



The Final Review of the Palestinian Decent Work Programme (DWP)

Final Review Summary Report

Wael Zakkar

July 2022

A-Background

The situation in the Occupied Palestinian Territory (OPT) continues to be characterized by a stalled peace process, increased political instability, heightened tensions and the dire economic challenges that continue to be posed by the ongoing Israeli occupation. This applies to the Palestinian economy's potential to achieve growth, to create employment opportunities that counter poverty and combat low wages, to cater for the needs of the growing number of people seeking to enter the labour market every year, and to include and retain more poorer women in the labour market. The risks of pervasive unemployment have been heightened by the outbreak of COVID-19, resulting in lockdown and movement restrictions.

The most important challenges facing the Palestinian labour market include: poor employment opportunities and services; dispersed and poor linkages, incomplete tripartite institutionalization; limited governance of the vocational education and training system; labour relations and conditions that do not comply to the standards of decent work; lack of national consensus and suitable tools for social security; limited capacities of the three partner institutions (Ministry of Labour, Palestinian General Federation of trade Unions (PGFTU) and the Palestinian Federation of Chambers of Commerce, Industry and Agriculture (PFCCIA)) leading and delivering sectoral services with its different components; weak coordination between relevant stakeholders on effectively and efficiently reorienting interventions and programmes and managing the gap between demand for and the supply of labour¹.

To overcome such these challenges, the ILO has been providing support to the Ministry of Labour and the social partners in developing a multi-year Decent Work Programme (DWP). The programme defines priorities, outcomes and activities. Tripartite stakeholders and other key partners should, with the support of the ILO, adopt and implement measures aimed at attaining and promoting full employment and ensuring access for all men and women to decent and productive work while fulfilling conditions of freedom, equity, security, and human dignity. Based on both an integrated and participatory programmatic approach and on results-based management (RBM), the DWP identifies priority areas of intervention, short and medium-term strategic outcomes and provides an operational action plan for the implementation of measures designed to achieve these outcomes while defining the roles of each of the different tripartite stakeholders and other key partners.

The first phase of the Decent Work Programme was launched and implemented during the period 2013-2016. A number of goals were achieved in the first phase of implementation as reflected in a final review conducted by the ILO in the second half of 2016. One of the main achievements under the first DWP was the development and enactment of the first-ever social security law for private-sector workers by the President of OPT on 30 September 2016 based on ILO Standards.

The second phase of the DWP, for the period 2018-2022, was developed and launched not only to follow up on the first phase but also as a response to the needs and priorities identified by tripartite partners as a result of extensive consultations. The second DWP 2018-2022, like the first one, creates a framework for collaboration between the Palestinian Authority, through the Ministry of Labour, and social partners on various aspects linked to the three pillars of the Decent Work Agenda and the ILO Declaration on Fundamental Principles and Rights at Work with technical and financial assistance from the ILO. Based on the results of consultation with the tripartite partners, the second DWP defined three priorities:: Priority 1. Enhance employment and livelihood opportunities for Palestinian women and men. Priority 2. Strengthen labour governance and the realization of fundamental principles and rights at work through freedom of association, strengthened collective bargaining and improved social dialogue mechanisms and

¹ State of Palestine, Ministry of Labour of Palestine (2020), Labour Sector Strategy 2021-2023; The road to decent work and employment opportunities improvement, April 2020.

Priority 3. Support the implementation and development of the Palestinian social security system and the extension of social protection to all.

A number of target outcomes were defined for each priority. To achieve these outcomes, ILO has implemented projects with tripartite partners. These projects are either directly funded by donors or through the Regular Budget Supplementary Account (RBSA). The list of all projects includes the following:

- 1-PSE 152 RBSA - Strengthened tripartite institutions and social dialogue processes for improved socioeconomic response to the impact of the COVID-19-pandemic that is in line with international labour standards and Human Rights treaties.
- 2-PSE 17 01 UNW – Promoting Women’s Equal Access to Economic Decent Work in Palestine.
- 3-PSE 19 02 UNW - Promoting Women’s Equal Access to Economic Opportunities and Decent Work, Phase II.
- 4-PSE/19/01/ITA Cooperative Support Programme for Palestine (CSP-OPT).
- 5-PSE/17/03/SPE Land and Rights – Paths to Social and Solidarity Economy in Palestine.
- 6-PSE/16/01/PDF “Promoting entrepreneurship education and business start-up for Palestinian youth”.
- 7-PSE 18 02 FAO - Agreement No 9542095 Capacity development support to Palestinian agricultural cooperatives and relevant Palestinian NGOs and Ministries.
- 8-PSE 152 RBSA Workplace compliance is improved to better protect labour rights and promote safe and secure working environments for women and men workers in line with national laws and regulations and international standards.
- 9-PSE/17/02/QAT Establishing an Independent Social Security Institution for the Administration of the New Social Security System for Private Sector Workers and their Family Members in Palestine.
- 10-PSE 151 RBSA A comprehensive social security strategy to enhance coverage to Palestinians women and men is developed in line with international labour standards – Phase I and II.
- 11-PSE2101 EUR Strengthening nexus coherence and responsiveness in the Palestinian social protection sector.
- 12-PSP 2019 PAL Towards a universal and holistic social protection floor for persons with disabilities (PwD) and older persons (OP) in the State of Palestine Joint Programme.

The second DWP 2018-2022 is now approaching completion and a review is now necessary in order to identify the lessons learned from its implementation and to inform the formulation of the new DWP. This must focus on national goals based on existing national needs with regard to decent work, the Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs), the United Nations Development Assistance Framework (UNDAF) 2018-2022 and the National Policy Agenda (NPA) 2017-2022.

B-Scope and methodology of the DWP final review

The final review of the Palestinian Decent Work Programme (DWP) assessed the results of the programme under the five headings of Relevance and coherence, Validity of design and evaluability, Effectiveness and Partnership, Efficiency, Effectiveness, Sustainability and Impact.

A set of evaluation questions has been drawn up with the purpose of drawing conclusions about the success of the programme in terms of its triple strategy approaches: 1-Enhancing employment and livelihood opportunities for Palestinian women and men, 2-Strengthening labour governance and realizing fundamental principles and rights at work through freedom of association, strengthened collective

bargaining and improved social dialogue mechanism, 3-Supporting the implementation and development of the Palestinian social security system and the extension of social protection to all.

The final review was based on an initial desk review, interviews with ILO OPT Team, ROAS DWT and a series of interviews with line stakeholders, mainly tripartite stakeholders to answer the questions posed in the. The final review adopted Results-Based, Human Rights-Based and gender-sensitive approaches. It also referred to specific ILO norms while taking into consideration the United Nations Evaluation Group standards and those of the quality evaluation of the OECD/DAC.

C- Relevance and strategic fit of the Decent Work Programme

C.1-Strategic alignment and extent of harmony with national development plans

The Decent Work Programme 2018-2022 was aligned in terms of design with national Palestinian strategic priorities as reflected in the Palestinian National Policy Agenda 2017-2022: Putting Citizens First. The latter consists of three pillars: Path to Independence, Government Reform and Sustainable Development, defined under each National Priority and National Policy. Each of the three priorities of the Decent Work Programme corresponds to a particular policy under the different national priorities and pillars of the NPA.

In addition to the Palestinian National Policy Agenda 2017-2022, the DWP was also in accordance with sectoral strategies and Action Plans.

Its three priorities were in harmony with the axes of the Labour Sector Strategy. On one hand the first priority “Enhancing employment and livelihood opportunities for Palestinian women and men” is in accordance with the sub-strategic axes: Reducing unemployment rates in OPT; Developing the vocational and technical system to provide skilled workers according to labour market needs; Empowering the role of cooperatives in employment; Strengthening the labour sector’s human and financial capacities and enhancing its role at local and international levels; Promoting cooperative principles and concepts as means for socioeconomic development; Providing support and expanding the base for cooperatives with sustainable and viable business ideas; and Continuing to develop the structure and legal framework for the cooperative sector.

On the other hand, the second priority of the DWP, “strengthening labour governance and the realization of fundamental principles and rights at work through improved dialogue mechanisms” is also in harmony with the following sub-axes of the Labour Sector Strategy: - Promote Decent work by national OSH policy framework and well developed labour administration system; Reform and development of the legal framework of the labour sector; Working continuously to provide the legal environment and practical requirements for a social protection system; Fill gaps in legal framework to enable development of economic and social policies; Enhancing tripartite relationship in accordance with law provisions and collective agreements; Promote freedom of association; Promoting social dialogue as a means for developing and regulating the labour sector.

As for the third DWP priority, “Support the implementation and development of the Palestinian social security system and the extension of social protection to all”, it is in harmony with the sub-axes of the Labour Sector Strategy: - Working continuously to provide the legal environment and practical requirements for a social protection system and Fill gaps in legal framework to enable development of economic and social policies.

Furthermore, the main DWP areas of intervention are also in harmony with the Social Development Sector Strategy (updated for 2021-2023). It should be noted that this strategy has defined strategic

outcomes under social protection while designating governmental institutions responsible for implementation. In this regard the strategy encompasses the following outcomes particularly supported by the DWP, under the responsibility of the Ministry of Labour:

-Empowerment and employment programs for the unemployed; Establishing agricultural cooperatives for women and youth, as well as building the capacities of cooperatives under outcome 2.1 Poor households and marginalized groups social and economically empowered.

-Activate working according to the social security law after realizing further consensus around it under outcome 2.2. Social Security.

Furthermore, the strategy includes outcomes under the responsibility of the Ministry of Social Development that are supported by the Decent Work Programme:

-Development of social protection system to be more flexible and capable of quick response under crises as well as various outputs related to building up the national social protection floor under outcome 2.1 Establishing the foundation for social protection.

