Advancing the Decent Work Agenda in North Africa "ADWA (Phase I)" and Advancing the Decent Work Agenda in North Africa and the Levant "ADWA (Phase II)"– Final Independent Cluster Evaluation.

ILO DC/SYMBOL: RAF/18/50/SWE and GLO/21/61/SWE

Type of Evaluation: Clustered

Evaluation timing: Final

Evaluation nature: Independent

Project countries: Sub-Regional- Egypt, Tunisia, Morocco

P&B Outcome(s): 3 and 4

SDG(s): 1, 8, 10, 16

Date when the evaluation was completed by the evaluator: 03 October 2024

Date when evaluation was approved by EVAL: Click here to enter a date.

ILO Administrative Office: DWT/CO-Cairo

ILO Technical Office(s): DWT/CO-Cairo

Joint evaluation agencies:

Project duration: November 2018-January 2025

Donor and budget: Phase I: US$ 5,524,938.04 / Phase II: US$ 2,683,930.06

Name of consultant(s): Rafael Muñoz-Sevilla (Team Leader), Anis Ben Younes (National Consultant Tunisia), Bassem Adly (National Consultant Egypt).

Name of Evaluation Manager: Pacome Dessero

Evaluation Office oversight:

Evaluation budget: 42,873 USD

Key Words: Decent work, employment

Table of Contents

List of Tables

List of Acronyms

ACTEMP	ILO Bureau for Employers' Activities
ACTRAV	ILO Bureau for Workers Activities
ADWA	Advancing Decent Work Agenda
AI	Artificial Intelligence
CAPMAS	Central Agency for Public Mobilization and Statistics (Egypt)
CGE	Computable General Equilibrium
CO	Country Office
CPOs	Country Programme Outcomes
CTA	Chief Technical Advisor
DWCP	Decent Work Country Programme
ET	Evaluation Team
E&W	Employment, Wages and Hours of Work Establishment Survey
ELMPS	Egyptian Labour Market Panel Survey
ERF	Economic Research Forum
FEI	Federation of Egyptian Industries
GIZ	Gesellschaft für Internationale Zusammenarbeit
GJAM	Green Jobs Assessment Model
HCP	National Statistics Office of Morocco
ILO	International Labour Organization
ILS	International Labour Standards
ITC	International Training Centre of the ILO in Turin- Italy
LFS	Labour Force Survey
LMIS	Labour Market Information System
M&E	Monitoring and Evaluation
MEF	Ministry of Economy and Finance (Morocco)
MFPE	Ministry of Employment and Professional Training (Tunisia)
MoL	Ministry of Labour
MOM	Ministry of Manpower (Egypt)
MOPA	Ministry of Parliamentarian Affairs (Egypt)
MPED	Ministry of Planning and Economic Development (Egypt)

NCJS	National Council for Judiciary Studies (Egypt)
ONEQ	National Observatory of Employment and Skills (Tunisia)
OSH	Occupational Safety and Health
P&B	ILO Programme and Budget
SAM	Social Accounting Matrix
SCORE	Sustaining Competitive and Responsible Enterprises Programme
SDGs	Sustainable Development Goals
Sida	Swedish International Development Agency
UNESCWA	United Nations Economic and Social Commission for Western Asia
UNPDF	United Nations Partnership Development Framework
UNSDCF	United Nations Sustainable Development Cooperation Framework

▶ Executive Summary

Summary of project purpose, logic and structure

The projects "Advancing the Decent Work Agenda in North Africa" (ADWA Phase I) and "Advancing the Decent Work Agenda in North Africa and the Levant" (ADWA Phase II) are implemented in the framework of a partnership between the Government of Sweden—through the Swedish International Development Agency (Sida)—and the International Labour Organization (ILO) to advance the Decent Work Agenda in North Africa. ADWA Phase I, a six-year project (2018-2025)[1], and Phase II, a three-year project (2022-2024), have taken an innovative approach to promote evidence-based policies for full employment and effective access to International Labour Standards (ILS), including at the workplace level. The ADWA project Phase I builds on an earlier successful pilot phase that ran from August 2017 to November 2018. The pilot phase underwent an internal evaluation, which concluded in 2019. The ADWA project Phase II had an induction phase that ran from January 2022 to September 2022. The projects intervened at the regional and national levels. The country focus is on **Egypt, Morocco, and Tunisia**.

Project Outcomes

The projects have three main outcomes as described below. Corresponding outputs and activities have been developed under each Outcome and these were contextualized at country level.

ADWA Project - Phase I

- **Outcome 1:** Improved Data Collection, Data Analysis, and Data Use for Economic Policy Reforms to Steer Towards Job-rich Growth in Target North African Countries.

- **Outcome 2:** Improved Ratification, Reflection in National Jurisprudence, Enforcement and Knowledge of ILSs in Target North African Countries.

- **Outcome 3:** Enhanced Engagement of the Private Sector to Achieve Decent Work in Telecom and Automotive Sectors in Target North African Countries.

ADWA Project - Phase II

- **Outcome 1:** Increased adoption of economic policies and reforms promoting the growth of green and inclusive jobs in partner countries.

- **Outcome 2:** Improved ratification, reflection in national jurisprudence and increased knowledge of gender-related ILS in partner countries.

- **Outcome 3:** Improved contribution of the private sector to a just transition and green economy, especially from women entrepreneurs.

Purpose, scope and methodology of the evaluation

Overall, as specified in the Terms of Reference (TOR), the objective of this final evaluation is to review and assess the progress and achievements of the project against the planned outcomes and products, identify expected and unexpected results by examining the results chain, processes, contextual factors, and causality using OECD-DAC[2] criteria: relevance, coherence, effectiveness, efficiency, impact, and sustainability. The evaluation also provides actionable recommendations to the project, to the ILO, the national tripartite constituents and to the donor. The main findings, lessons learnt, and identified best practices will contribute to organizational learning and improvement of future project design and effectiveness.

The evaluation set out to answer a list of specific questions which were organized according to the thematic criteria as defined in the Terms of Reference (Annex 2). The evaluator addressed the evaluation questions using multiple sources of evidence, combining primary qualitative data with secondary quantitative data. Qualitative data were obtained using key informant interviews. Quantitative data were obtained from the performance reporting data

---

[1] The ILO and Sida signed a cost-extension up to 31 January 2025. The interest accrued during the duration of the project was added to the project budget, rather than returned to Sida. USD 150,401.07

[2] The Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development's (OECD) Development Assistance Committee (DAC)

presented by the ILO in the progress reports to Sida, as well as from other secondary sources. Data collection methods and stakeholder perspectives were triangulated to bolster the credibility and validity of the results.

Main findings and conclusions

Relevance and coherence

The ADWA projects are highly relevant and well-aligned with a variety of strategic frameworks and plans. These frameworks include the governments' development strategies, the ILO's Programme and Budget (P&B) and Decent Work Country Programme (DWCP) for Tunisia; Sida's MENA Regional Strategy priorities, the United Nations Sustainable Development Cooperation Frameworks (UNSDCF); and the Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs).

In addition, the evaluation team (ET) concluded that both ADWA projects have demonstrated significant relevance to the needs of national stakeholders in Egypt, Morocco, and Tunisia. This relevance is underscored by the alignment of the project's objectives and activities with the specific requirements and priorities of key stakeholders in the respective countries. In Egypt, the ADWA project addressed the need for improved labour market data by supporting CAPMAS in revising survey methodologies and enhanced judges' understanding of International Labour Standards (ILS) through targeted training. It also provided technical support to the Ministry of Planning and Economic Development (MPED) to enhance evidence-based policymaking using CGE models. In Morocco, the project assisted the High Commission for Planning (HCP) in improving labour statistics, supported female entrepreneurship through ILO tools, and strengthened ILS knowledge among Ministry of Labour staff. In Tunisia, ADWA improved the Ministry of Employment's project management with a new information system and institutionalized ILS training within the judiciary to enhance national jurisprudence.

The ADWA project's model is fundamentally sound and relevant to its objectives of addressing decent work deficits in North Africa. By combining policy-level and selected grassroots interventions, the project effectively tackles the region's complex challenges, such as promoting job-rich growth, improving labour standards, and enhancing social dialogue. Its emphasis on evidence-based policymaking is particularly crucial, as it ensures that the project's efforts are grounded in the realities of local labour markets, aiming for sustainable, long-term impact.

Despite its strengths, the project faces some challenges in its implementation and monitoring. While the Monitoring and Evaluation (M&E) framework is structured and detailed, particularly in Phase II, some indicators from Phase I lack targets and actuals, which undermines the project's ability to fully track its progress. The ADWA projects have successfully established extensive technical and financial collaborations with numerous ILO projects and departments, various UN agencies, and other cooperation partners in each of the participating countries.

Effectiveness

The ADWA projects have shown effectiveness in achieving its goals in Egypt, Morocco, and Tunisia. ADWA successfully enhanced national capacities for labour market data collection and analysis, contributing to better-informed policy-making. For example, several stakeholders opined that in Egypt, the collaboration with the Central Agency for Public Mobilization and Statistics (CAPMAS) improved labour market data quality, which has the potential for guiding Egypt's socio-economic policies and legal reforms. Morocco saw the development of a National Employment Strategy (NES) and the promotion of green jobs, while Tunisia benefited from digitalization of Ministry of Labour (MOL) procedures and processes and the updating of Active Labour Market Programmes. The project also made strides in promoting ILS, with substantial capacity-building initiatives. These efforts led to tangible improvements, such as the institutionalization of ILS training for judges in Egypt and the ratification of important ILO conventions in Morocco and Tunisia. The ADWA projects' effectiveness was further demonstrated by the engagement with the private sector to advance the Decent Work Agenda. In Egypt, the projects promoted responsible business practices and Decent Work conditions within multinational enterprises, alongside supporting women's entrepreneurship. Efforts in Egypt, Morocco and Tunisia included promoting female entrepreneurship through various initiatives.

The ADWA projects have successfully fostered extensive collaboration with a wide range of ILO projects and departments, UN agencies, and other cooperation partners. In addition, the ADWA projects have significantly fostered positive relationships with national stakeholders across Egypt, Morocco, and Tunisia through various collaborative efforts and successful partnerships These partnerships have been instrumental in enhancing the effectiveness and efficiency of the ADWA initiatives, allowing for advancements in areas such as capacity building, evidence-based policymaking, and the promotion of women's entrepreneurship across the target countries.

Despite facing significant external challenges such as administrative delays, currency devaluation, and the impacts of the COVID-19 pandemic, the projects implemented mitigating measures such as regular stakeholders' consultations, adaptive project implementation strategies, and improved coordination. These measures ensured the continued progress of the projects and highlighted the strong collaboration with government, parliamentary, and judiciary partners.

Efficiency

The projects' financial and human resources were used efficiently in the target countries to achieve project outcomes. The projects successfully leveraged additional resources (the co-financing leveraged constitutes 5.6% of the overall budget which according to the evaluators' experience this is good ratio compared, in average, to similar initiatives). through collaborations with other ILO initiatives and national-level stakeholders, which contributed to an implementation of the projects' activities. A prime example of this efficiency is seen in Egypt, where the project successfully leveraged additional resources and collaborations with national-level stakeholders to support the development and operationalization of the MNE Declaration roadmap. Disbursements and expenditures were in line with the expected budgetary plans.

The evaluation also found that the management and governance arrangements of the projects facilitated the achievement of project results. Roles and responsibilities were clearly understood by all parties involved in the implementation and monitoring processes. Additionally, the projects received adequate administrative, technical, and policy support from ILO offices and specialists, particularly from the Decent Work Team at the Cairo Office (DWT/CO Cairo). In addition, the projects established strong relationships and cooperation with national stakeholders and institutions, which was crucial for successful project implementation.

The ADWA projects have significantly fostered positive relationships with national stakeholders across Egypt, Morocco, and Tunisia through various collaborative efforts and successful partnerships

Considering the project's complexity, the numerous institutions involved, and the participation of three countries, the evaluators agree with several stakeholders that achieving the same results at a lower cost would not have been likely

Impact and Sustainability

The ADWA projects have demonstrated potential for positive impacts in Egypt, Morocco, and Tunisia across various dimensions, including economic development, gender equality, capacity building, environmental sustainability, and social dialogue. In Morocco, the projects contributed to inclusive economic growth through the development of the National Employment and Entrepreneurship Policy 2035, targeting women and youth. Gender equality initiatives empowered women entrepreneurs and supported legal reforms, such as advocating for the ratification of international conventions on violence, harassment, and domestic work. Capacity building efforts enhanced the skills of stakeholders, including judges and government officials, while strengthening institutions like Egypt's CAPMAS and Morocco's HCP for better labour market data analysis. Environmental sustainability was promoted through green growth strategies and job assessment models, facilitating green employment opportunities. Additionally, the projects reinforced social dialogue and tripartism, ensuring inclusive policy development and fostering collaboration between governments, employers, and workers to address labour market challenges (please refer to the impact and sustainability section in the body of the report for further details)

The positive changes introduced by the ADWA projects are likely to be sustained beyond their lifetime, according to opinions gathered by the evaluators from several stakeholders, due to the strategic alignment with national policies, robust capacity-building efforts and embedding of changes within existing institutional frameworks. However, the continued impact of the changes will depend on effective coordination, continuing stakeholder engagement beyond the duration of the project, securing necessary funding and expertise, and on-going ILO support.

Cross-cutting Issues

The ADWA projects have considered and integrated the principles of gender equality, tripartism, social dialogue, international labour standards, and a fair transition to environmental sustainability throughout and across the projects, from their design to the implementation. These integration efforts are reflected in the engagement with and inclusion of diverse stakeholders, undertaking of comprehensive training programs, provision of legislative support, and undertaking of initiatives aimed at the promotion of green and inclusive economic growth.

Lessons learned, good practices and recommendations

Lessons Learned

1. Early Engagement of National Partners: An important lesson learned is that regular and meaningful engagement with national stakeholders is crucial for aligning project activities with national priorities, ensuring stakeholder buy-in, and fostering ownership.

2. Design Context-Specific Approaches: Another key lesson learned is that tailoring interventions to the socio-economic and political contexts of each target country is essential for effective project implementation.

3. Navigating Instability: A key lesson learned is that political and economic instability significantly impacts projects, which highlights the importance of identifying risks early on in the design and implementation stages, anddeveloping contingency plans and flexible designs to maintain progress and achieve realistic objectives.

Good Practices

1. Strong Stakeholder Engagement: Involving stakeholders in planning, maintaining open communication, and including them in decision-making fosters trust, transparency, and a sense of ownership, ensuring sustained project activities and outcomes.

2. Collaboration with Judges and Parliamentarians: Engaging judges and parliamentarians in the project ensures well-informed decisions on labour laws, promotes awareness of labour rights, and enhances the capacity of the judiciary and legislative bodies to handle labour issues effectively.

3. Institutionalizing Capacity-Building: Implementing extensive capacity-building activities, such as training programs and curriculum development, ensures long-term impact. Support for training programs in Egypt, Tunisia, and Morocco exemplifies sustained efforts in capacity-building.

Recommendations

Recommendation 1: Leverage ILO-ADWA's Comparative Advantage to Strengthen Support for International Labour Standards and National Employment Policies in the MENA Region.

It is recommended that the ILO, building on ADWA's comparative advantage in policy-level work, continue promoting and enhancing the implementation of ILS across the MENA region, particularly in Egypt, Morocco, and Tunisia. This support should include ongoing technical assistance, capacity building, and advocacy to align national labour laws with ILS. Additionally, the ILO should intensify its efforts to support the development and implementation of National Employment Policies in these countries, ensuring they are evidence-based and inclusive of all relevant stakeholders.

Recommendation 2: Promote Cross-Fertilization of Best Practices and Strengthen Capacity Building in Labour Market Information Systems. The ILO, national Governments and Constituents should reinforce collaboration among Tunisia, Egypt, and Morocco to facilitate the sharing of best practices and innovations, particularly in the areas of ILS, labour market information systems and employment policies. This includes continued support for the enhancement of labour market data collection and analysis capabilities in Egypt, Morocco and Tunisia ensuring high standards and informed policy-making. Efforts should also focus on improving active labour market policies, enabling these countries to address common challenges through shared learning.

Recommendation 3: Expand and Integrate Green Jobs and Employment Initiatives. It is recommended that the ILO, national Governments and Constituents continue to expand the GJAM studies and integrate green employment initiatives into national strategies and policies in Egypt, Morocco, and Tunisia. This includes incorporating findings from GJAM studies into national policies, providing capacity building for stakeholders, and aligning these initiatives with broader sustainability and climate resilience goals.

Recommendation 4: Enhance Support for Legal and Institutional Frameworks for Labour Rights. The ILO, the national Governments and Constituents should continue to support the establishment and operationalization of labour legal aid offices in Egypt and build the capacity of judges and parliamentarians in Morocco. This support is crucial for ensuring effective implementation of labour laws, and access to legal services for workers and employers.

Recommendation 5: Support Women's Entrepreneurship and Broader Employment Strategies. The ILO should continue its collaboration with national partners to support women's entrepreneurship, particularly for women in vulnerable situations. In addition, by institutionalizing tools like the GetAhead program and providing ongoing training and mentorship, the ILO can contribute to the sustainable and scalable growth of women-owned businesses and ensure alignment with national employment goals.

Recommendation 6: Ongoing Collaboration for Improved Labour Market Data and Digitalization. The ILO should continue its collaboration with national institutions, such as CAPMAS in Egypt, the HCP in Morocco and MOL in Tunisia, to enhance labour market data systems. This includes supporting the integration of green employment components, implementing digital platforms like ILO.Stat, and improving the quality and accessibility of labour market data.

▶ Projects' background and description

The projects "Advancing the Decent Work Agenda in North Africa" (ADWA Phase I) and "Advancing the Decent Work Agenda in North Africa and the Levant" (ADWA Phase II) are implemented in partnership between the Government of Sweden—through the Swedish International Development Agency (Sida)—and the International Labour Organization (ILO) to advance the Decent Work Agenda in North Africa. ADWA Phase I is a six-year project (2018-2025), and Phase II is a three-year project (2022-2024). Both of which have taken an innovative approach to promote evidence-based policies for full employment and effective access to International Labour Standards (ILS), including at the workplace level. The ADWA project Phase I builds on the successful pilot phase that ran from August 2017 to November 2018. The pilot phase was subject to an internal evaluation concluded in 2019. The ADWA project Phase II had an induction phase that ran from January 2022 to September 2022.

As specified in the terms of reference (TOR) for the evaluation, the projects intervened at the regional and national levels. **The country focus is on Egypt, Morocco, and Tunisia**, with some specific activities carried out in Algeria, Jordan, and Lebanon. The activities carried out in Algeria (under the ILO SCORE programme) in the context of a Public-Private Partnership (PPP) signed between the ILO and Volvo in 2019 (which ended in 2022 and was not extended), have been discontinued since 2022, in line with the recommendations of the mid-term evaluation. Similarly, the activities carried out in Egypt in the context of an MoU signed between the ILO and Ericsson also ended in 2022 and have not been extended, in line with the recommendations of the mid-term evaluation. In Lebanon (initially proposed as a new target country), the inception phase was used to conduct an in-depth assessment of the renewable energy sector, intended to inform the ILO's intervention strategy under ADWA II. This led to the discontinuation of the project's interventions in the country. In Jordan and Lebanon, the activities have been discontinued since the funding proposed in the PRODOC to Sida was double of what was ultimately received from Sida due to allocation changes on their side linked to the war in Ukraine.

Being one of the very few projects in the region and thus holding a comparative advantage, a key characteristic is its work at the policy-making level to support evidence-based decisions across various dimensions of the Decent Work Agenda. The focus of the projects, and their main value added, is to jointly address issues related to job-rich economic growth and the implementation of ILS: two fundamental aspects for the development of the region and essential to advance towards the realization of the Sustainable Development Goals.

The following aspects have been considered in the development of the projects' strategy: demand from national stakeholders for technical assistance and development cooperation; gaps in international funding; and the prominence given to Decent Work and employment in national development frameworks.

The projects' interventions are designed strategically to achieve two main goals: a) Providing more jobs, and b) Making sure those jobs are better jobs:

a. More jobs

From an economic perspective, the policy agenda in North Africa focuses largely on maintaining macroeconomic stability, as well as on improving the business environment. With the support of the World Bank and the International Monetary Fund, Ministries in charge of the

economy and public finances have set up solid intelligence systems to preserve macroeconomic balances. Government efforts have also focused on cutting red tape and making it easier for businesses to operate. But these economic recipes on their own have fallen short in delivering job-rich growth, and in promoting the sustainable sort of growth that makes good use of a country's assets – starting with its workforce. Public action in North Africa needs, therefore, to pursue much more proactively a job-rich growth agenda. This is the work of the projects under Outcome 1 which is being implemented in Egypt, Tunisia and Morocco.

b.   Better Jobs

The decent work challenge is not going to be met with success only on the economic front. Workers and employers are rights holders, and a job is not merely an economic function, but a place in society and a large part of an individual's ambitions and hopes. In reference to ILS, while the North African countries have a good record of ratification of key ILO conventions, the de facto application of ILS remains a patchy picture. The projects are designed to work along four complementary streams to further promote the effective application of ILS that are intrinsic to the promotion of the Decent Work Agenda. Those streams include collaboration with National Parliaments to promote and facilitate ILS ratifications, expert-review of the alignment of national laws with ILS, working on national jurisprudence and provide guidance for it to refer directly to relevant ILS. Lastly, the projects aim to engage with the media and key civil society organizations to enhance their understanding of ILS and enrich the public discourse in these areas. This is the work of the projects under Outcome 2 which is being implemented in Egypt, Tunisia and Morocco.

c.   Partnering with the Private Sector

Under the ADWA Phase I, the project partnered with Swedish enterprises with the goal to illustrate that improved adherence to ILS and improved working conditions can promote private sector profitability and could influence economic policy development. However, as explained above, the activities carried out under this outcome in both Algeria (PPP signed between the ILO and Volvo in 2019) and in Egypt (MoU signed between the ILO and Ericsson) ended in 2022 and have not been extended, in line with the recommendations of the mid-term evaluation.

"Advancing the Decent Work Agenda in North Africa and the Levant" ADWA' Phase II, took into consideration the persistent economic gender gap and the low female labour force participation in North Africa. The project has therefore developed Outcome 3 introducing three new thematic areas: 1) gender, 2) climate change, and 3) working towards an environmentally sustainable economy that is characterised by equitable access to decent and green jobs for women and men. The aim of this outcome is to improve the contribution of the private sector, and particularly women entrepreneurs, to a just transition and green economy in the three targeted countries.

Project Outcomes

The projects have three main outcomes as described above. Corresponding outputs and activities have been developed under each Outcome and were contextualized at country level.

ADWA Project - Phase I

- **Outcome 1:** Improved Data Collection, Data Analysis, and Data Use for Economic Policy Reforms to Steer Towards Job-rich Growth in Target North African Countries
- **Outcome 2:** Improved Ratification, Reflection in National Jurisprudence, Enforcement and Knowledge of ILSs in Target North African Countries
- **Outcome 3:** Enhanced Engagement of the Private Sector to Achieve Decent Work in Telecom and Automotive Sectors in Target North African Countries

ADWA Project - Phase II

- **Outcome 1:** Increased adoption of economic policies and reforms promoting the growth of green and inclusive jobs in partner countries.
- **Outcome 2:** Improved ratification, reflection in national jurisprudence and increased knowledge of gender-related ILS in partner countries.
- **Outcome 3:** Improved contribution of the private sector to a just transition and green economy, especially from women entrepreneurs.

▶ Evaluation background

ILO considers evaluation as an integral part of the implementation of technical cooperation activities towards learning, project management and accountability for all stakeholders. Provisions for evaluations are made in all projects, in accordance with ILO evaluation policy. These are based on the nature of the project, and the specific requirements agreed upon at the time of the project design, and during the project as per established ILO procedures. According to ILO evaluation guidelines, 3rd edition, projects with a budget of over 5 million USD are subject to an independent midterm and a final evaluation. The Advancing the Decent Work Agenda in North Africa project (Phase I) underwent a mid-term independent evaluation (MTE)[3] as per ILO evaluation policy and procedures. This report reflects the findings of the independent, final evaluation.

In evaluations, ILO applies the evaluation criteria established by the OECD/DAC Evaluation Quality Standards and the UNEG Code of Conduct for Evaluation in the UN System.

---

[3] https://webapps.ilo.org/ievaldiscovery/#axmpmmf

▶ Purpose and objectives of the evaluation

As specified in the Terms of Reference, the current final independent cluster evaluation serves multiple objectives:

a. Assess the relevance and coherence of projects' design, regarding the countries' needs as well as how the projects are perceived and valued by the target groups.

b. Identify the contributions of the projects to DWCP or similar national frameworks where appropriate, the SDGs, the countries UNDAF, the ILO P&B objectives and Countries outcomes and their synergy with other projects and programmes.

c. Analyse the implementation strategies of the projects regarding their effectiveness in achieving the project outcomes and impacts, including unexpected results and factors affecting project implementation (positively and negatively).

d. Review the institutional set-up, capacity for the projects' implementation, coordination mechanisms, and the use and usefulness of management tools. including the project monitoring tools and workplans.

e. Assess the implementation efficiency of the projects including in light of the recommendations of the mid-term evaluation.

f. Review the strategies for the outcomes' sustainability and their orientation to impact.

g. Identify lessons learned, potential good practices and lessons to be learned for the key stakeholders.

h. Provide strategic recommendations for the different tripartite constituents, stakeholders, and partners to improve future projects.

▶ Scope of the Evaluation

15

The independent cluster evaluation covers Phases I and II of the ADWA project (the project, hereafter), until the date of the evaluation starts and covers <u>Egypt, Morocco and Tunisia</u> where the projects are implemented.

For all practical purposes, the evaluation Terms of Reference and the ILO Evaluation policies and guidelines define the overall scope of this evaluation. Recommendations, emerging from the evaluation, are strongly linked to the findings of the evaluation and provide clear guidance to stakeholders on how they can address them.

The evaluation has integrated gender equality and non-discrimination as a crosscutting concern. Furthermore, the evaluation addressed social dialogue, international labour standards and fair environmental transition.

▶ Scope of the Evaluation

▶ Evaluation criteria and questions

As per the ToR, the evaluation has addressed the general areas of focus (evaluation criteria) and specific questions, as detailed in the table below.

