



ILO - EVALUATION

- o **Project Title :** Developing tripartite institutions and mechanisms that advocate for and promote the realization of core labour rights in Colombia
- o **TC/SYMBOL:** COL/13/02/USA
- o **Type of evaluation:** Final independent
- o **Countries:** Colombia
- o **Evaluation Date:** August-October 2014
- o **Consultant's Name:** Teodoro Sanz
- o **Evaluation Management:** Patricia Villegas
- o **Administrative Office (ILO):** ILO Office for the Andean Countries
- o **Technical Office (ILO):** GOVERNANCE and TRIPARTISM
- o **End of project:** September 2015
- o **Donor:** State Department of the United States of America (USD\$495,00.00)
- o **Key words:** Social dialogue, vulnerable groups
- o **Evaluation Budget:** USD \$ 9,500.00

This evaluation has been made following the policy and procedures of ILO. This report has not been edited.

Table of contents

1. Cover	1
2. Table of contents and lists	2
3. List of abbreviations	4
4. Executive summary	6
4.1. Background and context	6
4.1.1. Project objective, logic and structure	6
4.1.2. Current project status	6
4.1.3. Purpose, scope and clients of the evaluation	6
4.1.4. Evaluation methodology	7
4.2. Main findings and conclusions	7
4.3. Lessons learned, best practices and recommendations.	13
5. Evaluation	17
5.1. Project Background	17
5.2. Evaluation background	18
5.3. Methodology	19
5.4. Main findings	20
5.4.1. Relevance	20
5.4.2. Validity of the Project design	24
5.4.3. Effectiveness	31
5.4.4. Efficiency	45
5.4.5. Management effectiveness	47
5.4.6. Impact orientation	50
5.4.7. Sustainability orientation	53
6. Conclusions	57
6.1. Conclusions	57
6.2. Lessons learned	62
6.3. Best practices	63
6.4. Recommendations	63

3. List of acronyms and abbreviations

ANDI -	National Business Association of Colombia
CB -	Collective Bargaining
CGT -	General Confederation of Workers
CLAF -	Afro-Colombian Labor Council
CPCPSL -	Standing Negotiation Committee on Wage and Labor Policies
CPO -	Country Programme Outcome
CTC -	Colombian Workers' Confederation
CUT -	Central Union of Workers
DANE -	National Statistics Department
DW -	Decent Work
ENS -	National Unions' School
FA -	Freedom of Association
FENALCO -	National Merchants' Federation
FRW -	Fundamental Rights at Work
GDP -	Gross Domestic Product
ILO -	International Labour Organization
LA&C -	Latin America and the Caribbean
MoL -	Ministry of Labor
ORMET -	Regional Labor Market Observatories
PRODOC -	Project Document
Project -	The Project "Developing tripartite institutions and mechanisms that advocate for and promote the realization of core labour rights in Colombia"
SD -	Social Dialogue
SDO/OPS -	Service Delivery Orders/ <i>Órdenes de Prestación de Servicios</i>
TS -	Technical Secretariat
UDSOL -	United States Department of Labor
USDOS -	United States Department of State

4. Executive summary.

4.1. Background and context.

4.1.1. Project objective, logic and structure.

The project “Development of tripartite and mechanisms that advocate for and promote the realization of core labor rights in Colombia” aims to strengthen the capacity of tripartite dialogue institutions to promote the implementation of fundamental rights at work with particular emphasis on women, young people and Afro-Colombians and to promote sound labor relations and the right to collective bargaining at sectoral and enterprise level. Thus, the project aims to develop social dialogue institutions and mechanisms that promote and advocate for compliance with the fundamental rights at work in Colombia.

The Project has four areas of action, the first three are linked to Immediate Objective 1 and the fourth is linked to Immediate Objective 2:

- Generation of knowledge about the labor market situation of these groups and the barriers they face in exercising their fundamental rights at work.
- Training aimed at the CPCPSL, the Departmental Subcommittees of Valle del Cauca (Cali) and Bolivar (Cartagena), and women, young people and Afro-Colombians members of social organizations and the CLAF, to promote the realization of core labor rights with particular emphasis on women, young people and Afro-Colombians.
- Technical assistance for the design and adoption of action plans that will address the rights and employment needs of these groups and their integration into the development plans for 2015-2019 of the departments of Bolívar and Valle del Cauca.
- Training aimed at of employers’ and workers’ organizations on the exercise of the rights to collective bargaining and freedom of association.

4.1.2. Current project status.

The project started on August 30, 2013, and ended on September 30, 2015, and its budget was \$ 495,000. In this regard, as agreed with the donor, an independent final evaluation is warranted.

4.1.3. Purpose, scope and clients of the evaluation.

The evaluation seeks to determine, systematically and objectively, the project’s achievements and whether its targets were met according to the approved design, and identify what worked, what not and why, in order to improve the design of future initiatives.

The evaluation covers the entire duration of the project (August 2013 - September 2015). The geographical scope of the evaluation is national, in view of the various places targeted by the project interventions.

The external clients of this evaluation are USDOS, the Ministry of Labor of Colombia, the trade union confederations (CGT, CTC, CUT), ANDI, the CPCPSL, 2 Departmental Subcommittees (Valle del Cauca and Bolivar), the CLAF and the Center for Solidarity. And the internal clients are the Project Team, the Regional Office for Latin America and the Caribbean, and the relevant HQ backstopping units: GOVERNANCE AND TRIPARTISM, ACTRAV, ACTEMP, PARDEV and EVAL.

4.1.4 Evaluation methodology.

To carry out the evaluation, mainly primary sources were used as well as secondary sources. Secondary sources mainly include the Project Document, reports on the project's physical and budgetary execution, the final outputs of the project, action plans and minutes of meetings of Subcommittees, the action plans of CLAF and the list of participants to the workshops and training programs. Also, in order to analyze design criteria, independent evaluations of similar projects to those the ILO has implemented (or has underway) in Colombia have been reviewed. And to analyze relevance and impact criteria, statistical information about Colombia was reviewed (basically from the Ministry of Labor and the DANE).

On the other hand, primary sources consisted of in-depth interviews with different stakeholders involved in Project implementation: officials of the ILO Office for Andean Countries; the Team in charge of project implementation; representatives of beneficiary organizations such as the Ministry of Labor, trade unions, ANDI, the Subcommittees and the CLAF, and representatives of other ILO projects promoting fundamental rights at work and social dialogue in Colombia.

4.2. Main findings and conclusions.

Relevance

1. The socio-economic and labor market indicators in Colombia in 2012 reveal a more critical situation for women, young people and Afro-Colombians (relative to men, adults and the mestizo population respectively), justify the existence of the Project, whose development goal is to promote the implementation of fundamental rights at work with particular attention precisely on women, young people and Afro-Colombians.
2. The Project's immediate objective to strengthen the technical and management capacities of tripartite social dialogue institutions, such as the Subcommittees, is justified because previous assessments of other

ILO projects in Colombia show that effective tripartite dialogue at the local level is necessary to improve the working conditions of the target population; and because in 2012 the Subcommittees exhibited weaknesses such as insufficient capacity of its members for dialogue and negotiation, lack of technical, financial and technological resources, and lack of commitment from the mayor's and governor's offices.

3. The relevance, legality and legitimacy of the Project are also underpinned by the fact that the Project's objectives, outputs and activities are framed within policies, plans and measures that the Colombian government, both nationally and locally, has adopted in recent years on the matter of social dialogue, decent work and fundamental rights at work; as well as within the strategy to strengthen social dialogue for the implementation of fundamental rights at work that the ILO has been implemented in Colombia since 2008.

Validity of the Project design

4. The Project design has adequate top-down logic because its activities are necessary for obtaining the outputs, which in turn are necessary for achieving the immediate objectives; also, within each objective, there is consistency between the products that comprise it.
5. However, the project also has limitations in its design, namely the lack of clarity regarding the complementarity between the two immediate objectives, and how one objective can benefit from progress in the other. Furthermore, the magnitude, effects and possibilities of occurrence of each of the identified risk factors were not properly dimensioned: the political and social situation in Colombia in 2014 and 2015, which in practice hindered tripartite dialogue and inclusion of Project concerns on the agenda of the CPCPSL and prevented the attainment of precisely the output linked to the CPCPSL.
6. Project design provided for indicators and targets for all of its activities, outputs and objectives, but these indicators do not always adequately reflect that which is intended to get done or to be generated. At the activities level, some indicators are more closely linked to the outcomes of the activities and, therefore, function rather as output indicators; while at the outputs and objectives level the source of information on the values of indicators for improved knowledge and skills is very subjective (perception surveys administered to participants of training programs), which limits the reliability and validity of results.

Efficiency

7. Project effectiveness is reflected in the fact that the majority of outputs and activities outlined in the logical framework have been completed for both the first and the second specific objectives, and in some cases the planned targets have even been surpassed.
8. The main activities in achieving the project outputs and objectives were the forums on decent work and public policy, the workshops on collective bargaining aimed at unionists, and the training programs on fundamental rights at work aimed at members of the Subcommittees, representatives of employers' and workers' organizations and the Ministry of Labor, women, youth and Afro-Colombians. The total number of beneficiaries of these forums, programs and workshops clearly exceeded the planned target.
9. Also important in achieving the outputs and objectives was the technical assistance provided for the Subcommittees to prepare its action plans to promote fundamental rights at work and address the employment needs of women, young people and Afro-Colombians; as well as the events with candidates for governor and mayor; the inclusion of the CLAF in all workshops and activities in order to disseminate its objectives and activities; and the technical assistance provided for the CLAF to prepare its action plans. In all these activities the targets set in the design were achieved.
10. However, the planned were not achieved for two outputs: under the first specific objective, the work that had been scheduled to be carried out with the CPCPSL to reach tripartite agreements on legal proposals and policies aimed at women, young people and Afro-Colombians regarding fundamental rights at work was not carried; while under the second specific objective, the number of enterprises that participated in the awareness and information workshops on labor rights and conflict prevention and resolution mechanisms, was well below the planned target.

Efficiency

11. The project shows a high level of financial performance (96% of the allocated budget), which, added to the high level of efficiency, shows that the project has been efficient in the use of resources, as it met all the physical targets within the overall resources available.
12. The distribution of the budget executed by type of spending is consistent with the results of the technical implementation of the Project. Expenditures on workshops, trainings, forums, courses and seminars represent approximately 60% of the budget execution, which is consistent with having achieved and even exceeded the targets under such activities. On the other hand, project staff costs represent 20% of

the budget executed, which is consistent with a full-time coordinator being hired in March 2015.

Management effectiveness

13. The project has been developed under the direction of the ILO Office for the Andean Countries located in Peru. Until February 2015, as the project did not have a national coordinator, it was the Labour Law and Labor Administration Specialist from said Office who in practice exercised the functions of coordinator. His technical contributions to the planning and development of Project outputs and activities was recognized by constituent representatives interviewed.
14. However, the lack of a national coordinator in Colombia during 2014 helps explain why the end of the Project's original term several activities were still pending completion. This absence of a coordinator also prevented a more fluid contact with constituents as well as the possibility of more frequent meetings to follow up on the progress and constraints of the Project.
15. Workers' and employers' organizations and State authorities have been beneficiaries of the training activities of the Project, and have been actively involved in the design of some of these activities, especially those related to the second objective. Also, the similarities with other projects implemented by the ILO in Colombia in terms of thematic platform, stakeholders and activities undertaken has allowed the Project to take advantage of strategies, tools and staff employed in these other projects.
16. However, coordination with constituents and other ILO projects could have been closer and, therefore, it was not possible to fully tap all synergies. A factor in this was the lack of a national coordinator in Colombia, and the fact that the Tripartite High Level Committee (which was going to have an important role in generating these synergies among the various projects) has hardly met during the Project implementation period.

Impact orientation

17. Actions conducted between 2013 and 2015 to generate and disseminate knowledge and provide training and technical assistance to the Subcommittees, as well as activities with the candidates for governor and mayor have contributed to improve the performance of the Subcommittees of Bolívar and Valle del Cauca. This is reflected in increased participation within the Subcommittees of mayor's office and governor's office officials with decision-making power; the greater importance given to building the decent work policy with an emphasis on

the populations targeted by the Project; and the improved capacities of the members of the Subcommittees.

18. These actions carried out by the project have also contributed to these Subcommittees placing the Project's concerns on the social agenda, and advancing advocacy for public policies at the local level. The Subcommittees have contributed to efforts to draft ordinances (Valle del Cauca, 2015, approved by the government) and district-wide agreements (Cartagena, 2014, approved by the city council) through which local public policies on decent work have been adopted, which expressly call for addressing the needs of women, young people and Afro-Colombians within the scope of their jurisdiction.
19. Actions to garner more visibility for the CLAF, and provide more technical assistance to prepare its action plans have contributed to strengthening the CLAF. This is reflected in its position before the Ministry of Labor, the governor's office, the mayor's office, the ANDI, and the unions, as an institution that seeks to reduce racial discrimination in the workplace. Also, since 2015, the CLAF is part of the Subcommittees of Valle del Cauca and Bolivar, having been involved in preparing the draft public policy ordinance on decent work in Valle del Cauca. Moreover, the CLAF already has in place a national action plan and several departmental plans.
20. The evaluation considers that these three outcomes (strengthening the Subcommittees, public policy advocacy, and strengthening the CLAF) can be attributed largely to the Project's intervention, as no other projects are known to have given priority to working with the Subcommittees of Valle del Cauca and Bolívar and the CLAF.
21. Training activities targeting workers' and employers' organizations regarding the exercise of the rights to freedom of association and collective bargaining, as well as strategies for conflict prevention and resolution, have helped both sides to understand better the current national regulations and to consider collective bargaining as a comprehensive win-win strategy. Unlike in the three previous outcomes, training activities and technical assistance provided by other ILO projects have also contributed to this outcome.

Sustainability orientation

22. In terms of the sustainability of the Subcommittees, it is positive thing that the Ministry of Labour has included in next year's budget the necessary resources to hire a technical secretary. However, no

information is available on whether this applies to all Subcommittees and whether these technical secretaries are going to engage in this role exclusively or primarily.

23. Other critical elements to the sustainability of the Subcommittees include having significant trade union presence, monitoring and implementing action plans, disseminating their results to society, exercising their role in prevention, conflict mediation and resolution, and having the necessary financing. According to the interviews, the current view on these elements of the Subcommittee of Valle del Cauca is more favorable than that of Bolivar.
24. In relation to the Subcommittees' capacity for advocacy for local public policies on decent work, progress sustainability will depend on whether the contents of the district draft agreements (Cartagena) and of the draft ordinance (Valle del Cauca) are reflected in the departmental development plans 2016 - 2019, and on whether policies and plans for promoting employment, decent work and income generation for the most vulnerable populations are generated based on these documents.
25. Greater political will of the government on the issue of social dialogue, the creation and operation of Subcommittees, public budget allocations for decent work policies and agreements, collective bargaining agreements in the public sector, and the reduction in violence against union leaders are factors in the sustainability of Project interventions in Colombia. It is also a positive thing that Colombia's National Development Plan 2014-2018 has embodied in two articles the issue of decent work, strengthening social dialogue and compliance with fundamental rights at work. This gives legitimacy to potential actions in these areas.
26. However, there are contextual factors limiting the sustainability of Project interventions, such as the use of negotiation modalities that weaken trade unions, (such as collective agreements), the breach of labor laws in Colombia, impunity in cases of violence against trade union leaders, and delays in resolving labor disputes.

4.3. **Lessons learned, best practices and recommendations.**

Lessons learned

1. Surveys of satisfaction with the quality and usefulness of training workshops or programs are useful for adjusting some aspects of the methodology and/or the subject matter for future workshops or programs, but not for measuring results (gains in skills or knowledge), for which

other type of instruments would be required, such as pre- and post-knowledge tests.

2. Generating lasting trust between employers' and workers' organizations, requires not only the good will and disposition of both sides to promote decent work and compliance with fundamental rights at work, but mainly concrete results, such as investing financial resources to undertake actions in the different thematic areas in which progress is being made; ensuring employers' compliance with the law and reducing the use of figures limiting compliance with fundamental rights at work and protection of labor relations; and greater coherence between the discourse and the actual activities of trade unions.
3. The role of the Subcommittees' Technical Secretariat and more specifically that of the individual in charge of this Technical Secretariat is very important for proper functioning of the Subcommittees. A capable, renowned professional who has credibility before the constituents that can devote himself/herself exclusively (or at least primarily) to the said function may be key to make the Subcommittee a dynamic and efficient forum capable of generating outcomes and results.
4. Estimating the duration of a project should take into account whether there will be significant electoral processes during implementation, as the priority given by constituents to the project in the months before and after the election will be reduced and therefore fewer activities will get done during that timeframe.
5. Failure to incorporate a gender perspective from the design stage of a project, including, inter alia, setting gender disaggregated targets for some activity and outcome indicators, may be a factor in the reduced participation of women in workshops, programs, forums and other training events.

Best practices.

1. Project's focus on promoting the exercise of the fundamental rights at work among a specific population consisting of women, young people and Afro-Colombians. It is a best practice because if what is sought is to strengthen the capacity of institutions for social dialogue (in this case the capacities of the Subcommittees) it is essential that technical assistance aim at enhancing tripartite dialogue on a specific thematic platform.
2. Project's provision of technical assistance to the Subcommittees to develop action plans promoting labor market inclusion of women, young people and Afro-Colombians as well as participating in events with the

candidates for governor and mayor. It is a good practice as these actions and events complement each other to give priority to the issue of decent work on the candidates' agenda and strengthen the Subcommittees' capacity for advocacy for public policies at the local level.

3. The Project's choosing the Subcommittees of Valle del Cauca and Bolívar based not only on the high proportion of Afro-Colombian population but also on the increased institutional presence of workers' and employers' organizations, as well as the higher level of development compared to other Subcommittees. It is a good practice because institutional capacity is strengthened when the social partner institutions have a certain high level of development.
4. The Project's promoting participation in workshops and training programs of those involved in leadership positions in employers' and workers' organizations (president, director, coordinator, manager, head of unit). It is a good practice because the involvement of these people in training programs enhances political decision-making, by replicating the learnings in their organizations.

Recommendations

Recommendations regarding the project under evaluation.

1. Systematize and document the lessons learned from those outputs that involve strategies or methodologies that can be replicated on a larger scale, such as training programs; and socialize the main results and outcomes of the Project among constituents, businesses, civil society and cooperation institutions in order to give priority to these issues on the national and regional agendas and increase the chances of obtaining new financing.
2. Manage political support to obtain the Assembly's approval of the draft public policy ordinance on decent work of Valle del Cauca and, if approved, to provide technical support to promote adoption of the ordinance by the 42 municipalities of the department. Also, provide technical assistance to promote the new authorities' adoption of the public ordinance and the district agreement in the development plans of Valle del Cauca and Bolívar, respectively.

Recommendations regarding future similar projects.

3. In working with the subcommittees, prioritize these issues in order to address weaknesses identified with most of the subcommittees: ensure that the Subcommittees have an active Technical Secretariat headed by a professional devoted exclusively (or at least primarily) to the discharge of this function; ensure that the Subcommittees exercise their role of

conflict prevention and resolution, extend their reach to the municipal and not just the departmental level; ensure that the ORMETs provide technical support to the Subcommittees.

4. In working with the CLAF, prioritize the following issues in order to address constraints within the departmental CLAFs: access to financing so that the CLAFs can carry out the activities set out in their action plans; build the technical capacities of their members to develop projects; and generate greater coordination with the unions in order to better position themselves before the constituents and society.
5. In the training programs aimed to the constituents, prioritize the following topics: international rights and national labor standards, and labor dispute prevention. Also, give priority to training in decent work aimed at public officials from the governor's and mayor's offices, the development of industrial action plans, and project design, implementation and monitoring; and, in working with the unions, give priority to strategies to attract younger members and close the gender gaps in unions.
6. Establish linkages to existing programs and employment integration projects aimed at youth, women and Afro-Colombians. A new intervention could strengthen the design of these programs and projects, giving them visibility, and enhance their implementation with complementary services for greater coverage and impact on the vulnerable population.
7. Depending on the budget available, a new project could expand the geographical scope of interventions to new departments or cities, provided the choice is justified following the same technical criteria used by the Project in choosing Valle del Cauca and Bolivar. Priority could be given to interventions targeting those sectors where there is greater breach of the fundamental rights at work, such as in textiles, transport and health care in Bogotá); street vending, taxi service and hotels in Cartagena); and commerce, public security, and sugar cane production in Cali. Victims of violence and armed conflict could also be included among the beneficiaries.
8. Reactivate the High Level Tripartite Committee as a forum for discussion and analysis on the progress of projects that form part of the strategy to strengthen social dialogue for promotion of the fundamental rights at work, and for effective use of synergies among these projects.
9. Include in the Project design activities to assist and follow up the train-the-trainer strategy to reinforce the positive outcomes generated

(knowledge, skills, motivation) and to have evidence of replication by the trainers.

10. Generate a single database of beneficiaries of the training for the various projects in order to identify whether a person has already received a similar training from another project and thus avoid the risk of training and education actions being repetitive and/or involving a duplication of efforts.
11. The number of public policies generated by the Subcommittees, the number of enterprises applying collective bargaining techniques promoted by the project, the number of enterprises implementing conflict prevention strategies, the level of compliance with collective bargaining agreements and the quality thereof, could be used as indicators for the project's objectives(referring not only to wages, but also to productivity, health and safety, training). Regardless of the indicators used, the criteria or conditions of compliance and the "baseline" values should be clearly specified.
12. Incorporate targets disaggregated by gender in the logical framework (for training activities, for example) and progress reports. This contributes to highlighting clearly to the implementation team and the constituents the importance of the gender approach for a project, and can lead to a greater participation of women in training programs.
13. Identify the risk factors (intervention assumptions) involved in the project and, above all, estimate their chances of occurrence, magnitude and possible effects on the performance of project activities and/or achievement of outputs and targets.

