

Final Internal Project Evaluation

***‘Strengthening Law enforcement Responses and Actions against Internal
Trafficking and Bonded Labour in Sindh & Punjab, Pakistan’***

- **ILO TC/SYMBOL: PAK/10/02/USA**
- **Type of Evaluation: Final**
- **Date of the evaluation: November 27 – December 20, 2013**
- **Name of consultant: Humera Hussain**
- **ILO Administrative Office: ILO Country Office Pakistan**
- **ILO Technical Backstopping Office: ILO Special Action Programme to Combat
Forced Labour (SAP-FL)**
- **Date project ends: December 31, 2013**
- **Donor: The U.S Department of State’s Office to Monitor and Combat Trafficking in
Persons (J/TIP)**
- **Evaluation Manager: Neetu Lamba**

End Project Evaluation Report ILO

Acknowledgement

I am thankful to International Labour Organization (ILO) for providing me the opportunity to evaluate its project 'Strengthening Law Enforcement Responses and Actions against Internal Trafficking and Bonded Labour in Pakistan'. This opportunity not only helped me to expose myself with a wealth of knowledge produced under the project but also enabled me to meet a range of stakeholders from tripartite constituents who are doing a great deal of work to prevent, reduce and eliminate the phenomenon of forced/bonded labour from Punjab and Sindh.

While taking the opportunity I would like to thank the following people:

Ms Neetu Lamba, ILO Evaluation Manager for Pakistan, for her technical support on the evaluation framework, feedback on tools and report.

Mr. Mian Muhammad Benyameen, National Project Coordinator, not only provided his time for project briefings, clarifying queries, sharing project documents, introducing me to the stakeholders and setting up my meetings with the identified participants.

The personnel from the partner tripartite constituents (workers, employers and the government) who kindly gave their time and energies for interviews and facilitated my field visits that provided the insight and perceptions that constitutes the content of the report. I am also thankful to the evaluation process participants from Department of Labour (Sindh and Punjab) for recalling their experiences at the trainings and consultative events and for addressing my questions seriously and graciously.

Similarly, I am thankful to the Brick Kiln Owners who allowed me to access their workers in the working hours. Likewise, I am indebted to the Brick Kiln workers for sparing time for the group discussions and sharing their experiences on micro credit, social security cards, CNIC and NFE Centres. My special thanks go to the teachers and children in the Non- formal Education Centres, who received me enthusiastically with welcome rhymes. Their excitement and learning journey gave me the hope that this initiative has set the foundations that will lead them to the path where they will break the cycle of bonded labour and be the proactive, better skilled and informed citizens of this country.

Humera Hussain

Consultant

End Project Evaluation Report ILO

Table of Contents

Acronyms	III
Executive Summary	IV
Introduction	1
Evaluation Methodology	2
Findings	3
Lessons Learned	19
Recommendations	20
Validation Workshop Findings/Recommendations	21
Annexures	23

End Project Evaluation Report ILO

Acronyms

BISP	Benazir Income Support Program
BKOA	Brick Kiln Owners Association
EBLIK	Elimination of Bonded Labour in Brick Kilns
EOBI	Employees Old age Benefit Institution
DoL	Department of Labour
DVC	District Vigilance Committee
ILO	International Labour Organization
ILS	International Labour Standards
IG	Inspector General
LASU	Legal Aid Service Unit
NADRA	National Database and Registration Authority
NIC	National Identity Card
PESSI	Punjab Employees Social Safety Institution
WWF	Workers Welfare Fund

End Project Evaluation Report ILO

Executive Summary

The ILO project 'Strengthening Law Enforcement Responses and Actions against Internal Trafficking and Bonded Labour in Sindh & Punjab Provinces, Pakistan' was funded by the U.S. Department of State's Office to Monitor and Combat Trafficking in Persons (J/TIP) for the period of three years starting from October 2010 and ended in September 2013, however, the project received no cost extension till December 31, 2013. The project aimed to, "strengthen government and civil society capacity to contribute to the elimination of bonded labour and to address the needs of bonded labourers and their families in Pakistan".

The immediate objectives/outcomes of the project were:

- (1) By the end of the project, the commitment of federal and provincial governments to prevent and reduce bonded labour, will have increased, in particular through revitalization of DVCs
- (2) By the end of the project, the capacity of state functionaries, judiciary, labour inspectors, employers and workers organizations and civil society will have increased to prevent, prosecute and address legal needs of bonded labourers
- (3) By the end of the project, collaborative efforts between government and civil society for the sustainable rehabilitation of freed labourers and family members will have been developed
- (4) By the end of the project, a sound knowledge base will have been developed as a programme management tool for stakeholders to plan, design and carryout interventions targeting bonded labour

ILO directly implemented the project in partnership with: Department of Labour (DoL) Punjab and Sindh, Punjab Literacy and Non-formal Basic Education Department, District Government Nankana Sahib, Punjab and Sindh Judicial Academies, Civil service Academy, Sindh Police, Employers Federation of Pakistan (EFP), Brick Kiln Owners Association of Pakistan (BKOAP), Pakistan Workers Federation (PWF), Human Rights Commission of Pakistan (HRCP) and Association of Network for Community Empowerment (ANCE). Whereas, to carry out specific research studies/ assessments/ awareness products, capturing best practices and to develop training packages individual consultants were contracted.

The project contributed to ILO Pakistan Decent Work Country Programme (DWCP) II (2010-2015) outcome 6 (details are provided in the section 3.1.3 of the report).

End Project Evaluation Report ILO

The project under its planned outputs have delivered a significant amount of work e.g. it supported government of Punjab and Sindh under the 18th Constitutional Amendment to draft its Plans of Action to Combat Bonded Labour. The project also supported the review of Bonded Labour System (Abolition) Act 1992 in addition to the Support for review of Anti Bonded Labour Cell already established in Mirpur Khas for developing Standard Operating Procedures and providing the base either this model is replicable in other parts of the province or not. It supported government of Punjab in developing its project proposal, in consultation with stakeholders, for the expansion of its flagship project ‘Elimination of Bonded Labour in Brick Kilns’ (EBLIK II) to four additional districts of Punjab.

The project worked through the tripartite structure and organized social dialogues for its constituents i.e. government, workers and employers. It provided trainings to a range of government functionaries like staff of Department of Labour (DoL), Police Training Academies, trainees in Judicial Services Academy and the Civil Services Academy. It commissioned studies on: the impact assessment of EBLIK I (implemented in Kasur and Lahore), Impact assessment of Micro Credit on Brick Kiln workers, Study of Existing Financial Model at Brick Kilns, Developed directory of available resources for the rehabilitation of bonded labourers. It also supported District Government Nankana Sahib for implementing a model project on Brick Kilns. The contours of the project include support to BK workers for getting CNIC, registration with PESSI, getting birth registration certificates for new born, providing health screening services in BK clusters, setting up NFE centres for children and linking women to social protection schemes like Benazir Income Support Programme.

The project also developed awareness posters for the workers to get registration with PESSI and a video documentary on the initiative. The project also supported the reactivation of National Coalition against Bonded Labour (NCABL), which would develop projects in future with the district governments for the rehabilitation of the Bonded Labour.

The report in hand is the result of the end project evaluation exercise carried out for the project to assess: whether the project achieved its immediate objectives. Either there are any emerging impacts of the intervention that contribute to ILO Pakistan DWCP II and to what extent the partners would own the strategies started under the intervention. The principal clients for the evaluation are: ILO project management, ILO constituents in Pakistan, ILO technical units and the project donor.

Evaluation methodology included a comprehensive literature review that resulted in a number of themes and issues that formed the structural underpinnings of the exercise.

End Project Evaluation Report ILO

For data collection 17 one on one meeting with the tripartite constituents and 2 focus group discussions with the beneficiaries were conducted in Lahore, Karachi, Kasur and Nankana Sahib (questionnaires are attached in Annex A).

While sharing findings it is important to share that the project started at the time when devolution under the 18th Amendment to the Constitution of Pakistan started and a number of ministries including labour was devolved to the provinces. This shift created a vacuum for collaboration at the federal level, whereas at the provincial level the governments were still in the process of clearing their roles, responsibilities and functions under the new administrative set up. However, this transition also created opportunities for the project and partnerships formed under this project found their place through consultations on the finalization of the project result framework. The findings of the evaluation exercise under the areas of: relevance, validity of design, efficiency, effectiveness and impact & sustainability are provided in detail in section 3 of the report.

Following are the lessons learned from the intervention:

1. ILO has all the technical and financial capacity to support provincial governments to bridge technical gaps either in drafting policy plans or to review laws for adoption. Government fully acknowledge this support and look at ILO as a strategic partner.
2. Transformation and devolution brings opportunities and they are well tapped under this project to push the agenda of decent work forward.
3. Tripartism is an effective approach to make constituents' social partners for policy dialogue and formulation through cooperation, consultation and negotiation.
4. Strengthening law enforcement responses and actions against any social issue is a long-term agenda and it shall be looked in to that perspective. For instance at times it takes a decade to get any policy/law approved, in this perspective long term projects shall be started.
5. To keep the project activities smooth and for better implementation minimum two people shall be hired at the country office level for project management/support.
6. One off training events in the government institutions cannot institutionalise the trainings.
7. Continuous coordination and follow up on government decisions is required to implement and institutionalise the initiatives e.g. establishment of anti bonded

End Project Evaluation Report ILO

labour cells in three districts of Sindh could not happen despite the notifications from the competent authorities.

