



ILO EVALUATION

- **Evaluation Title:** Mid-Term Evaluation for the Regional Workers' Literacy Project: "Strengthening of Workers' Organizations in the Arab Countries through Economic, Social and Legal Literacy".
- **ILO TC/SYMBOL:** RAB/11/02/USA
- **Type of Evaluation :** Midterm Internal Evaluation
- **Country(ies) :** Bahrain, Lebanon, Jordan, Occupied Palestinian Territories, Oman, Yemen
- **Date of the evaluation:** 17-23 June 2014
- **Name of consultant(s):** Mr. Niels Enevoldsen
- **ILO Administrative Office:** ROAS
- **ILO Technical Backstopping Office:** ACTRAV
- **Date project ends:** May 2015
- **Donor country and budget US\$: USA and ILO (cost sharing) 2,924, 750 USD (total)**
- **For Joint Evaluations:**
- **Evaluation Manager:** Mr Abid Briki with technical support provided by Regional M&E Advisor
- **Evaluation Budget:** 6,258.00 USD
- **Key Words:** Workers, trade unions, women, youth, migrant workers, domestic workers

- **This evaluation has been conducted according to ILO's evaluation policies and procedures. It has not been professionally edited, but has undergone quality control by the ILO Evaluation Unit.**

Table of Contents

Table of Contents.....	3
List of Appendices.....	3
Executive Summary.....	4
List of Acronyms and Abbreviations.....	4
1 Project Background	11
2 Evaluation Background	13
3 Methodology.....	14
4 Evaluation Findings.....	15
4.1 Relevance	15
4.2 Effectiveness	17
4.3 Efficiency	22
4.4 Sustainability	23
4.5 Preliminary impact	23
5 Conclusions	24
6 Important lessons learned and emerging good practices	25
7 Recommendations.....	26
8 Appendices.....	27

List of Appendices

- Annex I, Terms of reference
- Annex II, Lessons learned
- Annex III Good practices
- Annex IV, List of interviewees
- Annex V, List of activities
- Annex VI, List of activities, gender segregated
- Annex VII, List of publications
- Annex VIII, Monitoring and evaluation matrix

List of Acronyms and Abbreviations

ACTRAV, ILO Bureau for Workers' Activities

BLUFF, Bahrain Labour Union Free Federation

C87, ILO convention concerning Freedom of Association and Protection of the Right to Organise

C98, ILO convention concerning Application of the Principles of the Right to Organise and to Bargain Collectively

C111, ILO convention concerning Discrimination in Respect of Employment and Occupation

CGTL, Confédération Générale des Travailleurs au Liban

DWCPs, ILO Decent Work Country Programmes

DWTST, ILO Decent Work Support Team

FENASOL, Fédération Nationale des Syndicats des Ouvriers et des Employés au Liban

FITUJ, Federation of Independent Trade Unions, Jordan

GFBTU, General Federation of Bahrain Trade Unions

GFJTU, General federation of Jordanian Trade Unions

GFOTU, General Federation of Omani Trade Unions

GFYTU, General Federation of Yemeni Trade Unions

ICATU, International Confederation of Arab Trade Unions

ITUC-AR, International Trade Union Confederation Arab Region

KTUF, Kuwait Trade Union federation

MENA countries, Middle East and North Africa

OPT, Occupied Palestinian Territories

PGFTU, Palestinian General Federation of Trade Unions

Executive Summary

Project Background and context

The project, "Strengthening Workers' Organizations in Arab countries through Economic, Social and Legal Literacy", was designed as a response to the waves of popular movements and protests that swept the Arab Region in 2011.

The overall project objective is to develop the capacity of workers' organizations in the Arab region to participate effectively in policy debates, influence public decisions, and defend workers' rights and interests. The immediate objectives of the project are:

- Strengthening the institutional capacity of workers' organizations (immediate objective 1).
- Strengthening the technical capacity of workers' organizations (immediate objective 2).

On the institutional level, the project aims at supporting workers' organizations in enhancing their internal democracy and independence. Concerning strengthening the technical capacity, the project will support workers' organizations through policy advice, production of knowledge materials and conducting workshops on priority issues for the labour movement.

The direct beneficiaries of the project include women, men, young, migrants, and unorganized workers in the formal and informal economies, as well as leaders and members of independent, free, and representative workers' organizations committed to social justice and democracy in the eight project countries. Where no such workers' organizations exist, support will be provided for encouraging and enabling their establishment through training and technical advice on financial autonomy and management training. The project was planned to focus on Bahrain, Oman and Yemen. It would also cover Lebanon, Kuwait, Qatar, Saudi Arabia, Syria, Jordan and the United Arab Emirates (UAE).

The project was designed for a duration of 24 months with a budget of 2,210,000 USD co-financed by the US State Department (2,000,000 USD) and the ILO (210,000 USD).

The project was scheduled to end in May 2014; however, due to the activities being implemented in a reduced number of project countries, the savings facilitated the donor's acceptance to extend the project for an additional 12 months period with supplementary funds provided by the ILO. Thus the project will come to an end in May 2015.

While the objectives of the project extension remain basically the same, the activities aim at strengthening achievements of the first 24 months and will be concentrated on the countries and organizations that have already received project support. The extension also envisages activities in Yemen with informal workers.

Purpose, scope and clients of the evaluation

The purpose of the mid-term evaluation is to enable project staff, constituents and other relevant stakeholders to assess the progress in delivery of project outcomes and based on this assessment to take decisions regarding future intervention logic and emphasis of the project during its remaining time. The clients of the evaluation were expected to include: the ILO Regional Office for Arab States (Beirut, including the overall project manager (CTA), the project team (NOs), the technical backstopping staff (senior workers' specialists),

members of the steering committee, the constituents, and the donor. According to the Terms of Reference (APPENDIX I) the Mid-term evaluation is expected to assess five evaluation criteria:

- Relevance
- Effectiveness
- Efficiency
- Sustainability
- Preliminary impact

Methodology

As stipulated in the terms of reference, the evaluation employed two methodologies: document review and key informant interviews.

Document review: the evaluator familiarized himself with the project through a review of relevant documents. The documents included: Project Document, work plans, progress reports, workshop reports and mission reports. In addition, a number of selected project related documents were also made available to the evaluator.

Key informant interviews: During the mission to Beirut the evaluator carried out a number of interviews with key informants. The evaluator also participated in a preparatory regional workshop in Beirut on trade union organizing on 22 and 23 May 2014. This provided the evaluator with the opportunity to meet with representatives of beneficiaries and partner workers' organizations.

Limitations: Although there were some measurable results in the increase of the number of affiliates and members in Oman and Lebanon, a more systematic data collection with regard to membership figures and collected union dues would have been useful to measure impact.

In scrutinizing the available project documentation and in the interviews with the various stakeholders, the evaluator has sought to obtain answers to the Terms of Reference's detailed key evaluation questions related to the five evaluation criteria.

Main findings and conclusions

The project was relevant and timely from the outset as it built on two important experiences from the Arab Spring: Firstly, countries with an active trade union movement, characterized by democracy and independence, even in relative terms, witnessed trade unions being in the forefront of the societal and popular democratic movements that demanded changes. Secondly, and in contrast, countries where the trade union movements were government controlled, they helped quell popular uprising. This created scope for establishing new alternative trade unions where the "historic" unions were not willing to embrace change for democracy and independence. Thus new trade unions structures were formed in Jordan and Lebanon.

However, these new structures were under pressure from the unreformed trade unions as well as the authorities that saw that their grip on workers' organizations slipping away. In

addition, the new embryonic unions were in need of assistance in all areas: internal organization, administration, dealings with authorities, capacity building on socio-economic issues, regional and international affiliations, etc.

The project was also timely in the sense that existing unions that had participated in the uprisings came under strong pressure from the authorities, as in Bahrain. Assistance from an international authority like the ILO was therefore both timely and relevant.

The newly established trade union movement in Oman was still at a very embryonic stage and needed assistance in nearly all areas related to normal trade union functions.

In the Occupied Palestinian Territories (OPT), the Palestinian trade unions (PGFTU) continued to suffer from permanent restrictions in free movements and had a number of conflicts with the Palestinian Authorities on legislation, socio-economic issues and the Authorities' support for rival unions.

The project document also envisages including in Syria, Kuwait, Qatar, Saudi Arabia, and the United Arab Emirates in project activities. The crisis situation in Syria has made it impossible for trade unions to function normally and travel to the country has been severely restricted

and thus Syria has not been involved in project activities. The necessary developments and minimum requirements to work with trade union structures, even embryonic ones, were not present and did not emerge in the other countries. Thus the project concentrated on activities in Bahrain, Jordan, Lebanon, the Occupied Palestinian Territories, Oman and on a limited scale Yemen.

The declared strategy for the project was to promote and support change in the sense that where existing organizations were compromised and not willing to embrace internal democracy, diversity and independence, the project would provide assistance to workers in establishing alternative trade unions. This was a major break with previous international, ILO included, support in the Arab region to unions often too cosy with, if not the extended arms of governments and/or political parties, and it proved to be a correct one. However, at the same time developments were carefully monitored in the "historic" unions with a view to step in with assistance should they wish to reform.

In general, the major expected **outputs** and **outcomes** (Appendix V, a matrix produced by the project staff with evaluator's comments) have by and large been produced and achieved even though the number of project countries was reduced. However, the evaluation notes that national training activities conducted by project trained trainers fall short of the targets set for the project's first phase and that the training materials to be used by the trainers were produced and printed rather late in the project implementation. Instead, the project placed in its first phase emphasis on institutional strengthening. This shift was justified by the results of the country needs assessments which showed that in most project countries the trade union movement or the alternative structures were still at a nascent stage that needed to be further strengthened. However, the 12 months' extension document includes an increased number of national training activities.

Through actively promoting regional trade union cooperation among bona fide trade unions that were committed to freedom of association, the right to collective bargaining, human rights, women workers' rights and migrant workers' rights, the project played an important role in supporting the efforts to establish an **independent Arab trade union structure**, the

ITUC-Arab Region. A founding congress of the ITUC-AR is expected to take place in September 2014.

The project provided assistance to the GFBTU, **Bahrain**, in holding its second General Congress at a time of social and political turmoil. This support came at a crucial time in GFBTU's conflict with the government. Tensions have, however, eased somewhat following an ILO high level intervention and the signature of a tripartite agreement including the GBFTU.

