

**BIENNIAL COUNTRY PROGRAMME REVIEW
(2006-2008)**

MONGOLIA

FINAL REPORT

FEBRUARY 2009

Table of Contents

LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS	III
EXECUTIVE SUMMARY	IV
I. BACKGROUND	1
II. OBJECTIVES OF THE REVIEW	2
III. METHODOLOGY	3
IV. SCOPE OF THE REVIEW	3
V. FINDINGS ON THE APPROPRIATENESS AND ADEQUACY OF THE DWCP DESIGN, PARTNERSHIP AND IMPLEMENTATION.....	4
VI. FINDINGS ON OPERATIONAL ASSESSMENT ON PROGRESS OF THE ELEVEN OUTCOMES.....	9
VII. STAKEHOLDERS' CONSULTATION ON 27 OCTOBER 2008	26
VIII. CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS	26
ANNEXES	29

ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

The Review Team is grateful to the Mongolian tripartite constituents and other stakeholders who shared freely of their knowledge and experience. The Review Team would also like to acknowledge the support and assistance provided by the Director, Deputy Director and all staff of the ILO's Office for China and Mongolia in Beijing, China. In particular, the Team was grateful for the support provided by Ms. Samina Hasan, Programme Analyst for Mongolia. She had put a lot of efforts in collecting all relevant documents for desk review, liaised with the project team and stakeholders in Mongolia and provided necessary information to the Review Team as required.

Staff of ILO's Time-Bound Programme on the Elimination of the Worst Forms of Child Labour, particularly Ms. Mongolmaa Norjinkham, National Programme Manager and Ms. Altanchimeg Banzar, Programme Assistant had also played significant roles in the successful completion of the Country Programme Review.

The support of the ILO's Sub-regional Office for East Asia and the Regional Office for Asia and the Pacific in Bangkok throughout the review process was also appreciated by the Review Team.

February 2009

LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

ACTEMP	Bureau for Employers' Activities
ADB	Asian Development Bank
AIDS	Acquired Immune Deficiency Syndrome
BCPR	Biennial Country Programme Review
CCA	Common Country Assessment
CMTU	Confederation of Mongolian Trade Unions
DWCP	Decent Work Country Programme
EGSPRS	Economic Growth Support and Poverty Reduction Strategy
FAO	Food and Agriculture Organization
FDI	Foreign Direct Investment
GDP	Gross Domestic Product
HDI	Human Development Index
HDR	Human Development Report
HIV	Human Immunodeficiency Virus
ILO	International Labour Organization
ILS	International Labour Standards
IPEC	International Programme on the Elimination of Child Labour
KAB	Know About Business
LEAD	Local Economy and Aimag Development
M&E	Monitoring & Evaluation
MDGs	Millennium Development Goals
MONEF	Mongolian Employers Federation
MSWL	Ministry of Social Welfare and Labour
NDS	National Development Strategy
NPADW	National Plan of Action on Decent Work
OSH	Occupational Safety and Health
OSH-MS	Occupational Safety and Health Management System
PES	Public Employment Service
PRS	Poverty Reduction Strategy
RBTC	Regular Budget for Technical Cooperation
RO-Bangkok	Regional Office for Asia and the Pacific - Bangkok
SIYB	Start and Improve Your Business
SRO-Bangkok	Sub-Regional Office for East Asia - Bangkok
TBP	Time Bound Programme
TOR	Terms of Reference
TOT	Training of Trainers
UN	United Nations
UNCT	United Nations Country Team
UNDAF	United Nations Development Assistance Framework
UNDP	United Nations Development Programme
UNIDO	United Nations Industrial Development Organization
VAT	Value-added tax
WFCL	Worst Forms of Child Labour
WIND	Work Improvements and Neighbourhood Development
WISCON	Work Improvements in Small Construction Sites
WISE	Work Improvements in Small Enterprises

Executive Summary

The Biennial Country Programme Review (BCPR) of Mongolia was conducted in October 2008. This report presents the objectives, scope, methodology and findings in sections 2 to 7 and the conclusions and recommendations in section 8.

The BCPR was conducted in Mongolia to assess the progress with the implementation of the country programme from June 2006 to June 2008, in a country where ILO has no country office¹. The principal clients for the BCPR are the national constituents and implementing partners, ILO's Office for China and Mongolia in Beijing, Sub-regional Office for East Asia and the Regional Office for Asia and the Pacific in Bangkok as well as ILO HQ, all of whom support national efforts within the national development framework. The clients will share responsibility to follow up the findings and recommendations of the review.

The review focuses on the Decent Work Country Programme (DWCP) implementation and progress made within 2006-07 biennium in a comprehensive manner. However, the review also examines the strategy, capacity and resources available to deliver the DWCP outcomes or milestones set for the period of 2008-09. The timeframe of the review is therefore from January 2006 to June 2008.

The Review Team found that the implementation of the DWCP is progressing well. The performance of the country programme implementation under the different general criteria and outcome is as follows:

General findings:

Below are the summary conclusions for the general findings:

- ***Relevance, coherence and comparative advantage in the ILO:***

ILO remains relevant in Mongolia. The constituents demonstrate both appreciation for the ILO activities and ownership of the DWCP. However, due mostly to financial constraints, the ILO's support has a scattered semblance and could benefit from utilizing different strategies to fully operationalize its comparative advantage. The latter would be enhanced if the UN as a whole were able to better position itself within the country to demonstrate its comparative advantage.

- ***Partnership, strategies and inter-agency relations:***

Donors and development partners (bi/multi and civil society) need to continue to work towards refining coordination in Mongolia. ILO has some joint programmes with the UN family, which have included UNDP/ILO National Human Development Report on Poverty and Employment; a joint ILO/UNDP National Forum on Employment; and the new HIV/AIDS programme. The ILO as a non resident UN agency with limited funding needs to use these initiatives to build better partnerships that result in developing ILO supported technical assistance and programmes in the country. On the Mongolian side, the constituents have used the outputs of DWCP to bring forward progress towards the achievement of outcomes.

- ***Managing for results***

Mongolia has made progress towards results for some country programme outcomes with assistance from ILO despite limited resources available for the ILO and the Mongolian stakeholders. The country programme outcomes are not always clearly defined, some indicators of the outcomes are vague and not all targets of the indicators are identified. Monitoring system should be strengthened and exit strategy for ILO's projects and programmes in Mongolia should be developed. Documentation of good practices and tools need to be further

¹ ILO's Office for China and Mongolia in Beijing, China, is responsible for programme planning and implementation of ILO's Decent Work Country Programme in Mongolia.

strengthened to include relevant materials from IPEC, Informal Economy, OSH, SIYB, and work on youth and rural development.

- ***The efficiency and adequacy of ILO organizational arrangements:***

Performance monitoring systems of DWCP should be strengthened and as much as possible aligned with the National Plan of Action on Decent Work (NPADW). Knowledge management and sharing are relatively good.

- ***Knowledge management and sharing:***

Knowledge management and sharing are relatively good.

Recommendations

It is noted that the NPADW precedes DWCP, and has a wider perspective. DWCP supports prioritised areas as decided with the constituents. Based on the findings, the Review Team have the following recommendations on DWCP design, donor coordination, resource mobilisation, local representation, monitoring system and knowledge management:

1. On Design

- Adjust the DWCP implementation workplan in anticipation of possible lower economic growth in Mongolia.
- Reduce the number of outcomes from eleven to between three and five and align with the next phase of the NPADW.
- Set specific targets for the indicators of the DWCP's outcomes.

2. Donor Coordination

- Strengthen ILO's comparative advantage and improve ILO's influence on development agenda through closer collaboration and coordination with the UN family and donor community.

3. Resource Mobilisation

- Collaborate with other donors (bi/multi and civil society) to maximize the use of ILO's resources and impact as significant increase in extra-budgetary funding is not likely. Promotional efforts may be required to support financial assistance in relation to several project concept notes and proposals that have been prepared and submitted to the donors.

4. Local Representation

- Establish a country presence as a matter of priority.

5. Monitoring system

- Strengthen monitoring system to measure progress and document good practices of DWCP and NPADW.

6. Knowledge management

- Document good practices and tools consistently for future use and share them with tripartite constituents, development partners and other stakeholders.

I. BACKGROUND

The Biennial Country Programme Review (BCPR) of Mongolia was conducted in October 2008. A field visit to Ulaanbaatar, Mongolia and Beijing, China, was undertaken by the Review Team from 17 to 30 October 2008. The Review Team consisted of two members (see [Annex 1](#)), one external consultant and one staff from the ILO's Regional Office for Asia and the Pacific in Bangkok (RO Bangkok). The Terms of Reference (TOR) are included in [Annex 2](#) and the Programme of Meetings in [Annex 3](#).

This report presents the objectives, scope, methodology and findings in sections 2 to 7 and the conclusions and recommendations in section 8.

The BCPR was conducted in Mongolia to assess the progress with the implementation of the country programme from June 2006 to June 2008, in a country where ILO has no country office. The principal clients for the BCPR are the national constituents and implementing partners, ILO's Office for China and Mongolia in Beijing (ILO-Beijing), Sub-regional Office for East Asia (SRO Bangkok) and RO-Bangkok as well as ILO HQ, all of whom support national efforts within the national development framework. The clients will share responsibility to follow up the findings and recommendations of the review.

Background of the ILO's DWCP Programme in Mongolia

Tripartite constituents in Mongolia adopted the National Plan of Action for Decent Work in Mongolia (NPADW) of 2005-2008 at the meeting of the National Tripartite Committee of Labour and Social Consensus on 24 January 2005.

The NPADW places itself within the parameters of national policy and is aligned with the national development frameworks in Mongolia, which include the National Development Concept of Mongolia/long-term policy framework; the Economic Growth Support and Poverty Reduction Strategy (EGSPRS)/medium term development policy of Mongolia; the Social Security Sector Strategy Paper/medium-term policy framework of the sector and the Mongolian National Policy on Population Development.

