



ILO EVALUATION

- Evaluation Title: **Way Forward: after the revolution – Decent work for women in Egypt and Tunisia**
- ILO TC/SYMBOL: **RAF/12/01/FIN**
- Type of Evaluation : **Midterm**
- Country(ies) : **Egypt , Tunisia**
- Date of the evaluation: **June 2015**
- Name of consultant(s): **Joseph Schechla**
- ILO Administrative Office: **DWT/CO Cairo**
- ILO Technical Backstopping Office: **EMP/POLICY**
- Evaluation Manager: **Farice, Gugsu**
- Key Words: **Decent work, women's empowerment, employment creation**

This evaluation has been conducted according to ILO's evaluation policies and procedures. It has not been professionally edited, but has undergone quality control by the ILO Evaluation Office.

**ABBREVIATIONS**

ACI	Areas of critical importance
ACTEMP	ILO Bureau for Employers' Activities
ACTRAV	Bureau for Workers' Activities
AfDB	African Development Bank
AFEM	Association des Femmes Chefs d'Entreprises du Maroc
AusAid	Australian Aid
AWTaD	Association for Women's Total Advancement and Development
CAPMAS	Central Agency for Public Mobilization and Statistics
CEACR	Committee of Experts on the Application of Conventions and Recommendations
CEFD	Center of Egyptian Family Development
CNAM	Chambre Nationale de l'Artisanat et des Métiers
CNFCE	Chambre Nationale des Femmes Chefs d'Entreprises [National Chamber of Women Entrepreneurs] (Tunisia)
CO	Country Office
CoM	Cabinet of Ministers
CPO	Country programme outcome
CREDIF	Centre de recherches, d'études, de documentation et d'information sur la femme
CSO	Civil society organisations
CTA	Chief technical advisors
DW	Decent Work
DWA	Decent Work Agenda
DWAA	Decent Work Agenda in Africa
DWCP	Decent Work Country Programme
DWPP	DWPP Decent Work Pilot Programme
DWT	Decent Work Team
ECES	Egyptian Center for Economic Studies
ECESR	Egyptian Center for Economic and Social Rights
EDLC	Egyptian Democratic Labour Conference
EDLC/U	Egyptian Democratic Labour Conference/Union
EFITU	Egyptian Federation of Independent Trade Unions
EGP	Egyptian pound
EMG	Eastern Mediterranean Gas
ERF	Economic Research Forum
ETUF	Egyptian Trade Union Federation
EVAL	Evaluation Unit (ILO)
FA	farmers' association
FAO	Food and Agriculture Organisation
FEI	Federation of Egyptian Industries
GDP	Gross domestic product
GIZ	Deutsche Gesellschaft für Internationale Zusammenarbeit (German Society for International Cooperation)
GoE	Government of Egypt
GoT	Government of Tunisia
GYB	Generate Your Business Idea (training package)
HLE	High-level evaluation
HQ	Headquarters
HR	human resources
HRBA	Human rights-based approach
IFEF	Independent Federation of Egyptian Farmers



ILC	International Labour Conference
ILO	International Labour Organization/International Labour Office
ILO-ITC	ILO-International Training Centre in Turin
ILO EVAL	External Evaluation Unit
ILS	International labour standards
IMC	Industrial Modernisation Centre
ITC	International Training Centre, Turin
ITU	International Telecommunication Union
ITUC	International Trade Union Confederation
IYF	International Youth Federation
JP	joint programme
LED	Local economic development
M&E	Monitoring and evaluation
MAFFE	Ministère de la Femme, de la Famille et de l'Enfance [Ministry of Women, Family and Children Affairs] (Tunisia)
MAS	Ministère des Affaires Sociales [Ministry of Social Affairs] (Tunisia)
MB	Muslim Brotherhood
MCDR	Ministère de la Coopération et du Développement Régional [Ministry of Cooperation and Regional Development] (Tunisia)
MDG-F	Millennium Development Goals Fund
MFPE	Ministère de la Formation Professionnelle et de l'Emploi (Tunisia)
MLSA	Ministry of Labour and Social Affairs
MoALR	Ministry of Agriculture and Land Reclamation
MoMM	Ministry of Manpower and Migration
MoP	Ministry of Planning
MoSI	Ministry of Social Insurance
MoU	memorandum of understanding
MSME	mico, small and medium enterprises
NCCM	National Council for Childhood and Motherhood
NCW	National Council for Women (Egypt)
NORMES	International Labour Standards Department
NPC	national project coordinators (NPCs)
NSC	National Steering Committee (tripartite)
OCs	Outcome Coordinators
P&B	Programme and budget
PGA	Participatory Gender Audit
PO	Programme officer
PWD	person with disability
RB	Regular Budget
ROAF	Regional Office for Africa
SPF	Social Protection Fund
SSE	social and solidarity economic
ToR	Terms of reference
UEF	Union of Egyptian Farmers
UGTT	Union générale tunisienne de travail
UNCT	United Nations Country Team
UNDAF	United Nations Development Assistance Framework
UNDP	United Nations Development Programme
UNDSS	United Nations Department of Safety and Security
UNIC	UN Information Center
UNIDO	United Nations Industrial Development Organisation, ILO, IOM, UNDP and UNIDO)



UNRC	United Nations Resident Coordinator
USAID	United States Agency for International Development
UTICA	Union Tunisienne de l'Industrie, du Commerce et de l'Artisanat
VCD	value chain development
WED	Women's Entrepreneurship Development
XBTC	Extra-budget technical cooperation

1. EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

“The Way Forward” after the Revolution - Decent Work for Women in Egypt and Tunisia” (“The Way Forward”) stands as an example of successful project management and implementation in a complex and challenging environment. It has succeeded to meet most mid-term objectives and indicators not only because of competent project leadership and team work, but also due to the willingness of ILO, project partners and the donor to be flexible and allow needed innovation.

The project operation in two transitional countries encountered asymmetries and complications. The governmental partners in Tunisia have shown willingness to incorporate lessons and improve the administrative environment for realising women’s human rights, including full participation. Therefore, project outcomes are being felt “upstream,” in the bureaus and in the prospective legislative agenda of the country’s new Assembly of the Representatives of the People (Arabic: مجلس نواب الشعب Majlis Nawwāb ash-Sha’b). These real and prospective project outcomes are guided by an article of the Tunisian Constitution (Article 46), which guarantees the equality of opportunities between women and men to have access to all levels of responsibility in all domains. It exceptionally provides that “The state works to attain parity between women and men in elected Assemblies.”

Although the principal Egyptian government partner (i.e., Ministry of Manpower and Migrations—MoMM) does not manifest comparable engagement and support for the project’s policy outcomes, the social partners have been demonstrating the greater commitment to gender-balanced statutory and structural reforms in independent labour and employer structures. The tactical project approach to providing direct job-creation, income-generation and capacity-building support in marginalized regions of Egypt—and, to a lesser extent, in Tunisia—has proved fruitful for participants, partner organizations and even local authorities. However, the central government remains less visible in these efforts, despite the September 2013 “Program for Economic Development and Social Justice during the Transitional Period” of the Government of Egypt (GoE).

The relevance of “The Way Forward” rates high, as the positioning of the project and its constituent activities harmonize well with the formal objectives and priorities of project partners and ILO strategies, making it an exercise in internal and external coherence across several levels in both Tunisia and Egypt. The project also aligns directly with P&B Outcomes 1, 2, 3, 9, 10, 11, 12, 14, 17, and 18, as well as ILO Egypt CPOs, including EGY100, EGY103, EGY105 and EGY106, and Tunisia CPOs, including TUN 126, TUN800, TUN826.

The efficiency of “The Way Forward” suffered initially, due to inherent delays in recruitment and project start-up. This mid-term evaluation comes later than anticipated for reasons of project slippage, as well as delays encountered by the evaluator for reasons unrelated to the project. However, this evaluation took place at a time of accelerated project output, coinciding with the production of several key studies that promise to influence partner’s positive decision making and enhance policy-reform options.

Those products include a legal review, a survey of women-headed enterprises and the role of women entrepreneurs in the structure of the Tunisian Union of Industry, Commerce and Crafts (UTICA), in Tunisia, and a survey of women’s prospective goals and priorities in independent labour unions, in Egypt (still ongoing). Each shows high grades of relevance, as well as actual and potential impact.

Another project-related study during the period has assessed the potential costs of implementing ILO Convention 183 in Tunisia. This practical device, applying ILO assets proved elsewhere, is highly



relevant to partner objectives and interests, coherent with project objectives, effective in providing a rational and informed basis for policy-reform decisions, and impactful in its process and output. However, it also poses a dilemma for a norm-based specialized organization such as ILO. That is to say that appearing to condition non-discrimination and meeting women's special needs and rights at work upon fiscal values may encourage the logic that rights can be subordinate to accounting criteria. This evaluation does not pose an alternative to such budgeting of rights fulfilment for purposes of establishing administrative feasibility. However, one finding and its corresponding recommendation encourages the messaging around such approaches to uphold the core of the right and corresponding obligations of parties, in particular the state and its constituent parts, rather than subjecting them to negotiation with the actual duty holders.

The P&B Outcomes and *Strategy for North Africa*, emphasising gender discrimination concerns and women's empowerment through access to productive employment, decent work and income opportunities (P&B Outcomes 1 and 17), are reflected in two principal approaches, involving microcredit schemes and women's training for entrepreneurship in both countries, but especially in Egypt. While these strategies are always relevant, they remain limited in their scope and impact. This underscores the need to "upstream" the impacts to affect policy-level outcomes¹ and to validate such outcomes by the project's end. With the lack of capacity and policy direction in Egypt's central institutions of government, the longer-term sustainability of impact remains in question. Therefore, future programming and evaluation may need to focus more on the coherence and sustainability of these interventions as they relate to employers and their institutions, including and especially the Federation of Egyptian Industries (FEI).

That is not to suggest that Office personnel and project staff in North Africa have not been diligent. All staff members working in technical, programming, project management, administrative or support functions have shown tremendous energy, competence and selfless dedication to their jobs and supportive roles. They have earned a reputation as being extremely effective and committed employees and international public servants. Nonetheless, some staff and their expertise could always be utilized to a greater degree, notably where technical specialists could be more involved in programming to ensure ILS, FPRW and norms—an ILO comparative advantage—are more visibly integrated across all project activities.

This brings the evaluation to the crucial finding about the project's time frame and prospects for achievement of policy-level, institutional and legislative outcomes within a realistic calendar. However relevant, coherent and timely are the project's inputs and outputs, the objectives remain ambitious for both country contexts. This evaluation finds the need for both a time extension for the project, as well as greater continuity of the efforts to support the ultimate development of the strategic vision and corresponding policies and practices of the project partner institutions, but also to accompany the necessary legislative processes. The current context for achieving such upstream objectives in Egypt is not conducive, while the data on the sustainability of the downstream benefits of efforts to build women's cooperatives are weak at this mid-point. Ensuring sustainability of achievements will require a greater investment of time, especially since the project (1) has exposed a wide range of policy options and dilemmas that need to be reconciled (e.g., quotas, meritocracy, parity options) within lengthy processes within social partner institutions, as well as equally cumbersome legislative and policy development in Government of Tunisia (GoT) institutions.

2. BACKGROUND AND CONTEXT

Despite the North African sub-region's progressive human-development indicators in recent years, challenges mainly relating to inequality and exclusion remain entrenched. Gender discrimination,



wide geographical discrepancies in economic development within countries, and unequal access to services and education are some expressions of these challenges.

Increasing inequality and exclusion were among the forces driving the popular uprisings in all countries in the North Africa sub-region since 2010. Limited freedom, lack of social justice, undemocratic regimes, weak civil society, and opaque decision-making processes have afflicted entire societies. Many of these deficiencies have related to the labour market and the limited access to, and availability of decent work.

Both Tunisia and Egypt have witnessed considerable progress, most notably in female education. Tunisian and Egyptian female university enrolment rates are relatively high, at 89 for every 100 males in Egypt and 162 for every 100 males in Tunisia as of 2013.² Female enrolment rates in Tunisia also exceed that of boys at the secondary school level, with a rate of 93%.³ For its income level, Tunisia has the highest tertiary education enrolment in the Middle East and North Africa sub-regions.⁴

Nonetheless, women's participation in labour markets is less encouraging. Egyptian women remain among the lowest labour force participation rates in the world (at 23.7%),⁵ with Tunisia at only 24.8%.⁶ This low women's participation as compared to male counterparts is partly due to numerous labour-market obstacles, including cultural constraints and attitudes, gendered laws and weak support services.⁷

In Egypt, only 22.9% of young female graduates find employment. In Tunisia, only 38% find work. In addition, the few highly educated women who work face gender inequalities in the workplace, even in the formal sector. Although those with the highest levels of education do receive the highest wages, women with university degrees or above face the largest gender-wage differentials.⁸ In Egypt, the burden of unemployment falls particularly hard on the more highly educated and young women.⁹

On average, women in Tunisia earn 17% less than their male counterparts¹⁰ and, in Egypt, women in the formal sector earn 24% less. Egyptian women in informal jobs earn almost 50% less than male counterparts. Notably, the sectors showing the largest female-employment growth also have the largest gender-wage gaps. For example, women in blue-collar manufacturing jobs earn 56% of the income of men, and 51% in food processing jobs.¹¹

Over the past two decades, real wages in Egypt also have either declined or stood still, while labour supply continued to outgrow demand. In 2010, the Egyptian Center for Economic and Social Rights (ECESR) sued the government for a suitable minimum wage, in line with inflation rates and price increases. The National Wage Council (NWC) then set the minimum monthly wage at EGP400 (US\$56) in late 2010; however, this wage remained too low to meet the cost of living at the time. In July 2011, the newly elected government announced a minimum wage increase to EGP684 (US\$95), but only for permanent government employees. Article 14 of the 2012 Constitution provided for a national minimum wage, conditioned on productivity, contrary to the 2010 court's decision, finding the need to provide for inflation and other factors.¹² The Shura Council was reviewing a draft law on minimum wage before the Constitutional Court dissolved the legislature in mid-2014, but that draft was similarly criticized.¹³

The Government of Egypt (GoE) did not have an announced programme for labour issues and national development reform until the third year of transition. This was despite many calls by intellectuals and civil society, and amid six Cabinet of Ministers (CoM) shuffles over the course of the same period. Finally, on 12 September 2013, the CoM announced the "Government

Programme for economic and social equity during the transition period” in an attempt to address the demands of the popular uprising; i.e., “bread, dignity, freedom and social justice.” The 9-page document is comprised of five operative sections, each one addressing labour issues, employment and social protection. The programme remains valid to date.¹⁴

In September 2010, a high-level mission on Freedom of Association signed a MoU with Egypt on the way forward to resolve the Freedom of Association issues (C87). The mission managed to forge the first dialogue on this issue between GoE and Federation of Egyptian Industries (FEI); then the entire roadmap for recovery was signed. Three-months later, the 25 January 2011 erupted at a time when ILO has anticipated the agenda of social justice should be at the forefront of the GoE reform agenda. The GoE’s lack of response led to the broad popular uprising, also known as the “25th of January Revolution” with objectives embodied in its slogan: “bread, freedom, and social justice.”

Gender Inequality Index		
Egypt	0.580	130/187
Tunisia	0.265	90/187
Source: UNDP, <i>Human Development Report 2013</i> , Table 4: Gender Inequality Index, at: http://hdr.undp.org/en/content/table-4-gender-inequality-index .		

The Tunisia project office has emerged within the beginning of the project period, reflecting the heightened priority of Tunisia and related issues that have arisen long before the country’s December 2010 uprising, but which government performance, ILO programming and donor priorities previously had not addressed. However, the increased donor and development agency attention to the region saw a tremendous increase in ILO project and programme activity across the region, especially in the DWT/CO-Cairo. Strategic guidance for this growth took the form of region-wide and country-specific planning instruments, notably the *ILO Strategy for North Africa, 2011–2015* and country-specific *Roadmaps* for Tunisia and Egypt.

Meanwhile, the UNDAF for Tunisia (2012–16) was the result of an ongoing and widely consultative process, which was used to analyse how the UN system can more effectively contribute to the implementation of national

RAF/12/01/FIN: “The Way Forward” After the Revolution— Decent Work for Women in Egypt and Tunisia	
Policy Level: Raise awareness and cooperation with the National Council for Women (NCW)	PES counsellors train some job clubs for women.
Project Level: One implementation agreement with an NGO (AWTAD)	Leadership/empowerment /coaching/mobilizing

priorities and development needs of transitional Tunisia. This plan is the result of the analysis of the situation in the Common Country Assessment (CCA), which inspired the current Five-Year Development Plan and the Presidential Programme objectives. These also refer to the MDGs, which the government approved and adopted. The CCA-UNDAF roadmap for 2015–19 acknowledges that “Despite the growth recorded during the last 20 years (average 5%), Tunisia still faces the problem of unemployment, which has become structural (14.7% in 2009, 13.3% in 2011), following the ILO’s methodology, which Tunisia has newly adopted.”¹⁵

Consistent with the evaluation requirements for RAF/12/01/FIN, ““The Way Forward” after the Revolution - Decent Work for Women in Egypt and Tunisia,” (“The Way Forward”) the project was to undergo an independent mid-term evaluation 1.5 years after the project start-up. Upon signing the project document in May 2012, the expected project period was to run from 1 June 2012 through 31 July 2015. Due to the evolving political context in both Egypt and Tunisia, the project initiated activities in January 2013 with the arrival of the project Chief Technical Advisor. This mid-term evaluation comes at a stage in which the project is in its 24th month of implementation.

The social partners in this project have maintained a gender-neutral structure and operation until the time of project start-up. However, the project coincides also with internal debates and



consideration of options to advance the role and function of women within them. These processes have been aided by the new thinking that has accompanied the uprisings in the two countries.

In Tunisia, the General Union of Tunisian Workers (UGTT) has been engaged in debates over the five years since its most-recent general conference about the means to achieve gender balance. Rival trade union federations also have emerged in Tunisia since 2011; however, they are not specifically covered by this project. The Tunisian Union of Industry, Commerce and Crafts (UTICA) created the National Chamber of Women Entrepreneurs (CNFCE) in 1990 and has maintained an organic relationship with it through overlapping membership and by hosting CNFCE's office within the UTICA headquarters.

In Egypt, the independent trade union movement has emerged as one of the most-dynamic sectors of civic engagement before and, especially, after 2011. New trade unions, including those formed by rural workers, have proliferated. Of the non-rural trade union movement, three major confederations operate, with two of those representing independent labour. Each of these is engaged in discussions about gender within their institutional development. Likewise, the FEI has undergone much rethinking since 2013, including greater independence from the state (i.e., executive branch of GoE) control and initiating a reform of representative structures with specific regard to democratic self-representation and gender diversity.

In all of these social partner institutions, the gender-neutral statutes and practices effectively have institutionalized discrimination against women. This is manifest in the paucity of women holding representational and decision-making positions as of the project's start.

The project period coincides with the prolific growth of civic initiatives in all sectors. In Tunisia, this is reflected in the registration of approximately 2,500 associations developed per year since 2011, as compared with the average of about 191 per year in the previous period.¹⁶ In Egypt, this dynamic has differed with the growth in popular and informal associations and initiatives at local levels, within a context of general restriction of formal civic organisations and sporadic repression of foreign organizations.¹⁷ Nonetheless, a vibrant nongovernmental service and development sector continues to operate, particularly where government and other state institutions do not meet local needs. This dynamic is relevant to project implementation, not least in the way that "The Way Forward" has innovated partnerships with productive NGOs, especially in Egypt, to advance women's employment, as well as basic skills and capacities.

As the project operated in two transitional countries, it embodied and inherited asymmetrical backgrounds from the aspect of the dynamics with government partners. The governmental partners in Tunisia, principally the Ministry of Women, Family and Children Affairs (MAFFE), but also the Ministry of Social Affairs (MAS) have shown willingness to incorporate lessons and improve the administrative environment for realizing women's human rights, including full participation. Tunisia's new Constitution (Article 46), guarantees the equality of opportunities between women and men to have access to all levels of responsibility in all domains. It exceptionally provides that "The state works to attain parity between women and men in elected Assemblies."