Table 1. Evaluation Criteria and Questions

Evaluation criteria and questions	
Criteria	**Questions**
Relevance and coherence	1. Are the projects relevant to the achievements of the governments' strategy, policy and plan, the DWCPs, SIDA's MENA Regional Strategy priorities as well as other relevant regional and global commitments such as the UNDAFs, SDGs targets and ILOs strategic Objectives (Programme & Budget 2018-19 and 2020-21)? 2. Have the projects been relevant to the felt needs of the national stakeholders and final beneficiaries? 3. How relevant have the projects been in developing national capacities? 4. Have the projects planning included a useful monitoring and evaluation framework with outcomes indicators, baselines and targets? 5. To what extent have ADWA' activities been able to complement other Project partners' activities, other ILO projects and other activities of the UN or non-UN international development aid organizations at local level in the countries of implementation?
Effectiveness	6. To what extent have the projects been being able to achieve its results at outcome and output levels, with particular attention to the project objectives? 7. How have positive and negative factors outside of the control of the projects affected results and how have the projects dealt with these external factors? 8. What, if any, unintended results of the projects have been identified or perceived? 9. What have been the main contributing and challenging factors towards projects' success in attaining its targets? 10. How well are projects partners (in particular Government, Parliament and Judiciary partners) able to fulfil the roles expected in the project's strategy?
Efficiency	11. Have the financial and human resources being used efficiently in the target countries to achieve outputs? 12. Have there been resources leveraged (monetary or in-kind) by projects partners (e.g., by collaborating with other ILO initiatives and other projects; as well as through National-level stakeholders) to support the implementation of activities? 13. To what extent have the disbursements and projects expenditures been in line with expected budgetary plans? Why? 14. Has the management and governance arrangement of the projects facilitated project results? Is there a clear understanding of roles and responsibilities by all parties involved into implementation and monitoring? 15. Is the monitoring & evaluation system in place relevant, including collecting and using data disaggregated by sex (and by other relevant characteristics,

	such as people with disabilities and other disadvantaged groups the project might have identified)?
	16. Have the projects created good relationship and cooperation with relevant national and regional stakeholders for implementation purposes?
	17. Have the projects received adequate administrative, technical and - if needed - policy support from the ILO office and specialists in the field (DWT/CO Cairo and CO Algiers) and other ILO offices as relevant?
Impact and Sustainability	18. Has national ownership been promoted?
	19. How effective have the projects been at stimulating interest and participation in the projects at national level?
	20. To what extent are the projects' positive changes likely to continue after its end? What socio, economic and institutional changes are likely to be sustained beyond the projects lifetime?
	21. What good practices and success factors have partner organizations, ILO personnel and partners identified to promote sustainability?
	22. How effective/relevant is the sustainability plan of the projects?
	23. To what extent the recommendations of the mid-term evaluation have been integrated in the projects' implementation strategy?
Cross-cutting: Gender	24. How effective were the projects at including gender mainstreaming? How effective were the strategies to promote equal participation of women and men?
	25. Were there sufficient and appropriate gender-sensitive monitoring structures in place to help assess the outcomes and impact of the projects?
	26. Has the project considered tripartism, social dialogue, international labour standards and a fair transition to environmental sustainability in its design and implementation?

Evaluation Schedule

The evaluation was conducted between July and September 2024. The evaluation team (ET) reviewed project documents, developed data collection instruments, and prepared for the data collection and fieldwork phase during the month of July. Preliminary meetings with the Evaluation manager and the Project Team were also conducted during that month. Data collection and fieldwork was conducted in Morocco, Tunisia, and Egypt between July 16 and August 12, 2024. The evaluation report was written in August 2024.

▶ Evaluation methodology

Evaluation phases

- <u>Inception phase</u>

During the inception phase the ET reviewed the documents and relevant materials from secondary sources (e.g. project documents; technical progress reports; mid-term evaluation, etc.) needed for the successful implementation of the evaluation and identified the key informants to be interviewed. In addition, the ET held interviews through conference calls and exchanges via e-mail with the evaluation manager and the project´s team.

The ET prepared of the Inception report containing the methodological approach to the evaluation including the main aspects of operational planning of the evaluation.

- <u>Data collection phase</u>

During the data collection phase, the ET conduct interviews (remote in Tunisia and Egypt; face-to-face in Morocco) with project and ILO staff as well as with national stakeholders; and facilitated remote stakeholders' workshops toward the end of this phase.

- <u>Report writing phase</u>

In the report writing phase, the evaluation team analysed the collected data, synthesized findings, and formulated conclusions and recommendations based on the evidence. This phase involved drafting the evaluation report, which was shared with stakeholders for feedback. After incorporating their input, the final evaluation report was prepared.

Methods and techniques

The selection of evaluation methods and techniques assured data collection that was relevant for the evidence needed, in order to best answer the Evaluation Questions (EQs) and analyses that were considered the most appropriate for generating useful findings and address the Evaluation Criteria.

To strengthen the credibility and usefulness of evaluation results, to ensure data accuracy and facilitate their interpretation, the ET used a mix of data sources which were collected through multiple methods and techniques. Through "triangulation" the ET was able to rule out the bias that may come from single information sources, or the use of single methods or single observations.

Evaluation methods and techniques collected primary and secondary data. The primary data for this evaluation consisted of information observed by the evaluators or collected directly from stakeholders, related to their first-hand experience with the project. Secondary data for this evaluation included documentary evidence with direct relevance for the evaluation purposes, and materials produced by the ILO, individual stakeholders or agencies that were produced for purposes other than those of the evaluation. In addition, quantitative data were obtained from the performance reporting data presented by the ILO in the Technical Progress Reports (TPRs) to Sida.

Comprehensive document review

The ET reviewed a variety of documents related to the project. Examples include the project document, TPRs, and other key documents produced by the project. Additionally, the ET analysed other relevant documentary evidence, as listed in Annex 6.

Key Project Informant Interviews and Focus Group Discussions

The ET conducted a series of interviews with 61 key informants (28 women and 33 men). The sampling considered representatives from all key stakeholders: ILO, Sida, Government agencies, and employers and workers' organizations from the three countries of implementation. A complete list of participants appears in Annex 5.

Table 2. Categories of informants

Categories	Men	Women	Total
Sida	--	1	1
ILO	8	9	17
Government	17	14	31
Employers' Organizations	3	3	6
Workers Organizations	3	1	4
Others	2	--	2
Total	33	28	61

The ET used qualitative data analysis methods to categorize, triangulate, synthesize, and summarize the raw data captured from the interviews. The results of the data analysis provided tangible blocks of information, which the ET used to write the evaluation report. The data analysis is consistent with the evaluation questions in the Terms of reference.

Stakeholders' workshop for presenting results

The ET conducted stakeholders' virtual workshops to present the findings of the evaluation to key stakeholders including the donor.

Limitations of the evaluation

The findings in this evaluation are based on information sourced from background documents and key informant interviews. The accuracy of these findings depends on the reliability of the information provided to the evaluation team and the team's ability to triangulate that data effectively.

While the methodology selected is appropriate for the evaluation's objectives, it carries inherent limitations. These include the potential for measurement inaccuracies and, in some cases, challenges in establishing causal relationships. Furthermore, the study's findings are drawn from a specific sample, which may present unintentional limitations in terms of representativeness.

A notable challenge was the large volume of information that needed to be analysed. The process of sorting through a wide array of documents and data was time-consuming and required significant resources. Despite efforts to streamline the review process, this limitation may have impacted the depth of analysis in certain areas. The evaluation team has prioritized

relevance, while acknowledging the practical constraints of managing such a substantial amount of information within the available timeframe.

Despite these challenges, the team believes that the interviews conducted offer a strong representation of key stakeholders' and beneficiaries' perspectives. Additionally, a wide range of documents was reviewed, and retrospective approaches were used to establish a solid analytical foundation for the evaluation.

▶ Main Findings

Relevance and coherence

In this section, the ET addresses a series of evaluation questions to ascertain the relevance and coherence of the ILO's ADWA project. The evaluation reviewed whether the projects align with the strategic priorities and plans of the governments, the Decent Work Country Programmes, Sida's Regional Strategy, and other significant regional and global frameworks such as the United Nations Sustainable Development Cooperation Frameworks, Sustainable Development Goals, and the ILO's strategic objectives outlined in the Programme and Budget. Additionally, the ET examines if the projects meet the expressed needs of national stakeholders as well as the final beneficiaries, and how they have contributed to developing national capacities. The relevance of the monitoring and evaluation framework has also been evaluated. Finally, the section has assessed the extent to which ADWA's activities complement the efforts of other project partners, additional ILO projects, and the initiatives of other UN or non-UN international development aid organizations at the local level in the countries of implementation.

Alignment with the strategic priorities and plans

The ADWA´ projects are found to be highly relevant and well-aligned with a variety of strategic frameworks and plans. These include the governments' strategies, the ILO's Programme and Budget (P&B) and Decent Work Country Programme (DWCP) for Tunisia; Sida's MENA Regional Strategy priorities, the United Nations Sustainable Development Cooperation Frameworks (UNSDCF); and the Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs). This alignment ensures that the projects support broad, internationally recognized development objectives while catering to specific national needs.

Governments' strategies and plans

In **Egypt**, the government's development strategy, *Vision 2030*, aims for inclusive economic development, enhanced social justice, and improved livelihoods for its citizens. The ADWA projects contribute to these goals through their emphasis on macroeconomic stability, improved business environments, and the promotion of decent work. By focusing on economic reforms that foster job-rich growth and better employment conditions, the projects align with Egypt's priority to increase employment opportunities and improve workplace standards, particularly in sectors with high job growth potential. In addition, the project is well aligned with Egypt´s National Strategy on the Green Economy, launched in 2016 and updated in 2023: the National Sustainable Development Strategy "Egypt 2030".

Morocco's *National Sustainable Development Strategy* (2017-2030) as well as its *New Development Model* both aim to boost economic growth, reduce social disparities, and increase employment opportunities, especially for youth and women. In addition, *Morocco´s National Employment Strategy* (NES) aims at increasing the employed population and a reduction of unemployment to 3,9% by 2025. The ADWA projects align well with these objectives, especially through their work on promoting the implementation of International Labour Standards (ILS) and enhancing job quality. Morocco's emphasis on sustainable development and social inclusion dovetails with the ADWA's initiatives to create better jobs and engage with the private sector to ensure compliance with labour laws and improve labour conditions. In addition, the *Green Morocco Plan*, the *Rural Development Strategy* and the *Development Fund for Rural*

Mountainous Areas are flagship mechanisms for reducing inequalities and promote employment creation.

Tunisia's plans, such as *Vision 2035* and the *Development Plan 2023-2025*, focus on economic recovery, employment promotion, and social inclusion. The ADWA projects' efforts in Tunisia are particularly aligned with these plans, given their focus on promoting economic policies that enhance job creation and improve labour standards. Moreover, the *Tunisian National Environment Protection Strategy* focuses on strengthening legal and institutional mechanisms for protecting the environment. as well as on establishing green sectoral policies and programmes, by collaborating with both the public and private sector.

Alignment with broader ILO policies and strategies: P&B and DWCP

- *ILO Programme and Budget (P&B)*

The Programme and Budget (P&B) of the ILO sets out the strategic objectives and expected outcomes for the Organization's work in the biennium and is approved every two years by the International Labour Conference[4].The ADWA projects are aligned with and contribute to the following P&B outcomes:

Table 3. Projects´ alignment with the ILO P&B

Projects' alignment with the ILO P&B	
P&B for the biennium 2024–25	Outcome 3: Full and productive employment for just transitions. Outcome 4: Sustainable enterprises for inclusive growth and decent work.
P&B for the biennium 2022–23	Outcome 2: International labour standards and authoritative and effective supervision. Outcome 3: Economic, social and environmental transitions for full, productive and freely chosen employment and decent work for all. Outcome 4: Sustainable enterprises as generators of employment and promoters of innovation and decent work.
P&B for the biennium 2020-21	Outcome 2: International Labour Standards and authoritative and effective supervision. Outcome 3: Economic, social and environmental transitions for full, productive and freely chosen employment and decent work for all. Outcome 4: Sustainable enterprises as generators of employment and promoters of innovation and decent work.
P&B for the biennium 2018-19	Outcome 1: More and better jobs for inclusive growth and improved youth employment prospects. Outcome 2: Ratification and application of international labour standards. Outcome 4: Promoting sustainable enterprises.

Source: ILO : https://www.ilo.org/global/about-the-ilo/how-the-ilo-works/programme-and-budget/lang--en/index.htm

[4]Source: ILO: https://www.ilo.org/global/about-the-ilo/how-the-ilo-works/programme-and-budget/lang--en/index.htm

▶ **Error! No text of specified style in document.**

▪ *ILO Decent Work Country Programmes*

Throughout the world, Decent Work Country Programmes have been established as the main vehicle for delivery of ILO support to countries. DWCPs define, in agreement with the national constituents, the priority areas for ILO technical support in a country[5].

Only one of the three countries included in the current evaluation, namely Tunisia, has a DWCP in place. The projects closely align with the DWCP, with both emphasizing the enhancement of job-rich growth, the implementation and enforcement of ILS, and the engagement of the private sector to foster decent work environments. ADWA's efforts resonate with the DWCP's objectives of boosting employment, ensuring compliance with labour laws, and enhancing workplace standards.

The projects also align well with the current ILO Country Programme Outcomes (CPOs). In particular:

Egypt

- EGY101- *Increased capacity of constituents to develop labour market services and support transitions to decent work, particularly for youth and women*.

- EGY108- *The Labour Market Information and Analysis System is strengthened through technical support for producers and users*.

Morocco

- MAR176- *Les capacités des mandants sont renforcées pour élaborer et mettre en oeuvre des stratégies nationales et régionales en faveur de l'emploi décent et pour améliorer l'information et l'analyse du marché de travail[6]*.

- MAR826- *Les capacités des Etats membres de ratifier et d'appliquer les normes internationales du travail, ainsi que de s'acquitter de leurs obligations en matière de présentation de rapports, sont renforcées[7]*.

Tunisia

- TUN102- *Les capacités institutionelles sont renforcées pour la promotion de politique et des programmes d'emploi et pour l'amélioration des systèmes d'information et d'analyse du marché du travail en faveur de l'emploi décent[8]*.

- TUN826- *Les capacités des Etats membres de ratifier et d'appliquer les normes internationales du travail ainsi que de s'acquitter de leurs obligations en matière de présentation de rapports sont renforcées[9]*.

---

[5] Source ILO : https://www.ilo.org/global/about-the-ilo/how-the-ilo-works/organigramme/program/dwcp/lang--en/index.htm

[6] MAR 176 -The capacity of constituents is strengthened to develop and implement national and regional strategies for decent work and to improve labour market information and analysis.

[7] MAR826- Member States' capacities to ratify and implement international labour standards and to fulfil their reporting obligations are strengthened.

[8] TUN102- Institutional capacities are strengthened for the promotion of employment policies and programmes and for the improvement of labour market information and analysis systems for decent work.

[9] TUN826- Member States' capacities to ratify and implement international labour standards and to fulfil their reporting obligations are strengthened.

Sida's MENA Regional Strategy priorities

The ADWA projects are highly relevant and well-aligned with Sweden's *Middle East and North Africa (MENA) Regional Development Cooperation Strategy 2021-2025*[10], which prioritizes sustainable economic development, gender equality, democracy, human rights, and environmental sustainability. More precisely, ADWA phase II aligns well with Pillar Three of the Sweden strategy: Environmentally and Climate Resilient Sustainable Development and Sustainable Use of Natural Resources with Gender Equity. Both ADWA projects place a strong emphasis on economic development and job creation, key elements of Sweden strategic focus.

Moreover, a central principle of Sweden strategy is the promotion of human rights and decent working conditions. The ADWA projects support these goals by focusing on the enhancement and enforcement of ILS, thereby promoting better labour practices and workplace-related rights. In addition, the project is well aligned with the most recent *Strategy for Sweden's regional development cooperation with the Middle East and North Africa (2024–2027)*. More specifically, it aligns with the strategy's first objective: economic development, education, trade, and green transition. This includes increased job creation through private sector development, innovation, entrepreneurship, and the green transition, with a particular focus on the economic empowerment of women and young people[11].

Alignment with the United Nations Sustainable Development Cooperation Frameworks (UNSDCF)

The ADWA projects align well with the objectives of the United Nations Partnership Development Framework (UNPDF) for 2018-2022 and the United Nations Sustainable Development Cooperation Framework (UNSDCF) for Egypt for 2023-2027; the United Nations Development Assistance Framework (UNDAF) for 2017-2021 and the 2023-2027 UNSDCF for Morocco; as well as the 2021-2025 UNSDCF for Tunisia.

Each country's specific priorities regarding economic growth, employment and labour standards, are well-supported by the projects' activities and outcomes.

Alignment with the Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs)

Both phases of the ADWA projects emphasize economic development and employment, directly supporting *SDG 8: Decent Work and Economic Growth*. In addition, the projects work to improve the ratification and application of ILS, ensuring better work conditions and equitable employment practices, which are aligned with *SDG 10: Reduced Inequalities*. The projects also support other SDGs such as *Goal 1: End poverty in all its forms, everywhere*; or *Goal 16: Promoting Peaceful and Inclusive Societies*.

Relevance regarding the needs of national stakeholders and final beneficiaries

Based on document review and interviews with project stakeholders, the ET concluded that the ADWA projects have demonstrated significant relevance to the needs of national stakeholders in Egypt, Morocco, and Tunisia. This relevance is underscored by the alignment of the project's

---

[10]   https://www.government.se/international-development-cooperation-strategies/2021/03/strategy-for-swedens-regional-development-cooperation-with-the-middle-east-and-north-africa-20212025/

[11]   https://government.se/international-development-cooperation-strategies/2024/04/strategy-for-swedens-regional-development-cooperation-with-the-middle-east-and-north-africa-20242027/

objectives and activities with the specific requirements and priorities of key stakeholders in these countries.

The following examples highlight how the project has addressed these needs:

In **Egypt**, national stakeholders, particularly the Central Agency for Public Mobilization and Statistics (CAPMAS), required enhanced labour market data to inform policy decisions. The ADWA project's support, for example, with revising labour market survey methodologies directly addressed this need. The revised methodologies for the Labour Force Survey (LFS) and the Employment, Wages, and Hours of Work Survey (ES), developed in collaboration with CAPMAS, have been actively utilized to improve labour market data in Egypt. These updates have enabled CAPMAS to better capture key labour market dynamics. CAPMAS's active participation in international forums, such as the 21st International Conference of Labour Statisticians, has further strengthened its capacity, allowing for the ongoing application and refinement of these methodologies to support evidence-based policy making.

In addition, there was a recognized need to improve the understanding and application of International Labour Standards among judges. The project's training for judges on ILS and labour legislation filled this gap, promoting better compliance with international labour laws. The Ministry of Planning and Economic Development (MPED) required better analytical tools for policy formulation. The project's technical support for using Computable General Equilibrium (CGE) models helped enhance the ministry's capacity for evidence-based policy making.

In **Morocco**, the High Commission for Planning (HCP) needed support to improve labour statistics production. ADWA's technical assistance aligned with this need, supporting the HCP's efforts to improve labour market data. Moreover, there was a need to support female entrepreneurship, particularly for women with low levels of education. The project's initiatives using the ILO's tools and the creation of a project bank for green projects targeting potential women entrepreneurs directly addressed this need. In addition, the Ministry of Labour required enhanced knowledge of ILS among its staff. The project's sponsorship of staff participation in ILS training courses at the ITC in Turin met this need, contributing to better implementation of labour standards.

In **Tunisia**, the Ministry of Employment and Vocational Training (MoL) needed a robust management system for the management of international cooperation projects. The establishment of an information management system by ADWA addressed this requirement, improving the ministry's project management capabilities. Additionally, there was a need for institutionalized ILS training within the judiciary to enhance the incorporation of ILS in national jurisprudence. The project's efforts in this area ensured sustained capacity building and improved judicial processes.

Relevance regarding developing national capacities

Regarding the relevance of the projects in developing national capacities (please refer to evaluation question #3), through document review and interviews with key stakeholders, the evaluators concluded that, overall, the ADWA projects have proved relevant in developing national capacities. This relevance can be seen through its comprehensive capacity-building initiatives aimed at enhancing the skills and knowledge of key stakeholders, promoting evidence-based policy making, and institutionalizing new practices within national frameworks.

For example, in **Egypt**, several workshops on International Labour Standards enhanced judges' knowledge these standards and labour legislation through training courses conducted in

partnership with Egypt's National Centre for Judicial Studies (NCJS). Additionally, the project provided labour-specialized judges with specific training on gender issues in labour law.

In **Morocco**, the project capacity-building workshops were conducted for HCP teams on the production of labour statistics. ADWA also supported trainers under the Social Development Agency (ADS in French) to target women with low levels of education, encouraging them to create small businesses through the ILO's GetAhead[12] tool. ADWA also sponsored the participation of staff of the Moroccan Ministry of Labour in ILS training courses organized by the International Training Centre (ITC) of the ILO in Turin.

In **Tunisia**, the ADWA projects institutionalized comprehensive training on ILS within the Higher Institute of the Judiciary. In addition, a seminar on labour inspection and public employment services was held, improving understanding of labour statistics and ILS concepts among participants.

Monitoring and Evaluation Framework

The ADWA project's model is fundamentally sound and relevant to its objectives of addressing decent work deficits in North Africa. The project's approach, which combines interventions at both the policy and grassroots levels, is well-aligned with the complex challenges of promoting job-rich growth, improving labour standards, and enhancing social dialogue in the region.

Furthermore, the model's emphasis on evidence-based policymaking is highly pertinent. By focusing on the production and use of robust data to inform decisions, the project aims to create sustainable policy changes that are deeply rooted in the realities of the labour markets in these countries. This approach is crucial for ensuring that the project's interventions are not only effective in the short term but also sustainable in the long run.

The projects planning included a Monitoring and Evaluation (M&E) framework with outcomes indicators, baselines and targets. However, targets and actuals are missing for several Phase I indicators. Despite these omissions, overall, the ET has found that the M&E framework (in particular for Phase II) demonstrates an overall structured approach to monitoring and evaluating the projects' progress, with defined indicators, data collection methods, and responsibilities.

The project exhibits some notable features, including a strong participatory approach, a focus on capacity building and skills transfer to project partners, and a commitment to generating ownership and sustainability of the project amongst key stakeholders.

Complementarities with other ongoing initiatives

The ADWA projects have successfully established extensive collaborations with numerous ILO projects and departments, various UN agencies, and other cooperation partners. Below, we provide some examples of these collaborative efforts.

In **Egypt**, ADWA has actively collaborated with various international agencies to enhance capacity building and support evidence-based policymaking. Key collaborations include, for example:

- UNWOMEN and GIZ: ADWA has partnered with UNWOMEN and GIZ on various capacity building initiatives focused on capacity building. These efforts aimed to

---

[12] https://www.ilo.org/resource/get-ahead-resources

       improve the skills and knowledge of stakeholders involved in the design Implementation of labour market policies and practices.

- United Nations Economic and Social Commission for Western Asia (UNESCWA): This collaboration supported evidence-based policymaking through the development and implementation of the Computable General Equilibrium (CGE) model, which aids in assessing economic policies' impacts.

- ILO PROSPECTS and ERF: ADWA has worked with the PROSPECTS programme on labour market surveys and projections, funded and supported by specific activities aimed at improving labour market data and analysis.

- UNWOMEN: The project also partnered with UNWOMEN to support workshops and capacity-building initiatives focusing on ILS.

In **Morocco**, ADWA has joined forces with several projects and agencies to promote female entrepreneurship, green jobs, and capacity building. Notable collaborations include the following:

- ILO ProAgro and Wafira Projects: These joint efforts with ADWA focused on supporting female entrepreneurship and the creation of green jobs, helping women to establish and grow sustainable businesses.

- UNWOMEN: ADWA has collaborated with UNWOMEN to promote female entrepreneurship and green jobs, contributing to the economic empowerment of women in Morocco. Moreover, through joint programming, ADWA and UNWOMEN focused on capacity building, particularly addressing gender-based violence and harassment in the workplace.

- ILO THAMM Project: ADWA supported Morocco's membership in the ILO.stat platform by covering interpretation costs while THAMM paid for logistics and travel for experts, enhancing the country's labour statistics capabilities.

- INWORK: ADWA has also partnered with the ILO INWORK department to support the adoption of evidence-based policies for setting and updating negotiated minimum wages and collective bargaining. Additionally, they jointly conducted a diagnostic study on new forms of work (part-time and platform work).

Regional Collaboration

ADWA's regional collaborations aimed to address broader labour market challenges across North Africa. Key regional activities included, for example:

- Economic Research Forum (ERF): ADWA has established a network of experts and developed the Annual Regional Reports on Jobs and Growth in North Africa in collaboration with ERF. According to several stakeholders consulted by the ET, these reports provide valuable insights into regional labour market trends and policy impacts.

- COVID-19 Monitor Surveys: In collaboration with ERF and supported by the *Agence Française de Développement* (AFD), ADWA conducted surveys in Egypt, Tunisia, and Morocco to assess the pandemic's socio-economic impact on households and firms. These surveys helped in creating a better understanding of the pandemic's impact and allowing for identifying measures to mitigate the socio-economic effects of COVID-19.

Effectiveness

In this section, the ET addresses the effectiveness of the ADWA projects by focusing on several key Evaluation Questions. The ET has examined the extent to which the projects have achieved their intended results at both the outcome and output levels, with particular emphasis on achieving the projects' objectives. In the second section the ET has described how positive and negative factors beyond the projects' control have impacted results and how the projects have mitigated the impacts of these external factors. Additionally, the ET has investigated any unintended results of the projects that were identified or perceived. The section also analysed the main contributing and challenging factors towards the projects' success in attaining their targets. Lastly, the ET has assessed to what extent project partners, in particular the governments, parliaments, and judiciary partners, have fulfilled the roles expected in the project's strategy.

ADWA consolidated results framework

Throughout the ADWA projects life cycle, their objectives remained consistent, however, the wording of the intended outcomes has evolved over time, to better reflect stakeholders' interests and emerging opportunities. Phase II, originally planned as a geographic expansion into Middle Eastern countries (such as Lebanon and Jordan), was instead scaled back to focus first on deepening and refining the existing projects in the original countries. This Second phase prioritized a focus on gender issues and highlighted the potential for a just transition to enhance job-creation in economic policymaking. During this phase the unique challenges faced by women workers in terms of employment quality, were also addressed, by focusing on gender equality elements of ILS.

The following illustrate the progressive reformulation of the projects' three intended outcomes over five years and two phases:

First area of impact: using evidence-based policy to ensure that economic decisions create **employment**.