C.2-Extent of aligning of the Decent Work Programme with the United Nations Development Assistance Framework (UNDAF) for Palestine

The Palestinian Decent Work Programme 2018- 2022 was developed in complete harmony with the UNDAF 2018-2022 for the State of Palestine. The UNDAF for 2018-2022 is framed around four fundamental strategic priorities, on the basis of the principle 'Leave No One Behind' from the 2030 Agenda: 1-Supporting Palestine's path to independence; 2-Supporting equal access to accountable, effective and responsive democratic governance for all Palestinians; 3-Leaving No One Behind: supporting sustainable and inclusive economic development; 4-Leaving No One Behind: social development and protection. The Decent Work Programme's three strategic priorities fall under three of the four fundamental UNDAF strategic priorities, i.e nos. 2, 3 and 4.

C.3-Strategic alignment with SDGs

The DWP was strategically aligned with the SDGs. The first priority of the DWP, "Enhance employment and livelihood opportunities for Palestinian women and men" and the outcomes under this priority are compatible with SDG No 8, "Promote sustained, inclusive and sustainable economic growth, full and productive employment and decent work for all", SDG No 16 "Peace and Justice Strong Institutions", SDG No 17 "Partnerships to achieve the Goal", SDG No 4 "Quality Education", while all three outcomes under the first priority are also in harmony with SDG No 5 "Gender Equality" as well as SDG No 10 "Reduced inequality".

As with regard to priority 2, "Strengthen labour governance and the realization of fundamental principles and rights at work through improved social dialogue mechanisms" and the outcomes under this priority are compatible with SDG No 5: Achieve Gender Equality and empower all women and girls" as well as SDG 16, "Promote peaceful and inclusive societies for sustainable development, provide access to justice for all and build effective, accountable and inclusive institutions at all levels". Furthermore, the outcomes under this priority are aligned with SDG No 8 "Decent Work and Economic Growth", SDG 10 "Reduced inequality", SDG 3 "Good Health and Well-Being", and SDG 17 "Partnerships to achieve the Goal".

As for the third priority of the DWP, "Support the implementation and development of the Palestinian social security system and the extension of social protection to all" and the outcomes under this priority

are all aligned with SDG No 1 “End poverty in all its forms everywhere”, SDG 2 “Zero Hunger”, SDG No 10 “Reduce inequality within and among countries” and SDG No 5 “ Achieve Gender Equality and empower all women and girls”.

C.4-Relevance of the DWP in terms of International Labour Standards:

The Palestinian DWP is based on International Labour Standards encompassing different ILO conventions, protocols and recommendations such as: C122 - Employment Policy Convention, 1964 (No. 122), C144 - Tripartite Consultation (International Labour Standards) Convention, 1976 (No. 144), R189 - Job Creation in Small and Medium-Sized Enterprises Recommendation, 1998 (No. 189), C095 - Protection of Wages Convention, 1949 (No. 95), C131 - Minimum Wage Fixing Convention, 1970 (No. 131), C100 - Equal Remuneration Convention, 1951 (No. 100), C111 - Discrimination (Employment and Occupation) Convention, 1958 (No. 111), C158 - Termination of Employment Convention, 1982 (No. 158), C087 - Freedom of Association and Protection of the Right to Organise Convention, 1948 (No. 87), C154 - Collective Bargaining Convention, 1981 (No. 154), C081 - Labour Inspection Convention, 1947 (No. 81), C155 - Occupational Safety and Health Convention, 1981 (No. 155), C102 - Social Security (Minimum Standards) Convention, 1952 (No. 102), R202 - Social Protection Floors Recommendation, 2012 (No. 202)...etc.

C.5-Extent of National ownership

ILO adopted a concrete participatory approach and partnership with tripartite stakeholders in the planning, design and approval of the DWP. The three partners were deeply involved in the process from the beginning, as reflected in the DWP planning and design phases. This ownership was concretized during the implementation of the DWP, with the Ministry of Labour, PFCCIA and PGFTU being highly involved in different social dialogue sessions. For example, during COVID-19, the tripartite committee established to review the national minimum wage within the framework of implementation of the RBSA project (PSE/20/01/RBS Strengthened tripartite institutions and social dialogue processes for improved socioeconomic response to the impact of the COVID-19 pandemic) met almost 30 times².

D-Validity of the Design

D.1- Coherence and realism of the Programme’s priorities and outcomes

Decent Work Country Programmes are the main platform for the delivery of ILO support to countries, promoting decent work itself, as well as providing technical and administrative support to tripartite partners, allowing them to take advantage of ILO comparative advantage.

The second phase of the Palestinian Decent Work Programme has defined three priorities:

Priority 1: Enhance employment and livelihood opportunities for Palestinian women and men

² Meetings with PFCCIA, PGFTU and ILO OPT.

Priority 2: Strengthen labour governance and the realization of fundamental principles and rights at work through freedom of association, strengthened collective bargaining and improved social dialogue mechanisms.

Priority 3: Support the implementation and development of the Palestinian social security system and the extension of social protection to all

These three priorities are the same as the first Decent Work Programme (2013-2016), although more specific, measurable results have been defined under each heading. Three outcomes were defined for each strategic priority, with a total of 9 outcomes for the Decent Work Programme. In terms of coherence, the outcomes defined under each strategic intervention priority are coherent with the associated priority.

D.2-Relevance of the programme indicators

At the level of indicators, it should be noted that three indicators were adopted under each outcome. Some of these indicators are output-oriented, related to the development of an action plan, policy or law, while others are outcome- or impact-oriented indicators in nature. Most of the indicators are relevant. Nevertheless the following remarks should be noted:

On one hand it should be noted that the sets of indicators included under each outcome included only the definition of the indicators. There are no baselines or targets fixed for the indicators. The absence of baselines and targets hampers the utility of the outcome and impact indicators in a results-based approach. On the other hand, some of the indicators are not relevant relative to the context, nature and extent of interventions and the tripartite monitoring system. This applies to indicator 1.2.1 (Percentage of young women and men with improved knowledge and attitude as a result of the flagship entrepreneurship programmes (such as KAB, GYB and SYB), indicator 1.2.2. (Average improvement in productivity and work conditions among enterprises benefiting from performance enhancement services provided by national enterprise support organizations), indicator 2.2.2 (percentage of employers and workers with improved knowledge on freedom of association, social dialogue and representation). Finally, some indicators adopted could not reflect the performance, weight or qualitative dimension of implementation. For example, indicator 1.1.2 (Number of initiatives implemented by PFESP that are aligned with the National Action Plan).

D.3-Gender coherence and extent of shaping women's rights priorities in terms of design.

Gender equality and relevant aspects are explicitly mentioned in the priorities, outcomes, structure and indicators of the Palestinian Decent Work Programme. Furthermore, it should be noted that interventions went beyond what was planned in the JP framework, particularly through the implementation of the two focused programmes on gender equality and decent work.

Gender Equality is also taken into consideration at the level of the monitoring and evaluation of certain indicators but not all. For example, indicator 2.1.1 should have included a clear gender aspect in terms of definition, to become 'Concrete proposals are developed on the harmonization of the Labour Law with the needs of the labour market and international labour standards including those targeting enhancing employment and decent work conditions and equity for Palestinian women'. This is to tackle the context where the large predominance of women workers are in lower paying and informal jobs with little or no protection, as reflected in the justification of the outcome itself. Furthermore, all indicators should have been combined with baseline and target indicators, including gender segregated baselines and target

indicators, in order to bring about concrete monitoring of the progress, including in terms of Gender equality targets.

E-Programme Progress and Effectiveness

E.1- Progress and Effectiveness in terms of priorities and outcomes:

Priority 1. Enhance employment and livelihood opportunities for Palestinian women and men

Outcome 1.1. Enhanced capacity of government and social partners to strategize on employment and labour market policies and programmes

Achievements:

Evidence-based policy planning is required in order to address the employment crisis. The Ministry of Labour has taken steps to improve the analysis of the labour market in order to implement solutions that will foster job creation. This has been carried out with ILO support and in collaboration with social partners, highlighted by the creation of a National Employment Strategy for the first time in the latter stages of 2020, covering the years 2021 to 2025. This strategy will ensure the coordination of all interventions in the labour market, as well as offering the opportunity for ownership for all relevant stakeholders. The genesis of this strategy was a national team coordinated by the Ministry of Labour, with the initial groundwork taking place in late 2019.

As an example of the evidence-based planning underpinning current tripartite action and incorporated into the National Employment Strategy, the ILO conducted a study from April to July 2020 on the Palestinian labour market in the context of the pandemic, given the economic damage caused by lockdown measures in the territory. Two main categories of policy prescriptions were developed as a result. On one hand, the immediate impact of lockdown should be addressed, targeting vulnerable cohorts with short-term supports. On the other hand, at the structural level, it was suggested that measures be taken to foster indigenous industry and reduce dependency on the Israeli economy.

The ILO also provided baseline figures in relation to national Public Employment Services capacity in terms of supports for jobseekers and engagement levels, adapting midstream to take account of the lockdown context. Employment Services will be a key mechanism for implementation of the National Employment Strategy. Recommendations to assist employment supports in being responsive in the current public health crisis have already been made available, with the full set of policy prescriptions currently being finalised.

Outcome 1.2. Government and social partners will have agreed and implemented concrete measures to improve the business environment through business development services, cooperatives and entrepreneurship education targeting women and men

Cooperatives

Achievements

In line with the Promotion of Cooperatives Recommendation, 2002 (No. 193), the ILO works with government and other partners to reform the cooperative sector. Central to this objective is their support for the Cooperative Work Agency (CWA) to become an independent commission as CWA, on the basis of the newly adopted cooperative law in November 2017, with the purpose of regulating, promoting and providing administrative services for cooperatives in the OPT. At a later stage, CWA triggered revisions of Cooperative Law No. (20) of 2017, to help enable the CWA to fulfil its mandate and functions. The support of ILO was requested in this regard. The revisions were consistent with the Promotion of Cooperatives Recommendation, 2002 (No. 193), as well as available best practices. ILO oversaw a participatory consultative process, involving a wide range of stakeholders, provided technical support and fostered debate, tabling remarks and draft amendments. The draft revisions of the law were concluded in September 2020 and presented to the Board of the Agency for endorsement. They are still pending this endorsement. Once endorsed, they should be translated into a project of law of cooperatives to be approved and issued by presidential decree. In addition to the revision of "Decree Law No. (20) of 2017 on Cooperative Associations, ILO assisted the CWA in the preparation of by-laws pertaining to the establishment of the Agency's promotional entities, the Cooperative Training Institute (CTI) and the Cooperative Development Fund (CDF). By early 2021, the relevant by-laws had been prepared and submitted to the Board of Directors of the Cooperative Work Agency for deliberation and endorsement. Finally, a Strategy of the Cooperatives Sector 2017-2022 was developed before phase II of the DWP. Nevertheless, this strategy was recently subject to an update to cover the years 2021-2023, taking into account COVID-19 impact on the sector, within the framework of the DWP.

