



ILO EVALUATION

- **Evaluation Title:** Technical and Vocational Education and Training Reform in Bangladesh (TVET-R)
- **ILO TC/SYMBOL:** BGD/06/01/EEC
- **Type of Evaluation:** Final Independent Evaluation
- **Country:** Bangladesh
- **Date of the evaluation:** July and August 2014
- **Name of consultants:** Sustineo Pty Ltd (Ms Sue Allan and Ms Mary Mertin-Ryan), Canberra Australia
- **ILO Administrative Office:** ILO Country Office for Bangladesh (CO-Dhaka)
- **ILO Tec. Backstop. Office:** ILO Decent Work Team for South Asia (DWT-New Delhi)
- **Date project ends:** December 2015* (approved no cost extension)
- **Donors:** European Union (EUR 14 million), ILO (EUR 1 million), Bangladesh (EUR 1 million - in kind)
- **Evaluation Manager:** Mr Natanael Lopes, ILO Country Office for Brazil (CO-Brasilia)
- **Evaluation Budget:** USD 38.749,00
- **Key Words:** Technical Education; Vocational Education

This evaluation has been conducted according to ILO's evaluation policies and procedures. It has not been professionally edited, but has undergone quality control by the ILO Evaluation Office.

Table of Contents

List of Abbreviations.....	4
Executive Summary	6
1 Introduction and Background.....	11
1.1 Country Context	11
1.2 Development Achievements	11
1.3 TVET Reform Initiative.....	12
1.4 Project Implementation Arrangements	14
1.5 Project Partners and other Stakeholders	14
2 Evaluation background.....	16
2.1 Purpose and Primary use of the Evaluation	16
2.2 Evaluation Methodology	17
2.3 Geographic Site Visits for Evaluation	18
2.4 Data Analysis	22
2.5 Mainstreaming Gender Considerations	23
3 Main Findings	23
3.1 Relevance	24
3.2 Coherence.....	27
3.3 Effectiveness.....	30
3.4 Efficiency	36
3.5 Impact.....	39
3.6 Sustainability	43
3.7 Gender Issues Assessment	48
3.8 Tripartite Issues Assessment	52
4 Conclusions.....	53
5 Lessons learned and emerging good practices	53
5.1 Research and Design	53
5.2 Development of Public Private Partnerships.....	54
5.3 Skills of TVET-R ILO Team	54
5.4 Tripartite Constituents	55
5.5 Inclusiveness.....	55
5.6 The “Demonstration Effect”	56
5.7 Promotion of TVET in Communities	56
6 Recommendations.....	57
6.1 Recommendations to ILO	57

6.2	Recommendations to Donors.....	58
6.3	Recommendations to Government.....	59
6.4	Recommendations to Industry.....	59
6.5	Recommendations to Training Institutes.....	60
6.6	Recommendations to NGOs and Civil Society.....	60
Annex 1: Analytical Framework of Questions		62
	Methodology	80
	Data Collection Instruments.....	81
	Quantitative Data Collection Plan	83
	The Final Workshop with Stakeholders.....	85
	Independent Evaluation Workshop – Preliminary Findings, Dhaka - Contribution of workshop participants in Table Talk exercise.....	87
Annex 1: Terms of Reference.....		62
Annex 2: Stakeholders consulted during the Final Independent Evaluation of TVET-R.....		80
Annex 3: Bibliography.....		90
Annex 4: Final Workshop Agenda		93
Annex 5: List of Attendees – Final Evaluation Workshop.....		95
Annex 6: Logical Framework Analysis – Final Evaluation Team comments		100

List of Abbreviations

ADB	Asian Development Bank
AYAD	Australian Youth Ambassador for Development
BEF	Bangladesh Employers Federation
BEHTRUWC	Basic Education for Hard to Reach Urban Working Children
BMET	Bureau of Manpower, Employment and Training (Ministry of Expatriates' Welfare and Overseas Employment)
BTEB	Bangladesh Technical Education Board
CBT	Competency Based Training
CBT&A	Competency Based Training & Assessment
CIDA	Canadian International Development Agency
COEL	Centre of Excellence Leather
CRP	Centre for the Rehabilitation of the Paralyzed
CSLB	Competency Skills Log Books
CTA	Chief Technical Advisor
DfID	Department for International Development, UK Government
DTE	Directorate of Technical Education (of MoE)
DWCP	Decent Work Country Program
EC	European Commission
EC	NSDC Executive Committee of the National Skills Development Council
EU	European Union
EUD	Delegation of the European Union (to Bangladesh)
GIZ	German Agency for International Cooperation
GoB	Government of Bangladesh
ILO	International Labour Organization
ILO CO	International Labour Country Office (Bangladesh)
ISC	Industrial Skills Council
JICA	Japan International Cooperation Agency
MAWTS	MAWTS Mirpur Agricultural Workshop and Training School
MCCI	Metropolitan Chamber of Commerce and Industry
MIS	Management information system
MoE	Ministry of Education
MoLE	Ministry of Labour and Employment
MTR	Mid Term Review
NCCWE	National Coordination Committee for Workers Education

NGO	Non Governmental Organization
NSDC	National Skills Development Council
NTVQF	National Technical and Vocational Qualifications Framework
OECD	Organization for Economic Cooperation and Development
OSH	Occupational Safety and Health
PMCC	Project Monitoring and Coordination Committee
PPP	Public Private Partnership
PRSP	Poverty Reduction Strategy Paper
PSC	Project Steering Committee
RPL	Recognition of Prior Learning
RTO	Registered Training Organization
SDC	Swiss Agency for Development and Cooperation
SDP	Skills Development Project (ADB and SDC supported)
TA	Technical Assistance
ToR	Terms of Reference
TTC	Technical Training Centre
TVET	Technical and Vocational Education and Training
UCEP	Underprivileged Children's Education Programs
UNDP	United Nations Development Program
UNESCO	United Nations Educational, Scientific, and Cultural Organization
UNICEF	United Nations Children's Fund
VTTTC	Vocational Technical Teachers Training College
WB	The World Bank

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

Project Background - TVET Reform Project (TVET-R)

From 2007-2013, as part of the 10th European Development Fund, the European Union (EU) injected 14 million Euros into working with the Government to set a policy framework focused Technical and Vocational Education and Training (TVET). The 'TVET Reform Project' (TVET-R) is funded by the EU, and executed by the International Labour Organization (ILO) in partnership with Government of Bangladesh (GoB) Agencies. As a demonstration of their commitment, the ILO also contributed Euros 1million, and the GoB another Euros 1million of in-kind contribution.

TVET-R has focused on reducing mismatches between knowledge and skills of TVET graduates and the demand of the labour markets. TVET-R assistance provided to large groups of under-privileged youth and adults will enable them to improve productivity and income and pursue new careers in the labour market.¹ TVET-R aimed to introduce new approaches of competency-based training and assessment, structured apprenticeships and recognition of prior learning, and quality vocational training, to help create pathways to 'decent work for all'.

Evaluation Background

Purpose: This evaluation sought to assess the key achievements of the intervention as per the project framework. It examined the extent to which TVET-R partners in Bangladesh, tripartite constituents, local communities, and trainees have benefited, and will continue to benefit, from TVET-R's outputs, strategy, and implementation arrangements. It has also aimed to highlight positive outcomes and strengths, areas for improvement, and to make recommendations for sustainability, lessons learned, and good practice. The desk review for this Evaluation began in June 2014 by two consultants from Sustineo Pty Ltd in Canberra, Australia, followed by a field trip to Bangladesh undertaken from 7 to 23 July. The evaluation methodology followed ILO Policy Guidelines for Results-Based Evaluation² and its technical and ethical standards, including Relevance, Coherence, Effectiveness, Efficiency, Impact, and Sustainability.

Primary Data: During the field trip to Bangladesh, the Evaluators visited Dhaka, Gazipur, Savar and Chittagong, met with 38 separate departments, organizations or training institutes, and conducted semi-structured interviews with 58 individuals (52 males and 6 females), discussions with dozens of teachers and trainees on site, and informal conversations with other informants. They conducted a final evaluation workshop in Dhaka to present their preliminary findings at the end of the visit, which 31 Project partners (25 males and 6 females) attended.

The formal meetings and interviews were conducted with a full range of Project stakeholders, including government officers, workers' and employers' organizations, industry leaders, Industry Skills Council members, Principals and staff of training institutes, TVET trainees in private, public and NGO training centres, ILO implementation team members past and present, the Director, Deputy Director and Program Officer of ILO Dhaka, EU program staff and diplomatic representatives, Canada donor representatives, and the Asian Development Bank (ADB) SDP Project Director and staff.

Secondary Data: The range and quality of secondary data consulted included policies, implementation guidelines, progress and monitoring reports, promotional materials, videos,

¹ <http://capacity4dev.ec.europa.eu/article/tvet-reform-promotes-social-inclusion-and-skills-bangladesh>

² http://www.ilo.org/eval/Evaluationguidance/WCMS_168289/lang--en/index.htm

brochures, handbooks and relevant academic and research materials. A full list of data sources can be found in Annex 3 (Bibliography) of this report.

Data Analysis

A critical desktop literature review was carried out, and a comparison of data was made against Project indicators and objectives. Primary data collected through semi-structured interviews and focus groups discussions was analysed under each of the five components of TVET-R. Information was triangulated and cross-checked against each indicator and objective of the five key project components. Through triangulation, the evaluators examined TVET-R's relevance, coherence, efficiency, effectiveness and potential sustainability. The Evaluators ensured that gender considerations were addressed in accordance with ILO Guidance note 4: "Considering gender in the monitoring and evaluation of projects."³

Evaluation Findings

The TVET-R Project has without doubt achieved its Program Purpose and Component Results. The foundations for TVET Reform in Bangladesh have been built and tested. This is a remarkable achievement across five major components. As one stakeholder stated:

"TVET-Reform helped us to understand where we stood and what we should do – we had no measures, we were in an ocean, TVET-R helped us to see the bigger picture." (Stakeholder July 2014)

Key Achievements

The key achievement from the perspective of every person interviewed throughout the evaluation process was 'the successful formulation and formal adoption of the National Skills Development Policy'. To achieve this outcome, an exhaustive process of consultation and collaboration was undertaken over a more than two-year period involving TVET-R team, the Government, and other partners. The outcome of this was not only the development of a national policy for the first time in the Government's history, but the process helped build the foundations of the strong partnership between ILO, and the tripartite constituents (Government, Employers, and Employees) involved in TVET-R. The process also ensured a strong sense of achievement and ownership of the reform process by the Government of Bangladesh. This has resulted in the creation of a broad base of 'champions of change', which is vital to the long-term sustainability of results.

Other significant achievements in building the foundations of the reform process included drafting legislation for the new TVET Act, development of a new structure and coordination mechanism in the National Skills Development Council (NSDC) for the TVET system, policies and guidelines for promoting gender equality and working with people with disability – all of which are ground breaking achievements in the TVET sector in Bangladesh and directly attributable to TVET-R.

Another major outcome of TVET-R is the formulation and adoption of the National Technical and Vocational Qualifications Framework NTVQF, and the Quality Assurance Systems for use in private, NGO and Government training institutions. This has formed the basis for an enhanced TVET system into the future, which will be able to more flexibly respond with increasingly high quality and relevant training programs for Bangladeshi trainees to meet industry demand for skills.

TVET-R's aim to create the systems and foundation in order to strengthen TVET Institutions through improved knowledge and skills of managers and teachers has also been demonstrably achieved. TVET-R has completed the development of training materials and

³ http://www.ilo.org/eval/Evaluationguidance/WCMS_165986/lang--en/index.htm

courses, and the upgrading of skills, competency and experience of management, master trainers, assessors and teachers.

ILO has a unique approach to working with tripartite constituents, and has demonstrated particular expertise in facilitating and supporting Private Public Partnerships through TVET-R. Through TVET-R linkages have been formed between Government and training institutions with industry. This linkage, and engagement with industry was non-existent prior to TVET-R and now plays a vital role in the planning and delivery of TVET. TVET-R has been able to contribute enhanced productivity and competitiveness in key growth and export-oriented industries by assisting Industry Skills Councils to be established in the five industry sectors of leather and leather goods, transport equipment, agro-food processing, information technology, and tourism and hospitality. Both the leather and agro-food Councils incorporate a Centre of Excellence, the first of their kind in Bangladesh.

TVET-R has achieved impressive results in its aim to increase access of underprivileged groups to TVET and in helping to promote the value of TVET to communities. It has partnered with other skills and development projects working with 'the most vulnerable' and helped to create alternative pathways for working children, for example through informal apprenticeships. The apprenticeship training system has been enhanced and expanded across a number of different industries with over 2000 young people provided with on the job training. Other achievements include the NTVQF established for pre-vocational training, on the job training, and pilot programs for women with disability. Models created for increased inclusion, including mainstreaming of gender considerations, and leadership on the development of the National Policy for Promoting Gender Equality in TVET, and the Strategy for people with disability are also highly significant achievements of TVET-R.

Conclusions

The TVET-R has been a highly ambitious and very successful Project and has consolidated ILO's reputation as the leader in TVET Reform in Bangladesh. The expertise, determination and commitment of ILO personnel and the Organization as a whole has been a key success factor for TVET-R. The ILO's ability to broker and facilitate partnerships and trusting relationships has enabled TVET-R to arguably become the most well-known and successful TVET project in the country.

TVET-R has achieved its stated objectives and has managed to do so within budget. However, extra time was required with three no cost extensions granted until December 2015. The additional time was used to translate materials and documents produced during TVET-R into Bangla, and to raise the profile of TVET through comprehensive communications and promotional strategies.

There have been many complex challenges faced by TVET-R, including capacity of Government and other partners, bureaucratic delays, a level of reluctance to embrace change in the technical education system, and the lack of human and physical resources limiting stakeholders' ability to engage fully in the process of reform. There are also still achievements to be made by TVET-R with regard to addressing needs of the underprivileged in TVET, and in gender mainstreaming and reporting on gendered outcomes.

The two main factors that support the likelihood of sustainability of TVET-R efforts are the continuation of Project activities in a limited way under a no cost 18-month extension to the end of 2015, and Canada's funding of the Bangladesh Skills for Employment and Productivity Project (B-SEP) with ILO, which will focus on the implementation of the National Skills Development Policy and scale-up of some activities from the TVET-Reform.

Lessons Learned and Emerging Good Practices

The following is a summary of the key lessons learned throughout the evaluation.

1. **Research and Design** – The allocation of time and resources to research and consultation in the first two years of TVET-R has been a key contributing factor to the quality of TVET-R and the strength of the relationships supporting the work.
2. **Public Private Partnerships (PPP)** – The huge and sustained effort made by the ILO, and supported by the EU (donor), in facilitating the PPP aspects of TVET-R was a key success factor.
3. **Skills of TVET-R Team** – The ILO recruited high quality personnel to undertake this project. The time and effort made to undertake sound HR and recruitment processes with a focus on skills, experience and interpersonal qualities paid off.
4. **Tripartite Constituents** – The ILO approach in working with Tripartite Constituents is a signature quality of this project ensuring that the ‘Decent Work for All’ agenda is kept on the table.
5. **Inclusiveness** – The leadership and expertise that TVET-R has shown in the sector through its commitment to inclusion of the disadvantaged, females, and people with disability, is making a difference in changing perceptions.
6. **The “demonstration effect”** – This ‘demonstration effect’ assisted in changing mind-sets to support TVET-R. This was evidenced through the number of pilots undertaken which served to increased general awareness and more specifically of Government officials.
7. **Promotion of TVET in communities** – It is evident that graduate trainees are a useful source of promotion and there is huge untapped potential to explore use of mobile phone technology for promotion such as through social media, alongside the current communication strategies.

Recommendations

The following is a summary of key recommendations from this evaluation.

Recommendation 1: The ILO reviews the support required for the TVET-R industry sectors (in particular transport, agro-food and IT) to transition to self-sufficiency.

Recommendation 2: The ILO leads the development of a plan and timetable for the implementation of the RPL system.

Recommendation 3: The ILO assertively drives the implementation of gender equality in TVET - supporting NSDC in implementing priority areas outlined in the National Strategy for Gender Equality.

Recommendation 4: The ILO captures more quantitative data on outcomes and impact for both TVET-R and B-SEP.

Recommendation 5: Canada, as Co-Chair of the Skills Development Working Group, continues to take a leadership role in Skills Development generally, and more specifically in the implementation of the National Skills Development Policy Action Plan.

Recommendation 6: Canada continues the high public profile given by the EU to TVET.

Recommendation 7: All donors for Skills Development in Bangladesh work closely with the NSDC and support the implementation of the NSDP Action Plan.

Recommendation 8: The Government of Bangladesh finalises all outstanding legislative requirements.

Recommendation 9: The Government of Bangladesh moves quickly to resource the implementation of the NSDP Action Plan especially fully staffing and resourcing the NSDC Secretariat, BTEB and DTE.

Recommendation 10: Industry continues to take a leadership role in TVET through the Industry Skills Councils and Centres of Excellence.

Recommendation 11: Training Institutes continue to show leadership by promoting and adopting the NVTQF, CBT and RPL.

Recommendation 12: Training Institutes take a leading role, with Government and industry, to find solutions to the cost of CBT so there is greater access from the broader community to training.

Recommendation 13: NGOs continue their strong engagement with the Skills Development Sector and ISCs to advocate on behalf of the disadvantaged, women, and people with disability, and facilitate skills and employment opportunities.

Recommendation 14: Employee Group Representatives take a stronger role with the Skills Development Sector, and ISCs, to advocate for decent work conditions for employees.

Sustainability

Overall, the outlook for sustainability is extremely positive if there is further roll out of well documented and promoted 'demonstration' activities, if capacity building and training efforts continue within the different stakeholder groups, and if the clear support and commitment to reform of the system from Government, Training Institutes and Industry continues.

The biggest risk factor to sustainability is if there are deliberate efforts by a small but vocal minority of development projects to undermine the achievements of TVET-R and other Projects using the new methods of training before they have the chance to establish themselves fully into the TVET system.

Given the potential for socio-economic benefits arising out of the outcomes of a reformed TVET System, there is a strong likelihood of ongoing support for continued change, especially given the amount of time, resources and commitment already expended by so many in influential positions in the country.

As more opportunities are presented to the Bangladesh's export manufacturing industry, the multiple benefits of a skilled workforce will become increasingly understood and demand driven by leaders in business and government. If this is achieved, there will be an increasing self-interest in continuing their support to improvements in the TVET sector until the system becomes fully self-supporting, in order to remain globally competitive in the future marketplace.

INTRODUCTION AND BACKGROUND

1.1 Country Context

Bangladesh is the largest of the least developed, and one of the most densely populated countries in the world. The population of nearly 164 million is ‘young’, with one-third below the age of 15 and nearly 90% of the population considered to be ‘of working age’ (See Table 1).⁴

Table 1: Age break down of Total Population of Bangladesh

Age range	Percentage of Total Population	No. of Males	No. of Females
0-14 years	33.0%	27,393,912	26,601,199
15-24 years	18.8%	14,337,930	16,377,785
25-54 years	37.6%	29,091,046	32,455,670
55-64 years	5.7%	4,775,062	4,625,192
65 years and over	4.9%	3,918,341	4,078,723

1.2 Development Achievements

Despite being frequently affected by natural disasters, such as flooding and cyclones, the economy of Bangladesh has steadily increased, and poverty, which affects half the population, has been declining. Bangladesh has achieved considerable success in socioeconomic development in recent years despite the challenges it faces. Even though the country is working from a low starting point, it has been praised by the international community for increasing life expectancy, reducing the population growth rate, achieving gender parity in education, and improving maternal and child health. In many areas, Bangladesh is well ahead of India and Pakistan.

Millennium Development Goal Progress

The MDGs Progress Report of 2012 reported that Bangladesh has already met several targets of MDGs like reducing the poverty gap ratio, attaining gender parity at primary and secondary education, under-five mortality rate reduction, containing HIV infection with access to antiretroviral drugs, children under five sleeping under insecticide treated bed nets, detection and cure rates of tuberculosis. Since 1991-92 the country has reduced poverty at 2.47% annually, and maternal mortality has declined 40% in nine years.⁵

Workers, Trade and Economy

There are about 8 million Bangladeshis working overseas, in 155 different countries, and remittances from these workers was more than \$14 billion in 2012. Bangladesh is also a leading global exporter of ready-made garments (RMG), second only to China. In 2011-12, RMG sales accounted for 80% of exports, totalling \$19 billion. McKinsey recently predicted that apparel exports could gross \$36 billion by 2020. Goldman Sachs highlighted Bangladesh as one of the next 11 emerging economies and JP Morgan identified it as a ‘Frontier Five’

⁴ http://www.indexmundi.com/bangladesh/demographics_profile.html

⁵ http://www.bd.undp.org/content/bangladesh/en/home/library/mdg/publication_1/

economy. Standard & Poor's and Moody's have rated Bangladesh second only to India for creditworthiness in south Asia.⁶

Skills Shortages

With the availability in Bangladesh of an enormous workforce, referred to as its 'demographic dividend', there is a huge potential for further economic development. Progress, however, is hindered by three main factors: poor infrastructure, poor energy distribution and the **lack of skilled workers**. The lack of skills reflects in the country's high rate of unemployment, and it also causes under-employment.

Also, according to a recent ILO report, young women face the greatest challenge in finding work. The female youth unemployment rate was 22.9% nearly four times greater than the male rate of 6.2%.⁷ As early as 2006, the Government of Bangladesh identified weaknesses that needed to be addressed otherwise they would continue to slow employment growth. Firstly, there are low levels of education and skills in the labour force, and secondly there is a weak formal TVET system insufficiently adapted to labour market requirements, and covering only a small proportion of the training needs.

1.3 TVET Reform Initiative

From 2007-2013, as part of the 10th European Development Fund, the European Union (EU) injected 14 million Euros into working with the Government and partners to set a policy framework that focuses Technical and Vocational Education and Training (TVET) to provide skills for Bangladesh that are directly linked to industry demand. The 'TVET Reform Project' is an initiative of the Government of Bangladesh (GoB). It is funded by the European Union (EU) and executed by the International Labour Organization (ILO) in partnership with government agencies. As a demonstration of their commitment, the ILO also contributed Euros 1 million, and the GoB another Euros 1 million of in-kind contribution.

TVET-R has focused on two most important issues. The first is to reduce mismatches between knowledge and skills of TVET graduates and the demand of the labour markets. Second, TVET-R has provided assistance to large groups of under-privileged youth and adults who were part of the labour market but were under-performing or underemployed. This group represents the major part of the workforce operating in the export-oriented industries such as garments, light engineering or electronics. They also represent a massive share of the labour force in construction, services, and transport. TVET-R assistance provided to large groups of under-privileged youth and adults will enable them to improve productivity and income and pursue new careers in the labour market.⁸

The second issue was to strengthen economic development by ensuring that technical and vocational education and training in Bangladesh is of a consistently high quality, accessible to students, internationally recognized and relevant to the needs of industry. These new approaches of competency-based training and assessment, structured apprenticeships and recognition of prior learning have helped to create pathways to 'decent work for all'. The reform recognizes that for Bangladesh to achieve a reduction in poverty, more people need to have access to both formal and informal TVET training to develop skills that will lead to employment. This includes underprivileged people, women, and people with disability all of whom are traditionally under-represented in formal skills training.

⁶ <http://www.global-briefing.org/2013/04/bangladesh-challenges-and-achievements/>

⁷ Toufique, K.A., June 2014, ILO, Labour market transitions of young women and men in Bangladesh, Youth Employment Programme, Employment Policy Department

⁸ <http://capacity4dev.ec.europa.eu/article/tvet-reform-promotes-social-inclusion-and-skills-bangladesh>

TVET-R Project Development Objectives

TVET-R's Development Objective is to support the pro-poor growth agenda of Bangladesh's Poverty Reduction Strategy Paper by creating more employment opportunities for the poor and strengthening the capacity to tackle the competitive challenges of the country.

The Purpose of TVET-R was to develop a market-oriented and flexible TVET system, which responds to the demand for competitive skills of the modern sector as well as to the needs of youth and under-privileged groups.

TVET-R has five interrelated components:

1. TVET policies, systems and legislation reviewed and strengthened at the central and decentralized levels
2. Enhanced flexibility, quality and relevance of TVET
3. Strengthened TVET institutions through improved knowledge and skills of managers and teachers
4. Improved skills development resulting in enhanced productivity and competitiveness in key growth and export-oriented industries in the formal industrial sector
5. Increased access of underprivileged groups to TVET.

The Expected Outcomes of TVET-R were visionary and included the following.

- New national TVET policy that will allow the TVET system to function more effectively at the central and decentralized levels.
- New national qualifications framework for TVET.
- New skill standards and curriculum in priority occupations.
- New quality assurance arrangements for training organizations.
- Enhanced links between industry and TVET.
- Strengthened TVET institutions through improved knowledge and skills of managers and teachers
- Improved skills development resulting in enhanced productivity and competitiveness in key growth and export-oriented industries in the formal industrial sector.
- Increasing access of underprivileged groups to TVET.

Direct recipients of TVET-R are the numerous Government of Bangladesh departments and agencies. They have had access to the best practices of reforming public education and training systems through the introduction of policies and practices of good governance and decentralization in the systems of public services. The TVET system reform will also produce a spill over to other sectors of public services, which may learn from this reform. Various Government agencies will benefit including: the Department of Technical Education (DTE); the Bangladesh Technical Education Board (BTEB); the public Technical and Vocational Education and Training (TVET) institutions; private technical schools and centres; and NGOs delivering non-certified, short-term and very short-term training.

The Ultimate beneficiaries of this project include:

- Employers who learn and apply structured training approaches and introduce modern training practices and engage with Government training providers.
- The underprivileged persons (including people with disabilities and women) who are provided opportunities for training and employment.
- Regular TVET students and graduates who benefit from better quality teaching in better run training establishments using programs developed with industry. Increasingly these students will have a higher percentage of women.

- Trade unions, which are strengthened in their operation and management and are able to promote skills upgrading for their members.

Funding Arrangements

The TVET Reform Project has a value of Euros 16 million – 14 million Euros was provided in the form of a European Union (EU) grant, complemented with 1 million Euros from the International Labour Organization (ILO) and 1 million Euros in kind from the Government of Bangladesh. Implementation commenced in December 2007. The TVET-R activities were originally planned to be completed in December 2013, but there have been several no cost extensions approved, the current one being to December 2015. The ILO was chosen as the implementing agency, along with the relevant government agencies and concerned ministries. A main implementation contribution of the ILO is the provision of technical and capacity-building expertise.

1.4 Project Implementation Arrangements

The EU Delegation to Bangladesh has an assigned Program Manager based in Dhaka, who has oversight to Private Sector Development and Trade – under which the TVET-R Project sits.

The ILO Country Office in Bangladesh (CO-Dhaka) has oversight of all in country projects, including TVET-R, with an allocated Senior Program Officer assigned to this role. The TVET-R project is part of the ILO's Decent Work Country Program (DWCP) for Bangladesh and it contributes with the following DWCP Outcome – BDG101: Improved skills training and entrepreneurship for enhanced employability and livelihoods, which is linked to the ILO Global Outcome 02: Skills Development: Skills development increases the employability of workers, the competitiveness of enterprises, and the inclusiveness of growth.

Project Steering Committee (PSC) and TVET-R Monitoring and Coordinating Committee (PMCC). Both the PSC and the PMCC played an important role as forums for discussion, decision making and coordination.

The TVET-R Implementation Team is based in Dhaka in its own office. The current small team managing the extension to December 2015 comprises a Senior Specialist (formerly the Chief Technical Advisor to TVET-R), a Program Officer and an Administrative Assistant. Throughout the duration of TVET-R until June 2014, a large team of National and International staff worked together on TVET-R. Each team member was recruited for their particular technical and sectorial expertise aligned to their allocated Component, either as Technical Experts, Program Officers or as Administrative and Support staff. Short-term international and national advisors were brought in for specific tasks throughout TVET-R implementation as required, such as to provide Competency Based Training (CBT), engage with industry and to undertake curriculum reviews etc.

The TVET-R Team is also technically backstopped by the Skills Specialist based at the Decent Work Technical Support Team in New Delhi.

There were two evaluations conducted on TVET-R, including a Mid-Term Review in February 2011 by two external consultants and this Final Independent Evaluation conducted by two consultants from Australia in July 2014. The final evaluation was arranged through ILO's Evaluation Office (EVAL) and was managed by the Evaluation Manager, Mr Natanael Lopes, based in the ILO Country Office for Brazil (CO-Brasilia).

