Review of Cambodia Decent Work Country Programme, 2016-2018

February 27, 2019

Mr. Don Clarke (international consultant), M. Sok Somith (national consultant

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Page 2
Page 4
Page 5
Page 11
Page 17
Page 20
Page 23
Page 26
Page 35
Page 35
Page 39
Page 53
Page 54
Page 59
Page 63
Page 65
Page 67
Page 68
Page 70
Page 81

ACRONYMS AND ABBREVIATIONS

	Association of Combodian Descuitment Associat
ACRA ACT	Association of Cambodian Recruitment Agencies Action, Collaboration, Transformation
ASEAN	Association of Southeast Asian Nations
AC	Arbitration Council
BFC	Better Factories Cambodia
С	Cambodia National Disability Strategic Plan 2014-2018
CAMFEBA	Cambodian Federation of Employers and Business Associations
CBA	Collective Bargaining Agreement
C-BED	Community-Based Enterprise Development
CCA	Common Country Assessment
CDC	Council for the Development of Cambodia
CEDAW	Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women
CEACR	ILO Committee of Experts on the Application of Conventions and Recommendations
CDRI	Cambodia Development Research Institute
CIPO	Cambodia Indigenous People's Organisation
CNDSP	Cambodia National Disability Strategic Plan 2014-2018
СО-ВКК	ILO Country Office for Thailand, Cambodia and Lao PDR
СР	Country Programme
CRPD	Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities
CSO	Civil Society Organisation
CSDGs	Cambodia Sustainable Development Goals
CWEA	Cambodia Women Entrepreneurs Association
DWCP	Decent Work Country Programme
DWT	Decent Work Technical Support Team
ESCAP	Economic and Social Commission for Asia and the Pacific
EU	European Union
FASMEC	Federation of Associations for SMEs of Cambodia
FDI	Foreign Direct Investment
FAO	Food and Agriculture Organisation
GDP	Gross Domestic Product
GIZ	Gesellschaft für Internationale Zusammenarbeit (Germany)
GMAC	Garment Manufacturers Association of Cambodia
HDI	Human Development Index
HEF	Health Equity Fund
HIES	Household income and expenditure survey
HIV/AIDS	human immunodeficiency virus and acquired immune deficiency syndrome
IAG-M	Industry Advisory Group on manufacturing skills standards
IDP	Industrial Development Policy
IFAD	International Fund for Agricultural Development
ILC	International Labour Conference
ILO	International Labour Organisation
ILS	International Labour Standards
IMC	Inter-Ministerial Committee
IOM	International Office of Migration
КАВ	Know About Business
LAC	Labour Advisory Committee
LDC	Least Developed Country
LFS	Labour Force Survey
LGBTQI	Lesbian, Gay, Bisexual, Transgender, Queer and Intersex
	Lower-Middle Income Country
M&E	Monitoring and Evaluation Ministry of Agriculture, Ecrostry and Eisbories
MAFF	Ministry of Agriculture, Forestry and Fisheries
MoC	Ministry of Commerce
	Ministry of Economy and Finance
MHLW MIH	Ministry of Health, Labour and Welfare (Japan) Ministry of Industry and Handicrafts
	ministry of muustry and nanuiciaits

MIT	Ministry of Tourism		
MOC	Ministry of Commerce		
MOFA	Ministry of Foreign Affairs (Netherlands)		
MoLVT	Ministry of Labour and Vocational Training		
MPI	Multidimensional Poverty Index		
MRC	Migrant Resource Centre		
MRD	Ministry of Rural Development		
MRS	Mutual Recognition of Skills (ASEAN)		
MTR	Mid Term Review		
MWA	Ministry of Womens' Affairs		
NCLS	National Child Labour Survey		
NEP	National Employment Policy		
NGO	Non-Governmental Organisation		
NIS	National Institute of Statistics		
NSDP	National Strategic Development Plan		
NTUC-DWCP	National Trade Union Council for the DWCP		
ODA	Official Development Assistance		
OECD	Organisation of Economic Cooperation and Development		
OHCHR			
PICC	Performance Improvement Consultative Committee		
RBM	Results-Based Management		
RGC	Royal Government of Cambodia		
RMG			
SDG(s)			
SIDA			
SNA	Sub-National Administration		
SPPF	Social Protection Policy Framework		
TVET	Technical Vocational Education and Training		
UN	United Nations		
UNCT	INCT United Nations Country Team		
UNDAF	JNDAF United Nations Development Assistance Framework		
UNDP	United Nations Development Programme		
UNDS	United Nations Development System		
UNESCO	United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organisation		
UNICEF	United Nations Children Fund		
UNIDO	United Nations Industrial Development Organisation		
UNW	United Nations Entity for Gender Equality and the Empowerment of Women		
USD	United States Dollar		
USDOL	US Department of Labour		
WB	World Bank		
WHO	World Health Organisation		

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

The reviewers wish to acknowledge the support of H.E Mr. Hou Vudthy, Under-Secretary of State, MoLVT, and representatives of MoLVT departments; the Cambodian Federation of Employers and Business Associations (CAMFEBA); and member organizations of the National Trade Union Council for the DWCP (NTUC-DWCP) for their input and guidance.

Further acknowledgement is given to Mr. Graeme Buckley, Director, County Office for Cambodia, Lao PDR and Thailand who advised and supported the process throughout; Mr. Tun Sophorn, ILO National Coordinator in Cambodia who gave unstintingly of his time and knowledge; Ms. Sutida Srinopnikom, Senior Programme Assistant, ILO Decent Work Technical Support Team for East and South-East Asia and the Pacific, who patiently supported the process from the beginning; members of the various ILO project teams in the ILO Joint Project Office (JPO) in Phnom Penh; and staff at Better Factories Cambodia.

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY AND RECOMMENDATIONS

Overview

The DWCP 2016-2018 is a three-year cooperation framework and plan of action to support Cambodia's achievement of sustained job-rich growth and an inclusive and sustainable development pathway towards graduation from LDC status and achievement of Upper-Middle Income Country status by 2030. It was signed by the ILO and the Royal Goveral of Cambodia (RGC) in October 2016, together with the Cambodian Federation of Employers and Business Associations (CAMFEBA) and Cambodian trade unions. The DWCP contributes to the RGC's Rectangular Strategy for Growth, Employment, Equity and Efficiency (Phase III). This serves as the foremost socio-economic policy agenda and political vision for the country's development and is operationalized by the National Strategic Development Plan 2014-2018.

This review was primarily conducted in the period August – October 2018 as part of the wider process of developing the next DWCP for the period 2019-2023. The main components of the highly streamlined review process were a desk review of project evaluation reports from the period concerned, supplemented by semistructured interviews with a limited number of selected Cambodian counterparts. Input was also provided by (i) the extensive tripartite consultative process through which the core elements of the new draft DWCP were developed simultaneously in Khmer and English and endorsed in the last quarter of 2018; and (ii) a comprehensive partnership mapping exercise carried out for the development of the new DWCP and planning for its implementation. A particular feature of the current review is its integration with a parallel review being conducted of ILO in-country tripartite governance mechanisms across Asia and the Pacific. As a result, this aspect of DWCP performance receives additional attention in the following report.

Overall, the review found that the DWCP 2016-2018 has made significant progress towards achieving its stated indicators and targets under each Country Priority and Outcome. Notable achievements to which the DWCP contributed since 2016 include (i) the formulation of legislation (e.g. the Minimum Wage Law) and policy frameworks (e.g. TVET and social protection); (ii) the strengthening and establishment of tripartite institutions (e.g. the Minimum Wage Council); (iii) development of the national garment sector strategy and improved factory level compliance with international labour standards and domestic legislation; (iv) steps (albeit slower than anticipated) to implement the National Employment Policy (NEP); (v) expansion of social protection, including to informal workers; (vi) ongoing development of Cambodia's skills architecture and capacities, including the development of competency standards and assessment mechanisms, as well as a comprehensive skills development programme for tourism professionals; (vii) improved capacities for collective bargaining and evidence-based annual minimum wage negotiations; (viii) expansion and strengthening of employment and migrant worker services, including the national migrant workers complaints mechanism; (ix) coordination of a joint programming approach within the UN system on youth employment; (x) ongoing strengthening of critical constituent capacities in areas including labour inspection and policy engagement; and (xi) ongoing promotion of small enterprise development to thousands of Cambodia young people via means such as the 'Community-based Enterprise Development' (C-BED) initiative and the 'Know About Business (KAB)' programme in secondary schools.

The DWCP design positioned NEP implementation as a cornerstone which underpinned the whole programme to reinforce focus and prioritization of effort and resources. However, delays in the establishment of the NEP architecture and resourcing challenges somewhat lessened its role and impact in this regard during the three-year period of the DWCP. A further innovative aspect of the DWCP was a separate set of indicators and targets to "lift the game" on monitoring, evaluation and reporting. These were aimed at producing (i) a comprehensive list of labour market and decent work indicators linked to all employment-related SDG indicators; and (ii) a broad range of additional indicators to contribute to monitoring progress in the priority DWCP policy and strategy areas, with special attention to capturing the gendered dimension of progress. Capacity challenges and contending priorities within both the DWCP tripartite governance mechanism (see below) and ILO Joint Projects Office (JPO) meant that this area largely remains work in progress.

DWCP tripartite governance

As noted above, DWCP tripartite governance was a priority focus in the review. Such arrangements are a core part of the DWCP concept and vital for national ownership. They provide a platform and model for social dialogue and in this way can influence wider tripartite / social dialogue processes. The current Cambodia DWCP arrangement operates as follows:

- tripartite DWCP sub-committee under the Inter-Ministerial Committee for the NEP (IMC-NEP), with some 15 ministries involved
- comprehensive annual process under this framework to review DWCP progress and plan ahead
- annual comprehensive reports on DWCP progress, lessons and challenges.

The establishment in 2016 of the National Trade Union Council for the DWCP (NTUC-DWCP), bringing together 15 national trade union federations / confederations), provides an important new component of the DWCP governance architecture. The review found that the IMC-NEP DWCP subcommittee has provided a robust platform for the annual examination of DWCP progress and lessons, and for adjustments at the target level (in particular) in light of experience and changes in the operational context. Nonetheless, it is recommended that a review of this arrangement should be carried out in the next DWCP period in light of changes in Cambodia's tripartite institutional context and the heavy support and administrative workload for the JPO. Such review should be conducted in association with a wider review of tripartite arrangements and processes in Cambodia.

Relevance, effectiveness, efficiency, impact and sustainability

Relevance: The review found the DWCP to be highly relevant, *inter alia* demonstrated by its close and specific alignment with key elements of Cambodia's national development policy and strategic architecture, its alignment with social partner priorities and needs, and the commitment to its implementation shown both by national constituents and a growing base of governmental, non-governmental and international partners. The core elements of the DWCP (current and future) and Decent Work Agenda more generally are furthermore well embedded in the UNDAF 2019-2023

Effectiveness: The review found the DWCP to be effective in terms of both programme delivery and the management of resources and partnerships for its implementation. 59 percent of indicators are assessed as completed or specifically on track for completion in the next DWCP period. A further 29.5 percent of indicators are showing progress and will carry forward into the next DWCP period with a good likelihood of completion. This is a satisfactory rate of delivery which indicates a close alignment in the DWCP design between the selected outcomes, national and ILO capacities, and local context. At the same time however, feedback was received from some partners concerning a tendency (also highlighted in the last DWCP review) towards transaction intensive once-off activities and workshops, the impact of which was often reduced by a lack of resources for ongoing follow-up and consolidation.

A parallel partnership mapping exercise carried out to support the next DWCP development process indicated a diverse and growing range of implementation partners. Partner feedback indicated a strong appreciation and valuing of the ILO mandate, comparative advantages and technical capacities in relevant areas. Resource mobilization efforts were generally successful, with local and ILO resources being supplemented by USD7,187,916 being generated through donor-funded development cooperation projects in 2016 and 2017. Only one key output area did not proceed due to a lack of resources as a result of the key donor reprioritizing its engagement in Cambodia.

Although there is scope for ongoing improvement, the application of cross-cutting policy drivers¹ was generally visible across programme outcomes, with some notable highlights in gender mainstreaming,

¹ The ILO's cross-cutting policy drivers are: (1) ratification and implementation of international labour standards; (2) social dialogue and tripartite cooperation; (3) gender equality and women's empowerment and non-discrimination in

particularly in the context of Better Factories Cambodia engagement in the garment and footwear sectors. Applying the commitment to mainstreaming of environmental sustainability considerations across all components of the DWCP, including with regard to climate change and 'just transition,' is the area most requiring intensified attention. At the level of programme management, a strong and clear focus on DWCP priorities and outcomes was maintained by the JPO, supported by the oversight and review role of the DWCP sub-committee of the IMC-NEP. The period since 2016 furthermore shows improvements in the synergies and mutual reinforcement across the DWCP. However, DWCP management and coordination capacities at country level remain stretched despite the addition of one new administrative position, compounded by the growing requirements of engagement in the broader process of UN reform and some pressures at project delivery level for resources and time to be directed to ongoing fundraising due to insufficient provision for core operational costs.

Efficiency: The review found the DWCP to be efficiently, transparently and accountably managed with respect to the application of both financial and human resources, although there are areas for improvement in terms of internal systems and procedures. One major programme (Better Factories Cambodia) has taken initiative to set up its own database and other systems to supplement those provided centrally. Funds mobilized through donor-funded development cooperation projects were applied to the purposes intended and actively monitored. One further area which is relevant from an efficiency perspective is the extent of cross-programme synergies and mutual reinforcement. As noted above, the current DWCP period has seen improvements in this respect.

Impact and sustainability: The review found that while there are indications of impact and sustainability in some key areas of DWCP implementation, both areas largely remain "work in progress." A definitive overall assessment remains premature at this stage due to the long-term nature of the processes involved. These often transcend several DWCPs, requiring multi-year timeframes for consolidation and building of national ownership, knowledge and capacities. Increased resourcing of DWCP outcomes and outputs over time through the national budget provides an important indicator of success in this context, an area still requiring ongoing attention and advocacy, including at the level of high-level dialogue with the RGC.

There is evidence in the meantime that ILO strategy and actions have contributed to legislative, policy, strategic and institutional change (e.g. expansion of social protection policy and systems, supported by a combination of national budget funding and contributory approaches; the development of a national garment sector strategy; and the ongoing development of an evidence-based minimum wage process). The strong alignment of the DWCP to national laws, policies, strategies and plans provides a key factor in achieving sustainability, embedding DWCP contributions within broader national frameworks and providing impetus for the resourcing efforts and decisions (human and financial) of constituents for decent work initiatives.

Two areas in which there is particular evidence of progress with respect to impact and sustainability are (i) Better Factories Cambodia, now in its 18th year within the Cambodian garment (and more recently footwear) export sectors; and (ii) the development of Cambodia's social protection policy and systems, where the ILO has also been a long-term key partner. These are elaborated in the report.

Lessons and considerations for future planning

A number of key lessons and considerations from the current DWCP period were identified to inform the design of the DWCP 2019-2023. These include the following:

• The current three priorities remain highly relevant to Cambodian context – it was thus recommended early in the CPR process (and endorsed by national constituents) to continue these for the next five

all respects, including on the basis of disability; (4) promotion of an environmentally sustainable world of work (linked to implementation of the ILO Green Initiative).

years, albeit with different wording and sequencing.

- An orientation around the opportunities and challenges of the rapidly evolving digital economy and future of work should provide a core theme within DWCP, with the next five years being critical for Cambodia's ability to seize the opportunities and mitigate the challenges in this respect.
- It will be critical to embed specific alignment with SDGs/CSDGs, RS IV NSDP 2019-2023 and other relevant policies and strategies decent work elements of each should be reflected in DWCP outcomes, indicators and targets.
- The next DWCP should further strengthen the clarity of linkages between DWCP contributions and 'bigger picture' changes in Cambodia (i.e, the articulation of a 'theory of change').
- A focus on implementation and impact should drive the DWCP, with national decent work legislative, policy and institutional frameworks now largely in place or in progress.
- Resourcing of the DWCP should increasingly be embedded into national budget planning and decisionmaking – this is crucial for national ownership.
- The DWCP and its tripartite governance process should be positioned as platforms for facilitating greater social dialogue as well as coordination and synergies between all relevant government ministries and other stakeholders.
- It is critical to systematically invest in and closely monitor the quality of partnerships while continuing to
 (i) extend and deepen engagement with other government ministries and development partners to
 broaden the outreach, influence, leverage and resource base of the Decent Work Agenda and (ii)
 promote coherence and coordination in DWCP delivery and its contribution to broader national
 development objectives
- Maximizing internal synergies among programmes and projects under the purview of the JPO in Cambodia on the one hand, and between specialist and programme staff based in ROAP and the CO on the other, requires ongoing monitoring and attention.
- Systematically embedding, applying and resourcing the application of the ILO's cross-cutting policy drivers (see above), is critical to the equitable and inclusive delivery and ultimate success of the DWCP and ensuring 'nobody is left behind.'
- The current emphasis on (i) outreach to and coverage of informal sector and (ii) subnational initiatives and capacities should continue as a systemic underpinning of the programme e.g. current initiatives under the NEP and social protection reform.
- Data gathering, research and evidence-based advocacy should provide a further underpinning focus to the programme – including strengthening LMI. This is a potential comparative advantage area for the ILO in the Cambodia context. Two potential research priorities have already been suggested in discussion with ILO staff based in Phnom Penh. These are (i) the nature of informal sector and (ii) implications of digital economy from a decent work perspective

Recommendations

In this context and looking forward to the DWCP 2019-2023, the following recommendations are made:

At strategic and substantive levels:

- 1. Carry forward and build on the **three current DWCP priorities** into the next DWCP period, with an underpinning focus on the potential and challenges of the emerging digital economy in Cambodia.
- 2. Strengthen explicit DWCP **linkages with the SDGs/CSDGs**, reinforcing the normative and business cases for the implementation of decent work as a core aspect of SDG implementation.
- 3. Ensure effective **social dialogue and tripartite cooperation** is given priority attention in all aspects of the DWCP, including design, implementation, resourcing, M&E and DWCP governance. In this context, conduct reviews of (i) the effectiveness and status of tripartite mechanisms in Cambodia and (ii) DWCP tripartite governance arrangements.

- 4. Strengthen specific attention to **mainstreaming**, **inclusion and capacity strengthening** with respect to gender equality, youth and vulnerable groups (including informal workers, young workers, migrant workers, persons with disability, members of indigenous communities, LGBTQI persons and women and men living with HIV. In this context, prioritize the promotion of women's leadership, voice and representation within constituent organizations and DWCP processes.
- 5. Include and implement strategies that increase effective **coordination of stakeholders** around decent work objectives at national and subnational levels, including across and between government ministries and agencies, employers and the trade union movement, with prioritization of (i) outreach to and inclusion of informal and vulnerable workers and (ii) increased multi-stakeholder collaboration around social protection and skills/TVET.
- 6. Leverage the ILO's relationship of credibility and trust with the RGC to encourage progressive increases in National Budget commitments over time to support implementation of DWCP priorities and outcomes. In this context, continue seeking opportunities, along with other development partners as appropriate, to engage in high-level policy and planning dialogue with the RGC, including on long-term national budget planning and commitments.
- 7. Beyond the ILO's core constituent relationships, pursue **expanded and new partnerships** at governmental, civil society, international partner levels as part of sustainability and impact-enhancing efforts.
- 8. Prioritize the strengthening of **data availability** in areas of relevant to the Decent Work Agenda, including through more regular Labour Force Surveys. In this context, (i) prioritize strategic research in key areas of relevance to the Decent Work Agenda; and (ii) employ available technologies to effectively use the data to which the DWCP has access (e.g through BFC monitoring services) as a basis for policy influence and performance improvement.

At operational/implementation levels:

- 9. Continue to strengthen programme delivery through:
 - i. harmonization of DWCP M&E systems with national RS IV, NSDP, CSDG and UNDAF systems and reporting, as well as internally within the ILO (including linkages between country-level governance/oversight and the ILO's global reporting systems)
 - ii. developing and improving processes to synthesize and use information from evaluation findings and recommendations in ongoing DWCP planning and implementation
 - iii. increasing support for training and mentoring in result-based management and M&E, as well as financial reporting, to narrow the M&E and reporting capacity gaps identified by partners
 - strengthening synergies, linkages and mutual reinforcement under the Cambodia DWCP,
 including (i) across and between programmes and projects at national level; and (ii) within the
 ILO between regional specialist staff and programme staff at regional and country levels
 - v. developing a multi-country ILO resource mobilisation strategy (e.g. at ASEAN and/or GMS levels, including an enhanced focus on South-South Cooperation) to increase strategic focus, coherence and synergies and reduce fund-raising pressures on in-country staff
 - vi. in parallel with the above, increasing attention to ensuring that donor agreements include adequate provision for the operational/core costs of delivery
- vii. expanding programmatic approaches with particular priority on measures to address activity-byactivity and high transaction approaches, in line with the ILO Development Cooperation Strategy 2015–17: Report on progress, 329th Session, 9-24 March 2017

viii. selectively increasing ROAP, CO and JPO engagement in wider UNCT working groups and UN Development System reform processes at country level, including through an increased proportion of DWCP delivery occurring through joint programming arrangements.

1. SUMMARY OVERVIEW OF COUNTRY CONTEXT

1.1 Significant progress lays basis for future ...

With a per capita Gross National Income (GNI) of US\$ 1,140 in 2016, Cambodia has been one of the 10 fastest-growing economies in the world over the past 20 years. A sustained average GDP growth rate of 7.6 per cent between 1994-2015² catapulted Cambodia to becoming a Lower Middle-Income Country (LMIC) in 2015³. World Bank projections indicate ongoing growth at similar levels as Cambodia looks towards attainment of Upper Middle Income status by 2030.⁴ The projected acceleration of economic growth until 2030 would see average incomes increase fourfold in that time.⁵

Cambodia is a medium human development country and ranks 143 out of 188 countries on the Human Development Index (HDI). From 0.357 in 1990, Cambodia's HDI rose to 0.563 in 2015 making it the 8th best performing country globally over this period. At the same time, Cambodia remains a Least Developed Country (LDC) under the United Nations and World Trade Organisation system which takes into account three broad criteria – Gross National Income (GNI) per capita, human assets and economic vulnerability. Cambodia is expected to graduate from LDC status by 2030.

The last decade has seen an acceleration of economic structural transformation in Cambodia. The contribution of agriculture to GDP has been shrinking, while that of industry has expanded. In 2016, agriculture's share of GDP declined to 20.6 per cent, down from about one-third a decade ago and below industry's share of 32.6 percent in that year. As a result, the economy has become increasingly reliant on the industry and services sectors to absorb new entrants into the labour force and the ongoing migration from rural to urban areas, with approximately 270,00 new entrants to the labour market every year.⁶ The factors driving job creation in Cambodia are thus shifting significantly. These are linked to broader trends including ASEAN integration, the emergence of digital and knowledge-based economies and the drive to smart and higher value-added production.⁷

Snapshot: Key trends and opportunities

Trends relevant to the Decent work Agenda

- One of 10 fastest growing economies in the world aim to be Upper-Middle Income Country by 2030.
- Economic growth rates remain robust (7% per annum) projected to continue.
- Rapidly evolving digital economy trends, with initial impacts of "Industry 4.0" increasingly apparent automation, digital economy, platform economy, gig economy, etc.
- Human Development Index (HDI) increased from 0.357 in 1990 to 0.563 in 2015.
- GDP per capita increase from USD 1,024 to 1,308 USD from 2014-2016.
- Almost 500% increase in per capita income over past decade 400% further increase projected when upper middle income status achieved.
- Shift in structure of labour force agriculture (58.7% in 2004 to 33.7% in 2015); industry and services increasingly main provider of new jobs, but still mainly low value/low skill.

² MEF and ADB (2016). *Cambodia's Macroeconomic Progress, A Journey of 25 Years,* Ministry of Economy and Finance, <u>https://www.mef.gov.kh/documents/shares/Macroeconomic_Progress_at_ADB.pdf</u>.

³ The World Bank classification system defines LICs as those with a Gross National Income (GNI) per capita of less than USD 1,025, with LMIC status in the range of USD 1,026 – 4,035.

⁴ World Bank (April 2018). *Cambodia Economic Outlook: Recent Economic Developments and Outlook.* World Bank Group, Phnom Penh

⁵ UN Country Team, Cambodia (2018). *Common Country Assessment*, 2019-2023. Phnom Penh

⁶ UNited For Youth Employment in Cambodia. (August, 2017) United Nations Joint Programme Document, Phnom Penh

⁷ World Bank (April 2018). *Cambodia Economic Outlook: Recent Economic Developments and Outlook.* World Bank Group, Phnom Penh

- By 2015, about 50% of rural household income from salaries and wages, up from 30% in 10 years previously.
- Poverty rate reduced from 47.8 % to 13.5 % between 2007 and 2014 exceeds NSDP targets. Food poverty reduced to virtually zero by 2014.
- Income inequality reduced Gini coefficient improved from 0.41 in 2007 to 0.29 on 2014.

Leveraging opportunities for decent work

The current context holds many opportunities which the next DWCP can leverage for greater relevance, effectiveness, efficiency, impact and sustainability. These include the following:

- "Future of Work" / "Industry 4.0. developments," with scope for potential impacts in areas such as ecommerce, enhancing productivity, LMI, training outreach, etc
- Positive ongoing economic growth projections
- Increased revenue collection and public expenditure
- Growth in youth population demographic dividend, freeing up resources for investment and family income growth
- Expanded legal, policy and strategy frameworks in areas relevant to decent work
- New institutions relevant to decent work agenda
- Regional cooperation within the framework of the ASEAN Economic Community (AEC), although increased skill levels are crucial to seizing the opportunities potentially available.
- Planned Labour Force Survey and Population and Housing Census in 2019, providing access to vital new data on labour market dynamics and trends

1.2 ... but many challenges remain

1.2.1 Most workers in vulnerable employment

Work in formal enterprises accounts for less than 20 per cent of employment and only 3.4 percent of establishments. Approximately 70 percent of workers remain in informal work, with many (especially women) as own-account workers or contributing family workers. They are more likely to suffer poor working conditions and vulnerability than are formal workers. In this context, female participation in the labour market in 2016 was is 75.5 percent, compared to 86.7 percent for men. Overall unemployment, at around 2.7 per cent of the workforce nationwide, is very low, but unemployment among educated urban youth is growing, an issue that, if not addressed, could become a socially and politically destabilizing force.

1.2.2 Structural vulnerabilities leave Cambodia potentially exposed

The country's dependence on a narrow economic base leaves Cambodia vulnerable to shocks, with limited capacity to diversify industrial production and move out of its low-wage, low-productivity growth model. The Industrial Development Policy (IDP), launched in 2015, is of critical importance in addressing these structural limitations to growth. However, its implementation to date has been limited overall.

