



International Labour Organization

IPEC

International Programme on the Elimination of Child Labour

IPEC Evaluation

PREVENTION AND ELIMINATION OF CHILD LABOR IN SMALL-SCALE TRADITIONAL MINING IN COLOMBIA COL/01/P50/USA

A Mid Term Evaluation

Prepared by

An Independent Evaluation Team

February 2003

FINAL VERSION

TABLE OF CONTENTS

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY	III
INTRODUCTION.....	1
CHAPTER 1 : CONTEXT OF THE EVALUATION	2
1.1. BACKGROUND.....	2
1.2. THE TIMING OF THE EVALUATION.....	3
1.3. OBJECTIVES	3
1.4. SUMMARY OF THE NATIONAL PROJECT AND THE ACTION PROGRAMS	4
CHAPTER 2 : RESULTS OF THE EVALUATION.....	16
2.1. PROGRESS AT THE NATIONAL LEVEL	16
2.2. ACCOMPLISHMENTS BY MUNICIPALITY	22
CHAPTER 3 : CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS	40
ANNEX : EVALUATION METHODOLOGY	42
1. DESIGN OF INDICATORS	42
2. INFORMATION-GATHERING TECHNIQUES AND SOURCES	43
3. DESCRIPTION OF INFORMANTS.....	44
4. SHARING OF RESULTS, EXPANSION AND VERIFICATION OF INFORMATION AND ANALYSIS	45
APPENDIX: ADDITIONAL COMMENTS BY IPEC.....	46

TABLES

TABLE 1: BASIC PROBLEM AND NEEDS, BY MUNICIPALITY.....	7
TABLE 2: GOALS AND OBJECTIVES, BY MUNICIPALITY	8
TABLE 3: EXPECTED OUTPUTS, BY OBJECTIVE AND MUNICIPALITY	9
TABLE 4: INDICATORS OF ACHIEVEMENT AND TARGETS BY MUNICIPALITY	11
TABLE 5: CONCEPT OF AND PROPOSAL FOR SUSTAINABILITY, BY MUNICIPALITY	13
TABLE 6: BENEFICIARIES AND RECIPIENTS, BY MUNICIPALITY	14
TABLE 7: IMPLEMENTING AND PARTICIPATING AGENCIES, BY MUNICIPALITY	15
TABLE 8: DIMENSIONS, SUB-DIMENSIONS AND INDICATORS OF THE EVALUATION	42
TABLE 9: INFORMATION-GATHERING TECHNIQUES, BY INFORMATION SOURCE	43
TABLE 10: SOURCE OF INFORMATION, BY MUNICIPALITY	44

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

This section summarizes the results of the interim (mid-term) evaluation of the Project for Prevention and Elimination of Child Labor in Small-Scale Traditional mining in Colombia. It was prepared by consultants belonging to the *Centro Internacional de Educación y Desarrollo Humano-CINDE* at the request of the International Programme on the Elimination of Child Labour of the International Labour Organization (IPEC-ILO). The evaluation focuses on actions to encourage the withdrawal of children from work in small-scale traditional mining in the municipalities of Nemocón, Sogamoso, Muzo and Condoto. The selection of these municipalities was based on previous studies done in the country to establish the magnitude and characteristics of child labor in small-scale traditional mining of gold, emeralds and clay.

The evaluation analyzed both the national project and the action programs implemented in each municipality by non-governmental organizations, taking into consideration the following criteria: relevance, effectiveness, efficiency, sustainability and administration / management. Indicators were designed for each criterion. The evaluation, which could be defined as formative, obtained information “*in situ*” in each municipality through observation and interviews with key stakeholders of the action programs, including mayors, AP staff, public officials, families and children. Key stakeholders connected with the project at the national and sub-regional levels were also interviewed. These information-gathering strategies were complemented by a review of IPEC documents produced in Colombia.

The analysis of the information leads to the conclusion that the national project is relevant because it has raised the issue of the prevention and elimination of child labor in the small-scale traditional mining sector where children work under exploitative conditions. It is based on prior studies that documented critical points requiring immediate attention and includes appropriate strategies and lessons learned from other countries that underscore the importance of taking an integral approach to tackle the causes of the problem. Although child labor has been used in small-scale traditional mining in the country for many decades, only around 1995 did an intervention begin to address the problem in the coal-mining sector. With this project, as indicated, actions were expanded to small-scale mining of clay, emeralds and gold.

At the national level, the project has fulfilled its purpose, overcoming difficulties that have arisen during implementation. Despite limitations imposed by the political violence affecting some of the zones of intervention, the low levels of development in the municipalities and the lack of non-governmental organizations available to work on the issue in certain zones, the action programs generally began without major delays. At the municipal level, progress has focused on the identification and coordination with the various institutions involved in the issue, to gain their commitment to carrying out the action programs. Interviews with officials demonstrated that they have knowledge of the activities and awareness on the issue. In addition, the mayors, the highest municipal authorities, have committed themselves to the program. In Nemocón and Sogamoso, especially, significant progress has been made in including the issue in the municipal development plans.

The accomplishments in the municipalities vary according to the areas. In Nemocón, the program has substantial visibility in the educational area, although there have been problems in adapting the pedagogical proposal to the characteristics of the target population. In Sogamoso, a great deal of work has been done in addressing the change of cultural attitudes among parents, because these have been identified as factors that can have a negative impact on the program. In Muzo, great efforts have been made in inter-institutional coordination. In Condoto, despite political instability, significant progress has been made in the area of health.

The priority placed on inter-institutional coordination has enabled the project and action programs to gain efficiency (relationship between the progress made and the use of allocated resources). Addressing the

problem of child labor from each institution's perspective has allowed the action to be focused in an effective, integral way on the target population, leveraging actions and results and making the best use of the municipalities' limited resources. These synergies have increased the impact of the results.

With regard to sustainability, the transition towards a new administration in August 2002 and its decision to shut down MINERCOL has required the project coordination to take action to ensure the intervention's continuity. At the national level, arrangements were made to include the issue in the National Development Plan and in specific institutional agendas. A proposal was drawn up for inclusion in the Plan and presented to the relevant agencies, but the outcome of this process is still not certain. If it is not included, the project's sustainability will be affected. At the municipal level, taking into account the decentralization of public administration, arrangements have been made to include the issue in municipal development and sector-specific plans, with positive results. The fact that the mayors will remain in office until 2003 is also positive for continuity of the programs, ensuring that the agreements reached so far will be maintained.

With regard to project management, the national coordinating office has provided technical support, supervision and ongoing assistance for the programs, the implementing agencies and participating organizations. Periodic workshops have been held with action program coordinators designated by the municipalities and the NGOs to train them in strategies for institution building, awareness raising, income generation, etc. Arrangements have also been made with national and municipal institutions to gain their commitment to preventing and eliminating child labor in small-scale traditional mining. This has made possible to achieve the planned goals within the set timeframes, and contributed to learning lessons and reinforcing the administration, organization and management of key stakeholders at various levels. Project activities are being carried out as planned, as reflected periodically in the progress reports submitted to IPEC and the donor.

The main conclusions and recommendations of the evaluation are.

1. As it was planned and implemented, the project and the action programs correspond to national and regional needs in relation to child labor in small-scale traditional mining. The priority placed on education as a strategy for withdrawing children from work leads us to focus on the need for additional emphasis in the area of pedagogic and curriculum development and adaptation to the real situation of children working in mining.
2. Income generation requires maturity on the part of organized groups, which need support so they can learn from the experiences in the various municipalities.
3. Institution building is a priority. It is being emphasized, and this must continue in order to ensure the project's sustainability. This may be the project's greatest challenge. It is necessary to work with agencies at the local level, seeking their empowerment and encouraging their interest so that when the period of NGO leadership ends, they can continue on their own, implementing actions that lead to the withdrawal of children from work and the prevention of their entry into the work force.
4. The importance of attitude change has been suggested by preliminary studies and underscored by experiences in other countries in the sub-region. If it is not explicitly addressed, long-term results may be less important than expected. It is clear that cultural patterns cannot be changed in one year, but work must at least begin with direct beneficiaries and institutions committed to the project. It may also be important to achieve greater participation by program beneficiaries in forming groups in which they can contribute to the programs, strengthening their personal development and democratic decision-making skills.

INTRODUCTION

Under an agreement with the International Education and Human Development Center (*Centro Internacional de Educación y Desarrollo Humano-CINDE*), the International Programme on the Elimination of Child Labor (IPEC) carried out a interim (mid-term) evaluation of the project for the Prevention and Elimination of Child Labor in Small-Scale Traditional Mining in Colombia. This project falls within the framework of the National Action Plan for the Elimination of Child Labor that the Colombian government formulated for 2002 as a direct intervention action.¹ The purpose of this type of action is “to have a controlled effect on targeted groups of children occupied in the worst forms of child labor, to ensure their effective withdrawal and the full restitution of their rights through programs that ensure simultaneous and complementary action by different sectors.”²

According to follow-up reports on the plan, overall progress has been made in the formulation and implementation of projects and action programs aimed at preventing early entry into work and ensuring the withdrawal of minors working in prohibited occupations, such as domestic labor, street vending, informal labor, sexual exploitation and small-scale traditional mining. In the latter sector, IPEC and the National Mining Company (*Empresa Nacional Minera-MINERCOL*) formulated this project in 2001 to address the problem of children working in small-scale traditional mining of gold, emeralds, clay and coal. The intervention, which has a two-year timeframe, began in January 2002. It targets 5,200 children and 2,600 families in 10 municipalities in the departments of Boyacá, Caldas, Cundinamarca, Chocó and Nariño.

As an external entity, CINDE’s role has been to assess, together with project stakeholders, the project’s progress and potential, as well as its prospects for the future, so the intervention would be able to produce the desired effects.

In the joint MINERCOL-IPEC project, IPEC’s priority has been the intervention in small-scale traditional mining in the municipalities with the largest number of working children: Condoto (Chocó), Muzo (Boyacá), Nemocón (Cundinamarca) and Sogamoso (Boyacá). The areas of action were the following: 1) Strengthening the national capacity for fighting child labor in the sector through development of programs and the creation and strengthening of the necessary institutional structures; 2) Beginning the formalization of mining activity and the adoption of codes of conduct rejecting child labor; and 3) Development of demonstration projects to withdraw from work or prevent premature entry into work by 5,200 children, improving their quality of life and that of their families.

The following report is divided in three main chapters: chapter 1 describes the context of the evaluation, including its objectives and a summary of the progress of the project and the action programs; chapter 2 includes the results of the assessment at the national and municipal levels; finally, chapter 3 highlights the main conclusions and recommendations of the evaluation. The evaluation methodology and data gathering tools are included in an Annex.

The evaluation report includes also an appendix with additional information prepared by the IPEC team in Colombia, addressing two issues not sufficiently covered by the independent evaluation: 1) the activities and results in the area of institutional strengthening and capacity building; and 2) an analysis of the project’s reaction to the problems derived from MINERCOL’s lack of participation in the process as planned.

¹ The plan includes other areas of action, such as situation analysis, awareness raising and transformation of cultural patterns, development of public policy and institution building, legislative development and management of implementation of the plan.

² National Plan for the Elimination of Child Labor and the Protection of Working Youth, 2000-2002. Follow-up to the National Operating Plan-2001. Bogotá, December 2001.

CHAPTER 1: CONTEXT OF THE EVALUATION

1.1. BACKGROUND

Child labor in small-scale traditional mining is a worldwide practice that has become an issue in the country in the past decade. Because it is informal, it is often invisible, a fact that allows it to become rooted in daily life. This makes interventions complex, and the process of evaluating these interventions requires refined strategies in order to reach those affected.

“The illegal nature that tends to characterize child labor means that this work is done under conditions that are unfavorable and disadvantageous for the working minors: The work is concentrated in the informal sector of the economy, the children do not always receive wages, they put in long, hard work days that they must juggle with school attendance, and even statistics tend to make them ‘invisible’ by categorizing their work unremunerated aid to the family or by not considering domestic chores as work.”³

Child labor is a factor that limits a country’s social and economic development. It does not allow children to fully develop their abilities and skills, because they must split their time, at a disadvantage, between development activities appropriate to their age — education, health, recreation — and work. This jeopardizes their possibilities for growth and limits the country’s possibilities of developing its social, cultural and economic capital.

Eliminating child labor in small-scale traditional mining is neither an easy task nor a short-term goal. Because it is rooted in social practices that involve concepts of children, their development and their formation, because it is a traditional practice passed from generation to generation, and because it is learned informally through family socialization, change aimed at abolishing the practice implies slow processes of cultural transformation.

There has been progress in Colombian policy regarding elimination of child labor, reflected in the formulation of two national plans addressing the problem, which covered the periods from 1995 to 1999 and 2000 to 2002, as well as the Juvenile Code, which prohibits minors from engaging in underground mining tasks (Decree 2379 of 1989, Article 245); the ratification of the International Convention on the Rights of the Child, the approval of Convention 138 on the minimum age for entry into work; and the process under way for ratification of ILO Convention 182 on the elimination of the worst forms of child labor. Nevertheless, child labor still occurs. Mechanisms for follow-up, oversight and sanctions are needed to ensure compliance with these norms and make further progress toward the elimination of child labor.

Colombia has been making efforts since 1995 to address the problem of child labor in small-scale traditional mining. First through CARBOCOL and later with ECOCARBON, a project was implemented to withdraw approximately 1,000 children from work in small-scale traditional coal mining in the departments of Antioquia and Boyacá. Later, with this organization’s participation in the Inter-Institutional Committee for the Elimination of Child Labor and with technical support from the IPEC Program, the formulation of an Action Plan began with the goal of expanding actions to other small-scale traditional mining sectors in which children were working, including clay, gold and emeralds. As a result of this joint action, the Project for Prevention and Elimination of Child Labor in Small-Scale Traditional

³ MINERCOL, ILO/IPEC. *Children Working in Small-Scale Traditional Mining in Colombia. A Socio-Cultural, Economic and Legislative Survey*. Colombia, ILO, 1st edition, 2001, p.6 (159 pp.). This study provided information about: 1) the situation of children working in mining; 2) the beliefs, values and perceptions of adults and children regarding child labor; 3) contrasts between children working in mining and those not working in this area; and 4) characteristics of the households in which children performed mine labor.

Mining in Colombia was formulated. This is the program receiving a mid-term evaluation now, one year after it began.

1.2. THE TIMING OF THE EVALUATION

The mid-term evaluation is conceived as an evaluation of a program that has not yet concluded. Therefore, the program's formulation, operating plan or actions under way can be modified. It is characterized as an evaluation of processes proposed and implemented in the course of the program. It is an evaluation that can affect the implementation of the program, its organization and operations by detecting, in conjunction with the stakeholders, critical factors, weaknesses and strengths, and the best opportunities for and potential of the program's actions.

It is also referred to as a formative evaluation, because it implies learning from experience, from the implementation of the program itself. Based on these learnings, the necessary adjustments and corrections can be made to achieve the proposed goals. Thus it affects everyday program decisions.

It also places importance on an external view that allows an evaluation of the process based on the experience of a specialist in evaluations. This expert can compare the program with prior experience and knowledge and, through these comparisons, make relevant recommendations about the program being evaluated. Because it is external, it avoids preconceived notions or pre-formed judgments about the project that could bias the evaluation and its results.

1.3. OBJECTIVES

The general objective of the evaluation was to document, along with the stakeholders involved, the practices related to the first year of the project to eliminate child labor in small-scale traditional mining in Colombia, make recommendations based on lessons learned and implement corrective actions and adjustments to plans.

This general objective can be broken down into the following specific objectives:

1. Evaluate the relationship between the project's proposed actions and those planned and implemented by the institutions and organizations in each selected region.
2. Evaluate the appropriateness of the proposals formulated and implemented in each region, in relation to the characteristics of the various regions.
3. Evaluate the results of processes to date in light of those proposed by the project and the action programs in the regions.
4. Evaluate unanticipated achievements resulting from the implementation of the programs in each region.
5. Identify key aspects that the project and program must consider in order to increase the probability of success.

1.4. SUMMARY OF THE NATIONAL PROJECT AND THE ACTION PROGRAMS

1.4.1. SUMMARY OF THE NATIONAL PROJECT

This project falls within the framework of the Action Plan for the Elimination of Child Labor and Protection of Working Youths formulated by Colombia for 2000-2002. Its main objective is to contribute to the gradual elimination of child labor, with priority given to the worst forms, and the protection of working youths between ages 15 and 17 who are not involved in harmful and hazardous activities, by implementing programs that modify the causes for early entry into the work force, ensure integral and equitable protection for children, and guarantee the full restitution of their rights. The proposal involves coordination of actions based on shared responsibility at various levels among government agencies, organizations of workers and employers, non-governmental organizations, the children, their families and society as a whole.