First formulation (2018)	Policy stances in North Africa steer job-rich growth
Second formulation (2020)	Economic policy reforms in North Africa steer towards job-rich growth.
Third formulation (2021)	Improved data collection, data analysis, and data use for economic policy reforms to steer towards job-rich growth in target North African countries.
Phase 2 formulation (2021)	Increased adoption of economic policies and reforms promoting the growth of green and inclusive jobs in partner countries.

Second area of impact: Practical application of **International Labour Standards** and other information to improve the quality of jobs available.

First formulation (2018)	Decision-makers and influencers make better use of policy evidence to promote social and labour rights
Second formulation (2020)	Decision-makers and influencers make better use of policy evidence to promote International Labour Standards
Third formulation (2021)	Improved ratification, reflection in national jurisprudence, enforcement and knowledge of ILS in target North African countries
Phase 2 formulation (2021)	Improved ratification, reflection in national jurisprudence and increased knowledge of gender-related ILS in partner countries.

Third area of impact: engaging the **private sector** in advancing the Decent Work agenda.

First formulation (2018): as an output under Outcome 2 above	Enhanced labour standards and good practices are promoted in different economic sectors through the cooperation with the private sector.
Second formulation (2020) as Outcome 3	The private sector and multinational companies engage to achieve decent work in different economic sectors.
Third formulation (2021)	Enhanced engagement of the private sector to achieve decent work in telecom and automotive sectors in target North African countries.
Phase 2 formulation (2021)	Improved contribution of the private sector to a just transition and green economy, especially from women entrepreneurs.

Key results achieved

This section examines if and to what extend the key results were achieved under each "area of impact" (please refer to the previous section) and per country, providing the ET's analysis of the project's effectiveness in achieving its goals. Detailed information on the projects' achievements, categorized by outcome and country, can be found in Annex 1.

Overall, based on primary and secondary evidence, the ET found that the ADWA projects have made progress in advancing the Decent Work agenda in Egypt, Morocco, and Tunisia. The projects´ effectiveness is illustrated by the improved data collection capabilities, strengthened employment policies, promotion of international labour standards, and the emphasis on green jobs and gender equality in each of the target countries.

First area of impact: using evidence-based policy to ensure that economic decisions create employment.

The effectiveness of the ADWA project under the first area of impact (Outcome 1 phases I and II) is reflected, for example, in its successful efforts to strengthen the capacities of national statistical agencies and improve the quality of labour market data. These efforts have facilitated the development of evidence-based policies and enhanced the ability of governments to make informed decisions.

Key results in **Egypt** include, for example:

- Strengthening Statistical Capacities: The collaboration between ADWA and the Central Agency for Public Mobilization and Statistics has significantly enhanced the national statistical agency's ability to collect and analyse labour market data by providing technical assistance to improve their labour market survey and facilitating the participation of CAPMAS statisticians in international conferences. Additionally, the project supported CAPMAS in developing analytical outputs, such as reports and bulletins, which improved their ability to analyse and communicate labour market data.

- Policy Guidance: Improved data now empowers CAPMAS to provide informed policy guidance, promoting that socio-economic policies and legal reforms are based on solid and updated data.

- National Employment Strategy (NES): The project supported Egypt in formulating an ongoing NES[13] by conducting a labour market diagnostic study, organizing capacity-building workshops for trade unions, and engaging employers in consultation rounds to ensure tripartism. This enabled meaningful engagement and the development of recommendations for the NES.

- Green Jobs: ADWA Supported the Ministry of Planning and Economic Development with the ILO Green Jobs Assessment Model (GJAM) to inform future green policies.

In **Morocco** key results include, among others:

- National Employment Policy 2035: The project has supported Morocco in finalizing an action plan for the new National Employment and Entrepreneurship Policy (PN2E 35). This includes reforms aimed at improving the labour market, supporting small enterprises, and promoting women's employment.

- Satellite Account for Employment (SAE): in collaboration with the HCP the project finalized the preparation of the Satellite Account for Employment[14], which merges the data from all the key survey instruments (households, enterprises in both formal and informal economy) and links them to the national accounts (GDP). The SAE represents an important policy tool to better understand growth and jobs dynamics in the country.

- Digitalization of processes within the Ministry of Economic Inclusion, Small Business, Employment, and Skills. As part of the project, more than 70 procedures within the ministry have been digitalized. This effort is designed to enhance efficiency, improve service delivery, and support evidence-based decision-making.

- Green Jobs: in collaboration with the *Haut Commissariat au Plan* the project launched the GJAM to inform future green policies by the Government of Morocco.

In **Tunisia** ADWA´s key results include:

- IDEMA System: The project has supported the digitalization of the Ministry of Employment (MoL) through the IDEMA system[15], improving the ministry's ability to manage and evaluate employment policies.

- Active Employment Programs: The ADWA project supported the updating of Active Labour Market Programmes (ALMPs)[16] after the undertaking of impact evaluations. These evaluations also contributed to enhancing the ministry's policy evaluation capabilities.

- Green Jobs: in collaboration with Ministry of Economy, the project launched the ILO Green Jobs Assessment Model (GJAM), to be able to inform the government's future green policies.

---

[13] https://www.sis.gov.eg/Story/185396/Labor-Minister-National-Employment-Strategy-set-to-be-launched-shortly?lang=en-us

[14] A Satellite Account for Employment is a specialized accounting framework used to measure and analyze employment-related activities within an economy. Satellite accounts are extensions of the national accounts, which provide a detailed breakdown of the main economic aggregates, such as Gross Domestic Product (GDP). These accounts offer more detailed and focused data on specific areas that are not fully captured in the main accounts. In the case of a Satellite Account for Employment, the focus is on gathering and presenting data related to employment, labor, and human resources.

[15] https://www.ilo.org/fr/presentation-du-systeme-idema-un-outil-innovant-pour-la-gestion-de-la

[16] ALMPs are government initiatives designed to improve the employment prospects of workers and help them gain, maintain, or find new employment. These programs aim to address various labor market challenges such as unemployment, underemployment, and skill mismatches.

Second area of impact: Practical application of ILS and other information to improve the quality of jobs available.

The ADWA project has promoted the application of ILS through capacity building, knowledge sharing, and advocacy. These initiatives have contributed to strengthening the national legal frameworks and judicial capacities in the target countries. For example:

In **Egypt** some key results are:

- Strengthened Capacity: Serval training workshops were conducted to enhance the knowledge of judges from various courts on ILS and the application of labour legislation in cases before the labour courts. In addition, ILS training has been incorporated in the curriculum of the National Centre for Judicial Studies (NCJS). Moreover, training on Gender in Labour Law was provided to judges in collaboration with NCJS.

- Strengthened legal frameworks: The project supported the Ministry of Justice (MoJ) in the implementation of international labour standards. According to several stakeholders consulted by the ET, this led in some cases to the incorporation of ILS in judicial verdicts. In addition, two gap analysis studies on ILO Conventions have been conducted. Moreover, with the project´s support two labour legal aid offices have being established to provide legal advice to workers and employers. Legal aid offices are an unplanned result that was not originally anticipated in the ADWA project. Furthermore, the project supported the development, finalization and dissemination of the bench book[17] on ILS, labour legislation and national jurisprudence in collaboration with MoJ and NCJS.

- Increased Awareness: The project conducted awareness-raising activities for judges on ILS, with a special focus on issues related to equity and gender equality in the context of the world of work, and increased women parliamentarians' participation in these activities.

In **Morocco** examples include:

- Ratification of ILO Conventions. ADWA advocated for and supported the registration[18] of three important ILO conventions by Morrocco: C.97 on Migration for Employment, C.102 on Social Security, and C.187 on Occupational Safety and Health (OSH), during the 2019 International Labour Conference. In addition, the project conducted a gap analysis[19] study for ILO C.189 (Domestic Workers).

- Capacity building: with MoL and the national tripartite commission on ILS implementation reporting[20].

---

[17] A bench book is a reference guide or manual used by judges to assist them in the administration of justice.

[18] The "registration" of ILO conventions refers to the formal process of recording a country's ratification or acceptance of a specific ILO convention with the ILO's International Labour Office. Once a country ratifies an ILO convention, it is officially registered and becomes binding on that country under international law. This registration process is a key step in making the convention legally effective within that country, meaning the country commits to implementing the convention's provisions in its national laws and practices. The registration process ensures that there is a formal record of the country's commitment to the convention, and it enables the ILO to monitor and report on the country's compliance with the convention's standards.

[19] A gap analysis is a systematic process used by countries to compare their existing national laws, policies, and practices with the requirements and standards set forth in the ILO conventions. The goal of this analysis is to identify "gaps," or areas where the national framework does not fully comply with the obligations and standards established by the ILO conventions.

[20] The National Tripartite Commission on ILS Implementation Reporting is a body established to facilitate the monitoring, implementation, and reporting of the nation's compliance with International Labour Standards as set by the ILO.

In **Tunisia**, some key results include:

- Training and Capacity Building: The project has undertaken training courses on ILS for judges and seminars and workshops, for example, on the application of the ILS with a focus on gender equality issues.

- Ratification of ILO Conventions. The project developed and disseminated a diagnostic study on the ratification and implementation of ILS, leading to the ratification of the Promotional Framework for Occupational Safety and Health Convention, 2006 (No. 187) by Tunisia in 2021. In addition, the project carried-out lobbying activities related to the ratification of C.160

- Application of ILS. A guide for judges on the incorporation/integration of ILS in national jurisprudence has been developed in consultation with the Ministry of Justice and the *Institut Supérieur de la Magistrature* (ISM).

Third area of impact: Engaging the private sector in advancing the Decent Work agenda.

The project's efforts under Outcome/Area of Impact 3 have focused on engaging the private sector to advance the Decent Work agenda. This includes promoting responsible business practices, and supporting enterprises in adopting sustainable and inclusive policies.

In **Egypt** examples include:

- Responsible Business Practices: The project has promoted responsible business practices among multinational enterprises through workshops and the adoption of a tripartite roadmap based on the Tripartite Declaration of Principles concerning Multinational Enterprises and Social Policy (MNE Declaration). This was also an unintended result that was not originally planned for in the ADWA project.

- Decent Work in Supply Chains. The project conducted studies on supply chains and promoted decent work conditions within Ericsson's supplier network.

- Women´s entrepreneurship. The project conducted a "Rapid Situational Analysis" (RSA) for Women Entrepreneurship Development (WED) with a focus on a just transition and policy recommendations.

- Support for Enterprises: The project provided training to companies in the telecom sector within Ericsson's supplier network, promoting decent working conditions and responsible business practices

In **Morocco** some key results are:

- Women´s entrepreneurship. The project conducted training about gender-sensitive entrepreneurship for 50 trainers using the Get Ahead ILO tool. It collaborated with the ILO's PAGE and Wafira projects to study value chains for income-generating activities run by women in two pilot localities. The project promoted female entrepreneurship by supporting very small businesses in five localities, studying green business potential for women in two other localities, supporting ADS on women entrepreneurship, and creating a project bank with 30 green projects for women in two localities.

In **Tunisia**

- The project organized training sessions under the ILO's GERME (Gérer Mieux Mon Entreprise) program, targeting both the Ministry of Industry and civil society incubators. These training sessions were primarily aimed at women entrepreneurs, many of whom manage green projects. Nearly 100 women, predominantly from vulnerable backgrounds, were trained, enhancing their skills in managing green enterprises. Additionally, the project has been working at a macro level with the Ministry of Economy and Planning to implement the Green Jobs Assessment Model (GJAM) to support Tunisia in designing climate policies that promote green job creation while protecting existing jobs.

Analysis of ADWA Phase I and II indicators

The analysis of the <u>ADWA Phase I indicators</u> (below) reveals significant challenges in assessing the project's effectiveness, mainly due to the overall lack of available data related to the project's indicators. For many of the key performance indicators (KPIs) the targets and/or actuals were marked as "N/A" (Not Available), which significantly hinders the evaluation's ability to measure the project's impact accurately.

Table 4. ADWA Phase I Indicators

Expected Results		Performance indicators	Disaggregation	Target	
				Target (end of Project)	**Actual / Final Result**
Outcome 1: Improved data collection, data analysis, and data use for economic policy reforms to steer towards job-rich growth in target North African countrie					
1100	1100-#5	Degree key stakeholders report that the regional and/or national policy discourse is informed by key evidence, by country	**Total**	80%	N/A
			Egypt	80%	N/A
			Morocco	80%	N/A
			Tunisia	80%	N/A
			Algeria	80%	N/A
	1100-#6	# of key government institutions responsible for economic policy reforms ADWA' has partnered with, by country	**Total**	N/A	N/A
			Egypt	N/A	N/A
			Morocco	N/A	N/A
			Tunisia	N/A	N/A
	1100-#7	% of key stakeholders who report the usefulness of ADWA' networking, conferences and publications to improve dialogue, by country	**Total**	80%	N/A
			Egypt	80%	N/A
			Morocco	80%	N/A
			Tunisia	80%	N/A
			Algeria	80%	N/A
	1100-#8	# of improved analytical instruments actively used by government officials to monitor, interpret and forecast the real economy and the labour market, by country	**Total**	N/A	N/A
			Egypt	N/A	N/A
			Morocco	N/A	N/A
			Tunisia	N/A	N/A
	1100-#9	% of relevant stakeholders who report having high capability for macroeconomic analysis for job-rich growth, including for women, by country	**Total**	80%	N/A
			Egypt	180%	N/A
			Morocco	280%	N/A
			Tunisia	380%	N/A
			Algeria	480%	N/A
Output 1.1: Dialogue, knowledge and analysis capacities on quality job creation and sustainable economic growth are improved among regional stakeholders					
1110	1110-#10	# of experts in the regional network on job and growth, by country and gender	**Total**	N/A	**103**
			Egypt	N/A	0
			Morocco	N/A	0

			Tunisia	N/A	0
			Algeria	N/A	0
			Male	N/A	0
			Female	N/A	0
	1110-#11	# of regional high-level conferences convened on jobs and growth	**Total**	4 regional conferences (2 online and 2 in-person)	**1**
	1110-#12	# of annual reports published, with analysis disaggregated by gender, age groups and country	**Total**	4 (3 annual reports ,1 summary report, including sections on COVID-19 by 2023)	**1**
	1110-#13	# of case studies/highlight reports published on the COVID-19 impact on jobs, by country	**Total**	3	**3**
			Egypt	1	0
			Morocco	1	3
			Tunisia	1	0
Output 1.2: Governments officials' macroeconomic analysis and policy diagnostic capacities are improved (Egypt; Morocco; Tunisia)					
1120	1120-#14	# of macroeconomic analysis tools/instruments enhanced/developed, by country and category of stakeholder	**Total**	N/A	**10**
			Egypt	N/A	0
			Morocco	N/A	1
			Tunisia	N/A	0
			Ministry of Labour	N/A	1
			Ministry of Statistics	N/A	7
			Ministry of Finance	N/A	1
	1120-#15	# of studies and/or surveys conducted, by country	**Total**	N/A	**6**
			Egypt	N/A	1
			Morocco	N/A	4
			Tunisia	N/A	1
	1120-#16	# of government officials provided technical assistance[1] on macroeconomic analysis and/or policy diagnostics, by country and gender	**Total**	N/A	**16**
			Egypt	N/A	10
			Morocco	N/A	4
			Tunisia	N/A	2
Output 1.3: Ministry of Employment /Labour management capacities are improved (Morocco; Tunisia)					
1130	1130-#17	# of Ministry management and information systems (MIS) enhanced and digitized, by country	**Total**	N/A	**1**
			Morocco	N/A	1
			Tunisia	N/A	0
	1130-#18	# of impact evaluations of employment programs, by country	**Total**	N/A	**1**
			Morocco	N/A	1
			Tunisia	N/A	0
	1130-#19	# of government officials trained on MIS and evaluations, by country and gender	**Total**	N/A	**37**
			Morocco	N/A	10
			Tunisia	N/A	27
			Male	N/A	21
			Female	N/A	6
Outcome 2: Improved ratification, reflection in national jurisprudence, enforcement and knowledge of ILSs in target North African countries					
1200	1200-#20	# of ILS conventions ratified as following Project support, by country	**Total**	3	**4**
			Egypt	1	0
			Morocco	1	3
			Tunisia	1	1
	1200-#21	# of countries where national jurisprudence better take into consideration ILS covered by the Project	**Total**	3	**0**
			Egypt	1	0
			Morocco	1	0
			Tunisia	1	0

	1200-#22	# media /civil society publications enriching the National discourse on ILS, by country	**Total**	N/A	**0**
			Egypt	N/A	0
			Morocco	N/A	0
			Tunisia	N/A	0
	1200-#23	% of stakeholders that feel knowledgeable and capable to discuss ILS, by stakeholder type, country and gender	**Total**	80%	N/A
			Egypt	80%	N/A
			Morocco	80%	N/A
			Tunisia	80%	N/A
			Male	80%	N/A
			Female	80%	N/A
Output 2.1: Parliamentarians and Government officials' knowledge and capacities on ILS are improved (Egypt; Morocco; Tunisia)
1210		1210-#24 # of reports / studies / diagnostics / communication tools on ILS completed and shared, by country	**Total**	N/A	**2**
			Egypt	N/A	0
			Morocco	N/A	0
			Tunisia	N/A	2
		1210-#25 # of national parliament and government officials trained on ILS, by country and gender	**Total**	N/A	**126**
			Egypt	N/A	86
			Morocco	N/A	40
			Tunisia	N/A	0
			Male	N/A	16
			Female	N/A	11
		1210-#26 Degree that national mechanisms of discussion and review of ILS are strengthened	**Total** (Morocco)	80% (Morocco only)	N/A
Output 2.2: Judicial and enforcement stakeholders knowledge and capacities on ILS and its enforcement are improved (Egypt; Morocco; Tunisia)
1220	1220-#27	# of judges or other judiciary stakeholders trained on ILS and its enforcement, by country and gender	**Total**	N/A	**881**
			Egypt	143	855
			Morocco	N/A	0
			Tunisia	N/A	26
			Male	N/A	11
			Female	N/A	15
	1220-#28	# of labour inspectors trained on safe return to work (COVID-19 and ILS), by gender	**Total** (Tunisia)	N/A	**29**
			Male	N/A	22
			Female	N/A	7
	1220-#29	# of handbooks / guides / communication materials developed and disseminated regarding the national application of ILS, by country	**Total**	N/A	**1**
			Egypt	N/A	1
			Morocco	N/A	0
			Tunisia	N/A	0
	1220-#30	# of countries that institutionalize ILS training for judges	**Total**	3	**2**
			Egypt	1	2
			Morocco	1	0
			Tunisia	1	0
Output 2.3: The media and civil society are more knowledgeable and support policy development on ILS (Egypt; Morocco; Tunisia)
1230	1230-#31	# of communications tools on ILS developed for media and civil society, by country	**Total**	N/A	**3**
			Egypt	N/A	0
			Morocco	N/A	3
			Tunisia	N/A	0
	1230-#32	# of individuals from employers and workers organisations, media and civil society trained on ILS, by stakeholder type, country and gender	**Total**	N/A	**0**
			Egypt	N/A	0
			Morocco	N/A	0
			Tunisia	N/A	0
			Male	N/A	0
			Female	N/A	0
	1230-#33	Number of studies undertaken to promote collective bargaining agreements	**Total** (Morocco)	2	**3**
Outcome 3: Enhanced engagement of the private sector to achieve Decent Work in telecom and automotive sectors in target North African countries
1300	1300-#34		**Total**	80%	

		# and % of companies that report improvements in productivity (e.g., in the form of cost savings, on time delivery, increase in labour productivity, reduction defects, waste per month, and improved energy efficiency)	Egypt	80%	80%
			Algeria	80%	80%
	1300-#35	# and % of companies that report improvements in working conditions (OHS), by sector/country	**Total**	80%	
			Egypt	80%	80%
			Algeria	80%	80%
	1300-#36	# of non-discrimination and gender equality initiatives promoted	**Total** (Algeria)		**0**
Output 3.1: Labour standards are better applied in the telecomm sector in Egypt (Egypt)					
1310	1310-#37	# of assessments / analyses carried out in the telecomm sector	**Total** (Egypt)	3	**3**
	1310-#38	Finalized (or existence of a) OSH capacity enhancement programme for the telecomm sector	**Total** (Egypt)	1	**1**
	1310-#39	# of individuals trained in OSH capacity enhancement in the telecomm sector, by gender	**Total** (Egypt)	N/A	**33**
			Male	N/A	0
			Female	N/A	0
	1310-#40	# and % of private and public agencies attending roundtable events on OSH and decent work standards	**Total** (Egypt)	# and 80%	N/A
			Private agencies	# and 80%	N/A
			Public agencies	# and 80%	N/A
Output 3.2: Productivity and working conditions are improved in the Algerian automotive sector (Algeria)					
1320	1320-#41	Development (existence) of a SCORE training programme to meet the needs of the Algerian automotive sector	**Total** (Algeria)	1	**1**
	1320-#42	# of national institutions trained for delivering SCORE Training	**Total** (Algeria)	1	**0**
	1320-#43	# of SCORE certified SCORE trainers trained, by gender and expert level	**Total** (Algeria)	10	**0**
			Male	7	0
			Female	3	0
			Expert	2	0
			Normal trainer	8	0
	1320-#44	# of SMEs trained on SCORE training	**Total** (Algeria)	20	**0**
	1320-#45	# of employees trained, by gender and type (workers and managers)	**Total** (Algeria)	80	**0**
			Male	56	0
			Female	24	0
			Workers	N/A	0
			Managers	N/A	0
Crossing cutting: Coherence and Sustainability					
1400	1400-#46	# of collaborations with other ILO Projects and NGOs, by country	**Total**	N/A	**3**
			Egypt	N/A	0
			Morocco	N/A	2
			Tunisia	N/A	1
			Algeria	N/A	0
	1400-#47	Amount of funding or in-kind resources leveraged, by country and government/non-government institutions	**Total**	N/A	**0**
			Egypt	N/A	0
			Morocco	N/A	0
			Tunisia	N/A	0
			Algeria	N/A	0
			Government	N/A	0
			Non-government	N/A	0
	1400-#48	# of activities /initiatives that effectively support two or more Outcomes	**Total**	N/A	**2**
			Egypt	N/A	0
			Morocco	N/A	1
			Tunisia	N/A	1
			Algeria	N/A	0

Source: ILO Project team

Despite these data gaps, there are some areas where the project reported successes, such as, "Conferences and Reports": The project successfully organized one regional high-level conference and published one annual report (1110-#11, 1110-#12). "COVID-19 Impact Studies": The project met its target for the number of case studies/highlight reports published on the COVID-19 impact on jobs, with Morocco publishing three such studies (Indicator 1110-#13). "Ratification of ILS Conventions": The project surpassed its target by facilitating the ratification of four ILS conventions, one more than planned (Indicator 1200-#20).

The analysis of the <u>ADWA Phase II indicators</u>' targets versus actuals (below) highlights that the project has made notable advances in several areas, particularly in modernizing tools (indicator 1100-#2) and enhancing the capacity of government officials and other stakeholders (indicator 1210-#8). However, gaps remain, for example, in integrating gender-related ILS into national jurisprudence (Indicator 1200-#7), engaging the private sector in green economy initiatives (indicator 1300-#10) and, and providing sufficient support for women entrepreneurs (1300-#11). The mixed outcomes suggest that while the project has had significant positive results in several areas, there is still room for improvement to fully meet all of its ambitious targets.