1.5 Project Partners and other Stakeholders

The Government of Bangladesh. TVET-R aimed to draft the national TVET policy and mechanism of its implementation during its initial 2-year phase 1. The structure of the TVET system, functions and coordination between agencies involved in TVET, namely DTE, BTEB

and Bureau of Manpower Employment and Training (BMET) were reviewed and improvements were made.

The Ministry of Education and the Department of Technical Education (DTE). DTE is under the Ministry of Education (MoE) and is the policy-making and administration body in charge of the technical and vocational education system, which involves Technical Schools, colleges and polytechnics. DTE is also a provider of technical services to the TVET system as it is in charge of the qualification and curriculum development.

The National Skills Development Council (NSDC). The NSDC was established in September 2008 supported by TVET-R. The mandate of the NSDC is to develop and implement a national policy for skills development, oversee key reforms, co-ordinate activities and monitor implementation of TVET and skills training. There is a clear need for an apex, or peak, body to oversee TVET and skills training in Bangladesh as there are 22 government ministries delivering programs without any previous coordinated planning or national strategy for skills development.

The Bangladesh Technical Education Board (BTEB). BTEB is a regulatory body in charge of accreditation and certification of qualifications, curriculum development and examinations.

The Public TVET Institutions. These are administered mainly by the Ministry of Education, the Ministry for Expatriate Welfare and by the Ministry of Women and Children Affairs, but also by several other line Ministries.

Polytechnics. These institutions deliver the diploma-level programs, (such as the most common Diploma of Engineering) which may also provide access to higher education or jobs in the public service.

Private Technical Schools and Centres. These have been established throughout Bangladesh to address the large demand for vocational training. They focus mainly on low-cost courses such as business management and computer skills and to a limited extent on basic technical skills.

NGOs Delivering Non-Certified, Short-Term and Very Short-Term Training. These NGOs play an active role in delivering the higher-quality pro-poor, flexible and community-based training and are right across the country, including in the more remote areas.

Industry Partners. A number of key industry stakeholders and local TVET practitioners took part in regional fellowships, which showcased effective working examples of different aspects of TVET in regional countries. The 5 industry areas involved in the TVET-R Project included: IT, Leather, Transport (Shipping), Tourism and Hospitality, and Agro-Food Production.

Industry Skills Councils were created in each of the priority sectors, bringing together the representatives of different associations and key stakeholders to discuss sector development issues and provide guidance to the TVET Reform Project.

Employers and workers had direct input into the national TVET policy development committee, skills standards drafting committees and the qualifications development committees. The Agro Food and Leather Industry Skills Councils have established industry-driven Centers of Excellence.

EVALUATION BACKGROUND

1.6 Purpose and Primary use of the Evaluation

The evaluation has sought to assess the key achievements of TVET-R as per Project Framework, including its Five Strategic Components. It has examined the extent to which TVET-R partners in Bangladesh, tripartite constituents, local communities, and trainees have benefited, and will continue to benefit, from TVET-R's outputs, strategy and implementation arrangements. It has also aimed to highlight positive outcomes and strengths, areas for improvement, recommendations for sustainability, lessons learned and good practice.

The Final Evaluation was conducted in 3 Phases outlined below.

Phase 1 – Evaluation Planning and Desk Review - 23 June to 4 July 2014:

- This was undertaken in Canberra, Australia.

Phase 2 – Evaluation Field Visit to Bangladesh - 8 to 23 July 2014:

- The Evaluators conducted meetings across all stakeholder groups based in Dhaka and in Chittagong.
- The Evaluators met with 38 separate government departments, organizations or Institutes and conducted semi-structured formal interviews with 58 individuals (52 males and 6 females) with trainers and trainees on site, and had informal (but noted) conversations with numerous other informants.
- The final evaluation workshop in Dhaka was attended by 31 stakeholders at the end of the field visit.

Phase 3 – Analysis and Reporting - 25 July to 17 September 2014:

- Combined analysis of desk-top review documentation and data and site visit evidence by 31 July.
- Develop Draft Report and present to ILO Evaluation Manager by 8 August.
- Obtain feedback from ILO by 01 September.
- Revise Draft Report to final report by 15 September.
- Submit Final Report on 15 September.
- Debrief with ILO on findings on 17 September.

The outcome indicators of the final evaluation are linked to the TVET Monitoring and Evaluation Plan and sought to:

- Assess whether the TVET-R has achieved its planned objectives and whether its management systems are appropriate.
- Assess to what extent the TVET-R has responded to the mid-term independent evaluation's recommendations.
- Assess what has worked in the TVET-R and what has not worked, and the reasons.
- Examine if the approach described in the PRODOC was taken, and if it was optimally executed.
- Assess the impact and sustainability of program activities and identify evidence of long-term impact.
- Provide recommendations to support ILO's expansion of its skills development and employment activities based on the key success factors, examples of good practice and any constraints faced.

- Articulate key lessons learned and identify good practice to inform future project development and contribute to knowledge development of the ILO and the program stakeholders.

Clients of the evaluation are:

- The main donor, the European Union
- The TVET-R team in Dhaka, Bangladesh, the ILO Evaluation Manager, Brazil
- ILO Head Office in Bangladesh and ILO Regional and HQ staff
- Tripartite Constituents - government, employers and - and other TVET sector stakeholders.

Dissemination of Findings:

- Evaluation findings and recommendations will inform and guide current projects in the skills program of ILO Dhaka.
- The recommendations will benefit and be addressed by those who will be involved in current ILO projects, and in any pipeline projects to be funded for example by the EU and ADB.
- Preliminary findings and recommendations were tested in an in-country workshop with tripartite constituents during the evaluation field visit in Dhaka.
- The evaluation report will be disseminated in the ILO for organizational learning through the EVAL i-Track evaluation database.
- A summary of the evaluation will be made available publicly through EVAL's website.

1.7 Evaluation Methodology

The methodology used in this final evaluation of TVET-R followed ILO Policy Guidelines for Results-Based Evaluation⁹ and its technical and ethical standards. The evaluators at all times adhered to the Code of Conduct for Evaluation in the UN System¹⁰. The evaluation complied with the OECD/DAC guidelines, listed below, that are directly in line with international standards of good practice, namely relevance, efficiency, effectiveness, sustainability and impact. A detailed Framework of Questions is included in Annex 1.

1. **Relevance:** the evaluation assessed the extent to which the aid activity is suited to the priorities and policies of the target groups, recipients and donors.
2. **Coherence:** the evaluation assessed the extent to which the strategy is logical and consistent, and coherent with design and operations of complementary initiatives and organizations.
3. **Effectiveness:** the evaluation measured the extent to which an aid activity attains the objectives of each of its components and activities.
4. **Efficiency:** the evaluation measured the outputs (both qualitative and quantitative) in relation to inputs.
5. **Impact:** the evaluation explored the positive and negative changes produced by TVET-R, whether directly or indirectly, and intended or unintended. This involved the main impacts and effects resulting from the activity on the local social, economic, environmental and other development indicators. Through analysis of results, the evaluation considered the impact of external factors, such as changes in terms of trade and financial conditions.

⁹ http://www.ilo.org/eval/Evaluationguidance/WCMS_168289/lang--en/index.htm

¹⁰ <http://www.unevaluation.org/ethicalguidelines>

6. **Sustainability:** the evaluation measured whether the benefits of TVET-R are likely to continue after donor funding is withdrawn. It also examined the extent to which TVET-R is environmentally as well as financially sustainable.

Quality of data

The Evaluators have confidence in the quality, accuracy and quantity of primary and secondary data collected during the evaluation. A very broad and representative range of views, opinions and perspectives was gathered and faithfully recorded on both positive and negative aspects of TVET-R, and the quality and quantity of data enabled clear findings and recommendations to be made.

1.8 Geographic Site Visits for Evaluation

The TVET-R Project undertook Program Trials and Pilots in Dhaka, Chittagong, Barisal, Rangpur, Khulna, and outlying areas of Dhaka (Savar, Mirpur, Gazipur). The Evaluation Team visited the range of tripartite constituents in Dhaka, and its outlying areas, and in Chittagong in order to ensure that a broad view of project achievements and issues were observed.

Given the time and logistical constraints during the evaluation period in country, the team, in consultation with ILO Implementation Team agreed that the best examples and coverage were to be seen by visiting Dhaka, Mirpur, Gazipur and Chittagong, since they were representative of TVET-R as a whole.

The rationale for including Chittagong is that it is a premier commercial, financial and industrial hub and the principal maritime gateway of Bangladesh. It accounts for 12% of the national economy - generating 40% of heavy industrial output, 85% of foreign trade and 60% of revenue. This is clearly an area where Skills Development and TVET reform is of high significance. Chittagong is also the centre of industries in steel, petroleum, chemicals, shipbuilding, ship-repair and salvage, glass manufacturing, cement, ceramics, fertilizer, automotive components and motor vehicle assembly. Industry there specializes in garments, leather products, food processing, tea, sports goods and jute products. The Chittagong Export Processing Zone, which is the largest export-processing zone in Bangladesh, was ranked by the Financial Times *as one of the world's best special economic zones*. Chittagong has experienced a rapid reduction in urban poverty. In 2005, the poverty rate was estimated at 27.8%. In 2010, the rate dropped to 11.8%, as compared to the national average of 31.5%.¹¹ Given that there were also numerous interesting and varying Pilot programs under TVET-R being undertaken Chittagong, it was deemed to be a logical place to conduct evaluation activities.

The Evaluators are also satisfied that they were able to visit the full range of Technical Training institutes in Chittagong and Dhaka to ensure feedback was sought from a wide range of stakeholders. The institutes visited are offering various training courses with different emphasis on tradition and innovation, courses for males and females, and they all receive different sources of funding and resource support from the public, private and NGO sectors.

Primary Data

The Evaluators were impressed with and grateful to all stakeholders who gave time during the holy month of Ramadan to engage with the evaluation during the field visit. Informants in Dhaka, Mirpur, Gazipur and Chittagong all went out of their way to share information and insights which were invaluable in building a picture of TVET-R's achievements and outcomes. During our field trip to Bangladesh, visiting Dhaka, Gazipur and Chittagong, the Evaluators met with 38 separate departments, organizations or institutes and conducted semi-

¹¹ Bangladesh: Poverty Reduction Strategy Paper International Monetary Fund. Asia and Pacific Dept

structured interviews with 58 individuals (52 males and 6 females), held discussions with teachers and trainees on site, and had informal conversations with numerous other informants. We conducted a final workshop at the end of the visit which 31 people attended (25 males and 6 females) – many of whom we had met with previously, but some were additional.

Meetings and interviews were conducted with a full range of Project stakeholders, including government officers, workers groups, employers groups, industry leaders, Industry Skills Council members, principals and staff of training institutes of different types, TVET trainees, private, public and NGO training centres, ILO implementation team members past and present, the Director, the Deputy Director and Program Officer of ILO Dhaka, and an ILO international TVET Advisor, EU program staff and diplomatic representatives, Canada donor representatives, and the ADB SDP Project Director and staff. For a full list of stakeholders consulted see Annex 2.

The rationale for this approach was to gather feedback and information from as many different perspectives as possible during the field visit. It is interesting to note that a large percentage of informants had a long association with TVET-R, many having been involved since the beginning, thus adding to their knowledge and experience.



Figure 1: Bangladesh Korean Technical Training Centre, Chittagong

Secondary Data

The range and quality of secondary data made available in the process was impressive – TVET-R has compiled a vast range of policies, implementation guidelines, progress and monitoring reports, promotional materials, brochures, handbooks and on line materials, all of which helped the evaluators build a picture of TVET-R.

For a full list of secondary data consulted see Annex 3.

Some Limitations

The intention was to conduct separate focus group activities with trainees in various settings, such as with groups of females at TVET pilot sites. This was only partially possible, given logistical issues, time constraints and the fact that many classes had shut down for Ramadan and/or for examinations. However, consultations were held with individuals and groups of trainees using translators in institutes where they were in training sessions, such

as with two groups of females - one in Chittagong Mohila Polytechnic Institute and another group of females living with disability in the Centre for Rehabilitation of the Paralyzed in Gazipur. A semi-structured session was used with trainees through interpreters in the Bangladesh Korea Technical Training Institute and less formally with other trainees (both male and female) in Mirpur Agricultural Workshop and Training School (MAWTS) Training Institute in Mirpur (Private) and National Hotel and Tourism Training Institute in Dhaka. We were able to conduct in-depth focus group discussions in the final workshop – where stakeholders and tripartite constituents gathered for the day to discuss the presentation of our preliminary findings, using the ‘Table Talk’ participatory methodology outlined in detail in the Inception Report.



Figure 2: Bangladesh Korean Technical Training Centre, Chittagong

The Final Evaluation Workshop with Stakeholders

The final evaluation workshop held over one full day was held with key stakeholders in Dhaka with representatives from all tripartite constituents, including ILO, EU, Government representatives, Employer groups, Workers and Workers Representatives and TVET sector stakeholders. The workshop planning was highly dependent on the convenience and availability of key stakeholders during our visit in country and during Ramadan, and we were very pleased that 31 people attended.

The venue for the workshop was selected so that people could easily move around to participate in small group work, breakout groups and other participatory activities. The duration of the sessions in the workshop was designed to allow adequate time for breaks and informal networking and discussions, which was highly successful. We planned the workshop itinerary in consideration of Ramadan, and based on advice about the difficulties for participants in working into late afternoons. In consideration of this, the ILO administration and logistics team were very helpful in providing advice about how to overcome challenges relating to catering etc.

We ensured that all key stakeholders were invited to the final workshop, representing the tripartite constituency. Invitations were sent out to all stakeholders on the list provided to the Evaluators by the ILO – and we were delighted with the turnout considering it was over a whole day close to Ramadan. Some participants also travelled from outside Dhaka to attend, which we saw as a clear demonstration of their commitment to TVET-R. For the Final

Evaluation Workshop agenda see Annex 4. For a full list of key stakeholders who participated in the Final Evaluation Workshop see Annex 5.



Figure 3: Final Evaluation Workshop

Workshop Outcomes

The aim of the workshop was for the Evaluators to bring together constituents to present our preliminary findings to stakeholders. Firstly we invited the Guest Speakers to outline their views on the key achievements of TVET-R.

The following guests spoke for around ten minutes each:

- Welcome by Mr Gagan Rajbhandari representing the Director of ILO Country Office
- Major Achievements of TVET-R Project - National Project Director, Mr Mian, Directorate of Technical Education.
- Major Achievements from the Donor's perspective Dr Nicole Malpas Programme Manager European Union.
- Address by-Mr A S Mahmud, Additional Secretary (Development) and Co-Chair Person, Project Steering Committee, Ministry of Education.
- Major Achievements by Chief Technical Advisor TVET-R – Mr Arthur Shears.

The Evaluators gave a PowerPoint presentation of the key findings and recommendations from the Evaluators (see PPT presentation in separate attachment). Through our PowerPoint presentation:

- The successes of the ILO TVET Reform Project was highlighted.
- We presented the preliminary findings, assumptions and conclusions to the group and encouraged and facilitated robust discussion and debate in order to reach a final viewpoint for the evaluation report.
- We identified the key enablers of success in TVET-R to highlight lessons to apply to new TVET project design.

- We identified the main challenges, gaps and issues and their causes experienced through the implementation of TVET-R, along with suggested key strategies to address challenges and issues and as required, seeking input to address any gaps
- We highlighted and documented lessons learned; and made recommendations for sustainability of efforts and strategies for the future of TVET Project design.

Participatory Discussion using Table Talk

The Evaluators then facilitated sessions in order to encourage discussion and debate amongst the disparate group members in order to resolve any doubts around the validity of information or data, to reach and validate some solid conclusions for the final evaluation report. In order to achieve this, the Evaluators used a method called ‘Table Talk’ to encourage full participation by all stakeholders in the discussion. A full report on the recommendations and observations made by participants at the workshop can be found in Annex 1.

The Final Workshop ended with each group speaking to their recommendations so the plenary group could discuss further. The workshop finished by looking forward with Mr Cezar Dragutan, the new CTA for the B-SEP Project speaking about his aspirations for the next stage of TVET reform in Bangladesh.



Figure 4: Key stakeholders engaging in a participatory activity during the Final Evaluation Workshop.

1.9 Data Analysis

The evaluation data has been analysed in three stages.

First, a critical desktop literature review was carried out. These documents included policies, rules and regulations; project progress reports, and mid-term review report; then a comparison of the review data with TVET-R indicators and objectives.

Second, the primary data that was collected through semi-structured interviews, focus groups discussions and field visits was analysed by comparing feedback with each indicator designed under different objectives for five key components of TVET-R.

Third, the information and data was triangulated and cross-checked against each indicator and objective of the five key project components. Through triangulation, we examined whether TVET-R has achieved its stated objectives, and assessed the preliminary impact, and its relevance, coherence, efficiency, effectiveness and potential sustainability.

1.10 Mainstreaming Gender Considerations

The evaluation ensured that gender considerations were addressed in accordance with ILO Guidance note 4: “Considering gender in the monitoring and evaluation of projects.”¹² Key questions under each criterion were designed to ensure the mainstreaming of gender considerations throughout the evaluation, for example, the extent to which gender equality had been integrated into the design and implementation strategies of TVET-R. The evaluation also considered the effectiveness and efficiency of gender related objectives, the outcomes delivered in terms of gender equality, and an estimation of the sustainability of outcomes and measurable impact of the policies on both female and male stakeholders. The ILO Guidelines around gender considerations, as outlined in the ‘ILO Evaluation Guidance’¹³ were utilized and adhered to at all stages of the final evaluation.

The ability to undertake a full gender analysis was limited given the paucity of disaggregated data produced by TVET-R through their monitoring and reporting at this stage. There is a clear need to improve the implementation of gender mainstreaming in TVET-R and specific recommendations can be found in the section on Gender Considerations in the main body of the report.

MAIN FINDINGS

The TVET-R Project has without doubt achieved its Program Purpose and Component Results. The foundations for TVET Reform in Bangladesh have been built and tested. This remarkable achievement and has been tackled across its 5 major components.

The key achievement from the perspective of every person interviewed throughout the evaluation process was ‘the successful formulation and formal adoption of the National Skills Development Policy’. The outcome of this was the development of a national policy for the first time in the Government’s history, and the process of consultation helped build the foundations of the strong partnership between ILO, and the tripartite constituents (government, employers and workers). This has resulted in the creation of a broad base of ‘champions of change’, which is vital to the long-term sustainability of results.

Other significant achievements in the building of the foundations of the reform process included drafting legislation for the new TVET Act, development of a new structure and coordination mechanism in the National Skills Development Council (NSDC) for the TVET system, policies and strategies for promoting gender equality and working with people with disability – all of which are ground breaking achievements in the TVET sector in Bangladesh and directly attributable to TVET-R.

The formulation and adoption of the National Technical and Vocational Qualifications Framework, has formed the basis for an enhanced TVET system into the future. TVET-R’s aim to create the systems and foundation in order to strengthen TVET Institutions through improved knowledge and skills of managers and teachers has also been demonstrably achieved.

ILO has a unique approach to working with tripartite constituents, and has particular expertise in facilitating and supporting Private Public Partnerships, as demonstrated through TVET-R. TVET-R has assisted 5 Industry Skills Councils to be established and two of these

¹² http://www.ilo.org/eval/Evaluationguidance/WCMS_165986/lang--en/index.htm

¹³ http://www.ilo.org/eval/Evaluationguidance/WCMS_206205/lang--en/index.htm

have incorporated a Centre of Excellence, the first of their kind in Bangladesh.

TVET-R has achieved impressive results in partnering with others to achieve in its aim to increase access of underprivileged groups to TVET and in helping to promote the value of TVET to communities. Models created for increased inclusion, including mainstreaming of gender considerations, and leadership on the development of the National Policy for Promoting Gender Equality in TVET, and the Strategy for people with disability are also highly significant achievements of TVET-R.

The TVET-R has been a highly ambitious and very successful Project and has consolidated ILO's reputation as the leader in TVET Reform in Bangladesh TVET-R has achieved its stated objectives and has managed to do so within budget. However, extra time was required with three no cost extensions granted until December 2015. The additional time is being used to translate materials and documents produced during TVET-R into Bangla and to raise the profile of TVET through comprehensive communications and promotional strategies.

ILO's ability to broker and facilitate partnerships and trusting relationships has enabled TVET-R to become the most high profile and successful one working in the TVET sector in country.

1.11 Relevance

Relevance to the primary Donor, the European Union

TVET-R has high relevance for the primary donor, the European Union. The Head of Delegation to Bangladesh made these statements in an interview in 2012 and this was reiterated during our meeting with him, where he stated that 'TVET-R has been my favourite Project since I have been in this post'. Other comments follow and speak for themselves:

"TVET and skills development in particular are consistent with the new European Union (EU) priorities for development cooperation as set out in the Agenda for Change, especially the emphasis on inclusive and sustainable growth for human development. The importance of skills development is recognized in all national policy documents, especially the National Skill Development Policy (NSDP) to which the Sixth Five Year Plan refers. The NSDP mentions that government, industry, workers and civil society recognize the vision for skills development. They identify it as a coordinated and well planned strategy for national and enterprise development, as well as a way of empowering all individuals to access decent employment and of ensuring Bangladesh's competitiveness in the global market.

The primary aim of the European Commission's own development strategy is the eradication of poverty and this is done through concentrating on six priority areas. The TVET Reform Project crosses a number of these, namely trade and development, support to macroeconomic policies and equitable access to social services and institutional capacity building. There has been greater interest in skills development in Bangladesh the past two years, especially since the adoption of the National Skill Development Policy in January 2012. Many development partners are now willing to invest in skills development, including the Department for International Development (UK Aid), Asian Development Bank, World Bank, Swiss Development Corporation, GIZ, CIDA, JICA, etc¹⁴).

Relevance to the Government of Canada

This donor expressed feedback confidence in ILO and their belief in the relevance, achievements and approach to TVET reform of the TVET-R Project. This is supported by

¹⁴ http://www.ilo.org/wcmsp5/groups/public/---asia/---ro-bangkok/---ilo-dhaka/documents/publication/wcms_160971.pdf

evidence to take forward several of the TVET-R activities (namely to contribute towards the implementation of the National Skills Development Policy formed under TVET-R), with largely the same implementation team through the new Project Bangladesh Skills for Employment and Productivity Project (B-SEP), which began in June 2014. This is a resounding endorsement of their belief in the positive achievements of ILO and the results attained by this Project. In March 2014, Canada took over from the Swiss International Development Cooperation Agency as the Development Partner Co-Chair of the Skills Development Committee, which by working with the B-SEP Chief Technical Advisor from ILO and other project personnel, is attempting to improve coordination and collaboration of effort amongst all the main Skills Projects functioning in country at this time. This further demonstrates Canada's commitment to effective reform in this sector, and to continued close alliance with the ILO team and other donors.

Relevance to other donors

As previously mentioned, there are many other international donors (DFID, Canada, GIZ, Swiss, WB, ADB, JICA) providing ongoing and new funding through grants and loans to Bangladesh for Projects focusing on TVET reform and Skills development. This also demonstrates the recognition of the achievements and importance of the stated objectives in the TVET-R Project, the economic and social opportunities that exist in the country in the area of manufacturing, trade and exports and the shortfall in appropriately skilled workers available to meet growing demand.

Relevance to the ILO

This Project fits very well with the ILO direction and philosophy, particularly the ILO Decent Work Country Program (DWCP). This was the flagship Project in Bangladesh for ILO from 2007 and its design, which includes a strong focus on the tripartite constituency at its core, has enabled ILO to build its own capacity in linking with industry and to demonstrate its competency and leadership in skills development across the Bangladesh skills sector. Skills Development is one of the four key priorities of ILO and this project also gives relevance to workers' rights and conditions, inclusion for the under-privileged and marginalised, women, and people living with disability – all of which are highly relevant to ILO internationally.

Relevance to the Government of Bangladesh (GoB)

The development and adoption of the National Skills Development Policy was the key achievement outlined by all GoB officers during the evaluation. There was a strong sense of ownership and pride in this significant policy amongst informants from public sector stakeholders, including the Ministry of Education (MoE), Directorate Technical Education (DTE), Bangladesh Technical Education Board (BTEB), Bureau of Manpower, Employment and Training (BMET) and the National Skills Development Council (NSCD). In every interview conducted during the visit, informants confirmed that TVET-R Project had helped them achieve the building of the foundations of reform in the TVET sector. This is an issue which has been flagged as a priority of the Government of Bangladesh since at least 2006. It was mentioned in every Government meeting that the Prime Minister herself is a strong supporter of the TVET-R Project and its objectives and achievements. This is also demonstrated by the fact that the Prime Minister is the Chair of the NSDC and has personally attended and endorsed numerous Project functions and achievements (such as the National Strategy to Promote Gender Equality in TVET 2012).

Relevance to Training Institutes

There is still a long way to go in terms of the entire TVET sector embracing reform and change in Bangladesh. However, the Principals, staff and trainees visited were all very convincing in their endorsement of the new National Technical and Vocational Quality Framework (NTVQF) and Competency Based Training curriculum and modules. The institutes visited all saw CBT as the relevant way forward for the country if it is to keep up with

demand for skills in the fast changing business environment, but all acknowledged that change will be slow and require huge inputs of resources.

Despite the challenges to the *status quo* in terms of teaching and learning styles, the management staff and trainers in Institutes consulted while viewing the TVET-R Pilot activities, were very positive about the relevance of the new skills and CBT method training received through TVET-R to their own career paths, and to improved skills gained by their students. In all interviews they confirmed positive outcomes for employers who are giving preference to the more highly skilled trainees in their workplaces.

Relevance to Trainees

The relevance of this Project is compelling. For both male and female trainees (including those with disabilities) consulted during the evaluation across eight different training institutions - the key motivating factor was the economic imperative of finding a suitable job in their skills area with a reasonably good salary either in Bangladesh or as migrant workers. Given that CBT approaches focus on giving trainees competency in skills matched closely to demand of industry, coupled with the opportunity for certification with recognizable qualifications in TVET – TVET-R outcomes are highly relevant to their needs and aspirations.

Training undertaken through the National Diploma of Engineering (the traditional TVET system which is still operating) has little or no focus on skills competency or practice, but focuses mainly on academic theory. The new way of skills training introduced under TVET-R is much more relevant to trainees as they can apply their skills as soon as they begin work and get paid as workers. For females and for those with disabilities, the skills gained through the Pilot courses have provided them with opportunities to train on the job as well as in the classroom. It was reported by trainees with disability that TVET-R approaches and associated partnership agreements with industry, has provided them with new equality of opportunity not previously available to them, particularly in the RMG sector.

Some testimonials from stakeholders are noted below:

‘We got so much support from TVET-R to train ourselves and our teachers in CBT. We worked closely with the garment industry and we got a lot of support from ILO. We now train our disabled and under-privileged trainees using the CBT methods. We had the first disabled women working in the garment industry. The factory owner is very pleased and said out of their 8000 employees, our (disabled) trainees were the best, and now the employers want us to train more. If disabled people can get this type of training it will empower them to get recognition, employment or self-employment’. (NGO working with People with Disabilities)

‘Since 2012 with the support of TVET-R and the setting up of the Centre of Excellence for Leather, over 8000 people have been trained following the NTVQF and CBT, and 95% of them have been employed, including 60% females. For employees, this provides gainful employment, a good career path, better working conditions and higher salaries’. (Project Implementation Team Member)

‘We have been adopting Competency Based Training through our pilots, and employers have been very supportive. We have a strong partnership with a ready-made garment factory, which gave us sewing machines and materials, and helped with training modules. They are now taking between 70% and 80% of our all female trainees into their workplace. In our Diploma of Engineering there is only around 50% employment and not often in the related skills area, and a lot of females drop out’. (Principal Training Institute)

‘From our involvement with TVET-R in the pilot programs, we have raised our rates to 90% employment for those trainees undertaking CBT in a number of skills areas. There are visits to industries and on the job training activities for one month for

these students so trainees are more job ready under this system and employers like this too'. (Principal Training Institute)

Relevance to Employer Groups

This Project is of extreme relevance and importance to Employer Groups and Industry in general in Bangladesh. There is a huge workforce in Bangladesh in demand domestically and overseas, and so the improvement in Skills Training is vital to the development of a responsive and quality workforce into the future. One key aspect that was mentioned in a high percentage of meetings with respondents is that TVET-R and ILO in its approaches managed to facilitate very well the partnership between the private and public sectors, something that had not occurred before in this country. The benefits and relevance of this Project to the private sector are most evident, given that employer needs for skilled workers is highlighted as the guiding factor in TVET-R design, and that through Industry Skills Councils, employers are put in a leadership role in this partnership arrangement.