To achieve this objective, the Plan established the following five action areas, which were implemented by member organizations of the National Committee on Elimination of Child Labor through the annual operating plans that they designed between 2000 and 2002: 1) A national sub-system of information on child labor; 2) Awareness raising and transformation of cultural patterns; 3) Development of public policies on education, health, family, children, recreation and use of free time; 4) Updating and development of national legislation on child labor; and 5) Direct intervention with defined groups of children working in the worst forms of child labor, through projects that ensure simultaneous, complementary actions by various sectors, taking into account components involving education, health and activities that provide an alternative to the school day.

The Project for Prevention and Elimination of Child Labor in Small-Scale Traditional Mining in Colombia falls within the National Plan. Its purpose is to contribute to the elimination and prevention of child labor in small-scale traditional mining of clay, emeralds, coal and gold in Colombia, drawing on learnings from other countries in the sub-region where parallel projects are under way (Ecuador, Peru and Bolivia).

To achieve the proposed objective and interconnect national and local actions, the project included in its strategy the following areas that are also part of the Plan: 1) Institution building and public policy development; 2) Awareness raising for cultural transformation; 3) Legalization of small-scale traditional mining and adoption of codes of conduct that prohibit child labor (formalization); and 4) Prevention and effective withdrawal of children from mine labor through the focusing and improvement of educational and health-care services, recreation and income-generation for adults.

The project's formulation was the result of joint efforts by the IPEC Program, at the sub-regional and national levels, and MINERCOL. The formation of a task force representing the parties ensured that the formulation responded to national requirements for addressing the problem of child labor in small-scale traditional mining as well as those established by the donor (the United States Department of Labor-USDOL) and the ILO/IPEC Program.

According to the project document, MINERCOL and IPEC applied to the National Royalties Fund and USDOL, respectively, for the financial resources needed to implement the project. It was determined that MINERCOL would have responsibility for the technical and financial implementation of the area related to formalization, as well as the awareness-raising component of the project.

After the resources were approved by the parties, MINERCOL had to reformulate the part of the project involving resources approved by the Royalties Fund, excluding the actions planned in those areas. In

response to these changes, the Action Programs formulated as part of the IPEC project were modified to include activities for addressing cultural factors by raising awareness and helping mining families generate income from alternative sources.

Before the project was formulated, studies were done in 10 municipalities to determine the magnitude and characteristics of child labor in small-scale traditional mining of gold, emeralds and clay. The results indicated a greater incidence of the problem in the municipalities of Condoto (Chocó), Muzo (Boyacá), Nemocón (Cundinamarca) and Sogamoso (Boyacá). The decision was made to focus the intervention on these areas of the country. The goal is to have a controlled influence on specific groups of children working in the mines to ensure their effective withdrawal from such work and the full restitution of their rights through simultaneous and complementary actions by various sectors.

To achieve this objective, priority is given to improving access to and quality of services related to education (formal education and professional training for youths between ages 14 and 18), health (agreements with the Ministry of Health, as well as prevention campaigns and brigades), recreation and culture, and income generation for adult members of the families after they make a commitment to withdraw their children from work done under prohibited conditions.

One basic mechanism established for implementing the actions and ensuring their sustainability was the coordination of efforts among all stakeholders: the National Mining Company of Colombia (MINERCOL), which is responsible for legal regulation and restructuring of mining activity in Colombia; the Ministry of Labor; the Coordinating Agency for NGOs in Colombia; local NGOs; and collaborating entities, including the Ministry of Health, Ministry of Education, Colombian Institute for Family Welfare (*Instituto Colombiano para Bienestar Familiar-ICBF*); and labor and business organizations.⁴

To achieve this inter-institutional coordination, the project has approached national and local entities that have responsibility in this area. According to information provided by the project coordinator, the Technical Committee is responsible at the national level. The direct intervention area is coordinated by the Committee's *ad hoc* group, which consists of eight institutions. For the mining project, it was also proposed that a subcommittee be formed that would include MINERCOL, the Technical Committee's technical secretariat (under the responsibility of the Ministry of Labor), IPEC and the UNDP. The idea was to specifically connect these agencies with the project's implementation, because they had direct responsibility for the issue. This subcommittee functioned at first, but stopped operating when MINERCOL returned the project to the Royalties Fund. At that point, the *ad hoc* groups took over the coordination.

For the direct intervention programs, an NGO was contracted in each municipality to coordinate the Action Program. Each NGO⁵ had to work with municipal and departmental agencies to promote the various planned activities. This strategy responded to the proposal established in the National Plan⁶ to promote "coordination as a management mechanism," seeking "to establish horizontal relationships among the institutions and entities having various levels of responsibility, increase their interaction and make their boundaries broader and more flexible." This strategy aims to establish cooperation among various implementing and collaborating agencies so that they can collaborate with the action programs in each municipality, each from the standpoint of its specific mission, orienting their activities toward the project's beneficiary population.

The project activities are planned to reach approximately 2,313 children and youths under age 18 in the target communities in the municipalities of Sogamoso, Nemocón, Muzo and Condoto. Of this total, 1,647

⁴ ILO. *International Program of Elimination of Child Labor (IPEC). Multilateral Technical Cooperation Program*. 50 pp.

⁵ The ACJ in Nemocón; Minuto de Dios in Sogamoso; Cooptrabajo in Muzo; and Corpasode in Condoto.

⁶ National Plan for the Elimination of Child Labor and Protection of Working Youth, 2000-2002.

will be withdrawn from mine labor, and safer working conditions and shorter work hours will be provided for 666 youths as a “first step” or transitional measure toward their complete withdrawal from work.⁷

1.4.2. SUMMARY OF THE ACTION PROGRAMS

The following tables summarize the action programs in the municipalities, taking into consideration the following categories: 1) Definition of local problems and identification of needs; 2) definition of goals and objectives; 3) expected outputs; 4) establishment of indicators, methods and mechanisms for follow-up and evaluation; 5) the concept of sustainability and actions planned for achieving it; 6) definition of beneficiaries; and 7) implementing NGOs and participating agencies.

⁷ Project for the Prevention and Elimination of Child Labor in Small-Scale Traditional Mining in Colombia, 2001-2003.

Definition of the local problem and needs assessment

TABLE 1: BASIC PROBLEM AND NEEDS, BY MUNICIPALITY

		ACTION PROGRAM			
		Nemocón⁸	Sogamoso⁹	Muzo¹⁰	Condoto¹¹
Key local problem		45% (165) of a total of 366 minors ¹² work in small-scale traditional mining, most receiving no remuneration or no more than 17% of the legal minimum wage. They combine studies with mine labor and household chores.	313 children work in coal and clay mining. 63.3% combine studies with work and household chores. High rate of school absenteeism, informal learning of job, cultural patterns favoring child labor, and lack of economic alternatives.	Economy based on small-scale, traditional, informal mining of emeralds, involving 456 children between ages 5 and 17.	Active entry at an early age by 546 children and youth into small-scale traditional mining, which represents great physical and psychological risk and denies them opportunities for a better life, because this illegal and dangerous work impedes appropriate socialization.
Needs detected		Change concepts of child labor; increase access to education; motivate children to stay in school; strengthen the nuclear family through economic alternatives and better communication and family cohesion; make the problem of child labor visible and create awareness of the violation of the fundamental rights of children and adolescents in the sense that this is an infraction of the law that deprives them of appropriate opportunities for socialization and jeopardizes their physical and emotional health.	Recognize the International Convention on the Rights of the Child and Law 12 of 1991, which ratified it; analyze the conditions of child labor, especially in coal mining; recognize the great risk posed by child labor in mining because of temperature fluctuations, pollutants, lack of oxygen and the possibility of landslides and roof falls.	Ensure full exercising of children's rights to education, health care, nutrition and recreation; improve education, decrease infant morbidity and malnutrition and promote mental health; break the cycle of poverty by increasing literacy; ensure compliance with legislation (Decree 2379) prohibiting child labor; recognize the negative effects of child labor.	Increase knowledge and ownership of the problem; raise families' awareness of the importance of education for providing alternative opportunities; raise the awareness of children, youths, adults, the community and institutions about the risks of mine labor; provide incentives for vocational training for children and youths, improving their school performance and decreasing dropout rates.

⁸ Information about the Action Program in the Municipality of Nemocón was taken from the following documents: 1) *Work Summary (Appendix II)*. Action Program No. P. 260.03.220.050. Agreement No. 2002-32552/2003-32009. Title of Action Program: Elimination and Prevention of Child Labor in Small-Scale Traditional Mining-Nemocón, Patio Bonito area. Starting date: 26-09-02. Timeframe: 12 months; 2) Action Program No. P.260.03.220.050. Agreement No. 2002-32552/2003-32009. Title of Action Program: Elimination and Prevention of Child Labor in Small-Scale Traditional Mining of Clay. Patio Bonito-Nemocón. Starting date: 26-09-02. Timeframe: 12 months; and 3) *Action Program: Elimination of Child Labor in Small-Scale Traditional Mining-Nemocón*. International Labor Organization (ILO), International Program of Elimination of Child Labor (IPEC).

⁹ Information about the Action Program was taken from the document, *Action Program for the Elimination and Prevention of Child Labor in the Municipality of Sogamoso*, obtained during the field work done in the municipality in November 2002.

¹⁰ Information about the Action Plan for Muzo was taken from the document, *Program of Elimination of Child Labor in Small-Scale Traditional Emerald Mining in Muzo-Boyacá*, and from the interview with the coordinator of Cooptrabajo, Alvaro Chaparro, in Muzo, November 28, 2002.

¹¹ Taken from the *Summary Outline* document. Action Program for the Prevention and Elimination of Child Labor in Small-Scale Traditional Gold Mining in the Municipality of Condoto. Locality: Condoto; urban area: neighborhoods of Santa Rita, Cascajero, El Salto and Platinero; districts: Opogodó and La Hilaria. Corpasode, ILO/IPEC.

¹² Child Labor in Small-Scale Traditional Clay Mining. Socio-cultural and economic survey of the Municipality of Nemocón. Bogotá. MINERCOL, ILO, IPEC, p.20.

Definition of goals and objectives

TABLE 2: GOALS AND OBJECTIVES, BY MUNICIPALITY

	ACTION PROGRAM			
	Nemocón	Sogamoso	Muzo	Condoto
Purpose or overall objective	Contribute to processes for the prevention and elimination of child labor for 285 children.	Contribute to the prevention and elimination of child labor in 273 families.	Contribute to the prevention and elimination of child labor for 476 children and youths between ages 5 and 17.	Contribute to the prevention and elimination of child labor in mining by improving living conditions for the children and their families.
Objectives/goals	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Foster inter-institutional coordination to form a Social Policy Council and develop public policies and effective solutions for the elimination of child labor. - Withdraw 80% of children from mine labor and provide them with social services. - Link 62 families that have working children or children at risk of entering the work force with alternative means of income generation. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Commit 273 families and 10 institutions to the elimination and prevention of child labor and raise their awareness about human development and children's rights. - Withdraw 433 children and adolescents between ages 5 and 17 from work or provide those over age 14 with responsibilities appropriate to their age. - Increase the income of 80 families committed to the elimination of child labor. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Raise awareness of 541 families and 8 institutions and gain their commitment to the prevention and elimination of child labor. - Withdraw 476 children from work, providing them with aid in education, health and recreation. - Provide training and microcredit assistance to 50 adult heads of households. - Provide technical-vocational training to 98 adult partners to allow them to diversify their families' income sources. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Raise awareness of 149 families, 6 communities and 15 local institutions. - Withdrawal from or prevention of early entry into work in small-scale traditional mining for 446 children and improvement of their living conditions by linking them to educational, recreation and cultural services, job training, literacy training (for 45 adults) and connecting their families with health services. - Training, education and technical support for 74 families to establish income-generating activities.

Expected outputs, by objective

TABLE 3: EXPECTED OUTPUTS, BY OBJECTIVE AND MUNICIPALITY

	ACTION PROGRAM			
	Nemocón	Sogamoso	Muzo	Condoto
Institution building	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - At least 8 government agencies and 5 NGOs include the issue of elimination of child labor in their policies, plans and programs. - Distribute information about Conventions 138 and 182 in the municipality and foster attitudes and behaviors that favor their application. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - 273 families view children as persons with rights and understand the negative effects of child labor. - At least 10 local institutions also develop such a view and commit themselves to working for the prevention and elimination of child labor. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - 85% of beneficiary families and 8 public agencies take a responsible view of children's rights, understand the negative effects of child labor, improve their emotional and family relationships and commit themselves to the prevention and elimination of child labor. - Formation of a functioning local committee for the prevention and elimination of child labor and formulation of an action plan. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - 90% of families improve emotional relationships with their children, based on an understanding of children's rights, and withdraw them from or prevent them from entering work in the mines. - Awareness raising for 80% of community and civic organizations about the importance of eliminating and preventing child labor in mining. - Inclusion of the issue in policies of government agencies and institutions.
Direct intervention	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Withdraw 285 children under age 14 from mine labor and provide them with access to social services (health, education, recreation and culture). - Provide vocational training for workers between ages 14 and 17 and help them enter the work force and gain access to social services. - Strengthen the families of children and youths who work or are at risk of entering the work force. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Enroll 36 children in school, with commitment to their withdrawal from work. - Provide technical-vocational training and guidance for 40 youths between ages 14 and 17, with commitment to their definite withdrawal from work - Involve 433 children and youths in youth club programs. - Carry out a campaign for a book and school supply bank. - Help 273 families gain access to legal aid and health and nutrition services. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Remedial courses or school enrollment for 476 children, with parents' commitment to withdraw them from work. - Technical-vocational training for 61 youths between ages 14 and 17, with commitment to their definite withdrawal from mining. - Participation by 476 children in recreational, sporting and cultural activities and events. - Participation by 90 adult heads of households and their partners in literacy project. - Connect 476 children and their parents to SISBEN and health-care services. - Participation by 100% of the children in nutrition program and improvement of dietary habits. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Strengthening of 10 schools and enrollment of child miners. - Technical-vocational training for 90% of youths between ages 14 and 17 committed to withdrawal from mine labor, and assistance in placing them in permissible jobs. - Enrollment of 100% of family members in the social security system for medical care and participation in preventive health campaigns. - Participation of 100% of direct beneficiaries in recreational, cultural and sporting activities.

ACTION PROGRAM				
	Nemocón	Sogamoso	Muzo	Condoto
Income generation	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Promote the participation of 30 families in production groups with access to microcredit. - Promote the participation of 40 families in job training appropriate to work opportunities in the region. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Incubation of at least 4 production activities, at least one of which is aimed at family consumption with marketing of excess, for 40 nuclear families, after they have committed to the definite withdrawal of their children from work. - Vocational training and guidance for 40 adult partners and improvement of their production skills once they have committed to withdrawing their children from work. - Allocation of 100% of microcredit resources to incubated production projects, with management by a local agency. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Formation of 5 business associations for 30 nuclear families committed to the elimination and prevention of child labor. - Vocational and technical training for 50 adult partners committed to the definite elimination of child labor and improvement of their production capacity. - Allocation of 100% of available resources, such as microcredit, to production projects, with supervision, evaluation and monitoring to ensure effective investment and operation of production activities, as well as follow-up for portfolio management and loan repayment. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Vocational training or formation or reinforcement of family businesses for 80% of families. These businesses produce for family consumption and marketing. - Organization and reinforcement of a revolving fund, under the supervision of a financial entity, with participation of representatives of family businesses.