5. Evaluation

5.1. Project Background.

1. The project "Developing tripartite institutions and mechanisms that advocate for and promote the realization of core labour rights in Colombia" (the Project) is part of a strategy to strengthen forums for social dialogue at national and local levels to promote the realization of fundamental rights at work in Colombia, that the ILO Office for the Andean Countries has been implementing since 2008. The project has been designed seeking to generate synergies with other projects implemented and/or underway in the context of this strategy.
2. The two immediate objectives of the project are: (a) strengthen the capacity of tripartite dialogue institutions to promote the realization of fundamental rights at work with a particular emphasis on women, young people and Afro-Colombians, and (b) promote sound labor relations and

the right to collective bargaining at sectoral and enterprise level. Thus, the project aims to develop social dialogue institutions and mechanisms that promote and advocate for compliance with the fundamental rights at work in Colombia.

3. The Project has four areas of action, the first three are linked to Immediate Objective 1 and the fourth is linked to Immediate Objective 2:
 - Generation of knowledge about the labor market situation of these groups and the barriers they face in exercising their fundamental rights at work.
 - Training aimed at the CPCPSL, the Departmental Subcommittees of Valle del Cauca (Cali) and Bolívar (Cartagena), and women, young people and Afro-Colombians members of social organizations and the Afro-Colombian Labor Council (CLAF), in order to promote the realization of core labor rights with particular emphasis on women, young people and Afro-Colombians.
 - Technical assistance for the design and adoption of action plans that will address the rights and employment needs of these groups and their integration into the development plans for 2015-2019 of the departments of Bolívar and Valle del Cauca.
 - Training aimed at of employers' and workers' organizations on the exercise of the rights to collective bargaining and freedom of association.
4. These lines of work are reflected in the 6 outcomes and 16 activities included in the project logframe design, and are the basis for assessing project coherence and effectiveness.

5.2. Evaluation background.

5. The project started on August 30, 2013, and ended on September 30, 2015, and its budget was \$ 495,000. In this regard, as agreed with the donor, an independent final evaluation is warranted.¹
6. The evaluation seeks to determine the project's achievements and whether its targets were met according to the approved design, and identify what worked, what not and why, in order to improve the design of future initiatives. The specific objectives of the evaluation are:
 - Determine the relevance of the development objective, immediate objectives, outputs and activities under the Project's logical framework.
 - Assess the consistency of the project development strategy and methodology and determine the effectiveness of the indicators set out in the Logical Framework to measure the set targets.

¹ The Terms of Reference for the evaluation are attached as Annex 1.

- Measure compliance with the project targets, evaluating to what an extent the expected results were achieved for each of the Project's objectives.
 - Analyze and assess the efficiency and effectiveness of the Project's management approach.
 - Assess Project outcomes/impacts and the sustainability of Project results.
 - Identify good practices and lessons learned from the intervention that may be useful to the donor, the Colombian Government and the ILO in order to design future interventions.
7. The evaluation covers the entire duration of the project (August 2013 - September 2015) and therefore analyzes all activities and outputs delivered in the departments of Bolívar and Valle del Cauca, which were the Project's areas of intervention. The clients of this evaluation are:
- External clients: the Ministry of Labour of Colombia, trade unions (the General Labor Confederation –CGT–, the Colombian Workers' Confederation –CTC–, and Central Union of Workers –CUT), the Employers' Association (ANDI), the CPCPSL, 2 Subcommittees (Valle del Cauca and Bolivar), the CLAF, the Center for Solidarity and the United States Department of State (USDOS).
 - Internal clients: Project Team, Regional Office for Latin America and the Caribbean, and the relevant HQ backstopping units: GOVERNANCE AND TRIPARTISM, ACTRAV, ACTEMP, PARDEV and EVAL.

5.3. Methodology.

8. To carry out the evaluation, mainly primary sources were used as well as secondary sources. Secondary sources mainly include the Project Document (PRODOC), reports on the project's physical and budgetary execution, the final outputs of the project, action plans and minutes of meetings of Subcommittees, the action plans of CLAF and the list of participants to the workshops and training programs. Also, in order to analyze design criteria, independent evaluations of similar projects to those the ILO has implemented (or has underway) in Colombia have been reviewed. And to analyze relevance and impact criteria, statistical information about Colombia was reviewed (basically from the Ministry of Labor and the National Statistics Department –DANE). Annex 2 shows a detailed list of secondary sources reviewed.
9. On the other hand, primary sources consisted of in-depth interviews with different stakeholders involved in Project implementation: officials of the ILO Office for Andean Countries; the Team in charge of project implementation; representatives of beneficiary organizations such as the Ministry of Labor, trade unions, ANDI, the Subcommittees and the CLAF,

and representatives of other ILO projects promoting fundamental rights at work and social dialogue in Colombia. These interviews were conducted in September 2015, mainly at the Project's areas of intervention (Bolívar and Valle del Cauca).² The list of people interviewed was defined by the team responsible for project implementation and evaluation.

10. **An interview guide has been prepared for each respondent; the guide contains questions related to the overall project implementation and/or its various objectives, outputs and activities.** With some interviewees we spoke about all of the Project's objectives, outputs and activities; and with others we spoke only about some, depending on their individual levels of involvement. Some questions were asked of a variety respondents, in order to gaining a broader view of the situation, not biased by the appreciations of a single individual or institution. Annex 3 presents the content of the basic interview guide. Annex 4 contains a list of all interviewees.

5.4. Main findings

5.4.1. Relevance

11. The project is being executed in Colombia in a context of economic growth (according to the DANE, during the period 2010 - 2014 the GDP has increased at an average annual rate of 4.8%) but insufficient jobs, poor working conditions, and constraints on the exercise of freedom of association, collective bargaining and other fundamental rights at work.
12. In 2012 the unemployment rate in Colombia was 10.4%, higher than the average rate in Latin America and the Caribbean of 6.1%.³ In that same year the percentage of non-agricultural informal employment in Colombia was 56%, eight percentage points higher than the Latin America and the Caribbean average; while more than 40% of workers in Colombia earned less than the minimum wage.
13. The employment situation is more critical among vulnerable groups such as women and young people (higher unemployment, higher percentage of informal employment and of workers earning less than the minimum wage). In fact, Colombia has one of the highest rates of youth unemployment in Latin America and the Caribbean, and the same is true for women's unemployment.

² However, the interviews with officials from the ILO Office for Andean Countries and the team in charge of project implementation were conducted in Lima and Bogotá.

³ ILO figures based on the countries' household surveys.

Table 1: Unemployment rate and indicators of informality and wages in Colombia, by sex and age, 2012.

	By sex		By age	
	Men	Women	Age 15-24	25 and older
Unemployment rate	7.9%	13.8%	20.5%	7.9%
% Informal non-agricultural employment	52.0%	60.7%	65.2%	54.1%
% Employed persons who earn less than the minimum wage	54.0%	57.2%	55.2%	42.2%

Compiled using the ILO report, "Decent Work and Youth – Latin America," 2013.

14. According to Ministry of Labor figures,⁴ other indicators revealing the more critical employment situation of women and young people are:

- In 2012, 59% of the population in employment was male and 41% female; also, 19% were under 25 and 81% over 25.
- In 2012, men earned on average 204,000 pesos more⁵ and worked 9 hours more.
- In 2012, 25% of young people between 18 and 28 were not working, nor seeking work, nor attending school.

15. The project also includes Afro-Colombians as beneficiaries of its intervention. According to the 2005 Population and Housing Census 2005 in Colombia, 11% of the population -recognizes itself as Afro descendants.⁶ And according to the report "Race and Human Rights in Colombia" prepared by the Observatory on Racial Discrimination of the University of Los Andes in 2009, there is marked exclusion and marginalization of this population compared to the mestizo population, reflected in worrying socioeconomic indicators:

- The percentage of the population living in poverty is 61% for Afro-Colombians and 54% for the mestizo population.
- The percentage of the population living in destitution is 24% for Afro-Colombians and 19% for the mestizo population.
- The income of an Afro Colombian worker is, on average, almost 30% less than that of a mestizo worker
- The percentage of workers in precarious employment is 54% for Afro-Colombians and 40% for mestizos.

⁴ Figures from the Labour Information Source of Colombia (FILCO) of the Ministry of Labor.

⁵ This figure (about \$ 115 at the exchange rate in effect in 2012) represents approximately one third of the minimum wage in 2012.

⁶ However, various organizations of Afro-Colombians agree that, being based on ethnic self-identification, this figure underestimates the true proportion of Afro-Colombians in the country, which should be around 25%.

16. Regarding the exercise of the rights of collective bargaining and freedom of association, the country presents low rates of unionization and poor collective bargaining mechanisms. Although there are no official statistics, estimates of the National Unions' School (ENS) show that at the start of this decade less than 5% of workers in Colombia benefited from collective bargaining and even in cases where they did, the agreements were often short-lived (1-2 years) and any common ground was only related to wages.
17. The CPCPSL and the Departmental Subcommittees were established in 1996 to promote good industrial relations and contribute to the resolution of collective labor disputes. In practice, the CPCPSL has reached agreements (basically on minimum wages) only in some years. As for the Subcommittees, according to the "Diagnostic Survey of the State of Subcommittees in Colombia" prepared by the ILO, their main weaknesses in 2012 were: insufficient capacity to carry engage in successful tripartite dialogue and to use negotiation as a means to reach agreement on concrete actions; as well as the lack of technical, financial and technological resources, lack of commitment of mayors and governors, and weak coordination with the CPCPSL to generate a stronger impact.
18. The above-mentioned situation (both of the target population and of the tripartite social dialogue institutions) justifies the Project's objective to build the technical and management capacities of these tripartite institutions so that they will be better prepared to promote the realization of the fundamental rights at work, with special emphasis on women, young people and Afro-Colombians. This objective is also justified considering that previous evaluations of other ILO projects in Colombia have shown that effective tripartite dialogue at national and local level, based on trust and cooperation between the social partners, is needed to improve the working conditions of the target population.

Consistency with national policies and sectoral and departmental plans in Colombia.

19. The project is part of national policies and measures the Colombian government has adopted in recent years on the matters of social dialogue, fundamental rights at work and decent work. The most important policy instrument of this kind include the Political Constitution of Colombia, in force since 1991; decent work policies grounded in Laws 278 of 1996 and 411 of 1997; the Tripartite Agreement on Freedom of Association and Democracy in Colombia, signed in 2006; the Colombia-U.S. Labor Action Plan, signed in 2011;

the Colombia National Development Plan 2010 – 2014; and Decree 4108 creating the Ministry of Labor, signed in 2011.⁷

20. Colombia also has in place national-level policies and plans on labor issues geared to the needs of women and young people.⁸ As regards women, there is a Plan for Equality in Employment, and as regards young people there are youth employment policies in place.^{fn} However, to date, the Plan for Equality in Employment has not been implemented, and the impact of the youth employment policies is yet to be evaluated.⁹

21. Some of the policies, plans and/or measures mentioned above, notably the Colombia National Development Plan 2010 - 2014, have been the basis for building the Local Development Plans 2012 - 2015, including policies, programs, agreements and ordinances in the departments of Valle del Cauca and Bolivar (the Project's areas of intervention) and, hence, these plans are also part of the regulatory and political context within which the project is being developed.¹⁰

22. *The policy instruments at national and local level identified above provide evidence of the relevance of the projects thematic platform and give a framework of legality and legitimacy to the intervention.*

Consistency with the strategic objectives and results of the ILO and USDOS.

23. The Project's development objective to strengthen the capacity of social dialogue institutions and mechanisms to promote the realization of fundamental rights at work, among which are freedom of association and collective bargaining, is in line with the ILO Declaration of 1998 and the ILO fundamental conventions 87 and 98 and the technical conventions 151 and 154, all ratified by Colombia.¹¹

24. The project's expected results are associated to the third strategic objective of the ILO Program and Budget for ILO 2012 - 2013 (Social

⁷ The links of each of these policies and measures with Project's objectives are explained briefly in Annex 5.

⁸ There are no explicit policies or plans aimed at the Afro-Colombian population as there are for women and young people. Only Law 70 of 1993 provides mechanisms for the protection of the cultural identity and rights of black communities in Colombia and promotion of their economic and social development

⁹ Act 1429 ("First Employment Act") of 2010, the National Youth Policy of 2005, and the Statutory Law 1622 on Citizenship of 2013 are the main policy documents that are part of this policy on youth employment.

¹⁰ Annex 6 lists the plans, policies, programs, resolutions and ordinances of Valle del Cauca and Bolivar that are relevant to the Project's thematic focus.

¹¹ Fundamental Convention 087 on Freedom of Association and Protection of the Right to Organize; Fundamental Convention on the Right to Organize and Collective Bargaining; Technical Convention 151 on Labor Relations (Public Service); Technical Convention 154 on Collective Bargaining.

Dialogue), and specifically result No.12: “Tripartism and strengthened labour market governance contribute to effective social dialogue and sound industrial relations.”¹² They are also linked to the Country Program Outcome (CPO) of Colombia, specifically result COL 503 (“Social dialogue institutions at local, national and regional level will have been strengthened”).

25. An additional reason for the relevance of a project is when it is part of and/or is complemented by other projects or programs of similar thematic content that the ILO has developed in the country. In this sense, the project is designed and is being developed within the framework of the strategy to strengthen social dialogue at national and local levels to promote the realization of fundamental rights at work that the ILO Office for the Andean Countries has been implementing in Colombia since 2008. This strategy has included the implementation of the following projects, which have also included among its objectives the strengthening of social dialogue institutions (the CPCPSL and Subcommittees) and/or building the capacities of social partners to resolve conflicts and negotiate collective agreements:

- “Promoting the fundamental principles and rights at work”, funded by USDOS.
- “Promoting compliance with international labor standards in Colombia,” funded by the US Department of Labor (USDOL).
- “Strengthening institutional forums for social dialogue and tripartite participation of stakeholders at the departmental level in Colombia,” funded by the Ministry of Labor of Colombia.
- “Promoting decent work through social dialogue at the local level in Colombia.”

5.4.2. Validity of the project design

Vertical logic and intervention strategies of the Project.

26. The two immediate objectives of the project are: (a) strengthen the capacity of tripartite dialogue institutions to promote the realization of fundamental rights at work with a particular emphasis on women, young people and Afro-Colombians, and (b) promote sound labor relations and the right to collective bargaining at sectoral and enterprise level.

27. In order to achieve the first objective, the project design envisioned the following strategies: (a) generating knowledge on the labor market situation of women, young people and Afro-Colombians and the

¹² The ILO Program and Budget 2014-2015 retains this same strategic objective and result # 12.

barriers they face in exercising their fundamental rights at work; (b) training aimed at the CPCPSL, the Subcommittees of Valle del Cauca and Bolivar, and the CLAF to promote the realization of fundamental rights at work in the target groups; and (c) technical assistance to the CPCPSL, the Subcommittees and the CLAF for the design and adoption of action plans that will address the fundamental rights at work and employment needs of these groups. Meanwhile, to achieve the second objective, the Project design adopted the strategy of providing training to employers' and workers' organizations on exercising the rights to collective bargaining and freedom of association.

28. These strategies are implemented through different outputs and activities included in the Project's logical framework. There is an adequate vertical logic in the Project design because the activities (mainly training programs, workshops, technical support, consultancies) are necessary in order to obtain the products (building greater capacity of the Subcommittees, employers and trade unions, as well as the adoption of action plans by the Subcommittees; and application of new techniques for conflict prevention and collective bargaining by employers and trade unions); and in turn these outputs are necessary for achieving the immediate objectives.

Table 2: Strategies, outputs and activities linked to the Project's Immediate Objective 1.

Strategies	Outputs	Activities
Knowledge generation Training aimed at CPCPSL, Subcommittees, CLAF	1.1. The National Committee and its subcommittees are better equipped to understand and address the labor market concerns of women, young people and Afro-Colombians	1.1.1 Technical Support to the Subcommittees to carry out diagnostic surveys and mapping exercises on working conditions and compliance with core labor rights at work of women, young people and Afro-Colombians
		1.1.2 Train-the-trainer program aimed at leaders of the Sub Committees and the CLAF
		1.1.3 Large scale training program aimed at women, young people and Afro-Colombians of Subcommittees, CLAF, Ministry of Labor, employers' and workers' organizations and other social organizations
Technical Assistance aimed at CPCPSL, Subcommittees, CLAF	1.2. A set of proposals on fundamental rights at work and decent work for women and young Afro-Colombians is adopted by the CPCPSL	1.2.1 Consultancy delivered to the CPCPSL for organizing and implementing roundtables with youth and women
		1.2.2. Technical support to the CPCPSL to discuss, improve, and (if approved) disseminate the proposals generated at the round tables.
	1.3. Local action plans or similar initiatives are adopted by the Subcommittees to address the	1.3.1 Individual consultancies with members of the Subcommittees for development of proposals that address the specific needs of the target population

	labor market needs and concerns of women, young people and Afro-Colombians	1.3.2 Technical support to the Subcommittees for the design and adoption of action plans on employment and fundamental rights at work of the target population
		1.3.3 Support the Subcommittees so that their action plans can be incorporated into the departmental development plans 2015-2019

Table 3: Strategies, outputs and activities linked to the Project's Immediate Objective 2.

Lines of action	Outputs	Activities
Training aimed at workers' and employers' organizations	2.1. Union members acquire better skills to exercise the rights of freedom of association and collective bargaining at sectoral and enterprise level	2.1.1. Meeting with experts from trade unions to discuss how to improve coverage and quality of collective bargaining agreements, and to design a program on collective bargaining skills and techniques and conflict prevention and resolution aimed at trade unions
		2.1.2. Train-the-trainer program aimed at union leaders
		2.1.3 Large scale training program aimed at union members
	2.2. Enterprises are better informed about how to comply with the rights to freedom of association and collective bargaining	2.2.1 Design workshops aimed at enterprises on how to comply with the rights to freedom of association and collective bargaining
		2.2.2 Conducting workshops aimed at enterprises
	2.3 Enterprises apply new techniques or skills to introduce or improve strategies for conflict prevention and resolution and collective bargaining	2.3 Prepare a training program on techniques or skills to introduce or improve strategies for conflict prevention and resolution and collective bargaining
		2.3.2 Select enterprises to participate in the training program
		2.3.3. Conduct the training program with selected enterprises

29. There is consistency between the outputs included within the first objective. Thus, the evidence on the situation of the target population provided by the diagnostic surveys and mappings (activity 1.1.1) enriches the thematic platform of the training programs (activities 1.1.2 and 1.1.3); also, the knowledge and skills generated by these training programs (output 1.1) are intended to improve the technical quality and relevance of the discussions and decision-making processes within the tripartite dialogue institutions and to be reflected in proposals and/or action plans to address the issue of the fundamental rights at work and decent work for women, young people and Afro-Colombians (outputs 1.2 and 1.3).

30. A design constraint has been the failure to properly quantify the magnitude and potential for occurrence of the identified risk factors. The project did not carry out output 1.2 basically because the political and social situation in Colombia in 2014 and 2015 hampered tripartite dialogue and inclusion of project concerns on the CPCPSL agenda. Although the project cannot avoid these risks from being present, their magnitude and chances of occurring could have been better dimensioned in the design phase (more so having known from the beginning that 2014 was going to be an election year).
31. All training activities under the second objective aimed at unions and enterprises (outputs 2.1, 2.2 and 2.3) are expected to increase the willingness and ability of employers and workers to generate collective bargaining agreements that will benefit both parties, and that in turn this will be reflected in a greater exercise of the right to collective bargaining and in the implementation of strategies for conflict prevention and resolution that will promote good industrial relations. However, this evaluation considers that this second objective can be achieved in the medium or long term, unlike what happens with the first objective, which can be achieved in a shorter term, as envisaged by the project.
32. A constraint in the Project's design is the lack of clarity regarding the complementarity between the two immediate objectives, and how one objective can build on the progress of the other. This in turn may limit the project's contribution to development objective to "develop social dialogue institutions and mechanisms that advocate for and promote the realization of core labor rights in Colombia."
33. Considering that one of the lessons learned from previous ILO projects in Colombia¹³ is that in order to strengthen the capacities of social dialogue institutions it is important that technical assistance be aimed at improving tripartite dialogue on a specific topic, it is also appropriate that the Project had focused mainly on the realization of the fundamental rights at work among a specific population consisting of women, young people and Afro-Colombians.

¹³ This reference (and all others made throughout this document) to lessons learned from previous ILO projects in Colombia are based on independent evaluations of projects developed as part of the strategy to strengthen forums for social dialogue at national and local levels for the realization of fundamental rights at work, and that were listed in the preceding section ("Relevance"). Consideration has also been given to the main results of the study "Social Dialogue Interventions: What works and why? A synthesis review 2002 - 2012, ILO, covering social dialogue interventions carried out by the ILO worldwide during the period 2002-2012.

