

An abstract graphic featuring three concentric blue circles of varying sizes. Two circles are positioned in the upper right quadrant, and a larger one is in the lower right quadrant. Thin blue lines extend from the top left towards the circles, creating a sense of perspective or focus.

Internal Evaluation “Strengthening Employers’ Organizations for Effective Social Dialogue”

Karstein Haarberg

08/06/2013

Content

Acronyms	3
Executive Summary	4
1. Background and Project Description	7
1.1 The Internal Evaluation	7
2. Purpose	8
3. Methodology	8
4. Theory of Change.....	9
5. The Project	9
5.1 Moldova	9
5.1.1 Background	9
5.1.2 Objectives	10
5.2 Nepal.....	11
5.2.1 Background	11
5.2.2 Development Objective.....	11
5.3 Cambodia	12
5.3.1 Background	12
5.3.2 Objectives	12
6. Relevance	13
7. Validity of design	15
7.1 Operational aspects	15
8. Project effectiveness.....	17
8.1 Achievements	17
8.1.1 Cambodia.....	17
8.1.2 Moldova.....	19
8.1.3 Nepal	20
8.1.4 Achievements summary	21
8.2 Factors behind the achievements.....	22
8.3 Challenges	23
8.3.1 Project challenges	23
General challenges and constraints.....	24
9. Efficiency	25

Evaluation of ILO Project " Strengthening Employers' Organizations for Effective Social Dialogue "

10.	Management effectiveness	25
11.	Conclusions	26
11.1	Main findings	26
12.	Recommendations	27
13.	Lessons learned and good practices	27
	Annex 1: Terms of Reference	29
	Annex 2: Field visit programmes with list of people meet	38
	Moldova	38
	Cambodia	40
	Nepal	44
	Annex 3: List of documents reviewed	46
	Moldova	46
	Cambodia	46
	Nepal	47

Acronyms

ACT/EMP	Bureau for Employers Activities
ACTRAV	Bureau for Workers' Activities
CAMFEBA	Cambodian Federation of Employers and Business Associations
CNPM	National Confederation of Employers of the Republic of Moldova
DWCP	Decent Work Country Programme
EC	European Commission
EU	European Union
FNCCI	Nepalese Chambers of Commerce and Industry
HIV/AIDS	Human Immunodeficiency Virus/Acquired Immune Deficiency Syndrome
HQ	Head Quarter
ILO	International Labour Organisation
IR	Industrial Relations
NGO	Non-Governmental Organisation
PCA	Programme Cooperation Agreement
TC	Technical Cooperation
TCCCB	Territorial Commission for Consultancy and Collective Bargaining
TOT	Training Of Trainers

Executive Summary

Background

The ILO Bureau for Employers' Activities (ACT/EMP) is undertaking an internal evaluation of its technical cooperation projects in Cambodia, Moldova and Nepal which are part of the overall global project on "Strengthening Employers' Organizations for Effective Social Dialogue".

The funds for this technical cooperation project have been provided by the Norwegian Government under the ILO-Norway Programme Cooperation Agreement (2010-2011), which was signed on 1st December 2010. The ILO Declaration on Social Justice for a Fair Globalization (2008) forms the guiding principle for the Agreement with the ILO.

The main purpose of the evaluation is to examine the justification for and relevance of the interventions; to assess the effectiveness in achieving the results; to gauge the satisfaction of beneficiaries; and to reflect on the lessons learned and emerging good practices for future interventions.

Methodology

The evaluation was undertaken first by a desk review of relevant documents. Then a the consultant visited the three countries for a three day field visit, interviewing stakeholders, visiting project sites and for Cambodia and Nepal undertaking a half day workshop. After the field visit a draft report was made, and after receiving feedback the consultant prepared a final report. The evaluation took place from mid-May to mid-July 2012.

Main findings

The project has overall performed well in all aspects.

Overall the relevance has been good and needs met. Needs has been based on country needs assessments. All three employers' organisations have been strengthened in terms of general strength (knowledge and capacity), independence (through professional capacity) and more representative in terms of more members. Knowledge and capacity has been strengthened through training and awareness rising. Professional capacity has been strengthened through in-house studies (Moldova), lobbying (Nepal) and better strategy towards new members (Cambodia). All three employers' organisations have also enhanced their capacity to analyse business environment and in particular influence policy development.

Regarding design, the project was short and the project documents for all the three countries verify a clear strategy for what to do. The problem definition and needs description was clearly set out in the project document. The approach was simple and straight forward.

Most activities and outputs, and then the supporting immediate outcomes have been achieved.

Trainings, including awareness rising, have been the most prominent success as it has been essential in all countries and generally been successful. In addition to the success in executing the trainings,

feedback shows that beneficiaries are using what was learned, and that also companies changes behaviour and practice to comply with law and good practice.

Factors behind the successes are training and awareness (done by the employer federations). Also good collaboration, dialogue and communication within the workplace are frequently occurring. Networking including sharing experience is also frequently coming up as a success factor.

Challenges to the project were the short duration of the project, caused by late signing of ILO agreement with donor. Some parts of the project did not succeed. Particularly the "Enhancing employment services for youth" outcome in Nepal did not turn out well. The decision makers as well as the implementers did not have the necessary technical and business competence.

There are also a number of challenges and constraint that affect the employers. These where country specific (Nepal and Cambodia only one assessed) and relates to fragmented trade unions, ineffective labour law, the continuing economic crisis etc.

The general assessment is that the efficiency is good in terms of turning inputs into benefits, with the failed interventions as obvious exemptions. The actual budget and spending levels between the countries differs as Nepal has spent 85,474 USD, Moldova 42,772 USD, while Cambodia have spent 67,390 USD.

Technical support was appreciated and feedback explained that it was sufficient. ILO came in with much needed technical and administrative knowledge and support, as well as with legitimacy, in most areas of the projects. The Youth Employment intervention Nepal is an exemption to this general finding.

Recommendations

Continue good practice like training and awareness as well as other successful work. Other successful work is the targets achieved during the project period (see Section 8.1).

Networking in a wide sense was frequently put forward as beneficial. Networking between stakeholders in same countries but also in other countries was recommended. This is closely related to exchange visits that also were frequently asked for. In Moldova, stakeholders asked for exchange visits or experience sharing seminars to share and learn from experience from other countries.

Better communication: Several stakeholders mentioned better communication as important. Better communication to public, other social partners (for example easy access to public work collective bargaining with own website), and better communication to other territories.

Nepal: Close down the database project. Assess, and if necessary, investigate use of funds.

Use relevant competence when entering into technical field and business areas beyond the ILO's competence. Such competence is particularly relevant during the strategy process to guide directions.

Include proper risk assessment when entering into joint activities with partners outside the project and beyond the control of the project. A backup plan – if proper cooperation or resources are not available from the partner – should be made to improve the probability for success.

Lessons learned and good practices

Joint efforts have risk: The project had a few interventions that required joint efforts with trade unions and other partners outside the projects control. Such efforts bear a larger risk than interventions only dependent on resources and commitment within the control of the project, as the delayed or cancelled interventions in Cambodia shows. The interventions can however, also have great benefits that may justify higher risk.

Technical and business knowledge important: When entering into areas outside the core competence of ILO, proper competence should be called upon. The construction of database under the Nepal youth employment outcome is an example of failing to do so. Even if such expertise is called upon the risk will increase.

The way awareness and training has been implemented is a good practices. This relates to both targeted and useful approach and content, where all countries were successful, but in particular Cambodia and Moldova's approach gain momentum to deliver benefits to employers and the labour market in general.

1. Background and Project Description

The funds for this technical cooperation project have been provided by the Norwegian Government under the ILO-Norway Programme Cooperation Agreement (PCA) (2010-2011), which was signed on 1st December 2010. The ILO Declaration on Social Justice for a Fair Globalization (2008) forms the guiding principle for the Agreement with the ILO.

A new ILO-Norway Programme Cooperation Agreement for 2012-2013 was signed in December 2011. Both ACT/EMP and the Bureau for Workers' Activities (ACTRAV) agreed on the selection of countries to be included under the new PCA. ACTRAV will therefore also continue to support workers' organizations in these countries through their workers' education programme, and collaborative activities on the ground will continue to be pursued aimed at enhancing social and policy dialogue.

The implementing partner employers' organizations in the respective countries are the Cambodian Federation of Employers and Business Associations (CAMFEBA); the National Confederation of Employers of the Republic of Moldova (CNPM) and the Federation of Nepalese Chambers of Commerce and Industry (FNCCI).

These employers' organizations are considered to be representative examples of ACT/EMP's technical cooperation and can therefore provide useful information for assessing current and future strategies for technical assistance.

The overall objective of the ACT/EMP project on "Strengthening Employers' Organizations for Effective Social Dialogue" has been to contribute towards strengthening the institutional capacity of employers' organizations for effective social dialogue. The strategy has been two-fold: On the one hand to support the expansion or enhancement of services that employer organizations provide to their members and potential members and, on the other, to strengthen the capacity of employers' organizations in policy development and lobbying. This evaluation will therefore focus on assessing the progress and achievements with regard to this strategy.

1.1 The Internal Evaluation

The internal evaluation covers the technical cooperation projects in Cambodia, Moldova and Nepal which are part of the overall global ACT/EMP project on "Strengthening Employers' Organizations for Effective Social Dialogue".

The main purpose of the evaluation is to examine the justification for and relevance of the interventions; to assess the effectiveness in achieving the results; to gauge the satisfaction of beneficiaries; and to reflect on the lessons learned and emerging good practices for future interventions.

The evaluation is expected to lead to increased knowledge of the strategies and achievements of the country projects; improved performance in project planning and implementation, and an increased recognition of the added value of strengthening the capacities of employers to enable them to participate as credible partners in social and policy dialogue.

As a new ILO-Norway Programme Cooperation Agreement for 2012-2013 was signed in December 2011, the evaluation exercise is also expected to provide recommendations on future strategies in line with ILO-Outcome Strategy 9, donor expectations and realistically achievable and durable results within the given timeframe.

