

Self Evaluation Report

INS/08/03/UND

ILO/UNDP Joint Programme for the Papua Highlands Entrepreneurship Skills Development Project

2009



Evaluation Report prepared by: Naomi Sosa, Papua Partners

Date of Report: 21 December 2009

Contents of Report

1. Executive summary	1
2. Project Background	4
2.1 Intervention logic and background	4
2.2 Project objectives	4
2.3 Project strategy	5
2.4 Information on project area	5
2.5 Women and economic development in the highlands	11
3. Background on evaluation	14
4. Methodology	15
5. Findings	17
5.1 General impact of project according to achievement of project objectives and outputs	17
5.2 Assessment of project according to key questions	35
6. Conclusions	40
7. Recommendations	42
Appendices	47
1. List of people interviewed	
2. Interview questions (Bahasa)	

1. Executive Summary

This document reports on the evaluation of the ILO Entrepreneurship Skills Development Project which was initiated in January 2009 and finished in December 2009. The purpose of the evaluation was to assess the work done and achieved by the project and specifically to examine project relevance, effectiveness, efficiency, sustainability and gender specific results as regards the specific objectives and outputs of the project. Under the framework of the UN Joint Programme that was funded by the UNDP, the ILO through the project titled the Enterprise Skills Development Project aims to contribute to poverty reduction by facilitating community entrepreneurship skills development activities that would lead to increased income and employment opportunities, primarily for indigenous Papuans. The project aims to achieve this in the central highlands Regencies (regency) of Jayawijaya, Lany Jaya and Yahukimo in the Province of Papua, Indonesia. The Papua region and especially the central highlands suffer from high levels of poverty currently recorded at 41.8%. Papua also is way behind on key non-income indicators of poverty related to the Millennium Development Goals. Papuan's rate of access to health services and participation in formal education are amongst the lowest in Indonesia. The gender empowerment measure is also very low.

The methodology of the evaluation included revision of project documents, process of dialogue with beneficiaries and stakeholders through interviews, group discussion with training participants, general public, government, NGO partners and other stakeholders as well as general observation.

The evaluation found that the ILO-ESD project in the central highlands is *relevant* to community needs and interests and fits within current government priorities. The project has been very *effective* in progressing towards the three objectives set out in the initial project framework but has not yet reached the intended impact in terms of changed behavior and situations as stated in project outputs. The project strategy has been *efficient* in achieving results in a short time but most of these results are limited to one regency. The project has developed a *basis for creating sustainability* however, more long term action is required before interventions become sustainable and are owned by the local populations. The ILO-ESD project has had good results in the area of meeting the *gender specific targets*. By consistently raising the profile of women entrepreneurs has had significant impact in terms of increasing awareness of the importance of women in economic development, what women are doing already and the potential that lies in supporting them and raising their capacity to interact more effectively in the marketplace.

One of the main achievements of the ILO-ESD project has been the *building of awareness on the business potentials and role of women entrepreneurs* in the regencies of Jayawijaya and Lany Jaya among all actors involved in economic development. *Overall Impact of the project is greatest in the Regency of Jayawijaya* and to a lesser extent Lany Jaya. There has not yet been significant results or progress in Regency Yahukimo. This is mainly due to political and logistical factors but also due to the limited number of staff on the project team. *There is still a lack of clarity among many actors especially entrepreneurs themselves and some NGOs about what the actual objectives and Mandate of ILO are.*

The ILO-ESD has succeeded in mobilizing many local skilled people from different backgrounds to support entrepreneurs through their training of trainers program with a total of 137 people trained. Although there are currently only 20 facilitators active this is felt to be a significant achievement which can be built on next year. The project has achieved the training of 625 indigenous Papuan entrepreneurs in the GET Ahead module with 70% of these participants being women. The GET-AHEAD training process has been effective in providing a general introduction to Papuan entrepreneurs about how to improve their business and the general issues involved in this. It has started to tackle some key limitations and challenges identified in the baseline. The module on gender has helped insert new ways of thinking about relationships between men and women and how this affects aspects of their lives. It can be said that the training process provided by ILO-ESD has initiated a change in the way of thinking among women entrepreneurs who have taken part but in most cases this has not yet translated into action in terms of changes or improvements in their businesses. However, for a one year project the impact that has been felt so far is a significant achievement.

Due to the lack of capacity of civil society no appropriate BDSP (Business Development Service Provider) were identified for further training and joint working with ILO. Due to this ILO have initiated the set up of a BDS formed up of local facilitators trained by ILO in Jayawijaya. This will be headed up by an indigenous Papuan woman. This initiative has a lot of potential to effectively build capacity and coach micro and small entrepreneurs specifically for Jayawijaya. There is good coordination with local government actors in Jayawijaya and Lany Jaya and overwhelming support for the objectives of the programs shown by various initiatives that have been committed to support local entrepreneurs in the region. This relationship has created a strong basis for further strengthening and training to increase sustainability. The project has established the groundwork and foundations for developing an effective and workable framework for economic interaction between micro-entrepreneurs and other economic actors (banks, government, NGOs) at the regency level in Jayawijaya as well as facilitating the exchange of knowledge and experience.

Based on the above findings the evaluation has put forward thirteen separate recommendations focusing on different aspects of the project. More detail on carrying out the recommendations is provided in the recommendation section.

1. Strengthen the understanding and awareness about ILO mandate and project objectives
2. Improve and add to the training of entrepreneurs process and materials to take into account the needs of Papuan Entrepreneurs, facilitators capacity and the cultural situation especially relating to gender.
3. Develop stronger, more formal working relationships with local NGOs, Churches and cultural organizations to ensure sustainability of training and accompaniment of indigenous women entrepreneurs.
4. Increase level of coordination with local government departments to ensure sustainability of interventions and support to indigenous Papuan women entrepreneurs in the future from the government. This should include:
5. Increase the capacity of the ILO-ESD team so they have the capacity to coordinate activities in the three regencies.

6. Implement an effective and collaborative coaching process which would work in coordination with the new BDS, ILO-ESD and partners in the other Regencies.
7. Identify, strengthen and support a local organization in each regency to set up a basic micro-finance systems.
8. Strengthen the agribusiness, forestry and tourism sector for the promotion of employment opportunities in areas where Papuans have strengths and knowledge.
9. Work together with NGOs, churches and government to develop and implement strategies for economic development and for the empowerment of indigenous Papuan women entrepreneurs in each of the three regencies based on the individual context, experience, culture, situation of women and geography.
10. Expand the support of BDS mechanisms to Lany Jaya and Yahukimo and provide training and accompaniment for BDS in the three regencies.
11. Continue the process to create a network to support small and micro business and strengthen these activities in Lany Jaya and Yahukimo.
12. Develop working agreement with the RESPEK/PNPM program in order to improve the economic development activity and increase women's participation at village levels in the three target regencies.
13. Increase project activities specifically focusing on building awareness on gender

2. Project Background

2.1 Intervention Logic and Background

The Papua region¹ is one of the regions in Indonesia that has enormous natural resources. On account of this wealth, high levels of export earnings have been generated from exploitation of these resources, especially minerals, gas, oil, forestry and fishery products. It was reported that in 2003, revenues from the export of these resources reached as much as USD 1.5 billion. A fraction of these revenues is plowed back to Papua annually to support various development programs initiated by the government.

Demographically, the Papua region has a population of 2.3 million, of which 1.5 million are indigenous Papuans who belong to 250 ethno-linguistic groups. At least 73% of the indigenous Papuans live in rural areas.

Despite all the resources, however, the Papua region continues to suffer from high levels of poverty, which is currently recorded at 41.8% - the highest percentage compared to other provinces in Indonesia (Indonesian Human Development Report 2004). It has also one of the lowest Human Development Index in the country.

Papua also lags behind other provinces on key non-income indicators of poverty related to the Millenium Development Goals (MDGs). Papuans' rates of access to health services and participation in formal education are amongst the lowest in Indonesia. The gender empowerment measure is similarly low.

The UN Joint Program for the Papua Highlands is an initiative taken by the UN agencies presently working in Papua, namely: UNDP, UNICEF, WHO, UNFPA, ILO and UNV to consolidate their technical cooperation services in specific areas in order to generate greater development impact and sustainability. The Highlands of Papua province was selected to serve as a pilot site for the implementation of the Joint Program.

Under the framework of the UN Joint Programme that was funded by the UNDP, the ILO through the project titled the Enterprise Skills Development Project aims to contribute to poverty reduction by facilitating community entrepreneurship skills development activities that would lead to increased income and employment opportunities, primarily for indigenous Papuans.

2.2 Project Objectives

The Enterprise Skills Development Project aims to cover the Regencies of Jayawijaya, Lani Jaya and Yahukimo and pursues the following objectives:

¹ Papua region consist of the Provinces of Papua and West Papua.

1. Enhanced awareness and understanding of the business potentials that abound in the Papuan highlands considering the existing natural resources.
2. Basic entrepreneurship skills acquired by partner community members, especially the indigenous women.
3. Increased capacity of micro and small entrepreneurs to manage their enterprises and business development service providers to coach the micro and small entrepreneurs.

2.3 Project Strategy

1. Facilitate the development and maintenance of a data base on micro and small enterprise potentials and existing entrepreneurs in the Papuan Highlands.
2. Ensure the effectiveness of the entrepreneurship skills development process by providing micro-entrepreneurs a training package consisting of two stages: a) basic entrepreneurship training based primarily on ILO Gender and Entrepreneurship Together (GET Ahead) and Start and Improve Your Business (SIYB) tools; and b) hands-on entrepreneurship training, with special attention to marketing, through coaching.
3. Identify and engage the services of existing business development service (BDS) providers in the area and ensure the provision of corresponding basic infrastructure by the government.
4. Assist the micro and small entrepreneurs to develop mechanisms for collaboration with concerned government agencies for the delivery of related basic services, including infrastructure and other service providers e.g. UNICEF, UNFPA, WHO, UNV, OXFAM, etc. for other technical services such as health, education, microfinance, and the like.

2.4 Information on Project Area

The ESD project aimed to work across the Regencies of Jayawijaya, Lany Jaya and Yahukimo. This section describes the basic context of the region with particular reference to issues that affect the project.

2.4.1 Context on Regency Jayawijaya²

Jayawijaya is the largest regency in the highlands of Papua. The capital is Wamena which has the only paved airport in the region. The regency of Jayawijaya with its present size of 2,629 km² was been the largest regency in the highlands of Papua before it was divided in five regencies in the year 2008 (Jayawijaya, Nduga, Mamberamo Tengah, Yalimo and Lanny Jaya). Jayawijaya now includes 11 districts with 116 villages. Approximately 110,000 people live in these 11 districts of Jayawijaya.³ The 11 districts of Jayawijaya are

² The majority of this information is taken from the Baseline study

³ Jayawijaya dalam angka – 2007/2008.

Wamena Kota, Hubikosi, Pelebaga, Asologaima, Musاتفak, Kurulu, Bolakme, Wollo, Yalengga, Assolokobal and Walelagama.

Jayawijaya is surrounded by four regencies (in the east Regency Pegunungan Bintang and Merauke, in the south Regency Yahukimo and Boven Digul, in the west Regency Puncak Jaya and Tolikara and in the north Regency Jayapura). Geographically the regency Jayawijaya is known for its mountainous regions from 2000-5000m above sea level. These conditions make it difficult to build roads which could connect all districts. So far the government has build about 1.300 km of roads inbetween the regency of Jayawijaya.

As there is no road yet from Jayapura (the capital of Papua at the coast) to Jayawijaya, all goods have to be brought in by plane. Because of heavy rains (especially in the months of March and April as well as from September to December) and poor construction many roads and bridges are already destroyed after several months of usage. Most villages in Jayawijaya can still only be reached by plane or by foot. In and around the city of Wamena there are a lot of taxis available, but because of fuel shortage and very high fuel prices all kind of transportation is also very expensive in the city. Because of high transportation costs of goods the living costs in Wamena and the surrounding villages are much higher than in Jayapura.

Jayawijaya is located about 1.500 above sea-level. Therefore the climate in Jayawijaya is colder, humidity is around 80% and vegetation differs from the coastal areas. The wide variety of vegetables from Jayawijaya are known for high quality because of very fertile soil. Mostly there is no need at all to use fertilizers. However, due to high transportation costs the prices of vegetables from Wamena cannot compete well with the market prices from imported vegetables from other Indonesian islands which are brought in to Jayapura by ship. Therefore the cost of intensive vegetable shipments by plane from Wamena to Jayapura are mostly not profitable because of unhealthy competition with cheap imported products from other regions.

The communication system is best in the capital of Wamena, where there are already several internet-café's. The indonesianwide telecommunication Telkom, Telkomsel and Satelindo provide services in the capital of Wamena. In the others districts SSB radio transmittion is used for communication.

