



ILO EVALUATION

- **Evaluation Title:** Midterm evaluation of the project The Way Forward after the Revolution: Decent Work for Women: in Egypt and Tunisia (DWW) - Phase II
- **ILO TC/SYMBOL:** RAF/17/05/FIN
- **Type of Evaluation :** Independent Midterm Evaluation
- **Country(ies) :** Egypt and Tunisia
- **P&B outcome(s):** 6
- **SDG(s):** 1,5,8 and 10
- **Date of the evaluation:** 1 June- 10 July 2020
- **Name of consultant(s):** Mr. Martin Østergaard/team leader & Ms. Kimiko Pedersen

- **ILO Administrative Office:** Regional Office, South Africa
- **ILO Technical Backstopping Office:** Employment, ILO Geneva and DWT Cairo
- **Other agencies involved in joint evaluation:** N/A
- **Date project ends:** March 2021
- **Donor: country and budget US\$** Finnish MOFA 2.470 mill. USD
- **Evaluation Manager:** Mr. Ricardo Furman, SREO ROAF
- **Evaluation Budget:** 13,040 USD
- **Key Words:** Gender equality, social partners, women leadership, women entrepreneurship, Egypt, Tunisia

This evaluation has been conducted according to ILO's evaluation policies and procedures. It has not been professionally edited, but has undergone quality control by the ILO Evaluation Office

Table of Contents

Executive Summary	1
1. Context and description of the project	6
2. Purpose, scope and clients of the evaluation	9
3. Methodology	10
3.1 Key evaluation questions.....	10
3.2 Key considerations prior to the evaluation	11
3.3 Role of the COVID crisis and the home-based nature of the evaluation	12
3.4 Evaluation process.....	13
3.5 Techniques applied.....	13
3.6 Stakeholder engagement	14
3.7 Limitations	15
3.8 Ethical standards	15
4. Findings.....	16
4.1 Relevance	16
4.2 Validity of design	19
4.3 Effectiveness.....	20
4.3.1 Results related to outcome 1.....	22
4.3.2 Results related to outcome 2.....	25
4.3.3 Results related to outcome 3.....	27
4.3.4 Summary results	29
4.3.5 Additional unexpected results	32
4.4 Efficiency of resource use.....	32
4.5 Impact orientation and sustainability	33
5. Conclusions.....	34
6. Recommendations.....	36
7. Lessons learned and good practices.....	38

Annex 1: Terms of reference 39

Annex 2: List of people interviewed 55

Annex 3: Overview of documents consulted..... 58

Annex 4: Overview of activities and outputs delivered..... 59

Annex 5: Lessons Learned 63

Annex 6: Emerging Good Practice 65

Executive Summary

The Decent Work for Women project (phase 2) (DWW) is funded by the Finnish Ministry of Foreign Affairs, and has a total budget of USD 2.470 million for 2018-2021. It builds upon experiences achieved through the first phase of the programme from 2012 to 2018. In the meantime, close cooperation has been established with the project's key partners, and a larger portfolio of gender equality projects have been developed at ILO Cairo.

The evaluation is an independent midterm evaluation, and has been carried out remotely as a result of the COVID 19 crisis. Project methodology has been developed accordingly, and interviews have been carried out with project stakeholders through IT platforms and with questions that made it simple to triangulate data.

The data collection has been carried out during the period 12 June to 7 July. The meetings have been based on semi-structured interviews with both individuals and to a smaller extent with groups of 2-4 persons. The interviews have contacted key informants (project partner organizations), beneficiaries from both Egypt and Tunisia, and a number of experts. Consultations have also been carried out with the donor, who is presently preparing the next MENA strategy for Finland.

The DWW project is found to be relevant and addressing key issues related to women's inclusion in the labour market, entrepreneurship and leadership among social partners. The DWW project is also working in the context of the ILO, the wider UN, SDGs and national action plans and frameworks, and has increasingly established synergies to the project from these different frameworks. Project design is considered relevant, however, has objectives that are ambitious given the timeframe, context and resources in terms of technical diversity.

The project has achieved good results over time, especially at the macro and meso levels. These results relate to the support to ILO Conventions on gender equality, where there is a momentum in both Tunisia and Egypt in different ways. The DWW project has made good progress with the ILO HR Academy concept in both the Federation of Egyptian Industries (HR and Gender Academy) and the *Chambre Nationale des Femmes Chefs d'Enterprises (CNFCE)*, where an Academy for Women Business Leaders (*Academie des Femmes Cheffes d'Enterprises*) is now running independently. Training of a large group of approx. 150 labour inspectors in both Egypt and Tunisia has created results in terms of reporting on gender equality issues, in guidelines and in the form of the Gender and Non-discrimination Unit in the Ministry of Manpower in Egypt. The DWW project has also facilitated participation of the Tunisian and Egyptian governments and social partners to the ILO Equal Pay International Coalition recently.

In terms of women entrepreneurship, both the employers' partner organization in Tunisia and Egypt have launched important WED policy documents with the support of key stakeholders. In both Tunisia and Egypt, the policy documents came about based on groundwork carried out in earlier phases of the DWW project. Initial training of trainers for women entrepreneurs in informal settings through the ILOs Get Ahead training has also been initiated along with training on Financial Education in Egypt. In both countries, some activities have had to be changed because partners wished to move ahead in a different way. In terms of reaching women entrepreneurs at the local levels, the DWW project has not yet delivered tangible results, and the

project strategy in relation to outcome 2 needs to be re-assessed to clarify linkages between the micro, meso and macro levels.

Finally, in relation to women’s leadership in social partners, the DWW project has achieved important results in relation to the work with the Egyptian trade unions, where a study on women’s participation, gender strategic workshops and a TOT for women trade union members were key activities. Meanwhile, activities have also been carried out with the Tunisian trade union partner, and activities with the employers organisations planned for both FEI and CNFCE in 2020.

The project has recovered from a difficult period at the beginning, and is now on track with expenditure above 1 million USD, and planned activities for the coming year. The DWW project is well supported to move towards sustainability in the future supported by a larger gender equality portfolio, integration with different areas of the ILOs technical expertise, tripartism and labour standards, the UNPDF and closer strategic collaboration with key national partners.

Recommendations are made for the short-term (end of the DWW project by March 2021), medium-term (end of 2022) and the long-term (beyond 2022): This is indicated for each of the recommendations below:

1. The project develops synergies with other ILO projects in Tunisia to strengthen outreach similar to the work done in Egypt. As an example, work with ILO Conventions could find inspiration from e.g. the ADWA project and their work to advance Decent Work in North Africa, including experiences from Morocco to work with national units carrying out audits. The DWW should also continue to grow the gender portfolio at ILO Cairo, and its support to the Gender and Discrimination Unit in the Ministry of Manpower.

Addressed to	Priority	Time-frame	Resources
DWW team /ILO Cairo	High	Medium-term	Medium

2. Follow up on activities, where partners with more support or additional follow-up can achieve further results:
 - a. CNFCE, Ministry of Manpower and NCW should document results of the DWW project in terms of separate communication products.
 - b. Engage project partners to provide evidence on women career paths, and challenges for women to enter/re-enter the labour market, in preparation for the planned regional conference.
 - c. Work with FEI to support companies in Egypt with more than 50 employees to have child care facilities.
 - d. Combine labour inspection training with workplace dialogue in Tunisia and address problems related to harassment or violence in the workplace with company management.

Addressed to	Priority	Time-frame	Resources
DWW team, FEI, CNFCE, MoM, MSA, and NCW	Medium	Short-term: a,b Medium term: c,d	Low

3. Expand on trade union activities in Egypt on gender equality and collect data on women's occupational patterns and trade union membership.

Addressed to	Priority	Time-frame	Resources
DWW project, trade union partners in Egypt and ILO Cairo	High	Short-term	Medium

4. Revisit the project strategy on women entrepreneurship:
- If the objective is to achieve results on women's entrepreneurship, decide how, for how many and in which areas
 - If the objective is to build the capacity within the NCW to carry out Get Ahead training, state the expected number of trainers, how many will be certified, and how to support the trainers.
 - Explore wider cooperation and funding of the Get Ahead. The Get Ahead is relevant, there are opportunities to work with women's entrepreneurship in both Tunisia and Egypt, and more ILO technical expertise is available from both the Decent Work team in Cairo and from ILO Geneva to support. Issues could include further adaptation to local needs and local human and environmental sustainability issues.

Addressed to	Priority	Time-frame	Resources
DWW project w/support from ILO Cairo/Geneva (a,b,c), with NCW (a,b)	High	Short-term: a, b. Medium term: c	Medium

5. Make targets for new interventions adopted during implementation, and reflect this in the monitoring system. Set qualitative and/or quantitative indicators for new initiatives such as the work with C 190, C 189 and C 183, or the EPIC networks, and review and amend the PMF indicators.

Addressed to	Priority	Time-frame	Resources
DWW project team	Medium	Short-term	Low

6. Develop a stakeholder analysis tool to document how changes are due to macro, meso or micro level factors among partners during project implementation to understand how opportunities and constraints in the project arise and are responded to.

Addressed to	Priority	Time-frame	Resources
DWW project team	Medium	Short-term	Low

7. Elaborate a strategy for the HR Academy with the FEI. The strategy should include an assessment of the institutional and economic sustainability of the HR Academy and a timeframe for the eventual phasing out of support from the ILO. Given the strong experiences of the FEI in organizational development processes, such a strategy can provide important learning.

Addressed to	Priority	Time-frame	Resources
DWW project, and FEI	Medium	Short-term/medium term	Low

8. Elaborate a strategy for response to the COVID 19.
- a. Short-term planning for the remaining part of the project with changes made
 - b. Provide data on effects of the COVID crisis on women entrepreneurs, and women in precarious employment in Tunisia and Egypt.
 - c. Respond to the COVID crisis and to climate change, which is also high on the agenda and related to the COVID crisis in different ways. Initially, constraints relate to personal mobility, hygiene and social distancing:
 - i. Get Ahead modules can be developed to incorporate these constraints and allow women entrepreneurs to continue operating.
 - ii. More focus on occupational safety and health at the micro levels and the informal sector developed with local partners and supported by ILO experts, e.g. through Get Ahead training modules.

Addressed to	Priority	Time-frame	Resources
DWW project (a,b,c), NCW/partners working with Get Ahead, supported by ILO (b,c)	High	Short-term: a Medium term: b, c	Medium

Acronyms

ACTEMP	ILO office for employers' activities
ACTRAV	ILO office for workers activities
CNFCE	Chambre Nationale des Femmes Chefs d'Enterprises
COVID	Corona Virus Disease
COFIL	Comite de pilotage/DWW Project Steering Committee, Tunisia
CPO	ILO Country Programme Outcomes
CTA	Chief Technical Advisor
DWCP	Decent Work Country Programme
DWW	Decent Work for Women project
EDLC	Egyptian Democratic Labour Congress
EPIC	Equal Pay International Coalition
ETUF	Egyptian Trade Union Federation
FEI	Federation of Egyptian Industries
GED	Gender, Equality and Diversity Branch
GRWP	Gender-responsive workplaces in Egypt project
Get Ahead	ILO training programme for women entrepreneurs
ILS	International Labour Standards
JP	ILO/UN Women Joint Programme for Promoting Productive and Decent Employment for Women in Egypt, Palestine and Jordan
MENA	Middle East North Africa Region
MFFEPA	Ministère de la Femme, de la Famille, de l'Enfance et des Personnes âgées/Ministry of Women, Family, Children and Senior Citizens
MFPE	Ministère de la Formation Professionnelle et de l'Emploi/Ministry of Vocational Training and Employment
MoM	Ministry of Manpower, Egypt
MSA	Ministere des Affaires Sociale/Ministry of Social Affairs, Tunisia
MSMEDA	Micro, Small, Medium Enterprise Development Agency
MTE	Midterm evaluation
NCW	National Council for Women
OECD DAC	Development Assistance Committee of the OECD
SDG	Sustainable Development Goals
TOR	Terms of reference
UETUF	Upper Egypt Trade Union Federation
UGTT	Union Générale de Travailleurs Tunisiens
UN	United Nations
UNEG	United Nations Ethical Guidelines
UNPDF	United Nations Partnership for Development Framework
UTICA	Union Tunesienne de l'Industrie, du Commerce et de l'Artisanat
WED	Women's Entrepreneurship Development

1. Context and description of the project

The first phase of the Decent Work for Women (DWW) project in Egypt and Tunisia started in 2012. Its direction and content took a point of departure in the events following the Arab Spring in 2011, and the changes that took place in the years after, hence the title “The Way Forward after the Revolution”. During this period, international support for a stronger focus on gender equality in the MENA region increased, including initiatives to increase women’s inclusion in the labour market.

Women’s participation in the labour market in the MENA region is one of the lowest in the world. At the beginning of the project, the labour market participation was around 23 per cent for women (with youth participation at only 16.6 per cent). For Tunisia and Egypt, the female unemployment rate was 24.2 per cent in Egypt and 22.2 per cent in Tunisia. Meanwhile, the educational level for women has increased considerably over the same period, however, without translating into job opportunities.¹ The recent economic crisis in 2008 had a negative effect on women’s participation, as women were hit harder than men by the economic crisis with many in precarious employment or in the informal markets, and although there has been positive economic growth in recent years, this has unfortunately not resulted in any significant increase in employment, with women’s employment remaining almost constant. The recent COVID crisis has affected women harder, especially many women in the informal sector.

There is also a significant gender gap in the quality of jobs. Women still occupy the lowest paid occupations, have part-time work, and salaries are considerably lower than for men. Women continue to contribute much more to family work, and many working women operate in informal working arrangements. As women are more likely than men to be in informal employment, they often do not have access to social protection, such as pensions, unemployment benefits or maternity protection. Discrimination against pregnant workers and workers with family responsibilities constitutes a significant problem, and women still perform the large majority of unpaid care work. During the first phase of the DWW project, issues related to safety and violence in the work place were also addressed. Many companies in Egypt and Tunisia still show conscious or unconscious bias against women’s career progression, despite ample evidence of the positive effects of more gender-diverse workforces and management teams. Only few women are able to break the glass ceiling in the private sector.

The ILO Women’s Entrepreneurship Development Assessment reports published by the project in Egypt and in Tunisia indicate that women business owners are concentrated in rural areas (82 per cent women entrepreneurs in rural areas compared to 18 per cent in urban areas). With 2 per cent women entrepreneurs, Egypt is known to have the lowest percentage of women entrepreneurs in the Middle East North Africa region (4 per cent for the region), as well as comparing to the Sub-Saharan Africa region (27 per cent for the region), and women business owners account for only 11% of the total number of businesses.²

¹ Project document : « Decent Work for Women » (phase 2) p. 2

² ILO: “Assessment of Women’s Entrepreneurship Development-Egypt”, Cairo 2016 and ILO: “Evaluation nationale du développement de l’entrepreneuriat féminin-Tunisie”, Cairo 2016.

At the global level, “The ILO Women at Work: Trends 2016” report reflected this from the beginning of the first DWW project. During the adoption by the UN of the SDGs in 2015, a global consensus on the crucial importance of gender equality as an indispensable precondition for sustainable development was reaffirmed³. One of the key arguments was related to the contribution of women to GDP growth, which was estimated to be an additional USD 28 trillion. These SDGs are now incorporated into UN planning frameworks, national action plans for women’s empowerment and represents the larger institutional context that the Decent Work for Women project now operates in.

A number of ILO Conventions have been identified as being key to the promotion of gender equality, including the Equal Remuneration Convention, 1951 (No. 100), the Discrimination (Employment and Occupation) Convention, 1958 (No. 111), the Workers with Family Responsibilities Convention, 1981 (No. 156), the Maternity Protection Convention, 2000 (No.183), as well as the Domestic Workers Convention, 2011 (No.189). With the adoption by the International Labour Conference of Convention 190 on “Elimination of Violence and Harassment against Women in the World of Work” in 2019, the project is now also involved in work with this convention along with conventions 183 and 189 mentioned above.

Both the first and the present phase of the DWW project are supported by the Finnish Ministry of Foreign Affairs. The present phase to a large extent builds on the achievements from the first phase, and plays a key role in the Finnish strategy for the MENA region 2017-2020. The strategy has a focus on gender equality and employment, a presence in Tunisia and Egypt, and over the years good cooperation has developed between the Finnish Ministry of Foreign Affairs and the ILO in the region. A new strategy for Finland for the coming 4 years in the MENA region is now under preparation.

This present phase of the DWW project runs from April 2018 to March 2021, has a budget of 2.470 M USD. and three outcomes:

- To support the development of an enabling environment for gender equality in the workplace
- To create an enabling environment for women’s entrepreneurship development
- To support employers’ and workers’ organizations strengthen the representation of women in their structures for an improved women leadership

The project partners:

In Egypt, the DWW project works with the Ministry of Manpower and with the National Council of Women (NCW). The DWW project also works closely with the social partners in Egypt. On the employers side, the DWW works with the Federation of Egyptian Industries; and on the workers side, the project works with the Egyptian Trade Union federation (ETUF), the Egyptian Democratic Labour Congress (EDLC), and the Upper Egypt Trade Union Federation, along with other emerging, mainly workplace-based trade union members and federations that contribute to the agenda on gender equality. The Micro, Small and Medium Enterprise Development Agency (MSMEDA) also takes part in the project.

³ Project document, « Decent Work for Women » (phase 2), p.3

In Tunisia, the DWW project works with the Ministry of Social Affairs, the Ministry of Women, Family, Children and Senior Citizens, and the Ministry of Vocational Training and Employment. As for the social partners, the DWW project works with the UGTT, and with CNFCE, which is a chamber under the employer's organisation UTICA. Most partners have been the same since 2012; hence, a solid working relationship has been established over time.⁴

The DWW project is run by a project team, consisting of a CTA, two national coordinators for Egypt and for Tunisia, and 5 staff working as project assistants, finance/admin assistant, and drivers. The DWW project is backstopped by ILO technical experts, mostly from the Decent Work team at ILO Cairo, with the Employment specialist as lead, and also with Workers and Employers Activities specialists, the Senior International Labour Standards specialist, The Wage and Social Dialogue specialist, and to some extent also backstopping and support from ILO experts in Geneva, including the SME development section at ENTERPRISE, and the GED department. Meanwhile, the amount of projects relating to gender equality at ILO Cairo has increased, and has developed into a stable portfolio of engagements and core staff who work together to coordinate efforts.

