

**Building Sound Industrial Relations for Sustainable Development and
Competitiveness**

Final Project Evaluation

(Final Report)

Submitted to
ILO Country Office, Addis Ababa
Ethiopia

Contents

Acronyms	ii
Executive Summery	iii
1 Introduction	1
1.1 Description of the project	1
1.2 Purpose, scope, and clients of the evaluation	1
1.3 Methodology	2
2 Findings	3
2.1 Relevance and strategic fit of the program,	3
▪ Project's Contribution in Meeting Needs of Partners	5
2.2 Validity of the approach, design and strategies adopted by the project	8
▪ Impact and Progress Indicators	9
▪ Geographic Appropriateness	10
▪ Assessment of Risks	12
2.3 Project progress and delivery of results	13
▪ Outcome One: Strengthened Harmonious labour relations through social dialogue	13
▪ Outcome Two: Improved implementation of labour legislation and ratified conventions for better industrial relations and working conditions	15
▪ Attribution of Results to Project Activities	16
▪ Gender Issues	17
2.4 Efficiency of resource use	18
2.5 Organizational management arrangements	19
2.6 Impact orientation and sustainability	20
2.7 Lessons learned	22
3 Conclusions	23
4 Recommendations	25
5 Annexes	27

Acronyms

BOLSA	Bureau of Labour and Social Affairs
CETU	Confederation of Ethiopian Trade Unions
DANIDA	Danish International Development Agency
DWCP	Decent Work Country Program
EEF	Ethiopian Employers' Federation
GTP	Growth and Transformation Plan
MOLSA	Ministry of Labour and Social Affairs
NPC	National Project Coordinator
PAC	Project Advisory Committee
TU	Trade Union
TWG	Technical Working Group

Executive Summery

This internal evaluation was conducted with the aim of providing a final assessment of the project in achieving the project objectives and delivery of results; strategies and implementation modalities chosen; partnership arrangements, constraints, and opportunities as well as providing recommendations for future similar projects in terms of strategies, institutional arrangements, and any other area. To meet these objectives, primary data were collected through seven individual interviews conducted with CETU and EEF leaders in Addis Ababa, Dire Dawa, Harrar, Mekelle; group discussions with EEF Mekelle leaders, and Tigray BOLSA staff, and interviews with ILO CO staff.

The evaluation found that the project intervention areas are directly relevant to GTP I as well as GTP II. In both policy documents, labour relations feature as one of the seven cross-cutting issues, and expanding social dialogue is presented as a central goal. Moreover, the project activities are aimed at achieving two of the decent work country programme outcomes namely; (i) relevant conventions on labour standards ratified, enforcements and implementation improved; and (ii) strengthened Harmonious labour relations through social dialogue.

The project started out by conducting an assent of the project partners and found out that they had critical needs related to basic office facilities, man-power, and awareness of labour relations issues including organizing, collective bargaining, and social dialogue. Hence, the project undertook capacity building activities that addressed many of these needs. Nonetheless, the human capacity gap at the branch level persists. None of the branch offices covered under this evaluation have more than two professional staff in addition to the office head, office space is very much limited, and existing financial capacity, as well as the capacity to raise funding is very weak. In addition, by facilitating the establishment of many unions, the project has created new needs of follow up and training. CETU leaders further explain that the inauguration of industrial parks and the construction of many more is likely to create new needs of organizing, bargaining, and social dialogue.

While the evaluation has found the project interventions to be generally appropriate for all geographical areas visited, it was found that the wide capacity differences between branch offices of the constituents has made some of the interventions more crucial to some than others. For instance, at least two of the EEF branch offices visited were found to be very weak, and thus more in need of basic technical and equipment support. While, the trainings are likely to have some impact in these offices, their weak capacity may limit the effectiveness of the trainings. The evaluation also found that while the project took proper stock of risks, the 2016 widespread unrest in the country negatively affected the implementation of some activities, including trainings and completion of studies.

Almost all project activities under the two immediate objectives were implemented on time and to the desired level. In relation to the establishment of social dialogue forums, the planned activities cannot be accomplished due to the delay in the revision of the Ethiopian Labour Proclamation No. 377/2003, which governs such bodies. Thus, the project shifted towards the establishment of Tripartite Forums at regional levels. Overall, the evaluation concludes that, based on the fact that most of the planned outputs were delivered, the level of project achievement has been satisfactory.

The project also found that allocation of financial resources was somewhat fair, and their use was efficient. However, given the number of activities under outcome 2, a better delivery would have been possible had the project initially allocated more funding for the outcome.

The evaluation found that both broad strategic management as well as technical details were effectively managed through the PAC and TWG. The NPC was able to effectively discharge her duties in cooperation with the TWG as well as ILO CO staff. However, it was found that an initial delay in project commencement had moderately affected delivery of activities. In the part of CETU and EEF branch office, some gap in communication with the head offices was witnessed, particularly among the latter.

Finally, the evaluation found that all project activities are impact-oriented and some are likely to be sustainable. However, serious financial and manpower capacity gaps of the social partners and their branch offices are likely to pose sustainability challenges.

1 Introduction

1.1 Description of the project

‘Building Sound Industrial Relations for Sustainable Development and Competitiveness’ is a project implemented through a partnership of ILO and the Danish International Development Agency (DANIDA). The project aims to contribute to ensuring decent work through peaceful industrial relations for sustainable development with a view to creating virtuous cycle between better productivity, competitiveness and better working conditions. Hence, the project addressed industrial relation challenges at national, sectoral and enterprise levels in line with the 2014-2016 Decent Work Country Program.

1.2 Purpose, scope, and clients of the evaluation

The internal final evaluation serves two main purposes:

- i. To give a final assessment of the project in achieving the project objectives and delivery of results; strategies and implementation modalities chosen; partnership arrangements, constraints, and opportunities.
- ii. Provide recommendations for future similar projects in terms of strategies, institutional arrangements, and any other area.

As per the TOR, this final evaluation covers the project overall, including relevance, validity, effectiveness, resource efficiency, as well as sustainability throughout the project period (1st January 2015 – 31st December 2016). As these issues are inextricably linked to the capacity of the partners (EEF and CETU), the report also touches on organizational issues related to the partners. The primary client for this evaluation is the Danish International Development Agency (DANIDA), ILO and the implementing partners, i.e., MOLSA, EEF and CETU. ILO offices and staff involved in the project (project staff, ILO departments at HQ, the technical backstopping department, and the Regional Office for Africa (ROAF)) will use the findings of the report. Tripartite constituents and other parties involved in the execution of the project would use, as appropriate, the evaluation recommendations and lessons learnt. Key lessons learned will also be discussed with and reported back to beneficiaries and stakeholders (EEF and CETU) and the donor (DANIDA).

1.3 Methodology

The evaluation relied on both primary and secondary data to compile a comprehensive review of the project.

- **Desk review:** a review was conducted, where periodic project progress reports were analysed to provide insight into key aspects of the evaluation questions. In addition, manuals, implementation agreements, and other documents produced as part of the project were consulted during the desk review. Ethiopia's development policies and programs, the Decent Work Country Program document were reviewed to assess the project's relevance and strategic fit.
- **Interviews (ILO):** staff of the ILO country office (CO) including the National Project Coordinator (NPC), as well as other relevant staff of the CO were interviewed on the overall evaluation issues. However, attention was paid to management arrangements and monitoring, as well as planned versus actual resource allocation.
- **Interviews (Partners and Stakeholders):** in depth interviews were conducted with relevant stakeholders including members of the technical working group (TWG) and project beneficiaries (branch offices of EEF and CETU in Mekelle, Dire Dawa, Harari and Bahir Dar) to evaluate the delivery of outputs and outcomes of the respective project components.