Sources of livelihood are mostly farming and traditional ways of animal-breeding. The family income per day is very low (approximately lower than 1 US \$ per family per day). Basic food supply are several kinds of sweet potatoes (Ubi jalar, Hipere) and leaves (daun singkong, daun ubi etc.). Relationships in between families and tribes are very strong. Land is owned by the community (hak ulayat) but there is very little land apart from that in the town which has formal land certificates.

At the time of the baseline survey Jayawijaya had 9 doctors, 299 nurses and 61 midwives who work in one hospital (in Wamena) as well as in 12 public health centres ("Puskesmas") and 19 sub health centres ("Pustu") as well as 36 mobile clinics "Puskesmas keliling" which provides health service by car (8 units) or motorbike (28 units). There are 6 pharmacies in Jayawijaya (all of them located in the capital of

Wamena). Most diseases are worm infections, bronchitis or lung infections, malaria. Every year the number of HIV/AIDS – positive patients is raising rapidly.⁴

For education the regency of Jayawijaya provides: 6 Kinder garden with 686 pupils and 55 teachers; 99 primary schools, with 9798 pupils and 775 teachers; 20 junior high schools 5822 with and 654 teachers; 8 senior high schools with 2700 pupils and 164 teachers; 5 schools for specific education 1500 pupils and 122 teachers.⁵

At the end of 2008 there were 319 protestant churches, 87 catholic churches, 8 mosques and one Hindu temple in the regency of Jayawijaya. Most people in Jayawijaya are protestant Christians (190.206 people), followed by the religion of Islam (3.476), Hindu (28 people) and Buddha (8 people).

In 2006 there were only 90 registered businesses in Wamena with a total of 323 employees. In all other districts small businesses seem to be not officially registered and therefore there are no valid statistics available about the number of micro and small businesses in the area. From all registered businesses, 25 are active in the area of food, beverages and tobacco, 20 in textile, clothes and animal skin, 6 in chemistry and building materials, 6 in handy crafts and 33 in metal manufacturing businesses.⁶

Electric power supply by the government is only guaranteed in the district of Wamena. In 2005 around 727 600kwh have been produced and most parts have been sold to private households, offices, small and medium sized businesses and only a small part to local industries.

There are 46 cooperatives with more than 7.000 members in the regency of Jayawijaya, but the efficiency of these cooperatives for business development is questionable. It needs to be checked if all of them are still active and if they work efficiently.

Local resources are cows, sheep, goats, pigs, fish (especially ikan mas, ikan mujair, ikan nila), shrimps, coffee, red pepper, spinage, black raddish (keladi), beans, carrots, shallots, sping onions, cucumber, potatoes, tomatoes, cabbage, peanuts, soyabeans, corn, sweet potatoes (biggest production), pineapple, oranges, passionfruits, avocado etc.

The biggest business potential is seen in the area of tourism (especially in the months of August) and pig-breeding (because of high profit margins and high demand). Opportunities are in the area of cattle-breeding, rabbit-breeding, goat-breeding, piscine culture, trading of fresh vegetables and handy crafts.

2.4.2 Background on Lanny Jaya

Lanny Jaya is a new “regency” in the Papuan highlands which has been acknowledged as new regency by the central government on 21 July 2008. Lanny Jaya with a total size of 10.448km² is surrounded by four regencies (in the east regency Puncak Jaya, in the south regency Nduga, in the west regency Jayawijaya and in the north Regency Tolikara). The

⁴ Source: Jayawijaya dalam angka – 2007/2008

⁵ Source: Jayawijaya dalam angka – 2007-2008, hal 100.

⁶ Source: Jayawijaya dalam angka - 2005

regency Lanny Jaya is in the mountains of Papua and is located about 1500-3000 above sea level and includes 10 districts with 145 villages. Tiom: 21 villages, Makki: 23 villages, Pirime: 28 villages, Poga: 10 villages, Danime/Gamelia: 13 villages, Balingga: 15 villages, Tiomneri: 11 villages, Malagai/Melagineri: 5 villages, Kuyawage: 10 villages, Dimba: 9 villages).

There are not schools present in all villages. There are a total of: 1 Play Group (TK), 102 primary schools (SD) with 330 teachers and 9.953 students; 10 middle schools (SMP) with 42 teachers and 3.716 students; and 4 high schools (SMU/SMK) with 14 teachers and 867 students.⁷ So far there are no schools in Lanny Jaya which are orientated towards practical training and entrepreneurship skills development.

The mountainous wooded geographical condition does not support economic development as 4 of the 10 districts can only be reached by foot or by plane. The main road from Tiom (capital of Lanny Jaya) to Wamena (which is the capital of the regency Jayawijaya) connects the other 6 districts. This road includes around 120 bridges and because of heavy rains the road is not in good condition (a report from April 2009 says that 52% of that road is destroyed because of heavy rain and landslides, and only 48 % of the road is paved⁸) so that it takes a 4,5 hours drive to go the 80 km from Wamena to Tiom. Lanny Jaya has one airport (with airstrip 700m length) and 6 grass airstrips (in Tinggipura, Pirime, Kuyawage, Makki, Dimba, Malagai dan Tiomneri).

Demographically, the Lanny Jaya region has a population of 316.279 people, which means a density of 25,48 people /km². Around 213.082 of the Lanny Jaya people live in poor living conditions (IPM = 53%).⁹ Most people in Lanny Jaya are protestant Christians (316.237 people) with animistic background. Only a few are Muslim (43 people). There are 315 churches (1 GKI, 4 GKII and 310 Baptist churches).

The health sector provides 13 village clinics (9 Puskesmas and 4 Pustu) with 4 doctors, 7 nurses and 7 midwives. Infant mortality is still very high and mothers often die after delivering a baby because of complications. The most common diseases found in the Lanny Jaya area are worm diseases and *upper respiratory infections*.

The main sources of livelihood are farming, pig breeding and hunting and the family income per day is very low (approximately Rp. 5.000-Rp. 30.000 income per day). Local resources are sweet potatoes (ubi jalar, keladi), corn, coffee (Arabica), vegetables, honey, red onions, garlic, buah merah, pigs, rabbits, sweet water fish and shrimps.

Land is generally owned collectively. Tribal leaders decide which family can use which part of the land for farming. Relationships are very close in between the families.

There are currently 7 cooperatives working in Lanny Jaya, but they are not working effectively due to a lack of management knowledge and facilities. Business potential is seen in the areas of tourism, pig-breeding, rabbit-breeding, chicken-breeding, farming

⁷ Source: Profil Regency Lanny Jaya - Provinsi Papua, Tiom, April 2009

⁸ Source: Profil Regency Lanny Jaya - Provinsi Papua, Tiom, April 2009

⁹ Source: Profil Regency Lanny Jaya - Provinsi Papua, Tiom, April 2009

and piscine culture, but the destroyed roads are hindering ongoing business activities. Private businesses do not have a big impact yet on the society because they are mostly run to satisfy daily needs and not to provide employment possibilities for others.

Most business owners do not show strong efforts to produce surplus and people are not used to create savings for future needs. There are no banks yet in Lanny Jaya. All money transfers are done in Wamena, which is the capital of Jayawijaya. Communication is difficult, because no telecommunication network has been installed yet. Only SSB-Radios and satellite phones can guarantee communication to other regencies. Electricity is only available in the district of Makki because of a water-hydro-generator which was the result of a development program run by the government. In all other districts people still use candles, flashlights with batteries or solar panels.

The government budget for developing the regency of Lanny Jaya for 2009 was approximately Rp. 190.000.000.000. The government has stated that it wants to use part of this budget to support small scale businesses. Support is also planned for the 7 cooperatives which already exist. Furthermore there are plans from the government to enlarge the coffee-production in almost all districts.¹⁰

The local markets in Lanny Jaya are very small. Women sell vegetables from their gardens in order to be able to pay for school fees, instant food, cigarettes and clothes. There are no industries yet in Lanny Jaya.

2.4.3 Background on Yahukimo

The regency of Yahukimo was formed in 2002 (Undang –Undang Nomor 26 Tahun 2002) and was officially acknowledged by the central government as a new regency on 12 April 2003. The name of the regency was taken by adding the first two letters of the names of the four biggest tribes who live in that area (**Y**ali, **H**upla, **K**imyal dan **M**omuna). Besides these tribes there are also three other large tribal groups, the Ngalik, Una Ukam and Mek. In the area of Tokoni, Beyono and Obokain there are about 5 smaller tribes with their own languages.

Geographically the regency is located between 138°30′ – 40°15′ BT and 3°30′ LS-5°15LS and includes an area of about 1.604.900 hectare of mostly fertile farming land. Yahukimo includes lowlands as well as mountainous regions (between 500-4,000 above sea level). In the year 2006 the regency of Yahukimo which includes 51 Districts with 518 villages has had a population of about 216.000 inhabitants¹¹. The capital of Yahukimo is the new city of Dekai (also sometimes called Sumohai) which is located in the southern lowlands close to the border with the Regency of Asmat. Dekai only started to develop after the establishment of the new Regency. The location of Dekai was chosen

¹⁰ See “Prioritas kegiatan yang saat ini sedang digumuli pemerintah regency Lanny Jaya) in Profil Regency Lanny Jaya - Provinsi Papua, Tiom, April 2009

¹¹ Source: BPS Regency Yahukimo 2006

to be the capital due to its access to the sea via river. There is a new port being developed about 30 minutes drive from the town of Dekai at Lokbon.

Previously to the establishment of the Regency Dekai was a small Momuna village home to about 10 -20 local families. It is an area originally opened up by GIDI local evangelists. It had a small airstrip, a primary school and a church. The Momunas traditionally are nomadic hunters and gatherers with their main staple being sago. Over the past 5 years the town of Dekai has grown rapidly with many roads, buildings and businesses. The majority of businesses in the centre of Dekai are owned by immigrants from other islands who have arrived by river. They have been given permission to open shops in the area of the local market and in several other roads in Dekai. Papuan businesses are scattered around the outskirts of the main centre in areas populated by people from the mountains. Several schools, government buildings, 2 hotels and various restaurants have been built. The new Regents office and DPR building are under construction. The airstrip has been improved and lengthened so that now an ATR or Hercules-plane can land. The air companies that service Dekai are MAF, AMA, Trigana and Susi Air. However, only MAF and AMA service the highland airstrips on a regular basis.

The majority of the people in Yahukimo are protestant (77,1%) or catholic (22,9%) Christians. About 40% of the inhabitants can not read or write. At the time of the Baseline survey there was 1 Kinder garden, 68 primary schools, 11 middle schools and 4 high schools as well as 33 parallel schools which are supported by Yasumat. There are also some primary schools run by Yayasan Yapesmi in the Una Ukam area.

Besides one hospital, there are 54 village clinics (4 Puskesmas and 50 Pusto) with 13 doctors, 115 nurses and 39 midwives available. The most common diseases in Yahukimo are Malaria, TBC, HIV/AIDS, and influenza.

A policy from the local government of handing out money at village level without any accountability mechanisms is encouraging bad financial management practices and not encouraging any kind of sustainable economic growth at village level. It is also creating a dependency on government and suppressing local initiative. This practice is also negatively affecting women (see section on women and economy in the highlands).

Sources of livelihood are mostly farming, pig breeding and hunting and the family income per day is low (approximately 1 to 3 US\$ per day). Local resources are wood, coffee, sweet potatoes (ubi jalar), several kinds of vegetables, peanuts, sago, bananas, avocado, “buah merah” (pandanus), pineapple, lemon, markisa.

Big business potential is seen in producing tahu and tempe (which is related to soybean production in the area). Indigenous people from the Lowlat area have already got some experience in producing tahu/tempe but have not received any help yet to be able to set up their own production business. Piscine culture and animal breeding (rabbits, pigs, chicken) have also good potential in the area. In the lowlands timber and non-timber forest products are not being used in an optimal way as there is no clear regulation and no forestry skills for developing management plans so that timber can be harvested in a sustainable way. There is much unregulated cutting and local people are not receiving a

fair price for their land or timber. There is a lack of skills in marketing of non-timber forest products which could be used for tourism, medical purposes, tourism, construction (rotan), food etc. In the villages there is a lot of potential for vegetables and other products but due to difficulties with transport and lack of knowledge of markets this potential is not used.

In Ninia and Kurima the government has already set up market-buildings to help women to sell their products in a save environment but elsewhere women still sit on the grass to offer their products. In Dekai the government has build 50 business units (Ruko) in order to train indigenous men to improve business capacity in the region. The Yahukimo government has contracted consultants from Forum Pelayanan Papua (FPP), an NGO from Bandung and they are training Papuans in these shops. However, there were only one or two women that benefited from this program.¹² In Dekai it is now possible to buy building material, clothes, music-CDs, electronic items and kitchen utensils which was not possible in former years. Service orientated businesses are mostly in the hands of non-local people. They work in repair workshops, photocopy-shops or provide sewing services or transportation services (by motorbike or by car). Providing internet services in Dekai seems to be a big business potential for the coming years since more and more people are coming to work for government agencies.