Economic development remains narrowly based – dependent on garments, tourism, rice and construction, with export markets falling within a narrow range. Cambodia's garment and footwear sector is the largest formal employment provider. Although overall numbers vary from year-to-year, the Cambodian garment export sector employs about 600,000 workers (650,000, if footwear and travel goods' workers are included). This accounts for approximately 6 percent of the country's total labour force. The garment industry is also Cambodia's largest exporting industry—having grown from a US\$27 million industry in 1995 to exporting nearly US\$5.4 billion per year, and accounting for 80 percent of total country goods export. It is estimated that the garment industry contributes to 10 percent of total Cambodia's gross domestic product (GDP). At the same time the sector faces increased issues of competiveness and productivity, as well as the threat of

possible withdrawal of tariff free access to European markets under the Everything But Arms" agreement with the EU.

Such vulnerabilities are compounded by the implications of climate change for national agricultural patterns, infrastructure and employment, particularly in rural areas.

1.2.3 Gender inequalities undermine inclusive development

Women and men face different constraints in obtaining productive employment, decent work and government services, but Cambodian women remain considerably disadvantaged in comparison to men. They have restricted access to ownership of assets and employment even though the 1993 Constitution recognizes the principles of gender equality. The increasing labour participation of women in the economy does change social norms, beliefs and perceptions of gender roles, albeit slowly. Women's participation is constrained by lower level of literacy and total years of schooling compared to men and women earn 71 percent of what men earn.

One measure of the degree of gender inequality at country level is the Gender Inequality Index (GII) published by UNDP as part of its annual Human Development Index (HDI) Report. The GII draws on data related to reproductive health, empowerment (including percentage of women in parliament) and labour market participation. The Cambodia GII rating for 2015 was 0.479, a slight drop over one decade from 0.561 in 2005. By comparison, Vietnam, Lao PDR and Thailand stood at 0.337, 0.468 and 0.366 respectively. The lowest level of gender inequality in ASEAN was Singapore, at 0.068.⁸

1.2.4 Social protection: Expanding quickly but capacity challenges

The last two year have seen significant social protection initiatives implemented in the context of the 2018 national elections and adoption in 2017 of the National Social Protection Policy Framework (NSPPF) 2016–2025. The policy framework is a ten-year strategic road map which foresees major legal, institutional and financial reforms to support a gradual expansion of coverage, in line with the country's expanding economy and fiscal space. However, the recent rapid expansion of contributory and non-contributory benefit coverage has been mandated entirely to the National Social Security Fund (NSSF), bypassing its Tripartite Board, raising questions about the system's capacity to effectively respond. For example:

- a) The Government decided to remove the co-contribution on the Social Health Insurance (SHI) from workers and delegated the whole contribution solely to the employers. This decision creates increased financial burden on employers, especially the SMEs and increases incentives for informality.
- b) The political pressure to implement the health insurance scheme for informal workers and civil servant schemes by 1st January 2018 prompted lots of changes in the NSSF internal structure without a clear strategic plan as the institution shifted gear towards registration of informal workers' and pregnant workers. While the Government is covering the cost of the benefits, the NSSF is not being reimbursed for the administrative costs of this work (i.e. 200 new staff hired) which effectively means private sector contributions are subsidizing this politically-motivated expansion.

1.2.5 Occupational safety and health undermined by capacity and compliance gaps

Although reliable information on worker outcomes following occupational accidents and diseases is not yet comprehensively available, the current Cambodia DWCP document states that occupational safety and health (OSH) practices in Cambodia remain inadequate. Where OSH regulations, information, and guidelines do exist, they are often unavailable or difficult to access, while labour inspection services still lack the requisite capacity and are often denied access to workplaces. The rapidly growing construction sector, where the proportion of informal work is very high, has been a focus of DWCP OSH engagement since 2016. Two further immediate key issues stand out in the current DWCP context are (i) the number of workers killed and injured in road accidents as they commute to and from factories, particularly in the garment and footwear sector; and (ii) the ongoing episodes of fainting that have been affecting garment workers since the early

⁸ BFC Project Document, 2016-2018.

2000s. These have been variously attributed to factors such as the smell of paint and pesticides inside the premises, poor health and hygiene, inadequate nutrition and psychological distress and heavy workloads (overtime).

1.2.6 Child labour a persistent issue

While concerted collaboration between BFC and national partners have seen the incidence of child labour in Cambodia's garment sector reduced to 2 percent (mainly cases of underage workers, aged 12-15), child labour remains a serious issue more broadly, fuelled by challenges in accessing basic education and the absence of a compulsory education requirement. This is despite ambitious commitments by the RGC, including at the IVth Global Conference on the Sustained Eradication of Child Labour (2017) and the ratification of ILO Conventions No. 138 and No. 182, with a national target of reducing the overall incidence of child labour to 8 per cent by 2016.

According to the 2012 National Child Labour Survey (NCLS), just over one in every ten children in Cambodia are engaged in child labour in areas including salt farms, rubber plantations, fishing, brick-making, portering, domestic labour, and waste scavenging or rubbish picking. A major report produced in 2018 by the British Social Research Council further highlighted the prevalence of child labour in Cambodia's brick industry, where tens of thousands of debt-bonded families work in hazardous condition to meet the needs of Phnom Penh's booming construction industry.

Cambodia has integrated child labour as an indicator in the national policy framework, including in successive National Strategic Development Plans. In 2016, Cambodia adopted a second National Plan of Action on Worst Forms of Child Labour and approved guidelines for addressing child labour in the fisheries sector. The Government also established standardized inspection guidelines to increase the effectiveness of child labour law enforcement. However, progress remains slow and beset by lack of capacity in critical areas.

1.3 Social dialogue and tripartite cooperation

1.3.1 Overview

The overall state of industrial relations in Cambodia's garment sector remains highly conflictual. BFC reports that there is limited trust at the sectoral or factory level between employers and trade unions. Unfair labour practices by both employers and trade unions are commonplace in the industry. Some employers seek to exert control over trade union organizations in their workplace, while in other circumstances they use surveillance, Fixed Duration Contracts (FDUs) and other practices to divide and limit the influence of trade unions. At the same time, trade unions have employed unhelpful IR practices, including extortion, intimidation, falsified membership records and triggering strikes at factories in which they have no members.

1.3.2 Ratification of international labour standards

Cambodia has ratified 13 international labour standards, including all eight fundamental Conventions and one governance Convention (the Employment Policy Convention, 1964, No. 122). Cambodia has not ratified the Labour Inspection Convention (1947, No. 81), which sets out international standards and best practices on labour inspection.

1.3.3 National tripartite architecture

The peak tripartite body in Cambodia is the Labour Advisory Committee (LAC). The committee considers labour and employment related issues, gives advice on the scope of collective bargaining agreements, and formulates recommendations for the minimum wage (although this role will now shift to the newly established Minimum Wage Commission). ILO technical support and capacity building has helped the minimum wage setting process to become better understood, more strongly evidence-based and more

orderly than in the past. The current DWCP highlights the potential to build on the LAC's positive experience by expanding, within its existing mandate, the range of issues with which it deals.

Other key tripartite organs include the Arbitration Council (see below), the Governing Body of the National Social Security Fund, the 8th Working Group on Labour and Industrial Relations, the Minimum Wage Council, the OSH Commission, the Social Protection Commission (although the tripartite balance is not equitable with six government members and four from the social partners combined), and the National Committee for Monitoring Implementation of Ratified ILO Conventions.

1.3.4 Labour market institutions

Strong economic growth has been accompanied by vibrant, but fragile, development of labour market institutions. Key issues in this context include the weak protection of rights to freedom of association (FoA) and collective bargaining, particularly within the garment sector. Individual and collective labour disputes are regulated by the Labour Law. The point of recourse for an individual dispute is the labour inspectorate. Collective disputes can be considered by a Conciliator, but if that fails the dispute is arbitrated either by procedures set out in the collective agreement or by the Arbitration Council.

The ILO played an instrumental role in the establishment of the **Arbitration Council** (and the supporting Arbitration Council Foundation), which in was formalized in 2003 as an independent but state sanctioned part of Cambodia's industrial disputes resolution architecture. The council is widely respected for its effectiveness, transparency and credibility. According to International Trade Union Confederation (ITUC), the Council has effectively taken the place of labour courts, which have not been established despite them being provided in the Labour Law of 1997. Drawing on a tripartite pool of 30 arbitrators, the council is responsible for handling cases through its tripartite dispute resolution system, with a timeframe of 15 days to hear a case and make an award.

A key factor in the development of the Council was the signing of the first garment sector MOU between employers and workers' organisations, a central element of which was an agreement to binding arbitration (by employers) on rights disputes (in exchange for agreement to abide by lawful strike procedures by unions). The council and BFC maintain an active collaborative relationship. This includes the use of council findings in BFC assessments and provision by the council of training and technical assistance to BFC around FoA issues. The wider "strategic alliance" with the ILO remains important for the ongoing operation of the council, not least due to the credibility and influence of the 'ILO brand' as well as the tripartite approach which is the cornerstone of the ILO. Established with ILO support, the Arbitration Council Foundation supports the functioning of the Council and facilitates resource mobilisation, training and outreach.

After the introduction of the Cambodia's Trade Union Law (TUL) in May 2016, the number of cases handled by the council dropped significantly from 360 per year to about 50 per year. The council is currently researching the reasons for this. Feedback from trade union stakeholders during the evaluation generally attributed the decline in cases to the impact of the 50 plus 1 percent provision for most representative status (MRS) under the law. This view is not generally shared by employers, who have largely welcomed the law as providing a framework for regulating the proliferation of unions in the garment sector. Union feedback also highlighted what they experience as onerous financial disclosure and registration requirements under the law as key issues to be addressed, as they further affect unions' ability to represent their membership. The Minister of Labour has in the meantime agreed to address the union representation issue via a draft Prakas for tripartite review on allowing minority unions to represent their members in collective labour disputes .

1.3.5 Employers' and workers' organizations

Both employers' and workers' organizations have grown from a virtually zero base in the early 1990s to increasingly more representative organizations with a progressively greater capacity to advance and protect the interests of their members. Membership of the Cambodian Federation of Employers and Business

Associations (CAMFEBA) is steadily increasing and its capacity to analyse and to play a constructive and influential role in advocating policy positions on the basis of research and facts has been strengthened.

As the representative of garment and footwear manufacturers in Cambodia, the Garment Manufacturers Association in Cambodia (GMAC) works closely with the RGC, BFC and other counterparts to provide more confidence for investors by improving industrial relations and the business environment. Training is one of main services of GMAC, which operates the national Cambodia Garment Training Institute (CGTI), with an important focus on training for productivity growth.

Workers' organizations have proliferated in Cambodia, but they demonstrate mixed capacities and degree of independence and representativeness. Despite a high level of union density in the industry, upwards of 70 percent, the trade union movement remains fragmented, divided by political affiliations, personality, and tactical differences. At the same time, there has been a growing number of independent unions emerging, particularly in the garment and footwear sector. The fragmentation of unions overall is a significant obstacle in trade union efforts work collaboratively on wage and policy matters, and also creates confusion and conflicts at factory level. Workers in the industry remain poorly educated as a result of the lack of sufficient investment for decades in high quality, public education.

In this context, the DWCP 2016-2018 identifies the following priorities in this context: building trade union capacity; tackling anti-union discrimination; reducing proliferation, divisions, and in-fighting among garment sector unions; providing more capacity-building support for CAMFEBA and GMAC; strengthening government labour inspection and dispute prevention and settlement capacities; and setting the Arbitration Council on a solid footing.

1.3.6 Collective bargaining

The number of collective bargaining agreements (CBA) remains limited; moreover, most agreements recorded as CBA are limited to resolving issues within a specific dispute. Collective bargaining is practised by some larger hotels, garment factories, and service enterprises, but remains rare in other sectors. Comprehensive collective agreements are still uncommon, although the current sector-wide collective bargaining approach underway in the garment and footwear sector signals an important shift in this regard.

Challenges: Snapshot

A number of challenges relevant to the next DWCP stand out from the above analysis. These include:

- The need to prepare as a country to reap the benefits of "future of work" e.g. skills, adaptability of workforce, maximising benefits and addressing risks of digital economy, platform economy, etc
- Fragile economic base 4 main sectors, unstable agricultural prices, financial instability, natural disasters
- Sustaining economic growth upper middle income status requires 9.5 % increase until 2030 (World Bank)
- Ensuring burgeoning FDI within the economy, particularly from China, translates into decent jobs within the context of Cambodia's Investment Law (1994) and the country's strategic development directions and priorities.
- Increasing the productivity and competiveness of economy and expanding sustainable enterprises.
- Widespread vulnerability : Approximately 70 percent of the workforce remain in informal/vulnerable work, with the most vulnerable including migrant workers, youth and persons with disability.
- Economic progress is not inclusive or equitable. The increase in income equality is counter-balanced by widespread disparities in areas such as education, health, and gender.
- Persistent poverty more than 33 percent of the population are multi-dimensionally poor; 28 percent remain vulnerable to falling back into poverty as a result of factors such as economic shocks or natural disasters.
- The low education and skills base of much of workforce, a result of systemic under-investment and compounded by the mismatch between skills and jobs mismatch in the labour market.
- Persistent gender disparities in all spheres despite important progress on gender equality (e.g. 78

percent participation in workforce and close to parity in primary school enrolment).

- Low OSH levels (although reliable data is not yet available), particularly in growing construction sector.
- Persistence of child labour, especially in rural areas.
- The capacities of national institutions (including the NSSF) to deliver on laws, policies, strategies, plans and new initiatives and monitor and evaluate results.
- The capacity of ILO national constituents including for effective contribution to national policy processes and DWCP delivery.
- Still evolving labour market institutions and social dialogue, with many gaps in capacity to strengthen and sustain both
- Data availability in key areas (e.g. the dynamics and make-up of the informal sector; labour force surveys; and sex-disaggregated data more generally) to support monitoring of the CSDGs and national policy/ strategy / plan implementation.

2. NATIONAL POLICY CONTEXT

2.1 Rectangular Strategy IV (RS IV)

Cambodia's development vision is set out in the Rectangular Strategy-Phase IV (the socio-economic policy agenda of the RGC) and the soon-to-be adopted National Strategic Development Plan (NSDP) 2019-2023, which provides the roadmap for implementation of the Rectangular Strategy.

The recently adopted RS IV is grouped around a central focus on "acceleration of the governance reform," which in turn links outwards to four core priority areas. Of particular direct relevance to the next DWCP are:

<u>Rectangle 1:</u> Human resource development, particularly "technical training, improving gender equity and social protection."

<u>Rectangle 2</u>: Economic diversification, particularly "preparation for the digital economy and Fourth Industrial Revolution."

<u>Rectangle 3:</u> Private sector and market development, particularly "job market development" and "promoting SMEs and entrepreneurship."

<u>Rectangle 4</u>: Inclusive and sustainable development: Particularly (1) promotion of agricultural and rural development (including role of agriculture in creating employment).

Linked to the RS IV and associated NSDP are the Cambodia Sustainable Development Goals (CSDGs) 2016-2030, which adapt the SDGs to the local context and include an additional goal on addressing the impact of UXOs and promoting victim assistance.

A number of laws, strategies, plans and Prakas support implementation of the RS IV and NSDP. Relevant developments in this respect during the current DWCP period include the adoption of the Law on Minimum Wage (promulgated in 2018) and drafting of laws on Social Protection (one on Social Security and one an overarching law on Social Protection). Planned changes are in the pipeline to the Trade Union Law to address concerns raised by unions and other stakeholders on registration and most representative status (MRS) requirements.

The policy, strategy and planning architecture has been further developed since 2016 through a number of new policies, strategies and plans in specific sector and thematic areas relevant to the Decent Work Agenda. These include social protection, TVET, OSH, child labour, garment sector, food security and nutrition, climate change, green growth, digital economy, implementation of NEP, manufacturing skills standards and internships/apprenticeships.

The same period has also seen an expansion of national bodies relevant to decent work agenda as noted earlier – the Minimum Wage Council, OSH Commission, Social Protection Commission and National Committee for Monitoring Implementation of Ratified ILO Conventions.

2.2 Industrial Development and National Employment Policies

In 2015, two closely related national policies – the Industrial Development Policy (IDP) 2015–2025 and the National Employment Policy (NEP) 2015–2025 – were developed through intensive consultations between government ministries and with other partners. Together they provide a policy framework for the coming decade of national development and for ILO support.

The IDP aims to transform Cambodia's industrial structure from a low value-added, low-wage, and labourintensive base to a skill-driven model by 2025, and sets out targets in the areas of labour market development, industrial relations, and skills and human resource development, although no explicit reference is included to the long term future of the garment industry.

The NEP was developed with extensive ILO support and *inter alia* elaborates plans to achieve the following goals:

- more decent and productive employment opportunities, achieved in part by means of macroeconomic policy and sectoral development policies supporting decent/productive employment growth and formalization of informal businesses;
- enhanced skills and human resource development in the areas of core employability skills, quality of and access to education and TVET, and alignment of education and TVET with labour markets; and
- improved labour market governance, including better quality and more accessible labour market information, employment services, and working conditions and labour protection, as well as improved industrial relations and wage-setting mechanisms, unemployment insurance, and protection for migrant workers.

2.3 2030 Development Agenda

Further weight to the above policies and commitments, and to the priorities and outcomes of the current and future DWCPs is provided by the 2030 Development Agenda, particularly SDG 8 on decent work and economic growth. The following SDG 8 targets are of particular relevance:

<u>Target 8.2</u>: Achieve higher levels of economic productivity through diversification, technological upgrading and innovation, including through a focus on high-value added and labour-intensive sectors (links to ILO/BFC work on the strategy for the future of the garment sector in Cambodia).

<u>Target 8.5</u>: By 2030, achieve full and productive employment and decent work for all women and men, including for young people and persons with disabilities, and equal pay for work of equal value (links to BFC commitments around rights at work, and quality of work, for women and men).

<u>Target 8.7:</u> Take immediate and effective measures to eradicate forced labour ... and secure the prohibition and elimination of the worst forms of child labour ... and by 2025 end child labour in all its forms.

Target 8.8: Protect labour rights and promote safe and secure working environments for all workers.

2.4 UNDAF (2019-2023)

The United Nations Development Assistance Framework (UNDAF) 2019-2023 provides a core element of the policy and international cooperation framework within which the next DWCP will be developed and implemented. It provides an important bridge between the SDGs and the national context and priorities to

which the DWCP will fully align, recognizing that the Decent Work Agenda is already well integrated into the UNDAF framework.

Of particular reliance to the next DWCP are UNDAF priorities (1) expanding economic and social opportunities; (2) promoting sustainable living (includes application of the ILO Just Transition Guidelines Towards Environmentally Sustainable Economies and Societies); (3) managing urbanization (includes creating decent jobs); and (4) strengthening accountability and participation (includes voice and representation in public decision making, with a focus inter alia on gender equality and persons with disability).

3 EVALUATION APPROACH, KEY STEPS AND METHODOLOGY

3.1 Objectives

The approach underpinning the design of the Cambodia DWCP 2019-2023 is an **integrated and highly streamlined** one which encompasses this evaluation as one of three inter-linked objectives:

- (1) Conduct review of the DWCP 2016-2018 (CPR): Through a desk review of relevant documentation, supplemented by targeted stakeholder consultations, the review (CPR) will (i) assess progress, gaps, lessons and good practices from the current DWCP period, analyzing these from the perspective of relevance, effectiveness, efficient, impact and sustainability and (ii) make recommendations for consideration in the design of the next DWCP.
- (2) **Develop Decent Work Country Analysis of Cambodia:** The DWCA will analyze the country context through a decent work lens to identify the key strategic developments, trends and issues which will underpin the selections of DWCP priorities, outcomes, indicators and targets over the next 5-year period.
- (3) Produce Cambodia DWCP document for 2019-2023: Based on the above analysis and recommendations, develop a DWCP for the period (2019 – 2023) which (i) orients the country programme to target vulnerable workers and focuses on areas where the ILO can make the most difference in support of Cambodia's national priorities for achieving the 2030 Agenda and DWA; (ii) ensures the DWCP's alignment with the 2030 Agenda to assist the country in achieving relevant SDGs in the context of the rapidly changing country context⁹ as well as global and regional trends – including technological advancement and its impact on labour market; and (iii) aligns with the UNDAF (2019-2023) in the context of the reform of the UN Development System which will be implemented during the next DWCP period.

Specific tasks, expectations and document formats for the CPR in the above context are set out in detail in the ToR attached. The aim is to draw to the degree possible on the extensive and detailed work done in 2015-2016 in developing the current DWCP and a comprehensive desk review of project evaluation reports produced since 2016.

Desk review findings were supplemented by limited targeted engagement with selected national constituent representatives. A semi-structured consultative approach was followed which paid attention to gender perspectives.

3.2 Integration between CPR and ILO tripartite governance review

⁹ Including the graduation of Cambodia to Lower Middle Income Country status in 2016, and the future development financing landscape, demographic change and job growth particularly for Cambodian young

A particular feature of the CPR process was its integration with a parallel review being conducted of ILO incountry tripartite governance mechanisms across Asia and the Pacific. Questions on this dimension were added into the Analytical Framework (below).

3.3 Administrative arrangements

International and national consultancy services for the CPR were provided under the supervision of the Director of DWT/CO-Bangkok. The latter had primary responsibility for review and analysis of existing project review and evaluation documents and the presentation of preliminary findings to stakeholders.

All aspects of the process were supported by the ILO Regional Office for Asia and the Pacific (ROAP) and DWT/CO-Bangkok. The ILO Monitoring and Evaluation Officer from ROAP provided overall oversight.

3.4 Deliverables

The key CPR deliverables under the ToR are:

- preliminary report and powerpoint presentation to national tripartite workshop
- draft and final CPR report

3.5 Analytical framework

The following key questions were developed in consultation with the ILO National Coordinator in Cambodia to guide and inform the CPR.

The role and relevance of ILO in Cambodia, its niche and comparative advantage, and partnerships

- The extent to which the national political, economic and social factors have shaped formulation of DWCP
- The extent of DWCP priorities consistent with ILO's capacities and its comparative advantages vis-à-vis other UN agencies
- To what extent the DWCP has contributing to the overall policy coherence and whether ILO has worked in partnership with key constituents, government agencies, other partners including other UN agencies in achieving Cambodia national development goals and SDGs
- The extent to which it is a realistic in its approach and takes into account budgetary realities

Tripartite participation

- The extent to which it has been based on a solid mapping of constituent needs and is fully reflective of those needs in execution
- The extent to which that the DWCP has worked in partnerships with tripartite constituents in delivering DWCP outcomes and built national capacities and support policy change.
- What are the main capacity and resource constraints of the tripartite constituents in delivering DWCP in line with their priorities? And if so have there been steps to address them collectively?

The focus and coherence of the programme's design and strategies

- Is there coherence and integrated approach in DWCP strategy? Does the DWCP fit within ILO's strategic policy framework and programme and budget priorities and strategies.
- Does the DWCP reflects a consensus between the country and the ILO on decent work priorities and areas of cooperation?
- To what extent the cross-cutting drivers have been integrated into DWCP e.g. gender mainstreaming, ILS, social dialogues, environmental sustainability and attention to vulnerable target groups
- The extent that the current programme is coherent, logic and captures opportunities for reinforcing each other in meeting objectives. To what extent, the DWCP has the ability to respond to emerging opportunities?
- The extent to which the resource mobilization is an integral part of DWCP strategies.

Effectiveness and adequacy of institutional set up to deliver ILO's programme in Cambodia

- Will all the planned outcomes likely to be achieved by the end of 2018? Have the progress/changes taken place in the past three years (against the indicators/milestones set)? If not, why did it not happen?
- What have been emerging risks and/or opportunities? Have they affected the progress of any specific outcomes?
- To what extent the operation and institutional set up are effective for DWCP implementation, adequate monitoring and ensuring delivering of the expected results?
- Is there clarity and agreement on how results have been documented? Are verified indicators with targets and milestones being applied? Has the monitoring plan been prepared and used as management tools?
- The extent to which the DWCP tripartite steering committee has been engaged in monitoring the progress of DWCP? The extent to which constituents drive implementation of the programme and contribute to reviews and decision-making on DWCP prioritization.

Efficiency

- Is the ILO contribution to the outcome adequately resourced? Any technical cooperation activities (regardless of the sources of funds) contribute to this outcome? Any other resources? If under-resourced, why?
- Are work processes efficient and timely?

Impact and sustainability

- Are there exit strategies to ensure results are sustainable by partners' institutions at various levels (local, provincial and national level)? To what extent do the national tripartite constituents take ownership of DWCP e.g, have there been any contributions (in cash and in kind) by the tripartite or other partners in delivering DWCP results
- Are the outputs delivered under the DWCP being used by the partners/ target groups?
- To what extent have the tripartite constituents improved capacities to influence national policy and resources within decent work areas. Any evidence e.g. national tripartite constituents are actively involved in national development planning forums and networks.
- To what extent and how does the DWCP and its associated governance/coordination arrangements contribute to strengthening social dialogue.

3.6: Limitations and considerations

As noted above, the evaluation was based on a streamlined TOR which prioritized a desk review of existing evaluative and review material, supplemented by a limited number of targeted stakeholder consultations. This approach was underpinned by an appreciation of (i) the short period under review (2016-2018), and (ii) an assessment by the ILO Country Office and JPO that the previous CPR process had been particularly comprehensive and was still largely relevant.

The late signing of CPR contracts also meant that the CPR and initial tripartite consultative processes for DWCP drafting purposes were compressed and overlapped. In practice, the subsequent DWCP formulation consultations brought forward a number of observations and insights which were also relevant to the CPR. To the extent possible, these have been incorporated into the current draft. The initial findings of a comprehensive partnership mapping conducted for the formulation of the DWCP 20019-2023 also provided invaluable input and is appended accordingly to this report

A further factor which influenced CPR drafting was the fact that much of the data for 2018 was not yet available (the desk review was conducted in August 2018). Where data became available later (e.g. the BFC annual report for 2017-2018), this has been incorporated to the extent possible.

4. KEY COMPONENTS OF THE DWCP

4.1 Priorities and outcomes

The first DWCP (2006-2010) had a strong focus on employment and skills development, which has continued throughout all DWCP periods; with only the emphasis shifting. The second DWCP (2011-2015) had a strong focus on dispute resolution, skills matching and youth employment, as well as on the revision of several key policies and laws. The third DWCP (2016-2018) consolidates the achievements of previous DWCPs and increases the emphasis on policy implementation, youth employment and entrepreneurship, and sustainable enterprises.

As elaborated later, collaboration with government partners other than the Ministry of Labour and Vocational Training has expanded considerably during the current DWCP period, particularly with the Ministry of Economy and Finance (MEF) which now leads work on social protection and the national garment sector strategy.

In line with the overarching focus on implementation of the NEP and relevant sections of the IDP as cornerstones of the DWCP 2016–2018, the current programme is based on the following three priorities, sub-strategies, nine outcomes and related sub-strategies, indicators, and targets:

Priority 1: Improving industrial relations and rights at work

- Outcome 1.1: Professional and technical capacities of social partners strengthened.
- Outcome 1.2: Improved laws, mechanisms and processes, particularly in the garment sector for industrial relations, dispute prevention and resolution and wage setting.
- Outcome 1.3: More effective application of equality and rights at work for discriminated-against and vulnerable groups.

Priority 2: promoting an enabling environment for decent employment growth and sustainable enterprises, with a particular focus on young people.