The Decent Work Country Programme (DWCP) framework supports and furthers the NPADW and outlines the strategic areas for which the ILO will focus its technical support and assistance to the tripartite partners, who will work in collaboration with one another, for promoting decent work. The DWCP articulates the priorities resulting from in-depth consultations with the constituents. Furthermore, it builds on previous work of the ILO in Mongolia. It is also aligned with the United Nations Development Assistance Framework (UNDAF) and the Common Country Assessment (CCA) of June 28, 2005, which guides the UN system response to assist Mongolia in achieving the Millennium Development Goals (MDGs). The current DWCP spans over the period of 5 years (2006-2010). The tripartite constituents formally endorsed the DWCP in April 2007.

Country Situation

Mongolia has entered into a new era in its development. Mongolia's Human Development Index (HDI) is now at its highest level ever and has improved significantly in all aimags. All three components of the HDI, indicators measuring status of health, education and income, have risen significantly in the last seven years. In the last five years the gap in the HDI between more and less advanced aimags has been decreasing. Mongolia is also showing progress in most of the MDGs. Achievement of 60 percent of the 22 national targets is on track, including the vital infant and maternal mortality goals.

Mongolia's real Growth Domestic Product (GDP) growth rate was 9.9 percent in 2007. Growth was driven by agriculture (which contributed 3.4 percentage points), and services (4.3 percentage points). While most of the foreign direct investment (FDI) coming into Mongolia continues to go to the mining sector, the value-

added of the sector grew by only 1.7 percent this year (mainly from coal extraction). The services sector continues to show strong growth, driven in particular by transport and trade (2.1 and 1.3 points of economic growth respectively). At the end of February 2008, the number of registered unemployed had declined by 5.1 percent.

Despite a planned budget deficit of 3.9 percent of GDP, the government's fiscal balance recorded a surplus again for the third consecutive year. This was the result of higher-than-expected revenues and lower-than-planned expenditures. The key reasons for strong revenue performance were: (i) higher than anticipated commodity prices and the imposition of the windfall tax on gold and copper; (ii) robust economic growth; and (iii) improved revenue administration. Expenditures were below budgeted levels because the execution rate for capital expenditures fell below expectations. The resulting fiscal surplus enabled the Government to build additional reserves at the Bank of Mongolia of about US\$ 169 million (4.4 percent of GDP). At the end of 2007, government deposits at the central bank were equal to US\$ 531 million (14 percent of GDP)

Inflation accelerated to reach 15.1 percent in 2007, the highest level in a decade. The price index climbed 4.6 percent in the first two months of 2008 alone. This marked rise was due to rapid monetary growth, public sector wage increases, and increases in the price of key imports, especially food. Total loans outstanding increased by 67.2% of which loans to private sector increased by 78.9%.

Officially recorded decline in gold exports and robust import growth led to a trade deficit in 2007. Compared to a year ago, exports grew by 22.5 percent (reaching US\$ 1.9 billion) and imports rose by 42.5 percent (reaching US\$ 2.1 billion). Since the imposition of the windfall tax on gold and copper exports, officially recorded gold exports have started to decline as more and more gold is now allegedly being smuggled out of the country to avoid the tax. For the first year, the (positive) price impact of high international prices for copper and gold on export earnings has been outweighed by the (negative) impact of the windfall tax on recorded gold exports. Meanwhile, import growth has remained robust in 2007, led by strong economic growth which translated in sustained demand for consumption and investment goods.

Since 2007 commodity prices dropped substantially. The price of copper has dropped approximately 50% and gold approximately 30% since the top in July 2008. Taking the financial turmoil into account, Mongolia's revenue as well as investments may be less favourable in the coming year(s).

II. OBJECTIVES OF THE REVIEW

BCPR focuses on the outcomes and guiding strategies of the DWCP to identify where and how improvements can be made. They enable constituents and ILO staff to apply the concepts and practice of results-based management in country programme, and enhance national ownership of the review process.

The review will consider areas in which the ILO's collaboration has been more and less effective to the national framework, to inform on what should be pursued in the future, and where improvements can be made. This will include reinforcement or changes in priorities, strategies, and organizational practices.

The review is also intended to provide a basis for improved insights to the ILO, as an assessment tool, as to better design, implement, monitor and assess country programmes in the future.

III. METHODOLOGY

The BCPR exercise was conducted as a participatory assessment. The Review Team had interviews with stakeholders in Ulaanbaatar for four days, 20 to 23 October 2008, and one day (24 October 2008) on site visits on a selection of ILO programmes. The list of people met during the review is included as [annex 4](#).

A stakeholders' consultation workshop was conducted on 27 October 2008 in Ulaanbaatar to discuss the findings and bring out recommendations for the implementation of the remaining period of DWCP. The agenda of the workshop and presentation made by the Review Team are included in [Annex 5](#).

The team comprised one ILO official, Mr. Oktavianto Pasaribu of RO-Bangkok and an external consultant, Mr. Karstein Haarberg who facilitated the review process.

This report has been drafted by the Review Team based on the desk review of relevant documents, inputs from interviews during the field trip and the stakeholders' consultation. If team members do not agree on particular findings or recommendations, this disagreement is stated explicitly in the report.

IV. SCOPE OF THE REVIEW

The review focuses on the DWCP implementation and progress made within 2006-07 biennium in a comprehensive manner. However, the review also examines the strategy, capacity and resources available to deliver the DWCP outcomes or milestones set for the period of 2008-09. Therefore the timeframe of the review covers the period from January 2006 to June 2008.

The review scope has two main components. The first involves a review of the appropriateness and adequacy of DWCP design, outreach/partnership and implementation performance. The key criteria are 1) the relevance, coherence and comparative advantage of the ILO in the country; 2) partnership, strategies and inter-agency relations; 3) managing for results; 4) the efficiency and adequacy of ILO organizational arrangements; and 5) knowledge management and sharing. The detailed content of this component is clarified through the questions provided in TOR.

The second component of the BCPR is an operational assessment to report on progress being made on tangible outcomes directly resulting from ILO contributions. Key criteria for the review are: 1) adequacy of resources; 2) delivery of outputs; 3) use of outputs by partners; 4) progress made towards outcomes; and 5) emerging risks and opportunities.

Analytical assumptions

In our analysis we have made these analytical assumptions:

- Funding for ILO activities in Mongolia will still be scarce: ILO is a technical assistance agency and not a donor as such. The Review Team regards it as unlikely that the ILO programme in Mongolia will receive a substantial increase of extra-budgetary funds in the near future. The assessment made will not take into consideration a situation or make recommendations based on such an increase. Instead funding on existing level will be taken as the expected level of funding for the remaining period of the DWCP implementation.
- Reallocation of existing funding is more likely than "fresh" money: Relating to the point above, any reallocations as a consequence of change in priorities need to be done within existing budget framework and donor situation.
- The international financial turmoil and a drop in commodity prices may cause negative implications for Mongolia's economy: As the international financial crisis was progressing during the field visit

for this review, the possible consequences for DWCP were taken into consideration. The stakeholders interviewed as well as speakers at the Mongolian Economic Policy Conference in Ulaanbaatar on 27 October 2008 that the Review Team attended, stated that Mongolia would be vulnerable to commodity price fluctuations, and to a lesser extent, the financial turmoil.

- Government ability to raise internal funding for development may be reduced due to reduction of tax incomes resulting from the drop in commodity prices: The Government revenue from mineral exploitation will likely decrease, which reduces the Government budget for development spending.
- Increased unemployment, as economic growth reduces: As a plausible consequence of the slowing economic growth in the country, the level of employment may be negatively affected.
- Limited Government resources to put into the implementation of DWCP: Considering all the factors above, the Government will most likely have limited resources, even more limited than in the previous years, to support the implementation of NPADW and DWCP.

Limitations

The Review Team applied the tools and criteria outlined in the TOR. In applying the tools and criteria and considering that the BCPR was undertaken during the mid-term implementation period of the DWCP, the Review Team found the following weaknesses of the methodology:

- Scoring system: Aggregating the scorings on each individual criterion does not make an appropriate total scoring for the outcome as a whole when reviewing the outcomes holistically.
- Lack of understanding of the review methodology on the part of the stakeholders, particularly with the definition of the ratings.
- The field visit was of limited time. More time would allow for additional information to be collected as well as for verification and further discussion with stakeholders.
- To gauge stakeholders' assessment of the performance of the DWCP, the TOR of the BCPR should include a time and cost effective web-based questionnaire survey prior to the field visit.
- Given that the BCPR is conducted to review the mid-term progress with the implementation of the country programme, it is important to involve technical specialists/experts as members of the Review Team to assess progress of the country programme outcomes.
- More participatory approaches to ensure deep understanding of the context, performance review process and implications of the BCPR findings and recommendations for the implementation of the remaining period of DWCP. The stakeholders' consultation workshop at the end of the field trip was the only interaction with stakeholders as groups. More and earlier participatory interactions with the stakeholders including with the ILO staff would have strengthened the review process.

The assessment below should be read taking into account the weaknesses in the methodology of the BCPR.

V. FINDINGS ON THE APPROPRIATENESS AND ADEQUACY OF THE DWCP DESIGN, PARTNERSHIP AND IMPLEMENTATION

A. Introduction

This section contains an assessment of the DWCP design, partnership and implementation using the multi-point score matrix provided in the TOR. As the background for preparing the assessment, the Review Team used the findings from the review of materials, interviews with the stakeholders and inputs received during the stakeholders' consultation workshop.