2. Purpose

The purpose of the internal evaluation is to provide a review of the country project interventions and to:

- Examine the rationale for and relevance of the project interventions.
- Assess the effectiveness of achieving expected results, examining the efficiency in the use of inputs to yield results, and assessing the satisfaction of intended beneficiaries.
- Review the strategies and approaches and assess whether lessons can be learned to further strengthen employers' organizations and to identify good practice for future application.

3. Methodology

A desk review of relevant material was initiated in mid-May 2012. Documents from ILO/ACT/EMP and the partners in Moldova, Cambodia and Nepal were handed over to the consultant. The field visit was also planned and prepared in parallel with the desk review.

A one day briefing and interview visit to the ILO headquarters in Geneva was undertaken on the 21 May 2012, followed by field visits to the countries Moldova, Cambodia and Nepal. Three days were set aside per country, and followed the following structure. The first day interviews were held at capital and headquarter of the employers' organisations. The second day was devoted to field visit(s). The field visit for time and logistical reasons had to be limited to visit sites either inside the capital (Cambodia) or within a few hours' drive from the capital (Moldova and Nepal).

The third day was originally devoted to a workshop. In Moldova it was not practically possible to arrange a workshop, and therefore none was undertaken. In Cambodia, it was realised after the planning was set that the third day of the field visit was a holiday. Therefore an adapted workshop was instead undertaken the second day, and the third day was used to interview beneficiaries that could be accessible on this holiday. In Nepal a full participatory workshop was undertaken as planned. The workshop was a one day participatory stakeholder workshops including a debrief from the consultant presenting preliminary findings, followed by group work exploring the stakeholders success stories related to the project, future vision and actions to be taken. A wide spectre of stakeholders was invited to the workshop.

After the field visits was completed a draft report was compiled and sent to ACT/EMP for comments. A final report was made after comments has been received and incorporated.

4. Theory of Change

The Social Justice Declaration reconfirms that social dialogue and tripartism are the most appropriate method of translating economic development into social progress. For this to happen, the parties to dialogue have to be strong, representative and independent. Strong and effective employers' organizations are essential for good governance and promoting longer-term economic and social development.

Strong and effective employers' organizations can promote policies conducive to the creation of sustainable and competitive enterprises and an entrepreneurship culture, which are the basis for development and economic growth. Without sustainable enterprises and employment, there can be no decent employment. Sustainable enterprises need to innovate, adopt appropriate environmentally friendly technologies, develop skills and human resources, and enhance productivity to remain competitive. They need also to apply workplace practices based on full respect for fundamental principles and rights at work and international labour standards, and to foster good labour management relations as important means of raising productivity and creating decent work.

One key element of the ACT/EMP programme is to strengthen organizational structures and the internal management of employers' organizations, enabling them to develop new and improved services that make them more valuable to member enterprises. Effective employers' organizations attract and retain member enterprises through the delivery of value added services, representation and advocacy. Strategic planning and staff competence building are central in pursuing this aim.

The second, related element of the programme for employers' organizations is strengthening the institutional capacity of employers' organizations in policy development and lobbying so that they can influence national, regional and international policy debates. Enterprises are facing new demands, including the fall-out from the financial and economic crisis, which oblige employers' organizations to adapt their services and develop coherent strategies in their lobbying work. Some key challenges for enterprises are to ensure that economies remain open and competitive and that enterprises can continue to compete in global markets.

5. The Project

Below is a summary of the three country projects, including main outputs and activities.

5.1 Moldova

5.1.1 Background

In spite that a legal framework conducive to social dialogue exists in Moldova, the social dialogue materialised in information, consultation, and collective bargaining among the local actors almost does not exist at the local level. The most vulnerable branch of the social dialogue is the regional level (rayonal and subordinate villages). Thus, the national-level social partners, CNPM and CNSM under the project "Enhanced Social Dialogue for Better Governance of the Labour Market in the Republic of Moldova" decided to intervene at the local level so as to encourage social dialogue by replicating the

knowledge and the practices obtained at the national level, from their own experience, as well as a result of the activities, among which training seminars, producing of promotional materials, development of studies on employers and other activities aimed to strengthen the capacities of employers to effectively participate in local social dialogue.

This project was initially developed within Moldova to apply for EU funding. However, the opportunity to obtain definite funding under the ILO/Norwegian Partnership arose before the EU application was lodged and thus did not proceed

In Moldova, the main objective has been to set up and/or revitalise regional offices and provide social dialogue services at local level. A study funded by ILO, but undertaken by a local expert revealed this fact.

5.1.2 Objectives

The following immediate objective, outputs and activities, with the respective budgeted (excluded overhead) and actual spending according to output, has been formulated for Moldova:

Immediate Objective: To enhance social dialogue for better governance of the labour market in the Republic of Moldova		
Output 1.1 Establishment and enhanced functioning of TCCCB with a wider mandate to address social and economic issues.		
Activity	Budgeted amount	Actual amount spent
	USD	
1.1 Conducting one day Kick-off Conference in Chisinau	3066	3029
1.1.2 <i>Conducting 3 one day training on the commission's consultation mandate</i>	4200	4138
1.1.3. Conducting three training programmes on the commission's component of negotiations	4200	4138
1.1.6.2 Development and printing of promotional materials		
1. "Practical guide for the application of the new law on occupational safety and health", 2 .Booklet on "Fees and taxes in the RM", 3. Leaflet: "Social Dialogue. Role and Mission"	2500	2501
1.1.7 Provision of office equipment to TCCCB secretariat	5000	4892
Output 1.2 Enhanced capacities of social partners to effectively participate in local social dialogue		
1.2.4 Development of a survey/scanning of employers and the variety of activities carried out by them	6000	6000
Printing of the studies of employers and the variety of activities carried out by them	4506	4492
1.2.5 Conducting nine workshops with local employers	10500	10349
1.2.7 Development and printing of promotional material	3291	3233
1."Practical guide on matters of social dialogue for employers", 2. Leaflet "EO-registration guidelines".		
Total	43263	42772

The total budget was 49 000 USD and the remaining is personnel and operational costs.

The three territories Cahul, Edinet and Balti were selected as target territories. They were selected because of a) Having advance infrastructure and significant businesses, b) representing a spread in geography (some from North, middle and South).

5.2 Nepal

5.2.1 Background

The project in Nepal aims to strengthen the institutional capacity of employers' organizations to better enable them to fulfil their mandates and thus effectively contribute to economic and social development through effective social dialogue. The ILO-Bureau of Employers' Activities has carried out Capacity Building of Employers for Effective Social Dialogue in partnership with the Federation of Nepalese Chambers of Commerce and Industries (FNCCI) to achieve the overall development objective of promoting social dialogue by enhancing the services of FNCCI to its members and potential members. This Project started in April 2011 and run until the end of March 2012.

In Nepal, the main objective has been to promote workplace cooperation and gender equality at the workplace, in addition to raising awareness on the new labour law and promoting youth employment.

Key aspects of the Project:

- a. Establishing mechanism to pursue good industrial relations
- b. Preparing, printing and distribution of booklet on 'Negotiation Procedure'
- c. Developing a pool of trainers on workplace cooperation (ToT)
- d. Policy guidance to promote gender equality at workplace
- e. Sensitization and consensus on labour legislation
- f. Follow-up on database of youth employment and skills

5.2.2 Development Objective

The overall goal of the project is to promote social dialogue by enhancing the services of FNCCI to its members and potential members. The project consisted of the following immediate objectives and outputs. The respective budgeted amounts in Nepali rupees and USD is attached as well.

	Amounts planned on initial indicative budget	Actual contracted amounts US\$
<i>Immediate Objective 1: Promoting workplace cooperation and gender equality</i>		
Output 1.1: Mechanism for pursuing good industrial relations	20,882	10,000
Output 1.2: Development and publication of booklets on "Negotiation Procedure"	11,000	11,000
Output 1.3: Pool of trainers on workplace cooperation and negotiation skill	20,000	22,578
Output 1.4: Policy guidelines to promote gender equality at workplace	5,000	7,000
<i>Immediate Objective 2: Promoting awareness and consensus on the proposed new Labour Law</i>		
Output 2.1: Labour law sensitization	15,000	17,396
<i>Immediate Objective 3: Enhancing employment services to the youth</i>		
Output 3.1: Promotion campaign and up-dating of database for youth employment	10,000	9,000

Output 3.2: Survey on skilled job vs job market	20,000	0
<i>No-cost extension of project (Jan-March 2012)</i>		
Training workshops on workplace cooperation; promotional activities	8,500	8,500
Total	110,382	85,474*

*This amount does not include the salary of the Project coordinator based in ILO Office in Kathmandu.

5.3 Cambodia

5.3.1 Background

In Cambodia the main objective of the project has been to improve industrial relations (IR) through capacity building in conflict resolution and workplace cooperation, as well as increasing CAMFEBA's outreach and representativeness.

To contribute to sound industrial relations in Cambodia, the project aims to strengthen the IR services, outreach and representativeness of CAMFEBA by implementing the following strategies:

Strategy 1: Provide capacity building to general employers and business associations on labour dispute resolution, CBA, labour law & regulations, case preparation & presentation techniques in front of the Arbitration Council etc.

Strategy 2: In collaboration with ILO-ACTRAV's Workers Education Programme (WEP), among the factories that have attended the above training programme, select 5 factories that most often had the cases at the Arbitration Council to join a pilot project in which CAMFEBA will help review their workplace policies, help them to set up some policies which support the good workplace communication.

Strategy 3: Implement the marketing campaign to raise CAMFEBA's membership through recruit marketing personnel, produce promotional material with the aim of recruiting 16 new members each month.

5.3.2 Objectives

Below are the outputs with the assigned budgeted amount. Actual spending was not available for the consultant.

