29 years
	Sex									
Dois Irmãos	Masc.	154	146	147	171	165	178	882	942	990
	Fem	148	184	154	150	160	166	826	865	863
	Total	302	330	301	321	325	344	1708	1807	1853
Novo Hamburgo	Masc.	2178	2274	2124	2167	2269	2360	10248	9553	10002
	Fem	2105	2130	2057	2153	2160	2328	1409	9752	10495
	Total	4183	4404	4181	4320	4429	4688	20657	19305	20497

Persons 10 years and over, employed during the week of the survey, according to monthly earnings for all types of work in Brazil and Rio Grande do Sul - 1992 and 1999

Monthly earnings category	Brazil (1)		Rio Grande do Sul	
	1992	1999	1992	1999
Up to 1/2 the minimum wage	8512813	4142475	339591	179889
More than half 1/2 up to 1 minimum wage	11605503	10264313	717637	537374
More than 1 to 2 minimum wages	14565439	15519933	1175857	1098002
More than 2 to 3 minimum wages	6689139	10950183	585472	791783
More than 3 to 5 minimum wages	6174858	8055321	507489	615598
More than 5 to 10 minimum wages	4425352	6965702	369598	546911
More than 10 to 20 minimum wages	1541902	3094227	134126	227575
More than 20 minimum wages	531202	1554090	52904	119729
No earnings 2)	10364194	10131650	1063994	912018
No declaration	985089	998325	42554	27222
TOTAL	65395491	71673219	4989222	5056101

Source: IBGE, PNAD, 1992 and 1999

ANNEX VII
LIST OF PARTICIPANTS IN THE IPEC/ASBEM PROGRAMME

DOIS IRMÃOS

Child's name, age in 1996 and address:

1. Adriana da Silva de Pontes	10	Valter Schimer – Portal da Serra
2. Adriano Trindade	12	Tocantins, 205
3. Alessandra Lauermam da Silva	09	Anita Garibaldi, 1735
4. Davi Isaías da Silva	10	Salvador, 597 – Picada 48
5. Dionatan Jesus da Silva	12	Rua 112 Loteamento Heisler
6. Eliseu de Oliveira	12	Piauí, 14
7. Jackson Sartori	09	Tancredo Neves, 14
8. José Josemar Bieleski	12	Bento Gonçalves, 40
9. Lucas Ariel Freitag	11	Anita Garibaldi, 1387
10. Luiz Sidineia Bueno Weiss	10	Tocantis, 712
11. Maikon Cristiano Diel	13	Minas Gerais, 216
12. Marcelo Santos Bizarro	10	Rolante, 136
13. Markyson Marques Royer	11	Salvador, 462 – Picada 48
14. Odirlei Luis Schaefer	12	Anita Garibaldi, 1819
15. Odirleia Lima da Rosa	10	Walter Backs, 600
16. Rafael Henrique Dietrich	10	Tiradentes, 261
17. Roberto Carlos Dias Peres	09	Schneck – Portal da Serra
18. Roni Pessi da Silva	09	Salvador, 162 – Picada 48
19. Rosemeri Elisio de Souza Pinto	12	Oto Engelman, 276
20. Silvana de Oliveira	10	Piauí, 14
21. Tiago Rambo	12	Santo Agostinho, 57
22. Thiago Vinicius Neitzke	10	Vitória, 207 – Picada 48
23. Tiago Zanunes	11	Pedro Alfredo Johan, n/no.
24. Valdair dos Santos	11	Salvador, 193 – Picada 48
25. Deyse Dayana dos Santos Oliveira	11	Anita Garibaldi, 401
26. Diane Carla Rauber	12	Anita Garibaldi, 314
27. Dionatan Karlinski Zahn	09	Navegantes, 502
28. Eliel da Rosa Rodrigus	09	Roraima, 222
29. Cláudio dos Santos	10	Alecrim, n/no.
30. Adriano Anschau	11	Walter Schneck, 483
31. Alesson Luiz Becker Rech	10	Anita Garibaldi, 1760
32. Alcyone Clayton Becker Rech	09	Anita Garibaldi, 1760
33. Carlos Alexandre da Silva	12	Walter Schneck, n/no.
34. Cristiano Luis Schenkel	10	Walter Schneck, 163
35. Daniel Staudt	11	Esteio, 734
36. Denise Anschau	10	Walter Schneck, 483
37. Leonir Carlos Bieleski	08	Bento Gonçalves, 40
38. Leandro Dahmer	09	Goiás, 447
39. Luis Fernando Locatelli	09	João Klauk R-151, 102 B
40. Odair José Pascoal	11	Rua dos Imigrantes, 85

41. Márcia Carine Diel	10	Minas Gerais, 216
42. Simone Amaral Farias	12	Tocantins, 180
43. Simone Finger	10	Porto Alegre, 641
44. Simone Meurer	11	Tobaldo Engelmann, 160
45. Suzana Heck da Silva	11	Inglaterra, 125
46. Adriano Hanzen	08	Tocantins, 1332
47. Daniel Fath	11	Vicente Pietro, 34
48. Cristiano Schneider	09	Porto Alegre, esq. 21 de Abril, 771

