



International Programme on the Elimination of Child Labour (IPEC)



International
Labour
Office

IPEC Evaluation

**To Contribute to Developing National
Capacities to Achieve the 2015 National
Child Labour Reduction Targets and the
ILO Global Targets for Ending the Worst
Forms of Child Labour
in Cambodia by 2016
P.270.16.316.052 - CMB/08/50/USA**

**An independent expanded final evaluation by a team of external
consultants**

Includes evaluation sub-studies

November 2012

This document has not been professionally edited.

NOTE ON THE EVALUATION PROCESS AND REPORT

This independent evaluation was managed by ILO-IPEC's Evaluation and Impact Assessment Section (EIA) following a consultative and participatory approach. EIA has ensured that all major stakeholders were consulted and informed throughout the evaluation and that the evaluation was carried out to highest degree of credibility and independence and in line with established evaluation standards.

The evaluation was carried out by a team of external consultants¹. The field mission took place in September to October, 2012. The opinions and recommendations included in this report are those of the authors and as such serve as an important contribution to learning and planning without necessarily constituting the perspective of the ILO or any other organization involved in the project.

Funding for this project evaluation was provided by the United States Department of Labor. This report does not necessarily reflect the views or policies of the United States Department of Labor nor does mention of trade names, commercial products, or organizations imply endorsement by the United States Government.

¹ Mei Zegers (Team Leader) and Sok Somith

Executive Summary

The Royal Government of Cambodia (RGC) and other committed entities have been working towards the elimination of child labour, especially in its worst forms for over a decade. The country set targets to reduce child labour among children aged 5-17 from 16.5% in 1999 to 8% in 2015. The RGC has, further, committed to ending all WFCL by 2016. These two goals are usually referred to as Cambodia's "Twin Goals" to address child labour. Among other projects that the International Labour Organisation (ILO) has implemented (with the support of a number of donors), two, both supported by the United States Department of Labor (USDOL), have specifically supported the RGC towards the eventual achievement of the Twin Goals. An expanded final evaluation of the second phase of the ILO International Programme on the Elimination of Child Labour (IPEC) project was conducted from September to October, 2012.

The project concentrates on several key areas of focus to support Cambodia in eliminating exploitive and worst forms of child labour (WFCL) in the country. Key areas include:

- contributing to the revision and alignment of the Cambodia national frameworks to achieve national and international targets,
- strengthening the knowledge of all stakeholders on child labour,
- strengthening capacities of project partners to address exploitive child labour, and
- developing replicable community-based models to combat exploitive child labour in Cambodia.

The primary purposes of the expanded final evaluation are to:

1. Establish the relevance of the project implementation strategy;
2. Assess the extent to which the project has achieved its stated objectives at outcome and impact level, implementation effectiveness and efficiency of the Project;
3. Identify unintended changes, both positive and negative, in addition to the expected results;
4. Identify the level of sustainability of the results of the project;
5. Identify lessons learned and potential good practices
6. Provide recommendations to project stakeholders

To ensure a thorough evaluation the evaluator used a combination of methods so that a well-rounded evaluation could be carried out:

- Document review, individual interviews and/or focus group discussions with stakeholders from a wide range of groups including national, provincial, district and local education policy makers and providers, local authorities, project partners, and community based organizations, and communities, parents and children.
- The evaluation has expanded to include a sub-study on the Enabling Environment to Reduce Child Labour with special focus on two of the project implementation provinces, Kampot and Kep. The sub-study has separate Terms of Reference (TOR) and was designed to contribute to the overall expanded final evaluation described in the current report.
- Observation of the stakeholders and their work in different settings as well as their networking actions. This was combined with field visits and individual interviews as well as focus group meetings.

- Stakeholder meetings at provincial and national level where initial findings were presented, discussed, and enriched with additional input from the participants.

The project design was valid overall and supported the achievement of the project goals as set out in the Project Document and is appropriate within the context including cultural and gender issues, economic and political contexts. The needs of stakeholders including specific target groups (sectors, institutions, community-based groups) were considered including poverty and gender issues. The design provides good support to address remaining gaps identified at the end of the first phase of the ILO IPEC project to support the National Plan of Action on the Worst Forms of Child Labour Phase I (NPA-WFCL I). Under the current project, the design moved away from focusing on the individual child to integrating the family, community and other stakeholders across a broad framework at different structural levels. The design recognises the need for a multi-sectoral, cross cutting and multi-level approach to effectively address child labour issues in Cambodia.

The project sectors, target groups, districts and locations were appropriately selected based on various studies from project phase I, information from different stakeholders and experience from project phase I. Some government interviewees also added that other types of child labour need to be addressed, such as sand collection and children in agriculture. The need to address the special problems of children of internal migrants and of girls was also raised by one national and some provincial interviewees.

The project was able to largely achieve its objectives and related outputs. The project has contributed to the revision and alignment of several key national frameworks to achieve child labour targets. The project has also significantly strengthened knowledge and awareness on child labour although a need for continued intensive awareness raising exists. The capacities of stakeholders have been strengthened, particularly at national and provincial levels. At commune and community levels more work is needed to strengthen capacities to attain the twin goals of reducing child labour by 2015 and eliminating the WFCL by 2016. While sustainable community-based pilot initiatives to combat exploitive child labour/WFCL models were developed, the implementation quality of some elements was challenging. Particularly effective Direct Action models included the development and strengthening of local coordinating mechanisms; capacity building; advocacy and awareness raising in partnership with employers and workers' organizations and other groups. Most of the challenges faced were due to small budget allocations which had an impact on implementation and also limited follow up support to the Implementing Agencies (IAs) and Action Programs (AP). It is possible that the models would have been more effective if budget allocations had been larger to allow for more intensive implementation efforts by local stakeholders and technical support.

The project was very active through advocacy and technical support for the integration of child labour in policy and legal frameworks. Although progress has been made, some elements still require further attention, such as the finalisation of the NPA-WFCL II and adaptation of the labour law. A zero draft of the NPA-WFCL II is ready and includes input provided through technical support from the project. A project supported consultant analysed gaps and issues to be addressed in the labour law. Government commitment to eliminating child labour is relatively good as compared to other countries although budget allocations and adaptation of the labour law still need to be realised. The actual enforcement of existing laws and regulations was not as fully achieved as the project had anticipated. Several reasons exist for the still limited enforcement of existing national laws and regulations. Reasons include the lack of human resources in the labour inspectorate. There is also a need to continue to improve the understanding of labour inspectors, police and other enforcement agents regarding their roles and responsibilities for enforcing hazardous child labour elimination.

A child labour monitoring system (CLMS) that will be used over the long term to identify, monitor and follow up on children was developed and formally adopted in June, 2012. The CLMS is to be implemented from the community level through the village committees all the way to the national level

where data collection and analysis will take place. The full implementation of the CLMS is expected to be challenging so it will require a great deal of close support from child labour and other national and international specialists on child protection related subjects. Challenges include the limited number and coverage of labour inspectors and workplace monitors, budgets to cover costs, identification of children in mobile and hidden sectors, capacities of community and other monitors, accurate reporting systems and data processing at all levels. Effective and detailed referral systems also need to be clarified.

The project has supported or provided input into research on a range of subjects related to child labour. The project used information from the various surveys to provide input into capacity strengthening efforts. Information was distributed in written form but also discussed at meetings and in training workshops to help stakeholders integrate relevant information into their work.

The project strengthened capacities through training workshops, dissemination of research, technical support in Action Programs and meetings, and direct contacts. The capacities of institutions were also strengthened to develop structures and coordination mechanisms to address child labour issues. The capacity strengthening provided with project support was well received. Evaluation interviewees indicated that they found that their capacities to address child labour had been strengthened substantially even if it was not always easy to implement what had been learned. Implementation was hampered in some situations by the need for yet further capacity strengthening, such as on institution building, and to increase understanding of the difference between child labour and child work. Commune Councils were trained on mainstreaming child labour into their local budgets but, due to the small amounts available in local budgets, actual allocation is still limited.

The project developed nine Action Programs (APs) to withdraw or prevent children from the WFCL that can serve as replicable models. The project targeted 11,000 children, for withdrawal and prevention through educational services and an additional 1,000 children through non-education services. 7,200 children were to be withdrawn and 3,800 prevented from exploitative and/or hazardous work in 15 provinces. In collaboration with the ILO's Women's Entrepreneurship Development and Gender Equality (WEDGE) 2,000 families of the beneficiary children were to be provided with self-help group (SHG) development support. These targets were ambitious given the size of the allocated budget for withdrawal and prevention. Because of the emphasis on the enabling environment, budget allocations supporting the enabling environment are proportionately almost equal to the allocation for direct actions. All the stakeholders met deemed that the amounts allocated to the implementation of the Direct Actions insufficient which they felt had an impact on the quality of the results. Even though, after the midterm evaluation, some adjustments in terms of funding allocated to withdrawing and preventing beneficiaries from child labour were made, the amounts were still very minimal compared to the needs to meet the targets.

The project was able to achieve its target of withdrawing or preventing 11,000 children from child labour although, mostly due to definition issues, it is not entirely certain if all of these children are fully withdrawn or prevented from child labour. The project reports that 5,846 children were withdrawn and 5,884 were prevented from child labour for a total of 11,744. While the project did achieve its overall target, it failed to achieve its withdrawn target by 1,354 children.

Almost one half of the children withdrawn or prevented are girls. Qualitative interviews were conducted with groups of children, parents, local community based monitors, commune officials, employers and other stakeholders. These interviews (and focus groups) indicated that while beneficiaries had been withdrawn or prevented from child labour, some might not strictly be considered as withdrawn or prevented using Direct Beneficiary Monitoring and Reporting (DBMR) definitions. Despite an improvement in their work and education status, some randomly selected children who had been reported as withdrawn were still involved in some work according to their description of their work situation. Their

descriptions indicated that, according to the definitions of child labour and hazardous work, they were still in child labour. The primary reasons were a lack of understanding of the difference between light work and hazardous child labour as well as some other contextual factors.

The project pilot tested approaches to achieve Child Labour Free Zones (CLFZ) and Child Labour Free Sectors (CLFS) through an Integrated Area Based Approach (IABA). The IABA consists of a programme of interventions based on the involvement of local communities in dialogue and cooperation among government, employers' and workers' organizations. The purpose of the CLFZ concept is to establish child labour free villages, communes, and/or districts as models for other provinces. Progress to achieving CLFZ and CLFS was noteworthy. Hazardous child labour has been visibly reduced in the CLFZs and CLFS areas according to local stakeholders and data collected through the project but elimination has not yet been absolutely achieved. Challenges to achieving CLFZ and CLFS are high internal mobility, low budget allocations from all sources, and need for sustainably continued awareness raising and capacity strengthening. The project stakeholders currently mostly view CLFZ and CLFS as goals as opposed to an absolute state that can be achieved. Many local stakeholders appreciate the concept of CLFZ and CLFS as it motivates all concerned to work towards a goal. Issues concerning the confusion of definitions of child labour and child work, and the terms CLFZ and CLFS, add to the difficulty in determining whether areas are truly child labour free.

Awareness of the impact of child labour on child development is quite evident in the project communities. Real understanding of the complex interplay between child labour and the long term poverty of households is growing. Detailed understanding about how child labour affects children still needs to be increased, particularly at household level as most sub-national stakeholders only related child labour with its impact on physical development. Some of the community level awareness raising methods, such as peer education, need more attention in future child labour actions to be fully effective.

Vocational and skills training actions for older children (age 15 through 17) who could/would not return to formal school provided a good starting point for such children to end their work in hazardous situations. Stakeholders appreciated this project component and felt it needed to be scaled up substantially in future child labour actions. The children and other stakeholders who were involved with the vocational/skills training, however, indicated that more work is needed to improve such actions. While the project implemented some labour market assessments to identify types of training that could lead to eventual employment, the range of skills that could be learned were still limited. The principal challenges were 1) that the labour market survey was implemented using the opinion of key stakeholders as opposed to detailed research data and 2) lack of availability of appropriate trainers and other resources in project sites. Children felt that the duration of training was much too short for them to be able to have the confidence to find employment or be successfully self-employed. The allocated budget for the training and lack of start-up equipment and capital were other issues raised.

The project implemented a livelihoods project component in collaboration with the ILO WEDGE project. The component consisted of providing support capacity building of families of targeted children to develop income-generation projects through self-help groups (SHG). Most of the training focused on the successful establishment and/or operations of such SHGs. The project achieved about 83% of the target of 2,000 households of project beneficiaries. Unfortunately, however, the evaluation team was unable to sufficiently assess the quality of the livelihood component independently due to lack of availability of an implementing NGO and generally tight evaluation schedule. The stakeholders interviewed were positive about the concept of the SHG and noted the importance of poverty alleviation as the fundamentally most effective way to eliminate child labour.

The project was relatively efficient in terms of the allocated resources with results obtained. As already stated in previous sections, the project budget allocations to the APs was quite limited, especially for

Direct Actions for withdrawal and prevention in the communities. The project had qualified and dedicated national staff which were well supported by technical backstopping from the ILO Decent Work team in the ILO regional office in Bangkok and from IPEC headquarters. The project had a number of management challenges. The Chief Technical Adviser (CTA) left about one year before the end of the project. Although this temporarily slowed down some of the work, the national project manager who replaced the CTA was able to improve project functioning and management of staff during the past year. Support from regional and headquarters ILO/IPEC offices during the transition was well appreciated.

The project monitoring plan (PMP) functioned well overall. While assisting IAs with preparing and/or improving the quality of their technical progress reports was time consuming, the IAs did acquire new capacities as a result. The DBMR, while recognised as complex in terms of data collection and processing from community to national level, was considered useful.

Sustainability was at the forefront of the project design from inception. The sustainability of the national, provincial and commune child labour committees are likely although the intensity of their actions will depend on budget allocations at the different levels. Key areas that require further support to achieve the twin goals' for the reduction of child labour by 2015 and elimination of WFCL by 2016 depend on available financial resources for the sustainability of other actions as well. In communities, some workplace and community monitors still need further capacity strengthening. The extent to which such monitors are provided with clear roles and responsibilities in practice through the CLMS implementation will be important for local sustainability. The general guidelines included in the CLMS draft report are unlikely to be sufficient to ensure sustainable implementation in communities unless local committees know exactly "who will do what" and to whom they will report.

Finalising and implementing the NPA-WFCL II and CLMS, adapting the labour law to address the gaps on child labour issues, continuing to establish child labour committees in new locations and capacity strengthening will all be needed to reach Cambodia's Twin Goals on eliminating child labour. To ensure that mobile populations are aware of the laws and regulations it will also be important to scale up awareness raising using mass media and all other means to ensure that the entire Cambodian population is reached.

Key Recommendations

Development of Policies and Legal Framework, Systems and Resource Mobilisation

1. Finalise and implement the NPA-WFCL II. (Government, Employers', Workers', Civil Society organisations, ILO, other child labour project agencies)
2. Adapt and implement/enforce the labour law to address remaining legal gaps on child labour issues. Develop additional Prakas on other exploitive and hazardous child labour such as domestic child labour. (Government with input from Employers', Workers', Civil Society organisations, ILO and other child labour project agencies)
3. Continue to mainstream child labour into policy and strategy documents on issues such as child protection, social protection, education, gender issues, agriculture, service and industrial development, informal economic development, local economic development, private sector social responsibilities, HIV issues, and decent work as relevant. (Government with input from Employers', Workers', Civil Society organisations, ILO and other child labour project agencies)
4. Develop detailed descriptions of roles and responsibilities for the referral, monitoring, and follow up systems of the CLMS. Include in descriptions potential linkages of NGOs and civil society groups to government CLMS. Clear integration of the CLMS into government referral

systems in the areas of social protection, child protection, education, and health. Provide close technical support for the full implementation of the CLMS through child labour and other specialists. (Government with input from Employers', Workers', Civil Society organisations, child labour project agencies)

5. To ensure that the CLMS is correctly implemented, clarity on the difference between child labour and child work will need special attention. Laws, regulations, policies and strategies need to reflect the meaning of these terms in the Cambodian context and in accordance with the ILO International Conventions 138 and 182. Awareness raising but most especially good training about laws and regulations and their application will also be essential to ensure that those involved in the CLMS will interpret and apply the definitions correctly.
6. Explore possibility of establishment of an independent national fund for the elimination of child labour to ensure that adequate funding is attributed to the various components of the NAP-WFLC II. Include or organise a conference to discuss the establishment of such a fund. Conference can include potential donors, government agencies, private enterprises, and others to identify entities that can also take responsibility for funding different components once the NPA-WFLC II is formally adopted. (Government with input from Employers', Workers', Civil Society organisation, ILOs and all other relevant stakeholders)

Capacity Strengthening

7. Continue to strengthen the understanding of labour inspectors, police and other enforcement agents regarding their roles and responsibilities for enforcing hazardous child labour elimination. Ensure that they are aware of relevant laws, regulations, different types of child labour and child work. (Government, child labour project agencies)
8. Stimulate and provide capacity strengthening to community members to conduct advocacy to integrate child labour into Commune Council decision making. (Government, Civil Society organisations, child labour project agencies)
9. Focus intensively on capacity strengthening of the Community Based Monitoring Agents (CBMA) and other community leaders on the implementation of the CLMS system. Ensure that they are well aware of their roles and responsibilities. (Government, Civil Society Organisations)

Awareness Raising

10. Ensure that mobile and other populations are aware of the laws and regulations by continuing to scale up awareness raising using mass media and all other means to ensure that the entire Cambodian population is reached. (Government, all other relevant stakeholders)

Education – Vocational/Skills Training- Livelihoods

11. Provide vocational skills training in responding to market demand and create a link to appropriate micro finance institutions. Include emphasis on Occupational Safety and Health measures and work in agribusiness. (Government, vocational and skills training centres, Civil Society organisations, child labour project agencies)
12. Increase development of appropriate services to support parents through livelihoods and self-help groups. (Government, Civil Society organisations, child labour project agencies)

Additional specific recommendations are included in the main report in section 7.4.

Table of Contents

Executive Summary	iii
Key Recommendations.....	vii
Development of Policies and Legal Framework, Systems and Resource Mobilisation	vii
Capacity Strengthening	viii
Awareness Raising	viii
Education – Vocational/Skills Training- Livelihoods	viii
Acronyms	xi
Acknowledgements	xiii
1. Introduction	1
2. Methodology	2
3. Project Design and Relevance	4
3.1. Problems and Needs Identification.....	5
3.2. Project Design Fit and Contribution to National Instruments and Initiatives	6
3.3. Design Logic, Coherence and Consideration of Institutional Stakeholders	7
3.4. Clarity and Logic of Project Elements	7
3.5. Indicators, Means of Verification, Assumptions	8
3.5.1. Relevance of Indicators and Means of Verification	8
3.5.2. Assumptions and Integration of Sustainability into Design	8
3.6. Selection Sectors, Target groups, Districts and Locations	9
3.7. Child Labour Free Zones and Child Labour Free Sectors.....	9
4. Achievements- Implementation and Effectiveness	10
4.1. Overview of Project Achievement of Immediate Objectives.....	10
4.1.1. Immediate Objective 1 on National Frameworks.....	12
4.1.2. Immediate Objective 2 on Knowledge Strengthening.....	13
4.1.3. Immediate Objective 3 on Capacity Strengthening.....	15
4.1.4. Immediate Objective 4 on Models for Direct Actions, Withdrawal and Prevention of Child Labour in Specific Zones and Sectors	16
4.1.5. Timely Realisation of Outputs Over the Life of the Project.....	18
4.1.6. Implementation of Mid-term Evaluation Recommendations	18
4.2. Selection of Implementing Agencies and Action Programs.....	19
4.2.1. Implementing Agencies- Strong Points and Challenges	20
4.2.2. Selection and Usefulness of the Action Programs.....	21
4.3. Enabling Environment.....	22
4.3.1. Structures Established to Address the Elimination of Child Labour.....	23
4.3.2. Decentralisation.....	24
4.3.3. Commitment, National Agencies Mainstreaming of Child Labour Issues.....	24
4.3.4. Provincial Government Mainstreaming of Child Labour Issues	27
4.3.5. Commune Mainstreaming of Child Labour Issues.....	28
4.3.6. Coordination and Collaboration with Other Development Oriented Agencies.....	29
4.3.7. Child Labour Monitoring System.....	30

4.4.	Direct Targeted Actions	31
4.4.1.	Identification of Child Beneficiaries	31
4.4.2.	Sector-based Versus Area-based Approaches, CLFZ, CLFS	32
4.4.3.	Awareness Raising in Communities.....	33
4.4.4.	School Supplies, Other Material Support, Community Learning Centres	34
4.4.5.	Vocational and Skills Training.....	34
4.4.6.	Livelihoods Component	35
5.	Efficiency	36
5.1.	Project Management.....	36
5.1.1.	Project monitoring systems	37
6.	Sustainability	37
7.	Conclusions and Recommendations.....	38
7.1.	Conclusions	38
7.2.	Key Good Practices and Lessons Learned	39
7.2.1.	Good practices	39
7.3.	Lessons Learned- Possible generalizations based on evaluation insights	39
7.4.	Key Recommendations.....	40
7.4.1.	Development of Policies and Legal Framework, Systems and Resource Mobilisation	40
7.4.2.	Capacity Strengthening	41
7.4.3.	Awareness Raising	41
7.4.4.	Education – Vocational/Skills Training- Livelihoods	41
7.5.	Additional Recommendations	42
7.5.1.	Development of Policies and Legal Framework, Systems and Resource Mobilisation	42
7.5.2.	Capacity Strengthening	42
7.5.3.	Advocacy, Knowledge Base.....	42
7.5.4.	Awareness Raising	42
7.5.5.	Education – Vocational/Skills Training- Livelihoods	43
7.5.6.	Project Management.....	43
	Annex 1: Implementation of Mid-term Evaluation Recommendations	44
	Annex 2: Additional Resources Leveraged.....	46
	Annex 3: Evaluation schedule	50
	Annex 4: List of Interviewees	58
	Annex 5: List of Participants Stakeholder Workshops.....	64
	Annex 6: References	68
	Annex 7: Terms of Reference	70

Acronyms

AP	Action Program
APIC	Action Program Implementing Committee
CAMFEBA	Cambodian Federation of Employers and Business Association
CBMA	Community-Based Monitoring Agents
CHES	Children's Empowerment through Education Services
CHO	Cambodian Hope Organization
CICP	Cambodian Institute for Cooperation and Peace
CL	Child Labour
CLC	Community Learning Centre
CLFS	Child Labour Free Sectors
CLFZ	Child Labour Free Zones
CLM	Child Labour Monitoring
CLMS	Child Labour Monitoring Systems
CMDG	Cambodia Millennium Development Goals
CNCC	Cambodian National Council for Children
CSNACL	Civil Society Network against Child labour
CSR	Corporate Social Responsibility
CSEC	Commercial sexual exploitation of children
CTA	Chief Technical Adviser
DBMR	Direct Beneficiary Monitoring and Reporting
DoCL	Department of Child Labour
DoLA	Department of Local Administration
DWCP	Decent Work Country Program
EAs	Executing Agencies
EFA	Education for All
FAO	Food and Agriculture Organization
GAP	Global Agriculture Project
HCC	Healthcare Centre for Children
HIV/AIDS	Human Immunodeficiency Virus/ Acquired Immune Deficiency Syndrome
IA	Implementing Agency
IABA	Integrated Area Based Approach
IGA	Income Generating Activity
ILO IPEC	International Labour Organization/ International Program on Elimination of Child Labour
MAFF	Ministry of Agriculture, Forestry and Fisheries

MoLVT	Ministry of Labour and Vocational Training
MoEYS	Ministry of Education, Youth and Sport
MoH	Ministry of Health
MoI	Ministry of Information
MoInt	Ministry of Interior
MoJ	Ministry of Justice
MoP	Ministry of Planning
MoSVY	Ministry of Social Affairs, Veterans and Youth Rehabilitation
MoT	Ministry of Tourism
MOU	Memorandum of Understanding
MoWA	Ministry of Women Affairs
NGO	Non-Government Organization
NIS	National Institute of Statistics
NPA-WFCL	National Plan of Action Against the Worst Forms of Child Labour
NPRS	National Poverty Reduction Strategy
NSC-CL	National Sub-Committee on Child Labour
OSH	Occupational Safety and Health
PDLVT	Provincial Department of Labour Vocational Training
P/MCCL	Provincial/Municipal Committee on Child Labour
PCCL	Provincial Committee on Child Labour
PMP	Project Monitoring Plan
RGC	Royal Government of Cambodia
SCREAM	Support Children's Rights through Education, the Arts and the Media
SHG	Self-help Groups
SIMPOC	Statistical Information and Monitoring Program on Child Labour
TBP	Time-Bound Program
ToR	Terms of reference
UCW	Understanding Children's Work
UNDAF	United Nations Development Assistance Framework
UNICEF	United Nations Children's Fund
USAID	United States Agency for International Development
USDOL	United States Department of Labor
WDACL	World Day Against Child Labour
WEDGE	Women's Entrepreneurship Development and Gender Equality
WFCL	Worst Forms of Child Labour
WFP	World Food Programme

Acknowledgements

The evaluator would like to thank the entire project team for their input into the evaluation process. The ILO project staff was helpful, straightforward and accommodating. The staff from IPEC headquarters and ILO sub-regional office also provided useful support and input without influencing the independence of the evaluation. Thanks should also go to government officials, educators, employers and workers organisation representatives, representatives of community-based organizations, parents, and especially to the children for sharing their comments.

1. Introduction

1. The Royal Government of Cambodia (RGC) and other committed entities have been working towards the elimination of the child labour, especially in its worst forms (WFCL) for over a decade. The country set targets to reduce child labour among children aged 5-17 from 16.5% in 1999 to 8% in 2015². The RGC has, further, committed to ending all WFCL by 2016. These two goals are usually referred to as Cambodia's "Twin Goals" to address child labour.
2. Among other projects that the ILO has implemented (with the support of a number of donors), two, both supported by the United States Department of Labor (USDOL), have specifically supported the RGC towards the eventual achievement of the Twin Goals. The first ILO-IPEC project to support the National Plan of Action on the Elimination of the Worst Forms of Child Labour (referred to as NPA-WFCL I)³ was implemented from 2004-2008. A second phase of the ILO-IPEC project is being implemented starting in September 2008 and is due to end in December 2012. The second phase of the project is entitled "To Contribute to Developing National Capacities to Achieve the 2015 National Child Labour Reduction Targets and the ILO Global Targets for Ending the Worst Forms of Child Labour in Cambodia by 2016". The project is commonly called the Phase II of the Support Project to the NPA⁴.
3. The project concentrates on several key areas of focus to support Cambodia in eliminating exploitive and worst forms of child labour (WFCL) in the country. The project objectives are:
 1. By the end of the project, national frameworks to combat child labour are revised and aligned to achieve national and ILO targets to reduce child labour by 2015 and to end the WFCL by 2016.
 2. By the end of the project, knowledge on child labour of stakeholders and partners has been strengthened.
 3. By the end of the project, tripartite and other IPEC partners' capacities to address exploitive child labour improved.
 4. By the end of the project, effective and sustainable community-based pilot initiatives to combat exploitive/WFCL serve as replicable models for Cambodia.
4. The project was implemented in the provinces of Sihanoukville, Kampot, Kep, Phnom Penh, Kampong Cham, Siem Reap, Banteay Meanchey, Koh Kong, Kandal, Svey Reang, Krachie, Rattanakiri, Kompong Thom, Kampong Channang and Battambang. The project budget was USD \$4,310,000
5. An expanded final evaluation of the project was conducted from September to October 2012, which was managed by the Evaluation and Impact Assessment Section of ILO-IPEC.
6. The evaluation included a sub-study on the Enabling Environment to Reduce Child Labour with special focus on two of the project implementation provinces, Kampot and Kep. The sub-study has

²Project Document: Final Draft, To contribute to developing national capacities to achieve the 2015 national child labour reduction targets and the ILO global targets for ending the Worst Forms of Child Labour in Cambodia by 2016. "Towards Twenty Sixteen: Contributing towards Ending the WFCL in Cambodia. Geneva: ILO-IPEC.

³ Royal Government of Cambodia (2008), National Plan of Action on the Elimination of the Worst Forms of Child Labour (NPA-WFCL). Phase I. Phnom Penh: Royal Government of Cambodia.

⁴ For the sake of brevity the Phase II of the Support Project to the NPA WFCL I project will be referred to as "the project".

separate Terms of Reference (TOR) and was designed to contribute to the overall expanded final evaluation described in the current report.

7. The primary purposes of the expanded final evaluation are to:
 1. Establish the relevance of the project implementation strategy;
 2. Assess the extent to which the project has achieved its stated objectives at outcome and impact level
 3. Determine the implementation effectiveness and efficiency of the Project;
 4. Identify the supporting factors and constraints that have led to any achievements or lack of achievements;
 5. Identify unintended changes, both positive and negative, in addition to the expected results;
 6. Identify unintended positive and negative changes at outcome and impact levels;
 7. Identify the level of sustainability of the results of the project;
 8. Identify lessons learned and potential good practice, especially regarding models of interventions that can be applied further;
 9. Provide recommendations to project stakeholders to support the completion or further development of initiatives supported by the project.
8. It is useful to stress that the evaluation is not intended to criticize but to learn from the past and study how efforts can be further improved in the future. Specifically, this means that the evaluation determined what should be avoided, what can be improved, and what can be added so that the elimination of the worst forms of child labour can be achieved more effectively.

2. Methodology

9. The project was implemented in line with the Terms of Reference for the evaluation⁵ and included the Enabling Environment Sub-study as well as other field work. To ensure a thorough evaluation the evaluator used a combination of methods so that a well-rounded evaluation could be carried out:
 - Document review including direct project related documents but also on the overall context in Cambodia regarding education, child labour issues, the Cambodian National Plan of Action on the Elimination of the Worst Forms of Child Labour I and II and other potential issues of importance.
 - Individual interviews and/or focus group discussions with stakeholders from a wide range of groups including national, provincial, district and local education policy makers and providers, local authorities, project partners, and community based organizations, and communities, parents and children⁶.
 - Telephone briefings were conducted with USDOL and ILO/IPEC representatives including with the former desk officer in ILO/IPEC headquarters.

⁵ Included in annex 7.

⁶ See Annex 4 for details of individuals met during the final evaluation mission. For details on people met during the Enabling Environment Sub-study please consult the relevant report. The evaluation schedule (annex 3) and references (annex 6) can be found in the annexes.

