



International Programme on the Elimination of Child Labour (IPEC)



International
Labour
Office

IPEC Evaluation

Combating Abusive Child Labour II (CACL II) - Pakistan P.270.06.342.008 - PAK/08/03P/EEC

**A combined independent final evaluation and sub-studies
conducted by a team of external consultants**

December 2013

This document has not been professionally edited

IPEC/EVAL/2014/04

NOTE ON THE EVALUATION PROCESS AND REPORT

This independent evaluation was managed by ILO-IPEC's Evaluation and Impact Assessment section (EIA) following a consultative and participatory approach. EIA has ensured that all major stakeholders were consulted and informed throughout the evaluation and that the evaluation was carried out to highest degree of credibility and independence and in line with established evaluation standards.

The evaluation was carried out by a team of external consultants¹. The field mission took place in November 2013. The opinions and recommendations included in this report are those of the authors and as such serve as an important contribution to learning and planning without necessarily constituting the perspective of the ILO or any other organization involved in the project.

Funding for this project evaluation was provided by the European Commission, Europe Aid. This report does not necessarily reflect the views or policies of European Commission, Europe Aid nor does mention of trade names, commercial products, or organizations imply endorsement by European Commission.

¹ Mei Zegers

Table of Contents

Acknowledgements.....	v
Acronyms.....	vi
Executive Summary	vii
1. Introduction.....	1
2. Purpose and scope of the final evaluation	2
3. Methodology	3
3.1 Methodology limitations.....	4
4. Analysis of project design and relevance	5
4.1 Project design fit with existing initiatives.....	5
4.2 Economic, cultural and political situation.....	6
4.3 Logic and coherence; clarity and realism of project objectives	8
4.4 Expectations of roles, capacity and commitment of stakeholders.....	10
4.5 Consideration of existing institutional arrangements.....	10
4.6 Key external factors and assumptions.....	10
4.7 Strategy for sustainability	11
4.8 Relevance.....	11
5. Selection of action programmes, implementing agencies and child beneficiaries	13
5.1 Selection of action programme implementing entities.....	13
5.2 Selection criteria and identification process of beneficiary children	14
5.3 Timeliness of project implementation activities and outputs.....	16
6. Project achievement of targets and objectives/outcomes.....	19
6.1 Holistic district model – Withdrawing and preventing child labour	20
6.1.1 Non-formal education and mainstreaming into formal education	22
6.1.2 Literacy and vocational training.....	25
6.1.3 OSH alleviating working conditions in the target districts.....	28
6.1.4 Health screening.....	29
6.1.5 Project impact on family economic empowerment	30
6.2 Institutional and capacity strengthening	32
6.2.1 Enabling environment - institutional capacity strengthening	35
6.2.2 Promoting pro-child policies and laws enhancing support on child labour elimination.....	37
6.3 Knowledge base and awareness raising	37
6.3.1 Sensitising government, trade unions and employers, local communities and general population.....	38
6.4 Project approaches to gender issues.....	40
7. Project coordination and management	42
7.1 Project monitoring	42
7.2 Project coordination and collaboration with other child-focused interventions.....	43
7.3 Project responses to midterm evaluation recommendations	44
8. Sustainability of project results: Potential for long-term impact, replication, adaptation to new districts	45
8.1 Leveraged resources	46
8.2 Documenting and dissemination.....	46
9. Conclusions and key recommendations	48
9.1 Key lessons learned and good practices.....	48
9.2 Key recommendations	49
Annexe 1: Detailed recommendations	52
Annexe 2: Title of action programme and name of implementing agency.....	56
Annexe 3: Stakeholder workshop results.....	57
Annexe 4: Collaboration and coordination with other child centred entities.....	61
Annexe 5: Resource mobilization - Non-project resources leveraged	64
Annexe 6: Key mid-term recommendations and relevant actions undertaken	70

Annexe 7: Evaluation itinerary	74
Annexe 8: List of interviewees	79
Annexe 9: List of participants' stakeholder workshop	83
Annexe 10: Schedule workshop	84
Annexe 11: References.....	85
Annexe 12: Data sources and techniques used by type of stakeholder during the evaluation.....	87
Annexe 11: Terms of Reference	88

Acknowledgements²

The evaluator would like to thank the entire project team and implementing partners for their input into the evaluation process. Thanks should also go to government officials, educators, employers and workers organisation representatives, representatives of community-based organizations, parents, and especially to the children for sharing their comments.

Particular mention should be made for relevant input and support to:

- Mahjabeen Qazi, national consultant to the Extended Evaluation
- Mahe Nau Haider, Consultant for the sub-study on the Impact of the ILO/IPEC Project of Support on the Enabling Environment
- Muhammad Hussain Bhatti, Osman Mirza and Semiotics team members for the sub-study on the Assessment of the Impact of the Family Economic Empowerment Intervention on Child Labour and School Attendance
- Sujeewa Fonseka (project Chief Technical Adviser) and all the project team members at project headquarters and in districts.

As special thank you to Dr. Sajid Chauhan, District Coordination Officer Sahiwal, for efficient and kind support during an especially challenging time during the mission.

Note: The text of the current report includes information from two sub-study reports as follows-

1. Haider, Mahe Nau (2013) Sub-Study on the Impact of the ILO/IPEC Project of Support on the Enabling Environment. Islamabad: Mahe Nau Haider Independent Consultant (report available from ILO Pakistan office)
2. Semiotics Consultants (Pvt.) Limited (2013), Assessment of the Impact of the Family Economic Empowerment Intervention on Child Labour and School Attendance. Islamabad: Semiotics Consultants (Pvt.) Limited.

² References in the report to the “evaluator” indicate the Team Leader of the evaluation who is ultimately responsible for the content of the current final evaluation report.

Acronyms

AP	Action Programme
ALC	Adult Literacy Centre
CACL II	Combating Abusive Child Labour II
CIWCE	Centre for the Improvement of Working Conditions & Environment
CLMS	Child Labour Monitoring System
CLU	Child Labour Units
CSO	Civil Society Organisation
CTA	Chief Technical Advisor
CIWCE	Centre for the Improvement of Working Conditions and Environment
DBMR	Direct Beneficiary Monitoring & Reporting
DCC	District Coordination Committee
DCO	District Coordination Officer
DWCP	Decent Work Country Programme
DEP	District Education Plan
DLO	District Labour Officer
EC	European Commission
EFP	Employers Federation of Pakistan
FBS	Federal Bureau of Statistics
ILO	International Labour Organisation
IP	Implementing Partner
IPEC	International Programme on the Elimination of Child Labour
MFI	Micro Finance Institution
MOPHRD	Ministry of Overseas Pakistanis & Human Resource Development
MoLM	Ministry of Labour & Manpower
MoU	Memorandum of Understanding
MTR	Mid-Term Review
NFBE	Non-Formal Basic Education
NFE	Non-Formal Education
NGO	Non-Governmental Organisation
NRSP	National Rural Support Programme
OSH	Occupational Safety & Health
PCC	Provincial Coordination Committee
PCLU	Provincial Child Labour Units
PRSP	Punjab Rural Support Programme
PTCL	Pakistan Telecommunication Co. Ltd.
PWF	Pakistan Workers Federation
ROM	Result Oriented Monitoring
TBP	Time-Bound Programme
TPR	Technical Progress Report
WDACL	World Day Against Child Labour
WFCL	Worst Forms of Child Labour
WWF	World Wildlife Fund

Executive Summary

Pakistan has been working in collaboration with a variety of donor-supported actions to address child labour concerns in the country for about 20 years. The enormity of the challenges, however, means that much work remains to be done to fully eliminate the worst forms of child labour (WFCL) in the country. Many lessons have been learned over the years, which were linked together to design the ‘Combating Abusive Child Labour II’ (CACL II) project. The overall project development objective of the CACL II project is: “To contribute to the elimination of child labour, with special focus on the elimination of the abusive/worst forms of child labour in Pakistan.” The project has an increased focus on developing a sustainable enabling environment at provincial and district level. Downstream actions on withdrawing and preventing children from child labour were concretely planned and integrated to serve as replicable district models within the provinces.

The CACL II project has been funded by the European Commission and was implemented by the International Labour Organization (ILO) in Pakistan together with a range of national stakeholders. The project implementation period was from April 2008 and it will end on 31 December, 2013. The project was evaluated over a period spanning from September until December 2013.

In accordance with this approach, the project has three Immediate Objectives (IO):

1. A sustainable and holistic district model developed to reduce and gradually eliminate abusive child labour across sectors.
2. The institutional and technical capacity of target district governments, four provincial Child labour Units and one Federal Child Labour Unit strengthened to effectively combat child labour.
3. The knowledge base on child labour and its worst forms expanded and awareness increased to promote child labour friendly policies.

Implementation activities were planned with a focus on three main areas: direct assistance to child workers and poor families who involve their children in WFCL; capacity building for government labour administration, employers, workers and civil society; building a knowledge base on child labour in the country. Under Immediate Objective 1 children were to be withdrawn or prevented from child labour in formal and informal sectors including auto-workshops, domestic labour, rag-picking, street children, and agriculture.³ The CACL II project targeted other forms of hazardous child labour as indicated on a list of 29 hazardous occupations that had been identified in 2002 through tri-partite⁴ consultations. Under the original project document 6,500 children were to be withdrawn (5,500) and 1,000 or prevented from WFCL. These numbers were later increased as the project sought to attain additional results. After a project revision the CACL II project aimed at withdrawing 7,500 and preventing 1,500 children from WFCL.

The project focuses on the provinces of Punjab, Sindh, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, and Balochistan. The districts of Sahiwal in Punjab and Sukkur in Sindh were selected—with input from the key stakeholders—to serve as district models for potential replication.

The primary purposes of the expanded final evaluation are to:

1. Establish the relevance of the project implementation strategy;

³ International Labour Organisation (ILO) International Programme on Elimination of Child Labour (IPEC) – European Commission (EC) (2009). Contribution Agreement between the European Commission and International Labour Organization (ILO) International Programme on the Elimination of Child Labour (IPEC) to implement the Financing Agreement between the European Commission and the Government of Pakistan. Islamabad: ILO and EC.

⁴ Government, employers and workers organisations.

2. Assess the extent to which the project has achieved its stated objectives at outcome and impact level
3. Identify the supporting factors and constraints that have led to any achievements or lack of achievements
4. Determine the implementation effectiveness and efficiency;
5. Identify the supporting factors and constraints that have led to any achievement(s) and/or lack of achievement(s)
6. Identify unintended positive and negative changes at outcome and impact levels
7. Assess the sustainability
8. Identify lessons learned and potential good practice
9. Provide recommendations to project stakeholders to support the completion, expansion or further development of initiatives.

The evaluation includes two important sub-studies to provide specific information on achievements and challenges relating to project impact:

- enabling environment at sub-national level
- project family economic empowerment intervention

These studies serve to not only to deepen the understanding of the project for the overall evaluation. They are intended to provide insights on key crucial project elements and to triangulate with the information collected by the international and the national consultant team. Both sub-studies were carried out by Pakistani teams with strong experience in the local context and thus buttress the findings of the evaluation. All data from the various sources—whether documentation, interviews, focus groups, workshops or observation—was triangulated during the analysis and in the evaluation report.⁵

The overall project design, as reflected in the project Logical Framework and narrative, was highly relevant and appropriate to the context. The design was valid and assisted the achievement of the project goals as set out in the Project Document and its Logical Framework.

The project took the economic, cultural and political situation into account at the time of the design. Problems and needs were adequately analysed taking lessons learned from previous child labour projects into account. Most of all, government officials, authorities and educators stressed the importance of *the key strategy of focusing on creating synergistic networks to attain project objectives*. Government, employers and workers ‘representatives who were familiar with previous child labour projects in the country saw the design as a logical progression from past projects to the current design that focuses more on the enabling environment. During the previous projects, efforts were concentrated on addressing sectoral child labour issues whereas the current project design moved to an area-based approach in line with transferring responsibility to the Government. The project established institutions in the form of Provincial Child Labour Units and district committees to focus on child labour and education. Two districts were selected to serve as models for the integrated area-based approach.

The project design fit well with existing government initiatives on child labour and was in support of the priorities under the Decent Work Country Programme (DWCP). The subsequently developed Decent Work Country Programme 2010-20156 continues to reflect child labour as a priority area, with the project as the key element supporting the DWCP.

⁵ See Annexe 12 for an overview of data collected by stakeholder type and source.

⁶ ILO Country Office for Pakistan (2010) Decent Work Country Programme 2010 – 2015. Islamabad: ILO Country Office

The project Logical Framework included risks and assumptions several of which, ultimately, did prove to be problematic. Adjustments in the practical implementation of the project needed to be made due to security challenges and changes in devolution processes (See Section 5.1 for details). The original assumption was that the Government would continue to devolve to district level but this situation changed. Instead governance responsibility devolved even more strongly away from federal to provincial level than was expected with less devolution to district level than envisaged. This situation had profound impact on project methodologies. The project was, however, able to revise the pertinent project components to meet this changing situation.

Risks identified in the Logical Framework related to security and natural disasters proved to be true. Security challenges and natural disasters (floods) resulted in the need to make further implementation changes. These included the implementation of a district model in Punjab instead of in Khyber Pakhtunkhwa as originally planned.

Selection of Implementing Partners for the actions on direct withdrawal and prevention of child labour and to support household with economic empowerment was conducted in a participative and transparent manner. Government entities at provincial and district level, employers and workers organisations as well as two national NGOs implemented the Action Programmes (AP). The evaluator thus notes that AP implementation included a good representation of actors from the ILO constituents but and from civil society. The range of AP Implementing Partners thus the major stakeholders with had opportunities to gain experience and ownership.

Children were selected in line with the ILO IPEC criteria of children in the WFCL or at risk of WFCL. Mothers included in the project economic empowerment component were the mothers of beneficiary children.

The project functioned well to achieve its overall objective of contributing to the elimination of child labour, with special focus on the elimination of the abusive/worst forms of child labour in Pakistan. Evidence from the individual and focus group discussions, sub-studies, other documents, as well as observations, all support the conclusion that the project generally attained the overall as well as immediate objectives (IO). The project mobilized the tripartite constituents of government, workers and employers. Individual APs, research and policy projects, and awareness raising were effective to different degrees but all contributed to overall positive results. The only area where the result fell slightly short of the target was in the area of access to micro-credit or grants with 91% of the target achieved.

For IO1, a sustainable and holistic district model was developed to reduce and gradually eliminate abusive child labour across sectors in were developed in one model district in Punjab and Sindh each. Government funded replication is already being launched. The two model districts achieved their targets and can truly be called “model districts”. Downstream actions on withdrawing and preventing children from child labour were concretely planned and integrated into education systems to serve as replicable district models within the provinces. Networking and establishment of synergistic actions have been among the project’s most important successes.

A total 10,500 children were withdrawn (8,354) or prevented (2,146) from child labour with support from the project (See Result number 10 and 11 below). This figure substantially exceeds even the higher target set by the project after the project revision. The project attained the goal of withdrawing or preventing approximately equal number of boys (5098) and girls (5402) from child labour. Children below the age of 14 were withdrawn or prevented from child labour through enrolment in Non-Formal Education with the majority subsequently mainstreaming into formal education. Most of the children in the age category 15-17 received six month literacy training and 81% also received vocational/skills training. Some of the older children (146) benefitted from working under improved conditions and

for Pakistan.

were thus withdrawn from WFCL. Health services had been provided which was reported to benefit the children and their families.

Results in terms of mainstreaming of children out of child labour and into education were generally positive. Stakeholders considered that project inputs and services provided were sufficient overall to keep beneficiary children regularly attending school and out of child labour. The mainstreaming of children after NFE (transitional education) into formal education appeared to mostly be successful with most children long-term results. Despite these overall positive results, however, there is still room for improvement as some children appeared to still be working. The sub-study team on economic empowerment, the enabling environment sub-study consultant, and the team of international team leader with the national consultant all found some instances of continued child labour. The sub-study team on economic empowerment included a sample of 422 mothers of which 13% still had children in child labour. Due to evaluation time limitations it was not possible to ascertain if any of these children were working under improved conditions. Although these findings may appear disappointing, the evaluator still noted comparatively good results as compared to child labour projects in other countries.

Literacy and vocational/skills training were successful but longer training was needed for some while the range of options and market linkages could have been improved. Economic empowerment was useful in reducing household dependence on child labour but there was still much need for additional training for mothers; micro-finance and grants; and market linkages for products and services. The project literacy and vocational or skills training for older children ages 14-17 included types of training such as sewing, embroidery, beauty/barbering, motorbike or mobile phone repair, and electric motor winding⁷. The project had tried to match the types of training provided to local labour market needs through informal assessments in communities and at Union Council level.⁸ No formal study was conducted, however. While children did have a choice of trades, interviewed children stated that the range of possibilities they could choose from was limited. This was mostly because of availability of trainers in the localities but, in addition, there is a need to further develop innovative ideas for the types of training.

The Economic Empowerment sub-study did find that 57% of mothers in Sukkur and Sahiwal reported that children aged 15-17 who obtained literacy /vocational training and/or toolkits were able to find employment or start their own work. A full post-project impact study may be useful to learn more lessons about the different elements implemented in the literacy/vocational/skills training. In some locations and for some types of work, children reported earning a decent income that is at least equivalent to the money they could earn in child labour.

The project engaged in very interesting work on Occupational Safety and Health (OSH) in an effort to improve working conditions for older children. Workplaces where conditions are adequate, including acceptable working hours, can serve as good choices for training and youth employment. Under the OSH component, the project worked with the Centre for the Improvement of Working Conditions and Environment (CIWCE) and the Employers Federation of Pakistan (EFP) to establish safe work auto and agricultural model workshops.⁹ Materials and awareness raising on OSH were disseminated. The work of CIWCE is clearly well organised and implemented by competent individuals with good support from EFP. As discussed in the main body of the report, some aspects could be studied further to ensure full compliance.

To help address poverty, mothers of child beneficiaries were provided with Business Management Skills Training (BMST), Livestock Management Skills Training (LMST), or Sewing and Stitching Training (SST) along with micro-credit or grants.¹⁰ Some families were linked to the Zakat and Bait-

⁷ Repairing motors such as irrigation pumps by improving their main functioning mechanisms.

⁸ As one interviewee stated, “we talked to different people and asked them what they thought, we also gave community members a list of possible trades and asked them their opinion.”

⁹ The concept of model workshops was already implemented in at least one previous ILO IPEC project in Pakistan.

¹⁰ Please see Section 5.1 on selection of beneficiaries and their mothers.

UI-Mal grant schemes for scholarships. The evaluation economic empowerment study found that, while the mothers' economic empowerment results are not perfect, they do indicate that the training and the micro-finance had a positive impact on over half of all households.¹¹ This positive impact was found to contribute to enabling mothers to keep their children out of child labour. Sahiwal, approximately 79% of the mothers started their own work and 3% worked for someone else subsequent to their training; 18% of them did not work after training. In Sukkur, around 36% of the mothers started their own work, while 18% were employed elsewhere; 47% did not work after the completion of their training. Training had 33% positive increase on income levels in Sahiwal, equal to Rs. 1,725; in Sukkur, this impact was an 11% increase, translating to Rs. 975.

For IO2, evaluation stakeholders who had participated in institutional and capacity strengthening indicated that a great deal had been accomplished. Institutional and personal capacities were strengthened through training and direct technical support from the project and implementing partners. Government at provincial and district level, teachers, employers and workers organisation representatives all indicated that they were in a better position to address child labour issues as a result of the project. Other evidence for the relative success of IO2 exists. This includes the quality these stakeholders' actions and their planned replication.

The project provided significant capacity and institutional strengthening through training, technical support by project staff, and networking among different project partners. Child Labour Monitoring System (CLMS) were made operational in 135 Union Councils (UC)¹² of the model districts of Sukkur and Sahiwal. Much work remains to be done to fully institutionalise them. Less formal community-based CLMS had been established early during the project implementation to identify, track and report on project beneficiaries. Teachers, districts officials, and other stakeholders have indicated that they will continue to implement this beneficiary specific system. The project successfully networked with other entities such as the World Wildlife Fund (WWF) with which they coordinated to implement the CLMS in Sukkur District.

Project IO3 results were ultimately strong on awareness raising within institutions, which reinforced the results of IO1 and IO2. Stakeholders interviewed for the evaluation wholeheartedly emphasised awareness raising as one of the project major successes. The project engaged in some standard as well as some very interesting and innovative activities on awareness raising. These included a photography contest and the development of videos on child labour issues by media students in 7 universities. Evaluation interviewees could clearly describe child labour and the difference with child work as well as the detrimental effects of child labour on well-being and national development. The Enabling Environment Sub-study consultant did find some confusion among some interviewees but this was limited.

Under IO3, the knowledge base on child labour and its worst forms was expanded even if an originally envisaged national child labour survey could not be carried out. The project baseline could have been more useful if it had been completed at an earlier project stage. The primary reasons were lengthy discussions on methodologies and the eventual devolution of federal labour implementation responsibilities to the provinces.

The content of the studies intended to inform the project (and expand the knowledge base) were relevant but not as effective as they could have been. The baselines were delayed although the project was able to collect useful information in the field through networking with stakeholders to ensure actions were adequately informed. The district CLMS database and Rapid Assessments¹³ that were added to the project after the revision were implemented late in the project.

In terms of gender, the project included almost equal attention to boys and girls, with good impact on both. Ultimately, however, the direct actions with boys are likely to have more long-term potential

¹¹ That is, households where mothers had received micro-financing or grants.

¹² Union Councils are Government administrative units one level below Districts.

¹³ Six in Sahiwal

than those with girls. This is primarily because boys can publicly market their products and services while girls may be working primarily from home. Teacher training was successful in raising awareness of gender issues as clearly noted in evaluation interviews with teachers in different settings. Stakeholders still indicate that much more effort is needed to educate girls since, as a head teacher pointed out, “an educated girl will raise a whole family and it will have a positive effect on all of them.”

Project coordination and management was well implemented overall. The project staff was able to address most of the challenges resulting from the interplay between security issues, national disasters, and staffing. The project worked efficiently to maximise—and even exceed—planned results using the available budget of somewhat about 4.8 million Euro. The efficiency is, furthermore, confirmed in the funding allocated by the Punjab Government to replicate the actions in 4 new districts as the amounts are not dissimilar to that spent in the model districts. The generally effective and comprehensive project monitoring system was comprised of the project monitoring plan (PMP), work plans, data collection and processing, analysis and reporting. Recording of children in the DBMR was carefully done and they were only recorded as withdrawn/prevented if they have been mainstreamed for at least three months. Some improvements with respect to data entry of parents who access credit or grants were needed. Where mothers and fathers both accessed these and their names were different, it resulted in some unintended double counting.

The project has good potential for long-term sustainability in terms of impact and replication to new districts. The project successfully increased focus on developing a sustainable enabling environment at provincial and district level. Project Immediate Objectives 1 – 3 all contributed together to this result. The institutional and technical capacity of target district governments and four provincial Child Labour Units have been strengthened to effectively combat child labour. The planning and leadership capacities of government staff, employers and workers at federal, provincial and district levels have been strengthened. Provincial laws on child labour have been developed and have been entered into official systems to obtain their approval and enforcement. Awareness has been raised at all levels. Provincial and District Governments have mainstreamed child labour concerns into their activities. Child labour committees include representatives of different sectors to ensure that synergies to address child labour were created. The two model districts have developed Education Plans for future actions that include child labour elements and which are intended to provide sustained financing for their child labour actions. Financial support for these new plans was not yet allocated at the time of the field work for the evaluation.

The project has been able to contribute to the institutionalising of the Provincial Child Labour Units (PCLUs) and funding for their operations exists in all four provinces. As many stakeholders pointed out, however, there is still a need for a Federal Level Child Labour Unit to coordinate data-gathering, exchanges and learning from the experiences of other countries. Government, employers and workers organisations all still request that at least one ILO technically experienced child labour expert be available to the country continue to provide technical support to the established institutions.

District Coordination Committees (DCC) on child labour in the model districts are likely to continue even if no substantial external funding, from the provincial Government or other sources, is provided. Capacities, commitment, and ownership are currently high. Individual employers and employers’ associations indicated that they will implement their Codes of Conduct and MoUs on the elimination of child labour.

Some experience sharing with the districts has already occurred including workshops and field visits. This needs to be taken to a much higher level, however, with more field visits, by representatives of other provinces.

The project was quite successful in leveraging resources through collaboration with its Implementing Partners and other agencies. **The project has clearly been able to mobilize resources, policies, programmes, partners and activities to support the Government’s National Policy and Plan of**

Action to Combat Child Labour and the National Time Bound Programme (2008-2016) and its devolved Provincial actions on child labour.

Key Recommendations

Stakeholders especially suggested for implementing the recommendations are indicated between parentheses following each recommendation.

Project Design and Data Management

1. A continued technical presence of ILO-IPEC is needed in Pakistan to provide technical support for replication of the district models developed under the project. That is, Government, employers and workers organisations still request that at least one ILO technically experience child labour expert be available to the country continue to provide technical support to the established institutions (Government, ILO, donors,).
2. The DBMR system should attribute a single code per household even if there is more than one child who is enrolled in the project. Each child can still have his/her own code within the household. When data is collected in communities, field officers need to verify the exact household to which each person accessing credit or other services is linked and list the person using the household code (ILO and all implementing entities).

Federal Action, Provincial and District Institutions and Replication

3. Review establishment possibilities for a federal level unit on child labour in Pakistan to coordinate data-gathering, ensure that indicators are comparable, organise inter-provincial exchanges and mutual exchange of learning of experiences with other countries. This should be a tri-partite body to monitor and guide child labour activities (Government).
4. Review potential of conducting a National Child Labour Survey in Pakistan and conduct survey. Such a survey would help to provide national data for sharing with others countries, to adequately inform planning in each province, and to provide a comparable baseline for comparison with future progress (Government, ILO).
5. Replicate district integrated area-based approaches as much as possible in other areas of Pakistan. Advocacy to finance replication and sustainability of existing model districts needs to continue with special focus on advocacy by stakeholders (Government).
6. Source continuing human and financial resources to implement important actions such as data collection, data entry and analysis on the CLMS in Pakistan. While labour officers have been assigned to address child labour, there will be a continuing need for additional staffing for full effectiveness (Government).

Awareness Raising and Capacity Strengthening

7. Widely replicate project actions using various competitions such as photography and video. Where feasible, work with universities to develop future journalists' knowledge on child labour by conducting research and preparing videos is useful to create awareness. Child labour projects could replicate similar competitions with students on specific child labour issues such as on the use of Occupational Safety and Health efforts and model workshops (ILO, Government, donors, employers, organisations, workers organizations, NGOs/Civil Society Organisations).
8. Replicate sub-study on Economic Empowerment in other settings and countries to increase knowledge and understanding of the best methods to provide skills training and micro-finance/grants to reduce dependence of households on child labour (ILO, donors).

Education and Economic Empowerment

9. Improve labour market and market linkages research to ensure appropriate matching of vocational/skills training and local needs. Conduct brainstorming exercises involving a range of stakeholders to identify more and innovative types of economic activities. (Government, ILO, employers, organisations, workers organizations, NGOs/Civil Society Organisations)
10. In economic empowerment actions, provide a combination of training courses and micro-finance or grant provision (Government, ILO, donors, employers, organisations, workers organizations, NGOs/Civil Society Organisations).
11. Address gender issues in context of vocational/skills training on sewing/beauty for girls and more technical trades for boys. While engaging girls in the technical trades might be challenging in the Pakistani context, identifying some more gender neutral trades could be useful in future initiatives (Government, ILO, donors, employers, organisations, workers organizations, NGOs/Civil Society Organisations).

Occupational Safety and Health

12. Widely disseminate and replicate the project occupational safety and health approaches. This includes using a system of risk assessment in different sectors, development of appropriate OSH equipment/materials and implementation in model workshops (including in other countries) (Government, ILO, employers, organisations, workers organizations, NGOs/Civil Society Organisations).

Knowledge Base Development

13. Develop database of child labourers in districts at an early project stage to ensure that projects have appropriate information for all actions to be implemented. Integrate data into an overall referral system linking child labour, other areas of child protection, education and health (Government, ILO, NGOs).

1. Introduction

1. Pakistan has been working in collaboration with a variety of donor-supported actions to address child labour concerns in the country for about 20 years. The enormity of the challenges, however, means that much work remains to fully eliminate the worst forms of child labour (WFCL) in the country. Many lessons have been learned over the years, which were linked together to design the ‘Combating Abusive Child Labour II’ (CACL II II) project. The overall project development objective of the CACL II project is: “To contribute to the elimination of child labour, with special focus on the elimination of the abusive/worst forms of child labour in Pakistan.” The project has an increased focus on developing a sustainable enabling environment at provincial and district level. Downstream actions on withdrawing and preventing children from child labour are concretely planned and integrated to serve as replicable district models within the provinces.
2. The CACL II project has been funded by the European Commission and was implemented by the International Labour Organization (ILO) in Pakistan together with a range of national stakeholders. The project implementation period was from April 2008 and it will end on 31 December 2013.
3. In accordance with this approach, the project has three Immediate Objectives:
 1. A sustainable and holistic district model developed to reduce and gradually eliminate abusive child labour across sectors.
 2. The institutional and technical capacity of target district governments, four provincial Child labour Units and one Federal Child Labour Unit strengthened to effectively combat child labour.
 3. The knowledge base on child labour and its worst forms expanded and awareness increased to promote child labour friendly policies.
4. Implementation activities were planned with a focus on three main areas: direct assistance to child workers and poor families who involve their children in WFCL; capacity building for government labour administration, employers, workers and civil society; building a knowledge base on child labour in the country.
5. Under Immediate Objective 1 children were to be withdrawn or prevented from child labour in formal and informal sectors including auto-workshops, domestic labour, rag-picking, street children, and agriculture.¹⁴ The CACL II project, furthermore, targeted other forms of hazardous child labour as indicated on a list of 29 hazardous occupations that had been identified in 2002 through tri-partite¹⁵ consultations. The original project document targeted 6,500 children. Of this total, 5,500 were targeted for withdrawal and 1,000 were to be prevented from WFCL. These numbers were later increased as the project sought to attain additional results. After a project revision the CACL II project aimed at withdrawing 7,500 and preventing 1,500 children from WFCL.
6. The project focuses on the provinces of Punjab, Sindh, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, and Balochistan. The districts of Sahiwal in Punjab and Sukkur in Sindh were selected—with input from the key stakeholders—to serve as district models for potential replication.

¹⁴ International Labour Organisation (ILO) International Programme on Elimination of Child Labour (IPEC) – European Commission (EC) (2009). Contribution Agreement between the European Commission and International Labour Organization (ILO) International Programme on the Elimination of Child Labour (IPEC) to implement the Financing Agreement between the European Commission and the Government of Pakistan. Islamabad: ILO and EC.

¹⁵ Of Government, employers and workers organisations.

2. Purpose and scope of the final evaluation

7. The primary purposes of the expanded final evaluation are to:
 - establish the relevance of the project implementation strategy;
 - assess the extent to which the project has achieved its stated objectives at outcome and impact level;
 - identify the supporting factors and constraints that have led to any achievements or lack of achievements;
 - determine the implementation effectiveness and efficiency of the project;
 - identify the supporting factors and constraints that have led to any achievement(s) and/or lack of achievement(s);
 - identify unintended positive and negative changes at outcome and impact levels in addition to the expected results;
 - assess the relevance of the sustainability strategy, its progress and its potential for achievement; identify the processes that are to be continued by stakeholders beyond the project period;
 - identify lessons learned and potential good practice, especially regarding models of interventions that can be applied further;
 - provide recommendations to project stakeholders to support the completion, expansion or further development of initiatives that were supported by the project.
8. The evaluation includes two important sub-studies to provide specific information on achievements and challenges relating to project impact:
 - on the enabling environment at sub-national level;
 - of the project family economic empowerment intervention.
9. These studies serve to deepen the understanding of the project for the overall evaluation. They are also intended to provide insights on key crucial project elements and to triangulate with the information collected by the international and the national consultant team. Both sub-studies were carried out by Pakistani teams with strong experience in the local context and thus buttress the findings of the evaluation.

3. Methodology

10. It is important to stress that the evaluation is not intended to criticize but to learn from the past and study how efforts can be further improved in the future in Pakistan as well as inform similar actions in other countries. Specifically, this means that the evaluation determines what can be improved, should be avoided, and/or added to eliminate the worst forms of child labour more effectively.
11. The evaluation process was a joint and participative effort to identify the key conclusions in each of the evaluation areas. Despite this overall approach, the team leader of the evaluation is ultimately responsible for the evaluation process including writing of the expanded final evaluation report. The current report does include input from the sub-study reports in all relevant parts.¹⁶
12. The evaluation team attended to the guidelines provided by the ILO and was consistent with ILO- International Labour Organisation (ILO) International Programme on Elimination of Child Labour (IPEC) – European Commission IPEC Evaluation and Impact Assessment (EIA) principles. The evaluation applied a high standard of evaluation principles including adhering to confidentiality and other ethical considerations concerning all interviews with special attention to those of children. With regard to gender the evaluation applied the ILO guidelines on gender analysis in child labour as well as the ILO guidelines on gender in monitoring and evaluation.
13. To ensure a thorough evaluation the evaluation used a combination of methods for a well-rounded evaluation:
 1. Document review including of:
 - direct project related documents such as the Technical Progress Reports¹⁷, Result Oriented Monitoring Reports¹⁸, and various research reports;
 - overall context in Pakistan regarding education, child labour issues, the Pakistan National Plan of Action on the Elimination of the Worst Forms of Child.
 2. Individual interviews and focus group discussions with stakeholders from a wide range of groups including national, provincial, district and local policy makers and providers, local authorities, project partners, and community based organizations, and communities, parents and children.
 3. Individual and small group discussions with project staff in the central office and with partner NGO staff.
 4. Observation of the stakeholders and their work in different settings as well as their networking actions. This included visits to model workshops exhibiting occupational safety and health methods.
 5. The family economic empowerment included detailed interviews with mothers and other key persons using a random sample frame. The sample frame was based on stratification by training and microcredit. The sample frame was obtained from the total population of mothers benefiting from the project to ensure that it would be representative and statistically

¹⁶ Information from the sub-study reports has been directly integrated throughout the current Expanded Evaluation Report as relevant. To avoid excessive footnotes, each incidence of information integrated from the sub-studies is not referenced separately.

¹⁷ E.g., Combating Abusive Child Labour II (CACL II) (2013b). Report (a) – Pakistan - April 2013. Islamabad: ILO – IPEC, CACL II project (and others)

¹⁸ E.g., Romijn, Clemens (2012). Results Oriented Monitoring Report CACL II Project MR-125660.02. Available from the European Commission. (and others)

robust. Details on the methodology and sampling are available in the full family economic empowerment report.¹⁹

14. Stakeholder meetings level where initial findings were presented, discussed, and enriched with additional input from the participants.
15. Locations for field visits were identified in line with guidelines provided by the evaluator. With regard to downstream data gathering, this included the need to ensure that stakeholders from successful implementation sites, as well as those where the project faced more challenges are included. Local project staff, officials, employers and workers representatives, academics, media representatives, local leaders, NGO partners' staff, educators and representatives of local civil society groups were included in interviews and/or focus group discussions. (See Annexe 8 for details).
16. All data from the various sources—whether documentation, interviews, focus groups, workshops or observation—was triangulated during the analysis and in the evaluation report.²⁰ The sub-study on the enabling environment formed an important component for triangulation of the data.²¹ Information collected for the enabling environment sub-study was generally confirmed after analysis of other interviews conducted by the team leader who was accompanied by another expert national consultant. The veracity of the data collected was further clearly confirmed during the stakeholder workshop (see Annexe 3 for an overview of the prioritized points raised in discussion groups).