During the same period, projects implemented through the UN system have been increasingly streamlined at different levels. For the ILO, projects are part of a planning framework that responds to a country-level time-bound cooperation agreement with the ILOs constituents, known as Decent Work Country Programmes (DWCP), or other country programme planning frameworks in case a fully-fledged DWCP has not been fully negotiated. The ILO has a DWCP with Tunisia, and still working to get a formal Decent Work programme in Egypt.

The ILO also operates with four-year strategic plans, including biennial Programme and Budget, which work as a framework for the overall engagement of the organisation with its constituents. The present Strategic Framework is from 2018-21, divided into ILO Programme & Budget for 2018/19 and 2020/21, respectively.

The UN-wide Partnership for Development Framework is the UNs 4-year strategic plan with governments, representing a coordinated response from the UN to development priorities of the host government and other partners. These frameworks do, inter alia, represent opportunities to work on gender equality with other UN partners, in the case of the DWW with UN Women. As mentioned above, national action plans and development frameworks are important points of reference for the UN and specialised agencies such as the ILO. In the case of the DWW project, key national plans are represented by Egypt's Strategic Plan for Women's Empowerment 2030 as well as the Egypt Vision 2030, while Tunisia's Strategic Development Plan 2016-2020 (*Plan Strategique de Développement 2016-20*) make up the key point of reference.

Finally, development efforts are increasingly aligned with SDGs, not only among development agencies at the bilateral and multilateral levels, but also for private sector entities, civil society and other actors. In relation to the DWW project, SDG 5 /Gender and SDG 8/Decent Work are the key reference points with their accompanying indicators, while other SDGs may be relevant for particular aspects of the project.

⁴ See Independent Final Evaluation: The Way Forward After the Revolution: Decent Work for Women (Egypt and Tunisia)/phase 1

2. Purpose, scope and clients of the evaluation

According to the Terms of reference for the mid-term evaluation, the key purposes are:

1. Assess the relevance and coherence of project's design regarding country needs and how the project is perceived and valued by the target groups.
2. Identify the contributions of the project to, the SDGs, the countries UNDAFs and Tunisia DWCP, the ILO objectives and CPOs and its synergy with other projects and programs in both countries.
3. Analyse the implementation strategies of the project with regard to their potential effectiveness in achieving the project outcomes and impacts; including unexpected results and factors affecting project implementation (positively and negatively).
4. Review the institutional set-up, capacity for project implementation, coordination mechanisms and the use and usefulness of management tools including the project monitoring tools and work plans.
5. Asses the implementation efficiency of the project.
6. Review the strategies for outcomes' sustainability and orientation to impact.
7. Identify lessons and potential good practices for the key stakeholders.
8. Provide strategic recommendations for the different key stakeholders to improve implementation of the project activities and attainment of project objectives.

The independent midterm evaluation is carried out under the UNEG and ILO guidelines for evaluation and the guidelines developed in connection hereto. As a midterm evaluation, both the results achieved and the prospects for the remaining part of the project make up key areas of focus, and the methodology has been designed accordingly.

Due to the COVID crisis, the evaluation is carried out as home-based (see also methodology below) with the following phases:

- desk review and writing of Inception report	1-9 June
- interview with respondents and data collection	10 June- 7 July
- data analysis and draft report	4-15 July
- comments on draft report/finalization	16 July – 10 August

The dates have been modified along the way due to response time from respondents under the COVID crisis.

The primary users of the evaluation are the national stakeholders, in Egypt: the Ministry of Manpower, the National Council of Women, the ETUF, the EDLC and the Upper Egypt Trade Union Federation; and the FEI. In Tunisia, it is the Ministry of Family Affairs, Women, Children and Senior Citizens, Ministry of Social Affairs, the Ministry of Vocational Training and Employment, UGTT and the CNFCE and UTICA. The primary users of the evaluation are also the Finnish Ministry of Foreign Affairs, and the ILO: ILO Cairo, including the DWW project and the specialists at the DW team supporting the project, the GED and ENTERPRISE backstopping units at ILO Geneva as well as the Country Office in Algiers.

3. Methodology

3.1 Key evaluation questions

The following represent the key evaluation questions in the TOR for the mid-term evaluation. They are organized according to OECD DAC criteria for evaluations:

Relevance:

- 1.1 Is the project coherent with the Governments objectives, National Development Frameworks, beneficiaries' needs, and does it support the outcomes outlined in ILO's CPOs as well as the SDGs?
- 1.2 How does the project complement and fit with other on-going ILO programmes and projects in the countries?
- 1.3 What links have been established so far with other activities of the UN or other cooperating partners operating in the Country in the areas of employment, market development and women's empowerment?
- 1.4 Has the project been able to leverage the ILO contributions, through its comparative advantages (including tripartism, international labour standards, ILO Decent Work Team etc.)?

Validity of design:

- 2.1 Does the project address the major causes of women unemployment in Egypt and Tunisia, and respond to it?
- 2.2 Is the project realistic (in terms of expected outputs, outcome and impact) given the time and resources available, including performance and its M&E system, knowledge sharing and communication strategy?
- 2.3 To what extent has the project integrated ILO cross cutting themes in the design?
- 2.4 Is the project Theory of change comprehensive, integrate external factors and is based on systemic analysis?

Effectiveness:

- 3.1 What progress has been made towards achieving the overall project objectives/outcomes?
- 3.2 Has the management and governance structure put in place worked strategically with all key stakeholders and partners in Egypt and Tunisia, ILO and the donor to achieve project goals and objectives?
- 3.3 Has the knowledge sharing and communication strategy been effective in raising the profile of the project within the country and among the cooperating partners?
- 3.4 Is the monitoring and evaluation system results-based and facilitate a project adaptive management?
- 3.5 Assess how contextual and institutional risks and positive external to the project factors have been managed by the project management?
- 3.6 To what extend is the COVID-19 Pandemic influencing project results and effectiveness and how the project have addressed this influence and is ready to adapt to changes for at least some time from now-on?
- 3.7 Does the (adapted) intervention model used/to be used in the project suggest an intervention model for similar crisis response?

Efficiency of resource use:

- 4.1 Have resources (financial, human, technical support, etc.) been allocated strategically to achieve the project outputs and specially outcomes? If not, why and which measures taken to work towards achievement of project outcomes and impact?
- 4.2 Are the project's activities/operations in line with the schedule of activities as defined by the Project team and work plans?
- 4.3 How efficient was the Project in utilizing project resources to deliver the planned results?
- 4.4 To what extent did the project leverage resources to promote gender equality and nondiscrimination; and inclusion of people with disability?

Impact orientation and sustainability:

- 5.1 What level of influence is the project having and would continue to have on the development of employment and other areas on policies and practices at national and sub national levels?
- 5.2 Which project-supported tools have been institutionalized, or have the potential to, by partners and/or replicated or external organizations
- 5.3 Is the project contributing to expand the knowledge base and build evidence regarding the project outcomes and impacts
- 5.4 To which extent the results of the intervention likely to have a long term, sustainable positive contribution to the SDG and relevant targets? (explicitly or implicitly)
- 5.5 Does the project developed and implement an exit strategy?
- 5.6 How has the sustainability approach of the project been affected/could be affected by the Covid19 situation in context of the national responses?

3.2 Key considerations prior to the evaluation

In terms of response to the scope of the midterm evaluation as mentioned in the TOR, the following key points are important to highlight:

Table 1: Key considerations and approach adopted

Scope in TOR	Approach adopted
The mid-term evaluation will cover the period 1 April 2018 to 30 March 2020. The evaluation will cover all the planned outputs and outcomes under the project, with particular attention to synergies between the components and contribution to national policies and programmes.	The methodology applied will collect data to show the relation between activities/clusters of activities to outputs and outcomes with a point of departure in partner experiences and assessment of links to outcomes.
The evaluation will discuss how the project is addressing its main issue (i.e. gender equality) and the ILO cross-cutting themes including non-discrimination, social dialogue and tripartism, international labour standards, and just transition to environmental sustainability.	Interviews with ILO experts, and desk review of documents, put together with questions of relevance in interviews with different stakeholders, will give a picture as to how the ILOs comparative advantages contributes to achieve the DWW objectives.
The evaluation should help to understand how and why the project has obtained or not the specific results from output to potential impacts.	The MTE will have a focus on clusters of activities the role of project partners, synergies between them and the connections to outputs, outcome and impact.

Certain elements of the methodology have been subject to a particular focus:

- 1) The COVID 19 crisis and the home-based nature of the evaluation makes it important to ensure that the voice of all key stakeholders has been included. To this end, the evaluation team has engaged from the outset with the project to benefit from their experience in relation to development of methodology without compromising the independent nature of the evaluation.
- 2) Gender equality is integral to ILO evaluations, and the evaluation aims to understand specific challenges faced by women stakeholders. Consultations with the project team to understand the background have contributed to this end. The midterm evaluation also includes equal representation of men and women, and work with gender disaggregated data.
- 3) The team has engaged with the donor to get their inputs to the evaluation. Based on interviews with the Finnish embassy in Tunisia and with the responsible desk officer at the Ministry of Foreign Affairs in Helsinki, the connections between the project and the MENA strategy of the Ministry of Foreign Affairs in Finland have been clarified.
- 4) Evaluation questions have been adapted to a form that is relevant to the stakeholders, taking a point of departure in activities that the partner has been involved in.
- 5) The evaluation team asked the same questions to stakeholders at macro/meso (key informants) as compared to the micro level (beneficiaries). These questions related to relevance, effectiveness and sustainability. The triangulation between this data will show coherence/consistency and identify gaps and differences in perceptions relating to the results that are expected, and make links to the context the project is implemented in.
- 6) Questions relating to context, connections with other programmes and planning frameworks will receive particular focus in interviews with the group "experts".
- 7) Data collection will be compared to data from the projects M&E system.

3.3 Role of the COVID crisis and the home-based nature of the evaluation

A special consideration concerns the COVID crisis, which has disrupted implementation processes, and also left questions as to when, and how, project activities can be resumed at full level again, and what modifications to the project plan that has to be developed.

The planning of the data collection was also to a large extent related to the COVID crisis, both in terms of understanding what the COVID crisis means for the project, as well as in terms of collecting data remotely. At the initial design phase, different tools for data collection were considered. This included questionnaire online survey, focus group discussions carried out outline, and also the holding of an online workshop to present the first findings of the evaluation. These different options needed to be changed for different reasons:

- a questionnaire was deemed unlikely to carry through with the time available. Prior experiences from the project with this kind of data collection indicated that a questionnaire requires substantial follow up, and does most often not have a low response rate. Moreover, this would require active involvement from project staff to facilitate this discussion and possibly compromise the independent nature of the evaluation.
- focus groups were replaced by group interviews with 2,3 and 4 respondents, both with key informants, and with beneficiaries. Respondents had to be available on the same IT platform, and with connections often being burdened, the risk of losing data prompted the team to go for a more simple solution.

- the final online meeting with project stakeholders was cancelled, both due to engagement of stakeholders as well as formal complexities in convening such a meeting. However, since the midterm evaluation should convene stakeholders for a discussion on the future, this activity might be resumed at a later point.

3.4 Evaluation process

The midterm evaluation has moved ahead as follows:

1. **Desk review:** Consultation with relevant documents, and understand the origin of the programme and the context it operates in.
2. **Data from the projects M&E system and progress reports** was explored to the extent possible. On the basis of the reading of these reports, a matrix on project progress in relation to outputs was made.
3. **Data collection:**
 - a. The evaluators interviewed **key informants** based on suggestions from the project team, and additional respondents identified by the evaluation team. Proper IT communication systems were selected to allow respondents to participate and contribute in ways that safeguard their integrity and anonymity. IT platforms such as Skype, Skype for business, Teams, WhatsApp, Zoom and Messenger were used according to the preference of the respondent.
 - b. Based on the project's list of participants for 4-5 selected activities, a **number of beneficiaries** were selected for interviews approx. 20 with equal representation of men and women. These respondents were asked the same evaluation questions as key informants, however, with an additional emphasis on the particular process and results of activities they are engaged in in relation to the project. In Egypt, the evaluation focused on Get Ahead and Financial education training with NCW, and with trainees of the HR Academy, while in Tunisia, the interviews concentrated on the training of labour inspectors, and the basis for the WED launch by the CNFCE. In both countries, interviews were carried out with trade union members. With these beneficiaries, the evaluation collected data related to key interventions in the DWW project distributed equally between countries and fairly equally between women and men (with some more women interviewed than men).
 - c. Finally, the evaluators carried out **interviews with experts**. Experts comprised ILO experts, participants in a sub-regional network of gender experts, and a few interviews with resource persons external to the ILO and the DWW project, who have worked with the national partners in other contexts

3.5 Techniques applied

The methodology as described in the inception report consist of the following approaches:

- **LFA matrix performance assessment:** Based on project document, and project progress reports, the evaluation has made an assessment of types of activities undertaken, and the extent to which plans have been implemented as envisaged. This overview is presented in annex 4, and gives a basis to assess the role

of unexpected changes, difficulties encountered or the extent to which project management pursued new opportunities. Reference has also been made to the project’s monitoring system (PMF).

- **semi-structured interviews** were carried out with individual respondents, i.e. allow respondent to share what he/she finds relevant, and follow up to ensure that evaluation questions are responded to. Questions related to direct activities undertaken as a point of departure, and the discussion established links to outcomes and results. These semi-structured interviews were carried out with key informants, beneficiaries and with experts.

- **group interviews:** The interviews followed the same questions as above, however, with an increased focus on activities, as most of the respondents were beneficiaries, who do not know the other parts of the project. Group interviews were also carried out with a few key informants. The data collected in this way reflect social norms more, and gave room for discussion between respondents.

- **triangulation of data** was made by comparing data between respondents, documents or other data identified online.

3.6 Stakeholder engagement

Interviews were carried out with 1) key partners, 2) beneficiaries in a selected number of project activities, and 3) experts. The midterm evaluation has met with a total of 61 respondents, divided by:

Table 2: Overview of respondents interviewed:

a) Group:

	Total	Female	Male
Key stakeholders/ Egypt	12	9	3
Key stakeholders/ Tunisia	10	4	6
Beneficiaries/Egypt	11	6	5
Beneficiaries/Tunisia	9	7	2
Experts	14	7	7
Donor	5	3	2

b) Gender:

	Tunisia	Egypt	Experts	Donor	Subtotal
Female	11	15	7	3	36
Male	8	8	7	2	25

c) Constituents:

	Tunisia	Egypt	Subtotal	Female	Male
Government	9	10	19	13	6
Employers	5	7	12	8	4
Trade unions	5	6	11	5	6

Questions with key stakeholders were prepared based on the key evaluation questions in the TOR. During interviews, questions were rephrased to take a direct point of departure in activities carried out, and during the discussion, respondents explained how it related to context and the project’s outcomes. This adaptation to a large extent helped to create a good basis for the interviews and a good discussion with respondents.

Interviews with beneficiaries have given a good insight into contextual factors beyond the project, and also to opportunities and challenges identified by beneficiaries and provided a critical perspective and a good basis for learning.

The group experts are: ILO experts at the Decent Work team at ILO Cairo, backstopping units at ILO Geneva, external experts such as consultants hired under the DWW project, members of the gender network from the sub- regional workshop in Tunis, and external experts that have worked with the social partners on issues related to gender equality.

The interviews represent women well (with 36 as against 25 men), and the interviews also managed to get a balanced amount of respondents from the ILO constituents with 19 from Government, and 11 and 12 from each of the social partners, respectively.

3.7 Limitations

- The COVID crisis made it more difficult to collect reliable and valid data, because respondents have not yet established an overview of the effects of the COVID 19 on their target group and the activities related to the DWW project. The assessment is that this mainly concerns data relating to outcome 2 (women entrepreneurship)
- The remote nature of the evaluation in general makes it a challenge to establish the trust needed to gain valuable insights into the project. The measures taken to increase this is to show flexibility in terms of timing, prepare information beforehand to let respondents know the key focus areas of the interview, and try as much as possible to let the respondent take the lead in the conversation. To a large extent, this has worked well, and help to collect data that is assessed to be valid and reliable.
- Independent evaluation missions communicate direct with project stakeholders without the involvement of project staff. In many cases, however, the evaluation team assisted to follow up with respondents, and the fixing of meetings took a little longer than expected from the beginning. In the end, interviews took approx. 4 weeks, but the assessment is that it did not impact the quality of data collected in any negative way.
- Technical challenges play a larger role with remote interviews as the only data collection method. The team has used a number of platforms, i.e. Skype, Messenger, WhatsApp, Zoom and Teams, and in a few cases direct phone calls. The technical difficulties have been surprisingly few, although the connections have in a few cases made it difficult to understand respondents. However, cross-checking with written sources, comparing interviews and checking with project staff mean that the effect of this limitation is also minor.

3.8 Ethical standards

Interviews were carried out according to ILO evaluation guidelines (including the UNEG guidelines). During interviews, it has been stated that this was an independent interview, and that respondents were free to express their opinion, which would be anonymized in the report. The evaluation has also made it optional to conduct interviews in the preferred language of the respondent. The interviews have been conducted in Arabic, French and English. Interviews were made in such a way that respondents could express themselves freely, and carried out without the project staff present.

4. Findings

4.1 Relevance

The purpose of this section is to ascertain that the DWW project is still relevant in relation to the challenges identified at the beginning. This section looks at coherence with existing national and international frameworks, and has collected data from both beneficiaries and external experts.