8. Awareness raising for behavioural change is a long process and it shall be looked at the individual, community and at the over all environment level. To implement this aspect more products shall be developed.

Following recommendations are drawn on the basis of the evaluation:

1. Capacity building of reactivated DVCs in Punjab is very important and shall be integrated into future initiatives, whereas, in Sindh its reactivation shall be advocated.
2. Advocacy to implement minimum wage for the Brick Kiln workers shall be done. However, the issue of urban and rural locations of Brick Kilns and the brick rates should be taken as a baseline for determining minimum wage.
3. More tripartite social dialogues shall be organized in future to minimize the apprehensions of the constituents like BKOA on laws and social security.
4. Training shall be institutionalised in the government facilities like police training academy, judicial services academy and civil services academy.
5. Labour Administration Institute like NILAT shall be taken on board while developing policies and plans and they shall be strengthened to take up their training role with the capacity building of their staff and provision of equipment like multi media, sound system etc.
6. Support shall be provided to NGOs to start BL rehabilitation projects in partnership with the district governments.
7. More upstream work shall be done with the provincial governments to adopt provincial plan of action and laws like Bonded Labour System (Abolition) Act 1992.
8. The issue of internal trafficking shall be looked in to at two levels: a) at existing legal framework (does it properly address the issue, if not proper legislation shall be done) and b) relevant departments like Police, FIA and higher ups at the Ministry of Interior shall be taken on board from the very beginning.
9. For effective implementation of the projects ample human resource shall be hired at the ILO country office level.
10. Internal review and stakeholder consultation on the projects coming to end shall be done at least 6 months before the end date, so as the extension (if required) or the next phase can be planned well on time.

End Project Evaluation Report ILO

-
11. Minimum wage of the project staff (for example NFE Centre teachers) shall be ensured.

To validate the evaluation findings and recommendations a workshop of the tripartite constituents was organized in Lahore and following are additions in the recommendations:

1. BKOAP: Their association shall be taken on board at the DVCs and the government shall determine the minimum wage with their consultation.
2. Dr. Ghulam Haider: In future interventions ILO shall look in to bonded labour in agriculture sector in Sindh, according to him the landlords keep women of the bonded labourers as sex slaves and this issue shall be investigated and addressed.
3. NCABL: ILO has created a model in Nakana Sahib and it can be replicated in other districts and provinces.
4. Director Labour Sindh: In Sindh a focused initiative shall be started by ILO to support the provincial government to kick-start the registration process of the Brick Kiln and agriculture workers with the social security institutions.
5. Riaz Ahmed Lawyer: In the future interventions to address the issue of internal trafficking a study shall be commissioned to see the types of trafficking and the ways to address it.
6. Ishaq Haider (DoL Nankana Sahib): In Nankana Sahib, District Police Officer is at DVC and the phenomenon of internal trafficking is very much at their agenda. This model can be replicated in reactivated DVCs.
7. Director General Labour Punjab: He recommended that *in future an anthropological study should be commissioned to investigate the causes for prevalence of 'Pashgi' in 'Patheras'*. He further recommended that *in future a component on Occupational Safety Hazards (OSH - awareness and practice) should be embedded for the BK workers*. He further asked for the *development of a model Brick Kiln* where the labour standards and OSH are practiced and this model shall be promoted for replication.

End Project Evaluation Report ILO

1.0 Introduction

This report identifies the findings of the Final Evaluation (FE) conducted for the *International Labour Organization (ILO) in Pakistan for 'Strengthening Law Enforcement Responses and Actions against Internal Trafficking and Bonded Labour in Sindh and Punjab Provinces of Pakistan'* implemented between October 2010 and December 2013.

The report identifies the themes, issues and questions on which the FE was conceived, resulting in the questionnaires included in Annex A. These were based on the literature review and on meetings with the ILO Project Coordinator and Evaluation Manager in Islamabad. It also contains a list of recommendations made (i) by participants and (ii) by the evaluator based on the evaluation findings.

The primary purpose of the FE was to assess the relevance, validity, effectiveness, efficiency and impact and sustainability of the project inputs against the actual results. Additionally, the FE was intended to ascertain how well knitted the initiative was with ILO Pakistan Decent Work Country Programme II (2010 -2015) outcomes and Joint UN Programme Component outcome. The FE also examined the type of strategic partners identified for taking the course of the initiative 'on' to meet the project's discrete objectives and how and to what degree their combined efforts have contributed to the project's accomplishment of its development objective. That development objective, as expressed in the project Result Framework, was "to strengthen government and civil society capacity to contribute to the elimination of bonded labour and to address the needs of bonded labourers and their families in Pakistan".

The immediate objectives/outcomes of the project were:

- (5) By the end of the project, the commitment of federal and provincial governments to prevent and reduce bonded labour, will have increased, in particular through revitalization of DVCs
- (6) By the end of the project, the capacity of state functionaries, judiciary, labour inspectors, employers and workers organizations and civil society will have increased to prevent, prosecute and address legal needs of bonded labourers
- (7) By the end of the project, collaborative efforts between government and civil society for the sustainable rehabilitation of freed labourers and family members will have been developed

End Project Evaluation Report ILO

- (8) By the end of the project, a sound knowledge base will have been developed as a programme management tool for stakeholders to plan, design and carryout interventions targeting bonded labour

The project was implemented with the financial assistance of The U.S Department of State's Office to Monitor and Combat Trafficking in Persons (J/TIP). Hereafter in the body of the report this project is referred as 'J/TIP'.

Whereas, the project management arrangement involved the overall supervision of the Director of ILO office in Islamabad and SAP-FL as the technical backstopping unit at Headquarters level and for the day-to-day management a National Project Coordinator (NPC) was hired. The NPC supported all local partners, whereas, a Technical Backstopping Officer (from the Area Office) was also designated to the project.

Project activities were either directly carried out by ILO, or implemented in partnership with Department of Labour (DoL) Punjab and Sindh, Punjab Literacy and Non-formal Basic Education Department, District Government Nankana Sahib, Employers Federation of Pakistan (EFP), Brick Kiln Owners Association of Pakistan (BKOAP), Pakistan Workers Federation (PWF) and Association of Network for Community Empowerment (ANCE). Whereas, to carry out specific research studies/ assessments/ awareness products, capturing best practices and to develop training packages individual consultants were contracted.

Hence the project focused on strengthening law enforcement responses against internal trafficking and bonded labour, so the beneficiaries include the bonded labourers, their families across Sindh and Punjab, law enforcement agencies, provincial Department of Labour, workers & employers organizations. It is important to mention here that in Punjab the phenomenon of Bonded Labour is found more in practice at the Brick Kilns and in Sindh in the Agriculture sector.

2.0 Evaluation Methodology

The planned methodology as described earlier in detail in the Inception report included a comprehensive literature review resulted in a number of themes and issues that form the structural underpinnings of the evaluation. These are expressed in the interview questionnaires (Annex A). The evaluator also watched the video documentary 'ILO intervention in Brick Kiln sector' and analysed the posters and training reports,

End Project Evaluation Report ILO

produced under the project. Both subjective and objective sources of information were consulted to draw the complete analysis.

2.1 Evaluation Methods and Data

The evaluator held a total of 17 individual meetings with the personnel belonging to the selected tripartite constituents (which include 9 meetings with the government officials from the Department of Labour Punjab and Sindh, officials from Department of Non-formal and Basic Education Punjab, Punjab Employees Social Security Institute, National Institute of Labour Administration Training and Police Department Sindh. Four meetings with the NGO representatives from: PILER, HRCP, SPARC and ANCE. Three meetings with the representatives of: Employers Association of Pakistan, Pakistan Workers Federation and Brick Kiln Owners Association of Pakistan). A meeting of District Vigilance Committee (DVC) was attended in District Coordination Officer (DCO), Office in Nankana Sahib. Two group meetings were conducted with the beneficiary workers of the Government of Punjab's initiative 'Elimination of Bonded Labour in Brick Kilns' (EBLIK I) at Brick Kilns in District Kasur. List of the people with names and organizations' is provided in Annex B.

Five Non-formal Basic Education Centres were visited in Nankana Sahib and Kasur and discussions with the teachers and children were carried out. Two Focus Group Discussions were carried out with the beneficiaries of EBLIK in Kasur to extract information on impact of interventions like micro credit, CNIC, veterinary services and NFE.

2.2 Limitations of the Evaluation

Though I carried out intensive meetings/interviews with a range of stakeholders in Sindh and Punjab and they provided me with a wealth of information on various components of J/TIP, yet, due to time constraint I could not visit the anti bonded labour cell in Mirpur Khas to seek subjective information of its functions (prevailing practices and challenges) through interviewing its staff. However, the management of SPARC (an NGO) that took initiative of establishing this pilot was interviewed in Karachi.

3.0 Findings

3.1 Relevance

Following are the findings under this analytical thread:

End Project Evaluation Report ILO

3.1.1 Relevance of Project Objectives/outcomes with the country needs

Project Development Objective “to strengthen government and civil society capacity to contribute to the elimination of bonded labour and to address the needs of bonded labourers and their families in Pakistan” is found fully relevant to the needs of the country especially in the wake of 18th Constitutional amendment, which devolved all responsibilities related to labour to the provinces, which got the liberty to legislate for preventing, reducing and eliminating all forms of bonded labour and to develop their own plans of action to combat the issue.

