



International
Labour
Organization

► Evaluation Office



i-eval Discovery



Combating Human Trafficking in Egypt

ILO DC/SYMBOL: EGY/20/06/USA

Type of Evaluation: Project

Evaluation timing: Mid-term

Evaluation nature: Internal

Project countries: Egypt

P&B Outcome(s): Outcome 5: Decent work in the rural economy, and Outcome 4: Promoting sustainable enterprises

SDG(s): 3, 8, 16

Date when the evaluation was completed by the evaluator: 01 November 2024

ILO Administrative Office: DWT/CO-Cairo

ILO Technical Office(s): DWT/CO-Cairo

Project duration: June 2021 – June 2025

Donor and budget: USD 1,500,000.00

Name of consultant(s): Doaa Abdelal

Name of Evaluation Manager: Noha Hassan

Evaluation budget: 9,000 USD

Key Words: Decent Work, Human Trafficking, Domestic Work, Skills development, Gender Equality, Rural Egypt

Cette évaluation classée comme « évaluation interne » dans la nomenclature des types d'évaluation du BIT a suivi un processus d'évaluation formalisé géré par un officier de l'Unité Régionale de Programmation du Bureau Régional de l'Afrique du BIT. Le but des évaluations internes sert largement l'apprentissage organisationnel.

Contents

ABBREVIATIONS AND ACRONYMS.....	3
Executive Summary	4
1. Context of the Evaluation	9
1.1. Project Description	9
1.2. Overall & specific objectives of the project	9
1.3. Management arrangements	10
2. Evaluation Background	10
2.1. Objectives of the evaluation	10
2.2. Scope of the evaluation	11
2.3. Clients of the evaluation	11
3. Evaluation Criteria and Questions	11
3.1. Evaluation Criteria	11
3.2. Evaluation Questions	12
4. Evaluation Methodology	13
9. Evaluation Findings.....	16
9.1 Relevance	16
9.2 Coherence	19
9.3 Effectiveness	22
9.4 Efficiency	26
9.5 Impact Orientation	28
9.6 Sustainability	29
10. Conclusions.....	30
11. Lessons Learnt & Good Practices	32
12. Recommendations.....	33
12. Annexes	37
Annex I: Terms of Reference	37
Annex II: Evaluation Matrix	1
Annex III: Data Table on project progress (targets vs achievements).....	8
Annex IV: Evaluation schedule	12
Annex V: Bibliography	13
Annex VI: List of people consulted for the MTE	15
ANNEX VII – Lessons Learned	18
ANNEX VIII – Good Practices	22

ABBREVIATIONS AND ACRONYMS

CO	Country Office
CPOs	Country Programme Outcomes
CSO	Civil Society Organizations
DAC	Development Assistance Committee
DWCP	Decent Work Country Programme
HRBA	Human Rights-based Approach
ILO	International Labour Organization
ILS	International Labour Standards
IOM	International Organization for Migration
NCCPIM & TIP	The National Coordinating Committee for Combating and Preventing Illegal Migration and Trafficking in Persons
NGO	Non-Governmental Organization
NRM	National Referral Mechanism
OECD- DAC	Organization for Economic Co-operation and Development- Development Assistance Committee
PwD	People with Disabilities
SDG	Sustainable Development Goals
ToR	Terms of Reference
TIP	Trafficking in Person
UN	United Nations Organization
UNEG	United Nations Evaluation Group
UNODC	United Nations office on Drug and Crime
UNSCF	UN Strategic Common Framework

Executive Summary

Project Background

The “Combating Human Trafficking in Egypt” is a three-year (15 June 2021 – 15 June 2024) project funded by the United States Department of State office with a total budget of USD 1,500,000.00. The project governmental counterpart is the National Coordinating Committee for Combating and Preventing Illegal Migration and Trafficking in Persons (NCCPIM&TIP). The start of the project activities was delayed till July 2022 till it received security approval. The project collaborated in activities with international Organization for Migration (IOM), United Nations Organization on Drugs and Crime (UNODC), UN Women and other two ILO project ACCEL Africa and Better Work.

The overall objective of the project is to improve the capacity of the Egyptian Government to combat human trafficking by strengthening the national identification and referral mechanism (NRM) and providing assistance and reintegration services for identified victims. The project’s logical model and results matrix has been updated several times to respond to the NCCPIM&TIP requested changes throughout the project lifetime. The stated goal is to: Improve the capacity of the Egyptian Government to combat human trafficking while the two outcomes are: 1) An effective victim identification system and a national referral mechanism are in place and operational, 2) Improved comprehensive assistance and reintegration services for identified victims using a victim-centred, trauma-informed, and survivor-informed approach.