Relevance to Employee Groups

The Evaluation Team met with members of Bangladesh Labour Federation and the Bangladesh Trade Union Centre. From their perspective that people have 'the right to employment with fair wages and good conditions', the TVET-R Project is highly relevant to the achievement of those goals. Their feedback was TVET-R has helped orientate the TVET system to skills and jobs and that good skills are a pre-requisite to good wages and conditions. They also mentioned the importance that is placed in the NVTQF and curriculum on Occupational Safety and Health, which has good outcomes for workers in the long run.

1.12 Coherence

Research and Design

Based on feedback from informants and through secondary data, the Evaluators are convinced of the importance and value of the extensive research and consultation that was undertaken at TVET-R design and start up phases. The time and effort taken to ensure that the design was sound, (albeit very ambitious) has paid off and resulted in a high quality Project. Significantly, what sets TVET-R Project apart from most of the current TVET Projects in Bangladesh, was that there were no major design changes, apart from some minor alteration to indicators/ targets after the Mid Term Review.

The design of TVET-R is appropriate for a Reform Project, where the interconnecting Components look at change and growth across all aspects of TVET and support TVET-R Purpose including:

- TVET policies, systems and legislation reviewed and strengthened at the central and decentralized levels.
- Enhanced flexibility, quality and relevance of TVET.
- Strengthened TVET institutions through improved knowledge and skills of managers and teachers.
- Improved skills development resulting in enhanced productivity and competitiveness in untitled folder 7key growth and export-oriented industries in the formal industrial sector
- Increased access of underprivileged groups to TVET.

Many respondents have acknowledged that this Project was 'wildly ambitious' and that 'it probably would have not worked without the extraordinary dedication and skills of TVET-R team'. At the same time informants from all stakeholder groups have reported that TVET-R design, which drew on international and national expertise within ILO and which ensured a multi-pronged approach to reform, was a key enabler to TVET-R's success. It is an interesting point of discussion as to whether the high level of success in this Project was actually 'an unexpected outcome', given the scale and ambition of the design – and whether the

outcomes would be achievable in another context, at another time and with different personnel.

Another key aspect of TVET-R design and start-up phases, was the fact that considerable resources, time and effort were put into consultation and building relationships from the beginning with all stakeholders, which resulted in their 'buy-in'. This also paid off in terms of ensuring the design of TVET-R reflected stakeholder priorities and interests.

Pace of Progress

At times, there have been questions within the partner group about the 'pace of progress and quantity of outputs' in terms of the pilots and the practical implementation of the new systems. It has been a Project where the supporting mechanisms and framework has been built to support the more 'visible and action orientated' outcomes, which is vital to long term reform and sustainability. For Government however, which is often focused on quantitative outcomes (number of pilots, number of teachers trained, number of students with certificates etc) and for industry partners who are very focused on their need to meet target numbers of workers in short time frames, the pace and 'volume' of achievement in TVET-R has, at times, appeared to be slow.

Strategic Objectives and Assumptions

The Logical Framework Matrix, which was updated in February 2012 after the Mid Term Review (MTR), is comprehensive, coherent and user friendly, having been reported against on a regular basis throughout TVET-R by the implementation team members responsible for each Component area. It is evident that all team members had a high awareness of the indicators and targets in each component area and the progress that had been made during the implementation period in their area of responsibility as well as overall for TVET-R.

Qualitative Indicators

The indicator targets are largely quantitative apart from some for Component 5, which are qualitative relating to beneficiary outcomes. This is somewhat appropriate for this Project design, given that it was outputs driven for a large portion of the implementation period – but the MTR noted that gender disaggregated reporting should have occurred for all components. It was discussed in the final Evaluation Workshop in Dhaka that the development of a more complex M&E system focussing on qualitative indicators of impact on Trainees (including disaggregated gender data) was a strategy of the new B-SEP team, along with the development of tracer studies to follow up on employment outcomes over the longer term. During the latter part of TVET-R, where communications activities and promotional materials were in higher production mode, more evidence of collecting compelling stories and 'human interest' perspectives is evident.

Cross-Cutting Themes

It was recommended in the MTR that:

'A number of cross-cutting themes, particularly increased access to TVET and employability for women and people with disabilities, are placed under the intervention logic for Component-5 in the Logframe. While the Skills Development Policy does mention including the above underprivileged sections of society, and certain efforts are made by some members of TVET-R team, the onus of ensuring their inclusion should not be born alone by Component 5.'

From discussions with the implementation team, the Evaluators have confidence that these recommendations have been taken on board to some degree since the MTR and awareness of the importance of ensuring gender and disability sensitivity in course materials and instruction in Components 2, 3 and 4 has improved since that time. However, there is room for further improvement in the new B-SEP Project implementation and more discussion around this issue appears later in this report.

Assumptions and Risks

Observations in the MTR and adjustment to Assumptions and Risks, namely the limitations of implementation capacity by the Government of Bangladesh remains a project risk to the end of 2015 and into the future in terms of sustainability of efforts. ILO and TVET-R implementation teams of TVET-R and B-SEP clearly acknowledge and have plans to manage this ongoing risk. The specific strategies to support ongoing capacity development, particularly in BTEB and NSDC, are clearly evident in future project implementation plans. For example the B-SEP plan states:

'Support will be provided to the NSDC to lead inter-ministerial coordination to support NSDP implementation and develop new mechanisms and sources of funding, including potentially, through a national human resources fund as foreshadowed in the NSDP¹⁵ '.

Productive Collaboration with other TVET Projects. Along with the Assumption and Risks relating to the GoB capacity to implement the changes to the TVET system and to adopt the NVTQF and CBT, is the underlying assumption that other donor funded Skills Projects will collaborate, the risk being that other Projects will not work in competition and undermine the TVET-R efforts.

There is strong evidence that the TVET-R Implementation team, staff in the ILO Dhaka, and even the EU Program Manager have all made considerable attempts to encourage and facilitate collaboration and coordination of effort between their Project and others working in TVET. To this end, there has been good collaboration with UNICEF through their 'Basic Education for Hard to Reach Urban Working Children' (BEHTRUWC) Project and others.

'Skills Development Project' and Risk. In relation to the ADB's Skills Development Project (SDP) in particular, there has been little success in achieving meaningful collaboration to date, and in fact the Evaluators believe this presents a key risk for TVET-R, and for B-SEP and other Skills Projects into the future. TVET-R Director and the Additional Project Director of SDP funded by ADB, in describing their skills development work, presented a parallel system to that of the work undertaken by TVET-R. The potential for this 'parallel system' to evolve was noted as a concern in the MTR.

The sector as a whole is aware of the strong public vocal opposition by the SDP team towards TVET-R and its achievements and approaches, and this was highlighted as a concern on many occasions during interviews. From the research and meetings, the criticisms promulgated by the current SDP team are not an accurate, valid or a fair reflection on the TVET-R Project. The concern is, however, that this team's strong opposition to these new approaches aligned to the NSDP and NVTQF that many other Projects in the Skills development sector in Bangladesh are adopting, presents high risk to all working in the sector currently.

Key Government stakeholders involved in TVET-R complained that SDP is creating 'parallel structures and processes', not collaborating or following the National Skills Development Policy and openly criticizing the NVTQF, while creating courses without certification 'claiming they were in the spirit of CBT'. The essence of SDP Project Management opposition is reflected in their comments about the 'complexity of the new system', their doubt on the 'genuine nature of buy-in by Government partners' and their skepticism around 'the value' of the National Policy and Framework since they are 'just documents'. The Evaluators agree with the views shared by respondents that this could very likely serve to create more division and conflict in the sector, undermine and dilute the efforts and achievements of TVET-R and other Projects, and pose a major risk to sustainability of efforts across the board. See the Recommendations section for further comments.

¹⁵ B-SEP Project Implementation Plan 2014

1.13 Effectiveness

The Evaluators are very impressed with the quality and quantity of outputs achieved under TVET-R to July 2014. We consider that effectiveness can mainly be measured against the indicators in the logical framework and have provided a detailed in Annex 6, with a commentary on achievements, progress, and any outstanding issues. The major achievements by component are listed below.



Figure 5: National Tourism Training Institute Dhaka

Component 1: TVET policies, systems and legislation reviewed and strengthened at the central and decentralized levels.

- The National Skills Development Policy and the National Implementation Action Plan, have been formulated and formally adopted.
- A new structure and coordination of TVET system has been established and awaits the approval of the draft NSDC Act and amended BETB Act.
- A Strategy for the Promotion of Gender Equality in Technical and Vocational Training 2012 has been finalized.
- A Strategy for Working with People with Disabilities has been developed.

Component 2: Enhanced flexibility, quality and relevance of TVET.

- The National Technical and Vocational Qualifications Framework, the Quality Assurance System have been formalized and adopted and in use in private, NGO and Government training institutions.
- An NTVQF Implementation Manual is available with BTEB for further roll out. More than 200 units of competence have been developed in 12 occupations with close to 50 qualifications.
- An industry database (MIS) has been established within the NSDC and is ready to be made fully functional.

- Analysis of relevant qualification/institution highlighted that overall trainees were predominantly male (83%), were from the 14-27 year age bracket (86%), and the most common form of educational attainment was Secondary School Certificate (Vocational) (61%). For more details on the break down of trainees to gender, age and educational attainment, see Table 2.

Table 2: Number of Trainees, Gender, Age and Educational Attainment by Qualification/ Institution

Qualification /Institution	No. of Trainees	Gender		Age Bracket			Educational Attainment			
		Male	Female	14-27	28-41	42 - up	JSC	SCC	College Level	College Graduate
Welding (TSC Barisal)	20	18	2	15	5		3	12	4	1
Welding (TTC Chittagong)	20	20		20			4	14	2	
Welding (Western Marine)	20	20		19	1		4	15		1
EIM (TTC Chittagong)	20	16	4	20			1	19		
Fitting (TTC Chittagong)	20	NA	NA	20			3	14		1
Baking (NHHTI)	20	12	8	14	6		1	6	9	3
FP&QC (Dhaka Polytechnic Institute)	21	15	6	13	6	2	1	9	4	7
Graphic Design (GAI)	20	12	8	14	6		2	12	3	3
IT Support (Feni Computer Institute)	20	18	2	20			20			
Web Design (Feni Computer Institute)	20	20		18	2			20		
TOTAL	201	151	30	173	26	2	39	121	22	16

Component 3: Strengthened TVET institutions through improved knowledge and skills of managers and teachers.

- Operational Handbook for TVET Institutions' Manager, December 2013 is completed and is currently being translated into Bangla. The extra time available through the no –cost extensions to TVET-R has enabled the translations of documents in Bangla.
- Leadership and Management Development (LMD) Program is developed and more than 100 TVET institution managers and department heads trained and over 20 NGO and private institutions have staff participated in the Leadership and Management Development Program.
- New system established that include two levels of instructor training: Certificate IV in CBT&A and Certificate V in Competency Based Training & Assessment (CBT&A) and more than 400 instructors have completed Cert IV training and more than 20 in Certificate V training (Master Trainers). The instructors were from NGO, Government, and private sector institutions.



Figure 6: National Tourism Training Institute Dhaka

Component 4: Improved skills development resulting in enhanced productivity and competitiveness in key growth and export-oriented industries in the formal industrial sector.

- Industry Skills Councils have been established in five industry sectors – leather and leather goods; transport equipment; agro-food processing; information technology; and tourism and hospitality. Both the leather and agro-food Councils incorporate a Centre of Excellence. High levels of industry engagement and commitment have been achieved.
- A model has been developed to assist the replication of further ISCs.
- Modern work practices are being introduced through: the training on CBT&A (leather and agro-foods); training of over 30 managers across different industries in Kaizen; training and introducing a range of business tools and workplace cooperation modules.
- Over 100 people participated¹⁶ in the fellowship programs and study visits (Australia, Malaysia, Korea, Sri Lanka and the Philippines).
- To improve linkages between TVET and enterprise over 100 industry assessors have been trained on CBT&A with over a third having been accredited by BTEB.
- Women are well represented in the apprenticeships at the Centre of Excellence Leather (COEL) (Machine operative). 68% of apprenticeships are held by females, compared to 32% males.

Component 5: Increased access of underprivileged groups to TVET.

- Community Based Training for Economic rural Empowerment (CB-TrEE) was developed and piloted as part of the TVET-R project. It is now being mainstreamed into TVET and the courses are being approved by the BTEB.
- NGOs, Government and private providers developed and established options for working children including different pathways, in 14 informal occupations, e.g.

¹⁶ Figures provided by the ILO Dhaka.

through informal apprenticeship, training by NGOs on non-formal school hours. Competency Skills Log Books (CSLBs) were developed for the informal sector encompassing a Code of Practice. Over 11,000 child workers were trained in 1st and 2nd phase through BEHTRUWC project partners.

- Model for informal apprenticeship has been developed and piloted and proven successful in more than 12 trades. More than 700 micro-businesses in 5 sectors hosted 2000 young persons and provided on job training.
- RPL system designed and approved by BTEB in 24 RPL centres with over 45 industry assessors trained and certified as registered assessors.
- The NTVQF has established two levels Pre-Voc 1 and 2 available for people with lower educational levels and over a 100 people have already benefited from training at this level.
- Several pilots conducted including ones with Underprivileged Children's Education Programs (UCEP), BRAC and BMET. More than 10,000 persons trained by NGOs oriented to work with under-privileged young persons.
- Models have been created for increased inclusion, including mainstreaming of gender considerations and for people with disability, for example at TSC-Gazipur and CMPI-Chittagong are now conducting a CBTA course on Sewing Machine Operation for under-privileged females including people with disabilities.
- Informal sector, green jobs training were conducted through BMET at two TTCs namely Rangpur TTC and Khulna TTC. The course was Solar Home Systems (installation and servicing). The number of trainees was 120, all being males.
- Women were well represented in informal apprenticeship under the UNICEF-BRAC-ILO project. Overall 60.5% were female, to 39.5% male. Specific examples of this include: TSC Gazipur where of 92 apprentices 63 are female; CMPI Chittagong where all 71 apprentices are female; and CRP where all 39 apprentices are female, 22 of whom have a disability. There were 500 Master Craft Persons involved in this model with 139 female and 347 male.



Figure 7: CPR-Savar



Figure 8: CPR-Savar

Assessment of levels of Government involvement

One of the key strengths and achievements of TVET-R has been the level of commitment, buy-in and ownership demonstrated by the Government of Bangladesh partners. In almost every interview conducted during the evaluation, respondents also commented on the personal involvement and endorsement of TVET-R Project by the Prime Minister as an indicator of Government support and confidence in the approach.

A number of factors have contributed to this achievement including: the experience and cultural competence of National Staff and their expertise in the TVET and Government sectors and their vast networks in both areas; the expertise of International staff in building relationships across cultures; and the commitment and dedication of Government staff themselves in working with TVET-R. This has been very well encapsulated in the MTR and still rings true at the end of TVET-R.

'The Government's in kind contribution includes its commitment to, ownership of, and involvement in TVET-R. Many senior and other staff give many hours of their time to participate fully across all areas of project activity including outside of their normal working hours. This occurs to such a high degree that it deserves to be acknowledged as a distinctive element of what is being and has been achieved¹⁷.

Apart from testimonials from individual informants, it is evident that Government officials, particularly from MoE, DTE, BTEB, BMET, and NSDC are all extremely well informed of and involved in TVET-R implementation, its promotion and endorsement activities. Some of the Government officers did not previously have expertise in TVET, but since their involvement they report that their own capacity to support reform in this sector has increased markedly. Several Government officers commented on the valuable support given to them personally by Project team members, and praised the professional development outcomes of their involvement in the Fellowship Program under TVET-R. They also continued to build their capacity and interest in TVET through ongoing exposure sector reform issues through workshops and regular meetings, TVET-R Steering Committee, the Executive Committee of the NSDC, and through other Project related activities.

Private Public Partnerships

The demonstrated commitment of TVET-R team to facilitate collaboration between Government and the Private Sector has also enhanced the level and quality of the partnership arrangements – which has significantly contributed to the positive achievements made over the last 6+ years by TVET-R. The mix of international expertise in Public-Private

¹⁷ Mid Term Review Report – TVET Reform Project Bangladesh 2011.

Partnership (PPP) development, the cultural and social expertise of national staff and the technical expertise across the team has also been a major contributing factor to this outcome.



Figure 9: Western Marine Shipyard, Chittagong

Adoption of the Recommendations in the Mid Term Review

The following provides a summary of the response to the Mid Term Review recommendations by TVET-R Implementation team.

Recommendation 1. *'The time is now right, to take a major step up in levels of emphasis and efforts regarding visibility and dissemination of TVET-R's impressive achievements. This is especially in regard to the many "best practice" resource materials and procedures TVET-R has developed and put in place. Crucial in this regard will be an enhanced web presence and capturing best practice training activity electronically*¹⁸.

Since the mid-term evaluation TVET-R has recruited a series of Australian Youth Ambassador for Development volunteers (AYADs) who worked specifically on Communications and Promotion. Up until the end of 2013 one AYAD volunteer spent 18 months working on production of the promotional materials, which have been packaged and shared. These resources comprise fact sheets, pilot sheets, stories of change, individual stories, videos, replication guides and information sheets promoting further engagement. Examples include "Why Support Skills Development?" and "How to become a Registered Training Organization" During TVET-R dozens of press releases were also prepared that related to project events including workshops, conferences, and ISC meetings for example. From this, it is evident that the recommendations in the MTR have been embraced, and by looking at the Workplan for the remaining 18 months of TVET-R, communication and promotion are given high priority and focus until the end of 2015.

¹⁸ Mid Term Review Report – TVET Reform Project Bangladesh 2011.

Recommendation 2: *‘Revisit the wording of entrance requirements in course/programme documents developed by TVET-R in order that “Grade 8” completion is not misinterpreted as being an absolute barrier to entry in all circumstances’.*

TVET-R team reported that on the recommendation of the MTR, the wording has been changed. There are now four pathways to entry – Grade 8 plus three others, or one year's work experience, a challenge test, a Pre-Voc pass, or challenge test of language, literacy, numeracy considered necessary for the trade. The wording of the entrance requirements section of the National Skills Development Policy was also approved some months after the MTR and adequately reflects this provision and so now there is no ambiguity. This demonstrates that this recommendation from the MTR was acted upon.

Recommendation 3: *‘Undertake, as a matter of priority, a financial review to obtain a fuller understanding and quantification of anticipated projected spending during the remaining lifetime of TVET-R, in particular to:*

Assess the scope and appropriateness (if any):

- *For transfer of funds between budget lines;*
- *For support of additional activities and interventions, judged to be priorities (such as the communications and dissemination activities recommended above, as well as the capturing and dissemination on video/DVD of exemplary training practice)’.*

TVET-R CTA reported that they had adopted this MTR recommendation. After the MTR TVET-R budget was reviewed regularly with the Component managers and adjustments were made to respond to changing needs, including making substantial shifts between budget lines. These changes, for example, transferred extra money into equipment purchases, funding for short-term consultants, and money for service contracts. Rather than video the trainers, TVET-R ensured there were a number of Master Trainers trained in the CBT methodologies and that there were plans in place to develop local centres where the Certificate IV program could operate as a sustainability strategy.

1.14 Efficiency

Overall

TVET-R scores very well in terms of efficiency, being of sound design in terms of the division of implementation activities and related resources to achieve results between the five interconnecting Components.

TVET-R Implementation Team reported that their financial management of TVET-R has been of high standard, evidenced by three ‘no cost’ extensions having been approved, while at the same time all intended results across TVET-R having been substantially achieved. There were significant hold ups to Project activities at times during the implementation period, especially for extensive consultation and drawn out approval processes by Government and notably during a particularly politically volatile period in 2013. The last no cost extension was justified by the Government and key participants of the PSC given the high priority accorded to the skills program and so to not disrupt the on-going cooperation that has been established. So in fact, the results overall, achieved under budget, have been highly commendable, especially given the nature of the challenges for a TVET reform Project in the current development context.

Early Delays

In the early stages TVET-R’s efficiency was affected by delays that were beyond their direct control. These included activities that required Government approval, such as the National Skills Development Policy, which took two years to finalize. These and other delays such as political unrest, some issues relating to the quality of work by some consultants that had to be redone slowed down the start up of the Pilot Programs Other hold ups affecting

efficiency included identification of a greater lack of resources and equipment in some Institutions where Pilot programs were planned, and the need to provide additional training for trainers to improve their skills and competencies before trials began (in areas such as computer use).

Achievement Summary

The achievements are far too numerous to list, however, TVET-R was remarkably efficient in the use of the allocated resources to achieve all the stated Project objectives in the given period.

Key achievements include:

- NSCD established and functioning with a Skills Policy Implementation Plan and an Operational Plan ready to be implemented.
- The Skills Database in place ready for use.
- Analysis and review of the legal environment for TVET.
- The National Skills Development Policy developed and adopted.
- Public – Private Partnerships established and functioning well.
- Fellowship visits conducted to build awareness and capacity of government partners and other stakeholders.
- Industry Skills Councils formed in 5 sectors.
- Two Centres of Excellence established and functioning as planned and others getting ready.
- The NTVQF developed and 130 Instructors trained in this from public institutions.
- Curriculum and course materials, teaching modules in full development and growing.
- 22 Pilot demonstration Programs rolled out and two review workshops conducted to improve implementation.
- Equipment and materials procured for partners training in Leather, Agro food, IT and RMG.
- Replication guides and other materials produced.
- Strategies to include women and people with disability and related Gender and PWD Policies developed.

Full details are provided in the Logical Framework Analysis in Annex 6.

Management and Support

The quality of the ILO organizational support mechanisms, both in terms of technical and management expertise, the outstanding commitment, good leadership and effective functioning of the TVET-R Implementation team and their adherence to the strict institutional guidelines for Project Management are all highly commendable and have contributed significantly to TVET-R's effectiveness and efficiency. This was succinctly described by the various donor representatives from the EU:

- *'A key contributor to success was the people. The (TVET-R) team had a cohesive team spirit, they had a strong mix of good skills and enthusiasm'.*
- *And, 'This was the right Project, at the right time, and with the right people. Arthur's persistence and drive was also an important factor'.*
- *And ' I've always been impressed with ILO's approach to this and other Projects, particularly after Rana Plaza. ILO is the most relevant of partners. Arthur Shears is remarkable, he is a great leader of the team and a huge factor in their success'.*

In terms of internal staffing capacity, the Evaluators were very impressed with the quality of mix of skills and experience in the ILO TVET-R Team of both locally engaged staff and expatriates. They also had complementary skills and experience and together presented a dynamic, highly committed, and talented team as whole. The ILO Country Office built on this

capacity, with early training and orientation of Project Staff on ILO's internal governance system. In terms of the early formation of TVET-R Team, the Evaluators understand that the National Professional interventions play a key part in the overall success of the team in that it was often they who provided the momentum of TVET-R while working with TVET-R staff. There was some feedback from ILO respondents that it may be have useful to have brought in the international technical consultants earlier to support the initial development, and this has been adopted as a lesson learned by the CO.

The Evaluators have viewed the Work Plans for the TVET-R Project, including the one covering the no-cost extension period from June 2014 to December 2015. This plan is comprehensive and detailed, and has a focus on issues that have been highlighted as requiring strengthening, such as communication strategies and promotion, and translation of all Project materials and documents into Bangla.

There was strong evidence that TVET-R Work Plans have been closely monitored and reported against in regular meetings and in written reports within ILO and to the donor and through the PSC and PMCC. Progress of implementation activities is disseminated to stakeholders, and achievements and highlights are celebrated and broadcast through improved communications strategies.

The ILO's strong institutional approaches are certainly reflected in the implementation of TVET-R. The Evaluators gained the impression that both TVET-R Steering Committee (PSC) and TVET-R Monitoring and Coordinating Committee (PMCC) worked well as forums for discussion, decision-making and coordination. While noting the limited capacity of Government generally to take follow up action in these fora, the Ministry of Education and Directorate of Technical Education were particularly pro-active in their approaches.



Figure 10: Western Marine Shipyard, Chittagong

The substantive factors that supported the smooth project implementation have been raised throughout the report, including: the right timing (economically and socially) for Bangladesh to move to a TVET system; high profile political support through the Prime Minister and senior Ministers; high profile and flexible commitment by the EU (as donor);

commitment and enthusiasm by many in the technical system (leaders of training institutions), civil society, industry leaders; the best quality mix of staff in TVET-R; and ILO Country Office commitment and support. Some of the hindrances have included the slow pace of Government bureaucracy, internal Government instability in 2013, and also slow processes within ILO (e.g. recruitment) and the EU. The Evaluators have been advised that just recently the (now) TVET-R Senior Specialist has been delegated with further financial and administrative authority, which has facilitated a speed up of internal ILO processes.

1.15 Impact

Longer Term Development Impact

It is still too early to assess the longer-term impact of TVET-R at this stage on aspects such as adequately meeting employer changing demands for skills, increased employment opportunities for trainees in chosen skill areas or increased salaries and conditions for workers. In the Final Evaluation Workshop conducted in Dhaka the question of measuring longer-term impact was discussed in small groups and in the plenary session. It is the commitment of B-SEP to undertake more Pilot activities and to monitor and analyze through the implementation of tracer studies on trainees, looking the impact of CBT on employment rates and opportunities. The COEL has also begun to attempt to trace the patterns of employment for their trainees through the use of their database and a requirement of trainees to submit ongoing information, but this has a long way to go before it is successfully tracking impact.

Employment Outcomes

That said, there is preliminary data on employment outcomes for trainees from the Pilot programs, which is very encouraging. The employment rate of NTVQF graduates in their field is from 79% to 100% within 6 months of completion.

Employers from RMG, Leather, IT, Tourism, Shipbuilding, and Agro Food all reported directly that trainees from the CBT trials under TVET-R are more highly skilled and 'job ready' than those recruited for their workplaces from other training courses, or those who have just received on the job training in their workplaces.

'We use CBT training for disabled and under-privileged women and work closely with the garment industry. Our trainees have been given support through ILO for stipends, accommodation etc in order to complete their training, which includes pre-vocational training followed by a challenge test then they go to the factories. These trainees are guaranteed a job with our employer partner and their suppliers after this course and their salaries start at 6,000 Taka, increasing to 10,000+ Taka after the full 8 months training is complete. The employer now wants 247 more disabled people trained by us, and they say they are the best employees they have. This has empowered our trainees who are gaining employment, recognition and self-esteem through this training, we want every Institute to follow this model'.

(An NGO working with people with disability)

Through the TVET-R partnership arrangements undertaken in the main under Component 4, many new initiatives have occurred to encourage and facilitate arrangements with industry. This includes such activities as employers assisting with design of curriculum and training modules that reflect the skills required for their workplaces. It also includes employers agreeing to the provision of materials and machinery of the same types as those used in the factories; industry staff visiting Institutes to be part of assessments of skills, organization of workplace visits and more importantly on the job, practical training as a main part of the courses. In some cases, employers give a clear commitment to employ trainees who successfully complete the CBT training before the pilot program begins. This has highlighted

the very positive impact of partnerships between industry and training institutes – all of which have clearly been a result of collaboration facilitated under TVET-R.

Other examples of the positive impact that the new approaches to Skills training has had, include the increasing demand by employers for CBT trained and more highly skilled students, which at this stage cannot be met by Institutes at this early stage of partial adoption of the new system. This reinforces the recommendation that is important to keep the momentum of the Pilots going under B-SEP and other Skills Projects in order to attempt to meet stakeholder expectations and enthusiasm is not lost.

Demand for CBT Trainees

The feedback we received from Institutions, staff and Principals, and male and female trainees indicated that there is already a very positive impact experienced by the key recipients of the training:

‘We have 1,668 people enrolled in our 3 months CBT training at levels 1 and 2. They get preference in getting work due to this training. We have a target of training 10,000 workers by December 2014, and we are easily on track, having completed more than 8,600 (July 2014) – they are all ensured of work after successful completion’.

