



Final Progress Report
June 2019

Promoting Decent Work in Oil Palm Plantations in Indonesia
Project Code (IDN/16/02/NLD)



Donor: The Embassy of the Royal Kingdom of the Netherlands
Admin Unit: ILO Country office for Indonesia and Timor Leste

Project title: **Promoting decent work in palm oil plantations in Indonesia**

Report type (pick one) Components ^a	Final Progress Report incorporating Self Evaluation
Reporting period:	From 01 April 2017 to 30 June 2019

Linkages:

Strategic Policy Outcome: Outcome 5 - Decent Work in the Rural Economy

Country Programme Outcome: Optimized employment outcomes of the rural economy, agriculture and public investment, IDN 127

Sustainable Development Goal: 8. Decent Work and Economic Growth; 12. Responsible Consumption and Production; 15. Life on Land

UNDAF Outcome: Indonesia UNPDF (UN Partnership for Development Framework) 2016-2022: Outcome 1 on Poverty reduction, equitable, sustainable development, livelihoods and decent work

Related project(s): N/A

Preparation and Review

Report prepared by: Yunirwan Gah, 31/07/2019

Report reviewed by: Elvis Beytullayev, 05/11/2019

Report approved by: Michiko Miyamoto, Insert date

All text highlighted needs to be deleted when finalising the report. This is the standard ILO format for extra-budgetary development cooperation final progress reports (FPR) only. Interim reports must use a different template. Once finalized the report must be uploaded in the [Development Cooperation Management Support System](#).

^a Version incorporating self-evaluation components mandatory to development cooperation projects up to USD 500,000 maximum.

Contents

1	Executive Summary	4
2	Basic Information	5
3	Summary outputs	5
4	Summary outcomes	10
5	Narrative Report: Managing for Results	13
5.1	<i>Result summary</i>	14
5.2	<i>Monitoring, evaluations and other reviews</i>	21
5.3	<i>Main challenges, risks and corrective action</i>	22
5.4	<i>Opportunities and corresponding strategy adjustments</i>	22
5.5	<i>Overall Budget Analysis</i>	23
5.6	<i>Lessons learned and Good Practices</i>	25
5.7	<i>Visibility & Communication</i>	25
5.8	<i>Conclusions and Recommendations (Mandatory section for projects up to USD 500,000 in lieu of a separate evaluation report)</i>	26
6	Annexes	28

1 Executive Summary

<Please use the executive summary as a tool to inform the donor about key achievements: be concise, to the point and illustrate the results of the project. Maximum one page>

Implemented between April 2017 and June 2019, with support from the Ministry of Foreign Affairs of the Netherlands, the project's objective was to promote sustainable rural livelihoods through improved working conditions and workers' access to rights and quality job opportunities in Indonesia's palm oil sector. It also supported enterprises in implementing core international labour standards and national labour laws with a view to improving both compliance and competitiveness in their supply chains. The *institutional development component* of the project aimed at improving the functioning of labour market and governance institutions, as well as the capacity of the tripartite constituents to address decent work challenges in the palm oil sector. This component comprised capacity building of the constituents on decent work, strengthening the organizations of workers and employers to engage in social dialogue and improve their outreach and inclusiveness, strengthening of legislation enforcement through labour inspection in the sector and the rural economy at large. The *direct support component* included the implementation of activities aimed to improve working conditions at the plantation level, with a particular focus on social dialogue and occupational safety and health (OSH), and advising businesses on compliance.

During the duration of the project, the ILO facilitated a series of meetings combined with technical workshops on key labour issues facing the palm oil sector, thereby also contributing to the promotion of effective social dialogue among sectoral constituents. In order to improve labour regulation, the project assessed the alignment of Indonesian labour laws, regulations and practices, as applied in the palm oil industry, with international labour standards on labour inspection, safety and health, and work on plantations.

Furthermore, the project facilitated the establishment of the trade union network in the palm oil industry as well as the development of a dialogue between the workers and the employers, represented by the national sectoral palm association (GAPKI). The support provided by the project included conducting technical workshops, capacity building activities and facilitating collaboration and coordination among the trade unions engaged in the sector.

As part of the direct support component, in North Sumatra, the project carried out activities in key areas such as the promotion of social dialogue, OSH and the strengthening of labour inspection. More specifically, activities included a diagnostic study on working conditions in the palm oil sector; the development of an action plan and of practical interventions to address decent work challenges facing the sector; tripartite national and provincial-level dialogue forums in 2017 and a bipartite (workers–employers) national forum in 2018; a series of meetings and workshops, especially for trade unions, to improve understanding of seminal issues in the industry to inform the dialogue; capacity building activities for labour inspectors; training activities for workers and employers on collective bargaining; OSH training at the plantation level, including for smallholder farmers.

The project has shown great potential, which has manifested in the growing interest among palm oil companies as well as communities to acquire new skills and technical expertise for improving workplace conditions in plantations as well as implementing labour standards.

As a pilot, the project has served its intended purpose well and with appropriate follow-up, the outcomes could be sustained, improved and scaled-up.

2 Basic Information

Project budget in USD: 435,540		
Project duration in months: 28	Planned	Actual
Project start date:	February 2017	March 2017
Project end date:	December 2018	June 2019

3 Summary outputs

OUTPUT DELIVERY ^b		
Output	Output status	Output Analysis
Outcome 1: Strengthened capacity of ILO tripartite constituents – governments, workers and employers – and other relevant stakeholders to design, implement, and monitor targeted measures for the promotion of decent work in the oil palm plantations sector (institutional development component).		
1.1 An action plan on decent work in plantations designed and monitored to sustainably address decent work challenges within the palm oil plantations sector	Completed	The ILO conducted a diagnostic process on working conditions in Indonesia's palm oil sector. The diagnostic process follows a methodology developed to identify opportunities and challenges for the promotion of decent work in the agro-food sector. It combines innovative qualitative methods of sociological research with quantitative methods and covers a wide range of technical issues, including engagement and recruitment of workers, wages, maternity protection, workmen's compensation, housing and medical care to the fundamental principles and rights at work. Information is gathered through in-depth focus group discussions (FGDs) with government officials, representatives of workers' and employers' organizations, and plantations managers at the national, regional and local levels and direct interviews with plantation workers and small-scale producers. In Indonesia, the process included 13 FGDs held in Jakarta and selected locations in North-Sumatra and Aceh. The discussions, with on average 10-20 participants per meeting, included a short questionnaire, completed by each participant. Separate questionnaires were administered to 874 plantation workers and 109 small agricultural producers, both organized and unorganized. The workers interviewed were employed by multinational plantation companies (42 per cent) and domestic private companies (41 per cent), as well as by state-owned plantations (9 per cent) and smallholder farms (8 per cent). Those interviewed included permanent workers (68 per cent) - with and without written contracts – and those who identified themselves as daily workers, casual workers and seasonal workers (31 per cent). The survey results