Each criterion is assessed and given a scoring from 1 to 6, where 1 is the lowest and 6 is the highest scoring. The scoring categories have the following meaning: 1=Very unsatisfactory, 2=Unsatisfactory, 3=Moderately unsatisfactory, 4=Moderately satisfactory, 5=Satisfactory and 6=Very satisfactory. The DWCP in Mongolia has 3 priorities and 11 outcomes as follows:

MAPPING OF DWCP OUTCOMES OF MONGOLIA

DWCP Document (2006-10)	SMM/IP 2006-07	SMM/IP 2008-09
Priority 1: Formulating and implementing employment promotion strategies to address issues of sustainable livelihoods and poverty alleviation in the formal and informal economy	MNG 100 – Formulating and implementing employment promotion strategies to address issues of sustainable livelihoods and poverty alleviation in the formal and informal economy	MNG100 – Employment promotion strategies address issues of sustainable livelihoods and poverty alleviation in the formal and informal economy
Outcome 1.1: Development of national policy framework is supported by innovative interventions designed and implemented to promote employment and impact livelihoods and poverty with specific focus on informal economy	MNG 101 – Development of National Policy Framework supported by innovative interventions designed and implemented to promote employment and impact livelihoods and poverty with specific focus on informal economy	MNG 101 – National policies and programmes on informal economy, employment, employability and enterprise development improved and implementation strengthened
Outcome 1.2: Improved skill development for livelihood and employability	MNG 102 – Skill development for livelihood and employability area improved	
Outcome 1.3: Promote decent and productive work for youth	MNG 103- Promote decent and productive work for youth	
Priority 2: Improving the working environment and extending protection of workers' rights	MNG 125 – Better application of rights and security for Disadvantaged Groups	MNG 125 – Improving the working environment and extending protection of workers' rights
Outcome 2.1: Improved scope, quality, and impact of labour inspection so that there is better application of labour law and progress made in understanding and compliance of ILS	MNG 126 – Improved scope, quality and impact of labour inspection so that there is better application of labour law and progress made in understanding and compliance of ILS	MNG 126 – Increased capacity to apply ILS, and to develop and implement policies towards the 10-year goal of eliminating child labour and other fundamental principles and rights at work
Outcome 2.2: Make substantial progress towards the 10-year goal of eliminating the worst forms of child labour, in particular removing children from hazardous work in informal mining	MNG 127 – Make substantial progress towards the 10-years goal of eliminating child labour, in particular removing children from hazardous work In informal mining	
Outcome 2.3: Improved legal environment for migrant workers		
	MNG 128 – Promoting support and assistance to employment of disabled persons	(ref. MNG 101)
Outcome 2.4: Improved Conditions and Safety and Health at Work	(ref. MNG 127 above & MNG 901)	MNG 127 – Social protection and safety and health at work and working conditions improved
Outcome 2.5: Strengthened advocacy for HIV/AIDS in the Workplace		
Priority 3: Strengthening tripartism to support social and economic policy development, implementation and institutional reform	MNG 150 – Strengthening tripartism to support social and economic policy development and implementation	MNG 150 – Strengthening tripartism to support social and economic policy development, implementation and institutional reform
Outcome 3.1: Further progress in implementing in the Resolution on Tripartism is achieved.	MNG 151 – Further progress in implementing in the resolution on tripartism	MNG 151 – Tripartite social dialogue strengthened and wage policy improved through tripartite consultation
Outcome 3.2: Improve wage policy	MNG 152 – Wage policy developed and implementation begun	
Outcome 3.3: Improved capacity of workers and employers for representation of their members	MNG 900 – Other areas of work	MNG 800 – Strong and representative employers' and workers' organizations influencing economic, social and governance policies
	MNG 901 – Global compact and CSR initiatives supported	MNG 801 – Strengthened institutional capacity of employers' organizations
	MNG 902 – Tripartite social dialogue process and institution reformed to become more effective tool for policy development and implementation in tripartite manner	MNG 802 – Strengthened institutional capacity of workers' organizations

Criteria 1: Relevance, coherence and comparative advantage of the ILO in Mongolia

Scoring 4.0: Moderately satisfactory.

ILO remains relevant in Mongolia. More on this is also mentioned under the findings of Criteria 2.

Relevance:

ILO remains relevant as it continues to provide support to Mongolia on priority labour and social issues in the country. The concept and value of decent work has been well understood by the tripartite constituents. The ILO's areas of expertise and technical advisory services fit well with the needs and priorities of Mongolia's development plans.

Labour issues have been and will remain important in the foreseeable future for Mongolia. The country has been facing challenges with regard to unemployment, improvement of working conditions particularly in the informal economy sector, improving skills development to match with the demand of labour market, etc. The ILO, with its unique mandate, expertise and access to policy level decision makers in the country, is well positioned to support its constituents and other stakeholders to support them to address these issues.

The DWCP is also aligned with the NPADW of 2005-2008. Since the constituents are developing the next phase of the National Plan of Action, necessary adjustments in the implementation of DWCP will be required to ensure the relevance of DWCP.

Coherence:

The DWCP has 11 outcomes, which overlap to some extent. The ILO support is fragmented with relatively small amount of resources available to deliver tangible results. The technical issues covered under the DWCP are quite broad while the capacity is relatively limited. This requires the ILO to coordinate its work with those of other development partners. However, without the presence of an ILO office in Mongolia, coordination cannot always be fully followed up.

In spite of this, the ILO is well positioned to support its strategic partners and remains flexible and responsive to changes warranted. All strategic partners interviewed expressed high appreciation of the work and partnership with ILO. Nevertheless, according to the Team, ILO executes its influence mostly in solitude, which greater coordination or alignment with other donor partners will enhance the impact of its comparative advantages.

ILO is also a part of the UN family. A better coordinated and united UN family could have "a louder voice". We found that major donors did not coordinate well when working in similar areas. The Government of Mongolia is working on a system to keep oversight of the work of the donor community.

Reach and expansion in ILO's delivery services will need to be improved, to avoid it becoming an obstacle in the implementation of the remaining period of DWCP where the constituents are likely to seek ILO's support in other aimags outside Ulaanbaatar.

Criteria 2: Partnership, strategies and inter-agency relations

Scoring 3.5: Moderately satisfactory.

The ILO has participated in some UN joint programmes. The ILO – as a smaller UN agency with limited funding – may need to put additional resources in joint programmes.

Partnership and strategy:

An important partnership for the ILO is its partnership with the UN family. Position Paper of the UN Country Team (UNCT) states clearly that: “*UNCT Mongolia has agreed on the key principles and instruments to move towards “One United Nations” in Mongolia*”. UNCT’s rationale for “One UN” is to have an effective, efficient and coherent programme to maximize development benefit for the people of Mongolia. UNCT Mongolia has already been practicing a number of elements of “Five Ones” and is committed to continue the reforms. There have been some good and unique examples of collaboration within the UN family in Mongolia. The UNDP and ILO collaboration on the Human Development Report (HDR) Mongolia 2007 and the joint programme on HIV/AIDS are good examples of collaboration within the UN family. Important initiation of inter agency collaboration for the Year of Job Creation is yet another example. However, collaboration generally remains limited. The Review Team agree with the findings of the study on UN agencies involvement in the Poverty Reduction Strategy (PRS) and the National Development Strategy (NDS) in Mongolia (Zohir and Patel 2008) that despite the structures put in place for better coordination, these structures facilitated exchange of information only. We believe that the ILO could benefit substantially from a more united UN family and donor community. While ILO does have some unique comparative advantages in Mongolia, large funds for technical cooperation are not one of these. Therefore we believe that the achievement of DWCP would be greatly improved if it can use the UN family and the donor community to advocate for its values and principles. Better coordination within the UN family can be improved partly through the development of stronger Results Matrix and Monitoring and Evaluation Framework of UNDAF (Askwith 2008), which the ILO can contribute to.

While ILO makes substantial contributions to national policy development, it does less on local levels. ILO lacks larger partners with strong presence at local levels. ILO has experience in working at local levels outside Ulaanbaatar through the International Programme on the Elimination of Child Labour (IPEC) project but these are limited to specific sectors. With strong demand from tripartite constituents and stakeholders for the ILO to help them implement the policy at local levels, the challenge for the remaining period of DWCP implementation is how to deliver technical services at local levels.

The relation with the tripartite constituency is of particular importance for ILO in Mongolia and this relationship is well established.

Inter-agency relations:

As mentioned above, ILO has some good examples of inter-agency relations including two joint programmes with the UN family. ILO also participated actively in an ad-hoc joint UN initiative in the development of the 2007 HDR report. As part the “One UN” efforts and in line with Paris Declaration these effort should be strengthened. Part of the UN’s (and ILO’s) role is to be impartial and trusted development partners, which should be regarded as one of the comparative advantages of the ILO.

Criteria 3: Managing for results

Scoring 4.0: Moderately satisfactory.

Overall, DWCP Mongolia is heading in the right direction towards the achievement of the country programme outcomes. Progress has been made for most of the outcomes in spite of limited resources of the ILO. The stakeholders have used the outputs delivered by the ILO to move forward towards results identified in the DWCP.

Given the number of country outcomes in the DWCP, overlap and linkages between outcomes are unavoidable. This requires the ILO to revisit its overall country programme strategy to ensure that achievement of results belonging under one outcome would contribute to the achievement of other outcomes. During the field trip, constituents and other stakeholders requested for more ILO support including

implementation of national policy at local level through direct assistance to specific target groups. Since the DWCP is halfway through its implementation period and taking into account the available resources, review of the country programme strategy should look into ways to respond to such request within the remaining period of the DWCP and ILO's limited resources.

Attempts to improve the country programme monitoring have been made with the identification of at least one indicator per outcome. The DWCP Monitoring Plan has also identified baselines, milestones and outputs against which progress reporting has been made. ILO Beijing has been using a country programme workplan as a monitoring tool and used that as a basis to mobilise technical support from SRO Bangkok and ILO HQ. Unfortunately with the use of different terminology to measure progress (i.e. indicators and milestones), there remains some degree of confusion as to how progress towards the achievement of results should be documented and verified over time. Guidance on the use of indicators and milestones in measuring progress will improve monitoring exercise for the remaining period of DWCP.