Although the putative Egyptian government counterpart (i.e., Ministry of Manpower and Migrations—MoMM) does not manifest the same level of support for the project's policy outcomes and, in fact has complicated operations by requiring elusive project agreements with it for each ILO project, including this one. This has led to MoMM's relative alienation from gender-advancing activities, processes and benefits that the social partners have experienced both internally and in connection with "The Way Forward."

The tactical project approach to provide direct job-creation, income-generation and capacity-building support in marginalized regions of Egypt has proved fruitful for participants, partner organizations and even local authorities. However, the divergence of government cooperation in the two countries, as well as certain local specificities (e.g., different approaches to “cooperative” enterprises), have made the project operate as effectively two projects in constant search of synergy. That search has been largely successful, if not absolutely symmetrical.

“The Way Forward” project document sets out fairly standard objectives, setting out to:

1. Develop awareness of gender issues as related to FPRW,
2. Increase participation of women in the representational and decision-making structures of the social partner institutions,
3. Improve women’s skills toward employment and leadership,
4. Build labour market institutional capacity.¹⁸

However generic these objectives may seem, the particular contexts, historical moments and diversity of local experience have distinguished this project. The competent and strategic management of the project also has distinguished “The Way Forward” from the standard through innovation and tactical adjustments.

The project under review, with a budget of US \$3,109,453, has aimed at strengthening women’s position and level of participation in the labour market in Tunisia and Egypt. Between project start up and March 2014, the project underwent adjustments and consolidation of objectives in response to conditions and opportunities that developed since project inception. The March 2014 version of the project’s results framework forms the basis for this assessment of project achievements against planned objectives.

3. EVALUATION ANALYTICAL FRAMEWORK

This evaluation pursues the following purposes:

- Assess the project as a whole, including issues of initial project design, implementation, lessons learned, replicability.
- Assess the extent to which its stated objectives and outputs have been achieved and estimate the progress made against these planned results (in %).
- Review the efficiency and effectiveness of the project implementation framework and management arrangements.
- Provide recommendations on the remaining period of implementation of the project, including revisions of scope, timeframes, implementation modalities, to ensure the achievement of objectives and their sustainability.
- Document lessons learned and good practices in order to maximize the experience gained.

SCOPE

This evaluation considers the project intervention as part of the ILO’s wider programme in Egypt, Tunisia and North Africa. This evaluator has covered both fields of project operation (Tunisia and Egypt) through a series of site visits to project partners, interviews with stakeholders and a documentary review, including drafts of available studies and plans that shed light on the project’s forward direction and progress.



CLIENTS

This exercise is destined primarily to ILO management (the ILO DWT/CO Cairo, Regional Office for Africa) overseeing the implementation of the project, the key stakeholders involved, and the donor. Because of the particular timing of this mid-term evaluation, the assessment gives special attention to the values that concern the donor within its overall development objectives, as well as project objectives that are designed to achieve ambitious progress within the project's restricted timeframe. Therefore, the evaluation addresses the concerns of all clients in the potential follow-up to the current performance period.

EVALUATION METHODOLOGY

The evaluation questions have been answered through three essential methods: (1) desk review of project-related documents; (2) individual interviews and collective (focus group) sessions with project staff, partners and key stakeholders and (3) site visits (verification missions).

The evaluation took place mostly in Cairo, with two field verification visits to Tunis of six days total. The evaluation has taken the following key steps:

Step 1: Desk review of all relevant documents and related literature in the field of the project. This included the project document, work plans, interim reports, documented deliverables and studies (at their respective stages) commissioned under the project, press coverage, reports from workshops and conferences, drafts of studies undertaken and literature from stakeholders.

Step 2: Preparation of an inception report based on the desk review and the terms of reference for the evaluation. The inception report met the clearance of the evaluation manager.

Step 3: On-site interviews with stakeholders, meetings with project staff and other ILO personnel, focus group discussions with project staff, project beneficiaries, social partners, subcontractors, the project advisory committee and other key stakeholders. Because of the particular timing and circumstances of this evaluation, the evaluator took advantage of his presence in Tunis in early December (with air-travel expenses covered outside the budget of this evaluation) to meet with ILO staff and project partners over four days. The timing of this on-site verification mission was based on a partial desk review, since not all project documents had been provided by this early opportunity. Because it has not been possible to arrange meetings at this short notice with all concerned parties (i.e., the donor, at least one external researcher, and the collective meeting of the project advisory committee), the evaluator returned to Tunis in mid-January 2015 under this evaluation plan for a two-day visit, in coordination with ILO-Tunisia. The evaluator on CTA also visited project sites over two concentrated days of meetings coordinated with subcontractors, participants and key stakeholders in the Red Sea and Aswan Governorates in December 2014.

Step 3. A debriefing meeting by the evaluator presented and discussed the preliminary findings and conclusions of the evaluation with the ILO Cairo management. This allowed the evaluators to address any factual errors and clarify ambiguities and issues of misunderstanding or misinterpretation, and any gaps in the available data.

Step 4: The evaluator submitted a first draft of the evaluation report to the evaluation manager, who share it with key stakeholders, ILO management and the project team. The evaluation manager shared these inputs with the evaluator through email and in physical meeting within two weeks of the first draft.

Step 5: The evaluator received the draft with track-changes mode on MS Word entered directly into the draft, and returned the corrected final draft for review and approval by the evaluation manager in consultation with ILO Eval at Regional Office.

LIMITATIONS AND CONSTRAINTS



We are experiencing a boom in demand for prevention and evaluation in most fields of endeavour correlating with high expectations of the feasibility and efficacy of prevention and evaluation. Despite the increasing practical importance of such evaluations, we also witness a gap between rising expectations and what can actually be achieved.

The evaluation method seeks to assess the benefits and costs of an activity within a certain limited range of time and other available resources. In reality, however, it is impossible, or at least extremely rare, to capture all the benefits and costs either numerically or qualitatively. Nonetheless, this evaluation seeks to determine true values of costs and benefits of “The Way Forward” project objectively.

In some cases, it is difficult to measure the outcomes of a program, especially while in midstream. This evaluation applies the assumption of “generativity”; that is, the well-known fact that small interventions may generate (predictable and unpredictable) effects evoking further effects and so on, until an abundance of the consequences have given rise to a common phenomenon in nature or other systematize change. The present evaluation pursues an inquiry in to the predicted outcomes determined in the project objectives. However, it remains open also to capturing the unpredictable outcomes of efforts exerted within the project that are consistent with, or deviate from those intended objectives. In any event, it is extremely difficult to distinguish and measure a fluctuation of results identified with a particular performance indicator and attribute that fluctuation faithfully to the entire range of its influences. The attempt to do so is limited by the values, pertinent experience and information available to the external evaluator.

Evaluation results and findings also may have diverse implications, insofar as the same facts may be interpreted differently, according to the values of different observers.

It often happens in the course of a project that urgent action is required, with little or no time for appropriate evaluation. Hence, the adjustments and apparent deviations in a project typically are based on management decisions, the assessment of which may change with the passage of time and/or the external perceptions of the evaluator. The organic nature of the project cycle may justify such deviation for reasons outside the evaluation criteria. There are possibilities that objectives or targets were not clarified in the policy making stage, or the initial objectives have come to be no longer appropriate. Therefore, flexibility rather than scientific precision vis-à-vis targets and outcome indicators may be needed to arrive at a useful finding.

It is not always possible to evaluate all aspects of a program with absolute objectivity. The evaluation risks reflecting certain bias in stakeholder responses to the evaluator’s questions. Some respondents may not understand fully the purpose of the evaluation. The evaluator also embodies certain biases based on experience and values that s/he brings to the task.

Finally, the limit on all kinds of resources available to the evaluation invariably affect the depth of country-level investigation. The balance among available information, evaluator and/or stakeholder bias and the ability to access relevant data may oblige the evaluator to circumscribe the inquiry strictly to matters that can contribute to findings relevant to her/his terms of reference.

4. MAIN DELIVERABLES

The expected deliverables are:

- (a) An inception report, including work plan and evaluation methodology;
- (b) A draft evaluation report structured as follows:
 1. Executive Summary
 2. Methodology, Purpose, Scope and the Clients of the Evaluation
 3. Key findings (structured on the basis of the evaluation questions)

4. Conclusions and recommendations for project replication
5. Annexes

(c) The final evaluation report

(d) The evaluation summary fact sheet, consisting of two pages for wide dissemination a summary of the key results achieved by the projects as verified by the evaluation; key technical products developed by the project and good practices identified.

4. EVALUATION FINDINGS

PROJECT RELEVANCE

The design of “The Way Forward” has been highly relevant in addressing the severe deficit in decent work for women, deepened as a result of the economic downturn since 2011. The project objectives are also in line with the draft Decent Work Agenda and *Roadmaps* in Egypt and Tunisia (mainly, social dialogue and skill building and employment for youth and women), and linked to P&B outcomes 1, 2, 3, 4, 9, 10, 11, 12, 17, and 18.

The project has proved to be highly relevant toward filling the severe gaps in women decent jobs, further escalated as a result of the “Arab spring.” The project objectives are in line with the drafted-but-yet-unimplemented Decent Work Country Programmes in Egypt and Tunisia (mainly, social dialogue and skills building and employment for youth and women) and linked to P&B outcomes 1, 2, 3, 9, 10, 11, 12, 17, and 18. They are in line with Egypt’s UNDAF priorities on poverty reduction and assistance to the most-vulnerable groups including women; improvement of the institutional setting; decent employment creation; and economic and social empowerment of women (1.4). Likewise, the project aligns with Tunisia’s UNDAF, including at least three of the four “cooperation domains” of (1) Equity, disparity and life quality; (2) Youth and adolescents; (3) Employment and (4) Globalization.

Within the wide lens of ILO’s programme, ILO has devised roadmaps and strategies for Egypt and Tunisia within the ongoing *Strategy for North Africa, 2011–2015* through a four-pronged intervention strategy, consisting of:

1. Sensitizing social partners and a wider audience on gender issues and inequalities in the world of work;
2. Increasing the capacity of and institutional setting for females to equip them with necessary skills to engage in social dialogue and collective bargaining processes for advancing gender equality, nondiscrimination, and increased female representation in trade unions;
3. Increasing women’s skills to enhance their employability, and;
4. Capacity building for labour market institutions to better serve women and increase women’s access to these institutions. The intervention logic is grounded in the assumption that improving women’s labour market position and increasing participation in decent work is a prerequisite for sustained equality, inclusion and democratization in Tunisia and Egypt.

These broad contours were further specified in the “Egypt Roadmap for Recovery and Decent Work in Egypt 2011,” which frames ILOs work through the country’s transition. While “transition” may be an ambitious term for the present process of reconsolidating the old guard in Egypt’s central and regional governing institutions, the recovery and decent work priorities—as indeed the September 2013 “Government Programme for economic and social equity during the transition period” affirms—remain in place.



“The Way Forward” aligns directly with many of the priority areas, work areas and agreed objectives of the *Roadmap* for Egypt. It fits well within all three priority areas: (1) Social Dialogue and ILS, (2) Tourism and (3) Agriculture.

It further engages simultaneously in each of the *Roadmap*'s ten work areas:

1. Independent Trade Unions
2. Employers organisations
3. Reform of Trade Union Law
4. Culture for Social Dialogue
5. Promotion of conventions
6. Small and Medium Size Enterprises (SMEs)
7. Modern apprenticeship schemes and on the job training schemes
8. Income Generating Activities
9. Decent Work in Tourism Sector
10. Skills Development in Agriculture

From the specific perspective of gender equality/equity, “The Way Forward” also meets agreed objectives:

- Strengthen capacity of independent trade unions
- Assistance in the creation of new trade unions (partially)
- Strengthening employers organisations
- Promotion of social dialogue among the social partners *and beyond*
- Development of a vision plan for social dialogue in Egypt
- Increased awareness of norms (partially)
- Entrepreneurial skills development
- Promotion of SMEs as an option for people
- Improving the legal environment for SMEs
- Business services for SMEs
- Informal apprenticeship schemes in several governorates (partially)
- Establishment of policies for modern apprenticeship systems (partially)
- Generate income options for the parents of working children and other vulnerable groups (partially)
- Assess situation and opportunities
- Improve productivity of tourism sector through skills development
- Participation of the ILO in a Tourist Committee meeting (unknown)
- Improve entrepreneurial and technical skills in the agricultural sector
- Improved working conditions and acceptance of ILO standards in rural areas

In keeping with the aim of the UN specialized agencies to support inclusive development and a more-equitable society, these objectives and project interventions also reflect the emphasis of Egypt's UNDAF on reducing both gender-based and geographical income disparities, and addressing the special needs of vulnerable groups. In relation to the other UN agency contributions for each priority area, “The Way Forward” has enabled ILO to maintain coherence at the level of the UN Country Team, while applying its comparative advantage and specialized capacity.

In addressing this priority programme area, UN collective action takes into account World Bank efforts in enhancing access to finance for micro- and small enterprises. This also includes supporting job readiness and placement for marginalized youth and bolstering the European Union's development assistance to reform the technical and vocational education and training system

(TVET), as well as providing sectoral policy support in education, health, rural and social development. Also the African Bank for Development supports several initiatives in this field. Additionally, UN initiatives are complementary to Canada's Strategy which emphasizes "sustainable growth with a renewed focus on private sector development" and Italy's development assistance in poverty alleviation that includes support for the legal rights of children, girls and women, and the technical and financial support to Egyptian SMEs.

Egypt: UNDAF, 2013–17 "Poverty Alleviation through Pro-Poor Growth and Equity"

Outcome 1.1: Government is operating with efficient and adequately resourced mechanisms of awareness creation, equitable targeting, delivering and monitoring of social protection services and access to adequate and affordable housing, for children, young people, rural women, elderly and other vulnerable groups.

Outcome 1.2: Government applies improved pro-poor, inclusive and gender sensitive policies in financial and non-financial services supporting Micro and Small Enterprises (MSE).

Outcome 1.3: Strengthened private sector businesses in tourism, agro-industries, and other key pro-poor sectors are able to address gender, equity and environmental sustainability

Outcome 1.4: More and better skilled youth, women and other vulnerable groups have decent job opportunities.

In Tunisia, the ILO "Roadmap for Recovery and Decent Work for Tunisia," determined in March 2011, emphasizes the priority areas of (1) Social protection, (2) Standards and (3) Social dialogue. "The Way Forward" is organically linked to each of these priorities.

The supporting work areas for the Roadmap involve: (1) Establishment of a social protection floor, (2) Ratification of selected conventions and (3) Capacity building of constituents. "The Way Forward" also aligns with each of these three work areas under the *Roadmap*.

In turn, the project meets of the agreed objectives for Tunisia as follows:

- To extend a minimum level of social protection to all Tunisians
- To extend coverage of existing social protection systems to the informal economy (partially)
- Ratification by Tunisia of C 144, C 151, C 154, C 181 and C 183 (partially)
- Capacity building for social partners in social dialogue at the national, local, sectoral and firm levels, and in conflict resolution

Aligned with national priorities and international commitments, (Conventions and International conferences taking account of the Millennium Development Goals and Post-2015 Sustainable Development Goals), the current UNDAF for Tunisia was developed in a participatory manner and based on five principles of programming including: (i) the approach based on human rights, (ii) gender, (iii) environmental sustainability, (iv) managing for results, (v) capacity development.

The unstable situation in the country led to the preparation of a Tunisia Transition Strategy (STT) for 2011–13, which the UN and GoT extended by mutual agreement until 2014. The STT was developed on the basis of a situation analysis and a relatively wide consultation to identify the problems and set the most urgent priorities.

The suspension of Tunisia's 12th cyclical Economic and Social Development Plan, led to the development of a transitional "economic and social development strategy" for 2012–16. The objectives were defined in a guideline determining: the areas of commitment, principles of action, the phases of implementation and growth pattern. Developed by the second provisional

government after the revolution, this strategy has not been taken into account by governments. They have opted for smaller frames, namely economic budgets 2012 and 2013. The UNDAF is aligned with national priorities in these three documents, affirming the principles of:

1. Anchoring democracy through the rule of law, building a new project more inclusive and balanced society based on freedom, good governance, social justice and civic participation.
2. Ensuring inclusive and balanced development, integrating the sustainable management of natural resources, energy efficiency, development of renewable energy, reducing risks and managing the impacts of climate change and natural and humanitarian crises;
3. Accelerating the pace of growth by accelerating structural transformation of the economy to create enough jobs in number and qualification and regional distribution structure;
4. Devoting social progress and equal opportunities, enhance social protection;
5. Improving the health status of the population, the quality and relevance of education, the conditions of women, the situation of young people.

Also in light of these national priorities, the project aligns directly with principles 1, 3, 4 and 5.

Tunisia: UNDAF 2015–19

1. Democratic Governance:

Outcome 1.1: Civil, political and administrative institutions are fully operational, while respecting the universal principles of human rights, democracy and gender equality.

2. Inclusive, Sustainable and Resilient Economic Model:

Outcome 2.1: Implement a new model of economic development and equitable social, inclusive, sustainable and resilient generator of wealth and jobs.

Outcome 2.2: Regional actors operate efficiently and exploit local resources in an optimal, sustainable and inclusive manner.

3. Social Protection and Equitable Access to Social Services:

Outcome 3.3: Vulnerable groups with special needs enjoy social and legal protection in accordance with the commitments made by Tunisia in the framework of international conventions and treaties on human rights and gender equality.

The project inception phase confirmed the relevance of the project strategy and logical framework to both ILO strategic frameworks and national development priorities. Minor changes were introduced to some outputs in the interim of implementation to meet needs.

In Tunisia, the project assumed a long-term strategy of ratification and implementation of ILO Convention 183 on maternity protection.

Convention No. 183 (C183) provides for 14 weeks of maternity benefit to women to whom the treaty applies. It provides that women who are absent from work on maternity leave shall be entitled to a cash benefit which ensures that they can maintain themselves and their child in proper conditions of health and with a suitable standard of living and which shall be no less than two-thirds of her previous earnings or a comparable amount. The Convention also requires ratifying states to take measures to ensure that a pregnant woman or nursing mother is not obliged to perform work which has been determined to be harmful to her health or that of her child, and provides for protection from discrimination based on maternity. The standard also prohibits employers to terminate the employment of a woman during pregnancy or absence on maternity leave, or during

a period following her return to work, except on grounds unrelated to pregnancy, childbirth and its consequences, or nursing. Women returning to work must be returned to the same position or an equivalent position paid at the same rate. Also provides a woman the right to one or more daily breaks or a daily reduction of hours of work to breastfeed her child.

The current entitlement for maternity leave in Tunisia falls far below the international standard, and institutionalizes discrimination between sectors. Public sector employees are allowed three weeks maternity leave, while women working in the private sector are entitled to four weeks paid leave. The objectives of the project to align benefits with the standard of C183 would require significant adjustment to bear the additional financial cost of extending benefits, as well as legislative reform.

The relevance of the project's study on financial feasibility is not in question. That would serve both employers and government institutions (e.g., MoSA) to envision the practical arrangements necessary to implement the improved benefit. It also addressed the specific measures required to end the distortion in the current scheme.

The practical approach of quantifying policy change has had the effect of elimination speculation and certain fears that arise from such a significant change in entitlement benefits. However, what is at stake is an over-riding principle of state obligation under UN human rights treaties, as well as ILO norms. Although the relevance of the project intervention is seen as closely linked with the provisions of C183, Tunisia remains outside that legal regime, not having yet signed or ratified the C183. The relevance of aligning the state performance of a treaty obligation that would apply in the undefined future might be in doubt. It seems that the imaginable long-term process of parliament deliberations and executive ratification of C183 would run well past the end of the current project, thus making this indicator elusive within the performance period.

That does not invalidate the target, however. Tunisia is not yet bound to the terms of Convention 183, nor has it ratified the Protocol to the African Charter on Human and Peoples Rights on the Rights of Women in Africa, the CEDaW Optional Protocol or the ICESCR Optional Protocol, it decided (partially) to withdraw its reservation under CEDaW in 2011, registered that change in 2014, but retained a general reservation subordinating the treaty's application to Islamic criteria.¹⁹ The state is nonetheless bound under treaty since 1976 to exercise non-discrimination,²⁰ which prohibits differentiation of rights and entitlements between public and private sector workers.

In light of any potential question of the relevance of the project intervention without the binding ratification of C183, Tunisia still remains obliged to eliminate discrimination in the benefits to women working in public versus private sectors.