^b Based on the Implementation Plan

	<p>were discussed by the constituents in a tripartite setting. The discussions culminated in the adoption of a plan of action on the promotion of decent work on oil palm plantations. The plan covered six areas, in line with the results of the diagnostic process: (i) employment status; (ii) wages; (iii) social dialogue; (iv) occupational safety and health; (v) child labour; (vi) labour inspection and included agreed actions which also form the basis of the project. For each of these areas, agreed actions were identified which form the basis of the ILO's activities and technical support to the sector. The diagnostic study also formed the basis of technical support delivered as part of this project.</p> <p>The project has organized, on a regular basis, multi-stakeholder dialogue forums at both national and provincial levels.</p> <p>The project has also been facilitating the establishment of a bipartite forum for social dialogue between the Palm oil employers' organization in Indonesia (GAPKI) and the palm oil trade union network (JAPBUSI). While it was originally planned to be launched in May 2019, the official inauguration of the forum has been deferred pending discussions and agreement on its operational arrangements and the possibility of involving the Employers' Association of Indonesia (APINDO), in addition to GAPKI. The two entities have, however, developed a work plan for 2019-21, which draws on the findings of the diagnostic process and covers the following areas: 1) employment status; 2) social dialogue; 3) occupational safety and health (OSH); 4) wages; 5) labour inspection 6) child labour and gender. The plan also delineates the roles and responsibilities of constituents and presents a strategy for sustaining a national bipartite dialogue in the industry. Details of the work plan in Bahasa version are available in appendix 1.</p> <p>Both JAPBUSI and GAPKI have formulated a joint proposal for funding to be submitted to BPDP Sawit (Badan Pengelola Dana Sawit), a government body responsible for managing the funds from the palm oil export levy. The proposal covers several immediate joint activities such as trainings on collective bargaining and dialogues on addressing labour and employment issues in the palm oil sector in two provinces in Kalimantan as well as at the national level.</p> <p>Drawing from the findings of the diagnostic study and the above-mentioned action plan, the project also provided technical inputs on employment and labour in the development of the National Action Plans for</p>
--	---

		Sustainable Palm Oil, led by the Coordinating Ministry for Economic Affairs and supported by the UNDP.
1.2 Enhanced knowledge and capacity of tripartite constituents for addressing decent work challenges in plantations.	Completed	<p>Capacity building trainings delivered by the project were designed on the basis of the findings of the diagnostic process as well as the national-level dialogue held in October 2017. The national dialogue focused on three priorities: enhancement of social dialogue; awareness on occupational safety and health and the prevention of child labour in the palm oil sector.</p> <p>The legislative gap analysis conducted by the project has been distributed to the relevant line ministries, GAPKI and the palm oil trade union network, which could potentially use the results from the analysis in their lobbying and advocacy materials.</p> <p>On social dialogue, which has been identified as one of the key areas requiring capacity building support, the project focused on building trust between the trade union network and the employers. The following activities were carried out:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a) Three dialogue forums at each national and provincial levels have been conducted for trade unions and GAPKI. Subsequently, ten meetings were held to follow up on the conclusions of the dialogue forums and led to the development of a joint national bipartite dialogue platform between GAPKI and JAPBUSI as well as a commitment for collaboration to promote decent work in the sector. b) A training on effective collective bargaining was conducted at the provincial level for 20 representatives from 5 palm oil plantation companies. By the end of the project, one company had signed a collective bargaining with the workers. The other four companies had submitted their progress of process that started since January 2019 for reviewing or renewing their existing collective bargaining agreements. <p>On occupational safety and health, the project worked together with the national labour inspection department to adapt and introduce the participatory oriented training approach of the ILO for workplace and OSH improvement in palm oil plantations. The process included:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. An in-depth study on the OSH drivers and

		<p>vulnerabilities in the palm oil supply chain in Indonesia. The study was conducted in collaboration with another ILO project on OSH vulnerability in global supply chain funded by the European Union (EU).</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> b. A two-day technical expert workshop on improving working conditions in the palm oil plantations sector, involving 25 participants from the national and provincial levels. The workshop was facilitated by OSH specialists from the ILO Regional Office for Asia and the Pacific (ROAP). Both the study and the workshop formed the basis for adapting the tools on improving working conditions in agriculture to the palm oil sector in Indonesia. c. A five-day Training of Trainers (ToT) for 22 participants from the labour inspectorate at the national and provincial levels, trade union representatives, companies and farmer organizations, conducted in North Sumatra. d. A two-day workshop to refine the training modules and tools for promoting OSH in the palm oil sector. The final version of the tools include child labour and gender issues. <p>On the role of labour inspection, a workshop to discuss strategies to improve labour inspection in rural areas was held at the provincial level and findings were communicated to the ILO technical units specializing in labour inspection. The final product will be integrated as part of the strategic compliance mechanism that is being introduced by the ILO in Indonesia.</p>
<p>Outcome 2: Improved working conditions in targeted plantations in selected districts (direct support component).</p>		
<p>2.1 OSH management systems revised and updated in close collaboration with bipartite committees.</p>	<p>Completed</p>	<p>The project adopted the participatory action training approach as the model for assisting the industry with the “know how” and tools to improve working conditions, in particular OSH, and implement national regulations and certification standards relevant to the palm oil sector such as the Indonesian Sustainable Palm Oil (ISPO) system – a policy adopted by the Ministry of Agriculture on behalf of the Indonesian Government – and the Roundtable on Sustainable Palm Oil (RSPO) – a private certification scheme. In the duration of the project, a series of workplace and OSH improvement workshops were delivered to some 50 companies in North Sumatra and Central Kalimantan. In addition, 273 workers and 89 farmers from two smallholder palm oil groups in two districts in North Sumatra were trained on using the</p>

		<p>participatory action oriented training approach and the workplace improvement checklist tools for improvement of workplace conditions and OSH.</p> <p>By June 2019, more than 367 workplace improvement activities had been planned by participants from 50 companies in North Sumatra who had attended the OSH trainings. Based on the monitoring reports, 137 activities had been successfully implemented by the end of the project. Progress in the implementation has been slow due to extended discussions required with the management in the companies. Furthermore, 30 companies in North Sumatra were trained during the last phase of the project, during February-March 2019, and are in process of implementing their workplace improvement plans.</p> <p>The workplace improvement checklist tools have also been consistently utilized by the two trained farmer groups to improve their working conditions.</p> <p>In addition to the above trainings, 22 trainers from PT. Wilmar, a member of GAPKI, voluntarily conducted a pilot training for their staff, within the framework of the project, to introduce and implement the participatory action-oriented training approach and the checklist tools in their operation.</p> <p>As the trainings targeted participants at the supervisory level, participation of women was very low, as there were not too many women holding supervisory positions in plantations as well as in palm oil factories. The project therefore introduced additional check points for gender aspects into the OSH and workplace improvement checklist tools.</p>
--	--	--

OUTPUTS: Overall delivery assessment	
<p><input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Highly satisfactory Almost (>80%) outputs have been implemented on schedule as envisaged in the implementation plan and almost all (>80%) indicator targets have been met.</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Unsatisfactory Some (40-60%) outputs have been implemented on schedule as envisaged in the implementation plan and only some (40-60%) indicator targets have been met.</p>	<p><input type="checkbox"/> Satisfactory Some (60-80%) of outputs have been implemented on schedule as envisaged in the implementation plan and the majority (60-80%) of indicator targets have been met.</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Very unsatisfactory Few (<40%) outputs have been implemented on schedule as envisaged in the implementation plan and only a few (<40%) indicator targets have been met.</p>

4 Summary outcomes

OUTCOME ACHIEVEMENT ^c		
Indicator	Baseline (before project start)	Outcome summary ^d
Outcome 1: Strengthened capacity of ILO tripartite constituents – governments, workers and employers – and other relevant stakeholders to design, implement, and monitor targeted measures for the promotion of decent work in the oil palm plantations sector (institutional development component). Outcome Achieved		
Decent work challenges and opportunities are effectively addressed by targeted measures jointly developed by ILO constituents and other stakeholders	N/A	<p>With a focus on workplace compliance, this component has influenced the development of several policy documents at the national and provincial levels. It has also facilitated the engagement of the tripartite constituents in improving industrial relations in the palm oil sector in Indonesia. Numerous social dialogue platforms have been introduced at both national and provincial levels to create a space for debate and discussion among the constituents and social partners to promote responsible and sustainable workplaces in the sector. Key achievement at various levels are:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • At the national level, the project actively engaged in the development of the National Action Plan on Sustainable Palm Oil, an initiative led by the Coordinating Ministry for Economic Affairs. Compared to the initial draft of 2017^e, the final version of the document to be presented before the President of Indonesia includes elements on social dialogue, OSH, enhanced governmental effort to strengthen labour inspection in the palm oil sector. • At the industry level, the project facilitated the process of setting up a bipartite sectoral forum as a channel for workers and employers to work together. It also supported the creation of the first and largest trade union network in the palm oil sector (JAPBUSI),

^c Based on the M&E plan

^d Compare achievement against planned target as per indicator.