2 Findings

2.1 *Relevance and strategic fit of the program*

The first one year of this project coincides with the last implementation year of the first five-year Growth and Transformation Plan (I), which has been guiding Ethiopia's development efforts in the 2011–2015 period. The GTP pays significant attention to job creating through transforming the Ethiopian economy which will enable the country to reduce poverty and achieve the millennium development goals. To this end, the plan gives broad priority to modernizing agriculture as well as enabling the industrial sector to play a leading role in the economy. Improving labour relations is one of the nine cross-cutting issues of the plan, where it sets a strategic direction to *expand workplace support and cooperation to encourage the resolution of labour disputes by bilateral (employee and employer) and trilateral (employee, employer, and the government) dialogue and discussion (p 115)*. The document sets seven targets under the Labour Affairs cross-cutting issue, including ensuring an effective enforcement of the labor laws, launching a job information service, supporting job seekers, providing capacity development training to employees and employers, launching dialogue and discussion forums at workplaces, providing support to solve labour disputes through dialogues and discussions, strengthening monitoring of working environments.

Industrial relations in Ethiopia are dealt with in greater detail in its Decent Work Country Program (DWCP 2014-15), which was formulated through a partnership of the tripartite (Government, Workers' and Employers' organisations) parties in Ethiopia, in collaboration with ILO Country Office for Ethiopia to ensure decent employment opportunities that correspond to the rapidly expanding size of the labour force and promote genuine social dialogue, safe working conditions and applications of labour standards. More specifically, improving the implementation of international labour standards and social dialogue with emphasis on compliance and coverage is one of the main priorities identified by the constituents for the Ethiopia DWCP. This priority seeks to enhance labour market governance through the ratification and implementation of relevant conventions, and strengthen the capacities of social dialogue, labour dispute resolution and collective bargaining institutions. Expected results are

new ratifications, and improve the implementation and enforcement of relevant conventions on labour standards, and to strengthen harmonious labour relations through social dialogue.

Throughout the GTP I period, the industrial sector has continued to grow. As per the GTP II review of macro-economic performance in the preceding plan period, the industrial sector accounted for about 20 percent of the annual average value-added growth rate, which was twice as high as service and more than three times higher than agriculture. The manufacturing sub-sector of the industry registered an annual average growth rate of 14.6 percent during the same period (p 7). Despite this growth, the performance of the large and medium scale manufacturing industries lags behind the plan, mainly hampered by inability to attract a large number of new and high-quality export oriented private investments into manufacturing and the low productivity and competitiveness of existing manufacturing firms. Considering these, the GTP II pays attention to rapidly developing the industrial sector. In the plan period, labour relations feature as one of the seven cross-cutting issues, where expanding social dialogue is presented as a central goal. The document sets the following key strategic direction:

closely monitoring working conditions based on protection so as to secure peaceful industrial relation at work places and expanding occupational safety and health services, strengthening bilateral and multilateral cooperation and social consultation systems, creating safe working condition, protecting illegal human trafficking and building institutional capacity (p 218).

The project under review selected and implemented activities aimed at achieving two of the decent work country programme outcomes namely; (i) Relevant conventions on labour standards ratified, enforcements and implementation improved; and (ii) Strengthened Harmonious labour relations through social dialogue. As a result, this project is directly relevant to not only the DWCP, but also the strategic objectives of the GTP I and GTP II.

Table 1: Relevance and Strategic Fit of the Project against Country Priorities

	Country Priorities	GTP
Immediate Objective One: <i>Strengthened Harmonious labour relations through social dialogue.</i>	CP outcome 2	GTP Pillar 3: Governance and Capacity Building
• Output 1.1: Tripartite consultation system strengthened at Federal level and established at Regional and Sectoral levels.	• CP output 2.1	
• Output 1.2: Effective Bipartite dialogue system established at national, sectoral and enterprise level.	• CP output 2.2	
• Output 1.3: Capacity of tripartite constituents enhanced to effectively engage in social dialogue.	• CP output 2.3	
• Output 1.4: Improved capacity of social partners and enterprises to effectively engage in collective bargaining.	• CP output 2.2, 2.3	
• Output 1.5: Improved labour dispute system and enhanced capacity for labour dispute settlement at enterprise level.	• CP output 2.2, 2.3	
Immediate Objective Two: <i>Improved implementation of labour legislation and ratified conventions for better industrial relations and working conditions.</i>	CP outcome 1	GTP Pillar 3: Governance and Capacity Building
• Output 2.1: Institutional support in place to strengthen freedom of associations, unionization, collective bargaining and dispute settlement.	• CP output 1.2	
• Output 2.2: Capacity of social partners, judiciary and the legislature strengthened on the implementation of labour legislation and ratified conventions.	• CP output 1.3	
• Output 2.3: Promote realization of better terms and conditions of service for enhanced productivity and competitiveness.	• CP output 1.1	

▪ Project's Contribution in Meeting Needs of Partners

Project partners, particularly CETU and EEF branch offices were asked to what extent the results of the project were useful in addressing their outstanding problems. CETU branch leaders stated that their key problems related to financial, manpower, and mobility needs as compared to their large geographical coverage as well as numerosity of enterprises under their coverage; lack of even basic awareness regarding unionization, collective bargaining, and social dialogue among workers as well as lack of willingness to engage in social dialogue among some employers; and lack of proper office space and equipment.

When asked to what extent these needs have been met, they reported that the equipment support (desktop computer, printer and fax machine) has been extremely useful in improving their day-to-day operation. Not only has it enabled them to provide better service to their constituents, it has also enabled them to communicate effectively with the head office promptly, and has facilitated proper record keeping, and thus improved institutional memory in the form of the availability of electronic copies of documents for later reference.

Nonetheless, some of the initial needs still persist. According to interviews with officials from CETU at Addis Ababa, all seven of the industrial relations and unionization expert employed through funding from this project have been retained. Despite this, however, the human capacity gap at the branch level persists. None of the branch offices visited have more than two professional staff in addition to the office head. The office heads elaborate that they often serve as finance officers, project coordinators, and members of the regional labour relations board, which seriously restricts their full engagement at any one task.

In addition, both at Mekele and Dire Dawa the offices have only a motor cycle, which seriously limits their outreach activities poses threats to the physical wellbeing of staff, who sometimes have to ride through rough terrain to get to enterprises, especially those in the agro-industry sub-sector. Regarding awareness creation, despite the significant gains made as a result of trainings provided by the project on various issues, leaders of existing unions as well as workers have not been adequately trained, as most of the trainings focus on CETU branch and federation leaders. Thus, there is still need for training on duties and responsibilities of workers and employers as well as the benefits of unionizing.