- Outcome 2.1: Mechanisms for policy leadership, coordination, and implementation strengthened to support development and implementation of policies and programmes.
- Outcome 2.2: Enhanced employability of men and women through improved and expanded gender-responsive skills development and employment services.
- Outcome 2.3: Effective progress made to enhance enterprise productivity, competitiveness, working conditions, and promotion of entrepreneurship.

Priority 3: Improving and expanding social protection and Occupational Safety and Health (OSH)

- Outcome 3.1: Increased social protection quality and coverage
- Outcome 3.2: Increased transitioning from the informal to the formal economy, particularly in rural areas, including women and indigenous people.
- Outcome 3.3: Improved and expanded OSH, with particular focus on hazardous work.

Addressing gender and other cross-cutting issues have a high priority in the above context, including a focus on domestic workers and the predominantly female workforces in the entertainment industry and garment sector.

4.2 Monitoring, evaluation and reporting

A distinct feature of the current DWCP is the attention given to monitoring and evaluation, with a separate set of indicators and targets set out in the DWCP in this regard, as follows:

Indicators	Targets
Annual labour force surveys or household surveys with a core labour force module	Core labour force statistics included annually in SDG indicators
Regular collection of labour market indicators from administrative records	Employment-related SDG indicators included annually from administrative records
Comprehensive labour market information system including additional quantitative and qualitative indicators	Regular (annual) bulletin on the national decent work indicators (including qualitative and institutional framework indicators)
M&E-DWCP implementation plan maintained	Baseline indicators (SDG employment-related indicators and other qualitative and quantitative indicators} and end-of-programme indicators (SDGs and other indicators} maintained

The expectation is that the DWCP governance mechanism will prioritize attention in this area, including:

- the prioritization of links with the country's National Strategy for the Development of Statistics
- provision of support to the following broad activities:
 - household-based surveys such as the labour force survey (LFS) or household income and expenditure survey (HIES), aiming annually to collect a core module of labour survey statistics;
 - collection of labour market data on administrative records from all relevant public institutions (e.g. ministries and state agencies), and relevant private institutions (e.g. employers' and workers' organizations); and
 - ensuring that all DWCP outcome indicators and means of verification are integrated into the comprehensive DECP monitoring framework (M&E-DWCP).

The comprehensive framework for DWCP monitoring (the M&E-DWCP) provides the basis for DWCP governance attention in this respect and pursues two inter-related objectives:

- provision of information on achievements in implementing existing national employment-related policies and strategies such as the NEP, the NSPS, the IDP, and the LMP; and
- contributing to monitoring progress on achieving employment-related SDG Targets.

Expected outputs are:

- A comprehensive list of labour market and decent work indicators, both quantitative and qualitative, covering particularly all employment-related SDG indicators; and
- A broad range of additional quantitative and qualitative indicators to contribute to monitoring progress in the key policies and strategies outlined above, with special attention to capturing the gendered dimension of progress.

Building institutional capacity to produce these indicators on a regular basis (many annual) is further prioritized, as recommended in international standards on labour and work statistics. The DWCP expectation is to draw on data which is generated to showcase ILO contributions to achieving the SDGs, since most ILO work in the country addresses one or more SDG Targets. Section 6 examines progress in implementing this aspect of the DWCP.

4.3 Risk Identification and Management

The DWCP notes that achieving the intended outcomes will depend on the political will of the Government, including the allocation of national budget support for the agreed outcomes; and the social partners' and other key stakeholders' commitment to work towards shared goals. To succeed in these objectives, the DWCP assumes the following:

- a level of political stability;
- continuation of the current major policy directions;
- continuing economic and jobs growth; and
- continuing commitment on the part of Government and the social partners to more inclusive and equitable growth.

While the DWCP assumes an increasing level of national budgetary support for the agreed outcomes, it also recognizes the Government's fiscal space limitations. Funding gaps prevailed at the beginning of the DWCP period for most of the outcomes, with the assumption that national partners and ILO would together mobilize the necessary resources. Although DWCP outcomes and the concomitant resources were defined prudently with regard to likely sources of funding in a context of decreasing potential for securing donor support for Cambodia, an inability to secure the necessary financing of the DWCP nevertheless remained a risk.

The key mechanism for managing these risks and adjusting the DWCP as necessary in response to unforeseen developments was the annual tripartite review meeting and ongoing coordination and review by the Subcommittee on DWCP under the Inter-Ministerial Committee for the National Employment Policy (IMC-NEP).

5. OVERVIEW OF PROGESS IN PROGRAMME IMPLEMENTATION

Country Priority 1: Improving industrial relations and rights at work

Outcome 1.1: Professional and technical capacities of social partners strengthened

Key initiatives and developments in this regard were:

- The strengthening of **CAMFEBA's policy and organizational capacities** as reflected in annual increases of its membership and policy engagement initiatives. The latter included position papers on:
 - a) The draft Minimum Wage legislation, which was developed through a robust consultative process with member associations. Since the launch of the paper and a minimum wage video which was additionally developed, CAMFEBA has received numerous requests to make presentations at business organizations and Chambers of Commerce (both domestic and international), a strong sign of its raised profile and credibility within the business community. The position paper was reported widely in the national media and was widely disseminated and is being used as part of the advocacy process. A technical and strategic analysis report on the draft Minimum Wage legislation was produced for the CAMFEBA key negotiators, enabling CAMFEBA to engage effectively on a law which has significant implications for its membership.
 - b) The draft Law on Procedures for Labour Dispute Adjudication (drafting of the law was subsequently suspended).
 - c) Workplace-based learning good practices in the light manufacturing and food processing sectors.
 - d) The development of the platform economy in Cambodia (a national report on the impact of new technologies on jobs was to be launched in 2018.
- Initiation by CAMFEBA of the **Purchasing Managers Index (PMI)**, which provides information on forecasted sales, stock, purchasing etc from surveyed companies.
- The relaunching of **CAMFEBA's legal and training services** for members and non-members in 2017 in line with the annual workplan, along with a restructuring of the Legal Department and recruitment of a new manager.
- Enhanced trade union coordination and collective capacities around the DWCP, with 15 major national confederations and federations forming a National Trade Union Council for the DWCP (NTUC-DWCP) to support the monitoring, evaluation and reporting on the implementation of DWCP 2016-2018. The NTUC-DWCP provides a forum to coordinate and guide the implementation of the DWCP among trade unions in Cambodia.
- Establishment of an informal trade union contact group in the context of Better Factories Cambodia (BFC) to discuss more in-depth issues in the garment sector, such as the competitive state of the industry, issues related to the use of short term and long term contracts and election of union representatives for the Project Advisory Committee (PAC).
- Development of **membership organizing plans by workers' organizations** in the garment, tourism and informal economy sectors.
- Strengthened capacity for 42 members of 'Women's Union Network' as a result of training on International Labour Standards (ILS), collective bargaining and leadership skills in order to promote greater representation of women in trade unions.
- Improved **knowledge and understandings for tripartite partners** as a result of a series of training sessions on wages policy, minimum wage setting criteria, economics and econometrics. In 2017, over 300 tripartite representatives/members (31% women) directly benefited from the training.
- Improved access for tripartite partners to technical information relevant to social dialogue and collective bargaining through updates on labour market information and relevant indicators provided by NEA reporting and ILO bulletins on Cambodia's garment and footwear sectors.

<u>Outcome 1.2</u>: Improved laws, mechanisms and processes, particularly in the garment sector, for industrial relations, dispute prevention and resolution and wage-setting

Key initiatives and developments in this regard were:

- Adoption of the **Minimum Wage Law**, with active social partner engagement. The law *inter alia* creates the basis for gradual expansion of the minimum wage to other sectors than the garment and footwear industry.
- Establishment of a **tripartite Minimum Wage Council** to oversee implementation of the law and annual minimum wage negotiations (with this role being transferred from the Labour Advisory Council).
- Ongoing technical support to the Arbitration Council and Foundation.
- Ongoing dialogue involving tripartite partners concerning changes to the **Trade Union Law**, with a *Prakas* issued in July 2018 on improving the requirements and procedures around the provision on trade union Most Representative Status (MRS) in the workplace (the ILO has been requested to provide technical support to changes in the law to take account of trade union concerns, in particular).
- **Registration of a number of new unions** in 2017, including six confederations, 40 federations and 635 local unions, despite the difficulties posed by the Trade Union Law.
- The **status of Fixed-Term Contracts** set by law at four years, after which they become unlimited, a previously contentious issue.
- Ongoing expansion of joint worker/management Performance Improvement Consultative Committees (PICCs) to 164 garment and footwear export factories in 2018, supported by BFC factory advisory services.
- Improved **work-place-based capacities for workers and employers** as a result of training modules conducted for garment factories to respond to specific thematic issues identified in the enterprises concerned. A total of 2,067 union/worker representatives (60% of whom were women) and 1,793 management staff (53% women), were trained on IR related matters in 2017.
- With respect to **disputes resolution** (2016), 476 cases of individual disputes and 127 cases of collective disputes were filed with the MoLVT of which 228 were completely conciliated and 56 were partly resolved. The remaining 70 unsettled collective disputes were referred to the Arbitration Council.
- 29 new CBAs concluded and registered with the MoLVT in 2016-2017, while 20 factories signed enterprise level MOU/ULP (Unfair Labour Practice) Agreements supporting collective bargaining negotiations and opting for binding arbitration awards on right-based disputes. 15 factories improved their grievance-handing mechanism or adopted a well-functioning grievance procedure.
- Initiation of negotiations to conclude the first **sector-wide collective bargaining agreement in Cambodia's garment and footwear industry,** involving GMAC, and unions in the sector and 17 buyers under the global ACT initiative,¹⁰ with ILO technical support under the regional garment sector supply chain project). This is a significant development with implications for other sectors in Cambodia.

<u>Outcome 1.3</u>: More effective application of equality and rights at work for discriminated and vulnerable groups

Key initiatives and developments in this regard were:

Prakas 194 for workers in entertainment industry

• The **guidelines for implementation of** *Prakas 194* were launched in December 2016 to support the effective application of working conditions and occupational safety and health for entertainment workers, including for lesbian, gay bisexual, transgender and intersex (LGBTI) workers.

¹⁰ ACT: 'Action, Collaboration, Transformation' initiative to address living wages). Established by IndustriALL and a number of international garment brands.

- ILO collaborated with UNAIDS to provide technical support to the **Cambodia Tripartite Coordination Committee (TCC) and the Ministerial AIDS Committee (MAC)** of the MoLVT in implementing of ministerial regulations on working conditions and OSH protection for vulnerable groups.
- HIV/AIDS workplace response was integrated into CBCA training and outreach programmes targeting enterprise members of CAMFEBA and GMAC. In 2016, 5000 formal workers (500 males, 4500 females) and 1400 informal workers (400 males, 1000 females) from the entertainment and construction sectors received the training and awareness raising on prevention and reduction of HIV-AIDS and HIV-related stigma and discrimination.

Domestic workers

• Input provided to a series of tripartite-plus other stakeholder consultations undertaken by the MOLVT to develop a **new regulation on conditions for domestic work in 2016**. The draft new *Prakas* when adopted will mark a breakthrough normative effort to promote decent work for domestic workers in Cambodia, in keeping up with the key principles of ILO Convention 189. A Tripartite Technical Working Group was established to support the development of the *Prakas*, including an in-depth legislative gap analysis and recommendations for legal reform.

Child labour

 BFC continued its collaboration with GMAC on the settlement of child labour cases as set out in the MOU signed in December 2014. A protocol on child labour was developed, outlining roles and responsibilities of stakeholders, particularly for employers, GMAC and labour inspectors. On-going implementation at the enterprise level continues on a case by case whenever cases in factories are identified in the course of BFC assessment visits. The 2018 BFC compliance report showed that the incidence of child labour in the garment and footwear export sectors had been "reduced sharply" from 74 cases between May 2013 and April 2014 to 10 cases in the current reporting period, with underage workers often using falsified identification documents to get jobs.

Migrant workers: Refer to summary of initiatives under the TRIANGLE Project under Outcome 2.2

<u>CP Priority 2:</u> Promoting and Enabling Environment for Decent Employment Growth and Sustainable Enterprises, with a particular focus on young people

<u>Outcome 2.1:</u> Mechanism for policy leadership, coordination and implementation strengthened to support development and implementation of policies and programmes

Key initiatives and developments in this regard were:

- Adoption of the **National Action Plan 2017-2019 to implement the NEP**: Strategic interventions under the plan include a focus on technical and vocational skills training and recognition, addressing the social and economic costs of migration and the supporting the reintegration of returning migrant workers. Operationalization of the M&E component of the policy was prioritized in 2018, with the preparation of the first progress report (not available at the time of this review).
- Establishment of the Inter-Ministerial Committee for Leading, Monitoring and Evaluating the implementation of the NEP (IMC-NEP), supported by training to deliver the action plan. By the end of 2017, 18 provincial committees had been set up to support the implementation and monitoring of the NEP at the provincial level. Four provinces were selected for in-depth implementation support (Banteay Meanchey, Kampong Speu, Siem Reap and Sihanoukville), with a view to longer-term scaling-up across all provinces. 100 members of the committees for the four provinces were trained on work planning and budgeting for NEP implementation.

• Development of a **draft strategy to promote the competiveness, sustainability and value-addition of the Cambodian garment sector** under the auspices of the Cambodia Supreme National Economic Council (SNEC). BFC worked closely with the MEF to facilitate discussions with national and international stakeholders and provided technical inputs. The draft was being consulted with key stakeholders as this review was being completed and will be adopted in 2019 with ILO support. The ILO / BFC role in development of the strategy was described by MEF as instrumental: "Without the BFC support this strategy would not have progressed," MEF officials leading the drafting process informed the reviewers. The added-value of BFC's strong links with GMAC, relevant trade unions, international investors, buyers and brands were cited as being of vital importance in the strategy development process.

<u>Outcome 2.2</u>: Enhanced employability of men and women through improved and expanded gender responsive skills development and public employment services

Key initiatives and developments in this regard were:

Skills development

- The **National TVET Policy** was developed with ILO (and other IDP) support, adopted in June 2017 and officially launched by the Prime Minister. National mechanisms/working groups and facilities to support implementation of the policy were established with ILO technical support, e.g. the Industry Advisory Group and Sector Skills Councils.
- A core focus of ILO technical support has been the development of **Competency Standards** (CS), Competency-based Curriculum (CBC) and Competency Assessment Packages (CAP). With training and technical guidance from DGTVET, the Industrial Technical Institute (ITI) is leading this work for Metal Arc Welding at levels 1, 2, 3 and 4 of the Cambodia Qualification Framework (CQF). At the same time, the National Polytechnic Institute of Cambodia (NPIC) is leading the development of the CSs, CBCs and CAPs for CQF levels 1 and 2 of Machining, Baking and Fruit and Vegetable Processing. Sector consultations with industry stakeholders, including expert workers, were conducted in 2016 to validate the draft competency profiles, CS and CBC for the four occupations.
- At a sector level, ILO has prioritized the improvement of **skill levels within the tourism sector** in partnership with the Ministry of Tourism (MIT). Combining the development of competency standards, training and assessment centres, and linking to standards under the ASEAN Mutual Recognition of Skills arrangement, the programme aims to professionalize the sector with a target of ensuring that every worker has a formally certified skill. The MIT counterpart interviewed for this review commended the ILO technical expertise brought into the design, implementation and rolling out of the programme, which will continue and be extended under the DWCP 2019-2023. The quality of ILO partnership was also highlighted, with the MIT counterpart further describing the ILO as a committed, professional, responsive and well-grounded partner.
- Establishment of an **Industry Advisory Group (IAG) on manufacturing** in March 2017. The IAG endorsed the new competency-based standards and curriculum to the National Training Board on 24 March and 20 October 2017.
- Development of first tripartite **Sector Skills Councils** to provide a sustainable coordination framework among policy makers, industry actors and training providers for sustained quality TVET development.

Employment and labour migrant services

Following the non-continuation of the ILO/China South-South Cooperation project on employment services and labour market information after its conclusion in 2016, technical support has been provided from Bangkok for the ongoing strengthening and expansion of the National Employment Agency (NEA). The particular focus in light of limited resource availability has been on labour market information gathering and analysis; improved quality and expanded coverage of career counselling and employment services; and increased outreach to vulnerable communities in rural areas. Two NEA new job centres were established and operationalised in Banteay Meanchey and Preah Sihanoukville provinces in 2017,

making a total of nine job centres. 3,412 young workers (1,923 women) secured jobs through the NEA's services in 2017.

- The operation manual for career guidance for Cambodian youth was updated incorporating competency standards on core employability skills of the ILO Regional Model Competency Standards. Augmenting the guidance is a Career Self-Evaluation Quiz that also was updated in 2017. This is aimed at developing career prospects and soft skills for young job seekers using the NEA services. According to NEA data, 13,388 secondary students (grades 10-12 and 7,180 were females) were provided with career guidance and another 523 (46% females) were trained on soft skills in 2017.
- The ILO guide 'Youth rights at work' was adapted to the national context of Cambodia and disseminated widely to reach young women and men through a training of trainers "cascade." The newly trained facilitators led initiatives to raise awareness on rights and responsibilities at work among hundreds of young job seekers, out-of-school youth, and community-based youth volunteers. The awareness-raising activities utilized a variety of methods such as social media, radio talks, workshops and counselling sessions.
- Access to and utilization of the services of Cambodia's Migrant Resource Centres (MRCs) supported by the ILO / Australia TRIANGLE Project continued to increase in Phnom Penh and four provinces (Battambang, Kampong Cham, Kampong Thom and Kampot). The MRCs connected their services with private sector counterparts at provincial and national levels, especially within special economic zones, to promote access to local job information for young people. A total 10,589 migrant workers and members of their families (of whom 4,973 were men and 5,564 women, including at least 1,000 young job seekers), were provided with information and services for domestic and overseas employment in 2017.
- Alongside the establishment of the MRCs, a cornerstone of ILO / TRIANGLE Project engagement in Cambodia during the previous and current DWCP periods has been the establishment and ongoing technical support of a **national complaints mechanism for migrant workers**. The mechanism is widely seen as functioning well and providing a much needed service. It received 490 complaints in 2017 (on behalf of 1,430 persons, 37 percent of whom were women). The most common complaints were delays in deployment/jobs not provided (61 percent) and passports not provided (56 percent). The most common remedy was the return of documents.
- 10 officials of three relevant departments of the MOLVT (Employment Office, in charge of Malaysia, ASEAN, and Thailand) and all 26 officials from Provincial Departments of Labour and Vocational Training (PDOLVTs), together with representatives of trade unions and CSOs, were provided with training on Dispute Resolution of Migrant Worker Grievances, and Ethical Recruitment Training. As a result, the officials have been empowered to receive and mediate complaints of migrant workers with private recruitment agencies more quickly and effectively, in line with *Prakas 249* adopted in 2013.
- A publication on the assessment of the effectiveness of the **complaints mechanism for migrant workers** was launched with ILO tripartite constituents and stakeholders. This was achieved through the consolidation of the reports from the three Migrant Resource Centres (MRCs) operating in Kampong Cham, Prey Veng and Battambang. In addition to the three functioning MRCs, two new MRCs were established in Kampong Thom and Kampot with TRIANGLE Project support in 2017. These operate in partnership with NEA to provide safe migration information and counselling services to migrants, migrant workers, and their families.

Outcome 2.3: Effective progress made to enhance enterprise productivity, competitiveness and working conditions and promote entrepreneurship

Key initiatives and developments in this regard were:

Promoting enterprise productivity, competitiveness and working conditions

• Development with active BFC engagement of the draft **Garment and Footwear Sector Development Strategy 2019-2025**, which *inter alia* aims to improve industry productivity and competiveness and sustainability. To be supported by the establishment of Private Garment and Footwear Industry Advisory Committee with BFC participation to provide oversight and coordination.

- Increase in the **number of garment and footwear export factories in compliance with all 21 critical issues** under the BFC factory monitoring and transparent reporting system. In the period 1 May 2017 to 30 June 2018, 464 factories were assessed, with the level of compliance increasing from 33 percent to 44 percent. The number of violations on the 21 critical issues decreased from 329 to 234 in the same period.
- Agreement on and initial implementation of new partnership MOUs with two of the major China-based manufacturing and investment groups active in Cambodia's garment and foot wear sectors, with a view to strengthening collaboration to improve working conditions, productivity and competiveness
- Expansion of BFC training programmes in the garment and footwear sectors in areas ranging from improving enterprise management to OSH, women's leadership, supervisory skills and addressing sexual harassment.
- Improved levels of cooperation and communication in factories that signed the enterprise level MOU/ULP Agreement, from "moderately" to "considerably;" 10 (42 percent) of 24 factories that signed the agreements had also signed new CBAs and/or renewed their expired CBAs. The factories with well-functioning or improved grievance mechanisms continued to have their grievances successfully settled at 100% success rate.
- Use by one private-sector buyer (H&M) of the ILO's Small Business Competitive (SBC) and In-Business tools to enhance productivity and working conditions. Five factories were trained with the support from this partner.

Promoting entrepreneurship

- Engagement of thousands of young people in **entrepreneurship training** via the Community-based Enterprise Development (C-BED) training approach via:
 - a) Four partner organizations (MoEYS, Oxfam, PADEK and Plan International) who institutionalized the model and integrated it in their organizational strategy and programme for implementation. Seven new training modules for C-BED using social learning and activity-based methodology were developed to support delivery of C-BED. In 2017, training for 4,642 rural and young men and women aged 15-30 was provided by partners across the country.
 - b) The MoEYS as part of entrepreneurship training for in-school and out-of-school youth in 2017. For rural out-of-school youth the training using C-BED was delivered through youth centres in four provinces. More than 3,200 young trainees (50 percent females) participated in the training that was offered in collaboration with several private companies (Smart, Wing, Coca-Cola, Krispy Kreme, ACLEDA and Canadia Banks, etc.). With this achievement, the MoEYS was recognized in 2017 as the newest Guinness World Record holder for the Largest Practical Business Seminar, which was successfully conducted using the C-BED approach.
- Roll-out of the **Know About Business (KAB) package** in Khmer language to secondary schools nationwide. The KAB has been adopted by the MoEYS as an entrepreneurship education tool for secondary education. It was integrated into the national curriculum in 2018. A national roll-out plan was prepared and costed in support of the KAB dissemination and delivery.

<u>CP Priority 3</u>: Improving and Expanding Social Protection and Occupation Safety and Health (OSH)

Outcome 3.1: Increased social protection quality and coverage

2016-2018 saw a number of significant achievements and interventions under the DWCP, as follows:

• Launch of the **NSSF's health insurance scheme** in September 2016 with ILO support. By the end of 2017, approximately 1.2 million workers were registered and 527,074 workers utilized health care services with the contracted health facilities. A massive registration took place during the last quarter of 2017,

following the Prime Minister's announcement of the expansion of health services for informal workers through the Health Equity Fund (HEF), including construction workers and tuk tuk drivers. In 2017, there were 2,118 new enterprises registered, including about 300,000 workers.

- Ongoing technical support provided for NSSF planning and operations in the context of expanding responsibilities which include the **introduction of a national pension scheme** in 2019 (see below) and extension of NSSF coverage to informal workers under the MoLVT's notification 307 (19 October 2017) which reduced the NSSF registration threshold from enterprises with at least 8 employees to those with 1 employee. The NSSF was further mandated to register informal workers and pregnant workers to receive allowances from the government upon birth. By the end of 2017, approximately 50,000 informal workers had been registered.
- Technical support in collaboration with a number of partners to the Technical Working Group (TWG) which developed the **National Social Protection Policy Framework, 2016-2025**. The ILO took the leadership on pension reform, but also provided technical advice and inputs to the social health protection and social assistance sections of the framework (funded by ILO-Korea Project, 2015-2017).
- Participation in a working group coordinated by UNICEF to support the development of a Social Assistance Policy Framework (SAPF) as part of the wider Social Protection Policy Framework, particularly providing perspectives on the relationship between contributory and non-contributory schemes (funded by ILO-Korea Project, 2015-2017).
- Costing of the **income-support schemes** proposed in the SAPF: a child grant; school scholarships; school meals; and, disability and old age pensions (funded by ILO-Korea Project, 2015-2017).
- A follow-up joint study by ILO and UNICEF on **institutional options to support implementation of a cash grant scheme for pregnant women and children** of ages 0-5, which was prioritized by the Government (funded by EU-SPS, 2017). Informing these discussions were the lessons of the SSDM pilot (refer above).
- Initial feasibility studies, including a sector value chain analysis, on **expansion of EII coverage** to the construction sector, providing an entree point for informal workers into statutory social security (co-funded by EU-SPS, ILO-Korea and ILO-OSH Projects, 2017). This work complements an ILO OSH project in the construction industry under the DWCP 2016-2018.
- An overall **evaluation of the EII scheme** in 2017, including a survey of employers and workers, with view to supporting the NSSF to improve its efficiency and effectiveness (funded by ILO-Korea Project). Follow-up to this evaluation includes a separate ILO / ILO-Korea-funded initiative to support the development of an organisational development strategy and plan for NSSF.
- An actuarial review of social health insurance in 2017 for second SHI branch for civil servants, with NSSF effectively acting as a single payer (requested by MEF, funded by ILO-Korea). If implemented, the will be the first step towards a contributory system for public sector social security, financed to date by the national budget.
- An analysis of the Government's then proposed extension of existing pension arrangements, from the point of view of population coverage, adequacy of benefits and affordability and financial sustainability (requested by MEF and MOLVT, co-funded by AFD and ILO, 2017). Drawing *inter alia* on this earlier work, the MOLVT plans to launch a universal pension scheme under the NSSF in 2019. Ongoing legal and investment advice and capacity development is planned to support implementation of the scheme.
- Technical/legal advice (HQ sourced) for the formulation of a legal framework (to include new Social Security and Social Protection Laws) to regulate the entire social protection system in line with the National Social Protection Framework, addressing legal gaps for the expansion of the system left by the Social Security Law of 2002 (joint ILO and GIZ initiative, 2017). Three joint missions took place in 2016 to help establish the expectations of different stakeholders. Preliminary recommendations from national and ILO legal experts include carrying out a regulatory impact assessment to map potential overlaps and gaps with respect to existing legislation. The public consultations required in the process of developing new legislation are expected to become a forum to validate the vision of the Policy Framework and begin designing the schemes it sets out.

<u>Outcome 3.2</u>: Increased transitioning from the informal to the formal economy, particularly in rural areas, including women and indigenous people

- Development of the NEP action plan and first progress report (the latter not available at the time of this review). The NEP provides the centre-piece of ILO support for the transition of workers from informal to formal employment. Progress has been slow due to delayed establishment of the national architecture to oversee implementation and limited provision of national budget support to date. Training was provided to the provincial-level committee for coordinating and implementing the NEP for four selected provinces in 2017. This helped develop measures to integrate formalization into national decentralization and de-concentralization strategies and programmes to be adopted by the local governments in these provinces. Longer term planning for NEP implementation under the next DWCP will continue the focus on the same four provinces with a view to in-depth targeted implementation which can over time be scaled-up to other provinces
- Ongoing attention to strengthening of the skills development system, including competency standards and assessment, which is designed to enhance employability within the formal economy (see earlier commentary).

