





Title YEP – Youth Employment Promotion Programme

Program Number TIM/07/03/AUS

Donor Australian Government Aid Program

Implementing Agencies Secretariat of State for Vocational Training and

**Employment** 

**International Labour Organisation** 

**Type of Evaluation Independent Mid-term Evaluation** 

**Consultant** M Wheelahan

Date of Report April 2010

The views expressed in the Consultants' report do not necessarily reflect the views or policies of the International Labour Organisation (ILO), or Australian Government Aid Program (AusAID). Terminology used may not necessarily be consistent with ILO official terms.

# **Table of Contents**

1. EXECUTIVE SUMMARY	3
2. PROJECT BACKGROUND	8
2.1 CONTENT OF THE PROGRAMME	8
2.2 PURPOSE, SCOPE AND CLIENTS OF EVALUATION	9
3. METHODOLOGY	11
4. FINDINGS	12
4.1 Relevance	12
4.2 VALIDITY OF DESIGN - IMPLEMENTATION APPROACH	13
4.3 EFFECTIVENESS – SUMMARY OF ACHIEVEMENTS	14
4.3.1 Component 1 Policies and Strategies for Youth Employment	14
4.3.2 Component 2 Employment and Training Opportunities for Young Women and Men	15
4.3.3 Component 3 Labour-Intensive Public Works	
4.3.4 Component 4 Competency-based education and training system	21
4.4 EFFICIENCY	24
4.5 Sustainability	
4.6 MONITORING AND EVALUATION	26
4.7 Gender Equality	26
5. CONCLUSIONS	28
6. RECOMMENDATIONS AND LESSONS LEARNED	29
APPENDICES	32
APPENDIX 1, TERMS OF REFERENCE FOR THE MID-TERM EVALUATION (SEPARATE DOCUMENT)	32
APPENDIX 2: LIST OF PERSONS MET	32
APPENDIX 3: SUMMARY OF PROPOSALS ELIGIBLE FOR CONSIDERATION BY FEFOP	
APPENDIX 4: SUMMARY OF STAFFING DISPOSITION BY DIRECTORATE	35
APPENDIX 5: FINANCIAL DELIVERY	36

#### **Acronyms and Abbreviations**

AusAID Australian Agency for International Development

CDE "Centro de Desenvolvimento Empresarial" (Business Development Centre)

CEOP Employment and Career Guidance Centre

DNAFOP National Directorate of Vocational Training (SEFOPE)

DNE National Directorate of Employment (SEFOPE)
EVTF Employment and Vocational Training Fund

FEFOP Fundo de Emprego e Formação Profissional (EVTF)

GEMS Gender Mainstreaming Strategy

GYBI Generate Your Business Idea training programme

IADE Institute for Business Support ILO International Labour Organization

INAP National Institute of Public Administration
IYB Improve Your Business training programme
INDMO National Labour Force Development Institute
KAB Know About Business training programme

LED Local Economic Development
LMI Labour Market Information
MFIs Micro-Finance Institutions
MoE Ministry of Education

MOU Memorandum of Understanding

NCAAA National Commission for Academic Assessment and Accreditation

NYEAP National Youth Employment Action Plan

OJT On-the-Job Training SC Strategic Component

SEFOPE Secretariat of State for Vocational Training and Employment

SEPI Secretariat of State for the Promotion of Equality

SIMU SEFOPE Computerised Labour Market Information System

SPWG Solar Power Working Group

STEC Short Term Employment Creation Department of SEFOPE

SYB Start Your Business training programme

TLNQF Timor Leste National Qualifications Framework

TOT Training of Trainers
TP Training Provider

TVET Technical Vocational Education and Training

VT Vocational Training

YEP Youth Employment Promotion Programme

# 1. Executive Summary

The Youth Employment Promotion Programme (YEP) is a four-year programme funded by the Commonwealth of Australia, represented by the Australian Agency for International Development (AusAID), and by the Government of Timor-Leste, through the Secretariat of State for Vocational Training and Employment (SEFOPE). The ILO is the implementing agency working with SEFOPE. The YEP has an overall budget of US\$ 18,023,735, with US\$ 10,000,000 to be funded by SEFOPE and US\$ 8,023,735 funded by AusAID.

YEP has four specific objectives, which coincide with the programme components:

- i. A set of policies for Youth Employment consistent with the National Employment Strategy, developed and adopted by the Timor-Leste Government;
- ii. Employment and suitable training opportunities for young women and men provided by established Employment Centres and Youth Career Centres, in collaboration with partner organisations;
- iii. A safety net created for most deprived rural poor through the organisation of Labour-Intensive Public Works in critical periods and geographical areas;
- iv. A competency-based education and training system, providing Timorese youth with relevant skills in accordance with the labour market requirements, established and operational.

# **Purpose and Scope of Evaluation**

This independent mid-term evaluation reviewed the extent to which the project partners and beneficiaries have benefited, and will continue to benefit, from the project's strategy and implementation arrangements.

The scope of the evaluation is the overall YEP Programme in all strategic components as implemented at the central and district levels as specified in the Project Document and Contribution Agreement between ILO and AusAID. The review covered the period from project inception in March 2008 until February 2010.

The framework for the evaluation was provided by ILO's standard policies and procedures on evaluations and AusAID requirements as specified in the Contribution Arrangement signed with the ILO.

#### Methodology

The evaluation methodology included a review of documents related to the YEP programme and a mission to Timor Leste from 1-19 March 2010. Interviews and consultations with stakeholders took place in Dili and selected districts and field visits were made to Ermera, Railaco, Maliana, Baucau Venilale and Manatuto to assess the impact of component implementation in these locations. A stakeholder workshop was conducted in Dili on 18 March at which the preliminary findings and proposed recommendations of the evaluation were presented.

#### **Findings and Conclusions**

The evaluation found that the YEP Programme had been well-designed and its objectives remain equally valid and relevant today particularly in the context of the Government's national priorities for 2010 as well as AusAID's Australia—Timor Leste Country Strategy.

Overall progress towards planned objectives has been positive if somewhat fragile and there is good evidence to expect that end-of-Program Outcomes are likely to be achieved. As mentioned earlier, the project implementation arrangements have been working effectively and are contributing to the gradual, growing capacity within SEFOPE and IMDMO.

The implementation approach adopted by the CTA has been highly effective with national project staff being recruited directly on Government conditions of service and with all project staff and international advisers being located within SEFOPE and INDMO ensuring that project activities have been institutionalized within SEFOPE.

Good progress has been made across all four components of the YEP programme and there are signs of growing capacity within INDMO and SEFOPE. The development and promulgation of the National Youth Employment Action Plan (NYEAP) has been successful and legislation has been passed to cover the operations of INDMO and FEFOP. The Skills Training Policy has been finalized and a Gender mainstreaming draft Document has been circulated within SEFOPE.

Collaboration arrangements between SEFOPE, INDMO and Ministry of Education (MoE) are working well and other stakeholders have been included wherever appropriate. The FEFOP has become a very useful mechanism for providing direct assistance to young people under its various components with the self employment module proving particularly effective in generating income earning opportunities and community empowerment especially for women in poor local communities.

The full establishment of the NQF will require a Decree Law approved by the Parliament. The Ministry of Education will prepare this law for submission to the Council of Ministers and subsequently to the National Parliament. The NQF Law is important for INDMO because it will define linkages between the Vocational Training system under SEFOPE, and the Technical Education under the Ministry of Education.

YEP has strongly supported the development of Youth Career Centres and all staff have received comprehensive training in counseling skills. An expanded counseling program is currently being implemented and it will be important to monitor the effectiveness of this activity in assisting the very large target group of young people.

Labour intensive work arrangements on road maintenance have been highly effective at the District level with more than 35,000 placements under the scheme since the project commenced. This component has been accompanied by successful implementation of literacy and numeracy and HIV/AIDS awareness training.

The labour market information system (SIMU) has recently been upgraded to meet SEFOPE's growing needs and it will also provide an IT application to support CEOP activities in the near future. The provision of improved labour market information and analysis will bring considerable benefits not only in highlighting trends and emerging areas of skill demand but also in providing up to date information to assist employment counselors in their work.