The DWW project is designed in line with key government policies related to gender equality. In Egypt, the DWW is aligned to the “National Strategy for Women’s Empowerment 2030”, in particular component two on the promotion of women’s economic empowerment, as well as Egypt’s Vision 2030. In Tunisia, the project is in line with the Strategic Development Plan 2016-20. As mentioned at the outset, the DWW project is now also operating in a larger environment of ILO, UN and SDGs:

ILO Programme and Budget: Feedback from experts interviewed show that the most recent ILO Programme and Budget for 2020-2021 represents organizational objectives in a way that allow country offices and Decent Work teams the opportunities to integrate their work in different ways. In the present P&B, under Outcome 6: Gender equality and equal opportunities and treatment for all in the world of work, there is specific mention of the Diversity Dividend, i.e. that women’s inclusion in the labour market can give additional benefits for both companies and economies in general.

This particular aspect has also been highlighted by many of the national partners during interviews, and make up an opportunity to create stronger links to the ILOs Programme and Budget. In addition, the ILO P&B also highlights issues such as women leadership and management, equal wages (incl. EPIC), and action against violence in the workplace.⁵ These issues all link up to the DWW project. As for the regional outlook, the Arab States have the prospects of a significantly increased budget over the years 2020-2021 in terms of extra-budgetary resources (60 M USD).

ILO Decent Work Country Programme: The ILO played a special role in the creation of the tripartite Council for Social Dialogue in Tunisia three years ago in 2017, and the recently developed Decent Work Country Programme 2017-2022 builds further on these experiences with a focus on employment, vocational training, social protection and social dialogue, The CNFCE and the HR Academy is mentioned in the DWCP for Tunisia, and the document reflects many of the key areas mentioned by DWW partners such as workers in the informal sectors and increased social protection. Meanwhile, in Egypt, the process towards developing a Decent Work Country Programme is still under development, and the DWW project has created synergies in other ways (see below)

ILO Country Programme Outcomes: The DWW project connects to the Country Programme Outcomes (CPOs) mentioned in the project document and in the TOR for the midterm evaluation as shown in the following table:

⁵ ILO P&B, p.33 and p. 79

Table 3: Decent Work for Women project and its connection to ILO Country Programme Outcomes

Country Programme Outcome	DWW project identification of link
TUN 103: Employment for youth and women through entrepreneurship, Value Chain Development, green enterprises, social enterprises, cooperatives and business development programmes promoted.	Links to DWW project outcome 2 on women's entrepreneurship, in particular the question of value chains (output 2.2)
TUN 126: Les capacités des institutions de la sécurité sociale sont renforcées pour améliorer et étendre la couverture sociale et les services fournis aux groupes vulnérables.	Links to the work with outcome 1 (e.g. C. 183 and the discussions related hereto)
TUN 801: Strengthened institutional capacity of employers' organizations	Linked to outcome 1 and 3 on women's participation and leadership among social partners, and the HR Academy initiative in Tunisia (outcome 1)
TUN 802: Strengthened institutional capacity of workers' organizations	Linked to outcome 1 and 3 on women's participation and leadership among social partners
EGY 105: National capacity to create enabling business environment which is also gender transformative for sustainable enterprises is strengthened	Linked to both outcome 1 and 2, in particular the initiatives with the HR Academy in Egypt.
EGY 106: Employment for young men and women through entrepreneurship, Value Chain Development, green enterprises, social enterprises and cooperatives and business development programmes promoted	Linked to outcome 2 on women's entrepreneurship, in particular the question of value chains (output 2.2)
EGY110: Increased capacities to understand the informal economy and to enact gender-sensitive policy reforms that facilitate transition to formality	Linked to outcome 2 (note the new SME law and the work of MSMEDA in Egypt)
EGY 801: Strengthened institutional capacity of employers' organizations	Linked to outcome 1 and 3 on women's participation and leadership among social partners (workers and employers' organisations)
EGY 802: Strengthened institutional capacity of workers' organizations	Linked to outcome 1 and 3 on women's participation and leadership among social partners

UNPDF: The UNPDF framework also show a clear coherence with the DWW project⁶. The UNPDF in Egypt is the most recent and runs from 2018-2020. The Egypt UNPDF framework has offered an opportunity for the DWW project to promote the work by engaging directly with NCW, whose position in relation to the Egyptian government allowed to give leverage to the DWW project. The project has found that the emergence of the UNPDF in 2018 meant that the DWW had had time to develop results and create linkages, and is now in a very good position to support the UNPDF. Component 4 in the UNPDF is: Women's empowerment. Among the UN, the ILO and UN Women are co-leading the work on this component. The generic content of the component is assessed by project team to give a very good space to operate in and allows for flexibility and synergies with other ILO gender equality projects and initiatives. In general, technical cooperation projects represent opportunities to support the implementation of key activities of the UN. In Egypt, resources are available to respond to these opportunities provided they are directly relevant for the different projects on gender equality and offer opportunities for leverage.

SDGs: The DWW project relates to Goal 1: Reducing poverty, Goal 5: Achieving gender equality and women's empowerment, Goal 8: Promoting sustained, inclusive and sustainable economic growth, full and productive employment and decent work for all, and Goal 10: Reducing Inequalities, with a special focus on goal 5 and 8. SDGs are also integral to the ILO Programme and Budget, with specific references to women's leadership

⁶ The UNPDF in Tunisia is from 2014-2019 and is not part of the assessment.

and management, and elimination of violence in the workplace (SDG 5), and to equality of wages between men and women (SDG 8).⁷

The interviews carried out during the evaluation confirm that the DWW project is relevant to the partners' needs. It is also interesting to investigate the feedback from beneficiaries and experts on the relevance of the DWW project. The following table show some of the statements on relevance that both beneficiaries and experts (not related to the ILO) have highlighted:

Table 4: Views of external experts and beneficiaries in relation to the relevance of the DWW project

Outcomes	Macro	Meso	Micro	
1. To support the development of an enabling environment for gender equality in the workplace	Women can play a positive role in the labour market, and the benefit for the private sector should present a win-win situation. Important to distinguish between the public and the private sector.	Many companies are in the process of developing HR policies for inclusion of women, and need to link up to activities as those carried out by the project	Important to address employers willingness to recruit women, and that many issues could be discussed at the workplace through local dialogue mechanisms	Egypt
	Positive environment for promoting key ILO conventions related to women, but also gaps between legislation and enforcement. Important to distinguish between the public and the private sector.	Many respondents are concerned with outreach to the informal sector e.g. agriculture, where social protection is very low.	Relevant to have more visibility on violence and abuse in the workplace, which are widespread and often with no direct tool for e.g. labour inspectors to intervene.	Tunisia
2. To create an enabling environment for women's entrepreneurship development	Women's access to finance represents a real challenge, not least because of the need for support after the COVID	Projects that support women entrepreneurs are often not sufficient to have a real impact	Difficult to reach women entrepreneurs, resources not available on the ground	Egypt
	Women's access to finance represents a real challenge, not least because of the need for support after the COVID	Projects that support women entrepreneurs are often not sufficient to have a real impact	Difficult to reach women entrepreneurs, resources not available on the ground	Tunisia
To support employers' and workers' organizations strengthen the representation of women in their structures for an improved women leadership.	Social partners have put the issue on the agenda, now need to address the issue in a way that promotes a win-win situation	Social partners can facilitate change in the private sector, e.g. in relation to safety at work	Women leadership is both a key driver and also a long-term goal that requires culture change.	Egypt
	Social partners have made good progress, but could move faster toward inclusion of women in leadership	Social partners should try to address the informal sector more, especially agriculture.	Women leadership is both a key driver and also a long-term goal that requires culture change.	Tunisia

The groups' statements made point to a number of issues related to relevance:

- the key topics of the DWW project are relevant and clearly linked to key challenges for women's employment. However, in quite a few cases respondents highlight underlying cultural issues that change only slowly. This indicates that project ambitions may be too high, although they clearly address important issues. This seems particularly relevant for the micro level, where also many factors will work against the change that the project tries to achieve.

⁷ See ILO P&B, p. 79, where key SDGs in relation to the ILO P&B are listed, with reference to key areas of intervention.

- some of the partners, e.g. the social partners in Tunisia, are already working on leadership of women, however, are also encouraged to do more and make further progress. Hence, the project works with relevant issues, but operate in larger organizational structures that have their own pace, often independent from DWW project workplans and schedules.
- relevance could easily be changing after the COVID 19, especially in relation to outcomes 1 and 2, where women are hit harder, especially women entrepreneurs. At this point, focus is still on health and security issues related to the pandemic, including relations with neighboring countries and the global dimensions of the COVID crisis, including risks that the virus might still spread across borders into Tunisia and Egypt. As for the economic consequences, assessments at this point are that the lockdown has resulted in considerable setbacks for women's participation in the labour market, especially in the private sector. As for women entrepreneurs, financial aid and access to markets is more relevant than before, and a few new markets for online training or digital services are among the unexpected, positive developments.
- many respondents point out that the relevance of the issues addressed must go hand in hand with a language that promotes a win-win culture among stakeholders. As an example, the case that women's inclusion can make a change for companies and their performance and results, could be made more specific and tangible.

4.2 Validity of design

The topics addressed by the project address key issues for women's inclusion in the labour market, as discussed under relevance above. This section assesses whether the project has been designed in such a way that it is likely to be able to achieve the expected results.

The DWW project contains 3 main outcomes with 10 corresponding outputs, addressing the questions of the enabling environment for gender equality in the labour market, for women entrepreneurship and for leadership and women's representation among social partners (trade unions and employers). These areas are combined in the project's theory of change:

Women's participation in the labour market in the two countries can be improved if an enabling environment for gender equality in the workplace is created; if an enabling environment for women's entrepreneurship is in place and income generating opportunities for women are up-scaled and implemented at the national level, and if women's leadership in workers' and employers' organizations is enhanced. For this to happen, laws and regulations that impact gender equality in the workplace, as well as gender-responsive labour and private sector development policies need to be developed by institutional partners; the private sector need to better attract, retain, and promote women in decent work by using adequate HR strategies; successful models of women's entrepreneurship projects need to be developed, communicated, and replicated; and workers' and employers' organizations benefit from gender awareness. This entails that workers' and employers' organizations benefit from increasing women's leadership and that companies are aware of the positive returns of increased gender diversity and improved human resources management practices and working environments.

This theory of change remains valid in connection with external factors and other developments in the environment during project implementation. There has been new important legislation, in Tunisia in relation

to the law on violence against women as well as the council for social dialogue in 2017, and in Egypt, the labour law is under discussion and a new trade union law in operation from 2017. These changes in the context link up very well with the topics addressed by the DWW project, and an opportunity to engage and create synergies in different ways.

The theory of change also takes into account the reciprocal nature of the relationship between stakeholders, i.e. for change to happen, partners must see the benefit and be willing to engage. However, many respondents point out that the achievement in the long-run also depend on cultural change and norms, which is not included in the theory of change. The theory of change in general operates on a high level of abstraction, and depending on whether the expected change is on the macro, the meso or the micro level, more specific sub-theories of change could be worked out as part of the project monitoring.

The projects key indicators are in general linked closely to outcomes and measured in quantitative terms. However, the indicators also include a specific target for women-owned enterprises⁸, which is not linked direct to the “up-scaling of income-opportunities for women” mentioned in the theory of change. Moreover, the indicators to some extent relate to factors beyond the control of the project. Moreover, some achievements that contribute to long-term goals, and provide important inputs to a process, may not be captured by the outcome indicators of the project (see under effectiveness below).

The project represents many of the organizational strengths of the ILO, including the cross-cutting themes gender equality, tripartism and the promotion of international labour standards, which have been integral to the DWW project from phase 1 in 2012.

4.3 Effectiveness

The following section sets out to document results achieved in terms of outcomes. The point of departure is an overall assessment of outputs delivered, followed by a more specific focus on key processes, where the evaluation has had the opportunity to combine data from key stakeholders with beneficiaries. The following table represents the status of the project in terms of outputs delivered in relation to the logical framework:

Table 5: Outcome, outputs, and activities implemented.

Output activities, Egypt and Tunisia	Egypt	Tunisia	Comment
Outcome 1 Enabling environment for gender equality in the workplace enhanced through an integrated approach with national partners and private companies.	x	x	The main part of activities have been implemented under outcome 1
Output 1.1 – Training and technical support programme developed and rolled out within public institutions so as to strengthen their gender-responsive policies and procedures.	x	x	Carried out through training of labour inspectors, both in Egypt and Tunisia
Output 1.2 – Gender responsive policies developed and promoted by employers’ and workers’ organizations and adopted by private companies.	x	x	Addressed both through social partners and the HR Academies
Output 1.3 – Advocacy and knowledge sharing efforts provided by national partners on women and employment.	x	x	Addressed most recently through a sub-regional gender conference and the establishment of a network, also supported by the donor

⁸ See project PMF and under “effectiveness” below

Outcome 2 Enabling environment for women's entrepreneurship development enhanced			Addressed through both WED launch and roll out of training of trainers
Output 2.1 – Relevant entrepreneurship policies and programmes are reviewed, designed, developed to include gender-responsive measures.	x	x	WED launch in both Egypt and Tunisia successfully carried out
Output 2.2 – Private initiatives to better engage women-owned enterprises in supply chains developed.			This output is likely to be changed based on partners wishes
Output 2.3 – Networks of national partners in private sector development capacity to support women's economic empowerment strengthened.			As above
Output 2.4. Value-chain development initiatives for specific community-driven cluster development facilitated			As above
Output 2.5. New job opportunities created through formal micro-small business development.	x		Study carried out in Egypt, however, not yet delivered results in terms of job opportunities
Output 2.6. Micro-finance institutions supported to achieve main goals of Egypt's financial inclusion national plans	x	x	Financial education training in Egypt (still in early stages)
Outcome 3: Women leadership in workers and employers' organizations improved			Addressed with social partners, and supported by ILO experts.
Output 3.1 – Training programme developed and rolled out among new women members of workers and employers' organizations with the aim to enhance their access to leadership positions.	x	x	Addressed with Egyptian trade unions, where the ILO plays a significant role and laid the basis for the future. Also with UGTT, and activities planned for employers in 2020

In sum, a good amount of project activities has been carried out as planned, and activities in general got well under way in 2019. The table shows that many activities have been carried out in relation to outputs under Outcome 1 and 3⁹. In relation to outcome 3, there is a certain link to output 1.2, where activities are alike. In relation to outcome 2, it is noted that most activities are related to outcomes 2.1 and 2.6. Other activities are planned for outputs 2.5 this year, while outputs 2.2., 2.3, and 2.4 have not yet been carried out as planned (see below).

In the following, based on the project's progress reports, a certain number of activities, or clusters of activities, have been identified in order to concentrate on processes and cooperation with partners. As mentioned under methodology above, these clusters of activities made up the point of departure for most interviews with partners and represents the focus chosen for the evaluation. Where a country is indicated (in green), this is where the evaluation team interviewed direct beneficiaries as well. The key clusters evaluated by the team and their relation to outcomes are indicated in the table below:

Table 6: Key clusters of activities and outcome results examined by the evaluation team

Outcome 1	Outcome 2	Outcome 3
Support to key ILO Conventions related to gender/ Tunisia and Egypt	Business Start-up with Get Ahead and Financial Education approaches (Egypt)	Women membership and women leadership in trade unions/ Egypt
Labour inspection training and institutionalization processes/ Tunisia	National launch on women's economic development (WED)/ Tunisia	
Support to the HR Academy/ Egypt	COVID 19 surveys/ Egypt and Tunisia	
Admission to the Equal Pay International Coalition network/ Tunisia and Egypt		

⁹ Activities are listed under outputs here as mentioned in the progress reports. See annex 4 for a full overview of activities implemented based on progress reports

4.3.1 Results related to outcome 1 : To support the development of an enabling environment for gender equality in the workplace

Support to ILO Conventions: Three conventions are being supported by the DWW project, namely C 183 on Maternity Protection, C. 189 on Domestic Workers, and the recently adopted Convention 190 on Elimination of Violence and Harassment in the World of Work.

In Egypt, a study on Violence in the Workplace was made under the first phase of the project. The study has not yet been published. However, when ILO Convention 190 was adopted by the International Labour Conference in 2019, the Government of Egypt indicated its intention to take steps towards studying the possibilities for ratification. Following this decision, the DWW has held information workshops in late 2019, and a Gap Analysis has now been drafted.¹⁰ Through the Ministry of Manpower, a consultation process is under way to work further on the Gap Analysis together with the social partners, and based on the feedback, decisions will be made on the way ahead. As for C. 183, discussions with the Ministry of Social Solidarity took place based on a protocol by the ILOs Social Protection programme earlier on in the project, and further activities are planned for 2020.¹¹

In Tunisia, many activities related to the conventions have been supported: As for C. 183, two workshops have been held with the UGTT (the second one with a larger group of stakeholders from government). At the moment, there is considerable difference between the public and the private sector, with only 1-month maternity leave in the private sector (as against 2 in the public sector). Questions related to the costs involved have for some years held the employers back from supporting the process, however, a study on actual costs involved has enabled employers to analyse the consequences in more detail and begin to move forward. For some of the stakeholders, the ratification of convention 183 would represent a very important step forward for gender equality. The social partners are very involved in this process with the government, and the council for social dialogue in Tunisia plays a key role. The contribution from the DWW project has been good and helped to move the process forward.

In relation to C 189 on domestic workers, the Ministry of Social Affairs has recently initiated a process towards ratification by the end of the year, including DWW project partners CNFCE and UGTT. As for C 190, Tunisia already adopted a law on violence against women in 2017, which from the outset covers the economic area, but not with specific reference to the labour market. With this basis, activities are now under way towards ratification in Tunisia through the Ministry of Women Affairs, including the development of a Gap Analysis.

Activities related to the above have been described by beneficiaries as very useful, and given social partners such as the UGTT the opportunity to assess international standards against existing legislation in Tunisia, and prepare the next steps , both inside their own organization with e.g. a Position Paper on C. 183, as well as in the Council for Social Dialogue in Tunisia.