^e The initial version of Indonesia Action Plan on sustainable palm oil can be downloaded from:

http://www.foksbi.id/download?file=FoKSBI%20Rencana%20Aksi%20Nasional%20-%20draf%206_1.pdf.

		<p>which brings together four confederations and nine trade union federations.^f</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> The plans for the official inauguration of the bipartite forum have been discussed between GAPKI and the palm oil trade union network; and, the project made efforts to involve APINDO. The tripartite mechanism has been included in the joint activity plan of GAPKI and the Network. This mechanism will be proposed to the Ministry of Manpower. In order to accelerate the process of collaboration and coordination with the trade unions, internally GAPKI has set up a taskforce^g comprising of representative from its companies and also created a dedicated department for child labour to work together with the joint secretariat of the network. Regular bimonthly meetings have been planned. <p>Between January and May 2019, a series of national and provincial level dialogue forums were held jointly by GAPKI and the network, with technical support from the project. Decent work and SDGs were also discussed during the Annual international conference on palm oil held by GAPKI in November 2018, which was attended by around 1500 participants from the palm oil industry around the world and included dedicated sessions to discuss the recommendations of the 2015 diagnostic study.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> At the provincial level, the relationship between trade unions and employers' organizations is somewhat different. Lack of trust between employers and unions has impeded the discussions on setting up sectoral bipartite or tripartite social dialogue mechanisms at the provincial levels and further efforts are needed to build trust among the constituents.
Outcome 2: Improved working conditions in targeted plantations in selected districts (direct support component)		Outcome Achieved
Workers and employers are fully engaged to improve occupational safety and health in selected plantations	N/A	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> The tools introduced to workers and smallholder farmers engaged in palm oil using the participatory action oriented training approach have been appreciated and considered practical. In particular, the approach and the tool facilitated the workers to implement relevant standards, especially those pertaining to OSH. The tools also helped the bipartite OSH committees in companies as well as farmer groups in understanding hazards and risks at the workplace and facilitated preventive actions to improve their safety and health during working hours.

^f While ten union federations had participated at the preparation stage, one federation, FSPMI withdrew from the network at the inauguration stage..

^g GAPKI's task force covers the following themes: Social dialogue, employment status, wages, child labour and gender, OSH, and labour inspection

		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> The number of companies covered by the project exceeded the five companies and two farmers groups initially planned. By the end of the project, the OSH training had been delivered to some 50 palm oil companies. All companies have reported taking some concrete steps to improve the OSH and working condition in their respective companies. Those concrete steps were taken from the activity plan that have been made jointly by the workers and representative of the management. Many requests were received to expand the training programme to other provinces, reflecting the utility of the tools in addressing the unique needs of the sector. The ILO additionally received requests to expand the tools and approach beyond OSH to all fundamental rights at the work.
--	--	--

OUTCOME: Overall outcome summary			
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<p>Highly satisfactory Based on the indicators & the risk assessment, all outcomes have been achieved by the end of the project.</p>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<p>Satisfactory Based on the indicators & the risk assessment, the majority of outcomes have been achieved.</p>
<input type="checkbox"/>	<p>Unsatisfactory Based on the indicators & the risk assessment, only some outcomes have been achieved.</p>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<p>Very unsatisfactory Based on the indicators & the risk assessment, only a few outcomes have been achieved</p>

5 Narrative Report: Managing for Results

Present how project implementation was actively managed to ensure results, following the subheadings indicated below. Be brief, concise and reflective.

For projects below USD 500, 000 please provide findings based on your critical self- assessment of the overall project achievement as defined in the project outcomes and development objective. The boxes provide guiding questions for the self-evaluation.

Background and context

With support from and active participation of the Government of Indonesia and the relevant workers' and employers' organizations, and as a follow up to the ILO's diagnostic process on working conditions in palm oil plantations conducted in 2015, a national action plan on the promotion of decent work in the palm oil sector was agreed upon by the tripartite constituents. The plan covers the following six areas: (i) employment status; (ii) wages; (iii) social dialogue; (iv) OSH; (v) child labour; and (vi) labour inspection. For each of these areas, agreed actions were identified which form the basis of the ILO's activities and technical support to the sector. As a follow up, in April 2017, with support from the Netherland Embassy in Indonesia, the ILO embarked on a project to promote decent work in palm oil plantations.

The project *Promoting decent work in Indonesia's palm oil plantations sector* implemented by the ILO in collaboration with local stakeholders and support from the Dutch Government necessarily had a limited scope in terms of both geographic and thematic coverage. In addition to national-level activities, it includes activities in the provinces of North Sumatra focusing on a number of key areas such as the promotion of social dialogue; occupational safety and health (OSH); and the strengthening of labour inspection. More specifically, project activities included: a diagnostic study identifying opportunities and challenges for the promotion of decent work in the palm oil sector; the development of an action plan and of practical interventions to address decent work challenges facing the sector; tripartite (government-workers-employers) national- and provincial-level dialogue forums held in 2017 and a bipartite national forum between workers and employers held in 2018; a series of meetings and workshops, especially for trade unions, to improve understanding of seminal issues in the industry to inform the dialogue; capacity building activities for labour inspectors; training activities for workers and employers on collective bargaining; OSH training at the plantation level, including for smallholder farmers; and a technical assessment of the extent to which Indonesian labour laws, regulations and practices as applied in the palm oil industry are aligned with international labour standards on safety, health and labour inspection in agriculture, and work on plantations. In addition, the palm oil trade union network consisting of four confederations and nine federations affiliated with the Indonesian confederation of trade unions, KSBSI, has been set up through the ILO efforts in collaboration with CNV Internationaal.

Project Strategy

The project objective was to promote sustainable rural livelihoods through improved working conditions and workers' access to rights and quality job opportunities in Indonesia's palm oil sector. It also aimed at supporting enterprises in implementing core international labour standards and national labour laws with a view to improving both compliance and competitiveness in their supply chains. The project did so by *inter alia* supporting sector-specific social dialogue, strengthening labour regulation and enforcement of national legislation, and improving working conditions, with a particular focus on OSH.

This project was part of a wider global ILO programme on plantations implemented at both the global and national levels. Country programmes combine efforts aimed at improving the capacity of national partners to identify and address key labour and employment issues in the sector and providing enterprise advisory and training services to support practical improvements through

workplace cooperation. At the global level, the programme develops practical tools that address various decent work issues; improve the institutional capacity of employers' and workers' organizations; help enterprises improve their compliance with labour standards and increase their competitiveness.

Country-specific interventions have two distinct components; the **institutional development component** and the **direct support component**. The institutional development component aims at advancing the functioning of rural labour market through improved compliance with legislation, information dissemination and strengthened capacity of national and local institutions to address decent work challenges in the sector and the rural economy at large.

