



ILO's FAIRWAY Programme – Independent Final Evaluation

QUICK FACTS

Countries: Arab States: Bahrain, Jordan, Kuwait, Lebanon,

Africa: Ethiopia, Kenya, Morocco, Nigeria, Uganda

Evaluation date: 15 March 2024

Evaluation type: Project

Evaluation timing: Final

Administrative Office: MIGRANT

Technical Office: MIGRANT

Evaluation manager: Elena Dedova

Evaluation consultant(s): Svetlana Bronyuk (team leader, international consultant), Ahmed Tamimi (regional consultant in Arab states), Walter Atito (regional consultant in Africa), Ayalew Abebe (national consultant in Ethiopia)

DC Symbol: GLO/19/06/CHE

Donor(s) & budget: Swiss Agency for Development and Cooperation (SDC); USD 10,972,250.00

Key Words: Labour migration; international migration; freedom of movement; domestic work; fair recruitment; decent work



BACKGROUND & CONTEXT

Summary of the project purpose, logic and structure

The FAIRWAY Program is a four-year inter-regional development cooperation project funded by the Swiss Agency for Development and Cooperation (SDC) and implemented by the International Labour Organization (ILO) from December 2019 to March 2024. The programme aims to improve conditions of labour migration across migration pathways from Africa to Arab States and better protect all migrant workers in vulnerable situations within the Arab States region, thereby enabling migrant workers to contribute more fully to sustainable development in both countries of origin and destination. Expected programme outcomes: (1) Private sector, employers’ and workers’ organizations engaged for decent work for migrant workers; (2) Gender-responsive policy frameworks are developed or strengthened for fair recruitment and decent work and regulatory compliance; (3) Discriminatory attitudes towards women and men migrant workers are diminished; and (4) Migrant workers have improved access to information and support services throughout the migration cycle.

Purpose, scope and clients of the evaluation

The purpose of this final evaluation is to ensure accountability and learning. The final evaluation covered all the activities and products related to the FAIRWAY Programme in Africa and Arab States at the country and regional level, as well as knowledge inter- and intra-regional linkages, in the period of December 2019 to March 2024. The findings of the evaluations and its recommendations will be used by the ILO and its stakeholders to enhance organizational learning.

Methodology of the evaluation

The evaluation consultants complied with the evaluation rules and standards of the United Nations System, as well as the Evaluation Quality Standards and Criteria of OECD/DAC and the United Nations Evaluation Group standards. To strengthen the credibility and usefulness of evaluation results, the evaluators used both primary and secondary data sources.

Limitations of the evaluation

The following major limitations and challenges were observed during the evaluation process: 1) Assessment of the MRCs established in Africa was limited – one Migrant Resource Center (MRC) in Kenya was visited; MRC established in Uganda was not visited; 2) Assessment of the support provided by Ethiopian consulates was limited to desk review and interview with



representatives of General Consulate of Ethiopia in Lebanon, the consulate and shelters were not visited

MAIN FINDINGS & CONCLUSIONS

Relevance: Strategic relevance of the FAIRWAY programme has been rated as high by all key stakeholders and constituents who confirmed great importance of the programme in light of its inter-regional set up and strong commitment to the rights-based approach. By assisting the countries of origin (CoO) to develop national policies aimed at improved conditions for migrant men and women in the countries of destination (CoD) in the Arab states the FAIRWAY programme is relevant to the needs of migrant men and women and higher national development goals of the African states seeking prosperity of their citizens. In the CoD in the Arab states the FAIRWAY programme is relevant to the needs of countries in the region which seek increasing participation of women in the labour force. Skilled domestic workers currently bridge the gap of lack of investment to the care economy in the Arab states and fill the gap in labour shortage in the national labour markets.

Coherence: This evaluation observed strong interlinkages between the FAIRWAY programme and other development actors at the global, inter-regional, regional, sub-regional and country levels. The FAIRWAY results framework is coherent with strategic programme frameworks on migration of the Swiss Confederation. The FAIRWAY put in place coordination mechanisms between other ILO programmes on migration. The FAIRWAY contributes to SDG targets 8.8, 8.7 and SDG 10.7 to a high extent.

