



# ILO EVALUATION

- Evaluation Title: **Making Decent Work a reality for domestic workers - Final evaluation**
- ILO TC/SYMBOL: **GLO/11/54/SID**
- Type of Evaluation : **final**
- Country(ies) : **India, Philippines, Paraguay, Tanzania, Zambia**
- Date of the evaluation: **Jul 2014**
- Name of consultant(s): **Una Murray**
- ILO Administrative Office: **INWORK**
- ILO Technical Backstopping Office: **INWORK**
- Donor: country and budget US\$ **499,999**
- Evaluation Manager: **Rasha Tabbara**

**This evaluation has been conducted according to ILO's evaluation policies and procedures. It has not been professionally edited, but has undergone quality control by the ILO Evaluation Unit.**

*July 11<sup>th</sup> 2014*

# **Final Evaluation Report**

---

**Making decent work a reality for domestic  
workers (ILO)**

---

**GLO/11/54/SID**

**Dr. Una Murray July 11<sup>th</sup> 2014**

## Quick Facts

---

<b>Donor:</b>	<b>Government of Sweden</b>
<b>Funds:</b>	\$1,178,658
<b>P&amp;B 2012-13</b>	<b>Outcome 05:</b> Working Conditions: Women and men have better and more equitable working conditions
<b>Technical Area:</b>	Making Decent Work a reality for Domestic Workers Conditions of Work and Equality
<b>Countries:</b>	Zambia, The Philippines, Paraguay, India, Tanzania also Cape Verde and Botswana (75 percent) Global (25 percent)
<b>CPO's</b>	ZMB 134 (Zambia also 1250MSID) PHL 132 (the Philippines) PGY 127 (Paraguay) IND127 (India) TZA104 (Tanzania) CPV 127 (Cape Verde) Botswana did not have a CPO
<b>Project Start:</b>	January 2012
<b>Project End:</b>	March 2014
<b>Project Code:</b>	GLO/11/54/SID
<b>Evaluation type:</b>	Final independent evaluation of Outcome Based Funding, Outcome 5
<b>Evaluation Management:</b>	Ms. Rasha Tabbara
<b>Evaluator:</b>	Dr. Una Murray
<b>Keywords:</b>	Domestic work; domestic workers; informal workers; contract workers; working conditions; minimum wages, social protection, ILO Convention 189

## Table of Contents

<b>QUICK FACTS</b> .....	<b>II</b>
<b>LIST OF ACRONYMS</b> .....	<b>V</b>
<b>ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS</b> .....	<b>VI</b>
<b>1. EXECUTIVE SUMMARY</b> .....	<b>2</b>
<b>2. BACKGROUND AND CONTEXT OF GLO/11/54/SID</b> .....	<b>2</b>
2.1 PROJECT INTRODUCTION .....	3
2.2 PROJECT ELEMENTS.....	3
2.3 ADMINISTRATION OF PROJECT AND ORGANIZATION OF WORK THROUGH THE PROJECT.....	6
<b>3. PURPOSE, SCOPE AND CLIENTS OF EVALUATION</b> .....	<b>8</b>
<b>4. EVALUATION METHODOLOGY</b> .....	<b>9</b>
4.1 THEORY OF CHANGE AND MEASURING IMPACT .....	9
4.2 METHODOLOGICAL APPROACH .....	9
4.3 CONSTRAINTS AND LIMITATIONS .....	11
<b>5. FINDINGS</b> .....	<b>11</b>
5.1 SUMMARY RESULTS BY COUNTRY .....	12
5.2 RELEVANCE AND ALIGNMENT WITH P&B AND CPOs.....	15
5.2.1 RELEVANCE OF INTERVENTIONS TO CPOS AND C189.....	15
5.2.2 RELEVANCE OF GLOBAL PRODUCTS.....	17
5.3 COHERENCE .....	17
5.3.1 COHERENCE OF IMPLEMENTATION STRATEGY WITH P&B OUTCOMES AND ILO C189.....	18
5.3.2 SYNERGIES WITH OTHER ILO INTERVENTIONS (INCLUDING OTHER DONORS).....	18
5.3.3 COHERENCE WITH RESPECT TO GENDER MAINSTREAMING .....	18
5.4 EFFECTIVENESS OF PROJECT OUTPUTS TOWARDS CPOs AND OUTCOME 5.....	19
5.4.1 EFFECTIVENESS OF OUTPUTS IN SUPPORTING THE ACHIEVEMENT OF CPOs & OUTCOME 5.....	20
5.5 IMPACT .....	25
5.5.1 ZAMBIA.....	25
5.5.2 PHILIPPINES .....	26
5.5.3 PARAGUAY .....	28
5.5.4 INDIA.....	29
5.5.5 TANZANIA.....	30
5.5.6 GLOBAL PRODUCT (KNOWLEDGE DISSEMINATION STRATEGY & FEEDBACK) .....	31
5.5.7 OTHER EVALUATION FINDINGS ON THE OVERALL IMPACT ORIENTATION .....	32
5.6 SUSTAINABILITY .....	35
5.6.1 ORGANISING DOMESTIC WORKERS TO SUSTAIN DEMANDS FOR DECENT WORK.....	35
5.6.2 SUSTAINABILITY ISSUES RAISED BY COUNTRIES.....	36
5.7 EFFICIENCY OF RESOURCE USE.....	41
5.7.1 ADDED VALUE OF SIDA RESOURCES TOWARD THE ACHIEVEMENT OF OUTCOME 5 .....	41
5.7.2 SYNERGIES BUILT DURING IMPLEMENTATION .....	42
<b>6. CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS</b> .....	<b>45</b>
6.1 CONCLUSIONS .....	45

<b>6.2 RECOMMENDATIONS</b> .....	<b>46</b>
6.2.1 RECOMMENDATIONS TO SUPPORT THE ACHIEVEMENT OF INDICATOR 5.1 (P&B).....	49
6.2.2 RECOMMENDATIONS TO SUPPORT THE ACHIEVEMENT OF INDICATOR 5.2 (P&B).....	51
6.2.3 RECOMMENDATIONS FOR 'GLOBAL PRODUCTS' .....	52
6.2.4 RECOMMENDATIONS FOR ILO HEADQUARTERS .....	52

**7. LESSONS LEARNED..... 54**

**8. ANNEXES..... 56**

<b>ANNEX 1: DOCUMENTS CONSULTED FOR EVALUATION</b> .....	<b>56</b>
<b>ANNEX 2: INTERVIEW QUESTIONS</b> .....	<b>61</b>
<b>ANNEX 3: LIST OF EVALUATION RESPONDENTS</b> .....	<b>64</b>
<b>ANNEX 4: TERMS OF REFERENCE FOR EVALUATION</b> .....	<b>67</b>
<b>ANNEX 5: EXPECTED RESULTS FROM OUTCOME 5 (2012-2013)</b> .....	<b>73</b>
<b>ANNEX 6: EMPLOYERS ORGANISATION AND THE PHILIPPINES</b> .....	<b>74</b>
<b>ANNEX 7: COMMENTS ON THE RESEARCH FOCUS IN SIDA</b> .....	<b>74</b>
<b>ANNEX 8: POINTS NOTED DURING EVALUATION WITH RESPECT TO COUNTRY LEVEL COHERENCE</b> .....	<b>78</b>
<b>ANNEX 9: GENDER RELATED ISSUES NOTED DURING EVALUATION</b> .....	<b>80</b>
<b>ANNEX 10: CHALLENGES REPORTED THAT STILL MUST BE ADDRESSED</b> .....	<b>82</b>
<b>ANNEX 11: RESULTS TABLES BY COUNTRY AND RESULTS FOR THE GLOBAL PRODUCT</b> .....	<b>85</b>
<b>ANNEX 12: LESSONS LEARNED TEMPLATES</b> .....	<b>95</b>

**LIST OF TABLES**

<b>TABLE 1: COUNTRY BREAKDOWN AND CATEGORY OF EVALUATION RESPONDENT</b> .....	<b>10</b>
<b>TABLE 2: SUMMARY OF RESULTS BY COUNTRY</b> .....	<b>12</b>
<b>TABLE 3: RELEVANT COUNTRY PROGRAMME OUTCOMES (CPOS) IN THE INTERVENTION COUNTRIES</b> .....	<b>16</b>
<b>TABLE 4: DOLE REPORTS ON THE STATUS OF IMPLEMENTATION OF THE DOMESTIC WORKERS ACT</b> .....	<b>27</b>
<b>TABLE 5: INCREASE IN DOMESTIC WORKERS REGISTERED FOR SOCIAL SECURITY, PARAGUAY</b> .....	<b>28</b>
<b>TABLE 6: ASSESSMENT OF DIRECT ASSISTANCE PROVIDED TO FIVE CPOS</b> .....	<b>34</b>
<b>TABLE 7: RATIO OF FUNDS USED</b> .....	<b>44</b>
<b>TABLE 8: RECOMMENDATIONS ARISING FROM THE EVALUATION</b> .....	<b>46</b>
<b>TABLE 9: ZAMBIA, RESULTS AND COMMENTS</b> .....	<b>85</b>
<b>TABLE 10: PHILIPPINES, RESULTS AND COMMENTS</b> .....	<b>87</b>
<b>TABLE 11: PARAGUAY, RESULTS &amp; COMMENT</b> .....	<b>89</b>
<b>TABLE 12: INDIA, RESULTS AND COMMENT</b> .....	<b>90</b>
<b>TABLE 13: TANZANIA, RESULTS AND COMMENTS</b> .....	<b>92</b>
<b>TABLE 14: GLOBAL PRODUCTS, RESULTS AND COMMENTS</b> .....	<b>94</b>

## List of acronyms

---

ACI	Areas of Critical Importance (strategic framework, ILO)
ACTEMP	ILO's Bureau for Employers Activity
ACTRAV	ILO's Bureau for Workers' Activities
ATE	Association of Tanzania Employers
Batas Kasambahay	Domestic Workers Act, Philippines
C189	ILO Convention 189 concerning Decent Work for Domestic Workers
CHODAWU	Conservation, Hotels, Domestic and Allied Workers Union, Tanzania
CPO	Country Programme Outcomes
DFID	UK Department for International Development
DW	Domestic Worker
DW TWG	Domestic Workers, Technical Working Group, Philipipnes
DWCP	ILO Decent Work Country Programmes
DWDW	Decent Work for Domestic Workers (acronym for project at the country level).
ECOP	Employers Confederation of the Philippines
Excol	ILO contract for external collaborator
Grps	Groups (abbreviation)
IDWF	International Domestic Workers Federation
ILC	International Labour Conference
Incl	Including
IPEC	ILO Child Labour Programme
IRR	Implementing Rules and Regulations (for law) Philippines
IPS	Social Security Institute Paraguay
IPSOS	Zambia, private institution for training and consultancy
ITUC	International Trade Union Confederation
Leeaz	Labour employment consultants, Zambia
MoU	Memorandum of Understanding
MW	Minimum Wage
NPC	National Project Coordinator
NDWM	National Domestic Workers Movement, India
OSH	Occupational Safety and Health
P&B	ILO Programme and Budget
PARDEV	ILO's Partnerships and Development Cooperation Department
RBSA	Regular Budget Supplementary Account
RBTC	Regular Budget Technical Cooperation
ROAP	ILO's Regional Office for Asia and the Pacific
Sida	Swedish International Development Cooperation Agency
ToT	Training of Trainers
TU	Trade Union
UNDAP	United Nations Delivering as One Programme, Tanzania
ZFE	Zambian Federation of Employers
TWG	Tripartite Technical Working Group on Domestic Workers, the Philippines,

## **Acknowledgements**

---

The Evaluator would like to sincerely thank the evaluation manager Rasha Tabbara, the ILO Evaluation office (Francisco Guzman) for their comments and support in conducting this evaluation. The evaluator would also like to acknowledge and sincerely thank the ILO domestic work team at INWORK ILO Geneva (Inclusive Labour Markets, Labour Relations and Working Conditions Branch) for their access and support in conducting this evaluation, and their immediate responses to the many queries throughout the process, in particular the CTA for the project.

A special thanks also to the two ILO national project coordinators in Zambia and the Philippines (and the project assistant in Zambia) who generously hosted and facilitated visits to the project and efficiently organised meetings with project stakeholders. Thanks also to Lena Reichstetter who provided help in Spanish translation and interviews in Paraguay. Sincere thanks to all stakeholders who took time to be interviewed or responded to questionnaires, providing their useful observations and perceptions, in particular domestic workers. In Zambia and the Philippines, a specific appreciation is due to those domestic workers who took time off to meet the evaluator and answer difficult and personal questions.

Una Murray, July 11<sup>th</sup> 2014

# 1. Executive Summary

---

## Introduction

ILO Convention 189 concerns rights of Domestic Workers. Decent work for domestic workers implies that they are entitled to a clear communication on their employment conditions, minimum wages, rest hours, freedom to choose how to spend their free time and are protected from violence in their workplace. Those engaged in domestic work should not be under the national minimum age of employment. Progress towards decent work for domestic workers is reported in ILO under Outcome 5 in the Strategic Planning Framework, with two indicators.

## Background and Context

Funding through the Government of Sweden (Sida) towards Outcome 5 allowed ILO to provide technical support for follow-up actions in relation to C189 along the lines of the *Resolution concerning efforts to make decent work a reality for domestic workers worldwide* adopted by the International Labour Conference in June 2011. Funding allowed ILO to operationally explore ways in which national governments could be facilitated to implement and enforce measures to make decent work a reality for domestic workers in line with Outcome 5 measurement criteria. The central focus was on the provision of what are called 'Global Products' and a set of activities in five countries (Paraguay, India, Zambia, Tanzania and The Philippines). Sweden specified a 75/25 funding ratio between headquarters and field. The countries were chosen based on whether domestic work featured in their Country Programme Outcomes (CPOs). The actual initiatives in each country were designed around the measurement criteria in the P&B (under indicators 5.1 and 5.2), which is a good practice. Sida funds were used to assist constituents in Cape Verde and Botswana on

minimum wage policy for vulnerable workers including domestic workers. In Botswana, the government specifically requested assistance for minimum wage setting for agricultural workers and domestic workers. Global products concern the production of a new knowledge base and policy tools in selected policy themes.

**Purpose, scope and clients of evaluation**  
The purpose of this final evaluation is to assess the relevance, effectiveness, efficiency, coherence, impact and sustainability of ILO's actions taken under the Sida funds. The methodological approach focused on the outputs of the different initiatives and tried to determine how the outputs contributed to the measurement criteria under Outcome 5, what has worked and what has not worked. The Evaluator obtained information about the performance of ILO headquarters staff, ILO field staff offices and constituents against progress in making decent work a reality for domestic workers. She focused on the factors that affected ILO's staff and their constituents' performance positively or negatively. Sida, outcome 5 coordinators and ILO staff are the main clients of the evaluation, so they can improve their future programmes.

## Evaluation methodology

The methodological approach in the evaluation focused on how Swedish funds contributed overall to Outcome 5 and contributed to Indicators 5.1 and 5.2. Evidence came through a document review, interviews and questionnaire responses from ILO and constituents, about 118 individuals responded in total (about 12-14 domestic workers). Two countries were visited, Zambia and the Philippines. A less thorough analysis of Paraguay, India and Tanzania took place.



## Main findings

In general, the resources from Sida were highly appreciated, necessary, effective and produced results (more in some countries than others). Activities could not have been initiated without resources. Most countries are sustaining activities following the decent work for domestic workers initiatives in their country programme outcomes for 2014-2015.

The Chief Technical Advisor very closely monitored Sida-funded Outcome 5 activities from Geneva, and along with her team provided timely advice and monitoring visits to countries involved. A good monitoring system was in place, which allowed for problems to be addressed before they become major issues.

Highlights of achievements include the Ratification of C189 in the Philippines and Paraguay. The sexual harassment of women at the workplace Act in India included domestic workers. A national plan of action to make decent work a reality for domestic workers has been developed by tripartite partners in Tanzania and a Domestic Labour Act enforced in the Philippines. With the exception of employers organisations in India, tripartite constituents in all countries of focus implemented information dissemination and awareness raising campaigns on improving working conditions with respect to domestic work, the results of which are difficult to determine. Notably in Paraguay results with respect to an increased number of domestic workers registered for social security following an awareness campaign, were documented.

The effectiveness of training strategies for improving working conditions for domestic workers are less clearly measurable, although a number of workshops took place for trade unions and government officials in India, Zambia, and the Philippines. Many ILO staff and constituents thought gender issues were addressed because the focus was on women workers, rather than a deeper analysis of inequalities in the gender division of labour.

ILO had produced the first reliable global and regional estimates of the number of domestic workers and the extent of their legal protection. The ILO organized seven regional tripartite knowledge-sharing forums on domestic work using regular budget funds along with Sida resources. Global products to which Sida funds contributed (along with ILO Regular Budget) included research on domestic work and minimum wage impact; the development of a primary research methodology to present a profile of domestic workers and their employers and minimum wage 'before and after' impact assessment in Cape Verde. In addition a policy resources package on the domestic work sector included resources on extending legal protection to domestic workers; limiting and regulating working hours; minimum wage fixing; and enforcement, compliance and labour inspection. A more thorough dissemination strategy for these products must now be rolled out.

Most stakeholders questioned during the course of this evaluation reported that ILO project outputs and products (to the extent they are known) were very effective in moving forward with decent work for domestic workers (and hence CPO outcomes). For example funds from Sida and ILO technical support to the tripartite Technical Working Group on Domestic Workers in the Philippines was very effective in supporting the ratification of Convention 189 and devising the required *Implementing Rules and Regulations* for the *Domestic Workers Act*.

All countries have follow-up CPOs to sustain achievements. A key problem for sustaining achievements is commitment from ILO staff when a key ILO resource person is no longer responsible in-country. ILO programming frameworks only allow for a small number of projects to get funded for short periods. Without designated funding, initiatives that focus on Domestic Workers, who are only one category of workers, have to compete with the many other outcomes and employment related issues in a particular ILO country

office. Sustaining a focus depends on commitment from country office directors.

### **Conclusions**

The work throughout the project reinforced the fact that the mechanisms and process involved in initiating and developing information product matters, and it is important to ensure tripartite partners are involved in planning, monitoring and validating research and other information products. Reactions in country to minimum wages for domestic workers were mixed, with confusion about affordability. Rigorous impact studies are required to clarify affordability for different categories of earners. Introducing rights for domestic workers requires a lot of 'mind changes' amongst tripartite representatives who are also employers themselves. Some countries may be ready for a stronger focus on gender inequalities in the domestic work sector, rather than the current focus on women's workers rights. However giving voice to this group of 'invisible' women is a valid initial strategy in some countries.

Policy related support may require more flexibility (and regular funding) than technical cooperation allows, particularly when it is a relative new 'sector of focus' such as domestic work, which does not yet have a tried and testing methodology. Results based management can often seem very stringent from a country office perspective. Sometimes initiatives are taken that may seem chaotic from a measurement of results perspective, but these initiatives may be important for political purposes. Political support is important for the adoption of legislation or national plans of action, but does not always fit neatly into results oriented reporting boxes. The reality is that policy process issues are not linear processes. A key element for success is experienced, dedicated, astute and technical competent ILO staff.

The evaluation concludes that much has been done effectively and efficiently with the Sida funds in, yet much remains to be done in the countries of focus and other countries to ensure this new Convention receives the

respect it deserves through demonstrating effective implementation in a number of countries.

### **Recommendations**

Recommendations are organised around the measurement criteria for Outcome 5 with other recommendations for ILO alone. To implement draft national policies forward for domestic workers more consultation and discussion is still required at various levels; a focus on other ministerial departments beyond the ministry of labour is necessary in the future to ensure smooth implementation and cross-governmental collaboration particularly for communicating down the line new legislation or policy. Attention to the details of implementation of legislation is essential, to avoid pitfalls. ILO should improve its measurement of how ILO actually informs or influences policy. Documenting national policy process stressing the non-linear aspects of the policy may be useful for others to learn (focused on the Philippines or Paraguay).

It is important to continue to encourage all domestic workers to be registered and have a contract with employers. For wider information dissemination definitions of domestic workers must be made very explicit in all ILO documentation on employment policies or labour laws. Further sensitisation campaigns on the rights of domestic workers are required, reminding trade unions of their obligation to these informal workers. Strategies that prove effective in organising employers of domestic workers and organising domestic workers into trade unions could be summarised in a policy brief.

Some type of research support and quality review framework for research in ILO is required. An independent peer process to review research is suggested. More efforts are required to ensure that research actually feeds into policy processes; some resources on how to do this are provided in the evaluation report. Explorations on whether skills training for domestic workers will actually raise wages in the sector are required. Evidently any skills

training curriculum for domestic workers must include rights issues. More tripartite discussion on minimum wages are required overall and many ministries require support in devising minimum wages.

It is important that ILO continue to use staff that has considerable experience of working on the domestic workers sector so that institutional knowledge is not lost. A long term funding perspective with regard to decent work for domestic workers is required so that activities can be planned and technical inputs provided from time to time. Some type of mobile policy advisory unit may be relevant.

### **Lessons learned**

A strategy on domestic workers cannot be steered unless ownership is given to others and many levels of expertise are necessary to implement the decent work for domestic workers strategy. Many stakeholders stressed the importance of tripartite structures to oversee activities and interventions on domestic workers. Considerable efforts must be made to ensure domestic workers

themselves have 'voice' in larger trade unions involved in official tripartite negotiations.

Political dimensions and political leadership are important and should not be ignored. In-depth and detailed knowledge of the policy process is essential for national work around domestic workers (and workers rights generally). Having experts at hand at all times to provide quick answers to political and technical questions is essential whilst national legislation is being formulated. Solid monitoring (e.g. from Geneva and from the NPCs in the Philippines, and ILO staff in Paraguay) worked to provide timely advice for adjustments. For implementation of measures to improve the working conditions for domestic workers, precise attention to detail with regard to implementation provisions of a new law is essential. Beyond the ministry of labour, working with other ministries is important for ILO. Finally the two-year time-frame of outcome based funding support make impacts on the ground for domestic workers difficult to locate, much progress occurs as a result of years of support, continuous engagement and awareness raising.

## 2. Background and context of GLO/11/54/SID

---

### Introduction

The ILO Convention 189 (C189) is a major step in providing standards against which to measure improvement in working and living conditions for domestic workers across the world. C189 is much welcomed amongst advocates around the world as many governments still exclude domestic workers from labour laws. In fact, domestic workers tend to be amongst the least protected workers, lacking basic rights and protection. This Convention has created a strong momentum to do something concrete about the world's 53 million (or more) domestic workers and recognise them as employees who are entitled to labour rights.

In September 2013, ILO Convention 189 came into force. By May 11 2014, it had been ratified by 13 member states, and in force in 7 of these countries. As a relatively new Convention, many countries are keen to learn from the experiences of countries that have ratified the Convention and put it in force. Countries can of course align their national laws prior to ratifying the Convention, and many have done so. According to Luebker (2014) some changes since the Convention include:<sup>1</sup>

- In Thailand, domestic workers no longer have to work on public holidays
- In Singapore, they are guaranteed a weekly day of rest,
- Namibia is setting a minimum wage for domestic workers.
- In Bahrain, the new Labour Code includes a number of provisions for domestic workers.
- In the Philippines, the new Domestic Workers Act sets out detailed rules and protection for domestic workers.
- The United States has extended wage and overtime protection to the nearly 2 million direct care workers who help elderly or disabled people in their homes.
- The European Union called on its members to act to implement ILO Convention 189

Even with changes in national legislation, compliance with national law is often weak. Implementation and enforcement requires considerable attention in the process of ensuring good intentions get translated into impacts in the workplace of domestic workers.

ILO is implementing a 'global strategy' towards the goal of making decent work a reality for domestic workers worldwide. The global strategy is attempting to unify support and outline practical approaches to address challenges in the sector. The strategy focuses at many different levels and requires funding from ILO's regular budget as well as from donors. ILO's Decent Work Agenda is detailed in the 19 outcomes set out in the Strategic Policy Framework (2012-15). Domestic work falls under Outcome 5 (*Women and men have better and more equitable working conditions*) in the 2012-13 ILO Strategic Framework. Amongst other Outcomes the Swedish Government had an interest in funding towards Outcome 5, with a focus on domestic workers.

---

<sup>1</sup> <http://www.ipc-undp.org/pub/IPCPovertyInFocus27.pdf> or [http://www.ilo.org/global/about-the-ilo/newsroom/comment-analysis/WCMS\\_236843/lang--en/index.htm](http://www.ilo.org/global/about-the-ilo/newsroom/comment-analysis/WCMS_236843/lang--en/index.htm)

## 2.1 Project introduction

Outcome based funding is a funding modality that allows donors to ‘lightly earmark’ their funding by specifying the Outcomes they would like to support. Responsibility for ensuring the quality of initiatives funded through this mechanism lies with PARDEV. Amongst other outcomes Sweden contributed towards Outcome 5 (*Women and men have improved and more equitable working conditions*), generously provided \$1,067,504 towards this Outcome without earmarking funds toward specific countries.

Funding through the Government of Sweden towards Outcome 5 allowed ILO to provide technical support and operationally explore ways in which national governments could be facilitated to implement and enforce measures to make decent work a reality for domestic workers. Countries can avail of outcome based funding if they have a Country Programme Outcome (CPO) linked to the main Outcome in the ILO Strategic Framework (which has 19 Outcomes). A quarter of the funding provided was allocated towards the provision of what is called ‘Global Products’. Three quarters of the funds were decentralised to organise a set of activities in five countries (Paraguay, India, Zambia, Tanzania and The Philippines). The quarter allocation to headquarters allowed for coordination of the field activities as well as funding for overall resources towards domestic work (see global products below).

Swedish funds were translated into the project GLO/11/54/SID often referred to as *Decent Work for Domestic Workers* (DWDW) or the *Sida domestic work* project. The overall goal of GLO/11/54/SID (DWDW) was to advance decent work for domestic workers. DWDW initiatives began in 2012, six months after the landmark Convention on Domestic Workers<sup>2</sup>, was adopted during the 100th session of the ILO in June 2012. The Convention entered into force on 5 September 2013.

## 2.2 Project elements

GLO/11/53/SID was planned in line with the Outcome 5 Indicator 5.1, in that it aimed to support – *Women and men have better and more equitable working conditions*. Elements also linked to Indicator 5.2 capacities to implement sound wages.

*DWDW* was implemented through policy advice, capacity development and guidance to national constituents with practical examples from elsewhere with new relevant information obtained through the global product element of the project. At the country level, direct assistance was provided to five CPOS. The project documented (TRAVAIL) outlined how ILO was to assist governments and social partners to design, assess and implement strategies policies, laws or other measures to promote decent work for domestic workers. Typically ILO assistance in different countries centred on:

- Advocacy towards the ratification of Convention 189
- Commissioning and overseeing studies on the conditions and magnitude of domestic work
- Bringing stakeholders together to develop tripartite recommendations such as those that related to extending social protection schemes, consider minimum wages, organising, or implementing a plan of action to improve decent work for domestic workers.
- Supporting stakeholders to organise awareness raising campaigns on the plight of domestic workers.
- Considering domestic work in terms of skills training frameworks to justify better wages for domestic workers.

---

<sup>2</sup> which sets labour standards for domestic workers

## Global Products

Apart from providing direct technical assistance to specific countries, the development and dissemination of what is termed a 'global product' to constituents is incorporated in the ILO strategy for domestic workers. Global products help to respond to constituent's particular needs to align national legislation and other efforts with Convention 189. The aim of 'global products' is to help constituents address the challenges in the domestic work sector by providing 'instruments', 'examples', 'case studies', 'methodologies' or 'policy measures' that have been tried and tested and may be applicable in other contexts.

The Global Products originally planned under Outcome 5 for the 2012-2013 biennium (to which Sida contributed) included:

i) Policy resource packages on four selected themes:

- extension of effective legal protection to domestic workers;
- compliance and enforcement;
- wages and working time in domestic work; and
- organization of domestic workers. Depending on the specific topic and target audience, these resource packages would include case studies, guides, manuals, policy briefs, and/or training modules, and would draw material from regional knowledge-sharing forums, research and pilot tests.

ii) Guidelines on methodologies for assessing (and monitoring) the situation in domestic work based on the experience of pilot measures.

## Context Zambia

In 2011, the government of Zambia enacted a *Domestic Workers Order* covering minimum wages and conditions of employment for domestic workers. This was published as Statutory Instrument No. 3. As this was the first time that Zambia had passed legislation for domestic workers as such, there was a strong interest in promoting compliance.

A Zambian project under the ILO Special Action Programme to Combat Forced Labour (SAP-FL, Irish Aid funded), and a joint UN joint programme on human trafficking (with IOM, UNICEF and ILO) paved the way for *DWDW* activities in Zambia. So also did ILO child labour programmes under the IPEC programme. These programmes worked with ILO tripartite partners, and resulted in a number of initiatives that facilitated the domestic work project. For example stemming from earlier ILO-IPEC Child Labour in Commercial Agriculture (Com-Agri) Projects, a technical working group had been set up (comprising representatives from the government, trade unions as well as employers). The Zambian Federation of Employers (ZFE) developed a *Code of Conduct for Employers of Domestic Workers in Zambia* through the SAP-FL initiative.

## Context Philippines

Previous ILO funded initiatives related to the campaign on the adoption of international labour standards for domestic workers. This current project focused on supporting this standard setting process, and supporting the passage of a national law on domestic workers through the Domestic Work Technical Working Group (which included tripartite constituents, domestic workers and social partners). Support was also provided through the ILO Regular Budget Supplementary Account (RBSA). Previous support had been through the ILO-Luxembourg Framework Agreement Thematic Contribution between 2010-12.

NGOs such as the *Visayan Forum Foundation* and the *Asian Asia Migrant Domestic Workers' Alliance* had long been involved in advocating for the trafficking of domestic and migrant workers and had continuously lobbied for the government to do something concrete about the plight of these workers. Initially the government wished to propose laws that were binding for migrant domestic workers, without binding recommendations for national domestic workers. ILO had provided support over the past decade to a range of initiatives around migrant workers. ILO had also worked with the *Visayan Forum Foundation* on child labour issues and internal domestic workers issues. A common tripartite position on domestic work was achieved prior to the International Labour Conference in 2011.

In 2011, the Philippine Senate concurred with the President's decision to ratify C189. The Labour Secretary required ILO support for the ratification process and the passage of a new law on Domestic Workers. The project work in the Philippines must be viewed historically as part of a continuous and iterative process in the Philippines to ensure decent work for domestic workers.

### **Context Paraguay**

"In Paraguay domestic workers frequently faces formal job discrimination and a violation of their employment rights. Employers only have to pay domestic workers 40 percent of minimum wages and they are not entitled pension rights. Prior to 2009 Domestic Workers outside Asuncion could not register for social security, but this changed when a modification was made in 2009, which gave Domestic Workers in the whole country the right to register. By 2011 the government had expressed commitment to improving the working conditions of domestic workers and further, in December 2012 the ILO Convention 189 was ratified.

The activities funded under Sida in Paraguay must be seen within the framework of a longer process to promote Convention 189 and extend social security, which had support from social partners. For instance a Spanish MDG multi-agency project named *Oportunidades* ran between 2009 and 2013. ILO participated in this multi-agency project, focusing among other areas, on increasing Domestic Workers rights in general and the ratification of C189. A skills training focus in Paraguay started with the MDG multi-agency project. The MDG project had started to work on training curricula for the National Training Institute, but the process was at an embryonic stage when the Sida supported initiatives began.

### **Context India**

With a population of over 1.2 billion people, India poses completely different sets of challenges than the other countries supported through the Sida *DWDW* project. India is a federation made up of 28 states, with different laws, linguistics and administrators. Although anti-discrimination laws and social welfare programmes are slowly making changes across the Indian continent, many highlight that the Indian caste system still functions to stratify society placing social restrictions on who can do what including in lower paid sections of the workforce. A focus on domestic workers is fairly new to India. There is still relatively little acceptance amongst employers, (which includes trade unionists who employ domestic workers) of the need to focus on this growing sector. Employer representative organisations have not really engaged with ILO yet on the issue of domestic workers.

Despite the above, there are stakeholders keen to improve the working conditions of domestic workers. In 2010-11 a Task Force on Domestic Workers, chaired by the Labour Ministry, drafted a national policy on domestic workers (this task force is now closed). The draft policy (in line with Convention 189) sets directions for improving the protection of domestic workers' rights and their working conditions, including the extension of health insurance coverage (called RSBY) to domestic workers. Furthermore minimum wage fixing for domestic workers at state-level was considered.<sup>3</sup> ILO

---

<sup>3</sup> Minimum wages are covered under the India minimum wage Act 1948, but it seems it is up to each state to fix minimum wages

provided support for these initiatives. This draft national policy remains pending with Cabinet. The recommendations from the final report of the Task Force on Domestic Workers September 2011<sup>4</sup> provided a framework for the formulation of the Sida funded initiatives, which began about six months after these recommendations were presented. A tripartite-plus Gender Taskforce was established in 2011, led by the Ministry of Labour and Employment, to guide policy and implementation of issues related to gender equality in the world of work. Sida support for domestic workers in India was linked to a gender mainstreaming ILO project *Basic II* funded by Norway.

## Context Tanzania

The United Republic of Tanzania was one of the countries that gave solid tripartite support to the adoption of C189 and R201 in 2011. The immediate objective of the Sida project in Tanzania was increased capacity of government and social partners to promote decent work for domestic workers. Some issues related to domestic work were already covered in the *Employment and Labour Relations Act*, 2004. For example this Act requires the provision of extensive written particulars at the beginning of employment. The employer must ensure that the terms are explained to the domestic worker in a manner that she or he understands. The Ministry of Labour had expressed commitment toward doing more for domestic workers, acknowledging that efforts remained to prepare Tanzania for the process of ratifying the C189 Convention. Like India, child labour is common in Tanzania. Girls are commonly employed as domestic servants.