During the field trip, the Review Team found that the country programme performance was not monitored in a coherent way against indicators. The Review Team also received an English version of the DWCP from the stakeholders where the outcome indicators were not written. It is therefore likely that the Mongolian partners are not aware of the country programme indicators against which progress towards the outcomes is assessed.

To avoid turning monitoring into a mere reporting exercise, efforts should be made to improve activities related to monitoring. This includes collecting information of the baseline situation under each outcome through mini survey, rapid assessment etc; documenting the outputs more systematically to ensure that they all contribute towards results of the relevant country programme outcomes; identifying clear targets of the indicators with clear means of verification; and consolidation of project progress reports as well as documentation of good practices and tools as part of regular office monitoring plan. Regular budget resources should therefore be set aside specifically for country programme monitoring purposes. With improved monitoring system, the ILO would be able to demonstrate clearly the results when the current DWCP ends in 2010.

Constituents and partners have acknowledged the contribution of the ILO to improve their institutional capacity in order to ensure progress towards results of the country programme. However, it is not clearly evident, except to some extent the TBP project, how the ILO has prepared the constituents and partners to sustain the activities it has currently supported. The exit strategy for the country programme outcomes needs to be prepared soon to ensure that results are sustainable by the partner institutions.

Criteria 4: The efficiency and adequacy of ILO organizational arrangements

Scoring 4.0: Moderately satisfactory.

In general, the constituents are satisfied with the quality of ILO's technical assistance. They acknowledged the quality of ILO's major outputs provided by technical specialists in the region and headquarters. The ILO is seen as a fair and honest broker to promote international labour standards and decent work in the country. ILO's work on the elimination of the worst forms of child labour, for example, is cited as a good example of how the ILO helps constituents put into practice the principles of its conventions. The constituents also regard the ILO as a reliable body to assist Mongolia in setting its national wage policy.

As mentioned in the previous section, the performance monitoring system of DWCP should be strengthened in order to measure tangible results towards the achievement of DWCP outcomes. The Review Team noted that knowledge management and sharing are relatively good with record of important meetings and some of ILO's tools are easily accessible through the Office website.

The absence of ILO's country presence in Mongolia has affected the effectiveness of the delivery of ILO's services. The constituents also expressed appreciation for the involvement of the Director of ILO Beijing not only in providing managerial support for programming activities but also for technical inputs for work relating to the promotion of international labour standards. Currently, ILO Beijing has assigned a programme analyst responsible for backstopping the implementation of the country programme. However, without a physical presence, coordination and relations with UNCT and donor community have suffered and the Office is not always up-to-date on the latest development in the country. The constituents also feel that they do not always get the response on time from the Office due to the absence of ILO presence in the country. The recruitment of a National Coordinator in Mongolia from December 2008 will hopefully address this issue. The UN Resident Coordinator also welcomed the recruitment of the National Coordinator as part of "Delivering as One" in Mongolia.

The use of relatively new technology like Skype, web conferencing and online collaboration on documents would improve communication and make collaboration with UN family, donor community and partners more effective. This would complement the function of the National Coordinator.

Criteria 5: Knowledge management and sharing

Scoring 4.0: Moderately satisfactory.

ILO Beijing has a website that provides links to relevant workshop reports, publications and other information resources relating to country programme in Mongolia. It is noted that the website is not frequently updated but it provides useful links to website of other offices of the ILO, including ILO Geneva. The TBP project has made attempts to document good practices developed under the project. The Review Team has also received a list of publications developed under the completed Informal Economy project, which is not readily available in the website. The Office also has a newly appointed dedicated media and communications officer but the Review Team did not have the chance to meet him to discuss the communications and media relations strategy of DWCP in Mongolia. The ILO does not have public information centre in Mongolia, which is something the Office can assign the National Coordinator to look after.

More regular tripartite meetings between the Office and the constituents can also be considered where progress with the implementation of the country programme can be reported. In such meetings, contribution of the DWCP to the achievement of larger outcomes of the NPADW can be discussed.

VI. FINDINGS ON OPERATIONAL ASSESSMENT ON PROGRESS OF THE ELEVEN OUTCOMES

This section contains an assessment of each DWCP outcome using the multi-point score matrix provided in [annex 6](#). As the background for preparing these assessments, the Review Team used the findings from the review of materials, findings from the stakeholders' interviews as well as inputs received during the stakeholder workshop.

The assessment of progress of each of the country programme outcomes below is based not only on the DWCP Monitoring Plan and outcome report of ILO Beijing but also on subjective observation made by the Review Team. The observations have taken into account the desk review of materials and feedback from the interviews and from stakeholders' consultation.

Priority 1: Formulating and implementing employment promotion strategies to address issues of sustainable livelihoods and poverty alleviation in the formal and informal economy

Outcome 1.1: Development of national policy framework is supported by innovative interventions designed and implemented to promote employment and impact livelihoods and poverty with specific focus on informal economy

Findings: Satisfactory (4.5)

This outcome covers a lot of outputs and activities. Capacity building of the tripartite constituents, the Informal Economy project, and application of SIYB, GET Ahead and KAB were major activities under this outcome. Joint preparation for the 2007 HDR-Mongolia entitled “Employment and Poverty in Mongolia” was another major activity.

All ILO’s activities were positively rated by the tripartite constituents and other stakeholders.

A. Resource adequacy

While resources are limited and hard prioritization and cost minimization must be done, the available resources are sufficient for the implementation of the outcome. However, without having external resources, the current activities are limited to maintaining the on-going activities but difficult to gain the scale merit.

B. Delivery of outputs

The existence and functioning of the tripartite constituency to address this issue is the most valuable output under this outcome. The Review Team believe that this output is sustainable. We observe that the ILO is given credit for its contribution to the tripartite constituents by the Mongolian stakeholders.

The stakeholders appreciate ILO outputs and their quality. Most outputs are delivered according to the plan, and where this is not the case, the setback may be because of the delays from the Mongolian side as well as from the ILO.

SIYB seems to be the most widely used output in terms of people trained/involved. It has been used by governmental bodies to train 900 or more entrepreneurs. TOT training has also been undertaken. The SIYB training is to some extent followed up by supporting the entrepreneurs during a start-up phase. However, the entrepreneurship spirit and growth of new business ideas is greatly curtailed, in the Review Team’s opinion, by the process for governmental approval of the business plan. If the Government decides which entrepreneurs are allowed to start their businesses and which business plans to be supported, then the concept of private enterprises is greatly reduced. Only if the approval process consists of transparent, objective, verifiable and non-discriminating requirements will such a process lead to the promotion of entrepreneurship in the country.

Under the current situation, the SIYB training is linked to different government, donor and NGO programmes. It is inevitable that the follow-up support for SIYB trainees is required under these programmes. Micro credit institutions which operate for private sector development could be a more professional body to approve business plans. Recently started cooperation with the Xacbank can be a good entry point in this respect.

Based on the information gathered during the field trip and inputs from the stakeholders, access to capital (state loans) is in short supply. The global financial crisis and falling commodity prices do not make access to capital any better nor make it likely that there will be significantly more capital available for the banks in the immediate future. Many of the relatively large number of determined entrepreneurs who are motivated and trained in Mongolia by ILO, Government and entrepreneurship programmes of other donors may be disappointed that they cannot start their businesses because of administrative, financial as well as market barriers to overcome. The number of start-up entrepreneurs trained may be a good indicator about the development of entrepreneurship in Mongolia but it is not sufficient as an indicator for a successful development of businesses.

In December 2008, MONEF organized a monitoring of the SIYB programme in 4 provinces, which recorded the number of entrepreneurs training, out of which how many started businesses and registered and the number of employment created. With the current level of financial resources, it is difficult to have indicators to see how successful these businesses are. More resources are required to establish a comprehensive data base and analysis of such overtime.

The collaboration for the development of 2007 HDR-Mongolia is a good model for joint activities and collaboration between UN agencies, which we believe will be useful in the future.

C. Use of outputs by partners/target groups

As described in B, the Review Team assess the establishment and functioning of tripartite body to address the employment issue as the most valuable output.

SIYB seems to be a widely used output in terms of people trained/involved. KAB is also widely used as a module in vocational training.

D. Progress made (against outcome indicators)

Stakeholders interviewed appreciated the progress being made by the DWCP. However, the progress has been limited as the ILO has acted alone. Other donors, including UN agencies, work on related, overlapping or complementary areas with limited collaboration among them. ILO does not have a country office in Ulaanbaatar, which limits active collaboration with the UN agencies resident in Mongolia.

After pilot programmes in 20 schools, the Government plans to replicate KAB across the country, which is an indication of progress of this outcome.

E. Emerging risks and opportunities

Political risk is clearly high for this outcome, which may affect ILO's programme.

Conclusions:

The outcome consists of a lot of different objectives, outputs and activities. As described in section B, the tripartite constituency is the most valuable output by the target group. We also believe that it is sustainable. Other outputs are delivered well by the ILO. Resources have been sufficient to make progress that is appreciated by the stakeholders.

Recommendations:

ILO should continue supporting the tripartite constituents. Some of the groups in the stakeholder workshop (see chapter VII) suggested some improvements to the tripartite work, which indicate that the ILO may have to review the tripartite functioning with the objective for improvement. This review should be done jointly with the tripartite constituency.

Outcome 1.2: Improved skill development for livelihood and employability

Finding: Satisfactory (4.5)

ILO has supported the Ministry of Social Welfare and Labour (MSWL) to improve Vocational Education Law. As most changes in policy, even relatively modest ones have to be backed by a law in Mongolia, this work has been important. However the process of improving the law is time consuming since it has to be updated in a few years time to accommodate more policy issues. Thus the work on the revision of the law takes resources away from its implementation.

Resulting from ILO inputs the special needs of people with disabilities and the prevention of discrimination is now included in the new law.

A. Resource adequacy

ILO Beijing managed to allocate funding from RO Bangkok and HQ and to link inter project activities and regional technical cooperation funds. Progress has been made with limited resources.