Regarding new needs that have emerged during the lifetime of the project, the evaluation found that some of these were direct result of the implementation of the project, while others are results of national developments. Regarding the first, CETU leader both in Bahir Dar and Mekele indicated that the employment of an industrial relations and unionization expert has enabled them to embark on a large-scale activity of facilitating the formation of basic unions at the enterprise level. Once formed, however, the branch offices are not able to provide follow-up

trainings as well as other technical support due to lack of capacity. The CETU branch office head at Mekele elaborates that 35 trade unions were established at various locations in Tigray during the project life time, while in Amhara, some 50 unions were established in the same period. Both branch offices stressed that these newly established unions create a significant training and technical support need that cannot be fulfilled by the existing capacities. One unintended consequence of this is the potential for industrial conflict. In the words of one interviewee,

“after we facilitate the formation of unions, the elected leaders want to rush into enterprise managers’ offices immediately and start negotiations in a confrontational manner. This is because they lack knowledge of labour relations laws and procedures. There is a misconception among workers that a union leadership which is discourteous to employers is a strong leadership. If we cannot provide trainings to workers and union leaders, our effort to create harmonious industrial relations ends up causing problems...”

Furthermore, the industrial development process at the national level has already begun to create new needs that are unlikely to be met by the existing capacity of the CETU branch offices. For instance, the newly inaugurated industrial park at Hawassa is reported to employ some 50,000 workers, a development which is an issue of concern for CETU, according to an official. The same concern is reflected in Bahir Dar, Mekele, and Dire Dawa, cities which are slotted to have their own industrial parks in the near future.

Some of the branch offices have already begun to experience new challenges as a result of the expansion of industries in their areas of operation. For instance, the Mekelle branch head of CETU explains that with the opening of new industries in the garment sector, there is a significant movement of workers from the existing factories to the newly opened ones as well as among the new ones. As a result, workers who were union members or leaders in one enterprise end up being ununionized in the other. On the other hand, the workers who are newly recruited to fill the vacancies created by the migration of workers to other factories have not had any training on the benefits of unionization, and thus are reluctant to become union members. Hence, there is a continued ‘dilution’ of workers by the addition of a large number of fresh workers, which needs to be countered by a continued process of training and awareness creation.

2.2 Validity of the approach, design and strategies adopted by the project

Interview with ILO staff knowledgeable of the project design process revealed that the Building Sound Industrial Relations for Sustainable Development and Competitiveness project emanated from the Decent Work Country Programme (2014-2015) of Ethiopia. As such, an evaluation of the design process should focus on the DWCP document from which the immediate objectives, outputs as well as specific activities of the current project were extracted.

A review of the DWCP shows that several consultations were held between the Government, Employers' and Workers' organizations, the ILO and other stakeholders to identify the country's decent work priorities. The Ministry of Labour and Social Affairs (MoLSA), the Ethiopian Employers Federation (EEF) the Confederation of Ethiopian Trade Unions (CETU) played key roles in this process. It was further revealed that the country priority outcomes took into consideration the strategic plans of CETU and EEF as well as policies and development programs of the country.

CETU and EEF leaders interviewed at the federal level for this evaluation expressed strong satisfaction with the project design. They reported that the project adequately reflected their organization's priorities and was in line with their respective strategic plans. Moreover, they are of the opinion that the specific activities planned under the project are designed in such a way as to lead to the achievement of the project's immediate objectives as well as the broader needs of the stakeholder organizations. In fact, they point out that this is a key strength of the project. It should be noted here that the responses were mostly about the contents of the project itself rather than the design of this particular project. Regarding the latter, interviewees did not recall much, and thus were not able to provide detailed feedback.

At the branch level responses regarding the content of the project are similar to those found at the federal level. Knowledge of the design process, however, widely varied. As can be expected, some of the interviewees were certain that most projects are designed with the participation of the umbrella organizations (CETU and EEF) at the federal level and brought down to the branch levels for implementation. Interviewees at some branches reported that they assume that projects that they implement are designed with the participation of their umbrella organization while few

reported that they did not have any information regarding the design process. Despite the fact that the project is well in line with their needs, interviewees at some of the branch offices of CETU and EEF felt that better ownership, implementation and overall success would have been achieved if they were directly involved in the design of the project.

It was further pointed out that the activities that were designed to contribute to achievement of Immediate Objective Two: Improved implementation of labour legislation and ratified conventions for better industrial relations and working conditions, particularly those that relate to building the capacity of legislator and the judiciary leave some gaps related to formal legal training at the tertiary level. One of the interviewees for this evaluation commented that legal education in Ethiopia pays limited attention to labour relations, international conventions, and laws, as well as the laws of the land in this regard.

While it might be difficult for a project of this size to be directly involved in such activities, it may be able to advocate for or support such education through MOLSA, which is a key stakeholder of the project. Finally, it should be noted that the project's objectives to "promote realization of better terms and conditions of service for enhanced productivity and competitiveness" are difficult to evaluate under the scope of this project, mainly due to the fact that the means of verification, i.e "assessment report" is neither specific enough, nor possible to compile given the paucity of data regarding terms and conditions of service and worker's livelihood at the national level.

- Impact and Progress Indicators

The project document starts out by clearly stating its expected impact. Harmonious industrial relations and effective implementation and compliance with labour legislation, competitiveness and sustainability achieved through higher productivity, and better terms and conditions of service are the three impact areas. It further specifies progress and impact indicators, and as such, it is well organized. It clearly specifies nine outputs under its two immediate outcomes, sets indicators for all outputs, and specifies the means of verification.

However, the project does not specify any of the above for the twelve indicative activities it proposes under the two immediate objectives. Moreover, none of the nine outputs as well as the twelve indicative activities have quantified targets attached to them. For instance, while the project document specifies that the number of trade unions and employers' associations established will be used as an indicator, it does not stipulate how many such associations are planned to be set up, and as a result, makes evaluation of achievements difficult, if not impossible.

This gap seems to have been remedied when it comes to the implementation agreements signed with CETU and EEF. Examination of the terms of reference of these agreements show that responsibilities, tasks, allocation of finances, as well as quantified targets and reporting mechanisms are clearly set.

- Geographic Appropriateness

The geographical locations that were visited during this evaluation (Harar, Dire Dawa, Amhara, Tigray) seemed to share a number of characteristics including having large and expanding urban centres, large working populations, as well as good working relationships, particularly between CETU and EEF, and the respective regional governments. On the other hand, some differences are witnessed in terms of the dominant sub-sector covered by the stakeholders. For instance, Harar EEF reported having a large number of Small and Micro Enterprises (SMEs) and hotels as member, while Amhara EEF counted a significant number of businesses in the water sector as its membership. Yet again, Mekele CETU reported that a large number of the workers it represents are employees in the manufacturing sub-sector, which themselves range from companies employing slightly more than ten to more than a thousand.

When interviewees were asked if the project design was appropriate for their geographical locations, the responses were invariably affirmative. All of the stakeholders reported that the designed interventions addressed some of their many outstanding needs. Even though it is related more with operational details rather than project design, the only exception to this response was the process of employment of consultants funded by the project. Interviewees in the various EEF branch offices explained that the employment process took too long because it was being carried

out at the head office in Addis Ababa. It was argued that this approach does not take into consideration the geographical distribution of the branch offices. As per the interviewees, advertising the vacancy for the employment of consultants at Addis Ababa is not likely to be effective because professionals based there might be reluctant to relocate to the regional states for short term employment opportunities.