Also from the human rights perspective, the relevance of the project's study on the financial aspects of compliance with the principle of non-discrimination and application of the C183 standard must be assessed with caution. An established human right, such as that enshrined in ILO Convention 183, arises from criteria of human dignity specified in the relevant Covenants and Conventions. Such a right is, therefore, self-executing. Thus, the ratifying state is required to operationalize (respect, protect and fulfil) the right on its own merit, without equivocating on the basis of cost implications.

Normally, under a human rights budget analysis, it becomes necessary to apply the treaty-bound principle of "maximum of available resources" to fulfil a human right. Operationalizing that obligation requires the analysis of budget dilemmas beyond the actuarial projections of the study. A domain of state sovereignty, the corresponding budget allocations must weigh the available resources and costs of other public budget expenditures to ensure that the resources for human rights fulfilment take priority over other expenditures.



Understandably, the ILO study does not penetrate the veil of state sovereignty to determine budgetary trade-offs, if any. However, for ILO to maintain the normative approach in this case, it would behave all project partners to emphasize the principle that human rights are inalienable and, therefore, non-negotiable. Therefore, it should be widely understood that the outcome of the Actuarial Study on the Level of Maternity Protection in Tunisia may answer the questions as to *how* to implement the global minimum norm on maternity leave, while it does not leave open any question as to *whether* the state and its constituent institutions—public and private—have to implement it.

With regard to the relevance of the project’s results to the development priorities of the governments of Egypt and Tunisia, and ILO, this evaluation rates project performance high. The outcomes and products generally show great potential for their integration within the overall national efforts to achieve decent work for women.

Both the Tunisian-side project activities, with their immediate policy applicability, and the Egyptian-side activities, focusing rather on local capacity and employment generation, show promise. Four major studies conducted in Tunisia on the characteristics of women’s entrepreneurship have assessed (1) the Women’s Entrepreneurship Development Framework Conditions in Tunisia, (2) the participation of women in UTICA’s constituent bodies, (3) the current statutes of the CNFCE and (4) the prospects of extending maternity leave benefits consistent with the provisions of C 183 (an actuary study). These, combined with training for UGTT leadership on gender equity experiences, all have aided responsible decision making at institutional levels. The ILO/Egypt efforts to build skills and employment in marginalized regions also have produced highly relevant models that should inform future policy and programming decisions.

The exchange of experiences between the two countries for both workers and employers has generated new thinking of options for local application. The much-praised joint ILO-FEI Conference on “Supporting Business Women: A necessity, the challenges and the way forward,” in Cairo, November 2014, provided opportunities for exchange of experience between Egypt and Tunisia on the options for developing gender equity in national social partner institutions. It also brought forward examples from the wider region such as the gender parity principle applied in Moroccan employer structures at the regional and sectoral level. The “*Colloque sur l’Accès des Femmes Chefs d’Entreprises aux Financements*,” in Tunisia, in April 2014, also reportedly generated much new thinking, as well as produced a sectoral needs assessment with new ideas for addressing those needs, including the development of an “academy” within CNFCE to provide training and create knowledge for women entrepreneurs.

The ILO specialists and project staff, as well as subcontractors, conveyed a full cornucopia of policy options to project partners, based on intra-regional and international precedents. Both regional and global experiences are valuable and tactically important. It was eminently relevant for project participants to explore the experiences at the full options for operationalizing gender equity: ranging from quotas to merit-based integration, to parity. Each has its relative advantages and disadvantages.

PBO	SO	NASO	CPO	Technical Sector	XB Symbol	Project Title	Scope	Fund (US\$)	Duration	Planned Eval.	Evaluation Type
3,10,15	Primary: Employment, Secondary : Social Dialogue	1,2	EGY80 2- EGY10 6- EGY15 3	Employment	RAF/12/01/FIN	“The Way Forward”	NA	3,10,453	01/06/2012–31/07 /2015	3/15	Independent

Another aspect of project relevance was the important engagement with local authorities in Egypt. The development of cooperatives, local industries, accessing land and infrastructure for job creation often require the cooperation of local authorities, where they exist. Although Egypt does not yet have structures that qualify as local government, the local authorities cooperating with ILO's local subcontractor Center of Egyptian Family Development (CEFD) were particularly engaged, indicating relevance also to these public actors.

Project partners were confident that the studies of women-headed enterprises and CNFCE constituents were relevant undertakings. However, in the actual conduct of the studies, they learned just how relevant they were. The research revealed the great extent to which both CNFCE and UTICA lack data on their own membership, especially in the regions (outside of the capital).

This evaluator also discovered the general lack of data at the level of central government institutions on the subject of women enterprises, in addition to the void of information about many aspects of informal enterprises, including the extent of women-headed informal enterprises. While the relevance of the project's statistical approach cannot be doubted, these contributions also point to ILO's comparative advantage as a knowledge-based institution capable of applying lessons and methodologies across borders.

PROJECT COHERENCE:

On its face, "The Way Forward" appears to have weak internal coherence, due to its seemingly divergent targets and approaches in the respective countries. The Tunisia aspect of the project seeks to "upstream," immediately policy-relevant objectives that include improving the roles of women within the statutory regulation and institutional functions of all tripartite partners. At the level of the Government of Tunisia (GoT), the project seeks to enable legislative reform that includes, but is not limited to, the state's ratification of C183 and compliance with its increased maternity-leave provisions for women. Within the employers' institutions, "The Way Forward" creates the conditions, including the indispensable knowledge base, for integrating women in the representative and decision-making bodies of UTICA and CNFCE. The UGTT is the subject of knowledge creation and capacity building to enable the adoption of a proposed quota system to ensure greater women's participation in the structures serving workers' interests.

This internal coherence, alignment and balance among project interventions in Tunisia is reflective also of the improved context for social dialogue. That indicates coherence also with the conditions both created and enhanced by the Social Contract (2013) that the ILO's Social Dialogue project has supported. While "The Way Forward" in Tunisia involves important links to capacity building and skill building at the level of women workers by coordinating efforts with more downstream ILO projects in the country, the bulk of its efforts rest at the level of policy reform in the relevant government and social partner institutions.

It is difficult to draw clear lines between the Tunisia side of the project and all of the interventions in Egypt. The upstream benefits of the efforts remain, in large part, theoretical. This is due to two principal factors: (1) The socio-political environment differs from that in Tunisia in that the social dialogue is relatively less developed and (2) the greater emphasis targets women's agricultural and handicraft cooperatives in remote governorates, where the benefits are less felt in the capital.

Rather, in the case of Egypt, the project is giving special attention to applying ILO assets that develop models of intervention that build skills and capacities in ways that eventually can be up-scaled and, thus, help address the implementation challenges at the policy level. However, the replication and upstreaming issues are addressed under Impact and Sustainability below.



Despite this apparent discrepancy between the approaches within a single project, this evaluation makes three essential observations: (1) the results framework reflects the common features of the difference approaches in both countries, (2) the distinct approaches are realistic in light of the divergent realities unfolding in Tunisia and Egypt, and (3) the management and implementation has sought successfully to draw out and build upon the prevailing common denominators between the two sets of tripartite constituents.

The revised logical framework of March 2013 sets out to:

- 1. Build social partner capacities to improve women's roles:** Where this has proceeded at a slower pace in Egypt than in Tunisia, the project has support advancements across the board in both labour and employer institutions in both Tunisia and Egypt, providing also opportunities to exchange experiences between the two countries—as well as exchange with the parity approach of Moroccan employer institutions (regional branches of AFEM)—to ensure that constituents share the full range of policy options. In this sense, the project has achieved the intended coherence.
- 2. Strengthen labour-market institutions:** This objective has been served in both countries. In addition to the specific legislative review in Tunisia and the subcontracting of Association for Women's Total Advancement and Development (AWTaD) in Egypt to promote gender equality in recruitment in 20 companies, the project has supported the training of at least 306 persons in both countries in women's enterprise development (WED) tools.
- 3. Improving women's skills:** This objective has been best served in Egypt, where the project has partnered with eight governmental and nongovernmental organizations to enhance the skills and capacities of some 930 women in the production of handicrafts and aromatic plants. At the level of entrepreneurship, the project also conducted a series of four training-of-trainer (ToT) sessions in Red Sea and New Valley in "GET Ahead" women-in-enterprise tools, which, in turn, resulted in the onward training of 86 beneficiaries in Marsa Alam, Hamata and Aswan. The Tunisia-side counterpart to this project effort is seen in the ToT for Tunisian cooperatives managers, in March and April 2014, on Mainstreaming Gender in Value Chain Development (VCD).
- 4. Gender-sensitive data development:** The internal reporting on this objective is modest. However, the project's contributions to the knowledge base and, in particular, the statistical reality of Tunisian women's engagement as entrepreneurs (in both formal and informal sectors) through the Women's Entrepreneurship Development Framework Conditions study, the participation of women in UTICA and the study on prospects of extending maternity leave benefits have broken new epistemological ground. The project's provision of training for institutional capacity building in conducting gender audits in Egypt figures in this knowledge-creation objective as well, where social partners and four ministries took active part.

Within locally specific constraints, the results framework has proved to be realistic. However, another level of effort is needed to evaluate the coherence among these objectives within each of the target countries.

Coherence is found between objectives 1 and 4 through the interventions in Tunisia, whereas, the data outcomes from the three studies cited under 4 above directly support the social partner capacities to *[arrive at informed decisions about how to]* improve women's roles. The search for coherence between objectives 3 and 1 in Egypt remains speculative; however, the better function and production of the women's cooperatives in Aswan and Red Sea governorates suggests increased potential for both female-headed and male-headed enterprises to invest in them. (This question arises again under SUSTAINABILITY below.)

Project efforts to realize objective 3 in both countries also serve objective 2 to the extent that greater competence through on-the-job training and other forms of capacity building promise to introduce more-competitive women job seekers into the labour market. Pursuit of objective 3 also supports objective 1 in the sense that women's greater capacity to operate and manage a business develops the pool of potential women entrepreneurs. Obviously, objective 4 efforts are indispensable to the realization of objective 1, since informed decisions about enhancing women entrepreneurs'—or women workers'—formal role in their respective institutions must rely on crucial data about their number, composition and capacities.

Adding to the coherence of ILO efforts consistent with "The Way Forward," ILO/Cairo has produced several related products in the form of policy guidelines and working papers since 2011. The titles in the table below indicated the coherence of these to the objectives of "The Way Forward."

Policy Guidelines and Working Papers Produced
<i>Labour Market Developments and Policies in Egypt</i> <i>Egyptian Labour Market in Times of Transition: Which Role Can Active Labour Market Policies Play?</i> <i>Informal Apprenticeship in Micro and Small Enterprises</i> <i>Skills for Green Jobs</i> <i>Roadmap for Cooperatives in Egypt</i> <i>Aswan Agricultural Sector Mapping</i> <i>Red Sea Handicrafts Sector Value Chain Mapping</i>

ILO Tunisia has supported high-level tripartite dialogue as a building block of the political transition. Within two years, and in the context of an important ILO Social Dialogue project, the Head of Government and the leaders of the UGTT and UTICA signed the *Tunisian Social Contract*. This is one measure of how UGTT and UTICA have figured prominently in the national political process, culminating also in the new Tunisian Constitution. UGTT's and UTICA's ability to forge a strong partnership and channel the aspirations of Tunisian social forces within a constructive dialogue is widely seen as central to this historical achievement and a model for the sub-region.

In many cases of ILO services, the commitment from the national government in Egypt was not clear or consistent. This may be due to a combination of factors, ranging from political will, institutional and budget capacities and blurring of mandates and jurisdictions between social affairs and labour ministries. However, in "The Way Forward," these issues did not seem to impede project performance.

Integration among the project's components in Egypt and Tunisia has posed opportunities for sharing knowledge and experiences between the two countries. This is observed through the cooperation with the social partners in Tunisia during the first year of implementation, on one hand, and through the grassroots-level interventions in Egypt, on the other hand.

Social Dialogue is all the more relevant to engage also employers outside the industrial sector that have been organizing during the evaluation period, representing banking and insurance, construction, tourism and commerce. Meanwhile, the new unions and federations include National Federation for Workers (NFW) Egyptian Democratic Labour Union (EDLU) and Egyptian Democratic Labor Congress (EDLC). ILO in Egypt has remained open to cooperation also with these new formations not affiliated with the previous regime. However, in practice, these formations have not yet emerged as full partners, except in theory. Independent workers reported that, although their representatives sometimes participated in ILO-organized training and conferences, they were not consulted on programming and had little knowledge of ILOs activities in the country. In conversations with ILO staff, this shortcoming does not seem to emerge from any lack of will on



ILO's part, but from the need for greater capacity and resources (e.g., time) to be more consultative and inclusive.

While building capacities to represent the needs of women entrepreneurs and working women, complemented with the ILO's Conducive Environment project, "The Way Forward" has applied—and further developed—capacities of NGOs promoting women's economic empowerment, gender units of the relevant ministries in both countries, as well as the CNFCE and UTICA, in Tunisia, and the FEI, in Egypt. Achievements of synergy and coherence are remarkable, if not sufficiently recognized.

PROJECT EFFECTIVENESS

During 2013 and 2014, after start-up delays, the project demonstrated accelerated and sustained progress and was effective in the achievement of key objectives. ILO recruited the Chief Technical Advisor (CTA) at Cairo in January 2013, and the Tunisian National Officer (NO) in the next month. ILO hired the Project Assistant–Egypt in August 2013 and the Project Assistant-Tunisia in February 2014.

Consultations with key national partners completed revision of the project's logical framework in 2013. (See above discussion of the revised logical framework of March 2013.) The Project Advisory Committee (PAC) in Tunisia had held three quarterly meetings as of this evaluation. In Egypt, the PAC was to be created in the first quarter of 2014; however, difficulties in uniting all the constituent groups in the form of a PAC led to a management decision not to delay project activities by making them contingent upon the formation of a PAC in Egypt, deferring the formation of the PAC until the present.

Nonetheless, during the project's inception phase, ILO developed trust with project partners through extensive consultations with tripartite constituents, as well as civil society and community-based organizations. These meetings also have confirmed the validity and feasibility of the project's strategy and objectives. As mentioned elsewhere, the exception was in the participation of MoMM, in Egypt, at the same high level.

As a result of these consultations and with clearance and guidance from the country office management and CTA, the project's logical framework underwent some changes, which were introduced in the project's first annual report (March 2013). These adjustments lent themselves to better evaluability of project effectiveness by reducing the many (64) indicators, some of them immeasurable, complicated monitoring and evaluation. The resulting consolidation focused the framework on 11 key indicators at the objective level.

In general, the project's indicators and targets fit logically with the results chain set out and reported since March 2013. Two caveats are in order, however:

1. With regard to outcome indicators 2.2 (improved legal environment for women's participation in labour markets) and 2.3 (improved employment policies reflect the challenges that women face in labour markets and increased number of women profiting from employment policies) in Egypt, little evidence emerges from this evaluation to establish the project's policy-level outcomes toward closing the gender gap in that country. The most encouraging indication so far has been the oral expression of interest from FEI members to consider transacting with the project-supported cooperatives.
2. Outcome indicator 1.4 (Government official and labour officers acquire skills to promote and implement international labour standards related to gender equality) may realise results in future Egypt-side reporting and evaluations. However, the current political climate and the

apparent difficulties in the relationship between MoMM and the independent labour movement suggest that it would be preferable to show more positive indications by the end of the project to evaluate success.

Immediate Objective 1: Social partners in Egypt and Tunisia are in a stronger position to support an increase of women participation in the labour force, enhance their position to defend their rights and participate effectively in social dialogue

1.1 Built capacity on gender related issues in the government, trade unions and employer's organizations (including gender audits of these three institutions, training seminars, study tours, dissemination of relevant information, etc.) for women and men

The project trained 71 representatives of the Tunisian administration, academicians, experts, members of trade unions and of civil society organizations, including 33 government officials, were trained on gender related issues through the workshop on the "Economic and Social Rights of Women" conducted in cooperation with the MWFA in Tunis on June 2013.²¹

In November 2013, 140 CNFCE members received training in (1) networking for their greater economic role (2) female entrepreneurship and greater economic integration at Tunis (June and November 2013), and technical training in creating modern carpets at al-Mahdia (November 2013).

50 representatives of main tripartite institutions (MoMM, MWFA, NCW, UGTT, CNFCE) were trained in gender in the context of informal economy, social and solidarity economic solutions, national policies against child labour, supporting open economies, sustainable enterprises, development for youth, **gender audit** at the ILO -International Training Centre in Turin (ILOITC).

At the time of evaluation, "The Way Forward" was preparing for a ToT workshop for 30 members of the Egyptian National Participatory Gender Audit (PGA) Team (7–18 May 2015), with follow-up involving national institutions replicating the PGAs, in addition to gender-equality training provided to the HR departments of selected private companies.

1.2 Increased women's participation in trade unions and employers organizations

Trade unions:

The project provided three training workshops in Tunisia focused on raising awareness of members of trade unions on women's participation in the Social Contract. With that essential step, the project also supported the process of the locally determined revision of the UGTT internal regulations to ensure a larger representation of women in the trade union's decision-making structures. Through training events, in particular, those conducted on the basis of original research and comparative analysis of experiences in other countries, the project advanced local (male and female) UGTT members's adherence to the proposed revisions. The effort included assistance in the preparation of the draft Internal Regulations proposal, as well as eight seminars covering the 23 governorates, targeting a total of 300 members.

A formally proposed *change concerning the internal regulations of UGTT* favours a two-seat minimum quota for representation of women in UGTT structures and decision-making bodies. The reform proposal has passed through most of the required internal UGTT validation steps, including its Administrative Commission, and the proposal is expected to pass in the next National Congress (2016).



In Egypt, a project-supported a *joint trade union committee on gender issues* was created later, in February 2015. The project plans to pursue a similar approach in the cases of the more-complex configurations of five (3 national and 2 sectoral) independent trade union federations. That followed a conference where 60 senior trade union representatives from the five federations were sensitized on the role of trade unions in promoting gender equality.

The 15-member *joint trade union committee on gender issues* is collaborating on the baseline study on the participation of women in trade unions in Egypt. Members also recently participated in a 3-day training event on gender and trade union issues. ILO is currently reproducing the training in a series of 5 workshops covering Upper Egypt, including Fayum, Suhag and Aswan.

Employers associations:

On the side of employers associations and, in particular, women entrepreneurs, the project trained 185 persons, including 140 members of CNFCE to build their capacity as women entrepreneurs and develop linkages among them as a means of strengthening their economic role. Other partner institution representatives received training related to the informal economy, social and solidarity economic, child labour, sustainable enterprise development for youth, and gender audit at the ILO-International Training Centre in Turin (ILO-ITC).

Parallel and complementary to the awareness-raising functions of the project was the 2014 baseline study (completed in January 2015) that assessed the current situation of women in trade union structures and proposed recommendations on complementary actions for increasing their participation. The baseline revealed an average participation rate of 9.6% of businesswomen in the national and regional bodies of UTICA. A conference of 80 participants discussed the findings, followed by the ILO and CNFCE to develop recommendations to improve CNFCE roles, services and internal statutes. The study is supposed to be followed also by the development of a monitoring system to measure and report on the number and percentage of female membership in the trade unions. At the time of this evaluation, the reform recommendations and proposed monitoring system are works in progress.

In the meantime, CNFCE has launched an awareness campaign on businesswomen's role in UTICA decision-making bodies. ILO is starting a *training programme* on social affairs for the locally elected businesswomen to attract them to business structures.

In Egypt, the project's highly effective November 2014 conference, "Supporting Business Women: A necessity, the challenges and the way forward," organized with FEI, was the locus of several firsts in Egypt. For instance, FEI used the occasion to announce the establishment of a "Women in Business" Unit and a commitment to develop supportive services to increase businesswomen's participation in their own structures and within companies.

A *baseline study on the participation of women in employers' organisations*, similar to that conducted in Tunisia, is envisaged also in Egypt.

1.3 Increased knowledge of women and the wider public on women's rights at work

The project benefitted 71 representatives of government institutions, as well as academics, experts, members of trade unions and of civil society organizations through a workshop on the in cooperation with MAFFE, In Tunisia.