Definition of indicators and mechanisms for follow-up and evaluation

TABLE 4: INDICATORS OF ACHIEVEMENT AND TARGETS BY MUNICIPALITY

	ACTION PROGRAM			
	Nemocón	Sogamoso	Muzo	Condoto
System of indicators	<p><u>Institution building:</u> Public initiatives to combat child labor (4); inclusion of the issue of elimination of child labor in local development plan and NGOs' action plans (5).</p>	<p><u>Institution building:</u> Institutions committed (10); families aware of and committed to elimination of child labor (273); children and youth with awareness raised, prevented from early entry into work force (310); inter-institutional coordination and commitment (1).</p>	<p><u>Institution building:</u> Families committed to withdrawing children from work (238); institutions with institutional plan for elimination of child labor (7).</p>	<p><u>Institution building:</u> Children and families participating in awareness-raising actions (466); organizations that include the issue in institutional or local plans (8); local functionaries participating in actions for elimination of child labor (40); signed agreements (4).</p>
System of indicators	<p><u>Direct intervention:</u> Children under age 14 withdrawn from work and benefiting from social protection systems: health, nutrition, recreation and culture (285); children under age 14 involved in formal education programs (24); children involved in non-formal education (60 children, 60 pre-teens and 40 teens); children who have learned to read and write and have progressed in basic math operations (142); youths between ages 14 and 17 with better working conditions (50); children participating in pre-vocational and vocational training (40); children participating in preventive actions (265); children and families with legal assistance (30); families with medical, dental, nutrition and legal aid services (315); families headed by women receiving these services (50); parents participating in groups: networks (80); families participating in Parents' Schools (60); persons participating in oversight groups.</p>	<p><u>Direct intervention:</u> Children withdrawn from or prevented from entering work (433); children between ages 5-13 enrolled in school (36); youths between ages 14-17 with vocational training (40); families with legal assistance (273); children and adolescents participating in groups for teens and pre-teens (433); clubs established (25); parents with literacy training (67); families assisted in obtaining access to social services, including subsidized health care and nutrition and hygiene programs (273).</p>	<p><u>Direct intervention:</u> Children participating in formal education programs (40); youths participating in vocational training programs (192); children enrolled in school (23); participants in creative, free-time programs (381); adults participating in literacy programs (94); children participating in health and nutrition programs (285).</p>	<p><u>Direct intervention:</u> Children withdrawn from mining and receiving educational services (466); children with non-formal education (233); children with educational cycle complete (39); Institutional Educational Projects adapted to and including issues related to elimination of child labor (10); Parents' Schools (10); teachers trained in the issue (130); youths with vocational training (170); adults with literacy training (45); youths in protected jobs, according to their vocational training (50); families and children with medical, nutrition, eye care and dental services, parasite treatment and vaccinations (149); children participating in recreational, sports and cultural activities (466); children prevented from entering work force (266).</p>
System of indicators	<p><u>Income generation:</u> Families benefiting from microcredit/income-generating activities (40); parents and adolescents with specific training for finding job or increasing family income (30); credit groups formed (5).</p>	<p><u>Income generation:</u> Adults involved in business-incubation program and benefiting from loans (40); Adults with professional training and guidance (40); incubated businesses (4); microcredit loans (US\$7,000).</p>	<p><u>Income generation:</u> Adult heads of households participating in income diversification programs (45).</p>	<p><u>Income generation:</u> Families trained in production activities (74); family businesses established and operating (34); family businesses benefiting from loans (34).</p>

ACTION PROGRAM				
	Nemocón	Sogamoso	Muzo	Condoto
Means of verification	Minutes, plans, social work reports, receipts, bulletins, participant and attendance lists, health secretariat records, time cards, supporting material, evaluation forms, photographic records, planning of activities, copies of guidance forms, family testimony, written commitments, operating businesses, people employed.	Action plans, minutes, letters of commitment, attendance records, follow-up forms, enrollment certificates, records (of services received, enrollment, etc.), activity plans adopted, certification, bank and purchase receipts.		Records (of participants, attendance, activities, care), letters of commitment, plans, minutes, signed agreements, certificates, documents, work contracts, monitoring system, surveys, home visits, loan approval forms, financial reports.
Follow-up and verification mechanisms	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Technical committee for planning, monitoring and evaluation (to meet at least once a month). - ACJ work plan and presentation of quarterly technical and financial progress reports and final report. - Weekly meeting of technical team for follow-up of activities. - Monthly meeting of technical team to determine overall progress toward goals, based on monitoring instruments. - Self-evaluation at end of program, including such areas as: accomplishments and difficulties, principal learnings, life stories and testimony of people and institutions involved, annual financial situation. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Technical committee for planning, monitoring and evaluation, to meet once a month. - Preparation of work plan by CMD and presentation of quarterly technical and financial progress reports and final report. - Monthly meeting of CMD project directors for follow-up or progress. - Self-evaluation at end of program. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Timeline of activities - Periodic field visits. - Bimonthly meetings and interviews to measure impact of results achieved. - Monthly meetings for evaluation of action program. - Quarterly meetings of inter-institutional committee for program evaluation. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Technical committee for planning, monitoring and evaluation of program implementation, to meet at least once a month - Corposode action program and presentation of quarterly technical and financial progress reports and final report. - Weekly meeting of technical team for follow-up of activities. - Self-evaluation at end of program to evaluate such areas as: accomplishments and difficulties, principal learnings, life stories and testimony of people and institutions involved, annual financial situation.

Design of program sustainability and continuity

TABLE 5: CONCEPT OF AND PROPOSAL FOR SUSTAINABILITY, BY MUNICIPALITY

		ACTION PROGRAM			
		Nemocón	Sogamoso	Muzo	Condoto
Concept		Because early entry into the work force is related to various factors, especially in the socio-cultural area, sustainability of actions and results is based on the project's focus, from planning through implementation, as well as on mechanisms and strategies put in place to ensure continuity.	Sustainability is the result of institution building, community participation in committees and improvement of the families' abilities to identify and take advantage of opportunities.	Sustainability results from beneficiaries having: access to the municipality's sectoral programs, inclusion in municipal development plans, allocation of budget funds, broad-based local participation and autonomous decision making by associated groups.	Sustainability must be guaranteed from the start through participatory mechanisms and involvement of civil society, families and institutions at the national, departmental and local levels.
Proposed actions		Three key areas of sustainability: 1) Changes in cultural patterns; 2) Solidification and reinforcement of networks for prevention and citizen oversight; and 3) Implementation of proposals included in the municipal development plan.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Inclusion of the issue and actions in the Social Policy Council, in strategic plans of at least 10 local institutions and in Institutional Educational Projects (IEP). - Implementation of Godparent Plan. - Coverage for beneficiaries by subsidized services, inclusion in municipality's basic care plan and encouragement of family participation in oversight groups. - Promotion of 4 income diversification activities as a pilot project. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Direct connection with local authorities. - Make program official through agreement with Municipal Council. - Periodic meetings for monitoring and evaluation. - Help make beneficiaries self-supporting through organization of production associations. - Connection with businesses (Tecminas, Coesminas and Minercol) and ICBF, the Health Secretariat of Boyacá and the Regional Office of Labor and Social Security. 	Children's Social Policy Council: catalyst; local government: responsible for continuity through UMATAM, Inder, municipal office, social development office and inter-institutional coordination among: Secretariat of Education and Social Development, area directors; ICBF-health; SENA; Indecho, Inder, Civil Defense-sports and recreation area; municipal oversight organization; and establishment and reinforcement of revolving fund.

Definition of beneficiaries and recipients

TABLE 6: BENEFICIARIES AND RECIPIENTS, BY MUNICIPALITY

	ACTION PROGRAM			
	Nemocón	Sogamoso	Muzo	Condoto
Direct beneficiaries	Families: 62 with vocational training, income-generating activities or credit plans; 52 with literacy programs; 176 with medical care; 60 in network, Parents: 1 group, 6 female heads of household with all services, 1 self-help group and 60 parents' school. Children: 285 withdrawn from work, 115 with better working conditions and vocational training, 142 with non-formal education and literacy training, 24 enrolled in educational system, 285 with health and nutrition services and guidance, 112 with legal assistance. Community: 1 oversight group.	433 children between ages 5 and 17 and 273 families.	476 children and youths between ages 5 and 17 and 238 families.	446 children and youths between ages 5 and 17.
Indirect beneficiaries	Families benefiting only from awareness raising. Also: 114 families with vocational training and income-generation activities or credit plans, 22 with literacy programs and 221 younger siblings of working children in process of prevention from entry into work force.	176 families, 310 children and youths and an undetermined number of community members (teachers, parents and community leaders).	436 families and community members and 591 non-working children and youths.	436 families in the communities of Opogodó (120), La Hilaria (50) and neighborhoods of Cascajero, Platinero, Santa Rita and El Salto (276).
Direct recipients	Local government (with which work is done jointly), principals and educators in involved schools, organized community groups, parish, UMATA and SENA personnel (responsible for coordinating technical training), Family Police (responsible for legal aid to families) and Culture Office (<i>Casa de la Cultura</i>).	Local government and at least 10 local institutions, the educational community, people connected with the project and agencies involved in implementation.	Community Action Boards (11 areas), Parents' Associations (12), teachers at 12 schools, rural health promoters, medical and paramedical personnel at the Health Center (Mata Café) and hospital (Santa Ana de Muzo), Volunteer Women of Muzo, Western Council for Normalization, Verification and Development, Muzo Red Cross, Central Committee and Subcommittee of Quebrada Huitoco, Corporación PAZ VIVA and Muzo Women's Committee.	"The 10 Parents' Associations, through Parents' Schools that support the process in association with educational institutions. Local NGOs."

Implementing and participating agencies

TABLE 7: IMPLEMENTING AND PARTICIPATING AGENCIES, BY MUNICIPALITY

	ACTION PROGRAM			
	Nemocón	Sogamoso	Muzo	Condoto
Imple- menting	Christian Youth Association (ACJ-YMCA)	Corporación Minuto de Dios (CMD)	Cooperativa de Trabajo Asociado Consultores y Asesores Empresariales Limitada (Cooptrabajo Ltda.)	Corporación para el Desarrollo Social y Educativo Ltda. (Corpasode).
Collaborating	Local government, UMATA, SENA, ICBF, head of district (nucleus), Health Secretariat.	Local government (through Administrative Planning Department, secretariats of Development and Environment, Health, Education and Social Planning Council, UMATA, Economic and Social Development Unit (UDES), Chamber of Commerce, schools, ICBF, MINERCOL, SENA, National and Distance Learning University (UNAD), Pedagogical and Technological University of Colombia (UPTC)	<u>Local</u> : Local government (through UMATA, Health Office, District (Nucleus) Office, sports agency, culture office, parish). <u>Regional</u> : ICBF and SENA. <u>Departmental</u> : Secretariats of Health and Education, sports agency, Institute of Culture and Fine Arts. <u>Nacional</u> : Pedagogical and Technological University of Colombia (UPTC)	Municipality (co-implementer of program) with Social Development Office (program coordinator) and supervision and follow-up with UMATAM, INDER, Secretariat for Development. Also ICBF, schools, DASALUD, San José Hospital, INDECHO, Labor Office, Ombudsman's Office, SENA, NGOs
Partners	Directors and educators, parish, family police, Culture Office, community action, community and grassroots organizations and the Sports Institute.	Parish of Morcá and others, parent groups, teachers, health personnel and community leaders.	Community Action Boards, parents' associations, educators, Red Cross of Muzo and health promoters.	Civil Defense and the Chocó Corporation for Sustainable Development.

CHAPTER 2: RESULTS OF THE EVALUATION

The results of the mid-term evaluation of the intervention component, which are presented in this chapter, are organized in two parts. The first discusses overall progress at the national level, while the second describes progress in each municipality, according to the five areas and components of the evaluation: 1) Relevance, 2) Effectiveness, 3) Efficiency, 4) Sustainability, and 5) Administration and management.

2.1. PROGRESS AT THE NATIONAL LEVEL

This section discusses project results based on *implementation at the national level and major trends in the municipalities*. Analysis at the national level was based on information from the National Project Coordinator, the members of the National Technical Committee for Elimination of Child Labor and the Sub-Regional Coordinating Office for Mining, based in Lima (Peru). It also includes observations about earlier stages of implementation, especially project design and formulation.

Relevance

According to interviewees at the **national level**, the following are the main factors contributing to the project's relevance:

It has expanded the issue of prevention and elimination of child labor in small-scale traditional mining to other areas of mining besides coal (emeralds, clay and gold), because many children are working in these sectors under harsh conditions that pose a threat to their development (Ministry of Labor and Social Security and National Project Coordinator).

It is based on prior studies, unlike other ILO/IPEC programs. That makes it possible to understand and analyze the situation of mining at the national level and in mining regions and establish action programs based on sound arguments (Sub-Regional Coordinator for Mining).

It involves *appropriate strategies* (prior studies, mini-programs, participatory methodologies) and incorporates *learnings from other countries* that have underscored the importance of taking an integral approach to the causes of the problem (Sub-Regional Coordinator for Mining).

Institution building. All respondents interviewed at the national and municipal levels agree about the importance of working with the various government agencies responsible for economic and social development and gaining their commitment to the prevention and elimination of child labor in its worst forms, particularly, in the case of this project, in small-scale traditional mining. People interviewed at the national level explained that their participation is not aimed at designing specific strategies for the project, but at focusing each agency's strategies, plans and actions toward the project's goals and activities and the municipalities' action programs. They also emphasized the importance of coordinating efforts among agencies.

The *consensus-based formulation of the project in 2000* by MINERCOL and the IPEC Program at the national and sub-regional levels also had an impact on relevance. The formation of a work team that included a country expert, as well as a representative of the IPEC sub-region, and its interaction with agencies directly responsible for the issue facilitated the preparation of a project document that responded to the characteristics of the problem in the country and the requirements of international cooperation agencies. Another positive aspect was the fact that baseline studies were done early in the project formulation period, resulting in a much more precise definition of goals.

It was noted, however, that during the formulation stage, the parties agreed to an investment equivalent to US\$2,500,000 in resources for project implementation. The final investment approved by ILO/IPEC, with funds from the United States government, was US\$840,000. This led MINERCOL to reformulate its application for resources approved by the National Royalties Fund, excluding the areas of Formalization and Cultural Transformation (National Project Coordinator). While measures taken by IPEC in the action programs have overcome this difficulty to some extent, it has nevertheless reduced the impact of the intervention.

The project document includes indicators that are clear and precise, in most cases, and establishes verification mechanisms that have proven viable. The project's files include minutes of meetings, attendance lists, records of services provided, etc. During the design phase, however, a specific system for keeping records of the children prevented from entering or withdrawn from work was not proposed. The formation of a monitoring group made up of various institutions, to keep track of these children, is not feasible because of travel costs, violence in several of the intervention zones and the lack of personnel available for this task at a time when there is a policy of personnel and spending cuts in public administration (National Project Coordinator).

Progress is currently being made, in conjunction with the Domestic Child Labor Project, on the design of an inspection and oversight mechanism that, among other things, will monitor compliance with commitments established by institutions and families to withdraw children from mining or prevent them from entering mine labor. Mechanisms are also being developed to establish a periodic record of the activities of the children and adolescents to determine how many have been kept out of mine labor, are working less or have withdrawn from mining. These mechanisms will be implemented in conjunction with schools and NGOs. Their initial application is planned for the first week of February, when children return to school. For this reason, there are no records yet of the number of beneficiaries who have been withdrawn from mine labor or prevented from becoming involved in such work.

With regard to project implementation, the National Coordinator emphasizes the *relevance of institution building* as a fundamental strategy for increasing the likelihood of success and sustainability of the project and its action programs. This reinforcement addresses several areas: 1) The national level, through committees (direction and technical), the *ad hoc* group for direct intervention, and the project subcommittee; 2) Strengthening of the NGOs, beginning when they are invited to formulate action programs. This reinforcement consists of guidance, invitations to meetings and workshops, and ongoing follow-up of activities and reports; 3) Work with labor organizations so that they will include the issue in their fight for labor rights; 4) Work with mining companies; 5) Inclusion of the issue in national development policy and the National Development Plan.

Institution building is relevant because it makes it possible for the government, represented by its agencies, to assume responsibility for addressing the problem of working children, rather than depending on outside interventions or foreign aid to resolve this and other social problems. If the current national government lacks the necessary political will, it may be difficult for the project to continue. The action programs probably can continue, however, because of the decentralization of public administration.

The *implementation of mini-programs* in the project's start-up phase made it possible to address more relevantly the factors identified as the principal causes of child labor (Sub-Regional Coordinator for Mining).

Participatory methodologies for the design of action programs, with the participation of the municipal institutions that responded to the invitation (Sub-Regional Coordinator for Mining).

The importance of the project's efforts to *address cultural issues*, understanding the problem of child labor in mining as being rooted in tradition and, therefore, in the concepts and cultural patterns of the people, is emphasized by nearly all the people interviewed and seen as a priority in studies of the problem of child labor in small-scale traditional mining. As the Sub-Regional Coordinator for Mining points out, however, this is a complex issue that could require a great deal of time and systematic, specialized efforts. In the project, it is important that the expectations in this area be clearly and realistically defined. When MINERCOL removed the cultural component from its proposal, the decision was made to allocate resources in the programs to design and implement awareness-raising actions that, while they will not be able to transform such deeply rooted cultural practices as child labor, will provide opportunities for reflection that will lead to the questioning of and eventually the changing of these patterns.

