



ILO EVALUATION

- **Evaluation Title:** Final Evaluation of “An Integrated Model for the Elimination of Worst Forms of Child Labour (WFCL) in Seasonal Agriculture in Hazelnut Harvesting in Turkey”
- **ILO TC/SYMBOL:** TUR/15/01/NLD; TUR/15/02/CAB
- **Type of Evaluation :** Final Internal Evaluation
- **Country(ies) :** The Republic of Turkey – (Ordu, Düzce, Sakarya and Şanlıurfa Provinces)
- **Date of the evaluation:** 25 February 2018
- **Name of consultant(s):** TANOVIC, Lejla
- **ILO Administrative Office:** ILO Office for Turkey
- **ILO Technical Backstopping Office:** ILO/IPEC
- **Other agencies involved in joint evaluation:** N/A
- **Date project ends:** 15 September 2017 TUR/15/01/NLD
31 December 2017 TUR/15/02/CAB
- **Donor: country and budget US\$** The Netherlands EUR 270.000
CAOBISCO EUR 645,000
- **Evaluation Manager:** BERBER AGTAS, Özge
- **Key Words:** Child labour, seasonal agriculture work, rights of the child

This evaluation has been conducted according to ILO’s evaluation policies and procedures. It has not been professionally edited, but has undergone quality control by the ILO Evaluation Office

Table of Contents

List of Acronyms	4
Executive Summary	5
1. Introduction	13
1.1. Project Background and Context	13
1.2. Project Objectives	14
1.3. Logics of Intervention	14
1.4. Funding and Organisational Arrangements	15
2. Evaluation Background	16
2.1. Purpose of the Evaluation	16
2.2. Scope and clients of the Evaluation	17
2.3. Evaluation Standards	17
2.4. Operational Sequence of the Evaluation	18
3. Evaluation Methodology	18
3.1. Evaluation Criteria and Questions	18
3.2. Methodological Tools	19
3.3. Limitations of the Evaluation	20
3.4. Rationale for Stakeholder Participation in the Evaluation Process	20
3.5. Structure of the Report	20
4. Review of Implementation	21
5. Main Findings	29
5.1. Relevance and Design	29
5.2. Effectiveness	29
5.3. Efficiency	33
5.4. Sustainability and Impact Potential	35
5.5. Lessons learned and emerging good practices	36
5.6. Gender Concerns	36
6. Conclusions	37
7. Recommendations	37
7.1. Linking Conclusions with Recommendations	38

Appendices

TORs, Field Mission Schedule, List of publications used and cited

Disclaimer

The views expressed are those of the evaluator and do not necessarily represent any official view of ILO or the Government of target country.

Acknowledgements

The evaluator would like to express her sincere gratitude to all the key informants for their invaluable kindness and generosity in providing information and sharing their views.

Special thanks go to Mrs. Özge Berber Agtas, Evaluation Manager; Assoc. Prof. Murat Gürkan Gülcan, Education Coordinator of the Project; Mr. Nejat Kocabay, Senior Programme Officer; and Mrs. Ceren Ababay Tosyalı, Project Assistant, for their continuous support and precious advice.

List of Acronyms

CAOBISCO:	Association of Chocolate, Biscuit and Confectionery Industries of Europe
CLMM:	Child Labour Monitoring Mechanism
CSR:	Corporate Social Responsibility
DC:	Development Cooperation
DWA:	Decent Work Agenda
DWCP:	Decent Work Country Programme
GDP:	Gross Domestic Product
HAK-İŞ:	HAK-IS Trade Union Confederation
IPEC:	International Programme on the Elimination of Child Labour
İŞKUR:	Turkish Employment Agency
ILO:	International Labour Organization
MNE:	Multinational Enterprise
MoLSS:	Ministry of Labour and Social Security
MoNE:	Ministry of National Education
NSC:	National Steering Committee
PAC:	Provincial Action Committee
P&B:	Programme and Budget
RBM:	Results-Based Management
SDGs	Sustainable Development Goals
ToC:	Theory of Change
ToRs:	Terms of Reference
TURKSTAT:	Turkish Statistical Institute
TÜRK-İŞ:	Confederation of Turkish Trade Unions
UN:	United Nations

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

Project Background and Objectives

The National Programme on the Elimination of Child Labour 2017-2013 recognizes child labour as one of the most important problems in the Republic of Turkey (Turkey). According to the results of the 2012 Child Labour Force Survey conducted by the Turkish Statistical Institute (TURKSTAT) quoted by the said Programme, the employment rate of children in the age group of 6-17 working in economic activity in Turkey was 5.9%, with a total of 890 thousand child workers.¹ The most recent statistics on child population provided by TURKSTAT give an account of child population of 22 million 891 thousand and 140 of the total population of 79 million 814 thousand and 871 at the end of 2016. Child population which includes 0-17 age group constituted 28.7% of the total population in 2016.²

The share of agriculture in total employment in Turkey stood at 24.6 percent in 2012.³ Child labour statistics reveal that children employed in agriculture constitute the biggest portion of working children, i.e. 44,7 percent of total working children (38,4 percent of working boys and 58,4 percent of working girls).⁴ The National Employment Strategy 2014-2023 defines paid employment in mobile and temporary agricultural works except family businesses” within the agriculture as one of the worst forms of child labour and identifies it as one of the primary intervention areas.⁵

Work in agriculture is correlated with seasonal migration. In majority of the cases, children of seasonal agricultural workers migrate with their families, and contribute to family livelihoods by working in agriculture. Child labour in general, and particularly in agriculture, threatens physical and mental health of children, as well as their social and educational development. It is associated with school non-attendance or early drop out, which keep them trapped in poverty and deprivation. According to the National Programme on the Elimination of Child Labour 2017-2023 most common difficulties regarding the child labour in agriculture are attendance in compulsory primary education, compliance to working age standards and implementation of minimum age in working life. About 35 percent of children that dropped out of school are working in economic activities.⁶

Since several years, Turkey has acknowledged the existence of child labour in agriculture and has adopted and implemented a number of policy and legal measures to address this phenomenon in line with the ILO Minimum Age Convention, 1973 (No. 138) and the ILO Worst Forms of Child Labour Convention, 1999 (No. 182). Recognition of importance and complexity of the child labour issue, as well as a commitment to address this issue in addition to existing legal provisions and

¹ National Programme on the Elimination of Child Labour 2017-2013, p. 10

² Statistics on Child, 2016. Press Release. Turkish Statistical Institute. No: 24645, 21 April 2017.
<http://www.turkstat.gov.tr/PreHaberBultenleri.do?id=24645>

³ The Tenth Development Plan 2014-2018, p.98

⁴ National Employment Strategy 2014-2023 p 54.

⁵ Ibid p 54.

⁶ Ibid p 37.

measures indicated in the Tenth National Development Plan 2014-2018 and the National Employment Strategy 2014-2023 and respective action plans, can also be found in the National Time-Bound Policy and Programme Framework for the Elimination of the Child Labour (2005-2015) updated for the 2017-2023 period and respective National Programme on Elimination of Child Labour 2017-2023; the Prime Ministry Circular No 2017/6 on Seasonal Agricultural Workers; and the Circular No 2016/5 on Access to Education of Children of Seasonal Agricultural Workers and Nomadic or Semi-Nomadic People of the Ministry of National Education.

Collaboration in addressing the child labour issue between the ILO and Turkey goes back to 1992, when Turkey was among the first six countries to join the ILO's International Programme on the Elimination of Child Labour (IPEC), and subsequently ratified the ILO Minimum Age Convention, 1973 (No. 138) and the Worst Forms of Child Labour Convention, 1999 (No. 182) in 1998 and 2001 respectively.

The most recent example of such collaboration, includes public-private partnership (PPP) projects: the "Elimination of Worst Forms of Child Labour in Seasonal Agriculture in Hazelnut Harvesting in Ordu", and the "Integrated Model for the Elimination of Worst Forms of Child Labour in Seasonal Agriculture in Hazelnut Harvesting in Turkey", which are financially supported by the Association of Chocolate, Biscuit and Confectionery Industries of Europe (CAOBISCO)⁷ and the Government of the Netherlands. This project is the first and unique example of a PPP modality applied to DC project implementation in Turkey.

The project aims to contribute to the elimination of the worst forms of child labour in seasonal agriculture in hazelnut harvesting in Turkey in line with the National Employment Strategy 2014-2023. The project is being implemented jointly by the Ministry of Labour and Social Security of Turkey and the ILO. The project is planned to run for 30 months (July 2015 – December 2017).

The overall objective of the projects is to contribute to elimination of worst forms of child labour (WFCL) in seasonal agriculture in line with the Government's strategy drawn by the National Employment Strategy 2014-2023.

The main purpose of the project as per the Evaluation ToRs was to enhance national and local capacity for the removal of children from the worst forms of child labour in seasonal agriculture in hazelnut production in Turkey and prevention of at-risk children from entering such work through the capacity building of public institutions, development of monitoring mechanism and establishment of partnerships including public/private partnership (PPP). The project would sustain the strategic intervention model elaborated under the previous project and scale it up in other regions which would in turn contribute the policy making process for the elimination of WFCL in seasonal hazelnut agriculture in Turkey.

During the project duration it was expected to achieve three interlinked and mutually supportive outputs, as follows:

⁷ Contributing members of CAOBISCO to the ILO PPP Project: Ferrero, Nestlé, August Storck KG, Barry Callebaut, Alfred Ritter GmbH & Co. KG, Mars incorporated, Chocosuisse, NATRA S.A., Griesson - de Beukelaer GmbH & Co., Cémoi chocolatier, Gebr. Jancke GmbH, Neuhaus NV, Stollwerck GmbH, Koenig Backmittel GmbH

Output 1/ Capacity Building: The capacity of national and local institutions in targeted provinces has been improved in planning, managing, coordinating, monitoring and implementing activities for the elimination of WFCL in seasonal agriculture in hazelnut harvesting.

Output 2/ Direct Intervention: Direct support mechanism towards all actors of harvesting process-children, families, intermediaries and garden owners has been established and implemented for effective withdrawal and prevention.

Output 3/ Awareness-raising: A communication plan targeting all actors of the harvesting process, the public and the media has been developed and implemented.

The project has prioritized education as the main approach to eliminate child labour in seasonal agriculture and adopted a dual strategy for removal of working children from WFCL and prevention of at-risk children to enter such work, by providing them with educational and rehabilitative services.

Purpose, Scope and Clients of the Evaluation

The main purpose of this evaluation is to assess the results of the work done in order to properly report on the results as well as define the steps for possible further project development to promote elimination of worst forms of child labour in seasonal agriculture in Turkey. Furthermore, the evaluation aims to assess the effectiveness, efficiency and relevance of the project in the period 2015-2017, to contribute to organizational learning and make recommendations for improvement on further implementation, so as to secure the sustainability of achieved results at the end of the project. It would help to define what and how the ILO Office for Turkey contributed in the development of a comprehensive national policy for elimination of worst forms of child labour, improvement of institutional and technical capacities of national and local public institutions, raising the awareness of the families, employers, public institutions and the general public about elimination of child labour in seasonal agriculture sector (Ordu, Sakarya, Düzce and Şanlıurfa).

The present evaluation has been conducted from 20th November 2017 to 15th February 2018, under the supervision of the ILO Evaluation Manager, Mrs Özge Berber Agtas.

The scope of the evaluation is the ILO project “An Integrated Model for the Elimination of Worst Forms of Child Labour (WFCL) in Seasonal Agriculture in Hazelnut Harvesting in Turkey”, which is consisted of two projects (TUR/15/01/NLD and TUR/15/02/CAB) The evaluation will cover the projects as a whole, for the period from July 2015 - December 2017.

The evaluation will serve the following clients’ groups:

- ILO management, project team members and programming staff and national and local partners, and
- National and local partners as well as tripartite constituents in Ankara and selected pilot provinces, Ordu, Sakarya, Düzce and Şanlıurfa.

Methodology of the Evaluation

The evaluation was conducted in the following phases:

- i) a documentation review (desk research), where preliminary material was collected and analysed, and
- ii) a field phase, where information and additional material were collected and interviews were held with ILO management and technical staff and local stakeholders,
- iii) a documentation review (desk research) where additional material was collected and analysed, and
- iv) a drafting phase, which output is the present draft report;
- v) a final phase, where comments from all stakeholders will be analysed and incorporated.

The main sources of information for the evaluator have been interviews, literature review and site visits.

Main Findings

Main Findings are structured according to the evaluation criteria of relevance and design; effectiveness; efficiency; and sustainability and impact.

Project Relevance and Design

The project prioritize education as means for eradication of WFCL seasonal agriculture. It is in line with the national policies and regulations and agreed ILO areas of cooperation, as well as with the ILO defined priorities and broader international agendas. It complements efforts of the governments in addressing WFCL and corresponds to the needs of children working in seasonal agriculture, their families, host communities, stakeholders and constituents through a combination of “upstream” policy work and “downstream” work, which is visible through the project achievements to be elaborated further in the Report.

Concerning the project design, a well-built logical framework would help in avoiding the risk that a project becomes a series of sporadic activities with no real logical linkages.