3.1 Methodology limitations

17. As in any evaluation process, some potential limitations occurred that could impact the collection and analysis of the data. These included availability of key individuals to be interviewed, especially those from government. Fortunately, the evaluation team was able to meet almost all key persons. In cases where they were not available, other competent persons who could answer the questions were made available.
18. For the family economic empowerment sub-study, a pre-test had indicated that it could be difficult to trace some of the mothers as families were mobile. To address this issue, the livelihoods sub-study team added some extra respondents to their research sample. Security affected mobility and ability to meet key stakeholders. The mission was, however, able to continually make adjustments and received excellent support from key government officials and the UN to facilitate passage. The project CTA and staff assisted in various ways to ensure that the mission was able to meet the key stakeholders

¹⁹ Semiotics Consultants (Pvt.) Limited (2013), Assessment of the Impact of the Family Economic Empowerment Intervention on Child Labour and School Attendance. Islamabad: Semiotics Consultants (Pvt.) Limited.

²⁰ See Annexe 12 for an overview of data collected by stakeholder type and source.

²¹ Haider, Mahe Nau (2013) Sub-Study on the Impact of the ILO/IPEC Project of Support on the Enabling Environment. Islamabad: Mahe Nau Haider Independent Consultant (report available from ILO Pakistan office)

4. Analysis of project design and relevance

19. The overall design of the project, as reflected in the project Logical Framework and narrative, was highly relevant and appropriate to the context. The design was valid and assisted the achievement of the project goals as set out in the Project Document and its Logical Framework.
20. Problems and needs were adequately analysed taking lessons learned from previous child labour projects into account. Some of these lessons included the need for:
 - an area-based approach;
 - the addressing poverty as the root cause of child labour;
 - improvement of working conditions for older children through occupational safety and health actions.
21. All major stakeholders indicated in evaluation interviews that the implementation strategy was valid and had been linked to existing and/or planned national and provincial strategies.
22. Stakeholders who confirmed the validity of the project design included the key Implementing Partners consisting of NGO, employer and workers' organisations representatives. As one partner indicated, "We are very satisfied with the design of the project. It was clear but sufficiently general to allow us to adapt practical implementation to the local areas where we worked."
23. Most of all, government officials, authorities and educators stressed the importance of *the key strategy of focusing on creating synergistic networks to attain project objectives*. Government, employers and workers' representatives who were familiar with previous child labour projects in the country saw the design as a logical progression in terms of past projects to the current design that focuses more on the enabling environment. During the previous projects, efforts were concentrated on addressing sectoral child labour issues whereas the current project design moved to an area-based approach in line with transferring responsibility to the Government.
24. The project Logical Framework included risks and assumptions several of which, ultimately, did prove to be problematic. Adjustments in the practical implementation of the project needed to be made due to security challenges and changes in devolution processes (See Section 5.1 for details). The original assumption was that the Government would continue to devolve to district level but this situation changed. Instead governance responsibility devolved even more strongly away from federal to provincial level than was expected with less devolution to district level than envisaged. This situation had profound impact on project methodologies. The project was, however, able to revise the pertinent project components to meet this changing situation.
25. Risks identified in the Logical Framework related to security and natural disasters proved to be true (See also Section 4.6 and 5.1). Security challenges and natural disasters (floods) resulted in the need to make further implementation changes. These included the implementation of a district model in Punjab instead of in Khyber Pakhtunkhwa as originally planned.
26. Some other risks and assumptions cited in the Logical Framework, furthermore, proved to be challenging but the project was able to work in different ways to address them. These included the weak institutional infrastructure which the project helped address through institution and capacity strengthening (see Section 6.2).

4.1 Project design fit with existing initiatives

27. The project design fit well with existing government initiatives on child labour. This includes existing laws and regulations, notably, the Employment of Children Act (1991). Following the

ratification of ILO Convention 182 on Worst Forms of Child Labour, the country defined a list of hazardous child labour. Pakistan ratified ILO Convention 138 on the minimum age for employment in 2006. The project is also in line with the National Policy and Plan of Action to Combat Child Labour that was adopted in 2000 and the National Plan of Action for Education for All (2001-2015). The CACL II project continued to be in line with the national strategies although, as already stated, national strategies on child labour needed adjustment due to devolution.

28. The project was, further, in support of the priorities under the Decent Work Country Programme (DWCP) that was being implemented at the time of project design.²² The DWCP included the National Time Bound Programme. The subsequently developed Decent Work Country Programme 2010-2015²³ continues to reflect child labour as a priority area with the project as the key element supporting the DWCP.

4.2 Economic, cultural and political situation

29. The project took the economic, cultural and political situation into account at the time of the design. Economic aspects were considered in terms of budget allocations to the different project components, including a high focus on supporting government to implement Action Programmes (AP).²⁴ Government entities previously had low budget allocations for child labour actions. To stimulate higher budget allocations, the design thus included substantial support to illustrate the potential benefits of the actions to Government development programmes.
30. In Khyber Pakhtunkhwa officials pointed out that the project design could have placed more emphasis on actions in their province. Officials noted that the heavy burden of international and internal migrants strongly affect the local economy and prevalence of WFCL. An official from Balochistan, likewise, pointed out that he felt the economic situation in his province, the isolation of remote areas and consequent high challenges in addressing child labour warranted more and earlier project attention. High security challenges were, however, among the key reasons that the project had less intensive focus in these provinces and that model districts were developed elsewhere.
31. The choice of districts had been made through discussions with the Project Steering Committee. The evaluator notes that the choice of developing model districts in less challenging areas under CACL II was a wise decision since it was necessary to demonstrate feasibility. If the model districts had been implemented in the more challenging environments and were not—or only partially—successful it would have been difficult to ascertain whether this was due to security, isolation, or general failure of the model. The importance of replicating the model in Khyber Pakhtunkhwa and Balochistan is, nevertheless highly evident.
32. In terms of cultural elements, the project design considered elements such as the lack of social censure of child labour and gender issues such as cultural barriers that prevent girls from pursuing education. The project design included withdrawal and prevention activities for equal numbers of boys and girls and awareness raising to change attitudes towards child labour and education. Teacher training using the ILO-IPEC Supporting Children's Rights through Education, the Arts, and the Media (SCREAM) Module was, furthermore, part of the design. The materials include focus on child labour as well as gender issues.²⁵

²² ILO Country Office for Pakistan (2008) Decent Work Country Programme. Islamabad: ILO Country Office for Pakistan.

²³ ILO Country Office for Pakistan (2010) Decent Work Country Programme 2010 – 2015. Islamabad: ILO Country Office for Pakistan.

²⁴ Action Programmes are mini-projects focusing on specific project elements that are carried out by different Implementing Partners. Action Programmes serve to bring project components close to the different target groups while also providing capacity strengthening of the Implementing Partners through the project. The Implementing Partners can be from Government, employers and workers organisations and/or Non-Governmental Organisations and other non-state actors.

²⁵ Section 6.4.1 discusses some cited impact of the gender awareness raising included in the SCREAM package.

33. The original project design did take the political related governance situation into account but the extent of subsequent changes in these aspects could not be foreseen. A constitutional amendment (18th Amendment) to devolve the functions of several ministries, including the Ministry of Labour and Manpower, to the provinces was made effective from July 1, 2011. The introduction of the 18th Amendment gives much more autonomy and greater decision making roles to the provincial governments. In line with devolution, provinces make their own legislation and formulate policies²⁶ including on issues such as child labour.
34. Some subject areas relevant to the CACL II project were retained under the new Ministry of Overseas Pakistanis & Human Resource Development (MOPHRD). These subjects include the compilation of labour statistics for national and international utilisation; coordination of labour legislation in the country; and monitoring and reporting on country labour and social security issues. The MOPHRD acts as co-convenor of the CACL II Project Steering Committee (PSC).
35. The devolution was implemented almost “overnight” according to several evaluation interviewees instead of using a gradual phased approach. This meant that the Government and other project partners needed to reorient their project associated actions within a very short time period. The project team worked with the project partners²⁷ to make adjustments in the project design to take these governance changes into account. The evaluator notes that the successful project adjustments were a result of the overall good networking established under the project. The proposed adjustments were well planned to maximise project impact under the changed governance situation. The project steering committee approved the revised Logical Framework in February 2012. The European Commission approved the fully revised project document in February, 2013.²⁸
36. Actions that were dropped under the project design included:
- cancellation of the planned National Child Labour Survey due to initial slow uptake of the survey development at federal level (partially due to differences of opinion on how to implement the survey)²⁹ and because demand for the survey later shifted away from the federal to the provincial level;
 - research and awareness raising to complement the planned National Child Labour Survey;
 - technical support for federal level inclusion of child labour in Ministry of Education policies and plans.
37. As was also pointed out in the final evaluation stakeholders’ workshop, it was unfortunate that the project had to drop the National Child Labour Survey. Participants pointed out that there was still a need for such a survey as it is useful to have a comprehensive and thorough statistical view of the overall child labour situation in Pakistan. The evaluator believes, however, that the changes in the design at provincial and district level—particularly in Punjab and Sindh—contributed to improved outcomes and potential for sustainability in these provinces. Details to support these conclusions are presented throughout Section 6.

²⁶ International Labour Organisation (ILO) International Programme on Elimination of Child Labour (IPEC) – European Commission (EC) (2013). Revised Contribution Agreement between the European Commission and International Labour Organization (ILO) International Programme on the Elimination of Child Labour (IPEC) to implement the Financing Agreement between the European Commission and the Government of Pakistan. Islamabad: ILO and EC.

²⁷ Government, Employers, Workers representatives and NGO Implementing Partners.

²⁸ International Labour Organisation (ILO) International Programme on Elimination of Child Labour (IPEC) – European Commission (EC) (2013). Revised Contribution Agreement between the European Commission and International Labour Organization (ILO) International Programme on the Elimination of Child Labour (IPEC) to implement the Financing Agreement between the European Commission and the Government of Pakistan. Islamabad: ILO and EC.

²⁹ Romijn, Clemens (2012). Results Oriented Monitoring Report CACL II Project MR-125660.02. Page 2, last paragraph. Available from the European Commission.

38. Resources allocated under the original design were re-allocated under the project revision design, including:
- increased focus on strengthening Provincial Child Labour Units (PCLU);
 - development of a monitoring mechanism on reducing the Worst Forms of Child Labour (WFCL) in the districts;
 - support for the development of provincial laws on child labour;
 - technical support to provincial Governments to address WFCL.
39. Under the revised design, the project augmented focus on capacity strengthening at district level and increased the number of children to be included in withdrawal and prevention of child labour activities. The project added more occupational safety and health (OSH) improved model workplaces to demonstrate safe apprenticeship/employment opportunities for adolescents (age 15-17 years). The revised design included additional attention to awareness raising with special focus on working with university Mass Media Departments to develop the skills of future journalists. Supplementary emphasis was further added to the development of Codes of Conduct against WFCL with employers. The evaluator notes that all of these revised approaches contributed to project successes (see Section 6).

4.3 Logic and coherence; clarity and realism of project objectives

40. The project design as described in the project document and its Logical Framework³⁰, was generally logical and coherent while the different project components complemented each other. The importance of complementarity was particularly significant given the overall goal of creating sustainable integrated networks to address child labour over the long term. The objectives were individually clear although there was some overlap between the different actions under the objectives. This overlap could potentially have led to confusion during implementation.
41. The first Immediate Objective (IO)³¹ on the development of a district model includes a wide range of actions but capacity strengthening of stakeholders falls under a separate objective.³² District model development (IO1) as a concept could actually have included IO2 on capacity strengthening instead of forming a separate immediate objective. Both IO1 on the district model and IO2 on capacity strengthening include awareness raising, for example. IO1 includes an output³³ on the sensitization of local stakeholders with an activity on: “involving district officials for employers/contractors of child labourers to highlight CL/WFCL concerns and importance of education”. Under Immediate Objective 2 an expected Output is “Institutional capacity of targeted district governments enhanced”. Development/establishment of a Community based Child Labour Monitoring (CLMS) and Referral system is part of this output. The CLMS could, however, be part of IO1 as it is integral to establishing a holistic approach to hazardous child labour elimination. Several of the IO2 outputs thus logically fall under the heading of “capacity strengthening” but they also need to form an essential part of any district model (i.e., Immediate Objective 1). It is important to note, however, that Implementing Partners did not report any confusion regarding this aspect. For replication of the district model

³⁰ ILO IPEC - Combating Abusive Child Labour II Project (2009) Programme Logical Framework - Combating Abusive Child Labour II Project. Islamabad: ILO Pakistan office.

³¹ To facilitate reading, the current report will refer to the single term “Immediate Objectives” as opposed to Specific Objectives or a combination of the two. The Project Logical Framework uses a combination of the two terms Specific and Immediate Objective.

³² ILO IPEC - Combating Abusive Child Labour II Project (2009) Programme Logical Framework - Combating Abusive Child Labour II Project. Islamabad: ILO Pakistan office.

³³ The project document uses both the term “Outputs” as well as “Results” to refer to the same logical framework elements. In the current report the single term “Output” is used.

elements under Specific Objective 2 will need to be integrated in planning implementation of the model.

42. The development of systems on child labour monitoring is, thus, integrated under IO2. This includes collection of model district child labour data across their Union Councils. Rapid assessments implemented in a total of 25 districts of Sindh and Punjab provinces and fall under IO2. Arguably, these rapid assessments could also have been included under IO3, which has a component on development of the knowledge base.
43. The evaluator is of the opinion that these issues on the project components and their related Immediate Objectives are not very detrimental as they serve to *underscore the interlinking and cross cutting nature of the elements*.
44. The linkages between the project inputs, activities, outputs and objectives were generally clear and logical. The *sequencing* of the Immediate Objectives could have been more logical to help improve clarity. IO2 on capacity strengthening could have been listed before IO1 on development of the District model. The sequencing of the objectives does not, however, appear to have had any fundamentally detrimental impact on project implementation. This is primarily because the sequencing of project actions were logically organised in a project work-plan to ensure coherent implementation. At project level, and within the Action Programmes, initial work was focused on awareness raising and capacity strengthening of project partners. This was followed by implementation of concrete activities with target groups. Further awareness raising and capacity strengthening was designed to continue throughout project implementation.
45. Geographically, the project first worked on *institution establishment* at provincial level and then moved on to district level institution building. *Direct Action Programmes* were, however, first initiated in the districts to ensure that targets would be fully met by project end. A late start in districts could have impeded obtaining results, as it is necessary to allocate sufficient implementation time. Subsequently Action Programmes at provincial level were launched.
46. District project staff indicated that they found the design of project activity sequencing practical and effective. One government official indicated that the concrete launching of the Non-Formal Education activities with project beneficiaries was well timed at an early stage to allow for effective follow-on of the other activities. The project's demonstration of actual actions helped buttress additional activities on awareness raising, networking, and development of codes of conduct with employers.
47. During the stakeholder workshop, one group did indicate that the sequencing of the activities could have been improved as education and skills efforts were well underway before economic empowerment activities were initiated. The group believed that economic empowerment should be initiated at an early stage to ensure poverty reduction and sustainable continuation of project efforts. In practice, this comment only applied to one model district because economic empowerment had been initiated earlier in Sahiwal than in Sukkur. The implementing partner for Sukkur stated that they had preferred to focus on other actions first, especially education. Based on experience in other countries, the evaluator agrees that it is advisable to start economic empowerment very earlier to give enough time for incomes to improve prior to project end.
48. The project objectives were *realistic within the context* at the time of project start-up. They were likely to be achieved *within the established time schedule* and with the allocated resources, including human resources. Constraints, resources and access to project services of the different beneficiaries were clearly identified in the project document. Gender issues, such as the lack of mobility of girls to attend vocational/skills training, were considered though no explicit gender analysis was implemented to inform the design. The design was, however, planned to bring such training closer to girls' homes.

49. The project components on capacity building, awareness raising and social mobilization, and direct actions with beneficiaries clearly and realistically complemented each other. Various stakeholders, including provincial and district government interviewees and district project staff, indicated the combined usefulness of the components.
50. Policy and legal framework project actions were adjusted following the devolution to make them more relevant to the changed situation.³⁴ More emphasis was placed on developing laws and regulations that are appropriate to the provincially devolved responsibilities. Details are discussed in Section 6.2.2. Subsequent to these changes in the project design, the policy and legal framework project actions clearly and realistically complemented the other actions.

4.4 Expectations of roles, capacity and commitment of stakeholders

51. The project document included high expectations with respect to the roles, capacities and commitment of stakeholders to implement the actions. The evaluator was initially concerned that the expectations were overly optimistic and unlikely to be achieved, particularly with regard to the intensive role of Government. As will be detailed in Section 6, however, these high expectations were mostly justified, particularly towards the end of the project implementation period. Capacities of the stakeholders were initially low but, since the project included substantial capacity strengthening activities through various mechanisms, this was not a major impediment. In some locations security and/or natural disasters affected the extent to which the stakeholders could fully play their roles. Provincial level committees were not all equally committed although this improved over time.

4.5 Consideration of existing institutional arrangements

52. As already described, the project originally considered government institutional arrangements from national to district and community level. Government institutional arrangements continued to be considered after the project revision but with more focus on provincial and district levels. Consideration of existing institutional arrangements with employers and workers organisation continued under the revised project design. The Employers Federation of Pakistan (EFP) and the Pakistan Workers Federation (PWF) are actually confederations of employers/workers federations at the national level but retain their original name. The project design included national level involvement of the EFP and PWF both prior and after revision. The project supported Action Programmes of employers and workers organisations at national level according to both the original and revised project design.
53. The project design, further, considered institutional arrangements with existing NGOs and Micro-Finance Institutions (MFI). Potential Micro-Finance Institutions were identified in the project document that could potentially provide services to the families of project beneficiaries

4.6 Key external factors and assumptions

54. Key external factors were identified and assumptions were formulated. While the assumptions were generally appropriate at the time of the project launching, they needed to be reformulated after the devolution. Additional assumptions were included and some assumptions regarding federal issues had to be dropped, as they were no longer relevant.

³⁴ As described in the revised project document and logical frameworks: 1) International Labour Organisation (ILO) International Programme on Elimination of Child Labour (IPEC) – European Commission (EC) (2012). Revised Contribution Agreement between the European Commission and International Labour Organization (ILO) International Programme on the Elimination of Child Labour (IPEC) to implement the Financing Agreement between the European Commission and the Government of Pakistan. Islamabad: ILO and EC. 2) ILO IPEC - Combating Abusive Child Labour II Project (2012) Addendum: Revised Programme Logical Framework. - Combating Abusive Child Labour II Project. Islamabad: ILO Pakistan office.

55. Project listed assumptions on security and natural disasters did ultimately affect project implementation. Security issues particularly affected the Khyber Pakhtunkhwa (KP) and Balochistan provinces although the provinces of Punjab and Sindh were affected to a lesser degree. Natural disasters, particularly the floods of 2010 that affected the project province of Sindh, interfered with implementation.
56. Other assumptions listed in the Logical Framework also affected the project, particularly the turnover of Government staff in the Child Labour Units, especially at district level. There was substantial Government staff turnover of members of the District Coordination Committees.

4.7 Strategy for sustainability

57. The overall sustainability plan at project inception was included in the project document. The overarching sustainability mechanism is rooted in stimulating the linking and networking of stakeholders for long-term initiatives on child labour. Capacity strengthening, awareness raising and knowledge base development were all planned to contribute to the sustainability of project actions. The key design strategies, further, included the development of well-functioning Provincial Child Labour Units and working models on child labour in 2 districts. Other sustainability mechanisms included working with schools to ensure mainstreaming of project children and implementation of community based monitoring systems.
58. Sustainable financing for project actions was envisaged using different mechanisms. This included working with Government to allocate financing to address child labour at national,³⁵ provincial, and district level. At district level the project planned to develop child labour sensitive education plans to be submitted to the provincial Government for funding. The project planned to establish linkages to District Zakat (Islamic Welfare Fund) Committees³⁶ and the social welfare support organisation, Bait-ul-Maal³⁷. Both entities provide support to address social issues among the poor.
59. Each of the project eleven Action Programmes included a sustainability plan to orient the action towards long-term continuation of activities under the programme. According to interviewees these plans were effective, though, as indicated in Section 6 and 8 this does vary.

4.8 Relevance

60. The project includes all four provinces—i.e. Punjab, Sindh, Balochistan, and Khyber Pakhtunkhwa—but does not include the other federally administrated units in the country.³⁸ The choice of the four provinces was relevant and is in line with the overall strategy to establish sustainable institutions using provincial governance systems. Given available funding, the project design could not develop model districts in all four provinces although this would have been useful.
61. The CACL II project needed to accommodate the originally planned level of focus on the Khyber Pakhtunkhwa province due to constraints caused by the security situation. The design had called for a project officer and intensive work in Khyber Pakhtunkhwa but, with the consent of the EC as donor and of the stakeholders, this was changed to Punjab. Naturally, security

³⁵ The strategy to promote allocation of funding at national level actions to child labour had to be adjusted in the design following the devolution of labour responsibilities to the provinces.

³⁶ Toor, Imran Ashraf & Nasar, Abu (2004). Zakat as a Social Safety Net: Exploring the Impact on Household Welfare in Pakistan. Pakistan Economic and Social Review, Volume XLII, No. 1&2 (2004), pp. 87-102.
<http://pu.edu.pk/images/journal/pesr/PDF-FILES/5%20TOOR%20Zakat%20as%20a%20Social%20Safety%20Net.pdf> (Website accessed 20 November, 2013)

³⁷ Pakistan Bait-Ul-Mal (2013), Introduction. http://www.pbm.gov.pk/Introduction_Links.html (Website accessed 23 November, 2013)

³⁸ The project thus does not include the Islamabad Capital Territory or the Federally Administered Tribal Areas.

challenges are difficult to predict and their duration is impossible to easily plan for, so the project did not have much choice but to shift focus.

62. The evaluator does believe that it would have been more relevant to include one project officer in each of the four provinces instead of in only the two provinces where model districts were tested. Unfortunately, however, despite the relevance this was not feasible under the security circumstances. As will be discussed in the remainder of the report, however, while some progress was made in Khyber and Pakhtunkhwa Balochistan, this was substantially less notable than in Punjab and Sindh. If security had allowed, including at least one project officer in Khyber Pakhtunkhwa and Balochistan each province would have been useful to ensure follow up of previous child labour projects and provide technical support.
63. The choice of the model districts was relevant. Tripartite provincial stakeholders held meetings to select the model districts, which were later formally approved by the Project Steering Committee. A range of criteria was considered including the extent to which the district was representative of the situation in the province, included both urban and rural forms of child labour and the average percentage of 'out of school' children. Another criteria was that selected districts should be reasonably accessible to facilitate the eventual sharing of experiences with other districts.
64. All stakeholders agreed that the choice of the districts was appropriate. As one member of the Provincial Child Labour Unit in Sindh explained, for example, "Sukkur was a good choice as it is the third largest city of the province and has both urban manufacturing and an important agriculture base".
65. The project was relevant in responding to the real needs of the beneficiaries and stakeholders, particularly the need to consider children as members of families and communities. In most past projects children to be withdrawn or prevented from child labour were usually considered as unique entities. As already indicated in Section 4.2, the project design includes methods to address household poverty and the need to develop sustainable networks. The specific target groups of children in—or at risk of—WFCL and their mothers were thus correctly identified. The general project strategy was to include not only children but also other stakeholders in the target groups. These included target groups from provincial and local Government, downstream membership of employers and workers organisations, individual and associations of local employers, and teachers. The project strategy addresses the different needs and roles, constraints, and access to resources of the target groups accordingly.
66. The programme indicators and means of verification as indicated in the logical framework were generally relevant although these needed to be adjusted in line with the changing realities following devolution, particularly with respect to the actions planned for the federal level. The indicators were adjusted to allow for more attention to awareness raising in line with the Midterm Evaluation recommendations. All changes were made in collaboration with the project steering committee, which includes the ILO constituents and the EC.

5. Selection of action programmes, implementing agencies and child beneficiaries

67. The project objectives and expected outputs as indicated in the Logical Framework determined the type of project Action Programmes to be implemented.³⁹ Given the overall emphasis on coordination and networking, almost more than the individual Action Programmes, it was their combination that was most essential. The most important lesson learned in this respect was the need to consider the complementarity of the Action Programmes to each other.
68. In fact, as will be analysed in Sections 5 - 6, it is the overall comprehensive approach combining/linking the three project components on capacity strengthening with knowledge base development together with withdrawal and prevention direct actions at community level that form the project core. Ultimately, the project was able to link all of the elements well although delays in developing the knowledge base (See Section 6.3 in particular) posed some challenges in this regard.
69. While *direct actions to withdraw and prevent child labour* are still very important, about 40% of the total budget allocated for Action Programmes was divided among other actions. It is often difficult to stimulate Government action in areas that are considered additional “add-ons” to their usual work. The provision of support for Action Programmes to Government offices thus served to stimulate and illustrate the feasibility and usefulness of child labour actions through networking. The evaluator thus notes that the proportions allocated to the different Action Programmes (40 – 60%) suitably reflect the importance of the different actions to contribute to a more integrated and sustainable area-based approach.
70. The project included 12 Action Programmes of which 7 focus primarily, or in large part, on capacity strengthening. Awareness raising was another major area of emphasis. This is in line with the project aim to ensure sustainable outcomes of project initiatives to eliminate WFCL. The key areas of directly withdrawing and preventing child labour were addressed through two Action Programmes although cross-cutting efforts were included in the other Action Programmes. Elements in the other Actions programme that had a direct impact on child labour prevalence included teacher training on child labour, gender and improved teaching methods.
71. One important Action Programme focused on combating hazardous child labour through risk assessment and OSH interventions in selected sectors. As will be detailed in Section 6.4.3, this component had particularly useful lessons learned that can be important for similar efforts in Pakistan and other countries.

5.1 Selection of action programme implementing entities

72. Government entities, employers’ and workers’ organisations as well as two national NGOs implemented the Action Programmes at provincial and district level. The evaluator notes that Action Programme implementation included a good representation of actors from the ILO constituents but also from civil society. The range of Action Programme Implementing Partners thus provided opportunities to the major stakeholders to gain experience and ownership.
73. The Provincial Child Labour Units in all four provinces were automatically included for implementation of Action Programmes. Selection of NGO Implementing Partners for the actions on *direct withdrawal and prevention* of child labour—and to support household with economic empowerment—was conducted in a participative and transparent manner. An advertisement had been placed in national newspapers to request interested agencies to apply if they met the following criteria:

- should have prior experience in the area where they propose to work;

³⁹ See [Annexe ?](#) for a list of the Action Programmes.

- have experience with child labour and/or child protection, education;
 - ability to provide and/or assure access to micro-finance.
74. Implementing agencies were subsequently shortlisted and provided with a two-day training on preparing proposals for Action Programmes. Following submission of their proposals, their proposals were assessed with results submitted to the Project Steering Committee, which ultimately selected the Punjab Rural Support Programme (PRSP) and National Rural Support Programme (NRSP). One of these implementing agencies, NRSP, submitted a proposal for a partnership with another agency, Sindh Rural Support Organisation (SRSO), for the micro-finance activities. The project did need to work with the two selected NGOs and the other Implementing Partners to provide capacity strengthening improve the content of their Action Programmes. The ILO headquarters provided technical and financial oversight to the final version of the Action Programmes.
75. The Project Steering Committee selected the Districts, employers and workers organisations, and the Government Centre for the Improvement of Working Conditions and Environment (CIWCE) for the remaining Action Programmes. UNICEF and Save the Children—which are other agencies with experience with child labour related issue—attended the discussions on the review.
76. On reviewing the overall project results, the evaluator is of the opinion that the Action Programmes were well chosen. The Implementing Partners, taken as a group, also complimented each other very well and were suitable to achieve the project goal of establishing networks to eliminate the WFCL. They represented a good mix of government, employers and workers representatives, NGOs and local civil society organisations. In many past projects the Action Programmes worked more or less independently from each other, despite efforts to link them together. ILO IPEC newer methodologies aim more intensively to link them together. During the entire final evaluation process of the CACL II project, stakeholders commented on the usefulness of the networking established with support of the project.

5.2 Selection criteria and identification process of beneficiary children

77. Children were selected in line with the ILO IPEC criteria of children in the WFCL or at risk of WFCL. The criteria include children who are working in various unconditional forms of child labour according to ILO Convention 182 and children under the age of 14 who should not be working according to ILO Convention 138.⁴⁰ The criteria included children listed under the hazardous child labour list determined by the tripartite constituents in Pakistan in 2002. The project criteria for the selection of children to be *prevented* from WFCL included that he or she should be a sibling of a child identified as a child labourer.
78. Mothers included in the project were simply identified by requesting the mothers of beneficiary children to join mothers' groups. The mothers' groups were intended to provide women with awareness raising on child labour, hygiene, and other general topics. Most mothers groups also engaged in some form of group savings while 1,519 mothers received credit or grants. Training on income generating skills and/or business management was provided to many such groups (see Section 6.4.5 for details).
79. The project found that identification of the children according to the criteria was not always easy, particularly in rural areas where children often work in agriculture. The main reasons were the type of agricultural work and resistance of the parents and communities. Some forms of agricultural child labour are less hazardous than others—such as vegetable gardening as

⁴⁰ International Labour Organization (2013), ILO Conventions and Recommendations on child labour. <http://www.ilo.org/ipec/facts/ILOconventionsonchildlabour/lang--en/index.htm> Website accessed 21 November, 2013)

compared to cotton farming. Agricultural work is usually seasonal so a child may only be in hazardous child labour for part of the year. But if a child is working even one hour under the conditions of WFCL they qualify according to the criteria. If a child is working in less hazardous conditions but for too many hours they also qualify. The identification of the children was thus complex as many elements needed to be considered.

80. The project used community child labour monitoring volunteers, project staff, implementing partner staff, District Education Monitoring Officers and other Government staff to identify the children. The evaluator asked all of the children met how they came to be involved with the project (see Annexe 8 for details of the children met). All of the children were able to report clearly how they were selected and by whom. Many children indicated not only that they had been working prior to the project, but that they were orphans or had other especially challenging home situations such as parents who were too ill to work. Younger children (7-9) usually reported that they had been working in some capacity but some did not make the connection with being included in the project. They just stated that they were told about the project by an uncle, another child, a community leader or a teacher and asked to go to school. Given their age, however, this is understandable. One especially clever girl of 7 years old, however, reported that she had been “washing dishes to help my mother when she went to do domestic work in other people’s homes but I am supposed to be in school.” Given that the girl had been in the project for 2 years, this meant that she had been working at the age of five. The international and national evaluator both clearly concluded that selection of project children was properly carried out.
81. Some interviewees did state that there were some difficulties at the early stages of identification. They indicated that their initial understanding of the types of child labour that were not acceptable as opposed to those that would be considered “child work” had been limited⁴¹. Several different stakeholders reported that it was very challenging to raise awareness in communities and affected households to end child labour and bring the identified children back to education. As some Government staff indicated, “They see the children as a source of income; the parents don’t want to cooperate because they are so poor”.
82. A related issue is the fear of some parents that they will be reported to the police and their families investigated. This fear is well grounded as, if the parents are aware of the laws, they may actually be reported to the police. The evaluator was, however, not able to quantitatively ascertain the extent to which parents had been aware of this risk before the project. She could not, therefore determine whether this issue played a significant role in initial hesitance to participate in the project.
83. Other challenges included the difficulties of identifying children who had gone to work with their families in the fields and those in hidden child labour such as in domestic work. Children who worked in factories posed challenges as factory and motor repair workshop owners were reluctant to share information such as working hours and conditions. An interviewee reported that his group was able to find children who had been locked into a room by the factory staff. He stated that “We saw them peeking through the window.” Only after 5-6 visits to the worksite and catching the children as they were going out of the gate was the project able to obtain the needed information. University students who conducted research and made films about child labour reported similar situation in the workplaces they visited. While this kind of problem did not occur in every case, it does show the extent to which employers will go to cover their illegal employment of children. The only positive element in this situation is that the employers were aware that what they were doing was not acceptable to the law (or to tax collectors). Despite all these challenges, the project was able to identify and include the number of children that they were expected to identify and reach the targets.

⁴¹ With child work defined as” not being detrimental to the physical, emotional and moral development of the child not interfering with their education.

5.3 Timeliness of project implementation activities and outputs

84. The project was affected by several delays that affected implementation although, due to a no-cost project extension, it was ultimately possible to attain the objectives, including additional outputs. Project preparatory activities, such as identification and mobilisation of stakeholders, staff recruitment⁴² and disbursement of allocations resulted in substantial lead-in time to core implementation processes.
85. The project monitored the both internal and external risks closely, particularly as there were important security issues which could not be ignored. A good risk coping strategy was established taking these realities into account. For example, security challenges, especially in Khyber Pakhtunkhwa and Balochistan, had a major impact on timely delivery of planned activities during the first half of the project. Security challenges continued to affect the project throughout the implementation period, including during the Midterm and Final Evaluations. The security challenges limited UN staff's full mobility, particularly to Khyber Pakhtunkhwa and Balochistan. The project had to withdraw from Khyber Pakhtunkhwa (see also Section 4.6), which required backtracking on the original scheduling and budgetary allocations and reorganising planning. In fact, Haripur a district in Khyber Pakhtunkhwa had already been selected as a model district but was replaced with Sahiwal in Punjab.
86. The project had to establish institutions, particularly the Provincial Child Labour Units, and select the districts that would serve as models for the integrated area-based approach. This was a time consuming process as the selection of districts was carried out through tri-partite consultations to ensure full ownership for the long-term. As in any situation, participation tends to slow processes down initially although it often allows projects to "catch up" at a later stage as there is often more commitment. This was also the case in the CACL II project where commitment was quite evident at almost all levels.
87. Other elements that affected timely implementation included the floods of 2010 and 2011, which affected all of Pakistan's provinces. The model district of Sukkur in Sindh was the project area that was most particularly affected by the floods resulting in a six-month implementation delay after the floods. The efficiency of the implementing partner in Sukkur was also affected as competent staff was hired by other agencies to provide emergency and rebuilding relief.
88. The displacement of people due to floods, security or other reasons for internal migration, such as the Government clearing of low-lying slum areas, affected implementation. In some cases the project had identified—and even started working with specific households—when entire communities disappeared and new beneficiaries needed to be identified.
89. Some of the Implementing Partners needed intensive technical and monitoring support to stay on track, partially due to their other commitments and/or their internal staffing challenges. The partners with staffing challenges included Government at different levels, which was affected by rapid staff turnover. Every Government official who was assigned to new areas, i.e. away from the project areas, would take their knowledge and other capacities with them. Of course, this can lead to potentially good outcomes in new areas. In many case staff was reassigned quickly and had no time to handover to his/her successor. This meant that the project and other implementing staff had to provide continuous awareness raising and capacity strengthening to newly assigned officials.
90. In the case of Implementing Partner NRSP, which worked in Sukkur District, the Action Programme was initially managed from Islamabad. The project noted that there were delays so NRSP eventually assigned a project officer to work directly in Sukkur, which contributed to

⁴² Tonchev, Plamen (2010). Results Oriented Monitoring Report CACL II Project MR-125660.02. Available from the European Commission.

improved speed of implementation. PRSP, the implementing partner for Sahiwal, had some internal management challenges, which affected timely implementation but these were successfully overcome. The Pakistan Workers Federation (PWF) indicated that they faced challenges to deliver their results within the planned timeframe due to internal restructuring but were finally able to complete their Action Programme.