Planned support for the ongoing extension of the indigenous community identification and certification process as a basis for the granting of communal land titles was not able to proceed due to a withdrawal of the resources for the ILO project in this area by the German Government. This shift was due to a reprioritization of German engagement in Cambodia. Resources have subsequently been made available to activate previous work in this regard in partnership with the Ministry of Rural development under the DWCP 2019-2023.

Outcome 3.2: Improved and expanded OSH, with a particular focus on hazardous work

The priority sectors for ILO engagement on OSH since 2016 have been the construction, garment and footwear industries. Key initiatives and developments in this regard were:

- Operationalization of the **National OSH Committee** since 2017. The initial work of the Committee has focused on development of a comprehensive strategy to prevent and mitigate the mass fainting incidents in the garment industry.
- Completion of draft **2nd OSH Master Plan** for the period of 2018-2022 in November 2017 (subsequently adopted in early 2019). The draft Plan was refined as the result of a technical review by the ILO and social partners and provides a cornerstone for ILO technical engagement under the DWCP 2019-2023.
- Establishment by the Department of Occupational Safety and Health (DoSH) and Ministerial AIDS Committee (MAC)'s Secretariat of a programme to give effect the ministerial regulation (*Prakas* no. 194) on "working conditions, occupational safety and health rules in enterprises, establishments, companies of entertainment sector", particularly vulnerable to HIV. Implementation guidelines to be used by labour inspectors in this area were finalized in 2016.
- Ongoing progress in addressing **OSH within garment and footwear export sector workplaces**: OSH accounts for the largest cluster of compliance points under the ILO Better Factories Cambodia factory monitoring programme, covering a total number of 60 compliance questions. The 2018 BFC annual report indicates that OSH non-compliance levels remain high and are often the result of a lack of proper policies, procedures and division of roles and responsibilities at enterprise level. This suggestion is supported by the analysis in this report that links factories' performance on legal OSH matters to the quality of their OSH management systems. The better factories do on their OSH management systems, the lower their non-compliance.¹¹

¹¹ Better Factories Cambodia (2018). Annual Report 2018: An Industry and Compliance Review. ILO and IFC, Geneva

- In the above context, a focus on OSH within BFC workplace monitoring, advisory and training services
 as well as engagement to strengthen MoLVT joint labour inspectorate capacities. OSH was a priority for
 BFC in the context of collaboration on a revised/improved checklist of the labour inspection services; the
 agreed concerted focus (also with MOC and GMAC) on low compliance factories; the development (still
 subject to further review and updating) of a Joint Action Plan; and the development of an enforcement
 protocol and action plan around critical and zero tolerance issues (still pending final agreement).
- Training in collaboration with BFC **on strategic OSH compliance planning**; and the introduction by BFC of a comprehensive OSH inspection training programme for MoLVT, GMAC, unions and other stakeholders under the ILO global Better Work Academy. Both initiatives will be continued through the new DWCP period

6. OVERALL ASSESSMENT OF PROGRAMME PERFORMANCE

6.1 The role and relevance of ILO in Cambodia, its niche and comparative advantage, and partnerships

The review found the DWCP to be highly relevant.

• The extent to which the national political, economic and social factors have shaped formulation of DWCP

The document review and all stakeholder feedback affirmed the relevance of the DWCP at national legislative, policy and strategy levels, drawing on a comprehensive previous DWCP review, participatory country diagnostic process and highly interactive DWCP drafting process. The links set out in the DWCP to the RGC's Rectangular Strategy for Growth, Employment, Equity and Efficiency (Phase III) and National Strategic Development Plan 2014-2018 are well recognized and explicit. Of specific relevance to the Rectangular Strategy have been DWCP engagements in areas including private sector/SME development; partner capacity building and human resource development. Key areas of alignment with the NSDP include private sector development, employment creation, labour market development, human resource development and gender equality.

As a sector example, the review of the ILO's engagement since 2012 on social protection highlighted the longer term consistent alignment over multiple DWCP periods to Cambodia's relevant policy and strategic frameworks, as well as to the country's broader long-term development agenda as set out in the Rectangular Strategy Phases III and II and the relevant National Strategic Development Plans (NSDP). Project documents during the period concerned directly referenced such linkages. Furthermore, the ILO's social protection interventions have contributed to Cambodia's ability to meet the Economic Vulnerability Index (EVI) requirements for graduation from LDC status.

As elaborated later, the design of the DWCP in the context was largely centred around Cambodia's National Employment Policy (NEP) 2015-2025. This was seen as providing a unifying framework to enhance focus and impact in light of the NEP's prioritization *inter alia* of harmonized industrial relations, strengthening of minimum wage setting mechanisms, protection of migrant workers, improvement of conditions of work and implementation of international labour standards. Linked to this core orientation was prioritization of support to the implementation of relevant components of Cambodia's Industrial Development Policy 2015-2025, including SME development and economic diversification beyond the current reliance on the garment sector.

Further key policy linkages in the DWCP are the National Policy for Cambodian Youth Development, the Policy on Labour Migration for Cambodia 2015-2018, the National Policy on Indigenous Peoples' Development and the Strategic Plan for Gender Equality and Women's Empowerment. The DWCP link to Cambodia's then National Social Protection Strategy shifted in 2016 to the Social Protection Policy Framework 2016-2025 under the purview of the Ministry of Economy and Finance (MEF), the development of which included active ILO technical input.

To the extent that these policy and strategic documents continue to reflect national political, economic and social factors relevant to the Decent Work Agenda, the DWCP in turn reflects such factors.

• Does the DWCP reflect a consensus between the country and the ILO on decent work priorities and areas of cooperation?

The consultative process to develop the DWCP was intensive and transparent, encompassing a very well attended tripartite workshop to consider findings of the previous DWCP review and begin articulating priorities for the next DWCP, and multiple tripartite workshops to consider the country diagnostic and evolving draft DWCP. A parallel but linked consultation on stakeholder perspectives and priorities for the next phase of Better Factories Cambodia provide additional opportunities to ensure that future planning was well grounded in stakeholder priorities and the rapidly evolving local context. The full DWCP document was endorsed by constituents through a tripartite dialogue process before finalization

Feedback provided by Development Cooperation Project evaluations carried out during the DWCP period validated the alignment of DWCP Priorities and Outcomes with national priorities, challenges and developments, as well as the strength of consensus between the ILO and National Constituents in this regard. In the case of BFC, the single biggest and longest standing ILO programme in Cambodia, stakeholder feedback to a mid-term evaluation conducted in 2018 universally affirmed the continued (and in fact renewed) relevance of BFC's role and presence in Cambodia after 18 years. The sense of renewed relevance was linked by several stakeholders to a range of factors. Standing out amongst these were the success of BFC's role with respect to development of the national garment sector strategy; the growing evidence made publically available of improvements in garment sector working conditions which are attributable to BFC engagement; emerging new stakeholder relationships; and BFC's advocacy and facilitation role in mobilizing stakeholders to act collectively on the issue of workers' transportation in light of high death and injury rates of workers commuting to work.

The fact that the consensus was well based and continued to hold during the DWCP period can be seen through the active participation of national constituents in the annual reviews conducted by the IMC-NEP DWCP sub-committee and the process of intensive and highly engaged tripartite consultations to develop the DWCP for 2019-2023. This included a request from MoLVT for an additional (and very well-attended) tripartite dialogue that was held on the DWCP first draft in December 2018.

• The extent of DWCP priorities consistent with ILO's capacities and its comparative advantages vis-à-vis other UN agencies

The DWCP links to three mutually reinforcing outcome areas under the UNDAF 2016-2018: (1) sustainable inclusive growth and development; (2) social development, social protection, and human capital; and (3) governance and human rights, with the DWCP's core focus on tripartite cooperation and social dialogue a key element within the governance agenda. The ILO's specific mandate and comparative advantage areas around decent work, international labour standards, social dialogue and social protection are clearly recognized within both the current and new UNDAFs. The latter has a significant focus on the Decent work Agenda and explicitly recognizes the ILO role in areas including decent work creation, international labour standards, 'just transition' to a more sustainable economy and social protection. The United Nations Resident Coordinator in Cambodia explicitly indicated that the ILO's mandate and role was a very important part of wider UNCT engagement in Cambodia, and its role in the UNCT via both the ILO Regional and Country Offices in Bangkok and the JPO were much valued.

A key component of both the current DWCP review process and consultations to develop the new DWCP was a comprehensive mapping of current and emerging partnerships with Cambodian constituents and other agencies and organizations, UN agencies based in Cambodia and other international development partners (refer annexes). The mapping clearly indicated a general recognition by domestic and international partners of the ILO's global mandate and added-value role (refer to the respective columns in the mapping on 'focus areas' for cooperation' and 'ILO contribution').

At the same time, however, constituents and other partners indicated that they appreciated the ILO's resource limitations and reliance on Development Cooperation Projects for funding. In the context of an independent review of the ILO's engagement over five years in supporting the development of Cambodia's social protection system, and as noted elsewhere, the senior MEF official now overseeing this area commented that "the ILO is high in expertise but low in resources," requiring financing to be found from other partners.

In this context, the DWCP priorities were well aligned with what the ILO is able to provide in terms of normative, policy, technical, capacity development and targeted financial support. National constituents recognized this in endorsing the carrying forward of the same three priorities into the next DWCP period.

The alignment of DWCP design and implementation with ILO comparative advantages is illustrated by the way interventions have played to the ILO's recognised strengths with respect to social protection, i.e. its international mandates, normative/policy role and technical expertise.

All stakeholder feedback during the social protection review in 2016 and the previous DWCP review highlighted the relevance of ILO technical support. The NSSF particularly commended the contribution of ILO actuarial studies at key points in its development as well as continuous policy and institutional development advice provided since the Fund's creation. UNICEF commended the ILO's ability to draw on relevant technical expertise in the context of the technical working group which developed the National Social Protection Policy Framework, where the ILO took the leadership on pension reform and provided technical advice and inputs to the social health protection and social assistance sections of the framework.

One of the ILO's comparative advantages in this context was described as "its ability to provide cross-cutting perspectives and expertise." Similarly, UNICEF highlighted the value-addition of the ILO's contribution to the working group to support the development of a Social Assistance Policy Framework (SAPF), particularly in providing perspectives on the relationship between contributory and non-contributory schemes. Stakeholder feedback also noted the particular value-added of the ILO's advocacy of and support for tripartite governance approaches and collaboration.

• To what extent the DWCP has contributed to overall policy coherence and whether the ILO has worked in partnership with key constituents, government agencies, other partners including other UN agencies in achieving Cambodia national development goals and SDGs

The partnership mapping (refer Annexes) sets out the scope of current and emerging partnerships to implement the DWCP. A significant development in the DWCP period has been the broadening of engagement under the DWCP with other government agencies and agencies, particularly with the Ministry of Economy and Finance which now has the lead on social protection policy and programme development. Other ministries which have indicated they wish to be more engaged with the DWCP include the Ministry of Agriculture, Forestry and Fisheries (MAFF – rural employment and skills), the Ministry of Industry and Handicrafts (MIH – SME development) and the Ministry of Women's Affairs (MWA – women's entrepreneurship). The Ministry for Rural Development indicated its interest in reactivating a partnership which has lowered in intensity since 2016 due to resourcing issues.

Several UN agencies have also indicated an interest in activating stronger cooperation with the ILO under the next DWCP with a focus around decent employment, skills development, labour rights and gender equality (e.g. FAO, IFAD, UNDP, UNIDO, UNOHCHR and UN Women). The STED Project offered another example of the ILO's widening partnership base in Cambodia, engaging with local universities, international and local NGOs, the ADB, the WTO, UNIDO and UNESCO among others to support skills development for trade, employability, and inclusive growth and economic diversification in selected priority sectors.

The core partnerships within this broader scope remain those with the constituents. These are formalized through their DWCP signatory status and participation in the IMC-NEP DWCP sub-committee. Due to the

absence of a national union centre and the highly proliferated and politicized nature of the trade union movement, building effective union partnerships under the DWCP is challenging. An important initiative taken by the ILO National Coordinator / JPO during the DWCP period has been the establishment of the National Trade Union Council for the DWCP. Consisting of 15 national unions and confederations,¹² this body provides a platform for inputs into DWCP planning, implementation and review processes, as well for strengthening the collective union voice on key issues. While the NTUC-DWCP is still finding its feet and reflects some of the wider divisions within the movement, it constitutes an important step towards strengthening worker perspectives within DWCP governance and implementation.

• The extent to which it is a realistic in its approach and takes into account budgetary realities

The overall implementation rate of the DWCP vis-à-vis its performance indicators is assessed as satisfactory (refer to next section on effectiveness), indicating that the programme design was generally well aligned with ILO and constituent capacities and available resources and that the level of ambition was appropriately pitched. The need to achieve such alignment and balance was highlighted in the previous DWCP review.

As elaborated later, the central focus on the NEP as the DWCP "backbone" and "unifier" was not able to be followed through to the extent envisaged for reasons linked to delays and challenges in the implementation of the NEP itself.

Generally it proved possible to mobilize the necessary resources to implement the DWCP, with the major area affected by insufficient resourcing being indigenous land titling and livelihoods (due to a redirection of German Government funding). A total of USD7,187,916 was mobilized in 2016 and 2017 to support DWCP implementation through international donor funding under Development Cooperation Projects (refer to later elaboration).

The BFC resourcing arrangements present a different approach, with a significant long-term contribution from national stakeholders. In line with the Garment Sector MOU, the main sources of BFC financing are (i) the RGC (at a contribution rate based on the value of previous year garment exports); (ii) garment sector manufacturers (paid through GMAC at the rate of 0.6 USD per factory worker per year based on NSSF data); (iii) payment for BFC core services by international buyers (for reports) and by factories (for voluntary advisory services) and (iv) international donor contributions to cover remaining programe delivery requirements (about USD 1.6 million in the current strategic phase). The payment for services element of BFC income is further reinforced by the Garment Sector MOU statement that international buyers who use BFC services "will contribute to programme operation based on fees for services rendered."

According to the evaluation of Better Work Phase III, BFC has stood out amongst its country counterparts for its ability to generate income from cost recovery in the delivery of services (assessments/reports, advisory support and training), with an 80 percent rate of return currently being shown according to BFC data. The Better Work evaluation also provided a positive assessment of BFC efficiency, noting that "efficiency is assessed positively, both at BWG and at country level although the picture is incomplete due to gaps in the available data. " BFC's ability to demonstrate attention to value-for-money considerations in programme planning and delivery is seen as a selling-point in attracting and retaining international donor support. BFC's own assessment is that the current pricing model applied by Better Work does not yet allow the organization to be fully self-sustaining .

At the same time, as indicated in the Country Overview, the DWCP period has seen a significant increase in

¹² The NTUC is comprised of 15 founding members drawn from: CCTU (Mr. Chuon Momthol, President); CCU (Ms. Yang Sophorn, President); CLC (Mr. Ath Thorn, President); CCNU/CIFTU (Ms. Tep Kimvannary, President); NACC (Mr. Som Aun, President); CNCLP (Mr. Sath Chheanghour, President); CNCL (Mr. Yoeng Chhun, President); CNL (Mr. Sam Soeun, President); CUNIC (Mr. Heng Bunchhun, President); CCUMW (Mr. Pav Sina, President); FTUKWC (Ms. Touch Ser, President); BWTUC (Mr. Sok Kin, President); CTSWF (Mr. Morm Rithy, President); CUF (Ms. Sok Thach, Secretary General); and CFSWF (Ms. Ou Tepphallin, Secretary General).

public revenue and expenditure, with increases in social protection spending and the introduction of a national pension planned for 2019. However, considerable scope remains for phased increases in national budget commitments to areas crucial to the Decent Work Agenda and achieving the SDGs. These include technical and vocational skills development to meet the future needs of work within a digitalizing economy; the further expansion of employment and LMI services; improving data availability through regular Labour Force Surveys; and environmentally sustainable employment creation, including green jobs. The lack of regular Labour Force Surveys sustained by the national budget affects ILO and constituent ability to assess the impact of in DWCP implementation in areas such as economic formalization and the reduction of vulnerable employment.

6.2 Effectiveness, including adequacy of institutional set-up to deliver ILO's programme in Cambodia

The review found the DWCP to be effective in terms of both programme delivery and the management of resources and partnerships for its implementation (noting that completed data for 2018 not available at the time of review).

 Will all the planned outcomes likely to be achieved by the end of 2018? Have the progress/changes taken place in the past three years (against the indicators/milestones set)? If not, why did it not happen?

Overall, the DWCP period has seen satisfactory progress under each of the outcomes, although this is variable at the output, indicator and target level as indicated below. Two outcomes (2.2 and 3.1) were fully achieved at the time of this review. The rest were well on track overall, although the ability to reach 100 percent achievement is affected by one or more indicators in each case still likely to be "in progress" by the end of 2018, as well as four indicators assessed as "off-track."

Overall implementation progress as assessed against the 44 DWCP indicators				
Completed / on track for completion in 2018	On track for completion in next DWCP	In progress (will carry forward into next DWCP)	Off track	Suspended
54.5 % (24 indicators)	4.5 % (2 indicators)	29.5 % (13 indicators)	9 % (4 indicators)	2.3 % (1 indicator)

The above summary indicates a satisfactory overall level of progress, with 59 percent of indicators assessed as completed, or on specifically on track for completion in the next DWCP period. The 29.5 percent of indicators where progress is indicated, and which will carry forward into the next DWCP period, are assessed as also being likely to be achieved in time, albeit within a longer timeframe (bearing in mind the three-year timeframe of the current DWCP). The latter are under largely existing development cooperation projects and/or ongoing ILO specialist-supported technical support arrangements which will carry forward or be renewed. Nine and 11 multi-year development cooperation projects were implemented in 2016 and 2017 respectively, providing critical financial and technical resources .

One indicator and associated target was suspended (Indicator 1.2.6 on the establishment of a labour court) due to a decision by constituents not to proceed with this. The four indicators which are rated as "off-track" are: Indicator 1.2.1 on MRS and trade union registration under the Trade Union Law; Indicator 2.1.4 on expanded LMI availability; Indicator 3.2.1 on indigenous land rights and livelihoods; and Indicator 3.3.4 on access to OSH information. Project evaluations and feedback from stakeholders and the JPO highlight the following factors to be critical in these four cases:

- difficulties created by the Trade Union Law with respect to MRS and trade union registration, compounded by capacity gaps and delays in setting up improved systems in MoLVT for union registration, and associated guidance and training
- the withdrawal of anticipated resources to progress indigenous communal land ownership identification and certificatio due to a redirection of German Government priorities in Cambodia
- capacity gaps on the part of implementing parties alongside contending priorities in the context of limited resources

The DWCP 2019-2023 will include measures to reactivate actions in each of these areas and commit the necessary ILO technical support and other resources.

Factors influencing implementation delays (i.e. those indicators assessed as "in progress" and carrying forward to the next DWCP period) include:

- staff and governance turn-over in partner organizations, alongside pressures on staff availability and resources across all constituents
- persistent normative barriers to increased women's leadership and participation
- delays in putting requirements and system in place to set and enforce maximum levels for recruitment agency fees
- lack of capacity in critical areas to address child labour prevalence outside the garment sector
- delays in establishment of Inter-Ministerial Committee for the NEP and adoption of national Action Plan, *inter-alia* affecting generation of Decent Work Indicators, linked to delays in NEP implementation due to lack of national budget resourcing
- slower than expected uptake by local partners of ILO SBC and In-Business tools

The above factors were reflected in adjustments were made by constituents to DWCP targets through the annual tripartite IMC-NEP DWCP sub-committee review process.

• What have been emerging risks and/or opportunities? Have they affected the progress of any specific outcomes?

The most prominently discussed emerging risk is the decision taken by the EU in February 2019 to proceed with the case to withdraw Cambodian "Everything but Arms" (EBA) tariff free access to European markets. Various studies, missions and negotiations held during 2018 did not alter the EU's final decision to pursue its concerns about human rights and core labour standards in Cambodia by this means. The major risk posed by this development is to the gains made in improving prospects and livelihoods for the 650,000 mainly women workers in the garment export sector, where the EBA has been an important factor in sector growth. The ILO (including BFC) was involved in inter-agency/government dialogue on the potential implications of EBA removal during 2018.

Perhaps the major areas of risk which have had a direct bearing on DWCP implementation are:

- the continued challenges facing unions under the Trade Union Law with respect to representing members at the enterprise level (ILO technical assistance has been requested in the new DWCP period to address the key issues in this respect)
- the continued challenges around implementation of ILS with respect to Freedom of Association identified by the ILO CEACR mission to Cambodia in 2016 (implementation of a national joint constituent Roadmap to address these is prioritized under the new DWCP)
- ongoing institutional capacity gaps across the national constituents, ranging from capacity deficits within the MoLVT joint inspection service to the need for enhanced social partner capacities for effective national policy engagement.

A number of other current and emerging broader risks are also important within the broader context for DWCP implementation. While they may not yet have had a direct bearing on implementation, they hold the potential for impacting future DWCP design, planning and implementation. These risks include:

- the educational, skills, technical and planning gaps that potentially hold back Cambodia's ability to reap the benefits of "future of work" – e.g. skills, adaptability of workforce, maximising benefits and addressing risks of digital economy, platform economy, etc
- the impact of the low education and skills base of much of workforce, a result of systemic underinvestment and compounded by the mismatch between skills and jobs mismatch in the labour market
- the country's fragile economic base, which is reliant on four main sectors including the garment sector
- unstable agricultural prices and potential for financial instability
- changes (potential downturns) in regional economies which are major markets and investment sources for Cambodia, particularly China
- impacts of climate change, including the threat of increased natural disasters (floods and drought) and the implications for agricultural production and rural livelihoods
- weak productivity and competiveness in key areas of the economy, particularly in the context of increasing regional competition under the ASEAN Economic Community
- persistent widespread vulnerability, with approximately 70 percent of the workforce still in informal/vulnerable work, with the most vulnerable including migrant workers, youth and persons with disability.
- the impact of widespread disparities in areas such as education, health, and gender, despite the increase in income equality nationally in recent years
- persistent poverty, with 28 percent of the population vulnerable to falling back into poverty as a result of factors such as economic shocks or natural disasters.
- the impact of persistent gender disparities in all spheres despite important progress on gender equality in some areas (e.g. 78 percent participation in workforce and close to parity in primary school enrolment).
- capacity gaps within national institutions to deliver on laws, policies, strategies and plans and monitor and evaluate results.
- capacity gaps within employers' and workers' organizations national constituents, including for effective contribution to national policy processes and DWCP delivery
- lack of credible and comprehensive data in critical areas to inform policy development, planning and monitoring e.g labour force trends and status (with regular Labour Force Surveys a key current gap), informality and vulnerability, OSH (including in the burgeoning construction sector), and child labour
- To what extent the operational and institutional set up are effective for DWCP implementation, adequate monitoring and ensuring delivering of the expected results?

The key ILO institutional elements in this respect are: The Country Office; the ROAP Decent Work Country Team (DWT); the Regional Programme Services Unit (programming advice, evaluation, DWCP formulation); the JPO, headed by the ILO National Coordinator (supported by one administrative assistant; the staff and associated resources of Development Cooperation Projects under the DWCP; and technical and programme advisory support provided by ILO Geneva in specific areas.

The primary country-based DWCP oversight and coordination institutional arrangement is IMC-NEP DWCP sub-committee (described below), linked to Project Advisory Committees where they have been established.

ILO and partner feedback, along with the desk review of project evaluations, indicates that although the DWCP institutional base is small and can be described as under-resourced in the context of the demands it must meet in a rapidly developing national context, DWCP implementation and monitoring has been both effective and efficient. ILO credibility as an effective partner is high among partners and UNCT members, although recognition is quickly given of the limitations experienced by the ILO in terms of the lack of a full Country-Office status for the JPO and the pressures on the ILO National coordinator. The latter range from broader representational and oversight roles to detailed stakeholder and daily programme management requirements.

This situation was highlighted as requiring urgent attention in the previous DWP review. The creation since

then of a dedicated administrative support position has relieved some of the pressure around the ILO National Coordinator role in particular, but stakeholders who provided feedback in the course of this review noted the long and relentless hours required of the coordinator to cover the range of demands and tasks associated with the ILO's complex engagement in Cambodia and its associated high expectations. The National Coordinator's contribution to UNCT processes (including formulation of the new UNDAF), governmental consultations and other broader representational and policy related processes was commended by the UN Resident Coordinator, despite the lack of 'Country office' status for the ILO in Cambodia.

With respect to "success factors" in ILO engagement in Cambodia, the social protection review highlighted the following:

- The value of continuity and the local knowledge and partnership building role of the in-country ILO social protection project office This has enabled the multi-year targeting of ILO expertise, the building of counterpart trust and confidence, and the maintenance of ILO visibility.
- As noted elsewhere, the quality and value of ILO technical expertise, including in areas such as the interrelationship between contributory and non-contributory schemes and cross-cutting approaches which take the bigger picture into account.
- The leverage and influence of the" ILO brand" based on international mandates and track record, and the ILO's ability to coordinate the necessary expertise.
- The extent to which the DWCP tripartite steering committee has been engaged in monitoring the progress of DWCP? The extent to which constituents drive implementation of the programme and contribute to reviews and decision-making on DWCP prioritization

The table below sets out the current tripartite DWCP Governance arrangements in Cambodia, which are centred on annual meetings of sub-committee established by *Prakas* under the Inter-Ministerial Committee (IMC) for the National Employment Policy (NEP). Well-established Project Advisory Committees and a more recently established National Trade Union Council for the DWCP (NTUC-DWCP) are also important actors in DWCP governance.

As indicated, constituent feedback, particularly from social partners, highlighted a desire for deepened engagement and more regular meetings. Questions were also raised about the link between DWCP governance and the Labour Advisory Committee, which is undergoing a change of role in light of minimum wage setting and OSH responsibilities being transferred to new national bodies in each field.