Table 5. ADWA Phse II Indicators

Outcome 1: Increased adoption of economic policies and reforms promoting the growth of green and inclusive jobs in partner countries		
Indicator	**Target End of Project**	**Actual (July 2024)**
1100-#1 Degree to which key stakeholders report that the national policy discourse around green and inclusive jobs is informed by key evidence, by country and sex [1100-#5 Degree key stakeholders report that the regional and/or national policy discourse is informed by key evidence, by country]	60%	**Egypt** (Total: 14, Male: 11, Female: 3) **Morocco** - (Total: 8 , Male: ,5 Female:3) **Tunisia** (Total: 6, Male: 5, Female:1)
1100-#2 # of modernised tools and/or processes around *green and inclusive jobs* in active usage, by country [**1100-#8** # of improved analytical instruments actively used by government officials to monitor, interpret and forecast the real economy and the labour market, by country]	In active Usage **Egypt - 1** **Morocco –2** **Tunisia -1**	**Egypt - 7** **Morocco –8** **Tunisia -2**
Output 1.1: Increased capacity of Government statistical offices to collect, analyse, digitize and report on data incorporating economic, social, environmental sustainability and gender equality dimensions (Egypt, Morocco, Tunisia)		
1110-#3 # of government officials trained on *green and inclusive job* data collection/analyses, by sex and country [**1120-#16** # of government officials provided technical assistance[21] on macroeconomic analysis and/or policy diagnostics, by country and gender]	**Egypt** (Total: 20, Male: 10, Female: 10) **Morocco** - (Total: 20, Male: 10 Female: 10) **Tunisia** (Total: 20, Male: 10, Female: 10)	**Morocco** - (Total: 20, Male: 5, Female: 15)
1110-#4 # of data collection tools and/or processes around *green and inclusive jobs* modernised, by country [**1120-#14** # of macroeconomic analysis tools/instruments enhanced/developed, by country and category of stakeholder]	Modernised **Egypt - 2** **Morocco -2**	**Egypt - 2** **Morocco -2**
Output 1.2: Increased knowledge of policy makers and other stakeholders to formulate policy options and solutions for green growth, including in women-led MSMEs, and on accelerating the job potential of greening the economy (Egypt, Morocco, Tunisia)		
1120-#5 # of diagnostic reports completed with ILO support on high-priority issues of policy concern for job-rich, *green and inclusive growth*, by country [**1110-#12** # of annual reports published, with analysis disaggregated by gender, age groups and country]	**Egypt - 1** **Morocco - 1** **Tunisia -1**	**Egypt - 2** **Morocco - 5** **Tunisia -1**

Outcome 2: Improved ratification, reflection in national jurisprudence and increased knowledge of gender-related ILS in partner countries		
Indicator	**Target End of Project**	**Actual (July 2024)**
1200-#6 # of *gender-related* ILS conventions having interest of ratification[22], in the process of ratification or ratified following Project support, by country [**1200-#20** # of ILS conventions ratified as following Project support, by country]	**Egypt - 2** **Morocco - 2** **Tunisia - 2**	**Egypt - 5** **Morocco - 3** **Tunisia - 5**
1200-#7 # of countries where national jurisprudence better takes into consideration *gender-related* ILS covered by the Project [**1200-#21** # of countries where national jurisprudence better take into consideration ILS covered by the Project]	**Egypt - 1** **Morocco - 1** **Tunisia - 1**	**N/A**
Output 2.1: Improved capacity of key stakeholders to promote employment and gender-related ILS ratification and subsequent implementation via national frameworks (Egypt, Morocco, Tunisia)		
1210-#8 # of government officials, tripartite stakeholders and members of civil society who have their capacity enhanced on *gender-related* ILS, by sex, stakeholder type and country [**1210-#25** # of national parliament and government officials trained on ILS, by country and gender. **1230-#32** # of individuals from employers and workers organisations, media and civil society trained on ILS, by stakeholder type, country and gender]	**Egypt** (Total: 80, Male: 50, Female: 30) **Morocco** (Total: 30 Male:15, Female:15) **Tunisia** (Total:30, Male: 15, Female:15)	**Egypt** (Total: 146, Male: 102, Female: 44) **Morocco** (Total: 30, Male: 14, Female:16) **Tunisia** (Total: 0, Male: 0, Female:0)
1210-#9 # of judges who have their capacity enhanced on *gender-related* ILS and their application, by country and sex. [**1220-#27** # of judges or other judiciary stakeholders trained on ILS and its enforcement, by country and gender]	**Egypt** (Total: 470, Male: 400, Female: 70 **Morocco** - (Total: 50, Male: 25, Female: 25) **Tunisia** (Total: 70, Male: 30, Female: 40)	**Egypt** (Total: 324, Male: 224 Female: 100 **Morocco** - (Total: 0, Male: 0, Female: 0) **Tunisia** (Total: 0, Male: 0, Female: 0)
Outcome 3: Improved contribution of the private sector to a just transition and green economy, especially from women entrepreneurs		
Indicator	**Target End of Project**	**Actual (July 2024)**
1300-#10 # of companies implementing the road map for business environment enhancement, by country	15	**N/A**
1300-#11 # of MSMEs / women entrepreneurs that create/expand a green business, by country and sex of owner	**Morocco** - (Total: 50, Male: 0, Female: 50) **Tunisia** (Total: 20, Male: 0, Female: 20)	**N/A**
Output 3.1: Improved ability of stakeholders to assess and promote a more enabling business environment for the greening of enterprises (Egypt, Morocco, Tunisia)		
1310-#12 # of road maps developed for business environment enhancement, by country	2 (1 **Morocco**; 1 **Tunisia**)	**N/A**
1310-#13 # of individuals that have their capacity built on the greening of businesses, by country and sex	**Egypt** (Total: 10, Male: 4, Female: 6) **Morocco** - (Total: 50, Male: ,25 Female:25) **Tunisia** (Total: 50, Male: 35, Female: 15)	**Egypt** (Total: 0, Male: 0, Female: 0) **Morocco** - (Total: 295, Male: ,0 Female:295) **Tunisia** (Total: 0, Male: 0, Female: 0)
Output 3.2: Improved capacity of MSMEs to reduce their carbon footprint and adopt circular (green and decent) economy business models with special support to women entrepreneurship (Tunisia, Morocco)		
1320-#14 # of MSMEs/ women entrepreneurs capacity enhanced on adopting circular (green and decent) economy business models, by country and sex of business owner	**Morocco** - (Total: 10, Male: 0, Female: 10) **Tunisia** (Total: 10, Male: 0, Female: 10)	**Morocco** - (Total: 46, Male: 0, Female: 46) **Tunisia** (Total: 0, Male: 0, Female: 0)

Source: ILO Project Team

[22] Ratification is the act of signing or giving formal consent, it does not mean it has been entered into force.

Challenges and external factors

The implementation of the ADWA projects encountered several challenges across the two phases and different countries. These challenges are detailed below.

- Administrative Challenges: Lengthy and Unclear Procedures for Security Clearances

In **Egypt**, the process to obtain security clearances for international experts was particularly cumbersome. These procedures were not only lengthy but also unclear, leading to significant delays in project implementation.

- Devaluation of the Egyptian pound

Due to the devaluation of the Egyptian Pound in March 2024, ADWA faced unforeseen budget constraints, that led to limited ability to carry out certain planned activities. Consequently, adjustments were necessary, including, for example, changes to the training schedule for junior judges and women judges on ILS, and reducing the total number of participants in the trainings.

- Changes in Government and Administrative Structures

Frequent changes in government, especially in **Tunisia**, posed a significant challenge. Since the project's rollout in December 2019, Tunisia experienced five different governments, necessitating repeated re-engagement with new officials and a continuous relaunch of activities in a tripartite way.

In **Egypt**, the replacement of the Minister of Manpower in August 2022 disrupted the regular monthly meetings with MoM staff, making coordination difficult and affecting continuity of project activities. Another cabinet change occurred in the summer of 2024.

- COVID-19 Pandemic

The pandemic has had a widespread impact on the planning and implementation of project activities, particularly those requiring physical meetings. The relatively quick shift to online communication tools was not always effective, leading to delays in various activities such as workshops, consultations, and capacity-building sessions.

IT complications and internet connectivity issues also affected the efficiency of virtual meetings and workshops, limiting participant engagement and reducing the quality of discussions. Nevertheless, thanks to the close collaboration between the project CTA and the Sida focal point, the work plan was adjusted to address new needs and ensure the project's continued relevance.

- Delays in Project Activities Approvals and Coordination

The project faced delays in obtaining approvals from government bodies, which were critical for the execution of planned activities. For instance, the process of securing the necessary approvals from the Ministry of Planning and the Ministry of Manpower in **Egypt** was protracted and required persistent follow-ups. Similarly, in Tunisia, impact evaluations were started in 2020 and only finished in 2024

Coordination issues were prevalent, particularly with external partners and governmental institutions, which had limited availability due to other pressing priorities, such as, for example, the national elections and the COP-27 preparations in Egypt[23].

- Capacity Limitations

In **Morocco** and **Egypt**, difficulties in accessing micro-data and the slow pace of collaboration with the HCP hampered the project's ability to gather and analyse labour market data effectively.

Overall, **in the three countries**, the administrative heaviness and centralization of decisions at government levels added to the delays, as approvals and communications needed to pass through multiple bureaucratic layers.

Corrective Actions

To address these challenges, the ADWA project management team implemented several corrective measures:

- Engagement and Regular Consultations

The project team held regular consultations with concerned parties, including national stakeholders, relevant ILO CO, RO and HQ units, and Sida, to navigate through operational obstacles.

- Adaptive Strategies

Project activities were adjusted, and funds were quickly reallocated in response to emerging needs while maintaining alignment with original project objectives helped mitigate some impacts of COVID-19 and other disruptions.

- Improved Coordination and Communication

Establishing steering committees and formalizing partnerships through MoUs and protocols helped streamline processes and improve coordination among national partners.

- Enhanced Support and Capacity Building

Additional technical support and capacity-building opportunities were provided for stakeholders and project staff, to cope with new requirements such as and maintain productivity.

Project partners´ roles in project implementation

The evaluation found that, overall, the project partners, including government, parliament, judiciary and workers and employers' organizations, have been able to fulfil the roles expected in ADWA's strategy. Key successes include effective leadership and integration of technical

---

[23] COP27, short for the 27th Conference of the Parties to the United Nations Framework Convention on Climate Change (UNFCCC), was a global climate conference that took place in Sharm El-Sheikh, Egypt, from November 6 to 18, 2022.

assistance in government operations, as well as substantial training and sensitization efforts for parliamentarians and members of the judiciary. Some examples include:

- Government Partners

Egypt: The Ministry of Planning and Economic Development (MPED) and the Central Agency for Public Mobilization and Statistics have demonstrated a high level of involvement and satisfaction with ADWA's technical assistance. .

Morocco: The Ministry of Economic Inclusion, Small Business, Jobs and Skills (MOL) showed strong leadership, particularly in the digitalization of procedures. ADWA collaborated with the ministry through effective communication and training, ultimately transitioning to fully digital procedures funded under ADWA. Collaboration with HCP was also key in, for example, the elaboration of the employment satellite account.

Tunisia: The Ministry of Employment and Vocational Training benefited from ADWA's support in knowledge production and capacity building, implementing several strategic instruments and a monitoring system for international cooperation projects.

- Parliamentary Partners

Several stakeholders interviewed by the ET opined that the training of parliamentarians on ILS was important for enhancing the understanding of Decent Work principles among lawmakers. According to these stakeholders, this increased awareness could potentially lead to concrete actions, such as stronger advocacy for labour reforms in line with ILS and more informed legislative debates. It might also result in parliamentarians pushing for the incorporation of Decent Work principles into national labour policies, contributing to a greater alignment of national legislation with international labour standards. In this regard, the participation of parliamentarians was well aligned with the projects´ strategy.

- Judiciary Partners

In **Tunisia** and **Egypt**, Judges received training on national labour law and ILS. In addition, the training facilitated dialogue among judges from different courts, promoting a common understanding of cases and legal gaps. Technical assistance from ADWA was highly valued, with the INS and NCJS respectively reporting to have benefited significantly. They have incorporated ILS into their general training program for judges and developed a bench book with ADWA's support.

- Social Partners

The ADWA project actively engaged with employers' organizations and workers' organizations/unions in Egypt, Morocco, and Tunisia as part of its strategy to promote decent work and enhance social dialogue across North Africa.

In **Egypt**: the project engaged with the Federation of Egyptian Industries (FEI) and workers' organizations to promote the ILO Tripartite Declaration of Principles concerning Multinational Enterprises (MNE Declaration). This included training sessions for companies in the telecommunications sector, particularly those linked to Ericsson's supplier network, on topics like occupational safety and health (OSH), management systems, and workplace cooperation. Additionally, the project facilitated the development of a national roadmap for responsible

business conduct, endorsed by tripartite constituents, to strengthen collaboration between employers, workers, and the government.

In **Morocco**: the project worked with the Confédération Générale des Entreprises du Maroc (CGEM) and other stakeholders to improve the application of ILS among employers. Activities included workshops and studies on new forms of work, such as platform work and part-time employment, aimed at improving conditions for workers, particularly women. The project also supported social dialogue by developing studies that informed discussions between employers, workers, and the government. The Confédération Démocratique du Travail (CDT) in Morocco was a key partner in coordinating trade union activities under the ADWA project. This collaboration involved capacity-building initiatives aimed at strengthening the ability of the CDT to engage in social dialogue, advocate for labor rights, and promote the application of International Labour Standards.

In **Tunisia**: the project collaborated with the Union Tunisienne de l'Industrie, du Commerce et de l'Artisanat (UTICA) by organizing workshops for UTICA counselors to enhance their understanding of International Labour Standards (ILS) and their application in judicial decisions. Additionally, the project engaged with the Tunisian General Labour Union (UGTT) to promote decent work and social dialogue, focusing on capacity-building and advocacy for the implementation of ILS.

Efficiency

In this section, the ET addresses the level of efficiency of the ILO's ADWA projects. The analysis begins by investigating the deployment of financial and human resources in the target countries to determine their effectiveness in achieving project outputs. The ET has also evaluated how project partners have leveraged monetary and in-kind resources, to support project activities, including collaborations with other ILO initiatives and national-level stakeholders. The section also analyses disbursements and project expenditures to assess their alignment with expected budgetary plans and explain any variances. Moreover, it assesses the management and governance arrangements of the projects, focusing on their role in facilitating project results and whether roles and responsibilities are clearly understood by all parties involved in implementation and monitoring. The section further examines the relevance of the monitoring and evaluation system, including the collection and utilization of disaggregated data, such as by sex and other relevant characteristics. Finally, it explores the extent to which the projects have fostered good relationships and cooperation with relevant national and regional stakeholders and ends with an evaluation of the adequacy of administrative, technical, and policy support provided by the ILO offices and specialists involved.

Allocation of resources

The total budget of the Phase I amounted to 5.524.938,04USD. As detailed in the table below, by July 2024, the project had executed or had committed 5.504.453,34 USD (99.6% of the total budget). Also in July 2024, Phase II had either executed or committed a total of 2.483.628 USD from the project's overall budget of 2.683.930,06 USD (92.5% of the total budget), as outlined in the table below.

From document review and interviews with key stakeholders, the ET concluded that these amounts correspond to the actual execution of the activities and the confirmed achievement of the expected products under both projects (as detailed in the Effectiveness section).

Table 6. ADWA Phase I and Phase II budget and expenses

ADWA Projects Phase I and II: Budget and expenses (in USD) July 2024				
Project	Budget	Actuals	Encumbrances	Balances
Phase I	5.524.938,04	5.436.805,50	67.647,84	20.484,70
Phase II	2.683.930,06	2.042.805,10	440.823,20	200.301,76

Source: ILO Project Management

The tables below detail the expenses per project phase (outcomes). From the cross-analysis of the effectiveness and the financial information provided by the project management, the evaluation deduced that the level of budget execution (broken down by outputs and activities) is consistent with the initial allocation of resources and with the results achieved. In this regard, the evaluation concludes that there was an efficient use of financial resources.

Table 7. ADWA Phase I budget and expenses per Outcome

ADWA Phase I: Budget and expenses (in USD) July 2024				
	Budget	Actuals	Encumbrances	Balances
Outcome 1: Employment	1.624.751,53	1.620.188,47	4.136,47	426,59
Outcome2: International Labour Standards	654.700,55	653.761,89	694,07	244,59
Outcome 3: Private sector	181.156,01	174.040,11	6.373,98	741,92

Staff and Operational Cost	2.206.921,62	2.206.756,75	237,68	(72,81)
Project Management	221.794,21	156.584,95	56.205,64	9.003,62
Programme Support Cost & Provision for Cost Increases	635.614,12	625.473,33	-	10.140,79
Total	**5.524.938,04**	**5.436.805,50**	**67.647,84**	**20.484,70**

Source: ILO project management

In addition, budget execution rates were good; reported at nearly 100% (to both Phase I and Phase II) by July 2024. Disbursements and project expenditures were in line with expected budgetary plans.

Table 8. ADWA Phase II budget and expenses per Outcome

ADWA Phase II: Budget and expenses (in USD) July 2024				
	Budget	**Actuals**	**Encumbrances**	**Balances**
Inception phase	37.704,37	37.704,37	0	0
Outcome I: Employment	626.871,33	422.492,64	163.847,15	40.531,54
Outcome 2: International Labour Standards	394.807,12	297.609,48	85.574,87	11.622,77
Outcome 3: Green business and Gender	214.301,87	175.175,53	38.879,98	246,36
Project management and communication	123.984,63	89.156,05	31.315,70	3.512,88
Staff and Operational Cost	977.489,67	785.632,84	121.205,50	70.651,33
Programme Support Costs and Provision for Contingency	308.771,07	235.034,19	0	73.736,88
Total	**2.683.930,06**	**2.042.805,10**	**440.823,20**	**200.301,76**

Source: ILO Project management

Cost sharing activities

ADWA successfully leveraged USD 459.356 from partners and ILO Offices and Departments to support interventions in Egypt, Morocco, and Tunisia, as detailed in the table below.

Table 9. Cost-sharing activities

Cost shared activities				
Activity Name		ADWA' cost share in USD	Other cost share in USD	Specification of cost share (RB, RBTC, RBSA, project etc)
Egypt				
1	Carry out supply chain analysis for the telecommunication sub-sector	14.336	5.000	From MULTI Unit- ILO HQ
2	Funding the establishment survey	80.000	75.000	GIZ
3	Support the digitalisation of the establishment survey	8.000	28.000	ACCEL project
4	Organize Gender in Labour Law Workshops for labour specialized judges	7.373	9.440	RBTC CAIRO (contribution to the workshop venue PO at March and June workshops in Cairo)

5	Organize trade union workshop on jobs & growth in Egypt	4.179	44,495	RB funds
6	MNE Declaration Workshop	10.690	6800	from MULTI Unit- ILO HQ
7	Green Skills Study Upgrade - Excol Contract - Dahlia Roque	9.800	15.000	Youth For Future , Decent Work for Women
8	Joint activities with BW	22.970	13.395	BETTER WORK
9	ELMPS	155.000	120.000	PROSPECTS
Total Egypt		**312.348**	**317.130**	
Morocco				
5	Support the National Observatory for Employment (OMT) to ensure their capacity to implement labour market projections; to manage LMIS platforms, and better use of social security data. Action : Evaluer la Stratégie nationale de l'emploi et le plan d'action national de l'emploi du Maroc	40.887	12.772	*ILO/ONU Femmes join programming project *ILO/HQ Département politique de l'emploi
6	Support the National Observatory for Employment (OMT) to ensure their capacity to implement labour market projections; to manage LMIS platforms, and better use of social security data. Action : Appuyer la mise en place du LMIS.Stat : Appuyer l'adhesion du Maroc à la plateforme ILO.stat 1ère activité : Atelier de formation des producteurs de données	11.618	11.618	Projet BIT/ THAMM (appui à la migration équitable de la main d'œuvre)
7	Support the adoption of evidence-based policies to set and update negotiated minimum wages Appui à la négociation collective au Maroc	33.900	40.000	40 000 USD from Département INWORDK / Project : GLO/20/56/SWE (107523) *Increased capacity of member states to set adequate wages and promote decent working time
8	Conduct training sessions on "reporting on ILS" for MoE and focal points from other departments, as well as social partners	4.000	8.000	Contribution budget BIT/Alger
9	Prepare a diagnostic study on the new forms of work and support the implementation of its recommendations Activités sur 2 nouvelles formes du travail (travail à temps partiel et travail sur plateformes)	17.380	75.228	*Enquête PHI (40 228 USD) *Excoll INWORK Deprtmt
10	Macroeconomic analysis tools and capacity to utilize these tools is strengthened (Morocco)		10.000	ILO/ONU Femmes join programme
Total Morocco		**107.785**	**157.618**	
Tunisia				

11	Appui logistique à la digitalisation de l'Inspection de travail	10.981	29.103	Project: IPDLI/ETOFE/RBTC
Total Tunisia		10.981	29.103	
TOTAL COST SHARES		**431.114**	**459.356**	

Source: ILO Project management

Given the total project budget of USD 8,208,868 for both Phase I (USD 5,524,938.04) and Phase II (USD 2,683,930.06), the co-financing leveraged constitutes 5.6% of the overall budget. According to the evaluators´ experience this is good ratio compared, in average, to similar initiatives.

Coordination and collaboration with other ILO, UN and other cooperation partners

As explained in the relevance section, the ADWA projects have successfully fostered extensive collaboration with a wide range of ILO projects and departments, UN agencies, and other cooperation partners. These partnerships have been instrumental in enhancing the effectiveness and efficiency of the ADWA initiatives, allowing for advancements in areas such as capacity building, evidence-based policymaking, and the promotion of women's entrepreneurship across the target countries.

Cooperation with national stakeholders

The ADWA projects have significantly fostered positive relationships with national stakeholders across Egypt, Morocco, and Tunisia through various collaborative efforts and successful partnerships. For example, in **Egypt**, the project worked closely with the Ministry of Planning and Economic Development to draft a National Employment Policy. Additionally, the National Council for Judicial Studies integrated International Labour Standards into their training programs for judges, developing "bench books" that incorporate national labour law and ILS, now used as a reference by judges. The Central Agency for Public Mobilization and Statistics benefited from improved data collection and analysis tools, including the redesigned Employment and Wage Establishment Survey, and conducted rapid assessments of COVID-19 impacts on the labour force, influencing policy responses.

In **Morocco**, ADWA worked, among others, with the HCP to merge household and labour data with national accounts, creating the Satellite Account for Employment and enhancing statistical decision-making tools, aiding economic and employment policy formulation. The project also engaged with the Ministry of Economic Inclusion, Small Business, Employment, and Skills (MIEPEEC) to digitize its processes, improving service delivery and efficiency. The elaboration of the Green Jobs Assessment Model assessed opportunities for green job creation. The project in cooperation with the ADS provided GERME/Get-Ahead training for women entrepreneurs, promoting women's economic participation.

In **Tunisia**, ADWA collaborated, for example, with the Ministry of Social Affairs to develop new monitoring and evaluation systems for active labour market programs and implemented the Green Jobs Assessment Model to support the transition to a sustainable economy. The National Observatory of Employment and Skills (ONEQ) conducted impact evaluations of employment programs, informing policy adjustments and improvements, and enhanced the capacity for evidence-based program evaluation. The *Institut Supérieur de la Magistrature* institutionalized training on ILS and gender issues for judges, leading to decisions increasingly reflecting ILS principles, thereby improving the quality of labour jurisprudence.

Regionally, the Economic Research Forum (ERF) produced reports on jobs and economic growth, facilitating cross-country comparisons and knowledge sharing. They also hosted webinars and virtual meetings to discuss research findings and policy implications, strengthening regional cooperation. Tripartite workshops and committees were established, such as in Egypt, where a tripartite steering committee was set up for implementing the National Roadmap for Responsible Business Conduct. The project also supported the adoption of the ILO MNE Declaration, promoting responsible business practices.

These examples illustrate the extensive and effective collaboration between the ADWA projects and various national stakeholders, ensuring that project activities are well-aligned with national priorities and contribute to sustainable outcomes.

ILO support to project implementation

Based on interviews with key stakeholders and a review of documents, the ET found that the ADWA projects benefited from extensive technical and policy support, particularly from the ILO Cairo Country Office, where the core project team was based. This proximity to the Egypt ILO office facilitated easy access to support from the CO Director and Decent Work Team specialists, including the ILS Specialist, the Employment Specialist, and the Enterprise Development and Job Creation Specialist. Additionally, both the ACTRAV and ACTEMP specialists provided support as needed.

This support was instrumental for the successful implementation of the ADWA projects. The ILO and its specialists played a vital role in coordinating various activities and provided continuous technical, policy, and institutional assistance, which helped implement the projects.

Governance and management arrangements

Governance

The governance structure of the ILO-ADWA projects demonstrates a multi-layered, collaborative framework that involves regional offices and several key stakeholders: The projects are implemented under the responsibility of the ILO Decent Work Team (DWT) for North Africa in Cairo, in close collaboration with the ILO Office in Algiers, responsible for the Maghreb countries (Algeria, Libya, Morocco, Tunisia, and Mauritania).

The annual meetings between ILO and Sida representatives, serve as a platform for reviewing and discussing the project's annual report. This regular engagement ensures transparency, accountability, and alignment with donor expectations. However, a challenge for the ILO has been the changes in Sida focal points throughout the project, with the team now working with the third focal point, each having different expectations. In addition, there are biannual (remote) meetings between the project team and Sida for discussing implementation, monitoring, and workplans, facilitate continuous dialogue and timely adjustments to project strategies.

The inclusion of a tripartite governance structure (involving governments, employers' and workers' organizations) in each of the countries ensures that key stakeholders are involved in the project's implementation and oversight. In Tunisia, this structure was fully tripartite, while in Morocco it applied specifically to Outcome 1. In Egypt, although a tripartite steering committee was established on paper and met once, the Ministry of Manpower (MOM) subsequently requested that bilateral consultations be held instead, with all activities

channelled through them. This inclusive approach, where fully implemented, ensures that diverse perspectives are considered, enhancing the relevance and acceptance of the project interventions.

Management

The management structure of the ILO-ADWA projects is designed to ensure efficient implementation and supervision, with clearly defined roles and responsibilities.

The Project Manager/Chief Technical Advisor (CTA) based in Cairo is responsible for overall project management, implementation, and supervision of the project team. Since 2022 and based on the recommendation of the MTE, the CTA is supported by a Project Officer (initially M&E and Programme Officer) who also handles monitoring and evaluation. In addition, a senior finance and administrative assistant, along with administrative and finance assistants in Egypt, Morocco, and Tunisia, ensure robust financial and administrative management. This structure supports efficient resource allocation, budget management, and administrative operations.

National Project Coordinators in Egypt Morocco and Tunisia are responsible for project operations in their respective countries. While they formally report to the CTA and work under the supervision of the ILO Country Directors, what truly made the management effective was the constant contact and exchange between the CTA and the country-based teams. In addition, regular ADWA team meetings and retreats, both online and in person, facilitated collaboration and ensured that country-specific issues were addressed promptly, allowing project activities to be effectively tailored to local contexts.

The governance and management arrangements of the ILO-ADWA projects have facilitated project results by establishing a comprehensive, collaborative, and transparent framework. The involvement of multiple stakeholders through a tripartite approach ensures that the projects are contextually relevant and inclusive. The centralized leadership by the CTA, supported by a robust team for financial, administrative, and operational tasks, ensures efficient project implementation and supervision. Regular engagement with the donor through the Advisory Committee and biannual meetings further enhances accountability and strategic alignment. Overall, these arrangements have contributed to the effective delivery of project activities and the achievement of project outcomes.

Monitoring and evaluation

The terms of reference ask the evaluators to assess whether there is an M&E system in place that includes collecting and using data disaggregated by sex, disability, and disadvantaged groups.

As explained in the relevance section, the project developed an M&E framework. Indicators developed for Phase I were not disaggregated by sex, disability, or other disadvantaged categories. However, indicators developed for Phase II were disaggregated by sex, but not by disability. According to project management staff, individuals with disabilities were never a specific target or focus group of the project.

Overall, the evaluation, based on primary and secondary information, concludes that all project activities provided good value for money. Additionally, considering the project's complexity, the numerous institutions involved, and the participation of three countries, the evaluators agree with several stakeholders that achieving the same results at a lower cost would not have been likely.

Impact and Sustainability

This section begins by examining the potential for positive impact of the ADWA project. Additionally, it explores whether the projects have fostered national ownership and the effectiveness of the projects in generating interest and participation at the national level. Moreover, it examines the likelihood of the projects' positive outcomes persisting beyond their conclusion. This analysis also identifies success factors as recognized by partner organizations, ILO personnel, and partners to enhance sustainability. The section further assesses the relevance and effectiveness of the projects' sustainability plans. Lastly, it reviews the extent to which the recommendations from the mid-term evaluation have been incorporated into the projects' implementation strategies, ensuring alignment with broader developmental objectives and the sustainability of results.

Potential for Positive Impacts of the ADWA Project

The ADWA projects have demonstrated potential for positive impacts across several dimensions in the target countries of Egypt, Morocco, and Tunisia. These impacts can be categorized into several key areas, including economic development, gender equality, capacity building, and environmental sustainability.

1. Economic Development

The projects have the potential to contribute to more inclusive economic development by promoting job-rich growth. For example, in Morocco, the projects supported the development of the National Employment and Entrepreneurship Policy 2035, which includes measures to create new employment opportunities, particularly for women and youth.