91. Timely implementation was, further, affected by bureaucratic/administrative processes at all levels. In some situations and times, processing of requests and approval of reports was completed within quite a reasonable delay. At other times frustration set in as inordinately long periods passed while reviews and approvals were obtained, disbursements were made or data was processed. These problems occurred in part due to extensive audit, monitoring, and quality control systems in place within the ILO and European Commission. The existence of such systems is based on reasoning to ensure transparency and delivery quality. Some stakeholders, however, felt that delays for these reasons were excessive and did not provide added quality. Streamlining administrative and other processing in a project working with such a wide array of partners and consultants, would have benefited the project positively. The evaluator does understand the need for such controls but recommends that, at the beginning of a project, systems of both donor and executing agency are reviewed specifically to develop a joint plan that spells out the exact mechanisms that will be used. Having such a plan can be useful to share with Government as key cooperative partner so that there is clarity on the details of the required processing.
92. Financing for an Action Programme on the capacity strengthening of the Provincial Child Labour Unit for Balochistan was allocated just after the Midterm Review. The province did not, however, immediately start to implement their programme. Reasons included security issues and frequent transfer of provincial coordinators as well as challenges with monitoring from the Islamabad office. The project was able, however, to provide an extension to implement the Action Programme and, with more intensive support from project headquarters, the programme was implemented. During the stakeholder workshop, however, the Balochistan representative did argue for earlier and more intensive attention to the province.
93. The project was able to gain momentum and impact in the second half. This was partially due to the hiring of a qualified and innovative communications specialist and, after the project revision, of a competent and motivated new Senior Programme Officer. The communications officer was able to contribute to the success of the additional focus on awareness raising. In fact, initially there was no comprehensive communication strategy so the various communication activities were not as well linked and coherent as desired. This situation was rectified consequent to the midterm evaluation (See also Section 6.3.1.)
94. Certain Government actions, such as that of Punjab Chief Minister's enrolment campaign accelerated the pace of progress considerably. This campaign is aimed at enrolling all 'out of school' children aged 4 to 14 years and much activity related to this campaign was witnessed in the field. The project was able to interconnect with this campaign in Sahiwal to ensure that child labourers were included. The project helped raise awareness among project stakeholders of a Punjab Government decision on the abolishment of requirements for a formal birth certificate to enrol in school and for school uniforms. **While this requirement was dropped, most children and their families still want their children to wear a uniform. The evaluation team found a few children wearing old uniforms that had belonged to their siblings or neat clothing of non-standard school colours. One child who was not wearing a uniform stated, "I cannot afford the uniform and the teachers are OK with it." Most children did, however, wear uniforms obtained with project support. As one stated, "We like wearing uniforms because we are disciplined students."**
95. The evaluator noted that a very important element that contributed to project success was the building of personal relations of project staff with and among Implementing Partners and other

stakeholders. These relations helped to find solutions to overcome delays and other implementation challenges. The project generally responded well to these (mostly unforeseen) negative factors that arose throughout the implementation process and was able to adapt in order to overcome these obstacles without hindering the ultimate effectiveness of the project. While the inclusion of a no-cost project extension had been important to catch up and exceed the expected results, the flexibility of the donor, project, and Implementing Partners contributed to the final achievements.

6. Project achievement of targets and objectives/outcomes

96. *“I like to study so I can grow up and be a good person.” Formal education mainstreamed child*
97. *“We always wanted to study. Education improves us a lot and our personality grows with it. It gives us a lot of confidence.” Formal education mainstreamed child.*
98. The project achieved or substantially exceeded all except one of the targets and, consequently, the overall immediate objectives and outcomes as indicated in the logical framework. Evidence from the individual and focus group discussions, sub-studies, other documents, as well as observations, all support the conclusion that the project generally attained the overall and immediate objectives. With the exception of Tables 1-3 and specific discussion of these tables, the evaluation team based all conclusions discussed in Section 6 on their own evidence obtained through such quantitative and qualitative data collection. All quotes included in the text serve to illustrate the type of evidence collected from the evaluation field work.
99. Individual Action Programmes, research and policy projects, and awareness raising were effective to different degrees but all contributed to overall positive results.⁴³ As one Government official stated, “A lot of NGOs say they do things but on the ground there is nothing. With this project they did what they said they would.” While the project had delays at different stages of the implementation process, ultimately all that was planned was realised. The only area where the results fell slightly short of the target was in the area of access to micro-credit or grants. The project achieved 91% of the target on the economic empowerment.
100. The Action Programmes contributed to the coordinated establishment of a conducive enabling environment in Punjab and Sindh. Though at the senior most provincial level in Sindh there was less uptake of child labour elimination high, middle and junior level officials convincingly related the benefits that the project had provided. The Sindh officials particularly noted the development of the district model in Sukkur, as well as awareness raising and capacity strengthening of project stakeholders. In Punjab the senior most officials were supportive of the project and, more importantly, of the importance of eliminating child labour for provincial development from the beginning. In Punjab, as in Sindh, relevant high, middle and junior level provincial officials believed that they were capable of implementing child labour actions.
101. As already explained in preceding sections, research for the National Child Labour Survey could not be implemented but was replaced by other relevant research. As discussed in Section 6.3.1., awareness raising was one of the most important project successes .
102. The project provided the summarised data reported in Tables 1 – 3 based on their project monitoring system, which was reviewed by the evaluator. The evaluation team concluded that the reported data is true after consideration of the project sub-studies, the interviews/focus groups of the international and national evaluator, and physical evidence during fieldwork.⁴⁴ Project stakeholders continuously indicated the different types of support that they had received from the project during the evaluation. There were some questions regarding reporting on mothers’ access to micro-finance but this was later clarified as resulting from delayed input of data into the database and from double counting of households. Further details on this issue are included in Section 7.1. The database has subsequently been updated to reflect the correct information and to avoid double counting.

⁴³ The successes and challenges of the different Action Programmes are discussed in the remainder of Section 6 under thematic headings.

⁴⁴ Review of binders with newspaper clippings, observation of information collections, OSH model workshops, etc.

6.1 Holistic district model – Withdrawing and preventing child labour

103. The project has been quite successful in the achievement of Immediate Objective 1: a sustainable and holistic district model developed to reduce and gradually eliminate abusive child labour across sectors. Section 6.1 serves to provide quantitative and qualitative evidence in support of this assertion. The section first reviews official results data as presented in Table 1 and then analyses other supporting evidence from Section 6.1.1 to 6.1.5.
104. When reviewing discussions under Section 6.1 on the analysis of IO1, it is important to recall that the immediate objectives cannot be discussed strictly separately. In fact, the integration of the IOs is one of the project strengths. For a holistic district model to be successful it is essential that institutional and technical capacities are strengthened. As a result, some elements of IO2 on institutional and technical capacity and IO3 on the knowledge base are intertwined with the discussions on IO1. The separate sections on the results of IO2 and IO3 serve only to summarise the results of these immediate objectives.
105. Under IO1 on the Holistic District model, the project was expected to identify working children, especially those in worst forms, and provide them with alternative opportunities for education and vocational/skills training. Families and working children were to be linked with social safety nets, credit providers and health services.
106. This objective thus includes all activities towards the direct withdrawal and prevention of child labour. The current report does not detail all of the many individual indicators as the evaluation concentrates on the key elements under each objective.⁴⁵ Detailed discussion of the results and issues regarding the timely delivery of project outputs are discussed in the remainder of the current Section 6. The most important results are presented in Tables 1-3 with discussion of the results following each table. The results are reported as based on the project Logical Framework expected outputs. Details on wider and longer term outcomes are discussed following the Overview of Results tables.

Table 1: Overview of key results – Immediate Objective 1

<i>Immediate Objective 1: A sustainable and holistic district model developed to reduce and gradually eliminate abusive/worst forms of child labour across sectors.</i>				
No.	Types of Results	Target	Result	Remarks
1.	No. of employers who offered non-hazardous jobs to older children through workplace improvement	20	30	Model workplaces in Sukkur and Sahiwal
2.	No. of children in worst forms of labour (WFCL) and children at risk received basic health services	9,000	12,997	6,255 Boys; 6,742 Girls
3.	No. of families (with WFCL and children at risk) who are no longer relying on the children's income	1,600	1,426 ⁴⁶	1,288 – loans (14.2 million) 140 – grants (1.7 million) (91% of target)
4.	No. of children (less than 14 years old) in WFCL or at risk of entering into WFCL who completed NFE	4,000	6,521 (3,104 B; 3,417 G)	4,375 – WFCL 2,146 – young siblings
5.	No. of children (less than 14 years old) in WFCL or at risk who were mainstreamed into formal education system	4,000	4,850* (2,259 B; 2,591 G)	2,980 – WFCL 1,870 – young siblings
6.	No. of children (14-17 years old) in WFCL who completed 6-month adult literacy education	5,000	6,476	3,151 Boys; 3,325 Girls
7.	No. of children (14-17 year old) in WFCL who completed vocational training in non-hazardous trades	5,000	5,228 (2,562 B; 2,666 G)	Beautician, Motor mechanic, Stitching & Tailoring, Plumbing Motor

⁴⁵ As per the Terms of Reference for the final evaluation requirements the evaluator includes: “ A table presenting the key results (i.e. figures and qualitative results) achieved per objective (expected and unexpected)” See Annex 13 for the complete Terms of Reference.

⁴⁶ Data has been updated in line with most recent information provided through the authors of the Economic Empowerment Sub-study.

<i>Immediate Objective 1: A sustainable and holistic district model developed to reduce and gradually eliminate abusive/worst forms of child labour across sectors.</i>				
8.	No. of children (14-17 years old) in WFCL who received starter kits to commence self-employment after vocational training	5,000	5,228 (2,562 B; 2,666 G)	
9.	No. of children in WFCL who were withdrawn from hazardous occupations through removal or protection at workplace	7,500	8,354 (4,038 B; 4,316 G)	2,980 – Mainstreamed to school 5,228 – Changed employment 146 – Protected at workplace
10.	No. of young siblings of WFCL children who were prevented from entering into hazardous occupations through mainstreaming them to formal education system	1,500	2,146 (1,060 B; 1,086 G)	Additionally, a part of 1,200 brick kiln children were young siblings.

*...The figure does not include the additional 1,200 children of brick kiln workers who were enrolled in Govt. schools.

107. For the sake of clarity, it is important to note that a total 10,500 children were withdrawn (8,354) or prevented (2,146) from child labour with support from the project (See Result number 10 and 11 below). This figure substantially exceeds even the higher target set by the project after the project revision. The project attained the goal of withdrawing or preventing approximately equal number of boys (5098) and girls (5402) from child labour.
108. Children below the age of 14 were withdrawn or prevented from child labour through enrolment in Non-Formal Education with the majority subsequently mainstreaming into formal education. Most of the children in the age category 15-17 received six month literacy training and 81% received vocational/skills training. Some of the older children (146) benefitted from working under improved conditions and were thus withdrawn from WFCL.
109. When reviewing Table 1, please note that some of the figures include the same children because they benefitted from more than one service. This was intentional, as children needed more than one service for holistic and effective support. For example, for Result number 6 on literacy education and children who completed vocational training, it was mostly the same children who received both.
110. Stakeholders at all levels—from local Government to teachers, children and parents—indicated that the project achieved success with regard to provision of services to children and their families to enable them to withdraw or prevent WFCL. Interviewees from community level agencies and organizations indicated that their capacities to plan, initiate, implement and evaluate child labour actions were strengthened. The entire target population has been reached although all stakeholders, including children and parents, indicate that there are many more children who need assistance so they can stop child labour. The length and quality of the services provided were appropriate overall although, particularly for vocational/skills training for children and mothers, such training needs to be longer for full effectiveness.
111. Results in terms of mainstreaming of children out of child labour and into education were generally positive. Inputs and services provided were sufficient overall to keep children regularly attending school and out of work. Evaluation interviews, focus groups, and observations led to several important evaluation conclusions regarding withdrawal/prevention and education of beneficiary children. The mainstreaming of children after NFE (transitional education) into formal education appeared to mostly be successful with most children likely to remain in school after the project. Children who had received literacy and vocational training likewise were often found to be out of child labour. Some children were working in improved conditions. Health services had been provided which interviewees reported benefitted the children and their families. Importantly, project actions such as support for economic empowerment of mothers and provision of starter kits for children who had completed vocational/skills training were well appreciated and stated to be mostly useful.

112. Despite these overall positive results, however, there is still room for improvement as some children appeared to still be working. The sub-study team on economic empowerment, the enabling environment sub-study consultant, and the team of international team leader with the national consultant all found instances of continued child labour. The sub-study team on economic empowerment included a sample of 422 mothers of which 13% still had children in child labour. The evaluation team leader and accompanying national consultant found, for example, that a group of girls was not available to meet because they were working in the cotton fields. In some instances such work appeared to be seasonal and for shorter hours. The extent to which it occurred in sufficiently improved conditions could not be ascertained due to evaluation time limitations. Although these findings may appear disappointing, the evaluator noted comparatively good results as compared to other countries. Even in countries where withdrawal during the project period was successful, in most cases, during final evaluations at least half of children report that they expected to drop out of school subsequent to project end.⁴⁷ The most important reason given in such countries was that the poverty had not, or only marginally, been addressed.

6.1.1 Non-formal education and mainstreaming into formal education

113. The project was able to cover the equivalent of one year of education through the 6-month non-formal transition education programme. The programme was designed to ensure that children, no matter their previous education or lack of it, would be able to enter formal education on completion of the programme. Non-formal education centres were established in the model districts and teachers hired to implement the programme.

114. The evaluation found that the vast majority of the children were successfully mainstreamed in formal schools. The Enabling Environment Sub-study consultant visited some schools while the international and accompanying national consultant visited other schools. The conclusion of these visits was that the children met were likely to stay in school. In several cases, children had already been mainstreamed for one year or more and insisted that they would stay in school. The mere idea of having to go back to work was impossible for them to reconcile with their new, or renewed, life as school-going children. A typical comment was, “Our parents have told us we will not have to work, we can stay in school. They will go to the fields and work.” A different child stated, “We are clever now and will continue to study.” Yet another child commented that, “Our parents have now even given us notebooks and pens on their own.” Yet another stated, “We will continue studying as long as there is a school building here. According to my parents I will continue my education.” Parents interviewed for the evaluation volunteered similar points such as, “Our children are not working and the income has gone down but we are happy that our children are getting an education.”

115. The children interviewed for the evaluation were often able to explain their rights to education and reasons that they should not be in child labour although not all of them were able to do so. Comments they made included, “We have a right to education, to play, not to work, to a house...”. Also, “We should not work because it can make us sick. When we were going to the farms we used to get fevers, now we are in school, we feel comfortable and are enjoying school.”

116. Some stakeholders did insist that there should have been some type of binding agreement with parents at the beginning of the project to ensure continued enrolment in the programme and regular attendance of their child.

117. Some NFE teachers and representatives of a School Management Committee indicated that, for some mainstreamed girls, it was uncertain whether they would be allowed to continue education

⁴⁷ During evaluations the evaluator is always careful to avoid leading questions and makes it clear that any answers on any issue will not lead to further project support.

after primary into middle school. This problem is particularly prevalent in rural areas where parents are hesitant to let their girls walk far to school. The male members of the School Management Committee insisted that they would continue to work to promote education for girls.

118. The NFEs in Sahiwal could be established in formal schools but, to promote ease of access, the classes were initially conducted in the communities. For reasons of sustainability the NFE classes in both districts later largely shifted to Government schools where it is easier for the Government to monitor them. After the end of the project the materials and equipment are provided to the school, which will contribute to sustainability.
119. NFE teachers were provided with training and a teachers' resource kit containing information on child labour and on NFE teaching methods.⁴⁸ Teachers were trained on child labour and how to provide activity-based education. An NFE teacher thus stated, "The most important thing that I have learned is about child labour. How to identify child labour and how to provide a good atmosphere in the school so they do not to go back to work on their farms."
120. To improve education quality and attract children to education, the project provided a wider scale teacher training programme in schools. A core group of trainers were trained for 3 days on child labour and related issues who in turn trained other government primary schools male and female teachers. A total of over 4,000 teachers were eventually trained in the two model districts through this programme. The materials used were adapted from the ILO IPEC SCREAM modules and were highly appreciated. Teachers indicated that, as a result of the training, they are better placed to identify, track and ensure that more children come to school. Teachers interviewed by the Enabling Environment Sub-Study consultant, as well as separately by the international and national consultants, appeared to be committed to this cause. The teachers mentioned specific benefits including awareness regarding child labour and related conventions, differences between child work and child labour, gender discrimination and sexually transmitted infections. Teachers reported instances where they sensitized parents and enrolled children; are more observant of instances of child labour at local level; and follow-up cases of regular absenteeism and drop-outs.
121. The NFE teachers who were interviewed for the evaluation were quite motivated. Two were even continuing to teach NFE on a volunteer basis. As one teacher said, "I saw those children working in the fields before the project and I felt bad, I wanted to do something for them but did not know what. Then due to this intervention I know. My heart is happy to see these children who are studying in these schools. I want to continue to contribute to this village." These NFE teachers did indicate that they hoped that they would eventually receive some financial support so they can continue over the long term. This is understandable as the teachers often have other work and home responsibilities and are not wealthy themselves. One NFE teacher found a solution to this situation by registering her NFE centre officially as a private school with the Government and continues to educate the children for a small fee.
122. In both Sahiwal and Sukkur district, schools visited during the evaluation indicated that the number of children enrolled had increased substantially. According to the school head teachers, the project contributed to this even beyond the actually enrolled project beneficiaries. In one case they stated that there had been only 65 children in the school but, after the project started implementation, there were 185. In another case, enrolment was said to have doubled. It is true, however, that in the later stages of the project there were additional Government efforts to increase enrolment so it is difficult to state exactly how much was due to either the Government, the project or the combination of the two.

⁴⁸ 2000 teacher kits in each model district.

123. In Sukkur the evaluation team met a School Management Committee, which was chaired by a woman. Unfortunately, the team had so many different project actions to review that no other specific meeting with a School Management Committee could be conducted. The chairperson indicated that she had immediately agreed to participate in the project when it had arrived and was subsequently elected chairperson. All of the mothers who came to meet the team were members of the School Management Committee and the mothers group at the same time. There was also a group of elder male village leaders. The chairperson indicated that, “You can see a real difference between before and after the intervention. Before we could not sit here with males present. Now we can. Our women’s role is vital and it is a credit to us females that the children came out of this (child labour).” Interestingly, the male leaders responded to this by insisting that their role was important saying, “we men also helped, we need two hands to clap so the women did not do this alone.”
124. In one school the Head Teacher indicated that, due to the project, it was much easier to work with the parents and, “it avoids a lot of headaches for us. The children come to school and they come on time.” He did add that there was still another 20% of school-aged children who were not coming to school so there was still room for improvement. This included the need to add school-rooms and teachers to accommodate the growing number of children. In other locations, likewise, the same problem was raised. In one example, an NFE teacher related that, “only 66 out of the 184 NFE children could be accommodated in the school. So I just continued to teach them myself for now.” The mothers of the concerned children confirmed this, one of whom stated “I went to the headmaster and he said he could give the space but that we need to provide the teachers.”
125. Despite the training provided to teachers, there were still instances of discrimination against former child labourers who have been mainstreamed back into education although this does not appear to be highly prevalent. A few parents complained that teachers ignored such children saying, for example, “They do not pay attention to our children, and they discriminate a lot. At first they did not let her appear in an exam. It is not only my child, others from this program as well.” The Enabling Environment Sub-study consultant noted an instance where a teacher frightened a young child in front of her. In one school there was a comment from a Master Trainer that, “We heard about problems of discrimination against NFE children. The NFE teachers kept their children separate all the time and this made it more difficult to integrate the children properly in regular classes. I even went back to the school and tried to talk to discriminating teachers.” A few instances of jealousy of other children of the school supplies and attention that the former child labourers had received were identified.
126. Despite these few identified instances, it was clearly not a common problem as most parents, children and teachers were very positive about the efforts undertaken to educate former child labourers. The Implementing Partners did take some steps to help to integrate the former NFE children by, for example, asking NFE teachers to come with the children to help them adjust to the school.⁴⁹ It is evident, however, that there will be a continued need to raise awareness, monitor and ensure that children of all backgrounds are accepted and treated fairly in schools.
127. A few other challenges were identified such as the lack of hygienic toilet facilities in the schools. As one child stated, “What I don’t like is that the bathroom is very dirty, in the NFE it was clean. We never go to the bathroom here it is too dirty so we don’t go. We come from home and go to the bathroom there and try not to go when we come here.” Other issues, such as lack of drinking water at school, led some children to say that they like the NFE centre better. The teaching methods at the NFE centres were well appreciated with children in both model districts mentioning points like, “I like the centre better because we had more time and talk and laugh. The teacher used to play games with us and we learned a lot.”

⁴⁹ This was done in at least 3 schools.

128. The project had to work with the education department to ensure that teachers actually come to school to teach instead of absenting themselves on a regular basis, or even being absent entirely. Other project mainstreaming challenges included the timing of the school year as the Education Department in Sukkur, for instance, would first not allow the children to enrol but, with the help of the District Coordination Committee it was possible to find solutions to admit the children. Conditions in Government schools are not ideal in most cases although children still very clearly want to stay in school.
129. In both districts, local business associations and employers were involved in helping to return children to school and out of child labour. Project staff and the Implementing Partners had to undertake major efforts to achieve this result with special input from District Government officials. As **the District Coordination Officer** (DCO) in Sahiwal related, “Eventually there was a kind of competition between the business associations to enrol more children.” The brick, agriculture, motor works and other employers provided various forms of support such as uniforms or fabric for uniforms. It should be added that, in one case, a brick kiln association indicated that they had already supported the education of some of their workers’ children prior to the project. A newly arrived Government official informed the evaluators that he was “astonished” at the noticeable enthusiasm that had been initiated at a function in the brick kilns where children received their school supplies. He reported that, “I have worked in many different districts. When I joined the visit I saw the DCO was there, the head teachers were there, the owners were there. At first I could not understand what they were all doing there. In total 90 children were admitted to school that day and I attended 5 more similar functions later.”
130. Improving quality of teaching and the school environment will still require much effort to benefit all children. It is partially for this reason that the project had supported the development of an Education Plan for future actions in both model districts (See Sections 4.7 and 6.2.1).

6.1.2 *Literacy and vocational training*

131. *“Before this project I had to do brick works. My health was affected, I just had time to wash my mouth and go to work. In the evening I used to just go home and sleep. If this project can be done wherever there is child labour, then those children can also be helped like me.”* Adolescent boy.
132. *“We really want more skilled workers.”* Auto workshop owner.
133. The project implemented concentrated literacy and vocational or skills training for older children ages 14-17. According to interviewees, which included children and teachers, literacy training was started for about 3-4 months before the vocational/skills training was initiated. In most cases vocational/skills training lasted for 2-6 months and was mostly conducted for a few hours daily while literacy training continued. Some child labourers did not need the literacy training as they had completed 5 years of basic education and were directly streamlined into vocational/skills training. Types of training provided included sewing, embroidery, beauty/hairdressing/barbering, motor bike or mobile phone repair, and electric motor winding⁵⁰. Children were trained in schools and in a range of village level spaces that were made available. The project assisted a total 6 schools in Sahiwal to establish or upgrade laboratories or so-called “labs” intended for vocational/skills training.
134. Literacy education was based on Government materials and included basic numeracy. General knowledge and some life skills information were included in the training. Girls enthusiastically reported that they appreciated having learned about the contents of their rights according to marriage contracts. Children who attended the training reported being able to read and write adequately and do simple calculations. There was a doubt expressed by one Government

⁵⁰ Repairing motors such as irrigation pumps by improving their main functioning mechanisms.

stakeholder about the level acquired by a few of the students who could, according to him, not even write their name.⁵¹ Due to time constraints, however, the evaluators could not test the children, particularly as they needed to be interviewed about their vocational/skills training. At the end of the training period the children had, however, been tested and passed completion exams. After 6 months of literacy training it would, indeed be very unusual for a child to not be able to at least write their name unless their attendance was irregular or if they have a learning disability. It was, nevertheless, apparent that children felt that their abilities were not yet sufficient to meet their aspirations and they had wanted longer literacy training.

135. All parents, children, and community members interviewed expressed a strong appreciation for the income generating skills the children had gained, even where incomes had not yet substantially improved as a result of the acquired training. It should be noted that, with the exception of the mothers' economic empowerment sub-study, the evaluation is mostly qualitative in nature and exact numbers cannot be provided. The Economic Empowerment sub-study did find that 57% of mothers in Sukkur and Sahiwal reported that children aged 15-17 who obtained literacy /vocational training and/or toolkits were able to find employment or start their own work. A full post-project impact study may be useful to learn more lessons about the different elements implemented in the literacy/vocational/skills training.
136. Children who successfully completed the vocational/skills training were provided with equipment and/or tools to start their own economic activity or to help them find employment. Equipment provided included items such as sewing machines, embroidery kits, and toolboxes with appropriate content to repair motorbikes or mobile phones. Youth applying for jobs would, theoretically, have more chances of being hired if they could bring such equipment and tools with them to their new job.
137. The project tried to match the types of training provided to local labour market needs through informal assessments in communities and at Union Council level.⁵² No formal study was conducted, however. While children did have a choice of trades, children interviewed for the evaluation stated that the range of possibilities they could choose from was too limited. In some cases children said they had actually wanted different training than they received but that their choice was not available in their locality.
138. The selection of the types of training that could be provided was limited by several factors. These included lack of proficient trainers across a wider range of subject areas, particularly in villages where it was difficult for girls to go far to attend training. To ensure that girls were able to access training the project had taken the wise decision to provide "door-step" training in or very close to homes in some locations. This solution was found because it was difficult to reach the planned 50% target for girls in vocational/skills training. The door-step method was successful since the project was able to exceed the target of 1,200 girls by 400. Girls were happy with this approach and stated that they were now able to "to work in the shade of our houses while before we were working in agriculture." This did have the unfortunate side effect, however, of limiting the choice of subjects that could be offered because there were even fewer trainers able and willing to provide such training.
139. The evaluation recommends that in future projects a wider and more innovative approach to skills development is needed. Naturally, not all of the potential innovative types of skills that could be developed are appropriate in all locations and will depend on local needs, markets, available training and materials. No single type of activity will provide solutions and cost-benefit calculations will need to be made to determine the usefulness of a more varied approach to vocational/skills training.

⁵¹ This person expressed the same concern to the Enabling Environment Consultant as well as to the International-National Consultant team.

⁵² As one interviewee stated, "we talked to different people and asked them what they thought, we also gave community members a list of possible trades and asked them their opinion."

140. Given the continuing high importance of agriculture in Pakistan, however, attention could be directed to include establishing more linkages to other agencies working in subject areas such as:
- food processing, food preservation;
 - horticultural gardening, safe honey production, fruit tree growing;
 - improved agriculture/livestock production using occupationally safe and healthy methods⁵³;
 - building and sale of biomass based food dryers, energy efficient cooking stoves and other appropriate technology.
141. Other potential skills that could be considered include subjects such as:
- mechanical processes and metal cutting, designing mechanics, auto part repair⁵⁴;
 - making and/or adding safety mechanisms to equipment in motor shops, on farms, in brick making, and in other local situations to make them OSH compliant. (Based on methods developed through agencies such as the Centre for the Improvement of Working Conditions and Environment (CIWCE);
 - machine embroidery;
 - market skills (buying and selling locally needed products);
 - market skills and linkages for sale of products such as solar energy based portable lights, energy efficient cooking stoves, etc.;
 - secretarial skills including computer use;
 - become junior trainers on occupational safety and health in the workplace⁵⁵.
142. The evaluation found that there was a high variability in terms of the usefulness of the various types of training in different settings. The reasons for the disparities in success after training are mostly due to the availability of appropriate local employment in the acquired skills and access to markets for the sale of products.⁵⁶ The project did organise 4 successful exhibitions of products made by project children but this was not sufficient to provide long-term markets or benefit all trainees.
143. The head teacher/principal of a participating school with a lab observed that the training given to girls was a success and there is a great demand for more training. Schools have provided in-kind support and remain interested in continuing to facilitate such training courses in school labs although funding will be needed.
144. In some locations and for some types of work, children reported earning a decent income that is at least equivalent but often surpassed the money they could earn in child labour. Some children were even found to be training others, such as on motorbike repair. In others cases success was reported as less notable. In such situations, especially in the case of girls, they stated that they could at least save their family some money as they could sew their family's clothes or cut their hair. These results are, however, not necessarily sufficient to keep such trained girls out of WFCL. Indeed, some of the girls were working in the cotton fields, while others said that they merely stayed home and helped around the house.

⁵³ One training institute indicated that they usually only provide agricultural training to young people 20-30 years old.

⁵⁴ One of the employers' organisations indicated that there was a labour market need in their industry for such trained youth.

⁵⁵ To be paid by employers, NGOs, through Government initiatives.

⁵⁶ According to the sub-studies as well as the field work of the international and national consultant.

145. The results of sewing training were particularly variable with children in some locations stating that they were able to each “sew at least 1-2 garments” per day. In such locations girls tended to be spread across different villages. In other locations, however, girls and community leaders reported that there were already many women who knew how to sew so it was not a particularly good income generating activity. This challenge was by confirmed other evaluation interviewees including some Government officials, implementing partners and some project staff. There was still a strong interest in such locations for learning how to sew, however. Girls and their mothers felt it was a good standard skill for all girls to have. The sewing machines the girls had received were seen as useful for girls to take with them in their dowries upon marriage. An official related that, “One girl wanted to learn cooking so she can cook for her husband. She is not thinking of this as a potential money source such as catering.” At least in some cases, therefore, it is necessary to ensure that interests and acquired skills are more closely linked to economic benefits.
146. Many children stated that they needed longer training to become fully competent in the vocational/skills training that they had received. All children did take exams and received certificates of completion. Many need further training as apprentices and, in particular for boys who did find employment, they perform the job of helpers in small businesses/industrial units. As one boy who was interviewed stated, “There were 24 boys in my motorbike repair group. Ten are working as ‘expert’ on their own but some of the others are not able to continue this because they need more money to start. Others are continuing to learn as apprentices.” One trainer indicated that, “Most of my former students have found work.” While a beauty shop trainee indicated that all her co-trainees were either working or providing some beauty services from home.
147. Despite the usefulness of the toolkits, children, parents and teachers pointed out the necessity for more financing for materials and other needs to enable children to actually launch independent economic activities. Although the Implementing Partners and trainers did try to assist children to find employment this was not comprehensive for all children due to the limited job possibilities. There is limited or no provision for continued post-training support and counselling due to lack of on-going resources.
148. An unexpected benefit was that, particularly for boys, it helped to overcome animosity between children from different communities that are commonly in conflict with each other. The children had to attend training together and, as a result of getting to know each other, they realised that they improved their relations. As one teacher related, “they went home and talked to their families and asked them to soften their behaviour.” Teachers indicated that girls were very happy to attend training in centres as they could socialize and make friends while also gaining confidence. Of course, if girls are confined to their homes to engage in their new skills they will not be able to socialise further.

6.1.3 OSH alleviating working conditions in the target districts

149. The project engaged in very interesting work on Occupational Safety and Health (OSH) in an effort to improve working conditions for older children. Workplaces where conditions are adequate, including acceptable working hours, can serve as good choices for training and youth employment. The principal project partner for the OSH activities was the Centre for the Improvement of Working Conditions & Environment (CIWCE) working under the Directorate General of Labour Welfare Punjab, which worked with the Employers Federation of Pakistan (EFP) on the action. CIWCE also provided support to Sukkur District in Sindh. District Government officials collaborated with CIWCE and EFP to raise awareness.

150. Under the OSH component, the project established safe work model workshops, such as for car repair and car body-work, and safety mechanisms for agriculture machines.⁵⁷ Materials and awareness raising on OSH were disseminated. As one district official in Sahiwal remarked, “We had a series of meetings with the mothers to indicate the hazards and how to avoid them. Previously the children used to put the pesticide with their hands but this has improved with the use of gloves.” CIWCE reported promotion of simple measures such as bringing sugar and salt as well as lemon flavoured water to drink in the fields during hot weather.
151. The work of CIWCE is clearly well organised and implemented by competent individuals who study and know how to implement OSH in very challenging situations. CIWCE has, for example, developed safety mechanisms for a fodder cutting machine, which they state, has been very well accepted in project areas. CIWCE is, however, affected by limited resources, including human resources to take their activities to much higher levels and effectively disseminate.
152. The evaluation team visited different workshops and noted how the model workshops differed from those of their neighbours. The workshop owners provided a part of the funding for the transformation of their businesses. The model workshops were well organised and attention to improved safety and health was well done. There were still some aspects that could be studied further to ensure full compliance. It is always difficult for workers who are used to working in a particular way to switch to new methods and use protective equipment and materials. Children and employers noted that gloves decreased nimbleness of hand-work, masks and protective clothes could be very hot in the summer season, etc. Most of the model workplaces the evaluation team visited were still relatively new so it was difficult to assess the extent to which OSH was being fully implemented. The evaluator was only able to visit one older model workshop and saw children working in apparently safe conditions.
153. The entire concept of the model workshops is very interesting and clearly sparked the interest of employers as well as children met during the evaluation. The evaluator believes this type of effort is worth scaling up and replicating in other settings. Not all countries will have experienced OSH experts who can establish locally suitable workshops, however. There are still some issues in the Pakistan model that need attention. Aside from improving protective gear for the climatic conditions, this would include early implementation of model workshops in a variety of trades. It would mean increasing dissemination by organising large-scale visits to the model workshops or other mechanisms to share the experiences. It will, further, be necessary to do a cost-benefit analysis for employers as part of the model workshop development. Businesses willing to replicate will unlikely have access to donor funding to assist them so it is important to show businesses the clear monetary investment and eventual advantages of implementing such changes.

6.1.4 Health screening

154. The project included annual health-screening for all beneficiaries with follow up and referral for children who needed additional attention. As one interviewee noted, “The project has the excellent element of health screening, partially paid for by the Government. At least ten health⁵⁸ camps (for check-ups) were conducted in project communities, which included awareness raising on issues such as hygiene. Mothers and literacy/vocational/skills training beneficiaries indicated that they had benefited from the training and the health check-ups. The check-ups are important as they can serve to alert doctors to child labour related injuries such as from equipment and from chemicals used in different types of work. Ideally, any such information should be integrated in an overall referral system linking child labour, other areas of child protection, education and health.

⁵⁷ The concept of model workshops was already implemented in at least one previous ILO IPEC project in Pakistan.

⁵⁸ There might have been more but exact data was not available as some camps were initiated directly by the District Director of Health.

155. The Punjab Provincial Government has already decided to replicate the district model developed with project support in 4 additional districts and funding has been allocated. The Provincial Government ultimately aims to cover the whole province using the same methods. This includes replication of the health-screening component, which they deemed a very important project component.