Project Effectiveness

OUTPUTS /EXPECTED RESULTS ON CAPACITY BUILDING

1. National and local institutional capacities to plan, manage, coordinate, monitor and implement activities against child labour in seasonal agriculture will be improved.

One of the prerequisites for any intervention to achieve expected results is the level of national commitment and willingness to tackle the issue addressed by the project. While the objective of this evaluation is not to assess the efforts of the government at either level, it has to be said that without these prerequisites the intervention would not be successful. The worst forms of child labour is a multi-dimensional phenomenon, involving a broad range of actors; and addressing all of its dimensions requires high motivation, complete freedom from vested interests, as well as availability of resources, both human and financial.

The project was very successful in strengthening national capacities in planning, coordination, implementation and monitoring of activities against child labour in seasonal agriculture. Structured dialogue enabled all stakeholders to address gaps and seek solutions in unison.

Two indicators of the project were not met i.e. (four) provincial action plans and Strategic Plans of respective Municipalities (2015-2019) due update, are still missing, even though the project reported that in the case of the latter measures targeted for these plans were included in the National Programme on the Elimination of Child Labour (2017-2023).

Unless decided by the beneficiaries at provincial level that there was no need for provincial action plans, a transition phase could be used to assist the PACs to develop their respective plans.

OUTPUTS ON DIRECT SUPPORT/EXPECTED RESULTS ON WITHDRAWAL AND PREVENTION

2. Withdrawal and prevention through education and counselling services to targeted children and their families will be provided by the end of the project.

As regards the outreach activities aimed at children and families of seasonal workers the figures demonstrate that the project was very successful and exceeded initially set targets. It is understood that such extraordinary results requiring intense field work could be hardly achieved without efforts and synergic work of all stakeholders at local level, and particularly dedicated teachers and project collaborators.

3. Corporate social responsibility will be promoted throughout the supply chain of hazelnuts.

Significant number of enterprises, intermediaries and garden owners in supply chain of hazelnut production received counselling services and training on WFCL, as part of corporate social responsibility (CSR) component. The figures again demonstrate that initially set targets for enterprises and rural intermediaries exceeded originally planned indicators. The intervention is also a good example of corporate social responsibility and demonstrates how multinational companies, working in partnership with ILO constituents, can achieve sustainable progress in eliminating child labour in their supply chains and support withdrawal of children from WFCL. Should the project enter the next phase a special project component could be devoted to CSR and child labour built on good practices and lessons learnt to develop a tool for the promotion of CSR policy.

OUTPUTS / EXPECTED RESULTS ON AWARENESS RAISING

4. A Communication Plan will be developed and operational by the first year and national and local capacity to conduct advocacy and public awareness, and policy dialogue enhanced by the end of the programme.

The awareness raising activities have promoted better knowledge and increased awareness on child labour and WFCL and actions and achievements of the project not only in targeted regions, but also country wide, thereby contributing to enhanced understanding of adverse impact of child labour in general and particularly in agriculture on children health and development, but also in shaping general public opinion and people mindsets.

Project Efficiency

The project has brought about highly satisfactory results in term of cost-benefits and use of resources, and has also allowed for a good degree of freedom in the planning and implementation of activities.

Project Sustainability and Impact Potential

From the outset there is evidence that the integrated strategic model approach adopted by the project is conducive to longer-term sustainability of interventions aimed at eradication of WFCL due to its capacity to mobilise and provide buy-in of key stakeholders at national and local levels. By successfully mobilising a range of stakeholders at national and local levels, the project has managed to lay the basis for potential sustainability and buy-in to the integrated strategic model amongst a range of actors.

In order to achieve longer-term effects, PACs and CLMM should be replicated in other provinces to complement the MoNE's efforts with the full implementation of the MoNE's Circular, as key policy tool in eradication of child labour in agriculture in Turkey, in ensuring satisfactory monitoring of children of seasonal agriculture workers.

Lessons learned and Good Practices for Future Application

1. Education is essential to fight and eliminate child labour, but the basic conditions, such as infrastructure need to be in place.
2. Continuity and replication of the project achievements in other regions and agriculture production are required in order to take advantage of results and outputs developed under the project, provided that specific conditions and particularities of each region are taken into consideration.
3. The project experience and know-how could be replicated both country wide and globally, based on the project achievements, which need to be consolidated through further collaboration.
4. In order to be fully successful there is a need for a follow-up of the project once it is completed.
5. The project supported socialization and social inclusion of children withdrew or prevented from WFCL.

Gender Concerns:

The project mainstreamed gender aspects into its interventions and set very clear targets in terms of percentage of girls and boys to benefit from education and referral services, as well as in terms of number of mothers to benefit from the project. Figures related to girls and boys benefiting of the services provided by the project are almost equal.

Majority of key respondents emphasised great importance attached to gender equality during the project implementation and some were of opinion that girls were positively discriminated against boys.

Conclusions

1. The project contributed to the elimination of the worst forms of child labour in seasonal agriculture in line with the Government Strategy, yet the worst forms of child labour in agriculture remain a challenge in targeted regions requiring further attention and follow-up by key stakeholders and the ILO to consolidate gains, with more focus on Şanlıurfa Province to address the challenge at its source.
2. The project is highly relevant to the priorities spelt out in national strategies and the integrated strategic model promoted by the project has proved to be conducive to longer-term sustainability of interventions aimed at eradication of WFCL, owing to effective mix of policy and outreach work supported by structured stakeholders' dialogue and intense awareness raising activities.
3. Logical linkages between objectives and expected results and activities need to be more pronounced in the project design.
4. Partnership between public and private sector in the elimination of child labour has been added value to the project and has further emphasised the important role of multinational enterprises (MNEs) in eradication of child labour and potentials of PPPs in social mobilization around legally and socially unacceptable practices.
5. Social mobilization proved to be a powerful tool in promoting better understanding of harmful effects of child labour and particularly of WFCL on child's health and development.

Recommendations

1. To consolidate gains of the project through a follow-up activities in targeted regions with more focus on Şanlıurfa Province to address the challenge at its source.
2. To scale-up up the integrated strategic model in other agriculture regions with high potentials for involving child labour in agriculture through a programme and PPP initiatives.
3. When designing interventions it is always advisable to use logical framework approaches, as they illustrate the logical process from problem analysis to activities and help to understand how and why a desired change is expected to happen in a particular context, thus strengthening coherence and effectiveness of actions.
4. To further promote corporate social responsibility and child labour-free businesses in the spirit of the ILO Declaration on Multinational Enterprises (MNEs) through public private partnerships (PPPs) and engagement f employers' and business' associations.
5. To continue social mobilization and awareness-raising on legally and socially disapproved practices related to child labour.

Linking Conclusions with Recommendations

Conclusions	Recommendations	To whom?
1. The worst forms of child labour in agriculture remain a challenge in targeted regions, which require further attention and follow-up by key stakeholders and the ILO to consolidate gains, with more focus on Şanlıurfa Province to address the challenge at its source.	To consolidate gains of the project through a follow-up activities in targeted regions with more focus on Şanlıurfa Province to address the challenge at its source.	ILO Country Office National and local partners Tripartite constituents in Ankara and selected pilot provinces, Ordu, Sakarya, Düzce and Şanlıurfa.
2. The integrated strategic model proved to be conducive to longer-term sustainability of interventions aimed at eradication of WFCL, owing to effective mix of policy and outreach work supported by structured stakeholders' dialogue and intense awareness raising activities.	To scale-up up the integrated strategic model in other agriculture regions with high potentials for involving child labour in agriculture through a programme and PPP initiatives.	ILO Country Office MoLSS
3. Logical linkages between objectives and expected results and activities need to be more pronounced in the project design.	To use logical framework approaches, as they illustrate the logical process from problem analysis to activities and help to understand how and why a desired change is expected to happen in a particular context, thus strengthening coherence and effectiveness of actions.	ILO Country Office
4. Partnership between public and private sector in the elimination of child labour has been added value to the project and has further emphasised the important role of multinational enterprises (MNEs) in eradication of child labour and potentials of PPPs in social mobilization around legally and socially unacceptable practices	To further promote corporate social responsibility and child labour-free businesses in the spirit of the ILO Declaration on Multinational Enterprises (MNEs) through public private partnerships (PPPs) and engagement of employers' and business' associations.	ILO Country Office Employers' associations Agriculture Chambers Chambers of Commerce
5. Social mobilization proved to be a powerful tool in promoting better understanding of harmful effects of child labour and particularly of WFCL on child's health and development.	To continue social mobilization and awareness-raising around legally and socially unacceptable practices related to child labour.	ILO Country Office Trade Unions

1. INTRODUCTION

1.1. Project Background and Context

The National Programme on the Elimination of Child Labour 2017-2023 recognizes child labour as one of the most important problems in the Republic of Turkey (Turkey). According to the results of the 2012 Child Labour Force Survey conducted by the Turkish Statistical Institute (TURKSTAT) quoted by the said Programme, the employment rate of children in the age group of 6-17 working in economic activity in Turkey was 5.9%, with a total of 890 thousand child workers.⁸ The most recent statistics on child population provided by TURKSTAT give an account of child population of 22 million 891 thousand and 140 of the total population of 79 million 814 thousand and 871 at the end of 2016. Child population which includes 0-17 age group constituted 28.7% of the total population in 2016.⁹

The share of agriculture in total employment in Turkey stood at 24.6 percent in 2012.¹⁰ Child labour statistics reveal that children employed in agriculture constitute the biggest portion of working children, i.e. 44,7 percent of total working children (38,4 percent of working boys and 58,4 percent of working girls).¹¹ The National Employment Strategy 2014-2023 defines paid employment in mobile and temporary agricultural works except family businesses” within the agriculture as one of the worst forms of child labour and identifies it as one of the primary intervention areas.¹²

Work in agriculture is correlated with seasonal migration. In majority of the cases, children of seasonal agricultural workers migrate with their families, and contribute to family livelihoods by working in agriculture. Child labour in general, and particularly in agriculture, threatens physical and mental health of children, as well as their social and educational development. It is associated with school non-attendance or early drop out, which keep them trapped in poverty and deprivation. According to the National Programme on the Elimination of Child Labour 2017-2023 most common difficulties regarding the child labour in agriculture are attendance in compulsory primary education, compliance to working age standards and implementation of minimum age in working life. About 35 percent of children that dropped out of school are working in economic activities.¹³

Since several years, Turkey has acknowledged the existence of child labour in agriculture and has adopted and implemented a number of policy and legal measures to address this phenomenon in line with the ILO Minimum Age Convention, 1973 (No. 138) and the ILO Worst Forms of Child Labour Convention, 1999 (No. 182). Recognition of importance and complexity of the child labour issue, as well as a commitment to address this issue in addition to existing legal provisions and measures indicated in the Tenth National Development Plan 2014-2018 and the National Employment Strategy 2014-2023 and respective action plans, can also be found in the National

⁸ National Programme on the Elimination of Child Labour 2017-2013, p. 10

⁹ Statistics on Child, 2016. Press Release. Turkish Statistical Institute. No: 24645, 21 April 2017.

<http://www.turkstat.gov.tr/PreHaberBultenleri.do?id=24645>

¹⁰ The Tenth Development Plan 2014-2018, p.98

¹¹ National Employment Strategy 2014-2023 p 54.

¹² Ibid p 54.

¹³ Ibid p 37.

Time-Bound Policy and Programme Framework for the Elimination of the Child Labour (2005-2015) updated for the 2017-2023 period and respective National Programme on Elimination of Child Labour 2017-2023; the Prime Ministry Circular No 2017/6 on Seasonal Agricultural Workers; and the Circular No 2016/5 on Access to Education of Children of Seasonal Agricultural Workers and Nomadic or Semi-Nomadic People of the Ministry of National Education.

Collaboration in addressing the child labour issue between the ILO and Turkey goes back to 1992, when Turkey was among the first six countries to join the ILO's International Programme on the Elimination of Child Labour (IPEC), and subsequently ratified the ILO Minimum Age Convention, 1973 (No. 138) and the Worst Forms of Child Labour Convention, 1999 (No. 182) in 1998 and 2001 respectively.

The most recent example of such collaboration, includes public-private partnership (PPP) projects: the "Elimination of Worst Forms of Child Labour in Seasonal Agriculture in Hazelnut Harvesting in Ordu", and the "Integrated Model for the Elimination of Worst Forms of Child Labour in Seasonal Agriculture in Hazelnut Harvesting in Turkey", which are financially supported by the Association of Chocolate, Biscuit and Confectionery Industries of Europe (CAOBISCO)¹⁴ and the Government of the Netherlands. This project is the first and unique example of a PPP modality applied to DC project implementation in Turkey.

1.2. Project Objectives

The project aims to contribute to the elimination of the worst forms of child labour in seasonal agriculture in hazelnut harvesting in Turkey in line with the National Employment Strategy 2014-2023. The project is being implemented jointly by the Ministry of Labour and Social Security of Turkey and the ILO. The project is planned to run for 30 months (July 2015 – December 2017).

The overall objective of the projects is to contribute to elimination of worst forms of child labour (WFCL) in seasonal agriculture in line with the Government's strategy drawn by the National Employment Strategy 2014-2023.