2. Gender Equality

The ADWA projects have made progress in promoting gender equality and empowering women:

- Women's Entrepreneurship: Across countries, the projects implemented initiatives to support women entrepreneurs. These efforts have the potential to enable women to start and grow their businesses, contributing to economic resilience and gender parity.
- Legal and Policy Reforms: The projects have advocated for and supported the alignment of national laws with international standards on gender equality and non-discrimination. This includes efforts to support the ratification and implementation of the Violence and Harassment Convention, 2019 (No. 190), the Domestic Workers Convention, 2011 (No. 189), or the Part-Time Work Convention, 1994 (No. 175).

3. Capacity Building

Significant efforts have been directed towards building the capacity of various stakeholders, including government officials, social partners, and judiciary members:

- Training Programs: Extensive training sessions were conducted to enhance the skills and knowledge of judges, parliamentarians, and government officials on ILS and best practices in employment policies. This has the potential to lead to improved policy formulation and implementation.

- Institutional Strengthening: for example, in Egypt and Morocco, the collaboration with CAPMAS and HCP respectively strengthened the national statistics agency's ability to collect and analyze labour market data. This improved data infrastructure supports informed decision-making and policy development.

4. Environmental Sustainability

The projects have promoted a fair transition to environmental sustainability, supporting the development of green growth strategies and the promotion of green jobs. Across-countries ADWA supported the development of green job assessment models (GJAM) and the integration of green employment components into national surveys. This has the potential to facilitate the creation of sustainable jobs and promoted environmentally friendly business practices.

5. Social Dialogue and Tripartism

The projects have reinforced the importance of social dialogue and tripartism, ensuring that the voices of workers, employers, and governments are included in policy-making processes:

- Inclusive Policy Development: Through the promotion of social dialogue, the projects have supported the development of inclusive policies that reflect the needs and perspectives of all social partners. This has the potential to lead to more effective and equitable employment policies.
- Strengthening Tripartite Relationships: By facilitating national dialogues and consultations, the projects have strengthened relationships between government bodies, employers' associations, and workers' organizations, fostering a collaborative approach to addressing labour market challenges.

National Ownership and Stakeholder Participation and Engagement and Capacity Building

The ADWA project places a strong emphasis on increasing national ownership of its objectives by ensuring the meaningful participation of key stakeholders. This approach is crucial for sustainability as it builds local capacity and commitment to continue the project's initiatives. For instance, in **Egypt**, partnering with the National Council for Judicial Studies has ensured that training on ILS and gender is integrated into the NCJS's ongoing judicial education programs, which have their own budget and mandate. Similarly, in **Tunisia**, the project supported the Institut Supérieur de la Magistrature by providing specialized training of trainers on ILS, creating a pool of labour experts who can pass on this knowledge to newly trained judges. These efforts are expected to have long-lasting effects.

The project's extensive capacity-building activities, including the development of training manuals, establishment of new curricula, and institutionalization of programs like GetAhead for women entrepreneurship in **Morocco** by the ADS, are essential for sustaining these changes. These initiatives have not only improved skills and knowledge but also increased awareness and interest in the project's goals. For example, training sessions for judges in **Egypt** and **Tunisia** have led to a better understanding and application of ILS, prompting further interest among judicial stakeholders.

Additionally, the project has effectively stimulated interest and participation by engaging stakeholders at multiple levels, conducting regular surveys, and adapting to new challenges and needs. These strategies have collectively ensured a high level of commitment and active involvement from national partners, which is crucial for the sustainability of the project's positive changes. The latest project survey in 2024 saw a significant increase in stakeholder responses, with many expressing high commitment to sustaining the project's outcomes, reflecting the growing interest and engagement fostered by the project's activities.

The ADWA Key Stakeholders Survey conducted in 2024 gathered insights from 28 respondents across Egypt, Morocco, and Tunisia, indicating an increase in participation compared to previous years. Key findings include:

- **Commitment and Ownership**: Approximately 70% of respondents expressed high to very high commitment to sustaining the ADWA project's results, indicating strong support for maintaining its outcomes. However, about 75% of respondents believed that more capacity building is still needed, highlighting gaps in knowledge and skills for ensuring project sustainability.

- **Influence on Policy and Legal Reforms**: Over half of the respondents noted that the ADWA project had influenced economic policy changes or reforms in the target countries. The project was credited with contributing to the alignment of national policies with international standards and the reference to ILS in judicial judgments.

- **Skills Development**: Respondents across all three countries reported improvements in skills and organizational development due to the ADWA project's interventions. These improvements were seen as contributing to more effective programs and policies, particularly in areas like green jobs, gender-inclusive work, and the application of ILS.

- **Sustainability**: The sustainability of the project's outcomes was generally viewed positively, with many respondents confident that the changes facilitated by the ADWA project would be maintained long-term due to strong institutionalization efforts. However, there were concerns about the need for continued engagement and capacity building to ensure lasting impact.

Alignment with National Policies and Strategies

The projects' objectives are closely aligned with national plans and strategies, which enhances their sustainability. For instance, the data collection and analysis improvements made in collaboration with CAPMAS in **Egypt** or HCP in **Morocco** have strengthened these agencies' abilities to inform socio-economic policies. This alignment ensures that the initiatives continue to receive support from national governments.

Institutional Embedding

Changes are embedded in existing institutional frameworks. For example, in **Morocco**, the digitalization of procedures within the Ministry of Economy Inclusion, Small Business, Jobs, and Skills has been built on the Ministry's existing software platform, ensuring ongoing maintenance and integration within the Ministry's budget. Also, in **Egypt**, the inclusion of green job data in the government-funded annual employment survey illustrates the embedding of project outcomes into national processes.

Good Practices and Success Factors to Promote Sustainability in ADWA Projects

- <u>National Ownership and Alignment with National Strategies</u>: The sustainability of the ADWA projects largely stems from their alignment with national plans and strategies, fostering a sense of ownership among national stakeholders. This alignment ensures that the project's goals are integrated into the broader national development agendas, making the initiatives more relevant and sustainable. For instance, partnering with the NCJS in Egypt leveraged its mandate for judicial education, ensuring long-term implementation and sustainability.

- <u>Integrated Strategy for Sustainable Impact</u>: The ADWA project has employed a comprehensive strategy that includes targeted capacity building, embedding changes in national systems, developing knowledge products, and fostering stakeholder engagement. This approach has enhanced data collection and analysis capabilities, such as through advanced training provided to Egypt's CAPMAS, and has integrated new practices like digitalization within Morocco's Ministry of Economic Inclusion. The creation of guides, training manuals, and tools, including judicial bench books in Egypt and Tunisia, has ensured the institutionalization of best practices. Additionally, strong stakeholder collaboration, characterized by regular consultations and collaborative planning, has promoted flexibility, responsiveness, and a strong sense of ownership, which are crucial for the sustainability of the project's outcomes.

- <u>Exit Strategy and Monitoring</u>: ADWA's explicit exit strategy includes regular stocktaking, monitoring of results, and sustainability assessments. These activities contribute to keeping project interventions on track and increase the likelihood of their sustainability.

- <u>Risk Mitigation and Adaptation to Changing External Conditions</u>: The flexibility of the ADWA projects to adapt to changing external conditions, such as the COVID-19 pandemic as well as to institutional and policy changes, has also contributed to their sustainability. The projects have been able to pivot and adjust their strategies to meet new challenges and opportunities effectively.

Effectiveness and Relevance of the ADWA Projects' Sustainability/Exit Strategy

Based on document review and interviews with key stakeholders, the ET concluded that the ADWA projects' exit strategy is both effective and relevant, as it addresses key areas necessary for the sustainability of project outcomes. By focusing on regular assessments, knowledge transfer, stakeholder engagement, and risk management, the strategy aims at ensuring that the positive changes brought about by the projects are likely to continue beyond their lifespan. The strategy's alignment with national goals and adaptability to changing contexts further enhances its effectiveness and relevance, making it a robust framework for promoting long-term sustainability.

<u>1. Effectiveness of the Exit Strategy</u>

The ADWA projects have implemented a comprehensive exit strategy designed to ensure the sustainability of project outcomes. The strategy, developed initially in 2020 and refined in 2023, focuses on several core areas:

- <u>Regular Stocktaking and Monitoring</u>: The strategy includes ongoing evaluations and periodic stakeholder consultations to ensure that project interventions remain relevant and

effective. This regular assessment helps in identifying any gaps or areas needing adjustment to enhance sustainability.

- Knowledge Transfer and Capacity Building: A significant component of the strategy is the focus on transferring knowledge and building capacity. This includes developing training manuals, establishing curricula, and ensuring that tools and methodologies are integrated into national systems. For example, in Egypt, the collaboration with the NCJS ensures that trainings on ILS is part of the judicial curriculum, making these initiatives sustainable.

- Stakeholder Engagement and Ownership: The exit strategy emphasizes the importance of national ownership by involving key stakeholders in the planning and implementation phases. This approach ensures that the projects are aligned with national priorities and that stakeholders are committed to continuing the initiatives post-project. For example, in Morocco, the digitalization of procedures efforts within the Ministry of Economic Inclusion, Small Business, Jobs, and Skills have been integrated into the Ministry's ongoing operations.

- Scoring System for Sustainability Assessment: The exit strategy employs a detailed scoring system to evaluate the likelihood of sustainability for each project outcome. This system assesses factors such as the extent of completion, identification and engagement of responsible organizations, commitment levels, capacity to continue activities, and availability of funding sources. The likelihood of sustainability up to three years post-project is assessed using a detailed scoring system.

Based on the exit strategy document, here are some specific examples of how the sustainability of the ADWA project's results was scored:

1. **Labour Force Survey (Egypt):** This outcome received a relatively high sustainability score. The project ensured that bulletins were produced, and specialists and directors were engaged for formal commitments. However, partial synergies and the need for ongoing funding sources were noted, resulting in a final score of 33 out of 55.

2. **Judges Training (Egypt, Tunisia):** This outcome, which involved institutionalizing ILS capacity-building and developing bench books, scored 35 out of 55. The high commitment from judicial institutions and the integration of these tools into national curricula contributed positively. However, synergies with other ILO projects and continuous funding were areas identified for further development.

3. **Women Entrepreneurship (GetAhead) (Morocco):** The institutionalization of the GetAhead program by the ADS scored 34 out of 55. The high alignment with ADS's strategic objectives and identified funding sources contributed to the favorable score, but the need for ongoing trainer certification and continued engagement was highlighted as crucial for long-term sustainability.

- Coordination and Continuity: The vast number of stakeholders involved presents a challenge (and at the same time, an opportunity) for maintaining coordination and continuity post-project.

- Political and Institutional Changes: Changes in government or turnover among key national stakeholders can affect sustainability. Engaging civil society, the media, academia, and the private sector can help mitigate these risks by diversifying the support base.

- Funding and Expertise: The availability of experts and funding post-project is a significant challenge. Identifying funding sources and ensuring that stakeholders have the capacity to continue activities independently is critical.

2. Relevance of the Exit Strategy

The relevance of the exit strategy is underscored by its alignment with national priorities and the focus on building local capacities to ensure that the project's impacts are long-lasting. Several key aspects highlight the strategy's relevance:

- Alignment with National Goals: The exit strategy ensures that the project activities support national objectives, which enhances the commitment from local stakeholders. For instance, the strategy aligns with the national employment and development strategies, ensuring that project outcomes are integrated into the country's long-term employment and development objectives.

- Adaptability to Contextual Changes: The strategy has been updated to reflect, for example, the challenges posed by the COVID-19 pandemic, ensuring that project activities remain relevant and effective under changing circumstances. This adaptability is crucial for maintaining stakeholder engagement and project effectiveness.

- Risk Management: The strategy includes a risk register and plans to address potential risks such as political instability, changes in government, and economic disruptions. By anticipating these risks, and identifying mitigation measures form early on, the strategy promotes that the projects are resilient and can adapt to various challenges throughout their implementation.

- Stakeholder Feedback and Continuous Improvement: The strategy incorporates feedback from stakeholders, which helps in refining and improving the exit plan. This feedback loop promotes that the strategy remains relevant and effective in achieving its sustainability goals.

Despite the good prospects for sustainability, key stakeholders consulted by the ET expressed the need for the ILO and the donors to continue providing technical and financial support to maintain and expand the successful outcomes achieved. There is a call, for example, for continued support in promoting ILS across countries in the MENA region, as well as in expanding the GJAM studies.

In **Egypt**, further enhancing capacity building for Labour Market Information Systems and supporting the development and implementation of the National Employment Policy (NEP) remains important. Moreover, stakeholders also emphasized the need for continued support for Labour Legal Aid Offices.

In **Morocco**, stakeholders highlighted the necessity of ongoing support for the implementation and monitoring of the National Employment Strategy. Continued collaboration with the ADS for women's entrepreneurship, as well as support for the HCP and MOL to keep on improving the Labour Market Information System, were also requests by national stakeholders. Furthermore, capacity building for judges and parliamentarians, as it happened in Tunisia and Egypt, is an area that was demanded by Moroccan stakeholders.

In **Tunisia**, there is a need to strengthen the evaluation and improvement of Active Labour Market Policies and support the development of green employment initiatives. In addition, enhancing support for women's entrepreneurship and gender equality requires potential ongoing support from the ILO to ensure continued progress and sustainability.

Integration of the MTE Recommendations

The Terms of Reference asked the evaluators to assess the extent to which the recommendations from the mid-term evaluation were integrated into the project's implementation strategy. Based on the information provided by the project management, the Evaluation Team found that six out of the nine recommendations were fully implemented, while three were partially implemented, as detailed in the table below:

Table 10. Integration of the MTE Recommendations

Were the recommendations of the MTE integrated in the project´s implementation strategy?		
Recommendation	**Integrated**	**Comments**
*R1: **ILO project team**: Given the limited project resources, which are spread quite thinly, it is recommended to focus the implementation of phase I on the truly needs-based components of ADWA'. Contracts for the regional component should not be extended or renewed with the view to terminate this component.*	Yes	The recommendation has been implemented
*R2: **ILO project team** At the same time, greater involvement of civil society and the media is a necessity. ADWA project should focus more on building partnerships with these organizations and the media, particularly in Tunisia and Morocco, in order to play a triggering role in the ratification of certain conventions, changes in laws and regulations concerning workers' rights. The latter would also better link outcomes 1 and 2.*	Partially	The recommendation was implemented in Morocco
*R3: **ILO project team and constituents**: Maintain the intention to include gender prominently in the project's design of phase II post 2023, as envisaged. Look actively for opportunities to address disability in the design of phase II.*	Partially	Gender was included, but no disability as the latter was never a specific target/focus group of the project
*R4: **ILO project team and constituents**: Some interviewees see that ADWA' comes with fixed objectives without any consultation with those concerned and which meet the expectations of donors. Faced with this situation and for greater credibility, the ILO and donors must plan and/or program projects that respond to requests made by the country and transmitted to it for technical and financial support. It is therefore recommended to actively consult tripartite constituents in the remaining months of 2022 and 2023 in the project countries about the design of phase II post 2023. Constituents should actively participate in that process.*	Yes	The recommendation has been implemented through recurrent workplan discussions with relevant partner Ministries and the consultations carried out while developing the new ADALA project in 2023, consultations with the occasion on the end of project regional workshop (EOPRWS) in July 2024 to identify impact, challenges, sustainability of the intervention and recommendations for future interventions
*R5: **ILO project team**: The project requires a realistic design for phase II post 2023, with a ToC built on feasible assumptions.*	Yes	A project document was developed for phase II and approved by the donor
*R6: **ILO project team**: Revise the staffing structure and reduce the number of national*	Yes	The recommendation has been implemented.

officers for the three outcomes in Egypt to free up staff resources to better support the CTA. Consider moving the full-time administrative support from the Algiers CO to Rabat (50%) and Tunis (50%).		
R 7: **ILO project team***: Engage with the donor as a follow-up of this mid-term evaluation and agree to keep the current country focus on Egypt, Morocco, and Tunisia at least till the end of 2023.*	Yes	The recommendation has been implemented.
R8: **ILO CTA***: Review the CTA's workload and identify areas for delegation to one additional support staff to free up time for the CTA to lead on reaching out to potential new donors as early as possible in 2022.*	Yes	The recommendation has been implemented. However, in 2024 staffing challenges due to turnover and officers leaving the project for longer employment opportunities
R 9: **ILO project team:** It is recommended to strengthen the project's approach to capacity building on the lessons learned concerning capacity building practices. The need shows for systematically applying training needs assessment, follow-up to capacity building, it institutionalizations by involving local partners, for example through a train the trainers approach, the documentation of training and the exploration of hybrid training modalities where feasible.	Partially	TOT was provided and capacity building institutionalized in the countries.

Integration of ILO Cross-cutting issues

To evaluate whether the ADWA projects have effectively considered the ILO cross-cutting issues of gender, tripartism, social dialogue, international labour standards, and a fair transition to environmental sustainability in their design and implementation, the following assessment is based on document review and interviews with key stakeholders.

1. **Gender Mainstreaming**

The ADWA projects have demonstrated various efforts and results in including gender mainstreaming and promoting equal participation of women and men.

- Training and Capacity Building: The projects have focused on enhancing the understanding of women's rights and providing comprehensive training programs for women. For instance, in **Egypt,** the projects supported female judges by providing training on labour laws and ILS to enhance their technical skills and knowledge.

- Policy and Legal Frameworks: In **Morocco,** the projects worked on mapping women's employment characteristics to understand the barriers they face. This contributed to the formulation of a new employment and entrepreneurship strategy, which contain objectives that aim at improving women's participation in the labour market.

- Support for Women Entrepreneurs: The ADWA projects in **Egypt**, **Morocco**, and **Tunisia** included initiatives to support women entrepreneurs. These efforts aimed at creating a more enabling environment for women's entrepreneurship.

- Employment Opportunities: The projects conducted situational analyses to identify value chains and sectors conducive to women's employment. For example, the Rapid Situational Analysis in **Egypt** focused on women's entrepreneurship within the context of just transition policies.

- Addressing Legal Gaps: In **Morocco,** the project engaged in discussions with the MOL regarding the findings and recommendations of a gap analysis that was undertaken. This analysis aimed to identify the discrepancies between national legislation and the provisions of the Violence and Harassment Convention, 2019 (No. 190), with the goal of encouraging its ratification. This initiative aimed to create safer working environments for women. The projects also engaged in the promotion of ILS with a gender focus: C.190 (violence and harassment in the workplace), C.189 (domestic work) and C.175 (part-time work)

- Green Jobs and Sustainable Development: The projects promoted green jobs and sustainable economic practices with a gender-sensitive approach. In **Morocco,** green job initiatives included identifying small-scale green enterprises managed by women and integrating green employment components into national surveys.

Overall, the ADWA projects have been proactive in mainstreaming gender, and in promoting inclusive economic growth, although according to several stakeholders consulted continued efforts and monitoring are necessary to maintain and build on these achievements.

The TOR also request the evaluators to assess whether there are sufficient gender-sensitive monitoring structures in place. As discussed in previous sections, the Phase I M&E framework did not include gender-disaggregated indicators. However, this gap was effectively addressed in Phase II, where the project's M&E framework incorporated and collected gender-

disaggregated data. This improvement ensured a more comprehensive and inclusive assessment of the project's results, particularly concerning gender-related outcomes.

2. Tripartism

Tripartism, which involves the collaboration between governments, employers, and workers' representatives, is a core principle of the ILO. The ADWA projects have made significant efforts to include tripartite stakeholders in their initiatives. We highlight some examples below:

- **Egypt**: The project facilitated national dialogues involving government agencies, employers, and workers' organizations, for example, to develop and implement a roadmap based on the MNE Declaration principles.

- **Morocco**: The project supported the creation of committees that included representatives from the government, employers, and workers to formulate the new employment and entrepreneurship strategy.

- **Tunisia**: Similar efforts were made to involve tripartite stakeholders in discussions on employment policies and labour standards.

Additionally, the end-of-project regional workshop held in Cairo in July 2023 brought together key stakeholders from the target countries. This workshop served as a platform for sharing lessons learned, discussing the sustainability of project results, and reinforcing the importance of tripartite collaboration moving forward.

3. Social Dialogue

Social dialogue, involving negotiations, consultations, and exchanges of information between representatives of governments, employers, and workers on issues of common interest, has been integral to the ADWA projects:

- Capacity Building: Training programs for social partners were implemented to enhance their capacity to engage in effective social dialogue.

- Policy Development: The projects supported the development of policies through inclusive consultations, ensuring that the perspectives of all social partners were considered.

- Legal Frameworks: the projects worked with various stakeholders to align national laws with international standards, fostering an environment conducive to social dialogue.

4. International Labour Standards

The ADWA projects have prioritized the promotion and application of international labour standards. Moreover, ILS are a core component of the projects.

- Training and Awareness: Extensive training sessions were conducted for judges, policymakers, and social partners on ILS, ensuring a thorough understanding and effective application.

- Legislative Alignment: The projects undertook gap analyses to identify discrepancies between national laws and ILS, advocating for legislative changes to align with international conventions.

5. Fair Transition to Environmental Sustainability

The projects have integrated environmental sustainability into their objectives, focusing on a fair transition that includes all stakeholders:

- <u>Green Jobs</u>: Initiatives were launched to promote green jobs and sustainable economic practices, with a particular emphasis on gender equality and inclusivity.
- <u>Policy Support</u>: Support was provided for developing green job assessment models and incorporating green employment components into national surveys and policies.
- <u>Women's Entrepreneurship</u>: Efforts were made to support women in green business ventures, ensuring that the transition to a green economy is inclusive and equitable.

▶ Conclusions

Based on the findings of the evaluation, the conclusions are organized under the evaluation criteria of relevance and coherence, effectiveness, efficiency, sustainability and impact, and cross-cutting Issues.

Relevance and Coherence

The ADWA projects have demonstrated significant relevance and coherence, aligning well with various strategic frameworks and plans. This includes alignment with the governments' strategies, ILO's Programme and Budget (P&B) and Decent Work Country Programme (DWCP) for Tunisia, Sida's MENA Regional Strategy priorities, the United Nations Sustainable Development Cooperation Frameworks (UNSDCF), and the Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs). The projects addressed the needs of national stakeholders in Egypt, Morocco, and Tunisia, ensuring that project objectives and activities were tailored to the specific requirements and priorities of these countries

Effectiveness

The ADWA projects have been effective in achieving their intended outcomes across the target countries. Key achievements include enhanced national capacities for labour market data collection and analysis, improved policies for job-rich growth, and the promotion of International Labour Standards. For instance, in Egypt, the collaboration with CAPMAS has led to better data quality, guiding socio-economic policies and legal reforms. Similarly, in Morocco, the development of a National Employment Policy and the promotion of green jobs have been significant milestones. In Tunisia, digitalization efforts and updates to Active Labour Market Programmes have been noteworthy. The projects also made significant progress in promoting ILS, with substantial capacity-building initiatives and enhanced legal frameworks across countries. This led to tangible improvements such as the institutionalization of ILS training for judges in Egypt and the ratification of important ILO conventions in Morocco and Tunisia. Additionally, the projects' efforts to engage the private sector and promote responsible business practices have further advanced the decent work agenda.

Efficiency

The ADWA projects have been efficient in utilizing financial and human resources to achieve their objectives. The projects have successfully leveraged notable additional resources through collaborations with other ILO initiatives and national-level stakeholders, enhancing the implementation of activities. Financial management and disbursement processes were aligned with budgetary plans, and the projects received adequate administrative, technical, and policy support from ILO offices and specialists. This efficient use of resources and effective management have facilitated the achievement of project outcomes. Overall, the evaluation, concluded that all project activities provided good value for money. Additionally, considering the project's complexity, the numerous institutions involved, and the participation of three countries, the evaluators agree with several stakeholders that achieving the same results at a lower cost would not have been likely

Sustainability and Impact

The ADWA projects have laid a strong foundation for sustainability by fostering national ownership and aligning with national policies and strategies. The extensive capacity-building activities, such as training programs and the development of training manuals, have ensured knowledge transfer and institutionalization of new practices. These efforts have led to potential positive impacts. For instance, the institutionalization of ILS training for judges in Egypt and the inclusion of green job data in national surveys illustrate the embedding of project outcomes into national processes. However, the continuation of these positive changes will depend on effective coordination, continuous stakeholder engagement, and securing necessary funding and expertise.

Cross-cutting Issues

Gender equality and environmental sustainability were effectively integrated into the project design and implementation. The projects addressed gender disparities in the labour market and promoted inclusive policies, contributing to broader social and economic development goals aligned with the SDGs. In addition, the project effectively integrated environmental sustainability by promoting a fair transition that includes all stakeholders. Key initiatives focused on fostering green jobs and sustainable economic practices, with an emphasis on gender equality and inclusivity. The project also provided policy support by developing green job assessment models and embedding green employment elements into national surveys and policies. Additionally, targeted efforts were made to empower women in green business ventures, ensuring that the shift towards a green economy remains both inclusive and equitable.

▶ Lessons learned

1. Importance of Engaging National Partners

One of the key lessons learned from the ADWA projects is the importance of regular and meaningful engagement with national stakeholders. Regular meetings and consultations with key partners are essential for aligning project activities with national priorities, ensuring stakeholder buy-in, and fostering a sense of ownership. By engaging stakeholders early, projects can ensure that activities align with national priorities and gather strong support.

2. Importance of Context-Specific Approaches

Another important lesson learned from the ADWA projects is the critical need to tailor project interventions to the specific socio-economic and political contexts of each country. For example, stakeholder engagement and policy implementation approaches required customization to align with the unique circumstances of Egypt, Morocco, and Tunisia. This experience highlighted the necessity of conducting thorough contextual analyses and being flexible in adapting methodologies to meet local needs and conditions effectively.

3. Navigating Political and Economic Instability

The ADWA projects learned that political and economic instability significantly impacts project implementation and outcomes. Various challenges arose from fluctuating political landscapes and economic conditions in the target countries, emphasizing the importance of having contingency plans and flexible project designs. By anticipating potential disruptions and developing strategies to mitigate their impact, projects are better positioned to maintain progress and achieve their objectives despite adverse conditions.

▶ Emerging Good Practices

1. Strong Stakeholder Engagement

Engaging stakeholders early on in the planning process ensured that work plans were relevant, realistic, and had broad buy-in. This approach facilitated a smooth implementation and great commitment from partners. In addition, maintaining open lines of communication of the project management and staff with stakeholders, including regular consultations and updates, fostered continued trust and transparency. This ensured that stakeholders were informed and remained engaged throughout the project. Moreover, by involving stakeholders in decision-making processes, the project fostered a sense of ownership and responsibility among partners. This practice was crucial for sustaining project activities and outcomes.