Effectiveness: The FAIRWAY Programme achieved expected results (outputs) at the multi-regional, inter-regional, regional, sub-regional and country level to a high extent. Planned outputs at the inter-regional level were delivered as they were initially planned. At the regional level the FAIRWAY programme exceeded targets planned in the CoO in Africa and in CoD in the region of Arab states. At the country level, the FAIRWAY programme met all targets planned in the CoD and the CoO at the rate of at least 75%. The performance of the countries towards achievement of results at the policy, institutional and individual level is assessed at the medium extent in the CoD and at the high extent in the CoO.

Efficiency of resource use: Overall implementation of the FAIRWAY activities proved to be efficient without significant delays. At the



end of its implementation period the expenditures rate was close to 100%. The representation of the Chief Technical Advisors (CTAs) in both of the regions was efficient but equal distribution of power led to the lack of authorized power to reinforce the higher, inter-regional component of the programme. The existing reporting lines are conducive to ensure coordinated delivery of FAIRWAY in both regions. The established MRCs operated by government in Kenya provided wide range of services to migrant men and women reaching high number of persons – more than two thousand (2,000).

Impact: FAIRWAY Programme better positioned ILO in target countries, regionally and inter-regionally. The CoO in Africa have been empowered and united in bargaining better conditions for their workers in Arab states. In the CoD, FAIRWAY well positioned the ILO across the Arab states on migration and development issues. OSH practices and legislation were improved in Kuwait and Jordan to protect migrant workers (predominantly men) working in construction sector. The joint initiative on the policy brief on absconding based on the research conducted in 6 GCC countries resulted in the interest of Arab states to conduct policy reforms. Direct impact on lives of migrant men and women was observed in Lebanon, Kingdom of Saudi Arabia, Ethiopia and Kenya. In Nigeria, FAIRWAY support achieved impact level result contributing to gender equality. In Kuwait, FAIRWAY support contributed to policy level results contributing to non-discrimination of migrant workers.

Sustainability: The domains on fair recruitment, decent work and prevention of forced labour will remain priorities for the governments in the CoO in Africa, namely in Nigeria, Kenya and Morocco. In the countries of destination, in the Arab states, the most notable sustainability results at the policy and institutional level to be supported by government in relation to protection of migrant men and women was observed in Kuwait. The governments of Bahrain and Jordan demonstrated commitment on strengthening OSH protection of their workers including migrant workers. The most persistent challenges of human rights protection of migrant domestic workers remain in Lebanon. Though the FAIRWAY cooperated with the Ministry of Labour on the revision of the Standard Unified Contract (SUC) for the employment of migrant domestic workers as an important step on dismantling the kafala

system, the Shura Council suspended the implementation of the SUC on the ground.

LESSONS LEARNED AND EMERGING GOOD PRACTICES

Lessons learned

Lessons learnt:

Lesson learned 1. The programme of such scale and ambition should have provisioned gender analysis and gender strategy at the stage of programme inception.

Lesson learned 2. The support of M&E consultant of high qualification was important to ensure coherent monitoring and reporting on programme results across country, regional and inter-regional levels.

Lesson learned 3. Provision of two CTAs in both regions though simplifies delivery of results at the regional level but doesn't allow for managing results at the inter-regional level.

Lesson learned 4. Joint research on Wage Protection Systems in the GCC facilitated by the GCC bureau and collaboration of the UN agencies allowed strengthening international appeal on kafala reforms in the Arab states region.

Emerging good practices

Emerging good practices:

Good practice 1. The Domestic Workers Union was established, equipped and capacitated to provide services to migrant workers. Source: Bahrain.