It was further argued that even those who move are likely to quit their posts as opportunities arise in the capital Addis Ababa, or when they are faced with different working conditions than they are used to. Moreover, the interviewees stressed that the employment process should have been conducted by the branch offices of EEF, as they are more cognizant of their own needs. This centralized approach has had obvious impacts on effectiveness as most of the consultants employed for the EEF branch offices worked only for 8 to 9 months instead of the planned one year. In fact, this was made possible only after EEF changed its approach and carried out the employment process locally. In contrast to EEF, the various CETU branch offices were able to advertise vacancies for the consultant position locally as well as in Addis Ababa and proceed to employ qualified candidates without much delay. Moreover, the interviewees were highly appreciative of the performance of the employed consultants.

What was found to be even more important than geographical differences was the capacity differences between CETU and EEF in general, as well as the differences among the various EEF branch offices. Visits made for this evaluation to the branch offices as well as interviews demonstrated that the CETU branch offices generally covered much larger geographical areas than the EEF branch offices, and thus have acute mobility needs. On the other hand, some of the EEF branch offices have very low membership (for instance Dire Dawa has only 61 and Mekelle only 58 members), while others like Harrar have a large number of members (more than 500). Not only that, some of the smaller EEF branches are also poorly organised in terms of manpower and office. Thus, they are likely to need basic technical support, before they can fully make use of the other capacity building components, such as trainings.

Hence, recognizing the fact that the project intervention areas are appropriate to all geographical regions, this evaluation found that prioritization of interventions based on the capacities of the

stakeholders as well as their various branch offices would strengthen implementation, impact as well as sustainability.

▪ Assessment of Risks

The project document has identified the following risks and made corresponding assumptions. The risks as well as the assumption were evaluated by the National Project Coordinator (NPC) throughout the project life time. The following table summarizes the risk assessment based on a review of the various project progress reports as well as interviews with the NPC and leaders of stakeholders.

Table 2: Evaluations of Risks and Assumptions

Risk	Assumption	Evaluation of risk
The May 2015 general election may affect political commitment of the government and the industrial relations environment	The Government of Ethiopia will continue to be committed to promotion of Social Dialogue and to improving industrial relations and working conditions in the country.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ The election passed without bearing risks on the industrial relations environment. ▪ CETU and EEF officials at the federal as well as regional levels stated that they continue to have very strong working relationship with the Federal MoLSA as well as its regional bureaus and that this relationship has not been negatively affected during or after the election
Project partners in particular EEF and CETU, MoLSA, Regional BoLSAs are assumed to commit themselves in promoting Social Dialogue and peaceful industrial relations in the country.	Limited capacity of workers' and employers to effectively engage in social dialogue	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ The project designed in such a way as to mitigate this risk by building the capacity of stakeholders through basic technical support as well as trainings. ▪ Despite this, the internal progress report documents show that the risk was present throughout the project life as the partners had low capacity to engage in social dialogue. ▪ While it was found during this evaluation that the activities aimed at building capacity for social dialogue among the partners have been meaningful, the

		capacity gaps still persist, given the low level of education among many union leaders, widespread lack of awareness about labour legislation at the basic union level, and lack of interest among some employers to engage in social dialogue
--	--	--

The second half of 2016 saw demonstrations and widespread unrest in the country, particularly in Oromia and Amhara national regional states. This coincided with the last several months of the project implementation schedule and negatively affected execution of some activities. Following the national state of emergency declared by the government, movement was limited in certain parts of the country and this led to the postponement of data collection activities planned as part of two research activities. Similarly, training activities that were planned to be delivered in different regions were delayed. According to interviews with the NPC, rescheduling activities minimized the impact of this event.

2.3 Project progress and delivery of results

- Outcome One: Strengthened Harmonious labour relations through social dialogue

According to the project design, this immediate objective has three major outputs, and 11 sub-outputs. At the outcome level, the indicator is the number of social dialogue forums established. At the start of the project, the only the Labour Advisory Board, established as per the Ethiopian Labour Proclamation No. 377/2003 operated at the Federal level. This labour law has been under revision and, the various stakeholders expected the revision to be completed sooner, and thus provide legal basis for the establishment of tripartite labour advisory boards at the regional and sectoral level. However, the revision was not completed, and this, according the NPC, led the focus of the project to shift towards tasks that can be accomplished within the existing legal framework of the country.

Hence, embarking on the establishment of Tripartite Forums at regional levels, one such forum was established in Oromia National Regional State. In this regard, the Mekelle branch of CETU reported that a tripartite memorandum of understanding was signed to deliberate on issues of industrial relations. However, further interviews with the regional BOLSA revealed that the

signed agreement was only in relation to functioning of the regional Labour Relations Board. According to interviews with both CETU and BOLSA in Mekelle, even though there were initiatives to form tripartite industrial relations bodies at the regional as well as woreda-levels, the lack of legislation governing the initiative has caused the initiative to cease. It was also found out that dispute resolution committees, some of whose members have benefitted from trainings given through this project, exist at the woreda level. While there is no proclamation regarding these committees, they are established as a result of a business process re-engineering conducted in the regional BOLSA.

The other project activities carried out under outcome one are as follows:

1. **Establishment of Labour Relations Boards:** a study on the effectiveness of Labour Relations Boards was commissioned by the project in Oromia Regional State. It was found that there were only two such boards in the entire regions, which was found to be inadequate given the geographical size of the region and the number of workers and enterprises in the region. Hence, the project facilitated the establishment of four new Labour Relation Boards in the region.
2. **Capacity building of CETU and EEF:** following a capacity assessment of CETU and EEF offices, the project funded the employment of fourteen consultants (1 for each head office at the seven regional offices) that could give technical support. In addition, 12 offices of these partners were supplied with basic office equipment. Moreover, the project supported the opening of a CETU branch office in Kombolcha and four EEF sub-branches in Amhara. Finally, the four new LRBs established in Oromia were supplied with the same basic office equipment as above.
3. **Trainings:** a total of 733 persons, including newly elected TU representatives, newly elected General Supreme Council, and Executive Committee members, EEF board members and experts, as well as tripartite partners from Federal and Regional levels were provided trainings on issues of tripartism and social dialogue. In addition, training of trainers (TOT) was provided for 20 participants from tripartite constituents, and training

focusing on mutual gains of collective bargaining was provided for 45 participants. A training package with an industrial relations work book, participant's handbook, and trainer's guide was developed and distributed as part of the TOT.

- Outcome Two: Improved implementation of labour legislation and ratified conventions for better industrial relations and working conditions

The project document specifies three major areas of intervention under this outcome. The first focuses on putting in place institutional support to strengthen freedom of association, unionization, collective bargaining and dispute settlement. While the second and third focus on building the capacity of social partners, judiciary and the legislature, and other relevant stakeholders on the implementation labour legislation and ratified conventions, and promoting the realization of better terms and conditions of service for enhanced productivity and competitiveness. The achievements are as follows:

- 1. Translation of core ILO convention and labour standards:** one of the major capacity gaps identified by the project as well as through interviews for this evaluation is low level of awareness regarding ILO core conventions ratified by Ethiopia, and specific issues such as labour standards and rights at work. The project funded and facilitated the translation of these core conventions and ILS to Amharic, Oromifa and Tigrigna, which will enable a large segment of the population to potentially access and understand these documents.
- 2. Capacity Building of LRBs and Social Partners:** two manuals on case handling and mediation and conciliation were prepared and distributed to LRB member. Moreover, 106 members of all LRBs in the country were trained on the basics of labour law and case handling and mediation/conciliation. In addition, partners were trained on ILS, labour law, dispute resolution and case handling in cooperation with ITC-ILO. The training on ILS and constitutional obligations focused on how to address implementation gaps and to participate actively in the procedures of standard setting, submission, ratification, and supervision with emphasis on reporting. The second training was on ILS for judges and legal educators, and addressed the issues of how to use international

labour law to resolve domestic labour issues, and judicial use of ILS on key areas.