6.1.5 Project impact on family economic empowerment

156. *“Before the project we had no idea about savings. We are now holding monthly meetings and ask members to bring their savings. We use it to solve our medical problems and things like clothes for the children to go to school and be neat and clean.”* Mothers group member.

157. *“With the training we are getting more opportunities to earn some more, this has helped us to keep the children in school.”* Mothers’ Group Member.

158. Given that poverty is probably the leading cause of child labour in almost every country, the project focused on several approaches to ensure that families of project beneficiaries could become more economically empowered. The evaluation included a special sub-study on the effectiveness of the project component on economic empowerment for mothers of child beneficiaries.⁵⁹ Older children also benefitted from some support as described in Section 6.4.2 in the form of toolkits, which could contribute to household income increases.⁶⁰ The conclusions of the Sub-Study were confirmed on triangulation with other data collected by the Enabling Sub-study consultant and the team of the International and National Consultant.

159. To help address poverty, mothers of child beneficiaries were provided with Business Management Skills Training (BMST), Livestock Management Skills Training (LMST), or Sewing and Stitching Training (SST) along with micro-credit or grants.⁶¹ Some families were linked to the Zakat and Bait-Ul-Mal grant schemes for scholarships.

160. Some women attended more than one type of training. (Please note that the evaluator is still waiting for some final statistics on the study and numbers of women who benefitted from these actions. The information will be included in the next draft of the current report) Effects of these economic empowerment interventions were assessed in terms of additional income earned and the impact on child labour and education status of children in the households.

161. The sub-study on Economic Empowerment used a hybrid data collection strategy to uncover quantitative and qualitative insights and findings. This involved primary research techniques including in-depth interviews, focus group discussions, field observations as well as secondary research and dataset analysis – including of the DBMR database. The DBMR is the basic data collection system used to track project beneficiaries. Collectively, the instruments and feedback provided a comprehensive insight into changes in the target group’s livelihoods.

⁵⁹ Please see full Sub-study Report for Details: Semiotics Consultants (Pvt.) Limited (2013), Assessment of the Impact of the Family Economic Empowerment Intervention on Child Labour and School Attendance. Islamabad: Semiotics Consultants (Pvt.) Limited.

⁶⁰ As noted, an impact study on the economic impact of actions with children is still needed.

⁶¹ Please see Section 5.1 on selection of beneficiaries and their mothers.

Table 4: Economic empowerment data sample for interviews

	Sample		
	Sahiwal	Sukkur	Total
One Training Attended Only	152	150	302
With Loan/Grant	31	30	61
Without Loan/Grant	121	120	241
Multiple Trainings attended	-	120	120
With Loan/Grant	-	30	30
Without Loan/Grant	-	90	90
Total Unique Mothers Surveyed = 422			

162. Illiteracy was prevalent amongst the mothers surveyed: 86% overall were unable to read or write, and did not attend or complete primary school. Half the mothers cited that training lasted for 2-3 days while one-third cited longer duration for their sessions lasting 6-7 days
163. Almost all (97%) mothers in Sahiwal felt that their training method was very effective in helping them develop skills. In Sukkur, 51% of mothers felt the same way, while 42% felt that the training was “somewhat” effective. Overall, BMST was viewed as having a slightly more effective training method in comparison to LMST, which itself was deemed more effective relative to SST.
164. In Sahiwal, approximately 79% of the mothers started their own work and 3% worked for someone else subsequent to their training; 18% of the women did not work after training. In Sukkur, 36% of the mothers started their own work, while 18% were employed elsewhere; 47% did not work after the completion of their training. Approximately 65% mothers in Sahiwal felt that the training helped them generate income to a large extent; in Sukkur, this proportion was lower, between 9-10% based on the number of trainings. Training had 33% positive increase on income levels in Sahiwal, equal to Rs. 1,725; in Sukkur, this impact was an 11% increase, translating to Rs. 975. Of those mothers who undertook multiple trainings, 51% felt that the trainings helped increase their income to some extent, while this proportion was lower (34%) for those who undertook only one type of training.
165. Women who had accessed micro-credit indicated that the main reason was to start a business - 54 out of 90 mothers (or 63%) stated this as their main objective. This was followed to a lesser extent by the need to purchase additional livestock or add capital to existing business. 54% of the mothers stated that the loan helped to a large extent and an additional 43% said it helped to some extent. Similar responses were obtained from mothers located in both districts.
166. In both districts, around 80% of the mothers stated that the loan had been fully repaid; approximately 19-20% of mothers stated that repayment of the loan is currently in progress. Thirty-six (36) out of 90 mothers stated that this added a lot of pressure on them; an additional 40 mothers stated that this added some pressure on them. Only 14 mothers reported that the repayment of the loan did not add financial pressure on them.
167. The 422 sampled mothers had a total of 1,597 children (787 sons and 808 daughters) amongst them. 59% of the children aged 5-14 were attending school in Sukkur; this proportion was higher in Sahiwal (76%). Further, 27% of children had never attended school or had dropped out from school in Sukkur, and this was true amongst 21% of children in Sahiwal.
168. Focusing on children aged 15-17, in Sukkur, 26% were currently attending school and 9% were attending training provided by the project; however, only 8% had completed such training. In Sahiwal, 22% were attending school and 8% were attending a training course, similar to Sukkur; however, 31% managed to complete a training course – a relatively higher proportion.

169. There are still children aged 5-14 who are working either full or part time in both districts (13% in Sukkur and Sahiwal each). Often, they had dropped out from school/training or had never attended school/training. Of the children who had stopped working, it was generally following the project intervention with children or after the mothers received training. 32% of the mothers overall stated that withdrawal of their children from work affected household income to a large extent; another 58% felt that this affected income to some extent. Only 10% felt that income was not affected when their child stopped working.
170. In Sahiwal, 69% of the mothers and in Sukkur, 57% of the mothers said that they would still send their children to work if they really required the money. This is despite the fact that around 67% of mothers in Sahiwal and 42% of mothers in Sukkur claimed to be aware of laws regarding child labour.
171. An important finding was that 83% of mothers in Sahiwal and 66% mothers in Sukkur felt that training helped empower their role in the household. They were able to contribute more to decision-making and to household income. More women who had obtained a loan in addition to receiving training felt this way.
172. In conclusion, while the economic empowerment results are not perfect, they do indicate that the training and the micro-finance had a positive impact on over half of all households⁶² contributing to enabling them to keep their children out of child labour. At least one in ten children were still working in some capacity and a substantial proportion of mothers indicated that they might still need to revert to sending their children to work if it was needed due to poverty.

6.2 Institutional and capacity strengthening

173. The project was quite successful in achieving positive outcomes for IO2. During the evaluation, stakeholders who participated in institutional and capacity strengthening indicated that a great deal had been accomplished. Government at provincial and district level, teachers, employers and workers organisation representatives all indicated that they were in a better position to address child labour issues as a result of the project. Institutional and personal capacities were strengthened through training and direct technical support from the project and implementing partners. This was reiterated in comments during the Final Stakeholder Workshop.
174. **Table 2 indicates the results for Immediate Objective 2** on effective institutional and capacity strengthening of the model districts and the four provincial Governments. Note: While IO2 included the strengthening of the federal Child Labour Unit, as already explained in Section 4, due to devolution, federal aspects of the project were cancelled.

⁶² That is, households where mothers had received micro-financing or grants.

Table 2: Overview of key results – Immediate Objective 2

Immediate Objective 2: The institutional and technical capacity of the target district governments, four provincial CLUs and one federal CLU strengthened to effectively combat child labour.				
	Types of Results	Target	Result	Remarks
11.	No. of times each DCC meets per year	3	Min. 3	
12.	No. of Union Councils where the Community based Child Labour Monitoring System (CLMS) is operational	4 (2 in each)	135	Sukkur (46 UC) Sahiwal (89 UCs)
13.	District Child Labour Information Centres are providing qualitative and quantitative information on child labour to the general public and media	Yes	Yes	
14.	No. of 100 district-level officials who were trained on child labour and related thematic issues	200	2,901	CLMS-2,801; ITC-5; Other training -95
15.	On-going District Education Plan for 2012-2014 has incorporated the child labour concerns of the district	Yes	Yes	Currently DEPs are being implemented.
16.	No. of primary school teachers trained on child labour issues	1,000	4,020	Sukkur-2,025; Sahiwal-1,995
17.	Enhanced knowledge, training, awareness raising and advisory services on child labour issues are available at four provincial child labour units (PCLUs)	Yes	Yes	Library or document collection
18.	CL databases of selected districts are available at PCLUs	Yes	Yes	Website, RA reports
19.	Capacities to disseminate knowledge (on child labour) for district governments available at four provincial PCLUs	Yes	Yes	
20.	No. of provincial & district level officials who were trained on child labour and related thematic issues	300	316	RA surveys-64; CL related themes-227; ITC-25
21.	CL related legislation are available at each province	Yes	Yes	In the process of enactment

175. Provincial and District Governments mainstreamed child labour concerns into their activities. The project was able to provide support for the integration of child labour in on-going education development plans at district level (2012-2014) to which resources were allocated as part of routine implementation. Child Labour Monitoring Systems that were integrated in governance were established at District level.

176. The project provided significant capacity and institutional strengthening through training, technical support by project staff, and networking among different project partners. The project partners all had their own areas of expertise, e.g. governance, education, health, agriculture,

labour law, business management and rights of workers. Project partners indicated during the evaluation that, as they continued to work together, they bolstered their own institutions. This was mostly accomplished by providing each other with technical support during meetings and joint actions. As part of institutional capacity strengthening IO2 includes the development of awareness raising within the participating entities and the development of qualitative and quantitative databases on child labour.

177. At provincial level In Sindh and Punjab evaluation interviewees emphasised the importance of training and project support to the Provincial Child Labour Units with office equipment. The office equipment was seen as crucial to their effectiveness and efficiency.
178. As stated in Table 2, Child Labour Monitoring Systems (CLMS) were made operational in 135 Union Councils (UC) ⁶³ of the model districts of Sukkur and Sahiwal. Much work remains to be done to fully institutionalise them. Less formal community-based CLMS had been established early during the project implementation to identify, track and report on project beneficiaries. Teachers, districts officials, and other stakeholders interviewed during the evaluation appreciate the CLMS and indicated that they will continue to implement this beneficiary specific system.
179. The broader CLMS in the 135 UCs was established through an organised data collection system in the model districts towards the last 8 months of the project. Identification of child labourers for the CLMS is, however, only part of the picture as action to support and monitor the identified children is necessarily part of operationalization. While the system exists, the funding to make the CLMS fully operational into the future was not yet formally allocated at the time of the evaluation fieldwork.⁶⁴ This means that Reported result 12 on the CLMS operationalization is still tentative although the Model District Government representatives are working hard to raise funding for their implementation.
180. The current CLMS system is probably valid for up to 2-3 years. Data is available on the Provincial Child Labour websites. Automated updating and reporting of CLMS results from the district to the provincial level is not yet effective. The CLMS is still a stand-alone child protection⁶⁵ data-gathering tool as the country does not yet have a wider child protection data collection and management system. In Khyber Pakhtunkhwa there is, however, an important institution, the “Child Protection and Welfare Commission (CPWC)”. The Commission works as a policy, regulatory body vis-à-vis all child protection issues as well as carrying out monitoring of child rights. The CPWC is planning to integrate child labour into district referral systems.
181. Ideally, a CLMS should feed into a comprehensive child protection and referral system in each province as it would allow for integrated follow up on various issues related to child labour including education, health, abusive punishment, etc. This lack of integration of the CLMS in wider referral systems means that it is difficult to fully use it as an effective tool for planning, rationalizing and assigning resources towards addressing child labour. Naturally, children become older and will no longer be eligible if they reach the age of 18. Some children will be withdrawn from child labour for reasons not related to specific replication actions. Continuing to update the CLMS will thus be important to ensure enduring relevance of the data while child labour is eliminated.

⁶³ Union Councils are Government administrative units one level below Districts.

⁶⁴ See Section 8 on Sustainability.

⁶⁵ The UN includes exploitation in the WFCL as a subject area under the definition of child protection. United Nations Children’s Fund (2008), UNICEF Child Protection Strategy, Executive Board Annual session 2008- 3-5 June 2008. New York: UNICEF

6.2.1 Enabling environment - institutional capacity strengthening

182. *“Before our Action Programme we had no idea how to convene seminars, how to make people participate, how to raise their interest to work with us. We learned with project support and can now say we were successful up to 90%.”* Provincial official.
183. *“We do have the right institutions now. We can implement everything on child labour.”* District official.
184. *“The reason why we have success in our district is because we all worked together to achieve this: workers, employers, Government, NGO etc.”* District workers organisation representative.
185. The project supported the establishment of provincial child labour units (PCLU) and provincial committees in all four provinces and District Coordination Committees in the two model districts. The PCLU act as the executive bodies for the committees. Child labour committees include representatives of different sectors to ensure that synergies to address child labour are created. The two model districts have developed Education Plans for future actions that include child labour elements and which are intended to provide sustained financing for their child labour actions. Financial support for these new plans was not yet allocated at the time of the field work for the evaluation.
186. Much of the project work on strengthening the enabling environment through capacity strengthening of institutions and awareness raising has already been integrated in preceding sections. Elements already covered include awareness raising and training for officials and educators. Discussion on Table 2 in the first part of Section 6 covers some of the key findings.
187. In general, the planning and leadership capacities of the government, employers and workers at federal, provincial and district levels have been strengthened. Details of the role of Government, employers and workers organisations, and NGOs as it related to education, health and other project elements has already been discussed.⁶⁶ In fact, it is impossible to strictly separate to project’s work on the enabling environment from the other project activities. The Logical Framework has separated these elements for the purpose of reporting but, in practice, the entire project concept is based on integration of the different project objectives. To avoid repetition in the current section, the evaluator thus focuses the discussion on some core elements of institution building and networking.
188. As already indicated, the project focused most intensively on Punjab and Sindh provinces so the enabling environment in these two provinces has logically been strengthened the most. Success was good at provincial level although at senior most level in Sindh there were still advocacy challenges as some senior officials still do not see child labour as a priority area.
189. Provincial stakeholders particularly noted that the project training was key to success. In one example, a provincial official stated, *“The main achievement we had with this project is the success of the training with the labour inspectorate. Almost none of them had any knowledge of child labour laws and conventions before the project.”*
190. In Balochistan efforts at provincial level came late but was intensive and initial progress had been made at the time of the evaluation. During the stakeholder workshop, a representative from Balochistan argued strongly with the evaluator for more intensive support for actions on child labour in his province. This request confirms the awareness of the importance of addressing child labour of this provincial official.

⁶⁶ Including triangulated information from the evaluation sub-studies.

191. Members of the Provincial Child labour Unit (PCLU) in Khyber Pakhtunkhwa are aware and able to address child labour in their province although they state that continued technical and other support is needed. Their capabilities are in part due to previous child labour projects in Khyber Pakhtunkhwa. Of course, as elsewhere, there has been Government staff turnover although a few important staff members have been involved with child labour actions during previous projects as well as during the CACL II. Evidence of commitment to continue actions include the recent decision of the provincial Government to apportion 17 million rupees for 2 years. (approximately 160,000 US dollars) to address child labour in the province. According to the Provincial Labour Director, this has now been integrated into the budget and will be a permanent feature with a next phase starting in two years
192. The Enabling Environment Sub-study identified continuing gaps in Khyber Pakhtunkhwa such as the need for:
- increased emphasis of child labour as a pressing concern;
 - low salaries and lack of transport for 2 recently assigned child labour inspectors;
 - substantial additional financing to withdraw, prevent and integrate children into education;
 - integrating child labour into the provincial child protection monitoring systems.
193. Fluctuations on governance mechanisms in Punjab and Sindh have had an effect on developing the enabling environment, particularly at district level. The project and partners needed to adjust to changes in lines of responsibility and decision-making. At the district level, consequently any efforts to influence laws/regulations and policies were challenging. Changes in the systems are expected to continue in the future as the country makes adaptations to its devolution system. These will need to be taken into account in planning for future child labour actions.
194. Initially the project expected to be able to include elected officials at district level but, ultimately, this was not possible because local elections were not held. The project was, however, able to support training for some parliamentarians.
195. The two model districts have achieved their targets and can truly be called “model districts”. Networking and establishment of synergistic actions have been among the project’s most important successes. Networking meetings at district level were frequent. A total of 345 meetings on various child labour issues with different stakeholders were counted in Sahiwal alone. As discussed in preceding sections, there are always elements that can be improved or need to be intensified. There are also differences in governance between the provinces with authority more highly centralised at provincial level in Sindh than in Punjab, which is somewhat more decentralised. Some experience sharing with the districts has already occurred including workshops and field visits. This needs to be taken to a much higher level, however, with more field visits, by representatives of other provinces.
196. The original project included assumptions that funds for social safety nets would be readily available but in practice this was not as evident as was expected. Though some linking occurred, the country does not have a comprehensive conditional cash transfer scheme and the Zakat and Bait-Ul-Mal available funding is limited. Such funding is also managed under the authority of religious leaders instead of district Government. As religious leaders had not been strongly integrated in the project it was challenging to link to these schemes although some efforts were successful. There are, however, some other initiatives with potential such as scholarships to child labourers through Government programmes in Punjab on NFE and the Non-Formal Basic Education (NFBE) programme.
197. The project successfully networked with other entities such as the World Wildlife Fund (WWF) with which they coordinated to implement the CLMS in Sukkur District. WWF is implementing

the Better Cotton initiative, which includes promoting decent work and links well to the project goals.

6.2.2 Promoting pro-child policies and laws enhancing support on child labour elimination

198. New draft laws on elimination of child labour have been drafted with project support in Punjab, Sindh and Khyber Pakhtunkhwa. Existing laws were considered dated and needed to cover more comprehensive issues such as categorising types of hazardous and permitted work, including adequate penalties and other elements. In Punjab, for example, the new draft law on Prohibition of Employment of Children Act, 2012 was finalised and vetted by the Provincial Law Department. The draft law has been submitted to the Provincial Assembly for legislation after having received clearance from the Provincial Law Reforms Commission. The laws in other provinces are being processed through the official channels and, with time, it is expected that they will be adopted.
199. The Education Plans for future actions that were developed in the two model districts are good in terms of linking education and child labour although, as some interviewees pointed out, they need to be more comprehensive. With the label of “Education Plan” they are seen too much as a strategy focusing just on education while one of the strong points of the CACL II project was the networking of stakeholders across different sectors. Broader plans including wider awareness raising, OSH, agriculture, linkages to social and child protection systems, and police/labour inspector enforcement are needed.
200. Aside from Codes of Conduct by employers, a number of Memoranda of Understanding (MoU) on elimination of child labour were signed by the EFP with 8 business associations in Sahiwal and three in Sukkur. The Enabling Environment sub-study concluded that there is still a need for increased coordination among employers, workers and the occupational safety and health centre (CIWCE) in actions with employers.

6.3 Knowledge base and awareness raising

201. Project IO3 results were ultimately strong on awareness raising within institutions, which reinforced the results of IO1 and IO2. Interesting steps were taken on raising awareness using wider public media methods. The project did contribute to the knowledge base although, as discussed in the current section, this occurred with some delays.
202. **Table 3 reports on Immediate Objective 3** on the knowledge base and awareness increase to has been explained in the text preceding Table 2. Table 3 thus primarily focuses on the awareness raising elements although the project Baseline studies were included.

Table 3: Overview of key results – Immediate Objective 3

<i>Immediate Objective 3: The knowledge-base on child labour and its worst forms expanded and awareness increased to promote child labour sensitive policies.</i>				
	Types of Results	Target	Result	Remarks
22.	No. of media reports per year published/broadcast/telecast	500	568	As per published/broadcast media collection
23.	No. of universities launched research-based media products	6	7	21 videos
24.	A collection of quality photographs, documentaries and other advocacy material are available at concerned institutions (including CLUs) for wider public dissemination	Yes	Yes	Child labour photographs, song album, video documentaries, calendars, brochures, posters publications, mugs, UPS, etc.
25	Project Baseline Studies	2	2	The project baseline studies District Sukkur and Sahiwal were completed September 2011

203. The studies intended to inform the project (and expand the knowledge base) were relevant but not as effective as they could have been. The baselines were delayed although the project was able to collect useful information in the field through networking with stakeholders to ensure actions were adequately informed. The district CLMS database and Rapid Assessments⁶⁷ that were added to the project after the revision were implemented late in the project.
204. Unfortunately, the baseline studies (see Result 25) were not finalised until mid to late 2011, well into the project implementation period. Instead of 6 months, the consultants took 1.5 years to finalised them although they do have some useful information. Baseline studies can serve two main purposes, the inform project planning and to serve as a starting point against which to compare final results. Due to the late completion of the baseline studies, however, they were more used as background information for Implementing Partners than to inform project planning. The information included in the Baseline Surveys is, nevertheless, informative for future planning purposes, especially in combination with the Rapid Assessments and CLMS surveys conducted in the Union Councils.
205. No formal end-line survey was conducted against which to compare the baseline survey although the project did collect data through the CLMS survey late in project implementation (2013). The project did not aim (or claim) to eliminate all WFCL in the proposed districts but to develop successful actions that could be replicated within and in other districts. District Sahiwal alone probably has over 2 million inhabitants and Sukkur close to 2 million so a single project cannot achieve full elimination of WFCL.⁶⁸.
206. The primary usefulness of the Rapid Assessments and CLMS database will thus be to inform the Government and their implementing partners on future actions. The consultants who implemented the Rapid Assessments indicated that the time allocated for the studies was very short. They believe that there is still a need for a comprehensive national child labour survey. Such a survey would help to provide national data for sharing with others countries, to adequately inform planning in each province, and to provide a comparable baseline for comparison with future progress.

6.3.1 Sensitising government, trade unions and employers, local communities and general population

207. *“One of the biggest achievements of this project is the awareness raising.”* Government Official.
208. *“We realised that the children who are working as child labourers are deprived of happiness, of their childhood.”* Teacher.
209. Stakeholders interviewed for the evaluation wholeheartedly emphasised awareness raising as one of the project major successes. The project has engaged in some standard but also some very interesting and innovative activities on awareness raising. These included a photography contest and development of videos on child labour issues by media students in 7 universities. Note that Result 23 was added in line with the need to increase emphasis on awareness raising as indicated in the Midterm Review and confirmed in the project revision.

⁶⁷ Six in Sahiwal and ?? in Sukkur District (to be inserted)

⁶⁸ The 2011 Census data for Sukkur and Sahiwal districts were not available but according to officials from the Districts and unreferenced data from Wikipedia these estimates are probably close to correct. Sahiwal data: Wikipedia (2013) http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Sahiwal_District (Website accessed 20 November, 2013)
Sukkur data: Wikipedia (2013) http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Sukkur_District (Website accessed 20 November, 2013)

210. Evaluation interviewees could clearly describe child labour and the difference with child work as well as the detrimental effects of child labour on well-being and national development. The Enabling Environment Sub-study consultant did find some confusion among some interviewees but this was limited.
211. In the initial stages, the project did not have an overall written communications plan for awareness raising although there were such plans directly integrated into the individual Action Programmes. After the midterm evaluation a communications plan was developed and implemented (See Section 6.3). Employers, through their national EFP organisation, and the workers through their respective national PWF, implemented actions on sensitising their membership. NGO Implementing Partners worked in communities to conduct training and awareness raising campaigns as well as day-to-day continuous awareness raising during their meetings in schools and communities. Provincial and District Government officials were trained on child labour issues, which was important as there has always been much turnover. District officials were actively involved in various awareness raising events such as World Child Labour Day and launching of project events. Media representatives included organised visits and events to enhance reporting on CL issues. As already stated in Section 6.4, teachers were trained on child labour issues. The project, further, was able to ensure good media coverage of its activities, particularly in the written media such as newspapers.
212. The Economic Empowerment Sub-study included a section on the awareness of beneficiary mothers regarding child labour subsequent to project interventions. Of the 422 mothers surveyed, about three-quarters (83% in Sahiwal and 71% in Sukkur) stated that their opinion on child labour had changed “against child labour” as a result of project services.
213. Many champions to the cause of child labour have emerged as a result of the awareness raising and close project involvement. Some individuals exhibited greater activism, capacity to mobilize resources and inspired much greater trust and confidence at the local level. Prominent amongst these are the ILO project officer in Sahiwal, the research officer in Provincial Child Labour Unit of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, some business association members, and the current District Coordination Officer DCO in Sahiwal. Some community level representatives, especially head teachers, NFE and literacy/vocational /skills teachers, have become prominent champions. Very importantly, some mothers and children became strong child labour elimination champions in their own right. Field-visits during the evaluation, and observations during the stakeholder workshop, confirm the personal commitment and activism of these champions towards eradicating child labour.
214. After the Midterm Evaluation it was clear that a focussed but wider system of awareness raising was needed to reach the larger public. The project subsequently hired a media communications specialist who worked together with the project team and Implementing Partners to develop an overall approach. This project element has proved to be a very good success and can be identified as one of the main project good practices. It included all kinds of activities but most importantly a research and video making competition involving seven universities and a photography competition on child labour. A total of 500 photographs were entered into the competition. These were judged and prizes were distributed at a formal event at the Pakistan Festival of the Arts. The evaluation team saw calendars and posters the project had made based on the winning photographs in many locations that they visited. Head teachers, district officials and employers had the calendars prominently displayed on their desks.
215. Probably the most exciting element of the awareness raising campaigns was the university media project.⁶⁹ The key concept behind this project activity was the raising of awareness among media students, that is, future journalists. The evaluation team visited four of the

⁶⁹ Details about the university project can be found in: Combating Abusive Child Labour II (CACL II) (2013a). Demonstrating what is possible towards eliminating child labour in Pakistan. Good Practices Report. Islamabad: ILO – IPEC, CACL II project. Available from the ILO Pakistan Office.

universities personally where the lecturers and students were still very enthusiastic about their experiences. The project had briefed students on child labour. The students then conducted research on concrete child labour situations. The research was subsequently translated into videos in three categories, i.e. docu-drama, documentaries and animation. The videos were subsequently judged in a competition and a large media event was held to provide prizes and disseminate the videos. The prize-winning videos were aired on national and local television.⁷⁰

216. The students' collection of additional research information added to the knowledge base. The students' and teachers indicated that their close involvement in preparing and processing the materials helped them to develop their technical skills to carry out a project proposed by a client.
217. Teachers and students did indicate that the materials that were developed still needed to be much more widely disseminated. They requested many more similar assignments on development issues as they felt this was extremely useful. The project was not able to measure the full impact of these awareness-raising campaigns on the wider public as this would have required a large-scale knowledge, awareness and practices survey. Research on the use of media has shown, in the past, that repeated dissemination of messages does at least create awareness following which actual behaviour change actions can then more easily be built.⁷¹
218. Given the importance and effectiveness of including a professional media/communications specialist in such a project, the evaluator recommends that child labour projects include such specialists from an early stage. The evaluator observed in other countries that involving media specialists is effective in disseminating information on child labour to a wider public. Child labour projects could replicate similar competitions with students on specific child labour issues such as on the use of Occupational Safety and Health efforts and model workshops.
219. There is a need make awareness raising a continuous process among the stakeholders and the wider public. As one teacher noted, "With this project there have been changes in our thoughts and practices but a lot more needs to be done. There is still too little awareness and it needs to be raised further."

6.4 Project approaches to gender issues

220. "We were not paying enough attention to gender but now, with the ILO project, we learned the importance and that it needs to be paid attention to." Head teacher.
221. Discussion on gender was mainstreamed throughout the current report under the relevant section headings (See Sections 4.2, 4.3, 5, 6.4.1, 6.4.2, 9.1, 9.2). The project included almost equal attention to boys and girls with good impact on both. Ultimately, however, the direct actions with boys are likely to have more long-term potential than those with girls. This is primarily because boys can publicly market their products and services while girls may be working primarily from home.
222. A general gender analysis was carried out in preparation for the project. The project included gender analysis and disaggregation of data by gender in the project baseline studies and the Rapid Assessments (see Section 7). The project conducted discussions at district level and in communities that were analysed and used to plan gender oriented activities. This resulted in special steps such as door-step vocational training for girls and emphasis on gender in teacher

⁷⁰ The project

⁷¹ "Though community outreach strategies and mass media campaigns are two distinct strategies, the most effective examples of such approaches tend to combine mass media intervention with community-based action." UN Women, (2013) Community Mobilization, Outreach and Mass Media. <http://www.endvawnow.org/en/articles/219-community-mobilization-outreach-and-mass-media-.html> (Website accessed 23 November, 2013)

training. The project worked at community level on women's empowerment and in school/community and mothers' groups.

223. Some other shortcomings were noted, including the continued classical direction in vocational/skills training on sewing/beauty for girls and more technical trades for boys. While engaging girls in the technical trades might be challenging in the Pakistani context, identifying some more gender neutral trades could be useful in future initiatives. Teacher training was successful in raising awareness of gender issues as clearly noted in evaluation interviews with teachers in different settings. As one head teacher indicated, enrolment of girls substantially increased in one school. He stated that teachers realised that it was important to improve the quality of teaching since teachers and girls "were not there just to pass the time." The proportion of girls was said to have increased from 1—15% to about 45% currently. Nevertheless, stakeholders still indicate that much more effort is needed to educate girls since, as a head teacher pointed out, "an educated girl will raise a whole family and it will have a positive effect on all of them."

7. Project coordination and management

224. *“We saw the project as a team effort.”* Project staff member.
225. Project coordination and management was well implemented overall. The project staff was able to address most of the challenges resulting from the interplay between security issues, national disasters, and staffing. The project worked efficiently to maximise—and even exceed—the planned results using the available budget of somewhat about 4.8 million Euro. The efficiency is also confirmed in the funding allocated by the Punjab Government to replicate the actions in 4 new districts as the amounts are not dissimilar to that spent in the model districts.
226. The project Chief Technical Adviser (CTA) was well respected for his commitment, openness and high level of experience on the subject of child labour. He was seen as a very good organiser “with an effective performance appraisal system”. The CTA was very “hands on” and made many field visits, which were accelerated when delays occurred. He was said to use his “powers as project manager to apply positive pressure to complete the work on time.” Expectations were high and some Implementing Partners felt that they could have done some of the work more independently. Implementing partners did, however, clearly recognise the need and benefits of the technical support provided by the entire project team. Within the project team, a few differences of opinion regarding implementation delays and methods were reported but these were resolved.
227. Colleagues and implementing partners at all levels well appreciated the field project staff in Sukkur and Sahiwal. In their case, their commitment and willingness to work long hours to provide support “above and beyond the call of duty”⁷² were noteworthy.
228. Processing of administrative matters was adequate although this varied at times with complex and slow approvals of some financial disbursements due to bureaucratic processes of the ILO and, sometimes, of the donor agency.
229. The project, further, reported having received good support from the ILO IPEC senior sub-regional child labour expert in New Delhi and from ILO IPEC headquarters. Good relations with the EC Programme Officer and the EC overall were reported. The willingness of the EC to consider revisions in line with implementing realities was well appreciated.
230. ILO/IPEC had clearly established communication mechanisms and performance management systems of both staff and implementing partners. Reporting was regular with intensive support to Implementing Partners improve report writing skills when needed.

7.1 Project monitoring

231. The generally effective and comprehensive project monitoring system was comprised of the project monitoring plan (PMP), work plans, data collection and processing, analysis and reporting. The project monitoring plan was useful and sufficiently adapted to the changing realities with respect to devolution, security and natural disasters. Monitoring data was collected on a regular basis and adequately analysed for reports. All stakeholders reported being in frequent contact with the project and implementing agency staff for monitoring purposes. There were some challenges, however, to collect and enter data in a timely manner due to the complexity of the information to be gathered. The narrative of reports from the field often needed substantial revision at project headquarters to ensure that they met quality requirements.
232. Some analysis of the CLMS, which was linked to the DBMR, has already been discussed in Section X. In fact, the evaluator noted improved tracking of activities beyond the DBMR,

⁷² According to a district official in Sahiwal. The project officer for Sukkur was also appreciated.

which is often so highly focussed on in child labour projects that other elements are insufficiently considered. Monitoring of capacity strengthening activities, community meetings, awareness raising were, for example, well tracked. Monitoring of these elements was done both quantitatively to report on indicators but also qualitatively through frequent field visits by project and implementing partner staff.

233. The project used information from the monitoring feedback to make adjustments in the project, such as the increases in capacity strengthening exercises including training of Government officials. Project management used information collected through the monitoring and evaluation system to inform the awareness raising and knowledge sharing (see Section X).
234. The field monitoring of project children and households included several components. The Implementing Partners (NRSP and PRSP) responsible for the project education component worked with their field coordinators to monitor school attendance of project-enrolled children. The field coordinators, in turn, involved teachers and community members as well as the mothers groups to track project children. The Government has a system to monitor school attendance through education inspectors. There were some cases where children were irregular in attendance or dropped out from the NFE programme although this was not a comparatively major issue. Data was then recorded in the project DBMR and shared with district stakeholders at District meetings. Interviewees indicated that the DBMR worked well and posed no major challenges during implementation, that is, unless children had migrated away. As one project field staff members stated, “Regarding the DBMR, we found it is very good for registering the children and monitoring them.” Recording of children in the DBMR is carefully done and only recorded as withdrawn/prevented if they have been mainstreamed for at least three months.
235. The Economic Empowerment Sub-study noted that, “One of the key strengths of the CACL II programme was its data collection procedures in place, and the digitization of this collected data. This allows one to observe key summary reports in order to monitor progress through a specifically devised online portal”. The sub-study report does, however add that “the data collection process can further be strengthened. The online portal, although useful, is not up-to-date in parallel with the database and does not allow one to link specific variables of one report (or subset of the data) with another”.
236. As authors of the Economic Empowerment Sub-study indicated, there were some challenges with respect to the counting of households. In some households both the husband and wife obtained a loan and were registered in the monitoring system with different names. As a result there was a double counting of 93 households, which gave the impression that there were more households accessing micro-credit than was actually the case. The evaluator thus recommends that, in the future, the Direct Beneficiary Monitoring & Reporting (DBMR) system attributes a single code per household even if there is more than one child in the household who is enrolled in the project. Each child can still have his/her own code within the household. When data is collected in communities, field officers need to verify the exact household to which each person accessing credit or other services is linked and list the code.

7.2 Project coordination and collaboration with other child-focused interventions

237. Aside from the principal project Implementing Partners, the project coordinated and collaborated with other entities. See Annexe 4 for full details. These included the WWF for the CLMS in Sukkur District but also to establish two child labour free village in their model cotton farming villages. The Benazir Income Support Programme (BISP) provided grants to 183 beneficiary mothers. The Bab-ul-Ilm and National Commission for Human Development established educational centres at two brick kiln clusters where Government schools were not available. Save the Children funded some renovation for the offices of the PCLU Sindh and (See Annexe 5 for details on funding). The Society for the Protection of the Rights of the Child

(SPARC) provided Two Capacity Building trainings conducted for 35 Inspectors. Additional information is available in Annexe.

7.3 Project responses to midterm evaluation recommendations

238. The project implemented as many of the Midterm Evaluation Recommendations as possible. See Annexe 6 for details. The project was revised in light of the changing governance responsibilities due to the devolution. A recommendation regarding linkages between Federal and Provincial level Child Labour Units could not be implemented as the Federal Child Labour Unit was abolished. The National Child labour Survey needed to be cancelled as already discussed in Section 6. Additional capacity strengthening and awareness raising activities were implemented. This included attention to several subjects such as OSH and improved quality of reporting by Implementing Partners.