1.3. Logics of the Project

The main purpose of the project as per the Evaluation ToRs was to enhance national and local capacity for the removal of children from the worst forms of child labour in seasonal agriculture in hazelnut production in Turkey and prevention of at-risk children from entering such work through the capacity building of public institutions, development of monitoring mechanism and establishment of partnerships including public/private partnership (PPP). The project would sustain the strategic intervention model elaborated under the previous project and scale it up in other regions which would in turn contribute the policy making process for the elimination of WFCL in seasonal hazelnut agriculture in Turkey.

During the project duration it was expected to achieve three interlinked and mutually supportive outputs, as

¹⁴ Contributing members of CAOBISCO to the ILO PPP Project: Ferrero, Nestlé, August Storck KG, Barry Callebaut, Alfred Ritter GmbH & Co. KG, Mars incorporated, Chocosuisse, NATRA S.A., Griesson - de Beukelaer GmbH & Co., Cémoi chocolatier, Gebr. Jancke GmbH, Neuhaus NV, Stollwerck GmbH, Koenig Backmittel GmbH

follows:

Output 1/ Capacity Building: The capacity of national and local institutions in targeted provinces has been improved in planning, managing, coordinating, monitoring and implementing activities for the elimination of WFCL in seasonal agriculture in hazelnut harvesting.

Output 2/ Direct Intervention: Direct support mechanism towards all actors of harvesting process-children, families, intermediaries and garden owners has been established and implemented for effective withdrawal and prevention.

Output 3/ Awareness-raising: A communication plan targeting all actors of the harvesting process, the public and the media has been developed and implemented.

The project has prioritized education as the main approach to eliminate child labour in seasonal agriculture and adopted a dual strategy for removal of working children from WFCL and prevention of at-risk children to enter such work, by providing them with educational and rehabilitative services.

1.4. Funding and Organisational Arrangements

The project “An Integrated Model for the Elimination of the Worst Forms of Child Labour (WFCL) in Seasonal Agriculture in Hazelnut Harvesting in Turkey” is funded by the Government of the Netherlands in the amount of EUR 270,000 and the CAOBISCO in the amount of EUR 645,000. This project, along with the Phase 1 project is public private partnership (PPP).

Project activities are implemented in selected pilot provinces of Ordu, Sakarya, Düzce and Şanlıurfa. The Project Team is based in Ankara.

A Project Team (PT) has been established for the Project comprising:

- Mr. Nejat Kocabay, Senior Programme Officer
- Ms. Ceren Ababay Tosyalı, Project Assistant

In addition to the project team other collaborators were engaged to carry out the activities as per harvesting periods indicated below:

In the harvesting season of 2015, 73 persons undertook tasks under the project including 60 teachers - including 7 sub-field coordinators-, 2 social workers, 1 project site officer regarding administrative and registration matters, 1 communication specialist, 1 field coordinator and 8 cleaning personnel. In the harvesting season of 2016, 81 persons - 64 teachers including 6 sub-field coordinators, 1 social service expert, 13 cleaning personnel, 2 field coordinators and 1 education coordinator- undertook tasks under the project in the harvesting season of 2016.

In the harvesting season of 2017, 87 persons – 69 teachers including 6 sub-field coordinators, 2 field coordinators, 1 education coordinator, 1 communication specialist, 1 project consultant, 13 cleaning personnel, undertook tasks under the project in the harvesting season of 2017.

The project is backstopped by the ILO/IPEC based at the ILO Headquarters in Geneva, Switzerland.

As regards the governance mechanism, there is no project steering board; instead the guidance is being provided by a National Steering Committee (NSC), which is composed of key stakeholders and partners of the project namely, representatives of the Ministry of Labour and Social Security (MoLSS), workers' and employers' organizations and academy. Apart from the core members, representatives of the Ministry of National Education, the Ministry of Family and Social Policies, the Ministry of Development, the Ministry of Food Agriculture and Livestock, the Ministry of Health, Turkish Labour Agency, education unions, chambers, exporters associations, private sector and civil society organizations.

The National Steering Committee's meetings are held with the participation of local administrators of targeted provinces in the form of stakeholders' meetings in order to transfer knowledge and share experience among national and local level actors for better implementation of the project activities. Those meetings have been designed for the planning and evaluation of project activities prior to and following the hazelnut harvesting seasons. Since the start of the project, the NSC held 5 meetings on: 7th December 2015, 24th June 2016, 27th September 2016, 2nd June 2017, and 22nd November 2017.

Additionally, multi-stakeholder meetings and field visits have been organized in each harvesting season (2015-2016-2017) with the participation of the project donors in order to monitor project activities and share information. Besides these, ad-hoc meetings were also held (at least two meetings per harvesting season) under coordination of the MoLSS.

2. EVALUATION BACKGROUND

2.1. Purpose of the Evaluation

As ToRs (Annex 1) specify the evaluation of the projects on Elimination of Worst Forms of Child Labour (WFCL) in Seasonal Agriculture in Hazelnut Harvesting is part of the Monitoring and Evaluation Plan 2016-2017 of the ILO Regional Office for Europe and Central Asia.

The main purpose of this evaluation is to assess the results of the work done in order to properly report on the results as well as define the steps for possible further project development to promote elimination of worst forms of child labour in seasonal agriculture in Turkey. Furthermore, the evaluation aims to assess the effectiveness, efficiency and relevance of the project in the period 2015-2017, to contribute to organizational learning and make recommendations for improvement on further implementation, so as to secure the sustainability of achieved results at the end of the project. It would help to define what and how the ILO Office for Turkey contributed in the development of a comprehensive national policy for elimination of worst forms of child labour, improvement of institutional and technical capacities of national and local public institutions, raising the awareness of the families, employers, public institutions and the general public about elimination of child labour in seasonal agriculture sector (Ordu, Sakarya, Düzce and Şanlıurfa).

2.2. Scope and Clients of the Evaluation

The present evaluation has been conducted from 20th November 2017 to 15th February 2018, under the supervision of the ILO Evaluation Manager, Mrs Özge Berber Agtas.

The scope of the evaluation is the ILO project “An Integrated Model for the Elimination of Worst Forms of Child Labour (WFCL) in Seasonal Agriculture in Hazelnut Harvesting in Turkey”, which is consisted of two projects (TUR/15/01/NLD and TUR/15/02/CAB) The evaluation will cover the projects as a whole, for the period from July 2015 - December 2017.

The project was implemented in Ordu Province of East Black Sea Region with widened implementation in Düzce and Sakarya Provinces of West Black Sea Region and Şanlıurfa Province of South Eastern Anatolia.

The evaluation will serve the following clients’ groups:

- ILO management, project team members and programming staff and national and local partners, and
- National and local partners as well as tripartite constituents in Ankara and selected pilot provinces, Ordu, Sakarya, Düzce and Şanlıurfa.

2.3. Evaluation Criteria and Questions

The evaluation applied the key evaluation criteria of relevance, effectiveness, efficiency, sustainability and impact potential as per OECD/DAC Criteria for Evaluating Development Assistance.

Relevance

- Are the project activities relevant to the needs of child labour in seasonal agriculture, agriculture workers and their families, host communities, stakeholders and constituents?
- If the project was designed in accordance with needs of main target groups? If yes, how this was reflected in the project activities?

Effectiveness

- To what extent have the project objectives been achieved? What are results noted so far? Have there been any obstacles, barriers?
- What have been the intended and/or unintended results?
- What have been the major results/accomplishment of the projects?
- What were the major factors influencing the achievement or non-achievement of the objectives?
- Were the activities and outputs of the projects consistent with their overall objectives and has the quality of these outputs been satisfactory?
- Have there been any successes, innovations?

Efficiency

- Given the resources available (time, expertise, funds, knowledge and know-how), how economically have been the inputs turned into the outputs?

Sustainability and impact potential

- Are the results achieved likely to continue after the end of the project?
- Are they likely to produce longer term effects?
- What action might be needed to bolster the longer term effects?
- How the project envisages achievement of solutions for sustainable results?

Lessons learned and good practices for future application

- What are the lessons learned from the implementation?
- How these lessons should be assessed/ benefited in the formulation and implementation of a new phase?
- Are the results achieved likely to continue after the end of the project?
- Are they likely to produce longer term effects?
- What action might be needed to bolster the longer term effects?
- How the project envisages achievement of solutions for sustainable results?

2.4. Operational Sequence of the Evaluation

The operational sequence of the evaluation is summarized in Table 1 as follows:

Table 1. Operational Sequence of the Evaluation

Activity	21-30 Nov 2017	25-31 Jan 2018	1- 6 Feb 2018	6 - 20 Feb 2018	20-25 Feb 2018
Field mission/Interviews					
Desk Review					
Draft Report					
Comments					
Final Report					

The first draft of this report was prepared on 6th February 2018, for which feedback was received. The Report was finalized on 25th February 2018.

3. EVALUATION METHODOLOGY

3.1. Evaluation Standards

This evaluation was conducted in accordance with the ILO Evaluation Policy, ILO Policy Guidelines for Results-Based Evaluation, UN Evaluation Group (UNEG) Norms and Standards¹⁵ and OECD/DAC Criteria for Evaluating Development Assistance.

¹⁵ The UNEG guidelines note the importance of ethical conduct for the following reasons:

1. Responsible use of power: All those engaged in evaluation processes are responsible for upholding the proper

In accordance with ILO Guidance Note 4: “Considering gender in the monitoring and evaluation of projects”¹⁶ the gender dimension has been considered as a cross-cutting concern throughout the methodology, deliverables and final report of the evaluation. In terms of this evaluation, this implied involving both men and women in the consultation and evaluation analysis.

The evaluator reviewed data and information disaggregated by sex and gender and subsequently included in the report the relevance and effectiveness of gender-related strategies and outcomes to improve lives of women and men.

3.2. Evaluation Methods

A mix of data methods, such as desk review of the project-related documents and international and national policy frameworks; face-to-face interviews and direct observations, was applied.

Participatory character of the evaluation is reflected in a wide range of project stakeholders and members of other institutions that were considered as key informants (see Annex 2 for a list of key informants). The rationale for stakeholders' participation in the evaluation process is strengthened national ownership and commitment, and importance of stakeholders' inputs for the project achievements and sustainability of the project results.

The evaluation was conducted in the following phases:

- vi) a documentation review (desk research), where preliminary material was collected and analysed, and
- vii) a field phase, where information and additional material were collected and interviews were held with ILO management and technical staff and local stakeholders,
- viii) a documentation review (desk research) where additional material was collected and analysed, and
- ix) a drafting phase, which output is the present draft report;
- x) a final phase, where comments from all stakeholders will be analysed and incorporated.

The main sources of information for the evaluator have been interviews, literature review and site visits.

Literature Review

The evaluator has analysed ILO programmatic documents; international and national policy frameworks in relation to child labour and its worst forms; the project documents and related progress reports; other information on the child labour issue indicated in Annex 3.

Field visits

conduct of the evaluation.

2. Ensuring credibility: With a fair, impartial and complete assessment, stakeholders are more likely to have faith in the results of an evaluation and to take note of the recommendations.
3. Responsible use of resources: Ethical conduct in evaluation increases the chances of acceptance by the parties to the evaluation and therefore the likelihood that the investment in the evaluation will result in improved outcomes.

¹⁶ http://www.ilo.org/eval/Evaluationguidance/WCMS_165986/lang--en/index.htm

The purpose of the field visits was to explore stakeholders' commitment and attitudes, as well as to verify countries' priorities and experiences.

In addition to the meetings held in Ankara on 21-22 and 30 November 2017, the following field visits were conducted: Ordu 23-24 November 2017; Düzce and Sakarya 27-28 November 2017; and Şanlıurfa 29 November 2017. The orientation meeting at ILO Office in Ankara took place on 22nd November 2017, prior to the stakeholders' meetings.

Interviews

At general management level, interviews were held with the ILO staff at the ILO Office in Ankara.

At beneficiary level, interviews were held with: national/province/district/municipal authorities, and social partners and other relevant stakeholders and beneficiaries.

Face-to-face interviews were carried out during the field mission following a structured questionnaire. In total, 27 key informants (22M/5F) participated in interviews in Ankara and the provinces of Ordu (Altınordu, Perşembe and Ünye), Düzce (Çilimli and Akçakoca); Sakarya (Sakarya and Hendek) and Şanlıurfa. The Internal Evaluation Mission Programme shows the breakdown of informants per organization (available in Annex 2).

3.3. Limitations of the Evaluation

Despite efforts made to interview as many key informants as possible during the field missions, the mission time-frame and long distance to travel to reach the regions covered by the project prevented the evaluator to carry out interviews with donors' representatives and other UN and international organizations implementing child labour projects or being active in the area of child labour prevention and fight against its worst forms.

Moreover, the timing of the evaluation (autumn) was not conducive to interviews with parents and children involved in the project activities to get their first-hand experience about the relevance and impact of the project activities.

3.4. Rationale for Stakeholder Participation in the Evaluation Process

Participatory character of the evaluation is reflected in a wide range of project stakeholders and members of other institutions that were considered as key informants (see Annex 2 for a list of key informants). The reasons for stakeholders' participation in the evaluation process include:

- Strengthened national ownership and commitment,
- Importance of stakeholders inputs for impact and sustainability of the project results.