	Amounts planned on initial indicative budget (US\$)	Actual (US\$)
<i>Immediate Objective 1: To enhance the capacity of employers' associations in dispute prevention and dispute resolution.</i>		
Output 1.1: Training program developed and conducted on dispute prevention and dispute resolution.	9,784	7,238

<i>Immediate Objective 2: to expand the services and representativeness of CAMFEBA.</i>		
Output 2.1: Marketing and sales strategy developed and implemented	17,430	13,818
Output 2.2: Training for foreign investors on "Business in Cambodia- An Essential Guide" conducted	10,964	0
<i>Immediate Objective 3: to promote workplace cooperation in collaboration with the ILO WEP.</i>		
Output 3.1: Workplace Cooperation program for employers and workers developed & conducted	29,005	22,604
Output 3.2: Establishment of Project Advisory Committee includes also project coordination and admin. costs.	17,022	22,590
Office equipment	1,125	1,140
Total	85,330	67,390

6. Relevance

a) *To what extent have the results of the projects been useful in meeting the needs and priorities of the employers' organizations concerned and addressing the identified problems? Do the initial needs and problems still exist and are they still relevant? Have new and relevant needs emerged?*

Overall the relevance has been good and needs met. Needs have been based on country needs assessments.

Moldova: Needs have been met, even though more improvements are obviously needed. It was CPNM itself that identified their needs based upon an analysis of Moldova's situation that "the local social dialogue remains the weakest link in the overall channel of partnership, being the least organized and harnessed in Moldova" according to an ILO study done before the project. The study identified the Territorial Commission on Consultancy and Collective Bargaining (TCCCB) as the bottleneck. The project was wanted by the Moldovan stakeholders. Needs in Moldova have changed, from this initial "pilot" in three relatively strong territories to, in the future, assisting weaker territories as well as scaling-up number of regions.

Cambodia: CAMFEBA was a promising but still weak employer federation. It was by far the most representative employer federation in Cambodia, when it comes it's about 1 000 members as well as being cross-sectoral by having members from all business sectors. CAMFEBA is recognised by Royal Government of Cambodia, ILO as well as other local and international agencies as the most representative voice of employers in Cambodia. Industrial relations (IR) improvement was needed in Cambodia. CAMFEBA needed more members as well as a stronger organisational set-up to make progress. Training courses fitted very well with the needs of the companies according to feedback in interviews. Needs are still more or less the same as CAMFEBA still would highly benefit from having more members and more trainings. IR is still weak in Cambodia. The issues and challenges related to IR in Cambodia are most severe for trade unions, which are very fragmented.

Nepal: Also in Nepal needs are addressed by the project. Workplace cooperation has been weak with a fragmented and powerful, but in general low capacity, trade unions. The law gives trade unions and

employees' rights that make their position strong, which has made their incentives to collaborate low. The coming new labour law is important and FNCCIs involvement is highly relevant and important. Gender was also identified as an issue, and women situation is of real concern as well but many companies – like manufacturing – will likely benefit more from OSH or other gender neutral issues, according to feedback during field mission. Youth employment is an important issue; however the strategy was to go into technically advanced issues like developing a database for job search. This was done without FNCCI or ILO having access to or using relevant technical or business skills, therefore this part failed in terms of relevance, as the ambitions and strategy did not match reality.

General: ILO as a UN agency with a universal mandate and holder of the labour rights conventions, are playing a unique role towards governments. This role cannot be substituted with other agencies. There are therefore aspects with the support towards particularly the governmental level that makes governments listen more to what ILO are saying, what opinions and learning ILO is putting forward than to what donors and other supporting agencies are saying. This unique position is both a competitive advantage as well as a core responsibility for ILO. This came across during interviews with stakeholders in all countries.

b) To what extent have the project results been useful in meeting Outcome 9 in the ILO Programme & Budget 2010-1, namely, Employers have strong, independent and representative organizations, and especially Indicators 9.2. and 9.3.

- *Number of national employers' organizations that, with ILO support, create or significantly strengthen services to respond to the needs of existing and potential members:* All three employers' organisations have been strengthened in terms of being responsive towards their existing and potential members.

Moldova's CPNM have vitalised the important level TCCCB and by that gave both members and potential members a better service in the three districts. Before the projects the TCCCBs was not functioning but with trainings and support they have now understood their role and are functioning. This is a significantly change for both members and non-members/potential members.

In Cambodia, trainings of staff from member companies were instrumental in changing the ways the companies did their activities. Two new training courses were developed and four existing training courses were updated to make it more practical for employers. Around 180 employers/their representatives were trained on labour dispute prevention and labour dispute resolution in eight training courses. Many of the interviewed participants informed that their company had changed practice towards aligning with the law when they learned that their practice was not in line with laws and regulation, for example in Calculation Methods for Overtime and Other payments under the Cambodia Labour Law.

In Nepal, a particular important activity has been the lobbying FNCCI and its members has done regarding influencing the new labour law. Measuring the impact of this lobbying is difficult but FNCCI has approached the government to have several improvements made, which is for the benefit of existing and new members. A training unit has also been built within FNCCI which has facilitated

trainings of members as well as TOT. This is a significant strengthening of the service towards employers in Nepal.

- *Number of employers' organizations that with ILO support have enhanced capacity to analyse the business environment and influence policy development at the national, regional and international levels:*

All three countries studied, have made important steps forward in terms of policy capacity. Moldova made studies of their regions in terms of the TCCCBs for first time by themselves. One report of each region was prepared. Although the studies took longer than anticipated and required much manual work, they were an important step in making the CNPM assessing their own reality, and now being able to provide evidence for their views as well as learn.

Also Cambodia was strengthened in this respect, but less so than Moldova. In Cambodia strengthened its organisation in several ways like trainings, recruitment of members and discussion and pilot meetings in Siem Reap, a new area for CAMFEBA. Unfortunately CAMFEBA was not successful establishing a PAC.

Nepal is in an important process with new labour law in pipeline and their awareness raising among members and lobbying capacity has been enhanced. FNCCI's activities towards awareness and lobbying for improving the labour law draft has strengthen the organisation to make themselves policy relevant.

- c) How well did the project manage to contribute to strengthening bipartite dialogue and/or enhanced industrial relations/workplace cooperation?

For Moldova, the project created an arena as well as a reason and understanding for starting dialogue with social partner bilaterally. Trade unions and employers have done common efforts towards government. For Nepal, FNCCI has strengthened its awareness, interaction and lobbying bilaterally towards the government. This is very important as the new labour law is in pipeline and the project period was a good window of opportunity for influence. Also trade unions and FNCCI have improved dialogue; however trade unions are fragmented and are generally weak so results have been modest. For Cambodia, trade unions are fragmented which also influence CAMFEBAs bilateral relations with them. Also relation with government seems to be modest.

7. Validity of design

7.1 Operational aspects

ILO's way of working is thorough and can in principle be put into the following steps from an idea is put forward to decision is made: 1) Background notes and studies made; 2) Look at opportunities (ILO assessment); 3) Identified shared needs and build a case; 4) If it is clear that it is worthwhile for partners to go ahead then it's an acceptable case and funding can be recommended. This design seems to have uncovered the needs and put ILO – for most of the outputs – in a good position to support good projects.

Moldova is a case where ACT/EMP was already heavily involved in and where ACTRAV could adapt to join. ACT/EMP was the driver in Moldova. At present trade unions in Moldova have good links with political level but weak member links. This project also develops the bipartite relation between trade unions and employers.

In Cambodia ACTRAV trained also trade unions in collective bargaining. This is an important aspect as there is "A lot of competence building and collaboration through bargaining and negotiations", according to feedback from ILO staff and findings in the field. Cambodia did not achieve planned target when it came to activities where responsibility was either formally or in reality shared, in this case with trade unions (ILO WEP activities). As trade unions are organisationally weaker and more fragmented CAMFEBA ended up not getting the trade union side committed and on board and the output target was not met. This risk should have been discussed and probably a backup plan should have been prepared.

In Nepal the programme was designed well. The trainings were well set up and trainings offered were well received, according to feedback in the field. There is an additional challenge in doing trainings in Nepal as the country is affected by aid mentality; there is an attitude that trainings are free or even that participants should make money on attending trainings through allowances. FNCCI has worked on this mentality and still are demanding at least some payment for trainings. Gender issues were put on the agenda, however this output has not moved far. A generic gender guideline is in place, but the impression was that progress is a challenge. The youth employment strategy however failed, as discussed elsewhere.

a) Do the project documents specify the problems, needs and strategy to be followed and the objectives of the projects?

Generally the project was short and the project documents for all the three countries verify a clear strategy for what to do. The problem definition and needs description was clearly set out in the project document. The approach was simple and straight forward.

Documents were clear and practically designed. Needs, strategy and objectives were in most cases clear in the documents.

b) Were the project objectives and outcomes relevant and realistic to the situation on the ground?

As explained elsewhere most objectives and outcomes were relevant and realistic, with some exemptions. In Moldova developing the survey/scanning of employers was delayed and took more resources than expected as this was a new experience for the CNPM.

In Cambodia the plan underestimated the challenge with getting people to the Project Advisory committee (PAC). This should maybe have been spotted in the planning. CAMFEBA also run into a problem when a hired consultant did not deliver the guide on "Business in Cambodia" within acceptable time. This however is assessed as an unexpected event.

In Nepal enhancement of youth employment database failed, which is discussed in more details in section 8.3.

c) Was the intervention logically coherent and realistic?

The intervention was based on analysis of the situation. In Moldova a funder was searched for which ended up with ILO, which is evidence that the project has ownership and is valued at national level. The project idea and concept thus have had some time to mature, before implementation. Generally – with exceptions - the logic was solid. The outputs were linked to the immediate outcome. The main strategic component in all countries was training, and the rest of the component supported and enhanced this core component and activity.

The exemptions were the same as discussed elsewhere, youth employment strategy in Nepal and PAC in Cambodia.

Based on the findings regarding failed interventions in Cambodia and in Nepal, it seems to have been external factors that were missed and not planned for in some cases.

8. Project effectiveness

The projects achievements and challenges are presented below. First is the logframe for each country presented with the consultant's assessment of what was achieved and what was not achieved. A brief summary of main achievements is also presented.

8.1 Achievements

a) To what extent have the expected results of the country projects been achieved and what have been the projects' main achievements?

Below are the logframes with an assessment of achieved or not achieved.