¹⁰ Together with the ILO/UN Women Joint Programme for Promoting Productive and Decent Employment for Women.

¹¹ See DWW progress report 2018 and DWW workplan 2020 (maternity and paternity schemes study)

Labour inspection training: Some 150 labour inspectors have been trained under the DWW project. Activities started earlier in Egypt, where a batch of labour inspectors were trained during 2018. The training of labour inspectors led to the inclusion of gender into the guidelines for inspection of worksites. Above all, the labour inspection training provided the trigger for the establishment of a Gender and Non-Discrimination Unit in the Ministry of Manpower.

In Tunisia, training of labour inspectors (4 days training, reaching approx. 70 participants) has also reached out to different regions based on experiences from phase 1. Interviews with participants emphasize that the workshops were an eye opener to them. It gave an opportunity to understand international standards in relation to the national legislation in their country, and to see possible strengths and gaps. The interactive training method included different presentations by legal experts, economists and sociologists, and was very inspiring. The workshops have allowed labour inspectors to detect and pinpoint challenges related to gender equality in the workplace such as violence, harassment, and discrimination in the form of e.g. salary or poor working conditions for women.

The training has also made labour inspectors reflect further on the environment they work in. In Tunisia, labour inspectors pointed to the existing legislation from 1972, and found that there is a need for changes to the legal framework. Other points related to the challenges faced in the rural areas in Tunisia, where the legislation does not allow labour inspection to be carried out in agricultural-related worksites. The poor working conditions in the private sector in Tunisia in general as opposed to the public sector was also mentioned. As a result of the training, labour inspectors have started to report more on gender equality, violence and harassment in the workplace.

In terms of suggestions for the future it would be important to investigate the effects of violence against women in the workplace in relation to effects on companies and societies, and private sector managers could be involved in the training related to gender equality and labour inspection.

HR academies: The **HR academies** have been established in both Tunisia and Egypt during both this and the previous phase. The HR Academy builds on an ILO concept, and is most often supported by training through the International Training Centre in Turin for key persons from the partner organisations. Built on this ILO support, the HR Academy develops training curriculum and materials, and works directly with companies, i.e. members of the employers' organization to address HR issues at the level of the company. Issues covered can be gender equality norms, the labour law and HR policies. The experiences in Tunisia and Egypt were initiated at different times, and have progressed the furthest in Tunisia, where the DWW project progress report in 2019 concluded that the HR Academy had become sustainable, offering courses to CNFCE members on a regular basis¹².

In Egypt, the HR Academy has carried out three courses so far, 2 in Cairo and the most recent one in Alexandria. FEI has taken the step to offer HR Academy training to their local branches, and wish to reach companies outside Cairo. As a result, 10 out of 26 reported on changes to their HR policy (one of them to the

¹² See DWW progress report, 2019, the CNFCE Academy for Women Business Owners (L'academie des femmes cheffes d'entreprises)

ILO) after the latest training. Initially, the training was carried out with experts who gave their own content to the courses. Participants included PhD and other non-company HR experts, who did not attend the HR Academy in order to implement changes in the company afterwards. Therefore, the FEI started a critical review of the profile of the participants. Now, curriculum and manuals are being further developed to give a basic framework for the Academy in the future. The plan is that 3 core trainers (ILO) train a group of FEI trainers to develop the HR Academy in ways where the training can be sustained through payment of fees. Tools for pre-assessment and post-assessment are now made in relation to institutional changes more than individual change with support from the ILO, so support can be phased out over time. This work has been strengthened during the present phase of the DWW, because the other ILO gender equality projects have resources to support the process as well.

FEI finds it important to have courses outside Cairo, and also to tailor the training to the needs of the companies, i.e. fewer days, and more impact-orientation. After the courses, a consultant is now following up with companies to document progress in terms of HR policies and inclusion of women. FEI would also like their members to take an active part in moving the HR Academy forward, and to emphasize on the positive role of women for the companies and their performance as a company. Throughout the process, the Women in Business Unit has played a key role. This unit has been supported by the ILO, and as from late 2019, the unit is run by the FEI, and is under the Strategic Units of the FEI.¹³

Feedback from participants showed that the HR Academy is highly relevant because many companies in Egypt do not have HR policies. Even in sectors where there is a high demand for women workers, there is little willingness on the part of company management to hire them. Hence the training is indeed relevant, however, indications from respondents also indicate that the process of adapting its form and material to meet the needs of FEI members will take time. Issues discussed were management support for change, the culture of HR policies among FEI members, how to make the training economically sustainable through payment of fees, how to promote the recruitment of women and how to create a good working environment for women.

EPIC network: During the project period, both Egypt and Tunisia have joined the **Equal Pay International Coalition** for the MENA region. This network is established through the ILO. The project has mainly facilitated the participation of the governments of Tunisia and Egypt at a sub-regional meeting in Amman. In connection with this meeting, both governments indicated their readiness to join the network, Egypt as part of the MENA steering committee. Egypt is now member, and Tunisia have pledged to join. This step was supported from the level of DWW project staff, and required a considerable amount of lobbying and follow up. The EPIC network is relatively recent experience, where there is still need for time to see results emerge. It is also a new, and unexpected development in the project, and is closely linked to one of the core ILO Conventions 100 on equal remuneration. The EPIC is now also seen as one of the possible drivers for change during the remaining period of the DWW project. The ILO has recently published the Wages in Africa report, which has been translated into French and Arabic by the DWW project.

¹³ See FEI homepage <http://www.fei.org.eg/index.php/en/>

4.3.2 Results related to outcome 2 : To create an enabling environment for women entrepreneurship

Get Ahead and Financial Education training: **Get Ahead** TOT training and **Financial education** training have been carried out in Egypt. The Get Ahead was initially launched 5 years ago in 2015 with the MSMEDA.

The TOT training has been made using local NCW structures for outreach. From the outset, the agreement made by the ILO Cairo with the NCW paved the way for getting the DWW project on track in Egypt, and the subsequent collaboration makes up the key activities related to many parts of the DWW project, including outcome 2 in Egypt. The NCW has a department for women entrepreneurship, where a number of other initiatives support women entrepreneurs as well. As for the training with Get Ahead, the rationale is that the NCW has representations at the Governorate level that can reach out to women entrepreneurs in precarious employment, who try to start up micro enterprises. The NCW has been independently leading on the roll-out process 4 times (Siwa, Giza, and Alexandria) and has also recently carried out an income-generating study (early 2020) to assess possibilities for women entrepreneurs.

In the process, the focus of the DWW moved from the original idea of value chains, and local economic development, and partners were more in favour of working with Get Ahead.

The Get Ahead training is a business development programme specifically for women entrepreneurs. It has been developed based on concepts of other ILO business training programmes with an emphasis on the training of trainers, certification of trainers through training of entrepreneurs, access to standardized, internationally recognized materials and technical support from the ILO. Trainers in the TOT need to carry out two rounds of training in order to be certified as ILO Get Ahead trainers.

The Get Ahead addresses the lack of business start-up programmes that relate specifically to challenges faced by women. The Get Ahead is organized as a five-day training, but with intervals between the training sessions, and with a flexible approach that meets the need of women entrepreneurs to organize their involvement according to other obligations. The Get Ahead also works with issues such as violence in the workplace, social protection and family-related matters, and has worked out modules such on peer support and coaching, presentation and talking in front of prospective investors.

For the Financial Education training, the approach was similar with a TOT seminar, but the selection of participants focused more on a group of micro finance professionals. The training itself had a more technical content related to financial and banking issues. The financial education training also aims to develop the capacity through the structures of the NCW, and to eventually make credit available to women entrepreneurs. A Manual on Financial Education for Women was developed first by the DWW project in close collaboration with Social Finance department in Geneva.

The feedback for both the Get Ahead and the Financial Education training shows that follow up training has been carried out in different Governorates through the local chapters of the NCW. The feedback from participants after the TOT indicates that it has been difficult to find resources to carry out the training of entrepreneurs, to get institutional support, to directly apply the training methodology to the context, to make the training relevant for the women entrepreneurs, and to get feedback on the experiences of the

training. It was also found that further adaptation is needed in order to make the training attract the women entrepreneurs, because the context is different in different parts of Egypt. At the same time, many find the training really inspiring and interesting, and would like to continue.

In the first instance, the trainers also need to get certified. So far this has not been possible, both because of the challenges in completing the 2 compulsory rounds of training, and also because of the COVID 19 crisis. In the longer run, there are also questions about the strategic plan for further roll-out in Egypt, i.e. how to adapt training materials to the Egyptian context, and how to raise the funds to reach out to a critical mass of women entrepreneurs. The feedback showed that there are many questions in relation to resources, the future as a Get Ahead trainer, and development of a training format that matches needs of women entrepreneurs in different contexts. The future plan for roll-out in NCW needs to be clearer, and how the local representations of the NCW can support the women entrepreneurs develop their business, since activities only got started relatively recently.

These initial experiences are fully consistent with experiences in other contexts. To reach out to women micro entrepreneurs and support a process of business creation takes time, and the right mixture of training, follow up, coaching, access to finance etc. is a long process that has just started recently.

The Get Ahead training has also been launched in Tunisia, however, not under the DWW project. The plan is to move ahead in 2020 with training of women businessowners from CNFCE, and also to seek further cooperation with other partners in Tunisia. Compared to the approach outlined in the project document, the partners preferred not to do an initial study on value chains, and the DWW project has therefore now agreed on a new way to move forward. An interesting activity relates to the CNFCE cooperation with Attajari bank, where efforts are made to reach more women entrepreneurs by extending loans tailored to the needs of women business owners.

WED launch activities: **WED launch activities** have taken place in both Egypt and Tunisia. In Egypt, the FEI has launched their position paper “Unleashing the Potential of Women Entrepreneurs in Egypt”. The document is based on a WED assessment carried out with the ILO in previous phases and relates to six key framework conditions. The WED position paper was launched at a ceremony with the ILO. For the FEI, it was important to launch the WED report in a non-political and non-confrontational way in order to rally support for advocacy on women entrepreneurship development in Egypt. The Women Business Unit of the FEI also played a key role in this process.

In Tunisia, the launch of the Manifesto represents a long process where the CNFCE has played a key role in promoting women entrepreneurship. Based on a study on the development of female entrepreneurship (*Developpement de l'Entrepreneuriat Feminin/DEF*), which started during phase one of the DWW project, solid documentation has been developed and analysis made to understand the challenges confronting women entrepreneurs. The Manifesto is built upon six challenges that the CNFCE tries to change with advocacy in Tunisia. Key among these areas are discrimination towards women entrepreneurs among support systems, lack of access to credit for women, and the question of women leadership in the private sector. For the CNFCE, the name of the document was important, to strike a balance between a proactive

language to encourage change and support for the process, while at the same time pointing to key areas, where women business leaders and entrepreneurs need changes in terms of legislation and policies.

The Manifesto was presented at a launch event in Tunis in April 2019, and represented a coordinated effort by several key ministries, the employers and business organisations, the banking sector and the ILO. The Manifesto has been signed by all parties and is seen as the key document for the CNFCE. The Governor of the Central Bank has cited the CNFCE's WED Paper as the trigger to the Bank's *National Study on Women's Access to Finance* with the objective to revise regulations related to women entrepreneurs' access to finance, constituting a solid step forward.

The COVID crisis response: **The COVID 19** crisis plays an important role for project implementation. The lockdown experienced by Tunisia and Egypt, and the consequent health and economic hardship faced by especially women entrepreneurs and small businesses in the informal sector have created a set-back. The DWW project has launched a study to analyse further the consequences of the COVID crisis among micro and small enterprises lead by women in both Egypt and Tunisia. Based on a questionnaire, different IT platforms among partner organisations have been used. Initially, the response rate was low, and the study delayed, but is now expected to be published soon.

Meanwhile, the Arab Labour Congress have made a study on the informal sector. Although results have not yet been published, it shows that many women-lead businesses have had to close, and employees laid off. During the same period, access to health has decreased, and domestic violence increased. These results are in general the same for Egypt and Tunisia in terms of headlines, but the prospects for opening up are very different with Tunisia in the process of opening up, while Egypt has experienced a sharp increase in the number of COVID infections.

Meanwhile, the NCW has taken action to develop a digital version of the Get Ahead and hope to reach women entrepreneurs during the crisis. The results of this launch are not yet documented, as it was set in motion only recently.

4.3.3 Results related to outcome 3 : To support employers' and workers' organizations strengthen the representation of women in their structures for an improved women leadership

Trade unions: Women participation and leadership in trade unions has been addressed in both Tunisia and in Egypt. In Egypt, a key activity has been the elaboration of a Study on Women in Trade Unions¹⁴. This study has been very timely, following the question of women representation and quota policies from 2013 onwards, and the subsequent new trade union law in 2017 and trade union elections in 2018. The study has been published in Arabic, and makes up a baseline that will enable to assess results in the years ahead. Women's participation in trade unions is low, and the study has helped to provide an evidence base that can be referred back to later. Among the key questions is the relationship between workplaces with a high incidence of women workers as compared to the number of women leaders and active trade union members, which is now possible to follow over time.

¹⁴ Before that, the project also assisted in developing a policy paper with the trade union partners (see progress report)

The DWW project has held gender strategic workshops with members from both the ETUF, the EDLC as well as the Upper Egypt Trade Union Federation during 2019. Based on these workshops, trainees were selected for the TOT on women leadership in Egypt. The TOT was made up by two parts, started with 20 participants, and eventually ended up with 13 trade union women graduating after the second course.¹⁵

The objectives are to increase both women membership in trade unions and also women leadership. In Egypt, figures are low in both areas, and while women membership of trade unions has to some extent increased, women leadership is still marginal (in EDLC it has been increased to 30 per cent). These issues were addressed during the TOT where topics such as public speaking, technical knowledge, management of meetings and development of leadership skills were on the agenda. The leadership capacities developed among women trade unionists will be important leading up to the next trade union elections in 2022.

Feedback shows that the activities have been very well appreciated. The topic has helped to bring issues such as gender and discrimination to the attention of members and to understand how they as a trade union can work proactively with these issues, including in dialogues with employers and government. There is a strong intention to share the experiences wider, and training activities for local members in the respective unions, as well as across unions, have already been carried out. There is also a focus on understanding the importance of workers education, and on having access to data and research that can pave the way for making decisions and change policies.

In Tunisia, the UGTT started from a point, where women membership and leadership had been addressed and results achieved, e.g. with the election of 1 women member in the UGTT executive committee. In the context of the project, workshop activities have been carried out with the UGTT and a study prepared on women's participation in decision-making structures to be presented at the UGTT later.

Employers: The DWW project has carried out activities with the employers covering the entire period. For the FEI, some of the results are already described under Outcome 1 above, and further leadership activities planned with the NCW and FEI later this year.

For the CNFCE, women leadership is one of the key elements of the Manifesto. In 2017, the CNFCE managed to gain access to representation in line with UTICAs quota arrangements. CNFCE has also made an Index on Women Leaders, and a Talent Pool, and aims to train companies' HR managers to promote women leadership further. The DWW project has contributed to leadership with a strategic planning workshop under the present phase. This workshop aimed to develop the internal capacities for strategic and operational planning, and has since been followed up internally by CNFCE by 3-4 planning meetings, where further steps were taken. Among the key issues in CNFCE are support to the regional branches, and support to manage relations with local government, and financing institutions in order to secure access to credit for women business owners. It is also key for the CNFCE to increase women's participation in general to gain more influence based on higher number of members in the CNFCE among women business owners.

¹⁵ These activities can also be linked to Outcome 1, which addresses the same issues.

4.3.4 Summary results

The following represents a summary of results. Firstly, the table below shows results as per the DWW projects PMF:

Table 7: Summary results as per the projects PMF: Egypt and Tunisia

Indicator	Baseline	Target	Achieved	Comment
Changes to national laws and regulations that impact on gender equality in the world of work (social protection, working conditions).	0	0	0	This is a key area, however, suggest that indicators relate to indicators other than changes in laws, such as important support provided
	0	0	0	
Number of times training modules are repeated with the aim of institutionalization by partners	0	6	4	In the initial phases of cooperation, this indicator is good sign, however, in the longer term, indicators should relate more to indicators of financial, and institutional sustainability.
	0	1	1	
By the end of the project, the extent of development, validation, endorsement, and implementation of women entrepreneurship policies and/or programmes has increased among national partners' operations.	0	1	0	This indicator links up with the ambition in both Tunisia and Egypt. With the official launching and validation of the WED, the objective seems to have been achieved.
	0	1	0	
Number of women-owned enterprises in targeted value chains	0	2	0	Aiming for 2 women-owned enterprises is not aligned with initial project objectives.
	N/A	N/A	N/A	
Number of women in boards and institutions for the period from 2018 to 2020 in at least 4 workers' and employers' organizations	1	5	8	This is a good indicator, and important in both Egypt and Tunisia. The indicator could be diversified more to indicate what level of representation.
	2	5	3	

* Figures for Egypt on top of column, for Tunisia at the bottom

The evaluation team finds that many of the projects key indicators have been achieved, or are well under way to be achieved. However, there are a couple of reflections:

- a project should aim for more than "0". For objectives with a high impact beyond the project control (such as laws), other indicators should be added to reflect important achievements made.
- For the WED launching of position papers has already taken place in both Egypt and Tunisia, and this achievement should be possible to reflect with the indicators.
- the indicator on women-owned enterprises is not consistent with the project design, where much more emphasis was given to value chains, local economic development and job opportunities from the beginning. The relation between macro, meso and micro is not clear anymore for outcome 2, e.g. with the roll-out of the Get Ahead (meso) as against local economic networks, or job opportunities for women (micro).
- the communication strategy under the project contains a number of key documents that have been published. This includes the study on women in Trade Unions, the Manifesto (CNFCE), the Violence at the Workplace Study (not yet published), and "Unleashing the Potential of Women Entrepreneurs" in Egypt. While these publications represent a commendable result, the evaluation has found it difficult to find further

documentation of these achievements on partner organisations' online homepages (i.e. in the case of the Gender and Non-Discrimination Unit in MoM or the Academy for Women Business Owners at CNFCE), and find that these achievements would merit attention in terms of separate communication products (see also recommendations).