ILO has already been working towards promoting improved and equal working conditions for domestic workers by providing policy advisory services and supporting technical assistance projects in Tanzania and Zanzibar.

## ***2.3 Administration of project and organization of work through the project***

GLO/11/54/SID had a CTA based in Geneva who had been working on domestic workers for many years. A Technical Officer, *Working Conditions, Domestic Work* in Geneva, supported her. They coordinated the Global Products (and developed some), and provided assistance to country level activities. There were inadequate funds to hire a National Project Coordinator (NPC) in each of the five countries of focus. In the Philippines there was a NPC, supported by a gender focal point. In India the NPC was shared with another project, (*BASIC II focused on gender*). In Zambia there was an NPC shared with a 'forced labour' project. Initially in Tanzania the UNDAP coordinator worked on the project. However when the UNDAPs workload proved too high, a NPC was hired (in the second year). The work in Paraguay was supported from ILO Santiago office in Chile initially by the Senior Gender Specialist (and later by a long term Gender Consultant) as well as others in the regional office. In country, a Paraguayan Consultant provided much support however alongside an ILO officer from the youth employment project. Funds for CPOs were decentralised to four country offices and one regional office (Santiago).

---

<sup>4</sup> Report authored by the Director General Labour Welfare, Ministry of Labour and Employment, Government of India. September 12 2011





### **3. Purpose, scope and clients of evaluation**

---

The purpose of this final evaluation is to assess the relevance, effectiveness, efficiency, coherence, impact and sustainability of ILO's action taken under this outcome based Sida funding (GLO/11/54/SID). Specifically the evaluation sought to review the added value of Sida resources to the achievement of the Global Product and the five key CPOS. Annex 4 contains the *Terms of Reference* for this evaluation.

Outcome based funding monitoring is managed by PARDEV. Reports are required from each CPO intervention and these are assembled into an annual report for each donor. Results from interventions by different sources of funds (RBSA, TC or outcome based funding) are merged into the overall results for the Outcome. It can be difficult to decipher exactly what contributed directly to what (particularly for an individual ILO staff member involved in implementation and not directly involved in budgeting or programming). Nevertheless PARDEV and PROGRAM attempt to break down contributions. The overall results related to donors earmarked Outcomes are reported directly to donors in a special report. Over all within ILO, Outcome Results under the specific indicators (in this case 5.1 and 5.2) are reported under criteria for measurement in the Programme and Budget (P&B) Biennium Report.

The evaluation centred on how the Swedish funds have facilitated ILO to have a much stronger focus on domestic workers as a category of the most vulnerable workers, in line with planned objectives of GLO/11/54/SID and the ILO Strategy for Action for Domestic Workers. The broad scope concerns how Sida support (via ILO) has facilitated constituents to take on board domestic workers as an important category of workers and adopt policies or implement strategies to promote their improved working conditions, ultimately contributing to Outcome 5 indicators. Impacts must however be considered in terms of contributions to Indicators 5.1 (and somewhat to 5.2) under Outcome 5 (*women and men have improved and more equitable working conditions*) in the ILO Programme and Budget for the Biennium 2012-2013.

The evaluation also examined how ILO has disseminated information through their global products, sharing lessons from their work on domestic workers to a wider audience.

The clients of this evaluation are Sweden as project donor, ILO as executor of the project, particularly ILO TRAVAIL and PARDEV in Geneva, as well as project staff in the countries of focus. It would be expected that ILO country based staff would share relevant results with constituents, particularly those interviewed during the evaluation or those who responded to questionnaires.

## 4. Evaluation methodology

---

The principles and approach adopted during the evaluation were in line with the norms for evaluation in the UN System, the ILO policy and strategic framework for evaluation,<sup>5</sup> and in line with OECD/DAC criteria for international development evaluations.

### 4.1 Theory of change and measuring impact

Overall the evaluator attempted to understand the theory of change behind the interventions. For example how ILO support was understood to contribute to the intended or observed outcomes or any observable impacts. Impact refers usually to lasting or significant changes in people's lives. These can be positive as well as negative changes or intended and unintended changes brought about by ILO and social partners interventions. Apart from the expected measurement criteria results outlined in the P&B, in the case of this project, the expected and ultimate impact would be improvements in the lives and livelihoods of domestic workers. Economic impacts could include for example an increase in the level of income resulting in a change in the vulnerability status of domestic worker. This could be due to a move to monetized payment for domestic workers rather than payment in-kind or a raise in wages. Social-cultural impacts could a change in power relations between domestic workers and employers as domestic workers move more into the formal economy. Social impacts could also relate to the way society respects and values this form of work. Another level of impact could relate to domestic workers and their own personal view of themselves and their profession. This type of impact would refer more to the empowerment of domestic workers, which often can only be supported through collective action (the unionization and organization of domestic workers). Measuring empowerment is complex and generally requires qualitative studies.

Although examining the above impacts would certainly be interesting and relevant, it must be stressed however that impacts cannot be found without adequate baseline information and adequate time to conduct rigorous studies (to compare the before and after situation) in a particular region. Secondly, *Outcome Based Funding, which is linked to two-year cycles*, does not allow sufficient time for certain types of impacts to occur. Instead the evaluation attempted to examine process indicators of impact or the impact orientation of the project outputs to date. For example the approval of legislative changes for domestic workers will be a lasting change if implementation goes smoothly, even if it is too early to measure the effect on domestic workers themselves. The sanction of a study on the working conditions of domestic workers by an authoritative agency will allow a study to have more sustained impact as more people may attention to the study results. The official approval of an action plan will demonstrate that a process is in place with commitment to implement (evidently if funding is allocated for implementation greater commitment is demonstrated). The release of funds from stakeholders other than ILO will demonstrate a commitment to sustained follow up, hopefully leading to impact on the ground for domestic workers. The increased mobilization of domestic workers into association or trade unions should demonstrate increased self-awareness by virtue of domestic workers commitment to financially commit to join. The continuation of awareness raising or other activities after the financial withdrawal of ILO is also a process indicator of impact. The impact of the technical support provided in the five main countries of *DWDW* focus (Zambia, Tanzania, India, the Philippines and Paraguay) was examined in this light.

### 4.2 Methodological approach

The methodological approach focused on how Swedish funds contributed overall to Outcome 5 and contributed to Indicators 5.1 and 5.2 in the P&B for 2012-2013. The evaluation attempts to describe how direct assistance to five CPOs, through headquarters, regional and country offices progressively

---

<sup>5</sup> UNEG 29 April 2005 and ILO GB 294<sup>th</sup> Session, Nov 2005

contributed to the measurement criteria under 5.1 (and to some extent 5.2). Monitoring of outcomes in ILO's Strategic Framework and Programme and Budget (P&B, 2012-2013) is a continual process for Outcome Coordinators. The Evaluator supplemented outcome reports, P&B reports, with more detailed project reports and monitoring information along with direct contact with stakeholders related to this project.

Evidence came through interviews and questionnaire responses from social partners and ILO. PARDEV indicated that the donor did not necessarily wish to be interviewed. The Evaluator visited two countries, the Philippines and Zambia, to attempt to examine the impact on the ground. Interviews with domestic workers and organisations that represent domestic workers took place in these two countries. In the other three countries, evidence was found through a document review, telephone/Skype interviews and written questionnaire responses. Over 150 people were contacted in total and 118 people responded (see Table 1 below) either through interviews or written responses. A full list of those contacted who responded is outlined in Annex 3. Activities in Cape Verde and Botswana were examined only through interviews with ILO headquarters staff. Excluding ILO headquarters staff, the majority of respondents were from Trade Unions (including smaller domestic workers unions). India had the lowest response rate to the questionnaires sent (twice) by email. No employers responded from India, nor did any of the large trade unions. Those representing domestic workers in trade unions responded however.

#### The evaluation methodology encompassed:

- A desk review of relevant project documentation and other relevant publications from ILO
- Preparation of an evaluation instrument to document and analyze progress towards intended outcomes
- Visit to ILO Geneva to interview key ILO staff involved with the project
- Visit to Zambia to meet key ILO constituents and domestic workers associations
- Visit to the Philippines to meet key ILO constituents and domestic workers associations
- Short questionnaire (Annex 2 contains types of questions asked) and telephone /Skype interviews with other ILO GLO/11/54/SID stakeholders from India, Paraguay and Tanzania.

**Table 1: Country breakdown and category of evaluation respondent**

	<i>ILO staff</i>	<i>Government or govt related agency</i>	<i>Trade Union or Domestic workers association</i>	<i>Employers organisations</i>	<i>Other e.g. universities or research institute, NGOs</i>	<i>Total interviewed or who responded</i>
<i>ILO HQ</i>	12	-	-	-	-	12
<i>Zambia</i>	5	2	16 (9 DWs <sup>6</sup> )	3	11	37
<i>Philippines</i>	5	5	12 (4 DWs)	4	8	34
<i>Paraguay</i>	5	4	4 (3 DWs)	3	2	18
<i>India</i>	4	1	3	0	0	8
<i>Tanzania</i>	3	2	1	1	2	9
<b>Total</b>	34	14	36	11	23	118

The methodology drew from a range of tools available for use in social research, triangulating across data sources. This approach was outlined in an inception report approved by ILO in late March 2013. Both primary and secondary sources of information were used. For the latter a large list of documents has been provided via *dropbox* access to the Evaluator, and other documents were added as the evaluation progressed. For primary sources of information, interviews - both opened-ended and semi-structured questions took place, with separate sets of questions for workers organisations

<sup>6</sup> DWs = Domestic Workers

representing domestic workers. The selection of interviewees were made internally in ILO but added to based on discussions with ILO staff. The pre-prepared questions linked the interview questions to the objectives of the ILO project (GLO/11/54/SID).

### **4.3 Constraints and limitations**

Evidently time was a constraint. In 35 days, focusing on 5 countries, a range of global products, and travel to two project countries (and to Geneva), an evaluator cannot fully understand the nuances inherent in a project of this type and will have missed important detail.

The evaluation had a stronger focus on the Philippines and Zambia as the evaluator visited those countries. Consequently there is relatively a less thorough review of initiatives in Paraguay, Tanzania and India. It proved difficult to get responses from India, which is understandable given it was in the middle of an election and given the size of the country. However it was disappointing that the larger trade unions did not respond even though they were asked on a number of occasions. In the Philippines the timing did not correspond with a domestic workers event that had been organised. This event would have provided the evaluator with ample opportunity to talk to many domestic workers in an informal setting. A smaller group (4) of domestic workers were interviewed instead. The evaluator did not have the scope to review in detail the contents of outputs through ILO country offices nor the use of ILO knowledge products in the field.

## **5. Findings**

---

The following sections outline findings organised under the OECD/DAC criteria of relevance, coherence, effectiveness, impact, sustainability and efficiency. Table 2 contains a summary table of findings. A series of results tables for each core country and for the global product element are provided in Annex 11. In general, the resources from Sida that contributed to the findings in the report were highly appreciated, necessary, effective and produced results (more in some countries than others). Activities could not have been initiated without resources. Most countries are sustaining activities following the *DWDW* focus.

### **Monitoring and strategies for reducing risks**

All Sida funded outcome 5 activities were very closely monitored by the Chief Technical Advisor (CTA) in Geneva, who travelled often to the countries of focus and communicated extremely regularly with the NPCs and project staff by Skype and email. The CTA designed Country Programme Outputs (CPO) flash reports as monitoring tools. These forms requested national programme coordinators to report every six months on the highlights of project achievements, progress, the status of ongoing initiatives and outputs as well as any difficulties and a summary of funding spent. The CPO flash reports provided excellent details in most cases, and were very useful for historically reviewing progress during the evaluation. This monitoring system was similar to the periodic outcome-based work (OBW) reviews that field offices had to complete. To avoid double reporting, OBW reviews were used towards the end of the project-reporting period.

## 5.1 Summary results by country

Table 2: Summary of results by country

	<b>Zambia</b>	<b>Philippines</b>	<b>Paraguay</b>	<b>India</b>	<b>Tanzania</b>
<b>Relevant CPO</b>	ZMB 134	PHL 128 PHY 132	PRY 128 PRY 103	IND 127	CPO 104
<b>% of Domestic Workers in the labour force (national relevance)</b>	According to the 2010 Zambian Labour Survey, Lusaka has an estimated 50,000 domestic workers. The study funded through ILO /Sida found domestic workers, aged 10 years & above, make up about 2.2% of total employment.	1.96, 2010 (labour force data). 5.3 % of total employment (Men and women). 11.5% of employed women & 1.4% of employed men	13.3% (198.512) 91.% female, 2011	2.3 to 10 million domestic workers 90% are female	2.2% of employed (paid domestic workers), but 3.8% of total employed if unpaid domestic workers included
<b>Ratification of C189</b>	Not ratified	Ratified	Ratified	Not ratified	Pending
<b>Funding from Sida</b>	\$175,207 + \$19,929 (global product funds) = \$195,136  Additional funds: \$97,534 approx.	\$174,828  Additional funds: \$27,000 +++	\$97,062 about 45% of funds to Outcome 5.  Additional funds: \$109,850	\$117,341 (2013???)  Supplemented by considerable funds.	Contributed 30% (approx) to Outcome 5 (\$78,791)
<b>Coherence/ synergies with other programmes</b>	Irish Aid funded Forced Labour outcome based funding Sida gender mainstreaming project	IPEC GAP project; currently IPEC CLEAR. <sup>7</sup> IPEC conducted rapid assessment on child labour in domestic work. Overlaps during 2013 World Day against Child Labour. Sida gender funds for 2 specific activities	Oportunidades youth employment project (rural youth coming to capital)	BASIC II on gender equality. Linkages with child domestic workers campaign IPEC.	UNDAP in line with components on social protection, also funding towards seminars, travel, admin, fellowships, (\$162,527) Links made to code of conduct for UN staff employing domestic workers to ensure UN staff lead change.
<b>Achievements (immediate impacts)</b>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• More dialogue and awareness of the Minimum Wages and Conditions of Employment (Domestic Workers) Order, 2011.</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• C189 passed</li> <li>• A national law on Domestic Workers enacted</li> <li>• A national plan of action on promoting decent work for</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• C189 passed</li> <li>• Elaboration of Domestic Workers law in parliament pending discussion</li> <li>• Information &amp; awareness</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Domestic work included in the National Sexual Harassment Act</li> <li>• Government's initiatives to extend the coverage of</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• The labour ministry &amp; social partners adopted a tripartite action plan (DW for DW) - officially adopted in February 2014</li> </ul>

<sup>7</sup> Country Level Engagement in Advocacy to Reduce Child Labour

	<b>Zambia</b>	<b>Philippines</b>	<b>Paraguay</b>	<b>India</b>	<b>Tanzania</b>
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Qualitative study on Domestic Workers completed</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>domestic workers adopted by the National Domestic Work Technical Working Group</li> <li>ILO got employers organisation fully engaged</li> <li>Information dissemination campaign took place</li> <li>ToT on Decent work for domestic workers took place for trade unions</li> <li>Qualitative study on Domestic Workers completed</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>campaign implemented by IPS (social security agency) to increase enrolment of domestic workers to social security insurance.</li> <li>Tripartite &amp; bipartite discussion led to the formulation of a skills curriculum for domestic workers</li> <li>Study completed <i>Trabajo doméstico remunerado en Paraguay</i> (M.V. Heikel)<sup>8</sup></li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>minimum wage legislation and a health insurance scheme to domestic workers were supported through a study of practices in 7 states and a national knowledge-sharing workshop on experience and lessons learned</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>2 Information awareness campaigns (TUCTA and CHODAWU trade unions)</li> <li>Qualitative study on Domestic Workers completed</li> </ul>
<b>Key factors that contributed to the success of activities (effectiveness)</b>	<p>Statutory Instrument No. 3 (minimum wages &amp; conditions of employment (DW) 2011, paved the way and interest in Zambia.</p> <p>Building from previous projects such as forced labour project that had included persons trafficked for domestic workers.</p>	<p>Domestic workers rights on the agenda for many years. Tripartite mechanisms functioned very well. Support in parliament for C189 ILO staff had been working on DW related issues for 2 decades, very familiar with the DW political context. ILO staff astute in providing inputs, facilitating process, but allowing actors to take the lead to ensure ownership.</p>	<p>Commitment of tripartite partners The impetus to ratify C189 in the region ILO's information and outreach work, which included Spanish studies on the implications for labour standards of the adoption C189 important.</p>	<p>'Technical' inputs and advocacy from ILO and other partners Studies on minimum wages and RSBY conducted</p>	<p>Commitment of labour ministry Facilitation of tripartite workshops (3) essential to ensure the national plan of action was adopted by tripartite constituents Hiring a media specialist to help plan an awareness raising campaign with CHODAWU was important for focusing the campaign</p>
<b>Sustainability issues - continuation after Sida funds</b>	<p>ZMB134 (2014-15) focuses on improved working conditions, particular for vulnerable grps.</p> <p>ZMB134 if funded will attempt to mainstream DW issues in labour law review process, revise SI on DW &amp; produce a set of recs adopted by tripartite partners.</p>	<p>2 CPOs (2014-15) PHL 132 has a core focus on the adaption of the national legal framework for domestic workers, more specifically on developing capacities for its implementation. PHL128 concerns wage policy, with a focus on minimum wage. Other follow-up planned</p>	<p>A CPO on the promotion of decent work for migrants (incl DWs) in the Paraguay-Argentina corridor is currently being implemented by MIGRANT &amp; ILO Santiago, funded by EU. This is reported under Outcome 7.1 for next biennium.</p>	<p>CPO127 (2014-15) more in the formal &amp; informal economy, have access to social protection &amp; improved working conditions. 2 components – i) state level, demonstrate a model of change that other states could learn from ii) sharing knowledge base &amp; tool on building national capacities.</p>	<p>TZA104 (2014-15) improved working conditions, particular for vulnerable grps has a focus on C189, awareness raising and training. CHODAWU are sustaining their campaign using their own resources and intend to do so towards the ratification of C189</p>

<sup>8</sup> May 2014 [http://www.ilo.org/wcmsp5/groups/public/--americas/--ro-lima/--sro-santiago/documents/publication/wcms\\_244224.pdf](http://www.ilo.org/wcmsp5/groups/public/--americas/--ro-lima/--sro-santiago/documents/publication/wcms_244224.pdf)





## ***5.2 Relevance and alignment with P&B and CPOs***

### **5.2.1 Relevance of interventions to CPOS and C189**

As mentioned the Swedish Government had an interest in funding towards Outcome 5, but did not earmark funds towards particular countries. The countries were chosen by ILO based on whether domestic work featured in their CPOs. Mapping all the CPOs that address domestic workers was a particular useful strategy when the project was initiated. Based on the resources available, five specific countries (Paraguay, India, The Philippines, Zambia and Tanzania) were subsequently chosen for a core focus with funding. These CPOs are outlined in Table 3. Regional representation was an important criterion for the choice of CPO (2 from Asia, 2 from Africa and 1 from Latin America). Examples from Africa were specifically required. Comments related to why the CPO was chosen are outlined in the right hand column in Table 3. Each country had an interest and political willingness to move ahead. Interventions were designed to allow ILO to provide technical support and operationally explore ways in which national governments could be facilitated to implement and enforce measures to make decent work a reality for domestic workers. In some countries this focus supported stakeholders to move ahead with the C189 ratification process.

The GLO/11/54/SID initiatives were aligned to the ILO Programme and Budget for 2012-2013. Each of the 5 key countries of focus had relevant CPOs. In addition to the 5 core countries, based on government requests, minimum wage studies were undertaken in Cape Verde and Botswana. Cape Verde had a relevant CPO. Botswana did not. Measurement criteria for the 5 countries were aligned with those outlined in the P&B under Outcome 5 (these measurement criteria are outlined in Annex 5). Indicator 5.1 concerns policies or implement strategies to improve working conditions, especially for the most vulnerable (in this case the most vulnerable focus is on domestic workers. Indicator 5.2 concerns strengthen institutional capacity to implement wage policies.

**Table 3: Relevant Country Programme Outcomes (CPOs) in the intervention countries**

<b>Country</b>	<b>CPOs 2012-2013</b>	<b>Comments</b>
<b>Zambia</b>	CPO ZMB134 Improved working conditions, particularly for vulnerable groups	Work in Zambia could build from the UN Joint Programme on Human Trafficking (UNJPHT with ILO, IOM and UNICEF). Through this and an Irish Aid funded Forced Labour project, the Zambian Federation of Employers had developed code of conduct for employers of domestic workers in Zambia.  This code, and a Statutory Instrument (no. 3) prepared Zambia for a more concentrated focus on DW.
<b>Philippines</b>	CPO PHL 132 National legal framework on domestic workers adopted and capacities for implementation developed. PHL 128 concerned national and local wage bodies and social partners develop sound wage policy, including on minimum wage.	The Philippines had a long history of domestic workers migrating abroad, and there was national pressure to also focus on national domestic workers. <sup>9</sup> The government realised the relevance of decent work for national domestic workers if they were to advocate for decent work for migrants with receiving countries.  The Tripartite Technical Working Group (TWG) on Domestic Workers was instrumental in putting together the structure for the project.
<b>Paraguay</b>	CPO PGY 128 Design and implementation of policies to improve working conditions and strengthening rights of domestic workers PRY 103 concerned strengthening mechanism of social dialogue for gender equality.	In Latin America there were a few options for countries. Some countries (Uruguay and Bolivia) had already received support under the Luxemburg TC, so Paraguay was suggested.  Paraguay had an ongoing Youth Employment project <i>Oportunidades</i> , which had a focus on youth coming from rural areas, many entering in DW in capital.  Government keen to professionalise and improve domestic workers image, as well as ratify Convention 189. The interventions in Paraguay complemented the two relevant CPOs.
<b>India</b>	CPO IND 127 Enhanced national capacities in developing/implementing policy, legal and other measures/ programmes that are aimed at making decent work a reality for women and vulnerable workers, with particular focus on domestic workers	A draft national policy on domestic work had been prepared in India  Links were made with the BASIC TC framework on 'Gender Equality in the World of Work', with the aim was of supporting constituents in promoting equality between women and men in the world of work. Domestic workers were considered an important area of focus.  A task force on DW had been set up (although dismantled) prior to DWDW. India had agreed to continue work on a national policy for domestic workers.
<b>Tanzania</b>	CPO TZA 104 National legal framework on domestic workers adopted and capacities for implementation developed	The Labour Minister in Tanzania had expressed her intention to move forward with the ratification of C189 and indicated she would strongly support a domestic work project. Trade Unions and Employers organizations (TUCT and ATE) were supportive.  The UNDAO programme also had linked elements around social protection and employment. Thus the focus was relevant for Tanzania.
<b>Cape Verde</b>	CPO CPV127 Improve the conditions of work for men and women, notably through the establishment of a minimum wage	A rare opportunity to assess the (before and after) impact of the new minimum wage on men and women arose. ILO had been collaborating with constituents since 2009.
<b>Botswana</b>	Botswana did not have a CPO in 2012-13, nor is there one in 2014-15.	The Botswana Government required technical assistance in establishing a minimum wage that promotes decent work for domestic workers (and cattle post workers) so that they could adjust minimum wage levels that were study at very low levels.

<sup>9</sup> Many domestic workers were returning from the Middle East with horrific stories of treatment and injuries. The work of domestic workers organisations in Hong Kong, and the *Asian Asia Migrant Domestic Workers' Alliance*, the *Visayan Forum Foundation* and an associated domestic workers organisations SOMPAI as well as NGOs associated with the *Global Forum on Migration and Development* were all instrumental in pushing the agenda forward.

## 5.2.2 Relevance of global products

Domestic work is poorly understood generally, and as a result, progressive approaches are often difficult to imagine, let alone devise and implement.

### Coherence and strategic fit to making decent work a reality for domestic workers

According to ILO staff in headquarters and country offices, typical questions asked by constituents who wish to improve their domestic work sector include:

- What is the actual size of the domestic work sector, how do we define and measure it?
- What did other countries do, what were their experiences and what were the results?
- What policies work? How were these policies designed?
- Will regulations adversely affect families that employ domestic workers and reduce employment?
- Will regulations inadvertently increase informality in the sector?
- Is it feasible at all to enforce labour regulations in domestic work?

The Global Products were designed to answer these types of questions. A key aim was to demonstrate 'examples', 'case studies', 'methodologies' or 'policy measures' that can be adopted for use. For instance, examples of minimum wages legislation from elsewhere in the world; proven labour survey instruments for measuring domestic labour; standard labour law solutions in line with Convention 189.

### Synergies with other ILO interventions

ILO implemented a previous technical cooperation project funded by Luxembourg between 2010 and 2012. The *DWDW* project was able to sustain from the achievements of the Luxembourg project, build upon the policy briefs and other materials produced from the project.

### Alignment of global products with CPOs

The finalisation of the 'newer' Global Products was not always in line with the timeframe for reporting under the 2012-2013 CPOs, although some Global Products (such as qualitative research methods) were developed with inputs from stakeholders working on CPOs.

#### Summary Relevance

The ILO GLO/11/54/SID projects in the core countries were relevant to the strategy outlined in the CPOs and P&B for Outcome 5. Initiatives in each country were designed around helping to support the achievement of the measurement criteria in the P&B (under indicators 5.1 and 5.2). This is considered a good practice. The Global Products are also relevant to the achievement of CPOs around Outcome 5, although not always read in time for the 2012-2013 CPOs, but will be useful for the 2014-15 CPOs linked to Outcome 5.

## 5.3 Coherence

This section examines the extent to which the various activities in the project's implementation strategy was coherent with the P&B outcomes as well as in-country coherence issues. Coherence with

regard to addressing gender equality issues in the domestic work sector is also outlined with supplementary information in Annex 9.

### **5.3.1 Coherence of implementation strategy with P&B outcomes and ILO C189**

The various activities in the projects' implementation strategy were fully coherent and complementary in their design and implementation with regard to the P&B Outcome 5 and the CPOs they intended to support. Most activities were designed around supporting countries to move forward with either ratifying or implementing Convention 189 and Recommendation 102.

#### **Coherence with Strategic framework**

However depending on how the issue of domestic work is approached, it could fall under Outcome 17 (*Discrimination in employment and occupation is eliminated*) or Outcome 5 *Women and men have improved and more equitable working conditions*. For example one of the measurement criteria for Outcome 17 is that *new or modified laws, policies, action plans and/or programme are adopted to bring them into line with international standards on non-discrimination*.

#### **Coherence with ILO's strategy for action to make decent work a reality for domestic workers**

It can also be concluded that most of the global products produced were fitted with ongoing ILO activities under the ILO Office wide strategy for action to make decent work a reality for domestic workers. Summarised versions of some longer global products into policy briefs such as those already developed under the ILO Policy Brief Series *Advancing decent work for domestic worker*, are still required.<sup>10</sup> For example, in their current format, it is unclear how the five case studies on organising domestic workers will inform country level constituents. A short policy brief on organising domestic workers would perhaps be useful (as requested by many trade union stakeholders). Trade unions are struggling to a) get larger trade unions to take on board this important category of informal worker b) actually help shop stewards mobilise domestic workers.

### **5.3.2 Synergies with other ILO interventions (including other donors)**

At the country level, in many cases synergies were developed with on-going government interventions and other ILO interventions. The extent to which synergies were developed with projects funded by other donors was not fully determined during this evaluation, although anecdotal information is available (see Annex 8). Apart from working through tripartite mechanisms, in many cases linkages were made with NGOs working on domestic workers.

### **5.3.3 Coherence with respect to gender mainstreaming**

Women generally dominate the domestic work sector. This often means that a focus on domestic work is mainly on women's workers rights. Without taking from the need to focus on women workers rights, this particular focus in the domestic work sector may reinforce male /female roles in the household. By focusing on women's working position alone without addressing their dominance in the sector can for instance reinforce the gender stereotype – i.e. a woman is suitable for domestic tasks. In a household with both males and females working outside the home, evidently it is difficult for the day today household tasks to be undertaken on top of full time jobs outside the home. Often the burden of and responsibility for household tasks remains with the working mother, even when both her and her spouse being employed full time. If earning enough, it is easier to substitute the mother's household domestic tasks with a lower paid domestic worker, than address inequalities in

---

<sup>10</sup> Conditions of Work and Employment Programme

the division of labour within the household.<sup>11</sup> If household and child rearing tasks were shared more evenly between men and women, there may be less demand for other women reinforcing a tradition of women as carers and as having full responsibility for cooking and cleaning within the household. We know that such tasks are not genetically inherited, but socially constructed. For example male chefs exist all over the world; men are physically capable of cleaning, ironing and washing. However such a change in attitude requires enormous shifts in perceptions of male/female roles.

### **Coherence of approach to gender equality issues**

Although in some countries, ILO highlighted gender issues and domestic workers, in others even with extra resources from 'gender mainstreaming' funds, such gender equality issues were not always discussed. Many equated gender issues with the fact that the sector is predominately female. In India, the Philippines and Paraguay ILO NPCs reported that they highlighted the devaluation of women's work, and how women's position reinforces inequalities. In the Philippines one trade unionist reported that they used feminist arguments to get other trade unionists on board, emphasising to his colleagues that:

*"if domestic workers were predominately male,  
Convention 189 would have been passed 70 years ago"*

Gender related issues noted during the evaluation are outlined in Annex 9.

#### **Summary Coherence**

Overall it can be concluded that the various activities in the project's implementation strategy were coherent with the CPOs and with national level processes, with the exception of getting employers on board in India. Some Outcomes could theoretically be reported under more than one of the nineteen Outcomes in the P&B 2012-2013. This issue may be resolved when ILO moves towards Areas of Critical Concern (ACIs) in this current biennium and beyond.

Part of the inequalities experienced by domestic workers can be traced to the undervaluation of women's work and of care work generally. Other inequalities stem from outright gender discrimination as well as racism and issues of caste. Some countries more than others raised these issues. Some countries may not yet be ready to explore fundamental gender equality issues such as unequal power relations in the household. This is because there is a more urgent need to actually recognise these workers and ensure they are organised in some way.

## ***5.4 Effectiveness of project outputs towards CPOs and Outcome 5***

This section examines whether the project outputs have been effective in supporting the achievement of the relevant CPOs. It must be stressed that most stakeholders, even some ILO staff, do not think of effectiveness and impact of outputs in terms of CPOs and measurement criteria in the P&B. They consider effectiveness and impact in terms of their own mandate and area of focus. Trade unions and employer organisations rarely understand the source of project funding from ILO and

<sup>11</sup> Additionally, whilst recognising that domestic work can provide females with some type of economic independence, a domestic worker does not enjoy non-remunerative advantages of work, such as working with colleagues, or socialising during work.

associate more with ILO individuals. For instance a trafficking project, a forced labour project, and then a focus on domestic workers are all viewed under one informal worker umbrella, or linked to one or two ILO resource persons.

In the Inception Report for this evaluation, reporting on effectiveness by stakeholder group and country was planned. However given the information obtained during the evaluation itself, and the fact that GLO/11/54/SID funds were outcome based, it made more sense to report the evaluation results under the P&B measurement criteria (in bold and italics headings) mainly *Indicator 5.1*. Thus this section of the evaluation report is organised under these measurement criteria headings. Annex 5 contains details of the measurement criteria for Indicator 5.1. Where known and shared with country level staff<sup>12</sup>, ILO staff stated that the global products were very useful for technical specialists and for sharing with government officials and others.

#### **5.4.1 Effectiveness of outputs in supporting the achievement of CPOs & Outcome 5**

##### ***Awareness raising campaigns and information dissemination (2 examples, Zambia & Paraguay)***

The use of different forms of media (televisions, radios in particular but also newspapers) was considered effective to reach employers of domestic workers, domestic workers and the community at large.

##### **Views of tripartite stakeholders interviewed**

In **Zambia** the effectiveness of the radio awareness raising campaign funded through the UN Joint Programme on Human Trafficking (UNJPHT with ILO, IOM and UNICEF) was reported by many (LEAAZ staff, Ministry of Labour, Domestic Workers Unions) to be effective. Discussions on the radio regarding domestic work related to forced labour, trafficking and the use of child labourers.<sup>13</sup> The only issue was that incoming callers to the radio wanted local languages. LEAAZ reported that they are still receiving inquiry calls from both male and female domestic workers. One interviewee felt that slogans for domestic workers are good, and should be developed more, channelled through the Domestic Workers Unions. In **Zambia** the Domestic Workers Union felt that their sensitizing activities were effective. Drama sketches of typical domestic workers situations were reportedly by domestic workers unions, the Ministry of Labour and Social Security, and Leaz to be effective. Taking place in open spaces, many local people congregated and were sensitized in an entertaining way. In contrast a representative from the Employers Association in Zambia (ZFE) reported that the campaign (and project) was spread a bit too thin, only reaching a few regions, and a bit urban focused. He felt that most domestic workers come from rural areas, and these were the ones who required awareness on their rights.

##### **Highlighting the plight of domestic workers**

CHODAWU in **Tanzania** argue that the media's role helped considerable, as the media campaign highlighted the working and living conditions of domestic workers. The media specialist and consultants who conducted workshops for CHODAWU were effective in helping CHODAWU design a strategic campaign to increase awareness on the plight of domestic workers and their rights. A stakeholder who collaborated in the launch of the media campaign reported that the link with child domestic workers was significant.

##### **Highlighting the plight of domestic workers**

<sup>12</sup> Many global products were under production during the project implementation so not shared with all countries, unless directly involved.

