



Support to Public Employment Services in Lebanon: Strengthening the Capacity of the National Employment Authority

Independent Final Mid-Term Evaluation

LEB/08/01M/CAN

Prepared by:

**Raouf F. Khouzam
Senior Evaluator**

**Final Version
September 2010**

ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

The Evaluator would like to extend his appreciation and gratitude to H.E. Mr. Botros Harb the Minister of Labour for the opportunity to meet and exchange views with him despite his extremely busy schedule.

Special thanks are due to Ms. Nada Al-Nashif the Director of ILO Regional Office for Arab States, Mr. Gregor Schulz the project Chief Technical Advisor and Ms. Rasha Tabbara the National Programme Officer for their support during the field visit.

The directives of Mr. Jean-François Klein the Chief of Regional Programming Services and the Evaluation Manager during the field visit are highly appreciated.

The remarkable and efficient management of all the mission logistics by Ms. Rania Hokayem the project National Coordinator is acknowledged.

The Evaluator is also thankful to the ILO ROAS team for their constructive comments on the first draft of this report.

Last but not least, the Evaluator is deeply grateful to all those who generously gave time and expertise to help the completion of this work.

Any mistakes that might be in this document are the sole responsibility of the Evaluator.

*Raouf F. Khouzam
Senior Evaluator
September 2010*

Table of Contents

<i>ACKNOWLEDGEMENT</i>	i
List of Acronyms.....	iv
Executive Summary.....	v
I. PROJECT BACKGROUND.....	2
1. Lebanon’s Agony:.....	2
2. Project Inception.....	2
3. CIDA’s Effort to Support Lebanon.....	4
4. Brief Project Description.....	4
5. Project Management.....	6
II. EVALUATION BACKGROUND and METHODOLOGY.....	6
III. MAIN FINDINGS.....	7
1. Examination of Project Design.....	7
1.1. Project Goal.....	7
1.2. Outcome One and Related Outputs and Activities.....	9
1.3. Outcome Two and Related Outputs and Activities.....	10
1.4. Outcome Three and Related Outputs and Activities.....	12
1.5. Performance Indicators.....	13
1.6. Risk Analysis.....	16
2. Project Achievements.....	19
3. Critical Issues Related to Project Performance.....	24
3.1 The Weakness of NEO.....	25
3.2 Three CTAs Took over Project Management within 2 Years.....	26
3.3 Three Ministers Headed the MOL within 2 years.....	26
3.4 The Missing Role of the Project Steering Committee (PSC).....	26
3.5 Excessive Delay in Furbishing the Three Pilot Offices.....	28
3.6 CIDA Freezes the Second Instalment.....	28
4. Success Factors.....	29
4.1 The Commitment the MOL Leadership.....	29
4.2 High Calibre of ILO/ROAS Project and Backstop Team.....	29
4.3 Project Ownership by NEOs Senior and Junior Officers.....	29
4.4 Stakeholders Enthusiasm.....	30
4.5 The “Agreement” between MOL and ILO/ROAS.....	30
4.6 Appointment of New Staff.....	30
4.7 Raising NEO’s Budget.....	30
4.8 Appointing an advisor to NEO’s acting DG.....	30
5. The Road Ahead.....	31
5.1 Scenario 1.....	31
5.2 Scenario 2.....	33
6. Efficiency and Effectiveness.....	33
7. Sustainability.....	34
8. Cross Cutting Issues.....	34
8.1. Gender.....	34
8.2. Poverty Alleviation.....	35
8.3. Tripartism.....	35
IV CONCLUSIONS.....	35
1. Lessons Learned.....	35
2. Good Practices.....	35
3. Recommendations.....	36
3.1 Recommendations for MOL.....	36

3.2 Recommendations for the project management	36
Annex A: TOR of the Mid-Term Evaluation.....	39
Annex B: List of Shared Documents.....	45
Annex C: List of Interviewed Stakeholders	47
Annex D: List of Participants in the Focus Group.....	49
Annex E: List of Workshop Participants	50
Annex F: MODIFIED LFA	53
Annex G: TERMS OF REFERENCE of JOINT PROJECT STEERING COMMITTEE	61
ANNEX H: Scenario 1	65
Annex J: Scenario 2	67

List of Tables

Table 1: The project goal and the outcomes	8
Table 2: Outcome 1 and related outputs and activities	9
Table 3: Modified Outcome 1 and related outputs and activities.....	10
Table 4: Outcome 2 and the relevant outputs and activities	11
Table 5: Outcome 2 and the relevant outputs and the modified activities.....	11
Table 6: Outcome 3 and the relevant output and activities	12
Table 7: Goal and impact performance indicators	13
Table 8: Outcomes' performance indicators	14
Table 9: Risk factors, rating and mitigation strategy	16
Table 10: Summary of the project achievements	19
Table 11: Summary of Scenario 1	32
Table 12: Summary Scenario 2.....	33

List of Acronyms

AOCS	Arab Occupational Classification System
BDS	Business Development Service
CAS	Central Administration for Statistics
CCA	Common Country Assessment
CGTL	General Confederation of Labour
CIDA	Canadian International Development Agency
CRI	Consultations and Research Institutes
CTA	Chief Technical Advisor
DG	Director General
ELE	Electronic Labour Exchange
GOL	Government of Lebanon
ILO/ROAS	ILO Regional Office for Arab States
LBL	Lebanese Lira
LFA	Logical Framework Analysis
LFS	Labour Force Surveys
LMI	Labour Market Information
LMIS	Labour Market Information System
M&E	Monitoring and Evaluation
MDG	Millennium Development Goals
MOL	Ministry of Labour
MOSA	Ministry of Social Affairs
MSMEs	Micro, Small, and Medium Enterprises
NEO	National Employment Office
NSSS	National Social Security System
OCIS	Occupational Classification Information System
PES	Public Employment Service
PMF	Performance Measurement Framework
PSC	Project Steering Committee
RBM	Result-Based Management approach
RMF	Rene Mouawad Foundation
TOR	Terms of Reference
TOT	Training of Trainers
UN	United Nations
UNDAF	UN Development Assistance Framework

Executive Summary

Support Public Employment Services in Lebanon: Strengthening the Capacity of the National Employment Authority”

Background & Context

Summary of the project purpose, logic and structure

The project seeks to ensure: (1) increased institutional capacity of the National Employment Office (NEO) of the Ministry of Labour (MOL) to assist the unemployed and underemployed and ensure efficient and equitable provision on employment services; (2) improved connectivity of municipalities, employers and job seekers to a general network of employment related information through the enhancement of the labour market information (LMIS) and the development of an occupational information system (OIS); and (3) enhanced self-employment opportunities through the establishment of successful small enterprises and improved skills.

The project covers every region in Lebanon. ILO/ROAS is the executing agency. The project is implemented through a small management team consisting of a Chief Technical Advisor (CTA) and a National Coordinator. It is technically backstopped by the Senior Skills and Employability Specialist at ILO/ROAS. The Regional Programming Service Unit provides programmatic support and facilitates the implementation of the project. Strategic guidance is provided by a Project steering committee (PSC) representing key stakeholders.

Present situation of project

The project has faced many difficulties beyond its control. The unfavourable work environment forced the project management to steer the execution of its activities more towards those activities under project control (or, in other words, the low-risk activities) focusing on capacity development activities, including staff training, preparation of training material and guidelines, mapping institutions practising relevant activities, hiring international and local consultants, and carrying out sector studies. Work on assignments that require contribution from other stakeholders was initiated but not completed. However, a number of recently emerged positive signs promise better project completion, if realized.

Purpose, scope and clients of the evaluation

The mid-term independent evaluation is conducted in order to examine the project implementation, enhance its performance, and garner stakeholder consensus around scenarios outlining the way forward for the remaining duration of the project. The primary clients of the evaluation are ILO/ROAS, MOL, NEO and CIDA. Secondary clients include social partners, and other units within ILO that may indirectly benefit from the knowledge generated by the evaluation.

Methodology of evaluation

Data and information were collected during a field mission to Beirut (July 19-27, 2010). The evaluation is based on a desk review of important documents, a series of personal interviews with key stakeholders, conference calls with previous senior project specialists, a focus group meeting with the trainees, and a visit to the Beirut Employment Office. The primary findings of the evaluation were presented to key stakeholders on the last day of the mission for the purpose of soliciting their comments.

Main Findings & Conclusions

A number of successive events impeded project progress as scheduled: (1) NEO has been incapacitated by a limited budget and understaffing (running by 20% of its force). (2) Two CTAs took over project management within 2 years. (3) Two Ministers took office within 2 years. This contributed to the delay of the appointment of the PSC, and the signing of the "Agreement" between the MOL and ILO/ROAS. The refurbishing of the pilot employment offices, and the appointment of the NEO's new staff was also considerably delayed. (4) PSC is supposed to meet semi-annually. It met only once since the project start. Consequently, many strategic decisions and directives were not made. (5) The payment of the second (and the last) instalment of the project fund was frozen subject to meeting 3 conditions to boost project performance: enhancing NEO's financial and human resources, refurbishing the pilot offices, and signing the agreement between the MOL and the ILO/ROAS.

The project has 3 outcomes, 6 outputs, and 24 activities. Achievements have been made in the area of capacity development. Senior and junior employment officers have received various trainings including a study tour to Canada, a field visit to Tunisia, and a workshop held in Lebanon jointly with the Jordanians concerning their system. In addition, several drafts of training materials, guidelines, self-instructional material are prepared. Project and some stakeholder staff went to Turin for an introductory course on LMIS.

Towards utilizing the resources available in Lebanon, the project mapped: relevant ILO projects to synergize their results, specialized NGOs to form referral systems and to hold job fairs, vocational and business training centres, and microfinance providers to support entrepreneurship.

An unscheduled, but directly relevant, achievement is the "Hospitality Sector Study" which is due in August 2010. It is an employment needs assessment conducted by means of an elaborated field survey.

An international consultant visited Lebanon twice to present a vision paper and work plan for LMIS.

The above results are achieved in an unfavourable work environment. This environment did not affect project efficiency because all operations are carried out according to the strict ILO regulations. Nonetheless, it adversely affected the effectiveness of the project because of: (i) the delay in introducing the new services to the unemployed and underemployed people specially the vulnerable group, and (ii) raising many of the risk factors associated with the realization of many outputs and outcomes.

A number of positive factors have emerged that will, if fully realized, boost project performance: (a) the determination and the commitment of H.E. the Minister and his top aides to the successful

completion of the project since NEO is a principal contributor to the formation of the long-awaited Lebanese labour policy, (b) the high calibre and devotion of the ILO/ROAS project team as has been demonstrated over the past two years, (c) the strong project ownership of NEOs staff shown during the meetings, (d) the enthusiasm of the key stakeholders to the project success as demonstrated during the interviews the Evaluator made and the reports of the international consultant, (e) the signing of the “Agreement” between MOL and ILO/ROAS, (f) the initiation of the procedure to appoint the new NEO 41 staff members (more than 100% of the current force), (g) raising NEO’s budget by 50% with another 50% being negotiated, and (h) appointing a senior advisor to support NEO’s management.

The above positive indicators invite the consideration of the road ahead of the project over the coming period. Assuming that the project will receive the second instalment of the fund at a suitable time, there are two possible end dates for the project. Scenario 1: the project ends as scheduled on March 31, 2011. Scenario 2 assumes that the project succeeds in securing CIDA’s approval for no-extra-cost extension to December 31, 2011.

- **Scenario 1:** 6 months or less is left to complete the rest of the project activities. This time is not enough to implement the main component of Outcome 2 (LMIS). The strategy to handle this situation is to cut down on the activities under Outcome 2 and utilize the savings mainly to support Outcome 3 (entrepreneurship) and Outcome 1 (capacity building).
- **Scenario 2:** An extension of the project to December 31, 2011 (at no additional cost to the funding agency) would allow the completion of the original project design.
- Regardless whether the project follows scenario 1 or 2; the current project team (1 CTA + 1 National Coordinator) needs to be supported by additional 3 technical officers and 0.5 administrative person. For the coming period requires simultaneous execution of project activities. This requires careful planning and intensive follow up beyond the ability of the present small team.

The project sustainability is assured by qualifying a carefully selected number of the already trained staff to be trainers for their new colleagues on the Canadian model.

Recommendations & Lessons Learned

Main recommendations and follow-up

- The MOL is recommended to refurbish the pilot employment offices without any further delay.
- Urgently, the project should request from CIDA an extension from March 31, 2011 to December 31, 2011 at no extra cost in order to compensate for the time lost because of circumstances beyond its control.
- PSC is better replaced by ad hoc committees to address specific urgent issues.
- CAS status should be upgraded from a key stakeholder to a full partner in the implementation of Outcome 2. Partnership to take the form of a signed protocol to unify the OCIS between the two institutions and to secure regular flow of data and information between them.

Important lessons learned

- Project inception documents have to be complete from the beginning (Inception Report, Logical Framework Analysis, and Performance Measurement Framework)
- Agreement between the Executing Agency and the host country has to be signed in the early stages of project implementation.
- The project should invest in achieving mutual understanding and securing effective participation of key stakeholders.

Support to Public Employment Services in Lebanon: Strengthening the Capacity of the National Employment Authority

Mid-Term Evaluation

Prepared by

**Raouf F. Khouzam
Senior Evaluator**

This report is a midterm evaluation of the project: *“Support Public Employment Services in Lebanon: Strengthening the Capacity of the National Employment Authority”*. The project aims at raising the level of employment as a vital tool to reduce poverty through assisting the Ministry of Labour (MOL) and its arm the National Employment Office (NEO) to transmit the strategies of the International Labour Organization (ILO) and adopting the modern techniques of public employment services (PES) in use by international donors.

The report is divided into 4 parts. Part I is the “Project Background”. It includes 5 sections. Section 1 titled “Lebanon’s Agony” briefly describes the suffering Lebanon has been going through during the past few decades ending with the devastating 2006 war. Also, it highlights the plan presented by the government of Lebanon (GOL) in order to bring to the fore one of its main issues which formed the basis of the project goal and design, specifically, poverty reduction. Section 2 “Project Inception” reviews the endeavor exerted by the Regional Office of the International Labour Organization in Beirut (ILO/ROAS) to address Lebanon’s labour market problems. The Canadian International Development Agency’s (CIDA) efforts in this direction along with the agreement with the ILO/ROAS are summarized in Section 3. Section 4 provides a brief project description and explains the project relevance to ILO/ROAS constituents. Section 5 summarizes the structure of the project management.

Part II presents the “Evaluation Background and Methodology”. It starts by an examination of the project design through an extensive analysis of its Logical Framework Analysis (LFA) in the first section. Project achievements are briefed in the second section. The third section discusses a set of factors that negatively impacted project implementation. The success factors which promise the realization of all, or at least most of the expected results are listed in the fourth section. The fifth section answers the crucial question about the “Road Ahead” of the project based on the plausible assumption that funds will be available to support resuming the project activities through two scenarios. The first scenario describes the project activities until its end in March 2011. The second Scenario portrays the project development if its end date is extended to December 2011 with the same fund. The project efficiency and effectiveness, and the cross-cutting issues follow. The last section includes

the lessons learned; good practices, and main recommendations. Relevant details are provided in 9 annexes at the end of the report.

I. PROJECT BACKGROUND

1. Lebanon's Agony:

For Seventeen years, Lebanon suffered internal strife that caused massive destruction everywhere. The determination of the Lebanese people to regain their country had resulted in outstanding achievements by mid 2006. Regrettably, successful recovery was disrupted by the tragic July-August war of 2006. The war and the subsequent blockade devastated the human life in Lebanon: nearly 1,200 people died, 4,400 injured, the houses of about 500,000 people were partly or totally destroyed, large-scale displacement took place, massive damage paralyzed infrastructure dislocating the whole economy, many professionals and entrepreneurs left the country, and about 30,000 lost employment.¹

On 25 January 2007, the GOL presented a "Recovery, Reconstruction, and Reform" plan to the "International Conference for Support to Lebanon" held in Paris (known as Paris III). The plan addressed a wide range of economic, political, and social aspects in Lebanon. Of special interest to this report is the brief reference made to poverty and the concomitant high unemployment especially among vulnerable groups along with conspicuous regional disparities.²

Being in its domain, ILO promptly conducted a post-crisis multidisciplinary rapid needs assessment mission to design a labour market program as a strategic intervention to relieve poverty and reduce regional disparity.

2. Project Inception

One of the most important goals referred to by Paris III is poverty reduction especially among vulnerable groups along with the minimization of regional disparities. Towards the fulfilment of that goal, the post-crisis multidisciplinary rapid needs assessment mission designed a comprehensive "Labour Market Program" for ILO/ROAS intervention based on an elaborated analysis of the problems of the Lebanese labour market. Of direct relevance to this report is the following findings:³

- Whilst two thirds of the resident Lebanese population is of working age, only one third is actually working. Primarily, this is due to the weak participation of women in the labour force.
- In 2006, the number of persons with disabilities is estimated at about 34 thousands of which 27 thousands are capable of working. Only one quarter of the last category

¹ Republic of Lebanon 2007, "Recovery, Reconstruction, and Reform", presented at the International Conference for Support to Lebanon, held in Paris on 25 January 2007 (Paris III).