The project is managed by a project team in Cairo, Egypt, which comprises a project manager and an admin and finance assistant. The project management team is responsible for the administrative, operational, and technical supervision and implementation of the project interventions.

Geographically, the project implementation is notably focused on Greater Cairo and Alexandria. Though this was reconsidered during implementation as some of the target groups are based in other governorates.

The project activities target multiple groups including governmental staff especially from the Ministry of Labour (MoL), and Ministry of Social Solidarity (MoSS). National Councils including the National Council for Women (NCW), the National Council for Childhood a motherhood (NCCM), Non-Governmental Organizations (NGOs), trade unions, employers’ groups, religious leader, and media professionals

Evaluation Objectives and methodology

The mid-term evaluation focused on the project’s implementation as of July 2022 till end of November 2023 reviewing and assessing all the results and key outputs that have been produced in this period. The primary users of the evaluation are ILO Cairo Office, ILO HQ and the J/TIP Office - USDOS.

The evaluation reviewed the project relevance, effectiveness, efficiency, relevance and sustainability and introduced actionable recommendations for the remaining period of the project towards improving delivery and sustainability of outcomes.

The mid-term evaluation adopted a participatory approach using qualitative methods. The evaluation started by reviewing of the project’s technical reports and wider relevant documentation; then held 20 interviews with the project team/ILO, ILO projects, BETTER WORK

factories, the governmental counterparts: NCCPIM&TIP, trade unions, Federation of Egyptian Industries (FEI) which mobilized employers for the training, religious leaders, media professionals, the National Council for Motherhood and Childhood (NCCM), National Council for Women (NCW), NGOs Federation President, Ministry of Social Solidarity staff, Labour inspectors and labour attaches - Ministry of Labour, UN agencies active in combating human trafficking: IOM, UNODC and UN Women.

Evaluation Findings

Findings showed that the project has clear relevance and alignment to national interests and objectives to combat the different forms of trafficking in persons as stated in the Egyptian Law No. 64 of the year 2010, and the national strategy to combat human trafficking in its third round (2022-206). Strategically the project partners with a key governmental body, NCCPIM&TIP which is mandated by coordinating efforts, polices and plans to combat human trafficking and promote public awareness on TIP).

The project was designed based on four gaps: a) the absence of an effective victim identification system and referral mechanism, b) the domestic workers (DW) are excluded from Egypt's labour law, c) lack of assistance services provided to victims of TIP, in particular lack of specialized shelters, d) the lack of socio-economic reintegration services for victims of TIP. Mostly, the last three of these gaps were of more relevance than the first one. These gaps in particular aim to enhance services and their accessibility; thus, the project was successful in selecting the victim-approach and the trauma centered approach. Adopting this approach allowed the participants in the trainings and the awareness raising sessions to highlight challenges in referring victims to services which included lack of trust in the governmental procedures, fear of social stigma and lack of confidence in securing the privacy of victims.

The changes in priority of gaps, delays faced by the project team to acquire the necessary security clearance, in addition to the deep involvement of the NCCPIM&TIP in the activity's implementation, has affected the pathways of change planned by the project theory of change and led to significant delays in the project's delivery. The implementation of the project activities revealed several challenges to the pathways of change and assumptions of the theory of change. The first is the national focus on provision of direct social and economic services to potential victims as a mean to reduce cases of TIP. This led to interrupting or changing the paths seeking to operationalize the NRM to enhance the referring procedures. This changes in priorities along with the clear focus of the counterpart on delivering training and awareness raising to various groups require revisiting the developed theory of change.

The review of the theory of change should be considered based in the capacity and the mandate of the national counterpart. Despite the fact that the committee already conduct studies with other counterparts in Egypt, the project faced several challenges with the to conduct the planned studies as the main activities of the project which should have informed other planned activities as trainings and capacity building. The main reason behind these challenges is the lack of corporation from the committee side to approve issuing these studies. The capacity of the committee itself is still evolving as it was only established in 2016 which expand and stretch its staff responsibilities between coordination efforts of national institutions and those of international organizations to combat TIP along organizing awareness raising campaigns. This affects negatively the scheduling of events and acquiring necessarily security clearance. The

capacity and the mandate of the committee pose restrictions on implementing activities of the project.