3.5. Structure of the Report

This report is structured in accordance with the ToRs and ILO Evaluation Office Guidelines for Evaluation Report requirements for evaluations. Section 4 of the Report provides a review of implementation, while Section 5 gives an overview of the main findings structured in line with the evaluation questions discusses the project's design and its relevance to national priorities; effectiveness, in particular the contribution of the results achieved to achieving the immediate

objectives (outcome); the project's efficiency, including the conversion of resources (financial and human) into results; the project's sustainability over time and makes some consideration on the impact, understood as the likelihood of achieving the development objective. It also includes gender concerns, intended as the capacity of the project to coherently pursue gender mainstreaming approaches, and discusses lessons learnt. This is followed by Section 6 on Conclusions and Section 7 on recommendations emerging from the project experience.

4. REVIEW OF IMPLEMENTATION

The project "Integrated Model for the Elimination of Worst Forms of Child Labour in Seasonal Agriculture in Hazelnut Harvesting in Turkey" is based on lessons learned and good practices from the earlier project on "Elimination of Worst Forms of Child Labour in Seasonal Agriculture in Hazelnut Harvesting in Ordu" which was implemented in the Ordu Province from 2012-2015.

The aim of the project is to replicate the strategic intervention model from referred project and scale up the project interventions in different regions of Turkey (Düzce and Sakarya Provinces of West Black Sea Region and Şanlıurfa Province of South Eastern Anatolia) with widened implementation in Ordu, and contribute to the sustainability of a child labour monitoring mechanism in seasonal agriculture.

Given the above, the project undergoing evaluation has been considered as the second phase of the previous project. The main rationale of the new phase was to strengthen national ownership for the sustainability of the integrated model through its replication in new regions and establishment of a school-based mechanism to monitor child labour. Western Black Sea Region (Hendek- Sakarya, Çilimli and Akçakoca - Düzce) was selected because of large presence of hazelnut production. The Province of Şanlıurfa, which is prominent as a sending province of seasonal agriculture workers has also been included for monitoring purposes within the scope of the project.


The agreement between the ILO and the Government of the Netherlands was signed in September 2015 for the project TUR/15/01/NLD duration from 15th September 2015 to 15th September 2017 and a no-cost extension has been made till the end of December 2017 with the Donor's consent; and the agreement between the ILO and CAOBISCO was signed in June 2015 for the project TUR/15/02/CAB between 1st December 2015 to 31st December 2017. The project funded by CAOBISCO has been extended for 4 months from 1st January to 30th April 2018 to smooth transition to a new phase¹⁷ with additional contribution of CAOBISCO and continuation of activities without break with the remaining funds until the end of April 2018. According to information available to the evaluator, upon the completion of the transition phase CAOBISCO will continue its support and a new phase of the project will start in May 2018 which will last till the end of 2020. The Government of the Netherlands will also continue to support the project.

A summary of outputs/expected results and activities can be found in the table further in the text, as follows:

¹⁷ No-cost extension phase.

Table 2. Summary of Project Outputs/Expected Results and Activities

TUR/15/01/NLD and TUR/15/02/CAB		
OUTPUTS /EXPECTED RESULTS ON CAPACITY BUILDING	MEASUREMENT CRITERIA	ACTIVITY RESULTS
1. National and local institutional capacities to plan, manage, coordinate, monitor and implement activities against child labour in seasonal agriculture will be improved	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ✚ Provincial action plans will be drawn up, implemented and regularly evaluated with the participation of all the stakeholders. ✚ Inputs will be provided to be incorporated to biannual (2016-2018) sectorial action plans part (agriculture) of the National Employment Strategy (2014-2023). ✚ Inputs will be provided to Strategic Plans of respective Municipalities (2015-2019) due mid-term updates. ✚ School-based Child Labour Monitoring Mechanism (CLMM) in selected schools in Şanlıurfa for the identification and referral of child labour cases established and operational by the end of the first year. 	<p>Activity 1.1: Establish a National Steering Committee and Action Committees at provincial level.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ A National Steering Committee (NSC) with key stakeholders and partners has been established at the central level. ○ Provincial Action Committees (PACs) have been established under the auspices of the Governors in Ordu, Sakarya, Düzce, and met prior and during the harvesting seasons of 2015, 2016 and 2017. ○ An orientation meeting for teachers was held in Ordu on 19 July 2016. ○ Workshop on “Responsible Business Practices in Food Supply Chains in the Context of International Conventions and Documents and the role of Trade Unions” with a specific focus on the elimination of child labour in seasonal agriculture was carried out on 27 September 2016. <p>Activity 1.2: Incorporate inputs in the National Employment Strategy (2014-2023) and Strategic Plans of respective Municipalities (2015-2019)</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Inputs based on the outcomes of the project were provided to biannual (2017-2019) sectorial action plans part (agriculture) of the National Employment Strategy (2014-2023). ○ Strategic Plans (2015-2019) and institutional structures of respective municipalities, including district municipalities, were reviewed and related measures to municipalities were assigned within the National Programme on the Elimination of Child Labour. ○ In parallel to the envisaged measures against child labour in seasonal agriculture in National Employment Strategy (2014-2023), the project contributed to the update of the Time Bound Policy and Programme Framework (TBPPF) for the elimination of WFCL and components of the strategic intervention model developed by the project were incorporated into the relevant parts of the National Programme on the Elimination of Child Labour (2017-2023). The projected supported preparatory work of launching 2018 as the year of combating child labour in Turkey and it was reflected

		<p>within the actions of the National Programme.</p> <p>Activity 1.3: Develop school-based Child Labour Monitoring Mechanism for the identification and referral of child labour cases</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ 20 primary and secondary schools in Şanlıurfa have been identified and 10 of them have been prioritized for the initial activities of the monitoring mechanism. Following the identification phase, a school-based CLMM has started to operate through tracking 50 targeted children in selected schools in Şanlıurfa. ○ MoNE Circular on “Access to Education of Children of Seasonal Agricultural Workers and Nomadic and Semi-nomadic Families” benefited from the ILO’s experience in the project by integrating main elements of established monitoring mechanism into the Circular, thus institutionalizing the project monitoring mechanism on legal basis. ○ 111 targeted children who regularly participated in education activities taken place in social support centres and reside in Şanlıurfa have been tracked. A sample group of families of those targeted children has been visited within the context of monitoring activities and collecting information on their route for seasonal agricultural work. ○ Training sessions for teachers on CLMM delivered in Şanlıurfa in February, March and September 2017 in cooperation with the Şanlıurfa Province Board for Monitoring the Children of Seasonal Agricultural Workers with aim to integrate referred trainings into the in-service trainings for teachers to ensure regular delivery and reach larger number of teachers. ○ Additionally, Konya, Sivas and Nevşehir provinces have been selected to extend monitoring activities and contribute to nation-wide implementation in other crop groups and locations. ○ Capacities on child labour monitoring of 302 teachers have been improved.
OUTPUTS ON DIRECT SUPPORT/EXPECTED RESULTS ON WITHDRAWAL AND PREVENTION	MEASUREMENT CRITERIA	ACTIVITY RESULTS
2. Withdrawal and prevention through education and counselling services to targeted children and their families will	 At least 1000 children (500 girls and 500 boys) and at least 300 families (250 mothers	<p>Activity 2.1. Identify 1,000 working and/or at risk children and provide on-site education, guidance, counselling, and rehabilitation services within the temporary settlement areas and coordinate/contribute provision of social, cultural, sports and</p>

<p>be provided by the end of the project.</p>	<p>and 50 fathers).</p>	<p>arts activities for the identified children. Necessary measures to be taken for enrolment of identified children to the formal education system if and when a prolongation of harvesting season occurs due to weather conditions.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Identification and referral services for the targeted children and families have been delivered through outreach activities composed of guidance, counselling and education services. Regular monitoring visits to project sites in Ordu, Düzce and Sakarya have been maintained during the harvesting periods of 2015, 2016 and 2017. ○ Education activities were carried out in collaboration with respective Governorates, District Governorates, Provincial/ District Directorates of National Education and Public Education Centres in 7 identified project sites in 2015-2016 and 8 identified project sites in 2017 for the period of one month. ○ 80% of children attended classes regularly. Some children could attend only for few days since their families were continuously moving from one place to another. ○ 1165 children (4-16 age groups) were reached in 2015, 719 of them (326 girls and 393 boys) were withdrawn or prevented from work through provision of education services, the rest benefited from other services. ○ 1200 children (4-16 age groups) were reached, 1015 of them (528 girls and 487 boys) were withdrawn or prevented from work through provision of education services, the rest benefited from other services. ○ 1125 children (4-16 age groups) were reached, 1064 of them (531 girls and 533 boys) were withdrawn or prevented from work through provision of education services, the rest benefited from other services. <p>Activity 2.2. At least 300 family members (250 mothers and 50 fathers) of child labourers and children at risk provided with counselling services for withdrawal and prevention</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ 1033 seasonal worker families in 2015; 1500 seasonal worker families in 2016; and 1050 seasonal worker families in 2017 were reached in targeted districts of Ordu, Düzce and Sakarya of which 202 families in 2015, 267 families in 2016 and 330 families in 2017 were provided with individual counselling, the rest was benefited from group counselling and training sessions.
<p>3. Corporate social responsibility will be promoted throughout the supply chain of</p>	<p>At least 300 employers and 30</p>	<p>Activity 2.3. At least 300 employers and 60 intermediaries trained on the elimination of WFCL and at least 60 model gardens identified and monitored through local</p>

hazelnuts.	<p>intermediaries will be trained and at least 30 model gardens will be identified and monitored.</p> <p>✚ At least 300 employers and 60 intermediaries will be trained on the elimination of WFCL and at least 60 model gardens will be identified and monitored through local partnerships including Governorates, Chambers of Agriculture, Provincial Directorates of Labour, Education, Family and Social Policies, Health, Security and Municipalities.</p>	<p>partnerships including Governorates, Chambers of Agriculture, Provincial Directorates of Labour, Education, Family and Social Policies, Health, Security and Municipalities.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ 75 employers (20 in Ordu; 55 in Düzce and Sakarya) and 41 intermediaries in 2015; 202 employers and 48 intermediaries (18 in Sakarya and Düzce; 30 in Ordu) in 2016; and 341 employers and 54 intermediaries (24 in Sakarya and Düzce; 30 in Ordu) in 2017 were provided with training on hazards of child labour in seasonal agriculture and legal responsibilities. ○ 104 model gardens were identified in the 2016 and 2017 harvesting seasons and 41 rural intermediaries (20 in Sakarya and Düzce; 21 in Ordu) were reached and provided with counselling and training sessions. In 2017, 60 targeted model gardens were monitored through local partners. ○ Links established with hazelnut producer companies at local level have been maintained in order to promote corporate social responsibility and touch upon all actors of the supply chain.
OUTPUTS / EXPECTED RESULTS ON AWARENESS RAISING	MEASUREMENT CRITERIA	ACTIVITY RESULTS
<p>4. A Communication Plan will be developed and operational by the first year and national and local capacity to conduct advocacy and public awareness, and policy dialogue enhanced by the end of the programme.</p>	<p>✚ At least 10,000 people (general public) from each of the targeted provinces will be reached through the awareness raising activities.</p> <p>✚ At least 3,000 employers, 1,500 families, 500 teachers, 200 intermediaries will be reached through different awareness tools to be identified and developed in a diversified manner by the communication plan to be prepared.</p> <p>✚ A phase out strategy will be developed and operational by November 2016 so as to ensure the sustainable interventions at national level to become a permanent fixture in</p>	<p>Activity 3.1. Develop a communication plan for the elimination of WFCL in agriculture in hazelnut harvesting focusing different levels (farm level awareness raising activities, village level activities, district level activities, province level activities, national level and international level activities).</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ A comprehensive two-year communication plan was developed and awareness activities were carried out in this reporting period. ○ By the end of 2017, awareness-raising activities targeting at least 10,000 people (general public) from each of the identified provinces have contributed to dissemination of the project outcomes. At least 3000 employers, 1500 families, 500 teachers and 200 intermediaries have been reached through different awareness-raising activities. ○ A panel discussion "Lessons from Turkey: How Public Private Partnership (PPP) created a sustainable model to tackle child labour in the hazelnut sector" was hosted by the Permanent Representation of the Kingdom of the Netherlands to the EU in collaboration with the ILO Office for Turkey, the CAOBISSCO, and the Netherlands