Whereas, the immediate objectives of the project were found comprehensive, since it encompassed all the relevant tripartite constituents in its universe. They not only looked in to the capacity building side of the state functionaries but also involved the initiatives to stimulate public private partnership to develop programmes for the sustainable rehabilitation of the freed BL workers and their families. The project objectives also focused on the development of technical resources that will stay with the partners to implement their programmes with full technical and evidence based references for example resource directory, training manuals and the research/assessment studies.

3.1.2 Recipient stakeholder ownership of the project

The evaluation data shows that the phenomenon of ownership varies among different stakeholders since it is a subjective field and the various project initiatives bring different results for different actors.

1. Provincial government of Punjab fully owns the support provided to its departments and they are now implementing their own project ‘Elimination of Bonded Labour in Brick Kilns’ (EBLIK), which was first implemented in two districts i.e. Lahore and Kasur and now extended to four additional districts of the province for the period of six years with the budgetary allocation of 196.987 million Pak rupees. Department of Labour is fully involved in its implementation along with the Department of Literacy & Non-formal Basic Education, Punjab Employees Social Security Institution (PESSI), Punjab Rural Support Programme and NADRA. The important point to mention here is that the government of Punjab requested ILO to support it in developing PC1 (government project proposal document) of this project. ILO acceded to this request and the proposal was developed.

End Project Evaluation Report ILO

The government also applauds ILO support for drafting Provincial Plan of Action to Combat Bonded Labour.

2. District Government Nankana Sahib a pilot project was implemented with the District Department of Labour Nankana Sahib. The partnership was agreed on the request of the District Labour Officer, who during ILO project trainings asked to implement a pilot on the brick kilns to address the issue of BL. The project was implemented to show case the model of public private partnership for other stakeholders and it involved: establishment of Non-formal Education Centres, Support in getting CNIC for the Brick Kiln (BK) workers, registration of BK workers with PESSI for social security cards, supporting new born for birth registration, providing health screening services to the BK workers and their families, linking women BK workers with the government social protection programme (Benazir Income Support Programme), implementing healthy and happy child schemes. Analysis of the set of the above-mentioned performed activities shows that the project involved work streams both at the upstream and the down stream level. The upstream level work was looked after by the District DoL, whereas, the down stream level was implemented through a local partner NGO, Association for Network of Community Empowerment (ANCE). Both the partners fully own their work.
3. Brick Kiln Owners Association of Pakistan The office bearers though claim to extend their full cooperation to ILO for registering their BK with the Department of Labour and registering their workers with PESSI for social security cards. They also attribute great respect to ILO for providing them opportunities of social dialogue with various government departments like PESSI, Department of Literacy & Non-formal Education and Department of Labour however, they have apprehensions on several points (details are provided in the later parts of the report) and at times feel disillusioned with this partnership.
4. Sindh Department of Labour owns this partnership with ILO and acknowledges its support for training provided to its inspection staff on various aspects of identifying and inspecting BL. Drafting Provincial Plan of Action to Combat Bonded Labour, review of Sindh Tenancy Act 1950 and review of Bonded Labour System (Abolition) Act 1992.
5. Sindh Police Department the department appreciates the work done in partnership with ILO to deal with the issue of BL in the province. A committee on “ Anti Bonded Labour Coordination” was formed having membership from Police Department,

End Project Evaluation Report ILO

Department of Labour and ILO. Notification on the establishment of 'Anti Bonded Labour Cells' in Umerkot, Sanghar and Mirpur Khas was issued. Review of initially established 'Anti Bonded Labour Cell' in Mirpur Khas was carried out along with development of Standard Operating Procedures. However, the actions have now slowed down due to other engagements of the Police Department, which is also of the view that the lead shall be given to the Department of Labour and the Police Department will come in the support role.

6. Pakistan Workers Federation they fully own their work done in collaboration with ILO i.e. survey of BK along with developing database of its workers in the districts of Lahore, Sheikhpura and Kasur. Facilitation in acquiring CNIC, birth registration, social dialogues with the BK owners and workers. They also developed awareness material on various aspects of workers rights like various schemes of social security and trade union education.

3.1.3 Programme alignment and Contribution to DWCP-II and One UN Programme

The project responds to Decent Work Country Programme (DWCP –II) Outcome 6, which says “Constituents’ actively promoting and supporting the elimination of forced/bonded labour”.

Following are its outcome indicators:

1. *Number of provincial authorities actively resourcing forced/bonded labour elimination programmes.*
2. *Number of promotional activities conducted by tripartite constituent representative organizations to eliminate forced/bonded labour.*

Target: *At least two provincial authorities, with ILO support, and with the active participation of the employers’ and workers’ organisations, have an increased number of programmes that address the elimination of forced/bonded labour.*

Outcome Strategies:

12. *Provide gender responsive technical assistance to provincial governments and tripartite constituents to develop result based programmes on elimination of forced/bonded labour, building on existing interventions and best practice in Pakistan and globally.*
13. *Support to build capacity and increase collaboration among tripartite constituents and key stakeholders to address forced/bonded labour.*

End Project Evaluation Report ILO

Analysis: The target is fairly achieved in Punjab where a number of provincial authorities have started their initiatives to eliminate BL at Brick Kilns for instance; Departments of Labour has started EBLIK II with technical support from ILO. Department of Literacy and Non-formal Basic Education has taken over ILO established four NFE Centres in Nankana Sahib and is in the process of establishing NFE centres at all BK in the province. PESSI though already had started registering workers at BK for social security cards as a result of the upstream work of the project in the province; however, the process was expedited by the orders of the Honourable Supreme Court of Pakistan in a Criminal Petition No. 213 of 2013, dated 17.07.2013, in which the Court directed the Government of Punjab to activate the District Vigilance Committees (DVCs) as early possible and to register all the labourers working at BK as a recipient of social security and owners be bound to pay their contribution to the Social Security Department.

However, in Sindh the work was started with the Department of Police and DoL, draft Provincial Plan of Action to Combat Bonded Labour was developed. Standard Operating Procedures for the Anti Bonded Labour Cell were developed but a push is required to implement the initiatives and for the initiation of the elimination programmes similar to the ones started by the government of Punjab.

At the outcome strategies level, provision of technical support of ILO is found in the development of initiatives like EBLIK to integrate gender into the activities like linking women workers to social protection programme, enrolling girl child in NFE Centres, ensuring birth registration for both boys and girls, health screening of all BL workers families. Similarly, for increased tripartite constituents interaction and collaboration a number of social dialogues and consultations were carried out, however, it is just a start (still provinces are trying to find their feet after devolution that came through 18th Constitutional Amendment) and it needs concerted efforts in the upcoming ILO interventions, however, it is pertinent to mention that the initiative under review has set all the right legislative and technical foundations for the constituents to build on that for eliminating BL.

The project also contributed to Pakistan Country Programme Outcomes:

PAK 801: Increased capacities of employers' organisations to influence economic, social and governance policies.

PAK 802: Increased capacities of workers' organisations to influence economic, social and governance policies.

End Project Evaluation Report ILO

PAK 826: Strengthened capacity of member States to ratify and apply ILS and to fulfil their reporting obligations

Analysis shows that this project has stimulated the process of enhancing capacities of the employers and workers organizations to influence economic, social and governance policies. For instance it has brought all the constituents in the broad based consultations organized for the development of Provincial Plan of Action to Combat Bonded Labour (draft) in Sindh and Punjab respectively. Similarly, icebreaking has started through social dialogues between the BKOAP and PESSI. BKOAP and Department of Literacy & Non-formal Education, BKOAP and DoL, Workers and Employers. Similarly, ILS and BL are discussed in the trainings of the DoL Inspection staff however, these are the induced elements and to bring them to the level of institutionalization they need focussed efforts at a much wider scale.

Under ‘One UN’ the project contributes to Joint Programme Component (JPC) 3: Empowerment, Mobilization, and Protection of Poor & Vulnerable Groups.

JP Outcome 3.2: Enhanced access to social services and social protection/safety nets.

Analysis shows that in Punjab work is done under the project to facilitate workers in getting PESSI social security cards and women workers are linked with the social protection services. Similarly, the support is provided in getting CNIC and birth registration. Survey of BK in selected districts is done to collect data of workers that will be a good resource for ILO to collaborate with the government to cover the workers under its initiatives in future. Similarly, the awareness posters created for the workers to get registered with PESSI are a good information resource not only for the workers but also for the relevant government machinery.

The J/TIP project also compliments its activities with One UN funded Project titled ‘Empowerment of Vulnerable Groups through Education, Employment and Training’. This project also does social security awareness for both workers and employers in Gujranwala, Sialkot and Lahore along with working for establishment of NFE Centres at BK.

3.2 Validity of Design

3.2.1 Starting Point of the Programme at the beginning of the inception phase and inclusion of gender

The project started in October 2010, when Pakistan was facing the worst floods ever recorded in its history. The scale of devastation was unprecedented as it affected lives

End Project Evaluation Report ILO

of over 18 million people, washing away communities and livelihoods and forced millions to flee from their homes. The people most severely affected were small farmers and unskilled labourers and according to an estimate almost 60% of them lost direct access to their livelihoods¹.