The project has two outcomes and eight outputs: five under outcome 1 and three under outcome two. Under Outcome (1): the project exceeded its targets in relation to three of the five outputs and is in progress in relation to two outputs. Some of the activities planned to achieve Outcome (2) are still to start. This outcome focuses on enhancing services of shelters, economic re-integration through capacitating staff of TVET centres along with capacitating social workers, health workers and NGO staff when dealing with TIP victims.

The findings indicate the effectiveness of the activities. Results show that the participants either in trainings or awareness raising sessions shared knowledge acquired in the sessions or planning actions which should further raise the awareness of different forms of human trafficking. These continuous efforts will gain the subject increased momentum in the society and potentially assist in defining novel solutions. The project increased its effectiveness through including multiple target groups from outside Cairo and Alexandria in the trainings as many other governorates are of potential target by traffickers. The project has also introduced governmental staff to international best practices in protecting victims of TIP through an international visit to the Netherlands. The lessons learned from the visit will contribute to the development plan of a new TIP shelter in Egypt.

In conclusion, effectiveness of the project activities was a result of adopting activities which combine introducing knowledge, provision of technical assistance to governmental counterpart, capacity building of multiple groups and introducing international best practices.

The project activities were delayed for two main reasons; first is the extended time to acquire security clearances to conduct planned studies *which were later changed or replaced) and the second issue was the frequent rescheduling of activities to align with the availability of NCCPIM&TIP staff, as their involvement is required in all aspects of activities implementation .. Nevertheless, the project was successful in compensating this delay by collaborating in activities with other UN agencies or ILO projects beside brainstorming with the national counterpart on developing new activities which should achieve the project's objectives. However, implementing these activities would require a new timeline to implement them using the remaining budget. Despite the continuous delays and changes in activities, it is realized that the project is dedicating sufficient resources to monitor its progress.

The project is playing a crucial role in mobilizing joint human and technical resources of ILO projects and other UN agencies contributing to the envisioned ONE UN VISION. The three organizations are open to extend the collaboration in order to maximize the impact of their work.

The project seeded actions towards sustainability especially through developing several manuals which could be used in future trainings, updating the labour inspector's procedural manual to include trafficking law no. 64, 2010. In addition, the project contributed to building a pool of advanced labour inspectors who can train and guide their peers. Despite that these actions of sustainability is woven in the project activities, a clear systematic plan of sustainability or an exit strategy is not in place to sustain the results.

The project emphasized the added value and role of the ILO and the project donor in supporting activities of combating human trafficking. The project offers new areas of work for the ILO regarding TIP in capacitating new target groups and in eliminating discrimination in a critical

labour occupation which is domestic work. This impact on enhancing the situation of domestic work will expand if further activities of the project address the stigma around this occupation.

Evaluation Recommendations

R1. It is highly recommended that the ILO and the NCCPIM&TIP re-assess the realistic aspect of the project theory of change to enhance its complementarity and assumptions to achieve change in strengthen the capacity to combat human trafficking.

R2. For future projects, it is highly recommended for the ILO that to multiply the governmental counterparts beside the NCCPIM&TIP The selected partners could include national research centers which are mandated by collecting data, developing studies and other types of knowledge as the National Center for Social and Criminology Research.

R3. It is highly recommended that ILO and NCCPIM&TIP include field visits to the shelters so the NGOs, rural women leaders, media professional and religious leaders along other groups could learn of their services. This will assist in seeding trust in the governmental entities before referring the victims to them emphasizing that shelters usually keep the identities of the people that refer TIP victim cases and the victims themselves anonymous for security reasons.

R4. It is highly recommended that the project allocates resources to host increasing number from targeted groups from governorates other than Cairo and Alexandria which are the scope of the project. This geographical expansion will allow hosting rural women leaders, labour inspectors, religious leaders and other. This recommendation targets the ILO and the donor.

R5. It is recommended that the project along with NCCPIM&TIP organize a follow up training for the rural women leaders. This follow up will be a suitable opportunity to discuss psychological support for victims of TIP; a subject that was highly requested for further elaboration by the respondents to the follow survey.

R6. It is recommended to allocate time during the capacity building sessions to include practical examples for discussion with the participants

R7. It is highly recommended that the planned awareness campaign includes messages to challenge the stigma around domestic work. The message should emphasize how domestic work is a main source of income for many families and the workers should be offered decent work conditions.