3. **Strengthening Institutions:** during the project life time, 507 new TUs with coverage of 72,479 workers were established in different parts of the country by CETU, and 2 employers' organizations (Hotel and Tourism and SME) were organized at the national level by EEF.

This evaluation has not found reporting of activities on two of the planned intervention areas, namely, (1) prepare/amend model MOU (workplace cooperation agreement) to be used at enterprise level, and (2) conduct survey on existing terms and conditions of service, validate and publish it. Regarding the first, it was found that MOLSA has already developed a model agreement and thus, was not necessary to repeat the process.

Hence, the evaluation concludes that, based on the fact that most of the planned outputs (save the above four) were delivered, the level of project achievement has been satisfactory. However, judgment cannot be passed regarding meeting of indicator targets as these were not fully specified at the beginning of the project. The table below presents details of achievements by each output area.

- Attribution of Results to Project Activities

This evaluation attempted to find out to what extent the above identified results can be attributed to the activities of the project intervention. While this was made difficult, particularly at the regional level, due to inability of some interviewees to parse out the interventions of this project from their overall operations (including those emanating from other ILO-run projects in CETU and a Norwegian funded project in EEF), clear indications of attributability are found in many cases.

Results related to office equipment supply are obvious, and thus we will not dwell on those. Regarding the employment of personnel for CETU and EEF, interviewees stressed that it had a significant impact on their operation, particular in terms of allowing them to organize more of their members. The interviewee at Bahir Dar CETU explained this as follows:

...We were very lucky in this regard. The employed expert organized some 50 trade unions in the short time she worked here. She later had to resign due to personal reasons, and we felt her absence seriously. We could not continue the work or organizing with the same intensity. We have now filled the vacancy and hope the work will continue...

Similar sentiments are reflected among interviewees in EEF Dire Dawa, EEF Harar, and CETU Mekele, all of whom stressed that the newly employed personnel have significantly improved their capacities regarding the registration of new members (EEF) and organizing unions (CETU). Furthermore, the various CETU branches covered in the evaluation directly attributed the improved knowledge of union and federation leaders to the various training given by the project. This, they say, is demonstrated by the fact that several union leaders no longer ask support from the branch offices regarding industrial relations issues, as they are now able to handle these by themselves.

- Gender Issues

This evaluation was not able to access gender-segregated data regarding specific project intervention areas. However, interviewees stated that their day-to-day operations in relation to this project are gender-sensitive. For instance, all CETU branches stress that they always specify that unions and federations make sure that at least half of the members that are chosen for trainings are women. A similar approach is taken when facilitating the election of union leaders. More indirectly, the study has found that women-dominated industries such as textile and garment factories and hotels are well represented among unions as well as employers' organizations. Hence, women working in these enterprises as well as women employers could have potentially benefitted from the project.

Despite this, it should be noted that the under-representation of women in the partner organizations persists. An interview with the training and education head at CETU revealed that women remain reluctant to be elected into offices at the trade union level, often fearing domestic repercussions. This remark is confirmed by the field observation, which revealed that women

leaders are very rare in the boards of EEF branches as well as the leadership and professional corps, who number very few, of CETU. Nonetheless, potential to bring gender issues to the forefront of industrial relations are not rare. Both in Bahir Dar and Mekelle interviewees indicated the existence of women-only trade unions,

2.4 Efficiency of resource use

As per the final financial report obtained from the ILO CO, the total budget allocated for the project was USD 795,356.20 (see annex II for details). As can be seen from the table below, a large portion of the budget (USD 517,814.48), which is about 65% of the total budget, was allocated to immediate objective one. On the other hand, immediate objective two was allotted only USD 79,038.45 (about 10% of the total budget). Overall, three-quarters of the budget was directly allocated to program activities, while the remaining quarter was allocated to project management and program support and provision for cost increase.

Table 3: Total Budget in USD for Major Project Activities

Major Item	Budget	Utilized
1. Strengthened Harmonious labour relations through social dialogue.	517,814.48	471,301.65
2. Improved implementation of labour legislation and ratified conventions	79,038.45	74,015.10
3. Project Management	106,516.00	86,731.41
4. Programme Support Costs and Provision for Cost Increase	91,987.27	80,712.92
Total	795,356.20	712,761.09

In terms of adequacy of financial resources, the NPC stated that the overall budget was adequate to execute the planned activities. However, she explained, the distribution favoured immediate objective one. The second immediate objective included some cost intensive activities, including extensive trainings and the translation of core conventions and ILS to three local languages. Hence, the NPC explained, some of the allotted funding had to be reallocated within the same immediate objective. The financial report shows that almost all the planned budget for the output “*Promote realization of better terms and conditions of service for enhanced productivity and competitiveness*” had been reallocated to other activities.

Regarding utilization, it was found out that, overall, some 90% of total budget for the project had been utilized by the end of the project. Project management had a lower utilization at 81%, while immediate objective two had the highest, at 94%. About 91% and 88% of the allocated budget for immediate objective one and programme support costs and provision for cost increase had been utilized by the end of the project.

On the issue of possible alternative uses of the available resources, interviews conducted for this evaluation showed that the best possible use of financial resources was made in almost all cases. The only reservation came from the NPC. She stated that most of the trainings for the project were conducted in venues that are relatively costlier, and thus, had a different strategy been followed (such as renting less expensive venues, conducting training in-town so that accommodation costs can be reduced, etc), the project would have been able to train more people. This, according to the NPC, was done to attract participants, who tend to be reluctant to sit through trainings that are provided in less attractive venues.

In light of the above discussion, this evaluation found that the project had fairly efficient and effective use of resources.

2.5 Organizational management arrangements

Overall policy and technical issues of the project were overseen by the Project Advisory Committee (PAC) composed of high-level officials from CETU, EEF and ILO. The day-to-day implementation of the project, on the other hand, was supported by the Technical Working Group (TWG), which was constituted by members from CETU, EEF and ILO. Internally, the project was managed by a National Project Coordinator (NPC), responsible for the day to day operations and management of the project. The NPC as well has finance and administrative assistant who were responsible for ensuring that ILO financial rules and regulations are adhered to. The Project team operated under the overall supervision of the ILO Country Office Director.

The fieldwork has found that these bodies have operated effectively. Interviews have shown that minor differences within the TWG were solved amicably and productively. The NPC elaborated that she has received all necessary support from members of the TWG and was able to establish

strong partnership with both CETU and EEF, making it easier to discharge her duties.

A similarly positive feedback is obtained from one of a CETU representative in the TWG. He stated that the project has been managed smoothly, where implementation agreements were signed promptly, and monies released on time. Once reports have been accepted by ILO, he added, the remaining amount of funding was released quickly, enabling the effective implementation of activities. However, he added that there was a delay at the beginning of the project, which led to shortage of time for the implementation of some activities. The NPC attributes the delay, partly to the late employment of the NPC and a finance and administration assistant, and partly to the significant capacity gap of the partners at the branch level, which extended the time needed to complete the capacity assessment. Overall, this evaluation found that the project had effective management arrangements.