The project worked to foster an enabling environment for freedom of association and the right to collective bargaining in **Jordan**. The majority of activities have been carried out in collaboration with the Federation of Independent Trade Unions in Jordan (FITUJ). Notably the project supported and assisted FITUJ in establishing itself as a national centre, although not yet recognized by the government, and the holding of the organization's first congress.

In **Lebanon** the project supported and furthered the embryonic initiatives, led by FENASOL and the Trade Union Coordination Committee (public servants and public and private school teachers), to build a new independent national centre. FENASOL is a confederation of Lebanese trade unions previously affiliated to CGTL which recently have split from the latter.

Cooperation with and monitoring activities of the PGFTU, **Occupied Palestinian Territories**, have for obvious reasons been difficult. However, the project contributed to PGFTU involvement in minimum wage setting discussions which also led to signing a bipartite agreement with the Federation of Palestinian Chambers of Commerce. The project also supported the PGFTU in holding its first unified executive committee meeting for many years (outside the OPT).

Building on previous efforts, including those of the ILO, to establish bona fide trade unions in **Oman**, the project helped the General Federation of Oman Trade Unions (GFOTU) to consolidate and further develop its structures and capacity. Through project advice and assistance, the GFOTU was able to expand its representation in enterprises to reach 180 company-based trade unions, up from 46 when the project commenced. The project also supported the GFOTU in convening its first General Congress in February 2014.

Some tentative activities were undertaken in **Yemen** with the GFYTU. However, the security situation in the country is not favourable or and it is not improving for the time being. In addition, the GFYTU does not seem to be on the threshold to change from being basically government controlled. Furthermore, it is split between those who want strong links continued links to ICATU and those who want to join the new ITUC-AR.

As an integral part of promoting its core objectives, the project encouraged trade unions across the region to include the ratification and observation of C87 and C98 as priority issues and it assisted workers' organizations in Jordan, Lebanon and Bahrain in using ILO supervisory mechanisms with a view to putting an end to violations of basic workers' rights, particularly regarding non-observance of C87, C98 and C111.

The evaluation found that the project is, through consistent support to developing democratic and independent trade union structures, moving well towards achieving the **project's overall objective**: To develop the capacity of workers' organizations in the Arab region to participate effectively in policy debates, influence public decisions, and defend

workers' rights and interests. This should, of course, be seen within the context of the limited number of countries and organizations involved in project activities.

With regard to the project's **immediate objectives**: "Strengthening the institutional capacity of workers' organizations" (immediate objective 1) and "Strengthening the technical capacity of workers' organizations" (immediate objective 2), it is noted that in general important progress is being made. New alternative democratic and independent trade union structures have been strengthened in Lebanon and Jordan. Existing trade union centres in Bahrain and Oman have been consolidated through improving their internal structures in democratic direction and by holding congresses/meetings as required by constitution. Affiliation have increased considerably in Oman and to some degree in Lebanon. Also unions have been using the ILO supervisory mechanisms and in some cases forging links with relevant NGOs.

However, the evaluation finds that there is room for improvements which may also serve as recommendations for the last project phase:

- Even if reliable **statistics** are not easily available from trade unions in the region, e.g. membership figures and collected union fees, there does not seem to be systematic efforts from the project to obtain such statistics. This could have been useful to measure project impact over the project duration being evaluated.
- Although it is recognized that women membership is low in the unions and that there are particular cultural and social obstacles in the region for a fair women participation, the evaluation finds that, except from the **gender** specific workshops, the female participation is low (less than 20%) in the general training activities.
- It is also noted that the participation of **young people** under 30 years of age in project activities is 12% only.

In general, it was found that funds have been utilized **efficiently** and project staff actually developed some of the studies and training materials that originally were envisaged to be done by external collaborators thus saving funds.

Certain governments' (Bahrain and Kuwait) refusal of issuing visas to backstopping workers' specialists, and in some cases to project staff, when travelling on project business made it difficult to implement and monitor activities in the concerned countries. In addition to being a problem for the project, it is also a serious matter of principle when the ILO cannot provide the necessary services to one of its constituents.

The Syria crisis, although not affecting the project implementation directly, affects the political and economic situation in Jordan and Lebanon seriously and thus indirectly the project implementation in these two countries since normal trade union functions are more difficult in an economy under pressure and with an increased labour supply.

Regarding **sustainability**, it cannot be expected that a project that has been fully operational for 24 months only can turn around a situation that have existed for more than 40 years. Although important achievements have been made and the process of change has been put on rails, the unions involved in the project will undoubtedly need continued support, even beyond the 12 months project extension.

In **conclusion**, the evaluation finds that the project came very timely in the immediate aftermath of the uprisings in the Arab Spring and events confirmed the validity of the project strategy to support change through supporting emerging new trade union structures where "historic" unions were not willing to embrace people's desire for democracy and independence.

It was also noted that the "old historic" trade unions became visibly nervous of the project's impact and that they may be threatened by the fact that alternative democratic and independent structures were possible. This created internal discussions in the "old" unions which might result in some unions starting to reform and/or affiliates leaving for the alternative unions. This will further strengthen the development of democratic and independent unions in the region.

The evaluation also found that while certain aspects of the project implementation can be improved and should be considered for the remainder of the project, it is the general conclusion that the project has done well under difficult circumstances and set in motion an important process of trade unions being more democratic and independent and better equipped to protect and further their members interests

Recommendations

Although the below summary of recommendations are mainly aiming at the remainder of the project, some of them may go beyond the present project:

- 1) The project should concentrate human and financial resources on consolidating and further develop what have been achieved so far.
- 2) The project should continue to concentrate activities with trade unions that already, or are willing to, embrace internal democracy, diversity and independence, both existing and alternative ones.
- 3) Special attention should be given to strengthen the nascent trade union movement in Oman.
- 4) The project should continue to assist the new ITUC-Arab Region regional trade union structure still under construction, by close collaboration in certain activity areas.
- 5) Given the security situation in Yemen as well as the internal instability in the General Federation of Yemeni Trade Unions, GFYTU, activities in that country should be on a limited scale with the possibility to expand should the situation change.
- 6) The project should as soon as possible activate the trained trainers and assist in establishing workers' education structures and activities within the partner unions.
- 7) Building upon already acquired experiences the project should continue to assist trade unions in approaching unorganized groups such as migrants, domestic and informal sector workers.

- 8) Systematic efforts to improve women and young workers' participation in project activities should be stepped up.
- 9) Systematic data collection should take place and be used for targeted and adapted project activities.
- 10) A precise plan for distribution of project studies and briefs should be developed and materials be made available for a wider audience.
- 11) Considerations should already at this stage be given to a new project that builds on the achievements of this one.

Important lessons learned and emerging good practices

Main lesson learned:

Breaking with previous ways of supporting trade unions in the region created a new momentum in developing democratic and independent trade unions.

Emerging good practice:

The establishment of the Labor Education and Research Network for the Arab Region (in progress) that aims at creating an interface between Arab trade unions and a resource base of NGO and civil society actors.

1 Project Background

The project, "Strengthening Workers' Organizations in Arab countries through Economic, Social and Legal Literacy", was designed as a response to the waves of popular movements and protests that swept the Arab Region in 2011 which were supported by workers and in some countries trade unions. The project took into consideration the lessons learned from the Arab Spring that showed that in countries where the trade unions were active and characterized by democracy and independence, even in relative terms, trade unions took a leading role and provided an umbrella for the societal and popular democratic movements. In contrast, in countries where the trade union movement was compromised, subordinated and dependent, witnessed the manipulation of union structures to become tools for oppressive control authorities. This created the conditions for the promotion of new independent trade unions.

In fact, the Arab uprisings showed that the greater the deficits in real and genuine participation of workers, the less responsive were the policies and priorities in meeting people's needs and aspirations. This stark contrast highlighted the powerful potential of unionism – and brought it forward as a key development priority. The ongoing events in the region confirmed that in the absence of genuine mechanisms for social dialogue with inclusive, equitable and independent workers' representation, workers and people at large

resorted to extra-institutional channels and actions to voice their demands, rights and interests.

The overall project objective is to develop the capacity of workers' organizations in the Arab region to participate effectively in policy debates, influence public decisions, and defend workers' rights and interests. The immediate objectives of the project are:

- Strengthening the institutional capacity of workers' organizations (immediate objective 1).
- Strengthening the technical capacity of workers' organizations (immediate objective 2).

On the institutional level, the project aims at supporting workers' organizations in enhancing their internal democracy and independence through various methods, ranging from reforming internal by-laws, using ILO supervisory mechanisms, expanding outreach for workers and holding General Congresses. Concerning strengthening the technical capacity, the project will support workers' organizations through policy advice, production of knowledge materials and conducting workshops on priority issues for the labour movement.

The direct beneficiaries of the project include women, men, young, migrants, and unorganized workers in the formal and informal economies, as well as leaders and members of independent, free, and representative workers' organizations committed to social justice and democracy in the eight project countries. Where no such workers' organizations exist, support will be provided for encouraging and enabling their establishment through training and technical advice on financial autonomy and management training. A key emphasis in planning and delivery will be the inclusion of the right to organize and collective bargain. The project was planned to focus on Bahrain, Oman and Yemen. It would also cover Lebanon, Kuwait, Qatar, Saudi Arabia, Syria, Jordan and the United Arab Emirates (UAE).

The project was designed for a duration of 24 months with a budget of 2,210,000 USD co-financed by the US State Department (2,000,000 USD) and the ILO (210,000 USD).

Based at the ILO Regional Office in Beirut, a project team consisting of a CTA, National officers and an administrative secretary was responsible for the day-to-day management of the project under the supervision of the regional Workers' Specialist. Further technical assistance was to be provided by the Bureau for Workers' Activities, ACTRAV, and its Senior Workers' Specialist at the ILO Geneva. A Project Steering Committee including representatives from ACTRAV and partner organizations providing funds and technical assistance.

In addition to co-funding the project and the technical supervision by ACTRAV, the ILO would provide administrative support from the ILO Regional Office as well as technical inputs from the Decent Work Support Team, DWTST, based in Beirut, as required.