<sup>13</sup> Two radio stations were used, one in Lusaka and one in the Southern Province - Sky FMin Mwanza and Radio Phoenix

In **Paraguay** the campaign carried out by the IPS or Social Security Institute was reported positively (by government representatives and others<sup>14</sup>). Using two languages (Spanish and Guaraní) was significant, particularly as domestic workers tend to speak Guaraní. Another aspect of the campaign was the adaptation of messages to different types of audiences (with some slogans aimed at domestic workers, others at their employers, reminding them of their legal obligation to register their domestic worker with the social security scheme). It was reported that the campaign was effective in sensitizing society about the precariousness of domestic work and how they were excluded. The key message of the campaign was to encourage employers to register domestic workers in their homes, and the rights of domestic workers to be registered. Like Zambia, radio was considered particularly effective in Paraguay. So also was advertising on buses. Both campaigns (Zambia and Paraguay) were mainly urban focused.

### ***New or modified legislation, regulations or policies***

#### **View of tripartite partners interviewed**

In Paraguay the ILO was considered effective in supporting the ratification of C189, distributing fact sheets on C189, and providing information notes on the domestic work sector. Likewise in the Philippines. Questions and facts regarding C189 were distributed at parliamentary committee meetings. ILO also provided an analysis of the legal situation of domestic workers.

Recognising that an important dimension of power lies with administrative staff, ILO in the **Philippines** briefed bureaucrats through DOLE to convince them on the need for the Domestic Workers Act. Under a service contract ILO gave funds to the Department of Labor and Employment (DOLE) to conduct briefings with legislative staff in both the senate and the House of Representatives. Coordination amongst various stakeholders who were advocates for ratifying the Convention was very effective in the Philippines. ILO monitored and convened many tripartite meetings, and provided many inputs to the Technical Working Group on Domestic Workers. The results from this TWG fed into the main tripartite group the National Industrial Peace Council.

ILO was also able to take advantage of the political change that occurred in **Paraguay**, with the (eventual) new government signing off on the Convention. In terms of extending social security systems and increase coverage for domestic workers, again following elections and changes in staffing, ILO was able to effectively lever against such opportunities.

In **Tanzania**, the effective pressure from the ILO Country Office/HQ, from pressure groups in particular International Domestic Workers Network, increasing questions on C189 from members of parliament and the timing were reported to all contribute to the launch of the Action Plan to promote decent work for domestic workers. ILO played a significant part in briefing the Minister of Labour and Employment providing technical inputs on many issues related to the ratification of C189. CHODAWU in **Tanzania** acknowledged the strong support from ILO.

The ILO Liaison Officer from Zanzibar reported that the forum for the Promotion of C189 for Labour Advisory Board Members and Secretariat was effective in raising awareness. Different recommendation was provided through the Forum for improving the situation of domestic workers such as: steps to support the ratification of C189; measures that eradicate the stigma on domestic work, such as raising awareness on the value of domestic workers; and defining 'domestic work' in Zanzibar's labour laws.

Although C189 was not ratified in **India**, the West Bengal Labour Commissioner reported that the support and assistance provided by ILO was of great help in moving the domestic workers agenda forward. A representative from the National Domestic Workers Movement (NDWM) also echoed this

---

<sup>14</sup> The campaign was reported to be quite creative by a few respondents including the Gender Equity Commission.

view. In particular the NDWM appreciated the extension of national health insurance for domestic workers, which was considered a significant achievement through ILO support. Although many states have not yet extended RSBY to domestic workers, it is on the policy agenda nationally and that is widely appreciated.

### ***National plan of action adopted by tripartite constituents***

#### **Views of tripartite partners interviewed**

The domestic workers law was enacted on 13 Jan 2013.<sup>15</sup> Following the enactment of the new Domestic Workers' Act, consultations were held on the draft Implementing Rules and Regulations (IRR) of the new Domestic Workers' Act, which are required before the law can be implemented. The draft IRRs were eventually presented at the National Tripartite Industrial Peace Council (the main tripartite body in the Philippines). ILO Manila with support from the CTA in Geneva were very effective in:

- setting up a template for the consultation process;
- drafting papers for strengthening trade union initiatives in organising domestic workers;
- developing an advocacy and communication plan to guide and inform collective advocacy and communication efforts on the Domestic Workers Act;
- identifying gaps in existing laws (around the protection of domestic workers)
- documenting minutes of workshops and meetings;
- summarising recommendations based on outputs and results of IRR consultations.

The Department of Labor and Employment (DOLE) with ILO support very quickly put in place a range of consultation and interagency meetings to draft the implementing rules and regulations and submit to the National Tripartite Industrial Peace Council (NTIPC) as effectively as possible.<sup>16</sup>

In terms of the effectiveness of tripartite meetings and stakeholder discussions (towards the development of a plan of action), in **Zambia** the Ministry of Labour representative interviewed underlined the important of consulting the Ministry of Justice to ensure efficiency of initiatives planned.

Given that during the period of ILO support to **Paraguay**, there were three changes of government, an effective approach was to conduct bipartite deliberations. According to the ILO Paraguay focal point, a major achievement of ILO was to effectively keep the issue of domestic work on the agenda, even with the succession of governments, who also had different ideological perspectives.

According to CHODAWU in **Tanzania**, the pressure from trade unions (CHODAWU and TUCTA) to ratify C189 contributed to the launch of the action plan to promote decent work for domestic workers. ATE was very positive about joint forces coming together to work towards DWDW.

### ***New or modified legislation, regulations, or policies***

#### **Effectiveness of policy related work**

In the **Philippines**, enacting new legislation occurred with the help of multi-stakeholder consultations on the draft IRR for the Domestic Workers Act.<sup>17</sup> In **Zambia**, much of the tripartite dialogue centred on the minimum wage, often overshadowing other issues that required dialogue. Yet with the controversy caused by ZFE rejecting the 67 percent increase in minimum wage for domestic workers,

<sup>15</sup> It was signed into law by the President after the two houses of Congress voted for the law latter part of 2012

<sup>16</sup> 16 regional consultations took place, 3 island wide multisectoral consultations (ILO provided financial assistance for two of these) and 2 internal technical DOLE meetings. One public consultation also took place, and there was an on-line public consultation facilitate available on DOLE's webpage, as well as DOLE's facebook account.

<sup>17</sup> Working with the DOLE, ILO provide support for Island wide multi sectoral consultations/ meetings to be held in the Visayas and Luzon, with DOLE funding the consultations that took place in Mindanao.



there were many media articles, resulting in more discussions on the Statutory Instrument and the rights of domestic workers more widely. In **Tanzania** three workshops organized by the ILO with tripartite partners and other stakeholders (on the Mainland and in Zanzibar) were effective in ensuring all were engaged in the development of a tripartite action plan.

### ***Training strategy for improving working conditions***

#### **Coherence of this indicator with the CPOs and Strategic Outcome 5**

The focus on a training strategy for improving working conditions appeared to centre on skills training domestic workers as an entry point (for providing information on rights). However the emphasis in such skills training courses is often on providing information on hygiene, household management, food production, children care, good manners and health eating. It is unclear if such training leads to improved conditions or better wages. A skills training curriculum for domestic workers was reported to be effective in **Paraguay**, prepared through a bipartite roundtable. The curriculum aims to inform domestic workers about their labour rights and the current legislation, as well as create opportunities for new work paths. This will be implemented by SINAFOCAL (the national skills training institute) once approved by government. In the **Philippines**, the government are exploring how to develop national competence standards (through TESTA the national skills authority) for domestic workers.

In **Zambia**, the links to skills training for domestic workers via so called ‘maids centres’ was not reported favourably by domestic workers interviewed. Maids centres may reach domestic workers, but essentially they are a business, taking payments from both employers and domestic workers. The extent to which they provide training on the rights of domestic workers is unclear. For example out of eight domestic workers interviewed, none reported obtaining information on their rights. Employers think that maid centres are not adequately training the maids. Domestic workers themselves reported that they cannot raise issues regarding violations of their rights whilst they are in employment (even if actually aware of their rights). The training they provide is ad hoc. Because maid centres are a relatively new but growing business sector (as evidenced by flyers for maid’s centres collected around Lusaka), they should be properly regulated and included under the various labour instruments. They should have licences to operate and be open for inspection. Improving the quality of the training offered may also help. Regulated employment agencies is considered by many interviewed (trade unions and others) to be a way forward.

In **India** a sectoral skills council is attempting to bring different stakeholders together around developing a qualification framework. A representative from the Domestic Workers Forum (AITUC) reported that her domestic workers union members are not clear that if they obtain training, they would obtain an increase in wages. In parallel, domestic workers require someone who will bargain with the employers for this increase in salary. A representative from the Domestic Workers Rights Union (Bangalore) reported that the focus on skills is beyond what is happening on the ground, as this focus seems to suggest that domestic workers have already circumvented issues such as salary, holiday pay and basic workers rights. Furthermore most domestic workers are purposefully kept at an unskilled level. Likewise in **Paraguay**, although the employers organisation reported that if domestic workers have skills certificates, this may result in an increase in their remuneration, whether or not this is true or affordable for households is unknown.

<b>Box 1: Effectiveness of studies conducted under ILO Sida</b>
---

Research is expensive to conduct, and has to be carefully considered when there are small country budgets.<sup>18</sup> In the **Philippines**, most of the research was completed towards the end of the biennium, which did not necessarily inform policy or the Implementing Rules and Regulations for the National Domestic Workers Act. However in **Tanzania** it was reported that the studies were very useful in planning the media campaign CHODAWU. In **Zambia**, the domestic workers union were disappointed that they were not involved in the process of planning the qualitative research. In **Paraguay** the studies were presented towards the end of the project but were still reported to be useful for continuing work by many stakeholders who responded during the evaluation. In **India** studies on RSBY and minimum wages were appreciated. Overall it was found that better attention could be paid to the use, quality and timing of research undertaken in projects of this nature. **Annex 7** outlines some suggestions on ensuring research is more effective.

### **Box 2: Effectiveness - tripartite issues**

Trade unions and governments were involved in all countries of focus. ILO was very effective in getting the employers involved in Zambia, Paraguay, the Philippines (and to the extent known in Tanzania). According to those interviewed at ECOP in the Philippines initially their members were not particularly interested. Continuous engagement with ECOP management was important. ILO staff explained why ECOP should engage, inviting them to events. Providing technical inputs around Convention 189 was also instrumental. **Annex 6** provides a good practice case study of the process adopted to engage employers in the Philippines. However no strategies to get employer organisations on board were noted from Tanzania or India.

### **Summary Effectiveness**

On the whole, dissemination of information regarding the international standard for domestic workers was reported as effective in many countries. Although domestic work may not yet be recognised as an important sector in their own country, many respondents implied that if other parts of the world considered domestic workers an important category of working worthy of an international standard, their country should pay attention.

When asked, most respondents reported that they fully appreciated ILO's technical support for inputs regarding modifying or developing new legislation. In the Philippines technical assistance provided to the DW-TWG was reported by all as highly significant for achievements made. ILO's support was very helpful in constantly and consistently providing inputs and advice that helped other stakeholders ensure the Convention was ratified, the National Domestic Workers Act was passed, with its accompanying implementing rules and regulations.<sup>19</sup>

For example Leaz in Zambia reported that ILO provided technical support. Employer stakeholders in Paraguay commented on the excellent technical support provided by ILO, distributing information notes on the domestic

<sup>18</sup> More comments in this section relate to the two countries visited by the evaluator. Comments do not intent in any way to compare research across countries, nor evaluate the quality of the research itself, rather raise issues more generally about the timing and reception of the research.

<sup>19</sup> For example Sida funds were used for a national *All Workers* consultation on the draft IRR for the Domestic Workers Act also took place, and a National *All Employers* consultation.

workers sector, and briefings for parliamentary committee meetings on C189 as well as answering technical questions around social security options.

## 5.5 Impact

As outlined in the inception report for this evaluation, all stakeholders interviewed were asked what they thought was the greatest impact of the *Decent Work for Domestic Workers* project and what had less impact. This question was included in all questionnaires sent out. This section summarises opinions on perceived impact supplemented by evidence located. The section is organised by outcomes and, where appropriate, by country. Attempts are made to report results against Indicator 5.1 in the P&B so that iterative progress towards reaching the indicators can be examined. Annex 5 contains details of this indicator. At the end of Section 5.5 responses to other evaluation questions from the Inception Report are presented. The time-frame for this evaluation did not allow for changes with regard to knowledge, attitude and perceptions of domestic workers to be determined.

### 5.5.1 Zambia

Zambia already had the Statutory Instrument on the minimum wage for domestic workers, this project allowed the tripartite partners to find out more about domestic workers, and their conditions of work. Increased awareness and making invisible workers visible was frequently mentioned as significant. Registering domestic workers is not yet required in Zambia. As one interviewee stated:

*“Zambians have to register their dog,  
so why do domestic workers not yet have to be registered as workers?  
Why are domestic workers not treated with more respect?”*

#### **Information dissemination / awareness –raising campaign**

##### **Greatest achievements according to tripartite partners**

Many interviewed (Ipsos focus group, domestic workers union, other trade unions) argued that the greatest impact of the DWDW project was that it focused attention on domestic workers in Zambia. Different points of view were brought together, with a platform for dialogue, creating more recognition for this groups of workers. People realised that Domestic Workers have rights. An ILO official thought however that the greatest impact of the project in Zambia was employers agencies taking up the challenge of domestic workers and their conditions of work. ZFE themselves stated the project ‘allowed’ the issues of Domestic Work to be discussed. The broadening of the knowledge base on domestic work was considered important. The results of research on domestic workers was only completed in February 2014, when the project was near completion and has not yet been fully disseminated or ‘packaged’, so had less impact.

According to the Assistant Labour Commissioner<sup>20</sup>, as well as FFTUZ representatives the media campaign had the greatest impact. In particular the radio programmes that were broadcast with different experts providing call-in advice. However although these programmes were funded through a different ILO initiative, related issues on informal work and domestic workers minimum wage were discussed at length (around the *Statutory Instrument*). The Ministry reported that airing issues that were previously difficult to discuss had an impact in moving the issue of decent work for domestic

<sup>20</sup> at the Ministry of Labour and Social Affairs

workers further up the public agenda. A Maid Centre owner interviewed stated that the posters (developed under the UNJPHT) created impacts. FFTUZ reported that the campaign had impacts at the community level. In particular the drama that UHDWUZ (domestic workers union) undertook went down well.

The Assistant Labour Commissioner felt that clarity is now established regarding the rights of domestic workers. Employers now know that the *Statutory Instrument* can 'be pulled' and they can be summoned if a complaint is made about them. However the Assistant Commissioner was unable to say if the number of cases had increased. This is difficult to measure as compliance with the *Statutory Instrument* may have improved, so there may be fewer complaints.

#### **Concerns raised amongst tripartite partners**

A few interviewed expressed the opinion that employers are now afraid that they could be reported to the labour office if they mistreat their domestic workers. The policy (or victim support) does not yet support domestic workers grievances.

#### **Domestic workers as beneficiaries**

According to Leaz, the fact that the domestic workers unions participated in Labour Day celebrations for the first time during the project is significant. A 'street steward' from a domestic workers union reported that efforts to organising domestic workers has had less impacts, due to scattered workers, illiteracy and the subscription charge to join the union. Domestic workers interviewed stated that for them gaining respect from society and their employers along with better wages was the most important impact. All domestic workers interviewed reported that the situation for live-in domestic workers was still very exploitative.

#### ***New (voluntary) regulations (implementing a code of conduct)***

The Zambia Federation of Employers (ZFE) felt disseminating their code of conduct for employers of domestic workers had the biggest impact on employers. They received no major criticism on the code. Although it was considered very useful by one 'maid centre' representative interviewed, there was less feedback from other stakeholders interviewed on the effects of disseminating the Code. Domestic Workers interviewed did not know about it.

## **5.2.2 Philippines**

### ***New or modified legislation***

#### **Greatest achievements according to tripartite partners**

Evidently the biggest impact in the Philippines was that C189 was passed and the rights and benefits of domestic workers are now clearly outlined in subsequent Domestic Workers Act. These are summarised in the Box 3 below. There are still challenges with regard to the registration of domestic workers for social security, and issues around the minimum wage for live-in domestic workers. DOLE is also developing a protocol for rescue and rehabilitation of domestic workers in abusive situations.

It is too early to see the impact of the Domestic Workers Act on domestic workers themselves. Some comments by domestic workers themselves included the importance of their own '*personal dignity*', and '*feeling like a real worker*'. An impact analysis should be done at some point to determine the effect on the ground.

<b>Box 3: The Rights of and Benefits expected by domestic workers in the Philippines:</b>	
1.	Minimum wage

2.	Other mandatory benefits, such as the daily and weekly rest periods
3.	Service Incentive Leave
4.	13th month pay
5.	Freedom from employers' interference in the disposal of wages
6.	Coverage under the SSS, PhilHealth and Pag-IBIG laws
7.	Standard of treatment
8.	Board, lodging and medical attendance
9.	Right to privacy
10.	Access to outside communication
11.	Access to education and training
12.	Right to form, join, or assist labor organization
13.	Right to be provided a copy of the employment contract
14.	Right to certificate of employment
15.	Right to terminate the employment and
16.	Right to exercise their own religious beliefs and cultural practices

DOLE, 2014

### Concerns raised amongst tripartite partners

Implementation of the Domestic Workers Act is on a complaint basis rather than through inspection.

### Progress in implementation of new legislation

DOLE statistics on the registration of domestic workers as well as their record of complaints provides some insights. **Table 4** below provides data on the implementation of the Domestic Workers Act<sup>21</sup>.

**Table 4: DOLE reports on the status of implementation of the Domestic Workers Act**

<i>Date</i>	<i>Status of implementation</i>
<b>Sept 2013</b>	41,235 domestic workers registered with Phil Health
<b>December 2013</b>	23,700 domestic workers registered with Pag-IBIG
<b>April 2014</b>	116,500 domestic workers registered with SSS (social security)
<b>Nov 12, 2013</b>	DILG reported 982 Barangays had registered 8,744 domestic workers
<b>January 2014</b>	107 requests for assistance filed by domestic workers at the National Conciliation and Mediation Board. 64 were settled 24 withdrawn 27 workers benefited from monetary benefits

DOLE, 2014

The *Bureau of Workers with Special Concerns* at DOLE provided the evaluator with a short document outlining the status of implementation of the Domestic Workers Act (such as the status of the implementation of safety and health standards, the licensing and regulation of private employment

<sup>21</sup> Baseline information was not located during the evaluation.

agencies, the status of the minimum wage review, the oversight of the law, issues around village registration of domestic workers as well as progress in setting up rescue and rehabilitation services for abused domestic workers). DOLE produced a sample contract template to register domestic workers. Although this is considered useful by many, some employers reported that it was too complicated to fill.

As mentioned earlier, according to ILO staff and also representatives of ECOP, one of the biggest impacts was to get the Employers Organisation engaged (Annex 6) and contributing to the process of developing the rules for the Domestic Workers Act. On the other hand one trade union official reported that getting trade union officials themselves involved was the most significant achievement.

### 5.5.3 Paraguay

#### *New or modified legislation*

##### **Greatest achievements according to tripartite partners**

In Paraguay, the Government ratified C189 in May 2013, evidently providing a national impact. A framework now exists to advance domestic workers rights. A proposal for legislative reform (in line with C189) is before government. This includes extending social security to domestic workers, national minimum wage, among other rights aiming at equalizing them with other workers.<sup>22</sup> Some stakeholders stated that it highly likely the bill will be passed; others are worried that it may be amended before passing.

#### *Information dissemination / awareness –raising campaign*

##### **Domestic workers as beneficiaries**

An awareness campaign (on remuneration for domestic workers) by the Ministry of Justice and Employment in conjunction with other government institutions was implemented from March 2012 (using ILO materials and receiving ILO support through the MDG Spanish funded Oportunidades project).

IPS ran another campaign until the end of 2013 encouraging domestic workers to be registered for social security (health coverage only). This campaign aimed to help reduce poverty and inequalities for domestic workers, as well as their children and dependent family members, who can also benefit from social protection through them. In collaboration with IPS and others, ILO assisted in the elaboration of the campaign content. Table 5 below demonstrates that there was an increase in the registration of domestic workers for social protection, highlighting evidence of the campaign's impact.

**Table 5: increase in domestic workers registered for social security, Paraguay**

<i>Date</i>	<i>Domestic workers registered for social security at IPS</i>	<i>Percentage increase</i>
<i>November 2011</i>	15,861	56% increase
<i>October 2013</i>	23,957	45% increase
<i>April 30 2014</i>	25,803	to date in 2014 13% increase

<sup>22</sup> Domestic workers are included in a law which was passed in May 2013, called *la Jubilación de las Amas de Casa, de los Trabajadores independientes*. This law extended pensions to housewives and self-employed independent workers. However a key problem identified by the ILO and other stakeholders is that Domestic Workers are not independent workers. In practice it is impossible for domestic workers to pay their pension contributions. The current draft law under discussion in the Parliament (and in line with Convention 189) proposes to include domestic workers in the general social security regime/system like other dependent workers.

The Director of IPS outlined that since the campaign was launched, and between December 2013 and February 2014, the registration increased by almost 9 percent. According to him:

*“When we made the partnership with the ILO, we set to grow by 5% to TDR inscriptions social health insurance in a period of 6 months. And we have far exceeded that percentage in half the expected time”.*

The former director of the gender division at the Ministry of Labour and Social Security believes that the creation of the Centre of Information for Domestic Workers (CATD) in the ministry was very significant. Herself and The Gender Equity Commission both reported that strengthening the network of associations of domestic workers was also a great achievement. The impact was demonstrated through their strong lobby group in May 2013.

### ***Social dialogue towards a national plan of action by tripartite constituents***

Many interviewed that the strengthening of social dialogue among the various actors was a very important process in **Paraguay** (for example two representatives from the government reported this)<sup>23</sup>. This allowed for ownership on drafting inputs for the law that would regulate domestic work on equal terms to other workers; it also ensured a consensus between employers and workers on the design and implementation of a professional training programme for domestic workers, within the national training system. Due to the political situation, at certain points, meetings could only take place between employers and workers, (bipartite). The employers organisation in Paraguay APEP, reported that the bipartite discussions allowed open dialogue and sharing amongst the employers representatives and trade unions. Representatives at the Ministry of Labour reported that the tripartite dialogue certainly put the issue of domestic work on the table of the Senate.

## **5.5.4 India**

ILO's comparative advantage in a large country like **India** is to make impact at policy level. One such way is through information to those in power to instigate change. For example through studies, ILO has been able to demonstrate that domestic work is on the increase in India<sup>24</sup>. Highlighting the economic value of domestic workers was important for policy level discussions. ILO also attempted to examine way of ensuring the existing labour laws also cover domestic workers, through using minimum wages legislation or the unorganised workers social security act (which states that unorganised workers are entitled to social security). ILO lobbied so that RSBY could be used for domestic workers (rather than only those living under the poverty line).

### ***New or modified legislation***

#### **Greatest achievement**

The inclusion of domestic workers in the new legislation *‘The Sexual Harassment of Women at Workplace’ (Prevention, Prohibition and Redressal) Act, 2013* is one of the more significant achievements of the project in India.

#### **Concerns raised**

<sup>23</sup> Social dialogue included round table discussions on the law, the campaign to increase social security coverage for domestic workers, validation of the study on the socio-demographic study on domestic workers, and bi-partite discussions on the need for a domestic workers skills training course.

<sup>24</sup> Domestic work is increasing at a faster pace than factory work

It is too early to see any impacts of this Act. Linking over 14,000 domestic workers into the Domestic Workers Welfare Fund in Tamil Nadu is a significant achievement as is the inclusion of domestic workers under the Minimum Wages Act in two states.

### ***Information dissemination or awareness raising***

#### **Domestic workers as beneficiaries**

In some states civil society organisations or domestic workers association have increased their activities to organise domestic workers and register them under the Trade Union Act. For example AITUC launched activities in 2012 to unionise domestic workers in Chennai. This evaluation was unable to find systematic data on the increased membership except:

- Before ILO support AITUC in Chennai had 14,000 domestic workers who were subscription-paying members. According to an AITUC official they had an 8-9,000 increase, but that figure could not be verified (the target was an increase of 10,000). AITUC reported that their members have an increased sense of confidence now and are more inclined to speak out. Rather than just asking for money, they are now more cognisant about their rights.
- An ILO official reported that the unionization of over 20,000 domestic workers was a significant achievement.

Although there is still a lot of sensitisation to be undertaken with the larger trade unions in India, an ILO official reported that the biggest impact to date has been that trade unions have increased their understanding on the importance of addressing the domestic work sector. However if this is true, they have yet to prioritise domestic workers (in their common platform).

#### **Baseline for project focus**

Although a baseline was not essentially established prior to the project, using a baseline of how people understood the term *domestic workers* in 2008, an ILO official reported that there is now less confusion about who exactly a domestic worker is now as opposed to a home based worker. In 2008 some local languages did not have a term for 'domestic worker', whereas now the discourse has changed.<sup>25</sup> The Labour Commissioner from West Bengal reported that due to the workshops organised by ILO the plight of domestic workers has come to the fore, authorities are now aware of their working conditions and lack of social securities. As a result of ILO domestic workers are now being included in the category of scheduled employment. Minimum wages will be fixed for domestic workers, but this is currently under process.<sup>26</sup> Another Domestic Workers Forum member stated that the consultative meetings were interactive, detailed with a fair exchange of information and experiences. She further stated:

*“more time could have been allocated to sharing good practices from various domestic workers union organisations across the country, and abroad.”*

#### **Impact of studies commissioned**

Many ILO activities in India concerned the commissioning of studies on extending RSBY to domestic workers or minimum wage setting practices in different states. It is difficult to determine the impact of these studies, as they are part of a slow iterative process to build a knowledge base on how to implement measures to ensure decent work for domestic workers.

## **5.5.5 Tanzania**

### ***A national plan of action adopted***

<sup>25</sup> Two knowledge sharing workshops were organised under Sida funding (Hyderabad, July '13, Delhi February '14).

<sup>26</sup> Workshops (such as one held in July 2012 in Haryana organised by HMS, INTUC and EWA) held through ILO support allowed different stakeholders to come together to deliberate on the issue of domestic workers according to a representative from NDWM.



### **Greatest achievements according to tripartite partners**

The labour ministry and social partners adopted a tripartite action plan, which promoted decent work for domestic workers. The Employers organisation (ATE) underlines the how joining forces brought this positive result. Whether this will result in Convention 189 eventually being ratified and national laws put in place remains to be seen. CHODAWU reported that the Government have moved closer to ratifying C189 (in comparison to their readiness to ratified other Conventions). ATE stress legal challenges to implement it. In April 2014 the Zanzibar tripartite partners drafted a *Plan of Action* to promote decent work for domestic workers in Zanzibar, with a plan to finalise it.

### **Information dissemination or awareness-raising campaign**

#### **Domestic workers as beneficiaries**

The Trade Union Congress of Tanzania (TUCTA) and the Conservation, Hotels, Domestic and Allied Workers Union (CHODAWU) sensitised some domestic workers on the international standard for domestic workers. Public awareness about domestic workers' rights was allegedly raised, through campaigns that were run in 2013. The ILO/UNDAP Coordinator reported that the increased acceptance of domestic work as a valuable contribution to the economy warranting particular attention was significant during this particular project. According to her, this can be demonstrated by at least three request from NGOs towards this goal and

*“more knowledgeable engagement of both employers and workers on issue of domestic work suggestion of what should be done and a mushrooming of community-based organizations and NGOs trying to make that happen”.*

According to a representative from CHODAWU Tanzanian's have become slightly more aware of domestic workers rights and C189 through their media project. However this is difficult to validate by this evaluation. A stakeholder who collaborated in the launch of the media campaign reported that the campaign

*“put a face on domestic workers, who are usually hidden behind closed doors, and more importantly unified them as a group, with a voice to advocate for themselves”.*

#### **Concerns raised amongst tripartite partners**

ATE reported that more awareness is required, and domestic workers themselves must understand their legal rights, and highlight their employment challenges. More immediate impacts according to the ILO/UNDP Coordinator are evident from inquiries from different partners following their digestion of the research results. From this, the ILO/UNDAP Coordinator concludes that the lack of reliable data was a hindrance previously.

### **5.5.6 Global Product (knowledge dissemination strategy & feedback)**

The process involved in developing global products is nearly as important as the final product itself, in terms of contributions, dialogue, discussions on substance, reflection on experiences and overall content. ILO 'global products' were generally developed with much dialogue and consultation to bring different perspectives and approaching the issues of decent work for domestic workers from different perspectives. Such a process is instrumental in ensuring a product does not come from one perspective alone, but is widely accepted. It would be important to continue to develop global products in this way.

#### **Feedback on global products**

As mentioned under 5.4, where known and shared with country level staff<sup>27</sup>, the global products were considered very useful for technical specialists and for government officials. In India for example the publication on labour law was considered to be particularly useful as well as examples of anti-discrimination law. In the Philippines, the ILO NPC found the policy briefs very useful. Basically it was reported that all these tools are important instruments providing examples for specialists who are supporting constituents to implement measures in line with the CPO. An example of impact reported during the evaluation came from a representative from the ILO child labour programme (IPEC) stated that GLO/11/54/SID's way of approaching the issue of domestic work changed the way IPEC approached child domestic labourers. For example IPEC's estimates on child domestic work is now based on *the industry-based approach*, rather than on previous occupation-approach.<sup>28</sup> IPEC now work towards improving working conditions for domestic workers who are older than the minimum age for employment, advocating to make their work more dignified and rights based.

#### **Box 4: Views on Outcome 5 Indicator 5.2: implementing sound wage policies**

The issue of minimum wages for domestic workers was raised by nearly all interviewed. Views on extending minimum wages to domestic workers proved contentious with much comment on the perceived effects of the impact (rather than actual evidence). Opinions differed depending on the type of stakeholder. In **Zambia**, all interviewed, except the employers organisation, thought the minimum wage rate for domestic workers was too low. Yet one domestic worker paid even lower wages to another domestic worker to mind her child, who could not live with her where she worked. In Zambia ZFE claimed that the level of recruitment of 'maids' has fallen due to the minimum wage, particularly as there was a public sector wage freeze at the point when the minimum wage arrived. An owner of a maid centre stated that the minimum wage had an effect, but in a negative way. Previously she was able to negotiate higher than the minimum wage for maids, but now employers will not go higher.

In the **Philippines**, the minimum wage was thought to be too low for domestic workers. The current law in **Paraguay** discriminates against domestic workers, who are legally entitled to only 40 percent of the minimum wage. The law mandates that housing and food be counted towards domestic worker's salary. In Paraguay an organisation representing housewives felt that minimum wages are only affordable by middle class families. A domestic workers representative reiterated this point for **India**. In **Tanzania** a researcher reported minimum wages for domestic work type of employment is very subjective as domestic work is 'atypical'. He repeated the oft-heard view that a young domestic worker may regard her work as temporary, using the opportunity to upgrade her education. In Zanzibar it was reported that the Ministry for Labour announced a new minimum wage for domestic workers, with a 100% increase (from 30,000 TSh to 60,000 or \$18 to \$36). However an ILO officer reported that many hardly receive \$9 per month.

The range of views above give an indication of the complexity of implementing sound wage policies, but indicate the need for solid evidence rather than anecdotal evidence on the effects of minimum wages. The results from **Cape Verde** and **Botswana** will be important in this regard.

### **5.5.7 Other evaluation findings on the overall impact orientation**

#### **Who benefited from GLO/11/54/SID (and project baselines)**

<sup>27</sup> Many global products were under production during the project implementation so not shared with all countries, unless directly involved.

<sup>28</sup> <http://www.ilo.org/ipecinfor/product/download.do?type=document&id=23235>

The time frame for implementing this project was very short to be able to see significant changes in people lives. Furthermore, without baseline information, it is difficult to determine who are the real beneficiaries from GLO/11/54/SID, although it can be argued that all tripartite partners benefited in terms of capacity development, technical support on labour legislation (with the exception of employers organisations in India). Domestic workers unions benefitted in particular because of the focus on their members. Employers organisations in Zambia and the Philippines benefitted by being able to develop their corporate social responsibility function. Most countries did not have adequate baselines on the membership of domestic workers in their unions.

#### **Evidence of the impact of GLO/11/54/SID in P&B 2012-13 report**

Results based management (BRM) reporting for Outcomes are generally restricted to the measurement criteria in the P&B. A number of achievements were evident as a result of Sida funding. Although RBM is welcomed, the ILO reporting format (although improving) does not necessarily allow for sufficient detail on smaller initiatives that may have had incremental impacts towards larger impacts. Not all impacts reach the P&B implementation report, so some indirect impacts are not widely shared. Generally all partners benefited by being included in discussions on the issues, broadening their horizons on how other countries have tackled the issue of domestic workers.

#### **Summary – impact**

Measuring ‘impacts’ or lasting/significant changes in for example the lives of domestic workers is challenging as it does not always follow a set pattern or fit into strict measurement criteria. Indeed baselines are not available on areas of focus such as attitudes of employers to domestic workers or domestic workers working conditions.

Secondly outcome based funding which is linked to two-year cycles does not allow sufficient time for impacts to occur that can be adequately measured. Thirdly the issue of ‘attribution’ is difficult and consideration is required for other projects including earlier ILO, UN and other agency initiatives.

Fourthly, it is impossible to account for ‘externalities’ or unexpected happenings, such as media coverage of the issue (outside ILO funded initiatives), changes in government or ‘entrenched’ views of organisations or key persons. Changes in legislation can be considered as having a lasting or significant impact only when we examine their implementation on the ground.

Generally, it was reported that there has been gradual changes. For example, some domestic workers knowing more about their rights, other stakeholders respect DWs contributions to the economy, and some employers are slightly more aware of domestic workers rights. It is difficult to assess fully these impacts without conducting an assessment of attitudes and knowledge of domestic workers rights. Creating structures for bringing different actors together may have produced the biggest impact in many countries, allowing the issues of decent work for DWs to be visible on the policy agenda. ILO through Sida funding has stressed domestic worker are an important emerging workforce and should be recognised as workers.