8. Sustainability of project results: Potential for long-term impact, replication, adaptation to new districts

239. *"It is now the responsibility of the Government to address this issue."* Government Education Official.
240. The project efforts are sustainable overall with good potential for long-term impact and replication to new districts. Project activities in the target districts are likely sustainable, although some beneficiary children may still return to hazardous child labour due to continued poverty. The project districts of Sahiwal and Sukkur are likely to continue their mainstreamed child labour actions. Unless, however, added provincial financing is allocated to Sahiwal and Sukkur, direct actions with child labourers and their households may be implemented at a less intense level.
241. Provincial Government recognition of the potential of sustainability is confirmed in Punjab where actions to replicate in four new districts area already being undertaken. Unless the Government had confidence in the ultimate sustainability of such actions it would not invest in replication. A project management office has been established and field officers have been assigned in each of the selected replication districts. NGOs will act as project implementing partners to faithfully replicate the success of the model districts. In Sindh there is also good potential for replication to new districts but this still needs to be formalised. In Khyber Pakhtunkhwa funding for child labour actions have been allocated to replicate the model in two districts (see Section 8.1 and Annexe 5 for details). Khyber Pakhtunkhwa is appointing two specialised child labour inspectors to supplement the mainstreamed child labour actions of inspectors. In Balochistan additional technical support will be needed before replication can become a reality.
242. Institutional strengthening strategies reinforce and sustain the direct interventions, and the (ultimately) enhanced knowledgebase and awareness helps in mainstreaming child labour concerns in the provinces and over a longer period. The project mobilized the tripartite constituents' government, workers and employers.
243. The opinion of the stakeholders regarding the potential sustainability of the methods used in the district models is confirmed in Punjab by the fact that the province plans to replicate all of the actions in the same way. In the existing districts there are, the district government in Sahiwal and the labour department still face resource and capacity constraints. Some headway was made in terms of resource mobilization in Sahiwal but uncertainty and anxiety remain high. At provincial levels, there is much appreciation for the project but there are no firm commitments at present to provide financing for continuing the actions in the model districts. Nevertheless, the children who have been mainstreamed and/or are now working in new or improved workplaces are not likely to revert to child labour.
244. In terms of institutions, the project has been able to institutionalise the PCLUs and funding for their operations exists in all four provinces. As many stakeholders pointed out, however, there is still a need for a Federal Level Child Labour Unit to coordinate data-gathering, exchanges and learning from the experiences of other countries. Government, employers and workers organisations all still request that at least one ILO technically experience child labour expert be available to the country continue to provide technical support to the established institutions.
245. District Coordination Committees (DCC) on child labour in the model districts are likely to continue even if no substantial external funding, from the provincial Government or other sources, is provided. Capacities, commitment, and ownership are currently high. Individual employers and employers' associations indicated that they will implement their Codes of Conduct and MoUs on the elimination of child labour.

246. The district Government in both model districts indicated that at least some funding would be found locally⁷³ and that key activities on child labour had been mainstreamed into on-going education programmes. As district Education Officers and teachers interviewed for the evaluation indicated, awareness now exists and enrolment campaigns will continue to pay special attention to child labourers. *Scaling up* efforts would be challenging, however, unless the new Education Plans proposed by the model districts are approved. Supplementary financing for intensive awareness raising and outreach to families of child labourers will be needed.
247. Some linkages to the Zakat scholarship scheme have been implemented and, in Sahiwal, 50 children have received scholarships so far. Provision of sufficient vocational/skills training and toolkits is likely to be challenging. Labs for vocational/skills training are likely to continue but financing for door-step and other specialised training will be needed. In Sahiwal a special vocational/skills training centre for former child labourers has been established in a building allocated and especially renovated by the district Government. The District Coordination Officer and the DCC are actively seeking financing through public-private partnerships to operate the centre. Funding for dissemination of the experiences of the OSH model workshops are needed. The needs are high and obtaining a portion of the funding available from the provincial level for such activities will continue to require advocacy by stakeholders. Several stakeholders, including senior district officials and local workers organisations⁷⁴ have indicated that they will continue to do so.
248. There is a need to continue training more key staff in different entities as turnover occurs. This is an area that will need attention and financing. Human and financial resources will be needed to implement important actions such as data collection, data entry and analysis on the CLMS. While labour officers have been assigned to address child labour, there will be a continuing need for additional staffing to maintain the momentum without the support of the NGO Implementing Partners. PRSP and NRSP have, however, indicated that they will continue to address child labour in their other on-going activities.

8.1 Leveraged resources

249. The project was quite successful in leveraging resources through collaboration with its Implementing Partners and other agencies. Not all the support was monetised but, totalling the contributions as summarised in Annexe 5, the amount **leveraged was valued at over US \$600,000. This does not include the US\$ 2 million allocated for project replication in Punjab and Khyber Pakhtunkhwa. The project has clearly been able to mobilize resources, policies, programmes, partners and activities to support the Government's National Policy and Plan of Action to Combat Child Labour and the National Time Bound Programme (2008-2016) and its devolved Provincial actions on child labour.**

8.2 Documenting and dissemination

250. The project has documented its actions and disseminated them through various mechanisms as already indicated in previous sections of the report. Summarising these they include experience sharing workshops, media publications, events on competitions, organised field visits to model districts, and the preparation a document on project good practices. The ILO headquarters website has included case studies on project actions and beneficiaries. The PCLU Punjab has launched a website (www.pclu.ciwce.org.pk) which disseminates child labour data on the collected with project support. There is still a need for much more effort to disseminate the lessons learned, good practices and, most of all, the district models. It will be important to

⁷³ For example through the District Government Local Budget.

⁷⁴ One workers association group indicated, for example, that if no funding is allocated they plan to start a pressure group of stakeholders to push for financing of child labour actions.

ensure that District model experience sharing includes all of the different project elements carried out in the district, including that of the OSH model workshops.

9. Conclusions and key recommendations

251. The project has functioned well to achieve its overall objective of contributing to the elimination of child labour, with special focus on the elimination of the abusive/worst forms of child labour in Pakistan. The project has successfully increased focus on developing a sustainable enabling environment at provincial and district level. The institutional and technical capacity of target district governments and four provincial Child labour Units have been strengthened to effectively combat child labour. Awareness has been raised at all levels. The knowledge base on child labour and its worst forms was expanded and awareness increased even if an originally envisaged national child labour survey could not be carried out. The primary reasons were lengthy discussions on methodologies and the eventual devolution of federal labour implementation responsibilities to the provinces.
252. Downstream actions on withdrawing and preventing children from child labour were concretely planned and integrated into education systems to serve as replicable district models within the provinces. Sustainable and holistic district models to reduce and gradually eliminate abusive child labour across sectors have been developed in one model district in Punjab and Sindh each.
253. Although the project has achieved its overall and immediate objectives as determined in the revised project document, there were still areas that posed challenges. Challenges resulting from security issues, natural disasters and high staffing turnover in Government and some of the other Implementing partners caused delays. Some of these challenges could not be predicted.
254. As compared to child labour projects in other countries, the project has been quite successful in the mainstreaming of Non-Formal Education children into formal education with good potential for sustainable mainstreaming. Literacy and vocational/skills training have been successful but longer training was needed for some while the range of options and market linkages could have been improved. Economic empowerment was useful in reducing household dependence on child labour but there was still much need for additional training for mothers; micro-finance and grants; and market linkages for products and services. Section 9.1 and 9.2 further summarise key findings and recommendations.

9.1 Key lessons learned and good practices

255. As the project developed the integrated area-based approach many lessons were learned and good practices developed. The current report just lists some key elements. (Note: in the next version this section may be summarised and details move to an Annexe)

Lessons learned

1. Given the overall emphasis on coordination and networking, almost more than the individual Action Programmes, it is their *combination* that was most essential to project success. There is thus a need to consider the complementarity of the Action Programmes and their implementing partners in any similar integrated approaches.
2. Project flexibility—as opposed to rigid logical framework implementation—is important for success where major challenges such as major security and natural disaster issues and other unexpected events occur.
3. The development of occupational safety and health approaches using a system of risk assessment in different sectors, development of appropriate OSH equipment/materials and implementation in model workshops is useful.
4. Implementation of model workshops in a variety of trades should be implemented at as soon as possible in any project. Large scale-visits or other dissemination of experiences need to be organised for full impact.

5. To provide accessible training for older girls in traditional socio-cultural environments, it is useful to provide vocational/skills training in or near their homes. It is necessary, however, to take into consideration that this can perpetuate the isolation of girls and decrease the kinds of training that they can be offered.
6. In project planning, given the high turnover in Government offices in Pakistan and in many other countries, projects need to consider developing a system to ensure that new officials/staff are aware and have child labour elimination capacities.
7. Awareness raising needs to be a continuous process among the stakeholders and the wider public.
8. Skills training and micro-finance/grants can be useful to reduce dependence of households on child labour. A combination of different training courses and micro-finance or grant provision are most effective.
9. Codes of Conduct and MoUs between employers' federations and their membership can be effective in reducing child labour. Particularly where employers have been motivated to engage in concrete actions such as through public events to provide school kits at their workplaces.
10. Health check-ups of child labourers are useful as they can serve to alert doctors to child labour related injuries such as from equipment and from chemicals used in different types of work.

Good practices

11. The establishment of integrated area-based approaches at District level is feasible and effective in Pakistan. Ensuring participation of a wide range of stakeholders and a range of types of actions is important for success. Projects need to allocate intensive and sufficient time to develop the level of integration needed for the establishment of long-term networks among stakeholders.
12. Taking time to building of personal relations of project staff and implementing partners was a very important element that contributed to project success. These relations helped to find solutions to overcome delays and other implementation challenges.
13. For awareness raising, various competitions to develop awareness raising materials, such as photography and video making are useful and generate interest among those involved and the public. Working with universities to develop future journalists' knowledge on child labour by conducting research and preparing videos is useful to create awareness.
14. To ensure that girls were able to access training the project had taken the wise decision to provide "door-step" training in or very close to homes in some locations. This solution was found because it was difficult to reach the planned 50% target for girls in vocational/skills training.

9.2 Key recommendations

256. Stakeholders especially suggested for implementing the recommendations are indicated between parentheses following each recommendation.

Project design and data management

1. A continued technical presence of ILO-IPEC is needed in Pakistan to provide technical support for replication of the district models developed under the project. That is, Government, employers and workers organisations still request that at least one ILO technically experience child labour expert be available to the country continue to provide technical support to the established institutions (Government, ILO, donors).

2. The DBMR system should attribute a single code per household even if there is more than one child who is enrolled in the project. Each child can still have his/her own code within the household. When data is collected in communities, field officers need to verify the exact household to which each person accessing credit or other services is linked and list the person using the household code (ILO and all implementing entities).

Federal action, provincial and district institutions and replication

3. Review establishment possibilities for a federal level unit on child labour in Pakistan to coordinate data-gathering, ensure that indicators are comparable, organise inter-provincial exchanges and mutual exchange of learning of experiences with other countries. This should be a tri-partite body to monitor and guide child labour activities (Government).
4. Review potential of conducting a National Child Labour Survey in Pakistan and conduct then survey. Such a survey would help to provide national data for sharing with others countries, to adequately inform planning in each province, and to provide a comparable baseline for comparison with future progress (Government, ILO).
5. Replicate district integrated area-based approaches as much as possible in other areas of Pakistan. Advocacy to finance replication and sustainability of existing model districts needs to continue with special focus on advocacy by stakeholders (Government).
6. Source continuing human and financial resources to implement important actions such as data collection, data entry and analysis on the CLMS in Pakistan. While labour officers have been assigned to address child labour, there will be a continuing need for additional staffing for full effectiveness (Government).

Awareness raising and capacity strengthening

7. Widely replicate project actions using various competitions such as photography and video. Where feasible, work with universities to develop future journalists' knowledge on child labour by conducting research and preparing videos is useful to create awareness. Child labour projects could replicate similar competitions with students on specific child labour issues such as on the use of Occupational Safety and Health efforts and model workshops (ILO, Government, donors, employers, organisations, workers organizations, NGOs/Civil Society Organisations).
8. Replicate sub-study on Economic Empowerment in other settings and countries to increase knowledge and understanding of the best methods to provide skills training and micro-finance/grants to reduce dependence of households on child labour (ILO, donors).

Education and economic empowerment

9. Improve labour market and market linkages research to ensure appropriate matching of vocational/skills training and local needs. Conduct brainstorming exercises involving a range of stakeholders to identify more and innovative types of economic activities (Government, ILO, employers, organisations, workers organizations, NGOs/Civil Society Organisations).
10. In economic empowerment actions, provide a combination of training courses and micro-finance or grant provision (Government, ILO, donors, employers, organisations, workers organizations, NGOs/Civil Society Organisations).
11. Address gender issues in context of vocational/skills training on sewing/beauty for girls and more technical trades for boys. While engaging girls in the technical trades might be challenging in the Pakistani context, identifying some more gender neutral trades could be useful in future initiatives (Government, ILO, donors, employers, organisations, workers organizations, NGOs/Civil Society Organisations).

Occupational safety and health

12. Widely disseminate and replicate the project occupational safety and health approaches. This includes using a system of risk assessment in different sectors, development of appropriate OSH equipment/materials and implementation in model workshops (including in other countries) (Government, ILO, employers, organisations, workers organizations, NGOs/Civil Society Organisations).

Knowledge base development

13. Develop database of child labourers in districts at an early project stage to ensure that any project has appropriate information for all actions to be implemented. Integrate data into an overall referral system linking child labour, other areas of child protection, education and health (Government, ILO, NGOs).

Annexe 1: Detailed recommendations

Stakeholders especially suggested for implementing the recommendations are indicated between parentheses following each recommendation.

Project design and data management

1. A continued technical presence of ILO-IPEC is needed in Pakistan to provide technical support for replication of the district models developed under the project. That is, Government, employers and workers organisations still request that at least one ILO technically experience child labour expert be available to the country continue to provide technical support to the established institutions (Government, ILO, donors).
2. In project design, consider the impact of indicators that could simultaneously fall under different objectives affects clarity of measurement of project results. Cross-cutting elements may need to be listed separately to avoid confusion under different immediate objective headings (ILO, donors).
3. Increase synergies of IPEC projects to other ILO programmes on decent work, Youth Employment, Migration, the Women's Entrepreneurship Development and Gender Equality section and other entrepreneurship programmes (ILO).
4. At the beginning of a project, both donor and executing agency should develop a joint plan that spells out the exact mechanisms for administration and financial disbursement that will be used (ILO and donor).
5. The DBMR system should attribute a single code per household even if there is more than one child who is enrolled in the project. Each child can still have his/her own code within the household. When data is collected in communities, field officers need to verify the exact household to which each person accessing credit or other services is linked and list the person using the household code (ILO and all implementing entities).
6. Religious leaders need to be well integrated in a child labour project wherever possible and useful so that their influence can be maximised to address child labour issues and link to their social support schemes (ILO, government).

Federal action, provincial and district institutions and replication

7. Review establishment possibilities for a federal level unit on child labour in Pakistan to coordinate data-gathering, ensure that indicators are comparable, organise inter-provincial exchanges and mutual exchange of learning of experiences with other countries. This should be a tri-partite body to monitor and guide child labour activities (Government).
8. Review potential of conducting a National Child Labour Survey in Pakistan and conduct survey. Such a survey would help to provide national data for sharing with others countries, to adequately inform planning in each province, and to provide a comparable baseline for comparison with future progress (Government, ILO).
9. Follow up on adoption of Provincial child labour laws and develop effective enforcement mechanisms (Government).
10. Replicate district integrated area-based approaches as much as possible in other areas of Pakistan. Advocacy to finance replication and sustainability of existing model districts needs to continue with special focus on advocacy by stakeholders (Government).
11. Develop comprehensive child labour district plans that integrate education with wider awareness raising, OSH, agriculture, linkages to social and child protection systems, and police/labour inspector enforcement are needed.

12. Source continuing human and financial resources to implement important actions such as data collection, data entry and analysis on the CLMS in Pakistan. While labour officers have been assigned to address child labour, there will be a continuing need for additional staffing for full effectiveness (Government).
13. Take fluctuations on governance mechanisms into account in planning for future child labour actions (Government).
14. Combine development of Codes of Conduct and MoUs between employers' federations and their membership with concrete actions to involve employers in public events (Government, ILO, donors, employers, organisations, workers organizations, NGOs/Civil Society Organisations).

Awareness raising and capacity strengthening

15. Widely replicate project actions using various competitions such as photography and video. Where feasible, work with universities to develop future journalists' knowledge on child labour by conducting research and preparing videos is useful to create awareness. Child labour projects could replicate similar competitions with students on specific child labour issues such as on the use of Occupational Safety and Health efforts and model workshops (ILO, Government, donors, employers, organisations, workers organizations, NGOs/Civil Society Organisations).
16. Include a professional media/communications specialist in child labour projects from an early stage as this has been shown to be effective in the CACL II project and in other types of projects elsewhere. Media specialists are often effective in disseminating information on child labour to a wider public (ILO).
17. Replicate sub-study on Economic Empowerment in other settings and countries to increase knowledge and understanding of the best methods to provide skills training and micro-finance/grants to reduce dependence of households on child labour (ILO, donors).
18. Develop a system to ensure that all *new* officials/staff are aware and have child labour elimination capacities (Government).
19. Develop training for health workers on how to identify possible child labour related child injuries and illnesses. Link identified children to health services and monitor (Government, NGOs, and private health service providers).
20. Continue to raise awareness among teachers to ensure that children of all backgrounds are accepted and treated fairly in schools, including children withdrawn from child labour (Government).

Education and economic empowerment

21. In economic empowerment actions, provide a combination of training courses and micro-finance or grant provision (Government, ILO, donors, employers, organisations, workers organizations, NGOs/Civil Society Organisations).
22. Improve labour market and market linkages research to ensure appropriate matching of vocational/skills training and local needs. Conduct brainstorming exercises involving a range of stakeholders to identify more and innovative types of economic activities (Government, ILO, employers, organisations, workers organizations, NGOs/Civil Society Organisations).
23. Implement a full post-project impact study to maximize the learning of lessons about the elements implemented in the literacy/vocational/skills training (Government, ILO).

24. Awareness raising to monitor and ensure that children of all backgrounds are accepted and treated fairly in schools will continue to be needed (Government, employers, organisations, workers organizations, NGOs/Civil Society Organisations).
25. Ensure that interests and acquired skills training are more closely linked to economic benefits (Government, employers, organisations, workers organizations, NGOs/Civil Society Organisations).
26. Longer training is needed to become fully competent in the vocational/skills training that children are provided with Government, employers, organisations, workers organizations, NGOs/Civil Society Organisations).
27. Address gender issues in context of vocational/skills training on sewing/beauty for girls and more technical trades for boys. While engaging girls in the technical trades might be challenging in the Pakistani context, identifying some more gender neutral trades could be useful in future initiatives (Government, ILO, donors, employers, organisations, workers organizations, NGOs/Civil Society Organisations).
28. In future projects a wider and more innovative approach to skills development is needed. Naturally, not all of the potential innovative types of skills that could be developed are appropriate in all locations and will depend on local needs, markets, available training and materials. No single type of activity will provide solutions and cost-benefit calculations will need to be made to determine the usefulness of a more varied approach to vocational/skills training (Government, employers, organisations, workers organizations, NGOs/Civil Society Organisations).

Note possible examples to be considered include subjects such as:

- mechanical processes and metal cutting, designing mechanics, auto part repair;
- making and/or adding safety mechanisms to equipment in motor shops, on farms, in brick making, and in other local situations to make them OSH compliant. (Based on methods developed through agencies such as the Centre for the Improvement of Working Conditions and Environment (CIWCE);
- machine embroidery;
- market skills (buying and selling locally needed products);
- market skills and linkages for sale of products such as solar energy based portable lights, energy efficient cooking stoves, etc.;
- secretarial skills including computer use;
- become junior trainers on occupational safety and health in the workplace⁷⁵.

Occupational safety and health

29. Widely disseminate and replicate the project occupational safety and health approaches. This includes using a system of risk assessment in different sectors, development of appropriate OSH equipment/materials and implementation in model workshops. (including in other countries) (Government, ILO, employers, organisations, workers organizations, NGOs/Civil Society Organisations).
30. Integrate awareness raising on importance of OSH in middle school curriculum including examples as related to work common in the localities. Also integrate OSH in vocational and skills training (Government, NGOs/Civil Society Organisations).
31. Review more intensively the quality and type of protective OSH materials such as uniforms, gloves, masks, etc. to ensure that they fit correctly and are as appropriate to the climate as possible (Government, notably CIWCE).

⁷⁵ To be paid by employers, NGOs, through Government initiatives.

Knowledge base development

32. Develop database of child labourers in districts at an early project stage to ensure that any project has appropriate information for all actions to be implemented. Integrate data into an overall referral system linking child labour, other areas of child protection, education and health (Government, ILO, NGOs).
33. Implement Rapid Assessments on key local child labour issues for all new districts being replicated (Government, NGOs).
34. Further strengthen data collection processes for the Direct Beneficiary Monitoring & Reporting. The online portal can be improved by ensuring that it is regularly updated and allows linkages of specific variables of one subset of the data with another (e.g. child beneficiaries, education interventions, mother economic empowerment).

Annexe 2: Title of action programme and name of implementing agency

	Title of AP and Name of Implementing Agency
1)	Elimination of Abusive Child Labour in District Sukkur through Education, Vocational Training and Social Family & Economic Empowerment; National Rural Support Programme (NRSP)
2)	Elimination of Abusive Child Labour in District Sahiwal through Education, Vocational Training and Social Family & Economic Empowerment; Punjab Rural Support Programme (PRSP)
3)	Support to the District Government's Programme for the Elimination of Worst Forms of Child Labour from the District of Sukkur; Community Development Department, Office of the District Coordination Officer, Sukkur
4)	Awareness Raising and Capacity Building of Workers against Abusive Child Labour; Pakistan Workers' Federation (PWF)
5)	Awareness Raising and Capacity Building of Employers against Abusive Child Labour; Employers' Federation of Pakistan (EFP)
6)	Strengthening Capacity of the Provincial Child Labour Unit to Combat Child Labour in Punjab; Provincial Child Labour Unit, Labour & Human Resources Department, Government of the Punjab, Lahore (PCLU-Punjab)
7)	Support to the District Government's Programme for the Elimination of Worst Forms of Child Labour from the District of Sahiwal; District Labour Office, Community Dev. Department, Office of the District Coordination Officer, Sahiwal
8)	Combating hazardous child labour through risk assessment and OSH interventions in selected sectors in Districts Sahiwal and Sukkur; Centre for the Improvement of Working Conditions & Environment (CIWCE), Government of the Punjab, Lahore
9)	Strengthening Capacity of the Provincial Child Labour Unit to Combat Child Labour in Sindh; Provincial Child Labour Unit, Directorate of Labour, Government of Sindh, Karachi (PCLU-Sindh)
10)	Strengthening Capacity of the Provincial Child Labour Unit to Combat Child Labour in Khyber Pakhtunkhwa; Provincial Child Labour Unit, Directorate of Labour, Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar (PCLU-KPK)
11)	Strengthening Capacity of the Provincial Child Labour Unit to Combat Child Labour in Baluchistan; Provincial Child Labour Unit, Directorate of Labour Welfare, Government of Baluchistan, Quetta (PCLU-Baluchistan)

Annexe 3: Stakeholder workshop results

Prioritised Successes, Challenges and Recommendations According to Discussion Groups

Note: when reviewing these tables, please consider that each column stands alone and information is not directly linked in rows.

Parents and children		
Successes	Challenges	Recommendations
Children received education and awareness	Difficult to withdraw the girls because fathers do not agree	Future work should be done to improve condition of our children
Capacity building to increase business	Children income is stopped after withdrawal, increasing household worries	There are still many children who need to be taken care of.
Increase in income	Getting mothers together is difficult	
Girls left the broom ("haroo") and started respectable work	Target too limited, not many children got benefit	
Increased contacts and relations	Children still tutoring once mainstreamed into government schools to continue their education smoothly.	
	Short training duration	
	Got vocational training at a young age making difficult to continue (that work)	

ILO Project Team		
Successes	Challenges	Recommendations
Strong media campaigns at national/international levels	Security concerns throughout the project, even during evaluations	Deeper understanding of Results and issues is required
Visibility of the project	Challenges in the admin system at the province and district levels	At the federal level, there should be a tri-partite body to monitor and guide child labour activities and report to ILO accordingly.
Effective networking	Super flash of flood and heavy rains	In-service training provided to public officers; regular capacity building. This will include exposure visits and other best practices beyond training
Institutional mechanisms PCLU/PCC/DCLU/DCC	Continuous transfers of higher government officials at district, provincial and federal levels	Need to strengthen inter-provincial coordination mechanism
Signs of sustainability at various levels (Punjab project, KP Project, STI, etc.) even before the end of the project	Changes to governance system (at local + 18 th constitution amendment) – a challenge and an opportunity	Inter-provincial study visit to share the best practice
By design and in implementation – all the Action Programmes complemented each other	Policy level decisions to facilitate the provision of microcredit	Continued technical assistance to PCLUs and for interprovincial coordination
Integrated, well-knitted, joint actions by district	Sustainability in Balochistan, KP and Sindh	Replication of district model approach to all districts through the mobilization of

ILO Project Team		
Successes	Challenges	Recommendations
based stakeholder to create maximum impact		internal/external resources
Capacity building	Less proactive management and administration support to expedite the AP	
Mainstreaming of CL into education system	Lack of proper infrastructure for field officers	
District Model; leveraging resources	Delay in auditing	
Coordination and collaboration amongst stakeholders	Poor understanding of issues by stakeholders	
District level CL monitoring system	Slow pace of AP implementation	
Feeling ownership and responsibility, developed at provincial level through the active involvement, training of institutions, strengthening (tools plus mechanisms)	Non-existent/ weak inter-provincial coordination mechanisms	
Family empowerment through loan.		

Education and Skills Group		
Successes	Challenges	Recommendations
Excellent coordination amongst stakeholders	Time allocation: sequencing of different activities could have been improved	CACL III must take place in all of Pakistan, and begin with Balochistan
Vocational skills training programmes & micro-credit helped poor families	Scope and size of project with regard to quantum of WFCL problem was limited	CACL II should not end, but should be developed for sustainability and implemented in other districts as well
Formation of adult literacy centres (ALCs) and brick kilns	Full-fledged budget required to cover all aspects of WFCL through different mass communication level tools	National Child Labour survey must be conducted
Mainstreaming of Non-formal Education (NFE) learners	Traditional media should be used to raise awareness about WFCL	
Awareness of child labour amongst students and youth; use of mass media; WFCL awareness amongst various stakeholders	Balochistan Universities were neglected for documentary competition	
Children involved in WFCL were interested in education	For sustainability of project, the intervention of follow-up mechanism need to be put in place.	
Parents/ families were also interested / sensitized with regard to health hazards of WFCL.	University students should be part of sustainability plan	
Children were contributing financial resources	Frequent transfers of government officials.	
Increase in income of target families through skill improvement		
Prospects of bright future for siblings of WFCL families		

Occupational Safety and Health Group	
Successes	Challenges
We have centre for improvement of working conditions and environment for technical assistance.	More sensitization / awareness raising projects should be launched
Skill development component for females with consultation of Social Welfare department.	Social and cultural change needs regular follow up of the interventions and measures
Establishing 50 model workplaces as reduction to promote healthy environment of adults under CACL	Lack of awareness among child labourers, their parents, employers, workers etc.
Raised awareness amongst workers about safety and health during work	Young workers feel some difficulties to adopt some new measures instead of traditional methods.
Getting priority and focus of international agencies and government institutions	Management controls and engineering controls (improving machines)
Introduce the safety and health measures through the concept of model working place.	Illiteracy is a barrier for development and interventions
A productive group work	Sustainability issue
Created awareness about the right and responsibility of the workers and employers	Attitude and behavioural change and workers, employers.
Very good platform for media students to work for social welfare	We have only 1 technical institution for improvement of working conditions which is not enough to cater the needs of Pakistan
Children can be protected by a clean and healthy environment as protecting from any damage	As a student it was difficult to handle employers of children as they claim that children work for their own will.
OSH practices can improve working conditions.	What is the future of Sahiwal activities initiated by the project?
	Lack of planning in beginning of project for sustainability.
	It was very difficult to approach real child labour.

Knowledge Management Policy and Law Group	
Successes	Challenges
Integrated approach developed dedication of all stakeholders	Enough was not done (delay)
Family/child focused	Limited Coverage
	Recommendations
	Child labour survey (existing one is too old - 1996)
	Further recommendations in the laws (updating of existing laws related to child

Knowledge Management Policy and Law Group		
Successes	Challenges	Recommendations
Vocational training / education focused	More sermons than deeds	Ownership of the provincial government
Introduction of new system of working to eradicate child labour	Child labour survey may be updated	
Awareness was created	Post amendment scenario	
New set of laws/rules proposed	Frequent transfers of government functionaries	
International community initiatives started	Logistic support needed	
Institutional mechanism developed	Adverse mind-set	
Policy-based outcome intervention		
Pilot project launched as experiment;		
Identification of WFCL in the form or inventory		
EFP code of conduct prepared		
Identification of proposed provincial legislation on child labour		

Social and Economic Empowerment Group		
Successes	Challenges	Recommendations
Community mobilization / sensitization	Credit denial	Interest free loans / soft loans to be provided to mothers and VT graduates
Mothers organized and trained under this project and enabling them to start their own business	Too high interest rate – haram in Islam	Honorarium during studies and vocational training (ALC)
MFI are mobilized to extend the credit to mothers and VT graduates	Refusal of availing loan facilities	Regular follow up monitoring by the concerned government department
Linkages with employers	Short duration of mothers training and vocational training	
Distribution of starter kits for sale employment	No compensation or honorarium for WFCL	
	Interest free soft loans to be provided to mothers and VT graduates	
	Sustainability	

Annexe 4: Collaboration and coordination with other child centred entities

District Governments – Sukkur & Sahiwal & Employers' Federation of Pakistan (EFP)

Entity	Joint Activities
World Wide Fund for Nature-Pakistan, Better Cotton Initiative Project	Development of two model cotton farming villages in Sukkur that are free of child labour Conducting of CLMS survey in Sukkur district Commitment to stop child labour in cotton farming sector by signing Employers' Code of Conduct
Sukkur Motor Works Association	Commitment to stop child labour in motor vehicle repair shops under its membership by signing Employers' Code of Conduct
Rohri Motor Works Association, Sukkur	Commitment to stop child labour in motor vehicle repair shops under its membership by signing Employers' Code of Conduct
Sukkur Small Traders Association	Commitment to stop child labour in small trading enterprises under its membership by signing Employers' Code of Conduct
Bhatri Osar Smaji Sangat (BOSS)	Commitment to stop child labour in various sectors under its membership by signing Employers' Code of Conduct
Shulatkar Social Welfare Association Panu Akil	Commitment to stop child labour in various sectors under its membership by signing Employers' Code of Conduct
Sindh Islamic Furniture Association Sukkur	Commitment to stop child labour in furniture manufacturing sector under its membership by signing Employers' Code of Conduct
Sahiwal Chambers of commerce & Industry.	Commitment to stop child labour in various sectors under its membership by signing Employers' Code of Conduct
Small Industrial Welfare Association (SIWA)	Commitment to stop child labour in various small & medium industrial sectors under its membership by signing Employers' Code of Conduct
Faleh Kisan Association, Sahiwal	Commitment to stop child labour in agriculture and livestock sectors under its membership by signing Employers' Code of Conduct
Farmers' Association, Chichawatni	Commitment to stop child labour in agriculture and livestock sectors under its membership by signing Employers' Code of Conduct
Furniture Bazar Association, Association	Commitment to stop child labour in furniture manufacturing sector under its membership by signing Employers' Code of Conduct
Central Traders Body, Chichawatni	Commitment to stop child labour in small trading enterprises under its membership by signing Employers' Code of Conduct
Auto Workshop Association, Sahiwal	Commitment to stop child labour in motor vehicle repair shops under its membership by signing Employers' Code of Conduct
Brick kiln Owners Association, Sahiwal	Commitment to stop child labour in brick kiln sector under its membership by signing Employers' Code of Conduct
Malik Hotel and tea stall, Sahiwal	Commitment to stop child labour in hotel and restaurant sector under its membership by signing Employers' Code of Conduct
Umeed Social Welfare Association (USWA)	Created awareness among brick kiln workers to enrol their children in Government Schools and provided school bags and stationery free of cost to their children
Bab-ul-Ilm and National Commission for Human Development	Established educational centres at two brick kiln clusters where Govt. Schools are not available

National Rural Support Programme (NRSP)

Institute of Rural Management (N-IRM)	IRM services were hired for organising various training events in project for community and vocational training. IRM Head Office provided support in terms of training manual developments, monitoring the trainings.
Sindh Rural Support Organization (SRSO)	Linked with mother groups for provision of micro credit and other programme benefits. Their outlet for display and sale of various handicrafts of community was also linked with mother groups and trainees for business promotion.
Micro Finance Institutions	Community had links with other MFIs in Sukkur for microcredit
World Wild Fund (WWF) for Nature	Linked with them for opening up NFEs and linkage with parents in cotton production areas where they already had their project on

	reducing the child labour in cotton production and producing the organic cotton with no pesticides.
Benazir Income Support Programme (BISP)	Some families were linked with this programme for support.
Sukkur / Rohri Motor works Association	Linked with organising various advocacy events and also helped in identification and supporting literacy and NFE component for children linked with them
Sahil (NGO)	Helped in identification of children for project
Media	Various local and provincial newspapers and local media institutions highlighted project programmes and its success.
Azaan Literacy Movement	Initially they provided adult literacy course curricula and training to NFE and ALC teachers
STEVA Training Institute	Their training facility and trainers were used for vocational training for project beneficiaries.
Local Entrepreneurs (Mobile phone workshops, dress outlets , boutiques, beauty salons, others)	These institutions were linked with vocational training graduates for employment and possible work on regular or piece work basis.