NOVO HAMBURGO THE CHILD'S WORLD NUCLEUS

Child's name, age in October 1997 and address:

1. Carine Aparecida Rodrigues dos Santos	11	Joaquim Gonçalves Ledo, 801 - Canudos
2. Darilene Gilsia Lessig	7	Ângelo Provenzano, 655 (back quarters)
3. Fabiane da Silva Dias	7	Ângelo Provenzano, 46 Canudos
4. Fernanda Daniele Salles	9	Ângelo Provenzano, 645
5. Josiane Fernandes Cabress	10	Presidente Costa e Silva, 785
6. Juciléia Chaves Louis	11	Gran Domingues, 591
7. Malane Francil moura de Freitas	08	Ângelo Provenzano, 755
8. Marilene da Rosa Bonifácio	09	Ângelo Provenzano, 346
9. Paula Cristiane da Silva dos Santos	07	Joaquim Gonçalves Ledo, 801 - Canudos
10. Renata Cláudia Fillmann	12	Ângelo Provenzano, 785
11. Sônia de Oliveira	12	Leopoldo Rodrigues, 42
12. Anderson Alves da Silva	11	Gran Rodrigues, 100
13. Cezar Rodolfo Nunes	08	Ângelo Provenzano, 407
14. Claudiomiro Martins	11	Helmut Heldt, 171
15. Cristiano Gomes da Rocha	12	Odon Cavalcante, 553
16. Cristiano Machado de Oliveira	07	Odon Cavalcante, 172
17. Cristiano Rodrigues Torques	13	Iran Domingos, 136
18. Dario Medeiros de Arruda	13	Ângelo Provenzano/ beco , 39
19. David Gustavo da Rosa	09	Bandeirantes, 808
20. Danter Gilson Lessig	13	Ângelo Provenzano, 655
21. Diogo Fabiano Salles	11	No address
22. Douglas Misael Monteiro	07	Ângelo Provenzano, 685
23. Evandro Gomes	09	Joaquim Gonçalves Ledo, 81
24. Everton Chaves Louis	08	Heron Domingos, 591
25. Ismael da Silva Sutell	11	Gran Domingos, n/no.
26. Jeisil Machado	13	Ângelo Provenzano, 764
27. Juliano da Silva Dias	13	No address
28. Julimar Anderson Freitas	09	Ângelo Provenzano, 755
29. Josué Faustino da Silva	11	São Leopoldo, 839
30. Leandro Toebe	11	Ângelo Provenzano, 750
31. Luiz Miguel E Martins	11	Pantera, 13
32. Maicon Cardoso	13	Pantera, 13
33. Maicon Rogério Weber	11	Ângelo Provenzano, 73
34. Marciel Cardoso	09	Pantera, 14
35. Marcos Ferreira Franco	13	Jumbo, n/no.

36. Marcelo Daniel Nascimento Silva	11	Presidente Costa e Silva, 785
37. Mauro César Machado	14	Presidente Costa e Silva, 785
38. Osvaldir Marcelo Geringer	13	Rua 2 quadra 2 nº 55
39. Roger Rodrigues de Moura	10	Ângelo Provenzano, n/no.
40. Silvio Gomes	13	Joaquim Gonçalves Ledo, 81

Annex VIII

Map of Child Labour Indicators

South Region

Rio Grande do Sul (updated in September/2000)

ECONOMIC ACTIVITY	MUNICIPALITIES	TASKS GENERALLY EXECUTED	WORKING CONDITIONS	MUNICIPALITIES SHOWING REDUCTIONS IN CHILD LABOUR INDICATORS
MASONRY WORK		Extraction, refining, cutting, polishing, and stone loading	Health, risks, sanitary conditions and inappropriate transport	Gravataí, Novo Hamburgo, Paraí, Parobé and Taquara (**)
APPLE CULTIVATION		Selection, pruning, harvesting, storage, transport and fruit conditioning	Agro-toxin manipulation, long work days, lack of EPI, bad food conditions, use of collective receptacles for portable water and a lack of awareness on CTPS	Bom Jesus, São José dos Ausentes, Esmeralda and Muitos Capões (**)
FUMIGATION	Santa Cruz do Sul, Vera Cruz, Passo do Sobrado, Vale do Sol, Sinimbu, Sobradinho and 270 other municipalities	Sewing, harvesting, drying preparation, classification and bailing.	Excessive work day, lack of EPI, bailing and classification activities carried out by children and women in closed sheds, use/handling of agro-toxins in the family economy	Camaquã, Candelária, Rio Pardo, São Lorenzo do Sul and Venâncio Aires (*)
ACACIA EXTRACTION		Tree cutting, debarking, piling hides and firewood. Helping with load transportation	Remuneration according to production, lack of EPI - Equipment for Individual Protection - (Equipamento para Proteção Individual), lack of registration with the State and Municipal Secretariats, NGOs and other typical actors, the implications of improved proposals for APEC'S procedures in the aforementioned entities' actions should be identified. CTPS and non-provision of portable water.	Montenegro, Triunfo, Butiá, Arroio dos Ratos, Taquari and Encruzilhada do Sul (**)
POTATO CULTIVATION	Bom Jesus and São José dos Ausentes.	Cleaning, cultivation, harvesting and transport excessively heavy bales.	Inadequate transport, use of cutting instruments, excessive work day, use of agro-toxins, a lack of EPI (Equipamento de Proteção Individual - no equipment for individual protection) and lack of registration with the CTPS (Official Work	