Another factor emphasized is the *income-generation* component of the action programs. It is important to mention the experience in Peru, where the question has been raised about whether this strategy is useful in all cases. SENA includes similar elements. Because the formalization component was removed from the MINERCOL project, an alternative income-generation component was proposed for the action programs. This would lead to an increase in household income not as a result of formalization, but because of economic activities other than mining.

It is also important to highlight the focus on action programs at the municipal level, not on small programs grouped by theme (for example, awareness raising, education or sexual exploitation). Implementation at the municipal level will give the actions and strategies greater impact (National Project Coordinator).

Finally, analysis shows that the perceptions of the people interviewed in the **municipalities** are similar to those at the national level. The relevance of work in education, health and recreation is mentioned, along with income generation for families and raising awareness of the project and the action programs. The programs are perceived as responding to the needs identified in each zone.

Effectiveness

The main achievements so far and the difficulties in each area of action are:

Institution building. At the **national level**, work is being done with the *ad hoc* group for direct intervention projects. Agencies such as the ministries of Labor, Education and Health and SENA are involved and participating actively. Significant reinforcement of the NGOs has also been done through ongoing follow-up that began before the action program proposals were presented. Two labor organizations have included the issue in their work and in the awareness-raising activities carried out by their affiliates. The labor groups' affiliates have also been trained in the methodology of project formulation so they can seek financing from sources other than the ILO.

The process with employers has been slower. One national meeting was held and another is planned to encourage actions in the mining sectors where the intervention is taking place.

The issue was included in a first draft of the National Development Plan, but was excluded from the version submitted by the National Planning Department during the first week of December. This reflects the uncertainty and difficulty of positioning the issue and making child labor in mining visible as an important element of the national government's social policy.

Despite the difficulties, the project has fulfilled its designated purpose at the national level (National Project Coordinator).

The main achievements at the **municipal level** center on the contacts and arrangements made with institutions. While there have been difficulties, there have also been positive results. Both municipal authorities and personnel at the various agencies are aware of the action programs and there is an initial level of awareness about the issue. While the mayors do not consider the project a priority, they at least allow it to operate freely. Local plans for the elimination of child labor have been approved by the municipal council in Nemocón and included in the municipal development plan in Sogamoso. Inter-institutional coordination has also been a significant accomplishment in all the municipalities.

Direct intervention: All action programs are currently under way. The ones in Sogamoso and Nemocón are the most advanced because they began activities with the implementation of a mini-program.

At the national level, the clearest progress is seen in the area of health, while the greatest difficulties are encountered in the municipalities because of a lack of resources. The common achievements in the municipalities are: identification of the beneficiary population, the signing of commitments with families and the raising of community awareness about the issue of child labor. In general, those interviewed reported that the goals and activities included in the timeline are proceeding as planned, although there have been some specific difficulties in certain municipalities.

In the municipalities, the following achievements are emphasized: 1) In Nemocón, the children have been enrolled in the school system, but there are difficulties in the area of pedagogy. The school system is not prepared to implement curriculum and didactic changes that would make education more attractive for these children and adolescents or take into account their learning styles and difficulties. Many recreational activities have also been held in this municipality, but some adolescents are apathetic about joining youth groups. 2) It is important to emphasize the resistance encountered in Sogamoso among parents who have deeply rooted cultural patterns regarding child labor. They perceive specific advantages, but do not understand the full range of benefits proposed by the program. Parents' cultural patterns are being identified there, because it has been determined that they could be a negative factor in the program's progress. 3) In Muzo, there has been a great effort at inter-institutional coordination, with substantial difficulties. 4) In Condoto, progress has been made in the area of health.

Formalization: This element is, perhaps, the project's greatest loss. The elimination of this component by MINERCOL hampers the possibility of increasing the use of technology in mining in the cases where that is feasible. Nevertheless, given this difficulty, it was wise to include an alternative income-generation component in the action programs. Keeping in mind the limited resources and the families' conditions, however, this will be an element difficult to implement in the municipalities. The learning from this is that in future projects, co-financing agencies must finance the same line items, aiming their contribution at attaining broader coverage. When line items are divided, there is a risk that not all of the important components will be included at the same time, as occurred in this case.

Efficiency

The project's resources are limited and its goals are relatively high. The National Coordinator indicated several strategies for ensuring efficient use of resources: 1) In the action programs, priority has been placed on inter-institutional coordination, in order to establish agreements for coordinated allocation of the resources of the municipality and the program. This has created synergies and given the results a greater impact; 2) In project management, administrative expenses have been reduced to focus resources on the direct intervention; 3) Actions of the small-scale traditional mining project have been coordinated with those of the domestic labor project in Colombia to reduce costs and make efforts more efficient.

Project personnel are interested in and willing to achieve greater efficiency in the management of available resources. In general, it is reported that in the municipalities, activities are being carried out

according to the established goals and timeline. Only in Sogamoso were difficulties reported with communication and use of the Internet.

Sustainability

In the National Coordinator's view, the project's sustainability is currently uncertain for several reasons. It is not clear whether the issue of child labor will be included in the Development Plan; if it is not included, it will be difficult to ensure that the project will be continued and implemented by the government agencies with responsibility in this area. In addition, the Ministry of Labor and Social Security, which so far has led the national process in this area, is being merged with the Ministry of Health. Finally, MINERCOL, the state agency responsible for managing the country's mineral resources, is being liquidated, and it is not clear which agency will assume the functions that it has been carrying out.

Given these problems, the project has made various efforts to establish alternatives. To include the issue in the Development Plan, a proposal was drawn up and presented to the National Committee and the National Planning Department, the agency responsible for formulating the plan. The first versions of the plan included the issue, but it was later removed with no explanation. In December, when the plan was presented to the national Planning Council, the inappropriate elimination of the issue was discussed. Agreement was reached to meet again with the national Planning Department, which considered it important to include the issue. Project personnel are awaiting a new version of the plan. With regard to the Ministry of Labor and Social Security, several meetings have been held with the Vice Minister of Labor to emphasize the importance of her role with regard to child labor. As a result, the ministry's General Labor Directorate included the issue among the projects to be carried out during its administration. It is hoped that this will guarantee its continuity in the coming merger. With MINERCOL, various meetings have been held with the participation of the Sub-Regional Coordinator for Mining and the National Project Coordinator. Nevertheless, there has been no specific response to questions about who will assume responsibility for the issue of child labor in small-scale traditional mining.

At the municipal level, the situation is somewhat different. The mayors, the highest local authorities, were elected in 2001 and will be in office until 2003. Their continuity contributes to the maintenance of the agreements reached so far. In addition, efforts to include the issue in municipal development plans have met with a positive response, which has a favorable influence on the sustainability of project actions. The uncertainty, however, will arise in 2004, with the new municipal administrations.

According to the ICBF, the income-generation component is the weak link in these projects. It believes that the NGOs and social agencies are qualified to establish connections in the psycho-social, eco-educational and social-pedagogical aspects of the intervention, but lack experience in the economic sphere, at both the micro and macro levels related to the issue of child labor in the region and the country. Institutions with direct responsibility in the economic area, such as the National Planning Office, have not included the issue on their agenda.

Joint efforts, the leadership of NGOs and intensive and ongoing work in institution building and income generation will increase the possibility of the project's sustainability.

Administration and management

Several elements will be analyzed in this section: 1) The relationships among the National Coordinator, the Sub-Regional Coordinator for South America-IPEC and the Sub-Regional Coordinator for Mining-IPEC; 2) the relationships between the National Coordinator and the partner NGOs; 3) the relationships among the various levels of the agencies supporting the project; and 4) the type of management needed by IPEC and the NGOs to connect institutions to the project and the action programs.

The project in Colombia is administered by the National Coordinator, with support from the Sub-Regional Coordinator for Mining and the Sub-Regional Coordinator for South America-IPEC. These coordinators provide ongoing technical advice. According to the Sub-Regional Coordinator for Mining, the principal technical adviser for the sub-regional IPEC/Mining program, "Support has included supervision of arrangements with national authorities for ensuring the signing of agreements and commitments with the project and the IPEC program." The Sub-Regional IPEC Coordinator for South America, meanwhile, "provides administrative support for the project." In addition, "the regional ILO office intervenes when greater weight is needed for arrangements with national authorities, appealing to the Memorandum of Understanding on IPEC activities in the country" (Sub-Regional Coordinator for Mining).

To maintain coordination with the sub-regional level and IPEC headquarters, the National Coordinator has participated in various planning meetings in Lima. The guidelines established in these meetings have been followed in implementing the project in Colombia. With regard to the IPEC mining project in Bolivia, Ecuador and Peru, the lessons learned, which were presented in the meeting in Bolivia in February 2002, and the experiences described in various publications have also been incorporated.

The National Coordinator is responsible for coordinating project implementation according to the plans established when the project was formulated. This requires maintaining relationships with directors of national and municipal agencies responsible for the issue, providing technical assistance to the NGOs responsible for formulating and implementing the action programs, financial administration of the project and preparing periodic reports. The project activities have been implemented as planned, although there was a delay in beginning two of the action programs.

After the action programs were formulated, the mayors of each municipality in the intervention zones were contacted to establish implementation agreements. Preliminary commitments were established with municipal offices through letters or other documents, and it was determined which municipal agency would be responsible for coordinating with the NGO the formulation and implementation of these programs. In Condoto, the Social Development Secretary was designated; in Nemocón, the UMATA director; in Muzo, the Family Police; and in Sogamoso, the Social Development Secretariat.

Relations between IPEC and the NGOs are characterized by close and ongoing follow-up by IPEC. The National Coordinator believes that the NGOs sometimes perceive this supervision as excessive control. Nevertheless, it has had positive results, because the goals have been met as planned and the NGOs have gradually been strengthened. Periodic workshops are held with the action program coordinators and representatives of the municipal offices to train them and reinforce their skills in implementing the strategies for institution building, awareness raising, direct intervention and income generation for adult members of the families. This has ensured the high technical quality of the actions and enabled the project to take advantage of feedback from the experiences in the intervention zones.

With regard to relations among the various levels of the agencies, the National Coordinator indicated that transferring actions from the national to the municipal level is very difficult, a view that is shared by the municipalities. Personnel at the national level also indicated that mechanisms for applying national policies at the municipal level were not clear. This difficulty arises from the weakness of the current system of decentralization in the country; it is not a specific difficulty of the project.

Finally, management of the Project and action programs is focused greatly on mobilizing people and agencies, making contacts and providing motivation to strengthen institutions and achieve specific commitments from various entities and authorities. The National Coordinator indicated that this activity was not a priority for the NGOs at first, but that these organizations are gradually understanding its importance. This type of activity is fundamental, along with the technical implementation of the other components of the project and the action programs.

2.2. ACCOMPLISHMENTS BY MUNICIPALITY

2.2.1. MUNICIPALITY OF NEMOCÓN

The action program of the Project for Elimination and Prevention of Child Labor began in September¹³ and has generally made satisfactory progress based on the proposal and needs in the zone, according to the various stakeholders interviewed. Preparatory activities began in June with the implementation of a mini-program.

Relevance

The action program and the project are consistent, they meet the needs of the region and its inhabitants, the intervention strategies and activities are relevant and adapted to the situation of mining in the zone, the intervention addresses cultural elements, and local people have been involved in the process.

In the local government, however, the Secretary of Government and the Coordinator of Social Programs object to the use of the term “eliminate” to refer to a cultural practice as deeply rooted as child labor. According to the Secretary of Government, “elimination” is neither the correct term nor the objective: “The objective is to prevent, not eliminate,” working as a team to create an alternative so that minor children do not work. Except for that point, local government personnel indicated that both the project and the action program respond to the needs of the region, employ good strategies and constitute a valuable contribution to a proposal for cultural change on the part of the community.

With regard to participation, the NGO responsible for implementing the program (*Asociación Cristiana de Jóvenes-ACJ*) has maintained an ongoing relationship with the local government. Working together, they have contacted the health, education and recreation sectors and other social programs of the municipality and clarified the responsibility of each regarding the issue of working children in the Patio Bonito area. This participation has extended to local residents, who attended an awareness-raising workshop on children’s rights and legislation on children’s issues, which was also designed to seek commitments from the participants based on their various roles.

The program’s components respond directly to the needs of families and the municipality. The institution-building component is considered one of the intervention’s strong points, because it will enable organizations to make a commitment to the program and help ensure continuity and sustainability.

The fact that the action program addresses the issue from a cultural standpoint was emphasized by all the stakeholders interviewed, who understood that changing concepts and cultural patterns related to child labor will be a long-term process.

Effectiveness

In general, the planned goals have been met, according to the local government and NGO personnel interviewed and the report on activities implemented. With regard to the planned results, the action program in Patio Bonito has made the following progress:

- *Raising awareness about the problem of child labor in the municipality and the local area.* The invitation extended to stakeholders in order to explain the project and the expectations related to it had

¹³ The entire process began in June-July with the design of a mini-program, while direct work in the area began in August-September.

a positive effect on the joint design of a local plan by the various municipal stakeholders, as well as the establishment of commitments and responsibilities. An awareness-raising workshop on children's rights and legislation on children's issues, a presentation on the program at the Municipal Educational Forum and earlier dissemination of information about the program also helped create favorable conditions for its launch.

- *Gathering of information about the community of Patio Bonito:* Home visits by ACJ social workers have made it possible to get to know the community, validate the family evaluation forms and gather data about children who have dropped out of school and are working. Other municipal social programs, such as Families in Action, have provided information about the families that will benefit from the program. The NGO has very complete documentation that will enable it to systematically document the program, the information gathered, follow-up of activities and the implementation process.
- *Approaching families and developing trust and commitment:* Work was done with the families during the first month. Of the total contacted, 60 signed commitments expressing their intention to participate in the program and withdraw their middle-school children from work. They also acknowledge that their children are involved in tasks in the mine. While some families received two home visits during the month, that depended on the complexity of family dynamics; some families also received more than two visits.
- *Socio-political commitment by the local government and visibility of the problem of child labor,* which have had a positive effect on the continuity of program actions: 1) Inclusion on the EBI form of the withdrawal of approximately 285 children from mine labor by 2003; 2) Reactivation of the Social Policy Council, which had been established by decree but was not operating; 3) All municipal agencies know of the project and have assumed some responsibility in the local plan; 4) The project was presented to the Municipal Council with the intention of ensuring its sustainability and obtaining resources for the next year. The council members expressed interest in supporting the program and willingness to allocate funds.
- *Contact and coordination with municipal stakeholders:* There is recognition of the importance of and need for the program in the municipality. Although this work is still unfinished, the results are visible in that contact has been made with the various sectors: health, education, recreation and other social programs. A support network called Challenges of Peace has also been formed, made up of representatives of all the sectors having some decision-making capacity. The network was established to lobby for compliance with children's rights, oversee the action program and work on issues related to domestic violence.
- *Coordination at various levels:* Support from ILO/IPEC; leadership from the UMATA Director as the local government representative, and the Secretary of Government, who is responsible for program coordination; an ongoing work agreement between the local government and the implementing agency; and, according to the Director of Social Projects, close coordination with the Patio Bonito school.

The program's accomplishments in each direct intervention area should also be noted:

- *Education sector:* A survey of the number of children not in school, coordination with the district director for assignment of teachers to this group of children, awareness raising for the principal and teachers of the Patio Bonito school, formation of groups of students by grades for remedial work in mathematics, language and reasoning, school breakfast and lunch program.

- *Health sector:* Contacts have been made and actions coordinated, but no results have yet been noted.
- *Recreation and culture:* The municipality's sports and recreation coordinator has been very open to the program and has coordinated closely to carry out the following activities: field trips, games, Saturday recreation activities, establishment of a micro-soccer sports school, pick-up tournaments, a micro-soccer team for girls, two pre-teen and one teen group, identification of recreational groups in the community and conversations with the Culture Office. According to the social workers, recreation is the activity that the children and adolescents most enjoy and keeps them from working outside school hours.
- Little progress has been made in the *income generation component*, but information is being gathered about each family's income and expenses, the types of work that most interest them and the feasibility of these activities for later analysis of alternate possibilities of income generation. A survey of possible jobs in the area (brick factories, flower farms) is also being done, and the first training module for job seekers was developed.

The social workers' constant presence in Patio Bonito, their daily, dedicated work and their closeness to the families are considered an important factor in the success of the program in Nemocón. Just as the selection of the ACJ can be considered an achievement, the organization has also become stronger, has learned from the experience and has developed greater management capacity.