The government has provided several practical short-term training workshops (for buah merah, sagu, bricks, singkong) but has not yet been successful in setting up sustainable businesses in those areas which are run by indigenous people.

The Momuna tribe based around the new city of Dekai have a very limited engagement in business activities. Some do sell vegetables for daily needs on an irregular basis or sell animals (pigs, rabbits) to the government when there is an opportunity. Their literacy and numeracy is very poor as is their understanding of government and the world outside their local environment. The majority of Papuan businesses in and around Dekai are owned by people from the mountains. The tribes from the mountains for the most part have higher education levels (especially men) and a higher percentage have literacy and numeracy skills.

2.5 Women and Economic Development in the Highlands¹³

The lives of women in the central highlands are full of challenges and hardships. Their needs are rarely properly understood and they are never asked what they think about their own situation or about what they would like to do about it. They have no voice in the home, in the village, in the district or in the regency. There are many issues affecting their lives some of which are forefront in their minds and often not the issues that others would maybe prioritize for them.

¹² Unfortunately several of the indigenous trainees have already stopped their activities because they are not used to work continuously and do not feel comfortable to sit all day in a building.

¹³ This section is based on research done by Yasumat in Yahukimo during 2009. Gajian Permasalahan Perempuan di Yahukimo. There is also some information taken from the ILO Baseline survey.

Women in the villages have not many chances to take part in the development process because decision making is seen as a “men task”. Their traditionally low status in the tribal hierarchy and their low education level makes it difficult for women to increase income. Often women are still treated as second class people who only have the right to care for food and children and to serve their husbands. But as soon as women are given the chance to receive better education (when they live in the city) they directly show higher motivation to increase their business potential rather than men. As soon as they have the chance to save some money from selling vegetables on the markets they invest it in buying goods which they bring back to their small kiosks (in order to sell these goods for higher prices in the villages). While men are focussing on consumption women are much more aware that it is necessary to increase income to be able to care for future needs of their children.

Women sell vegetables and fruits on the local markets, while the men sell tobacco and fire wood. Prices for vegetables are given per “tumpuk” (a certain amount of vegetables put together as a small pile) and not per kg. Weights are not used on traditional markets. Most women do not know the value of vegetables and also do not understand how to set reasonable prices. Because of poor education women also have lower reading, writing and counting skills than men. On the other hand women are much more persistent and active in running a business because the need to raise money in order to be able to pay for the education process of their children. While men rather tend to sit together in groups to discuss cultural and political issues, the women work hard to keep their businesses going besides working in the gardens from where they get food for the family.

Almost all women are able to produce Noken the traditional string bag which is needed to bring vegetables from their gardens and which is also used to carry little children, but they mostly only produce Noken to use them for themselves own. Noken are only sold if the women need money to pay for school fees or to pay for transportation.

Women have an important role in the process of raising pigs which is one of the main economic contribution to the family and community. Pigs have a very high cultural value and are often treated like children. Some women in remote villages even breastfeed little pigs to help them grow faster. In traditional villages men and women do not live together in the same hut but pigs and women do. There are Honai-huts for men and others for women and pigs. Female pigs have higher value than male pigs. Pigs are used to pay for bride prices, they are also given as donations if someone dies in the family and are cut and eaten together to strengthen relationships at the big cultural pig-feast ceremonies “bakar batu”. It’s a girls task to collect food for the pigs and it’s a women-task to cook and care for the pigs. Many pigs are only raised to be eaten at the cultural pig-feasts and it is not allowed to sell them. Other pigs are sold if a child needs to pay for school fees. Mostly the first pig of a breeding success will be given to the church.

Women do not have easy access to government support whereas men seem to be able to access business capital much easier as they “hang around” the government offices, know how to write a proposal and use family relations to get the needed starting capital. Based on interviews from Perindakop in Yahukimo there has been no ‘modals’ (grants) provided to women. When asked why they would not go to the government office to look

for help they say they are too scared and do not understand. There is also a fear that they would not be respected or received properly.

It is difficult for women from the highland villages to come down to the city on their own to look for support from government so they are forced to start on their own. Therefore all of the businesses that were owned by women in the areas surveyed both during the baseline and during gender research carried out by Yasumat had started with their own savings or a contribution from their husbands. In Yahukimo regency there has been no specific government intervention to support economic initiatives for women. However, this situation is different in Jayawijaya where women have more experience in dealing with government and NGOs. Women generally start their economic initiatives from savings from selling vegetables. This often will then grow into buying other goods if they have an opportunity to go to the town.

In most areas of the highlands women have ways of finding income for their family even if it is not through a small business. In the majority of cases they try to sell vegetables. Women from remoter villages will often just buy and sell based on opportunity such as if they go to the town or if their husband goes to the town. The presence of an airstrip close by in remote areas that can receive a caravan plane greatly facilitates basic economic development although transport by plane hugely increases the price of goods. For example a kilo of rice in Ninia, Yahukimo now ranges between 35,000 to 40,000 Rp per kilo.

Women face challenges in the purchase of stock for their shops as they are normally not allowed to come to the city on their own to buy supplies and have to rely on family or their husbands to purchase for them. However, women closer to Wamena, are more independent. In villages within walking distance women often have come out on their own or nominated other women or young people to buy for them and walk in with them. Where the village is 2 to 3 days walking to town or less women have greater facility to come in and out but further than this it is very rare for a women to walk out. This is evident in Nalca and Puldama and Sela in Yahukimo where it is far from Wamena and dangerous to walk to Dekai.

Women seem much more efficient and strict with how money is saved and used. They are more aware of profit making and seem generally able to manage a business on the long term better than men. One of the reasons for this is that men are often drawn into other activities such as building projects and politics. Women who have a small income generally use this money for family needs and very rarely on themselves. In a survey done by Yasumat in Yahukimo 80 percent of women used money for school fees for children, 60 percent used money to buy basic needs for their family and to pay for health costs.

Women have practically no access to credit or savings facilities and even more so in Lany Jaya and Yahukimo where women have no access to a bank. Only the women who live near Wamena or around Dekai can access the bank.

It can be seen from both the baseline survey and also research done by Yasumat in Yahukimo that in general the opening of new regencies and their development is not

benefiting women in most cases and in many areas negatively affecting women's lives. The large amounts of money that have been distributed at village and district level such as Respek funds, Gifts for the poor, village funds and other monies just handed out have had minimal benefits for women. According to women interviewed the village heads just divide up the money among themselves and most women never receive any of it. Very little of money targeted for village development is actually used for any sustainable initiative which would benefit the local population long term and definitely not used for anything to improve the lives of women.

In the case of the RESPEK program which operated for one year in Yahukimo there were no places which followed the guidelines and provided 15 percent of the money for women's issues. Based on interviews with the planning department in Jayawijaya (BAPEDA) this is also the case in most villages in this regency. No women were involved in identifying the activities that were carried out. In most cases villages built and fixed paths for the money but this was mostly men who did the work.

Most women that were interviewed in the various studies carried out said that all the money that was dropped into the villages was making their lives worse. Many of their husbands used the money to travel to the towns leaving their wives on their own and therefore increasing the burden of workload for the women. Due to the increase in availability of money there is an increase in the tendency to take second and third wives which causes many problems for the women and children left behind.

3. Background on Evaluation

Under guidance of the ILO Jakarta and supervision of the ESD project manager TOR was developed to carry out a project evaluation to assess the impact of the project. This evaluation has the following expected outputs¹⁴:

1. An evaluation report in English presenting the impact of and lesson to be learnt from the ESD project in three regencies of Jayawijaya, Yahukimo and Lanijaya.
2. The evaluation has also to assess the work done and achieved by the project particularly in comparing with the baseline survey reported in the beginning of the project.
3. In conducting the evaluation, the consultant has to undertake a field visit interview and focus group discussion involving selected relevant project beneficiaries and stakeholders. Please list the stakeholders and interview questions to be established.
4. The evaluation report should follow the ILO Evaluation Report Template and specifically has to capture the assessment on the implementation of the project strategy, methodology and tools (training and its training materials), the project implementation mechanism and project sustainability in the context of indigenous

¹⁴ Based on ILO TOR

peoples' empowerment and its link to the poverty reduction strategy through the job creation and livelihood.

The evaluation was carried out over a period of 10 working days between the 10th and 22nd of December 2009. The sequence of the evaluation activities were as follows:

Date/December	Activity
10	Assessment of documentation
11	Interviews carried out with local actors and beneficiaries
12	Interviews carried out with ILO trainers and UN Joint Program Coordinator
14	Interview with government actors Preparation of background information and document structure.
15/16	Interviews and discussion groups carried out with project beneficiaries and partners (government and NGO). Preparation of presentation of initial results for stakeholder meeting.
17	Meeting for presentation of initial results to local stakeholders
18-21	Preparation of final evaluation document

The evaluation was carried out by Naomi Sosa who was supported by two staff from local NGO Yasumat (Ester Yahuli and Yaved Bagabol) who carried out interviews with local women and other beneficiaries. Yasumat works in the Regency of Yahukimo and partnered with ILO in several activities during 2009. Naomi Sosa works as an advisor in community development, gender and governance for Yasumat, seconded by Papua Partners¹⁵ from the UK.

The total budget for the evaluation (fees and operational costs) is US\$3000.

4. Methodology

This evaluation is focused on measuring progress towards the 3 project objectives as explained in section on project background. It will also take into account the achievement of the four project outputs and their activities. These outputs are as follows:

Output 1	Potential entrepreneurs and service providers in the Papua Highlands, including concerned government agencies, can identify micro and small enterprise potentials based on local resources in the area as well as the challenges
Output 2	At least 250 micro-entrepreneurs in the target Regencys, of whom 90% are women, have practical, effective and sustainable micro-enterprise management systems, generating increased income and (self) employment opportunities
Output 3	A community enterprise management support mechanism, through business development service (BDS) providers

¹⁵ www.papuapartners.org

Ouput 4	A workable framework for economic interaction between micro-entrepreneurs and established enterprises at the Regency level.
---------	---

The evaluation will also look at the use of the project strategy in achieving the objectives.

The evaluation asks the following key questions:

- a. Relevance: Is the project design and its implementation strategy relevant to the government's priorities and communities needs and interest?
- b. Effectiveness: Does the project achieve what it has set out to do in accordance to date? What contributes to the achievements? What are the challenges? What are the view of the project stakeholders?
- c. Efficiency: Did the project deliver services in a timely manner? Were the implementation arrangements appropriate? If not what are the difficulties and solutions tried?
- d. Sustainability: Will the project interventions (what are they) and results be sustainable beyond the project period? What need to be done to ensure that?
- e. What are the project experiences and results with gender specific measures since this is a gender-specific project?

To achieve the impact assessment objectives and to be able to give realistic recommendations for the follow up to this initial pilot project, the following tools have been used: interviews and group discussions with training participants, general public, government and NGO partners and stakeholders and observation. A presentation was given half way through the evaluation to key stakeholders and feedback was received which was used for the final preparation of this report. As the evaluator also works for one of ILO's NGO partners in one of the target regencies (YASUMAT) the experience and observation of this NGO in working with ILO is also included in the assessment. The interviews and discussions were carried out only within Jayawijaya Regency. This is mainly due to difficulties in transport and time limitations. However, the Lany Jaya government currently still maintains offices in Wamena and were interviewed here. Yasumat, the NGO who works in Yahukimo also has offices in Wamena and staff were involved in the evaluation.

The evaluation team endeavoured to include as many beneficiaries of the project as possible but often they were not present at their place of business or at their home. Also there were several heads of government departments that were not in Wamena during the period of the evaluation and their staff were not aware or briefed to respond to evaluation questions.

The report also used information from project documents including: project activity report, baseline survey report, participant data from workshops (TOE and TOT).

5. Findings

5.1 General impact of project according to achievement of project objectives and outputs

This section will focus on how the project achieved each of the objectives and will compare activities carried out with project outputs and planned activities. It will outline main activities and discuss how they contribute to the project's progress towards objectives and what the estimated impact is from these activities. It will also comment on impacts that were not planned for.

Objective 1: Enhanced awareness and understanding of the business potentials that abound in the Papua Highlands considering the existing natural resources.

