

# International Labour Organization

# **Independent Final Evaluation**

# Project of Enhancing the Vocational Rehabilitation and Employment Services for People with Disabilities in Oman

OMA/06/01/AGF

**Final Report** 

Wael Zakkar April 2012 "Disability is not a brave struggle or courage in the face of adversity. Disability is an art. It's an ingenious way to live."

Neil Marcus

### **Sultanate of Oman**



### **Abbreviations List**

ΑΡ	Action Programme				
CL	Child Labour				
CLMS	Child Labour Monitoring System				
СР	Country Programme				
EFA	Education for All				
HCL	Hazardous Child Labour				
ILO	International Labour Organization				
IPEC	International Programme on Elimination of Child Labour				
MoSD	Ministry of Social Development				
ΜοΕ	Ministry of Education				
МоМ	Ministry of Manpower				
NGO	Non-Governmental Organization				
NPM	National Project Manager				
NSC	National Steering Committee				
OSH	Occupational Safety and Health				
PwD	People with Disability				
ROAS	Regional Office for Arab States				
UNICEF	United Nations Children's Fund				

# **Table of Contents**

Executiv	Executive Summary1				
	luation Background and Methodology				
2. Ma	in Findings	4			
2.1.	Relevance and Strategic Fit of the Project	4			
2.2.	Complementarity with other ILO Programmes and Projects in Oman	4			
3. Val	idity of the Design	5			
3.1.	Coherence and realism of the project's immediate objectives	5			
3.2.	Coherence and linkages between project activities, outputs, outcomes and objectives	5			
3.3.	Relevance of project indicators and means of verification	5			
3.4.	Project's contribution to shaping girls' rights priorities	5			
4. Pro	ject Progress and Effectiveness	6			
4.1.	Progress and Effectiveness in terms of outputs	6			
4.2.	Components of the project that had the greatest achievements	9			
4.3.	Progress in terms of Gender mainstreaming	9			
4.4.	Unplanned results	.10			
5. Ade	equacy and Efficiency of the Resources Used	.10			
5.1.	Adequacy of the resources allocated	.10			
5.2.	Efficiency of the Resources Used	.10			
6. Ma	nagement Arrangements	.10			
6.1.	Project management structure, coordination and implementation mechanisms	.10			
6.2.	Participatory approach, partnership enhancing and network building	.11			
6.3.	Monitoring and Evaluation Mechanisms	. 12			
6.4.	Capacity of the Project to deal with Constraints and Obstacles	.12			
7. Sus	tainability and Legacy	.12			
7.1.	National ownership	.12			
7.2.	Institutionalization and standardization	.13			
7.3.	Leadership Capacity Building	.13			
7.4.	Capacity of National and Local Partners to Maintain the Project Benefits.	.13			
7.5.	Good Practices and Success Stories	.13			
8. Cor	nstraints and Opportunities	.13			
8.1.	Constraints	.13			
8.2.	International classification of disability not adopted	.14			

	8.3.	Lack of awareness and information about different disability issues	14
9.	Орр	ortunities	15
	9.1.	Oman is entering a new era	15
	9.2.	Legal frameworks in favour of PwD	15
	9.3.	Success stories were registered which could serve as a model	15
	9.4.	Self Employment	15
10	). Le	essons Learned	16
	10.1. develo	The vocational rehabilitation of PwD in Oman is weak and at an early stappent	-
	10.2.	The absence of a coordinating steering body is a serious challenge	16
	10.3. the em	Communication and advocacy are key aspects in enhancing vocational rehabilitation ployment of PwD	
	10.4.	A gender dimension was not explicit within the project	16
	10.5.	The placement of PwD should not be considered as the end of the process	17
11	L. Re	ecommendations	17
A	opendix	1: List of Persons Interviewed	25
A	opendix	2: List of Key Documents Reviewed	26
A	opendix	3: Mapping Matrix	28
A	opendix	4: List of International Conventions and Standards	30
A	opendix	5: Evaluation TOR	31

#### **Executive Summary**

The issue of vocational rehabilitation and promotion of employment for PwD is complex as it involves many facets, including the type and extent of disability, rehabilitation structure, vocational rehabilitation, labour laws and practices, societal and employer attitudes, civil rights laws, labour market trends and so forth. In other words it is an issue that is located at the nexus of social convention and labour market activity.

On this basis, the project of "Enhancing the Vocational Rehabilitation and Employment Services for People with Disabilities in the Sultanate of Oman" aimed to implement a number of multidimensional interventions, both upstream and downstream, in order to improve the situation of vocational rehabilitation and employment infrastructure and services for PwD. Some of the interventions implemented aimed to improve the infrastructure, assessment and vocational rehabilitation services, and employment of PwD, whereas others targeted policy development and improvement in legislation and systems for the placement, employment or self-employment of PwD.

Despite the ambition that marked the project, it has faced a number of constraints, starting with a long delay before implementation began in January 2009. Other constraints emerged during the implementation due to the absence of any horizontal coordinating entity among the different ministries and local stakeholders (the failure of the high committee on disability and its related subcommittee for vocational rehabilitation and employment). The non-renewal of the CTA contract and his departure in January 2010 after one year of monitoring of the project implementation raised also a big challenge. The project also faced a general lack of awareness about different disability issues, and a lack of solid data and information about disability.

However, in terms of implementation, the project did bring about important achievements, mainly in terms of mapping and analyzing the available infrastructure, services and complementary services in the domain of vocational rehabilitation and employment of PwD. The project also established the basis for a national structure for the administration and placement of PwD.

Moreover, significant added value was instituted by the project at the level of capacity building and the empowerment of national Omani human resources through:

Building the capacity of directors and government representatives on strategies and mechanisms to integrate PwD into the labour market.

Building the capacity of staff, trainers and managers in vocational rehabilitation centers on principles of the vocational rehabilitation of PwD.

Strengthening the directors of the 22 Al Wafaa community-based rehabilitation centers on vocational rehabilitation of PwD.

Significant progress has been noted in the building of bridges with the private sector and in exploring the potential for partnership with industrial companies in order to implement initiatives aimed at the wide the employment of PwD. Progress was also evident in the conceptualization of the specialized vocational assessment unit structure.

While raising these significant project achievements, it is important not to disregard other areas where less progress was in evidence, specifically: in the development of a five-year national plan for the placement and employment of PwD, and in the development of a system of advanced employment loans and credit for PwD.

However, taken together, the areas where there was limited progress and those with significant progress yielded tangible lessons learned. These can be summed up as follows:

- 1. The vocational rehabilitation of PwD in Oman remains weak and is at an early stage of development; there is an urgent need to reconsider the existing structure of vocational rehabilitation of PwD.
- 2. The absence of a coordinating steering body presents serious challenges; the high national committee and the vocational training and employment sub-committee must either be dynamized, or a national council for disability must be established as a horizontal coordinative/executive body.
- 3. A gender dimension requires particular focus in terms of the vocational rehabilitation and employment of PwD, given the low number of female PwD who are either employed or integrated into vocational rehabilitation programmes.
- 4. The work placement of PwD should not be considered to be the final step; it is necessary to establish a follow-up section within the employment office, with responsibility for regular, individualized and a posteriori follow-up of cases of employed PwD.

Moreover, it will be necessary to consider:

The adoption of the WHO International Classification of Disability (ICF) as the standard for the classification of category and degree of disability, to be used by all programmes of vocational rehabilitation and employment of PwD.

Reinforcing the trade union in defending the rights of working PwD, and reinforcing the role of the Employers' Union/Chamber of Commerce in activating the employment of PwD in the private sector.

However, regardless of all of the elements described above, policies and interventions which seek to create a more equitable labour market for PwD will be consistently hindered by a lack of information about the needs of disabled people. It is essential to carry out assessments of PwD in Oman in general and of their employment conditions in particular, and to periodically compile quantitative and qualitative data related to PwD, their integration into economic life, and their participation in the labour market. Without such data it is impossible to ensure awareness of the scale of the problem or to allow the government to take appropriate measures. Such data would also be elementary in the monitoring and evaluation of project implementation.

The evaluation concludes that further technical support is required to advance towards concrete progress in improving the situation of vocational rehabilitation and employment of PwD in Oman. Moreover, there is now a sense of momentum in the country, as Oman has entered a new era following certain social problems which occurred, as concretized by the election of new consultative national and senatorial councils and the nomination of a new government with an agenda of accelerating the country's development path with close follow-up from the Sultan's office. It is necessary to use this momentum to launch a new phase of the project in order to advance towards the expected progress mentioned above in improving the rehabilitation and employment of PwD. Such a new phase should take the constraints and lessons of the previous phase into account, and adopt new concepts in terms of planning, design, management, use of a participatory approach, and monitoring and evaluation.

# 1. Evaluation Background and Methodology

The Final Independent Evaluation of the Project of Enhancing the Vocational Rehabilitation and Employment Services for People with Disabilities in the Sultanate of Oman assessed the results of the project under the six headings of Relevance and Strategic Fit, Validity of Project Design, Progress and Effectiveness, Efficiency of Resource Use, Effectiveness of Management Arrangements and Sustainability. A set of evaluation questions was drawn up with the purpose of drawing conclusions about the success of the project in terms of its dual strategy approach: enhancing vocational rehabilitation and employment services for PwD and developing public policies and mechanisms for the rehabilitation and employment of PwD.

The aims of the evaluation are as follows, as identified in the ToRs:

- <u>Aim a:</u> Provide a clear articulation of the main achievements and findings of the project.
- <u>Aim b:</u> Assess the success of implementing the project activities, and identify activities which as yet have not been implemented, and to suggest ways and timings for their implementation before the end of the current phase of the project.
- <u>Aim c:</u> Provide a clear analysis of the project's context, and articulate the main challenges and the factors contributing to its success.
- <u>Aim d:</u> Provide a clear analysis of the projects' partners and how they took ownership of the project, and recommend partnerships, communication and collaboration methods for future project implementations.
- <u>Aim e:</u> Assess current impacts and the sustainability of project activities; where possible, identify evidence of pathways and indicators of long-term impact.
- <u>Aim f:</u> Provide recommendations to enhance the ILO's efforts to support vocational rehabilitation and employment services for PwD in Oman.
- <u>Aim g:</u> Based on the potential recommendations and national priorities, support the expansion of the project while adjusting the objectives, deliverables and activities based on this project evaluation.

The evaluation was based on an initial desk review (see annex 2) and interviews with ILO Regional Office programme officers followed by field visits, and a series of interviews with stakeholders (see annex 1). It used a Results-Based, Human Rights-Based and gender-sensitive approach. It referred to specific ILO norms while taking into consideration the United Nations Evaluation Group standards as well as those of the quality evaluation of the OECD/DAC.

The evaluation tackled the various stakeholders relevant to the project, and took each of their strengths, weaknesses, capacities, comparative advantages and perspectives into account; it attempted to assess the extent to which each of these stakeholders had a positive effect, within a Theory of Change, on the long-term goal of enhancing the vocational rehabilitation and employment services for PwD in Oman.

# 2. Main Findings

# 2.1. Relevance and Strategic Fit of the Project

### Extent of harmony with national and local development needs and plans.

The issue of the rehabilitation and employment of PwD in Oman has been one of the priorities for intervention for the past decade for both the Ministry of Social Development and the Ministry of Manpower (both ministries used to form a single institutional body: the Ministry of Social Development and Manpower). Although an integrated vision and a holistic approach has not yet fully maturated, nonetheless several important efforts and initiatives promoting the improved integration of PwD in the labor market have gradually been launched. These efforts entered phase of intensification and acceleration after Oman's ratification of the UN Convention on the Rights of People with Disabilities in January 2009. As a result, more efforts were made to meet the obligations related to signature of the convention and its national implementation. These efforts were mainly concretized in legislation, and at the level of mechanisms to improve the living conditions of PwD and to provide them with equal opportunities in education, health, rehabilitation and access to employment opportunities. In the vocational rehabilitation and employment of PwD, although some progress was registered, Oman still faces real challenges. According to the statistics of the Ministry of Social Development, only 154 Omani PwD are working out of a total estimates of between 500 to 600 job seekers with disabilities\*. The number of job seekers itself is still limited when compared to estimates of the population over 18 years of age with disabilities who are capable of working with some degree of support (The Ministry of Social Development state this number to be at 10,122 persons in June 2011 based on the data compiled through the total disability cards delivered by MoSD to Omani PwD). These indicators clearly demonstrate the need for technical assistance to improve the actual employability and employment conditions of PwD in Oman.