The evaluation finds that the DWW project has achieved more than what is indicated by the quantitative targets above in relation to the different outcomes:

Results achieved in relation to outcome 1: To support the development of an enabling environment for gender equality in the workplace:

Following the commitment of the Egyptian government to engage in activities related to Convention 190, the DWW project has managed to mobilise further support through the JP and GRWP projects for both information activities and support to a consultation process on the Gap Analysis with the Ministry of Manpower.

In Tunisia, the social partners play a very active role in supporting the process towards ratification of C 183 on Maternity Protection. The process has apparently been deblocked and employers have engaged more actively in moving forward with the convention, and project support has been given. The Ministry of Women Affairs has recently started a process to pave the way for ratification of C 189 on domestic workers that includes two of the DWW project partners UTICA/CNFCE and UGTT. As for C. 190 on violence against women, the Ministry of Women Affairs is also very committed to pursue the process towards ratification. With the different training activities, and with the support to the documentation of legal gaps for the respective conventions in relation to Tunisian law, the DWW project has contributed to changes under way at the macro level.

The training of labour inspectors has had a direct effect on the ways that the participating labour inspectors work with gender equality in the workplace. In Egypt, this training has led to the inclusion of gender equality in the checklist for labour inspectors, and has pointed out gaps in the existing legislation. The establishment of the Gender and Non-discrimination Unit in the Ministry of Manpower testifies to the institutionalisation of gender protection, although the actual physical establishment and the staffing of the Unit is still in progress. A further testimony to the achievement is the active involvement of the National Council of Women in the support to this Unit. The DWW has in this way supported changes at the meso/macro levels, although the unit is not yet established in physical terms.

In Tunisia, labour inspectors have become aware of the gaps in both legislation and policies, and the lack of existing tools to address gender inequality in the workplace. An important achievement was a national seminar (attended by the minister) that gathered social partners and included 140 participants. During the seminar a charter on women's rights and equal opportunities for work was formulated and adopted, also by companies present. Inspectors who attended are linked to the companies that attended and signed the charter to ensure equal opportunities for women in the workplace. The DWW project has in this way contributed to changes at the meso level.

The HR Academy has made good progress. In Tunisia, the DWW project reports that the Academy is now fully sustainable in the CNFCE, with regular training offered to members on an economically sustainable way.

In Egypt, the HR Academy has been successfully launched, and 3 rounds of training have been held. Work is under way on the continued quality assurance of the trainers, the curriculum, and the active involvement of HR managers and companies, and will need to be further incorporated into the FEI to have general outreach to the private sector. Furthermore, the Women Business Unit is now financially supported by FEI and integrated in the organization.

These two results also make up achievements at the meso level in both Tunisia and Egypt.

Results achieved in relation to outcome 2: To create an enabling environment for women's entrepreneurship development

In Tunisia, the main achievement under the present phase of the DWW project is to launch the Manifesto as a way to highlight key policy issues related to women entrepreneurship. In Egypt, the WED position paper was also launched, and all key stakeholders involved. These launch processes and support from key actors represents an achievement of one of the DWW project objectives in relation to the enabling environment for women entrepreneurs.

In Egypt, the Get Ahead training and financial training marks a beginning to strengthen capacities in key institutions as the NCW to be able to reach out to women according to its mandate. The process is still in its early phases as only the first TOT has been carried out, and a few training activities made due to the COVID crisis. In Tunisia, the approach was discussed with the CNFCE, and the idea of a study and the focus on specific value chains abandoned, and a new launching process is planned for this year.

The evaluation team finds that the DWW project should revisit the project strategy in relation to Get Ahead and Financial Education training, both because the link with the project outputs and outcomes is not clear, and also because partners have requested changes. The strategy should clarify if the aim is at the micro, the meso or the macro level, and how the projects partners can play a role in these different scenarios (see also recommendation).

Results achieved in relation to outcome 3: To support employers' and workers' organizations strengthen the representation of women in their structures for an improved women leadership

The DWW has made a significant contribution to strengthen women's participation in trade unions and women leadership in Egypt, where the new trade union law coincided with the onset of the DWW project and offered an opportunity to impact on key issues. In Tunisia, key processes relating to women's leadership are mainly carried out internally in the UGTT, although the DWW project has contributed to the development of a Study on Women in trade Unions. These results also represent an achievement at the meso level as stated in the outcome.¹⁶

¹⁶ Women leadership activities are planned for later in 2020 in relation to employers organisations (see workplan 2020)

4.3.5 Additional unexpected results

The unexpected results of the project are integrated under the outcomes above, as they relate to the working processes already under way. In summary, the unexpected results are:

- The work in Egypt on C 190, the support to the Gender Unit in Ministry of Manpower, and also some of the activities related to conventions in Tunisia, which have changed since the beginning of the project.
- The opportunity to join the EPIC, and the possibilities represented by this network.
- COVID 19 crisis, and the studies on women entrepreneurs, which will guide the planning for the remainder of the DWW project, and the digitalization of the Get Ahead training
- The DWW has also given support to other processes related to its outcomes, e.g. the evaluation of the EU-funded RAIDA programme by the Ministry of Women Affairs in Tunisia, and support to the issue of transport for rural women entrepreneurs with the same Ministry.

4.4 Efficiency of resource use

The DWW project has a total budget of USD 2.5 M. The project did not spend much in 2018, partly due to the late recruitment of the project CTA (early 2019). Since then, project activities have picked up considerably. By the end of 2019, total expenditure was at approx. 800,000 USD, and by the first quarter of 2020 some 177,000 USD. This represents approx. 40 per cent of the total budget, and according to the planned activities, another 300,000 USD was committed, so the expenditure would have by now passed well above 50 per cent.

The pace of implementation is sometimes slowed down due to internal processes among some of the partner organisations, as evidenced by the communication with the project. The nature of the project, where many activities are inputs into decision-making processes, work plans can be changed with a short notice, and activities either changed or altered. Moreover, some partners are not usually directly engaged in implementing activities related to e.g. business start-up processes.

Project staff have also mentioned that high staff turn-over and focal points at partner level represents a discontinuity for project implementation (in Tunisia), and means that working processes can be disrupted or delayed.

The midterm evaluation finds that project management has managed well to redirect resources to relate to results at the outcome levels, and has taken steps to overcome the obstacles and at the same time react to opportunities.

At the same time, the DWW project has indeed leveraged resources considerably through the cooperation with the gender team at ILO in Cairo. This team presently comprises 6 members, and is funded through 3 different projects (JP, GRWP and DWW). Together, these projects ensure continuity in relation to important clusters of activities under the present project such as the HR Academy, the EPIC network, the work related to C. 190 and the Gap Analysis, as well as the trade union training activities. The project furthermore reports savings of approx. 135,000 due to financing arrangements with the other gender projects on staff costs.

In terms of project management, the DWW project has a Steering Committee for Tunisia, where two meetings have been held in 2019. For Egypt, it was initially envisaged to have an “Advisory Committee” not a Steering Committee. In addition, the DWW has a Project Board with regular meetings between the ILO and the donor. The project management therefore operates with three different planning and implementation environments that impacts on decision-making in different ways. In the context of the two countries and the project partners, these arrangements have proven to be viable, and the planning and implementation process stable.

4.5 Impact orientation and sustainability

There are several dimensions to the DWW project in relation to understanding how the project can move towards long-term impact and sustainability¹⁷.

The first dimension is linked to the immediate cooperation with the JP and the GRWP projects mentioned before. These projects did not exist when the first phase of the DWW project started in 2012, and have been built up as part of the gender project portfolio at ILO Cairo. The cooperation with these projects makes it possible to launch joint activities, and to pool resources for activities with the result that more leverage can be gained. ILO gender projects now play an important role for the ILO in that resources are readily available to react to opportunities to launch activities. The increase in the project portfolio gives the DWW project an opportunity to have more flexibility and autonomy.

The ILO DWCP and the UNPDF framework also contributes to orient the DWW project towards impact. The different actors involved can influence processes from different networks, and help to support a move towards tangible impact. The ability to explore such opportunities relies on project management and cooperation with key stakeholders in the ILO, its partners, the UN and key national partners involved in gender equality.

The ILOs role as a tripartite organization is important for a project like the DWW. The ILO can provide a space for reflection and discussion which is different from the institutional settings that exist among national partners. Processes can take a new direction if the perspective is international outlook and standards, and offer opportunities to raise concerns or seek solutions. The DWW project has already managed these processes well, and thereby provided one of the key elements for working towards impact, namely through continuous support and building of trust.

The ILO has many ways to support impact-orientation that can play different roles at different times. In this project, there are many examples:

¹⁷ JP is the ILO/UN Women Joint Programme for Promoting Productive and Decent Employment for Women in Egypt, Palestine and Jordan funded by Sida (2019-2022), with a budget of approx. 1 mill. USD for Egypt. The Dutch-funded project Gender-responsive Workplaces in Egypt has a smaller budget of some 500,000 USD, and with the same CTA as for the DWW project.

- international standard setting: With support from experts in how processes relate to conventions, the project has provided guidance on legal processes and ways to overcome hurdles. The ILS senior specialist has also been involved in training of the gender network at the sub-regional conference and in the “16 days of activism” in Egypt related to C 190.
- the offices for employers and workers respectively offer opportunities for bipartite dialogues among their constituents. This makes up a different space for dialogue and reflection. In the DWW project, the ILO plays a special role in relation to trade unions in Egypt as a convener and facilitator of the processes described above, and have a key role to play also in the future.
- the ILO has a gender focus as one of the core cross-cutting themes, and can mobilise technical expertise of the GED department in Geneva, and through the network of gender experts. Gender equality makes up a technical area with momentum and support from both national tripartite partners as well as donors.
- Expertise in relation to employment policies, overall labour market trends and their relation to gender equality can be mobilized and is planned in relation to a regional gender conference. Key for this conference is also to carry out data collection that can provide evidence on women and their career paths in the labour market in Tunisia and Egypt.
- The EPIC network on wage equality is a forum outside the national realm that offer the constituents a space to discuss with other partners from the region. The EPIC is also linked to ILO Convention 100 and the ILO Programme and Budget 2020-21
- technical support in general, in the DWW project the SME support and the Get Ahead training also offer a particular technical support that can be brought into play, e.g. by forging linkages to projects in the region or networks of trainers. The DWW project has also been supported by the Employment for Youth (EYE) in Egypt project in relation to activities on WED, Get Ahead and financial inclusion.

The continuity of relations with partners go back a long way, and trust and close working relations have been built over a long period of time. During the evaluation, it has been noted also that the donor is a part of these processes, e.g. as chair of the Gender and Development Group in Egypt, or through its active support to the sub- regional gender network This continuity is in itself an important factor that helps to decide when and how the DWW project can support certain processes, and have a particular impact.

5. Conclusions

1. The DWW in the present phase works from a stronger basis compared to the earlier phase I. This is partly a result of collaboration with other gender equality projects and joint action with the ILO Cairo gender team and Decent Work team, partly as a result of a stronger integration into national action plans, the UN Programme Development Framework (UNPDF) and more coherence with the objectives of the ILOs biennial Programme and Budget 2020-21.
2. Results in terms of outcomes mainly apply to the macro and meso levels. Key achievements include:
 - a. Promotion of key conventions on gender equality and support to processes lead by national partners,
 - b. Support to the creation of the Gender and Non-discrimination Unit in the Ministry of Manpower (Egypt).
 - c. The participation of Tunisia and Egypt in the EPIC network is on track with Egypt having joined the network and Tunisia having pledged to do so.

- d. Effective support to the HR academy in Egypt and Tunisia. In Tunisia, the HR Academy is run by the CNFCE and is now mentioned in the Decent Work Country Programme of Tunisia. In Egypt, the HR Academy has taken important steps through the holding of training for member companies outside Cairo, further development of HR manuals and preparing for the training of in-house FEI trainers
 - e. The launching of position papers on women's entrepreneurship development (WED) in both countries as a result of solid groundwork in the earlier phase of the DWW project. In Tunisia, the Manifesto responded to particular needs of Tunisian entrepreneurs, while the Egyptian position paper of the FEI related specifically to challenges in Egypt.
 - f. Awareness has been raised among a critical mass of labour inspectors in both countries, tools developed and gender issues are reported more than before.
3. The DWW project has managed to provide solid support to women participation and leadership in Egyptian trade unions through a timely and well-coordinated effort. The ILO plays an important role as convener and facilitator in Egypt.
 4. The project has not yet achieved results in terms of local economic development networks, women's job opportunities and women's access to finance. and the pathways to achieve the results at the micro levels are not clear. Still, the Get Ahead and Financial Education training addresses relevant needs among women entrepreneurs, and the context in both countries offer opportunities for further development.
 5. The project team has managed to adapt to opportunities and changes:
 - a. The adaptation of the ILO Convention 190 in 2019 by the ILC was followed up by the team with activities for and with the partners in both Egypt and Tunisia
 - b. The DWW project team is responding to changes in relation to engagement in rural areas and women's entrepreneurship in both Tunisia and Egypt
 6. The project team has managed to promote a proactive approach to gender equality and trust with partners. Examples include the initial work with C 190 in Egypt, and the integration of a gender equality into labour inspector' working practices. The project has documented these activities well in terms of communication activities on the ILO homepage, Facebook and other platforms.
 7. Initiatives based on ILO concepts such as the HR Academy have reached a point where there is a good degree of integration within the CNFCE and the FEI and relevance for their members.
 8. Most partners have responded to the COVID 19 as an emergency. There have not yet been any signs of a more long-erm response to the COVID 19 among partners, except for data collection related to their respective target groups. For the DWW project, the COVID crisis has effectively put many activities on hold in early 2020. Still, online activities have been carried out, and both surveys on the effects of COVID as well as digitalization of training activities have been carried out with a short notice as a rapid response to the new situation. Meanwhile, other activities on F2F meetings have been postponed and project activities are almost certain to be delayed beyond the project duration (March 2021).

6. Recommendations

Recommendations are made for the short-term (end of the DWW project by March 2021), medium-term (end of 2022) and the long-term (beyond 2022): This is indicated for each of the recommendations below:

1. The project develops synergies with other ILO projects in Tunisia to strengthen outreach similar to the work done in Egypt. As an example, work with ILO Conventions could find inspiration from e.g. the ADWA project and their work to advance Decent Work in North Africa, including experiences from Morocco to work with national units carrying out audits. The DWW should also continue to grow the gender portfolio at ILO Cairo, and its support to the Gender and Discrimination Unit in the Ministry of Manpower.

Addressed to	Priority	Time-frame	Resources
DWW team/ILO Cairo	High	Medium-term	Medium

2. Follow up on activities, where partners with more support or additional follow-up can achieve further results:
 - a. CNFCE, Ministry of Manpower and NCW should document results of the DWW project in terms of separate communication products.
 - b. Engage project partners to provide evidence on women career paths, and challenges for women to enter/re-enter the labour market, in preparation for the planned regional conference.
 - c. Work with FEI to support companies in Egypt with more than 50 employees to have child care facilities.
 - d. Combine labour inspection training with workplace dialogue in Tunisia and address problems related to harassment or violence in the workplace with company management.

Addressed to	Priority	Time-frame	Resources
DWW team, FEI, CNFCE, MoM, MSA, and NCW	Medium	Short-term: a,b Medium term: c,d	Low

3. Expand on trade union activities in Egypt on gender equality and collect data on women's occupational patterns and trade union membership.

Addressed to	Priority	Time-frame	Resources
DWW project, trade union partners in Egypt and ILO Cairo	High	Short-term	Medium

4. Revisit the project strategy on women entrepreneurship:
 - a. If the objective is to achieve results on women's entrepreneurship, decide how, for how many and in which areas

- b. If the objective is to build the capacity within the NCW to carry out Get Ahead training, state the expected number of trainers, how many will be certified, and how to support the trainers.
- c. Explore wider cooperation and funding of the Get Ahead. The Get Ahead is relevant, there are opportunities to work with women’s entrepreneurship in both Tunisia and Egypt, and more ILO technical expertise is available from both the Decent Work team in Cairo and from ILO Geneva to support. Issues could include further adaptation to local needs and local human and environmental sustainability issues.

Addressed to	Priority	Time-frame	Resources
DWW project w/support from ILO Cairo/Geneva (a,b,c), with NCW (a,b)	High	Short-term: a, b. Medium term: c	Medium

5. Make targets for new interventions adopted during implementation, and reflect this in the monitoring system. Set qualitative and/or quantitative indicators for new initiatives such as the work with C 190, C 189 and C 183, or the EPIC networks, and review and amend the PMF indicators.

Addressed to	Priority	Time-frame	Resources
DWW project team	Medium	Short-term	Low

6. Develop a stakeholder analysis tool to document how changes are due to macro, meso or micro level factors among partners during project implementation to understand how opportunities and constraints in the project arise and are responded to.

Addressed to	Priority	Time-frame	Resources
DWW project team	Medium	Short-term	Low

7. Elaborate a strategy for the HR Academy with the FEI. The strategy should include an assessment of the institutional and economic sustainability of the HR Academy and a timeframe for the eventual phasing out of support from the ILO. Given the strong experiences of the FEI in organizational development processes, such a strategy can provide important learning.

Addressed to	Priority	Time-frame	Resources
DWW project, and FEI	Medium	Short-term/medium term	Low

8. Elaborate a strategy for response to the COVID 19.
- a. Short-term planning for the remaining part of the project with changes made
 - b. Provide data on effects of the COVID crisis on women entrepreneurs, and women in precarious employment in Tunisia and Egypt.