The direct support component focuses on the implementation of integrated measures to promote productive employment at the level of palm oil plantations. The scope of the current project did not encompass all of the areas identified in the national action plan but intervened in selected areas in line with its budget. In particular under this project, the ILO focused on achieving the following outcome and outputs:

Outcome 1: Strengthened capacity of the ILO tripartite constituents – governments, workers and employers – and other relevant stakeholders to design, implement and monitor targeted measures for the promotion of decent work in the palm oil sector (*institutional development component*).

Output 1.1. An action plan on decent work in plantations designed and monitored to sustainably address decent work challenges within the palm oil plantation sector.

Output 1.2. Enhanced knowledge and capacity of tripartite constituents for addressing decent work challenges in plantations.

Outcome 2: Improved working conditions in targeted plantations in selected districts (direct support component).

Output 2.1. OSH management systems revised and updated in close collaboration with bipartite committees.

The project's interventions were part of a four-year strategy for promoting decent work in plantation in Indonesia. The activities covered basic elements for the implementation of the strategy in the first two years which can be delivered independently in a view of addressing the main decent work challenges in the sector.

The results of the project implementation since April 2017 until June 2019 including a self-evaluation result, which was conducted in close consultation with project constituents, are presented in the sections below.

5.1 Result summary

Briefly outline the outcomes achieved in the project, highlighting how project outputs led to (initial or more substantive) outcome changes during the project lifespan.

A. Institutional development

Output 1.1. An action plan on decent work in plantations designed and monitored to sustainably address decent work challenges within the palm oil plantations sector

Since the start of the project in April 2017, the ILO has been facilitating dialogue among employers, trade unions and the government at the national and provincial levels. A series of meetings combined with technical workshops on key labour issues facing the palm oil sector were held with a view to promoting effective social dialogue among sectoral constituents. In addition, a legislative gap analysis or a technical assessment of the extent to which the Indonesian labour laws, regulations and practices, as applied in the palm oil industry, are aligned with international labour standards on

labour inspection, safety and health, and work on plantations was carried out. The achievements made in the implementation of the project include the following:

1. A plan of action on the promotion of decent work in the palm oil sector, the national and provincial plans of action on sustainable palm oil

Based on the results of the diagnostic process on working conditions in the sector conducted by the ILO and discussed in a tripartite setting, the ILO facilitated the adoption of a plan of action on the promotion of decent work on oil palm plantations. The plan covered six areas, in line with the results of the diagnostic process: (i) employment status; (ii) wages; (iii) social dialogue; (iv) occupational safety and health; (v) child labour; (vi) labour inspection and included agreed actions which also formed the basis of the project.

At the national level, a work plan to address labour issues was integrated into the wider National Action Plan (NAP) of the Indonesian Sustainable Palm Oil (ISPO) initiative, which is led by the Ministry of Economic Affairs. The role of the Ministry of Manpower in addressing employment and labour issues in the sector has also been elevated in importance. In early 2018, with inputs from the project, the NAP began reviewing labour laws in areas such as enhancing industrial relations and social dialogue, dispute settlement, and workplace improvement of OSH practices in both companies and smallholder plantations.

In North Sumatra, the constituents agreed and developed a work plan to address key decent work challenges in the local context. The plan covers the improvement of collective bargaining through the establishment of a tripartite forum for the palm oil sector, an improved bipartite dialogue, OSH practices and capacity of labour inspectors.

2. Work plan for the trade union network

The palm oil trade union network was organized, consisting of representatives from nine trade union federations affiliated with the four national confederations. The network developed and agreed a three-year work plan to promote decent work in the sector. The detailed workplan of the trade union network presented in Bahasa Indonesia is attached in annex 1.

Collaboration among the trade unions is weak, with union federations working individually. Workshops and meetings facilitated by the project have provided avenues for trade unions to work together and improve collaboration. Nine trade union federations have join forces and developed a joint workplan to serve as a basis for structuring the efforts of trade unions for advocating their members' interest towards improved industrial relations and working conditions in the palm oil sector. The joint secretariat of the trade union network will coordinate and lead the implementation, monitoring, and evaluation of the workplan.

Work plans for the private sector

At the sectoral level, GAPKI developed a concrete short-term plan by forming thematic task forces based on the areas recommended by the ILO: employment status, social dialogue, gender and child labour, wages, occupational safety and health and labour inspection.

Between February and May 2019, GAPKI, through its labour affairs division, actively engaged in dialogue with its own branches as well as trade unions at the provincial level to improve industrial relations at the through workshops, seminars and focus group discussion. Some of the activities undertaken included:

- a. A workshop on child labour in plantations in North Sumatra
- b. A training workshop on collective bargaining hosted jointly with FHUKATAN and CNV in West Kalimantan

- c. The first international conference hosted by GAPKI in collaboration with Media Perkebunan, an agriculture magazine under ministry of Agriculture, to discuss six key thematic issues :employment status, wages, social dialogue, gender and child labour, occupational safety and health and labour inspection
- d. A preliminary dialogue among trade unions in North Sumatra to strengthen their network at the local level. About 14 trade unions (independent and federation members) attended the dialogue to identify common issues on palm oil sector in North Sumatra.

3. Sectoral bipartite plan

The project also facilitated a joint collaboration platform wherein GAPKI and the palm oil trade union network, JAPBUSI, agreed to develop a joint activity plan to address the issues identified in the diagnostic study conducted under the project. The activities cover joint advocacy and campaign plans at the national level on promoting decent work with particular focus on fundamental labour rights and industrial relations issues which include the promotion of the plantation/factory level bipartite dialogue, freedom of association, and collective bargaining at the national level.

Output 1.2. Enhanced knowledge and capacity of tripartite constituents for addressing decent work challenges in plantations.

The project has conducted a series of workshops, seminars, and trainings at both national and provincial levels on labour standards, social dialogue, collective bargaining, the role of labour inspection and OSH in agriculture with particular focus on improvement of working conditions in palm oil plantations and factories.

In addition, the project conducted a legislative gap analysis to inform stakeholders about the gap between prevalent regulations and international labour standards envisaged in the ILO conventions on plantations and labour inspection in agriculture. The report has been used by GAPKI as well as trade unions in developing their joint plans for promoting decent work in the sector. The findings of the study are also expected to be used by the trade union network for advocacy with the government when prevalent labour laws are reviewed. The findings of the study have also been disseminated to relevant ministries including the ministries of agriculture, coordinating ministry of economic affairs and manpower ministry.

On collective bargaining, at the plantation level, as a result of the training, one of the participating companies has concluded a collective bargaining agreement and the remaining four are in the process of developing theirs.

B. Direct Support Component

Under the direct support component, the project focused on OSH and working conditions in the targeted plantations and factories level. A total of 367 workplace and OSH improvement plans were made as a result of collaboration with a total of 50 palm oil plantations and companies including their subsidiaries and 2 smallholder palm oil farmer groups in North Sumatra and Central Kalimantan. After trainings in companies, the improvement plans were developed jointly by the representatives of management and workers at the plantation level. In smallholder plantations, the workplace and OSH improvement plans were developed by trained farmer groups. The trainings were supported by 22 trainers from the Labour Inspectorate, the Provincial Centre for Occupational Safety and Health, as well as representatives from GAPKI member enterprises.

Equipping the local bipartite OSH committees with easy and practical tools that could be used by workers at the plantation and factory level led to small but critical improvements at the

workplace. The ILO can build on this incremental progress to work with the ministry at the national level to develop a wider, systematic and structured intervention for all plantations. This could potentially be done through the ISPO or the “Ahi K3 Umum”, a national general OSH certification.