The project-supported June 2013 "Economic and Social Rights of Women" workshop was reported under Objective 1.1 (to benefit government, trade unions and employer's organizations). These

activities are consistent also with the overall objective of increasing knowledge of women in the “wider public” (i.e., beyond the tripartite constituents). However, in pursuit of outcome indicators corresponding to the elusive objective of increasing wider-public knowledge, this evaluation considers this activity here.

Indications of wider-public awareness raising on women’s rights at work linked to “The Way Forward” are found in local press coverage. Already in August 2013, the journal of *Centre de recherches, d’études, de documentation et d’information sur la femme* (CREDIF) published an in-depth article on “The Reality of Woman’s Economic Integration in Tunisia,” covering the range of issues programmed in the project, featuring urban and rural aspects, and the views of tripartite institutions. In the same month, CREDIF published an interview with the project CTA entitled “Cooperatives as a better alternative for valorising woman’s production.”

On 21 November 2013, the Tunisian News Agency (TAP) published and distributed on the wires an article of the ILO project’s work to enhance women’s productivity and access to markets in the production of medicinal plants. It focused on the recent “The Way Forward” workshop in Tunisia and the projects objectives in Egypt and Tunisia.

The November 2013 issue of *Jadal*, the UGGT publication, featured an article on the UGGT’s chief of women’s affairs. It reported the drafting of the statute for a quota including women in the decision-making structures of the Union. The entire issue was dedicated to women and youth in the processes leading up to the UGTT’s next national conference.

Tunisian Woman of History [Tūnisīyyāt al-Tarīkh] published an article in June 2013 on the clear strategy to realize women’s right, including decent work. It covered the workshop hosted at the MWCA/MAFFE in that month under the project. Almost simultaneously the TAP, *Kapitalis* and the UTICA published on the CNFCE-organised conference on the subject of women’s leadership and its role in the global economic development of Tunisia.

The women’s capacity-building efforts at Mahdia and Qairuan in December 2013 was the subject of other press and internet dispatches (baya, babnet, *et al.*), citing CNFCE and ILO cooperation under the project and the rights-based objectives it pursues. That followed a series of press articles—in Arabic and French—on subjects related to the right to decent work for women in Tunisia and the project’s activities.

The same pattern continues through 2015. However, this evaluation could not identify coverage from UNIC on the ILO activities in Tunisia, including coverage of this project. This is significant since the complications in the representation of the ILO/Tunisia CO in the UNCT was supposed to have improved with assignment of a local CO coordinator after February 2014. (See **Project Efficiency, Partnerships** below.)

The “Women’s Empowerment” income-generating activity in the New Valley, implemented through New Horizon Association for Social Development, was the subject of an implementation agreement whose objective 3 called for 100 women to acquire awareness on women workers’ and their rights. Reportedly, the implementer fulfilled that through training activities in the field.

1.4 *Government officials and labour officers acquire skills to promote and implement international labour standards related to gender equality*

As part of an awareness-raising campaign conducted by the Ministry of Women’s Affairs and the National Association of Labour Inspectors, and consistent with project objective 1 (indicator 1.4),

the project organized nine workshops on gender issues across Tunisia between May 2013 and February 2015, involving participants from 23 governorates.

The project activity described under 1.1 and 1.3 (above) in cooperation with MAFFE, in Tunisia, benefitted representatives of government institutions, among others. That workshop on the “Economic and Social Rights of Women” is coherent with 1.4 in so far as 33 of the total 71 beneficiaries were government officials and labour officers.

In addition, 24 representatives of Egypt’s main specialized institutions (MoMM, MWFA and NCW) underwent training at both regional level and at ILO-ITC on specific topics of ILS and gender equality.

Immediate Objective 2: Labour market institutions at the national and local level are better equipped to assist women

2.1 Local WED platforms created and enabled with ILO WED tools

The July 2014 Tunis “Colloque sur l’Accès des Femmes Chefs d’Entreprises aux Financements” benefitted participants from CNFCE. The participants interviewed for this evaluation reported the effectiveness of the training. However, one respondent questioned the choice of expatriate trainers, suggesting that the delivery and the discussions could have been more effective with facilitators who were more familiar with the Tunisian context. Nonetheless, the reports were overwhelmingly positive and the outcomes were particularly useful in pointing out the needs of women entrepreneurs and proposing the services and capacities that CNFCE could and should develop in future.

Assessments of the Women’s Entrepreneurship Development (WED) frameworks were in preparation in Egypt and Tunisia; however, progress in Tunisia has been faster. A legislative review and an actuarial study on the extension of maternity protection are also being conducted in Tunisia.

More than 600 representatives of governmental organizations, workers’, employers’, and civil society organizations, including a total of 306 persons were trained on different ILO WED tools in both countries. In Egypt, the project provided coaching to the trainers on the ILO GET-Ahead for Women in Enterprise tool. The trainers then trained 86 additional end-beneficiaries in Marsa Alam, Hamata, and Aswan as of the project’s mid-term.

A National Assessment of the Women’s Entrepreneurship Development (WED) Framework Conditions was ongoing in Tunisia at the time of this mid-term evaluation. The recommendations of the assessments, expected for launch in June 2015, should offer a roadmap to supporting women’s entrepreneurship in both countries. The project has selected a research team in Egypt to undertake the same study and undergo the same training as provided in Tunisia in late May 2015.

2.2 Improved legal environment for women who participate in labour markets

The UGTT has proposed a statutory amendment to maintain a quota of two seats for women in its structures, if the percentage of women members is equal to or greater than 20%. The quota would be set at one seat, if this percentage is less than 20%. This does not ensure equality, or parity (as sought in the Tunisian Constitution); however, it does signal major progress and effectiveness in the project’s support of UGTT to increase women’s participation in decision making structures. The project cannot claim the same level of presumed effectiveness in Egypt, where both labour organizations and the main partner employers association (FEI) remain at the level of exploratory discussions.

At the level of national law, however, the Tunisia progress is most evident and the project-supported activities promise to be effective and influential contributors to eventual law reform and ratification of ILO instruments concerning women's rights at work. The draft report on the *legislative review* of Tunisia has been completed in Tunisia and is subject to further review by the ILO. The effectiveness of these project activities is yet to be evaluated. However, the legislative review is deeply analytical and points out double standards in legislation that are bound to inspire lively debate. The actuary study on the prospective costs of extending maternity leave to women employees consistent with ILO Convention No. 183 may elicit effective arguments for the affordability of that benefit. However, the affordability criterion for extending an entitlement subordinates the human rights values grounding the realization of the right. While the legislature has only recently been formed and the forensic debate on the subject has not yet begun, the presumed legal obligation to extend maternity leave, which is Tunisia's ratification of Convention 193, remain distant. While relevance and coherence of these interventions are not in doubt, measuring their effectiveness is premature.

2.3 Improved employment policies to reflect the challenges women face in labour markets and increased number of women profiting from employment policies

ILO signed a contract with the Association for Women's Total Advancement and Development (AWTaD) on "Job Ready: Supporting Private Companies to Address Gender Inequality in Employment" (Dec. 2013–Nov. 2014) for a budget of USD 122,395.20. The activity has targeted at least 20 companies and 250 youth (60%, or 150, women) through capacity building and placement services. The activity has sought to demonstrate that by eliminating discrimination at recruitment and providing better working conditions for both women and men, a company is able to widen the pool of candidates for job vacancies, reduce worker turnover and, thus, improve overall productivity.

While this activity rates high in project relevance and coherence, this evaluation is unable to determine ultimate effectiveness due to the slow start-up (due to delays on the part of the relevant ministry in issuing approvals required for setting up the bank account). According to reports as of 12 November, the implementer had concluded cooperation arrangements with at least four large and diverse companies and four universities. The number of training activities and beneficiaries remains unreported; however, out of 104 job applicants through the AWTaD activities, 81.12% (84.36?) were females and 27.04% (28.12?) males. To ensure improved recruitment procedures, AWTaD also developed a performance review tool to measure the candidates' performance after completing "Job Ready" training and working during the first 3 to 6 months in their positions. Calculating the reported outcomes, this project activity appears to be partially effective with 40% of intended employer institutions engaged, and 56.24% of young women potentially served through placement.

By 2015, the project had trained 185 labour inspectors in Tunisia on gender equality at the workplace with a view to promote a gender-responsive labour inspection. This is the result of two rounds of a training campaign aiming at 250 labour inspectors in 24 governorates of Tunisia. Assessing on the basis of the numbers, this activity was 74% effective to date.

Immediate Objective 3: Women are better equipped to participate in labour markets and find a decent job

3.1 Increased awareness on women rights and career options



The partial effectiveness of “Job Ready: Supporting Private Companies to Address Gender Inequality in Employment” tailored training in soft skills, job shadowing and mentoring to improve competencies and facilitate adaptation to the working environment. 250 new recruits will be targeted by this initiative, 60% of whom females, to be selected and recruited by with some 20 partner companies that are medium-large employers of graduate students. Among this group, at least 50% will have been unemployed for at least one year.

Determining the effectiveness of the “Socio-Economic Justice for Bedouin Women” project, implemented by CEFD, is more straightforward. The clear reporting of outcomes vis-à-vis outputs is summarized below. Beyond the convincing numbers and ratios, this operation was a subject of a field verification mission during this evaluation and the qualitative effectiveness of the inputs is clear. The lives of women—and men—participating in workshops and practical guidance activities have reported spontaneously and unequivocally of the positive moral and material changes that have resulted from this implementation agreement.

Overall objective: Support Eastern Desert Bedouin Women in getting access to their legal and economic rights, in order to ensure justice and equality in the governorates of Aswan and Red Sea		
Specific objectives:		Effectiveness
1. At the end of the project, 450 Bedouin women in Aswan (300 women) and Red Sea (150 women) governorates have access to income-generating activities in their communities through the registration and operation of two social enterprises in the fields of handicrafts and agriculture.	Output 1.1. Two value-chains analyzed and gender links identified Output 1.2. The technical skills of 450 women improved for the production of Bedouin handicrafts Output 1.3. 60 women empowered to form social enterprises in two fields: handicrafts and agriculture fields.	High, but asymmetrical with targets (300% in Red Sea, 20% in Aswan)
2. At the end of the project, 900 Bedouin women in Aswan and Red Sea governorates are supported with juridical assistance to enable them to start an economic activity.	Output 2.1. Two social enterprises for Eastern desert nomads, especially women registered. Output 2.2. 800 women provided with birth certificates, ID cards or marriage certificates Output 2.3. 100 women in eight women groups supported to register their micro-economic projects and get economic licenses.	High (89%)
3. At the end of the project, eight voluntary support groups are enabled to provide coaching and regular support for the women’ social enterprises.	Output 3.1: Eight support groups of 7–9 voluntary members each created and trained; Output 3.2: Coaching and technical support provided to 800 Eastern Desert nomads, especially women through the eight support groups.	High (100%)
4. At the end of the project, eight CBOs in Aswan and Red Sea Governorates are enabled to raise awareness on and support Bedouin women economic empowerment.	Output 4.1: Local development priorities and training needs in the targeted Eastern Desert communities identified and addressed; Output 4.2: Eight CBOs working on women economic empowerment trained. Output 4.3. Community awareness raising campaign undertaken in coordination with the eight CBOs	High (100%)

In addition, this activity extended direct legal support to 238 Bedouin women to gain access to 50 birth certificates, 125 IDs, and prepared *tasaduq* registrations of 126 Bedouin citizens in al-Shalatīn District). The realisation of these process rights to recognition of one’s nationality and other public services forms an indispensable step toward achieving related social and economic rights.

The “Women’s Empowerment” income-generating activity in the New Valley, implemented through New Horizon Association for Social Development, also appears to have been mostly effective, having completed all contracted activities during the performance period. These included, under its

objective 1, to improve the skills of 75 women through vocational training in organic agriculture, greenhouse techniques and organic composting.

In the case of Bedouin women—and men—benefitting from project training provided by CEFD manifested enhanced awareness of gender issues. Men and women both testified that they acquired a new appreciation for “women’s work” through the training sessions and follow-up. Other indications of training effectiveness came from extra-project outcomes such as Bedouin women in Red Sea Governorate finally obtaining birth and marriage certificates, and the consequence of their children becoming eligible for public school attendance. In more than one case, women benefitting from “The Way Forward” project training have decided to run for local elections (whenever they take place). This new confidence and competence even took the form of gender awareness that caused one potential candidate publicly raising the question of women’s equal access to land tenure. The lessons learned in the training clearly holds potential for diverse applications, including those seeking substantive equality.

3.2 *Increased entrepreneurial skills for women*

Under objective 2, the “Women’s Empowerment” income-generating activity in the New Valley, improved entrepreneurial skills for 30 women, New Horizon reported to have ensured that 15 women acquired entrepreneurial skills. Therefore, its effectiveness at fulfilling this objective was partial.

The effectiveness of “Socio-Economic Justice for Bedouin Women” manifest at this mid-term by demonstrating increased entrepreneurial skills for women in Egypt in the registration of three cooperatives in the Governorates of Aswan and Red Sea: two handicrafts cooperatives and one agricultural cooperative. This follows the provision of five awareness sessions for 488 women in Aswan and Red Sea Governorates about productive cooperatives, in addition to five awareness sessions for 275 small farmers (men and women) on the importance of agriculture cooperatives. The handicrafts cooperatives also involved the intervention of another project partner the Industrial Modernization Centre, a semi-public agency.

In March and April 2014, the project conducted two workshops on value chain development (VCD) in Tunisia on the development and management of cooperatives. In the same period, ILO supported the participation of 25 community leaders (women and men) from Egypt’s Governorate of Aswan (Dairaw, Kom Ombo, Wadi al-Nukra) and the Red Sea Governorate (Marsa Alam, al-Kusair, al-Shalatīn) on “Mainstreaming Gender Analysis in Value Chain Development.” Respondents in both Red Sea and Aswan spontaneously shared their appreciation for these activities, with their focus on principles, governance and management of cooperatives through a gender lens. They recounted to this evaluator how these activities initiated life skills beyond their expectations, building self-confidence and actual capabilities to understand and join the labour market, as well as other skills to negotiate their way in the public sphere.

3.3 *Skills for women (including those in the informal sector) improved to facilitate their access to the job market*

A project-supported study on the challenges and the potential of “Women engaged in the Sector of Medicinal and Aromatic Plants” recommendations were discussed and approved by key national partners during a national-level validation workshop. The participants involved three women groups, who discussed a participatory action plan for national partners to mobilize direct support to the selected women and of professionals and of private companies to provide commercialization channels through an integrated ILO-led intervention.



The notable outcome of the project so far—owing also to the USD 30,000 implementation agency contract with New Horizon Association for Social Development in Dakhla Oasis/al-Wadi al-Jadid (Aug. 13–Jul. 2014)—trained 75 women in organic agriculture, greenhouse’s techniques and composting, as well as built entrepreneurial skills.

The Association of Community Development in West Aswan was contracted under the project with a budget of USD 30,000 for “Generating income for women through training on Nubian handicrafts” (Dec. 2013–Nov. 2014).²² This activity trained 215 women on Nubian handicrafts production and a Nubian expertise house specialized in supporting Nubian traditional handicrafts will be created.

Finally, the project has partnered with 8 key organizations in Egypt to build their capacities and deliver skills training to 975 women.

3.4 Modern skills for women improved through increased offers for women in soft skills, ICT and language knowledge

The partial effectiveness of “Job Ready: Supporting Private Companies to Address Gender Inequality in Employment” has addressed tailored training in soft skills and foreign-language knowledge. The AWTaD implementer has identified demand for such job skills. Presumably, the 250 targeted new job candidates would include women whose skills at these functions would have improved through project training inputs. However, this verification will be a subject of the final evaluation. It would behove the project to produce data that bears this out.

ILO maintains separate reports and Excel files in Cairo and Tunis to record training activities without necessarily linking them. In interviews, ILO officers demonstrate a good awareness of the training activities within their projects and, to some degree, how they may relate to other project-based and regular budget training. For understandable reasons, they may be less aware of similar—or even duplicative—training activities carried out by other actors. Particularly trade union representatives have mentioned the problem of duplicative training opportunities over time by ILO and other service providers.

It is with these aspects in mind that this evaluation finds a continuing need for the evaluation of training within ILO. These findings, however positive, make for rather anecdotal reporting that only can give a partial impression of training and skill-building outcomes.

3.5 5 innovative women entrepreneurship projects supported

As a stroke of innovation and ultimate project effectiveness, ILO concluded partnership contracts with five NGOs in Egypt to carry out the direct field work to equip women with skills to participate in the labour market. The local activities targeted a total of 870 women in two remote provinces. This evaluation reviewed the work of CEFD, which entered an implementation agreement for the “Socio-Economic Justice for Bedouin Women” project This supported also eight support groups to provide coaching to the beneficiaries and raise awareness on women economic empowerment through in the handicrafts and aromatic and medicinal herbs sectors. The ILO tools used were: Gender Links to Value Chain Analysis (completed), GET Ahead and My.Coop.

The ILO partnered with Association for Community Development for Family in Edfu (Dec. 2013–Nov. 2014), also with a budget of USD 30,000 for “Generating income for women using local palm tree resources and contributing to the reduction of environmental hazards resulting from palm tree waste burning.” A field verification mission of this evaluation visited the project at Nag`a al-Arab village, where 130 women have been trained on handicrafts production and marketing skills.

The outcome to date involves three new cooperatives (two handicraft and one agricultural). In this sense, the project has been 60% effective in fulfilling this objective to date. We will return to the matter of entrepreneurship project sustainability below.

Immediate Objective 4: Capacity building for the national agencies for statistics and other relevant stakeholders (e.g., employment observatories) to produce timely and accurate gender disaggregated data on labour markets and evaluate the impact of employment policies on women's labour market participation

Implementation of this component was postponed to 2014. However, in that calendar year, the results of the knowledge-based activities under Objectives 1 and 2, namely the two national WED assessments and the baselines on the participation of women in trade unions and business associations in both countries, have contribute to this objective. However, specific project activities to benefit national agencies for statistics have yet to be programmed. The principal indicator of project effectiveness in this field has been in the identification of gaps in national statistical data and collection methods, particularly as they undercount or do not address informality. However, one more lesson arises from the realization that social partner institutions also lack sufficient data on constituencies, especially disaggregating women.

- 4.1 *Capacity building on labour market indicators with a special focus on gender-relevant indicators*
- 4.2 *Training and technical assistance in conducting surveys, analysing data, and writing reports (statistical agencies in each country) with a special focus on gender-relevant statistics*
- 4.3 *Gender mainstreamed in selected thematic reports*
- 4.4 *Gender research undertaken in new thematic areas*

The effectiveness of these specific project objectives cannot be measured at the present, as they have not yet been programmed or implemented. Rather, much of the unprecedented data coming out of the CNFCE, UGTT and Egyptian labour movement baseline studies likely will contribute to the reform of methods and greater capacity of the worker and employer institutions to collect data relevant to women at work, both as entrepreneurs and as employees. However, it is less clear how these lessons will be integrated into the functions of statistical agencies in each country. The remaining months of the project will have to address this question in order to ensure similar effectiveness at the governmental level.

Overall effectiveness

In Egypt, this evaluator's findings from the field-level training carried out by civil-society partner subcontractors have been very positive. In the first line, the participants were ebullient about their new skills and, beyond the entrepreneurial and income-generation prospects of their involvement, expressed great satisfaction at the life skills that they acquired, learning the value of their production, new-found creativity through innovative designs and a radical expansion of their civic—and mental—horizons.

Due, in part, to their embeddedness and ongoing programmes of their own design, these particular partner organisations have brought added value to the ILO repertoire. In the case of Association for Community Development for Family (ACDF), at Nag`a al-Arab village, the local civil society organisation (CSO) has a long track record of community development, where almost any organising effort fills a need. The region is neglected by the absence of public investment, education, health

care, social services and infrastructure. The productivity, income-generating and market-access benefits of this project and its training component for basic and applied skills have brought tangible benefits to entire communities.

Moreover, because these discrete efforts are integrated within a broader program, for example, the ACDF's parallel efforts at maintaining data on housing conditions (e.g., habitability, sanitation and structural improvements, inhabitation dynamics, household contents) hold the potential for a deep analysis of development's benefits, beyond income. This evaluator learned during his field visit that ACDF also maintains records that enable the tracking of changes in urban-rural migration patterns, both seasonal and permanent emigration. Although that question lies outside the scope of this evaluation, it indicates the wider knowledge potential and corollary of outcomes. To wit, ACDF's director shared the observation that outward migration from the village has declined with the increase in productive and entrepreneurial activities, even to the degree at which some former migrants have returned.