For the achievement of this activity three main activities were planned

- Conduct a baseline survey of micro and small enterprise potentials considering local resources in the area, including existing entrepreneurs with special attention to indigenous women.
- Disseminate information on micro and small enterprise potentials and attendant challenges for their realization through the training of trainers and training of entrepreneurs.
- Facilitate the development and maintenance of a management information system (MIS) on micro and small enterprise potentials and entrepreneurs in the Papua Highlands.

Based on the evaluation process it can be concluded that one of the main achievements of the ILO ESD project has been the building of awareness on the business potentials in the central highlands among all the actors involved in economic development. This has mainly been through encouraging and facilitating people at all levels to examine their reality which has enabled discussion on what can really be done and how change could be achieved. During 2009 ILO have significantly and continuously increased awareness of the potentials of Papuan Entrepreneurs as well as the issues affecting them, especially indigenous women. However this impact is mainly limited to the Regency of Jayawijaya and to a lesser extent Lany Jaya. This has not yet been achieved in the Regency of Yahukimo among the government, business community or general population. Nevertheless, awareness has been raised in the local Yayasan Yasumat and this has had an impact on their thinking and planning for the future.

Baseline Survey

A baseline survey was carried out during the month of April 2009. This was done in coordination with three Yayasans in three Regencies. The three Yayasans are Yasumat, Bethesda and Oikonomos and they carried out research in the three Regencies of Yahukimo, Lany Jaya and Jayawijaya respectively. This baseline survey reported on the status of micro and small entrepreneurship activities in the Papua Highlands and was able to provide the following set of information:

1. An overview of the overall geographical, demographic, socio-economic, cultural and political condition in three regions of the Papua Highlands (Lanny Jaya, Yahukimo, Jayawijaya) with special attention to the status of the indigenous women and their role in the development process.
2. Detailed information on the key elements concerning micro and small entrepreneurship in three regions (Lanny Jaya, Yahukimo and Jayawijaya) in the Papua Highlands.
3. Clear and specific recommendations on how to effectively respond to the challenges facing micro and small enterprise development in the Papua Highlands in terms of priority support services (including training, social and physical infrastructure, etc.) and relevant policies that need to be made or improved.

The baseline survey was able to meet the objectives set out by the ILO-ESD project. In more detail it achieved the following:

- Each NGO worked using agreed methodologies and were able to carry out interviews with a total of 102 indigenous Papuan Business Owners. From this information a database was started which includes information on:
 - Existing entrepreneurs in each region (name of person, name of business, kind of business, address, contact number, year of start up, potential for development in the future).
 - Information on existing women business groups or individual women owned businesses with high potential for development in that region (name, area, kind of business).
 - Information on existing Business development service providers in the region (Regency) (name of organisation, objectives, kind of activities, name of contact person, telephone number, what material is used for small scale business development) in order to develop a network of micro and small enterprise support groups (NGO, church, government etc.) who work in entrepreneurship development in that region.
 - Information on supportive government officials (name of the person, name of the office he/she works in, position of the person in that office, office-address, telephone number) who want to help in entrepreneurship skills development in that region.
- The interviews carried out also provided real information that enabled each Yayasan to provide recommendations about what kind of new businesses with promising potential could be set up in the region.
- The baseline provided the opportunity for information to be collected on the overall geographical, demographic, socio-economic, cultural and political

condition in the specific region, with special attention to the status of the indigenous women and their role in the development process.

- Based on analysis of interviews and observation the baseline identified weaknesses of Papuan business owners in that region which need to be addressed in training and coaching. It identified strengths of Papuan Business owners and business potential (opportunities) in the region which needs to be developed. External influences (threats) which hinder economic development of Papuan entrepreneurs were also identified
- General recommendations were provided to ILO including strategies for coaching.

Many difficulties were faced by the teams carrying out the survey including a clash with the general elections which caused difficulty in travel especially in Yahukimo. Although one of the main survey objectives was to concentrate on women owned businesses it was difficult to find enough businesses which are run by women although there have been many women found who seem to have business potential to run a small business in the future. Most businesses in the survey areas are dominated and run by men although women often help their husbands in their businesses but are not given the right to make decisions. In the Yahukimo area only men have been supported by the government to get training in businesses. Therefore several men were also interviewed to get an idea about what kind of these businesses could also be run by women.

The baseline was not able to provide real quantitative data on certain issues due to the fact that many people interviewed had difficulty in understanding the questions that were asked. For example most people did not know the meaning of some of the business terminology such as “profit”. Due to poor counting skills of respondents the numbers provided for monthly or daily income, turnover or the amount of profit can not be considered as valid information but rather as guesses.

Most government officials interviewed during the baseline do not have the capacity yet to help indigenous Papuans to develop their businesses well. This huge lack of human resources in government offices which are involved in the planning of economic development activities seems to be one of the main reasons for the lack of well trained coaching staff, who could train Papuans in developing their businesses. Therefore the survey recommended that it would be very important to improve capacity among government officials and business development service providers in the regions first, before starting to address the more complicated problems in remote villages.

Apart from the main achievements of the baseline survey as outlined above there were other positive outcomes that were not planned for:

- Yayasanans that carried out the survey had their capacity built in research and analysis as well as basic economic principles.
- Yayasanans obtained useful information about the regions where they work which they had not previously understood. This has helped them refocus their own

programs and rethink approaches and assumptions (based on interviews with Oikonomos and Yasumat).

There were some weaknesses to the process of the survey and especially the process for presentation of results. The results were not able to be presented to the Jayawijaya and Lani Jaya government until the end of June. The results have still not been presented to the government of Yahukimo Regency. There has been no report available in Indonesian until the month of November 2009 so this has limited the potential impact that the details of the survey could have had in raising the understanding of issues affecting Papuan businesses among all actors. The main reasons that the presentation was not able to be made in Yahukimo was that the government asked that the printed report be available to them at the same time and this was not possible. However, there were also political factors that meant it was difficult for the government to find the time to support the presentation of the survey results. Due to this situation there is very little awareness within the Yahukimo Regency government of the situation of Papuan Business people in the regency and also of the objectives and activities of the ILO-ESD project. Most of government officials are unaware that Yahukimo is a target regency of the Program. If ILO is serious about working in Yahukimo activity they need to significantly increase the focus there.

Awareness Raising Activities

Awareness on the main issues surrounding entrepreneurship development and economic potentials was carried out through the use of media and socialisation meetings. A collaboration program was developed between ILO ESD Wamena and RRI Wamena (Radio of the Republic of Indonesia). This program includes: a) interactive radio program broadcasted every Tuesday between 07:15-08:00 AM Eastern Indonesian Time for a two month duration up until the end of November with entrepreneurship as the primary topic; b) spot or message broadcasting on the female roles within entrepreneurship, transmitted 2-5 spots daily and; c) weekly radio drama, broadcasted up to the end of November 2009.

The radio spots and programs have been a very good tool for socialisation and awareness raising. These activities have been able to back up many of the other ILO activities and help reach a wider audience. They also have provided ILO with a feedback mechanism from the public which is very useful for self-reflection and learning. It is difficult to estimate the impact from these programs but it can be said that these programs and spots brought several very important issues into the public forum for discussion. Issues such as provision of funding to people for businesses without provision of training and accompaniment from the general experience of the evaluator is one that is being discussed in many homes around Wamena. The programs and spots have raised these issues to the public forum and asked questions that will need to be answered by the government and civil society in the future.

A video, GET Ahead, The Movie has also been made by the project which shares the impacts of training and what can be achieved by strengthening women entrepreneurs. This film is a very good tool for showing the capacity and initiatives of Papuan women and has the potential to change mindsets on women in the highlands. It could be used as a tool for NGOs and Government in their training programs for motivation and should be

made widely available. ILO-ESD has been very successful in building relationships and getting involvement from all actors in entrepreneurship development. As mentioned previously the project has been very successful in raising awareness of issues affecting Papuan business people, especially women as well as raising awareness about potential areas for business development in the highlands.

However, it is still not clear among many actors especially entrepreneurs themselves and also some NGOs what the actual objectives of ILO in regards to this project are and in general what the mandate of ILO is. This comes out mainly in the form of misconceptions from entrepreneurs about what the way ILO works and lack of clarity from NGOs about certain strategies and how they are applied. These are small issues but could have negative impacts on the project if not dealt with early in the next stage.

For example some of the women interviewed felt that ILO had used their images on film without their permission and they were not in agreement with this. According to them this would be ok if ILO had invested in their business but they did not see the fact that they had received training from ILO as a good enough reason to be filmed for an ILO film. This comment mainly came from women who had little education and had not really felt the benefit of the training in their business. Other women, with more experience in business who understand the potential that the training offers them had no problem with these issues and generally felt that the promotion was good for them. The women that felt negatively said that this would be a reason to stop them going for more training. Based on this it is important that the aims of ILO are made very clear in all activities especially those involving promotion and awareness raising. This is mainly a cultural problem as it is difficult for most local people to understand that ILO could be doing something for the benefit of women without getting something for themselves in return. It is very important that all activities are seen through local cultural lenses so that difficulties and negative impacts can be minimised. Local Papuans are coming from a completely different world view and see activities, especially by outside actors often in a very different way and with different expectations than what is planned by the outside actor.

From an NGO perspective, the confusion mainly arises around work strategy and funding mechanisms. It is not clear to all what is ILOs way of working, their central aims, and target groups.

Management Information System:

The management information system or data base was initiated at the time of the baseline survey when valuable information was collected. It has been added to through data from participants in workshops. This type of system has a lot of potential for creating increased efficiency in work across all organisations and government departments working in entrepreneurship development in the highlands. It could also be an important resource for donors who start to work in the area. However, the information from the baseline was not presented back to ILO until November due to delays in the translation process so the database still has not been socialised and developed into a tool that can be used effectively.

Objective 2: Basic entrepreneurship skills acquired by partner community members, especially the indigenous women.

For the achievement of this objective four main activity types were planned as follows:

- Training (TOT using GET Ahead and STYB tools) and deploy micro and small enterprise development trainers in the target Regencies.
- Facilitate training of entrepreneurs (TOE) for qualified partner community members.
- Identify, train and deploy micro and small enterprise development coaches to conduct sustained hands-on follow up training for the micro and small entrepreneurs.
- Monitor the progress of trained micro and small entrepreneurs and identify areas of improvement which could be addressed through coaching activities.

The ILO-ESD project is most known in Wamena for the training part of the program and is what people in general associate with the project. When interviews were carried out with local government officials and NGO staff this is the part of the project where they have had most interaction and see the most activity and impact.

Training of Trainers

Through the training of trainers program in GET Ahead ILO have mobilized a lot of people with skills for supporting entrepreneurs. The project trained people from the NGO sector, Church, UNVs, and government staff, creating a body of potential trainers that can support the follow up process. Table 5.1 indicates the amount of people trained as trainers and in what aspect during the course of the project.

The project baseline showed that there were very few people that were equipped to support entrepreneurs especially in remoter areas in Lany Jaya and Yahukimo. From the TOT for Get Ahead a total of 137 people trained as trainers over the course of 7 workshops (one of these was in Sorong) there are currently approximately 20 facilitators that have been active in training others. Out of these 20 there are three that have been trained as trainers themselves and are most active. Therefore there is still an untapped potential of people that could become accompaniers of entrepreneurs. This means also that there is significant progress on preparing people to support local entrepreneurs even if the majority of these people are not yet active. There needs to be more follow up to those trained and a support mechanism developed which could be supported by local NGOs or churches. This is particularly important in Lany Jaya and Yahukimo where communication is difficult.

Table 5.1 Table explaining TOT workshops carried out and type of participants

Name of workshop	Date	Place	Type of participant	Number of participants	Number of women
TOT Get	9-13 Feb	Kota Wamena	NGO	25	5

Ahead					
TOT	7-21 Maret	Kota Wamena	Pemerintah and NGO	19	5
TOT Get Ahead		Wamena	UNV	13	5
TOT Get Ahead		Sorong	UNV	7	
TOT Get Ahead	27-30 Mei	Wamena	Yayasan dan Gereja	26	11
TOT Get Ahead	2-5 Juni 2009	Tiom	Gereja	21	6
TOT Respek	29 Juni – 2 Juli	Wamena (peserta kerja di Jayawijaya dan Lany Jaya)	Pendamping Distrik, Karyawan Distrik, UPKD, TPKK	26	4
TOT SIYB	24 Agust- 3 Sept	Wamena	NGO, Experienced entrepreneurs	25	10
TOT TMF	2-6 Nov	Wamena	NGO, UNV,	18	5
TOT IYES	9-13 Nov	Wamena			
TOT BDSP	30 Nov-2 Dec	Wamena	NGO, Church, Bank, Government	31	7
TOTAL				211 ¹⁶	58

Training for facilitators carried out in Tiom appear to have had good impact in mobilizing people, especially church organizations. Facilitators that graduated from the training in Tiom participated in support roles in further TOE training in Tiom, Pirime and Makki Villages in Lani Jaya Regency. The training of church workers and local organization members in the remoter areas appears to have a lot of potential. These people are not as busy as those based in Wamena and seem more likely to follow up their training and passing on knowledge to others as it fits a need within local communities. There has been very little of this type of training in Lany Jaya and Yahukimo and therefore where it happens it is more likely to have buy in and commitment than training in Wamena where many people have existing commitments or are easily distracted by other activities.