B. Delivery of outputs

Technical support has been provided by ILO on the development and improvement of national skills strategy and skills recognition systems. Comparison of Mongolia VET Law with the VET laws of South Africa (Skills Development Act 1998), Federal Republic of Germany (Vocational Training Act Berufsbildungsgesetz (BBiG) of 23 March 2005) and New South Wales, Australia (Vocational Education and Training Act 2005 No 100) was prepared and submitted to the Government.

ILO completed a technical review of the Mongolia Employment Service in April 2008 and provided a report and recommendations. Employment service staffs were included in a study tour, which looked at skills policy, standards, testing, and delivery systems and the roles of the social partners in addition to employment services.

The Mongolian Employers' Federation (MONEF) expressed the need for more skills training in Mongolia.

C. Use of outputs by partners/ target groups

The stakeholders reported activities as generally being useful.

Vocational Education Training (VET) law is yet to be finalized. Officials trained during ILO supported activities have suggested incorporation of some of the activities in the programme of the Millennium Challenge Account - Mongolia. This however remains to be further explored.

New Parliament is going to continue discussion of the draft law. There remains a problem of non-existent of nationally recognized certifications or qualifications despite the increase in the number of training providers offering different types of training courses. Employers do not see skills taught in formal institutions as relevant to their needs. Several stakeholders raised the need for intensifying capacity building as a more fundamental challenge to Mongolia.

For some outputs like the VET study, which was completed in mid 2008, it is too early to assess whether recommendations have been implemented. However, the report of the study provides information, findings and recommendations that would be useful in the coming years.

D. Progress made (against outcome indicators)

Improved skills have led to increased sustainability in employment, for instance, greater number of former unemployed who remain in employment for more than 6 months after training, according to information given to the Review Team.

Similar as with the use of outputs (point C), it is difficult to assess what progress is being made. We do however trust that the VET study and its findings and recommendations will improve the Mongolian employment authorities' possibilities to give better services to the target group, even though this remains to be implemented.

The DWCP document sets the following indicator for this outcome: "Increase in percentage of good practice replication and adoption of ILO tools and methodologies by Government and social partners". As it is difficult to get reliable estimate of the increase in the percentage, the Review Team cannot ascertain whether progress has been made based on this indicator.

E. Emerging risks and opportunities

Failure or inadequate implementation of the laws and decisions made by the authorities is a risk factor, since this outcome deals with a major restructuring of the organisational set up. Problems may arise if the employment service system is understaffed, funding is not adequate or the political climate in country change to be unfavourable.

The mismatch between the industrial requirements and what skills training institutions can offer is another risk factor. Some stakeholders also raised their concern that the industry requirements in the future is different from what the skills training institutions are able to deliver.

Conclusions:

Generally progress is satisfactory. Some stakeholders highlighted skills training as a priority for DWCP. The Review Team are satisfied with the use of resources to make progress towards results under this outcome.

Recommendations:

Support for the improvement of skills training policy should remain a priority of the country programme, particularly with regard to some structural problems under section C above.

Outcome 1.3: Promote decent and productive work for youth

Findings: Moderately satisfactory (4.0)

Government is giving employment a high priority and announced 2007 as the Year of Job Creation. Action taken by the Government includes: setting and working towards target to create 80,000 new jobs; registration of workers in the informal economy; increase of pensions by 15%; salary increase of public servants by 20%; increase in minimum wage from 53,000 Tugrugs to 69,000 Tugrugs; tax reforms regarding income tax (company and individual) and value-added tax (VAT).

To address the employment challenge, the Government has introduced a set of policies and programmes. The Employment Promotion Law implemented through the National Employment Promotion Programme includes employment promotion and active labour market policies. Policies to promote employment cover five areas: (i) finances and credit; (ii) enterprise development; (iii) rural employment promotion through cooperatives, partnerships, family businesses, animal husbandry and crop production; (iv) employment promotion linked to environmental protection; and (v) employment promotion through tourism and the development of infrastructure.

Mongolia is one of the 15 focus countries for the ILO Youth Employment Programme created to implement the ILO's action plan on youth employment adopted at the 2005 ILC.

The two main activities are the School-to-Work Transition survey and assistance to the preparation and adoption of National Plan of Action on Youth Employment.

A. Resource adequacy

Limited funding was available from the ILO/Korea Partnership Programme to support the two main activities mentioned above. ILO Beijing pooled resources from its Regular Budget for Technical Cooperation (RBTC) and other funding resources from RO-Bangkok and HQ to conduct activities.

B. Delivery of outputs

Capacity building, like to the School-to-Work Transition Survey took more time to accomplish than anticipated. The survey was conducted by the National Statistical Office with ILO technical and financial support in 2007. The recommendations put forth in the survey report provided a basis for the development of the national youth employment action plan.

Outputs delivered are relevant. As the resources have been limited, the outputs and the delivery have also been limited. The Review Team are satisfied with the present level of delivery taken into account the limited resources available.

The workplan for this outcome has been respected. Delays in the last few years were caused by change of Government, which led to change of MSWL staff.

C. Use of outputs by partners/ target groups

This outcome has become more important for the Mongolian Government and Parliament.

The MSWL has organized tripartite consultations at the provincial level. Several local consultations and meetings have taken place. Further campaigns are to be organized by MSWL later in the year.

Progress seems to go well and key elements in the success has been ILO's contribution and tripartite commitments. Both MONEF and CMTU have also contributed actively to this outcome. MONEF has also come up with a number of proposals to support youth employment such as through policy development, job placement, business surveys, information dissemination, professional training, internship programmes and cooperation with universities. The Confederation of Mongolian Trade Unions (CMTU) adopted a policy document at its 2004 Congress on "The position of CMTU on the issue of youth." This was aimed at encouraging young people to join trade unions with specific provisions for including young people in national employment programmes and protecting young migrants working abroad. It also called for assistance to youth working in the informal sector.

The work on youth was carried out in collaboration with the IPEC programme and linkages between child labour and youth employment were identified and addressed strategically in the national plan of action on youth employment.

D. Progress made (against outcome indicators)

Progress made is not yet possible to measure in terms of more or decent work for youth. The Review Team are of the opinion that good progress should be possible in the remaining period of the DWCP.

Main achievement expressed by some stakeholders is effective communication with the Mongolian stakeholders, through big events like the Employment Forum.

E. Emerging risks and opportunities

Understaffing of the relevant ministries, inadequate funding and political climate are key factors to watch out for. As youth employment is closely tied to the general trends in the labour market, the general economic development and poverty reduction progress will be a risk and opportunity factor to pay attention to.

Conclusions:

The tripartite constituents have shown commitment towards a successful implementation of this outcome. However, progress has not yet been possible to measure in terms of more or decent work for youth.

Recommendations:

As this outcome has become more important for Mongolia, the ILO's DWCP should also focus more on this outcome. The intervention strategy for the achievement of this outcome should also be closely linked with that of the outcome on the elimination of the worst forms of child labour.

Priority 2: Improving the working environment and extending protection of workers' rights

Outcome 2.1: Improved scope, quality and impact of labour inspection so that there is better application of labour law and progress made in understanding and compliance of ILS

Findings: Moderately satisfactory (3.7)

The ILO has provided a lot of recommendations for labour law reform in Mongolia but not all of the recommendations have been followed up. The labour inspection services have not been fully functioning to implement the laws although the stakeholders have indicated better understanding of the international labour standards (ILS) and the relevant labour laws implementing the ILS.

A. Resource adequacy

Regular budget resources have been allocated to undertake labour inspection audit and possibly ratification of ILO Convention No. 81 on Labour Inspection. Should the audit report be completed and the convention ratified, additional resources will have to be made to help the Ministry with the implementation. The National Human Rights Commission requested training for its secretariat staff on the fundamental principles and rights at work, which will require the allocation of resources from Regular Budget. Resources will have to be allocated to support MSWL in the implementation of various labour laws and regulation. The resources available from the TBP project were used to provide assistance to strengthen inspection of child labour and labour inspection audit.

B. Delivery of outputs

Major outputs in 2006/7 and first half of 2008 have been delivered within the timeline and the remaining outputs are likely to be delivered on time. Capacity building of the constituents on reporting obligations under the ILO Constitution has resulted in the finalization of submission of 5 out of 12 Government reports on the implementation of ratified Conventions. The National Human Rights Commission appreciated the training on the fundamental principles and rights at work and requested further training for its secretariat staff. The ILO has also provided recommendations as inputs for labour law reform.

C. Use of outputs by partners/target groups

The constituents and partner institutions receiving ILO's technical assistance have the capacities to use ILO's tools and materials to improve delivery of their own services, e.g.:

- MSWL has begun to submit pending reports on the implementation of ratified conventions.
- The National Human Rights Commission had used ILO's materials on fundamental principles and rights at work to train managers and workers of a Canadian mining company on issues relating to rights at work.

- Social workers in a coal mining district outside Ulaanbaatar showed how they used ILO's materials to conduct child labour monitoring.

It is noted that the constituents have taken into account some of the ILO's recommendations on the revision of labour laws whilst others are not yet followed up.

D. Progress made (against outcome indicators)

The country programme milestones set for 2006/07 were met and outputs for 2008 are being delivered to meet the milestones for 2008. The Review Team cannot confirm whether there has been an increase in the number of labour inspection, which is identified as one indicator under this outcome. Nevertheless, the stakeholders interviewed by the Review Team confirmed that they had better understanding on the international labour standards (ILS) and the relevant labour laws implementing the ILS. The Review Team cannot however verify whether such increase in understanding is due to improvement in the scope and quality of labour inspection, except on child labour monitoring where such link was established.

E. Emerging risks and opportunities

MSWL informed the Review Team that the Parliament and the Government were reviewing the role of the State Professional Inspection Agency. There is possibility that SPIA may be abolished and the labour inspection functions will be returned to MSWL. The ILO is aware of this new development and has taken this into account in its workplan for 2008/09. The recruitment of national coordinator for Mongolia is timely to assist the ILO Beijing in monitoring the development with regard to the status of the SPIA.