Outcome 1.3. The TVET skills development center will have piloted and replicated innovative applications on skills and employability

Achievements

No concrete achievements have been reported under this outcome.

Priority 2. Strengthen labour governance and the realization of fundamental principles and rights at work through freedom of association, strengthened collective bargaining and improved social dialogue mechanism

Outcome 2.1 Improved working conditions and labour rights for all women and men workers, and strengthened labour related legislation and mechanisms in line with international standards and Human Rights treaties.

Achievements

Palestinian labour legislation needs to be reformed if labour market conditions are to improve and employment rights are to be ensured. This can best be achieved through social dialogue among tripartite partners. The ILO has played a key role in facilitating such dialogue and providing technical support. A key meeting took place in September 2019, leading to 16 new recommendations for amendments to the labour legislation in the context of the 2019 Violence and Harassment Convention. In March 2022, a large bipartite meeting between PFCCIA and PGFTU took place, with the support of ILO and the participation of other employers' and workers' federations and sectoral unions, to discuss further eventual amendments. This resulted in a signed agreement between employers and workers. It is also worth bearing in mind that ILO support under this outcome in this specific area of labour reform also included the provision of a technical note on the gaps in the labour law against the ILS, in addition to a review of the labour law from a Gender equality perspective. Furthermore, to ensure engagement of CSOs in the labour law review

process, ILO supported the establishment of a coalition between the PGFTU and CSOs for reform of the labour law.

Despite delays due to the public health context, an extensive consultation process has taken place with employer and labour organisations, which has led to significant progress and agreement on legal mechanisms to protect workers against discrimination and ensure that employment rights are respected. More time is required to resolve certain sticking points, however, but the ILO continues to assist with finding solutions and ensure that all parties remain open to dialogue. Discussions are also ongoing in relation to the national minimum wage, and although the issue has not yet been resolved due to differences of opinion among various employers, a revised national minimum wage of ILS 1,880 was agreed for the OPT. This process has been informed by the ILO study on the minimum wage, as presented to the National Wages Committee in July 2019. The issue of a national minimum wage has become more prominent recently in the context of lockdowns due to the COVID-19 pandemic.

The latter Wages Committee was originally set up at the beginning of 2013 as a result of the Labour Law of 2000, and was reactivated through a series of meetings in 2018 – 2019. As the main target of DWP at the level of social dialogue is the institutionalization of social dialogue, it is noted that the Labour Law of 2000 established two leading tripartite mechanisms: the Wages Committee referred to above, and the Tripartite Labour Policies Committee. The ongoing discussions on a national minimum wage have included civil society organizations on a number of occasions as well as the tripartite partners. The Labour Policies Committee is supposed to be the main forum for tripartite cooperation and social dialogue. However, the Committee held only a few meetings before 2015 and did not meet at all between 2015 and 2020. It was reactivated in 2020 and its role was underlined for the preparation of the National Social Dialogue Conference in March 2021.

In June 2021, the ILO launched a review of social dialogue in Palestine to identify institutional deficits and capacity shortfalls, increase efficiency, define objectives, and seek to concretize social dialogue on an institutional basis at all levels. This is an evolution of ongoing progress, building on the tripartite agreement of March 2020 and the recommendations of the Social Dialogue Conference of March 2021.

Outcome 2.2 Capacity of workers' and employers' organizations is strengthened to ensure responsive, inclusive, participatory and representative decision-making in line with national and international standards.

Achievements

Within the perspective of this outcome, ILO provided significant capacity building activities to workers' and employers' organizations combined with knowledge acquisition, advocacy, institutionalization and policy development activities. A number of training sessions for workers and employers took place in 2019, facilitated by the ILO. Topics included collective bargaining, negotiation, governance, organisational and managerial capacity, engagement in socio-economic dialogue, health and safety, and representing one's mandate. The ILO also launched an awareness raising campaign targeting female workers in the childcare and education sectors, leading to increased trade union membership and the establishment of work committees. Future capacity building interventions will emphasise cohorts employed in poor working conditions. The ILO also collaborated with UN Women to map civil society organisations which could provide support to the PGFTU in terms of advocacy and identification and protection of workers at risk of harassment and other violations of their employment rights. A coalition of unions and civil society organisations was launched in 2022 by the PGFTU in partnership with ILO, on the basis of the labour law

review from a gender perspective. This will integrate the engagement and participation of workers' perspectives into the legislative reform process.

The public health context, and particularly the lockdown circumstances, have intensified an already-poor economic situation and led to increased vulnerability for large cohorts of workers. In this context, a tripartite agreement was signed in March 2020 to create a safety net for these vulnerable groups and move forward with solutions to the worsening cross-sectoral crisis. This was followed by the ILO supporting the tripartite partners in creating an Emergency Response Plan to address issues in the labour market. The development of the plan in itself represents a good practice in terms of fruitful collective bargaining and solidarity in an emergency context. The plan has led to concretization through resources being made available to vulnerable workers in the form of income support. Approximately 40,000 individuals have received a one-off payment of 700 new Israeli Shekels in May 2020. This was followed by a second round of payments in February 2021, affecting a further 15,523 workers whose livelihood had been affected by the pandemic.

Outcome 2.3 Workplace compliance is improved to better protect labour rights and promote safe and secure working environments for women and men workers in line with national laws and regulations and international standards, through strengthened labour inspection and increased preventative Occupational Safety and Health (OSH) culture

Achievements:

ILO provided extensive support to the Palestinian Ministry of Labour, under the DWP, to strengthen its capacity for more effective and responsive labour inspection, occupational safety and health. ILO support in these fields was multidimensional and comprehensive, encompassing institutional development, legislative development, normalization/standardization, knowledge acquisition, procurement in addition to large-scale capacity building, including on various aspects of gender responsive labour inspection. In terms of institutional development, ILO under the DWP provided support for the establishment of a specific OSH directorate within the Ministry of Labour in order to ensure proper monitoring and management of OSH aspects in different economic sectors.

To lay the ground for policy development in labour inspection and OSH, ILO supported Ministry of Labour in organizing the first Palestinian Labour Inspection Conference in November 2019 (24th-25th November 2019 in Jericho). This event brought together employers and employees with ministry officials and other local stakeholders, and a vision was laid out for an improved inspectorate. The ILO subsequently designed a reform plan for the labour inspectorate on the basis of a substantive assessment of the status quo. This was due to a number of weaknesses in the labour inspection function as well as in the labour inspection directorate being revealed in the assessment, including weaknesses in terms of management, strategic planning, monitoring and evaluation and reporting, all leading to overall weak performance. Furthermore, the assessment reflected serious weaknesses in terms of the authority and law enforcement capacity of labour inspectors, which seriously hamper their capacity to bring about prevention and mitigation of infractions and violations of labour laws or respect for workers rights and decent work conditions. There is also a concrete lack of the necessary logistical equipment (vehicles) for the implementation of inspection visits to assess complaints and violations. The reform plan of the ILO was designed to address these different weaknesses.

Another assessment under the DWP took place on OSH, leading to national OSH standards and guidelines being published. This has led to a list of hazardous work being agreed by the cabinet and included in National Occupational Safety and Health legislation. This thematic area was given particular emphasis due

to the public health crisis during the COVID-19 pandemic. The ILO supported the procurement of additional medical supplies and Personal Protective Equipment for workers, as well as providing public health documentation to protect and inform at-risk workers. A component of risk awareness training was also included. Training was targeted at both workers' and employers' organizations, focusing on prevention and precautionary measures, with an outcome being the ability to develop workplace safety, and risk prevention and mitigation plans.

Based on the previous steps, the support of ILO for the Ministry of Labour at policy level was particularly galvanized through the development of two policy documents: the national policy for labour inspection and the national policy for occupational safety. The Labour Administration, Labour Inspection and Occupational Safety and Health Branch of the ILO's Governance and Tripartism Department developed the ILO approach to strategic compliance planning for labour inspectorates, and the National Tripartite Committee for Occupational Safety and Health (OSH) discussed and validated the national OSH profile.

The support of ILO at the level of policy and legislative development and standardisation was accompanied by extensive capacity building activities. This included intensive 'train the trainer' training for the labour inspectorate on OSH, targeting members of PGFTU, PFCCIA, OSH institute and the Syndicate of Engineers. These new trainers will be available to train others on compliance with OSH law. 'Train the trainer' courses for health workers were also rolled out for health workers in Ramallah in August 2021, with OECD and WHO support, focusing on prevention of COVID-19 infection.

Priority 3. Support the implementation and development of the Palestinian social security system and the extension of social protection to all

Outcome 3.1 New Social Security Institution (PSSC) established and operational

Achievements:

In January 2019, Social Security Law No. 9 (2016) for private sector workers was suspended. The ILO put forward a plan to address the cessation of dialogue on social security reform at the end of 2019, leading to the Ministry of Labour creating a tripartite body to carry out such dialogue. The ILO role is to offer technical support, sometimes by giving access to international experts in the field. This committee has met several times and tabled amendments to social security legislation, and the ILO followed up with an assessment of the impact of the proposed changes. This review compared the suggested legislation with existing provisions for employer liability, providing costings on the basis of increased unemployment due to the COVID-19 pandemic, and using actuarial models to inform the discussion.

ILO has fulfilled a technical and financial support role vis-à-vis the Palestinian Social Security Corporation to avoid institutional memory loss, and this will continue at least until July 2021. ILO advocacy and awareness raising on the importance of social security also continues. ILO are carrying out a public information campaign on social security reform. The Ministry of Labour has conceded the importance of social security, formally signing off on a national dialogue for social security reform during the Social Dialogue Conference in March 2021.