# **Recommendations**

#### **INDMO** and Vocational Training

- SEFOPE, AusAID and the ILO should promote with donors that fund projects which include capacity building and training to ensure that such work takes place within the scope of the TLNQF to foster sustainability and future skills recognition. The projects should link with accredited local training providers in providing competencies. This requirement should also be promoted by SEFOPE through the Government's National Priorities Working Group 3 on Human Resource Development. The upcoming Development Partners meeting in Dili and the ILO's work within the UN Development Assistance Framework provide important opportunities to promote use of the TLNOF.
- YEP should intensify the awareness raising campaigns and promotion of the NQF agenda and registration and accreditation requirements to educate training providers, employers and trainees on the new arrangements.
- A strong case should be made by SEFOPE and ILO to the National Government as
  well as to potential donors to ensure adequate budget and resources are allocated to
  INDMO and SEFOPE so that this work can be completed. AusAID should also
  consider further funding needs beyond the current project life.
- To ensure the sustainability of the vocational training reforms beyond the current project life, ILO should seek donor support to cover:
  - Assistance to MoE in the preparation of NQF Legislation. This is a crucial step to consolidate the mandate of INDMO. Despite the fact that the INDMO Decree Law has been approved by the Council of Ministers and by the Parliament in 2008, there is a risk that inappropriate NQF Legislation may supersede INDMO Law and eventually impact negatively in its mandate and in the definition of the entire Vocational Technical Education and Training system.
  - Support for training providers to allow them to meet registration and accreditation standards and as part of the implementation of the Qualifications framework.
  - Longer term support to accredited training providers to deliver national qualifications, including support for the development of appropriate materials.

#### **FEFOP**

- The training and employment-related opportunities available under FEFOP should be
  widely promoted and the Government should maintain annual budget allocations at
  least at the 2009 budget level. With the Fund's operations now well established,
  SEFOPE, ILO and AusAID should consider opportunities for diversifying sources of
  funds, including through additional donors.
- The approval and contracting process of the self employment module under this model should be simplified and streamlined to minimize disruption and delays in the delivery of the program to the participants.

#### **CEOP's and Youth Counseling**

- The individual case management approach to counseling clients is currently being implemented by CEOP staff. This programme is both ambitious and resource intensive and should be reviewed in 6 months time including feedback from clients to assess its effectiveness and the outcomes being achieved.
- CEOPs should develop 'group' counseling approaches to convey information and guidance to groups with similar information needs or similar aspirations.
- Display of materials and information in CEOP offices should be improved and pamphlets and brochures on training and employment opportunities should be made available for distribution in CEOP offices and more widely, based on a specific communication effort in the next few months.

#### **Labour Intensive Works**

- Budget allocations for labour intensive works should continue and specifically target rural and remote communities. The training programmes for literacy and numeracy, HIV/AIDS awareness and family planning should be continued and should also target young people in local communities.
- There are eight teams of field engineers, supervisors and contractors based in SEFOPE and in the field with funding from YEP and TIM WORKS. ILO should alert potential donors proposing any follow-up labour-based road projects to the availability of this expertise to minimize the loss of positions when the TIMWORKS project concludes, either in June 2010 or end of 2010 if the expected extension is indeed approved.

# SIMU – the National Labour Market Information System

 Further support and enhancements to the LMI system (SIMU) database software should be considered to improve the usefulness and efficiency of the database and its reporting capability. If this is not possible within existing YEP resources, ILO and SEFOPE should identify other opportunities. SEFOPE and ILO should seek donor support for the unit to develop greater capacity
to analyze data such as the LF survey and other data collected by various units within
SEFOPE and report on labour market issues.

# **Gender Equality**

• Effective gender mainstreaming requires a dedicated effort and resources. ILO, SEFOPE and AusAID should consider this and arrange for specific gender expertise to be available to implement the SEFOPE gender mainstreaming strategy, including through i) training of staff and capacity building, where elements of ILO tools such as the Participatory Gender Audit could be adopted and ii) further research and analysis of gender in employment, using SIMU as a source of data and determing gender-specific social and economic barriers for gainful employment of men and women.

# **Lessons Learned**

The integrated approach adopted by the CTA and project team has resulted in implementation being fully embedded within the organizational framework of SEFOPE and INDMO. The recruitment of national project staff using a Service Contract with the Ministry enabled national staff to be recruited directly on Government conditions of service. This approach is promoting counterpart ownership and is facilitating the capacity building process as well as potentially enhancing sustainability in the longer term if these staff and their expertise are retained by SEFOPE after the project has finished. Current results show that SEFOPE has been able to gradually expand its core staff over a number of years, taking on well-tested and experienced staff that were brought in through YEP funding or that of earlier ILO projects using a similar approach.

This approach should be seriously considered by other development partners where other projects require a significant number of national staff to be recruited. ILO may want to discuss this with relevant Government institutions (Ministry for State Administration) and with its UN partners.

Experience with vocational training reforms in other countries confirms that major vocational training initiatives such as those being undertaken in Timor Leste take a long time to be implemented fully and require ongoing support. There will also be a need for continuing support from international advisors beyond the life of the current project and SEFOPE and ILO should prepare well in advance a succession plan.

# 2. Project Background

The Youth Employment Promotion Programme (YEP) was designed in 2007-2008 to contribute to addressing the high rates of youth unemployment (ages between 15 and 29) in Timor-Leste (18.4% nationally and 35.0% in urban areas). The youth unemployment rate is 3 times higher than the overall unemployment rate. One reason for this is the changing demographic profile of the country as a result of rapid population growth. Economic growth and job creation has been insufficient to absorb the estimated 15,000-20,000 new entrants into the labour market each year. There has also been continuing migration from rural areas to cities predominantly by young people seeking employment and a better life. Most remain unemployed and those that do find jobs invariably do so in the informal economy.

#### 2.1 Content of the Programme

The programme document outlines the following four specific objectives:

- i. A set of policies for Youth Employment consistent with the National Employment Strategy, developed and adopted by the Timor-Leste Government;
- ii. Employment and suitable training opportunities for young women and men provided by established Employment Centres and Youth Career Centres, in collaboration with partner organisations;
- iii. A safety net created for most deprived rural poor through the organisation of Labour-Intensive Public Works in critical periods and geographical areas;
- iv. A competency-based education and training system, providing Timorese youth with relevant skills in accordance with the labour market requirements, established and operational.<sup>1</sup>

Based on these four specific objectives, the YEP Programme's interventions cover four main components:

# **Development of Youth Employment Policies**

This involves the development of a National Youth Employment Action Plan, the establishment of a Youth Employment Fund and the creation of a Labour Force Development Institute.

# Promotion of a supportive environment for successful school-to-work transition

This includes targeted career guidance and counseling services delivered by the Youth career Centres and access to specific funding and support through the Youth Employment Fund.

# **Creation of Short-Term Employment opportunities**

This is achieved through a programme of Labour Intensive Public Works.

# **Establishment of the Labour Force Development Institute**

This will be responsible for developing the Timor Leste vocational training system, establishing a national system of competencies and a national certification framework.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup>Page 15 Programme Document TIM/07/03/AUS.

The YEP Programme is targeting all 13 districts of Timor-Leste, aiming to assist an estimated 70,000 beneficiaries, of which 40% are to be women.

The YEP programme is funded by the Commonwealth of Australia, represented by the Australian Agency for International Development (AusAID), and by the Government of Timor-Leste, through the Secretariat of State for Vocational Training and Employment (SEFOPE), which is also the main national counterpart of the Programme. The ILO is the implementing agency working with SEFOPE. The YEP is a 4-year programme with an overall budget of US\$ 18,023,735, with US\$ 10,000,000 to be funded by SEFOPE through the Employment and Vocational Training Fund (FEFOP), and US\$ 8,023,735 funded by AusAID. It builds on earlier work of the ILO related to the promotion of employment under the STAGE project.

Additional support was made available in May 2009 when AusAID and ILO signed an agreement for the National Labour Force Development Institute (INDMO) Support Facility. The overall objective of this agreement was to strengthen the implementation of the INDMO mandate more efficiently across priority industry sectors and with vocational training providers. The outputs correspond directly with the outputs for Strategic Component 4 and have been integrated into the YEP Programme work plan. This additional Support Facility was funded under the AusAID Emerging Priorities Fund.

#### 2.2 Purpose, Scope and Clients of Evaluation

# **Purpose**

The YEP project has now been implemented for 24 months. This independent mid-term evaluation reviewed the extent to which the project partners and beneficiaries, including the SEFOPE, partner government institutions, service delivery networks and youth in targeted communities have benefited, and will continue to benefit, from the project's strategy and implementation arrangements.