The program's weaknesses are as follows:

- *In education:* The school system's resistance to change,¹⁴ obstacles created by directors to suggestions or initiatives, and the teachers' difficulties in adapting their practices to the context of the students being attended¹⁵ (in evaluations, for example) are among the obstacles to institutionalization of the program in the vital area of education.
- *In health care:* The municipality currently lacks resources, the community has a small health center that is only staffed by a doctor and a nurse one day a week, and dental care is poor, with only one dentist. Communication problems caused the cancellation of the planned Health Brigade, which had already been announced in the community.
- *Recreation and culture:* It has not been easy to work with the youth group, because has not been possible to gather more than 20 people. In addition, the Culture Office's commitments have made it impossible to coordinate actions with the program.

- *Job creation:* The families have expressed little interest in grouping together for income generation. Families (mothers and children) express the program's accomplishments when they speak positively and with great affection of the social workers' efforts, emphasize the importance of the recreational aspect, commit themselves in writing to collaborating with the program and recognize that education is important for their children's future. The children, meanwhile, talk with each other about picking up their pay, loading bricks onto trucks for \$2000 colombian pesos¹⁶, and their desire to work instead of returning to school, and appear with their faces and clothing covered with dust. When they draw what they hope for in

¹⁴ According to the social workers, opportunities for working with children and youth are not provided.

¹⁵ It is necessary to recognize the school's fundamental role in retaining students in order for the school to provide an alternative to child labor. Teachers must also design strategies and mechanisms to keep students in school. Poor communication with students, the lack of relevance of school subject matter and an environment that shows little understanding of working students are among the factors that make these children drop out.

¹⁶ US\$1= \$2.938 Colombian pesos.

two to four years, however, their drawings reflect their desire to be part of soccer teams, to study, to be singers, to rest and also to work in the clay mining lots.

Efficiency

The actions have been carried out faithfully, with responsibility and with openness to the dynamics, situation and suggestions of the stakeholders involved. Institutional coordination has mobilized resources for various activities, meaning that the activities are being funded by other sectors as well as the program. According to those interviewed, the use of resources has followed the quarterly plan.

Sustainability

According to those interviewed, mechanisms for the program's sustainability are being created on the basis of the following areas:

- Empowerment of stakeholders through participation in and ownership of a vision of children's rights.
- Efforts to convert the government's commitment or intention into an ongoing commitment by the municipality. For this reason, the program is working on the adoption of a Municipal Agreement.
- Coordination of actions among municipal agencies, which will increase the likelihood of achieving the expected results.
- For some, maintenance of the program depends on support from the ILO.
- The ACJ social workers are considered very important in decision making. Without them, it was said, the work would be impossible.
- The Agreement and the EBI form, which make the program independent of government policy, are key to its continuity.

Administration and management

In Nemocón, the ILO's support and backing are considered sufficient. One noteworthy element is the commitment by the Secretary of Government, who has become involved in the program out of personal motivation. The Secretary of Government is extremely interested in placing the issue on the municipality's political agenda as one of the local government's social programs, so it is less dependent on politics and political changes.

Those interviewed believe that the guidelines are clear and sufficient, that the municipal coordinators receive support and that they have the means to guide and coordinate the project. The action program has benefited from the clarity of the project's guidelines. IPEC's support is considered generous, flexible and appropriate. It has constantly overseen processes involving orientation, training, guidance, follow-up and monitoring with regard to administrative, technical and financial management.

Coordination by the NGO is ongoing. Through the NGO, the general director provides supervision, weekly meetings are scheduled and reports are submitted. The strengths of this coordination are reflected in teamwork and in guidance by the ACJ advisory committee, which is composed of professionals from various areas who keep close track of progress toward goals and any difficulties encountered. It is also important to mention the commitment of UMATA, the Secretary of Government and the municipality's social programs.

2.2.2. MUNICIPALITY OF SOGAMOSO

In order to get preparatory activities under way, the implementing NGO began a mini-program in the municipality of Sogamoso in June. As part of this program, it updated the database of beneficiaries of the action program, began making arrangements to include the issue in the work plans of institutions and initiated awareness-raising activities for parents and children to gain their commitment to the program. Once this phase was completed, the action program for the prevention and elimination of child labor in small-scale traditional mining of clay and coal began.

Relevance

The evaluation showed that the action program in Sogamoso is consistent with certain objectives of the National Action Plan for 1999-2002,¹⁷ as well as with the needs identified in the zone. The needs of the target population identified at the national level are consistent with the survey and the needs identified in the zone, to which the action program is designed to respond.

The action program in Sogamoso is carrying out activities aimed at withdrawing children from work and meeting needs detected in education, health care, recreation and income generation for adults. It is part of the Municipal Development Plan, so it is adapted to local policy and to the needs identified in the region by local authorities. Stakeholders value the relevance of a program that does not propose starting new programs or activities, but allows the agencies to include the beneficiaries of the action program as beneficiaries of their existing programs and activities.

Those interviewed indicated that to eliminate child labor in small-scale traditional mining, three conditions are necessary: the creation of real and varied alternative income sources, improvement in families' living conditions (health, education, etc.) and, especially, changes in cultural patterns of child rearing and behavior. If these three elements are not addressed in an integral manner, it will be difficult to see positive results in the elimination of child labor in the short or medium term. They also indicated that withdrawal of children from mine labor cannot be accomplished in one year, because it is part of a structural problem related to social conditions in the country. Because the problem is economic and cultural in nature, the timeframe of the action program is considered short.

The only difficulty mentioned with regard to relevance was the criticism by various stakeholders of the objective of elimination of child labor. They said the goal should not be complete elimination of child labor, but the establishment of employment alternatives for families that allow them to improve their standard of living.

Finally, some members of municipal agencies suggested including in the program other working children who live in the same or worse conditions as those working in small-scale traditional mining.

Effectiveness

The program's accomplishments to date include:

¹⁷ The objectives of the National Action Plan 1999-2002 that relate to the AP in the municipality are: establishment of a national information subsystem on child labor; development and implementation of programs aimed at transforming cultural patterns that legitimize and perpetuate child labor; design and implementation of mechanisms necessary to ensure precise and well-focused public policy for the prevention and elimination of child labor; working with specific groups of children and youth engaged in the worst forms of child labor to ensure that they withdraw from work and guaranteeing the full restitution of their rights through projects that ensure simultaneous, complementary action by various sectors; and development of management mechanisms for the efficient, effective and coordinated implementation of the plan at various levels.

- Agreement among the members of local institutions and the implementing NGO with regard to the program's final objective.
- Development of a database of families with children who work or are at risk of going to work, so that local institutions and the national project coordinator can keep this information updated.
- Awareness-raising among local institutions and their commitment to the program. According to the ICBF director, ILO/IPEC's strategy of distributing the study to all municipal agencies was very important in motivating them and, as a result, making the work go more smoothly. Each institution has very clear goals and indicators and has included the action program's database in its own database, thus ensuring continuity.
- Coordinated, interdisciplinary work in the municipality. The agencies responsible for various state services are working together with common objectives aimed at reaching a specific population.
- Inclusion of nutrition activities in the action program, through schools and through gardens in places where there are welfare homes. Nutrition education and monitoring is also being provided, the school cafeteria program has been strengthened and expanded, and the protection of children's rights is being promoted in the municipality, according to the ICBF director.
- Committed participation by the school. The director of the Morcá School has become involved in the process and is acting as an intermediary between the program and the families. Training workshops in woodworking, pottery and coal sculpture are being offered at the school.
- The issue of child labor has been made visible at the school. Interviews indicated that the issue has become a concern of local educators. According to the director of the NGO, "So far, the issue has not been addressed directly because of a lack of resources, but the fact that it is a concern is attracting resources."
- The Young Carvers' Workshop led to the formation of a formal cooperative of young people over age 18. So far, however, they have not identified marketing channels for their products.
- Although the business promotion done by the local government is different from the program's business component, coordination among the three institutions (MINERCOL, the local government and IPEC) is facilitating fulfillment of the program's objectives.
- A change in the parents' attitudes, making the action program's actions and results more visible. While there is still some distrust and fear¹⁸ on the part of parents about participating in "one more program," and the various stakeholders are aware that changing parents' attitudes will be a demanding and prolonged task,¹⁹ they are also beginning to see the program's benefits and express satisfaction with them.
- Signing of a commitment between parents and the program to withdraw children from work in mining. As a strategy for strengthening the parents' commitment, it has been proposed that all local institutions go to the neighborhood at the same time, and that the community participate in meetings and become involved in the various activities being carried out.

¹⁸ In Pantanitos Bajos, the local government closed the clay-firing kilns because they were polluting the environment. As a result, the people who were working there must rent kilns in another area. This created resistance to the program and a very small number of parents in this sector are participating.

¹⁹ According to the ICBF director, "It is very difficult to change the parents' ideas. That will require a great deal of work over the medium and long term."

- Identification of parents' cultural patterns. According to the NGO coordinator, there is greater knowledge of the program's target population and the parents' opinions about child labor, education and their children's development.

The workshops indicated that while children have worked, either occasionally or with some frequency, none of them enjoys working. They do it to help their parents, but find it difficult, and they see it more as a benefit for the family. In the future, all would like to continue studying so as to have better possibilities of life outside the clay-mining lots. Adolescents who are in school do not see a future in work in clay mining. They work because they need to help their parents financially, but they do not enjoy the work. They say the work is tiring and the sun and smoke are irritating, and they would rather just study. This contrasts with their parents' perception that it is better for their adolescent children to be working than "hanging around in the streets." The parents also say, "We've worked in this all our lives. We've done it since we were born, and so have our children. They have to help out financially. We don't know how to do anything else."

Efficiency

Some members of municipal institutions reported a one-month delay in the program start-up. This, however, has not affected implementation of the planned activities.

NGO personnel mentioned certain problems in the efficient implementation of their work: much time is lost because of the lack of a separate telephone line; the line is currently shared with the municipality's Development Secretariat. There are also problems with the transmission of information by Internet, especially because both the manager of Minuto de Dios and the IPEC Project coordinator are in Bogotá and the program coordinator in the municipality must submit reports with excessive frequency.

According to the Municipal Development Secretariat, the program has fostered efficiency in all local institutions involved in the action program. Although MINERCOL had one experience working with the local government in the area, the arrival of the Minuto de Dios team this year has been a catalyst for coordination among local institutions²⁰ and co-financing of various activities, allowing services to be provided at lower cost.

Sustainability

In Sogamoso, the institutions' commitment to the program is clear: the program is already included in the Municipal Development Plan and is on the agenda of the Social Policy Council's Subcommittee on Children and the Family. Approval of the Local Action Plan by members of the subcommittee ensures the implementation of the various actions to be carried out by each entity.

In the words of some local stakeholders, to ensure the program's sustainability, there must be a commitment that goes beyond government policy to become national policy. This will ensure that the issue of child labor becomes a priority for intervention at the local level.

One factor ensuring the program's sustainability is the coordinated planning and action among various entities focusing on common objectives. While these agencies carry out activities specific to their own missions, they also address the program's needs, focusing on the families and children who are included in the database. As these entities have learned to carry out their actions more efficiently and effectively, it has become easier to maintain alliances.

²⁰ ICBF, Secretariat of Health, Education, ISS, Family Police, etc.

The program's follow-up mechanisms for ensuring that goals are met contribute to its sustainability. One example is the follow-up subcommittee, which reports on progress to the Social Policy Committee.

In the area of education, there are some experiences that have had a positive impact on the action program's sustainability. For the past six year, Minuto de Dios has been working in the area with a "Young Carvers' Center." It was decided to connect this center with the school. Meanwhile, the principal of the Morcá School proposed turning the school into a vocational-technical center. This strategy could help prepare local people to obtain alternative sources of income, change the ideas that children, youths and parents have about child labor and make education more relevant in the region.

According to the Program coordinator, resources constitute a threat to sustainability. Budget cuts currently occurring in state institutions could reduce or eliminate resources for the program.

Finally, representatives of the Family Police said that the participation of municipal agencies does not guarantee sustainability if there is not an entity such as Minuto de Dios to serve as a catalyst.

Administration and management

IPEC has been very supportive in the program's implementation and in meeting the planned objectives, according to the NGO coordinator and members of local entities. IPEC has provided clear guidance so that they the programs coincide with guidelines established in the National Action Plan, has supported the implementation of the programs and has promoted learning among the various implementing NGOs. It also has provided support for the survey of the zone and the awareness-raising phase, but it engages in excessive follow-up of processes and supervision of all actions, limiting the autonomy of the implementing NGO.

2.2.3. MUNICIPALITY OF MUZO

The Program began recently in Muzo, although start-up was planned for July 2001, according to the Action Program document.²¹ Of the planned 12-month timeframe, it has been under way for two months.

Relevance

In general, the action program is relevant, as it responds to the needs identified initially in the survey of the zone²² as well as in the national survey.²³ It proposes actions aimed at raising awareness among parents and children about work in the mines and the importance of education and health. By seeking to enroll and keep children in school, as well as providing remedial assistance, technical and professional training for youths between ages 14 and 17 and literacy training for parents, education is given priority over work beginning at an early age. In this way, the program aims to break the cycle in which parents who lack formal education repeat the same patterns with their children because they believe formal education is unnecessary or they see no other options.

In the area of health care the program seeks to satisfy principal needs through preventive care and by connecting people with the national health-care system, SISBEN.

²¹ *Program of Elimination of Child Labor in Small-Scale Traditional Emerald Mining in Muzo-Boyacá*. April 2002.

²² MINERCOL, ILO and IPEC. *Child Labor in Small-Scale Traditional Emerald Mining. Socio-cultural and Economic Survey of the Municipality of Muzo in Boyacá*. Colombia, ILO, 1st edition, 2001.

²³ MINERCOL, ILO and IPEC. *Girls and Boys Working in Small-Scale Traditional Mining in Colombia. Socio-cultural, Economic and Legislative Survey*. Colombia, ILO, 1st edition, 2001.

Finally, economic reinforcement through business associations eligible to receive microcredit is a component without which awareness raising and the inclusion of children in educational, health-care and recreational services would be only short-term, stopgap measures. Without this, the families would continue in the same economic conditions and children and youths would have to continue working, either at home or in the mines.

While the cultural transformation component of the national project could not be developed to the desired extent because of budget cutbacks by MINERCOL, this is seen as an important factor in the decisive withdrawal of children and youths from mine labor. In the survey, youths noted the uncertain nature of this type of mining, revealing that such deeply rooted cultural patterns are very difficult to change.

It is clear that cultural transformation cannot be achieved in one year, and that immediate results could not be expected from this component. It must be remembered, however, that if even if municipal entities continue to assume responsibility for the action program, if it does not involve actions oriented toward cultural change, the other strategies will have less impact.

While all actions do not require the participation of all stakeholders, the action program is aimed at motivating the commitment of and action by local, regional and departmental entities, which is consistent with the project's Institution Building action area. According to the plan, the actions must be carried out by agencies that provide services related to education, health care, use of free time, recreation and technical and professional training. Joint use of resources will enable direct beneficiaries to have access to these services in exchange for their withdrawal from mine labor. The agencies are expected to direct their actions toward this specific population. This will strengthen the institutions, and if they maintain their commitment to the issue, they will continue to contribute to the elimination and prevention of child labor in mining. This action area, therefore, is considered extremely relevant.

It is also hoped that the children will join clubs and sports groups and that the families will form income-generating associations. Such participatory strategies would ensure the continuity of efforts to eliminate child labor. They would also help break the chain of cultural factors related to mine labor. If adults and children see results in their own economic and working conditions and feel empowered to form different types of groups, they will gain autonomy and could begin to see possibilities other than work in the mines.

The program is good for parents, who do not want their children to be miners because they have spent their entire lives in that work and have little to show for it but survival. Parents see studying as more important, and believe an education will enable their children to become professionals and have a better life.

Parents also say that the mines are not a good environment for children because the miners do not respect the children and abuse them physically and verbally. Nevertheless, many parents must take their children to the mine because they have no one to care for them at home. Others take their children in the hopes that a child will have more luck and will find emeralds. Others do so because it is easier for children to go into the mine.

Parents repeatedly express interest in other sources of income, such as micro-enterprises. They also mention the importance of keeping this in mind during the program, because many are interested in learning another skill in order to enter another economic activity or to find job opportunities in other cities.

The youths who were interviewed were ambivalent about withdrawing from mining. While they like earning their own money, they are aware of the dangers. They would only stop working in the mine if they had an economic alternative that produced an income equal to that which they earn from mining, if they

could be well situated elsewhere, or if they received outside assistance that enabled them to finish their studies.