**Table 6: Assessment of direct assistance provided to five CPOs**

<b><i>ILO Areas of Assistance</i></b>	<b><i>CPOs with this indicator</i></b>	<b><i>Evaluation findings</i></b>
<b><i>A national plan of action is adopted by tripartite constituents, including representatives of domestic workers organizations where they exist, covering key priorities on working conditions and other aspects of decent work</i></b>	Tanzania Zambia	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Achieved in Tanzania and the Philippines</li> <li>▪ Domestic Workers were represented amongst tripartite constituents in the development of this Action Plan in Tanzania and got involved in discussions. Domestic workers unions were involved in discussions in Tanzania.</li> <li>▪ The national plan of action has not yet been implemented in Tanzania.</li> <li>▪ It is hard to determine how likely it is that the national tripartite action plan will be implemented in Tanzania, but ILO should act as facilitator and as a catalyst</li> </ul>
<b><i>New or modified legislation, regulations, policies, or national or sectoral programmes are adopted to improve working conditions and other dimensions of decent work</i></b>	India Philippines Paraguay Zambia	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ New legislation was adopted in India (domestic workers included in sexual harassment act) and the Philippines (Domestic Workers Act). A strong focus on implementing the existing legislation took place in Zambia (Statutory Instrument 3). C189 was adapted in Paraguay and a domestic workers Bill is before parliament. In India draft national legislation is before parliament.</li> <li>▪ The new legislation is known in the Philippines. Existing legislation appears to be less known in Zambia. In India it is not known how well the sexual harassment act is known. It is highly likely that the legislation will be adopted in Paraguay.</li> <li>▪ Whilst a focus on their sector is welcomed generally, those who represent domestic workers are not always fully satisfied with legislation around minimum wages and registration processes as formal workers. However more detailed studies should take place with regard to whether domestic workers views on the implementation of the legislation in the near future.</li> </ul>
<b><i>An information dissemination and awareness-raising campaign (aimed at reaching a big target audience or across geographical areas) on improving working conditions and promoting decent work more generally for domestic workers is implemented by one or more tripartite constituents</i></b>	Tanzania Zambia	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ The information and awareness raising campaign took place in both Tanzania and Zambia (and also in Paraguay and the Philippines).</li> <li>▪ Immediate impacts included more discussions in the media on minimum wages for domestic workers and broadly more awareness of the sector. Employers tend to be conscious of the need to protect themselves with respect to domestic workers rights, and agree that a contract is also of benefit to them as employers.</li> <li>▪ Apart from in Tanzania, there does not seem to be a solid monitoring system in place for checking the effects of the information dissemination/ awareness raising campaigns</li> <li>▪ Overall ILO's contribution with regard to information dissemination (although small in funding terms) was viewed positively by tripartite partners in the countries of focus.</li> </ul>
<b><i>A training strategy for improving working conditions and promoting decent work more generally along the lines of the new instruments is implemented by one or more tripartite constituents</i></b>	One or more than one tripartite constituent	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Paraguay is in the process of officially approving a training strategy for improving working conditions/ promoting decent work for domestic workers through the vocational education institutes. In Zambia attempts were made by the employers federation to sensitise 'maid centres' on decent work for domestic workers, but the impact of this is unclear. Some national stakeholders/ constituents felt that the professionalization of domestic work is important for higher wages, but whether this will translate into better wages and conditions is unknown, as many (including trade unionists themselves) cannot afford to pay for full time domestic work. Results for this indicator demonstrated the weakest results in GLO/11/54/SID.</li> </ul>

## 5.6 Sustainability

This section concerns whether or not there is a strategy in place to continue to make decent work a reality for domestic workers in each of the countries and ILO generally.

### Sustainability focus of GLO/11/54/SID

As far as this evaluation could determine, the Philippines and Paraguay appeared to have the most sustainable strategy in place for ensuring the policy process continues, although all countries had some types of plans to continue work in this sector. In many countries studies were just completed, disseminated and discussed toward the end of the project. In some ways it can be argued that initiatives are just beginning to take off in all five countries, but the project funding finished. Many challenges remain as outlined in Annex 10. Evidently a key challenge is how to continue and sustain the process initiated in all countries. This section examined the orientation of activities towards their continuation assuming ILO funds may not be available, or assuming that funds from elsewhere can be mobilised. Sustaining activities requires domestic workers to be at the heart of focus. Issues around sustaining organisations of domestic workers are outlined first, followed by issues noted with regard to enhancing sustainability. CPOs for 2014-15 were examined to consider continuation of focus in the five core countries of focus.

### 5.6.1 Organising domestic workers to sustain demands for decent work

#### Sustainability strategy around ensuring policy work continues – focus on domestic workers unions

A key common issue raised in all five countries was that of organising domestic workers for sustaining change and impact. More support on organising domestic workers was a recommendation arising from discussion with all unions (3 in the Philippines, 2 in Zambia, 1 in Paraguay, 2 in India and 1 in Tanzania). Organising domestic workers was not really fully addressed in the Global Product (except through the ACTRAV draft country case studies, that do not yet have a dissemination strategy).

In **the Philippines**, the three key main trade unions are competing to organize domestic workers, but have agreed to affiliate domestic workers into one National Alliance of domestic workers. ILO partners in the Philippines have asked for a manual for organizing domestic workers, which would document and provide hints on how to encourage individual domestic workers to understand the benefits of collective action. Comments from ILO officials in **India** suggested that the pilot approaches that facilitate trade unions to unionise domestic workers in Bangalore and Chennai were effective. The strategies used could be disseminated more widely.<sup>29</sup> Sustaining individual domestic workers membership in unions requires continuous service in terms of linking domestic workers to social welfare funds, and continuous skills development is important to ensure they continue in their unions.

Another sustainability issue is whether Domestic Workers Associations or smaller domestic unions affiliated with larger unions are represented in dialogue. In the **Philippines** every effort was made to include the key organisation representing domestic workers SUMAPI. In **Paraguay** one domestic workers union representative reported that their particular domestic worker union was not necessarily represented at bipartite discussions, although their 'mother' union was present. In **Zambia**, the two domestic workers unions reported that they felt part of the policy discussions and process.

Unionising domestic workers can proved futile unless they can engage in collective bargaining. In **Zambia** under the *Industrial Relations Act*, the *recognition agreement* stipulates that the Ministry of

<sup>29</sup> This was measured not only in organizing them but also identify leaders within themselves who could raise themselves to become peer leaders in carrying on the work of organizing them.

Labour can only register a union if it has an employer association (representing at least 25 workers) to negotiate with. Employers of domestic workers generally only employ one person. According to the Domestic Worker Union affiliated with ZTUC there is an informal agreement with the Labour Commission that the domestic workers unions can be involved in discussions.<sup>30</sup> However the question remains and is relevant for other countries – organising employers association with which the domestic workers unions can negotiate.

## 5.6.2 Sustainability issues raised by countries

The following section outlines the follow-up activities that have been initiated regardless of funding, and stresses where known if the tripartite constituents will continue to have a focus on domestic workers.

### 5.6.2.1 Zambia

#### How likely it is that actions will continue

Although there is a 2014-15 CPO that covers Outcome 5, it is unclear whether tripartite constituents will continue to implement actions to make decent work a reality for domestic workers. It would appear that ILO staff in the Lusaka office need to discuss where activities around decent work for domestic workers (DWDW) could fit within the Decent Work Country Programme (DWCP) (2013-2016). For example will follow up activities for domestic workers be automatically included under ILO support to the Ministry of Labour on Labour Law reform?

### 5.6.2.2 Philippines

#### How likely it is that actions will continue

The Domestic Workers Act is already being implemented and it is very likely that it will continue to be implemented and refined. A final and approved Domestic Work Technical Working Group (TWG) Plan of Action has been approved during the Domestic Work TWG a planning meeting in March 2014. The Philippines demonstrates what can sustainably be put in place with effective tripartite action and respect for different roles.

The Philippines 2014-2015 CPOs sustains a focus on domestic workers. PHL128 concerns wage policy, again with a focus on minimum wage. PHL 132 has a core focus on the adaption of the national legal framework for domestic workers, more specifically on developing capacities for its implementation. A strategy is in place to ensure tripartite constituents continue to implement actions to make decent work a reality for domestic workers. This is organised under P&B Outcome 5.1 and ACI 6 *Formalization of the informal economy*. The title of the current initiative is *Mechanisms to implement national legal framework for domestic workers strengthened and capacities of government and social partners enhanced*. The focus is on compliance with the Domestic Workers Act. Support will likely be provided for minimum wage criteria with guidelines as well as supporting plans for a Domestic Workers Alliance and some pilot interventions.

#### Follow-up activities that have been initiated

A range of follow-up activities is planned through some funds from Japan<sup>31</sup> and possible RBSA funds. A training manual on economic empowerment for Domestic Workers which came from the ILO enterprise section at the ILO regional office (ROAP)<sup>32</sup> will be offered to tripartite partners for ToT

<sup>30</sup> Parallels were drawn by Leaz and trade unions to the National Union of Plantation and Agricultural workers being able to negotiate with the Zambia National Farmers Union through the Farmers Employers Association of Zambia. Leaz and UHWDWUZ recommended that in Zambia a Domestic Service Commission (an independent body) would be set up. Zambia already has one for education and Leaz reported that it would be important in terms of furthering the rights of domestic workers. Issues such as retaining the NPC in Lusaka in the office means that there has been some continuity with regard to working with partners.

<sup>31</sup> Through the *Women Domestic Workers Empowerment Programme (WDWEP)*

<sup>32</sup> focused on the Philippines and Cambodia

purposes and pilot tested. The focus is on basic self-empowerment tools, domestic workers rights, and financial literacy, budgeting, and entrepreneurship. This manual may complement the 2012 *Decent Work for Domestic Workers in Asia and the Pacific* manual for trainers, prepared by IDWN and ILO<sup>33</sup>. The IDWN/ILO ToT manual concerns international rights for domestic workers and is already being used by trade unions and others.

A nation tripartite meeting will be convened in early June 2014, where the current status of the implementation of the Domestic Workers Act will be discussed, implementation issues highlighted and the new ToT manual from ILO ROAP presented. The Department of Labour and Employment have also planned a review of minimum wages.

In terms of sustaining a focus from the government's point of view, DOLE reported that activities around the implementation of the law are monitored, and help desks on what to do when there are violations are being set up. All regional DOLE offices are expected to implement the law. The evaluator noted that provisions under the July 2012 'Domestic Workers Act' has been 'mainstreamed' into the 2014 edition of the Department of Labor and Employments' Handbook on Workers' Statutory Monetary Benefits.<sup>34</sup> Producing an information kit on the *Batas Kasambahay* law with resources and qualitative research summaries may be useful for all stakeholders.

Employers (ECOP) are considering the development of readable material on the Domestic Workers Act for their members. Although they appreciate the model domestic workers contract template provided by DOLE, ECOP are considering developing a guide for employers. ECOP's training department may consider integrating issues around the Domestic Workers.

Thus with funding allocated for some of the above initiatives and others, (such as further studies on domestic workers, a citywide registration day for domestic workers), the Philippines could serve as a case study example of what can be put in place to ensure a comprehensive implementation of Convention 189. ILO Philippines staff and partners are clear on what still remains to be done, but require funds for some initiatives.

### 5.6.2.3 Paraguay

#### **How likely it is that actions will continue**

**In Paraguay** it is unknown whether 'political will' can ensure the Bill on Domestic Workers goes through parliament. With the formation of the new ministry of labour, an opportunity arises, if there is strong support from the *Tripartite Commission on Equal Opportunities*, particularly from the section focusing on working women.

#### **Follow-up activities that have been initiated**

Although the campaign in Paraguay has officially ended, more activities are being launched, including a television show produced by IPS broadcast on Paraguay's public television channel. The Ministry of Education and Culture is also conducting sensitisation campaigns in schools. A MoU signed between IPS and ILO in March 2014 to focus on increasing the coverage of social security includes one article on domestic workers. Once this MoU begins to be implemented, it will also serve to strengthen capacities to focus on domestic workers within IPS. This would render it highly likely that Paraguay will continue to strive towards decent work for domestic workers. ILO will provide technical backstopping on social security via a specialist in Venezuela with support also from the gender excol.

---

<sup>33</sup> produced by Elsa Ramos-Carbone

<sup>34</sup> See page 7. Minimum Wage and Rights of *Kasambahay* (DOLE 2014)

Work that has taken place under Sida funding in **Paraguay** will continue under the CPO entitled *Promotion of decent work for migrant workers and migrant domestic workers in the Paraguay-Argentina migration corridor*. This CPO for the 2014-2015 biennium and reported under Outcome 7 *More migrant workers are protected and more migrant workers have access to productive employment and decent work*. Paraguay to Argentina migration channels are one of the five main migration corridors for domestic worker that are included in a EU funded *Global Action Programme on Migrant Domestic Workers and their Families (2013-2016)*. This programme seeks to promote the rights of migrant domestic workers by addressing the challenges that make migrant domestic workers particularly vulnerable to the risks of exploitation and abuse. Building on the political will and dialogue started under the Sida project, amongst the many areas of focus, strengthening national labour laws is included.<sup>35</sup> The Union (CUT-AUTENTICA) reported that they will continue to organise domestic workers and are fully committed.

#### 5.6.2.4 India

##### How likely it is that actions will continue

The recent national election has stalled progress in India for the moment. ‘Political clearance’ of the draft National Policy on Domestic Workers is still required. It is unknown whether the new government will pass it. The previous administration was very slowing moving forward with the policy, according to one ILO official.<sup>36</sup> Clarification questions to ILO have been answered. The key issue being that the policy process takes time. As the draft National Policy is very much in line with ILO Convention 189, in the meantime many states can move ahead with their own initiatives rather than wait for the National Policy. ILO will pursue the ratification of C189 once the new political administration is in place.

##### Follow-up activities have been initiated

Domestic work is presented in the India DWCP 2013-2017 under promoting gender equality. It is included in a minor way under Outcome 2.3: Enhanced regulatory and delivery mechanisms to promote access and inclusion in skills development. Under Priority 3: *..social protection floor built ..* it is stressed that there is a need to create public awareness about key ILO instruments such as (among others) ILO Convention 189. One of three indicators includes the percentage increase made in coverage of informal economy workers in selected sectors (including domestic work) under Outcome 3.1: *...building a national social protection floor*. A CPO that covers domestic work is included in the 2014-15 P&B (IND127), linked to IND 125 on building a *National Social Protection Floor*. Domestic workers have a more obvious focus under Outcome 3.2: *Existing tripartite mechanisms for specific sectors are to be strengthened to ensure inclusion and effective implementation of policies such as (again amongst others) the National Policy on Domestic Workers, once adopted*. One of three indicators under Outcome 3.2 is the number of states, key partners and constituents implementing the National Policy on Domestic Workers. Thus the DWCP awaits the passing of this policy. Whether or not RBSA funding will be allocated for domestic work follow-up work is unknown (as of May 16<sup>th</sup> 2014).

---

<sup>35</sup> Although the focus is on Paraguay in terms of migrant domestic workers, strengthening the capacities of policy makers, domestic worker and employer organizations, and practitioners to advocate for migrant domestic workers’ access to decent work and human rights will likely help to sustain a focus on national domestic workers in Paraguay. Studies generated by this EU project on domestic workers living in Argentina will further strengthen Paraguayan officials knowledge on issues such as moving benefits between countries. Indeed the skills training course output implemented through SINAFOCAL (under Sida funds) will be implemented to help domestic workers prior to migrating. By pilot-testing national capacity building approaches to promote policies and regulations and empower domestic workers should sustain a focus on the sector in Paraguay.

<sup>36</sup> The National Advisory Council chaired by the President of the ruling Congress Party was also slowing pushing for the adoption of the policy. The Government had referred the draft policy to the state governments for their response. As far back as September 2011, the Secretary of Labour and Employment discussed the draft policy at a workshop with the State Labour Departments and encouraged the states to send their comments. The draft policy was referred to a Group of Secretaries for further discussion. Based on their comments a revised draft has been placed.



Outcome 4.1 in the DWCP also mentions on-going efforts of central trade unions to organize domestic workers (amongst other categories of workers) under *Strengthened national and state level tripartite mechanisms...* However no specific indicator or output here mentions domestic workers. A programme to prevent trafficking of women and girls (including into domestic work) entitled *Working in Freedom* supported by UK Aid will help to sustain work with regard to domestic workers in India. This programme also covers other Asian countries.<sup>37</sup>

### 5.6.2.5 Tanzania

#### Follow-up activities that have been initiated

The Tanzania DWCP 2013-2016 has an output on domestic workers under Priority 1 (*Extending social protection coverage for all* – one of four priorities in the DWCP). Outcome 1.3 concerns *improved working conditions ... in the formal and informal economy*. Indicators include the number of actions undertaken by the government to implement the standards set in Convention 189. Output 1.3. expects that *a national awareness-raising strategy for advancing decent work for domestic workers is designed and implemented*. Thus it can be argued that ILO and its partners will have a sustained focus on domestic work in Tanzania if the corresponding CPOs is adequately funded. The 2014-15 CPO TZA104 has the submission of Convention 189 to Cabinet as one of its milestones. Another milestone is reaching at least 2000 domestic workers.

#### How likely it is that actions will continue

There seems to be sustained interest from the trade unions in Tanzania. Although ILO (with Sida funds) provided the technical training and supported the launch of the CHODAWU campaign in September 2013, CHODAWU has since sustained the campaign using their own resources and intend to do so towards C189 ratification. A stakeholder who collaborated in the launch of the media campaign reported that there should be more discussion on sustaining the work done to date, to ensure the media work continues in the absence of donor funding.

### 5.6.2.6 Continued use of global products

#### Dissemination strategy for global products

ILO INWORK is in the process of developing a dissemination strategy for knowledge sharing on domestic workers. They will sustain the use of their global products using the current website (updating regularly), social media, collaboration with external partners, such as the International Domestic Workers Federation (IDWF) and prepare a colourful catalogue with all the resources and tools available. It would be important to begin to measure the use of global products and produce some metrics with regard to downloads. Other organisations (e.g. World Bank) are finding that their documents are not being downloaded to the extent envisaged.

<sup>37</sup> [http://www.ilo.org/global/about-the-ilo/multimedia/video/institutional-videos/WCMS\\_217690/lang--en/index.htm](http://www.ilo.org/global/about-the-ilo/multimedia/video/institutional-videos/WCMS_217690/lang--en/index.htm)

### Summary Sustainability

Sustainability requires a constant demand for action from below. Because ILO work is upstream, and is often focusing on policy change through tripartite consensus, sustained efforts have to be made to remind tripartite partners to communicate closely with their own constituents. This is particularly important for associations of domestic workers, who may be only loosely linked to a particular union. These associations may not fully understand the ILO support process, and may be expecting typical NGO type support (direct funds, tips for organising and facilities for holding meetings, personnel from 'donor' agencies working directly with them on the ground, advising etc.). Most importantly these associations have to feel that their grassroots knowledge is feeding into the policy process. Much depends on their relationship with their 'mother union' or association, as well as their capacities to voice their views. Their 'power' and 'voice' also depends on the number of associations of domestic workers unions in a given country, their representation and membership base.

In some countries, competition to organise domestic workers exists between unions. For domestic workers themselves, even if they know about unions, which union they should join and why (as well as the benefits) can be confusing and the implications worrying (in terms of their employer). Whether or not the domestic workers association/organisation or union is represented by the larger union or not is a matter for trade unions to decide. However ILO through ACTRAV and other projects can continue to remind and advocate that trade unions are giving voice and truly representing the views of smaller domestic workers associations or unions. For instance it may be important to prioritise specific domestic workers grievances, sexual harassment in the workplace, minimum wages, working hours.

Evidently new legislation and action plans will be sustainability depending on how they are implemented (with watch dogs such as domestic workers unions keeping track). Adherence to laws in the 'informal' sector is an issue in many countries and requires continued focus through tripartite mechanisms to ensure the implementation of legislation, regulations or policies to improve the working conditions of domestic workers.<sup>38</sup> However for sustained change overall, more sensitisation is required in nearly all the countries including at community level.

<sup>38</sup> In Zambia for instance implementing of minimum wages may not yet be occurring on the ground.

## **5.7 Efficiency of resource use**

### **5.7.1 Added value of Sida resources toward the achievement of Outcome 5**

This section concerns the efficiency of resource use under the Sida funds. Although the funding was outcome based, in reality at the country level, the work was viewed as a 'project' on decent work for domestic workers, with an implementation plan. Table 6 outlines the ratio of Sida funding to CPO outcomes and global products in relation to additional funds. This is based on financial information made available during the evaluation (and may require correction).

#### **SIDA's criteria for use of funds**

It appeared that the only stipulation in the outcome based funding modality was that Sida specified a 75/25 funding ratio between headquarters and field. This occurred, with the CTA and CPO coordinators allocated the ration of funding by CPO.

#### **Accountability mechanism put in place for use of funds**

Responsibility for ensuring the quality of initiatives funded through this mechanism lies with PARDEV, who provided spreadsheets to the evaluator that demonstrated how they track funding under this funding modality. Whilst responsibility for reporting on the Sida funds rested with PARDEV, whereas reporting on outcome indicators go to ILO PROGRAM (through Outcome coordinators in Geneva). According to PARDEV's report to Sida (2014) Sida's contribution to Outcome 5 amounts to 3.2 percent of total ILO expenditures on Outcome 5.

Funding used for global products appeared to be 'standard'. Funds were used strategically to integrate the issue of domestic workers across INWORK /TRAVAIL and beyond. These funds were supplemented by the ILO regular budget special programme account (\$596,800 for 2012-13) to follow up on domestic work. The CTA proved to be excellent resource for all countries, and was easily available and accessible to all NPCs or ILO staff requiring inputs and advice.

The funding for the five key countries of focus was not large by technical cooperation standards, but used strategically in most cases and supplemented by other funds and projects where possible. The cost of conducting studies was relatively quite high (particularly in Zambia and the Philippines, although the evaluator did not have full knowledge of costs of studies conducted in the other countries). It is not clear if this presents value for money as the impact of these studies is unknown. Because they are not peer reviewed (outside ILO), they may not be considered of sufficient high quality to be used confidently outside the narrow confines of the project and tripartite partners. See Annex 7.

In view of the high costs of hiring full-time National Project Coordinators (NPCs), costs were shared with other projects in Zambia and India. For example in India the salary of the NPC was shared with an ILO gender mainstreaming programme *BASIC II*. In Zambia the NPC worked 50 percent of the time on a forced labour project, which allowed synergies and cost sharing of awareness raising activities. A full time NPC which may reflect the process made there, although the Philippines was at a different stage to the other countries of focus. Paraguay had no NPC, although a long-term consultant and a gender Excol in Chile worked more or less continuously and effectively on the project.

## 5.7.2 Synergies built during implementation

Some examples of efficiencies noted during the evaluation are outlined below:

- **Resources were shared across continents.** The training manual entitled Decent Work for Domestic Workers, developed by the regional ILO office (Asia) and IDWN was used in the Philippines but also in Zambia during capacity building workshop for ZCTU and FFTUZ. Qualitative research methods and other methodological guidelines were shared across countries and with an ILO-EU funded project focusing on migrating workers along particular corridors.
- **Cost sharing with other ILO projects.** In **Zambia** synergies were built between child labour projects (from IPEC) and a Forced Labour project (SAP-FL). Under SAP-FL for instance, the Toolkit for trade unions in Zambia (*forced labour and human trafficking*) included outlined case examples of domestic workers. In this toolkit, Section 5 *What Trade Unions can do* outlines many awareness raising and campaigning principles that can be applied to work with other informal sector workers. Because the ILO UNDP officer initially coordinated activities in **Tanzania**, this allowed synergies to be built through UNDP activities. For example UNDP provided non-staff costs and costs toward tripartite meetings and other workshops. In **India** synergies were built with IPEC and child domestic workers. Some unions received grants for a campaign against child domestic workers (e.g. in Jharkhand) and were also able to highlight general issues around domestic workers.
- **ILO encouraged cost sharing with partners** The social security institute (IPS) paid for part of the campaign to register domestic workers in **Paraguay**. DOLE in the Philippines paid for one of 3 workshops. Following initial ILO support, ECOP paid for further workshops to sensitise on the Domestic Workers Act.
- **Using a broad range of staff.** ILO obtained help from the ILO focal point in Paraguay, who supported local coordination with actors, and assisted on all activities. In addition, an experienced consultant was regularly contracted which brought an 'outside' perspective.<sup>39</sup> Although this consultant provided many inputs, an existing ILO officer in Paraguay, as well as many ILO officers in the regional office in Chile provided backstopping.
- **Leveraging other funds.** For example in Paraguay the project leveraged other funds at the country level via *Programa Conjunto Oportunidades* (\$3,530) and ILO RBTC (\$5,000) as well as about 5 work months of regular budget staff from Santiago. Zambia appeared to leverage significant extra of funds required for the studies on domestic workers.

---

<sup>39</sup> This consultant, Maria Victoria Heikel, produced the study on the socio-demographic and labour situation of paid domestic work in Paraguay and was able to join up many of the activities with the ILO official during implementation. Her position was critical in terms of coordinating the implementation of the bi-partite roundtable for the domestic workers training course, as well as providing technical support on the draft law discussions. She also contributed significantly to the contents of the campaign for increased social security for domestic workers.

### **Summary efficiency**

On the surface it appeared that every effort was made to share resources and develop synergies with other related projects in ILO. ILO's use of resources through the Sida funds proved efficient and strategic. In Zambia the project appeared to cost more relative to the outputs achieved. On the whole, however insufficient information is available to make comments on value for money by country, although it would appear that Paraguay provided value for the money invested.

Stakeholders outside ILO are often unable to distinguish between different projects implemented through ILO. This lack of clarity could demonstrate how efficient ILO is at linking differently funded but related initiatives. However, it can also cause unease amongst partners as they do not understand funding mechanisms and rules with regard to how resources (both financial and human) are used. For example it can cause confusion that ILO is not sustaining a focus on domestic workers. It can cause concern and damage ILO's overall reputation if a former ILO officer (and resource person for a trade union or employers organisation) moves onto another topic and does not seem to sustain an interest in domestic workers.

**Table 7: Ratio of funds used**

	<b>Costs</b>	<b>Ratio provided by Sida DWDW</b>
<b>Zambia</b>	<p>\$175,207 + \$19,929 (global product funds) = \$195,136 + additional funds of \$97,534 approx.</p> <p>(\$36,000 gender; \$3,000 RBTC; \$15,000 ROAF; \$16,323 INWORK RBTC &amp; Special Programme Account for DW \$27,211)</p> <p>Total: \$292,670</p>	<p>Sida provided about two thirds of the funds towards the work.</p> <p>The studies in Zambia proved expensive</p>
<b>Philippines</b>	<p>\$174,828</p> <p>Supplemented by approx \$7,000 from INWORK RBTC and \$10,000 from Sida gender (all workers planning in organising DWs &amp; national ToT on DW for DW).</p> <p>Total: \$??</p>	<p>Sida provided over 90% of the funds towards the work. Sida funds used to fund consultations with social partners to provide inputs into the implementing rules and regulations of the Domestic Workers Act.<sup>40</sup> Also external collaboration and inputs towards the DW TWG planning. Covered the cost of a NPC</p> <p>Relative to other costs, the qualitative research on domestic workers was expensive.</p>
<b>Paraguay</b>	<p>\$97,062</p> <p>Supplemented by \$109,850 from RB and 5000 from RBTC</p> <p>Total: \$??</p>	<p>Sida provided about 45% of funds towards the work.</p>
<b>India</b>	<p>\$117,341 (2013???)</p> <p>Supplemented by funds from ILO New Delhi RBTC capacity building of TU's in organising DWs. BASIC II on gender equality &amp; sexual harassment in the workplace (also sharing salary of NPC).</p> <p>Total: \$??</p>	<p>Approximately 14% of Sida funds were used for studies. Almost a third of Sida funds went towards four knowledge-sharing workshops (Hyderabad, Bangalore, Ranchi and New Delhi). Nearly another third of the funds were spent on travel, NPC salary and evaluation costs. About 21 % of funds were spent on administrative and programme support.</p>
<b>Tanzania</b>	<p>Contributed 29% (approx) to Outcome 5 (\$78,791)</p> <p>Funding from ILO Travail (\$35,590) toward domestic work study and administration. UNDAP provided nearly \$162,527 towards seminars, travel, administration and a fellowship.</p>	<p>Sida funds contributed about 29% (approximately) UNDAP provided nearly 59 % of funding ILO TRAVAIL funds provided about 12% of the total funding. Funds from Sida used for training of CHODAWU in media campaign strategy and development of materials; production of CHODAWU media resource; qualitative research in employment practices and working conditions; fellowship training of labour officer. NPC salary for 1 year.</p>
<b>Global products</b>	<p>SIDA funds used were 24.8% of total.</p> <p>\$596,000 from ILO Special Prog Account for follow-up action on domestic work Supplemented by regular budget staff time from INWORK &amp; ALBADMIN. Luxembourg thematic contribution in 2012 to CTA salary. \$79,223 went to global products on wages, &amp; some country level activities</p>	?
<b>Cape Verde</b>	<p>\$50,072 Empirical survey on minimum wage</p>	?
<b>Botswana</b>	<p>\$7,383 Study on minimum wage for domestic workers (and cattle post workers)</p>	?

<sup>40</sup> For example a service contract also ensured that island wide multi-stakeholder consultations could take place to provide inputs to the IRR of the Domestic Workers Act in the short time period available before the IRRs had to be in place. Funds were also provided to spearhead the National All Workers consultation on the draft IRR of the Domestic Workers Act and to the National All Employers consultation. In essence funds were provided to all tripartite partners to ensure their inputs.

## **6. Conclusions and recommendations**

---

### ***6.1 Conclusions***

Evidently it can be concluded that many initiatives have taken place, much as been achieved, but much remains to be done to make decent work a reality for domestic workers. Sida funds were instrumental in ensuring an effective response to decent work for domestic workers, both at country level and through the global products. The project actions have produced immediate and mid-term impacts towards the achievements of CPOs and P&B outcomes. For example in India, there had been gaps over the years in ILO support and focus on Domestic Workers. The Sida funding was instrument in ensuring the last set of initiatives on domestic work continued (2012-present).

This evaluation concludes that a lot has been achieved with the resources available, all relevant and coherent with Outcome 5. The achievements and outputs are linked mainly to Indicator 5.1 with some issues relevant to Indicator 5.2.

Project management at INWORK ILO Geneva have been extremely effective in supporting country level initiatives and global product development. ILO overall has enhanced knowledge on the sector; worked towards ensuring tripartite constituents address this important sector; and ensured a sustained focus on the practical implementation of measures to improve domestic work conditions. More evidently, ILO continues to close important information gaps on estimates of domestic workers, so that such evidence and comparison with other countries contributes to ensuring more visibility to this sector or workers. ILO's global work on domestic workers is extremely important to create a demand by national partners for decent work for domestic workers.

Clearly, ILO staff in-country are supporting tripartite partners to be more effective, whilst also encouraging greater participation of domestic worker associations in larger trade unions, although precise information is hard to determine without an extensive examination of membership. In specific countries, measures are in place to improve the likelihood that decent work becomes a reality for domestic workers. The political dimension of ILO's work is hard to put on paper, yet NPCs technical contribution to parliamentarians or bureaucrats with influence can be significant in national parliaments where support is requested.

A range of challenges were mentioned by many interviewed and respondents to the questionnaire. These are organised by country and summarised in Annex 10. These challenges are by no means the only challenges different countries face to implement decent work for domestic workers, but provide a snapshot of challenges and reflect information collected during the evaluation. Sweden's support over the two years has contributed significantly to supporting all the ILO programme initiatives that encourage decent work for domestic workers. Although this evaluation assesses the ILO's work as overall praiseworthy, it concludes that the Domestic Work as a sector requires more support in the current biennium.

## 6.2 Recommendations

The section contains recommendation that arose during the course of the evaluation. For consistency, some recommendations are organised around the measurement criteria for Outcome 5. Other recommendations that do not relate directly to these criteria are then presented. The recommendations are summarised in Table 8, subsequently followed by more detail.