R8. It is recommended to the project's donor to approve a no cost extension to continue its activities and emphasize the established relationship with NCCPIM&TIP.

R9. It is recommended that the project advocates for establishing a joint committee between active UN agencies in the field of human trafficking. The committee may include international organizations working in the same filed. to discuss allocation of resources, navigate discussions with NCCPIM&TIP and align activities to ensure non-duplication. The committee can play an important role in advocating for enhancing data collection and accessibility.

R10. It is recommended that the project design an exit strategy highlighting different steps to sustain the project results.

Lessons Learned

Given the challenges faced by the project team to implement some of the activities and to reach the planned targets, the below lessons learned are pinpointed by the evaluation study, to capitalize on for future programming.

LL1. Addressing economic root causes which jeopardize youth and women safety exposing them to risks of falling victims of human trafficking is key to combating human trafficking.

LL2. Reaching to institutions and organizations in governorates other than Cairo and Alexandria provide higher potential to reach TIP victims or postprandial victims with enhanced services.

LL3. Close coordination with national counterparts and involving diverse counterparts with varying mandates can streamline project implementation and align with the broad scope of the project's activities.

Good Practices

The evaluation study revealed good practices, to be maintained, to enhance project's delivery.

1. Building a pool of advanced trained governmental staff who mentor their colleagues on identifying and reporting cases of human trafficking. The project adopted this method with labour inspectors in the Ministry of Labour.
2. Strengthening the capacity of governmental staff extends to assisting in developing visual formats of national documents. The project developed a mind map of the National Referral System (NRM) for human trafficking.

1. Context of the Evaluation

1.1. Project Description

The “Combating Human Trafficking in Egypt” is 36 months (16 June 2021 – 15 June 2024) project funded by the United States Department of State office with a total budget of USD 1,500,000.00. The project addresses the following identified problems: 1) The absence of effective victim identification and referral procedures; 2) A lack of appropriate assistance and reintegration services for victims; 3) A lack of coordination and collaboration among all the key stakeholders with regards to fight against TIP; 4) Insufficient capacity of key governmental and nongovernmental stakeholders to identify victims and refer them for assistance services; 5) Inadequate awareness of the population on how to identify victims of TIP and where to look for help; absence of legal basis to protect DW. Without resolving these problems, using a victim-centered, trauma- and survivor-informed approach, the issue of TIP will remain in Egypt in the current magnitude at best or, more likely, worsen due to the COVID pandemic’s implications on the economy and, as a result, the increasing number of the vulnerable population falling victims to this crime. The project approach is in line with the TIP Office’s prioritized recommendations for Egypt, the Strategy, as well as the Palermo Protocol, and the ILO Conventions C.29, C.105 and C.182, ratified by Egypt.

1.2. Overall & specific objectives of the project

The overall objective of the project is to improve the capacity of the Egyptian Government to combat human trafficking by strengthening the national identification and referral mechanisms (NRM) and providing assistance and reintegration services for identified victims.

Specific Objectives of the project

The project’s logical model and results matrix has been updated to respond to the NCCPIM/TIP requested changes last quarter. The following are the final goal, 2 outcomes and 8 outputs as summarized below:

Goal: Improve the capacity of the Egyptian Government to combat human trafficking

Outcome 1: An effective victim identification system and a national referral mechanism are in place and operational

Output 1.1: Strengthened National Victim Identification system

Output 1.2: Improved awareness and quality of the National Victim Referral Mechanism

Output 1.3. Increased capacity of the relevant stakeholders for identification and referral of victims of human trafficking

Output 1.4. Improved awareness of the importance of legislation relevant to the prevention of human trafficking

Output 1.5. Increased awareness among the population, especially those considered vulnerable to human trafficking, on how to spot the signs of human trafficking and where to look for help

Outcome 2: Improved comprehensive assistance and reintegration services for identified victims using a victim-centered, trauma-informed, and survivor-informed approach

Output 2.1. The number and quality of assistance services for victims of human trafficking are increased

Output 2.2. Socio-economic reintegration of identified victims is facilitated.