It also must be borne in mind that this project takes place within the context of the "Omanization" policy that has been adopted by the government, which consists of increasingly replacing expatriate staff with Omani Citizens in a number of economic sectors. This policy will obviously be translated into an increasing demand for an Omani labour force that could include PwD.

# 2.2. Complementarity with other ILO Programmes and Projects in Oman

A technical cooperation framework was developed and implemented between ILO and the Sultanate of Oman in the area of Decent Work for the years 2003-2009. The Memorandum of Understanding focused on:

- MoSD was enabled to provide the exact number at the time of the evaluation
- Employment and labour market policies and labour statistics
- Vocational education training policy development and skills development
- Small and micro enterprise development
- Social Protection
- ILS (mainly declaration)

A comprehensive Decent Work country programme was formulated for the years 2010-2013 in response to the request of the government through the Ministry of Manpower as well as different social partners, primarily employers' and workers' organizations. Three priorities were defined for this Decent Work country programme: Enhancing the integration of the national labour force into the economy, ensuring the effectiveness of the social dialogue in compliance with ILS, and enhancing social protection. These orientations in general represent common ground with the project of enhancing vocational and employment services for PwD. The first priority in particular includes four

outcomes, among them an outcome "Strengthened TVET sector and employment services for enhancing the employability of Omanis including PwD" with a specific output of developing policies and services for the rehabilitation and employment of vulnerable groups, with a focus on People with Disabilities and women. A specific key performance indicator was defined as number of services developed and operational for enhanced access to the labour market for disabled people. While mentioning these outcome outputs and indicators for follow-up, the programme document mentioned the fact that ILO will continue to implement the technical cooperation project of "Enhancing the Vocational Rehabilitation and Employment Services for People with Disabilities". In other words, the Decent Work Programme represents as formulated, a framework that encompasses the project of enhancing the Vocational Rehabilitation and Employment services for People with Disabilities". However, in terms of implementation, the independent evaluation found no clear evidence that such complementarities were translated in terms of implementation and monitoring and evaluation of the project and DWCP. A possible explanation is that there is a different key partner for each intervention (the Ministry of Manpower for the Decent Work country programme, and the Ministry of Social Development for the PwD vocational and employment services project).

# 3. Validity of the Design

# **3.1.** Coherence and realism of the project's immediate objectives

Two immediate objectives were fixed for the project: 1- Enhancing vocational rehabilitation and employment services for PwD by investing in local resources and established facilities of the government and non-governmental sectors. 2-Developing public policies, strategies, mechanisms and plans for the rehabilitation and employment of PwD. The two objectives are coherent and in line with existing national needs at both the upstream and downstream levels. They also meet national needs in terms of policy, mechanisms, services and facilities for the vocational rehabilitation and employment of PwD.

# **3.2.** Coherence and linkages between project activities, outputs, outcomes and objectives

Each of the immediate objectives included a number of outputs, but activities were not specified. As for the outputs, it is noted that most of were coherent with the immediate objective. We can note the exception of the output 3.2.2 of "Technical structure of the employment offices of the Ministry of Manpower strengthened to provide guidance and placement services and follow-up of placement and employment of people with disability" should instead have been included as an output of Immediate Objective 1, on enhancing vocational rehabilitation and employment services for PwD, not an output of the Immediate Objective 2 on developing public policy etc.

# 3.3. Relevance of project indicators and means of verification

No concrete indicators in terms of impact or outcomes were defined for monitoring implementation progress. No baselines and no amounted objectives were defined. The project was designed as output-oriented. That might be argued for in this phase, as the project aims to cover a vacuum in certain areas in terms of infrastructure and services. However, in future phases it is necessary for the project design to include a structure of indicators for follow-up in terms of immediate objectives, outputs and activities.

# **3.4. Project's contribution to shaping girls' rights priorities**

A gender dimension was not explicitly incorporated into the project document, either in terms of the project's justification or in terms of immediate objectives and outputs. No gender analysis or data

disaggregated by sex was included in the introduction to the project. The strategic gender needs of PwD were not mentioned in terms of vocational rehabilitation and employment.

# 4. Project Progress and Effectiveness

#### 4.1. Progress and Effectiveness in terms of outputs

**Immediate Objective 1:** Enhancing vocational rehabilitation and employment services for people with disabilities by investing in local resources and the established facilities of both government and non-government sectors.

**1.1** Evaluation report and situation analysis of the placement and vocational rehabilitation programme completed; assessment of available resources and structures, with appropriate recommendations for improvements;

A situation analysis has been implemented by the project CTA and the national project director. It mapped the existing vocational services and infrastructures for PwD. Different categories of rehabilitation centre were described; this was combined with an analysis of their strength and weaknesses. The report also included an analysis of the various complementary services provided by different ministries, including pre-rehabilitation services at the Ministry of Education, as well as the Ministry of Agriculture. The report also tackled the role played by civil society, in addition to the various existing initiatives and programmes to support business and self-employment. The report did not comprehensively tackle the existing employment mechanisms that have been adopted by the Ministry of Social Development and the Ministry of Manpower, nor did it examine the coordination mechanisms between these ministries. However, general constraints were described and constructive recommendations on how to improve the system as a whole were provided.

**1.2** Establishment of specialized vocational assessment units at vocational rehabilitation centres for vocational guidance, training and employment.

No assessment unit has been established, either at the Ministry of Social Development or the Ministry of Manpower. The argument of the Ministry of Social Development is that such a unit should be established in Al Khodh Centre. As the latter needs rehabilitation, this activity has been postponed. However, an ILO expert has implemented a mission within the context of the project, at the end of which a proposal was developed regarding a national vocational assessment programme for PwD. The proposal recommended the implementation of this vocational assessment programme in three stages; the first in some vocational training centres, the second in all vocational training centres operating under the Ministry of Manpower, and the third in all institutes under the Ministry of Social Development (such as the Wafaa centres). According to the proposal, the first stage must be implemented in private factories.

**1.3** Enhanced vocational rehabilitation and training programmes from the Ministry of Manpower, with technical capacities to assist in seeking advanced vocational training in line with labour market needs;

This output should be concretized at two levels: at the upstream, at the Ministry of Manpower, by building the capacity of this ministry and establishing a proper mechanism to enable the ministry to set and re-set the orientation and content of vocational training for PwD, as dispensed in the different vocational centres of the ministry in line with the needs of the labour market. This output should also be concretised at the downstream level, at the different vocational centres, through the proper provision of vocational training programmes to PwD, thereby putting the orientation and directives of the Ministry of Manpower into practise.

In terms of effectiveness, it is noted that no action has been undertaken at the upstream level mentioned above. At the downstream level of the vocational centres, capacity building and training activities on the principles of vocational training for PwD were implemented for the staff of the Care

and Rehabilitation Center for Disabled of the Ministry of Social Development. Three others were implemented for the staff of three vocational training centres of the Ministry of Manpower (Al Sib Center, Sour Center and Ebri Center). Each of the five training sessions took five days and it tackled different categories of disability and various sorts of rehabilitation. Trainings were attended by 12 participants for the Care and Rehabilitation Center for Disabled, whereas those for the vocational training centers were attended by 51 participants (15 participants from the Sib Center, 16 from Sour Center and 20 for Ebri Center). The participants included teachers and vocational training and employment services for PwD was implemented for 17 job counsellors and occupational guidance specialists from employment offices on job counselling and occupational guidance principles for People with Disability.

This training is a first step, serving as an introductory activity and introducing staff at the rehabilitation centres to notions about vocational training for PwD. However, from the perspective of building the capacity of the trainers and teachers at the rehabilitation centres to deal with vocational trainees with disabilities, a 5 days training session is absolutely insufficient. More specific, longer training sessions that are tailored to particular types of disability are required. Such trainings should be provided by a specialized expert in the specific type of disability in question. Specific guidelines and materials relating to specific disabilities should be provided to the trainers at each vocational centre (for example, guidelines on hearing and speech disabilities for vocational training, other guidelines for physical disabilities, etc.). It is also necessary to envisage on-the-job coaching for vocational centre trainers for an extended period. This coaching should be provided by the specialized expert/trainer mentioned above on how to dispense quality vocational training to vocational trainees with disabilities.

Furthermore, such training requires developing a specific vocational training package on the nature of vocational training and on specific disabilities, in a manner that is well adapted to the needs of people with disabilities. Such a training package should be developed in a standardized manner at the upstream level of the Ministry of Manpower. This ministry should officially adopt each package and orient the five different vocational centres to implement this package vis-à-vis their vocational trainees with disabilities.

**Immediate Objective 2**: Developing public policies, strategies, mechanisms and plans for the rehabilitation and employment of PwD.

**2.1**- An effective national structure adopted for the administration, coordination and organization of government and non-government efforts and inputs in the field of placement and employment of PwD.

Progress has been registered in this output; a focal point for the employment of PwD has been designated in each governorate as well as in the Ministry of Education. However, work is still required in terms of the reinforcement of this structure, to ensure that it is well adapted to the Omani realities of how PwD are rehabilitated and employed. Action is also necessary in terms of the establishment and institutionalization of monitoring and evaluation mechanisms to supervise how different cases are employed. Horizontal extension of the existing network of focal points is required, to include other related ministries such as the Ministry of Agriculture/Directorate of Rural Women, the Ministry of Information, and the National Office of Statistics. Vertical extension is also required in terms of the selection and capacity building of lower level line administrators within the Ministry of Labor and the Ministry of Social Affairs, as well as focal points in all of the rehabilitation and employment centers related to each ministry. Moreover, additional work is required in the preparation of the Terms of Reference for the different focal points and for the national structure.

**2.2** Technical structure of the employment offices of the Ministry of Manpower strengthened to provide guidance and placement services, and follow-up on the placement and employment of PwD.

A position of PwD Employment Coordinator has officially been defined and adopted. The position is supposed to be filled by a civil servant from the Ministry of Social Development who will work in the Ministry of Manpower for three days each week, in order to provide guidance and ensure follow-up on the cases of job seekers with disabilities. Civil servants were designated to fill that position at the central level, as well as at the local level of each governorate. For the purpose of monitoring, intensive field visits to the different Oman governorates were implemented by the National Programme Director/National director of PwD employment coordination, supervising the work of the different employment coordinators in each governorate, and ensuring that proper networking took place with the private sector. The field visits also aimed to verify the extent that the quota of 2%, fixed by the government for the employment of PwD in companies with more than 50 persons, was applied.

**2.3**- An advanced employment loan and credit system for the development of various forms of employment programmes for PwD.

Two major national programmes of credit for business development and supporting selfemployment and entrepreneurship already exist (Mawared Al Rezk and Sanad). The project implementation did not bring additional added value in that domain.

**2.4** Develop clear and recognized instructions, guidelines, and rules for activating governmental legislation in the field of the rehabilitation and employment of PwD.

An overall review of current legislation and laws has been implemented by the CTA and the project manager, focusing on PwD in general and vocational rehabilitation and employment in particular. Recommendations for activating government legislation were included in the situation analysis document. However, such a review required the support of specific legal technical mission, to be implemented by a specialized legal technical expert. This would have consisted of a deep legal review of actual Omani legislation in relation to PwD, and a comparison with various international conventions (Annex 4: list of international conventions on PwD). It should also have included meetings with the legal departments in the Ministry of Social Development and the Ministry of Manpower, but also in the Ministry of Justice, with legal experts, and with associations for PwD.