Effectiveness

To describe the program's effectiveness, we will highlight the principal accomplishments to date, based on information provided by personnel from the municipality, as well as the difficulties that they perceive:

- The informants in the local government office agree that the main achievement to date is the *identification and selection of the beneficiary population*, although they believe that the information gathered two years ago does not reflect the current situation because of the changes that have occurred during that time.
- *Contacts with the entities* participating in the program.²⁴ These contacts have resulted in some concrete accomplishments:
 - In education: The San Marcos School and the urban José Francisco Mahecha School have been asked to expand their coverage so that youths can obtain their baccalaureate diplomas. Construction of a new classroom has begun at Concha de Silva School. Arrangements are being made to enroll more children and expand the school cafeteria. Human and infrastructure resources have been obtained to unify and extend the school day.
 - In health: 1) Inter-institutional coordination with the Sectional Health Institute of Boyacá, which is based in Tunja, to include certain aspects of the action program's plan in its Basic Care Plan (*Plan de Atención Básica-PAB*), particularly the "healthy schools" project. 2) Participation by the Institute in the local program committee. 3) Some of the program's health and nutrition activities were included in the Basic Care Plan. 4) The action program has been well-received by the head nurse and the assistant administrative director of the Santa Ana de Muzo Hospital, with whom co-financed actions have been coordinated for medicines, health brigades and vaccination campaigns.
 - In nutrition: Improvement of the diet in school cafeterias.
 - With regard to labor issues, the Regional Labor Office participates in the local program committee.
 - Arrangements have been made with two municipal councils, which are interested in the national project and the action program, to include the issue in municipal actions. It is also included in the municipal plan, to which adjustments were made based on Law 715.
- *Receptivity to the program* by the population, local entities and business (Coexminas). Levels of interest and attendance at events have been very high. People who are not involved in the program, but who have found out about it through radio broadcasts, have attended workshops. Awareness-raising meetings with the beneficiary population before the workshops began and meetings with teachers have included a process of reflection and awareness-raising about the situation of child labor and its consequences for individuals and society as a whole. The parents interviewed are aware of the program and have signed commitments to withdraw their children from the mines. The youths interviewed, however, did not know about the program. While some had heard it mentioned on the radio news, the reports were not specifically about the program in the region.

²⁴ Director of district office (nucleus), Sectional Health Institute of SENA, Santa Ana de Muzo Hospital, San Marcos de Muzo School and other offices serving students.

- *Institution building*: So far, progress has been made in gaining commitments to the program from some departmental entities, such as the Colombian Institute of Family Welfare (*Instituto Colombiano de Bienestar Familiar-ICBF*), the Regional Labor Office and the National Apprenticeship Service (*Servicio Nacional de Aprendizaje-SENA*). These good intentions, however, have not yet translated into specific participatory actions. So far, there are no mechanisms for interconnecting the national, departmental and local levels. In Muzo, although the Social Policy Council, as the municipal agency responsible for coordinating children's issues, was set up before the action program arrived, it is not active. For this reason, local institutions recently agreed to establish a Local Committee for the Prevention and Elimination of Child Labor in Small-Scale Traditional Mining of Emeralds, which will adopt policies and strategies to leverage and support the project's technical management.

Despite the achievements, the program has not been without difficulties:

- Limits on national budget resources affect the extent of actions at the municipal level. In health, the program sought to arrange with the municipality an expansion of coverage to allow beneficiaries to receive medical insurance. One requirement for increasing coverage under the current national health-care system, however, is co-financing by the local and national governments. Unfortunately, the municipality lacks such resources. It is therefore necessary to make such arrangements with the Municipal Council, but priority access for beneficiary families will not be possible immediately.
- A similar situation exists in the area of education. Entities in the municipality's education sector have problems because the national government has frozen teacher placements, because of limitations on infrastructure and because of the cost to parents of transferring children to different schools within the educational system. These circumstances pose obstacles for the action program in getting the students into the educational system and keeping them in school.
- The location of departmental institutions in different municipalities in the department significantly limits coordination and simultaneous implementation of actions in the municipality. For example, the regional SENA offices are located in the municipality of Sogamoso, those of the Sectional Health Institute and the Ministry of Labor are in the capital of the department (Tunja), and those of ICBF are in the municipality of Otanche.
- The economic recession and the situation of violence in the area have forced families to engage in various activities in order to survive. This results in migration toward the mining zone.
- Children's participation in mining is a deeply rooted custom. One year is considered too short a time in which to feasibly modify such patterns.

Despite these difficulties, however, a very significant process has begun to connect various entities with the program, contributing to its implementation and continuity. The interviews indicate that there is interest and commitment on the part of certain local sectors, while arrangements are more difficult at the departmental and national levels, as seen in the areas of health and education.

Efficiency

Because the program is in its initial phase, little can be said yet about efficiency. According to the NGO coordinator, who is responsible for managing the budget, spending so far has been slow. No large investments have been made, and the timeline is slightly behind schedule. Because of the difficulty of reaching Muzo and the lack of availability of qualified personnel in the area, more time was needed to begin the action program. In the future, the coordinator foresees the need to change some of the program's

line items to respond to the difficulties encountered in areas such as education and health or make transfers between areas or to make connections with experts.

Sustainability

The NGO coordinator sees as a priority the strategy that seeks to institutionalize the program at the local level through approval of an agreement by the Municipal Council. It is hoped that this will make the local problem of child labor visible and lead to allocation of funds in the budget for municipal investment.

The Secretary of Government emphasized several conditions for the program's sustainability: 1) maintain coordination with government entities that provide educational health-care and recreational services; 2) Citizen monitoring groups that oversee processes and monitor accomplishments, progress and backsliding; 3) Active, joint participation by all involved in the program; 4) Direct work with businesses; 5) Agreements with SENA and other institutions to provide training for parents in jobs other than mining that would provide them with a more stable income; 6) Organizational processes motivated by the NGO; 7) Continuation of financing by the ILO or another organization; 8) The government's political will.

This person considered economic difficulties to be the main obstacle to the program's continuity. The coordinator believed that meeting the objective of eliminating child labor in mining would require at least five years of work.

Another factor that has a negative impact on the program's institutional establishment is the difficulty that the Family Police office has had, as the local government representative, in assuming responsibility for coordination. The Family Police office must fulfill three roles simultaneously and lacks sufficient information about the program, although it has participated in the various events and meetings that have been held. When asked about IPEC's support for the program, the personnel responded that it was minimal and focused exclusively on economic resources that financed such subsidies as school supplies and equipment for the schools. In fact, however, the program has planned an integral intervention in the areas of education, health, recreation, income generation for adults, etc.

Meanwhile, the income-generation component is considered critical because of the complexity of helping a transient mining population organize businesses and form business associations.

This information indicates, in general, that the strategies planned for fostering the program's sustainability are appropriate and share the same goals: strengthening institutions in their commitment to the program and facilitating mechanisms for participation and for helping families, organized into business associations, find alternative sources of income.

Administration and management

The NGO coordinator's perception of IPEC's technical support and management is fairly positive. The coordinator believes that this is a decisive factor in the program's implementation and that guidelines for managing economic resources and logistics have been clear and direct. The program's professional staff members have also received adequate training and technical orientation.

The Action Program's work areas and guidelines with regard to the national project are related to national and international policies on the issue of child labor in small-scale traditional mining. This consistency is complemented by clear guidelines for each component. Those interviewed appreciated the fact that when the proposal was presented, they had technical support from IPEC.

Nevertheless, it should be noted that members of the technical committee do not understand exactly what IPEC's support involves. They believe it is limited to subsidies for school expenses and the contracting of the NGO. This committee has had difficulties in finding time to meet.

Time has also been an enemy for the coordinator, who believes that it is difficult to adjust the initial planning and begin implementation of the program in one year. The coordinator feels that there is too little time for the many actions that must be carried out.

Finally, the management strengths are perceived in the NGO's experience and in the interest that exists in seeing the project progress. The representatives of the technical committee share this interest.

2.2.4. MUNICIPALITY OF CONDOTO

The results of the evaluation in this municipality²⁵ reveal the progress made by the action program and allow an assessment of its relevance, effectiveness, efficiency, administration and management and sustainability.

Relevance

Both the formulation and the implementation of the Action Program in Condoto are adjusted to local needs, satisfy expectations in the region and aim to address cultural issues appropriately. The Action Program's goals are also realistic and appropriate to the municipality's situation, and the specific activities are consistent (with the expected results and the objectives themselves). The responsibilities assumed and the timelines reflect interconnections and synergy among the participants based on their functions. If these proposals are carried out, the successful attainment of the program's objectives will be guaranteed. Evidence of this lies in the public's knowledge of the program, its credibility and the expressions of satisfaction with the program.

The fact that so many institutions have made commitments and are participating in the program is a sign that the strategies selected are appropriate. The Secretary of Government considers the program's greatest strength to be the inter-institutional coordination, because this makes it possible for institutions to support actions with the resources of their own projects, thus using synergy to leverage the purposes, objectives and goals of the national project and local program.

The program's relevance is reflected in the results of the workshops held with children between ages 7 and 13 and adolescents between 14 and 17, as well as the complementary interviews (with children aged 7-13 and parents), as follows:

- The workshop with children between ages 7 and 13 found that they perceive themselves as mine workers with money to buy food for their families, purchase their clothing and pay all of their school expenses. At the same time, they consider themselves in poor health, and some believe they are in danger of being killed on the steep cliffs where they dig the earth to pan for gold. If they were not for mining, the children say, they would be studying, playing with friends (soccer, basketball, dolls, etc.), sharing with their families, watching television or swimming in the river. If they continue working in mining for three more years, they see themselves dropping out of school.

²⁵ Information from telephone interviews (with the legal representative and the program coordinator in Corposode and the local government representative), field visit with the collaboration of a professional from the area who did the interviews (with approximately 30 parents and two members of the NGO), workshops with 10 children between ages 10 and 13 and with 24 youths between ages 14 and 17, information from conversations, observations and review of certain files, documents and workshops of the NGO.

If they did not continue working in the mine for the next three years, they would imagine themselves studying to get ahead as college professionals or in sports.

- The interviews with this same group of children showed that they are studying, although they are usually behind the grade level appropriate for their age. They prefer studying to working because they see education as a way to get ahead in life. At the same time, they say they must work in order to earn money to buy what they need. They know about the program to withdraw children from mine labor and acknowledge being part of it. They say they agree with the program because they believe that if children get caught up in work, they drop out of school, and the program's goal is to keep children from working. They consider that good, because they can learn a great deal, relate to other children and other people, play, learn dynamics and study instead of working.
- The workshop and interviews with adolescents between ages 14 and 17, which consisted of putting together a model human body and explaining the function of each part, resulted in responses such as the following:
 - They repeatedly mentioned the hands as the body part that was most used. One youth indicated that the head was used most because that is where the brain, which is used for thinking and acting, is located. For mine labor, they identified the hands and feet as the most-used body parts.
- Parents responded massively to the request for interviews, demonstrating great enthusiasm for and expectations of the program. The proposal to withdraw their children from mining seemed positive to them, although they said it is sometimes necessary to take the children to the mine so they can learn to take care of themselves, learn to work and not develop vices that will make them lazy. One father said, "Mining is a hard life for a child whose life has barely begun. The body suffers before its time. They also run great risks working alone. In the mine, they can be buried in a rockfall. If they are withdrawn from mining, they will grow up more relaxed, in a better environment, and will learn to share with others."

Condoto has been identified as a municipality with a high level of child labor in mining, because there are no municipal policies to address the issue. There is also a lack of awareness among the families, children, youths and institutions about the negative impact of children's early entry into mine labor. These factors make the action program even more necessary and relevant.

Effectiveness

Despite the short time that has passed since the direct actions began (two months), significant progress has been made in institution building and direct intervention in health, education, recreation and culture, and discussion and contacts that will lead to development of the income-generation component have begun.

With regard to *institution building*, arrangements have been made to include the issue in municipal plans and programs, and some positive results are already visible. Program beneficiaries have been selected, awareness-raising activities have been held with them and with institutions, with good results, and synergy is arising from work commitments established with various institutions.

With regard to arrangements for including the issue of child labor in mining in policies, a close and productive relationship has been established with the municipal administration, which has supported the program in various ways: 1) A commitment has been signed, and it is hoped that this agreement will become a Decree through which the program will receive budget funding for 2003; 2) the issue was included in the Basic Health Care Plan for preventive health campaigns; 3) the Secretariat of Development

provided the opportunity for some children to enroll in SISBEN; 4) a representative of the municipal government is on the action program team; 5) the mayor has personally dedicated time to meetings with the team, becoming fairly involved in the program's ongoing implementation.

Although the selection of the beneficiary population has been difficult, because most people wanted to be included, inclusion criteria were established keeping in mind that the program seeks to reach the most vulnerable families and those that most need time and attention if child and adolescent labor are to be eliminated. Awareness raising has been done successfully with this population, and parents and other family members consider the program important for both themselves and their children, they value the training provided, the opportunities for sharing and the relationships that have been established, and they have become aware of the need to withdraw their children from mining and the possibilities offered by the program.

In the area of overall awareness, the achievements so far have increased the program's credibility with the population. This increasing credibility is attributed to the fact that "they have done everything they said they would do." The families, children and youths, therefore, are highly motivated and have increased their awareness of the need to withdraw children from mining because of the risks inherent in this type of work, the physical problems and illnesses they suffer and the effect it will have on their future lives, reducing their life expectancy and making it even more difficult to break the cycle of poverty and marginalization.

Progress has been made in signing commitments between parents and the implementing agency. Parents say that they have signed commitments to gradually withdraw their children from mining and to participate in all activities that the program offers them and their children.

Local institutions also show increased awareness and motivation. This has translated into letters of commitment with SENA, ICBF, INDECHO and the Secretariat of Education to include the program and its activities in their plans and programs. An inter-institutional process has also begun that has connected the local government with these entities for final approval of the inter-institutional action plan.

Nevertheless, the program could encounter major difficulties in getting these institutions to really assume their responsibilities and commitments so that the actions are continuing and sustainable.

In the area of *direct intervention*, the action program in Condoto has been included on the agendas of municipal agencies working in the areas of education, health, recreation and culture, with the following accomplishments:

In education, the program has established connections with the Departmental Secretariat of Education, the director of School District (Nucleus) No. 23 and the Escipi3n School in an effort to reinforce the Parents' School. Progress has been made in discussion of strategies for including the issue of child labor in mining in nine educational institutions. Enrollment opportunities and remedial educational alternatives have been arranged. Recreational equipment has been acquired and schools are being adapted.

In the area of education, there is significant understanding of the program, and those who have become involved have made a decisive commitment to implementing it. They say that they have a greater understanding of the risks and negative consequences of child labor in mining for the children's development, and have become involved in the program to seek strategies that will provide more appropriate, personalized pedagogical attention for child miners, as well as relevant support for the children's families. Teachers who have received training from the NGO have made efforts to pass what they have learned on to parents. Corpasode has been involved in regular meetings with parents and there is

discussion of the implications of what has been learned for daily school activities, so that these learnings will be included not only in annual plans, but also in the IEPs.

Despite the progress, the principal of the Escipión School expressed concern about the government's commitment to an educational policy to promote access to education, encourage children to stay in school and promote literacy as strategies for preventing and eliminating child labor. The principal said that child miners must be given special educational opportunities, such as scholarships, transportation assistance and help with educational expenses.

In the area of health care, the following activities have been carried out in Condoto: 1) health-care training; 2) day-long health events (parasite control, fluoride treatment and vaccinations); 3) gradual inclusion of families in the social security system; 4) arrangements with ICBF for projects for cafeterias in schools, children's homes and homes for mothers and children; 5) nutrition follow-up for children through height and weight monitoring; 6) addressing the issue of domestic violence.

In the area of recreation and culture, the community has become involved in organizing and carrying out free-time activities.

Finally, in the area of *income generation*, the following activities have been carried out:

- Letter of commitment from SENA to collaborate in proposing alternatives for vocational education and training for youths and adults to help them diversify their income sources, in coordination with the multi-sector training center.
- Significant progress in local awareness of the fact that children should not work.
- There is evidence that children would withdraw from work if they had a way to pay for their studies and if they learned a trade that would enable them to earn the money they need.
- Parents hope that the program will also help them get out of mining because "we're hardly finding anything and there are days when we go hungry." They hope the program will help them establish alternative income-generating activities.
- The population has high expectations with regard to SENA.

There is a great deal of concern in Condoto about this component. The NGO coordinator considers it one of the program's greatest potential problems, because it requires that families really see and have other employment alternatives. For most, however, it is not clear what alternatives the program could offer to enable them to generate income to replace their children's earnings.