	<p>the work of the various authorities.</p> <p>Embassy in Ankara on 13 October 2016 in Brussels.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ An awareness raising event on the occasion of World Day against Child Labour (12 June) was implemented through week long activities in 2016 and 2017 in Şanlıurfa, Adana, Mersin and Hatay. On 12 June 2017, a panel discussion was organized in collaboration with the South-eastern Anatolia Project (GAP) Regional Development Administration in Şanlıurfa. ○ A seminar has been organized jointly by the ILO Office for Turkey, Hatay Union of the Chambers of Tradesmen and Craftsmen (HESOB) and Eastern Mediterranean Development Agency (DOĞAKA) on 15 June 2017 in Hatay. ○ In the ILO 10th European Regional Meeting (ERM) the CAOBISCO has launched a booth in order to introduce the project to participants from governments, social partners, international organizations and academia. ○ Project activities and results have been presented in seminars organized by public institutions on the occasion of 12 June World Day against Child Labour and World Day on Children's Right in 2017. ○ The project supported launching 2018 as the year of combating child labour in Turkey and a joint planning of respective activities were carried out with the MoLSS. <p>Activity 3.2. Create visual materials and regular news for awareness-raising on the elimination of child labour in seasonal agriculture.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ 153 banners and 3500 posters were produced to introduce project strategy to a wider audience. ○ 6480 posters, 1000 brochures and 250 bookmarks were produced for the World Day against Child Labour (12 June) in 2016 and 2017 and shared with the MoLSS and MoFSP for distribution to respective local authorities of all provinces of Turkey. ○ A music video clip which was recorded by a group of targeted children in the hazelnut harvesting season of 2017 in support of music teachers has also been used as an awareness raising material. ○ Provision of news on the project activities through regular website news at: http://www.ilo.org/ankara/lang-tr/index.htm. ○ 3 press releases were published on the website of the ILO Country Office on occasion of WDACL and PPP event in Brussels ,as well as news texts in the United Nations (UN) Newsletter ○ In 2016, a photo report has been synchronously published on the website of the
--	---

		<p>ILO Global and ILO Office for Turkey websites at http://www.ilo.org/global/about-the-ilo/multimedia/photo-slideshows/slideshows/rich/WCMS_440902_EN/lang-en/index.htm).</p> <p>Activity 3.3. Develop a phase out strategy to be operational by November 2016 so as to ensure the sustainable interventions at national level to become a permanent fixture in the work of the various authorities.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Project strategies towards elimination of WFCL in seasonal agriculture were mainstreamed into the national policies such as: “National Programme on the Elimination of Child Labour (2017-2023)” and MoNE Circular “Access to Education of Children of Seasonal Agricultural Workers and Nomadic or Semi-Nomadic People”. ○ Various trainings and awareness raising activities particularly on capacity development were provided in support of development and implementation of an effective CLMM. ○ Contribution provided in improving the knowledge basis and complemented existing efforts in data collection on child labour in Turkey. ○ The phase out strategy of the project would also provide inputs to forthcoming National Development Plan (2019-2023)

5. MAIN FINDINGS

This section of the Report is structured according to the evaluation criteria of relevance and design; effectiveness; efficiency; and sustainability and impact.

5.1. Project Relevance and Design

This part of the Report reflects upon the relevance and design of the project and the extent to which the project activities were relevant to the needs of main target groups and how this was reflected in project activities.

The project is based on the Memorandum of Understanding (MoU) between the ILO and the MoLSS of 10th February 2009, according to which providing technical support to child labour problem within the framework of the ILO Convention on Worst Forms of Child Labour No 182 is one of the priorities of ILO Office for Turkey. It is directly linked to the ILO Strategic Policy Framework (SPF), Programme & Budget (P&B) 2016-2017 and Outcome¹⁸ 8: Protection of workers from unacceptable forms of work, CPO TUR101 - Tripartite constituents take policy and programme action to eliminate child labour, with specific emphasis on children working in seasonal agriculture.

The project was developed in collaboration with the MoLSS to support national efforts in addressing WFCL in seasonal agriculture and more specifically in the hazelnut production. It is in line with the objectives and targets set by the Tenth National Development Plan 2014-2018, more specifically Objectives and Targets 265 and 267 under the Goal 2.1 Qualified People, Strong Society; the main policy pillars of the National Employment Strategy 2014-2023 related to the elimination of worst forms of child labour¹⁹; and the National Programme on the Elimination of Child Labour (2017-2023). The project is also complementary to the Prime Ministry Circular No 2017/6 on Seasonal Agricultural Workers and the Circular No 2016/5 on Access to Education of Children of Seasonal Agricultural Workers and Nomadic or Semi-Nomadic People of the Ministry of National Education.

The project takes into account international agendas, such as: the Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs), and more specifically the SDG Goal 8²⁰, and Target 8.7²¹, and the United Nations Development Cooperation Strategy 2016-2020 (UNDCS) for Turkey, Pillar 1: Sustainable, Inclusive Growth and Development and Outcome 1.2: By 2020, all underserved population groups have more equitable and improved access to integrated, sustainable and gender sensitive quality services (e.g. health, education, decent employment, and social protection systems).

¹⁸ The biennial Programme and Budget of ILO sets out the strategic objectives and expected outcomes.

¹⁹ National Employment Strategy 2014-2023, pp 37 and 28

²⁰ Promote sustained, inclusive and sustainable economic growth, full and productive employment and decent work for all.

²¹ Take immediate and effective measures to eradicate forced labour, end modern slavery and human trafficking and secure the prohibition and elimination of the worst forms of child labour, including recruitment and use of child soldiers, and by 2025 end child labour in all its forms.

Key respondents felt that the issues addressed by the intervention were highly relevant and coherent with needs on the ground and complementary to measures addressing WFCL, as well as to stakeholders' efforts in addressing WFCL in their respective areas at all administrative levels (central and local levels).

Regarding the project design, the two project documents are identical in terms of the contents with slight inconsistencies in indicators (measurement criteria), and are regarded as one project. The focus of the intervention is on: 1) the institutional strengthening of the project stakeholders; 2) direct interventions towards all actors of harvesting process for withdrawal/prevention of children from work in hazelnut agriculture, and 3) awareness raising towards all actors of harvesting process and the public. Despite being very essential, the project document provides all information needed, even though it would benefit from a more robust logical approach, clearly showing the linkages between stated objectives and activities (milestones). This might have been easily done through the insertion of a project logical framework or a theory of change.

Conclusions

The project prioritize education as means for eradication of WFCL seasonal agriculture. It is in line with the national policies and regulations and agreed ILO areas of cooperation, as well as with the ILO defined priorities and broader international agendas. It complements efforts of the governments in addressing WFCL and corresponds to the needs of children working in seasonal agriculture, their families, host communities, stakeholders and constituents through a combination of “upstream” policy work and “downstream” work, which is visible through the project achievements to be elaborated further in the Report.

Concerning the project design, a well-built logical framework would help in avoiding the risk that a project becomes a series of sporadic activities with no real logical linkages.

5. 2. Project Effectiveness

This part of the Report seeks to assess progress made against each of the project's three outputs. A recapitulation of the main outputs/ expected results and related activities of the project are provided in the table 3 further in the text.

An analysis of the project effectiveness is based on the first column of the table 3 (outputs/expected results) as follows below in the text.

OUTPUTS /EXPECTED RESULTS ON CAPACITY BUILDING

1. National and local institutional capacities to plan, manage, coordinate, monitor and implement activities against child labour in seasonal agriculture will be improved.

The project supported functioning of the National Steering Committee (NSC) and the establishment of Provincial Action Committees (PACs) in Ordu, Sakarya, and Düzce, which capacities in participatory planning at district and local levels were strengthened, thereby ensuring

responsiveness of project interventions to needs articulated at local levels, while simultaneously providing integration in and synergies with broader national policies and strategies. Due to structured dialogue key respondents reported improved reporting procedures at the level of provinces.

The project contributed to the development of national policy documents by providing policy advice and inputs to biannual (2017-2019) sectorial action plans part (agriculture) of the National Employment Strategy (2014-2023), which development was supported through the Phase 1 project, and the updated Time Bound Policy and Programme Framework (TBPPF) for the elimination of WFCL, through inclusion of components of the project's strategic intervention model into the relevant parts of the National Programme on the Elimination of Child Labour (2017-2023), as well as into the Prime Ministry Circular No 2017/6 on Seasonal Agricultural Workers and the MoNE's Circular No 2016/5 on "Access to Education of Children of Seasonal Agricultural Workers and Nomadic and Semi-nomadic Families". The latter included main elements of CLMM, thus institutionalizing the child labour monitoring mechanism launched by the project.

A school-based CLMM has been launched for identification and referral of child labour cases in Şanlıurfa in 10 primary and secondary schools. The mechanism includes, among other, a special e-module which serves for checking the school enrolment and attendance of students transferred from one school to another as "Students engaged in Seasonal Agricultural Works" through e-School Management Information System, which is recognized as an example of good practices established under the project. Hence, during the field mission the module appeared still inactive.

The launch of CLMM was followed by corresponding trainings of teachers in Şanlıurfa, as part of teachers' in-service training to ensure regular delivery and larger outreach. Even though not initially planned, monitoring activities were extended to Konya, Sivas and Nevşehir Provinces to scale up the CLMM in other crop groups and locations and contribute to nation-wide implementation, thus improving capacities of 302 teachers on child labour monitoring.

Conclusions

One of the prerequisites for any intervention to achieve expected results is the level of national commitment and willingness to tackle the issue addressed by the project. While the objective of this evaluation is not to assess the efforts of the government at either level, it has to be said that without these prerequisites the intervention would not be successful. The worst forms of child labour is a multi-dimensional phenomenon, involving a broad range of actors; and addressing all of its dimensions requires high motivation, complete freedom from vested interests, as well as availability of resources, both human and financial.

The project was very successful in strengthening national capacities in planning, coordination, implementation and monitoring of activities against child labour in seasonal agriculture. Structured dialogue enabled all stakeholders to address gaps and seek solutions in unison.

Two indicators of the project were not met i.e. (four) provincial action plans and Strategic Plans of respective Municipalities (2015-2019) due update, are still missing, even though the project reported

that in the case of the latter measures targeted for these plans were included in the National Programme on the Elimination of Child Labour (2017-2023).

Unless decided by the beneficiaries at provincial level that there was no need for provincial action plans, a transition phase could be used to assist the PACs to develop their respective plans.

OUTPUTS ON DIRECT SUPPORT/EXPECTED RESULTS ON WITHDRAWAL AND PREVENTION

2. Withdrawal and prevention through education and counselling services to targeted children and their families will be provided by the end of the project.

The number of children outreached by the project in 4-16 age groups from 2015 to 2017 totalled 3,490 (1165 in 2015; 1200 in 2016; and 1125 in 2017). Out of this number 80 percent or 2,798 children - 719 (326 girls and 393 boys) in 2015; 1015 (528 girls and 487 boys) in 2016; and 1064 (531 girls and 533 boys) in 2017 were withdrawn or prevented from work through provision of education services, and 20 percent or 692 benefited from other services.

According to gender disaggregated data a total number of girls withdrawn or prevented from work through provision of education services was 1,385 and the total number of boys was 1,413. Total figures for the period 2015 through 2017 and annual figures for 2015 reveal that girls were slightly outnumbered by boys, while they were in lead in 2016. In 2017, the number of girls and boys was almost equal.

As regards seasonal workers' families a total number of 3,538 of seasonal workers' families were reached from 2015 through 2017 (1033 in 2015; 1500 in 2016; and 1050 in 2017) in targeted districts of Ordu, Düzce and Sakarya Provinces. The total number of families which were provided with individual counselling was 799 (202 in 2015; 267 in 2016; and 330 in 2017), while 2,739 benefited from group counselling and training sessions.

Conclusions

As regards the outreach activities aimed at children and families of seasonal workers the figures demonstrate that the project was very successful and exceeded initially set targets. It is understood that such extraordinary results requiring intense field work could be hardly achieved without efforts and synergic work of all stakeholders at local level, and particularly dedicated teachers and project collaborators.

3. Corporate social responsibility will be promoted throughout the supply chain of hazelnuts.

During the harvestings seasons in 2015, 2016 and 2017 training on hazards of child labour in seasonal agriculture and legal responsibilities was provided to 618 employers and 143 intermediaries. Counselling services and trainings were provided to 104 model gardens during harvesting seasons in 2016 and 2017 and 41 rural intermediaries, and 60 targeted model gardens were monitored in 2017 through local partners.

Links established with hazelnut producer companies at local level in 3 provinces, namely Ordu, Düzce and Sakarya. The names of the major companies collaborated at local levels are Gürsoy Fındık, Proğıda, Balsu, Ferrero Fındık Turkish Branch, Sabırlar Fındık that helped to promote corporate social responsibility and to touch upon all actors of the supply chain. In this context it is worthwhile to mention the ILO Workshop on “Responsible Business Practices in Food Supply Chains in the Context of International Conventions and Documents and the role of Trade Unions” with a specific focus on the elimination of child labour in seasonal agriculture was carried out on 27 September 2016.

Conclusions

Significant number of enterprises, intermediaries and garden owners in supply chain of hazelnut production received counselling services and training on WFCL, as part of corporate social responsibility (CSR) component. The figures again demonstrate that initially set targets for enterprises and rural intermediaries exceeded originally planned indicators. The intervention is also a good example of corporate social responsibility and demonstrates how multinational companies, working in partnership with ILO constituents, can achieve sustainable progress in eliminating child labour in their supply chains and support withdrawal of children from WFCL. Should the project enter the next phase a special project component could be devoted to CSR and child labour built on good practices and lessons learnt to develop a tool for the promotion of CSR policy.