**2.5** Develop advanced national mechanisms for funding the disability programme and activities targeted at enhancing the rehabilitation and employment opportunities of PwD.

Two meetings were held by the project CTA with the officials of the SANAD Programme to support small enterprises as well as the Mawared Al Rizk project that provides interest-free loans. However, no concrete progress has been achieved as there was no continuation of action beyond the two meetings held.

**2.6** Develop a clear five-year national plan for the placement and employment of PwD.

Some work has been initiated by jointly the CTA and the National Project Manager through drafting some aspects of the five-year plan. But it was neither concretized at the technical level nor at the participatory level with different local partners.

**2.7** Develop national human resources that are strengthened and capable of providing rehabilitation and employment services for PwD.

As mentioned previously in point 2.1, capacity building activities took place through the implementation of:

• Five training workshops for the staff and trainers of the five vocational centres of the Ministry of Manpower.

- A study tour and training at the ILO institute in Turin on the labour-market inclusion of PwD, for a selected team of 12 members including the national chief of employment of PwD, seven PwD national and local employment coordinators, representatives from the Ministry of Education, the Ministry of Civil Service, and the Ministry of Manpower, and a vocational rehabilitation specialist from the Al Khodh rehabilitation centre.
- A three day training workshop on vocational rehabilitation and the employment of PwD for 22 directors of the Wafaa centers.
- A study tour to Germany for government representatives from the Sultanate of Oman is under preparation, to attain knowledge on the German experience with integrating people with disabilities into the workforce. It focuses particularly on practical methods and mechanisms to generate work and provide jobs for PwD. It also aims to gain knowledge about how German enterprises and organizations set up employment systems and procedures for diagnosing, profiling, training and promoting PwD. Finally it has a purpose of strengthening the capacity of participants to conceptualize and implement policies, programmes and practices on the labour-market inclusion of PwD.

**2.8** Develop an interchangeable relationship with the private sector through the Oman Chamber of Commerce and Industry and vocational committees.

Field visits were implemented by the national project director and the project CTA to Al Ruseil Industrial zone as well as a number of industrial companies in the governorates of Al Sharkieh, Dakhliah, Zofar and Al Batinah. These visits aimed at exploring the extent that the quota mentioned above was either applied through the channels of employment offices or through contacts with local disability organizations, but also explored perspectives on building partnerships with the private sector in the placement of a number of PwD, to create success stories on a win-win basis.

### 4.2. Components of the project that had the greatest achievements

The implementation of the situation analysis of rehabilitation and employment services for PwD is the project component that provided the most important achievement. This situation analysis resulted in a constructive report that could be used in future planning and policy conceptualization.

The area of building the capacity of national human resources also revealed the existence of significant activities and efforts, mainly through the organization of the study tour and the training at the ILO institute in Turin. Participants in that training revealed important added value and the acquisition of important technical knowledge.

The field visits to some industrial companies, as well as to the industrial zone of Al Ruseil, also resulted in useful findings and constructive recommendations on improving advocacy and enhancing cooperation with the private sector in the employment of PwD.

#### 4.3. **Progress in terms of Gender mainstreaming**

Gender mainstreaming was a focus during the implementation of the project. The situation analysis of vocational and rehabilitation services tackled the beneficiaries of existing services in terms of gender. The report also raised the point that females are to a wide extent not really benefitting from the programmes of the Ministry of Manpower's vocation rehabilitation centres. The project management established contacts with the Directorate of Rural Women in the Ministry of Agriculture, and perspectives on cooperation were discussed. Furthermore, during the implementation of the project, female Omani civil servants, technicians and directors benefitted from the training and capacity building activities of the project. For example, 6 among the 12 participants from the Care and Rehabilitation Center for Disabled who benefited from the training on vocational training for PwD were female. 5 among the 17 Job counselors who benefited from the training and occupational guidance were also female. However, it is to be noted

that the female participation in the training in Torino was weak (2 female among 12 participants) and that there was non-female participation in the three training workshops that were implemented for three vocational centers (Al Sib, Sour and Ebri) where among the total 51 participants in the training not one single female participated. This was due to the weak employment of female within these centers reflecting the requirement for a serious effort from the ministry of manpower in terms of mainstreaming gender within these vocational centers.

# 4.4. Unplanned results

No concrete unplanned results from the implementation of the project were reported or revealed to the independent evaluation.

# 5. Adequacy and Efficiency of the Resources Used

# 5.1. Adequacy of the resources allocated

To implement the project, a total sum of US \$700,000 was allocated: US \$300,000 was allocated by the Arab Gulf Programme for the United Nations Development Organization (AGFUND), and US \$400,0000 was a contribution in kind from the Omani government. The AGFUND contribution was transferred to the ILO project budget through a special agreement between the two parties. According to the terms of this agreement, the AGFUND contribution was intended to fund the two project phases, with US \$150,000 provided for each phase. This AGFUND contribution was primarily intended to cover the cost of the international and local expertise required to complete each phase of the project. In the first phase, this was mainly intended to cover the fees of the Chief Technical Adviser, and to fund a limited proportion of the training provided to local staff.

In terms of adequacy, given the ambition of the project and its horizontal areas of intervention, it can be noted that the resources allocated were highly limited and restricted. They were not sufficient to meet the project objectives or the activities related to the project, as most of the donor contribution was allocated to fund the expertise of various missions and support.

# 5.2. Efficiency of the Resources Used

The resources were used according to fixed budget lines, with components jointly programmed in advance by the ILO and the Ministry of Social Development. However, some minor transfers took place among some budget lines, to meet specific needs related to the implementation of certain activities or technical mission assignments.

# 6. Management Arrangements

# 6.1. Project management structure, coordination and implementation mechanisms

The structure of implementation of the project was based on an international Chief Technical Adviser (CTA), who was appointed by ILO for one year in consultation with the Ministry of Social Development. The structure also includes a National Project Director who is the Director of employment of PwD, and has been designated by the Ministry of Social Development. The CTA started his assignment in January 2009 and finished in January 2010 as his contract was not renewed. After his departure the National Project Director assumed the management and monitoring of the project.

Seven employment coordinators for PwD were appointed by the Ministry of Social Development to work on the project in seven governorates. Both the CTA and the National Project Director benefited

from the support and assistance of many staff of the Ministry of Social Development on different occasions.

No tripartite committee or steering committee was set up. The existence of no joint thematic working groups involving of other stakeholders was made known to the evaluation.

# 6.2. Participatory approach, partnership enhancing and network building

The project was implemented through close cooperation between the ILO and the Ministry of Social Development, with the involvement of the Ministry of Manpower. However, beyond these three parties, it is notable that a non-tripartite approach was adopted, and there was no involvement of either the labour union or the employers' union (the Chamber of Commerce and Industry). Furthermore, the implementation of the project did not include representatives of PwD groups. Nor did the project manage to coordinate with other resident UN agencies, such as UNICEF and UNFPA, which have an interest in PwD and are involved in various interventions in this area.

The implementation of the project was an opportunity to recognize national stakeholders involved in the arena of disability, rehabilitation and the employment of PwD. This mainly took place through the implementation of the situation analysis of rehabilitation and employment services for PwD that was implemented within the framework of the project. Capacity building activities also provided an opportunity to build bridges and ties with the vocational centers of the Ministry of Manpower and the Wafa rehabilitation centers network that are dispersed across the different governorates of Oman. The monitoring field visits implemented by the national director to supervise the performance of the PwD employment coordinators in the different governorates were an opportunity to open channels of coordination with the private sector, especially industrial companies that could eventually employ a number of PwD.

Given the effective time of project implementation (almost one year), it would be difficult to expect a higher level of partnership building. However, in future phases of implementation, it will be necessary to:

- 1. Activate coordination and cooperation with the national and local chambers of commerce, as the leading entities of the private sector. This activation is required in order to better harmonize cooperation with the private sector as a whole, to promote better performance in the employment of PwD in that sector. This is also necessary bearing in mind that many private sector companies are not aware of the quota of 2% employment of PwD for companies with more than 50 staff that is required by law. Moreover, many employers are not aware of the comparative technical advantages of employing certain categories of PwD that could be reflected in specific productivity gains, higher performance and added value for the company. In other words, they are not aware of the win-win aspect of employment of PwD.
- 2. Build partnerships with the Ministry of Information and the media in order to promote the rehabilitation and employment of PwD. In fact, real action is urgently required in this area, as a wide bracket of Omani PwD and their families are still not aware of the right to work of PwD, or are still hesitant or unconvinced about the concept of employment for PwD and its benefits to their well being. This was revealed by several interviews with PwD carried out during the independent evaluation, which exposed a vacuum and the need for the prioritization of an intensive awareness-raising campaign and behavior change. In this regard, it is worth bearing in mind that there were absolutely no TV spots or public campaigns organized to promote the right to employment of PwD or to showcase individual success stories.
- 3. Enhance the partnership with local NGOs active in the area of disability. In Oman the leading NGO in that area is the Oman Association for PwD. Others are also active. In any

future phase of implementation it will be necessary to ensure cooperation with these NGOs, but it will also be important to work on providing support to them in:

- a) Improving their capacity to play a further active and constructive role in the area of vocational rehabilitation and the employment of PwD
- b) Strengthening their relationship with public institutions, vocational rehabilitation centers and public employment services.

#### 6.3. Monitoring and Evaluation Mechanisms

The project document, "Enhancing the vocational rehabilitation and employment services for people with disabilities in the Sultanate of Oman", included a definition of immediate objectives and major related outputs, but did not include a definition of indicators for follow-up. Moreover, contrary to ILO procedures for project preparation, the project document did not include a plan/section on project monitoring and evaluation. This should usually include details on reporting mechanisms, periodicity, the process by which the project should be monitored, and the specific evaluations planned.

In terms of activities of monitoring and evaluation actually implemented, the following is noted:

- a) Field visits by the national project director to the various Omani governorates took place, to inspect the performance of the employment coordinators for PwD
- b) Country visits were made to Oman by ILO Regional Office staff
- c) A progress report and final reports were prepared by the Expert/Chief Technical Adviser of the project.

#### 6.4. Capacity of the Project to deal with Constraints and Obstacles

The main constraint dealt with by the project during implementation was the national counterpart's delay in providing the required logistical facilities (premises and transportation) for project implementation. Although this input was well defined as a government contribution to the project, there was a delay of three months before appropriate office accommodation was provided for the Chief Technical Adviser and before transportation facilities were made available. A weakness in the capacity of the project to resolve this issue must be noted in this regard. On one hand, the CTA did not immediately report this issue to the regional office in order that they could take action vis-à-vis the national governmental counterpart to expedite the provision of logistical support. On the other hand, once the ILO regional office were informed of the situation much later, no formal approach was taken to resolve that issue, but an informal approach was adopted instead; no official letter was sent by the ILO to the national counterpart urging action to provide facilities for the project in line with the terms of the project document. It was only after the visit of an ILO regional office delegation that this issue was resolved.

# 7. Sustainability and Legacy

The evaluation of sustainability is based on the following factors:

#### 7.1. National ownership

National ownership of the project was evidenced by the fact that responsibility for project design was shared with the key national counterpart (the Ministry of Social Development). Government contribution, although in kind, represented 57% of the total project budget. The international expert/Chief Technical Adviser of the project was contracted based on the approval of this ministry (however, it is noted that only one expert's name was suggested by the ILO, and in future phases, it is necessary for several options to be suggested). A national project director was appointed by the

Ministry of Social Development from ministry personnel to work jointly with the international CTA. Office accommodation within the ministry compound was provided to the project unit for use of the CTA and NPD. Progress reports and feedback relating to the implementation of the different project activities were provided to both the Ministry of Social Development and the ILO.