2.6 Impact orientation and sustainability

This evaluation found that project activities oriented towards bringing about noticeable impact, and potentially, lead to sustainability. Localization of core conventions and ILS, strengthening of existing branches and establishment of new branches and sub-branches of partner organizations, as well as trainings on industrial relations issues were all aimed at critical gaps felt by the stakeholders themselves and, and the implementation has already begun to pay off. Field visits made for this evaluation have revealed the following about sustainability in three major areas:

1. Technical capacity building: as already noted, the branch offices visited have greatly benefitted from the supply of computers, printers and fax machines. However, there are no branch-level plans put in place to replace these as they get old, or pay for maintenance. Harar EEF reported that the fax machine it received broke down few months after receipt, was sent back to the dealer in Addis Ababa for maintenance, but was never received back.
2. Employment of personnel: both CETU and EEF reported that this activity has had significant impact on their operations. However, while those employed by CETU worked for 12 months funded by the project, and were retained by the organization afterwards as agreed in the implementation contract, this was not the case in EEF. First, the consultants

worked 7 to 9 months because of the above explained delay in employment. Second, only two of the consultants were retained by EEF. The latter organization explains that it was not able to continue the contracts of the consultants because of limited financial capacity. This negatively affects the sustainability of the projects impacts, particularly, given that financial capacity can only be raised by improving service to members.

3. Trainings: it was found that most of the trained persons in EEF and CETU are still available in the organizations, and thus their contribution is still being felt. Moreover, all of the visited CETU offices and some of the EEF offices kept copies of training modules and translated conventions readily available. Hence, knowledge transfer is evaluated to be sustainable in this regard. Nonetheless, there is a clear risk in the longer-term due to expected turnover of trained staff.
4. Unionizing: notable success has been gained in unionizing workers in various regions with the support of the employed consultants. However, this success faces serious sustainability challenges. First, the branch offices are not able to provide the necessary follow-up for the newly established unions. Second, the low level of union density nationally means CETU itself has serious capacity limitations, which are exacerbated by the irregular collection of payments. In some cases, the newly organized unions are not members of the sectoral federations since the individual members are reluctant to start paying membership fees.

The evaluation further found that some branches aspired for strengthening their financial capacities including raising the number of their members, increasing membership fees, and engaging in income generating activities, such as providing trainings. However, there were no concrete plans drawn up, and even the above activities seemed to need significant external support, either from ILO, regional governments, or other donor organizations. Nonetheless, given the active role played by consultants employed by this project to increase the capacity of the branch offices (for instance in Harrar EEF, the consultant is responsible for designing a project to organize an exhibition and bazaar), this evaluation concludes that the current project has made some contributions towards attempts at financial independence.

A key issue that is likely to affect impact and sustainability in regard to EEF is lack of clarity and unified strategic direction regarding the relationship between branches and the federal organization, as well as management of both. At least two of the branches visited for this evaluation have raised strong concerns regarding the above issues that seem to fall out of the scope of the evaluation. In addition, it was noted that quite a few of the board members in EEF branch offices are managers (and in some cases, not members of the top-level management), instead of relevant employers. This affects impact and sustainability of the project as well as strength of the organization since such board members may not be able to fully engage in the activities of the Federation. For instance, Harrar EEF had to restructure its board because some of its members left the organizations they were representing.

2.7 Lessons learned

The evaluation sought to collect information regarding what the various social partners considered good practices of the project, and also what they thought should be avoided. At the national level, there was a clear indication that both CETU and EEF felt that the project took into consideration their needs as identified by the DWCP. Moreover, they stated that their involvement both in the PAC and TWG was an important positive lesson to be replicated by other projects.

Interviews with the NPC revealed that, despite smooth communication with stakeholders, working with multiple partners in several regions poses challenges, particularly in scheduling of activities, such as trainings. She elaborates that this problem was overcome only through planning activities well in advance of their execution and being accommodating of unforeseen changes.

At the branch level, perhaps the most important lesson raised is the fact that ILO conducted physical visits to assess the capacity of the offices. Interviewees stated that they were able to express their needs clearly during the visit and they believe that this led, particularly, to the material support they received. The NPC and other interviewees from ILO confirm the importance of the visit. According to them, the personal visit allowed them to have a clear picture of the state of the offices and the pace with which the project can progress.

Finally, a repeatedly raised issue at the branch level is the need for ILO (and other agencies) to work directly with the branch offices, not only at the implementation stage, but also starting from project design. The evaluation has found that there is a lack of awareness among the leadership of branch offices regarding projects, which is reflected in the confusion vis-à-vis project titles and partners. Almost all interviewees at the branch level stated that they did not have access to the complete project document, and some received it immediately before this evaluation. This has the potential to create isolated goals at the local level. They further stress that if at least part of the project is designed in consultation with them, they will be able to articulate their specific needs and design a time-frame suited to their capacity.

3 Conclusions

This internal evaluation was conducted with the aim of providing a final assessment of the project in achieving the project objectives and delivery of results; strategies and implementation modalities chosen; partnership arrangements, constraints, and opportunities as well as providing recommendations for future similar projects in terms of strategies, institutional arrangements, and any other area. To meet these objectives, primary data were collected through seven individual interviews conducted with CETU and EEF leaders in Addis Ababa, Dire Dawa, Harrar, Mekelle; group discussions with EEF Mekelle leaders, and Tigray BOLSA staff, and interviews with ILO CO staff.

The evaluation found that the project intervention areas are directly relevant to GTP I as well as GTP II. In both policy documents, labour relations feature as one of the seven cross-cutting issues, and expanding social dialogue is presented as a central goal. Moreover, the project activities are aimed at achieving two of the decent work country programme outcomes namely; (i) relevant conventions on labour standards ratified, enforcements and implementation improved; and (ii) strengthened Harmonious labour relations through social dialogue.

The project started out by conducting an assessment of the project partners and found out that they had critical needs related to basic office facilities, man-power, and awareness of labour relations issues including organizing, collective bargaining, and social dialogue. Hence, the

project undertook capacity building activities that addressed many of these needs. Nonetheless, the human capacity gap at the branch level persists. None of the branch offices covered under this evaluation have more than two professional staff in addition to the office head, office space is very much limited, and existing financial capacity, as well as the capacity to raise funding is very weak. In addition, by facilitating the establishment of many unions, the project has created new needs of follow up and training. CETU leaders further explain that the inauguration of industrial parks and the construction of many more is likely to create new needs of organizing, bargaining, and social dialogue.

While the evaluation has found the project interventions to be generally appropriate for all geographical areas visited, it was found that the wide capacity differences between branch offices of the constituents has made some of the interventions more crucial to some than others. For instance, at least two of the EEF branch offices visited were found to be very weak, and thus more in need of basic technical and equipment support. While, the trainings are likely to have some impact in these offices, their weak capacity may limit the effectiveness of the trainings.

The evaluation also found that while the project took proper stock of risks, the 2016 widespread unrest in the country negatively affected the implementation of some activities, including trainings and completion of studies.

Almost all project activities under the two immediate objectives were implemented on time and to the desired level. In relation to the establishment of social dialogue forums, the planned activities cannot be accomplished due to the delay in the revision of the Ethiopian Labour Proclamation No. 377/2003, which governs such bodies. Thus, the project shifted towards the establishment of Tripartite Forums at regional levels. Overall, the evaluation concludes that, based on the fact that most of the planned outputs were delivered, the level of project achievement has been satisfactory.