Whereas, at the political front one of the most significant shifts was underway and that was the devolution process under the 18th Amendment to the Constitution of Pakistan, it vested more powers to the provinces. Under this amendment certain ministries including labour were devolved from the centre to the provinces and it led the project to realign it self with the new administrative set up, which itself was in the state of confusion in terms of looking in to overall structural adjustments, re-positioning of roles and responsibilities at three tiers: the federal, the provincial and at the district level. The fluid situation somewhat impacted the momentum of the work in a number of ways. For instance, new focal points had to be identified for administrative contact/ arrangements at the provincial level. The key challenge was the capacity issue at the provincial level where responsibilities had been transferred without the requisite transfer of knowledge and skills. However, this scenario brought opportunities for the project. A number of consultations were organized with the government machinery (in Punjab and Sindh) and the other tripartite constituent stakeholders in the wake of devolution to identify, realign and finalize the planned activities with the new political context. These consultations stimulated the process of implementation on the activities planned and dovetailed under the project result framework.

Analysis The inception phase witnessed the transition of power in the Ministry of Labour & Manpower from the Centre to the provinces and absorbed the transition with the proactive approach. For instance it tapped the opportunities with the new set up and actively aligned itself with the emerging needs of the departments in provinces. For example there was need to develop provincial plans of action to combat issues of bonded labour, review of federal law on the abolishment of the bonded labour so it can be adopted in the provinces. Trainings of government functionaries from judiciary, police and labour department was required for more proactive actions against the issue of bonded labour. Broad based consultations were required between the tripartite players, so as common understanding can be developed on labour legislation, rights of right holders and responsibilities of the duty bearers. In the context, J/TIP kick started the process that later on culminated in drafting the Plans of Actions to Combat Bonded Labour for Sindh and Punjab and in the review of Bonded Labour System (abolition) Act 1992. Started organizing social dialogues between workers, Brick Kiln Owners Association, Punjab Employees Social Security Institution and Non-formal Education

¹ GoP-UNHCR, Profile of the IDPs from the Floods of 2010 in Pakistan

End Project Evaluation Report ILO

Department on various challenges that each of them were facing to move on towards reducing the issue of BL. Similarly, the support stimulated the issuance of several notifications by the competent authorities, for instance, coordination committee was formed in Sindh to look in to the issue of bonded labour, a notification was issued for the establishment of 3 Anti Bonded Labour Cells in the districts of Umerkot, Sanghar and Mirpur Khas. In Punjab, ILO supported impact assessment of the first phase of the government's flagship initiative EBLIK. All the above-mentioned initiatives that either started/planned in the inception phase set the pace for the rest of the project duration.

Similarly, the project also has embedded gender in its interventions because the support it provided later in the formulation of policies equally addressed the needs of men and women. Furthermore, the initiatives like health screening and NFE Centres that were implemented later involved both boys and girls.

3.2.2 were the planned objectives and outcomes relevant, whether they were adapted?

Yes, they were relevant to the needs of the target group i.e. bonded labourers and their families. The activities under each objective were realigned/adapted under the new administrative set up of the provinces after the 18th Constitutional amendment. The broad based consultations with tripartite constituents were organized in March 2011 in Lahore and Karachi to finalize the project result framework.

The consultations had broad based participation e.g. it had representatives from Department of Labour, Department of Literacy & Non-formal Education, employers and workers organizations', Department of Social welfare, Department of Police, NGOs, academia and media.

3.2.3 Is the intervention logic coherent and realistic?

Yes, it is coherent and realistic. For instance, it took complete stock of political transition; prevailing capacity factors and identified appropriate agents of change and change processes. The result chain also offered required knowledge and tools that led the initiative to attain the development objective.

3.2.3.1 Causal link between outputs to the intended outcomes

Yes, there is a clear causal link between the outputs to the intended outcomes; since the outputs clearly indicated the supply-side deliverables e.g. Plans of Actions, knowledge resources like directory of sources of funds available for BL, draft model contract, training manuals etc. Whereas, the intended outcomes clearly described the

End Project Evaluation Report ILO

behaviour change among users of outputs for example the DoL staff trained under the project is equipped with the tools and techniques to do inspection at brick kilns.

Overall the theory of cause and effect used for the development of this result logic presents a clear sequencing at all levels to achieve its objectives.

3.2.3.2 Who are the partners of the programme and how strategic they are?

ILO works through a tripartite structure i.e. government, worker and employer. The J/TIP also worked through the same structure and kept the philosophy of promoting rights at work, enhancing social protection and strengthening dialogue intact in its activities.

In this project the key partners were: Department of Labour (DOL) Sindh and Punjab, Police Department Sindh, Pakistan Brick Kiln Association, Pakistan Workers Federation, Employees Federation of Pakistan, Association of Network for Community Empowerment (ANCE), District Government Nankana Sahib, Punjab Literacy and Non-formal Basic Education Department, Human Rights Commission of Pakistan.

All the partners other than ANCE (which implemented the model project at BK in Nankana Sahib) were strategic in terms of their mandate. For instance government of Punjab and Sindh are instrumental for regulation, control and implementation of laws. Workers and employers associations are the entities that safe guard their rights and create awareness among their members on various opportunities and laws, which positively and negatively affect their businesses and livelihood. Human Rights commission of Pakistan (an NGO) is an important stakeholder since it analyses the state of human rights in Pakistan and does advocacy for elimination of various discriminations. It has worked to highlight the plight of bonded labourers in Sindh in early 2000s and is known for its watchdog role. Here in J/TIP it was involved to reactivate the National Coalition against Bonded Labour, which was an effective NGO network in the past on the issue of BL and it can join hands in future with the government for effective Public Private initiatives to prevent, reduce and eliminate BL.

3.2.3.3 On which risks and assumptions does the project logic build?

The assumptions that underpinned the project activities were well identified in the project document, for instance it encompassed the continuous commitment of the government departments, active participation and cooperation of BKOA, stable security situation, economic stability, coordination mechanism joined by all partners without

End Project Evaluation Report ILO

reservations etc. However, it is important to write here that on the basis of assumptions no risk mitigation strategy is found in writing in the documents.

Whereas, if we look in to the point of how realistic were the assumptions and how far the programme could have controlled them, it can be shared that J/TIP came in continuation to the other ILO projects e.g. Promoting the Elimination of Bonded Labour in Pakistan. Furthermore, the on going One UN project, 'Empowerment, Mobilization, and Protection of Poor & Vulnerable Groups' is also working with the same stakeholders. So, it is analysed that the partners with whom the project is implemented are the partners with ILO since decades. However, despite the long-term relationship of the partners that has now created the position of influence, it is plausible that risk mitigation strategy shall be devised in future projects.

3.2.3.4 How useful are the evolving indicators in the result framework? Can they be tracked?

The indicators in the result framework were useful and indicated change in an easily traceable manner, however, most of them was qualitative, so it would be difficult to quantify the exact change e.g. output 3.2 in the result framework says "Rehabilitation Programme developed and promoted" and the indicator says "MoU signed among NACBL and target District Government for collaboration", it is completely qualitative without mentioning the number that how many district governments will sign this MoU and how many programmes will be developed.

This bottleneck was also identified in the Mid Term Review Report of the project, however, no change is found incorporated in the result framework as a result of that review.

3.3 Effectiveness

3.3.1 Technical support and capacity building undertaken at provincial and district level

Technical support and capacity building undertaken at the provincial and district level included trainings of the DoL staff nationally and internationally (4 DoL staff members were sent to ILO International Training Centre, Turin) on Labour inspection, bonded labour and inspection, tools, techniques and formats, ILs and bonded labour etc. Whereas, in terms of technical support consultants were provided to conduct various researches, impact assessments and review of various interventions like Anti Bonded Labour Cell in Sindh and EBLIK assessment in Punjab.

End Project Evaluation Report ILO

Consultants were hired for development of training resources, which were rolled out in the government training institutions like Judicial Academy, Police Training Institutes and NILAT.

Similarly, drafts of Provincial Plans of Action to Combat Bonded Labour were developed for Sindh and Punjab. Bonded Labour System (abolition) Act 1992 was reviewed.

3.3.2 what kind of tools have been developed to achieve the project targets?

- Knowledge products in the form of trainings resources, resource directory and awareness material.
- Exploratory researches to study various fields like existing financial model at BK, impact study of micro credit on the BK workers etc.
- Legislative frameworks like plan of action and drafts of reviewed laws i.e.
- Lobbying through reactivation of NCABL
- Advocacy and awareness

3.3.3 to what extent the project is reaching the target group in particular women, youth, and local communities

The project universe fully encompasses all the above identified groups under its interventions e.g. the provincial plans would address the needs of all bonded workers and their families in term of protection and minimum wage etc. Social security covers the health needs of all the registered workers. NFE centres established at BK enrolled both boys and girls. Health screening initiative in Nankana Sahib under the model project covered all men, women, children and youth living at the brick kilns. CNIC intervention also supported both men and women. Women workers and other females of the BL worker families were linked to the social protection scheme of Benazir Income Support Programme.

3.3.4 what are the signs of emerging impact of the implemented activities?

- BK workers have CNIC, PESSI registration cards, access to income support scheme, birth registration for children. Workers Welfare Board approved marriage grant of PKR 100,000/- for one of the project beneficiaries in Nankana Sahib. The beneficiary got his social security card in January 2013.

“Now we the tripartite constituents sit together and listen to each other patiently. This is the impact of ILO work with us.”