Outcome 3.2 Improved knowledge base, analytical capacity, and sex-disaggregated statistics for the delivery of social protection

Achievements:

ILO has carried out an actuarial costing of public sector pensions to certify that the national pension fund is financially sustainable, making a presentation to the Board of Directors of the Public Pension Agency (PPA) in February 2020. The report was endorsed by the Board of Directors at the latter meeting, and a technical committee was established to identify policy prescriptions which will safeguard the viability of the Agency and the funding of public pensions.

Furthermore, ILO implemented the assessment: *On the Road to Universal Social Protection: A social protection floor assessment in the Occupied Palestinian Territory*. The report, the first report of its kind in oPt, provides analysis of the coverage, adequacy and impact of the Palestinian social protection system, and includes a series of recommendations as a basis for future policy dialogue.

The Ministry of Social Development carried out a mapping and data collection exercise focussed on People with Disabilities and Older Persons, identifying their requirements and the existing deficits in social service provision. This was supported by the ILO and partners. ILO also looked into the feasibility and factors that would feed into the development of a social pension scheme, providing a report on means-tested non-contributory social protection provision.

Outcome 3.3 National Social Protection Floor progressively implemented

Achievements:

Within the perspective of establishing a comprehensive social protection system, ILO has been providing support within the framework of the Decent Work Programme at the level of non-contributory social protection, targeting the poor and vulnerable in particular, under the responsibility of the Ministry of Social Development.

An assessment of the Social Protection Floor (SPF) was finalised in Q1 2021 with ILO support. The purpose was to identify what social protection benefits were essential for at-risk cohorts, with various costed scenarios being outlined to government in February 2020.

The ILO took part in a joint programme with UNICEF and the World Food Programme to facilitate the Ministry of Social Development in establishing the components of a Palestinian social protection floor. This would feed into the development of policy options affecting older persons and persons with disabilities, and was informed by the 2020 ILO Social Protection Floors Assessment. Social allowances for vulnerable groups, particularly pensions, were supported by ILO.

A pilot scheme of cash transfers to People with Disabilities was also rolled out, in a deviation from the usual proxy-means test approach exemplified by the Cash National Transfer Programme. There have been multiple lessons learned from this pilot project, which will lead to the development of a rights-based approach to social protection in public policy, creating a broader social safety net across the Palestinian population.

It is noted that there is a need for improved and increased communication and collaboration between government, humanitarian and development actors. This deficit highlights the lack of sustainability of existing approaches to social protection, and the associated need to focus on improving governance. There is a certain fragmentation of interventions, which ILO are attempting to remedy by means of a joint programmatic and financing framework for social protection. This brings together a range of different interventions by various actors under the umbrella of the Ministry of Social Development Sectoral

Strategy. This will facilitate government and partners in improving collaboration, increasing capacity, and improving the effectiveness and oversight of the Palestinian social protection system for all cohorts of society.

E.2-Progress in terms of Gender mainstreaming

DWP support at the level of gender mainstreaming has taken three forms. It was either through the implementation of specific activities targeting enhancing decent work for women, it was cross cutting and inclusive within different interventions and technical support under the different DWP outcomes, or it was within the framework of the implementation of a Joint regional Programme in cooperation with UN Women, “Promoting Productive Employment and Decent Work for Women in Egypt, Jordan and Palestine”. The support encompassed activities at the level of institutional development, policy, legislation development, capacity building, advocacy and knowledge acquisition. In terms of institutional development, a Memorandum of Understanding was signed between the PGFTU and the Ministry of Women Affairs in October 2020, aiming to establish the National Pay Equity Committee and the National Violence and Harassment Committee. Through this MoU ILO has committed to support the establishment and dynamization of both committees. On another level, the National Committee for Women’s Employment benefited in 2021 from ILO support under the DWP to revise its objectives in the light of lessons learned from its activities since its establishment. Furthermore, a strategic plan for the committee has been developed with the support of ILO. In the legal sphere, in 2019/ 2020 ILO supported the implementation of a gender review of the labour law. This review has led to important recommendations that could feed the process of labour law reform. Furthermore, ILO has supported the development of several proposals on the inclusion of ILO Convention No. 190 on preventing violence and abuse at work and their submission to the committee on labour law reform.

In terms of policy, the development of the National Employment Strategy 2021-2025 is an example of concretization of a gender responsive employment strategy. This concretization is achieved in terms of the vision of the strategy which states: “Achieve full, productive and freely chosen employment for jobseekers, particularly youth and women”. It is also concretized as one of its three main objectives: “Strengthen private sector resilience and ability to increase productivity while creating decent employment opportunities for jobseekers, particularly youth and women”.

At the capacity building level, six weeks of training were provided in 2021 to different worker representatives. This covered social dialogue, freedom of association, collective bargaining, addressed gender-based discrimination, violence and harassment against women in workplace. ILO also supported an awareness raising campaign led by the PGFTU focussing on female employees, particularly in the education and childcare sectors. It resulted in 2,500 new female subscriptions for PGFTU as well as several new work committees.

At level of advocacy for the reform of the labour law, in March 2021 ILO supported PGFTU, sectoral unions and civil society organizations to join together and create a coalition to ensure lobbying, advocacy and pressure, as well as to ensure proper representation of workers’ voices, mainly those of women, throughout the reform process of the labour law.

F- Efficiency

F.1- Effectiveness of management arrangements; Decent Work Programme management structure, coordination and implementation mechanisms

Structure of the Decent Work Programme in ILO OPT

The decent work programme structure consists of the following:

1-A tripartite DWP committee encompassing representatives from the ILO office in Jerusalem in addition to the tripartite stakeholders: Ministry of Labour, PGFTU and PFCCIA. The committee also includes a representative from NCWE to ensure its gender responsiveness legacy. Inputs and support are provided from the ILO ROAS to the committee on certain occasions. While the DWP steering committee is supposed to meet on a quarterly basis, this frequency was not concretely satisfied and the committee instead used to meet sporadically.

2-Programme Analyst, who is ensuring management of the DWP and ensuring daily coordination with different national stakeholders, mainly the tripartite stakeholders. The Programme Analyst is acting directly under the ILO OPT Country Office Representative and in addition to the management of the DWP, as a matter of fact is exercising the function of the ILO OPT Deputy Country Representative.

3-Two programme assistants, and one operations assistant, who are covering the administrative, finance and Monitoring & Evaluation functions of the OPT Decent Work Programme team.

4-National technical officers and specialists in the domains of: social dialogue, cooperatives, social security and Gender.

5-International social protection technical officer.

6-Local consultant in Gaza to ensure monitoring and implementation of DWP activities in the Gaza Strip.

7-Local and international ILO consultants who are serving as advisors to partners and running a multitude of analytical work.

It is to note that while the Programme Analyst and the two programme assistants are working in the ILO office in Jerusalem with frequent travel to Ramallah, all the technical specialists are based in the ILO Office in Ramallah. This is particularly to ensure the technical experts have the capacity to coordinate and provide the required technical support to the Ministry of Labour, other tripartite stakeholders and other stakeholders based in Ramallah, which is the hub for the Palestinian Authority institutions, and to avoid movement given the restrictions and occupation check points around the exits from Jerusalem.

Support from ILO ROAS

Extensive technical support has been provided to the OPT DWP team from the ILO DWT in ROAS in Beirut in different areas of interventions of the decent work programme. This support was mainly via: Senior Employment Policy Specialist, Senior Specialist of Social Security, Senior Specialist of Occupational Safety and Health (OSH) and Labour Inspection (LI), Senior Specialist of Employers' Activities, Senior Specialist of Workers' Activities, Senior Specialist for ILS and Labour Law, Senior Specialist for Gender Equality, and Enterprise Development Specialist, while all the support is coordinated through the Chief of Regional Programming Services. The technical support provided by each regional senior specialist encompasses: Provision of technical support during the planning and design of the decent work programme in the domain of specialization of the regional senior specialist; Provision of guidance and technical support

directly to different national tripartite partners and other line stakeholders; Implementation of country field visits to support the implementation of DWP activities; Attending and monitoring ILO involvement in specific events when attended by senior national officials; Coaching and backstopping local specialists within the ILO DWP OPT including the Social Protection Technical Officer, Cooperative technical officer, social dialogue technical officer, Gender Project Officer; Provision of technical external consultants in domains of intervention of the decent work programme when necessary and monitoring the outcome of their assignments.

It should be noted that the technical support from ILO ROAS DWT passes through two stages: a first stage in which their engagement with local stakeholders was intensive and direct in support of the ILO decent work team in Palestine, during a period when the DWT team was restricted, in the beginning only encompassing the Programme Analyst and a Programme assistant. In a second stage, ILO worked on building a local team to ensure technical support and follow-up vis-à-vis national stakeholders directly on a daily and intensive basis. A local team was built encompassing the Social Security Technical Officer, Cooperative technical officer, social dialogue technical officer, Gender Project Officer. Once the team was built and functioning, the support of the ILO ROAS shifted to backstopping on a regular basis but less intensively.

Support from ILO HQ

Where expertise is absent at ROAS, ILO DWP in OPT has recourse to support from HQ as appropriate. This was particularly evident in the domain of cooperatives, with ILO OPT and the COOP unit in Geneva in close collaboration in the rollout of activities relating to cooperates, as has been the case for several years. STATS, EMPLAB, LABADMIN/OSH AND SOCPRO all routinely provide technical support at local level, with ROAS DWT providing coordination in relation as well as access to a network of international expertise.