- c. Respond to the COVID crisis and to climate change, which is also high on the agenda and related to the COVID crisis in different ways. Initially, constraints relate to personal mobility, hygiene and social distancing:
 - i. Get Ahead modules can be developed to incorporate these constraints and allow women entrepreneurs to continue operating.
 - ii. More focus on occupational safety and health at the micro levels and the informal sector developed with local partners and supported by ILO experts, e.g. through Get Ahead training modules.

Addressed to	Priority	Time-frame	Resources
DWW project (a,b,c), NCW/partners working with Get Ahead, supported by ILO (b,c)	High	Short-term: a Medium term: b, c	Medium

7. Lessons learned and good practices

Lesson learned:

The COVID crisis has to a large extent put many activities on hold, and will no doubt have a profound impact on the economy and the labour markets many years ahead. The initial response has been crisis response, assuming that the COVID crisis was a temporary thing. However, as time goes on, the emerging picture is that the crisis will stay for longer than expected, and that the effects will only become clearer with time. Therefore, the immediate response to a crisis as a temporary measure will most likely be replaced by a more long-term realization of conditions that have permanently changed. This will also be true for the stakeholders under the DWW project, and there will be a need to rethink interventions on the assumption that the constraints imposed by COVID to some extent will remain permanent. Therefore, it is key to assess how adaptations should be made also in the longer timeframe. Issues such as localized solutions, and protection of human and natural resources will most likely become integral to future interventions, and will need to be elaborated also at the level of project management (LFA together with tools for adaptability).

Good practice:

The DWW project has managed to promote gender equality among ILO partners over a period of more than 8 years since 2012. During this period, a network has been built up between key gender experts, government, trade unions and employers in Egypt and Tunisia, and with the donor. This continuity has allowed for results to mature and materialize. During the same period, the ILOs portfolio in gender equality has expanded, and the team has grown and extended its reach within the different areas of the ILOs expertise. In recent years, this cooperation is now also integrated further with important national strategic plans on gender equality and with the UN. The process undertaken has kept a focus on gender as a proactive field of cooperation, and showed that important changes can be made, provided that the approach and the framing of this issues at stake are made in such a way that partners find an interest to engage and support a process for change.

Annex 1: Terms of reference



International Labour Organization

TERMS OF REFERENCE (TOR):

INDEPENDENT MID-TERM EVALUATION OF THE WAY FORWARD AFTER THE REVOLUTION: DECENT WORK FOR WOMEN IN EGYPT AND TUNISIA PROJECT (PHASE II)

Project Title:	The Way Forward after the Revolution: Decent Work for Women in Egypt and Tunisia-Phase II
Project Code	RAF/17/05/FIN
Administrative Unit	CO-Cairo
Donor	Ministry of Foreign Affairs of Finland
Budget	2.097 million Euros / USD 2,520,827
Implementation period	1/04/2018-31/03/2021
ILO Technical Units	Gender /Employment/Entrepreneurship/Workers' and employers' activities
Type of evaluation	Independent Mid-term Evaluation
Date of the evaluation	End May-July 2020
Evaluation Manager	Ricardo Furman, Senior Monitoring & Evaluation Officer, ILO Regional Office for Africa

1. BACKGROUND INFORMATION

Background of the project to be evaluated

“Peace, prosperity and social justice depend on the achievement of substantive equality between women and men. This is both an issue of fundamental rights and a key driving force for global progress.” However, in a context characterised by political instability and challenges related to lack of social justice, large gender gaps in labour market indicators have been prevailing in the Arab States and North Africa, in particular in Egypt and in Tunisia.

In order to address these gender gaps, and advance the Goals set out in the 2030 Sustainable Development Agenda, an integrated framework of transformative measures guided by ILO Conventions and Recommendations, will be essential. A number of ILO Conventions have been identified as being key to the promotion of gender equality, including the Equal Remuneration Convention, 1951 (No. 100), the Discrimination (Employment and Occupation) Convention, 1958 (No. 111), the Workers with Family Responsibilities Convention, 1981 (No. 156), the Maternity Protection Convention, 2000 (No.183), as well as the Domestic Workers Convention, 2011 (No.189). This framework reflected in the 2030 Agenda places the elimination of discrimination and violence, equal remuneration for work of equal value, universal social protection and measures to recognize, reduce and redistribute unpaid care and household work at the heart of policy interventions aimed at reducing poverty (Goal 1) and inequalities (Goal 10), achieving gender equality and women’s empowerment (Goal 5) and promoting sustained, inclusive and sustainable economic growth, full and productive employment and decent work for all (Goal 8). This blueprint is also embedded in the ILO Women at Work Centenary Initiative, which marks the commitment of ILO constituents to gender equality as the Organization approaches its centenary in 2019. It aims to identify and promote innovative action, and to engage ILO constituents, civil society and all women and men in concerted action to achieve full and lasting gender equality and non-discrimination. It is against this background that the Project “The Way Forward after the Revolution: Decent Work for Women in Egypt and Tunisia Phase II” is designed to pursue, strengthen, and expand the action developed under the Phase I.

This Phase seeks to address the barriers to a satisfactory participation of women in the labour market through a comprehensive approach that works at the macro, meso and micro levels; that tackles at the same time access to employment, entrepreneurship, decent work conditions, and social dialogue. The project’s theory of change is: Women’s participation in the labour market in the two countries can be improved if an enabling environment for gender equality in the workplace is created; if an enabling environment for women’s entrepreneurship is in place and income generating opportunities for women are up-scaled and implemented at the national level, and if women’s leadership in workers’ and employers’ organizations is enhanced. For this to happen, laws and regulations that impact gender equality in the workplace, as well as gender-responsive labour and private sector development policies need to be developed by institutional partners; the private sector need to better attract, retain, and promote women in decent work by using adequate HR strategies; successful models of women’s entrepreneurship projects need to be developed, communicated, and replicated; and workers’ and employers’ organizations benefit from gender awareness. This entails that workers’ and employers’ organizations benefit from increasing women’s leadership and that companies are aware of the positive returns of increased gender diversity and improved human resources management practices and working environments. However, the ultimate change of an improved participation of women in the labour market remains beyond the direct control of the project. National authorities target an

increase from 24.2 to 35 per cent in this rate by 2030 in Egypt (11 points) according to the National Strategy on Women's Empowerment: 2030 (NSWE) and from 25.5 to 35 per cent in Tunisia by 2020 according to the Strategic Development Plan for 2016-20.

We take into consideration that this objective is also linked to increased economic growth that is inclusive of women. To contribute to this, the project is already contributing in two studies that help in analysing the employment trends for women and identifying sectors where investment have most positive returns on women employment. The country interventions will be supported by cross-fertilization among the two countries and with other countries in North Africa as well as with other international experiences, particularly Finland. This will ensure that work delivered in Egypt and Tunisia throughout the two phases is consolidated in national and regional partnerships, communities of practice, and regional knowledge generation and dissemination.

The three main outcomes of the project are as follows:

- To support the development of an enabling environment for gender equality in the workplace **(Outcome 1)**;
- To create an enabling environment for women's entrepreneurship development **(Outcome 2)**;
- To support employers' and workers' organizations strengthen the representation of women in their structures for an improved women leadership **(Outcome 3)**.

Project alignment with the DWCP, P&B, CPO & SDG

Link to Decent work country programmes (DCWP):

Tunisia: The project responds to the outcomes 2.1, 2.4 and 2.5 regarding the female participation in the labour market, to outcome 2.6 regarding the promotion of entrepreneurship and to outcome 4.1 regarding the reform of social protection. On 14 January 2013, the Government, UGTT and UTICA signed the Social Contract which was the basis of the economic and social transition period after the 2011 Revolution, but also the basis of the political transition and the role played afterwards by the National Quartet. The Social Contract was prepared with the direct support from the ILO and the Action Plan was then translated into a DWCP. Entitled "The social contract, an innovative example of DWCP for Tunisia", this Programme was developed through a participatory approach and highlighted the following national priorities:

- Priority 1: Economic growth and regional development, global, sustainable, balanced and fair growth between regions;
- Priority 2: Employment and vocational training;
- Priority 3: Towards a new model of industrial relations and decent work;
- Priority 4: A comprehensive reform of social protection in Tunisia;
- Priority 5: Institutionalization of social dialogue.

In the DWCP, the Government and social partners recognize that:

- Female labour is more marked by precariousness than male labour
- Disparities especially for access to high-level posts exist.
- The place of women in political, economic and social decision-making bodies remained small, despite the steady increase in the level of education of women.
- Tunisia has experienced a gradual improvement in legislation aimed at eliminating discrimination against women and has ratified International Conventions Nos. 100 and 111, however, these improvements are still perfectible. The constituents stressed that *“the realization of these commitments requires further reform of legislation and regulations and the introduction of tools and mechanisms to reduce inequalities still visible in labour practices, income, professional hierarchies and access to political, economic and social decision-making.”*

The project contributes to the objectives of the DWCP through the direct support provided to the constituents and through the expected outcomes which are in line with the priorities defined by the constituents.

Egypt: The ILO had a draft for the DWCP which was under discussion prior to the 2012 events in the country; one of the priorities of the programme focused on increasing the participation of women, equality and gender mainstreaming. The ILO has started new rounds of discussion with the constituents in view of a possible adoption of the DWCP in 2018. Within the wide lens of ILO’s programme, ILO had devised strategies for Egypt within the ongoing Strategy for North Africa, 2011–2015 through a four-pronged intervention strategy, consisting of:

1. Sensitizing social partners and a wider audience on gender issues and inequalities in the world of work;
2. Increasing the capacity of and institutional setting for females to equip them with necessary skills to engage in social dialogue and collective bargaining processes for advancing gender equality, non-discrimination, and increased female representation in trade unions;
3. Increasing women’s skills to enhance their employability, and;
4. Capacity building for labour market institutions to better serve women and increase women’s access to these institutions.

The intervention logic is grounded in the assumption that improving women’s labour market position and increasing participation in decent work is a prerequisite for sustained equality, inclusion and democratization in Egypt.

Link to ILO P&B:

The challenge of ensuring women’s equal access to decent work, is as relevant as ever. This is highlighted in the ILO Programme and Budget 2018-19, with gender equality and non-discrimination identified as a crosscutting policy driver. The ILO’s Strategic Plan for 2018–21 identifies four institutional factors which constitute the enabling environment for the ILO to realize the ILO 2021 Vision, and they apply equally to the implementation of the Programme and Budget for 2018–19.

The Project is aligned to P&B outcomes 1, 3, 4 and 10, and linked to the following current Country Programme Outcomes (CPOs):

- TUN 103: Employment for youth and women through entrepreneurship, Value Chain Development, green enterprises, social enterprises, cooperatives and business development programmes promoted.
- TUN 126: Les capacités des institutions de la sécurité sociale sont renforcées pour améliorer et étendre la couverture sociale et les services fournis aux groupes vulnérables.
- TUN 801: Strengthened institutional capacity of employers' organizations
- TUN 802: Strengthened institutional capacity of workers' organizations
- EGY 105: National capacity to create enabling business environment which is also gender transformative for sustainable enterprises is strengthened
- EGY 106: Employment for young men and women through entrepreneurship, Value Chain Development, green enterprises, social enterprises and cooperatives and business development programmes promoted
- EGY110: Increased capacities to understand the informal economy and to enact gender-sensitive policy reforms that facilitate transition to formality
- EGY 801: Strengthened institutional capacity of employers' organizations
- EGY 802: Strengthened institutional capacity of workers' organizations

The project is firmly anchored in the ILO's Programme and Budget as indicated above, as well as in the 2030 Sustainable Development Agenda (in particular Goals 1, 5, 8, 10 and 11) and in the DWCP for Tunisia that was signed in July 2017.

Project Management Arrangement

The project is managed by a Chief Technical Adviser (CTA), responsible for overall project management based in Cairo, Egypt and reports to the Director of the ILO Cairo Office. The Project Management Team comprises:

- National Project Coordinator in Tunisia;
- National Project Coordinator for Egypt;
- Senior Project Assistant in Egypt;
- Project Assistant in Egypt;
- Project Admin and Financial Assistant in Tunisia;
- Project Driver in Egypt;
- Project Driver in Tunisia.

2. PURPOSE, OBJECTIVES AND SCOPE OF THE MID-TERM INDEPENDENT EVALUATION

Evaluation Background

ILO considers evaluation as an integral part of the implementation of technical cooperation activities. This project will go through two independent evaluations. Both evaluations are managed by an ILO certified evaluation manager and implemented by independent evaluators.

The evaluation in ILO is for the purpose of accountability, learning and planning and building knowledge. It should be conducted in the context of criteria and approaches for international development assistance as established by: the OECD/DAC Evaluation Quality Standard; and the UNEG Code of Conduct for Evaluation in the UN System.

This evaluation will follow the ILO policy guidelines for results-based evaluation; and the ILO EVAL Policy Guidelines Checklist 3 “Preparing the inception report”; Checklist 4 “Validating methodologies”; and Checklist 5 “Preparing the evaluation report”. The evaluation will follow the OECD-DAC framework and principles for evaluation. For all practical purposes, this ToR and ILO Evaluation policies and guidelines define the overall scope of this evaluation. Recommendations, emerging from the evaluation, should be strongly linked to the findings of the evaluation and should provide clear guidance to stakeholders on how they can address them.

Purpose and objectives of the Mid-Term independent evaluation

The main purpose of this mid-term independent evaluation is to provide an independent assessment of the progress to date, through an analysis of relevance, effectiveness, efficiency, effects and orientation to impact of the project. The specific objectives of the evaluation are the following:

9. Assess the relevance and coherence of project’s design regarding country needs and how the project is perceived and valued by the target groups.
10. Identify the contributions of the project to, the SDGs, the countries UNDAFs and Tunisia DWCP, the ILO objectives and CPOs and its synergy with other projects and programs in both countries.
11. Analyse the implementation strategies of the project with regard to their potential effectiveness in achieving the project outcomes and impacts; including unexpected results and factors affecting project implementation (positively and negatively).
12. Review the institutional set-up, capacity for project implementation, coordination mechanisms and the use and usefulness of management tools including the project monitoring tools and work plans.
13. Asses the implementation efficiency of the project.
14. Review the strategies for outcomes’ sustainability and orientation to impact.
15. Identify lessons and potential good practices for the key stakeholders.
16. Provide strategic recommendations for the different key stakeholders to improve implementation of the project activities and attainment of project objectives.

Scope of the evaluation

The mid-term evaluation will cover the period 1 April 2018 to 30 March 2020. The evaluation will cover all the planned outputs and outcomes under the project, with particular attention to synergies between the components and contribution to national policies and programmes.

The evaluation will discuss how the project is addressing its main issue (i.e. gender equality) and the ILO cross-cutting themes including non-discrimination, social dialogue and tripartism, international labour standards, and just transition to environmental sustainability.

The evaluation should help to understand how and why the project has obtained or not the specific results from output to potential impacts.

3. REVIEW CRITERIA AND KEY EVALUATION QUESTIONS

a) Review criteria

The evaluation should address the overall ILO evaluation concerns such as relevance, effectiveness, efficiency, sustainability and impact as defined in the ILO Policy Guidelines for results-based evaluation, 2017:

(https://www.ilo.org/wcmsp5/groups/public/---ed_mas/--eval/documents/publication/wcms_571339.pdf)

The review will address the following ILO evaluation concerns;

- Relevance and strategic fit of the project;
- Validity of the project design;
- Project effectiveness;
- Efficiency of resource use;
- Sustainability of project outcomes;
- Impact orientation;
- Gender equality and non-discrimination

b) Key Evaluation Questions

The evaluator shall examine the following key issues:

a) Relevance and strategic fit,

- Is the project coherent with the Governments objectives, National Development Frameworks, beneficiaries' needs, and does it support the outcomes outlined in ILO's CPOs as well as the SDGs?
- How does the project complement and fit with other on-going ILO programmes and projects in the countries?
- What links have been established so far with other activities of the UN or other cooperating partners operating in the Country in the areas of employment, market development and women's empowerment?
- Has the project been able to leverage the ILO contributions, through its comparative advantages (including tripartism, international labour standards, ILO Decent Work Team etc.)?

b) Validity of intervention design

- Does the project address the major causes of women unemployment in Egypt and Tunisia, and respond to it?
- Is the project realistic (in terms of expected outputs, outcome and impact) given the time and resources available, including performance and its M&E system, knowledge sharing and communication strategy?
- To what extent has the project integrated ILO cross cutting themes in the design?
- Is the project Theory of change comprehensive, integrate external factors and is based on systemic analysis?

c) Effectiveness:

- What progress has been made towards achieving the overall project objectives/outcomes?
- Has the management and governance structure put in place worked strategically with all key stakeholders and partners in Egypt and Tunisia, ILO and the donor to achieve project goals and objectives?
- Has the knowledge sharing and communication strategy been effective in raising the profile of the project within the country and among the cooperating partners?
- Is the monitoring and evaluation system results-based and facilitate a project adaptive management?
- Assess how contextual and institutional risks and positive external to the project factors have been managed by the project management?
- To what extent is the COVID-19 Pandemic influencing project results and effectiveness and how the project have addressed this influence and is ready to adapt to changes for at least some time from now-on?
- Does the (adapted) intervention model used/to be used in the project suggest an intervention model for similar crisis response?
-

d) Efficiency of resource use

- Have resources (financial, human, technical support, etc.) been allocated strategically to achieve the project outputs and specially outcomes? If not, why and which measures taken to work towards achievement of project outcomes and impact?
- Are the project's activities/operations in line with the schedule of activities as defined by the Project team and work plans?
- How efficient was the Project in utilizing project resources to deliver the planned results?
- To what extent did the project leverage resources to promote gender equality and nondiscrimination; and inclusion of people with disability?

e) Impact orientation and sustainability

- What level of influence is the project having and would continue to have on the development of employment and other areas on policies and practices at national and sub national levels?
- Which project-supported tools have been institutionalized, or have the potential to, by partners and/or replicated or external organizations?
- Is the project contributing to expand the knowledge base and build evidence regarding the project outcomes and impacts
- To which extent the results of the intervention likely to have a long term, sustainable positive contribution to the SDG and relevant targets? (explicitly or implicitly)
- Does the project developed and implement an exit strategy?
- How has the sustainability approach of the project been affected/could be affected by the Covid19 situation in context of the national responses?