*Syed Hasnat Javed, Director
Labour Welfare Punjab*

End Project Evaluation Report ILO

- DoL staff is trained in bonded labour inspection techniques
- Draft plan of actions are developed that will lead the provincial governments to embed initiatives in their interventions to reduce and eliminate BL
- Tripartite constituents hold dialogues on various labour issues
- Children of BK worker families are enrolled in NFE Centres and getting education
- NCABL is reactivated to take up the role to push provincial governments to take stock of the BL issues

3.3.5 what outputs have not been implemented and the implementation progress?

Outputs not implemented	Progress update
Output 1.3 DVCs reactivated to respond on BL	Reactivation of DVCs are in process in Punjab and the provincial government in compliance to the order of the Supreme Court of Pakistan has formed a high level committee to monitor the performance of DVCs. However, the process is slow in Sindh.
Output 1.4 Anti Bonded Labour Cells established in Sindh	Though the existing Anti Bonded Labour Cell was reviewed in Mirpur Khas and SoPs were developed however, no model could be developed to replicate.
Output 1.6 Proposal to initiate Sindh Bonded Labour project developed	Though regular interaction was kept with the government of Sindh, however, no proposal could be developed
Output 1.7 Proposals to access NBLF developed	Though 80 CSOs and Govt. representatives are trained on the techniques to access funds however, the funds are frozen due to devolution and proposals cannot be developed till the time the funds are transferred to the provinces.
Output 2.2 Use of model contract promoted through social dialogue	The implementation of the model contract is primarily hindered by a controversial provision on Pashgi (advance payment) as it is completely banned by law but still being commonly practiced in the brick kiln sector. This issue is

End Project Evaluation Report ILO

	<p>address in proposed revision of Bonded Labour System (Abolition), Act, 1992; once approved, this issue will be settled and implemented</p> <p>Meanwhile, Government of Punjab constituted a high level committee for effective implementation of bonded labour law in the province.</p>
Output 3.2 Rehabilitation programme developed and promoted	Though NCABL has been reactivated and they have developed a framework for eradication of BL, however, no intervention has started in partnership with the government yet.

3.3.6 To what extent have international and national consultants contributed to the technical support of the project?

No international consultant was hired under the project, however, the contributions of the local consultants were found useful and their products were a great technical resource. For instance, the PC1 of EBLIK II, training manuals for the government training institutes like judicial services academy and police training institutes. Training manual for DoL inspection staff. Impact assessment study of EBLIK 1, review of Anti Bonded Labour Cell Report and development of SoPs, awareness posters on social security cards for the BK workers are an excellent resource.

Furthermore, the drafts of Provincial Plans of Action to Combat BL were another contribution of the consultants in the project. Similarly, a number of studies are underway e.g. impact assessment of micro credit on the EBLIK project beneficiaries and the study of the existing financial model of the BK.

All the above-mentioned initiatives helped J/TIP to accomplish its planned outputs and move closer to the attainment of its development objective.

3.3.7 Has the project used/created harmonized management principles with in other development partners?

The involvement of tripartite constituents likes DoL, worker and employer federations in the J/TIP are attributed to the harmonization of management principles e.g. the involvement and engagement of all these actors for preventing, reducing and eliminating the issue of BL indicates the efforts that ultimately move towards the attainment of social justice and creating decent work environment.

End Project Evaluation Report ILO

3.3.8 Should there be any change in focus, approach, partnership or implementation strategy?

Yes, there should be some planned output on addressing the issue of internal trafficking. Some focus should have been kept to bring departments like police and FIA on board during the development of action plans or other social dialogues, so as the process for integrating and addressing the issue of internal trafficking with BL should have been started formally with the input of the relevant departments in the policy documents.

In addition, some work shall be done at the legal framework to tackle the issue specifically, for instance in the current situation the issue is dealt under different laws e.g. Habeas Corpus under section 491 of Cr.P.C.

3.4 Efficiency

3.4.1 What is the project efficiency in terms of management and capacity building?

J/TIP was managed with efficiency for instance in the domain of capacity building it created training resources, which are available for the training institutes and the instructional staff is trained to roll out the trainings. It was one off investment and it would bring greater results. Similarly, four government officials are trained at ILO International Training Centre, Turin and they are a resource for the government to replicate these trainings here.

In terms of management, most of the resources were developed through the individual consultants who were hired for short duration. This act saved the financial resources of the project, which could have been exhausted with the full time hiring. Similarly, for the project day-to-day management, only one person (National Project Coordinator) was hired and this act also allowed the utilization of resources more on the programmatic side. However, this point is dicey because it over burdened the NPC.

3.4.2 How efficient has been the project in terms of project information, communication, cooperation, coordination and financial arrangements?

The project is found fairly efficient in terms of project information for instance at the upstream level it is known to the government officials at the highest provincial level like to Secretary Department of Labour and Human Resource Punjab, IG Police Sindh,

End Project Evaluation Report ILO

Secretary Department of Literacy & Non-formal Education Punjab, Commissioner PESSI, Director Labour Sindh, President BKOAP, President PWF, top management of EFP, however, at the down stream level it is not known among the workers. Hence, it can be rated at a fairly efficient level because in the course of three years it has done a great deal of work with the top brass (which was trying to clarify its roles, responsibilities and functions in the wake of 18th amendment) it's an achievement.

Project communication with the stakeholders is found strong and well recorded for institutional history.

Cooperation with stakeholders like government is found strong since ILO extended its full support to the government to fill its technical capacity gaps like it supported the review of Anti Bonded Labour System (abolition) Act 1992, developed PC1 for EBLIK II, supported for the impact assessment of EBLIK I, Review of Anti Bonded Labour Cell was carried out. For NGOs support was provided to reactivate NCABL. BKOAP was provided with the forums like they were taken to the civil service academy to communicate its position. PWF was engaged in conducting a survey of BK and its workers in three districts. District DoL Nankana Sahib was provided with assistance for implementing the model for BK workers.

Coordination was created between the tripartite constituents' and they are engaged in dialogues with each other. Though initial level cooperation has been started between various actors like BKOAP, PWF, PESSI and DoL however there are still apprehensions and need a continuous dialogue process to over come them.

Financial arrangements - all funds for the activity were provided by the US Department of State's Office to Monitor and combat Trafficking in Persons to ILO Pakistan. ILO either directly arranged events or made payments to the vendors or it contracted consultants and the payments were made through cross cheques at the delivery of agreed deliverables.

3.4.3 Should the project seek additional resources for expansion as per potential opportunities, if yes what approach?

Yes, because the devolution also brought opportunities in its wake and the additional funds could have helped in scaling up the initiative in Nankana Sahib at more number of brick kilns or in other districts and its publicity could have been done at large scale in the print/electronic media to attract attention of stakeholders at large. For example

End Project Evaluation Report ILO

the video case study of David Masih could have been developed and put on the electronic media. This act could have minimised the apprehensions of BKOAP and the workers for registration with social security institutes' and the message could have brought the snowball effect.

For additional sources either J/TIP could have been approached or some small grants from other institutional donors like USAID could have been sought.

3.5 Impact and Sustainability

3.5.1 Emerging impacts of the project and changes that can be linked to J/TIP interventions

- Responsive and conducive policy environment, provincial governments are committed to approve the plans of action.
- Initiation of BK registration with DoL and registration of workers with PESSI
- BK workers have CNIC and access to social protection schemes
- Tripartite dialogues on issues like social security, model contract and NFE
- Initiation of reactivation of DVCs
- Trained DoL staff and BK inspection mechanism is in place
- Reactivation of NCABL and functional Secretariat
- SoPs for Anti Bonded Labour Cells are in place
- Government of Punjab EBLIKII is launched

3.5.2 Has the project developed tools, methodology and training package that can be re-used in future by the ILO Constituents?

Yes, the project has demonstrated the methodology in its project in Nankana Sahib that can be further replicated in the districts, though the Government of Punjab is already practicing it in EBLIK, however, it can be replicated in other provinces too.

Training packages designed under the project i.e. for DoL inspection staff, Judiciary, and Police are a resource and it can be used in future.

Similarly, the communication products like posters and the documentary are excellent communication resources not only for showcasing the project but also for the future use.

Resource Directory of number of available funds for the rehabilitation of BL, developed under the project is another resource that will be used in future.

End Project Evaluation Report ILO

3.5.3 How effective is the exit strategy of the project?

No formal exit strategy is found in the documents. It is an area that needs planning and reflection in future projects. However, some forward time bound planning is found with governments under J/TIP in terms of taking the draft action plans for approval and putting the indicated initiatives in place.

3.5.4 Are partners likely to continue working on project's achievement?

Yes, however, it is subjective. For instance there is ownership in Punjab since it has started the process of registering BK with the government and registration of workers has received an extra push under the orders of the Supreme Court. Similarly, the EBLIK is extended to new districts in the second phase. Nevertheless, more work is required to push government for the adoption of 1992 BLSAA after review. Similarly, upstream work is required to push government of Sindh on the issues like establishment of functional anti bonded labour cells in the districts, development of projects for rehabilitation of bonded labour and reactivation of DVCs.

Similarly, BKOAP though fully appreciates ILO support under J/TIP and is ready to move on with work, however, it has apprehensions on the issues like: social security (though they have started PESSI registration), minimum wage, 'pashgi' and model contract. Subsequently, this needs more focus and the end of J/TIP may halt the process of dialogues with the government.

EFP though remained involved in all consultations and they take ownership of the inputs they gave at different forums in the formulation of plans however, they are overly concerned on the delay in adoption of model contract. They want support of ILO in future to push it further with the concerned quarters with the removal of legal objections on 'pashgi'.