With respect to gender, the participation of women workers in the palm oil plantations and factories was low despite the project requisitioning the participation of female representatives in the training activities. It is therefore important to mainstream into the activities in the sector gender specific components such as the role of the gender committee and gender related education in the companies. Further, as the workforce in plantations and factories, especially at higher levels, is predominantly male, targeted interventions are needed to improve the opportunities for women in the sector.

The project, in its limited scope, contributed to SDG 8 by initiating the process for establishing a well-functioning platform for social dialogue in the sector. The project also collaborated with GAPKI and trade unions to increase awareness among stakeholders on the importance of a social dialogue platform to promote the freedom of association.

Self-evaluation results – (mandatory section for projects up to USD 500,000 in lieu of a separate evaluation report):

For further guidance on the objectives and methodology to conduct a self-evaluation please consult [ILO's evaluation policy guidelines](#) "section self- and internal evaluations"

The self-evaluation was conducted in May 2019 in accordance with the ILO's evaluation policy to review the results achieved against the expected project deliverables and outcomes, identify correction measures that should be taken into account in any future programme interventions and systematize the lessons learned and emerging good practices that could be used in the future project for promoting decent work in the palm oil plantation sector.

The self-evaluation utilized multiple sources and methods. First-hand data were collected from key stakeholders namely workers at the plantation level, project partners such as labour inspectors both at the targeted provincial level and national level, the trade union network and GAPKI.

Data was collected through a combination of methods including document reviews, interview with key stakeholders, focus group discussions, sharing of good practices, observations during field visits and knowledge sharing workshops and analysed through triangulation of sources. Focus group discussions and workshops for sharing good practices were especially beneficial to give voice to smallholders and workers. Quality data was defined by their consistency from different sources. In particular, data collection focused on the following evaluation aspects:

- Relevance to the project
- The progress of the project against outputs and outcome targets
- The efficiency of resource use
- Effectiveness of management arrangements and the extent to which management arrangements are appropriate to achieve desired results and outcomes within a timely, effective and efficient manner.
- The level of engagement with and satisfaction of project constituents and direct beneficiaries and possibilities for the continuation of the project.

The main findings of the self-evaluation are captured below:

Relevance - *Were the project objectives and strategy consistent with beneficiaries' requirements, country needs, ILO priorities and partners' and donors' policies?*

The project was developed as part of the follow up to the diagnostic study on working conditions in Indonesia's palm oil sector carried out in 2015. Interventions under the project focused on two of the five priority areas identified in the diagnostic study, namely a) improving institutional capacity of the tripartite constituents to identify and address decent work deficits, with a focus on social dialogue and labour inspection, and b) direct intervention at the plantation level with focus on OSH. The project interventions were aligned with the ILO programme and budget for 2018-2019, in particular, Outcome 5 on the promotion of decent work in the rural economy. The project was also fully aligned with the ILO decent work country programme for Indonesia.

In addition, the project's interventions were well aligned with priorities of the Government of Indonesia for making the sector sustainable. The Indonesian Government has developed a national certification system as part of the country's sustainability strategy. The project's experience, in particular that relating to social dialogue and OSH, has been taken into consideration as inputs to the national strategy for sustainable palm oil in Indonesia. Further, at the provincial level, the project's activities also aligned with the Government's laws and guidelines on OSH, in particular, those related to practical ways for improvements in the existent mechanism for bipartite cooperation at the workplace. The interventions under the project were also received well by GAPKI and the trade unions active in the sector.

It has been observed that conducting a diagnostic study on decent work deficits prior to the implementation of projects allows for the development of more focused interventions which are responsive to the unique needs and context of the targeted sector. While results of the diagnostic study carried out in 2015 were of crucial significance for the successful implementation of the current project, further in-depth studies could be conducted at the provincial levels for an improved understanding of the local context, dynamics, opportunities, and challenges.

Effectiveness - *To what extent can changes in the observed outcomes be attributed to the project? To what extent has the project contributed to changes in the project's ultimate beneficiaries? How effective was the project in advancing gender equality and inclusion of people with disabilities within the context of project's objectives?*

The project delivered all outputs in a timely manner. Under the first outcome on social dialogue, the project established a solid framework for tripartite sectoral dialogue as a sectoral tripartite social dialogue mechanism had not been identified in the palm oil sector in Indonesia. At the national level, the project successfully provided an initial forum for engagement between GAPKI, as representative of the employers, and nine union federations. Further to this development, APINDO was also keen to participate. This has led to an increase in interest among constituents for tripartite sectoral social dialogue platforms to address decent work issues. Trade unions also acknowledged the successful facilitation of the creation of the network by the project, as the process would have ordinarily taken much longer.

Under the second outcome on OSH, the participatory approach was well received by the private sector as complementary to the existing procedure that the companies already had in place. The project was further requested to integrate other labour standards such as those relating to maternity rights, collective bargaining and freedom association into one package of comprehensive and practical tools for companies to use in their operations.

Within the limited time frame and resources, the project successfully delivered multiple quality products. The politically sensitive context of the palm oil sector in Indonesia and difference in stakeholder expectations at the national and provincial levels presented serious challenges. The project staff has to dedicate significant time to lobbying and advocacy to engage the relevant stakeholders in the social dialogue process. The project experienced a delay in the direct implementation at the field level due to difficulties in engaging the private sector. Furthermore, the union movement in Indonesia was also fragmented and the unions lacked adequate mechanisms for coordination and communication as well as the capacity of to advocate for their members. These factors weakened the negotiation process at various levels, making social dialogue crucial for decent working conditions in the sector.

The project received a six month extension for monitoring and additional training requested by the employers' associations in North Sumatra. The initial plan of the project was to at least target five companies and two smallholder palm oil plantations in the pilot phase. The project, with support from GAPKI and its several multinational member companies, could successfully exceed the target to reach more companies and start to expand its geographical locations to other than those initially defined in Jambi, Riau and Kalimantan.

The extent of the project's impact on improvement in working conditions in each plantation and factory could not be assessed given the constraints of time. The monitoring carried out by the project was limited to whether the plantations and factories had taken action to follow up on the plans made after the training.

On the gender aspect, the project however faced difficulties in reaching out workers at the plantation level. Creating more opportunities for women to participate in trainings by

providing specific measures such as dedicated trainings for women will be a suggested area for improvement in future. Measures to increase participation of women could include incorporating gender aspects in designing of interventions and conducting trainings especially dedicated and relevant to women ensuring safe conditions for participation of women including through training methodology and schedule. Future activities should also focus on developing the capacity of women union members to advocate the cause of workers.

Sustainability – *To what extent has the project produced durable results that can be maintained, or scaled up and replicated, within the local development context, or as a global approach or policy, after the completion of the project? Are there any internal or external factors that may affect the sustainability of results?*

The project has met its objectives and delivered all the outputs that had been planned for the implementation period. Some of the outputs, such as the establishment of the bipartite dialogue forum and of the trade union network, should contribute to ensuring the sustainability of project results. For example, the GAPKI-Trade union network dialogue forum has developed a joint workplan for the period of two years.

As noted earlier, one of the objectives of the project was to facilitate the process of a establishing a bipartite sectoral dialogue. To this effect, a number of bipartite meetings were held, the latest one being in October 2018. As a result of these meetings, the workers and the employers have agreed to establish a bipartite forum, which was originally planned to be inaugurated in May 2019 but has been deferred pending discussions and agreement on the operational arrangements of the forum and the possibility of involving APINDO in addition to GAPKI.