(Leather industry sector)

‘7 of our Institutes are piloting CBT with the assistance of the TVET-R Project, which helped us out with the instruments of training, some facilities upgrade and some equipment. This has given us a new direction for the system. We are now motivated to get good standards following the NTVQF for all our 17 occupations now we have more awareness of what this means, and this will eventually take over from our traditional system. There are lots of things we need and it is hard keeping up, but we have given the order to start the CBT system in those occupation areas and we will be a better organization in the future’.

(Government Training Institute).

Raising the profile of TVET

A key finding is that the profile and acceptability of TVET in Bangladesh appears to be changing as a direct result of the TVET-R Project. This is not only because of the fellowships, the development of the National Skills Development Policy, the NVTQF, or the Pilot programs. Many respondents believed that the gradual building up of awareness of the importance of TVET and the possibility of this being a viable education stream option is due to Government commitment. The involvement and endorsement of the Prime Minister and the high impact of the national program of TVET Week, conducted in 2010 and again recently in 2014 have all been key to increasing acceptance and the profile of TVET.

In the past, TVET has had a very low social status in Bangladesh as elsewhere in the world, but there is pride in its traditional technical education system based on teacher-centered pedagogy with a theoretical not practical focus – namely through the Diploma of Engineering courses. TVET has traditionally and culturally been seen to be mainly for working, poorer, or less educated citizens, and traditionally thought of as mainly for males and not seen as a desirable stream for more elite members of the population.

‘Global patterns always show that the target groups comprising students for VET education are mostly from the underprivileged background¹⁹’.

With the advent of the booming export and manufacturing sector in Bangladesh, this perception is slowly changing, where for example, 80% of workers in the RMG sector are now women, and quality practical sewing skills are essential for employment. The

¹⁹ <http://www.bdeduarticle.com/technical-and-vocational-education>

introduction of CBT and the NVTQF – which lead to internationally recognized certification, higher practical competency, increased employability and the economic advantages of higher wages is evidently changing this perception in communities.

‘We have 12,000 new Technical Teacher vacancies, and we just got 94,000 applications for those jobs – TVET week promoted this’.

(DTE feedback)

Support for TVET reform agenda

There is strong and consistent feedback gained from all stakeholder groups that this reform Project has had the effect of ‘shaking up’ various aspects of the TVET system over the last 6+ years. There are now principals, teachers and students who are more aware of the option of training for skills in a different way through CBT. Results are becoming visible in using the competency based training approaches, the courses are more engaging and interesting for individuals – both teachers and trainees have more practical skills at the end of courses. Achievements during training are clearly measurable for individuals and they can repeat a step until they work at their own pace towards competency – so the prospect is that everyone can succeed. TVET-R has very clearly been a catalyst for change which is spreading and gaining popularity and support throughout the sector and which is exciting many as they come on board with the new system. This was evidenced at the Stakeholder Workshop on 22 July when the participants nominated a key achievement as ‘a mindset to accept such education/skills as a means of livelihood’.

TVET and People with Disability

Several respondents, including two Principals from training Institutes (one Government, one NGO) reported that the perception of TVET for people with disabilities is definitely experiencing changes, due to the influence of good training and OSH practices under the Pilot activities of TVET-R. The fact that families can now also see the economic benefits that come from the salaries of their family member is also an important motivating factor in them giving permission to them to enroll in training courses and to take up employment afterwards.

‘Most families and communities are very protective and worried about security for their relatives with disability. For that reason we work with whole families, we provide safe training programs, we make sure the factories provide ‘decent working conditions’ before making agreements with them. We are also now very mindful of OSH for our trainees, we provide continuing support and have a social worker for back up too’.

(NGO Training Institute)

‘This course has had a huge impact on the lives of the beneficiaries, who have not only experienced immense personal benefit, but are also now role models within their families and communities. They are becoming confident advocates for disability awareness and, from being almost completely financially dependent on their families, are on the path to financial independence’.

(EU feedback)

See later section on Page 48 for a detailed discussion on Gender considerations.

NSD Policy, NVTQF Framework and Certificates

Having a NSD policy and NVTQF for the first time in Bangladesh history is having a major and positive impact on the sector, as reported in almost every discussion conducted during the evaluation. While the existence of policy and framework documents in itself is no guarantee of any change, the perception is that they are highly significant, and are already having a

major impact. Many of the new Skills development Projects being designed for Bangladesh are now following the NSD Policy guidelines. There has been an exceptionally high take up rate of the CBT courses during the pilot phases as the training was provided for free and often associated with small stipends and ‘tiffin money’. The on-going take up rate is now varying between sectors depending on the cost of the training.

One of the most significant impacts of the introduction of CBT courses under the NTVQF is the potential for receiving certificate proof of skills for trainees, most of whom may not have received any kind of formally recognized qualifications in the past. These qualifications are not only of high value within the Bangladesh context, but are internationally recognizable. Respondents to the evaluation report that and even those with skills at Levels 1 and 2 are gaining preferential employment opportunities within the Pilot occupational sectors and are more confident of gaining higher salaries as migrant workers after the training is completed.

‘Many people can cook, but they have no certificates – they need RPL – they need certificates so they can go on a career path’.

One of the challenges to this outcome is that there are not enough qualified assessors to complete the task of assessment, due to staff shortages and lack of training at this stage of the reform. This is of concern to sustainability since gaining certification is one of the main motivating factors for trainees. This issue should continue to be a high priority for ILO and the tripartite constituents to resolve in partnership, before it adversely affects support for the new system.



Figure 11: Dhaka Polytechnic Institute, Dhaka

Impact for Employers

There is clear evidence that the new forms of training, particularly through COEL for the leather sector is having a major positive impact to this growing industry and its need to find skilled workers as a matter of priority.

‘We are now shifting our resources to COEL to undertake the training for our industry. It has unique characteristics, of ‘Learning, Earning, Job Guaranteed’. We had a crisis before (in getting workers), now it’s beginning to work. 98% of the graduates are in industry now, working and with better skills. Previously workers came to the factory gate and if they persisted we may have taken them on as a (low paid) helper. We are guaranteeing that none of the new trainees will be a helper,

they have employability because they have the skills, which can take years on the job to develop’.

ILO Profile and Reputation

There were consistently clear and strong messages throughout the Evaluation process relating to the way in which the implementation of TVET-R has built ILO’s reputation garnering respect and endorsement from all stakeholder groups. This feedback came from donor representatives, government officials, other TVET sector projects, and more generally across the skills development community of practice.

People are also highly aware of ILO’s commitment to working with tripartite constituents, and the philosophy underpinning the organization’s commitment to decent work and worker’s rights.

*‘The International Labour Organization (ILO) is the only tripartite U.N. agency with government, employer, and worker representatives. This tripartite structure makes the ILO a unique forum in which the governments and the social partners of the economy of its Member States can freely and openly debate and elaborate labour standards and policies’.*²⁰

In the majority of interviews, respondents commented on the competency and appropriateness of ILO being the implementing partner of the TVET-R Project. The common view was that ILO has the ability to call on technical expertise when required, and their commitment to working with all parties, government, employers and workers is highly appreciated. Feedback from all stakeholders included comments about ILO being ‘leaders in TVET reform’, and as ‘being ideally suited to take a leadership role in TVET reform in Bangladesh, given their capacity’. The successful implementation of the TVET-R Project has no doubt helped to reinforce the view that ILO is a strong and competent leading organization in the sector.

Gender achievements

In order to boost the participation of females in the TVET Sector in Bangladesh, the NSDC Secretariat in conjunction with ILO and in particularly the TVET-R Project, has developed a policy ‘Promoting Gender Equality in the TVET Sector in Bangladesh’. This had the active involvement of all stakeholder partners and was guided by a Gender Working Group with 15 representatives from Government, ministries and departments and 3 civil society organizations. This demonstrates the commitment to improving not only gender participation within the sector, but to support capacity building of partners in the mainstreaming of gender in all activities. The next stage of this process is to ensure that the implementation of the policy now guides future TVET and Skills Project activities implemented by the ILO teaMs See more detail on Gender considerations on page 34 of this report.

1.16 Sustainability

Ongoing activities under TVET-R and B-SEP

Most respondents observed that Canada providing donor support to the new B-SEP Project to continue, broaden and elaborate on the efforts of TVET-R is a most positive step in terms of ensuring sustainability of efforts of TVET-R. The B-SEP complements the TVET-R and was designed to help move forward the implementation of the National Skills Development Policy that was developed under TVET-R. Led by a new CTA, most staff from the

²⁰ <http://www.ilo.org/global/about-the-ilo/who-we-are/tripartite-constituents/lang--en/index.htm>

implementation team of TVET-R have been retained to work on B-SEP. This means that the intellectual property, relationships, networks and expertise can continue to feed into the new Project in a seamless way. The previous CTA of TVET-R can continue working on the extension of that Project which the EU has also granted for an 18-month period at no cost. This will also help ensure that ongoing activities and the momentum gained under TVET-R are continued using the remaining resources.

Ongoing support to previous sectors

Two of the original occupation areas (Tourism and Agro Food) are being retained under B-SEP, and three new areas are being added, namely Pharmaceuticals, Ceramics and Furniture. During the last 18 months of implementation of TVET-R will provide some continuing support to the occupation areas left out of the new Project, (IT, Leather, and Transport – Shipping). If this is successful and there is further clarity around what ongoing support will be provided, the sustainability of efforts in these areas may have more chance of being upheld.

If possible, B-SEP or other projects could look for innovative ways to continue support and collaboration with the former industry areas, which were successfully piloted under TVET-R but only for a brief time. There may be a view by TVET-R that these occupations are able to continue using their own resources. The point that while the pilots were successful, those involved in the former occupation areas not taken up by B-SEP, reported to us during the evaluation a strong sense of need for ongoing support and encouragement to continue. It is important for the longer term outcomes of TVET-R that the momentum and confidence gained through the relatively brief Pilot Programs is not lost by casting occupation areas adrift before they have the confidence, the resolve and the resources to operate independently.

A strong, well-supported NSDC

This is an essential 'ingredient' to sustainability of TVET-R's efforts and there are positive signs that the capacity of this Secretariat, which sits under the Ministry of Labour and Employment, has increased substantially, and continues to do so. Through feedback from relevant evaluation informants (including from within the Secretariat itself), it is clear that NSDC has been built up with support from TVET-R and ILO, including physical infrastructure development, awareness-raising through the fellowship study tours, and ongoing support and partnership. Since this is the central coordinating body for all stakeholders working in the Skills development space, it is vital that the NSDC's reputation, mandate and capacity is acknowledged by all donor and project partners and supported through their efforts.

Ensuring compliance with the NSDP

A key role of the NSDC is to ensure that the National Skills Development Policy is being implemented by all development partners working in the skills sector. To monitor this, an Action Plan on Policy Implementation has been developed by NSDC with input from 10 different Government Departments. It is very important that this Action Plan is implemented and the findings are disseminated if the sector is to work more effectively and in alignment on TVET reform. If some Projects (such as the SDP Project funded by the ADB) continue to question the function of NSDC, by developing parallel systems while ignoring policy alignment, this will undermine the efforts of other Projects and weaken the likelihood of impact and sustainability of efforts of all. This is a serious risk to the sustainability of TVET-R efforts, and a risk to all other collaborating development efforts in the Skills area, if not adequately addressed. Support for Project collaboration through the Skills Development Working Group and pressure applied by government stakeholders and donors are all important to achieving this outcome.

Capacity Building of BTEB - Certification processes completed

Adequate resourcing and capacity building of the Bangladesh Technical Board (BTEB) is going to be vital to capitalize on the achievements so far of the TVET-R Project. Under TVET-R, 48 Industry Assessors were trained for the different sectors, and the assessment tools to assess teachers and students were also provided to BTEB. However, there are currently significantly inadequate resources in BTEB to fully enable them to respond to the requests for course accreditation, assessment of teachers and students, approval of new courses and to fully support the changeover to the new system.

Certification and qualifications have high value in Bangladesh and after completion of the CBT training, the expectation is built that this process will be completed with the awarding of the correct certificates proving competency. The lack of capacity of BTEB to meet the increasing demands in this area is a major risk to the sustainability of Project efforts if it is not resolved. In order to address this major hurdle, ongoing support by ILO and other Skills development Projects is an urgent requirement. There was anecdotal evidence in numerous training institutes that training was continuing using CBT methods despite final assessments not having been completed, but it will only be a matter of time before this damages the positive image of undertaking such training and the impact becomes a serious risk.

CBT course refinement

In order to remain relevant and viable into the future, there should be an ongoing process of refinement so that curriculum and module content meet both industry needs, needs of students seeking skills, balanced with the quality outcomes of training to standards.

An example of this was outlined in our meetings with the leather industry partners. The CBT modules currently train potential employees up to level 2 in Sewing, Lasting and Cutting, ostensibly training each worker to be a 'Jack of all trades'. This is seen as mismatch to their career potential in the current industry in Bangladesh where workers are usually highly skilled in just one of these areas. It is acknowledged that there is need for different standards of competency required if the employees work overseas. However, discussions are now taking place around the leather industry's request to see more flexibility in the conduct of CBT training to meet their local industry needs. They see the potential to cut down on the time required for trainees to complete their courses, and the need to make adjustments to course assessments in order to allow trainees to gain competency and expertise in just one skill area related to the industry.

These issues are being discussed currently with the TVET-R team during TVET-R extension period, but this helps clarify the general need for this flexibility to be built into future programming for sustainability. One very positive aspect of this example is the respect and openness that the TVET-R team and industry partners are displaying in their willingness to discuss modifications to a system, which needs to be tailored to the context in which it is operating.

National Skills Database

In order to support sustainability of efforts, the National Skills Database, which has a developed platform at this stage of TVET-R, should be assisted to function as fully intended as soon as possible. This will also need particular focus on building stakeholder awareness and training of all relevant partners in building, maintaining and utilizing the database, as a key component of its success. When this database is operational, it could provide huge opportunities for Government and training institutes to be able to track industry demand for skills, and to steer the output of training programs in order to respond to employer needs. A fully functioning skills database will also enable partners to strategically plan in order to meet the ultimate goal of TVET-R.

Understanding of timeframes required

In order to ensure that initial commitment, enthusiasm and involvement generated by TVET-R in the new training approaches, a clear communication strategy around any ongoing support that can be given to the three occupational areas of Leather, IT and Transport (shipping) is clearly required. As previously outlined, there is a mismatch between the expectations of those in those industries so they can meet growing demands for skilled workers, and the training institutes' ability to transform their workplaces into fully operational CBT training in the same time frames. Constraints such as staffing levels of teachers and assessors, and ongoing training and resourcing requirements will all take time to overcome, and will need support from Government, industry itself and possibly other TVET Projects to sustain.

The challenge is to set realistic targets and expectations for industry partners so that faith in the new system doesn't waver if frustration about target numbers of trainees sets in. At the same time, if other Projects such as SDP are training students only 'in the spirit' of CBT, in shorter time frames through a watered down parallel system – there may well be an undermining of efforts that will seriously affect sustainability.

It is undeniable that reform of an entire system is a long-term process, so ongoing promotion of the benefits of the new system to stakeholders, clear and prompt support from Government to resource trainers and assessors, coupled with flexibility, compromise and an efficiency analysis would be a good strategy at this stage for all partners.

Innovative approaches to resourcing

There are differing views on how ongoing resourcing for the new reformed sector is going to be achieved, and no doubt this is a key question of sustainability of efforts under the TVET-R Project. The responsibility for this now lies within the partnership, primarily with a combination of commitment from Government, along with industry contribution and with innovative thinking from training institutions themselves.

It is not sustainable in the long term for development projects to continue to support and resource the implementation of the reforms in the sector. However, there is a good argument for Skills development Projects to continue their efforts in the shorter term to support up-skilling and training of teachers and assessors. Projects could continue support for the establishment of more Industry Skills Councils (ISCs), and to also partner with specific training institutes in order to continue the solid work already undertaken in promoting the take up of the new system.

In TVET-R, there were impressive inputs, support and commitments by employers and companies as seen through various pilot programs. It is clear that the 'mass industries', such as RMG and Leather, are seen by others as having more capacity to contribute than smaller sectors, but this is debatable. What is clear is that there are expectations which have been built through Skills Projects (not just TVET-R), which are difficult to sustain and the real challenge now is for Government, training institutes and industry partners to look at ways to continue the funding of the sector into the future.

The clear messages from the industry areas involved in TVET-R on this issue include:

'Every industry is different in its capacity to contribute, depending on its volume, scope and size'.

'We already give our time freely at no cost. We can't give in an unlimited way. Even when we are involved through CSR (corporate social responsibility) we want to break even, it can't be too costly, it is still a business transaction'.

'We have already contributed a lot by our involvement in this project. In our ISC, members are industry owners, they are busy and focused on their businesses, and

they have little time to keep up involvement. They should be mandated to come to meetings, or they will lose interest and momentum. For sustainability we have to have an open structure in the future to give equal opportunity to have our voice as industry partners on the NSDC as we know about industry and the way it works’.

‘We need skilled workers we do on the job training for our own company and for others. But the cost of CBT training for courses such as welding where each trainee uses a lot of materials are adding huge burden of costs onto us, which we cannot meet by ourselves’.

The Impost of Fees

The Evaluators argue that it is too simplistic to see the main solution to this issue as ‘Imposing course fees on students to pay for higher costs of CBT’ - as suggested by numerous respondents from all stakeholder groups during our meetings. The argument put forward is that ‘if students hear it is good training and want a well paid job, they will find a way to pay for the courses’.

While acknowledging that there is a place for a ‘fee for training’ within the system, it undoubtedly presents severe disadvantage to students (particularly females) from families with lower incomes. It is a clear fact the profile of many TVET students is that they are often from less privileged backgrounds. More thought and strategic planning needs to be undertaken before decisions about fees are made by training institutes, perhaps with consideration to seek avenues for self-funding or partnering with industry to supplement costs. One example of where this was working well was in MAWTS in Mirpur. This private training institute has become totally self-sufficient by expanding its manufacturing capability and using a ‘training on the job’ approach.



Figure 12: MAWTS, Mirpur

Stipends

Another point related to this, is that through the various Skills Projects operating in Bangladesh currently (including TVET-R pilots), many trainees are provided with reasonable stipends, or in some cases smaller amounts of ‘tiffin money’. For poorer students this is significant in enabling them to participate in training when the imperatives of day-to-day survival mean they are often needed at home. These, and other considerations on how to

support students while they study, and how to support training institutes while they evolve and build their capacity to offer CBT training courses are key issues which need a coordinated effort by all development partners and stakeholders working in the Skills development sector, until sustainability issues are addressed.

Cooperation / collaboration of donor projects

As previously mentioned in order to ensure there is no waste and unnecessary duplication of efforts, the cooperation and communication that can be achieved by genuine engagement through the Skills Development Group is absolutely vital. To demonstrate a true willingness to collaborate there should be a joint effort to reduce competition between development partners and to eliminate any 'conflict of interest messages' around their varying pathways to reform.

The Skills Development Working Group, currently co-chaired by a representative from the Canadian Government and the CEO of the NSDC Secretariat, should continue in its already admirable efforts to resolve any inter-project or inter-personal conflict within the confines of their Working Group in order to present a united image to the sector and to increase sustainability of efforts by working together. Development partners can retain their individualism and integrity while working collaboratively, making the most of opportunities in their areas of strength, but not by undermining the efforts of others. Where particular Project management staff demonstrate a lack of willingness to positively engage with the Skills Development Group, donors should consider how to use their influence to rectify this lack of cooperation, with the support of Government authorities. The ILO and EU should continue their active participation in the Skills Development Working Group.

Sustainability Summary

Overall, the outlook for sustainability is extremely positive if there is further roll out of well documented and promoted 'demonstration' activities; if capacity building and training efforts continue within the different stakeholder groups; and if the clear support and commitment to reform of the system from Government and Industry continues. The biggest risk factor to sustainability is if there are deliberate efforts by a small but vocal minority of development projects to undermine the achievements of TVET-R and other Projects before they have had the chance to influence lasting change in the TVET system.

Given the potential for socio-economic benefits arising out of the outcomes of a reformed TVET System, there is a strong likelihood of ongoing support for continued change, especially given the amount of time, resources and commitment already expended by so many in influential positions in the country. As more opportunities are presented to the Bangladesh's export manufacturing industry, the multiple benefits of a skilled workforce will become increasingly understood and demand driven by leaders in business and government. If this is achieved, there will be an increasing self-interest in continuing industry support to improvements in the TVET sector in order to stay globally competitive in the future marketplace, until the system becomes fully self-supporting over the long term.

1.17 Gender Issues Assessment

Promoting Gender Equality in the TVET Sector Policy

Bangladesh faces many challenges in gender equality, and young women are four times less like to have jobs than young men in Bangladesh²¹. In order to boost the participation of females in the TVET Sector in Bangladesh, the NSDC Secretariat in conjunction with ILO and the TVET-R Project, has developed the 'Promoting Gender Equality in the TVET Sector'

²¹ Toufique, K.A., ILO, 2014, Labour Market Transitions of Young Women and Men in Bangladesh, W4Youth Publication Series No 13, Youth Employment Programme, Employment Policy Department

Policy. This had the active involvement of all stakeholder partners and was guided by a Gender Working Group with 15 representatives from Government, ministries and departments and 3 civil society organizations. This demonstrates the commitment to improving not only gender participation within the sector, but to promote the mainstreaming of gender in all TVET activities from Project design, implementation, monitoring and evaluation.



Figure 13: Women's Polytechnic Institute, Chittagong

From the Resource Guide on Gender Mainstreaming in TVET, Bangladesh:

'Gender equality and empowerment has been set as one of the seven categories of monitorable targets to achieve according to the vision and objectives of the Sixth Five Year Perspective Plan in Bangladesh that serve as a framework for halving poverty and improving lives. Substantive equality between women and men in all dimensions of development is an indispensable tool for advancing socio-economic progress and reducing poverty.

Over the past two decades the government has demonstrated strong commitment to achieve gender parity in primary and secondary education through policy reform and programme development. Women's participation in the labour force has shown a significant rise. Life expectancy has increased and health awareness and overall political sensitization have improved. Despite these remarkable achievements, challenges still remain critical and inequalities are persistent.

This is frustratingly evident in the low female participation that exists in the Technical and Vocational Education and Training (TVET) sector, particularly in formal institutions. Women's participation in TVET in Bangladesh is strikingly low, ranging from 9% to 13% in public institutions and 33 % in private institutions, the average is approximately 24%. Similarly, the number of female instructors overall is about one-fifth of the total number within technical institutes. It is also worth noting that the lesser number of Technical Training Centres (TTCs) within the variety of technical education providers is more on par with the national averages for women's participation. Technical School and Colleges (TSCs) are severely lagging behind

national averages of gender inclusion by about half (i.e. one-tenth of all teachers and one-eighth of all students within TSCs are female)²²’.

Promotion of Gender Equality

The development of the Promoting Gender Equality in TVET policy is a significant contribution of the TVET-R Project as a facilitator to the sector in Bangladesh. It seeks to translate the NSDP into a clear framework of strategies and targets to improve gender equity and awareness of its importance in TVET. The question will be over the long term whether the policy will translate into positive action, and if, for example, participation levels for females increase, and if there are measurable changes in attitude and practice with regard to promoting gender equality in the sector – such as encouraging promotion of more females into supervisory and management roles, as well as increasing numbers of trainees.

The National Strategy for Promotion of Gender Equality in Technical and Vocational Education and Training (2012), developed jointly by the NSDC and TVET-R Project, describes guiding principles and sets a clear pathway for priority areas of action. ILO can continue to play a positive role in supporting the NSDC in implementing, monitoring and reporting on the policy.

Some progress on gender considerations

Visible and measurable achievements by TVET-R were observed, although it was clear that there are still many achievements to be made. Several institutions are encouraging females into ‘non traditional’ courses and this was being highlighted and promoted by TVET-R team. Many of the institutions involved in the pilot program were taking measures to attract and retain female and students with disability, such as ensuring timetabling of classes during the daytime, providing satisfactory facilities for females such as washrooms, and in some cases the providing safe and suitable accommodation for females who live distances from training centres. Similar reports were heard from some employers for women, and for people with disability.

While there still may be many challenges ahead in the area of gender, TVET-R has provided ‘an opening’ for improvements in the way females are included, supported and acknowledged.

Reporting on Gender Issues

As far as TVET-R Implementation team is concerned, there have been attempts during TVET-R to ensure that data is disaggregated and reported on, although there are still gaps in this area. The MTR made the following recommendation in relation to gender:

‘A number of cross-cutting themes, particularly increased access to TVET and employability for women and people with disabilities, are placed under the intervention logic for Component-5 in the Logframe. While the Skills Development Policy does mention including the above underprivileged sections of society, and certain efforts are made by some members of TVET-R team, the onus of ensuring their inclusion should not be born alone by Component 5. For example, satisfying the indicators of ensuring gender and disability-sensitivity of curriculum contents and meeting the quotas set for female and disabled instructors and trainees are best managed by Components 2, 3, and 4, respectively as well as Component 5. It is advisable for project management to make the sharing of this responsibility clear by way of an explicit project policy statement on social inclusion, and a required element by which all components account for their progress’.

²² Resource Guide on Gender Mainstreaming in TVET in Bangladesh TVET-R guideline 2012

While there has been progress made in the development of the Promoting Gender Equality in TVET paper, it is apparent from TVET-R Progress Reports made available, that there is a long way to go in terms of monitoring and reporting on gendered outcomes by TVET-R team. This should be an area of priority for capacity building for ILO Project staff in country if the recommendations of the Gender Policy are to be systematically applied to their own operations in the future. That said, this view of the TVET-R Progress Reports may not reflect the reporting for all ILO Projects in Bangladesh.

Recommendations to ILO on reporting on gender

- The reporting on gender in TVET-R still seems to have been limited to the monitoring for Component 5, despite this also being of high importance for work undertaken in Components 2, 3 and 4, as highlighted in the MTR.
- There is no clear evidence of disaggregated data in TVET-R Progress Reports – and the latest written and viewed by us was for November 2013.
- There is also a paucity of analysis and complexity to the reporting on gender at this stage which needs further strengthening to improve outcomes.

Therefore, data should be disaggregated and reported on across all components by ILO.

Examples with comments from TVET-R Monitoring Report November 2013 include:

‘Promoting Gender Equality in TVET: Component 5 has been providing technical support to NSDC to conduct dissemination workshops among the government TVET institutions on the National Strategy for Promotion of Gender Equality in TVET in Bangladesh. The draft strategy was recently printed’. (Comment: This is talking about outputs and it should include more feedback from the workshops, more analysis on likely outcomes of the activities and a detail of strategies to monitor these outcomes).

‘The programme in motorcycle servicing with some female trainees was repeated at the UCEP Centre in Mirpur’.

(Comment: While this output is positive, more detail is needed on the rationale for repeating the training, the outcomes and impact of the training for female trainees, the contribution to gender focused objectives linked to TVET-R Objectives, any unexpected outcomes such as social implications, etc).

‘TVET-R continued to encourage women’s engagement in its programme trials and by participating in various gender related fora. As such, a total of 30 underprivileged females attended RMG Sewing Machine Operation Course at Gazipur TSC and CMPI-Chittagong’.

(Comment: More details about successful ‘engagement strategies’ and the links between participation in ‘gender related fora’ and increased female enrolments in courses needs to be described. Lessons learned about specific gender activities to be applied to future activities should be outlined).

‘Gender strategy is being disseminated among public TVET institutions by NSDC’.

(Comment: This is a positive activity – some targets for monitoring or follow up on outcomes should also be included in the reporting).

‘Gender issues are being prioritized in all TVET institutions’.

(Comment: This statement in its current form does not provide any useful information or suggest learning about gender strategies, or outcomes. Real examples of outputs such as Institutions changing timetables or facilities to encourage female participation and

enrolment rates for example, and expected outcomes with supporting evidence would help improve reporting on gender here).

In summary, there are positive developments observed in the area of addressing gender issues in TVET-R since the MTR with the development of the Gender in TVET Policy as an example. This still has to be translated into more competent and practical gender mainstreaming strategies – especially in terms of reporting in Project Monitoring and Reports. There is also an ongoing need, seemingly not addressed since the MTR in terms of building the capacity of staff to report on gendered outcomes as this is everyone’s responsibility regardless of the area of work they are responsible for.

1.18 Tripartite Issues Assessment

The ILO Project Team has consulted, engaged and worked closely with the tripartite constituents: the Government of Bangladesh through 22 Ministries and agencies; the workers unions and representative bodies; and the employer bodies. This engagement started in TVET-R design and has continued throughout TVET-R. The establishment of the Industry Skills Councils and the NSDC is an exemplary model of tripartite bodies working together.