# 7.2. Institutionalization and standardization

Progress in terms of institutionalization was concretized through the setting up of an effective national structure for the coordination of governmental and non-governmental efforts, at the level that coordinators for the placement and employment of PwD were designated in each governorate.

# 7.3. Leadership Capacity Building

The different training sessions implemented included the study tour/training at the ILO centre in Turin for the national director and the various employment coordinators in the governorate, in addition to the director of special education in the Ministry of Education. A study tour for various national directors and government representatives is being prepared, to take place in Germany. The intention is to build capacity on strategies and mechanisms to integrate PwD in the labour market.

It is also notable that the directors of the five vocational centres of the Ministry of Manpower attended five-day training on the principles of vocational training for PwD.

# 7.4. Capacity of National and Local Partners to Maintain the Project Benefits.

Significant technical progress has been revealed to the evaluation. This took place at the level of the structure of the reception of PwD willing to integrate in the labour market, the registration of data, mediation with the private sector and the arrangement of job interviews and placements of PwD. However, it will be necessary for this structure to be reinforced in terms of the institutional capacity for follow-up with the PwD employed on an individual basis.

In terms of vocational assessment, a vacuum still exists, whereas in terms of vocational rehabilitation for PwD, existing capacity is still limited. Reconsideration of the actual structure is required (see Recommendations section).

It was noted that there is strong political will to generally upgrade the situation of Omani PwD, and particularly their vocational rehabilitation and engagement in the labour market. This is concretized by a capacity to issue decrees, and to support them with the allocation of the budgetary funds required to overcome various challenges. The recent Sultan's decree on the transformation of the different 22 Wafaa Centers to public institutions under the responsibility of the Ministry of Social Development is a concrete example.

# 7.5. Good Practices and Success Stories

The implementation of the project has not yet led to concrete good practices being developed that could be raised to the upstream level. Continuity of the project combined with reconsideration of the approaches used are needed to lead to good practices and success stories, that could eventually be transformed into policies.

# 8. Constraints and Opportunities

# 8.1. Constraints

Absence of a horizontal coordinating entity among the different ministries with regard to the vocational rehabilitation and employment of PwD: In fact, a high national committee for PwD has been created in order to ensure the supervision of the disability portfolio and ensure coordination among the different national stakeholders concerned. The committee has the minister of social

development as chairperson, and its members include: the deputy ministers of social development, manpower, information, transportation, communication, education and health. It also included the chairperson of the Oman Chamber of Commerce. Several committees were established from that steering committee; on education, health, professional rehabilitation and placement, transportation and information.

Several sub-committees were also established, among them a sub-committee for vocational training and employment. However, unfortunately neither the steering committee nor the sub-committee functioned properly; no meetings took place in the last three years after the inauguration meeting.

Weakness of harmony and complementarity of action among different stakeholders concerned and initiatives in the area of disability: Actually it is worth noting that considerable effort was made in Oman in the area of disability, rehabilitation and employment. However, due to the absence of a horizontal coordinating entity, weaknesses were evident in terms of coordination between various stakeholders and initiatives. This lack of coordination is most concrete in the relationship between the Ministry of Social Development and Ministry of Manpower, at the level of the integration of PwD in the Ministry of Manpower's vocational centers. This lack of coordination is relevant in the coordination between the Ministry of Education and the Ministry of Social Development in the domain of pre-vocational rehabilitation. This weakness is again pertinent in the relationship with the Oman Chamber of Commerce, in coordination with the Private sector, and with the Ministry of Information in terms of national advocacy. Finally this weakness is concretized in the limited coordination between NGOs active in the area of disability.

# 8.2. International classification of disability not adopted

The International Classification of Functioning, Disability and Health, known more commonly as the ICF, is a classification that was set up by the World Health Organization to provide a standard language for classifying health and changes in body function and structure. The classification is based on two lists: a list of body functions and structure, and a list of domains of activity and participation. Since an individual's functioning and disability occurs within a context, the ICF also includes a list of environmental factors. The ICF was officially endorsed by all 191 WHO Member States in the Fifty-fourth World Health Assembly on 22 May 2001 for use in Member States as the international standard for describing and measuring health and disability. Although the Sultanate of Oman was among the countries that endorsed the ICF, they have not adopted this classification as the basis for the classification of disability. It has not so far been used as a basis for setting policies or programmes related to the vocational rehabilitation and employment of PwD. It has not yet been used in the national census and statistical systems as the basis for classification of PwD.

# 8.3. Lack of awareness and information about different disability issues

Despite the progress that has been witnessed in Oman, a lack of awareness still exists in public opinion, among some decision makers, and in the private sector, as well as among PwD about the rights of PwD to vocational rehabilitation and employment. This is reflected in the wide failure to apply the quota of 2% for the employment of PwD in companies with more than 50 persons in Oman. It is also reflected in the fact that many Omani PwD and their parents are hesitant about the idea of engaging in vocational rehabilitation and searching for jobs. Sometimes a lack of awareness still exists in some spheres and domains of decision making, and is evidenced by a relatively limited interest, dynamism and performance in the management of this portfolio, which witnesses ups and downs depending on the conviction of the ministerial cabinet at any given time and its prioritization of the issue. To tackle this it is necessary to provide awareness raising activities and capacity building to decision makers in various line ministries and public institutions. This will also build bridges with parliamentarians; mainly those serving on social committees at the two national and senatorial councils, and their capacity should be built in a manner that will exercise pressure on the government. Finally, it is very necessary to draw up a clear strategy document and 10-year action

plan, to be combined with action plans for periods of three years. This will ensure that the agenda continues to be implemented with the same dynamism and according to fixed, targeted objectives.

# 9. Opportunities

# 9.1. Oman is entering a new era

After some social troubles and demonstrations that occurred in the country. The office of the Sultan is carrying out close follow-up of national development efforts. Concrete and quick progress and results are required from a number of government institutions. A new high consultative national council was elected...The press and media are more alert and observant, and are keeping a critical eye on the efforts of government ministries. A real need for external technical guidance, orientation and support has been revealed.

# 9.2. Legal frameworks in favour of PwD

On 22 April 2008, a law on the care and rehabilitation of PwD was issued by Sultan's decree (The decree 63). Although the law did not cover all areas related to PwD, and although it has a tendency to be care-oriented rather than rights-oriented, nonetheless, it is a key milestone for PwD in Oman. In terms of employment, the law has fixed the rights of work for PwD clearly, as well as the private sector obligation to employ PwD according to a certain quota. In the beginning this was fixed at 1% for companies with more than 50 employees. This percentage was increased to 2% in 2011.

Moreover, the Omani labour code obliges local companies to employ a certain percentage of Omani nationals instead of expatriates within the government policy of "Omanization", which consists of relying more on national human resources and less on expatriate labour. On this basis the Ministry of Manpower had issued a decree to encourage the employment of PwD, such that the employment of one person with a disability is equal to the employment of two Omani nationals (Ministry of Manpower decree No 362/2006).

# 9.3. Success stories were registered which could serve as a model

The number of employed Omani PwD remains limited (154); however, qualitative success stories of the employment of PwD were registered and revealed to the independent evaluation. These cases were characterized by the offer of jobs tailored to the needs and capacities of the PwD, through which they provide real productivity and add value to the company or institution in question. In other words, these success stories are win-win cases for both employer and employee which could serve as models for advocating the wide employment of PwD.

Existence of important infrastructure, services and initiatives in favor of PwD in general and their vocational rehabilitation in particular: Important infrastructure and services already exist in this regard. For example, in terms of general vocational training, the Ministry of Manpower has five vocational centers, and in the domain of the vocational rehabilitation of PwD in particular, Al Khodh centre can be mentioned.

# 9.4. Self Employment

In relation to self employment, the two programmes of Mawarid Al Rizk and Sanad specialize in the provision of support to Omani people in setting up their own businesses, including PwD. As for the rehabilitation of children, 22 Community Based Rehabilitation projects exist to provide rehabilitation services for children with disabilities under the auspices of Al Wafaa centers, which are spread across the different governorates of the Sultanate. These various facilities, and others, are pillars on which the implementation of any future phase of the project could build.

# **10.Lessons Learned**

# 10.1. The vocational rehabilitation of PwD in Oman is weak and at an early stage of development

There is only one center specializing in specific disabilities (hearing and physical disabilities). The options for vocational rehabilitation are very limited and traditional, and are not up to date (Only carpentry for hearing PwD, tailoring for physical disability...). Some categories of disabilities lack vocational training services, particularly learning difficulties and visual disabilities. Ordinary vocational centers are still not accessible to PwD. There are no norms and standards for prevocational rehabilitation in harmony with vocational rehabilitation. There are shortcomings in terms of expertise and trainers specialized by category of disability. Hence, intensive development efforts should be undertaken to improve the existing infrastructure and services for vocational rehabilitation, as this is the key causality factor in the employment of PwD. Even with strong placement infrastructure and the imposition of a quota, quantitative indicators on the employment of PwD will not improve significantly until the vocational qualifications of PwD are enhanced.

# **10.2.** The absence of a coordinating steering body is a serious challenge

The national management of the portfolio of disability in general and vocational rehabilitation and employment in particular require a horizontal mechanism for coordination and follow-up, as progress in this area requires the involvement of several ministries and public institutions as well as civil society. The failure of the high committee of disability and its related sub-committees, including the sub-committee on vocational rehabilitation and employment, has created a real vacuum in terms of coordination and monitoring. Therefore, two options are suggested to overcome this vacuum: either the high national committee and its related sub-committees should be reinforced and given more dynamism through a decree from the Sultan's office, or a national council for disability should be established to function as a coordinating/executive horizontal body.

# **10.3.** Communication and advocacy are key aspects in enhancing vocational rehabilitation and the employment of PwD

The evaluation process has revealed that certain key national counterparts were not well-informed about the project. Moreover, other national counterparts interviewed claimed that – vis-à-vis the public, decision makers, PwD themselves and their families – there was an absence of awareness tools and effort in relation to the promotion of the rights, perspectives, and employment of PwD as well as the added value of vocational rehabilitation. Furthermore, a wide range of private sector companies are not aware of the quota of 2% for the employment of PwD in companies with more than 50 employees. As a result of these findings, the next phase of the project must place increased emphasis on an integrated dimension of communication and advocacy to better promote the project and the cause of the employment and vocational rehabilitation of PwD.

# **10.4.** A gender dimension was not explicit within the project

Statistics indicate that, in the whole of Oman, only 23 female PwD are working (representing 15% of the total of 154 working PwD). Such a low figure requires that a gender dimension be explicitly included in any future phase of the project to tackle the vocational rehabilitation and employment of female PwD. This has to start with a deep analysis of the life conditions of female PwD to determine the sources of inequality in their access to education, rehabilitation, vocational rehabilitation and employment, to include the definition of practical and strategic gender needs. The latter must be reflected in a specific and immediate objective within particular outputs promoting the development of programmes of rehabilitation in defined sectors, while also increasing gender awareness and mobilizing women's groups and organizations as key partners.

#### 10.5. The placement of PwD should not be considered as the end of the process

In fact, working PwD interviewed during the final evaluation who had obtained their job opportunities through the placement services of the Ministry of Manpower revealed that once they were placed in a professional job, government action almost reached a dead end. No follow-up is taking place to ensure that the employer respects the terms of the contract or the labour rights of the PwD, or to ensure that the employer has rehabilitated the work place or work station in which the PwD is working, in terms of accessibility or being adequate to the needs of the employee. Hence, institutional development is required in the employment offices of the Ministry of Labour to establish a follow-up section for employed PwD, with the mission of carrying out regular, individualized follow-up of the different PwD employed.