² *Ibid.*

³ "An ILO Post Conflict Decent Work Program for Lebanon", Report of the September 2006 Multi-Disciplinary Mission to Lebanon, Beirut, Lebanon.

is actually working (7 thousand persons). To make it worse, people with disabilities hardly has access to education and vocational training.

- Micro, small and medium sized enterprises (MSMEs) have historically been one of the most important sources of employment in Lebanon, and are expected to continue so. To be sure, more than 80% of the companies in Lebanon are MSMEs providing more than 80% of the job opportunities. Some of the main impediments to the growth of MSMEs are the lack of sources of micro finance, and the deficiency in the provision of basic business skills.
- Although unemployment and poverty in Lebanon are major threats to the country's stability, the government and the social partners agree that there is no coherent labour policy.

In order to be able to substantially contribute to the poverty alleviation goal, the mission's "Labour Market Program" identified "Employment Promotion" as one of two priority areas.⁴ The objectives of "Employment Promotion" priority area furnished the ground for designing this project; specifically:

1. Establishing employment services enhanced in terms of geographic outreach and quality of services (Outcome 1 of the project).
2. Strengthening the labour market information (Outcome 2).
3. Supporting the MSMEs (Outcome 3).

Adhering to tripartism, ILO/ROAS spent most of 2007 in continuous consultations with its constituents to design the project with the contribution of an employability consultant. A project document was produced at the end of the year based on the participatory approach covering a wide range of stakeholders in the Lebanese labour market at large.

Meanwhile, ILO/ROAS managed to secure a grant of \$2 million from CIDA and to negotiate with the NEO a commitment to provide in-kind share in the project by refurbishing three pilot employment offices, and providing staff at a rate of 3-4 persons/office. This commitment was confirmed by a letter on December 10, 2007 from H.E. the Minister of the MOL to the Director of ILO/ROAS.

The strategy adopted by ILO/ROAS was, subsequently, supported by several other efforts:

- The Common Country Assessment (CCA) 2007 (completed in 2008) concluded that employment opportunities are not growing sufficiently enough to absorb new entrants into the labour market. And, unemployment, particularly among youth and unfavourable groups, is at a very high level.⁵
- The UN Development Assistance Framework (UNDAF) 2009 (for the years 2010-2014) considered poverty reduction and the minimization of regional disparities as central issues to Lebanon.⁶
- Unemployment, brain drain, and inflow of foreign workers are symptoms of the trouble in the Lebanese labour market. Moreover, abundance of skills in the labour market led to lack of appreciation by the employers as indicated by the growing

⁴ The other priority area is "Social Dialogue and Labour Market Governance".

⁵ United Nations Common Country Assessment: Lebanon, December 2007.

⁶ United Nations Development Assistance Framework Lebanon (2010-14), May 2009.

unemployment among the educated and relatively low payment. Low skilled Lebanese are in competition with undocumented inflow of foreign workers in a largely informal sector. Additionally, nearly 80 percent of workers are recruited through word of mouth. Problems of the labour market are aggravated by the absence of active labour market policy.⁷

3. CIDA's Effort to Support Lebanon

CIDA is committed to the Millennium Development Goals (MDGs). Of special interest to this project is MDG-1 (eradication of poverty and hunger) and MDG-3 (promotion of gender equality and empowering women). Those two MDGs formed a point of mutual interest to the three institutions: CIDA, ILO and GOL. This mutual interest is a focal element in the project design.

On March 27, 2008, CIDA and ILO/ROAS signed an "Arrangement" for their cooperation to implement the project. Of main concern to this report are:⁸

- The first Article states that CIDA will make a grant of CDN\$2,200,000 and delegated the ILO to use it exclusively for the purpose of the project.
- The second Article schedules the payment of the grant as follows:
 - US\$ 1,215,802 to be paid within 2 weeks from signing the "Arrangement" into an interest bearing account
 - US\$ 1,013,172 to be paid on or before April 30, 2009
- On March 12, 2010, CIDA requested the amendment of the entirety of sub-article 2.2. According to the change, CIDA postponed the date of paying the second installment from April 30, 2009 to March 31, 2011.⁹
- The third Article delegates ILO to administer the grant in accordance with its regulations.
- The eighth Article specifies the project end date on March 31, 2011. However, it gives room to extend the project duration beyond that date by CIDA's authorization.
- Articles 8.2 and 9.9 give both CIDA and ILO the right to terminate the project upon a ninety-day written notice.

The project design is detailed in an annex to the Arrangement. Mainly, it is based on ILO/ROAS project document.

4. Brief Project Description

The project is designed to address one of the crucial issues raised in Paris III; specifically, poverty reduction and the associated conspicuous regional disparities with special attention

⁷ Lebanon Labour Market Brief, Draft, June 2010, prepared by Zafiris Tzannatos, ILO consultant

⁸ "Arrangement between the Government of Canada and the International Labour Organization", Lebanon: Support to Public Employment Services, Project: Z020868, Arrangement: 7050007, 2008

⁹ It is worth mention at this point, that CIDA had frozen the payment of the second installment few months before the amendment due to reservations on the project performance (this issue is raised below).

directed to vulnerable groups. ILO believes that the best way to eradicate poverty is through combating unemployment. Hence, the project goal is to:¹⁰

“contribute to raising the level of employment for poverty reduction in Lebanon through the pursuit of a strategy that increases institutional capacities to deliver active labour market programming.”

The project is expected to

“assist the Lebanese Ministry of Labour and Employment Authority by identifying strategies and transmitting ILO and International Donors expertise and know-how in the area of employability development programs and interventions for the productive employment and re-employment of workers displaced by the war.”

The project outcomes explicitly and directly express the objectives of the ILO/ROAS program’s “Labour Market Program” priority area of “Employment Promotion” described above. The project seeks to ensure:

1. Increased institutional capacity of the NEO to assist the unemployed and underemployed and ensure efficient and equitable provision on employment related services at the national and local level;
2. Improved connectivity of various municipalities, employers and job seekers to a general network of employment related information through the enhancement of the national labour market information systems (LMIS) and the development of an occupational information system (OIS);
3. Enhanced self-employment opportunities through the establishment of successful small enterprises and improved skills.

Enhancing PES builds the essential electronic bridges between job seekers and employers anywhere for the purpose of promptly matching the interests of each party and, hence, reduce unemployment. The NEO has the mandate to provide placement for job seekers, collect labour market information and liaise with training institutions in providing accelerated training for available jobs.

There are two challenges facing the Lebanese PES: weak capacity of the existing structure and the limited geographic outreach. Hence, it is the ILO strategy to enhance the capacity of the NEO through staff training, developing on-line job matching services, analyzing and disseminating labour market information, extending its geographic coverage by building new employment offices, and providing vocational and business training, and guidance to micro-finance for MSMEs. Furthermore, the project seeks to promote the re-integration of the unemployed back into employment through skills development. This will be achieved through utilizing training opportunities available in the community to allow for accelerated skill formation with special attention to vulnerable groups.

¹⁰ “Arrangement between the Government of Canada and the International Labour Organization”; *op. cit.*

As such the project materializes the goals of ILO and its constituents. In a sustainable approach, it builds the capacity of the MOL to design Lebanese labour policies, enables the NEO to serve wide sectors of job seekers, employers and entrepreneurs in and outside Lebanon. Capacity building of the NEO is based on the Canadian model. Poverty reduction and directing special interest to vulnerable groups including women meets CIDA's objectives embodied in MDG-1 and MDG-3. Furthermore, the "Agreement" between the MOL and ILO/ROAS delegates the latter to integrate this project with its other programs in Lebanon for the benefit of all ILO partners (employers and workers organizations, and NGOs) and in agreement with the Project Steering Committee (PSC) which represents a wide spectrum of labour market stakeholders.¹¹

5. Project Management

The Project is managed by a Chief Technical Advisor (CTA) recruited by ILO/ROAS alongside with a National Coordinator. That small team is technically backstopped by the Senior Skills and Employability Specialist at ILO/ROAS. The Regional Programming Service Unit at the ILO/ROAS provides programmatic support and facilitates the implementation of the project.

CIDA is the donor agency. It delegated ILO/ROAS as the project "Executing Agency". Policy guidance and strategic decision making is the responsibility of the PSC which is chaired by the MOL.

II. EVALUATION BACKGROUND and METHODOLOGY

The evaluation is conducted in order to examine in-depth the project implementation, enhance its performance, and garner stakeholder consensus around scenarios outlining the way forward for the remaining duration of the project (the Evaluator's Terms of Reference is provided in Annex A).

The evaluation was participatory. It engaged ILO/ROAS constituents, key stakeholders, and beneficiaries. The starting point was a desk review of the main project documents to collect the relevant information available on the project (Annex B contains a list of the documents shared with the Evaluator). Further information was collected, verified and investigated during a nine-day field visit to Beirut between 19-27 July 2010.

Personal meetings and conference calls were conducted during the field visit. Meetings included at least one person from each group of key stakeholders (a list of meetings is presented in Annex C). Those included inter alia from the ILO Ms. Nada Al-Nashif, Regional Director, Mr. Jean-François Klein, Chief of Regional Programming Services and Evaluation Manager, the concerned ILO/ROAS officers, the project CTA, and the project National Coordinator who was also responsible for the mission logistics. From the MOL, the

¹¹ Agreement between the Government of Lebanon (represented by the Ministry of Labour) and the International Labour Organization (represented by the International Labour Office) signed on August 26, 2010.

Evaluator met with the Minister **H.E. Minister Botros Harb**, his Counsellors, the MOL Director General (DG), and the Chief of Statistics Department. A whole day was spent in the NEO meeting with the DG, Chief Department–Employment Offices, Chief Department–Statistics, and Chief Department–IT. During that day a focus group meeting was held with the PES officers who received the training including NGO trainees (Annex D gives a list of the focus group participants). The Beirut pilot office was also visited.

The primary clients of the evaluation are the ILO/ROAS, the MOL, the NEO and CIDA. Secondary clients include social partners, and other units within the ILO that may indirectly benefit from the knowledge generated by the evaluation.

The Evaluator met with the two CIDA officers in charge of project funding. A series of meetings were also held with key relevant government and non-government institutions: Ministry of Industry, Consultations and Research Institutes (CRI), Rene Mouawad Foundation (RMF), UNRWA, and the Labour Union (CGTL; “Conseil general des travailleurs Libanais”).

The Evaluator concluded the field trip with a presentation of the mission’s tentative findings during a workshop attended by key stakeholders (a list of participants is furnished in Annex E). The objective of the workshop was: i) to gather additional information from the participants, ii) to answer the evaluation questions, and iii) to make recommendations on how the project should go forward.

III. MAIN FINDINGS

1. Examination of Project Design

The Project design is examined in reference to the legally binding “Arrangement” document; specifically, Annex A of the “Arrangement”.

The evaluator first examines goals, outcomes, outputs, and activities; i.e. the components of the vertically built columns. The analysis then moves to the “Performance Indicators” followed by the “Risk Analysis”. The modification resulting from the analysis is incorporated in the Logical Frame Analysis (LFA) presented in “Annex F”.

1.1. Project Goal

As mentioned earlier in the “Project Background”, the project goal aims at raising the level of employment as a main tool of poverty reduction. This goal directly responds to Lebanon’s needs as expressed in Paris III, and is a part of the “Employment Promotion” priority area of the ILO/ROAS program.

Seeking such a goal requires: (1) building the capacity of the NEO and expanding its geographic outreach, (2) boosting its labour market mediation and information services, and

(3) enhancing its capability to promote self employment through transmitting ILO and international donors strategies. These are captured in 3 outcomes (Table 1).

Table 1: The project goal and the outcomes

Project Goal
<p>The project will contribute to raising the level of employment for poverty reduction in Lebanon in the aftermath of the war through the pursuit of a strategy that increases institutional capacities to deliver active labour market programming.</p> <p>The project will assist the Lebanese MOL and NEO by identifying strategies and transmitting ILO and International Donors expertise and know-how in the area of employability development programs and interventions for the productive employment and re-employment of workers displaced by war.</p>
Project Outcomes
<p>Outcome 1: Increased institutional capacity of the NEO to assist the unemployed and underemployed workers and ensure efficient and equitable provision of employment related services at the national and local level</p>
<p>Outcome 2: Improved connectivity of various municipalities, employers and job seekers to a general network of employment related information</p>
<p>Outcome 3: Self employment opportunities promoted for men and women through the establishment of successful small enterprises and enhancement of the business/enterprise skills of people in general</p>

The three outcomes are interrelated. This implies that the failure to achieve one of the three outcomes would adversely affect the transformation of other realized outcomes into the expected impact. Logically, such interrelationship is acceptable. For, building NEO's capacity (Outcome 1) is a prerequisite to achieve the other two outcomes. Also, boosting the NEO's connectivity (Outcome 2) is indispensable because it is the vehicle through which NEO services can be readily accessible to jobseekers in and outside Lebanon. Therefore, Outcomes 1 and 2 are strongly related. As for promoting entrepreneurship (Outcome 3), it seems, at the outset, to be depending on Outcomes 1 and 2 but not the opposite.

Lebanon enjoys the highest rate of self-employment in the region (as high as 40% in the non-agriculture sectors),¹² where a large number of small businesses have closed down because of the devastating 2006 war. The expected impact and project goal of raising the level of employment therefore cannot be achieved without the realization of Outcome 3 as well.¹³ The three outcomes are examined in the next sections.

¹² Lebanon Labour Market Brief, *op. cit.*

¹³ 40% are self-employed in the non-agriculture sector plus self-employment in the agriculture sector.

1.2. Outcome One and Related Outputs and Activities

Outcome 1 focuses on the capacity building of the NEO to assist the unemployed with special attention paid to vulnerable groups and the minimization of regional disparity. Table 2 displays Outcome 1, its Outputs 1.1 – 1.3 and the activities under each output. In order to achieve “Outcome 1”, Outputs 1.1-1.3 must be realized first which in turn means that the activities contributing to each output must also be implemented successfully.

Table 2: Outcome 1 and related outputs and activities

Outcome 1		
Increased institutional capacity of the NEO to assist the unemployed and underemployed workers and ensure efficient and equitable provision on employment related services at the national and local level		
Output 1.1: Employment service programs/interventions designed and implemented, including job search assistance and employability counselling programs and services	Output 1.2: Sustainability of the programme ensured through TOT and the development of partnerships with capacity building activities with relevant associations	Output 1.3: Results based monitoring and Evaluation (M&E) System developed
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Activity 1.1.1 Train PES officers to provide assessment counselling • Activity 1.1.2 Provide guidelines and training to assist PES officers in setting up job search training programs • Activity 1.1.3 Train PES officers to provide individual and group employment counselling & job search assistance • Activity 1.1.4 Work with Lebanese counterparts in setting up referral system to refer selected clients to appropriate training opportunities • Activity 1.1.5 Implement a case management and reporting system 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Activity 1.2.1 Develop training course content in collaboration with Lebanese counterparts • Activity 1.2.2 Implement a TOT course for a cadre of selected NEO staff • Activity 1.2.3 Participate in the joint delivery of TOT • Activity 1.2.4 collaborate with relevant associations / institutions for the training of staff and external stakeholders in initial pilots 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Activity 1.3.1 Design and implement an M&E system • Activity 1.3.2 Provide guidance in conducting M&E and collaborate in initial reports and other feedback mechanisms

One remark is due about Outcome 1: it does not emphasize serving vulnerable groups. Outcome 1 is modified accordingly (Table 3).

Output 1.1 aims directly at the capacity development of the NEO staff to serve NEO’s clients. The first 3 activities under this output focus on staff training, the preparation of training guidelines and material, and training PES officers to provide individual and group job-search training. The fourth activity (1.1.4) is an outreach to NGOs involved in missions complementary to that of the NEO for the purpose of establishing a referral system that mobilizes and utilizes their capabilities while also enhancing NEO’s productivity.

Activity 1.1.5 is to “Implement a case management and reporting system”. Currently, this activity goes beyond the capability of the NEO. NEO is understaffed and its officers are only recently trained. The standard term for this activity is "one-stop-shop" where a client will

have one counselor coordinating all activities related to the service. This activity is kept in the LFA in case time allows its implementation.