Punjab Rural Support Programme (PRSP)

Sahiwal Chamber of Commerce & Industry (SCCI)	Sustained one Vocational Training Centre after completion of its tenure
Faleh Kisan Association, Sahiwal	Established four Adult Literacy and Vocational Training Centres for Ex-WFCL boys/girls aged 15-17 years Assisted to form 2 livestock model workplaces
Farmers' Association, Chchawatni	Established One Adult Literacy and Vocational Training Centres for Ex-WFCL girls aged 15-17 years
Auto Workshop Association, Sahiwal	Established One Adult Literacy and Vocational Training Centres for Ex-WFCL boys aged 15-17 years Assisted to form one auto repair model workshop
Brick kiln Owners Association, Sahiwal	Enrolled 1,200 siblings of brick kiln workers in Govt. Schools Established 3 Adult Literacy Centres at brick kilns
Sanat-iZaar (Women Development Centre) VTI	Signed a MoJ with PRSP and enrolled 1,200 Ex-WFCL girls aged 15-17 years for various vocational skill training courses such as beautician, embroidery and tailoring
Punjab Vocational Training Council (PVTC)	Signed a MoJ with PRSP and enrolled 500 Ex-WFCL boys aged 15-17 years for various vocational skills training courses such as home electrician, AC refrigeration and motor winding

Pakistan Workers' Federation (PWF)

Pakistan WAPDA Hydro Electric Union	Cluster meetings and awareness raising campaign were conducted on child labour and its related issues. Leaflet and pamphlets were distributed at homes during electricity meter readings. The association openly announced its support for the on-going Action Programmes under CAEL II Project
Labour Union of Pakistan Telecommunication Corporation Limited (PTCL)	Cluster meetings and awareness raising campaign were conducted on child labour and its related issues. The association openly announced its support for the on-going Action Programmes under CAEL II Project
Punjab Irrigation workers Union	Cluster meetings and awareness raising campaign were conducted on child labour and its related issues. Leaflet and pamphlets were distributed to farmers. The association openly announced its support for the on-going Action Programmes under CAEL II Project
Rohri Trade Union	Cluster meetings and awareness raising campaign were conducted on child labour and its related issues. The association openly

	announced its support for the on-going Action Programmes under CACL II Project
Municipal and town Committees workers Union	Cluster meetings and awareness raising campaign were conducted on child labour and its related issues. The association openly announced its support for the on-going Action Programmes under CACL II Project
Union of Paramedical Staff	Cluster meetings and awareness raising campaign were conducted on child labour and its related issues. The association openly announced its support for the on-going Action Programmes under CACL II Project
Barrage Colony Welfare Association	Cluster meetings and awareness raising campaign were conducted on child labour and its related issues. The association openly announced its support for the on-going Action Programmes under CACL II Project
Small Industry Union and Site Area Labour Union	Cluster meetings and awareness raising campaign were conducted on child labour and its related issues.
National Bank (NBP) Employees' Association	Cluster meetings and awareness raising campaign were conducted on child labour and its related issues. The association openly announced its support for the on-going Action Programmes under CACL II Project

PCLU-Sindh

Thardeep Rural Development Programme (TRDP)	Financial and logistic support provided for conducting the World Day Against Child Labour event from 2009 to 2012
Save the Children	Renovation expenses provided for PCLU Sindh
SPARC	Two Capacity Building trainings conducted for 35 Inspectors.

Annexe 5: Resource mobilization - Non-project resources leveraged

PCLU Balochistan

Entity which provided resources	Brief description including quantities in US \$ or number of materials/ services if in kind	
Provincial Government	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Office space-three rooms for PCLU @ 145 USD per month including utilities: 20 months x 145 = Provided human resources for PCLU activities: On average Director's & other staff's 20 % time @ 475 USD per month 0.2 x 475 x 20 = Monitoring Rapid Assessment survey activities in two districts = Total = 	USD 2,900 USD 1,900 USD 300 = <u>USD 5,100</u>
Local NGOs	1. NGOs provided the banners for World day against child labour worth of USD 200	
Funds Allotted and Programmes Approved for Sustainability of Project Actions and Replication		
Project proposal (PC 1) was prepared	PCLU prepared a project proposal (PC1) for replicating CACL II model on WFCL at 1 district. However, it is still in the draft form and will be included in the Provincial development working group meeting soon.	

PCLU-Khyber Pakhtunkhwa

Entity which provided resources	Brief description including quantities in US \$ or number of materials/ services if in kind	
Provincial Government	2. Office space-three rooms for PCLU @ 324 USD per month including utilities: 20 months x 324 = 3. Provided human resources for PCLU activities (Director's 20% time @ 416 USD, 2 Research Officers' 25% time @ 648 USD per month) and 2 support staff's 50% time @ 370 USD per month)= Director: 0.2 x 416 x 31.5 = Research officers 2 x 0.25 x 648 x 21 = Support staff 0.5 x 370 x 21 = Total =	USD 6,480 USD 2,621 USD 6,804 <u>USD 3,885</u> <u>USD 19,790</u>
Funds Allotted and Programmes Approved for Sustainability of Project Actions and Replication		
Project proposal (PC 1) was prepared	PCLU prepared a project proposal (PC1) for replicating CACL II model on WFCL at 2 districts – Nowshera and Peshawar; it was approved by the Departmental development working party and the allocation was PKR 16.1 million (USD 160,000). The funds worth of PKR 3.5 million (USD 35,000) were released to Labour Department exclusively for fight against child labour.	

PCLU-Punjab

Entity which provided resources	Brief description including quantities in US \$ or number of materials/ services if in kind	
Provincial Government	<p>4. Office space- two big rooms & one store for PCLU @ 416 USD per month including utilities: 38.5 months x 416 = USD 16,016</p> <p>5. Provided human resources for PCLU activities (Director's 20% time @ 600 USD, 2 Research Officers' 25% time @ 694 USD per month) and 1 support staff's 70% time @ 74 USD per month): Director: 0.2 x 600 x 38.5 = USD 4,620 Research officers 2 x 0.25 x 694 x 38.5 = USD 13,360 Support staff 0.7 x 74 x 38.5 = USD 1,994 Total = <u>USD 35,990</u></p>	
Funds Allotted and Programmes Approved for Sustainability of Project Actions and Replication		
Project proposal (PC 1) was prepared	PCLU prepared a project proposal (PC1) for replicating CACL II model on WFCL at 4 districts – Chakwal, Jhang, Jhelum and Lyyah; The 5-year project worth of PKR 180 million (USD 2 million) was launched in 2012 and is now operational.	

PCLU Sindh

Entity which provided resources	Brief description including quantities in US \$ or number of materials/ services if in kind	
Provincial Government	<p>6. Office space-one big room for PCLU @ 648 USD per month including utilities: 31.5 months x 145 = USD 4,568</p> <p>7. Provided human resources for PCLU activities (Director's 15% time @ USD 1,020 and 2 research officers' 25% time @ 560 USD per month) = Director: 0.15 x 1,020 x 31.5 = USD 4,820 Research officers 2 x 0.25 x 560 x 31.5 = <u>USD 8,820</u> Total = <u>USD 18,208</u></p>	
NGOs (Save the Children)	8. NGOs provided financial resources worth of USD 1,850 for conducting two capacity building workshops for labour inspectors on child labour	
Funds Allotted and Programmes Approved for Sustainability of Project Actions and Replication		
Project proposal (PC 1) was prepared	PCLU prepared a project proposal (PC1) for replicating CACL II model on WFCL at 2 districts – Thatta & Jamshoro. However, it is still in the draft form and will be included in the Provincial development working group meeting soon.	

Employers' Federation of Pakistan (EFP)

Entity which provided resources	Brief description including quantities in US \$ or number of materials/ services if in kind	
District Government	9. Office space at Sahiwal for Field Coordinator for 32 months.	
EFP Board Members	10. Provided human resource time to participate in meetings, monitoring of project activities when visiting project areas.	
Media	The President and other Board Members provided their valuable time at no cost to the project for its implementation. Media at Sukkur & Sahiwal provided its support by publishing news at various occasion by publicising the Action Programme at no cost to the Project.	

Pakistan Workers' Federation (PWF)

Entity which provided resources	Brief description including quantities in US \$ or number of materials/ services if in kind
PWF	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 11. Office space for project interventions at Lahore, Sahiwal and Sukkur for 24 months. 12. Each month Electricity bills. 13. Administrative services and support to its field staff to conduct cluster level meetings and awareness raising rallies and walks. 14. Provided land space to conduct trainings and meetings with other allied trade union partners. 15. Provided human resource time to participate in District Coordination Committee meetings, Provincial Coordination Committee meetings, Experience sharing Workshops, World Day against Child Labour Events, and meetings related to preparation of Employers' Codes of Conduct. 16. Part time services of PWF field workers in all over Pakistan to create awareness among workers on child labour and child rights.

District Government Sukkur

Entity which provided resources	Brief description including quantities in US \$ or number of materials/ services if in kind
District Government, Sukkur	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 17. Provided office space (2 offices), one for ILO Field Office Sukkur (for 48 months), and second for District Child Labour Unit Sukkur at Commissioner's Office, Sukkur: PKR 400,000 (USD 4,000). 18. Part time services of District Officer Labour, Additional Deputy Commissioner (focal point) and Deputy Commissioner, Sukkur: PKR 900,000 (USD 9,000). 19. Provided resources to cover the cost of travel, utilities, and other miscellaneous expenses of the Action Programme: PKR 300,000 (USD 3,000). 20. Provided the services of Janitor: PKR 180,000 (USD 1,800). 21. Provided human resource time to participate in District Coordination Committee meetings, District Education Plan Development meetings, Provincial Coordination Committee meetings, Experience sharing Workshops, World Day against Child Labour Events, meetings related to drafting of Employers' Codes of Conduct, and monitoring of project activities when visiting project areas. 22. District Education Department provided free books to the NFE children aged 05-14 years. 23. District Education Department provided human resource time for the assessment of NFE learners, and provided facilitation in establishing NFEs at Government Schools and the mainstreaming of NFE learners into Govt. Schools. 24. District Education Department provided 12 Head Teachers and 01 Senior Education Officer as Master Trainers to train 2,010 Government Primary School Teachers in Sukkur on child labour issues and creating child-friendly classrooms. 25. Provided 2,010 Government Primary School Teachers' time to participate in the training on child labour issues. 26. Provided human resource time to monitor these training programmes. 27. Provided spaces and other utilities for conducting these training programmes. 28. District Health Department provided free health screening and medication to the targeted children and their families. 29. National Commission for Human Development provided free books to the ALC children aged 15-17 years. 30. Provided 15 key Officials from Department of Education, Literacy, Social Welfare, Labour, District Zakat Office, Pakistan Bait-Ul-Maal and Health, 46 Union Council (UCs) secretaries, 80 Government Primary School Teachers' time for the orientation on Child Labour Monitoring & Referral System (CLMRS). 31. Provided spaces and other utilities for conducting the said training programmes.

Funds Allotted and Programmes Approved for Sustainability of Project Actions and Replication	
District Government, Sukkur	32. Provided PKR 50,000 (USD 600) in FY 2011/12 to District Child Labour Information Centre to expand its activities on child labour.
District Zakat Fund	33. 50 ex-child labourers received grants worth of PKR 90,000 (USD 900) from District Zakat Fund. (each child received PKR 1,800/-).
Benazir Income Support Programme	34. 183 mothers received grants worth of PKR 2,618,000/- (USD 26,180) from Benazir Income Support Programme.

District Government Sahiwal

Entity which provided resources	Brief description including quantities in US \$ or number of materials/ services if in kind
District Government, Sahiwal	<p>35. Office space for ILO Field Office for 48 months: PKR 480,000 (USD 4,800).</p> <p>36. Office space for EFP Field Coordinator for 32 months: PKR 240,000 (USD 2,400).</p> <p>37. Part time services of District Officer Labour and District Coordination Officer, Sahiwal: PKR 900,000 (USD 9,000).</p> <p>38. Official vehicle and its maintenance: PKR 800,000 (USD 8,000).</p> <p>39. Office utilities including, Telephone, fax and electricity bills: PKR 300,000 (USD 3,000).</p> <p>40. Provided land space to conduct trainings and meetings for Govt. Officials.</p> <p>41. Provided security to international staff.</p> <p>42. Provided human resource time to participate in District Coordination Committee meetings, District Education Plan Development meetings, Provincial Coordination Committee meetings, Experience sharing Workshops, World Day against Child Labour Events, meetings related to drafting of Employers' Codes of Conduct, and monitoring of project activities when visiting project areas.</p> <p>43. District Education Office provided 20 Head Teachers and 01 Senior Education Officer as Master Trainers to train Government Primary School Teachers in Sahiwal on child labour issues and creating child-friendly classrooms.</p> <p>44. Provided 1,980 Government Primary School Teachers' time to participate in the training on child labour issues.</p> <p>45. Arranged the services of 2,200 volunteers to collect the data from 89 Union Councils of Sahiwal for CLMS (out of school and working children).</p> <p>46. Provided spaces in Govt. Schools and Union Council Offices to conduct training programmes for volunteers.</p> <p>47. Establishment and operation of DCLU.</p>
Funds Allotted and Programmes Approved for Sustainability of Project Actions and Replication	
Vocational Training conducted for additional 150 Ex-WFCL children (100 girls + 50 boys)	<p>48. PKR. 450,000 (USD 4,500) - Fees of literacy courses, books, stationery and material for training.</p> <p>49. PKR 180,000 (USD 1,800) - 3 months' honoraria for teachers and instructors for conducting courses.</p>
Sahiwal Training Institute (STI) established to provide vocational skills training to out-of-school/working children	50. Premises, infrastructure, equipment and material, furniture, core staff and utilities worth PKR. 10 million (USD 100,000).

National Rural Support Programme (NRSP)

Entity which provided resources	Brief description including quantities in US \$ or number of materials/ services if in kind
National Commission for Human Development (NCHD)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Provided free Books for ALC learners.
Department of Education	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Provided free books for NFE learners. • Assessment of NFE learners. • Facilitation in establishing NFEs at Government Schools and the mainstreaming of NFE learners at Government Schools.
Department of Health	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Provided free health screening and medication to the targeted children and their families.
NRSP Support from Head Office (HO) / Regional Office	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • HO support cost in terms of GM, Programme Manager SSS, Finance, MER and other sections: PKR 5.73 million (USD 57,300). • Regional office Rahim Yar Khan i.e. RGM, DPO, finance, Admin, vehicles etc.: PKR 5 million (USD 50,000). • NRSP also provided 2 motorbikes, 6 computers, 5 UPS, 4 computer printers, 1 camera, and office furniture. • UCBPRP Project implemented by NRSP, contributed in terms of office rent being used and allied support in same office. They also provided some office support staff costs: PKR 2.23 million (USD 22,300).
Funds Allotted and Programmes Approved for Sustainability of Project Actions and Replication	
Sindh Rural Support Organization (SRSO), and other Micro Finance Institutions	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Provided microfinance to mother groups and also held meetings (206 family members received micro-credit support worth of PKR 4,519,500/- (USD 45,195).

Punjab Rural Support Programme (PRSP)

Funds Allotted and Programmes Approved for Sustainability of Project Actions and Replication	
District Health Department	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Provided free Health Screening and medication to the targeted children and their families
District Education Department	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Provided free books for NFE learners • Provided the spaces for NFE and ALCs in Govt. School premises including furniture, electricity, white/black boards and infrastructure • Services of experts for quarterly assessment of the children during their examination and monitoring • Mainstreaming of the WFCL children in Govt. Primary Schools
PRSP Support from Head Office / Regional Office	<p>HO support cost in terms RGM/Programme Coordinator (For back and forth coordination among PRSP, ILO and other stakeholders) plus other services include:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 1 vehicle; • 2 motorbikes; • 6 computers; • 5 UPS; • 4 computer printers; <p>The total contribution is estimated at PKR. 4.4 million (USD 44,000).</p>

Funds Allotted and Programmes Approved for Sustainability of Project Actions and Replication	
Community Primary Schools	5 Non Formal Educational Centres (NFE) were sustained and converted into Community Primary Schools (CPS). Now it will work as formal schools under the financial assistance of PRSP. PKR. 50,000 per month (USD 500 per month).
Micro Credit Facility	Linked the targeted children's families with its core project to provide micro credit facility to mother groups. 1,130 families received micro credit worth of PKR 11.6 million (USD 116,030).

Centre for Improvement of Working Conditions and Environment (CIWCE)

Entity which provided resources	Brief description including quantities in US \$ or number of materials/ services if in kind
Centre for Improvement of Working Conditions and Environment (CIWCE)	<p>51. Office space for 36.5 months: PKR 730,000 (USD 7,300).</p> <p>52. Vehicle, driver, fuel & maintenance: PKR 1,44,000 (USD 14,400).</p> <p>53. Provided security to international staff.</p> <p>54. Provided human resource time to participate in District Coordination Committee meetings, Provincial Coordination Committee meetings, Experience sharing Workshops, World Day against Child Labour Events, meetings related to drafting of Employers' Codes of Conduct, and monitoring of project activities when visiting project areas.</p>

Annexe 6: Key mid-term recommendations and relevant actions undertaken

(To be edited in next version of report)

Key Recommendation (note, the evaluator has summarised the recommendations)	Brief summary of steps undertaken/or reasoning for not addressing recommendation
1) With the changes envisaged by the devolution of power from federal to provincial levels, the possible future role of the federal government in implementing the NPPA-CCL needs to be reconsidered and discussed.	Project could not do much as its focus shifted to province as a matter of urgency, following the devolution in July 2012. In fact, project had only one & half years to address long list of assistance (law reforms, drafting CL policy, RA surveys, etc.) sought by all 4 provinces. Since the devolution, Federal Ministry has been confined to represent the country in the Intl. Labour Conference and to send various reports on the implementation of ratified conventions to the Expert Committee. The ILO-Islamabad office has been assisting both federal and provincial governments to streamline the process of information flow (from province to federal and vice versa) with regard to reporting to the ILC. Federal Ministry also now deals with inter-provincial coordination.
2) Go through the project Logical Framework again in light of changing responsibilities due to the 18 th Amendment process and review activities along with indicators specific to envisaged outcomes.	Project Log Frame has been revised with inputs from IPEC HQ, EU and national stakeholders, in particular the Provincial Labour Departments. The revised Log Frame was approved by the PSC in its 9 th meeting on 07 Feb. 12.
3) Due to the on-going process under the 18 th Amendment, many questions remain regarding devolving tasks of the Ministry of Labour and Manpower, these questions will also affect the role and responsibilities of the FCLU and need close follow-up. It is possible that AP for the FCLU needs revision and adjustment.	Ministry of Overseas Pakistanis & Human Resource Development (MOHRD) was entrusted the responsibility in dealing with affairs related to the ILO at federal level in Oct. 11. Accordingly, 8 th PSC meeting was convened on 29 Nov. 11, 9 th meeting on 07 Feb. 12. and 10 th meeting on 29 Jan. 2013 (only PSC meeting held after devolution). The role of FCLU was identified as the coordinating entity for reporting on obligations relating to the international labour standards. An action programme to support FCLU is yet to be prepared upon the approval of the forthcoming Project Revision. Currently all PCLU APs are being revised in consultation with the respective Labour Departments. The FCLU action programme was never prepared as there was no official exclusively assigned for the purpose. In addition, the role of FCLU was unclear to many MoHRD officials who joined the ministry later. In the meantime, all 4 PCLU Action Programmes were revised as per the revised log frame and made effective from 01 April 2013.
4) At national level, the FCLU Officer, in collaboration with MoLM, needs to establish the linkages with PCLUs to report progress on combating the WFCL. Monitor compliance of provincial child labour legislation with the national child labour policy.	The FCLU was abolished so this component was no longer relevant. FCLU becomes rather redundant as Ministry's ILS compliance monitoring has been broader and not only limited to child labour.
5) To strengthen PCLUs to take over increased responsibilities under the devolution process, more capacity building and input may be necessary from ILO. The newly appointed communication officer could take over the role of liaising and broadening the network between the four PCLUs and supporting the linkages between PCLUs and federal CLU.	The appointed Programme Officer (Mass Communication) has implemented support to provincial and district-level institutions and partner organizations in designing awareness material and implementing public awareness campaigns in line with the project's Communication and Advocacy Strategy (CAS). In addition, a number of activities will be carried out nation-wide directly by the project to raise the visibility, with the involvement of stakeholders at all levels. The additional activities include national photo competition, production of research-based visual products in collaboration with university media and mass communication departments, production of song album on child labour and production of wide range of awareness material. Liaison among the PCLUs with regard to the capacity building and institutional strengthening has been carried out by the Chief Technical Adviser and Senior Programme Officer. The drafting of provincial law on children's employment, its rules, the provincial lists of hazardous child labour sectors and the conducting of rapid assessment surveys in no. of districts (enhancement of CL knowledge base) are a few of the activities for which the technical assistance and guidance was provided.

Key Recommendation (note, the evaluator has summarised the recommendations)	Brief summary of steps undertaken/or reasoning for not addressing recommendation
<p>6) Project needs to address: 1) hazardous and illegal forms of child labour need to involve law enforcement agencies, e.g. police, prosecution, through labour inspection, and 2) linkages to existing child protection systems.</p>	<p>Thematic training on OSH and CLMS for PCLU and district labour officials was held in Sep. '11. The Child Labour Monitoring System was established in the entire Sahiwal and Sukkur districts. As a part of this exercise, close linkages have been developed with the Provincial Child Protection Bureaus and District Child Protection Cells under the Social Welfare Departments. Currently the Social Welfare Department is an active member of PCC-CL and DCC-CL. However, Police could not be included in none of these committees as the convenors (Provincial Labour Secretaries and DCOs) were of the view that labour inspectorate has enough power and legal authority to deal with the child labour issue. It was also considered that such invitation should be sent through the respective home ministry/internal affairs departments and it would be difficult to materialize. Provincial governments were assisted in drafting new legislation to prohibit hazardous child labour (law, rules and provincial HCL list) and bring these in conformity with the ILO Conventions.</p>
<p>7) The National Child Labour Survey is a priority concern of all stakeholders. ILO, FBS and EU are all keen to move forth. FBS assured the MTR in the meeting held on 6th May that NCLS can be started. The FBS representative reiterated this at the stakeholders' debriefing on 16th May. All modalities should be immediately addressed, and NCLS, as an important national need, should start as soon as possible.</p>	<p>http://tribune.com.pk/story/633994/addressing-abuse-child-protection-policy-draft-in-final-review-stage/</p> <p>The NCLS was initially planned to commence in 2009. The sample design for the survey was expected to be based on the National Population Census which was earlier scheduled to be conducted in 2008. However, due to the frequent postponement of the National Census the alternative strategy for conducting the Second NCLS was approved by the PSC in its 7th meeting held on 20 Jan. 11. Accordingly, technical specialist from SIMPOC (IPEC HQ) conducted two missions to Pakistan in 2011 and finalized the main parameters for the survey, which were agreed by the technical experts from the FBS. ILO then sent a formal letter to FBS on 26 Jul. 11 indicating the financial resources, with the understanding that the methodology and timing of the survey had already been agreed between the parties.</p> <p>FBS took its time to respond to the letter and made a counter proposal (on 21 Sep. 11) with a changed sample design, size and implementation strategy. ILO pointed out the deviations in another letter of 04 Oct. 11. A follow-up meeting was held in the office of the DG FBS in which FBS showed its inability to conduct the survey on the previously agreed timeframe because of two reasons- (i) FBS Sample Frame was being updated and (ii) FBS was going to be merged with the Population and Agriculture Census Organizations in near future.</p> <p>ILO held yet another meeting with the Secretary Statistics Division on 18 Oct. 11 and as a follow-up to this meeting FBS proposed, through a letter of 27 Oct. 11, to conduct the survey with reduced scope (field implementation and data collection reduced to six months instead of one full year). The proposal was not acceptable to ILO on the grounds that it would greatly compromise the quality and the results of the survey. Thus the issue was referred to the PSC for decision. The PSC held its deliberations in two consecutive meetings on 29 Nov. 11 and 07 Feb. 12 but could not convince the FBS to conduct the survey. Hence, with the mutual agreement of all key stakeholders (MOHRD, EU, Employers and Workers representatives and the provincial DOLs) it was decided to cancel the survey and reallocate the resources to other project activities.</p> <p>The AP for Balochistan commenced on 01 Aug. '11. A PCC-CL meeting was held on 30 Jul. '11. The Secretary of Labour participated in a training course held at the ITC Turin in Oct. '11. Yet, the implementation of PCLU action programme was not started until April 2013 by citing various reasons such as security and lack of human resources. Later on the APSO was revised by reducing its allocation and limiting its scope. The revised AP was then implemented by the PCLU-Balochistan successfully as the new Director of Labour (in-Charge of PCLU) was very committed and took extra responsibility to accomplish all activities. It completed RS surveys in 2 districts- Quetta & Loralai, conducted the training programmes on CL for labour inspectors, processed the new provincial law for its enactment, prepared the rules and HCL list to be included in the law and submitted a PC-1 for securing provincial development</p>
<p>8) The Action Programme for Balochistan should be initiated with as much speed as possible.</p>	

Key Recommendation (note, the evaluator has summarised the recommendations)	Brief summary of steps undertaken/or reasoning for not addressing recommendation
9) Submit a revised budget allocation to the EC based on the review of the LFM regarding outcome indicators, devolution plans, NCLS implementation, and the Balochistan actions.	funds for taking action against CL. A request for Project revision along with its revised budget allocations was submitted to EU in May 2012. This revision accommodated the changes made to LFM, post devolution demand for interventions at provincial level, cancellation of NCLS at federal level and reallocation of funds to new activities. The second amendment request was approved by the EU in February 2013 and the addendum to the Contribution Agreement was signed in March 2013.
10) The adaptation of the Child Labour Monitoring and Referral System has to be developed and implemented within the remaining project period.	Developed and implemented. The project has taken steps to maintain the regularity (quarterly) of filling in monitoring forms and analysing data under the DBMR system. A consultant firm was hired to develop software to produce reports on reduction of working hours & hazards at workplace, children's performance at NFE, literacy & VT, economic status achieved by the families through micro credit, etc.
11) ILO internal management may need a review of the internal lines of reporting to enable timely preparation of updated information prior to future evaluation missions.	Project reviewed and strengthened its internal operational mechanism (including reporting) in order to respond to requests in a timely and efficient way.
12) The Project Officers based at the two project model districts should prepare separate more analytical reports, including guidance, instead of reproducing the reports submitted by the partner NGOs. The project should assist in linking the district model experience to PCLUs.	As per the instructions of Project Management, two POs conducted bi-weekly review meetings at the districts, along with NGOs conducted various field monitoring visits, sent progress reports with analysis reports to the CTA on monthly basis. During the last 6 months, this frequency has been increased to weekly basis. These reports would present the project achievements with respect to outcomes (and changes that have been taken place due to project interventions) rather than the project targets. A direct reporting mechanism between PCLUs and project districts, in Punjab and Sindh, has already been established. The DCO and the District Labour Officer were called upon to PCC meetings regularly by the Provincial Labour Secretary to provide the progress at the district level. In addition, Provincial Labour Minister (at least twice), Labour Secretary (at least 4 times) and the Director Labour (several times) visited the pilot districts in order to review the progress at the grass-roots level. Probably, such visits, particular by the Punjab higher officials and policy makers had led to the launching of its own project to replicate the CACL II district model approach.
13) Both PCLUs of Balochistan as well as of NWFP have the unique opportunity to learn from existing experience in Punjab and Sindh. This inter-provincial learning process and exchange of experience should be supported by ILO.	The consultant who had provided her services for the training and report writing assistance to the rapid assessment surveys in Punjab was later assigned to do the same for KPK and Balochistan. During the DWCP review workshops, PSC meetings, provincial experience sharing workshops and other inter-provincial workshops these learning and experiences were shared at a greater scale. The CACL II Project Management kept all PCLUs in the same loop during the implementation of similar activities that had not only expedited the process but also enhanced the quality of products. KPK and Balochistan are well aware of the results of Sukkur and Sahawal as these PCLU officials got enormous opportunities to share their experiences within the country as well as during training programmes at ITC, Turin.
14) Other Provincial Governments and PCLUs should consider establishing a link to a research and/or training institution that could facilitate and perpetuate the mechanism between different sectors, stakeholders and levels of intervention for reducing WFCL.	This issue has been addressed successfully during the involvement of research institutions, NGOs and universities for the rapid assessment surveys conducted in each province. It was also done to a greater extent while preparing the individual provincial lists of hazardous sectors.

Key Recommendation (note, the evaluator has summarised the recommendations)	Brief summary of steps undertaken/or reasoning for not addressing recommendation
15) Co-ordination should be enhanced with district Zakat and Bait-ul-Mal, introducing income generation and micro-credit as well as skills training and mainstreaming child workers in education to underpin the process of withdrawing them from harmful work.	It was very difficult to create these linkages (as envisaged in the original log frame) mainly due to the fact that these institutions have been operating differently than the usual government departments at the district level. For example, the beneficiaries for Zakat funds are determined by the district level religious institutions that have no formal relationship with Deputy Commissioner or District Coordination Officer. Bait-ul-Maal funds are allocated as per the decisions made at the federal level. During the revision of the log frame these activities and targets were therefore removed. However, it was an exceptional achievement made by the NRSP and District Government Sukkur to secure PKR 90,000 from district Zakat fund for the ex-child labourers in Sukkur.
16) DCCs require a higher frequency of meeting - at least two-monthly, if needed in sub-committees. The overall DCC meetings could concentrate more on issues or constraints and come up with immediate solutions to any obstacle occurring.	DDC met at least thrice per year, sometimes even more when the activities were in full swing. To know exactly how thoroughly DDCs have solved the issues and constraints and come up with quick and appropriate solutions, please refer to the 6 th , 7 th , 8 th , 9 th and 10 th meetings minutes of the DCCs held in Sukkur and Sahiwal.
17) The MTR recommends including EDO Agriculture on the DCC.	Not only EDO Agriculture was included in the DCC, the Agriculture Extension Assistants at each UC took part voluntarily in the data collection of out-of-school/working children under the CLMS.
18) It is recommended to give the target groups, adults and child labourers of the CACL-II project a voice and representation at the field level, e.g. the DCC.	It was done occasionally at the DCC meetings as well as at media interactions held at Sukkur and Sahiwal. The children, parents and community leaders were apart of all events including WDACL, signing of MOUs with employers, signing of Codes of Conduct, etc.
19) Education initiatives under the project must be strengthened based on the outcome of the educational study that is presently under way. The MTR witnessed lack of formal/mainstream educational facilities in the areas visited.	The preparation of 3-year District Education Plan and its implementation has changed this situation dramatically. A number of non-functional schools (used as cow sheds or Roads Dept. stores) were converted into functional schools in Sukkur with the initiative taken by the DCC and Implementing Partners. The Executive District Officer-education took action against non-attending teachers as well. Similarly, there was a programme launched at Sahiwal to qualify schools as "child friendly". A criteria was developed for this qualification with the hand outs that were circulated among teachers of each school. This was an activity envisaged in the Education Plan of Sahiwal.
20) More vigorous and effective efforts are required at the district level by all partners towards a reduction in working hours of the children. District DoL, employers and workers have to play a more pro-active role in their collaboration to achieve this purpose.	Among many focussed & integrated interventions, the conducting of OSH training by CIWCE; signing of employers' Code of Conduct by the 16 employer associations; development of 30 model workplaces in several sectors; mobilizing the parents to manage their current income effectively and further increase their income through micro finance and other income generation means; and training about 5,000 primary school teachers have contributed immensely to the raising of awareness about child labour and overall withdrawal, prevention and protection of children from hazardous child labour.

Annexe 7: Evaluation itinerary

Field Mission Programme

Time Frame	Activities	Remarks
First Mission (23 – 27 September 2013)		
23 Sep. Monday	02:30	Arrival in Islamabad by EY 231
	10:00-11:00	Briefing meeting with ILO Director (TBC)
	11:00-13:00	Meeting with CACL II staff; CTA will join a Skype chat (as he is on R&R) in order to brief about project in detail.
	14:00-15:00	Meeting with CACL II staff continues....
	15:00-16:30	Meeting with EU officials
24-27 Sep.	Skype chat with Sub-regional Specialist on Child Labour, New Delhi	
	Skype chat with Alexia/Peter, IPEC/EIA, Geneva	
	Meetings with Ms. Mahe-Nau Haider, Consultant (Enabling Environment sub-study)	
	Meetings with Mr. Ali Raza Kazmi, Semiotics Consultants Pvt. Ltd. and team (Livelihood sub-study)	
	Meeting Federal Secretary, Ministry of Human Resource Development and Federal Child Labour Unit officials	
28 Sep. Saturday	Leave Islamabad by EY232	Guest House will drop off at airport
Second Mission (30 October – 19 November 2013)		
30 Oct. Wednesday	02:20	Arrival in Islamabad by QR 614
30 Oct.	Briefing from CACL II team on project activities and logistical arrangements for the field visits; Preparation for field visits	
31 Oct.	Travel to Peshawar; Meeting with PCLU staff, PCC, Secretary Labour, Peshawar University, research institutions; Travel back to Islamabad	
01 Nov.	Interaction with CTA	
02 Nov. Saturday	14:00 – 16:00	Flight PK 691 to Sukkur
	17:00 – 19:00	Briefing at NRSP Office
03-05 Nov.	Interactions with beneficiaries, stakeholders and partners (District Government, NRSP, District Coordination Committee, N-IRM and WWF-Pakistan) at Sukkur and field visits; travel to Karachi (evening flight PK 541 at 21:00 hrs.)	
	Meeting with Provincial Child Labour Unit (PCLU)-Sindh officials, Secretary-Labour, Sindh and Provincial	
06 Nov.		(night at Karachi)

Time Frame	Activities	Remarks
	Coordination Committee members	
07 Nov.	Meeting with Employers' Federation of Pakistan (EFP) and Greenwich University (Implementing Partners)	(night at Karachi)
08 Nov. Friday	Travel to Lahore (morning flight PK 302 at 08:00 hrs.) and proceed to Sahiwal (by road)	(night at Sahiwal)
09-12 Nov.	Interactions with beneficiaries, stakeholders and partners (District Government, PRSP, Training Institutions) at Sahiwal and field visits. Travel to Lahore by road in the evening;	(nights at Sahiwal/Lahore)
13-14 Nov.	Meeting with PCLU-Punjab officials, Secretary Labour-Punjab, Centre for Improvement of Working Conditions and Environment (CIWCE), Lahore College for Women University (implementing partners), and staff of Punjab Govt. funded Combating WFCL project; Travel to Islamabad by PK 656 at 22:00 hrs.	Guest House will pick up from airport (nights at Lahore/Islamabad)
15-17 Nov.	Preparing for stakeholders' workshop and travel to Lahore on 17 Nov. afternoon by PK 587 at 15:25 hrs.	(nights at Islamabad/Lahore)
18 Nov.	Stakeholders' Workshop; Return to Islamabad by PK 656 at 22:00 hrs.	(night at Islamabad)
19 Nov.	Leaving Islamabad by QR 615 at 03:55 a.m.	