The existence of more than one focal point/programme officer in the ILO regional office for followup of the project might cause confusion: Two project focal points coexist in the regional office: one administrative and the other technical. This requires the clear definition of responsibilities and areas of intervention. However, even if there is such clear definition at the outset, responsibilities between the two focal points may gradually become confused, both within the regional office as well as for the key project stakeholders across Oman. Follow-up in relation to some issues might overlooked or delayed. Hence, it is necessary for follow-up of this project to be the responsibility of only one programme officer/focal point in the regional office, who will ensure coordination with any technical requirements with the ILO regional office.

# **11.Recommendations**

Based on the different findings, constraints, opportunities and lessons learned it is recommended that the next phase of project implementation continue to horizontally tackle various issues related to the vocational rehabilitation and employment of PwD, as a relative vacuum and deficits still exist in key areas such as: policy, standardization, knowledge acquisition, institutional mechanisms of coordination, infrastructure and advocacy. It is to be noted that some of the key interventions required are located in areas beyond the specialization of ILO and its exclusive mandate requiring an inter-agency cooperation particularly recommendations 2,3 and 12). In a concrete manner, the following is recommended:

# 1. Adoption of the international classification of persons with disability and matching with perspectives on vocational rehabilitation and employment sectors.

It is necessary that the WHO International Classification of Functioning, Disability and Health (ICF) are adopted by the Ministry of Social Development and the Ministry of Manpower, to be used as the standard for the classification of category and degree of disability. This should be followed by the definition of possible headlines of vocational rehabilitation and profession that could be exercised, to a certain extent, by different categories of PwD in line with the ability and function requirements for different jobs (For example, in terms of physical and exertion job requirements four categories are defined: sedentary, light, medium and heavy, with a range of work specified for each. For example, the range of work that is sedentary includes: lifting up to 10 pounds, standing or walking for up to two hours a day, and sitting for up to six hours a day. The range of work categorized as medium includes: constant standing, constant walking, constant kneeling, constant squatting, bending, climbing, lifting 26 pounds frequently and lifting 50 pounds occasionally).

Such a definition will help in the reconsideration and design of orientation in terms of programmes of rehabilitation, pre-vocational rehabilitation, vocational rehabilitation and employment, bearing in mind that in Oman there is a trend towards fixing highly limited parameters for vocational rehabilitation and employment. For example, in the vocational centers of Oman, people with hearing problems are usually only offered vocational training in woodwork, whereas they could certainly be employed in a wide range of other professions.

However, the adoption of the ICF and the definition of an eventual matrix of possibilities for vocational orientation should not be exclusive, bearing in mind that each case of disability requires an individualized assessment.

### 2. Implementation of a national survey on PwD in the sultanate of Oman

Such a survey is necessary as the National Census is not sufficient to provide precise indicators on the extension of different sorts of disabilities in line with WHO norms and standards. In fact, the National Census used to ask the following pair of questions: Do you have any long-standing illness, disability or infirmity? Does this illness or disability limit your activities in any way?

People who answered yes to both questions were treated as experiencing a 'limiting long-standing illness' (LLI). What is really required is the implementation of a kind of Health and Disability Survey. This usually asks respondents a series of detailed questions about more than ten types of impairment-normal functions which they are unable to perform, or which they can only perform in a restricted way, such as walking, seeing and so forth.

### 3. Development of a coherent national policy for PwD

The development of a national policy on PwD is one of the top priorities for the next phase, as a serious vacuum still exists at the policy level. Such a vacuum is translated into interventions not being objective-driven, as well as a lack of harmony among the different activities led by the various stakeholders involved. Such a national policy should be developed through a specific process that must be participatory, in consultation and with the involvement of different line stakeholders and social partners. The outputs of this process should include a policy document with clear objectives to be reached in the next five or ten years , and an action plan specifying the interventions to be undertaken by different government institutions and social partners as well as in workplaces, while also specifying indicators for follow-up, monitoring and evaluation.

#### 4. Implementation of a survey: Trends in the Employment of PwD in Oman

This is necessary because statistics tell us very little about the PwD who do not have jobs and nothing at all about the PwD who do have jobs.

#### 5. Reinforcing the existing institutional mechanisms for coordination and follow-up

This could be implemented by:

- a. Dynamization of the national steering committee
- b. Setting up a subcommittee for the employment of persons PwD
- c. Establishment of sections within employment offices to follow up working PwD and to promote a safe and healthy workplace environment for PwD.

#### 6. Integration within the National Plan

Integrating within the national plan for employment within the next five years the creation of a certain number of jobs for Persons with Disabilities. To reach such objective the plan should include definite targets of creating employment opportunities through:

- a. Occupational Centers, which aim to provide occupational therapy and personal and social adjustment for those who cannot be integrated into other schemes; Special Employment Centers, which carry out productive work and ensure remunerative employment, regularly participating in market operations.
- b. Supported Employment, which is employment in the open market with ordinary companies but with the necessary supports provided both inside and outside the workplace.
- c. Ordinary Employment, which is employment in normalized companies where most workers do not have disabilities, such as the public sector and the self-employment sector and cooperatives.

#### 7. Supporting enforcement mechanisms of the rights of working PwD

It will be necessary to develop measures to implement the quota of 2% and to provide for levies if companies are not able or willing to comply. This would require the creation of a specific section within the labour inspection system, specializing in inspecting the application of the quota and the extent that the working conditions of PwD are respected. One such measure might be the payment of a heavy compensatory levy for each unfilled compulsory post. Moreover, it is necessary to improve the law in order to provide PwD with special protection against dismissal, to defend their interests and, possibly, to provide them with special assistance. In this regard, advocacy is needed to promote the creation of a specific magisterial office to deal with charges of discrimination. Furthermore, improvement in the law should also include the definition and division of work into four categories according to the level of exertion required for each, and the development of part-time contract forms tailored to the limited physical capacities of some PwD. This should be supported by a major initiative to bring positive awareness about the business case for hiring people with disabilities and government supports to provide incentives to employers as well as technical supports such as training on disability management, etc.

#### 8. Reconsider the division of work between Minsteries

Reconsidering the division of work in terms of vocation rehabilitation between the Ministry of manpower and the Ministry of social development based on the factors of comparative advantage, know-how and specialization. In this regard, the independent evaluation suggests that all programmes of vocational training for PwD (through the five vocational training centers that can integrate PwD and) take place under the direct supervision of the Ministry of Manpower, whereas responsibility for the assessment and diagnosis of disability services and for rehabilitation in general, including pre-vocational training, should be under the auspices of the Ministry of Social Development.

#### 9. Rehabilitating existing Vocational Training Centers

Rehabilitating the five existing vocational training centers of the Ministry of Manpower to be able to integrate PwD. This rehabilitation should be in a manner that integrates persons with physical, hearing, and speech disabilities, in addition to mild degrees of learning and cognitive disabilities. The rehabilitation should be done at the level of: 1- Accessibility 2-Curriculum and learning tools (including the use of tools tailored to the different kinds of disabilities mentioned) 3- Building of the capacity of trainers and teachers to train specific PwD. The idea of hiring specialist trainers for PwD might be considered. The establishment of additional centers must be also considered in order to meet the growing national need for vocational training.

#### 10. Transforming Al Khodh centre into a Vocational Assessment Centre

Transforming AI Khodh centre for the vocational training of persons with hearing and physical disabilities into a Vocational Assessment Centre, to function under the responsibility of the Ministry of Social Development. Such a centre should administer various sorts of tests to assess the physical, psychological, educational and vocational capabilities of PwD, as well as their potential interests and limitations (these tests could include intelligence and academic attainment tests, evaluations of attention span, spatial perception, physical and hand function, a vocational interest test, a work capacity evaluation, work behavior observations, etc.). The centre could also offer guidance and help to PwD in how to formulate individual goals, and provide support in achieving such goals. It could also offer assistance and counseling on the social and personal problems of PwD which may adversely affect their training and job placement. Finally, this centre could assess the need for technical aids and the adaptation of a work environment to accommodate PwD. In the future, other similar centers or technical assistance and training centers for mainstream staff or assistive technology centers could be established to cater to the needs of PwD all around the country.

#### **11.** Opening special vocational training centers

Opening special vocational training centers for some categories of PwD, providing very special training adapted to the highly specific needs of these categories, at a level appropriate to their capacity. In this regard, it will be necessary to set up a vocational training centre for persons with visual disabilities, and another for those with severe learning disabilities or intellectual disability. These centers should incorporate professional skills and environments that are fully in harmony with the capacities of these categories of PwD.

#### 12. Rehabilitating of the 22 Wafaa centers

Rehabilitating of the 22 Wafaa centers by the Ministry of Social Development after they have fallen under the responsibility of that ministry. This will require setting standards for the work of these Community Based Rehabilitation centers, while investing heavily in building the capacity of the workers therein. Such rehabilitation and standardization could include the development and integration of a dimension of pre-vocational training for children and adolescents with disabilities within the centers' programmes.

#### 13. Reinforcing trade union ability and will to defend the rights of working PwD

- a. Setting up a Person with Disability Committee among the different committees in the trade union. The committee should be backed by a specific secretariat.
- b. Setting up an additional service within the union to provide information to employed PwD on any social security provision with a preventive, compensatory or rehabilitative function relating to disability.
- c. Defining a clear agenda of actively advocating employment and training opportunities for PwD in national negotiations and at the level of enterprise.
- d. Recruitment by the Union of persons with disability.

# 14. Reinforcing the role of the Employers' Union/Chamber of Commerce in activating the employment of PwD in the private sector

- a. Building the capacity of the Chamber of Commerce to actively advocate the employment of PwD and to promote its benefits within the business community, and arranging adequate orientation in this regard.
- b. Obtaining the involvement of employers in designing skills development programmes.
- c. Promoting various forms of training for PwD sponsored by employers, as well as on-thejob training.
- d. Building the capacity of the Chamber of Commerce to provide support in the employment placement of PwD.

# 15. Enhancing communication and advocacy and raising awareness of the rights, dignity, working capacity and contributions of PwD

The number of Omani PwD who are working or looking for jobs is still limited when compared to the estimated total number of PwD in the Sultanate. This reflects the fact that wide brackets of Omani PwD, mainly female, still see themselves as permanently unable to work, and are also seen in this way by others. This remains the case in spite of the new emphasis on disability rights in the law and public discourse. An important number of employers are either unaware of the quota of 2% for the employment of PwD for companies with more than 50 employees, or are still not highly motivated to hire or retain people who are perceived to combine ill-health with a low skill level.