The evaluation has reviewed the project's strategy and implementation arrangements specifically in terms of relevance, effectiveness, efficiency, sustainability, gender equality promotion, monitoring and evaluation, knowledge sharing and learning environment. Within these parameters, the independent mid-term evaluation assessed the following:

- the progress made in relation to the planned achievements of the results and the immediate objectives, including a preliminary assessment of the impact of the programme;
- the programme management, coordination mechanisms among the partners and the effectiveness and efficiency of programme implementation in general;
- institutional arrangements within SEFOPE to support the implementation of the YEP programme during and beyond the timeframe of AusAID funding;
- project's experiences that can be learned with regard to achieving gender equality within each strategic component;
- the design and performance of the INDMO and the National Qualifications

Framework, which have received additional funding as "component 5" of the YEP as per the Amendment No 2 of the Contribution Agreement between ILO and AusAID in April 2009.

The terms of reference for the evaluation are shown in Appendix 1.

## Scope

The scope of the evaluation is the overall YEP Programme in all strategic components as implemented at the central and district levels as specified in the Project Document and Contribution Agreement between ILO and AusAID. The review covered the period from project inception in March 2008 until February 2010

#### Clients

The evaluation findings and recommendations are provided to the ILO, AusAID and SEFOPE as well as to the YEP steering committee as such. They may want to request the ILO programme management to take the recommendations into account and to inform subsequent steering committee meetings about how this has been done.

The evaluation also took into account other institutions with mandates and programmes that support the achievement of the goals of the YEP including the Ministry of Education, the Ministry of Infrastructure, Timor-Leste trade unions and employers' organizations and relevant ILO technical backstopping units and partner UN agencies of the ILO in Timor-Leste.

The evaluation was an independent review conducted by Michael Wheelahan, International Consultant. Frederico Boadiva, National Consultant also participated in the evaluation. Staff from the AusAID Office in Dili took part as observers in the field visits. The Evaluation Manager for ILO was Peter Rademaker, ILO Geneva and the cost of the evaluation was covered by the YEP programme. ILO Jakarta provided the administrative support.

# 3. Methodology

The framework for the evaluation was provided by ILO's standard policies and procedures on evaluations and AusAID requirements as specified in the Contribution Arrangement signed with the ILO.

The evaluation methodology included a review of documents related to the programme, such as the initial programme document, progress reports and reports to the Steering Committee Meetings, a review of other relevant documents such as the Timor-Leste 2008, 2009 and 2010 National Priorities Working Groups, National Development Program, AusAID Country Strategy (2009-14), Timor-Leste Decent Work Country Programme (2008-2013) and the Timor-Leste UNDAF (2008-2013).

The evaluation mission to Timor Leste took place from 1-19 March and comprised a program of interviews and consultations with stakeholders. Field visits were conducted in Ermera, Railaco, Maliana, Baucau Venilale and Manatuto. An important criterion in selecting these locations was the potential to review activities across all of the components of the YEP project. The consultants identified the key stakeholders of the programme to be interviewed, drawn from counterpart Ministries and Departments, Steering Committee members, programme beneficiaries and project staff.

At the completion of the field mission, a stakeholder workshop was conducted in Dili on 18 March and the preliminary findings and proposed recommendations were presented. A list of persons interviewed as part of the evaluation is shown in Appendix 2.

# 4. Findings

#### 4.1 Relevance

The YEP programme objectives remain very much in line with the Government of Timor Leste's national priorities for 2010, in particular, Priority 3 on Human Resources Development relating to its objective 'to establish the National Qualifications Framework (NQF) and accredit training' and for 'Young women and men to successfully complete labour market orientated vocational training with employment outcomes'.<sup>2</sup>

With its focus on increasing employment by promoting vocational education and training, improving access to employment information and career counseling, labour intensive initiatives and by promoting private sector development through local community training and access to microfinance, the YEP Programme is also directly in line with one of the key focus areas in the Australia–Timor-Leste Country Strategy 2009 to 2014.<sup>3</sup>

From the outset of the project, the SEFOPE and other relevant stakeholders have been fully involved in developing the programme components and this has continued during project implementation, ensuring strong local ownership and commitment to the Programme.

#### **Definition of Youth**

It was noted that the YEP Programme uses a definition of youth as those within the age range of 15 to 29 years old. The rationale for this was outlined in the original programme document. "Many international organisations, including the World Bank and UN, currently define youth as those between the ages of 15 and 24 years. This age bracket is used in statistical data analysis and makes comparisons of data possible across time and countries. However, for a qualitative analysis, additional considerations to age are relevant. These qualitative indicators are obviously culturally constructed and highly depending on the economic conditions in the country. Since youth is a transitional phase in life, between childhood and adulthood, several developing and emerging economies define youth within the range of 15 to 29 years old, recognising the effects high rates of unemployment has in delaying adulthood. At present, the Government of Timor-Leste has not officially defined an age range for "youth" or other specific policies targeting young people beyond school age. The YEP Programme, considering the high rate of unemployment in Timor-Leste, uses a definition of youth as being between the ages of 15 and 29."<sup>4</sup>

The use of this definition remains appropriate during the life of the project but in the longer term SEFOPE may need to ensure that the definition aligns with any changes

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> Pp5,6, 2010 Draft National Priorities Matrix (draft 28 January 2010) Timor Leste Government.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> Page 9 Table 1: Indicative strategy objectives and outcomes. Australia-Timor Leste Country Strategy 2010-2014, AusAID.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> Pg 28, Programme Outline Document, TIM/07/03/AUS.

introduced by the National Statistics Office as this may facilitate analysis and comparison with other data sources.

# 4.2 Validity of Design - Implementation Approach

A major feature of YEP implementation has been the integrated approach adopted by the management team. National project staff and international advisors have been located in SEFOPE and implementation has been fully embedded within the organizational framework of SEFOPE and INDMO from the beginning of the project. The approach used to recruit staff as part of the YEP implementation strategy meant that rather than hiring national staff on ILO contracts, the Project established a Service Contract with the Ministry which enabled all national staff to be recruited directly on Government conditions of service. This approach promoted counterpart ownership and team spirit, and facilitated the capacity building process as well as sustainability in the longer term, allowing the Ministry to fill new permanent positions by selecting the best staff out of those initially recruited on temporary contracts under the YEP/Ministry Service Agreement. The project office is also physically located within the Ministry precincts and each international specialist/advisor works with a counterpart.

The result has been a high level of stability and continuity amongst the national staff who have been recruited throughout the project and there is every indication that this strategy and the accompanying investment in staff training will be a significant factor in the retention of expertise within SEFOPE and INDMO and therefore contribute to the sustainability of the programme's achievements.

The four-year implementation timeframe has provided the opportunity for strong capacity building initiatives to be introduced and reinforced within the SEFOPE and INDMO. During the remainder of the project, it will be increasingly important that staff take on independent responsibility for their actions and there are signs that key staff are gaining more confidence in carrying out their duties.

Another significant factor contributing to the success of YEP has been the high calibre and expertise of the international technical staff, most of whom already had considerable experience working in Timor Leste. Their commitment and collective efforts working closely with counterparts has ensured a strong team approach and the effective transfer of skills and competencies to staff both within SEFOPE and INDMO.

The capacity building framework for sustainability envisaged in the Project design is proving effective in reality with YEP adopting the practice of working directly alongside and building the capacities of national government counterparts in INDMO and SEFOPE. Although good progress is being made particularly in relation to Component 4/5, the reforms being implemented in relation to Vocational Training as well as the full establishment of the NQF, competency standards and the accreditation process are all long term initiatives and it is highly likely that further support beyond the life of the current project will be needed to ensure the longer term sustainability of the reforms.

It was noted that the Steering Committee had recommended in December 2009 that enhanced coordination arrangements should be developed. During the evaluation, the Principal Advisor to the Secretary of State for SEFOPE also highlighted the ongoing need to strengthen coordination. The Chief Technical Advisor (CTA) advised that SEFOPE and YEP have now organised quarterly meetings, to be chaired by the Secretary of State for Vocational Training and Employment, and involving SEFOPE Directors and Chief of Departments, and ILO international Advisors and the first of these quarterly meetings will take place in April 2010.

The full establishment of the NQF will require a Decree Law approved by the Parliament. The "Timor-Leste NQF" Decree Law is at the top of the list of legislation to be prepared by the Ministry of Education for submission to the Council of Ministers and subsequently to the National Parliament.