2. Working with judges and parliamentarians to promote ILS

Working with judges and parliamentarians is crucial for several reasons. Judges play a pivotal role in the interpretation and enforcement of labour laws, and their decisions set precedents (jurisprudence) that shape the application of these laws. The projects' engagement with judges ensured they have expanded their knowledge about ILS and the intention behind national laws, which is expected to potentially lead to more consistent and fair judgments. Similarly, parliamentarians are responsible for drafting, debating, and enacting laws. Their understanding and commitment to international labour standards are crucial for developing robust national legislation. Collaboration with both judges and parliamentarians also promotes greater awareness and education on labour rights and standards among the judiciary and legislative bodies. This, in turn, leads to better-informed decisions and policies that uphold labour rights and address emerging labour issues effectively. Continuous engagement helps build the capacity of judicial and legislative institutions to handle labour issues competently and fairly, fostering an environment where labour laws are not only well-crafted but also effectively implemented and enforced.

3. Institutionalization of capacity-building activities to ensure their sustainability

A notable good practice of the ADWA projects is the consolidation of capacity-building activities to ensure their sustainability. The project has implemented extensive capacity-building initiatives, including training programs, the development of training manuals, and the establishment of new training curricula. In this regard, ADWA supported the NCJS in Egypt and the ISM in Tunisia, by providing specialized Training of Trainers on ILS. This training has been successfully integrated into the training curricula of both NCJS and ISM, ensuring that new judges receive education on ILS. Additionally, in Morocco, the institutionalization of the GetAhead program for women's entrepreneurship by the ADS exemplifies sustained capacity-building efforts, ensuring ongoing support and development for women entrepreneurs.

▶ Recommendations

Recommendation 1: Strengthen Support for International Labour Standards and National Employment Policies in the MENA Region

It is recommended that the ILO continues to support and enhance the promotion and implementation of ILS across the MENA region, particularly in Egypt, Morocco, and Tunisia. This support should include ongoing technical assistance, capacity building, and advocacy to align labour laws with ILS. Additionally, the ILO should continue its support to the development and implementation of National Employment Policies in these countries, ensuring that such policies are evidence-based and inclusive of all relevant stakeholders.

Addressed to	Priority	Implementation	Level of resources	Related conclusion, LL or GP
ILO, national Governments and Constituents; the donor community	Medium	Mid-term	High	Effectiveness Sustainability

Recommendation 2: Promote Cross-Fertilization of Best Practices and Strengthen Capacity Building in Labour Market Information Systems

The ILO, national Governments and Constituents should reinforce collaboration among Tunisia, Egypt, and Morocco to facilitate the sharing of best practices and innovations, particularly in the areas of ILS, labour market information systems and employment policies. This includes continued support for the enhancement of labour market data collection and analysis capabilities in Egypt, Morocco and Tunisia ensuring high standards and informed policy-making. Efforts should also focus on improving active labour market policies, enabling these countries to address common challenges through shared learning.

Addressed to	Priority	Implementation	Level of resources	Related conclusion, LL or GP
ILO, national Governments and Constituents; the donor community	Medium	Mid-term	High	Effectiveness Sustainability

Recommendation 3: Expand and Integrate Green Jobs and Employment Initiatives

It is recommended that the ILO, national Governments and Constituents continue to expand the GJAM studies and integrate green employment initiatives into national strategies and policies in Egypt, Morocco, and Tunisia. This includes incorporating findings from GJAM studies into national policies, providing capacity building for stakeholders, and aligning these initiatives with broader sustainability and climate resilience goals.

Addressed to	Priority	Implementation	Level of resources	Related conclusion, LL or GP
ILO, national Governments and Constituents; the donor community	Medium	Mid-term	High	Effectiveness Sustainability

Recommendation 4: Enhance Support for Legal and Institutional Frameworks for Labour Rights

The ILO, the national Governments and Constituents should continue to support the establishment and operationalization of labour legal aid offices in Egypt and build the capacity of judges and parliamentarians in Morocco. This support is crucial for ensuring effective implementation of labour laws, and access to legal services for workers and employers.

Addressed to	Priority	Implementation	Level of resources	Related conclusion, LL or GP
ILO, national Governments and Constituents; the donor community	Medium	Mid-term	High	Effectiveness Sustainability

Recommendation 5: Support Women's Entrepreneurship and Broader Employment Strategies

The ILO should continue its collaboration with national partners to support women's entrepreneurship, particularly for women in vulnerable situations. In addition, by institutionalizing tools like the GetAhead program and providing ongoing training and mentorship, the ILO can contribute to the sustainable and scalable growth of women-owned businesses and ensure alignment with national employment goals.

Addressed to	Priority	Implementation	Level of resources	Related conclusion, LL or GP
ILO, national Governments and Constituents; the donor community	Medium	Mid-term	High	Effectiveness Sustainability

Recommendation 6: Ongoing Collaboration for Improved Labour Market Data and Digitalization

The ILO should continue its collaboration with national institutions, such as CAPMAS) in Egypt, the HCP in Morocco and MOL in Tunisia, to enhance labour market data systems. This includes supporting the integration of green employment components, implementing digital platforms like ILO.Stat, and improving the quality and accessibility of labour market data.

Addressed to	Priority	Implementation	Level of resources	Related conclusion, LL or GP
ILO, national Governments and Constituents; the donor community	Medium	Mid-term	High	Effectiveness Sustainability

▶ **Error! No text of specified style in document.**

▶ Annexes

Annex 1 Summary of key results achieved by outcome

ADWA Phases I&II

KEY RESULTS achieved by outcome

(as reported by the project in the TPRs)

Outcomes	Egypt	Morocco	Tunisia
First area of impact: using **evidence-based policy** to ensure that economic decisions create employment (**Outcome 1**)	• The project defined an action plan with the Ministry of Planning to enhance macroeconomic analytical tools, including the update of the Social Accounting Matrix (SAM), the development of a satellite account on education and training, and the integration of the labour component in the Computable General Equilibrium (CGE) model. • ADWA supported the Economic Research Forum (ERF) on the production of new data on the Egyptian labour market through the 2018 Egypt Labour Market Panel Survey (ELMPS). • ADAWA provided technical assistance to CAPMAS resulted in enhanced data quality and availability for the Labour Force Survey (LFS) and the Employment and Wages (E&W) Establishment survey.	• With the Ministry of Economy and Finance, the project conducted expert meetings to map the available macroeconomic analytical tools; and defined priorities for developing new tools, including the impact assessment of public investments on employment and modelling the impact of tax exemptions on work formalization. • A work plan was prepared and adopted by the technical working group to address gaps in macroeconomic analysis for job promotion. • The realization of the satellite account for "employment" with the MEF and the HCP was finalized. • The ILO supported the Moroccan Ministry of Labour to join the ILO LMIS platform "Stat" for better decision-making.	• Supported the establishment of the Information and Management System for the Projects of International Cooperation of the Ministry of Professional Training and Employment. • Support provided to ONEQ to carry out impact evaluations of two employment programs. • Contributed to shaping the UN Cooperation Framework for Tunisia 2021-2025, ensuring ILO's priorities were reflected in the UNCF. This framework supports effective public policies for inclusive, sustainable development and resilience to crises and climate risks. • Supported the digitization and skills development of the labour inspection services in response to COVID-19. • Impact evaluations of two employment programs launched.

	A complete review and update of these surveys, including methodology, weighting system, and sampling frame improvements, was conducted. • In partnership with MoM, the project supported a study on the Fourth Industrial Revolution, AI, and the future of work in Egypt. The findings were presented in a joint webinar with ILO and the African Development Bank (AfDB). • In cooperation with MoF the project started the preparation of a diagnostic study on government spending in education vs labour market needs. • In collaboration with GIZ ADWA supported the work of the Labour Market Policy Unit at MPED: mapping of the labour market information in Egypt. • The project updated its work plan with MPED to cover emerging needs due to COVID-19. • Labour unit cost and productivity study preparations, and the introduction of an employment module to the latest Social Accounting Matrix (SAM), were advanced. • First draft of the study on government spending in education vs labour market needs. • Collaboration with CAPMAS to improve labour market surveys. Reviewed and	• As a request from the MoL, a study on new forms of work in the context of the 4th industrial revolution was prepared. • Supported the MoL's digitization of administrative and financial procedures. • Conducted a study in collaboration with AfBD on the impact of the pandemic on employment, especially SMEs. • Dissemination of the study on the new forms of work. • With MoF and HCP creation of the first employment satellite account to integrate various survey instruments with national accounts. • Training for the National Observatory for Employment on LMIS and digitization of the Ministry of Labour's processes. • Supported development of policies promoting collective bargaining and negotiated minimum wages. Organized workshops to enhance capacities in these areas. • Studies on the impact of COVID-19 on employment and SMEs. Dissemination of reports and policy briefs, influencing government strategies. • In collaboration with the HCP the project finalized the preparation of the Satellite Account for Employment, SAE, which merges all the data from all the key	• Improved project management information system for the Ministry of Employment and conducted studies to inform labour market policies. • Studies on the impact of COVID-19 on employment and SMEs. Dissemination of reports and policy briefs, influencing government strategies. • Training to 6 senior managers from MoL on M&E of employment policies (ILO/ITC) • Supported the Ministry of Economy and Finance with a guide for estimating the employment impact of public investment projects. • Organized seminars and workshops to strengthen the competence of labour inspectors and enhance the relationship between Public Employment Services and Labour Inspection Services. • Impact evaluations of the Karama and Civil Service Contract (CSC) employment programmes conducted. • Support has been provided to the Ministry of Vocational Training and Employment (MEFP) in upgrading the "IDEMA" system in order to strengthen planning and governance of international cooperation projects. • Organizational support provided to MEFP.

updated LFS and E&W Establishment survey questionnaires, methodologies, and sampling designs. • Digitalization of the Establishment Survey questionnaire to improve data collection efficiency. • Partnership with MPED to update the Social Accounting Matrix and conduct a study on total factor productivity. • Strengthening the labour component of a CGE model to analyse growth, employment, and inequality. • Studies on the impact of COVID-19 on employment and SMEs. Dissemination of reports and policy briefs, influencing government strategies. • A workshop on Strengthening the technical capacity of the Ministry of Planning and Economic Development (MPED) in Egypt in using Computable General Equilibrium (CGE) modelling techniques was jointly organized by the ILO and UN ESCWA to help MPED's officials from relevant technical units to familiarize and strengthen their capacity to utilize such tool for the formulation of sustainable policies. • Partnership with the national statistical office (CAPMAS), providing technical support to improve the quality and the	survey instruments (households, enterprises in both formal and informal economy) and links them to the national accounts (GDP). The SAE represents an important policy tool to better understand growth and jobs dynamics in the country. • Conducted a mid-term evaluation of the National Employment Strategy (NES) 2015-2025, highlighting the need for a new employment policy (2025-2035) that is more inclusive, resilient, gender-sensitive, and sustainable. • Initiated tripartite consultations for the new employment policy strategy. • Collaborated with UN Women to study and map the characteristics of women's employment in Morocco, identifying factors that hinder their labour market participation and proposing recommendations for improvement. • Conducted studies on new forms of work, such as part-time and platform work, revealing decent work deficits and potential job opportunities for women. • Developed a Labour Market Information System (LMIS) to provide better tools for labour market analysis. • Support to MIEPEEC in digitalizing processes and procedures	• With MoL launched the Green Jobs Assessment Model (GJAM) • With ONEQ contributed to review decree #2019-542 establishing the National Employment Fund, the modalities of its benefits and the development of an M&E and decision making platform for the MoL. • In cost sharing with ILO Geneva, the project has supported the development of a review of public spending on employment in Tunisia, the aim of which is to analyze spending on employment and determine the coherence between this spending and employment objectives/challenges in Tunisia. • Support to MoL to develop the skills of managers in policy monitoring and evaluation. • The project supported the updating of ALMPs following the impact evaluations. • The work undertaken in collaboration with the Ministry of Employment (MEPF) and the Ministry of Social Affairs has enabled the establishment of a framework agreement for the exchange of statistical data. Moreover, this agreement has been extended to include other institutions such as the Ministry of Finance and the Ministry of Education, thus facilitating better access to administrative and statistical data, and a

	relevance of labour market statistics in line with international standards. • The project supported the review and update of the two main annual surveys of the labour market: the Labour Force Survey (LFS) and the Employment, Wage and Hours of Work Establishment Survey (E&W). • Conducted the Egypt Labour Market Panel Survey (ELMPS) 2023, which provides valuable data for policy recommendations and understanding economic vulnerabilities, particularly among women. • Supported the Ministry of Planning and Economic Development (MPED) with the ILO Green Jobs Assessment Model (GJAM) to inform future green policies. • Support to MoL in the formulation of the National Employment Strategy (NES) • Training provided to Unions to engage in NES formulation. • Agreement with the Economic Research Forum (ERF) to provide technical and financial support to the CAPMAS for the development of the 2023 Egypt Labour Market Panel Survey (ELMPS 2023). Findings to be published on Q2 2024. • Launched the Green Jobs Assessment Model	• In collaboration with MoL, elaboration of a guide on collective bargaining for social partners • Support to MoL on the formulation of a new employment and entrepreneurship policy by 2035 (PN2E 35) • Supported the HCP in launching the ILO Green Jobs Assessment Model (GJAM) to inform future green policies. • Workshop with MoL on PN2E 35 flagship programmes. • In collaboration with ILO migration projects, capacity building of HCP managers on labour statistics.	better understanding of the labour market

	• CAPMAS participation in the 21st International Conference of Labour Statisticians. • Continued to provide technical assistance to CAPMAS on skills data using existing surveys. • Liaising with MoF for the publishing of "Government spending on education and skills, and the educational requirements of the labour market in Egypt Policy Note". Pending publication. • Baseline and data collection for the GJAM model.		
Second area of impact: Practical application of **ILS** and other information to improve the quality of jobs available (**Outcome 2**)	• ADWA conducted training workshops to enhance the knowledge of 141 judges from various courts on ILS and the application of labour legislation. • Plans were discussed to institutionalize ILS content in the National Center for Judicial Studies' (NCJS) training programs. • Prepared proposals for establishing regular briefing sessions with the Parliament on ILS and the International Labour Conference. • Concept note for a diagnostic study on ILS in Egypt to guide the work of the **MoM** and the ILO in the following years.	• Advocated for and supported the registration of three important ILO conventions: C.97 on Migration for Employment, C.102 on Social Security, and C.187 on OSH by Morocco during the 2019 International Labour Conference. • Supported the training of senior staff from the High Commission on Planning (HCP) on the decent work agenda and the Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs). • A programme on the reporting of the ILS implementation was prepared to support the tripartite commission on ILS. • With CGEM, developed training materials on International Labour Standards (ILS) for Moroccan enterprises to adapt to the COVID-19 pandemic, benefiting 17	• Prepared a partnership agreement with the Ministry of Justice and the Higher Institute of Judges to institutionalize ILS in Tunisian jurisprudence. • In collaboration with MoSA, UGTT and UTICA, the project carried out a diagnostic study on the application of ILS as well as a study on the opportunities for ratifying new conventions. • Signed an agreement with the Higher Institute of the Judiciary to integrate ILS into judicial training, aimed at improving ILS use in national jurisprudence. • Organized webinars to disseminate diagnostic studies on ILS application and the opportunities for new ratifications,

	• Institutionalization of ILS training in the National Centre for Judicial Studies curriculum. • With NCJS training on Gender in Labour Law for 38 judges were conducted. • 273 Judges were trained on ILS national legislation and application. • Briefing session on ILS with 19 parliament members and 6 officials from MoM and MoPA • Facilitated a diagnostic study on the application of International Labour Standards (ILS) to guide the Ministry of Manpower (MOM) in developing an action plan on ILS, focusing on encouraging women's participation in the labour market. • Conducted workshops for 138 labour specialized judges, enhancing their knowledge on women's rights at work and the application of ILS in judicial decisions. • Awareness rising of Parliamentarians on International Labour Standards with a special focus on gender issues and increased women parliamentarians' participation to such awareness raising activities. In total, 51 members of the Egyptian Parliament as well as 8 Government representatives from the Ministry of Manpower and Ministry of	participants by the end of 2020. Institutionalized by Academie de Formation • Study on gaps for the ratification of ILO C.190 C.189, C.175 • Training workshops with MoL on ILS reporting. • Finalization of the C.189 gap analysis study.	promoting the ratification of new conventions like Convention No. 190. • Training workshop for 23 labour judges (80% of the total) on ILS • Developed and disseminated a diagnostic study on the ratification and implementation of ILS, leading to the ratification of the Promotional Framework for Occupational Safety and Health Convention, 2006 (No. 187). • Trained 24 labour judges on the role of ILO and ILS, resulting in increased knowledge and intention to apply ILS in judicial decisions. • Lobbying activities for the ratification of C.160, C. 129 and C. 155 • A capacity building workshop on the methodology to be adopted in the preparation of national reports on the application of International Labour Standards was organized with a view to strengthening the knowledge and improving the capacities of the participants (Government and social partners) in the elaboration and monitoring of the ILS through the reporting. • A guide on the application of International Labour Standards into the national Jurisprudence has been developed in consultation with the

	Parliamentary Affairs have attended two Briefing sessions on ILS.	Ministry of Justice and the Institut Supérieur de la Magistrature (ISM).
	• Primary Courts judges enhanced their knowledge on women rights at work through the organization of four rounds of Gender in Labour Law workshops that were attended by 138 labour specialized judges.	• Two workshops on the application of the ILS with a focus on the gender have been organised in collaboration with the Institut Supérieur de Magistrature (ISM) to improve the knowledge of the judges on ILS and their application in the national jurisprudence. 50 Tunisian judges attended the workshops, including 26 women. In addition, an online legal training on ILS has been provided to 50 Tunisian judges including 18 women with the support of the ITCILO.
	• In collaboration with the Minster of Justice and the National Council for Judicial Studies, International Labour Standards were included for the second year in a row in the basic training curriculum for the newly appointed 360 junior judges.	• Institutionalization - TOT of ILS training for newly recruited judges with ISM.
	• In 2023, for the 3rd year in a row, a content on ILS and its applications in national legislations was included in the basic training for newly hired judges. This training has reached 450 judges trained in August and September 2023. In addition, 65 newly recruited women judges were trained in March 2023. Moreover, the project provided training to 138 newly labour specialised judges in Primary Courts as well as providing advanced training on labour law for the women specialised judges within May and June 2023.	• Online course available for ISM • Two workshops on International Labour Standards were organized for 65 counsellors of the employers' organisation, UTICA, with a view to enhancing their knowledge on the ILS ratified by Tunisia, as well as on their application in judicial decisions,
	• The project supported the development, finalization and dissemination of the bench book on ILS, labour legislation and	• The project supported the development, finalization and dissemination of the bench book on ILS, labour legislation and national jurisprudence in collaboration with the Ministry of Justice and the Institut Supérieur de la Magistrature (ISM)

	national jurisprudence in collaboration with the Ministry of Justice and the National Center of Judicial Studies (NCJS) • Gap analysis for the ratification of Convention 155 and 187 (OSH) and Convention 122 (Employment Policy) • Capacity building of women judges (9) • Support to two pilot legal offices for workers and employers. • Capacity building on ILS to senior judges of the Court of Appeal and Cassation • In partnership with the NCJS and ILO/ITC, development of an online e-campus platform to ensure the sustainability of the ILS training.		• Capacity building of judges and labour inspectors with a focus on C.156 (workers with family responsibilities), C.183 (maternity protection), C.189 (domestic work), and c.190 on violence and harassment. • Training course on ILS • Seminar on the impact of ILS on professional relations.
Third area of impact: engaging the **private sector** in advancing the decent work agenda and green economy (**Outcome 3**)	• ADWA completed studies on Ericsson's supplier network and the telecommunication sector's supply chain to promote decent working conditions. • The project trained 23 participants from five companies in the telecom sector, within Ericsson network of suppliers, on OSH, management systems, workplace cooperation, and adequate earning. Follow-up visits showed tangible improvements in workplace communication, salary review systems, and OSH enhancements.	• The projects conducted a training of 50 trainers based on the Get Ahead ILO tool training and coaching in gender-sensitive entrepreneurship for women and men with very low levels of education. • The projects in collaboration with the ILO's PAGE programme and ILO Wafira project, carried out a study in a pilot region on value chains with high potential for the creation of income-generating activities or very small enterprises run by women in 2 localities. • The project kept on promoting female entrepreneurship through the support to	• The projects organised a training session for GERME trainers targeting the Ministry of Industry and civil society incubators. The projects trained 18 people on the ILO GERME methodology aiming to promote the creation of micro and small business run by women. 100 women received capacity building.

	• Promoted sustainable and responsible business practices through workshops and presentations of the ILO MNE Declaration, leading to a Roadmap for Responsible Business Conduct. • Roadmap endorsed by tripartite constituents in December 2023. • ILO conducted Rapid Situational Analysis (RSA) for Just Transition with a focus on Women Entrepreneurship Development tool. The report presents a policy-oriented conclusion of high potential entry points for supporting a just transition in selected key sectors of the economy. • The project conducted workshop on just transition policies (23 participants from tripartite institutions) in the context of the MNE Declaration implementation plan	the creation of very small businesses in 5 localities. • Study on potential value chains to create green business by women in 2 other localities. • Support to ADS on women entrepreneurship • Project bank with 30 green projects that can be launched by women in 2 localities. • Training workshops for 500 women in the ILO tool "GetAhead" for the creation of small business.	

REGIONAL COMPONENT

- ADWA established the foundation for a partnership with the Economic Research Forum (ERF), a prominent economics think-tank in the region. This partnership aims to boost research and policy discussions on jobs and growth, ensuring sustainability and scale for these objectives.

- Conceptualized a regional network of experts on labor market and economic growth in North Africa. The project prepared a concept note and initiated discussions for collaboration with ERF to establish this network. The network is intended to facilitate regional conferences and produce regional reports on jobs and growth.

- In 2020, due to COVID-19, the annual regional conference on jobs and growth was converted into a four-day webinar planned for Q1 2021. Preparations were ongoing, and draft chapters of the 2020 Jobs and Growth report were ready.

- Conducted a series of rapid labour market surveys in Egypt, Tunisia, and Morocco to assess the socio-economic impact of COVID-19. Highlight reports were produced after each wave.

- In 2021, finalization and dissemination of the First Regional Report on Jobs and Growth in North Africa.

- Due to the COVID-19 related challenges, the first annual regional conference on jobs and growth was switched to a regional "four days" webinar series.

- In response to the COVID-19 pandemic, and in collaboration with the ERF, the project conducted a series of short panel rapid labour force phone surveys in Egypt, Tunisia and Morocco to monitor and assess the impact of the crisis on households and firms (COVID-19 Monitor), from a socio-economic perspective.

- Produced and shared multiple research papers and policy briefs on COVID-19 impacts. Coordinated efforts with other UN agencies for broader dissemination and knowledge sharing.

- COVID 19 MENA Monitor: Conducted rapid labour force phone surveys in Egypt, Tunisia, and Morocco to assess the impact of COVID-19 on households and firms. Published country-specific highlight reports and developed thematic research papers and policy briefs.

- Finalized and disseminated the Second Regional Report on Jobs and Growth in North Africa (2018-2021), examining the impact of COVID-19 on labour market dynamics.

Annex 2 Terms of Reference of the evaluation

Terms of Reference

Independent Final Cluster Evaluation of the projects "Advancing the Decent Work Agenda in North Africa" ADWA' (Phase I) and "Advancing the Decent Work Agenda in North Africa and the Levant" ADWA' Phase II

ILO Project Codes	RAF/18/50/SWE and GLO/21/61/SWE
Project Countries	Sub-Regional- Egypt, Tunisia, Morocco
Administrative Unit in charge of the Project	DWT/CO-Cairo
Technical Backstopping Unit	DWT/CO-Cairo
Type of Evaluation	Independent Final Cluster Evaluation
Projects Period	Phase I: 6 years (November 2018 - September 2024) Phase II: 2 years and 9 months (January 2022 - September 2024)
Total Project Budget	Phase I: $ 5,524,938.04 / 55 million SEK Phase II: $ 2,683,930.06 / 25 million SEK
Funding Agency	Sweden, Swedish International Development Cooperation Agency (Sida)
Evaluation Manager	Pacome DESSERO

1. __Introduction:__

The projects "Advancing the Decent Work Agenda in North Africa" ADWA' (Phase I) and "Advancing the Decent Work Agenda in North Africa and the Levant" ADWA' Phase II are a partnership between the Government of Sweden - through the Swedish International Development Agency (Sida) - and the International Labour Organization (ILO) to advance the Decent Work Agenda in North Africa. ADWA' Phase I is a six-year project (2018-2024) and Phase II is a three-years project (2022-2024), which take an innovative approach to promote evidence-based policies for full employment and effective access to International Labour Standards (ILS), including at the workplace level. The ADWA' project Phase I builds on the successful pilot phase which ran from August 2017 to November 2018. The pilot phase was subject to an internal evaluation concluded in 2019. The ADWA' project Phase II had an induction phase which ran from January 2022 to September 2022.

The projects are intervening both at regional and at national levels. The country focus is on Egypt, Morocco and Tunisia, with some specific activities carried out in Algeria, Jordan and Lebanon. The activities carried out in Algeria (ILO SCORE programme) in the context of a PPP signed between the ILO and Volvo in 2019 (ran out in 2022 and not extended), have been discontinued since 2022 in line with the recommendations of the mid-term evaluation. Similarly, the activities carried out in Egypt in the context of a MoU signed between the ILO and Ericsson also ran out in 2022 and have not been extended in line with the recommendations of the mid-term evaluation. In Lebanon (an initially proposed new target country), the inception phase was used to conduct an in-depth assessment of the renewable energy sector that was meant to inform the ILO's intervention strategy under ADWA II, which led to the discontinuation of project's interventions in the country. In Jordan, the activities have been discontinued due to the fact that the funding proposed in the PRODOC to Sida was double of what was ultimately received from Sida due to allocation changes on their side linked to the war in Ukraine.

In line with the donor agreement and ILO's evaluation policy, these projects are subject to an independent final cluster evaluation on the sixth and third year respectively of project implementation.

The evaluation will be conducted as an independent evaluation managed by an ILO/EVAL certified official as an evaluation manager, with final approval by EVAL, and conducted by an external evaluation team to be, selected through a competitive process. Key stakeholders, relevant ILO constituents, partners and the donor will be consulted through the evaluation process.