F.2- Partnership enhancing

As ILO is part of the Palestine UNCT, the implementation of certain activities under the Decent Work Programme were achieved in partnership with other UN entities. This cooperation was developed from the perspective of building a humanitarian and development nexus in OPT. For instance, in the domain of labour inspection and OSH, partnerships were built with WHO and UN Women. Through that cooperation an assessment and review was carried out for the existing mechanisms of complaint, including those related to the harassment and abuse of female workers. In parallel and in cooperation with WHO, capacity building activities were implemented jointly to build the capacity of social workers. In this regard two training sessions were implemented, one in the West Bank and one in Gaza. In the domain of social dialogue a tripartite event was organized in cooperation with WHO. While under a joint programme with UNICEF and WFP, ILO supported the Ministry of Social Development in establishing components of a Palestinian social protection floor. ILO have worked with UNDP and UNIDO, in the context of the Palestinian Authority's socio-economic strategy to assist business in recovering from the impact of lockdowns imposed in the territories as a result of the COVID-19 pandemic. At other levels, the DWP harnessed partnerships carried out with other UN and development entities, such as In the domain of Gender mainstreaming where ILO harnessed cooperation with UN Women for the implementation of the regional Joint Programme 'Promoting Productive Employment and Decent Work for Women in Egypt, Jordan and Palestine'.

As with regards to partnerships with non-UN organizations, three types of partnerships existed and were concretized through support for the implementation of projects under the DWP: support from foreign governmental funds and institutions, support from foreign non-governmental organizations and funds, and support from Palestinian non-governmental organizations and funds. In terms of support from foreign governmental funds and institutions, support was provided from the government of Kuwait for the implementation of the project “Strengthened tripartite institutions and social dialogue processes for improved socioeconomic response to the impact of the COVID-19-pandemic that is line with international labour standards and Human Rights treaties”, the project “Workplace compliance is improved to better protect labour rights and promote safe and secure working environments for women and men workers in line with national laws and regulations and international standards”, and the project “Comprehensive social security strategy to enhance coverage to Palestinians women and men is developed in line with international labour standards – Phase I and II’. Under this category it is also worth mentioning the support provided by the Qatari Ministry of Administrative Development, Labour and Social Affairs for the implementation of the project “Establishing an Independent Social Security Institution for the Administration of the New Social Security System for Private Sector Workers and their Family Members in Palestine” as well as the contribution of the Qatar fund for the implementation the project “A comprehensive social security strategy to enhance coverage to Palestinians women and men is developed in line with international labour standards – Phase I and II’’. Also, it should be noted that the Italian Agency for Development Cooperation (AICS) supported the implementation of the project “Cooperative Support Programme for Palestine (CSP-OPT)’’ as well as the UNW project- Promoting Women’s Equal Access to Economic Opportunities and Decent Work, Phase II.

Support from foreign non-governmental organizations and funds included that of the Italian Cooperazione Per Lo Sviluppo Dei Paesi Emergenti (COSPE) in the implementation of the Land and Rights – Paths to Social and Solidarity Economy in Palestine. Finally, the partnerships with Palestinian non-governmental organizations and funds included partnership with the Palestine for Development Foundation (PsDF) for the implementation of the project “Promoting entrepreneurship education and business start-up for Palestinian youth”.

G-Sustainability

Analysis of the sustainability of the decent work programme encompasses analysis of the factors and achievements of the decent work programme in terms of institutionalization, standardization, its capacity building activities, the capacity of national and local partners to maintain the benefits of the decent work programme, and good practices that could be integrated into national policies, replicated, and expanded in future replications of the DWP.

G.1-Institutionalization

Institutionalization has been one the top of priorities during the implementation of the DWP in its different axes of intervention. There were achievements in this regard in the domain of OSH, with the establishment of a specific OSH directorate within the Ministry of Labour. Another achievement was through reaching an intermediate agreement among the government, the Cooperative Work Agency (CWA) and the General Federation of Cooperatives regarding the establishment and status of the Cooperative Development Fund (CDF) and Cooperative Training Institute (CTI), as well as the creation of a specific directorate of training within the Cooperative Work Agency to monitor the work of the institute.

With regards to the institutionalization of social dialogue, progress has been registered. Social dialogue has been dynamic during the second phase of the decent work programme, with a number of tripartite

committees holding meetings in various domains related to the decent work programme: on active labour market policies during the COVID-19 context, on development of the National Employment Strategy, on amendment to the minimum wage, social security law, and labour law, on preparation of the social dialogue first conference, on OSH issues, cooperatives, and women's employment.

The social dialogue in these various domains took place via a number of specific committees, some of which are old, having been created on the basis of labour law No 7, such as the Labour Policies Committee and Committee on Wages, others created during the first phase of the Decent Work Programme, such as the National Committee for Women's Employment. Still others are new and were created during the second phase of the decent work programme, such as the committee for the development of the National Employment Strategy, the committee for the amendment of the social security law, the committee for the amendment of the labour law and the OSH committee. There is also the potential for new committees to emerge, and a number of committees related to gender have been discussed by the PGFTU and the Ministry of Women's Affairs , inter alia. The ILO is likely to be involved in any such committees.

Such committees have tended to be active, and significant achievements have been registered, such as the development of National Employment Strategy, amendment of the minimum wage, agreements on measures during the COVID-19 context, and legal, policy and standardization in OSH and cooperatives. Committee work provided a channel and platform for deliberations among the tripartite stakeholders. Some of these committees were particularly dynamic, such as the committee on wages, which met more than 30 times in a short period in the first quarter of 2021 to decide on amendments to the national minimum wage.

Despite this effectiveness and dynamism and multiple committees in existence, social dialogue in Palestine has not yet reached a stage of concrete institutionalization per se.

Actually, most of the committees established were created or re-dynamized for a specific purpose and to deal with a specific issue. Once the issue is resolved or the purpose achieved, the committee enters a phase of 'hibernation'.

In fact, the requirements regarding this institutionalization seem to be at two levels:

- 1- On one hand there is a need in terms of creating a sustainable mechanism that functions systematically and properly among the three tripartite stakeholders. The mechanism should be well structured at the supervisory, executive and administrative level. It should have a steering body, a secretariat to ensure that it convenes, that meeting minutes are distributed, and that follow-up actions are taken. It should have multiple task forces and specialized sub-committees to deal with specific aspects, such as the reform of the social security law or labor law, minimum wage adjustments, or measures to deal with emergency contexts such as the COVID-19 pandemic. The mechanism should be consistent, with coordination meetings taking place regularly as defined by internal regulation and not on an ad-hoc basis.

The mechanism should concretize concrete national ownership, functioning by the will, interest, and determination of national tripartite stakeholders, not waiting for ILO Country Office initiatives to trigger or invite participants to a meeting to deal with a specific issue or event.

The mechanism should be sustainable, with stakeholders having concrete capacity to ensure its function on a regular sustainable basis with support from ILO.

The mechanism should also be participatory in terms of including the participation of other important line stakeholders in addition to the tripartite stakeholders, such as Ministry of Social Development, Ministry of Economy, Commission for Women Affairs, National Statistics Bureau and civil society organizations.

- 2- The second need is in terms of resolving fragmentation within the trade union and employer partners. In fact, each of the main partners, the PFCCIA and PGFTU, need strengthening, not only in terms of social bargaining capacity but most importantly in their own capacity and structure to represent and encompass all fragments of the partners, specifically all business associations for the PFCCIA, and all trade unions for the PGFTU. It should be borne in mind that there are around 90 business associations and almost 17 trade unions. A large number of business associations consider themselves not to be part of the PFCCIA, despite the existence of a council related to PFCCIA that encompasses representatives from various chambers of commerce and business associations, while a significant proportion of trade unions consider the PGFTU not to be their representative. Certainly the large public rejection of social security law No 19 of 2016, was due to a number of factors. They included a factor of mistrust in terms of public opinion vis-à-vis the management of the Social Security Cooperation and its control by the government, which was considered not to be independent or neutral. Furthermore, according to various Palestinian sources, they also included manipulation by the Israelis, who are always opposed to the creation of a Palestinian social security system and cooperation, as it would lead to the transfer of significant public funds by the Israeli Government to fund the Palestinian social security system and cooperation, as required by the Oslo conventions. Nevertheless, the public rejection of the social security law No 19 was also partly due to the concretization of a certain distance between the representatives of the partners and certain fragments of the partners. While the law was developed and approved through tripartite dialogue in which the PFCCIA and PGFTU were key actors and contributors, the drastic, large rejection of this law by brackets of private sector workers and employers in 2018/2019 reflects a question over representative capacity for both the PFCCIA and PGFTU, as well as each of its own public and sub-partners. This needs to be addressed.

The ILO is already giving special attention to the unification of all sub-partners of the employer category under the leadership of the PFCCIA and all sub-partners of the trade unions under the leadership of the PGFTU, and this should be a specific focus in any eventual next phase. It will require consideration of a structure for each partner that could allow the representation, involvement and participation of all sub-partner groups in formulating a joint position that reflects all fragmentary voices and the majority of opinions through a democratic process within each partner.

G.2- Standardization

Support in terms of standardization was provided through supporting the development of national OSH standards, including the list of hazardous work and reference guidelines approved by the Palestinian Cabinet. Standardization was also included within the draft cooperative law (for example, aspects related to the minimum number of cooperatives required to form a federation of cooperatives and representation of cooperatives in the board of directors according to R193).

The most significant achievement in terms of standardization was the agreement reached among tripartite stakeholders, with the support of ILO, to amend the minimum wage to the level of 1880 Shekel. However, it should be noted that while the new minimum wage was agreed on by the tripartite stakeholders, no list of violations and fines has been developed and issued by the Ministry of Labour to ensure the respect and commitment by employers for the new minimum wage. Meanwhile, new standards are at the core of the ongoing deliberations related to the amendments to the social security and labour laws, though agreement is yet to be reached here. There are other ways in which standardization has been implemented, such as in the development of the NES on the basis of certain ILO guidelines, or the use of technical reviews, analysis, actuarial evaluations, comparison with international conventions and other measures to ensure that standards are identified and made available to relevant stakeholders.

G.3-Capacity Building

Various capacity building activities were implemented under the decent work programme with the aim of ensuring capacity development for the tripartite partners as well as the sustainability of the DWP. Capacity building, including online training during lockdown, was targeted at public employment services in 2020. An ITCILO online course on “Employment Services for Effective Job Transitions” with a networking aspect was rolled out for two General Directorate of Employment managers, and the directorate’s Director General was trained in “Employment Impact Assessment in the time of Coronavirus”, also in 2020.