The Evaluation team met with tripartite representatives throughout the final evaluation and they were also involved in the Evaluation Team’s Workshop on Preliminary Findings. A comment in the reporting back from groups during the workshop that, *“Some of the work with tripartite is missing throughout TVET-R - particularly worker’s education.”* Our view is that workers education was not missing during TVET-R, but we do agree that this aspect could be strengthened. This could potentially be done through better resourcing the workers unions and/or through the Industry Skill Councils under the new B-SEP and other ILO Projects.

International Labour Standards Assessment:

While this aspect was not a requirement of the final evaluation of TVET-R, we do note that Industry has a continued to experience a high demand for skilled and semi-skilled workers across a numbers of sectors. As reported through feedback from respondents, CBT skilled workers are no doubt attracting the jobs with better pay and conditions within industry. With reform of TVET through the application of the NTVQF, occupational safety and health and training is a key component of all courses. This in the long run could make a significant contribution to the overall labour standards as awareness grows and as workers influence practice in their workplaces.

‘Skilled workers are treated better than unskilled or semi-skilled because employers want to keep them’.

‘Our main point of view is employment – good skills are a prerequisite – then good wages follow’.

‘Since TVET-R we have now introduced health, as well as safety this has had a big influence’.

CONCLUSIONS

The TVET-R has been a highly ambitious and very successful Project and has consolidated ILO's reputation as leader in TVET Reform in Bangladesh. The expertise, determination and commitment of ILO personnel and the organization as a whole has been a key success factor for TVET-R. The ILO's ability to broker and facilitate partnerships and trusting relationships has enabled TVET-R to become the most high profile and successful TVET project sector in the country.

TVET-R has achieved its stated objectives and has managed to do so within budget. However, extra time was required with three no cost extensions granted until December 2015. The additional time was used to translate materials and documents produced during TVET-R into Bangla and to raise the profile of TVET through comprehensive communications and promotional strategies.

There have been many complex challenges faced by TVET-R, including capacity of Government and other partners, bureaucratic delays, a level of reluctance to embrace change in the technical education system, and the lack of human and physical resources limiting stakeholders' ability to engage fully in the process of reform. There are also still achievements to be made by TVET-R with regard to addressing needs of the underprivileged in TVET, and in gender mainstreaming and reporting on gendered outcomes.

The two main factors that support the likelihood of sustainability of efforts of TVET-R are the continuation of Project activities in a limited way under a no cost 18 month extension to the end of 2015, and the funding by Canada of the Bangladesh Skills for Employment and Productivity Project (B-SEP) with ILO which will focus on the implementation of the National Skills Development Policy and scale-up of some activities from TVET-Reform.

LESSONS LEARNED AND EMERGING GOOD PRACTICES

The following list of the key lessons learned was developed from the feedback received in our meetings and interviews with respondents during the evaluation. This feedback was triangulated with our own observations and analysis and from materials analyzed during the desk review, particularly TVET-R Monitoring Reports, the Mid Term Review and other general Project promotional documents and press releases. A longer list of lessons learned was presented in the Final Evaluation Workshop in Dhaka on 22 July 2014 and it formed the basis of small focus group discussion during that event. Each lesson learned is described at Annex 7.

1.19 Research and Design

The extensive research and consultation undertaken at TVET-R design and start up phase was critical to the success of TVET-R.

As previously mentioned in this report, the allocation of time and resources to research and consultation in the first two years of TVET-R was a key contributing factor to the quality of TVET-R and the strength of the relationships supporting the work. While this is an important consideration of cost for donors, this aspect of TVET-R has set it apart from other Projects currently working in the Bangladesh TVET sector, given that during the implementation period there were no major changes to design. The design of TVET-R also garners respect in the skills community, since the approach is seen to be successful and is self-promoting through the 'demonstration effect'. TVET-R is also a project focused on 'learning' – the M&E system was robust and being utilized by all team members to monitor, report, share, reflect, learn and grow.

1.20 Development of Public Private Partnerships

This is an important lesson, especially for a Project that has at its core long term and systemic reform of a sector, such as TVET-R. This has necessitated ILO and the EU making a huge and sustained effort in facilitating the PPP aspect of TVET-R, and also in fostering open and inclusive relationships with all stakeholders - from inception through to final evaluation.

This commitment to genuine engagement and partnership has meant that at all steps of TVET-R, progress has been at the pace required to involve all partners, and in some cases there would have been additional costs involved in the long process of consulting and engaging. However, the positive outcomes of this investment are reflected in the quality of enduring relationships and the trust in and respect for ILO and EU that has obviously been built as a result. Evidence of this can be seen in the involvement of all stakeholder groups in Project related activities, such as meetings and workshops, including the high levels of cooperation and assistance we were given during the final evaluation (even when the bulk of inputs has been expended by TVET-R).

The quality of relationships is also reflected in the genuine contributions that have been made by different stakeholder groups, such as the in-kind contributions of the Government and the contribution of time and other resources by industry and employer partners to Project activities for over 6 years. It may seem obvious that relationship building is a prerequisite of good development practice, but the quality of the relationships built, and the role that ILO has played during TVET-R in facilitating partnerships and the generation of 'good will' through capacity building and other activities such as fellowship visits, has been outstanding.

This fastidious approach obviously has time and other financial cost implications that must be woven into Project design documents and associated budgets if it is to be replicated in the future. It also requires national and international Project team members recruited not only for their technical and sectoral expertise, but for their interpersonal and cross cultural acumen and their understanding of the importance of impartiality, equity and fairness in their operations. In the TVET-R Project, ILO has displayed exemplary HR practices and Project Management oversight that have contributed to this successful outcome.

1.21 Skills of TVET-R ILO Team

The vast array of skills and experience within the TVET Team, and in and between stakeholder groups, has been key to the success and quality of TVET-R and is another lesson linked to the question of relationships. Examples include:

- For the TVET-R team, staff were recruited based on their skills and experience linked to each Component to which they were assigned.
- It was clear that a staff person brought into country with expertise in training in CBT was highly regarded by all the relevant stakeholders we met with during the evaluation with one CBT trainer (female from Australia) being singled out for her effectiveness multiple times during different meetings.
- The accolades for the implementation CTA that were reported by the donors, and by many other respondents for his tenacity, commitment and persistence in achieving results, along with his team.
- The key international advisor for Component 4 was very clearly lauded for his extensive international TVET expertise in developing industry partnerships, and for his consistently high quality support to partners in the formation of ISCs.
- Equally valued and important was the expertise of the national staff in the TVET sector, in working with NGOs, and for their connections, networks and established strong relationships within the Government sector.

- Also highlighted by respondents was the very strong administrative and auxiliary support services provided by other TVET-R staff.

As more than one high profile respondent commented during our discussions: *'This really was about the right people, at the right time, and in the right place'*. The lesson for ILO is that the time and effort allocated to undertake sound HR and recruitment processes and the focus on peoples skills AND personal qualities pays off. This is especially true in the somewhat challenging context of Dhaka and highlights the need to consider the dynamics and skills of a team as a whole, rather than just the recruitment of individuals.

1.22 Tripartite Constituents

The ILO approach in working with Tripartite Constituents is a signature quality of this Project. While the voice of the Employee Group representatives was not as strong as it could have been, by engaging with the Tripartite Constituents the 'Decent Work for All' agenda was kept on the table.

Just as all 5 Components in TVET-R design are interlinked and of equal importance in achieving reform in the TVET sector, all stakeholders have a major role to play in contributing to the successful outcomes. It is important to reinforce the significance of the ILO's approach of working with Tripartite:

'The International Labour Organization (ILO) is the only tripartite U.N. agency with government, employer, and worker representatives. This tripartite structure makes the ILO a unique forum in which the governments and the social partners of the economy of its Member States can freely and openly debate and elaborate labour standards and policies'²³.

The successful outcomes of TVET-R cannot be attributed to any single stakeholder group, as each has made its unique contribution to the achievements over the last 6+ years.

That said, from observations through meetings and from specific feedback from the final workshop, the partnership with Employee Group Representatives should become a stronger focus, as their input and influence is not as clearly evident as the Government and Employer partners. This is to some extent reflective of the relative weakness of the Labour movement in the country due to complex socio-political factors, however there are opportunities to build involvement and capacity further of this partner through further engagement and support.

'Although Bangladesh ratified various ILO conventions and although labour rights are vividly conceded in the constitution and other labour policies and documents, violations of labour law and ILO ratification is a very common thing; very little evidence might be found where the state officials monitor the applications of labour laws and the ILO conventions'²⁴.

1.23 Inclusiveness

TVET-R has shown leadership in the sector through its commitment to inclusion of the disadvantaged, females and people with disability. Recognising that women represent over 80% of the workforce in certain occupational areas sectors, TVET-R has played a key role in supporting the development of the National Policy on 'Promoting Gender Equality in TVET in Bangladesh', which having the support of the (female) Prime Minister, is gaining recognition and support within the country.

This leadership was evident through the ILO TVET-R team taking the initiative in seeking flexibility and driving and supporting pilots with NGOs and training Institutions. They also

²³ <http://www.ilo.org/global/about-the-ilo/who-we-are/tripartite-constituents/lang--en/index.htm>

²⁴ <http://www.sacw.net/article889.html>

explored opportunities to mechanisms for inclusion, including informal apprenticeships, pre-vocational training and life skills development and facilitating the use of Recognised Prior Learning a process for giving candidates credit for skills, knowledge and experience previously gained through working and learning.

Training institutes were visited during the evaluation where TVET-R pilot programs were being conducted to support people with disability in the program, the majority of whom were also female. Through TVET-R partnership with NGOs and pilot training Institutes such as the Chittagong Mohila Polytechnic, women with disability have been exposed to many opportunities to become part of the mainstream skills training, particularly in the sewing skills for RMG industry. Recognising the large numbers of people with disability in the community,²⁵ this is an important contribution to the development impact on women's lives through gaining recognition as skilled workers, and in achieving employment opportunities, which were not available to them previously. This is an inspiring achievement in the national context and has definitely added quality and value to TVET-R, which should be replicated in the future endeavours through B-SEP.

1.24 The “Demonstration Effect”

To assist in changing mind-sets to support Competency Based Training, “the demonstration effect” has been very successful. This has been evidenced through the number of Pilots undertaken which has increased general awareness and specifically that of Government officials.

The Pilot Programs have been highly successful in trialling and improving training methods and course material, identifying issues for trainees, and in achieving ‘the demonstration effect’ which has changed mind-sets, led to increased general interest in and support for CBT and the new approaches. Recommendations from numerous stakeholders, including Project staff and Government partners, are that Pilots could have been designed to begin earlier, and the number of batches and students trained per pilot could have been increased to multiply the positive outcomes and to satisfy stakeholder expectations about ‘volume’ of results.

1.25 Promotion of TVET in Communities

It is evident that graduate trainees are a useful source to promote CBT and TVET-Reform. During interviews people have identified that trainees themselves are the best promoters of CBT and TVET in general. They are able to promote quality training that focuses on specific practical skills, and to endorse training institutes that are supportive and considerate of people with different needs.

In Bangladesh, as with most other places in developing countries, the use of mobile phones is booming. Out of 160 million people, over 101 million are mobile phone users, and although the use of social media and the internet is currently at relatively low levels, this is expected to expand rapidly in the near future. There is huge potential for the TVET-R team to explore the use of mobile phones and social media by trainees as one promotional tool over the coming 18 months. There could be some small pilot activities focusing around encouraging attendance at information sessions, or enrolment in courses training, for example. For those students who are regular Internet users there could also be on-line forums with which they can interact, in order to give updates and feedback on their training and to assist new trainees as they come into the system. There is huge untapped potential

²⁵ Based on an assessment of available figures and estimates by WHO and World Bank for developing countries, an overall disability prevalence of about 10% of the population remains a valid working estimate.

to explore these avenues for promotion into the future, along with the other strategies in communication and promotion currently being used.

RECOMMENDATIONS

On the basis of the key issues, achievements and lessons learned through this final evaluation the following recommendations are made.

1.26 Recommendations to ILO

- Given the achievements of TVET-R and the widely acknowledged role of ILO as the 'leader' in the TVET sector in Bangladesh, it is important to build on the successes of TVET-R, to apply the lessons learned, in order to retain its standing. Through the successful ongoing implementation of activities under B-SEP, the ILO will be in a strong position to apply to partner again with the EU in the next funding round after the end of 2015.
- Immediate consideration should be given to ongoing support to the occupational / industry areas left out of B-SEP but supported by TVET-R initially, particularly IT and Transport (shipping). While the nature of this support will be limited in terms of funding capabilities, TVET-R can continue to offer advice and mentoring as they seek additional resources to enable them to become independent and self-sustaining. Feedback from these sectors is that they do not feel ready as yet to 'go it alone'. B-SEP is helping to carve out a new direction by engaging with new industry sectors (Ceramics, Furniture and Pharmaceuticals) and with underprivileged stakeholders in different localities.
- We commend the plan by ILO for the coming 18 months to ensure all TVET materials are translated into Bangla and this was highlighted as a priority by many respondents throughout the evaluation. This has a particular resonance with those with lower educational and literacy levels, particularly in English.
- There should be a timetable for the rest of 2014 and 2015 for implementation of the RPL system and work undertaken over the extension period to promote, clarify and implement this system for which the groundwork has been achieved. This is also a priority for many stakeholders identified throughout the evaluation.
- Any opportunities to encourage, promote and support further training for females in Supervision and Management through TVET-R should be embraced, as there are low percentages of females still in these roles across the sector. Given TVET-R's commitment to gender equality in TVET, this will have a strong impact in the sector.
- Play a supportive role to NSDC in implementing and reporting on the priority areas outlined in the National Strategy for Promotion of Gender Equality in TVET.
- B-SEP is the right design for the 'second phase' – with the broadening of sectors and more focus on the under-privileged and disadvantaged. This new Project has many opportunities to build on what has already been achieved, the act on lessons learned through the pilot programs, and to carve out a new direction in terms of engaging with some new industry sectors and stakeholders in different localities.
- Now is the time to undertake a robust analysis of the M&E frameworks in the Skills area in order to capture more qualitative data on outcomes and impact. More training and development should be undertaken for staff in the area of monitoring and reporting on gender impact, tracking socio-economic outcomes for trainees and any longer term impact linked to Bangladesh's poverty agenda.

Recommendation 1: The ILO reviews the support required for the TVET-R industry sectors (in particular transport, agro-food and IT) to transition to self-sufficiency.

Recommendation 2: The ILO leads the development of a plan and timetable for the implementation of the RPL system.

Recommendation 3: The ILO assertively drives the implementation of gender equality in TVET by supporting NSDC in implementing priority areas outlined in the National Strategy for Gender Equality.

Recommendation 4: The ILO captures more quantitative data on outcomes and impact for both TVET-R and B-SEP.

1.27 Recommendations to Donors

- Donors play a vital role in facilitating and encouraging cooperation, communication and collaboration of development partners as active participants through the Local Consultative Skills Development Working Group (SDWG) in order to minimize the risks highlighted by disunity within the sector. The SDWG should continue its good work in focusing on what ‘collaboration’ means in practice for the different partners, undertaking more ‘mapping exercises’ to avoid duplication and to share lessons, and encouraging and supporting all Projects to implement the National Skills Development Policy Action Plan.
- Based on feedback from many respondents during this evaluation the clear recommendation is that all current and future Skills Projects supported in Bangladesh should include explicit targets to build Bangladeshi staff capacity and expertise in TVET.
- All TVET and Skills Project designs should follow the National Skills Development Policy, and the National Strategies to Promote Gender and People with Disability in TVET, and donors play a key role in ensuring this is implicit in the design and implementation plans and reporting for any new Projects they support.
- To the EU Canada has now come on board immediately to ‘carry the torch for TVET-R through B-SEP and ILO’ with the objectives of increasing the rate and range of implementation. To keep this momentum going and to contribute to the multiplier effect, EU should strongly consider supporting ILO into the future in TVET Reform in the next funding round and possibly with other donors. The EU-ILO relationship has been positive and productive, making an ongoing partnership in this sector a likely success.
- Donors should approach the Secretariat of the National Skills Development Council (NSDC) as the first point of entry when developing and planning TVET and Skills Projects. Existing projects should also regularly consult with the CEO of the NSDC Secretariat.

Recommendation 5: Canada, as Co-Chair, Skills Development Working Group, continues to take a leadership role in Skills Development generally, and more specifically in the implementation of the National Skills Development Policy Action Plan.

Recommendation 6: Canada continues to promote the high public profile given by the EU to TVET.

Recommendation 7: All donors for Skills Development in Bangladesh work closely with the NSDC and support the implementation of the NSDP Action Plan.

1.28 Recommendations to Government

- Government Partners of TVET-R should keep up their commitment and exemplary work by continuing to be ‘champions of change’ in the TVET sector.
- Government can contribute to the ongoing reform in the TVET sector by working to finalize all outstanding legislative requirements for approval of the TVET, NSDC Acts and changes to the BTEB Act.
- In order to implement the new TVET system into the future, adequate allocation of resources will be a requirement, including the recruitment of trainers, assessors and instructional staff, upgrading of TVET facilities and creating more flexibility in training delivery. Given the enormity of this undertaking, the Government should seek ongoing support from development partners to supplement its own contribution to the financing of the reform process.
- The Government plays a key role in ensuring that Skills development projects in Bangladesh are coordinated and are following the National Skills Development Policy. Project harmonization and collaboration are vital in ensuring synergies between Skills Projects leading to better use of resources, sharing of lessons learned and supporting sustainability of efforts.
- The Government’s leadership of the Skills Development Working Group and related sub-groups is key for ensuring the institutionalization and sustainability of stakeholder coordination efforts.
- Based on feedback from the private sector during the evaluation, Government should consider inviting a larger % representation of Industry Partners onto the NSDC Secretariat based on their industry expertise and willingness to commit to working with government as part of the tripartite agreement.
- For BTEB – there is an urgent need for more Assessors to be identified, recruited and trained so that the increasing demands for competency assessments under the new system are able to be met.
- For DTE the recommendation is that all new technical teacher-training courses should be following the NVTQF and CBT modes of instruction.

Recommendation 8: The Government of Bangladesh finalises all outstanding legislative requirements.

Recommendation 9: The Government of Bangladesh moves quickly to resource the implementation of the NSDP Action Plan especially fully staffing and resourcing the NSDC Secretariat, BTEB and DTE.

1.29 Recommendations to Industry

- There is a great opportunity for members of the current Industry Skills Council to engage with and to support the formation of new ISCs, in order to share their expertise gained through TVET-R. Supported by ILO, if industry members can contribute time to this capacity building measure, it will further consolidate their role as leaders in the TVET reform process in Bangladesh.
- Through ISC, industry should continue to collaborate with others to develop long-term strategies to meet demands for skills in their occupation areas by remaining involved in the ongoing implementation of the National Skills Database in conjunction with NSDC.
- Industry partners have shown exemplary leadership, commitment and contribution through the TVET-R and other Skills development Projects to date. The recommendation is that continuing support and resources from industry in the sector reform process will be required before it becomes fully operational and self-sustaining.

- In order to achieve more flexible and locally appropriate CBT curriculum for certain skills requirements, industry should continue their collaboration with TVET-R and B-SEP to assist in making the necessary adaptations to meet the needs identified during the final evaluation process.

Recommendation 10: Industry continues to take a leadership role in TVET through the Industry Skills Councils and Centres of Excellence.

1.30 Recommendations to Training Institutes

- Training Institutes should continue to show leadership in the TVET sector by promoting and facilitating adoption of the NVTQF and Competency Based Training to all stakeholders.
- Training Institutes should work together to devise strategies to encourage current teachers to up-skill and re-train in readiness for the NVTQF and CBT.
- Principals of Training Institutes should monitor and report of the outcomes of CBT, such as changes to ‘employability’ and actual employment rates, as well as quality of teaching and learning under the new system, with comparison to traditional training outcomes. Principals should seek professional development for teachers and management in the area of monitoring and evaluation, where there are skills shortages in their institution.
- Principals should encourage trainees to become advocates for CBT within their communities of interest through the use of social media and other on line forums
- In order to meet increasing costs and demands for resourcing linked to the introduction of CBT, Institutes should not see the impost of student fees as the only solution to revenue targets. They should work with Government, Industry and other development partners in order to analyze opportunities for innovation in income generation and self-sufficiency.

Recommendation 11: Training Institutes continue to show leadership by promoting and adopting the NVTQF, CBT and RPL.

Recommendation 12: Training Institutes take a leading role, with Government and industry, to find solutions to the cost of CBT so that a greater diversity of students have access to training.

1.31 Recommendations to NGOs and Civil Society

- NGOs should continue to show leadership in the TVET sector by advocating for under-privileged and disadvantaged people, including women and people with disability. NGOs have a particular strength in terms of their reach and credibility in communities so they play a vital role in encouraging and supporting people to engage with the TVET sector to gain ‘marketable skills and qualifications’.
- NGOs should continue their strong engagement with the Skills development sector, particularly with ILO, to focus on pre-vocational training, the apprenticeships system, and RPL, all of which particularly resonate with the poorer sectors of the community.
- NGOs should work within their sector to promote the value of high quality non-formal vocational training programs, which are relevant and following CBT methods for the best outcomes of their constituents.
- NGOs should exploit their considerable reach and influence to promote improved quality of training to communities in more remote and hard to access locations.
- Civil Society organisations, especially those representing employees, should continue to advocate for decent work conditions for workers including through the Industry Skills Councils.

Recommendation 13: NGOs continue their strong engagement with the Skills Development Sector and ISCs to advocate on behalf of the disadvantaged, women, and people with disability, and facilitate skills training and employment opportunities for them.

Recommendation 14: Employee Group Representatives take a stronger role with the Skills Development Sector, and ISCs, to advocate for decent work conditions for employees.

ANNEX 1: TERMS OF REFERENCE –FINAL INDEPENDENT EVALUATION

XB Symbol:	BGD/06/OIM/EEC
Project title:	Technical and Vocational Education and Training Reform Project in Bangladesh (TVET-R)
Country:	Bangladesh
P&B Outcome:	Outcome 2: Skills development increases the employability of workers, the competitiveness of enterprises, and the inclusiveness of growth.
DWCP Outcome:	BDG101: Improved skills training and entrepreneurship for enhanced employability and livelihoods.
Duration:	6,5 years
Starting date:	December 2007
Ending date:	June 2014
Project language:	English
Budget:	EUR 14,5 millions
Project Administrative and Technical Backstopping Unit:	ILO Dhaka and Decent Work Support Team (New Delhi)
Independent Mid-Term Evaluation:	February 2011
Type of Evaluation:	Final Independent Evaluation
Evaluation Manager:	Mr. Natanael Lopes

I. INTRODUCTION AND RATIONALE FOR EVALUATION

1. These ToR cover the final independent evaluation of the TVET reform project in Bangladesh, which is funded by the European Union (EU), with additional contributions from the ILO and the Government of Bangladesh.
2. The TVET-R is a five-year project that started officially in December 2007, although staff of the project did not start arriving until June 2008 and full staffing was not attained until October 2008. The project mid-term independent evaluation was conducted in February 2011 and recommendations were proposed for TVET-R and its stakeholders to address. The TVET-R project was scheduled to cease at the end of December 2012 but was approved for two no-cost extensions, one up to December 2013 and a second up to June 2014²⁶. The final evaluation is thus required now at the request of the ILO Evaluation Unit (EVAL).
3. According to the ILO Evaluation Policy, due to the amount and length of the project, an independent evaluation must be carried out before the ending of the project. The EU will conduct their own final evaluation of the project one year after the project ends. The final evaluation is a requirement as described in the project document and is in line with the ILO Evaluation Policy regarding evaluation of such programmes. The evaluation will also comply with the Norms and Standards of the United Nations Evaluation Group (UNEG).
4. This final independent evaluation will be conducted by an external evaluation team and managed by Mr. Natanael Lopes as Evaluation Manager. The EU and the Government of Bangladesh agencies have collaborated in defining the scope and modalities of the evaluation as presented in these Terms of Reference. The evaluation process will be participatory and will involve stakeholder counterparts throughout the process. The ILO Office, the tripartite constituents and other parties who were involved in the execution of the project are the primary users of the evaluation findings and lessons learnt. The evaluation report will be discussed at the Project Steering Committee and submitted to the Government of Bangladesh and to the EU.
5. The evaluation is expected to determine if the project has achieved its stated objectives, assess the preliminary impact, relevance, efficiency, effectiveness and potential sustainability, formulate conclusions and recommendations and generate lessons learnt and good practices. The purpose of this final independent evaluation is to verify the achievements made during project implementation, and in particular to assess if the results specified in the logical framework matrix have been achieved by the end of the project. However, it also identifies further strategic directions to ensure the sustainability of the project. The evaluation findings, recommendations, lessons learnt and good practices will also contribute to the operation of the new ILO skills projects including the B-SEP and developing a centre of excellence for the Ready-Made Garments (RMG) sector project. Information from this evaluation will also enable the ILO to engage

²⁶ In the meantime, at the request of the EU and Project Steering Committee the ILO has submitted a request for another no-cost extension to December 2015.

with anticipated future skills projects funded by the European Union and the Asia Development Bank (ADB).

6. The TVET-R project is part of the ILO's Decent Work Country Programme (DWCP) for Bangladesh and it contributes with the following DWCP Outcome: BDG101: Improved skills training and entrepreneurship for enhanced employability and livelihoods.
7. The evaluation will be carried out between May-July 2014, with a final report being available by July 2014. The TVET-R will bear the cost of the evaluation.
8. The evaluation report will be in English.

II. BACKGROUND ON THE TVET-R AND CONTEXT

9. Bangladesh is a least-developed country (LDC), which achieved an average annual per-capita GDP growth rate of 3 % and reduced poverty rates from 59% in 1991 to 50% in 2000. Bangladesh attained impressive achievements in social and human dimensions of poverty: the country expanded gross primary school enrolment from 72% in 1980 to 98% in 2001 and achieved the Millennium Development Goal (MDG) of eliminating gender disparity in primary and secondary education. Life expectancy increased, lowering infant and child mortality, which were among the fastest decreases in the developing world (from 140 in 1972 to 6 in 2000, and from 95 in 1972 to 30 in 2000 respectively). The population growth rate has fallen to 1.5% per year, which is lower than that of India (1.8%) and Pakistan (2%). This is mainly due to a reduced birth rate, which fell from 6.3 children in 1975 to 3.3 in the mid-1990s. Bangladesh has also increased its immunization coverage. The country achieved faster progress in social indicators than most countries at similar income levels, including neighbours India, Pakistan, Sri Lanka, and Nepal. However child labour is widespread, with over seven million economically active children and over one million children involved in hazardous work.
10. As early as 2006, the Government identified weaknesses that needed to be addressed; otherwise, they would continue to slow employment growth: 1) low levels of education and skills in the labour force; and 2) a weak formal TVET system that it is not sufficiently adapted to labour market requirements, and covering only a small proportion of the training needs.
11. The project has focused on two most important issues. The first is to reduce mismatches between knowledge and skills of TVET graduates and the demand of the labour markets. Second, the project has addressed large groups of under-privileged youth and adults who were part of the labour market but were under-performed or remained underemployed. This group represents the major part of the workforce operating in the export-oriented industries such as garments, light engineering or electronics. They also represent a massive share of the labour force in construction, services and transport. The project assistance provided to large groups of under-privileged youth and adults will enable them to improve productivity and income and pursue new careers in the labour market. Below the transcription of the project's strategy approach:

12. **Development Objective:** The Development Objective of the project, TVET Reform in Bangladesh, is to support the pro-poor growth agenda of Bangladesh's Poverty Reduction Strategy Paper by creating more employment opportunities for the poor and strengthening the capacity to tackle the competitive challenges of the country.
13. **Purpose:** A market-oriented and flexible TVET system, which responds to the demand for competitive skills of the modern sector as well as to the needs of youth and under-privileged groups.
14. **Project Components and Result Areas:** The project has five components the names of which describe the key results expected of the project:
- **Component 1:** TVET Policies, Systems and Legislation Reviewed and Strengthened at the Central and Decentralized Levels;
 - **Component 2:** Enhanced flexibility, quality and relevance of TVET;
 - **Component 3:** Strengthened TVET Institutions Through Improved Knowledge and Skills of Managers and Teachers;
 - **Component 4:** Improved Skills Development Resulting in Enhanced Productivity, and Competitiveness in Key Growth and Export-Oriented Industries in the Formal Industrial Sector;
 - **Component 5:** Increased Access of Underprivileged Groups to TVET.
15. **Direct beneficiaries:** The Government of Bangladesh will have access to the best practices of reforming public education and training systems through the introduction of policies and practices of good governance and decentralization in the systems of public services. The TVET system reform will also produce a spill over to other sectors of public services, which may learn from this reform. Various Government agencies will benefit including: the Department of Technical Education (DTE); the Bangladesh Technical Education Board (BTEB); the public Technical and Vocational Education and Training (TVET) institutions; private technical schools and centres; NGOs delivering non-certified, short-term and very short-term training.
16. **Ultimate beneficiaries:**
- Employers who learn and apply structured training approaches and introduce modern training practices and engage with Government training providers.
 - The underprivileged persons who are provided opportunities for training and employment.
 - Regular TVET students and graduates who benefit from better quality teaching in better run training establishment using programmes developed with industry. Increasingly these students will have a higher percentage of women.
 - Trade unions, which are strengthened in their operation and management and are able to promote skills upgrading for their members.
17. **Budget:** Total contribution is EUR 14.5 million from December 2007 to June 2014.
18. The mid-term review of the TVET-R in February 2011 recommended a new project that provided for vertical and horizontal expansion of the interventions in TVET-R. The Canadian International Development Agency (CIDA) funded the Skills for Employment and Productivity project (B-SEP) which builds on the work

of the TVET-R and launched in April 2013. B-SEP expands the ILO work into three new sectors (furniture, ceramics and pharmaceuticals) while retaining two sectors (agro-food processing and tourism/hospitality). H&M and the Swedish International Development Cooperation Agency (SIDA) supported a new project for the Ready-Made Garments sector entitled: Developing a Centre of Excellence for the RMG Sector project. Additional skills projects are in the pipeline including a new project targeting sector likes construction with funding from the United Kingdom Department for International Development (DFID), a huge project on Supporting Education and Skills Development Investment Programs (SEIP) funded by the Asian Development Bank. The EU has stated that skills development will be one of three pillars of their new country programme for Bangladesh starting at the end of 2015.