8.1.1 Cambodia

Immediate Objective 1 (IO-1): To enhance the capacity of employers associations in dispute prevention and dispute resolution.	Achieved	Not achieved	Comments
Output 1.1: Training programme developed and conducted on dispute prevention and dispute resolution.	Achieved		
Activity 1.1.1: Develop the training materials based on CAMFEBA's existing training materials and other publication of the ILO and the Arbitration Council	Achieved		
Activity 1.1.2: Set the training calendar	Achieved		
Activity 1.1.3: Put announcement on the training courses and invite employers and workers to participate	Achieved		
Activity 1.1.4: Organize the ToT training for business associations to build up their training capacity so that they can further train their members on workplace cooperation, labour dispute resolution etc.	Achieved		Number of trainings reduced from 8 to 6, but as matter of logistic efficiency.

Evaluation of ILO Project " Strengthening Employers' Organizations for Effective Social Dialogue "

Activity 1.1.5: Implement the follow up activities with the business associations to ensure that they have provided the training to their members.		Not achieved	
Immediate Objective 2 (IO-2): to expand the services and representativeness of CAMFEBA			
Output 2.1: Marketing and sales strategy developed and implemented	Achieved		
Activity 2.1.1: Recruit 5 Sales & Marketing Executives	Achieved		Target was reduced to 4 not 5.
Activity 2.1.2: Recruiting a Marketing Consultant to help develop CAMFEBA's marketing tool and strategies and conduct Sales & Marketing Training to Sales & Marketing team	Achieved		
Activity 2.1.3: Develop and print CAMFEBA's marketing materials	Achieved		
Activity 2.1.4: Provide the induction training about CAMFEBA and Sales & Marketing skills to the Sales & Marketing team	Achieved		
Activity 2.1.5: Develop and implement the sales and marketing strategy	Achieved		
Activity 2.1.6: Organize one half-day workshop for employers on the roles of CAMFEBA in order to promote membership in Siem Reap	Achieved		
Activity 2.1.7: Sales & Marketing Team follow up after the workshop	Achieved		
Output 2.2: Training for foreign investors on "Business in Cambodia- An Essential Guide" conducted		Not achieved within project timeframe	Consultant did not deliver the guidebook on time. All output on hold as the foundation for the activities not in place.
Activity 2.2.1: Printing the Guidebooks		Not achieved within project timeframe	The Guidebooks were however finalised & printed later in 2012 with ACT/EMP RBTC funds
Activity 2.2.2: Design the training material with the consultant who developed this guide		Not achieved within project timeframe	Achieved later in 2012 with RBTC funds
Activity 2.2.3: Post the advertisement in the newspapers		Not achieved	
Activity 2.2.4: Implement two training courses by using CAMFEBA trainer and the consultant		Not achieved	Achieved later in 2012 with RBTC

Evaluation of ILO Project " Strengthening Employers' Organizations for Effective Social Dialogue "

			funds
Activity 2.2.5: CAMFEBA conduct this training on monthly basis by using its own trainer alone after the first two trainings.		Not achieved	
Immediate Objective 3 (IO-3): to promote workplace cooperation in collaboration with the ILO WEP			
Output 3.1: Workplace Cooperation programme for employers and workers developed and conducted		In progress	
Activity 3.1.1: Convene a meeting with ILO WEP to discuss the organization of joint training on workplace cooperation.	Achieved		
Activity 3.1.2: Develop the guidebooks with ILO WEP	Achieved		
Activity 3.1.3: Identify 5 garment factories to participate in this pilot project		Not achieved	
Activity 3.1.4: Conduct the training on workplace cooperation, Labor Dispute Resolution and Strike & Lockout procedure for them	Achieved		
Activity 3.1.5: Implement regular follow-up activities to continue to provide them the on-going technical support after the training	Achieved		
Activity 3.1.6: Document the good and bad examples of practices in those enterprises and develop as the case studies for the future training on the same topic.		In progress	
Output 3.2: Establishment of Project Advisory Committee		Not achieved	Did not find candidates that had time to devote to PAC.
Activity 3.2.1: Establishment of the PAC		Not achieved	
Activity 3.2.2: Organize 3 PAC Meetings		Not achieved	

8.1.2 Moldova

Immediate Objective: To enhance social dialogue for better governance of the labour market in the Republic of Moldova	Achieved	Not achieved	Comments
Output 1.1 Establishment and enhanced functioning of TCCCB with a wider mandate to address social and economic issues.	Achieved		
Activity			
1.1 Conducting one day Kick-off Conference in Chisinau	Achieved		
1.1.2 Conducting 3 one day training on the commission's consultation mandate	Achieved		
1.1.3. Conducting three training programmes on the commission's component of negotiations	Achieved		

Evaluation of ILO Project " Strengthening Employers' Organizations for Effective Social Dialogue "

1.1.6.2 Development and printing of promotional materials	Achieved		
1.1.7 Provision of office equipment to TCCCB secretariat	Achieved		
Output 1.2 Enhanced capacities of social partners to effectively participate in local social dialogue	Achieved		
1.2.4 Development of a survey/scanning of employers and the variety of activities carried out by them	Achieved		Achieved but took longer time than planned
1.2.5 Conducting nine workshops with local employers	Achieved		
1.2.7 Development and printing of promotional material	Achieved		

8.1.3 Nepal

Project: Capacity Building of Employers for Effective Social Dialogue:	Achieved	Not achieved	Briefly explain major factors that affected output delivery when outputs were not achieved
Outcome 1: Promoting Workplace Cooperation and Gender Equality			
Output 1.1: Mechanisms for pursuing good industrial relations established through the implementation of internal rules and grievance procedures at workplaces.	Achieved		
Output 1.2: Published booklets on "Negotiation" and "workplace cooperation".	Achieved		
Output 1.3: Pool of trainers on workplace cooperation and negotiation skills in district chambers and FNCCI	Achieved		
Output 1.4: Set of policy prepared and mainstreamed to promote gender equality at workplaces.	Achieved		
Outcome 2: Sensitization of new drafts on the labour law. (Employers across the country will be educated on the content of new draft labour laws)			
Output 2.1: Sensitization of the major issues contained in the draft labour laws/social security in the districts.	Achieved		
Outcome 3: Enhancing employment services to the youth	-	-	-
Output 3.1 A promotion campaign to encourage youth to utilize the FNCCI website to seek employment. An increased updated database of youth employment and skills.		Not achieved	Database is of no use, not appropriate as a pilot and of sub-standard quality. Other questions have been raised elsewhere in this

			report as well.
Output 3.2 A baseline Survey designed to match the availability of skilled with the demands of job market.		Not Achieved	FNCCI wanted to implement this activity during the period of no-cost extension (Jan-March 2012), however, due to insufficient time, there was a concern of its accomplishment with quality results. Therefore, some alternative activities purposed for implementation

8.1.4 Achievements summary

The summary above shows that most activities and outputs, and then the supporting immediate outcomes have been achieved.

Trainings including awareness rising has been the most prominent success as it has been essential in all countries and generally been successful. In addition to the success in executing the trainings, feedback shows that beneficiaries are using what was learned, and that also companies changes behaviour and practice to comply with law and good practice.

For Moldova the Territorial Commission on Consultancy and Collective Bargaining (TCCCB) existed but did not work. The project made the TCCCBs function, according to consistent feedback from the field visit. TCCCB is the link between local and national level and are as such an essential part of the social dialogue. TCCCBs were trained in their roles, rights, duties and function and were put quickly into a position where the members could make the TCCCBs function well.

The project in Moldova developed the capacity of their organization to do own studies, through the three territorial studies of Cahul, Balti and Edinet. The studies were also in collaboration with the tripartite partners. The consultant see this as a great step forward, even though it took more time than expected and that their analytical capacity should still be enhanced.

All planned activities were also undertaken in Moldova. All activities were done within the project period, even though not all on time according to the plan.

For Nepal training and awareness were the most significant achievement. A training department is build and their capacity in this respect is greatly enhanced, thanks also to Training of Trainers (TOT) that has

built a pool of trainers that can expand training even more. This clearly strengthened the institutional capacity of employers which was one of the main objectives.

Cambodia also training is fundamental as with the other two countries. CAMFEBA's trainings were more on specialised subjects. Feedback from training participants indicate that their companies have changed their practice to better be in line with laws and regulations.

8.2 Factors behind the achievements

For Cambodia and Nepal there were undertaken stakeholder workshops with a broad spectre of stakeholders. During these workshops we studied how CAMFEBA and FNNCCI respectively succeeded. One or more of the follow factors was highlighted as being present when CAMFEBA and FNCCI stakeholder succeeded with work related to social dialogue. Below are the most frequent success factors in the two countries.

In Nepal, awareness about social dialogue issues, formation of workplace committees/social dialogue (non-political), involve all stakeholders, working towards set objectives, having a Code of Conduct; enter into Bilateral Dialogue all were forwarded as success factors. "We have a sense of joint responsibility and ownership/good faith (between employer and employees) was a statement that could sum up the key to success.

In Cambodia the following factors where most frequent, learning from CAMFEBA training, utilize CAMFEBA services, having good communication (good workplace cooperation), being willing to share experience, networking with CAMFEBA members as well as communicate learning to top management all were forwarded as success factors.

We see that training and awareness (done by the employer federations) is coming up as success factors. Also good collaboration, dialogue and communication within the workplace are frequently occurring. Networking including sharing experience is also frequently coming up as a success factor.

During the Moldova visit, there was no time to organise a stakeholder workshop.

b) Have the outputs been useful and do the benefits accrue equally to both genders?

For Moldova it was important to have engaged and capacitated the three key regions in the project. This is important in itself but also as a learning and demonstration pilot for a possibly scaling up towards more regions. These regions are likely to have less capacity than the three regions in this round.

"Finally the employers understand the importance of having an organisation", was one stakeholders views, trying to explain the less measurable but significant effect of the project. Stakeholders interviewed in Moldova claim that employers (and trade unions) understood that it's easier to sit down and talk than to have strike. If it is the case that the project has hindered strikes, the project has had a positive economic influence as well as strikes are costly for society (businesses and employees).