In the domain of OSH, intensive capacity building activities and training was provided. At one level, all 95 Ministry of Labour inspectors were trained on OSH norms and implementation of the OSH law. Another training sought to build a national team of trainers who could provide guidance and coaching to all private sector companies on fulfilling of the requirements of the law. This national team of trainers (25 trainers) were selected from various stakeholders related to the labour sphere (PFCCIA, PGFTU, Engineers association and the OSH institute). Thirdly, training for 25 inspectors was designed to build a specific and specialized corps of OSH inspectors within the inspectorate directorate who can ensure OSH-specific inspection work.

In the domain of cooperatives, it is worth mentioning the orientation towards creating the Cooperative Training Institute to provide training and capacity building to cooperative members. A union literacy programme was rolled out for more than 50 trade unionists in late 2020. This had been designed in Turin by ITC/ILO.

G.4-Capacity of national and local partners to maintain the benefits of the decent work programme.

The capacity of national tripartite stakeholders to maintain the benefits of the decent work programme is fragmented and disproportionate.

From the technical perspective, factors of sustainability vary according to the domains and themes of the DWP. This is due on one hand to certain domains and themes of DWP intervention being more neutral, more technical, less ‘political’ and less at the nexus of conflict of interest among tripartite stakeholders than others. For instance, the capacity of stakeholders to maintain the benefits of the DWP seem more

advanced in the domain of active labour policies, OSH and cooperatives than in the domain of social security or labour law amendment.

More sustainable multidimensional national capacity development was achieved here as it is in the domains of active labour policies, OSH and cooperatives that consensus among line tripartite stakeholders is easier to reach than the very controversial and adversarial social security or labour law amendments. Furthermore, the capacity of tripartite stakeholders to maintain the benefits of the decent work programme is related to the particular capacity (and will) of the Ministry of Labour, who has the leading role in the tripartite nexus. In the Palestinian context, it was observed that the social dialogue process can take a dynamic and accelerated path or a slow or stagnant path based on level of dynamism and orientation of the Ministry of Labour. For example, although the Labour Policies Committee was the leading committee according to Labour Law No 7, this was blocked for the five years from 2015 and 2020 by the Ministry of Labour under the mandates of three consecutive labour ministers.

This lack of initiative for social dialogue among employer and worker partners is a reason why ILO initiated a bipartite approach and triggered meetings between the two partners, to enhance the level of maturity, initiative and direct cooperation among the two partners.

Finally, above all of this, it is worth mentioning that the sustainability of action and interventions under the decent work agenda is related to the sustainability of ILO action in OPT. In fact, technically, all action, benefits and effectiveness under the latter agenda were effectively achieved thanks to ILO support. From a concrete and objective analytical perspective, ILO is needed and will always be needed to advance the decent work agenda and its different components in OPT. There should be a further permanent commitment on the part of Palestinian tripartite stakeholders to the concept of the Decent Work and its adoption, rather than occasionally when it comes to projects and meetings organized with ILO. It should be present on all occasions and vis-à-vis other development partners and donors.

From the financial perspective, tremendous challenges remain in terms of sustainability. The PA is suffering from extensive public finance deficits. Interventions under the decent work programmes are almost completely dependent on donors and ILO. The latter not only invest a significant part of their core funding but also play a key role in building partnerships and fundraising to support the implementation of different decent work programme portfolios in OPT.

J- Recommendations

Decent Work Programme Coverage

It will be necessary for a next phase of the decent work programme to consider a certain refocus on certain areas of interventions instead of being large horizontally, covering large numbers of areas of intervention. In this regard and based on the recommendations of the workshop with the tripartite stakeholders to discuss the findings of this review, it is suggested the next phase of the Decent Work Programme prioritize three areas of interventions: A- Implementation of the National Employment Strategy, B- Institutionalization of social dialogue C- Monitoring and supporting rights of Palestinian workers working within the green line. Support for social security, non-contributory social protection and the cooperatives sector might additionally be considered. This prioritization might also be necessary taking into consideration certain eventual challenges that could arise in terms of fund raising and resource mobilization in support of future DWP projects in Palestine. This prioritization is also necessary to take into consideration the monitoring and administrative capacity of ILO OPT and the limitations in terms of

the human resources working in the office. Most importantly it should also take into fact the fundraising capacity and enthusiasm of donors, hampered on one hand by a global economic crisis in OECD countries as a consequence of COVID-19, in addition to the attention of donors being diverted towards other emergency contexts such as Yemen, Syria, and now Ukraine.

Institutionalization of social dialogue

Concrete institutionalization should be developed for social dialogue. That should be a priority for ILO in a next phase of the Decent Work Programme. In this regards three scenarios might be possible, depending on the availability of funds: **Scenario A:** Institutionalization based on the Labour Policies Committee, through which the Labour Policies Committee Terms of Reference are reviewed towards consistency in terms of meetings and better representation of workers and employers. More importantly the creation of a secretariat is needed with the support of ILO (via specific project) in order to lead, organize different meetings and ensure consistency, transparency, and the proper recording and sharing of information on progress among the tripartite stakeholders. This is a scenario that might be the easiest in terms of feasibility. **Scenario B:** Institutionalization through the achievement of the creation of the socio-economic council as a social dialogue institution which has been under consideration for a long time but has not yet been achieved. While the socio-economic council by nature will have other horizontal responsibilities in various socio-economic fields, it is an institution that will require significant means and human resources, and hence there will be significant budget and finance implications and the need for extensive donor support.

Scenario C: Creation of a social dialogue commission as an autonomous institution to organize and lead social dialogue among the tripartite stakeholders in different social protection domains, in line with different ILO conventions, good governance, transparency and respect for human rights. Being an institution under the PA President, the Commission will ensure neutrality and objectivity of social dialogue among tripartite stakeholders. It will monitor the commitment of the tripartite stakeholders to the outcomes of the dialogue and will issue a quarterly report in this regard. As a commission, it will require less means, human resources, public finance and donors support than a socio-economic council.

The three scenarios were highly debated during the workshop to present the findings of this review, mainly scenarios A and B. More dialogue is needed among the tripartite stakeholders to agree upon the best scenario.

Monitoring decent work conditions and rights of Palestinian workers working within the Green Line in Israel

-With almost 20% of the Palestinian work force working in Israel, encompassing an important portion of graduates from universities that did not find work opportunities in the Palestinian labour market, a specific axis of intervention is needed specifically for those working within the green line. Working in the green zone is the only coping mechanism for a large number of Palestinians due to high unemployment, but these workers are subject to various forms of exploitation, abuse and injustice that contrast with the principles of decent work, not to mention bad treatment at border checkpoints and military checkpoints.

The specific axis of intervention noted above would have objective of bringing about respect of their rights and working conditions according to the principles of decent work, and ensuring the creation of appropriate mechanisms for this purpose. It was suggested by the tripartite stakeholders to establish a specific office for ILO within Israel (within the green line zone), to be responsible for monitoring the fulfilment of the rights associated with decent work for Palestinian workers within Israel.

Implementation of the new law on minimum wage

To date, the new minimum wage has not been implemented by employers despite being agreed upon by the tripartite stakeholders. This is because no list of violations and fines has been developed and issued by the Ministry of Labour to ensure respect and commitment for the new minimum wage on the part of employers. The Ministry of Labour needs the capacity to ensure it can monitor and ensure the commitment of the private sector to the new minimum wage, as well as enforcing it. Its present capacity as defined by the law requires it to depend on the good will of different employers to apply the new minimum wage. Finally, social dialogue should take place to suggest alternative options for the new minimum wage where some economic sectors might not be capable of implementing it due to the weakness of these sectors and the fragility of companies within them, where they are facing limited capacity and profits.

Social dialogue initiatives

Social dialogue should not only be initiated as a result of government (mainly Ministry of Labour) decisions or upon ILO initiative; the initiative for negotiations can and should come from the social partners as well. This did occur, with the trade unions' campaign for a minimum wage during the COVID-19 pandemic.

ILO should continue to support the bipartite dialogue initiated recently by social partners for social dialogue between the workers and employers' representatives (PGFTU and PFCCIA), and expand this beyond labour law reform to other social areas, while also encouraging the broader participation of other federations and sectoral unions on both the worker and employer sides. Investment in the capacities of workers' and employers' groups is required in this regard.

Engagement of civil society within the national dialogue

ILO should continue and expand its support to the coalition between the PGFTU and civil society organizations. The support to the coalition should be multidimensional, encompassing institutional development (supporting management and legal and advocacy committees already initiated within the coalition), guidance in terms of lobbying, and exercising pressure on the social dialogue process to fulfill workers' rights, including those of female workers. The support should also target increase in the number of civil society organizations in the coalition.

Expansion of the DWP to Gaza

Any future phase of the DWP should envisage expanding to Gaza and covering it concretely in terms of activities. This is necessary on one hand due to the deteriorated socio-economic context overwhelmed by poverty, deprivation and unemployment, giving ground to exploitation, low payment, and bad working conditions, mainly affecting female workers. On the other hand it is also due to the existence of stakeholders who showed dynamism and commitment in the domains of DWP interventions, mainly among civil society organisations. In this regard, ILO has recently reopened a local office in Gaza and appointed a local coordinator with the orientation of expanding its implementation of activities in the Strip.

Support for a non-contributory system

In cooperation with other UN agencies and donors and through the UNCT, the next phase of the DWP should also consider sustaining the balance between the contributory and non-contributory aspects of social protection. The next phase should target a more comprehensive social protection system. This is also because given the high level of informality and low employment rates, the non-contributory package of benefits and services is of tremendous importance and plays a significant role in protecting against poverty and vulnerability. In this regards the implementation of the project 'Strengthening nexus of coherence and responsiveness in the Palestinian social protection sector' is very important.