Output 2.3. Strengthened support for Egyptian victims of human trafficking abroad

1.3. Management arrangements

The project is managed by a project team in Cairo, Egypt, which comprises a project manager, Monitoring and evaluation consultant and project assistant (however, this position has not been filled for more than 6 months since start of project implementation). The project management team is responsible for the administrative, operational, and technical supervision and implementation of the project interventions. Moreover, the project is supported by ILO Office in Cairo, Egypt for issues related to the technical and administration areas. Additional technical backstopping is also provided by Jean-Marie Kagabo, Programme and Operations Specialist at FUNDAMENTALS, HQ, and Coen Kompier, ILS Specialist in Cairo, Egypt.

2. Evaluation Background

The ILO considers evaluation as an integral part of the implementation of development cooperation activities. The evaluation in the ILO is for the purpose of accountability, learning, implementation improvement and building knowledge. It should be conducted in the context of criteria and approaches for international development assistance as established by the OECD/DAC Evaluation Quality Standard; and the UNEG Code of Conduct for Evaluation in the UN System.

To follow the ILO Policy on Evaluation for Technical Cooperation projects and the Development Cooperation Internal Governance Manual, the project is commissioning this midterm evaluation which was carried out by an independent national consultant following the ILO evaluation procedures. An Evaluation Manager from the project team is designated to oversee and manage the evaluation process.

This evaluation followed the ILO policy guidelines for results-based evaluations Principles, rationale, planning and managing for evaluations 4th edition; and the ILO EVAL Policy Guidelines Checklist 4.6. "Preparing the inception report"; Checklist 4.3. "Data collection method"; and Checklist 4.2. "Preparing the evaluation report". The evaluation also followed the OECD-DAC framework and principles for evaluation. For all practical purposes, this ToR and ILO Evaluation policies and guidelines define the overall scope of this evaluation. Recommendations should be strongly linked to the findings of the evaluation and should provide clear guidance to stakeholders on how they can address them.

2.1. Objectives of the evaluation

This mid-term evaluation reviewed the project relevance, coherence, effectiveness, efficiency, impact and sustainability and made actionable recommendations for the remaining period of the project towards improving delivery and sustainability of outcomes.

The specific objectives of the evaluation are to:

- ▶ Establish the relevance and coherence of the project design and implementation strategy in relation to the national development frameworks, beneficiary needs and ILO and UN policy frameworks and the SDGs.

- ▶ Analyze the implementation strategies regarding their potential effectiveness in achieving the project outcomes, identifying factors affecting project implementation (positively and negatively).
- ▶ Identify unexpected positive and negative results of the project.
- ▶ Assess the extent to which the project outcomes will be sustainable
- ▶ Assess the project immediate and potential long-term impact, with special consideration on the results on capacities of the relevant institutions and target beneficiaries.
- ▶ Identify lessons learned and potential good practices for the key stakeholders.
- ▶ Provide strategic and actionable recommendations for the different key stakeholders to improve implementation of the project activities and attainment of project objectives.
- ▶ Analyze implementation strategies towards achieving the project objectives.
- ▶ Review the institutional capacity for project implementation.
- ▶ Assess the implementation of the project to date.
- ▶ Examine the likelihood of the project achieving its objectives.
- ▶ Review strategies for sustainability of project's results.

2.2. Scope of the evaluation

This mid-term evaluation focused on the project's implementation as of July 2021. It is expected to review and assess all the results and key outputs that have been produced in this period. Geographically, the project implementation notably focused on Greater Cairo and Alexandria, though members from several target groups who work and reside outside the two governorates were invited to attend the trainings. These included members from trade unions and employers, rural women leaders (Raedat Refeyat), staff of the Ministry of Social Solidarity (MoSS) and Oasis Centre affiliated to the public mental health hospital in Abbasiya- Cairo.

The evaluation ensured that ILO's cross-cutting themes - gender equality and non-discrimination (e.g. people with disabilities), social dialogue, international labour standards and fair transition to environmental issues - are taken into consideration as per the EVAL Guidance Note n° 4 and Guidance Note n° 7 to ensure stakeholder participation.

2.3. Clients of the evaluation

The primary users of the evaluation are ILO Cairo Office, ILO HQ and the USDOS J/TIP.

3. Evaluation Criteria and Questions

3.1. Evaluation Criteria

The evaluation followed the ILO Policy Guidelines for Results-based Evaluation (4th ed.)¹. Following the ToR, the evaluation criteria are based on the principles and criteria of evaluation defined by the Development Assistance Committee (DAC) of the Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development (OECD)², namely Relevance and strategic fit, Coherence, Effectiveness of project implementation and management arrangements, Efficiency of resource use, Sustainability and Impact orientation.