- Individual and small group discussions with project staff in the central office and with partner NGO staff.
 - Observation of the stakeholders and their work in different settings as well as their networking actions. This was combined with field visits and individual interviews as well as focus group meetings.
 - Stakeholder meetings at provincial and national level where initial findings were presented, discussed, and enriched with additional input from the participants⁷.
10. The Enabling Environment Sub-study field work consisted of a qualitative analysis based on interviews and focus groups with key stakeholders and was implemented to analyse the effect of the project on the enabling environment in the salt sector of Kampot province and (ii) generally in Kep province⁸. The study also considered changes in the enabling environment at the national level that supported the reduction of child labour at the provincial level. The results of this study were reviewed and the consultant interviewed. Findings from that study have been integrated in this report.
 11. The evaluator first met with senior project staff in Phnom Penh—after arriving in the country—to finalise the issues to address and obtain their further input into the evaluation process. This was followed by initial joint discussions on the evaluation subjects. The evaluator also met with the consultant who carried out the Enabling Environment Sub-study to discuss findings. Further individual meetings were held in Phnom Penh with the project director, monitoring and evaluation staff and other relevant stakeholders identified with the project staff. These included government, employers and workers representatives, civil society network against child labour (CSNACL) representatives and of another international agency which had implemented another USDOL funded project, i.e., Winrock International.
 12. Following these meetings, the international evaluator and national consultant proceeded to visit other stakeholders in project provinces to gather additional information about project functioning within the overall context. Additional meetings were also held with project staff at several intervals to ensure their input into all evaluation Terms of Reference questions.
 13. Locations for field visits were identified in line with guidelines provided by the evaluator. With regard to downstream data gathering, this included the need to ensure that stakeholders from successful implementation sites such as Kampot and Kep provinces, as well as those where the project faced more challenges were included i.e. Poipet municipality of Banteay Meanchey, near the border with Thailand in the north of the country. Local implementing and executing partners, officials, employers and workers representatives, local leaders, educators and representatives of local civil society groups were included in interviews and/or focus group discussions. Parents and children were also included in focus group discussions.
 14. Two stakeholders' workshops were held. A provincial level workshop held on October 23 focused primarily on obtaining input into the evaluation process from a cross-section of provincial, commune and local stakeholders. A few preliminary findings were also shared with the provincial stakeholders for initial verification/validation. A national stakeholder workshop with national level participants and some representatives from sub-national level took place on 26 October, 2012. The purpose of the national workshop was to share preliminary findings based on all of the triangulated

⁷ Annex 5 lists the participants in both workshops.

⁸ Goddard, Milet (2012), Study on the Enabling Environment to Reduce Child Labour: In the Salt Sector of Kampot Province and Generally in Kep Province, To contribute to the expanded final evaluation of Towards Twenty Sixteen: Contributing towards Ending the Worst Forms of Child Labour in Cambodia. Phnom Penh, Cambodia: Goddard, Milet.

data collected, including from the provincial workshop, and to obtain additional input from the participants. Stakeholder participants were thus provided with an opportunity to respond individually and in groups to the preliminary evaluation conclusions during the workshop. After the return of the evaluator from the field, the first version of the evaluation report was drafted. The report was forwarded for further comments and finalised after receiving feedback on the first version.

3. Project Design and Relevance

15. The project design was valid overall and supported the achievement of the project goals as set out in the Project Document. The design provides good support to address remaining gaps identified at the end of the first phase of the ILO IPEC project to support the NPA-WFCL I. Some of the gaps included the need for further support for review and application of policy, legislative and enforcement frameworks; capacity strengthening at all levels; mainstreaming child labour concerns into commune councils; knowledge building and awareness on child labour issues; development of various institutional structures; addressing urban child labour; and poverty alleviation.
16. Under the current project, the design moved away from focusing on the individual child to integrating the family, community and other stakeholders across a broad framework at different structural levels. The design recognises the need for a multi-sectoral, cross cutting and multi-level approach to effectively address child labour issues in Cambodia. As will be discussed in Section 3, the design to involve many types of stakeholders from different backgrounds set a challenging context for the project although this aspect was relatively successful.
17. Three of the four project objectives emphasise the development of the enabling environment. The enabling environment objectives support strengthening the legal and policy frameworks (IO1), further developing knowledge and awareness raising (IO2), as well as capacity strengthening (IO3) at all levels. The fourth immediate objective (IO4) focuses on developing direct action models for withdrawing and preventing sustainable community-based pilot initiatives to combat exploitive child labour/WFCL. It is important not to interpret the project objectives as purely contrasting the enabling environment (IO1-3) versus downstream direct actions (IO4) as there is interplay between all of the objectives. The enabling environment influences the downstream actions while data, good practices and lessons learned, and input from communities can serve to inform the enabling environment. Awareness raising is, of course, aimed at all levels of the population, whether national government officials, provincial, commune, or community members.
18. Some of the project elements, particularly with respect to withdrawing and preventing children from the WFCL in 15 provinces, were ambitious given the size of the allocated budget. Because of the emphasis on the enabling environment, budget allocations for IO1-3 are proportionately almost equal to the allocation for IO4. Under immediate objective 4, the project targeted 11,000 children of which 10,000 were targeted for withdrawal and prevention through educational services and 1,000 through skills development services. The remaining 1,000 children were to be targeted for support through non-educational services such as counselling, Self Help Groups and income generation for parents of children at risk, awareness-raising and other actions. In practice all child beneficiaries were withdrawn or prevented using education and skills services. Of the total, 7,200 were to be withdrawn and 3,800 prevented from exploitive/hazardous child labour. The project determined that it was more effective and less complex to include education/skills services for all children as opposed to only non-education services for some. The project thus decided to provide the same educational services to the additional 1,000 children who were originally targeted to

receive non-educational services⁹. Such children were reported against targets for withdrawal and prevention through education services and explain the number of children reported as withdrawn or prevented at 11,744 children.

19. Stakeholders at all levels and from different sectors mentioned that under Phase I of the project there was a higher degree of realism with respect to project targets as compared to Phase II. Reaching higher project targets effectively and sustainably across a wider geographic area with a relatively small budget was, thus, viewed as too optimistic and ambitious. Initial allocations to support provision of direct education services to withdraw children were just US \$ 10 per child and US \$5 for prevention of a single child from child labour. A study carried out by a group of UN agencies¹⁰ in 2009 concluded that the average real cost of withdrawing one child between the ages of 10-13 is about US \$ 68 and for 14-16 year olds US\$ 136¹¹. This estimate did include the cost of identifying and following up on beneficiaries, self-help group facilitation, and non-education services such as counselling and direct awareness raising as well as direct education services.
20. in addition, in collaboration with the ILO's Women's Entrepreneurship Development and Gender Equality (WEDGE) 2,000 families of the beneficiary children were to be provided with self-help group (SHG) and income generation development support.
21. As will be discussed in Section 4.1.6, following the mid-term evaluation, there were some adjustments but the overall amounts allocated to direct actions were still minimal. In practice, as will be discussed in Section 4.4 and despite project efforts, the ambitious nature of the direct action targets did have some impact on the quality of the ultimate outputs of IO4.

3.1. Problems and Needs Identification

22. The project design is appropriate within the context including cultural and gender issues, economic and political contexts. The needs of stakeholders including specific target groups (sectors, institutions, community based groups) have been considered including poverty and gender issues. Aside from the positive impact of some project activities, the overall problems and needs of stakeholders are generally still the same as when the project started and continue to remain relevant. According to some local authorities, employers and project staff, however, while the type of needs remained the same, the global economic crisis has increased the *scale* of the economic needs in many communities¹².
23. The design was based on the experience acquired from the first phase of the project to support the NPA-WFCL I, gap analysis, rapid surveys in some target provinces, information from the National Child Labour Survey (2001)¹³ and other sources. The first phase project also conducted various stakeholder workshops which contributed to the design of the current project (i.e., the Phase II project).

⁹ I.e., the 11,000 children receiving services.

¹⁰ Including the ILO, UNICEF and the World Bank.

¹¹ Understanding Children's Work (2009) Towards Eliminating the Worst Forms of Child labour in Cambodia by 2016: An Assessment of Resource Requirements Report on Child Labour. Rome: Understanding Children's Work (UCW) Programme.

¹² This is also confirmed in research. The project contributed to the Inter-Agency Study on the Impact of Food Prices on Child Labour and Education in Cambodia which stated, "Higher proportions of children that were either absentee, dropped out or never enrolled in school came from households that had experienced cash shortages in 2008, and were eating less than three meals per day." United Nations (2009). Phnom Penh: United Nations Development Programme. Also see Hossein Jalilian, Chan Sopha, Glenda Reyes & Saing Chan Hang, with Phann Dalis & Pon Dorina (2009). Global Financial Crisis Discussion Series Paper 4: Cambodia. London: Overseas Development Institute.

¹³ National Institute of Statistics (2001), Cambodia Child Labour Survey 2001. Phnom Penh, National Institute of Statistics (Available from: <http://www.nis.gov.kh/nada/index.php/catalog/19/accesspolicy/>. Accessed 30 October, 2012)

24. Government representatives interviewed for the evaluation concurred that the project design is appropriate and particularly mentioned the useful emphasis on the provision of technical support for supporting linkages between the different ministries. At provincial level, interviewees likewise expressed appreciation for the consideration of the local situation in project design. In Banteay Meanchey, for example provincial representatives noted that the project involved more stakeholders at local levels.
25. A few government stakeholders¹⁴ did note that they felt they had not been adequately consulted for the development of the project design. Despite this situation, however, some did state that they had become more involved with the project during implementation but would have liked to be more involved from an earlier stage.

3.2. Project Design Fit and Contribution to National Instruments and Initiatives

26. The project was especially designed to support Cambodia's national instruments and initiatives on child labour. The project was, for instance, designed to support the NPA-WFCL I as well as the Education for All (EFA) National Plan 2003-2015¹⁵ by supporting education initiatives. Consistency and support to the NPA- WFCL I remained throughout the project implementation period. The project also supports the National Strategic Development Plan (NSDP), 2006-10¹⁶ that was in progress at the time the project was designed. The NSDP includes in paragraph 4.81 a statement that eliminating the WFCL is one of the plan's strategies.
27. The project design was similarly intended to contribute to the further development and strengthening of other existing as well as new instruments and initiatives. In one example, the project provided support to Cambodia in its efforts as one of the first countries to prepare a roadmap to achieve the goal of WFCL elimination by 2016. The Roadmap includes 12 steps and was presented at The Hague Global Conference on Child Labour in 2010¹⁷. Additional project contributions are discussed in Section 4.3.6 and Annex 2.
28. The project design, further, fits within and complements existing initiatives by other agencies and frameworks that have an impact on the prevalence of child labour. The design is, for instance, in line with the United Nations Development Assistance Framework (UNDAF) 2006-2010 that was being implemented at the time the project was designed¹⁸. The UNDAF 2006-2010 included a reference to a planned output to strengthen capacities of the country to implement ILO labour conventions. The project, furthermore, continues to fit with UNDAF 2011-2015¹⁹ which contains several references to child labour²⁰. As the project design includes components on promoting access to education and skills training, livelihoods and gender equality promotion it also complements efforts of UN and other development partners in these areas.

¹⁴ To preserve their anonymity they cannot be identified. There were three instances of such comments during the evaluation interviews.

¹⁵ Royal Government of Cambodia (2003). Education for All (EFA) National Plan 2003-2015. Phnom Penh: Royal Government of Cambodia (See Annex 8- References for Internet link)

¹⁶ Royal Government of Cambodia (2006). National Strategic Development Plan (NSDP), 2006-10. Phnom Penh: Royal Government of Cambodia.

¹⁷ Royal Government of Cambodia (2010). Eliminating the Worst Forms of Child Labour in Cambodia by Twenty Sixteen Cambodia's Roadmap to 2016. Phnom Penh: Royal Government of Cambodia. (Note: reference to support from IPEC Cambodia project on page 16)

¹⁸ United Nations and Kingdom of Cambodia. (2005) United Nations Development Assistance Framework 2006-2010. Phnom Penh: United Nations and Royal Government of Cambodia.

¹⁹ United Nations and Kingdom of Cambodia. (2010) United Nations Development Assistance Framework 2011-2015. Phnom Penh: United Nations and Royal Government of Cambodia.

²⁰ Partially also as a result of input from the ILO.

29. The project design supports the Decent Work Country Program (DWCP) including through national capacity strengthening on labour issues; promotion of participation of employers, workers and other civil society organisations; and productive employment for youth. The project input in the Decent Work Country Program (DWCP) for Cambodia 2011-2015 was successful in supporting inclusion of the elimination of child labour as one of the priorities under the Priority 3 on social protection , Outcome 3.3: Effective progress made toward the elimination of child labour, especially its worst forms.
30. The project, further, complemented another USDOL financed project on the elimination of child labour that was implemented by Winrock International between 2007 and 2011. The ILO IPEC project worked in some of the same locations as the Winrock International project but did not duplicate efforts. The overlapping locations were Siem Reap and Kampong Cham where Winrock International focused on eliminating child labour in agriculture, while the ILO IPEC worked on eliminating child labour in urban settings (Siem Reap) and enabling environment and sustainability in Kampong Cham. At provincial government²¹ and national level the agencies did join in providing technical support.

3.3. Design Logic, Coherence and Consideration of Institutional Stakeholders

31. The design logic and work plan sequencing was logical and realistic although the downstream component remained ambitious. During project design an analysis of the roles, capacities and commitment of institutions and stakeholders (especially government) was conducted. Constraints of government, including access to resources were adequately and realistically considered in the design. As will be described in Section 4.3 and 4.4, the government does still face substantial challenges to finance efforts on child labour related issues, particularly at the sub-national level²².
32. As reflected in the size of staffing (35 persons) of the Department of Child Labour within the Ministry of Labour and Vocational Training (MoLVT), the commitment of the government to addressing child labour is good as compared to many other countries. The Department of Child Labour (DoCL) under the MoLVT has three principal roles:
 - To eliminate child labour particularly of WFCL
 - To provide safe work to children above the age of 15 as to promote youth employment
 - Contribute to eliminating child trafficking in collaboration with police, Ministry of Interior and other agencies.
33. While the Department of Child Labour is the key government stakeholder, as discussed in subsequent sections, the project also worked with other national and sub-national departments across different ministries.
34. Constraints among the employers, workers and other civil society partners were considered in the design, particularly the lack of capacities of the workers' organisations.

3.4. Clarity and Logic of Project Elements

35. The project objectives, inputs, activities, and outputs are clear, well linked and logical. The project objectives and project components complement each other. The project components of policy and legislation development support, capacity building, knowledge development, awareness raising and

²¹In Kampong Cham and Siem Reap provinces.

²²Cambodia refers to all levels below the national central government level as "sub-national levels"

social mobilization for direct action were designed to create the necessary synergies to attain the overall NPA-WFCL goal.

36. Among project partners—including the government, employers and workers representatives—there is a good understanding of the multi-sectoral, cross cutting and multi-level approaches of the project. In practice it has been challenging to work with so many different types of stakeholders as they have different backgrounds and capacities to integrate project components into their work.
37. Project staff reported that the expertise of the ILO IPEC specialists was useful to help ensure the clarity and logic of the project design. Some project partners, particularly from the government, did believe that the logical framework was too inflexible and did not sufficiently take the changing realities into account. The Implementing Partners who implemented the project Action Programmes (APs) did not always understand the details of project elements very well²³ but they did generally understand the overall project objectives and other parts of their own APs.

3.5. Indicators, Means of Verification, Assumptions

3.5.1. Relevance of Indicators and Means of Verification

38. The indicators, outputs and means of verification are generally relevant and are covered in the 6-monthly Technical Progress Reports. Three of the indicators, their related outputs and activities proved challenging. The wording of these three indicators focus on the harmonisation of national legislative frameworks with national and ILO child labour goals followed by wide distribution²⁴. In order to distribute the legislation it must, however, be formally adopted by the government which is not something over which the project has control. Projects can only provide technical support and promote advocacy but passage is dependent on government priorities and procedures for adoption of laws and regulations.

3.5.2. Assumptions and Integration of Sustainability into Design

39. The assumptions mostly proved to be true. The political situation has remained relatively stable, key government staff were regularly available for inputs in various project supported efforts, and capacities to conduct research were adequate. The government continued to support civil society's role while workers and employers' organisations remained functional and active. Two assumptions were not proven entirely true. The government only partially approved and formalised relevant policy, legislative and enforcement frameworks on child labour (see also Section 4.1.1 and 4.3). Mobility of households in some project locations also hindered effective monitoring of some of the project beneficiaries.
40. The project design was highly focused on achieving sustainability through a focus on strengthening the enabling environment (IO1-3). The establishment of a model for subsequent direct actions to withdraw and prevent child labour (IO4) was also intended to provide examples for scaling up efforts into the future.

²³ As will be discussed in remaining sections.

²⁴ Indicator 1.1 Number of National policy frameworks harmonized with National and ILO child labor goals and distributed widely. Indicator 1.2 Number of National legislative frameworks harmonized with National and ILO child labor goals and distributed widely. Indicator 1.3 Number of National enforcement frameworks harmonized with National and ILO child labor goals and distributed widely.

3.6. Selection Sectors, Target groups, Districts and Locations

41. The project sectors, target groups, districts and locations were appropriately selected based on various studies from project phase I, information from different stakeholders and experience from project phase I. No comprehensive baseline was conducted to identify implementation places and sectors, however. An end-line survey conducted during Phase I did provide some useful information on some of the context in project locations²⁵. During project implementation the project did conduct “Rapid Listing” exercises to identify the targeted beneficiaries including child labourers and those at risk, and thus potential beneficiaries, in different locations.
42. Although government stakeholders agreed that the provinces and communes were appropriately selected, they also stated that still more communes need to be included in the future. Some government interviewees also added that other types of child labour need to be addressed, such as sand collection and working children in agriculture. The need to address the special problems of children of internal migrants and of girls was also raised by one national and some provincial interviewees. Although girls were equally included in the project, their special needs were not studied *in detail* and only partially considered in aspects such as provision of direct support²⁶.

3.7. Child Labour Free Zones and Child Labour Free Sectors

43. To achieve the project objectives, the project design included the intention to achieve Child Labour Free Zones (CLFZ) and Child Labour Free Sectors (CLFS) through an Integrated Area Based Approach (IABA). The IABA consists of a programme of interventions based on the involvement of local communities in dialogue and cooperation among government, employers’ and workers’ organizations²⁷. The purpose of the CLFZ concept is to establish child labour free villages, communes, and/or districts as models for other provinces²⁸.
44. The decision to test approaches to establishing CLFZs and CLFS influenced the selection of targets and sectors. The project design indicated that the development of a CLFZ in Kep province would be attempted. Kep was deemed to be a good practical test area of reasonable size with a range of types of WFCL²⁹. The CLFS concept is aimed at establishing areas where no child labour in a specific sector is found. In the case of the current project portering sector in the Municipality of Poi Pet and salt production sector in Kampot were included. The Poi Pet and Kampot areas were selected for initial tests of the CLFS concept as they are in well circumscribed areas and these forms of child labour are relatively easy to identify³⁰. The IABA was also implemented to address urban child labour in some parts of Phnom Penh and Siem Reap.
45. At project inception no specific written definition of Child Labour Free Zones (CLFZ) or Child Labour Free Sectors (CLFS) was prepared. As one staff member noted, “It was not clear at the time that a definition of CLFZ was needed as all concerned felt that the meaning was evident.” The

²⁵ The project included some of the same locations and added several more.

²⁶ Girls received precedence for the supply of bicycles where such a need was identified.

²⁷ Based on information provided by ILO IPEC.

²⁸ International Labour Organization (ILO), International Programme on the Elimination of Child Labour (IPEC) (2008), Project Document: Final Draft, To contribute to developing national capacities to achieve the 2015 national child labor reduction targets and the ILO global targets for ending the Worst Forms of Child Labor in Cambodia by 2016. “Towards Twenty Sixteen: Contributing towards Ending the WFCL in Cambodia. Geneva: ILO-IPEC (Page 16)

²⁹ Kep is a relatively small province so suitable for an initial pilot test. The project document (see preceding reference) indicated that children in Kep province are working in fishing, salt production, stone breaking, construction work, restaurants, handicraft (selling), child domestic labour, gathering fire wood and non-timber forest products and working in agriculture.

³⁰ As opposed to more hidden types of child labor such as domestic child labor and commercial sexual exploitation of children (CSEC). Although portering across the border in Thailand and in hidden crossing areas is still difficult to identify (See Section 4.4.2)

project staff member added that it gradually became apparent that the concept is much more complex than initially thought. The need for a definition was then identified so that criteria could be set to determine when a zone could be identified as truly child labour free.

46. The evaluation collected information from various sources—including interviews by the evaluation team and from the Enabling Environment Sub-study—to determine understanding of stakeholders with respect to the definition of CLFZs. Stakeholders cited a wide range of different interpretations of CLFZ and CLFS. Some of the definitions people provided were broader than one would expect while others were narrower. In several cases a CLFZ was understood broadly to mean that “children are not working, they go to school, *and* people in the area understand about child labour.” In some other cases people felt that “if all the child beneficiaries targeted by the project have been reached then the area can be declared a CLFZ.” Other interviewees felt that a CLFZ is a general goal, not an absolute state that can be measured using permanent criteria. As one person noted, “Due to mobility a place can be child labour free but the next day an influx of migrants into the area can change the entire situation.” This wide range of ways of understanding the concept indicates the confusion concerning the concept of a CLFZ. Understanding of the concept of a CLFS is less problematic as the sector is clearly defined although even in this case there is some confusion.

4. Achievements- Implementation and Effectiveness

47. The project was able to largely achieve its objectives and related outputs. As several stakeholders pointed out, the achievements of the project objectives are the result of joint efforts and cannot be attributed solely to the project. Given that the project was intended to create networking structures this is a logical comment. Stakeholders from government, workers’ and employers’ organisations, and civil society representatives all contributed to the identified successes. It should be added that some areas where the project was less successful are not necessarily due to project shortcomings as the project did not always have full control over implementation. Examples include (as stated in Section 3.5.1) the formal government adoption of policy and legal frameworks which also depends on bureaucratic processes³¹. While the project could promote advocacy and provide technical support for adoption of such frameworks it could not force passage nor associated budget allocations.

4.1. Overview of Project Achievement of Immediate Objectives³²

48. The project has contributed to the revision and alignment of several key national frameworks to achieve child labour targets. The project has also significantly strengthened knowledge and awareness on child labour although a need for continued intensive awareness raising exists. The capacities of stakeholders have been strengthened, particularly at national and provincial levels.
49. At commune and community levels more work is needed to strengthen capacities to attain the twin goals of reducing child labour by 2015 and eliminating the WFCL by 2016. While sustainable community-based pilot initiatives to combat exploitive child labour/WFCL models were developed, the implementation quality of some elements was challenging. Particularly effective Direct Action models included the development and strengthening of local coordinating mechanisms; capacity building; advocacy and awareness raising in partnership with employers and workers’ organizations and other groups. Most of the challenges faced were due to small budget allocations which had an

³¹See Section 3.5.1, while project outputs do not state that the project must ensure adoption it is implied in the wording of some indicators.

³²Section 4.1 provides a short overview of project achievements with respect to the Immediate Objectives. Further analysis is included under Section 4.3 on the Enabling Environment and 4.4 on Direct Targeted Actions.

impact on implementation and also limited follow up support to the Implementing Agencies (IAs) and Action Programs (AP). It is possible that the models would have been more effective if budget allocations had been larger to allow for more intensive implementation efforts by local stakeholders and technical follow support.

50. The project elected to use a system of implementation at community level using two levels and multiple types of partners which was difficult to control. The project attempted to balance the need for long term sustainability through close involvement of local government with the need for intensive community level work to ensure quality. Most community Action Programs (AP) were channelled through government Implementing Partners (IPs) while local government or NGO partners worked directly in the communities as Executing Agencies (EA). As will be detailed in the remainder of the current section, this “balancing act” was challenging due to multiple constraints including budgetary limits and the existing tasks and responsibilities of officials.
51. The current evaluation report cannot detail all of the results with regard to all of the individual outputs and instead refers to the Final Project Technical Progress Report which is currently being prepared.

Table 1- Overview of Key Results Towards Meeting the Immediate Objectives

Immediate Objective	Key Results Towards Meeting the Objective
IO1 -National frameworks to combat child labour are revised and aligned to achieve national and ILO targets to reduce child labour by 2015 and to end the WFCL by 2016	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Child labour has been integrated as a concern into seven government ministries. - Coordination mechanism - national and sub-national development supported (National Sub-Committee on Child Labour (NSCCL) and CL committees in 15 provinces) - CL issues integrated into key government strategy policies including on education and social protection. - Government overt commitment to and Roadmap towards 2016 goal. - NPA-WFCL I developed and being implemented, NPA-WFCL II under development - NPA on combating CL in fisheries sector developed and adopted - Legislative and enforcement frameworks reviewed, gaps identified, revised and additional inputs for improvement made and proposed amendment of the labour law. - Four new Prakas³³ on CL developed and put in place.
IO2 -Knowledge on child labour of stakeholders and partners has been strengthened.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Studies and surveys related to CL conducted, findings disseminated widely. Reports included on legal framework gap analysis; education, social protection and child labour policy linkages; child labour monitoring systems, resource mobilisation; and sustainability. - Studies have been used to inform policy and legal framework development, planning of child labour actions. - Knowledge sharing platforms/workshops, meetings held - Awareness raising materials, TV, radio programs on CL developed and disseminated. - Nationwide annual observance of the World Day Against Child Labour (WDACL) - Wide ranging stakeholder involvement in awareness raising. - Community awareness raising, child peer education.

³³ Government regulations

IO3- Capacity of stakeholders and partners has been strengthened.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Training packages on CL including on ILO C 138, 182, 29, relevant government policies, NPA-WFCL, Prakas, root causes and consequences of CL for specific target audiences developed and conducted. - Inter-agency collaboration on capacity strengthening/ - Capacity built through stakeholders' involvement in the implementation of Action Programmes, Mini Programmes, Service Contracts, etc.
IO4- Effective and sustainable community-based pilot initiatives to combat exploitive/WFCL serve as replicable models for Cambodia.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Children withdrawn and prevented from child labour. - Development of replicable models on child labour elimination in Cambodia on: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ◦ Community based awareness raising ◦ Rapid Listing system to identify child labourers and monitoring systems. ◦ Community Learning Centres (CLC) for bridging education of child labourers back to formal schools ◦ Vocational/skill training for child labourers ◦ Livelihoods and income generation program for households with child labourers ◦ Resource mobilization methodologies

4.1.1. Immediate Objective 1 on National Frameworks

52. The project has been very active through advocacy and technical support for the integration of child labour in policy and legal frameworks. Technical support was provided in meetings, through training on child labour issues, and dissemination of relevant research that was carried out with project coordination and funding.
53. Synergies resulting from the linking of the first three project IOs is thus apparent as can be noted from Table I. The project was even able to support the mainstreaming of child labour into a Fisheries National Action Plan which had not been part of the original project planning. It should be noted that the responsible government official in the Ministry of Agriculture, Forestry and Fisheries (MAFF) stated that the original impetus came after the official had attended a workshop on child labour jointly organised by the Food and Agriculture Organization (FAO) and the ILO in 2010. The official, further, pointed out that her office had not been very aware of the dangers of child labour in fishing prior to that point in time.
54. Although progress has been made, some elements still require further attention. The NPA-WFCL II still needs to be finalised. A zero draft is ready and includes input provided through technical support from the project. One stakeholder noted that a next draft still requires a more detailed description of the future roles of the different relevant line ministries with respect to addressing child labour issues.
55. Officials from the Ministry of Labour and Vocational Training (MoLVT) stated that the delays in finalising the NPA WFCL II are mostly because the new policy needs to be grounded in the most current child labour data. The National Institute of Statistics (NIS) has recently finished doing the basic tabulation of a child labour survey that was recently carried out and final results are expected in February, 2013. Once information from the child labour survey is finalised the NPA-WFCL II will be adjusted, submitted to the National Sub-Committee on Child Labour, and submitted to other councils including the Council of Ministers for approval. The MoLVT representatives indicated that

they expect the NPA-WFCL II to be fully approved by the end of 2013. The MoLVT representatives did note, however, that as the NPA-WFCL II is awaiting finalising, the NPA-WFCL I will continue to guide on-going work of government structures on child labour.

56. As part of the country's obligation with respect to its ratification of ILO C. 138 (in 1999) and C. 182 (in 2005), a project consultant was engaged and carried out an analysis of the Cambodian labour law. The purpose was to study the Labour Law and determine the extent to which it can be revised, or additional elements on child labour can be added. The project reported that the process to adapt the labour law is very complex and, so far, the MoLVT has been reluctant to invest the time and human resources to do so as the MoLVT indicates that there are other important pending issues that also need to be addressed³⁴. As one interviewee noted using a Cambodian saying, "The food is ready but it is not sure if people are ready to eat".
57. The scope of the labour law is limited to the formal sector while the advantage of the Prakas is that they cover both formal and informal economy workers. One government representative noted, the Prakas are very good and help fill the gaps, but we have no funding attached to enforcing the Prakas. Labour inspectors who have been trained on child labour can technically cover the informal economy and report incidents of child labour even if it is not covered by the labour law.
58. The project was able to provide support for the development of 4 new Prakas that contain specific regulations on child labour. Prakas are important as, although they are not formal laws, they do carry moral weight and are commonly recognised as important due to historical customary traditions. At provincial level some provincial orders have also been developed that can be used to enforce actions against child labour.
59. The actual enforcement of existing laws and regulations was not as fully achieved as the project had anticipated. An interesting positive element is, however, the Code of Conduct on child labour that was adopted by the Salt Producers Community of Kampot and Kep and the CAMFEBA garment employers' code of conduct³⁵. The Code of Conduct outlines the commitment of employers against child labour and the penalties that will be imposed on members who allow children to work in their production areas³⁶. Children and other stakeholders noted that parents' awareness that salt producers will enforce their Code of Conduct will have a major impact on reducing children's work in the next salt production season. Several reasons exist for the still limited enforcement of existing national laws and regulations. Reasons include the lack of human resources in the labour inspectorate. There is also a need to continue to improve the understanding of labour inspectors, police and other enforcement agents regarding their roles and responsibilities for enforcing hazardous child labour elimination.

4.1.2. Immediate Objective 2 on Knowledge Strengthening

60. Immediate Objective Two has two main components, 1) development and carrying out of relevant research on child labour to inform efforts to eliminate child labour, and 2) awareness raising. As indicated in Table 2, the project has supported³⁷ or provided input into research on a range of subjects related to child labour. Some reports on research recently conducted were still being finalised at the time of the evaluation. An end-line survey report on the prevalence of WFCL in Kep province and in salt production in Kampot province is almost ready. An analysis of good

³⁴ Such as on workers unions

³⁵ Employers' organization

³⁶ According to the Code, children are not allowed to work as employees or with their parents as helpers.

³⁷ A full and detailed list can be obtained from project technical progress reports.

practices and lessons learnt to share models developed under IO4 is being concluded. The report will be available in December 2012 to be shared with project stakeholders.