#### Table 1: Matrix of Follow-up

Recommendations	Responsible	Success indicator
1-Adoption of the international classification of persons with disability and matching with perspectives on vocational rehabilitation and employment sectors.	Ministry of Health, Ministry of Social Development, Ministry of Manpower, WHO, ILO	<ul> <li>-International classification of persons with disability adapted</li> <li>-Matching done with perspectives on vocational rehabilitation and employment sectors</li> </ul>
2-Implementation of a national survey on PwD in the sultanate of Oman.	Ministry of Social Development, Ministry of Health, Ministry of Manpower, , Ministry of Economy /statistics, WHO, UNFPA, UNICEF and ILO	-Survey implemented -Concrete indicators on PwD in Oman available
3- Development of a coherent national policy for PwD.	Ministry of Social Development, Ministry of Health, Ministry of Manpower, , Ministry of Economy /Planning, WHO, UNFPA, UNICEF and ILO	-National policy document prepared
4-Implementation of a survey "Trends in the Employment of PwD in Oman".	Ministry of Manpower, Ministry of Social Development, Ministry of Economy /statistics department, ILO	-Survey implemented -Indicators and baselines available
5-Reinforcing the existing institutional mechanisms for coordination and follow-up.	Office of the Prime Minister, Ministry of Manpower, Ministry of Social Development ILO	-Steering committee re-activated -Subcommittees for employment of PwD set up -Sections to follow-up working PwD are established within employment offices
6-Integrating within the national plan for employment within the next five years the creation of a certain number of jobs for Persons with Disabilities.	Ministry of Manpower, trade union, employers' union, ILO	-An axis on PwD is included within the national action plan for employment -Specific objectives and target indicators are

		fixed for the creation of jobs for Persons with Disabilities
7- Supporting enforcement mechanisms of the rights of working PwD.	Ministry of Manpower, ILO	-A specific section within the labour inspection system is created to supervise the application of the quota of employment of PwD and the conditions of their work
8-Reconsidering the division of work in terms of vocation rehabilitation between the Ministry of manpower and the Ministry of social development.	Ministry of Manpower, Ministry of Social Development	-Different categories of vocational training for PwD are under the responsibility of the Ministry of Manpower.
		-Assessment and diagnosis services, rehabilitation in general and pre-vocational training for PwD are under the responsibility of the Ministry of Social Development
9-Rehabilitating the five existing vocational training centers of the Ministry of Manpower to be able to integrate PwD.	Ministry of Manpower, ILO	<ul> <li>The five existing vocational training centers are rehabilitated in order to integrated PwD</li> <li>Number of different categories of PwD integrated within the five centers</li> </ul>
10-Transforming Al Khodh centre for the vocational training of persons with hearing and physical disabilities into a Vocational Assessment Centre.	Ministry of Social Development, ILO	<ul> <li>-Al Khodh center is transformed into a vocational assessment center</li> <li>-Number of assessments provided on monthly and yearly basis</li> </ul>
11-Opening special vocational training centers for some categories of PwD.	Ministry of Manpower, ILO	<ul> <li>-Special vocational training centers for specific categories of PwD are opened.</li> <li>-Number of PwD who are profiting from the vocational training for these centers</li> </ul>
12- Rehabilitating of the 22 Wafaa centers by the Ministry of Social Development.	Ministry of Social Development, UNICEF, WHO	-Centers rehabilitated
13-Reinforcing trade union ability and will to defend the rights of working PwD.	Trade Union, ILO	-PwD Committee set up within the trade union

		<ul> <li>-Additional service set up to provide information and guidance to employed PwD on social security provision with a preventive, compensatory or rehabilitative function relating to disability</li> <li>- Agenda for Employment and training opportunities for PwD is well defined and included in national negotiations</li> </ul>
14-Reinforcing the role of the Employers' Union/Chamber of Commerce in activating the employment of PwD in the private sector through.	Employers' union, ILO	<ul> <li>-Training implemented for Chamber of Commerce on how to advocate employment of PwD and promote its benefits within the business community</li> <li>-Employers involved in the designing of skills development programmes</li> <li>-Number of trainings and on-the –job trainings for PwD sponsored by employers on yearly basis</li> <li>-Number of placements of PwD done through the Chamber of Commerce</li> </ul>
15-Enhancing communication and advocacy and raising awareness of the rights, dignity, working capacity and contributions of PwD.	Ministry of Information, ILO	<ul><li>-Evolution of the number of working Omani</li><li>PwD</li><li>-Evolution of the number of Omani PwD job</li><li>seekers</li></ul>

# Appendix 1: List of Persons Interviewed

# ILO Regional Office for the Arab States

Mr. Maurizio Bussi	Deputy Regional Dire		
Mr. Jean-Francois Klein	Chief, Regional Prog		
Ms. Laetitia Weibel	Regional Monitoring		
Ms.Mary Kawar	Senior Regional Adv		
Patrick Daru:	Senior Regional Adv		
Ms.Rabiaa Jaloul	Regional Programmi		
ILO/Project <u>Enhancing</u> the Disabilities in Oman"	Vocational Rehabilita		
Mr. Maher Risha	Previous CTA of the		
Mr. Slam Salim Al-Kindi	National Project Ma		
Ministry of Social Developm	ent		
H.E. Dr. Yahia Al Moali	De		
Mr. Hammoud Bin Ahamo			
Mr. Aed Al Sultani	Di		
Ministry of Manpower			
Mr. Fares Bin Ahmad Bi A	li Al-Roshadi De		
Ministry of Education			
Riad Bin Seif Al-Hosi	Ec		
Projects of Mawared Al Rise	k		
Mr. Mohamad Bin Khamis	s Al Hanafi Di		
Mr. Mohamad Al-Remhi	De		
National High Committee fo	r Persons with Disabi		
Mr. Mokhtar Mohamad A	l-Rawahi Re		
Vocational Training Centre -	- Al Sib		
Mr. Isaa Al Rashidi	Di		
Mr.Sadek Al-Bloushi			
Centre for Rehabilitation of	PwD – Al-Khod		
Mr. Moubarak al Kasimi	Di		
Special Education School			
Ms. Batoul Mohsein Al La	watia Di		
Ms. Ayam Al-Farisi	Sp		
Oman Association for PwD			
Mr. Yahia Al Amiri	Cł		
Mr. Marhoun Al Ghafiri	Co		

25

#### rector

- gramme Service (PRS)
- g & Evaluation officer
- visor on Skills and Employability
- visor on Skills and Employability
- ning Service unit
- tation and Employment Services for People with
- e project anager
- Deputy Minister of Social Development Director Disability Expert
- Deputy Director of employment section
- ducation Specialist
- Director, Projects of Mawared Al Rizk
- Deputy Director, Projects of Mawared Al Rizk

# oility

Representative of PwD in the committee

#### Director

ocational orientation specialist

# Director

- Director Specialist in vocational orientation
- Chairperson Coordinator

#### **Appendix 2: List of Key Documents Reviewed**

#### **Oman Project Briefing material**

- 1. Decent work for women and men with disabilities in Oman ILO / Technical Cooperation / Sultanate of Oman – Project Document Template (PORDOC).
- 2. Decent Work Country Programme 2010-2013, Sultanate of Oman / ILO June 2010
- Centre (ITC ILO) Turin (Italy), March 1. 10.2010 (Course A 502403).
- Final Report July 31, 2009.
- Final Report Dec 31, 2009
- Disabilities Minute Sheet ILO Beirut 07 Feb 2007.
- 7. Agreement between Arab Fund Programme for United Nations Development Organizations Oman.
- Disabilities in the Sultanate of Oman Progress Report.
- 9. Technical Cooperation Project between the Government of the Sultanate of Oman and the 2006.
- 10. Report on Mission to Oman (10-15 October 2009) Ghassan Al-Saffar.
- 11. Enhancing the Vocational Rehabilitation and Employment Services for People with 2009.
- 12. Key Elements ILO Associate Experts (AE) Programme
- 13. Enhancing the Vocational Rehabilitation and Employment Services for People with Disabilities in Oman – Technical Briefing Notes prepared by Maher Risha.
- 14. Mission Report Oman 12-14 July 2009 Rabia Jalloul, Jean-Francois Klein, Mary Kawar, Christina Behrendt.
- 15. Enhancing the Vocational Rehabilitation and Employment Services for People with (Arabic).
- Manpower, AGFUND.

3. Labour market inclusion of people with disabilities for Oman – ILO International Training

4. Enhancing the Vocational Rehabilitation and Employment Services for People with Disabilities – ILO / Multi-Bilateral Programme of Technical Cooperation – Progress Report /

5. Enhancing the Vocational Rehabilitation and Employment Services for People with Disabilities – ILO / Multi-Bilateral Programme of Technical Cooperation – Progress Report /

6. Enhancing the Vocational Rehabilitation and Employment Services for People with

(AGFUND) and International Labor Organization (ILO) concerning a project for Enhancing the Vocational Rehabilitation and Employment Services for People with Disabilities - Phase I /

8. Enhancing the Vocational Rehabilitation and Employment Services for People with

International Labour Organization (ILO) 2007-2008 - Enhancing the Vocational Rehabilitation and Employment Services for People with Disabilities in the Sultanate of Oman – December

Disabilities in Oman – Vocational Rehabilitation for PwD to create decent work opportunities - Project Concept Note for a TC project – International Labour Organization – PRS – RJ – June

Disabilities in Oman – First Report – Maher Risha and Salam Bin Salem Al Kindi – April 2009

16. Various correspondences between ILO RO and Ministry of Social Development, Ministry of

#### ILO EVAL/ ILO General

- Evaluation Unit (EVAL) September 2007.
- for Evaluations Version 1 Evaluation Unit (EVAL) January 2010.
- Evaluation Unit (EVAL) November 1997.
- Technical Cooperation Programmes and Projects.
- 5. ILO Decent Work Country Programmes A Guidebook Version1 ILO 2005.

#### UNEG

- 2005.
- 2005.
- 2010/2.
- 4. United Nations Evaluation Group (UNEG) UNEG Quality Checklist for Evaluation Terms of Reference and Inception Report – 2010/1.

#### OECD

- March 2006.
- 2. OECD Glossary of Key Terms in Evaluation and Results Based Management

1. Evaluation Guidance - Considering Gender in Monitoring and Evaluation of Projects -

2. ILO Guidelines to Results-Based Evaluation – Principles, Rationale, Planning and Managing

3. Guidelines for the Preparation of Independent Evaluations of ILO Programmes and Projects -

4. Summary Notes - from ILO training manual on Design, Monitoring and Evaluation of

1. United Nations Evaluation Group (UNEG) – Norms for Evaluation in the UN System – April

2. United Nations Evaluation Group (UNEG) – Standards for Evaluation in the UN System – April

3. United Nations Evaluation Group (UNEG) – UNEG Quality Checklist for Evaluation Reports –

1. OECD - DAC Network on Development Evaluation - DAC Evaluation Quality Standards -

# Appendix 3: Mapping Matrix

Mapping Matrix of rehabilitation, pre-vocational and vocational rehabilitation services of Persons with Disability

	Rehabilitation during childhood and adolescence		Vocational rehabilitation	
Type of Disability	Rehabilitation and Education	Pre-vocational rehabilitation	Specialized Vocational Centers for PwD	Inclusion within regular vocational centers
Visual Disabilities	Al Wafa Centers Omar Bin Al Khatab Institute	Omar Bin Al Khatab Institute	Al-Nour Association for Blinds	No cases of inclusion within vocational regular centers
Hearing Disabilities	Al Wafa Centers Al Amal School	Al Amal School	Al-Khodh Centre	Few cases were integrated within the Vocational Centers/Ministry of Manpower
Speech Disabilities	Al Wafa Centers Al Amal School	Al Amal School	Al-Khodh Centre	Few cases were integrated within the Vocational Centers/Ministry of Manpower
Cognitive Disabilities	Al Wafa Centers Al Tarbia al Fikriah School	Al Tarbia al Fikriah School		
Physical Disabilities (Paralysis, amputations, Cerebral Palsy, Cardiac aliments, Paraplegiaetc)	Al Wafa Centers Disabled Children Care Centre (Dar Riaet Al Atfal Al Mouakin) Regular School with special needs programmes		Al-Khodh Centre	Cases were integrated within universities and technical faculties
Learning Disabilities and disorders (Autism, Dyslexia,	Al Wafa Centers	Al Tarbia al Fikriah School		

Dyscalculia, Dysgraphia, Dyspraxia, Auditory Processing Disorder)	Al Tarbia al Fikriah School Regular School with special needs and Learning Difficulties programmes		 
Mental Retardation (MR)	Al Wafa Centers Al Tarbia al Fikriah School	Al Tarbia al Fikriah School	 
Brain Disabilities (Acquired Brain Injury/ABI, Traumatic Brain Injury)			 

# **Appendix 4: List of International Conventions and Standards**

- 1. ILO Workmen's Compensation (Accidents) Convention 1925 (No.17)
- 2. ILO Social Security Convention 1952 (No.102)
- 3. ILO Occupational Safety And Health Conventions and Codes of Practices Over 40 Standards and Codes of Practice
- 4. ILO Code of Practice on Managing Disability in the Workplace 2001
- 5. ILO Vocational Rehabilitation and Employment (Disabled Persons) Convention 1983 (No. 159), and Recommendation No. 168
- 6. ILO Human Resources Recommendation 2004 (No.195)
- 7. UN Convention on Rights of Persons with Disability (UN CRPDP) 2006
- 8. The WHO International Classification of Functioning, Disability and Health (ICF)

# **Appendix 5: Evaluation TOR**

#### Independent Final Evaluation

## Enhancing the Vocational Rehabilitation and Employment Services for People with Disabilities in the Sultanate of Oman

OMA/04/01M/AGF

### Terms of Reference OMA/06/01M/AGF

### 16. Introduction and rationale for the independent final evaluation

Since 2001, the International Labour Organization has implemented the project entitled *'Establishment of a National community-based Vocational Rehabilitation Program in Oman'*; a 24month project funded by the ARAB GULF PROGRAMME FOR UNITED NATIONS DEVELOPMENT ORGANIZATIONS (AGFUND). In February 2007, the project evolved into a second phase entitled *'Enhancing the Vocational Rehabilitation and Employment Services for people with Disabilities in Oman'*, which was designed in consultation with the Ministry of Social Development and implemented by the International Labour Organization. The total cost of second phase of the project is \$ 700,000 USD with a contribution funded by AGFUND of \$ 300,000 USD for a period of 24 months, starting in December 2008 and ending in December 2010. The project was subsequently extended to December 2011 and then again to June 2012 in order to finalise the implementation of planned activities. The project is jointly executed by the ILO and the Ministry of Social Development.