34. Project design aptly states that target groups should be actively involved in the project implementation. That is, it was intended that women, youth and Afro-Colombian leaders Ministry of Labor actively participate in the activities planned for under the first immediate objective, such as training programs (activity 1.1.3), roundtables (activity 1.2.1), and designing action plans (activity 1.3.2).
35. The choice of Valle del Cauca and Bolivar as areas of intervention of the project is justified by the high concentration of Afro-Colombian population (Valle del Cauca and Bolivar are two of the departments with the highest proportion of Afro-Colombian population, along with the departments of Chocó, San Andrés and Magdalena). According to the General Census of Population and Housing 2005, the percentage of the population that recognizes itself as Afro-descendants is 27% in Valle del Cauca and in Bolivar (that is more than twice the national average of 11%).¹⁴ Furthermore, youth and women in Valle del Cauca and Bolivar are disadvantaged in terms of employability, to the extent that some indicators show that this disadvantage is even higher than the national average (see Annex 1).
36. Moreover, from all the departments with a high concentration of Afro-Colombian population, the constituents (the Ministry of Labor, the unions and the ANDI) chose Valle del Cauca and Bolivar for the greater institutional presence of workers' and employers' organizations, which is reflected in the fact that the level of development of the Subcommittees of these two departments at the start the project was higher than that of other Subcommittees where this condition is not met: according to the "Diagnostic Survey of the Situation of Subcommittees in Colombia" conducted by the ILO, in 2012 the Subcommittee of Valle del Cauca was one of 8 that were ranked at a "high" level, while Bolivar was one of 13 ranked at a "medium" level.¹⁵ Among the departments with high concentration of Afro-Colombian population, the Subcommittee of Magdalena was ranked at a "high" level, the Subcommittee of San Andrés was ranked a "medium" level and the Subcommittee of Chocó was one of 8 ranked as having a "low" level.

Horizontal logic of the project

37. All project activities have an indicator that measures the extent of execution. However, these indicators are appropriate for only some activities (e.g., the number of meetings held, the number of

¹⁴ Also, Cali and Cartagena (capitals of Valle del Cauca and Bolivar, respectively) are the two cities with the largest Afro-descendant population (560,000 and 280,000 respectively, accounting for 13% and 7% of the total Afro-descendant population in Colombia).

¹⁵ The criteria behind this categorization are tripartite participation, the existence of a technical secretary hired by Ministry of Labor and the ILO, technical and administrative support, the actual attendance to monthly meetings, the existence of plans for social dialogue and the implementation of these plans.

workshops, the number of recommendations provided by the project, the number of diagnostic surveys and mapping exercises) while not appropriate for others because what the indicators measure is linked more to the results of these activities (e.g., proportion of participants to training programs with enhanced knowledge and skills), and therefore are more of an output indicator. Moreover, in terms of the activities, there was a failure to include indicators for the number of people (unionists, employers, women, young people, Afro-Colombians) who have been trained or had their capacities built.

38. In terms of products, the indicators listed in the logical framework properly reflect what is intended to be generated, and can be classified into three types: (A) proposals for policies or local action plans (outputs 1.2 and 1.3), (b) percentage of participants to the training who improve knowledge and skills (outputs 1.1, 2.1 and 2.2); and (c) enterprises that apply what they have learned (output 2.3). However, the design failed to specify the criteria or minimum requirements the proposed policies had to meet in order to consider that the outputs 1.2 and 1.3 had been achieved; as well as the contents of the pre- and post-knowledge tests that should be administered to participants in order to measure the indicators for outputs 1.1, 2.1 and 2.2.

39. In terms of immediate objectives, the indicator for the first objective (“total number of practical measures adopted by the tripartite institutions to promote the full realization of fundamental rights at work”) does not specify which conditions should be met by a “practical measure” in order for it to be considered as having been “adopted.” As for the second objective, the indicator used (“percentage of employers and trade unionists who report being in a better position to exercise their right to collective bargaining”) is too subjective because it is basically measuring the perception of beneficiaries of a service received.

Incorporating lessons learned and recommendations from other projects into the project design.

40. USDOS announced an open call for developing a project in Colombia, with an emphasis on Afro-Colombians, women and young people, to improve the CLAF’s institutions and strengthen tripartite social dialogue institutions (i.e., aspects more closely linked to the project’s first objective). UDOS selected the proposal submitted by the ILO, which proposed to complement the national approach to support the CPCPSL with one which was more closely linked to local public policies through departmental subcommittees, and added a second objective for the project.

41. It is a positive thing that the project incorporated many lessons learned and recommendations from previous ILO projects in Colombia, such as orienting the technical assistance towards improving tripartite dialogue on a specific topic; increasing the sense of ownership of stakeholders and the sustainability of the intervention through active involvement of the social partners in the design and implementation of a project; and enhancing capacity building by increasing the level of development of the social partners' institutions (in this case, the Subcommittees of Valle del Cauca and Bolivar).
42. However, the project did not take into account other lessons learned and recommendations, which may have allowed for improved horizontal logic, such as agreeing with the constituents (mainly the trade unions) about the indicators, targets and even the monitoring plan for outputs and objectives, taking into account the duration of the Project; and giving more priority to the participation of women in the project, in terms of the targets embodied both in the logical framework and in the quarterly progress reports.

Adjustments to the Project's design

43. During project execution, and after a fact-finding mission by representatives of USDOS, the ILO requested a 6-month extension of the Project duration.¹⁶ With this extension, the two activities under output 1.2 ("Adoption by the CPCPSL of a set of proposals in the matter of fundamental rights at work and decent work for women and young Afro-Colombians") were removed without involving any changes to project objectives, beneficiaries, geographical scope or budget). In addition, the extension seeks the completion of the activities under output 2.3 ("Companies applying new techniques or skills to introduce or improve conflict prevention and resolution and collective bargaining strategies") whose implementation started as recently as February 2015; and introduced "new" activities to strengthen the CLAF (namely, support in identifying initiatives and developing proposals to be submitted to international cooperation agencies, and to enhance the knowledge of its members of national and international standards that acknowledge and guarantee labor rights to the Afro-Colombian population).

5.4.3. Efficiency.

¹⁶ Initially, the project had been scheduled for a duration of 18 months (September 2013 - February 2015). With the extension request, the Project end date was extended until September 2015.

Outputs and activities linked to the first immediate objective

The CPCPSL and the Subcommittees are better equipped to understand and address the labor market concerns of women, young people and Afro-Colombians (Output 1.1).

44. The project developed a national diagnostic survey of the barriers that prevent young people from exercising their labor rights and two studies on gender, youth and Afro-descendant populations in Valle del Cauca and Bolivar. These studies were pioneers in the subject of the employment situation of Afro-Colombian populations.
45. The project conducted training programs to strengthen the capacity of individuals to actively participate in social dialogue and express collective needs, and the capacity of institutions to promote the adoption of public policies on employment aimed at the target populations. The programs included the following topics: national and international legislation on fundamental rights at work; tripartite social dialogue and decent work; negotiation skills; initiatives and best practices to promote workplace equality, create youth employment; the labor market situation of women, young people and Afro-Colombians.
46. The beneficiaries of the training were not only members of the Subcommittees or representatives of workers' and employers' organizations or the Ministry of Labor, but also women, young people and Afro-Colombians. In total almost 600 people were trained:
 - Between 2014 and 2015, 241 workers were trained in Valle del Cauca and Bolivar, among representatives of the trade union federations CTC, CGT and CUT, employers and officials of the Ministry of Labor.
 - In 2015, 324 women, young people and Afro-Colombians were trained in Valle del Cauca and Bolivar.¹⁷
47. The targets set out in the Project design were met, and even surpassed in some cases. However, the output indicator providing evidence of having attained the goal is based on surveys conducted

¹⁷ A workshop was held in Cartagena aimed mainly at young people ("Strengthening the public policy on decent work for young Afro-Colombians") with attendance of 84 people. Another workshop was aimed at women ("Empowering women for developing proposals for social inclusion of women in development plans") with participation of 40 people. Meanwhile, in Cali there was a training workshop for youth with attendance of 160 people took part and another workshop for women ("Strengthening the public policy on decent work with a gender approach") with attendance of 40 people.

by the project at the end of the training whereby respondents were asked whether they had improved their knowledge; this is a very subjective question, which limits the reliability and validity of the results.

Table 4. Planned targets and results achieved under Output 1.1 and its activities.

Output/Activity	Defining the output or activity	Indicator	Planned target	Result achieved
Output	1.1. The National Committee and its subcommittees are better equipped to understand and address the labor market concerns of women, young people and Afro-Colombians	Percentage of tripartite constituents that improve their knowledge and skills on core labour standards and tripartite dialogue	80%	85%
Activities	1.1.1 Technical Support to the Subcommittees to carry out diagnostic surveys and mapping exercises on working conditions and compliance with core labor rights at work of women, young people and Afro-Colombians	Number of diagnostic surveys and mapping exercises developed	3	3
	1.1.2 Train-the-trainer program aimed at leaders of the Sub Committees and the CLAF	Number of people who received the training	390	565
	1.1.3 Large scale training program aimed at women, young people and Afro-Colombians of Subcommittees, CLAF, Ministry of Labor, employers' and workers' organizations and other social organizations			

Compiled using the logical framework, progress reports, and the project monitoring plan.

48. According to the people interviewed in Cartagena and Cali during the field mission of this evaluation, the activities undertaken by the project have contributed to the Subcommittees of Bolívar and Valle del Cauca working better than two years ago, which is mainly reflected in the following aspects:

- Greater participation in the meetings of the Subcommittees of legal representatives of employers' organizations (such as ANDI and the National Merchants' Federation –FENALCO –, for instance) and of high-level officials and with decision-makers from the governor's and the mayor's offices. For instance, according to the minutes reviewed, during 2014 the Sub-committee of Bolívar met 13 times with an average of 10 attendees per meeting, and with the continued

participation of representatives from the mayor's and governor's offices.¹⁸

- Before this, the meetings of the Subcommittees would deal only with specific issues relating to the labor disputes of some enterprises without a previously defined agenda; starting with the project inception, priority was given to building a decent work policy, with emphasis on vulnerable populations. Proof of this stems from the review of 19 minutes of the meetings of the Subcommittees (13 minutes from Bolivar in 2014 and 6 from Valle del Cauca in 2015) all have agendas dealing with frequent subjects such as social dialogue linked to the concerns of women, young people and Afro-Colombians, the policy on decent work, the participation of women in the labor market, labor inclusion, etc.
- Better preparation of the members of the Subcommittees (and, therefore, greater technical quality of discussions and agreements); and greater confidence among members of the Subcommittees. Prior to this, the parties would confront one another as though they were "rivals"; but now dialogue is emphasized and the parties consider each other partners.

49. Despite the advances noted in the operation of the Subcommittees, these still have some limitations.

- The role of the Regional Directorate of the Ministry of Labor as Technical Secretariat (TS) of the Subcommittees.¹⁹ In Cartagena, it happened that the Sub-committee operated more dynamically in 2014 (when the Technical Secretariat was chaired by an independent person hired by the ILO) than it was in 2015 (when the Technical Secretariat was hosted by the Territorial Directorate of the Ministry of Labor). One reason is that the administrative structure of the Territorial Directorate (and therefore the composition of its staff) is designed primarily for handling investigations and inspections of labor standards and not for discussing or proposing public strategies and policies on decent work.
- The representatives of workers' and employers' organizations are concerned that the Subcommittees place little emphasis on discussing the issues of conflict prevention and mediation, and even

¹⁸ In fact, representatives of governor's and mayor's offices have participated not only on the Subcommittees, but also in the various events and workshops conducted by the Project. For instance, during 2014 three forums on decent work and public policies for gender equity, youth and Afro-Colombian populations were held, attended by about 250 people, 50 of which (20%) were representatives of governor's or mayor's offices.

¹⁹ Under the Act, the Technical Secretariat of the Subcommittee should be appointed by the Ministry of Labour; otherwise Ministry of Labor itself should take on the leadership of the Subcommittee.

less so on the resolution of cases, although this is one of their constitutionally mandated functions.²⁰

- The Subcommittees have a scope (in terms of its members and topics covered in the meetings) that is mainly departmental, not reaching the municipal level.
- The Subcommittees are not properly coordinated with the CPCPSL nor with the Regional Labour Market Observatories (ORMET), which could be of valuable support to the Subcommittees in making certain decisions.
- FENALCO, unlike the ANDI, does not have much participation, and this limits the possibility of the commerce sector (which has a higher level of informality than the industrial sector, for example) becoming more involved in the activities of the Subcommittees.

50. It should be noted that the evaluations of other similar ILO projects in Colombia agree on some recommendations or lessons learned that deal precisely with the above-mentioned limitations. However, they were not considered in this project, possibly due to the restrictions of time and financial resources.

A set of proposals on the fundamental rights at work and decent work for women and young Afro-Colombians is adopted by the CPCPSL (Output 1.2).

51. The project was intended to increase the capacity of the CPCPSL to reach tripartite agreements on legal and policy proposals aimed at women, young people and Afro-Colombians regarding their fundamental rights at work. Although initially the Technical Secretariat agreed to include the issues promoted by the project, the political and social situation in Colombia in 2014 and 2015 hampered tripartite dialogue and the inclusion of these issues on the formal agenda. Consequently, the targets set in the project design in terms of activities and outputs were not met.

52. During 2014, the attention of the institutions that make up the CPCPSL focused on the presidential election, and even the Ministry of Labor played an active role in the presidential campaign of the current president of Colombia. After the elections, the focus shifted on the election of new authorities within the Ministry of Labor and, in the last quarter, on the minimum wage negotiations. During 2015 the agenda of workers' organizations has been marked by complaints

²⁰ Judging by the content of the minutes of the meetings of the Subcommittees, this seems to be more of a common occurrence at Valle del Cauca than in Bolívar, as matters related to labor disputes have been discussed at several meetings of the Subcommittee of Bolívar.

about the fulfillment of the commitments made in the electoral campaign on overtime pay and night work, and by collective bargaining and conflict resolution in strategic public sectors. In addition, another priority issue at country level has been the negotiation of a peace agreement with the FARC. All of which impacted on the CPCPSL not giving the highest priority to the issues promoted by the project.

Table 5. Planned targets and results achieved under Output 1.2 and its activities.

Output/Activity	Defining the output or activity	Indicator	Planned target	Result achieved
Output	1.2. A set of proposals on fundamental rights at work and decent work for women and young Afro-Colombians is adopted by the CPCPSL	Number of proposals for policies and action plans adopted by the CPCPSL and its subcommittees on youth and gender equity that comply with ILS on fundamental rights	2	0
Activities	1.2.1 Consultancy delivered to the CPCPSL for organizing and implementing roundtables with youth and women	Number of roundtables held	2	0
	1.2.2. Technical support to the CPCPSL to discuss, improve, and (if approved) disseminate the proposals generated at the round tables.	Number of meetings held with the CPCPSL	4	0

Compiled using the logical framework, progress reports, and the project monitoring plan.

Local action plans or similar initiatives are adopted by the Subcommittees to address the labor market needs and concerns of women, young people and Afro-Colombians (Output 1.3).

53. The project provided technical assistance to the Subcommittees of Valle del Cauca and Bolivar to prepare plans to address the realization of fundamental rights at work and meet the employment needs of women, young people and Afro-Colombians. Specifically, these Subcommittees prepared dialogue plans first and then action plans, in both cases under the leadership and support of the ILO, which conducted workshops on public policies on decent work and then provided general guidelines and information useful to developing the plans and to finally review the progress made by the Subcommittees and propose adjustments to the objectives, indicators, and activities, among others.²¹

²¹ Action plans have an annual basis and include different objectives, each of which has its own outputs, activities, indicators, targets, persons responsible and deadlines. In the case of Valle del Cauca, the Plan 2015 has four objectives: (a) improve the protection of labor rights, (b) create more and better job

54. In addition to this technical assistance to help strengthen the Subcommittees' capacity for advocacy on public policy at the local level, the project held events with the candidates for governor and mayors,²² who presented their government plans on women, youth, and Afro Colombians and their decent work policy. The candidates then received comments from other participants and, on that basis, adjusted their plans on these issues. Judging from the responses given by the people interviewed during the field work for this evaluation, these events have helped to place the issue of decent work on the candidates' agendas and to obtain their commitment to incorporate the issue into their local development plans, should they win the elections. Such actions are another example of leveraging lessons learned from previous projects. In this case one lesson learned was to prioritize and focus efforts towards political dialogue in the projects.

55. At Valle del Cauca, these actions have contributed to the development of a draft ordinance whereby a public policy for decent work was adopted for the department, which explicitly includes women, young people and Afro-Colombians in the scope of its jurisdiction.²³ The draft ordinance has already been approved by the governor's office and submitted to the Departmental Assembly, where it should be signed and formalized as an ordinance.

56. In Cartagena, District Agreement 109 establishes the public policy on decent work for the district,²⁴ with the ILO participating actively in its drafting (albeit through another project). The Agreement was approved by the council in 2014, even though this year it has not

opportunities in the department, (c) strengthen social dialogue in the department, and (d) increase the number of workers with social security coverage.

²² About half of the candidates for governor most likely to win polls participated in these events. Elections for governors and mayors will take place on 25 October, 2015. By then the project would have been completed.

²³ This ordinance consists of 15 articles, with article 11 stating that the public sector of department should promote projects and investments to generate new sources of employment in decent conditions respond in decent work conditions. To do this, it should strengthen access to employment opportunities for disadvantaged populations (among which it mentions "female workers" and "Afro-Colombians") through ongoing technical training, "supporting employment programs targeting women heads of household" and the "design, implementation and funding of policies and strategies aimed at young Afrodescendant women."

²⁴ The Agreement consists of 8 articles, with article 5 stating that public policy on decent work will reorient projects and investments in the district to generating new sources of employment in decent work conditions, for which one of the lines of action should be to provide advice, inclusion and support to minority sectors of the population (with specific mention of "mothers heads of household") who are disadvantaged compared to the rest of the population

been followed up on, plus it only covers a district from the entire department.

Table 6. Planned targets and results achieved under Output 1.3 and its activities.

Output/Activity	Defining the output or activity	Indicator	Planned target	Result achieved
Output	1.3. Local action plans or similar initiatives are adopted by the Subcommittees to address the labor market needs and concerns of women, young people and Afro-Colombians	Number of similar actions or initiatives adopted by the subcommittees with support of the project that comply with ILS on fundamental rights.	2	2
Activities	1.3.1 Individual consultancies with members of the Subcommittees for development of proposals that address the specific needs of the target population	Number of recommendations provided by the project and included in the proposals drafted by the subcommittees	2	2
	1.3.2 Technical support to the Subcommittees for the design and adoption of action plans on employment and fundamental rights at work of the target population	Meetings held	4	6
	1.3.3 Support to the Subcommittees so that their action plans can be incorporated into the departmental development plans 2015-2019	Workshops conducted with the Subcommittees	1	0

Compiled using the logical framework, progress reports, and the project monitoring plan.

Project support to strengthening the CLAF.

57. At all the workshops and activities held as part of the first immediate objective, the Project has invited the CLAF to make public its objectives and activities to the Ministry of Labour, the governor's office, the mayor's, the Chamber of Commerce, the ANDI and the trade unions, among others.²⁵ Since 2015, the CLAF has representation in the Subcommittees of Valle del Cauca and Bolivar

²⁵ The CLAF in Colombia was born in 2008 from a meeting of workers and leaders of the port, sugar cane and oil palm sectors, but was formally established in 2013, focusing on the flower, mining and construction industries, in addition to the above-mentioned areas of intervention. The aim of CLAF is to contribute to the reduction of racial discrimination in the workplace, prevent the exclusion, job insecurity and precarious employment of Afro-Colombian workers. The CLAF brings together non-unionized workers, trade unions and other organizations to discuss common cultural and social issues.

and has participated in the development of the draft public policy ordinance on decent work in Valle del Cauca. This strategy has contributed to making the CLAF more visible to representatives of employers, workers and the State.

58. Regarding the latter, the project has funded workshops on strategic planning of the CLAF in Valle del Cauca and Bolivar, resulting in the generation of the CLAF national action plan and departmental action plans for 2015, including for Valle del Cauca and Bolivar.²⁶ Also, in late September 2015, the Third Afro-Colombian National Forum was held in Bogota to discuss the main objectives and activities to be included in the CLAF National Action Plan and departmental action plans for 2016.

59. Despite these advances, according to interviews, the CLAF currently has several limitations such as lack of resources (financial, logistics, infrastructure) and weak coordination with the trade union federations, which causes the federations to believe that non realization of the fundamental rights at work affects the entire population equally. Therefore, they do not quite accept that Afro-Colombians should have priority treatment. The CLAF strategic planning documents also identify other problems such as the lack of people to assume direct responsibility, inadequate technical capabilities of its members to formulate projects, and lack of communication between the departmental-level CLAFs.

60. To help address some of these limitations, the Project had planned to support the CLAF in developing projects to promote the institution's obtaining financing from different sources of cooperation; however, beyond a few actions undertaken in this regard, there is no further evidence of concrete achievements.

Outputs and activities linked to the first immediate objective.

Unionists acquire better skills to exercise the rights to freedom of association and collective bargaining at sectoral and enterprise level (Output 2.1); enterprises are better informed about how to comply with the rights to freedom of association and collective bargaining (Output 2.2.); and enterprises apply new techniques or skills to introduce or improve conflict prevention and resolution and collective bargaining strategies (Output 2.3).

61. The project trained 275 unionized workers (including 12 union leaders) on issues of national and international legislation, good

²⁶ Other departments in which these plans have been developed with the support of the ILO are Atlántico, Bogota, Buenaventura, Cesar, Magdalena and Turbo.

practices in collective bargaining in Colombia, building good workplace relationships in companies and conflict prevention:

- In 2014, 12 union leaders were trained in Valle del Cauca and Bolivar.
- That same year, 263 unionized workers²⁷ belonging to the trade union federations CTC (74), CGT (79) and CUT (111) were trained in Valle del Cauca (136) and Bolivar (127).