Table 3: Modified Outcome 1 and related outputs and activities

Outcome 1 (modified; changes underlined)			
Increased institutional capacity of the NEO to assist the unemployment and underemployed workers and ensure efficient and <u>geographically</u> equitable provision of employment related services at the national and local level <u>with special attention to vulnerable groups.</u>			
Output 1.1: Employment service programs / interventions designed and implemented, including job search assistance and employability counselling programs and services	Output 1.2: Sustainability of the program ensured through TOT	Output 1.3: Results based monitoring and Evaluation (M&E) System developed	Output 1.4: Develop partnerships, with capacity building activities, with relevant associations
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Activity 1.1.1 Train PES officers to provide assessment counselling • Activity 1.1.2 Provide guidelines and training to assist PES officers in setting up job search training programs • Activity 1.1.3 Train PES officers to provide individual and group employment counselling & job search assistance • Activity 1.1.4 Work with Lebanese counterparts in setting up referral system to refer selected clients to appropriate training opportunities • Activity 1.1.5 Implement a case management and reporting system 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Activity 1.2.1 Implement TOT course for a cadre of selected NEO staff • Activity 1.2.2 Participate in the joint delivery of TOT 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Activity 1.3.1 Design and implement a monitoring and evaluation system • Activity 1.3.2 Provide guidance in conducting M&E and collaborate in initial reports and other feedback mechanisms 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Activity 1.4.1 Develop training course content in collaboration with Lebanese counterparts • Activity 1.4.2 Collaborate with relevant associations / institutions for the training of staff and external stakeholders in initial pilots

Output 1.2 combines two outputs serving one main theme (sustainability): Training of trainers (TOT) and establishing partnership with, and building the capacity of, relevant associations.

“1.4 Develop partnerships, with capacity building activities, with relevant associations”

1.3. Outcome Two and Related Outputs and Activities

Outcome 2 is concerned with boosting the connectivity of NEOs so as its internet-based services are available on a web site for users everywhere. It is based on the realization of two outputs. The first output (2.1) is to establish a country-wide LMIS. The second output is to establish OIS and ELE.

Table 4: Outcome 2 and the relevant outputs and activities

Outcome 2	
Improved connectivity of various municipalities, employers and job seekers to a general network of employment related information	
Output 2.1: Country-wide LMI network established	Output 2.2: Computer-assisted occupational information system (OIS) developed
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Activity 2.1.1. Develop guidelines for the implementation of an LMIS • Activity 2.1.2. Prepare a conceptual design for a country-wide application • Activity 2.1.3 Draw up specifications for hardware and software requirements, i.e. computer analysis programs and operational specifications • Activity 2.1.4 Develop format for setting up stakeholder advisory committees • Activity 2.1.5 Identify requirements & specifications for any government re-engineering required to implement LMIS 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Activity 2.2.1 Develop an Occupational Information System (OIS) and adapt a job matching system from existing system in M.E. region • Activity 2.2.2 Prepare a user guidebook • Activity 2.2.3 Design and implement a training course for NEO employment officers

Five activities are introduced to build LMIS: develop implementation guidelines, prepare conceptual design, determine the specifications of the hardware and the software, and set up a stakeholder advisory committee. The last activity (2.1.5) needs a brief discussion.

Activity 2.1.5 refers to “re-engineering” i.e. adjusting or changing the system in “any” government institution. It is safe to say that no one in the project, whether the NEO or the MOL has the authority to carry out such a task. However, as stated in the last technical LMIS report prepared by Dr. Ralph Kellett, President of Ralph Kellett and Associates, Canada:

“... a strong will exists among almost all of the key players to move ahead quickly with the development and implementation of the proposed system. A sufficient number of the key ministries expressed their commitment to contribute as necessary to the development and ongoing sustainability of the system in terms of time and resources to provide evidence that the LMIS, once up and running, can be sustained by the players.”¹⁴ Given the above discussion, Activity 2.1.5 should be modified in order to secure the approval of targeted government institutions. It needs to be broken down to (Table 5):

Activity 2.1.5: Negotiate with potential LMIS clients their willingness to accept assessment of the interface between their systems & NEO’s LMIS.

Activity 2.1.6: Secure the approval of LMIS clients concerning changing their systems, the time frame for implementation and the source of finance.

Activity 2.1.7: Implement changes

Table 5: Outcome 2 and the relevant outputs and the modified activities

Outcome 2

¹⁴ Dr. Ralph Kellett, “Support to Public Employment Services in Lebanon: Strengthening the Capacity of the National Employment Authority”, Project Deliverable Plan for the Development and Implementation of a Labour Market Information System (LMIS) in Lebanon, August 24, 2009

Improved connectivity of various municipalities, employers and job seekers to a general network of employment related information	
Output 2.1: Country-wide LMI network established	Output 2.2: Computer-assisted occupational information system (OIS) developed
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Activity 2.1.1 Develop guidelines for the implementation of an LMI system • Activity 2.1.2 Prepare a conceptual design for a country-wide application • Activity 2.1.3 Draw up specifications for hardware and software requirements, i.e. computer analysis programs and operational specifications • Activity 2.1.4 Develop format for setting up stakeholder advisory committees • Activity 2.1.5: Negotiate with potential LMIS clients their willingness to accept assessment of the interface between their systems & NEO's LMIS. • Activity 2.1.6: Secure the approval of LMIS clients concerning changing their systems, the time frame for implementation and the source of finance. • Activity 2.1.7: Implement changes 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Activity 2.2.1 Develop an Occupational Information System (OIS) and adapt a job matching system from existing system in M.E. region • Activity 2.2.2 Prepare a user guidebook • Activity 2.2.3 Design and implement a training course for NEO employment officers

Outputs 2.1 and 2.2 are concerned with the electronic development of OIS *via* 3 activities.

1.4. Outcome Three and Related Outputs and Activities

Table 6: Outcome 3 and the relevant output and activities

Outcome 3
Self employment opportunities promoted for men and women through the establishment of successful small enterprises and improve the business/enterprise skills of people in general.
Output 3.1: Entrepreneurship Training Program implemented
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Activity 3.1.1. Conducting a mapping of existing vocational training programs, business management training, and micro-finance providers, to whom the PES officers can refer their clients • Activity 3.1.2. Create work teams (Entrepreneurship coaches) and familiarize them with the various components of the entrepreneurship program • Activity 3.1.3 Prepare the groundwork to set up workshops in selected regions • Activity 3.1.4 Launch the entrepreneurship program by setting up pilot projects in designated areas • Activity 3.1.5 Validate the training provided to the coaches and assess the activities and procedures for the clients participating in the program

Outcome 3 is about entrepreneurship. It consists of a single output supported by 5 activities. The first activity (3.1.1) maps existing centres in the areas of vocational training, business management, and microfinance providers for the purpose of establishing a referral system. The rest of the activities directly fit under this output.

1.5. Performance Indicators

1.5.1. Goal and Impact Indicators

The over-all development goal of this project is to reduce the rate of unemployment. Any improvement or deterioration in the rate of unemployment is a function of changes in many endogenous variables (e.g. fiscal policy... etc.) and exogenous factors (e.g. the world economy, energy prices ...). So, changes in the rate of unemployment could take place regardless of the quality of the performance of NEO. So, this indicator does not have any direct service for project management. Hence, it is replaced by another indicator (referred to below). Nevertheless, NEO has to regularly produce the rate of unemployment once it can because it is one of the most important macro indicators (Table 7 displays goal and impact performance indicator before and after modification).

There are six indicators for the project impact. Presumably, they measure the aggregate over all the NEO's employment offices. Besides, the indicators have to take into consideration two main issues raised in all the works sited above about Lebanon: (a) regional disparity; and (b) the vulnerable groups. The indicators are modified accordingly.

Table 7: Goal and impact performance indicators

Expected Result	Performance Indicators	Modified Performance Indicators
Goal	Unemployment rate	The NEO and the MOL are delivering labour market programs
Impact	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Number of jobseekers successfully matched with job opening through public employment services 2. % of labour market mobility (both geographically and occupationally) 3. Number of integrated displaced workers and other groups who are experiencing labour market difficulties 4. % of job seeker workers who found suitable employment through the use of the job placement and other services 5. % of job placements in 3 years through labour market intermediary system 6. % of successful enterprises by participants in the entrepreneurship program 	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Aggregate number of jobseekers successfully matched with job openings through PES in all NEO's employment offices distributed geographically and by vulnerable groups 2. % of labour market mobility (both geographically and occupationally) and by vulnerable groups 3. Aggregate number of integrated displaced workers and vulnerable groups in all NEO's employment offices distributed geographically 4. % of aggregate number of job seeker workers who found suitable employment through the use of the job placement and other services distributed geographically and by vulnerable groups 5. % of aggregate annual job placements through labour market intermediary system distributed geographically and by vulnerable groups % of aggregate successful enterprises by participants in the entrepreneurship program distributed

		geographically and by vulnerable groups
--	--	---

The goal and impact indicators are modified. The goal indicator shows the NEO and the MOL capacity to deliver labour programs. Such ability does not need a special measurement. For, if the MOL formulates a labour policy it will be known for stakeholders and publicly announced.

There are some similarities among the indicators of the impact. This invites some clarification. The first of these indicators is the number of matching processes between job seekers and job opportunities carried out by PES aggregated over NEO’s employment all over Lebanon. It should be noted that the satisfaction of job seekers with the service is not of main interest of this indicator; it is measured below.

The second indicator is straightforward but requires establishing a communication protocol between the NEO and the National Social Security Fund (NSSS). The latter institution is also under the supervision of MOL. The third indicator is similar to the first one but confined to displaced workers. The fourth indicator is about workers who are not satisfied with their jobs. As they try to find more suitable jobs, they become job seekers.

The fifth indicator is the number of job placements through labour market intermediary system. This encompasses all means to balance demand for and supply of jobs. The measurement frequency of the fifth indicator is 3 years in the original LFA. It is not clear why should the monitor wait three years to measure that indicator. It is modified to be measured annually.

The last indicator is related to Outcome 3: entrepreneurship. It is the number of “successful” enterprises according to the standard criteria of the micro finance centers. An interesting feature of this indicator is that while others can be generated electronically, this one requires a continuous follow-up on the participants in the entrepreneurship program.

1.5.2. Outcomes Indicators

Outcomes’ performance indicators are shown in Table 8. The first indicator of outcome 1 has to be measured through a “client satisfaction survey”. It requires the employment offices to be fully operational for about a year. So, the indicator is likely to be measured towards the end of the project. The only modification there is to highlight vulnerable groups in the survey. Furthermore, it should be included as a regular indicator within NEO’s M&E.

Table 8: Outcome performance indicators

Expected Result	Performance Indicators	Modified Performance Indicators
Outcome 1	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Job seekers satisfaction rate Number of individual plan of action for job 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Job seekers satisfaction rate by vulnerable groups

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> market integration developed Rate of potential for finding suitable occupations by job seekers using the new service 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Number of individual plan of action for job market integration developed
Outcome 2	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Quality of LM decision making tools for both workers and employers % of employment counsellors making effective use of the OIS. Access rate by employers and workers to information on job opportunities and job seeker data at the local, municipal and national levels Frequency of use of the information system by key stakeholders 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Quality of LM decision making tools for both workers and employers % of employment counsellors making effective use of the OIS. Access rate by employers and workers to information on job opportunities and job seeker data at the local, municipal and national levels Frequency of use of the information system by key stakeholders
Outcome 3	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Number of beneficiaries (women and men) attending BDS trainings 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Number of beneficiaries (women and men) attending BDS trainings by geographic distribution and vulnerable groups % of those who started business out of the number of BDS trainees by geographic distribution and vulnerable groups

The third indicator is not specific and is not directly measurable. Since the NEO has not started yet its enhanced PES, the potential has to be based on some imported norms; it could be the Canadian, the French, the Tunisian, the Jordanian standards or a mix thereof. Even then, the question remains whether those labour markets are similar to the Lebanese one. The Evaluator believes that the Lebanese labour market and the special circumstances of the development of the NEO will make this indicator misleading. Besides, it is difficult to define “suitable” in this case.

For outcome 2, the first indicator requires conducting periodic “client satisfaction survey”. As mentioned above, the NEO’s electronic system has to be fully operational for about a year in order to conduct such survey. So, it is to be measured towards the end of the project. Similarly, indicators 2, 3 and 4 require the installation and the full operation of the OIS, ELE and LMIS first.

The indicator of outcome 3 measures the number of trainees regardless how many will actually benefit from the training and start business. One additional indicator is needed to measure the percentage of those trainees who initiate MSMEs as a result of the training. Besides, the indicator focuses on the gender issue. But the scope of vulnerable groups is broader than that. So, the first indicator is modified accordingly.

1.5.3. Output Indicators

Generally, output indicators are acceptable as they are. Few of those indicators are discussed here. The indicator of output 1.1 is straightforward: “*Number of employment centers at the national level offering employability services according to defined standards of quality*”. By the end of the project, it should be at least 3 enhanced offices.

As for output 1.2, the reader should be reminded that it was split into outputs 1.2 and 1.4. The indicators of outputs 1.2 and 1.3 are direct ones. Two new indicators are included to measure the performance of output 1.4:

“A list of relevant institutions is prepared.”

“Communication protocols signed to secure institutional cooperation”

Performance indicators of outputs 2.1 and 2.2 are directly related to the nature of the output. The indicator corresponding to output 3.1 is discussed under outcome 3, since this is the only output for that outcome.

1.6. Risk Analysis¹⁵

The project design had taken into consideration several risk factors about matters which are: (i) difficult to predict, (ii) beyond the control of the project management, and/or (iii) pose a threat to the achievement of one or more of the expected results. Those risk factors are reviewed below and modified, when needed, to reflect recent changes in the project environment.

A summary of risk factors is presented in Table 9. The first five factors affect the project performance in general whether during implementation of after completion.

Table 9: Risk factors, rating and mitigation strategy

Expected Result	Modified Risk	Rating	Mitigation
Goal and Impact	Political environment deteriorates due to instability / conflict in Lebanon	MEDIUM	Achieve good quality tangible results accompanied by strong awareness campaign
	Inadequate budget	MEDIUM	Raise public awareness of labour market issues & the potential role NEO can play in addressing them
	Weak adoption of the Canadian model at the top level	LOW	* Include senior PES staff in trainings & study tours * Achieve good quality tangible results accompanied by strong awareness campaign
	Deficiency in strategic management by key stakeholders	HIGH	* Regular meetings of PSC * Invite <i>ad hoc</i> committees to decide on important issues
	Lack of coordination among institutions	HIGH	* Adopt participatory management approach * Promote common understanding * Open dialogue among key stakeholders on labour market and project on-going policy matters
	Ability of PES officers to successfully apply the adopted	LOW	

¹⁵ The fourth column of the project LFA is sometimes called “risk” and other times called “assumption”. They are one and the same. The difference is that risk is a negative statement while assumption is a positive statement of the same thing.

Outcomes	model		
	Acquired expertise fades away over time	MEDIUM	*Refurbish & open the pilot employment offices * Continue coaching PES officers
	Trained officers leave for higher-income jobs	HIGH	NEO to take measures to offset such possibility
	Sources of LM data and information do not provide them to NEO	MEDIUM	* Adopt participatory management approach * Promote common understanding

1. The first risk factor considered is a political one. The probability that this takes place is rated **HIGH** in the LFA. The probability that this risk takes place still exists, but a number of factors invite downgrading it to **MEDIUM** and to alter the mitigation strategy: (a) the original rating was made in 2008 after a strong incident showing political instability. Since then, indicators suggest a degree of improvement towards political stability, and (b) the remaining duration of the project is about a year, compared to 3 years when the project was designed, which again reduces that risk.

A political change may jeopardize the investments and the assets of the project if the tendency was to cancel the NEO.¹⁶ The strategy to mitigate this risk is to prove, beyond doubt, the importance of NEO's contribution to solving the three-pronged problem facing the Lebanese society: high unemployment, regional disparity, and marginalization of vulnerable groups. The project should achieve tangible results of good quality accompanied by strong awareness campaign to attract potential clients to use the NEO services, raise the public awareness of the NEO's role, and gain the support of: the public, the Parliament and the high government offices. If this is done, then a political change will keep NEO because of the public demand for its services. Indeed, this strategy will mitigate many other risk factors.

2. The potential low budget for government departments participating in the development and deployment of the various employability measures inherent in the project poses a serious risk to project completion and sustainability. The probability associated with this risk is significant. The Lebanese government is late in refurbishing the pilot employment offices. To that effect, the associated risk should be **HIGH**. However, given the support shown by H.E. the Minister to NEO the risk is downgraded to **MEDIUM**.
3. If the adoption of the transferred model is not genuine, the NEO stops using the acquired techniques after the end of the project. The probability of this risk factor is **LOW** based on: the project's training policy to include NEO's Department Chiefs, the clear strong support to NEO made by H.E. the Minister personally and by his top counsellors. The mitigation strategy mentioned above applies to this risk factor as well.

¹⁶ It should be kept in mind that during the 1st PSC meeting a reference was made about cancelling the autonomous legal identity of the NEO and combine in the MOL.