In Cambodia, after talking to a number of beneficiaries, it becomes clear that many were participants in training are taking what they learned to the company management for changing existing practice that may not be align with present law, as discussed elsewhere in this report.

Related to giving better services particularly in Cambodia it was explained that the ILO programme gives credibility, which again makes it easier for the marketing efforts to raise new members.

Gender: The activities and outputs are not gender focused, however it is clear that most activities taking place in an environment with most men. This is the case for Nepal and Cambodia but less so for Moldova. The programmes gender policy has had a relatively low visibility. Generally when social dialogue finally improves in the countries the benefit will accrue to both women and men.

8.3 Challenges

d) What if any, have been the main challenges or constraining factors of the projects and how have they been overcome?

8.3.1 Project challenges

The project duration was short as well as with a short preparation time (Feb. 2011 to end Feb. 2012) and training of TCCCBs was done in Nov. 2011. This was a challenge that ACT/EMP inherit from the delayed signing of the Norwegian agreement with ILO. Longer project durations would give more space for undertaking longer term change processes. A short project can however anyway be a good kick-start of processes as the overall positive assessment of this project illustrate.

Cambodia: Two main outputs were not accomplished, namely, Output 2.2: Training for foreign investors on "Business in Cambodia- An Essential Guide" conducted, and Output 3.2: Establishment of Project Advisory Committee. The challenges facing these outputs are discussed elsewhere.

Nepal: The "Enhancing employment services for youth" outcome did not turn out well. The decision makers as well as the implementers did not have technical and business skills in job searching platforms or integrated complex national databases. The technical quality of the database was poor. The consultant therefore questions the use of funds for this database.

In Cambodia, CAMFEBA missed target in two of their activities. In activity Output 3.2: Establishment of Project Advisory Committee no such committees were established. Finding suitable candidates that had time to engage in the committee was given as reason for not establishing the committees. Output 2.2: Training for foreign investors on "Business in Cambodia- An Essential Guide" conducted, also failed to materialise within the project timeframe. A consulting company was hired to work on the Guide but it took much longer than planned to complete. At the time of the field visit to Cambodia, early June 2012 no guide has arrived. The attempts done by CAMFEBA to remind the company had also failed. However the Guide has since been finalised and activities completed with TC funds from ACT/EMP's regular budget (RBTC). Also some activities related to Output 3.1: Workplace Cooperation programme for employers and workers developed and conducted was delayed as ILO WEB and ACTRAV did not respond in due time on their cooperation to conduct Joint training on workplace cooperation and guidebook development on the Workplace Cooperation, Labour Dispute Resolution Procedure and Strike and Lock

Out Procedure. This took longer time than planned which led to delay in the implementation of activities.

Moldova is in an uncertain and difficult economic and political situation which naturally affects the labour market negatively. The difficult economic environment was a challenge for the project.

General challenges and constraints

There are also a number of challenges and constraint that affect the employers. This is list of the most significant (from the workshops with stakeholders):

In Cambodia several challenges and constraints were raised: Loophole in labour law; Political issues will affect IR; Trade unions law will not be adopted; The economic crisis remain; Level of understanding of labour law among employer and employee is low; Education of employee (Basic education); Improving the level of functioning of Ministry Of Labour and Vocational Training.

In Cambodia there is fragmented trade unions and labour associations structure that makes negotiations and collective bargaining challenging. Cambodia has 56 federations, 13 associations, 1 NGO, 9 union confederations and 1 union chamber on the trade union side, altogether 79 actors on the trade union and labour association side.

In Nepal there is unhealthy competition among trade unions; In absence of local government for long time, chamber has bigger responsibility at local level; Limited recourses both financial and human; High interest rate from banking sector; Lack of protection for entrepreneurs; Load shedding, power cut up to 12 hours in a day (Electricity shortage); Political instability (strikes, government change); Labour and other related laws (inflexible, old); Poor implementation of laws; Lack of employers unity (Multiplicity of employers organizations); No good-faith bargaining; Not enough training and awareness to both workers and management.

e) What, if any, alternative strategies would have been more effective in achieving the objectives of the projects?

The evaluation has not brought forward a better alternative for the programme as a whole. The same apply for country and outcome strategies. Failed interventions are discussed elsewhere in this report.

While no better strategies were brought forward with confidence, some reflections were made. In Cambodia the garment industry has 80% of export value and 30% of the GDP. It is by far the largest manufacturing employer. The export has also increased drastically as EU has expelled the previous Rule of Origin and now allows for free import to EU even if some material is purchased from other countries. The softening of these Rules of Origin have made it boom in the garment sector in Cambodia. A more focused and tailor made strategy towards the garment industry could be effective as the European market is sensitive towards labour rights as well as the export increase could give rise to more foreign investments.

9. Efficiency

Have the inputs (funds, project personnel, expertise, partners, training materials and equipment) been adequate, timely and relevant? Have resources been used efficiently? Have activities supporting the strategy been cost effective? In general, have the results achieved justified the costs? Could the same results have been obtained with fewer resources?

The general assessment is that the efficiency is good in terms of turning inputs into benefits, with the failed interventions as obvious exemptions. Training has been essential in this. Efficiency will also depend on whether the benefits will be sustainable. If not sustainable, meaning that the long term value (Net present value) is drastically reduced. For Cambodia and Moldova the evaluation shows that the federations is getting stronger and likely more sustainable also regarding training. For Nepal the training unit is built by consulting funding from ILO, and the consultant has doubt if this unit will be maintained without funding from external donors.

In CAMFEBA marketing personnel have been hired to recruit members to CAMFEBA. The recruiting of new members are more demanding than expected and less number of new members is recruited. The target was 16 members per month; however the number now is much less. About 4-6 members a month with variations, in total 42 new members had been recruited since New Year (until end of May when the field visit took place). The recruitment pays for the extra marketing. This is good, but CAMFEBA hoped for more.

Siem Riep, Cambodia, with its tourist market and many companies is frequently mentioned as a potential new area and an office is suggested. Already CAMFEBA have had successful events in Siem Riep and recruited new members from the area. At the moment this efforts seems worthwhile and important with potential, but also with risk in terms of number of new members.

10. Management effectiveness

a) Was the technical and administrative guidance and support provided by ACT/EMP adequate? *Did the project governance facilitate good results and efficient delivery? Was there a clear understanding of the roles and responsibilities by all parties involved?*

Technical support was appreciated and feedback explained that it was sufficient. ILO came in with much needed technical and administrative knowledge and support, as well as with legitimacy, in most areas of the projects.

In Nepal also the ILO country management, as well as the regional specialist failed to understand the whole "Enhancing employment services to the youth", so did the FNCCI and others involved, and both the activities (outputs 3.1 and 3.2) failed. Output 3.1 was implemented but with sub-standard results (explained elsewhere) and output 3.2 - a baseline survey - was not undertaken.

Even though the national and regional specialist (or other involved) did not have adequate competence in these areas (LIMS, web-based recruitment system), basically building highly complex and advanced

database system, no expertise were consulted and asked to assist. Nor was national or regional already existing suppliers asked for advice or cooperation, according to findings from the field visit.

b) To what extent have the various ILO units and technical specialists cooperated? Has this cooperation worked satisfactory?

Cooperation has been good and valued by the national counterparts. Technical specialists are busy and national partner would like more time (particularly for Cambodia and Nepal) from the specialist. The willingness and efforts from the specialists are honourable, according to feedback under field visit.

11. Conclusions

The project has overall performed well in all aspects.

11.1 Main findings

Overall the relevance has been good and needs met. Needs has been based on country needs assessments. All three employers' organisations have been strengthened in terms of general strength (knowledge and capacity), independence (through professional capacity) and more representatives in terms of more members. All three employers' organisations have also enhanced there capacity to analyse business environment and in particular influence policy development.

Regarding design the project was short and the project documents for all the three countries verify a clear strategy for what to do. The problem definition and needs description was clearly set out in the project document. The approach was simple and strait forward.

Most activities and outputs, and then the supporting immediate outcomes have been achieved.

Trainings including awareness rising has been the most prominent success as it has been essential in all countries and generally been successful. In addition to the success in executing the trainings feedback shows that beneficiaries are using what was learned, and that also companies changes behaviour and practice to comply with law and good practice.

Factors behind the successes are training and awareness (done by the employer federations). Also good collaboration, dialogue and communication within the workplace are frequently occurring. Networking including sharing experience is also frequently coming up as a success factor.

Challenges to the project were the short duration of the project, caused by late signing of ILO agreement with donor. Some parts of the project did not succeed. Particularly the "Enhancing employment services for youth" outcome in Nepal did not turn out well. The decision makers as well as the implementers did not have the necessary technical and business competence.

There are also a number of challenges and constraint that also affect the employers. These where country specific (Nepal and Cambodia only one assessed) and relates to fragmented trade unions, ineffective labour law, the remaining economic crisis etc.

The general assessment is that the efficiency is good in terms of turning inputs into benefits, with failed interventions as obvious exemptions. The budget level between the countries differs as Nepal had an indicative budget of 100,000 USD, Moldova only 49,950 USD, while Cambodia had as much as 85,330 UD.

Technical support was appreciated and feedback explained that it was sufficient. ILO came in with much needed technical and administrative knowledge and support, as well as with legitimacy, in most areas of the projects. The Youth Employment intervention Nepal is an exemption to this general finding.

12. Recommendations

Continue good practice like training and awareness as well as other successful work.

Networking in a wide sense was frequently put forward. Networking between stakeholders in same countries but also in other countries was recommended. This is closely related to exchange visits that also were frequently asked for. In Moldova stakeholders asked for exchange visits or experience sharing seminars to share and learn from experience from other countries.

Better communication: Several stakeholders mentioned better communication as important. Better communication to public, other social partners (for example easy access to public work collective bargaining with own website), and better communication to other territories.

Nepal: Close down the database project. Assess, and if necessary, investigate use of funds.

Use relevant competence when entering into technical field and business areas beyond the ILO's competence. Such competence is particularly relevant during the strategy process to guide directions.