The director and the teacher interviewed said that while it is necessary to offer children alternatives to work, they are concerned about how to replace the economic assistance that these children provide to their families. They express the conundrum this way: "We help them from a physical standpoint, but what will happen with the family's economic needs?"

Efficiency

Despite the short time and intensity of activities, the work team in Condoto has fulfilled the program's purpose. As they point out, the program is intensive because of the quantity of activities and the short timeframe for each. So far, the team has dealt with this with great dedication, with the commitment of a great deal of additional time by the work team and the community. It was noted, however, that the municipality's infrastructure and services made the team's work complex and costly and that telephone and electricity services and Internet access are deficient.

Sustainability

Sustainability is well under way from the standpoint of making the issue visible in municipal policy-making agencies, including it in the municipal development plan and committing budget resources to address it. Institutionalization will require linking the program to development programs from now on and helping to obtain loans for the families.

The program has not yet been included in the municipality's project bank, but an agreement was recently signed with the planning team and the Secretariat of Development indicating their willingness to implement the program. The agreement shows that they are familiar with the action plan jointly developed and approved as part of the program to provide care to vulnerable children and their families. Resources dedicated to this program will be used for components of the entire action plan.

According to the NGO coordinator, one decisive factor in sustainability is SENA's commitment to carrying out actions related to the income-generation component (vocational training and assistance in developing economic alternatives). This agency, however, is currently in a restructuring process that will last until September 2003.

Corpasode's learnings are considered a guarantee that the program is being accepted, that it can bring people together and that it can take full advantage of the connections and synergies that have been mentioned. The principal and teacher of the Escipión School believe that continued financial support will be necessary to ensure the program's continuity, because all the objectives cannot be met in one year.

Another factor mentioned in the workshop held to share the results of the mid-term evaluation, which is a concern for the action program, is the problem of violence posed by the presence of armed groups operating outside the law. This affects the program's implementation, because it limits the actions and activities that can be carried out in the planned areas, makes transportation more expensive, makes it difficult for education specialists to travel to workshops, hampers ILO/IPEC's supervision in the area and, in the case of this evaluation, kept the CINDE team from traveling to the municipality. In addition, various forms of violence related to the armed conflict and common crime have recently begun to have a serious effect on Chocó, making security difficult. So far, the program team has managed to deal with this situation.

Administration and management

The program began in September, when the current coordinator, appointed by the mayor, took over and the coordinator of the NGO began working. She received training from IPEC and had the opportunity to participate in a workshop in Bogotá, sharing program experiences with people from the other three participating municipalities. The coordinator characterizes the relationship with IPEC as supportive and says that the local government supports the components of the program.

As the delegate appointed by the mayor to support and oversee the program, the Secretariat of Social Development has direct responsibility and a serious commitment and participates actively in all program activities (meetings, logistical support, invitations to members of the education and health sectors occasionally issued directly by the local government).

The selection of the NGO was ideal, given its experience and knowledge of both the zone and the issue. The team is committed and has demonstrated great ownership of the program and appreciation of its relevance. The team also has great local credibility. Carrying out the work has been difficult, requiring 14- to 16-hour workdays to implement and meet such a tight schedule, in which actions practically overlap. Many of those interviewed commented that the team works around the clock, seven days a week.

The Corpasode team has also developed a great deal of clarity about the program, has adapted it well to local conditions and its own experience, and has gained new knowledge. It has organized the work and information well and its ideas about the actions are clear.

For the NGO's program coordinator, the greatest concern has to do with the final stage, when management of resources is turned over to the local people. The coordinator believes that it is important to have a solid organization of families and institutions for this final phase. With appropriate management of resources by the stakeholders involved in sustaining the program, it will be feasible to create many jobs in the municipality, as well as a series of changes among the parents and in entities such as Corpasode.

CHAPTER 3: CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

This section presents the conclusions from the preceding analysis. They are intended to summarize the main findings and recommendations for areas deserving particular attention. The recommendations are included in italics.

1. In general, the project and the action programs for preventing and eliminating child labor in small-scale traditional mining are relevant as proposed and implemented, because they are adapted to national needs and those of the local zones. The types of strategies proposed place a priority on care of working children and their families, with special attention to education, health, recreation and income generation. *To keep children in school, changes are needed in pedagogical methodology and curriculum to make education attractive to children so it can really compete with work.*
2. Income generation must be an important strategy, but it must be implemented with prudence and good judgment in order to be effective. It is necessary to create conditions to help the groups to be assisted mature, and those who lead their formation and manage loans and donations must be experienced, in order to avoid failure and a return of children to the mines. *We recommend the prompt initiation of actions aimed at forming such groups, so that when the year of activities ends, they and their actions have reached a basic level. It is also recommended that marketing studies be done before the groups are formed and production activities are fostered.*
3. The issue of institution building, seeking national and local commitments from government entities, is a priority. Emphasis is being placed on this area, and it is important to continue in this vein to catalyze the project's sustainability. Some municipal authorities demonstrate a certain fear of assuming complete responsibility for managing, leading and financing the project. They understand the importance of doing so and demonstrate interest, but they worry about the withdrawal of the NGOs. This is a conflict between dependence and autonomy with regard to the program. This issue may be the project's greatest challenge. *It is necessary, therefore, to work with these entities at the local level, seeking their empowerment and their interest so that when NGO leadership ends, they can continue autonomously in carrying out actions related to the withdrawal of children from work and prevention of their entry into work. When political campaigns begin for the election of new municipal administrations, it will be important to contact the candidates to raise their awareness about the issue and gain their commitment to addressing it.*
4. Although there are no resources allocated to it, the issue of cultural patterns must be taken into consideration and included in awareness-raising actions of the action programs. The importance of cultural change has been indicated by preliminary studies and underscored by experiences in other countries in the sub-region. If it is not explicitly addressed, long-term results may be less than expected. It is clear that cultural patterns cannot be changed in one year, *but work must at least begin with direct beneficiaries and institutions committed to the project. It may also be important to achieve greater participation by program beneficiaries in forming groups in which they can contribute to the programs, strengthening their personal development and democratic decision-making skills.*
5. Related to the cultural issue, in some municipalities concern has arisen over the term "elimination," because it involves cultural patterns that are deeply rooted and difficult to change within the project timeframe. While arguments made by the NGOs may be valid, it is important to stress that the project's commitment is to the elimination of child labor, and any other approach could send ambiguous messages. In addition, each municipality has formulated specific goals for the elimination of child labor within a defined population, which indicates that they have considered this a feasible result. *To resolve this conceptual conflict, it is recommended that the issue be addressed explicitly in*

workshops and meetings held by IPEC, in a dialogue that will lead to minimal agreements for progressing toward clarity about the concept of elimination of child labor.

6. Various kinds of progress are seen in the municipalities, but it is clear that as the programs move forward, the sense of achievement and progress increases, providing motivation for continued action. *Communication among the various NGOs is important, therefore, to foster a sharing of experiences so that the zones where less progress has been made are motivated to advance and to learn from the programs that are farther along.*
7. Transfer of commitments from the national to the municipal level is being complicated by the system of decentralization being implemented in the country and because of budget cutbacks in government agencies. This is a factor that negatively affects achievement of goals and objectives, or at least makes achievement more difficult. This is an area that has been addressed to a great extent by the national coordinating office, and in which it is necessary *to keep working, understanding that the progress may not be great, but the gains will be important.*
8. Related to the preceding point, management and coordination actions, especially in the area of contact with authorities and government agencies, is requiring a great deal of time on the part of project and program leaders (IPEC and NGOs). *It is important to be aware that these activities are part of the project and programs, so the coordinators do not feel that they are making great efforts to contact and gain commitments from these people and agencies and dedicating little time to implementation of direct interventions.*
9. IPEC's actions in support of the NGOs are generally considered valuable, because they have enabled the NGOs to appropriately structure the action programs and enter into the project dynamic proposed by IPEC. Nevertheless, some coordinators perceive a high degree of control and little autonomy within this supervisory task. *It is recommended that an opportunity for sharing be arranged in which both IPEC and the NGOs can analyze the positive aspects and difficulties in the coordination relationship and seek agreements that guarantee IPEC that the proposed goals and objectives will be achieved, while providing the NGOs with the autonomy that they consider necessary to carry out the actions according to regional characteristics.*

ANNEX: EVALUATION METHODOLOGY

This section describes the indicators proposed, information-gathering instruments, sources of information and a description of informants.

1. DESIGN OF INDICATORS

Because the action programs were just beginning, the indicators initially proposed were refined after the evaluation began. Table 8 shows the dimensions, sub-dimensions and indicators that were evaluated.

TABLE 8: DIMENSIONS, SUB-DIMENSIONS AND INDICATORS OF THE EVALUATION

DIMENSIÓN	SUB-DIMENSIONS	INDICATORS
RELEVANCE Adaptation of the plans to the real situation	Adaptation of plans and their intervention activities to the situation of mining in the zone	- Adaptation of action programs to expectations created by the project. - Adaptation of strategies and activities to the results of the study of the region (national and local).
	Addressing the issue from a cultural standpoint	- Includes strategies that take into account the people's cultural concept of child labor and attitudes toward work and children.
	Involvement of the population in the project	- Forms of participation by people in the intervention, type of participation, sustainability of the participation.
EFFECTIVENESS Fulfillment of goals or degree to which the project's objectives and goals have been reached. Also includes unforeseen results.	Achievement of intermediate goals	- Type of goals or objectives achieved - Characterization of accomplishments - Progress with regard to concepts of and attitudes toward work and child labor. - Appropriate identification of agencies to provide project services. - Connections with key stakeholders and strengthening of the capacity of implementing agencies.
	Comparison of plan with implementation: Degree to which strategies contribute to achievement of goals.	- Successful experiences or practices - Effectiveness of strategies used and possible alternatives
	Comparison mechanisms for evaluating the operational plan and goals.	- Gathering of information about progress indicators - Maintenance or modification of original progress indicators in light of national/local baseline studies. - Offering of appropriate evidence of progress indicators with regard to project's effects and impact. - Need to gather additional information
	Intervening factors	- Factors and processes that affect achievement of objectives or application of strategies - Ways in which they have been affected - Types of factors - Changes caused by these factors
EFFICIENCY Cost-benefit relationship. Minimization of costs to generate a predetermined quantity of results or optimization of the combination of inputs to maximize the output	Appropriate management of spending	- Efficiency in the use of resources - Better alternatives for use of resources - Changes in use of resources - Relationship between change and achievement of goals - Spending breakdown by component
	Appropriate cost-benefit relationship	- Expected results of project and program justify costs - More efficient alternatives for spending - Relationship of actions to costs

DIMENSIÓN	SUB-DIMENSIONS	INDICATORS
	Appropriate relationship between proposed use of resources and timeline	- Appropriate use of resources for achievement of planned results, according to proposed timeline.
SUSTAINABILITY Anticipation of probability of sustainability	Sustainability mechanisms included in the design	- Planning of strategies and mechanisms to ensure sustainability - Actions implemented to foster sustainability. - Actions planned to empower local stakeholders and institutions - Progress in creating conditions for ensuring sustainability.
	Participatory areas that can ensure sustainability	- Priority placed on project by beneficiaries and recipients - Management capacity, commitment and political will of the country and zones to continue working in this area. - Use of participatory approach in design of action programs and mechanisms for stakeholder participation. - Functioning of planned mechanisms (National Commission on Child Labor, local committees, networks of institutions). - Interaction and support provided by IPEC team in each region - Involvement of program beneficiaries in design of action plans. - Guarantee of future participation.
ADMINISTRATION AND MANAGEMENT Macro and micro project guidelines. Appropriate management for putting them into practice.	Guidelines clear and sufficient	- Municipal coordinators have clear guidelines and means of directing the project
	Guidelines adapted to context	- Guidelines provided for meeting specific needs identified at national and zonal levels.
	Support for project at macro level	- Appropriate, sufficient and flexible backing by project personnel
	Management forms and styles	- Strengths of project management and coordination of action programs - Weaknesses of project management and coordination of action programs.

2. INFORMATION-GATHERING TECHNIQUES AND SOURCES

To gather information about each of the dimensions and sub-dimensions included in the preceding table, the following instruments were designed:

TABLE 9: INFORMATION-GATHERING TECHNIQUES, BY INFORMATION SOURCE

INFORMATION-GATHERING TECHNIQUE	SOURCE OF INFORMATION	DIMENSIONS CONSIDERED
LOCAL LEVEL (MUNICIPALITIES)		
Interview	NGO Coordinator	Relevance, effectiveness, efficiency, administration and management, sustainability
Interview	Coordinator designated by local government	Relevance, effectiveness, efficiency (related to actions and timeline), sustainability, administration and management
Interview	Mayor	Relevance, effectiveness, sustainability, administration and management
Interview	Technical committee (Social Policy Committee) or designated members	Relevance, effectiveness, efficiency (related to actions and timeline), sustainability, administration and management

INFORMATION-GATHERING TECHNIQUE	SOURCE OF INFORMATION	DIMENSIONS CONSIDERED
Workshop-Interview	Parents	Effectiveness: especially concepts of child labor and knowledge of AP
Workshop-Interview	Children and youths	Effectiveness: especially concepts of child labor and knowledge of AP
NATIONAL LEVEL		
Interview	National IPEC Coordinator	Relevance, effectiveness, efficiency, administration and management, sustainability
Interview	Members of Technical Committee	Relevance, effectiveness, sustainability
SUB-REGIONAL LEVEL		
Written questionnaire	Sub-regional coordinating office	Relevance, sustainability, administration and management
OVERALL LEVEL		
Analysis of documentation	Documents (see list of documents in Appendix 2)	Relevance, effectiveness, efficiency, sustainability, administration and management

3. DESCRIPTION OF INFORMANTS

Of the sources of information proposed in the preceding section *in each municipality*, because of various circumstances different information was gathered depending on access to the sources. In particular, it should be noted that it was impossible to travel to Condoto from Bogotá because of lack of security in the zone. Telephone interviews were done and contact was made with people in the area who had experience in interviews and workshops, so that they could carry out some of the planned activities (workshops and interviews). It should also be noted that it was impossible to interview any of the four mayors. Instead, interviews were done with their designated representatives.

Table 10 summarizes information about the informants, by municipality.

TABLE 10: SOURCE OF INFORMATION, BY MUNICIPALITY

SOURCE OF INFORMATION	MUNICIPALITY			
	NEMOCÓN	SOGAMOSO	MUZO	CONDOTO
Mayor	NO	NO	Government secretary	NO
NGO Coordinator	YES	YES	YES	YES
Coordinator designated by local govt.	YES	YES	YES	YES
Technical Committee	- Unable to make appointment for interview	- Delegated to the social policy council. - ICBF Director - Director of nucleus	- District (nucleus) director - Social Welfare Coordinator	Principal and teacher of Escipión School
Parents	4	9	8	30 (group)
Youths	-	12	15	24
Children	40	25	-	10

At the national level, certain members of the Technical Committee were interviewed: 1) Ministry of Health; 2) Ministry of Education; 3) Ministry of Labor; 4) SENA; 5) ICBF. It was not possible to contact the UNDP representative, and the MINERCOL representative to the committee delegated the task to another functionary who was on vacation. In IPEC, the project coordinator was interviewed. At the sub-regional level, a response was obtained through a questionnaire.

4. SHARING OF RESULTS, EXPANSION AND VERIFICATION OF INFORMATION AND ANALYSIS

During the week of December 16, a workshop was held in Bogotá to share the progress report on the action programs. This event served to verify the value of progress made throughout the project, compare it with information supplied by the municipalities, expand on it and refine it. This was done in two ways: 1) Each municipality was given two documents of evaluation results, one corresponding to the summary of the municipal action program and one related to the mid-term evaluation results. 2) On Wednesday, December 18, the CINDE evaluation team presented the results at a workshop and gathered observations, recommendations and clarifications about the content. The information obtained through this process was incorporated into this final evaluation report.

APPENDIX: ADDITIONAL COMMENTS BY IPEC

This section has been included in the document to provide additional information on aspects of the evaluation not sufficiently covered in the main report. More specifically, it deals with two basic issues:

- 1) The activities undertaken and the main results achieved in the area of institutional strengthening as a strategy for ensuring the sustainability of the benefits, both at the national and at the municipal level
 - 2) The adjustments in the project in view of the difficulties faced by MINERCOL for participating in specific activities —formalization of mines, awareness raising, establishment of ethical codes of conduct, among others— as planned
- 1) Objective 1 of the project is aimed at developing and guaranteeing the solidity of the capacities of the institutions with competency in the issue of child labor in mining, so that they can include among their regular functions the prevention of early involvement in small-scale traditional mining and the withdrawal of children from this type of work. Achievement of this goal is an essential element of the project's sustainability strategy.