2. __Description of the Project Strategy:__

A key specificity of the projects is the work at upstream and policy-making level to support evidence-based decisions on different dimensions of the Decent Work Agenda. The focus of the projects, and their main value added, is to address together issues related to job rich growth and the implementation of ILS: two fundamental aspects for the

development of the region and essential to advance towards the realization of the Sustainable Development Goals.

The demand from national stakeholders for technical assistance and development cooperation, gaps in international funding, and the prominence given to Decent Work and employment in national development frameworks have been particularly considered in the development of the projects' strategy.

The projects' interventions are designed strategically to address two main points: a) Providing more jobs, and b) Making sure those jobs are better jobs:

1. **More jobs:**

From an economic perspective, the policy agenda in North Africa focuses largely on maintaining macroeconomic stability, as well as on improving the business environment. Ministries in charge of the economy and public finances have set up, with the support of the World Bank and the International Monetary Fund, solid intelligence systems to preserve macroeconomic balances. Cutting red tape and making easier for businesses to operate has also focused much government work. But these economic recipes on their own have proven short in delivering job-rich growth; in promoting the sustainable sort of growth that makes good use of a country's assets – starting with its workforce. Public action in North Africa needs, therefore, to pursue much more proactively a job-rich growth agenda. This is the work of the projects under Outcome 1 which is being implemented in Egypt, Tunisia and Morocco.

2. **Better Jobs:**

The decent work challenge is not going to be met with success only on the economic front. Workers and employers are right holders, and a job is not merely an economic function, but a place in society and a large part of an individual's ambitions and hopes. In reference ILS, while the North African countries have a good record of ratification of key ILO conventions, the de facto application of ILS remains a patchy picture. The projects are designed to work along four complementary streams to further promote the effective application of ILS that are intrinsic to the promotion of the Decent Work Agenda. Those streams include collaboration with National Parliaments to promote and facilitate ILS ratifications, expert-review of national laws alignment with ILS, working on national jurisprudence and provide guidance for it to refer directly to relevant ILS. Finally, to engage with the "fourth power" to enhance the understanding of ILS among the media and key civil society organisations and enrich the public discourse in these areas. This is the work of the projects under Outcome 2 which is being implemented in Egypt, Tunisia and Morocco.

3. **Partnering with the Private Sector:**

Under the "Advancing the Decent Work Agenda in North Africa" ADWA' Project (Phase I), the project partnered with Swedish enterprises to illustrate that improved adherence to ILS and improved working conditions can promote private sector profitability and could influence economic policy development. However, as explained above, the activities

carried out under this outcome in both Algeria (PPP signed between the ILO and Volvo in 2019) and in Egypt (MoU signed between the ILO and Ericsson) ran out in 2022 and have not been extended in line with the recommendations of the mid-term evaluation.

Under "Advancing the Decent Work Agenda in North Africa and the Levant" ADWA' Phase II, considering the persistent economic gender gap and the low female labour force participation in North Africa, the project has developed the Outcome 3 introducing the new thematic areas of gender and climate change towards an environmentally sustainable economy characterised by decent and green jobs available to women and men on an equal basis. The aim of this outcome is to improve the contribution of the private sector, and particularly women entrepreneurs, to a just transition and green economy in the three targeted countries.

Project Outcomes:

The projects have three main outcomes as described above. Corresponding outputs and activities have been developed under each Outcome and were contextualized at country level.

ADWA' Project - Phase I
Outcome 1: Improved Data Collection, Data Analysis, and Data Use for Economic Policy Reforms to Steer Towards Job-rich Growth in Target North African Countries
Outcome 2: Improved Ratification, Reflection in National Jurisprudence, Enforcement and Knowledge of ILSs in Target North African Countries
Outcome 3: Enhanced Engagement of the Private Sector to Achieve Decent Work in Telecomm and Automotive Sectors in Target North African Countries

ADWA' Project – Phase II
Outcome 1: Increased adoption of economic policies and reforms promoting the growth of green and inclusive jobs in partner countries.
Outcome 2: Improved ratification, reflection in national jurisprudence and increased knowledge of gender-related ILS in partner countries
Outcome 3: Improved contribution of the private sector to a just transition and green economy, especially from women entrepreneurs.

3. <u>Project Management Arrangements</u>

The projects are managed by an internationally recruited Chief Technical Adviser. Given the technical breadth of the projects, a multi-disciplinary team of high-level national experts is working under her lead. The team's main location is in Cairo. The work in Tunisia and Morocco requires presence at the national officer level.

The following table presents the functional and geographic distribution of the team:

Position	Location
Chief Technical Advisor	Cairo
Programme Officer	
National officer - Employment – not filled	
National officer - ILS – not filled	
Sr Finance & Administrative Assistant	
Finance & Administrative Assistant	
National Project Coordinator	Tunis
Finance & Administrative Assistant	
National Project Coordinator	Rabat
Finance & Administrative Assistant	

As per the PRODOC, the projects hold joint annual review meetings with Sida for Technical Progress Report review.

4. Project Key Results achieved by December 2023 – As Reported By The Project:

Advancing the Decent Work Agenda in North Africa" ADWA' Phase I

Outcome 1
- A network of experts established on the complex relationship between employment creation and economic growth, to better inform policymakers and influence the policy debate in North Africa.
- The first annual report was disseminated in July 2021 and the second annual report in October 2022.
- In Egypt, within the framework of the National Strategy for the Development of Statistics (NSDS), the project has worked towards supporting quality data collection for evidence-based policymaking establishing a close partnership with the ERF.

Outcome 2:
- Promotional Framework for Occupational Safety and Health Convention, 2006 (No. 187) ratified in 2021, in Tunisia.
- The bench book on ILS, labour legislation and national jurisprudence developed and disseminated in Egypt and Tunisia.

"Advancing the Decent Work Agenda in North Africa and the Levant" ADWA' Phase II

Outcome 1:
- A National Employment Policy (NEP) developed in Egypt.
- A Green Jobs Assessment Model (GJAM) launched in Egypt and Tunisia. In Morocco,
- A new employment and entrepreneurship policy by 2035 (PN2E 35) formulated and presented a draft PN2E 35 during a large tripartite workshop in Morocco.

Outcome 2:
- 64 newly recruited women judges trained on judicial system in Egypt.

Outcome 3:
- The ILO Rapid Situational Analysis for Just Transition tool conducted in Egypt.
- 50 trainers trained on the ILO tool in Morocco,

5. Evaluation Background:

ILO considers evaluation as an integral part of the implementation of technical cooperation activities towards learning, project management sand accountability for all stakeholders. Provisions are made in all projects in accordance with ILO evaluation policy and based on the nature of the project and the specific requirements agreed upon at the time of the project design and during the project as per established procedures. According to ILO evaluation guidelines, 3rd edition, project with a budget over 5 million USD is subject to independent midterm and final evaluation. The Advancing the Decent Work Agenda in North Africa project (Phase I) has been subject to a Mid-term independent evaluation (MTE) as per ILO evaluation policy and procedures, and this final evaluation will be independent.

The independent final cluster evaluation should therefore build on the results of the MTE. ILO applies the evaluation criteria established by the OECD/DAC Evaluation Quality Standard and the UNEG Code of Conduct for Evaluation in the UN System.

6. Purpose of the Evaluation:

The independent evaluation serves multiple objectives as follows:
i. Assess the relevance and coherence of projects' design regarding countries needs and how the projects are perceived and valued by the target groups.
j. Identify the contributions of the projects to DWCP or similar national frameworks, the SDGs, the countries UNDAF, the ILO P&B objectives and Countries outcomes and their synergy with other projects and programmes.
k. Analyse the implementation strategies of the projects with regard to their effectiveness in achieving the project outcomes and impacts, including unexpected results and factors affecting project implementation (positively and negatively).

l.   Review the institutional set-up, capacity for projects implementation, coordination mechanisms and the use and usefulness of management tools including the project monitoring tools and work plans.

m.   Assess the implementation efficiency of the projects including in light of the recommendations of the mid-term evaluation.

n.   Review the strategies for outcomes' sustainability and orientation to impact.

o.   Identify lessons learned, potential good practices and lessons to be learned for the key stakeholders.

p.   Provide strategic recommendations for the different tripartite constituents, stakeholders, and partners to improve future projects.

7.   <u>Scope of the Evaluation:</u>

The independent cluster evaluation covers the entire life and aspects of the projects until the date of the evaluation start and will covers Egypt, Morocco and Tunisia where the projects are implemented.

For all practical purposes, this ToR and ILO Evaluation policies and guidelines define the overall scope of this evaluation. Recommendations, emerging from the evaluation, should be strongly linked to the findings of the evaluation and should provide clear guidance to stakeholders on how they can address them.

The evaluation will integrate gender equality and non-discrimination as a crosscutting concern throughout its deliverables and process. It should be addressed in line with EVAL guidance note n° 4 and Guidance Note n° 7 to ensure stakeholder participation. Furthermore, it should pay attention to issues related to social dialogue, international labour standards and fair environmental transition.

8.   <u>Evaluation Criteria and Questions:</u>

The evaluation will cover the following evaluation criteria:

a.   Relevance and coherence of the projects (including validity of the projects' design)

b.   Effectiveness of the projects

c.   Efficiency of the projects

d.   Impact and sustainability orientation

e.   Gender as cross-cutting element of the projects

Key Evaluation Questions:

In line with the results-based approach applied by the ILO, the evaluation will focus on identifying and analysing results through addressing key questions related to the evaluation criteria and the achievement of the outcomes/ objectives of the projects. Furthermore, the evaluator will use the indicators in the logical framework of the projects. The evaluator shall examine the following key issues:

Relevance and coherence

- Are the projects relevant to the achievements of the governments' strategy, policy and plan, the DWCPs, SIDA's MENA Regional Strategy priorities as well as other relevant regional and global commitments such as the UNDAFs, SDGs targets and ILOs strategic Objectives (Programme & Budget 2018-19 and 2020-21)?
- Have the projects been relevant to the felt needs of the national stakeholders and final beneficiaries?
- How relevant have the projects been in developing national capacities?
- Have the projects planning included a useful monitoring and evaluation framework with outcomes indicators, baselines and targets?
- To what extent have ADWA' activities able to complement other Project partners' activities, other ILO projects and other activities of the UN or non-UN international development aid organizations at local level in the countries of implementation?

Effectiveness

- To what extent have the projects being able to achieve its results at outcome and output levels, with particular attention to the project objectives?
- How have positive and negative factors outside of the control of the projects affected results and how have the projects dealt with these external factors?
- What, if any, unintended results of the projects have been identified or perceived?
- What have been the main contributing and challenging factors towards projects' success in attaining its targets?
- How well are projects partners (in particular Government, Parliament and Judiciary partners) able to fulfil the roles expected in the project's strategy?

Efficiency

- Have the financial and human resources being used efficiently in the target countries to achieve outputs?
- Have there been resources leveraged (monetary or in-kind) by projects partners (e.g., by collaborating with other ILO initiatives and other projects; as well as through National-level stakeholders) to support the implementation of activities?
- To what extent have the disbursements and projects expenditures been in line with expected budgetary plans? Why?
- Has the management and governance arrangement of the projects facilitated project results? Is there a clear understanding of roles and responsibilities by all parties involved into implementation and monitoring?
- Is the monitoring & evaluation system in place relevant, including collecting and using data disaggregated by sex (and by other relevant characteristics, such as people with disabilities and other disadvantaged groups the project might have identified)?
- Have the projects created good relationship and cooperation with relevant national and regional stakeholders for implementation purposes?
- Have the projects received adequate administrative, technical and - if needed - policy support from the ILO office and specialists in the field (DWT/CO Cairo and CO Algiers) and other ILO offices as relevant?

Sustainability and Impact
- Has national ownership been promoted?
- How effective have the projects been at stimulating interest and participation in the projects at national level?
- To what extent are the projects' positive changes likely to continue after its end? What socio, economic and institutional changes are likely to be sustained beyond the projects lifetime?
- What good practices and success factors have partner organizations, ILO personnel and partners identified to promote sustainability?
- How effective/relevant is the sustainability plan of the projects?
- To what extent the recommendations of the mid-term evaluation have been integrated in the projects' implementation strategy?

Cross-cutting: Gender

• How effective were the projects at including gender mainstreaming? How effective were the strategies to promote equal participation of women and men?

• Were there sufficient and appropriate gender-sensitive monitoring structures in place to help assess the outcomes and impact of the projects?

- Has the project considered tripartism, social dialogue, international labour standards and a fair transition to environmental sustainability in its design and implementation?

9. **Methodology:**

The evaluation should be carried out in adherence with the relevant parts of the ILO Evaluation Framework and Strategy; ILO Policy Guidelines for Evaluation: Principles, Rationale, Planning and Managing for Evaluations.

The evaluation will be conducted by an international consultant virtually (home-based) with support of three national consultants based in Cairo, Rabat and Tunis respectively. The methodology will comprise of the following elements:

a. **Inception Phase**

The Evaluation team will review the projects documents, work plans, projects monitoring plans, progress reports, documents on the projects from the ILO and donor, government documents, meeting minutes, policy frameworks and other relevant documents that were produced through the projects or by relevant stakeholders. In addition, the Evaluator will conduct initial electronic or telephone interviews with the evaluation manger first and then with the projects' coordination team and with the donor to understand expectations.

The inception report should follow the corresponding EVAL checklist (see Annex 1).

Upon approval by the evaluation manager of the Inception report, the evaluation team will move to the next phase.

b. **Data Collection Phase**

The evaluation data collection methodology will combine remote/virtual (evaluation team leader) and field work data collection (evaluation team members). This will require enhanced engagement and collaboration with the projects team in terms of organizing the contact with stakeholders.

The Evaluators will undertake group and/or individual discussions. The projects will provide all its support in organization of these virtual interviews to the best extent possible. The evaluators will ensure that opinions and perceptions of women are equally reflected in the interviews and that gender-specific questions are included.

The evaluation team is encouraged to propose alternative mechanism or techniques for the data collection phase. These will be discussed with the projects and the evaluation manager at the Inception phase. Any alternative should be reflected in the Inception report.

It is suggested that the evaluation team develops an initial survey questionnaire as part of the initial data collection to guide the interviews (including ensure consistency in interviews across the project outcomes in the four target countries). This will help the evaluator to identify knowledge gaps that need to be verified and validated through interviews.

Interviews with ILO Staff
A first meeting will be held with the ILO Cairo and Algiers CO Directors and the projects Team. The evaluation team will undertake group and/or individual discussions with projects staff. The evaluator will also interview projects staff of other ILO projects, and ILO staff responsible for financial, administrative, and technical backstopping of the projects. An indicative list of persons to be interviewed will be prepared by the CTA in consultation with the Evaluation Manager.

Interviews with key stakeholders in project locations
The evaluation team will meet relevant stakeholders. A list of beneficiaries will be provided by the projects for selection of appropriate sample respondents by the evaluators. The evaluator will select the field visit locations, based on criteria defined by her/him. The criteria and locations of data collection should be reflected in the inception report mentioned above.

Stakeholders' workshop for presenting preliminary results
At the end of the data collection, the evaluation team leader will organize, with logistic support from the project, a stakeholders' virtual workshop to present the preliminary findings of the evaluation to key stakeholders including the donor (interpretation to Arabic will be provided)

c. **Report Writing Phase**

Based on the inputs from discussions and interviews with key stakeholders, the evaluators will draft the evaluation report. The draft report will be sent to the Evaluation Manager, who after a methodological review, will share the updated draft report with key stakeholders for their inputs/comments. The Evaluation Manager will consolidate all comments and will then share them with the Evaluator for consideration in finalizing the report.

10. <u>Evaluator's Deliverables:</u>

1. Inception report (with detailed work plan and data collection instruments – see Annex)

The inception report should, following EVAL Checklist 4.8, detail the Evaluators' understanding of what is being evaluated and why, showing how each evaluation question will be answered by way of: proposed methods; proposed sources of data; and data collection procedures. The inception report should also include an evaluation matrix, proposed schedule of tasks, activities and deliverables. The evaluation methodology should include a description of an analytical approach to assessing the projects across the three outcomes and target countries.

2. A concise draft and final Evaluation Reports (maximum 30 pages plus annexes and following EVAL Checklists 4.2 and 6 - see Annex 2 as per the following proposed structure:

   - Cover page with key projects and evaluation data (using ILO EVAL template)
   - Executive Summary
   - Acronyms
   - Description of the projects
   - Purpose, scope and clients of the evaluation
   - Methodology and limitations
   - Clearly identified findings for each criterion
   - Conclusions
   - Recommendations
   - Lessons learned and good practices (briefly in the main report and a detailed in ILO EVAL template, annexed to the report)
   - Annexes:
     - TOR
     - Evaluation questions matrix
     - Data Table on Projects Progress in achieving its targets by indicators with comments
     - Evaluation schedule
     - Documents reviewed
     - List of people interviewed
     - Lessons learned and good practices (using ILO-EVAL template)
     - Any other relevant documents

3. Evaluation Summary using the ILO template.

All draft and final outputs, including supporting documents, analytical reports and raw data should be provided to the evaluation manager in electronic version compatible with Word for Windows.

11. <u>Work Plan and Time Frame:</u>

Phase	Task	Responsible Person	Timing	Days Proposed	Team member	Team member B	Team member C

			Team leader	**A**		
i.	Preparation of ToR	Evaluation Manager	December 2023-January 2024	0	0	0	0
ii.	Recruitment of independent evaluators and contract sign	Evaluation Manager	February 24	0	0	0	0
iii.	Inception report writing and approval	Evaluators	25 February -8 March	7 days	3 days	3 days	3 days
iv.	Field data collection activities and stakeholder's workshop.	Evaluators	18 March-8 April	15 days	15 days	15 days	15 days
v.	Draft evaluation report writing	Evaluators	9-22 April	7 days	4 days	4 days	4 days
vi.	Circulate the draft evaluation report to project stakeholders and consolidate comments of stakeholders	Evaluation Manager	23 April-21 May	0	0	0	0
vii.	Finalize report including explanations on comments not included	Evaluators	22 May	1 day	1 day	1 day	1 day
viii.	Approval of report by EVAL	EVAL	23 - 31 May	-	-	-	-
Total				30	23	23	23

12. <u>Management Arrangements and Evaluation Team Responsibilities.</u>

Evaluation team leader responsibilities
a. Desk review of programme documents
b. Briefing with ILO/ Evaluation Manager

c. Preliminary interviews with the project manager and the donor
d. Development of the Inception report including the evaluation instrument
e. Undertake interviews with stakeholders (skype, telephone, or similar means)
f. Facilitate the virtual stakeholders' workshop
g. Draft evaluation report
h. Finalise evaluation report

Evaluation team member responsibilities

a. Support the desk review of programme documents
b. Undertake interviews with stakeholders (skype, telephone, or similar means)
c. Field visits
d. Support the facilitate the virtual stakeholders' workshop
e. Provide inputs in the draft and final evaluation report versions

The evaluator will report to the evaluation manager and should discuss any technical and methodological matters with the evaluation manager, should issues arise.

For this independent final cluster evaluation, the final report and submission procedure will be as follows:

a. The Evaluation team leader will submit a draft evaluation report to the Evaluation Manager;
b. After reviewing compliance with the TORs and accuracy, the Evaluation Manager will share it with all stakeholders (national stakeholders, ILO, donor, etc.) for comments and factual check;
c. The Evaluation Manager will consolidate the comments and send these to the Evaluation Consultant;
d. The Evaluation team will finalize the report, incorporating any comments deemed appropriate and providing a brief note explaining why any comments might not have been incorporated. He/she will submit the final report to the Evaluation Manager;
e. The Evaluation Manager will forward the report to EVAL for review and approval. Feedback from EVAL on corrections required before approval could take place.
f. Once approved, EVAL publishes the report in i-eval Discovery and informs the ILO responsible official for the submission of the approved report to the national stakeholders and the donor.

13. Required Resources for this Independent Final Cluster Evaluation:

The following resources are required:

a. Consultant fees for 30 workdays for International Team leader

b. Consultant fees for 23 days each for national consultants based in Cairo, Rabat and Tunis respectively
c. Fly ticket for team leader (if any)
d. DSA payment and transport for travel to selected project sites will be based on ILO Rules and Regulations
e. Stakeholders' workshop logistics, including interpretation

Profile of Evaluation team
The Evaluators should have the following qualifications:

Team Leader
- Advanced university degree in social sciences or related graduate qualifications.
- A minimum of 7 years of professional experience in evaluating social development projects initiatives including the gender dimension; including role of sole evaluator or team leader experience in the area of decent work (e.g., legislation and policies) will be an added advantage.
- Proven experience with logical framework and theory of changes approaches and other strategic planning approaches, M&E methods, and approaches (including quantitative, qualitative, and participatory), information analysis and report writing.
- Fluency in written and spoken English and French is required. Arabic will be an asset.
- Experience in facilitation of multi-stakeholders' workshops
- Knowledge of the UN System in general and ILO's roles and mandate and its tripartite structure in particular (experience is an asset).
- Understanding of the development context of the Project countries is an advantage.
- Excellent consultative, communication and interview skills.
- Demonstrated ability to deliver quality results within strict deadlines.

Team Members (national consultants – Cairo, Rabat and Tunis based)

- University degree in social sciences or related graduate qualifications.
- A minimum of 5 years of professional experience in evaluating social development projects initiatives or related social research including gender dimension; as team member (i.e., data collection and analysis, on the area of decent work will be an added advantage.
- Proven experience with logical framework and theory of change approaches and other strategic planning approaches, M&E methods, and approaches (including quantitative, qualitative, and participatory), information analysis and report writing.
- Fluency in written and spoken Arabic (and or French for Morocco and Tunisia) and good knowledge of English required.

- Knowledge of the UN System in general and ILO's roles and mandate and its tripartite structure (experience is an asset).
- Understanding of the development context of the Project Country is an advantage.
- Excellent communication and interview skills.
- Demonstrated ability to deliver quality results within strict deadlines.
- Based in Cairo, Rabat and Tunis respectively and holding the nationality of each country.

ANNEX 1: All relevant ILO evaluation guidelines and standard templates

ANNEX1-RELEVANTILOEVALUATIONGUIDELINES AND STANDARD TEMPLATES

Website EVAL portal on managing and conducting evaluation (all guidance notes, checklist, templates, etc.) -en Anglais
https://www.ilo.org/wcmsp5/groups/public/---ed_mas/-eval/documents/publication/wcms_853289.pdf
Specially:
- The ILO Policy Guidelines for evaluation: Principles, rationale, planning and managing for evaluations, 4th ed.
In sections 3 and 4:
- Template 3.1 Code of conduct form (To be signed by the evaluators)
- Guidance note 3.1. on integrating gender equality in the monitoring and evaluation of projects
-Guidance note 3.2. on adapting evaluation methods to the ILO's normative and tripartite mandate
- 4.4. Guidance notes on stakeholders' engagement in the ILO evaluation
-Checklists:

     4.1 Preparing the evaluation report.

     4.2 Filing in the evaluation title page

     4.3 Writing the evaluation report summary.

     4.4 Documents for project evaluators

     4.6 Writing the inception report.

     4.7 Rating the quality of evaluation reports.

- Templates

     4.1 Lessons learned.

     4.2 Good practices

     4.3 Evaluation summary (internal evaluator template to be provided by the evaluation manager)

     4.4 Evaluation title page (internal evaluator template to be provided by the evaluation manager)

UNEG Ethical Guidelines for Evaluation
http://www.unevaluation.org/document/download/548

Annex 3 Evaluation Matrix

Evaluation Criteria and Questions	Indicators	Data Sources	Data Collection Methods	Key informants	Analysis and Assessment
Relevance and Coherence					
1. Are the projects relevant to the achievements of the governments' strategy, policy and plan, the DWCPs, SIDA's MENA Regional Strategy priorities as well as other relevant regional and global commitments?	Alignment of project objectives with government strategies, DWCPs, SIDA's MENA priorities, UNDAFs, SDGs, ILOs objectives	Project documents, policy documents, strategy papers	Document analysis, interviews	Project staff, ILO staff, SIDA staff, government officials and constituents	Assess alignment and gaps between project goals and governmental strategies and other policy frameworks
2. Have the projects been relevant to the felt needs of the national stakeholders and final beneficiaries?	Perception of relevance among stakeholders and beneficiaries, satisfaction levels	Project documents, stakeholders feedback	Document analysis, interviews	Project staff, ILO staff, SIDA staff, constituents, other project stakeholders and beneficiaries	Evaluate perceptions of relevance and satisfaction among beneficiaries and stakeholders
3. How relevant have the projects been in developing national capacities?	Capacity building outcomes, capacity building activities conducted, improvement in skills and knowledge	Capacity-building reports, pre- and post-assessment tests	Document analysis, interviews	Project staff, ILO staff, SIDA staff, constituents, other project stakeholders and beneficiaries	Improvements in capacities
4. Have the projects planning included a useful monitoring and evaluation framework with outcomes indicators, baselines and targets?	Existence of M&E framework, clarity and measurability of indicators	Project document, M&E Plan, stakeholders feedback	Document review	Project managers, M&E officers, ILO staff, SIDA staff	Examine the robustness and practical application of the M&E framework
5. To what extent have ADWA's activities been able to complement other project partners' activities?	Level of integration and complementarity with other projects and programs	Reports from other projects, project TPRs, stakeholders feedback	Document analysis, interviews	Project staff, ILO staff, SIDA staff, constituents, project partners, other UN and non-UN organizations	Analyze integration and synergy with other initiatives
Effectiveness					
6. To what extent have the projects been able to achieve its results at outcome and output levels?	Achievement of output and outcome targets, progress against planned milestones	Progress reports, M&E reports, stakeholders feedback	Review of project reports, data analysis	Project staff, ILO staff, SIDA staff, constituents, other project	Assess progress towards achieving set objectives and milestones

				stakeholders and beneficiaries	
7. How have external factors affected results and how have the projects dealt with these factors?	Types of external factors identified; adaptive measures taken	TPRs, other documents, stakeholders feedback	Document analysis, interviews	Project staff, ILO staff, SIDA staff, constituents, other project stakeholders and beneficiaries	Identify external influences and adaptive strategies used
8. What unintended results of the projects have been identified?	Identification of unintended outcomes	Project evaluation reports, stakeholders feedback	Document analysis, interviews	Project staff, ILO staff, SIDA staff, constituents, other project stakeholders and beneficiaries	Investigate any unexpected outcomes or impacts of the project
9. What have been the main contributing and challenging factors towards projects' success in attaining its targets?	Contributing and challenging factors identified, their impact on project success	Project reports, stakeholder feedback	Document analysis, interviews	Project staff, ILO staff, SIDA staff, constituents, other project stakeholders and beneficiaries	Determine key drivers and barriers to success
10. How well are projects partners (in particular Government, Parliament and Judiciary partners) able to fulfil the roles expected in the project's strategy?	Performance of project partners against expected roles, stakeholder satisfaction, project reports, stakeholder feedback	Partner performance reports, stakeholder surveys	Document analysis, interviews	Project staff, ILO staff, SIDA staff, constituents, Government officials, parliament members, judiciary partners	Evaluate effectiveness of partner roles and stakeholder satisfaction
Efficiency					
11. Have the financial and human resources been used efficiently in the target countries to achieve outputs?	Cost per output, resource utilization rates	Financial reports, stakeholder feedback	Data analysis, document review	Project staff, ILO staff, SIDA staff, constituents,	Analyze cost efficiency and resource allocation
12. Have resources been leveraged by project partners to support implementation?	Resources leveraged (monetary, in-kind), collaboration instances	Partnership agreements, financial records	Document review, interviews	Project staff, ILO staff, SIDA staff, Partners, financial officers	Review extent and impact of resource leveraging
13. To what extent have the disbursements and project expenditures been in line with expected budgetary plans? Why?	Adherence to budget, timing of disbursements	Budget reports, financial statements	Document review, financial analysis	Project staff, ILO staff, SIDA staff, Partners, financial officers	Evaluate financial management effectiveness
14. Has the management and governance arrangement of the projects facilitated project results? Is there a clear understanding of roles and responsibilities by all parties involved in implementation and monitoring?	Effectiveness of management structure, clarity of roles and responsibilities	Project reports, staff interviews	Interviews, observation	Project staff, ILO staff, constituents and other project partners	Assess management's role in facilitating outcomes