DWCP governance arrangement	Objectives/role	Comment
An annual tripartite DWCP review and planning process is convened under the auspices the Inter-Ministerial Committee (IMC) for the National Employment Policy (NEP) via a sub- committee which has been established as the DWCP tripartite governance mechanism (refer	The following role of the DWCP Sub-Committee under the IMC- NEP is set out in <i>Prakas 190</i> on "the establishment of Inter- Ministerial Committee for examining and developing	The attention given by constituents to the annual tripartite DWCP review and planning process was highlighted by the 2015 DWCP review as an important contribution to
next column). The NEP in turn is an underpinning focus of the DWCP.	national employment policy."	enhancing social dialogue more broadly.
A secretariat is established under the MoLVT for the IMC-NEP and its 5 sub-committees as a whole. The ILO JPO prepares a comprehensive annual progress report for the DWCP sub-committee, including lessons and recommendations for the next year. This is compiled with constituent input. An integrated DWCP M&E Framework provides the	relevant institutions to collect official documents, information, data and other inputs for providing recommendations on the process of developing and implementing the Decent Work Country Programme for	The sub-committee is considered to be well-connected with broader tripartite process in Cambodia, including the LAC, through the links that members bring.
basis for the report and sub-committee discussion. The JPO further prepares minutes of DWCP sub-	Cambodia (DWCP) to the Inter- Ministerial Committee;	The recommendation of the 2015 DWCP review that the

committee meetings. Meetings are interactive, with small group discussion used to set priorities for the coming year. Employer perspectives are represented by CAMFEBA. Worker perspectives are provided via the National Trade Union Council for the DWCP (NTUC-DWCP), consisting of representatives from 15 national union confederations/federations which cover an estimated 80% of the formal national workforce.	Organize a workshop to review the DWCP on an annual basis; Prepare progress reports on the implementation of DWCP on a regular basis and submit to the Inter- Ministerial Committee; ensuring the implementation of the DWCP within the established workplan and budget;	governance process should give more attention to relevant evaluation and review findings remains relevant. A notable feature of the current DWCP is the inclusion of specific indicators and targets for M&E and the explicit linkages to national data sources.
A further important element of the governance structure is the existence of tripartite Project Advisory Committees (PACS), which bring together relevant stakeholder representatives for the project focus concerned in most cases (the TRIANGLE project, for example, does not have a PAC). The BFC PAC is the longest established, is chaired at senior MoLVT level and involves senior level representation across the constituents. An important recent development has been the development of a joint PAC approach for the UN Joint Programme on Youth Employment, for which the ILO provides coordination and servicing. A similar arrangement has been set up for social protection under the RC. PACS don't report directly to the DWCP sub- committee. Communications are handled via the ILO/JPO. Recent years have seen a stronger alignment of projects and PACS to the DWCP priorities and outcomes.	Participate in the monitoring and evaluation of the programmes and projects under the DWCP; Promote the cooperation with the ILO, other UN agencies and development partners to mobilize technical and financial assistance for the more effective implementation of DWCP; Prepare reports on its performance and submit to the Secretariat for consolidation and reporting to the Inter-Ministerial Committee; Carry out other relevant tasks as assigned by the Chair of the Inter-Ministerial Committee.	Employer, worker and JPO feedback supports more regular meetings of the sub-committee (at least 6 monthly) and intensified engagement outside the formal meetings. An option for the future structuring of DWCP tripartite governance would be to consider whether the LAC may provide a suitable vehicle in light of its changed role due to minimum wage and OSH processes being transferred to new national bodies. The next DWCP includes provision for a review of current DWCP governance arrangements, including linkages with the LAC.

• Is there clarity and agreement on how results have been documented? Are verified indicators with targets and milestones being applied? Has the monitoring plan been prepared and used as management tools?

A comprehensive consolidated DWCP monitoring plan was developed by the JPO in 2016, based on key elements of DWCP internal Annexes 4 and 5. The format includes columns for the setting out of annual targets (linked to those set out for the three year period of the DWCP); a rating of the status of progress; and comments on reasons for adjustments and delays, changes in approach and factors to be considered in implementation. The progress plan also identifies contextual changes, challenges, key lessons to date and proposed priorities and adjustments for the coming year. It is compiled by the JPO with active constituent input and presented to the IMC-NEP DWCP subcommittee as a draft to be revised and endorsed by that body.

As noted previously, a distinct feature of the current DWCP is the attention given to monitoring and evaluation, with a separate set of indicators and targets set out in this regard. The DWCP sets out expectations of significant tripartite governance engagement in oversight and coordination in this area via the DWCP sub-committee of the IMC-NEP.

The following table summarizes progress to date in implementing the indicators and targets concerned. DWCP review consultations indicated that while the envisaged scale of comprehensive attention to monitoring, evaluation, reporting, data strengthening and SDG links did not occur via the IMC-NEP subcommittee process, but there was nonetheless significant progress in maintaining the M&E DWCP implementation plan as a basis for annual tripartite review and reporting for the periods 2016 and 2017.

Key-factors in the status of implementation in this area were lack of an RCG decision and commitment of resources on more regular Labour Force Surveys; the lack of adequate resources in the JPO to conduct the extensive documentation, monitoring and reporting envisaged; and pressures on IMC-NEP sub-committee time and resources to engage more comprehensively with this aspect of the DWCP.

Indicators	Targets	Status of implementation
Annual labour force surveys or household surveys with a core labour force module	Core labour force statistics included annually in SDG indicators	No further LFS since 2012, next LFS currently projected on tentative basis for 2019
Regular collection of labour market indicators from administrative records	Employment-related SDG indicators included annually from administrative records	Still to be actioned. The completion and availability of the Cambodian SDGs (CSDGs) in 2019 will help facilitate progress in this regard
Comprehensive labour market information system including additional quantitative and qualitative indicators	Regular (annual} bulletin on the national decent work indicators (including qualitative and institutional framework indicators}	Not developed due to lack of the resources for the regular research and documentation required.
M&E-DWCP implementation plan maintained	Baseline indicators (SDG employment-related indicators and other qualitative and quantitative indicators} and end-of-programme indicators (SDGs and other indicators} maintained	Maintained on annual basis for 2016 and 2017, presented to annual review meeting of the DWCP tripartite governance mechanism (sub-committee of the IMC-NEP)

• The extent to which the DWCP has been based on a solid mapping of constituent needs and is fully reflective of those needs in execution

The tripartite constituents were closely involved at every stage leading to the development of the DWCP. In addition to individual discussions with many government ministries and the social partners in the process of developing the Decent Work Country Analysis, specific activities involved the following:

- DWCP awareness-raising and capacity building for ILO constituents (May 2015);
- planning and developing a road map for the 2016-2018 DWCP roll-out, endorsed by the tripartite constituents at the Tripartite Annual Review of DWCP 2011-2015 for Cambodia (May 2015);
- tripartite consultations on the Decent Work Country Analysis (August 2015);
- tripartite consultations on the External Review of DWCP 2011-2015, including preliminary discussion of priorities for the DWCP 2016-2018 (September 2015); and
- tripartite consultations regarding country programme priority and CP outcome areas (October 2015).

A key influence on the degree to which DWCP execution has been reflective of constituent needs has been the annual review meetings of the DWCP sub-committee of the IMC-NEP. This has met five times since its establishment in 2016, providing an important opportunity to review progress, gaps and challenges and to prioritize implementation for the coming year. Minutes of meetings indicate that decisions were taken jointly in quite specific terms on upcoming implementation priorities in light of experience, available or planned resources, challenges and lessons to date. • The extent to which DWCP implementation has been based on partnerships with tripartite constituents in delivering DWCP outcomes and built national capacities and support policy change.

The majority of DWCP activities have involved the tripartite constituents directly or indirectly, either jointly or in their own right (for example capacity development activities with the MoLVT labour inspection service, CAMFEBA or NTUC-DWCP members are often on a single constituent basis). Project Advisory Committees (PACs) established to oversee Development Cooperation Projects under the DWCP involve all the constituents. The focus areas of constituent engagement in DWCP implementation are elaborated in the partnership mapping table (refer to Annexes).

However, as noted previously, the partnerships developed to implement the DWCP have extended well beyond the core tripartite constituents. With respect to the RGC, for example, the ILO works closely with a wide range of other ministries and coordinating institutions beyond the MoLVT. Such partnerships include the ministries of Economy and Finance (MEFO Social Affairs and Veterans' and Youth Rehabilitation (MoSAVY), Commerce (MoCO, Planning (MoPO, Women's Affairs (MoWA), Rural Development (MRD), Interior (MoI), Industry and Handicrafts (MoIH), Mines and Energy (MoME), Education, Youth and Sport (MoEYS), Public Works and Transport (MoPWT), Tourism (MoT), and inter-ministerial committees, as well as the Council for the Development of Cambodia (CDC), the Council for Agricultural and Rural Development (CARD), the National Employment Agency (NEA) and the various social security funds. Partnerships are emerging in the context of the next DWCP with other ministries, as detailed previously.

The core social partners with which ILO collaborates on the DWCP are the CAMFEBA and the 15 national confederations and federations that comprise the NTUC-DWCP. The ILO also works with sectoral business associations that are members of CAMFEBA, particularly GMAC in the context of BFC, and with enterprise-level unions. At the same time, as elaborated elsewhere, the ILO increased partners with CSOs such as Oxfam and CARE in areas ranging from promoting youth entrepreneurship to training on addressing sexual harassment.

With respect to the degree to which the DWCP has built national capacities and supported policy change, the summary of DWCP achievements by outcome in Section 5 indicates a number of areas where progress can be seen. Important and relevant contributions were made, for example, to the development of the national policy framework for social protection as well as the national strategy for the garment sector. Although still clearly "work in progress," national capacities were developed in areas including social protection policy and systems (NSSF), labour inspection and OSH (MoLVT); employment services and LMI (NEA); enterprise management (garment sector employers); minimum wage negotiation (LAC and the Minimum Wage Council); and policy analysis and engagement (CAMFEBA and the NTUC-DWCP).

• What are the main capacity and resource constraints of the tripartite constituents in delivering DWCP in line with their priorities? And if so have there been steps to address them collectively?

Employer and union representatives alike highlighted capacity gaps in the following areas: (i) strategic planning (including updating the existing strategic plan in the case of CAMFEBA); (ii) research, analysis and policy engagement; (iii) social dialogue, workplace cooperation, collective bargaining and disputes resolution; (iv) understanding of digital economy trends and use of emerging technologies to strengthen outreach, services and influence; and (v) social protection laws and schemes (including contributory aspects).

Other areas that stood out from review feedback, including from relevant ILO specialists, were the need for attention to:

- expanded and enhanced representativeness of respective memberships, including (as appropriate) representation of SMEs, women, youth, informal workers and vulnerable groups
- increased number of women in leadership and senior management roles at all levels

- increased women's and youth voice and representation generally, including through expansion and strengthening of relevant committees, processes and agendas
- increased cooperation on shared priorities among unions at all levels, including in coverage and representation of informal workers, with prioritization of construction, tourism and agricultural sectors.

As detailed in the summary of DWCP progress by outcome indicates, a number of capacity development initiatives were conducted at collective tripartite and individual constituent levels in areas ranging from labour inspection strategic compliance planning to enterprise management, social partner policy analysis and engagement and women's leadership development. As noted elsewhere, in most cases capacity development remains 'work in progress', with the need to move beyond once-off training events in some areas to longer-term, iterative approaches which consolidate and reinforce learning and practice over time. For example, the the MEF highlighted the value of opportunities for direct access to other country experience and the need to build long-term core staff knowledge and skills around its new lead role on social protection policy and systems development. The NSSF highlighted the need for systemic institutional development in addition to increased staff technical capacity and ongoing enhancement of the integrity of its tripartite governance structure.

• Is there coherence and integrated approach in DWCP strategy? Does the DWCP fit within ILO's strategic policy framework and programme and budget priorities and strategies.

The single largest and most longstanding programme under the DWCP is Better Factories Cambodia (BFC). *Inter alia* this programme has a project team of approximately 45, has been operational in Cambodia for about 18 years, is supported by a senior level tripartite Project Advisory Committee and is financially sustained through a mix of fees for service and contributions from constituents, donors and the ILO. The DWCP review for the period 2011-2015 highlighted the need to strengthen the integration of BFC within the overall DWCP framework. The BFC / DWCP relationship thus provides a useful lens through which to examine DWCP coherence and integration.

The mid-term evaluation of BFC conducted in the first quarter of 2018 indicated that there had been considerable progress in this regard. At a structural / design level, the work of BFC, under its own strategy and project document, is directly reflected in the indicators and targets of the following DWCP Outcomes:

Outcome 1.1: Professional and technical capacities of social partners strengthened

Outcome 1.2: Improved laws, mechanisms and processes, particularly in the garment sector, for industrial relations, dispute prevention and resolution, and wage setting

Outcome 1.3: More effective application of equality and rights at work for discriminated-against and vulnerable groups

Outcome 2.1: Mechanisms for policy leadership, coordination, and implementation strengthened to support development and implementation of policies and programmes

Outcome 2.3: Effective progress made to enhance enterprise productivity, competitiveness, working conditions, and promotion of entrepreneurship

Outcome 3.3: Improved and expanded OSH, with a particular focus on hazardous work

At the same time joint JPO / BFC efforts to identify and reinforce synergies is demonstrated by the expanded collaboration in areas including:

- Joint work between BFC and the ILO Labour Standards in Global Supply Chains (LSGSC) project. This included BFC support for LSGSC monitoring of minimum wage compliance data, as well as related communications and advocacy work. Such collaboration builds on the ILO's very active engagement in the development of Cambodia's current annual and increasingly evidence-based minimum wage setting process.
- Collaboration between BFC and the ILO DWT Labour Inspection Specialist around the training provided for MOLVT staff on strategic compliance planning. This holds the potential to be a core capacity development focus through 2018 and into the next DWCP period.

• BFC / LSGSC / ACTRAV collaboration on inputs into the development of Cambodia's garment sector strategy.

At the same time, some other stakeholder feedback was more mixed in nature. One bilateral interlocutor with longstanding links to both BFC and broader ILO engagement in Cambodia described his embassy's perception that the BFC was "bigger than the ILO" in Cambodia, and that the two entities were perceived (at least from a third party perspective) to function relatively separately. The ILO was described as "relatively anonymous overall," while BFC had a much stronger profile in both the development partners community and among local stakeholders. The interlocutor suggested that the ILO as a whole could balance wider stakeholder perceptions by facilitating wider stakeholder dialogue and networking on decent work issues, clearly encompassing BFC within this.

The above-mentioned positive examples of wider ILO-BFC synergies not-withstanding, staff interviewed from BFC and the ILO Regional Office in Bangkok also indicated scope for continuing to strengthen mutually reinforcing links, particularly with respect to ACTRAV and ACTEMP trade union and employer association capacity development. The explicit incorporation of BFC's strategy, work plan and constituency into wider ACTRAV and ACTEMP planning (and vice versa) would help facilitate such stronger linkages. The potential which also clearly exists for enhanced BFC / wider ILO collaboration and synergies around promoting women's voice, representation and leadership is already being acted upon. Ongoing joint planning involving BFC and the ILO/ROAP Senior Gender and Non-Discrimination Specialist is well progressed to this end.

Beyond the BFC component of the DWCP, the review found that that DWCP coherence, integration and cross-programme interaction had improved overall since 2016. This was particularly reflected in both the intensified attention to information sharing and joint planning within the context of the JPO and anecdotal indications of increased interaction between DWT specialist staff backstopping different DWCP components. The regular meetings convened by the ILO National Coordinator of all project / project teams based in the JPO, plus BFC are well regarded and attended. BFC highlighted the value of these meetings, for example, and noted that they ensure senior level participation.

With respect to DWCP alignment to overall ILO Project and Budget (P&B) priorities, the links with specific P&B outcomes were specified in the DWCP.

• The extent that the current programme is coherent, logical and captures opportunities for reinforcing each other in meeting objectives. To what extent, the DWCP has the ability to respond to emerging opportunities?

Further to the above commentary on DWCP coherence and integration, a key feature of DWCP design is the underpinning focus on implementation of the National Employment Policy (NEP). The NEP is positioned by the DWCP as the core framework for ILO support to Cambodia, covering inclusive and sustainable employment growth; skills development and human resources; and labour market governance. Thus, as the DWCP observes, " the NEP engages with most aspects of the Decent Work Agenda, and the DWCP addresses a wide range of decent work issues." The intention of centring the DWCP around the NEP in this way is to avoid excessive country programme spread and complexity and maximize impact and sustainability by ensuring a stronger focus in the application of effort and resources.

The centrality of the NEP to the DWCP is further reinforced by the establishment of sub-committee under the Inter-Ministerial Committee for the NEP (IMC-NEP) to serve as the DWCP tripartite governance mechanism. The Government focal point for this arrangement is the MoLVT. Employers participate through CAMFEBA while workers' organisations participate through the National Trade Union Council for the DWCP (NTUC-DWCP). The latter body consists of the representatives of 15 national union federations / confederations and was especially established as a platform for expanded trade union engagement with the DWCP (see elaboration elsewhere). The sub-committee meets annually for a tripartite DWCP review and planning process chaired by the Minister of Labour. The review is based on a comprehensive annual report on DWCP progress, gaps, lessons and good practices prepared by JPO with constituent input. As well as monitoring and

reviewing past and present DWCP implementation, the sub-committee prioritizes implementation in the coming year and adjusts outputs, indicators and targets in light of experience and changing circumstances. The latter may include available resourcing. Through its role and membership, the sub-committee links to other tripartite bodies at national and subnational and sector levels, for example the LAC, NSSF Board and OSH committees.

In practice, however, the focus on the NEP that is structured into the DWCP design in all respects has not delivered the degree of cohesive drive to DWCP implementation envisaged. Key factors in this regard have included (i) slow progress in establishing the NEP oversight and coordination architecture (although the DWCP sub-committee has functioned effectively, with significant JPO support); (ii) as yet insufficient national budget resourcing for NREP implementation; (iii) a complex and expansive NEP implementation plan that exceeded available capacities for delivery and (vi) the call on available resources of other important DWCP initiatives, not the least of which is the emergence of the UN Joint Programme (UNJP) on Youth Employment for which the ILO has the overall coordination role.

As this review was being conducted, the first progress report on NEP implementation was being completed, and was not yet available. In the meantime discussions between the MOLVT and ILO concluded that a rescaled and more focused approach was required, centred on initial in-depth implementation in four provinces and later scaled up over time. This revised strategy for NEP implementation is reflected in the draft DWCP for 2019-2023.

In this context, DWCP coherence has nonetheless been strengthened since 2016 when compared with the preceding DWCP period. As noted above, the role of the ILO National Coordinator and JPO, the contribution of the IMC-NEP DWCP sub-committee and structured integration of the BFC into DWCP design have been key factors in this regard.

The IMC-NEP DWCP sub-committee further plays a key role with respect to the ability of the DWCP to respond to emerging opportunities. The comprehensive IMC-NEP DWCP review workshops in 2017 and 2016 considered progress in DWCP implementation in light of available resources and changing context (e.g. the delays in NEP implementation, transfer of responsibility for social protection to the MEF, non-availability of anticipated resources for planned work on indigenous land-titling, and the attention given to the development of the UNJP on youth employment by the UN Resident Coordinator).

DWCP targets were adjusted accordingly by the sub-committee for the following year (2017 and 2018). These adjustments were noted in the DWCP Monitoring Framework which is updated annually by the ILO National Coordinator. The review thus finds that the DWCP has been responsive to emerging opportunities, with the attention given to the UNJP initiative an important example that will both carry forward into the next DWCP and provide a joint UN programming example of global interest.

To what extent the cross-cutting drivers have been integrated into DWCP e.g. gender mainstreaming, ILS, social dialogues, environmental sustainability and attention to vulnerable target groups

A review of DWCP strategies, indicators and targets found references to women, youth, vulnerable groups, persons with disability and indigenous people to be generally well integrated across the programme design. Development Cooperation Projects under the DWCP likewise have given attention in design and implementation to gender and non-discrimination considerations. ILS promotion/ implementation and social dialogue directly and indirectly provide the cornerstone of all aspects of DWCP implementation, although strengthening the capacities for engagement by the social partners requires ongoing support in areas ranging from policy analysis and advocacy to engagement with the challenges and opportunities of the emerging digital economy. The cross-cutting issue most needing further specific attention across the DWCP is environmental sustainability, including with respect to the decent work implications of climate change. This issue also links to the emerging digital economy in Cambodia and the potential for creation of green jobs.

Gender equality and women's empowerment

A review of programme /project documentation under the DWCP in two prominent areas (BFC and social protection), indicates that scope remains to further strengthen and make more explicit the gender dimensions of programme and project design, including at indicator and target level. While BFC documentation was significantly more developed in this regard, as detailed below, ILO social protection project documents since 2012 indicate very limited explicit attention to gender or other rights and discrimination concerns, whether in the contextual analysis or the formulation of outcomes, indicators and targets.

At the same time, the current DWCP period saw some important initiatives to strengthen attention to gender equality and women's empowerment at the substantive/delivery level. These included (i) the development of a BFC gender strategy; (ii) research and publications on the status of rights and issues of women in the predominantly female garment sector workforce, including with respect to pregnancy; (iii) the initiation of an innovative women's transformative leadership training programme for garment sector workers in collaboration with UN Women (refer case study below); (iv) ongoing research, analysis and capacity development to create the basis for ratification of the ILO Domestic Workers Convention (C.189); (v) work jointly with CARE on recognizing and addressing sexual harassment in garment sector workplaces; (vi) ongoing support for implementation of *Prakas 194* on the rights of Cambodian women migrant workers, also in collaboration with UN Women; (viii) training provided via the ILO "Get Ahead" tool to staff and members of the Cambodian Women Entrepreneurs Association (CWEA); and (ix) particular attention to the position and voices of young women in the UNJP youth employment project.

An examination of gender mainstreaming within BFC provides a more detailed lens on both significant progress and the scope for ongoing development in the single largest programme area under the DWCP. Of 68 Key Performance Indicators in BFC results framework for 2016-2018, 11 have an explicit gender component. The same pattern is reflected in annual targets for 2016, 2017 and 2018. The majority of engendered indicators fall under Output 1.4 (BFC strategy on industrial relations is developed and implemented, tailoring BFC's core services to the Cambodian industrial relations challenges); and Output 1.5 (BFC gender mainstreaming approach developed and implemented to support the gender-specific issues that exist in the garment sector). The final indicator under Output 1.5 is of a cross-cutting nature, requiring gender-disaggregated data (GDD) to be collected and reported on. The mid-term BFC evaluation in 2018 recommended wider embedding of gender mainstreaming commitments and measures across core programmatic documentation for the next phase, both further strengthening BFC's leadership on gender equality and women's empowerment and enhancing accountability for all BFC stakeholders and staff in this respect.

More generally, the availability of up-to-date and comprehensive sex-disaggregated data remains an issue, however, a constraint also highlighted in the last DWCP review. The DWCP has *inter alia* contributed to improvements in this regard through the intensified analysis and use of data from the BFC's comprehensive garment sector data-base for policy engagement purposes; the sex-disaggregated analytical work presented on a regular basis through the Garment / Footwear Sector Bulletins produced by the LSGSC project (which contributes to the basket of data for annual minimum wage negotiations); and particular attention to the position of young women in the UNJP youth employment project. Sex-disaggregated data available via National Employment Agency (NEA) data is important in this context, an area for which technical support has been provided under the DCWP via the ILO/China South-South Cooperation Project on employment services and LMI, as well as ongoing ILO specialist support.

Case study: Feminist Leadership Programme for female participants in joint worker/management committees in ¹³ garment export factories, Phnom Penh, Cambodia

Implementing agency: Better Factories Cambodia (BFC) programme, in collaboration with UN Women, Phnon Phenh, Cambodia. The training is a core component of BFC's strategy for engagement in Cambodian garment sector.

The BFC Feminist Leadership Programme was specifically established to strengthen women's leadership, voice and representation within the committees. Still in its first year of development and implementation, it brings women together from different factories into a safe and trust-based environment around the following objectives:

- 1. Strengthen the skills of women PICC members to represent women workers in their factories and to analyze, communicate and act on the issues affecting those workers.
- 2. Contribute to individual and collective empowerment of women workers.

The course aims to facilitate the development of leadership skills and attributes in the following areas:

- Collecting information and capturing/recognizing patterns in the factory.
- Participation in the analysis of issues to find solutions. This requires understanding gender and other social structures (and power relations within these) as well as problem analysis tools.
- Representational skills: listening to women, being able to be accountable to them and bringing forward those issues to others.
- Participation in discussions and decision-making (meetings), presenting their own views effectively, being able to negotiate and dealing with not being successful.
- Understanding and applying key enabling strategies: building mutual support/coalitions; negotiating family and community support for dealing with obstacles, developing self-awareness and self-care.

To date, 21 factories and 84 participants have taken part in the training programme. BFC's intention is to expand this to 60 factories by the end of 2019.

The training is structured around a series of two in-depth training workshops. The first is a two day foundation workshop involving three to five women workers from about five factories coming together, about 25 participants in all. These workshops introduce gender analysis; explore power as it affects individual lives and as a resource that women can draw on; and builds skills in problem analysis. By the end of the workshop each factory group agrees on what steps they will take to apply their learning and address an issue in their workplace. Underpinning the workshop approach is a focus on developing individual self-awareness, strengthening confidence and skills, and laying foundations for ongoing peer support and solidarity.

A follow-up one day workshop four-six weeks later provides an opportunity for sharing and reflection on the actions taken after the first training. It supports individual and collective problem solving to strengthen future action. The focus on confidence and skill building as well as mutual support and learning is carried on from the first workshop. Skills in providing constructive feedback and listening as key elements of effective leadership are reinforced.

Core to the training is learning how to understand and analyse gender power dynamics in any situation, both in the workplace and in personal life. A variety of tools and approaches are used to raise awareness and link learning to everyday experience. "We don't use powerpoint and lectures," the trainers explained. "The whole approach is very much based in the experience and everyday life of the participants, both at work and at home. It can often become very emotional as the participants come to understand some of the factors which influence their lives."

An important part of the wider picture of the training is the BFC's wider team of advisors and trainers within the Cambodian garment sector. These work with the PICCs and provide an important means of monitoring impact, progress and lessons from the training.

¹³ Known as Performance Improvement Consultative Committees (PICCs) established formally under BFC's programme in Cambodia's garment export sector.

Vulnerable groups, including vulnerable/informal workers, persons with disability, young workers, child labourers, indigenous communities, persons living with HI and LGBTI persons

A focus on vulnerable women, men and youth workers cuts across the DWCP, including within the formalization agenda and social protection expansion (with targeted priority in programmatic terms currently on construction workers, young workers, tuk tuk drivers, domestic workers and entertainment workers). However, the review observes that there is scope for a more deliberate and systematic focus on decent work creation in rural areas where the majority of Cambodia's population still lives, including through strengthened partnerships with the relevant ministries, international partners and domestic civil society partners. This need was also highlighted in priorities raised by constituents in the first of the tripartite workshops to develop priorities for the next DWCP. A key target group in this context is indigenous communities for whom the formalization of communal land rights can be an essential stepping stone towards improved rights and livelihoods. Planned engagement with selected indigenous communities under the DWCP did not proceed due to anticipated resources not being available, as elaborated elsewhere.

The reduction of child labour in the garment sector is widely regarded as a success story of BGC / GMAC collaboration. A challenge in detecting remaining cases of child labour is the use of fake ID's by young workers as well as negotiating remediation processes with employers where young workers used falsified documents. However, as frequent reports from different sources indicate, child labour is still prevalent in many areas of the Cambodia economy, with child labour in the brick kilns which have sprung up to service the construction industry being the most recent widely publicized example. The strengthening of MoLVT labour inspection capacities around child labour continues to be a priority, and there has been discussion between ILO and FAO on addressing child labour in rural areas.

Beyond these areas, only limited and partial evidence was available from a desk review of Development Cooperation Project evaluation findings on the extent to which the rights, status and conditions of vulnerable groups were systematically reflected in DWCP implementation. Overall, the review finds that scope remains for more systematic attention to the inclusion, rights and conditions of vulnerable groups, from evidencebased contextual analysis in project designs to specific inclusion in indicators, targets and implementation plans.

International Labour Standards and social dialogue

Cambodia has not ratified an International Labour Convention since 1999, although preparatory work or the ratification of C.189 on domestic workers has proceeded under the current DWCP. At the same time a number of concerns, particularly around Freedom of Association, have been highlight by the CEACR, providing the basis for the joint adoption by constituents of a Roadmap to address CEACR concerns and recommendations in this regard in the next DWCP period.