Based at the ILO Regional Office for the Arab States (ROAS) in Beirut, a project team consisting of a Chief Technical Advisor (CTA), National officers and an administrative secretary was responsible for the day-to-day management of the project under the supervision of the Senior Regional Workers' Specialist. Further technical assistance was to be provided by the Bureau for Workers' Activities, ACTRAV, and its Senior Workers' Specialist at the ILO Geneva. The project also includes a Steering Committee including

representatives from ACTRAV and partner organizations providing funds and technical assistance. In addition to co-funding the project and the technical supervision by ACTRAV, the ILO ROAS would provide administrative support as well as technical inputs from the Decent Work Support Team based in Beirut, as required.

Following approval by the donor, the project started in September 2011 with some activities, although not yet staffed, under the supervision of the regional workers' specialist. Project staff was not recruited until April 2012 when actual implementation took off.

The project was scheduled to end in May 2014, however due to the activities being implemented in a reduced number of project countries, the savings facilitated the donor's acceptance to extend the project for an additional 12 months with supplementary funds provided by the ILO. Thus the project will come to an end in May 2015.

While the objectives of the project extension remain basically the same, the activities aim at strengthening achievements of the first 24 months and will be concentrated on the countries and organizations that have already received project support. The extension also envisages activities in Yemen with informal workers.

2 Evaluation Background

The project document stipulates an Internal Evaluation in month 12 and a Final Independent Evaluation in month 23. However, since the project was extended for 12 months, the present Internal Mid-Term Evaluation is conducted at month 14, and the Final Independent Evaluation will be carried out by the end of the project.

The purpose of the mid-term evaluation is to enable project staff, constituents and other relevant stakeholders to assess the progress in delivery of project outcomes and based on this assessment to take decisions regarding future intervention logic and emphasis of the project during its remaining time. The clients of the evaluation were expected to include: the ILO Regional Office for Arab States (Beirut, including the overall project manager (CTA), the project team (NOs), the technical backstopping staff (senior workers' specialists), members of the steering committee, the constituents, and the donor. The evaluation will take place from 19 of May to 1st of June 2014. The scope of the evaluation in terms of operational area will be Beirut, and upon availability of resources, it will include selected countries.

The Mid-term evaluation is expected to assess five evaluation criteria as outline below (Terms of Reference, APPENDIX I):

- Relevance
- Effectiveness
- Efficiency
- Sustainability
- Preliminary impact

The evaluation took place as follows: two working days of desk review, and four working days in Beirut (20-23 May), followed by report writing. Thus Lebanon was the only country visited in the evaluation; however, a regional project workshop on trade union organizing taking place in Beirut at the same time as the evaluator's presence, allowed for an evaluation session with the evaluator and project regional beneficiary organizations. In Beirut, meetings were held with project staff, the workers' specialists based in Beirut and ACTRAV Geneva, the Director of the ILO Regional Office, the Director of the Decent Work Team and Depute Regional Director, the Regional Monitoring and Evaluation Advisor, the Chief of the Regional Programming Services, the Regional Specialist on Gender Equality, the National Coordinator for the project on Promoting the Rights of Women Domestic Workers in Lebanon, Administrative Officers at the ILO Office, representatives of the Arab NGO Network Development, and representatives of the Confédération Générale des Travailleurs au Liban, CGTL. The list of interviewees can be found in APPENDIX IV.

3 Methodology

As stipulated in the terms of reference, the evaluation employed two methodologies: document reviews and key informant interviews.

Document review: the evaluator familiarized himself with the project through a review of relevant documents. The documents included: Project Document, work plans, progress reports, workshop reports and mission reports. In addition, a number of selected project related documents were also made available to the evaluator.

Key informant interviews: During the mission to Beirut the evaluator carried out a number of interviews with key informants. The evaluator also participated in a preparatory regional workshop in Beirut on trade union organizing on 22 and 23 May 2014. This provided the evaluator with the opportunity to meet with representatives of partner workers' organization who received active support from the project.

In scrutinizing the available project documentation and in the interviews with the various stakeholders, the evaluator has sought to obtain answers to the Terms of Reference's detailed key evaluation questions related to the five evaluation criteria:

- Relevance
- Effectiveness
- Efficiency
- Sustainability
- Preliminary impact

There were few or no data available with regard to developments in membership figures and collected union fees. Such data could have been useful to measure project impact in certain areas over the project duration.

ILO Evaluation guidance materials and checklists were also made available to the evaluator. These materials have guided the evaluation as appropriate.

It could be argued that a longer mission to Beirut and visit to all project countries/organizations would have provided the evaluator with more comprehensive and

deeper insight in the project performance and impact. However, this being a mid-term evaluation and therefore more limited in scope than a final independent evaluation, the duration and arrangements seem about right. Also, taken the limited resources available for the remainder of the project into consideration, a mid-term evaluation should not be too costly.

4 Evaluation Findings

4.1 Relevance

When the project was designed, two important experiences had been observed: Firstly, countries with an active trade union movement, characterized by democracy and independence, even in relative terms, witnessed trade unions being in the forefront of the societal and popular democratic movements that demanded changes. Secondly, and in contrast, countries where the trade union movements were government controlled they helped quell popular uprising.

The greater the deficits in real and genuine participation of workers in trade unions and thus the lack of responsiveness to people's priorities, needs and aspirations, the greater was the need and willingness to create alternative structures and this paved the way for establishing new independent trade unions. However, these new structures were under pressure from the "historic" unreformed trade unions as well as the authorities that saw that their grip on workers' organizations slipping away. In addition, the new embryonic unions were in need of assistance in all areas: internal organization, administration, dealings with authorities, capacity building on socio-economic issues, regional and international affiliations, etc.

The project was therefore relevant and timely from the outset. It helped develop the new emerging independent trade union structures in Lebanon Fédération Nationale des Syndicats des Ouvriers et des Employés au Liban (FENASOL) and in Jordan (FITUJ).

In Bahrain, the independent trade union movement (GBFTU) had in connection with the massive protests and demands for democracy come under enormous pressure from the authorities, which, among other things, laid-off around 4,000 of its members and established government controlled unions (BLUFF). Assistance to the GBFTU in that difficult situation from an international authority like the ILO was therefore both timely and necessary.

In connection with the US Trade Agreements with certain Gulf states, Oman had changed labour legislation and allowed for workers to organize in trade unions. This was further supported by a US funded project that aimed at Promoting Fundamental Principles and Rights-at-Work and Social Dialogue. However, the project came to an end in 2008 and the trade union movement in Oman (GFOTU) was still at a very embryonic stage and needed assistance in nearly all areas related to normal trade union functions.

In the Occupied Palestinian Territories (OPT), the Palestinian trade unions (PGFTU) continued to suffer from permanent restrictions in free movements and had a number of conflicts with the Palestinian Authorities on legislation, socio-economic issues and the Authorities' support for rival unions.

The Yemeni trade unions (GFYTU) have a long history and although substantial assistance had been provided over the years the unions were still in need for further help. The problem, however, was that GFYTU was neither democratic nor independent in the proper sense, but it was hoped that the uprisings that swept Yemen in 2011 would also bring changes to the trade union movement.

The project document also envisages including Kuwait, Qatar, Saudi Arabia, and the United Arab Emirates in project activities. The rationale behind this is that the project should be prepared for the possibility of changes in these countries that would allow for independent trade unions to emerge.

The declared strategy for the project was to promote and support change in the sense that where existing organizations were compromised and not willing to embrace internal democracy, diversity and independence, the project would provide assistance to workers in establishing alternative trade unions. This was a major break with previous international, ILO included, support in the Arab region to unions often too cosy with, if not the extended arms of governments and/or political parties. Previously, workers' assistance programmes attempted to introduce change by providing training to union leaders in the hope that they in turn would initiate reforms in the unions in a democratic and independent direction. When this failed in most cases, emphasis was placed on mass training of rank-and-file members as well as local branch and affiliate leaders, expecting that change gradually would come from pressure from "below". Again in the vast majority of cases this did not happen. Given the static trade union situation in most of the project countries, the change in strategy by this project, and taking advantage of the Arab Spring, to work with alternative unions was therefore logic and fully justified.

The project was also timely with regard to developments in regional trade union structures. The International Trade Union Confederation, ITUC, was considering to establish a regional structure, the ITUC-Arab Region (ITUC-AR), as a democratic alternative to the International Confederation of Arab Trade Unions, ICATU. Most ICATU affiliates actually opposed the uprisings in the Arab Spring and thus completely lost the opportunity to be part of the new democratic independent movement. Furthermore, they forged alliances with political and religious movements and the World Federation of Trade Unions, WFTU, whose membership is mainly made up of trade union centres that are neither democratic nor independent.

The ILO Regional Office sums up decent work as the aspirations of people in their working lives – their aspirations for opportunity and income; rights, voice and recognition; family stability and personal development; and fairness and gender equality. The project under review aims at developing the capacity of workers' organizations in the Arab region to participate effectively in policy debates, influence public decisions, and defend workers' rights and interests. Thus the project supported directly the ILO Decent Work Country Programmes (DWCPs) as well as Fundamental Rights and Principles at Work.

The project is the only ILO project in the region that provides direct assistance to ILO's worker constituents and thus it complements and reinforces other ILO activities and programmes in the region that provide assistance on a tripartite basis and/or to specific groups within the constituents.

In addition to responding to the general trade union needs described earlier in this section of the report, the project based its activities in each country on country needs assessments

that resulted in action plans (except in Bahrain and Oman where consultations with trade union leadership replaced the needs assessments) developed early in project implementation.

In order to help improve women participation in trade union activities in the region, gender equality concerns are dealt with in the project document by designing women as a special target group as well as aiming at securing gender equality in project activities.

4.2 Effectiveness

As previously mentioned in this report, the project document envisages to include workers' organizations in Bahrain, Oman and Yemen. It would also cover Lebanon, Kuwait, Qatar, Saudi Arabia, Syria, Jordan and the United Arab Emirates (UAE).