61. The project used information from the various surveys to provide input into capacity strengthening efforts under IO3. Information was distributed in written form but also discussed at meetings and in training workshops to help stakeholders integrate any relevant information into their work.
62. National stakeholders expressed appreciation of the documents that had been prepared with project support even if in some cases, such as the analysis of the labour law and resource mobilisation, they have not yet been able to realise extensive action based on the reports. Much of the information included in the reports continues to remain relevant as Cambodia moves forward with mainstreaming child labour into various policies, strategies, and actions. There is thus a need to continue to draw attention to the knowledge that was generated with project support. Systems to collect, analyse and use information generated in provinces needs to be developed as the country starts to fully implement the Child Labour Monitoring System.
63. Awareness raising approaches developed with support from the project are varied and have been used in a range of settings. These include mass media, holding of events such as the World Day Against Child Labour (WDACL), distribution of awareness raising materials, advocacy and awareness raising in meetings and informal gatherings.
64. The Ministry of Information has played a key role in the development of mass media and other materials while employers' and workers' organisations have also developed and disseminated materials. Call-in radio shows on child labour issues have appeared to be popular. Aside from regular national radio shows, in Kampong Cham the Department of Information disseminated shows on child labour 8 times during 2012 even while the Province was only receiving sustainability support from the project. In communities, implementing partners and executing agencies have raised awareness using direct interpersonal communications methods.
65. Awareness of the impact of child labour on the health of children, the perpetuation of the cycle of poverty, and the national economy has increased over the last years. According to national level stakeholders, the project contribution to greater awareness is very visible although the efforts of other agencies and projects that include actions on child labour have also played a role. Examples include the work implemented with the workers' and employers' organizations, through mass media, with local authorities, with leading community members..
66. It is important to recall that in evaluations an attempt is always made to differentiate the effects of the project being evaluated from the impact of other sources on results. At national level it is difficult, however, to make a precise analysis due to the influence of diverse sources ranging from attendance of officials in international conferences, exposure to the international media, to other projects such as the Winrock USDOL funded project, as well as other UN and NGO efforts. At provincial level, depending on the location and presence of other agencies, a more evident differentiation could be made. In communes and communities there has mostly been less overlap so that attribution of results to the project is easier to make.
67. Among the national level interviewees, understanding of the various negative ramifications of child labour is quite evident and well integrated. Interviewees at provincial level were convinced of the necessity to address child labour issues and some were able to point to larger issues such as the long term impact of continued child labour on the development of Cambodia. At community level understanding is variable and most highly focused on the negative *physical* impact on child development and the interference of child labour with fully accessing education. Links to the mental

and moral impact of some types of child labour were not readily made during interviews with different stakeholders at community level. In every community location that the evaluation team visited, however, interviewees and focus group members loudly and clearly stated their negative opinion of child labour. Children, in particular, shouted at full volume that they felt child labour is “bad”. Children further detailed their opinion by stating that child labour interferes with their physical development and their ability to benefit from education.

4.1.3. Immediate Objective 3 on Capacity Strengthening

68. The project strengthened capacities through training workshops, dissemination of research, technical support in Action Programs and meetings, and direct contacts. The capacities of institutions were also strengthened to develop structures and coordination mechanisms to address child labour issues. Training included officials in Ministries and Departments of Labour, Education, Women’s Affairs, Social Affairs, Interior, Information, Planning, etc. as well as workers’ and employers organisations, and the Civil Society Network against Child labour (CSNACL).
69. Much training was provided through a three tiered system. Senior trainers were trained on the relevant child labour subjects. The senior trainers then trained others who in turn, at the third tier, trained or provided information and other forms of awareness raising to groups at local levels. Training was channelled, among others, through government agencies, employers’ and workers’ organisations, and the Civil Society Network Against Child Labour Organization (CSNACL). The Ministry of Interior, for example, trained Commune Councils to integrate child labour concerns into their work and into commune development plans.
70. The three tier system allowed for efficient use of human and financial resources although quality at the third tier was variable. As project staff pointed out, “The level of absorption of the lead trainers varied which resulted in differences in terms of their capacities to share what they had learned further down.” Project staff also indicated that the project lacked sufficient resources to provide training materials to all participants participating in third tier training activities.
71. The capacity strengthening provided with project support was well received. Evaluation interviewees³⁸ indicated that they found that their capacities to address child labour had been strengthened substantially even if it was not always easy to implement what had been learned. Implementation was hampered in some situations by the need for yet further capacity strengthening, such as on institution building, and to increase understanding of the difference between child labour and child work. One interviewee stated, for example that, “Sometimes the ILO comes and does presentations on child labour and child work at our meetings. We still need a lot more information sharing on this, though.” Budget constraints within the different agencies also impeded the implementation of activities, including allocations at commune level to scale up child labour actions.
72. The project established cross-linkages of the capacity strengthening with other immediate objectives. The capacities of officials of the Ministry of Information were, for example, strengthened on the integration of child labour into awareness raising materials (IO2). A capacity assessment of the MoLVT was conducted to determine existing resources and requirements for policy and legal framework harmonisation and enforcement (IO1). Training and direct technical support was provided to the MoLVT to help enable them to address the challenges of eliminating child labour.

³⁸ In the overall interviews conducted by the Team Leader with the National Consultant as well as through the Enabling Environment Sub-study, training and other forms of capacity strengthening were much appreciated.

4.1.4. Immediate Objective 4 on Models for Direct Actions, Withdrawal and Prevention of Child Labour in Specific Zones and Sectors

73. The project developed nine Action Programs (APs) to withdraw or prevent children from the WFCL that can serve as replicable models. Five of these APs were integrated programs in the provinces of Kampot, Kep, Phnom Penh, Siem Reap, and Banteay Meanchey. An additional four smaller APs were implemented in the new project areas of Kampong Thom, Battambang, Kandal, and Koh Kong. Some issues regarding the quality of the attainment of IO4 were identified and can be largely attributed to the continued need for closer and more intensive work at community level. Details about the challenges on quality of attainment of IO4 are discussed in Section 4.4.
74. The APs usually used a combination of similar approaches to achieve targets. The approaches generally included:
- developing and strengthening coordinating mechanisms;
 - capacity building;
 - advocacy and awareness raising;
 - direct interventions to identify and remove/prevent children from child labour through formal and non-formal education, vocational and skill trainings;
 - promoting self-help groups and income generation for poorest of the poor families of targeted children;
 - development of gender sensitivity;
 - resource mobilisation; and
 - identifying and documenting good practices and lessons learned.
75. A more detailed analysis of the effectiveness of the different components of the direct action APs is included in Section 4.4.
76. The project was able to achieve its target of withdrawing or preventing over 11,000 children from child labour although, mostly due to definition issues, it is not entirely certain if all of these children are fully withdrawn or prevented from child labour. The project reports that 5846 children were withdrawn and 5,884 were prevented from child labour for a total of 11,744. While the project did achieve its overall target, it failed to achieve its withdrawn target by 1,354 children. Almost one half of the children withdrawn or prevented are girls.
77. The evaluation team was unable to conduct a study of the numbers using random quantitative sampling processes as this would have taken substantially more time than had been allocated to the evaluation. Qualitative interviews were conducted with groups of children, parents, local community based monitors, commune officials, employers and other stakeholders. These interviews (and focus groups) indicated that while beneficiaries had been withdrawn or prevented from child labour, some might not strictly be considered as withdrawn or prevented using Direct Beneficiary Monitoring and Reporting (DBMR) definitions. Despite an improvement in their work and education status, some randomly selected children who had been reported as withdrawn were still involved in some work according to their description of their work situation. Their descriptions indicated that, according to the definitions of child labour and hazardous work, they were still in child labour. The MoLVT also expressed concern that some beneficiary children are still in what should be termed as hazardous child labour. The primary reasons were a lack of understanding of the difference between light work and hazardous child labour as well as some other contextual

factors. A few provincial officials were still uncertain of the definition of hazardous work, as one Department of Labour official stated for example, “Children from the age of 12 who help their parents just to pick up the bricks and push the carts...to me that is light work” while other officials disagreed with this statement.

78. In another case community-based monitors also argued with each other in front of the evaluation team about the definition of light work. Some argued that scavenging, a WFCL in Cambodia is not hazardous if the hours are reduced. One focus group member, however, adamantly insisted that scavenging is hazardous and children should not be counted as withdrawn if they still engage in it. In the same location some beneficiary children stated that they still worked as porters at reduced hours after school or weekends although a few stated that they now carry lighter loads. Some monitors stated that light work is simply any work that does not result in accidents. In other locations there were similar issues with understanding of definitions regarding when a child could be considered withdrawn or prevented. Official government documents, including the Labour Law and NPA-WFCL need to clarify the difference between child labour and child work as this will help local authorities to implement actions and clarify the issues sustainably at local levels need to give clear and concrete examples of both child labour and child work.
79. Several stakeholders pointed out that the criteria for withdrawal, in particular, were not always realistic. As one interviewee pointed out, “the criteria are so absolute...they do not take some of the range of specific tasks that children do into account”. In the case of scavenging, for example, collecting discarded water bottles in the street is different from scavenging in large heaps of garbage. This means that, technically, a child who scavenges water bottles or picks up plastic bags using gloves after school for one hour should not be considered withdrawn. Similarly, the element of protection from hazardous work by improving working conditions is not well defined. In the case of working in brick production, for example, what kinds of occupational safety and health (OSH) measures would render the work non-hazardous so that the child can be considered withdrawn³⁹?
80. In Cambodia a Prakas defining light work describes 15 allowable types of light work which can help clarify some of the confusion. Extensive continued dissemination of the Prakas coupled with awareness raising explanations about its content can help increase understanding of the difference between child labour and child work.
81. Other contextual factors that influenced monitoring included points such as the pity felt by community based monitors/workplace monitors for the families enrolled in the project. As one monitor related, “the households make a lot of effort to reduce the children’s working hours. Given their poverty it is just unrealistic for them to withdraw their children fully from hazardous work. So I count them as withdrawn if I see improvement.” The extent to which this interpretation was common could not be fully assessed since, due to evaluation time constraints, the evaluation team was not able to meet a large number of monitors. The evaluation team did find that there were some questions with the way that monitors interpreted the terms in different locations.
82. In two locations children, parents, and local community leaders were not aware of any monitoring system of child beneficiaries. This may be, however, because the monitors do not formally announce their roles when they verify beneficiaries. Several monitors indicated that they mostly determine whether children are working by checking absenteeism with teachers as they did not have the resources to verify actual work levels in work situations. As a result the extent of after school and weekend work may not always have been fully monitored. In most locations visited it was

³⁹ A consultant did conduct a study funded through the project on the OSH conditions of children in brick works.

clear that beneficiaries' child labour had been significantly reduced but the extent to which children could be officially counted using the strict criteria could not be verified.

Table2- Children Withdrawn or Prevented by Type of Child Labour

Type of Child Labour	Withdrawn			Prevented			Total
	Girls	Boys	Total	Boys	Girls	Total	
Urban CL (begging; scavenging; selling flowers, newspapers, souvenirs; car washing; shoe polishing; construction services; providing services in restaurants, night clubs, Karaoke, domestic households) – Phnom Penh	420	565	985	416	434	850	1835
Urban CL - Siem Reap Province	435	459	894	538	573	1111	2005
Salt production - Kampot Province	89	87	176	317	343	660	836
Fishing, salt, stone breaking, restaurants, sea food processing, agriculture, and construction - Kep Province	183	215	398	935	870	1805	2203
Portering – Banteay Meanchey/Poi Pet	960	937	1897	328	303	631	2528
Brick works – Battambang	217	358	575	56	69	125	700
Brick works – Kandal Province	236	206	442	202	183	385	827
In-land Fishing – Kampong Thom	181	228	409	148	169	317	726
Trafficking & CSEC – for Svay Rieng, Banteay Meanchey and Siem Reap	70	0	70	0	14	0	84
Total	2791	3055	5846	2940	2958	5884	11744

4.1.5. Timely Realisation of Outputs Over the Life of the Project

83. The project staff reported that approximately 80% of the outputs were delivered in a timely manner. The reasons for initial slow development of the APs during the first year of the project were not entirely clear but can be attributed to several factors. The slow official signing of APs with government agencies, which was attributed to bureaucratic processes, was one of the causes for delays. With respect to the direct actions, the principal reason for delays was the need for the project to provide the IAs with intensive support to ensure that the APs proposals were of high quality. Some IPs also had difficulty to understand how to produce their progress reports and needed a great deal of assistance from the project which caused slow-downs. Floods and local elections further impeded progress in some locations. A change in project management early in the last year of the project further temporarily slowed down some of the work. As a result of all of these challenges, a particularly tight squeeze resulted at the end of the implementation period to achieve the outputs for the number of children to be withdrawn or prevented from child labour.

4.1.6. Implementation of Mid-term Evaluation Recommendations

84. The project Mid-term Evaluation (MTE) expressed concern regarding the timeliness and coverage of the Action Programs and some other project activities. The MTE made recommendations to review project implementation work plans and budgets and take appropriate measures to ensure that it could reach the projected objectives and related outcomes. As summarised in Table 2, the project took action to address the recommendations and was subsequently able to reach most of the targets. Most of the AP implementation periods had to be extended to ensure that their outputs could be realised to the extent possible. The extensions allowed the project to fully carry out activities such as documentation of lessons learned/good practices and preparations for sustainability which were carried out in a timely manner. Details of project actions in response to the MTE are available in Annex 1.

4.2. Selection of Implementing Agencies and Action Programs

85. The selection of IAs was based on project Phase I experience, input from stakeholders, selection criteria and quality of APs. Selection criteria of IAs included the relevance of their existing mandate, experience on relevant subjects such as education, ability to implement, and potential to contribute to sustainability of AP outcomes. The project verifies the reputation of NGOs by visiting their offices and verifying references and status with donors.
86. The project APs were implemented under the overall guidance, coordination and supervision of Implementing Agencies (IAs). In several cases—particularly where downstream actions were being implemented, Executing Agencies (EAs) and Supporting Agencies (SAs)—were associated. Executing Agencies could be government or various types of non-state actors and were responsible for coordinating and implementing activities to realise specific outputs in the APs. An example of the role of an SA is contribution on awareness raising in communities. The Executing Agencies had sub-contracts with the IAs while the SAs used their own resources to contribute to the actions. In Banteay Meanchey province, for instance, the Provincial Department of Labour Vocational Training (PDLVT) was the Implementing Agency, while EAs included various other provincial departments as well as the Municipal Council, chapter of the Civil Society Network Against Child Labour (CSNACL), the Cambodia Hope Organization (CHO), and local employers and workers organisations. IAs also implemented some of the actions to achieve the APs outputs themselves. Each AP is assisted by an Action Programme Implementation Committee (APIC) comprised of the IA, EAs, SAs and representatives of other stakeholder groups.
87. While this system allowed for a good joint approach and the establishment of potentially sustainable structures, the level of project control over the downstream activities of the EAs was limited. As the IAs were responsible for the results of the EAs much depended on the budget and human resources that were available to supervise and monitor the work of the EAs. The IAs received some support from the project to cover official travel and other supplementary costs while the IAs provided input into the APs in the form of office premises, meeting venues, communications, networking and utilities.
88. The project elected to include government agencies as the key implementing partners since the government is seen as key to long term sustainability (see also Section 4.1). Government agencies were responsible for 8 of the 15 APs. Employers' organisations as well as NGOs were also associated to work on specific subject areas relevant to their mandate and experience. Non-state actors are more frequently donor or membership driven and thus often depend on a stream of external resources to maintain in-depth action over the long term. The ability of NGOs to ensure sustainability at community level can be particularly challenging unless they can enable communities to mobilise resources independently. In some countries where community based organisations are vibrant and empowered, at least some communities have been able to mobilise resources for sustainability⁴⁰. In the case of Cambodia, the project noted that the role of government is key in implementation of various development initiatives at all levels. Decentralisation is well underway but several evaluation interviewees -as well as research⁴¹- indicated that due to Cambodia's socio-cultural framework, initiatives are still largely driven by government officials.

⁴⁰ This includes countries such as Indonesia and the Philippines where some communities have been able to obtain district budget allocations and/or corporate social responsibility resources to support child labor actions for education.

⁴¹ Research external to the project such as, 1) Cham Rotha & Chheang, Vannarith (undated) Cultural Challenges to the Decentralization Process in Cambodia. Phnom Penh: Asia Foundation; Kyoto: Ritsumeikan University. 2) Smoke, Paul & Morrison, Joanne (2008). Decentralization in Cambodia: Consolidating Central Power or Building Accountability from Below? International Studies Program Working Paper 08-36. Atlanta: International Studies Program, Andrew Young School of Policy Studies, Georgia State University.

Positive elements of this situation are evident as the hierarchy within government helps contribute to the translation of national policies and legal frameworks into local actions. At the same time, effective community level input into local decision making on issues such as decentralised budget allocations are still in the process of development⁴². Given the usefulness of local knowledge in the development of policies and plans, it will be useful to emphasise the role of communities more extensively in the future.

89. The final evaluation included interviews and workshop based input from representatives of all principal stakeholders on such issues. Research and discussions conducted with different project consultants provided further insights into the influences of implementing and executing agencies on project outcomes. The evaluator is of the opinion that, in the context of Cambodia, associating government agencies as key implementing partners is useful given their sustainable presence in the localities. Civil society actors will also need to be included, including in particular to stimulate advocacy by downstream actors so that local government actively implements needed child labour and related actions.

4.2.1. Implementing Agencies- Strong Points and Challenges

90. Strong points of government agencies include the existing use of systems that are already in place, experience on policy implementation, enforcement of legislation, and hierarchical linking from national to local levels. Challenges include low salaries which result in difficulties to consistently attract highly experienced and/or competent staff. The project noted that, where there is insufficiently proficient staff, the quality of work and progress reports was affected. Project staff was, subsequently, required to invest substantial time to support improvement in their reports. Government staff also does not necessarily see the project APs as part of their core work responsibilities.
91. One of the key challenges the IAs, EAs and project staff cited was the limited budget allocated to implementing the project APs, especially for direct actions and in comparison to TBP Phase I. According to the Cambodian government and donor regulations, where government agencies function as project IAs their staff members cannot receive salary supplements. Very small transport stipends were, however, provided although these were not considered adequate to cover all cost. The government specifies the per diem at different levels in accordance with staff status in the hierarchy which some staff do not consider fair. Sub-national level government staff, in particular, believe that their salaries are already low while they are asked to do supplementary tasks not included in their normal work load without adequate compensation. Such government staff also consider that NGO staff are paid for their work on project activities while they are not. This lack of extra remuneration creates some tension as they are expected to work together to implement the APs jointly. Sub-national government staff stated that the multi-sectoral, multi-level work needed to address child labour is complicated and requires a great level of effort. Aspects such as data collection for the project Direct Beneficiary Monitoring and Reporting (DBMR) and reporting were seen as time consuming and complex. The quality of downstream monitoring appeared to be somewhat affected by the lack of adequate compensation and tensions. Despite this situation, however, government staff indicated that they are dedicated to achieving the project objectives.
92. Employers' organisations have good relations with their membership and are supportive of adoption of the legislative tools such as the Prakas. The support of workers' and employers' organisations is key as the Prakas have to be consulted and recommended by a tripartite body before it could be approved and put in place by the MoLVT. The employers' organisations have an established

⁴² Ibid

internal system for capacity strengthening which facilitates the channelling of training on child labour and related subjects. The reports of the employers' organisations tend to be good. In terms of challenges, the employers' organisations find that⁴³ not all of their members are convinced of the need to address child labour issues. Some employer members tell CAMFEBA staff that "We do not employ children ourselves so why should we spend time on this issue?" Another challenge is that employers' organisations in Cambodia have not yet included informal economy employers in their membership which prevents them from directly reaching out to such employers.

93. Workers' organisations also have good relations with their membership and are likewise supportive of the adoption of legislative tools such as the Prakas. Workers' organisations have good experience with advocacy techniques and have channels for capacity building. In Cambodia the workers' organisations consist of many factions with different political priorities. With regard to child labour, however, the workers' organisations agree with each other and cooperate even if, in the initial stages this was challenging.
94. The Civil Society Network against Child Labour (CSNACL) consists of NGOs, associations, clubs, and religious leaders/groups. The CSNACL has 7 provincial chapters and a national chapter in Phnom Penh. The CSNACL are skilled at awareness raising and are competent in terms of mainstreaming child labour issues into the work of their members and is able to mobilise a large number of people such as for the WDACL. The network is also able to conduct some resource mobilisation such as when they were able to raise funds for some school bags and uniforms in Kep and Kampot Provinces. Challenges include the limited stipends for members who engage in child labour actions, as only a small stipend is provided to cover transport and communications. Each chapter has an executive committee which does not receive any support for meetings so it is challenging to ensure their full participation in planning meetings. Linking between the national and provincial executive committees can also be improved. The penetration and sectoral coverage of the CSNACL is still limited while institution building and capacity strengthening still needs further support.
95. The project has only two Implementing Agency NGO partners although there are some NGOs among the Executing Agencies. The NGOs are relatively smaller organisations with staff that have adequate salaries based on donor funding. NGOs tend to be relatively good at meeting deadlines and report writing which helped contribute to project efficiency. NGOs were not specialised in child labour prior to the project although they had experience working on child protection issues. The NGOs mostly do not mainstream child labour into their other activities since, as two of the NGOs interviewed indicated, donors tend to have other priorities. The evaluation team suggests that NGOs need to engage more with their other donors so that they can mainstream child labour into all of their relevant actions. The project did encourage NGOs to promote such mainstreaming. One NGO did already have some success with this but recognised that more work is needed to ensure that other donors also understand the importance of child labour issues.

4.2.2. Selection and Usefulness of the Action Programs

96. The Action Programs were selected in line with the expected project immediate objectives and expected outputs. All of the APs were useful and in line with the project design. Of particular importance were the establishment of the additional provincial child labour committees in new project provinces and the integration of child labour into the commune councils.

⁴³ Also noted by the project staff.

97. Criteria for the selection the Action Programs (APs) included the quality of the IAs (see Section 4.2.1); the extent to which the APs correspond to project outputs, and quality of the proposals. Assessment of the quality of proposals was at least partially dependent on the extent to which the APs included important methodologies. In the case of direct actions, for example, the AP should have included awareness raising, withdrawal and prevention of child labour methods, and capacity strengthening of local actors.
98. The efforts of the Ministry of Interior to capacitate Commune Councils to integrate child labour concerns into their work and into Commune Development Plans formed part of an important AP. The importance of attributing sustainable budget and other support to child labour elimination efforts where it occurs cannot be underestimated. The extent to which Commune Councils will be able to take sustainable action remains to be seen and will be discussed in further detail in Section 4.3.5.
99. Participants in the Evaluation National Stakeholders Workshop indicated that in the future, APs need increased participation from local stakeholders so that local context and ownership are maximised. Another issue raised was the need to simplify the format of AP project design as the complexity interfered with efficient design, implementation and reporting.

4.3. Enabling Environment

100. Although a short overview of the Immediate Objective results was discussed in preceding sections, the remainder of Section 4 details the key issues regarding the implementation and outcomes with respect to the Enabling Environment (Section 4.3) and the Direct Actions at local levels (4.4). The inter-relationships between the enabling environment and local direct actions are also discussed.
101. The project was highly focused on ensuring that the enabling environment could provide the necessary framework to sustainably eliminate the WFCL and other hazardous child labour in Cambodia. The project was able to substantially contribute to the strengthening of the enabling environment and can be said to constitute an important project success area. As compared to other countries—and in collaboration with enabling environment stakeholders—the project has achieved success. Much work remains to be done but progress is clearly evident. Functioning structures have been established at national, provincial, and commune levels that currently hold regular meetings. At national level the Department of Child Labour, under the MoLVT, has a staff of 36 which is responsible for policy and legal framework development, advocacy, awareness raising, training, coordination and supervision of actions. The Department of Child Labour is active in promoting the mainstreaming of child labour in different ministries and at different levels of the government hierarchy. The National Sub-Committee to combat child labour meets on a quarterly basis, while provincial and commune structures also meet regularly. A methodology for Child Labour Monitoring System has been developed, piloted and is ready for replication and scaling up if the necessary resources are available.
102. Some key remaining challenges include the need for the Labour Law to delineate child labour and child work; continued dissemination of information and awareness raising on child labour; increase resources to develop actions to eliminate child labour including appropriate services to support parents. Clear integration of the Child Labour Monitoring System (CLMS) into government referral systems in the areas of child protection, education, and health⁴⁴ will be necessary. Systems for data collection and analysis are also still needed.

⁴⁴ To address children's mental, moral and physical health issues resulting from hazardous child labor as necessary.

103. The MoLVT expressed satisfaction with the support that the project provided with capacity strengthening and other enabling environment efforts. The MoLVT representatives indicated that they had benefitted from training of trainers on providing capacity strengthening. Other ministries at national level, including the Ministry of Interior, Ministry of Information, Ministry of Planning, also indicated that project technical support in various forms had been useful to help develop actions and mainstream child labour into their work.
104. The MoLVT indicated that they would like to see further specialised working groups in the National Sub-Committee on Child Labour such as on child labour-education and child labour-social protection. While the project worked closely with the government, some of the national government representatives indicated that even more of the child labour projects/actions need to be channelled through the government. They argue that the government always needs to be part of the implementation process, even where NGOs are also associated as otherwise, “we are not sufficiently involved in what is happening.”
105. As already discussed in Section 4.2.1, the bringing together of government and NGOs in collaborative efforts, particularly at community level, is challenging and needs to be reviewed. In the case of government led APs, the government did coordinate/hold meetings and supervise work of participating NGOs and/or their own offices at community level. With the exception of WDACL⁴⁵, however, actions of the participating agencies tended to be somewhat separate in accordance with their AP specific tasks. Mechanisms linking NGOs and civil society groups to systems such as the CLMS can provide key instruments to improve detailed collaboration of stakeholders working to eliminate hazardous child labour. The referral, monitoring, and follow up systems included in a well-functioning CLMS can bring together all of the concerned parties if it is well-organised.

4.3.1. Structures Established to Address the Elimination of Child Labour

106. Aside from the sizable Department of Child Labour with its 36 staff members, Cambodia has established a number of structures to address child labour. Through both Phase I and II of the IPEC project implementation technical support was provided to establish and develop the capacities of these structures. The National Sub-Committee on Child Labour is one of four sub-committees under the Cambodian National Council for Children (CNCC) to develop policy and review as well as endorse the project AP proposals⁴⁶. The Labour Advisory Committee reviews all relevant laws on child labour in individual industries to ensure that the regulations can be effectively implemented. The National Civil Society Network Against Child Labour (CSNACL), conducts training on child labour and meets bi-monthly to coordinate relations between the national and provincial Civil Society Networks and monitor the project APs. Provincial Committees on child labour are composed of representatives of different government departments and civil society. Employers’ and workers’ organisations are represented in all of the child labour bodies. The Inter Trade Union Committee on Child Labour (ITUCL), further, coordinates the efforts of workers’ organizations to raise awareness of child labour and meets bi-monthly.

⁴⁵ The WDACL was a good example of collaborative action bringing together implementing agencies, executing agencies, supporting agencies, community-based civil society groups, employers and workers representatives and other relevant stakeholders.

⁴⁶ Information from this section and some other sections is partially obtained from the report of Ann Bishop on Good Practices and Lessons Learned (see references).

107. During the project implementation period each province also has an Action Programme Implementing Committee (APIC) composed of tripartite plus. These committees share information about AP implementation including discussion of monitoring and how to address challenges encountered.

4.3.2. Decentralisation

108. The Royal Government of Cambodia's (RGC) is currently implementing a 10 year National Program (NP) of Sub-national Democratic Development (SNDD). The program is aimed at the establishment, governance, functioning and oversight of decentralised Sub-national Administrations (SNA)⁴⁷. A first three-year implementation plan (IP3) covering the first period (2011 to 2013) of the NP-SNDD is currently underway. The Ministry of Interior holds responsibility for various decentralisation processes.
109. The project contributed to the development of the enabling environment in the decentralisation processes. The project worked closely with the Ministry of Interior on supporting the strengthening of attention to child labour in decentralised functions. The Ministry of Interior representatives appreciated the support of the project in this subject area. Other sub-national stakeholders also valued the support of the project for the development of advocacy and capacity strengthening on child labour. An AP focussing on integrating and articulating child labour concerns into the work of Commune Councils, Commune Development Plans, and Commune Investment Plans was implemented through the Ministry of Interior's Department of Local Administration (DoLA). With technical support from the project, DOLA developed a three tiered training system through which 10 DOLA trainers trained 170 trainers at the provincial government level who in turn trained 279 commune councillors.
110. As several evaluation interviewees pointed out, Commune Councils base their budget allocation decisions on the visibility of projects and, therefore, frequently decide to finance local infrastructure as opposed to investing in social actions. Raising awareness and increasing understanding of Commune Councils on child labour issues is useful but, as interviewees also noted, they do not guarantee that Commune Councils will allocate funds to address them. Locally available decentralised budgets are still limited, so advocacy from communities into Commune Council decision making is vital. The role of communities in advocating for such budget allocations for child labour related issues is still limited and needs to be further strengthened.

4.3.3 Commitment, National Agencies Mainstreaming of Child Labour Issues

111. In line with evidence from the NPA-WFCL I, the government commitment to eliminating child labour is relatively good. The Cambodian Prime Minister had written the Foreword of the NPA-WFCL I and continues to state his commitment in public messages. In the case of the Ministry of Information, for example, the ministry normally charges quite high costs to cover the airing of messages through the mass media. In the case of child labour, however, the Ministry aired the messages free of charge.
112. While evaluation individuals interviewed certainly feel ownership, overall government commitment—and that of other entities—in the form of budget allocations still needs to be realised. Aside from human resources allocated to support the NPA-WFCL I, contributions to its implementation was mostly dependent on the ILO IPEC and WINROCK International project inputs. Once the NPA-WFCL II is formally adopted it would be useful to hold a conference inviting

⁴⁷ National Committee for Sub-national Democratic Development (2010) The First Three Years Implementation Plan (2011-2013) of NP-SNDD (IP3). Phnom Penh: National Committee for Sub-national Democratic Development.

potential donors, government agencies, private enterprises, and others to identify entities that can take responsibility for funding different components. Such a conference can form important mechanisms for leveraging of resources to implement the NPA II.

113. The national government and national agencies are mainstreaming child labour issues in government policies and programmes, and structures but much still remains to be done⁴⁸.
114. The Ministry of Education, Youth and Sport (MoEYS) has integrated child labour into its Education Strategic Plan (ESP) II 2009-2013. The Ministry of Information has a range of awareness raising materials and methodologies at its disposal as a result of their AP implemented with project support. Such materials and methodologies can continue to be disseminated although formal decision making on replicating and continuing to disseminate such materials is still needed. Child labour has been integrated into the National Social Protection Strategy (NSPS).
115. Cambodia has not yet started implementing conditional cash transfers schemes so inclusion of attention to families with children in hazardous child labour in such schemes is still theoretical. A conditional cash transfer pilot program is under development for pregnant women and children 0-2 years of age. A representative of the Council for Agricultural and Rural Development (CARD) did, however, indicate that such families are to be targeted in social protections schemes as part of the NSPS. One of the elements of the NSPS is the development of One Window Services for the registration of potential social protection beneficiaries and referral services. Coordination of such a service with the implementation of the CLMS is a potential area for further child labour strategies in Cambodia.
116. The Fisheries Administration is in the process of finalising its next five year development plan which will include an indicator on child labour although funding to implement any child labour actions will still need to be sought. During the evaluation interview, the Fisheries Administration representative stressed the importance that will be attached in their plan to linking reduction of child labour with income generating activities for households. The Fisheries Administration is also working on the development of a Prakas on child labour elimination in the fishing sector. One interesting, albeit small, example of mainstreaming attention to child labour is also the inclusion of two questions on child labour in the secondary school social science exams in 2012 for the first time in Cambodia.
117. Nationally, the Cambodian Federation of Employers and Business Association (CAMFEBA) established a Code of Conduct under phase I of the project against child labour for its membership. Penalties for transgressions include the obligation of employers to pay for the education of any identified child labourer⁴⁹. CAMFEBA has developed a Plan of Action on Child Labour 2012-2016 but implementation has not yet started although a representative indicated that the organisation intends to ask members to donate US \$ 100-200 to implement the plan with a target of US \$ 10,000. Although such an amount is still limited, if it is raised there will be a sign of real commitment from employers.
118. CAMFEBA has integrated awareness raising using Employer Focal Points on Child Labour in 9 provinces/municipalities and materials. CAMFEBA disseminated awareness raising materials to garment factory workers through garment factory employer members. Given that garment factory workers often originate in rural areas with substantial child labour, the potential to channel information back to their communities exists. The extent to which this has been effective has,

⁴⁸ Details about all of the mainstreaming results can only be summarized in the evaluation report but can be obtained from the project.