62. In 2004, the project carried out awareness and information workshops with 33 enterprises (22 of Valle del Cauca and 11 of Bolivar) concerning labor rights (mainly freedom of association and collective bargaining) and conflict prevention and resolution mechanisms.

63. The project has designed a training program aimed at employers and unions on techniques and skills to introduce or improve conflict prevention and resolution strategies. Thus, the project is supporting collective bargaining processes and promoting the exercise of fundamental rights at work in Colombia. Regarding the enterprises participating in the program, firstly, the Ministry of Labor identified those enterprises whose collective agreements end in 2015 (and, therefore, need to renegotiate the agreements) and, secondly, the workers' and employers' organizations made the final selection. The training program was held in Cartagena in late September 2015 and saw the participation of 27 enterprises from different sectors of Valle del Cauca, Bolívar, Cundinamarca and Antioquia –specifically one representative from each of the governing bodies and a representative from the unions of each of these enterprises.

64. The targets set out in the project design regarding the training of trade unionists (output 2.1) have been met, and even surpassed in some cases; but not so the ones relating the information and awareness workshops aimed at enterprises (output 2.2). It should be noted that, just as was the case with the first Project objective, the evidence of meeting the targets set for the indicators of products 2.1 and 2.2 is based on surveys conducted by the project at the end of the training whereby respondents were asked whether they had improved their knowledge; this is a very subjective question, which limits the reliability and validity of the results.

Table 7. Planned targets and results achieved under Output 2.1 and its activities.

Output/Activity	Defining the output or activity	Indicator	Planned target	Result achieved
-----------------	---------------------------------	-----------	----------------	-----------------

²⁷ These workers represented a total of 107 unions.

Output	2.1. Union members acquire better skills to exercise the rights of freedom of association and collective bargaining at sectoral and enterprise level	Percentage of unionists who improve their knowledge and skills on the rights to exercise freedom of association and collective bargaining at sectoral and enterprise levels.	80%	97%
Activities	2.1.1. Meeting with experts from trade unions to discuss how to improve coverage and quality of collective bargaining agreements, and to design a program on collective bargaining skills and techniques and conflict prevention and resolution aimed at trade unions	Number of recommendations approved by experts	2	2
	2.1.2. Train-the-trainer program aimed at union leaders	Number of union leaders trained	10	12
	2.1.3 Large scale training program aimed at union members	Workshops' carried out	1	6
		Number of unionists trained	200	263

Compiled using the logical framework, progress reports, and the project monitoring plan.

Table 8. Planned targets and results achieved under Output 2.2 and its activities.

Output/Activity	Defining the output or activity	Indicator	Planned target	Result achieved
Output	2.2. Enterprises are better informed about how to comply with the rights to freedom of association and collective bargaining	Percentage of employers who improve their knowledge on compliance with the rights to freedom of association and collective bargaining	60%	90%
Activities	2.2.1 Design workshops aimed at enterprises on how to comply with the rights to freedom of association and collective bargaining	Number of recommendations approved by experts	2	2
	2.2.2 Conducting workshops aimed at enterprises	Number of enterprises sensitized	80	33
		Workshops carried out	4	2

Compiled using the logical framework, progress reports, and the project monitoring plan.

Table 9. Planned targets and results achieved under Output 2.3 and its activities.

Output/Activity	Defining the output or activity	Indicator	Planned target	Result achieved
Output	2.3 Enterprises apply new techniques or skills to introduce or improve strategies for conflict prevention and resolution and collective bargaining	Number of enterprises applying new skills and techniques for conflict prevention and collective bargaining	20	0

Activities	2.3 Prepare a training program on techniques or skills to introduce or improve strategies for conflict prevention and resolution and collective bargaining	Number of recommendations to improve the program's methodology and strategies	1	1
	2.3.2 Select enterprises to participate in the training program	Number of selected enterprises	20	20
	2.3.3. Conduct the training program with selected enterprises	Number of enterprises that received the training program	20	27

Compiled using the logical framework, progress reports, and the project monitoring plan.

Training activities aimed at workers' and employers' organizations on the exercise of rights to collective bargaining and freedom of association, and strategies for conflict prevention and resolution carried out within the framework of the second project objective have contributed (according to those interviewed during the field mission of this evaluation) to better understand the existing national legislation, since the parties understand collective bargaining no longer as "a strategy to defeat a rival" but as an integral strategy where all stand to gain and priority is placed on social dialogue and mutual trust.

The capacity building strategy.

65. Considering that the main strategy of the project for both the first and the second objectives is to build the capacities of workers' and employers' organizations, state institutions and civil society in general, some elements linked to that strategy should be highlighted.

66. To make better use of the training activities and training, it is important to properly select those who will be the direct beneficiaries of these actions. In that sense, these people should be those with higher positions and responsibilities in a given organization or those whose functions are more related to the subject matter of the training or education. The responsibility of selecting the direct beneficiaries does not rest with the ILO but with the organizations representing the employers (e.g., the ANDI) and the workers (e.g., CGT, CUT and CTC)²⁸ at the national level. Moreover, according to the list of participants in the various project activities, it can be noted that the involvement of those in leadership positions (president, vice president, director, coordinator, manager, boss) was approximately 30% in decent work and public policy forums, between 25% and 35% in fundamental rights at work training programs, and between 30% and 40% in collective bargaining workshops aimed at trade unionists.

²⁸ The ILO, mainly through ACTRAV and ACTEMP makes direct contact with these organizations nationwide representing employers and unions, but it is the latter that choose the grassroots or first-level organizations that will benefit from the training programs.

67. One risk of these actions is that education and training activities can be repetitive and / or involve a duplication of efforts because they are conducted in all ILO projects in Colombia. On the other hand, if the direct beneficiaries of these actions have already received similar training from other projects (on fundamental rights at work, collective bargaining, and freedom of association, among others) they may believe they do not need to learn more. On this point, the ILO does not have a single database of training beneficiaries for all its projects in Colombia, and therefore it cannot quantify, for instance, what percentage of beneficiaries of this project had been trained previously on similar issues by other projects.

68. What can be approximated is the proportion of women participants in training and education activities carried out by the Project. As can be seen in the table below, women have almost always been the minority, mainly at those events aimed at workers' organizations.

Table 10. Women's participation in Project activities

	Total participants	% Men participants	% Women participants
Forums on decent work and public policies on gender equity aimed at young and Afro-Colombian population (activity 1.1.3)	258	52%	48%
Training programs on fundamental rights at work (activity 1.1.2)	241	66%	34%
Workshops on collective bargaining aimed at unionists (activity 2.1.3)	263	79%	21%
Train-the-trainer programs aimed at unionists (activity 2.1.2)	12	67%	33%
Workshops aimed at enterprises (activity 2.2.2)	33	37%	63%
Training program aimed at enterprises – representatives of employers (activity 2.3.3)	27	52%	48%
Training program aimed at enterprises – representatives of workers (activity 2.3.3)	27	96%	4%

Compiled base on list of participants to Project activities.

69. The results of this project in terms of number of trained beneficiaries, confirm that it is usually more difficult to achieve the target set for employers than for workers. One of the most common arguments to explain this is the less time available to employers in relation to workers, who can also negotiate union leave of absence. However, this may also be linked to the perception by enterprises that the issues taught at the trainings are repetitive (i.e., other projects also

delivered the same training) or to the low participation of enterprises in program design.

70. At the end of training programs on fundamental rights at work, the project has administered surveys to participants to find out whether they were satisfied with the methodology used and whether they thought they had increased their knowledge.²⁹ While this is important to adjust some aspects of the methodology and/or thematic content for future workshops, their suitability for measuring outcomes is rather debatable, and other type of instruments, such as pre- and post-knowledge tests, might be better suited to this type of task.
71. The train-the-trainer strategy planned for this project and for most ILO projects in Colombia, is a priori positive for ensuring the sustainability of the intervention, as trade unions and employers' organizations are expected to transfer the learning to other people in their union or organization. In the case of this project, according to conducted interviews, the learnings have indeed been replicated at some trade unions,³⁰ but at others this has not been possible due to lack of funding. As the ILO did not anticipate measures to accompany or follow up on the trainers (although it was one of the recommendations of the independent evaluation of one of the projects of the ILO in Colombia), there is no official record to provide evidence of replication of the learning.

ILO Contributions.

72. The ILO has contributed to the Project achievements identified in this section, as its tripartite structure places the institution in a privileged position to advance the implementation of the fundamental rights at work, owing to the ILO's previous experience working with tripartite constituents in Colombia, its championing of the international labor standards, its exceptional documentary heritage (reports, documents, tools, methodologies in social dialogue, gender, employment), and the high professional quality of ILO specialists involved in the design and implementation of the Project in Geneva, the Office for the Andean Countries, and ACTRAV and ACTEMP in Colombia.

²⁹ Annex 8 describes some aspects of the methodology, content and results of these surveys.

³⁰ In these cases the dissemination of the learnings takes place at the plenary meetings of the board of every 2 or 3 months and executive committees ask the unions whether they want to know more about the topic; if so, training replication workshops are developed and, in some cases, the support of ILO specialists is requested .

73. All these factors cause the ILO to have credibility before the constituents as an institution that seeks consensus from its tripartite and independent structure, with vast experience and knowledge on the subject of labor rights. This image has allowed the ILO to play an important role as an articulator and motivator of social dialogue.

5.4.4. Efficiency.

74. The project budget was \$495,000, financed by USDOS. The adjustment to the project design did not change the total amount, but the distribution of the budget did vary by type of expenditure: the relative importance of the “contracts” category (development of seminars, workshops and training, and hiring consultants) increased significantly (from 44% to 61%), and the opposite happened with the “Project staff” category (which shrunk from 29% to 19%). This increased budget for “contracts” helps to explain why in some activities (precisely seminars, workshops and training) the achieved physical target has been higher than expected.

75. The reduced budget for “Project staff” can be explained by the fact that initially it was planned to have a full-time national coordinator from the start of the project. However, the national coordinator was hired as recently as March 2015 just as the project extension period (March - September 2015) started.³¹ In early 2014, the ILO held a call for hiring a national coordinator but negotiations with the selected candidate lasted over a month and eventually this person did not accept the proposal, and therefore the ILO declared the call null and void. In early 2015, considering the number of outputs and activities planned to be implemented during the project extension period (these outputs and activities include both what was left pending implementation from the original design as well as new outputs and activities introduced for strengthening the CLAF) the hiring process was restarted and a national coordinator was finally hired.

76. In turn, this explains the low relative importance of the “project staff” category (less than 20% of the total) compared to other ILO projects. However, this percentage cannot be considered a benchmark for future similar projects because it comprises a large amount of time spent by specialists from the ILO Office for the Andean Countries over the entire project implementation time.

Table 11. Original and adjusted Project budget, by type of expenditure

Type of expenditure	Original budget	Adjusted budget
---------------------	-----------------	-----------------

³¹ Originally it had been planned to have one part-time financial administrative assistant throughout the duration of the Project, but for the last 6 months the position was elevated to full-time status.

	Amount (in \$)	% of total	Amount (in \$)	% of total
1. Project staff	145,491	29%	91,852	19%
Coordinator	114,503	23%	31,730	6%
Financial administrative assistant	30,988	6%	60,122	12%
2. Travels by project staff and specialists	47,520	10%	35,920	7%
3. Supplies	9,000	2%	4,075	1%
4. Contracts	220,042	44%	300,029	61%
Seminars and trainings	154,000	31%	213,137	43%
Hiring consultants	52,042	11%	76,280	15%
Project evaluation	14,000	3%	10,612	2%
5. Other expenditures	16,000	3%	6,177	1%
6. Prog. Support Costs^{1/}	56,947	12%	56,947	12%
Total	495,000	100%	495,000	100%

Own calculations based on financial information provided by the ILO Office for Andean Countries

1/ In turn, the ILO provides technical expertise, partially dedicated human resources, office and facilities and programming and administrative support.

77. As at September 2015, the project had executed approximately \$ 475,000, representing 96% of the project budget. This high level of budgetary execution, coupled with the fact that most planned outputs and activities had been carried out (as shown in the previous section) reveals that the project has been efficient in reaching all of its physical targets while adjusting itself to the resources allocated for this. It should also be noted that this level of budgetary execution is very similar by type of expense.

Table 12. Level of budget execution, by type of expenditure

	Budget (in \$)	Budget execution (in \$) ^{1/}	% Executed
1. Project staff	91,852	87,139	95%
Coordinator	31,730	30,364	96%

Financial administrative assistant	60,122	56,775	94%
2. Travels by project staff and specialists	35,920	35,365	98%
3. Supplies	4,075	3,900	96%
4. Contracts	300,029	302,710	101%
Seminars and trainings	213,137	214,359	101%
Hiring consultants	76,280	76,139	100%
Project evaluation	10,612	12,212	115%
5. Other expenditures	6,177	4,406	71%
6. Prog. Support Costs	56,947	42,167	74%
Total	495,000	475,686	96%

Own calculations based on financial information provided by the ILO Office for Andean Countries

1/ Budget execution includes amounts disbursed and committed as at September 28, 2015.

5.4.5. Management effectiveness.

78. The project has been developed under the direction of the ILO Office for the Andean Countries. Until February 2015, in the absence of a national coordinator in Colombia, it was the Labor Law and Labor Administration Specialist from that Office who served as project manager and project coordinator, planning and implementing activities, coordinating with constituents, and providing the required technical assistance with the support of external collaborators.

79. Although the Labour Law and Labour Administration Specialist from the ILO Office for Andean Countries traveled many times to Colombia and his technical contribution to the planning and development of outputs and activities is recognized by all the representatives of the constituents who were interviewed, the lack a national coordinator in Colombia since the start of the project prevented a more fluid contact with constituents, as well as the possibility of more frequent meetings to discuss the project's progress.

80. During 2014 some of the activities provided for in the Project design were carried out (with the help of national consultants). However, other activities were still pending and could not have been done had the extension of the project until September 2015 not been approved. One factor that explains this delay is the lack of a national project coordinator in Colombia due to the reasons mentioned in the preceding section. Another factor is that 2014 was an election year in Colombia and, as in any country in Latin America and the Caribbean, the months running up to a presidential election (and even the months after that) are often uncertain times within public institutions, where

new priorities of a more political nature take hold delaying implementation of outputs and activities of projects such as the one under evaluation.

81. As recently as March 2015 the project hired a full-time national coordinator and continued on with the support of national consultants. This contributed to the project finally being able to perform the planned outputs and activities: in fact, from a financial point of view, nearly half of the project budget was executed during 2015.³²
82. The project has received assistance in both its design and implementation from other ILO units, such as GOVERNANCE and TRIPARTISM, ACTEMP and ACTRAV, and the ILO Office for Andean Countries. GOVERNANCE AND TRIPARTISM have been administrative and technical backstopping unit, participating in the approval of work plans, budgetary and technical reviews, and liaising with and reporting to the donor. ACTRAV and ACTEMP have made contributions to outputs and activities involving the presence of workers, employers and their respective organizations, and to the calls for these organizations to participate in the activities.

Coordination with constituents and with other ILO projects

83. Workers' and employers' organizations and State authorities have been beneficiaries of the training activities of the Project, and have been actively involved in the design of some of these activities, especially those related to the second objective.³³ Also worth noting, as an example of complementarity between the Project and other constituents' projects aimed at women, young people and Afro-Colombians, is that at the workshops and meetings conducted by the Project participants were made aware of the existence of these other projects, and based on the questions and feedback from participants, implementers of these projects would adjust and improve their design.³⁴

³² See [Annex 9](#) for more details.

³³ For example, for Output 2.1, labor experts provided suggestions on the methodology for the workshops; union specialists were the lecturers on several topics; and the unions selected the workers who received the training. For Output 2.2, the Fiscal Committee of the ANDI participated in designing the workshops aimed at the employers. For Output 2.3, the training program methodology was consulted with employers' and workers' organizations; and the Ministry of Labor and the workers' and employers' organizations were involved in the selection of participating enterprises.

³⁴ Perhaps the most noteworthy case is that of the Afro-descendants Employability Project (AFREM), conducted by Chamber of Commerce and the SENA in Cartagena, aimed at people between 18 and 40 years identifying themselves as Afro-descendants. Between December 2013 and June 2015, this project provided 300 beneficiaries with work-based training and comprehensive training for work in services and paid employment.

84. Project similarities with other ILO projects in Colombia in terms of the issues of social dialogue and fundamental rights at work, strategies (research, training, design of action plans) and the work with the Subcommittees has enabled the Project to build on some of the existing strategies, tools and other staff employed in these projects.³⁵
85. However, coordination with constituents and other ILO projects could have been closer and, therefore, it was not possible to fully tap all synergies. A factor in this was the lack of a national coordinator in Colombia, and the fact that the Tripartite High Level Committee³⁶ (which, according to the Project design, was to have an important role in generating synergies among the different projects) has hardly met during the Project implementation period. The differences between the target population Project (women, young people and Afro-Colombians) and the geographic coverage of the intervention (departments of Valle del Cauca and Bolívar) and those of other projects, may have also been a factor.

5.4.6. Impact orientation.

86. The Project's objectives are to strengthen the capacity of tripartite institutions to promote the full realization of the fundamental rights at work with an special emphasis on women, youth and Afro-Colombian workers; and to promote good working relationships between employers and workers and the right to collective bargaining. Although there is no empirical evidence of compliance with these objectives, below are some outcomes of the Project that, over time, could become impacts.³⁷
87. A first outcome is the enhanced operation of the Subcommittees of Bolívar and Valle del Cauca: according to the persons interviewed, these improvements include increased participation in the meetings by senior officials with decision-making powers from the governor's and the mayor's offices, a renewed emphasis by the project on

³⁵ For instance, the train-the-trainer activities under the first objective built on the experience of the project known as "Strengthening institutional forums for tripartite social dialogue and participation of stakeholders at the departmental level in Colombia," funded by the Ministry of Labor of Colombia. Meanwhile, the training activities under the second objective for Output 1 built on the experience of the project known as "Building capacity to promote trade union affiliation and collective bargaining coverage," funded by Norway; and activities for outputs 2 and 3 built on the experience of the project "Promoting compliance with international labor standards in Colombia," funded by USDOL.

³⁶ This Committee was established in Bogotá to guide the technical cooperation of the ILO in the country.

³⁷ The Project has just ended on 30 September, 2015, so it is still early to be conclusive about its impacts and whether these can be attributed solely to the Project intervention.

building a policy on decent work, with emphasis on the target population (which is reflected in the content of the action plans and the minutes of meetings of the Subcommittees) and better skills and preparation among members of the Subcommittees.

88. A second outcome is the increased capacity of these Subcommittees to place the project's thematic platform on the social agenda and to make an impact on public policies at the local level. In Cartagena, the commitment of candidates for governor and mayors (for the period 2016-2019) has been obtained to incorporate decent work concerns into their local development plans after winning the elections in October 2015. In addition, the Subcommittees have contributed to the development of draft ordinances (Valle del Cauca, 2015, approved by the government) and district agreements (Cartagena, 2014, approved by the Council) through which local public policies on decent work have been adopted that explicitly incorporate an special emphasis on the needs of women, young people and Afro-Colombians in the scope of their jurisdiction.
89. By generating these two outcomes, the project will contribute to some degree to comply with result 503 of Colombia's Country Program Outcome ("local-level and national social dialogue Institutions will have been strengthened"), particularly with two of its indicators ("public policies with a focus on decent work in at least 12 departments or municipalities will have been developed" and "tripartite participation rate in the Departmental Subcommittees will have been improved"). Also, it will be contributing to the achievement of Outcome # 12 of the ILO Program and Budget ("tripartism and strengthened labor market governance contribute to effective social dialogue and sound industrial relations"), specifically to indicator 12.1 "number of member States that, with ILO support, strengthen social dialogue institutions and mechanisms in line with international labor standards."
90. Another important outcome has been the strengthening of the CLAF, which is reflected in the higher positioning of the CLAF before the Ministry of Labor, the governor's office, the mayor's office, the Chamber of Commerce, the ANDI, and the unions, as an institution seeking to reduce racial discrimination at work, is part since 2015 of the Subcommittees of Valle del Cauca and Bolivar, and has already prepared a national action plan and several departmental plans. It is also worth noting that in the ranking made by the CLAF of its own

departmental bodies,³⁸ the only two that are ranked at a “good” level are those of Valle del Cauca and Bolívar, that is, those that have received support from the Project.

91. A fourth positive outcome is that, according to those interviewed, workers’ and employers’ organizations beneficiaries of the Project training have a better understanding of the current national regulations and understand collective bargaining not as a strategy to “defeat a rival” but as an integral strategy where all stand to gain. However, it should be noted that implementation within enterprises of this greater understanding and knowledge of techniques and skills for collective bargaining is an outcome that can only be achieved in the medium term, not now when the project has just ended.
92. The evaluation considers that the first three outcomes mentioned can be attributed largely to the Project’s intervention, as no other projects are known to have given priority to working with the Subcommittees of Valle del Cauca and Bolívar, and with the CLAF. Meanwhile, the training activities and technical assistance of other ILO projects certainly contributed to the fourth outcome.