PWF owns its work done in partnership with J/TIP and would like to continue, however, they expect ILO in future to provide financial support to conduct similar surveys of BK in other districts of Punjab and raise awareness among workers on issues like social security.

3.5.5 What should be the role of ILO for the expansion and extension of the project including contributions to the DWCP II outcomes?

End Project Evaluation Report ILO

ILO shall request J/TIP (if they still have the window available) for extension or other institutional donors for financial assistance to start the second phase of the project. As it is important to build on the work stimulated under the project for instance the draft plans of action are developed for Sindh and Punjab, the next phase will provide ample resources and the push to the governments to approve and implement them. Similarly, the process of tripartite dialogue has melted the ice and the continuous ILO support will bring these stakeholders at the point where the agenda of giving minimum wage, adopting model contract, getting social security registration and provision of NFE to the children will be agreed and institutionalised.

The extension will contribute to DWCP II country programme outcome 6 through its indicators 1 and 2.

4.0 Lessons Learned

Following are the lessons learned from the intervention:

1. ILO has all the technical and financial capacity to support provincial governments to bridge the technical gaps either in drafting policy plans or to review laws for adoption.
2. Transformation and devolution brings opportunities and they are well tapped under this project to push the agenda of decent work forward.
3. Tripartism is an effective approach to make constituents' social partners for policy dialogue and formulation through cooperation, consultation and negotiation.
4. Strengthening law enforcement responses and actions against any social issue is a long-term agenda and it shall be looked in to that perspective. For instance at times it takes a decade to get any policy/law approved, in this perspective long term projects shall be started.
5. To keep the project activities smooth and for better implementation minimum two people shall be hired at the country office level for project management/support.
6. One off training events in the government institutions cannot institutionalise the trainings.
7. Continuous coordination and follow up on government decisions is required to implement and institutionalise the initiatives e.g. establishment of anti bonded

End Project Evaluation Report ILO

- labour cells in three districts of Sindh could not happen despite the notifications from the competent authorities.
8. Awareness raising for behavioural change is a long process and it shall be looked at the individual, community and at the over all environment level. To implement this aspect more products shall be developed.

5.0 Recommendations

1. Capacity building of reactivated DVCs in Punjab is an important area and shall be integrated in the future interventions, whereas, in Sindh its reactivation shall be advocated.
2. Advocacy to implement minimum wage for the Brick Kiln workers shall be done. However, the issue of urban and rural locations of Brick Kilns and the brick rates should be taken as a baseline for determining minimum wage.
3. More tripartite social dialogues shall be organized in future to minimize the apprehensions of the constituents like BKOA on laws and social security.
4. Training shall be institutionalised in the government facilities like police training academy, judicial services academy and civil services academy.
5. Labour Administration Institute like NILAT shall be taken on board while developing policies and plans and they shall be strengthened to take up their training role with the capacity building of their staff and provision of equipment like multi media, sound system etc.
6. Support shall be provided to NGOs to start BL rehabilitation projects in partnership with the district governments.
7. More upstream work shall be done with the provincial governments to adopt laws like Anti Bonded Labour System (Abolition) Act 1992.
8. The issue of internal trafficking shall be looked in to at two levels: a) at existing legal framework (does it properly address the issue, if not proper legislation shall be done) and b) relevant departments like Police, FIA and higher ups at the Ministry of Interior (federal and provincial) shall be taken on board from the very beginning.
9. For effective implementation of the projects ample human resource (at least two full time professionals) shall be hired at the ILO country office level.

End Project Evaluation Report ILO

10. Internal review and stakeholder consultation on the projects coming to end shall be done at least 6 months before the end date, so as the extension (if required) or the next phase can be planned well on time.
11. Minimum wage of the project staff (for example NFE Centre teachers) shall be ensured.

6.0 Validation Workshop

To validate the evaluation findings, a tripartite workshop was organized in Lahore on December 24, 2013 and besides the representatives of the partner organizations (identified in section 1.0 of the report), a few bonded labourers and their families from Nankana Sahib, top management of the Department of Labour (Punjab), Punjab Employees Social Security Institution (PESSI) and Director Labour from Balochistan and Sindh also participated in the event. Following are the key points that the participants added to the findings/recommendations:

- 8. Bonded Labour Liberation Front:** ILO worked actively under J/TIP project, however, the activities like holding tripartite meetings, social dialogue, registration of workers with PESSI, registration of Brick Kilns with District DoLs, discussion on giving minimum wage, discussions on establishing exclusive inspection mechanism (separated from the factory act) for BK are just started, so there is a need for ILO to be there to keep the ball rolling till the elements get institutionalised. Internal trafficking shall be embedded in the upcoming project frameworks
- 9. Dr. Ghulam Haider:** In the future interventions ILO shall look in to bonded labour in agriculture sector in Sindh, according to him women of the bonded labourers are kept as sex slaves by the landlords and this issue shall be investigated and addressed.
- 10. National Coalition Against Bonded Labour:** ILO has created a model in Nakana Sahib through the district government and it shall be replicated in other districts and provinces.
- 11. Director Labour Sindh:** more focused intervention shall be carried out in Sindh to kick-start the social security registration process of the workers at Brick kilns and in agriculture sector.

End Project Evaluation Report ILO

12. **Riaz Ahmad Lawyer:** In the future interventions to address the issue of internal trafficking a study shall be commissioned to see the types of trafficking and the ways to address it.
13. **Ishaq Haider (DoL Nankana Sahib):** In Nankana Sahib, District Police Officer is at DVC and the phenomenon of internal trafficking is very much at their agenda. This model can be replicated in reactivated DVCs.
14. **ANCE:** He has found the trend of refusal to 'pashgi' at Brick Kilns in Sialkot and this is the emerging impact of J/TIP work with BKOAP.
15. **BKOAP:** Their association shall be taken on board at the DVCs and the government shall determine the minimum wage with their consultation. J/TIP work has brought their association in the realm of Tripartism and ILO shall provide constant support to institutionalise this process.
16. **Director General Labour Punjab:** After the initiation of J/TIP approximately 90% of the brick kilns are registered with the department. EBLIK I is implemented and EBLIK II is launched with the integrated approach (where different line departments are the part of the initiative) and this is a success story. He recommended that *in future an anthropological study should be commissioned to investigate the causes for prevalence of 'Pashgi' in 'Patheras'.* He further recommended that *in future a component on Occupational Safety Hazards (OSH - awareness and practice) should be embedded for the BK workers.* He further asked for the development of a model Brick Kiln where the labour standards and OSH are practiced and this model shall be promoted for replication.

ANNEX A: Research Tools

Questions for ILO Project Coordinator

1. Relevance

- 1.1. To what extent the project development objectives/outcomes were relevant to the needs of the country? To what extent the project supported target provincial governments in the wake of 18th Constitutional Amendment?
- 1.2. Has this initiative added value and bridged any technical gaps in the skills of relevant government machinery in Sindh and Punjab? If yes, Please give some examples. What was unique about this initiative?
- 1.3. To which extent the recipient stakeholders take ownership of the project concept and approach since the inception phase?
- 1.4. How does this project contribute to the ILO country programme outcomes established under DWCP –II?
- 1.5. How does this project strengthen and compliment the One UN Programme?
- 1.6. How does this programme create synergy with the other interventions taking place under the other donor funded projects and One UN programme? How does it avoid duplication?

2. Validity

- 2.1. To which extent this project caters the needs of adult bonded laborers both men and women and then elderly and children?
- 2.2. Do you think that the planned objectives, activities, outputs and outcomes are realistic? Furthermore, do they take account of the ground realities in both provinces?
- 2.3. Is the vertical and horizontal logic in the result framework consistent? Are planned outputs naturally flowing to result in the form of outcomes planned in the project?
- 2.4. How strategic are the partners to the project implementation and how strategic they are in terms of knowledge management once the project is over?
- 2.5. What do you think the strategy opted for the project implementation is appropriate? If yes how? What could have been done differently?
- 2.6. What were the main implementation challenges at different stages of the project (at inception, in the middle and at the end)?
- 2.7. Were the designed project indicators remained relevant through out the course of the project or they were amended to meet the current needs?
- 2.8. Were the anticipated resources (financial and human) were sufficient to attain its planned outcomes? If not what measures were taken to bridge up the gap.

3. Effectiveness

End Project Evaluation Report ILO

- 3.1 To what extent the skills and knowledge base of the identified groups i.e. state functionaries, judiciary, labor inspectors and employers and worker organizations increased as the result of project interventions? Is there any example that a participant talked about the practical challenges that they face as part of the government system in implementing law? Similarly, is there any incident quoted from the participants in the workers association, where they played some role in managing the exploitative situation for fellow workers?
- 3.2 How far this project has enabled the stakeholders like DVCs, Labor Department, PESSI and Employers Associations to create and maintain effective linkages to keep the ball rolling?
- 3.3 To what extent the project has proved successful in terms of reaching the target group at the workers level in particular girl child, women, youth and communities?
- 3.4 As a project Coordinator what elements (social, political and institutional) you term as impact after the course of project implementation?
- 3.5 What outputs have not been implemented or have slow progress? Why?
- 3.6 To what extent various studies carried out under the project have added value to the intervention?
- 3.7 Which outputs are still unable to show impact? And what are reasons?
- 3.8 How effectively the project performed on the responsibility for implementation and project ownership to date?
- 3.9 As project Coordinator, what do you think are the over achievements?
- 3.10 To what extent the project managed its risks and assumptions?
- 3.11 How well the project created and used opportunities under this project to harmonize management principles for other ILO interventions?