⁴⁹ i.e., children under the age of 15 and/or working in hazardous conditions until the age of 18.

however, not been verified although it would be useful to assess. CAMFEBA has also leveraged funding from its own resources to be able to fully implement all of the planned activities under its AP for an estimated value of US \$10,000⁵⁰.

119. Workers' Organisations have mainstreamed attention to child labour issues into their overall programming although budgeting remains a challenging area. Members of workers' organisations are usually only able to pay very limited membership fees so organisations do not have a great deal of funding at their own direct disposal to implement actions.
120. The Civil Society Network Against Child Labour (CSNACL) developed a national strategic plan for the period 2013-2017⁵¹. The Strategic Plan includes objectives on enhancing cooperation and strengthening dialogue among relevant actors, building capacities, promoting participation in child labour events, and improving access to information on child labour. While the CSNACL plans to conduct annual budget review requirements analyses, the funding of the activities described in the plan still poses major challenges.
121. Mainstreaming of child labour into *government structures* is reflected in the expansion of child labour committees into new provinces for a total of 15 provinces during the project implementation period. At national level the National Sub-Committee on Child Labour meets every 2-3 months while the provincial child labour committees meet approximately every four months. The Ministry of Interior has determined that it will now proceed with formally mainstreaming and determining the roles and responsibilities of sub-national government entities on child labour issues⁵².
122. Key challenges in mainstreaming centre on the continued need to improve linkages between the various structures and the allocation of budgets to implement the mainstreamed actions. The enforcement of Prakas and other relevant frameworks—such as on trafficking—continue to need substantial attention at national as well as sub-national levels. Labour inspectors, police and child labour monitors who can refer cases to government agencies need further capacity strengthening. Information about the roles and responsibilities of such individuals with respect to identification of cases of hazardous child labour need to be widely disseminated. Dissemination of such information is vital for two reasons, 1) so that the individuals themselves are fully aware of the expectations concerning their roles and responsibilities, 2) so that community members⁵³ can be sufficiently informed to hold responsible individuals accountable.
123. Although the project supported the development of resource mobilisation methodologies for child labour actions, there is also still a need for stakeholders to be more proactive to identify and obtain funding. The evaluation team noted a degree of concern among interviewees regarding their ability to raise funds from sources other than from existing child labour donors⁵⁴. The capacity of the MoLVT, National Sub-Committee on Child Labour (NSC-CL) and other agencies to develop their own proposals on child labour elimination needs further strengthening.
124. Advocacy among agencies of all types and different levels to try to move away from the usual donors is needed. Agencies need, for example, to indicate to government, donors and Corporate Social Responsibility programs that funding of development activities needs to include child labour as a mainstreamed action, just as is now common with the case of gender. Among many agencies in Cambodia the mainstreaming of gender is already an accepted inclusion in programming. Child

⁵⁰ Through subsidizing salary of the staff, office space, utilities.

⁵¹ Civil Society Network Against Child Labour (CSNACL) (2012). Strategic plan 2013-2017. Phnom Penh: CSNACL.

⁵² Announced at the Evaluation National Stakeholders' Workshop.

⁵³ Including children

⁵⁴ Including USDOL but also through other standard international donors.

labour may not need to be as widely integrated as gender since it is not relevant in every situation, but where appropriate, attention to this subject needs to be included in project proposals/development plans as “a matter of course.” Examples include programs supporting education, school feeding, livelihoods, etc. which can prioritise children affected by child labour.

125. Ownership of the national stakeholders with respect to NPA-WFCL I and II is good as evaluation interviewees repeatedly emphasised the importance of these policy documents. Mobilisation of partners and other institutions to be part of the NPA has also been good. Aside from the national tripartite plus partners UNICEF, UNESCO, UNDP, Winrock International, World Vision, Action Aid, Asia Foundation, World Education, and the Education Sector Working Group all provided input into the process. Employers and workers organisation representatives were actively involved in NPA-WFCL I and II design through participation in preparatory meetings and workshops. Employers and workers organisations also implemented APs under the project that are in line with the NPA-WFCL I.

4.3.4. Provincial Government Mainstreaming of Child Labour Issues

126. The provincial mainstreaming of child labour issues is coordinated by the Provincial Committee⁵⁵ on Child Labour (PCCL) in the 15 provinces linked to the project. In some provinces the PCCL has already mainstreamed child labour into Provincial Strategic Plans. Despite the inclusion of child labour in the provincial plans, however, there are still very limited or no budget allocations from the provincial budgets to implement the child labour related actions. A need to continue to support the PCCL with capacity strengthening and budgetary input specific for child labour actions was identified during the evaluation. While much progress has been made, the MoLVT and the PCCL indicated that a capacity needs analysis is still needed followed by intensive upgrading of knowledge and skills on child labour elimination⁵⁶. The responsibilities, roles and functions of the provincial committee members in relation to child labour actions implementation still need to be more clearly defined. Linkages between the PCCL and the NSC-CL also need further development for overall effective coordination of a country-wide approach.
127. The PCCL members met during the evaluation indicated that they are actively involved in regular meetings even if not all members are able to always attend. In most cases the Provincial Governor or Deputy Governor chairs the meetings indicating recognition of the importance of child labour elimination. PCCL members indicated that when replicating the establishment of PCCL in other provinces, the involvement of the Provincial Governor is key to ensuring adequate attention to the subject.
128. The evaluation team visited the PCCL in Kampong Cham. This province was only targeted with capacity strengthening and technical support for sustainability of actions initiated under phase I of the project. The evaluation team found that the Kampong Cham PCCL was still actively functioning and included continued actions on child labour even if these were being implemented at a less intensive rate. Labour Inspectors conduct monitoring in the formal sector and report cases of child labour if they are found. Unfortunately, however, child labour in the informal economy is still not sufficiently addressed. A visit to a rubber plantation area where a vocational training graduate had a small motorbike repair business indicated that many children in the area⁵⁷ still work with their parents in rubber extraction, including at night. The Department of Labour in Kampong Cham prioritises children withdrawn or at risk of child labour in vocational skills training programs. The

⁵⁵ Or municipal committee as is the case in Phnom Penh and Siem Reap.

⁵⁶ Some elements of the current and subsequent sections were obtained from the final evaluation sub-study conducted by Milet Goddard.

⁵⁷ According to children, parents, other community members.

Department of Information continues to broadcast programs on child labour issues. The Winrock International child labour project had also been working in Kampong Cham until 2011, however, so it is difficult to determine exactly how much can be attributed to the IPEC project. The PCCL did, however, emphasise the importance of the training workshops attended by the PCCL members with support of the current IPEC project.

4.3.5. Commune Mainstreaming of Child Labour Issues

129. Communes have started to integrate child labour into their commune plans⁵⁸ but, as already indicated in Section 4.3.2, budget allocations to child labour pose a challenge, partially also because the available overall amounts for any local programs is very limited. The project was able to cover and train 34 Commune Committees on child labour with an additional 6 communes trained with funding provided directly through the Ministry of Interior. While reaching 40 communes is a good start, it is still only a fraction of the more than 1,700 Commune Committees in Cambodia. Information on the extent to which the communes have now included child labour in their Commune Plans is not yet available.
130. The enabling environment evaluation sub-study found that, in the communes covered in the study, there was limited input from the commune into the provincial plans, which in turn provided limited input into national planning. Child labour (CL) has been included under the responsibilities of the Coordinating Committee for Women and Children (CCWC) in the communes. Commune officials note that local needs, and commune plans, are much more extensive than local capacities and budgets warrant. The average budget available per commune is currently about US \$30,000 which is to be spent on all local development including infrastructure. Any budget allocations will need to compete for funds with other committee maternal and health briefs. Some communes have installed child labour donation boxes in strategic locations such as hotels, markets, restaurants and factories. Although the donation boxes are starting to collect some money, the amounts are not expected to be important and will likely only result in a limited, although useful, amount. In most cases the money will likely be used to provide support for items such as school uniforms and materials for child labourers.
131. The Ministry of Interior representative interviewed for the evaluation pointed out the importance of training as many Commune Committees as possible. As he noted, “The communes make 5 year development plans with yearly commune investment plans. If they do not understand about child labour they will never mainstream it into their investment plan.” The need to develop the CLMS at community and commune level with the associated referral system is vital in this context. As the Ministry of Interior representative added, “The challenges are everywhere for the communes. They see a child labourer but, in the absence of an externally funded project, they do not know what to do to help that child...” During training participants discuss potential solutions but, given poverty as the primary cause of child labour, Commune Committees still find it very difficult to solve such problems.
132. A few evaluation interviewees stated that child labour is a cross-cutting subject and staff from different line departments do not yet know very well how to mainstream child labour into their work. In addition, education and health are still centralised functions although a few tasks in these areas have been decentralised. As a result, at commune level, there is limited power to manage actions. As one stakeholder, further noted, “Commune level authorities are often politicians with little technical knowledge. Line department staff frequently say that it is very hard to work with the Commune Councils because members are often elderly, not very educated, and have difficulty

⁵⁸ The evaluation only has information about integration of child labor into the plans of some communes.

understanding why children should not work if the family is poor.” Mainstreaming is one element that can help address child labour but working to improve other related development issues can also have an impact on child labour elimination. Related issues such as other areas under child protection, social protection of families, access to occupational safety and health supplies/equipment, are all areas linked to improving the situation of child labour. Such areas still require much attention at capacity strengthening at commune level and even at higher levels.

133. The Ministry of Interior does project continuing to provide training on child labour to Commune Committees. Funding may potentially be provided through future child labour project(s) as well as from funding through the National Committee for Democratic Development (basket fund)⁵⁹. Whether it will be possible to use available funding for these purposes will, however, depend on the donor and government committee overseeing disbursement.
134. The capacity of community level organizations to plan, initiate, implement, monitor and evaluate actions to prevent and eliminate child labour has improved during the project period but further technical and financial input is needed. Community Based Monitoring Agents (CBMA) provide direct awareness raising with parents and children about the importance of education and avoidance of hazardous work. The CBMA were also responsible for assisting with the identification and monitoring of project beneficiaries. Capacities of the CBMA and other community leaders on the implementation of the CLMS system and its integration into government social protection and other systems are needed. At community level the Department of Women’s Affairs assistants are expected to play an important role in the CLMS and will need capacity strengthening as well⁶⁰.

4.3.6. Coordination and Collaboration with Other Development Oriented Agencies

135. As already indicated in preceding sections, the project collaborated with government, employers and workers/ organisations as well as NGOs and other civil society groups. Collaboration with other development agencies was implemented using different approaches. Such collaboration included the leveraging of human and financial resources of the collaborating agencies. (See Annex 2 for details of additional resources leveraged)
136. The project provided input on child labour into documents such as the UNDAF, DWCP and others. The project collaborated on different types of policy research with the World Bank, UNICEF, World Food Program (WFP), and UNESCO. The Food and Agriculture Organization (FAO) was associated to work with the project in assisting the Fisheries Administration on integrating child labour into their development plans. The FAO and the project also worked together on the integration of child labour into the national agriculture census. The purpose of the agricultural census is to analyse and understand production and supply chains with linkages to analysis of the agricultural labour force.
137. ILO and FAO are part of an international partnership for cooperation on child labour in Agriculture with funding from USDOL⁶¹. The partnership also includes representatives of other international agriculture related organisations including employers and workers. The partnership aims to promote cooperation, mainstream child labour into agriculture organisations, promote decent work in rural areas for adults and youth. Together with the Senior Child Labour specialist based in the ILO Decent Work Team in Bangkok the project participated in discussions on the possible

⁵⁹ Basket funds are pooled funding arrangements in support of program-based as opposed to project approaches.

⁶⁰ Some of these assistants are already CBMA.

⁶¹ ILO & Food and Agriculture Organization (2012) International Partnership for Cooperation on Child Labour in Agriculture. (Website available from: <http://www.fao-ilo.org/fao-ilo-child/international-partnership-for-cooperation-on-child-labour-in-agriculture>. Accessed 3 November, 2012)

formulation of a sectoral Plan of Action to tackle child labour in Fisheries in Cambodia. The project also participated in discussions and workshops on this subject with other stakeholders. Resulting from this is the formulation and approval of a sectoral Plan of Action to tackle child labour in Fisheries in Cambodia.

138. The project collaboration with the Winrock International child labour project in the early stages was initially limited due to differences of opinion between the management staff of the two projects. Collaboration on information sharing and joint capacity strengthening in the overlapping project provinces eventually improved. The projects did jointly provide input into meetings concerning the development of the NPA-WFCL II, the CLMS as well as collaborating on WDACL.

4.3.7. Child Labour Monitoring System

139. A national child labour monitoring system (CLMS) that will be used over the long term to identify, monitor and follow up on activities on children at local levels was developed and formally adopted in June, 2012. Data from local levels will also be channelled into a national CLMS data collection system. During project implementation the project used the DBMR system to track project beneficiaries but this system is different from the CLMS as the DBMR is intended for project results reporting and is quite complex.
140. The project studied international experience with CLMS and worked with input from the tripartite plus stakeholders to adapt it to the Cambodian situation. Aside from discussion meetings, national and provincial consultative workshops were conducted to ensure that input was obtained in a well-structured format. The CLMS has three principal components, 1) identification of children in or at risk of hazardous child labour and assessing actions needed to withdraw or prevent the child from child labour; 2) removal, prevention or protection of the identified children; 3) referral of identified children into education or skills training or other relevant services. A key element in step 3 is the reference to “other relevant services” which still needs further definition as identified children may need physical and/or mental health support⁶² or other assistance⁶³.
141. The CLMS is to be implemented from the community level through the village committees all the way to the national level where data collection and analysis will take place. Although some training on the CLMS has been conducted, field implementation is still being organised. The full implementation of the CLMS is expected to be challenging so it will require a great deal of close support from child labour and other specialists⁶⁴. Unfortunately the project cannot fully provide technical support to CLMS implementation during the few weeks remaining in the current project.
142. While some experience with monitoring child labour has been gained through the DBMR, the CLMS is to be a much larger system that will also be carried out in areas where no child labour project has yet been active. The CLMS is to be integrated into the government child protection system. Challenges include the limited number and coverage of labour inspectors and workplace monitors, budgets to cover costs, identification of children in mobile and hidden sectors, capacities of community and other monitors, accurate reporting systems and data processing at all levels. Support for good coordination of the MoLVT, MoEYS, Ministry of Women Affairs, Ministry of Interior and their sub-national counterparts will be needed including to address step 3 on “other relevant services”. To ensure that the CLMS is correctly implemented, clarity on the difference between child labour and child work will need special attention. Laws, regulations, policies and strategies need to reflect the meaning of these terms in the Cambodian context and in accordance

⁶² Counseling, mentoring, etc.

⁶³ Some children may need to be withdrawn into residential care, if trafficked be returned to their place of origin, etc.

⁶⁴ Such as specialists in other areas related to social and child protection, livelihoods and employment, gender, HIV, education.

with the ILO International Conventions 138 and 182 . Awareness raising but most especially good training about laws and regulations and their application will also be essential to ensure that those involved in the CLMS will interpret and apply the definitions correctly. Although at national and provincial levels there appears to be good commitment to implement the CLMS, the extent to which the CLMS will be sustainable will depend on the degree to which the country can overcome the challenges.

4.4. Direct Targeted Actions

“When we work we will lose our future. When we come to learn we can build a better future. “Former child brick production worker

143. The project implemented Direct Targeted Actions⁶⁵ in communities with some excellent outcomes while in other areas challenges indicate that there was room for improvement. The duration, type and amount of service provided in the APs was sufficient to keep child beneficiaries regularly attending school although after school work continued for at least a portion of the children⁶⁶.
144. As stated in Section 4.2.1, the project used a multi-level system to implement APs, which resulted in the strengthening of local networks to address child labour but also decreased the level of control that the project could maintain over the actions. The evaluation team was unable to visit all project direct action sites but interviews and observations indicate that, overall, awareness of the hazards of child labour exists and there has been noticeable reduction in child labour levels.
145. All the stakeholders deemed the amounts allocated to the implementation of the Direct Actions insufficient which they felt had an impact on the quality of the results. Even though, after the midterm evaluation, some adjustments in terms of funding allocated to withdrawing and preventing beneficiaries from child labour were made, the amounts were still very minimal compared to the needs. Estimates of interviewees indicated that at least twice as much funding was needed per Direct Action AP to be effective.
146. The involvement of employers’ organisations at community level, such as in Kampot in the salt sector and brick making in Kandal province indicate that their cooperation can be very effective. Where employers are aware, especially if they have a Code of Conduct against child labour, change is notable.

4.4.1. Identification of Child Beneficiaries

147. Children and their parents stated that they had mostly been identified by community leaders, teachers, and through direct visits by staff from the IAs and EAs to the communities. The names of potential beneficiaries were entered into a Rapid Listing format. Subsequently the AP implementing committees verified the lists followed by substantiation of eligibility directly in the communities. The children who were selected for the project do appear to meet the selection criteria. Some interviewees noted that the selection process was challenging as community members found it difficult to understand why some children from poor families were selected while others were not.
148. An almost equal number of girls as boys were identified and selected as beneficiaries although in some sectors there were more boys than girls. In portering, for example, although there are girls, there are more boys working in this sector. IAs noted that gender is a key aspect that they consider

⁶⁵ The Direct Targeted Actions are implemented through APs working directly in communities. Some of these are implemented by the IAs and others by the EAs.

⁶⁶ See Section 4.1.4

to ensure that attention to both genders is balanced. As one Community Based Monitoring Agent (CBMA) pointed out, “The government prioritise the girl and the ILO also does the same. So even if the ILO project budget is small it has still been very good for our girls.”

4.4.2. *Sector-based Versus Area-based Approaches, CLFZ, CLFS*

149. The project implemented area based and sector based approaches as well as a combination of the two. These approaches were combined in some locations with Child Labour Free Zone (CLFZ)⁶⁷, and Child Labour Free Sector (CLFS)⁶⁸ models. Combination approaches include using an integrated area based approach (IABA) but focusing more intensively on particular sectors such as salt production in Kampot.
150. Sector based approaches can be easier to implement than approaches that require addressing all forms of child labour in a particular area. Where the sector is well organised, such as in the case of salt production, it is more straightforward than trying to eliminate the more informally organised child labour in portering. Anyone can be hired to porter items while salt is produced in designated fields owned by organised employers. Where children work in hidden sectors, such as domestic child labour in urban areas such as Phnom Penh and Siem Reap both sector and area-based approaches are challenging.
151. Progress to achieving CLFZ and CLFS was noteworthy. Hazardous child labour has been visibly reduced in the CLFZs and CLFS areas according to local stakeholders and data collected through the project through the project Endline⁶⁹ study on prevalence and the Enabling Environment Sub-Study⁷⁰ but elimination has not yet been absolutely achieved. On the basis of this information, although it is clear that there has been a very significant reduction in child labour, it is not possible to make a concluding statement on the ‘child labour-free’ status of the salt sector in Kampot. The interview responses for Kampot suggest that up to 15 children may still be working but there is no data on the child population in the areas and it is not possible to estimate a prevalence rate. For Kep province, the child labour rate in the age-group 5-17 years among the surveyed households was estimated at 7.5 per cent at the time of the project end line survey.
152. Challenges to achieving CLFZ and CLFS are high internal mobility, low budget allocations from all sources, and need for sustainably continued awareness raising and capacity strengthening. In the Poipet border area, local officials point out that it is difficult to monitor Cambodian children who cross the border to work in markets in the Thailand border area. Given the length of the border⁷¹ it is, furthermore, also difficult to fully monitor cross-border portering outside of the official border posts.
153. It is useful to recall that, as discussed in Section 3.7, the concept of CLFZ and CLFS still needs further clarification. At project start-up the project worked on the assumption that it was clear what would be understood by CLFZ and CLFS. Only in a late project stage did it become apparent that a definition would be useful. The project stakeholders currently mostly view CLFZ and CLFS as

⁶⁷ Kep

⁶⁸ As noted in Section 3.7 Poi Pet for portering and Kampot for salt production. In Phnom Penh and Siem Reap area based approaches in some locations were combined with striving to eliminate some WFCL in those locations.

⁶⁹ Dash, Tapas R; December 2012: Assessment of the current situation on child labour (i) in the salt sector in Kampot province and (ii) generally in Kep province. Phnom Penh, Cambodia: Build Bright University

⁷⁰ Goddard, Milet (2012), Study on the Enabling Environment to Reduce Child Labour: In the Salt Sector of Kampot Province and Generally In Kep Province, To contribute to the expanded final evaluation of Towards Twenty Sixteen: Contributing towards Ending the Worst Forms of Child Labour in Cambodia. Phnom Penh, Cambodia: Goddard, Milet.

⁷¹ 157 kilometers in the Poi Pet area.

goals as opposed to an absolute state that can be achieved. While many local stakeholders appreciate the concept of CLFZ and CLFS as it motivates all concerned to work towards a goal it is difficult to achieve. Issues concerning the confusion of definitions of child labour and child work, and the terms CLFZ and CLFS add to the difficulty in determining whether areas are truly child labour free. The view that CLFZ and CLFS should be seen as goals may be realistic given the conditions in the project areas. As one interviewee remarked, “We may eliminate it in one place only to find the next day that new families have moved into the area as a result of flooding and we have to start the process all over again...” Among some local officials in two of the areas there is also some resistance to the concept of CLFZ and CLFS as they feel it was “imposed” by the project, not their own idea and very difficult to achieve. It should be recognised that, even in most developed countries, it is difficult to absolutely state that there is no hazardous child labour in all areas⁷². The evaluator is of the opinion that the CLFZ and CLFS approaches are useful to stimulate stakeholders to work towards these goals. Simultaneously it is not realistic to expect full success in most project areas if local mobility conditions and budget allocations do not change.

4.4.3. Awareness Raising in Communities

154. Awareness of the impact of child labour on child development is quite evident in the project communities. Real understanding of the complex interplay between child labour and the long term poverty of households is growing. Detailed understanding about how child labour affects children still needs to be increased, particularly at household level as most sub-national stakeholders only related child labour with its impact on physical development.
155. The project mass media communications are very useful as they provide a basis for direct awareness raising by IAs, EAs, community leaders and others so that they can work with families to change behaviours concretely. The reach of mass media in remote rural areas still limits the extent of knowledge about child labour in such areas, however. The active work on WDACL has been useful and stakeholders appreciated its effectiveness even if, like mass media, it cannot reach all households with child labourers.
156. Community champions, usually community leaders and CBMA⁷³, have been key in raising awareness although much depended on the extent of their own understanding of the child labour⁷⁴. Direct interaction of such champions with parents was cited in the Provincial Workshop as one of the most effective mechanisms to raise awareness. Community monitors indicated that one of the most effective strategies to convince parents not to allow their children to work was to point out the high medical costs of working children as compared to those who only go to school. The three tiered training system with its decreasing levels of quality at lower levels, as well as the relatively lower level of education in communities, influenced the understanding of the difference between child labour and/or child work.
157. One of the project components that was not as effective as it could have been was the peer education component. As part of Cambodian education strategies, schools have Children’s Councils composed of school children who take on roles to motivate their classmates on various issues, including sanitation, absenteeism, polite behaviour and other subjects. The peer education awareness raising project component was to be implemented mostly through the Children’s Councils. The concept of channelling peer education on child labour through these councils is good. The evaluation team found indications that the children’s councils were not functioning as well as expected in the locations visited. Given the qualitative nature and time limitations to speak

⁷² Particularly with respect to CSEC which can be found in most urban cities and some truck stops in developed countries.

⁷³ Some of whom are also community leaders.

⁷⁴ See other sections including 4.4.1

with sufficient school teachers and children it is not possible to fully determine the extent of the challenges. The low budget allocations and lack of localised NGO staff to support the implementation of this component appears to be one reason for this situation in the project areas.

158. Future projects/actions should work to improve the role of the Children's Councils on child labour, linking them actively to the CLMS system. Child representatives of the Children's Councils can also be invited to make regular presentations and reports to community monitors and commune councils. Children can also be engaged in using SCREAM methodologies to collect and write case stories about child labourers for publication in the media. A general increase in promoting and implementing the wide range of SCREAM methodologies across child labour actions is recommended since children are often their own best advocates.
159. The evaluation stakeholders' workshop discussion groups indicated that continued development and dissemination of awareness raising materials is essential. One recommendation was, for example, to develop recognisable images of children engaged in child labour in sectors prevalent in the targeted local communities. Many stakeholders met during the evaluation insisted, however, that awareness raising can "only contribute to stopping child labour in a limited way as long as poverty continues."

4.4.4. School Supplies, Other Material Support, Community Learning Centres

160. Children who were targeted for withdrawal or prevention into formal education received school supplies and uniforms, or bicycle while vocational/skills training also received some supplies after completing their training. Children who received bicycles were identified through an assessment of the distance⁷⁵ that they needed to cover to go to school and the extent to which distance might affect their school attendance/work status. Approximately one half of all children who received such support are girls, including bicycles. Several stakeholders, including some parents and children, stated that the bicycles were very useful to motivate the children to go to school. Teachers reported that drop-out rates had been reduced as a result of the project support although quantified details were not available. Teachers also commented, for example that, "After the children received these things they paid more attention to their learning so this is good."
161. The Community Learning Centres (CLC) that supported children who needed assistance to transition back into school were effective. The CLC transitioning classes are conducted by retired teachers or teachers who work elsewhere in the morning and teach at the CLC in the afternoon. Finding appropriate locations for the Community Learning Centres was sometimes difficult because no budget for construction was available in locations where no such Centre yet existed prior to the project. Transitioning children attend the CLC for approximately one month after which the teacher decides whether the child can re-enter formal school. Stakeholders pointed out that good collaboration between the Department of Education in the different provinces and local authorities contributed to successful return to—or staying in—education.

4.4.5. Vocational and Skills Training

162. Vocational and skills training actions for older children (ages 15-17) who could/would not return to formal school provided a good starting point for such children to end their work in hazardous situations. Stakeholders appreciated this project component and felt it needed to be scaled up substantially in future child labour actions. The children and other stakeholders who were involved with the vocational/skills training, however, indicated that more work is needed to improve such actions. While the project implemented some labour market assessments to identify types of

⁷⁵ More than 2 kilometers from school.

training that could lead to eventual employment, the range of skills that could be learned were still limited. Children were mostly trained in tailoring, hairdressing/beauty, or motorbike mechanics. Project staff and other interviewees noted the need for more training in decent work in agriculture as this is more realistic, particularly for rural areas. Children felt that duration of training was much too short for them to be able to have the confidence to find employment or be successfully self-employed. Some children who had received training were able to organise their own attendance in apprenticeships or other training elsewhere. A few of the children in the age category of 15-17 interviewed were able to start—or be employed—in small roadside self-employed activities even if they were not yet earning sufficiently to cover their cost of living.

163. In Cambodia the garment industry has the potential to employ graduates of tailoring training but not all trainees are able or willing to move to locations where they can find such work. Some are also still under 18 when they complete training. Given the economic downturn it is difficult for young graduates of such programs to compete with more experienced older garment workers. Basic training on management was an element that needed attention as very little or no training had been provided in these subjects while stakeholders did feel it would be important.
164. In one instance a group of trained girls (age category 15 through 17) were able to find work in a small tailoring company in their locality. The girls reported that they were very pleased with their work and were able to earn a satisfactory income but only if they work, “from 6 am and finish at 12 midnight”⁷⁶. The girls stated that they had received sewing machines through the project a month previously which helped them to increase their income as they, “no longer have to rent a machine to work for the employer.” This situation underlines the complex situation that any project on child labour faces, i.e. vocational/skills training is no guarantee for decent work. The children say they are tired but happy not to work as porters or scavengers anymore and now earn sufficient money to contribute to their families. The importance of the need to improve decent work for all, children and adults, is highlighted in this example.

4.4.6. *Livelihoods Component*

165. The IPEC project implemented a livelihoods project component in collaboration with the ILO WEDGE project. The component consisted of providing support capacity building of families of targeted children to develop income-generation projects through self-help groups (SHG). Most of the training focused on the successful establishment and/or operations of such SHG. The project achieved about 83% of the target of 2,000 households of project beneficiaries. The stakeholders interviewed were positive about the concept of the SHG and noted the importance of poverty alleviation as the fundamentally most effective way to eliminate child labour. The MoLVT representatives interviewed noted that the project livelihoods component should have made more linkages to micro-finance institutions, potential programs on (youth) employment as well as explore other livelihoods promotion options⁷⁷. Some interviewees also stated that any livelihoods component should be initiated earlier, preferably immediately when children are identified so that there is time to build and ensure sustainability of the groups before the end to the project. The start of the SHG had been somewhat delayed as it took time to establish the groups, help them decide how much and when to save, who could be members in addition to project beneficiary families, etc.
166. Unfortunately, however, the evaluation team leader was unable to sufficiently assess the quality of the livelihood component independently due to lack of availability of an implementing NGO⁷⁸ and

⁷⁶ The number of hours depends on the orders that the employer is able to receive. The employer did not force the children to work so many hours but workers are paid by piece so the more hours worked, the higher the pay...

⁷⁷ Including decent work employment opportunities in businesses.

⁷⁸ Their staff was called to a meeting at the US Embassy.

generally tight evaluation schedule. The consultant evaluation sub-study did meet a few SHGs but, while these groups indicated that they wanted to become sustainable, they said they still needed support from donors to do so. The SHG that the evaluation team leader did meet reported that members had substantially benefited from the project but that most of their success was actually initiated under the first phase of the IPEC project. During the second phase the SHG had only received continued follow up support. The group did state that they had grown to 60 members, were functioning well and able to use savings and income from their activities to finance their children in school.

5. Efficiency

167. The project was relatively efficient in terms of the allocated resources with results obtained. As already stated in previous sections, the project budget allocations to the APs was quite limited, especially for Direct Actions for withdrawal and prevention in the communities. The ambitious objectives of the project for Direct Actions thus affected efficiency. Funding for staff monitoring transport and office management was also inadequate, partially because of substantial increases in travel and other costs. The cost of vocational training was also much more expensive than was originally budgeted for.

5.1. Project Management

168. The project had qualified and dedicated national staff which were well supported by technical backstopping from the ILO Decent Work team in the ILO regional office in Bangkok and from IPEC headquarters. The project staff at local implementation level was expected to provide technical support, monitor and report on project actions in their respective areas. The project functioned according to good operational standards using ILO tools for project management although certain elements could have been improved. Due to rising costs and overly ambitious Direct Actions, the project needed to undergo many budget revisions. According to project staff there could also have been more communication with stakeholders to update them of project progress. Communication mechanisms, performance management evaluation systems of the implementing partners and action programs were, however, fully implemented.
169. IAs and other project partners appreciated the skilful technical support from the project staff and from other ILO technical specialists from outside Cambodia.
170. Project management coordinated, supervised, worked with national stakeholders, monitored and reported on activities. The project had a number of management challenges. The Chief Technical Adviser (CTA) left about one year before the end of the project. The national project manager who replaced the CTA was able to improve project functioning and management of staff during the past year. Support from regional and headquarters ILO IPEC offices during the transition was well appreciated.
171. The evaluator noted that the project organisation chart was unusually structured with the CTA directly responsible for field-based project coordinators without going through the national senior programme officer. In practice, this resulted in a system with the CTA supervising junior staff in the field while also juggling many central project tasks. The CTAs field visits were, further, limited and did not consist of sufficiently deep monitoring and follow up to identify challenges in the direct actions. Staff noted that roles and responsibilities of staff also needed to be more clearly articulated.