Good practice 2. The fellowship on journalism between Uganda and Jordan universities resulted in joint collaboration between Jordanian and Ugandan youth to cover stories of migrant men and women. Source: Jordan

Good practice 3. The cooperation between the trade unions of Kenya and Lebanon resulted in strengthened approach to protect Kenyan migrant domestic workers in Lebanon. Source: Kenya – Lebanon

Good practice 4. The innovative initiative “Women’s Circles” approbated in Kuwait increased understanding of the behavior of female employers of domestic workers. Source: Kuwait

Good practice 5. The support of women-led community-based organizations allowed human-rights protection of the most

	<p>vulnerable migrant women and children – victims of forced labour, detained women, including women with children. Source: Lebanon</p> <p>Good practice 6. Six MRCs were established at the government premises (National Employment Authorities) in Kenya to provide services to migrant men and women at the MRCs across various locations via face-to-face mode and a Toll-free Hot line. This increased regional coverage of the services available to potential migrant men and women. Source: Kenya</p> <p>Good practice 7. The support to the Consulates of Ethiopia in KSA and Lebanon proved to be efficient which resulted in return of 37,800 (45% women) Ethiopian migrant workers to their country of origin during the COVID-19 pandemic. Source: Ethiopia</p> <p>Good practice 8. The training provided by the ITC-ILO on the design and bargaining BLA to the Ugandan stakeholders resulted in application of knowledge during the negotiation process on the BLA between Uganda and KSA. The signed BLA included a Joint Technical Committee to monitor implementation of the BLA regarding the human and labour rights of Ugandan migrant workers. Source: Uganda</p> <p>Good practice 9. The technical assistance provided by the FAIRWAY programme resulted in the design and adoption of a Gender Mainstreaming Strategy in Nigeria (GMS). Source: Nigeria</p> <p>Good practice 10. FAIRWAY supported Building Responsibly – a global industry group in construction - to strengthen knowledge of companies on practical ways to ensure decent work for migrant construction workers in the Arab States (especially GCC). Source: Global, ILO ROAS</p>
<p>Main recommendations and follow-up</p>	<p><i>Main recommendations and follow up:</i></p> <ol style="list-style-type: none">1. To ILO governing body. To establish ILO country offices in the countries of the GCC region with highest number of migrant men and women, e.g., Kingdom of Saudi Arabia (KSA) and United Arab Emirates (EAU) to develop cooperation with policy makers on kafala reforms in line with international labour standards (ILS).2. To MIGRANT. To support the countries of origin and countries of destination on joint monitoring of the signed BLAs through the technical support and participation in the monitoring missions.3. To ROAS. To develop a plan of actions with other UN agencies to assist the Arab states countries on kafala reforms.



4. To HQ, ROAS and ROAF. To initiate a high-level tripartite plus forum on Africa and Arab states migration in joint collaboration with the AUC, GCC and the League of Arab states to invigorate discussions on kafala reforms, joint monitoring of the BLAs and human rights protection of migrant men and women.

5. To FAIRWAY team in ROAS. To align the activities on OSH in construction with the initiatives and projects of the ILO Flagship programme Safety + Health for All and the Vision Zero Fund focused on OSH in construction in favor of other sectors, e.g., agriculture, hospitality, transportation.

6. To FAIRWAY team in ROAS. To develop robust gender equality strategy to address the needs of male migrant workers, including of male domestic workers in Saudi Arabia, and the needs of women domestic workers faced in the Arab States.

7. To FAIRWAY Team in Africa. To ensure access to the MRC services to the various groups of population by offering face-to-face and online services, access to the persons with disabilities and gender-sensitive services for young men and women.

8. To FAIRWAY Team in Africa. To build on achieved results of enhanced cooperation between the trade unions, migrant workers (men and women), MRCs and Private Recruitment Agencies by motivating them to contribute to the development and usage of the Migrant Recruitment Advisor of the International Trade Union Confederation (ITUC) to identify unethical recruitment practices on the part of PRA and support migrant men and women in filing complaints and protecting their rights.

9. To MIGRANT, HQ. To foster inter-regional component of the FAIRWAY programme by establishing a specific position of a CTA or a coordinator in charge of inter-regional activities.

10. To ROAS and ROAF. To strengthen skills component of the FAIRWAY programme through uplifting skills of migrant workers (men and women) in domestic work in Africa and strengthened work on recognition of skills of domestic workers in the Arab states

11. To ROAS. To address the needs of the Arab states in increasing participation of women in national labour force through encouraging the states to increase investments into national care economy and creating favorable working conditions for women with children of pre-school age.