Longer-term impacts

93. ¿To what an extent can these outcomes contribute in the future to advancing the realization of fundamental rights at work for women, young people and Afro-Colombians in terms of improving labor relations and reducing conflicts and other long-term impacts? Here are some thoughts on the subject:
94. First, this type of impacts cannot be required of a project so focused as this one, as the coverage targets of activities are smaller (for instance, the number of enterprises participating in collective bargaining workshops is very insignificant compared to the total number of enterprises in Colombia or in any given department in Colombia). In the best of cases this requirement may be made if an entire country intervention strategy were being (including several complementary projects together) aimed at precisely promoting the realization of fundamental rights at work. And even so, in the generation of this type of impacts other factors in the political, social

³⁸ To this end, they take into account the following criteria: (A) The local group meets periodically; (b) Develops policy initiatives for protection of the Afro-Colombian workforce; (c) Is aware of and endorses the conclusions of the second Afro-Colombian Labour Forum; and (d) Meets the economic and logistical conditions to ensure the operation of the Regional Chapter.

and economic context will always have an influence, and cannot be controlled even by a strategy of comprehensive country-level intervention.

95. Secondly, we should discuss what indicators would best reflect such impacts. Among the most common ones are the unionization rate (percentage of unionized workers / employed population) and the rate of collective bargaining (workers covered by collective agreements / employed population). However, the main limitation is that there are no official figures of the value of both indicators,³⁹ and without a “baseline” value it will not be possible to measure whether there has been a positive or negative change over a given period of time. According to the ENS the level of unionization of workers would be between 4% and 6%, while the level of collective bargaining would be between 2% and 4%, figures that match those expressed by most people interviewed during the field mission. Regardless of the value of the indicator, there is consensus that the indicators remain very low and that little progress has been made in recent years.
96. Other indicators that could also be used to measure the impact of medium- and long-term interventions such as the Project's are the number of public policies generated by the Subcommittees, the number of enterprises that have implemented the collective bargaining tools and techniques promoted by the Project, the number of enterprises that have implemented conflict prevention strategies, and even indicators that take into account the level of compliance with the collective bargaining agreements and the quality of those agreements (for example, indicators relating not only to wages but also to productivity, health and safety, training, etc.).
97. Regarding impacts in typical labor market indicators (such as employment rates, employment, unemployment) and the vulnerability of groups such as women and youth, improvements in the values of these indicators take time to materialize and it is something that should be taken into account when aiming to assess this type of impacts. For example, Annex 10 shows that in two years the variation in most labor market indicators is less than one percentage point, both nationally and in the departments of Bolívar and Valle del Cauca.

³⁹ A trade union census does not exist in Colombia. Moreover, the Ministry of Labor only requires unions to register the organization's charter, the number of people who make up the organization, and the list of members of the board of directors. It does not require the organization to provide its domicile, demanding only that the information on the board of directors be updated as necessary.

5.4.7. Sustainability orientation

98. If it is early to conclude about the impact of the Project, it is even more premature to conclude about the sustainability of the Project, so again here we only mention some preliminary ideas on the sustainability of the outcomes achieved.
99. In the case of the Subcommittees of Valle del Cauca and Bolivar a key factor to sustain improvements in performance is the presence of an active Technical Secretariat held by a professional whose primary (if not exclusive) function should be precisely to build the capacities of the Subcommittees. In this sense, it is a positive thing that, according to the interviews conducted, the Ministry of Labor has included in next year's budget the resources necessary to have a technical secretary. However, there is no information on whether this applies to all or only some Subcommittees (and in the latter case, whether the Subcommittees of Valle del Cauca and Bolivar are included) and whether these technical secretaries are going to engage in this role exclusively or primarily.
100. Other critical elements to the sustainability of the Subcommittees include having significant trade union presence, monitoring and implementing action plans, disseminating their results to society, exercising their role in prevention, conflict mediation and resolution, and having the necessary financing. According to the interviews, given this scenario, the current perspective of the Subcommittee of Valle del Cauca is more favorable than that of Bolivar, although Valle del Cauca is not yet at the institutional level of Antioquía, perhaps the most established of all the Subcommittees in the country.
101. In relation to the capacity for advocacy of these Subcommittees for local public policies on decent work, the district agreement (Cartagena) and the draft ordinance (in Valle del Cauca) represent important progress, even though their sustainability depends on the generation of labor insertion, decent work, and income generation policies and plans from these documents on behalf of the most vulnerable populations. Also, the content of these documents should be reflected in plans for departmental and municipal development developed during the first half of next year. This way, financing would be guaranteed for at least four years to implement actions aimed at promoting decent work and protecting the fundamental rights at work of the Project's target population.

102. The consolidation of the achievements of the project in terms of the CLAF has been contingent on different elements, such as access to funding to carry out the strategies and activities provided for in its plans of action and greater coordination with the trade union federations to better position itself before the constituents and society.

Capacity and will of constituents

103. Sustainability over time of the capacities generated by the project among representatives of employers' and workers' organizations and of the Ministry of Labor depends, among other factors, on the operationalization of "train-the-trainer" strategy provided for in the Project; that is, those who received the training will convey the learnings to their union or organization.
104. It is necessary that evidence of greater willingness and readiness of employers and workers to promote decent work and the realization of fundamental rights at work (for example, through greater participation, discussions and agreements within the Subcommittees or their understanding of collective bargaining as a comprehensive strategy where both parties stand to gain) be reflected in more concrete results, such as the investment of financial resources on actions in different thematic areas where progress has been made; compliance with the law by employers and less use of figures such as collective pacts; and greater consistency between the discourse and the actions of organizations.⁴⁰

Legal, social, political, institutional and economic factors affecting sustainability.

105. In the last 5 or 10 years, several changes have been produced in the legal, social, political and institutional context in Colombia that promote the sustainability of interventions such as the project's. Namely: greater political will of the government on the issue of social dialogue, the creation and operation of Departmental Subcommittees and other forums for dialogue among constituents, the new legal framework, government budget allocations for policies and agreements on decent work, collective bargaining agreements in the public sector, the reduction of cases of violence against union leaders, and some improvements in the functioning of labor inspections.
106. However, one element in this context limiting the possibility of success of interventions (such as the Project's) aimed at promoting

⁴⁰ As an example of this contradiction between discourse and action, the representative of an employers' organization who was interviewed stated that "*unions accuse employers of discrimination against women but have almost no women on their boards of directors*" and that "*the unions demand social responsibility from companies, but they themselves use service delivery orders to engage staff.*"

good labor relations and the right to collective bargaining is the fact that labor legislation in Colombia tolerates the use of bargaining modalities that undermine trade union organizations, mainly in the form of the abusive use of collective pacts.⁴¹ In the public sector, although collective bargaining is mandatory by law, there are some weaknesses as regards recruitment issues: according to interviews conducted in the field, there are public institutions whose number of workers hired through service delivery orders (OPS, by its acronym in Spanish: *órdenes de prestación de servicios*) exceeds that of those who are on the payroll, which limits the exercise of their labor rights.

107. Other contextual factors that limit the sustainability of interventions such as the Project's are the lack of dissemination of labor standards (especially to small businesses that often do not have a legal office or department), breach of labor laws in Colombia,⁴² impunity in cases of violence against trade union leaders, delays in the resolution of labor disputes, and the lack of preventive inspections. In this regard, the report "Social Dialogue Interventions: What works and why? A synthesis review 2002 – 2012," ILO, shows the need to improve labor legislation and strengthen the capacity of labor administration so that this type of interventions will have better results.

108. As for national policies and plans, it is a good thing for the sustainability of the Project that the National Development Plan 2014-2018 of Colombia, unlike previous plans, consolidates the whole issue of decent work in a single article (72 - National Policy on Decent Work), which gives legitimacy to everything that can be done in this area. Article 73 of the Plan also refers exclusively to strengthening social dialogue and the realization of the fundamental rights at work. In addition, three policy issues which the government wants to prioritize are the policy on decent work, a culture of peace and reparation for victims, rural and agricultural development, with social dialogue as a cross-cutting theme.

109. Considering that the realization of fundamental rights at work in the case of young people and women means, first, that these population segments enter the job market, the existence (both in Valle del Cauca and Bolivar) of policies, plans, programs and public

⁴¹ These pacts often offer workers greater benefits than those in the collective agreements (for example, more days off and higher salaries) but are offered only to non-unionized workers. One of the main problems here is that it is easier for the employer to ignore the terms of such pacts, which occurs when there is a drop in company productivity, output and sales. That is, these practices undermine the realization of fundamental rights at work and the protection of labor relations.

⁴² For instance, belaboring the collective pacts, the law allows this figure as long as it does not offer workers greater benefits than those that would be obtained from a collective agreement, but in practice, as mentioned above, this condition is not always met. Another example is Law 1453 of 2011, whereby an employer who restricts the right to collective bargaining and freedom of association will be punished by imprisonment. Nevertheless, in practice, only fines are handed out.

employment projects aimed at youth and women is a positive thing. However, the impact of policies and plans on employment for these two population groups has not yet been evaluated; and two aspects limiting the amount of people who can benefit from programs and projects are the lack of resources in public institutions and (at least in the case of Cartagena) the existence of too few medium or large-sized enterprises, rendering the promotion of women's paid (dependent) employment less effective compared to promoting self-employment through small formal production units instead. And in general the existence of an economic, social and political environment conducive to enterprise creation and development of entrepreneurial activity is necessary.

6. Conclusions.

6.1. Conclusions.

Relevance

1. The socio-economic and labor market indicators in Colombia in 2012 reveal a more critical situation for women, young people and Afro-Colombians (relative to men, adults and the mestizo population respectively), justify the existence of the Project, whose development goal is to promote the implementation of fundamental rights at work with particular attention precisely on women, young people and Afro-Colombians.
2. The Project's immediate objective to strengthen the technical and management capacities of tripartite social dialogue institutions, such as the Subcommittees, is justified because previous assessments of other ILO projects in Colombia show that effective tripartite dialogue at the local level is necessary to improve the working conditions of the target population; and because in 2012 the Subcommittees exhibited weaknesses such as insufficient capacity of its members for dialogue and negotiation, lack of technical, financial and technological resources, and lack of commitment from the mayor's and governor's offices.
3. The relevance, legality and legitimacy of the Project are also underpinned by the fact that the Project's objectives, outputs and activities are framed within policies, plans and measures that the Colombian government, both nationally and locally, has adopted in recent years on the matter of social dialogue, decent work and fundamental rights at work; as well as within the strategy to strengthen social dialogue for the implementation of fundamental rights at work that the ILO has been implemented in Colombia since 2008.

Validity of the Project design

4. The Project design has an adequate top-down logic because its activities are necessary for obtaining the outputs, which in turn are necessary for achieving the immediate objectives; also, within each objective, there is consistency between the products that comprise it.
5. However, the project also has limitations in its design, namely the lack of clarity regarding the complementarity between the two immediate objectives, and how one objective can benefit from progress in the other. Furthermore, the magnitude, effects and possibilities of occurrence of each of the identified risk factors were not properly dimensioned: the political and social situation in Colombia in 2014 and 2015, which in practice hindered tripartite dialogue and inclusion of Project concerns on the agenda of the CPCPSL and prevented the attainment of precisely the output linked to the CPCPSL.
6. Project design provided for indicators and targets for all of its activities, outputs and objectives, but these indicators do not always adequately reflect that which is intended to get done or to be generated. At the activities level, some indicators are more closely linked to the outcomes of the activities and, therefore, function rather as output indicators; while at the outputs and objectives level the source of information on the values of indicators for improved knowledge and skills is very subjective (perception surveys administered to participants of training programs), which limits the reliability and validity of results.

Efficiency

7. Project effectiveness is reflected in the fact that the majority of outputs and activities outlined in the logical framework have been completed for both the first and the second specific objectives, and in some cases the planned targets have even been surpassed.
8. The main activities in achieving the project outputs and objectives were the forums on decent work and public policy, the workshops on collective bargaining aimed at unionists, and the training programs on fundamental rights at work aimed at members of the Subcommittees, representatives of employers' and workers' organizations and the Ministry of Labor, women, youth and Afro-Colombians. The total number of beneficiaries of these forums, programs and workshops clearly exceeded the planned target.
9. Also important in achieving the outputs and objectives was the technical assistance provided for the Subcommittees to prepare its action plans to promote fundamental rights at work and address the employment needs of women, young people and Afro-Colombians; as well as the events

with candidates for governor and mayor; the inclusion of the CLAF in all workshops and activities in order to disseminate its objectives and activities; and the technical assistance provided for the CLAF to prepare its action plans. In all these activities the targets set in the design were achieved.

10. However, the planned were not achieved for two outputs: under the first specific objective, the work that had been scheduled to be carried out with the CPCPSL to reach tripartite agreements on legal proposals and policies aimed at women, young people and Afro-Colombians regarding fundamental rights at work was not carried; while under the second specific objective, the number of enterprises that participated in the awareness and information workshops on labor rights and conflict prevention and resolution mechanisms, was well below the planned target.

Efficiency

11. The project shows a high level of financial performance (96% of the allocated budget), which, added to the high level of efficiency, shows that the project has been efficient in the use of resources, as it met all the physical targets within the overall resources available.
12. The distribution of the budget executed by type of spending is consistent with the results of the technical implementation of the Project. Expenditures on workshops, trainings, forums, courses and seminars represent approximately 60% of the budget execution, which is consistent with having achieved and even exceeded the targets under such activities. On the other hand, project staff costs represent 20% of the budget executed, which is consistent with a full-time coordinator being hired in March 2015.

Management effectiveness

13. The project has been developed under the direction of the ILO Office for the Andean Countries located in Peru. Until February 2015, as the project did not have a national coordinator, it was the Labour Law and Labor Administration Specialist from said Office who in practice exercised the functions of coordinator. His technical contributions to the planning and development of Project outputs and activities was recognized by constituent representatives interviewed.
14. However, the lack of a national coordinator in Colombia during 2014 helps explain why the end of the Project's original term several activities were still pending completion. This absence of a coordinator also prevented a more fluid contact with constituents as well as the possibility of more frequent meetings to follow up on the progress and constraints of the Project.

15. Workers' and employers' organizations and State authorities have been beneficiaries of the training activities of the Project, and have been actively involved in the design of some of these activities, especially those related to the second objective. Also, the similarities with other projects implemented by the ILO in Colombia in terms of thematic platform, stakeholders and activities undertaken has allowed the Project to take advantage of strategies, tools and staff employed in these other projects.
16. However, coordination with constituents and other ILO projects could have been closer and, therefore, it was not possible to fully tap all synergies. A factor in this was the lack of a national coordinator in Colombia, and the fact that the Tripartite High Level Committee (which was going to have an important role in generating these synergies among the various projects) has hardly met during the Project implementation period.

Impact orientation

17. Actions conducted between 2013 and 2015 to generate and disseminate knowledge and provide training and technical assistance to the Subcommittees, as well as activities with the candidates for governor and mayor have contributed to improve the performance of the Subcommittees of Bolívar and Valle del Cauca. This is reflected in increased participation within the Subcommittees of mayor's office and governor's office officials with decision-making power; the greater importance given to building the decent work policy with an emphasis on the populations targeted by the Project; and the improved capacities of the members of the Subcommittees.
18. These actions carried out by the project have also contributed to these Subcommittees placing the Project's concerns on the social agenda, and advancing advocacy for public policies at the local level. The Subcommittees have contributed to efforts to draft ordinances (Valle del Cauca, 2015, approved by the government) and district-wide agreements (Cartagena, 2014, approved by the city council) through which local public policies on decent work have been adopted, which expressly call for addressing the needs of women, young people and Afro-Colombians within the scope of their jurisdiction.
19. Actions to garner more visibility for the CLAF, and provide more technical assistance to prepare its action plans have contributed to strengthening the CLAF. This is reflected in its position before the Ministry of Labor, the governor's office, the mayor's office, the ANDI, and the unions, as an institution that seeks to reduce racial discrimination in the workplace. Also, since 2015, the CLAF is part of the Subcommittees of Valle del

Cauca and Bolivar, having been involved in preparing the draft public policy ordinance on decent work in Valle del Cauca. Moreover, the CLAF already has in place a national action plan and several departmental plans.

20. The evaluation considers that these three outcomes (strengthening the Subcommittees, public policy advocacy, and strengthening the CLAF) can be attributed largely to the Project's intervention, as no other projects are known to have given priority to working with the Subcommittees of Valle del Cauca and Bolívar and the CLAF.
21. Training activities targeting workers' and employers' organizations regarding the exercise of the rights to freedom of association and collective bargaining, as well as strategies for conflict prevention and resolution, have helped both sides to understand better the current national regulations and to consider collective bargaining as a comprehensive win-win strategy. Unlike in the three previous outcomes, training activities and technical assistance provided by other ILO projects have also contributed to this outcome.

Sustainability orientation

22. In terms of the sustainability of the Subcommittees, it is positive thing that the Ministry of Labour has included in next year's budget the resources necessary to hire a technical secretary. However, no information is available on whether this applies to all Subcommittees and whether these technical secretaries are going to engage in this role exclusively or primarily.
23. Other critical elements to the sustainability of the Subcommittees include having significant trade union presence, monitoring and implementing action plans, disseminating their results to society, exercising their role in prevention, conflict mediation and resolution, and having the necessary financing. According to the interviews, the current view on this elements of the Subcommittee of Valle del Cauca is more favorable than that of Bolivar.
24. In relation to the Subcommittees' capacity for advocacy for local public policies on decent work, progress sustainability will depend on whether the contents of the district draft agreements (Cartagena) and of the draft ordinance (Valle del Cauca) are reflected in the departmental development plans 2016 - 2019, and on whether policies and plans for promoting employment, decent work and income generation for the most vulnerable populations are generated based on these documents.

25. Greater political will of the government on the issue of social dialogue, the creation and operation of Subcommittees, public budget allocations for decent work policies and agreements, collective bargaining agreements in the public sector, and the reduction in violence against union leaders are factors in the sustainability of Project interventions in Colombia. It is also a positive thing that Colombia's National Development Plan 2014-2018 has embodied in two articles the issue of decent work, strengthening social dialogue and compliance with fundamental rights at work. This gives legitimacy to potential actions in these areas.
26. However, there are contextual factors limiting the sustainability of Project interventions, such as the use of negotiation modalities that weaken trade unions, (such as collective agreements), the breach of labor laws in Colombia, impunity in cases of violence against trade union leaders, and delays in resolving labor disputes.

6.2. Lessons learned.

1. Surveys of satisfaction with the quality and usefulness of training workshops or programs are useful for adjusting some aspects of the methodology and/or the subject matter for future workshops or programs, but not for measuring results (gains in skills or knowledge), for which other type of instruments would be required, such as pre- and post-knowledge tests.
2. Generating lasting trust between employers' and workers' organizations, requires not only the good will and disposition of both sides to promote decent work and compliance with fundamental rights at work, but mainly concrete results, such as investing financial resources to undertake actions in the different thematic areas in which progress is being made; ensuring employers' compliance with the law and reducing the use of figures limiting compliance with fundamental rights at work and protection of labor relations; and greater coherence between the discourse and the actual activities of trade unions.
3. The role of the Subcommittees' Technical Secretariat and more specifically that of the individual in charge of this Technical Secretariat is very important for proper functioning of the Subcommittees. A capable, renowned professional who has credibility before the constituents that can devote himself/herself exclusively (or at least primarily) to the said function may be key to make the Subcommittee a dynamic and efficient forum capable of generating outcomes and results.
4. Estimating the duration of a project should take into account whether there will be significant electoral processes during implementation, as the priority given by constituents to the project in the months before and after

the election will be reduced and therefore fewer activities will get done during that timeframe.

5. Failure to incorporate a gender perspective from the design stage of a project, including, inter alia, setting gender disaggregated targets for some activity and outcome indicators, may be a factor in the reduced participation of women in workshops, programs, forums and other training events.

6.3. Best practices.

1. Project's focus on promoting the exercise of the fundamental rights at work among a specific population consisting of women, young people and Afro-Colombians. It is a best practice because if what is sought is to strengthen the capacity of institutions for social dialogue (in this case the capacities of the Subcommittees) it is essential that technical assistance aim at enhancing tripartite dialogue on a specific thematic platform.
2. Project's provision of technical assistance to the Subcommittees to develop action plans promoting labor market inclusion of women, young people and Afro-Colombians as well as participating in events with the candidates for governor and mayor. It is a good practice as these actions and events complement each other to give priority to the issue of decent work on the candidates' agenda and strengthen the Subcommittees' capacity for advocacy for public policies at the local level.
3. The Project's choosing the Subcommittees of Valle del Cauca and Bolívar based not only on the high proportion of Afro-Colombian population but also on the increased institutional presence of workers' and employers' organizations, as well as the higher level of development compared to other Subcommittees. It is a good practice because institutional capacity is strengthened when the social partner institutions have a certain high level of development.
4. The Project's promoting participation in workshops and training programs of those involved in leadership positions in employers' and workers' organizations (president, director, coordinator, manager, head of unit). It is a good practice because the involvement of these people in training programs enhances political decision-making, by replicating the learnings in their organizations.

6.4. Recommendations

ILO recommendations regarding the evaluated project

1. Systematize and document the lessons learned from those outputs that involve strategies or methodologies that can be replicated on a larger

scale, such as training programs; and socialize the main results and outcomes of the Project among constituents, businesses, civil society and cooperation institutions in order to give priority to these issues on the national and regional agendas and increase the chances of obtaining new financing. *Short-term recommendation / low cost.*

2. Manage political support to obtain the Assembly's approval of the draft public policy ordinance on decent work of Valle del Cauca and, if approved, to provide technical support to promote adoption of the ordinance by the 42 municipalities of the department. Also, provide technical assistance to promote the new authorities' adoption of the public ordinance and the district agreement in the development plans of Valle del Cauca and Bolívar, respectively. *Recommendation linked to conclusion # 24 / short-term / high importance / involves investment of resources.*

Recommendations to the Ministry of Labor and the ILO regarding future similar projects.