This collaborative programming with CSOs stands out as an innovation of this project, in particular, within the North Africa ILO operation. Largely because of the experience of the CTA in other ILO programmes, especially combatting child labour, she has become familiar and comfortable with the selective partnership with CSOs. This innovation is attributed to her, as well as to the ILO Cairo director, whose confidence in the CTA made this effective arrangement possible.

Much of the effectiveness of this project in relating to the tripartite constituents in both Tunisia and Egypt is explained by a high level of trust built with critical partners. UGTT apparently prefers to feel more involved in project-design phases. However, the respondents consistently report that they feel ILO respects and shares their objectives. They also explained that, in some important ways, the ILO partnership has changed their strategic thinking. This observation applies also to UTICA, CNFCE and government partners in Tunisia.

This trust factor is especially important not only because these tripartite institutions seek to optimise their benefits from interventions. Each is keenly autonomous and sovereign in its approach to their particular objectives, developed over long histories. The achievement of Social Dialogue and the 2013 Social Contract in Tunisia has signalled a breakthrough in building that trust, which has grown also among the three constituencies, especially UGTT and UTICA/CNFCE.

The tripartite construct in Egypt is a field of less mutual trust, particularly from the part of central government institutions. Nonetheless, the FEI has embraced the notions of greater gender sensitivity and women's engagement in representation and decision making in the sector.

In Egypt, FEI (leadership) apparently remains open minded to the methods of increasing women's leadership, at least as of the November 2014 conference. However, the independent trade union movement in Egypt is uncertain and not uniform in strategies across their diverse structures for advancing women's engagement. The women members also are undecided at the time of this evaluation. Future project support should remedy that ambiguity.

In Tunisia, the Constituent Assembly achieved consensus on the constitutional principle of gender parity as the goal for all assemblies within the republic.²³ However, UTICA leadership appears to be open to reserved seats for CNFCE in its structures. In UTICA's most-recent general conference, the revised by-laws did not enshrine that principle, however, owing to an apparent oversight in the merging of drafts. The human resources of CNFCE leadership apparently was stretched too thin at the time of the merger, and no one was able to monitor the final drafting process. That opportunity is deferred until the next conference in 2017.



Despite the parity principle at the national (constitutional) level, Tunisia's UGTT has opted for a quota of one or two women for each structure (see detail above). Women members of UGTT and its Secretary-General have promoted the quota approach.²⁴ Even this minimum has met reported resistance in certain regions of the UGTT constituency. However, the 2015 general conference is expected to validate the quota option in the new statute.

This "compromise," accepting a standard less than the national constitutional goal, appears to some surprising. UGTT is portrayed and self-acclaimed as being a progressive and deeply critical institution. However, it is also large and diverse.

Among the objectives of the project has been the establishment of Project Advisory Committees (PACs) in each of the two countries. Ideally, these bodies should operate as more than just sounding boards for ILO project management, but assume more strategic-planning and decision-making roles.

In Tunisia, the PAC is up and running; however, it meets infrequently. The difficulty of gathering the three-person PAC during the evaluator's early visit to Tunisia was the main reason necessitating his return visit. In meeting with the PAC members, all seemed to work together well and understand the project deeply. It was less clear about their function and importance as a body, particularly in addressing certain strategic project dilemmas that their broader perspective might see. (e.g., the need for time extension, strategies to gain support for the maternity-leave reform, etc.). This may be a result of infrequent meetings to consolidate contingency plans, or the newness of the questions. However, this project's PAC could embody women's effectiveness at visionary tripartite programming. The eminently compatible PAC members hold that potential for Tunisia.

PROJECT EFFICIENCY

Project management

As noted, the project experienced an inefficient start-up, due to the prolonged, 6-month recruitment process. However, ILO compensated for lost time in the start-up of "The Way Forward."²⁵ The activities with the NGOs helped expedite project activities with two implementation agreements and three purchase orders signed in the first year of effective implementation. However, the weak implementation capacity of NGOs in Tunisia delayed the identification of potential partners in certain areas of intervention. Reported, inordinate administrative delays in Egypt, including in approving implementation agreements, cost much time and other project resources.²⁶

More difficulties arose in the interface with government partners. The needed approval from the Ministry of Social Solidarity for NGOs in Egypt to receive funds inordinately delayed the effective start of some activities. In Tunisia, a difficult relation of the previous Minister of Women and Family Affairs with the social partners delayed progress on some outputs. In particular the National Council for Women in Egypt with whom dialogue has started in March 2013, but the project has not yet reached a satisfactory agreement.

The security situation in both countries continued to impact field operations. A curfew in Egypt, June to mid-November 2013, coincided with a travel ban for missions (within Egypt and from the outside). In both countries, certain rural areas were affected by random civil uprising.

In the light of this context, interviews with ILO specialists and project staff have affirmed their great concern to maximize coherence and synergies to bring about complementary results and economies of implementation efforts and resources. Thus, despite the divergence of the two specific country

situations, the project is adopting an integrated strategy and seeking coherence. Examples include other ILO projects that have carried out joint activities with the employment projects in Aswan, Egypt through the former AusAid funded project, “Decent Jobs for Egypt’s young people – tackling the challenge together,” and on trade unions with the Social Dialogue project in Tunisia.

At least one CSO project partner initiated the observation that working with ILO is administratively cumbersome. They cited the bureaucratic measures in obtaining approvals, resources and responses from ILO Cairo. It is understood also that some of these delays may relate to the multiple layers of MoSA applications and approvals for contracting local CSOs in Egypt.

Given the available documentation, it appears that the project was designed and managed to maintain a comprehensive and up-to-date work plan. The project has allocated its resources against the realisation of its different outputs, and has tracked its financial expenditures efficiently. Financial revisions for a possible project extension were under discussion at the time of this evaluation

Technical quality assurance and support

From the available information, both collected through document reviews and project partners, the project management has assured high quality of inputs, whether in the form of training, technical assistance, research and reporting. ILO has applied its assets, including and especially Specialists of the DWCT, trainers at Turin and external collaborators to meet partner expectations.

Some studies remain incomplete at this reporting (e.g., the study on Egyptian women’s participation in independent trade unions); however, indications suggest good outputs. For example, the choice of consultant for the Tunisian legislative review was particularly appropriate for his insight and deep understanding of the constituent rights and lacunae in the body of law (e.g., regulating labour action, but omitting to prohibit interference with workers’ freedom of association and labour organisation).

As noted elsewhere, quality assurance for training programs could improve with an integrated training database. However, that seems an ambitious undertaking and the likely subject of a future evaluation of sub-regional ILO training experience.

The cooperative spirit of local authorities in Aswan was an asset brought about, in part, through long cooperation with the local subcontractor, CEFD. In meeting with the focus group from the governorate, respondents affirmed that no form of local governance has changed since 2011 (and expressed confidence that none would).

ILO in North Africa is adopting integrated approaches, making use of various ILO instruments and training curricula. For example, the implementation agreement with CEFD combines the gender approach (training on Gender Links to Value-chain Analysis), with the promotion of cooperatives (creation of two cooperatives and training beneficiaries on “My Coop”), and building of women business skills (“Get Ahead” training), in addition to the provision of other direct services and legal assistance (support in marketing for Bedouin women, etc.). The CEFD approach seems to be both effective and efficient.

Administration and Finance

As reported by project managers, in general, this project experienced long lapses in the expected project commencement in addition to the lengthy recruitment processes that only could follow ILO

administrative requisites. That resulted in greater pressure on implementers to deliver within sufficient time and within available resources.

The donor is aware of the challenges faced by the project and by the efforts that were made to overcome them. For example, the Ambassador of Finland in Tunisia has shown full commitment to the project and has participated in the project activities, inviting the project partners to the Finnish Embassy, and actively participating to the Conference on Women Entrepreneurs Access to Financial Services. In Egypt, meetings and visits were organized with some of the project's partners in the ILO CO on the occasion of the visit of the Finnish Ministry of Foreign Affairs Representative in April 2013 and November 2014. The Finnish ambassador in Egypt also participated in project activities. Finland's Counsellor for Development and Economic Affairs in the Embassy in Cairo closely followed the project activities and was providing continuous support. This involvement suggests more direct interest on the part of the donor in Cairo, while noting also a change of the Finnish ambassador to Tunisia during the period.

Project Information	2012 (US\$, %)	2013 (US\$, %)	2014 (US\$, %)
1. RAF/12/01/FIN: The way forward after the revolution-decent work for women in Egypt and Tunisia (01/06/2012-31/07/2015)	Allocation: 12,994 Expenditure: 12,994 Delivery Rate: 100%	Allocation: 626,157 Expenditure: 626,157 Delivery Rate: 100%	Allocation: 1,831,919 Expenditure: 808,344 Delivery Rate: 44%

Partnerships

External coherence through partnerships is also evident insofar as "The Way Forward" links and aligns with several other projects within the ILO portfolio in Tunisia and Egypt. The project is also seeking integration along its four immediate objectives and with its different partners: (1) the work of women in the informal sector is a priority for the downstream as well as the up-stream level interventions; (2) the activities in the field are presented and discussed at the national level (examples: participation of the project beneficiaries in a meeting on a related subject co-organised by the workers and Enterprise Specialists, validating the study on the situation of women working in the aromatic and medicinal herbs sector in a national workshop; and (3) regular sharing of experiences between and among partners working in the same geographical area, or between partners in Egypt and in Tunisia.

Regular coordination with the ILO specialists has included the involvement of the Employers specialist developing the support of the employer organizations (UTICA, in Tunisia, and FEI, in Egypt) for the project. The April 2014 conference, in Tunis, on women entrepreneurs' access to financial services and to elaborating an action plan aimed to increase women representation in the UTICA structures. Other examples can also be given concerning the support provided by the Workers' specialist in the work initiated with the UGTT and with the independent Egyptian trade union. The Enterprise, Skills and Standards Specialists have contributed to other interventions within their areas of expertise. In recent months, the Training Specialist also has piloted the newly translated ILO My.coop modules within "The Way Forward."

Integrated approaches are being adopted, making use of different ILO instruments: For example, the implementation agreement with CEFD combines the gender approach (training on Gender Links to Value-chain Analysis), with the promotion of cooperatives (creation of two cooperatives and training beneficiaries on My.Coop), and building of women business skills (GET Ahead training), in addition to the provision of other direct services and legal assistance (support in marketing, obtaining vital documents for Bedouin women, etc.).



Partnerships for the whole duration of the project are designed and established with the constituents (especially in Tunisia), especially with regards to increasing women representation in the workers' and employers' organisations. These include training (through the ILO-ITC, ILO offices, or workshops organized by the project); technical support; awareness raising campaigns; baseline studies (within CNFCE and UTICA); creation of monitoring systems (planned with the UGTT), and other activities.

Integration between the project's components in Egypt and Tunisia has created opportunities for sharing knowledge and experiences between women entrepreneurs in both countries. This has followed the important achievement of the Social Contract in Tunisia during the first year of project implementation, under the ILO's Social Dialogue project. In both countries, ILO is supporting women working in the aromatic and medicinal herbs sector.

The challenges of ensuring coherence at the level of ILO country offices and subregional offices were particularly evident in the complex operations of Cairo and Tunisia during the High-level Evaluation of ILO North Africa in 2014 (2014 North Africa Evaluation).²⁷ For different reasons, each ILO operation had suffered from a lack of sufficiently regular meetings of programme staff. Both an ILO North Africa sub-region retreat in February 2014, implementation of resulting recommendations²⁸ and new management in both the Cairo and Algiers ILO offices have contributed to improving the internal coherence of ILO operations. The Tunis and Cairo offices conduct more and more-regular staff meetings, as well as the inclusion of the DWT in the early programming stages. This in-house lesson seems to have been learnt and implemented.

That same retreat reported a decision to “appoint a coordinator/leader/[focal point] for Tunisia.” Internal and external coherence requires this function, especially in order to ensure coherence and coordination with the UNCT, donors and constituents. The 2014 North Africa Evaluation recommended that this role be played by an international ILO officer not bound to a particular project. Instead, the designated coordinator does double as a specific project manager. However, from the perspective of this evaluation the coordinating function appears to be working, executing the findings of both the 2014 North Africa Evaluation and the staff-wide decision.

Generally, the project faces—and will continue to face throughout its execution period—a particularly weak capacity in local administration. That is in a context, in both Tunisia and Egypt, where local government is essentially lacking. The concept of local authorities, as distinct from local government, does not exist, even in the new 2014 Egyptian and Tunisian constitutions, and it is far too soon to foretell the legislative calendar in Tunisia, while Egypt has no legislature to date, and the Executive branch of central government rules by decree.

Nonetheless, partnerships with both central and local spheres of government are relevant to “The Way Forward.” In an evaluation focus group with Aswan Governorate authorities (technocrats), they expressed support for, and cooperation with the project's objectives. They explained also how they exerted efforts to survey land used for the agricultural cooperatives. In the midst of overlapping land administrations in Egypt, certain lands can be made available subject to governorate and/or municipal decisions, while other lands fall under the authority of the Ministry of Agriculture and Land Reclamation (MoALR). As affirmed by the Aswan Governorate respondents, the granting of land tenure for the project cooperatives remains at the will of the authorities. Given the nature of land administration and allotment in Egypt, land issues might affect sustainability of the cooperatives operating on tenure-insecure lands.

Not unrelated to this local representation question is the this evaluation's *post hoc ergo propter hoc* observation that capacity-building efforts through ILO's partner CEFD may have led to at least one



woman participant's announced candidacy for Egypt's eventual local council elections. She reportedly also has raised women's land tenure as an issue of her emerging platform.

Another partnership has not been articulated in this project. The composition, criteria of membership and potential contributions of the young entrepreneurs seem to remain little known to project participants. That raises the question unfathomed in this evaluation as to whether a similar ILO project might also show the way forward for such young entrepreneur structures as UTICA's Centre des Jeunes Dirigeants.

PROJECT IMPACT

"The Way Forward" already has realized important impacts, despite delays and environmental obstacles. The combined efforts and accomplishment of ILO, as well as its role as steward of ILS and norms, has aided these accomplishments. The momentum toward Tunisia's ratification of Convention 183 is significant. However, as most of the project objectives, the realization likely will follow the end of the project. This promise is emblematic of much of the intended impact of "The Way Forward."

The bulk of ILO's North Africa project portfolio evolved after 2011, and most projects initially could meet their objectives only partially, both in financial terms and, more importantly, in realizing their intended impact at the final evaluation period. As the space for decent work was much narrower before the uprisings and political changes in Egypt and Tunisia, project scopes tended to be narrow and of short terms. It is in this context that "The Way Forward" faces uncertain impact at this mid-point. Therefore, it would be premature to deem the longer-term project objectives as unmet.

Due to the effectiveness of training and capacity building inputs, as noted above, the impact on individuals and institutions is palpable. CNFCE has crystallised its vision of what Tunisian women entrepreneurs want of their own institution, and the project has helped them build their sense of how to engage in UTICA on a more-equal basis, starting with a possible quota (reserved seat) system.

Egypt's FEI has developed an expressed openness to mainstreaming gender equity in its structures. This progress is manifest also through its establishment of a Women in Business Unit through the accompaniment of "The Way Forward" project.

UGTT's position on the quota option may predate the project, but the effort to build greater understand and eventual consensus within its nationwide leadership and the rank and file has been greatly impacted by project interventions, particularly local expert-led workshop.

That said, the future potential for programming calls for longer-term commitments that build on current strategies, as well as building on a stabilising environment. The impact of capacity building and support for coops in the tourism and agricultural sectors of southern Egypt is manifest through the many positive testimonies of participants. Their experience has been life altering. The challenge now and through project end is to ensure the sustainability of this progress, despite the precarious economic conditions, particularly in the tourism sector.

Women—and men—benefitting from "The Way Forward" project training in the Egyptian countryside have taken on new dimensions of existence. In more than one case, women project beneficiaries have decided to run for the future local elections in Egypt. This reflects new-found confidence and competence to raise other issues of substantive equality for women. Although local elections still appear to a low priority and a subject of the longer future, the seeds for potential impact have been sown.

Even without a training database or proper evaluation of ILO training for the subregion, anecdotal findings indicate that many training impacts have been profound. However, impact cannot be systematically evaluated.

ILO has appreciated the strategic value of changes to the project and the role of the PAC in its operation. However, the intended impact of building opportunities for tripartite dialogue in Egypt has not been realized, due to MoMM's non-cooperation with the labour unions.

The ProDoc projects that the Social Fund for Development in Egypt "will provide loans for women wanting to open a business after having received training through this project" and that "a similar arrangement will be negotiated with the Banque de Solidarité in Tunisia." This evaluation has not found information confirming the status of this expected outcome. ILO did conclude three relevant MoUs with the Social Fund; however, these agreements were for continued training to advance women's entrepreneurship.²⁹

The Egyptian independent trade unions' gender policy is still at an early stage. The determination of impacts should come with the project's final evaluation.

PROJECT SUSTAINABILITY

Sustainability ultimately will be determined by the commitment and efforts made by the government and greater ownership by the social partners, which is especially critical in the Egypt side of "The Way Forward." The prospect of sustainability may be undermined by the short-term duration of the project and limited capacity of the ILO to affect environmental conditions and government predisposition, particularly with regard to legislative progress, including treaty ratification processes, in Tunisia, as well as Egyptian government institutions' precarious relations with constituents. In large part, these external factors will determine the success or failure of efforts at follow-up and the consolidation of project results. In the case of project interventions in Tunisia, the likelihood is greater that the current momentum—especially aided by Social Dialogue and implementation of the Social Contract—will be conducive to sustainable project-related results.

The ambitious prospect of Tunisia's ratification and implementation of ILO Convention 183 may be ensured at some future date. However, that date likely will not fall within the project period, even with its recent time extension to July 2016. Therefore, this evaluation sees the clear need for continued efforts, either through a supplemental project programming to see this prospect through toward a sustainable outcome. That sustainability likely would be ensured through a strategic awareness-raising effort directed at employers, government, legislators and the general public to ensure sustainable achievement.

All interventions, namely the work with the UGTT and the UTICA in Tunisia and with CEFD and AWTaD in Egypt include strong sustainability elements. Promotion of institutional changes in favour of an increased women role is given a priority over other types of interventions. The palpable increase in awareness and morale among women—and men—participating in "The Way Forward" raises the stakes of project achievements so as not to dash fragile hopes with unsustainable outcomes.

The economic viability of the women's cooperatives in Egypt raises the heaviest concern in this evaluation. Albeit a mid-term assessment, the current perspective lacks sufficient data and indicators of the longer-term self-sufficiency and growth of these enterprises. Therefore, this evaluation concludes with a recommendation that future reporting on indicators, including 3.1, 3.2, 3.3 and 3.4 on enhanced awareness, job skills and entrepreneurship.

The most uncertain of project outcomes, therefore, is the one embodied in outcome indicator 3.5 (5 women entrepreneurship projects supported). The latest Interim Progress Report, dated February 2015, shows this outcome as “delayed.” Critical to a positive project outcome will be the progress on that indicator.

Without solid data to evaluate on this indicator, it is observed that some progress is reported. However, anecdotally, the above-cited verbal expression of FEI members’ interest in the women’s cooperatives as business partners is encouraging. The pursuit of greater coherence in linking these project partners may bring results within the remaining 12 months of the newly extended project period. Also encouraging in the reported arrangement between the Industrial Modernisation Centre (IMC) and Egypt’s nation-wide department store Omar Effendi in the marketing of artisanal carpets from the project’s cooperatives.

In facing the dilemmas over method for instituting gender equity, each partner institution in Tunisia and Egypt has fostered its own approach. Through “The Way Forward,” the ILO has exposed them to all potential options, imposing none. This stewardship approach has been not only instructive to decision makers, but it also ensures the ownership and, at once, potential replicability of the reforms across the region. This approach also nurtures trust between ILO and its constituent parts that projects future collaboration, including tripartism.

4. CONCLUSIONS

PROJECT RELEVANCE

The relevance of the project’s results framework to the development priorities of the governments of Egypt and Tunisia, and ILO, is high. The outcomes and products generally show great potential for their integration within the committed national efforts to achieve decent work for women.