ILO also trained 13 UNVs (5 of which are women) from the regencies of Lany Jaya, Jayawijaya, Mimika, Sarmi, Yapen Waropen and Yahukimo. It was hoped that these UNVs, especially those from the highland areas would be active in their participation of TOE trainings in their place of work. Some of these UNVs helped at the TOEs that were carried out in their areas but they are not yet active in carrying out training themselves¹⁷. It was estimated from this workshop that five of the participants had the potential to be GET Ahead Facilitators. There was another training of UNV in Sorong where 7 UNVs

¹⁶ Some of the people in this total attended several workshops. This is a general estimate of the total attending each workshop added together and does not take into account people who attended more than one workshop.

¹⁷ Comment from UN Joint Program Coordinator

were involved. Further follow up to these UNVs is needed as they are in a position to carry out and organize further trainings and coaching at village level.

ILO-ESD also trained 26 people from the RESPEK program in Jayawijaya in coordination with the Village Community Development Body of Jayawijaya. It is not clear what impact this activity has had as there has not been good coordination or feedback from the RESPEK facilitators to ILO on how they used their training. The training and accompaniment of RESPEK facilitators in implementation of GET Ahead principles and coaching has huge potential as they are supposed to be in the villages accompanying the local people in their development process and in the use of funds from the provincial government. However, the management of this program is based at a provincial and national level so negotiations would need to be directly from ILO Papua or in Jakarta.

ILO ESD does not have specific standards for the selection of facilitators and will work with whoever shows enthusiasm and motivation to train others after they have received the training. This is good as it does not limit who becomes a trainer, however some people trained may not come back to ILO as there are not specific processes in place to follow up with them. Often it happens that although ILO may not identify a particular person to be a facilitator or hear from them directly again, some of those trained have used the material within their own context and adapted it to suit the situation. This has been seen in Ninia where Yasumat staff have taken certain principles and sections and used it in their accompaniment of local business women. Also Yayasan Humi Imane have used the material in their own training with women. Some participants also were able to support workshops in their own communities when ILO came to carryout workshop activity.

Training process for Entrepreneurs (TOE)

The baseline study showed that some of the main weaknesses of Papuan women entrepreneurs preventing them from progressing in business were a lack of knowledge of basic business administration, and financial management. Lack of self esteem and cultural factors are also very important. Table 5.2 below shows the main factors identified by the baseline study that limit progress for Papuan Entrepreneurs and women entrepreneurs specifically.

The training provided by the ILO-ESD project using the GET Ahead module mainly focuses on the administration, finance and marketing factor but also through its participatory way of teaching provides opportunities for women to speak out hence giving a voice to them. The module on gender also is inserting new ways of thinking about relationships between men and women and how this affects aspects of their lives. These factors are a good start to tackling issues of culture and gender but need much more in-depth activity before having a real impact on the basic issues.

Table 5.2: Table showing main challenges and characteristics of entrepreneurs in highlands

Characteristics of Papuan Entrepreneurs <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Low self esteem - Focus on consumption of goods rather than planning for the future. 	Management Skills <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Poor education - Poor financial management - Poor profit management - Lack of understanding about the market
Constraints for entrepreneurs <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Keeping good relationships is more important than making a profit - Social pressures to give donations destroy the cash flow. - Donations for cultural ceremonies - Leadership style which doesn't support initiatives - Fear of curses and spirits - 	Other challenges which affect economic development for Indigenous Papuans <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Poor access to banks - Lack of experience with modern technology - There is no support from experienced suppliers - There is a negative impact from money disbursement/handouts at village level - The majority of the Yahukimo is remote and transportation is difficult – access often only by plane, helicopter or walking. Other areas in Lany Jaya are access only by road and plane. - Women have a very subordinate role in culture

During 2009 the ILO-ESD project carried out a total 21 workshops for local entrepreneurs especially women. These workshops have trained a total of 625¹⁸ entrepreneurs in basic entrepreneurship skills using the GET Ahead Principles. Out of this total 70% (437) participants were women. The original target was to train 250 entrepreneurs of which it aimed for 90% women participation. The project has far surpassed this original target but women's participation is lower than originally hoped for. However, it is felt that 70% participation by women is already a significant achievement given the gender inequality in the central highlands. Women's participation is normally very difficult to achieve at village level due to dominance of men in any local activities. Also the fact that men were present at most of the workshops helped promote more balanced discussion on gender issues.

70% of those that received training were from the Regency of Jayawijaya, 22% were from Lany Jaya and only 8% were from Yahukimo. These figures are based on where the workshops were held rather than where the participants are from. The table below shows more detail on workshops carried out.

The majority of entrepreneurs that were trained had shops as their main business (25%). 17% of participants had livestock businesses, 11% sold beetle nut (pinang), 6% sold vegetables in the local markets, 5% are craft makers (net bags and other weaving), The rest were made up of people who had honey businesses, sold firewood, had small food warungs, sold fuel, cakes or local coffee. This variety shows the potential that exists among local entrepreneurs. Due to the fact that there is now a database of local entrepreneurs in the highlands it should be possible to organize further training to bring

¹⁸ This number also includes those who received socialisation on the SYIB tool

together people for training who work in the same area. It is not clear if the women that sell vegetables are also producers of vegetables or if they just buy and sell. There is a huge potential in Wamena to encourage and promote the agro-business sector as the majority of the population are engaged here and have an expertise that others do not have. Due to the fact that there are plans to develop roads and river transport this area should begin to be developed so that the area is ready to export when the time comes.

Table 5.3: Table showing location and participants of workshops carried out for TOE in GET Ahead

Date of workshop	Title of workshop	Place	Local Partner	Total no. of participants	No. of women participants
10-13 Nov	TOE	Wamena	General entrepreneurs	11	6
27-30 April	TOE	Ninia, Kab. Yahukimo	General entrepreneurs	29	29
4-6 May	TOE	Kimbim, Asologaima	General entrepreneurs	32	21
7-9 May	TOE	Muliama, Asologaima	General entrepreneurs	30	25
11-13 May	TOE	Pyramid,, Asologaima	General entrepreneurs	27	20
25-27 May	TOE	Wamena	General entrepreneurs	27	19
26-28 May	TOE	Bolakme	General entrepreneurs	30	15
8-10 June	TOE	Kurima, Kab. Yahukimo	General entrepreneurs	25	21
11-13 June	TOE	Wamena	Baptist Sion Church	26	12
15-17 June	TOE	Wamena	Women from Jibama market	16	11
15-17 June	TOE	Wamena	GKI Church Woma	25	20
16-18 June	TOE	Wamena	General entrepreneurs	42	19
22-24 June	TOE	Pirime, Lani Jaya	General entrepreneurs	61	27
22-24 June	TOE	Makki, Lani Jaya	General entrepreneurs	35	13
23-25 June	TOE	Wamena	Catholic church	33	32
23-25 June	TOE	Kama, Wamena	General entrepreneurs	25	24
9-11 Juli	TOE	Pisugi, Kurulu	Kingmi Church	21	18
27-29 Juli	TOE	Hipuba, Asolokobal	General entrepreneurs	32	29
30 Juli – 1 Agust	TOE	Siepkosi, Walegama	General entrepreneurs	39	18
4-5 Sept	Socialisation SYIB –	Wamena	Entrepreneurs who have already received	59	58

	ideas for Business		training		
26-29 Okt	SYIB	Wamena	Department for transport, information and communication.	No data	
<i>Totals</i>				625	437

Based on interviews carried out with participants of the TOE workshops there is generally a positive impact and beneficial knowledge that they feel they have gained. The TOE workshops generally benefited those with longer experience in business more than those with only a few years and who had not yet a well developed business. Some impacts that were felt by the participants were as follows¹⁹:

- The main learning point mentioned by majority of women interviewed is in the area of separation of private money from business money.
- Women with more well developed business or who had been a long time running their business commented that they have been able to significantly improve their administration and finance management based on the training. They already had a good base of knowledge and the training fitted very well with their needs which were mostly in the area of administration.
- Apart from the technical aspects of the training the opportunity provided by ILO for women to get together and discuss the challenges they faced as women and look at the potentials for their business was motivating and empowering. Despite issues raised by some of the women that are mentioned below overall the training has changed something inside the majority of them, and they are motivated to change. However this change will not happen if these workshops are not followed up with more in depth accompaniment and training more specific to their needs.
- The training has raised awareness about what can be done, about the potentials that Indigenous Papuan entrepreneurs have, the potentials of the region and what needs to be done to move forward.
- The workshops that were held at a community level increased understanding of the issue of gender. Much more needs to be done to bring about changes in the attitudes to women within the local culture however, these sessions provided good opportunities for women and men to bring issues out into the open. This worked best where there was a good balance of men and women taking part in the training.

Providing women with information on access to credit and breaking down perceptions on issues regarding to banks has been very useful to many women even if they have not been successful in accessing credit. Women were very happy to receive information on banking especially on access to credit. This helped them understand the process and the

¹⁹ Based on interviews with 10 participants from various TOE trainings and on NGOs and Facilitators who have relationships with the participants.

steps involved. According to ILO progress reports approximately 18 training participants on ILO ESD course have had their credit applications approved by Bank Papua Wamena Branch.

Progress towards output

It can be said based on results from interviews, progress reports and observations from participation in the process of the project that at the end of 2009 the output two has been surpassed in terms of quantity however it cannot be said that the project has achieved that 250 entrepreneurs have practical, effective and sustainable micro-enterprises. This is a long term target and cannot be hoped to be achieved in one year and through having limited interaction with beneficiaries. Main interaction was through participation in the workshop and some limited follow up and motivation by facilitators, but this was not continuous due to lack of availability of people. There is definitely some impact and ILO have moved closer to the target but the impact is still only general in scope and needs to be deepened.

Due to ILO-ESD intervention in areas where training is being carried out it can be said that thinking has started to change but in most cases this has not translated into action in terms of change. However, for a one year project, especially working in the highlands of Papua the small impact that has been felt is a significant achievement. This is why follow up and joint working between ILO-ESD, government and civil society is so important. ILO cannot hope to follow up on all these entrepreneurs on their own. They need to work with NGOs and churches who have the potential, if strengthened and supported to move from a superficial impact to real change in behavior bringing about changes in peoples livelihoods.

Role of NGOs

It is strongly felt by all NGO leaders and staff interviewed that NGOs should play a stronger role in the achievement of this objective. All commented that the training that ILO provided was an activity that could better be carried out by NGOs and Church organizations who are more aware of cultural issues and have ongoing relationships in the communities. They are also better able to overcome logistical issues in the remote highland areas such as Yahukimo. ILO could be overseeing and strengthening the NGOs to improve their capacity as business service providers in the areas that they work in.

Potential of working with local churches

ILO-ESD has considerable success in working together with local church congregations to implement training for women entrepreneurs. Local churches have made many requests for training and are willing to provide counterpart support to training by facilitating a place and often also cooking. They also can select the participants to be trained. This is a potential partner that could be strengthened in the future for further more in depth activities.

Some weaknesses and areas for improvement are identified by the women and other stakeholders interviewed:

- The training needs to go more into depth as they cannot learn how to do administration and finances just in a few days. Maybe it could be for longer or split into two sessions? They each need more individual help in their place of business. This shows the need which was recommended in the baseline study of more intensive follow up and continuous accompaniment to entrepreneurs.
- The training was very general in nature ie covered many issues and most interviewees felt it fit best with managing a shop. Although the GET Ahead training does use different examples this was the perception that they felt. This may have been affected by the larger percentage of participants that did run small shops. Women felt that they would benefit from advice and training on specific types of businesses such as cake making, livestock, agriculture produce as the principles are different.
- Some NGOs interviewed felt that the trainers lacked specific experience in the business types where most Papuan women work and that impact could significantly be increased if the training was more focused and the same type of business holders were trained together ie. Those who sell vegetables together, shop owners together, livestock producers together.
- Some women and also NGO staff interviewed felt that although the GET ahead material is very good in some cases it is too high a level for where the indigenous Papuan entrepreneurs are at. The majority of NGO staff felt that it needed to be contextualized and made more appropriate to the Papuan Context. In some cases experienced facilitators can do this in the training process but for new trainers this is not always possible and they will heavily depend on the training modules.
- Some NGOs interviewed felt that some of the trainers that they had observed in training often provided information to entrepreneurs that was not correct or did not provide them with the best solution. This was mainly in the area of working out finances and administration. It was felt that this was due to the fact that the majority of facilitators had never had the experience of running a business themselves which can mean that often responses are based on theory rather than experience. This may also be due to the inexperience of the facilitators and they themselves need more training especially in responding to needs of specific types of businesses and more practical experience of what it feels like to run a business on a day to day basis so that they can respond and teach based on their own experience rather than just from what they have learned in the TOT workshop.