The project also supported the initial functioning of the Trade union network through the provision of technical advice and support in the organization of meetings, with focus on training towards building the capacity of the members. A joint secretariat has now been established to serve as the hub for coordination of activities, collaboration, communication and knowledge sharing among the members. The participating unions in the network have agreed that the secretariat will be managed by an executive secretary, who will be elected from the nominations made by the unions. In addition, there will be six coordinators managing activities on: social dialogue and industrial relations; occupational safety and health; social and economic issues; research and development; training and capacity building; and, fund-raising activities. These coordinators will have 3 to 4 representatives from each of the member unions to assist in carrying out the activities. The executive secretary and coordinators will serve for a limited period of time and will be elected/selected on a rotational basis from amongst the participating unions.

The establishment of the Trade union network, JAPBUSI, was appreciated by constituents including the members of the network as well as the private sector. For GAPKI, the formation of the Trade union network was an important step towards a constructive dialogue and harmonization of industrial relations in the palm oil sector. GAPKI admitted that prior to the interventions under the project, the relations between GAPKI as one of the employers' organization and the unions in the sector were weak. Facilitation by the project staff over two years enabled GAPKI to set the foundation for a continuous dialogue to settle industrial relations disputes in the sector. Both GAPKI and JAPBUSI had agreed to join forces in promoting social dialogue at the provincial level. In addition, trade union federation also experience an improve communication among the trade union federation for both coordination and collaboration at the provincial level. At least four trade union federations, during the interview claimed that by joining the networks they were able to coordinate in advocating their members' cases with a palm oil plantation companies at provincial level.

Despite work plan has been jointly developed by GAPKI and the trade union network for 2019-21 to promote social dialogue and decent work in the sector. More support still required in order to make the Trade union forum, and initial bipartite forum at the national level can be sustained. The support required covered technical support for the trade unionist in advocating labour issues, in particular related with common issues such as overtime issues, working and resting time for workers in the plantations, standardise minimum welfare facilities, sectoral minimum wages, and other common issues. For employer's organisations, a continuous promotion of social dialogue at the plantation level, awareness raising on the fundamental labour rights in particular for companies that have not been certified. More technical support is also required in order to support employers able to develop a strategic compliance procedures in their operations due to various numbers of certifications that each company must have such as the ISPO (Indonesia Sustainable Palm Oil), RSPO (Roundtable Sustainable Palm oil), and many other related requirement that need to be fulfilled.

During three months of the project, the GAPKI and JAPBUSI has conducted several activities jointly at provincial level. The first, a discussion on setting up similar social dialogue platform in Central Kalimantan, carried out in the 5th of September 2019 attended by 75 participants from both unions and GAPKI's members companies, and the second social dialogue meeting in.

It is still early for a network to be able to function fully. There are still a lot to be increase and assess in terms of the effectiveness of the current structure of the joint secretariat and the social dialog platform to function well. First the representation of each federation still need a lot of capacity building in working together among each agencies as well as strengthening their representation at the local level.

A successful trade unions network forum requires a clear guided process in order to make it relevant in responding to the needs of workers and industry. The project, conducted four series of workshops, guided monthly meetings, and facilitate the development process of the charter. By having a solid ground including clear common frameworks will enable each institutions taking part and contribute to the forum.

5.2 Monitoring, evaluations and other reviews

Explain the process/method for collecting information regarding outcomes and challenges mentioned in this report.

The project carried out monitoring on a regular basis. Information on process as well as the outputs was well documented for workshops and trainings. To monitor the implementation of OSH related activities in the field, regular visits were carried out to factories that had submitted their progress reports. Further, information on progress of implementation was also collected by the participants and submitted to the project staff for knowledge sharing purposes.

A final self-evaluation was carried out at the end of the project. The project manager led the process of the self-evaluation. A qualitative approach was adopted where the project held several focus group discussions with employers, workers, and government officials. The project also interviewed employers' representatives as well as trade unions representative at the national and provincial levels. The final self-evaluation was delayed partly because initial delays in the project activities. Therefore the project decided to conduct the final self-evaluation at the end of the project period in order to capture and review more activities that had a delayed start such

as the training of occupational safety and health for workers at the companies and its follow up. At the same time, the fact that the evaluation was a self-administered brought notable benefits in terms of self-reflection and review given the first hand understanding and knowledge of the project issues by the person doing the evaluation.

A final knowledge-sharing workshop was held by the project to disseminate the project results and the tools, including on OSH. The participants in the final workshop acknowledged the achievements of the project and recommended the ILO to provide wider support in the sector in Indonesia, covering all aspects of compliance as well as improvement in governance of labour inspection in the sector.

5.3 Main challenges, risks and corrective action

Briefly outline the challenges and risks identified during the project lifespan that could have potentially hindered progress in delivery of outputs and achievements of outcomes as planned. What corrective actions were taken to address these challenges?

This sectoral project dealt with a complex industry, large number of constituents, and operated in a difficult political climate, with escalated trade tension between the EU and the Indonesian palm oil sector over the palm oil export to European countries and the expectation of compliance with various standards to ensure that the sustainability parameters were met by the palm oil products and its derivatives from Indonesia. This translated into each constituent having different expectations from the ILO, which influenced the implementation of the project both at the national as well as the grass-root level. GAPKI expected the ILO to counter the negative narrative against palm oil by the EU with impartial information about the positive potential of the sector. In fact, in the beginning, the industry was cautious of the ILO favouring the EU and the initial discussions about the source of funding were kept confidential, as agreed with the economic advisor from the Embassy of the Netherlands to find the balance between the Dutch support for the promotion of decent work in the palm oil sector with the position of the Netherlands as a member state of the EU.

In addition, divergent interests and past tensions between trade unions posed challenges in establishing and maintaining coordination. While some unions expected the project to improve dispute settlement and highlight various sectoral issues at the international level to apply pressure on the industry, others expected improvement in sectoral dialogue to address prevalent decent work issues.

In order to build trust and converge on common interests of various stakeholders, the project spent the first six months from inception in consolidating stakeholders and engaging in discussions with the constituents to develop collaboration and encourage ownership of the project activities by the employers and the unions. As a result, by the end of the project, a concrete bipartite platform was established in joint collaboration between GAPKI and the trade unions.

5.4 Opportunities and corresponding strategy adjustments

Present opportunities to do/achieve more than expected (gains in effectiveness, contribution to organizational learning, building alliances, etc.) and adjustments made to be able to make the most of these opportunities.

The initial arrangement was that the project will be managed by one National Coordinator located at the provincial level. The strategy, however, was adjusted to include a project assistant at the provincial level to support coordination of activities. Administrative and finance support was provided by the ILO Country Office in Jakarta.

Further, the strategy fully involved national employers' association as well as national trade

union confederations and federations and aimed to improve coordination and collaboration during the project implementation period and beyond.

5.5 Overall Budget Analysis

Present a brief budget summary, comparing actual and planned expenditure with previous forecasts and the approved budget. Also, highlight and explain over/under spending and efficiency gain.

At the end of the project, the delivery rate was 98.2 per cent. In terms of resource allocation 49 per cent or US\$ 213,589.06 was allocated for programme management cost. This allocation was to cover: 1 national project coordinator based in Jakarta; 1 provincial project coordinator based in North Sumatra; and one work month for a P2 specialist at HQ in Geneva (international staff). A total of 11 per cent of the total budget or US\$ 50,106 was allocated for programme support cost. And a total of US\$ 214,951 or 49 per cent of the total budget was allocated to cover activities at the provincial level.