Raising awareness of constituents on ILS continued as a priority capacity development and technical support focus during the DWCP period, anchored in CP Priority 1: Improving Industrial Relations and Rights at Work. The need to maintain this focus into the next DWCP is reinforced by an examination of various policy and project documents related to the ILO's social protection engagement in Cambodia (albeit only one programme area within the broader DWCP context). There is little explicit visibility in such documents of either C.102 on social protection or the ILO Social Protection Floors Recommendation(2012), although in practice core social floor concepts are embedded in the new and previous national social protection strategies.

With respect to social dialogue, stakeholder and project evaluation feedback generally indicated that institutions, processes and a culture of social dialogue are still maturing and evolving in Cambodia. Progress in this respect was demonstrated by the intensive and robust tripartite discussions to formulate the next DWCP and the effective dialogue which has underpinned the annual DWCP review processes. The largest and longest standing of the Project Advisory Committees, that for BFC, provides a platform for at times

robust dialogue. More broadly, a culture of tripartite dialogue has strengthened within the national minimum wage process and social partners have been actively engaged in legislative and policy development processes, albeit with challenges in terms of analytical capacities.

However, stakeholder feedback indicates that building the trust and robust processes necessary to lift social dialogue to a new level is still work in progress, with the practice still quite variable depending on the sector or issues concerned. Trade unions have drawn attention to the lack of social partner representation in the new Social Protection Council as an important gap in national governance architecture, despite the importance of employers and workers being heard as primary stakeholders. This review accordingly recommends that the promotion of social dialogue capacities and culture be social dialogue continue to be given intensive and explicit in the next DWCP.

Environmental sustainability

The desk review of Development Cooperation Project evaluations indicated that considerable untapped potential exists for giving this cross-cutting policy driver greater prominence in DWCP design, planning and implementation, linking inter alia to the Rectangular Strategy IV, UNDAF and the RGC Green Growth Strategy.

The BFC mid-term evaluation, for example, recommended that attention be given to environmental sustainability issues in international and local buyers' forums to generate discussion and share approaches and experience, with a view linking to the environmental standards and tools employed by international brands (e.g the use of the Higg Index by GAP as part of its internal environment assessment of supplier practices); assisting BFC to formulate a realistic approach to environmental sustainability in its next strategy and project document; informing implementation of the national garment sector strategy; and linking to RGC consideration of ways forward in addressing EU GSP + requirements for ratification of international environmental agreements in the context of LDC graduation.

The UNDAF 2019-2023 which was developed during 2018 highlights the contribution that can be made in this regard by the ILO through application of the ILO Just Transition Guidelines Towards Environmentally Sustainable Economies and Societies for All. ¹⁴ This includes the expanded creation of 'green jobs' that contribute towards the preservation and restoration of the environment, be they in traditional sectors, such as manufacturing and construction, or in new, emerging green sectors, such as organic agriculture, renewable energy and energy efficiency, eco-tourism, resource management and environmental services.¹⁵ Accordingly this review recommends the systematic incorporation of these guidelines into all relevant aspects of DWCP design, planning and implementation.

• The extent to which the resource mobilization is an integral part of DWCP strategies.

It is not unusual for DWCPs to be adopted with resourcing gaps still to be addressed in certain areas. In such cases there are normally indications of potential funding sources to be followed-up, with the DWCP itself providing a resource mobilization tool. At the same, new initiatives can emerge which offer funding potential, requiring a strategic response from the CO and JPO which links to DWCP priorities and outcomes (for example, the possibility which emerged in 2018 of funding from China for a sub-regional skills development project, including Cambodia). The JPO has shown itself as highly adept in responding to such opportunities and in matching known and potential funding sources with DWCP priorities and outcomes.

In this context, drawing on the evidence of project evaluations and JPO feedback, this review finds that resource mobilization and DWCP strategies are generally well integrated - including at the subregional level

¹⁴ The Guidelines offer a framework and practical tool to ensure that national and global efforts to tackle climate change and other environmental challenges also advance employment creation goals, social justice and fair transitions for workers, enterprises and communities on an equal footing.

¹⁵ ILO (2017). Cambodia: Employment and Environmental Sustainability Fact Sheets 2017, Geneva. Accessed at https://www.ilo/asia/publications/issue-briefs/WCMS 627803/lang--en/index.htm

in cases including social protection, employment services and LMI. A concerted effort made by tripartite and development partners mobilized USD7,187 in 2016 and 2017 (consolidated over two years) to implement activities under DWCP outcomes.

Two outstanding examples of integrating resource mobilization with DWCP strategies are BFC and the UNJP on youth employment. With respect to BFC, the main sources of BFC financing are (i) the RGC (at a contribution rate based on the value of previous year garment exports); (ii) garment sector manufacturers (paid through GMAC at the rate of 0.6 USD per factory worker per year based on NSSF data); (iii) payment for BFC core services by international buyers (for reports) and by factories (for voluntary advisory services) and (iv) international donor contributions to cover remaining programe delivery requirements (about USD 1.6 million in the current strategic phase). The payment for services element of BFC income is further reinforced by the Garment Sector MOU statement that international buyers who use BFC services "will contribute to programme operation based on fees for services rendered." This approach is anchored in BFC's focus on strengthening national ownership as part of its long-term exit strategy orientation.

With respect to the UNJP, resource mobilization benefited from long-term multi-year partnerships with a core of donors (i.e. SIDA, Japan, China and Korea) within which youth employment was a core component, often spread across DWCP periods. Negotiations with the donors involved addressing priorities of both parties and matching these to key project components. In contrast, the UNJP partnership with SDC was the result of a targeted request linking to both the DWCP and One UN/UNDAF priorities, with agreement reached after almost two years of negotiations. The resourcing approach reflects both the need to mobilise funds for particular components of the joint programme, linked to particular agency contributions, and the collective orientation of the UNJP overall.

6.3 Efficiency of programme delivery and use of resources

The review found the DWCP to be efficiently, transparently and accountably managed with respect to the application of both financial and human resources, although there are areas for improvement in terms of internal systems and procedures.

• Is the ILO contribution to the outcome adequately resourced? Any technical cooperation activities (regardless of the sources of funds) contribute to this outcome? Any other resources? If under-resourced, why?

As indicated elsewhere, the CO and JPO were generally successful in raising XB funding via development cooperation projects and internal sources to resource DWCP implementation (refer Annex 3). One indicator and target (indigenous land rights and livelihoods) was not able to proceed due to anticipated resources not being available for the current period, and the pace of progress in some other areas (e.g. implementation of the NEP, increasing LMI availability and access to OSH information) were affected by inadequate resourcing from National Budget and/or other sources.

Nonetheless, apart from BFC, the ILO is generally perceived by other stakeholders to lack resources to backup the agency's well-recognised technical expertise. According to one senior government interlocutor, the ILO is "high in expertise, but low in resources," requiring the Ministry for Economy and Finance (in this case) to look to other contributors such as the World Bank and Asian Development Bank for the necessary financing, which can lead to delays in work proceeding.

The ILO in-country social protection team noted a gap between local expectations of highly qualified and relevant support on the one hand, and lack of resources for implementation on the other. This has required locally-based staff to spend an estimated 30-40 percent of their time on obtaining donor funding to support ongoing work, cover their own salaries and meet government requests for technical support. This situation is compounded by the fact that most relevant donors don't cover staff costs and the reported introduction of

"user-pays" approaches for accessing technical expertise at ILO HQ (for example, legal advice to support drafting of the new Social Protection Law), on top of the 13 percent of project funds being earmarked for internal ILO costs.

• Are work processes efficient and timely?

While universally noting the pressures on the JPO in coordinating a complex (and in some areas high profile) programme at a time of accelerating UN reform, evidence provided by project evaluation reports and stakeholder feedback generally commended the efficiency and effectiveness of ILO operations on the ground. As indicated elsewhere, this review that found XB funding is managed and reported upon transparently and accountably and is applied to the purposes intended. One prominent interlocutor described the ILO's performance in Cambodia as "remarkable" in light of the small resource base from which it operates compared with other UN entities in the country.

The area most cited as requiring attention is the efficiency of work processes across the ILO system and the delays and unbalanced workloads this can cause on a day-to-day basis. The review carried out of the ILO's engagement in social protection initiatives under the DWCP found, for example, that internal systems contributed to the less than optimal efficiency of local engagement, particularly the inability to access financial data on IRIS for planning purposes and the lack of induction training to enable new staff to effectively and quickly navigate the system they rely on for managing their work.

Another key concern among both external stakeholders and ILO staff was the implications of activity-byactivity approaches which were seen as prevalent in the delivery of ILO technical/development cooperation projects, leading to higher than necessary transaction costs, especially when associated with delays in funding allocations and/or provision of the requested technical support. The above-mentioned lack of provision in donor agreements for core operational costs, including the necessary staff, further compounded inefficiencies in project delivery.

The BFC mid-term evaluation produced similar findings concerning the impact of internal systems and procedures. Evidence provided by interviews with BFC staff, review of BFC documents and previous evaluation findings indicates that BFC income and expenditure is well monitored and applied transparently in line with the requirement of programme outcomes and outputs. However, concerns were also raised concerning the lack of flexibility in the operational capacities of STAR, the IT backbone of the compliance monitoring system, echoing feedback in the evaluation of Better Work (Global) Phase III. In the BFC case, the office has set-up its own systems to supplement those provided centrally in order to improve work performance.

Such factors affecting day-to-day operations would appear to be in contradiction to references in the ILO Development Cooperation Strategy 2015–17: Report on progress – (329th Session, Geneva, 9–24 March 2017) to the development of programmatic approaches and enabling staff access to IRIS.

6.4 Impact and sustainability of DWCP implementation

The review found that while there is evidence of impact and sustainability in some key areas of DWCP implementation, both areas largely remain "work in progress."

As elaborated below, there is evidence that ILO strategy and actions have contributed to legislative, policy, strategic and institutional change (e.g. expansion of social protection policy and systems, supported by a combination of national budget funding and contributory approaches; the development of a national garment sector strategy; and the establishment of evidence-based minimum wage process). The strong alignment of the DWCP to national laws, policies, strategies and plans provides a key factor in achieving

sustainability, embedding DWCP contributions within broader national frameworks and providing impetus for the resourcing efforts and decisions (human and financial) of constituents for decent work initiatives.

Two areas in which there is evidence of particular progress with respect to impact and sustainability are (i) Better Factories Cambodia, now in its 18th year within the Cambodian garment (and more recently footwear) export sectors; and (ii) the development of Cambodia's social protection policy and systems, where the ILO has been a long-term key partner. A key factor in both cases has been longevity of partnership and development of strong trust-based partnerships. These are elaborated below.

BFC – impact and sustainability key drivers for new phase

An initial impact assessment conducted on BFC by Tufts University (USA) and Indochina Research indicates a positive impact on the lives and prospects of some 2.4 million people (workers, families and communities). Final study findings are due by end of 2018. The current study builds **on** several independent research studies on the impact of BFC spanning many years.¹⁶

Recognizing that BFC's work remains "unfinished," the programme has been shown to have (i) played a major role in sustaining the overall growth of Cambodia's garment industry, despite the downturn during the global financial crisis of 2007-2008; (ii) contributed to improvements in the lives of approximately 2.4 million Cambodians dependent on garment sector earnings (at least three other family members for each garment sector worker); (iii) created a level playing field for labour across all Cambodian garment exporting factories; (iv) influenced business practices through leveraging factory data to drive improvement and becoming a core element in the risk management strategies of international brands/buyers; (v) made Cambodia's garment factories safer overall; (vi) contributed to the virtual elimination of child labour in the sector; and (vii) ensured that workers are receiving the correct levels of wages and social protection benefits .

A key factor in the strengthening of BFC impact on factory performance in the past five years has been the reintroduction in 2014 of public disclosure of factory compliance via the BFC transparency database. Available data since the reintroduction of the database shows a significant reduction in the percentage of low compliance factories and the overall number of violations of the BFC's 21 critical issues.¹⁷

At the same, the data analysis indicates that while low compliance factories take actions to increase compliance prior to be listed in the transparency database, once on the database their performance seems to stagnate or deteriorate. This observation reinforces the importance of steps being taken by BFC (and by Better Work more broadly) to seek strategic entry points to stimulating momentum for ongoing improvements, so that the businesses themselves embrace and drive change to meet their own business imperatives, bringing benefits to all concerned.

The BFC mid-term evaluation found that BFC, linking closely to wider Better Work approaches, has responded proactively to this challenge through a range of initiatives. These include the recent reaching out to international manufacturing/investor groups active in Cambodia (JDU/Roo Hsing and Chrystal as initial/pilot relationships); the intensification of engagement with brands and buyers, including in fora outside Cambodia (e.g. Hong Kong/China); the emphasis on extending and strengthening advisory and training services; the increasing focus on women's leadership, voice and representation (shown to be a key factor in factory-level change); increased engagement with trade unions in the sector; increased attention to systematic data analysis to enhance policy initiatives and drive the improvement of organizational performance; and an internal focus on developing an organizational culture and staff skills base which emphasize "drivers of change" and systems approaches to underpin an ongoing shift from compliance per se

 ¹⁶ Tufts University in collaboration with Indochina Research. (January 2017). Assessing the impact of Better Factories Cambodia: Results from worker and manager baseline surveys. The final findings will be available by the end of 2018.
 ¹⁷ Robertson, Raymond (2018) "Lights On: Public Disclosure and Compliance: Evidence from Better Factories Cambodia," forthcoming Better Work Discussion Paper

to systemic change (described in the new BFC strategy as developing a "culture of compliance" – i.e embedding international labour standards and national legislative requirements into everyday thinking, planning and actions by government, employers, investors, buyers and workers.

Social protection - progressively extending impact and building sustainability over time

The ILO's engagement under successive DWCPs on social protection provides another lens on issue around impact and sustainability. Despite capacity, efficiency and resource challenges from the ILO delivery perspective (see separate references), a 2017 review of relevant documentation and stakeholder feedback indicates that ILO interventions have had a tangible impact in contributing to important developments within Cambodian social protection policies and systems. These have included value-added contributions to the formulation and costing of key policy and strategy documents; the ongoing capacity strengthening of the NSSF and establishment, costing and implementation of the current Employment Injury Insurance (EII) and Social Health Insurance (SHI) schemes (and in the case of the EII, its expansion to the construction sector); the scoping of social assistance options and identification of a way forward; and the scoping and costing of options for future development of pension provision.

Work is also planned to (i) ensure that the NSSF is "fit for purpose" in the new social protection environment which is opening-up in Cambodia and (ii) support the development and consultative process for the new social protection legislation which is currently in the pipeline. Each of these developments represents an important step in the gradual strengthening and expansion of Cambodia's policy and financial architecture, and the critical capacities needed to underpin this long-term.

 Are there exit strategies to ensure results are sustainable by partners' institutions at various levels (local, provincial and national level)? To what extent do the national tripartite constituents take ownership of DWCP – e.g, have there been any contributions (in cash and in kind) by the tripartite or other partners in delivering DWCP results (see earlier)

National constituents, in particular, contribute their own internal resources in terms of staff time actively and regularly, including for DWCP review, development and planning purposes. There are examples of significant financial contributions to the sustaining of DWCP outcomes and initiatives, for example the funding of KAB roll-out across the secondary system by MoEYS and the contributions (described elsewhere) of the RGC and GMAC to BFC over several years.

However, clearly articulated, negotiated, specific and agreed exit strategies are generally not a feature of DWCP design and planning, nor of development cooperation project design. As indicated earlier, the degree to which ongoing implementation and development are owned, driven and resourced by local institutions and the national budget is a key indicator of success in this respect. While this intention is generally an underpinning driver of the DWCP and related development cooperation projects, there is scope to strengthen specific planning in this respect as a basis for joint action and review.

The issue of exit strategies is most visibly highlighted by the current discussion among stakeholders of the long term future of BFC. This was a recurrent theme in consultations in the mid-term evaluation in 2018. While affirming BFC's positive contribution to Cambodia's garment sector over 18 years, all stakeholders interviewed also noted the need to be looking ahead to long-term options which sustain BFC's outcomes, impact and capacities. None advocated a rapid change to current arrangements, acknowledging that the necessary capacity and credibility does not yet exist within the public inspection service to meet international requirements and key stakeholder interests. Accordingly, the evaluation advocated a "crossing the river one stone at a time" approach to long term sustainability, building on the key lessons and good practices summarized in the evaluation report; stepping-up research on viable long-term legal and institutional options; and increasingly focusing on tapping into BFC's acknowledged "convening power" to address systemic issues within the sector.

The social protection review highlighted similar considerations, noting the importance of ILO's technical (including actuarial) and capacity development support to the development of the current social protection strategy and expansion of the system, as well as the effectiveness of the NSSF as a key delivery platform (although currently under pressure due to rapid expansion of services). The review also noted internal ILO dimensions of sustainability from an operational/delivery perspective, particularly in the current context of rapid national developments and high expectations of ILO policy, technical and capacity development support. The above-noted activity-by-activity/stop-start nature of current engagement, combined with the pressure on in-country staff to be raising their own resources, raises questions about the sustainability of current engagement. The adoption of a more programmatic approach, based on longer timeframes and greater coherence and continuity of engagement, supported by multi-country resource mobilization efforts, was thus recommended.

• Are the outputs delivered under the DWCP being used by the partners/ target groups?

Stakeholder feedback and the review of development cooperation project documentation indicated that internalizing DWCP outputs into partner and target group policy, planning and operations is an ongoing focus across all aspects of the programme, even in the absence of explicit exit strategies per se, as indicated above. While results are variable to date, examples of DWCP outputs currently being used by national constituents include:

- adoption of the ILO's strategic compliance planning approach and an improved factory inspection checklist by the MoLVT joint labour inspection system
- the ownership taken by MoEYS over the KAB approach
- the use of ILO actuarial advice for social protection policy and system planning
- the establishment of new competency-based standards, curriculum and assessment packages for four occupations and delivery of these through partner training institutions, supported by the establishment of the Industry Advisory Group on manufacturing
- establishment by the NEA of two additional Migrant Worker Resource Centres (MRCs) in Kampong Thom and Kampot, reaching underserved populations of potential migrant workers and providing them with access to justice and compensation.
- establishment of the Minimum Wage Council and strengthened evidence-based engagement by employers' and workers' organizations in the national minimum wage negotiation process
- development by the Supreme National Economic Council (SNEC) of the national strategy for the long term development of the garment industry
- adoption and roll-out of the National Social Protection Policy Framework (NSPPF) 2016–2025
- establishment of a programme and launch of guidelines to give effect to ministerial regulation (Prakas no. 194) on "working conditions, occupational safety and health rules in enterprises, establishments, companies of entertainment sector", particularly workers vulnerable to HIV
- formulation of the draft second OSH Master Plan 2018-2022 (draft finalized in November 2017, formal adoption occurred in early 2019).

Beyond the core constituents, thousands of young people have been engaged in entrepreneurship training and promotion through the adoption of the ILO's C-BED methodology by locally-based NGOs, and the ILO / TRIANGLE Project MRC model has been partially adopted by IOM into their Standard Operating Procedure (SOP). The latter operationalizes and synthesizes IOM client services, dissemination of information and outreach to target groups via the Poi Pet Transit Centre.

• To what extent have the social partners¹⁸ improved capacities to influence national policy and resources within decent work areas. Any evidence e.g. national tripartite constituents are actively involved in national development planning forums and networks.

As summarized in Section 5, CAMFEBA and members of the DWCP-DWCP have been actively engaged in various national development forums and processes. Although both constituencies have self-identified a number of areas for ongoing and strengthened capacity support, particularly for strategic and effective engagement in national policy process as summarized earlier, they have *inter alia* engaged in the formulation of the new Social Security Law, the Minimum Wage Law; ongoing dialogue on the revision of the Trade Union Law and a range of tripartite processes including the annual tripartite minimum wage process, the Arbitration Council, the Governing Body of the NSSF, the National Committee on Occupational Safety and Health, the National Training Board (NTB), the 8th Working Group on Labour and Industrial Relations and the National Committee for Monitoring Implementation of Ratified ILO Conventions.

In the first two years of the DWCP, such engagement was supported by a series of training sessions in wages policy, minimum wage setting criteria, economics and econometrics. In 2017, over 300 tripartite representatives/members (31 percent women) directly benefited from the training, while tripartite stakeholders' access to technical information was enhanced through LMI produced by the NEA and the regular ILO bulletins on Cambodia's garment and footwear sector. The constituents report that the DWCP period has seen some improvement in capacities and effectiveness of engagement in prioritized areas, but ongoing consolidation and deepening of support is needed in areas prioritized by constituents. Change-over of staff and representation on governance boards and committees accentuates the need for support to be iterative, followed-up and consolidated over time.

• To what extent and how does the DWCP and its associated governance/coordination arrangements contribute to strengthening social dialogue.

The role and effectiveness of the IMC-NEP DWCP sub-committee as the DWCP tripartite governance mechanism is elaborated elsewhere. MoLVT interlocutors in particular highlighted the add-value of that body, as well as the DWCP overall, as a platform for both promoting and demonstrating greater coordination and social dialogue. In this sense, the DWCP and its associated governance/coordination arrangements provide space for the building of relationships, trust and mutual understanding. This was visible to the reviewers in three tripartite workshops during last half of 2018 to develop priorities, outcomes, outputs, indicators and targets for new DWCP. One senior interlocutor addressing the first workshop commented on the "maturity and openness" of the discussion compared with similar meetings at a similar stage of the current DWCP.

¹⁸ The original question referred to "tripartite constituents." It is assumed that the intention is to focus on social partners in this context.

7. MAJOR CHALLENGES AND LESSONS

7.1 Challenges in implementation of the DWCP

An assessment of project evaluations, internal ILO reporting and stakeholder feedback indicates a number of challenges to be considered in formulating and implementing the next DWCP. The following summary highlights key challenges to be taken into account and addressed:

7.1.1 Broader country context

- The need to prepare as a country to reap the benefits of "future of work" e.g. skills, adaptability of workforce, maximizing benefits and addressing risks of digital economy, platform economy, etc
- Fragile economic base four main sectors, unstable agricultural prices, financial instability, natural disasters
- Sustaining economic growth upper middle income status requires 9.5 % increase until 2030 (World Bank)
- Ensuring burgeoning FDI within the economy, particularly from China, translates into decent jobs within the context of Cambodia's Investment Law (1994) and the country's strategic development directions and priorities.
- Increasing the productivity and competiveness of economy and expanding sustainable enterprises.
- Widespread vulnerability: Approximately 70 percent of the workforce remain in informal/vulnerable work, with the most vulnerable including migrant workers, youth and persons with disability.
- Economic progress is not inclusive or equitable. The increase in income equality is counter-balanced by widespread disparities in areas such as education, health, and gender.
- Persistent poverty more than 33 percent of the population are multi-dimensionally poor; 28 percent remain vulnerable to falling back into poverty as a result of factors such as economic shocks or natural disasters.
- The low education and skills base of much of workforce, a result of systemic under-investment and compounded by the mismatch between skills and jobs mismatch in the labour market.
- Persistent gender disparities in all spheres despite important progress on gender equality (e.g. 78 percent participation in workforce and close to parity in primary school enrolment).
- Low OSH levels (although reliable data is not yet available), particularly in growing construction sector.
- Persistence of child labour, including in emerging areas such as the brick kiln industry to serve Cambodia's burgeoning construction industry.

7.1.2 Specific to DWCP implementation

- The capacities of national institutions to deliver on laws, policies, strategies, plans and new initiatives, and monitor and evaluate results, *inter alia* placing demands on availability of key staff and officials to support DWCP initiatives. Considerable cross-provincial variations in the capacities of subnational authorities to implement national policies and deliver quality services.
- Limited institutional and technical capacities of implementing partners to deliver results and meet
 reporting obligations under ILO contractual requirements, including lack of capacity to collect data
 required for the monitoring and evaluation, particularly on outcomes and impact of interventions
 (examples include application of new competency standards and competence-based training by TVET
 institutes and increasing pressures on NSSF due to expansion of contributory and non-contributory
 benefit coverage).
- Data gaps in key areas related to DWCP implementation. More frequent Labour Force Surveys will be an important factor in addressing this challenge.
- NEP implementation slowed down by lack of national budget resourcing and absence of data and monitoring indicators to demonstrate changes in employment outcomes.

- Implementation of the Trade Union Law as promulgated, with implications such as lengthy and complicated registration and MRS certification processes, affecting the ability of unions to represent their members. ILO technical support has been requested to address concerns.
- Categories of fees chargeable by recruitment agencies not yet determined, opening the way for continued arbitrary charges for labour migration services and undermining ethical recruitment practices.
- Pressures on DWCP project staff due to lack of operational/core funding to progress work on social protection (in particular).

Anecdotal feedback conveyed by the Mekong DWCP Evaluation¹⁹ also highlighted challenges posed by differing priorities and perspectives between the DWCP core constituency and those of other ministries and business organizations outside the ILO's tripartite partners. The evaluation suggested that this matters when they are potentially important actors in the implementation of DWCP priorities such as the ratification of fundamental conventions and introducing approaches based on social dialogue and tripartite cooperation. Reference is made to anecdotal indications that influential business interests, for example, have on occasion actively and successfully limited the pursuit of certain DWCP priorities, highlighting the limitations and challenges inherent in decent work programming through tripartite processes. Deeper and expanded engagement around the DWCP will provide important opportunities to help ensure broader policy coherence and 'buy-in' with respect to mainstreaming decent work across governmental policies and strategies in line with ILC and SDG commitments, an approach which already is gaining significant momentum as summarized elsewhere in this report.

7.2 Lessons learnt in DWCP implementation

An assessment of project evaluations, internal ILO reporting and stakeholder feedback affirmed the relevance of the three 2016-2018 priorities to the Cambodian context. These are thus carried forward into the next DWCP phase period and linked to the emerging implications and opportunities of the 4th Industrial Revolution for the Decent Work Agenda.