4. Efficiency

- 4.1 What is the project efficiency in terms of management and capacity building?
- 4.2 How efficiently the financial resources of the project have been used on outputs and activities in comparison with the plan?
- 4.3 How efficiently the project has been managed in terms of project information, communication, cooperation and coordination and financial arrangements with in the project and with the national, provincial and district stakeholders?
- 4.4 You think the project has achieved its over all development objective?

5. Impact and Sustainability

End Project Evaluation Report ILO

- 5.1 What do you think the project has brought its intended impact on the identified stakeholders? If yes, please quote example and if not what shall be done?
- 5.2 Has the project resources produced in the form of draft plans, researches, training tool kits can be re used in future by the existing partners?
- 5.3 Is there any exit strategy for the project? If yes, is it realistic and shared with the stakeholders?
- 5.4 Are the project outputs related to the capacity building of various stakeholders are durable? What is institutionalized as a result of this project?
- 5.5 Can the project approach be replicated or scaled up by the national/provincial/district partners and other actors?
- 5.6 To which extent the project fulfilled the advanced strategic gender related needs and will they stay after the closure of the project?

End Project Evaluation Report ILO

Questionnaire for ANCE– Lahore

1. How far technical and financial support of ILO under its J/TIP project helped to strengthen law enforcement responses against the bonded labour in Brick Kilns in Nankana Sahib?
2. How do you look at the establishment of Non Formal Education schools in terms of saving children from the bonded labour? Is this initiative sufficed to lead the child to get decent work?
3. What practical challenges you faced in implementing the project activities like helping workers to get CNIC, birth registration, linkages with BISP, registration with PESSI and in carrying out the awareness raising events etc.?
4. What support ILO as a partner agency extended to you in overcoming implementation level challenges?
5. How do you look at the Government of Punjab model project EBLIK and its extension to 4 other districts? Is it a way forward to help reducing the bonded labour phenomenon in the province in Brick Kiln sector?
6. As a partner for reducing the phenomenon of bonded labour in model project, what do you think that what kind of consolidated efforts are required at upstream level to safeguard the rights of bonded laborers? What are the challenges that district governments face in implementing the project?
7. What is your work experience with various stakeholders like PESSI, Health Department, Workers Association, Employers Association and District Labour Department? What worked well and what shall be improved?
8. What should have been done differently at ILO level?
9. Is there any good practice example that you think can be replicated in other provinces or in other districts of EBLIK II?

End Project Evaluation Report ILO

Questionnaire for Commissioner PESSI– Lahore

1. What technical support your department has received from ILO under its J/TIP project to extend social security coverage to the brick kiln workers and their families?
2. What support ILO as a technical partner agency has provided to PESSI to build functional linkages with PBKOA and in removing their fears/challenges to work in coordination with PESSI as per law?
3. What support PESSI has received from ILO under its J/TIP project to improve its coordination with the provincial DOL to get Brick Kilns data?
4. What is your opinion about the IEC material i.e. awareness raising posters developed and disseminated by ILO and its partner ANCE, in terms of leveraging workers and employers opinions to get register with PESSI?
5. As a partner agency what do you think ILO should have done differently to help you to get your mandate?
6. What do you think is the best practice example under this initiative?
7. Any suggestions for future partnership on the similar issues for instance still there is a very small percentage of Brick Kilns that are registered with PESSI for social security of its workers?

End Project Evaluation Report ILO

Questionnaire for HRCP– Lahore

1. What technical and financial support HRCP received from ILO under its J/TIP project to revive NCABL?
2. To what extent NCABL can be effective in promoting the agenda of elimination of bonded labour in Pakistan?
3. What type of system in addition to legal frameworks is required at the provincial and district level to prevent and reduce the phenomenon of bonded labour? What support ILO as the specialized agency on the issues of Labour can extend to the government and NGOs to improve the situation of eliminating bonded labour?
4. What long-term support you expect from ILO to keep NCABL active and busy in highlighting various issues around the practice of Bonded Labour?
5. What are the repercussions on the workers rights after the 18th amendment and to what extent ILO support through J/TIP has helped the provincial labour departments to safeguard the workers rights? If not what do you expect from ILO in future?
6. As a manager of Human Rights Commission, what do you think that what kind of consolidated efforts are required at policy level to safeguard and mainstream the rights of bonded laborers and to reduce the policy –implementation level gaps?
7. What ILO can do differently, so as its agenda to support bonded workers in getting decent work can be achieved?
8. What do you think are the practical steps that ILO can push at the federal level for devolving the bonded workers welfare fund in future, since the J/TIP project is ending on December 31, 2013?

End Project Evaluation Report ILO

Questionnaire for President PBKOA– Lahore

1. What value addition ILO partnership under J/TIP has brought to PBKOA? Please share examples.
2. How do you look at activities brought to PBKOA like establishment of non-formal education centers on brick kilns, dialogues with kiln owners to register their workers with PESSI, facilitation for developing a model contract and asking owners to abolish traditional form of '*pashgi*' etc.?
3. How do you look at coordination that ILO under J/TIP has established for you with various line departments like Deptt. Of Labour, NADRA, Health, PESSI, BISP and your exposure to Civil Services Academy, Judicial Academy etc?
4. What was your first reaction when ILO approached you for partnership? Will it go beyond this J/TIP project?
5. To what extent this partnership has helped PBKOA in shunning its fears about registration with the government and paying 6% share of employees' salary for social security? Since I found PBKOA had fears that social security benefits may not reach workers the way they are projected by the social security department?
6. What do you feel about ILO approach of tripartite constituents? How do you look at legal and social empowerment of workers from the employers' point of view?
7. What do you think could have been done differently under this project?
8. Is there any good practice example that you think can be replicated in other provinces or in other upcoming projects of ILO on bonded labour?

End Project Evaluation Report ILO

Questionnaire for Secretary Department of Labour – Lahore

1. What technical support your department has received from ILO under its project 'Strengthening Law Enforcement Responses and Action against Internal Trafficking and Bonded Labour in Sindh & Punjab Provinces, Pakistan' to address the issue of bonded labour in the province. Please also share the efforts that have institutionalized the system at the provincial level and district level?
2. What support ILO as a technical partner agency has provided to DOL Punjab in strengthening its own initiatives like EBLIK, taken against the elimination of bonded labour?
3. What support ILO has provided under the project to DOL to develop the provincial policies and plan of actions to prevent and eliminate the issue of bonded labour especially in the context of devolution after 18th Constitutional Amendment?
4. How did ILO support in carrying various consultations like tripartite consultation on Brick Kiln sector helped DOL to add value in its work?
5. Do you think ILO technical support to conduct various studies like mapping exercise for resource directory, assessment of EBLIK I and development of PCI for EBLIK II, helped DOL in getting sound to implement its official mandate?
6. Since the project is ending on December 31, 2013 how do you look at it e.g. shall it be extended? or it has helped enough to make DOL sound to take its official agenda of eliminating bonded labor at its own?
7. What should have been differently in this partnership with DOL?
8. What do you think is the best practice under this initiative?
9. Any suggestions for future partnership on the similar issues?

End Project Evaluation Report ILO

Questionnaire for Secretary Department of Literacy & Non Formal Basic Education Department – Lahore

1. What support your department has received from ILO under its project 'Strengthening Law Enforcement Responses and Action against Internal Trafficking and Bonded Labour in Sindh & Punjab' to establish non-formal schools at brick kilns in southern districts of Punjab?
2. What support ILO as a technical partner agency has provided to your department to create linkages with other stakeholders like PBKOA, parents of NFE Schools children, brick kiln workers and district departments of Labour?
3. For what additional support you look towards ILO in terms of moving on with your official departmental mandate?
4. What do you term as the best practice under ILO support to your department?
5. Any suggestions for future partnership on the similar issues?

End Project Evaluation Report ILO

FGD Questionnaire for Beneficiaries in Nankana Sahib

1. Are you aware of the Government of Punjab EBLIK project? Who comes here for meetings with you? What is the frequency of meetings?
2. How were you mobilized to move on for getting CNIC, birth registration, getting social security and availing micro credit? Have you seen awareness-raising posters developed under the project?
3. What benefits the above-mentioned interventions has brought to you? How do you feel after having a CNIC and Social Security Card?
4. How do you feel while interacting with your employer on the issues related to health screening, non-formal education center and getting connected with BISP and micro credit programme? Is he fine with this change or does not like it?
5. What are the challenges that you face in accessing the micro credit, zakat and other schemes introduced by the government for you?
6. What type of advances you and your family has taken against your services from the employers and what is their repayment mode? What type of work environment you have and what shall be changed?
7. How many of you have availed a health benefit like maternity benefits, sickness benefit etc.?
8. Have your children received milk and toys under the project?
9. What are your needs that shall be looked in to in the upcoming projects?
10. Any good practice from the project interventions that you will like to share with me?

End Project Evaluation Report ILO

Questionnaire for Director General– Sindh Judicial Academy

1. What training support your institution received from ILO under G/TIP?
2. As a DG you think this training was required for the judiciary? If yes, is it incorporated in the regular training curriculum?
3. Is there any technical element on bonded labour issue from social, legal and political aspect that you think shall be embedded in the existing training structure?
4. What long-term support from ILO you look at in terms of trainings and material for judiciary on labour laws in general and bonded labour in particular?
5. What do you think should have been done differently under G/TIP trainings to judiciary?
6. Any suggestions for future interventions for ILO?