172. Due to the complexity of processing, including late reporting by the IAs themselves, some IAs reported that financial disbursements were late although implementation extensions helped to overcome this problem.

5.1.1. Project monitoring systems

173. The project monitoring plan (PMP) functioned well overall. While assisting IAs with preparing and/or improving the quality of their technical progress reports was time consuming, the IAs did acquire new capacities as a result. The DBMR, while recognised as complex in terms of data collection and processing from community to national level, it was considered useful. No element of the DBMR was superfluous while all necessary aspects were included. Work plans were sometimes unrealistic in terms of the amount of time for implementation, steps included in the plans were, however, adequate.
174. Provincial department of labour staff randomly selected and verified 5% of the records or a maximum of 75 records in the DBMR system every quarter to ensure that children were correctly identified as withdrawn or prevented. The ILO IPEC Field Coordinator then randomly selected and checked 15 records through personal visits. Given some of the confusion over definitions, however, future projects will need to conduct more intensive monitoring of direct actions. Other elements of project monitoring have been covered in previous sections of the current report.

6. Sustainability

175. Sustainability was at the forefront of the project design from inception. Three of the four project immediate objectives were oriented towards strengthening the enabling environment for long term impact on the elimination of child labour. The sustainability of the fourth immediate objective on creating models for withdrawal and prevention of child labour at local levels also had a replication orientation. The sustainability plan was thus an integral part of the project and was developed with input from stakeholders in the original project document preparation.
176. As the project continued implementation national, provincial and local institutions, other relevant entities contributed to planning sustainability through meetings, workshops, and expressing opinions in other settings. National Social Protection Strategy components on education and child labour, fisheries, CSNACL and CAMFEBA plans on child labour will all likely contribute to sustainability but still depend on budget allocations.
177. Codes of Conduct developed by employers are likely to have a sustainable impact as long as employers remain active in enforcing them. Current signs indicate that employers are committed to doing so. Commune level committees have been trained on mainstreaming child labour into their commune development plans. If committees are successful and budgets are allocated, sustainability of existing and future child labour actions will be improved.
178. The sustainability of the national, provincial and commune child labour committees are likely although the intensity of their actions will depend on budget allocations at the different levels. Key areas that require further support to achieve the twin goals' for the reduction of child labour by 2015 and elimination of WFCL by 2016 depend on available financial resources for the sustainability of other actions as well. In communities, some workplace and community monitors still need further capacity strengthening. The extent to which such monitors are provided with clear roles and responsibilities in practice through the CLMS implementation will be important for local sustainability. The general guidelines included in the CLMS draft report are unlikely to be

sufficient to ensure sustainable implementation in communities unless local committees know exactly “who will do what” and to whom they will report.

179. Finalising and implementing the NPA-WFCL II and CLMS, adapting the labour law to address the gaps on child labour issues, continuing to establish child labour committees in new locations, capacity strengthening will all be needed to reach Cambodia’s Twin Goals on eliminating child labour. To ensure that mobile populations are aware of the laws and regulations it will also be important to scale up awareness raising using mass media and all other means to ensure that the entire Cambodian population is reached.
180. Additional attention from the Ministry of Women’s Affairs (MWA) and other agencies to the most effective means to respond to the needs of girl labourers and their special requirements to be successful in remaining in schools is needed. While the project did work to ensure that girls were equally considered, for sustainability more in-depth information and specialised actions are needed.
181. To help ensure scaling up and replication of pilot project models and other good practices the project is finalising a report documenting these processes.
182. Ideally an independent national fund for the elimination of child labour needs to be established to ensure that adequate funding is attributed as indicated in the UCW⁷⁹ analysis. As suggested in Section 4.3.3 a conference to discuss and enlist donors—as far as feasible—could be one method to start towards the establishment of such a fund. An analysis of government decentralisation processes as related to the financing of child labour mainstreaming, including the CLMS, could be useful.

7. Conclusions and Recommendations

7.1. Conclusions

183. The project was able to contribute substantially to the technical quality of the enabling environment to eliminate the WFCL and other hazardous child labour in Cambodia. Capacity strengthening, other forms of technical input including from research, advocacy and awareness raising, support for the development of child labour structures have all helped to obtain comparatively good results. At community level much progress was made although confusion over types of child labour that can be permissible and quality of monitoring still needs improvement. Community level awareness raising has been effective although some methods, such a peer education, can be further improved. Further detailing of the CLMS with regard to roles, responsibilities, and methods for ensuring good understanding of definitions followed by good implementation will help to alleviate some of these challenges.
184. The project stakeholders currently mostly view CLFZ and CLFS as goals as opposed to an absolute state that can be achieved. Progress to achieving CLFZ and CLFS was noted and hazardous child labour has been visibly reduced in the CLFZs and CLFS areas according to local stakeholders and data collected through the project⁸⁰ but elimination has not yet been absolutely achieved. Challenges to achieving CLFZ and CLFS are high internal mobility, low budget allocations from all sources, and need for sustainably continued awareness raising and capacity strengthening. Many

⁷⁹Understanding Children’s Work (2009) Towards Eliminating the Worst Forms of Child labour in Cambodia by 2016: An Assessment of Resource Requirements Report on Child Labour. Rome: Understanding Children’s Work (UCW) Programme.

⁸⁰ End line study on prevalence being finalized and the Enabling Environment Sub-Study.

local stakeholders appreciate the concept of CLFZ and CLFS as it motivates all concerned to work towards a goal.

185. Areas requiring further attention in the future include the scaling up of vocational and skills training and expanding options across wider sectors. Livelihoods and self-help group development also need to be scaled up using more intensive support than was possible through the project, mostly due to comparatively limited budget allocations for the downstream components.
186. The sustainability of the national, provincial and commune child labour committees are likely although the intensity of their actions will depend on budget allocations at the different levels. Finalising and implementing the NPA-WFCL II and CLMS, adapting the labour law to address the gaps on child labour issues, continuing to establish child labour committees in new locations, capacity strengthening will all still be needed to reach Cambodia's Twin Goals on eliminating child labour. The level of commitment of the government and other stakeholders is good so, with sufficient resources, Cambodia can reach the Twin Goals.

7.2. Key Good Practices and Lessons Learned

7.2.1. Good practices

1. Working with a range of different stakeholders, including across different line ministries through functioning structures at all levels was key for effectiveness and potential sustainability.
2. Promotion and provision of technical support for mainstreaming of child labour into all relevant policy and plans of action in different subject areas/sectors.
3. Continued technical support follow-up in areas where direct project support has ended.
4. High emphasis on capacity strengthening of individuals and their institutions on child labour issues as relevant to their work and situation was a useful project investment.
5. Successful support for the development of the Child Labour Monitoring System was important although more detail on roles, responsibilities and implementing of referral systems still needs to be included.
6. Development of research on key areas that can provide specific information for the development of policies, legal framework, actions on child labour.

7.3. Lessons Learned- Possible generalizations based on evaluation insights⁸¹

1. Focussing on the enabling environment is important as it is key for long terms sustainability of child labour elimination actions. Downstream direct actions models are still important to illustrate good practices and learn lessons for input into enabling environment planning.
2. Integrated Area Based approach serves to pull together and develop networks of local agencies and other stakeholders to address child labour in a coordinated and comprehensive way.
3. Child labour Free Zones and Child Labour Free Sector approaches serve to set a good goal to work towards but can be difficult to fully attain due to mobility, continued poverty, natural disasters, need for intensive monitoring and referral services.
4. Visible presence, advocacy and technical input from regional experts into national level discourse contributes to quality and success of advocacy on child labour.

⁸¹ Including good practices and challenges to address.

5. Promotion and supporting development of Code of Conduct by employers in different sectors can be effective if enforced.
6. Projects need to avoid being over-ambitious in terms of number of children to be withdrawn or prevented.
7. Vocational/skills training needs to cover a wide range of types of work, include attention to OSH and agriculture related work options (especially in rural areas and include production, food processing/agro-industry, trade, etc.).
8. Poverty reduction through support for initiatives such as self-help groups, income generating activity development, linking to micro-finance institutions is key to eliminating child labour and requires emphasis in child labour projects.
9. Avoidance of too many hierarchical layers between project and implementers at community level is important for effective monitoring and follow-up of activities. Close monitoring by project of all project activities is necessary, including downstream direct actions in communities.
10. Need for close advocacy and awareness raising from community members into commune council planning.
11. Projects need to provide intensive training and then verify understanding of Community Based and other child labour monitors/labour inspectors, police on the definitions of child labour.

7.4. Key Recommendations

7.4.1. Development of Policies and Legal Framework, Systems and Resource Mobilisation

1. Finalise and implement the NPA-WFCL II. (Government, Employers', Workers', Civil Society organisations, ILO, other child labour project agencies)⁸²
2. Adapt and implement/enforce the labour law to address remaining legal gaps on child labour issues. Develop additional Prakas on other exploitive and hazardous child labour such as domestic child labour. (Government with input from Employers', Workers', Civil Society organisations, ILO and other child labour project agencies)
3. Continue to mainstream child labour into policy and strategy documents on issues such as child protection, social protection, education, gender issues, agriculture, service and industrial development, informal economic development, local economic development, private sector social responsibilities, HIV issues, and decent work as relevant. (Government with input from Employers', Workers', Civil Society organisations, ILO and other child labour project agencies)
4. Develop detailed descriptions of roles and responsibilities for the referral, monitoring, and follow up systems of the CLMS. Include in descriptions potential linkages of NGOs and civil society groups to government CLMS. Clear integration of the CLMS into government referral systems in the areas of social protection, child protection, education, and health. Provide close technical support for the full implementation of the CLMS through child labour and other specialists. (Government with input from Employers', Workers', Civil Society organisations, child labour project agencies)
5. To ensure that the CLMS is correctly implemented, clarity on the difference between child labour and child work will need special attention. Laws, regulations, policies and strategies need to reflect the meaning of these terms in the Cambodian context and in accordance with

⁸² Key responsible agencies between parentheses.

the ILO International Conventions 138 and 182 . Awareness raising but most especially good training about laws and regulations and their application will also be essential to ensure that those involved in the CLMS will interpret and apply the definitions correctly.

6. Explore possibility of establishment of an independent national fund for the elimination of child labour to ensure that adequate funding is attributed to the various components of the NAP-WFLC II . Include or organise a conference to discuss and the establishment of such a fund. Conference can include potential donors, government agencies, private enterprises, and others to identify entities that can also take responsibility for funding different components once the NPA-WFCL II is formally adopted.(Government with input from Employers', Workers', Civil Society organisation, ILOs and all other relevant stakeholders)

7.4.2. Capacity Strengthening

7. Continue to strengthen the understanding of labour inspectors, police and other enforcement agents regarding their roles and responsibilities for enforcing hazardous child labour elimination. Ensure that they are aware of relevant laws, regulations, different types of child labour and child work. (Government, child labour project agencies)
8. Stimulate and provide capacity strengthening to community members to conduct advocacy to integrate child labour into Commune Council decision making. (Government, Civil Society organisations, child labour project agencies)
9. Focus intensively on capacity strengthening of the Community Based Monitoring Agents (CBMA) and other community leaders on the implementation of the CLMS system. Ensure that they are well aware of their roles and responsibilities. (Government, Civil Society Organisations)

7.4.3. Awareness Raising

10. Ensure that mobile and other populations are aware of the laws and regulations by continuing to scale up awareness raising using mass media and all other means to ensure that the entire Cambodian population is reached. (Government, all other relevant stakeholders)

7.4.4. Education – Vocational/Skills Training- Livelihoods

11. Provide vocational skills training in responding to market demand and create a link to appropriate micro finance institutions. Include emphasis on Occupational Safety and Health measures and work in agribusiness. (Government, vocational and skills training centres, Civil Society organisations, child labour project agencies)
12. Increase development of appropriate services to support parents through livelihoods and self-help groups. (Government, Civil Society organisations, child labour project agencies)

7.5. Additional Recommendations

7.5.1. Development of Policies and Legal Framework, Systems and Resource Mobilisation

13. Continue to establish child labour committees in new provinces and communes. (Government, Employers', Workers', Civil Society organisations, child labour project agencies⁸³)
14. Establish Civil Society Networks in all provinces in order to help eliminate Child Labour in accordance with government policy.
15. Further development of linkages between the Provincial Child Labour Committees and the National Sub-Committee on Child Labour is needed. Improved linkages will contribute to overall effective coordination of a country-wide approach. (Government, child labour project agencies)
16. Conduct analysis of government decentralisation processes as related to mechanisms for the financing of child labour mainstreaming, including the CLMS. Analysis should identify potential improvements that can be implemented to ensure that budgets are available to address child labour at community levels. (Government, child labour project agencies)
17. Develop systems to collect, analyse and use information generated in provinces as the country starts to fully implement the Child Labour Monitoring System need to be developed. (Government, child labour project agencies)
18. Provide close technical support for the full implementation of the CLMS through child labour and other specialists. (Government, child labour project agencies)
19. Increase engagement of NGOs and other development agencies with their donors, including through Corporate Social Responsibility donors, to allow mainstreaming of child labour into all of their relevant actions. (Employers', Workers', Civil Society organisations including NGOs, other development agencies)

19.5.2. Capacity Strengthening

20. Continue to provide capacity strengthening to existing and new provinces. (Government, Employers', Workers', Civil Society organisations, child labour project agencies)

7.5.3. Advocacy, Knowledge Base

21. Continue to draw attention to the knowledge that was generated with support from the project as much of the information included in the reports continues to remain relevant as Cambodia moves forward with mainstreaming child labour into various policies, strategies, and actions. (Government, all other stakeholders)
22. Continue to increase the knowledge base on child labour as relevant to the different locations including on special gender child labour related aspects. (Government, stakeholders as relevant)

7.5.4. Awareness Raising

23. Improve the role of peer education on child labour in school Children's Councils. Link the Children's Councils actively to the CLMS system. Child representatives of the Children's Councils can be invited to make regular presentations and reports to community monitors and commune councils. (Government, schools, child labour project agencies)

⁸³ May include ILO IPEC if IPEC is implementing the project.

24. Intensify and improve peer-education methods using methodologies such as ILO IPEC's SCREAM.
25. Include parents in organising SCREAM activities. Government, schools, Civil Society Organisations, child labour project agencies)

7.5.5. Education – Vocational/Skills Training- Livelihoods

26. Encourage sharing of experiences (through field trips and exchanges) of schools that have successfully addressed child labour issues in their communities with schools that still face challenges. (Government, schools, child labour project agencies)

7.5.6. Project Management

27. When designing projects, ensure that the objectives are realistic in general and in particular with regard to number of project areas and targets for children to be withdrawn or prevented from child labour. (ILO, other child labour agencies)
28. Projects need to ensure that technical support and monitoring of community level direct actions is sufficiently provided so that quality can be ideally assured. (ILO, other child labour agencies)
29. Review effectiveness of the methodology of multiple levels of Implementing Agencies and Executing Agencies during project implementation. Determine if other methods to promote networking during implementation of direct actions can be developed while still maintaining more direct quality control. (ILO, other child labour agencies)

Annex 1: Implementation of Mid-term Evaluation Recommendations

Key Recommendations	Project Actions Undertaken
1. The project should review the delays in implementation that have occurred and identify how these may affect the achievement of project targets, the project objectives, the sustainability of these outputs and the timeframe available for reporting and follow up.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Reviews were conducted by internal to project and ILO child labour specialists - All Action Programs were extended to allow the implementing agencies time to achieve their objectives. - Project management structure was change from international CTA leadership to the national in the last quarter of 2011. - A 3 month extension of the project as a whole was approved and implemented.
2. The project, in consultation with the DoCL/MoLVT, needs to clarify what its goal is with regard to the revision of labour legislation and to set some specific time-limited milestones for its achievement.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - The Project engaged a Consultant to assist the Department of Child Labour (DoCL) to review, identify gaps and propose amendments to the Cambodian 1997 Labour Law to harmonise with ILO Conventions 138 and 182. - Results including proposed revised texts/articles were presented to the National Sub-Committee on Child Labour and submitted to the DoCL for further action. - Four new Prakas prohibiting hazardous child labour in agriculture, tobacco plantation, cassava plantation and inland fishing were developed and adopted. - Initial consultations on new Prakas prohibiting hazardous child labour in construction and domestic sectors have been initiated with relevant government agencies.
3. With at least two of the APs, in the opinion of the MTE, facing challenges in achieving their objectives within the agreed timeframe, the project, in conjunction with providing increased technical support to AP implementation, should review if an extension for the APs is required and if this would assist them in achieving their objectives.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - See also under response to Recommendation 1. - The two APs (Banteay Meanchey and Battambang) identified were extended and some limited additional resources were allocated.
4. The project should carry out a review of its activities and budget immediately and submit a project revision by 15 th April 2011 in order to bring expenditure in line with available resources. As part of this budget review the project should give serious consideration to: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> o Reviewing the impact of reduced funds for direct interventions with children in terms of quality and duration of services being provided and if necessary prioritise remaining activities to free up funds to at least the level of phase I support. o Consolidating its different activities and geographical spread in order to give a greater level of attention to a smaller number of prioritised outputs. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - See also response to Recommendation 1. - The project completed the review, including through monitoring visits to APs implementation areas. - Project savings were identified and redirected towards improving existing service quality to beneficiaries. - USDOL approved the subsequent proposed budget revision. - The project was not able to find and utilise funds from development partners although some funds were leveraged by collaborating with other agencies. - The Koh Kong AP that had been cancelled was not re-contracted to another institution.

Key Recommendations	Project Actions Undertaken
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Seek and utilise funds from development partners and government that are available for parallel objectives (i.e. existing school scholarship funds) that would reduce direct action costs. ○ Refraining from re-contracting the Koh Kong AP to another institution. 	
<p>5. In order for the models of interventions to combat WFCL to be of maximum use, the project needs to identify the various challenges that have been faced, both in management and in implementation, and also record the measures taken to overcome or reduce the negative effect of these challenges.</p>	<p>See also response to Recommendation 4.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Most of the project's APs at both national and grass root levels were reviewed and amended based on the challenges faced by each of these APs, needs and priorities. - Project management was reviewed and changed. - Project's review and its amendment/extension was made based on the challenges identified and priority needs of the project and approval of the donor of the proposed amendment was obtained. - CL assessment surveys in Kampot and Kep provinces and GPs and LLs study have been conducted and regular technical progress reports of the project prepared recording the measures taken by the project to overcome/ reduce the negative effect of these challenges.

Annex 2: Additional Resources Leveraged

Mobilization local resources for the elimination of child labour during the implementation of Action Programs of the TBP Phase II.						
Title	Description	Start Date	End Date	Contr. Funds	Participants	Event Location
Training on mainstreaming child labour in commune planning	Additional 6 communes trained with funding provided directly through Ministry of the Interior.	Unavailable	2012	Not available	Commune officials	6 communes
TV Roundtable discussion	Observance of World Day Against Child Labour June 12, 2010 " Go for the Goal: End the Worst Forms of Child Labour in Cambodia by 2016."	28-May-10	Telecast 01 June 10	Winrock International =USD3,000		Phnom Penh
Radio Talk Show Programme:	Observance of World Day Against Child Labour June 12, 2010	01-Jun-10	04-Jun-10	Winrock International =USD500		Phnom Penh
Angkor Wat Children's Min Marathon Against Child Labour	Observance of World Day Against Child Labour June 12, 10	05-Jun-10	05-Jun-10	Winrock International =USD500		Siem Reap
Observance of World Day Against Child Labour June 2011 in Kandal province.	"Warning! Children in Hazardous Work – End Child Labour!" held on 03 June 2011 at <i>Chheu Teal primary school</i> in Mok Kampul district of Kandal province.	03-Jun-11	03-Jun-11	KHANA NGO=USD350	750 people	Kandal
Observance of World Day Against Child Labour June 2011 in Phnom Penh.	Observance the World Day Against Child Labour on 12 June, 2011 and the Launching of the one year Programme for Declaring the Riverside in Phnom Penh a Child Labour Free Zone.	12-Jun-11	12-Jun-11	World Vision =USD800	1,000 people	Phnom Penh
Observance of World Day Against Child Labour June 2011 in Poipet, Banteay Meanchey province.	Local resources were mobilized through a meeting organized by ILO IPEC in coordination with the PDLVT in Banteay Meanchey on 29 May 2012 with the relevant stakeholders and partners in Banteay Meanchey province for observance of the WDACL	10-Jun-11	10-Jun-11	<u>Total</u> =USD3,000	1,000 people	Poipet Town
The 1st Public Forum on the Elimination of Child Labour.	The CSNACL in Siem Reap province organized a public forum on the elimination of Child Labour.	23-Jul-11	23-Jul-11	Budget from Fund raising Box and contribution of CSNACL members of the =USD1,000	258 people	Srah Srang Village in Sangkat Noko Thom, Siem Reap Province
Mobilizing resources from Pagoda and	on 6 September 2011, the monks, President of the	06-Sep-11	06-Sep-11	Charity from	500 people	In 5 primary

To Contribute to Developing National Capacities to Achieve the 2015 National Child Labour Reduction Targets and the ILO Global Targets for Ending the Worst Forms of Child Labour in Cambodia by 2016
Final evaluation – November 201

Mobilization local resources for the elimination of child labour during the implementation of Action Programs of the TBP Phase II.						
Title	Description	Start Date	End Date	Contr. Funds	Participants	Event Location
from CSNACL members to support poor children and their families in Kep province.	CSNACL and its members have collected charity money about US\$2,500 to purchase school supplies and 10kg of rice from the monks and CSNACL members.			Pagoda, Monks and CSNACL members= USD2,500		schools in Kep province.
Enrol the children in the appropriate skill training centre and ensure that they are appropriately trained in their chosen skills, with attention to effective and equitable outcomes for both boys and girls.	AFESHIP Organization - assisted the children upon completion of their training to start up business activities through consultations and negotiation apprenticeships with local entrepreneurs and through the on-going provision of support services	01-Oct-10	31-Mar-12	AFESHIP NGO= USD21,000	7 children	Vocational Training Centre of the AFESHIP Organisation Siem Reap Province
Observance of World Day Against Child Labour on 12 June 2012 in Battambang province.	The LICHADO in coordination with World Vision International - Battambang observed the WDACL with the theme of "Human Rights and Social Justice: Let's End Child Labour" on 12 June 2012	12-Jun-12	12-Jun-12	LICADHO NGO = USD2,300	500 people	Battambang Town
Observance of World Day Against Child Labour 26 June 2012 in Battambang province.	The Provincial Department of Labour and Vocational Training, Battambang spent their budget with the amount US\$1,800 for observance of the WDACL on 26 June 2012 in Kampong Prieng High School in Sangke District of Battambang Province with the theme of "Human Rights and Social Justice: Let's End Child Labour"	26-Jun-12	26-Jun-12	PDLVT-BTB= USD1,800	472 people	Kampong Prieng High School in Sangke District of Battambang Province
The 2nd Public Forum on the Elimination of Child Labour.	The CSNACL in Siem Reap province organized a second public forum on the elimination of Child Labour.	25-Feb-12	25-Feb-12	Budget from Fund raising Box and contribution of CSNACL members =USD1,200	320 people	Chrav Village in Sangkat Sala Kamroeuk, Siem Reap Province
Charity donation to promote children education for the poor children.	In collaboration with ILO IPEC and a Local NGO called Save Incapacity of Teenagers (SIT), the American Intercon School and Institute organized a Charity donation to promote children education for the poor children	04-Mar-12	04-Mar-12	The American Intercon School and Institute = USD1,200	470 people	In Chheuteal primary school, Prek Anhchanh commune, Mokampoul district,

Mobilization local resources for the elimination of child labour during the implementation of Action Programs of the TBP Phase II.						
Title	Description	Start Date	End Date	Contr. Funds	Participants	Event Location
						Kandal province.
Enrol the children in the appropriate skill training centre and ensure that they are appropriately trained in their chosen skills, with attention to effective and equitable outcomes for both boys and girls.	Enrol the children in the appropriate skill training centres that run by Friend International Organization and assisted the children upon completion of their training to start up business activities through consultations and negotiation apprenticeships with local entrepreneurs and through the on-going provision of support services (business advice, facilitated linkage to MFI and liaise with Financial Institutions to obtain capital for starting up their businesses. These training were spent by the government budget of US\$34,300.	01-Jan-11	31-Mar-12	Friend International= USD34,300	61 people	Vocational Training Centre of the Friend International Organization, Siem Reap Province
Enrol the children in the appropriate skill training centre and ensure that they are appropriately trained in their chosen skills, with attention to effective and equitable outcomes for both boys and girls.	Enrolled the children in the appropriate skill training centres that run by the PDLVT with budget US\$9,000 and assisted the children upon completion of their training to start up business activities through consultations and negotiation apprenticeships with local entrepreneurs and through the on-going provision of support services (business advice, facilitated linkage to MFI and liaise with Financial Institutions to obtain capital for starting up their businesses.	01-Jul-11	30-Apr-12	PDLVT-BTB= USD9,000	20 people	Vocational Training Centre of the Provincial Department of Labour and Vocation Training, Battambang Province
The 3rd Public Forum on the Elimination of Child Labour.	The CSNACL in Siem Reap province organized a third public forum on the elimination of Child Labour. Approximately 200 participants from members of CSNACL in the province, local authorities, polices, teachers, parents, participated. This event spent about US\$900 contributed by members of the CSNACL in this province. The event aimed to sensitize local authorities, parents and communities on child work and child labour, cause and consequences of CL and the important of child education, and encouraged parent and communities to send their children to schools.	28-May-12	28-May-12	Budget from Fund raising Box and contribution of CSNACL members of the =USD900	200 people	Tror Pang Seh Village in Sangkat Kok Chork, Siem Reap Province
Enrol the children in the appropriate	Enrolled children in the appropriate skill training	01-Aug-11	31-May-12	PDLVT-	20 people	Vocational

Mobilization local resources for the elimination of child labour during the implementation of Action Programs of the TBP Phase II.						
Title	Description	Start Date	End Date	Contr. Funds	Participants	Event Location
skill training centre and ensure that they are appropriately trained in their chosen skills, with attention to effective and equitable outcomes for both boys and girls.	centres that run by the PDLVT and assisted the children upon completion of their training to start up business activities through consultations and negotiation apprenticeships with local entrepreneurs and through the on-going provision of support services (business advice, facilitated linkage to MFI and liaise with Financial Institutions to obtain capital for starting up their businesses. The amount of US\$18,000 were spent by the government budget for training on sewing and tailoring skills.			Kampong Thom= USD18,000		Training Centre of the Provincial Department of Labour and Vocation Training, Kampong Thom Province
Observance of World Day Against Child Labour June 2012 on scheme "Human Right and Social Justice: Let's End of Child Labour"	Round Table Discussions on <i>Mobilising Resources for the Elimination of WFCL by 2015 and 2016</i> , involving government officials, employers' and workers' organizations, financial institutions, WB, ADB, and UN agencies, civil society representatives, etc. to discuss ways through which child labour can be eliminated. Telecast these discussions on national TV station/s.	18-May-12	18-May-12	UNICEF = USD2000 and World Vision=USD1,000		Phnom Penh
National Observance of the World Day Against Child Labour 2012	National Observance of the World Day Against Child Labour 2012. The event will be held on 29 May 2012 under the presidency of Samdach Ahkas Moha Sena Padey Techor Hun Sen, Prime Minister of the Royal Government of Cambodia	29-May-12	29-May-12	UNICEF = USD3000 and CNCC = USD32,400		Phnom Penh
Total				USD139,750		

Annex 3: Evaluation schedule

	Date and time	Activities	Purpose	Venue	Contact point	TBP focal point
Monday - 08 October 2012						
1	09:00–12:00	Meeting with ILO IPEC Team in Phnom Penh.	Briefing with TBP Support Project staff in Phnom Penh (PNP) reviewing relevant materials and documents produced under the Project and to understand the scope, reach, achievements, challenges, and ways forward of ILO IPEC in Cambodia.	ILO Joint Office, Phnom Penh Centre, Building B, 2nd Floor, Corner of Sihanouk and Sothea Blvds, Tonle Bassac, Chamcar Mon, Phnom Penh		Mr. Ouk Sisovann NPM ILO IPEC TBP Tel: 012- 811 399
2	13:30–15:00	Meeting with Milet, Consultant and discussing the key findings of the sub-study on the enabling environment conducted in Kampot and Kep.	To understand the key findings of the sub-study on the enabling environment conducted in Kampot and Kep and Milet's possible suggestions related to the final evaluation report	ILO Joint Office, Phnom Penh		Mr. Ouk Sisovann NPM ILO IPEC TBP Tel: 012- 811 399
3	15:00–17:30	Meeting with Dr. Dash, Consultant and discussing the key findings of CL assessment conducted in Kampot and Kep	To understand the key findings of the sub-study on CL assessment conducted in Kampot and Kep and Dr. Dash's possible suggestions related to the final evaluation report	ILO Joint Office, Phnom Penh		Mr. Ouk Sisovann NPM ILO IPEC TBP Tel: 012- 811 399
Tuesday - 09 October 2012						
4	08:00–09:00					
	09:00–09:30	<i>Travel to Ministry of Labour and Vocational Training (MLVT)</i>				Mr. Chea Mony
5	09:30–10:30	Meeting with Secretary of State of the MLVT and Chairperson of the National Sub-Committee on Child Labour, and the Members of the NSC-CL and Mr. Veng Heang, Director of Department of Child Labour,	To understand Government's response to child labour including its commitment to end the WFCL by 2016 and the challenges the country is facing in achieving that goal.	MLVT Office #3, Russian Federation Blvd, Toul Kok, Phnom Penh, Cambodia	Mr. Veng Heang Director, DOCL	Mr. Ouk Sisovann NPM ILO IPEC TBP Tel: 012- 811 399
	10:30–11:00	<i>Travel from MLVT to ILO Joint Office</i>				Mr. Chea Mony

To Contribute to Developing National Capacities to Achieve the 2015 National Child Labour Reduction Targets and the ILO Global Targets for Ending the Worst Forms of Child Labour in Cambodia by 2016
Final evaluation – November 2012