OUTPUTS / EXPECTED RESULTS ON AWARENESS RAISING

4. A Communication Plan will be developed and operational by the first year and national and local capacity to conduct advocacy and public awareness, and policy dialogue enhanced by the end of the programme.

A two-year communication plan for the elimination of WFCL in agriculture in hazelnut harvesting focusing on activities on farm/village/district/province/national/international levels was developed and implemented targeting at least 10,000 people (general public) were carried out during the project life-time. At least 3000 employers, 1500 families, 500 teachers and 200 intermediaries have been reached through different awareness-raising activities.

The objectives of the Communication Plan were to increase awareness on elimination of child labour; to promote Pikolo I & II video documentaries which were produced in the first phase among potential new audience; to engage project partners to disseminate ILO's global message on World Day Against Child Labour; to promote “An integrated model for the elimination of worst forms of child labour in seasonal agriculture in hazelnut harvesting in Turkey” project as a strategic intervention model for combating child labour in seasonal agriculture work at national and local level; and to ensure the engagement of project partners for sustainability. Various universities, chambers, national and local constituents have presented Pikolo documentary series in their venues to different target groups. Moreover ILO ITC Turin has used the documentary as a training tool for discussions on training sessions on child rights and child labour in 2016 and 2017.

At international level two events were used to promote project objectives and achievements in addressing the child labour issue, such as: “A panel discussion on "Lessons from Turkey: How Public Private Partnership (PPP) created a sustainable model to tackle child labour in the hazelnut sector" held on 13 October 2016 in Brussels, and the 10th European Regional Meeting of the ILO, when a video on child labour in agriculture PICOLO I and II was presented.

At central and decentralised levels a week-long awareness raising campaigns were held on occasion of the World Day against Child Labour (12 June) in 2016 and 2017 in Şanlıurfa, Adana, Mersin and Hatay. On 12 June 2017, a panel discussion was organized in collaboration with the South-Eastern Anatolia Project (GAP) Regional Development Administration in Şanlıurfa. Also, a seminar was held jointly by the ILO Office for Turkey, Hatay Union of the Chambers of Tradesmen and Craftsmen (HESOB) and Eastern Mediterranean Development Agency (DOĞAKA) on 15 June 2017 in Hatay. Moreover, project activities and results have been presented in seminars organized by public institutions on the occasion of 12 June World Day against Child Labour and World Day on Children’s Right in 2017.

As part of the Communication Plan a number of visual materials and regular news for awareness-raising on the elimination of child labour in seasonal agriculture were produced, shared and disseminated in 2016 and 2017, such as banners, posters, brochures, and bookmarks, as well as a music video clip which was recorded by a group of targeted children in the hazelnut harvesting season of 2017 in support of music teachers, has also been used as an awareness raising material and a photo report that was published on the ILO global and ILO country office web sites.

This component of the project included also development of a phase out strategy to be operational by November 2016 so as to ensure the sustainability of interventions at national level to become a permanent fixture in the work of the various authorities. The strategy included mainstreaming of project strategies towards eliminating WFCL in seasonal agriculture into the national policies such as: “National Programme on the Elimination of Child Labour (2017-2023)” and MoNE Circular “Access to Education of Children of Seasonal Agricultural Workers and Nomadic or Semi-Nomadic People”, including provision of inputs to forthcoming National Development Plan (2019-2023), as well as awareness raising activities and trainings particularly on capacity development in support of development and implementation of an effective CLMM.

Conclusions

The awareness raising activities have promoted better knowledge and increased awareness on child labour and WFCL and actions and achievements of the project not only in targeted regions, but also country wide, thereby contributing to enhanced understanding of adverse impact of child labour in general and particularly in agriculture on children health and development, but also in shaping general public opinion and people mindsets.

5.3. Project Efficiency

This part of the Report discusses the project’s efficiency in terms of time, expertise, funds, knowledge and know-how; including the conversion of resources (financial and human) into results.

The project has been directly managed by the ILO Country Office for Turkey (ILO CO), and the project team based in Ankara, which was supported by the project collaborators in targeted provinces, which number varied in harvesting seasons covered by the project.

A project steering committee has not been envisaged; and the coordination and overall guidance was provided by the National Steering Committee, which composition was described earlier in the Report. The National Steering Committee's meetings took place with the participation of local administrators of targeted provinces in the form of stakeholders' meetings to transfer knowledge and share experience among national and local level actors for the planning and evaluation of project activities prior to and following the hazelnut harvesting seasons.

In addition to its coordination role, the NSC has also played a role of a platform for knowledge sharing along with other events organized by the project, which can hardly be transferred into institutional practices. For instance, in its earlier phase the project produced a needs assessment study and a training package (available in Turkish language) and a model spatial planning for camp. The latter document was shared with respective Governorates and MoLSS thus inspiring the construction of a new camp site in Ordu, namely Saraycık in 2017. The project is currently engaged together with MoLSS in the revision of the teachers' guidebook-child labour and education for the elimination of child labour in agriculture-. In terms of material produced and disseminated for knowledge purposes, it is advisable to consolidate outputs of the project in the form of tools, materials and knowledge elaborated during projects and make sure that those don't get dispersed.

The expected outputs appear to be delivered timely enough, given the fact that outreach activities were carried out during harvestings seasons, and which was confirmed by the key respondents, however, no sequencing of the outputs and activities was indicated in the project documents.

In terms of cost-effectiveness, allocations were decided in consecutive steps upon receipt of progress and financial reports by the donors. Regular transfer of donors' funds (in instalments as specified by the contracts) speaks on behalf of the project success to deliver the planned activities on time and in line with the donors' financial requirements. Also, considering the results of outreach activities, which are supported by evidence on the number of families of seasonal workers and children reached by the project, it could be said that the project was cost-effective. This was confirmed during the interviews with key respondents. The use of qualified human resources in the field has permitted cost-reduction related to external expertise. Also, management costs are virtually non-existing since the project was managed and coordinated by the ILO Country Office core team.

Conclusions

The project has brought about highly satisfactory results in term of cost-benefits and use of resources, and has also allowed for a good degree of freedom in the planning and implementation of activities.

5.4. Project Sustainability and Impact Potential

This part of the Report discusses the project's sustainability over time and makes some consideration on the impact, understood as the likelihood of achieving the development objective.

In terms of envisaged achievement of solutions for sustainable results as indicated under the Section on Effectiveness, Outputs / Expected Results on Awareness Raising under point 4, a phase out or sustainability strategy of the project has been envisaged to mainstream child labour concerns into larger social policies and programmes, improve policy and legal analysis, and establish a school based child labour monitoring mechanism. The focus of the phase out work will be more on strengthening the effectiveness of national institutions in monitoring child labour programmes; and producing and disseminating information for further analysis, planning and programming in a broader context.

Grounds for sustainability have already been provided through the ILO's effective collaboration with its tripartite constituency in addressing WFCL; participatory approach in design, implementation and monitoring of the project; functioning of the national coordination mechanism and provincial advisory committees in selected areas; as well as by providing contributions to national policy and legal frameworks (the "National Programme on the Elimination of Child Labour (2017-2023)", the Prime Ministry Circular No 2017/6 on Seasonal Agricultural Workers; the Circular No 2016/5 on Access to Education of Children of Seasonal Agricultural Workers and Nomadic or Semi-Nomadic People of the Ministry of National Education; action plans in agriculture of the National Employment Strategy 2014-2023), as well as support provided to CLMM through trainings of teachers in parallel to strong advocacy and awareness raising campaigns and materials, have a crucial role for the project sustainability and impact.

The phase out strategy of the project would also provide inputs to the forthcoming National Development Plan (2019-2023) of which the preparatory work has already started in autumn 2017, while contributing to effective implementation of the above mentioned two policy documents. The ILO together with MoLSS established inter linkages between the new time bound strategy of the Government on the elimination of WFCL and the phase out strategy of the project.

All key respondents emphasised the need for further ILO involvement, even though views on the type of involvement ranged from facilitation to more proactive role. Also, while all key respondents are supportive to the replication of the project interventions in other geographical areas and agriculture crops in support of the Government efforts to eradicate WFCL in agriculture, yet most of them believe that the project should continue its focus on their respective regions. In this regard Şanlıurfa Province might require more attention as residence of large number of seasonal migrant workers and strong influx of refugees from Syria.

In terms of impact i.e. contribution to elimination of WFCL in seasonal agriculture in line with the Government's strategy even though it might be early to assess its impact given recent completion of the project followed by a four-month transition period²² to the next phase, it can be already said that

²² This period will involve no additional costs and will serve to complete the planned activities and develop a new project.

some of the outputs are considered to have been most successful in bringing about changes, such as mainstreaming WFCL into national policy documents; establishment of coordination mechanism at both national and local levels; and introduction of a school-based CLMM.

Conclusions

From the outset there is evidence that the integrated strategic model approach adopted by the project is conducive to longer-term sustainability of interventions aimed at eradication of WFCL due to its capacity to mobilise and provide buy-in of key stakeholders at national and local levels. By successfully mobilising a range of stakeholders at national and local levels, the project has managed to lay the basis for potential sustainability and buy-in to the integrated strategic model amongst a range of actors.

In order to achieve longer-term effects, PACs and CLMM should be replicated in other provinces to complement the MoNE's efforts with the full implementation of the MoNE's Circular, as key policy tool in eradication of child labour in agriculture in Turkey, in ensuring satisfactory monitoring of children of seasonal agriculture workers.

5.5. Lessons learned and Good Practices for Future Application

1. Education is essential to fight and eliminate child labour, but the basic conditions, such as infrastructure need to be in place.
2. Continuity and replication of the project achievements in other regions and agriculture production are required in order to take advantage of results and outputs developed under the project, provided that specific conditions and particularities of each region are taken into consideration.
3. The project experience and know-how could be replicated both country wide and globally, based on the project achievements, which need to be consolidated through further collaboration.
4. In order to be fully successful there is a need for a follow-up of the project once it is completed.
5. The project supported socialization and social inclusion of children withdrew or prevented from WFCL.

5.6. Gender Concerns:

The project mainstreamed gender aspects into its interventions and set very clear targets in terms of percentage of girls and boys to benefit from education and referral services, as well as in terms of number of mothers to benefit from the project. Figures related to girls and boys benefiting of the services provided by the project are almost equal.

Majority of key respondents emphasised great importance attached to gender equality during the project implementation and some were of opinion that girls were positively discriminated against boys.

6. CONCLUSIONS

6. The project contributed to the elimination of the worst forms of child labour in seasonal agriculture in line with the Government Strategy, yet the worst forms of child labour in agriculture remain a challenge in targeted regions requiring further attention and follow-up by key stakeholders and the ILO to consolidate gains, with more focus on Şanlıurfa Province to address the challenge at its source.
7. The project is highly relevant to the priorities spelt out in national strategies and the integrated strategic model promoted by the project has proved to be conducive to longer-term sustainability of interventions aimed at eradication of WFCL, owing to effective mix of policy and outreach work supported by structured stakeholders' dialogue and intense awareness raising activities.
8. Logical linkages between objectives and expected results and activities need to be more pronounced in the project design.
9. Partnership between public and private sector in the elimination of child labour has been added value to the project and has further emphasised the important role of multinational enterprises (MNEs) in eradication of child labour and potentials of PPPs in social mobilization around legally and socially unacceptable practices.
10. Social mobilization proved to be a powerful tool in promoting better understanding of harmful effects of child labour and particularly of WFCL on child's health and development.

7. RECOMMENDATIONS

1. To consolidate gains of the project through a follow-up activities in targeted regions with more focus on Şanlıurfa Province to address the challenge at its source.
2. To scale-up up the integrated strategic model in other agriculture regions with high potentials for involving child labour in agriculture through a programme and PPP initiatives.
3. When designing interventions it is always advisable to use logical framework approaches, as they illustrate the logical process from problem analysis to activities and help to understand how and why a desired change is expected to happen in a particular context, thus strengthening coherence and effectiveness of actions.
4. To further promote corporate social responsibility and child labour-free businesses in the spirit of the ILO Declaration on Multinational Enterprises (MNEs) through public private partnerships (PPPs) and engagement of employers' and business' associations.
5. To continue social mobilization and awareness-raising on legally and socially disapproved practices related to child labour.