Include proper risk assessment when entering into joint activities with partners outside the project and beyond the control of the project. A backup plan – if proper cooperation or resources are not available from the partner – should be made to improve the probability for success.

13. Lessons learned and good practices

Joint efforts have risk: The project had a few interventions that required joint efforts with trade unions and other partners outside the projects control. Such efforts bear at larger risk than intervention only dependent on resources and commitment within the control of the project, as the delayed or cancelled interventions in Cambodia shows.

Technical and business knowledge important: When entering into areas outside the core competence of ILO, proper competence should be called upon. The construction of database under the Nepal youth employment outcome is an example of failing to do so. Even if such expertise is called upon the risk will increase.

Evaluation of ILO Project " Strengthening Employers' Organizations for Effective Social Dialogue "

The way awareness and training has been implemented is a good practices. This relates to both targeted and useful approach and content, where all countries were successful, but in particular Cambodia and Moldova's approach gain momentum to deliver benefits to employers and the labour market in general.

Annex 1: Terms of Reference

Internal Evaluation

Terms of Reference

ILO - Bureau for Employers' Activities (ACT/EMP)

“Strengthening Employers’ Organizations for Effective Social Dialogue”

GLO/10/56/NOR

Financing agency:	Ministry of Foreign Affairs, Norway
Implementing agency:	International Labour Organization (ILO)
Type of evaluation:	Internal evaluation
Geographical Coverage:	Eastern Europe and South Asia
Main project countries:	Moldova, Cambodia, Nepal
Languages:	English, local languages
Tentative date for final report:	22 June 2012
Preparation date:	April 2012

Introduction

1. The ILO Bureau for Employers' Activities (ACT/EMP) is undertaking an internal evaluation of its technical cooperation projects in Cambodia, Moldova and Nepal which are part of the overall global project on "Strengthening Employers' Organizations for Effective Social Dialogue".¹
2. The funds for this technical cooperation project have been provided by the Norwegian Government under the ILO-Norway Programme Cooperation Agreement (2010-2011), which was signed on 1st December 2010. The ILO Declaration on Social Justice for a Fair Globalization (2008) forms the guiding principle for the Agreement with the ILO.
3. The main purpose of the evaluation is to examine the justification for and relevance of the interventions; to assess the effectiveness in achieving the results; to gauge the satisfaction of beneficiaries; and to reflect on the lessons learned and emerging good practices for future interventions.
4. The evaluation is expected to lead to increased knowledge of the strategies and achievements of the country projects; improved performance in project planning and implementation, and an increased recognition of the added value of strengthening the capacities of employers to enable them to participate as credible partners in social and policy dialogue.
5. As a new ILO-Norway Programme Cooperation Agreement for 2012-2013 was signed in December 2011, the evaluation exercise is also expected to provide recommendations on future strategies in line with ILO-Outcome Strategy 9, donor expectations and realistically achievable and durable results within the given timeframe.
6. The evaluation will be managed by the evaluator/s with coordinating, administrative and logistical support provided by relevant ACT/EMP officials at Headquarters and ILO Regional and Country Offices.

Background and Justification

Overall project context

7. The Social Justice Declaration reconfirms that social dialogue and tripartism are the most appropriate method of translating economic development into social progress. For this to happen, the parties to dialogue have to be strong, representative and independent. Strong and effective employers' organizations are essential for good governance and promoting longer-term economic and social development.
8. Strong and effective employers' organizations can promote policies conducive to the creation of sustainable and competitive enterprises and an entrepreneurship culture, which are the basis for development and economic growth. Without sustainable enterprises and employment, there can be no decent employment. Sustainable enterprises need to innovate, adopt appropriate

¹ The global project (GLO/10/56/NOR) supports specific elements of the Outcome 9 Strategy of the ILO Programme and Budget for 2010-2011: "Employers have strong, independent and representative organizations".

environmentally friendly technologies, develop skills and human resources, and enhance productivity to remain competitive. They need also to apply workplace practices based on full respect for fundamental principles and rights at work and international labour standards, and to foster good labour management relations as important means of raising productivity and creating decent work.

9. One key element of the ACT/EMP programme is to strengthen organizational structures and the internal management of employers' organizations, enabling them to develop new and improved services that make them more valuable to member enterprises. Effective employers' organizations attract and retain member enterprises through the delivery of value added services, representation and advocacy. Strategic planning and staff competence building are central in pursuing this aim.
10. The second, related element of the programme for employers' organizations is strengthening the institutional capacity of employers' organizations in policy development and lobbying so that they can influence national, regional and international policy debates. Enterprises are facing new demands, including the fall-out from the financial and economic crisis, which oblige employers' organizations to adapt their services and develop coherent strategies in their lobbying work. Some key challenges for enterprises are to ensure that economies remain open and competitive and that enterprises can continue to compete in global markets.

Country project description

11. It is proposed that the internal evaluation be conducted in Cambodia, Moldova and Nepal, as ACT/EMP will continue to provide technical and financial support to the national employers' organizations in these countries under the new ILO-Norway PCA 2012-2013.
12. It should be mentioned that both ACT/EMP and the Bureau for Workers' Activities (ACTRAV) agreed on the selection of countries to be included under the new PCA 2012-2013. ACTRAV will therefore also continue to support workers' organizations in these countries through their workers' education programme, and collaborative activities on the ground will continue to be pursued aimed at enhancing social and policy dialogue.
13. The implementing partner organizations in Cambodia, Moldova and Nepal are the national employers' organizations: the Cambodian Federation of Employers and Business Associations (CAMFEBA); the National Confederation of Employers of the Republic of Moldova (CNPM) and the Federation of Nepalese Chambers of Commerce and Industry (FNCCI).
14. These employers' organizations are considered to be representative examples of ACT/EMP's technical cooperation and can therefore provide useful information for assessing current and future strategies for technical assistance.
15. The overall objective of the ACT/EMP project on "Strengthening Employers' Organizations for Effective Social Dialogue" has been to contribute towards strengthening the institutional capacity of employers' organizations for effective social dialogue. The strategy has been two-fold: On the one hand to support the expansion or enhancement of services that employer organizations provide to their members and potential members and, on the other, to strengthen the capacity of employers' organizations in policy development and lobbying. This evaluation will therefore focus on assessing the progress and achievements with regard to this strategy.

16. In Cambodia the main objective of the project has been to improve industrial relations (IR) through capacity building in conflict resolution and workplace cooperation, as well as increasing CAMFEBA's outreach and representativeness.
17. In Moldova, the main objective has been to set up and/or revitalise regional offices and provide social dialogue services at local level.
18. In Nepal, the main objective has been to promote workplace cooperation and gender equality at the workplace, in addition to raising awareness on the new labour law and promoting youth employment.

Other relevant project background

16. Decent Work Country Programmes (DWCPs) are the main instrument for ILO cooperation with member States throughout the world. The DWCPs provide a mechanism through which to outline agreed upon priorities between the ILO and the national constituents within a broader UN and International development context.
17. The DWCPs define a corporate focus on priorities, operational strategies as well as a resource and implementation plan that complement and support constituent plans for national decent work priorities. As such DWCP are broader frameworks to which the individual ILO project is linked and contributes to.

Purpose, Scope and Clients of Evaluation

Purpose

18. The purpose of the internal evaluation is to provide a review of the country project interventions and to:
 - Examine the rationale for and relevance of the project interventions.
 - Assess the effectiveness of achieving expected results, examining the efficiency in the use of inputs to yield results, and assessing the satisfaction of intended beneficiaries.
 - Review the strategies and approaches and assess whether lessons can be learned to further strengthen employers' organizations and to identify good practice for future application.
19. The country projects have been technically backstopped by the ACT/EMP Employer Specialists based in the ILO Sub-regional Offices in Bangkok (covering Cambodia), Budapest (covering Moldova) and New Delhi (covering Nepal).
20. ILO Offices in Bangkok, Budapest and New Delhi have also provided administrative support to the projects. As the project is centrally managed, the ACT/EMP Project Manager in ILO Headquarters in Geneva has been overall responsible for the project.
21. The project funds under the ILO-Norway Partnership Agreement supplement ACT/EMP's Regular Budget Technical Cooperation (RBTC) allocations in support of the Outcome-based Workplans of the ACT/EMP Employer Specialists. It is therefore suggested that if time allows, that the evaluator also reviews the overall technical assistance programme of ACT/EMP in the said countries in order to provide a holistic picture of ACT/EMP's technical and financial support to the selected national employers' organizations.

22. The main users of the evaluation are ACT/EMP headquarters and field specialists; employers' organizations; other relevant technical units in the ILO (in particular ACTRAV); Directors of ILO Offices in the context of the coordination role of the Decent Work Country Teams; donors - the Ministry of Foreign Affairs in Oslo; and other relevant partners.

Suggested Analytical Framework

23. The following Analytical Framework contains the main evaluation criteria with suggested questions under each criterion to guide the evaluator and the evaluation process. The evaluator will attempt to address the aspects outlined below to the extent possible based on the chosen evaluation methodology described in Methodology section below.

24. Relevance

- a) To what extent have the results of the projects been useful in meeting the needs and priorities of the employers' organizations concerned and addressing the identified problems? Do the initial needs and problems still exist and are they still relevant? Have new and relevant needs emerged?
- b) To what extent have the project results been useful in meeting Outcome 9 in the ILO Programme & Budget 2010-1, namely, *Employers have strong, independent and representative organizations*, and especially Indicators 9.2. and 9.3.:
 - Number of national employers' organizations that, with ILO support, create or significantly strengthen services to respond to the needs of existing and potential members.
 - Number of employers' organizations that with ILO support, have enhanced capacity to analyse the business environment and influence policy development at the national, regional and international levels.
- c) How well did the project manage to contribute to strengthening bipartite dialogue and/or enhanced industrial relations/workplace cooperation?

25. Validity of design

- a) Do the project documents specify the problems, needs and strategy to be followed and the objectives of the projects?
- b) Were the project objectives and outcomes relevant and realistic to the situation on the ground?
- c) Was the intervention logically coherent and realistic?
 - Did the outputs causally link to the immediate objectives that link to the broader development objective?
 - What were the main strategic components of the project?
 - How useful and appropriate have the indicators described in the project document been in assessing the project's progress? Are the means of verification for the indicators appropriate?
 - Were the external factors affecting project implementation identified and assumptions proven valid?