	Date and time	Activities	Purpose	Venue	Contact point	TBP focal point
						Tel: 097- 727 2505
6	11:00–12:00	Meeting with US official(s) responsible for labour affairs in Cambodia	To discuss and understand the TBP Project implementation in Cambodia and the ways forward to reach 2016 goal	ILO Joint Office	Ms. Lisa Kalijian, Political and Economic Officer, US Embassy	Mr. Ouk Sisovann NPM ILO IPEC TBP Tel: 012- 811 399
	13:30–14:00	<i>Travel to Ministry of Education, Youth and Sports (MOEYS)</i>				Mr. Chea Mony Tel: 097- 727 2505
7	14:00–15:00	Meeting with Mr. Sorn Seng Hok, Director of the Department of Legislation, and Mr. Chum Sophal, Ministry of Education, Youth and Sports (MoEYS)	To understand the MoEYS's strategies and efforts of the MoEYS in the elimination of child labour towards achieving EFA goal and linkages between child labour and education policies.	MoEYS Office #80, Norodom Blvd.	Mr. Sorn Seng Hok, Director of Department of Legislation, MoEYS Mr. Chum Sophal, Officer of Legislation Bureau,	Mr. Ouk Sisovann NPM ILO IPEC TBP Tel: 012- 811 399
8	15:15–17:00	Meeting with ILO IPEC Team	To interview following the prepared guidelines	ILO Joint Office, Phnom Penh Centre	Mr. Ouk Sisovann	Mr. Ouk Sisovann NPM ILO IPEC TBP Tel: 012- 811 399
Wednesday - 10 October 2012						
	07:45–08:00	<i>Travel to National Institute of Statistic (NIS/MoP)</i>				Mr. Chea Mony
9	08:00–09:00	Meeting with Mr. Heang Kanol, Deputy Director General of the NIS, and Mr. Toun Thavrak, Director General (IDPoor expert, of Planning of the Ministry of Planning (MOP).	To understand the efforts and the role of the NIS and MOP in contributing to the reducing of CL and ending the WFCL in Cambodia.	#386, Monivong Blvd, Sangkat Boeung Keng Kang 1, Chamkar Morn district, Phnom Penh,	Mr. Heang Kanol, Deputy Director General of the NIS/MoP. and Mr. Toun Thavrak, Director General (IDPoor expert, NIS/MoP.	Mr. Ouk Sisovann NPM ILO IPEC TBP Tel: 012- 811 399
	09:00–09:15					
10	09:15–10:15	Meeting with Mr. Sok Sothy, Deputy Director Policy Development and Analysis Division National Committee for Sub-National Democracy Development (NCDD) Secretariat	To discuss the decentralization of power and resources to the commune councils, and the integration of Child Labour Elimination into the Commune Development Plan (CPD), Commune Council Activities etc., in contributing ending the WFCL in the country.	the Ministry of Interior (MoInt) Office LoDA, MoInt, Norodam Blvd. Chamkar Morn.	Mr. Sok Sothy, Chief of Capacity Building Office of the DoLA, MoInt.	Mr. Un Vuthy PO, ILO IPEC TBP Tel: 012- 88 99 82

	Date and time	Activities	Purpose	Venue	Contact point	TBP focal point
11	10:30–11:45	Meeting with H.E Mr. Ngy Chanphal, Secretary of State, Ministry of Interior and Deputy Chairperson of the Council for Agriculture and Rural Development (CARD)	To understand the efforts and the role of the National Social Protection Strategy (NSPS) in contributing ending the WFCL	Office CARD, MoInt, Norodam Blvd. Chamkar Morn.	H.E. Dr. Sann Vathana, Deputy Secretary General of CARD	Mr. Ouk Sisovann NPM ILO IPEC TBP Tel: 012- 811 399
12	14:00–15:00	Meeting with Mr. Tun Sophorn, National Coordinator, ILO Joint Office	To understand child labour issues which are integrated with the other ILO projects	ILO Joint Office, Phnom Penh Centre	Mr. Tun Sophorn	Mr. Ouk Sisovann NPM ILO IPEC TBP Tel: 012- 811 399
13	15:00–16:00	Meeting with Mr. Ath Thorn, Chair of Inter Trade Union Committee Against Child Labour (ITUCL), and Mr. Keo Sampov, AP Coordinator.	To understand the role of the Trade Unions and their efforts in eliminating child labour, especially its worst forms in Cambodia.	ILO Joint Office, Phnom Penh Centre,	Mr. Ath Thorn, President CLC Mr. Keo Sampov, AP Coordinator.	Mr. Un Vuthy PO, ILO IPEC TBP Tel: 012 88 99 82
14	16:10–17:20	Meeting with Mr. Seang Meng, former Winrock staff member of 2008 DOL-funded project, closed December 2011).	To understand the participations and collaboration role of Winrock and ILO IPEC engages in action to eliminate CL in the country.	Winrock Office, Phnom Penh Centre,	Mr. Seang Meng, Deputy Party of the Winrock.	Mr. Un Vuthy PO ILO IPEC Tel: 012 88 99 82
Thursday - 11 October 2012						
	07:30–14:00	Travel from Phnom Penh to Poi Pet, Banteay Meanchey province				Mr. Chea Mony Tel: 097- 727 2505
15	15:00–16:30	Meeting with Action Programme Implementing Committee (APIC) and IA & EAs in Banteay Meanchey town	To understand the strategies and efforts of IPEC and its Partners in Banteay Meanchey to work towards Child labour Free in Porter sector.	PDLVT Office in Banteay Meanchey provincial town	Hong Prak Korp, Deputy Director PDLVT BMC.	Mr. Sao Kosal, ILO IPEC Field Coordinator Tel: 012 555 887.
	17:00–18:00	Travel from Banteay Meanchey to Poi Pet				Mr. Chea Mony Tel: 097- 727 2505
Friday - 12 October 2012						
16	08:00–10:00	Meeting with former child labourers and their parents	To understand the status of children and their families	Palilai Primary School, Poipet	Hong Prakorb, Deputy Director PDLVT, BMC	Mr. Sao Kosal, ILO IPEC Field Coordinator Tel: 012 555 887
17	10:00–11:00	Meeting with former child	To understand how formers child	Palilai II Primary	Hong Prakorb,	Mr. Sao Kosal,

To Contribute to Developing National Capacities to Achieve the 2015 National Child Labour Reduction Targets and the ILO Global Targets for Ending the Worst Forms of Child Labour in Cambodia by 2016
Final evaluation – November 2012

	Date and time	Activities	Purpose	Venue	Contact point	TBP focal point
		labourers or at risk children who have started their business after the completion of skills training under the project	labourers have started up and sustained their small business after the completed training provided by the project	School, Poipet	Deputy Director PDLVT, BMC	ILO IPEC Field Coordinator Tel: 012 555 887
18	11:00–12:00	Meeting with local community monitors on child labour	To understand on roles and responsibilities and their commitment to combat on child labour in the sector	Palilai II Primary School, Poipet	Hong Prakorb, Deputy Director PDLVT, BMC	Mr. Sao Kosal, ILO IPEC Field Coordinator Tel: 012 555 887
19	13:30–14:00	Field Visit to Poipet International Border Gate where child labourers are employed as porters and or to do pushing the carts	To understand on extent of effectiveness of the project on eliminating of child labour in worst forms	International Border Gate in Poipet		Mr. Sao Kosal, ILO IPEC Field Coordinator Tel: 012 555 887.
20	14:00–15:30	Meeting with school directors, principal, PDEYS Officer	To understand on roles and responsibilities and their commitment to combat on child labour in the sector	Palilai II Primary School, Poipet	Hong Prakorb, Deputy Director PDLVT, BMC	Mr. Sao Kosal, ILO IPEC Field Coordinator Tel: 012 555 887
	15:30–17:00	Travel from Banteay Meanchey to Battambang				
Saturday - 13 October 2012						
	07:30–13:00	Travel from Battambang to Phnom Penh				Mr. Chea Mony
Sunday 14 October 2012 to Tuesday 16 October: National Holiday, Phcum Ben Day; Wednesday - 17 October 2012						
21	8:00– 9:00	Meeting with Fisheries Administration (FIA), Mr. Kaing Khim	To understand the efforts for elimination worst forms of child labour in fisheries sector	#185, Norodom Blvd, Phnom Penh	Ms. Kaing Khim Deputy Director General	Mr. Ouk Sisovann NPM ILO IPEC TBP Tel: 012- 811 399
	9:00–9:30	Travel from FiA to ILO Joint Office				
22	9:30–10:30	Meetings with Mr. Som Chamnan Executive Director, and Ms. Sok Dalis, AP Coordinator of the Employer's Association, APSO on mobilizing employers against child labour (CAMFEBA).	To understand the role of the Employers and their efforts in eliminating child labour, especially its worst forms in Cambodia.	CAMFEBA House 44A, Street 320, Sangkat Boeung Keng Kang III, Phnom Penh, Cambodia	Mr. Som Chamnan Executive Director – CAMFEBA Ms. Sok Dalis, AP Coordinator- CAMFEBA.	Mr. Un Vuthy PO, ILO IPEC TBP Tel: 012 88 99 82
23	10:30–11:30	Meeting with Ms. Ann Bishop, Consultant conducted GPs and LLs	To share and discuss her work findings for potential inputs into the evaluation analysis and report	ILO Joint Office		Mr. Ouk Sisovann NPM ILO IPEC TBP Tel: 012- 811 399

	Date and time	Activities	Purpose	Venue	Contact point	TBP focal point
		Study emerging from the project implementation				
	13:00–16:30	Travel from Phnom Penh to Kompong Cham province				
Thursday - 18 October 2012						
24	8:00–10:45	Meeting project’s partners, stakeholders, and conduct field Visit to previous IPEC TBP Sectoral Action Programmes’ target areas in Kampong Cham.	To understand strategies and sustainable efforts of ILO IPEC and its Partners/stakeholders in Kampong Cham to work towards ending of WFCL by 2016.	Target district in Kampong Cham (to be confirmed)	Mr. Chheang Eam Leng, Deputy PDLVT, KCM.	Mr. Sao Kosal, ILO IPEC Field Coordinator Tel: 012 555 887
	10:45-11:00	Travel to meet former child labourer who been trained on hair beauty and make up skills				
25	11:00–11:30	Meeting with Miss.... Former child labourers who had been withdrawn for receiving training on hair beauty and make up skill	To understand on impact of the withdrawal for providing vocational skill training	Hair Beauty Shop in Kompong Cham provincial town	Mr. Chheang Eam Leng, Deputy PDLVT, KCM.	Mr. Sao Kosal, ILO IPEC Field Coordinator Tel: 012 555 887
	11:30–12:30	Travel to former targeted areas to meet with former trainees on motorbike repair and lunch break				
26	13:00–13:30	Meeting with former child labourer who been withdrawn for receiving training on motorbike repair	To understand impact of the withdrawal for providing vocational skill training	Motorbike workshop in village, Chop Rubber Plantation	Mr. Chheang Eam Leng, Deputy PDLVT, KCM.	Mr. Sao Kosal, ILO IPEC Field Coordinator Tel: 012 555 887
	13:30–14:10	Travel to former targeted areas to meet with former trainees on hair beauty and make up skills				
27	14:10–14:45	Meeting with former child labourer who been withdrawn for receiving training on hair beauty and make up skills	To understand impact of the withdrawal for providing vocational skill training	Chop Rubber Planation	Mr. Chheang Eam Leng, Deputy PDLVT, KCM.	Mr. Sao Kosal, ILO IPEC Field Coordinator Tel: 012 555 887
	14:45–18:00	Travel from Kampong Cham back to Phnom Penh				Mr. Chea Mony
Friday – 19 October 2012						
	7:30 – 8:30	Travel from Phnom Penh to Mok Kampoul district, Kandal province				Mr. Chea Mony Tel: 097- 727 2505
28	08:30–10:30	Meeting project’s partners and conduct field Visit to IPEC TBP Sectoral Action Programmes’ activities in Kandal.	To understand the strategies and efforts of IPEC and its Partners in Kandal to work towards elimination of child labour in brick sector.	Angkoul Primary School	Mr. Chhun Roeun, Director SIT.	Mr. Sao Kosal, ILO IPEC Field Coordinator Tel: 012 555 887

To Contribute to Developing National Capacities to Achieve the 2015 National Child Labour Reduction Targets and the ILO Global Targets for Ending the Worst Forms of Child Labour in Cambodia by 2016
Final evaluation – November 2012

	Date and time	Activities	Purpose	Venue	Contact point	TBP focal point
29	10:30–12:00	Conduct field visit to IPEC TBP Sectoral Action programme's target areas to interact with formers child labourers	To understand the progress of their studies	Chheur Teal Primary School	Director SIT.	Mr. Sao Kosal, ILO IPEC Field Coordinator Tel: 012 555 887
	12:00–14:00	<i>Lunch break and travel from Kandal back to Phnom Penh</i>				
30	14:30–15:30	Meeting with Mr. Phanna, Deputy Director General, Department of National Television of Kampuchea	To understand on MoIF's strategies and efforts of the MoIF in the elimination of child labour towards achieving twin goals	H#30, Street Monivong Blvd., Phnom Penh	Mr. Pang Nath Vice Director TVK	Mr. Sao Kosal, ILO IPEC Field Coordinator
	15:30–16:00	<i>Travel back from MoI to ILO Joint Office</i>				
31	16:00–17:30	Meeting with ILO IPEC Team in Phnom Penh	Continued discussion about the project	ILO Joint Office, Phnom Penh Centre		Mr. Ouk Sisovann
Saturday - 20 October 2012 Sunday - 21 October 2012: Travel to Kampot province (2:30 pm – 4:40pm); Day 8: Monday - 22 October 2012						
32	08:00–10:45	Meeting project's partners, stakeholders, and conduct field Visit to IPEC TBP Sectoral Action Programmes' activities towards child labour free in Kep.	To understand the strategies and efforts of IPEC and its Partners in Kandal to work towards elimination of child labour in Kep.	IPEC TBP Action Programmes Target Areas in Kep province.	Mr. Dith Lay Heak, Director PDLVT Kep (IA).	Mr. Un Vuthy PO, ILO IPEC TBP
	10:45–11:00	<i>Travel to meet children in Primary School in Angkoal village, Domnak Chang Eor district, Kep province</i>				
33	11:00–11:30	Meeting with school children	To understand on impact of child withdrawal for schooling	Primary School in Angkoal village, Domnak Chang Eor district,	Mr. Dith Lay Heak, Director PDLVT Kep (IA).	Mr. Un Vuthy PO, ILO IPEC TBP Tel: 012- 88 99 82
	11:30–11:40	<i>Travel to meet Fishing Union members, Domnak Chang Eor district, Kep province</i>				
34	11:40–12:30	Meeting with Fishing Union members	To understand on efforts of Union to stop child labour	Domnak Chang Eor district, Kep province	Mr. Dith Lay Heak, Director PDLVT Kep	Mr. Un Vuthy PO, ILO IPEC TBP Tel: 012- 88 99 82
	12:30–14:00	Lunch break				
35	2:00–16:30	Meeting project's partners, stakeholders, and conduct field Visit to IPEC TBP Sectoral Action Programmes' activities towards child labour free in salt sector.	To understand the strategies and efforts of IPEC and its Partners in Kampot to work towards elimination of child labour in salt sector..	IPEC TBP Action Programmes Target Areas in Kampot province.	Mr. Doung Sovann, Director PDLVT Kampot (IA). Tel: 012- 927 829/097- 5130 999	Mr. Un Vuthy PO, ILO IPEC TBP Tel: 012- 88 99 82

	Date and time	Activities	Purpose	Venue	Contact point	TBP focal point
		in Kampot.				
	16:30–17:20	<i>Travel to meet with members of Self Help Group in Somroang village, Chong Kreal commune, Teuk Chhou district, Kampot province</i>				
36	17:20–18:20	Meeting with Self Help Group	To understand on impact on child labour as a result of livelihood improvement of parents	Somroang village, Chong Kreal commune, Teuk Chhou district	Mr. Doung Sovann, Director PDLVT Kampot	Mr. Un Vuthy PO, ILO IPEC TBP Tel: 012- 88 99 82
	19:00–20:30	Meeting with ILO IPEC team	To debrief on preliminary findings which were prepared in power point presentation for a following day's workshop	Restaurant, Kampot province		
37	23/10/12 (8:00–16:00)	The Provincial Stakeholder Workshop in Kampot	To get the inputs, comments and feedbacks from the IAs, EAs and Stakeholders for the findings found by the Evaluation Team.	Diamond Hotel, Kampot province	Evaluation Team	Mr. Ouk Sisovann NPM, ILO IPEC Mr. Un Vuthy PO, ILO IPEC TBP
38	16:00–16:35	Meeting with Mr. Om Chhun, Representative of Salt Production Community in Kep and Kampot	To understand on how the salt production community has done to stop children from labour	Diamond Hotel Kampot province	Mr. Doung Sovann, Director PDLVT Kampot	Mr. Un Vuthy PO, ILO IPEC TBP Tel: 012- 88 99 82
39	16:35–17:15	Meeting with ILO IPEC team	To discuss on feedback of the workshop and prepare logistics for the National Workshop	Diamond Hotel Kampot province		
Tuesday - 23 October 2012, The Provincial Stakeholder Workshop in Kampot						
37	23/10/12 (8:00 – 16:00)	The Provincial Stakeholder Workshop in Kampot	To get the inputs, comments and feedbacks from the IAs, EAs and Stakeholders for the findings found by the Evaluation Team.	Diamond Hotel, Kampot province	Evaluation Team	Mr. Ouk Sisovann NPM, ILO IPEC TBP Mr. Un Vuthy PO, ILO IPEC TBP
38	16:00 – 16:35	Meeting with Mr. Om Chhun, Representative of Salt Production Community in Kep and Kampot	To understand on how the salt production community has done to stop children from labour	Diamond Hotel Kampot province	Mr. Doung Sovann, Director PDLVT Kampot	Mr. Un Vuthy PO, ILO IPEC TBP Tel: 012- 88 99 82
39	16:35 – 17:15	Meeting with ILO IPEC team	To discuss on feedback of the workshop and prepare logistics for the National Workshop	Diamond Hotel Kampot province		
Wednesday – 24 October 2012						
	8:00– 8:18	<i>Travel to meet with School Director and children in Ta Ang village, Troey Koh commune, Kampot province</i>				
40	8:18– 10:05	Meeting with School	To learn on how school has	Ta Ang village,	Mr. Doung	Mr. Un Vuthy

To Contribute to Developing National Capacities to Achieve the 2015 National Child Labour Reduction Targets and the ILO Global Targets for Ending the Worst Forms of Child Labour in Cambodia by 2016
Final evaluation – November 2012

	Date and time	Activities	Purpose	Venue	Contact point	TBP focal point
		Director	engaged in preventing or withdrawal of children from child labour	Troey Koh commune, Kampot province	Sovann, Director PDLVT Kampot	PO, ILO IPEC TBP Tel: 012- 88 99 82
41	10:05–11:15	Meeting with children in Child Council	To learn how the children had been engaged in the ILO IPEC project, and impact of the child labour issues which were disseminated to them on their learning performance	Ta Ang village, Troey Koh commune, Kampot province	Mr. Doung Sovann, Director PDLVT Kampot	Mr. Un Vuthy PO, ILO IPEC TBP Tel: 012- 88 99 82
	11:30–14:40	Travel back to Phnom Penh				Mr. Chea Mony
42	14:40–17:00	Meeting with ILO IPEC team	To continue discussion on the prepared questions as provided by ToR	ILO Joint Office, Phnom Penh	Mr. Ouk Sisovann NPM, ILO IPEC	
	Evening meeting	Meeting with Simrin Singh, ILO	Interview			
Thursday – 25 October 2012						
43	8:00– 17:00	Preparation for National Stakeholder Workshop				Evaluation Team
44	17:00–18:00	Meeting with ILO IPEC team to run the Power Point for feedback and inputs if any.				Evaluation Team and IPEC Team
Friday – 26 October 2012, National Stakeholder Workshop in Phnom Penh						
45	8:00–16:00	The National Stakeholder Workshop in Phnom Penh	To get the inputs, comments and feedbacks from the National Partners/ Stakeholders for the findings found by the Evaluation Team.	Phnom Penh Hotel	Evaluation Team	Mr. Ouk Sisovann NPM, ILO IPEC Mr. Un Vuthy PO, ILO IPEC TBP
46	15:00–16:00	Meeting with ILO IPEC Team in Phnom Penh.	To wrap up meeting with TBP Support Project staff in Phnom Penh (PNP).	Phnom Penh Hotel	Evaluation Team	Mr. Ouk Sisovann NPM, ILO IPEC

Annex 4: List of Interviewees

Date: Day only (all in October 2012 except where indicated)	Last and First Name (If group of children or more than 6 adults present only list total number by gender)	M #	F #	Address or name of community	Organisation or type of individual (Local leader, parent(s), child(ren), etc.
25, 26 Sept	Keith Jeddere-Fisher	M		ILO Headquarters, Geneva (Skype)	<i>ILO IPEC DED Senior Evaluation Officer.</i>
26 Sept	Bharati Pflug		F	ILO Headquarters, Geneva (Skype)	Former Cambodia desk officer, ILO IPEC
October 5	USDOL briefing with ILAB team			Washington, DC (Skype)	Bureau of International Labor Affairs (ILAB), USDOL
Monday 8	Un Vuthy	M		ILO Joint Office, Phnom Penh Centre	ILO IPEC
	Sao Kosal	M			
	Hun Savuth	M			
	Heng Sothavy		F		
	Ouk Sisovann	M			
	Seang Kokha	M			
	Chea Mony	M			
Tuesday 9	Emelita Santos Goddard		F	Phnom Penh	Individual consultant
	Dr. P.R. Dash	M		Phnom Penh centre	Individual consultant
	Seang Sok Rotha	M		Phnom Penh centre	Consultant Assistant
	Lisa Kalajian		F	US Embassy, No.1, Street 96	Political and Economic Officer
	Excellency Mao Sambath	M		Ministry of Labour, Vocational Training H#3, Russian Federation Bld, Toul Kork, Phnom Penh	Under State Secretary
	Veng Heang	M			Chief Officer
	Nouth Sophorn	M			Deputy Director of Child Labour Department
	Tang Sopheak	M			Deputy Director
	Yav Ny	M			Chief Officer
	Vann Ratana	M			Chief Officer
	Shorn Senghok	M		Ministry of Education, Norodom Bld.	Director of Legislation Department
	Seng Sovath	M			Deputy Director of Legislation Department
Wed 10	Heang Kanol	M		Ministry of Planning, H#386, Preah Monivong Blvd. Sangkat Boeng Keng Kang I, Khan Chamkar Mon, Phnom Penh	Deputy Director General National Institute of Statistics
	Teav Rongsa	M			Deputy of Department National Institute of Statistics
	Sok Sothy	M		National Committee for Sub-National Democratic Development (NCDD), Ministry of Interior, H#275, Norodom Blvd, Tonle Bassac, Chankar	Deputy Director Policy Development and Analysis Division

Date: Day only (all in October 2012 except where indicated)	Last and First Name (If group of children or more than 6 adults present only list total number by gender)	M #	F #	Address or name of community	Organisation or type of individual (Local leader, parent(s), child(ren), etc.)
				Mon, Phnom Penh	
Wed 10	Excellency Ngy Chanphal	M		Ministry of Interior, H#275, Norodom Blvd, Tonle Bassac, Chankar Mon, Phnom Penh	Secretary of State
	Tun Sophorn	M		ILO Joint Office, Phnom Penh Centre	National Coordinator
	Tep Kim Vannary		F	CCTU	Trade Union
	Keo Samhpov	M		Cambodia Labour Confederation	Trade Union
	Morm Nhim		F	Cambodia National Labour Confederation (CNC)	Vice president
	Kim Chansammany	M		NACC (Trade Union)	Secretary
	Rath Minea	M		CNC	Secretary
	Soy Seyha	M		CCTU	Secretary
	Meang Seng	M		WINROCK INTERNATIONAL Phnom Penh Centre	Deputy Chief of Party
Thu 11	So Savoeun	M		Porter and Construction Confederation Poipet Municipality, Banteay Meanchey province	President
	Oung Rasmey		F	Provincial Department of Women's Affairs, Banteay Meanchey province	Deputy Director
	Nuon Sina	M		Provincial Department of Labour and Vocational Training, Banteay Meanchey (BTM)	Chief of Labour and Vocational Training Office
	Chem Vandeth	M			Vice Chief of Labour and Vocational Training Office
	Sirey Uddom	M			Chief of Labour and Vocational Training Office
	Chok Kosal	M		Provincial Department of Information, BTM	Deputy Director
	Oeun Setha	M		Provincial Department of Education, BTM	Official in the Department
	Prak Sohpeak Neary		F	Children Committee (NGO), BTM	Project Officer
Friday 12	Khou Shim		F	Ou Chrov village, Poipet, Banteay Meanchey province	Mother of interviewed child
	Yoeum Mich		F		Mother of interviewed child
	Arth Pha		F		Mother of interviewed child
Friday 12	Cheang Huon		F		Mother of interviewed child
	Chea Norm		F		Mother of interviewed child
	Interviewed Children	5	2	Palilai Primary School, Poipet, Banteay Meanchey province	Children of interviewed Mother
	Sao Tol		F	Palilai village, Poipet	Mother of interviewed child
	Shim Pov		F	Kbal Spean village, Poipet	
	Heng Ny		F	Palilai village, Poipet	
	Shim Pha		F	Kbal Koh village, Poipet	

Date: Day only (all in October 2012 except where indicated)	Last and First Name (If group of children or more than 6 adults present only list total number by gender)	M #	F #	Address or name of community	Organisation or type of individual (Local leader, parent(s), child(ren), etc.)
	Soam Savoeung		F	Kbal Koh village, Poipet	
	Boy and girls of interviewed mothers	1	4	Palilai Primaru School II, Poipet	Withdrawn/prevented boy and girls who have been in business
	Nuon Sina	M		Serey Sohorn, Banteay Meanchey province	N/A
	Khuon Kheang	M		Poipet Municipality	Community based child labour monitoring agent
	Theng Sohphary		F	Palilai village, Poipet	Village Chief
	Chuob Theary		F	Palilai village, Poipet	Vice Chief of Village
	Touch Narin	M		Poipet	Community based child labour monitoring agent
	Hing Savon	M		Ou Chrov village, Poipet	
	Eang Vanna	M		Kbal Spean village, Poipet	
	Chib Hy	M		Ou Chrov village, Poipet	Vice Chief of Village
	Kong Saruon		F	Ou Chrov village, Poipet	Women Leader of W Affairs
	Bot Siloan		F	Poipet Municipality	Deputy Governor Chairperson of the Civil Society Network for Combatting on Child Labour
	Heng Phorn	M		Poipet Municipality	Chief of Education Office
	San Phal	M		Primary School in Ou Chrov village	School Director
	Chhun Leang Shrun	M		Rattana Ram Primary School	
	Khoal Rann	M		Watt Trach Primary School	
	Mok Sarin	M		Palilai Primary School	
	Yin Sakhorn	M		Prom Nimeth Primary School	Deputy School Director
Wed 17	Kaing Khim		F	Ministry of Fisheries, H#186, Preah Norodom Blvd.	Deputy Director General of Fisheries Administration
	Som Chamnan	M		CAMFEBA, H#44A, Str. 320	President
Thursday 18	Sim Thanyda	M		Kaksekor Thmey (NGO), Kompong Cham	Project Officer
	Cheng Heang	M		Provincial Dept. Labour and VL., Kompong Cham province	Director
	H.E. Meng Suon	M		Kompong Province	Deputy of Provincial Governor & Chairperson of the Provincial Committee to Combat on child labour
	Ros Sopheak		F	Provincial Dept of Women's Affairs, Kompong Cham province	Deputy Director
	Thorn Bonshroan		F		Chief of Education Office
	Som Phalla		F	Provincial Dept of Information Kompong Cham province	Deputy Director
	Chhuy Mongsreng	M		Provincial Dept of Education Kompong Cham	Chief of Information Office

Date: Day only (all in October 2012 except where indicated)	Last and First Name (If group of children or more than 6 adults present only list total number by gender)	M #	F #	Address or name of community	Organisation or type of individual (Local leader, parent(s), child(ren), etc.)
	Dara	M		Provincial Dept of Planning Kompong Cham province	Chief of Planning Office
Thursday 18	Thou Naren		F	Former child labourer who been withdrawn for receiving training on hair beauty and make up skill	Hair beauty and make up trainee Village 33, Chamcar Andoug Rubber Plantation
	Sok Sinath	M		Former child labourer who been withdrawn for receiving training on motorbike repair, Chop rubber plantation	Running business on motorbike repair village 48, Chop Rubber Plantation
	Hol Sophal		F	Former child labourer who been withdrawn for receiving training on hair beauty shop in, Chop Rubber Plantation	Hair beauty and make up trainee, Tapang Market, Tapang Rubber Plantation
	Chheang Eam Leng	M		Provincial Dept of Labour, VT Kompong Cham province	Deputy Director
Friday 19	Chhun Roeun	M		Save Incapacity Teenagers (SIT) Mok Kompoul district, Kandal province	Director
	Lem Pharom	M		Provincial Dept. Labour, VT	Deputy Director
	Ven Pheap		F	Mok Kompoul district, Kandal province	Community Volunteer
	Men Sopha	M		Save Incapacity Teenagers (SIT) Mok Kompoul district, Kandal province	Community Monitor
	Thay Va		F	Mok Kompoul district, Kandal province	Community Volunteer
	Na Vanny		F	Mok Kompoul district, Kandal province	Community Volunteer
	Ros Roeun	M		Mok Kompoul district, Kandal province	Community Literacy Teacher
	Heng Dina	M		Mok Kompoul district, Kandal province	Community Literacy Teacher
	Si Nuon		F	Save Incapacity Teenagers (SIT) Mok Kompoul district, Kandal province	Accountant
	Children	4	7	Chheu Teal Primary School, Mok Kompoul district, Kandal province	Withdrawn or prevented children
	Phann Na	M		Ministry of Information, Monivong Blvd., Phnom Penh	Deputy General Director, TVK
	Pao Meng Shrun	M			N/A
	Thai Chak Riya		F		Accountant
	Chhay Thea	M			Director of the Radio Station FM96
	Ly Den	M			Director of the Agent Cambodia Press (AKP)
Monday 22	So Sokundoeun		F	Children Committee, Kep	Project Officer
	Kao Ny		F	Provincial Dept of Women's Affairs, Kep	Deputy Director
	Nhang Sophy	M		Provincial Dept of Labour, VT, Kep	Deputy Director

Date: Day only (all in October 2012 except where indicated)	Last and First Name (If group of children or more than 6 adults present only list total number by gender)	M #	F #	Address or name of community	Organisation or type of individual (Local leader, parent(s), child(ren), etc.)
	Soy Sam On	M		Cambodian Union Federation, Kep	President
	Kong Lyna	M		Provincial Dept of Education, Kep	Vice Chief of Education Office
	Yang Bros	M		Provincial Dept of Planning, Kep	Deputy Director
	Kong Sadom	M		Provincial Dept of Education, Kep	Deputy Director
	Taen Sokhorn	M		Provincial Dept of Labour, VT, Kep	Vice Chief of Labour, VT Office
	Srey Samorn	M		Provincial Dept of Labour, VT, Kep	Chief of Labour, VT Office
	Dith Lay Heak	M		Provincial Dept of Labour, VT, Kep	Director
	Leav Shunry	M		Provincial Dept of Information, Kep	Deputy Director
	Children	5	5	Primary School in Angkoal village, Domnak Chang Eor district, Kep province	
Monday 22	Meas Va	M		Fishing Union	Vice President
	Keo Sdoeng	M			Member
	Meas Chin		F		
	Meas Men		F		
	Ly Lok		F		
	Eng Chorvy		F	Cambodia Centre for the Protection of Children Rights (CCPCR), Kampot	
	Kao Rith	M		Provincial Dept of Education, Kampot	Deputy Director and Project Coordinator
	Doung Savann	M		Provincial Dept of Labour, VT, Kampot	Director
	Koa Bunna	M		Provincial Dept of Planning, Kampot	Deputy Director
	Sokhun Pheak Khdey	M		Provincial Dept of Labour, VT, Kampot	Vice Chief of Labour, VT Office
	Ork Somnang	M		Provincial Dept of Information, Kampot	Deputy Director
	Pov Kunthy		F	Provincial Dept of Women's Affairs, Kampot	Deputy Director
	Children	12	11	Primary School in Toteung village, Boeng Chouk commune, Teuk Chhou district, Kampot province	
	Tes Nam		F	Self Help Group in Somroang village, Chong Kreal commune, Teuk Chhou district, Kampot province	Group Leader
	Phan Rin		F		Vice leader
	Nget Dy		F		General Ledger bookkeepers
	Em Channa		F		Cashier
	Keng Sok Pheng		F		Auditor
	Dom Tien		F		Member
	Chey Sok Khem		F		
	Da Kannha		F		
	Bou Sokun		F		