III. PURPOSE, SCOPE AND CLIENTS OF EVALUATION

19. The Technical and Vocational Education and Training Reform in Bangladesh project will end in June 2014. With its budget well over USD 10 Million, the ILO evaluation policy requires that it goes through an independent final evaluation. This requirement was specified in the project document and agreed with the donor.
20. The evaluation seeks to assess the key achievements of the project as per project framework, the extent to which the project partners in Bangladesh, tripartite constituents, local communities and beneficiaries have benefited, and will continue to benefit, from the project's outcome, strategy and implementation arrangements. It is also aimed to highlight good points, areas for improvement and recommendations for sustainability, possible lessons learnt and good practices.
21. **Purpose:** the main purposes of the evaluation are to:
 - Assess whether the TVET-R has achieved its planned objectives and whether its management systems is appropriate.
 - Assess TVET-R intervention to what extent the project has responded to the mid-term independent evaluation's recommendations.
 - Assess TVET-R interventions focusing on what has worked and what has not worked, and why this was the case;
 - Examine if the approach described in the PRODOC (**Annex 1**) was taken, and if it was optimally executed;
 - Assess the current impact and sustainability of the programme activities undertaken and where possible, identify evidence of pathways and indicators of long-term impact;
 - Provide recommendations to support ILO's expansion of its skills development and employment activities based on the assessment of the key success factors, good practices and constraints faced by the programme;
 - Provide a clear articulation of lessons learnt and identify good practices to inform future project development and contribute to knowledge development of the ILO and the programme stakeholders.
22. The outcome indicators of the evaluation are linked to the Monitoring and Evaluation Plan attached as **Annex 2**.

23. **Scope:** the final evaluation will cover the project duration from December 2007 to present; covering the five strategic components of the project as outlined in section 2, and referencing the performance indicators in the logical framework as revised, February 2012 (**Annex 3**). The evaluation builds on the findings of the mid-term review (MTR – see **Annex 4**) and should take into account the evaluation’s purpose as available in the project document.
24. **Clients:** the clients of the evaluation are:
- The donor, European Union - close collaboration (such as sharing the Terms of Reference, asking for comments on the draft report and debriefing at the end of the evaluation) with the donor during the evaluation will ensure that donor requirements are met;
 - The skills programme²⁷ team in Dhaka, ILO office in Bangladesh and other ILO field and HQ staff;
 - Tripartite constituents (government, employer, and worker representatives in Bangladesh).
25. The evaluation will be used in the following ways:
- Evaluation findings and recommendations will inform and guide current projects in the skills programme of ILO Dhaka; the recommendations will benefit and be addressed by concerned parties particularly those that will be involved in above projects plus pipeline projects, for example, those to be funded by the EU and ADB;
 - The evaluation report will be disseminated in the ILO for organisational learning through the EVAL’s i-Track evaluation database. A summary of the evaluation will be made available publicly through EVAL’s website.

IV. KEY EVALUATION QUESTIONS

26. Each evaluation conducted by the ILO is expected to assess the key evaluation criteria defined by OECD/DAC that are directly in line with the international standards of good practices. These criteria are:
- **Relevance:** the extent to which the aid activity is suited to the priorities and policies of the target group, recipient and donor.
 - **Coherence:** the extent to which the strategy is logical and consistent, and coherent with design and operations of complementary initiatives and organizations.
 - **Effectiveness:** a measure of the extent to which an aid activity attains its objectives.
 - **Efficiency:** measures the outputs - qualitative and quantitative - in relation to the inputs. It is an economic term which signifies that the aid uses the least costly resources possible in order to achieve the desired results. This generally requires comparing alternative approaches to achieving the same outputs, to see whether the most efficient process has been adopted.

²⁷ The three projects under the skills programme umbrella are: TVET-R; B-SEP and COE for RMG.

- **Impact:** the positive and negative changes produced by a development intervention, directly or indirectly, intended or unintended. This involves the main impacts and effects resulting from the activity on the local social, economic, environmental and other development indicators. The examination should be concerned with both intended and unintended results and must also include the positive and negative impact of external factors, such as changes in terms of trade and financial conditions.
- **Sustainability:** is concerned with measuring whether the benefits of an activity are likely to continue after donor funding has been withdrawn. Projects need to be environmentally as well as financially sustainable.

27. The ILO Policy Guidelines for Results-Based Evaluation²⁸ and the technical and ethical standards and abide by the Code of Conduct for Evaluation on the UN System²⁹ are established within these criteria and the evaluation should therefore adhere to these to ensure an internationally credible evaluation.

28. Gender concerns should be addressed in accordance with ILO Guidance note 4: “Considering gender in the monitoring and evaluation of projects³⁰”. All data should be sex-disaggregated and different needs of women and men and of marginalized groups targeted by the programme should be considered throughout the evaluation process.

29. The evaluation will examine the project along the following six standard evaluation criteria³¹. A more detailed analytical framework of questions and sub-questions will be developed by the Team Leader Evaluator (TLE):

29.1. Relevance and strategic fit of the intervention

- Is the programme linked to national and or international development frameworks such as United Nations Development Action Framework (UNDAF), Decent Work Country Programme (DWCP), ILO’s Programme and Budget (P&B), etc?
- Are the objectives of the intervention consistent with beneficiaries’ requirements, country needs, global priorities and partners’ and donors’ policies?
- Does the TVET-R project design effectively integrate the different interests and capacity levels of communities in their roles as programme

²⁸ http://www.ilo.org/eval/Evaluationguidance/WCMS_168289/lang-en/index.htm

²⁹ <http://www.unevaluation.org/ethicalguidelines>

³⁰ http://www.ilo.org/eval/Evaluationguidance/WCMS_165986/lang-en/index.htm

³¹ Key questions under each evaluation criteria have been designed to help address the extent to which the mainstreaming of gender equality has been integrated into the implementation of the intervention, the effectiveness and efficiency in mainstreaming gender equality, the outcomes delivered in terms of gender equality, and an estimation of the impact of the policies implemented on the equality of women and men, when appropriate.

stakeholders, workers and employers' organization, other partners, implementers and beneficiaries?

- Was gender analysis included during the initial needs assessment of the programme?

29.2. Coherence of intervention design

- Were the project strategy, objectives and assumptions appropriate for achieving the planned results in capacity building and employment creation?
- Did the project have a coherent LF and M&E plan?
- How well did the TVET-R complement, fit, and strategically optimize synergies through collaboration with other ILO projects in Bangladesh particularly to increase its effectiveness and impact?
- Did the project design adequately consider the gender dimension of the planned interventions and involve adequately social partners? To what extent are the output and outcome indicators gender-sensitive? How could the project strategy be adapted to further contribute to gender equality?

29.3. Project progress and effectiveness

- Are the results of the project, technical quality and usefulness of ILO outputs and contributions recognized by core partners and direct beneficiaries?
- What obstacles did the project encounter in project implementation? What corrective action does the project need to take to achieve its objectives?
- To what extent has the programme so far achieved its objectives and reached its target groups? Do programme outcomes contribute to gender equality? What factors influenced the effectiveness of the project capacity building and other activities? Have the quantity and quality of outputs been satisfactory? How have outputs been transformed into outcomes? (i.e. Policies have been implemented?)
- How and to what extent has the Government been involved in project implementation?
- What are the adjustments that have been made in the programme implementation due to the midterm evaluations' recommendations? What motivated these adjustments? To what extent were these adjustments effective and enhanced the Project's outcome achievements?
- What are the "surprise" achievements and challenges in the course of the implementation?
- In which areas of Project implementation has tripartism been integrated meaningfully? The extent to which the social partners have been involved in the implementation of the project.
- What are the good practices and lessons learnt noteworthy of documentation?

29.4. Efficiency of resource use

- Does the project make efficient use of its financial and human resources?
- Is the implementation strategy cost-effective?
- Is the distribution of resources between staff and activities optimal?

- Were the intervention resources used in an efficient way to address gender equality in the implementation?
- Does the project have good systems to provide: (a) budget planning and reporting and (b) work planning and reporting effectively correspond? Do they allow for efficient use of time and resources?

29.5. Effectiveness of management arrangements

- Are the Project Steering Committee and Project Monitoring and Coordinating Committee active and effective? Are both committees clear about roles and responsibilities?
- Has the institutional framework been favourable for the Programme development? Did the project have adequate staff capacity to implement the project? Has the project staff sought and received adequate support from the relevant ILO units and offices, including gender expertise when needed? Does the country project staff have sufficient authority/delegation in executing and managing the project (e.g. technically, financial and admin management)?
- What could have been done more effectively or differently?
- Did the project receive adequate administrative, technical and if needed political support from the ILO Dhaka, ROAP, technical specialists and the responsible technical units at HQ (the Technical units in HQ shall include admin and management support unit such as e.g. BUD/FIN, and PROCUREMENT). How effective was the internal coordination among technical units to support the TVET-R?
- Is the monitoring and evaluation system practical, useful and cost effective for project management? Has the project systematically monitored results (outputs and outcomes) through collecting sex-disaggregated data? Does the management use the information generated by the M&E system to assess progress against the objectives (including gender-related results) and take necessary adaptive measures when required?
- Does the M&E system include indicators and baselines? How effective is the project in sharing good practices between ILO projects in Bangladesh and communicating success stories and disseminating knowledge internally and externally (including gender-related results and knowledge)?
- Any substantive factors that support (or hinder) the smooth project implementation?

29.6. Impact orientation and sustainability of the intervention

- What are the necessary action / interventions by the ILO, Government of Bangladesh, and donors to ensure that the achievements of the programme can be sustained and provide a meaningful platform for further capacity building of the Government of Bangladesh?
- Has the project made a significant contribution to broader and longer-term development? What are the obstacles the project encountered towards achieving sustainability and how did the project address these?
- Are national partners willing and able to continue the project? How effectively has the project built national ownership and capacity of people and institutions?
- Are the gender-related outcomes likely to be sustainable?

- Has the project reached sufficient scale to justify the investment? Are the approach and its results likely to be up-scaled or replicated?
- Do conditions exist to ensure that the project's results will have lasting effects?
- What is the likelihood that the project's benefits will be sustained after the withdrawal of external support?
- What are the impacts of the project?
- What are the emerging impact of the project and the changes that can be causally linked to the project's intervention?
- How far has the project made a significant contribution to broader, longer term development impact?
- What are the realistic long-term effects of the project on employment, gender mainstreaming and capacity of government and social partners?
- Have the risks factors that need to be mitigated to ensure maximum and sustainable capacity enhancement after the Project ends been addressed?
- What are the good practices and lessons learnt noteworthy of documentation?

V. METHODOLOGY TO BE FOLLOWED

30. ILO's Policy Guidelines for results-based evaluation: Principles, rationale, planning and managing for evaluation³² provides the basic framework; the evaluation will be carried out in accordance with ILO standard policies and procedures. The ILO adheres to the United Nations system's evaluation norms and standards as well as to the OECD/DAC Evaluation Quality Standards.

31. Methodologies will complement each other and data will be triangulated through the different methodologies. The evaluator is expected to use the following methodologies during the evaluation:

31.1. **Evaluability assessment:** The evaluator will conduct an evaluability assessment of the project's logical framework and M&E plan. This evaluability assessment shall review the coherence and logic of the, as well address issues related to data availability and adequacy of this data in reflecting progress towards results. The evaluator shall be guided by EVAL's conceptual framework and evaluability instrument³³ which scores individual projects and programmes based on the following six criteria:

- Objectives;
- Indicators;
- Baselines;
- Milestones;
- Risks and assumptions;
- Monitoring and Evaluation.

³² http://www.ilo.org/eval/Evaluationguidance/WCMS_168289/lang-en/index.htm

³³ http://www.ilo.org/wcmstp5/groups/public/---ed_mas/---eval/documents/publication/wcms_165984.pdf

31.2. Desk review: The evaluator will review the following documents before conducting any interview and undertaking visits to the programme sites:

- TVET-R PRODOC;
- Revised LOGFRAME and rationale, February 2012;
- TVET-R Work plan 2008-2009 (two year combined), Progress Reports (5); sample quarterly progress report; sample monthly progress reports; sample PSC and PMCC minutes;
- TVET-R Mid-Term Review (MTR) report and Monitoring Mission Report;
- Justification for project extensions (one year to December 2013 and six months to June 2014);
- ILO Bangladesh DWCP documents;
- Project monitoring and evaluation plan;
- Other key documents produced by the project: e.g. Research reports, National Skills Development Policy; National Quality Assurance Framework for TVET; National Technical and Vocational Qualifications Framework (NTVQF) Implementation Manual; Strategy to Promote Gender Equality in TVET; Draft Strategy to Promote Inclusion of Persons with Disabilities in TVET;
- Other relevant project outputs including samples of Course Accreditation Documents, Competency Based Learning Materials (CBLMs), Competency Skills Logbooks (CSLBs), replication guides, pilot description sheets, information videos; list/sample of programmes held to engage National Coordination Committee for Workers Education (NCCWE) and Bangladesh Employers Federation (BEF);
- A variety of documents about the project are available at: www.ilo.org/tvet.

31.3. Data review / data collection: The evaluator will review the programme's M&E system for tracking programme's progress in achieving its goals and objectives. The evaluator will review existing quantitative and qualitative data and collect more progress data where necessary.

31.4. Interviews to key actors: To be checked with Evaluation team (ILO staff backstopping the project, technical specialists from the regional and HQ).

31.5. Focused group discussion: TVET-R project staff members, Donors, Stakeholders and Beneficiaries. It is recommended to keep a gender balance of representation.

31.6. Field visits for observation and interviews: The evaluation mission will visit a number of project sites, which will give a representative picture of the TVET-R activities. The mission will conduct interviews with key stakeholders, staff and beneficiaries on the ground.

31.7. Stakeholder workshop in the field: At the completion of the field mission, a stakeholder workshop which will be organized by the ILO Skills Programme in Dhaka, to present and discuss the overall findings, conclusions, and recommendations emerging from the evaluation.

31.8. ILO and donor debriefing: Upon completion of the report, the Team Leader Evaluator will take part in a meeting to provide a debriefing to the European

Union and the ILO on the evaluation findings, conclusions, and recommendations as well as the evaluation process (via telephone conference).

VI. MAIN OUTPUTS: INCEPTION REPORT, DRAFT AND FINAL REPORT

32. **Inception report** submitted to the Evaluation Manager with detailed methodological document outlining the evaluative approach, key activities, interview questionnaires, list of key actors and timeframe (refer to Checklist 3: Writing the inception report³⁴).
33. **Draft evaluation report** with specific feasible recommendations submitted to the Evaluation Manager at the ILO (refer to Checklist 5: Preparing the evaluation report³⁵).
34. **Final evaluation report** submitted to the Evaluation Manager, within one week after the receiving final comments on the draft report. The report will follow EVAL format template, including a title page (refer to Checklist 7: Filing in the evaluation title page³⁶) and be no more than 35 pages in length + annexes. Annexes of the report will include results of the questionnaire survey, a summary of findings for each field visit, summary for each meeting, a list of people interviewed and; a list of documents reviewed. The quality of the report will be determined based on conforming to the EVAL quality standards (refer to Checklist 6: Rating the quality of evaluation reports³⁷).
35. **Evaluation Summary** submitted to the Evaluation Manager based on the evaluation report executive summary (refer to Checklist 8: Writing the evaluation report summary³⁸).
36. Gender equality issues shall be explicitly addressed throughout the evaluation activities of the consultants and all outputs including final reports and events need to mainstream gender equality.
37. All draft and final outputs, including supporting documents, analytical reports and raw data should be provided in electronic version compatible with the software Microsoft Word for Windows. Ownership of the data from the evaluation rests solely with the ILO. The copyright of the evaluation report will rest exclusively with the ILO. Use of the data for publication and other presentation can only be made

³⁴ http://www.ilo.org/eval/Evaluationguidance/WCMS_165972/lang--en/index.htm

³⁵ http://www.ilo.org/eval/Evaluationguidance/WCMS_165967/lang--en/index.htm

³⁶ http://www.ilo.org/eval/Evaluationguidance/WCMS_166363/lang--en/index.htm

³⁷ http://www.ilo.org/eval/Evaluationguidance/WCMS_165968/lang--en/index.htm

³⁸ http://www.ilo.org/eval/Evaluationguidance/WCMS_166361/lang--en/index.htm

with the agreement of the ILO. Key stakeholders can make appropriate use of the evaluation report in line with the original purpose and with appropriate acknowledgement.

VII. MANAGEMENT ARRANGEMENTS, WORK PLAN, FORMATTING REQUIREMENTS AND TIME FRAME

Management Arrangements

38. The evaluation is managed by an independent evaluation manager, Mr. Natanael Lopes of ILO Brazil. He will be supported by Regional Evaluation Officer based at ILO Regional Office for Asia and the Pacific Ms. Pamornrat Pringsulaka.
39. The final independent evaluation will be conducted by a team of two international independent evaluators – one Team Leader Evaluator (TLE) and one International Consultant Evaluator (ICE). The team leader reports to the evaluation manager.
40. The International Consultant Evaluator will work closely with the Team Leader Evaluator on the mission. The ILO office (skills programme) in Dhaka will help in organizing hotel bookings, arranging meetings and transportation.
41. The Team Leader Evaluator is responsible for conducting the evaluation according to the ToR. The Team Leader Evaluator shall:
- Review the ToR and provide input, as necessary;
 - Review project background materials (desk-review);
 - Review the evaluation questions and refine the questions in collaboration with the Evaluation Manager as necessary and develop interview protocols;
 - Develop and implement an evaluation methodology (i.e., conduct interviews, review documents) to answer the evaluation questions;
 - Design and conduct a survey/questionnaire for the interviews, group discussions and field visits;
 - Conduct interviews and a stakeholder workshop in the field;
 - Conduct an evaluation planning teleconference prior to the evaluation mission;
 - Undertake evaluation mission to Bangladesh;
 - Prepare an initial draft of the evaluation report and submit it to the Evaluation Manager. Prepare a final report, reflecting any comments or additional inputs received;
 - Submit the final evaluation report after the evaluation mission according to the timeline provided below. The other member of the evaluation team should be involved in the drafting of and commenting on the final report.
42. The International Consultant Evaluator shall:
- Desk review of programme documents;

- Participate in evaluation planning teleconference prior to the evaluation mission;
 - Undertake field mission to Bangladesh;
 - Contribute to the development of the evaluation instruments;
 - Participate in meetings with and interviews of stakeholders and field visits in the country;
 - Co-facilitate stakeholder workshop (under the Team Leader Evaluator leadership);
 - Contribute to the evaluation report through systematizing data collected and providing analytical inputs;
 - Other activities as required by the Team Leader Evaluator.
43. On the ILO's side, the Team Leader Evaluator will be supervised by the Evaluation Manager. The Evaluation Manager will:
- Prepare and finalize the ToR for the evaluation and liaise with the ILO Management Support Unit and EVAL as necessary. The ToR is to be reviewed and approved by the Regional Evaluation Officer, based in the ILO Regional Office for Asia and the Pacific in Bangkok - Thailand;
 - Review the evaluation questions and work with the donor and the Team Leader Evaluator to refine the questions, as necessary;
 - Ensure meeting schedules are set up;
 - Review and provide comments on the evaluation report;
 - Ensure that the evaluation is conducted in accordance with these ToR, for the preparation of the draft report of the evaluation, discussing it with the other members of the evaluation team, the beneficiaries and the stakeholders.
 - Liaise with TVET-R project staff wherever their engagement is needed to fulfill the requirements above.

Work plan

44. The total duration of the evaluation process is approximately **7** weeks. The Team Leader Evaluator will be engaged during approximately **31** days of which approximately **16** workdays will be in Bangladesh. It is expected that the International Consultant Evaluator will be engaged for approximately **26** workdays³⁹.
45. Meetings in Bangladesh will be organized by project staff, in accordance with the Team Leader Evaluator's requests and consistent with the ToR. A detailed programme for the in-country mission will be prepared by TVET-R.

Provisional work plan

46. The following is a schedule of tasks and anticipated duration of each output.

Period for evaluation: **June 14** to end of July.

³⁹ The suggested distribution of workdays is indicative. The two consultants may agree a different distribution during discussions prior to finalizing contracts.

PHASE	RESPONSIBLE	TASKS	TENTATIVE DATES	DAYS	
				TLE	ICE
I	Evaluation Team	- Skype briefing with ILO - Desk-review of programme related documents - Inception Report	June 14 – 17	4	4
II	Evaluation Team	- Skype briefing with TVET-R team	June 19	1	1
III	Evaluation Team	- Field visits, interviews and workshop with stakeholders	June 21 - 27 June 29-30 July 1-3 July 5 - 8	16	16
IV	Evaluation Team	Draft Report writing	July 11-July 24	11	5
V	Evaluation Manager	Quality check and initial review Circulate draft report to key stakeholders Consolidate comments of stakeholders and send to team leader	July 25 –Aug 6	0	0
V	Team Leader Evaluator	Revision of evaluation report and prepare evaluation summary	Aug 7-8	2	0
VI	Team Leader Evaluator	Debriefing with ILO and donor	August 10 or 11 (date to be confirmed)	1	0
	Evaluation Manager/ Evaluation Officer	Check the revision and if all is fine, submit the final report to EVAL for the final approval	By August 12 (EVAL to review within 10 days of submission)	0	0
TOTAL =				31	26

TLE = Team Leader Evaluator

ICP = International Consultant Evaluator

Resources

47. The resources required for this evaluation are:

48. For the Team Leader Evaluator:

- Fees for approximately 31 days;
- Fees for international travel from consultant' home to Bangladesh in accordance with ILO regulations and policies;
- Local travel costs;
- Fees for local DSA during the field visits (as appropriate).

49. For the International Consultant Evaluator to work with the Team Leader Evaluator:

- Fees for approximately 26 days;
- Fees for international travel from consultant' home to Bangladesh in accordance with ILO regulations and policies;
- Fees for local DSA during the field visits (as appropriate);
- Local travel costs.

50. For the evaluation exercise as a whole:

- Stakeholder workshop expenditures;
- Interpretation costs as appropriate;
- Any other miscellaneous costs.

51. Team Leader Evaluator Profile. The Team Leader Evaluator should have:

- A minimum of eight years of experience conducting evaluations
- 10 years of experience in TVET including policy and practice and in at least one other area such as: teacher training, management training for education; strengthening business – TVET linkages; curriculum development; or working with disadvantaged groups.
- Familiarity with the ILO mandate and its tripartite and international standards foundations
- Candidates should also demonstrate solid team work skills, and have excellent written and oral communication skills in English.
- Country experience in Bangladesh is an advantage
- Gender balance and knowledge of gender equality issues will be considered in the selection of the evaluator/evaluation team

52. International Consultant Evaluator Profile. The International Consultant Evaluator should have:

- A minimum of four years of experience conducting evaluations
- 5 years of experience in TVET including policy and practice and in at least one other area such as: teacher training, management training for education; strengthening business – TVET linkages; curriculum development; or working with disadvantaged groups or related area.
- Familiarity with the ILO mandate and its tripartite and international standards foundations
- Candidates should also demonstrate solid team work skills, and participatory methodologies.
- Gender balance and knowledge of gender equality issues will be considered in the selection of the evaluator/evaluation team.

VIII. LEGAL AND ETHICAL MATTERS

53. This evaluation will comply with UN norms and standards for evaluation and ensure that ethical safeguards concerning the independence of the evaluation will

be followed. Please refer to the UNEG ethical guidelines: <http://www.unevaluation.org/ethicalguidelines>.

54. To ensure compliance with ILO/UN rules safeguarding the independence of the evaluation, the contractor will not be eligible for technical work on the project for the next 12 months.

IX. ANNEXES

Annex 1: Project document;

Annex 2: Monitoring and evaluation plan;

Annex 3: Revised logframe (Feb, 2012);

Annex 4: Mid-term review report;

Annex 5: Tentative mission schedule;

Annex 6: List of ILO staff to be interviewed;

Annex 7: List of ILO Evaluation guidelines and standard templates (includes those on the footnotes 3, 5, 7, 8, 9, 10 and 11):

1. Evaluation tool: Evaluability assessment tool for DWCP and projects
 - http://www.ilo.org/eval/Evaluationguidance/WCMS_165990/lang--en/index.htm
2. Code of conduct form (To be signed by the evaluator)
 - http://www.ilo.org/eval/Evaluationguidance/WCMS_206205/lang--en/index.htm
3. Checklist No. 3: Writing the inception report
 - http://www.ilo.org/eval/Evaluationguidance/WCMS_165972/lang--en/index.htm
4. Checklist No. 5: Preparing the evaluation report
 - http://www.ilo.org/eval/Evaluationguidance/WCMS_165967/lang--en/index.htm
5. Checklist No. 6: Rating the quality of evaluation report
 - http://www.ilo.org/eval/Evaluationguidance/WCMS_165968/lang--en/index.htm
6. Template for lessons learnt and Emerging Good Practices
 - http://www.ilo.org/eval/Evaluationguidance/WCMS_206158/lang--en/index.htm

- http://www.ilo.org/eval/Evaluationguidance/WCMS_206159/lang--en/index.htm
7. Guidance Note 7: Stakeholders participation in the ILO evaluation
- http://www.ilo.org/eval/Evaluationguidance/WCMS_165982/lang--en/index.htm
8. Guidance Note 4: Integrating gender equality in M&E of projects
- http://www.ilo.org/eval/Evaluationguidance/WCMS_165986/lang--en/index.htm
9. Template for evaluation title page
- http://www.ilo.org/eval/Evaluationguidance/WCMS_166357/lang--en/index.htm
10. Template for evaluation summary
- <http://www.ilo.org/legacy/english/edmas/eval/template-summary-en.doc>

ANNEX 2: ANALYTICAL FRAMEWORK OF QUESTIONS

Methodology

The methodology used in the final evaluation of TVET-R complied with the ILO Policy Guidelines for Results-Based Evaluation⁴⁰. The evaluators at all times adhered to the Code of Conduct for Evaluation in the UN System⁴¹.

The evaluation complied with the OECD/DAC guidelines that are directly in line with international standards of good practice, namely relevance, efficiency, effectiveness, sustainability and impact.