Questionnaire for DIGP Administration– Karachi

1. How do you as a Police Officer look at your work experience with ILO in addressing the issue of bonded labour at various levels i.e. prevention and mitigation at the policy level? Will you please like to share your findings about the functions and procedures of Anti Bonded Labour Cell in the post review scenario? Are they active in the districts? Is this an effective intervention in reducing the issue of bonded labour?
2. How much the training on anti bonded labour issues for the police officers and police academies instructional staff has been institutionalized in the system? Please share examples.
3. What practical challenges as a police officer you face in preventing and confronting the issue of bonded labour? How does ILO can extend you help to manage those challenges?

End Project Evaluation Report ILO

4. Is the issue of bonded labour high on the agenda of Sindh Police? If yes, what additional measures have been taken to prevent and mitigate it?
5. What technical capacity challenges exist for police and other relevant government departments like DOL, WWB, SESSI etc. to address the issue of bonded labour? What help ILO extended under J/TIP in bridging those gaps.
6. How do you look at the phenomenon of public private partnership in preventing and reducing the issue of bonded labour? Is it a workable model?
7. What type of coordination mechanism in the wake of G/TIP interventions in the province is in place between various state actors to address the issue of bonded labour?
8. Since G/TIP is coming to its end how do you look at the capacity of provincial machinery in curbing the issue of bonded labour? Shall project be extended? If yes, what are the priority needs that shall be dealt under the project.
9. As a partner for G/TIP what do you think ILO could have done differently in the intervention?
10. Is there any good practice example that you think can be replicated in other provinces especially in the context of Police role and cooperation in addressing the issue?

End Project Evaluation Report ILO

Questionnaire for PILER – Karachi

1. As the only labour research and labour mobilization institution in Pakistan, do you find any synergy in your work and ILO mandate?
2. Any of your researches and campaigns e.g. campaign on land rights, social protection and democracy find technical and financial support from ILO?
3. How do you look at ILO G/TIP and its contribution in strengthening law enforcement responses and actions against bonded labour and internal trafficking in Sindh?
4. How far DVCs can be effective in eliminating the issue of bonded labour?
5. As a research institution, what are the aspects in bonded labour on which researches are required and ILO can take lead on that?
6. What type of synergy is required in the efforts of various actors (state and civil society) working to prevent and reduce the phenomenon of bonded labour?
7. What gaps you feel in the legal frameworks that hamper state performance in reducing the phenomenon of child labour?
8. What type of upstream and downstream awareness raising is required in strengthening law enforcement responses against bonded labour?
9. Any suggestions for existing and future interventions for ILO?

End Project Evaluation Report ILO

Questionnaire for Director Labour– Sindh

1. What support under G/TIP you received from ILO to prevent, reduce and mitigate the issue of bonded labour?
2. A committee was constituted comprising of DOL, Police and ILO to ensure that the decisions on trainings of staff (police and labour department) and establishment of anti bonded labour cells are implemented, are you aware of their performance? Have they managed to implement the high level decisions? How did this coordination go?
3. How do you look at the performance of labour inspection staff after receiving trainings from ILO - G/TIP? Are they sensitized on the issue and look in to the labour issues at the employer side and the worker side with clarity? Have you received any complaints where staff highlighted the unlawful practices at the employers level in any district?
4. How do you look at the existing provincial legal framework in terms of preventing and eliminating the issue of bonded labour?
5. What is the good practice example under G/TIP that you think Labour department will carry on with in its systems?
6. What were you expectations from ILO under G/TIP especially after 18th amendment?
7. Few research studies are carried out under G/TIP like rapid need assessment of bonded labour, development of resource directory for freed bonded labour and awareness material on highlighting the benefits of getting registered with social security schemes, how effective they are for your department in terms of achieving its mandate?
8. What do you think about Public Private partnership against bonded labour? Is this model workable?
9. G/TIP is ending in December 2013, has it helped you in finding your feet in the area of bonded labour? Or it shall be extended to help more in formalizing the legal frameworks and their implementation in the post devolution scenario?
10. What do you think should have been done differently under G/TIP?

End Project Evaluation Report ILO

11. Any suggestions for future interventions for ILO?

End Project Evaluation Report ILO

Questionnaire for SPARC

1. How do you look at your initiative of establishment of first ever anti bonded labour cell in Mirpur Khas? How far ILO later on took this initiative in terms of scaling up with the provincial police department?
2. What do you think about ILO commissioned study on the review of the above mentioned cell and what value addition the review exercise brought to the initiative?
3. What do you think of the public private partnership initiative in preventing and reducing the phenomenon of bonded labour? How effective civil society in partnership with government can be in developing model projects for rehabilitation of free bonded laborers?
4. What role civil society coalitions like NCABL can play in preventing, reducing and eliminating the phenomenon of bonded labour?
5. How do you look at reactivation of DVCs and their role in the districts to prevent and reduce the phenomenon of bonded labour?
6. What as an activist you think are the policy and implementation level gaps in eliminating the phenomenon of bonded labour? What activities at the upstream level shall be taken to push government to take measures under the ILO conventions it has ratified to reduce the phenomenon of forced labour?
7. Since the draft plan of action to combat bonded labour is drafted for Sindh, what advocacy initiative you expect from ILO to push it for approval?
8. What do you quote as a best practice example under G/TIP?
9. Is there any element under the project you think should have been done differently?
10. Any suggestions for future interventions for ILO?

End Project Evaluation Report ILO

Questionnaire for Barristar Zafarullah (Consultant)

1. How do you look at the ILO training initiative for judiciary, police, Labour Department and civil society on the issue of Bonded Labour under G/TIP?
2. Since you developed trainings manual for judiciary and civil services, what were the contents of those manuals?
3. What were the feedback of the participants and the management of the training academies (judicial and civil Services) on the initiative and contents?
4. What practical challenges you faced in terms of getting permission from the above mentioned institutions for organizing and delivering trainings?
5. Do you think the trainings provided to judicial officers and civil services officers have been institutionalized? If yes where and if not why?
6. What support other than trainings ILO shall provide to the government departments like police and judiciary to prevent and reduce the phenomenon of Bonded Labour?
7. What should have been done differently at ILO level in terms of trainings contents development and training delivery?
8. Is there any good practice example that you will like to share with us in the context of trainings?

End Project Evaluation Report ILO

Questionnaire for Employers Federation of Pakistan

1. What technical and financial support under G/TIP you received from ILO to conduct consultations for developing a model contract and carrying out social dialogues?
2. What are the findings under consultations that ILO took at the upstream level to make model contract applicable? How far it succeeded and what shall be done next if the project gets extension?
3. What type of awareness material in local languages you produced under G/TIP and how effective your audience found it? Please share examples.
4. How does EFP look at ILO approach of tripartite constituents? How open is the government to work through this approach? Please share your experience especially in the context of employers' rights?
5. How do you look at the coordination mechanism established by ILO and its partners (in government and civil society) in preventing and reducing the phenomenon of bonded labour? If yes, how it can be sustained?
6. What are the challenges that EFP faced in consultations' and dialogues at the various geographical pockets in terms of bringing various stakeholders on one platform and developing a draft model contract, which is acceptable to both workers and employers? What are the challenges that still exist and what is the strategy to move on with the finalization?
7. What long-term technical support you expect from ILO in reducing and preventing the phenomenon of bonded labour and bringing change in the behaviour of employers?
8. What do you think should have been done differently under G/TIP especially the component on which you worked in partnership?
9. Any suggestions for future interventions for ILO?

End Project Evaluation Report ILO

ANNEX B: List of People Interviewed

Lahore

Name	Designation
Captain (Retd.) Mohammad Yousaf	Secretary Department of Labour and Human Resources, Punjab
Dr. Pervaiz Ahmad Khan	Secretary Department of Literacy & Non-formal Basic Education
Shahid Adil	Vice Commissioner, Punjab Employees Social Security Institution
Mr. I A Rehman	Human Rights Commission of Pakistan
Ch Naseem Iqbal	President PWF, Central Punjab
Malik Nazir	Project Manager, Punjab Government's Project on Bonded Labour
Mr. Shoaib Khan Niazi	President, Brick Kiln Owners Association
Muhammad Imran Haider Tipu	District Labour Officer, Rahim Yar Khan
Mr. Muhammad Mansha	Manager NFE, EBLIK
Ishaq Haider	District Labour Officer, Nankana Sahib
Raja Abbas	President, Association for Network of Community Empowerment

End Project Evaluation Report ILO

Karachi

Name	Designation
Mr. Zulfiqar Shah	Joint Director, PILER
Sheikh Imtiaz Ali	Director General, NILAT
Syed Saud Alam	Officer-in-charge, EFP
Syed Athar shah	Assistant Director, Labour
Mr. Abdul Khaliq Sheikh	DIG, Sindh Police
Mr. Kashif Bajeer	Project Coordinator, Bonded Labour Project, SPARC

Other participants

Nankana Sahib

- DVC members in Nankana Sahib
- Beneficiaries of CNIC and marriage grant in Nankana Sahib
- Children at 2 NFE Centres

Kasur

- Beneficiaries' of micro credit, CNIC and NFE Centres at Kasur Brick Kiln and Sabir Basti
- Teachers and children of NFE Centres