Additionally, as per its ToR, the mid-term internal evaluation provided an account of the project's contribution to cross-cutting themes such as human rights, gender dimension and leaving no one behind. To that end, the mid-term evaluation examined the progress of the project and the

¹ ILO (International Labour Organization-2020). ILO Policy Guidelines for Results-based Evaluation. Principles, rationale, planning and managing for evaluations", 4th edition.

² OECD (Organization for Economic Co-operation and Development (2021). Applying Evaluation Criteria Thoughtfully.

internal and external factors which facilitated or limited the achievement of the results. Finally, the mid-term evaluation assessed the extent to which the project considered tripartism, social dialogue, international labor standards and fair transition to environmental sustainability in its design and implementation.

3.2. Evaluation Questions

A set of evaluation questions were presented in the ToR to guide the evaluation, which have been revised by the evaluator, as presented below:

1. Relevance and Strategic Fit

- 1.1. To what extent has the project fit in and compliment with the draft Decent Work Country Programme (DWCP), ILO Country Programme Outcomes (CPOs), UN Strategic Common Framework (UNSCF) and SDGs?
- 1.2. To what extent are the project objectives aligned to beneficiaries needs, policy frameworks and strategies at national level?
- 1.3. Has the project addressed the cross-cutting themes (gender equality and non-discrimination -e.g. people with disabilities-, social dialogue, international labour standards and fair transition to environmental issues in the project document?
- 1.4. To what level the ILO partners have participated in the planning and implementation of the project?

2. Coherence

- 2.1. Was the project theory of change valid and realistic? Has the theory of change adequately integrated effectively external positive and negative factors (risks and assumptions)?
- 2.2. Has the project complemented other government, UN, NGOs, etc. intervention in the project themes?

3. Effectiveness

- 3.1. To what extent have the project objectives been achieved or are expected to be achieved by the end of the project?
- 3.2. Have unexpected positive and negative results took place?
- 3.3. What were the main internal and external factors that influenced the achievement or non-achievement of results?
- 3.4. How far is the management and governance arrangement responsive to achieve project results? Is there a clear understanding of roles and responsibilities by all parties involved?
- 3.5. Is the project receiving the necessary administrative, technical and – if needed – policy support from the ILO Cos and specialists in the field and the responsible technical units in headquarters?
- 3.6. What measures were put in place to identify potential/perceived conflicts? What strategy was adopted to promote conflict-sensitive programming during the implementation?

4. Efficiency

4.1. Have resources (financial, human, technical support, etc.) been allocated strategically and sufficient to achieve the project outputs/outcomes?

4.2. Were the project's activities/operations programmatically and financially in line with the schedule of activities as defined by the project team and work plans? If not, what are the factors that hinder timely delivery and what are the counter measures taken to address these issues?

4.3. Did the project establish and applied for accountability, management and learning a reliable monitoring and evaluation system and risk register during the implementation? Has it integrated key stakeholders as implementers and users??

5. Impact Orientation

5.1. To what extent are the project supported tools, methodologies, and new or improved policies will be institutionalized? What gaps should be addressed?

5.2. Can the project's approach or parts of it, and results be replicated or amplified by national partners or other actors (i.e., ILO constituents) considering the country's institutional and financial dimensions?

6. Sustainability

6.1. Has the project initiated an exit strategy, embedded in the overall delivery, to allow continuation of relevant results? What measures and actions have been put in place to ensure ownership at local, regional and national level? Is the process for handover of the structures clear to all parties and has the responsible authority allocated budget for maintenance?

6.2. To which extent are the results of the intervention likely to have a long term, sustainable positive contribution to the SDG and relevant targets (Explicitly or implicitly)?

7. Cross-cutting Themes

7.1. Within the project's thematic area, what were the facilitating and limiting factors in the project's contribution/potential contribution to gender equality and non-discrimination?

7.2. Has the project taken into account tripartism, social dialogue, international labour standards and a fair transition to environmental sustainability in its design and implementation?

4. Evaluation Methodology

The mid-term evaluation used a qualitative and participatory approach, following ILO's Guidance Note 7: Stakeholder participation. The data collection methods used by the evaluation included: a review of progress technical reports and wider relevant documentation; meetings with the NCCPIM & TIP and national tripartite partners in Cairo, as well as local partners in the governorates of Greater Cairo and Alexandria; interviews with the project team, as well as with ILO experts from FUNDAMENTALS, ILO Cairo Office, and project managers from other ILO projects on TIP; and a stakeholders' workshop to analyze and discuss the evaluation preliminary findings.