The desk review and stakeholder feedback further highlighted the following lessons learned and considerations which are relevant to formulation of the DWCP 2019-2023, as well as to the planning and resourcing needed for effective implementation:

The importance of:

- continuing to strengthen alignment with national policy frameworks and priorities, particularly the SDGs/CSDGs, RS IV, NSDP 2019-2023, the IDP, the NEP and relevant sectoral policies and strategies
- strengthening clarity of the linkages between DWCP contributions and bigger picture changes in Cambodia ("theory of change")
- an overall focus on implementation and impact, with national decent work legislative, policy and institutional frameworks now largely in place or in progress
- increasingly embedding DWCP resourcing within national budget planning and decision-making as core to achievement of Cambodia's long-term development objectives
- closely and continuously monitoring the local context and implications for DWCP implementation (e.g. while recent decisive actions by the RGC have shown the availability of fiscal space to expand coverage of social protection benefits, they have also exposed fragilities and gaps in the national governance structure and the need to support social partners to represent their interests in the evolving policy

¹⁹ Ofir, Zenda. (2017). Independent evaluation of the ILO's Decent Work Country Programmes strategies and actions in the Mekong subregion. ILO, Geneva

debates)

- systematic attention to strengthening the institutions, processes, culture and requisite capacities for social dialogue
- positioning the DWCP and its tripartite governance arrangements as a platform for facilitating social dialogue and enhancing coordination and synergies between relevant government ministries and organisations of employers and workers
- continuing the focus on collective bargaining capacities and culture in this context, including the current industry-wide processes within garment sector, with attention to the lessons from this for other sectors
- continuing to systematically strengthen the mainstreaming of gender, disability and the rights and inclusion of vulnerable groups as cornerstones of the SDG focus on 'leaving nobody behind,' underpinned by specific indicators and targets within the DWCP results framework
- maximizing synergies among programmes and projects under the DWCP to enhance efficiency, effectiveness and impact
- continuing and strengthening the DWCP emphasis on (i) outreach to and coverage of informal sector and (ii) subnational initiatives and capacities
- investing in and closely monitoring the quality of partnerships while continuing to (i) extend and deepen engagement with other government ministries and development partners to broaden the outreach, influence, leverage and resource base of the Decent Work Agenda and (ii) promote coherence and coordination in DWCP delivery and its contribution to broader national development objectives
- appreciating the complexities of developing effective partnerships based on trust and openness, which require time and commitment and are influenced by factors such as (i) the attention to national sovereignty and ownership issues that increasingly underpin RGC relations with the international community; and (ii) the impact of generally low capacity "starting levels' across government ministries and departments in terms of resources, facilities, and skills
- enhancing capacities for strategic data gathering, research and evidence-based advocacy to inform
 policy and programme development related to the Decent Work Agenda, with BFC's comprehensive
 factory / sector-based database providing significant potential as a driver for change at policy and
 enterprise levels in this context
- having statistical monitoring indicators at the objective and/or goal level of policies to demonstrate changes and improvements in labour market outcomes and facilitate domestic or external resource mobilization and measurement of progress towards CSDGs
- expanding the engagement of employers' and workers' organizations in skills development prioritization and delivery, including through the validation of competency standards to ensure relevance and alignment to industry needs
- open-source, low cost, peer-based models for training, which have enabled the partner organizations to increase outreach, impact and sustainability and show potential for expansion to areas beyond entrepreneurship and enterprise development
- training on enterprise management systems to support improved ILS and Labour Law compliance (including OSH)

- continuing to strengthen monitoring and evaluation at all levels, with more attention to ensuring learning is widely shared and applied both within the ILO and among constituents and other stakeholders
- mainstreaming M&E and learning capacity development into all DWCP planning and activities
- including adequate provision in development cooperation project agreements for resourcing of core / operational costs (including the necessary staff) for the duration of the project concerned.

8. CONCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATIONS

8.1 Overview

Overall, the review found that the DWCP 2016-2018 has made significant progress towards achieving its stated indicators and targets under each Country Priority and Outcome.

Notable achievements to which the DWCP contributed since 2016 include (i) the formulation of legislation (e.g. on social security) and policy frameworks (e.g. TVET and social protection); (ii) the strengthening and establishment of tripartite institutions (e.g. the Minimum Wage Council; (iii) development of the national garment sector strategy and improved factory level compliance with international labour standards and domestic legislation; (iv) steps (albeit slower than anticipated) to implement the National Employment Policy; (v) expansion of social protection, including to informal workers; (vi) ongoing development of Cambodia's skills architecture and capacities, including the development of competency standards and assessment mechanisms, as well as a comprehensive skills development programme for tourism professionals; (vii) improved capacities for collective bargaining and evidence-based annual minimum wage negotiations; (viii) expansion and strengthening of employment and migrant worker services, including the national migrant workers complaints mechanism; (ix) initiation and coordination of a joint focus within the UN system on youth employment; (x) ongoing strengthening of critical constituent capacities in areas including labour inspection and policy engagement; and (xi) ongoing promotion of small enterprise development to thousands of Cambodia young people via means such as the 'Community-based Enterprise Development' (C-BED) initiative and the 'Know About Business (KAB)' programme in secondary schools.

8.2 Recommendations

In this context and looking forward to the DWCP 2019-2023, the following recommendations are made:

8.2.1 At strategic and substantive levels:

- 1. Carry forward and build on the **three current DWCP priorities** into the next DWCP period, with an underpinning focus on the potential and challenges of the emerging digital economy in Cambodia.
- 2. Strengthen explicit DWCP **linkages with the SDGs/CSDGs**, reinforcing the normative and business cases for the implementation of decent work as a core aspect of SDG implementation.
- 3. Ensure effective **social dialogue and tripartite cooperation** is given priority attention in all aspects of the DWCP, including design, implementation, resourcing, M&E and DWCP governance. In this context, conduct reviews of (i) the effectiveness and status of tripartite mechanisms in Cambodia and (ii) DWCP tripartite governance arrangements.
- 4. Strengthen specific attention to mainstreaming, inclusion and capacity strengthening with respect to gender equality, youth and vulnerable groups (including informal workers, young workers, migrant workers, persons with disability, members of indigenous communities, LGBTQI persons and women and men living with HIV. In this context, prioritize the promotion of women's leadership, voice and representation within constituent organizations and DWCP processes.
- 5. Include and implement strategies that increase effective **coordination of stakeholders** around decent work objectives at national and subnational levels, including across and between government ministries and agencies, employers and the trade union movement, with prioritization of (i) outreach to and inclusion of informal and vulnerable workers and (ii) increased multi-stakeholder collaboration around social protection and skills/TVET.

- 6. Leverage the ILO's relationship of credibility and trust with the RGC to progressively **increase National Budget commitments** to implement DWCP priorities and outcomes. In this context, continue seeking opportunities, along with other development partners as appropriate, to engage in high-level policy and planning dialogue with the RGC, including on long-term national budget planning and commitments.
- Beyond the ILO's core constituent relationships, pursue expanded and new partnerships at governmental, civil society, international partner levels as part of sustainability and impact-enhancing efforts.
- 8. Prioritize the strengthening of **data availability** in areas of relevant to the Decent Work Agenda, including through more regular Labour Force Surveys. In this context, (i) prioritize strategic research in key areas of relevance to the Decent Work Agenda; and (ii) employ available technologies to effectively use the data to which the DWCP has access (e.g through BFC monitoring services) as a basis for policy influence and performance improvement.

8.2.2 At operational/implementation levels:

- 9. Continue to strengthen programme delivery through:
 - i. harmonization of DWCP M&E systems with national RS IV, NSDP, CSDG and UNDAF systems and reporting, as well as internally within the ILO (including linkages between country-level governance/oversight and the ILO's global reporting systems)
 - ii. developing and improving processes to synthesize and use information from evaluation findings and recommendations in ongoing DWCP planning and implementation
- iii. increasing support for training and mentoring in result-based management and M&E, as well as financial reporting, to narrow the M&E and reporting capacity gaps identified by partners.
- strengthening synergies, linkages and mutual reinforcement under the Cambodia DWCP, including (i) across and between programmes and projects at national level; and (ii) within the ILO between regional specialist staff and programme staff at regional and country levels
- v. developing a multi-country ILO resource mobilization strategy (e.g. at ASEAN and/or GMS levels, including an enhanced focus on South-South Cooperation) to increase strategic focus, coherence and synergies and reduce fund-raising pressures on in-country staff
- vi. in parallel with the above, increasing attention to ensuring that donor agreements include adequate provision for the operational/core costs of delivery
- vii. expanding programmatic approaches with particular priority on measures to address activity-byactivity and high transaction approaches, in line with the ILO Development Cooperation Strategy 2015–17: Report on progress, 329th Session, 9-24 March 2017
- viii. selectively increasing ROAP, CO and JPO engagement in wider UNCT working groups and UN Development System reform processes at country level, including through an increased proportion of DWCP delivery occurring through joint programming arrangements.

Annex 1: References

Background references

Asian Development Bank (2014). Cambodia: *Country poverty analysis 2014*, Asian Development Bank: <u>https://www.adb.org/sites/default/files/institutional-document/151706/cambodia-country-poverty-analysis-2014.pdf</u>.

Asian Development Bank. *Country Partnership Strategy: Cambodia, 2014–2018. Gender Analysis*. Accessed at <u>https://www.adb.org/sites/default/files/linked-documents/cps-cam-2014-2018-ga.pdf</u>

Asian Development Bank (2015). Promoting Women's Economic Empowerment in Cambodia. ADB, Manila

ILO (2017). Application of International Labour Standards 2017 (1): Report of the Committee of Experts on the Application of Conventions and Recommendations. ILO, Geneva

ILO/Better Factories Cambodia (2018). Annual Report 2018: An Industry and Compliance Review. ILO and IFC, Geneva

ILO (2017). Cambodia Country Brief: ASEAN in Transformation. How Technology is Changing Jobs and Enterprises. ILO ACT/EMP, Geneva

ILO (2018). World Employment and Social Outlook – Trends 2018. Accessed at https://www.ilo.org/global/research/global-reports/weso/2018/lang--en/index.htm

MEF and ADB (2016). *Cambodia's Macroeconomic Progress, A Journey of 25 Years,* Ministry of Economy and Finance, <u>https://www.mef.gov.kh/documents/shares/Macroeconomic Progress at ADB.pdf</u>

RGC. (2018). Policy on Labour Migration for Cambodia 2019-2023, Phnom Penh

RGC. (2013). Rectangular Strategy for Growth, Employment, Equity and Efficiency (Phase VIII). Phnom Penh

RGC. Cambodia Supreme National Economic Council (2018). *Draft Cambodia Garment and Footwear Sector Development Strategy 2019-2025: Update of Strategic Priorities.* Phnom Penh

RGC: Relevant laws, *Prakas*, and national policies strategies and plans, including the IDP, NEP, LMP, NYP, TVETP, SPPF, NPA-CL 2, OSH Master Plan 2, and Neary Ratanak IV/V

UN Country Team, Cambodia (2018). Common Country Assessment, 2019-2023. Phnom Penh

UN Country Team, Cambodia (2015). United Nations Development Assistance Framework (UNDAF), 2016-2018. Phnom Penh

UNDP. (2018). *Human Development Indices and Indicators: 2018 Statistical Update. Briefing note for countries on the 2018 Statistical Update:* Cambodia. UNDP, Phnom Penh

World Bank (April 2018). *Cambodia Economic Outlook: Recent Economic Developments and Outlook*. World Bank Group, Phnom Penh

World Bank (2017). *Cambodia: Sustaining strong growth for the benefit of all - A systematic country diagnostic*. World Bank Group, Phnom Penh

DWCP and related documents

ILO Joint Projects Office DWCP Progress Reports (2016, 2017)

Kingdom of Cambodia Decent Work Country Programme (DWCP) 2016-2018

Evaluations of UNDAF Cycles 2011-2015; and 2016-2018 in Cambodia

High Level Evaluation of the ILO's Decent Work Country Programme strategies and actions in the Mekong subregion 2012–2017 and a fact sheet summarizing key findings and recommendations;

ILO High Level Evaluation on Social Protection Floors, 2012-2017 - Cambodia Case Study. Midterm Evaluation of Better Factories Cambodia

TRIANGLE in ASEAN - Evaluability Assessment Report

Asia Region Thematic Evaluation on Social Protection 2012-2017 (Phase II)

Social Dialogue interventions: What works and why? Lesson learned from a synthesis review 2013-2016

Mid-term review of the Partnership Programme 2014-2017 between Minister for Foreign Trade and Development Cooperation of the Netherlands and the ILO

Regional Thematic Evaluation on Youth Employment in Asia and the Pacific (Cambodia) 2012-2017

Evaluation of the SIDA Partnership on Employment Promotion (Cambodia)

ILO Decent Work Results Dashboard 2016-2017 / Cambodia: https://www.ilo.org/IRDashboard/#aci0p4r

Final Evaluation reports of the ILO STED project and IR project in Cambodia

Final evaluation report of ILO-Korea Partnership Programme 2015-2017

Annex 2: List of those consulted for review

H.E Mr. Hou Vudthy, with representatives of MoLVT	Under-Secretary of State, MoLVT
Departments	
Ms. Sandra D'Amico	Vice President, Cambodian Federation of Employers
	and Business Associations (CAMFEBA)
National Trade Union Council (NTUC-DWCP)	Members of committee
Mr. Ath Thorn	President, Cambodia Labor Federation (CLC)
Ms. Pauline Tamesis	UN Resident Coordinator
Mr. Tun Sophorn	ILO National Coordinator
Ms. Esther Germans	CTA, Better Factories Cambodia (BFC)
Ms. Sara Park	Deputy Programme Manager, BFC
Ms. Chuong Por	National Project Coordinator, Occupational Safety
	and Health Project
Ms. Malika Ok	National Project Coordinator, Expanding and
	Improving Social Protection (SOCPRO)
Mr. Rim Khleang	National Project Officer, Strengthening Skills
	Development in Cambodia, Lao PDR and Myanmar
	through South- South and Triangular Cooperation
Mr. Ritthy Ou	National Project Officer, Community-based
	Enterprise Development (C-BED)
Ms. Socheata Sou	Coordinator, Joint UN Programme on youth
	employment, JPO
Mr. Veth Vorn and Mr. Oliver Fisher	National Project Coordinator and Technical Officer
	respectively, Tripartite Action to Protect Migrant
	Workers within and from the Greater Mekong
	Subregion from Labour Exploitation (GMS TRIANGLE
	project)

In line with the streamlined and integrated approach followed for the drafting of this CPR, valuable input was also provided by consultations conducted as part of the following processes for development of the Cambodia DWCP 2019-2023:

(i) three national tripartite consultation workshops in the period August – December 2018

- (ii) consultations conducted with a range of RGC ministries and international development partners as part of the DWCP 2019-2023 partnership mapping exercise
- (iii) interviews conducted with ILO specialists based in Bangkok in the above context.

In addition (as noted earlier), input was provided in the course of consulations held as part of the parallel review on DWCP governance arrangements in Asia and the Pacific, for which Cambodia was a case study country.

No.	Project Name	Project Description	End date
1	BFC Better Factories Cambodia (Main donors: RGC, GMAC, GIZ, USDOL, Netherlands/MoFA, Better Work)	BFC helps the garment industry improve working conditions and compliance while enhancing its competitiveness through unannounced factory monitoring visits and offering a growing range of training resources and advisory services for workers, union leaders, supervisors and factory managers.	31/12/2019
2	C-BED Community-based Enterprise Development to strengthen grassroots activities targeting vulnerable workers and business owners in the informal economy (Main donor: Japan SSNF)	The project improves the ability of tripartite partners and social safety net providers in Cambodia to provide low cost, sustainable programs for business skills development, secure finance, and rights protection. Project partners will receive technical assistance to augment the ILO Community-Based Enterprise Development training tools.	31/12/2017
3	IR Improving Industrial Relations in Cambodia's Garment Industry (Main donor: SIDA, H&M)	The Project promotes industrial peace by assisting the Government, employers and workers to develop harmonious industrial relations and to prevent and resolve disputes by strengthening dispute resolution mechanisms, developing legal, policy and regulatory framework and capacity building of social partners to engage in collective bargaining and promote high quality collective bargaining agreements.	31/12/2017 (2 nd Phase expected to start in Q1 2018)
4	OSH Enhancing Occupational Safety and Health Standards in Construction Sector in Cambodia (Main donor: Japan MoHLW)	The Project will improve safety and health of construction workers in Cambodia through effective implementation of policy and legal framework in construction sector; and promote and share best practise on OSH through training and capacity building programmes and promote high quality agreements.	31/03/2020
5	LSGSC–WAGE Labour Standards in Global Supply Chains: A programme of action for Asia and the garment sector (Main donor: Germany BMZ)	The Project produces knowledge and tools which can be used by the social partners at the factory, national, regional and global levels to improve labour market governance and working conditions throughout the globalized supply chain. Cambodia, Indonesia and Pakistan are particular beneficiary countries. In Cambodia, the project focuses on the minimum wage fixing and promotion of freedom of association and harmonised industrial relations.	31/12/2018
6	Social Protection Increased Quality and Coverage of Social Protection, particularly among vulnerable groups (Main donors: Japan, Korea, EU)	The project expands and improves social protection to vulnerable workers through evidence-based policy advice; capacity building for national constituents; promotion of knowledge sharing; and awareness-raising activities and support for national dialogue. It supports the National Social Security Fund in developing & implementing health insurance and pension schemes for workers, and the national social protection policy framework.	31/12/2019

Annex 3: Development cooperation projects supporting DWCP (2017)

7	SSC	The SSC improves labour market efficiency and	31/07/2017
	ILO/China South-South Cooperation Project to Expand Employment Services and Enhance labour Market Information in Cambodia and Lao PDR (Main donor: China MoHRSS)	participation, reducing unemployment, and enhancing linkages and information flows between job seekers and employers, which will in turn contribute to the reduction of poverty in Cambodia and Lao PDR. The Project strategy is to improve the quality of employment services through strengthened client orientation and capacity building of job centres and their officials, and to improve the quality and analysis of labour market information will be the core components of this Project.	(2 nd Phase delayed)
8	STED Upgrading Skills for Trade and Economic Diversification (Main donor: Sweden SIDA)	The Project supports growth and decent employment creation in two sectors (light manufacturing and food processing) to contribute to increased exports and economic diversification. Its support is through action research, standards development and skills training in Cambodia and Myanmar.	31/12/2017
9	TRIANGLETripartite Action for the Protection and Promotion of the Rights of Migrant Workers in ASEAN Region(Main donor: Australia DFAT, Canada CIDA)	The TRIANGLE project aims to significantly reduce the exploitation of labour migrants through the formulation and implementation of improved recruitment and labour protection policies and practices, capacity building for stakeholders, and provision of support services. The project carries out interventions in six countries -Cambodia, Lao PDR, Malaysia, Myanmar, Thailand and Viet Nam.	30/08/2025
10	UNJP United Nations Joint Programme "UNited for Youth Employment in Cambodia" (ILO as the convening and administrative agent) (Main donors: Switzerland SDC, Sweden SIDA, IBSA Trust Fund)	The programme promotes decent and productive employment opportunities for Cambodian youth, through providing the quality formal and non-formal education including volunteerism to develop relevant technical and vocational skills; equipping them with adequate entrepreneurial and business skills to create and develop sustainable enterprises; and helping them reduce their exposure to discrimination at work while raising their awareness of rights; and how to promote their rights at work.	31/08/2019 (Phase 1)
11	Youth Employment (YE) ILO follow-up to Cambodia's National Employment Policy 2015- 25, targeting Youth Employment (Main donor: Sweden SIDA)	The project will create enabling conditions for decent and productive employment and to prepare young people for the world of work. It focuses on (i) Strengthening institutional mechanisms for leadership, coordination and implementation of policies; (ii) Supporting young women and men with access to quality education and technical/vocational skills training; and (ii) Protecting young women and men from the risk of abuse and discrimination at work.	31/12/2017

Annex 4: Cambodia DWCP 2019-2023: partnership mapping, 27 January, 2019

The following mapping draws on a series of consultations with the ILO JPO in Phnom Penh, a wide range of Cambodian government ministries and agencies, international agencies active in Cambodia and ILO specialist and programme staff based in Bangkok. As of 27 January 2019, it was still in draft form and subject to verification and completion to ensure 100 percent coverage of all current and emerging DWCP partners.

Cambodian partners	Focus of cooperation	ILO contribution
CDC	Supporting skills development and inclusion of vulnerable groups aspects of new Investment Law	Technical and skills development support
MEF	Implementation of national Garment Sector Strategy, including through establishment of tripartite Advisory Committee to support MEF	 Technical and capacity building support Facilitating tripartite stakeholder engagement Access to other country experience
МІН	Transition from informal to formal economy, including preparedness of SMEs for registration and national awards to promote SME good practice	Technical and skills development support
MoLVT MoC	 Improving competitiveness and productivity of garment/footwear sector through improved working conditions and rights in the workplace 	 Implementation of Better Factories Cambodia (BFC) at workplace level (2019-2023 - main donors: RGC, GMAC, GIZ, USDOL, Netherlands MoFA, ILO Better Work)
MRD	 Indigenous community identification and certification (as basis for communal land titles and livelihoods) Establishment of National Council of Indigenous People 	 Technical and capacity development support Outreach to other relevant actors and resources Access to other country experience
CAMFEBA, workers organizations and entrepreneur associations (CWEA, YEAC)	 Promotion of formal employment opportunities and SME registration, as well as relevant institutional and technical capacities in each organization Strengthening productivity and competiveness of garment sector 	 Technical and capacity development support Outreach to other relevant actors and resources Access to other country experience
Cambodia Indigenous Peoples Organisation (CIPO)	 Indigenous identification and certification process Livelihoods promotion in selected communities 	 Technical and capacity development support Outreach to other relevant actors and resources Access to other country experience
GMAC	Strengthening competiveness and productivity of garment sector in context of implementation of Garment	 Technical and capacity development support Outreach to other relevant actors and

Key partnerships for delivery of Outcome 1.1

	and Footwear Sector Development Strategy 2019-2025	resourcesAccess to other country experience
International partners	Focus of cooperation	ILO contribution
FAO	 5-year agricultural survey (employment aspects) Livelihoods promotion for indigenous communities on communal land 	 Technical and capacity development support Outreach to other relevant actors and resources Access to other country experience
IFAD	Rural employment and livelihoods (under Accelerating Inclusive Markets for Smallholders Project, AIMS)	 Technical and capacity development support Outreach to other relevant actors and resources Access to other country experience
SDC, SIDA IBSA Trust Fund	Implementation of UN Joint Youth Employment Programme	 Convening and administration of United Nations Joint United Programme (UNJP): UNited for Youth Employment in Cambodia (Phase 1 until 31/08/2019; main donors SDC, SIDA, IBSA Trust Fund)
UNIDO	 Promotion of sustainable tourism, including eco and community tourism Livelihoods promotion for indigenous communities on communal land 	 Technical and capacity development support Outreach to other relevant actors and resources, including links with ILO tourism professionals skills development project (Ministry of Tourism) Access to other country experience
UNJP (UNDP, UNESCO, UNICEF and UNV)	 Promoting youth employment, employability, technical and soft skills, and rights at work 	 Convening and administration of United Nations Joint United Programme (UNJP): UNited for Youth Employment in Cambodia (Phase 1 until 31/08/2019; main donors SDC, SIDA, IBSA Trust Fund)
UNOCHR	 Indigenous community identification and certification (as basis for land titling and livelihoods) 	 Technical and capacity development support Outreach to other relevant actors and resources Access to other country experience

Key partnerships for delivery of Outcome 1.2

Cambodian partners	Focus of cooperation	ILO contribution	
CDC	Implementation of provisions in new Investment Law concerning labour	Technical and capacity development support	

	skills development with focus on automotive and electrical sectors	
MAFF	Identification of skill areas for competency standards development in rural areas, including (i) management of cooperatives and (ii) repair and maintenance of agricultural machinery, with exploration of possible cooperation with the UNESCAP Centre for Sustainable Agricultural Machinery (CSAM)	 Technical and capacity development support, including through incorporation of the two identified areas into national skills development planning Access to other country experience
MEF	• Skills development, including for rural youth, with focus on digital literacy (within framework of the MEF Skills Development Fund)	• Technical support and capacity development, including on digital literacy as key component of TVET
MoLVT	 TVET development and provision via TVET centres and NEA Application of ASEAN skill standards (MRS and MRA) in Cambodia 	 Technical and capacity development support Design and implementation of ILO/China South-South Cooperation Project to expand Employment Services and enhance Labour Market Information (phase 2 commencing in 2019; main donor China MoHRSS)
МоТ	 Application of MRS and MRA in Cambodian tourism sector Tourism professional skills development (1 employee /1 skill) Soft skills and entrepreneurship through tourism training centres 	 Technical support in areas including TOT, recognition of prior learning, assessment centre quality, apprenticeships and internships Soft skills and entrepreneurship training modules provide through SSN project
NTB, IAG-M and Sector Skills Councils	Oversight, priorities, coordination and direction of skills development / TVET	 Technical and capacity development support Access to other country experience
CAMFEBA, workers organizations	 Supporting / encouraging respective memberships to engage with TVET system Supporting / encouraging workers, especially youth, to undertake TVET 	Technical and capacity development support
International partners	Focus of cooperation	ILO contribution
FAO	 Skills development for rural youth, including life skills education Assessment of skill needs for rural youth (including application of FAO guidelines) 	 Technical and capacity development support Incorporation of prioritized rural skills needs into broader national skills and competencies planning
IFAD	 Assessment of skill needs of rural youth (under Assets for Agricultural Markets, Business and Trade Project, SAAMBAT) 	 Technical and capacity development support Incorporation of prioritized rural skills needs into broader national skills and competencies planning

UNIDO	 Youth skills and employment development, including digital literacy (linked to UNIDO Programme for Country Partnership) 	•	Technical and capacity development support Incorporation of prioritized skills needs into broader national skills and
			competencies planning

Key partnerships for delivery of Outcome 1.3

Cambodian partners	Focus of cooperation	ILO contribution
MAFF	• Development of farmer cooperatives in initial 5 province; extension to further provinces based on initial experience	 Technical and capacity development support through use of ILO 'Think Co- op' tools Technical and capacity development support through use of ILO 'Think, Start and Manage Coop' tools
MEF	 Implementation of National Entrepreneurship Promotion Fund (EPF) 	• Technical and promotional support, linked to ILO/CAMFEBA partnership and ILO Community-based Enterprise Development (C-BED) programme (donor: Japan SSNF)
МІН	Implementation of National SMEs Development Policy and Strategy	Technical and capacity development support
MoEYS	 Roll-out of 'Know About Business' to all secondary schools nationwide Entrepreneurship training through youth centres as well as Cambodia Entrepreneurship Day awareness raising events 	 Technical and capacity development support Provision of ILO tools on entrepreneurship and support to training organisation
CAMFEBA and workers' organizations	 Promoting knowledge and skills relevant to entrepreneurship and sustainable enterprise development within respective memberships Evidence-based policy engagement on entrepreneurship and sustainable enterprise development 	 Technical and capacity development support in context of 5-year ILO/social partner cooperation plans
Entrepreneurship associations (CWEA, YEAC) ²⁰	 Promoting entrepreneurship for women and youth Evidence-based policy engagement on entrepreneurship and sustainable enterprise development 	Technical and capacity development support
FASMEC ²¹	 Promotion of SME development, including at national policy and regulatory level 	 Technical and promotional support, linked to ILO/CAMFEBA partnership and ILO Community-based Enterprise Development (C-BED) programme (donor: Japan SSNF)

²⁰ Cambodia Women Entrepreneurs Association and Young Entrepreneurs Association of Cambodia

²¹ Federation of Associations for Small and Medium Enterprises of Cambodia

International partners	Focus of cooperation	ILO contribution
FAO	 Rural youth skill needs assessment, skills development and employment Enterprise and entrepreneurship development in domestic fisheries (EU funded) 	 Technical and capacity development support
IFAD	 Small business / value-chain development in agriculture (under Agriculture Services Programme for Innovation, Resilience and Extension, ASPIRE) Youth entrepreneurship development (under Assets for Agricultural Markets, Business and Trade Project, SAAMBAT) 	Technical and capacity development support
UNIDO	Enterprise and entrepreneurship development in domestic fisheries	Technical and capacity development support