Assessment of applicability of GET Ahead Training Materials for local context

From a revision of the GET Ahead materials this evaluator is of the opinion that the materials can be used effectively in the context of the highlands. It has been designed for working with those who cannot read or write and is very simple. It is practical with lots of examples to work through which is mainly the way that Papuan's learn. It is however designed to cover all aspects of managing a small business and therefore it is felt that even in one week there is not enough time to go into enough detail to really build understanding. Follow up on the main principles is definitely required with practice

carried out in place of business. The way the material is received and understood will of course depend hugely on the capacity of local facilitators to be able to adapt the material to every local context where they are teaching and to teach using simple languages. As mentioned above the majority of facilitators have never actually run a business themselves and so although can explain the main issues may provide wrong information when provided with problems experienced by the entrepreneur. Also if the facilitator is not clear or speaks in rapid Indonesian this may cause the lack of clarity that some women expressed. There are some ways that the training could be adapted both in its printed presentation, its verbal presentation and also in the provision of support material to facilitators to help them in explaining some of the more complex concepts using local examples. Some suggestions are as follows:

- Provide additional material on financial management for facilitators/trainers worked out for different types of businesses.
- Trainers and facilitators if possible should have or gain some practical experience in running a business themselves so they can replicate this to the local entrepreneurs.
- Introduce drawings and examples from a Papuan context
- Additional material which works through ways of running businesses that are common to Papuans
- There are success stories from Papuan women

Training with Start and Improve Your Business (SIYB)

A selection process was carried out for candidates suitable for receiving ongoing training using the SYIB methods. A socialization workshop was carried out for Papuan Business Women on this methodology during September. A SYIB workshop took place during October in collaboration with the Office of Social Welfare and Manpower Affairs of Jayawijaya Regency. The participants were mainly business owners under the sponsorship of this office. Seventeen small business owners participated. It was felt by some of the facilitators that this method is still too advanced for the local situation and beyond the capacity of local businesses to absorb. It may be worth looking for other materials which are already prepared for the level of more experienced Papuan Entrepreneurs which are not yet ready for SYIB.

Issues affecting the impact mobilizing trainers from TOT as coaches (activity 3).

One of the main limitations in the process of training entrepreneurs is that it was not possible during 2009 to set up an effective coaching process. This is due to a variety of factors mainly due to the availability of coaches.

- One of the main issues that has come out from interviewing participants from the TOT workshops is that due to the fact that many participants were from NGOs when these people were selected as facilitators often the NGO was not pleased

that their staff was spending time working for another organization without previous agreement from the NGO in question. Therefore several potential facilitators did not continue in this role. This issue could be avoided if more formal clearer relationships were developed between the project and NGOs so that the NGOs could take on responsibility for certain training activities. This is explained further in the TOE section.

- There was no formal extended structure established in the project for the provision of coaching apart from expectation that facilitators trained by TOT process would become coaches. This is most likely due to the fact that ILO-ESD was not aware of human resources available in terms of NGOs, Churches before the project started and therefore there was no activities and budget to engage more effectively with these actors to establish a network. After the first year ILO-ESD is in a much better position to build on relationships developed to follow up and deepen knowledge in entrepreneurs through coaching.
- Due to the type of terrain, communications it is difficult to monitor these trainers and provide them with support in order to carry out further trainers. In many cases training may have been carried but due to poor communications this has not been communicated to ILO. However, this is not necessarily a problem as such, just that it is difficult for ILO to measure impact of their actions in more remote areas. As ILO-ESD has only one full time staff in Wamena it is difficult to provide motivation and also to encourage these trainers to provide accompaniment to local entrepreneurs.
- Many people trained as Trainers were too busy in other activities or became government employees during the year which prevented their involvement on a continuous basis in further training or in providing coaching.

The above factors have limited the initiation of the coaching process during the first year but there is a good basis built for this to be put into place over 2010.

Objective 3: Increased capacity of micro and small entrepreneurs to manage their enterprises and business development service providers to coach the micro and small entrepreneurs.

For the achievement of this objective there are two outputs and eight activities

Output 3: A community enterprise management support mechanism, through business development services (BDS) providers.

- Identify, train and engage the services of business development service providers to serve in the target regency.
- Facilitate the development of community enterprise management support mechanisms with the BDS providers to ensure sustained delivery of technical assistance to the micro and small entrepreneurs.

- Monitor the delivery of business development services to identify its strengths and weaknesses and areas for improvement.
- Undertake the necessary adjustments to enhance the quality of business development services delivery.

Output 4: A workable framework for economic interaction between micro-entrepreneurs and established enterprises at the Regency level.

- Identify established enterprises in the target kabupaten (and nearby areas) who are willing and able to do business micro and small entrepreneurs in the target regency.
- Facilitate dialogue and workshops for the development of mechanisms of collaboration between the micro and small entrepreneurs and established businesses in the area.
- Monitor the operation of the business collaboration framework and identify areas of improvement.
- Undertake necessary adjustments to increase the effectiveness of the business collaboration framework.

Establishment of Community Enterprise Management Support Mechanism

The baseline survey looked at the provision of Business Development Services (BDS) within the project area with the aim that these BDS would become partners of ILO-ESD in supporting entrepreneurs in the target Regencies. The baseline found that there were very few BDS functioning that currently had the capacity to effectively serve small and micro entrepreneurs with technical assistance. In Jayawijaya one main functioning BDS is Oikonomos who provides training, accompaniment, support in access to bank services and opportunities for practical experience. Oikonomos mainly focus on the regencies of Jayawijaya, Mombramo Tenggara and Yalimo. They are also developing a business advisory service currently providing help in preparing business development plans but this is still in an initial stage.

In Lany Jaya there are no organisations functioning as a BDS although there are several NGOs in this area who could potentially be trained in the future to provide services to small and local entrepreneurs. In Yahukimo this is also the case. There is one BDS called Papua Service Forum who are from Java. However, they are currently under contract to the government and do not have a long term program in the area. Yasumat is a local indigenous NGO providing basic services (health, education, community development, land rights and forestry to remote communities. They do have some economic development activities including micro credit and creation and support of small businesses but they still don't have the capacity to provide a good quality BDS without further training being provided.

Due to the above ILO-ESD has decided to support the set up of a new BDS entity. A workshop was held to provide training in the principles of BDS at the end of November 2009. Just after this workshop a group was developed from experienced trainers/facilitators to set up a local BDS in Wamena City. ILO will provide a grant for a

the start up of this. The concept for the BDS is to set up an open shop system in a café environment. This café will promote and sell local coffee as well as other products and provide technical advice to entrepreneurs that need it. The facilitators/trainers that are starting this initiative also have ideas to work together with micro-finance providers in assisting with follow up and coaching. This central place would be supported with facilitators that are based in villages. This BDS will only have the capacity to serve entrepreneurs within Jayawijaya so it is key for the project to look at how it can extend this BDS capacity to the other target regencies.

There is considerable buy in for this concept from local regency government authorities which is a good sign for their sustainability. In Jayawijaya the BDS centre has already been provided with a location by the Social Development Department. The Regent of Lany Jaya has committed that he will provide a significant grant for the operation of a BDS for whichever NGO will set one up at a Regency level. Therefore the follow up for the new regencies will need to focus on capacity building processes of local actors which could be church, NGO or cultural organisations.

As this activity is only starting impact cannot be assessed however it can be said that the process for setting up an enterprise support mechanism has good community and government support in two of the three target regencies and has the potential to succeed in Jayawijaya. The people involved are motivated and have good skills. Also one of the main initiators for the BDS is a woman local to the area.

Establishment of a workable framework for economic interaction between micro-entrepreneurs and established enterprises at the Regency level

The main activities carried out in this area were focused around networking and advocacy. There are many varied processes still ongoing which have not yet had any concrete results in terms of visible support to small and local entrepreneurs. Other activities have started to show results. Most of the successes in this area are due to the networking and social skills of the local ILO-ESD staff who has done a very good job of bringing people together, initiating dialogue, passing on ideas and sharing learning. ILO-ESD has initiated a process that has the potential to create a situation where there is economic interaction between micro-entrepreneurs and established enterprises however there are many challenges to achieving this. Some of the main challenges include established networks between cultural groups from other islands which are difficult for Papuans to enter into, a lack of interest from established entrepreneurs to help micro-entrepreneurs and the lack of capacity of Papuan entrepreneurs to provide products to sellers on a continuous basis.

The main processes initiated by ILO-ESD through networking and advocacy and the initial impacts of these activities are described below:

- A good relationship has been built with Bank Papua. Staff and managers from the bank have engaged in training of entrepreneurs, been involved in dialogue on the radio with ILO-ESD and have worked with ILO-ESD to encourage Indigenous Papuans to start saving and also to access credit. This relationship has already had

good results in that at least 18 entrepreneurs have achieved credit and many more have been able to open bank accounts and initiate savings. ILO-ESD supported Bank Papua to attend training on Micro-Finance in Bandung with the aim of strengthening their skills to serve the local Papuan People.

- Efforts have been made to build networks with the local chamber of commerce but as of yet there is no enthusiasm to be involved with ILO-ESD.
- Good coordination has been established between ILO-ESD and the local government departments. Many of the activities and training events have been carried out with their cooperation. This has created a good buy in and strong support. All government officials interviewed fully supported the aims of the project although there is still limited involvement in actual implementation. Some of the government officials felt that they need more direct support to the actual departments in terms of training and would also like to be more involved in monitoring and evaluation. This would create more ownership of the process and build capacity for government departments to improve their service to Papuan entrepreneurs.
- Good relationships have been developed with local NGOs. The central Highlands discussion forum was launched on August 20 2009 during an interactive dialogue on RRI. This is a form of collaboration of NGO/BDSP which are actively involved in public empowerment. Not all actors are involved in the economic sector. It is hoped that this discussion forum would accelerate community development in the central highlands and to act as a partner of the local government. The setting up of this forum is mainly the result of negotiation by ILO-ESD. It was originally hoped that this forum could become the basis for a Business consulting firm but activity has been minimal since it has been set up so this has not taken place. There was events held around World Poverty Week which raised the profile of the Forum but there have been no activities since. It is difficult to say why this Forum has not taken off as expected but it may be due to a lack of real felt need from the NGOs themselves. As the forum was started by ILO and not by one of themselves there is no current clear leadership or ownership of the process. There also may have been expectations from NGOs of support from ILO for training activities but this is not clear.
- ILO facilitated the visit of the Pancur Kasih Credit Union to Wamena to present their experience in West Kalimantan with the Dayak indigenous population. A general workshop was held as well as socialisation activities with local NGOs and Government officials. From this activity there were several results: firstly the regent of Jayawijaya committed to allocating funds to developing a micro-finance institution in Jayawijaya Regency; The NGO Oikonomos felt that the concept had a lot of potential and took the initiative to travel to West Kalimantan to visit the credit union and learn from their activities. They now have plans to develop a credit union, starting with people close to the organisation to see how it will initially work.

- ILO-ESD has formed collaboration with the state owned pawnshop (Perum Pegadaian). They were able to present information at one of the TOE workshops on alternative micro-financing for business development purposes. The relationship with this entity is very promising. They are very new in Wamena and are open to establishing working relationships with ILO-ESD and supporting micro-entrepreneurs in the highlands. As of July 35% of customers were from the central highlands including the three target regencies.
- Other promotion and social activities has taken place to strengthen relationships, raise the profile of local products as well as the local women entrepreneurs themselves.

As with other objectives the impact is mainly limited to Jayawijaya for 2009 but the successful activities could be adapted and replicated in the other two regencies.

5.2 Assessment of project according to Key Questions

This section of the evaluation will assess the project achievements through the key evaluation questions as outlined in output 2 of the Evaluation TOR.. This section will focus on additional information only. If the questions have already been answered in section five it will refer to this.

5.2.1 Project Relevance

Based on the results of the baseline survey it can be said that the ILO-ESD project is relevant to the communities needs and interests. Economic development is a high priority among communities in the central highlands and this project is tackling key weaknesses for economic growth as identified in the baseline survey results such as training in business administration and market opportunities. It is important that this project focuses specifically on women as this is a need but not necessarily normally identified by key actors.