**Table 8: Recommendations arising from the evaluation**

<i>Related to:</i>	<i>Recommendation</i>	<i>Who?</i>	<i>Priority</i>	<i>When</i>	<i>Costs</i>
<b>P&amp;B Indicator 5.1 Measurement Criteria: National Plans of Action Adopted</b>	Wide consultation and discussion is still required at various levels in the 5 countries of focus or other countries	Initiated by ILO country staff	High	Continuous	Should be integrated into on-going policy dialogues on informal sector
	Stress the need for attention to the precise detail of national plan implementation measures.	ILO staff in India, Zambia, Paraguay, Philippines	Medium	Continuous Now and for other countries implementing legislation on domestic law	Yes.
	Continue to ensure all domestic workers are registered. Highlight the advantage of domestic workers having a contract for employers.	ACTEMP, ILO country staff dealing with employers organizations, and Employers organizations to their members. Employers in India, may require some capacity development as regards why they should do this.	High	Continuous	Funds required for a public information campaign & build capacities of government services providers, particularly at the local village level so they can facilitate registration of DWs.
	Integrate with issues related to migrant domestic workers	ILO Migrant and ILO INWORK ILO Santiago, ILO India	High	At next HQ working group on domestic strategy. Communicate strong messages to country offices	None
<b>P&amp;B Indicator 5.1 Measurement Criteria: New or Modified Legislation</b>	Constantly engage in the future (high level ILO staff) with the ministries of labour on the issue of domestic workers e.g. ILO could constantly check with the new Ministry of Labour in Paraguay on the progress of the draft domestic labour law	ILO country offices	High	Particular important for new administration India, also in Zambia, Paraguay & Tanzania	Perhaps but appears to be political 'will' to move ahead
	Improve its measurement of how ILO informs or influences policy.	ILO HQ Technical Unit. Ask for summary of Sida evaluation on Policy	Medium	Before end of 2014	Yes, time and human resources, review of Sida work done in this area in on-going evaluation



<i>Related to:</i>	<i>Recommendation</i>	<i>Who?</i>	<i>Priority</i>	<i>When</i>	<i>Costs</i>
	Develop context specific policy case study examples	Dialogue as an instrument at end of 2014 ILO Philippines ILO Paraguay	Medium	Before end of 2014	Yes, hire someone to undertake this job (e.g. in the Philippines Jerome A. Alcantra; in Paraguay Maria Victoria Heckle)
<b>Indicator 5.1</b> <b>Measurement Criteria:</b> <b>Information Dissemination or Awareness-Raising Campaign</b>	Include definitions of domestic workers explicitly in all ILO documentation on employment policies or labour laws	ILO INWORK	Medium	Starting now – but continuous	Yes
	Organise further sensitisation campaigns on the rights of domestic workers. Share ILO materials with NGOs conducting awareness raising campaigns on the plight of domestic workers	ILO country offices, ILO HQ	High	Now and as opportunities arise	Yes, but domestic workers should be included in other on-going campaigns. Sharing information electronically not costly, but time involved, and reminders to share existing information
	Provide guidance, in collaboration with ACTEMP, on how to involve the employers of domestic workers.	ILO HQ with ACTEMP	Medium	Now	Yes
	Develop a quality review framework for research commissioned by ILO. Set up an independent peer process to review research. Ensure that research is better linked to policy processes. Consider how ILO commissioned research can better inform policy, including timing issues	ILO HQ ILO Country Offices	High	In the next few months	Yes
<b>Indicator 5.1</b> <b>Measurement Criteria: Training Strategy for Improving Working Conditions</b>	Strengthen domestic workers organisations and fill knowledge gap on how to organize domestic workers	ILO HQ Technical Unit (INWORK) ACTRAV	High	Soon	Yes
	Review evidence and discuss whether skills development for domestic workers will actually raise wages in the sector.	ILO HQ project management	Medium	Soon	Yes
<b>Indicator 5.2</b> <b>Minimum wages</b>	Tripartite discussion on minimum wages is required. Follow up on requests for support to ministries on minimum wage legislation.	Lead by ILO INWORK ILO country offices with tripartite Constituents in Zambia, Philippines, Paraguay, Tanzania	Medium	On-going	Not really, as it can be included in other minimum wage discussions or other tripartite discussions. However there may be implications if research

<i>Related to:</i>	<i>Recommendation</i>	<i>Who?</i>	<i>Priority</i>	<i>When</i>	<i>Costs</i>
	Consider a campaign on minimum / fair wages for domestic workers.	Lead by ILO INWORK	Low	2015	/evidence required
<b>Recommendations related to Global Products</b>	Request ACTRAV to document the many ways to organise domestic workers	ILO HQ	High	2014	Yes
	Improve dissemination of global products to grassroots level	ILO Country office and Project Management INWORK	High	Ongoing	Yes
<b>Specific recommendations related to ILO HQ</b>	Ensure domestic workers organisations are represented in all activities, and invited to major events. Ensure employers organisations involved.	ILO HQ, Inwork	Medium	2015	Yes
	Consider a long term funding perspective with regard to decent work for domestic workers	ILO management Governing body	Medium	2015	Yes
	Use knowledgeable experienced ILO staff on related domestic worker initiatives and expand expertise on the sector.	ILO HQ	High	Ongoing	Yes
	Plan for obvious linkages to the domestic work sector in other work at the CPO design stage	ILO country office PROGRAM staff	High	Reviews of CPOs, or when action plan for CPO being developed	No
	Consider the inclusion of domestic workers in a thematic evaluation around broader topics such as formalising the informal sector in a particular country	ILO Eval	Low	2015	Yes
	Reconsider how research and studies are commissioned (see earlier recommendation under <i>Information Dissemination</i> )	ILO HQ	High	Late 2014	Yes

## 6.2.1 Recommendations to support the achievement of indicator 5.1 (P&B)

### National plans of action adopted by tripartite constituents

1. To move the **draft national policies forward for domestic workers** (in some countries), **more consultation and discussion is still required at various levels** (often ensuring employers organisations are fully on board). ILO should continue assist in organising this consultation and the overall dialogue process.<sup>41</sup> For example in some cases, whether or not separate legislation is required on domestic workers or whether domestic workers should be integrated as 'normal' workers in national labour law should be discussed through tripartite dialogue. This is important in terms of minimum wage and access to social security. In some countries minimum wages for domestic workers are legislated to be lower.
2. **Stress the need for attention to the details of implementation to ensure decent work for domestic workers.** In further country level guidance or global level documentation on domestic workers, strong attention should be placed on communicating legislative changes for domestic workers down the line to intermediary institutions and local government to avoid 'policy evaporation'. A different ministry may control these bodies, so a strong emphasis must be placed on the nitty-gritty (or fundamental) aspects of implementation (e.g. encourage ministries of labour to communicate carefully in directives for implementation, funding mechanisms and media channels across ministries agencies etc.).
3. **Stress the need to continue to or start to ensure all domestic workers are registered.** The responsibility for registration is often through local councils. However the order must come from the Ministry of Labour or from the particular administrative procedures in place in the country or state (official notifications, detailed government directives, or the official government Gazette (India). **Continue to highlight the advantage of domestic workers having a contract for employers.** Many employer organisations (APEP in Paraguay, ZFE in Zambia) reported that hiring honest domestic workers, who is trustworthy, is a concern for many employers. Stress how having a contract in place can help to protect employers.
4. **Integration with issues related to migrant domestic workers should continue to be made.** In Paraguay for example emigration to other countries requires bilateral agreements to be put in place to address migrant domestic workers needs.

### New or modified legislation, regulations or policies adopted

1. Some domestic workers consider legislation that is binding and enforceable imperative.<sup>42</sup> Again, there is a need for ILO officials to **constantly engagement by ILO Directors and high level staff with the ministries of labour (by ILO and trade unions) on the issue of domestic workers.** This is particular important for the new administration in **India**, but also in Zambia and Tanzania (where there appears to be political will to move ahead). ILO could constantly check with the new Ministry of Labour in Paraguay on the progress of the draft domestic labour law.
2. **ILO should improve its measurement of how ILO actually informs or influences policy.** Better measurements would help to explain to donors what exactly is meant by 'technical

<sup>41</sup> In India a Labour Commissioner commented on this as well as a representative from NDWM, stating that tripartite meetings with clear directions to states along with ILO facilitation will help domestic work move higher on the agenda, and the national policy passed.

<sup>42</sup> In **India** for example a representative from the Domestic Workers Forum argued strongly that ILO should really push for the ratification of Convention 189, because once ratified domestic workers will be officially recognised as workers. A huge push from domestic workers themselves may help.

support' or 'technical inputs' which are often written as if this is adequate to cover the range of dialogue, policy advice, influencing strategies, studies, econometric analyses, statistics used in this regard, by whom and with whom. Jones, H. (February 2011) provides a useful note/guide to *monitoring and evaluating policy influence*.<sup>43</sup>

3. **Develop context specific policy case study examples.** The entire policy process in the Philippines should be documented highlighting different roles, political nuances, timing issues etc. This will help stakeholders from other countries planning their ratification or implementation campaign. **If documenting the national policy process, stress the non-linear aspects of the policy process.** The Philippines (and Paraguay) could be used to demonstrate the non-linear policy process involved in obtaining achievements around DWDW, highlighting instead political issues.

### Information dissemination or awareness-raising campaign

1. **Ensure definitions of domestic workers are very explicit in all ILO documentation on employment policies or labour laws;** keep the focus also on child domestic workers, working with IPEC. **Further sensitisation campaigns on the rights of domestic workers** are definitely required. Where possible encourage national stakeholders to expand existing campaigns to other regions/provinces. Drama or theatre sessions seem to prove effective in rural areas (e.g. in Chaco areas in the Paraguay). Campaigns for rural and urban areas may have to be quite different. National partners should be strongly encouraged to extend media campaign to other regions. **Share ILO materials with NGOs conducting awareness raising campaigns on the plight of domestic workers,** particularly in contexts where trade unions are not strongly supporting domestic workers.
2. **A continuous campaign involving trade unions and civil society organizations** is required to ensure that domestic workers remain and move up the political agenda. ILO can constantly remind trade unions of their obligation to these informal sector workers. Domestic workers must be consistently mentioned in most other work with ACTRAV and mentioned in tripartite dialogue sessions. New materials should be sent out, emails reminding about existing materials, policy briefs or any new developments.
3. Guidance could be provided in collaboration with ACTEMP on **how to involve the employers of domestic workers** through the likes of Resident Welfare Associations or associations of housewives, or other means. Encourage ACTEMP to raise awareness and highlight working conditions and the lack of social security for domestic workers in their literature, stressing the advantages of formalising contacts with domestic workers from an employer's perspective, and a human rights perspective.
4. **Some type of research support and quality review framework for research is required. Develop an independent peer process to review research commissioned by ILO.** For a research study to be considered robust and likely to be quoted outside a narrow project framework, it should be sent to a range of independent reviewers. Ensure sample sizes and methodologies are always clearly outlined in all research reports. Research institutes may be able to provide guidance (e.g. link with Masters and PhD students who wish to focus on a relevant labour related area, but are supervised by a graduate research committee). Alternatively set up a 'research' support office that oversees sample sizes, qualitative

<sup>43</sup> <http://www.odi.org.uk/resources/download/5252.pdf>

Reisman, J., A. Gienapp, et al. (2007) also have a useful guide to measuring advocacy and policy available at:

<http://www.hfrp.org/evaluation/the-evaluation-exchange/issue-archive/advocacy-and-policy-change/a-guide-to-measuring-advocacy-and-policy>

methodologies and reviews the research concept note before research commences. Annex 7 contains further points. **Ensure that research is better linked to policy processes and carefully consider how it can inform policy, including timing issues.** Box 3 below outlines some useful resources in this regard.

**Box 4: Resources for linking research to policy**

- (i) Young, J. and Court, J. (2004) Bridging Research and Policy in International Development: An Analytical and Practical Framework." RAPID Briefing Paper 1.  
<http://www.odi.org.uk/resources/download/168.pdf>
- (ii) Start, D. and Hovland, I. (2004). "Tools for policy impact: a handbook for researchers" ODI
- (iii) Hovland, I (2007) Making a difference: M&E of Policy Research Working Paper 281 ODI, July 2007
- (iv) Bridging research and policy – annotated bibliography ODI

### Training Strategy for improving working conditions

1. **Strengthening domestic workers organisations** was a recommendation put forward by many during this evaluation.<sup>44</sup> There is knowledge gap with regard to strategies that prove effective in organising employers of domestic workers.
2. **A standard curriculum for domestic workers, which includes rights** is recommended by many (Zambia, Paraguay, the Philippines), although it is unclear whether this will lead to higher wages, or the professionalization of domestic workers. **Review evidence and discuss whether skills development for domestic workers will actually raise wages in the sector.** ILO should discuss internally and with ILO Skills Development the major issues around designing programmes to enhance the skills of the domestic workers and what this should include at a minimum (beyond the skill set required for this type of work). Apart from issues around rights as workers, consider what information is required with regard to organising, and skills that improve their employability and income.

### 6.2.2 Recommendations to support the achievement of Indicator 5.2 (P&B)

1. **More tripartite discussion on minimum wages is required.** For example in Paraguay, Paraguay will need ILO support to address the complicated issue of minimum wages to inform parliament. Given the political nature of the minimum wage in Zambia (and the discrepancies in views with regard to it), and the fact that many<sup>45</sup> stated that the minimum wage is not implemented, and many interviewed (at least 20) said that the minimum wage is too low, a study on the effects of the minimum wage may be in order. In Zambia and the Philippines consider toward the beginning of 2015 conduct a small rapid assessment (500) of domestic workers asking them specifically about the impact of the minimum wage on their lives. Use the existing research tools developed under the project. ILO should continue to **support various ministries of labour in devising minimum wages** adjusted for inflation and

<sup>44</sup> For example the Ministry of Women, all three trade unions and domestic workers association in the Philippines, one trade unions in Zambia and both domestic workers unions, ILO staff in Zambia and stakeholders in India.

<sup>45</sup> Ipsos researchers, domestic workers themselves, trade unions etc..

embracing the principals of a Living Wage formula. Disseminate existing publications more widely and communicate the criteria and procedures for fixing wages.

2. **Consider a campaign on minimum / fair wages.** Clarify why domestic workers are entitled to minimum wage protection where such coverage exists for workers generally. In some countries more discussion is required with respect to live-in full time domestic workers and part-time domestic workers and the consequences. Households who cannot pay minimum wages to employ domestic workers need to consider other options (part-time basis or highlighting that households can share some of the tasks that domestic workers typically undertake). Not hiring a domestic worker from 8am to 17 hours but for two days a week instead requires a change in attitude. A campaign on this may be required.

### 6.2.3 Recommendations for 'global products'

1. **Request that ACTRAV documents the many ways to organise domestic workers.** Trade unions require more capacity on extending membership to domestic workers. Trade unions frequently requested training or technical assistance for organising domestic workers (in all countries). Many innovative methods were mentioned by domestic workers organisations during this evaluation (social media, malls, church, specific outreach activities, invitations to skills training programmes, street organising, drama etc.).
2. **Improve dissemination of global products to grassroots level.** In disseminating global products it may be important to ensure they go beyond the director of an organisation by insisting that some feedback is provided by a number of employees. **Develop a global dissemination strategy for ILO domestic work products.** A group of people around the world are evolving naturally because of the common interest in domestic workers. However this Community of Practice must be sustained through sharing information and experiences with the group to learn from each other. Sustaining such a community however requires a dedicated promoter or coordinator. ILO is now chairing the Global Migration Group (GMC)<sup>46</sup>, which has 16 UN members, providing lots of opportunities for increasing the visibility of achievements under this project. Case studies of what worked and why from the five countries of focus should be prepared and presented at high-level discussions. **Link with partners, sharing materials.** ILO should continue to work in close partnership with trade unions and domestic workers associations linking IDWF and International ITUC's 12 by 12 campaign<sup>47</sup> (providing hyperlinks from the Domestic Workers website).

### 6.2.4 Recommendations for ILO headquarters

1. Evidently ILO should maintain estimates on domestic workers. **Ensure domestic workers organisations are represented in all activities.** Follow-up on CPOs for 2014-15 is urgent, so that the momentum is not lost in countries with a domestic worker focus. When organising a domestic workers global conference, ensure the domestic workers unions themselves are represented rather than only federation of trade unions. Their representation is essential, even if they have less capacities than their affiliate union.

<sup>46</sup> <http://www.globalmigrationgroup.org/>

<sup>47</sup> <http://www.ituc-csi.org/domestic-workers-12-by-12.html?lang=en>

2. **Consider a long term funding perspective with regard to decent work for domestic workers,** with regular budgets allocated to countries that show potential or mobilise the domestic work sector or interest in implementing C189. Immediate and persistent attention to domestic workers is required by ILO in the immediate future, particularly as it is a new Convention. If attention is not paid, the momentum from the Sida funded initiatives will be lost and the global community will not regard this new standard with the respect it deserves.
3. **Continue to use the knowledgeable ILO staff that have considerable experience of working on the domestic workers sector and expand expertise on the sector.** Ensure that the institutional knowledge is not lost through changes in staffing arrangements. Document the experiences of achieving DWDW stressing the skills of ILO officials required to work in this sector.
4. **Plan for obvious linkages to the domestic work sector in other work at the CPO design stage,** particularly when developing a work plan. Cost sharing measures to continue a focus on domestic workers must be carefully thought about at any linked programme design state, as they are harder to implement mid-way through a project. More linkages to other UN agencies working in related areas could be made overall.
5. **Consider the inclusion of domestic workers in a thematic evaluation around broader topics such as formalising the informal sector in a particular country.** Most ILO constituents do not view ILO initiatives under a particular donor funding framework. They find it difficult to distinguish between whether an initiative came through an earlier project or the current one being evaluated. These may provide a clearer picture on how ILO support iteratively builds technical expertise and facilitates change.
6. **ILO should reconsider how it commissions research and studies,** and how they can do it better with linkages to research institutes and online research databases (e.g. Google Scholar). Research institutes may be able to provide guidance. Linking with Masters and PhD students who wish to focus on a relevant labour related area, but are supervised by a graduate research committee may be relevant in some cases. Alternatively ILO could set up a 'research' support office that oversees sample sizes, qualitative methodologies and reviews the research concept note before research commences. Some type of research support and quality review framework for research is required.

## 7. Lessons learned<sup>48</sup>

---

### **A strategy on domestic workers cannot be steered unless ownership is given to others**

ILO in Geneva reported that the expertise of many levels of ILO is required to implement the DWDW strategy. Rather than try to work alone on domestic workers, the Sida CTA and team carefully brought others working on related issues to the table, to discuss solutions to the particular issues faced by these informal workers. For example those working on minimum wages, occupational safety and health, and those who are providing technical advice on labour inspection. A strategy on domestic workers can only be steered with those in these specialised areas taking ownership of domestic workers as an important category of workers, with someone overall steering the process. To address domestic workers in overall ILO work, a form of mainstreaming is required, with facilitators and promoters of this category of workers in other sections of ILO. New knowledge brought in from the situation in-countries who are implementing measures to address domestic workers is very beneficial. The enthusiasm for a focus on domestic workers may not last infinitely, thus speedily obtaining examples of ways to approach this difficult category of informal and isolated workers is necessary.

**Many interviewed reiterated the importance of tripartite structures to oversee activities and interventions on domestic workers.** This process was very much appreciated and helps to ensure ownership amongst all constituents. Although workers unions do not always represent domestic workers as a category of workers, ways of working with organisations that actually provide voice to domestic workers is essential.

**A key success factor in many countries stems from a political dimension.** Political leadership for a focus on domestic workers is necessary. This was essential to move drafts through the political institutions in the Philippines<sup>49</sup> and Paraguay. Political support appears to be lacking in India and Zambia. Political support along with ILO staff who are knowledgeable, astute and fast in providing inputs, facilitating a tripartite process, keeping partners on board (including NGOs advocates) and a public momentum to move the agenda forward.

**In-depth and detailed knowledge of the policy process is essential for national work around domestic workers (and workers rights generally).** This includes a knowledge of proper procedures, how to submit realistic and contextual advocacy and evidence based materials to Parliament, timing issues, knowledge of parliamentary committees and subgroups and an assessment of who would be sympatric to the plight of domestic workers. Workshops that share information on the policy process proved useful in Zambia for unions that represented domestic workers.

**Having ILO staff at hand at all times to provide quick answers to many legal labour questions is essential whilst national legislation is being formulated,** particularly when a category of workers (domestic workers) is a new area of focus. For example ILO staff at hand to interpret certain provisions in Convention 189 (knowledge on what the Convention states about stand-by law, or child domestic workers, whether drivers are included etc.).

For implementation of measures to improve the working conditions for domestic workers, **precise attention to detail in the provisions of a new law is important.** For example the issue of retro-payments for the registration of domestic workers was largely ignored when the Domestic Workers Act was being passed in the Philippines. This later proved to be a disincentive for employers to register their domestic workers. Another example was initially ignoring the actual mechanics of

---

<sup>48</sup> See also Annex 12

<sup>49</sup> In the Philippines, the DOLE secretary herself was very supportive of establishing labor rights for domestic workers. Congressman Ong and Senator Estrada from the senate and congress played critical roles in supporting legislative reform. DOLE also reported that internal close coordination of different DOLE departments was significant as well as coordination with other government agencies outside DOLE.



registering domestic workers in the required three separate social security offices (time consuming and thus a disincentive). A 'unified registration' system is now in place (one payment system is not yet in place). Thus a key lesson learned is that whilst the policy formulation process attempts to address and cover most aspects of the Convention, it is very difficult to get it right without the benefit of implementation experiences and hindsight.

**Stress the need for cross-governmental collaboration. Beyond the ministry of labour, working with other ministries is important for ILO.** For example in the Philippines it is proving important to also work with the Department of Interior and Local Government the Department of Social Welfare and Development (DSWD), Philippine National Police (PNP), Social Security System (SSS), Philippine Health Insurance Corporation (PhilHealth) and Home Development Mutual Fund (HDMF) which are all government institutions. In Zambia at the very least engaging with the Ministry of Justice is necessary. Tripartite legal reform discussions may go ahead leaving a particular ministry out of policy dialogue process. Enacting reforms may be delayed because a particular rule or procedure may have been overlooked. Implementation requires planning processes across government ministries to ensure that all are on board from the start. For example an implementation strategy could contain set tasks for different ministries (such as Justice, education, finance, labour, agriculture etc.). A table should be set up with a broad range of relevant government ministries (and their 'stake' in a focus on domestic workers) to serve as a monitoring mechanism. For example training of judges and lawyers may also be important for the implementation of laws; Central Statistics Offices or the Ministry of Labour Survey must be encouraged to include adequate questions on domestic work in any forthcoming labour surveys. Thus when developing national plans of action, **include a focus also on ministerial departments beyond the ministry of labour.**<sup>50</sup>

**The short time frame of outcome based funding support make initiatives difficult** to evaluate without knowledge of previous programmes and evaluations. The effect of new ideas, concepts or ideology around the rights of domestic workers cannot be determined during a two-year period. Shifting attitudes on Domestic Workers amongst the public takes time. India society has particular perceptions about domestic work that are difficult to alter, particularly because women from marginalised communities are those that perform domestic work. Much work remains to establish domestic workers as workers in their own right. Cultural dimensions around domestic workers are deeply biased and hard to change. Even with regulation, implementation will be difficult unless there are good practices from different states that demonstrate operational experience. It is interesting to compare cultural attitudes to domestic workers with attitudes towards child labourers 10 to 15 years ago. It can be argued that in 10 years ILO achieved a lot with regard to attitudes towards child labour in India (although of course much remains to be done on child labour).

**Annex 12** contains a synthesis of three lessons learned using the ILO Evaluation format template.

---

<sup>50</sup> In Tanzania the Ministry of Internal Affairs and the Ministry of Constitution were reported to be significant for moving issues up the policy agenda.

## 8. Annexes

---

### *Annex 1: Documents consulted for evaluation*

#### General documents consulted

- Convention No. 189 and Recommendation No. 201 on Decent Work for Domestic Workers
- C189 & R201 at a glance : an explanatory brochure C189: questions & answers
- Domestic Workers across the World: Global and regional statistics and the extent of legal protection
- Effective Protection for Domestic Workers: a Guide to Designing Labour Laws
- Remuneration in domestic work (Policy Brief No. 1)
- Working hours in domestic work (Policy Brief No. 2)
- Measuring the economic and social value of domestic work (Policy Brief No. 3)
- Global and regional estimates on domestic workers (Policy Brief No. 4)
- Coverage of domestic workers by key working conditions laws (Policy Brief No. 5)
- “Meeting the needs of my family too”, Maternity protection and work-family measures for domestic workers (Policy Brief No. 6)
- Working time of live-in domestic workers (Policy Brief No. 7)
- Decent work for domestic workers in Asia and the Pacific: manual for trainers (ILO & IDWN) 2012 (Elsa Ramos-Carbone).
- ILC (June 2011) 100<sup>th</sup> Session, Fourth item on the agenda: Decent work for domestic workers. Report of the Committee on Domestic Workers. Geneva, June 2011
- ILC (June 2011) 100<sup>th</sup> Session, Provisional Record. Twenty-first sitting. Thursday, 16 June 2011, 10.05am Final Record vote on the Convention concerning Decent Work for Domestic Workers.
- Child domestic work: Global estimates 2012. ILO IPEC
- Researching Domestic Work - ILO Survey on Domestic Workers: Preliminary guidelines, by Farhad Mehran
- Researching Domestic Work - The employment relationship and working conditions: Preliminary Guidelines for a Qualitative Research, by Amelita King Dejardin
- Luebker, Malte (2014) *Domestic Work: Women’s Work, Decent Work?* Policy in Focus. A Publication of the International Policy Centre for Inclusive Growth. UNDP. March 2014. No 27. ILO Regional Office for Asia and the Pacific. <http://www.ipc-undp.org/pub/IPCPovertyInFocus27.pdf>
- Labour Inspection and compliance mechanisms in the Domestic Work Sector
- Recording Working Time of Live-In Domestic Workers: a Manual for Trainers by Claire Hobden

#### India

- Final Report of the Task Force on Domestic Workers. Realising Decent Work. Director General Labour Welfare. Ministry of Labour and Employment, government of India. September 12, 2011.
- Domestic work information kit : fixing minimum wages (by Asha D’Souza)
- Working Paper on Minimum Wage Setting Practices in Domestic Work in India: An Inter-State Analysis (by Neetha N.)
- Organizing and Unionising Domestic Workers in Tamil Nadu: A Case Study Bharti Birla National Project Coordinator Gender Equality in the World of Work (BASIC II)
- Report from National Workshop of TU Womens’ Committee on Decent Work for Domestic Workers, 29-30 March, 2012, New Delhi
- K.S. Ravichandran Mission Report July 21-24 2013 Training Workshop on Organizing Domestic Workers
- Note on Trade Union Workshop On Organising Domestic Workers: Experiences and Initiatives 15-17 April 2013, Bangalore
- Progress Review, 29 July 2013 CPO IND 127 2012-13 Updated Workplan for August-30 November 2013
- IND 127 Implementation Framework

- Sweden Partnership Agreement Support for Outcome 5 *Making decent work a reality for domestic workers* INDIA - IND127
- Mission report (no date but filed 4<sup>th</sup> Sept 2012) Suneetha Eluri and Amy King's Mission Title: The Fact Finding Mission to Delhi, Bangalore and Chennai
- 3 page brief Kerala Domestic Workers Welfare Fund Scheme; 6 pages brief on Tamil Nadu Domestic Workers Welfare Board
- Extension and implementation of RSBY to Domestic workers in Chhattisgarh Submitted by - Santosh Pandhari Suradkar 7 August 2013
- Report on the Extension and Implementation of Rashtriya Swastha Bima Yojana (RSBY) for Domestic Workers in Kerala Dr. Neha Wadhawan Independent Consultant ILO, Delhi (26 June 2013 or August 2013)
- 5 February 2014 Outline for workshop to develop Follow up plan
- Sexual Harassment Law April 23 2013 The Gazette of India. Ministry of Law and Justice
- Indispensable yet unprotected: Migrant domestic workers from India at risk SEWA – India
- Special Action Programme to combat forced labour ILO Geneva 2012
- NO DATE: Organizing Domestic Workers: Issues and Challenges
- Report from the first meeting of the Task Force on Gender Equality in the World of Work. 27 October 2010 India.
- Minimum Wage Setting Practices in Domestic Work: An Inter-State Analysis Neetha N. Centre for Women's Development Studies, New Delhi, India. May 2013 Report Submitted to ILO, New Delhi
- Draft work plan for trade union module on Domestic workers
- Launch of Case Study on Organizing Domestic Workers in Karnataka *Bangalore, 15 April 2013* Mr. Ariel Castro, Senior Specialist on Workers activities, ILO DWT/CO New Delhi
- Organizing and Unionising Domestic Workers in Tamil Nadu: A Case Study Bharti Birla National Project Coordinator Gender Equality in the World of Work (BASIC II) 5 pages
- Programme for National Knowledge Sharing Workshop on Improving Protection for Domestic Workers: Minimum Wage Setting and Extending RSBY Coverage 25-26, July 2013, Hyderabad List of Participants (ILO, Govt from different States, & TUs, Domestic workers forum GIZ, Consultants )
- Programme for National Knowledge-Sharing Workshop *Improving Protection for Domestic Workers: Minimum Wage Setting and Extending RSBY Coverage* Date: 25 – 26 or 29-30 July 2013 Hyderabad Review of above Hyderabad July 2013 meeting
- WORKSHOP REPORT National Knowledge Sharing Workshop Improving Protection of Domestic Workers: Minimum Wage Protection and RSBY Extension Hyderabad, India 25-26 July 2013 (32 page report)
- Campaign materials for National Platform for Domestic Workers

## Paraguay

- YouTube Entrevista Myriam Agüero, Secretaria General del Sindicato de Trabajadoras Domésticas del Paraguay durante el VI Encuentro Nacional de Trabajadoras Domésticas del Paraguay realizado en Asunción, con el apoyo de las Naciones Unidas a través del Programa Oportunidades. 22 de septiembre 2012. <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=XNaYU1IVufg>
- More domestic workers in Paraguay with social security is showing the first signs of success. [http://www.ilo.org/global/about-the-ilo/newsroom/features/WCMS\\_242164/lang--en/index.htm](http://www.ilo.org/global/about-the-ilo/newsroom/features/WCMS_242164/lang--en/index.htm) ILO Feature 6.5.2014
- Concept Note: Programa de Acción Mundial sobre los Trabajadores y las Trabajadoras Domésticas Migrantes y sus Familias Corredor migratorio Paraguay-Argentina. Un proyecto financiado por la Comisión European
- Situación socio-demográfica y laboral del trabajo doméstico en Paraguay, by María Victoria Heikel
- Manual de intervención para el trabajo doméstico para trabajadoras domésticas y empleadores, by Red De Centros De Atencion a Trabajadoras Domésticas
- A life without violence is a life with rights (Una Vida sin violencia es una vida con derechos). Manifest of female domestic workers in Paraguay for the international day against violence against women 25.11.2012
- Entrevistas Campaña OIT-IPS. Entrevista Ana Maria Ortiz APEP; Hugo Roys (representante gobierno) , Librada Maciel (Sindicato de Trabajadoras Domesticas de Itapua, Gerhard Reinecke OIT.

## Tanzania

- Draft report of a comparative study on convention no. 189 and national law and practice in the United Republic of Tanzania, by Dr. Tulia Ackson
- Domestic Workers in the United Republic of Tanzania: Summary of Findings of a Situational Analysis 2013, ILO.
- ILO Press release 27 February 2014. Tanzania launches Action Plan to promote decent work for domestic workers.
- CPO Flash Reports from TZA 104 (Kokushubila Kabanza and Annamarie Kashiya Kiaga)
- ToR for Rapid Survey of the Magnitude and Profile of the Domestic Work Sector
- Mission Reports 8<sup>th</sup> -11<sup>th</sup> April 2014 on Tripartite Workshop Zanzibar; 20-24 October 2013 Iringa and Dodoma CHODAWU Media campaign; 29-31 October 2013 Arusha CHODAWU Media campaign.
- Summary ILO note (with recommendations) on MOLE stakeholders meeting to discuss and consider ratification of Convention 189 Held on 3<sup>rd</sup> and 4<sup>th</sup> April, 2014 at Regency Park hotel
- Narrative Report on Domestic Workers Media Campaign Workshop 16-17 July 2013. CHODAWU. Reported prepared by Dept of Gender, Children and Youth Development. CHODAWU HQ.
- GAD Consult Inception Report: Facilitation of Media Campaign on Making Decent Work a Reality for Domestic Workers in Tanzania
- TZA104 Implementation Strategy
- Feb 14 2014 (draft) 8 page ILO document on Domestic Workers in Tanzania
- 2013 English Booklet on C 189 DW 24 pages
- Working Conditions of Domestic Workers in Tanzania Draft Final Report By Dr. Opportuna Kweka Senior Lecturer University of Dar es Salaam ILO Dar es Salaam Office September, 2013
- Press release: Tripartite Action Plan: Launch of the Tripartite Plan of Action to promote decent work for domestic workers (28.2.2014)
- Zanzibar Programme from the promotion of C189 for Labour Advisory Board Members and Secretariat 19<sup>TH</sup> April, 2012 Zanzibar Beach Resort.