Date: Day only (all in October 2012 except where indicated)	Last and First Name (If group of children or more than 6 adults present only list total number by gender)	M #	F #	Address or name of community	Organisation or type of individual (Local leader, parent(s), child(ren), etc.)
	Khin Dorn		F		
	Yuon Channa		F		
	Som Rim		F		
	Hun Neang		F		
	Morm Nam		F		
	Kuy Sokhom		F		
	Tem Sareth		F		
	Chey Puth	M			
	Nget Sarath		F		
	Tom Srey Mao		F		
	Chin Sokun		F		
	Chhim Tom		F		
	Kong Rin		F		
	Touch Koeun		F		
	Kong Roeun		F		
	Chhuon Seung An		F		
	Chhuon Vanna		F		
	Keng Sok Thai	M			
	Nget Chhao	M			
	Om Eoun		F		
Tue 23	Om Chhun	M		Salt Production Community in Kep and Kampot provinces	Representative
Wed 24	Ban Sophal		F	Hun Sen Primary School, Watt Troey Koh, Ta Ang village, Troey Koh commune, Kampot province	School Director
	Children	4	7		Members and Leaders of Child Council
	Simrin Singh		F	Interview held in Phnom Penh	Senior Child Labour Specialist

Annex 5: List of Participants Stakeholder Workshops

List of Participants for the National Stakeholder Workshop of the Expanded Final Evaluation of the TBP Support project, Phase II in Cambodia, 26 October 2012 at the Phnom Penh Hotel, Phnom Penh

No	Name	Sex	Position	Organization	City/Province
1	Nouth Sophorn	M	Deputy Director	MoLVT	Phnom Penh
2	Som Piseth	M	Vice Governor	PRCCL	Kep
3	Meng Soun	M	Vice Governor	PCCL	Kampong Cham
4	Noum Sophon	F	Vice Governor	PCCL	Banteay Meanchey
5	Chhat C. Vathnak	M	Advisor	PCCL	Banteay Meanchey
6	Veng Heang	M	Director	DOCL, MoLVT	Phnom Penh
7	Simrin Singh	F	Snr CL Specialist	ILO	Bangkok
8	Mei Zegers	F	Consultant		
9	Seang Meng	M	DCOP	WINROCK	Phnom Penh
10	Un Vuthy	M	Program Officer	ILO	Phnom Penh
11	Hun Savuth	M	Program Assistant	ILO	Phnom Penh
12	Sorn Seng Hok	M	Director	DOL, MOEYS	Phnom Penh
13	Hour Phalla	M	Labour Assistant	US Embassy	Phnom Penh
14	Pang Nath	M	Deputy Director General	TVK	Phnom Penh
15	Dank Eakakada	M	Operation Manager	CAMFEBA	Phnom Penh
16	Kou Phearith	M	Senior Project Manager	World Vision	Phnom Penh
17	Tun Sophorn	M	National Coordinator	ILO	Phnom Penh
18	Sok Sothy	M	Deputy	DOLA, Ministry of Interior	Phnom Penh
19	Lim Sarom	M	Representative	PCCL	Kandal
20	Nop Rithear	M	Head of Section	CNCC	Phnom Penh
21	Thon Sopheap	M	Official	WDA	Phnom Penh
22	Sareun Phalla	F	Child	Target children, Tonle Basac	Phnom Penh
23	Sun Chamroeun	M	Child	Target children, Tonle Basac	Phnom Penh
24	Sar Sovanara	M	Reporter	Radio Free Asia	Phnom Penh
25	Sok Somith	M	Consultant		
26	Ouk Sisovann	M	National Project Manager	ILO	Phnom Penh
27	Seang Sokha	M	Finance Assistant	ILO	Phnom Penh
28	Chuong Sivvuth	M	Vice Governor	PCCL	Kampt
29	Kem Gunawadh	M	Director General	TVK	Phnom Penh
30	Phoeun Rithy	M	Staff	PP Capacity Hall	Phnom Penh
31	Sao Kosal	M	Field Coordinator	ILO	Phnom Penh

No	Name	Sex	Position	Organization	City/Province
32	Emelita Goddard	F	Consultant		Phnom Penh
33	Aun Leakhena	F	Communication officer	CARD	Phnom Penh
34	Kuy Kakda	M	Communication officer	CARD	Phnom Penh
35	Im Chamroeun	M	Vice Chief of office	PDLVT	Siem Reap
36	Pen Chantra	M	Official	World Vision	Phnom Penh
37	Um Visal	M	Political	CLC	Phnom Penh
38	Meng Danin	F	M & E Assistant	CARD	Phnom Penh
39	Be Vanny	M	Project Assistant	WDA	Phnom Penh
40	Heng Sothavy	F	Program Assistant	ILO IPEC	Phnom Penh
41	Sok Sarin	M	Driver	ILO IPEC	Phnom Penh
42	Ou Nearyrith	F	Counsellor	Tonle Bassac	Phnom Penh
43	Khieu Leang	F	Parent, target children	Tonle Bassac	Phnom Penh
44	Sun Phorn	M	Parent, target children	Tonle Bassac	Phnom Penh
45	Sok Saran	F	Official	HCC	Phnom Penh
46	Vann Ratana	M	Chief of office	DOCL	Phnom Penh
47	Seng Sophear	F	Translator	Freelancer	Phnom Penh
48	Tep Sophal	M	Official	DOL, MOEYS	Phnom Penh
49	Chhom Phearak	M	Official	TVK	Phnom Penh
50	Khoun Sopheak Oudom Vannak	M	TVK Camera	TVK	Phnom Penh
51	Mom Saran	M	Official	CCTU	Phnom Penh

List of Participants for the Provincial Stakeholder Workshop for Expanded Final Evaluation of the TBP Support project, Phase II in Cambodia, 23 October 2012 at the Kampot Diamond Hotel, Kampot Province

No	Name	Sex	Position	Organization	City/Province
1	Phin Vong	F	Director	PDWA	Banteay Meanchey
2	Soung Savon	M	Deputy Director	PDEYS	Banteay Meanchey
3	Khim Phally	F	1st Head of Sangkat	Kok Chak	Siem Reap
4	Som Nimol	M	Official	MDLVT	Phnom Penh
5	Kong Lina	M	Vice Chief of office	PDEYS	Kep
6	Koy Phal	M	Chief of office	PDEYS	Siem Reap
7	Yean Meng Tech	M	Deputy Director	PDLVT	Kampong Thom
8	Kao Ny	F	Vice Chief of office	PDWA	Kep
9	Phann Phirun	M	Chief of counsellor	PCCL, Banlon	Ratanakiri
10	Siep Oun	M	Chief of office	PDP	Kep
11	Choup Chhean	F	Monitor	Ou Krasar	Kep
12	Tann Phang	F	Monitor	Ou Doung	Kep
13	Pov Son	M	Head of Sangkat	Treuy Koh	Kampot

No	Name	Sex	Position	Organization	City/Province
14	Sokun Pheakdey	M	Vice Chief of office	PDLVT	Kampt
15	Un Vuthy	M	PO	ILO IPEC	Phnom Penh
16	Ou Nearyrith	F	Counsellor	Tonle Bassac	Phnom Penh
17	Hong Vannthy	F	Counsellor	Prek Anchan	Kandal
18	Som Sinath	M	Deputy Director	PDLVT	Kampong Chhnang
19	Kim Do	M	Counsellor		Kratie
20	Bin Kim San	M	Deputy Director	PDLVT	Kratie
21	Ly Eak	M	Official	PDEYS	Phnom Penh
22	Sorn Bun Cheun	M	Director	PDLVT	Ratanakiri
23	Thol Norn	M	President	NIUBTW	Siem Reap
24	Chhouy Mong Sreng	M	Chief of office	PDYES	Kampogn Cham
25	Cheng Heang	M	Director	PDLVT	Kampong Cham
26	Noun Sina	M	Chief of office	PDLVT	Banteay Meanchey
27	Soy Sam On	M	President	CUF	Kep
28	Samreth Sopha	M	Translator		Phnom Penh
29	Neang Sovath	M	Member	CSNACL	Kampong Cham
30	Or Saren	M	Director	PDSOVYS	Svay Rieng
31	Sek Sophal	M	Program Director	CCPCR	Phnom Penh
32	Prum Chanvichet	M	Chief of office	PDLVT	Sihanoukville
33	Doung Sovan	M	Director	PDLVT	Kampt
34	Mao Sambath	M	Under Secretary of State	MoLVT	Phnom Penh
35	Chhun Roeun	M	President	SIT	Kandal
36	Chim Chanthlar	M	Deputy Director	PDLVT	Svay Rieng
37	Emelita Goddard	F	Consultant		Phnom Penh
38	Mei Zegers	F	Consultant		
39	Sok Somith	M	Consultant		
40	Heng Sothavy	F	Program Assistant	ILO IPEC	Phnom Penh
41	Ouk Sisovann	M	National Project Manager	ILO IPEC	Phnom Penh
42	Sao Kosal	M	Field Coordinator	ILO IPEC	Phnom Penh
43	Horm Rithy	M	Chief of office	PDLVT	Sihanoukville
44	Koh Soumatra	M	Chief of office	PDLVT	Siem Reap
45	Bun Chreb	F	Vice Chief of office	PDLVT	Siem Reap
46	Heng Khim	F	Vice Chief of office	PDWA	Siem Reap
47	Im Chamroeun	M	Vice Chief of office	PDLVT	Siem Reap
48	Nouth Nang	F	Official	PDSOVYS	Phnom Penh
49	Meng Chhorvy	F	Official	CCPCR	Kampt
50	Kao Rith	M	Deputy Director	PDEYS	Kampt
51	Tep Sopheap	F	Coordinator	CCPCR	Kampong Thom

To Contribute to Developing National Capacities to Achieve the 2015 National Child Labour Reduction Targets and the ILO Global Targets for Ending the Worst Forms of Child Labour in Cambodia by 2016
Final evaluation – November 2012

No	Name	Sex	Position	Organization	City/Province
52	Prounch Chhun	M	Head of village	Samroung village	Kampot
53	Seng Phin	M	Pro. Manager	OEC	Battambang
54	Pich Sambo	M	Director	PDEYS	Kampong Chhnang
55	Mom Sandap	F	Director	PDP	Phnom Penh
56	Tes Chan Saroeun	F	Director	PDWA	Phnom Penh
57	Lim Sarom	M	Deputy Director	PDWA	Kandal
58	Heng Mono	M	Chief of commune	Phat Sanday	Kampong Thom
59	Ten Sokhorn	M	Vice Chief of office	PDLVT	Kep
60	Phoung Chea	M	Director	PDLVT	Battambang
61	Nou Nim	M	Director	PDLVT	Phnom Penh
62	Dith Lay Heak	M	Director	PDLVT	Kep
63	Seth Neoun	M	Chief	CSNACL	Kep
64	Thy Channa	F	Child	Vocational Skills	Kep
65	Khun Chandara	F	Child	Vocational Skills	Kep
66	Ros Say	M	Chief of Village	Ou Krasar, SHG	Kep
67	Hong Prakorb	M	Deputy Director	PDLVT	Banteay Meanchey
68	Seang Sokha	M	Finance Assistant	ILO IPEC	Phnom Penh
69	Mey Seav Yan	F	Child	Beung Taprem	Kampot
70	Prak Tola	M	Child	Beung Taprem	Kampot
71	Pring Sarom	M	Vice Chief of office	PDEYS	Kampot
72	Chhay Sokun Neary	F	Member	TU	Kampot
73	Put Bun	M	Chief	TU	Kampot
74	Pen Sophann	M	Official	PDLVT	Kandal
75	Chak Kosal	M	Deputy Director	PD of information	Banteay Meanchey
76	Oum Chhun	M	Employer	Salt community	Kep/Kampot
77	Pov Kunthy	F	Deputy Director	PDWA	Kampot
78	Ork Samnang	M	Deputy Director	PD of information	Kampot
79	Koun Kheang	M	Deputy Director	PDEYS	Banteay Meanchey
80	Bouth Silorn	F	Vice Governor	Ou Chrouv, Poipet	Banteay Meanchey
81	So Savoeun	M	Official	TU, Poipet	Banteay Meanchey
82	Veng Heang	M	Director	DOCL	Phnom Penh
83	Kao Bunna	M	Deputy Director	PDP	Kampot
84	Prak Sokunneary	F	Official	CC	Phnom Penh
85	So Kundoeun	F	Official	CC	Phnom Penh
86	Leng Ratha	M	Technician	Theatry	Phnom Penh

Annex 6: References

Note: The evaluator reviewed many documents including the project Technical Progress Reports. In Annex 6 only the documents referenced in the report are listed.

Bishop, Anne (2012), Draft Report: Good Practices and Lessons Learned in the Project To contribute to developing national capacities to achieve the 2015 national child labour reduction targets and the ILO global targets for ending the Worst Forms of Child Labour in Cambodia by 2016. “Towards Twenty Sixteen: Contributing towards Ending the WFCL in Cambodia. Phnom Penh, available from ILO IPEC.

Cham Rotha& Chheang, Vannarith (undated) Cultural Challenges to the Decentralization Process in Cambodia. Phnom Penh: Asia Foundation; Kyoto: Ritsumeikan University. (Available from: http://www.google.mw/url?sa=t&rct=j&q=&esrc=s&source=web&cd=6&cad=rja&ved=0CDUQFjAF&url=http%3A%2F%2Fcube.ritsumei.ac.jp%2Fbitstream%2F10367%2F233%2F1%2FRJAPS24_Cultural%2520Challenge%2520to%2520the%2520Decentralization%2520Process%2520in%2520Cambodia.pdf&ei=FjeWULSUB8aGhQfcw4HwCA&usg=AFQjCNG7_bCR0e-ra-K2EhwX6VQFkStdQQ . Accessed 1 November, 2012).

Civil Society Network Against Child Labour (CSNACL) (2012). Strategic plan 2013-2017. Phnom Penh: CSNACL.

Dash, Tapas R; December 2012: Assessment of the current situation on child labour (i) in the salt sector in Kampot province and (ii) generally in Kep province. Phnom Penh, Cambodia: Build Bright University.

Goddard, Milet (2012), Study on the Enabling Environment to Reduce Child Labour: In the Salt Sector of Kampot Province and Generally In Kep Province, To contribute to the expanded final evaluation of Towards Twenty Sixteen: Contributing towards Ending the Worst Forms of Child Labour in Cambodia. Phnom Penh, Cambodia: Goddard, Milet”.

Hossein Jalilian, Chan Sophal, Glenda Reyes & Saing Chan Hang, with Phann Dalis & Pon Dorina (2009). Global Financial Crisis Discussion Series Paper 4: Cambodia. London: Overseas Development Institute.

International Labour Organization (ILO), International Programme on the Elimination of Child Labour (IPEC) (2008), Project Document: Final Draft, To contribute to developing national capacities to achieve the 2015 national child labour reduction targets and the ILO global targets for ending the Worst Forms of Child Labour in Cambodia by 2016. “Towards Twenty Sixteen: Contributing towards Ending the WFCL in Cambodia. Geneva: ILO-IPEC.

ILO & Food and Agriculture Organization (2012) International Partnership for Cooperation on Child Labour in Agriculture. (Website available from: <http://www.fao-ilo.org/fao-ilo-child/international-partnership-for-cooperation-on-child-labour-in-agriculture>. Accessed 3 November, 2012).

ILO-IPEC & Winrock International, (2012) Draft: Child Labour Monitoring System for Cambodia. Phnom Penh, ILO-IPEC & Winrock International.

- Ministry of Labour and Vocational Training, (undated), Collection of Prakas Related to Child Labour. MoLVT, Cambodia. Phnom Penh: MoLVT.
- National Committee for Sub-national Democratic Development (2010) The First Three Years Implementation Plan (2011-2013) of NP-SNDD (IP3). Phnom Penh: National Committee for Sub-national Democratic Development.
- National Institute of Statistics (2001), Cambodia Child Labour Survey 2001. Phnom Penh, National Institute of Statistics (Available from: <http://www.nis.gov.kh/nada/index.php/catalog/19/accesspolicy/>. Accessed 30 October, 2012).
- Royal Government of Cambodia (2003). Education for All (EFA) National Plan 2003-2015. Phnom Penh: Royal Government of Cambodia (Available from: <http://www.google.mw/url?sa=t&rct=j&q=&esrc=s&source=web&cd=1&ved=0CBsQFjAA&url=http%3A%2F%2Fplanipolis.iiep.unesco.org%2Fupload%2FCambodia%2FCambodia%2520NPA%2520EFA%2520English.pdf&ei=PtePUI7wHMOphAfJgYGwAg&usg=AFQjCNG2v2KggkCfaK-YAWgblbs1atueRA>. Accessed 30 October, 2012)
- Royal Government of Cambodia (2006). National Strategic Development Plan (NSDP), 2006-10. Phnom Penh: Royal Government of Cambodia
- Royal Government of Cambodia (2008), National Plan of Action on the Elimination of the Worst Forms of Child Labour (NPA-WFCL). Phase I. Phnom Penh: Royal Government of Cambodia
- Royal Government of Cambodia (2010). Eliminating the Worst Forms of Child Labour in Cambodia by Twenty Sixteen Cambodia's Roadmap to 2016. Phnom Penh: Royal Government of Cambodia. (Note: reference to support from IPEC Cambodia project on page 16)
- Smoke, Paul & Morrison, Joanne (2008). Decentralization in Cambodia: Consolidating Central Power or Building Accountability from Below? International Studies Program Working Paper 08-36. Atlanta: International Studies Program, Andrew Young School of Policy Studies, Georgia State University.
- Understanding Children's Work (2009) Towards Eliminating the Worst Forms of Child labour in Cambodia by 2016: An Assessment of Resource Requirements Report on Child Labour. Rome: Understanding Children's Work (UCW) Programme.
- United Nations and Kingdom of Cambodia. (2005) United Nations Development Assistance Framework 2006-2010. Phnom Penh: United Nations and Royal Government of Cambodia.
- United Nations (2009). Inter-Agency Study on the Impact of Food Prices on Child Labour and Education in Cambodia. Phnom Penh: United Nations Development Programme.

Annex 7: Terms of Reference



International Labour Organization- International Programme on the Elimination of Child Labour ILO/IPEC

Terms of Reference For Independent Expanded Final Evaluation

**To Contribute to Developing National Capacities to Achieve the 2015 National
Child Labour Reduction Targets and the ILO Global Targets for Ending the
Worst Forms of Child Labour in Cambodia by 2016**

**(“Towards Twenty Sixteen: Contributing towards Ending the WFCL in
Cambodia”)**

ILO Project Code:	CAM/08/P50/USA
ILO Iris Code	101450
Country	Cambodia
Duration:	51 months
Starting Date:	September 30, 2008
Completion Date:	December 31, 2012
Geographical Coverage:	Cambodia (Preah Sihanouk, Kampot, Kep, Phnom Penh, Kampong Cham, Siem Reap, Banteay Meanchey, Koh Kong, Kandal, Svey Reang, Krachie, Rattanakiri, Kompong Thom, Kampong Channang and Battambang provinces.)
Project Language(s):	English/Khmer
Executing Agency:	ILO/ IPEC
Financing Agency	USDOL
USDOL Donor Contribution:	USD 4,310,000

List of Abbreviations

AP	Action Programme
C182	ILO's Worst Forms of Child Labour Convention, No. 182 of 1999
CSNACL	Civil Society Network Against Child Labour
CL	Child Labour
CLMS	Child Labour Monitoring System
CMDG	Cambodia Millennium Development Goals
DBMR	Direct Beneficiaries Monitoring and Reporting
DWCP	Decent Work Country Programmes
D&D	Decentralization & De-concentration
EIA (DED)	Evaluation and Impact Assessment Section of ILO/IPEC
FGD	Focus group discussion
GAP	Global Action Plan
HQ	Headquarters
IA	Implementing Agency
IABA	Integrated Area Based Approach
ILO	International Labour Organization
IPEC	International Programme on the Elimination of Child Labour
NAP	National Action Plan
NC	National consultant
NGO	Non-governmental Organization
PMP	Project Monitoring Plan
PRSP	Poverty Reduction Strategy Paper
RGC	Royal government of Cambodia
SIMPOC	Statistical Information and Monitoring Programme on Child Labour
TBP	Time Bound Programme
TL	Team leader
UCW	Understanding Children's Work
UN	United Nations
UNDAF	United Nations Development Assistance Framework
USDOL	United States Department of Labor
WDACL	World Day Against Child Labour
WFCL	Worst Forms of Child Labour

I. Background and Justification

1. The aim of the International Programme on the Elimination of Child labour (IPEC) is the progressive elimination of child labour, especially its worst forms. The political will and commitment of individual governments to address child labour - in cooperation with employers' and workers' organizations, non-governmental organizations and other relevant parties in society - is the basis for IPEC action. IPEC support at the country level is based on a phased, multi-sector strategy. This strategy includes strengthening national capacities to deal with this issue, legislation harmonization, improvement of the knowledge base, raising awareness on the negative consequences of child labour, promoting social mobilization against it, and implementing demonstrative direct action programmes (AP) to prevent children from child labour and remove child workers from hazardous work and provide them and their families with appropriate alternatives.
2. The operational strategy of IPEC has over the years focused on providing support to national and local constituents and partners through their projects and activities. Such support has to the extent possible been provided in the context of national frameworks, institutions and processes that have facilitated the building of capacities and mobilisation for further action. It has emphasized various degrees of a comprehensive approach, providing linkages between action and partners in sectors and areas of work relevant for child labour. Whenever possible specific national frameworks or programmes, such as national plans, strategic frameworks, have provided such focus.
3. Starting in 2001, IPEC has promoted and the implementation of the "Time Bound Programme" approach as such national frameworks or national plans of action. A Time Bound Programme (TBP) is essentially a national strategic programme framework of tightly integrated and coordinated policies and initiatives at different levels to eliminate specified Worst Forms of Child Labour (WFCL) in a given country within a defined period of time. It is a nationally owned initiative that emphasizes the need to address the root causes of child labour, linking action against child labour to the national development effort, with particular emphasis on the economic and social policies to combat poverty and to promote universal basic education. The International Labour Organization (ILO), with the support of many development organizations and the financial and technical contribution of the United States' Department of Labor (USDOL) has elaborated this concept based on previous national and international experience. It has also established innovative technical cooperation modalities to support countries that have ratified the ILO's Worst Forms of Child Labour Convention, No. 182 of 1999 (C182) to implement comprehensive measures against WFCL.
4. The most critical element of a TBP or national action plan (NAP) is that it is implemented and led by the country itself. The countries commit to the development of a plan to eradicate or significantly diminish the worst forms of child labour in a defined period. This implies a commitment to mobilize and allocate national human and financial resources to combat the problem. IPEC has over the years implemented a number of country specific projects of support of multi-year duration and focusing both on policy and institutional support through enabling environment and direct support to communities, families and children through targeted interventions.
5. The experience with national NAPs has suggested a range of approaches to establish and implement national frameworks to provide the comprehensive approach, the linkages and the mechanisms for developing the knowledge, mobilising the actors, institutions and resources; and to plan effective coherent national action as part of the broader national development. The experience also showed

that the degree of support needed to get this process going in different countries can vary and that specific strategic initiatives can be identified as often key to the process, focusing on influencing key policies and processes.

6. The Global Action Plan (GAP), proposed in the 2006 Global Report on Child Labour and endorsed by the Governing Body at its November 2006 sitting, called on all ILO member States to put appropriate time-bound measures using National Action Plans (NAPs), in place by 2008 with a view to eliminating the WFCL by 2016.
7. The Royal Government of Cambodia (RGC) is publicly committed to ending child labour and has taken concrete steps to do so. Since ratifying International Labour Organisation (ILO) Conventions No. 138 and 182, the country has adopted time-bound targets and measures to address child labour. The Cambodian Millennium Development Goals (CMDG) includes child labour reduction targets as an indicator for poverty alleviation. The National Plan of Action on the Elimination of the Worst Forms of Child Labour (NPA-WFCL) for 2008-2012, approved in June 2008, also adopted these targets. In June 2009, the RGC made a commitment to the ILO's global goal to eliminate all the worst forms of child labour (WFCL) by 2016. These national and global targets are referred to as the Cambodia's 'Twin Goals' on child labour.
8. The RGC is currently preparing the NPA II for the period 2013 – 2017.
9. From the perspective of the International Labour Organisation (ILO), the elimination of child labour is part of its work on standards and fundamental principles and rights at work. The fulfilment of these standards should guarantee decent work for all adults. In this sense, the ILO provides technical assistance to its three constituents: government, workers and employers. This tripartite structure is the key characteristic of ILO cooperation and it is within this framework that the activities developed by the Programme should be analysed.
10. ILO Decent Work Country Programmes (DWCPs) have subsequently been developed and are being introduced in the ILO to provide a mechanism to outline agreed upon priorities between the ILO and the national constituent partners within a broader UN and International development context. For further information please see:
<http://www.ilo.org/public/english/decent.htm>
11. The DWCP defines a corporate focus on priorities, operational strategies, as well as a resource and implementation plan that complements and supports partner plans for national decent work priorities. As such, DWCP are broader frameworks to which the individual ILO project is linked and contributes to. DWCP are beginning to be gradually introduced into various countries' planning and implementing frameworks. The DWCP document for Cambodia is available at:
<http://www.ilo.org/public/english/bureau/program/dwcp/download/cambodia.pdf>

Project background and current status

12. The Government of Cambodia has ratified ILO Conventions 138 and 182, has participated in initiatives to combat child labour and child trafficking, and has implemented policy and legal frameworks to address these problems.
13. USDOL has supported a number of projects in Cambodia for the elimination of child labour, with some of these being implemented through ILO/IPEC. These projects are listed below:

USDOL-funded child labour projects in Cambodia			
Date	Grantee	Project	Grant
2001-2004	ILO/IPEC	Combating Child Labour in Hazardous Work in Salt Production, Rubber Plantations and Fish/Shrimp Processing Sectors in Cambodia	\$999,310
2003-2007	World Education	Options: Combating Child Trafficking and Commercial Sexual Exploitation Through Education	\$3,000,000
2003-2007	International Rescue Committee	Opportunities for Reducing Adolescent and Child Labour through Education (O.R.A.C.L.E.)	\$3,000,000
2004-2009	ILO/IPEC	Support to the Cambodian National Plan of Action on the Elimination of the Worst Forms of Child Labour: A Time-Bound Approach	\$4,750,000
2007-2011	Winrock International	Children's Empowerment Through Education Services (CHES): Elimination of the Worst Forms of Child Labour in Cambodia	\$4,025,563
2008-2012	ILO/IPEC	To Contribute to Developing National Capacities to Achieve the 2015 National Child Labour Reduction Targets and the ILO Global Targets for Ending the Worst Forms of Child Labour in Cambodia by 2016	\$4,310,000

#

14. ILO has also implemented the following projects/research related to child labour in Cambodia:

- Greater Mekong Sub-Regional Project to Combat Trafficking in Children and Women 2000 – 2003 (DFID –funded)
- Cambodian component of the TCRAM Child Domestic Workers Project 2002 – 2004 (Dutch –funded)
- Combating Trafficking in the Greater Mekong Sub-region Phase II 2003 – 2008 (DFID funded)
- Understanding Children's Work (UCW) inter-agency research project, implemented by ILO, UNICEF and the World Bank study on child labour in Cambodia, 2006, 'Children's work in Cambodia: A challenge for growth and poverty reduction'.
- Understanding Children's Work (UCW) also published an assessment of financial resource requirements for the elimination of WFCL in Cambodia by 2016 in 2009, 'Towards eliminating the worst forms of child labour in Cambodia by 2016: an assessment of resource requirements'.

15. The development objective of the project is: To contribute to developing national capacities to achieve the 2015 national child labour reduction targets and the ILO global targets for ending the Worst Forms of Child Labour in Cambodia by 2016.

16. The project has four strategic areas of national policy, legislative and enforcement frameworks. Immediate objectives cover these four areas:

- o Immediate objective 1: By the end of the project, national frameworks to combat child labour are revised and aligned to achieve national and ILO targets to reduce child labour by 2015 and to end the WFCL by 2016.
- o Immediate objective 2: By the end of the project, knowledge on child labour of stakeholders and partners has been strengthened.
- o Immediate objective 3: By the end of the project, tripartite and other ILO/IPEC partners' capacities to address exploitive child labour improved.
- o Immediate objective 4: By the end of the project, effective and sustainable community-based pilot initiatives to combat exploitive/WFCL serve as replicable models for Cambodia.

17. As of April 2012, the Project has reported the following achievements:

Towards Achieving Immediate Objective 1:

- Further progress in national legislative framework revision -: The review of the legislative and enforcement frameworks was carried out in 2011 and the findings of the review were shared with national stakeholders.
- Detailed changes to be made to the current draft of the Labour Code have been provided. Due to the overall reform of the Labour Code currently going on in Cambodia moving slowly, these proposals have not been approved by the competent authority yet. This prevents the National Assembly from debating and approving the child labour recommendations necessary to put the Cambodian legislative framework fully in line with the ILO Convention Nos. 138 and 182.

Towards Achieving Immediate Objective 2:

- Upcoming integration of Statistical Information and Monitoring Programme on Child Labour (SIMPOC) national child labour survey results on the prevalence and nature of child labour in Cambodia.
- The project continued to use and disseminate the promotional materials produced during the observance of the World Day Against Child Labour (WDACL), June 2011 in the events organized by the project itself or by its partners during the reporting period.
- The established Committee on Awareness Raising and Advocacy Against Child Labour continued to work, coordinating and advising on the implementation of the Action Programme under the Prakas issued by Minister, Ministry of Information on 14 December 2010.