Local government also prioritizes economic development but they may not have necessarily have identified women as the main priority group. They also have never focused specifically on training as a strategy for strengthening entrepreneurs preferring to focus on providing business grants. This normally has no follow up and no capacity building linked to it. The ILO-ESD project fills a gap in this area and complements the government strategy. It is important now to build government and NGO capacity in the area that ILO-ESD is currently acting.

It is always going to be difficult going to be inserting the issue of gender into any development process in the central highlands due to cultural norms currently existing. However, there seems to be a good acceptance among stakeholders especially in Jayawijaya of the priority on women from this project. It remains to be seen whether this will be the case in Yahukimo and a different strategy may need to be taken to empower the women entrepreneurs and ensure that they are not sidelined.

5.2.2 Project Effectiveness

The issue of effectiveness has mostly been answered in section five of this report where achievements and impact compared to objectives and outputs are compared. The main project achievements have also been outlined in section five. It can be concluded that the project has achieved good progress towards the three objectives but has not achieved them in full in terms of the intended impact of changed behavior and situations as stated in project outputs. However, it is felt that the outputs developed at the beginning of the project are more appropriate to a longer term project and not to a short term 6 month project. It has been able to carry out most activities apart from several under objective three. Views of stakeholders are explained in section 5.

The main factors contributing to achievements are as follows:

- The facilitative way of working of the project coordinator in Wamena. His motivation encouraged buy in from all stakeholders and ensured support for all the ongoing activities.
- Good planning, organizing and task sharing allowed for many workshops to be held at the same time. This was done by using the services of trained facilitators which although were not as many as hoped definitely contributed to the achievement of the numbers of entrepreneurs that were trained.
- The use of media especially the radio allowed for news of the entrepreneurship potentials and also for opportunities for training to be socialized widely. This also allowed for feedback to ILO-ESD from the general public which encouraged learning during the process of the project.
- Training facilitators to become trainers of entrepreneurs is a good strategy for increasing and widening impact especially in such a remote area. Even though numbers were not as high as hoped or work was not as consistent as hoped these facilitators were one of the main contributors to the success that ILO-ESD has had during 2009.

The main challenges affecting this project are as follows:

- A misunderstanding of the mandate of ILO and of UN agencies in general in the central highlands. It is very important for both ILO and the UN Joint program to understand how they are seen through the eyes of local Papuans. In many cases there is expectations way beyond what ILO's mandate and purpose is.
- The political processes that took place during 2009 placed severe challenges to the ILO-ESD project. This was mainly in the regency of Yahukimo where election processes and their follow up were stricken with allegations of corruption and fraud. It has been very difficult for the local government within this regency to act in an effective and focused way due to these issues.

- The low level of education of the general population in the central highlands especially women presents a serious challenge to a project of this type. It means that training needs to take this into account and different skills need to be used to communicate information.
- Transport and logistics are very difficult especially in Yahukimo but also in Lany Jaya. In Lany Jaya there is road transport available to the capital town but from there the only access is by walking to villages. In Yahukimo apart from the districts of Kurima and Dekai access is by small aircraft or by foot. This means that careful planning and coordination is necessary to carry out training or other activities in these areas. All communication is done by SSB radio and it is therefore critical that ILO-ESD works in close coordination with local NGOs and/or church who know the situation and the people very well and can act as effective facilitators of the process.
- Lack of capacity of civil society to engage effectively with the project. Although there has been effective collaboration with NGOs, local cultural organizations and churches in implementation of certain project activities and capacity exists there is generally a lack of experience in civil society in economic development in the project area. Firstly, there are only a few NGOs active in Lany Jaya and Yahukimo and none currently have sufficient capacity to serve as a BDS. Secondly, there are cultural organizations and churches who are motivated and want to promote economic development activities but their level of experience is still extremely limited. Therefore, if ILO want to effectively transfer knowledge and work with local organizations they will need to invest more time and energy into capacity building of these groups especially in the Lany Jaya and Yahukimmo.
- Local norms and practices that affect the lives of women in the central highlands are a challenge to achieving the promotion of women entrepreneurs. As found in the baseline survey and in other research carried out on the issue of gender in the central highlands women are still regarded as second class citizens and are below men when it comes to decision making and power. However, in Jayawijaya this is somewhat different than in the other regencies due to the influence and presence of so many women entrepreneurs that are the main income earners for their family. It can be seen that women can be empowered through economic development and this can have a knock on effect on gender relations. In Yahukimo especially it is recommended that the project works closely with the church on the issue of gender as they have a lot of influence at a local community level.

5.2.3 Project Efficiency

The project did deliver services in a timely manner. The time was extended twice as more opportunities were identified.

It is felt that implementation arrangements were not appropriate to achieving the three objectives effectively and efficiently in three large regencies, especially ones having the

logistical challenges of Lany Jaya and Yahukimo. It would be preferable if ILO could provide one coordinator for each regency or at least one for Jayawijaya and Lany Jaya and another for Yahukimo. In this way relationships could be better built in all regencies. As the implementation structure is currently in place it is very difficult for one person to affect the three areas at the same level. If the current structure is kept it will be very difficult to extend achievements from Jayawijaya to other areas.

The other option which has not been tried is to contract services out to NGOs, cultural organizations or churches or a grouping of the three for a particular regency. It is vital that if this takes place it happens early in the year so it can be fitted in with local plans and priorities and also training can be provided so these groups can support ILO-ESD in achieving the objectives. If an initiative or specific activity is requested to an NGO or other group without a process of joint planning and agreement taking place previously this can negatively affect other activities of these organizations. It is generally difficult to find staff and therefore especially NGOs are limited in their workforce and are generally unwilling to have their staff diverted for other activities unrelated to their current organizational aims. Therefore it is advantageous to ILO-ESD to find ways of how their program can fit in with NGO programs and then support this financially so it will be carried out in an efficient way. In this way the programs will start to be 'owned' by local actors and improve sustainability.

5.2.4 Project Sustainability

This issue of sustainability of each initiative has been discussed under the description of achievement against each objective in Section 5. In general it can be said that the project has created an initial basis for creating sustainability however, more long term intervention is required before interventions become sustainable. There are several main interventions that have initiated this process but which will need to be intensified over the next 2-3 years.

The provision of training for churches and other actors such as NGO has started to create ownership of the training materials and the importance of training women indigenous Papuans. This activity needs to be strengthened in order to ensure sustainability in the long term. Training can be provided to churches, cultural organizations and NGOs so that they take on the training and coaching of women entrepreneurs as part of their normal work and also integrate gender as a cross cutting issue.

The provision of training and motivation by ILO-ESD to Bank Papua has built the capacity of this institution to provide micro-finance services more effectively to local indigenous Papuans. This intervention has already created sustainability as Bank Papua are taking initiatives on their own to improve this service. The bank itself will most likely need more accompaniment and support from ILO-ESD to strengthen these actions as well as support in socialization and communication to local entrepreneurs.

The creation of the new BDS in Jayawijaya will carry on some of the current functions of ILO-ESD. This initiative is the result of training from the project and can be said that this is a start to creating locally sustainable business service to local entrepreneurs. However,

this BDS is still in very early stages and will need accompaniment and support for another few years from ILO-ESD.

The building of relationships with government is creating the basis for enabling them to carry out services and support to local indigenous Papuan entrepreneurs more effectively. However, this is far from being assured and time and budget needs to be planned for training government departments as well as planning bodies. The government is open to this so it will depend on ILO-ESD to design the most appropriate way to ensure this takes place.

5.2.4 Gender specific experiences and results

This project has had good results in the area of meeting gender specific targets. This is described in more detail under section 5. The baseline survey of the project specifically brought out factors affecting women entrepreneurs as well as women in general and factors affecting their lives within the culture of the central highlands. This has also been specified down to the level of each Regency. This is very useful information not only for this project but for other donors hoping to carry out interventions in this region.

In general the project by consistently raising the profile of women entrepreneurs has had significant impact in terms of raising awareness of the importance of women in economic development, what women are doing already and the potential that lies in supporting them and raising their capacity to interact more effectively in the marketplace.

ILO-ESD has achieved a 70% attendance by women in the training workshops specifically targeted at entrepreneurs which is a significant achievement given the normal gender relations in the highlands. The participation of women was active and the result was empowering for them. The project still has to have a sustained impact on entrepreneurs businesses in terms of practices being changed but the training has helped open peoples minds to new ways of thinking it has raised issues of gender relations at village level and opened discussions on economic development, gender, markets, savings, credit that have never been discussed in the public forum at this level before especially with a focus on women.

From experiences in training in the GET Ahead material especially at a village level it is seen that it is very important to include men in any discussions on gender. In a few areas where training was carried out and men were not included men were angry and felt that ILO was encouraging the women to rise up against the men. In this situation the training may have had a negative impact on gender relations This was not experienced where men were included in the discussions. However, this effect may be narrowed to a particular geographic area or characteristics of a church area and it is difficult to make a general conclusion. However, it would be recommended that men are always included in the process even if only for discussion on the gender module. There is very little experience in activities specifically targeting women especially in Yahukimo and also in Lany Jaya so the project needs to take care in making sure it understands fully the local context and perceptions. Agreement also needs to be reached with local leaders before such a training is carried out.

6. Conclusions

The main conclusions of the evaluation are as follows:

- The ILO-ESD project in the central highlands is *relevant* to community needs and interests and fits within current government priorities. The project has been very *effective* in progressing towards the three objectives set out in the initial project framework but has not yet reached the intended impact in terms of changed behavior and situations as stated in project outputs. The project strategy has been *efficient* in achieving results in a short time but most of these results are limited to one regency. The project has developed a *basis for creating sustainability* however, more long term action is required before interventions become sustainable and are owned by the local populations.
- The ILO-ESD project has had good results in the area of meeting the *gender specific targets*. By consistently raising the profile of women entrepreneurs has had significant impact in terms of increasing awareness of the importance of women in economic development, what women are doing already and the potential that lies in supporting them and raising their capacity to interact more effectively in the marketplace.
- One of the main achievements of the ILO-ESD project has been the *building of awareness on the business potentials and role of women entrepreneurs* in the regencies of Jayawijaya and Lany Jaya among all actors involved in economic development.
- *The baseline study was a key activity in the process of the project in creating an understanding of the capacity, limitations and challenges facing indigenous Papuan entrepreneurs in the highlands of Papua.* This study has provided valuable information which can be used to design effective training and accompaniment programs in the target areas.
- *Overall Impact of the project is greatest in the Regency of Jayawijaya* and to a lesser extent Lany Jaya. There has not yet been significant results or progress in Regency Yahukimo. This is mainly due to political and logistical factors but also due to the limited number of staff on the project team.
- *There is a lack of clarity among many actors especially entrepreneurs themselves and some NGOs about what the actual objectives and Mandate of ILO are.* This needs to be clarified to reduce problems in the future.
- The ILO-ESD have *succeeded in mobilizing many local skilled people from different backgrounds to support entrepreneurs through their training of trainers program* with a total of 137 people trained. Although there are currently only 20 facilitators active this is felt to be a significant achievement which can be built on next year.

- The ILO-ESD training of entrepreneurs *has worked most effectively where it engages with local actors such as church groups, NGOs and local facilitators* (including UNV) in the provision of training. This needs to be strengthened and built on.
- ILO-ESD have achieved the training of *625 indigenous Papuan entrepreneurs in the GET Ahead module with 70% of these participants being women*. This is a significant achievement given the challenges and gender inequality that exists in the central highlands.
- The GET-AHEAD training process has been *effective in providing a general introduction to Papuan entrepreneurs about how to improve their business and the general issues involved in this*. It has started to tackle some key limitations and challenges identified in the baseline. The module on gender has helped insert new ways of thinking about relationships between men and women and how this affects aspects of their lives. These factors are a good start to tackling issues of culture and gender but need much more in-depth follow up before the project can have a real impact.
- The training process provided by ILO-ESD has initiated a change in the way of thinking among women entrepreneurs who have taken part but in most cases this has not yet translated into action in terms of changes or improvements in their businesses. However, for a one year project the impact that has been felt so far is a significant achievement.
- Due to the lack of capacity of *civil society no appropriate BDS were identified for further training and joint working with ILO*. Due to this ILO have initiated the *set up of a BDS formed up of local facilitators trained by ILO in Jayawijaya*. This will be headed up by an indigenous Papuan woman. This initiative has a lot of potential to effectively build capacity and coach micro and small entrepreneurs specifically for Jayawijaya.
- There is good *coordination with local government actors* in Jayawijaya and Lany Jaya and overwhelming support for the objectives of the programs shown by various initiatives that have been committed to support local entrepreneurs in the region. This relationship has created a strong basis for further strengthening and training to increase sustainability.
- The project has established the groundwork and foundations for developing an effective and workable framework for economic interaction between micro-entrepreneurs and other economic actors (banks, government, NGOs) at the regency level in Jayawijaya as well as facilitating the exchange of knowledge and experience.