1. **Relevance:** the evaluation assessed the extent to which the aid activity was suited to the priorities and policies of the target groups, recipients and donors.
2. **Coherence:** the evaluation assessed the extent to which the strategy was logical and consistent, and coherent with design and operations of complementary initiatives and organizations.
3. **Effectiveness:** the evaluation measured the extent to which an aid activity attained the objectives of each of its components and activities.
4. **Efficiency:** the evaluation measured the outputs (both qualitative and quantitative) in relation to inputs. It assessed whether TVET-R had used the least costly resources possible in order to achieve the desired results.
5. **Impact:** the evaluation explored the positive and negative changes produced by TVET-R, whether directly or indirectly, and intended or unintended. This involved the main impacts and effects resulting from the activity on the local social, economic, environmental and other development indicators. Through analysis of results, the evaluation considered the impact of external factors, such as changes in terms of trade and financial conditions.
6. **Sustainability:** the evaluation measured whether the benefits of TVET-R are likely to continue after donor funding is withdrawn. It also examined the extent to which TVET-R is environmentally as well as financially sustainable.

A detailed analytical framework of questions and sub-questions based on the OECD/DAC evaluation criteria above that have been developed by the Evaluation team is illustrated below. This spells out the overarching, higher level questions that the Evaluation team used as their guide throughout the process.

1. Relevance and strategic fit of the intervention

- Is TVET-R relevant to the national and international approaches to TVET?
- Does TVET-R address beneficiary objectives?
- Does TVET-R fit with the donor's priorities?
- Does TVET-R integrate all stakeholder interests?
- Was gender analysis adequate in the design?

2. Coherence of intervention design

- Is TVET-R design appropriate?
- Are the strategy, objectives and assumptions appropriate for achieving results?
- Is the Logframe coherent?

⁴⁰ http://www.ilo.org/eval/Evaluationguidance/WCMS_168289/lang--en/index.htm

⁴¹ <http://www.unevaluation.org/ethicalguidelines>

- Is the M&E framework coherent and appropriate?
- Has there been productive collaboration with other TVET projects such as ADB and WB?
- Is the design of gender considerations adequate?

3. Project progress and effectiveness

- Are Results clearly defined and disseminated to partners for use?
- What were the key obstacles in achieving outputs and outcomes?
- Is TVET-R contributing to gender equality?
- Assessment of the quality and quantity of outputs.
- Were the outputs transformed to outcomes?
- Assessment of levels of Government involvement.
- Were the Mid Term Review recommendations adopted?
- Were there any unexpected outcomes?

4. Efficiency of resource use

- Was TVET-R efficient in its use of resources?
- Was the implementation cost effective?
- Were resources distributed effectively?
- Are there efficient budget planning, monitoring and reporting systems?

5. Effectiveness of management arrangements

- Are TVET-R Steering and Project Monitoring Committees active and effective?
- Was there adequate support and action from Government?
- Was there adequate staffing at all levels, administrative, technical?
- Was there adequate coordination with all partners to act and implement?
- Was the M&E system effective and adequate?

6. Impact orientation and sustainability of the intervention

- What is the longer-term development impact especially on employment opportunities, gender mainstreaming and capacity development?
- Questions around sustainability of efforts – are the risk factors being addressed?
- Specific conclusions about gender impact
- Lessons learned around good practices

Data Collection Instruments

Meeting and Semi-Structured Interview Questioning

The semi-structured interview questions have been designed on the basis of the indicators and objectives of TVET-R against each component that are developed in the Revised Log Frame (2012) and the Five Components of TVET-R. The discussions held with individuals and with small and larger groups during the field visits were also directed by the indicators for each component of TVET-R.

The Question Guide

The Evaluators used the template outlined in the inception report to ask the following questions consistently in meetings and discussions is as follows:

(See Template in Inception Report)

1. What do you see as the key achievements or successes of the TVET-R Project?

2. What are the enabling factors behind the successes and achievements?
3. What have been the biggest challenges or issues of the TVET-R Project?
4. What were the reasons for the challenges and issues in TVET-R?
5. What successful strategies were used to address challenges and issues?
6. What do you think the impact of TVET-R will be and for whom?
7. What impact on gender considerations do you think has TVET-R had?
8. What do you think the likely sustainability of the impact of TVET-R will be?
9. What could be done further to increase the likelihood of sustainability of TVET-R?
10. What have been the key lessons you've learned from TVET-R?
11. What recommendations would you make for future Project Development in TVET?
12. Any other comments, observations, suggestions or recommendations?

Participatory Approaches and Methodology

Sustineo's approach to working with all our clients is based on the following principles:

- Appreciative inquiry / strengths based approaches
- Active listening and affirming
- Respect for culture and diversity
- Participatory methodology in all evaluation activities
- Early and good communication and trust with the client and participants
- Being flexible in our planning to ensure as many relevant people are given the opportunity to participate and contribute as possible
- Working closely and collaboratively, with our clients

During the Evaluation this approach was effective in terms of respondents understanding the objective of our meetings and discussions, they were open and positive in sharing information and appreciated being given the opportunity to discuss and analyse outcomes and results during the process – as well as being asked for their recommendations for the future.

Quantitative Data Collection Plan

Evaluation Questions	Indicator	Sources of Data?	Method?	Who Will Collect?	How Often?	Cost?	Who will analyze?
Relevance and strategic fit of the intervention	Program design and objectives consistent with national and international frameworks, and partner / beneficiary interests	UNDAF, (DWCP), ILO's Project Design Documents, TVET-R Reports	Desk Review, discussions with ILO Project Team, EU, TVET Sector Stakeholders	TLE, ICE	In desk review planning stage, in meetings, focus groups, joint stakeholder workshop in Dhaka	-	TLE, ICE
Coherence of intervention design	Logical and appropriate strategy, objectives and assumptions. Synergies with other ILO Projects. Clearly articulated gender considerations	TVET-R Logframe, M&E Plan, Gender strategy of TVET-R	Desk review, discussion with ILO Project Team, EU, discussion with tripartite constituents, field visit observations and discussions	TLE, ICE	During desk review planning stage, in meetings, focus groups, discussions in joint workshop in country	-	TLE, ICE
Project progress and effectiveness	Technical quality of outputs and Results. Core partners and direct beneficiary satisfaction rates	TVET-R Reports, Mid Term Review, feedback from tripartite constituents and beneficiaries	Desk review of TVET-R reports, including MTR, meetings, focus group discussions, workshop activities, field visit observations	TLE, ICE	During field visit, interactions with stakeholders in the field and in participatory workshop	-	TLE, ICE
Efficiency of resource use	Clear and effective budget planning processes, reporting and work planning. Partner satisfaction rates relating to resource	ILO TVET-R Project financial, planning and reporting systems TVET-R financial reports, stakeholder feedback	Desk review of reports, systems and planning documents, discussions with ILO, EU teams,	TLE, ICE	During field visit, interactions with Project Team, stakeholders in meetings	-	TLE, ICE

	allocation, cost comparison with SDP, STEP		discussions with relevant stakeholders about resource allocation				
Effectiveness of management arrangements	Steering Committee activity and effectiveness Staffing levels, Levels of administration, technical and other support M&E system effective and useful for project management	Steering Committee meeting minutes, TVET-R management reports, M&E Framework, ILO Project staff feedback, EU feedback	Desk review reports and relevant documents, analysis of M&E plan, interviews and meetings with ILO and EU officers	TLE, ICE	During field visit, interactions with ILO Project team, EU discussions and meetings	-	TLE, ICE

The Final Workshop with Stakeholders

The final evaluation workshop held over one full day was held with key stakeholders in Dhaka with representatives from all tripartite constituents, including ILO, EU, Government representatives, Employer groups, Workers and Workers Representatives and TVET sector stakeholders. The workshop planning was highly dependent on the convenience and availability of key stakeholders during our visit in country and during Ramadan, and we were very pleased that 31 people attended.

The Workshop Venue

The venue for the workshop was selected so that people could easily move around to participate in small group work, breakout groups and other participatory activities.

Session Times

The duration of the sessions in the workshop was designed to allow adequate time for breaks and informal networking and discussions, which was highly successful. We planned the workshop itinerary in consideration of the fact that the holy month of Ramadan occurred during the field visit to Bangladesh and based on advice about the difficulties for participants in working into late afternoons. In consideration of this, the ILO administration and logistics team were very helpful in providing advice about how to overcome challenges relating to catering etc.

Workshop Invitees

We ensured that all key stakeholders were invited to the final workshop, representing the tripartite constituency. Invitations were sent out to all stakeholders on the list provided to Sustineo by the ILO – and we were delighted with the turnout considering it was over a whole day close to Ramadan. Some participants also travelled from outside Dhaka to attend, which we saw as a clear demonstration of their commitment to TVET-R.

Workshop Outcomes

The aim of the workshop was for the Evaluators to bring together constituents to present our preliminary findings to stakeholders. Firstly we invited the Guest Speakers to outline their views on the key achievements of TVET-R.

The following guests spoke for around ten minutes each:

- Welcome by Mr Gagan Rajbhhandari representing Director of ILO Country Office.
- Major Achievements of TVET-R Project - National Project Director, Mr Mian, Directorate of Technical Education.
- Major Achievements from the Donor's perspective Dr Nicole Malpas Programme Manager European Union.
- Address by-Mr A S Mahmud, Additional Secretary (Development) and Co-Chair Person, Project Steering Committee, Ministry of Education.
- Major Achievements by Chief Technical Advisor TVET-R – Mr Arthur Shears.

The Evaluators gave a PowerPoint presentation of the key findings and recommendations (see PPT presentation in separate attachment).

- We highlighted the successes of the ILO TVET Reform Project.
- We presented the preliminary findings, assumptions and conclusions to the group and encouraged and facilitated robust discussion and debate in order to reach a final viewpoint for the evaluation report.
- We identified the key enablers of success in TVET-R to highlight lessons to apply to new TVET project design.

- We identified the main challenges, gaps and issues and their causes experienced through the implementation of TVET-R, along with suggested key strategies to address challenges and issues and as required, seeking input to address any gaps.
- We highlighted and documented lessons learned; and made recommendations for sustainability of efforts and strategies for the future of TVET Project design.

Participatory Discussion using Table Talk

The Evaluators then facilitated sessions in order to encourage discussion and debate amongst the disparate group members in order to resolve any doubts around the validity of information or data, to reach and validate some solid conclusions for the final evaluation report. In order to achieve this, the Evaluators used a method called 'Table Talk' to encourage full participation by all stakeholders in the discussion.

Independent Evaluation Workshop – Preliminary Findings, Dhaka - Contribution of workshop participants in Table Talk exercise

NB. The three groups were self-selecting with a representative mix of participants from Government, Training Institutions, Industry/Centres of Excellent, NGOs Workers' Groups, Donors, ILO and other international organisations.

	Group 1	Group 2	Group 3
Key Achievements	<p>National Skills Development Policy developed and approved by Cabinet.</p> <p>Implementation of NTVQF developed and approved.</p> <p>Implementation of CBT&A system.</p> <p>Development & implementation of Quality Assurance System.</p> <p>Cert IV on CBT&A developed and approved for teachers/trainers through BTEB.</p> <p>NTVQF and MIS system functional.</p> <p>Gender strategy approved.</p> <p>Industry Skills Councils established.</p> <p>Centre of Excellent established and functional.</p> <p>Industry Assessors program running.</p> <p>Implementation of PWD strategy.</p>	<p>Successful piloting of TVET reform projects.</p> <p>Certification for 1st batch trainers/assessors.</p> <p>Policy formed and approved.</p> <p>Successful policy and advocacy for reformMs</p> <p>Initiating and stabilizing CoEs.</p> <p>Registered Training Centres.</p> <p>Documents for accreditation.</p> <p>More industry linkage established.</p> <p>Recognition and acceptance by all stakeholders that skill is a national issue.</p> <p>Quality and relevance of TVET.</p> <p>Mainstreaming gender issues in TVET.</p> <p>Piloting of RPL in 5 occupations in informal sector. RPL system developed.</p> <p>Strategy on gender equality in TVET and its resource guide.</p> <p>Peoples'/interested groups'/individuals' mindset to accept such education/skills as means of livelihood.</p> <p>Developed competency standard.</p> <p>Developed Quality Assurance System.</p> <p>Developed Course Accreditation document</p> <p>Developed CBLM.</p>	<p>TVET Teachers' training.</p> <p>Centre of Excellence.</p> <p>Donors' coordination.</p> <p>Structured informal apprenticeship.</p>
Enablers to Success		<p>Introduced CBT&A training in Bangladesh.</p> <p>ILO's involvement in TVET for Government and citizens of Bangladesh.</p> <p>Strong support from stakeholders –successful mobilization.</p> <p>Participation of industries/employees in TVET.</p> <p>Use print and electronic media by Government to impress upon benefits and requirements for skills training.</p>	<p>Training and retraining.</p> <p>TVET financials.</p>

Challenges/Issues	Capacity building of stakeholders. Capacity building of BTEB.	<p>RPL system introduced. Promote to make more popular. Sustainability of training providers in the private sectors. Private sector contribution to Skills/TVET. Mass awareness of TVET – social mindset. Sustainability and operational costs of ISCs. Scaling up of successful pilots. Quality of teachers to implement and deliver training. The decision-makers within the implementation partners’ organisations shall be selected and appointed based on demonstrated/proven commitment to attaining the objectives of TVET-Rs that they are tasked to lead. Potential of other priorities on their agenda, undermines everyone else’s efforts. Make TVET institutions inclusive of people with disabilities and women. Collect industry assessors for training and certification of graduates. Participation of industry. Trained and certified industry assessors. Modern tools and equipment. Trained and certified teachers. Mind-set of society and individuals in TVET.</p>	Roll out of ISCs. Initiate to enact TVET Act (Draft).
Lessons Learned		<p>Importance of CBT and RPL in certification. Sharing workshop for all pilot projects. Bringing all stakeholders to the table. Industry linkage should be continued. Educate people on TVET system. TVET sector requires more advocacy to remove social stigma. Public-private-donor-partnership needed (PPDP). Learned of occupational safety and health.</p>	TVET for underprivileged. Skills forecast.
Sustainability	Policy for sustainability. Support for NSDP Implementation Plan.	<p>Mass people’s thought about TVET as “right to TVET”. Building awareness. New project needed. Change recruitment policy for industry.</p>	Employment support (system). Increased TVET budget.

		<p>Give priority to CBT Graduates for recruitment.</p> <p>Very good timeliness of new projects being initiated (e.g. BSEP) to secure continuity and preservation of accumulated experience, skills, know-how, and institutional memory in order to maintain the momentum of initiated reforms NSDC need to be more functional.</p> <p>Training skills should have stronger employer ownerships – demand-driven.</p> <p>Private sector should contribute to TVET funding.</p> <p>Appropriate mechanisms and resources for TVET/Skills training.</p> <p>Business model for TVET institutions – commercial basis.</p> <p>Skills training should be followed by enterprise development for promoting self-employment.</p>	
Recommendations	<p>Certification – support for RPL activation; strengthening RPL; certification of trained teachers – to complete.</p> <p>BTEB - Database of resources to be developed by BTEB with support; decentralization of regulatory power of BTEB; continue strengthening the regulatory function of BTEB.</p> <p>Funding – there must be an incentive system for those players who will implement the reform initiatives, namely, trainers, assessors and institutions; funding is required to private sector from Government; continuation of TVET-R 2nd phase.</p> <p>ISCs/CoEs – revitalization of ISC members; strengthening CoEs.</p> <p>Other – awareness training programmes; follow up of trainees regarding employment.</p>	<p>Strengthen ISCs.</p> <p>Course fee and materials fee for trainees.</p> <p>Separate Ministry dedicated to Human Resource Development (TVET).</p> <p>Improved credibility and quality of training - credible certification system which is well-recognised.</p> <p>Bring some flexibility in some programs</p> <p>Awareness and social marketing for disadvantaged, particularly women and people with disabilities.</p> <p>To training institutions: establish a system of maintaining communication and securing feedback from graduates re their success in getting better employment or setting own business and tracking the impact over longer period of time (e.g. 1-2 years) e.g. changed 2-3 jobs, 1 job then own business over 1-2 years.</p> <p>Working with tripartite is missing throughout TVET-R particularly workers education.</p> <p>Tighten coordination among implementing partners to promote a coherent implementation of priorities set by the government, e.g. the skills development policy rather than diverting from them and pursuing other priorities.</p> <p>Flexibility and responsiveness to market demand/employers.</p> <p>NSDC Secretariat should be strengthened massively.</p> <p>Need a clear business plan for sustainability.</p>	<p>Advocacy.</p> <p>TVET promotion through social media.</p> <p>Provide market driven skills – training, e.g. driving.</p> <p>Flexibility in CBT&A.</p>

ANNEX 3: STAKEHOLDERS CONSULTED DURING THE FINAL INDEPENDENT EVALUATION OF TVET-R

Name	Organization	Position
Mr Arthur Shears	ILO	CTA of TVET-R
Mr Cezar Dragutan	ILO	CTA of B-SEP
Mr Wazed Ali	ILO	Program Officer TVET-R
Mr Serajul Islam	ILO	National Program Officer Comp 3
Mr Haripada Das	ILO	National Program officer Comp 1
Mr Francis De Silva	ILO	Senior Specialist (TVET-R) and B-SEP Comp 3
Mr Gabriel Bordado	ILO	Technical Advisor (TVET-R) and B-SEP Comp 2
Mr Md Nuruzzman	ILO	National Program Officer Comp 4
Mr Tanjel Ahsan	ILO	National Program Officer Comp 4
Mr Haruna Rashid	ILO CO	National Project Coordinator
Mr Srinvas Reddy	ILO CO	Country Director
Mr Gagan Rajbhandari	ILO CO	Deputy Director
Mr Nurunnabi Khan	ILO CO	Senior Program Officer
Mr Paul Comyn	ILO Dehli, India	Senior Specialist
Mr William Hanna	European Union	Head of Delegation, Bangladesh
Ms Libuse Soukapova	European Union	First Secretary, Head of Human and Social Development
Dr Nicole Malpas	European Union	Program Manager, Private Sector Development and Trade
Ms Loree Semeluk	Canada High Commission	Second Secretary (Development)
Mr Md Nurul Islam	Canada High Commission	Advisor, Skills for Development
Eng Md Babar Ali	Directorate of Technical Education, Dhaka (DTE)	Director, Planning and Development
Mr SM Shahjahan	Bangladesh Technical Education Board (BTEB)	Deputy Inspector
Mr Jiban Kumar Chowdhury	Ministry of Labour and Employment, NSDC	CEO of the National Skills Development Council and Joint Secretary NSDC Secretariat
Engineer Md Khalilur Rahman	Bureau of Manpower, Employment and Training (BMET)	Director
Mr Dewan Md Nazmul Haq	BMET	Deputy Director
Md. Jaynal Abedin	BMET	Deputy Director Training
Mr Abdul Kalam Azad	Bangladesh Trade Union Centre	Joint General Secretary
Md Delwar Hossain Khan	Bangladesh Labour Federation	General Secretary

Mr Farooq Ahmed	Bangladesh Employers Federation	Secretary General
Mr Tapan Kumar Chowdhury	Bangladesh Employers Federation	President
Mr Santosh Kumar Dutta	Bangladesh Employers Federation	Joint Secretary
Mr Jamilur Rhaman	Bangladesh Employers Federation	Training Coordinator
Mr Kohinoor Mahmoud	Bangladesh Institute of Labour Studies	Project Coordinator
Mr Shahadat Hossain	National Coordination Committee on Workers Education (NCCWE)	Member
Mr Chowdhury Mufad Ahmed	DTE (Skills Development Project) ADB funded	Project Director
Mr Kamal Hossain	As above	Additional Project Director
Md Atiar Rahman	MAWTS Institute of Technology	Manager (Training and Education)
Md Rehan Uddin	Chittagong Mohila Polytechnic Institute	Principal
Engineer Md Nazrul Islam	Bangladesh-Korea Institute Chittagong	Principal
Teaching and Training Staff	Bangladesh-Korea Institute Chittagong	Welding, electrical, mechanical, IT and other teaching staff
Dr Md.Rafiqul Islam Mir	Dhaka Polytechnic Institute	Principal
Mr Suresh Chandra Mondal	Dhaka Polytechnic Institute	Coordinator Pilot Programs and Head of Department Food Technology
Various teaching staff x 5	Dhaka Polytechnic Institute	Staff Department Food Technology
ABM Ashraful Haque	National Hotel and Tourism Training Institute (NHTTI)	Principal
Ms Shaheen Afroz	NHTTI	Manager, Head of Bakery
Mr Badal Malaker	NHTTI	Deputy Manager
Md Shafiqur Rahman Bhuiyan	Centre of Excellence Agro Food Skills Foundation	Chairman and CEO
Mr Sayed Khorshedul Alam	Western Maritime Institute Chittagong	Principal
Various instructors x 6	Western Maritime Institute Chittagong	Various trade and teaching staff
Engineer Md Sakhawat Hossain	Western Marine Shipyard Ltd	Managing Director
Engineer Md Fazle Rashid	Western Marine Shipyard	Deputy Managing Director

	Ltd	
Mr Monzur Morshed Chowdhury	Western Marine Shipyard Ltd	Director
Md Mominul Ahsan	Landmark and Apex Footwear Ltd	Executive Director Landmark and Apex Companies CEO of Centre of Excellence for Leather Skills, Bangladesh
Ms Kazi Roushan Ara (Shumi)	Centre of Excellence for Leather Skills, Bangladesh	Project Coordinator
Md Arifur Rahman Bhuiyan	Centre of Excellence for Leather Skills, Bangladesh	Training Coordinator
Imran Nazmul	Centre of Excellence for Leather Skills, Bangladesh	Assistant Manager, Business Development
Mr Shafquat Haider	CIPROCO Computers Ltd Industry Skills Council, IT Sector	Chairman & Managing Director
Mr Ramesh Chandra Halder	Centre for the Rehabilitation of the Paralyzed (CRP)	Vocational Training Coordinator
Ms Arpita Roy	Centre for the Rehabilitation of the Paralyzed (CRP)	Training Coordinator
Other staff in CRP, including office manager, trainers, and hostel accommodation manager (x3)	Centre for the Rehabilitation of the Paralyzed (CRP)	

ANNEX 4: BIBLIOGRAPHY

Type	Document
TVET Project Documents	<p>Addendum to contribution Agreement</p> <p>B-SEP Project Implementation Plan 2014</p> <p>Draft Workplan Feb 2012</p> <p>Competency Based Training and Assessment, Initial Evaluation Report on the conduct of Program Trials (NTVQF Level 1), ILO TVET Reform Project 2013</p> <p>Indicator Adjustment Feb-12-2.docx</p> <p>Letter revised logframe</p> <p>Logframe Feb-2012 revisions</p> <p>Mapping and Analysis of growth-oriented industrial sub-sectors and their skills requirements in Bangladesh, Employment Sector, Employment Report No. 17, 2012</p> <p>Mid Term Review Report – TVET Reform Project Bangladesh 2011</p> <p>Memorandum & Articles of Association of Leather and Leather Goods Industry Skills Council Ltd (draft) A Company Limited by Guarantee (Under Section 29, The Company Act 1994)</p> <p>Monitoring Report 29/03/2012</p> <p>Operational Handbook for TVET Institutions’ Manager (draft), TVET-R, Component 3, December 2013</p> <p>Plan of Action GANTT Chart Jan 2012</p> <p>Plan of Action submitted 12.11.09</p> <p>PRODOC TVET R Project</p> <p>Progress Report- May 31, 2010</p> <p>Project Progress Report – June 2010 to September 2011</p> <p>Project Progress Report – October 2012 to November 2013</p> <p>Project Progress Report- 12.12 2007 to 21.5 2009</p> <p>Trends and Linkages TVET Industry</p> <p>TVET-R Project Implementation Plan June 2014 to December 2015</p> <p>TVET Reform Project, Component 4, Workplace Learning and Productivity, Phase 1 Completion Report, June 2008-December 2009</p> <p>DRAFT Final Report - Bangladesh TVET Reform Project MTR</p> <p>Indicator Adjustment Feb 7-12</p> <p>Logframe - Feb 7-2012</p> <p>Plan of Action submitted 121109</p> <p>Project M&E Plan (V5) May 10(AD_10 April 2011)</p>
ILO Specific Documents	<p>Evaluation Tool - Evaluability assessment for DWCP and projects</p> <p>ILO Checklist 3 - Writing the inception report</p> <p>ILO Checklist 5 - Preparing the evaluation report</p> <p>ILO Checklist 6 - Rating the quality of evaluation reports</p> <p>ILO Checklist 7 - Filling in the title page</p> <p>ILO Checklist 8 - Writing the evaluation summary</p> <p>ILO Checklist 10 - documents for the evaluator</p> <p>ILO Code of Conduct for Evaluators - template</p> <p>ILO Emerging Good Practice Template</p> <p>ILO Evaluation Summary template</p> <p>ILO Evaluation title page template</p> <p>ILO Guidance Note 4 - Integrating Gender equality</p> <p>ILO Guidance Note 6 - The evaluation manager - Role and function</p> <p>ILO Guidance Note 7 - Stakeholder Participation</p> <p>ILO Inception Report Annex template</p>

	<p>ILO independent evaluation approval form</p> <p>ILO policy guidelines for results-based evaluation - Principles, rationale, planning and managing for evaluations</p> <p>Policy guidelines for results based evaluation</p> <p>Template - Code of Conduct Agreement with ILO Evaluation Consultants</p> <p>Template-checklist3</p> <p>United Nations Evaluation Group_2008_EthicalGuidelines</p>
Other materials and publications consulted	<p>ILO policy guidelines for results-based evaluation: Principles, rationale, planning and managing for evaluations, 2nd ed. (July 2013)</p> <p>Voices and Views: European Development Fund: TVET Reform Promotes Social Inclusion and Skills for Bangladesh 2013</p> <p>Public Private Partnership (PPP) in the Technical Vocational Education and Training (TVET) Sector in Bangladesh: Challenges and Prospects. M H TANSEN and RUBAYA MONZUR November 2012</p> <p>Bangladesh: Poverty Reduction Strategy Paper International Monetary Fund. Asia and Pacific Dept March 2013 IMF Country Report No. 13/63</p> <p>'Labour market transitions of young women and men in Bangladesh', Youth Employment Programme, Employment Policy Department ILO Toufique, K.A, June 2014</p> <p>Draft National Strategy for Promotion of Gender Equality in Technical and Vocational Education and Training (TVET) 2012, NSDC, Government of Bangladesh, in collaboration with TVET Reform Project</p> <p>National Skills Development Policy, 2011, Government of Bangladesh</p> <p>Action Plan for the Implementation of the National Skills Development Policy 2011, Government of Bangladesh, Ministry of Labour and Employment, National Skills Development Council Secretariat.</p>

ANNEX 5: FINAL WORKSHOP AGENDA



Agenda - Workshop on “Final Independent Evaluation”

1.0	Theme	–	Final Independent Evaluation of TVET Reform Project
2.0	Target Audience	–	Key Stakeholder Partners of TVET-R Project
3.0	Date	–	Tuesday, 22 July 2014 11.00 to 15.30 pm
4.0	Venue	–	BRACC Centre Inn Bangladesh 75, Mohakhali, Dhaka 1212
5.0	Objectives of the Workshop	–	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • To present the key observations and preliminary findings of the final independent evaluation of the TVET-R Project to a representative group of key stakeholders. • To provide opportunities for discussion and debate, as well as input into recommendations and lessons learned to be included in the final evaluation report to ILO.
6.0	Program		
	11:15 a.m.	–	Arrival of guests
	11:30 a.m. – 11:55 a.m.	–	<p>Welcome by Mr Gagan Rajbhandari representing Director of ILO Country Office</p> <p>Major Achievements of TVET-R Project - National Project Director, Mr Mian, DTE</p> <p>Major Achievements from EU perspective Dr Nicole Malpas Programme Manager</p> <p>Address by - Mr A S Mahmud, Additional Secretary (Development) and Co-Chair Person, Project Steering Committee, Ministry of Education</p>
	11:55 a.m. – 12:25 p.m.		Presentation Overview of Evaluation Findings by Sue Allan and Mary Mertin—Ryan
	12.25 – 12-30	–	Summary major Achievements from Program Team perspective - Mr Arthur Shears
	12:30 p.m.–13:00 p.m	–	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Break
	13:00 p.m.–14:30 p.m.	–	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Small Group activities and discussions
	14.30 – 15.15		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Plenary and final recommendations
	15:15 pm- 15:30 pm	–	<p>Vote of thanks and Closing</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • ‘Looking Forward’ - Mr Cezar Dragutan, CTA- Skills Program Manager • Ms Sue Allan Team Leader Evaluation - vote of thanks