Reform of the labour law

The process of reform of the labour law on a tripartite basis should be dynamic and consistent. This does not mean that the amendment of the law should be necessary speedily concluded. An assessment should be carried out on the implications of amended articles. An agenda should be set as well as a decision on how to continue tripartite negotiations on issues that cannot be immediately settled. Moreover, it will be important to initiate a lot of advocacy and communication vis-à-vis the public before issuing a law. In parallel to the process of review of the labour law, it will be necessary to consider introducing a labour court system as stipulated by the Social Dialogue Conference of March 2021, while appointing and building the capacity of judges with specific knowledge of labour issues. The next phase of the DWP could integrate mediation as a potential mechanism that represents an efficient approach compared to lengthy court procedures. In this regard, the Palestinian Chamber for Local and International Mediation could be a partner for cooperation along with other partners in the next phase of the DWP.

Gender Mainstreaming

ILO Support for the National Committee for Women's Employment should be increasing in a future phase to strengthen that committee and expand its role and responsibilities. Furthermore, it would be necessary for ILO to manage the division of responsibilities between the recently created committees of National Pay Equity, National Violence and Harassment and the National Committee for Women's Employment in order to avoid confusion and duplication. The support of ILO in terms of Gender Mainstreaming should continue in a next DWP phase through the two ongoing approaches: cross-cutting with different areas and domains of intervention of the Decent Work Programme and via the Joint Programme with UN Women of 'Promoting Productive Employment and Decent Work for Women in Egypt, Jordan and Palestine'.

Cooperatives

In a next phase, ILO should focus on supporting horizontal and vertical expansions of the cooperative sector. Cooperatives could be not only in classic sectors such as agriculture or industry, but also expanded to other sectors such as IT or clean energy generation, while also possibly developing value chains within the cooperative sector. It would also be important to consider high support for the cooperative sector in Gaza as a system to cope with high unemployment and extensive vulnerabilities. However, ILO's forthcoming support to the cooperative sector in the West Bank and Gaza should be considered under a specific integrated project with upstream and downstream interventions, including activities targeting support in terms of exports and the provision of access to external markets to sell cooperative products. Furthermore, on another level, ILO should seek to involve more labour unions in the ongoing process seeking to develop the cooperatives sector strategy.

OSH and Labour Inspection

In the next phase of the DWP, ILO should work on addressing the multi-level causal factors that still lead to weak performance of the labour inspectorate in OPT. This should mainly include better institutional development of the labour inspectorate and its structure; enhancing labour inspection planning in order to systemize the process of prioritization of inspection visits to high-risk establishments, while enabling full randomization of labour inspections, covering both high and low risk establishments, and addressing emergency complaints; improving feedback and reporting mechanisms among field inspectors, middle management and upper management; addressing (in cooperation with other UN agencies and donors) the lack of dedicated transportation vehicles for the use of labour inspectors; institutionalizing collaboration with the police to bring about better and higher performing law enforcement; establishing labour courts as proper channels between MOL and the judiciary system, to speed up conflict resolution and take serious action against violators in a shorter timeframe, while amending law No 3 of the year 2000, to strengthen penalties for violation leading to employee injury or death. Furthermore, it will be important to consider developing Palestinian standards driven from ISO 45001 standards to allow establishments constructing their health and management systems with minimal effort and guidance from MOL staff. Other recommendations at level of the OSH and labour inspections include: a- achieving the second step of the computerization of the inspection system, related to two important directorates within the Ministry of Labour: the directorate of inspection and directorate of OSH; b-considering better institutional development for the commission of inspection; c-considering working on reviewing the status of the labour inspection system to become similar to the status of the public prosecution system in terms of power, salaries, working hours, and administrative and financial status; d-supporting the creation of a national centre for OSH; e- Continuing in efforts to create a system of monitoring work injuries that had previously started but stopped abruptly due to budgeting issues; f-approval and adoption of the national strategy and policy for labour inspection; g- approval and adoption of the national strategy and policy for OSH; g-Institutionalisation of the national committee for OSH; h-Continuing to implement capacity building programmes for labour inspectors; i-creating an authority for wages due to its eventual importance for the inspection work.

Structure of provision of technical support of ILO

It will be important in any future replication of the DWP to maintain the structure of provision of technical support by ILO in OPT at the regional and country levels. It will be important to consider reopening the ILO Office in Gaza to allow significant DWP interventions in the Strip.

Capacity Building

It is important that ILO considers an evaluation of the extent that capacity building added value and was utilized by tripartite and other stakeholders. This might be done through various models, mainly the Kirkpatrick 4-step training evaluation framework. While social dialogue is taking place in a number of domains, it would be important to assess the extent to which the tripartite partners are relying on negotiators trained by ILO in various specific areas of DWP as opposed to always relying on the same negotiators and representatives who are constantly part of all different tripartite committees.

Monitoring & Evaluation

Reporting on results achieved under different projects should be done using the results framework for the whole DWP.

On another level, if funds are available, a fully dedicated Monitoring & Evaluation officer should be hired within the ILO OPT to ensure the necessary multi-dimensional action in terms of monitoring and evaluation including selection, validation and use of the structure of indicators that should be adopted by the DWP and its various projects in a results-based approach. The purpose would be to ensure progress monitoring in achieving these indicators towards fixed targets, assuming regularity, harmony and consistency of ILO reporting towards ROAS, HQ, donors and government; preparation and implementation of an annual integrated monitoring and evaluation plan; supervision of implementation of various studies, survey and situation analysis; in addition to ensuring coordination with the national statistics centre and regular follow-up on social statistics data. If funds are not available, Scenario (B) should be adopted, encompassing the absolute implementation of recommendation No. 1 above on one hand, related to refocusing the horizontal coverage of the next DWP and the number of projects to be followed up on, to ensure better fulfilment of monitoring and evaluation requirements. On the other hand, it would be important under that scenario to consider further integrating M&E on a cross-cutting basis across the mandate and daily work of different specialists working within ILO OPT, in addition to the managerial staff already handling various Monitoring and Evaluation tasks. Support should be provided to ILO oPt by M&E Section in ROAS and Eval department in Geneva in terms of coaching and evaluability assessments and enhancement on a regular basis, similar to the support provided by different DWT specialists in ROAS and HQ in different sectors (social security, cooperatives, OSH...etc). The eventual adoption of both scenario A and B could ensure better monitoring and evaluation. Furthermore, when designing a next phase of the DWP, it will be important to involve the regional Monitoring and Evaluation specialist in ILO RoAS in reviewing the programme document from a M&E perspective and verifying the validity of the indicators adopted in a results-based approach, as well as the existence within the DWP of an M&E section and plan.

Specific social brackets to target and to take into account in the design of the next phase of the Decent Work Programme:

People with disabilities need to be considered for inclusion as a target bracket of a next phase of the Decent Work Programme to ensure the fulfilment of their rights for Decent Work opportunities. The situation of decent work in East Jerusalem, especially for young Palestinian men and women, should also be emphasised in the design of the next phase of the Decent Work Programme. Finally, particular attention needs to be given to workers among the vulnerable brackets of youth and women who are living and working in remote and rural areas, including in zones C, A and B. This group faces concrete difficulties in terms of accessibility to these zones because of the Israeli occupation, and they need to be taken into account in any future phase of the Decent Work Programme.

Third phase of the Decent Work Programme

This final review recommends the planning, design and implementation of a third phase of the decent work programme while taking into consideration the findings and recommendations mentioned above. A third phase will be necessary. In this regard, it will be important to organize meetings among the tripartite stakeholders within the framework of planning the next phase of the decent work programme. This would allow discussion of the findings of the review of the decent work programme and the remarks of the participants during the recent workshop in which the final review was presented (comments provided in annex), as well as consideration of the objectives and priorities defined by the tripartite stakeholders for

the second phase of the DWP and whether or not they should be carried through to the next phase. The challenges of the second phase should also be discussed, as should the valuable ideas and suggestions brought up during the workshop, along with possible means to take account of them within the next phase of the DWP.

Annex

Final Review of the Palestinian Decent Work Programme

Comments and recommendations issued during the workshop with tripartite stakeholders to present findings of the review.

Ramallah – 20.06.2022

Decent work conditions and rights of Palestinian workers working within the Green Line in Israel

-Almost 20% of the Palestinian work force are working in Israel. They encompass an important portion of graduates from universities that did not find work opportunities in the Palestinian labour market. With high rates of unemployment, working in the green zone is the only coping mechanism for a large number of Palestinians. These workers are subject to various forms of exploitation, abuse and injustice that contrast with the principles of decent work, not to mention bad treatment at border checkpoints and military checkpoints. (The day before the workshop, a Palestinian worker working within the green line was shot dead by Israeli soldiers at the entry checkpoint on the border).

In the next phase of the decent work programme it will be important to include a specific axis of intervention specifically for those working within the green line with the objective of bringing about respect of their rights and working conditions according to the principles of decent work, and ensuring the creation of appropriate mechanisms for this purpose. An idea to consider, as suggested by the tripartite stakeholders, is the establishment of a specific office for ILO within Israel (within the green line zone), to be responsible for monitoring the fulfilment of the rights associated with decent work for Palestinian workers within Israel.

Institutionalization of social dialogue

-Institutionalization of social dialogue was highly debated. While the review report suggested three options, there were various different comments on these options, both supportive and opposing:

1- Institutionalization of the social dialogue should be based on the committee for labour policies (Scenario A suggested in the review report under institutionalization), as its role has been defined by the labour law as the key committee to lead social dialogue. In parallel it will be important to concretize the creation of the socio-economic council (Scenario B suggested in the review report), taking into consideration the mandate of the latter will cover much wider dimensions than social dialogue and the tripartite mechanism.

2-It is very important to create the socio-economic council as a platform for social dialogue (scenario B in the final review report), taking into account that there are many pending issues – such as the reform of the labour law or the reform of the social security law – that could be tackled and treated efficiently through a socio-economic council. The support of ILO is requested to bring about the establishment of the socio-economic council.

3-The creation of a specific commission for social dialogue (scenario C suggested in the review report) would be an appropriate solution with a structure encompassing a number of specialized committees.

Other remarks and comments related to institutionalization:

-The institutionalization of social dialogue is very important. If there was real institutionalization of social dialogue, this would have avoided many of the problems and challenges with which Palestinian workers and employers were confronted during the COVID-19 period.