3. In working with the subcommittees, prioritize these issues in order to address weaknesses identified with most of the subcommittees: ensure that the Subcommittees have an active Technical Secretariat headed by a professional devoted exclusively (or at least primarily) to the discharge of this function; ensure that the Subcommittees exercise their role of conflict prevention and resolution, extend their reach to the municipal and not just the departmental level; ensure that the ORMETs provide technical support to the Subcommittees. *Recommendation linked to conclusion #22 and #23, and lesson learned #3 / short-term / high importance / involves investment of resources.*
4. In working with the CLAF, prioritize the following issues in order to address constraints within the departmental CLAFs: access to financing so that the CLAFs can carry out the activities set out in their action plans; build the technical capacities of their members to develop projects; and generate greater coordination with the unions in order to better position themselves before the constituents and society. *Recommendation – short term / high importance / involves investment of resources.*
5. In the training programs aimed to the constituents, prioritize the following topics: international rights and national labor standards, and labor dispute prevention. Also, give priority to training in decent work aimed at public officials from the governor's and mayor's offices, the development of industrial action plans, and project design, implementation and monitoring; and, in working with the unions, give priority to strategies to attract younger members and close the gender gaps in unions. *Recommendation linked to lesson learned # 2 / medium-term / high importance / involves investment of resources.*

6. Establish linkages to existing programs and employment integration projects aimed at youth, women and Afro-Colombians. A new intervention could strengthen the design of these programs and projects, giving them visibility, and enhance their implementation with complementary services for greater coverage and impact on the vulnerable population. *Recommendation linked to conclusion # 24 / medium-term / involves investment of resources.*
7. Depending on the budget available, a new project could expand the geographical scope of interventions to new departments or cities, provided the choice is justified following the same technical criteria used by the Project in choosing Valle del Cauca and Bolivar. Priority could be given to interventions targeting those sectors where there is greater breach of the fundamental rights at work, such as in textiles, transport and health care in Bogotá); street vending, taxi service and hotels in Cartagena); and commerce, public security, and sugar cane production in Cali. And the victims of violence and armed conflict could also be included among the beneficiaries. *Recommendation linked to good practice # 3 / medium-term / involves investment of resources.*
8. Reactivate the High Level Tripartite Committee as a forum for discussion and analysis on the progress of projects that form part of the strategy to strengthen social dialogue for promotion of the fundamental rights at work, and for effective use of synergies among these projects. *Recommendation linked to conclusion # 16 / short term / low cost.*
9. Include in the Project design activities to assist and follow up the train-the-trainer strategy to reinforce the positive outcomes generated (knowledge, skills, motivation) and to have evidence of replication by the trainers. *Recommendation – medium term / high importance / involves investment of resources.*
10. Generate a single database of beneficiaries of the training for the various projects in order to identify whether a person has already received a similar training from another project and thus avoid the risk of training and education actions being repetitive and/or involving a duplication of efforts. *Recommendation - short-term / low cost.*
11. The number of public policies generated by the Subcommittees, the number of enterprises applying collective bargaining techniques promoted by the project, the number of enterprises implementing conflict prevention strategies, the level of compliance with collective bargaining agreements and the quality thereof, could be used as indicators for the project's objectives (referring not only to wages, but also to productivity, health and safety, training). Regardless of the indicators used, the criteria or conditions of compliance and the "baseline" values should be clearly

specified. *Recommendation linked to conclusion # 6 / medium term / high importance / low cost.*

12. Incorporate targets disaggregated by gender in the logical framework (for training activities, for example) and progress reports. This contributes to highlighting clearly to the implementation team and the constituents the importance of the gender approach for a project, and can lead to a greater participation of women in training programs. *Recommendation linked to lesson learned # 5 / medium term / low cost.*
13. Identify the risk factors (intervention assumptions) involved in the project and, above all, estimate their chances of occurrence, magnitude and possible effects on the performance of project activities and/or achievement of outputs and targets. *Recommendation linked to conclusion # 5 / medium term / low cost.*



Annex 1

INTERNATIONAL LABOUR ORGANIZATION

Terms of Reference for Independent Final Evaluation

Project “Developing tripartite institutions and mechanisms that advocate for and promote the realization of core labour rights in Colombia”

XB Symbol:	COL/13/02/USA
Project title:	Developing tripartite institutions and mechanisms that advocate for and promote the realization of core labour rights in Colombia
Country:	Colombia
P&B Outcome:	Outcome 12: Social Dialogue
CP Outcome:	COL 153
Duration:	24 months
Start date:	30 August 2013
End date:	30 September 2015
Project language:	English
Project budget:	USD 495,000
Project Administrative and Technical Backstopping Unit:	DIALOGUE
Evaluation date:	August – September 2015
Evaluation type:	Final independent evaluation
Evaluation Manager:	Patricia Villegas
Evaluation budget:	Remuneration: USD \$ 7,500 Mission lump sum: USD\$ 2,000

CONTENTS

I.	Introduction and Rationale for the Evaluation.....	65
II.	Project Background and Context	66
III.	Purpose, Scope and Clients of the Evaluation	69
IV.	Key Evaluation Questions	71
V.	Methodology to Be Followed	75
VI.	Main Outputs: Inception Report, Progress Report and Final Report.....	76
VII.	Management Arrangements, Work Plan, Format Requirements and Deadlines.....	77
VIII.	Legal and Ethical Matters.....	81
IX.	Annexes	82

LIST OF ACRONYMS

ANDI	National Business Association of Colombia
CUT	Central Union of Workers
CLAF	Afro-Colombian Labor Council
CPCPSL	Standing Negotiation Committee on Wage and Labor Policies
CTC	Colombian Workers' Confederation
CGT	General Confederation of Workers
IEC	International External Consultant
DAC/OECD	Development Assistance Committee/ Organization for Economic Co-operation and Development
EVAL	Evaluation UNIT
PROCUREMENT	ILO's Procurement Bureau
P&B	ILO's Program and Budget
ILO	International Labour Organization
MoL	Ministry of Labor
M&E	Monitoring and Evaluation
NGO	Non-governmental organization
OFR	Office of Fundamental Rights
PRODOC	Project Document
ToR	Terms of Reference
UNDAF	United Nations Development Action Framework
UNEG	United Nations Evaluation Group
USDOL	United States Department of Labor
USDOS	United States Department of State

I. Introduction and Rationale for the Evaluation

1. These Terms of Reference (TOR) are for the Independent Final Evaluation of the Project *“Development of tripartite mechanisms and institutions that advocate for and promote the realization of core labor rights in Colombia,”* funded by the United States Department of State (USDOS) with a budget of US\$ 495,000 and an initial duration of 18 months.
2. The project is part of the strategy to strengthen social dialogue for the implementation of core labor rights implemented by the ILO since 2008. This strategy has been financed with funds from the Government of Colombia through the Ministry of Labor and has received supplemental funding from the United States Department of State (USDOS), the United States Department of Labor (USDOL), the Norwegian Royal Ministry of Foreign Affairs) and the Ministry of Labor of Canada.
3. According to the terms of the agreement signed with the donor, the project is subject to a **Final Independent Evaluation** and must comply with the norms and standards of the United Nations Evaluation Group (UNEG).
4. This **Final Independent Evaluation** will be conducted by an International Evaluation Consultant and managed by Patricia Villegas as Evaluation Manager. The evaluation process will be of a participatory nature and involve the stakeholders during the process. USDOS, USDOL, the ILO Office, the tripartite constituents and other parties involved in the project implementation are the main users of the evaluation outcomes and lessons learned.
5. This evaluation is expected to identify the project’s impact and main achievements and the contribution to the ILO Social Dialogue strategy. Specifically, it is intended to assess the project outcomes in terms of i) strengthening social dialogue institutions at the local level for promoting implementation of fundamental labor rights at work with a particular emphasis on women, youth and Afro-Colombians; and ii) the exercise of the right of collective bargaining at sectoral and enterprise levels. It will also assess the achievement intermediate outcomes such as addressing the needs and interests of women, young people and Afro-Colombians and their inclusion in the 2015-2019 local development plans of selected subcommittees (Valle del Cauca and Bolívar), as well as the implementation of strategies for conflict prevention and the exercise of collective bargaining rights within enterprises.
6. Further, the evaluation is intended to identify key factors in achieving the objectives, what worked and what did not and why. It will also verify to what an extent the recommendations made in the context of the preceding final evaluation COL/08/01/USA were taken into account, or why not.
7. As detailed in Section III of these Terms of Reference, the evaluation will assess all of the ILO evaluation criteria for independent evaluations. In this regard, the evaluation will verify the relevance of the intervention, the coherence of the project design, the achievements of the project in terms of the outputs that were committed to be delivered, whether the

implementation was carried out efficiently or not, whether there is indication of positive changes generated as a result of project interventions, and whether good practices or lessons learned were generated that can be useful to the donor, the Colombian Government and the ILO for replication in future interventions.

8. The evaluation will be conducted from the last week of August through the whole month of September 2015. At the time of conducting the evaluation, project activities will still be underway. Costs associated with the evaluation will be borne by the Project.
9. The evaluation report will be produced in Spanish.

II. Project Background and Context

10. The project is being implemented in a context of economic growth although with insufficient jobs and with situation of inequality that does not go down. Moreover, the rights to freedom of association and collective bargaining are not fully exercised; on the contrary, hundreds of union leaders have been victims of violence and the fundamental labor rights have been systematically breached. However, in the last decade there has been increased awareness in the country that the causes and solutions to these problems stem from the workplace itself, and the importance of building trust among stakeholders and exercising the rights to freedom of association and collective bargaining is generally recognized. The government has reaffirmed its commitment to address this situation and in 2006 the government and social organizations signed the Agreement on “Freedom of association and democracy in Colombia,” and in 2011 signed the “Labor Action Plan” with the United States. The National Development Plan 2010-2014 includes among its objectives the promotion of social dialogue; and the Plan for Employment Equity seeks to develop measures to prevent gender-based discrimination and inequality in the workplace. Moreover, the government has signed agreements with the ILO in order to use government resources to strengthen forums for social dialogue and ensure compliance with fundamental rights at work.
11. Among the topics to be addressed by the CPCPSL and the subcommittees is the vulnerable labor market situation of women, young people and Afro-Colombians as these groups frequently find themselves caught in precarious working and living conditions. In 2011, Colombia had the highest unemployment rate in the region, according to figures from the ILO Labour Overview, and approximately 62% of Afro-Colombians lived in poverty. Valle del Cauca and Bolívar were among the departments with the largest concentration of African-descendant communities. The vulnerability of these groups is compounded by their high concentration in the informal economy where fundamental labor rights are largely ignored.
12. Since 2008, the ILO Office for the Andean Countries has been developing a technical cooperation program to strengthen the operation of these Departmental Subcommittees, by training the local-level tripartite actors to enable them to plan and implement actions to promote decent work and compliance with fundamental rights at work. While not all the 32 departments of the country have functioning tripartite bodies, at least 26 meet with some frequency. Of these, 20 have been developing formal plans, with greater or lesser success in achieving results. The existence of labor disputes makes it difficult to advance in the construction of agreements on other priority issues. Although the departmental subcommittees

have the power to influence the solution of such conflicts, according to Law 278, not all exercise this power and those that do often lack the tools and technical capacity to have a more effective influence.

13. As part of this technical cooperation program, between 2008 and 2012, the ILO implemented the project “Promoting fundamental principles and rights at work” funded by USDOS. The project objectives were to: i) promote and institutionalize tripartite dialogue by providing support to the National Committee on labor and wage policies and the Special Committee for the Handling of Conflicts Referred to the ILO; ii) better equip the judiciary to deal with cases of violations of labor law and international labor standards; and iii) build the capacities of government officials and social partners to resolve conflicts and negotiate collective agreements. This project was taken as the basis for the design of the project COL/13/02/USA, the subject of this evaluation, with regard to immediate objective 2.
14. The project was designed seeking to generate synergies with ILO projects underway, specifically with the project “Promoting Compliance with International Labor Standards in Colombia” financed by USDOL. Although both projects seek to strengthen the Standing Negotiation Committee on Wage and Labor Policies (CPCPSL), the USDOL project focuses on capacity building with an emphasis on structures, operations and processes for meaningful social dialogue, while *the Project* seeks to strengthen the capacity of tripartite constituents to enhance the technical quality and relevance of their capacity for debate, decision-making and proposal design.
15. The ILO established in 2008 a high-level tripartite committee to coordinate technical cooperation in the country. It is the responsibility of the evaluator to determine whether synergies, complementarity and coordination were generated between the Project and other ILO projects and to identify what achievements that can be attributed solely to the Project.
16. The project was initially scheduled for 18 months from 30 August 2013 until 28 February 2015. It was subsequently extended until May 31, 2015 and again extended until 30 September 2015. These extensions did not involve additional funding but they did entail a review of the logical framework, which led to the deletion of Output 1.2
17. **Project Development Objective:** The project aims to develop social dialogue institutions and mechanisms that promote and advocate for the realization of fundamental labor rights in Colombia. (See Logical Framework: Annex 2).
18. **Project Immediate Objectives:**
 - Immediate Objective 1: Strengthen the capacity of tripartite dialogue institutions to promote the full implementation of fundamental labor rights with particular emphasis on women, young people and Afro-Colombians.
 - Immediate Objective 2: Promote sound industrial relations and the right to collective bargaining at sectoral and enterprise levels.
19. **The strategy.** The project is part of a long-term strategy to strengthen tripartite social dialogue, both nationally and locally, building synergies with other ILO cooperation projects implemented in Colombia. The ILO, through the Project, provided technical assistance to the

Standing Negotiation Committee on Wage and Labor Policies (CPCPSL) and the Subcommittees of Valle del Cauca and Bolívar to promote the full implementation of fundamental labor rights with particular emphasis on women, young people and Afro-Colombians. The following lines of action were pursued: (i) generation of knowledge about the labor market situation of these groups and the barriers they face in exercising their fundamental rights at work; (ii) capacity building aimed at the CPCPSL, Subcommittees, women, youth and Afro-Colombian members of social organizations, and the Afro-Colombian Labor Council; (iii) provision of technical assistance for the design and adoption of action plans that will address the rights and employment needs of these groups and their integration into the development plans for the period 2015 -2019 of the departments of Bolívar and Valle del Cauca; (iiii) provision of training aimed at employers' and workers' organizations on the exercise of the rights to freedom of association and collective bargaining.

20. Among the issues to be addressed in the Strategy are:

- Accompanying departmental subcommittees of Valle de Cauca and Bolívar in analyzing the employment situation of women, young people and Afro-Colombians in order to enable the subcommittees to develop action plans that will address the needs of these vulnerable groups and to incorporate them into the Local Development Plans for the period 2015-2019.
 - Building capacities of tripartite actors through a Training-of-Trainers program on fundamental labor rights, relevant national legislation, social dialogue, practices to reduce inequality and vulnerability in the labor market, etc. These trainers in turn would focus their efforts on the departments of Valle del Cauca and Bolívar and deliver training on these issues to women, young people and Afro-Colombian leaders of the subcommittees, social organizations and the Afro Colombian Labor Council.
 - Provide consultancy to the National Committee for organizing social dialogue roundtables on youth and women, made up of tripartite leaders trained by the Project. Discussions at these roundtables would generate proposals for fundamental labor rights and decent work for women, youth and Afro-Colombians, develop the Youth Employment Policy and provide recommendations for tripartite implementation of the Plan for Equal Employment Opportunities. The consultancy services rendered to the National Committee included discussion sessions to improve and adopt some of the proposals generated at the workshops. This item was removed during project implementation in coordination with the donor; and assistance to CPCPSL was reduced to the production of a National Diagnostic Survey. Capacity building aimed at workers' organizations to improve coverage and quality of collective bargaining agreements in Valle del Cauca and Bolívar, by designing a training program on the right of collective bargaining, conflict prevention and resolution and training for trainers, to be implemented by the organizations themselves.
 - Capacity building aimed at the Afro-Colombian Labor Council in partnership with the Center for Solidarity, through assistance in their strategic planning, training on international standards and national legislation acknowledging the rights of the Afro-Colombian population, assistance in identifying priorities and development of technical cooperation projects.
 - Capacity building aimed at employers' organizations in compliance with fundamental rights at work, particularly freedom of association and collective bargaining at sectoral and enterprise levels. Consultancy on the design of the workshops aimed at training companies to improve or incorporate conflict prevention and collective bargaining strategies in their training programs.
21. The list of outputs and main activities that the project has drawn up as of the start date of the evaluation process can be found in [Annex 3](#):

22. Direct beneficiaries:

- ✓ Ministry of Labour, trade union confederations (CGT, CUT and CTC) and the employer's organization, ANDI.
- ✓ Women, youth and Afro-Colombian leaders of the Ministry of Labour and Social Organizations
- ✓ CPCPSL and subcommittees (Valle del Cauca and Bolívar)
- ✓ Afro-Colombian Labor Council
- ✓ Partners: Center for Solidarity (joint work with the Afro-Colombian Labor Council)

23. **Other Project beneficiaries:** The project also seeks synergies with other technical cooperation projects implemented by the ILO Project Office in Colombia, such as the project *Promoting compliance with international labor standards in Colombia*, funded by the United States Department of Labor, the project *Strengthening institutional forums for tripartite social dialogue and tripartite participation of social actors at departmental level in Colombia*, which has funding from the Ministry of Labor of Colombia; and the project *Building capacity to promote trade union affiliation and wider collective bargaining coverage*, funded by the Norwegian Royal Ministry of Foreign Affairs.

III. Purpose, Scope and Clients of the Evaluation

24. The ILO evaluation policy and the memorandum of approval of the Project provide that an **Independent Final Evaluation** shall be conducted. The resources allocated in the Project budget for evaluation activities may only be used for those purposes. Independent evaluations are to be managed by an independent Evaluation Manager and should be submitted to EVAL for approval before dissemination to the donor through PARDEV. The Independent Final Evaluation will help the ILO to systematize lessons learned and best practices from the process and generate knowledge about the best strategy to follow in future similarly-themed projects and be accountable to their constituents for achievements made under these interventions.
25. This evaluation will be conducted during the last month of the project, with some activities still pending implementation, especially those relating to Objective 2.
26. It is worth mentioning that the project "Promoting fundamental principles and rights at work" (COL/08/01/USA) was evaluated in 2012 and represents the main antecedent of this project. It is also important to review the evaluations of the projects "Promoting compliance with international labor standards in Colombia" (COL/11/04/USA), "Strengthening institutional forums for tripartite social dialogue and participation of social actors at departmental level in Colombia" (COL/13/02/COL and COL/14/01/COL)," and "Developing the capacity to promote trade union affiliation and wider collective bargaining coverage" (COL/13/05/NOR).
27. This independent final evaluation will systematically and objectively determine the achievements and fulfillment of goals while identifying what worked and what did not according to the approved design, with the purpose of improving the design for future initiatives pursuant to the following objectives:

- Determine the relevance of the development objective, immediate objectives, outputs and activities under the Project's logical framework.
- Assess the consistency of the project development strategy and methodology and determine the effectiveness of indicators to measure the expected targets and outcomes.
- Measure compliance with project goals, evaluating to what an extent expected results were achieved for each of the Project's two immediate objectives.
- Analyze and assess the efficiency and effectiveness of the Project's management approach.
- Assess Project outcomes/impacts and the sustainability of Project results.
- Identify good practices and lessons learned from the intervention in order to maximize the experience gained.

28. **Scope:** The evaluation includes an assessment and analysis of all the activities specified in Project's logical framework (and subsequent amendment), that were conducted between September 2013 and September 2015.

The geographical scope of the assessment is basically Bogotá and the departments of Valle del Cauca and Bolívar.

Fieldwork. Fieldwork will include all the departmental subcommittees that have been the subject of Project intervention, namely, the Subcommittee of Valle del Cauca (Cali) and the Subcommittee on Bolivar (Cartagena), as well as interviews conducted in Bogotá.

29. **Clients:** The clients of the evaluation are:

- **External clients:**
 - United States Department of State
 - Ministry of Labor of Colombia
 - Trade Union Federations - CGT, CTC, CUT
 - Employers' Associations - ANDI
 - Standing Negotiation Committee on Wage and Labor Policies (CPCPSL)
 - 2 departmental subcommittees (Valle del Cauca and Bolívar)
 - Afro-Colombian Labor Center
 - Center for Solidarity
- **Internal clients:**
 - Project Team
 - DWT/CO for the Andean Countries

- Regional Office for Latin America and the Caribbean
- Relevant technical units at headquarters: GOVERNANCE AND TRIPARTISM, ACTRAV, ACTEMP, PARDEV and EVAL.