The situation in Syria makes it virtually impossible to travel to that country ,let alone implementing activities, thus the country has not been involved in project activities. The necessary developments and minimum requirements to work with trade union structures, even embryonic ones, were not present in the United Arab Emirates. At a very early stage the project endeavoured to turn workers' committees in Saudi Arabia into real trade unions which, however, was turned down by the Saudi authorities. The project attempted to work with the unions in Kuwait (KTUF), however, they were not at all interested in reforming and even blocked visa issuing for project staff on one occasion and cancelled a project mission on another. Even in Qatar, which is under a certain international pressure to improve working conditions and to facilitate basic rights due to the world football cup to be held in 2022, developments are slow and the government has so far not been serious in allowing even a minimum of genuine trade union activities. Thus the project concentrated on activities in Bahrain, Jordan, Lebanon, the Occupied Palestinian Territories, Oman and on a limited scale Yemen.

With regard to the delivery/achievements of the expected outputs/outcomes a matrix produced by the project staff is appended to this report as Appendix V. After scrutinizing all relevant reports and interviewing representatives from the participating trade unions, the evaluator has verified to the extent possible the information provided and added his comments in the row: Data Disaggregation in APPENDIX V.

It is in particular noted that national training activities conducted by project trained trainers fall short of the targets set for the project's first phase. This has been explained by the necessity to shift emphasis to institutional strengthening of the emerging alternative structures in the project's first phase. The change in strategy and emphasis was based on the need assessments carried out in each country. However, the 12 months' extension document includes an increased number of national training activities. For sustainability purposes discussed later in the report, the evaluator stresses the importance of proper project registration of the trained trainers' competences, of their national activities and project preparedness to provide support through advice and materials.

Recognizing that many trade unions for a variety of reasons are not "attractive" to many unorganized or under-organized groups of workers such as women, young, migrants, domestic and informal workers, the project would reach out to NGOs and civil society in general with a view to connect to these groups and offer the protection being organized in a

trade union might offer. In addition, NGOs and civil society could provide valuable expertise in unfamiliar areas to trade unions.

Although the project has been instrumental in making connection between FENASOL and the ILO project on Promoting the Rights of Women Domestic Workers in Lebanon, there is still a long way to go before unions are serious about and capable of organizing migrants and domestic workers (who are mainly migrants as well) with the exception of Bahrain maybe. It is recognized, however, that in most countries, the status of migrants, including their right to organize, is extremely sensitive which does not facilitate the task.

The stage of the development of the Labour Education and Research Network for the Arab Region, that should facilitate contacts between unions and civil society/NGOs, seems to be somewhat unclear. Although a list of 38 names exists with e-mail addresses and expertise (or rather their occupation), the list falls short of the target (30 for each country) which on the other hand might have been too ambitious. It is not clear if the list is part of a database for the network as foreseen in the project document and if the names are easily available for participating unions. The list should also include more precise expertise areas than just their occupation. While regional seminars including civil society actors have been held, none of the national seminars foreseen in the project document have been conducted.

Through actively promoting regional trade union cooperation among bona fide trade unions that were committed to freedom of association, the right to collective bargaining, human rights, women workers' rights and migrant workers' rights, the project played an important role in supporting the efforts to establish an independent Arab trade union structure, the ITUC-Arab Region. A founding congress of the ITUC-AR is expected to take place in September 2014 with all unions supported by the project as founding members except FENASOL which is still reviewing its international and regional affiliations. The project and cooperating organizations were represented in a major event that saw a common action plan to protect migrant workers' rights agreed upon between Arab trade unions and Asian trade unions. In collaboration with other partners, the project organized a regional workshop on trade union rights and the right to strike that resulted in common positions been elaborated between trade unions in the Middle East and North Africa (MENA countries). The project also supported an elaboration of unified MENA trade union perspective on socio-economic development policies in the region. Thus the project has had an important impact at the **regional level** on issues directly and indirectly affecting trade unions and their membership. However, the ITUC-AR still in the process of being established officially will probably need considerable support in the next coming years if it in turn should be able to assist and protect its new affiliates.

In line with supporting democratic, independent and representative trade union structures, the project provided technical and financial assistance to the GFBTU, **Bahrain**, in holding its second General Congress at a time of social and political turmoil. The project provided the GFBTU with technical advice in developing a comprehensive socio-economic policy vision which was adopted together with an action plan by the General Congress in 2012. The project supported the GFBTU at a crucial time in its conflict with the government. Tensions have, however, eased somewhat following an ILO high level intervention and the signature of a tripartite agreement including GBFTU, which also lead to the union to withdraw a complaint to the ILO. The agreement also resulted in reaching an acceptable solution for the issue of about 4,000 workers who were dismissed in connection with the social-political

turmoil. However, the government is still trying to undermine and weaken GFBTU by supporting the government controlled BLUFF union and thus the GFBTU is in a vulnerable situation that requires continued support from outside.

The project worked to foster an enabling environment for freedom of association and the right to collective bargaining in **Jordan**. The majority of activities have been carried out in collaboration with the Federation of Independent Trade Unions in Jordan (FITUJ). Notably the project supported and assisted FITUJ in establishing itself as a national centre, although not yet recognized by the government, and the holding of the organization's first congress. The project managed at an early stage to establish some kind of entente between the GFJTU, the "historic" trade union centre, and FITUJ and even some cooperation with regard to a common trade union stand on labour and trade union reforms in conformity with the International Labour Standards. However, the GFJTU gradually hardened its stance and all forms for cooperation with FITUJ have ceased. GFJTU being close to the government did not participate in the social uprisings and is as an ITUC member playing an ambiguous role in its regional affiliation which, however, also means that it is complicating a FITUJ membership of the ITUC-AR. The GFTUJ has further complained to the ILO about its assistance to the independent trade unions. It may be useful if the ITUC establish clear criteria for membership. Given the hostile environment, outside efforts to consolidate the achievements of the FITUJ is needed as well as further support to help the organization to develop into a bona fide trade union centre.

In **Lebanon** the project supported the embryonic initiatives, led by FENASOL and the Trade Union Coordination Committee (public servants and public and private schools teachers), to build a new independent national centre. FENASOL is a confederation of Lebanese trade unions previously affiliated to CGTL which recently have split from the latter. FENASOL and its cooperating partners were considered as a credible alternative to the "historic" union centre CGTL with regard to promoting freedom of association and the right to collective bargaining. The evaluator's discussions held with the CGTL confirmed that the CGTL had no immediate interest in changing and to develop into a democratic, independent and representative trade union centre. Also, the project supported FENASOL in efforts to organize informal and migrant domestic workers. This was done in close collaboration with ILO project on domestic workers in Lebanon. The organizing of women migrant domestic workers in Lebanon is a precedent in the Arab region and constitutes a pilot model that might be replicated in other countries in the region. The project also supported FENASOL in reforming its internal by-laws towards more internal democracy and assisted it in aligning itself to the independent international and regional trade union movement. FENASOL is moving in the right direction and continued support will be necessary to consolidate and further develop its achievements.

Cooperation with and monitoring of the activities of the PGFTU in the **Occupied Palestinian Territories** have for various reasons been difficult. The situation, being occupied territories, does not facilitate access to project staff to the West bank and Gaza. Meetings with PGFTU representatives had thus to be held outside Palestine. In addition, considerable assistance is provided by a variety of donors to the PGFTU and coordination is difficult. However, the project's efforts have focused on strengthening the PGFTU in areas of capacity building and developing representative structures by way of providing policy advice and training. The project's activities provided scope for building new alliances between the PGFTU and the

university teachers' trade union, the UNRWA staff union and other sectoral unions. With the aim of solidifying the PGFTU efforts to represent Palestinian workers, the project also supported the PGFTU in holding its first unified executive committee meeting for many years, overcoming restrictions on mobility. The project assisted the PGFTU to engage in tripartite dialogue and influence national policies. This contributed in the active involvement of the PGFTU in minimum wage setting discussions and also led to signing a bipartite agreement with the Federation of Palestinian Chambers of Commerce. Given the special situation in the occupied territories, the PGFTU will need continued support.

Building on previous efforts, including those of the ILO, to establish bona fide trade unions in **Oman**, the project helped the General Federation of Oman Trade Unions (GFOTU) to consolidate and further develop its structures and capacity. The Project supported GFOTU in building a team of trade union trainers that will enable it to design and implement its own training programme. Also, efforts were employed in order to integrate women workers' priorities and concerns in trade union agendas. Moreover, the project developed policy position papers for the GFOTU that prepared the organization to participate in social dialogue and national debates on minimum wage and amendments of labour legislation. Furthermore, through project advice and assistance, the GFOTU was able to expand its representation in enterprises to reach 180 company-based trade unions, up from 46 when the project commenced. It is also in the process of establishing sectoral trade unions. Finally, the project supported the GFOTU in convening its first General Congress in February 2014. However, there seems still to be a long way for the newly formed trade unions in Oman before they can play a qualified role in discussions on matters of importance to its membership. Further assistance will be needed to consolidate achievements, establish trade based federations within the centre, for the time being only the oil workers are organized in a federation, as well as establishing clear demarcations vis-à-vis the government.

Some tentative activities were undertaken in **Yemen** with the GFYTU. However, the security situation in the country is neither conducive nor improving. In addition, the GFYTU does not seem to be on the threshold to change from being basically government controlled. Furthermore, it is split between those who want strong continued links to ICATU and those who want to join the new ITUC-AR. Under the given circumstances the project should include Yemen only on a limited scale in the last phase of the project and at the same time watch developments carefully and be prepared to assist further if the situation improves.

As an integral part of promoting its core objectives, the project encouraged trade unions across the region, to include the ratification and observation of C87 and C98 as priority issues on their agendas. The project also facilitated alliances and cooperation between unions and rights-based civil society organizations. It assisted workers' organizations in Jordan, Lebanon and Bahrain in using ILO supervisory mechanisms with a view to putting an end to violations of basic workers' rights, particularly regarding non-observance of C87, C98 and C111.

The project is, through consistent support to developing democratic and independent trade union structures, moving well towards achieving the **project's overall objective**: To develop the capacity of workers' organizations in the Arab region to participate effectively in policy debates, influence public decisions, and defend workers' rights and interests. This should, of course, be seen within the context of the limited number of countries and organizations involved in project activities. In the regional seminar observed by the evaluator, the

awareness of the meaning democratic and independent unions seemed to be very high. One evidence of the project's impact is that the "old historic" trade unions are visibly nervous and that they may be threatened by the project's achievements and are launching violent press attacks against it as well as the ILO. On the other side, the fact that alternative democratic and independent structures exist, or that they are possible, have created internal discussions in the "old" unions, e.g. in the CGTL Lebanon, and it might result in some unions starting to reform and/or affiliates leaving for the alternative unions. In its last phase the project should keep an eye on such possible developments and be ready to intervene in one or another way.