The NQF Law is important for INDMO because it will define linkages between the Vocational Training system under SEFOPE, and the Technical Education under the Ministry of Education. The NQF Law is also very important for a number of specific training institutions attached to other Ministries like Health, Agriculture, State Administration, and Defense. The NQF Law will define a framework to clarify how those training institutions not under the Ministry of Education or under SEFOPE, fit in the educational/training system. Both SEFOPE and INDMO have developed gender mainstreaming strategies which they are currently implementing. For example, the INDMO gender mainstreaming strategy touches on integration of gender concerns into INDMO internal human resources policies, planning, and management practices as well as establishment of gender-specific targets in its programmes of activities, including capacity building of vocational training providers in the field of gender equality promotion<sup>5</sup>.

#### **4.3** Effectiveness – Summary of Achievements

Overall progress towards planned objectives has been positive if somewhat fragile and there is good evidence to expect that end-of-Program Outcomes are likely to be achieved. As mentioned earlier, the project implementation arrangements have been working effectively and are contributing to the gradual, growing capacity within SEFOPE and IMDMO.

Further work will be necessary to consolidate these achievements and it will be important to recognize that implementing a new national vocational training framework and at the same time building the institutional capacity to support it will take time and cannot be rushed. A more detailed examination of progress in relation to each of the four components follows.

#### 4.3.1 Component 1 Policies and Strategies for Youth Employment

Under this component, the program supported the development of a set of policies for

\_

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> Pg 55, YEP Progress Report 3 September 2009.

youth employment consistent with the National Employment Strategy. These policy development initiatives envisaged under the programme have largely been achieved during the first half of the project.

A key initiative was the development of the National Youth Employment Action Plan (NYEAP) which provided a framework for action in four key areas, namely employment generation, employability, entrepreneurship, and equal opportunities for young women and men. It was developed in partnership with SEFOPE, and in close consultation with the National Steering Committee on Youth Employment. Employer and worker organizations, youth groups, civil society and international organizations also participated in the development of the Action Plan.

The NYEAP was officially approved by the Government on 18 September 2009 and has provided a set of policies and strategies to address the youth employment challenge in Timor-Leste. The plan has also been an important instrument to mainstream gender into the national policies and programmes.

The Employment and Vocational Training Fund (FEFOP) Act was formally established and announced in the Official Gazette on 13 August 2008. Following this announcement, the YEP supported the development of the FEFOP management structure and implementation guidelines.

The National Vocational Training Policy was also jointly developed by SEFOPE with YEP support and was approved by the Council of Ministers in 2009. The Policy promotes a market-oriented competency-based training system, in which all certification will describe the competencies achieved as a result of the training.

A draft document outlining the SEFOPE Gender Mainstreaming Strategy was developed and translated into Tetum to facilitate further discussion involving all SEFOPE directorates and departments and eventual adoption and implementation by the Institution. This work is continuing and ILO may want to propose further support by way of international expertise to assist the gender coordinator in the development of action plans, surveys and analysis of issues to help mainstream gender issues.

# **4.3.2** Component 2 Employment and Training Opportunities for Young Women and Men

This component aims to help young people in the transition from school to work by providing access to career information, guidance and counseling as well as information on employment and training opportunities through Youth Career Centres to be established in SEFOPE's Employment Centres. It also provides access to employment promotion activities through a Youth Employment Fund (FEFOP).

These Employment and Career Guidance Centres (CEOPs) are now operating in Dili, Baucau, Bobonaro, and Oecusse. Construction of the CEOP in Ermera has been completed and it is expected to open in April this year. SEFOPE has plans to open

CEOPs in the districts of Covalima, Manufahi and Lautem. The YEP programme will support the construction of offices in Covalima and Lautem.

YEP has strongly supported the development of these youth Career Centres which are located in the CEOP offices and all staff have participated in a comprehensive training program to provide them with improved counseling skills and techniques. A Counseling manual called Jump Start has been developed to meet local requirements and copies of the manual in Tatum have been distributed and are being used in all offices.

The Career Counseling Manual itself provides comprehensive guidelines in 7 modules covering a wide range of employment and counseling needs and situations with detailed steps and processes which can be used. Potentially the counselor can work with individual clients over a number of scheduled interviews to conduct a personal 'needs' analysis and to develop an appropriate action plan to meet the individual's needs. All staff in the CEOPs received training during 2009 through a series of three 5-day workshops followed by on-the-job training and follow up in their offices. The overall objectives of the training were to develop CEOP staff capacity to provide employment and career guidance services and to establish a professional career guidance practice in CEOP employment centres.

A brief description of the process is as follows. A client first comes to the CEOP office for registration, then, after registration - now known as the First Interview under the new system - the client has a needs assessment interview with a counselor. The counselor then conducts or sends the client for a detailed 'interests and skills' profiling to help the client to better understand his/her own interests, skills, strengths and weaknesses and job preference. After that the client joins a job market orientation session along with other clients to consider available job, training, self-employment options. Modifications have recently been made to the IT software used in the CEOP centres to support the new counseling approach which is now being implemented more widely during 2010. This programme is both ambitious and potentially resource intensive and as it is still in its early stage of implementation, it is recommended that the approach should be reviewed in 6 months time including feedback from clients to assess its effectiveness and the outcomes being achieved.

While aspects of the counseling skills training have focused on providing an individualized case management approach, it will be very important to ensure that staff take a realistic approach and do not become 'process driven' i.e. they should not necessarily set out to offer each individual client a customized counseling program as this may not be appropriate or even possible given the large number of young people in the target group. Individual 'case management' of clients should be the exception rather than the rule.

The counseling programme to assist young people will expand during the second half of the project now that staff have been fully trained and formal approval has been received

-

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> Pg 7, DECG Staff Training Report No. 2, Career Guidance and Counseling Development in Timor-Leste. August 2009.

from MoE for CEOP staff to provide group counseling in schools. Given the large potential target groups of young people either in their final year of schooling or who have already left school and are unemployed, the highest priority should be to develop group counseling approaches than can be used to convey information and guidance to groups with similar information needs or similar aspirations. These sessions could be developed along occupational or industry grouping, e.g. information on training and job options in the hospitality and tourism sector. As an additional aid in the counseling process, consideration should be given to providing 'employment and training information' display areas in the offices and the preparation of pamphlets and brochures on a range of employment and training related topics which would be available to jobseekers and which could also be used to supplement information provided during counseling sessions. This promotional material could also be distributed more widely through local NGOs, church groups and community organizations.

The CEOPs have a difficult task and limited scope in providing conventional 'job brokerage' services because of the low number of employers and employment opportunities available in the formal economy. The evaluation team noted that, under the direction of Employment Services Department, the CEOPs are currently preparing annual work plans to help them prioritize their activities and improve their services to clients with particular emphasis on counseling services, working with vocational training providers and promoting the development of FEFOP proposals at community level. The review fully endorses the preparation of annual plans as a very good initiative which should help staff to focus on providing good services and achieving their target outputs.

#### SIMU – the National Labour Market Information System

The labour market information system (SIMU) has recently been upgraded to meet SEFOPE's growing needs and it will also provide support to the Employment and Career Guidance Centres in the near future by systematizing their registration and mediation activities with jobseekers. The YEP Programme has also supported the Labour Market Information Department and the National Directorate of Statistics to carry out a Labour Force Survey during 2010. The provision of improved labour market information and analysis will provide considerable benefits not only in highlighting trends and emerging areas of skill demand but also in providing up to date information to assist employment counselors in their work. CEOPs also need access to up-to-date labour market information in order to provide relevant information on employment and training opportunities and trends.

Further support and enhancements to the LMI system (SIMU) database software including improved anti-virus protection should be considered to improve the usefulness and efficiency of the database and its reporting capability. Support should also be provided for the unit to develop capacity to provide labour market information and analysis based on surveys such as the Labour Force survey and other data collected by various units within SEFOPE

#### **FEFOP**

In August 2008 the Fundo de Emprego e Formação Profissional (FEFOP) was officially established to support proposals to provide employment and training-related

opportunities for young people. FEFOP replaced an earlier Employment and Vocational Training Fund and established a new management structure and improved implementation and eligibility guidelines. The law establishing the fund enabled different types of programmes to be fully funded or co-funded through the FEFOP and implemented by the Government with the assistance of its development partners.

The new guidelines encouraged the submission of a broader range of proposals and provide far greater information on the types of proposals that could be supported and the evaluation criteria that would be used to assess proposals. Standardised application forms were provided and guidelines were readily available to assist groups to submit proposals. Greater emphasis was also placed on proposals to assist unemployed youth and these can include on-the-job training activities, work experience programs to promote better transition between training centres and enterprises, and internships to provide temporary opportunities for unemployed youth out of school who graduated from secondary school.