Question	Indicator	Source	Method	Respondents	Purpose
15. Is the monitoring & evaluation system in place relevant, including collecting and using data disaggregated by sex (and by other relevant characteristics, such as people with disabilities and other disadvantaged groups the project might have identified)?	Relevance and effectiveness of the M&E system, inclusivity in data collection	M&E framework documents, data reports	Document analysis, stakeholder feedback	Project staff, ILO staff, SIDA staff, constituents and other project partners	Review relevance and comprehensiveness of the M&E system
16. Have the projects created good relationship and cooperation with relevant national and regional stakeholders for implementation purposes?	Quality of relationships with stakeholders, level of cooperation	Stakeholder feedback, TPRs	Document analysis, interviews	Project staff, ILO staff, SIDA staff, constituents and other project partners, National and regional stakeholders	Examine strength and quality of stakeholder relationships
17. Have the projects received adequate administrative, technical, and—if needed—policy support from the ILO office and specialists in the field (DWT/CO Cairo and CO Algiers) and other ILO offices as relevant?	Level of support received satisfaction with support	Feedback from project team, COs and other ILO offices/staff	Document analysis, interviews	Project team, ILO officials	Measure adequacy and impact of support from ILO
Sustainability and Impact					
18. Has national ownership been promoted?	Level of local involvement and leadership in project activities	Project reports, stakeholder feedback	Interviews, document analysis	Project staff, ILO staff, SIDA staff, constituents and other project partners	Assess level and impact of local ownership and involvement
19. How effective have the projects been at stimulating interest and participation in the projects at national level?	Participant engagement levels, frequency and quality of interactions	Stakeholder feedback, TPRs	Interviews, observation	Project staff, ILO staff, SIDA staff, constituents and other project partners	Evaluate engagement and active participation levels
20. To what extent are the projects' positive changes likely to continue after its end? What socio-economic and institutional changes are likely to be sustained beyond the project's lifetime?	Sustainability of project outcomes, continuity of socio-economic and institutional changes	Stakeholder feedback, TPRs	Interviews, document review, observation	Project staff, ILO staff, SIDA staff, constituents and other project partners	Predict longevity and permanence of project impacts
21. What good practices and success factors have partner organizations, ILO personnel and partners identified to promote sustainability?	Identified best practices and success factors	Best practice reports, internal reviews	Document analysis, interviews	Project staff, ILO staff, SIDA staff, constituents and other project partners	Highlight and disseminate best practices for sustainability
22. How effective/relevant is the sustainability plan of the projects?	Relevance and effectiveness of sustainability plans	Project documentation, sustainability	Document review, stakeholder feedback	Project staff, ILO staff, SIDA staff, constituents and other project partners	Evaluate the practicality and foresight of the sustainability plan

		assessments or plans			
23. To what extent have the recommendations of the mid-term evaluation been integrated in the projects' implementation strategy?	Integration of evaluation recommendations, changes implemented post-evaluation	Evaluation reports, project updates	Document analysis, interviews	Project staff, ILO staff, SIDA staff	Assess incorporation and impact of evaluation feedback
Cross-cutting: Gender					
24. How effective were the projects at including gender mainstreaming?	Gender inclusion metrics, participation rates by gender	Project data, monitoring reports	Data analysis, gender-focused reviews	Project staff, ILO staff, SIDA staff, constituents and other project partners	Evaluate effectiveness of gender mainstreaming strategies
25. Were there sufficient and appropriate gender-sensitive monitoring structures in place to help assess the outcomes and impact of the projects?	Existence and effectiveness of gender-sensitive monitoring structures, adequacy of gender-disaggregated data	Monitoring frameworks, project reports	Document review, interviews	Project staff, ILO staff, SIDA staff, Monitoring and Evaluation officers, Gender advisors	Assess adequacy of gender-focused monitoring systems
26. Has the project considered tripartism, social dialogue, international labour standards, and a fair transition to environmental sustainability in its design and implementation?	Inclusion of tripartism and social dialogue principles, adherence to international labour standards, incorporation of environmental sustainability measures	Project design documents, stakeholder meeting minutes, sustainability reports	Document analysis, stakeholder interviews	Project staff, ILO staff	Evaluate incorporation of tripartism and dialogue principles

Annex 4 Documents reviewed

- Advancing the Decent Work Agenda in North Africa - ADWA' Project - PROJECT DOCUMENT, July 2020

- ADWA' - Advancing the Decent Work Agenda in North Africa and the Levant - Phase II - - PROJECT DOCUMENT, October 2021

- Advancing the Decent Work Agenda in North Africa Project (ADWA') Project (Phase I) and Advancing the Decent Work Agenda in North Africa and the Levant Project (Phase II)- EXIT STRATEGY. December 2023

- ADWA activities in cost sharing phase I and II

- ADWA Delivery Report Phase I

- ADWA Delivery Report Phase II

- Data Collection Sheets. Performance tracking. December 2021

- ADWA Key Stakeholders survey 2023

- ADWA Key Stakeholders survey 2024

- ADWA Technical Progress Reports 2019, 2020, 2021, 2022, 2023, 2024

- ADWA project mid-term evaluation final report. November 2022

- Decent Work Country Programme (DWCP) for Tunisia 2017-2022. ILO-Republic of Tunisia, 2017

- Strategy for Sweden's regional development cooperation with the Middle East and North Africa 2024–2027. The Swedish International Development Cooperation Agency 2024

- Plan cadre de d'aide au développement de Tunisie 2021-2025. Nations Unies Tunisie, 2021

- United Nations Sustainable Development Cooperation Framework (UNSDCF) 2023-2027. UN Egypt- Ministry of International Cooperation and the United Nations in Egypt.

- Plan Cadre des Nations Unies pour l'aide au Développement au Maroc pour la période 2017-2021. Nations Unies Maroc, 2017.

- National Sustainable Development Strategy "Egypt 2030". Ministry of Planning and Economic Development, 2023

- Nouveau modèle de développement du Maroc. Haut Commissariat au Plan 2021

- ILO Programme and Budget 2018-2019; 2020-2021 ; 2022-2023 ; 2024-2025

Annex 5 List of Stakeholders Interviewed

Egypt

Full Name	Institution	position
Mr. Sherif El-Naggar	Ministry of Justice	Head of specialized courts
Mr. Haytham Hegazy	National Center for Judicial Studies (NCJS)	Head of the NCJS
Mr. Motaz Mostafa	Ministry of Justice	Judge at labour court
Mr. Mohamed Asskr	Ministry of Justice	Judge at labour court
Ms. Hanan Nazir	Ministry of Planning and Economic Development	Director of labour policy unite
Mr. Sayed Torky	Federation of Egyptian Industry	Chairman Advisor
Mr. Ahmad El-Dabaa	Ministry of Parliamentary Affairs	Previous Advisor to the Minister of Parliamentary Affairs
Ms. Radwa Kamouna	General Authority For Investment (GAFI)	Director of international cooperation
Ms. Sally El-Hawary	General Authority For Investment (GAFI)	Researcher at international cooperation unite
Ms. Omnia Abdelhamed	Ministry of Labour (MoL)	Minister Technical Office
Ms. Rasha Baset	Ministry of Labour (MoL)	Head of International cooperation
Mr. Enas Abdallah	Ministry of Finance	
Ms. Sara Mohamed	Ministry of Finance	Researcher
Ms. Laura Dospinescu	Ministry of Telecommunication and Information Technology	Technical Advisor for Dr. Ghada Labib deputy minister
Mr. Mohamed Abdelmonem	General Union of Telecommunication	GUT Chairman
Mr. Wegdan Hussein	Bibliotheca Alexanderia-Solidarity Staff Union	Chairman
Mr. Mohamed Saaid	"We" trade union committee- Telecom Egypt	Deputy chairman
Mr. Aziz Refaat	Ericsson	Health and Safety manager
Ms. Nashwa Samy	Business Egypt -Project	Head of Gender unit
Mr. Marwa Hassan	FEI-Eco	Environment unit manager
Mr. Mostafa Younes	CAPMAS	Researcher at labour force study unit
Mr. Eman Hassan	CAPMAS	Head of labour force study unit

Morocco

Full Name	Institution	Position
Mme Hafida Oubel	Agence de Développement Sociale	Cheffe Département Activités Génératrices de Revenues
Mme Fatima Mourad	Agence de Développement Sociale	Département Activités Génératrices de Revenues
Mme Bahija Nali	Haut Commissariat au Plan	Chef des services des études sur les matrices de comptabilité sociale et les matrices des emplois
M. Hazim Mohamed	MIEPEEC/ Observatoire national du marché du travail (ONMT)	Directeur de l'Observatoire du Marché du travail au ministère de l'Emploi et de l'insertion professionnelle (ONMT)
M.Samir Ajraam	MIEPEEC/ Direction de l'Emploi	Directeur de l'Emploi
M. Fouad Mahdaoui	MIEPEEC/ Direction du Travail	Directeur du Travail
Mme. NADIA SOUBAT	Democratic Confederation of Labor (CDT)	Coordination contact of trade union activities with ADWA and ILO projects
M. Touzani Mohamed	Confédération Générale des Entreprises du Maroc (CGEM)	Coordination contact of EMPLOYERS activities with ADWA and ILO projects

Tunisia

Full Name	Institution	Position
Mme. Hayet Ben Ismail	Ministere des Affaires Sociales	Présidente COPIL ADWA' - Préseidente de la haute Instance du Travail et des relations professionnelles
Mr. Noureddine Triki	Ministere des Affaires Sociales	Directeur Général de l'inspection de travail
Mme. Zohra Abbassi	Ministere des Affaires Sociales	Inspectrice Générale de travail
Mr. Fakher Zaibi	Observatoire Nationale des Emplois et des Qualifications - ONEQ	Directeur Général
Mr. Issam Lahmer	Ministere de la Justice Centre des études juridiques et judiciaires	Juge et président de la cellule de criminologie au CEJJ
Mr. Hichem Boussaid	Agence Nationale pour l'Emploi et le Travail Indépendant	Directeur des opérations et programmes

Mr. Zied Charfi	Union tunisienne de l'industrie, du commerce et de l'artisanat - UTICA	Directeur des Affaires Sociales
Mme. Manel Zaouali	Union tunisienne de l'industrie, du commerce et de l'artisanat - UTICA	Direction des affaires sociales
Mr. Mounir Dakhli	Ministère de l'Emploi et de la Formation Professionnelle	Directeur Général de la coopération internationale
Mr. Chawki Ladhiri	Ministère de l'Emploi et de la Formation Professionnelle	Directeur Général des systèmes d'information
Mme. Naima Haj Mohamed	Ministère de l'Emploi et de la Formation Professionnelle	Directice
Mme. Arwa Samti	Ministère de l'Emploi et de la Formation Professionnelle	Chargée de la gestion du système IDEMA
Mr. Laroussi Oueslati	Ministère de l'Emploi et de la Formation Professionnelle	Chargé du programme PAFIP

Annexe 6 Evaluation schedule

Phase	Tasks	Dates
Desk review and Inception Report	- Desk review. - Initial briefing and consultation with the project team. - Elaboration of the Inception report (i.e. evaluation methodology, questions, instruments, etc.) - Finalization of inception report incorporating the ILO´s comments	July 15
Data collection Egypt, Tunisia, Maroc	- Interviews with key stakeholders + Preliminary findings briefing	July 15-to August 18
First draft	- Development and submission of draft evaluation report with all annexures	August 28
Stakeholders' Feedback	- Circulate draft report to key stakeholders - Consolidate comments of stakeholders and send to team leader	Sept. 15
Final report	- Finalize the report after receiving comments	Sept. 28
Stakeholders´ workshops	- Workshops with Egyptian, Moroccan and Tunisian stakeholders	18, 22 and 27 September

Annex 7 Lessons Learned and Good Practice Template

Advancing the Decent Work Agenda in North Africa "ADWA (Phase I)" and Advancing the Decent Work Agenda in North Africa and the Levant "ADWA Phase II"– Final Independent Cluster Evaluation

Project code: RAF/18/50/SWE and GLO/21/61/SWE
Evaluator Name: Rafael Munoz, Anis Ben Younes, Bassem Adly
Date:02 September 2024

The following lesson learned has been identified in the evaluation process. More explanatory text of the lesson can be included in the full evaluation report.

ELEMENT OF LESSON LEARNED 1	TEXT
Brief description of the lesson learned (relation to a specific action or task)	One of the key lessons learned from the ADWA projects is the critical importance of early and consistent engagement with national stakeholders. This lesson is linked to the action of conducting regular meetings and consultations with key partners. These engagements were essential for aligning project activities with national priorities, ensuring stakeholder buy-in, and fostering a sense of ownership. By engaging stakeholders early, projects can ensure that activities align with national priorities and garner strong support.
Context and any related preconditions	This learning occurred within the framework of the ADWA projects, which aimed to enhance evidence-based policymaking and ILS across target countries. The precondition was the need to align project activities with national development priorities and the importance of securing stakeholder commitment from the outset.
Users / Beneficiaries addressed	The targeted users and beneficiaries of this lesson are the project teams, ILO departments, UN agencies, national governments, and other cooperation partners involved in similar initiatives.
Negative challenges/lessons – Causal factors	A challenge identified was the potential delay in project alignment with national priorities if early engagement with stakeholders was not prioritized. Additionally, without early buy-in, there was a risk of reduced stakeholder support and ownership, which could impede the project's success.
Achievements / Positive aspects - Causal factors	The successful outcome was the strong alignment of project activities with national priorities, achieved through early and regular engagement with stakeholders. This approach facilitated stakeholder buy-in and ownership, contributing significantly to the effectiveness and efficiency of the ADWA initiatives.
Administrative aspects of the ILO (personnel, resources, design, implementation)	For future projects, it is crucial to allocate sufficient staff resources and time for the early and continuous engagement of national partners. This includes planning for regular consultations and incorporating feedback from national stakeholders into the project design and implementation phases. By following this approach, projects can better align with national priorities, ensuring broader support and more sustainable outcomes.

ELEMENT OF LESSON LEARNED 2	TEXT
Brief description of the lesson learned (relation to a specific action or task)	Another important lesson learned from the ADWA projects is the critical need to tailor project interventions to the specific socio-economic and political contexts of each country. This lesson is linked to the action of customizing stakeholder engagement and policy implementation approaches. For instance, approaches required specific customization to align with the unique circumstances of Egypt, Morocco, and Tunisia. This experience highlighted the necessity of conducting thorough contextual analyses and being flexible in adapting methodologies to meet local needs and conditions effectively.
Context and any related preconditions	This learning occurred within the context of the ADWA projects, which aimed to enhance evidence-based policymaking and ILS across diverse target countries. The precondition was the recognition of the unique socio-economic and political landscapes in each country, necessitating tailored interventions to ensure relevance and effectiveness.
Users / Beneficiaries addressed	The targeted users and beneficiaries of this lesson are project teams, ILO departments, UN agencies, national governments, and other cooperation partners involved in similar initiatives. Specifically, stakeholders in countries with varied socio-economic and political contexts will benefit from this tailored approach.
Negative challenges/lessons – Causal factors	A significant challenge identified was the potential misalignment of project activities with local needs if a one-size-fits-all approach was applied. Without context-specific customization, there was a risk of reduced effectiveness and stakeholder engagement, potentially impeding project success.
Achievements / Positive aspects - Causal factors	The successful outcome was the effective alignment of project activities with the specific needs of each country, achieved through tailored interventions. This approach facilitated better stakeholder engagement and policy implementation, significantly contributing to the success of the ADWA initiatives.
Administrative aspects of the ILO (personnel, resources, design, implementation)	For future projects, it is crucial to allocate sufficient staff resources and time for conducting thorough contextual analyses and developing flexible methodologies. This includes planning for tailored stakeholder engagement strategies and adapting policy implementation approaches to fit the unique circumstances of each country.

ELEMENT OF LESSON LEARNED 3	TEXT
Brief description of the lesson learned (relation to a specific action or task)	The ADWA projects learned that political and economic instability significantly impacts project implementation and outcomes. This lesson is linked to the action of developing contingency plans and flexible project designs. Various challenges arose from fluctuating political landscapes and economic conditions in the target countries, emphasizing the importance of anticipating potential disruptions and developing strategies to mitigate their impact. By doing so, projects are better positioned to maintain progress and achieve their objectives despite adverse conditions.
Context and any related preconditions	This learning occurred within the context of the ADWA projects, which operated in environments characterized by political and economic instability. The precondition was the recognition of the inherent uncertainties and risks associated with such environments, necessitating proactive planning and flexible approaches to ensure continuity and effectiveness.
Users / Beneficiaries addressed	The targeted users and beneficiaries of this lesson are project teams, ILO departments, UN agencies, national governments, and other cooperation partners involved in similar initiatives, particularly those working in regions prone to political and economic instability.
Negative challenges/lessons – Causal factors	A significant challenge identified was the disruption of project activities and potential setbacks in achieving objectives due to political and economic instability. Without contingency plans and flexible designs, projects faced the risk of stalled progress and diminished outcomes.
Achievements / Positive aspects - Causal factors	The successful outcome was the ability to maintain project momentum and achieve objectives despite adverse conditions, facilitated by the development of contingency plans and flexible project designs. This proactive approach allowed for timely adjustments and the mitigation of potential disruptions.
Administrative aspects of the ILO (personnel, resources, design, implementation)	For future projects, it is crucial to allocate sufficient staff resources and time for developing and implementing contingency plans. This includes designing flexible project frameworks that can adapt to changing political and economic conditions. Ensuring regular monitoring and having predefined strategies for potential disruptions will enable projects to respond effectively to instability.

Annex 6 Emerging Good Practices Template

Advancing the Decent Work Agenda in North Africa "ADWA (Phase I)" and Advancing the Decent Work Agenda in North Africa and the Levant "ADWA Phase II"– Final Independent Cluster Evaluation

Project code: RAF/18/50/SWE and GLO/21/61/SWE

Name of evaluator: Rafael Munoz, Anis Ben Younes, Bassem Adly

Date: 02 September 2024

The following emerging good practice has been identified in the evaluation process. More content can be found in the full evaluation report.

COMPONENT OF GOOD PRACTICE 1	CONTENT
Brief description of the good practice (relation to the project objective or specific result, background, purpose, etc.)	Engaging stakeholders in the planning process ensured that work plans were relevant, realistic, and had broad buy-in. This approach facilitated smoother implementation and greater commitment from partners. By maintaining open lines of communication with stakeholders, including regular consultations and updates, the project fostered trust and transparency. This practice ensured that stakeholders were informed and engaged throughout the project. Moreover, involving stakeholders in decision-making processes and respecting their inputs fostered a sense of ownership and responsibility among partners. This practice was crucial for sustaining project activities and outcomes.
Relevant conditions and context: limitations or recommendations in terms of applicability and replicability	This practice is applicable and replicable in a wide range of projects and contexts. However, its success depends on several factors, including the adaptability of the engagement strategies to the specificities of the project, the availability of resources, and the ability to effectively involve all relevant stakeholders. It is advisable to customize these engagement strategies based on the size and scope of the project, as well as the cultural and sectoral environment in which it is implemented.
Establish a clear cause-effect relationship	Implementing this practice directly led to better project management and results. Regular stakeholder engagement ensured alignment with national priorities, which in turn facilitated smoother implementation and greater partner commitment. This proactive approach fostered a sense of ownership among stakeholders, which was essential for the sustainability of project activities and outcomes.
Indicate measurable impact and intended beneficiaries	The potential impact includes improvements in project effectiveness, greater ownership and support from stakeholders, and the promotion of long-term benefits. The intended beneficiaries are project partners and the project target populations, which include stakeholders from various sectors, particularly those involved in women's entrepreneurship and policymaking.
Replication potential and by whom	High replication potential. This practice can be adopted by other ILO projects, UN agencies, and cooperation partners working in similar fields.
Upward linkage with ILO global objectives (DWCPs , Country Program Results or ILO Strategic Program Framework)	

Other relevant documents or comments	

COMPONENT OF GOOD PRACTICE 2	CONTENT
Brief description of the good practice (relation to the project objective or specific result, background, purpose, etc.)	Working with judges and parliamentarians is crucial for the successful implementation and enforcement of labour laws. This good practice ensures that judicial and legislative bodies are well-informed about international labour standards (ILS) and the intent behind national laws, leading to more consistent and fair judgments. Engaging with judges and parliamentarians ensures their understanding and commitment to ILS, which is essential for developing robust national legislation. This collaboration promotes greater awareness and education on labour rights and standards among the judiciary and legislative bodies, resulting in better-informed decisions and policies that uphold labour rights and address emerging labour issues effectively.
Relevant conditions and context: limitations or recommendations in terms of applicability and replicability	This practice is widely applicable and replicable in different national contexts. Its success, however, depends on several factors including the political will of the judicial and legislative bodies, the availability of resources for training and engagement activities, and the existing level of awareness and commitment to ILS among judges and parliamentarians. The practice is most effective in environments where there is a clear framework for judicial and legislative engagement in labour issues and where there is a strong commitment to upholding international labour standards.
Establish a clear cause-effect relationship	Implementing this practice has a direct positive impact on the enforcement and development of labour laws. Educating judges ensures that their decisions reflect a deep understanding of ILS, leading to fairer and more consistent judgments. Similarly, educating parliamentarians results in the creation of stronger, more comprehensive labour laws that are aligned with international standards. This proactive engagement fosters an environment where labour laws are not only well-crafted but also effectively implemented and enforced.
Indicate measurable impact and intended beneficiaries	The measurable impact includes improved consistency and fairness in judicial decisions regarding labour disputes and the development of robust labour legislation. The primary beneficiaries are workers who gain better protection under the law, as well as employers who benefit from clearer and more consistent legal frameworks. Additionally, the judiciary and legislative bodies benefit from enhanced knowledge and capacity to address labour issues.
Replication potential and by whom	This practice has high replication potential and can be adopted by other ILO projects, UN agencies, national governments, and cooperation partners working to improve labour standards and enforcement. It is particularly beneficial for countries undergoing significant labour law reforms or facing challenges in the enforcement of existing labour laws.
Upward linkage with ILO global objectives (DWCPs, Country Program Results or ILO Strategic Program Framework)	
Other relevant documents or comments	

COMPONENT OF GOOD PRACTICE 3	CONTENT
Brief description of the good practice (relation to the project objective or specific result, background, purpose, etc.)	A notable good practice of the ADWA projects is the institutionalization of capacity-building activities to ensure sustainability. The project has implemented extensive capacity-building initiatives, including training programs, the development of training manuals, and the establishment of new curricula. For instance, ADWA supported the National Centre for Judicial Studies (NCJS) in Egypt and the Higher Institute of the Judiciary (ISM) in Tunisia by providing specialized training of trainers (TOT) on International Labour Standards (ILS). This training has been successfully integrated into the training curricula of both NCJS and ISM, ensuring that new judges receive education on ILS. Additionally, in Morocco, the institutionalization of the GetAhead program for women's entrepreneurship by the Social Development Agency (ADS) exemplifies sustained capacity-building efforts, ensuring ongoing support and development for women entrepreneurs.
Relevant conditions and context: limitations or recommendations in terms of applicability and replicability	This practice is broadly applicable and replicable in various contexts. However, its success is contingent on several factors, including the commitment of local institutions to integrate capacity-building into their standard curricula and the availability of resources to support ongoing training. The practice is most effective in environments where there is a strong commitment to institutionalize training programs and where there is an existing framework for the inclusion of new training materials and methodologies.
Establish a clear cause-effect relationship	Implementing this practice led to a sustainable increase in the capacity of judicial and entrepreneurial institutions. By integrating training on International Labour Standards into the curricula of judicial training centers, the project ensured that new judges are continuously educated on these standards, leading to more consistent and informed judicial decisions. Similarly, the institutionalization of the GetAhead program in Morocco ensures that women entrepreneurs continue to receive the necessary training and support, fostering sustainable economic growth and entrepreneurship among women.
Indicate measurable impact and intended beneficiaries	The measurable impact includes enhanced knowledge and application of International Labour Standards among new judges in Egypt and Tunisia, and increased support and development for women entrepreneurs in Morocco. The primary beneficiaries are the new judges trained under the NCJS and ISM programs, and women entrepreneurs in Morocco who benefit from the GetAhead program.
Replication potential and by whom	This practice has a high potential for replication by other ILO projects, UN agencies, national governments, and cooperation partners involved in similar capacity-building initiatives. It is particularly beneficial for countries looking to improve the education and training of judicial officials and support women's entrepreneurship.
Upward linkage with ILO global objectives (DWCPs , Country Program Results or ILO Strategic Program Framework)	
Other relevant documents or comments	