With regard to the project's **immediate objectives**: Strengthening the institutional capacity of workers' organizations (immediate objective 1) and Strengthening the technical capacity of workers' organizations (immediate objective 2), it is noted that in general important progress is being made. As discussed earlier in the report, the new alternative democratic and independent trade union structures have been assisted in expanding their membership, improve their internal structures in democratic direction, holding congresses/meetings as required by constitution, used the ILO supervisory mechanisms and in some cases forged links with relevant NGOs. Also, the assistance to FENASOL and FITUJ in establishing due collection mechanisms is important in institution building. Technical capacity building is under way although some of the more tangible outcomes still have to materialize, for example the national training activities undertaken by the project trained trainers and easily available database for the Labour Education and Research Network for the Arab Region. However, important outcomes have been noted, for example position papers issued by workers' organizations and legal amendments proposed by unions.

There is, however, room for improvements which may also serve as recommendations for the last project phase. Although the evaluator is well aware of the fact that reliable statistics are not easily available from trade unions in the region, e.g. membership figures and collected union fees, there does not seem to be systematic efforts from the project to obtain such statistics. This could have been useful to measure project impact over the project duration being evaluated. More rigorous data collection and registration with regard to all project activities including those carried out by trained trainers at the national level and materials printed at country level as well union statistics is therefore recommended for the remainder of the project.

The project is collaborating closely with the Gender Equality Specialist based in Beirut and training have been carried out at the regional and national levels to integrate women, and in some cases youth, in trade union activities and it is noted that congresses in GBFTU and GFOTU have elected women to the leadership. However, except from the **gender** specific workshops, the female participation is low, less than 20%, in the general training activities. Although it is recognized that women membership is low in the unions and that there are particular cultural and social obstacles in the region for a fair women participation, it could be questioned if the project has been sufficiently active in urging the unions to appoint women to the activities. A better use of statistics and closer collaboration with the gender specialist may be useful in the future. It is also recommended to work with the unions to improve the participation of **young people** in project activities, so far only 12% is under 30 years of age.

A notable achievement of the project is the help rendered to unions in Lebanon and Jordan to establish membership fee collection mechanisms. Collection of union dues is a weak point in most organizations in the region as well as in many places elsewhere. Many of the "historic" unions financially depends on government subsidies and/or check-off systems decided by legislation which, of course, make them dependent on government goodwill. In Bahrain, for example, many companies stopped paying to the GBFTU when the dispute with the government developed. Since independence of unions in general is closely linked financial independence, the project should pursue its efforts to assist trade unions in setting up mechanisms for realistic due collection and, if possible, to place check-off systems within the framework of collective agreements.

Concerning the training/study materials and literacy briefs produced by the project, they were for obvious reasons all in Arabic and the contents therefore not accessible to the evaluator. However, project staff assured that the materials, which were all signed by the Regional Director, although shaped to local circumstances were based upon basic ILO principles and general ILO materials and publications and had been checked by the workers' specialists. The materials were printed recently which to the evaluator seems rather late in the project implementation if they should serve trainers in their activities. However, it was explained to the evaluator that lengthy procedures were partly to blame. It is recommended that project staff now elaborate a plan for distribution as well as making the materials available for a wider audience, for example making them easily accessible on-line.

In general, the evaluator finds that the major expected **outputs** and **outcomes** have by and large been produced and achieved even though the number of project countries was reduced as discussed above.

4.3 Efficiency

Since the number of countries that actually benefited from the project was considerably lower than originally foreseen in the project document, the funds allocated seemed adequate, which is also evidenced by the fact that project could be extended for additional 12 months (with supplementary ILO funds though). However, the budget for regional training was on the low side and support for the holding of congresses in the participating organizations was not envisaged. It was also expensive to bring people out for meetings as was the case of Bahrain (for a certain period) and Palestine. In addition, in some countries, Lebanon and Jordan, the project ran parallel activities with competing trade union centres until it was decided to work with one centre only. However, the project budget allowed for considerable flexibility.

In general, the funds have been utilized efficiently and project staff actually developed some of the studies and training materials that originally were envisaged to be done by external collaborators and thus saving funds.

Following initial employment of National Officers, NOs, in each of the project countries in addition to the CTA and the secretarial assistant based in Beirut, it turned out that it was difficult to monitor the quality of work of the NOs and, at the same time, it was the experience that, with the exception of the NO in Lebanon, they did not extend their work duties beyond strict administrative matters, e.g. advising the organizations on trade union related matters. Subsequently, contracts were not renewed for the NOs outside Lebanon

where an additional NO was recruited to cope with the increased workload for the central team in absence of NOs in the other countries.

Certain governments' (Bahrain and Kuwait) refusal of issuing visas to backstopping workers' specialists, and in some cases to project staff, when travelling on project business made it difficult to implement and monitor activities in the concerned countries. In addition to being a problem for the project, it is also a serious matter of principle when the ILO cannot provide the necessary services to one of its constituents.

The Syria civil war developed just after the project was designed and it was subsequently not possible to involve that country in the project. The Syria crisis, although not affecting the project implementation directly, affects the political and economic situation in Jordan and Lebanon seriously and thus indirectly the project in these two countries.

4.4 Sustainability

In general, it cannot be expected that a project that has been fully operational for 24 months only can turn around a situation that have existed for more than 40 years. Although the strategy of supporting alternative democratic and independent trade union structures where "historic" and compromised unions have refused to reform and adapt to new realities, has proved valid, the majority of the project supported organizations are still at a nascent stage. Important achievements have been made and the process of change has been put on rails, however, the unions involved in the project will undoubtedly need continued support, even beyond the 12 months project extension.

Sustainability of the achieved results will also depend on what kind of support the newly funded unions can get from regional and international trade union organizations. Since the ITUC-AR is just in the process of being formally established, it would require assistance from outside if it in turn should be able to assist weak affiliates.

One of the project's main activity areas, still in progress, has been training of trainers with a view to ensure an on-going training programme in the project organizations. Sustainability in the long run will to a high degree depend on the project's success in the last phase to establish within the unions workers' education structures which ensure coherent on-going education programmes that make use of project trained trainers. In addition, the trainers have to be supported with further training, if required, and suitable training materials/manuals.

The project strategy, in addition to the inroads the project has made with some unions in organizing migrant and domestic workers can no doubt, when further elaborated and with some modifications, be replicated by other organizations in the region.

4.5 Preliminary impact

Evidence of the project's preliminary impact with regard to developing a democratic and independent trade union movement in the region is that the "old historic" trade unions are visibly nervous and feel threatened of the project's achievements and are launching violent press attacks against it as well as the ILO. The fact that alternative democratic and

independent structures exist, or that they are possible, have created internal discussions in the "old" unions, e.g. in the CGTL Lebanon, and it might result in some unions starting to reform and/or affiliates leaving for the alternative unions.

Important steps towards developing democratic and independent trade unions were taken in Bahrain, Jordan, Lebanon and Oman where congresses were convened with the support of the project. The congress in Jordan was the founding event where independent trade unions formed the Federation of Independent Trade Unions in Jordan (FITUJ).

Internal democracy in the General Federation of Oman Trade Unions was further strengthened by project supported revision of the organization's bylaws.

Also in Oman, the number of company based unions affiliated to the GFOTU increased from 46 to 180 during the project duration.

In Lebanon two new unions were formed (public servants and public and private schools teachers).

Three observations to the ILO Supervisory mechanisms were submitted by unions in Bahrain, Jordan and Lebanon.

5 Conclusions

The evaluator observes that the project came very timely in the immediate aftermath of the uprisings in the Arab Spring that saw mass protests against suppressive regimes and popular demands for democracy sweeping the region. In some countries the trade unions were part and parcel, and sometimes even in the forefront, of these protests and uprisings, judging that the claims coincided with those of a democratic and independent trade union movement. In other countries, the "old historic" trade unions that were characterized by being compromised, subordinated and dependent sided with the oppressive regimes. In these countries a climate for the formation of alternative democratic and independent trade unions were created. The project addressed the needs of these unions as well as of the independent unions that were brought in difficulties for having taken part in the protests.

The evaluator finds that the designed strategy for the project in promoting and supporting change by focussing assistance to existing democratic and independent trade unions as well as to workers in establishing alternative trade unions where existing organizations were compromised and not willing to embrace internal democracy, diversity and independence, was a valid one. It is also noted that this is a major break with previous international, ILO included, support in the Arab region to unions often too cosy with, if not the extended arms of, governments and/or political parties. At the same time, it was noted that the "old historic" trade unions became visibly nervous of the project's impact and launched violent press attacks against it. On the other side, the fact that alternative democratic and independent structures exist, or that they are possible, have created internal discussions in the "old" unions which might result in some unions starting to reform and/or affiliates leaving for the alternative unions. This strategy should be continued and reinforced, and at the same time the last phase of the project should pay close attention to possible positive developments in the "historic" unions and be ready to intervene in one or another way.

The evaluator found that certain aspects of the project implementation can be improved and should be considered for the remainder of the project. National training activities should be speeded up and precise profiles of trainers' competences and participants' union responsibilities would help to better target and adapt project activities. The latter could also, among other things, be useful in efforts to improve participation of women and young workers.

This said, it is the general conclusion of the evaluator that the project has done well under difficult circumstances and set in motion an important process of trade unions being more democratic and independent and better equipped to protect and further their members interests.

The evaluator is of the opinion that a project that has been fully operational for 24 months only cannot be expected to turn around a situation that have existed in the region for more than 40 years. Although it is found that the project is moving towards delivering the major outputs and outcomes, project supported organizations are still at an embryonic stage or, as in Bahrain, under heavy pressure from government. Even with the project extension of 12 months these organizations will unquestionably be in need of assistance for some time to come.

6 Important lessons learned and emerging good practices

The main **lesson learned** so far in the project implementation was:

Breaking with previous ways of supporting trade unions in the region created a new momentum in developing democratic and independent trade unions. Where previously support were given to existing trade unions centres in the hope that they would over time change into genuine democratic, independent and representative organizations, which did not happen in most cases, support was now provided to new emerging structures. By supporting alternative democratic and independent trade union structures where existing organizations were compromised and not willing to embrace internal democracy, diversity and independence, created a completely new situation in the countries concerned. The mere fact that alternative democratic and independent structures exist, or that they are possible, have created internal discussions in the "old" unions which might result in some unions starting to reform and/or affiliates leaving for the alternative unions, which again may reinforce the momentum.