Field Mission Programme – Sukkur

Time Frame	Activities	Remarks
02 Nov. Saturday		
16:00	Arrival at Sukkur	
03 Nov. Sunday		
08:00-09:15		Travel to Ali Sher Katpar
09:15-10:15	Meeting with VT Graduate Girls	Ali SherKatpar
10:15-11:15	Meeting with Mothers	Ali SherKatpar
11:15-12:15	Meeting with NFE Children mainstreamed at Government School	Ali SherKatpar
12:15-13:00	Travel Time	Travel to Village Muhammad Buksh Maisro
13:00-13:45	Lunch	Panu Aqil
13:45-14:45	Meeting with VT Graduate Boys (Motor Cycle Repair Workshop)	Village Muhammad Buksh Maisro, PanuAqil
14:45-15:15	Travel Time	Travel to Village Maisro
15:15-15:45	Meeting with VT Graduate Boy (Mobile Repairing Workshop)	Village Maisro, PanuAqil
15:45-16:30	Travel Time	NRSP Office
16:30-18:00	Field Visit (OSH Interventions)	Model Workshops developed by CIWCE
18:00-19:00	Meeting with Sukkur Motor Works Association	Sukkur Motor Works Association Office
04 Nov. Monday		
08:00-09:00	Meeting with IRM (VT trainers)	NRSP Office
09:00-09:30	Meeting with PWF Representative	PWF Office
10:30-11:00	Courtesy Call to DC	DC Office
11:00-13:00	DCC Meeting	DC Office
13:00-13:30	Lunch	DCO Office

Time Frame	Activities	Remarks
13:45-14:20	Meeting with AD Labour/ILO Focal Person	DCO Office
14:30-15:30	Meeting with District Education Plan Committee members	DO Literacy Office
16:00-17:00	Meeting with VT Graduates	VT Graduate Girls, at Beauty Parlour–AcherGitti
17:20-18:30	Meeting with Mothers	Mother's General Store, New Pind& along with others
05 Nov. Tuesday		
08:30-09:45	Meeting with Master Trainers	Government Girls School
10:00-11:00	Meeting with NFE Children	Government School at New Pind
11:15-12:15	Meeting with NFE Children	Government School at New Goth
12:30-13:30	Meeting with WWF	WWF Office
13:45-14:45	Lunch	NRSP Office
14:45-16:45	Meeting with NRSP staff	NRSP Office
16:45-17:45	Meeting with Ashfaq Ahmad, Programme Officer, CACL II	CACL II Field Office at Commissioners' Office/NRSP Office
17:45-19:15	Debriefing	NRSP Office
20:00	Departure to Karachi	

Field Mission Programme- Karachi

Time Frame	Activities
November 6, 2013	
09:00-09:30	Travel to EFP Headquarter
09:30-11:30	Meeting with Saud Alam, AP Coordinator and AP staff and UR Usmani, Management Committee member concerned with child labour theme
11:30-12:00	Travel to PCLU-Sindh
12:00-1500	Meeting with PCLU staff
15:00-16:00	Meeting with PILER research team
16:30	Arrival at the guest house
November 7, 2013	
07:30-10:30	Travel to University Sindh, Jamshoro
10:30-11:30	Faculty and students of Department of Media and Mass Communication, University of Jamshoro
12:30-16:30	Travel back to Karachi
November 8, 2013	Departure to Lahore to continue for Sahiwal by road

Field Visit Sahiwal

Combating Abusive Child Labour II Project - Independent Extended Final Evaluation - Ms. Mei Zegers, Team Leader and Ms. Mahjabeen Qazi, National Consultant - 8-12 Nov 2013	
Friday 8 Nov 2013 (DAY 1)	
1030	Travel from Lahore to Sahiwal by road (travel time 3 hrs.)
1330	Check in Sahiwal Club Guest House
●	1330 to 1445 Lunch & Prayer Break at Sahiwal Club
1450	Departure from Sahiwal Club to DCLU (travel time 5 minutes)
1500-1545	Visit DCLU Sahiwal and use of DBMR software Meeting with Syed Muhammad Haider, District Officer Labour (DOL) / Focal Person/Coordinator-Dist. Govt. Action Programme, Sahiwal, at DCLU, Sahiwal (Individual meeting)
1545-1645	Meeting with representatives of Sahiwal Chamber of Commerce & Industry and members of Furniture Association, and Small Industrial Welfare Association Sahiwal (All have signed MOU/Codes of Conduct with EFP) at DCLU (group meeting)
1650-1700	Departure from DCLU to DCO Camp Office (travel time 10 minutes)
1700-1800	Meeting with Dr. Sajid Mehmood Chouhan, District Coordination Officer (DCO), at DCO Camp office, Sahiwal (Individual meeting)
1800	End of Day-1; back to Club guest house
Saturday 9 Nov 2013 (DAY-2) [Due to Iqbal Day 9 th Nov is a National Holiday. All schools and offices would be closed]	
0900-1100	Meeting with Mr. Abdul Mateen Janjua, Programme Officer ILO EC CACL-II Project, Sahiwal at ILO Field Unit Office, located at DOL, Sahiwal (Individual meeting)
1100-1225	Visit to a livestock & welding model who signed MoU/Codes of Conduct with EFP (Individual meeting)
●	1230-1330 Back to Club Guest House and Lunch & prayer Break
1330-1340	Departure to DCLU (travel time 10 min)
1345-1430	Meeting with Farmers' Welfare, Brick-kiln Owner's Association and SIWA who have signed MoUs/Codes of Conduct with EFP at DCLU (group meeting)
1430-1530	Meeting with a group of master trainers at DCLU (group meeting)
1530-1700	2 nd meeting with DCO sb
1700	End of Day-2; back to Club guest house
Sunday 10 Nov 2013 (DAY-3)	
1000-1030	Departure for Project Beneficiaries' meeting in rural areas (travel time 30 min)
1030-1130	Meeting with NFE centre teachers and Ex-WFCL children (5-14 years) who were mainstreamed into Govt. Schools at village 76/5-R (group meeting)
1130-1140	Departure to next village travel time 10 min
1140-1240	Meeting with beneficiaries of Business Management Skills Training (BMST), sewing training, and different VT graduates at village 74/4-R (group meeting)
●	1240-1340 Lunch & prayer Break (Lunch could be made at view hotel near to these localities)
1340-1410	Departure to next village (travel time 30 min)
1410-1510	Meeting with Adult Literacy centre teachers and Ex-WFCL children (15-17 years) who received vocational training under project 74/5-L (group meeting)
1510-1545	Departure to next village (travel time 35 min)
1545-1645	Meeting with mother group, beneficiaries of Micro Credit Finance (MCF) and Livestock Management Skills Training (LMST) at village 62/5-L (group meeting)
1645-1710	Departure to Ghousia Colony (25 min drive)
1710-1755	Meeting with Humera Ilim Deen, a mainstreamed girl (ex-domestic CL) (Individual meeting)
1800	Back to Club guest house; end of Day-3

Combating Abusive Child Labour II Project - Independent Extended Final Evaluation - Ms. Mei Zegers, Team Leader and Ms. Mahjabeen Qazi, National Consultant - 8-12 Nov 2013	
Monday 11 Nov 2013 (DAY-4)	
0830	Departure to Kameer [Kameer is 25 km away from Sahiwal city in south west side 30 min drive]
0915-1015	Visit to a vocational lab at GGHS, Kameer 120/9-L, Sahiwal and meeting with successful learners of stitching and tailoring class. (Group meeting)
1020-1120	Meeting with volunteers of Child Labour Monitoring System (CLMS) at GGHS, Kameer 120/9-L, Sahiwal (group meeting) - Lady Health Workers / Lady Health Volunteers - Primary school teachers and agriculture field staff - Secretaries of Union Councils
1130-1200	Back to Sahiwal City at Club Guest house Sahiwal
1200-1330	Lunch & Prayer Break at Sahiwal Club
1340-1350	departure to DCO office (5 min drive)
1400-1530	Meeting of District Coordination Committee on CL at DCO meeting room
1540-1550	Departure to Sahiwal Training Institute (travel time 10 min)
1550-1630	Visit to STI (Vocational training institute established by DCO Sahiwal to sustain the VT programme for boys 15-17 years of ILO Project, Sahiwal) (visit with DCO)
1635-1645	Departure for education complex (10 min drive)
1645-1730	Meeting with EDO Education at District Education Complex, Sahiwal (Individual meeting)
1730	Any other meeting if required / End of Day-4
Tuesday 12 Nov 2013 (DAY-5)	
0900-1100	Meeting with Project Director/Regional General Manager PRSP and Project Manager PRSP Action Programme at PRSP Field Office 31W, Fared Town Sahiwal (group meeting)
1100	Departure to Lahore

Field Mission Programme-Lahore

Time	Activities
November 12, 2013	
13:30-3:30	Meeting with the faculty members of Media and Mass Communication Department, Lahore College for women, University
4:00-5:30	Meeting with the Punjab Govt-funded WFCL-Project staff
November 13, 2013	
08:30-12:00	Meeting with the PCLU and CIWCE staff including presentations plus display of PCLU products and demonstration of innovations
12:00-1300	Lunch
13:30-1530	Meeting with the Director General Labour and Mr. Hasnat
15:30-1600	Travel back to guest house
1800:1930	Meeting with Mr. Mubeen Iahi, EX ILO focal person, Government Sukkur
November 14, 2013	
07:15	Departure to Islamabad by PK 386 at 09:05 am

Annexe 8: List of interviewees

(some additional interviews that took place in September 2013, and at the end of the second field mission still need to be added in a next version

List of stakeholder met during final evaluation mission October 31-November 18, 2013							
Date	Name	Male	Female	Organization/name of the community	Job Title	Telephone number	Email (if available)
District- Sukkur							
03-11-2013	Vocational training boy-Motor Repairing	✓		Village M Byliss Maisro-Panu Aqil	Child		
03-11-2013	Vocational training boy-Mobile Repairing	✓		Maisro Taluka- Panu Aqil	Child		
03-11-2013	Javed Ahmed	✓		CICWE			
03-11-2013	Munir Ali	✓		Employer-Workshop road, Near railway road			
03-11-2013	7 ALC members	7		Village Ali Sher Katpar			
03-11-2013	School Management Committee-Mothers group	7	18	Village Ali Sher Katpar	Rural leader and parents		
03-11-2013	NFE Students	3	4	Village Ali Sher Katpar	Children		
03-11-2013	NFE Students	3	36	Village Ali Sher Katpar	Children		
03-11-2013	Nasreen Zaheer Hussain		✓	Village Ali Sher Katpar	NFE Teacher		
04-11-2013	Habib Urehman	✓		IRM	Finance and Admin officer	03003151913	viemehran@gmail.com
04-11-2013	Syed Zahid Hussain Shah	✓		Pakistan Workers Federation (PWF)	President-Focal Person	03009316838	
04-11-2013	Shujaat Ali Ghumro	✓		PWF	Member	03009314025	
04-11-2013	Mazhar Hussain Ansari	✓		PWF	Vice president	03337160772	
04-11-2013	Mohammad Juman Bhutto	✓		PWF	Member	03003112152	
04-11-2013	Ghulam Nabi Soomro	✓		PWF	member	03337174736	
04-11-2013	Shahzad Taeeen	✓		District Government	Deputy Commissioner		
04-11-2013	Anjad Iqbal Khan	✓		NRSP	Regional General Manager	03033331233	amjadnrspp@hotmail.com
04-11-2013	Jamil Ahmed Khan	✓		NRSP	Project Manager –NRSP CACL II		
04-11-2013	M. Abdullah Avais	✓		NRSP	Program officer-E&E	03053681717	avaismrsp@gmail.com
04-11-2013	Nazir Ahmed Meer	✓		WWF-P	Focal Person	0333-2507328	Nazeer_meer@yahoo.com
04-11-2013	Dr. Kareem Baloch	✓		Health Department	THO	0333-7105115	karimbaloch@yahoo.com
04-11-2013	Muhammad Ismail Somro	✓		Agriculture Extension Directorate	To coordinate with the district offices and monitoring and supervising	071-9310881	
04-11-2013	Syed Asif Shah	✓		Information Department	Deputy Director	071-5627750	infosukkol@gmail.com
04-11-2013	Dr. A Hayee Khoro	✓		District Health Office	DDO-P&D	08009317519	drhayeekhoro@yahoo.com
04-11-2013	Naveed Ali Abro	✓		Pakistan Bait Ul Maal	Junior Clerk	0312-3532028	Naveed_iaan7@yahoo.com
04-11-2013	Liaqat Ali Khan	✓		WWF-P; Cotton Growing community	Manager	03327313936	lakham@wwf.org.pk
04-11-2013	S. Zahid Hussain	✓		PWF		03009316838	
04-11-2013	Syed Naseer Hussain Shah	✓		Social Welfare		03337130617	Naseershah2010@gmail.com

List of stakeholder met during final evaluation mission October 31-November 18, 2013							
Date	Name	Male	Female	Organization/Name of the community	Job Title	Telephone number	Email (if available)
04-11-2013	Shafi M Khoro	✓		Education Department	DOE	03003316177	
	Ghulam Mujtaba Dayo	✓		Education Department	DOE Literacy	03009314462	
	Naeem Ahmed	✓		Labour Department	AD-Labour	03337103120	
04-11-2013	Shafique Rehman	✓		Information Department	Director Information	03002426032	
04-11-2013	Allah Rakhio Jatoi	✓		Education and Literacy department	Deputy Director-Schools		
04-11-2013	Ms. Afab Kousar	✓		Education and Literacy department	ADO (Education)	034380061640	
04-11-2013	Mohammad Naseer Shah	✓		Education and Literacy department	Head Master Govt. Modern High School	03213102002	
04-11-2013	3 trainees of VT (beautician)		03	Sukkur			
04-11-2013	VT (General Store)		✓	Sukkur			
05-11-2013	Mrs. Shahjehan		✓	Govt Girls High school-Sukkur	Head Mistress	03342915775	
05-11-2013	Mrs. Yasmeen Bhatti		✓	Education and Literacy department	Supervision, monitoring, and support to teachers and parents	03337100850	yasmeenbhatti@hotmail.com
05-11-2013	Mrs Kiran Samreen		✓	Govt Girls High school-Sukkur	HST	03213108137	
05-11-2013	Mohammad Nawab Soomro	✓		Govt. Primary School-Behar Colony	Head Master	03003157066	Sweet_heart4033@yahoo.com
05-11-2013	Mohmad Younas Amiin	✓		Govt. Primary School-Islam Gul, New Pind Sukkur	Head Master	03153170846	
05-11-2013	Javed Hussain	✓		Govt. Primary School-New Goth	Assistant Teacher	03052955642	
05-11-2013	Ghulam Farid Qazi	✓		Govt. Primary School-New Goth	Head Master	03023665104	
05-11-2013	NFE	0	3	Govt. Primary School-New Pind	Children		
05-11-2013	Najma Kareem Pathan		✓	Govt. Primary School-New Pind	Head Mistress	03147120436	
05-11-2013	Tauheed Ghani Mahesar	✓		WWF-P	Project Coordinator-Spring Project	03008311652	tgmahesar@wwf.org.pk
05-11-2013	Adeel Aslam Perzada	✓		WWF-P	Senior Project Officer	03337102514	Adeel_pirsi@yahoo.com
05-11-2013	Adnan Mubarik	✓		IRM	Project Manager	03336971940	adnanm@irm.edu.pk
05-11-2013	Manshaat Pirzada	✓		IRM-VT	Master Trainer-Motor Mechanic	03032630885	
05-11-2013	Nazia	✓		IRM-VT	Master Trainer-Dress Designer	033363654016	
05-11-2013	Seher	✓		IRM-VT	Master Trainer-Beautician	03337167048	
Karachi							
06-11-2013	Syeda Rabia Zaidi		✓	Employers Federation of Pakistan (EFP)	Adm and Finance officer	03452161253	Sraz243@gmail.com
06-11-2013	Syed Saud Alam	✓		Employers Federation of Pakistan (EFP)	Office in Charge	03212399683	efpak@cyber.net.pak
06-11-2013	Ubaid R Usmani	✓		Employers Federation of Pakistan (EFP)	Member Managing committee	0324110049	efpak@cyber.net.pak
06-11-2013	Syed Athar Ali	✓		Directorate of Labour	Assistant Director –Focal Person CACL II	03002850641	athardis@yahoo.com
06-11-2013	Syed Zulfiqar Ali Shah	✓		Directorate of Labour	Senior Research		

List of stakeholder met during final evaluation mission October 31-November 18, 2013						
Date	Name	Male	Female	Organization/Name of the community	Job Title	Telephone number Email (if available)
06-11-2013	Ghulifam Nabi Memon	✓		Directorate of Labour	Joint Director Labour	03212058790
06-11-2013	Zulfiqar Shah	✓		Pakistan Institute of Labour Education and research (PILER)	Joint Director	03002119637 piler@cyber.net.pk
06-11-2013	Zeenat Hisam		✓	Pakistan Institute of Labour Education and research (PILER)	Associate Research	Zeenathisam2004@gmail.com
07-11-2013	Students of Journalism and Mass communication	07	09	Jamshoro University	Students	
District- Sahiwal						
08-11-2013	Ramzana	✓	✓	Labour Department	Data Base Assistant	03086933279 Fari71b4u@hotmail.com
08-11-2013	Syed Mohammad Haider			Labour Department	District Officer-Focal person CACL II	03017247477 Haider.do@hotmail.com
08-11-2013	Muhammad Kashif	✓	✓	(SIWA) Small Industrial Estate Sahiwal	Ex-president	03417444555 Siwa.sahiwal@gmail.com
08-11-2013	Dr. Sajjid Chohan	✓	✓	District Government	District Coordination Officer	03228887886
09-11-2013	Abdul Mateen	✓	✓	ILO	Program Officer	03338606615
09-11-2013	Livestock Model Farm	15		62/4R Kallu Livestock Farm	Farmers	
09-11-2013	Model Steel welding Shop	6		Near Pakpattan Road, Chowk, Sahiwal	Workers	
09-11-2013	Mujahid Manzoor	✓		Farmers Association	General secretary	
09-11-2013	Haji Altaf Hussain	✓	✓	Kissan Welfare Association	President	
09-11-2013	Mohammad Aslam	✓	✓	Brick Kiln Association Sahiwal	General secretary	
09-11-2013	Haji Mohammad Saleem	✓	✓	Brick Kiln Association Chicha watni-Sahiwal	President	
09-11-2013	Khadim Hussain	✓	✓	Kissan Welfare Association	President	
09-11-2013	Salwat Shahzad Paracha	✓	✓	Small Industrial Estate Sahiwal (SIWA)	Senior Vice President	03008684682 Mechano3@yahoo.com
09-11-2013	Ijaz Ahmed Khan	✓	✓	Education Department	Teacher	03458024163
09-11-2013	Zahida Anwar		✓	Education Department	Teacher	03236567324
09-11-2013	Eshwar Zafar	✓	✓	Education Department	Teacher	03226076758
09-11-2013	Arshad Munir	✓	✓	Education Department	Teacher	03347672497
09-11-2013	Musarrat Jabeen	✓	✓	Education Department	Teacher	03212571003
09-11-2013	Pervaiz Iqbal	✓	✓	Education Department	Teacher	03009695740
09-11-2013	Khadim Hussain	✓	✓	Education Department	Teacher	03467461107 Khadim7785@yahoo.co
09-11-2013	Tasleem Anif	✓	✓	Education Department	Teacher	03316779552
09-11-2013	Nazir Arif Khan	✓	✓	Education Department	Teacher	03017324436
09-11-2013	M. Aslam	✓	✓	Aslam Model Car/AC Workshop	Owner	03018690380
10-11-2013	NFE school	1	13	76/5 R	Children	
10-11-2013	Mrs. Farzana Zahid		✓	76/5 R	Teacher	
10-11-2013	Business Management Group and VT Graduates		30	74/5 R	Mothers group	
10-11-2013	ALC and VT graduates	✓	20	74/5 L	Children	

List of stakeholder met during final evaluation mission October 31-November 18, 2013							
Date	Name	Male	Female	Organization/name of the community	Job Title	Telephone number	Email (if available)
10-11-2013	Khalida Parveen		✓	74/5 L	VT teacher	03023719254	
10-11-2013	Hajira Parveen		✓	74/5 L	ALC teacher	03005690665	
10-11-2013	Jannat Bibi		✓	74/5 L	NFE teacher		
10-11-2013	MCF and LMST		25	62/5L	Mothers group		
10-11-2013	Humera Ilim Deen		✓	Ghousia Town	Child		
11-11-2013	VT graduates (district government group)		07	Kameer	Girls		
11-11-2013	VT graduates (PRSP group)		09	Kameer	Girls		
11-11-2013	Zubaida		✓	Kameer	VT teacher		
11-11-2013	LHWS		07		CLMS		
11-11-2013	Kaleem Nasir			Agriculture	Deputy district agriculture officer	03006925592	
11-11-2013	Nasir Jaffri			Information	PG	03006924286	
11-11-2013	Abdul Rehman			Health	CDC officer	03016908462	visahiawal@pvtc.gop.pk
11-11-2013	Javed Mahmood Naveed			Punjab Vocational Training Council	Principal	04045544499	
11-11-2013	Syed Rehman Hussain			Social welfare deptt Punjab	District officer	0409200445	
11-11-2013	Niaz Hussain			RGM	PRSP	03336934387	
12-11-2013	Iqbal Naveed	✓		Department of Mass Communication, Lahore College for Women University	TV Instructor, broadcast teacher and TV project instructor	03004254938	Rananaveed_2002@yahoo.com
12-11-2013	Faiza Latif		✓	Department of Mass Communication, Lahore College for Women University	Acting Head of the Department	03334458294	faizabad@hotmail.com
12-11-2013	Muhammad Rehan Khan	✓		Project Management Unit and HR Department - Government of Punjab	Focal Person	03004199299	Pm.wfcl@wfcil.gop.pk
12-11-2013	Muhammad Haider Khan	✓		Project Management Unit and HR Department - Government of Punjab	Manager Monitoring and Evaluation	03234174083	Mme.wfcl@hotmail.com
12-11-2013	Mohammad Azhar Mehmood	✓		Project Management Unit and HR Department - Government of Punjab	Manager Adm and accounts	03435000096	Azhar.naveed25@yahoo.com
12-11-2013	Mahmood Arshad	✓		CIWCE, Lahore	Environmental/hygenist/deputy Director	03334281620	arshadset@gmail.com
12-11-2013	Hussain Ifikhar	✓		PCLU, Lahore	Adm and finance Assistant	03144093423	Shahkar.lhr@gmail.com
12-11-2013	Malik Nazir	✓		PCLU, Lahore	Senior research officer	03004199516	Malik.nazir@yahoo.com
12-11-2013	Himid Arshad	✓		PCLU, Lahore	Researcher	0300432404	Hamidsyed.arshad@gmail.com
12-11-2013	Muhammad Kamran Akhter	✓		CIWCE/PCLU, Lahore	Monitoring and Evaluation officer	03215347850	kamranhussain@gmail.com
12-11-2013	Nadeem Aslam Chaudhary	✓		DG Labour welfare Punjab, Lahore	DG	04299230342	nachaudhary@gmail.com
12-11-2013	Masood Ahmed Tariq	✓		Directorate of Labour, Lahore	Director	04299230342	masoodtariq@gmail.com
12-11-2013	Syed Hasnat Javed	✓		Directorate of Labour, Lahore	Director Labour	04299230342	Hasnat72@gmail.com
12-11-2013	Mubeen Ilahi,	✓		Government Sukkur	EX ILO focal person		

Annexe 9: List of participants' stakeholder workshop

(To be inserted in next draft)

Annexe 10: Schedule workshop

9:00-9:30	Registration Participants	Project Support Team
9:30-10:00	Welcome	(to be determined by project staff)
	Overview of the Workshop	Mei Zegers, Senior International Consultant and Mahjabeen Qazi, National Consultant
10:00-11:00	Presentation and discussion of Preliminary Findings	Mei Zegers
11:00-11:15	Morning tea break	
11:15-13:00	Small group work- Additional input by stakeholders	Facilitated by Mei Zegers and Mahjabeen Qazi
13:00-14:00	Lunch	
14:00-15:00	Plenary discussions	Facilitated by Mei Zegers and Mahjabeen Qazi
15:00-15:15	Afternoon break	
15:15-16:00	Small group work- key recommendations	Facilitated by Mei Zegers and Mahjabeen Qazi
16:00-16:30	Plenary discussions on recommendations	Facilitated by Mei Zegers and Mahjabeen Qazi
16:30-16:45	Summary of discussions	Mei Zegers
16:45	Thank you and official close of the workshop	To be determined

Annexe 11: References

Note: Only references included in the current report are included in the reference list. Other documents were also consulted).

Combating Abusive Child Labour II (CAACL II) (2013a). Demonstrating what is possible towards eliminating child labour in Pakistan. Good Practices Report. Islamabad: ILO – IPEC, CAACL II project.

Combating Abusive Child Labour II (CAACL II) (2013b). Technical Progress Report (TPR) – Pakistan, April 2013. Islamabad: ILO – IPEC, CAACL II project.

Federal Bureau of Statistics (FBS), Statistics Division, Ministry of Labour, Manpower and Overseas Pakistanis (MLMOP), International Labour Organization (ILO) and International Programme on the Elimination of Child Labour (IPEC) (1996). Summary results of Child Labour Survey in Pakistan (1996). Islamabad: FBS, MLMOP, ILO, IPEC.

Haider, Mahe Nau (2013) Sub-Study on the Impact of the ILO/IPEC Project of Support on the Enabling Environment. Islamabad: Mahe Nau Haider Independent Consultant (report available from ILO Pakistan office).

ILO Country Office for Pakistan (2008) Decent Work Country Programme. Islamabad: ILO Country Office for Pakistan.

ILO Country Office for Pakistan (2010) Decent Work Country Programme 2010 – 2015. Islamabad: ILO Country Office for Pakistan.

International Labour Organization (2013), ILO Conventions and Recommendations on child labour. <http://www.ilo.org/ipec/facts/ILOconventionsonchildlabour/lang--en/index.htm>. Website accessed 21 November, 2013.

International Labour Organisation (ILO), International Programme on Elimination of Child Labour (IPEC) – European Commission (EC) (2009). Contribution Agreement between the European Commission and International Labour Organization (ILO) International Programme on the Elimination of Child Labour (IPEC) to implement the Financing Agreement between the European Commission and the Government of Pakistan. Islamabad: ILO and EC.

International Labour Organisation (ILO), International Programme on Elimination of Child Labour (IPEC) – European Commission (EC) (2013). Revised Contribution Agreement between the European Commission and International Labour Organization (ILO) International Programme on the Elimination of Child Labour (IPEC) to implement the Financing Agreement between the European Commission and the Government of Pakistan. Islamabad: ILO and EC.

ILO IPEC - Combating Abusive Child Labour II Project (2009) Programme Logical Framework - Combating Abusive Child Labour II Project. Islamabad: ILO Pakistan office.

ILO IPEC - Combating Abusive Child Labour II Project (2013) Addendum: Revised Programme Logical Framework. - Combating Abusive Child Labour II Project. Islamabad: ILO Pakistan office.

Pakistan Bait-UI-Mal (2013), Introduction. http://www.pbm.gov.pk/Introduction_Links.html. Website accessed 23 November, 2013.

Romijn, Clemens (2012). Results Oriented Monitoring Report CAACL II Project MR-125660.02. Available from the European Commission.

- Tonchev, Plamen (2010). Results Oriented Monitoring Report CACL II Project MR-125660.02. Available from the European Commission.
- Toor, Imran Ashraf & Nasar, Abu (2004). Zakat as a Social Safety Net: Exploring the Impact on Household Welfare in Pakistan. Pakistan Economic and Social Review, Volume XLII, No. 1&2 (2004), pp. 87-102. <http://pu.edu.pk/images/journal/pesr/PDF-FILES/5%20TOOR%20Zakat%20as%20a%20Social%20Safety%20Net.pdf>. Website accessed 20 November, 2013.
- Semiotics Consultants (Pvt.) Limited (2013), Assessment of the Impact of the Family Economic Empowerment Intervention on Child Labour and School Attendance. Islamabad: Semiotics Consultants (Pvt.) Limited.
- United Nations Children's Fund (2008), UNICEF Child Protection Strategy, Executive Board Annual session 2008- 3-5 June 2008. New York: UNICEF.
- UN Women (2013). Community Mobilization, Outreach and Mass Media. <http://www.endvawnow.org/en/articles/219-community-mobilization-outreach-and-mass-media-.html>. Website accessed 23 November, 2013.
- Wikipedia (2013) http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Sahiwal_District. Website accessed 20 November, 2013.
- Wikipedia (2013) http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Sukkur_District. Website accessed 20 November, 2013.

Annexe 12: Data sources and techniques used by type of stakeholder during the evaluation

Type of Stakeholder	Technique
Project Staff	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Document review • Review of Media Communications and other Behaviour Change Communications (BCC) materials • Individual interviews • Group interview • Observation
Project partners and associates including implementing agencies	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Individual interviews • Observation • Review of BCC materials
National, provincial and district policy makers and providers, local authorities, workers and employers organisation representatives; NGO, academia and media representatives.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Individual and group interviews • Observations • Review of materials/documentation shared by interviewees. • (Note: due to devolution national level interviews were limited)
Representatives of community based organisations	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Individual and group interviews • Observations
Educators	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Individual and group interviews • Observations • Review of materials/documentation shared by interviewees.
ILO experts	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Interviews (by Skype or in person as applicable)
Parents and children.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Focus group interviews • Individual interviews for the sub-study: Assessment of the Impact of the Family Economic Empowerment Intervention on Child Labour and School Attendance. • Observation • Review of reports, SCREAM and other BCC materials and actions as was applicable

Annexe 11: Terms of Reference



**International Labour Organization- International Programme on the
Elimination of Child Labour
ILO/IPEC**

Version for contract
12 September 2013

**Terms of Reference
For
Independent Expanded Final Evaluation
‘Combating Abusive Child Labour II’
Pakistan**

ILO Project Code	PAK/08/03P/EEC
ILO Iris Code	101169
Country	Pakistan
Duration	69 months
Starting Date	01 April 2008
Ending Date	31 December 2013
Project Locations	Pakistan (Provinces of Sindh, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Punjab, and Balochistan)
Project Language	English
Executing Agency	ILO-IPEC
Financing Agency	EC
Donor contribution	EC: Euro 4,750,000 ILO: Euro 447, 900

List of Abbreviations

AP	Action Programme
ALC	Adult Literacy Centre
C182	ILO's Worst Forms of Child Labour Convention, No. 182 of 1999
CL	Child Labour
CLMS	Child Labour Monitoring System
DBMR	Direct Beneficiaries Monitoring and Reporting
DWCP	Decent Work Country Programmes
EC	European Commission
EIA	Evaluation and Impact Assessment Section of ILO/IPEC
GAP	Global Action Plan
HQ	Headquarters
IA	Implementing Agency
IABA	Integrated Area Based Approach
ILO	International Labour Organization
IPEC	International Programme on the Elimination of Child Labour
NAP	National Action Plan
NC	National consultant
NFE	Non-formal Education
NGO	Non-governmental Organization
PMP	Project Monitoring Plan
PRSP	Poverty Reduction Strategy Paper
TBP	Time Bound Programme
TL	Team leader
UN	United Nations
UNDAF	United Nations Development Assistance Framework
WFCL	Worst Forms of Child Labour

I. Background and justification

1. The aim of the International Programme on the Elimination of Child labour (IPEC) is the progressive elimination of child labour, especially its worst forms. The political will and commitment of individual governments to address child labour - in cooperation with employers' and workers' organizations, non-governmental organizations and other relevant parties in society - is the basis for IPEC action. IPEC support at the country level is based on a phased, multi-sector strategy. This strategy includes strengthening national capacities to deal with this issue, legislation harmonization, improvement of the knowledge base, raising awareness on the negative consequences of child labour, promoting social mobilization against it, and implementing demonstrative direct action programmes (AP) to prevent children from child labour and remove child workers from hazardous work and provide them and their families with appropriate alternatives.
2. The operational strategy of IPEC has over the years focused on providing support to national and local constituents and partners through their projects and activities. Such support has to the extent possible been provided in the context of national frameworks, institutions and processes that have facilitated the building of capacities and mobilisation for further action. It has emphasized various degrees of a comprehensive approach, providing linkages between action and partners in sectors and areas of work relevant for child labour. Whenever possible specific national frameworks or programmes, such as national plans, strategic frameworks, have provided such focus.
3. Starting in 2001, IPEC has promoted and supported the implementation of the "Time Bound Programme" approach as such national frameworks. A Time Bound Programme (TBP) is essentially a national strategic programme framework of tightly integrated and coordinated policies and initiatives at different levels to eliminate specified Worst Forms of Child Labour (WFCL) in a given country within a defined period of time. In Pakistan, there is a Government's National Policy and Plan of Action to Combat Child Labour, mainly the National Time Bound Programme (2008-2016) - its medium term plan for combating the worst forms of child labour.
4. It is a nationally owned initiative that emphasizes the need to address the root causes of child labour, linking action against child labour to the national development effort, with particular emphasis on the economic and social policies to combat poverty and to promote universal basic education. The International Labour Organization (ILO) has elaborated this concept based on previous national and international experience. It has also established innovative technical cooperation modalities to support countries that have ratified the ILO's Worst Forms of Child Labour Convention, No. 182 of 1999 (C182) to implement comprehensive measures against WFCL.
5. The most critical element of a National Action Plan (NAP) is that it is implemented and led by the country itself. The countries commit to the development of a plan to eradicate or significantly diminish the worst forms of child labour in a defined period. This implies a commitment to mobilize and allocate national human and financial resources to combat the problem. IPEC has over the years implemented a number of country specific projects of support of multi-year duration and focusing both on policy and institutional support through enabling environment and direct support to communities, families and children through targeted interventions.
6. The experience with NAP has suggested a range of approaches to establish and implement national frameworks to provide the comprehensive approach, the linkages and the mechanisms for developing the knowledge, mobilising the actors, institutions and resources; and to plan effective coherent national action as part of the broader national development. The experience also showed that the degree of support needed to get this process going in different countries can

vary and that specific strategic initiatives can be identified as often key to the process, focusing on influencing key policies and processes.

7. The Global Action Plan (GAP), proposed in the 2006 Global Report on Child Labour and endorsed by the Governing Body at its November 2006 sitting, called on all ILO member States to put appropriate time-bound measures using National Action Plans (NAP), in place by 2008 with a view to eliminating the WFCL by 2016
8. From the perspective of the International Labour Organisation (ILO), the elimination of child labour is part of its work on standards and fundamental principles and rights at work. The fulfilment of these standards should guarantee decent work for all adults. In this sense, the ILO provides technical assistance to its three constituents: government, workers and employers. This tripartite structure is the key characteristic of ILO cooperation and it is within this framework that the activities developed by the Programme should be analysed.
9. ILO Decent Work Country Programmes (DWCPs) have subsequently been developed and are being introduced in the ILO to provide a mechanism to outline agreed upon priorities between the ILO and the national constituent partners within a broader UN and International development context. For further information please see:
<http://www.ilo.org/public/english/decent.htm>
10. The DWCP defines a corporate focus on priorities, operational strategies, as well as a resource and implementation plan that complements and supports partner plans for national decent work priorities. As such, DWCP are broader frameworks to which the individual ILO project is linked and contributes to. DWCP are beginning to be gradually introduced into various countries' planning and implementing frameworks.
11. ILO/IPEC has been working in Pakistan since 1994 with a number of implementing partners, including trade unions, employers' associations, government departments and civil society organizations, to address child labour issues in various sectors. In September 2012, ILO's tripartite constituents approved the revised Decent Work Country Programme – II (2010-2015) document, re-fixing priorities for the remaining Programme period (2012-2015) in light of the 18th Constitutional Amendment. Combating child labour prominently features in the Country Programme Outcomes (CPO-5)
<http://www.ilo.org/public/english/bureau/program/dwcp/countries/>

Project background and current status

12. Prior to the CACL II in Pakistan, IPEC implemented the EU-funded Phase I of the “Bonded Child Labour Project”. The project began in January 1999 and ended in October 2002. Phase-I covered the four provincial capitals as well as 14 small cities and towns in the country.
13. ILO/IPEC, with the support of different donors, has carried out a number of projects on the elimination of child labour in Pakistan. The US Department of Labor (USDOL)-funded Project of Support to the National Time Bound Programme (2003-2008) acted as the umbrella project for all the IPEC supported programmes and activities on child labour in the country at the time.
14. In April 2008, the European Commission (EC) and the International Labour Organization (ILO) signed an agreement under which EC would support the project; ‘Combating Abusive Child Labour II’ in Pakistan, building on the “Bonded Child Labour Project”. The total cost of the project is EUR 5,197,900 of which the EC contribution is EUR 4,750,000.
15. The project development objective is: To contribute to the elimination of child labour, with special focus on the elimination of the abusive/worst forms of child labour in Pakistan.