ILO contribution:

In addition, the ILO also allocated a total of US\$ 68,333 which consisted of an additional work month for a P2 Specialist at the ILO HQ for US\$ 20,383, additional cost to cover workshops and seminars, a legislative gap analysis for USD 30,000 and 1 national admin and finance staff (GS 4) for 12 months for US\$ 17,950

Self-evaluation results – (mandatory section for projects up to USD 500,000 in lieu of a separate evaluation report):

Efficiency – How optimally were the resources and inputs (e.g. funds, expertise, time, etc.) used to produce results? Do the expected project results justify the costs incurred? To what extent did the project leverage resources (financial, partnerships, expertise) to promote gender equality and non-discrimination?

Despite the slow start in the first year, the project witnessed a significant improvement in the implementation of activities in the second year and was able to use 98 per cent of the allocated resources based on the log frame and agreed workplan. Some adjustment were made to the budget allocation to allow improvement in activities at the field level. The project also leveraged the collaboration with GAPKI by jointly carrying out training and workshop activities. GAPKI as well as its affiliated members supported the activities through in-kind contributions accommodation and transportation for participants. GAPKI also supported the meetings at provincial levels to follow-up on the national dialogues. Despite operating in a complex and politically sensitive environment, the project was able to successfully deliver on all expected milestones and meet expected targets within 28 months.

At the national level, the project actively engaged in the development of the National Action Plan on Sustainable Palm Oil, led by the Coordinating Ministry for Economic Affairs and supported by the UNDP, enhanced the dialogue between the trade union federations in the palm oil sector and facilitated the establishment of national bipartite and tripartite sectoral social dialogue platforms. Trade unions considered the contribution of the project as efficient, considering that it successfully facilitated within one year the formation of JAPBUSI, which brought together 10 federations (out of which 9 federations are actively engaged in the Network). According to one of the multinational companies that acknowledged the successful facilitation by the project, the process of consolidating even one or two federations could have otherwise gone on for years.

Substantial costs were incurred by the project towards management and activities, which were critical in maintaining support and presence both at the national and provincial levels. At the plantation level, the companies supported the implementation by providing ‘in kind’ contributions during trainings, for instance, by covering costs of accommodation and daily expenses for their staff. While these ‘in kind’ contributions varied among companies, they facilitated the project to cover more companies at the provincial level.

With respect to leveraging resources to promote gender equality and non-discrimination, the project, given the political sensitivity and complexity of the sector, was cautious in partnering with civil society organizations who had expressed interest in supporting activities on gender equality and non-discrimination. That said, the project extensively supported the initiatives of JAPBUSI, GAPKI as well as its member companies to promote gender equality and non-discrimination. Supported by the project, GAPKI has set up a dedicated department to promote women workers’ rights at the employers. JAPBUSI has also included gender equality as one of its key priorities for work in the sector.

At the plantation and factory levels, as the trainings targeted participants in supervisory capacities, participation of women was very low, as there were not too many women holding supervisory positions in plantations as well as in palm oil factories. The project has however made progress in raising awareness about gender issues at the national level, in particular, by introducing additional check points for gender aspects into the OSH and workplace improvement checklist tools.

Both GAPKI and JAPBUSI have sought further technical support from the ILO, such as guidance on the functioning of the field-level gender committees, to implement concrete activities on promotion of gender equality and non-discrimination in the palm oil sector, in particular, at the plantation level.

5.6 Lessons learned and Good Practices

Describe any lessons, positive and negative, that have been learned during project implementation. If you think that some of the positive lessons learned can be potential good practices worth sharing with other projects, please complete the template [Emerging Good Practices](#).

Strategies for improving industrial relations and creating fair value chains at the plantation level should aim at strengthening smallholder farmer groups' and labour unions' capacity to operate and advocate for their members.

A participatory approach, which entails active involvement of all key stakeholders and partners at all stages of project design, implementation, monitoring and evaluation is crucial to ensuring ownership and long-term sustainability of project results. The strategy of the current ILO project has been characterized by strong participatory approach, which has helped to guarantee the robust support and buy-in from the constituents. For instance, the fact that prior to the development of the project, the ILO conducted a diagnostic process involving all the constituents has helped to build trust, especially on the employers' and government's side, and ensure their active participation in project activities.

Combining institutional capacity building with direct support activities is critical to ensuring sustainability. Technical sustainability is largely achieved through building the capacity of stakeholders, when targeted beneficiaries of the intervention are considered to be knowledgeable about employment and labour issues, especially when it comes to the specific opportunities and challenges in the agro-food sector. Ensuring this sustainability through institutional capacity building is achieved through close cooperation and active engagement with the government, when the key ministries and the social partners mainstream the lessons learnt from the programme into government policy and programmes to create multiplier effects for wider-scale impacts. Activities at the plantation/enterprise level help to identify gaps, needs and lessons learnt and demonstrate achievements and benefits of project interventions.

Participation of the private sector is also critical to the success of the interventions targeting the agro-food sector and efforts aimed at scaling up and ensuring national ownership and sustainability of project activities.

The analysis of the ILO's past work in the rural economy also highlights the importance of an approach combining a sound analytical base of comparative achievements and policies, data collection and dissemination, collaboration with other international institutions, as well as programmes of technical support that provide support at all levels, i.e. to national, sectoral and local stakeholders to promote decent work in rural areas.

Further, the ILO's tripartite partners should be in the frontline to oversee the results of the project to enhance and build upon the lessons learned, and to continue to advise its constituencies when implementing measures to promote decent work in the sector.

In addition, a feasibility study of using technology such as android based applications or alike, to enhance workplace compliance needs to be carried out as part of a broader programme on enhancing industry' compliance to address the need for coherent and credible data. . Data could be collected on a wide range of relevant issues such as challenges in compliance, progress and trends of cases to enhance the evidence base for future improvements. The project has already piloted documentation of work-place improvements at a small-scale through social media to monitor progress made by the participants. Monitoring progress and sharing lessons learnt was also an essential part of the OSH training. Before and after pictures reflecting the changes made by participants at the workplace could accelerate knowledge sharing among the workers. The result of the exercise could also be used by the OSH committee at the enterprise level to monitor progress and report it to the local manpower office.

5.7 Visibility & Communication

Describe how results of this project were communicated to stakeholders. Indicate how the

donor support for this project was made public and what steps were taken to comply with visibility obligations?

Since palm oil is a part of the trade discussions between Indonesia and the EU, sensitive project information such as results of studies and details of the donor was subject to high scrutiny before being made public. Bearing this in mind and as per the understanding with the Embassy of the Netherlands at the commencement of the project, the project was regularly communicated with the stakeholders, as appropriate.