SEFOPE began publicizing the new FEFOP guidelines with a major publicity program late in 2008 and the district CEOP offices also played an important role in encouraging proposals from local communities. A summary of types of activity, target groups and key features of proposals which will be considered under FEFOP is shown in Appendix 3.

The Fund is administered through a Secretariat within SEFOPE and an Administrative Committee has been set up is responsible for the overall management of the Fund including approval or rejection of proposals and reporting requirements. The Administrative Committee is composed of representatives from SEFOPE, Ministry of Finance, Employers' Associations, and Trade Unions. YEP played a very important role in supporting the development of the current guidelines for applications under FEFOPE and in establishing the administrative arrangements for the operation of the fund but there is now a well trained team of SEFOPE staff who are managing the fund's operations with a greater degree of independence without direct YEP support.

A total of 58 proposals were approved during 2009 and a further 15 proposals had already been approved by the end of February 2010. The total cost of these 73 proposals was \$477,000. A summary of the proposals is shown in the following Table.

**Table 1: FEFOP Approvals** 

Mode	No of proposals	No of participants		
Wiode	approved	F	M	Total
Vocational Training	18	145	185	345
Work Experience	13	383	323	681
Internship	18	31	22	53
On-the-Job-Training	7	36	39	75
Strengthening Vocational Training Centres	1	24	3	27
Enterprise Training	9	935	140	1,075
Self-employment Promotion	7	1,400		1,400
Total	73	2,954	712	3,656

Source: SIMU Database SEFOPE

The FEFOP has become a highly effective vehicle for providing direct assistance to young people in a number of ways under its various components.

Despite the initial publicity, there is still considerable potential for the fund to be more widely promoted explaining how the fund operates, the types of activities that can be considered and how proposals should be developed. Scope also exists for the CEOP offices at district level to take a more active role in explaining FEFOP possibilities and to actively promote FEFOP at the local level.

It was noted on field visits that the self employment module has been particularly effective in generating income earning opportunities particularly for women in poor local communities. These ventures such as tofu making and pot plant making usually involve three elements – a skills training component, business management training and access to micro credit. At present each of these components are separately contracted and comments from participants indicated that there are sometimes delays or lack of continuity between the various components. The existing process is complex involving up to three different providers and consideration should be given to simplifying and streamlining the process to minimize disruption and delays in delivery to the participants.

# 4.3.3 Component 3 Labour-Intensive Public Works

This component aims to provide a safety net for the most deprived rural poor through the organisation of Labour-Intensive Public Works in critical periods and geographical areas. Where possible, the labour-intensive public works are synchronized to coincide with the agricultural slack seasons offering employment opportunities during these off-peak periods.

This component provided a substantial impact during the first year of the project with almost 32,000 people participating in labour intensive work programmes. The government allocated \$1.7 million for this activity during 2008 but only \$200,000 during 2009 which resulted in a significant reduction in the level of activity during last year. The allocation for 2010 is \$400,000 and the first round of road maintenance activities commenced in March 2010. The following table shows the number of persons employed on labour intensive activities over the last two years.

The overall target is to assist 50,000 persons under this component with 50% of participants being youth and 40% being women. To date, youth participation<sup>7</sup> is running at 41.4% of the total with females comprising 25% of those young participants. When placements are being arranged at community level, opportunities for women and young people are seen as the priority groups and participation of women has varied considerably across districts from as high as 36% in Dili to only 5% in Manufahi. (See Table 3: Number of participants by district).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup> YEP Programme uses a definition of youth as those between the age of 15 and 29 years old.

Table 2: Number of persons who receiving short-term employment

Period	F	M	T	Progressive
				total
Mar 2008-Feb 2009	8,098	23,853	31,951	31,951
Mar-Aug 2009	410	1,485	1,895	33,846
Sept-Nov 2009	361	1,016	1,377	35,223
Dec-Feb 2010 <sup>8</sup>	nil	nil	nil	35,223
Total	8,869	26,354	35,223	

Source: SIMU Database SEFOPE

The Short Term Employment Creation Department (STEC) in SEFOPE is responsible for implementing this labour intensive programme which covers road maintenance. Early in the project, YEP supported the development of draft policy guidelines for routine road maintenance including technical aspects of road maintenance as well as procedures for contracting out such work to community based contractors. This new approach to routine road maintenance developed by STEC has been shared and discussed with the Ministry of Public Works and others with a view to endorsing and subsequently up-scaling the approach.

STEC collaborates with Eight District Technical Teams (which are funded under the TIM-WORKS project) to ensure that there is good coordination and coverage. The STEC and District Technical Teams also work closely with the Public Works Regional Engineers and District Supervisors of the Ministry of Infrastructure. This approach has made it easier to agree on priorities for maintenance works on the road network and to coordinate with other ongoing or planned activities as well as to apply consistent standards and procedures in relation to labour-based work activities. These arrangements have worked well over the last two years; however as the TIM-WORKS project concludes in June 2010, it will be important to determine in advance if this expertise can be used beyond June 2010. At present a total of 48 positions (25 positions funded by YEP and 23 positions funded by TIM WORKS) including eight teams of field engineers, supervisors and contractors are based in SEFOPE. ILO should alert potential donors who may be considering any follow-up labour-based road projects of the availability of this expertise to minimize the loss of positions when the TIMWORKS project concluedes in June 3010.

Road maintenance activities have been carried out in all districts and the following table shows the numbers of workers participating by district since the programme commenced.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>8</sup> No short term employment activities were undertaken during this period. Pg 3 YEP Programme Monitoring Plan Q1 Dec 09-Feb 10.

**Table 3: Number of Participants by District** 

Number of Participants YEP -Cumulative - Nov-2009				
DISTRICT	F	M	Total	Women as % of Total
Aileu	376	2,234	2,610	14%
Ainaro	225	1,305	1,530	15%
Baucau	470	1,039	1,509	31%
Bobonaro	468	1,621	2,089	22%
Covalima	239	1,691	1,930	12%
Dili	3,592	6,456	10,048	36%
Ermera	368	2,296	2,664	14%
Lautem	625	1,517	2,142	29%
Liquica	718	2,135	2,853	25%
Manatuto	725	1,633	2,358	31%
Manufahi	91	1,855	1,946	5%
Oecusse	334	720	1,054	32%
Viqueque	638	1,852	2,490	26%
Total	8,869	26,354	35,223	25%

Source: SIMU Database SEFOPE

#### **Additional Work Skills**

An important aspect of the labour intensive works program has been to provide participants with additional work skills. More than 70% of the participants in the labour-intensive works are illiterate<sup>9</sup> and the YEP project supported initiatives to build the literacy and numeracy skills of participants to increase their employability in jobs and businesses, as well as to enhance their self esteem and ability to respond to the challenges faced by their families and communities.

Literacy and Numeracy training and HIV Awareness modules were developed and published in partnership with the National Directorate of Non-Formal Education of the Ministry of Education, the National Directorate of Employment of the SEFOPE, and UNICEF. Participation in this programme is voluntary and usually provided in conjunction with or immediately after labour intensive jobs have been provided in the area. The activity involves 108 hours of training for the Literacy and Numeracy programme, implemented over a 3-month period, and an additional 4 hours for the HIV Awareness training. The overall target is for 5,000 persons to be assisted under this programme. As at the end of February 2010, 2136 persons have participated with women comprising 61% of the total.

#### 4.3.4 Component 4 Competency-based education and training system

The National Labour Force Development Institute (INDMO) was established by the Timor-Leste Government<sup>10</sup> in March 2008. It is a partnership between the Government,

21

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>9</sup> P48, Analysis of participants in labour intensive public works, YEP Progress Report. 3 Sept 2009.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>10</sup> Refer Decree Law 8/2008

employers, worker organisations and vocational training institutions to establish a good quality vocational training system for Timor-Leste.

INDMO operates as an autonomous, public institution under the auspices of SEFOPE. Its objectives are to ensure that training is geared to labour market demand and it will achieve this by approving competency standards determined by the relevant industry sector for the jobs in that sector. INDMO will also accredit vocational training providers that meet the necessary requirements.

INDMO has made considerable progress over the last two years in developing the vocational training system in Timor-Leste. The INDMO Secretariat now has six staff and has received technical support from several international advisors under the project. During 2009 all staff were funded through the YEP Programme however INDMO expects that at least three staff will be funded within the Government budget for 2010.