The project innovations of engaging CSO partners (Egypt) and quantifying the implementation of labour rights (Tunisia) were relevant and thought provoking. The relevance of partnerships extended also to cooperation with local authorities in Egypt, which partners assisted in land access for cooperatives.

Alignment of “The Way Forward” with ILO’s global, North Africa and country-specific strategies is nearly seamless. However, the project objectives appear promising, but ambitious, given the pace and political context tempering project reform of institutionally bound policies and structures.

ILO’s tripartism and norm-based comparative advantages are highly relevant and suited to this project and its objectives. The ILO-norm focus is especially timely as related to project inputs in Tunisia, although less obviously in the Egypt dimension of the project. The norms most relevant to Tunisia are ILO Convention No. 183 and the fiscal details of its implementation. The most relevant normative issue in Egypt involves—but is not limited to—the freedom of association.³⁰

PROJECT COHERENCE

On its face, “The Way Forward” appears to have weak internal coherence, due to its seemingly divergent targets and approaches in the respective countries. Internally, however, the project actions and objectives are compactly interlaced, although they operate in two distinctly different contexts.



The Tunisia aspect of the project seeks to “upstream,” immediately policy-relevant objectives that include improving the roles of women within the statutory regulation and institutional functions of all tripartite partners. At the level of the Government of Tunisia (GoT), the project seeks to enable legislative reform that includes, but is not limited to, the state’s ratification of C183 and compliance with its increased maternity-leave provisions for women. Within the employers’ institutions, “The Way Forward” creates the conditions, including the indispensable knowledge base, for integrating women in the representative and decision-making bodies of UTICA and CNFCE. The UGTT is the subject of knowledge creation and capacity building to enable the adoption of a proposed quota system to ensure greater women’s participation in the structures serving workers’ interests.

This internal coherence, alignment and balance among project interventions in Tunisia are reflective also of the improved context for social dialogue. That indicates coherence also with the conditions both created and enhanced by the Social Contract (2013) that the ILO’s Social Dialogue project has supported. While “The Way Forward” in Tunisia involves important links to capacity building and skill building at the level of women workers by coordinating efforts with more downstream ILO projects in the country, the bulk of its efforts rest at the level of policy reform in the relevant government and social partner institutions.

It is difficult to draw clear lines between the Tunisia side of the project and all of the interventions in Egypt. The upstream results indicators in the Egypt operation remain, in large part, theoretical. This is due to two principal factors: (1) The socio-political environment differs from that in Tunisia in that the social dialogue is relatively less developed and (2) the greater emphasis targets women’s agricultural and handicraft cooperatives in remote governorates, where the benefits are less felt in the capital.

Rather, in the case of Egypt, the project is giving special attention to applying ILO assets that develop models of intervention that build skills and capacities in ways that eventually can be up-scaled and, thus, help address the implementation challenges at the policy level.

PROJECT EFFECTIVENESS

In the first year of implementing, the project underwent a consolidation, focusing on 11 key indicators at objective level. The PAC in Tunisia developed its oversight of project effectiveness. However, in Egypt, no PAC has been formed to guide “The Way Forward.” Nonetheless, in both countries, the project has been effective in building knowledge upon which to base upstreaming decisions, where there is political will to do so.

Project management innovated an effective choice, in Egypt, partnering with local NGOs and CBOs to deliver the downstream benefits of the project. Participants uniformly affirming the effectiveness of training and capacity building activities. Their ability to coordinate with local authorities and, later, the central Ministry of Agriculture and Land Reclamation, in Egypt, has been instrumental in accessing land for the agricultural cooperatives. The effectiveness of training in soft-skills for job-placement candidates cannot be evaluated with available data. However, life skills and technical capacity building and management of cooperatives are knowledge transfers that are effective by ILO staff and implementation partners with ILO tools.

Constituent trust of ILO personnel and knowledge products emerges as a positive factor in project effectiveness. This presents itself in project effectiveness at convening partners, including those who do not otherwise work together. Related to this, ILO’s nonpartisanship in presenting the gamut of women-advancement options in partner institutions also has built and maintained trust.

PROJECT EFFICIENCY



All staff members working in technical, programming, project management, administrative or support functions have shown tremendous energy, competence and selfless dedication to their jobs. They have earned a reputation as being extremely effective and committed employees and international public servants. Nonetheless, technical Specialists could be more involved in programming to ensure ILS, FPRW, norms are integrated across the project when conducting and reporting on project activities.

Initial project delays were compensated with accelerated implementation. Project spending kept pace with the budget. The upstream objectives in both Tunisia and Egypt will require longer effort than the current project allows. The time extension will help see some contributory outcomes through to completion.

PROJECT IMPACT

“The Way Forward” has shown impact in several important ways. The project is demonstrating the benefits of ILO assets in knowledge creation. This is particularly so through the project’s ground-breaking studies in Tunisia and Egypt, and the nonpartisan shepherding of constituents through a full range of options for integrating more women in social constituent institutions, including in effective decision-making roles.

The capacity building and training support to women’s cooperatives have shown both material and nonmaterial benefit for participant women and men. The project has enabled irreversible changes of mind and more effective and participatory social roles for women in targeted regions of Egypt. These impacts are not easily evaluable, particularly since the results framework does not include them.

The coming period will be critical in determining the impacts of many of the project interventions. The consequences of the recent studies remain to be seen, as also the exposure to institutional gendering options are subject to decision-making processes in partner institutions that have not yet run their course.

PROJECT SUSTAINABILITY

While the project time extension to July 2016 will help complete some contributory outcomes; the sustainability of achievements and momentum toward others remains a challenge to realise and to chart at this mid-term.

The project continues to prepare and position participants for success by developing Egyptian women-led cooperatives’ marketing acumen, having developed logos, further refining their products and marketing them at important trade exhibitions. These models need to find more partners and publics to ensure their viability, particularly through support from synergising with the other constituents (e.g., FEI, IMC, etc.). The self-sufficiency and profitability of the three new cooperatives are important factors to show by the project end, in order to assess sustainability.

A PAC both anchors and guides tripartite ownership of project outcomes. The gradual realisation of that role in the Tunisia dimension of the project still contrasts with the absence of a PAC for Egypt. The central GoE appears to benefit less than other tripartite constituents from opportunities to realise sustainable project outcomes, and the inability to form a PAC in Egypt is only one manifestation of that missed opportunity on the part of a major stakeholder.

With regard to outcome indicator 2.2 (improved legal environment for women's participation in labour markets) and 2.3 (improved employment policies reflect the challenges that women face in labour markets and increased number of women profiting from employment policies), little evidence emerges from Egypt to establish the project's policy-level outcomes toward closing the gender gap. A more-encouraging indication of cross-constituency cooperation so far is a verbal expression of interest in FEI to cooperate with the women's cooperatives. IMC also has arranged with Omar Effendi to market carpets produced in the Red Sea cooperatives.

5. RECOMMENDATIONS

1. LONGER PROGRAMMING PERIOD

Of high importance is the extension of the short implementation period of "The Way Forward." The upstream (policy- and legislative-level) outcomes eventually pursued are strategic and respond to opportunities in their environment. However, these long-term objectives are contrasted with the view, and particularly in the light of this mid-term evaluation, that all parties (donor, ILO, PAC) need a more-realistic project timeframe to realise them. Considering the good progress that the project has made, the likelihood of achieving the desired outcomes require a combination of (1) current project extension, (2) add-on or supplemental funding to ensure ambitious outcomes, including the needed public information and promotional efforts to secure ratification and implementation of C183 in Tunisia.

In addition, the visioning exercises that CNFCE has undertaken within this project, as well as the workshops and training events, have produced the elements of an institutional needs assessment and development plan, including the prospect of forming a Women's Entrepreneurship Academy within CNFCE. In Egypt, FEI's announced Women in Business Unit is likely to face the same needs and plans. Realizing them will require additional efforts and project support that ILO, CNFCE and the PAC should develop together.

2. MORE PUBLIC INFORMATION

Related to the challenges facing the ambitious objectives of improving the legal and policy framework and, in particular, implementing entitlements enshrined in an ILO Convention not yet ratified and reforming the statutes of employers and workers organisations, the public information aspect is vital. Both ILO and tripartite partners need to transmit messages through more media channels to (1) celebrate the tripartite cooperation achieved (e.g., in Tunisia); (2) demonstrate cross-sector solidarity by publicly acknowledging and appreciating the respective and parallel processes among workers, employers and—at least in Tunisia—central government institutions to enhance the participation and engagement of women in their decision making bodies and promote women's decent work, in general.

In general, project events, products and services to local societies and other accomplishments remain largely unacknowledged in the general public. This is despite the project's explicit objective 1.3 "Increased knowledge of women and the wider public on women's rights at work." Closer cooperation of ILO, tripartite constituents and implementing CSOs is still needed with media services, especially with UNIC, to get the message out about ILO's positive achievements. The intervention models, the positive socioeconomic outcomes (amid a deluge of dismal prospects otherwise reported in the transition period) and human-interest stories would appeal to several key publics at once, spreading impacts and making objective 1.3 more evaluable.

3. EVALUATE TRAINING ACTIVITIES



Quality assurance for training programs could improve with an integrated training database. ILO may benefit from the creation and maintenance of such a tool for North Africa (and Middle East) that would aid the tracking and evaluation of outcomes from this major investment of ILO programming. It also could help avoid duplication and assist in matching content to participants' needs and backgrounds.

The findings from training participant feedback suggest also that greater coordination is needed among service providers, including ILO, to avoid redundancy and more-strategically design and target training interventions. The design and creation of a sub-regional training database seems an ambitious undertaking. However, ILO may want also to consider the sub-regional ILO training experience as the possible subject of a future thematic evaluation.

4. **REFINE HUMAN RIGHTS METHODOLOGY AND MESSAGING**

The quantification of rights is a rich field and offers practicality to human rights implementation. The project's actuary study for extending and standardizing the maternity benefit in Tunisia promises to set many economy-minded sceptics at ease. However, relegating human rights and non-discrimination to a subject of negotiation over a financial sum may eviscerate the meaning of the "right." In order to avoid this conceptual misunderstanding for the provision of maternity benefits or any other rights may require both ILO and partners to provide a more-principled explanatory message to accompany presentation of the study's progress and findings. Applying and improving social-protection standards should be understood as a common tripartite national priority, and a state obligation. The actuary study should be a tool for determining *how* to implement a right, but not one for determining *whether* to implement it.

5. **NEED FOR SUSTAINABILITY DATA**

The specific objective 3.5: "five innovative women's enterprises supported" and immediate objective 4: "capacity building for the national agencies for statistics and other relevant stakeholders (e.g., employment observatories)" will need data to indicate the degree of their fulfilment by the end of the project. While these objectives are not as elusive as the grand policy and legislative advancements sought in specific objective 2.2: "Improved legal environment for women who participate in labour markets," they do form a challenge going into the final months of the project. For example, the three project-supported cooperatives represent 60% of the projected achievement and, while two additional enterprises would be preferable, the question of sustainability will arise in the final evaluation as well, challenging the project to demonstrate self-sustainability and/or profitability.

The project interventions so far promise to build capacity and inspire systems and practices to measure women's engagement in worker and employer institutions. The activities that would build the same capacity at the level of national agencies for statistics are not yet apparent in the project. By the end of the project, ILO and stakeholders (e.g., PAC) should be explicit as to how the lessons, tools and techniques used in the baseline studies and other knowledge products would benefit national agencies for statistics.

6. **CONSIDER FURTHER PROGRAMMING PROSPECTS**

ILO in the subregion and at headquarters should consider how future programming prospects could pursue the real and intended outcomes of "The Way Forward" and replicate them in line with the current ILO Strategy for North Africa:

- Continuation of "The Way Forward" as developed for an extended period and/or seek a new project that seeks to build and exchange the forward developments already in motion and

ensure greater sustainability by accompanying Tunisian constituents toward emulable legislative and institutional-policy outcomes; and

- ILO, donors and social constituents should consider the finding that the composition, criteria of membership and potential of the young entrepreneurs in employer institutions also remain uncharted or, at least, little known to project participants. The youth mechanism within UTICA, for example, along with its counterparts in FEI and the independent labour movement, could benefit from ILO support with a project analogous to “The Way Forward,” especially keeping in mind that “creating opportunities for youth,” along with women, forms one of the three pillars of the *ILO Strategy for North Africa, 2011–2015* and a continuing priority.

6. LESSONS LEARNED AND GOOD PRACTICES

1. PARTNERING WITH CIVIL SOCIETY

“The Way Forward” has shown the utility of engaging civil society organizations (NGOs and CSOs) as local partners, bringing added value and assets, as well as sustainability elements, unforeseen in the original project design. While this project has innovated the practice, grounded in ILO global experience, selectively chosen social entrepreneurial partners likely will enhance sustainability (local ownership and replicability) of project impacts. Therefore, this evaluation recognises the potential for further partnering with NGOs and CSOs as a consideration in future ILO programming in Egypt and Tunisia and, thus, recommends regularising the practice, where appropriate.

2. ENGAGING LOCAL AUTHORITIES

ILO should keep an eye out for further synergies with a wider range of tripartite actors, including those operating in cooperation with the local sphere of government. As treaty obligations apply equally to local governments and authorities as they do to central ministries, applying this legal theory presents an opportunity to more-explicitly engage local authorities and, where they exist, local governments in the implementation of ILS and norms. Local gains then would foster greater local ownership. Experience already has proved the relevance of such collaboration and institutional development to achieve successful LED. This project also has shown how the engagement of local authorities can enhance outcomes, including regularizing access to productive resources (e.g., land and water).

3. DISCOVERING DATA DEFICITS

Project partners had confidence that the studies of women-headed enterprises and of CNFCE constituents were relevant undertakings. However, in the actual conduct of the studies, they learned just how relevant they were. The research revealed the great extent to which both CNFCE and UTICA lack data on their own membership, especially in the regions (outside the capital).

This evaluator also discovered the general lack of data at the level of central government institutions on the subject of women enterprises, in addition to the void of information about many aspects of informal enterprises, including the extent of women-headed informal enterprises.

4. UNINTENDED OUTCOMES

Although some project indicators are not yet measurable or evaluable (e.g., 3.5 on supporting five women entrepreneurship projects), other outcomes not indicated in the logical framework are notable, including the increased sense of citizenship and belonging to the state some rural Red Sea women participants felt after obtaining their vital papers. Their “legal” status finally enables them and their children access to services such as education, and transcending also cognitive and creative inhibitors to experience personal autonomy.³¹ On this evaluation field verification visit, several men



also participating in the project in the Red Sea and Aswan spontaneously recounted to this evaluator how he had come to appreciate women's work through "The Way Forward."

6. ANNEXES

ANNEX I: Roadmap for Recovery and Decent Work in Egypt 2011

ANNEX II: Roadmap for Recovery and Decent Work for Tunisia 2011

ANNEX III: Egypt's Conventions in Force

ANNEX IV: Tunisia's Conventions in Force

ANNEX V: List of persons met and consulted

ANNEX VI: List of meetings conducted

ANNEX VII: Terms of reference for the mid-term evaluation

Annex I: Roadmap for Recovery and Decent Work in Egypt 2011

Priority area	Work area	Agreed objective	Type of ILO intervention/assistance	Responsibility	Timing	Ministry commitment	Comment
Social Dialogue and ILS	Independent Trade Unions	Strengthen capacity of independent trade unions Assistance in the creation of new trade unions	Series of workshops to build capacity	CAI/HQ	03/2011–10/2011		First workshop conducted 28–31 March 2011; ACTRAV secured \$65K (\$20K Cairo + \$45K HQ)
	Employers organisations	Strengthening employers organisations	Guidance and technical assistance	CAI/HQ	as of now	Minister offered to host such a workshop in the Ministry	ILO will appoint employers specialist for the Cairo Office
			Workshop to find out needs and to inform about different options on organizing employers	CAI/HQ	short-term		
	Reform of Trade Union Law	Draft proposal will be reviewed by the ILO	Assistance in the form of providing comments	HQ	as of now		Draft was handed to NORMS. DIALOGUE also offered to review the draft NORMES extended its support to any envisaged process of legislative reform
	Culture for Social Dialogue	Promotion of social dialogue among the social partners and beyond Development of a vision plan for social dialogue in Egypt	Technical assistance 2–3 day workshop	CAI/HQ	as of now short-term (6 weeks preparation needed)		This area is not sufficiently covered by the Social Dialogue project
	Promotion of conventions	Increased awareness of: Convention 122 Convention 181 Maritime Convention and other conventions upon interest of minister	Training workshops will take place on the different conventions	CAI/HQ	medium-term	Ministry will chose the conventions of highest interest	PAMODEC project could be extended to Egypt (Promotional project to apply principles and fundamental rights at work); At least Egypt could participate in some activities
Small and Medium Size Enterprises (SMEs) through entrepreneurial skills development, SME promotion and business services using	Entrepreneurial skills development; Promotion of SMEs as an option for people; Improving the legal environment for	Training of Trainers Provision of tools (training material, manuals, etc.) Adaption of training material to specific needs Translation of	CAI CAI CAI CAI	as of now and med-to long-term		Several ongoing projects of the ILO have SME components	



	local economic development approaches	SMEs; Business services for SMEs	training material into Arabic				
	Modern apprenticeship schemes and on the job training schemes	Informal apprenticeship schemes in several governorates Establishment of policies for modern apprenticeship systems	Technical assistance Implementation of project components Technical assistance and capacity building	CAI CAI CAI	as of now	Ministry will decide quickly on the 5 governorates in the child labour project where implementation will take place Ministry will provide legislative support	Strong component in child labour project and CIDA project
	Income Generating Activities	Generate income options for the parents of working children and other vulnerable groups	Implementation of project component of the Child Labour Project Technical assistance	CAI CAI	as of now & mid- to long-term		Strong component in Child Labour project
	Decent Work in Tourism Sector	Assess situation and opportunities Improve productivity of tourism sector through skills development Participation of the ILO in a Tourist Committee meeting	joined World Tourism Org./ILO mission Project proposal will be provided for discussion; ILO will look for possibilities to fund this project	HQ/CAI HQ/CAI CAI	short-term as of now April	Participation of the ILO upon invitation of the minister	Part of CIDA project Project proposal would be a joined ILO/WTO programme
Tourism	Skills Development in Agriculture	Improve skills in the agricultural sector (entrepreneurial skills, technical skills) Improved working conditions and acceptance of ILO standards in rural areas	Implementation of project component Declaration project for rural areas designed provide assistance in this area	CAI HQ	as of now Long-term		Part of CIDA project
Agriculture							

ANNEX II: Roadmap for Recovery and Decent Work for Tunisia 2011

Priority area	Work area	Agreed objective	Type of ILO intervention/assistance	Responsibility	Timing	Ministry commitment	Comment
Social protection	Establishment of a social protection floor	To extend a minimum level of social protection to all Tunisians	Technical assistance and advisory services	HQ, DWT Cairo	2012	Top priority for MAS	Consultations ongoing with HQ
		To extend coverage of existing social protection systems to the informal economy					
Standards	Ratification of selected conventions	Ratification by Tunisia of C 144, C 151, C 154, C 181 and C 183	Advisory services	DWT Cairo	Can start immediately	Request by UGTT and UTICA	UGTT does not agree with ratification of C 181 (employment agencies)
Social dialogue	Capacity building of constituents	Capacity building for social partners in social dialogue at the national, local, sectoral and firm levels, and in conflict resolution	Technical support Training and capacity building	DWT Cairo, HQ DWT Cairo, HQ, Turin	To start immediately Second half of 2011	Request by several ministries Request by social partners and government	ILO support mission to be programmed To be programmed in consultation with Sector IV units; RBSA resources available
Other Areas			Technical support	ROAF; DWT Cairo, ILO Algiers	Before the end of 2011	Strong request by MAS	Advanced draft exists and reviewed by QUAM; needs to be revised in light of the revolution
			Funding	ROAF, ILO Algiers	Before 31 August 2011	To be coordinated by the MAS in consultation with social partners	ROAF will provide resources; details to be discussed with MAS