-There are a number of ongoing tripartite committees working on different issues and topics. It is now important to consider how to coordinate and ensure liaison among these different committees. This is a question that should be answered jointly by the tripartite stakeholders.

-The different tripartite committees should meet on a regular basis taking into consideration that there are committees that have not met for years, such as the committee of decent work.

-The institutionalization of social dialogue should also put in place appropriate mechanisms to deal with the individual or small-scale conflicts that can take place in specific companies, both small and big.

-The form of institutionalization needed for social dialogue should be discussed among the tripartite constituents. The Ministry of Labour is open to all options (labour policies committee, commission under a number of committees, or socio-economic council).

Implementation of the new law on minimum wage

-While the new minimum wage was agreed upon by the tripartite stakeholders, to date it has not been implemented by employers due to the fact that no list of violations and fines has been developed and issued by the Ministry of Labour to ensure respect and commitment for the new minimum wage on the part of employers.

-The Ministry of Labour should be reinforced in terms of capacity to ensure it can monitor and ensure the commitment of the private sector to the new minimum wage, as well as enforcing it. Given its present capacity as defined by the law, it can only rely on the good will of different employers in terms of application of the new minimum wage.

- Social dialogue should take place, as some economic sectors might not be capable of implementing the minimum wage due to the weakness of these sectors and the fragility of companies within them, where they are facing limited capacity and profits. Hence, alternative options for the new minimum wage should be discussed.

Reform of the labour law

-It is important to quickly achieve reform of the Palestinian Labour Law through consensus among the tripartite stakeholders. In fact, the discussions on the reforms witnessed significant delays and it is time for the tripartite stakeholders to put their differences aside to achieve that reform, which has been pending for 20 years, to meet the expectations and needs of the workers and employers in line with international labour standards.

Fulfilment of DW principles for Palestinian women workers

-While reform of the labour law and review of the social security law have not yet been achieved, it is important to proceed with developing lists of norms and conditions in line with decent work for women workers.

-It is important to create the committee for equal payment due to the prevalence of inequities and injustice for Palestinian women workers.

-Virtual work should be given attention in the next phase of the Decent Work Programme as it is a modality that could allow woman to combine work from home with family responsibilities. It is a modality that should be encouraged in Palestine.

Expansion of Decent Work Programme interventions to Gaza.

-The recommendation of the review report to expand the next DWP to Gaza was highly welcomed by participants, while the review report recommendation suggesting consideration of the creation of a tripartite mechanism in Gaza was rejected, and considered as hurtful to the legacy of the PA and the principle of one unified Palestine. This is because the government in Gaza is considered as illegal. Cooperation with the local branches of the employer and worker unions is ongoing and will continue.

-An office for ILO has recently been reopened in Gaza and a local coordinator has been appointed. This will give a boost to cooperation with employer and worker organizations in Gaza.

Causes of failure of the social security law

-The review report should mention that among the causes of failure of the social security law is the occupation, which has no interest in creating social security cooperation because it would lead to a transfer of funds to that cooperation, according to the conventions of Oslo. Furthermore, another reason is the lack of trust of Palestinians on the board of social security cooperation under the control of the government.

-Therefore, it is very important to consider the creation of independent and neutral management for Social Security Cooperation, that can take decisions efficiently and independently from government influence.

Labour inspection and OSH

- It will be important for the next phase of the DWP to achieve the second step of the computerization of the inspection system related to two important directorates within the Ministry of Labour: the directorates of inspection and OSH.

-Furthermore, it will be important to consider better institutional development for the commission of inspection. In addition, it is worth considering working on reviewing the status of the labour inspection system to have a similar status to the public prosecution system in terms of power, salaries, working hours, and administrative and financial status. Finally, it is also recommended to consider:

1-Supporting the creation of a national centre for OSH

2- Continuing in creating a system of monitoring work injuries, which had started previously but stopped abruptly due to budgeting issues

3-Approval and adoption of the national strategy and policy for labour inspection

4- Approval and adoption of the national strategy and policy for OSH

5-Institutionalization of the national committee for OSH

6-Continuing to implement capacity building programmes for labour inspectors.

-It is recommended also to adopt some of the recommendations that were issued by the first conference of inspections as well as in the first social dialogue conference, such as recommendations for the creation of an authority for wages, due to its eventual importance for inspection work.

Mechanisms for labour conflict resolution

-The recommendation in the review report on the creation of special labour courts is very important, taking into consideration that there are complaints by workers and legal labour procedures in ordinary Palestinian courts that are still ongoing, which have been pending for more than 10 years.

-It is also recommended in the next phase to consider implementing trainings for judges on decent work rights and norms, within capacity building programmes.

-Mediation is an approach that should be discussed and that could be integrated into the next phase of the DWP, as it represents an efficient approach that could overcome lengthy court procedures. In this regard, the Palestinian Chamber for Local and International Mediation could be an institution worth cooperating with and including among the partners for the next phase of the DWP.

Cooperatives

-It is important to involve the labour unions in the ongoing process targeting the development of the cooperative sector strategy.

-There are a number of agricultural cooperatives that are effective. However, most of them are performing below expectations. Therefore, agricultural and industrial cooperatives need extensive support, including support in terms of export and access to external markets to sell their products.

Remedial measures during the COVID-19 crisis

-The Ministry of Labour was not capable of reacting promptly to the challenges of COVID 19. More institutionalization of social dialogue is needed to allow tripartite stakeholders to react appropriately and promptly to different crises and shocks.

Social dialogue

-In the social dialogue process between Palestinian tripartite stakeholders, it is often difficult to reach agreement among all three stakeholders. Agreements are most often reached on a bilateral basis between two of the three partners. In most cases there is often one stakeholder of the three who is not satisfied, who blocks eventual agreement or solutions.

Involvement of worker and employer unions in various national reporting processes

-It is important to link and coordinate DWP orientations and Sustainable Development Strategy, and to liaise and coordinate between the task forces working on each.

-During national reporting processes such as the one on SDGs, as the latter includes objectives related to ensuring full decent work (SDG No 8), it is important for the Ministry of Labour to involve representatives of workers and employers in the committee responsible for the preparation of the national report.

Priorities of the next DWP

-Supporting implementation of the employment strategy and monitoring and fulfilling the rights of Palestinian workers in Israel inside the green line should be key priorities within the next phase of the decent work programme.

Specific social brackets to target and to take into account in the design of the next phase of the Decent Work Programme:

-In future phases of the Decent Work Programme, it is important to consider people with disabilities among the target brackets, as well as the fulfilment of their rights for Decent Work opportunities.

-The situation of decent work in East Jerusalem and particularly for young Palestinian men and women should be also under focus in the design of the next phase of the Decent Work Programme.

-It will also be important for the next phase of the Decent Work Programme to give particular attention to workers among the vulnerable brackets of youth and women who are living and working in remote and rural areas, including in zones C, A and B, taking into consideration that there are concrete difficulties in terms of accessibility to these zones because of the Israeli occupation.

Transparency/Cooperation between Palestinian tripartite stakeholders and ILO and continuous commitment to the DWP principles

-ILO is working in close partnership with the Palestinian tripartite stakeholders and a new phase of the Decent Work Programme is planned and about to be designed. Therefore it is important that the Palestinian tripartite stakeholders, and mainly MoL, inform the ILO when other programmes, projects or initiatives are negotiated and signed with other development agencies, funds or donors in domains of implementation related to the Decent Work Programme, taking into consideration that some other development agencies might have suggested approaches that could contradict the principles and details of Decent Work as promoted by the ILO and its various conventions, or that could contradict of work plans and orientations discussed and approved through social dialogue between the tripartite stakeholders supported and coached by ILO.

-Palestinian tripartite stakeholders should reflect further commitment to the concept of Decent Work and its adoption permanently, rather than occasionally. This should not only be the case when it comes to

projects and meetings organized with ILO, but on all occasions vis-à-vis all other development partners and donors.

Harnessing local Palestinian expertise

-It is important for ILO to consider cooperating with local Palestinian consultants in implementing evaluations and reviews who can physically participate in debates with tripartite stakeholders.

Further discussions around the findings and recommendations of the review of the second DWP/Preparations for the planning of the DWP next phase

-The findings of the final review of the Palestinian DWP are important. It will be important to allocate further time to discuss the findings of the final review report as well as the remarks and feedback of participants.

-It will be important to organize another meeting or other meetings within the framework of planning the next phase of the decent work programme. This would allow discussion of the findings of the review of the decent work programme and the remarks of the participants of this workshop, as well as discussion of the objectives and priorities defined by the tripartite stakeholders for the second phase of the DWP and whether or not they should be adopted for the next phase. The difficulties that were faced during the second phase should also be discussed, as well as many of the valuable ideas that were mentioned during the workshop, and how to translate them and include them within the next phase of the DWP.

-It is suggested to establish a committee to discuss the findings of the final review of the decent work programme and its recommendations, as well as the remarks and comments of the participants in the final review workshop. In this regard, it is suggested that the committee encompass 15 members, five from each of the tripartite constituents. The committee would work with the ILO and discuss all findings and comments, defining a road map on the aspects to work towards for integration within the next phase of the Decent Work Programme.

-It is suggested to refer the recommendations, which are important and objective, to specialized committees such as committees for social security, women's employment, etc.

-It is important to refer the recommendations to specialized sub-committees in preparation for dialogue sessions with ILO to design the third phase of the Decent Work Programme.

-In the next sessions of dialogue to plan the next phase of the DWP, the tripartite stakeholders should adopt a realistic approach in terms of prioritization, bearing in mind that refocus will be necessary in terms of the objectives and orientation of the DWP contrary to the second phase, which was too horizontally ambitious.

-In the next discussion sessions among tripartite stakeholders in preparation for the next phase of the DWP, and while reviewing the findings and recommendations of the final review as well as the comments of participants, it is important to discuss whether the objectives and priorities defined for the second country programme have been reached. If this is not the case, it is important to discuss the causes and factors behind non-achievement of these objectives and priorities.