7.1. Linking Conclusions with Recommendations

Conclusions	Recommendations	To whom?
1. The worst forms of child labour in agriculture remain a challenge in targeted regions, which require further attention and follow-up by key stakeholders and the ILO to consolidate gains, with more focus on Şanlıurfa Province to address the challenge at its source.	To consolidate gains of the project through a follow-up activities in targeted regions with more focus on Şanlıurfa Province to address the challenge at its source.	ILO Country Office National and local partners Tripartite constituents in Ankara and selected pilot provinces, Ordu, Sakarya, Düzce and Şanlıurfa.
2. The integrated strategic model proved to be conducive to longer-term sustainability of interventions aimed at eradication of WFCL, owing to effective mix of policy and outreach work supported by structured stakeholders' dialogue and intense awareness raising activities.	To scale-up up the integrated strategic model in other agriculture regions with high potentials for involving child labour in agriculture through a programme and PPP initiatives.	ILO Country Office MoLSS
3. Logical linkages between objectives and expected results and activities need to be more pronounced in the project design.	To use logical framework approaches, as they illustrate the logical process from problem analysis to activities and help to understand how and why a desired change is expected to happen in a particular context, thus strengthening coherence and effectiveness of actions.	ILO Country Office
4. Partnership between public and private sector in the elimination of child labour has been added value to the project and has further emphasised the important role of multinational enterprises (MNEs) in eradication of child labour and potentials of PPPs in social mobilization around legally and socially unacceptable practices	To further promote corporate social responsibility and child labour-free businesses in the spirit of the ILO Declaration on Multinational Enterprises (MNEs) through public private partnerships (PPPs) and engagement of employers' and business' associations.	ILO Country Office Employers' associations Agriculture Chambers Chambers of Commerce
5. Social mobilization proved to be a powerful tool in promoting better understanding of harmful effects of child labour and particularly of WFCL on child's health and development.	To continue social mobilization and awareness-raising around legally and socially unacceptable practices related to child labour.	ILO Country Office Trade Unions

Appendix 1. Terms of Reference



TERMS OF REFERENCE

Evaluation of “An Integrated Model for the Elimination of Worst Forms of Child Labour (WFCL) in Seasonal Agriculture in Hazelnut Harvesting in Turkey” Project

Overview	
Project Title	An Integrated Model for the Elimination of Worst Forms of Child Labour (WFCL) in Seasonal Agriculture in Hazelnut Harvesting in Turkey
Contraction Organization	International Labour Organization (ILO)
ILO Responsible Office	ILO ANKARA
Funding source	CAOBISCO (PPP) and Embassy of Netherlands
Budget of the Project	
Project Location	Turkey with provinces of Ordu (East Black Sea Region), Düzce and Sakarya (West Black Sea Region) and Şanlıurfa (South East Anatolia Region)
Outcomes	TUR 101
Type of Evaluation	Internal Evaluation
Expected Starting and End Date of Evaluation	20 November 2017 – 25 February 2018
Geographical coverage	Ordu, Sakarya, Düzce and Şanlıurfa

This evaluation is conducted in accordance with the ILO Procedures for the use of the XBTC projects stipulating that projects with funds lower than 1 million USD are being subject to internal evaluation procedures in order to examine the results achieved with donor resources. This evaluation will be covering two projects which are being implemented in parallel.

Project description

The overall objective of the project is to contribute elimination of worst forms of child labour (WFCL) in seasonal agriculture in line with the Government's strategy drawn by the National Employment Strategy 2014-2023. The project has been developed to expand the interventions of the earlier project named "Elimination of Worst Forms of Child Labour in Seasonal Commercial Agriculture in Hazelnut Harvesting in Ordu" where a model has been developed within the harvesting seasons between 2013 and 2015.

The main purpose of the project is to enhance national and local capacity for the removal of children from the worst forms of child labour in seasonal agriculture in hazelnut production in Turkey and prevention of at-risk children from entering such work through the capacity building of public institutions, development of monitoring mechanism and establishment of partnerships including public/private partnership (PPP). The project would sustain the strategic intervention model and scale it up in other regions which would in turn contribute the policy making process for the elimination of WFCL in seasonal hazelnut agriculture in Turkey.

The project will bring added value through the replication of the strategic intervention model in different regions (Düzce and Sakarya provinces of West Black Sea Region) with widened implementation in Ordu and the establishment of child labour monitoring mechanism starting from the targeted province of Şanlıurfa (province of South Eastern Anatolia). Additionally, the project aims to contribute to the policy making on the elimination of WFCL in seasonal agriculture and establishment of a sustainable child labour monitoring mechanism in seasonal agriculture.

The main rationale of this new phase is to contribute national ownership for the sustainability of the model through replicating it in new regions and the establishment of child labour monitoring mechanism. In this context, Western Black Sea Region (Hendek- Sakarya, Çilimli and Akçakoca- Düzce) has been incorporated in the implementation area of the project. Şanlıurfa which is prominent as a sending province of seasonal agriculture workers has also been included for monitoring purposes within the scope of the project.

Elimination of child labour in seasonal agricultural work is identified as the priority area in the National Employment Strategy for the period of 2014-2023 prepared by the Ministry of Labour and Social Security (MoLSS). Although in decline, child labour is still a problem in rural areas

mainly due to lack of capacity to enforce minimum age requirements for work and ensure universal basic education. During peak work periods, children do not maintain regular school attendance and fall behind in their classes and are unable to make up for this when they return to school. The very nature of seasonal agricultural work exposes families to all types of risks, to which children are the most vulnerable. For economic and social reasons, children of adult seasonal workers usually accompany their parents from place to place. As a result, children alongside their parents and other adults are found in work that is unsuitable for their age, in order to secure the subsistence of their families. Children engage in hard physical labour under working conditions that cannot be considered decent even for adults. Living conditions mostly lack basic infrastructure and are well below minimum standards. Against this background, this project has been developed to focus on the worst forms of child labour in hazelnut harvesting in Turkey, as it is high on the national and local Government agenda.

To this regard, three outputs are expected to be achieved within the project duration:

Output 1/ Capacity Building: The capacity of national and local institutions in targeted provinces has been improved in planning, managing, coordinating, monitoring and implementing activities for the elimination of WFCL in seasonal agriculture in hazelnut harvesting.

Output 2/ Direct Intervention: Direct support mechanism towards all actors of harvesting process- children, families, intermediaries and garden owners has been established and implemented for effective withdrawal and prevention.

Output 3/ Awareness-raising: A communication plan targeting all actors of the harvesting process, the public and the media has been developed and implemented.

Present status of the projects

The outputs based accomplishments of the project are as follows:

Under Output 1, a National Steering Committee with key stakeholders and partners has been established at the central level. The committee has carried out preparatory meetings and field visits during the planning and implementation stage of the project. Provincial Action Committees (PAC) established under the auspices of the Governorates in Ordu, Sakarya, Düzce has met prior to and during the harvesting seasons of 2015 and 2016. Provincial Action Committees are consisted of representatives of Governorate, Provincial Directorate of National Education, Public Education Centre and Provincial Directorate of Labour Agency in Ordu and of representatives of District Governorates, District Directorates of National Education, Public Education Centres and village heads in Düzce and Sakarya. As of 2016 Şanlıurfa province is included into capacity building related interventions so as to develop and implement child

labour monitoring mechanism efficiently. Policy advocacy efforts and support for development and implementation of new policies in collaboration with the main Government partner – MoLSS- have continuously been carried out within the reporting period and resulted in two particular achievements with this respect.

Under Output 2, intensive activities were carried out for withdrawal, prevention and protection of targeted children during harvesting periods in Ordu, Düzce and Sakarya for the purpose of eliminating WFCL. All of the required education, guidance, counselling and rehabilitation services together with monitoring activities were actively implemented. Training of families, intermediaries and village heads on hazards of child labour were comprised complementary activities under this output.

Under Output 3, the activities are being focused on reporting of project intervention during the harvesting periods of 2015 and 2016. Activity based news has been published on the website of ILO Office for Turkey. News articles have also been consisted of capacity building and direct intervention activities of the project, news aspect of strategic interventions and interviews with children and stakeholders. Visual materials have been actively used in targeted provinces for awareness raising in harvesting seasons of 2015 and 2016.

Below is some quantitative information on project outcomes within hazelnut harvesting season of 2015;

- Total number of 1033 seasonal worker families was reached in targeted districts of Ordu, Düzce and Sakarya; 202 of them were provided with individual counselling, rest were benefited from group counselling sessions.
- Total number of 1165 children (4-16 age groups) was reached, 719 of them (326 girls and 393 boys) were withdrawn or prevented from work through provision of education services, the rest were benefited from other services.
- Total number of 41 rural intermediaries (20 in Sakarya and Düzce; 21 in Ordu) were reached and provided with counselling and training sessions.
- Total number of 75 hazelnut garden/plantation owners (55 in Sakarya and Düzce; 20 in Ordu) were reached, interviewed and provided with individual counselling sessions. In addition, 2 large hazelnut supplier/manufacturer companies were cooperated for raising producer awareness against child labour in seasonal agriculture in hazelnut harvesting in Turkey.

Below is some quantitative information on project outcomes within hazelnut harvesting season of 2016;

- The total number of 1500 families was reached in targeted districts of Ordu, Düzce and Sakarya; 267 of them were provided with individual counselling, rest were benefited from group counselling sessions.
- Total number of 1200 children (4-16 age groups) was reached, 1015 of them (528 girls and 487 boys) were withdrawn or prevented from work through provision of education services, the rest were benefited from other services.
- Total number of 48 rural intermediaries (18 in Sakarya and Düzce; 30 in Ordu) was reached and provided with counselling and training sessions.
- Total number of 202 hazelnut garden/plantation owners and village heads were reached, interviewed and provided with counselling sessions. Additionally, 2 large hazelnut supplier/manufacturer companies were cooperated for raising producer awareness against child labour in seasonal agriculture in hazelnut harvesting in Turkey.

Below is some quantitative information on project outcomes within hazelnut harvesting season of 2017;

- The total number of 1050 families was reached in targeted districts of Ordu, Düzce and Sakarya; 330 of them were provided with individual counselling, rest were benefited from group counselling sessions.
- Total number of 1125 children (4-16 age groups) was reached, 1064 of them (531 girls and 533 boys) were withdrawn or prevented from work through provision of education services, the rest were benefited from other services.
- Total number of 54 rural intermediaries (24 in Sakarya and Düzce; 30 in Ordu) was reached and provided with counselling and training sessions.
- Total number of 341 hazelnut garden/plantation owners and village heads were reached, interviewed and provided with counselling sessions. Additionally, 2 large hazelnut supplier/manufacturer companies were cooperated for raising producer awareness against child labour in seasonal agriculture in hazelnut harvesting in Turkey.

During the project period considerable effort is spent for the mobilization of additional resources and ensured significant contributions through local, national and international levels. MoLSS and ILO were very influential in ensuring greater visibility to child labour issues in the provincial development agenda and in enhancing support for the project at the provincial level.

In this regard, the project has successfully contributed development of a comprehensive policy on the ground in particular with its' support to development of 2 consecutive policy documents issued by the Ministry of Labour and Social Security and the Ministry of National Education namely "National Programme on the Elimination of Child Labour (2017-2023)" and "Access to Education of Children of Seasonal Agricultural Workers and Nomadic or Semi-Nomadic People". The micro-level interventions need to be relevant, supportive of and supported by developments at the macro level. The referred 2 valuable policy documents would help better

understanding of the interrelationships between child labour and developmental issues and also could contribute an effective coordination at institutional and operational levels. Raising awareness among national authorities focusing on the multi-disciplinary nature of child labour can help to ensure that related issues are embedded into ongoing and planned social-sector initiatives. The phase out strategy of the project would also provide inputs to forthcoming 11th National Development Plan (2019-2023) of which the preparatory work will start in December 2017 while contributing effective implementation of the above two policy documents. The ILO together with MoLSS established inter linkages between the new time bound strategy of the Government on the elimination of WFCL and the phase out strategy of the project.

The lessons learned from ongoing PPP interventions in hazelnuts have been incorporated into the National Programme of MoLSS for the elimination of child labour (2017-2023) which included the establishment of organizational structures and capacities for participatory planning at district and local levels that involved local stakeholders and local administrations. This ensured that interventions are responsive to locally articulated needs while fitting within national policies and strategies. The ILO has provided technical support for the identification of priority areas and necessary measures to be taken in each area. Seasonal agriculture has been identified as one of the priority areas. The strategic intervention model and child labour monitoring mechanism developed by the project has been placed as a good practice and agreed to be mainstreamed in action plans against child labour in seasonal agriculture.

Within the framework of the phase out strategy of the project, a well-designed national CLM system is not only a prerequisite for the accurate identification of target groups and areas towards which interventions are to be directed, but also provides a necessary framework for identification and referral of working children at the local level. To ensure the educational achievements of child labourers, a broad-based national partnership that brings together government, civil society and international organizations are cultivated. Previous successful ILO experience in social mobilization directed towards ensuring the school attendance of working girls and boys through a well-designed school based child labour monitoring mechanism would be scaled up following to phase out of the project and replicated in other provinces as a complement to MoNE's efforts with the full implementation of circular in ensuring satisfactory monitoring of children of seasonal agriculture workers. Mobilization of society and the state towards developing and maintaining child labour monitoring mechanism in support of full implementation of the MoNE Circular is the key policy tool in the elimination of child labour in agriculture in Turkey. Social mobilization for education of working children should also be built on the comparative advantages of trade unions to take the lead in a broad education campaign. To this end various meetings, workshops and events has been planned for the period of

September and December 2017 to ensure active participation of workers' and employers' organizations as well as education unions to the process.