ANNEX III: EGYPT'S ILO CONVENTIONS IN FORCE

Fundamental	
Convention	Date
C029 - Forced Labour Convention, 1930 (No. 29)	29 Nov 1955
C087 - Freedom of Association and Protection of the Right to Organise Convention, 1948 (No. 87)	06 Nov 1957
C098 - Right to Organise and Collective Bargaining Convention, 1949 (No. 98)	03 Jul 1954
C100 - Equal Remuneration Convention, 1951 (No. 100)	26 Jul 1960
C105 - Abolition of Forced Labour Convention, 1957 (No. 105)	23 Oct 1958
C111 - Discrimination (Employment and Occupation) Convention, 1958 (No. 111)	10 May 1960
C138 - Minimum Age Convention, 1973 (No. 138) <i>Minimum age specified: 15 years</i>	09 Jun 1999
C182 - Worst Forms of Child Labour Convention, 1999 (No. 182)	06 May 2002
Governance (Priority)	
Convention	Date
C081 - Labour Inspection Convention, 1947 (No. 81)	11 Oct 1956
C129 - Labour Inspection (Agriculture) Convention, 1969 (No. 129)	20 Jun 2003
C144 - Tripartite Consultation (International Labour Standards) Convention, 1976 (No. 144)	25 Mar 1982
Technical	
Convention	Date
C001 - Hours of Work (Industry) Convention, 1919 (No. 1)	10 May 1960
C002 - Unemployment Convention, 1919 (No. 2)	03 Jul 1954
C009 - Placing of Seamen Convention, 1920 (No. 9)	04 Aug 1982
C011 - Right of Association (Agriculture) Convention, 1921 (No. 11)	03 Jul 1954
C014 - Weekly Rest (Industry) Convention, 1921 (No. 14)	10 May 1960
C017 - Workmen's Compensation (Accidents) Convention, 1925 (No. 17)	10 May 1960
C018 - Workmen's Compensation (Occupational Diseases) Convention, 1925 (No. 18)	10 May 1960
C019 - Equality of Treatment (Accident Compensation) Convention, 1925 (No. 19)	29 Nov 1948
C022 - Seamen's Articles of Agreement Convention, 1926 (No. 22)	04 Aug 1982
C023 - Repatriation of Seamen Convention, 1926 (No. 23)	04 Aug 1982
C026 - Minimum Wage-Fixing Machinery Convention, 1928 (No. 26)	10 May 1960
C030 - Hours of Work (Commerce and Offices) Convention, 1930 (No. 30)	10 May 1960
C041 - Night Work (Women) Convention (Revised), 1934 (No. 41)	11 Jul 1947
C045 - Underground Work (Women) Convention, 1935 (No. 45)	11 Jul 1947



Convention	Date
C052 - Holidays with Pay Convention, 1936 (No. 52)	03 Jul 1954
C053 - Officers' Competency Certificates Convention, 1936 (No. 53)	20 May 1939
C055 - Shipowners' Liability (Sick and Injured Seamen) Convention, 1936 (No. 55)	04 Aug 1982
C056 - Sickness Insurance (Sea) Convention, 1936 (No. 56)	04 Aug 1982
C062 - Safety Provisions (Building) Convention, 1937 (No. 62)	25 Mar 1982
C063 - Convention concerning Statistics of Wages and Hours of Work, 1938 (No. 63) <i>Excluding Parts III and IV</i>	05 Oct 1940
C068 - Food and Catering (Ships' Crews) Convention, 1946 (No. 68)	10 Aug 1982
C069 - Certification of Ships' Cooks Convention, 1946 (No. 69)	04 Aug 1982
C071 - Seafarers' Pensions Convention, 1946 (No. 71)	04 Aug 1982
C073 - Medical Examination (Seafarers) Convention, 1946 (No. 73)	10 Aug 1982
C074 - Certification of Able Seamen Convention, 1946 (No. 74)	30 Mar 1967
C080 - Final Articles Revision Convention, 1946 (No. 80)	07 Jun 1949
C088 - Employment Service Convention, 1948 (No. 88)	03 Jul 1954
C089 - Night Work (Women) Convention (Revised), 1948 (No. 89)	26 Jul 1960
C092 - Accommodation of Crews Convention (Revised), 1949 (No. 92)	04 Aug 1982
C094 - Labour Clauses (Public Contracts) Convention, 1949 (No. 94)	26 Jul 1960
C095 - Protection of Wages Convention, 1949 (No. 95)	26 Jul 1960
C096 - Fee-Charging Employment Agencies Convention (Revised), 1949 (No. 96) <i>Has accepted the provisions of Part II</i>	26 Jul 1960
C101 - Holidays with Pay (Agriculture) Convention, 1952 (No. 101)	09 Apr 1956
C104 - Abolition of Penal Sanctions (Indigenous Workers) Convention, 1955 (No. 104)	18 Dec 1958
C106 - Weekly Rest (Commerce and Offices) Convention, 1957 (No. 106)	23 Oct 1958
C107 - Indigenous and Tribal Populations Convention, 1957 (No. 107)	14 Jan 1959
C115 - Radiation Protection Convention, 1960 (No. 115)	18 Mar 1964
C116 - Final Articles Revision Convention, 1961 (No. 116)	26 Mar 1962
C118 - Equality of Treatment (Social Security) Convention, 1962 (No. 118) <i>Has accepted Branches (a) to (h)</i>	12 Jan 1993
C131 - Minimum Wage Fixing Convention, 1970 (No. 131)	12 May 1976
C134 - Prevention of Accidents (Seafarers) Convention, 1970 (No. 134)	04 Aug 1982
C135 - Workers' Representatives Convention, 1971 (No. 135)	25 Mar 1982
C137 - Dock Work Convention, 1973 (No. 137)	04 Aug 1982
C139 - Occupational Cancer Convention, 1974 (No. 139)	25 Mar 1982
C142 - Human Resources Development Convention, 1975 (No. 142)	25 Mar 1982
C145 - Continuity of Employment (Seafarers) Convention, 1976 (No. 145)	17 Mar 1983



Convention	Date
C147 - Merchant Shipping (Minimum Standards) Convention, 1976 (No. 147)	17 Mar 1983
C148 - Working Environment (Air Pollution, Noise and Vibration) Convention, 1977 (No. 148)	04 May 1988
C149 - Nursing Personnel Convention, 1977 (No. 149)	03 Nov 1982
C150 - Labour Administration Convention, 1978 (No. 150)	05 Dec 1991
C152 - Occupational Safety and Health (Dock Work) Convention, 1979 (No. 152)	03 Aug 1988
C159 - Vocational Rehabilitation and Employment (Disabled Persons) Convention, 1983 (No. 159)	03 Aug 1988
C166 - Repatriation of Seafarers Convention (Revised), 1987 (No. 166)	28 May 2004

**ANNEX IV: Tunisia's ILO Conventions in Force**

Fundamental	
Convention	Date
C029 - Forced Labour Convention, 1930 (No. 29)	17 Dec 1962
C087 - Freedom of Association and Protection of the Right to Organise Convention, 1948 (No. 87)	18 Jun 1957
C098 - Right to Organise and Collective Bargaining Convention, 1949 (No. 98)	15 May 1957
C100 - Equal Remuneration Convention, 1951 (No. 100)	11 Oct 1968
C105 - Abolition of Forced Labour Convention, 1957 (No. 105)	12 Jan 1959
C111 - Discrimination (Employment and Occupation) Convention, 1958 (No. 111)	14 Sep 1959
C138 - Minimum Age Convention, 1973 (No. 138) <i>Minimum age specified: 16 years</i>	19 Oct 1995
C182 - Worst Forms of Child Labour Convention, 1999 (No. 182)	28 Feb 2000

**ANNEX V: List of Persons Met and Consulted**

Country and Organisation	Person and title
<u>Egypt:</u>	
ILO staff:	Badra Alawa, CTA-Cairo Luca Fedi, Senior Administrator Mohamed Trabelsi, Senior Workers' Activities Specialist Eric Oechslin, Senior Employers Specialist Nashwa Belal, Senior Programme Officer Christine Hofman, Skills Specialist Kholoud al-Khaldi, Senior Enterprise Development Specialist Enrica Bianca, consultant, Decent Work Team (DWT)
Social partners:	
Federation of Egyptian Industries (FEI)	Basma Osman
Donor	
Embassy of Finland (Egypt)	Ramses Malaty, Counsellor/Deputy Head of Mission
Partners/NGOs	Soheir al-Masry, Center for Egyptian Family Development (CEFD) Other CEFD staff Director, Association of Community Development, Nag`a al-Arab Nady Kamel, New Horizon Association for Social Development Mona Izzat, New Woman Foundation, researcher on women in labour movement (no reply)
<u>Tunisia:</u>	
ILO Staff:	Samia Chouba, NPC, Social Dialogue Nawel Tounsi, NPC, Women empowerment
Government of Tunisia:	
Ministry of Women and Family 's Affairs	Imène Houimel, General Director of Women Affairs
Ministry of Employment	Nizar Ataa
Social Partners	
UGTT:	Najoua Makhlouff Samir Cheffi Marwan Cherif
UTICA	
CNFCE:	Cyrine Ben Romdhane Ben Mlouka Leila Benkhira Jaber Raoudha Ben Saber Lemia Ben Khalifa Frini
Donor	
Embassy of Finland (Tunis)	Tanja Jaaskelainen, the Finnish Ambassador in Tunisia
Consultants	Ikbel Ben Moussa, researcher and trainer on UGTT statute reform Ouisseem Ghorbel, NuMu, consultant on women entrepreneur baseline study Karim Mejri, NuMu, consultant on women entrepreneur baseline study Moez Elj, NuMu, consultant on women entrepreneur baseline study Wahiba Ben Amer, researcher on CNFCE baseline study Ghazi Gherairi, expert in charge of the evaluation of the current regulatory and legal framework on women's economic and social rights

**ANNEX VI: List of Meetings Conducted****Mid-term Evaluation Mission
Tunis, 08–10/12/2014**

Monday 08 December 2014		
09h30	Meeting with the project team	<i>OIT office</i>
11h00	Meeting with NuMu representatives (M. Ouisseem Ghorbel, M. Karim Mejri and M. Moez Elj)	<i>Avenue de la Bourse -Lac 2</i>
14:00	Meeting with Ms. Najoua Makhoulouf and Samir Cheffi (UGTT)	<i>UGTT premises</i>
Tuesday 09 September 2014		
10 :00	Meeting with Ms. Ikbel Ben Moussa	<i>OIT office</i>
14h00	Ms. Imène Houimel, General Director of Women Affairs	<i>Av. Habib Bourguiba</i>
Wednesday 10 September 2014		
09h30	Working meeting with CNFCE representatives	<i>UTICA premises</i>
	Meeting with Ms. Wahiba Ben Amer.	<i>UTICA premises</i>
10h30		<i>UTICA premises</i>
11h30	Meeting with 3 businesswomen	<i>UTICA premises</i>

**Mid-term Evaluation Mission
Egypt Mission Agenda for 14–18 December**

Monday 15 December 2014		
09:30 – 10:30	Progress meeting with Luca Fedi, Senior Administrator	
10:30 – 11:30	Meeting with Mohamed Trabelsi, Senior Workers' Activities Specialist	
11:30 – 12:30	Meeting with Eric Oechslin, Senior Employers Specialist	
14:00-15:00	Meeting with the Federation of Egyptian Industries	
15:30-16:30	Meeting with Nashwa Belal, Senior Programme Officer	
Tuesday 18 December 2014		
10:00-11:00	Meeting with Christine Hofman, Skills Specialist	
11:00-12:00	Meeting with Kholoud Al Khaldi, Senior Enterprise Development Specialist	
Wednesday 17 December 2014		
08:00 – 09:25	Departure from Cairo to Marsa Alam (by plane)	
10:30 – 12:00	Focus group with the project beneficiaries	
13:00 – 14:00	Visiting training at Hamata village	
15:00 – 16:00	Visiting training at al-Kulaan village	
Thursday 18 December 2014		
06:30 – 10:00	Departure from Marsa Alam to Aswan (by road)	
10:30 – 11:00	Visit the Association of Community Development in Edfu	
13:00 – 14:00	Visit training at Daraw City, Aswan	
14:00 – 15:00	Visit the Association of Community Development in Daraw	

**Mid-term Evaluation Mission
Tunis, 20–23 January 2015**

Tuesday 20 January 2015		
Arrival at Carthage international Airport		
Wednesday 21 January 2015		
9h 30	Pick up from Tunisia Palace hotel	
	Meeting with the Tripartite Committee:	
10h00	Participants: Ms. Imen Houimel: DG women affairs at SEFF	
	Ms. Cyrine Ben Romdhane, our focal point at CNFCE	
	Ms. Najoua Makhoulouf, our focal point at UGTT	
	Representative of MAS	
	M. Nizar Ataa, from the Ministry of Employment	



12h30 Meeting with Mr. Ghazi Gherairi, expert in charge of the evaluation of the current regulatory and legal framework on women's economic and social rights. (Study in process to be finalized)

OIT offices

OIT Offices

Thursday 22 January 2015

11 :00 Meeting with Ms. Tanja Jaaskelainen, Finnish Ambassador in Tunisia

Finnish Embassy – Lac 2

13 :00 Meeting with the project team

OIT offices

Friday 23 January 2015

Mission end – Departure

ANNEX VII: Terms of Reference for the Mid-term Evaluation RAF/12/01/FIN

Title of projects being evaluated	The Way Forward After the Revolution - Decent Work for Women in Egypt and Tunisia
TC Code	RAF/12/01/FIN
Administrative Unit responsible for administrating the project	ILO Country Office in Cairo
Technical Unit(s) responsible for backstopping the project	DWT Cairo (Enterprise and skills specialists)
Type of evaluation	Mid-term independent evaluation
Donor	FINLAND

1. Background

An independent mid-term evaluation needs be conducted for the above project. The independent evaluation will be conducted by an external consultant, who will report to the evaluation manager appointed for this purpose at ILO Cairo and to the Regional evaluation office at the Regional Office in Addis Ababa.

The project under review has been approved for a budget of USD 3,109,453. It has started on 1 June 2012, and is due to run until 31 July 2015. The project aims at strengthening women's position to participate in the labour market in Tunisia and Egypt. To achieve this, a four-pronged intervention logic is envisaged: (i) Sensitizing social partners and a wider audience on gender issues and inequalities in the world of work (ii) Increasing the capacity of and institutional setting for females to equip them with necessary skills to engage in social dialogue and collective bargaining processes for advancing gender equality, non-discrimination, and increased female representation in trade unions (iii) Increasing women's skills to enhance their employability (iv) Capacity building for labour market institutions to better serve women and increase women's access to these institutions. The intervention logic is founded on the conviction that improving women's labour market position and increasing participation in decent work is a prerequisite for sustained equality, inclusion and democratization in Tunisia and Egypt.

The results framework¹ against which the achievements of this project will be evaluated is annexed. This project should be further appraised as part of ILO's wider programme in Egypt and North Africa. In Egypt in particular project EGY11/03/USA also targets women economic empowerment. In implementing its projects, ILO attempts to ensure coordination, synergies, exchanges of experience and information.

2. Evaluation Purpose and Scope

The evaluation is conducted as per ILO evaluation policy, with the following purpose:

- Look at the project as a whole, including issues of initial project design, implementation, lessons learned, replicability;
- Assessing to what extent the stated objectives and outputs have been achieved; and to provide an estimate of the progress made against these planned results (in %).
- Review the efficiency and effectiveness of the project implementation framework and management arrangements.
- Provide recommendations on the remaining period of implementation of the project, including revisions of scope, timeframes, implementation modalities, to ensure the achievement of objectives and their sustainability.

¹ Revised version of March 2014.



- Document lessons learned and good practices in order to maximize the experience gained.

Clients

This exercise is destined primarily to ILO management (the ILO DWT/CO Cairo, Regional Office for Africa) overseeing the implementation of the project, the key stakeholders involved, and the donor.

Scope

The evaluation will consider the entire project intervention as part of the ILO's wider programme in Egypt and North Africa. In preparing its inception report, the evaluator may determine whether a sample of localised interventions may be appropriate and sufficient for the evaluation of the project's local involvement.

3. Evaluation Criteria and Questions

The evaluation will be based on the following principles and concepts:

- **Development effectiveness:** The extent to which the development intervention's objectives and intended results are being achieved;
- **Resource Efficiency:** The extent with which resources are economically converted into results, considering potential alternative more cost-effective strategies;
- **Preliminary Impact:** Positive and negative, intended and unintended long-term effects;
- **Relevance:** The extent to which the intervention has met beneficiary requirements, has adapted to the local context as well as to global ILO and donors' policies;
- **Sustainability:** the likelihood of continued long-term positive effects of the project;
- **Partnerships:** The extent to which the project has built synergies with other relevant initiatives by national stakeholders, civil society, and development partners;
- **Lessons learned :** key positive and negative lessons learned through the implementation in view of the upscaling of the project or its replication in other contexts;
- **Good practice:** Specific intervention models that may be verified as constituting good practice for replication and upscaling, on account of their relevance, effectiveness and efficiency;
- **Policy change:** The extent to which the project promotes policy change, in terms of legislative and regulatory action and public resource allocation.

More specifically, the evaluation will answer the key questions below. The narrative will be structured around these specific questions and each question will be addressed.

Relevance and validity of design

- How relevant is the project's expected results to the development priorities of the Governments of Egypt and Tunisia, and ILO? How is it integrated within the overall national efforts to achieve decent work for women?



- Is the results framework of the project coherent? (i.e.; do outputs causally link to outcomes, which in turn contribute to the broader development objective of the project? Was the results framework realistic? Do the project's indicators and targets logically fit with the results chain?)
- Is there a need to consider a review of the project's scope and strategy (ie. revision of objectives and outputs?)

Project efficiency

- **Project management:** is the project making use of its resources in an efficient manner?
 - Has the project put in place adequate monitoring arrangements? Has there been timely troubleshooting? Has the project responded to shifting needs and priorities? If a need for a change to the scope and strategy of the project had arisen, has this been formally completed? Was this gender-sensitive?
 - How adequate can be considered the project staffing (sufficient, under/over staffed)?
 - Has the project designed and kept up to date a comprehensive workplan? Has the project *allocated* its resources against the realisation of its different outputs? Has it kept track of its financial expenditures? Has the project adequately completed financial revision requirements?
 - How well has the project communicated with its target final beneficiaries, direct beneficiaries and intermediaries, government and social partner stakeholders, and the general public?
- **Technical quality assurance and support:** Each project benefits from the technical backstopping of ILO international experts, within the ILO Cairo team, at HQs, or at the ITC in Turin:
 - Has there been evidence of efficient collaboration between the project and the backstopping specialists assigned to it?
 - Is there complementarity between the project and other ILO projects/interventions in the two countries?
 - Have ILO global and regional resources (manuals, technical guidelines etc) been adequately made use of?
 - Has the project contributed to knowledge development at regional or global among the ILO or beyond?
 - How do key project stakeholders/partners at senior level rate the quality of the key CB and technical assistance provided?
- **Administration and finance :**
 - Has the project suffered from significant delays in executing administrative procedures (issuing individual or company contracts, procuring goods etc.)? Where has been the bottleneck?
- **Partnerships** with other public or development partners' relevant initiatives: Is there evidence of sufficient coordination? Joint programming? Joint activities?

Project effectiveness against planned outputs

- To what extent the project outputs have so far been achieved (a percentage of achievement should be provided) against the indicators and targets? Provide an analysis on the reasons for achievement or failure;
- Has the project produced results that were not initially foreseen in the project document but contributed to attain its immediate objectives?



- How should the project reallocate or adjust activities in order to achieve immediate objectives?

Impact and sustainability

- What have been the main outcome-level results achieved so far by the project against the set indicators and targets?
- Are there expected results for which there is no sufficient evidence of achievement?
- What have been unintended positive and negative effects of the project?
- How effective has the project been in promoting local ownership? How likely are the results achieved to be sustained?

Lessons learned and good practices

- What good practices and lessons learned can be evidenced so far with a view to future project upgrading or replication?

4. Evaluation Methodology

The evaluation questions will be answered by the evaluator through a desk review of the project documentation (project document, work plans and documented deliverables), direct bilateral meetings with key stakeholders and participatory focus group sessions. The evaluation will take place mostly in Cairo, with a 1 week visit to Tunis. The evaluation will comprise the following key steps:

Step 1: Desk review of all relevant documents and preparation of inception report (also see below) for clearance by the evaluation manager.