### The Project Development Objective

To contribute to building the institutional and human resource capacities of vocational rehabilitation programmes for persons with disabilities in the Sultanate of Oman. This will enhance their opportunities in finding different forms of employment that contribute to the advancement of comprehensive social development of the country through empowerment of various social groups; hence, reduce the financial and social dependency on government assistance programmes, and allow people with disability to participate in the economic development with equal opportunities.

The key Immediate Objectives:

- 1. Enhance vocational rehabilitation and employment services for people with disability by investing in local resources and established facilities of the government and non-governmental sectors.
- 2. Developing public policies, strategies, mechanisms and plans for the rehabilitation and employment of people with disabilities.

Within the framework of the project document, the Oman Ministry of Social Development and the International Labour Organization assume full technical and administrative responsibilities for the project activities according to the predefined objectives.

This document describes the Terms of Reference for an independent final evaluation to be undertaken towards the end of the project's second phase, adhering to ILO's policies and procedures on evaluations. It will be conducted by an external evaluator and managed by the Regional Monitoring and Evaluation Advisor at the ILO Regional Office for Arab States (ROAS) in Beirut. The evaluation will cover both phases of the project's activities, starting since May 2001 up to present. The Project's performance will be reviewed with strict regards to relevance, design, effectiveness, efficiency, and sustainability. The evaluation is expected to:

- Provide a clear articulation of the main achievements and findings.
- Assess the success of implementing the project's activities, and identify activities which as yet have not been implemented and suggest ways and timings for their implementation before the end of the project's current phase.
- Provide a clear analysis of the project's context, and articulate the main challenges and the factors contributing to its success.
- Provide a clear analysis of the projects' partners, how did they take ownership of the project, and recommend partnerships, communication and ways of collaboration for future project implementations.
- Provide recommendations to enhance ILO's efforts to support the vocational rehabilitation and employment services for people with disabilities in Oman.
- Assess current impacts and the sustainability of the project activities; and where possible, identify evidence of pathways and indicators of long-term impact.
- Prepare a full-fledge Project Document for a new phase of ILO assistance in the field of persons with disabilities in Oman.
- Based on the potential recommendations and the national priorities, support the expansion of the project, and in light of the project proposal (noted above), adjust the objective, deliverables and activities based on this project evaluation.

### **17. Background and Project Context**

The current project builds on a preliminary phase which aimed at integrating the disabled into the economy of the Sultanate through awareness raising to the Ministry of Social Development regarding the importance of establishing a rehabilitation programme for the persons with disabilities in the local community. Also the project strived to upgrade institutional competencies and strengthen the vocational skills of officials working in the disability and social development programmes. The major targets of the first phase can be summarised as:

- build a general knowledge with all direct and indirect stakeholders regarding the importance of establishing a rehabilitation programme for persons with disabilities
- ascertain and establish a clear mechanism for a rehabilitation programme in the local community
- transmit knowledge on how to develop income generating activities and knowledge on how to establish education programme for children with special needs

The project work resulted in the creation of a technical and administrative unit within the Ministry, and jointly with the ILO, participated in the establishment of a rehabilitation centre.

Building on the success of the project's first phase, officials in the Ministry of Social Development showed interest in developing a second phase of the project with the ILO support aiming at improving rehabilitation measures and revamping appropriate rehabilitation policies and strategies for disabled people, as well as investing in the existing capabilities and resources that resulted from the project's first phase. In this respect, the ILO sent an international expert to discuss ideas with officials of the Ministry of Social Development, with the aim to develop a project document taking into consideration the national priorities identified by the Ministry and national resources persons. The approach of integrating project resources persons with the Ministry of Social Development also needs to be properly examined. The evaluation therefore should assess how effective and efficient were the allocation of the resources persons and whether same articulation should be maintained for any future phase of the project.

## Logic Structure of the Project

- 1. Development Objective: Contribute to building institutional and human resource capacities of vocational rehabilitation programmes for persons with disabilities in the Sultanate of Oman. This will enhance their opportunities in finding different forms of employment that contribute to the advancement of comprehensive social development in the country through empowerment of various social groups, and thereby reduce the financial and social dependence on government programmes of assistance, and participate in the economic development and equality of opportunity.
- 2. Immediate Objectives (outcomes) relevant to the ILO component of the UN Joint Project:
- Enhancing vocational rehabilitation and employment services for people with disability by investing in local resources and established facilities of the government and non-governmental sectors.
- Developing public policies, strategies, mechanisms and plans for the rehabilitation and employment of PWD.

## 3. Outcomes and related outputs:

Outcome 1: Enhancing vocational rehabilitation and employment services for people with disability by investing in local resources and established facilities of the government and non-governmental sectors.

- Evaluation report and situation analysis of the placement and vocational rehabilitation programme completed, and assessment of available resources and structures, with appropriate recommendations for improvements;
- Establishment of specialized vocational assessment units at the vocational rehabilitation centres for vocational guidance, training and employment;
- Vocational rehabilitation and training programmes of the Ministry of Manpower enhanced and have the technical capacities to assist in seeking advanced vocational training in line with the labour market needs.
- The evaluation will carefully and thoroughly examine the project design; how participatory was the design, how did the project respond to national priorities, was the intervention logic coherent and realistic, and how changes in logical frameworks, project strategies and work plans have been made and how have these been shared and validated.
- The evaluation will examine the situation analysis of the placement and vocational rehabilitation programme and assess how effective was the project in supporting the improvement of the programme.

Outcome 2: Developing public policies, strategies, mechanisms and plans for the rehabilitation and employment of PWD.

- An effective national structure adopted for administration, coordination and organization of governmental and non-governmental efforts and inputs in the field of placement and employment of PWD.
- Technical structure of the employment offices of the Ministry of Manpower strengthened to provide guidance and placement services and follow up of placement and employment of PWD.
- An advanced employment loans and credit system developed for the development of various forms of employment programme for PWD.
- Clear and recognized instructions, guides, and rules for activating the governmental legislations in the field of rehabilitation and employment of PWD developed.
- Advanced national mechanisms for funding the disability programme and activities developed targeted at enhancing the rehabilitation and employment opportunities of PWD.
- Clear five year national plan developed for the placement and employment of PWD.
- National human resources strengthened capable of developing rehabilitation and employment services of PWD.
- The evaluation will examine how effectively the project was in supporting the development of national structures for employment, vocational training of disabled persons. The evaluation should assess the progress made and highlight areas of focus for any potential future phase.
- The evaluation will give a specific emphasis on how effective the project was at building national ownership and thoroughly assess how willing and committed are the national partners to continue with the project.

### **18. Project Partners**

The programme partnered with the following organisations to implement the project:

- Ministry of Social Development
- Ministry of Manpower
- Worker Organisations
- Employer Organisations
- ILO International Training Centre

### **19. Institutional Framework**

The Ministry of Social Development and the ILO assume jointly the technical and administrative responsibilities for the implementation, supervision, technical backstopping, monitoring and evaluation of this project. The overall management of the project was done through an international Chief Technical advisor (CTA) who was appointed in XX for one year duration up to XX with the consultation of the Ministry of Social Development. Two national officers specialized in vocational rehabilitation and employment generation for the persons with disabilities will assist the CTA in implementing the project's activities.

## 20. Purpose, Scope and Clients of the Evaluation

### Purpose

The purpose of this evaluation is to:

- Provide a clear articulation of the main achievements and findings
- Assess the success of implementing the project's activities, and identify activities which have not been implemented and, where possible suggest ways and the timing for implementation before the end of the project's current phase.
- Provide a clear analysis of the project's context; what were the factors contributing to its success and the main challenges?
- Provide a clear analysis of the projects' partners; how did they take ownership of the project? Recommend partnerships, communication and ways of collaboration for future project implementations.
- Provide recommendations to support ILO's expansion of projects to enhance the vocational rehabilitation and employment services for disabled people in Oman.
- Assess current impacts and the sustainability of the project activities; and where possible, identify evidence of pathways and indicators of long-term impact.
- Based on the potential recommendations and the national priorities support the expansion of projects that will enhance the vocational rehabilitation and employment services for people with disabilities in Oman. In the light of the developed project proposal (noted in Section 1 above), adjust the objective, deliverables and activities based on this project evaluation.
- Document lessons learned, success stories, and good practice in order to maximize the experiences gained. The evaluation should take into consideration the project duration, existing resources and the constraints of the political environmental.

#### Scope

The evaluation will evaluate the relevance and logical coherence of the project design and its implementation. In particular, the evaluation will examine the impact of project activities on supporting the development of national structures for employment, vocational training of persons with disabilities.

The evaluation will be guided by the following core evaluation questions:

- **Development Effectiveness:** The extent to which the Project's objectives and intended results were achieved
- **Resource Efficiency:** The extent with which resources were economically converted into results, including the mention of alternative, more cost-effective, strategies when applicable
- Impact: Positive and negative, intended and unintended long-term effects
- **Relevance:** The extent to which Project interventions met beneficiary requirements, country needs, global priorities, and partners and donors policies
- **Sustainability:** The immediate benefits and probability of continued long-term benefits after the Project has ended
- **Partnerships:** The extent to which the Project's stakeholders absorbed the capacity to address social dialogue, labour reform and inspection issues
- Lessons Learned and Good Practice: Good practices identified by the Project, key lessons learned from project implementation, and recommendations for similar programmes/projects

#### **Clients of Evaluation**

The primary clients of the evaluation are the ILO Regional Office for Arab States (Beirut), and the ILO constituents, the Omani Ministry of Social Development, the Omani Ministry of Manpower, the other projects' partners and the donor AGFUND. Secondary clients include other units within the ILO that may indirectly benefit from the knowledge generated by the evaluation (SKILLS, CODEV, EVAL,).

## **21. Suggested Analytical Framework**

Relevance and Strategic Fit

- a. How did the Project contribute to national priorities as identified in the United Nations Assistance Strategy for Oman and UN Millennium Development goals?
- b. How have the stakeholders taken ownership of the Project concept and approach since the project started?
- c. How well did the Project design take into account local efforts already underway to support the rehabilitation and economic development of PWD in Oman and make use of existing capacity to address these issues?

#### Validity of the Design

- a. Was the intervention logic coherent and realistic? Do outputs causally link to outcomes, which in turn contribute to the broader development objective of the Project?
- b. Were the objectives of the Project clear, realistic and likely to be achieved within the established time schedule and with the allocated resources (including human resources)? Were the problems and needs adequately analyzed?
- c. How appropriate and useful were the indicators described in the Project progress documents for monitoring and measuring results? Were the means of verifications for the indicators appropriate?