			Card).	
STREET WORK	Porto Alegre, Canoas, Caxias do Sul, Passo Fundo, Pelotas and other cities.	Sale of sweets, candy, flowers, juices, newspapers and paper collection.	Exposure to sun and rain. Risk of drugs and robberies.	

(*) There is an intensive awareness raising work being developed by the DRTE/RS, in conjunction with the Municipal Secretariats for Education and the Councils for the municipalities considered.

(**) There are no indicators of child labour in these activities, only of teenage labour.

ECONOMIC ACTIVITY	MUNICIPALITIES	TASKS GENERALLY EXECUTED	WORKING CONDITIONS	MUNICIPALITIES SHOWING INDICATORS OF REDUCTIONS IN CHILD LABOUR
SEMI-PRECIOUS STONE EXTRACTION		Semi-Precious stone extraction from underground mines, operation in the removal of minerals through manual instruments for extraction of geodes, breaking of geodes and minerals, transport of non-refined stones.	Work in partnership with the owner of the land where the mine is located. In some cases, it is a co-operative work system. Risk of electric shock.	Ametista do Sul, Planalto and Soledade (**)
FURNITURE INDUSTRY	Nova Prata, Nova Bassano and Veranópolis (**)	Painting, sandpapering and polishing.	Exposure to dust and noise. Unhealthy environment.	
ALUMINIUM (SHEETS) INDUSTRY	Nova Prata, Nova Bassano and Veranópolis (**)	Welding assistant	Exposure to noise and odors from chemical agents.	
FOOTWEAR INDUSTRY		Platting the leather, sticking the soles and heels with chemical products, painting, sandpapering, polishing pieces and product cooling.	Activity carried out in small workshops in some cases situated in the home itself. This is why there is no control of the workday, protection against health risks (exposure to chemical products), safety (exposure to cutting instruments) among other aspects.	Araricá, Campo Bom, Dois Irmãos, Estância Velha, Igrejinha, Novo Hamburgo, Rolante, Santo Antônio da Patrulha, Sapiranga, Taquara, Três Coroas, Ivoti and São Leopoldo. (*)
PRODUCTION ON SMALL PLANTATIONS - FAMILY ECONOMY SCALE	Bento Gonçalves, Caxias do Sul, Farroupilha, Ipê, Antônio Prado, Pelotas and other cities.	Cultivation of seasonal products (tomato, onion, horticulture and fruit farming, potatoes, grapes, garlic etc.)	Application of agro-toxins, not used by EPI.	

(*) Novo Hamburgo and Dois Irmãos in particular develop ILO/IPEC's work and this has already eliminated more than 1500 depots having child labour activities, replacing the same with schools and vocational training - CIPE which received a national award for its innovative work in public management.

(**) There is no indication of child labour in these activities, only teenage labour.

International Programme on the Elimination of Child Labour (IPEC)

IPEC's aim is the progressive elimination of child labour worldwide, emphasizing the eradication of its worst forms as rapidly as possible. It works to achieve this in several ways: through country-based programmes which promote policy reform and put in place concrete measures to eradicate child labour; and through international and national campaigns intended to change social attitudes and promote the ratification and effective implementation of ILO Conventions on child labour. Complementing these efforts are in-depth research, legal expertise, policy analysis and programme evaluation carried out in the field and at the regional and international levels.

Evaluation in IPEC

Evaluation in IPEC is seen as contributing to building the knowledge base through identifying good practices to be used in action against child labour. It demonstrates accountability through showing how IPEC and its partners constantly learn more about the most effective and relevant action. Evaluations in IPEC are done as evaluations of global programmes, including IPEC as a whole; as thematic evaluations for interventions across IPEC within a specific theme; as country programme evaluations for all interventions in a given country; and as project specific evaluations, including the components of a project implemented by an individual implementing partner through an action programme. Ex-post evaluations of specific projects and broader impact assessments provide further knowledge on sustainability and fundamental changes. A combination of evaluations by independent experts and IPEC staff members and partners are used to balance the need to provide external verification of achievement and lessons learned with the need to ensure that lessons from evaluations can be used immediately by other parts of IPEC and its partners.

Further information on IPEC evaluation can be found at <http://www.ilo.org/childlabour>

International Programme on the Elimination of Child Labour (IPEC)
International Labour Office (ILO)
CH-1211 Geneva 22
Switzerland

Tel: +41-22-799 81 81
Fax: +41-22-799 87 71
e-mail: ipec@ilo.org

ISBN 92-2-116665-1