The YEP programme has supported a number of professional development initiatives with staff participating in the Timor-Leste Training Partnership Program implemented by the Victorian State Government Department of Planning and Community Development, in Melbourne and a follow-up program in Timor-Leste on the quality standards for the registration and accreditation of vocational training providers. Two key staff also participated in a two week training program on vocational training policy and system development at the ILO International Training Centre of Turin, Italy. A staff needs assessment was also conducted to prepare a staff development plan which is being implemented during 2010.

The Executive Commission met regularly throughout 2009 approving the Terms of Reference for the industry Sub-Commissions in September and subsequently appointing four industry sector Sub-Commissions. The 10 member Tourism and Hospitality Sub-Commission was appointed in September and an additional three Sub-Commissions - Construction, Administration and Finance and Education, Training and Assessment - were appointed in December 2009.

These Sub-Commissions represent their respective industries within the vocational training system. Membership comprises six representatives from industry, two training provider representatives, one representative from organised labour and one from a relevant government ministry.

The initial tasks of these Sub-Commissions are to identify the job categories in their industry sector and the skills and knowledge required for each job and then to advise on the development of the competency standards for these skills and knowledge requirements. They will help to manage the process for the validation of the competency standards and advise on the grouping of competency standards into qualifications. These Sub-Commissions also play a key role in providing authoritative, independent advice on training needs and promoting skills development to their sector.

#### Registration and accreditation of vocational training providers

During 2009, DNAFOP and INDMO made good progress in defining quality standards for the registration and accreditation of vocational training providers. Draft standards have been prepared for approval and implementation will commence early in 2010. A workshop on registration was held in March 2010.

The vocational training providers consulted during the evaluation were generally aware of these developments although it is likely that more extensive promotion will be needed before the specific implications of these changes are fully understood by training providers.

#### The NQF

The Provisional Timor-Leste National Qualifications Framework (TLNQF) has been developed by the Ministry of Education in cooperation and consultation with SEFOPE and INDMO. The NQF covers education and training qualifications from Ensino Basico to Doctorate. Completion of Ensino Basico is the ninth year of formal education and is the last year of compulsory education. The proposed NQF has eleven qualification levels ranging from foundation level to doctorate.

The scope of the NQF includes qualifications currently offered by institutions registered by the Ministry of Education (universities, polytechnics, academies and institutes) and qualifications that will be offered by vocational training providers registered by SEFOPE and accredited by INDMO. INDMO and the National Commission for Academic Assessment and Accreditation (NCAAA) are the implementing agencies responsible for the NQF. Executive functions for the NQF will lie within the Ministry of Education in the Division of Higher Education.

Full implementation of the system is dependent on legislation to be drafted in 2010. In the interim, INDMO is using the draft framework to inform its work until final agreement is reached and the appropriate legislation is approved. A major presentation of the new Vocational Training System that will take place in March 2010 should demonstrate the partnership between SEFOPE and Ministry of Education in the implementation of the NQF", and will highlight the public endorsement of the System by the Government.

Although considerable consultation and awareness-raising activities has already taken place with various stakeholders it will become even more important for INDMO to promote its role more widely with stakeholders. Training providers will also need to have a clear understanding of the registration and accreditation processes and the implications of the competency standards for their own curricula and registration requirements. The work of the individual sub-commissions will need to be monitored to ensure that they progress satisfactorily and the remaining two years of the project will be very important in supporting this ongoing work. Although INDMO is building up a good quality team of staff it will be essential that the INDMO Executive Commission continues to receive adequate resources and budget to carry out their work. There is some concern that

INDMO's current budget for 2010 is inadequate to fulfill its mandate across all areas<sup>11</sup>. There also is considerable reliance on the guidance provided by international advisors and this will need to continue in the medium term. It is unlikely that the vocational training reforms currently underway would be able to continue if the present level of support was no longer available.

# **4.4 Efficiency**

The Steering Committee has met bi-annually and has taken a strong interest in the progress of the project. At its most recent meeting in December 2009, the Steering Committee made a number of useful recommendations resulting in enhanced coordination between SEFOPE Directors and Chiefs of Department and YEP. Other recommendations included the need for increased support to the Vocational Training Directorate and the need for a further upgrading the SIMU and LMI Department urging the completion of the new computerised Labour Market Information (LMI) System and a review of development plans for the SEFOPE staff assigned to the LMI Department. Another of their recommendations resulted in an increase in the coverage of the Work Skills Programmes being implemented in coordination with the labour intensive programmes resulting in more people being included in the training sessions on the literacy, numeracy and HIV/AIDS modules.

Coordination and collaboration with the Tim Works (an ILO road rehabilitation project), has been particularly effective with the teams of field engineers and supervisors working closely with STET staff in SEFOPE when implementing labour intensive road maintenance activities to ensure an integrated approach and to avoid overlap or conflicting workplans.

# **Expenditure Review**

A review of the expenditure and accounts was carried out and an high-level overview of the delivery is provided in Appendix 5. It was noted that the format of these accounts aligned to inputs rather than programme outcomes and it would be useful to consider preparing future budgets around budget lines organized by programme outcome rather than only around budget lines representing inputs. Possibly, ILO could consider representing such an outcome-based budget on an annual basis, reflecting expenditures by major component of the programme against their budgeted amounts.

The ILO Office, Jakarta, which is responsible for the administrative backstopping of the YEP programme, confirmed that all programme activities to date have been completed on budget and an interim budget statement was provided. ILO Jakarta also advised that there would be a request for some minor revisions in budgets for several line items but that overall the project was proceeding on budget. It also advised that ILO's accounts, including those of the programme, are subject to comprehensive internal and external auditing arrangements of the ILO.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>11</sup> Page 9, INDMO Progress Report #2, January-December 2009

The reviewer noted that the level of activities in 2008 and 2009, particularly in relation to Component 2 covering the operation of FEFOP and Component 3 relating to labour intensive work placements, were directly related to the annual government budget allocation to SEFOPE which varied from year to year. It will be essential for the Government to continue its budget support for these activities otherwise the achievement of existing targets could be jeopardized.

# **Staffing Support**

Under a service agreement with SEFOPE, the YEP project is currently funding a significant number of staff positions in SEFOPE related to the implementation of the project. As at the end of February, there were 54 positions - 37 positions in DNE, 11 positions in DNAFOP and 6 positions in INDMO - which were being paid for by the YEP project and this represents 46% of all staff. An additional 23 positions in SEFOPE were being funded under the TIMWORKS project. It will be important for SEFOPE to maintain the level of staffing associated with these functions currently funded by YEP and to progressively take over the cost of these staff if sustainability is to be ensured. The following table shows the total number of staff and source of funding by Division and a more detailed listing of Staffing Disposition by Directorate is shown in Appendix 4.

Table 4: Total Number of Staff by Division and Source of Funding

Period	PAID by SEFOPE	PAID by YEP	Paid by TIM Works	Total
DNE	47	37	23	107
DNADOP	17	11	-	28
INDMO	0	6	-	6
Total	64	54	23	141

#### 4.5 Sustainability

On the vocational training front, the reforms being developed by INDMO have been backed with appropriate government legislation and the wide involvement of external stakeholders particularly through the work of the industry sub commissions which is also ensuring wider awareness and interest in the developments taking place. Considerable progress has been made, nevertheless, these reforms relating to the establishment of a national qualifications framework and the accreditation process will continue long beyond the life of the current project and will require a long term commitment if they are to succeed.

Expectations from stakeholders will be high but it will be important that INDMO proceeds in a systematic way, consolidates progress with each industry sub commission and maintains good quality standards. There should be a clear strategy in place and plans for expanding into new areas should be linked very closely to INDMO's capacity to resource and support these developments.

As mentioned earlier, one aspect of sustainability at the end of the project will be the need for SEFOPE to maintain the level of staffing associated with functions currently funded by YEP. As at the end of February, there were 11 positions in DVT and 47

positions in Employment Division of SEFOPE and 6 positions in INDMO which were being paid for by the YEP project.

To ensure the sustainability of the vocational training reforms, it is expected that longer term support beyond the current project life, will be needed in the following three main areas:

- Preparation of NQF Legislation. This is a crucial step and once the INDMO
  Decree Law has been approved by the Council of Ministers and by the
  Parliament, the Ministry of Education will need assistance in the preparation of
  the legislation.
- Training providers will need support to allow them to meet registration and accreditation standards and as part of the implementation of the Qualifications framework.
- Accredited Training Providers will require long term support to deliver national qualifications, including support for the development of appropriate materials.