The main **emerging practice** noted so far in the project implementation, which may turn out to be a good practice:

A database of international, regional and national resource persons is under development with a view to promote synergy of efforts, including the interface between national, Arab and global experiences. The database will provide a mapping of these resource persons by available skills aiming at ensuring the relevance and effectiveness of the training. National and regional meetings are organized to bring together trade unionists, civil society activists, women's rights activists, and youth activists, along with workers' educators and researchers

as well as journalists, to open opportunities for cooperation between them. An online platform will be developed to facilitate communication. The result aims to be the creation of the **Labor Education and Research Network for the Arab Region**.

7 Recommendations

- 1) The project should concentrate human and financial resources on consolidating and further develop what have been achieved so far. Taking onboard possible new tasks should be considered only if it does not impede this. For the outcomes to be achieved in the extension period, recommendations are made for each outcome in the "Monitoring and Evaluation Matrix", ANNEX V.
- 2) The project should continue to concentrate activities with trade unions that embrace internal democracy, diversity and independence, both existing and alternative ones, and at the same time pay close attention and be prepared to assist "historic" unions that show signs of desire to reform.
- 3) Special attention should be given to the trade unions in Oman. The union movement is still at a nascent stage and assistance will be needed to strengthen organizational consolidation and capacity building. This will further the chances for a democratic and independent development.
- 4) The new ITUC-Arab Region regional trade union structure is still under construction and the project can assist by close collaboration in certain activity areas as well as in supporting democratic and independent affiliates as well as potential affiliates.
- 5) Given the security situation in Yemen as well as the internal instability in the General Federation of Yemeni Trade Unions, GFYTU, activities in that country should be on a limited scale with the possibility to expand should the situation change.
- 6) The project should as soon as possible activate the trained trainers and assist in establishing workers' education structures within the unions with a view to launch substantive national training programmes.
- 7) Building upon already acquired experiences the project should continue to assist trade unions in approaching unorganized groups such as migrants, domestic and informal sector workers. Where traditional organizing is not possible, often due to legislative restrictions, alternative ways should be sought. This could also be applicable to for example public workers which in many countries are not allowed organize in traditional ways. Using NGOs and civil society contacts to reach out to groups that trade unions are normally not very familiar with is often useful.

- 8) Systematic efforts to improve women and young workers' participation in project activities should be stepped up. This will require specific activities for unions in assisting them in increasing the percentage of women and young members and parallel to that urge unions to ensure fair participation of the two groups in all union and project activities.
- 9) For purposes of targeted and adapted project activities and for better monitoring, systematic data collection and use should take place both within the project and from the unions in general. This would include development in membership figures and union fee collection. In addition, there should be precise registration of resource persons and their competences and profiles of participants in training activities.
- 10) It is recommended that a precise plan for distribution of project studies and briefs should be developed as well as making the materials available for a wider audience, for example making them easily accessible on-line.
- 11) As mentioned in the report, it is unlikely that, even after the 12 month project extension, and notwithstanding the undeniable progress made by the project, that many of the achievements are sustainable. Although the outcomes of increased national training activities in the final project phase will contribute to sustainability, there is no doubt that continued assistance to the unions in the region will be necessary. Therefore, considerations should already at this stage be given to a new project that builds on the achievements of this one.

8 Appendices

(Please see attachments)

Annex I, Terms of reference



International
Labour
Organization

Mid-Term Evaluation for the Regional Workers' Literacy Project

Terms of Reference

1. Introduction and Background on the Project

This term of reference (TOR) is designed in order to support and guide an independent consultant to conduct an internal mid-term evaluation (MTE) of the “Strengthening of Workers’ Organizations in the Arab Countries through Economic, Social and Legal Literacy”. The evaluation will assess the project performance in relation to stated objectives, outcomes and outputs. An assessment of the effectiveness of management arrangements and project design, as well as the project’s impact and relevance will be conducted. The evaluation will also identify opportunities for learning and improvement for the remaining period of the project. The evaluation will provide an opportunity for mid-term course corrections to improve upon expected project deliverables and results. It is expected to lead to recommendations and lessons learned for future use.

2. Brief Background on the Project and Context

The overall project objective is to develop the capacity of workers’ organizations in the Arab region to participate effectively in policy debates, influence public decisions, and defend workers’ rights and interests. The immediate objectives of the project are:

- 1) Strengthening the institutional capacity of workers’ organizations.
- 2) Strengthening the technical capacity of workers’ organizations.

The project was designed as a response to the waves of popular movements and protests that swept the Arab Region in 2011, and where workers and trade unions took active part in these democratic actions. The project stemmed from the lessons learned from the Arab Spring that showed that countries with an active trade union movement, characterized by democracy and independence, even in relative terms, have witnessed a leading role for trade unions which have provided an umbrella for the societal and popular democratic movements. In contrast, countries where the trade union movement was compromised, subordinated and dependent, have witnessed the manipulation of these union structures as tools under the oppressive control of the authorities, creating circumstances for the promotion of new independent trade unions.

In fact, the Arab uprisings showed that the greater the deficits in real and genuine participation of workers, the less responsive were the policies and priorities to people's needs and aspirations. This stark contrast has highlighted the powerful potential of unionism – and brought it forward as a key development priority. The ongoing events in the region have confirmed that in the absence of genuine mechanisms for social dialogue with inclusive, equitable and independent workers' representation, workers and people at large resorted to extra-institutional channels and actions to voice their demands, rights, and interests.

Accordingly, the project aims at strengthening the institutional capacity of workers' organizations (immediate objective 1) and their technical capacity (immediate objective 2). On the institutional level, the project supported workers' organizations in enhancing their internal democracy and independence through various methods, ranging from reforming internal bylaws, using ILO supervisory mechanisms, expanding outreach for workers and holding General Congresses. Moreover, on the technical level, the project supported workers' organizations through policy advice, production of knowledge materials and conducting workshops on priority issues for the labour movement.

The direct beneficiaries of the project included women, men, young, migrant, and unorganized workers in the formal and informal economies, as well as leaders and members of independent, free, and representative workers' organizations committed to social justice and democracy in the eight countries. Where no such workers' organizations exist, support was provided for encouraging and enabling their establishment through training and technical advice on financial autonomy and management training. A key emphasis in planning and delivery will be the inclusion of the right to organize and bargain collectively of informal workers, migrant workers, women, and youth. The project was active in Lebanon, Jordan, Oman, Bahrain, Yemen, and OPT.

The "Strengthening Workers' Organizations in Arab countries through economic, social and legal literacy has a duration of 24 months and a budget of 1.98 Million USD. The project officially started in September 2011, however its implementation started in April 2012 as the project team was recruited. The project ended in April 2014 and got an extension for one year till May 2015.

3. Purpose, Scope and Clients of the Mid-Term Evaluation

The purpose of the internal midterm evaluation is to enable project staff, constituents and other relevant stakeholders to assess the progress in delivery of project outcomes and based on this assessment, to take decisions regarding future intervention logic and emphasis of the project during its remaining time. The clients of the evaluation include: the ILO Regional Office for Arab States (Beirut, including the overall project manager (CTA), the project team (NOs), the technical backstopping staff (senior workers' specialist), members of the steering committee, the constituents, and the donor. The scope of evaluation in terms of time is from 19 of May to 1st of June. The scope of the evaluation in terms of operational area will be Beirut, and upon availability of resources, it will include travel to selected countries.

The Mid-Term evaluation will assess five evaluation criteria as outlined below. Related to each of these criteria are a number of key evaluation questions as outlined in part 4 of this TOR.

a. Relevance

- b. Effectiveness
- c. Efficiency
- d. Sustainability
- e. Preliminary Impact

4. Key evaluation questions

As mentioned in the previous section, and in line with ILO evaluation guidelines, the project should be assessed against five evaluation criteria. A number of questions have been developed for each criterion, as set out below. Those key evaluation questions are expected to be answered through the Midterm evaluation:

- a. Relevance
 - a. Is the programme directly supporting the Decent Work Country Programme (DWCP) where it exists?
 - b. Is the programme promoting Fundamental Rights and Principles at Work?
 - c. How well does it complement other relevant ILO projects in the region?
 - d. How well does the programme respond to the needs of identified beneficiaries and workers' organizations in the region?
 - e. Does the project align with ILO's mainstreamed strategy on gender equality?
- b. Validity of design
 - a. What is the 'theory of change behind the project'? Is the intervention logic coherent and realistic? Do outputs causally link to outcomes, which in turn contribute to the broader development objective of the project?
 - b. Have the various 'change' assumptions been properly identified and addressed in the project design and implementation?
 - c. How appropriate and useful are the indicators described in the project document in assessing the project's achievements? Are the targeted indicators realistic and can they be tracked?
- c. Effectiveness
 - a. Is the project making sufficient progress towards its planned objectives? Will the project be likely to achieve its planned objectives upon completion?
 - b. What outputs have been produced and delivered, and has the quality of these outputs been satisfactory? Are the outputs easily accessible and have they been disseminated?
 - c. In which areas does the Project have the least achievements? What have been the constraining factors and how have they been addressed?
 - d. What, if any, alternative strategies would have been more effective in achieving the project's objectives?
 - e. What is the effectiveness of the management arrangements?
 - f. Was the project flexible and quickly responsive to fluctuations and changing developments in the region?
 - g. How effectively does the project management monitor project performance and results? What M&E system has been put in place, and how effective is it? Is relevant

data systematically being collected and analysed to feed into management decisions? Is data disaggregated by sex?

d. Efficiency

- a. Are the available technical, financial, Human, and time resources adequate to fulfil the project plans?
- b. Were the available resources optimally utilized to obtain satisfactory results?
- c. Is information being shared and readily accessible to national partners?

e. Impact orientation and Sustainability

- a. Is there any progress in partner workers' organizations' capacity to carry forward with project's activities, in terms of training and policy, and is there a growing sense of ownership?
- b. How are the end beneficiaries (women and men) likely to benefit from project activities?
- c. Did the project succeed in integrating its approach into the workers' institutional settings?
- d. Does the project succeed in developing replicable approach that can be applied with modifications to other geographical settings or with other workers' organizations?