16. The project has three Immediate Objectives:
- A sustainable and holistic district model developed to reduce and gradually eliminate abusive child labour across sectors.
 - The institutional and technical capacity of target district governments, four provincial CLUs and one Federal CLU strengthened to effectively combat child labour.
 - The knowledge base on child labour and its worst forms expanded and awareness increased to promote child labour friendly policies.
17. Activities are planned with a focus on three main areas of (i) Direct assistance to child workers and poor families who involve their children in WFCL; (ii) Capacity building for government labour administration, employers, workers and civil society; (iii) Building a knowledge base on child labour in the country.
18. The Project focuses on four provinces: Sindh, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Punjab, and Balochistan.
19. A total of 6,500 children from four the provinces will be targeted for withdrawal (including through removal and protection in workplace) and prevention from child labour through the provision of educational and non-educational services following direct action from the Project. Building on the past experience of ILO/IPEC, the Project is aimed at a major intervention to remove about 5,500 working children from hazardous occupation and to prevent about 1,000 of their younger siblings from taking their positions in the labour market.
20. The project was revised in March 2013. The revision included changes to the logframe in response to the 1st June 2012 constitutional changes, and the end date was extended to 31 December 2013.
21. As of April 2013, the Project has reported the following achievements:
- **5,296** children aged 5-17 years (against a revised target of 7,500) have been withdrawn from hazardous labour, **3,828** children aged 5-14 years (against a revised target of 4,000) have been mainstreamed into formal education, **1,553** young siblings (against a revised target of 1,500) of working children have been prevented from entering into hazardous employments.
 - 16 local employer associations of nine sectors at Sukkur and Sahiwal districts have made commitment to follow Employers' Codes of Conduct on employing persons under 18 years while taking proactive actions during project period to eliminate all worst forms of child labour.
 - The Project has continued to carry out the capacity building activities in Sindh, Punjab, KPK and Baluchistan provinces and has supported the operationalizing of the established institutional structure, namely the Provincial Coordination Committees (PCCs) on Child Labour & Provincial Child Labour Units (PCLU) in Karachi, Lahore, Peshawar & Quetta and District Coordination Committees (DCCs) in Sahiwal & Sukkur.
 - With the exception of PCLU-Baluchistan, PCLU-KPK and PCLU-Sindh, all other implementing partners have carried out action programme activities as per the respective work plans during the reporting period.
 - Majority of the stakeholders at the provincial and district levels have been actively participating in the implementation of various interventions that has led to ensure the credible and effective utilization of project resources while paving way to guarantee the long-term sustainability of the project outcomes.

Evaluation background

22. The ILO considers evaluation as an integral part of the implementation of technical cooperation activities. Provisions are made in all ILO projects in accordance with ILO evaluation policy and based on the nature of the project and the specific requirements agreed upon at the time of the project design and during the project as per established procedures.
23. Evaluations of ILO/IPEC projects have a strong focus on utility for the purpose of organisational learning and planning for all stakeholders and partners in the project. The evaluation results are also likely to contribute to the work of Development and Cooperation – EuropeAid (DEVCO) on addressing child labour.
24. An external mid-term evaluation was carried out from April to June 2011 by an independent company and this was managed by the EU Delegation in Pakistan. In addition the project has been subject to two independent Result Oriented Monitoring (ROM) missions managed by the EC.
25. The project documents states that a final external evaluation will be conducted at the end of programme implementation and that the final evaluation ‘will assess the Programme achievements against targets, the success of various strategies employed, including expansion and scaling up, and the links to the National Time bound Programme’.
26. The ILO evaluation policy requires all ILO projects of this size to be subject to an independent evaluation managed as per the ILO evaluation policy and with a dedicated independent evaluation manager from ILO. In addition to this ILO managed final evaluation, the EU Pakistan Delegation will be managing an external final evaluation of the project as part of the donor's requirements. The ILO will coordinate with the EU Delegation so that the two evaluations will be implemented as per the requirements of each process and to ensure maximum complementarity.
27. This Expanded Final Evaluation will encompass the project final evaluation based on these ToRs and two sub-studies, one on the enabling environment to eliminate child labour, and a Target Group Impact Assessment Study (TGIAS) on the economic empowerment intervention. These activities will be implemented by separate teams but linked through the evaluation team leader (reflected in methodology and contents), and can be conducted simultaneously. Specific ToRs have been developed for each sub-study. The two studies will feed into the overall Expanded Final Evaluation report.
28. The overall purpose of the study on the enabling environment study is to carry out an assessment of the changes in the enabling environment at the provincial, district and local levels over the period of the project. The ‘enabling environment’ refers to processes and outcomes in relevant dimensions; institutions (government, non-government, formal and informal), legislation, awareness and attitude, political consensus and policy, knowledge (research and evaluation), planning and coordination, resource availability, community mobilisation, that can contribute to the elimination of WFCL.
29. The other sub-study, the TGIAS, will assess the impact of the family economic empowerment intervention on levels of income and on child labour and school attendance. The purpose of this study is to obtain more detailed information on the beneficiary target group and to give a clear picture of how the livelihoods component of the project has affected the target population.
30. To facilitate the effective integration of the findings of this study in the expanded evaluation, the expanded evaluation team leader will provide technical advice to sub-studies and will incorporate the findings in the evaluation process and in the report on the evaluation findings.

The EIA Evaluation Manager will provide overall technical backstopping to both the Expanded Final Evaluation and the sub-studies in particular.

31. The Evaluation and Impact Assessment (EIA) section of ILO/IPEC provides an independent evaluation function for all ILO/IPEC projects. The Expanded Final Evaluation and will be managed by the EIA section of ILO/IPEC.

II. Purpose and scope

Purpose

32. The main purposes of the final evaluation are:
 - a. Establish the relevance of the project design and implementation strategy;
 - b. Determine the implementation efficiency of the project;
 - c. Assess the extent to which the project has achieved its stated objectives at outcome and impact level and to identify the supporting factors and constraints that have led to this achievement or lack of achievement. The two sub-studies will provide specific information on achievements relating to:
 - i. Impact on the enabling environment at sub-national level
 - ii. Impact of the family economic empowerment intervention
 - d. Identify unintended changes, both positive and negative at outcome and impact levels, in addition to the expected results;
 - e. Assess the relevance of the sustainability strategy, its progress and its potential for achievement, identifying the processes that are to be continued by stakeholders;
 - f. Identify lessons learned and potential good practice, especially regarding models of interventions that can be applied further;
 - g. Provide recommendations to project stakeholders to support the completion, expansion or further development of initiatives that were supported by the project.
33. The final evaluation should provide all stakeholders with information to assess and revise, as it is needed, work plans, strategies, objectives, partnership arrangements and resources. It should identify the potential impact on mainstreaming policy and strategies and suggest a possible way forward for the future.

Scope

34. The evaluation will focus on the ILO/IPEC programme mentioned above, its achievements and its contribution to the overall national efforts to achieve the elimination of WFCL. The evaluation should focus on all the activities that have been implemented since the start of the projects to the moment of the field visits. (i.e. action programmes/projects)
35. The evaluation should look at the programme as a whole, including issues of initial project design, implementation, lessons learnt, replicability and recommendations for current and future programmes.
36. The contribution of IPEC to the National Action Plan (NAP) process includes the promotion of an enabling environment, and the role of technical advisor or facilitator of the process of developing and implementing the NAP. In order to assess the degree to which this contribution has been made, the evaluation will have to take into account relevant factors and developments in the national process.
37. The analytical scope should include identifying levels of achievement of objectives and explaining how and why they have been attained in such ways (and not in other alternative expected ways, if it would be the case). The purpose is to help the stakeholders to learn from the on-going experience.

III. Suggested aspects to be addressed

38. The evaluation should be carried out in adherence with the ILO policy guidelines for results-based evaluation⁷⁶ and with specific ILO and ILO/IPEC Guidelines and Notes, and the OECD/DAC Evaluation Quality Standard. Evaluators should adhere to the highest technical and ethical standards and abide by the Code of Conduct for Evaluation on the UN System⁷⁷.
39. Gender concerns should be addressed in accordance with ILO Guidance note 4: “Considering gender in the monitoring and evaluation of projects”⁷⁸. All data should be sex-disaggregated and different needs of women and men and of marginalized groups targeted by the programme should be **considered throughout the evaluation process.**
40. In line with results-based framework approach used by ILO/IPEC for identifying results at global, strategic and project level, the evaluation will focus on identifying and analysing results through addressing key questions related to the evaluation concerns and the achievement of the Immediate Objectives of the project using data from the logical framework indicators.
41. Annex I contains specific suggested aspects for the evaluation to address. Other aspects can be added as identified by the evaluation team in accordance with the given purpose and in consultation with ILO/IPEC Geneva's Evaluation and Impact Assessment section (EIA) which is the dedicated evaluation manager. It is not expected that the evaluation address all of the questions detailed in the Annex; however the evaluation must address the general areas of focus. The evaluation instrument (summarised in the inception report) should identify the general areas of focus listed here as well as other priority aspects to be addressed in the evaluation.
42. The main categories that need to be addressed are the following:
 - Design
 - Achievement (Implementation and Effectiveness) of Objectives
 - Relevance of the project
 - Sustainability
 - Special Aspects to be Addressed

IV. Expected outputs of the evaluation

43. The expected outputs to be delivered by the evaluation team are:
 - A desk review of appropriate material;
 - Review of the methodology for the sub-study on the ‘enabling environment to reduce child labour’ and the TGIAS, and on-going support to the sub-studies including feedback and support to the preparation of the reports. The final reports from the enabling environment and economic empowerment sub-studies will be prepared by the sub-study consultants separately from the report on the final expanded evaluation with an analytical initial bullet point report to feed into the EFE ;
 - Review and briefing/planning meeting on the methodology and expected outputs for the sub-study on the impact of the family economic empowerment intervention;

⁷⁶ http://www.ilo.org/eval/Evaluationguidance/WCMS_168289/lang--en/index.htm

⁷⁷ <http://www.unevaluation.org/ethicalguidelines>

⁷⁸ http://www.ilo.org/eval/Evaluationguidance/WCMS_165986/lang--en/index.htm

- Preparation of an inception report centred on the evaluation instrument, reflecting the combination of tools and detailed instruments needed to address the range of selected aspects. The instrument needs to make provision for the triangulation of data where possible;
 - Interviews and consultations with relevant stakeholders including field visits to the project locations in a selection of provinces;
 - Informal feedback meetings with stakeholders at the provincial data collection sites, facilitated by the evaluation team leader, focusing on the preliminary findings of observations of provincial-level achievements and constraints;
 - Stakeholders' workshop at the national level (for stakeholders at the national level and some representation from the provinces), reviewing issues from the provincial level but with a greater focus on national level achievements and constraints, facilitated by the evaluation team leader;
 - Debrief with key stakeholders following the stakeholders' workshop if requested
 - Draft evaluation report. The evaluation report should include and reflect on findings from the sub-studies on the enabling environment and the economic empowerment/livelihoods component, the field visits and the stakeholder workshops proceedings including:
 - ✓ Executive Summary with key findings, conclusions and recommendations
 - ✓ Clearly identified findings
 - ✓ A table presenting the key results (i.e. figures and qualitative results) achieved per objective (expected and unexpected)
 - ✓ Clearly identified conclusions and recommendations (identifying which stakeholders are responsible)
 - ✓ Lessons learnt
 - ✓ Potential good practices
 - ✓ Appropriate Annexes including present TORs
 - Final evaluation report incorporating feedback from stakeholders;
 - Notes with reflections on the process of the evaluation identifying lessons learnt and suggestions for future ILO/IPEC evaluations
44. The total length of the report should be a maximum of 40 pages for the main report, excluding annexes; additional annexes can provide background and details on specific components of the project evaluated. The report should be sent as one complete document and the file size should not exceed 3 megabytes. Photos, if appropriate to be included, should be inserted using lower resolution to keep overall file size low.
45. All drafts and final outputs, including supporting documents, analytical reports and raw data should be provided both in paper copy and in electronic version compatible for Word for Windows. Ownership of data from the evaluation rests jointly with ILO/IPEC and the consultants. The copyright of the evaluation report will rest exclusively with the ILO. Use of the data for publication and other presentations can only be made with the written agreement of ILO/IPEC. Key stakeholders can make appropriate use of the evaluation report in line with the original purpose and with appropriate acknowledgement.
46. The draft final report will be circulated to key stakeholders (those participants present at stakeholder evaluation workshop will be considered key stakeholders), including project staff for their review. Comments from stakeholders will be consolidated by the Evaluation and Impact Assessment section (EIA) of ILO/IPEC Geneva and provided to the evaluation team leader. In preparing the final report the team leader should consider these comments, incorporate as appropriate, and provide a brief note explaining why any comments might not have been incorporated.

V. Evaluation methodology

47. In ILO/IPEC evaluations of its projects are carried out to enhance organisational learning. As per IPEC procedures, a participatory consultation process on the nature and specific purposes of this evaluation was carried out prior to the scheduled date of the evaluation. Inputs were received from key stakeholders including constituents and implementing agencies. The present Terms of Reference is based on the outcome of this process and inputs received in the course of the consultative process.
48. The following is the proposed evaluation methodology. While the evaluation team can propose changes in the methodology, any such changes should be discussed with and approved by EIA and the Project, provided that the research and analysis suggest changes and provided that the indicated range of questions is addressed, the purpose maintained and the expected outputs produced at the required quality.
49. The evaluation will be carried out using a desk review of appropriate materials, including the project documents, progress reports, outputs of the programme and the projects (action programmes), results of any internal planning process and relevant materials from secondary sources. At the end of the desk review period, it is expected that the evaluation consultant will prepare a brief document indicating the methodological approach to the evaluation in the form of the evaluation instrument, to be discussed and approved by EIA.
50. The evaluation team leader will be asked to include in the inception report the evaluation instruments that will be used for documenting and analysing the achievements of the project and the contributions of the sub-projects (Action Programmes) to the programme.
51. A sub-study on the ‘enabling environment to reduce child labour at the provincial and district levels’ will be carried out. An important methodological resource will be the draft ‘Guidelines for impact assessment of enabling environment interventions for the elimination of child labour’ ILO/IPEC 2011 which has been produced as part of the Child Labour Impact Assessment Toolkit⁷⁹ developed by ILO/IPEC. The overall purpose of this study is to carry out a review of the impact of the capacity building work that has been carried out by the project for the development of the enabling environment at the provincial and district level and below. This includes provincial, district and community-level institutions. Important institutions include relevant government offices at the provincial and district level, the Child Labour Units (CLUs), Provincial and District Coordination Committees on Child Labour and union and community institutions. The study will be carried out in Punjab or Sindh and in Khyber Pakhtunkhwa provinces so that the effect of the project intervention with and without a project supported district can be assessed.
52. A second sub-study assessing the impact of the family economic empowerment intervention on child labour and school attendance will be conducted simultaneously with the enabling environment sub-study. The purpose of this study is to review in detail a sample of the mothers who have received Business Management Skills Training and Livestock Management Skills Training and/or Sewing and Stitching Training along with micro-credit. The effect of these interventions will be assessed in terms of additional income earned and the child labour and education status of children in the households. Baseline information collected by the project on beneficiary households will be supplemented as needed by tracing methodologies (as outlined in the Tracer Study Manual, which is part of the Child Labour Impact Assessment Toolkit)⁸⁰

⁷⁹ ILO, 2011: “Child Labour Impact Assessment Toolkit”; International Labour Organisation, International Programme on the Elimination of Child Labour (IPEC); Geneva, ILO; [A dynamic toolkit for policy and programme managers to serve as a framework for planning and implementation of impact assessment of child labour interventions]

⁸⁰ ILO, 2011: Child Labour Impact Assessment Toolkit: Tracer Study Manual”; International Labour Office, International Programme on the Elimination of Child Labour (IPEC), Geneva, ILO, ISBN 978-92-2-125192-7 (print full package); 978-92-2-125193-4 (Web PDF full package); Tracer Study - Book 1: Methodology Manual ISBN 978-92-2-125186-6 (print); 978-

whereby respondents are asked to recall their previous situation in addition to the current status. A qualitative counterfactual (what would have been the level of assessed change in the absence of the project interventions) will be identified through the survey, interviews and focus group discussions with key respondents in the communities who have an understanding of the project interventions and of the wider context. The study will be carried out in Sukkur (Sindh) and Sahiwal (Punjab) districts.

53. The two sub-studies will have separate (although linked) ToRs and are designed to specifically contribute to the overall expanded final evaluation. The inception report will incorporate the sub-studies within its framework, identifying how the findings will contribute to the expanded final evaluation. The first report from the sub-studies will be a 'bullet point' style report which will be submitted prior to the field mission of the expanded final evaluation.
54. The evaluation team will have working sessions with the sub-study consultants during the design phase of the methodologies.
55. The evaluation team leader will interview the donor representatives and ILO/IPEC HQ and regional backstopping officials through conference calls or face-to-face interviews early in the evaluation process, preferably during the desk review phase.
56. The evaluation team will undertake field visits to the project. The evaluators will conduct interviews and focus group discussions (FGDs) with project partners and implementing agencies, direct beneficiaries (i.e. children) and teachers and facilitate two stakeholder workshops towards the end of the field visits.
57. The selection of the field visits locations should be based on criteria to be defined by the evaluation team. Some criteria to consider include:
 - Locations with successful and unsuccessful results from the perception of key stakeholders. The rationale is that extreme cases, at some extent, are more helpful than averages for understanding how process worked and results have been obtained;
 - Locations that have been identified as providing particular good practices or bringing out particular key issues as identified by the desk review and initial discussions;
 - Representation of the main strategies or interventions used;
 - Areas known to have high prevalence of child labour;
 - Representation of the main types (sectors) of child labour being addressed
 - Locations close to main roads and also locations that are more remote;
 - Preferably to different provinces/communities/partners to those visited by the MTE.
58. One national stakeholders' workshop will be held in Lahore (provisionally scheduled for 18 November). Informal feedback meetings with stakeholders will be held in each province, focusing on individual provincial-level achievements and constraints.
59. The stakeholder workshop will be attended by ILO/IPEC staff and key stakeholders (i.e. partners), including the donor as appropriate. These will be an opportunity for the evaluation team to gather further data, present the preliminary findings for verification and discussion, present recommendations and obtain feedback. They will take place towards the end of the fieldwork.

60. The evaluation team leader will be responsible for organizing the methodology of the workshop. The identification of the number of participants of the workshop and logistics will be the responsibility of the project team in consultation with the evaluation team leader.
61. The team leader will be responsible for drafting and finalizing the evaluation report. The findings of the evaluation team will incorporate the feedback from the stakeholder workshop and the results from the sub-studies. The draft report will be circulated to stakeholders in English for their feedback and comments. The team leader will further be responsible for finalizing the report incorporating any comments from stakeholders as appropriate.
62. The evaluation will be carried out with the technical backstopping of the ILO/IPEC-EIA section and with the logistical support of the programme office in Islamabad. EIA will be responsible for consolidating the comments of stakeholders and submitting it to the team leader.
63. It is expected that the evaluation team will work to the highest evaluation standards and codes of conduct and follow the UN evaluation standards and norms.

Link between the evaluation and the sub-studies

64. The team leader will provide technical advice to the consultants in charge of the sub-studies and will provide feedback on the draft report.
65. The key findings from the sub-studies will be presented in a ‘bullet point’ style report to the team leader prior to the evaluation mission to Pakistan. The sub-study consultants will also participate in the stakeholders’ workshops. They may be required to make a presentation of the findings.
66. The team leader will incorporate the findings and conclusions of the sub-studies in the evaluation report.

The team responsibilities and profile

67. The expanded final evaluation will be carried out by an international evaluation team leader and an evaluation team member (national consultant). The evaluation team leader is responsible for drafting and finalizing the evaluation report. The evaluation team member will support the team leader in preparing the field visit, during the field visit and in drafting the report. The evaluation team leader will have the final responsibility during the evaluation process for the outcomes of the evaluation, including the quality of the report and compliance with deadlines. Separate teams/evaluators will carry out the sub-studies.
68. The background of the evaluation team leader and the evaluation team member should include:

Team leader (International consultant):

Responsibilities	Profile
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Desk review of programme documents • In-country to brief local partner agency and support in the design of the sub-studies • Provide comments and feedback on both impact sub-studies (enabling environment and economic empowerment) including feedback on the designed questionnaires) • Development of the evaluation instrument • Briefing with ILO/IPEC/EIA • Telephone interviews with ILO/IPEC HQ 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Not have been involved in the project. • Relevant background in social and/or economic development. • Experience in the design, management and evaluation of development projects, in particular with policy level work, institutional building and local development projects. • Experience in evaluations in the UN system or other international context as team leader • Relevant sub-regional experience • Relevant country experience highly preferred • Experience in the area of children’s and child labour issues and rights-based approaches in a normative framework and operational dimension are highly appreciated. • Experience at policy level and in the area of education and legal issues would also

Responsibilities	Profile
desk officer, donor <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Technical advice to national consultants • Undertake field visits in project area • Facilitate stakeholders workshops • Draft evaluation report • Finalise evaluation report 	be appreciated. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Experience in the UN system or similar international development experience including preferably international and national development frameworks in particular PRSP and UNDAF. • Fluency in English is essential • Experience facilitating workshops for evaluation findings.

National consultant:

Responsibilities	Profile
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Desk review of programme documents • Contribute to the development of the evaluation instrument • Organize interviews of stakeholders and field visits in the country • Provide translation and interpretation as required • Co-Facilitate stakeholder workshop (under the team leader leadership) • Contribute to the evaluation report through systematizing data collected and providing analytical inputs • Others as required by the team leader 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Relevant background in country social and/or economic development. • Experience in the design, management and evaluation of development projects, in particular with policy level work, institutional building and local development projects. • Relevant country experience, preferably prior working experience in child labour. • Experience in the area of children's and child labour issues and rights-based approaches in a normative framework are highly appreciated. • Experience facilitating workshops for evaluation findings. • Fluency in English (and other national relevant language) essential • Knowledge of local languages in the field visit areas an asset • Experience in the UN system or similar international development experience desirable.

Evaluation Timetable and Schedule

69. The total duration of the evaluation process including submission of the final report should be within two months from the end of the field mission.

70. The timetable is as follows:

Phase	Responsible Person	Tasks	No of days	
			TL	NC
I	Evaluation team leader	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • In-country to review and support design stage of 'enabling environment' and 'economic empowerment' sub-studies 	9	5
II	Evaluation team leader	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Briefing with ILO/IPEC • Desk Review of programme related documents • Telephone briefing with IPEC EIA, donor, IPEC HQ and ILO regional staff • Support and advice to 'enabling environment' sub-study consultant • Support and advice to 'livelihoods' sub-study consultant • Submission of inception report 	7	3
III	Evaluation team with logistical support by project	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • In-country for consultations with programme staff • Consultations with project staff /management • Interviews with project staff and partners • Field visits • Consultations with girls and boys, parents and other beneficiaries • Consultations with other relevant stakeholders • Support and advice to 'enabling environment' sub-study consultant • Support and advice to 'livelihoods' sub-study consultant • Workshop and informal feedback sessions with key stakeholders • Sharing of preliminary findings 	15	13
IV	Evaluation team leader	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Draft report based on consultations from field visits and desk review, and workshop • Debriefing as required 	8	2
V	EIA	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Quality check and initial review by EIA • Circulate draft report to key stakeholders • Consolidate comments of stakeholders and send to team leader 	0	0

Phase	Responsible Person	Tasks	No of days	
			TL	NC
VI	Evaluation team leader	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Finalize the report including explanations on why comments were not included 	2	0
TOTAL			41	23

TL: Team leader NC: National consultant

71. Summary schedule

Phase	Duration	Dates
Support to sub-study consultants	9 days	20 – 27 September
Desk review and inception report	7 days	21 – 29 October
Field mission	15 days	4 – 18 November
Draft report	8 days	20 – 1 December
Consultation	3 weeks	2 – 23 December
Final report	2 days	By 31 December

The summary schedule for the sub-study on the enabling environment is (see separate ToRs for details):

Phase	Duration	Dates
Desk review and outline of the Methodological plan	4 days	16-19 September
Feedback on the methodological plan		
Field work and preparation of 'bullet point' report and draft report	17 days	30 September -25 October
Review by EIA and final evaluation team leader		1 November
Presentation in evaluation workshop and final report preparation	2 days	18-19 November
Total	23 days	

The summary schedule for the sub-study on the 'economic empowerment' intervention (see separate TORs for details):

Phase	Dates
Desk review and outline of the study design and instruments	By 20 September
Feedback on the study design and instruments and finalise with the EFE Team Leader	23 - 27 September
Training of enumerators, field work and data analysis	30 September – 8 November
Submission of 'bullet point' report	By 8 November
Review by EIA and final evaluation team leader	8 – 15 November
Presentation in evaluation workshops and final report preparation	18 -19 November

Sources of Information and Consultations/Meetings

72. Sources of Information:

The following sources should be consulted:

Available at HQ and to be supplied by EIA	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Project document MTE report EIA, ILO and UNEG guidelines
Available in project office and to be supplied by project management	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Technical progress reports/status reports Baseline reports and studies Project monitoring plan Technical and financial reports of partner agencies Other studies and research undertaken Action Programme Summary Outlines Project files National Action Plans Study on good practices and lessons learned Surveys on CL in the provinces of Sindh, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Punjab, and Balochistan

73. Consultations/meetings will be held with:

- Project management and staff
- ILO/HQ and regional backstopping officials
- Implementing partner agencies
- Child labour programs in the country
- Social partners Employers' and Workers' groups
- NGO representatives
- Government stakeholders (e.g. representatives from Department of Labour, Social Development etc.)
- Government representatives, legal authorities etc. as identified by evaluation team
- Policy makers
- Direct beneficiaries, i.e. boys and girls (taking ethical consideration into account.)
- Parents of boys and girls
- Teachers
- Community members as identified by the project management and evaluation team leader
- Child labour monitors
- EC as donor

Final Report Submission Procedure

74. For independent evaluations, the following procedure is used:

- The evaluator will submit a draft report to ILO/IPEC EIA in Geneva
- IPEC EIA will forward a copy to key stakeholders for comments on factual issues and for clarifications
- IPEC EIA will consolidate the comments and send these to the evaluator by date agreed between EIA and the evaluator or as soon as the comments are received from stakeholders.
- The final report is submitted to ILO/IPEC EIA who will then officially forward it to stakeholders, including the donor.

1 VI. Resources and Management

Resources

75. The resources required for this evaluation are:

- For the evaluation team leader:
 - Fees for an international evaluation consultant for 38 work days
 - Fees for local DSA in project locations
 - Two times travel from consultant's home residence to Islamabad in line with ILO regulations and rules
- For the national consultant:
 - Fees for 23 days

- Fees for local DSA in project location
- For the sub-study consultants:
 - See detailed TORs
- For the evaluation exercise as a whole:
 - Local travel in-country supported by the project
 - Stakeholder workshop expenditures

A detailed budget for internal management purpose is available separately.

Management

76. The evaluation team will report to ILO/IPEC/EIA in headquarters and should discuss any technical and methodological matters with EIA, should issues arise. IPEC project officials and the ILO Office in Islamabad will provide administrative and logistical support during the evaluation mission.

Annex I: Suggested aspects to address

Design

- Determine the validity of the project design, in particular whether it assisted or hindered the achievement of the project goals as set out in the Project Document.
- Assess whether the project design was logical and coherent:
 - Were the objectives of the project clear, realistic and likely to be achieved within the established time schedule and with the allocated resources (including human resources)?
 - Were the linkages between inputs, activities, outputs and objectives clear and logical?
 - Were the different components of the project (i.e. capacity building, policy and legislation, awareness raising and social mobilization, direct action to beneficiaries, etc.) clearly and realistically complementing each other?
 - How relevant are programme indicators and means of verification? Please assess the usefulness of the indicators for monitoring and measuring outcomes.
 - Has the time frame for project implementation and the sequencing of project activities been logical and realistic?
 - Were the expectations of the roles, capacity and commitment of stakeholders realistic and likely to be achieved?
- Analyse whether available information on the socio-economic, cultural and political situation of Pakistan was taken into consideration at the time of the design and whether it was reflected in the design of the project.
- To what extent have key external factors been identified and assumptions formulated in the Project document? Have the identified assumptions on which the project was based, proven to be true?
- Assess whether the problems and needs were adequately analysed and determine whether the needs, constraints, resources and access to project services of the different beneficiaries were clearly identified taking gender issues into concern.
- Does the design of the project take into account the existing institutional arrangements, roles, capacity and commitment of stakeholders (i.e. education, livelihoods, etc.)? Does it fit into existing mainstreaming activities that would impact on child labour?
- How have gender issues been taken into account in the project design in its components and outcomes?
- Has the strategy for sustainability of project results been defined clearly at the design stage of the project?
- Does the project design fit within and complement existing initiatives by other organizations to combat child labour?
- How did the project contribute to the achievement of ILO strategic frameworks such as the Decent Work Country Programme (DWCP)
- How did the project contribute to the achievement of the Government's National Policy and Plan of Action to combat child labour?

Achievements (Implementation and Effectiveness) of Objectives

- Examine the preparatory outputs of the delivery process in terms of timeliness and identifying the appropriate resources/persons to implement the process.
- Examine delivery of programme outputs in terms of quality and quantity; have they been delivered in a timely manner?

- Assess whether the project has achieved its immediate objectives.
- Assess the role of project management at the local, project and headquarters level in the achievement of the project objectives
- How has the project responded to positive and negative factors (both foreseen and unforeseen) that arose throughout the implementation process? Has the project team been able to adapt the implementation process in order to overcome these obstacles without hindering the effectiveness of the project?
- Assess the selection of the implementing agencies for the APs in relation to the project strategy.
- Assess the design and implementation of the APs.
- Assess whether ILO/IPEC has established clear communication mechanisms and performance management of these implementing partners and activities.
- How effective were the APs, research projects, and policy projects, and how are they contributing to the project meeting its immediate objectives?
- Assess the programme monitoring system including the project monitoring plan (PMP), work plans, processes or systems (i.e. data collecting and processing, analysis and reporting)
- Assess the effectiveness of the programme i.e. compare the allocated resources with results obtained. In general, did the results obtained justify the costs incurred?
- Review the value of support received from programme partner organizations and relevant ILO units (including ILO Geneva, Sub regional and Regional Office).

Direct Targeted Action

- Assess the effectiveness of action programmes and their contribution to the immediate objectives of the programme. Has the capacity of community level agencies and organizations been strengthened to plan, initiate, implement and evaluate actions to prevent and eliminate child labour? Has the entire target population been reached? Were the expected outputs delivered in a timely manner, with the appropriate quantity and quality?
- Assess the effectiveness of the project's beneficiary identification and targeting strategies and mechanisms. Assess the gender dimensions of these strategies.
- Assess the effectiveness of the direct action interventions including whether the length and quality of the services provided are appropriate. Assess if the inputs and services provided were enough to keep children regularly attending school and out of work.
- Assess the effectiveness of the project's economic empowerment component based on the results of the TGIAS.
- How effective were the strategies implemented for child labour monitoring?
- Assess the relevance and effectiveness of the project's household livelihood component.
- Assess the effectiveness of the strategies used for withdrawing or preventing children including any different strategies used for different sectors.
- Review and analyse the comprehensive approach that the project provides at direct action level.

Enabling environment (Capacity Building)

- How has the capacity of the implementing agencies and other relevant partners (at national, provincial and local levels), to develop effective action against child labour, been enhanced as a result of programme activities?
- Assess the status of the CLM systems and how effective it is. Are the initiatives on child labour monitoring likely to be sustainable? What is the capacity and commitment to maintain and expand it?
- Examine the role of the project in building any networks that have been established between organizations and government agencies working to address child labour on the national, provincial and local levels.
- How effectively has the programme leveraged resources (e.g., by collaborating with non-ILO/IPEC initiatives and other programmes launched in support of the Government's National Policy and Plan of Action to combat child labour and the national programme policy framework processes thus far)?
- Assess the project efforts to coordinate and collaborate with other child-focused interventions supported by other organizations in the country with particular emphasis on those with work in child labour elimination.
- How successful has the programme been in mainstreaming the issue of child labour into on-going development efforts in areas such as education, social protection, cash transfer programmes, alternative employment promotion and poverty reduction (i.e. government ownership and implementation of the Government's National Policy and Plan of Action to Combat Child Labour and the National Time Bound Programme (2008-2016))? As far as possible identify the project's contribution to these achievements.
- How relevant and effective were the studies commissioned by the programme in terms of affecting the national debates on child labour?
- Examine how the ILO/IPEC project interacted and possibly influenced national level policies, debates and institutions working on child labour.
- Assess the extent to which the ILO/IPEC programme of support has been able to mobilize resources, policies, programmes, partners and activities to be part of the Government's National Policy and Plan of Action to Combat Child Labour and the National Time Bound Programme (2008-2016).

Relevance of the Project

- Examine whether the programme responded to the real needs of the beneficiaries and stakeholders, including specific target groups and sub-national areas
- Assess whether the problems and needs that gave rise to the programme still exists or have changed.
- Did the strategy address the different needs and roles, constraints, access to resources of the target groups, with specific reference to the strategy of mainstreaming and thus the relevant partners, especially in government?
- Assess the validity of the programme approach and strategies and its potential to be replicated and scaled-up.
- How did the strategy used in this project fit in with the Government's National Policy and Plan of Action to Combat Child Labour and the National Time Bound Programme (2008-2016), national education and anti-poverty efforts, and interventions carried out by other organizations? Did the programme remain consistent with and supportive of the

Government's National Policy and Plan of Action to Combat Child Labour and the National Time Bound Programme (2008-2016)?

- Has the project identified any other constraints or opportunities that need to be accommodated in the design in order to increase the impact and relevance of the project?

Sustainability

- Assess the design of the sustainability strategy, and assess the progress of the strategy.
- Determine the potential to sustain the gains of the project beyond its life and what measures are needed to ensure this.
- Assess what contributions the programme has made in strengthening the capacity and knowledge of national stakeholders and to encourage ownership of the programme to partners.
- Examine whether prioritised target group and gender aspects are taken into consideration regarding the sustainability of the programme results and assess whether actions have been taken to sensitize national and local institutions and target groups on these issues.
- Assess programme success in leveraging resources for on-going and continuing efforts to prevent and eliminate child labour in the context of the Government's National Policy and Plan of Action to Combat Child Labour and the National Time Bound Programme (2008-2016). Analyse the level of private sector / employers' organizations support to the Government's National Policy and Plan of Action to Combat Child Labour and the National Time Bound Programme (2008-2016), paying specific attention to how these groups participate in programme activities.
- Identify potential good practices and models of intervention that could inform future child labour elimination projects, especially those that the national partners could incorporate into national policy and implementation.

Specific Aspects to be addressed:

- How has the project considered the recommendations of the external midterm evaluation as relevant input to the on-going planning process? What have been the results and if recommendations were not followed what were the reasons?
- Assess the process for documenting and disseminating pilot projects/models of intervention: scale-up, lessons, etc.
- Assess how far the project has been able to mobilize the tripartite constituents (government, workers and employers) and other actors (civil society, UN, other development agencies) in the country in action against child labour and in contributing towards achieving the project's goals and objectives.
- Assess how much the project has contributed to the Government's National Policy and Plan of Action to Combat Child Labour and the National Time Bound Programme (2008-2016).
- Identify potential legacies of the project and outline why these might be potential project legacies