7. Recommendations

Based on findings and conclusions of the evaluation the following recommendations are made to ILO-ESD:

14. Strengthen the understanding and awareness about ILO mandate and project objectives

To do this the following measures can be taken:

- Develop a clear socialization process on the strategy and way of working of ILO-ESD including what the project can and cannot do.
- Before doing any kind of activity the project should endeavor to understand cultural perceptions and repercussions. This information can be used to lower the risk of people misunderstanding and dropping out of training programs due to becoming disappointed when ILO does not meet peoples expectations.

2. Improve and add to the training of entrepreneurs process and materials to take into account the needs of Papuan Entrepreneurs, facilitators capacity and the cultural situation especially relating to gender including

- Increase the time devoted to presenting the concept of gender and ensure that there are men also included in the discussions especially when trainings are held at a community level.
- Provide additional material on financial management for facilitators/trainers worked out for different types of businesses.
- Trainers and facilitators if possible should have or should gain some practical experience in running a business themselves so they can replicate this to the local entrepreneurs.
- Introduce drawings and examples from a Papuan context
- Include success stories from Papuan women in material presented

3. Develop stronger, more formal working relationships with local NGOs, Churches and cultural organizations to ensure sustainability of training and accompaniment of indigenous women entrepreneurs. This is especially important for implementing objectives in the remoter regencies of Lany Jaya and Yahukimo.

- ILO-ESD should look at new ways to engage actors such as local cultural organizations and church groups to support activities especially in remote villages.

- ILO-ESD should contract or develop implementation agreement with specific civil society organizations who have the capacity and potential to support the implementation of ILO-ESD objectives within the three regencies. This should not be on a one off activity basis but on the basis of an action plan which could be renewed every 6 months based on results.
- ILO-ESD should focus on strengthening the capacity of potential partners for achievement of objectives. This should not just be limited to becoming trainers of ILO materials but also in principles of economic development, good practice, financial and project management. This capacity building could be contracted out along with the support of these NGOs to implement the process.
- Encourage the activation of the Highland NGO forum for Discussion to develop structures that will support the above process.

4. Increase level of coordination with local government departments to ensure sustainability of interventions and support to indigenous Papuan women entrepreneurs in the future from the government. This should include:

- Develop a strategy together with relevant government departments in each regency (tourism, agriculture, fisheries and livestock, forestry and social development) for a training program that will enable them to serve indigenous Papuan entrepreneurs especially women more effectively.
- Work together with BAPEDA from each regency to strengthen their planning, monitoring and evaluation skills ensuring that gender is integrated into all training.
- Develop a management/coordination committee which will work alongside ILO-ESD during all phases of the project. This committee, the concept of which has already been discussed at a local level, should be involved in planning, monitoring and evaluation.

5. Increase the capacity of the ILO-ESD team so they have the capacity to coordinate activities in the three regencies. Currently with only one staff in Wamena and one back up staff in Jakarta it is very difficult to achieve set out objectives in three regencies.

- It would be preferable if ILO-ESD had a coordinator for each of the regencies who could advance the objectives in each place. If this is not possible it would be preferable to at least one additional member of staff for coordination outside of Jayawijaya.
- Ensure that there is enough budget to cover the additional costs of working in remoter areas i.e. funds for transport which is significantly higher than costs around Jayawijaya.

6. Implement an effective and collaborative coaching process which would work in coordination with the new BDS, ILO-ESD and partners in the other Regencies.

Training and coaching process should focus on quality rather than quantity and care should be taken to deepen knowledge and the aim should be to create lasting change in businesses and women's lives rather than just increase awareness of certain issues. This process should take into account the following:

- Facilitate practical training units where Papuans receive on the job training from professional coaches and where they can improve their entrepreneurship skills.
- Coachers/trainers should be highly motivated and have a deep understanding of the influences from culture and religion on Papuan owned businesses.
- A coaching network can be set up with regular training for the coaches to discuss issues that they are facing and to continuously improve the process. This can be done by contracting out services to local NGOs, churches or cultural organizations. In Jayawijaya this can be carried out by the new BDS.
- Offer follow-up trainings on a regular basis for business women who are willing to use money management tools and are starting to make changes and improve their business (at least one visit by a coach every month).
- Do field surveys to find out the basic needs of businesspeople in a certain area before planning a workshop in that area
- Continue to support existing women entrepreneurs in their efforts to get access to the bank sector and to government agencies which provide business capital or credits which can be invested in further business development.

7. Identify, strengthen and support a local organization in each regency to set up a basic micro-finance systems. This should take into account the following factors:

- Only offer micro credits to business people who are willing to take part in money management training until the credit is fully paid back.
- This should not be limited to working with banking institutions and can be as simple as setting up community banks with women's groups in small villages.
- These systems should be innovative and support women to increase savings and be flexible enough that they are adaptable to setting up enterprises in remote communities.
- ILO-ESD could provide an initial grant to start these processes up and support with training and coaching.

8. Strengthen the agribusiness, forestry and tourism sector for the promotion of employment opportunities in areas where Papuans have strengths and knowledge.

The following sub-recommendations should be taken into account:

- A detailed survey should be carried out to examine the potential challenges and the strategy needed to work in these sectors.
- Strengthen the capacity of the forestry, tourism and agriculture, livestock and fisheries departments and support them in the development of strategies and initiatives which can stimulate these sectors.
- Work together with UNDP and their partner NGOs in target districts already established to develop example projects in these sectors. These can be examples to be shared and replicated for other areas.
- Potential initiatives that ILO-ESD could support, encourage and accompany are community forestry, firewood plantations, reforestation, production of tahu, banana production, crafts, products from sweet potatoes, rabbit production and many others.

9. Work together with NGOs, churches and government to develop and implement strategies for economic development and for the empowerment of indigenous Papuan women entrepreneurs in each of the three regencies based on the individual context, experience, culture, situation of women and geography.

- Facilitate an inclusive planning process in coordination with the relevant government actors in each regency with result being an economic development strategy and action plan appropriate to local situation.
- Provide accompaniment and training for strategic activities in the implementation of the economic strategy as well as supporting through the strategies outlined in previous recommendations

10. Expand the support of BDS mechanisms to Lany Jaya and Yahukimo and provide training and accompaniment for BDS in the three regencies. This can be done through:

- Strengthening and accompaniment to local actors to start a BDS if none are already existent.
- Strengthen the capacity of local churches, cultural organizations and NGOs to provide training and work together as a network with the BDS.

- Implementing and accompanying the local economic development strategy in coordination with all actors with the development of an appropriately structured BDS as part of this.
- Develop partnerships with Bank Papua in Yahukimo as has happened in Jayawijaya.

11. Continue the process to create a network to support small and micro business and strengthen these activities in Lany Jaya and Yahukimo.

12. Develop working agreement with the RESPEK/PNPM program in order to improve the economic development activity and increase women's participation at village levels in the three target regencies. ILO should negotiate to provide training and accompaniment to the village facilitators to increase their capacity to initiate community banks, credit schemes, local business and provide accompaniment and advice in decision making at a local level.

13. Increase the activities specifically focusing on building awareness on gender including the following:

- Provide training and discussion on gender issues with churches. This can be done alongside training on entrepreneurship. It will help to find champions within the church denominations who will support this process. ILO-ESD should collaborate with church leaders who can provide good theological teaching on gender issues that will be received by churches.
- Continue awareness raising through radio with discussions also focusing on cultural aspects preventing the empowerment of women.

Appendix 1

List of people from Government and NGO interviewed

	Name	Position/job	Comment/Reason for interview
1	Bpk. Ditreks	Assistant Bapeda Jayawijaya	Worked in Coordination with ILO
2	Ibu Herni	Kepala Bagian Perindustrian	Worked in Coordination with ILO
3	Yoram Yogobi	Head of Yayasan Yukemdi	Participated in TOT
4	Simon Kobak	Project Coordinator Ninia Distrik – YASUMAT	Participated in TOT and also supported TOE in Ninia District
5	Jonny Jalek	Agriculture facilitator – Yasumat	Participated in TOT
6	Dolly Wetipo	Volunteer Trainer/ Facilitator	Participated in TOT and became ILO Trainer for TOE and TOT. Supports ILO in voluntary capacity
7	Andre	Volunteer Trainer/Facilitator	Participated in TOT and became ILO Trainer for TOE and TOT. Supports ILO in voluntary capacity
8	Lioba Van Dam	Coordinator UN Joint Program	Works in coordination with ILO under UN Joint Program
9	Alpius Wetipo	Head of office for Tourist Attractions, culture and tourism department, Jayawija	Some staff from Tourism department attended training
10	Taufik Rachman	Staff of Bapeda	Has been involved in ILO reporting meetings and has experience in local economic development
11	Marniks Balke	Head of Oikonomos	Coordinator in Baseline study, coordination on training with ILO and expert in local entrepreneurship development
12	Priscilla Yikwa	Oikonomos small Business facilitator	Took part in TOT TMF
13	Patricio Wetipo	Yayasan Humi Imane	Participant in TOT Get Ahead, TOT SIYB and TOT BDSP,
14	David Silak	Director Yayasan Yasumat	Participant in Indigenous Law workshop in Jakarta, also Yayasan involved in many ILO activities.

List of women interviewed during evaluation process

	Name	Type of business	Address
1	Eti Lokobal	Shop	Heputa, asolokobal

2	Fransina Rumbiak	Cake selling	Jl. Pramuka, Wamena Kota
3	Meri Haluk	Shop	Jl. Sinakma, Kompleks STA Sinakma
4	Herlina Aso	Shop	Wamena, belakang SMU NI
5	Marlina Matuan	Shop	Hepuba, Asolokima
6	Fransina Wetapo	Shop	Hepuba, Asolokobal
7	Agnes Siep	Sale of tape cassettes	Jln. Siepkosi
8	Nikolas Klalalau	Shop	Jln Katot Suproto
9	Serlina	Shop and coffee	Belakang SMU Negeri
10	Kefas Walalau	Mechanical workshop	Jln A. Yani, Woma

Annex 2: Interview outline

Outline for Interview – Government and NGO Stakeholders

1. Bpk/Ibu keterlibatan dalam kegiatan ILO seperti apa?
2. Ada dampak apa dalam kegiatan ini kepada masyarakat?
3. Ada dampak apa dalam kegiatan ini terhadap perempuan?
4. ILO membuat kegiatan apa dalam wilayah kerjanya Bpk/Ibu?
5. Bagaimana kegiatan ini sudah membantu LSM/Pemda
6. Kapasitas LSM/PEMDA sudah meningkat karena kegiatan ILO?
- 7.
8. Bpk/Ibu pikir kegiatan/program ILO cocok dengan kebutuhan masyarakat/dengan kebutuhan LSM/Kebutuhan masyarakat?
9. Bpk pikir proyek ini sudah melaksanakan tugas dengan baik? Kalau ada kurang – ini dimana?
10. Tantangan untuk ILO seperti apa menuju Bpk/Ibu?
11. Bagaimana proses untuk melaksanakan kegiatan dengan PEMDA/LSM – setuju dengan jadwal, efisien atau bagaimana?
12. Bpk/Ibu pikir hasil dari proyek ini ada dampak yang berkelanjutan? Mengapa? Kalau tidak - mengapa tidak?
13. Apa yang bisa dibuat untuk memperbaiki kegiatan dan untuk memastikan kegiatan ini akan ada dampak berkelanjutan?
14. Materi traninig yang dipakai oleh ILO Bagaimana? Cocok dengan budaya di pengunungan?
15. Sekarang ada data base untuk pengusaha di regency ini?
16. Bpk/Ibu sudah melihat kolaborasi meningkat diantar bisnis providor, bisnis kecil dan bisnis besar?

Interview outline for workshop participants

1. Sudah ikut training dari ILO?
2. Training macam apa sudah ikut dengan ILO?
3. Ibu/Bpk dapat manfaat seperti apa dari training tersebut? Belajar apa?
4. Training ada Pengaruh apa kepada bisnis ibu/Bpk? (bisa meningkatkan pendapatan?, lebih baik administrasi? Atau lain lain).
5. Ibu/Bpk sudah menerima bantuan lain dari ILO diluar khurus? (pendampingan, penasehat atau lain lain?).
6. Punya Pendapat apa tentang training yang telah ikut? Training cocok dengan kebutuhan ibu/Bpk? Bagaimana bisa perbaiki?
7. Ibu dan Bpk sudah mendengar program radio mana bicara ILO? Bisa belajar apa dari program itu?
8. Ibu/Bpk mau rekomendasi apa ke ILO untuk pekerjaan masa depan supaya pengusaha kecil bisa diperkuat?