Conclusions:

Progress has been made towards the achievement of this outcome. The stakeholders have indicated better understanding of the international labour standards (ILS) and the relevant labour laws implementing the ILS. However it cannot be verified whether better understanding of the ILS is due to improvement in scope and quality of the labour inspection.

Recommendations:

In view of possible dissolution of SPIA, the ILO should support other strategic partners, particularly MSWL, to strengthen their labour inspection capacity in order to achieve this outcome. In relation to child labour outcome below, it is worth putting further efforts in the remaining period of DWCP to prepare TBP partners in sustaining child labour monitoring system that has taken place at aimag and district level.

Outcome 2.2: Substantial progress made towards the 10-year goal of eliminating the worst forms of child labour, in particular removing children from hazardous work in informal mining

Findings: Very satisfactory (5.5)

This is a country programme outcome where substantive progress with tangible results has been made. The ILO provides technical assistance for policy development and direct assistance to the beneficiaries, including those in aimags outside Ulaanbaatar.

A. Resource adequacy

The resources of the TBP project allow the ILO to strengthen the enabling environment for policy development and the development of area-based intervention models. MONEF also benefit from additional resources provided by ACTEMP project to undertake awareness raising and advocacy campaign on child labour in mining sector.

B. Delivery of outputs

ILO's work under this outcome has been regarded as a good model of country programme intervention by the tripartite constituents and other stakeholders because it contributes not only to policy development but also area-based intervention model. The model includes inter-ministry collaboration between MSWL and Ministry of Education; the National Statistics Office and the aimag and level-district authorities.

The ILO has good visibility and respect from partners and stakeholders for its TBP project, including its contribution to the development of the National Advocacy Strategy against the WFCL. The project also raised awareness on the rights and protection of child jockeys. Work with the National Statistics Office resulted in the inclusion of child labour indicators in the quarterly Labour Force Survey and the implementation of the National Child Labour Survey. The support to the National Human Rights Commission of Mongolia contributed to the inclusion of the child labour situation in the Commission's Annual Report on "Human Rights and Freedoms in Mongolia" to Parliament.

C. Use of outputs by partners/ target groups

Tools and materials developed under the TBP project have been used by the constituents and partner institutions in their efforts to remove children from hazardous forms of labour. The advocacy work of the ILO under this outcome led to the formulation of the National Advocacy Strategy. District level partners also adapt ILO's tools to develop child labour monitoring system

There is need to document all tools developed under the TBP project to ensure that they are available for future use by the partners.

D. Progress made (against outcome indicators)

The country programme milestones set for 2006/07 were met and outputs for 2008 are being delivered to meet the milestones for 2008. Tangible results under this outcome are likely to be achieved by the end of the country programme in 2010.

E. Emerging risks and opportunities

It is a concern that both MONEF and CMTU indicated that they were not confident they would be able to sustain the interventions after the closing of TBP project at the end of 2009. The National Statistics Office also informed that they had limited resources to continue the inclusion of child labour issues as part of the quarterly labour force survey.

Conclusions:

The availability of extra-budgetary resources contributes to substantial progress towards the achievement of this outcome. This is one country programme outcome where the ILO can leverage the technical expertise it has on standards, child labour, occupational health and safety, working conditions and skills development as well as social mobilization to produce tangible results.

Recommendations:

It is important to start preparing the constituents and other stakeholders to sustain the results achieved under this outcome in the remaining period of DWCP, in particular in Ulaanbaatar where 40% of the country's population lives. It is also suggested to better link the implementation strategy of this outcome with that of the other outcome on youth employment. Efforts should also be made to document good practices and compile all tools and products produced under the TBP project and make them easily accessible for public to use through the website of ILO's Beijing Office.

Outcome 2.3: Improved legal environment for migrant workers

Findings: Moderately satisfactory (3.5)

Two issues are on the agenda regarding migrant workers. First, migrant workers coming mainly from China to work in the construction sector in Mongolia. Second, Mongolians migrating to South Korea for work. Both issues are of concern to the tripartite constituents regarding the legal situation these migrant workers are in.

A. Resource adequacy

The Government has developed a programme for migrant workers, but its labour migration management component needs to be improved. Activities are now being developed to this end, with the ILO providing assistance through its EU-funded Asian Programme on the Governance of Labour Migration project.

On the MSWL side limited staff has been an issue. Only one staff member has had competence on this issue and worked on this area. This person has been on education leave for two years (2004-2006), during which time no progress was made in this area in the MSWL.

B. Delivery of outputs

The MSWL has requested ILO technical assistance for work concerning mainly out-migration issues, as well as follow-up workshops for policymakers. The Mongolian Law on Sending Labour Force Abroad and Receiving Labour Force and Specialists from Abroad ("Migration Law", 2001) is currently being revised. ILO has reviewed all drafts from the Ministry, which confirms with the international labour standards. ILO has been providing support to the MSWL staff working on migration issues. It is noted that the migration law has not been adopted by the Parliament.

C. Use of outputs by partners/ target groups

As the labour law is not yet adopted there is so far no use of output to review.

D. Progress made (against outcome indicators)

The responsibility for progress lies with the Government. The progress however is slow, as discussed in section A, since the law is not yet approved.

E. Emerging risks and opportunities

The main risk seen now is a global economic crisis which might lead to recession in the main destination countries, potentially resulting in migration policy reforms that will reduce the number of migrant workers they will admit. However, this could also serve as an opportunity for the country to find an alternative employment policy that could generate domestic jobs for potential migrant workers.

Conclusions:

Limited progress has been made so far. However it is noted that the DWCP indicator for this outcome is "Tripartite constituents' initiatives to support migration workers are becoming visible" and the Review Team has seen such increasing support from the constituents. A proposal for a new law on migration is underway; however it is not yet approved. Even though the new law is not included as an indicator in the DWCP, this should be a key target.

Recommendation:

The Review Team recommend that the focus of ILO's support should be on supporting the Government in the adoption process of the migration law and eventually its implementation.

Outcome 2.4: Improved conditions and safety and health at work

Findings: Satisfactory (4.5)

The occupational safety and health at work (OSH) problems remain especially in sectors like informal mining. Progress has been made in the mining sector and now building sector is taking over as the worst sector. The Government adopted a National Programme on Industrial Safety and Hygiene for 2008-2010 in January 2008, and a new law on OSH has been adopted by Parliament. Both were prepared with ILO technical assistance.

The social security system in Mongolia remains underdeveloped, with the existence of a large informal economy posing a special challenge. ILO has only recently been asked to assist in this field. Until now Mongolia has only reformed its social security system with the assistance from financial institutions such as the Asian Development Bank. ILO is making critical interventions by providing vital advisory assistance, international comparative and normative experiences and practices.

A. Resource adequacy

Some stakeholders rated OSH to be one of the key outcomes receiving most resources. ILO resources for technical assistance to Mongolia however are also limited. The tripartite partners have allocated resources for activities under this outcome. It appears that this outcome receives adequate resources.

B. Delivery of outputs

Delivery of outputs has been good for this outcome. The success seems to be based on ILO's knowledge basis and is a good example of ILO's comparative advantage.

The outputs have included workshops and training activities, translation of ILO materials and dissemination. A conference on formulating the National Programme on OSH, with the participation of tripartite social partners, and two seminars to discuss the Programme's implementation were conducted.

Training has been very important and helpful in carrying out the work in this field. Technical assistance, including advice on OSH law, was valued by tripartite constituents. Other stakeholders expressed the need for re-training on OSH-related issues.

C. Use of outputs by partners/ target groups

Outputs delivered by ILO are used well. The Mongolian partners have been driving the progress themselves and been providing political support (ownership). Such political support is essential for the success in the implementation of this outcome.

Training is appreciated by the tripartite. MONEF has now capacity to undertake OSH-MS training.

MSWL and workers/employers groups have continued to expand training programme at the national level. They have used training materials and have been able to conduct national activities. The new Law on OSH has been accepted. The constituents considered training workshops and fellowship programme in Korea, Italy, Thailand, Vietnam and in Cambodia very worthwhile

Mongolia has awarded ILO's technical specialist on OSH a national award for "Outstanding employee of social welfare and labour sector", which is recognition of ILO's work in Mongolia.

D. Progress made (against outcome indicators)

Substantial progress has been made regarding legal environment, particularly on OSH. The Review Team noted progress with the decrease in the number of occupational accidents and diseases, which is the indicator for this outcome. The ILO's support has contributed to improvement in working condition in the mining sector.

Examples of progress made with assistance from ILO:

1. Decrease in the number of occupational accidents and diseases
2. National OSH programme improved and implemented
3. New OSH law enacted and implemented: The Law was adopted in June 2008
4. OSH protection to small enterprises and informal economy workplaces extended to provincial levels and 200 workplaces newly trained
5. OSH management systems approaches applied in the mining sector by using ILO OSH instruments

E. Emerging risks and opportunities

Government's attention and support in the implementation of this outcome is essential. The economic downturn affecting Mongolia may change Government's attention to issues under this outcome. However given the constituents' ownership of the on-going interventions under this outcome, the Review Team assessment is that the overall risk is moderate.

Stakeholders pointed out that the Government should also focus attention to emerging issues, such as HIV/AIDS in the workplace. They also highlighted the importance of information exchange among partners in Mongolia.

Conclusions:

Progress has been made thanks both to ILO and tripartite constituents' efforts and commitment. On capacity building, progress has been made with the increase in the number of people trained, including on OSH-MS.

Recommendations:

ILO should maintain the good momentum, particularly on capacity building of the constituents as this is the basis for progress in several sectors. Sectors like buildings and construction need more attention. However if a resource prioritization needs to be done, increasing the capacity of the constituents should be prioritized as this will secure future progress and sustainability.