5.8 Conclusions and Recommendations (Mandatory section for projects up to USD 500,000 in lieu of a separate evaluation report)

<i>Conclusions and recommendation from the self-evaluation</i>			
<i>Conclusions</i> ^h	<p>The project has shown great potential which has manifested in the growing interest among palm oil companies and communities to acquire new skills and technical expertise for improving workplace conditions in plantations as well as implementing labour standards.</p> <p>As a pilot, the project has served its intended purpose well and with appropriate follow-up, the outcomes could be sustained, improved and scaled-up.</p> <p>On the basis of the findings and analysis, the following key recommendations are drawn to inform subsequent similar interventions:</p> <p>a) All the relevant partner institutions must be engaged from the onset to ensure synergy and concurrence in the quality delivery of project outcomes.</p> <p>b) The project should focus on creating a buy-in at the local and community level to ensure sustainability of the outcomes. Implementation approach should participatory where initiatives led by local workers at the plantation level and farmers groups become the key for sustaining social dialogue.</p> <p>c) The training on collective bargaining, social dialogue and other international labour standards should be standardized.</p> <p>d) The project should integrate all relevant skills such as collective bargaining and OSH as part of the skills acquisition/transfer to enhance the skill-base of learners. The quality of trainings on skills should be guaranteed.</p>		
<i>Recommendations</i> ⁱ	<table border="1" style="width: 100%; border-collapse: collapse;"> <tr> <td style="width: 60%; vertical-align: top;"> <p>1. Continued support for the newly initiated social dialogue platform through:</p> <p style="padding-left: 20px;">a. Capacity building for the newly established joint secretariat on managing</p> </td> <td style="width: 40%; vertical-align: top;"> <p>Responsible entity: ILO CO Jakarta</p> <p>Priority (high, medium, low): High</p> </td> </tr> </table>	<p>1. Continued support for the newly initiated social dialogue platform through:</p> <p style="padding-left: 20px;">a. Capacity building for the newly established joint secretariat on managing</p>	<p>Responsible entity: ILO CO Jakarta</p> <p>Priority (high, medium, low): High</p>
<p>1. Continued support for the newly initiated social dialogue platform through:</p> <p style="padding-left: 20px;">a. Capacity building for the newly established joint secretariat on managing</p>	<p>Responsible entity: ILO CO Jakarta</p> <p>Priority (high, medium, low): High</p>		

^h Conclusions should synthesize the main findings into statements of merit and worth. As such, judgments need to be fair, impartial, and consistent with the findings

ⁱ Recommendations should follow from conclusions; link to lessons learned; and describe a time-frame (short-, medium-, long-term), the degree of priority (high, medium, low), who is called upon to act and acknowledge whether there are any resource implications.

ILO Development Cooperation Final Progress Report

	<p>communication among the trade unions, leadership training, advocacy and institutional support for advocating issues with GAPKI and other employers organizations at national and international level</p> <p>b. Improving the network to support grass-root implementation level.</p> <p>c. Raising awareness at the managerial and high level, such as CEOs for GAPKI and its member companies, to maintain their buy in.</p>	<p><i>Resources (high, medium, low, NA):</i> Medium</p>
		<p><i>Timeframe (long-, medium, short-term):</i> Short-term</p>
	<p>2. Using the workplace and OSH modules to:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Advocate the endorsement of the OSH training module by the national ministry as a toolkit for Ahli K3 Umum, and the bipartite OSH committee for raising workers’ awareness. - Support the request from GAPKI for the training tools to be widely used in scaling up the training programme to Kalimantan, and also other areas in addition to North Sumatra. - Monitor progress and collect data on the trained trainers and participants in the OSH trainings. - Conduct feasibility study on converting the workplace improvement action checklist into electronic format or android application, to support the development of good practices database on practical preventive actions for workplace and OSH in plantations. 	<p><i>Responsible entity:</i> ILO CO Jakarta</p>
		<p><i>Priority (high, medium, low):</i> High</p>
		<p><i>Resources (high, medium, low, NA):</i> Medium</p>
		<p><i>Timeframe (long-, medium, short-term):</i> Medium</p>

6 Annexes

A. Project risk register^j

Ref	Risk statement. The event we do not want to see and its potential impact on objectives	Measures currently in place to address this risk	Impact	Likelihood	Total	Change ^k	Risk Owner ^l	Additional risk response for the attention of the implementation team.
	Poor consensus in the private sector with respect to good practices in ensuring labour compliance.	One of the project's key strategies included enhanced collaboration through building partnerships with related organizations and constituents to promote labour compliance and increase buy-in from the private sector.					Project manager	

^j Use the existing project risk register for filling in this table

^k The Change column is used during implementation and summarizes the change since the last time the risk register was presented. Three symbols are used: ↑ Increase in the total level of risk; ↔ No change in the total level of risk; ↓ Decrease in the total level of risk.

^l The Risk Owner column is used during implementation and records the name of the person with day to day responsibility for monitoring the risk and coordinating the response.

Ref	Risk statement. The event we do not want to see and its potential impact on objectives	Measures currently in place to address this risk	Impact	Likelihood	Total	Change ^k	Risk Owner ^l	Additional risk response for the attention of the implementation team.
1	Lack of technical expertise with sufficient knowledge of the Indonesian palm oil sector.	The project expanded its network with national universities and other non-governmental organizations at national and provincial level. Internally, the project also utilized the available list of experts with working experience with the ILO on labour issues in Indonesia as well as at the global level.	High	High		↔	Project manager	The project also collaborated with other ILO projects currently active in Indonesia working on the same theme such as Better work Indonesia and Global Supply Chain project.
2	Delay in the delivery of technical inputs and resources.	Intensive coordination and communication within and between employers' organizations and trade unions minimized the delay in inputs and improved working relationships among the national constituents.	Medium	Medium		↔	Project manager	Technical inputs from various ILO specialists on related issues in the project complemented the resources available at the national level.
3	Lack of trust between stakeholders, leading to weak social dialogue mechanisms.	ditto	Medium	Medium		↔	Project manager	The project staff conducted regular meetings with key stakeholders to maintain buy-in and support for project activities.

Ref	Risk statement. The event we do not want to see and its potential impact on objectives	Measures currently in place to address this risk	Impact	Likelihood	Total	Change ^k	Risk Owner ^l	Additional risk response for the attention of the implementation team.
4	Weak buy-in from the tripartite constituents, who are key national and local stakeholders, and lack of willingness to engage in programme interventions	<p>The ILO’s project strategy aimed at building the capacity of the tripartite constituents to engage in social dialogue processes at different levels and provide technical assistance for the implementation of the agreements reached within the framework of this project.</p> <p>Active engagement and participation of national and provincial level partners in North Sumatra in various activities were key to mitigating these risks factors. Having the Ministry of Manpower specifically from the labour inspector’s unit actively engage as a national partner reflected the commitment from the government to the implementation and sustainability of the interventions.</p>	High	High		↓	Project manager	Intensive and regular communication with employers, trade unions and the Ministry of Manpower and other relevant ministries ensured continued support from constituents.

Ref	Risk statement. The event we do not want to see and its potential impact on objectives	Measures currently in place to address this risk	Impact	Likelihood	Total	Change ^k	Risk Owner ^l	Additional risk response for the attention of the implementation team.
5	Limited resources and capacity to support programme implementation, such as lack of facilitators, poor infrastructure	Capacity building constituted a key component of the program. Therefore, this risk factor was addressed throughout the implementation process. The project expanded its collaboration externally with other social partners such as CNV Internationaal, government institutions such as the Ministry of manpower, as well as private institutions. Internally, the project collaborated with other projects and departments of the ILO with expertise in focal areas like collective bargaining and labour compliance.	High	High		↔	Project manager	The project was supported by the specialists from ILO HQ as well as the Asia-Pacific Regional Office.

B. Include relevant documentation, photo, web link, multimedia or information that may contribute to a better understanding of project progress.

List of documents in the Appendix:

- a. Joint activity plan of GAPKI and JAPBUSI on promoting decent work in Bahasa Indonesia. News coverage on the joint collaboration in national media can be found at:
 1. <https://investor.id/agribusiness/gapki-japbusi-sepakat-tingkatkan-kesejahteraan-tenaga-kerja-di-perkebunan-kelapa-sawit>
 2. https://www.ilo.org/jakarta/info/public/pr/WCMS_654636/lang--en/index.htm
- b. Activity plan and code of ethics of JAPBUSI in Bahasa Indonesia
- c. Final draft modules and the manual on OSH in Bahasa Indonesia submitted to GAPKI and the trade union network for endorsement and joint publication.