4. EVALUATION METHODOLOGY

The independent mid-term evaluation will comply with evaluation norms and standards and follow ethical safeguards, all as specified in ILO’s evaluation procedures. The ILO adheres to the United Nations Evaluation Group (UNEG) evaluation norms and standards as well as to the OECD/DAC Evaluation Quality Standards. The evaluation is an independent evaluation and the final methodology and evaluation questions will be determined by the consultant in consultation with the Evaluation Manager.

The evaluation will apply a mix methods approach, including triangulation to increase the validity and rigor of the evaluation findings, engaging with key stakeholders of the project, as much as feasible, at all levels during the design, data collection and reporting stages.

Due to the onset of the COVID-19 pandemic and its impact on the world of work, this evaluation will be conducted in the context of criteria and approaches outlined in the ILO internal guide: Implications of COVID-19 on evaluations in the ILO: An internal Guide on adapting to the situation (version March 25, 2020). The evaluation will be carried out remotely:

Desk review, including the following information sources:

- Project documents (logframe, budget, implementation plan, etc.)
- Progress reports and outputs
- Research and studies conducted by the Project
- Project finance documents and records
- Mission reports
- All other relevant document from the project

The desk review may suggest a number of preliminary findings that could be useful in reviewing or fine-tuning the evaluation questions. The desk review will include briefing interviews with the project team and the donor.

Online/email questionnaires and telephone and video interviews: due to travel restrictions and no possibility of face-to-face engagements with project staff and stakeholders, the evaluation will employ email/online questionnaires and especially virtual interviews to be conducted in Arabic (Egypt) or Arabic/French (Tunisia) as the main sources for information gathering – to replace field visits and face-to-face interviews. However, the report will be developed in English.

An indicative list of persons to be interviewed will be prepared by the Project in consultation with the Evaluation Manager. The project will support closely logistically the organization of these interviews.

This list will include:

- Ministry of Manpower,
- National Council for Women, Social Partners (Egypt)
- Ministry of women, and Ministry of social affairs, and social partners (Tunisia)
- Other relevant stakeholders
- Representatives of the donor (Finland) in Egypt and Tunisia
- Project team, ILO CO-Cairo, DWT/CO-Cairo and Tunis
- Project consultants
- ILO technical units at HQ

The desk review may suggest a number of preliminary findings that could be useful in reviewing or fine-tuning the evaluation questions. The desk review will include briefing interviews with the project team and the development partners.

Online/email questionnaires and specially telephone and video interview with project staff and stakeholders will take place to replace field visits and face-to-face interviews. An indicative list of persons to be interviewed will be prepared by the Project in consultation with the Evaluation Manager.

A virtual stakeholders' workshop will be organized to validate findings and complete data gaps with key stakeholders, ILO staff and partners.

At the end of the data collection process the evaluator will develop the draft report (see below deliverables for details). The draft will be subject of a methodological review by the evaluation manager and upon the necessary adjustments will be circulated among the key stakeholders. Then, the evaluation manager will consolidate the comments and will be provided to the evaluator for develop the final version addressing the comments or explain the reason for not address any, if that would be the case.

5. MAIN DELIVERABLES

- a) An inception report (not more than 20 pages excluding the annexes) - upon the review of available documents and an initial discussion with the project management and the donor (EVAL Guidelines –Checklist 3) will be developed. The inception report will:
- Describe the conceptual framework that will be used to undertake the evaluation;
 - Elaborate the methodology proposed in the TOR with changes as required;
 - Set out in some detail the data required to answer the evaluation questions, data sources by specific evaluation questions, (emphasizing triangulation as much as possible) data collection methods, and purposive sampling
 - Selection criteria for individuals for interviews (as much as possible should include men and women);
 - Detail the work plan for the evaluation, indicating the phases in the evaluation, their key deliverables and milestones;
 - Set out the list of key stakeholders to be interviewed and the tools to be used for interviews and discussions;
 - Set out the agenda for the stakeholders workshop;
 - Set out outline for the final evaluation report;
 - Interview guides and other data collection tools

The Inception report should be approved by the Evaluation manger before proceeding with the field work.

- b) Preliminary Findings to be shared with the key stakeholders (i.e. the Advisory Committee and the donor) at the end of the data collection phase (if conditions allow) in a virtual workshop connected in Cairo and Tunisia. The ILO will organize virtual meeting to discuss the preliminary findings of the evaluation after data collection is completed. The evaluator will set the agenda for the meeting. The presentation should provide a brief review of key results for each evaluation criteria. The workshop will be technically organized by the evaluation team with the logistic support of the project.
- c) First draft of Evaluation Report in English: the report should be no longer than 30 pages excluding annexes. The Evaluation Manger holds the responsibility of approving this draft. The draft review report will be shared with all relevant stakeholders and a request for comments will be asked within two weeks.
1. Cover page with key project and evaluation data
 2. Executive Summary
 3. Acronyms
 4. Context and description of the project including reported results
 5. Purpose, scope and clients of the evaluation
 6. Methodology and limitations

7. Findings (this section's content should be organized around evaluation criterion and questions), including a table showing output and outcome level results through indicators and targets planned and achieved and comments on each one.
 8. Conclusions
 9. Recommendations (i.e. for the different key stakeholders), indicating per each one priority, timeframe and level of resources required
 10. Lessons learned and good practices
 11. Annexes:
 - TOR
 - Inception report
 - List of people interviewed
 - Schedule of work (electronic data collection and virtual interviews)
 - Documents examined
 - Lessons learned and good practices (under EVAL formats)
 - Others
- d) Final version of the evaluation report incorporating comments received from ILO and other key stakeholders. Any identified lessons learnt and good practices will also need to have standard annex templates (one lesson learnt and one Good Practice per template to be annexed in the report) as per EVAL guidelines.

The final version is subjected to final approval by EVAL (after initial approval by the Evaluation manager/Regional evaluation officer)

- e) Executive summary in ILO EVAL template

The draft and final versions of the evaluation report will be in English (maximum 30 pages plus annexes) will be developed under the following structure:

1. Cover page with key project data (project title, project number, donor, project start and completion dates, budget, technical area, managing ILO unit, geographical coverage); and evaluation data (type of evaluation, managing ILO unit, start and completion dates of the evaluation mission, name(s) of evaluator(s), date of submission of evaluation report).
2. Table of contents
3. Acronyms
4. Executive Summary
5. Background of the project and its intervention logic
6. Purpose, scope and clients of evaluation
7. Methodology and limitations
8. Presentation of findings (by criteria)
9. Conclusions
10. Recommendations (including to whom they are addressed, resources required, priority and timing)
11. Lessons Learnt and potential good practices

12. Annexes (TOR, table with the status achieved of project indicators targets and a brief comment per indicator, list of people interviewed, Schedule of the field workoverview of meetings, list of Documents reviewed, Lessons and Good practices templates per each one, other relevant information).

The evaluation report will be in English following EVAL Checklists 5 and 6 (see Annex).

6. MANAGEMENT ARRANGEMENTS AND WORK PLAN

Evaluation Manager: the evaluation will be managed by Mr. Ricardo Furman, Senior Monitoring & Evaluation Officer, ILO Regional Office for Africa, who has not prior involvement in the project.

The evaluation manager is responsible for completing the following specific tasks:

- Draft and finalize the evaluation TOR with inputs from key stakeholders;
- Develop the Call for expression of interest and select the independent evaluator in coordination with EVAL;
- Brief the evaluator on ILO evaluation policies and procedures;
- Initial coordination with the project team on the development of the data collection process and the preliminary results workshop;
- Circulate the first draft of the evaluation report for comments by key stakeholders;
- Ensure the final version of the evaluation report address stakeholders' comments (or an explanation why any has not been addressed) and meets ILO requirements.

Independent Evaluation team

Qualifications

- University Degree with minimum 7 years of experience in project /program evaluation.
- Evaluation expertise in market analysis field and previous proven skills and experience in undertaking evaluations of similar projects, preferably in North African;
- Experience in using the Theory of change approach on evaluation.
- Strong background in local economic and enterprise development as well as Human Rights Based Approach programming and Results Based Management;
- In-depth knowledge of the local context, national policies in terms of development and existing national and international support programs,
- Extensive knowledge of, and experience in applying, qualitative and quantitative research methodologies;
- Knowledge of ILO's roles and mandate and its tripartite structure as well as UN evaluation norms and its programming is desirable;
- Excellent analytical skills and communication skills;
- Demonstrated excellent report writing and oral skills in English and oral Arabic.

- Oral and reading skills in French will be an asset.

TH evaluation will be conducted by an evaluation team. The evaluation team leader will be responsible for the report.

- **The tasks of the Project:**

The project management team will provide logistical support to the evaluator and will assist in organizing the data collection (documents and interviews). The projects will ensure that all relevant documentations are up to date and easily accessible (in electronic form in a space such as Google Drive) by the evaluator from the first day of the contract (desk review phase).

Evaluation Timetable and Schedule

The MTE will be conducted between May and July 2020.

List of Tasks	Responsible	Number of evaluation team working days	Time line (Tentative dates to be adjusted)
Selection of the consultant and contract signing	Evaluation manager	0	4-22 May 2020
Briefing with the evaluation manger, desk review of project documents, and development and submission of the Inception report	Evaluator	5	25-29 May 2020
Feedback and approval of the inception report	Evaluation manager	0	1-2 June 2020
Data collection	Evaluator	10	3-16 June 2020
Analysis of data collected and preparation of the draft report	Evaluator	5	20-24 June 2020
Review of the Zero Draft evaluation report	Evaluation manager	0	25– 26 June 2020
Circulate draft report among key stakeholders including the donor	Evaluation manager	0	29 June -3 July 2020
Consolidate feedback for sharing with the evaluator	Evaluation manager	0	6-7 July 2020
Finalize the report and submit to the evaluation manager	Evaluator	2	8-9 July 2020
Review for approval by the evaluation manager and EVAL	Evaluation manager and EVAL	0	13-17 July 2020
Total days		22	

Resources

Estimated resource requirements at this point:

- Evaluator honorarium for 22days
- Communication cost (lump sum)
- Virtual stakeholders' workshop

ANNEXES

RELEVANT POLICIES AND GUIDELINES

ILO Policy Guidelines for evaluation: Principles, rationale, planning and managing for evaluations, 3rd ed.

http://www.ilo.ch/eval/Evaluationpolicy/WCMS_571339/lang--en/index.htm

Code of conduct form (To be signed by the evaluators)

http://www.ilo.org/eval/Evaluationguidance/WCMS_206205/lang--en/index.htm

Checklist No. 3: Writing the inception report

http://www.ilo.org/eval/Evaluationguidance/WCMS_165972/lang--en/index.htm

Checklist 5: preparing the evaluation report

http://www.ilo.org/eval/Evaluationguidance/WCMS_165967/lang--en/index.htm

Checklist 6: rating the quality of evaluation report

http://www.ilo.org/eval/Evaluationguidance/WCMS_165968/lang--en/index.htm

Template for lessons learnt and Emerging Good Practices

http://www.ilo.org/eval/Evaluationguidance/WCMS_206158/lang--en/index.htm

http://www.ilo.org/eval/Evaluationguidance/WCMS_206159/lang--en/index.htm

Guidance note 7: Stakeholders participation in the ILO evaluation

https://www.ilo.org/global/docs/WCMS_165982/lang--en/index.htm

Guidance note 4: Integrating gender equality in the monitoring and evaluation of projects

http://www.ilo.org/eval/Evaluationguidance/WCMS_165986/lang--en/index.htm

Template for evaluation title page

http://www.ilo.org/eval/Evaluationguidance/WCMS_166357/lang--en/index.htm

Template for evaluation summary

<http://www.ilo.org/legacy/english/edmas/eval/template-summary-en.doc>

UNEG Ethical Guidelines for Evaluation

<http://www.unevaluation.org/document/download/548>

[Project Theory of change](#)

Annex 2: List of people interviewed

Schedule of work (electronic data collection and virtual interviews):

	Entity	Representative	Title	Date interviewed
	EGYPT			
	1.1 Project stakeholders			
1	The National Council for Women (NCW)	Ms. May Mahmoud	Head of the Women Business Skills Development Center	16.06
2	The Ministry of Manpower	Ms. Rasha Baset	Manager of international organization Department	23.06
3	The Ministry of Manpower	Ms. Amal Abdel Mawgoud	Undersecretary, Central department for foreign relations	23.06
4	Federation of Egyptian Industries (FEI)	Ms. Heba Hesham	Former coordinator of the Women in Business Unit	23.06
5	Federation of Egyptian Industries (FEI)	Ms. Basmah Osman	Senior Advisor to the Executive Director - Supervisor of the Gender Unit	23.06
6	Federation of Egyptian Industries (FEI)	Mr. Adel Nour El Din	Coordinator for Branches,	23.06
7	Federation of Egyptian Industries (FEI)	Ms. Suzette El Reedy	FEI Representative, Alexandria Branch	23.06
8	Egyptian Trade Union Federation (ETUF)	Mr. Mostafa Rostom	Head of the International Relations Department	04.07
9	Egyptian Trade Union Federation (ETUF)	Ms. Faten El Senawy	Member ETUF	04.07
10	Egyptian Trade Union Federation (ETUF)	Ms. Mona Habib	Vice President, Health Sciences Trade Union	04.07
11	Egyptian Democratic Labour Congress	Mr. Saad Shaaban	EDCL General Secretary	30.06
12	Micro/Small and Medium Enterprises Development Agency	Ms. Azza Shalaby	Head of the Gender Unit	06.07
	2.1. Beneficiaries			
13	NWC Cairo	Abeer Mohamed Abou Elela	Participant/trainer, NCW training Get Ahead/Financial Education training	29.06
14	NWC Cairo	Heba Abdel Moneim Hami	Participant/trainer, NCW training Get Ahead/Financial Education training	29.06
15	NWC Cairo	Mona Mohammed Hamdy	Participant/trainer, NCW training Get Ahead/Financial Education training	29.06
16	NWC Cairo	Karam Abdel Mala Melouka Khela	Participant/trainer, NCW training Get Ahead/Financial Education training	29.06
17	NWC outside Cairo	Mona Mostafa Ahmen Zahran	Participant/trainer, NCW training Get Ahead/Financial Education training	30.06
18	NWC outside Cairo	Hanan Saad Hassan Hussein	Participant/trainer, NCW training Get Ahead/Financial Education training	30.06
19	FEI member	Mahmoud Saber Afifi Metwali (#11 on list)	Trainee, HR Academy	30.06
20	FEI member	Essam Shehata Abdelgalil Altaman (#8)	Trainee, HR Academy	30.06
21	FEI member	Ahmed Adbelhalim Youness (#1)	Trainee, HR Academy	30.06
22	Upper Egypt Trade Union Federation (Under establishment)	Ms. Zeinab Foad	Member, Upper Egypt Trade Union Federation (Under establishment)	24.06

23	Upper Egypt Trade Union Federation (Under establishment)	Mr. Atef Mahmoud	Member, Upper Egypt Trade Union Federation (Under establishment)	22.06
	TUNISIA			
	1.2 Project stakeholders			
24	Ministère des Affaires Sociales	Mme Hayet ben Ismail	Présidente du Comité Général du Travail et des relations professionnelles : Membre du COPIL	23.06
25	Ministère des Affaires Sociales /Association Tunisienne des Inspecteurs du Travail (ATIT)	Mr Hatem ben Helal	Président de l'association	23.06
26	Ministère de la Femme, de la Famille, de l'Enfance et des Personnes âgées	Mr Anis Zahraz	Directeur de la femme	23.06
27	Ministère de la Femme, de la Famille, de l'Enfance et des Personnes âgées	Mme Hanen Benzarti	Cheffe de services	23.06
28	Ministère de la Formation Professionnelle et de l'Emploi	Mme Anissa Ayari	Directrice / membre du COPIL Ministry pf Vocational Training and Employment	25.06
29	Ministère de la Formation Professionnelle et de l'Emploi	M. Mounir Dakhli	Director for International Cooperation and External Relations, Ministry pf Vocational Training and Employment	25.06
30	L'Union Générale Tunisienne du Travail	Mr Samir Cheffi	Secrétaire Général adjoint chargé de la Section « Femme , jeunesse travailleuse et relation avec la Société Civile »	25.06
31	L'Union Générale Tunisienne du Travail	Mr Marwen Chérif	Responsable à la Section « Femme , jeunesse travailleuse et relation avec la Société Civile »	25.06
32	L'Union Générale Tunisienne du Travail	Badr Smaoui	Consultant auprès de la Section « protection Sociale »	25.06
33	La Chambre Nationale des Femmes Chefs d'Entreprises (CNFCE)	Leila Belkhiria	Présidente de la CNFCE / membre du COPIL	17.6
	2.2. Beneficiaries			
34	La Chambre Nationale des Femmes Chefs d'Entreprises (CNFCE)	Bureau Executif: Ms. Aida Beji Kallel	CNFCE, executive committee and business owner	24.06
35	La Chambre Nationale des Femmes Chefs d'Entreprises (CNFCE)	Ms. Nesrine ben Romdhane	CNFCE member &business owner	25.06
36	La Chambre Nationale des Femmes Chefs d'Entreprises (CNFCE)	Ms. Nedra Razgallah	CNFCE member &business owner	25.06
37	La Chambre Nationale des Femmes Chefs d'Entreprises (CNFCE)	Ms Saoussen Bayaoui	CNFCE member &business owner	25.06
38	UGTT	Mme Habiba Sellini	Coordinator of the national office of working women	06.07
39	UGTT	Mme Habida Labbaoui	Legal affairs office, UGTT	02.07
40	Inspection du travail/BIT formation de Kairouan	Mme Mouna Taous	Labour inspector	24.06
41	Inspection du travail/BIT formation de Kairouan	M. Sami Jaziri	Labour inspector	24.06
42	Inspection du travail/BIT formation de Kairouan (Monastir)	M. Karim Ajmi	Labour inspector	24.06