Towards Achieving Immediate Objective 3:

- Capacities of the key Ministries, particularly of the Ministry of Labour and Vocational Training and the Ministry of Education, Youth and Sports, Ministry of Information, Ministry of Interior, Fisheries Administration of the Ministry of Agriculture, Forestry and Fisheries, CAMFEBA and Trade Unions partners and CSNACL have been further enhanced through their participation in the events organized by the project and in implementation of the Action Programmes with technical and financial support provided by the project.
- Decentralization & De-concentration (D&D) policy: The project is currently pursuing two key opportunities in relation to the current D&D process of the RGC and the emerging instrumental role of the Commune Councils, towards ensuring sustainability in resource mobilization for addressing child labour at the grass root level.
- Supporting the implementation of the trade unions' efforts: The action programme with Trade Unions is largely on track. The development of a child labour training manual for the unions under it has been completed for the roll out of a Training of Trainers for trade union focal points, and their subsequent training programme roll out to trade union members. A Training Manual on child labour has been developed by Trade Union in Khmer language for use in the upcoming 12 trainings programme for trade unions leaders and members.
- On 01 December 2011, the employers' organisation CAMFEBA endorsed their Short-term Strategic Plan of Action for Combating Child Labour (2011-2013) for CAMFEBA. This plan of action will be used for the long-term development of the National Plan of Action for CAMFEBA for Eliminating the WFCL in the country.
- 8 Focal points of Employers were established in September 2011 in 8 provinces/municipalities of Bantey Meanchey, Battambang, Siem Reap, Phnom Penh, Kandal, Kampot and Kep where there are direct support interventions are implemented under the TBP Phase II project.
- Strengthening Civil Society Network Against Child Labour (CSNACL) efforts: Generally, the implementation of the CSNACL's Action Programme is on the right track. It has achieved and completed its development of training manual on CL for civil society groups; training groups have

been set up and training of trainers have been conducted. Institutional capacity of CSNACL was reviewed and gaps identified which was shared with key civil society groups through a national workshop of CSNACL from 7 target provinces.

- The number of Network members at the provincial level has been increased. Many local, international, and religious NGOs, Associations expressed their interest on the issues of child labour.

Towards Achieving Immediate Objective 4

- The project is now largely on track towards reaching the direct beneficiary targets for children withdrawn and prevented.
- In Phnom Penh, a Municipal Circular was drafted, endorsed and issued to prohibit child begging and scavenging; children working as flower sellers, working in the restaurant, karaoke, and construction sector.
- A by-law on Child Labour Elimination Fund was developed and endorsed by provincial authority in Kep.

Evaluation background

18. ILO considers evaluation as an integral part of the implementation of technical cooperation activities. Provisions are made in all projects in accordance with ILO evaluation policy and based on the nature of the project and the specific requirements agreed upon at the time of the project design and during the project as per established procedures. The Evaluation and Impact Assessment (EIA) section of ILO/IPEC provides an independent evaluation function for all ILO/IPEC projects.
19. Evaluations of ILO/IPEC projects have a strong focus on utility for the purpose of organisational learning and planning for all stakeholders and partners in the project. As per ILO/IPEC evaluation approach, a participatory consultation process on the nature and specific purposes of this evaluation is carried to determine the final Terms of Reference. The present Terms of Reference are based on inputs from key stakeholders received by ILO/IPEC-EIA in the consultation process and on standard issues to be covered by a project final evaluation.
20. The project has undergone a USDOL initiated external mid-term evaluation managed by ICF Macro in January 2011. The project document states that a final independent evaluation will be conducted at the end of the project implementation.
21. This Expanded Final Evaluation will encompass the project final evaluation based on these ToRs and a sub-study on 'on the enabling environment to reduce child labour: (i) in the salt sector of Kampot province and (ii) generally in Kep province'. The salt sector in Kampot and the whole of Kep province have been targeted by the project to achieve 'child labour-free' status. The sub-study on the enabling environment also links with another ongoing study on the prevalence of child labour in the same locations. These three activities are being implemented by separate teams but linked through the evaluation team leader (reflected in methodology and contents).
22. The study on the prevalence of child labour is assessing the current situation in the salt sector of Kampot province and overall in Kep province. The survey in Kampot is an establishment survey with random sampling, interviewing employers and workers, supported by interviews with commune leaders from all communes in the salt production area. The survey in Kep is a household survey with random sampling.
23. The study on the enabling environment to reduce child labour will also be carried out in Kampot and Kep provinces. The overall purpose of this study is to carry out an assessment of the changes in the

enabling environment over the period of the two NAP support projects. It is expected that this study will complement the child labour prevalence study by providing causal information for the results found and important lessons for future interventions.

24. To facilitate the effective integration of the sub-study findings in the expanded evaluation, the expanded evaluation team leader will provide technical support to the sub-study on the enabling environment and will incorporate the findings in the evaluation report.
25. The project is also currently carrying out a study identifying and documenting 'Good practices and Lessons Learned'. The overall purpose is to:
 - Identify the most effective and target group-friendly practices and operations that have a high impact;
 - Identify innovative measures or actions having a high potential for future replication;
 - Identify the lessons learnt which are important for consideration in future programmes so as to improve the impact;
 - Share project experiences with other stakeholders especially those working on the issue of child labour; and
 - Indicate possible future project approaches to reduce or eliminate child labour to be undertaken by GOs, Employers, Trade Union, NGOs, Civil Society and Communities etc.

II. Purpose and Scope

Purpose

26. The main purposes of the expanded final evaluation are to:
 - a. Assess the extent to which the project has achieved its stated objectives at outcome and impact level and to identify the supporting factors and constraints that have led to this achievement or lack of achievement;
 - b. Identify unintended changes, both positive and negative, in addition to the expected results
 - c. Identify the level of sustainability of the results of the project;
 - d. Identify unintended positive and negative changes at outcome and impact levels;
 - e. Determine the implementation effectiveness and efficiency of the Project;
 - f. Establish the relevance of the project implementation strategy;
 - g. Identify lessons learned and potential good practice, especially regarding models of interventions that can be applied further;
 - h. Provide recommendations to project stakeholders to support the completion or further development of initiatives supported by the project.

Scope

27. The evaluation will focus on the ILO/IPEC programme mentioned above, its achievements and its contribution to the overall national efforts to achieve the elimination of WFCL. The evaluation should focus on all the activities that have been implemented since the start of the projects to the moment of the field visits. (i.e. action programmes/projects)

28. The evaluation should look at the programme as a whole, including issues of initial project design, implementation, lessons learnt, replicability and recommendations for current and future programmes.
29. The contribution of ILO/IPEC to the national NAP process normally covers the promotion of an enabling environment, and the role of technical advisor or facilitator of the process of developing and implementing the NPA. In order to assess the degree to which this contribution has been made, the evaluation will have to take into account relevant factors and developments in the national process. The focus of the evaluation however will be on the ILO/IPEC project “Towards 2016: Contributing towards ending the WFCL in Cambodia”.
30. The evaluation should identify intended (i.e. planned) and unintended results in terms of outputs and outcomes. Some of the unintended changes could be as important as the ones planned. Therefore, the evaluation team should reflect on them for learning purposes.
31. The analytical scope should include identifying levels of achievement of objectives and explaining how and why they have been attained in such ways (and not in other alternative expected ways, if it would be the case). The purpose is to help the stakeholders to learn from the on-going experience.

III. Suggested Aspects to be Addressed

32. The evaluation should be carried out in adherence with the ILO Evaluation Framework and Strategy; the ILO Policy Guidelines for Results-Based Evaluations; the specific ILO/IPEC Guidelines and Notes; the UN Evaluation Group Norms and Standards, Ethical Guidelines, Code of Conduct; and the OECD/DAC Evaluation Quality Standard.
33. The evaluation will address the overall ILO evaluation concerns such as relevance, effectiveness, efficiency and sustainability to the extent possible as defined in the ILO Policy Guidelines for Results-Based Evaluation: Principles, Rationale, Planning and Managing for Evaluations, January 2012 http://www.ilo.org/eval/Evaluationguidance/WCMS_168289/lang--en/index.htm
34. Gender concerns should be addressed in accordance with ILO Guidance note 4: “Considering gender in the monitoring and evaluation of projects” http://www.ilo.org/eval/Evaluationguidance/WCMS_165986/lang--en/index.htm All data should be sex-disaggregated and different needs of women and men and of marginalized groups targeted by the programme should be considered throughout the evaluation process.
35. In line with results-based framework approach used by ILO/IPEC for identifying results at global, strategic and project level, the evaluation will focus on identifying and analysing results through addressing key questions related to the evaluation concerns and the achievement of the Immediate Objectives of the project using data from the logical framework indicators.
36. Annex I contains specific suggested aspects for the evaluation to address. Other aspects can be added as identified by the evaluation team in accordance with the given purpose and in consultation with ILO/IPEC Geneva's Evaluation and Impact Assessment section (EIA). It is not expected that the evaluation address all of the questions detailed in the Annex; however the evaluation must address the general areas of focus. The evaluation instrument (summarised in the inception report)

should identify the general areas of focus listed here as well as other priority aspects to be addressed in the evaluation.

37. The main categories that need to be addressed are the following:

- Design
- Achievements (Implementation and Effectiveness) of Objectives
- Relevance of the project
- Sustainability
- Special Aspects to be Addressed

IV. Expected Outputs of the Evaluation

38. The expected outputs to be delivered by the evaluation team are:

- A desk review of appropriate material;
- Review of the methodology for the sub-study on the ‘enabling environment to reduce child labour’ and ongoing support to the sub-study including feedback and support to the preparation of the report. The final report from the sub-study will be prepared by the sub-study consultant separately from the report on the final expanded evaluation;
- Preparation of an inception report centred on the evaluation instrument, reflecting the combination of tools and detailed instruments needed to address the range of selected aspects. The instrument needs to make provision for the triangulation of data where possible;
- Interviews and consultations with relevant stakeholders including field visits to the project locations in a selection of provinces;
- Stakeholders workshop (for stakeholders from all provinces) at one of the provincial centres focussing on provincial-level achievements and constraints, facilitated by the evaluation team leader
- Stakeholders’ workshop at the national level (for stakeholders at the national level and some representation from the provinces), reviewing issues from the provincial level but with a greater focus on national level achievements and constraints, facilitated by the evaluation team leader;
- Debrief with key stakeholders following the stakeholders’ workshop if requested
- Draft evaluation report. The evaluation report should include and reflect on findings from the sub-study on the enabling environment, the field visits and the stakeholder workshops proceedings including:
 - ✓ Executive Summary with key findings, conclusions and recommendations
 - ✓ Clearly identified findings
 - ✓ A table presenting the key results (i.e. figures and qualitative results) achieved per objective (expected and unexpected)
 - ✓ Clearly identified conclusions and recommendations (identifying which stakeholders are responsible)
 - ✓ Lessons learnt
 - ✓ Potential good practices
 - ✓ Appropriate Annexes including present TORs
- Final evaluation report incorporating feedback from stakeholders.
- Notes with reflections on the process of the evaluation identifying lessons learnt and suggestions for future ILO/IPEC evaluations

39. The total length of the report should be a maximum of 35 pages for the main report, excluding annexes; additional annexes can provide background and details on specific components of the project evaluated. The report should be sent as one complete document and the file size should not exceed 3 megabytes. Photos, if appropriate to be included, should be inserted using lower resolution to keep overall file size low.
40. All drafts and final outputs, including supporting documents, analytical reports and raw data should be provided both in paper copy and in electronic version compatible for Word for Windows. Ownership of data from the evaluation rests jointly with ILO/IPEC and the consultants. The copyright of the evaluation report will rest exclusively with the ILO. Use of the data for publication and other presentations can only be made with the written agreement of ILO/IPEC. Key stakeholders can make appropriate use of the evaluation report in line with the original purpose and with appropriate acknowledgement.
41. The draft final report will be circulated to key stakeholders (those participants present at stakeholder evaluation workshop will be considered key stakeholders), including project staff for their review. Comments from stakeholders will be consolidated by the Evaluation and Impact Assessment section (EIA) of ILO/IPEC Geneva and provided to the evaluation team leader. In preparing the final report the team leader should consider these comments, incorporate as appropriate, and provide a brief note explaining why any comments might not have been incorporated.

V. Evaluation Methodology

42. In ILO/IPEC evaluations of its projects are carried out to enhance organisational learning. As per IPEC procedures, a participatory consultation process on the nature and specific purposes of this evaluation was carried out three months prior to the scheduled date of the evaluation. Inputs were received from key stakeholders including constituents and implementing agencies. The present Terms of Reference is based on the outcome of this process and inputs received in the course of the consultative process.
43. The following is the proposed evaluation methodology. While the evaluation team can propose changes in the methodology, any such changes should be discussed with and approved by EIA and the Project, provided that the research and analysis suggest changes and provided that the indicated range of questions is addressed, the purpose maintained and the expected outputs produced at the required quality.
44. The evaluation will be carried out using a desk review of appropriate materials, including the project documents, progress reports, outputs of the programme and the projects (action programmes), results of any internal planning process and relevant materials from secondary sources. At the end of the desk review period, it is expected that the evaluation consultant will prepare a brief document indicating the methodological approach to the evaluation in the form of the evaluation instrument, to be discussed and approved by EIA.
45. The evaluation team leader will be asked to include in the inception report the evaluation instruments that will be used for documenting and analysing the achievements of the project and the contributions of the sub-projects (Action Programmes) to the programme.

46. A sub-study on the ‘enabling environment to reduce child labour’ will be carried out in Kampot and Kep provinces. That sub-study has separate (although linked) ToRs and is designed to specifically contribute to the overall expanded final evaluation. The inception report will incorporate that sub-study within its framework, identifying how the findings will contribute to the expanded final evaluation. The first report from the sub-study will be a ‘bullet point’ style report which will be submitted prior to the field mission of the expanded final evaluation.
47. The evaluation team leader will interview the donor representatives and ILO/IPEC HQ and regional backstopping officials through conference calls or face-to-face interviews early in the evaluation process, preferably during the desk review phase.
48. The evaluation team will undertake field visits to the project. The evaluators will conduct interviews and focussed group discussions (FGDs) with project partners and implementing agencies, direct beneficiaries (i.e. children) and teachers and facilitate two stakeholder workshops towards the end of the field visits.
49. The selection of the field visits locations should be based on criteria to be defined by the evaluation team. Some criteria to consider include:
 - Locations with successful and unsuccessful results from the perception of key stakeholders. The rationale is that extreme cases, at some extent, are more helpful than averages for understanding how process worked and results have been obtained;
 - Locations that have been identified as providing particular good practices or bringing out particular key issues as identified by the desk review and initial discussions;
 - Representation of the main strategies or interventions used (model sustainability province, trafficking and migration province, a new phase II province, an old phase I continuation province. Also sector-based approach and area-based approach);
 - Areas known to have high prevalence of child labour;
 - Representation of the main types (sectors) of child labour being addressed
 - Locations close to main roads and also locations that are more remote.
50. Two stakeholder workshops will be held. One at a provincial centre will focus on provincial-level achievements and constraints (in all provinces) and the other held in Phnom Penh will focus on national level achievements and constraints.
51. The stakeholder workshops will be attended by ILO/IPEC staff and key stakeholders (i.e. partners), including the donor as appropriate. These will be an opportunity for the evaluation team to gather further data, present the preliminary findings for verification and discussion, present recommendations and obtain feedback. They will take place towards the end of the fieldwork.
52. The evaluation team leader will be responsible for organizing the methodology of the workshops. The identification of the number of participants of the workshops and logistics will be the responsibility of the project team in consultation with the evaluation team leader.
53. The team leader will be responsible for drafting and finalizing the evaluation report. The findings of the evaluation team will incorporate the feedback from the stakeholder workshops and the results from the sub-study on the enabling environment to reduce child labour. The draft report will be circulated to stakeholders in English for their feedback and comments. A Khmer translation will be prepared and circulated shortly afterwards in order to enable all stakeholders to effectively participate in the consultation process. The team leader will further be responsible for finalizing the report incorporating any comments from stakeholders as appropriate.

54. The evaluation will be carried out with the technical support of the ILO/IPEC-EIA section and with the logistical support of the programme office in Phnom Penh. EIA will be responsible for consolidating the comments of stakeholders and submitting it to the team leader.
55. It is expected that the evaluation team will work to the highest evaluation standards and codes of conduct and follow the UN evaluation standards and norms.

Link between the evaluation and the sub-study

56. The team leader will provide technical support to the consultant in charge of the sub-study and will provide feedback on the draft report.
57. The key findings from the sub-study will be presented in a ‘bullet point’ style report to the team leader prior to the evaluation mission to Cambodia. The sub-study consultant will also participate in the stakeholders’ workshops. He/She may be required to make a presentation of the findings.
58. The team leader will incorporate the findings and conclusions of the sub-study in the evaluation report.

The team responsibilities and profile

59. The evaluation will be carried out by an international evaluation team leader and an evaluation team member (national consultant). The evaluation team leader is responsible for drafting and finalizing the evaluation report. The evaluation team member will support the team leader in preparing the field visit, during the field visit and in drafting the report. The evaluation team leader will have the final responsibility during the evaluation process for the outcomes of the evaluation, including the quality of the report and compliance with deadlines.
60. The background of the evaluation team leader and the evaluation team member should include:

Team leader (International consultant):

Responsibilities	Profile
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Desk review of programme documents • Development of the evaluation instrument • Briefing with ILO/IPEC/EIA • Telephone interviews with ILO/IPEC HQ desk officer, donor • Technical guidance to national consultant • Undertake field visits in project area • Facilitate stakeholders workshops • Draft evaluation report • Finalise evaluation report 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • <u>Not have been involved in the project.</u> • Relevant background in social and/or economic development. • Experience in the design, management and evaluation of development projects, in particular with policy level work, institutional building and local development projects. • Experience in evaluations in the UN system or other international context as team leader • Relevant sub-regional experience • Relevant country experience highly preferred • Experience in the area of children’s and child labour issues and rights-based approaches in a normative framework and operational dimension are highly appreciated. • Experience at policy level and in the area of education and legal issues would also be appreciated. • Experience in the UN system or similar international development experience including preferably international and national development frameworks in particular PRSP and UNDAF. • Fluency in English is essential • Experience facilitating workshops for evaluation findings.

National consultant

Responsibilities	Profile
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Desk review of programme documents • Contribute to the development of the evaluation instrument • Organize interviews of stakeholders and field visits in the country • Provide translation and interpretation as required • Co-Facilitate stakeholder workshop (under the team leader leadership) • Contribute to the evaluation report through systematizing data collected and providing analytical inputs • Others as required by the team leader 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Relevant background in country social and/or economic development. • Experience in the design, management and evaluation of development projects, in particular with policy level work, institutional building and local development projects. • Relevant country experience, preferably prior working experience in child labour. • Experience in the area of children's and child labour issues and rights-based approaches in a normative framework are highly appreciated. • Experience facilitating workshops for evaluation findings. • Fluency in English (and other national relevant language) essential • Knowledge of local languages in the field visit areas an asset • Experience in the UN system or similar international development experience desirable.

Evaluation Timetable and Schedule

61. The total duration of the evaluation process including submission of the final report should be within two months from the end of the field mission.

62. The timetable is as follows:

Phase	Responsible Person	Tasks	No of days	
			TL	NC
I	Evaluation team leader	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Support to 'enabling environment' sub-study consultant 	5	0
II	Evaluation team leader	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Briefing with ILO/IPEC ○ Desk Review of programme related documents ○ Telephone briefing with IPEC EIA, donor, IPEC HQ and ILO regional ○ Submission of inception report 	5	3
III	Evaluation team with logistical support by project	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ In-country for consultations with programme staff ○ Consultations with programme staff /management ○ Interviews with programme staff and partners ○ Field visits ○ Consultations with girls and boys, parents and other beneficiaries ○ Consultations with other relevant stakeholders ○ Support to 'enabling environment' sub-study consultant ○ Workshops with key stakeholders ○ Sharing of preliminary findings 	17	15

IV	Evaluation team leader	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Draft report based on consultations from field visits and desk review, and workshop ○ Debriefing 	5	2
V	EIA	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Quality check and initial review by EIA ○ Circulate draft report to key stakeholders ○ Translation of draft report into Khmer by project ○ Consolidate comments of stakeholders and send to team leader 	0	0
VI	Evaluation team leader	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Finalize the report including explanations on why comments were not included 	2	0
TOTAL			34	20

TL: Team leader NC: National consultant

63. Summary schedule

Phase	Duration	Dates
I	5 days	27 August – 2 November
II	5 days	24 – 28 September
III	15 days	8 – 26 October
IV	5 day	28 October - 2 November
V	4 weeks¹	5 November – 30 November
VI	2 days	3 – 10 December

¹ Additional week added for translation of draft report into Khmer

The summary schedule for the sub-study on the enabling environment to reduce child labour is (see separate ToRs for details):

Phase	Duration	Dates
Desk review and outline of the Methodological plan	4 days	8 – 11 September
Feedback on the methodological plan		12 – 14 September
Field work	11 days	17 – 28 September
Preparation of ‘bullet point’ report and draft report	5 days	2 - 6 October
Review by EIA and final evaluation team leader		8 – 20 October
Presentation in evaluation workshops and final report preparation	3 days	By 26th October
Total	23 days	

Sources of Information and Consultations/Meetings

64. Sources of Information

The following sources should be consulted:

Available at HQ and to be supplied by EIA	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• Project document• EIA, ILO and UNEG guidelines
Available in project office and to be supplied by project management	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• Technical progress reports/status reports• Baseline reports and studies• Project monitoring plan• Technical and financial reports of partner agencies• Other studies and research undertaken• Action Programme Summary Outlines• Project files• National Action Plans• Study on good practices and lessons learned• Surveys on CL in Kampot and Kep 2012

65. Consultations/meetings will be held with:

- Project management and staff
- ILO/HQ and regional backstopping officials
- Implementing partner agencies
- Child labour programs in the country
- Social partners Employers' and Workers' groups
- NGO representatives
- Government stakeholders (e.g. representatives from Department of Labour, Social Development etc.)
- Government representatives, legal authorities etc. as identified by evaluation team
- Policy makers
- Direct beneficiaries, i.e. boys and girls (taking ethical consideration into account.)
- Parents of boys and girls
- Teachers
- Community members as identified by the project management and evaluation team leader
- Child labour monitors
- USDOL (by telephone)
- US Embassy staff

Final Report Submission Procedure

66. For independent evaluations, the following procedure is used:

The evaluator will submit a draft report to ILO/IPEC EIA in Geneva

IPEC EIA will forward a copy to key stakeholders for comments on factual issues and for clarifications

IPEC EIA will consolidate the comments and send these to the evaluator by date agreed between EIA and the evaluator or as soon as the comments are received from stakeholders.

The final report is submitted to ILO/IPEC EIA who will then officially forward it to stakeholders, including the donor.

VI. Resources and Management

Resources

67. The resources required for this evaluation are:

For the evaluation team leader:

- Fees for an international consultant for 34 work days
- Fees for local DSA in project locations
- Travel from consultant's home residence to Phnom Penh in line with ILO regulations and rules

For the national consultant:

- Fees for 20 days
- Fees for local DSA in project location

For the evaluation exercise as a whole:

- Local travel in-country supported by the project
- Stakeholder workshops expenditures
- Translation costs for the ToRs and draft report

A detailed budget is available separately.

Management

68. The evaluation team will report to ILO/IPEC/EIA in headquarters and should discuss any technical and methodological matters with EIA, should issues arise. IPEC project officials and the ILO Office in Phnom Penh will provide administrative and logistical support during the evaluation mission.

ANNEX I: Suggested Aspects to Address

Design

- Determine the validity of the project design, in particular whether it assisted or hindered the achievement of the project goals as set out in the Project Document.
- Assess whether the project design was logical and coherent:
 - Were the objectives of the project clear, realistic and likely to be achieved within the established time schedule and with the allocated resources (including human resources)?
 - Were the linkages between inputs, activities, outputs and objectives clear and logical?
 - Were the different components of the project (i.e. capacity building, policy and legislation, awareness raising and social mobilization, direct action to beneficiaries, etc.) clearly and realistically complementing each other?
 - How relevant are programme indicators and means of verification? Please assess the usefulness of the indicators for monitoring and measuring outcomes.
 - Has the time frame for project implementation and the sequencing of project activities been logical and realistic?
 - Were the expectations of the roles, capacity and commitment of stakeholders realistic and likely to be achieved?
- Analyse whether available information on the socio-economic, cultural and political situation of Cambodia was taken into consideration at the time of the design and whether it was reflected in the design of the project.
- To what extent have key external factors been identified and assumptions formulated in the Project document? Have the identified assumptions on which the project was based, proven to be true?
- Assess whether the problems and needs were adequately analysed and determine whether the needs, constraints, resources and access to project services of the different beneficiaries were clearly identified taking gender issues into concern.
- Does the design of the project take into account the existing institutional arrangements, roles, capacity and commitment of stakeholders (i.e. education, livelihoods, etc.)? Does it fit into existing mainstreaming activities that would impact on child labour?
- How have gender issues been taken into account in the project design in its components and outcomes?
- Has the strategy for sustainability of project results been defined clearly at the design stage of the project?
- Does the project design fit within and complement existing initiatives by other organizations to combat child labour?

Achievements (Implementation and Effectiveness) of Objectives

- Examine the preparatory outputs of the delivery process in terms of timeliness and identifying the appropriate resources/persons to implement the process.
- Assess whether the project has achieved its immediate objectives.
- Assess the role of project management at the local, project and headquarters level in the achievement of the project objectives
- Examine delivery of programme outputs in terms of quality and quantity; have they been delivered in a timely manner?

- How has the project responded to positive and negative factors (both foreseen and unforeseen) that arose throughout the implementation process? Has the project team been able to adapt the implementation process in order to overcome these obstacles without hindering the effectiveness of the project?
- Assess the selection of the implementing agencies for the APs in relation to the project strategy.
- Assess the design and implementation of the APs.
- Assess whether ILO/IPEC has established clear communication mechanisms and performance management of these implementing partners and activities.
- How effective were the APs, research projects, and policy projects, and how are they contributing to the project meeting its immediate objectives?
- Assess the programme monitoring system including the project monitoring plan (PMP), work plans, processes or systems (i.e. data collecting and processing, analysis and reporting)
- Assess the effectiveness of the programme i.e. compare the allocated resources with results obtained. In general, did the results obtained justify the costs incurred?
- Review the value of support received from programme partner organizations and relevant ILO units (including ILO Geneva, Sub regional and Regional Office).
- Assess the coordination and cooperation with other projects with complementary objectives including the USDOL-funded Global Agriculture Project

Direct Targeted Action

- Do the ILO/IPEC programme and project partners understand the definitions and their use (i.e. withdrawal and prevented) and do the partners have similar understanding of the terminology used? Please assess whether the programme is accurately able to report on direct beneficiaries based on partners' understanding of the definitions/terminology.
- Assess the effectiveness of action programmes and their contribution to the immediate objectives of the programme. Has the capacity of community level agencies and organizations been strengthened to plan, initiate, implement and evaluate actions to prevent and eliminate child labour? Has the entire target population been reached? Were the expected outputs delivered in a timely manner, with the appropriate quantity and quality?
- Assess the effectiveness of the project's beneficiary identification and targeting strategies and mechanisms. Assess the gender dimensions of these strategies.
- Assess the effectiveness of the direct action interventions including whether the length and quality of the services provided are appropriate. Assess if the inputs and services provided were enough to keep children regularly attending school and out of work.
- How effective were the strategies implemented for child labour monitoring?
- Assess the relevance and effectiveness of the project's household livelihood component.
- Assess the effectiveness of the strategies used for withdrawing or preventing children including any different strategies used for different sectors.
- Review and analyse the comprehensive approach that the project provides at direct action level.

Enabling environment (Capacity Building)

- Assess the progress in RGC drafting the labour code and other child labour ministerial regulations and identify the project's role in this.

- Assess the project's research on child labour policy and enforcement and how this has worked into supporting action and change in these areas.
- How has the capacity of the implementing agencies and other relevant partners (at national and local levels), to develop effective action against child labour, been enhanced as a result of programme activities?
- Assess the status of the CLMS and how effective it is. Are the initiatives on child labour monitoring likely to be sustainable? What is the capacity and commitment to maintain and expand it?
- Assess the impact of the project to build the capacity of the Commune Councils. For example, how has the capacity of the councils been built to address child labour and to support child labour monitoring?
- Examine the role of the project in building any networks that have been established between organizations and government agencies working to address child labour on the national, provincial and local levels.
- How effectively has the programme leveraged resources (e.g., by collaborating with non-ILO/IPEC initiatives and other programmes launched in support of the NPA-WFCL processes thus far)?
- Assess the project efforts to coordinate and collaborate with other child-focused interventions supported by other organizations in the country with particular emphasis on those with work in child labour elimination.
- How successful has the programme been in mainstreaming the issue of child labour into ongoing development efforts in areas such as education, social protection, cash transfer programmes, alternative employment promotion and poverty reduction (i.e. government ownership and implementation of the NPA)? As far as possible identify the project's contribution to these achievements.
- Assess progress in RGC adopting the NPA II and identify the project's role in this.
- How relevant and effective were the studies commissioned by the programme in terms of affecting the national debates on child labour?
- Examine how the ILO/IPEC project interacted and possibly influenced national level policies, debates and institutions working on child labour.
- Assess the extent to which the ILO/IPEC programme of support has been able to mobilize resources, policies, programmes, partners and activities to be part of the NPA.

Relevance of the Project

- Examine whether the programme responded to the real needs of the beneficiaries and stakeholders, including specific target groups and sub-national areas
- Assess whether the problems and needs that gave rise to the programme still exists or have changed.
- Did the strategy address the different needs and roles, constraints, access to resources of the target groups, with specific reference to the strategy of mainstreaming and thus the relevant partners, especially in government?
- Assess the validity of the programme approach and strategies and its potential to be replicated and scaled-up.

- Assess the appropriateness of the sectors/target groups and locations chosen to develop the projects based on the finding of baseline surveys.
- How did the strategy used in this project fit in with the NPA, national education and anti-poverty efforts, and interventions carried out by other organizations? Did the programme remain consistent with and supportive of the NPA?
- Has the project identified any other constraints or opportunities that need to be accommodated in the design in order to increase the impact and relevance of the project?

Sustainability

- Assess the design of the sustainability strategy, and assess the progress of the strategy.
- Assess how the strategy for the sustainability of the project outcomes has been affected by the pace of project implementation.
- Determine the potential to sustain the gains of the project beyond its life and what measures are needed to ensure this.
- Assess what contributions the programme has made in strengthening the capacity and knowledge of national stakeholders and to encourage ownership of the programme to partners.
- Examine whether prioritised target group and gender aspects are taken into consideration regarding the sustainability of the programme results and assess whether actions have been taken to sensitize national and local institutions and target groups on these issues.
- Assess programme success in leveraging resources for ongoing and continuing efforts to prevent and eliminate child labour in the context of the NPA. Analyse the level of private sector / employers' organizations support to the NPA, paying specific attention to how these groups participate in programme activities.
- Identify potential good practices and models of intervention that could inform future child labour elimination projects, especially those that the national partners could incorporate into national policy and implementation.

Specific Aspects to be addressed:

- How has the project addressed the recommendations of the midterm evaluation? What has been the impact and if recommendations were not followed what were the reasons?
- Assess the process for documenting and disseminating pilot projects/models of intervention: scale-up, lessons, etc.
- Based on what has been observed by the evaluation, identify key areas where further support is required in relation to the achievement of the 'twin goals' for the reduction of child labour by 2015 and elimination of WFCL by 2016.
- Review the impact at the commune level of child labour issues being mainstreamed in government policies and programmes. What are the opportunities for furthering the work with commune councils?
- Assess how far the project has been able to mobilize the tripartite constituents (government, workers and employers) and other actors (civil society, UN, other development agencies) in the country in action against child labour and in contributing towards achieving the project's goals and objectives.
- Assess the relative advantages and disadvantages of a sector-based versus area-based approach to the elimination of WFCL based on the experience of the project.