## Zambia

- Country profile: domestic work legislation in Zambia
- Emerging good practices on Action to combat child domestic labour (Kenya, Tanzania, Uganda and Zambia. ILO 2006
- Code of Ethics Leaz
- Code of Conduct for Employers of Domestic Workers in Zambia ZFE
- Forced labour and human trafficking: A toolkit for trade unions in Zambia. Special Action Programme to combat Forced Labour, ILO 2008.
- The Zambian Employer July – Dept 2013 ZFE Issue 7 2013 pages 8-14 Minimum Wage.
- The LEGAL RESOURCES FOUNDATION OF ZAMBIA (LRF) News No. 130 January – March 2013. Pages 6-7 pm minimum wages
- Statement by UHWDWUZ Affiliate of ZCTU on Domestic Workers. April 2014
- Zambia Labour Law Reform Issues Paper, May 2013, by Prof. Evance Kalula, Pamhidzai, H. Bamu; Juliana Masabo; Rutendo Mudarikwa; Suzanna Harvey
- Draft Report: Patterns of Employment Arrangements and Working Conditions for Domestic Work in Zambia (IPSOS Public Affairs)
- ILO Pre-test Report: Patterns of Employment Arrangements and Working Conditions for Domestic Work in Zambia (IPSOS Public Affairs)
- Nov 2013 Concept Note National Workshop on Employment and Working Conditions in the Zambian Domestic Work Sector

- ILO Radisson Blue Speech by NES

## Philippines

- ILO-Luxembourg General Framework Agreement Thematic Contribution 2010-12 Advancing Decent Work for Domestic Workers. Final Review and Evaluation Report.
- DOLE Status of Implementation of Batas Kasambahay (RA 10361) as of April 20<sup>th</sup> 2014. Report given to consultant April 25<sup>th</sup> 2014
- DOLE Unified Registration flyers.
- Study on Enforcement of Laws and Regulations Concerning Domestic Workers: Philippines. Jerome Alcantara, ILO External Collaborator 2013.
- Consultation and Consolidation Process for an Employers' Position to the IRR of the Philippine Domestic Workers Act April 2013.
- Analyzing the Philippines' Readiness to ILO Convention 190 on Domestic Workers: A Law and Practice Report. A concept Paper. DOLE (prior to Sida project).
- PHL 132 National legal framework on domestic workers adopted and capacities for implementation developed. Implementation Strategy. August 2012
- Report on Analysis per Theme for Entire Sample Qualitative Research on Employment Arrangements, Practices and Working Conditions in Domestic Work in the Philippines. Draft Final Report 15 April 2014. University of the Philippines under Team Leader Clarita Carlos.
- Narrative Report on Patterns and Policy Recommendations. Qualitative Research on Employment Arrangements, Practices and Working Conditions in Domestic Work in the Philippines. Draft Final Report 15 April 2014. University of the Philippines under Team Leader Clarita Carlos.
- Decent Work for Domestic Workers, ILO the Philippines, November 2012
- Domestic work is no longer a 'domestic issue' and Landmark treaty for domestic workers to come into force Feature on ILO website 5.9.2012
- Philippine Campaign on Decent Work for Domestic Workers materials. Produced by APL, ECOP, FFEW, ISP, MFA, NAPC-WIS, NCRFW, SUMAPI, TUCP, VFFI with support from ILO.
- The ILO GAD Checklists: Philippine Harmonized Gender and Development Guidelines for Project Development, Implementation, Monitoring and Evaluation. ILO Manila
- Gender Equality in the Labor Market in the Philippines. ILO and ADB 2013
- Good Global Economic and Social Practices to Promote Gender Equality in the Labor Market. ILO and ADB (2013)
- Republic Act 10361 Domestic Workers Act or Batas Kasambahay. An act instituting policies for the protection and welfare of domestic workers.
- DOLE (2014) edition. Handbook Workers' Statutory Monetary Benefits. Republic of the Philippines Department of Labor and Employment Bureau of Working Conditions.
- 3 page Partnership document for Outcome 5 with Philippines
- ToR for *Provision of technical support towards enhancement of implementing mechanisms for*
- *Republic Act (RA) 10361 otherwise known as the Philippine Domestic Workers' Act or the "Batas Kasambahay*
- *CPO Flash Report*
- Study on Enforcement of Laws and Regulations Concerning Domestic Workers: Philippines Prepared by Jerome A. Alcantara, ILO External Collaborator No date on file, but saved 23 October 2013 11 pages
- Concept note for: "*Building and Advancing Strategic Alliances for the Promotion of Decent Work for Domestic Workers*" Regional Conference on ILO Convention 189 Ratification Campaign 14-15 April 2012, Miriam College Manila, Philippines
- 28 Aug 2012 Meeting on Domestic Work Aug. 28, 2012 at Mitra Bldg., Congress Cong. Raymond Mendoza – TUCP Party List Ms. Amy King – ILO Geneva Ms. Ana Liza Valencia – ILO Manila Office Mon Certeza – TUCP.
- NEWS RELEASE ON ILO CONVENTION 189 AND KASAMBAHAY BILL (ONLINE SOURCE: DECEMBER 16 – 28, 2011)

- Report on Minimum Wage Determination for Domestic Workers
- CONCEPT PAPER for strengthening Trade Unions to organuse Domestic Workers
- Proposed Program and Session Guide for the Trade Union Planning Session on Organizing Domestic Workers
- National Trainers' Training on Decent Work for Domestic Workers 18-20 June 2013 Hotel Stotsenberg, Clark, Pampanga
- BATAS KASAMBAHAY ISLAND-WIDE MULTI-TAKEHOLDER CONSULTATIONS Organized by the Department of Labor and Employment With support from the ILO NARRATIVE REPORT. March 2013
- Consultation and Consolidation Process for an Employers' Position to the Implementing Rules and Regulations of the Philippine Domestic Workers Act 27 June 2013
- IMPLEMENTING RULES AND REGULATIONS OF REPUBLIC ACT NO. 10361, OTHERWISE KNOWN AS THE "DOMESTIC WORKERS ACT" OR "BATAS KASAMBAHAY
- National Workers and Civil Society Consultation on the Implementing Rules and Regulations of RA 10361 or the Kasambahay Law. Eurotel Hotel, Pedro Gil St., Ermita, Manila 15 April 2013
- Technical Working Group on Philippine Campaign on Decent Work for Domestic Workers [Plan of Action \(January – December 2013\)](#)
- TWG Draft Communication Plan for the Philippine Campaign on Decent Work for Domestic Workers File dated 18 March 2013 Provision of technical support in the conduct of the planning, learning sessions and validation meeting for the Domestic Work Technical Working Group (Domestic Work TWG) File dated January 2014

## **Annex 2: Interview questions**

### **Questions with regard to overall contribution to Outcome 5**

**Relevance:** were GLO/11/54/SID initiatives aligned to the ILO Programme and Budget for 2012-2013, and the relevant CPOs?

- Key question - Were the interventions under GLO/11/54/SID relevant to ILO Convention 189 and Recommendation 201?
- Desk review of outcome 5 in P&B for 2012-13; review 5 CPOs to determine what the domestic work focus was
- Include question in interviews to ILO staff - any issues around the alignment of the interventions with the ILO P&B, and the CPOs?

**Coherence:** Did the interventions under GLO/11/54/SID complement (in design and implementation) the ILO Programme and Budget for 2012-2013, and the relevant CPOs?

- How coherent were GLO/11/54/SID activities towards supporting countries to move forward with ILO Convention 189 and R. 201?
- What synergies existed with other ILO interventions, including projects funded by other donors (e.g. UN Women in Tanzania, BASIC in India)
- Questions to ILO staff in country offices around how the work on Domestic Workers fitted with other ongoing interventions implemented in-country?
- Ask about links constituents and others actors (NGOs in this area? UN agencies working on domestic work or related areas?)
- For global products – questions about coherence and strategic fit with ongoing ILO activities under the ILO Office wide strategy for action to make decent work a reality for domestic workers, and ILO C189.

**Effectiveness:** How effective have the project outputs been in supporting the achievement of the CPOs and the Strategic Outcome?

- What is the view of those representing domestic workers on the effectiveness of the GLO/11/54/SID?
- What is the view of the Ministry of Labour? and views from Employers and Workers organisations?
- How did the policy related work highlight gender equality issues to a particular group for them to notice the plight of domestic workers in their country?

**Impact:** Was the overall impact orientation of activities and measurable results to date towards achievements of CPOs and P&B outcome 5?

- Questions at the country level about impact to date. What was the biggest achievement of the activities organised under GLO/11/54/SID?
- Who are the real beneficiaries and how have they been affected and benefited from the ILO programmes? Both directly and indirectly.
- How would ILO staff and also tripartite partners and other stakeholders (in particular those representing domestic workers associations) assess the impact to date?
- Did the GLO/11/54/SID use baselines at the country level?
- Was all data disaggregated by sex?
- Is the impact of GLO/11/54/SID evident in the P&B 2012-2013 implementation report?
- What was the baseline for the global products? What sort of knowledge dissemination strategy is in place? What has been the feedback to date on the Global Product?

Specific questions with respect to linkages between CPO and Outcome 5 (Indicators 5.1 and 5.2)

- How were Domestic Workers represented amongst tripartite constituents?
- Did those representing domestic workers get involved in discussions?
- What is the current situation with regard to the national plan of action?
- How likely is it that a national tripartite action plan will be put in place?
  
- Was new/ modified legislation etc. adopted in each of the four countries?
- What status does the new/modified legislation hold?
- If not yet adopted, how likely is it that new/modified legislation etc. will be adopted?
- Are those who represent domestic workers satisfied with the changes? why ? or why not?
  
- Did the information and awareness raising campaign take place in Tanzania? In Zambia? (and also in India)
- What were the immediate and medium term impacts?
- What was the reaction?
- How was the information dissemination/ awareness raising campaign monitored?
- How was ILO's contribution viewed in the countries of focus?

- Did at least one tripartite constituent implement a training strategy for improving working conditions/ promoting decent work for DWs?
- What were the discussions or what was the rationale behind Zambia rather than the Philippines to design this training strategy?
- What are the views of national stakeholders/ constituents on this strategy?
- Do these strategies include clear objectives and indicators to measure their effectiveness?
- How do tripartite constituents view ILO's support with regard to the training strategy?

**Sustainability:** Is there a strategy in place to continue to promote knowledge dissemination and continue to make decent work a reality for domestic workers?

- Did the project have a sustainability focus? In what way?
- What sort of strategy is in place for ensuring the policy process work continues in the 5 countries?
- What follow-up activities have been initiated (regardless of funding)
- How likely is it that tripartite constituents will continue to implement actions to make decent work a reality for domestic workers? In what areas (by country?)
- How likely is it that the global products will continue to be used by ILO Constituents?

**Efficiency – Budget and risk related questions**

- What efficiencies were put in place? E.g. how did ILO share NPCs at the country level?
- What synergies were built upon?
- Given the range of countries, and the global product outputs, what was the added value of Sida resources to the achievement Outcome 5?
- Are Global products catalogued and made available for dissemination?
- How were the funds divided between Global Product and CPOs?
- What is SIDA's criteria for use of funds? (e.g. 75%:25%)
- What accountability mechanisms did ILO set in place for use of Sida funds?
- Questions to ILO staff: How the project has leveraged other funds at the country level.
- What were the risks associated with the project work? Working with employer organisations? What strategies are in place to manage risk?



**Types of questions sent in questionnaire to stakeholders not interviewed.**

**Questions for Government (to be sent by email with telephone/Skype call follow up)**

- How do they think the ILO project on domestic workers have been supportive in moving the agenda forward with regard to Domestic Workers
- What were the greatest achievements? Or the biggest impact to date?
- Do they think the government will continue to work towards decent work for Domestic Workers? In what direction or what ways?
- What challenges are there to move forward with an Action Plan for Domestic workers, and how can ILO help in this regard?

**Questions for workers organisations (to be sent by email with telephone/Skype call follow up)**

- How did ILO help to build knowledge on the domestic work sector in the country?
- According to representatives of domestic workers, what has been the best achievement with regard to domestic work?
- What was the most useful form of support provided by ILO for a focus on domestic work?
- Anything that could have been improved?
- How can ILO help to move domestic work further up the agenda?
- What are the key challenges?
- How is the trade union getting on with the particular activities they are running?

**Questions for employers organisations (to be sent by email with telephone/Skype call follow up)**

- What does the Employers Association think initiatives to date? (specify initiatives)
- What do they think the challenges will be to implement these initiatives? (specify initiatives)
- What is their view of the support ILO has been providing on Domestic Work?

**Questions with regard to the Global Products**

- Is the policy resource package finalised?
- What is the general feed back on the policy resource package?
- Which policy areas are most in demand with requests for information and technical support?
- Why is one policy option more feasible than another in a particular context?
- What experiences have been documented? Which countries?
- What was the approach put in place?
- What was the impact of the 6-7 regional knowledge sharing forums that took place in 2012-13? Any outcomes that were fed-back to ILO?
- Is there an outcome document with concrete recommendations and lessons learned to date?
- What follow up is planned as a result of use of these global product or demand for other products?
- What efforts have been put in place to ensure the wide dissemination in particular to DW associations?
  
- Has the guide been published?
- Peer reviewed outside ILO?
- What alternative methodologies were recommended?
- How is the methodology for qualitative research on DWs been disseminated?
- Where has this guide been disseminated so far?
- Any feedback?
- Plans for following up on how the guide is being used?

### Annex 3: List of evaluation respondents

#### List of persons contacted for this evaluation, including those who answered questionnaire

	Type of stakeholder & title	Name
<b>ILO Geneva</b>		
1.	ILO Evaluation Manager WORKQUALITY	Rasha Tabbara
2.	ILO INWORK	Amelita King-Dejardin
3.	ILO INWORK	Claire Hobden
4.	ILO EVAL	Francisco Guzman
5.	PARDEV	Pawel Gmyrek
6.	ILO MIGRANT	Maria Gallotti
7.	ILO IPEC (Child labour, domestic work)	Jose Maria Ramirez Machado
8.	ILO FPRW	Lisa Wong
9.	ILO, GED	Edward Lawton,
10.	ILO LABADMIN/OSH	Joaquim Pintado Nunes
11.	ILO INWORK	Philippe Marcadent
12.	ILO INWORK	Patrick Belser
<b>Zambia</b>		
13.	ILO NPC Domestic Workers Project Zambia	Evans Iwanga
14.	ILO Office Zambia	Jeanette Hedstrom
15.	ILO Social Protection Project	Nuno Cunha
16.	ILO PROGRAM	Anjali Patel
17.	ILO consultant	Chana Chelemu Jere
18.	Ministry of Labour and Social Affairs, Assistant Labour Commissioner	Mr. Chanda Kaziya
19.	Labour Consultants and Employment Agencies Association of Zambia (LEAAZ)	Humphrey Monde, President
20.	Labour Consultants and Employment Agencies Association of Zambia (LEAAZ)	Tembo Agrippa, Secretary General
21.	Labour Consultants and Employment Agencies Association of Zambia (LEAAZ)	Charles Muliya National Committee
22.	Zambia Federation for Employers (ZFE)	Harrington Chibanda Executive Director
23.	Zambia Federation for Employers (ZFE)	Hilary Chilala Hazele Manager, Economic & Policy Analysis
24.	Former ZFE employee now Ministry of Finance	Daniel Mwewa <a href="mailto:danielmwewa@yahoo.com">danielmwewa@yahoo.com</a>
25.	Domestic Worker	Mwinga Mazuba (30 years old male)
26.	Domestic Worker	Dorcus Ngandwe (26 year old female)
27.	Domestic Worker	Brenda Moonde (35 year old female)
28.	Domestic Worker	Barbra Imwiko (30 year old Female)
29.	Domestic Worker	Doris Mfuza (33 year old female)
30.	Domestic Worker	Mary Mwakayaya (44 year old female)
31.	Domestic Worker	Geoge Mumba (30 year old male)
32.	Domestic Worker	Medrick Kabaunda (45 year old male)
33.	Former Domestic Worker now Domestic Workers Union UHDWUZ	Ocsar Cheupe
34.	Former Domestic Worker now Domestic Workers Union UHDWUZ	Martha Kasalo
35.	Domestic workers union UHDWUZ affiliated with FFTUZ	Kevin Liywalli – President
36.	Federation of Free Trade Unions of Zambia FFTUZ	Joyce Nonde, President
37.	Domestic workers union affiliated with ZCTU	Joyce Phiri – President
38.	Domestic workers union affiliated with ZCTU	Kabima Kalarba Trustee
39.	Federation of Free Trade Unions of Zambia FFTUZ	Lyson Mando National Executive Secretary
40.	Zambia Union of Financial Institutions and Allied Workers ZUFIAW (member of FFTUZ)	Mutelo Mabenga, Assistant General Secretary
41.	Ipsos	Alice Nanga-Mola Country Manager Ipsos Zambia
42.	Ipsos	Allan Chila - Field Manager
43.	Ipsos	Nathan Kaund - DP Manager
44.	Ipsos	Bonaventure Phiri - Quality Control Coordinator
45.	Ipsos	Cynthia Chiselelwe - Research executive
46.	Ipsos	Elizabeth Tarney – Public Affairs Manager / PM
47.	Maid Centre -Teteinsuka Empowerment	Harriet Bwale (Mukololo-Harriet)
48.	ILO Consultant gender mainstreaming evaluation	Jane Hailé

	Type of stakeholder & title	Name
49.	ILO Consultant, thematic evaluation- Fundamental Principles and Rights at Work	David Tajgman
<b>Paraguay</b>		
50.	Former Gender Specialist ILO Chile ILO MIGRANT	Maria Elena Valenzuela
51.	ILO Chile, long term gender consultant	Cecilia Sjoberg
52.	Focal point of ILO in Paraguay (national officer) <i>Oportunidades MDG</i>	Ernesto Abdala
53.	ILO Employment Policy Chile	Gerhard Reinecke
54.	ILO key consultant for Sida project	Maria Victoria Heikel,
55.	Former Director (until Dec 2013) of gender división (Dirección de la promoción social de la Mujer Trabajadora)	Maria Elena Sartorio
56.	In charge of International Relations at Labor Ministry MTESS	Veronica Lopez
57.	Ministry of Women	Carlos Carmona, Technical officer
58.	Instituto de Previsión Social (IPS) Director	Hugo Royg indirectly responded via ILO
59.	DW organization: Presidenta, "Sindicato de Trabajadoras Domésticas del Paraguay (CNT)"	Miriam Aguero,
60.	APEP Employers organisation, President	Ana Maria Ortiz Villalba
61.	FEPRINCO Employers, Titular del Consejo Directivo por el sector comercio	Norma Villasanti de Almeida,
62.	Liga de Amas de Casa de Paraguay	Leni Pane
63.	Gender Equity Commission Senate Asunción Adviser on Gender	Sonia Brucke
64.	CIDSEP, Universidad Católica, Equipo Jurídico, Investigación & Proyectos	Mónica Cáceres
65.	Trade Union CUT A Secretaria de Género	Martha Dora Peralta
66.	Trade Union CUT A Secretaria de Educación	Graciela Congo
67.	Presidenta "Sindicato de Trabajadoras Domésticas y Afines del Departamento de Itapúa, (CUT A)"	Librada Maciel
<b>Philippines</b>		
68.	ILO Manila, Senior Programme Officer	Cocoy Sardaña
69.	ILO NPC- Domestic Work	Ana Liza Valencia,
70.	ILO Manila Director	Lawrence Jeff Johnson
71.	ILO Deputy Director (& evaluation specialist)	Carla Henry
72.	ILO IPEC Manila Office	Giovanni Soledad
73.	Domestic worker	Donnalyn Negre Kasambahay
74.	Domestic worker	Himaya Montenegro former DW (currently APL)
75.	Domestic worker	Madelyn S. Tornos Kasambahay
76.	Domestic worker	Novelita V. Palisoc Kasambahay
77.	LEARN /APL Organiser	Teresa B Dela Cruz
78.	ECOP (Employers Organisation) Director General	Vincente Leogardo
79.	ECOP Manager Research and Advocacy	Romeo Garcia
80.	ECOP Manager, Corporate Social Responsibility	Dang Buenaventura Snyder
81.	ECIP Research Specialist	Abigail Rozas
82.	ILO Consultant on Domestic Workers and former <i>Visayan Forum Foundation</i> employee	Jerome A. Alcantara
83.	Federation of Free Workers (FFW), President	Jose Sonny G. Matula
84.	FFW Assistant Vice President	Julius Cainglet
85.	Trade Union Congress of Philippines (TUCP) Assistant General Secretary	Ramon A. Certeza
86.	TUCP National Executive Vice President, Associated Labour Unions (ALU)	Gerard S. Seno
87.	TUCP	Jing Calubaquib
88.	Alliance of Progressive Labour (APL, now Sentro)	Josua Mata
89.	University of the Philippines	Clarita R Carol Project leader
90.	University of the Philippines	Michael Eric L Castillo Senior Researcher
91.	University of the Philippines	Farrah Christine Sierva Research Associate

	Type of stakeholder & title	Name
92.	University of the Philippines	Kim Fernando A. Uy Research Associate
93.	University of the Philippines	Michael V Manangu Research associate
94.	University of the Philippines	Joey Reyes Loristo Research Associate
95.	University of the Philippines	Dennis M Lalata Senior Researcher
96.	University of the Philippines	Clieve Arguelles Research Associate.
97.	Department of Labor and Employment (DOLE) Responsible for minimum wage criteria for domestic workers National Wages & Productivity Commission	Patricia P. Hornilla
98.	DOLE Executive Director of National Wages & Productivity Commission	Maria R. Criselda Sy
99.	DOLE Chief Women Workers Development Division, Bureau of Workers with Special Concerns (BWSC)	Maria Evelyn Lita P. Manangan
100.	DOLE Senior Labor and Employment Officer, Women Workers Development Division, Bureau of Workers with Special Concerns (BWSC)	Mr Robert C. Cudal
101.	DOLE Chief Labor and Employment Officer, Bureau of Working Conditions (BWC)	Mr. Nicanor V. Bon
	<b>India</b>	
102.	ILO Deputy Director, New Delhi	Boonpala Panudda
103.	ILO Senior Gender Specialist	Reiko Tsushima
104.	ILO Domestic Workers NPC	Suneetha Eluri
105.	ILO National Professional Officer (PROG)	K. S. Ravichandran
106.	AITUC Secretary All India Trade Union Congress Tamil Nadu (includes domestic workers)	Vahidha Nizam
107.	Domestic Workers Rights Union Bangalore	Geeta Menon
108.	National Core Team National Domestic Worker Movement, Kokar Ranchi Jharkhand	Chetan Chandran
109.	Labour Commissioner. Government of West Bengal Office	Jawaid Akhtar
	<b>Tanzania</b>	
110.	ILO Liason Officer Zanzibar	Fatma Rashid
111.	ILO UNDP coordinator	Annamarie Kiaga
112.	National Officer ILO	Kokushubila Kabanza
113.	CHODAWU- The <i>Tanzanian</i> Conservation, Hotels, Domestic and Allied Workers' Union	Deograsia Vuluwa
114.	Labour Officer Ministry of Labour	Valieth Ndenza
115.	Assistant Labour Commissioner, Ministry of Labour	Hawa Wenga (brief telephone chat)
116.	Project Director of Wekeza project	Yvonne Prempeh-Ferguson
117.	University of Dar-es-Salaam, lecturer and researcher	Godius Kahyarara
118.	ATE (employers association) Advocate/ legal officer	Suzanne Ndomba

## Annex 4: Terms of Reference for Evaluation

### GLO/11/54/SID: Making decent work a reality for domestic workers Final Independent Evaluation Terms of Reference (without logical framework details)

<b>Project Title:</b>	Making decent work a reality for domestic workers
<b>Type of Evaluation:</b>	Final independent evaluation
<b>Countries:</b>	Zambia, Tanzania, India, Philippines, Paraguay
<b>Project End:</b>	31 March 2014
<b>Evaluation Manager:</b>	Rasha TABBARA
<b>Administrative Unit:</b>	Inclusive Labour Markets, Labour Relations and Working Conditions Branch (INWORK)
<b>Technical Unit:</b>	Inclusive Labour Markets, Labour Relations and Working Conditions Branch (INWORK)
<b>Independent evaluator:</b>	Una MURRAY
<b>Key Words:</b>	working conditions, domestic work, migrant workers, social security, research, capacity building, policy advice

#### 1. BACKGROUND AND CONTEXT

Outcome 5 (“Women and men have improved and more equitable working conditions”) covers an array of policy areas, including wages and income, working time and work organization, work and family, and maternity protection – representing core elements of an employment relationship and of workers’ protection. Domestic workers are among the most vulnerable groups of workers – they are largely excluded, de jure or de facto, from protective labour legislation in many countries; are virtually invisible because they work in private houses; and experience serious decent work deficits. The demand for ILO technical assistance from national constituents on matters relating to domestic workers has increased since the adoption of the Domestic Workers Convention (No. 189) and Recommendation (No. 201), 2011. As a follow-up to the adoption of these new instruments, the ILO Governing Body (312th Session, November 2011) endorsed a global ILO “*Strategy for action towards making decent work a reality for domestic workers worldwide*”. This global strategy serves as a unifying framework for ILO action at country, regional and global levels on domestic work.

The project contributes to the achievement of Outcome 5, and forms part of the ILO global strategy mentioned above, through the following: (i) direct technical assistance to country-level actions in five countries (target Country Programme Outcomes linked to Outcome 5, specifically domestic workers, under the current ILO Programme 2012-2013) and (ii) development and dissemination of a global product which aims at building the capacities of constituents, ILO staff and partners to support and sustain country-level actions. The proposed technical assistance to CPOs will be based on priorities expressed by constituents in the countries concerned on the national policy and legislative agendas and developments to date, as well as on assessments of current situations.

The ultimate beneficiaries of this proposal are the domestic workers themselves. In the five countries to be assisted by this proposed project, domestic workers are estimated to be at least 7.6 million, excluding children aged less than 15 years of age. The knowledge and policy development tools that would be produced under the Global Product would be relevant to a greater number of countries in Africa, Asia and Latin America, and thus to a greater number of domestic workers.

The direct and immediate beneficiaries are:

- National level: government agencies and parliaments, workers’ and employers’ organizations, organizations of domestic workers and their employers, private employment agencies, non-government organizations and institutions involved in promoting decent work for domestic workers; and domestic workers themselves.
- International level: regional organizations of governments, workers and employers, UN agencies, and donor and

other international organizations whose mandates/programmes are relevant to decent work and domestic workers.

### **Direct assistance to Country Programme Outcomes (CPOs)**

In consultation with the Regional Offices and within the framework of the P&B process, five (5) target CPOs, which explicitly aim at improving national capacities to address policy issues concerning domestic workers and to promote decent work for this group of workers, will be assisted.

The immediate objectives and forms of technical assistance will naturally differ from CPO to CPO because national situations and policy contexts are different. In India (IND127), the Philippines (PHL132) and Paraguay (PGY128), social dialogues on policy or legal reforms concerning domestic workers have been underway. For these CPOs, technical support was built upon previous achievements and ILO work, and was aimed at strengthening the capacities of constituents to advance policy processes and move from policy or law to implementation. In Zambia (ZMB134) and Tanzania (TZA104) where policy dialogues on domestic work legal and policy issues are fairly new, the focus was on deepening the knowledge base of domestic work issues, and enabling constituents to draw up a plan of action. Strengthening the organizations of domestic workers and the capacities of trade unions to address domestic workers' needs, and facilitating social dialogues are running themes across the CPOs.

### **Support to Global Product "Advancing decent work for domestic workers"**

While the Global Product of the 2010-2011 biennium aimed principally to contribute to a well-informed participation by ILO's constituents in the standard-setting process towards the adoption of meaningful international standards on domestic workers, the Global Product in 2012-2013 aimed at supporting countries geared towards ratification and countries that were not contemplating ratification. It focused on knowledge development for capacity-building, i.e. accumulation, abstraction and systematization of experiences and practices into a package of policy resources ("tools") of various forms to be shared and used more widely by constituents, partners and ILO Staff. These resources may be used for meaningful policy dialogues, capacity-building and actual design of national actions. These may be case studies on country practices, their outcomes and lessons; factsheets providing data and examples; guidelines; how-to guides or actual instruments for carrying out specific activities such as assessing working conditions or assessing relative impacts of a policy. The knowledge development and sharing that will comprise this Global Product will also have direct links with relevant CPOs (and other national actions), both as generators of information and experience as well as users of the knowledge base. CPOs and other countries possess valuable information about the socio-economic and legal contexts of domestic work and concrete ways and experiences about how certain challenges or problems of domestic work might be addressed, or not. The GP will benefit from country-level experience and know-how through direct knowledge – exchanges between countries, practical work by ILO and constituents, as well as in-depth studies.

### **Links to other ILO Outcomes**

Due to the multidimensional nature of domestic work, the activities under this proposal are related to other Outcomes, such as Outcome 2, skills development (Philippines, Zambia); Outcome 4, social security (e.g. India, Paraguay); Outcome 9, employers' organizations (e.g. Zambia); Outcome 10, workers' organizations (e.g. India, Zambia); Outcome 15, forced labour (e.g. Zambia); Outcome 17, freedom from discrimination (e.g. India); and Outcome 18, labour standards (e.g. Philippines, Tanzania).

In CPOs, workers and employers organizations will be involved in policy dialogues and development. Capacity building activities, in collaboration with ACTRAV and ACTEMP, will aim at strengthening their capacities to participate actively and informed way on these processes.

## **2. LOGICAL FRAMEWORK**

### **Development Objective**

Women and men, especially for most vulnerable workers, have improved and more equitable working conditions.

### **Immediate Objective(s):**

Direct assistance to CPOs: Increased capacity of governments and social partners to design, assess and/or implement strategies, policies, laws or other measures to promote decent work for domestic workers, especially in terms of improved or more equitable working conditions.

Global Product: "Advancing decent work or domestic workers": An improved knowledge base on domestic work and strategies and policy and legal instruments for promoting decent work for domestic workers in diverse national contexts.

### **Indicators and means of verification:**

Direct assistance to CPOs: For the target countries which will be assisted, the indicators of achievement are any two of the following criteria:

- A national plan of action is adopted by tripartite constituents, including representatives of domestic workers organizations where they exist, covering key priorities on working conditions and other aspects of decent work (Tanzania, Zambia)
- New or modified legislation, regulations, policies, or national or sectoral programmes are adopted to improve working conditions and other dimensions of decent work (India, Philippines, Paraguay, Zambia)
- An information dissemination and awareness-raising campaign (aimed at reaching a big target audience or across geographical areas) on improving working conditions and promoting decent work more generally for domestic workers is implemented by one or more tripartite constituents (Tanzania, Zambia)
- A training strategy for improving working conditions and promoting decent work more generally along the lines of the new instruments is implemented by one or more tripartite constituents

Global Product:

- Knowledge products and policy resources (“tools”) are developed based on extraction, accumulation and systematisation of information and analyses on country situations, practices and experiences.

**Outputs level (corresponding indicators, means of verification & data collection):**

Direct assistance to five CPOs

Regional Offices and concerned COs were consulted about the choice of CPOs to be assisted under this proposal. All five CPOs presented below have been endorsed by the respective Regional Offices.

### **3. RATIONALE FOR THE EVALUATION**

The ILO entered a second phase of its partnership agreement with Sweden (Phase I: 2010-2011; Phase II: 2012-2013), with funding under the agreement being outcome-based and aligned with ILO’s Strategic Policy Framework 2010-15 and the Programme and Budget for 2010-2011, 2012-2013 and 2014-2015. The ILO partnership with Sweden supports the delivery of.

The partnership programme, which is implemented at the global and country levels, sets out to contribute to achievement of several ILO Programme and Budget (P&B) Outcomes, in particular those concerning Outcomes 1 (More women and men have access to productive employment, decent work and income opportunities), 5 (Women and men have improved and more equitable working conditions), 9 (Employers have strong, independent and representative organizations), 10 (Workers have strong, independent and representative organizations), 14 (The right to freedom of association and collective bargaining is widely known and exercised), 17 (Discrimination in employment and occupation is eliminated) and 18 (International labour standards are ratified and applied).

This document relates to the final independent evaluation of the ILO partnership agreement with Sweden for 2012-2013 for Outcome 5, which was implemented at the global and country levels. The evaluation will be undertaken in accordance with the ILO’s Evaluation Policy adopted by the Governing Body in 2005, which provides for systematic evaluations of projects in order to improve quality, accountability, transparency of the ILO’s work, strengthen the decision-making process and support to constituents in promoting decent work and social justice. The evaluation will comply with UN and OECD/DAC norms and standards, and ethical safeguards will be followed.

### **4. PURPOSE, OBJECTIVES AND CLIENTS OF THE EVALUATION**

The purpose of this final evaluation is to assess the relevance, effectiveness, efficiency, coherence, impact and sustainability of the ILO’s actions taken under this project. It will seek to ascertain what has worked, what has not worked, and the underlying reasons (internal and external). The evaluation will also identify contributions made to the ILO’s internal learning processes.

The evaluation will:

- Review existing budget information on use of funds to determine the added value of donor resources to the achievement of the Global Product and CPOs selected at the beginning of the partnership;
- Assess to what extent the interventions are aligned with the ILO Programme and Budget for 2012-2013, the Strategic Policy Framework and relevant Decent Work Country Programmes;
- Assess whether the interventions are aligned with relevant ILO Conventions and Recommendations on domestic work (Convention 189 and Recommendation 201);
- Assess to what extent synergies with other ILO interventions, including projects funded by other donors have been established, in order to have an overall picture of ILO work under each targeted outcome. Synergies with other UN projects could also be included.
- Assess the progress made to establish baselines, promote knowledge dissemination, design a sustainability strategy and manage risks
- Assess the progress made to, promote knowledge dissemination, design a sustainability strategy and manage risks
- Assess the impact orientation of activities and measurable results to date.

- Assess how the project has leveraged other funds at the country level.
- All data should be sex-disaggregated in the report or provide estimates to this effect, and any gender-based needs and concerns of women and men targeted by the programme should be considered throughout the evaluation process and integrated throughout the final evaluation report.
- Focus on results and impact against baselines. Details about the impact orientation of activities and results to date will allow the donor to determine how its funding has helped produce change.
- Where possible, a sample of the beneficiaries should be interviewed to determine their views on impacts of interventions.

The key evaluation clients will be: Sweden as project donor; ILO as executor of the project ; Project management and staff

## 5. SCOPE

The project has a budget amounting to US\$ 1,067,504 and is directly linked with P&B outcome 5 and indicator 5.1 “Number of member States in which tripartite constituents, with ILO support, adopt policies or implement strategies to promote improved or more equitable working conditions, especially for the most vulnerable workers”.

Following ILO evaluation requirements, the evaluation will be based on the Development Assistance Committee (DAC) criteria of relevance, efficiency, effectiveness and evidence of impact and sustainability through contributions of ILO support. The evaluation will identify how donor funding contributes to the achievement of the selected CPOs and how these CPOs contribute to the achievement of P&B outcome indicators.

## 5. EVALUATION METHODOLOGY

The final independent evaluation will combine a desk review of relevant project documentation, to obtain an overview of the activities supported in terms their contribution to the ILO P&B and CPOs; briefings at ILO Geneva; a study visit to 2-3 countries; and compilation of information on progress in other countries through other methods (e.g. phone/skype interviews, questionnaires, online surveys).

Key questions to be posed to all relevant country offices will be prepared by the independent evaluator and once agreed with the evaluation team, a questionnaire will be prepared and sent out to key programme staff, to be combined with telephone interviews if felt appropriate. This will be established in the evaluation inception report.

The evaluator would then undertake a study visit to the selected countries to conduct the field evaluation mission to gather country-level case studies and a review of partner organizations.