Methodology to be followed:

The evaluation will employ two methodologies: document reviews and key informant interviews.

- 1) Document review: the evaluator shall familiarize him/herself with the project through a review of relevant documents. The documents include: Project Document, workshop reports, and mission reports, work plans, progress reports. Selected documents will also be made available to the evaluator via e-mail.
- 2) Key informant interviews: the evaluator will be available in Beirut to carry out key informant interviews with partners in Lebanon. The evaluator will participate in a preparatory regional workshop in Beirut on trade union organizing on 22 and 23 May 2014. This will give the evaluator the chance to meet with representatives of partner workers' organization who received active support from the Project. Moreover, the evaluator will interview project staff, partners, backstopping staff and the project steering committee.

5. Main outputs

The evaluator will provide the following main outputs:

- An inception report summarizing the approach and methodology.
- A draft report for comment. **As per internal evaluation guidelines**, the report will be circulated among project staff, the relevant technical department, identified stakeholders and other relevant ILO officials (Regional Evaluation Officer, RPS, technical officers).
- A final report, including recommendations for the extension period.
- A presentation of findings to ILO ROAS – for program learning purposes.

The evaluator will produce a concise final report according to the ILO evaluation guidelines and reflecting the key evaluation questions. The quality of the report will be determined by conformance with checklist 4 “Formatting Requirements for Evaluation Reports”, and Checklist 5 “Rating for Quality of Evaluation Reports”. Adherence to these checklists should be considered a contractual requirement when submitting evaluations to ensure full remuneration of the contract. The maximum length of the final report is 30 pages long.

Timeline:

The timeline will be as follows:

	May 17 th	May 18 th	May 20 th	May 21 st	May 22 nd	May 23 rd	May 25 th	May 26 th	May 28 th	May 29 th	June
Preparation for the evaluation											
interviews with the project team in Beirut											
interviews with partner workers’ organizations (Jordan, Lebanon, OPT, Yemen, Bahrain and Oman)											
writing and submitting the draft report											
Circulating the report for comments											
finalizing the evaluation report											
Presentation of findings to ILO ROAS (and stakeholders)											

The travel, accommodation and daily spending allowance for the mission to Beirut will be all covered by the Regional Office.

Annex II, Lessons learned

ILO Lesson Learned Template

Project Title: Regional Workers' Literacy Project
 Project TC/SYMBOL: RAB/11/02/USA

Name of Evaluator: Niels Enevoldsen
 Date: 29 May 2014

The following lesson learned has been identified during the course of the evaluation. Further text explaining the lesson may be included in the full evaluation report.

LL Element	Text
Brief description of lesson learned (link to specific action or task)	Breaking with previous ways of supporting trade unions in the region created a new momentum in developing democratic and independent trade unions. Where previously support were given to existing trade unions centres in the hope that they would over time change into genuine democratic, independent and representative organizations, which did not happen in most cases, support was now provided to new emerging structures. By supporting alternative democratic and independent trade union structures where existing organizations were compromised and not willing to embrace internal democracy, diversity and independence, created a completely new situation in the countries concerned. The mere fact that alternative democratic and independent structures exist, or that they are possible, have created internal discussions in the "old" unions which might result in some unions starting to reform and/or affiliates leaving for the alternative unions, which again may reinforce the momentum.
Context and any related preconditions	Arab region with a majority of trade unions that have not yet embraced democracy and independence.

Targeted users / Beneficiaries	Trade union members in particular and workers in general.
Challenges /negative lessons - Causal factors	Resistance from governments that wish to keep workers' organizations under their control.
Success / Positive Issues - Causal factors	Legacy of the Arab Spring, the popular desire for democracy and involvement.
ILO Administrative Issues (staff, resources, design, implementation)	

Annex III Good practices

ILO Emerging Good Practice Template

Project Title: Regionaal Workers' Literacy Project
 Project TC/SYMBOL: RAB/11/02/USA

Name of Evaluator: Niels Enevoldsen
 Date: 29 May 2014

The following emerging good practice has been identified during the course of the evaluation. Further text can be found in the full evaluation report.

GP Element	Text
Brief summary of the good practice (link to project goal or specific deliverable, background, purpose, etc.)	A database of international, regional and national resource persons is under development with a view to promote synergy of efforts, including the interface between national, Arab and global experiences. The database will provide a mapping of these resource persons by available skills aiming at ensuring the relevance and effectiveness of the training. National and regional meetings are organized to bring together trade unionists, civil society activists, women's rights activists, and youth activists, along with workers' educators and researchers as well as journalists, to open opportunities for cooperation between them. An online platform will be developed to facilitate communication. The result aims to be the creation of the Labor Education and Research Network for the Arab Region.
Relevant conditions and Context: limitations or advice in terms of applicability and replicability	As this is a mid-term evaluation, it is underlined that this is an emerging practice, that may turn out to be a good practice
Establish a clear cause-effect relationship	

Indicate measurable impact and targeted beneficiaries	Impact to be measured by the end of project.
Potential for replication and by whom	By trade unions in the region
Upward links to higher ILO Goals (DWCPs, Country Programme Outcomes or ILO's Strategic Programme Framework)	Constituents reaching out to civil society
Other documents or relevant comments	

Annex IV, List of interviewees

Mr. Abid Briki, CTA, Regional Workers' literacy Project

Mr. Nabil Abdo, National project Coordinator, Regional Workers' literacy Project

Mr. Rabee Fakhri, National project Coordinator, Regional Workers' literacy Project

Mr. Mustapha Said, Senior Workers' Specialist, ILO Regional Office for Arab States

Mr. Walid Hamdan, Senior Workers' Specialist, ACTRAV, ILO Geneva

Ms. Nada Al-Nashif, Regional Director, ILO Regional Office for Arab States

Mr. Frank Hagemann, Deputy Regional Director, ILO Regional Office for Arab States

Mr. Jean-François Klein, Chief, Regional Programming Services, ILO Regional Office for Arab States

Ms. Rabia Jalloul, Officer, Regional Programming Services, ILO Regional Office for Arab States

Ms Emanuela Pozzan, Senior Regional Specialist, Gender Equality, ILO Regional Office

Ms. Nathalie Bavitch, Monitoring & Evaluation Officer, ILO R O for Arab States

Ms. Zeina Mezher, Expert, Project on Rights for Domestic Workers, Lebanon

Mr. Saadeddine Hamidi Sakr, General Secretary, CGTL

Mr. Ismail Badrane, Education Officer, CGTL

Ms. Zahra Bazzi, Program Manager, Arab NGO Network for Development

Mr. Hassan Sherry, Research Officer, Arab NGO Network for Development

Trade union representatives from Bahrain, Jordan, Lebanon, Occupied Palestinian Territories , Oman and Yemen participating in the project regional seminar on organizing, Beirut, 22-23 May 2014.

Annex V, List of activities				
Immediate Objective	Activity	Targeted countries	Title of the Activity	Year
Strengthening institutional capacities of workers' organizations	Workshop	Jordan (GFJTU and independent trade unions)	The role of the Jordanian trade union movement in light of Jordan's economic situation	2012
	Workshop	Lebanon – FENASOL	The Lebanese trade union movement in light of the socio-economic situation in Lebanon – towards and independent trade union movement	2012
	Workshop	PGFTU held in Jordan	The role of the Palestinian trade union movement within the Palestinian socio-economic challenges	2012
	Coordination meeting	GFBTU (meeting in Beirut)	A preparatory meeting for the GFBTU 2 nd General Congress	2012
	General Congress	Bahrain – GFBTU	GFBTU 2 nd General Congress	2012
	Regional Workshop	Held in Jordan	Trade Union Freedoms and the Right to Strike	2012
	Regional workshop	Joining Arab and Asian TUs in Beirut	Organizing migrant workers	2012
	Workshop	GFOTU Oman –	Tripartite workshop on social dialogue and collective bargaining	2012
	Workshop	Lebanon – FENASOL	the foundations of an independent, democratic and representative trade union movement in Lebanon	2013

	Workshop	Lebanon-FENASOL	organizing techniques and establishment of workers organizations	2013
	Congress	Jordan – Independent federation	Founding Congress for the Independent Federation of Jordan trade unions	2013
	Workshop	FENASOL Lebanon	Revising internal bylaws (2 workshops)	2014
	Workshop	FENASOL Lebanon	The Lebanese trade union movement and the Arab and international trade union movement	2014
	Congress	GFOTU Oman	First General Congress of the GFOTU	2014
	Workshop	Independent Federation – Jordan	Internal democracy in trade unions	2014
Strengthening technical capacities of workers' organizations	Workshop	GFOTU	Minimum wage and wage setting	2012
	Workshop	GFBTU	preparation of the GFBTU socio-economic report	2012
	TOT programme	GFOTU Oman	Training of trainers – 7 national workshops	2012
	TOT programme	GFBTU Bahrain	Training of trainers – 6 workshops	2012
	Training workshop	PGFTU Palestine	Training of trainers on collective bargaining	2013
	TOT programme	Jordan – Independent federation	Training of trainers 4 workshops	2013
	Workshop	CGTL Lebanon	Wage adjustment	2013
	Regional Workshop	Beirut	Gender Equality through Organizing	2013
	Workshop	GFBTU	Trade Unions' Rights and	2013

			Freedom	
	Workshop	GFJTU Jordan	– Integrating women and youth in trade unions	2014
	Workshop	GFBTU Bahrain	– Integrating women and youth in trade unions	2013
	Workshop	GFOTU Oman	– Integrating women and youth in trade unions	2013
	Workshop	GFBTU	Collective bargaining	2013
	Workshop	GFJTU	Trade Unions' Rights and Freedoms	2013
	Regional Workshop	Beirut	A workers' perspective on socio-economic development paradigm in the Arab region	2013
	Workshop	GFJTU	Wages and Social protection	2014
	Workshop	GFYTU	Study Days in preparation of the GFUTY socio-economic report	2014