#### **4.6 Monitoring and Evaluation**

An independent monitoring and evaluation officer within the ILO office in Dili monitors YEP progress and regularly undertakes field trips to assess different aspects of YEP activities providing the project with written reports of his findings. He also oversees monthly and quarterly reporting and the updating of the YEP Programme Monitoring Plan Matrix. This in turn is complemented by the monitoring of ILO Jakarta officials, who visit Dili on a regular basis.

The documentation and reporting on project progress and achievements is detailed and comprehensive with the bi-annual Progress Reports extending to 70 pages not including attachments. This level of detail is very helpful in providing additional insight on issues encountered, solutions implemented and progress being achieved in each of the components. However, the executive summary could be improved as a means of summarizing key milestones and successes over the period. The 12 page Programme Monitoring Plan Matrix is also quite complex providing both quantitative and qualitative commentary on objectives and performance indicators and the addition of a simplified summary chart would be beneficial in highlighting results achieved.

# **4.7 Gender Equality**

A Gender Mainstreaming Strategy (GEMS) for SEFOPE was developed during 2009 which is aimed at building SEFOPE institutional capacity to mainstream gender in its policies and programmes. This document has been translated into Tetum to facilitate further discussion involving all SEFOPE directorates and departments and eventual adoption and implementation by the Institution. The GEMS encompasses SEFOPE policies and programmes, and incorporates the following main sections:

- (i) Development of a SEFOPE gender capacity building plan, including training, gender analysis, gender mainstreaming, gender budgeting, and gender audits;
- (ii) Implementation of an annual gender training programme to newly recruited and existing staff;

(iii) Preparation of action plans for the different directorates and departments, by the respective gender focal points. Plans of action are to be socialised and integrated into SEFOPE as a whole and individual directorates and departments.<sup>12</sup>

The latest YEP Progress Report stated "While work on gender needs supports at the management level and technical inputs, a range of other initiatives such as administrative tools, field monitoring practices, and work-organizations are necessary. The YEP programme is gradually addressing these by integrating gender into each strategic component. At the same time and in the next 12 months, gender and its correlated capacity building will be articulated systematically in programme monitoring activities." <sup>13</sup>

The gender coordinator in SEFOPE stated that the gender mainstreaming strategy had been progressing but that budget limitations had restricted some of her activities in relation to training staff on gender awareness issues. She also stated that she felt the need for specialist support in preparing action plans and running programmes and ILO may want to propose further support by way of international expertise to assist the gender coordinator in the development of action plans, surveys and analysis of issues to help mainstream gender issues.

It is strongly recommended that the GEMS programme should be actively be implemented, drawing where needed on ILO expertise or other gender expertise that may possibly be sourced locally. While the programme addresses gender mainstreaming in an adequate manner across the components, this should remain a focus of attention to programme management.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>12</sup> Page 20 YEP Progress Report Sept 2009

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>13</sup> Page 66 YEP Progress Report, Sept 2009

#### 5. Conclusions

The evaluation found that the YEP Programme is well designed, its objectives remain equally valid and relevant today particularly in the context of the Government's national priorities for 2010 as well as AusAID's Australia—Timor Leste Country Strategy. The implementation approach adopted by the CTA has been highly effective with national project staff being recruited directly on Government conditions of service and with all project staff and international advisers being located within SEFOPE and INDMO ensuring that project activities have been institutionalized within SEFOPE.

Good progress has been made across all four components of the YEP programme and there are signs of growing capacity within INDMO and SEFOPE. The development and promulgation of the NYEAP has been successful and legislation has been passed to cover the operations of INDMO and FEFOP. The Skills Training Policy has been finalized and a Gender mainstreaming draft Document has been circulated within SEFOPE.

Collaboration arrangements between SEFOPE, INDMO and MoE are working well and other stakeholders have been included wherever appropriate. Implementation of youth employment counseling and information functions in the CEOPs is starting to take shape, this will be a key element of annual workplans currently being developed.

The FEFOP has become a very useful mechanism for providing direct assistance to young people under its various components. The self employment module has been particularly effective in generating income earning opportunities and community empowerment especially for women in poor local communities.

YEP has strongly supported the development of youth Career Centres and all staff have received comprehensive training in counseling skills. An expanded counseling program is currently being implemented and it will be important to monitor the effectiveness of this activity in assisting the very large target group of young people either in their final year of schooling or who have already left school that need access to good employment-related information and counseling.

Labour intensive work arrangements on road maintenance have been highly effective at the District level with more than 35,000 placements under the scheme since the project commenced. Teams of field engineers, supervisors and contractors have been operating out of SEFOPE to support this work. This component has been accompanied by successful implementation of literacy and numeracy and HIV/AIDS awareness training.

The labour market information system (SIMU) has recently been upgraded to meet SEFOPE's growing needs and it will also provide an IT application to support CEOP activities in the near future. The provision of improved labour market information and analysis will bring considerable benefits not only in highlighting trends and emerging areas of skill demand but also in providing up to date information to assist employment counselors in their work.

#### 6. Recommendations and Lessons Learned

#### **INDMO** and Vocational Training

- 1. SEFOPE, AusAID and the ILO should promote with donors that fund projects which include capacity building and training to ensure that such work takes place within the scope of the TLNQF to foster sustainability and future skills recognition. The projects should link with accredited local training providers in providing competencies. This requirement should also be promoted by SEFOPE through the Government's National Priorities Working Group 3 on Human Resource Development. The upcoming Development Partners meeting in Dili and the ILO's work within the UN Development Assistance Framework provide important opportunities to promote use of the TLNQF.
- 2. The programme should continue and where possible intensify awareness-raising campaigns and promotion of the NQF agenda and registration and accreditation requirements to educate training providers, employers and trainees on the new arrangements.
- 3. A strong case should be made by SEFOPE and ILO to the National Government as well as to potential donors to ensure adequate budget and resources are allocated to INDMO and SEFOPE so that this work can be completed. To ensure the sustainability of the vocational training reforms beyond the current project life, ILO should seek donor support to cover:
  - Assistance to MoE in the preparation of NQF Legislation. As previously described, this is a crucial step to clarify and strengthen the mandate of INDMO.
  - Support for training providers to allow them to meet registration and accreditation standards and as part of the implementation of the Qualifications framework.
  - Longer term support to accredited training providers to deliver national qualifications, including support for the development of appropriate materials.

AusAID should also consider further funding needs beyond the current project life.

# **FEFOP**

- 4. The training and employment-related opportunities available under FEFOP should be widely promoted and the Government should maintain annual budget allocations at least at the 2009 budget level. With the Fund's operations now well established, SEFOPE, ILO and AusAID should consider opportunities for diversifying sources of funds, including through additional donors.
- 5. The approval and contracting process of the self employment module under this model should be simplified and streamlined to minimize disruption and delays in the delivery of the program to the participants.

# **CEOP's and Youth Counseling**

- 6. The individual case management approach to counseling clients is currently being implemented by CEOP staff. This programme is both ambitious and resource intensive and should be reviewed in 6 months time including feedback from clients to assess its effectiveness and the outcomes being achieved.
- 7. CEOPs should develop 'group' counseling approaches to convey information and guidance to groups with similar information needs or similar aspirations.
- 8. Display of materials and information in CEOP offices should be improved and pamphlets and brochures on training and employment opportunities should be made available for distribution in CEOP offices and more widely, based on a specific communication effort in the next few months.

#### **Labour Intensive Works**

- 9. The Programme partners should all make efforts to ensure that budget allocations for labour intensive works should continue and specifically target rural and remote communities. The training programmes for literacy and numeracy, HIV/AIDS awareness and family planning should be continued and should also target young people in local communities.
- 10. There are eight teams of field engineers, supervisors and contractors based in SEFOPE and in the field with funding from YEP and TIM WORKS. ILO should alert potential donors proposing any follow-up labour-based road projects to the availability of this expertise to minimize the loss of positions when the TIMWORKS project concludes (currently foreseen by end 2010)

# SIMU – the National Labour Market Information System

- 11. Further support and enhancements to the LMI system (SIMU) database software should be considered to improve the usefulness and efficiency of the database and its reporting capability. If this is not possible within existing YEP resources, ILO and SEFOPE should identify other opportunities.
- 12. SEFOPE and ILO should seek donor support for the unit to develop greater capacity to analyze data such as the LF survey and other data collected by various units within SEFOPE and report on labour market issues.