4. The LFA considered the lack of objective bases for the selection of the coordinating and supporting committees which inputs are important to the overall success of the project. In the light of the experience of the PSC, the problem is not one of selection! The risk lies in not effectively utilizing such strategically important decision body. In the light of the standing experience this risk factor is rated **HIGH**. **Mitigation** to this risk is by forming *ad hoc* committees from project key stakeholders to look into specific issues and make decisions.
5. The lack of coordination among key stakeholders regarding joint project matters. Evidently, this is a serious source of **HIGH** risk to the project. The agreement on one national OIS comes at the top of the list of examples. The time it is taking and the complicated procedure to move Tripoli office from an inaccessible place to an accessible one is another issue. The mitigation strategy is to adopt a participatory management approach, promote common understanding among various stakeholders, and open a dialogue among key stakeholders on labour market and project on-going policy matters.
6. Related to output 1.1, the availability of human resources and equipment in the selected pilot sites is a major concern. The Evaluator attaches more importance to the trained human resources than to equipments because of the mobility of the first and because it represents a source for many risk factors. Evidently, the project has made remarkable effort in the area of training. The Chief-Department of the Employment Offices and members of offices from different parts of Lebanon went to Canada where they studied the Canadian model on employment services. Also, the Chief-Department of IT and members from collaborating institutions received an LMIS introductory course at the International Training Centre of the ILO in Turin (ITC). Nevertheless, some relevant issues need to be considered:
 - The ability of the trained Employment Counsellors to successfully apply the Canadian model. Such question cannot be answered until the enhanced employment offices are open and operating according to the Canadian model.

The Evaluator rates this risk factor as not likely to happen based on the observation that: (a) although the adoption of the new model has not been tested yet, but during the focus group meeting the trained officers demonstrated clear ownership of the Canadian model and showed strong enthusiasm to start applying it, (b) clearly, they expressed their frustration from the delay in enhancing the employment offices, (c) having the Chief-Department of Employment Offices received exactly the same training given to the junior officers safeguards against weak adaptation.

- The suitability of the Canadian model to the Lebanese labour market: this issue cannot be addressed until the enhanced employment offices are open, operating and applying the Canadian model. But, the Evaluator rates this risk factor as pretty low based on the fact that the Canadian model has been applied successfully in many parts of the region: Jordan, Morocco, and Egypt. Selected project staff went

on a study tour to Canada to see the model, while other NEO staff had already visited Morocco before the project.

- The transferred expertise fades away over time especially that it is not in use. It is natural that this takes place. This natural tendency can partly be offset by the coaching provided by the Canadian trainers in Lebanon on the material that young officers had studied. The Evaluator rates that risk factor **LOW-MEDIUM** depending on how soon the offices will be enhanced and become fully operational.

This risk can be mitigated by the MOL, the main beneficiary of the project: It has to speed up refurbishing the pilot employment offices, and then CIDA secures the fund needed to equip them.

7. There is a possibility that officers who receive training leave NEO for higher-income jobs. What raises this risk is the presence of many private employment offices and NGOs that can hire such trained human resources. The Evaluator rates this risk **HIGH**. NEO has to take measures to offset such possibility. Furthermore, enough number of officers receive training in each field.
8. Output 2.1 (Country-wide LMI network established) is dependent on sources of data and information outside MOL. For example, CAS prepares the Labour Force Survey, and the Ministry of Industry has conducted an industrial survey. To what extent are such institutes willing to share their primary data with NEO to populate the LMIS and update it continuously? However, at this point of time, the main risk is getting the LMIS installed. If the project ends on March 31, 2011, then the risk involved here is exceptionally **HIGH**. However, if the project extended to Dec 31, 2011 then the involved risk can be downgraded to **LOW**.

2. Project Achievements

The principal source for compiling the project achievements is the progress reports. Three progress reports are used to compile the project achievements (Table 10). The first progress report covers the period from the project official start date until mid April 2009 (27/3/08-15/4/09). The second report overlaps with the first over the beginning three and half months. It covers the whole 2009 year (1/1/2009-31/12/2009). The third period is the first four months of 2010 (January 2010–April 2010).

Table 10: Summary of the project achievements

	27/3/08-15/4/09 ¹⁷	Jan09 –Dec09 ¹⁸	Jan10–Apr10 ¹⁹
Outcome 1: Increased institutional capacity of the National Employment Authority (NEA) to assist the unemployed and under-employed workers and ensure efficient and equitable provision on employment related services at the national and local level.			
Output 1.1: Employment service programs designed and implemented, including job search assistance and employability counselling programme and services			

¹⁷ ILO Progress Report, 27 March 2008 – 15 April 2009

¹⁸ ILO Progress Report, January 2009 – December 2009

¹⁹ Progress Update, January 2010 – April 2010

1.1.1. Train PES officers to provide assessment counselling	Decisions pending approval by MOL on hiring required staff for selected pilot sites	17 employment counsellors participated in training on employment counselling in Nov09	17 PES officers received training in Lebanon in June/July10 w NGOs group
			6 months advertising campaign thru print & internet media for NEO services started Jun10
1.1.2. Provide guidelines & training to assist PES officers in setting up job search training programs	1 st draft guidelines & training materials prepared		Draft "Job Interview Guide" completed, in reviews to include vulnerable groups
			Working on the guide "Marketing Yourself & Preparing Your Resume"
1.1.3 Train PES officers to provide individual & group employment counselling & job search assistance	1 st draft training materials on group job search workshops prepared		
1.1.4 Work with Lebanese counterparts in setting up referral system to refer clients to appropriate training opportunities	Methodology for referral system to training opportunities established but needs collaboration from PES officers		
1.1.5 Implement a case management and reporting system	Initial work has begun on the development of a draft "case management" system		
Output 1.2: Sustainability of the programs ensured through TOT and the development of partnerships with capacity building activities with relevant associations			
1.2.1 Develop training course in collaboration w counterparts	A training plan is under development by an external firm	A training plan is under development & experts are to be determined	Training content identified. Two offers are received for this purpose
1.2.2 Implement TOT course for a cadre of selected NEA staff	Staff nominated for a Study Tour; dates and acceptance by NEO DG & agreement for timeframes are under discussion	8 Staff participated in Study Tour in Canada in Oct09	NEO & ILO staff took 1 week study tour to Tunis for exposure to best practices on employment services, ELE, LMI, vocational & technical training
			Preparation for TOT for 12 NEO Staff & partners: identification of trainers and training content.
1.2.3 Participate in the joint delivery of TOT	NEO staff involvement is yet to be determined		
1.2.4 collaborate with relevant associations /institutions for the training of staff & external stakeholders in initial pilots	Framework established to integrate & collaborate with ILO Skills Development project, ILO Palestinian project & NGOs in carrying out joint activities: co-training & resource sharing		
Output 1.3: Results based monitoring and Evaluation system developed			
1.3.1 Design & implement M&E system	ILO RBM M&E developed		
1.3.2 Provide guidance in conducting M&E collaborate in initial reports & other feedback mechanisms	Guidance in M&E provided by ILO		

Outcome 2: Improved connectivity of various municipalities, employers and job seekers to a general network of employment related information			
Output 2.1: Country-wide LMI network established			
2.1.1 Develop guidelines for implementation of LMIS	Guidelines presented thru the vision paper		Hospitality Sector study w NEO started Mar10.
	Inception mission by LMI specialist held in Jan09 to assess current situation in Lebanon wrt collection, analysis & use of LMI		Discussion w CRI to gather and analyze available LMI re-opened Apr10 & a service contract is considered for 2 nd quarter of 2010. CRI presented an offer, which the ILO has accepted but not yet signed.
2.1.2 Prepare conceptual design for a country-wide application	Vision paper & work plan developed for LMIS through inception mission	Sector studies are being prepared to contribute to the LMIS component	2 NEO, 1 CAS, 1 MOL joined ILO training on LMI in Turin May10
2.1.3 Draw up specifications for H/W & S/W requirements	Successful negotiations for work to begin on specifications & requirements in coordination with CAS	Preliminary assessment of specifications & requirements identified & reported Jul09	Identification of H/W & S/W requirements to upgrade the website & systems to host LMI & ELE finalized Apr10.
			Suppliers for bidding were identified. Procurement process initiated
2.1.4 Develop format for setting up stakeholder advisory committees	Agreement in process with CAS for cooperation on setting up an advisory committee	A project advisory committee & advisory group were established including TOR	
2.1.5 Identify requirements & specifications for any government re-engineering required to implement LMIS	Successful negotiations with CAS on specifications and requirements	Preliminary assessment on specifications & requirements was reported in the vision & blueprint report	
Output 2.2 Computer-assisted occupational classification & information system (OCIS)			
2.2.1. Develop OCIS & adapt a job matching system from existing system in M.E. region	Development of a Vision and Work Plan for OCIS	Presentation of OCIS in Jordan/Arab system/NOCs and ISCO during workshop July 2009	Review existing OCIS at the NEO for compatibility with ISCO88
	Discussions held w the Jordanian Al-Manar project on the Arab OCIS; workshop given to ILO staff on the system; contract negotiated to begin collaborative work in June09 w a view of adapting the system to Lebanese context.		Identification of software and hardware needed to upgrade the job matching system in place at the NEO and procurement initiated
2.2.2 Prepare a user guidebook			
2.2.3. Design & implement a training course for NEO employment officers			
Outcome 3: Self employment opportunities promoted for men and women through the establishment of successful small enterprises and improve the business/enterprise skills of people in general.			
Output 3.1 Entrepreneurship Training program implemented			
3.1.1. Conducting a mapping of existing vocational & business training, microfinance	Framework established to integrate & collaborate w ILO Skills Development project in carrying out		

providers to whom PES officers refer their clients.	joint LMI related mapping activities		
3.1.2 Create Entrepreneurship coaches & familiarize them with components of the program	Plans are underway for a Study Tour program in Canada that include a component for Entrepreneurship coaches	Canada study tour included a component for Entrepreneurship coaches	Tunis study tour included a component exposure on entrepreneurship programme there
3.1.3 Prepare the groundwork to set up workshops in selected regions			Proposal by RMF on 3 job fairs & entrepreneurial skills development in the North w NEO is considered
3.1.4.. Launch entrepreneurship program by setting up pilot projects in designated areas			
3.1.5 Validate training provided to coaches & assess activities & procedures for clients participating in the program			

A number of comments on Table 10 are due:

- The project comprises 3 outcomes, 6 outputs and 24 activities.
- Project implementation has been slowed down by a set of unfavourable circumstances which are beyond the control of the project team. Those factors are discussed in section 3. Critical Issues Related to Project Performance.
- Only one output and one activity have been entirely completed mid-way through the project; while the majority of remaining activities are in progress. Output 1.3 (the development of RBM-based M&E) is complete (though has not been adopted yet). Also, the specification of H/W and S/W is prepared (activity 2.1.3).
- No action was initiated in 4 activities because the prerequisites for their initiation have not been fulfilled yet. Two of those activities are under “Output 2.2 OCIS”; namely, “2.2.2 Prepare a user guidebook” and “2.2.3. Design & implement a training course for NEO employment officers”. Naturally, these activities cannot be initiated before finishing the design of the OCIS itself. The other two activities are under “Output 3.1 Entrepreneurship”; specifically, “3.1.4. Launch entrepreneurship program by setting up pilot projects in designated areas” and “3.1.5 Validate training provided to coaches & assess activities & procedures for clients participating in the program”. Activity 3.1.4 requires the start of the pilot offices and Activity 3.1.5 comes subsequent to implementing the entrepreneurship training program.
- In several activities, action was initiated in the first year without follow up in the following years:
 - Activity 1.1.3: Many training programs for PES officers are covered under Activity 1.1.1. The 1st draft training materials on group job search workshops should be finalized.
 - Activity 1.1.4: could be integrated with the project efforts to establish synergies with the ILO Skills Development project in South Lebanon, the ILO project in North Lebanon to promote the Employability of Palestinian refugees, NGOs and the Rene Mouawad Foundation (RMF)

- Activity 1.1.5: as discussed above, it is too early to get NEO's PES officers engaged in such activity because of the lack of experience
- Activity 1.2.3: TOT activities are not ready yet
- Activity 1.2.4 training of stakeholders staff started under other activities
- Activity 3.3.1: the results of this activity show up under Activity 3.3.3.
- Another activity that was briefly mentioned but should receive more attention is the sector study. First, it represents a first step in a series of sectoral studies crucial to guide the design of a labour market policy. Second, it is important component of the LMIS. The study is expected to be completed by August 2010. It conducts an employment needs assessment for the hospitality industry by means of a survey that covers 370 hotels and 430 restaurants throughout Lebanon with approximately 12 thousand employees. The purpose of the study is to provide statistics and information on the labour needs of the hospitality industry and potential job opportunities there. The study was carried out in collaboration with the Syndicate of Hotels and Restaurants and the NEO.
- Also, Outcome 2 deserves special attention. It is concerned with building OCIS, LMIS and ELE in order to enable NEO to provide employment services and information electronically to its clientele. An early effort in that direction was made at the beginning of the third millennium where the NEO acquired a job matching system and a website for online and internet-based recruitment. However, the NEO has not been financially able to cover the support fees of the system. The system was based on ISCO88 (International Standard Occupational Classification).
- ELE has extensive benefits to Lebanon in general and to the NEO in particular. First, it instantaneously provides employment services to job seekers and employers in and outside Lebanon. Second, the geographic spread of the ELE services expands the number of clients which is nothing but boosting the NEO's productivity. Third, ELE will present on its web-site self-instructional material to help job seekers, who prefer remote communication, to find jobs. Fourth, ELE will accommodate the NGOs which are providing job placement services.
- LMIS is an electronic library of labour market information. It is expected to be accessible by anyone, anywhere, and at anytime through a web site. It should be managed by key stakeholders' partnership and must not be owned by any institution for it is the product of collective action. The LMIS has to occur in concert with the development of an OCIS. In Lebanon, the development of LMIS is highly demanded, as was substantiated through field interviews²⁰ and in the Kellett report. During his second mission to Lebanon, Dr Kellett observed that:

"a strong will exists among almost all of the key players to move ahead quickly with the development and implementation of the proposed system. A sufficient number of the key ministries expressed their commitment to contribute as necessary to the development and ongoing sustainability of the system in terms of time and resources to provide evidence that the LMIS, once up and running, can be sustained by the players.

²⁰ MoL, MoIndustry, CAS, MOSA

...

the private sector players (COC, ALI, CRI) said they are prepared to do the necessary work at their own expense to display their LMI products on the new LMIS. All they require to proceed is an official invitation from the MOL."²¹

- Of the key stakeholders, CAS is the most important one in terms of its contribution to the LMIS. It has a strong mandate to collect and unify economic and social data. Furthermore, CAS is in charge of preparing Lebanon's periodic Labour Force Surveys (LFS) and household surveys. Both surveys are of crucial importance for LMIS.
- A serious problem is the different OCIS's in use by Lebanese institutions. In 2005, the NEO elaborated its own OCIS based on ISCO88. CAS is planning to adopt ISCO08 for the LFS.²² A third version is the Arab Occupational Classification System (AOCS) which has been recommended to be adopted by NEO as part of the Jordanian system Al-Manar.
- Having different OCIS in use creates a communication problem among the users who are producing or utilizing employment and labour market data and information. Choosing one OCIS faces two conflicting opinions. One group of the key stakeholders prefer to import the Jordanian model.²³ Contrarily, another group prefers that Lebanon develops its own OCIS.²⁴
- In this report, the question of selecting an OCIS is narrowed down from a Lebanese question to an issue to be settled between only two institutions: CAS and NEO. NEO cannot have a valuable highly demanded LMIS without the data and information which only CAS collects and disseminate in Lebanon, specifically, LFS and household surveys. If CAS switches to ISCO08, this jeopardizes NEO's investment in coding its programs using its own OCIS. It is strongly recommended that the NEO and CAS negotiate a partnership. Together they can decide on the OCIS to be nationalized, and establish regular flow of data and information between them. Having the NEO LMIS housing the sectoral studies, LFS, household surveys, and other related data will boost the demand for its services and, subsequently, supports its sustainability.

3. Critical Issues Related to Project Performance

In 2007, communication between ILO/ROAS, NEO, and MOL started about initiating this project. By the end of the year, the Minister of MOL sent a letter of commitment to ILO/ROAS (referred to above). Few months later, the project started officially on March 27, 2008. Nonetheless, effectively it started several months after that date! Furthermore, the first year of the project was interrupted by the events of May 2008 which ended with the

²¹ ILO, Project Deliverable Plan for the Development and Implementation of a Labour Market Information System (LMIS) in Lebanon, Dr. Ralph Kellett (Consultant), August 24, 2009

²² ILO, A Vision and Work Plan for the Development of a Labour Market Information System (LMIS) in Lebanon, presented by Dr. Ralph Kellett (Consultant), February 14, 2009

²³ ILO, Project Deliverable Plan for the Development and Implementation of a Labour Market Information System (LMIS) in Lebanon, Dr. Ralph Kellett (Consultant), August 24, 2009

²⁴ ILO, Workshop for Developing a National Labour Market Information System and an Occupational Classification Information System for Lebanon, 7th of July 2009, Workshop Report, 22 July 2009, Prepared by Rania Hokayem (National Project Coordinator).

Doha agreement. Even more, several other negative aspects, beyond the control of the project team, have impeded its progress as scheduled. These aspects are summarized below with more details afterwards:

- The weakness of NEO
- Two CTAs led project management within two years.
- Two Ministers headed the MOL within two years of project implementation.
- The missing role of PSC.
- Excessive delay in preparing the three pilot offices.
- CIDA freezes the second instalment.