26. Project effectiveness

- a) To what extent have the expected results of the country projects been achieved what have been the projects' main achievements?
- b) Have the outputs been useful and do the benefits accrue equally to both genders?
- c) Are the employers' organizations using outputs developed under the project?
- d) What if any, have been the main challenges or constraining factors of the projects and how have they been overcome?
- e) What, if any, alternative strategies would have been more effective in achieving the objectives of the projects?

27. Efficiency of resource use

- a) Have the inputs (funds, project personnel, expertise, partners, training materials and equipment) been adequate, timely and relevant?
- b) Have resources been used efficiently? Have activities supporting the strategy been cost effective? In general, have the results achieved justified the costs? Could the same results have been obtained with fewer resources?

28. Effectiveness of management arrangements

- a) Was the technical and administrative guidance and support provided by ACT/EMP adequate?
- b) Did the project governance facilitate good results and efficient delivery? Was there a clear understanding of the roles and responsibilities by all parties involved?
- c) To what extent have the various ILO units and technical specialists cooperated? Has this cooperation worked satisfactory?

Main Outputs

29. The expected outputs to be delivered by the evaluator/s are:

- 1) A desk review of project related documents
- 2) An internal evaluation instrument prepared by the evaluator identifying key aspects to address as well as approach and methods to be used
- 3) Data collection and interviews in Geneva
- 4) Preparation of questionnaire for field based colleagues and partners
- 5) Email and telephone interviews with staff and partners as identified
- 6) Draft evaluation report
- 7) Final Report including:
 - Executive Summary with key findings, conclusions and recommendations

- Clearly identified findings
 - Clearly identified conclusions and recommendations
 - Lessons learned
 - Potential good practices and effective models of intervention.
 - Appropriate Annexes including the TORs for the independent evaluation
30. The report should follow the outline that is considered the most appropriate given the purpose and scope of the evaluation, and focus on giving a clear and concise analysis of the effectiveness of the project in attaining the expected results and achievements.
31. The total length of the report should be a maximum of 20 pages, excluding annexes; additional annexes can provide background and details on specific components of the project evaluated.
32. All drafts and final outputs, including supporting documents, analytical reports and raw data should be provided both in paper copy and in electronic version (both in PDF and MS WORD compatible formats).
33. Ownership of data from the evaluation rests jointly with ACT/EMP and the consultant. The copyright of the evaluation report will rest exclusively with the ILO. Use of the data for publication and other presentations can only be made with the written agreement of ACT/EMP. Key stakeholders can make appropriate use of the evaluation report in line with the original purpose and with appropriate acknowledgement.
34. The final report will be circulated to key stakeholders for their review. Comments from stakeholders will be consolidated by ACT/EMP and provided to the evaluator. In preparing the final report the evaluator should consider these comments, incorporate as appropriate and provide a brief note explaining why any comments might not have been incorporated.

Methodology

35. The evaluation will involve interviews and field visits. The evaluation will start off at ILO Headquarters in Geneva where the evaluator will undertake a desk review of appropriate material, including the project documents, progress reports and outputs of the projects, followed by briefings and interviews with key personnel in ACT/EMP and ACTRAV.
36. Thereafter the evaluator will undertake missions to Cambodia, Moldova and Nepal, where interviews will be conducted with the key officials in the national employers' organizations and other relevant key stakeholders. Focus group discussions or evaluation workshops may be conducted to gauge the views of stakeholders. Visits to several areas on the ground where the projects are operational may also be undertaken, if time allows, in order to obtain first-hand information and perspectives of employers and other project stakeholders.
37. On completion of the evaluation missions, a draft report will be prepared by the evaluator/s. This draft report will be discussed with the responsible officials in ACT/EMP and circulated to key stakeholders (to be determined by ACT/EMP) for their comments and corrections in case of factual errors. When this process of review has been completed, the evaluator will finalize the report and submit to ACT/EMP Headquarters.

Sources of Information

38. Prior to the evaluation the evaluator will receive all relevant project documentation as listed below from ACT/EMP headquarters. This will be supplemented during the missions to the regions by documents provided by the national employer organizations visited. Documents to be reviewed include:

- Project documents
- Annual and Semi-Annual Progress Reports
- Publications, tools and reports produced by the projects.

Additional country-level material, such as studies, training and advocacy materials, will be given to the evaluator/s during the field and ILO-HQ visit.

Management Arrangements:

Work Plan, Timeframe and payment schedule

39. It is suggested that the evaluation be conducted within the period 14 May to 25th June 2012. The TOR can be discussed with the evaluator before the work commences. The final report must be submitted to the ILO no later than 25th June 2012.

40. After the desk review and consultation at ILO HQ in Geneva the evaluator will organize and undertake 3 field missions that will include travel to Moldova (approx. 3 days including travel), Cambodia (approx.. 4 days including travel) and Nepal (approx. 4 days including travel). This plan is based on the assumption that the evaluator will need two full work days in each country.

41. It is proposed that the evaluation follow the timetable below.

- 2 days desk review of the background documents prior to the start of the evaluation
- 1 day for briefing at ILO
- 3 days field mission to Moldova
- 4 days field mission to Cambodia
- 4 days field mission to Nepal
- 7 days for the preparation of the draft report
- 2 days for finalization of report
- Total of around 23 working days

42. The practical arrangements for the missions to the countries will be organised by ACT/EMP Headquarters in collaboration with the partner employers' organisations.

43. Upon completion of the evaluation missions, a draft report will be compiled by the evaluator and submitted for comments to ACT/EMP six weeks after completion of the field missions. The final evaluation report should be submitted to ACT/EMP two weeks upon receipt of ACT/EMP's comments on the draft report.
44. The consultant will receive a lump sum as advance payment to cover travel costs and DSA upon signing of the contract. The second and final instalment will be paid on receipt of the final evaluation report by latest 25th June 2012.

Annex 2: Field visit programmes with list of people meet

Below is the field visit programme for the three countries:

Moldova

Agenda for Mr. Karstein Haarberg

22 – 25 May 2012

Chisinau, Republic of Moldova

Tuesday, 22 May 2012

- | | |
|--------------|---|
| 10:00 | General Extraordinary Meeting of the CNPM

79, Stefan cel Mare street,
MD-2012, Chisinau, Moldova |
| 14:00 | Focus group discussion with stakeholders from the targeted regions

CNPM office
16, M.Cebotari str.

MD-2012, Chisinau, Moldova

Phone: (+373 22) 22-23-01, 22-24-44 |
| 15:00 | Focus group discussion with CNPM staff: Mr. Leonid Cerescu

(Chairman), Mr. Vlad Camisnchi (Head of Department), Ms. Iulia

Drumea (Project Coordinator)

CNPM office
16, M.Cebotari str.,

MD-2012, Chisinau, Moldova

Phone: (+373 22) 22-23-01, 22-24-44 |

Wednesday, 23 May 2012

- | | |
|-------------|----------------------------------|
| 9:00 | Travel to Edinet District |
|-------------|----------------------------------|

Focus group discussion with members of the TCCCB established and/or revitalized under the Project (local employers, trade unions and local public authorities)

Edinet district

Thursday, 24 May 2012

9:00 Interview/ Focus group discussion with the CNSM representatives

129, 31 August str.

MD-2009, Chisinau, Moldova

Phone: (+373 22) 266502

10:30 Interview with Mr. Valeriu Berlinschi (Secretary of the NCCCB)

CNPM office

16, M.Cebotari str.,

MD-2012, Chisinau, Moldova

Phone: (+373 22) 22-23-01, 22-24-44

11:30 Interview with Mr. Sergiu Morari (Head of department, Ministry of Labour, Social Protection and Family)

CNPM office

16, M.Cebotari str.,

MD-2012, Chisinau, Moldova

Phone: (+373 22) 22-23-01, 22-24-44

14:00 Interview with Ms Ala Lipciu (National ILO Coordinator in Moldova)

CNPM office

16, Maria Cebotari street

MD-2012, Chisinau, Moldova

Phone: (+373 22) 222301

Friday, 25 May 2012

9:30 Focus group discussion with CNPM staff: Mr. Leonid Cerescu

(Chairman), Mr. Vlad Camisnchi (Head of Department), Ms. Iulia

Drumea (Project Coordinator) / *(drawing conclusions, sharing views and impressions, etc.)or discussion with CNPM PM, Ms Iulia Drumea*

11:30 **Transfer to airport**

13:00 **Departure**

People met during workshop with Cahul TCCCB:

1. Veaceslav Balanel- Vice president of the district, Chairman of the TCCCB
2. Curjos Ion- President of the Association of Employers in Agriculture, member of the FNPAIA (Federation of Employers in Agriculture and Food Industry)
3. Tamara Susarenco – President of TUs in (the sector of) agriculture and food industry "Agroindsind"
4. Boris Susan- Employer in construction sector
5. Alexandra Balanel- Representative of TUs in Education
6. Anatol Nebunu- Business Center of Cahul
7. Tricolici Aliona- Secretary of the TCCCB
8. Maria Cotorobai- President of the Intersectoral Council of TUs in Cahul, representative of TUs in public service sector
9. Cornelia Prepelita- Head of department of public administration

Cambodia

"PROMOTING THE SOUND INDUSTRIAL RELATION IN CAMBODIA: Strengthening the IR services, outreach and representativeness of CAMFEBA" Project

Evaluation Meetings with CAMFEBA and Stakeholders

Mission Schedule

Date	Time	Activities	Place	Person-in-Charge
	14:50 (PG933)	Arrival	Phnom Penh Intn'l Airport	Airport Taxi