The project also found that allocation of financial resources was somewhat fair, and their use was efficient. However, given the number of activities under outcome 2, a better delivery would have been possible had the project initially allocated more funding for the outcome.

The evaluation found that both broad strategic management as well as technical details were effectively managed through the PAC and TWG. The NPC was able to effectively discharge her duties in cooperation with the TWG as well as ILO CO staff. However, it was found that an initial delay in project commencement had moderately affected delivery of activities. In the part of CETU and EEF branch office, some gap in communication with the national organizations was witnessed, particularly among the latter.

Finally, the evaluation found that all project activities were impact-oriented and some are likely to be sustainable. However, serious financial and manpower capacity gaps of the social partners and their branch offices are likely to pose sustainability challenges.

4 Recommendations

The following recommendations are made for the social partners:

1. ILO

- a. There is a need to localize the country priority areas identified as part of the DWCP. Hence, the ILO country office should aspire to involve branch offices of CETU and EEF in the project design process. This is likely to solve some of the ownership and project awareness issues noticed during the evaluation process.
- b. Project targets, indicators, as well as data sources need to be made more specific and be customized to each project, instead of relying on those developed for the DWCP.
- c. The country office should ensure that the budget allocated for each outcome is commensurate with the financial requirements of the designed activity.

2. CETU

- a. The capacity of the visited offices is significantly low as compared to their geographical area of coverage. CETU should plan for capacity building in terms of qualified manpower, vehicles, and office space, if these offices and workers are to benefit from other awareness-oriented activities sustainably.

- b. The branch offices have local opportunities, such as accessing land from local governments for construction that could help in capacity building. CETU should plan and assist such initiatives. In the long term, CETU should revisit its organizational structure to accommodate such developments and avail branches resources that are commensurate with their responsibilities.
- c. The country's workforce is expanding rapidly. CETU should proactively engage in unionizing efforts. This would not only benefit workers, but also increase its financial capacity and leverage.

3. EEF

- a. Serious disagreements between some branch offices and the national office, as well as organization issues were raised during the evaluation process. EEF needs to solve this urgently and amicably if it is to have a meaningful role in labor relations.
- b. Some of the visited offices are severely understaffed and underequipped, verging on non-existent. This needs to be solved urgently if these offices are to implement any additional projects of the current scale.
- c. Some of the branch offices have shown initiative to raise finances on their own by providing paid trainings for their members or organizing exhibitions and bazaars. The head office needs to support such initiatives and expand them to other branches, where possible.

- 4. **Government:** The construction and inauguration of industrial parks is a valuable opportunity to creating peaceful industrial relations as it brings together a large number of employers and workers in a limited geographical area. This could make organizing and training workers and employers easier. The government should incorporate space requirements or workers and employers' organizations in the planning of such parks.

5 Annexes

Annex I: Achievement of Planned Outputs

	Planned	Achieved
Immediate Objective One: Strengthened Harmonious labour relations through social dialogue.		
Output 1.1 Tripartite consultation system strengthened at Federal level and established at Regional and Sectoral levels.		
1.1.1 Develop guidelines/manuals to guide the functions of regional tripartite advisory body.		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Manual on the functions of LRB prepared and distributed.
1.1.2 Organize consultation forums for the tripartite constituents to promote the importance of tripartism.		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Workshops to promote tripartism and mutual gains bargaining was conducted for members of regional BOLSAs, MOLSA, CETU and EEF
1.1.3 Establish CETU and EEF structures/offices at regional level.		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> One new branch office established by CETU in Kombolcha, Amhara Regional state Four new sub-branch offices established by EEF Amhara Branch office
1.1.4 Establish tripartite advisory bodies at regional level.		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> One Tripartite Industrial Relations Forum Established in Oromia Region
1.1.5 Build the human and material capacity of tripartite constituents.		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Six EEF and six CETU branch offices supplied with office equipment (Computers, printers, fax machines and scanners) Four LRBs in Oromia were supplied with the same equipment as above. Fourteen consultants (7 for each constituent) that could give technical support and strengthen EEF and CETU were employed.
Output 1.2 Effective Bipartite dialogue system established at national, sectoral and enterprise level.		
1.2.1 Prepare/amend model MOU (workplace cooperation agreement) to be used at enterprise level.		-----
1.2.2 Train enterprises on social dialogue and workplace cooperation	20	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Six rounds of trainings for 293 newly elected TU representatives Two rounds of training programs were provided for 250 newly elected General Council and 60 Supreme Council and Executive Committee members

1.2.3 Lobby enterprises to establish bipartite dialogue system and sign MOUs		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Incorporated in all promotion of social dialogue components of the project
1.2.4 Promote the establishment of six labour tribunals at regional level		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Four new Labour Relation Boards (LRBs) established in Shashemene, Holeta, Jimmma and Oromia Special Zone- Addis Ababa
Output 1.3 Capacity of tripartite constituents enhanced to effectively engage in social dialogue.		
1.3.1 Conduct training needs assessment on social dialogue and hold national workshop to validate it		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Capacity gap assessment conducted at all patternner office locations
1.3.2 Prepare training manuals and organize trainings for tripartite constituents and targeted enterprises		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Two rounds of training programs were organized for 85 EEF board members and experts from 13 branches ▪ One round of training was organized for 45 tripartite partners from Federal and Regional level on tripartism and social dialogue.
Output 1.4 Improved capacity of social partners and enterprises to effectively engage in collective bargaining.		
1.4.1 Prepare training package on collective bargaining and organize national workshop to validate it		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ One training package developed with an industrial relations work book, participant's handbook, and trainer's guide
1.4.2 Conduct TOT on collective bargaining		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ TOT provided for more than 20 participants from tripartite constituents
1.4.2 Roll out training on collective bargaining for Social partners and managers and workers representatives of targeted enterprises		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Forty-five participants trained on collective bargaining with special emphasis on mutual gains collective bargaining.
Output 1.5 Improved labour dispute resolution system and enhance capacity for labour dispute settlement at enterprise level.		
1.5.1 Prepare training material on dispute prevention and resolution and validate it		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Training material developed as part of training package. ▪ Documentary film trailers were developed to share experiences of enterprises that have exemplary industrial relations practices
1.5.2 Conduct TOT		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Training conducted as part of training package.
1.5.3 Roll out training dispute prevention and resolution		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Training programs were organized on thematic areas of industrial relations wherein dispute

		resolution is one major component.
Immediate Objective Two: <i>Improved implementation of labour legislation and ratified conventions for better industrial relations and working conditions.</i>		
Output 2.1 Institutional support in place to strengthen freedom of associations, unionization, collective bargaining, and dispute settlement.		
Activities 2.1.1 Prepare training manuals to conduct trainings on freedom of association, unionization, collective bargaining, and dispute settlement		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Training material developed as part of training package.
2.1.2 Conduct training for trade unions' and employers' associations' freedom of association, unionization, collective bargaining and dispute settlement.		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Training programs were organized on thematic areas of industrial relations wherein freedom of association is one major component.
2.1.3 Give technical assistance to workers and employers organization to establish workers and employers organizations at sector and enterprise levels.		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> 507 new TUs were established with coverage of 72,479 workers in the time span of the project. Two employers' organizations (Hotel and Tourism and SME) were organized at the national level by EEF.
Output 2.2 Capacity of social partners, judiciary and the legislature, and other relevant stakeholders strengthened on the implementation labour legislation and ratified conventions.		
2.2.1 Translate and publish key conventions into the main local languages		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Eight core ILO Conventions and other ILS translated to Amharic, Oromifa and Tigrigna
2.2.2 Train legislators, members of the executive, judges, employers and workers on the implementation of ratified conventions.		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> One hundred six members of all labour relations boards in the country trained for five days. Manual on mediation and conciliation process was prepared and distributed. Judges and legal educators trained on labour issues and ILS.
Output 2.3 Promote realization of better terms and conditions of service for enhanced productivity and competitiveness.		
Activities 2.3.1 conduct survey on existing terms and conditions of service, validate and publish it		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Realizing better terms and conditions of service promoted as a crosscutting theme in all trainings. Survey not conducted.