4.1 Data collection and analysis methods

The data collection methods used by the evaluation included:

Methodological Briefing

A methodological briefing was held with the project management to shape and define the expectations regarding the mid-term evaluation, as well as to discuss, adapt, and operationalize the main methods of data collection. Specifically, the methodological briefing covered:

Desk Review

The desk review collected information from the various project documents, including the project document, baseline reports, progress reports, monitoring and follow up reports and other relevant documents. The document review extracted information to inform certain of the evaluation questions, as well as guided the design of the data collection tools.

Secondary Quantitative Data

Secondary relevant quantitative data were identified searching for statistical data in databases and follow up surveys.

Semi-structured interviews

Semi-structured interviews were conducted with 20 key informants from:

- The project team: project manager and Monitoring, Evaluation and Learning (MEL) advisor.
- ILO projects aligned with the project: Accelerating action for the elimination of child labour in supply chains in Africa (ACCEL Africa), Better Work ILO Project.
- Development partners active in combating human trafficking in Egypt such as International Organization for Migration (IOM) and United Nation Office on Drugs and Crime (UNODC).
- The national counterpart (NCCPIM & TIP);
- Representatives from entities who have some of their members attending the trainings provided by the project.

The interviews filled gaps in the knowledge emerging from the desk review. The questions for key informants were specifically designed to reveal the extent of the informants' awareness of the project as well as their perception on the short and long-term results (effects) of the project, as well as possible actions to sustain these results.

The interviews were held either remotely, via Zoom platform, or in person.

4.2 Data analysis and reporting

The **qualitative data** collected was stored using note-taking techniques. The notes were subsequently analyzed through content analysis techniques. **Quantitative secondary** data was analyzed using descriptive statistical methods.

4.3 Validation workshop

At the end of data collection period, an online meeting took place, with the project's team and other relevant stakeholders, where preliminary findings and recommendations were presented and discussed. The objective of this meeting was to validate the generated findings, address factual errors, clarify ambiguities or issues of misunderstanding or misinterpretation.

4.4 Cross-cutting issues

The evaluation took into account the integration of cross-cutting elements (human rights-based approach (HRBA), equity and gender equality, based on ILO's Guidance Note 4: Integrating

gender equality in monitoring and evaluation; the Guiding Document Integrating Human Rights and Gender Equality in Evaluations; and the United Nations System Wide Action Plan for Gender Equality and Empowerment of Women (UN-SWAP). Tripartism and international labour standards were also considered in the evaluation, following the ILO's Guidance Note 3.2: Adapting evaluation methods to the ILO's normative and tripartite mandate.

In this regard, the evaluation Included specific evaluation questions to address the issues of gender equality, ILO's normative and tripartite mandate in the design of the evaluation, definition of the respective indicators and sources in the evaluation matrix and their integration in the data collection instruments, as well as in the findings, conclusions and recommendations.

4.5 Limitations of the Evaluation

It was planned to collect data directly from participants who attended the trainings and the awareness raising sessions in order to clarify the obstacles they face in reporting cases of TIP. However, they were replaced by phone interviews or in person with fewer participants than the planned one. The NCCPIM&TIP invited the lead of the departments in the respective ministries which received the trainings. The data collected through interviews with beneficiaries were triangulated with the follow up survey results analyzing the feedback on challenges facing reporting cases.

Though it was also planned to interview rural women leaders (Raedat Refeyat) or conduct a focus group with them, this did not take place as the NCCPIM & TIP did not invite them. The consultant used the results of the follow up survey to analyze their feedback and comments to integrate in this evaluation.

4.4. Ethical considerations

The evaluation complied with ethical guidelines, which were applied at all stages of the evaluation process. Data collection and processing was carried out in full compliance with the United Nations Evaluation Group (UNEG) Ethical Guidelines for Evaluation and its principles, namely:

- Intentionality: consider the usefulness and the need for an evaluation from the beginning.
- Conflict of interests: exercise the commitment to avoid conflicts of interest in all aspects of work, thus maintaining the principles of independence, impartiality, credibility, honesty, integrity, and responsibility.
- Interactions with the participants: appropriate and respectful involvement with the participants in the evaluation processes, maintaining the principles of confidentiality and anonymity and their limitations; dignity and diversity; human rights; gender equality; and damage prevention.
- Evaluation processes and products: ensuring accuracy, integrity, and reliability; inclusion and non-discrimination; transparency; and fair and balanced reports that recognize different perspectives.
- Finding irregularities: discreetly reporting the discovery of any apparent misconduct to a competent body.