# **Gender Equality**

13. Effective gender mainstreaming requires a dedicated effort and resources. *ILO*, *SEFOPE and AusAID should consider this and arrange for specific gender expertise to be available to implement the SEFOPE gender mainstreaming strategy*, including through i) training of staff and capacity building, where elements of ILO tools such as the Participatory Gender Audit could be adopted and ii) further research and analysis of gender in employment, using SIMU as a source of data and determining gender-specific social and economic barriers for gainful employment of men and women.

#### **Lessons Learned**

The integrated approach adopted by the CTA and project team has resulted in implementation being fully embedded within the organizational framework of SEFOPE and INDMO. The recruitment of national project staff using a Service Contract with the Ministry enabled national staff to be recruited directly on Government conditions of service. This approach is promoting counterpart ownership and is facilitating the capacity building process as well as potentially enhancing sustainability in the longer term if these staff and their expertise are retained by SEFOPE after the project has finished. Current results show that SEFOPE has been able to gradually expand its core staff over a number of years, taking on well-tested and experienced staff that were brought in through YEP funding or that of earlier ILO projects using a similar approach.

This approach should be seriously considered by other development partners where other projects require a significant number of national staff to be recruited. ILO may want to discuss this with relevant Government institutions (Ministry for State Administration) and with its UN partners.

Experience with vocational training reforms in other countries confirms that major vocational training initiatives such as those being undertaken in Timor Leste take a long time to be implemented fully and require ongoing support. There will also be a need for continuing support from international advisors beyond the life of the current project and SEFOPE and ILO should prepare well in advance a succession plan.

# **Appendices**

# **Appendix 1, Terms of Reference for the mid-term evaluation (separate document)**

# **Appendix 2: List of Persons Met**

#### **Australian Agency for International Development (AusAID)**

Natalie McKelleher Second Secretary Development Cooperation

Francisco Soares Program Officer
Barry Patterson Education Advisor

# Secretariat of State for Vocational Training and Employment SEFOPE

Bendito dos Santos Freitas Secretary of State for Vocational Training and

**Employment** 

Isménio Marin S Da Silva Principal Advisor

José Maria da Costa Soares

Alessandra

Albano Salem

Director, Employment Division

Director, Self-employment Division

Director, Vocational Training

Carlos Bento Director, Employment Services Department

Albano Salem Director, Vocational Training
Lucio Bera Tali dos Santos Director, Short-Term Employment

Ms Angelina Secretariat, FEFOP

Bernardete P M Gomes Director. Gender Department

# National Labour Market Development Institute

Isobel Fernandes de Lima Director

KSTL.

José da Conceição da Costa President. Timor-Leste Trade Union Confederation

# **Business Development Support Unit**

Cosme Fatima Baptista da Silva Executive Director

Hernani Soares Director of IADE/CDE, Ministry of Economy and

Development

**YEP Project Staff** 

José Assalino Chief Technical Adviser & Liason Officer, ILO
Fernando Encarnação International Expert on Community Empowerment
Roberto Pes International Expert on Small Business Training,
Ms. Anne Keogh International Expert on Vocational Training
Junior Indart ILO, Labour Market Information Unit, SSVTE

Management Information System Expert

**Ministry of Education** 

Afonso De Almeida National Coordinator

**Education Sector Support Project** 

Sue Kent Skills Training Advisor for Partnership

**Dili Institute of Technology** 

Estanislau S Saldanha Director

**Beauty Salon Training Course** 

Justin Sarumaha Trainer/, Rudy Hair Studio Dili

**World Bank** 

Alan Male Senior Education Liaison Specialist

Senai

Alexandrino Rego Director

Centro Treinamento Visaun Foinsae TL

Francisco Cancio Director

**Association of Employers** 

Fernando Afonso da Silva Secretary Asset Lorosai

Baucau

Mr Romualdo A. de Saousa DEC Coordinator, Baucau

Celestino dos Santo Neto Employment officer
Maria Cestina Viegas Employment officer
Sidonia Fernandes da Silva Employment officer
Veronica Freitas Employment officer

Centro Treino Integral e Desenvolvimento (CTID) Colegion Canossa Baucau

Sister Candida de Castro Director

Centro Formasaun Informatika e Kustura (CFIC) Madalen Moorano Fuiloro

Sister Alexandrina do Carmo Pinto Director

Escola Tecnica Profesional (ETP) Santa Maria Mazzarello Venilale, Baucau

Sister Olga Principal

Dili Institute of Technology (DIT) Baucau

Oscar Belo Coordinator

Appendix 3: Summary of Proposals eligible for consideration by FEFOP

Type of Activity	Target Group	Proposal Features
Vocational Training	Persons seeking skills to improve their prospects of finding employment	<ul> <li>VT providers propose training activities linked to labour market needs;</li> <li>Activities can be at community level or at the training centre;</li> <li>VTP registered with SEFOPE;</li> <li>Contract between SEFOPE and the training provider;</li> <li>Funds disbursed in three tranches.</li> </ul>
Work Experience	School students and trainees have access to work experience as part of a VT course	<ul> <li>Financial support to training providers and technical secondary schools with work experience as part of the VT course;</li> <li>Placement organized by school or VT provider;</li> <li>Work experience participant paid an allowance.</li> </ul>
Internship	Unemployed out-of- school youth who have completed senior secondary school	<ul> <li>Practical work experience in the workplace;</li> <li>Up to three months in the workplace;</li> <li>Funds disbursed to employer who pays a monthly subsidy to the intern;</li> <li>Contract between employer and SEFOPE</li> </ul>
On-the-Job Training	Graduates of VT and business management training courses	<ul> <li>Support for graduates to increase their skills, knowledge and experience;</li> <li>Supervised work in enterprise or small business;</li> <li>6 months duration;</li> <li>Contract between employer and SEFOPE</li> <li>Employer makes financial contribution.</li> </ul>
Strengthening Vocational Training Centres	Support to professional training providers to improve the quality and relevance of the training	<ul> <li>Training providers have to prove the connection between their training programme and needs in the labour market</li> <li>show evidence of their plan to achieve registration and certification by the INDMO.</li> <li>contribute with 25% of the total costs of the activity,</li> </ul>
Enterprise Management Training	VT students, small business operators micro credit clients and others interested in starting or improving their own business	<ul> <li>Small business startup training (SYB,IYB) by registered training providers;</li> <li>Training organized at community level or at the training provider facility;</li> <li>Contract between SEFOPE and Training Provider.</li> </ul>
Self- employment Promotion	Selected unemployed people who need market driven training interventions and access to micro-credit to generate self- employment	<ul> <li>Integrated proposals from MFI together with vocational and business training providers;</li> <li>Non-interest bearing loan to MFI;</li> <li>Contract between SEFOPE and MFI;</li> <li>MFI responsible for coordination at community level of all partners involved.</li> </ul>

# **Appendix 4: Summary of Staffing Disposition by Directorate**

**Table 1 – Staff by function in DNE** 

DNE – Function	Paid by	Paid by	Paid by	Total
	SEFOPE	YEP	TIM	<b>Positions</b>
			WORKS	
DNE Central	2	8	0	10
STEC Central	1	8	0	9
STEC Engineers	0	0	16	16
STEC supervisors	0	0	7	7
STEC field officers	16	0	-	16
STEC Operation Officers	7	0	-	7
LMI	2	2	-	4
Overseas Employment Divison	1	3	-	4
Self Employment Division	5	0	-	5
FEFOP	2	0	-	2
CEOP - Baucau	2	5	-	7
CEOP – Bobonaro	2	3	-	5
CEOP –Dili	5	4	-	9
CEOP – Oecussi	2	4	-	6
Total	47	37	23	107

**Table 2 - Staff in DNAFOP** 

DNAFOP	Paid by SEFOPE	Paid by YEP	Total
DNAFOP Central	6	6	12
Vocational Training Centres Department	6	3	9
On-the-Job Training Department	5	2	7
Total	17	11	28

# **Appendix 5: Financial Delivery**

(Preliminary figures from ILO Jakarta; certified financial statements are submitted by ILO Jakarta to AusAID on a regular basis)

	Total Budget (US\$)	Expenditure up to 31 Dec 2009
Total	18,023,735	
Of which		
AusAID	8,032,735	2,559,565
SEFOPE/GoTL	10,000,000	3,098,594, broken down as follows:
		<ul> <li>729,594 to component 2, FEFOP (funding approved proposals, including remaining balance EVTF)</li> </ul>
		<ul> <li>2,369,000 to component 3, Labour Intensive Works for payment of wages</li> </ul>

Illustration of budget breakdown by component (December 2009 expenditures, AusAID contribution only, provided by ILO Jakarta)