3.1 The Weakness of NEO

NEO was established by Law 80 of 1977. It is a public authority with its head quarter in Beirut and authorized to open employment offices anywhere in the Republic of Lebanon. It has independent legal personality. Administratively, it is autonomous: headed by a DG and governed by an administrative board. The board is chaired by the Minister of the MOL and the membership of the MOL DG as Deputy Chairman, 5 members representing different economic sectors, 3 members from the Labour Union, and 3 members from educational institutions.

NEO is in charge of designing and implementing employment policy in Lebanon. Its target is to reduce unemployment. This is achieved *via* increasing employment by building a bridge between employers and job seekers, improving the labour market, raising the productivity of the working force, conducting and disseminating research and studies that serve employment policy.

Article 8 of Law 80/1977 prohibits the establishment of any office whose activities fall within NEO mandate. This article is not seriously enforced. There are several employment offices operating in Lebanon some of which operate for a charge. Also, there are offices which go around the law by exploiting another title “Migrant Workers Placement”.

Unfortunately, the NEO has been incapacitated by the lack of budget and understaffing. For about seven years, NEO has been run by a budget of LBL 2 billion which is hardly enough for its operation. While NEO suffers regular electric outages it cannot utilize its generator because it is out of order with no budget to repair it. As for staffing, the work force of NEO is about 107 persons.²⁵ It is operating now with about 20% of its workforce.

In spite of those limitations, the NEO is currently sharing training institutions the cost of an employability development program such as “Accelerated Skill Development” course. It dedicated LBL 100 million as a contribution towards that purpose. The cooperation resulted in the vocational training of 834 trainees on 38 professions with a contribution of LBL 600,000/trainee and another vocational training for 125 persons who suffer some disabilities with a contribution of LBL 800,000/trainee. Furthermore, NEO is collaborating with the project to carry out a study on the hospitality sector. Its contribution is LBL 50 million plus its qualified human resources.

²⁵ The NEO’s workforce is 107 persons according to the law. But, two senior officers mentioned 130 and the other 150 persons.

3.2 Two CTAs Took over Project Management within 2 Years

Directly, after receiving the first CIDA instalment in May 2008, the CTA post was advertised. A candidate was offered the position in September 2008 but declined in October 2008.

Between the appointment and the decline, the National Coordinator of the project (Ms. Ranya Hokayem) was appointed and the project starting date was declared to be on Nov 1, 2008. Mr. Arthur Mills was selected to replace the first candidate and came on board on 15 December 2008. As such, the project effective starting date was delayed for a few months. Unfortunately, before the lapse of one year, Mr. Mills submitted his resignation effective November 30, 2009 for family reasons. Mr. Gregor Schulz (the current CTA) took over on 1 December 2009. Of course, few more months were lost during that change.

3.3 Two Ministers Headed the MOL since inception of the project

Having two ministers heading MOL in a relatively short period of time delayed: (i) appointing PSC members and holding its meetings regularly, (ii) signing the “Agreement” between the MOL and ILO/ROAS, (iii) refurbishing the pilot employment offices, and (iv) appointing the NEO’s new staff. Meanwhile, the NEO’s acting DG was also changed once. This caused significant delays as it took several meetings to present the project, brief the new DG and familiarize him with project activities.

3.4 The Missing Role of the Project Steering Committee (PSC)

The PSC was established to be in charge of policy guidance and the strategic management of the project. It enjoyed a very wide authority over the project (PSC terms of reference is provided in Annex H).

The membership of PSC formed of one representative of each project key stakeholders: the MOL, the NEO, the ILO/ROAS and its project staff, CIDA, the Ministry of Education, the CAS, the Association of Lebanese Industrialists, and the Labour Union. Besides, the door is open to invite other organisations, groups, and/or individuals with the agreement of the above members.

PSC is supposed to meet semi-annually. In March 2009, ILO sent a letter to the MOL Minister, at that time, H.E. Mr. Mohammad Fneish concerning the naming of the members of the PSC. At the end of May 2009, the MOL DG, who was appointed as Chairperson by the Minister, invited the first PSC meeting on June 3, 2009. That meeting was not held because of objections by the previous NEO’s DG to the structure of the PSC membership.

Over 30 months, the PSC met only once on the 1st of September 2009 (two month before naming the present Minister). The PSC held its meeting in the absence of any NEO representative²⁶!! The meeting was chaired by the MOL DG (instead of the Minister). Of the issues addressed by the PSC is the relationship between the MOL and the NEO.

²⁶ Mr. Chahine (NEO DG at that time) refused to participate or even assign someone to represent him because he opposed the nomination of the MoL DG as chairperson.

The MOL DG elaborated on the relationship between the MOL and the NEO by pointing out the fact that the NEO was created by the MOL. He added that it is possible that the NEO gets downscaled to a department of the MOL. Furthermore, the MOL DG introduced to the PSC the idea that the NEO is not ready to receive the LMIS and, as a consequence, it should be housed at the MOL head quarter.

Any unbiased reader of the PSC minutes would not miss the negative attitude towards the NEO. The first signal came from the notable absence of any representative of the NEO at PSC meetings. The second signal came from the proposition that the NEO relinquish its legal and administrative autonomy and become just a department in the MOL. The third signal came from the proposal to implement the LMIS outside of the NEO.

It is important to bring the negative attitude towards the NEO to the fore because it, partly, explains the delay in project progress. The relationship between the NEO and the MOL was a major concern in the two progress reports ILO/ROAS presented to CIDA.

That was the one and only meeting PSC held. It never met again until the time of writing this report. It is worth mentioning that effective mid 2010 an Executive Board (comprising the MOL, ILO, CIDA, NEO has been convened to decide on vital issues related to project implementation. It met only once so far (on June 8,2010 with the next meeting scheduled for early Fall 2010.

Due to the challenges outlined above, the Project has steered away from its original work plan. The first work plan covered the period 2008-2011 and included three main project outcomes. The actions in each outcome start with a preparatory phase that takes two months (30/11/2008 - 30/01/2009) followed by an “operational implementation phase” that spans the rest of the project duration, approximately. Outcome 1 seeks to: (a) develop an employability program that involves both NEO and NGOs, (b) design staff training in Lebanon and study tours abroad, (c) produce guidelines and manuals for the delivery of the various interventions and services, and (d) implement a system for the re-integration of displaced workers into the labour market. At a cost of \$87,000 (this is the only financial estimate provided in that plan), Outcome 2 focuses on: (1) the design of the LMIS and the corresponding training plan, (2) the development of OCIS, and (3) the development of ELE. Outcome 3 (Entrepreneurship) starts with: designing a program with reference to: self-employment, access to capital, selection procedures for targeted clientele.²⁷ By mid April 2009, the approval of the work plan was waiting the approval of the PSC when it convenes in June 2009, which was postponed.²⁸

However due to the various challenges outlined above and outside of the project, the most recent work plan covering 2010 seeks to implement the activities, which are less determined by risk factors beyond the control of the project. By now, some of the planned

²⁷ Public Employment Service Project-Lebanon, “Overall Work Plan for 2008-2010”

²⁸ ILO Progress Report, 27 March 2008 – 15 April 2009

activities have been achieved. The focus in this scenario is on those activities that have not been achieved yet. In the area of training, the unaccomplished tasks are: phase III of the training of PES officers plus coaching, the second phase of the LMIS course, and the TOT. Complementary to training is the publication of the self-instructional material, the guidelines and the manuals. Of course, once the pilot employment offices are refurbished, the project will provide the appropriate equipment. Increasing the visibility of the NEO is another area of interest where a media campaign has already started, and networking with NGOs is undergoing. As for connectivity, the project will also upgrade NEO's ELE. Furthermore, a specialized consultant will collect available labour market information. For entrepreneurship, an NGO will be contracted to conduct entrepreneurship training for rural women.²⁹

3.5 Excessive Delay in Furbishing the Three Pilot Offices

The MOL and the NEO were aware of the in-kind contribution they have to make to the project before its start. Of their contribution was refurbishing 3 pilot offices so as the project will be able to equip them in order to provide the labour market services according to the Canadian model.

The offices are not ready yet although two of them just need minor painting job and partitioning in order to be ready to be equipped. These are the Beirut Employment Office, and the Sidon Employment Office. Tripoli Employment Office (the 3rd office) may take longer time to become ready. At present it is located in the governorate building (El-Saraya) in one room on the 6th floor without an elevator. The MOL has initiated contacts with the Governorate *via* the Ministry of Interior Affairs to move the office into a larger space on the first floor.

The delay in refurbishing the three pilot offices adversely affects project performance and effectiveness. First, there is no opportunity for trained officers to start introducing the new services they are trained to do, nor test and adapt the new model. Second, ELE cannot be developed and installed unless the pilot offices are properly refurbished.

3.6 CIDA Freezes the Second Instalment

Given the fact that the project was falling behind in achieving its main objectives, CIDA requested, on March 12, 2010, the amendment of sub-article 2.2 in order to postpone the date of the second installment from April 30, 2009 to March 31, 2011. Contemporary to the amendment, CIDA issued a freeze on the second installment.

On June 8, 2010, the Minister of Labour H.E. Mr. Boutros Harb chaired a vitally important "Executive Meeting" attended by H.E. the Canadian Ambassador and representatives of the MOL, CIDA, NEO, ILO/ROAS and the project team. During that meeting, H.E. the Canadian Ambassador explained that the 2nd installment cannot be released before September 2010

²⁹ "Project: Support to Public Employment Services in Lebanon – Progress Update"

for financial reasons. H.E. the Ambassador also expressed his concern about the project progress and urged the project to take three actions to boost its performance: (a) enhance the NEO's financial and human resources, (b) refurbish the pilot offices, and (c) sign the agreement between the MOL and the ILO/ROAS.

4. Success Factors

Fortunately, during the Evaluator field visit several positive factors have emerged and revived the project's work environment. The realization of those factors will boost the project performance:

- ✓ The determination and the commitment of H.E. the Minister and his top aides to save no effort to make the project success.
- ✓ The high calibre of the ILO/ROAS project team and the ILO backstop technical support.
- ✓ The strong project ownership by the NEOs senior and junior staff.
- ✓ The enthusiasm of key stakeholders to the project.
- ✓ Imminent signing the "Agreement" between MOL and ILO/ROAS.
- ✓ Initiation of the appointment of the new staff.
- ✓ Launch two pilot sites.
- ✓ Raising NEO's budget.
- ✓ Approval to appoint an advisor to NEO's acting DG.

4.1 The Commitment the MOL Leadership

During His meeting with the Evaluator on July 22, 2010, H.E. Mr. Botros Harb unequivocally declared his determination to form a solid labour policy for Lebanon. The NEO has a vital role to play in shaping the long-awaited policy. Meanwhile H.E. fully understands the NEO's situation. A project that builds the capacity of NEO and qualifies it to resume its role is important for the MOL. The Minister's top aides, whom the Evaluator met with separately, did have the same vision. One of them described the situation as *"a crisis that turns into a positive situation"*.

4.2 High Calibre of ILO/ROAS Project and Backstop Team

The good calibre of the ILO project team can be sensed in their determination to continue fighting against the odds to make the project succeed. The project was unable to comply to the original action plan. However, the project team succeeded in achieving many positive results within the available means. The supportive role of the ILO/ROAS on the financial management side helped the project in general. Besides, synergy cooperation and cost sharing with other programs especially the "Skills Development in South Lebanon" project has to be acknowledged.

4.3 Project Ownership by NEOs Senior and Junior Officers

The Evaluator had the opportunity to meet with the NEOs DG Mr. Nabil Tabet, Mrs. Dolly Feghally the Head of Employment Department, Mr. Hussein Chalhoub Chief of Statistic Department, Eng. Georges Fadel IT Manager, and the junior counsellors from the Beirut,

Sidon, and Tripoli offices who received the project training. Without exception, all senior and junior staff was fully committed to the project successful completion. They were even frustrated because they are not able to apply their training because of the delay in enhancing the employment offices.

4.4 Stakeholders Enthusiasm

The Evaluator met with most of the key stakeholders: ILO, MOL, CIDA, CGTL, CRI, MRF, JCC, UNRWA, and Ministry of Industry. Every person the Evaluator met with assured the importance of the project for Lebanon. Everyone had his own point of view about the weaknesses, and the strengths of the project along with a vision on how the project can improve. All recommendations are reflected in this report whenever feasible.

4.5 The “Agreement” between MOL and ILO/ROAS.

In April 2009, ILO sent a letter to the MOL Minister, at that time, H.E. Mr. Mohammad Fneish presenting a draft “Agreement” to be signed between the MOL and the ILO/ROAS concerning project implementation. The mandate of Minister Fneish, however, ended in September 2009 before the agreement was finalized, requiring that the ILO re-initiate discussions with the new Minister. The pending issue of finalizing a memorandum of understanding between the Ministry of Labour and the ILO was again raised in October 2009, but was not formally signed until 26 August 2010, under the stewardship of his Excellency the current Minister of Labour Mr. Boutros Harb.

4.6 Appointment of New Staff

As agreed in the correspondence between ILO, on the one hand, and the MOL and NEO, on the other hand, the pilot offices were supposed to be manned by 4-5 persons in addition to other officers for other technical assignments (e.g. LMIS, OIS, ELE). The cabinet approved to appoint 41 new staff members of whom 11 are admin and the rest (30 staff) are technical. It should be kept in mind that the process of appointment has to go through the Council of Civic Services. It takes about 5-6 months to finalize the appointment. When the number of the already trained staff is enough to man the 3 pilot offices; this will not be a barrier to start introducing the new services in the enhanced pilot offices.

4.7 Raising NEO’s Budget

NEO has been operating on an operational budget (no maintenance) of LBL 2 billion. It has been raised by 50% to reach LBL 3 billion with negotiation is still going on to raise it to LBL 4 billion.

4.8 Appointing an advisor to NEO’s acting DG.

To support the top management of the NEO, the project decided to finance the post of an advisor to the NEO. The TOR for this position has been presented to the Minister to identify a qualified candidate. The appointment and selection process not been completed yet.

5. The Road Ahead

Considering the work plan outlined above, the “Road Ahead” can take the form of either one of two scenarios. The first scenario adopts an ambitious plan that was proposed in an optimistic environment; namely, the “Overall Work Plan for 2008-2010”. The second scenario adopts a work plan designed to fight against the odds in the year 2010.

A key assumption paving the “Road Ahead” is that CIDA will release its freeze on the second instalment since: (1) the agreement between the MOL and ILO/ROAS had been signed on August 26, 2010, (2) the Cabinet approved the appointment of 41 new staff on July 8, 2010, and (3) the NEO’s budget is raised by 50% and additional increase is being negotiated.

Based on the satisfaction of the above assumption, two scenarios are introduced. The distinction between them lies in the project end date. Scenario 1 assumes that the project will end on its original date: March 31, 2011. Scenario 2 is based on the assumption that the project will be extended, at no additional cost, to December 31, 2011. Scenario 1 draws heavily on the unaccomplished tasks of 2010 work plan with some modifications. Scenario 2 draws on both plans with more emphasis on the last. The only new item that has been introduced in both plans is the KAB (Know About Business) related activities under Outcome 3. The reason for adding this activity is that KAB is the main, and probably the only, tool that can “improve the business/enterprise skills of people in general” as Outcome 3 states. The project is strongly recommended to exploit the expertise available in ILO/ROAS to adopt KAB.

In both scenarios, the project team needs support by one half administrator plus three technical officers. Currently, it consists of the CTA, 1 national coordinator, and ½ admin. The project has taken action towards the appointment of a consultant to support NEO’s management. Additional staff is required because in both scenarios the project team will have to work in order to minimize the risk associated with unforeseen changes. This means carrying out several assignments simultaneously.

5.1 Scenario 1

1. If the project ends on March 31, 2011, then the time left is about 6 months. Mainly, this will adversely affect the realization of Outcome 2. Basically, Outcome 2 is concerned with enhancing NEO’s connectivity in order to boost its ability to provide its services electronically to the Lebanese employers and job seekers in and outside Lebanon. In reference to Dr. Kellett’s report, it takes at least 6 months to build the LMIS. The endeavour starts after the project management has the fund available at its disposal and with no room for contingencies. If the LMIS will not be implemented then, consequently, there is no point in investing in related activities.
2. There is a question about improving the existing ELE. Actually, to answer this question one has to look at the investments required to upgrade the present ELE system especially upgrading the OCIS to the NEO’s 2005 version. The original budget tagged for the OCIS is about \$97 thousand. This investment will be a waste if Lebanon decides to nationalize a version of OCIS different from that of the NEO. To safeguard against wasting large investment, a limited fund is to be allocated for the

improving the current NEO's ELE. Based on the first progress report of the project, NEO's ELE could not continue its operations due to the lack of financial support to maintain the system and a server.³⁰

Table 11: Summary of Scenario 1
(breakdown is provided in Annex H)

Uncommitted Budget = \$ 1,115 thousand; End of Project: March 31, 2011	
OUTCOME	BUDGET \$“000”
1. Increased institutional capacity of NEO to assist the un- & underemployed workers & ensure efficient & equitable provision on PES at the national and local level	270
2. Improved connectivity of various municipalities, employers and job seekers to a general network of employment related information	260
3. Self employment opportunities promoted through the establishment of MSMEs & improve the business /enterprise skills of people	450
Total Outcome 1 + 2 +3	980
Contingencies + salaries for new project staff	135
Grand total	1,115

In Scenario 1, savings resulting from cancelling activities under Outcome 2 are redirected to carry out additional sectoral studies and strengthening Outcome 3 because of the significance of self-employment to the Lebanese economy. A budget is reserved for the additional staff needed to support the project (included in the contingencies line).