Step 2: On-site interviews with stakeholders, meetings and focus group discussions with project staff, project beneficiaries, social partners and other key stakeholders. This will include a 5 days site visit to Tunis.

Step 3: A debriefing meeting will be led by the evaluator to present and discuss the preliminary findings and conclusions of the evaluation with the project team and ILO Cairo management. This will allow to address factual errors, clarify ambiguities or issues of misunderstanding or misinterpretation, and any gaps with respect to the present TORs.

Step 4: The evaluation first draft will be submitted to the evaluation manager, who will share this with key stakeholders, ILO management and the project team. Comments received will be provided to the evaluator for consideration, no later than 2 weeks after reception of the first draft. The evaluator will present clearly (with a comments log or using track-changes mode on MS Word) how the comments have been addressed in the revised draft. The final draft will be approved by the evaluation manager in consultation with ILO Eval at Regional Office.

Key stakeholders and sources of information:

ILO

ILO Project Staff based in Cairo
Enterprise and Skills Specialists;
Project managers of other relevant projects
ILO Director and Programme staff in Cairo

Ministry of Manpower and Migration, Egypt
Ministry of Women and Family Affairs, Tunisia

Social Partners:

Independent trade unions, Egypt
Federation of Egyptian Industrialists, Egypt
General Labour Union (UGTT), Tunisia

Government:



National Chamber of Women Entrepreneurs
(CNFCE), Tunisia
Tunisia Union of Industry, Trade and Handicrafts
(UTICA), Tunisia

Others:
NGOs (implementing partners)

5. Main deliverables

The expected deliverables are:

- (a) An inception report, including work plan and evaluation methodology;
- (b) A draft evaluation report structured as follows:

1. Executive Summary
2. Methodology, Purpose, Scope and the Clients of the Evaluation
3. Key findings (structured on the basis of the evaluation questions)
4. Conclusions and recommendations for project replication
5. Annexes
 - o List of persons met and consulted
 - o List of meetings conducted
- (c) The final evaluation report
- (d) The evaluation summary fact sheet : this will consist of 2 pages and include for wide dissemination a summary of the key results achieved by the projects as verified by the evaluation; key technical products developed by the project and good practices identified.

6. Management arrangements

Under the overall responsibility of the ILO CO/Cairo Director, the evaluator will report directly to the evaluation manager appointed for this evaluation. The project team will provide administrative and logistical support as required and including: transportation, facilitation of contacts and organisation of workshops.

7. Time frame and payment

It is expected that the work will be carried out over a period of 6 weeks, according to the below timetable. Comments on the evaluator’s reports will be provided no later than 3 full working days following their submission to the evaluation manager.

Time Flow Chart

	2014						2015		
	October		November		December		January		
Recruiting									
Selecting consultant		x	x						
Signing Contract			x	x					
Inception									
Documentation submitted to evaluator				x					
Desk review and initial discussions with eval. manager and project team				x	x				
Submission and review of inception report					x	x			
Evaluation work									
Interviews, field visits etc.						x	x		
Initial findings submitted and revised,							x		



administrating the project	
Technical Unit(s) responsible for backstopping the project	
Type of evaluation (e.g. independent, internal)	
Timing of evaluation (e.g. mid-term, final)	

Background**Purpose, Scope, Clients****Evaluation Analytical Framework** (questions and related methodological approach)**Main Deliverables and Workplan****ANNEXES****11. Evaluation Report Outline**

Cover Page**Executive Summary** (2/3 pages)**Background****Evaluation Analytical Framework, Purpose, Scope, Clients** (questions and related methodological approach)**Implementation of the Evaluation** (process, work undertaken)**Findings** (answers to the evaluation questions)**Recommendations and Conclusions** (implications of the findings: usually, a list of key recommendations supported by a paragraph summarising their rationale)**Lessons Learned and Good Practices****Project Fact Sheet** (2/3 pages; short summary of the evaluation methodology; 1 page summary of the key results achieved by the project as verified by the evaluation; key technical products developed by the project; good practices).**Annexes**

ENDNOTES

- ¹ Nilüfer Çağatay “Gender and poverty” (New York: UNDP Social development and Poverty Elimination Branch, 1998), at: <http://www.undp.org/poverty/publications/wkpaper/wp5/wp5-nilufer.PDF>.
- ² United Nations Educational, Scientific, and Cultural Organization (UNESCO) Institute for Statistics, cited in World Bank, “Ratio of female to male tertiary enrollment (%),” at: <http://data.worldbank.org/indicator/SE.ENR.TERT.FM.ZS/countries>.
- ³ These include varying proportions of female enrollments by subject, with girls constituting 72% of students enrolled in arts and humanities, 70% of experimental science students, and 63.5% of management and economics students. Girls form 43% of computer enrollees and 26.7% of other technical subjects. Ministry of Education, *Statistiques de l'éducation et de la formation : Année scolaire 2008–2009* (Tunis : Ministry of Education, 2010).
- ⁴ OECD, *Women in Business 2014 Accelerating Entrepreneurship in the Middle East and North Africa Region* (Paris: OECD Publishing, 2014), p. 39, at: <https://books.google.com.eg/books?id=mKLiBAAAQBAJ&printsec=copyright#v=onepage&q&f=false>.
- ⁵ World Economic Forum, Table 3b: “Detailed rankings, 2013,” *Global Gender Gap Index* (Cologny/Geneva: World Economic Forum, 2013), p. 12, at: http://www3.weforum.org/docs/WEF_GenderGap_Report_2013.pdf#page=20.
- ⁶ Philippe Trape, Mickaëlle Chauvin and Hatem Salah, “Tunisia 2014,” in *African Economic Outlook 2014: North Africa* (Tunis: African Development bank Group, OECD and UNDP, 2014), p. 91, at: http://www.africaneconomicoutlook.org/fileadmin/uploads/aeo/2014/PDF/Regional_Editions/North_Africa_EN_web.pdf.
- ⁷ UNDP and Arab Fund for Economic and Social Development, *The Arab Human Development Report 2005: Towards the Rise of Women in the Arab World* (New York: UNDP and Regional Bureau for Arab States, 2005), pp. iii, iv, viii, 10, 13, 18, 23–24, 50, 52, 72, 75, 125, 133, 139, 143–61 (cultural aspects), 163–78 (social aspects), 179–200 (legal aspects), 8, 92 (support services), at: <http://www.arab-hdr.org/publications/other/ahdr/ahdr2005e.pdf>; Anthony O’Sullivan, Marie-Estelle Rey and Jorge Galvez Medez, “Opportunities and Challenges in the MENA Region (Paris: OECD, undated), p. 5, at: <http://www.oecd.org/mena/49036903.pdf>.
- ⁸ Fatma El-Hamidi and Mona Said, “Have Economic Reforms Paid Off? Gender Occupational Inequality in the New Millennium in Egypt,” A research study presented at the annual ECES conference, Cairo, June 2007.
- ⁹ Gada Barsoum, Mohamed Ramadan and Mona Mustafa, *Labour market transitions of young women and men in Egypt* (Geneva: ILO, June 2014), pp. 1–2, 29, at: http://www.ilo.org/wcmsp5/groups/public/---dgreports/---dcomm/documents/publication/wcms_247596.pdf.
- ¹⁰ Christophe Nordman, “Diffusion du capital humain et effets d’entreprise: Approche par frontière de gains dur données appariées marocaines et tunisiennes,” *Revue Économique*, Vol. 53, No. 3 (2002), pp. 647–58; Nordman, “Discrimination salariale, capital humain et structure des tâches selon le genre: l’apport de données liées employeur-employés au Maroc et en Tunisie,” in M. Maruani, D. Meulders and C. Sofer, eds., *Marché du travail et genre dans les pays Maghreb: spécificités, points communs et synergies avec l’Europe* (Brussels: Éditions du DULBEA, 2004).
- ¹¹ Fatma El-Hamidi, “Trade Liberalization, Gender Segmentation, and Wage Discrimination: Evidence from Egypt,” Working Paper 414 (Cairo: Economic Research Forum, June 2008), at: http://www.erf.org.eg/CMS/uploads/pdf/1244651357_414.pdf.
- ¹² Nariman Youssef, “Egypt’s Draft Constitution Translated,” *Egypt Independent* (02 December 2012), at: <http://www.egyptindependent.com/news/egypt-s-draft-constitution-translated>.
- ¹³ Rana Muhammad Taha, “Draft Law for Minimum and Maximum Wage,” *Daily News* (04 February 2013), at: <http://www.dailynewsegypt.com/2013/02/04/draft-law-for-minimum-and-maximum-wages/>.
- ¹⁴ “The Government’s Program for Economic Development and Social Justice during the Transitional Period,” copy on file.
- ¹⁵ Procès-verbal at the signing of CCA-UNDAF, 20 December 2012, p. 3, citing “Tunisia: 2010 Article IV Consultation Staff Report, Public Information Report on the Executive Board Discussion and statement of the Executive Director for Tunisia (IMF, September 2010).”
- ¹⁶ Foundation for the Future, “Study on Civil Society Organisations in Tunisia” (January 2013), p. 7, at: <http://foundationforfuture.org/en/Portals/0/Publications/Etude%20SC%20english%20Version%20Finale.pdf>.
- ¹⁷ Carmel Delshad, “Unwanted: NGOs in Post-Revolution Egypt,” *World Policy blog* (1 November 2011), at: <http://www.worldpolicy.org/blog/2011/11/01/unwanted-ngos-post-revolution-egypt>; International Center for Not-for-profit Law, “NGO Monitor: Egypt,” updated 12 December 2012, at: <http://www1.umn.edu/humanrts/research/Egypt/NGOs%20Monitor.pdf>; Chalaine Chang, “Egypt, swallowing civil society,” *openDemocracy* (19 August 2014), at: <https://www.opendemocracy.net/arab-awakening/chalaine-chang/egypt-swallowing-civil-society>.
- ¹⁸ (i) Sensitizing social partners and a wider audience on gender issues and inequalities in the world of work (ii) Increasing the capacity of and institutional setting for females to equip them with necessary skills to engage in social dialogue and collective bargaining processes for advancing gender equality, non-discrimination, and increased female representation in trade unions (iii) Increasing women’s skills to enhance their employability (iv) Capacity building for labour market institutions to better serve women and increase women’s access to these institutions.

-
- ¹⁹ FIDH, “Tunisie: les réserves à la CEDAW enfin enlevées,” 29 April 2014, at: <https://www.fidh.org/International-Federation-for-Human-Rights/north-africa-middle-east/tunisia/15372-tunisia-cedaw-reservations-officially-withdrawn>.
- ²⁰ At least since its 23 January 1976 ratification of the International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights and its 3 March 1976 ratification of the International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights.
- ²¹ The workshop covered the following themes: The international system of women economic and social rights; protection of women rights at the workplace in the Tunisian legislation; social protection for women in the legislation; gender equality in the draft of the constitution; gender aspects of the labour market; ILO best practices in the promotion of equal pay; women in the informal sector; concepts and principles of the Social and Solidarity Economy (SSE) and selected good practices from Tunisia, Morocco and Brazil. Particular emphasis was put on cooperatives as an SSE model that can respond to the economic and social challenges facing Tunisian women, especially in rural areas and in the informal economy.
- ²² With the related purpose of “Generating income for women using local palm tree resources and contributing to the reduction of environmental hazards resulting from palm tree waste burning.”
- ²³ Constitution of the Republic of Tunisia, Article 46.
- ²⁴ “Femmes au sein de l’UGTT : Abassi plaide pour le régime des quotas,” *GobalNet* (5 May 2015), at: <http://gnet.hb-cm.tn/actualites-nationales/tunisie/-femmes-au-sein-de-lugtt-abassi-plaide-pour-le-regime-des-quotas/id-menu-958.html>.
- ²⁵ RAF/12/01/FIN, 1 June 2012–31 July 2015. The project’s official start date (June 2012) was pushed back, awaiting the recruitment of the CTA (January 2013).
- ²⁶ See contracting AWTaD, above.
- ²⁷ “Independent Evaluation of the ILO’s Decent work Country Programme Strategies and Activities 2010–2013” (Geneva: ILO-EVAL, 2014), at: http://www.ilo.org/global/docs/WCMS_314439/lang--en/index.htm.
- ²⁸ Namely: “1. Each specialist facilitating meetings on a quarterly basis, with the projects that they backstop/ that have components under their responsibility; and 2. Overall ILO/Cairo TC meetings with all project managers and specialists every six months to consider synergies, cross-sectoral collaboration, common challenges and solutions.” See “General Procedures,” in “ILO Cairo Retreat Follow-Up Report,” February 2014.
- ²⁹ Mohamed Hamdy, “ILO signs 3 MoUs to support Egyptian Women and Entrepreneurs,” *Amwal al-Ghad* (28 March 2015), at: <http://www.amwalalghad.com/en/business/financial-institutions/34343-international-labour-sfd-spread-entrepreneurship-culture-by-three-mous.html>.
- ³⁰ ILO Convention No. 87 obliges the state party to enable independent labour unions.
- ³¹ The essence of human need, corollary to dignity as the essence of human rights. See Len Doyal and Ian Gough, *A Theory of Human Need* (London: Palgrave Macmillan, 1991).

ILO Emerging Good Practice Template

Project Title: “The Way Forward” after the Revolution - Decent Work for Women in Egypt and Tunisia

Project TC/SYMBOL: RAF/12/01/FIN

Name of Evaluator: Joseph Schechla

Date: 30 June 2015

The following lesson learned has been identified during the course of the evaluation. Further text explaining the lesson may be included in the full evaluation report.

LL Element	Text
<p>Brief summary of the good practice (link to project goal or specific deliverable, background, purpose, etc.)</p>	<p>“The Way Forward” has shown the utility of engaging civil society organizations (NGOs and CSOs) under implementation agreements, bringing added value and assets, as well as sustainability elements, unforeseen in the original project design. The dual objective of (1) raising awareness of rights at work and (2) building technical skills and enterprise-management capacity largely has been met at mid-term by partnering with local CSOs applying ILO tools and local knowledge.</p>
<p>Relevant conditions and Context: limitations or advice on applicability and replicability</p>	<p>Promoting women’s entrepreneurship, greater participation in employer and worker associations from the policy level was less possible in Egypt than in Tunisia under this regional capacity-building and knowledge-generating project. That necessitated asymmetry in project management that nonetheless produced compatible and mutually reinforcing results.</p>
<p>Establish a clear cause-effect relationship</p>	<p>Operationalizing tripartism (e.g., with a Social Contract) in one transitional country coincided with institutional self-questioning within tripartite institutions. Project objectives are upstream. A lesser degree of tripartism and mutual distrust left some governmental institutions out of the line of project benefit. Therefore, the project in that second transitional country focused more on vastly needed skills, especially in neglected areas.</p>
<p>Indicate measurable impact and targeted beneficiaries</p>	<p>A training effectiveness assessment would produce Kirkpatrick’s four measurable levels of training evaluation.</p>
<p>Potential for replication and by whom</p>	<p>While this project has innovated the practice in North Africa, grounded in ILO global experience, selectively chosen CSO partners likely would enhance sustainability (local ownership and replicability) of project impacts. Partnering with NGOs and CSOs is a consideration in ILO programming, especially where “upstream” outcomes are foreclosed.</p>

<p>Upward links to higher ILO Goals (DWCPs, Country Programme Outcomes or ILO's Strategic Programme Framework)</p>	<p>P&B Outcomes 1, 2, 3, 9, 10, 11, 12, 14, 17, and 18, as well as ILO Egypt CPOs, including EGY100, EGY103, EGY105 and EGY106; Area of critical importance (ACI) 5: "Promoting decent work in the rural economy."</p>
<p>Other documents or relevant comments</p>	

ILO Lesson Learned Template

Project Title: "The Way Forward" after the Revolution - Decent Work for Women in Egypt and Tunisia

Project TC/SYMBOL: RAF / 12 / 01 / FIN

Name of Evaluator: Joseph Schechla

Date: 30 June 2015

The following lesson learned has been identified during the course of the evaluation. Further text explaining the lesson may be included in the full evaluation report.

LL Element	Text
<p>Brief description of lesson learned (link to specific action or task)</p>	<p>Project partners had confidence that the studies of women-headed enterprises and of CNFCE constituents were relevant undertakings. However, in the actual conduct of the studies, they learned just how they were relevant beyond their expectations. The research revealed the great extent to which both CNFCE and UTICA lack data on their own membership, especially in the regions (outside the capital), and the data deficit at the national level, concerning women's entrepreneurship, in general, and informal entrepreneurship, in particular.</p>
<p>Context and any related preconditions</p>	<p>Research study on women entrepreneurs within UTICA and CNFCE</p>

Targeted users / Beneficiaries	CNFCE and UTICA leadership and constituents
Challenges /negative lessons - Causal factors	Extracting data from records was not sufficient. Telephone interviews with regional offices were required. Maintaining records and statistics remains a challenge without internal databases, procedures and protocols, and dedicated staff.
Success / Positive Issues - Causal factors	The study demonstrated how vital these data are to inform decision making.
ILO Administrative Issues (staff, resources, design, implementation)	

ILO Emerging Good Practice Template

**Project Title: "The Way Forward" after the Revolution
- Decent Work for Women in Egypt and Tunisia**

Project TC/SYMBOL: RAF/12/01/FIN

Name of Evaluator: Joseph Schechla

Date: 30 June 2015

The following emerging good practice has been identified during the course of the evaluation. Further text can be found in the full evaluation report.

GP Element	Text
Brief summary of the good practice (link to project goal or specific deliverable, background, purpose, etc.)	An aspect of project relevance was the important engagement with local authorities in Egypt. The development of cooperatives, local industries, accessing land and infrastructure for job creation often require the cooperation of local authorities, where they exist.
Relevant conditions and Context: limitations or advice in terms of applicability and replicability	Aswan Governorate
Establish a clear cause-effect relationship	Local authorities have aided women's cooperatives in accessing land for agricultural production
Indicate measurable impact and targeted beneficiaries	Women are working and producing aromatic herbs on land with official recognition of their tenure status
Potential for replication and by whom	ILO and local authorities, including local government, where it exists.
Upward links to higher ILO Goals (DWCPs, Country Programme Outcomes or ILO's Strategic Programme Framework)	Area of critical importance (ACI) 5: "Promoting decent work in the rural economy"
Other documents or relevant comments	See recommendation in "Independent evaluation of the ILO's Decent Work Country Programme Strategies and Activities in North-Africa: 2010-2013," p. 67.

ILO Emerging Good Practice Template

Project Title: “The Way Forward” after the Revolution - Decent Work for Women in Egypt and Tunisia

Project TC/SYMBOL: RAF/12/01/FIN

Name of Evaluator: Joseph Schechla

Date: 30 June 2015

The following lesson learned has been identified during the course of the evaluation. Further text explaining the lesson may be included in the full evaluation report.

LL Element	Text
Brief summary of the good practice (link to project goal or specific deliverable, background, purpose, etc.)	Some project outcomes not indicated in the logical framework are notable, including the increased sense of citizenship and belonging to the state some rural and women participants from Red Sea and Aswan governorates felt after obtaining their vital papers.
Relevant conditions and Context: limitations or advice in terms of applicability and replicability	Lack of official status or capabilities to access public services has led to rural women’s isolation, illiteracy and general vulnerability, preventing their children access to public schools, etc.
Establish a clear cause-effect relationship	Their “legal” status finally enables them and their children access to services such as education, and transcending also cognitive and creative inhibitors to experience personal autonomy.
Indicate measurable impact and targeted beneficiaries	Testimonies of women participants in cooperatives under the project. Several men participating in the project in the Red Sea and Aswan spontaneously recounted to this evaluator how he had come to appreciate women’s work through “The Way Forward.”
Potential for replication and by whom	Other ILO projects in rural areas where lack of official recognition renders them effectively stateless

<p>Upward links to higher ILO Goals (DWCPs, Country Programme Outcomes or ILO's Strategic Programme Framework)</p>	<p>P&B Outcomes 1, 2, 3, 9, 10, 11, 12, 14, 17, and 18, as well as ILO Egypt CPOs, including EGY100, EGY103, EGY105 and EGY106</p> <p>Area of critical importance (ACI) 5: "Promoting decent work in the rural economy"</p>
<p>Other documents or relevant comments</p>	