The process designed to accomplish this objective includes the following stages:

At the national level:

- Inclusion of the issue of child labor in the National Development Plan of the government that took office in Colombia in August 2002 and in institutional plans related to children's issues, education, health, labor, mining and information, in order to make it a national priority. It is difficult for issues not included in these plans to receive the necessary technical and economic resources for implementation during a government's administration.
- Inclusion of the issue in the Third National Plan for Elimination of Child Labor, which must be formulated for implementation between 2003 and 2005. Since 1995, this plan has enabled 22 government agencies and employers' and workers' organizations to coordinate actions for the prevention and elimination of child labor. Both the preliminary version of the National Development Plan and the National Committee for the Elimination of Child Labor, which met in November 2002, have committed themselves to drawing up the Third Plan.
- Strengthening of inter-institutional coordinating bodies responsible for implementing plans for the prevention and elimination of child labor. Colombia has a National Committee on the Elimination of Child Labor and a Technical Secretariat responsible for ensuring that it operates. Until December 2002, the Secretariat consisted of the former Ministry of Labor and Social Security and IPEC. At that time, IPEC turned over the Secretariat to the Committee as part of its process of transferring functions, and it was agreed that the new Ministry of Social Protection, the Ministry of Education and the ICBF would also join the Secretariat.
- Inclusion of the issue of the worst forms of child labor in the new Children's Law being drafted with the new administration. This law will reform the current Juvenile Code to bring it into line with international instruments ratified by Colombia (the Convention on the Rights of the Child, ILO Conventions, etc.).
- Awareness-raising workshops with employees of government agencies to gain their commitment to the issue, as established in the project work plan.
- Development and implementation of mechanisms for monitoring plans and programs. The SIMPOC - DANE project included the creation of an information system for monitoring the national plans for

elimination of child labor and the projects carried out as part of these plans, including the prevention and elimination of child labor in small-scale traditional mining.

- Inclusion of the issue in action plans of the principal labor organizations.
- Inclusion of the issue on the agendas of employers' organizations in the mining sector.

At the municipal level:

Because municipal administration in Colombia is decentralized, a process similar to that carried out at the national level was planned to ensure the reinforcement of institutional capacities and the project's sustainability. The planned phases are:

- Inclusion of the issue in municipal plans or establishment of specific municipal budget line items, approved by Municipal Councils, for the prevention and elimination of child labor.
- Formulation of municipal plans for the elimination of child labor in small-scale traditional mining in the municipalities of influence.
- Awareness-raising workshops to gain the commitment of local authorities regarding the issue.
- Inclusion of project beneficiaries in regular children's services, as well as education, health care and labor services.
- Strengthening or creation of inter-institutional coordinating bodies responsible for implementing the plans.
- Development of mechanisms for monitoring plans and programs.

The following table summarizes the main actions carried out in implementing the institution-building strategy and the results obtained.

Phase	Actions	Results
National level		
Inclusion of the issue in the National Development Plan and institutional plans for Labor, Health, Education, Children and Information.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Preparation of a proposal for including the issue. • Submission of document to the National Committee for study and comments. • Arrangements with the ministries of Labor, Health and Education and the Colombian Family Welfare Institute (<i>Instituto Colombiano de Bienestar Familiar</i>, ICBF), the National Statistics Department (<i>Departamento Nacional de Estadísticas</i>, DANE) and the National Planning Department (<i>Departamento Nacional de Planeación</i>, DNP) to include the proposal in the new Development Plan. • Participation in the Alliance Group of civil society organizations and cooperation agencies for inclusion of children's issues in the Development Plan. • Meeting with ICBF directors to determine priorities to be included in the Plan • Review of preliminary version of the Development Plan and preparation of comments, which were presented to the National Planning Council. • Meeting with DNP for further analysis of inclusion of the issue in the Plan. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Issue included in final version presented to the National Congress for approval, establishing as a priority the elimination of child labor in mining (see appendix). • Issue explicitly included in the plans of the Ministry of Social Protection and ICBF • Appointment of full-time and part-time professional staff to implement issue in ICBF and Ministry of Social Protection. • Arrangements with DANE for budget allocation for application of a child labor module in 2003 • Participation in current task force formed to formulate the 10-year plan on children's issues.

Inclusion of issue in National Plan for Elimination of Child Labor 2003 – 2005	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Participation in study and evaluation of national policy for elimination of child labor 1995-2002 • Arrangements for formation of a new National Committee Technical Secretariat for formulation of the new plan. • Meeting with Ministry of Social Protection to define actions for formulation of new Plan. • Establishment, jointly by Min. Social Protection, ICBF, Min. Education and IPEC, of steps for formulation of new Plan. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Positive decision by National Committee to formulate new Plan for Elimination of Child Labor, with priority on the worst forms (including small-scale traditional mining) • Preliminary proposal by Technical Secretariat and IPEC on steps for formulation
Inclusion of issue in new Children's Law	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Participation in meetings called by ICBF and the Alliance for formulation and coordination for approval of new Children's Law • Submission of articles on Child Labor and Child Labor in Small-Scale Traditional Mining to consultants hired for this purpose. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Group of consultants for formulation of new Children's Law hired with resources of agencies involved in the Alliance. • Legislative documents on child labor and small-scale traditional mining made available.
Strengthening of inter-institutional coordinating bodies	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Periodic meetings with Inter-Institutional Committee and Technical Committee to inform, analyze and establish actions for development of a National Plan to include the issue of small-scale traditional mining. • Participation, jointly with former Ministry of Labor, in National Committee's Technical Secretariat. • Technical assistance to Committee's current Technical Secretariat (Min. Social Protection, Min Education, ICBF) • Training for members of Technical Secretariat in tools needed for carrying out their duties. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • National Committee active • Minutes of Committee meetings • Technical Secretariat, made up of national organizations, active (Min. Social Protection, Min. Education, ICBF) • Committee's member organizations trained in use of tools necessary for Committee to function.
Awareness-raising workshops with member agencies of the National Committee and government agencies with competency in this area	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Establishment of a schedule for awareness-raising workshops for members of the National Committee on Elimination of Child Labor and MINERCOL personnel. • Organization of events • Systematic documentation of workshop results 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 1 sub-regional workshop, 120 participants • 14 national events, 490 participants
Development of monitoring mechanisms for plans and programs	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Design and implementation of information system for monitoring national plans and projects for prevention and elimination of child labor, including small-scale traditional mining (see Web page: http://suamox01.dane.gov.co:7777/pls/tic/home) 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • System designed and implemented: Web page specifically includes issue of child labor in small-scale traditional mining.

Inclusion of issue in labor organization action plans	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Formulation of a joint Action Plan by the two main labor organizations, the CUT and the CTC, to contribute to the objective of prevention and elimination of child labor in small-scale traditional mining. • Coordination by the organizations' departments of Children and Youth to include the issue in their national guidelines. • Training for members of the organizations for the formulation and management of projects aimed at preventing and eliminating child labor in small-scale traditional mining. • Coordination with the new directors of the organizations to review and update the Action Plan. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Joint Action Plan document of CUT and CTC for prevention and elimination of child labor in small-scale traditional mining. • Demand by MINERCOL Workers Union to MINERCOL regarding actions implemented for the prevention and elimination of child labor in the sector (see appendix). • Training workshop for members of the labor organizations in the formulation and management of projects. • Initiative for a national event with new leaders of the major labor groups to endorse the action plans.
Inclusion of issue by employer organizations	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Preparation of a database of employers organizations in the mining sector (gold emeralds, coal, clay) • Awareness-raising workshop with organizations of employers in mining sector • Coordination to include issue on agenda of business association council 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Database of employers and business associations involved in mining • Notes of event held with employers
MUNICIPAL LEVEL		
Inclusion of issue in municipal plans	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Coordination with mayors of municipalities to include issue in municipal plans. • Signing of agreements with local governments to establish commitments to the objective of preventing and eliminating child labor in small-scale traditional mining. • Presentation of the problem and the project to Municipal Councils. • Presentation of the problem and the project to governmental organizations of the municipality. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Agreements signed with mayors in three municipalities. • Agreements signed with governmental organizations in four municipalities. • Inclusion of specific line items for the issue of child labor in budgets of two municipalities.
Formulation of municipal plans for elimination of child labor in small-scale traditional mining	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Design of a methodology for the formulation of action plans on the issue in municipalities. • Coordination by NGO for formulation of the plans. • Preparation of preliminary versions of plans and presentation to municipal inter-institutional coordinating bodies for review and comment. • Preparation of final version of plan and presentation to inter-institutional coordinating bodies for approval. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Four municipal action plans formulated and approved by Social Policy Councils or Municipal Committees on Elimination of Child Labor.
Awareness-raising workshops to gain commitment from municipal authorities	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Preparation of workshop methodologies and content by partner NGOs. • Holding of workshops • Systematic documentation of workshop results 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • In Condoto (Chocó) • 10 workshops, 509 participants • In Muzo (Boyacá) • 2 events, 65 participants • In Nemocón (Cundinamarca) • 7 events, 305 participants • In Sogamoso • 6 events, 201 participants

Inclusion of beneficiaries in regular children's services and education, health and labor services	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • According to established plans and agreements, coordinate the inclusion of beneficiaries in regular ICBF programs (school cafeterias), Education Secretariats (formal education), Health Secretariats (public health insurance), National Apprenticeship Service (job training). • Coordination to direct special programs toward beneficiaries: health brigades, recreational and cultural activities. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Children prevented from becoming involved in work: 492 • Children withdrawn: 271 • Children who have reduced work hours: 540 • Children who regularly attend classes in formal education system: 1,278 • Children included in public health insurance system: 1,453
Strengthening or creation of inter-institutional coordinating bodies	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Activation of the Social Policy Council in Nemocón (Cundinamarca) and inclusion of issue on agenda • Insertion of issue on agendas of Social Policy Councils in Condoto (Chocó) and Sogamoso (Boyacá) • Formation of Municipal Committee on Prevention and Elimination of Child Labor in Small-Scale Traditional Mining of Emeralds in Muzo (Boyacá) 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Four inter-institutional coordinating bodies active in formulating and implementing action plans.
Development of mechanisms for monitoring plans	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Preparation of terms of reference and contracting of a consultant to design a monitoring mechanism for plans for prevention and elimination of child labor in small-scale traditional mining. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Terms of reference prepared

2) MINERCOL is a state-run industrial and commercial enterprise responsible for managing mineral and coal resources, promoting areas related to the industry and managing the collection and distribution of economic resources. It is the governmental body responsible for fostering and promoting mining activity and providing assistance to communities involved in this activity. It was created in 1998 through the merger of two state-run enterprises, Ecocarbón Ltda. and Mineralco S.A

ECOCARBON had been involved in activities aimed at addressing the problem of child labor in small-scale traditional coal mining since 1994 and was a member of the National Committee on the Elimination of Child Labor. In 1999, MINERCOL formulated an action plan to expand these activities to other small-scale traditional mining sectors. With support from IPEC, in 2000 arrangements were made for the formulation and approval of a project aimed at preventing and eliminating child labor in the small-scale traditional mining of emeralds, coal, clay and gold.

In the project, MINERCOL took on the following responsibilities:

1. Arranging with the Royalty Fund for approval of funds for implementing the awareness-raising components nationwide, the formal organization of mining activities in sectors where this was viable, and direct intervention in municipalities where there were fewer children involved in small-scale traditional mining.²⁶
2. With resources approved by the Royalty Fund, directly implement the formal organization component in areas where mining activity could be viable. Formalization involves improved technology for small-scale traditional mining, organization of families in associations for

²⁶ Colombia created the National Royalty Fund (*Fondo Nacional de Regalías*) in 1994. It is funded with royalties from mining exploitation not assigned to the producing Departments and Municipalities. The Fund was established to promote mining, preservation of the environment and regional investment projects defined as a priority in the regional development plans. The administration of the Fund is ensured by the National Royalty Commission, dependent of the Ministry of Mining and Energy. MINERCOL presented the original project to the Commission for approval of the use of national resources to complement IPEC-USDOL project.

extraction and commercialization of the ore, adoption of codes of conduct and a system for certifying that the product was produced without child labor. MINERCOL also agreed to subcontract awareness-raising and direct intervention actions.

3. Participation in the Project Committee responsible for coordinating joint implementation of actions agreed to in project documents, through arrangements by MINERCOL with the Royalty Fund and by IPEC with the United States Department of Labor.

MINERCOL encountered various difficulties in the implementation of these commitments. As a result, IPEC had to make adjustments in order to meet the planned objectives. One of the first obstacles involved the resources approved for implementation of the project. In the formulation phase, MINERCOL and IPEC reached a preliminary agreement to matching contributions of US\$1,200,000, for a total of US\$2,400,000. When IPEC approved US\$800,477, however, MINERCOL considered it necessary to revise the goals agreed to with the Royalty Fund. This process took approximately one year, with the new version approved in January 2003.

In the revised version of the project, the component aimed at the formal organization of mining activities was eliminated. Additionally, it was decided that the implementation of the other components (institutional strengthening, education, health and recreation, awareness raising and income generation for adults) would be limited to municipalities with no IPEC presence, in order to replicate and expand the scope of the intervention.

A second factor that has significantly affected the fulfillment of MINERCOL's commitments was the decision by the last administration and the current government to downsize and eventually liquidate the company. In 2002, the decision was made to close several of its regional offices and negotiate severance packages with a significant number of employees. Among the officials who left the company were those responsible for the Program for Integration of Mining Areas, which was coordinating the formal organization of small-scale traditional mining in sectors where this was deemed viable.

As part of a State Restructuring Plan, the new government, which took office in August 2002, decided to close MINERCOL, a process that is currently under way. In meetings with MINERCOL officials, letters and telephone calls, IPEC has requested information about the agency or body that will take over MINERCOL's functions. So far, no specific response has been received. IPEC has also made contact with the Ministry of Mines, which has indicated that the Colombian Family Welfare Institute (ICBF) is the competent authority in the area of prevention and elimination of child labor.

Various measures have been taken to address the difficulties that have arisen in the joint implementation of the project with MINERCOL:

1. The project included income-generation activities to provide an alternative to small-scale traditional mining for families where formal organization of mining was not viable. Because of the difficulty in implementing the formalization component with MINERCOL, however, resources were included to implement the alternative income component in all action programs. An expert in this area was also contracted to provide technical assistance for the implementation of this component in the four municipalities where the intervention is being carried out.
2. Work is being done with mining companies and business associations to raise awareness and encourage the adoption of a code of conduct to improve working conditions in small-scale traditional mining and avoid the involvement of children in this activity. Meetings are currently being held with company officials in each of the municipalities where the intervention is being carried out.
3. Various awareness-raising actions have been carried out. The issue has been included in various workshops and awareness-raising events nationwide with resources from national organizations or

with other IPEC projects being implemented in the country (see table in preceding section). In addition, all action programs allocated resources for awareness-raising materials and activities in the municipalities. The National Coordinating Office has also produced materials to assist the municipalities and help raise awareness and provide information at the national level.

4. The budget was revised to reduce the amount allocated to the project's administrative expenses and make more funds available for direct intervention (for a total of US\$33,500). These funds have been used to reinforce implementation of the awareness-raising and income-generation components that we have described.
5. Joint efforts have been strengthened with members of the National Committee for Elimination of Child Labor and especially with the ICBF to include the issue in the 10-Year Plan for Children that the agency is designing, as well as in its regular operations. The action program that was scheduled to be closed out in Condoto (Chocó) has been reformulated with the ICBF to design a model that can be included in existing ICBF programs for pre-teen clubs and youth clubs.
6. Coordination continued with MINERCOL for as long as necessary to establish mechanisms for joint implementation of the project, but the results were not positive because of the circumstances that we have described. Objectives 2 and 3 of the project were not revised until all possibilities for meeting them had been exhausted. Not until January 2003 did MINERCOL definitely confirm the elimination of the component for formal organization of small-scale traditional mining.

While the measures that have been taken do not completely resolve the difficulties that have arisen in implementation of the project, they have constituted a response that has made appropriate implementation possible. As we reported in the March 2003 progress report, there has been a gradual decrease in the number of hours that children spend working in small-scale traditional mining; beneficiaries have been included in regular education, health and children's programs; and progress has been made in implementation of the alternative income-generation component. As of February 2003, the main indicators showed that 492 children had been prevented from becoming involved in this type of work; 1,278 regularly attended classes in the formal education system; and 1,453 were included in the public health insurance program.

This adaptation process has required intensive coordination at both the national and municipal levels to meet the planned goals with the resources available.