Outcome 2.5: Strengthened advocacy for HIV/AIDS in the Workplace

Findings: Moderately satisfactory (3.5)

The interest for HIV/AIDS in Mongolia is based on attractive access to funding from the global fund, which has drastically increased the available funding to HIV/AIDS, Tuberculosis and Malaria globally. Donors expect that HIV/AIDS, will receive more attention in Mongolia as many agencies get involved in dealing with HIV/AIDS issues, mainly due to the Global Fund resources.

According to the AIDS Alliance, Mongolia has a low HIV prevalence (less than 0.1%), with only 25 reported cases of HIV (by 2006) among a population of 2.6 million. However, the situation is changing rapidly with 15 of the 25 cases reported in 2005 and 2006. This suggests a "*dramatic shift since the first case was reported 18 years ago*", according to the AIDS Alliance². More than 70% of the officially reported cases are among men who have sex with men, and many think that the country's vulnerability to the epidemic has been underestimated. According to UNAIDS estimates, at least 500 people are infected with HIV in Mongolia.

Although the number is small at present, the AIDS Alliance argues that there are a number of factors that make Mongolia vulnerable to HIV. These include: a high incidence of sexually transmitted infections (STIs), with 50% of all registered infectious diseases, around 15,000 to 20,000 cases annually; the prevalence of high-risk behaviours; increasing numbers of sex workers; low condom use; poor access to and variable

² Source: <http://www.aidsalliance.org/sw7225.asp>

quality of essential services, particularly STI testing and treatment; increased levels of domestic violence and alcohol abuse; and high levels of poverty. There is also a rapid increase in HIV in Mongolia's neighbouring countries, Russia, China and Kazakhstan, where the epidemic is fuelled primarily by injecting drug use. There are high levels of international migration between these countries. Although programmes for STIs and HIV have been established, prevention efforts have also been hampered by insufficient enforcement of policies and procedures within the health care system.

A. Resource adequacy

Resources seem to be adequate according to some tripartite stakeholders, including MONEF.

The UN joint programme has estimated a budget need of US\$ 45 million out of which US\$ 10.5 million is regarded as secured commitment from the UN and other donors like Global Fund, bilateral and multilateral agencies, the Mongolian Government and civil society organizations. The rest is unfunded for the moment. ILO has not provided major financial inputs. However, its advisory services and missions have resulted in improved capacity of MONEF to be the main partner for workplace initiatives.

B. Delivery of outputs

The HIV/AIDS programme is a joint UN programme with all major UN agencies working in Mongolia. It is aligned with the UNDAF outcomes, as well as with Mongolia's Strategy on HIV and AIDS Prevention (2006-2011).

MONEF is implementing a workplace education programmes on HIV/AIDS prevention in its member companies. ILO supported the formulation of MONEF's programme for the attainment of international HIV/AIDS funding. It provided training to MONEF on ILO's Code of Practice on HIV/AIDS and the World of Work and its implementation.

The ILO has been providing technical assistance in the formulation of a model workplace policy on HIV/AIDS. In addition, the ILO supports the involvement of workers' and employers' organizations in a national survey and information collection on HIV/AIDS related activities.

C. Use of outputs by partners/ target groups

ILO's assistance to MONEF has been appreciated as MONEF now reaches 30 companies, in its Global Fund project but with support also from ILO. These companies have been involved in advocacy on policy development and HIV/AIDS awareness raising training and activities. During the Global Fund project period 12,635 people were involved in HIV/AIDS prevention at workplace training. 35 peer educators in HIV/AIDS were prepared this year.

D. Progress made (against outcome indicators)

HIV AIDS still is in an early phase and results are pending. We expect the major progress to be made in the remaining of the period.

All advisory services planned have been completed. More requests keep emerging by way of training. Awareness is increasing at workplaces, which is according to one of the indicators set in the DWCP.

E. Emerging risks and opportunities

The ILO has the opportunity to join forces and build collaboration with the UN family and other donors for the implementation of this outcome. The growing joint programme on HIV/AIDS in Mongolia is still in a developing stage, which gives opportunity for ILO to hold discussions and assess possibilities for future inputs. If there is sustained interest - and funds - ILO can roll out training programmes for the informal economy given that the training materials have been translated into Mongolian.

Conclusions:

As attractive access to resources from particularly the Global Fund was part of the reason that development partners enters into this area to tackle a problem that has yet to come, the resources are in the perception of the Review Team adequate. We are not in a position to assess whether the resources are adequate to the expected needs. Progress is being made through collaboration with the tripartite. Results from the joint collaboration with other donors have not yet manifested.

Recommendations:

ILO should translate material into Mongolian to be able to do training.

ILO should strategically focus its assistance in collaboration with the UN family and other donors. The goal should be to improve influence and access to resources by joining forces with strategic partners.

Priority 3: Strengthening tripartism to support social and economic policy development, implementation and institutional reform

Outcome 3.1: Further progress in implementing the Resolution on Tripartism is achieved

Findings: Satisfactory (4.5)

Constituents at national level are aware of the value of tripartism and social dialogue and take ownership of tripartism mechanism. However, despite recognition of the value of tripartism and social dialogue to address social concerns, the social partners feel that the Government has not fully promoted and enhanced tripartism and social dialogue to deal with wide range of labour and social issues. In particular, they are concerned over the lack of appreciation of tripartism and social dialogue by other government ministries outside MSWL.

The Review Team did not assess the implementation of this outcome at aimag and district level. This outcome is closely linked with the other outcome on improvement of wage policy.

A. Resource adequacy

Regular budget resources are used to implement activities under this outcome, particularly for capacity building of tripartite constituents and development of knowledge base on collective bargaining and social dialogue.

B. Delivery of outputs

ILO's contribution for the introduction of tripartism and social dialogue in the formulation of labour and social policies was well recognized by the constituents. ILO's assistance contributed to the development of a proposal on Partnership for Development 2007-2015, which identifies capacity building needs around prioritised technical areas of wages and collective bargaining. Under this outcome, training activities have been carried out on elements of wage policies, including relations between industrial relations process and wage determination. In addition, capacity building activities were organized for CMTU and MONEF.

C. Use of outputs by partners/ target groups

As follow up to ILO assistance, constituents have developed a proposal on Partnership for Development (2007-2015) which identifies capacity building needs in priority technical areas such as wages and collective bargaining

D. Progress made (against outcome indicators)

Social partners have developed institutional capacity to fully participate in policy dialogues on labour and social issues. However, they still require further support from the ILO to provide inputs for the development of national wage policy.

E. Emerging risks and opportunities

Mongolia has institutionalized its social dialogue through the National Tripartite Committee on Labour and Social Consensus. Tripartism was crucial to the peaceful transition from socialist to market economy. The global financial crisis will put pressure on the Government and social partners to strengthen social dialogue in order to address labour and social challenges affecting Mongolia.

Conclusions:

Tripartite constituents in Mongolia are aware and appreciate the value of tripartism and social dialogue to address challenges in the world of work. The progress with the implementation of this outcome directly affects the achievement of the other two outcomes i.e. improvement of wage policy and strengthening the capacity of employers' and workers' organizations. It is noted that the Government has not involved ministries other than MSWL in tripartite consultative process to determine national policies affecting labour and social issues.

Recommendations:

It is necessary to continuously advocate for tripartism and social dialogue during the remaining period of DWCP, in particular to government ministries outside MSWL, and in sectors where tripartism and social dialogue are still absent. In this context, there is a need to set another indicator for this outcome concerning the participation of relevant government ministries in social dialogue process.

Outcome 3.2: Improve wage policy

Findings: Moderately unsatisfactory (3.0)

This is an outcome of the country programme where not much progress has been achieved. A lot of outputs have been delivered but they have not yet contributed towards tangible results of a new wage policy. One factor contributing to the slow progress under this outcome is the lack of capacities in the Government and social partners to understand the whole complexity of wage determination process.

A. Resource adequacy

The ILO has allocated regular budget resources to bring in wage experts to assist the constituents. However, such expertise is required for a longer period by the constituents given the complexity of the issue of wages and its implication to larger economic issues in the country. The constituents also require comparative studies on wage issues from other countries with more or less the same level of development and political situation.

B. Delivery of outputs

A number of training workshops have been organized for the MSWL and the social partners. In addition, the National Statistics Office has been involved in the design of wage structure survey. The MSWL has indicated the need for international wage expert who can advise them on various elements of wage policy, including minimum wages and relations between industrial relations process and wage determination.

C. Use of outputs by partners/ target groups

MSWL and the social partners still lack the capacity to design and set up wage policy that commensurate with the level of economic development of the country. The MSWL and the National Statistics Office need further support to implement national wage structure survey.

D. Progress made (against outcome indicators)

A number of outputs under this outcome have been delivered. What remains lacking is the capacity of the Government and social partners to use the outputs delivered as the basis to set up wage policy through social dialogue. Unless further support and capacity building is provided, this outcome may not be achieved within the remaining period of the country programme.

E. Emerging risks and opportunities

Wage policy determination is highly political in the country. The MSWL is under a lot of pressures to design new wage policy. Since the country just elected a new government, wage policy is high in the agenda of the new Government. It is opportune time to strengthen efforts to provide support in this area. Given the political nature of the issue, it is crucial to ensure that the technical services provided take into account the sensitivity of the Government and the social partners in providing such assistance.

Conclusions:

A lot more efforts are required if this country programme outcome were to be achieved in the remaining period of the country programme. The outputs planned under this outcome have been delivered according to the workplan. However, further capacity building is required to make the constituents fully comprehend the criteria and procedures involved in wage determination process. It is also important to make the constituents aware of the linkages between wage determination, productivity and economic growth.