The most important activity in Outcome 1 is equipping the refurbished offices. Repeatedly, this report pointed out that completing the enhancement of the pilot employment office is an important risk mitigation strategy and that it is the only way to put NEO on the right track. The scenario also completes the training of the PES officers, carries out the TOT, finalizes the preparation of all printed material, and enforces and materializes the connections between the project and NGOs. Nonetheless, the possibility of a conflict of interest has to be watched for when signing a protocol with an NGO. Some NGOs involved in the provision of employment charge for their services. In one of the interviews, it was stated that the charge reaches 40% of the salary of the first month, and then drops to 20%. Another NGO, which currently provides the service free of charge, is planning to charge for its services in the future. The source of conflict of interest is that the mandate of the NEO is to provide its services free of charge.

With respect to Outcome 2, beside completing the current “Hospitality Sector Study”, additional studies are encouraged. For, a sector study runs an assessment focusing on a single sector for the purpose of producing information on job opportunities, employers needs and skill gaps. Such information enables NEO to perform better job placement and

³⁰ ILO Progress Report, 27 March 2008 – 15 April 2009: “The NEO acquired a job matching system (named HRMS) 7 years ago, with a corresponding website for online and internet-based recruitment; the NEO has not been able financially to cover the support fees of the system. Lack of well functioning server has hampered efforts to connect data bases between existing offices.”

counseling services and facilitates extensive outreach to the employers thus increasing NEOs own visibility. Another area of interest is surveying the available data about the Lebanese labour market, its sources, means to collect and handle such data. This gives NEO a unique situation in the area of labour market information and prepares it to play its expected role in designing labour policy.

The scenario attaches special importance to upgrading ELE. It provides access to NEO's services to anybody anywhere. This will boost the visibility of the NEO in Lebanon. Also, it increases the productivity of PES officers tremendously. Furthermore, it publicize other material through its web site.

Scenario 1 favours Outcome 3 because it outreaches large segments of the Lebanese work force with emphasis on vulnerable groups and regions that suffer disparity. It maps vocational and business training centers, microfinance institutions for referral. KAB tool kit and workshops are added to the project activities along with job fairs and coaching.

5.2 Scenario 2

If a no-cost extension is approved, Scenario2 keeps all the activities under outcome 1 and outcome 3 as they are but scale them down (for example instead of holding 5 workshop each targeting 50 persons, hold 2 workshops each targeting 20 persons and so forth). The cut in spending on Outcomes 1 and 3 is directed to Outcome 2 which increased under this scenario by about by about 66%. The increase is directed to the LMIS.

Table 12: Summary Scenario 2

(Breakdown of Scenairo 2 is provided in Annex J)

Uncommitted Budget = \$ 855.7 thousand	
End of Project: December 31, 2011	
OUTCOME	BUDGET \$“000”
1. Increased institutional capacity of NEO to assist the un- & underemployed workers & ensure efficient & equitable provision on PES at the national and local level.	125
2. Improved connectivity of various municipalities, employers and job seekers to a general network of employment related information	415
3. Self employment opportunities promoted for men and women through the establishment of successful small enterprises and improve the business/enterprise skills of people in general.	180
Total Outcomes: 1 + 2 +3	720.0
Contingencies + salaries for the new project staff	135.7
Grand total	855.7

With respect to Outcome 2, besides completing the current “Hospitality Sector Study”, additional studies are encouraged. For, a sector study runs an assessment focusing on a single sector for the purpose of producing information on job opportunities, employers needs and skill gaps. Such information enables NEO to perform better job placement and counseling services and facilitates extensive outreach to the employers thus increasing

NEOs own visibility. Another area of interest is surveying the available data about the Lebanese labour market, its sources, means to collect and handle such data. This gives NEO a unique situation in the area of labour market information and prepares it to play its expected role in designing labour policy.

Outcome 3 should heavily exploit KAB as a means to raise the awareness of the masses of MSMEs especially that ILO/ROAS has the needed expertise.

There is a question about the ELE. The investment for this activity will be at risk if Lebanon decides to nationalize a version of OCIS different from that of the NEO. To safeguard against wasting large investment, the project should agree with concerned Lebanese institutions especially CAS on the OCIS which is expected to be acceptable nation-wide.

6. Efficiency and Effectiveness

The project spending is subject to the strict financial regulations of the ILO according to the “Arrangements” signed between CIDA and ILO/ROAS. This assures the efficiency of the spending. Most of the spending has been for capacity development activities. All the training activities were carried out in distinguished places: study tour to Canada, ITC, specialized Canadian trainers carry out training in Lebanon, field visit to Tunisia, workshop about the Jordanian model in Lebanon. The quality of the output of all expenses are excellent.

The effectiveness of project implementation has been bogged down by several delays. Many months were lost at the beginning because of the change in CTAs, and the virtually absent role of the PSC. The delay in the refurbishing of the pilot employment offices, and in the provision of the necessary equipment has further impeded project implementation (all issues are addressed above). However, efforts aiming at joint implementation of activities with resource sharing can improve the project effectiveness (Activities 1.1.4, 1.2.4, 3.1.1, 3.1.3).

7. Sustainability

Several factors assure the project sustainability. First, sustainability is a part of the project design through training of trainers to assure the continuation of flow of knowledge and expertise of the adopted model from older to newer generations. Second, a set of publications provides source to preserve technical information. Third, project ownership by the labour market stakeholders is an important guarantee for project sustainability.

8. Cross Cutting Issues

8.1. Gender

Women fall under the vulnerable groups category, especially widows accommodating their own families. Vulnerable groups are part the design of project services. Furthermore, special programs are dedicated to women. For example, an NGO will be contracted to conduct entrepreneurship training for rural women.

8.2. Poverty Alleviation

Poverty reduction is one of the cross-cutting themes ILO pays attention to. This project is about poverty reduction. It combats it *via* adopting all the possible means leading to improving the labour market and making it easily accessible for the unemployed categories with special attention paid to those who are at disadvantage in the labour market.

8.3. Tripartism

ILO/ROAS has adopted tripartism effective the preparatory phases of this project and continued to adhere to it all the way long during the project implementation.

IV CONCLUSIONS

1. Lessons Learned

- The project ought to adopt a participatory management approach so as to enhance the ownership of the project by key stakeholders. The project is already reaching out for private sector stakeholders, but it is less active in reaching out to government stakeholders. For example, CAS will be conducting semi-annual labour force survey, the Ministry of Industry is planning an industrial survey with the support of UNIDO at the end of 2010, and so forth.
- The standard documents of an international development project should be prepared during the inception phase e.g. agreement between the executing agency and the host government, LFA, the Inception Report, and the Performance Measurement Framework (PMF). True, the project inception had taken place in highly exceptional circumstances following the 2006 war and at a time of relatively high degree of political instability; nonetheless completing the project documentation was very important in order to secure a smooth project progress.

2. Good Practices

- Coordination with local institutes operating in areas similar or complementary to those of the project mobilizes national resources to achieve development goals more effectively. The project established a methodology for referral system to: training opportunities (Activity 1.1.4). The Project established synergies with the ILO Skills Development project for South Lebanon and the ILO project in North Lebanon to promote the employability of Palestinian refugees, as well as NGOs for joint training and resource sharing (Activity 1.2.4). The Project collaborated with the ILO Skills Development project in carrying out a joint LMI related mapping activities (Activity 3.1.1), while it cooperated with RMF to organize three 3 job fairs and entrepreneurial skills development (Activity 3.1.3)
- The Project has succeeded in introducing modern M&E methods (RBM) in the management of the served institute (Output 1.3). This will serve to improve the running of NEO even after the end of the project.

- Training of trainers has served to ensure project sustainability through training new generations in NEO especially, which is an understaffed institution with a desperate need for geographic expansion.
- Supporting the international top management with a national counterpart or second-level management specialist has successfully ensured project continuation despite changes at the top level. The National Coordinator (NC) of the project was appointed around the mid of 2008. The NC has been following all project development since that time when changes took place at the top level.

3. Recommendations

3.1 Recommendations for MOL

- A. The MOL is recommended to speed up refurbishing the Beirut and Sidon employment offices, while relocating the Tripoli office to its new premises and preparing it. The pilot offices are necessary for achieving most of the project's tangible results, and are a key tool for risk mitigation.
- B. Since the project start, the PSC met only once in September 2009. It seems that getting the PSC to meet and to provide policy guidance and take vital strategic decisions is not feasible given the time limits facing the project. It is recommended to resort to ad hoc committees to address specific urgent issues.
- C. Of the first *ad hoc* committees to be called is one to approve a project intensive action plan that synchronizes the MOL and NEO commitments with the project activities.
- D. The Article 8 of the Law 80/1977 that prohibits the establishing private employment offices needs to be enforced.

3.2 Recommendations for the project management

1. As soon as possible, the project should request from CIDA an extension from March 31, 2011 to December 31, 2011 at no extra cost. The justification of the extension is to compensate for the time lost because of the unfavourable circumstances beyond the control of the ILO project team. The positive response of the MOL to CIDA's requests would support this request.
2. Once the fund is available, it should be the strategy of the ILO project team to carry out as many attainable assignments as possible in as fast as possible in order to minimize the effect of any risk factor beyond their control.
3. The coming phase requires carrying out several assignments simultaneously and at a high speed. So, it is recommended to support the current project management team by an additional 3 technical officers and one part-time administrative assistant.

4. Because of the strong interrelationship between outcomes 1 and 2, the project management must make sure that the achievements in these two outcomes are balanced through implementing the activities under each one at the same pace.
5. CAS has a critical role to play towards the realization of Outcome 2. Therefore, CAS status should be upgraded from a key stakeholder to a full partner in the implementation of Outcome 2. This upgrade should take the form of a signed protocol between the project and CAS to agree on OCIS, which is to be nationalized afterwards, and secure an electronic link for regular flow of data and information between the two bodies.
6. A protocol needs to be signed with the Ministry of Industry to share information especially the industrial survey the Ministry will carry out with UNIDO at the end of 2010.
7. The Project should coordinate with the Ministry of Social Affairs concerning the social projects that intersects with the NEO's activities.
8. Through the MOL the project should get connected to the NSSF so as to keep track and analyse labour professional and geographic movements.
9. Raising the public awareness of the role of the enhanced NEO is crucial for the sustainability of the project. Public awareness will boost the demand for NEO's services. If the society appreciates those services, then funds will be secured for its continuation.
10. Any savings that might be realized during project implementation should be directed to support entrepreneurship, address the problems of vulnerable groups, and reduce regional disparities.
11. The monitoring system is designed not only for the project but for NEO afterwards. The project should make sure that the NEO has fully adopted the RBM M&E system.
12. The hand-over phase of the project to the NEO cannot start unless there are at least 3 pilot employment offices operating at full capacity. The last three months of the project should be dedicated to ensuring a smooth transfer of project activities.
13. Whenever feasible, the project team should start early planning for a new project phase to build upon the current project after its successful completion. Quality achievements and good records are the project's assets.

ANNEXES



Annex A: TOR of the Mid-Term Evaluation

Support to Public Employment Services in Lebanon: Strengthening the Capacity of the National Employment Authority

Terms of Reference

Introduction and Rationale

Support Public Employment Services in Lebanon: Strengthening the Capacity of the National Employment Authority is a three year programme funded by the Canadian International Development Agency (CIDA) for a total sum of \$2.2 million for 2008-2010. The project seeks to provide technical support to the Government of Lebanon in employment services and labour market information development. The project provides technical assistance to the Ministry of Labour, working primarily to strengthen the capacity of the National Employment Office (NEO).

A midterm evaluation of the project to *Support Public Employment Services in Lebanon: Strengthening the Capacity of the National Employment Authority* will be conducted to enhance project performance and garner stakeholder consensus around a way forward for the remaining duration of the project. The primary purpose of the mid-term evaluation is to:

- Take stock of key project achievements, success factors and constraints faced by the project, including review of project design and accuracy of original risk analysis;
- Garner support and renew commitment among the key stakeholders around a strategy and work plan outlining the way forward for the remaining duration of the project;
- Provide lessons learnt and recommendations for the remaining duration of the project towards longer term impact.

Brief background on project

The Project to Support Public Employment Services in Lebanon is a three year programme funded by CIDA to provide technical support to the Government of Lebanon in employment services and labour market information development. The primary goal of the programme is to support the Ministry of Labour (MOL) and strengthen the capacity of the NEO. The project seeks to ensure:

4. Increased institutional capacity of the NEO to assist the unemployment and underemployed and ensure efficient and equitable provision on employment related services at the national and local level;
5. Improved connectivity of various municipalities, employers and job seekers to a general network of employment related information through the enhancement of the national labour market information systems and the development of an occupational information system;

6. Enhanced self-employment opportunities through the establishment of successful small enterprises and improved skills.

The project's official starting date was 27 March 2008. It effectively became operational in December 2008 upon recruitment of the Chief Technical Advisor. The project officially ends on 31 March 2011.

Project implementation has been delayed by several exogenous factors outside the control of the project. The Government of Lebanon has struggled throughout 2009 to establish the Cabinet and fill leading positions in the various departments, including the Ministry of Labour, considered the main partner in the implementation of this project. This has delayed project progress as staffing and in-kind government contributions, including IT infrastructure and other material resource requirements, that were expected from the Government of Lebanon were never received.

There were similar delays in the formation of the Project Advisory Committee due to objections by the NEO Director General on the structure of the PAC. As a result the PAC, which was originally planned to convene in May 2009, did not meet till September 2009.

The issue of insufficient staffing and in-kind contribution was brought to the attention of the Project Advisory Committee (PAC) and recommendations were made to the MOL to allow for the recruitment of 18 vacant technical positions considered essential by the Project to deliver and ensure sustainability of services envisaged. The ILO officially submitted a brief to the new Minister of Labour in December 2009 on the needed support and the necessity for a signed agreement between the Government and the ILO clearly delineating the specifics of MOL's in-kind contribution, and NEO's role and responsibilities in project implementation.

In the meantime, and to circumvent any further delays in project implementation due to factors outside the ILO's direct control, the Project has adjusted its main focus for 2010 emphasizing:

- Capacity building/training of NEO staff through the International Training Centre in Turin, study tours and local training events to enhance employment services presently offered and to become trainers for staff that will be recruited by NEO under the expanded structure;
- Increased visibility of NEO through the dissemination of the hospitality sector study, the launch of the electronic labour exchange and enhanced media presence;
- Improved productivity of the NEO through new tools like the electronic labour exchange;
- Development of self-instructional material for job seekers and employers.

Management Arrangements

A Project Coordinator was appointed on 1 October 2008 and the Chief Technical Advisor was appointed on 1 December 2008 but resigned in November 2009 for personal reasons. A new Chief Technical Advisor took over early December 2009, undertaking a review of planned activities at that time.

The Project is technically backstopped by the Senior Skills and Employability Specialist at ILO Regional Office for Arab States (ROAS). The Regional Programming Service Unit at the ILO ROAS provides programmatic support and facilitates the implementation of the project.

The Project Advisory Committee (PAC) was established in spring 2009. The PAC, which serves as an advisory and strategic guidance body for the project, gathers members representing the Ministry of Labour, Ministry of Education, National Employment Office, Association for Lebanese Industrialists, Labour Union, Central Administration for Statistics, ILO and CIDA.

Purpose, scope and clients

The purpose of the mid-term evaluation is to conduct an in-depth examination of project implementation, taking stock of main achievements and bottlenecks. The objective of this review is to enhance project performance and garner stakeholder support and consensus around a way forward for the remaining duration of the project.

The scope of the evaluation will be on the relevance, effectiveness, efficiency, impact and sustainability of project activities since the inception of the project until the time of evaluation. The evaluation will review project activities, outputs and outcomes to date, taking into consideration project duration, existing resources and political and environmental constraints. The evaluation will also take specific note of the role of ILO constituents, and the project's main partner namely the Ministry of Labour.

The primary clients of the evaluation are the ILO Regional Office for Arab States, the Ministry of Labour and CIDA. Secondary clients include social partners, and other units within the ILO that may indirectly benefit from the knowledge generated by the evaluation.