The evaluator will submit a draft report which will be circulated for comments to all relevant stakeholders, comments that will be consolidated by the Evaluation Manager. A final evaluation report, incorporating the comments (if/when applicable) will be submitted by 30 April 2014.

### *Evaluation criteria and questions*

All aspects of this evaluation shall be guided by the ILO evaluation policy which adheres to the OECD/DAC Principles and the UNEG norms and standards. The evaluation will be based on the OECD/DAC criteria of relevance, efficiency, effectiveness and evidence of impact and sustainability through the analysis of the project implementation and outputs.

<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <b>Relevance:</b> To what extent is the design of the ILO project relevant to the strategy outlined in the CPOs and P&amp;B for the Outcome it aims to support, and for the achievement of the Global Product and CPOs it aims to support?</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <b>Coherence:</b> To what extent are the various activities in the project’s implementation strategy coherent and complementary (in its design and implementation) with regard to the vertical and horizontal elements of P&amp;B Outcomes which the project supports?</li> </ul>
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <b>Effectiveness:</b> Have the project outputs been effective in supporting the achievement of the CPOs and the Strategic Outcome.</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <b>Efficiency:</b> To what extent are the project’s resources (technical and financial) being used efficiently?</li> </ul>
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <b>Impact:</b> To what extent have the project’s actions produced immediate and mid-term impact towards the achievements of CPOs and P&amp;B outcome it aims to support?</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <b>Sustainability</b> Does the project have an implementation strategy that involves tripartite constituents and development partners to establish synergies that could enhance impact and sustainability?</li> </ul>



Through these criteria, the evaluation should aim to identify how donor funding contributes to the achievement of the selected CPOs and how these CPOs contribute to the achievement of P&B outcome indicators. The evaluation will:

- Review existing budget information on use of funds to determine the added value of donor resources in contributing to the achievement of the Global products and CPOs selected at the beginning of the partnerships and relative donor funding;
- Assess to what extent the interventions are aligned with the P&B;
- Assess the contribution of Swedish funds towards the achievement of ILO Outcome it supports;
- Assess the progress, made possible by the contribution of Swedish funds, towards ILO Outcome;
- Assess whether the interventions are aligned with ILO relevant Conventions;
- Focus on results and impacts against baselines;
- Assess to what extent synergies with other ILO interventions, including projects funded by other donors have been established, in order to have an overall picture of ILO work under the targeted outcome. Synergies with other UN projects could also be included;
- Examine if the best approach was taken, and if it was optimally executed;
- Provide recommendations and a clear articulation of the “lessons learned” and identify good practices to inform future project development and contribute to knowledge development of the ILO and project stakeholders;
- Provide examples of impact/results in the field.

The key questions to be addressed by this evaluation concern:

- How the outcome-based funding contributes to achieving progress towards the selected Global Product and CPOs as set out in the documents approved by the donor, in line with the indicators listed in the logframe.
- How the interventions reach out to the target groups, addressing their problems and part of a wider poverty reduction strategy
- How other decent work issues (gender equality, social dialogue...) are mainstreamed into the implementation.
- How the current efforts build on previous experience (other projects or regions, previous phases funded by the donor), and/or the synergies realized with other ILO interventions and sources of funding (i.e. RB, RBTC, XBTC, RBSA).
- What modifications are suggested to the outcome indicators, progress on gathering sex disaggregated data and building baselines that make it possible to conduct better gender analysis in future project planning?
- The effectiveness, efficiency, impact orientation and sustainability of project interventions
- The extent to which results-based management is being used with examples of impact on the ground as a result of i) using the global products, (ii) interventions, and (iii) capacity building.

#### *Analytical framework*

In analyzing the evaluation data compiled, and drawing conclusions about the relevance and strategic fit of the projects, as well as the validity of their design, impact orientation and sustainability, the following questions should be addressed, in the framework of the project documents; and against the backdrop of the objectives described in ILO Decent Work Agenda, Country Programmes, the Programme and Budget; and the provisions of ILO Convention No. 189 and Recommendation 201.

*Knowledge development initiatives:*

- To what extent has the Global Product and other knowledge development initiatives contributed to a more analytical understanding of national issues related to promoting meaningful policy dialogue, capacity building and design of national action?
- To what extent have these initiatives contributed to action on the rights of domestic workers? What means have been used to create, share/disseminate knowledge?
- Were there sufficient capacities in place to gather gender-responsive information and conducting gender analysis?

*Advocacy and technical advisory services*

- To what extent is there evidence that the concepts of domestic workers’ rights have been instilled in ILO constituents in the participating countries, through advocacy initiatives and technical advice regarding legislation and policies? Give examples.
- To what extent have the projects created a dialogue between ILO constituents and allowed a platform for domestic workers’ organizations to be heard by ILO constituents or are in process?
- To what extent have the projects contributed to increased ratification and implementation of relevant ILO labour standards? If possible, please give relevant examples.
- To what extent have employers’ organizations been encouraged and supported to promote domestic workers’ rights?
- To what extent have workers’ organizations been encouraged and supported to extend their membership to domestic workers?
- To what extent have private employment agencies been encouraged and supported to change their practices? Please give examples.
- To what extent has civil society been engaged in action to promote understanding of the rights and practices relating to domestic workers? How many have taken actions and provide examples.

- To what extent has the media in participating countries been encouraged and supported to tackle the issues relating to domestic work? How many media portraits/reflections have done so with examples?

#### Capacity building

- To what extent has the capacity of ILO constituents to develop and implement effective legislation and policies concerning domestic workers been enhanced through project initiatives? What changes are to be observed?
- To what extent have domestic workers' organizations been able to build their capacities to promote the principles of decent work?

## 6. MAIN OUTPUTS/DELIVERABLES OF THE EVALUATION

The evaluation process will yield the following outputs:

1. An inception report with an agreed evaluation design (methodology, evaluation questions).
2. A draft report.
3. A final report including recommendations.
4. An evaluation summary according to the ILO template provided

## 7. MANAGEMENT ARRANGEMENTS

The evaluation will be managed by an Evaluation Manager, an ILO staff member who has not been involved in the design or implementation of the project. The person selected must meet the independence criteria set forth in the ILO's Policy Guidelines for results-based evaluation. The Administrator/Programme Analyst of the Conditions of Work and Equality Department has been selected for this purpose.

The evaluation team will comprise an international evaluation consultant, who will be the evaluation team leader with responsibility for the timely and submission of deliverables, including the final evaluation report which should comply with ILO evaluation policy guidelines. The consultant is expected to be familiar with issues relating to domestic work.

## 8. PROPOSED TIMEFRAME AND WORKPLAN

The total duration of the evaluation process from the desk review to the submission of the final report should be for a three-month period (February-May 2014). It is proposed that desk review will take place in late February 2014 and the field work will take place in March-April 2014, with a draft report by end of April 2014 and the final report by mid-May 2014.

The evaluation consultant will be engaged for 35 working days of which 12 days will be conducting visits to ILO Geneva and to two countries covered by the project (Zambia, Philippines).

Phase	Tasks	Timeframe
I	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Draft, circulate, revise and finalize TORs</li> <li>▪ Recruit external consultant</li> </ul>	February 2014
II	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Telephone briefing</li> <li>▪ Desk Review</li> <li>▪ Consultations with ILO staff</li> <li>▪ Inception report with Evaluation questionnaire based on desk review and consultations</li> </ul>	February-March 2014
II	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Circulation of questionnaire to ILO staff and national partners in different countries, to gather feedback.</li> <li>▪ Field visits to intervention sites in selected countries</li> <li>▪ Consultations with national partners</li> </ul>	March-April 2014
III	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Draft report based on consultations from field visits, desk review and responses to questionnaire survey</li> </ul>	April 2014
IV	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Circulate draft report to key stakeholders</li> <li>▪ Consolidate comments of stakeholders and send to evaluator</li> </ul>	April 2014
V	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Finalize the report including explanations on why comments were not included</li> </ul>	May 2014

## ***Annex 5: Expected results from Outcome 5 (2012-2013)***

### **Outcome 5: Women and men have improved and more equitable working conditions.**

#### **5.1 Number of member States in which tripartite constituents, with ILO support, adopt policies or implement strategies to promote improved or more equitable working conditions, especially for the most vulnerable.**

##### **Measurement:**

To be counted as reportable, results must meet at least two of the following criteria:

- A national plan of action is adopted by the tripartite constituents covering key priorities on working conditions, including the most vulnerable workers
- New or modified legislation, regulations, or policies, or national or sectoral programmes, are adopted to improve working conditions, including for the most vulnerable workers, in one of more specific areas: maternity protection, work-family reconciliation, domestic work, working time and work organization
- An information dissemination or awareness-raising campaign on improving working conditions is implemented by one or more of the tripartite constituents in one or more specific areas: maternity protection, work-family reconciliation, domestic work, working time and work organization
- A training strategy for improving working conditions is implemented by one or more of the tripartite constituents in one or more specific areas: maternity protection, work-family reconciliation, domestic work, working time and work organization.

#### **5.2 Number of member States that, with ILO support, strengthen their institutional capacity to implement sound wage policies**

##### **Measurement:**

To be counted as reportable, results must meet at least one of the following criteria:

- A mechanism for the monitoring and collection of wage data is established or strengthened to expand or improve the availability of data on average wages, the wage share, or wage inequality, or other new wage indicators
- Legislation, regulations, or policies are adopted that improve minimum wages (national or sectoral), whether established via statute or through collective bargaining.
- Specific measures to improve wage setting are implanted in either the public or private sectors, such as the establishment or revitalization of a tripartite body at national level or other wage bargaining mechanisms, operating at different levels.
- A group of wage experts, trained as part of a capacity-building programme established by the ILO, is employed by the ministry of labour or employers' or workers' organizations, or academic institutions dealing with wage policy matters.

## ***Annex 6: Employers Organisation and the Philippines***

### **Case study: The successful engagement of the Employers Organisation, the Philippines**

A significant achievement by ILO in the Philippines was to get the employers confederation of the Philippines (ECOP) involved and committed to decent work for domestic workers. Overall it was reported that ILO's continuous engagement with ECOP management was effective (mainly under corporate social responsibility unit of ECOP). According to those interviewed at ECOP initially their members were not particularly interested. ILO staff explained why ECOP should engage, inviting them to events. Providing technical inputs around Convention 189 was instrumental in this regard.

In order for ECOP to get their members interested in domestic workers issues sensitising sessions and focus group discussions were held with members in various cities and 'sending' provinces such as Ngaga and Cebu cities, Southern Luzon and Mindanao to discuss the pending Domestic Workers Bill and devise an ECOP position to submit to DOLE. ECOP gradually became more engaged, as they realised that a written contract would also protect employers of domestic workers.

Major discussions on minimum wage took place; with some ECOP members actually believing that the minimum wage proposed was too low. The issue of social security registration also proved contentious for many employers. Those employers who run a business found it easier to register their domestic workers, whereas those who are individual employers found it difficult. ECOP found that the media was portraying employers in a bad light, only highlighting abuse stories, and not giving examples of employers who actually pay for domestic workers to go to night school or become employees of their companies.

Although ECOP had prepared in 2005/6 Ethical Guidelines on the Employment of Domestic Workers, they felt it still should be enriched. How to do this was an entry point for discussion with ECOP members and local government units. Eventually ECOP asked to be part of the team developing the Implementation Rules and Regulations (IRR) for the new Domestic Workers Act. Sida funds were used for an all employers consultation on the Domestic Workers Act Implementing Rules and Regulations held in April 2013 in Makati City. As mentioned the issue of social security registration proved contentious, particularly the issue of back payments, which included interest rate penalty, costs.

ECOP reported that many domestic workers themselves did not wish to be registered and asked for the cash in lieu of registration for social security (representatives of domestic workers stated that domestic workers themselves require orientation on the benefits of being organised as they are not always sure about the benefits). ECOP themselves funder a further up meeting in St. Lukes Manila, inviting the head of Social Security to present on the implications of the Domestic Workers Act for employers.

Other contentious for ECOP members issues included the termination of contracts; illiteracy of domestic workers (thus inability to read written contracts) in certain regions of the country. Generally ECOP found it very difficult to organise and reach employers of domestic workers. One way of reaching employers is through Home Owners Associations. These are mainly membership organisations of groups of people living in a gated community, a village or subdivision.

## ***Annex 7: Comments on the research focus in Sida***

ILO is using national research institutes for conducting research on domestic workers, building capacities to use qualitative research methods. This is a good practice as it can build institutional capacities instead of hiring consultants. Qualitative methodologies for researching the situation of domestic workers are recommended through ILO Geneva (along with quantitative survey data). Typically studies investigated the estimated size of domestic work employment and the key characteristics of domestic workers and households that employ them. Research studies also examine what domestic workers do; where they come from; how work is organised in the sector; and social demographic and economic characteristics of the sector.

For example in Tanzania (and Zanzibar) studies included (i) a national law and practice review, (ii) a national quantitative survey on domestic work, and (iii) qualitative research on employment practices and working conditions. The legal review (i) was adopted by the tripartite partners in October 2012. Tripartite partners agreed that domestic workers are by and large protected by the existing laws governing workplaces. However, there may be need for specific regulations to govern the domestic workers sector. The qualitative research (iii) was completed in December 2013.

Studies in **India** focused on various operational aspects of extending RSBY to domestic workers and, studies on minimum wage setting practices in domestic work in different states. ILO subsequently validated the study findings with labour department officials and trade unions. It is difficult to determine the impact of these studies, as they are part of a slow iterative process to build a knowledge base on how to implement measures to ensure decent work for domestic workers.

ILO experienced many challenges in mobilizing research in the countries of focus within a short time period, particularly as the studies were urgently required for use in decision making. Engaging national statistics offices was found to be very expensive and local expertise for conducting qualitative research was often lacking

#### **Validation of studies**

Whilst such an in-depth approach is important to develop a more accurate and comprehensive picture of domestic workers conditions, the use and validation of such studies was not promoted outside the project or ILO. Although robustly reviewed by specialists inside ILO (technical specialists within the ILO Bureau of Statistics) the studies were not externally peer reviewed outside the tripartite groups and ILO. For a research study to be considered robust and likely to be quoted outside a narrow project framework, it should be sent to a range of independent reviewers. This helps reduce criticism later and improves the quality of the research outputs. However it is acknowledged that there is little time to prepare, test and review research during a short two-year project timeframe, particularly research that has a focus on providing inputs during that time frame.

In **Zambia** some (e.g. Ministry of Labour and Social Affairs Commissioner and the Domestic Workers Union) felt that the sample size of qualitative study on domestic workers was too small and not necessarily representative. The Domestic Workers Unions were disappointed that they were not consulted with regard to the sample size and felt they could have advised the research body (IPSOS). In the **Philippines** there seemed to be confusion regarding the definition of child domestic workers. The university had to use the definition from the national statistics office, but were unclear where this definition came from.<sup>51</sup>

It is important to note that the methodologies used for the quantitative domestic worker surveys and the qualitative researches in the three countries (Tanzania, Zambia and Philippines) were being applied for the first time. Thus for the ILO office it was a learning process, and suggestions for improvements are included in the guidelines for qualitative research which are available on the ILO

---

<sup>51</sup> Their definition seemed to be 1 hour of domestic work in the past week

Domestic Workers website. Evidently more applications are required before ILO prescribes definitive methods for this type of research.

### **Sample size and locating sample**

The ILO office in Geneva reiterated the importance of differentiating between probability sampling using the sampling frame of the national statistics office (which a national domestic worker survey uses) and qualitative research on working conditions that cannot use a probability-based sampling due to absence of a sampling frame.

Much of this type of sampling was fairly new to some in-country researchers, so there was confusion amongst researchers with regard to interviewing domestic workers and the sampling frame. For example some were wondering whether there should be standards with regard to whether domestic workers are interviewed in their place of work or outside? (e.g. in a school for adult evening education). Those employers who allow their domestic workers to be interviewed or allow them to attend evening classes could tend to be 'good' employers, as opposed to those who do not allow their domestic workers to be interviewed. For instance in the **Philippines** most domestic workers in the 100+ sample were satisfied if not very satisfied with their working relationship with their employers, despite low wages, long working hours and no social security. In other words most were content or moderately contented, they felt they could choose their own destiny. Yet few had heard of the Domestic Workers Act. Alternative methods could be applied such as reaching domestic workers through facebook or at the 'mall' or in church.

### **Use of studies**

The timing, finalisation, and summary of these studies were often towards the end of the Sida project. The studies will of course inform future work. Without advertisement and promotional fuss studies can get 'lost' in large bureaucracies. ILO indicate that this will not happen in this case, as the studies were undertaken in response to a demand. A key point is the rapid dissemination and use of these studies. For example the three studies from Tanzania have been synthesized and used. Should the results be publicised more widely? Although in **Zambia** the national survey has been synthesised and circulated, in **Paraguay**, a representative of the government reported the need for a summary of the study. Should a summary briefing note be prepared on the main findings so as to inform those who do not have time to read the full study?

In the **Philippines** a domestic worker organiser reported that the study is effective for organising domestic workers, as it categorizes them. In **Paraguay** the employers organisation also appreciated the categorisation of domestic workers. Staff in IPS may use the Paraguayan research results (if a wide range of IPS staff get access to the research results and the results are discussed), to improve services to domestic workers. Some reported that although the study is interesting and informative (e.g. Universidad Católica), some others reported that the study misses missing some important ingredients and could be enriched a bit.

In the **Philippines** the qualitative study researched by the University of the Philippines was available after the Domestic Workers Act was passed. Thus the study did not inform the law. The study revealed an underestimation of the complexity of domestic workers and employers relations; that the sector is rapidly changing, with some domestic workers employed to mind animals or only the elderly; and more and more domestic workers are employed on a part-time basis rather than live-in. However this research results relates to the (small) sample size and location of the research. Although qualitative research generally use much smaller sample sizes and the indepth rich information is very useful, researchers must be clear that they can only draw different context specific conclusions from small sample sizes. Researchers should be discouraged from turning qualitative results into percentages (if the sample size is less than 100).

The researchers in the Philippines concluded that with so many new and emerging categories of domestic workers, it is difficult for a law to cover them all adequately, but at present the law only treats domestic workers as one type of workers, with similar requirements. Overall their results revealed many nuances in the categories of domestic workers and many cultural permutations on what is acceptable or not. The further concluded that the Domestic Workers Act may protect live in domestic workers, rather than live out.<sup>52</sup> A researcher from **Tanzania** also reported that there are different types of domestic workers so varying approaches are required.

Although not discussed in depth during the evaluation, in **Tanzania**, the studies were well received by those interviewed, and allegedly informed tripartite partners on what should be done. The results of the law and practice review and national domestic worker survey have been presented and validated by constituents. According to ILO Zanzibar, the study and the review of Zanzibar's legal framework comparing it to the provisions in C189 and Recommendation 201 as well as the assessment of existing employment patterns was well received by constituents. This study contributed to the launch of the Action Plan for domestic workers in Zanzibar. One stakeholder outside ILO reported that these studies provided the needed evidence base for the media campaign.

Also not discussed in depth during the evaluation, in **Paraguay** the employers organisation reported that the study can be used for the planned training for domestic workers (by Servicio Nacional de Promoción Profesional (SNPP) and Sistema Nacional de Formación y Capacitación Laboral (SINFOCAL), whereas an ILO focal point in Paraguay reported that the study can be used to sensitise policy makers and others about the precariousness of domestic work.

### **Conclusions: research**

For research to be considered of high quality it must be robustly peer reviewed outside ILO and authored (both researcher authored with ILO reviewers and approval) so that it is clear who researched, drafted and contributed to the report (attribution is clear in this project). A standard section in each report indicating who did what is necessary<sup>53</sup>. Sample sizes and methodology must be clearly summarised in all reports (not just in the methodological guidelines, but included as an annex or summarised at the beginning). Sample sizes should be succinctly mentioned in any policy briefs that are later produced. Be careful that the research conducted by ILO does not fall into gray areas, without the quality control of a peer-review stamp. This sometimes leaves stakeholders questioning sample sizes, geographic areas of focus and results.

### **Recommendations: research**

ILO should reconsider how it commissions research and studies, and how they can do it better with linkages to research institutes and online research databases. ILO should investigate with *Google Scholar* how to get ILO studies in that repository. Research institutes may be able to provide guidance. Linking with Masters and PhD students who wish to focus on a relevant labour related area, but are supervised by a graduate research committee may be relevant in some cases. Alternatively ILO could set up a 'research' support office that oversees sample sizes, qualitative methodologies and reviews the research concept note before research commences. Some type of research support and quality review framework for research is required.

---

<sup>52</sup> Although using a small sample size, they conclude that live out domestic workers as a category are expanding, with laundry workers moving from apartment to apartment, cleaners only working for one household a few hours a week, pet minders and so on.

<sup>53</sup> In the Philippines, the researchers have plans to draw out from the initial data and publish something from this work, including a column in a broadsheet.

## **Annex 8: Points noted during evaluation with respect to country level coherence**

In response to the question posed during the evaluation – coherence of the GLO/11/54/SID activities towards synergies with existing interventions (from ILO and other donors) and how the activities fitted with on-going interventions, the following addresses this question by country.

<p><b>Coherence issues - The Philippines</b></p> <p>Activities under the Sida funding were coherent with supporting the tripartite partners to move forward with the ratification of C189 as there was a common position amongst partners.</p> <p>The Philippine Labor &amp; Employment Plan 2011-2016<sup>54</sup> is essentially the DWCP for the Philippines and is a sectoral plan for the country at large. Although this plan was developed prior to the ratification of Convention 189, it does contain reference to domestic workers<sup>55</sup>. Thus activities planned through the Sida funds were in line with national priorities and ILO's strategy in the Philippines as outlined in the Labor &amp; Employment Plan (2011-2016).</p>
<p><b>Coherence issues – Paraguay</b></p> <p>ILO acted upon some issues around coherence with other legal reforms taking place in Paraguay. Another law national groups were lobbying for <i>Ley N° 4933/13</i><sup>56</sup> concerned social contributions for housewives and informal workers. Domestic workers were included and this law approved in May 2013. However pension rights were included for domestic workers viewing them as 'independent' rather than 'dependant' workers. (and it was not entirely in line with provisions under Convention 189 and the associated recommendation). This law equates domestic workers as self-employed and requires them to pay a very high amount of their salary, with no employer contributions.</p> <p>ILO staff to explain that the above law is not entirely suitable for achieving decent work for domestic workers and national groups agreed. The Domestic Workers Law that is currently under review includes domestic workers in the social security system on equal conditions with other dependant workers.</p>
<p><b>Coherence issues – India</b></p> <p>An ILO official reported that the studies on the minimum wages carried out through the ILO project have been very useful in providing insight on the comparative practices amongst different states. As the implementation of Minimum Wages Act is the responsibility of the state governments, further efforts are needed to encourage trade unions to ensure coherence on the issue of including domestic workers into the minimum wages schedule.</p> <p>The interventions under IND127 were coherent in terms of supporting India align itself with aspects of C189. Linking with sexual harassment in the workplace aligned gender mainstreaming budgets and DWDW (as well as ILO work on child domestic labour). Activities were coherent with the priorities of smaller trade unions, and the Domestic Workers Forum members. Work other donors are doing in India (such as Dfid) on migrant workers including domestic workers are linked.</p>

<sup>54</sup> <http://www.dole.gov.ph/fndr/bong/files/PLEP-26%20April%20version.pdf>

<sup>55</sup> For example on page 32 under the *Rights at Work* section, reference is made to the need to expand welfare and protection measures under the labor code to workers in the informal economy (including domestic workers) as a challenge. Page 33 also calls for reforms in protective mechanisms for domestic workers in the local economy. Under the *Social Dialogue* section some strategies make reference to the participation of domestic workers in dialogues, and support for organisations of domestic workers.

<sup>56</sup> *Que autoriza la incorporación voluntaria de trabajadores independientes, empleadores, amas de casa y trabajadores domésticos al seguro social – Fondo de jubilaciones y pensiones del Instituto de Previsión social”.*



**Coherence issues - Tanzania and Zambia**

The work in Tanzania was in line with UNDAP Tanzania, which has a component on social protection and employment. In Tanzania the Employers were passive, not exactly supportive, but did not raise objections.

In Zambia, the evaluator did not meet with ILO senior management, so issues around coherence vertically and horizontally across the DWCP were not discussed, making it difficult to conclude on coherence across various levels.

## ***Annex 9: Gender related issues noted during evaluation***

### **Zambia**

In **Zambia**, some initiatives were linked with headquarters funds for gender mainstreaming. However this seemed to be of an ad hoc nature. Gardeners are included as domestic workers in Zambia, resulting in only a 55 percent female dominance in the sector (compared to other countries which have a higher percentage of female domestic workers counted). Whilst male domestic workers (often gardeners) reported levels of salaries and a lack of a clear job description as their biggest grievance, interviews revealed that sexual abuse was a very common complaint amongst females (as well as a lack of respect). A sensitisation campaign on sexual abuse is still required. It is widely known that it occurs, but many employers need to be reminded that it is exploiting a domestic workers vulnerable position based on unequal power relations. There is a tendency to blame the domestic workers. For instance in Zambia about 4 or 5 people interviewed expressed the opinion that the employer also needs to be protected – stating domestic workers try to earn more by accepting the advances of males in the households. These issues (from both domestic workers and employers perspectives) could be explored in a sensitisation campaign. Evidently domestic workers should be included in other gender related programmes around sexual exploitation. This requires ILO to place the issue on the agenda of agencies.

Other issues faced by female domestic workers included not being allowed to eat food at work, not being allowed to bath, and employers holding their identify documents. Male domestic workers reported that their job description included all tasks around the household with employers not allowing them to remain idle for 5 minutes. There were little discussion on the gendered nature of domestic work overall, and women's traditional role in the household was taken as given.

Although some suggestions were put forward by those interviewed during the evaluation related to employing domestic workers for fewer hours if unable to afford the minimum wage, this also is not explored yet, as it appears to go again trade unions fighting against contract work. There was no evidence of discussions with regard to males contributing to traditionally female tasks in lieu of substituting with domestic workers. Sida gender mainstreaming funds were used to support two national surveys.

### **Philippines**

The NPC for the Philippines had a strong background in gender equality, having previously worked as a gender trainer and is well versed in using the Philippines *Harmonized Gender and Development Tool*. This ensured that gender related issues were highlighted through the implementation of the activities. Trade unions in the Philippines outlined that gender sensitivity training helped to get messages across about domestic workers. Some argued that if the majority of domestic workers were male, Convention 189 would be in place 70 years ago. Arguments around exploitation, discrimination and undertaking female roles were used.

In the Philippines funds were also allocated from Sida's gender mainstreaming project though ILO Bangkok. Two specific stand-alone activities took place. (i) An *All Workers planning session on Organising Domestic Workers* resulted in a report and action plan for partners involved. (ii) a National Training of Trainers workshop on Decent Work for Domestic Workers, where trade unions and domestic workers (as well as the employers organisation ECOP) developed a training plan for implementing decent work. These activities were planned to respond to the request of the *All Workers Group* under the *Domestic Work Technical Working Group* for support in organising domestic

workers. According to ILO Manila, the training mobilised female domestic workers, women leaders in the trade union movement and others outside as well as male officials of these organisations. One domestic worker organiser reported that they are already implementing aspects of what was covered in the workshop.

## **Paraguay**

In Paraguay according to 2011 figures, 91.4 percent of the 198,512 domestic workers are female, with 8.6 percentage male (17,023 men). The sector is predominantly female. In essence the focus on domestic workers in Paraguay was women specific, but large efforts were made to ensure men were also included in initiatives organised (with one campaign 'poster' focused on men). For instance the campaign organised through IPS (the institute of social protection) included male domestic workers. Drivers and gardeners were included in the draft law under consideration. Thus efforts were made to ensure a wide representation of types of domestic workers. In Paraguay the ILO Senior Gender Focal point, and subsequently a gender specialist who also brought a considerable gender focus to activities initially managed the focus on domestic workers.

## **India**

The Ministry of Women and Child Development is a member of the Indian tripartite-plus Gender Taskforce led by the Ministry of Labour and Employment that has been established, to guide policy and implementation of issues related to gender equality in the world of work. It would be important that the Ministry of Women understand and support the National draft policy on domestic workers or the ratification of Convention 189.

A gendered dimension of domestic work was reported to be highlighted in the case studies commissioned by ILO on minimum wages and RSBY, outlining how social notions about poor women from marginalised communities ensure that domestic work remains a low status occupation with low wages.

A National Workshop of Trade Union Women's Committee on Decent Work for Domestic Workers in March 2012 was held in Delhi. With a focus on women committee members, the workshop attempted to strengthen the gender components of the campaigns in support of decent work for domestic workers. Participants came up with action plans.

With regard to other workshops and operational aspects of the overall project, it was noted in India that sex disaggregated data on the attendance of one workshop (Hyderabad in July 2013) was not recorded. It would be assumed that at this stage, all ILO workshops report attendance by male / females and make arrangements to strongly encourage female participation. A number of comments given for this workshop were that female participants should be helped with finding accommodation when attending a workshop. Considering the safety of female participants travelling to another city to attend a workshop is a basic requirement that should be taken care of, if there is to be encouragement of female attendance.

## ***Annex 10: Challenges reported that still must be addressed***

### **Challenges Zambia**

- Implementation issues remain a challenge in Zambia (minimum wage). The new government in Zambia increased the minimum wage dramatically by 67%<sup>57</sup> without (according to Zambia Federation of Employers) adequate consultation with the tripartite partners. ZFE dismissed this increase as it did not respect social dialogue processes and advised their members not to comply with it. However the Trade Unions felt that such consultations had taken place with the previous administration. ZFE felt that raising the minimum wage when there is a freeze on public sector wages can result in domestic workers losing their jobs, or employers negotiating lower wages with domestic workers.
- As mentioned in main text collective bargaining for domestic workers (organised) is an issue.
- One of the trade unions in Zambia complained that planning of projects often leave trade unions out during the actual planning process.
- Another complaint is that projects of this nature and timing are too short. Things are just moving when the project is over. Often time is taken at the beginning getting all on board, and up to speed on the technical issues, particularly when they have not been involved at the start. Follow up is required to move the agenda further in Zambia.

### **Challenges Philippines**

- Continuing to organise domestic workers in the Philippines remains a challenge. Three key unions are striving to expand their membership to include this category of workers into a National Domestic Workers Alliance.
- Some issues around the Implementing Rules and Regulations of the Domestic Workers Act (IRR) provided major challenges to householders. Compliance on registration for social security by employers is proving the biggest obstacle to date. For example a previous law (that was unfortunately overlooked during the consultation and brainstorming) regulated that all households should register their domestic workers with the SSS. A repealing clause for all previous laws, rules and regulations that are inconsistent with any of the provisions of the Domestic Workers law was not in place. When the new Domestic Workers law came into force, this previous law could not be ignored, resulting in householders being obliged to pay their domestic workers social security payments from the date they initially started working, with penalties for late payments. This is a major disincentive to households registering domestic workers. On the other hand, a range of mitigating options is being considered (such as eliminating the interest charges in registering domestic workers from previous years).
- Local government agencies require information on how to implement the rules and regulations accompanying the Act. Not all Barangay chiefs are supportive of the law and many consider it a burden to implement the law<sup>58</sup>. DOLE requires support in communicating the Domestic Workers Act to their intermediary institutions and to the Local Government Units (LGUs) who are controlled by a different body, the *Department of Interior and Local Government* (DILG).

---

<sup>57</sup> The new government had based some of their election promises on the minimum wage

<sup>58</sup> Those attempting to organise domestic workers reported that often there are difficulties to enter sub-division of villages. The local government officials, when running for re-election think about the votes they obtain from 'employers' in the villages, and are afraid to discuss domestic workers rights for fear of losing their votes.

- Minimum wage fixing and increases still remain an issue. The regional wage boards issues minimum wage orders. Minimum wage criteria and guidelines for domestic workers are required. The tripartite National Wages and Productivity Commission retain overall responsibility for this.

### Challenges Paraguay

- The employers' organisation in Paraguay reported that to sustain activities an enablement environment between workers organisations and employers must continue, so that the benefits for both are highlighted and a clash of demands does not occur.
- A representative of the Ministry of Labour highlighted that a key challenge remaining is supporting the empowerment of domestic workers, so that they can defend their own rights.
- A representative from the government reported that the main challenge is to raise awareness amongst domestic workers themselves so that they begin to shout for "the same rights" as others.

### Challenges India

- A few respondents highlighted the challenge of getting the largest trade unions in India to put the issue of domestic workers on their agenda. If these large ILO affiliated unions do not represent domestic workers, moving forward is harder. Some representatives of the Domestic Workers Forum argue that ILO needs to involve more local unions on the issue of domestic work. They argue that the national unions are not so concerned with the plight of domestic workers. Others argue that ILO work is rather Delhi focused.
- Trade unions in India are reported to look upon ILO for financial support too much, rather than take the lead themselves or sustain activities after funding.
- Ensuring employers are engaged is challenging.
- A few respondents reported that minimum wages for domestic workers is still a concern. A representative of domestic workers reported that because the government is reliant on the votes of middle class people, they are loath to fix minimum wages.
- Even if states adopt minimum wages or extend RBSY coverage, implementation challenges are great. For example when domestic workers attempt to register, they require two forms of verification (a trade union certificate or an employers certificate or police verification), which they find difficult to obtain. There are no resident welfare associations in many cities and domestic workers cannot register. ILO and partners are trying to overcome some of these administrative issues, such as using other public distribution system (e.g. in Chhannattigarh state use food rationing systems).
- Setting up a local complaints committee for domestic workers in India will be difficult to implement according to a representative of the Domestic Workers Forum. Domestic workers are afraid that if they complain, they will not get another local job. However, examples exist. In Bangalore a Worker Facilitation Centre is piloting the registration of domestic workers in a database and providing information on grievance redressal mechanism.
- The issue of migrant domestic workers who are vulnerable to trafficking as well as issues around the exploitation of placement agencies requires attention (and ILO-DFID will tackle this in the *Working in Freedom* project). The issue of child domestic workers also needs consistent attention.
- In India attention to domestic workers has been intermittent and not always consistent in the past 5 years. Funding for work on domestic workers is a challenge, although RBSA funds could be allocated

## **Challenges Tanzania**

There are many challenges that must still be addressed in Tanzania including wider political support for the ratification of C189 along with further awareness raising.