Annex VI, List of activities, gender segregated

Activity	Country	Number of participants	Female Representatives
TOT programme 2012-2013	Bahrain	15	4
TOT Programme 2012-2013	Oman	14	2
Regional Workshop on Human Rights Protection Mechanism (OHCHR May 2012)	Regional - Lebanon	45	7
Regional Workshop on Freedom of expression, association and assembly (OHCHR May 2012)	Regional - Lebanon	80	20
Regional Workshop on Diplomacy Training Programme - Migrant Workers (May 2012)	Regional - Lebanon	45	20
Regional Workshop right to strike Jordan Nov 2012	Regional - Jordan	19	2
Regional Workshop Women TU Feb 2013	Regional - Lebanon	34	30
Regional workshop on organizing informal workers	Regional - Lebanon	11	4
Workshop - Study Days - Sep 2012	Bahrain	45	9
BH freedom of association April 2013	Bahrain	20	0
Workshop on collective bargaining June 2013	Bahrain	33	1
Integrating women and youth in trade unions	Bahrain	33	12
Workshop FENASOL - Lebanese TU in light of current socio-economic situation - Oct 2012	Lebanon	38	6
Workshop CGTL - wages March 2013	Lebanon	34	3
FENASOL - towards an independent and representative TU movement in Lebanon	Lebanon	30	7
FENASOL the foundations of an independent, democratic and representative trade union movement in Lebanon	Lebanon	32	8
FENASOL - organizing techniques and establishment of workers organizations	Lebanon	18	6

FENASOL - The Lebanese trade union movement and the Arab and international trade union movement	Lebanon	40	6
FENASOL - Reforming internal bylaws	Lebanon	28	7
Workshop on the Role of the trade Union Movement in light of Jordan's Socio-Economic Challenges - July 2012	Jordan	27	0
TOT -Independent federation	Jordan	15	3
GFJTU - wages and social protection	Jordan	26	5
GFJTU - women in trade unions	Jordan	24	17
Workshop On Minimum Wages Policy - Oct 2012	Oman	40	0
Workshop on Social Dialogue and Collective Bargaining	Oman	130	17
Workshop On Integrating Women and youth in trade unions - March 2013	Oman	50	12
Workshop PGFTU - on the Role of the Trade Union Movement in light of Palestine's Socio-Economic Challenges - Dec 2012	Palestine	43	4
training of TU negotiators Palestine April 2013	Occupied Palestinian Territory	26	5
GFYTU - workshop in preparation for the study days	Yemen	15	3
GFYTU - Study Days in preparation of the GFUTY socio-economic report	Yemen	25	4
Total		1035	224

Annex VII, List of publications - Phase IPublished materials

Comprehensive socio-economic report for the General Federation of Bahrain Trade Unions.

- A critical review of the Bahrain Labour Law
- Economic literacy brief on minimum wage
- Economic literacy brief on macroeconomic policies
- Economic literacy brief on economic crisis
- Economic literacy brief on taxation

Materials being finalized for publication

- Regional socio-economic report entitled: " A workers' perspective on socio-economic development in the Arab region"
- Socio-economic report for the General Federation of Yemini Trade Unions
- Economic literacy brief on social protection
- Economic literacy brief on the European-Mediterranean free trade agreement.

<u>Annex VII, Monitoring and evaluation matrix</u>							
<i>Activity</i>	Indicator	Target	Data Source	Evaluator's note	Data Disaggregation	Frequency	Recommendations for next phase
<i>1.1. Assess the needs of workers' organizations</i>	Needs assessment methodology developed	1 methodology document for needs assessments	Program monitoring and reports	This output has not been produced. Instead of a general methodology for the needs assessments, it seems that the project has approached the task in each country differently.	.	Final evaluation	Since the assessments have been made there is no need to develop a general methodology at this stage.
	Number of needs assessments conducted and validated	1 needs assessment per country	Program monitoring and reports, interviews with participants	The output has been produced	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Needs assessment workshop entitled “the role of the trade union movement in light of the current socio-economic situation” was conducted in Lebanon, Jordan, Palestine, and Yemen Consultations was conducted with the TU leadership in Oman & Bahrain 	Quarterly	
	Increased knowledge of needs among relevant actors	70% of interviewees report increased knowledge	Questionnaire and Interviews with participants and key informants	It has not been possible to establish if the target of this outcome has been attained.	By country	Yearly	In the view of the evaluator it is questionable how useful this target is. Instead, it is suggested that the project advice trade union officials on how to define the needs based on the partner organization's challenges and

							tasks, e.g. with regard to collective bargaining, membership campaigns, fee collection, etc.
1.2. Develop strategies and action plans for workers' organizations	Number of strategies and action plans developed	1 strategy and 1 action plan per country	Program monitoring and reports	The output has been produced.	Action plans with Trade union were developed in all targeted countries	Quarterly	
	Consolidated internal democracy, representativeness, freedom, and independence of workers' organizations	2 new workers' organizations formed with project support; Bylaws of 2 workers' organizations revised; 1 general assembly held per year per organization without outside interference; Yearly progress report and budget of 4 workers' organizations published;	Program monitoring and reports; Interviews with labor leaders and researchers; Monitoring of electoral process; Leadership rotation; Budget analysis; Reports; Relations with government and political parties	This outcome has been attained with the exception of the publishing of yearly progress reports and budgets of four workers' organizations.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> In Jordan, the project supported the establishment of the independent trade union federation. In Lebanon two independent trade unions were established (one is for the informal public servants) The bylaws of the General Federation of Oman Trade Unions was revised The bylaws of FENASOL are under revision <p>Three general assemblies were conducted in Oman, Bahrain and Jordan without outside interference</p>	Yearly	<p>Publishing of yearly progress reports and budgets of four workers' organizations.</p> <p>The project should further consolidate institution building and internal democracy by assisting union leaders in producing relevant documentation for decision making bodies and the membership in general.</p>
	Number of observations	1 observation submitted for	ILO supervisory	The outcome has been	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> 3 observation were submitted by Jordan, 	Yearly	

	submitted by workers' organizations for ILO supervisory mechanisms	ILO supervisory mechanisms	mechanisms; Interviews with trade union leaders	achieved	Bahrain and Lebanon		
--	--	----------------------------	---	----------	---------------------	--	--

Activity	Indicator	Target	Data Source	Evaluator's note	Data Disaggregation	Frequency	Recommendations for next phase
2.1. Provide workers' organizations with technical inputs on priority issues	Number of briefs developed and shared	At least 1 brief per country and 2 briefs for the region	Program monitoring and reports	The output can be considered produced although the literacy briefs are general for the region rather country related. However, country specific issues have been supported by the holding of national training activities.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> 7 thematic economic literacy briefs were developed (wages, macroeconomic policies, taxation, economic crisis, WTO, euro-med partnership and NAMA agreement) Thematic workshops were conducted in each country: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Oman (integrating women and youth in trade unions; wage policy and globalization; social dialogue) Bahrain (integrating women and youth in trade unions; trade union rights and freedoms) Jordan (integrating women in trade unions; wage policy and social protection; trade union rights and freedoms) 	Half-yearly	The project needs to develop a precise distribution plan and make the materials extensively accessible by, for example, making them available on-line. Also, some materials may need to be adapted from being of a general regional character to be country specific.

					<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Lebanon (wages and wage adjustment) 		
	Number of position papers issued by workers' organizations	At least 1 position paper issued per country	Interviews with trade union leaders	The outcome has been partly achieved only, as just one country position paper has been produced.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The GFBTU issued a comprehensive socio-economic programme on key priority issues in Bahrain. • The GFYTU in Yemen is finalizing its socio-economic programme. 	Yearly	Partner organizations in Oman, Lebanon and Jordan should be assisted in finalizing position papers.
	Number of legal amendments proposed by workers' organizations	At least 1 submission per country	Interviews with trade union leaders and relevant government officials	The outcome was attained with the exception of amendments proposed for Lebanon.	Three legal amendments were submitted in Jordan, Bahrain and Yemen	Yearly	Trade unions in Lebanon should be assisted in preparing legal amendments, if required.
2.2. Implement a comprehensive training program	Number of project focal points trained on training methodology and issues	7 project focal points	Program monitoring and reports	This output has not been produced. National Officers were initially appointed in some countries, but their contracts were not renewed with the exception of the NO in Lebanon.	By country and sex	Quarterly	Since it proved difficult to monitor the NOs activities outside Lebanon, the present arrangement with two collaborators in Lebanon who cover the whole region seems to be the best solution.

	Number of trainers trained	20 trainers per country trained for 25 days	Program monitoring and reports	This output has been partly produced only, both in terms of numbers and countries involved.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Three groups of trainers were trained and empowered in Palestine, Oman and Bahrain (15 people in each country) Training of trainers on collective bargaining with the PGFTU in Palestine Training of trade union organizers in the public sector with FENASOL 	Yearly	Training of trainers should be continued in the extension phase.
	Number of workers trained by the trainers	10 trainers per country train 100 workers under technical supervision	Program monitoring and reports	The outcome has in general not been attained.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> 40 workers trained in Bahrain 	Quarterly	National structured and leveled training activities should be the main activity for the remainder of the project.
2.3. Establish a Labor Education and Research Network for the Arab Region	Number of joint meetings held between trade unionists, civil society activists, and labor educators and researchers	1 national meeting per country, and 1 regional meeting	Program monitoring and reports	The output has not been fully produced since no national meetings have taken place.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Regional meeting regrouping civil society organizations and trade unions on organizing women workers Regional expert meeting regrouping trade union leaders and labour researchers entitled: "a workers perspective on socio-economic development in the Arab Region". Regional meeting on the right to strike 	Quarterly	In the last phase the project should look into the possibilities of forging links at the national level.
	Number of resource persons in	30 per country	Program monitoring	The output has not been fully produced as the full list for all countries so far include 38	By country, organization, and sex	Quarterly	In the evaluator's view, 30 resource persons may be somewhat optimistic in

	the developed database		and reports	persons only.			some countries. The project should concentrate on ensuring that in all countries, there is at least one resource person on each of the important topics. In addition, the list of resource persons should be more detailed with regard to competences and it should be made easily available, for example on-line.
	% of meeting participants who make regular use of the network	60% of meeting participants	Interviews with meeting participants	Since the network is still being established this outcome has not been attained.	By country, organization, and sex of participants	Final evaluation	For the final evaluation's verification of the use of the network, it is recommended to question the partner organizations rather than participants who do not necessarily are charged with educational responsibilities.