Questions and criteria to be used

- 1. Relevance: Evaluation examines the rationale for the intervention and looks at the relevance of the intervention.**
 - a. How is the project contributing to the national priorities/national development plans of the Government of Lebanon and more specifically the Ministry of Labour/National Employment Office?
 - b. Does the project respond to the real needs of the ILO constituents (Ministry of Labour, the Workers' and Employers' organizations)?
 - c. Are the planned project objectives and outcomes relevant and realistic to the situation and needs on the ground? How can they be made more relevant and realistic?
 - d. Does the project design take into account local efforts already underway and make use of existing capacity to address employability and access to labour market information? Does the project's original design fill an existing gap that other ongoing interventions have failed to address?

- e. Are the objectives of the project clear, realistic and likely to be achieved within the established time schedule and allocated resources? How can the project alternatively adjust its activities to ensure successful achievement?
 - f. Has the partnership with the MOL been strategic in terms of influence, capacities and commitment? How can the ILO consolidate and improve this partnership?
 - g. On which risks and assumptions does the project build? How crucial were they for the success of the project? How did factors outside of the control of the project affect project implementation and objectives and how has the project dealt with these external factors? How realistic were the risks and assumptions that the project built upon?
 - h. How appropriate and useful are the indicators described in the project document for monitoring and measuring results? If necessary, how should they be modified to be more useful? Are the means of verifications for the indicators appropriate?
- 2. Effectiveness and efficiency: Evaluation assesses the effectiveness of achieving expected results. It examines the efficiency in the use of inputs to yield results, while concomitantly gauging the satisfaction of intended beneficiaries.**
- a. Is the project likely to achieve its planned objectives in a timely manner?
 - b. Are the project partners using the outputs produced by the project? Have the project outputs been transformed by the project partners into outcomes?
 - c. Which components of the Project had the greatest achievements? What have been the supporting factors? How can the ILO build or expand on these achievements?
 - d. In which areas does the Project have the least achievements? What were the main bottlenecks and institutional constraints and how have they been addressed?
 - e. Is the project developing and building the capacities of national partners and tripartite constituents? How effective has the project been in establishing national ownership? Has the project been appropriately responsive to the needs of the national constituents and changing partner priorities?
- 3. Impact and sustainability: This relates to what has been learned and identifies good practice to guide the way forward for the remaining duration of the project.**
- a. For the remaining duration of the project, how can the project best ensure that results will be anchored in national institutions and local partners will be able to maintain them by the end of the project?
 - b. What are some of the lessons learned from the Project? What is the recommended course for the project for the remaining duration of its implementation?

Methodology

The evaluation will be conducted by an evaluation consultant, with expertise in the technical area in question and some knowledge of M&E, who will undertake a one week mission to Lebanon. The

evaluation will be participatory to the extent possible, engaging ILO constituents, beneficiaries, and other stakeholders.

The evaluator will first carry out a desk review, collecting all the relevant information available on the project. If additional info is needed, the evaluator will consider conducting focus groups or surveys. This information will be circulated in advance to the key stakeholders and partners who will be invited to attend the evaluation workshop.

The evaluator will then launch an evaluation workshop to which key stakeholders and partners are invited. The objective of the workshop is: i) to gather additional information from the participants; ii) to answer the evaluation questions by reviewing and discussing the information on the project; iii) to make evidence-based recommendations on how the project should go forward.

The proceedings of the workshop will be documented and expanded into a short evaluation report.

Main outputs

The main output resulting from this exercise is an evaluation report. Mid-term-evaluation reports are usually shorter than those of independent final evaluations, usually 10-20 pages plus annexes. The report may follow the below generic outline:

Sample Structure Cover page with key project and evaluation data

1. Abstract
2. Purpose, scope and clients of evaluation
3. Evaluation questions
4. Methodology
5. Presentation of findings
6. Conclusions
7. Recommendations
8. Annexes

The mid-term-evaluation report will be circulated to key stakeholders (those participants present at the evaluation workshop will be considered key stakeholders) for their review. Comments from stakeholders will be consolidated as appropriate into the final evaluation report.

Management arrangements, duration and timelines:

The evaluation will be managed by the Chief of Programme at ROAS Beirut, in close coordination with the Chief Technical Advisor of the project. The Chief Technical Advisor, project staff, ILO responsible officials and other project backstoppers will provide appropriate technical and administrative support during the mid-term evaluation, as needed, and are responsible for follow-up action.

The Evaluation manager (EM) is responsible to:

- Draft the TOR;
- Finalize and approve the TOR with input from the stakeholders and the evaluators;
- Ensure proper stakeholder involvement;
- Participate in the evaluation workshop;

- Circulate draft and final report to stakeholders;
- Review and provide comments on the evaluation report;
- Ensure follow-up to the evaluation recommendations.

The CTA is responsible to:

- Review the TOR and provide input, as necessary;
- Provide project background materials and information;
- Participate in preparatory meeting prior to the evaluation workshop;
- Provide logistical and practical support, as needed;
- Participate in mid-term-evaluation workshop;
- Review and provide comments on the draft evaluation report;
- Incorporate evaluation recommendations in project implementation for the remaining duration of the project.

The expected starting date of the evaluation is 12 July 2010. The first draft of the Evaluation report is to be submitted by 30 July 2010. The final report is due by 6 August 2010.

Qualifications and experience:

The evaluation consultant shall have:

- Technical expertise in the employment sector;
- Experience in the design, management and evaluation of development projects;
- Some knowledge of the Arab region;
- Fluency in spoken and written English, with strong editorial skills in English, knowledge of Arabic an asset;
- Experience facilitating workshops for evaluation findings.

Annex B: List of Shared Documents

Title
Project agreement with CIDA/project document/logical framework/project budget
Progress report 08-09
Progress report 09
Progress update first quarter 2010 -May 2010
Project agreement – letter NEO signed by the Minister (government contribution to the project)
Project financial report
Project budget
Grant arrangement amendment 1 (12/3/2010)
LMIS deliverable (mission 1 of Dr. Kellett)
LMIS deliverable (mission 2 of Dr. Kellett)
Sector studies
Training on employment counseling EECE (first training Nov 2009)
Study tour in Tunis
Study tour in Canada
Study tour in Canada
Training in Turin
Workshop on LMIS july09
Training on employment counseling EECE (second training)
Preliminary action plan Dec 2008
Action plan for the second quarter of 2009
Action plan prepared for 2010
Latest action plan (Matrix)
Model of an employment office center
Self-instructional materials (job interview guide, guide to job hunting)
List of trainings planned (EDS, LMIS, ELE,OCIS)
ToT offer and training phase III on the Canadian model
CRI offer to conduct and analyze available LMI
Executive meeting (8June2010)
Situational analysis and progress update (8June2010)
Steering committee meeting
Steering committee terms of reference
Project summary simplified meeting MOL 23 Dec2009
Project justification and PES future (list of staff needed and challenges)
Council of Ministers decision
Presentation at the PSC meeting
Presentation at the executive meeting
Ministerial statement (cabinet)
Mandate of NEO-decree law
Memorandum of Understanding (Ar/Eng)
ILO P&B 2010-2011
Lebanon UNDAF
Lebanon country brief labour market 2010 07 2
Paris III
ILO final report

CCA 2007
Summary guide – evaluation
Checklist for evaluation report

Annex C: List of Interviewed Stakeholders

Organisation and position	Name
Ministry of Labour	
MoL (H.E the Minister)	H.E Mr. Boutros Harb
MoL (Minister Advisor)	Mr. Bassem Khalife
MoL (Minister Advisor)	Mr. Ziad El Sayegh
MoL (Minister Advisor)	Mr. Joseph El Jemayel
MoL (Minister Advisor)	Mr. Riad Maalouf
MoL (Director General)	Mr. Abdallah Razzouk
MoL (Chief Statistic Department)	Mr. Piotr Falou
National Employment Office	
NEO (Director General)	Mr. Nabil Tabet
NEO (Chief department-employment offices)	Mrs. Dolly Feghali
NEO (Chief department – Statistics)	Mr. Hussein Chalhoub
NEO (chief department - IT)	Mr. Georges Fadel
NEO (employment officer/counselor – Beirut office)	Ghada El Nachef
NEO (employment officer/counselor – Beirut office)	Ghada Dahdouh
NEO (employment officer/counselor and working in the unit of people with disabilities– Beirut office)	Viviane Saade
NEO (employment officer/counselor – Beirut office)	Ali Abou Taam
NEO (employment officer/counselor and responsible of the employment office in Tripoly/North Lebanon)	Raymond Mouawad
NEO (employment officer/counselor and responsible of the employment office in Tripoly/North Lebanon)	Joumana El Abed
CIDA (Country representative)	Mr. Daniel Joly
CIDA (Local officer)	Ms. Rana Maalouf
CGTL (Labour Union)	Mr. Bchara Cheeyah
Ministry of Industry (studies and industry development)	Mr. Paul Masri
Ministry of Industry (studies and industry development)	Mr. Maher El Khatib
Consultations and Research Institutes	Mr. Redha Hamdan Ms. Rania
Rene Mouawad Foundation (General Manager)	Mr. Nabil Mouawad
Rene Mouawad Foundation (employment center manager)	Mr. Johnny Namnoum
JCC	Ms. Yousra Taleb
UNRWA (supervisor)	Oussama Yassine
Canada	Mr. Arthur Mills
ILO	
Regional Director	Ms. Nada Al-Nashif
Senior Skills and employment specialist	Ms. Mary Kawar

Specialist in skills development systems	Mr. Michael Axmann
Chief of Programme at ROAS Beirut	Mr. Jean-Francois Klein
Chief Technical Advisor	Mr. Gregor Schulz
Research Economist	Mr. Tariq Haq
Employer's specialist	Mr. Hisham Abou Jaoude
Worker's specialist	Mr. Walid Hamdan
SME specialist	Ms. Rania Bikhazi
Programme unit	Ms. Rasha Tabbara
National Project Coordinator	Mr. Roy Abijaoude
National Project Coordinator	Ms. Rania Hokayem

Annex D: List of Participants in the Focus Group

20/7/20100

Organisation and position	Name
National Employment Office	
NEO (employment officer/counselor – Beirut office)	Ghada El Nachef
NEO (employment officer/counselor – Beirut office)	Ghada dahdouh
NEO (employment officer/counselor and working in the unit of people with disabilities– Beirut office)	Viviane Saade
NEO (employment officer/counselor – Beirut office)	Ali Abou Taam
NEO (employment officer/counselor and responsible of the employment office in Tripoly/North Lebanon)	Raymond Mouawad
NEO (employment officer/counselor and responsible of the employment office in Tripoly/North Lebanon)	Joumana El Abed
JCC; Employment counsellor	Ms. Yousra Taleb
UNRWA (supervisor)	Oussama Yassine
ILO; National Project Coordinator	Mr. Roy Abijaoude
ILO; National Project Coordinator	Ms. Rania Hokayem

Annex E: List of Workshop Participants

27 July 2010

Organization	Name	Position
Ministry of Labour	Piotr Falou	Chief of Department of Statistics
Ministry of Labour	Bassem Khalife	Advisor
Ministry of Labour	Riad Maalouf	IT consultant
National Employment Office	Nabil Tabet	Director General
National Employment Office	Dolly Feghali	Head of employment department
National Employment Office	Hussein Chalhoub	Chief of statistic Department Labour Force
National Employment Office	Eng Georges Fadel	IT manager
National Employment Office	Raymond Mouawad	Chief office of the North
National Employment Office	Elie Berbari	Head of vocational training department
National Employment Office	Hanadi Mikdache	Employment counselor
Consultations and Research Institute	Rami Kiwan	Researcher
Central Administration for Statistics	Najwa Yaacoub	Statistician Acting head of department
Central Administration for Statistics	Lara Badre	Sociologist Social Statistics Department
Ministry of Social Affairs	Adel El Chabab	Head of the IT department NPTP coordinator
ILO	Nada Al-Nashif	Regional Director
ILO	Mary Kawar	Skills and employment development specialist
ILO	Michael Axmann	Specialist in skills development systems
ILO	Walid Hamdan	Workers' specialist
ILO	Rania Bikhazi	SME specialist
ILO	Rasha Tabbara	Senior Programme Assistant
ILO	Sanaa Abou Sleiman	Programme Assistant
ILO	Gregor Schulz	Chief Technical Advisor
ILO	Rania Hokayem	National Project Coordinator
ILO	Abdelhamid Kalai	Chief Technical Advisor
ILO	Majd Farhat	Employment specialist

Annex F: MODIFIED LFA

Country/Region:	Lebanon	Project No.	Z 020868
Project Title:	Support to Public Employment Services in Lebanon	Project Budget:	\$2,200,000*
CEA/Partner Organisation:	The International Labour Organization (ILO)	Project Manager:	Gregor Schulz
Date	August 2010	Project National Coordinator:	Rania Hokayem
Narrative Summary	Expected Results	Performance Indicators	Risk Analysis
<p>Project Goal</p> <p>The project will contribute to raising the level of employment for poverty reduction in Lebanon in the aftermath of the war through the pursuit of a strategy that increases institutional capacities to deliver active labour market programming.</p> <p>The project will assist the Lebanese Ministry of Labour and Employment Authority by identifying strategies and transmitting ILO and International Donors expertise and know-how in the area of employability development programs and interventions for the productive employment and re-employment of</p>	<p>Expected Impact</p> <p>Enhanced employment opportunities for unemployed and underemployed workers through improved labour market governance at the national and local level.</p>	<p>Number of jobseekers successfully matched with job opening through PES; by geographic region & major vulnerable groups</p> <p>% of labour market mobility (both geographically and occupationally) and by vulnerable group.</p> <p>Number of integrated displaced workers & of vulnerable groups distributed geographically</p> <p>% of job seekers who found suitable employment through the use of job placement & other services distributed geographically & by vulnerable groups</p> <p>% of job placements through labour market</p>	<p>1. The political environment deteriorates due to instability or conflict in Lebanon</p> <p>MEDIUM</p> <p>Mitigation: The project achieves tangible quality results accompanied by strong awareness campaign</p> <p>2. The adaptation of the transferred model is not genuine, so NEO stops using the acquired techniques after the end of the project</p> <p>LOW</p> <p>Mitigation: the above strategy</p>

workers displaced by the war.		intermediary system distributed geographically & by vulnerable groups % of successful enterprises by participants in the entrepreneurship program distributed geographically & by vulnerable groups The NEO and the MOL are delivering labour market programs	
Project Purpose (Objectives)	Expected Outcomes	Performance Indicators	Risk Analysis
<p>The project will achieve its goal through 3 interrelated outcomes that will focus on institutional capacity building, labour market intermediation services information system development and promotion of self employment</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • • The strategy will be based on the identification of specific opportunities to enhance the capabilities of the NEA to organize and implement expeditiously and effectively projects with an employability development dimension 	<p>1. Increased institutional capacity of the NEO to assist the unemployment and underemployed workers and ensure efficient and geographically equitable provision of employment related services at the national and local level with special attention to vulnerable groups.</p>	<p>Job seekers satisfaction rate</p> <p>Number of individual plan of action for job market integration developed</p> <p>Quality of LM decision making tools for both</p>	<p>3. Rendering key committees ineffective decision bodies</p> <p>HIGH</p> <p><u>Mitigation</u>: From the key stakeholders, form <i>ad hoc</i> committees to handle specific issues</p> <p>4. Lack of coordination among government institutions regarding matters on employment issues and job training policies</p> <p>HIGH</p> <p><u>Mitigation</u>: Adopt a participatory management approach, promote common understanding among various stakeholders, and open a dialogue</p>

		<p>workers and employers</p> <p>% of employment counsellors making effective use of the OIS.</p> <p>Access rate by employers and workers to information on job opportunities and job seeker data at the local, municipal and national levels</p> <p>Frequency of use of the information system by key stakeholders</p> <p>Number of beneficiaries (women and men) attending BDS trainings by geographic and main vulnerable groups distribution</p> <p>% of enterprises initiated by BDS participants who started business out of the number of BDS trainees</p> <p>% of those who continuing in business out of those started it</p>	<p>among key stakeholders on labour market and project on-going policy matters.</p>
Inputs/Activities	Expected Outputs	Performance Indicators	Risk Analysis
<p><i>Activities</i></p> <p>1.1.1. Train employment officers (PES officers) to provide assessment counselling</p>	<p>Outcome 1</p> <p>1.1. Employment service programs/interventions designed and implemented, including job search assistance and employability counseling</p>	<p>Number of employment centres at the national level offering employability services according to</p>	<p>5. Transferred expertise fades away over time especially that it is not in use</p>