- Although a tripartite Action Plan exists, the challenge remains to implement it and to get tripartite partners to discuss the legal challenges.
- Even with the media campaign that took place, most domestic workers are not aware of their labour rights. Most of domestic workers do not recognize themselves as workers
- Most employers of domestic workers do not recognize domestic workers as workers. Many employers do not abide with the laws
- Addressing the informality of the domestic work sector remains a key issue.

## Annex 11: Results tables by country and results for the global product

Table 9: Zambia, results and comments

Activities planned, Zambia	Indicators	Results and comments, Zambia
1.1. A study of domestic work patterns, magnitude, conditions and policy issues in Zambia is undertaken.	Report; study informs tripartite discussions	<p>The qualitative studies were completed by a research institute called IPOS, and presented at a dissemination tripartite meetings in February 2014 , so should inform discussions, although how this will be documented is unknown.</p> <p>No previous study on domestic workers had been undertaken. The study was internal review by IPOS and also reviewed by ILO. A total of <u>113 domestic workers</u> and <u>26 employers</u> were interviewed, and <u>4 FGDs with domestic workers</u> and <u>4 with employers</u> were conducted, in Lusaka and Kitwe.</p> <p>The Ministry of Labour representative met during the evaluation and the domestic workers unions reported that the sample size was not targeted nor large enough. They would like to have had inputs in the design of the study. Mini summary reports may ensure wide dissemination of the results.</p>
1.2. Tripartite meeting(s) on domestic work in Zambia, the national law (SI), C189, R201 and other policy and regulatory frameworks, conducted.	Number of discussions/forums held; participants (number and groups represented); set of conclusions & recommendations	<p>In June 2012 when the government adjusted MW upwards without social dialogue, ZFE very concerned. Disrupted social dialogue. Earlier Tripartite policy dialogue meeting on domestic work took place in December 2012 at the Pamodzi Hotel, Lusaka to discuss Statutory Instrument.</p>
1.3. Set of recommendations by tripartite partners for a plan of action to improve working conditions of domestic workers and/or for improvement of national policy, legal and regulatory framework	Report produced	<p>In February 2014 Tripartite dissemination meetings - at a one day workshop consisting of the presentation of the research findings, and interactive group discussions aimed at</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1) identifying and prioritizing issues that should be addressed; and</li> <li>2) identifying measures or actions that may be taken by the tripartite partners, together and separately, in the coming 2-4 years.</li> </ol> <p>The Ministry of Labour announced that they are beginning a process of ratifying Convention 189. A memo has been presented at cabinet level</p>
1.4. Code of Conduct for Employers of Domestic Workers and Domestic Workers, developed/finalised and disseminated.	Codes adopted by social partners; number of actual points of dissemination	<p>The code existed already, but during the project it was presented more and at different conferences. However domestic workers, some union representatives interviewed and the research institute Ipsos claimed they had not seen the code of conduct for employers of domestic workers.</p>

1.5 Campaign to raise awareness among domestic workers, employers and social partners, is designed and implemented by social partner(s)	Number of information/communication materials; number of campaign interventions undertaken through media (print and electronic), community events and/or national events (e.g. Youth Day, IWD, CL Day)	<p>Capacity of Domestic Workers Unions was strengthened, but some reported that domestic workers unions require more capacity to provide representation for DWs within their mandate. Both domestic workers unions (UHDWUZ affiliated with ZZTUC &amp; FFTUZ) participated in a workshop in Nov 2013. ILO Pretoria &amp; Zambia facilitated. Major issues related to DW in Zambia were covered. Participants learned how to conduct a comparative analysis of legislation &amp; gap analysis. DW Unions developed a mock submission paper for Parliament. Discussions on what trade unions can offer domestic workers were clarified. Came up with a small action plan at this meetings and progress was presented in Feb 2014 information dissemination meeting</p> <p>Employers provided start your business training for Maid Centres as entry point. Simultaneously discussions on the rights of domestic workers (their clients)</p> <p>Reaching out to DW through radio was reported as effective. Some awareness raising was done by the Trade Unions through church, and many agreed that faith based awareness raising is something that could be used more.</p> <p>Most DWs do not yet know their rights. The controversy around the introduction of the Statutory Instrument allowed for much discussion and media attention, particularly as the employers organization was against the 67% increase in MW. Awareness raising around the girl child also came from ILO. Some reported that awareness raising campaigns work well with slogans and less paper. UHDWUZ (DW union) provided examples of impact - last year they handled 451 cases and represented a significant number in court. The reasons for complaints were shown to the evaluator (dismissal, false accusation). UHDWUZ affiliated with ZTUC reported that they reached 500-600 people with their door-to-door campaign. This union reported an increase in their paid up membership (of at least 500) as a result of the campaign.</p>
1.6. Training curriculum and certification framework for domestic workers, developed through a consultative process, in collaboration with training authorities.	Study on training needs requirements for domestic workers undertaken & informed by domestic workers and their employers; collaboration with training authority established	<p>ZFE managed the training to enable the Maid Centres to understand the contents of the Statutory Instruments on Minimum Wages and conditions of service for domestic workers as well as be knowledgeable on the Code of Conduct for Employers of Domestic workers. The Maid Centres staff was offered basic business management skills that would make them more sustainable and realize the important role they play creation of employment in the domestic work sector. Maid centres as businesses appreciated knowledge on how to develop a business plan.</p> <p>A range of quality issues around the various maid centres noted, which is a growing sector. Unclear whether maid centres also train DW on their rights (along with household task training). Out of DWs met 4 out of 7 rated the training as low, and 2 rated it as average. None mentioned they received training on their rights. Director of maid centre indicated that 3 hours were provided on rights and theory, with 3-4 weeks on domestic work tasks. Some maid centres distribute the Employers Code of Conduct. Leaz reported that a handbook for training maids would be useful.</p>



**Table 10: Philippines, results and comments**

Activities planned, Philippines	Indicators	Results during Sida funding period (2012-13)	Comments from Evaluator
4.1. Consultations among government, legislators, social partners and other stakeholders regarding (i) ratification of C189, and (ii) proposed reforms or provisions of national law on domestic workers are carried out.	Report produced; participants (number and groups represented) in meetings; set of proposed reforms.	Convention 189 was ratified A national Domestic Workers Law was put in place with implementing rules and regulations produced with inputs from tripartite partners	<p>Generally Stakeholders view the National Law favourably. There are some initial implementation hiccups, but DOLE is making attempts to streamline systems and reporting on the implementation rules and regulations</p> <p>There is a solid group of stakeholders interested in moving forward with the implementation of Convention 189</p> <p>Domestic workers are currently being organized under the different trade unions, and will be registered as one association or Union</p>
4.2. Sets of recommendations arising from meetings among social partners, legislators and other stakeholders regarding (i) ratification of C189, and (ii) proposed provisions for new national law on domestic workers	Number or, and sector represented by, participants in meetings; report produced	3 Island wide multistakeholder consultations on the draft IRR for Domestic Workers Law took place 1 National All Workers consultations and 1 National All Employers Consultation	<p>The timeframe for inputs towards the reform of national law was adequate, but tight. ILO managed to ensure consultations were held during this period and fed to the Technical Working Group on Domestic Workers.</p> <p>Recommendations arising from meetings among social partners and other stakeholders were carefully documented and shared with DOLE. 4 documents provide inputs (position of employers, workers etc.) these were used in the final deliberations on the iRR.</p>
4.3. A set of measures identified, formulated or planned by government and/or social partners, aimed at effective implementation of, and promoting compliance with, new national law once adopted	Report; feedback from DOLE and Technical Working Group on Domestic workers	This measures have been identified and put in place.	<p>The government listened to the other stakeholders and also consulted widely within DOLE and with other government agencies</p> <p>The recommendations of the Technical Working Group on Domestic Workers fed into the National Tripartite Peace Council (the main tripartite body) (NTIPC)</p>
4.4. Training/orientation course for implementing agencies of new law on domestic work is designed; implemented in one pilot area	Report; participants (agencies involved, number)	Regional Action Plans for information dissemination on the provisions of the IRR are ongoing with DOLE. Sida gender funds were used to organize a training of trainers on organizing DWs and training on decent work for domestic workers.	<p>In March (5-6) 2014 the Domestic Work Technical Working Groups held an Assessment and Planning workshop, where a final Domestic Work TWG plan of action was approved.</p> <p>This workshop also served to present the results of an ILO funded qualitative study on Domestic Workers. This also served to pilot the IDWN manual for domestic workers and allow domestic workers build their capacities to organize themselves.</p>

Activities planned, Philippines	Indicators	Results during Sida funding period (2012-13)	Comments from Evaluator
4.5. Modalities of upgrading and professionalising skills of domestic workers, are studied and designed with partner institutions	Report; partner institution(s) participate in development; pilot testing supported by one	This did not take place under Sida funds, but with support from regional skills sections of ILO. The Skills Development Agency TESDA along with DOLE are consulting with relevant domestic workers associations on a National Certificate on household services customized for local hired domestic workers	The Qualitative study from the University of the Philippines funded by ILO should feed into this process, as their study underlies the different categories of domestic workers. It is unknown whether upgrading skills for domestic workers could actually results in better wages for DWs.

**Table 11: Paraguay, results & comment**

Activities planned, Paraguay	Indicators	Results and comments, Paraguay
5.1. Study on expansion of social security coverage (IPS) of domestic workers is conducted	Results discussed in tripartite meeting; endorsed by social partners or policy makers	<p>Situación socio-demográfica y laboral del trabajo doméstico en Paraguay: Trabajo doméstico remunerado en Paraguay was drafted in January 2014 by María Victoria Heikel. Both primary and secondary data included.</p> <p>A series of closed sessions with different partners to validate the study took place, where the main findings were presented and comments by constituents. Reported to have been well received by domestic workers associations and other stakeholders. Contains solid recommendations. Constituents and legislators when discussing the pending law may use results.</p> <p>The study was not peer reviewed outside ILO. Presentation of study to broad audience did not occur due to a general strike on the date planned for such event. Does not seem to be plans to make a shorter version.</p> <p>ILO need to plan a dissemination strategy for the study. Advertise the study with the media. Make summary statements and briefings to disseminate finding further.</p>
5.2. Conclusions and recommendations arising from consultative meetings among social partners, policy makers and parliamentarians are completed on any two of following topics: proposed legal reforms on domestic work from C189 perspective; expansion of social security coverage; role of employment and training services in upgrading and professionalizing skills of domestic work, and/or other priority issues that may arise	Participants (number, organizations and groups represented); report	<p>C189 ratified in May 2013. A draft bill with a proposal for legislative reform is before the government for approval. The importance of improving legislation governing domestic work and improving working conditions obtained the broad support from the social partners.</p> <p>In August 2013 an MoU between the Instituto de Prevision Social (IPS) and ILO was signed: to strengthen mechanisms to improve social security coverage for domestic workers; increase the registration of domestic workers; analyse and evaluate the social security system.</p> <p>ILO used legal change opportunities that are in place to include a stronger focus on social security, providing inputs.</p>
5.3. Pilot measures in two policy areas (e.g. domestic workers' access to information; role of employment and training services in upgrading skills of domestic workers; and/or expanding IPS social security coverage) aimed at improving legal and social protection of domestic workers, are designed, tested & assessed by social partners	Results of assessment of pilot test	<p>"Curso de Formacion Profesional para Tranajadoras Domesticas (with inputs from APEC, CNT, CUT A, FEPRINCO, OIT) outlined in December 2013 with 4 main modules, including one on occupational protection. The draft curriculum developed to professionalize the domestic work sector builds from efforts through another project Oportunidades, Bi-partite round tables on training for domestic workers began in Oct 2013. Systematised many previous training courses.</p> <p>Because the process included the contributions of bi-partite partners, it was reported that this approach ensure more ownership of the course, and more likely that it will be promoted by these partners. Awaiting approval by government before the curriculum can be rolled out.</p> <p>ILO should follow up on this process. Encourage Ministry to approve the curriculum</p>

Table 12: India, results and comment

Activities planned	Results and comments, India
<p>3.1. Consultative meetings among government and social partners, led by the (inter-ministerial and tripartite) Task Force on Gender Equality in the World of Work and/or Task Force on Domestic Workers, conducted on draft National Policy with view to defining follow-up actions.</p>	<p>This draft National Policy is still pending. There is a concern about domestic workers unionizing (e.g. what will housewives do if DWs strike?). The Ministry of Women and Child Development may not yet be fully supportive</p> <p>Many meetings were held mainly with trade unions with various calls for the nation policy to be passed. For example in Bangalore in April 2013 a workshop on organizing domestic workers took place; a draft work plan for a module on trade unions organizing domestic workers was presented in April 2013.</p>
<p>3.2. Measures/guidelines for effectively extending social protection schemes (particularly the Rashriya Swastha Bima Yojana (RSBY) health insurance) to domestic workers are designed and piloted.</p>	<p>Guidelines were prepared and shared with States; States extending social protection were identified. ILO to start discussion funded studies. 8 page briefs prepared on <i>Extending Health Insurance to Domestic Workers</i>. <i>Social partners found the guidelines useful, but required them in local languages</i>.</p> <p>Two knowledge-sharing workshops were held (Hyderabad July 2013 and New Delhi, May 2013) . These events allowed participations to discuss whether existing social security measures can be extended to domestic workers and issues around minimum wages setting. Much materials were distributed at these workshops included the draft national policy on domestic workers, C198, studies on minimum wages and RSBY studies, information on other Minimum wages advisory boards, articles on domestic workers, and sensitizing materials regard to decent work for domestic workers. Workshop reports tend to be directly after the meetings, so it is difficult to track actions taken as a direct results of these workshops. After workshop at Hyderabad, some States mobilized towards RSBY</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• West Bengal constituted unorganized Workers Social Security Board and included Domestic workers on basis of their occupational category. This State Labour Department is active collaborator of ILO.</li> <li>• Chhattisgarh Labour Department analysed the Various Operational aspects of extension and implementation of RSBY to Domestic Workers. Working on constituting the Welfare Board for Domestic Workers. Committed to regulating and improving the working conditions.</li> <li>• Jharkhand extended RSBY to domestic workers. Jharkhand demonstrated collaboration between Domestic Workers Unions (Jhakkhand Gharelu Kamghar Union) and Labour Departments in extending RSBY. Jharkhand Labour Department proposed a bill, the Jharkhand Unorganised migrant Workers (Registration and Welfare) Act, 2013, to promote safe migration. Several future prospects are there to work in collaboration with this State for ILO in future to show case the possible practices in regulating the working conditions of domestic workers.</li> </ul> <p>Two states included domestic workers under the minimum wages list. Capacity building was required on criteria for minimum wage and the process. ILO helped to clarify confusion on how to start the process, 'noodle agencies' and ILO helped facilitate discussions on who certifies domestic workers, how to do it etc. Kerala was used as an example as they already have a noodle welfare board, and they could just expand the existing system.</p> <p>Other states found it more difficult as domestic workers had to be certified by at least 2 of the following: TU; police; social welfare officer; or employers. The Hyderabad and Delhi meetings discussed studies on how to extend RSBY. The Ministry of Labour is now examining how to simplify the procedures.</p>
<p>3.3. Measures/guidelines for registering and monitoring practices of private placement agencies for domestic workers are drafted and pilot-tested.</p>	<p>Work on guidelines for private placement agencies did not commence due to resources. Also DFID is doing something in this area, linked with ILO India. ILO shared information with DFID.</p>

Activities planned	Results and comments, India
<p>3.4 A campaign to raise-awareness on the rights of domestic workers and encourage trade union membership is implemented by trade unions.</p>	<p>Most awareness raising was amongst unions. General indication found during evaluation is that the larger trade unions could support C189 more. At state level few of the large trade unions have taken the issue on board. In 2012 domestic worker Convention 189 was not part of the main trade unions common platform</p> <p>Figures on the increase of domestic workers being organized are not available. Trade Unions in West Bengal actively working towards organizing domestic workers in recent past.</p> <p>Whenever there was occasion ILO presented or tried to raise awareness on draft national policy presented. Examples of awareness raising with trade unions;</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• ITUC held a workshop in July 2012</li> <li>• A national workshop of TU women’s committee held in March 2012 New Delhi, where participants came up with an Action Plan</li> <li>• BMS held a meeting on Domestic workers in Oct 2013; A training workshop on Organizing Domestic Workers was held in July 2013 with TUCC, also with BMS in Prune Jan 2013, maybe also in April 2013 in Bangalore</li> </ul> <p>Unclear how ILO measures the effects of these types of campaigns nor the significant changes as result of campaign?</p>
<p>3.5: Study on minimum wage setting practices for domestic workers in 2-4 States, with a view to increasing knowledge base of government and social partners on MW setting and fair assessment procedures in support of the draft National Policy for Domestic Workers.</p>	<p>ILO commissioned a study on minimum wage notifications looking at different sectors (5 states). These studies were shared with other states that were coming forward to fix MW. The studies focus on what is need for minimum wages to be implemented. 8 page briefs prepared on <i>Fixing Minimum Wages</i> produced.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• West Bengal expressed commitment and took initiatives towards extending Minimum Wages for Domestic Workers and project shared information existing practices at other States in extending minimum wage protection to domestic workers.</li> <li>• ILO provided technical support in extending Minimum wages to Domestic Workers to Chhattisgarh Labour Department (in progress).</li> <li>• Jharkhand extended minimum wages to domestic workers.</li> <li>•</li> </ul> <p>Some states had notified MW for DW (e.g. Kerala Andra Pradesh, Bihar, Jharkhand, Rajasthan). However labour dept officials domestic workers trade unions were not always aware of minimum wage notification. Notification requires notice in the official government Gazette. In some instances a Labour Commissioner passed the notification, but a successive Commissioner person may not follow up. Consequently, it was felt that there was a strong need to organise trade unions to organise DW so that they would push for minimum wage notification.</p>

**Table 13: Tanzania, results and comments**

Activities planned, Tanzania	Indicators	Results and comment, Tanzania
2.1. Study on domestic work patterns, magnitude, conditions and policy issues in Tanzania, undertaken	Study report produced and used to inform tripartite discussions	<p>There were 3 parts to the studies, with each one done by different people from the University of Dar es Salaam. A qualitative study, a quantitative study and a legal gap study.</p> <p>Some were considered stronger than others, but with a lot of solid data that was considered useful. In particular the legal comparative study was appreciated (Dr. Tulia). The survey still requires some editing. The third study requires some rearranging, but the information is there.</p> <p>The ILO designed series of workshops with stakeholders before and after the survey. Key findings were communicated to representatives of workers, employers and policy makers.</p> <p>Those who gave opinion during the evaluation reported that the studies gave a good picture of domestic workers in Tanzania and Zanzibar. Information was extracted and used according to some respondents.</p> <p>The studies have been quoted such as at stakeholders meetings. Studies have not yet been summarized, but a flyer on the studies may be produced?</p>
2.2 Leaders and representatives of social partners participate in seminar/workshop with a view to increasing their knowledge of domestic work and C189	Participants (number and groups represented); positive feedback from participants about benefits from the seminar/workshop	Participants to these seminars and workshops have increased their knowledge on DW with the focus on domestic workers as workers in their own right. They know what must be done to move forward
2.3. Tripartite consultations on domestic work issues in Tanzania are conducted with a view to formulating a plan of action to address key challenges.	Participants (number and groups represented); number of meetings; report on meetings produced	<p>Although the Action Plan was drafted in 2012, the official launch of the Action Plan to promote decent work for domestic workers was announced by the Minister of Labour and Employment on Feb 27<sup>th</sup> 2014 (and in Zanzibar in April 2014). The studies (under 2.1 above) were part of this process. The Action Plan also resulted from tripartite discussions and seminars / workshops / awareness raising.</p> <p>C189 is not yet ratified. It may be in the pipeline, according to some interviewed. All seem to agree that it is important to ratify C189 but it may not be that soon. Some believe that national law already covers domestic workers (Employment and labour relations Act 2004 but unclear whether labour institutions Act 2004 covers domestic work and MOLE realizes it is impossible to focus on labour inspection), so why should C189 be ratified?</p> <p>On the other hand if Tanzanian laws are good enough vis a vis C189, it should be easy to ratify C189. Other respondents reported that it is important to firstly put in place solid implement measures as in Tanzania the problem is often the implementation of laws.</p>
2.4. Set of recommendations by tripartite partners for plan of action to improve working conditions of domestic workers / improvement of national legal framework	Report on recommendations produced.	One recommendation put in place by tripartite bodies is that grievance settlement procedures and mediation bodies should be set up for domestic workers whose rights have been violated. It is recommended that reconciliation bodies through the commission for mediation and arbitration (CMA) be used. So far few cases have been reported.

Activities planned, Tanzania	Indicators	Results and comment, Tanzania
2.5. Campaign to raise awareness among domestic workers, employers and social partners is implemented with participation of social partners	Number of information materials produced by social partners; number of awareness-raising events organized by social partners; numerical size or geographic scope of target audience of awareness-raising event or intervention implemented by any social partner	<p>Group discussion during stakeholder workshops with domestic workers themselves added to awareness raising campaign. CHODAWU completed a awareness raising campaign. CHODAWU leaders received training on how to conduct a media campaign. Although the Facilitation of the media campaign report has clear expected outcomes, verifiable results form the campaign were not found during the evaluation.</p> <p>There was also a decision to conduct awareness raising on grievance settlement.</p> <p>Inputs from evaluation respondents reiterated however that policy makers and the public at large still don't take domestic workers seriously enough. Social media is apparently discussing domestic workers and there is more general awareness in the places where the campaign was focused. However it was also reported that much awareness is required, also amongst domestic workers themselves.</p>

Table 14: Global Products, results and comments

Outputs planned	Results found during evaluation	Comments
<p>Policy resources package (thematic policy reports, briefs).</p> <p>The focus will be on in depth treatment of at least 4 policy areas.</p> <p>(i) extension of effective legal protection to domestic workers  (ii) compliance and enforcement  (iii) wages and working time in domestic work;  (iv) organization of domestic workers.</p> <p>Depending on the specific topic and target audience, these resource packages would include case studies, guides, manuals, policy briefs, and/or training modules, and would draw material from regional knowledge-sharing forums, research and pilot tests</p>	<p>Policy resource package (thematic policy reports, briefs) dealing with 4-5 policy areas were produced</p> <p>(i) Policy resources on extension of legal protection to domestic workers published and translated into Arabic, Chinese and Spanish. This has been disseminated through regional knowledge sharing forums, ITCILO and national meetings on domestic work. Used in the Philippines during deliberations on legislative reforms.</p> <p>(ii) Working time: A working time recording tool for domestic workers themselves tested in Bolivia, Philippines, Tanzania &amp; Thailand. A guide on how to use this tool has also been prepared. A policy brief (no. 7) Working time of live-in domestic workers prepared.<sup>59</sup></p> <p>(iii) Wages- 5 country case studies (Chile, Portugal, South Africa, Switzerland, United States) of MW-setting for domestic workers.</p> <p>(iv) Compliance and enforcement an introductory guide on labour inspection and compliance mechanisms in domestic work prepared with a training module on labour inspection in domestic work (produced by the ILO Labour Administration Branch). Plans for e-learning and integration in ITCILO courses underway.</p> <p>(v) Organizing domestic workers – ACTRAV drafted case studies of organizations of domestic workers</p>	<p>Little feedback on the number of users who consider the resources product useful and relevant for their work on domestic workers. ILO have noted that Domestic Workers organisations link to these resources.</p> <p>In terms of plans for the dissemination of this guide, the CTA outlined that ILO Encourage use of tool to partners and ILO staff dealing with DW in current biennium. ILO also encourage their partners to use the list of documents they have on their website which is updated regularly.</p> <p>Could further develop a dissemination strategy to ensure the wider dissemination of domestic workers global products, in particular target countries who have a CPO on Outcome 5</p>
<p>A guide to methodologies for monitoring and assessing situation of domestic workers. Guide will provide alternative methodologies and possible instruments for rapid assessments of domestic work, based on existing research experiences and pilot-tests.</p>	<p>2 guides prepared &amp; reviewed by the Bureau of Statistics. Through further application of the guidelines this and next years, get more feedback is expected.</p> <p><i>ILO Survey on Domestic Work: Preliminary guidelines, to help produce national estimates of domestic workers</i></p> <p><i>The employment relationship and working conditions: Preliminary guidelines for a qualitative research. For collecting qualitative data on employment practices and working conditions</i></p> <p>Both guides are based the practical experiences and lessons of researches in 2-3 countries.</p> <p>Guide has been used in ROAP.</p> <p>The section that includes doing an assessment of attitudes of employers is considered useful – plans are underway to have a further emphasis on employers of domestic workers. IPEC and migration are allegedly interested in using this guide.</p>	<p>The peer review process is internal to ILO, and reviewed by the Bureau of Statistics. Those interviewed in relation to this guide were mainly those who pilot tested the guide (University of the Philippines; IPSOS in Zambia; and the University of Dar es Salaam). It is too early to determine how useful the guide is considered, but ILO should develop a system for assessing the many products they produce. Further feedback will be collated in the next few years as the guide are used.</p> <p>How can ILO encourage it to be referred to and used in TC projects?</p>

<sup>59</sup> [http://www.ilo.org/travail/whatwedo/publications/WCMS\\_230837/lang-en/index.htm](http://www.ilo.org/travail/whatwedo/publications/WCMS_230837/lang-en/index.htm)



**Annex 12: Lessons learned templates****ILO Lesson Learned 1****Project Title: Making Decent Work a Reality for Domestic Workers****Project TC/SYMBOL: GLO/11/54/SID****Name of Evaluator: Una Murray      Date: 11.7.2014**

The following lesson learned has been identified during the course of the evaluation. Further text explaining the lesson may be included in the full evaluation report.

LL Element	Text
<b>Brief description of lesson learned (link to specific action or task)</b>	<p>A strategy on domestic workers cannot be steered unless ownership is given to others beyond ILO staff and tripartite partners. When developing national plans of action, include a focus also on ministerial departments beyond the ministry of labour.</p> <p>A strategy on domestic workers must be steered with those in these specialised areas taking ownership of domestic workers as an important category of workers, but with someone taking the lead and overall steering the process.</p> <p>Having ILO staff at hand at all times to provide quick answers to many legal labour questions is essential whilst national legislation is being formulated, particularly when a category of workers (domestic workers) is a new area of focus.</p>
<b>Context and any related preconditions</b>	<p>Apart from working with many sectors of government, ILO in Geneva reported that the expertise of many levels of ILO is required to implement the DWDW strategy. Although tripartite processes are extremely important, workers unions do not always represent domestic workers as a category of workers. Ways of working with organisations that actually provide voice to domestic workers is essential.</p> <p>Rather than try to work alone on domestic workers, the Sida CTA and team carefully brought others working on related issues to the table, to discuss solutions to the particular issues faced by these informal workers. For example those working on minimum wages, occupational safety and health, and those who are providing technical advice on labour inspection.</p>

<b>Targeted users / Beneficiaries</b>	Government staff and ILO staff and ultimately domestic workers themselves
<b>Challenges /negative lessons - Causal factors</b>	<p>Cross-governmental collaboration and cross departmental ILO collaboration is always a challenge.</p> <p>Beyond the ministry of labour, working with other ministries is important for ILO. However the challenge is to get others to consider domestic workers as a relevant and important category of workers.</p> <p>For example in the Philippines it is proving important to also work with the Department of Interior and Local Government the Department of Social Welfare and Development (DSWD), Philippine National Police (PNP), Social Security System (SSS), Philippine Health Insurance Corporation (PhilHealth) and Home Development Mutual Fund (HDMF) which are all government institutions.</p> <p>In Zambia at the very least engaging with the Ministry of Justice is necessary. Tripartite legal reform discussions may go ahead leaving a particular ministry out of policy dialogue process. Enacting reforms may be delayed because a particular rule or procedure may have been overlooked. Implementation requires planning processes across government ministries to ensure that all are on board from the start. For example an implementation strategy could contain set tasks for different ministries (such as Justice, education, finance, labour, agriculture etc.).</p>
<b>Success / Positive Issues - Causal factors</b>	A table should be set up with a broad range of relevant government ministries & ILO units (and their 'stake' in a focus on domestic workers) to serve as a monitoring mechanism. For example training of judges and lawyers may also be important for the implementation of laws; Central Statistics Offices or the Ministry of Labour Survey must be encouraged to include adequate questions on domestic work in any forthcoming labour surveys.
<b>ILO Administrative Issues (staff, resources, design, implementation)</b>	To address the plight of domestic workers, a form of mainstreaming is required, with facilitators and promoters of this category of workers in other sections of government and ILO. This requires training all staff on how to integrate this category of workers into other programmes and allowing for a focus on domestic workers in the administration of other programmes.

## ILO Lesson Learned 2

**Project Title: Making Decent Work a Reality for Domestic Workers**

**Project TC/SYMBOL: GLO/11/54/SID**

**Name of Evaluator: Una Murray      Date: 11.7.2014**

The following lesson learned has been identified during the course of the evaluation. Further text explaining the lesson may be included in the full evaluation report.

<b>LL Element</b>	<b>Text</b>
<b>Brief description of lesson learned (link to specific action or task)</b>	<p>A key success factor in many countries stems from an in-depth knowledge of political dimensions.</p> <p>In-depth and detailed knowledge of the policy process is essential for national work around domestic workers (and workers rights generally). This includes a knowledge of proper procedures, how to submit realistic and contextual advocacy and evidence based materials to Parliament, timing issues, knowledge of parliamentary committees and subgroups and an assessment of who would be sympatric to the plight of domestic workers.</p>
<b>Context and any related preconditions</b>	<p>Political leadership for a focus on domestic workers is necessary. This was essential to move drafts through the political institutions in the Philippines and Paraguay. Political support with ILO staff who are knowledgeable, astute and fast in providing inputs, facilitating a tripartite process, keeping partners on board (including stakeholders beyond tripartite partners and including NGOs advocates) and a public momentum to move the agenda forward.</p>
<b>Targeted users / Beneficiaries</b>	<p>Beneficiaries are ILO staff and domestic workers</p>
<b>Challenges /negative lessons - Causal factors</b>	<p>Workshops that share information on the policy process proved useful in Zambia for unions that represented domestic workers.</p> <p>For implementation of measures to improve the working conditions for domestic workers, precise attention to detail in the political provisions of a new law is important. Political support is required from many departments or ministries who must collaborate (see Lesson Learned 1). For example the issue of retro-payments for the registration of domestic workers was largely ignored when the Domestic Workers Act was being passed in the Philippines. This later proved to be a disincentive for employers to register their domestic workers. Another example was initially ignoring the actual mechanics of registering domestic workers in the required three separate social security offices (time consuming and thus a disincentive). A 'unified registration' system is now in place (one payment system is not yet in place). Thus whilst the policy formulation process attempts to address and cover most aspects of the Convention, it is very difficult to get it right without the benefit of implementation experiences and hindsight.</p>

<b>Success / Positive Issues - Causal factors</b>	ILO staff who have worked on this Project have a wealth of knowledge around policy processes and this knowledge should be used in future and in related programmes
<b>ILO Administrative Issues (staff, resources, design, implementation)</b>	Ensure ILO does not lose those staff who have knowledge of policy processes

### ILO Lesson Learned 3

**Project Title: Making Decent Work a Reality for Domestic Workers**

**Project TC/SYMBOL: GLO/11/54/SID**

**Name of Evaluator: Una Murray      Date: 11.7.2014**

The following lesson learned has been identified during the course of the evaluation. Further text explaining the lesson may be included in the full evaluation report.

<b>LL Element</b>	<b>Text</b>
<b>Brief description of lesson learned (link to specific action or task)</b>	<p>The effect of new ideas, concepts or ideology around the rights of domestic workers cannot be determined during a two-year period.</p> <p>Much work remains to establish domestic workers as workers in their own right. Cultural dimensions around domestic workers are deeply biased and hard to change.</p>
<b>Context and any related preconditions</b>	Shifting attitudes on Domestic Workers amongst the public takes time. For example India society has particular perceptions about domestic work that are difficult to alter, particularly because women from marginalised communities are those that perform domestic work. Even with regulation, implementation will be difficult unless there are good practices from different states that demonstrate operational experience.
<b>Targeted users / Beneficiaries</b>	ILO staff, constituents and Domestic Workers
<b>Challenges /negative lessons - Causal factors</b>	The short time frame of outcome based funding support make initiatives difficult to evaluate without knowledge of previous programmes and evaluations.

<p><b>Success / Positive Issues - Causal factors</b></p>	<p>It is interesting to compare cultural attitudes to domestic workers with attitudes towards child labourers 10 to 15 years ago (which has changed considerable in many countries). It can be argued that in 10 years ILO achieved a lot with regard to attitudes towards child labour in India (although of course much remains to be done on child labour).</p> <p>New knowledge brought in from the situation in-countries who are implementing measures to address domestic workers is very beneficial. The enthusiasm for a focus on domestic workers may not last infinitely, thus speedily obtaining examples of ways to approach this difficult category of informal and isolated workers is necessary.</p>
<p><b>ILO Administrative Issues (staff, resources, design, implementation)</b></p>	<p>Always plan for and budget for a longer term funding perspective with regard to decent work for domestic workers.</p>