IV. Key Evaluation Questions

30. The ILO applies the criteria of the OECD's Development Assistance Committee (DAC) for the evaluation of development assistance projects: relevance, effectiveness, efficiency, impact and sustainability, which are aligned with international best-practice standards. The ILO adheres to the OECD/DAC Evaluation Quality Standards and uses them as benchmarks for the quality control of evaluation processes and outcomes.
31. The ILO is member of United Nations Evaluation Group (UNEG) and adheres to the UN System Evaluation Norms and Standards that were developed by UNEG, which is reflected in the ILO Policy Guidelines for Results-Based Evaluations, and to the highest technical and ethical standards. This evaluation adheres to these principles as well as to the Code of Conduct for Evaluation in the UN System in order to ensure international credibility in the evaluation process.
32. The evaluation criteria are:
- 34.1. Relevance:** The extent to which the objectives and scope of the Project are consistent with the target group's and beneficiaries' priorities and donors' policies.
 - 34.2. Coherence:** The extent to which the strategy is logical and coherent in terms of the selection of geographical areas and levels of government subject of Project intervention as well as the extent to which the technical design of the project is coherent with the budget allocation.
 - 34.3. Effectiveness:** The extent to which an activity achieves its objectives. It speaks of the coverage, progress and results of the project intervention in terms of the set targets. It refers also to the effectiveness of the Project's organizational structure (managerial effectiveness) to achieve the expected results.
 - 34.4. Efficiency:** A measure of outputs (qualitative and quantitative) in relation to a given level of inputs. It measures how economically resources are used by activities in order to achieve the desired results. This generally requires comparing alternative approaches to achieving the same results, to see whether the most efficient process has been adopted.
 - 34.5. Impact:** It refers to the positive and negative changes produced, directly or indirectly, intentionally or unintentionally, by the intervention in question. This implies identifying the main impacts and effects resulting from the intervention through the measurement of economic, environmental and social development indicators. The evaluation should address both intentional and unintentional results

and should also include the positive and negative impact of external factors such as changes in the terms of trade and financial conditions.

34.6. Sustainability: A measure of the likelihood that the benefits of an activity will continue after funding from donors has stopped. Projects must be sustainable from an environmental and also an economic point of view.

33. Gender issues need to be addressed pursuant to the ILO Guidance Note 4: “Considering gender in the monitoring and evaluation of projects.” All data should be disaggregated by sex, and the different needs of women and men and of marginalized groups targeted by the program they should be considered during the evaluation process.
34. The evaluation will review the project against the following six standard evaluation criteria. A more detailed analysis framework for questions and sub-questions will be developed by the International Evaluation Consultant.

Relevance to and strategic coherence with the intervention

- 1) To what an extent are the project immediate objectives consistent with the needs of the Ministry of Labor (MOL), the Departmental Subcommittees (SCDs), and representatives of employers’ and workers’ organizations? Have the needs of these stakeholders changed in the course of the project? To what an extent are the project objectives consistent with the needs of vulnerable groups targeted by the project? Specify whether new needs have emerged.
- 2) Was the project adapted to the national development plans, results, and national and regional priorities of the strategic programming of the ILO and of the UNDAF in general?
- 3) To what an extent did the project complement and create synergies with other projects programs of the ILO or of other institutions in Colombia? To what an extent did the project contribute to other relevant initiatives?
- 4) Were gender, exclusion and/or discrimination analyses conducted? If they were, how did those analyses contribute to promote gender concerns in project activities? How has this diagnostic survey contributed to addressing the issue of exclusion and/or discrimination by the Project?

Validity of intervention design

- 5) To what an extent is the project’s logical framework coherent (in terms of activities/outputs/results) and realistic (in terms targets set to be achieved over a certain timeline)?
- 6) Are the logical framework indicators suitable for measuring project performance and impact? Have baseline and follow-up indicators been compared? To what an extent are the indicators described in the project document appropriate and useful to assess project progress and impact?
- 7) What has been the level of participation of the tripartite partners in the project design?

- 8) What risks and assumptions was the project logic based on? How crucial were they to the success of the project? How realistic were they? To what an extent was the project able to control for them?
- 9) Is the Project budget adequate and consistent with the planned strategies and activities?

Effectiveness of management arrangements

- 10) Was the Project's management structure adequately staffed? What have been the main constraints and/or difficulties encountered by the project team?
- 11) To what an extent did the management capabilities of the project team and the administrative procedures followed by it facilitate (or hinder) achieving the results?
- 12) Was there an effective level of coordination with project counterparts supported by the monitoring process?
- 13) Did the project receive support from the HQ technical backstopping units and specialists from the ILO Andean Office?
- 14) From a counterpart/constituent perspective, is there any comparative advantage in working with the ILO as opposed to working with other international organizations?

Project effectiveness (achievements of expected results)

- 15) What is the perception of quality and usefulness of the main products and/or services provided by the ILO within the framework of this project? Were these delivered in a timely manner?
- 16) Has the nature of social dialogue within the National Committee and the two departmental subcommittees changed positively as an achievement of this project?
- 17) Has the project responded in an effective and timely manner to emerging changes in the project's political and economic environment?
- 18) What has the project achieved in terms of: (i) compliance with the fundamental rights at work of women, youth and Afro-Colombians; (ii) improving labor relations and the exercise of the right to collective bargaining and conflict prevention? Identify the main limiting factors (institutional, political, economic, etc) that hindered the attainment of achievements . How can these be overcome?
- 19) What alternative strategies, if any, have been most effective in achieving the project objectives?

Efficiency of resource use

- 20) Were budgetary funds executed as planned? Have activities been cost-effective? Has the allocation of resources to staff and activities been optimal?
- 21) Is the level of budget execution for each component consistent with the level of fulfillment of the physical targets? Do the results achieved justify the costs?
- 22) How have the funds executed by the project been distributed in terms of: Project objectives, types of products, types of expenses, year of implementation?
- 23) Were resources (financial, human, time, expertise, etc.) assigned to the project in a timely manner? Is the timeframe allotted for implementing the Project considered adequate? Were there delays in implementing any of the activities?

Impact orientation

- 24) What changes in terms of capacities and attitudes can be seen in constituents/counterparts? Is it possible to identify the extent to which the project contributed to these results? Has the project achieved the beneficiaries' taking over ownership of results?
- 25) What outcomes with respect to the situation of FPRW (fundamental principles and rights at work) can be considered a result of the project intervention?

Sustainability

- 26) Once the external funding ends, is it likely that national institutions and implementing partners will continue to sustain the project or prolong its results, including contributing the required funds themselves?
- 27) Are national partners willing and committed to continue to sustain the project? Is there evidence of political will for this continuity?
- 28) Are results being mainstreamed within the national institutions and, if so, will the partners be able to sustain them financially after the project ends?
- 29) Can any positive or negative effects, unintended or unexpected, be observed as a result of the project intervention? If that is the case, in what ways has the project strategy been adjusted? Has the project strategy been adjusted to minimize negative effects?

V. Methodology to Be Followed

35. The basic conceptual framework on which this evaluation will be developed is the ILO Policy Guidelines for Results-Based Evaluations: principles, rationale, planning and management for evaluation. The evaluation will be carried out in accordance with ILO standard policies and procedures. The ILO adheres to the UN System Evaluation Norms and Standards and applies the OECD/DAC Evaluation Quality Standards.
36. The methodologies to be used in the context of this evaluation will complement each other and data triangulation techniques and methods will be used. The evaluator is expected to use the following methodologies for the assessment:
- **Desk review:** The evaluator will review the following documents before conducting any interviews and undertaking visits to project sites:
 - PRODOC (Project Document)
 - Project's original logical framework
 - Quarterly progress reports:
 - Final and mid-term evaluations of projects COL/08/12/USA, COL/11/04/USA, COL/13/02/COL, COL/14/01/COL and COL/13/05/NOR.
 - Project financial information
 - National Diagnostic Survey on the barriers preventing young people from exercising their labor rights, particularly their right to organize
 - Mapping of working conditions and enforcement of rights with particular emphasis on vulnerable groups in Valle del Cauca and Bolívar
 - Annual situational reports (diagnostic survey) of departmental subcommittees, 2008-2012 and 2014.
 - List of outputs obtained and activities carried out as at September 2015
 - All technical and administrative project documents (project reviews requested from the donor, final outputs, activity reports, lists of participants, budget, etc.)
 - Minutes/aide mémoires of the meetings of the Valle del Cauca and Bolívar Subcommittees.
 - ILO Strategic Policy Framework 2010-2015
 - **Data collection and review:** The evaluator will review the Projects' administrative information (including monitoring reports, project statistics, outputs and consultancies, among others) and will also collect additional data when necessary using various information gathering techniques.
 - **Interviews with stakeholders (field work).** A preliminary meeting will be held with the project technical coordinator (after conducting the desk review), the Labor Law and Labor Administration Specialist, the Management Team of the ILO Andean Country Office, and Program Officers in order to inform the desk review findings. The consultant will also hold meetings with personnel from other ILO projects this intervention has synergies with as well as the administrative staff of the ILO Office in Bogotá. Then, as part of the fieldwork, all interviews will be conducted (with constituents and beneficiaries, as scheduled by the

project coordinating unit) in Bogotá, Valle del Cauca and Bolivar, to collect and validate the information found by the initial desk review (See Annexes 4 and 5)

- **Reporting results to the donor.** The consultant will prepare a PowerPoint presentation summarizing the methodology, results, conclusions and recommendations of the evaluation for the donor –USDOS– and the ILO Tripartite Committee.

VI. Main Outputs: Inception Report, Progress Report and Final Report

37. **Output 1 (Inception report)** - The Inception report will be prepared by the external consultant on the basis of the agreement with the evaluation team and submitted to the Evaluation Manager for review and approval. This report will include a description of the methodology to be followed, the evaluation approach, key activities, interview questionnaires, list of stakeholders and the timetable (see [Checklist 3: Writing the Inception Report. See attached](#)).
38. **Output 2 (Draft Final Report)** - This report will be drafted by the external consultant under the technical guidance of the Evaluation Manager and will include actionable, specific and prioritized recommendations. The report will be submitted to the ILO Evaluation Manager for review, circulation, consolidation of results and final approval. All paragraphs must be numbered. (See [Checklist 5: Preparing the evaluation report. See attached](#)).
39. **Output 3 (Final Report)** - This report will be submitted to the Evaluation Manager and shall include final comments on the preliminary/draft version of the evaluation report. The report should follow the EVAL template , including a title page (see [Checklist 7: Filling in the evaluation title page](#)) and be no more than 45 pages long, excluding annexes. Annexes to the report will include: the final questionnaires used in the field work, the survey results, a summary of the results of each field visit, a summary of each meeting, a list of persons interviewed and a list of the documents reviewed. The quality of the report will be rated based on EVAL quality standards (see [Checklist 6: Rating the quality of evaluation reports](#)).

The evaluation report should be written using Word, A4 format, Arial 12 typeface, with a total of 45 pages excluding annexes. All paragraphs of the report must be numbered.

Report structure

- (1) Cover page with key project and evaluation data
- (2) Table of contents and lists of annexes, tables and figures
- (3) List of acronyms and abbreviations
- (4) Executive summary
- (5) Body of the report
 - 5.1. Evaluation background
 - 5.1.1. Summary of the projects purpose, logic and structure
 - 5.1.2. Current project status
 - 5.1.3. Purpose, scope and clients of the evaluation
 - 5.1.4. Evaluation methodology
 - 5.2. Main findings arranged according to the 6 analytical framework criteria (5 case studies)
- (6) Conclusions
 - 6.1. Conclusions

6.2. Lessons learned
6.3. Best practices
6.4. Recommendations
(7) Annexes

See the following required guidelines for preparing the report:

Checklist 7: Filling in the evaluation title page

Checklist 6: Rating the quality of evaluation reports

Checklist 8: Writing the evaluation report summary

40. **Output 4 (PowerPoint presentation):** A presentation that includes the evaluation's purpose, methodology, findings, conclusions and recommendations.
41. Gender equality issues should be explicitly addressed through evaluation activities carried out by the consultant and in the final reports and events undertaken as part of the assessment process.
42. All drafts and final outputs, including supporting documents, analytical reports and raw data, should be provided in an electronic format compatible with Microsoft Word for Windows. The information (data) produced as part of this evaluation, as well as the copyright in the Evaluation Report are the exclusive property of the ILO and the donor. The use of data for publication and other dissemination purposes can only be approved with the agreement of the ILO. Stakeholders may make appropriate use of the evaluation report in accordance with the original purpose and with the express citation of the source.

I. Management Arrangements, Work Plan, Format Requirements and Deadlines

Management arrangements

43. The final independent evaluation will be conducted by an International External Consultant (IEC).
44. The IEC will be responsible for conducting the assessment pursuant to the terms of reference. The IEC will:
 - Conduct a meeting with the Evaluation Manager to define the scope and contractual aspects of the evaluation.
 - Review the terms of reference and provide feedback as necessary.
 - Conduct a meeting with the Labor Law and Labour Administration Specialist, the Workers' Organizations Specialist to the Andean Countries, the Employers' Organizations Specialist to the Andean Countries and the Director of the ILO Office for the Andean Countries.

- Conduct a meeting with the Project Coordinator in Bogota and interviews with the CTA of the project “Promoting compliance with international labor standards in Colombia” (COL/11/04/USA).
- Conduct a desk review of project documentation.
- Review the evaluation questions and refine the questions in collaboration with the Evaluation Manager, as needed, and develop interview protocols.
- Develop and implement an evaluation methodology (i.e., conduct a desk review and interviews, perform data triangulation) to respond to the evaluation questions.
- Design a questionnaire/survey to be used for interviews, group discussions and field visits.
- Conduct the assessment mission in the cities of Cali, Cartagena and Bogota.
- Prepare a draft evaluation report and submit it to the Evaluation Manager.
- Prepare a Final Evaluation report reflecting the observations or contributions received.
- Submit the Final Evaluation report as per the evaluation schedule (see below).

45. The IEC will be supervised by the Evaluation Manager. The Evaluation Manager will:

- Prepare and finalize the terms of reference for the evaluation and liaise with the National Project Coordinator and Regional Evaluation Officer, as needed.
- Review the evaluation questions and work with the donor and the IEC to refine the questions, as needed.
- Ensure that the agenda for interviews/meetings is prepared in coordination with the National Project Coordinator.
- Review and comment on the Evaluation report.
- Ensure that the evaluation is conducted according to the Terms of Reference.
- Discuss the draft evaluation report with the IEC, project beneficiaries and stakeholders.
- Liaise with project staff where their commitment to comply with the above requirements is needed.

Work Plan

46. The total duration of the evaluation process is about 5.5 weeks, from 24 August to 30 September 2015. The EIC will be hired for 25 effective days.

47. The meetings in Colombia will be organized by project staff, according to requests from the IEC, consistent with the terms of reference. A detailed field (country) mission program will be prepared by the Project:

Tentative Work Plan

48. The following is a timetable of tasks and expected durations for each output.

Evaluation start date: 24 August 2015.

Stage s	Responsible person	Tasks	Date	Effective days of work
I	International External Evaluator	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Interview with ILO Evaluation Manager - Interview with the Labor Law and Labor Administration Specialist - Interviews with DWT Specialists in Lima (1 day) - Meeting via Skype with USDOS Project Coordinator - Meeting via Skype with the USDOL Project CTA - Desk review of project documentation - Inception report (IR) (submittal to Evaluation Manager - Lima) 	24 - 31 August (date of submission of IR is 31 August)	6
II	International External Evaluator	Field visits and interviews in Bogotá - Review and adaptation of tools and desk review (... continued): Fieldwork - Interviews in Bogota with constituents and partners: September - Cali - Cartagena	September	6
III	International External Evaluator	Systematization and triangulation of data collected in the field Preparation and submission of draft final report	September (date of submission of draft final report is 23 September)	8
IV	Evaluation manager	Circulate final draft to all involved Consolidation of comments and submission of document to consultant (2 days for review)	September (2 days)	
V	National External Evaluator	Completion of evaluation report (incorporating final comments)	September	4
VI	Evaluation manager	Review of final report (submission of final comments to evaluator)	September	
VII	National	Preparation and submission of final report	30 September	1

	External Evaluator	(and submission to ILO)		
TOTAL DAYS =				25

Resources

49. The resources required for this evaluation are as follows:

50. For the External Consultant Evaluator:

- Fees for International Evaluation Consultant: 25 effective days of work at **USD 300 per day**
* 25 days = **USD \$ 7,500.00**
- A lump sum USD 2,000.00 including DSA for 6 days (3 in Bogotá, 1.5 in Cali and 1.5 in Cartagena), air ticket for round trip between Lima and Bogotá, and domestic travel.

Payments

- Payment of the lump sum will be effective from the date of signing the contract and will be transferred to the consultant's account.
- Payments will be made in three disbursements. The first disbursement will be made against delivery of Inception Report, equivalent to 20% of the total amount of fees; the second disbursement will be made against delivery and approval of the Draft Final Report, equivalent to 40% of the total amount of fees; and the third disbursement will be made against delivery of the Final Report and PowerPoint presentation, equivalent to 40% of the total amount of fees.

51. Profile of the Evaluation Consultant. The evaluation consultant must have:

- Education/Training consisting of a Masters or Doctorate in Political Science, Social Science or Economics. Background in Public Administration and International Relations.
- Have completed at least 4 evaluations, at least one for the United Nations system.
- Knowledge of the social and labor dynamics present in Colombia.
- English skills.
- Familiarity with the mandate of the ILO, its constituents and the fundamental principles and rights at work.
- Solid teamwork skills and participatory methodologies.
- Excellent analytical and writing skills.

VIII. Legal and Ethical Matters

52. This evaluation complies with UN norms and standards for evaluation and will ensure that ethical safeguards concerning the independence of the evaluation will be followed. Please refer to the UNEG ethical guidelines: <http://www.unevaluation.org/ethicalguidelines>.

53. To ensure compliance with ILO/UN rules safeguarding the independence of the evaluation, the contractor will not be eligible for technical work on the project for the next 12 months and cannot be the evaluator of the final project evaluation.

IX. Annexes

Annex 1: PRODOC

Annex 2: Logical framework

Annex 3: Quarterly Progress Reports to the donor

Annex 4: Outputs and activities as at March 2015

(Project documentation will be submitted by email upon signing the contract)

Annex 5: Suggested schedule of interviews

DAY	TIME	INSTITUTION	PERSON INTERVIEWED	PROGRAM	TELEPHONE	ADDRESS

Annex 2. List of Reviewed Documents.

- PRODOC (Project Document).
- Minute Sheet Approval – PARDEV
- Revision Request Form - USDOS
- Quarterly progress reports: Jan-Mar 2014, Apr-Jun 2014, Jul-Sep 2014, Oct-Dec 2014, Jan-Mar 2015, Apr-June 2015
- Monthly reports of the Project CTA: May 2015, Jun 2015, Jul 2015, Aug 2015.
- Mission reports of the Project CTA, 2015
- Project financial performance report, as at September 2015
- “Draft Ordinance of Valle del Cauca by which a public policy on decent work is adopted”
- “Draft District Agreement of Cartagena by which a public policy on decent work is adopted”
- “National Development Plan Colombia 2014 - 2018”
- Final and mid-term evaluations of projects COL/08/01/USA, COL/11/04/USA, COL 12/01/COL, COL/13/02/COL, COL/14/01/COL y COL/13/05/NOR.
- “Social dialogue interventions: What works and why? A synthesis review 2002 – 2012”, OIT
- “Program and Budget for the Biennium 2012-2013,” ILO
- “Program and Budget for the Biennium 2014-2015,” ILO
- “National diagnosis on the barriers that prevent young people from exercising their labor rights”
- “Report on public policies on gender, youth and Afro-descendant populations in the Bolivar department,” July 2014
- “Report on gender, youth and Afro-descendant populations in the public policies of Valle del Cauca,” March 2014
- “Study on the social and labor market integration of Afro-descendant populations in the city of Cali,” 2015

- “Study on the social and labor market integration of Afro-descendant populations in the city of Cartagena,” 2015
- “Diagnostic survey on the situation of the departmental subcommittees in Colombia,” 2012
- “Report on monitoring achievement of the targets at the Departmental Subcommittee’s in Colombia,” 2014
- Action Plan 2015 by the Departmental Subcommittee of Valle del Cauca
- Minutes of the meetings of the Departmental Subcommittee of Valle del Cauca, 2015
- Minutes of the meetings of the Departmental Subcommittee of Bolivar, 2014
- CLAF National Action Plan 2015 and Departmental Action Plans
- Conclusions of the Second Afro-Colombian Forum, CLAF.
- Attendance lists for the training workshops
- DANE website: <http://www.dane.gov.co/>
- Ministry of Labor website: <http://www.mintrabajo.gov.co/>

Annex 3. Interview guide.