Key partnerships for delivery of Outcome 2.1

Cambodian partners	Focus of cooperation	ILO contribution
MEF	Oversight and implementation of Social Protection Law, Social Security Law and Social Protection Framework, including establishment of the integrated Social Security Operator arrangement	 Technical and capacity development support Strategic research Access to other country experience Implementation of project: Increased Quality and Coverage of Social Protection, particularly among vulnerable groups (until 31/12/2019 – main donors Japan, Korea, EU)
Social Protection Commission	Direction and oversight of Social Protection System	 Technical and capacity development support Access to other country experience
NSSF	Administration of Social Security schemes, including introduction of pension scheme	 Technical support for development of action plan and implementation Access to other country experience
CAMFEBA and worker's organizations	 Engagement with Social Protection Commission and related processes Engagement on development and implementation of social protection laws, policies, regulations, strategies and plans Raising awareness of members about social protection laws, availability and requirements, including with respect to voluntary contributions 	 Technical and capacity development support Access to other country experience

International partners	Focus of cooperation	ILO contribution
FAO	Social protection access / coverage in agriculture	Technical and capacity development support
Oxfam	 Expansion of social protection coverage to informal workers 	Technical and capacity development support
UNICEF	Social protection policy, systems and coverage development, with focus on youth and girls	Technical and capacity development support
WHO	Health Equity Fund expansion and coverage	Technical and capacity development support

Key partnerships for delivery of Outcome 2.2

Cambodian partners	Focus of cooperation	ILO contribution
MEF	Oversight and implementation of Social Protection Law, Social Security Law and Social Protection Framework, including establishment of new Social Security Operator arrangement	 Technical and capacity development support Strategic research and access to other country experience Implementation of project: Increased Quality and Coverage of Social Protection, particularly among vulnerable groups (until 31/12/2019 – donors Japan, Korea, EU)
Social Protection Commission	Direction and coordination of Social Protection System	 Technical and capacity development support Access to other country experience
NSSF	 Integration into Social Security Operator arrangement; administration of Social Security schemes, including introduction /administration of pension scheme 	 Technical support for development of action plan and implementation Access to other country experience
CAMFEBA and worker's organizations	 Participation in Social Security Operator arrangement Engagement on development and implementation of social protection laws, policies, regulations, strategies and plans Raising awareness of members about social protection laws, availability and requirements, including with respect to voluntary contributions 	 Technical and capacity development support Access to other country experience
International partners	Focus of cooperation	ILO contribution
FAO	Social protection access / coverage in agricultural sector	Technical and capacity development support

UNICEF	Social protection system development and expansion	Technical and capacity development support
WHO	 Health Equity Fund coverage and expansion 	Technical and capacity development support

Key partnerships for delivery of Outcome 2.3

Cambodian partners	Focus of cooperation	ILO contribution
MoLVT	 Developing and implementing OSH policy, systems, plans, profiles and inspection capacities Prioritization on addressing OSH issues in the garment/footwear, construction, and entertainment sectors 	 Technical and capacity development support, including on labour inspection strategic compliance planning Access to other country experience Implementation of Enhancing OSH and Health Standards in Construction Sector in Cambodia Project (until 2020; main donor Japan MHLW) Implementation of Better Work Academy Programme on OSH under Better Factories Cambodia (under BFC, until 2023; main donors: RGC, GMAC, GIZ, USDOL, Netherlands MoFA, ILO Better Work)
National Committee on Occupational Safety and Health	Effective functioning of the Commission to ensure implementation of OSH policy and plans	 Technical and capacity development support Access to other country experience
CAMFEBA and workers' organizations	 Engagement in the governance and implementation of the above projects and mechanisms; awareness raising and training of memberships on OSH 	 Technical and capacity development support Access to other country experience
International partners	Focus of cooperation	ILO contribution
International garment and footwear brands, buyers, investors	 Addressing OSH issues raised by BFC and , brand/buyer monitoring, and MoLVT inspections, in context of increasing sector competiveness, value-added and sustainability 	 Technical and capacity development support Access to other country experience Implementation of Enhancing OSH and Health Standards in Construction Sector in Cambodia Project (see above) Implementation of Better Factories Cambodia programme in garment and footwear export sectors (see above), including the Better Work Academy Programme on OSH
ASEAN-OSHNET (regional centre located in Myanmar 2018-2019)	Promotion of ASEAN cooperation on OSH standards, performance and capabilities.	 Technical and capacity development support Access to other country experience

the same field (GIZ, USDOL, Netherlandsand Health Standards in Construct Sector in Cambodia Project and BF programme (see above)MoFA, SIDA, Korea and Japan MHLW)programme (see above)
--

Key partnerships for delivery of Outcome 3.1

Cambodian partners	Focus of cooperation	ILO contribution
CAMFEBA and NTUC members	 Agreement on longer term and annual priorities for institutional and technical capacity development Collaboration on this basis through appropriate modalities, including ILO ITC/Turin training courses, workshop-based training, tertiary education scholarships, online courses, country visits, mentoring and exchanges 	 Technical and capacity development support and facilitation Access to other counter experience; ILO/ITC training programmes and tertiary education scholarships
International partners	Focus of cooperation	ILO contribution
International Employers Organisation (IEO)	Capacity development for Cambodian employer organisations	 Technical and capacity development support and facilitation Access to other counter experience
IndustriaALL	Capacity development for Cambodian workers' organisations	 Technical and capacity development support and facilitation Access to other counter experience
ΙΤUC	Capacity development for Cambodian workers' organisations	 Technical and capacity development support and facilitation Access to other country experience

Key partnerships for delivery of Outcome 3.2

Cambodian partners	Focus of cooperation	ILO contribution
ACRA	 Implementation of guiding principles for Codes of Conduct Introduction of transparent and consistent rates for recruitment services 	 Technical and capacity development support under project: 'Tripartite Action for the Protection and Promotion of the Rights of Migrant Workers in the ASEAN region'

		(TRIANGLE, until 30/08/2025; main donors Australia DFAT and Canada)		
Arbitration Council and Foundation	Council role, coverage, sustainability and effectiveness	Technical and capacity development support		
LAC	 LAC role following transfer of minimum wage role to new MW Commission Linkages to DWCP governance 	 Technical and capacity development support 		
MoLVT	 Implementation of relevant aspects of the Joint ILO/BFC/MoLVT Joint Action Plan Revision and implementation of Labour and Trade Union Laws 	 Technical and capacity development support Access to other country experience Implementation of new strategic phase of Better Factories Cambodia (BFC) (2019-2023 - main donors: RGC, GMAC, GIZ, USDOL, Netherlands MoFA, ILO Better Work) 		
CAMFEBA and workers' organizations	 Strengthening of relevant institutional and technical capacities at HQ and membership levels Promoting and supporting social dialogue, workplace cooperation and collective bargaining at national, sectoral and enterprise levels as appropriate Supporting recognition of MRS unions and compliance with CBAs 	• Technical and capacity development support		
International partners	Focus of cooperation	ILO contribution		
International garment and footwear brands, buyers, investors International donors in the same field (GIZ, USDOL, Netherlands MoFA, SIDA) ACT (Action, Collaboration, Transformation) and other global platforms	 Enhancing social dialogue, compliance monitoring, workplace cooperation, collective bargaining and disputes resolution at enterprise levels as key to (i) the competiveness and sustainability of the garment and footwear sectors and (ii) Cambodia's credibility as an ethical source for international markets. In the case of ACT, this includes collaboration around the process to the establish a sector-wide collective 	 Implementation of new strategic phase of Better Factories Cambodia (BFC) (2019-2023 (see above) Implementation Phase 2 of SIDA / M&M project. 		
other global platforms campaigning to improve labour rights and working conditions within the global garment supply chain.	the establish a sector-wide collective agreement in Cambodia's garment sector (2018-2019)			

Key partnerships for delivery of Outcome 3.3

Cambodian partners	Focus of cooperation	ILO contribution
--------------------	----------------------	------------------

CDC	 Implementation of provisions in new Investment Law concerning employment of women and vulnerable groups, including persons with disability 	Technical and capacity development support
MAFF	Reducing child labour in agriculture and fisheries	Technical and capacity development support
МоС	Garment export sector monitoring, ILS compliance and export licenses	Implementation of new strategic phase BFC (see above)
MoLVT	 Revision/implementation of Labour Law Implementation of ILS ratified by RGC Strengthening of labour inspection services capacity and effectiveness Protecting and protecting rights of women and men migrant workers 	 Technical advice on Labour Law revision and implementation Implementation of new strategic phase of Better Factories Cambodia (BFC) (2019-2023 - main donors: RGC, GMAC, GIZ, USDOL, Netherlands MoFA, ILO Better Work) Implementation of project: Improving Industrial Relations in Cambodia's Garment Industry. Phase 2 currently in deveopment. Implementation of project: 'Tripartite Action for the Protection and Promotion of the Rights of Migrant Workers in the ASEAN region' (TRIANGLE, until 30/08/2025; main donors Australia DFAT and Canada) Implementation of project: 'Safe and Fair: Realizing women migrant workers' rights and opportunities in the ASEAN region' (part of the EU-UN 'Spotlight Initiative' to eliminate all forms of violence against women and girls) Implementation of Cambodia migrant worker aspects of 'Ship to Shore Rights Project' on working conditions in Thai fishing and seafood industry (funded by EU)
National Minimum Wage Council	 Strengthening evidence-based approach to minimum wage setting and gradual extension of Minimum Wage Law to whole economy; ensuring effective social partner engagement 	Technical and capacity development support
CAMFEBA and workers' organizations	 Promoting and supporting implementation of the Labour Law and ILS in the workplace, including through raising awareness among respective memberships Implementation of the FoA Roadmap Proactively acting to address rights at work violations, including sexual 	 Technical and capacity development support for implementation agreed priorities under CAMFEBA's business plan

	harassment, child labour and discrimination related to pregnancy			
International partners	Focus of cooperation	ILO contribution		
FAO	Reducing child labour in agriculture	Technical advice and joint programming where feasible		
UNIDO	Corporate Social Responsibility promotion in garment sector	 Strengthening links with BFC (2019- 2023) 		
UNOCHR	 Implementation of ILO CEACR recommendations on freedom of association; promotion of business and human rights; following-up decent work elements of 2019 Universal Periodic Review (UPR) recommendations 	 Technical and capacity development support; links to BFC and engagement with MoLSW, CAMFEBA and workers' organizations 		
UNW	Realization of rights of Cambodian women migrants	 Implementation of project: 'Safe and Fair: Realizing women migrant workers' rights and opportunities in the ASEAN region' (see above) 		

Annex 5: Terms of Reference for DWCP Review (International Consultant)

Background

The current Decent Work Country Programme (DWCP) for Cambodia (2016-2018) will be ending soon. There is a need for the development of the next DWCP which will cover the five-year period of 2019-2023 and align with the National Strategic Development Plan 2019-2023. The next DWCP will also align with the United Nations Development Assistance Framework (UNDAF) 2019-2023 which coordinates the efforts of all UN Agencies in Cambodia in strategic support of national development priorities and in achieving Cambodia's development goals.

The DWCP should be built on strategic development outcomes, common needs, decent work country analysis, past achievements, lessons learned, risk assessment and management. It should be developed to advance the Decent Work Agenda in line with the new generation of DWCP guidebook (version 4) and the 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development. The DWCP should articulate, through the strategic priorities and the associated results matrix, where ILO can support for national implementation of the 2030 Agenda and will make a difference and add value within the fields of comparative advantage of the Organization and in the current Cambodian context.

It is agreed that the formulation process should be consultative and participatory and th'e tripartite engagement and consultation are central to the development and implementation of a coherent and integrated country programme. The timeline for the formulation of Cambodia DWCP 2019-2023 was endorsed by the tripartite constituents in Cambodia and is attached as Annex 1.

Objectives:

The objectives of this assignment are to:

1) Develop Decent Work Country Analysis of Cambodia

The DWCA will help guide the next country programme to focus and prioritize its support as framed in the DWCP, to target its support to vulnerable groups of workers and within those areas where it can make the biggest difference and most effectively engage in the national development priorities in support of the 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development while advancing Decent Work Agenda (DWA).

2) Conduct Review of the DWCP 2016-2018

The country programme review (CPR) will take stock of what has worked and has not worked and to see what needs improving and/or continuing to the next DWCP which is scheduled to begin in 2019. The country situation and evolving national development frameworks and plans will be taken into account.

3) Produce Cambodia DWCP document for 2019-2023

Based on the Analysis and consultations with tripartite constituents in Cambodia, and recommendations of the CPR above, develop and write up Decent Work Country Programme Document for Cambodia (2019 – 2023) that:

 orients the country programme to target vulnerable workers and focuses on areas where the ILO can make the most difference in support of Cambodia's national priorities for achieving the 2030 Agenda and DWA;

- ensures the DWCP's alignment with the 2030 Agenda to assist the country in achieving relevant Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs) and considering the rapidly changing country context²² and global and regional trends – including technological advancement and its impact on labour market; and
- c. aligns with the UNDAF (2019-2023) and thus ensuring ILO contribution to the revamped UN development system.

Assignments:

Under the supervision of the Director of DWT/CO-Bangkok, the external collaborator will perform the following:

I. Country Programme Review (CPR)

- 1) The CPR will assess the relevance and coherence of the DWCP design, the efficiency in implementation, effectiveness of its operations, sustainability or results. The review is also intended to provide a basis for improved insights within the country office as to how to better design, implement, monitor and assess country programmes in the future and also identify priorities by the constituents to inform the development of the next DWCP.
- 2) The CPR will cover all interventions planned and carried out during the period 2016-2018, taking into account that the priorities may remain the same. The CPR will be supported by the ILO Regional Office for Asia and the Pacific (ROAP) and DWT/CO-Bangkok.
- 3) The CPR will mainly rely on desk review of evaluation reports, implementation reports, and other relevant documents (and possibly list all the reports). Based on the desk review –initial draft report will be prepared. The consultant will identify gaps/issues that may need verification/discussions with the constituents. A list of semi-structure questions will then be developed to guide the process of discussion/verification with the constituents during the mission in Cambodia.
- 4) The CPR will include verification mission with the constituents on the gaps and any specific issues that may arise from the desk review. The core CPR team will comprise an international consultant to act as facilitator and team leader and a national consultant. The ILO Monitoring and Evaluation Officer from ROAP will provide overall oversight. The ILO approach is to encourage participation of key stakeholders throughout the review process. The accuracy of the CPR will depend on the collaboration from the national tripartite constituents and other relevant stakeholders.
- 5) The CPR will cover the appropriateness and adequacy of the programme design, outreach/partnership and implementation performance of the DWCP. It will also include an operational assessment of the progress being made on tangible outcomes directly resulting from ILO contributions in the DWCP. Specifically, the scope of the work will include:
 - 5.1 Review of the appropriateness and adequacy of the design of Cambodia DWCP vis-à-vis national development challenges and priorities, One UN, SDGs and ILO priorities.
 - 5.2 Examination of the usefulness of the strategies, partnerships and challenges or constraints, and the practical application of ILO cross-cutting issues (gender mainstreaming, social dialogues, ILS and environmental sustainability), and attention to vulnerable target groups.
 - 5.3 Assessment of how the DWCP has adapted/adjusted its strategies to the changing situation and needs on the ground.
 - 5.4 Analysis of DWCP implementation:
 - Examination of the effectiveness of DWCP (progress made towards outputs and outcomes -

²² Including the graduation of Cambodia to Lower Middle Income Country status in 2016, and the future development financing landscape, demographic change and job growth particularly for Cambodian young

achievement of planned results), its organizational arrangements (managerial, administrative and business processes) and the availability of resources in delivering results.

- Examination of the *efficiency* of programme implementation (time and cost).
- Examination of the *sustainability* with particular attention to capacity / institutional development and the creation of enabling environment (changes in laws, polices and behaviours).
- Identification of key success factors and constraints encountered (internal and external).
- 6) Assessment of any possible impact, identify good practices, and lessons learnt towards the achievement of the DWCP.

II. Decent Work Country Analysis (DWCA)

- Develop the Decent Work Country Analysis of Cambodia by using the provided Guideline for Decent Work Country Diagnostics as a general reference on Decent Work Agenda while shortening and simplifying by comparison with this reference, through desk review of resources materials as suggested by the guidelines, and in consultations with ILO Decent Work Support Team and Regional Office specialists as well as tripartite constituents tentatively on 13-14 September 2018.
- The document should provide a well informed and comprehensive but short diagnostic narrative of the growth, productive employment and Decent Work (DW) evolution, situation and challenges of the country.
- 3) It should also provide information on the progress and situation with regard to critical areas of DW in the country and serve as an input to the development of DWCP 2019-2023 and other planning framework.
- 4) It should contain the following sections:
 - Section 1: The Overall setting provides a succinct overview of the overall country-specific setting.
 - Section 2: The dynamics of employment, the labour market and the economy, explores the main challenges with regard to achieving inclusive growth and productive employment for all.
 - Section 3: Fundamental Principle and Rights at Work (FPRW) and the Implementation of ILS, examines the legal framework for respect for ILS and equal access to rights with a main focus on freedom of association and collective bargaining, and its effective implementation.
 - Section 4: Decent Working Conditions and Occupational Safety and Health with special focus on the provision of wages and OSH protection for workers in the construction, garment and tourism sectors.
 - Section 5: Equal opportunities and treatment in employment, with particular emphasis on gender issues.
 - Section 6: Social Protection, examines the progress regarding the extension of social protection and identifies the main challenge in this respect.
 - Section 7: Social Dialogue, examines the evolution and situation with regard to promoting effective and inclusive social dialogue and sound industrial relations.

Section 8: Main decent work challenges ahead, summarizes the key decent work challenges facing the country.

- 5) Each section should analyze the main issues and questions that the section should address and should be updated using the December 2015 DWCA with the latest information and data available
- 6) Consult the main issues of Decent Work Analysis to the tripartite constituents at a tripartite workshop on consultations of Decent Work Analysis in Phnom Penh on 13 September 2018; a PowerPoint presentation of the provisional findings and main conclusions, as a basis for tripartite inputs which would inform the draft report can be presented in the workshop.
- 7) Finalize the draft incorporate comments from the constituents as well as DWT/CO-Bangkok, ROAP and Policy Portfolio Departments by October 2018.

III. Development of the DWCP document 2019-2023

Development of the DWCP document 2019-2023 build on the following formulation process:

- Narrative, result framework and implementation plan which will be based on the components under the above items I and II.
- Consult with tripartite constituents in Cambodia on CP Priority and CP Outcome Areas.
- Development of Theory of Change (to be organized among ILO projects, select specialists, constituents and the consultant)
- Consultation with the CO, DWT and RAS on the CP strategies, M&E framework and implementation plan
- Internal review by Quality Assurance Framework
- 1) Develop the draft document based on the guidelines set out in the ILO DWCP Practical Guidebook version 4 which can be accessed at the link as provided below.
- 2) Make reference, to the fullest extent possible, the developed Decent Work Country Analysis, the findings and recommendations of the DWCP (2016-2018) evaluation/review, the priorities and outcomes as agreed in the tripartite workshop to be organized tentatively on 13-14 September 2018, as well as the outputs from the consultation with the workers and employers specialists of DWT-Bangkok.
- 3) Consult with tripartite constituents of Cambodia on CP Priority and CP Outcome Areas, to present an evidence-based analysis of the situation in the country covering the social, political and economic context and each of the four ILO strategic objectives (employment; social protection; social dialogue and tripartism; and fundamental principles and rights at work).
- 4) Consult with the concerned specialists, of DWT/CO-Bangkok and the Regional Office respectively on the possible programme implementation strategy, indicators and targets, as well as M&E plan for each DWCP outcome and other relevant results matrix, implementation plans, etc., as suggested by Chief of the Regional Programming Services of the ILO Regional Office for Asia and the Pacific.
- 5) Consult with the Director of DWT/CO-Bangkok and Chief of the Regional Programming Services of the ILO Regional Office for Asia and the Pacific and to make sure that the DWCP outcomes, indicators and targets, are in line with the new Global Programme and Budget of 2018-2019.

6) Undertake missions to consult with ILO colleagues in Bangkok and with the constituents on priorities and outcomes as well as participate in and attend the National Tripartite Consultation Workshops for finalizing country programme priorities and outcomes in Phnom Penh tentatively in September 2018 (dates to be confirmed).

Methodology

The methodology is in accordance with the ILO DWCP Practical Guidebook version 4 which can be accessed at <u>https://www.ilo.org/global/about-the-ilo/how-the-ilo-works/departments-and-offices/program/dwcp/WCMS_561045/lang--en/index.htm</u>. The methods of data analysis, interviews (if needed), tripartite consultations and ToC workshop should be used.

The below documents related to Cambodia are materialized and will serve as the basis of the desk review. The information from data analysis should also be circulated in advance to the key stakeholders and partners who will be invited to attend the Tripartite Consultation and ToC workshop. The information will serve as the basis of discussion during the workshop.

- The 2018 Cambodia Common Country Assessment (CCA)
- United Nations Development Assistance Framework (UNDAF) 2019-2023 Cambodia
- Rectangular Strategy for Growth, Employment, Efficiency and Equity (Phase IV)
- National Strategic Development Plan (NSDP) 2019-2023
- Cambodia Sustainable Development Goals
- Evaluation of UNDAF Cycles 2011-2015; and 2016-2018 in Cambodia
- High Level Evaluation of the ILO's Decent Work Country Programme strategies and actions in the Mekong subregion 2012–2017 and a fact sheet summarizing key findings and recommendations;
- ILO High Level Evaluation on Social Protection Floors, 2012-2017 Cambodia Case Study.
- Midterm Evaluation of Better Factories Cambodia
- TRIANGLE in ASEAN Evaluability Assessment Report
- Asia Region Thematic Evaluation on Social Protection 2012-2017 (Phase II)
- Social Dialogue interventions: What works and why? Lesson learned from a synthesis review 2013-2016
- Mid-term review of the Partnership Programme 2014-2017 between Minister for Foreign Trade and Development Cooperation of the Netherlands and the ILO
- Regional Thematic Evaluation on Youth Employment in Asia and the Pacific (Cambodia) 2012-2017
- Evaluation of the SIDA Partnership on Employment Promotion (Cambodia)
- ILO Decent Work Results Dashboard 2016-2017 / Cambodia: https://www.ilo.org/IRDashboard/#aci0p4r
- Annual progress reports of the DWCP
- Final Evaluation reports of the ILO STED project and IR project in Cambodia
- Final evaluation report of ILO-Korea Partnership Programme 2015-2017
- Sectoral Policies and Strategies of Cambodia (IDP, NEP, LMP, NYP, TVETP, SPPF, NPA-CL 2, OSH Master Plan 2, Neary Ratanak V, etc.)
- Progress reports of the ILO Projects (to be provided upon request)

The Tripartite Consultation and ToC Workshop will have three purposes: 1) to gather additional information from the participants; 2) to answer, review, and discuss the information for formulation the new DWCP 2019-2023; 3) to make evidence-based recommendations on how the DWCP should be.

Outputs and Timeframe

The assignments above will be performed for the period of 11 September 2018 to 28 February 2019, equivalent to a total of 36 work days.

The Consultant has to submit an **inception report** as soon as possible after signature of the contract to ensure a common understanding of the ToR by the involved parties. The elements of an inception report include: 1) administrative information; 2) background and context; 3) purpose, scope and stakeholders; 4) criteria and questions: 5) methodology; 6) deliverables: and 7) workplan.

Output 1: Country Programme Review Report (5 days)

1.1 Submit by 28 September 2018, a preliminary findings and recommendations from DWCP 2016-2018 review for comment by the DWT/CO-Bangkok and RO.

Note: The national consultant who is a co-team of the Consultant, will provide the information of examined performance against expected outcomes, as certain what has been achieved, whether outputs have led to the expected outcomes, and whether the strategies and partnerships have been effective and efficient based on the workplan of DWCP 2016-2018.

1.2 Final report incorporating inputs from key stakeholders by 15 October 2018 September 2018.

Output 2: Facilitation ToC Workshop and Tripartite Consultation and consultation meetings with ILO Specialists (10 days)

- 2.1 Facilitation of the Tripartite Consultation for inputs on the preliminary findings and recommendations of the CPR, DWCA and for CP Priority Setting, CP Outcome Areas based on the agreed recommendations tentatively September 2018 (dates to be confirmed)
- 2.2 Co-facilitation of the ToC Workshop on drafting result framework, with the agreed CP Priority and CP Outcome Areas tentatively September 2018 (dates to be confirmed)
- 2.3 Consultation with ILO specialists in Bangkok to provide feedback on ToC and results framework and to develop programme implementation strategy and implementation plan of the DWCP (3 days) tentatively October 2018 in Bangkok.

Output 3: Country context: diagnostic and situation analysis (4 days)

- 3.1 Submit by 30 October 2018 a draft of Decent Work County Analysis and result framework for feedback from DWT/CO-Bangkok, Regional Office (RO) as well as Policy Portfolio Departments (if needed).
- 3.2 Final report incorporating inputs from key stakeholders by 15 November 2018.

Output 4: Final draft of DWCP document 2019-2023 with the narrative, result framework and implementation plan (15 days)

4.1 Submit by 15 December 2018 a **first Draft DWCP document** including the following sections and annexes (*as ILO DWCP Practical Guidebook version 4*) for comments from DWT/CO-BKK and Regiona Office – preferably within 20 pages (excluding annexes)

Section	Annex		
 Section 1: Introduction Section 2: Country Context Section 3: Country priorities and CPOs Section 4: Management, implementation planning, M&E Section 5: Funding Plan 	 Annex 2: DWCP Results Matrix Annex 4: DWCP Results Monitoring Plan Annex 5: DWCP Implementation Monitoring Plan Annex 7: Checklist for evaluable results and monitoring framework Annex 8: Quality Assurance Mechanism Checklist 		

- 4.2 Submit by 15 January 2019 a **second Draft DWCP document**, M&E, results frame work matrix and implementation plan etc incorporated comments received under no. 4.1 including annexes for forwarding for ILO DWCP Quality Control Framework (QAM)
- 4.3 Submit by 20 February 2019 the **final draft DWCP document** with M&E, results frame work matrix and implementation plan, incorporating the inputs from DWCP QAM under point no. 4.2

Contract cost:

No	Description	Price (US\$)	Unit	Total
1	Consultancy Fee • Output 1 = 7 days • Output 2 = 4 days • Output 3 = 13 days (including missions in Phnom Penh) • Output 4 = 18 days	600	34 days	20,400
2	Air-ticket BKK-PNP-BKK for 2 missions	280.46	2	561
3	DSA in Phnom Penh – September/October 10 days	146	10	1,460
Total	Total costs			22,421

ILO will provide air tickets BKK-PNP-BKK. Total contract cost payable to the consultant is US\$ 22,421. The external collaborator is responsible for making his/her own travel arrangements for the route of Phnom Penh-Bangkok-Phnom Penh, accommodation, including obtaining of necessary visas. Daily subsistence allowance (DSA) will be paid to the traveler in accordance with the ILO rules and regulations to cover lodging, meals, transport costs, visa fee and other personal contingencies during the period of the mission.

Terms of Payment:

- 1) US\$2,021 upon signing of the contract to cover air ticket and DSAs.
- 2) US\$3,000 upon completion and submission of output 1.1, output 1.2
- 3) USD6,000 upon submission of output 2.1, 2.2, and 2.3
- 4) US\$2,400 upon completion and submission of outputs 3.1 and 3.2
- 5) USD9,000 upon completion and submission of output 4.1, 4.2, and 4