<p>1.1.2. provide guidelines and training to assist PES officers in setting up set up job search training programs</p> <p>1.1.3 Train PES officers to provide individual and group employment counselling & job search assistance</p> <p>1.1.4 Work with Lebanese counterparts in setting up referral system to refer selected clients to appropriate training opportunities</p> <p>1.1.5 Implement a case management and reporting system</p> <p>1.2.1 Develop training course content in collaboration with Lebanese counterparts</p> <p>1.2.2 Implement a training for trainers course for a cadre of selected NEA staff</p> <p>1.2.3 Participate in the joint delivery of training for trainers</p> <p>1.3.1 Design and implement a monitoring and evaluation system</p> <p>1.3.2 Provide guidance in conducting monitoring and evaluation and collaborate in initial reports and other feedback mechanisms</p> <p>1.4.1 collaborate with relevant associations/institutions for the</p>	<p>programs and services</p> <p>1.2. Sustainability of the programme ensured through Training for Trainers</p> <p>1.3. Results based monitoring and Evaluation (M&E) System developed</p> <p>1.4 Develop partnerships, with capacity building activities, with relevant</p>	<p>defined standards of quality</p> <p>Guidelines produced and used by job seekers and employment officers</p> <p>List of Lebanese counterparts for referral system mapped and used</p> <p>Management reporting system in place</p> <p>Number of trainers certified to provide training in each of the project's components</p> <p>Lessons learned in each of the 5 components are reported under key success factors: achievement of results; cost-effectiveness of results; relevance of results; appropriateness of design and resource utilization; and informed and timely action taken.</p>	<p>LOW-MEDIUM depending on how soon the offices will be enhanced</p> <p>Mitigation: MOL speeds up refurbishing the pilot employment offices and the project equips them</p> <p>6. Trained officers leave NEO to higher-income jobs</p> <p>HIGH</p> <p>Mitigation: NEO has to take measures to offset such possibility & enough number of officers receive training in each field</p> <p>7. Low budget for government departments participating in the development and deployment of various employability measures inherent in the project</p> <p>MEDIUM</p> <p>Mitigation: the same as # 1</p>
--	---	--	---

<p>training of staff and external stakeholders in initial pilots</p> <p>2.1.1. Develop guidelines for the implementation of an LMI system</p> <p>2.1.2 Prepare a conceptual design for a country-wide application</p> <p>2.1.3 Draw up specifications for hardware and software requirements, i.e. computer analysis programs and operational specifications</p> <p>2.1.4 Develop format for setting up stakeholder advisory committees</p> <p>2.1.5: Negotiate with potential LMIS clients the willingness to accept assessment of the interface between their systems & LMIS.</p> <p>2.1.6: Secure the approval of LMIS clients to implement changes, time frame & finance.</p> <p>2.1.7: Implement changes</p> <p>2.2.1. Develop an Occupational Information System (OIS) and adapt a job matching system from existing</p>	<p>associations</p> <p>Outcome 2</p> <p>2.1. Country-wide LMI network established</p>	<p><u>A list of relevant institutions is prepared.</u></p> <p>(merge the two)</p> <p><u>Communication protocols are signed to secure institutional cooperation</u></p> <p>LMI software developed, tested and installed in selected offices.</p> <p>LMIS pointer system that can accommodate a variety of Lebanese products (such as the electronic labour exchange) in place;</p> <p>Gap analysis of the LMIS conducted</p>	
--	--	--	--

<p>system in M.E. region</p> <p>2.2.2 Prepare a user guidebook</p> <p>2.2.3. Design and implement a training course for NEO employment officers</p> <p>3.1.1. Conducting a mapping of existing vocational training programs, business management training, and micro-finance providers, to whom the PES officers can refer their clients.</p> <p>3.1.2 Create work teams (Entrepreneurship coaches) and familiarize them with the various components of the entrepreneurship program</p> <p>3.1.3 Prepare the groundwork to set up workshops in selected regions</p> <p>3.1.4. Launch the entrepreneurship program by setting up pilot projects in designated areas</p> <p>3.1.5 Validate the training provided to the coaches and assess the activities and procedures for the clients for the clients participating in the program</p> <p>Inputs</p> <p>- CIDA: \$ 2,800,000</p> <p>- ILO: \$ 85,029**</p>	<p>2.2. Computer-assisted occupational information system (OIS) developed</p> <p>Outcome 3</p> <p>3.1. Entrepreneurship Training Program implemented</p>	<p>% of employers increased efficiency and effectiveness in posting their job orders</p> <p>NEA/NEO work teams created and familiarized with the various components of the Entrepreneurship programs</p> <p><u>% of those who started business out of the number of BDS trainees”</u></p> <p><u>% of those who continuing in business out of those started it</u></p> <p>I would replace the two above with number of workshops conducted</p>	
--	--	---	--

- MOL: \$922,960**			
--------------------	--	--	--

*Total CIDA's support to the project will be up to \$2,800,000. \$600,000 is reserved for the "Palestinian Component" of the Project once planning is finalised.

**Amounts are based on exchange rates of February 14, 2006

Annex G: TERMS OF REFERENCE of JOINT PROJECT STEERING COMMITTEE

SUPPORT TO PUBLIC EMPLOYMENT SERVICES

LEB/08/01M/CAN

I - BACKGROUND

Further to a needs assessment in 2006 conducted by the ILO in coordination with the Lebanese Government in the perspective of post crisis economic reform, it was concluded that there was a need for an enhanced public employment service strategy through strengthening the capacity of the National Employment Authority to develop a program for labour market and employment development.

Consequently and in partnership with the National Employment Authority, the International Labour Organization has entered in 2008 into an agreement with the Canadian International Development Agency (CIDA) to implement a project to support the National Employment Authority (NEA) of the Lebanese Ministry of Labour (MOL). The project will establish and strengthen the necessary supportive arrangements including institutions, information, human and other resources within the NEA to eventually enable them organize and implement effectively projects with an employability development dimension.

The development of such strategy will entail broad local, governmental and international consultations including the establishment of a joint project steering committee as part of the management strategy for the project to specifically oversee preparation as well implementation of the 5 project components. These components are:

- Design and implementation of employability development measures in the areas of needs assessment, employment counseling assistance and delivery of job search training
- Improve the national labour market information system as a part of an overall public employment services and a national program for skills training
- Develop an occupational information system
- Design and implement an entrepreneurship training programme
- Develop and implement training for trainers course

II – ROLE OF THE STEERING COMMITTEE

The Steering Committee will be established at the outset of the project to monitor overall progress towards achievement of the project's objectives and will serve as an advisory and strategic guidance council for the project and will monitor attainment of the project's objectives against a series of measurable criteria.

Specifically the Steering Committee will be to:

- Engage in finding all possible synergies with other local and international agencies in the country to strengthen partnerships and synergize outputs;
- Oversee development of a project plan to guide the strategy's development including a comprehensive methodology and key milestones. As well define role and contribution of each stakeholder to the action plan;
- Monitor project achievements and seek attainment of project objectives: oversee the management of the project to ensure its objectives are being met in a measurable and verifiably manner; Maintain a close watch on technical delivery to ensure that the project objectives are being translated into measurable and verifiable benefits;
- Provide experts advice to guide the contents of the strategy;
- Oversee the development of the Labour Market Information system including identification of the priority labour needs and data to be disseminated as well define architecture of the LMIS in terms of content and key priority indicators;
- Prioritize and endorse appropriate mechanisms to ensure the strategy is effectively implemented and provide advice, assistance and strategic planning for training on small businesses and entrepreneurial workshops for targeted clientele;
- Review relevant policy decisions and ensure their implementation effectively and efficiently;
- Collaborate together to facilitate use of an internet-based LMI system to provide inter-connectivity to other ministries, departments, NEO and other organization WEB sites;
- Consider reports/submissions submitted by members or experts relevant to the strategy;
- Review and approve the funding of the various program components and supervise the budgetary disbursement, procedures, allocation and re-allocation;
- Approve all the specified reports and work plans and ensure that the monitoring and evaluation procedures and general management functions are being performed in accordance with international best practices;
- Address and settle all program issues related to policy, administrative coordination and financial aspects of program implementation;
- Issue comprehensive meeting minutes with details of attendees, an overview of program outputs, a summary of progress, financial expenditure, constraints and outstanding issues; and
- Participate in the evaluation of the project achievements including conveyance to meetings to ensure that the design and construction of LMIS is satisfactory to all stakeholders.

III - MEMBERSHIP

The Steering Committee will be chaired by the Ministry of Labour (MoL) and comprise representatives of various key stakeholders who will serve for the period leading up to the accomplishment of the abovementioned project components targeted for 2011.

The Steering Committee (SC) will be formed of the following listed members:

- The National employment authority
- The ILO (ILO) and the ILO project staff as secretarial team to the SC.
- One (1) representatives from the MoL
- One (1) representative of CIDA
- One (1) representative of the Ministry of Education
- One (1) representative of the Central administration for statistics
- One (1) representative of the Association of Lebanese industrialists
- One (1) representative of the Labour Union

Other organisations/groups/individuals such as representatives from civil society (NGOs), UNRWA, ESCWA, UNDP, FAO, the World Bank among others that may have an interest in the development of the SC and project components may be invited to join the committee at any time with the agreement of the listed members.

The membership of the committee shall be restricted in maximum to one representative per organisation, of which should be drawn from a senior management structure. Any alterations to that shall be discussed and approved by majority consensus of the members.

IV - MEETINGS

The Steering Committee will meet in accordance with the milestones indicated in the project management strategy i.e on a semi-annual basis to ensure timely review and sign-off of critical planning stages. Additional meetings may be convened if required.

The committee member will be provided with an ad-hoc agenda prior to each meeting and will be provided with minutes of proceedings and decisions of each meeting as soon as practicable after each meeting.

The committee may approve that a person has an observer status at a committee meeting. A person given observer status may speak to the meeting or meetings on issues discussed by the committee with the approval of the Chairperson (MoL).

The venue for each meeting will be decided by the committee and will, in so far as possible, be reflective of the membership of the committee and the geographical remit of the planned service. (A suitable central venue might be used or venues might be changed to reflect full geographic spread).

V – CONFIDENTIALITY

Members should maintain confidentiality of committee discussions and of information made available to them where appropriate. Items of confidentiality will be identified in the agenda papers circulated to committee members. Items of confidentiality may also be determined by the committee as each issue is being discussed, and members may choose to leave the meeting during that discussion. Members shall not use, either directly or indirectly committee information for material gain or influence a decision for material gain.

VI – REPORTING

A record of each meeting will be kept by a designated note-taker. Note taking will revolve to the ILO project staff member of the committee. It is the responsibility of the designated note-taker to ensure that each member of the committee receives the notes from the previous meeting not less than 24 hours before the date of the next meeting. Alternatively, a supporting secretary may be appointed for the meetings.

A comprehensive semi-annual report must be presented to (ILO and NEA). The report is to summarise the matters considered by the Steering Committee during that period, highlighting key issues related to strategy, projects progress and policy.

VII – AMENDMENTS

Amendments or adjustments to these Terms of Reference may be made at any time with the agreement of the committee.

The Steering Committee will review its purpose, aims, objectives and achievements to date three (3) months after the date of formation of the committee.

ANNEX H: Scenario 1

Uncommitted Budget = \$ 1,115 thousand; End of Project: March 31, 2011	
OUTCOME / ACTIVITY	BUDGET \$“000”
1. Increased institutional capacity of NEO to assist the un- & underemployed workers & ensure efficient & equitable provision on PES at the national and local level	
Finalise the guide “Marketing Yourself & Preparing Your Resume” (1.1.2)	10
Finalise the training materials on group job search workshops (1.1.3)	10
Finalise the methodology for referral system to training opportunities (1.1.4)	10
Finalise the training plan for Lebanese counterparts (1.2.1)	10
Complete TOT of NEO’s officers inside Lebanon (1.2.2)	25
Jointly with ILO Skills Development project, ILO Palestinian project & NGOs, implement the co-training & resource sharing in designated pilot sites (1.2.4)	30
Arrange for referrals to community employment support agencies with NGOs	10
Equip the refurbished NEO three pilot offices	25
Contract trainers and implement training (coaching + phase III) for the NEO officers on the adopted Canadian model	30
TOT on the electronic system	40
Media campaign on the occasion of the enhancement of each office	10
Train the NEO staff on the use of M&E system (1.3.1)	30
Finalize self-instructional materials & guidebooks for job seekers and employers on job interviews and job search activities	30
Subtotal Outcome 1	270
2. Improved connectivity of various municipalities, employers and job seekers to a general network of employment related information	
Contract a qualified consulting firm to (2.1.1): <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • collect available primary & secondary data & information on the labour market • Store collected material in a database suitable for NEO • Analyze collected material • Assess data availability & difficulties involved in its collection • Design a protocol for data collection to be adopted by NEO • Whenever possible, NEO concerned staff should participate in the assignment in order to gain experience 	90
Complete and disseminate the “Hospitality Sector Study” (2.1.1) Initiate another 2 sectoral studies	90
Hire an IT consultant(s) to: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Develop guidelines to enhance NEO’s ELE • Train operating & maintenance personnel • Test and improve the functionality of the system • Prepare necessary manuals 	30
Procurement of ELE equipment	50
Subtotal Outcome 2	260
3. Self employment opportunities promoted through the establishment of MSMEs & improve the business /enterprise skills of people	
Map existing vocational & business training centers & micro-finance providers for referral (3.1.1)	20
Prepare a tool-kit on entrepreneurship & KAB	20
Organize MSMEs & entrepreneurship workshops properly distributed geographically in collaboration with experienced NGO	200
In cooperation with an experienced center, implement 3 job fairs & entrepreneurial skills development in the several geographic regions (3.1.3)	70
Undertake training on entrepreneurship programs for NEO staff	20

Coach & train work teams on entrepreneurship & KAB including the 3 who received similar training in Canada study tour (3.1.2)	30
Launch entrepreneurship program by setting up pilot projects in designated areas (3.1.4)	70
Validate training provided to coaches & assess activities & procedures for clients participating in the program (3.1.5)	20
Subtotal Outcome 3	450
Total Outcome 1 + 2 + 3	980
Contingencies + salaries for new project staff	135
Grand total	1,115

Annex J: Scenario 2

Uncommitted Budget = \$ 855.7 thousand; End of Project: December 31, 2011	
OUTCOME / ACTIVITY	BUDGET \$“000”
1. Increased institutional capacity of NEO to assist the un- & underemployed workers & ensure efficient & equitable provision on PES at the national and local level.	
Finalise the guide “Marketing Yourself & Preparing Your Resume” (1.1.2)	5
Finalise the training materials on group job search workshops (1.1.3)	5
Finalise the methodology for referral system to training opportunities (1.1.4)	5
Finalise the training plan for Lebanese counterparts (1.2.1)	5
Complete the TOT of NEO’s officers inside Lebanon (1.2.2)	10
Jointly with ILO Skills Development project, ILO Palestinian project & NGOs, implement the co-training & resource sharing in designated pilot sites (1.2.4)	10
Arrange for referrals to community employment support agencies with NGOs	5
Equip the refurbished NEO three pilot offices	30
Contract trainers & implement training (coaching + phase III) for the NEO officers on the adopted Canadian model	20
Media campaign on the occasion of the enhancement of each office	10
Train the NEO staff on the use of M&E system (1.3.1)	10
Finalize self-instructional materials & guidebooks for job seekers & employers	10
Subtotal Outcome 1	125
2. Improved connectivity of various municipalities, employers and job seekers to a general network of employment related information	
Contract a qualified consulting firm to: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • collect available primary & secondary data & information on the Lebanese labour market • Store collected material in a database suitable for NEO’s mission • Analyze collected material • Assess data availability & difficulties involved in its collection & means to overcome it • Design a protocol for data collection to be adopted by NEO • Whenever possible, NEO concerned staff should participate in the assignment in order to gain the required experience 	50
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Complete and disseminate the “Hospitality Sector Study” • Initiate another 2 sectoral studies 	90
Hire an IT consultant(s) to: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Develop guidelines for the implementation of ELE/LMIS • Prepare a conceptual design for a world-wide application • Draw up specifications for hardware & software requirements • Train operating and maintenance personnel to run the system • Test and improve the functionality of the system • Prepare necessary manuals 	70
Procurement: LMIS/ELE equipment	150
Train counselors to use ELE/LMIS	5
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Develop OCIS & adapt a job matching system from existing system in M.E. region, • Prepare a user guidebook. • Design & implement a training course for NEO counsellors on OCIS 	50
Subtotal Outcome 2	415
3. Self employment opportunities promoted for men and women through the establishment of successful small enterprises and improve the business/enterprise skills of people in general	
Map existing vocational & business training centers & micro-finance providers for referral (3.1.1)	10

Prepare a tool-kit on entrepreneurship & KAB	10
Organize MSMEs & entrepreneurship workshops properly distributed geographically in collaboration with experienced NGO	70
In cooperation with an experienced center, implement 3 job fairs & entrepreneurial skills development in the several geographic regions (3.1.3)	30
Undertake training on entrepreneurship programs for NEO staff	10
Coach & train work teams on entrepreneurship & KAB (3.1.2)	10
Launch entrepreneurship program by setting up pilot projects in designated areas (3.1.4)	30
Validate training provided to coaches & assess activities & procedures for clients participating in the program (3.1.5)	10
Subtotal Outcome 3	180
Total Outcomes: 1 + 2 +3	720.0
Contingencies + salaries for the new project staff	135.7
Grand total	855.7