GUIDE FOR INTERVIEWS WITH OFFICIALS OF THE ILO OFFICE FOR ANDEAN COUNTRIES

Evaluation criteria and questions	
I. RELEVANCE	
3. Does the project complement and create synergies with other projects/programs of the ILO or of other institutions in Colombia? How does the project fit into the ILO strategy of strengthening social dialogue (SD) to enforce core labor rights, as carried out by the ILO in Colombia since 2008?	
II. DESIGN VALIDITY	
5. What criteria were used for selecting government levels, geographical areas and vulnerable groups subject to Project intervention? Are there any indicators to justify interventions in these geographical areas and vulnerable groups?	
7. Why was it decided to suppress an output and several activities (referred to in the original logical framework) from the Project's revised logical framework and instead include several activities not included in the initial design? What other important changes were made to the revised logical framework and what were the reasons for these changes?	
8. In what way have the tripartite stakeholders (government, employers and workers) and the ILO participated in the Project design?	
10. What were the main similarities between the design of this project and that of other projects that are part of the strategy to strengthen social dialogue to enforce core labor rights, as carried out by the ILO since 2008? What actions were considered from the design stage to avoid duplication? What were the main differences between the design of this project and that of other projects?	
III. MANAGEMENT STRUCTURE EFFICIENCY	
21. What type of technical and administrative backstopping did the Project receive from the ILO Office for Andean Countries, the technical backstopping units based in headquarters, and the GOVERNANCE and TRIPARTISM Department? What role did the High Level Tripartite Committee fulfill as a forum for coordination, discussion and learning?	
22. Were coordinations made with other ILO projects in Colombia related to strengthening social dialogue? How did this coordination contribute to the achievements made by this Project and other projects? Were the lessons learned and best practices from these projects (as set out in the recommendations of the final evaluations) taken into account?	
VI. IMPACT ORIENTATION	
24. What positive attitudinal, technical and managerial changes can be observed in the tripartite institutions (National Committee and Departmental Sub-committees) and the employers' and workers' organizations targeted by the project? What types of skills were not strengthened?	
25. To what extent can these results, in terms of attitudes and skills, be causally linked to project interventions? What other factors external to the project may have contributed to these results?	
28. What outcomes have been generated from the positive changes in terms of attitudes and skills and managerial techniques within the tripartite institutions and employers' and workers' organizations? To what extent can these outcomes contribute to advancing compliance with the core labor rights of women, youth and Afro-Colombians in terms of improving labor relations and reducing conflicts and other long-term impacts? What factors in the political, social and economic context influenced this level of progress?	
29. To what extent and how has this and other ILO projects helped to generate such long-term impacts on promoting social dialogue and fundamental rights at work? What other factors external to the project, may have contributed to explain these impacts?	
VII. SUSTAINABILITY ORIENTATION	
30. Have the beneficiaries of the training provided by the project been able to replicate the training? Has the project transferred responsibilities, learning, methodologies and tools to constituents and national partners? Have the national constituents and partners converted outputs into direct outcomes reflected in initiatives and progress thereof which would not have been achieved without the project?	
31. Is there political will in national constituents and partners to consolidate Project results once the Project is completed? Do they have the technical capabilities to do this? Is there a favorable environment in terms of laws,	

regulations, policies, plans, ordinances , decrees? Have measures to serve the Project's target audience been incorporated into local development plans? Do they have funding for it? Are provincial-government budget funds available for recruiting technical secretaries for the subcommittees?

GUIDE FOR INTERVIEWING THE PROJECT'S CTA

Evaluation criteria and questions	
I. RELEVANCE	
1. Are the immediate objectives of the project are consistent with the needs of the Ministry of Labor (MOL), the Departmental Subcommittees (SCDs), and representatives of employers' and workers' organizations? Are there any "base" indicators that reveal the existence of these needs?	
II. DESIGN VALIDITY	
4. Is the logical design (logical framework) of the Project consistent (with chain of activities / outputs / immediate objectives)? Are planned activities necessary and sufficient to achieve the outputs and in turn are these outputs necessary and sufficient to achieve the immediate objectives? To what extent are the immediate objectives properly linked together to help achieve the Project's development objective?	
5. What criteria were used for selecting government levels, geographical areas and vulnerable groups subject to Project intervention? Are there any indicators to justify interventions in these geographical areas and vulnerable groups?	
7. Why was it decided to suppress an output and several activities (referred to in the original logical framework) from the Project's revised logical framework and instead include several activities not included in the initial design? What other important changes were made to the revised logical framework and what were the reasons for these changes?	
9. Has the gender perspective been incorporated in the Project design? Is this incorporation reflected in the conduct of gender, exclusion and / or discrimination analyses? In the formulation of intervention strategies and activities? In setting gender-disaggregated targets and indicators?	
10. What were the main similarities between the design of this project and that of other projects that are part of the strategy to strengthen social dialogue to enforce core labor rights, as carried out by the ILO since 2008? What actions were considered from the design stage to avoid duplication? What were the main differences between the design of this project and that of other projects?	
III. PROJECT EFFECTIVENESS	
12. Were goals set for activities and outputs achieved? Why were goals not achieved for some activities and outputs? At what levels of government and in what geographic areas was the Project more and less effective?	
13. Who were the beneficiaries of the trainings and how were they selected? What is the beneficiaries' perception of the quality and usefulness of the training, technical assistance and other Project products? Had they received similar services before the Project? What was different about the services provided by this project?	
14. In what manner did the ILO participate in the outputs and activities implemented?	
15. Have the risks and assumptions set out in the project design been fulfilled? Have major political, economic or institutional changes been generated in the project environment? Did these changes positively or negatively affect project implementation? Did these changes involve making adjustments to the Project?	
IV. EFFICIENT USE OF RESOURCES	
18. Were the necessary resources (financial, time, expertise, etc.) to carry out the activities and outputs assigned to the Project in a timely manner?	
V. MANAGEMENT STRUCTURE EFFICIENCY	
19. Was the Project's management structure properly staffed? To what extent did the management skills of the project team, and the administrative procedures followed by the team, facilitate (or not) the achievement of results? What were the main technical and administrative constraints and/or difficulties faced by the project team?	
20. Was there an effective level of coordination (at technical, political and administrative level) with the Project constituents? With what frequency and by what means? What was the level of participation and involvement of counterparts during the Project implementation?	
21. What type of technical and administrative backstopping did the Project receive from the ILO Office for Andean Countries, the technical backstopping units based in headquarters, and the GOVERNANCE and TRIPARTISM Department? What role did the High Level Tripartite Committee fulfill as a forum for coordination, discussion and learning?	

22. Were coordinations made with other ILO projects in Colombia related to strengthening social dialogue? How did this coordination contribute to the achievements made by this Project and other projects? Were the lessons learned and best practices from these projects (as set out in the recommendations of the final evaluations) taken into account?
VI. IMPACT ORIENTATION
24. What positive attitudinal, technical and managerial changes can be observed in the tripartite institutions (National Committee and Departmental Sub-committees) and the employers' and workers' organizations targeted by the project? What types of skills were not strengthened?
25. To what extent can these results, in terms of attitudes and skills, be causally linked to project interventions? What other factors external to the project may have contributed to these results?
26. ¿Have any results, positive or negative, not foreseen in the design, been generated as a result of project interventions? Have positive externalities been integrated into the project strategy? Has the strategy been adjusted to minimize the negative effects?
28. What outcomes have been generated from the positive changes in terms of attitudes and skills and managerial techniques within the tripartite institutions and employers' and workers' organizations? To what extent can these outcomes contribute to advancing compliance with the core labor rights of women, youth and Afro-Colombians in terms of improving labor relations and reducing conflicts and other long-term impacts? What factors in the political, social and economic context influenced this level of progress?
29. To what extent and how has this and other ILO projects helped to generate such long-term impacts on promoting social dialogue and fundamental rights at work? What other factors external to the project, may have contributed to explain these impacts?
VII. SUSTAINABILITY ORIENTATION
30. Have the beneficiaries of the training provided by the project been able to replicate the training? Has the project transferred responsibilities, learning, methodologies and tools to constituents and national partners? Have the national constituents and partners converted outputs into direct outcomes reflected in initiatives and progress thereof which would not have been achieved without the project?
31. Is there political will in national constituents and partners to consolidate Project results once the Project is completed? Do they have the technical capabilities to do this? Is there a favorable environment in terms of laws, regulations, policies, plans, ordinances , decrees? Have measures to serve the Project's target audience been incorporated into local development plans? Do they have funding for it? Are provincial-government budget funds available for recruiting technical secretaries for the subcommittees?

GUIDE FOR INTERVIEWS WITH REPRESENTATIVES OF BENEFICIARY ORGANIZATIONS OF THE PROJECT

Evaluation criteria and questions	
I. DESIGN VALIDITY	
8. In what way have the tripartite stakeholders (government, employers and workers) and the ILO participated in the Project design?	
II. PROJECT EFFECTIVENESS	
12. Were goals set for activities and outputs achieved? Why were goals not achieved for some activities and outputs? At what levels of government and in what geographic areas was the Project more and less effective?	
13. Who were the beneficiaries of the trainings and how were they selected? What is the beneficiaries' perception of the quality and usefulness of the training, technical assistance and other Project products? Had they received similar services before the Project? What was different about the services provided by this project?	
14. In what manner did the ILO participate in the outputs and activities implemented?	
III. MANAGEMENT STRUCTURE EFFICIENCY	
20. Was there an effective level of coordination (at technical, political and administrative level) with the Project constituents? With what frequency and by what means? What was the level of participation and involvement of counterparts during the Project implementation?	
23. From the perspective of constituents, what are the advantages of working with the ILO in comparison with other international organizations? What are the main difficulties of working with the ILO?	
VI. IMPACT ORIENTATION	
24. What positive attitudinal, technical and managerial changes can be observed in the tripartite institutions (National Committee and Departmental Sub-committees) and the employers' and workers' organizations targeted by the project? What types of skills were not strengthened?	
25. To what extent can these results, in terms of attitudes and skills, be causally linked to project interventions? What other factors external to the project may have contributed to these results?	
28. What outcomes have been generated from the positive changes in terms of attitudes and skills and managerial techniques within the tripartite institutions and employers' and workers' organizations? To what extent can these outcomes contribute to advancing compliance with the core labor rights of women, youth and Afro-Colombians in terms of improving labor relations and reducing conflicts and other long-term impacts? What factors in the political, social and economic context influenced this level of progress?	
29. To what extent and how has this and other ILO projects helped to generate such long-term impacts on promoting social dialogue and fundamental rights at work? What other factors external to the project, may have contributed to explain these impacts?	
VII. SUSTAINABILITY ORIENTATION	
30. Have the beneficiaries of the training provided by the project been able to replicate the training? Has the project transferred responsibilities, learning, methodologies and tools to constituents and national partners? Have the national constituents and partners converted outputs into direct outcomes reflected in initiatives and progress thereof which would not have been achieved without the project?	
31. Is there political will in national constituents and partners to consolidate Project results once the Project is completed? Do they have the technical capabilities to do this? Is there a favorable environment in terms of laws, regulations, policies, plans, ordinances , decrees? Have measures to serve the Project's target audience been incorporated into local development plans? Do they have funding for it? Are provincial-government budget funds available for recruiting technical secretaries for the subcommittees?	

**Guide for interviews with the CTA of OTHER RELATED PROJECTS AND from the
BUREAU OF FUNDAMENTAL RIGHTS IN GENEVA**

Evaluation criteria and questions	
I. RELEVANCE	
3. Does the project complement and create synergies with other projects/programs of the ILO or of other institutions in Colombia? How does the project fit into the ILO strategy of strengthening social dialogue (SD) to enforce core labor rights, as carried out by the ILO in Colombia since 2008?	
II. DESIGN VALIDITY	
10. What were the main similarities between the design of this project and that of other projects that are part of the strategy to strengthen social dialogue to enforce core labor rights, as carried out by the ILO since 2008? What actions were considered from the design stage to avoid duplication? What were the main differences between the design of this project and that of other projects?	
11. Is the Project budget adequate and consistent with the planned strategies and activities?	
III. MANAGEMENT STRUCTURE EFFICIENCY	
21. What type of technical and administrative backstopping did the Project receive from the ILO Office for Andean Countries, the technical backstopping units based in headquarters, and the GOVERNANCE and TRIPARTISM Department? What role did the High Level Tripartite Committee fulfill as a forum for coordination, discussion and learning?	
22. Were coordinations made with other ILO projects in Colombia related to strengthening social dialogue? How did this coordination contribute to the achievements made by this Project and other projects? Were the lessons learned and best practices from these projects (as set out in the recommendations of the final evaluations) taken into account?	
VI. IMPACT ORIENTATION	
28. What outcomes have been generated from the positive changes in terms of attitudes and skills and managerial techniques within the tripartite institutions and employers' and workers' organizations? To what extent can these outcomes contribute to advancing compliance with the core labor rights of women, youth and Afro-Colombians in terms of improving labor relations and reducing conflicts and other long-term impacts? What factors in the political, social and economic context influenced this level of progress?	
29. To what extent and how has this and other ILO projects helped to generate such long-term impacts on promoting social dialogue and fundamental rights at work? What other factors external to the project, may have contributed to explain these impacts?	

Annex 4. List of Persons Interviewed.

Officials from the ILO Office for Andean Countries

1. Maria Arteta (Director, ILO Office for Andean Countries)
2. Italo Cardona (Labor Law and Labor Administration Specialist)
3. Eduardo Rodríguez (ACTRAV)
4. Roberto Villamil (ACTEMP)

Team responsible for Project implementation

5. **Beatriz Osorio (Coordinator)**
6. **Elizabeth Torres (Administrative Assistant)**
7. **Maria Cristina Ruiz (External Collaborator in Cali)**
8. **Jacqueline Howard (External Collaborator in Cartagena)**

Representatives of other ILO projects in Colombia

9. Valkyrie Hanson (USDOL project)
10. Carolina Trivise (SCORE project)

Representatives of beneficiary organizations of the Project

11. Eduardo Bejarano (Director, Unit of Fundamental Rights, Ministry of Labor)
12. Jorge Rico (CGT)
13. Rugero Ruiz (Chairman, CTC - Cartagena)
14. Freddy Lazo (Secretary, CTC - Cartagena)
15. Just Jimenez (Director, AFREM Project, Chamber of Commerce - Cartagena)
16. Carolina León (Office of Women's Affairs, Mayor's Office - Cartagena)
17. Horacio Carcamo (Territorial Directorate, Ministry of Labor - Cartagena)
18. XXX (Chairperson, CGT - Cartagena)
19. Ilue Baldeón (Coordinator of Social Development, Governor's Office - Cartagena)
20. Erika Martinez (ANDI - Cartagena)
21. Francisco Marrugo (National Executive Director, CLAF)

- 22. Gil Falcon (Chairman, CUT - Cartagena)
- 23. Carlos Alberto Guzmán (Chairman, CGT - Cali)
- 24. Jhon Jairo Caicedo (Chairman, CTC - Cali)
- 25. Wilson Sáenz (Chairman CUT - Cali)
- 26. Diego Obando (Director, Territorial Secretariat of Social Development, Governor's Office - Cali)
- 27. Naomi Pizarro (Director, Secretariat of Gender Equality, Governor's Office - Cali)
- 28. Blanca Cuéllar (Technical Secretary, Subcommittee of Valle del Cauca)
- 29. Agripina Hurtado (Director, CLAF - Valle del Cauca)

Annex 5. National policies and actions that the Colombian government has adopted in recent years to promote social dialogue, the fundamental rights at work and decent work.

- The Political Constitution of Colombia, in force since 1991, stipulates in Article 25 that work is a right and a social obligation and is entitled, in all its forms, to the special protection of the State, while Articles 39 and 55 give workers the express right to freedom of association and collective bargaining.
- Decent work policies, grounded in Laws 278 of 1996 and 411 of 1997.
- The Tripartite Agreement on “Freedom of association and democracy in Colombia,” signed in 2006, which aims to promote decent work and the fundamental rights at work, and lays down minimum conditions for cooperation, social dialogue, freedom of association and collective bargaining.
- The U.S.-Colombia Labor Action Plan, signed in 2011, which focuses on the elimination of more subtle methods against freedom of association and the right to collective bargaining, such as collective agreements for purposes of anti-union discrimination or the use of cooperatives to disguise workers’ employment relationships. Both this Plan and the Agreement mentioned in the preceding paragraph, include the objective of building institutional capacity for tripartite dialogue.
- Colombia’s National Development Plan 2010-2014 (“Prosperity for All” Plan), which mentions that the country should implement labor market interventions aimed at reducing unemployment and increasing the quality of the work done by Colombians. In addition, the Plan includes the objective of promoting tripartite social dialogue, emphasizes the role of the CPCPSL in adopting the country’s labor policy and assigns the task of facilitating the holding of sectoral employment agreements to the Subcommittees.
- Decree 4108 creating the Ministry of Labor, enacted in 2011, which in Article 6 states that the Ministry of Labor is responsible for the orientation and formulation of social policies on decent work. Also, it provides that it is the responsibility of the Ministry of Labor to promote social dialogue to foster understanding and development of labor relations, propose measures for the stability of labor relations, and monitor compliance with ILO international conventions.

Annex 6. Plans, policies, programs, resolutions and ordinances of Valle del Cauca and Bolivar, relevant to the thematic platform of the project.

Valle del Cauca

- Development Plan 2012 – 2015.
- Ordinance 286 of 2009, by which the system and departmental public policy on youth of Valle del Cauca are adopted.
- Valle del Cauca Gender-Sensitive Employment Equity Program for Women, of the Ministry of Labor.
- Cali Development Plan, one of whose areas of focus is women and the economy. In addition, it seeks inclusion and improved access of Afro-Colombians to municipal welfare benefits programs and projects.
- Public Policy for Cali women: "Recognition, gender equality and equal opportunities 2009-2020," several of whose areas of focus deal with public participation and representation, education, economy, health and non-violence.
- International cooperation programs

Bolívar

- Bolivar Development Plan 2012 - 2015 includes sub programs aimed at women (women's public policy, productive women) and youth (public policy for youth, activating youth citizenship, youth information system)
- Cartagena Development Plan 2013 - 2015. It establishes a district-wide policy of productive inclusion to expand the access to income-generating and employment opportunities for vulnerable and impoverished populations, such as women, young people and Afro-Colombians. The Plan includes programs for women (women entrepreneurs, civic and political participation), youth (poverty reduction, increasing income and employment, entrepreneurship, political culture facilitators) and Afro Colombians (public policy programs and training and awareness subprograms)
- Cartagena Municipal Agreement 12/2012. Public policy on effective inclusion of Afro-Colombian, Palenquera and Raizal populations, and territorial, educational, cultural, economic, political and social development of black communities.
- Youth in Action Program of Cartagena, which provides training and life skills
- Technical cooperation programs

**Annex 7. Labor market indicators for young people and women: Colombia,
Valle del Cauca, Bolívar, 2012.**

	Colombia	Valle del Cauca	Bolívar
Share of employed population under 25 years	19%	17%	18%
Percentage of young people aged 18 - 28 years not in employment, and not seeking work and nor study	25%	28%	29%
Percentage of the employed population who are women	41%	44%	37%
Average income gap between men and women (in pesos)	203,926	305,176	177,796
Average hours-worked gap between men and women	9	9.7	8.6

Compiled internally from information from FILCO - MT of Colombia.

Annex 8. Training evaluation surveys.

The training program for promoting the fundamental rights at work, delivered at the end of 2014, ended with the dissemination and provision of feedback on the topics covered in the three phases, through a workshop using the administrative methodology known as "Design Thinking." Dividing students in five groups, each group was asked to take a topic developed in three phases, present it to their peers using graphics and request and provide feedback.

Subsequently a standard assessment survey was conducted of all the topics covered in the program:

- Freedom of Association and Trade Union Regulations
- Social Dialogue and Decent Work
- Negotiation Techniques Training
- Mechanisms for Promoting Labor Rights
- Training on Gender Policy

For each topic, the survey inquired about the content, methodology (theory-practice balance, supporting materials), usefulness and applicability, skills of the facilitator or trainer (knowledge of the subject, clarity, promotes participation of attendees), administrative aspects (compliance with schedule and adequacy of the venue) using level-of-agreement statements: "agree (4)," "partially agree (3)," "disagree (2)" or "strongly disagree (1)."

Below are the responses to the following two statements: (a) the training enhanced the knowledge on the topics, and (b) the knowledge gained is useful and applicable in the personal and professional fields. The results are disaggregated by trade union of which the respondent is a member.

Subject	Did the training enhance the knowledge on the issues?		Is the knowledge gained useful and applicable in the personal and professional fields?	
	CTC	CGT	CTC	CGT
Freedom of Association and Trade Union Regulations	94%	73%	94%	56%
Social Dialogue and Decent	95%	100%	95%	100%

Work				
Negotiation Techniques Training	92%	63%	77%	75%
Mechanisms for Promoting Labor Rights	95%		95%	
Training on Gender Policy	80%	100%	93%	82%

Annex 9. Project budget executed, as per yearly basis^{1/}.

	Total budget execution (in \$)	Budget execution for 2013 – 2014 (in \$)	Budget execution for 2015 (in \$)	Budget execution for 2015 as % of total budget execution
1. Project staff	91,852	38,941	52,911	58%
2. Travels by project staff and specialists	35,920	17,231	18,689	52%
3. Supplies	4,075	3,108	967	24%
4. Contracts	300,029	167,289	132,740	44%
5. Other expenditures	6,177	3,746	2,431	39%
6. Prog. Support Costs	56,947	44,132	12,815	23%
Total	495,000	274,448	220,552	45%

Own calculations based on financial information provided by the ILO Office for Andean Countries

1/ Budget execution includes amounts disbursed and committed as at September 28, 2015.

Annex 10. Labor market indicators for youth, women and the general population: Colombia, Valle del Cauca, Bolívar, 2012 - 2014

	COLOMBIA		BOLIVAR		VALLE CAUCA	
Activity rate	64.7%	64.5%	65.6%	65.7%	59.8%	59.1%
Employment rate	58.0%	58.6%	56.8%	58.0%	55.2%	55.3%
Unemployment rate	10.3%	9.1%	13.4%	11.7%	7.6%	6.4%
Share of women in employment compared to total employed population	41.3%	41.7%	43.8%	43.7%	36.8%	37.8%
Average income gap between men and women (in pesos)	203,926	205,484	305,176	297,084	177,796	155,675
Average hours-worked gap between men and women	9	8.6	9.7	9.9	8.6	7.9
Percentage of young people aged 18 - 28 years not in employment, and not seeking work and nor study	25.4%	23.8%	27.5%	25.8%	28.8%	28.2%

Compiled internally from information from FILCO - MT of Colombia.