	3. EXPERTS			
	3.1 ILO Decent Work Team for North Africa (DWT)			
43	ILO Cairo	Mr. Eric Oechslin	Director, ILO Decent Work Team for North Africa	16.6
44	ILO Cairo	Mr. Luca Fedi	Employment Specialist	18.06
45	ILO Cairo	Ms. Wafaa Abdel Kader	Workers Activities Specialist	17.6
46	ILO Cairo	Mr. Sevane Ananian	Wages and Social Dialogue specialist	17.6
47	ILO Cairo	Mr. Coen Kompier	Senior ILS Specialist	17.6
48	ILO Cairo	Ms. Ines Ayari/ Ms. Samia Archella	Gender Focal Point, ILO Cairo (as from Jan 2019 & CTA of DWW National Coordinator, DWW Egypt	07.07
49	ILO Cairo	Mr. Mohamed Abdelhamid	JP project Coordinator	06.07
	3.2 ILO Geneva			
50	ILO Geneva	Ms. Charleine Mbuyi-lusamba	ENTERPRISE, SME Unit WED Technical Coordinator	22.06
51	ILO Geneva	Ms. Shauna Olney Head/Emanuela Pozzan	GED department, Gender Expert	30.06 (mail)
	3.3 Project consultants	2.3.1. EGYPT		
52	ECWR (Egypt Centre for Women Rights)	Ms. Nehad Abul Komsan (Gap Analysis Consultant)	Involved with the Gender-based Violence in the Workplace, Gap Analysis and process on C 190.	06-07
53	CISR Research Institute	Shaymaa Kadry	Impact of the Covid-19 on Women entrepreneurs in Egypt and Tunisia surveys	28.06
		2.3.2. TUNISIA		
54	University of Sfax	Nouri Mzid	Expert in Labour law	22.06
	3.4 Other experts			
55	Danish-Arab Partnership Programme	Sami Saidana	DAPP labour market specialist	15.06
56	Gender Network (Sub-regional Gender Workshop)	Mongia Elhadfy	Arab Labour Organisation, Gender Expert	29.06
	4. Finnish embassy			
57	Ministry of Foreign Affairs of Finland	Mr. Jan Koivu	Project Focal Point, Desk Officer for MENA ODA Department for Africa and the Middle East	16.06
58	Ministry of Foreign Affairs of Finland	Laura Desmoulin	Senior Adviser, Private Sector Development Department for Development Policy	24.06
59	Embassy of Finland to Tunisia	Ms. Anna Kokko	Deputy Head of Mission	12.06
60	Embassy of Finland to Tunisia	Ms. Emmiina Vesalainen	Programme Coordinator, Local Cooperation Fund	12.06
61	Embassy of Finland to Egypt	Mr. Markus Rätty Ms. Lotta Malmirinta	Head of Development Programme Coordinator, Local Cooperation Fund	25.06

Annex 3: Overview of documents consulted

1. PROJECT-RELATED DOCUMENTS:

1.1 Egypt:

1. Activities reports of all national partners
2. Correspondence with national partners
3. Media coverage
4. Minutes of meetings with partners
5. Publications by the project

1.2 Tunisia:

6. Activities reports of all national partners
7. Correspondence with national partners
8. Media coverage
9. Minutes of meetings with partners
10. Publications by the project

1.3 Gender portfolio:

11. Joint Gender portfolio' workplan
12. JP-ILO/UN Women project reports
13. Promoting gender-responsive workplaces, phase 1 and phase 2 – project reports

1.4 Overview of participants in key DWW activities:

14. Activities Egypt & Tunisia (training workshops and meetings 2019)

1.5 Project documents:

15. Budget
16. DWW phase 1 evaluation report
17. Financial statements for DWW (phase 2)
18. DWW PMF/project key indicators and monitoring
19. DWW technical progress reports, 2018 and 2019
20. DWW project document
21. Mission reports under the DWW
22. Steering committee minutes, DWW

2. OTHER DOCUMENTS:

23. National policies related to gender action plans (Egypt and Tunisia)
24. Other national development plans and frameworks (Egypt and Tunisia)
25. ILO key documents relating to Decent Work programs, Strategic Plan 2018-2021 and technical reports from ILO Homepage
26. UN development frameworks, including UNPDF Egypt 2018-2022 & UNPDF Tunisia 2014-2019
27. Technical background reports relating to labour market issues for women in Tunisia and Egypt (ILO Homepage and LO/FTF Labour Market profiles)
28. ILO evaluation guidelines (including annexes, guidelines and formats for reporting)
29. Finland's Strategy for Development Cooperation in MENA 2017-2020
30. ILO DWCP Tunisia
31. ILO Programme and Budget 2020-21

32. Gender project workplan 2020, ILO Cairo

33. ILO documents related to COVID response, including guidelines related to evaluations.

Annex 4: Overview of activities and outputs delivered

LFA update by 31.03.2020			
Outcome/output	Activity	2018	2019
Outcome 1 Enabling environment for gender equality in the workplace enhanced through an integrated approach with national partners and private companies.		- = activity held + = activity held, but not in plan/extra activity X= planned, not held	
Output 1.1 – Training and technical support programme developed and rolled out within public institutions so as to strengthen their gender-responsive policies and procedures.	Activity 1.1.1 – Prepare and carry out a training programme for governmental officers including labour inspectors on gender equality in the workplace.	- Training of 83 Labour Inspector /39 women-Nov 2018 (EGY)	- 70 labour inspectors training carried out, (TUN) - Labour inspector lead (TUN) participate in ILO Beirut meeting - Gender Academy for Egyptian partners (2019), first and second training
	Activity 1.1.2 – Review labour inspection checklists and develop other mechanisms to improve gender equality in recruitment, remuneration, OSH, leaves and social care.	- Guidelines amended for labour inspectors (EGY)	
	Activity 1.1.3 – Upscale and standardize successful company level sexual harassment/physical violence/psychological violence policies and structures in partnership with the Ministry of Manpower and the National Council for Women in Egypt, and the Ministry of Women Affairs and Ministry of Social Affairs in Tunisia.	+ gender-based violence in the Workplace Study/Egypt (2018) + + conference on rural women (TUN) (2018)	- Gender Unit set up (JAN 2019), EGYPT - Project assisted at first gender unit meeting/launch (2019), EGY - Awareness on C. 190 in TUN/MIN and social partners, 300 pax. For awareness raising + advocacy with ILO/16 days of activism (2019), EGY + information on C.190, EGY and TUN + Gap Analysis/rel to C. 190, EGY and TUN
	Activity 1.1.4 – Provide technical expertise to the formulation and implementation of revised maternity protection schemes in Egypt and in Tunisia including maternity, paternity and parental leave and funding mechanisms.	- MoSS discussions on protocol made by ILO SEC/SOC on maternity protection, EGY	
	Activity 1.1.5 – Support policy dialogue on the integration of gender equality in the workplace and in social dialogue mechanisms.		- EPIC for both GoT and GoE/pledged to join (2019) EGY & TUN

Output 1.2 – Gender responsive policies developed and promoted by employers’ and workers’ organizations and adopted by private companies.	Activity 1.2.1 – Provide training with employers’ organizations to company owners, HR and other managers on gender equality in labour relations and HR strategies	– FEI and follow up on participants for HR Academy (2018), EGY X overall approach with CNFCE mentioned in progress report(planned) (TUN)	- Women Business Unit on FEI payroll EGY - HR Academy in Alexandria, to date 70 participants, 60 companies trained, EGY - manuals developed for the HR Academy by the ILO gender projects, EGY - CNFCE HR Academy is reported fully sustainable(2019), TUN
	Activity 1.2.2 – Assist companies in developing and endorsing gender-responsive HR strategies.		- LI symposium and Charter for companies (Dec 2019), TUN
	Activity 1.2.3 – Develop specialized protection response measures at company level on sexual harassment/physical violence/psychological violence.	– workshop on gender and women’s rights for FEI members (2018), EGY X- gender audit planned with MSA (TUN)	
	Activity 1.2.4 – Support trade unions on the development of advocacy, monitoring, and response policies and mechanisms on gender equality in the workplace.	- Policy paper on trade unions on mainstreaming gender (2018, Egypt)	- Study on women in trade unions published/Egypt (see also 3.1) - Study on women in trade unions/UGTT (2019), TUN - Support to UGTTs work with C 183/two steps, leading to support position paper, TUN - Strategic training on gender awareness in Trade unions/Egypt - 2 TOT for 20 TU women leaders (13 graduated) Egypt
	Activity 1.2.5 – Collaborate with trade union(s) to jointly develop an outreach training strategy on labour relations and gender equality.		
Output 1.3 – Advocacy and knowledge sharing efforts provided by national partners on women and employment.	Activity 1.3.1 – Conduct joined awareness raising campaigns on gender equality and decent work with national partners.		X FEI conference (planned) EGY + -partnered with the OECD:Study on Legal and Policy Reforms that Promote Women Economic Empowerment in Selected MENA countries
	Activity 1.3.2. Build a network of experts and support the sharing of experiences among the project partners in the two countries and with Finland.		– sub-regional workshop held in Tunis/end 2019, TUN & EGY + -Conference on Making Rural Areas more attractive to Youth (Cairo)
GAP – kunne være vigtig!!	Activity 1.3.3. Hold a regional conference (North Africa) on women and employment		
Outcome 2 Enabling environment for women’s entrepreneurship development enhanced			
Output 2.1 – Relevant entrepreneurship policies and programmes are reviewed, designed, developed to include gender-responsive measures.	Activity 2.1.1 Support institutional partners in reviewing, adapting, and developing their policies, programmes and services to improve access of women entrepreneurs to finance, business development services, markets and technology	- WED position paper developed with FEI (2018), EGY - WED position paper developed with CNFCE (Manifesto), TUN	- WED launch in both EGY and TUN (for 200 participants and 100 participants, respectively)

	Activity 2.1.2 – Develop coordinated action at the national level on the formalization of women entrepreneurs operating in the informal economy to complement and support relevant initiatives at the local level (under Output 2.3)		
Output 2.2 – Private initiatives to better engage women-owned enterprises in supply chains developed.	Activity 2.2.1 – Prepare and implement studies on the participation of women owned enterprises in supply chains in selected sectors	X Partners have asked for a different approach compared to project document	- Follow up from project and plan amended (TUN and EGY)
	Activity 2.2.2 – Support the development of Corporate Social Responsibility initiatives (alongside materials' development) to acknowledge and support the inclusion of business women in the targeted supply chains.		
Output 2.3 – Networks of national partners in private sector development capacity to support women's economic empowerment strengthened.	Activity 2.3.1 – Identify partners at the national and local levels (among local authorities, women machineries, business associations, NGOs, BDS providers, and business groups) with the view to create local committees capable of developing coordinated local economic empowerment programmes.	As above	As above
	Activity 2.3.2 – Conduct local assessments to identify income generating activities.		
	Activity 2.3.3 – Conduct TOTs on WED tools for organizations' members in the local committees.		
Output 2.4. Value-chain development initiatives for specific community-driven cluster development facilitated	Activity 2.4.1 – Design intervention models at the local level capable of enhancing the inclusion of women groups in the targeted areas through value chains.		- Assessment of value chains and local economic development/Egypt/NCW/2019) - ITC Rural development academy (one from each of the three partners) /2019,
	Activity 2.4.2 – Provide the technical support for local partners including BDS providers to implement the identified upgrading solutions for the value chains		
Output 2.5. New job opportunities created through formal micro-small business development.	Activity 2.5.1 – Form and train producer groups/cooperatives in the targeted areas to raise their understanding and skills on issues, such as formalization; creation of cooperatives, business skills development, training on business group formation.		- GA training carried out/Egypt/NCW/early 2020 X GA training under planning with CNFCE and other partners, TUN
	Activity 2.5.2 – Conduct training and post-training to women in the targeted areas with the view to provide non-financial support services, such as production techniques		

	improvements, marketing support, access to financial services, infrastructure facilities provision, monitoring and improvement of working conditions (including OSH).		
Output 2.6. Micro-finance institutions supported to achieve main goals of Egypt's financial inclusion national plans	Activity 2.6.1. Adapt and develop training to tools for micro-finance providers on gender equality		- Financial education training carried out/Egypt/NCW and financial institutions + initiative under way with Attajari Bank and CNFCE, TUN
	Activity 2.6.2. Train and provide technical support to micro-finance providers to promote financial inclusion		
Outcome 3: Women leadership in workers and employers' organizations improved			
Output 3.1 – Training programme developed and rolled out among new women members of workers and employers' organizations with the aim to enhance their access to leadership positions.	Activity 3.1.1 – Train UGTT board members (from local, sectoral and national levels) with the view to implement the quota of 2 reserved seats for women in all boards (already adopted in the project first phase).	- workshop w/committees in UGTT on revision of law on public servants, TUN	
	Activity 3.1.2 – Train women leaders in Egyptian trade unions (training manual developed under the first phase and first series of training conducted).	- Trade union study on women's participation in Egypt (2018)	- See training and TOT for trade unions in Egypt (mentioned above) X proposed leadership programme planned/Egypt/FEI X proposed leadership programme planned (TUN, UGTT and CNFCE)
	Activity 3.1.3 – Train employers' organizations to develop specific services to attract, maintain and serve women members.		- FEI and CNFCE/ ITC training in Turin on entrepreneurship, TUN and EGY
	Activity 3.1.4 Train and coach women leaders (current and potential) on both national and local levels.		X coaching and leadership activity with CNFCE, integrating new members elected on congress in 2017, TUN

Annex 5: Lessons Learned

ILO Lesson Learned Template

Project Title: Decent Work for Women (phase2)

Project TC/SYMBOL: N/A

Name of Evaluator: Martin Østergaard

Date: 14.07.2020

The following lesson learned has been identified during the course of the evaluation. Further text explaining the lesson may be included in the full evaluation report.

LL Element	Text
Brief description of lesson learned (link to specific action or task)	The COVID crisis has to a large extent put many activities on hold, and will no doubt have a profound impact on the project. The initial response has been crisis response, assuming that the COVID crisis was a temporary thing. However, as time goes on, the emerging picture is that the crisis will stay for longer than expected, and that the effects will only become clearer with time. Therefore, the immediate response will most likely be replaced by a more long-term realization of conditions that have permanently changed. This will also be true for the stakeholders under the DWW project, and there will be a need to rethink interventions on the assumption that the constraints imposed by COVID to some extent will remain permanent.
Context and any related preconditions	Therefore it is key to assess how adaptations should be made also in the longer timeframe. Issues such as localized solutions, and protection of human and natural resources will most likely become integral to future interventions, and will need to be elaborated also at the level of project management (LFA together with tools for adaptability).
Targeted users / Beneficiaries	The effect of the COVID crisis affects all stakeholders, however, is in particular relevant for women entrepreneurs
Challenges /negative lessons - Causal factors	Small businesses close down, employees are laid off, small entities are unable to keep their business going. Other effects are more domestic violence, and poor health conditions as a result of the lockdown.

<p>Success / Positive Issues - Causal factors</p>	<p>Among the few positive effects are the emergence of new products related to digital products, and new clients searching for alternatives. This has to some extent had a positive effect. However, the DWW project will review how this can be explored further through two studies on the effect of the COVID 19 in Tunisia and Egypt.</p>
<p>ILO Administrative Issues (staff, resources, design, implementation)</p>	<p>Resources have been allocated to do:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - two studies on COVID 19 - digitalise the Get Ahead in Egypt. <p>Follow up as a consequence of findings will require time and inputs from project staff, ILO experts, partner organisations and beneficiaries</p>

Annex 6: Emerging Good Practice

ILO Emerging Good Practice Template

Project Title: Decent Work for Women, Egypt & Tunisia phase 2
Project TC/SYMBOL: N/A

Name of Evaluator: Martin Østergaard
Date: 14.07.2020

The following emerging good practice has been identified during the course of the evaluation. Further text can be found in the full evaluation report.

GP Element	Text
<p>Brief summary of the good practice (link to project goal or specific deliverable, background, purpose, etc.)</p>	<p>The DWW project has managed to promote gender equality among ILO partners over period of more than 8 years since 2012. During this period, a network has been built up between key gender experts, government, trade unions and employers in Egypt and Tunisia, and with the donor. This continuity has allowed for results to mature and materialize.</p>
<p>Relevant conditions and Context: limitations or advice in terms of applicability and replicability</p>	<p>During the same period, the ILOs portfolio in gender equality has expanded, and the team has grown and extended its reach within the different areas of the ILOs expertise. This cooperation is now also integrated further with important national strategic plans on gender equality and with the UN. The process undertaken has kept a focus on gender as a proactive field of cooperation, and showed that important changes can be made, provided that the approach and the framing of this issues at stake are made in such a way that partners find an interest to engage and support a process for change.</p>
<p>Establish a clear cause-effect relationship</p>	<p>The evidence suggests that results are achieved through processes where project staff/ILO experts and partners decide on activities to influence ongoing processes and opportunities.</p>
<p>Indicate measurable impact and targeted beneficiaries</p>	<p>Results achieved at macro and meso levels according to project outcome indicators.</p>

Potential for replication and by whom	<p>The results achieved here can be replicated. It can be made more systematic by including tools such as stakeholder analysis in a regular and systematic way, or by defining intermediate goals in processes leading to e.g. legislation.</p>
Upward links to higher ILO Goals (DWCPs, Country Programme Outcomes or ILO's Strategic Programme Framework)	<p>Explore linkages to the ILOs "Diversity Dividend" under outcome 6 of the Programme and Budget.</p> <p>Explore links to the DWCP re: the role of gender equality as a technical focus area for moving other processes forward..</p>
Other documents or relevant comments	<p>N/A</p>