Annex II: Financial Report

	Task Description	Total-Budget	Current Balance
-1	Strengthened Harmonious labour relations through social dialogue.	517814.48	46512.82
-1.1	Tripartite consultation system strengthened at Federal level and established at Regional and Sectoral levels.	47705.09	368.28
32.0 01	Organize consultation forums for the tripartite constituents to promote the importance of tripartism	25089.34	358.53
1.1.1	Develop guidelines/manuals to guide the functions of regional tripartite advisory body.	22615.75	9.75
1.1.2	Organize consultations to validate the guide	0	0
-1.2	CETU and EEF structures/offices at regional level Established/Strengthened	93355.93	9217.23
1.2.1	Carry out comprehensive needs and capacity gap assessment of the current structures of EEF and CETU in all regions and Federal level	10274.77	0
1.2.2	Select priority regions to establish EEF and CETU structures	1.92	1.92
1.2.3	Purchase necessary equipments to strength the EEF and CETU offices	32185	0
1.2.4	Provide technical support to strengthen EEF and CETU regional offices	15000	7670.98
1.2.5	Conduct workshop on the role of Employers' and Workers' Organizations	35894.24	1544.337013
-1.3	Tripartite advisory bodies established at regional level	69280	6279.06
1.3.1	Select pilot regions to establish tripartite advisory bodies and labour tribunals	0	0
1.3.2	Conduct comprehensive needs and capacity gap assessment of selected BOLSAs to establish and lead functional advisory body	7720	0.9
1.3.3	Carry out consultations meetings with key partners	23580	5576.5
1.3.4	Purchase the necessary equipments to set up the advisory body offices	11980	16.66
1.3.5	Provide technical support to the regions	0	0
1.3.6	Conduct workshop on the role of tripartite advisor bodies.	26000	685
-1.4	Human and material capacity of tripartite constituents built	131648.46	4325.10853
15.0 01	ILO Staff mission cost	12984	2911
1.4.1	Conduct study tour to visit countries with good system of service delivery, social dialogue, dispute settlement, collective bargaining machineries etc.	34000	877
1.4.2	Carry out capacity gap assessment of EEF and CETU and undertake existing and potential members needs.	4574	179
1.4.3	Conduct trainings to CETU and EEF to address the identified gaps	15100.46	44.36
	Provide technical and financial support to develop portfolio of	48524	298.7485303

1.4.4	services to be provided by CETU and EEF to their existing and potential members		
1.4.5	ILO staff mission to support the partners	16466	15
-1.5	Effective Bipartite dialogue system established at national, sectoral and enterprise level.	19749	2
1.5.1	Carry out rapid assessment to identify the state of social dialogue in selected enterprises and establish best practices	0	0
1.5.2	Prepare and develop model recognition and collective agreements.	0	0
1.5.3	Conduct training on social dialogue	19749	2
1.5.4	Lobby enterprises to establish bipartite dialogue system	0	0
1.5.5	Promote the establishment of six labour tribunals at regional level	0	0
-1.6	Capacity of tripartite constituents enhanced to effectively engage in social dialogue.	106597	12118.24
1.6.1	Conduct study on the state of social dialogue, collective bargaining, unionization, freedom of association, dispute prevention and settlement in the country	44057	1189.96
1.6.2	Conduct training needs assessment on social dialogue, collective bargaining, unionization, freedom of association and dispute settlement & prevention	0	0
1.6.3	Prepare Trainer's guide and Learner's manuals on social dialogue, collective bargaining, unionization, freedom of association and dispute settlement & prevention	40930	262.28
1.6.4	Hold national workshop to validate the study and training manuals	10000	10000
1.6.5	Organize Pilot trainings for tripartite constituents and targeted enterprises	11610	666
-1.7	Improved capacity of social partners and enterprises to effectively engage in collective bargaining.	34212	2941.89
1.7.1	Prepare posters, leaflets on collective bargaining	14232	263.89
1.7.2	Conduct TOT on collective bargaining based on the guide developed (activity 1.6.3)	0	0
1.7.3	Roll out training on collective bargaining for Social partners and managers and workers representatives of targeted enterprises	19980	2678
-1.8	Improved labour dispute resolution system and enhance capacity for labour dispute settlement at enterprise level	15267	11261
1.8.1	Prepare posters, leaflets other promotional materials on dispute prevention and resolution	1122	0
1.8.2	Conduct TOT based on the guide developed (activity 1.6.3)	4145	1261
1.8.3	Roll out training dispute prevention and resolution	10000	10000
-2	Improved implementation of labour legislation and ratified conventions for better industrial relations and working conditions.	79038.45	5023.35
-2.1	Institutional support in place to strengthen freedom of associations, unionization, collective bargaining and dispute settlement.	46012.45	154.35
	Prepare promotional materials on freedom of association,	20975	130

2.1.1	unionization, collective bargaining and dispute settlement		
2.1.2	Conduct training for trade unions' and employers' associations freedom of association, unionization, collective bargaining and dispute settlement based on the guide developed (activity 1.6.3).	13991.45	14.45
2.1.3	Give technical assistance to workers and employers organization to establish workers and employers organizations at sector and enterprise levels.	11046	9.9
-2.2	Capacity of social partners, judiciary and the legislature, and other relevant stakeholders strengthened on the implementation labour legislation and ratified conventions.	33016	4859
2.2.1	Translate and publish key conventions into the main local languages	3353	1
2.2.2	Train legislators, members of the executive, judges, employers and workers on the implementation of ratified conventions, reporting	29663	4858
-2.3	Promote realization of better terms and conditions of service for enhanced productivity and competitiveness.	10	10
2.3.1	Conduct survey on existing terms and conditions of service	0	0
2.3.2	Conduct validation workshop	0	0
2.3.3	Publish studies	10	10
-3	Project Management	106516	19784.58
17.0 5	Monitoring and Evaluation	15634	9648.19
32.0 05	Seminar on M&E	0	0
-3.1	Staff Costs	83216	9440.39
3.1.1	National Officer(NOA step1)	39276	3754.38
3.1.2	Admin (G5 step 1)	25000	3057.92
3.1.3	Driver (G2 step 1)	18940	2628.08
-3.2	Operational Costs	7666	696
3.2.1	Security costs	0	0
3.2.2	Sundries	4660	169
3.2.3	Maintenance and fue	3006	527
-4	Programme Support Costs and Provision for Cost Increase	91987.27	11274.35
-4.1	Programme Support Costs and Provision for Cost Increase	91987.27	11274.35
68.0 01	PSC	91437.96	10725.04
4.1.1	Provision for cost increase	549.31	549.31
	Total	795356.2	82595.11381