29 May 2012	16:30	Check-in at Hotel	Queen Boutique Hotel (49A, St. 214, Beoung Rieng, Khan Daun Penh, Phnom Penh, Cambodia Tel: +855 23 211 683 Fax: +85523 211 583	Hotel Receptionist
30 May 2012	08:45	Pick-up from hotel	Queen Boutique Hotel (49A, St. 214, Beoung Rieng, Khan Daun Penh, Phnom Penh, Cambodia Tel: +855 23 211 683 Fax: +85523 211 583	Mr. Soum Chamrong (Project Manager)
	09:00-12:00	Meeting with Mr. Soum Chamrong, Project Team & Board of CAMFEBA	CAMFEBA Secretariat #44A, St. 320, BKK III, Phnom Penh.	Mr. Soum Chamrong
	12:00-13:30	Lunch	Tonle Bassac Restaurant	Mr. Soum Chamrong
	14:00-15:30	Meeting with Mr. Yim Serey Vathanak National Project Coordinator of ILO Workers' Education Programme (ILO WEP)	ILO Joint Project Office Phnom Penh Center	Mr. Soum Chamrong
	15:30-16:30	Meeting with Mr. Tun Sophorn ILO National Coordinator	ILO Joint Project Office Phnom Penh Center	Mr. Soum Chamrong

	16:30-17:00	Go to check venue for the workshop on 31 May	InterContinental Hotel Regency Square, 296 Mao Tse Toung Blvd, Phnom Penh 3, Kingdom of Cambodia	Mr. Soum Chamrong
	17:30	Come back to Hotel	Queen Boutique Hotel (49A, St. 214, Beoung Rieng, Khan Daun Penh, Phnom Penh, Cambodia Tel: +855 23 211 683 Fax: +85523 211 583	Mr. Soum Chamrong
	18:30	Dinner	Tonle Bassac Restaurant	Mr. Soum Chamrong
31 May	08:00-12:00	Evaluation Workshop	InterContinental Hotel Regency Square, 296 Mao Tse Toung Blvd, Phnom Penh 3, Kingdom of Cambodia	Mr. Soum Chamrong
	13:30-14:30	Meeting with Mr. Kaing Monika , Business Development Manager of the Garment Manufacturers Association in Cambodia (GMAC)	GMAC Secretariat #175, St. 215, Phnom Penh.	Mr. Soum Chamrong
	15:00-16:00	Meeting with Mr. Koy Tepdaravuth , Director of Department of Labor Dispute, Ministry of Labor and Vocational Training	Ministry of Labor and Vocational Training Russian Federation Blvd.	Mr. Soum Chamrong & Mr. Danh Engkakada (interpreter)
	13:30-	Meeting with Mr. Sok	Arbitration Council	Mr. Soum

	17:30	Lor , Executive Director of the Arbitration Council Foundation (ACF)	Secretariat No. 72, St. 592 (corner of St. 372), Boeung Kak II, Toul Kork,	Chamrong
	Free			
01 June	08:45	Pick-up from hotel	Queen Boutique Hotel (49A, St. 214, Beoung Rieng, Khan Daun Penh, Phnom Penh, Cambodia Tel: +855 23 211 683 Fax: +85523 211 583	Mr. Soum Chamrong
	09:00-12:00	Wrap-up meeting with Mr. Soum Chamrong and Project Team	CAMFEBA Secretariat #44A, St. 320, BKK III, Phnom Penh.	Mr. Soum Chamrong
	12:00	Lunch	Tonle Bassac Restaurant	Mr. Soum Chamrong
	14:00	City Tour	Phnom Penh	Mr. Soum Chamrong
02 June	04:40	Check-out from hotel and travel to airport	Queen Boutique Hotel (49A, St. 214, Beoung Rieng, Khan Daun Penh, Phnom Penh, Cambodia Tel: +855 23 211 683 Fax: +85523 211 583	Hotel Taxi
	6:40 (PG938)	Leaving Phnom Penh	Phnom Penh Intn'l Airport	

Nepal

ILO/ACTEMP Project: Internal Evaluation, 2-7 May 2012, Nepal **Mr. Karstein Haarberg, Consultant**

Programme Schedule

Day and date	Activities	Remarks
Saturday 02 June 2012	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - 12:25 hrs : Arrival to Kathmandu by TG 319 - 15:00 hrs : meeting with Prakash Sharma, Project Coordinator in Hotel Himalaya, Kupandol 	Hotel pick up
Sunday 3 rd June 2012	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - 11:30 hrs : meeting with FNCCI/Employers Council - Mr Y M Shakya and team at FNCCI Office, Teku - 15:00-17:00hrs: meeting with Ms Sakuntala Shrestha and FNCCI/EC training unit 	Prakash will accompany
Monday 4 th June 2012	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - 10:00 hrs : meeting with Mr Jose Assalino, Director and Mr Saloman Rajbanshi, Programme Officer for ILO Office in Nepal - 11:00 hrs: meeting with Mr Narayan Bhattra, Project Coordinator for ACTRAV project - 14:00-17:30 hrs: meetings with beneficiaries such as training participants, enterprise managers and union representatives 	Prakash will accompany
Tuesday 5 th June 2012	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - 10:00-14:00 hrs: visit in district chamber in Bhaktapur or Lalitpur - 14:00-17:30 hrs : meeting with enterprises in Kathmandu and Lalitpur 	Prakash will accompany
Wednesday 6 th 2012	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - 09:00-13:00hrs : Conduct half day consultation workshop for internal evaluation of the project in Hotel Himalaya - 15:00-17: 00 hrs: meeting with Mr Gotabaya Dasanayaka, Specialist /ILO/ACTEMP Delhi 	Mr Gotabaya Dasanayaka will join from Delhi
Thursday 7 th June 2012	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - 13:30 hrs: departure from Kathmandu by TG 320 	Hotel drop-off

List of the Participants

Internal Evaluation for the Project -ILO/ACTEMP

Kathmandu, Nepal (6th June 2012)

SN	Name	Address
1.	Mr Pashupati Murarka Chairperson, Employers Council	FNCCI Kathmandu
2.	Mr Manish Agrawal Vice- chairperson, Employers Council	FNCCI Kathmandu
3.	Dr Hemant Dawadi DG- FNCCI	FNCCI Kathmandu
4.	Mr Yagyaman Shakya Deputy Director, ENCCI/EC	FNCCI Kathmandu
5.	Mr Roman Awick Labour Expert, FNCCI/EC	FNCCI Kathmandu
6.	Mr Hansaram Pandey Director, FNCCI	FNCCI Kathmandu
7.	Ms Shakuntala Shrestha Training Unit	FNCCI Kathmandu
8.	Mr Ishowar Shrestha Consultant for database	Tribhuwan University
9.	Ms Anjana Tamrakar Consultant for Gender Policy	Kathmandu
10.	Mr Somnath adhikari	Morang Chamber
11.	The Representative	Dharan Chamber
12.	Mr Bibek Manandhar	Makwanpur Chamber
13.	The Representative	Pokhara Chamber
14.	The Representative	Bhairawa Chamber
15.	Mr Rasik Pradhan	Ratnanagr
16.	Mr Sunil Sharma	Nepalgunj Chamber
17.	Mr Sanu Raja Silpakar	Lalitpur Chamber
18.	Mr Rajuman Bajrachanrya	Bhaktapur Chamber
19.	Mr Udaya	Garment Association
20.	Mr Dharma raj Shakya	Handicraft Association (FHAN)
21.	The Representative	Yati Carpet
22.	The Representative	Radhan Engineering

Annex 3: List of documents reviewed

Moldova

CNPM: "End of Project Report - Enhanced Social Dialogue for Better Governance of the Labour Market in the Republic of Moldova"

CNPM Final Work Plan

CNPM: "Semi-Annual Progress Report Enhanced Social Dialogue for Better Governance of the Labour Market in the Republic of Moldova"

General Extraordinary Meeting of the CNPM held on 22 May, 2012: "Economic relaunch through constructive dialogue", Speeches by Mr. Leonid Cerescu – President of the CNPM, Mr. Alexandu Susari – Vice president of the CNPM, President of the FNPAIA, Mr. Andrei Strah, Foreign Investors Association, CNPM member.

The National Confederation of Employers of the Republic of Moldova: "Project Proposal on Enhancing social dialogue for better governance of the labour market in Moldova"

MOLDOVA: DECENT WORK COUNTRY PROGRAMME DOCUMENT 2012 – 2015

Report on the activity of the local expert Dorin Vaculovschi, external collaborator for the International Labour Organization under the terms of reference of project M.280.12.400.884/7378813/1406/054, M.280.12.400.884/7378814/1406/054

Cambodia

CAMFEBA: "Promoting the sound industrial relations in Cambodia through the enhancement of labor dispute prevention and resolution mechanism focusing on strengthening the roles of the Arbitration Council and other industrial actors and productivity improvement in the hotel sector", Project budget

CAMFEBA: "Annual Progress Report 2011 PROMOTING THE SOUND INDUSTRIAL RELATION IN CAMBODIA: Strengthening the IR services, outreach and representativeness of CAMFEBA".

ILO Bureau of Employers' Activities (ACT/EMP) in collaboration with the Cambodian Federation of Employers and Business Associations (CAMFEBA): Project On "PROMOTING THE SOUND INDUSTRIAL RELATIONS IN CAMBODIA: Strengthening the IR services, outreach and representativeness of CAMFEBA", Project proposal document.

ILO "THE STATISTICS OF TRADE UNIONS AND LABOUR ASSOCIATIONS IN CAMBODIA"

ILO "Cambodian Trade Unions and Labour Associations", Chart

Nepal

FNCCI: "FINAL REPORT Project Title: Employers Capacity Building for Effective Social Dialogue Period Covered: April 2011 - March 2012

FNCCI: "Final Work Plan Employers Capacity Building for Effective Social Dialogue"

FNCCI PowerPoint-Presentation: Introduction to FNCCI

FNCCI: PowerPoint Presentation: "ILO supported activities 2008-2012 Achievements".

FNCCI: "Project Proposal on Capacity Building of Employers for Effective Social Dialogue 2011"

FNCCI: "SEMI-ANNUAL PROGRESS REPORT Project Title: Employers Capacity Building for Effective Social Dialogue, Period Covered: April - June 2011".

ILO-ACTEMP/ FNCCI PPROJECT 2011 (NEPAL) Project Implementing Status