ANNEX 6: LIST OF ATTENDEES – FINAL EVALUATION WORKSHOP

Technical and Vocational Education and Training (TVET) Reforms in Bangladesh Project
(BGD/06/01M/EEC)

Consultation Workshop on Preliminary Findings of Independent Final Evaluation of TVET Reform
Project in Bangladesh July 22 2014

Venue: BRAC Centre Inn, 75, Mohakhali, Dhaka

Sl. No	Names of officials and/or official titles	Signature	Remarks
	Ministry of Education		
1.	Mr Shafiuddin Ahmed Joint Secretary Ministry of Education Representative of Chairperson of PSC, BSEP Project Paribahan Pool Dhaka-1000, Bangladesh		
	Delegation of European Union in Bangladesh		
2.	Dr Nicole Malpas Programme Manager - Trade and Private Sector Development Delegation of the European Union to Bangladesh Plot 7, Road 84, Gulshan 2, Dhaka 1212 Email: Nicole.MALPAS@eeas.europa.eu Tel: 880 2 8824730 Fax: 880 2 8823118		
3.	Ms Nadia Rashid Senior Programme Officer Delegation of the European Union to Bangladesh Plot 7, Road 84, Gulshan 2, Dhaka 1212		
	High Commission of Canada		
4.	Ms Loree Semeluk Second Secretary (Development) High Commission of Canada United Nations Road, Baridhara, Dhaka Email: loree.semeluk@international.gc.ca		
	Government Departments		
5.	Mr Md. Babar Ali Director (Planning & Development) Directorate of Technical Education (DTE) F-4/B, Agargaon Administrative Area Sher-e-Bangla Nagar Dhaka-1207 Cell: 01720947776 Email: babar_dte@yahoo.com		
6.	Mr S. M Shahjahan Deputy Inspector Email: Shahjahan_bteb@yahoo.com Cell: 01712-125765		
7.	Md. Jaynal Abedin		

Sl. No	Names of officials and/or official titles	Signature	Remarks
	Deputy Director (Training) Bureau of Manpower Employment and Training (BMET), 89/2 Kakrail, Dhaka dg@bmet.org.bd		
	Bangladesh Employers Federation		
8.	Mr Joha Training Coordinator Bangladesh Employers Federation (BEF) Chamber Building 122-124 Motijheel C/A, Dhaka Tel: 9565208-10 Fax:9565211-12		
	National Coordination Committee on Workers Education (NCCWE)		
9.	Mr Shahadat Hossain Member NCCWE Email: bils@citech.net Cell: 01711 135407 (O/R) chowdhuryaalam@yahoo.com		
	Industry Skills Councils		
10.	Md. Shafiqul Islam Bhuiyan CEO Industry Skills Council, Agro Food Sector Salim Centre (8 th Floor) 19/2, West Panthapath (Near Square Hospital), Dhaka-1207 Email: ceafsinfo@yahoo.com babbma07@yahoo.com Cell: 01711228747		
11.	Mr Shafquat Haider Chairman & Managing Director CIPROCO Computers Limited Industry Skills Council, IT sector House-120, (1 st floor) Road No-13, Block-E Banani, Dhaka Mob : 01711532597 E-mail : ciproco@bol-online.com		
12.	Md. Mominul Ahsan Executive Director Land Mark Footwear Limited Apex Footwear Ltd. House-6, Road-137, Block SE (D) Gulshan 1, Dhaka 1212 Cell: 01713363055 Email: ahsan@apexfootwearltd.com		
13.	Ms Kazi Roushan Ara (Shumi) Project coordinator Centre of excellence for Leather skill Bangladesh Ltd (COEL) Palli biddut, Shafipur, Kaliakoir, Gazipur Email: kshumi72@gmail.com		

Sl. No	Names of officials and/or official titles	Signature	Remarks
	Cell: 01190-777888		
	Technical and Vocational Training Institutes		
14.	Ms Shaheen Afroz Manager Head of the Dept. of Bakery National Hotel and Tourism Training Institute (NHTTI) 83-84, Mohakhali C/A Ph:9899289 ashraffiti@gmail.com		
15.	Dhaka Polytechnic Institute Mr Suresh Chandra Mondal Coordinator Programme trails & Head of Department Food Technology Dhaka Polytechnic Institute 01817620985 scmandam@live.com		

	Civil Society- Non Government / Private Organizations		
16.	NGO Institute- MAWTS Md. Atiar Rahman Director, MAWTS House No. – 226, Road No. – 12, Block – B, Mirpur – 12, Dhaka – 1216, Bangladesh Mratiar@yahoo.com Mobile no.: 01713384091		
17.	Centre for the Rehabilitation of the Paralyzed (CRP) Mr Ramesh Chandra Halder Vocational Training Coordinator, CRP, Gonok Bari, Savar email: ramesh.halder@yahoo.com		
18.	Ms Arpita Roy Vocational Training Coordinator, CRP, Gonok Bari, Savar		
	Other Development Partners		
19.	Mr Kamal Hossain Additional Project Director Skills Development Project (ADB funded) Shikkha Bhaban (ground floor) Room 115, Block 1 16 Abdul Gani Road, Dhaka 9513812//01712540422 cmahmed@gmail.com		
	ILO Country Office, Bangladesh		
20.	Mr Gagan Rajbhandari Deputy Director gagan@ilo.org 01730338469		

21.	Mr T.I.M Nurunnabi Khan Senior Programme Officer ILO, Dhaka nabi@ilo.org 01713046490		
ILO Project Implementation Team			
22.	Mr Cezar Dragutan Skills Programme Manager ILO, CO-Dhaka dragutan@ilo.org 01713239851		
23.	Mr Arthur Shears Sr. Skills Specialist TVET Reform Project		
24.	Mr Francis De Silva International Expert, Component 3 desilva@ilo.org 01713461259		
25.	Mr Gabriel Bordado International Expert, Component-2 bordado@ilo.org 01713461126		
26.	Mr Haripada Das National Programme Officer, Component-1 haripada@ilo.org 01715985427		
27.	Md. Wazed Ali National Programme Officer wazed@ilo.org 01715168725		
28.	Md. Serajul Islam National Programme Officer, Component-3 serajul@ilo.org 01674618126		
29.	Mr Mohammad Nuruzzaman National Programme Officer, Component-4 nuruzzaman@ilo.org 01711731539		
30.	Mr ANM Tanjel Ahsan National Programme Officer, Component-4 tanjel@ilo.org 01716-591005		
Other Members of ILO, CO-Dhaka			
31.	Mr Haurnur Rashid, Informal Economy Project, ILO, CO-Dhaka		
32.	Mr Alexious Chicham, NPC, IP Project, ILO, CO-Dhaka		

ANNEX 7: LOGICAL FRAMEWORK ANALYSIS – FINAL EVALUATION TEAM COMMENTS

The Indicators were updated 7 February 2012 to take account of the recommendations made by the Mid Term Review. (see bold and underlined)

	Intervention Logic	Objectively Verifiable Indicators	Results	Comments
Overall Programme objective	TVET-R will aim at supporting the pro-poor growth agenda of Bangladesh's Poverty Reduction Strategy Paper by creating more employment opportunities for the poor and strengthening the capacity to tackle the competitive challenges of the country.	Increased employment rate and reduced unemployment rate Increased productivity of manufacturing sector		It is too early to know the impact of TVET-R on employment and unemployment rates. Results will become clearer as programs are replicated across the sectors targeted. However, in just one sector, leather there are more than 8000 persons who have undertaken an apprenticeship programme and are now employed. The Apprenticeship scheme is being expanded to in-plant training, and has been expanded to centres in Chittagong and at one Women's Training Centre. The fact that the apprenticeship program is being expanded suggests industry has a high demand for skilled and semi-skilled workers.
Programme Purpose	A market-oriented and flexible TVET system which responds to the demand for competitive skills of the modern sector as well as to the needs of youth and under-privileged groups.	A national policy framework for demand-driven TVET implemented	National Skills Development Policy 2011 was approved by the NSDC, Chaired by the Prime Minister in September 2011, and approved by Cabinet in January 2012. The Action Plan for the Implementation of National Skills Development Policy 2011 (Phase 1) was approved by the NSDC and is being monitored by the NSDC Secretariat. National Strategy for Gender Inclusion in TVET approved by NSDC Secretariat; PWD inclusion strategy	The foundations for the TVET-Reform Project have been built and tested. This is an enormous achievement.

	Intervention Logic	Objectively Verifiable Indicators	Results	Comments
		<p>A system of modular and competency based training and qualifications introduced through policy and organisational changes</p> <p>All new applications for course accreditation submitted to BTEB meet reformed Quality Assurance standards by the end of TVET-R</p> <p>Share of female learners and disadvantaged groups attending BTEB affiliated courses increased by 15% by the end of TVET-R.</p> <p>Employment rate of NTVQF graduates in their field is at least 85% within 6 months of completion</p> <p>Public-private partnerships in TVET established in at least four priority industry sectors by the end of TVET-R. Needs to line up here</p>	<p>for TVET pending review by the NSDC Secretariat.</p> <p>New system of NTVQF in place and being operated by the BTEB.</p> <p>National Quality Assurance System for TVET developed including quality assured process to apply to become an Registered Training Organization.</p> <p>Share of females and disadvantaged attending BTEB affiliated courses has increased but has remained static at about 25% but raw numbers have more than doubled.</p> <p>200 NTVQF programmes have gone through the formal NTVQF programmes (mostly 1 and 2) on a pilot basis. Employment rate of NTVQF graduates in their field is from 79% to 100% within 6 months of completion, depending on the occupation.</p> <p>Industry Skills Councils have been established in five industry sectors – leather and leather goods; transport equipment; agro-food processing; information technology; and tourism and hospitality. Both the leather and agro-food Councils incorporate a Centre of Excellence.</p>	<p>Female participants in TVET have gone up from 64,980 in 2008 to 155,533 in 2013 but women's percent of TVET has remained more or less static at about 26% of total. Target for women in GoB's strategy paper (May 2012) is 25% women's participation</p>

Component 1:

	Intervention Logic	Objectively Verifiable Indicators	Results	Comments
Results	1: TVET policies, system and legislation reviewed and strengthened at the central and decentralised levels			
	1.1 Improved TVET policy and implementation mechanisms	TVET policy and mechanisms for its implementation are drafted by the end of 2011 with a planned implementation by the end of TVET-R.	<p>National Skills Development Policy 2011 was approved by the NSDC, Chaired by the Prime Minister in September 2011, and approved by Cabinet in January 2012</p> <p>The Action Plan for the Implementation of National Skills Development Policy 2011 (Phase 1) was approved by the NSDC and is being monitored by the NSDC Secretariat.</p>	<p>The development and approval of the National Skills Development Policy (NSDP) 2011 is a significant achievement of TVET-R and is the foundation document on which the reform is being built.</p> <p>A consultative committee (NPC) was established to guide the development of the draft policy. Extensive consultation was undertaken across a broad range of stakeholders including the public and civil society as well as Government ministries and agencies, industry bodies, NGOs, teachers associations, employer and workers organisations and private training providers. Over 200 participants from workshops, held in divisional cities of Bangladesh including Dhaka, provided comment and feedback for the final draft. After BTEB reviewed the draft, further consultation was undertaken by the Ministry of Education and then submitted to the EC NSDC for review. In December 2011 the policy was approved by the NSDC, chaired by the Prime Minister and approved by Cabinet in January 2012.</p>

				<p>The Prime Minister's involvement has added great weight and credibility to the TVET-Reform process.</p> <p>The Action Plan outlines the timeline for activities until December 2015 (coinciding with the no cost extension for TVET-R). The first progress report will be compiled by the Secretariat for the NSDC meeting in March 2015.</p>
	1.2 Improved legal and regulatory environment	<p>An account of national TVET laws and regulations compiled and reviewed by the end of 2009.</p> <p>Proposal on the improvement of TVET laws and regulations developed in 2010.</p> <p>Draft revised TVET laws and/or regulations developed in 2011.</p>	<p>Research study completed: Overview of TVET legislation, policy and regulations</p> <p>Report completed on legislation and regulatory reform proposals</p> <p>Revised TVET Act drafted (still under review in the Ministry)</p>	<p>The revised draft of TVET Act also reviewed the BTEB Act including to accommodate the new and expanded role of the BTEB. The draft was submitted to the Ministry of Education in May 2013 for approval.</p> <p>The lengthy delay in progressing the amendments through Parliament is interpreted by a small, but vocal, number of stakeholders as a lack of strong commitment by the Government to the TVET Reform. The timely passage through Parliament is essential to consolidate the changes.</p>
	1.3 Improved structure and coordination of TVET system	<p>Structure of the TVET system, functions and coordination between agencies involved (DTE, BTEB, BMET) reviewed and report prepared in 2010.</p> <p>Time bound plan for the TVET system structural reform developed and delivered to government in 2010.</p> <p>Mechanisms for stakeholder participation in TVET introduced in 2011</p>	<p>Research report completed: Review of National Structure and Coordination of TVET and Skills Development in Bangladesh.</p> <p>Time bound plan – see above</p> <p>New management structure for skills development comprising NSDC; EC-NSDC and the NSDC Secretariat contained in the draft NSDC Act</p> <p>Mechanism for stakeholder participation – see point above.</p> <p>Also, ISCs were introduced as well as program advisory body at</p>	<p>The research report provided a detailed pathway to improve the structure and coordination of TVET system. This structure has been established and awaits the approval of the draft NSDC Act.</p>

			training institutes.	
	1.4 Improved monitoring of resources and outputs and improved accountability in TVET	Operational handbook for TVET institutions drafted in 2012 Proposal for national TVET data system developed in 2010 National TVET data system in place in 2012 Accountability framework for TVET system proposed in 2012	Operational handbook completed June 2014; now being translated into Bangla Data system proposal completed and system is in place but not fully functional - Staff needed at the NSDC Secretariat and inputs from the ISCs. NSDC, EC-NSDC and Secretariat are in place. NSDC Act drafted.	The NSDC is operational however it would greatly benefit from the finalisation of the NSDC Act, enabling it to fulfil its mandate through resourcing. It would also be seen as an organisation with some 'authority' in the TVET system particularly in monitoring and reporting progress against the Action Plan for Implementation.. Credibility and functionality will be enhanced once the database is fully functional.

Component 2:

	Intervention Logic	Objectively Verifiable Indicators	Results	Comments
Results	2: Relevance and Quality of TVET			
	2.1 Developed National Qualifications Framework	National Technical and Vocational Qualifications Framework (NTVQF), proposed in 2009 and introduced in 2010 Implementation manual available in <u>2012</u>	NTVQF system is part of approved NSDP. System is adopted and in use by the BTEB which is responsible for its operation, and quality assurance. NTVQF MIS is in place at the BTEB to keep track of all new programmes, trainees, trainers, RTOs, assessors, etc. NTVQF implementation manual available with BTEB	The development, approval and introduction of the NTVQF, the competency standards and the Quality Assurance System are a major achievement for TVET-R. Continued support to BTEB would assist the timely approval of standards and training. Some stakeholders have concerns that BTEB is becoming 'a bottleneck' in the TVET system with regard to assessments.
	2.2 Developed or revised competency standards for occupations in selected economic sectors	Competency standards developed for priority occupations in at least four economic sectors in 2010 Manual on development of competency standards and national TVET qualifications available in <u>2012</u>	More than 200 units of competence developed in 12 occupations with close to 50 qualifications Manual on competency standards and qualifications included in national quality assurance system for TVET manuals	
	2.3 Developed courses and curricula based on the competency standards (for selected economic sectors)	Courses and curricula for priority occupations in at least four economic sectors developed and published in 2011 and in use in institutions by the end of TVET-R	100 competency based learning materials produced in 5 sectors Modified existing competency standards according to new BTEB format Programmes are being used in private, NGO and Government training institutions	
	2.4 Enhanced quality-assurance mechanisms in TVET	Quality Assurance mechanisms proposed in 2010 and introduced in 2011	Quality assurance manual (5 parts) developed and implemented. BTEB is the QA body for TVET.	

Component 3:

	Intervention Logic	Objectively Verifiable Indicators	Results	Comments
Results	3: Strengthened TVET institutions through improved knowledge and skills of managers and teachers			
	3.1 Improved capacity of TVET managers	Operational handbook for TVET institutions drafted in <u>2012</u> TVET manager qualification at the certificate or diploma level developed in 2011 and introduced by the end of TVET-R More than <u>50</u> TVET managers complete new manager qualification by the end of TVET-R	Operational Handbook for TVET Institutions Managers, December 2013 completed and currently being translated into Bangla. New training program – Leadership and Management Development – developed. More than 100 TVET institution managers and department heads trained = double the target	The participants from the Leadership and Management Development fellowship programs and study visits (Australia, Malaysia and Philippines) have greater knowledge, skills, ownership, and enthusiasm for the TVET Reform. They play an enabling and leadership role as change champions for reform. A specific outcome of the the LMD is that many of the Principals have developed and implemented Institutional Performance Improvement and Strategic Planning in their own institutions.
	3.2 Improved TVET instructor training	New instructor training system proposed in 2010. New instructor training system tested in 2011. More than <u>100</u> instructors from public and private TVET providers complete new instructor training program and technical updating by the end of TVET-R.	New system established that include two levels of instructor training: Certificate IV in CBT&A and Cert V in CBT&A System has been tested and more than 400 instructors have completed Cert IV training and more than 20 in Cert V training (Master Trainers). Instructors were from NGO, Government, and private sector institutions.	In 3.2 the original indicator of 500 instructors being trained was dropped to 100, however, the results show that over 400 master instructors have qualified.

	3.3 Enhanced capacity of training NGOs and private TVET institutions	More than 10 NGOs and private institutions participate in TVET leadership and management development courses by 2012 Operational handbook for TVET institutions drafted in 2011	More than 20 NGO and private institutions have staff participated in LMD programme including nine institutions under UCEP. Handbook completed (see 3.1)	In 3.3 the number of NGOs and private institutions who participated in LMD program was double the target. This is due to the efforts of the TVET-R team in ensuring NGO and private training Instructors could access the training NDSC/DTE are leading to finalise and pilot the decentralisation and accountability framework under B-SEP.
	3.4 Enhanced management, governance, flexibility, effectiveness, and efficiency of TVET institutions	Model management structures for TVET institutions proposed in <u>2012</u> Greater managerial and academic powers are devolved to TVET institutions in 2011-2012	Concept paper prepared and proposed Government structure including programme advisory committee with some business representatives. Concept taken over by B-SEP for trialling. TVET funding studies completed; proposal given to EC-NSDC for implementation.	

Component 4:

	Intervention Logic	Objectively Verifiable Indicators	Results	Comments
Results	4: Improved skills development resulting in enhanced productivity and competitiveness in key growth and export-oriented industries in the formal industrial sector			
	4.1 Employers' demands for higher skills raised	<p>Mapping of growth industry sectors and demand analysis completed in 2008</p> <p>Increased demand for skills training for workforce by end of 2011</p> <p>Employers recognize skill development of the workforce as a business growth strategy by end of 2011</p> <p>Employers recognize NTVQF qualifications as part of their HRD practices</p> <p>Employers participate in development of competency standards and curriculum starting in 2009-2010</p> <p>Industry-led bodies promoting skills development (e.g. Industry Skills Councils, Center of Excellence) established by 2009 in at least four priority industry sectors with their own initiative, advice and support from TVET reform project</p>	<p>Research study completed by Bangladesh Institute of Development Studies (BIDS, 2008</p> <p>Evidence from sectors such as leather indicate skills development is a key part of their growth strategy. New companies are joining the COEL consortium and offering training in the enterprises. COEL itself is now operating in two new locations, Savar and Chittagong.</p> <p>Employers continue to support the NTVQF but up-scaling of NTVQF offering in terms of delivery is still limited. However new initiatives such as the Centre of Excellence for RMG offer more large scale adoption of the NTVQF.</p> <p>Employers continue to be key participants in the Standards and Curriculum Development Committee process through the BTEB.</p> <p>Five industry skills councils established with two Centres of Excellence set up and a third in the RMG sector about to be started.</p>	<p>In those sectors where TVET_R is being implemented, employers recognize the value of the workers trained under TVET-R. For example, in Chittagong employers seek out those who have trained at the Chittagong TTC and offer better pay.</p>

<p>4.2 Improved linkages between TVET and enterprises</p>	<p>Employers' and workers' representatives participate in committees working on the national TVET policy and system reform by end 2009</p> <p>Industries appoint representatives to lead the development of competency-based vocational qualifications for selected trades by end 2010</p> <p>Industry representatives appointed to governing bodies in at least 8 public TVET institutions by end of 2011</p> <p>At least 10 customized training programs delivered by public TVET institutions at the request of industry by end of project</p> <p>At least 20 industry instructors deliver programs at public TVET institutions by end of project</p>	<p>Employers' and workers' representatives contributed to the development of the National Skills Development Policy both in the capital and in regional consultations.</p> <p>Industry continues to appoint technical representatives to the SCDC working groups under BTEB. These representatives identified key occupations in demand and contributed to competency standards development.</p> <p>Industry provided representatives to programme advisory bodies in eight institutions (Private and Public)</p> <p>6 customised training programs delivered by public training institutions at the request of industry, including occupational safety and health.</p> <p>24 industry instructors deliver programs at public institutions including programs in IT, leather and management.</p>	
<p>4.3 Modern work practices facilitating the utilization of skills and skills-productivity linkages in industry introduced</p>	<p>Enterprises in at least four sectors introduced productivity improvement practices (through leadership and management training, and other tools such as KAIZEN, SCORE, etc) by end of 2010</p>	<p>10 industries in the 5 priority sectors benefited from short-course training on leadership, marketing, team-building, KAIZEN and SCORE. Trainers of SCORE and KAIZEN continue to work within these companies</p>	

	4.4 Learning at work supported	<p>50 master trainers/assessors trained in four priority sectors by end 2011</p> <p>At least eight enterprises in priority sectors adopt structured training plans to support workplace learning by end 2011</p> <p>Share of certified workers in companies surveyed by TVET-R in 2008 increased by at least 20% by end of project</p>	<p>More than 200 master trainers/assessors were trained across five sectors.</p> <p>6 companies are using structured training plans developed around their training as trainers and assessors. For example, Royal Park is an going training/quality improvement program underway.</p> <p>8000 persons have been trained in the leather sector and 200 apprentices in shipbuilding.</p>	Many of the pilot programs would have benefited from further up-scaling.
	4.5 Formal apprenticeship system improved and supported	<p>Legislative framework concerning apprenticeship revised in 2011</p> <p>Set of apprenticeship procedures established and agreed with government by end of 2011</p> <p>Industry body is identified which supports and monitors apprenticeship training by end of 2011</p> <p>Number of formal apprenticeship contracts increased to at least 500 by the end of TVET-R</p>	<p>Apprenticeship Act and procedures were modified to make apprenticeship open to more and smaller size companies.</p> <p>Industry skills committees promote apprenticeship and monitors apprenticeship training in their sector. NSDC Secretariat also has a monitoring function.</p> <p>More than 8000 individuals became apprentices just in the leather sector; more than 200 in the transport sector</p>	

Component 5:

	Intervention Logic	Objectively Verifiable Indicators	Results	Comments
Results	5: Increased access of underprivileged groups to TVET			
	5.1 Community-based training mainstreamed into TVET	More than <u>25</u> TVET institutions are capable to provide community-based training by the end of TVET-R	Staff from more than 28 institutions (private, NGO and Government) trained in CB-TrEE methodology. A fellowship program to Sri Lanka was undertaken to inform participants about CBT.	Community Based Training for Economic rural Empowerment (CB-TrEE) was developed and piloted as part of the TVET-R project. It is now being mainstreamed into TVET and the courses are being approved by the BTEB.
	5.2 Increased access of working children to TVET	Advice and technical support provided to specialist agencies involved in delivering opportunities for working children to acquire a trade during the life of TVET-R	NGOs, Government and private providers developed and understand options for working children including different pathways, e.g. through informal apprenticeship, training by NGOs on non-formal school hours. NGOs such as BRAC are running programs independently. Competency Skills Log Books (CSLBs) developed for the informal sector. 14 informal occupations included CBT to working children About 11,000 child workers were trained in 1 st and 2 nd phase through BEHTRUWC project partners.	
	5.3 Informal apprenticeships improved and supported	Model for improving informal apprenticeships developed Code of practice developed for informal apprenticeships At least twenty informal businesses in at least four sectors include informal apprenticeships through linkage with public training institutions by the end of 2011.	Model for informal apprenticeship has been developed and piloted and proven successful in more than 12 trades. Code of practice is now part of the competency skills logbook (CSLB) which is key tool in the new model More than 700 micro-businesses in 5 sectors hosted 2000 young persons and provided on job training. Public training providers engaged with up-skilling the master craft persons.	

	5.4 A system for recognition of prior learning (RPL) developed	System for recognition of prior learning designed in 2010 RPL system introduced into at least four industry sectors At least 25 persons trained and certified as RPL assessors by the end of TVET-R	RPL system designed and description is included in the Quality Assurance for TVET documentation. RPL available in four targeted sectors and even those outside. More than 24 RPL centres have already been approved by the BTEB. More than 45 industry assessors trained and certified as registered assessors by BTEB. Authorized to do RPL.	Government funding is not targetted to people with low literacy levels and other disadvantaged groups in the public TVET institutions
	5.5 TVET extended to people with low education levels	NTVQF containing two pre-vocational levels available for people with lower educational levels proposed and tested National trade qualifications aiming at people with lower educational levels produced and tested through TREE & Informal Apprenticeship pilots by June 2012	Achieved – The NTVQF has levels Pre-Voc 1 and 2 and hundreds of persons have already benefited from training at this level. 14 informal occupations included in pre-voc qualifications. Pre-vocational programs (Pre-Voc 2) delivered in four areas – sewing machine operation; motor cycle servicing; block batik & screen printing, and Tailoring & Dress Making. Excellent training results and employment.	
	5.6 Enhanced capacity of key agencies (e.g. DTE, BTEB, BMET) to support skills development in the informal economy and for under-privileged groups	A need for extending public training capacity to under-privileged groups and people in the informal economy is recognized in the national TVET policy statement Training workshops conducted for key agencies. At least two pilot programs are jointly implemented with key stakeholders by December 2011	The National Skills Development Policy includes provisions for providing services for under-privileged groups. Fellowships to different regional countries and training on services for persons working in the informal economy completed Several pilots conducted including ones with UCEP, BRAC and BMET. More than 10,000 persons trained by NGOs oriented to work with under-privileged young persons. Joint effort with UNICEF. TSC-Gazipur and CMPI-Chittagong are now conducting CBTA course on Sewing Machine Operation for under-privileged females including people with disabilities.	

	<p>5.7 Access of females to TVET and employability increased</p>	<p>New TVET policy aims to increase participation of females in TVET programs</p> <p>Curriculum documents are gender-sensitive</p> <p>Number of female instructors increased by <u>5</u> % by the end of TVET-R.</p> <p>Staff of public TVET are aware of learning needs of female learners</p> <p>More than <u>10</u> % of public TVET students are female by the end of TVET-R</p>	<p>National skills development policy includes section on increasing participation of women. With project support, new gender inclusion strategy for TVET was approved by the NSDC. Handbook prepared on making TVET institutions more gender considerate.</p> <p>Competency standards, course accreditation documents and CBLMs are gender-sensitive.</p> <p>Percent of female instructors in public TVET institutions now at 11.8%; whereas in TVET institutions its around 17.6%. Number of female instructors is 4178, percentage is 20.18% including Govt. & Non-Govt. institutions.</p> <p>Dissemination workshops are being carried out in order to make staff of public TVET aware of the needs of female learners.</p> <p>Government target of 25% for public female TVET students is achieved.</p>	
	<p>5.8 Access for people with disabilities to TVET and employment improved</p>	<p>New TVET policy aims to increase participation of people with disabilities in TVET programs</p> <p>Curriculum documents are inclusive of the needs of people with disabilities</p> <p>New instructor training program includes modules on “students with special needs” by end of 2011</p>	<p>National skills development policy includes section on disadvantaged persons including people with disabilities.</p> <p>New inclusion strategy for people with disabilities in TVET and action plan approved by consultative group to be placed before the EC-NSDC and the NSDC.</p> <p>All curriculum documents are inclusive and the Cert IV and V programmes have inclusiveness integrated throughout their structure.</p>	