Well-sustained and responsive programmes for the elimination of child labour can be achieved only if public institutions in the relevant sectors recognize their roles and responsibilities in addressing the problem. The establishment of multi-sectoral mechanisms designed to ensure co-ordination among partners has proven to be of critical importance for the successful implementation of child labour programmes and maintaining their sustainability. The effectiveness of mechanisms such as the National Steering Committee in creating national ownership and commitment to the elimination of child labour in seasonal agriculture and at the provincial level, Provincial Action Committees have proven invaluable in promoting community involvement and creating a social mobilisation network at the grassroots level that has led to enhanced local ownership of the problem. The ILO together with its' main partner the MoLSS would therefore encourage the establishment of similar action committees at provincial level in different agricultural crop groups and geographical locations within the phase out strategy so as to ensure sustainability. The intensive media coverage materialized by the project is extremely significant in bringing child labour and seasonal agriculture related issues to the attention of the public and in the mobilization of social resources. Within the phase out strategy to be followed specific attention will also be paid to media involvement.

I. Purpose, scope and clients of the evaluation

The evaluation on Elimination of Worst Forms of Child Labour (WFCL) in Seasonal Agriculture in Hazelnut Harvesting is part of the Monitoring and Evaluation Plan 2016-2017 of the ILO Regional Office for Europe and Central Asia.

The main purpose of this evaluation is to assess the results of the work done in order to properly report on the results as well as define the steps for possible further project development to promote elimination of worst forms of child labour in seasonal agriculture in Turkey. Furthermore, the evaluation aims to assess the effectiveness, efficiency and relevance of the project in the period 2015-2017, to contribute to organizational learning and make recommendations for improvement on further implementation, so as to secure the sustainability of achieved results at the end of the project. It would help to define what and how the ILO Office for Turkey contributed in the development of a comprehensive national policy for elimination of worst forms of child labour, improvement of institutional and technical capacities of national and local public institutions, raising the awareness of the families, employers, public institutions and the general public about elimination of child labour in seasonal agriculture sector (Ordu, Sakarya, Düzce and Şanlıurfa).

The evaluation will cover the projects as a whole, for the period from June 2015 to the end of December 2017.

The main clients of the evaluation will be ILO management, project team members and programming staff and national and local partners as well as tripartite constituents in Ankara and selected pilot provinces, Ordu, Sakarya, Düzce and Şanlıurfa.

II. Criteria and questions

The evaluation will apply the key criteria of relevance, effectiveness, efficiency, sustainability and impact potential. It will seek answers to the following questions:

Relevance

- Are the project activities relevant to the needs of child labour in seasonal agriculture, agriculture workers and their families, host communities, stakeholders and constituents?
- If the project was designed in accordance with needs of main target groups? If yes, how this was reflected in the project activities?

Effectiveness

- To what extent have the project objectives been achieved? What are results noted so far? Have there been any obstacles, barriers?
- What have been the intended and/or unintended results?
- What have been the major results/accomplishment of the projects?
- What were the major factors influencing the achievement or non-achievement of the objectives?
- Were the activities and outputs of the projects consistent with their overall objectives and has the quality of these outputs been satisfactory?
- Have there been any successes, innovations?

Efficiency

- Given the resources available (time, expertise, funds, knowledge and know-how), how economically have been the inputs turned into the outputs?

Sustainability and impact potential

- Are the results achieved likely to continue after the end of the project?
- Are they likely to produce longer term effects?
- What action might be needed to bolster the longer term effects?
- How the project envisages achievement of solutions for sustainable results?

Lessons learned and good practices for future application

- What are the lessons learned from the implementation?
- How these lessons should be assessed/ benefited in the formulation and implementation of a new phase?
- Are there good practices to be replicated both nationally and globally?
- Is the project successful in terms of advocating and promoting good practices through innovative communication tools?

Gender Concerns:

- Have women and men in the target groups benefited equally from the project activities?
- To what extent did the project mainstream gender in its approach and activities?
- To what extent did the project use gender/women specific tools and products?

The list of questions can be adjusted by the evaluator in coordination with the ILO evaluation manager. Based on the analysis of the findings the evaluation will provide practical recommendations that could be incorporated into the design of potential future initiatives.

III. Methodology

One of the first tasks of the internal evaluator will be to review the available literature and materials and produced project outputs. The internal evaluator will carry out a mission to Ankara to meet with the ILO Office for Turkey Director, senior programme officer and financial&administrative assistant. This will be followed by field mission to the project pilot provinces to meet with the local partners in Ordu, Sakarya, Düzce and Şanlıurfa. Information will be collected by means of group and individual interviews with the stakeholders and project partners.

Upon completion of research and field mission, the evaluator will provide a debriefing to the ILO Office for Turkey on the preliminary findings, conclusions and recommendations and submit draft and final reports.

IV. Norms and standards

The evaluation will be carried out in adherence with the ILO evaluation policy guidelines²³, UN Evaluation Group (UNEG) Norms and Standards and OECD/DAC criteria for evaluating development assistance.

The consultant(s) shall respect people's right to provide information in confidence and make participants aware of the scope and limits of confidentiality, while ensuring that sensitive information cannot be traced to its source.

The gender dimension should be considered as a cross-cutting concern throughout the methodology, deliverables and final report of the evaluation. In terms of this evaluation, this implies involving both men and women in the consultation, evaluation analysis and evaluation team. Moreover, the internal evaluator should review data and information that is disaggregated by sex and gender and assess the relevance and effectiveness of gender-related strategies and outcomes to improve lives of women and men. All this information should be included in the final evaluation report.

V. Main deliverables (outputs)

The internal evaluator will provide a draft evaluation report in English (preferably up to 30 pages, without annexes) together with a three pages executive summary. The report will follow the format recommended by the ILO Evaluation Office (Checklist 5: Preparing the evaluation report²⁴) and include:

- ✓ A brief note on the methodology
- ✓ Executive Summary with key findings, conclusions and recommendations²⁵
- ✓ project background
- ✓ evaluation purpose, scope, clients and methodology
- ✓ description of the status of the project and overview of the work done (stocktaking)
- ✓ findings
- ✓ conclusions and recommendations
- ✓ lessons learnt and good practices
- ✓ annexes including the TORs, a list of those consulted

²³ ILO Policy Guidelines for Results-Based Evaluation
http://www.ilo.org/eval/Evaluationguidance/WCMS_168289/lang--en/index.htm

²⁴ http://www.ilo.org/eval/Evaluationguidance/WCMS_165967/lang--en/index.htm

²⁵ The executive summary should address the project purpose, project logic, project management structure, present situation/status of project, evaluation purpose, evaluation scope, evaluation clients/users, evaluation methodology, main findings, conclusions, main recommendations, important lessons learned, and good practices.

The draft report will be circulated by the evaluation manager and shared for comments with the stakeholders. Further to receipt of combined comment from the evaluation manager, the internal evaluator will prepare a final report that will be subject to approval by the ILO Evaluation Focal Point at the RO/Europe. The final report should be delivered not later than two weeks after receiving the comments to the draft report.

VI. Evaluation arrangements and professional requirements

The evaluation will be conducted by an internal evaluator who has taken a special course organized by the ITC ILO to increase technical capacity of the ILO staff on internal evaluation. It will require 30 working days in the period from mid November 2017 through mid January 2018 and will include travel to Ordu, Sakarya, Düzce and Şanlıurfa. Mission cost of the internal evaluator will be fully covered by the project budget allocated for the evaluation purposes.

A tentative timeline can be found below:

TASK	TIME	ESTIMATED DAYS
Desk review	January 2018	7
Field mission	November 2017	10
Data analysis and draft report	January 2018	5
Final report	January 2018	20
Total		42

Under the supervision of the ILO Office for Turkey, the internal evaluator will provide following deliverables within the indicated timeframe:

Deliverable	Deadline
Draft evaluation report	6 January 2018
Final evaluation report	25 February 2018

Appendix 2. Evaluation Mission Schedule

An Integrated Model for the Elimination of Worst Forms of Child Labour in Seasonal Agriculture in Hazelnut Harvesting in Turkey Project

Internal Evaluation Mission Programme

21-30 November 2017

ANKARA / 21-22 NOVEMBER 2017

21 NOVEMBER:

09:30 Meeting with Mr. Numan Özcan, Director, ILO Office for Turkey

Meeting with Mr. Nejat Kocabay, Senior Programme Officer and Ms. Ceren Ababay Tosyalı, Project Assistant, ILO Office for Turkey

11:00 Directorate General of Labour, Ministry of Labour and Social Security (MoLSS)

Mr. İbrahim Demircan, Head of Department on Employment Policies

with the participation of Ms. Özlem Özmen, Ms. Ceylan Çifçi and Ms. Tuba Öcal, Labour Experts

14:00 Directorate General of Basic Education, Ministry of National Education (MoNE)

Ms. Zuhall Mert, National Education Expert, Department of Education Policies

Ms. Sema Büyükyıldırım, National Education Assistant Expert, Department of Education Policies

with the participation of Mr. Adem Orakçı, Deputy Head of Department on Projects

15:30 Mr. Ulaş Yıldız, Legal Advisor, Turkish Confederation of Employer Associations (TİSK)

16:45 Mr. Şahin Serim, Former Official of Confederation of Turkish Real Trade Unions (Hak-İş)

17:30 Mr. Ertan Karabıyık, Executive Director, Development Workshop Cooperative

22 NOVEMBER:

09:00 – 16:30 Stakeholders Meeting (Ankara HiltonSA Hotel)

ORDU / 23-24 NOVEMBER 2017

23 KASIM:

- **Mr. Niyazi Erten, District Governor of Altınordu**
- **Mr. Engin Tekintaş, Mayor, Altınordu Municipality**
- **Visit to Saraycık Temporary Settlement Area for Seasonal Agricultural Workers**
with the participation of Mr. Onur Torun, Coordinator of Uzunisa Social Support Centre

24 KASIM:

- **Mr. Ahmet Arık, Deputy Governor of Ordu & District Governor of Perşembe**
- **Mr. Ümit Hüseyin Güney, District Governor of Ünye**

DÜZCE & SAKARYA / 27-28 NOVEMBER 2017

27 NOVEMBER:

- **Mr. Mahmut Şener, District Governor of Çilimli**
with the participation of Mr. Abdurrahman Yurttaş, District Director of National Education, Çilimli
- **Mr. Yasin Öztürk, District Governor of Akçakoca**
with the participation of Mr. Hüseyin Dilek, Unit Head, District Directorate of National Education, Akçakoca; Mr. Hasan Yalılı, Head Public Education Centre, District Directorate of National Education, Akçakoca; Mr. Ayhan Direk, Teacher & Coordinator Akçakoca Social Support Centres

28 NOVEMBER:

- **Mr. Bekir Dinkırcı, Deputy Governor of Sakarya**
with the participation of Mr. Tekin Kaya, Sakarya Provincial Director of Turkish Employment Agency (İŞKUR); Mr. Erhan Çavuş, Sakarya Provincial Director of Social Security Institution
- **Mr. Orhan Burhan, District Governor of Hendek**

ŞANLIURFA / 29 NOVEMBER 2017

- **Mr. Ufuk Akıl, Deputy Governor of Şanlıurfa**
- **Şanlıurfa Provincial Directorate of National Education**

Mr. Mahmut Çıtırık, Member of Provincial Monitoring Team for Children of Seasonal Agricultural Workers

Mr. Furkan Müslüm Solak, Member of Provincial Monitoring Team for Children of Seasonal Agricultural Workers

Field visits paid between 24-29 November 2017 in Ordu, Düzce, Sakarya and Şanlıurfa have been accompanied by Assoc. Prof. Murat Gürkan Gülcan, Education Coordinator of the Project.

ANKARA / 30 NOVEMBER 2017

11:00 Wrap-up in ILO Office for Turkey

Mr. Numan Özcan, Director

Ms. Özge Berber Agtaş, Programme and Admin Officer

Mr. Nejat Kocabay, Senior Programme Officer

Ms. Ceren Ababay Tosyalı, Project Assistant

Appendix 3. List of publications used and cited

List of publications used and cited

Document Title	Status
1. Project documents	Received
2. Progress Report	Received
3. Final Report of the project on Elimination of Worst Forms of Child Labour in Seasonal Agriculture in Hazelnut Harvesting in Ordu	Received
4. Tenth National Development Plan 2014-2018	Received
5. National Employment Strategy 2014-2023	Received
6. Tarım Sektörü, Eylem Planları 2017-2019	Received
7. National Programme on the Elimination of Child Labour (2017-2023).	Received
8. Prime Ministry Circular No 2017/6 on Seasonal Agricultural Workers	Received
9. Circular No 2016/5 on Access to Education of Children of Seasonal Agricultural Workers and Nomadic or Semi-Nomadic People of the Ministry of National Education	Received
10. Memorandum of Understanding between the ILO and Turkey	Received
11. United Nations Development Cooperation Strategy 2016-2020 (UNDCS) for Turkey	Received
12. Needs assessment and training package	Received
13. Elimination of Worst Forms of Child Labour in Seasonal Agriculture in Hazelnut Harvesting in Ordu: SPATIAL PLANNING REPORT	Received
14. Statistics on Child, 2016. Press Release. Turkish Statistical Institute. No: 24645, 21 April 2017.	Downloaded from Internet
15. Turkey USDOL 2015 Report	Downloaded from Internet
16. ILO Guidance Note 4: “Considering gender in the monitoring and evaluation of projects”	Downloaded from Internet