Recommendations:

Implementation strategy for this outcome needs to be revisited. The Government should be encouraged to undertake a wage structure survey to come up with factual information that can be used as the basis for setting up wage policy. However, considering the political sensitivity of the issue, capacity building of the social partners is required to prepare them to fully utilize the survey results as the basis for negotiation on the determination of wage policy. In particular the roles of employers' and workers' specialists are crucial to assist their respective constituents to participate in meaningful consultative process. At the same time, the ILO should also assist the Government, particularly MSWL and other relevant government ministries, to ensure the necessary preconditions for meaningful dialogue on the issue.

Outcome 3.3 Improved capacity of workers and employers for representation of their members

Findings: Moderately satisfactory (4.0)

Progress has been made with regard to the implementation of this outcome. There is indication that both organizations have provided better services to their members and represented their interests in negotiation of national and labour policies. The Review Team however did not have adequate information to assess whether benefits from improved capacity have been enjoyed by their rank-and-file members.

A. Resource adequacy

Both regular budget and extra-budgetary resources, particularly for child labour programme, have been allocated to support the implementation of this outcome. MONEF indicated that the long absence of

employers' specialist in SRO Bangkok had caused delay with the finalization and implementation of their activity workplan that required ILO's support.

B. Delivery of outputs

MONEF and CMTU recognize the value and quality of ILO's technical assistance. MONEF appreciated technical assistance by the ILO on OSH Management System, KAB, IYB and SIYB. CMTU regarded training on WISCON as very useful and appreciated ILO's work on child labour.

C. Use of outputs by partners/ target groups

Both organizations have better understanding of the concept "Decent Work" and are more confident in advocating it to their members. MONEF has developed capacity to conduct training on OSH-MS for their members. They have also carried out pilot training on KAB in a number of vocational schools. The internal change of CMTU has affected the capacity of its secretariat staff and member organizations, particularly on technical areas such as OSH in small construction, child labour etc.

D. Progress made (against outcome indicators)

Both organizations have actively involved in various tripartite bodies on labour and social issues. There is evidence that MONEF has provided better services to their members. CMTU has also facilitated their member organizations to improve service delivery to members. MONEF and CMTU also participate in the implementation of DWCP. Nevertheless, capacity building for the two organizations needs to be continued particularly in newly emerging issues such as labour migration and in highly political issue such as wage determination

E. Emerging risks and opportunities

Despite the improvement in capacity of MONEF and CMTU, their ability to sustain the results achieved thus far under the country programme is limited. In some instances, while MONEF and CMTU have benefited from ILO's technical assistance, it is important to ensure that they have the capacity to use outputs delivered by the ILO to further the progress towards the achievement of the country programme. The new political and economic situation in Mongolia requires MONEF and CMTU to improve their core functions and services on collective bargaining and industrial relations.

Conclusions:

There is clear evidence of increased capacity of MONEF and CMTU both in terms of providing better services to members and representing their interests in national social and labour policy dialogue. However, as far as the country programme is concerned the issue is whether they have the capacity to sustain the major results achieved. This relates to the sustainability of the country programme once the ILO no longer provides assistance in some of the areas covered, such as child labour etc. Sustainability also concerns the institutional capacity of the two organizations, particularly those of the secretariat staff of the organizations. Considering that other donors also provide bilateral support to Mongolia, it is important to assist them in mobilizing resources from these bilateral programmes.

Recommendations:

In line with the conclusions above, the ILO should review its strategy to strengthen the capacity of the employers' and workers' organizations in sustainability of the country programme results, including through mobilizing resources from other donors. Efforts should be strengthened to ensure that the benefits of ILO's assistance are enjoyed by the rank-and-file members of the organizations, including those at local level. It is suggested that the ILO facilitates dialogue between the social partners and other civil society organizations that share the same values and objectives of the employers' and workers' organizations.

VII. STAKEHOLDERS' CONSULTATION ON 27 OCTOBER 2008

The stakeholders' workshop was undertaken on 27 October 2008 at the Chinggis Hotel, Ulaanbaatar. Representatives from government ministries, employers' and workers' organizations participated in the workshop. Representatives of UN organizations and civil society organizations were also present.

The workshop had the following agenda:

- Welcome by Director of ILO Office for China and Mongolia, Ms. Constance Thomas
- Presentation of the preliminary findings and recommendations
- Group work
- Coffee
- Presentation of group work
- Plenary discussion

The workshop was a participatory exercise where the participants joined into groups according to constituency and discussed the findings presented by the Review Team, advised ILO which of the 11 outcomes they wanted ILO to prioritize as well as discussed how the ILO could assist them in achieving the DWCP outcomes.

Most of the groups agreed in general with the findings. All groups had comments to the different outcomes and towards ILO work and priorities which was presented and the Review Team noted the comments for incorporation into the final report.

Inputs and comments from the groups included the following aspects:

- Align the DWCP with the next phase of NPADW;
- Take into account the impact of global financial crisis, particularly the potential job losses, during the remaining implementation period of DWCP;
- Strengthen the use of tripartite social dialogue;
- Reconfirm the existing number of DWCP priorities and outcomes
- Suggest additional issues to be addressed under the DWCP such as short term employment and sexual assaults at work.

The inputs and comments were considered by the Review Team in coming up with the final scoring on the assessment of DWCP.

VIII. CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

The overall objective of the BCPR is to assess the adequacy and appropriateness of the design, outreach and implementation of the DWCP, and identify and make recommendations for improvement, especially in terms of results based management.

A. General findings:

Below are the summary conclusions for the general findings:

- ***Relevance, coherence and comparative advantage in the ILO:***

ILO remains relevant in Mongolia. Primarily due to lack financial resources, ILO's support has a scattered semblance and necessitates different strategies to fully utilize its comparative advantage. ILO, like FAO and UNIDO, is amongst the 'non resident' agencies. As the UN family and the donor community continue to become more and better coordinated, ILO will require wider participation amongst the UN and donors.

- ***Partnership, strategies and inter-agency relations:***

Donors and development partners (bi/multi and civil society) continue to work towards refining coordination in Mongolia. ILO has some joint programmes with the UN family, which have included UNDP/ ILO National Human Development Report on Poverty and Employment; A joint ILO/UNDP National Forum on Employment; HIV/AIDS. As UN joint programmes grow the ILO – as a small UN agency with limited funding – may need larger resources. Inter agency collaborations between MSWL, ILO and UNDP in relation to the Year of Job Creation are a good start. On the Mongolian side, the constituents have used the outputs of DWCP to bring forward progress towards the achievement of outcomes.

- ***Managing for results***

Mongolia has made progress towards results for some country programme outcomes with assistance from ILO despite limited resources available for the ILO and the Mongolian stakeholders. The country programme outcomes are not always clearly defined, some indicators of the outcomes are vague and not all targets of the indicators are identified. Monitoring system should be strengthened and exit strategy for ILO's projects and programmes in Mongolia should be developed. Documentation of good practices and tools need to be further strengthened to include relevant materials from IPEC, Informal Economy, OSH, SIYB, and work on youth and rural development.

- ***The efficiency and adequacy of ILO organizational arrangements:***

Performance monitoring systems of DWCP should be strengthened and as much as possible aligned with the National Plan of Action on Decent Work (NPADW). Knowledge management and sharing are relatively good.

- ***Knowledge management and sharing:***

Knowledge management and sharing are relatively good.

B. Recommendations

It is noted that the NPADW precedes DWCP, and has a wider perspective. DWCP supports prioritised areas as decided with the constituents. Based on the findings, the Review Team have the following recommendations on DWCP design, donor coordination, resource mobilisation, local representation, monitoring system and knowledge management:

On Design

- Adjust the DWCP implementation workplan in anticipation of possible lower economic growth in Mongolia.
- Reduce the number of outcomes from eleven to between three and five and align with the next phase of the NPADW.
- Set specific targets for the indicators of the DWCP's outcomes.

Donor Coordination

- Strengthen ILO's comparative advantage and improve ILO's influence on development agenda through closer collaboration and coordination with the UN family and donor community.

Resource Mobilisation

- Collaborate with other donors (bi/multi and civil society) to maximize the use of ILO's resources and impact as significant increase in extra-budgetary funding is not likely. Promotional efforts may be required to support financial assistance in relation to several project concept notes and proposals that have been prepared and submitted to the donors.

Local Representation

- Establish a country presence as a matter of priority.

Monitoring system

- Strengthen monitoring system to measure progress and document good practices of DWCP and NPADW.

Knowledge management

- Document good practices and tools consistently for future use and share them with tripartite constituents, development partners and other stakeholders.

C. Assessment of the methodology and tools included in the TOR

Based on the experience of the mission, the methodology for the BCPR laid out in the Terms of Reference can be improved through:

- The use of a time and cost effective web-based questionnaire survey prior to the field visit
- More participatory approaches to ensure deep understanding of the context, performance review process and implications of the BCPR findings and recommendations for the implementation of the remaining period of future possibilities DWCP. This is particularly important where BCPR is conducted during the mid-term implementation of the country programme
- Participation of technical specialists who are not directly involved with the delivery of DWCP will add value to the review process, particularly to assess whether the progress towards the achievement of outcomes is technically sound.
- Depending on whether the BCPR is conducted at the beginning, during the mid-term implementation period or at the end of the country programme cycle, there should be different emphasis on the elements of the country programme that should be assessed.

ANNEXES

1. Team Members
2. Terms of Reference
3. Programme of Meetings in Beijing and Mongolia
4. List of People Met
5. Stakeholders' Workshop Agenda and Presentation by the Review Team
6. Assessment of each DWCP outcome using the multi-point score matrix
7. DWCP Mongolia: 2006-2010

LITERATURE REFERRED TO IN THE TEXT:

Askwith, M. (2008) Report of the 2007 Annual Review of the United Nations Development Assistance Framework (2007-2011) in Mongolia. (November-December 2007), Government of Mongolia/UNCT.

Zohir, S. and M. Patel (2008). Changing Policy Environment in Mongolia: Role of UNCT in a Country at Crossroads, UNDG. Synthesis Report: findings and Recommendations from a Seven Country Study of UN Engagement in Poverty Reduction and National Development Strategies (Martin Greeley).