#### **Project Progress and Effectiveness**

- a. Has the Project made sufficient progress towards its planned outputs and activities? Do the benefits accrue equally to men and women?
- b. Which components of the Project had the greatest achievements? What have been the supporting factors? How can the Project build or expand on these achievements?
- c. What alternative strategies would have been more effective in achieving the Project's objectives?

#### **Efficiency of Resource Use**

- a. Have resources (funds, human resources, time, expertise etc.) been allocated strategically to achieve outcomes?
- b. Have resources been used efficiently? Has the implementation of activities been costeffective? Will the results achieved justify the costs? Could the same results have been attained with fewer resources?
- c. Have project funds and activities been delivered in a timely manner? Were there any major delays? What were the reasons, and how did the Project deal with this delay in work plan?

#### **Effectiveness of Management Arrangements**

- a. Were management capacities adequate? Did the project governance structure facilitate good results and efficient delivery?
- b. How effective was the communication between project team, regional office, and responsible technical department?

- c. How effectively did the Project management monitor performance and results? What M&E system were put in place, and how effective was it? Was relevant data systematically being collected and analyzed to document progress and inform management decisions?
- d. Did the Project receive adequate political, technical and administrative support from its national partners?

Impact Orientation and Sustainability

- a. What observed changes (attitudes, capacities, institutions etc) can be causally linked to the Project's interventions?
- b. Are national partners willing and committed to continue with the Project? How effectively has the Project built national ownership?
- c. Has the Project successfully built or strengthened an enabling environment? (laws, policies, people's attitude etc.)
- d. Should there be another phase of the Project to consolidate achievements?

#### **Specific Emphasis**

In the final Evaluation Report, the evaluation team will make sure that the following aspects receive sufficient emphasis in the report, under the appropriate evaluation domain and to the extent relevant information availability:

- a. Provide a clear articulation of the main achievements and findings.
- b. Assess the success of implementing the project's activities, and identify activities which have not been implemented and suggest ways and timing for their implementation before the end of the project's current phase.
- c. Provide a clear analysis of the project's context, what were the factors contributing to its success and the main challenges.
- d. Provide a clear analysis of the projects' partners, how did they take ownership of the project, and recommend partnerships, communication and ways of collaboration for future project's implementation.
- e. Provide recommendations to support ILO's expansion of enhancing the vocational rehabilitation and employment services for people with disabilities in Oman.
- f. Assess current impacts and the sustainability of the project activities; and where possible, identify evidence of pathways and indicators of long-term impact.
- g. Document lessons learned, success stories, and good practice in order to maximize the experiences gained. The evaluation should take into consideration the project duration, existing resources and the constraints of the political environmental.
- h. Analyse what specific efforts were made by the project to involve workers' and employers' participation, and determine how effective the project was at promoting the normative function of the ILO.
- i. Analyse how effective and functional were the Tripartite National Steering Committee in establishing the project's results.
- j. Carefully and thoroughly examine the project design, how participatory was the project designed, how did the project respond to national priorities, was the intervention logic coherent and realistic, and how changes in logical frameworks, project strategies and work plans have been made and how have then been shared and validated.

- k. Examine the situation analysis of the placement and vocational rehabilitation programme and assess how effective was the project in supporting the improvement of such programme.
- I. Examine how effectively the project was in supporting the development of national structures for employment, vocational training of persons with disabilities, assessing the progress made and highlighting area of focus for the next phase.
- m. Emphasise on how effective the project was at building national ownership and assessing thoroughly how willing and committed are the national partners to continue with the project.
- n. The evaluation recommendations should correlate to the 5 main focus areas of the evaluation, (effectiveness, efficiency, relevance, impact and sustainability) and the related key questions.

## 22. Methodology

The international evaluator will be requested to present a more detailed evaluation methodology and an evaluation plan integrated into an inception report based on the suggested analytical framework and the desk review. This will need to be approved by the Regional Monitoring and Evaluation Advisor.

While the evaluation will be strictly external and independent in nature, the exercise will strive to be participatory to the extent possible, engaging the staff who worked under the Project, including partners, beneficiaries and other stakeholders. The evaluation will include, but not restricted to:

- a. An inception report conducted in the evaluator's home-country based on project documents and materials provided by the ILO Regional Office for Arab States.
- b. Presentations /inductions with available staff who worked under the Project, including the key stakeholders and partners of the Project. The evaluator will explain the process, methodology, objectives and the use of participatory principles in the evaluation.
- c. Perform interviews with Project staff, including project partners, constituents and key project stakeholders.
- d. Phone Interviews with ILO HQ and hold meetings with the relevant focal points in the ILO Regional Office for Arab States.
- e. Provide a presentation of findings and recommendations to selected stakeholders and partners upon completion of the Evaluation Report.
- f. Provide a presentation of the Project Document for a potential new phase, taking into consideration the recommendations mentioned in the Evaluation Report to be discussed with relevant focal points in the ILO Regional Office for Arab States and the relevant Omani Ministries.

### 23. Main Outputs

The expected outputs to be delivered by the international evaluator are:

**Evaluation Inception Report, including statement of methodology**— these statements are requested from the evaluator before proceeding with the full-fledged evaluation exercise. The Inception Report should detail the evaluator's understanding of what is being evaluated and why; it should articulate how each aspect of the evaluation will be addressed by way of proposed methods, proposed sources of data and data collection procedures. The Inception Report should detail the evaluation methodology, provide a proposed schedule of tasks,

activities and deliverables, and designate an evaluation team member with the responsibility to lead each task or product. The evaluation Inception Report and evaluation methodology will need to be submitted, and approved, prior to the start of the evaluation exercise.

**Draft Evaluation Report (no more than 20 pages)** — the Regional Monitoring and Evaluation Advisor, the ROAS Programme Unit and key internal stakeholders will review the draft report to ensure that the evaluation meets the required criteria. Special attention will be given to the quality and quantity of recommendations.

**Final Evaluation Report and cover page** — the final report should include key project and evaluation data<sup>1</sup>, and follow the structure noted below:

- 1. Executive Summary
- 2. Description of the Project
- 3. Purpose, Scope and the Clients of the Evaluation
- 4. Methodology
- 5. Implementation Review
- 6. Clearly identified findings for each criterion
- 7. Conclusions
- 8. Recommendations (including tracking table with relevant follow-up responsibilities)
- 9. A statement addressing lessons learned, good practices and effective models of intervention drafted in user-friendly language for publication and circulation to wide audiences.
- 10. Summary of potential areas for further investigation and implications for global/regional strategies.
- 11. Annexes, including TORs, persons contacted, etc.
- 12. Standard evaluation matrix
- 13. Summary Evaluation Report according to ILO guidance.

**Stakeholder Workshop** — To be facilitated by the independent evaluator. The stakeholder workshop is held at the end of the evaluation process to present and validate findings and recommendations. The workshop should include national constituents and other stakeholders involved in the evaluation process as well as the ILO ROAS Skills and Employability Specialist.

**Prepare a full-fledge Project Document** for a new phase of the ILO assistance in the field of persons with disabilities in Oman. Based on the evaluation recommendations and the national priorities support the expansion of the project for enhancing the vocational rehabilitation and employment services for people with disabilities in Oman, and in the project proposal, adjust the objective, deliverables and activities based on this project evaluation.

The final Evaluation Report will be circulated to key stakeholders (those participants present at stakeholder workshop will be considered 'key stakeholders') for their review. Comments from stakeholders will be consolidated by the ROAS Regional Monitoring and Evaluation Advisor and provided to the international evaluator. In preparing the final report the international evaluator

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> The template will be provided by the ROAS M&E Advisor.

should consider these comments, incorporate them as appropriate. Provide a brief note explaining any comments that have been omitted, and subsequently not incorporated.

## 24. Management Arrangements, Work Plan and Timeframe

The evaluation will be conducted by a senior external evaluator. The ILO Regional Office in Beirut and the project management will be responsible for providing all logistical support to facilitate the evaluation process. The evaluation will be managed by the Regional Monitoring and Evaluation Advisor at ROAS Beirut.

### **Evaluation Team and Responsibilities**

The evaluation will be conducted by an international independent evaluator. The evaluator is responsible for conducting the final evaluation, as per the terms of reference, the evaluator is also responsible for preparing a full-fledge Project Document for a new phase.

## 25. The Responsibilities of the International Independent Evaluator

- 1. Review the TOR and provide input, as necessary
- 2. Review all original project documents and materials; this task includes a comprehensive review of the following documents:
  - Project Document
  - Progress Reports
  - Proposals for Extension
  - Work Plans
  - Mid-term evaluation completed in May 2010
- 3. Prepare an Inception Report including the evaluation methodology, instruments and plan
- 4. Reserve one week for a field mission including induction and interviews with direct and indirect stakeholders, and other methodological components the evaluator might chose to apply.
- 5. Conduct debriefing on preliminary findings, conclusion, and recommendation of the evaluation with Key stakeholders in the form of a workshop.
- 6. Draft Evaluation Report and finalize it based on comments from stakeholders.
- 7. Draft a full-fledge Project Document for a new phase.

### 26. The Regional Monitoring and Evaluation Advisor Responsibilities

- Drafting the final evaluation TOR
- Finalizing and approving the TOR with input from the stakeholders and the independent evaluator
- Organize relevant documentation
- Ensure proper stakeholder involvement
- Provide project background materials and information
- Provide logistical and practical support, as needed
- Participate in preparatory meeting prior to the evaluation mission

- Assist in the implementation of the evaluation methodology, as appropriate (i.e., participate in interviews, review documents) and in such a way as to minimize any bias in evaluation findings
- Coordinate the exchange of comments between the evaluator and the project partners during the evaluation
- Circulate draft and final report to stakeholders
- Review and provide comments on the Evaluation Report
- Participate in debriefing on findings, conclusions, and recommendations of the final Evaluation Report
- Ensure follow-up on the evaluation recommendations

## 27. The Chief Regional Programming Services Responsibilities

- Review the TOR and provide input, as necessary
- Provide a briefing to the evaluator on the project's background, history, and highlight issues to be considered
- Participate in debriefing/workshop on findings, conclusions, and recommendations of the final evaluation
- Review and provide comments on the draft Evaluation Report

## 28. The ILO Backstopping Officer and National Project Manager Responsibilities

- Review the TOR and providing input, as necessary
- Provide project background materials and collect information
- Participate in preparatory meetings prior to the evaluation mission
- Provide logistical and practical support, as needed
- Coordinate exchanges of information between the evaluator and the project's partners.
- Assist in the implementation of the evaluation methodology, as appropriate (i.e., participate in interviews, review documents) and in such a way as to minimize bias in evaluation findings
- Participating in debriefing on findings, conclusions, and recommendations of the final Evaluation Report
- Review and provide comments on the Evaluation Report

## **29. Estimated Duration of the Evaluation**

The total duration of the evaluation process is of 19 working days. The expected starting date of the evaluation is estimated end June 2011. The final report should submitted no later than End August 2011, while the draft report is expected no later than mid-August.

Table 2: The Evaluation Timetable and Schedule

Responsible Person	Tasks	Timeline
International Evaluator	Desk review of project documents. Submission of evaluation inception report, including evaluation's methodology and	3 days

	instruments	
International Evaluator.	Interviews with relevant focal points in the ILO Regional Office for Arab States	3 days
International Evaluator	One week for field mission including induction and interviews with direct and indirect stakeholders, including Programme Management Unit Conduct debriefing on findings, conclusion, and recommendation of the evaluation with Key stakeholders in the form of a workshop	4 days
International Evaluator	Draft Evaluation Report	5 days
Regional Monitoring and Evaluation Advisor	Integration of comments and finalization of the Evaluation Report	2days
International Evaluator	Draft Project Document for a new phase	2 days