The evaluator took the following steps to respect these ethical principles:

- Ensured informed (oral) consent by key informants and beneficiaries.
- Respected confidentiality and anonymity.
- Included specific evaluation questions to address the issues of equity, gender, and human rights in the design of the evaluation, definition of the respective indicators and sources in the evaluation matrix and their integration in the information collection instruments within the scope of the evaluation.

9. Evaluation Findings

9.1 Relevance

This criterion looks at the relevance of the project design in relation to national context in Egypt and assesses the relevance of the implementation approach and the project's contribution to the sustainable development goals (SDGs).

Finding 1: The objectives of the project align with national strategic objectives of combating human trafficking.

Legislatively, Egypt has clearly stated its objectives to combat all forms of human trafficking which were translated at the constitutional level. The anti-trafficking law No. 64 was issued in 2010 emphasized the illegality of human trafficking and the prosecution measures against the different forms of trafficking. On a constitutional level, article 89 of the Egyptian constitution addresses the subject of slavery, oppression, and trafficking stating: *"Slavery and all forms of oppression and forced exploitation against humans are forbidden, as is sex trafficking and other forms of human trafficking, all of which are punishable by law"*.

These legislative commitments were translated in the three consecutive five years' national strategy to combat human trafficking which operationalize the legislative commitments. A main objective in the strategy was capacity-building of the governmental staff to combat trafficking as a crime. This specific objective aligns with the project objective which aims to "Improve the capacity of the Egyptian Government to combat human trafficking".

Egypt established the National Coordinating Committee for Combating and Preventing Illegal Migration and Trafficking in Persons (NCCPIM&TIP) to coordinate the national efforts to combat human trafficking. The interviews with the chairperson of the committee and two members of its secretariat confirmed the alignment, especially that the activities of the project after revisions support the role of the committee in organizing capacity building activities, designing national awareness campaigns or visualizing the national referral mechanism (NRM) which clearly shows the tasks of relevant entities in the system and was distributed in trainings held in the last quarter of 2023.

Simultaneously, the approach of the project, which is victim-centered, aligns with the adopted approach of the national strategy of Egypt to combat and prevent human trafficking (the third strategy 2022-2026) which adopts the 4P approach: Prevention, Prosecution, Protection and Partnership. The activities of the project respond to the first and third pillars as they contribute to capacitating various governmental staff, NGOs, shelter staff and Training and vocational education centers (TVET), provision of technical assistance and awareness raising.

Finding 2: The project partnered with a key governmental entity as a counterpart for implementation although its mandate challenged planned activities.

The project's governmental counterpart is (NCCPIM&TIP). The committee was established in 2017 as an inter-ministerial committee with a mandate to coordinate efforts between national entities and international ones, ensure the effective implementation of the law, capacitate officials concerned with combating the human-trafficking crimes, raise awareness and protect vulnerable groups. The responsibilities of the committee include:

- Coordinating policies, plans and programs to combat and prevent illegal migration and trafficking in human beings at the national and international levels.
- Coordinating efforts to provide care and services to smuggled migrants and to protect witnesses in line with the international obligations arising from the bilateral and multilateral agreements in force in Egypt.
- Promoting public awareness about the dangers of illegal migration and trafficking in human beings.
- Mobilizing the necessary resources to support efforts to combat human trafficking and to support development as a basis for combating illegal migration and human trafficking.
- Presenting alternatives to employment opportunities in Egypt and to support the legitimate migration routes.

The mandate and responsibilities of the committee are wide in scope which qualifies the committee to achieve the national objectives to combat human trafficking. However, the committee focal point requested to cancel some of the planned activities, mainly focused on research and study, and requested the project to provide more hard interventions focused on economic empowerment activities. This shift in the priorities has affected the project's results chain, as some of the planned studies, were aimed to inform other interventions, embracing evidence-based management of the project.

The interviews with the members of the secretariat of the committee highlighted that the changes did not affect the alignment of the objectives between the project and the national ones. Though the project manager emphasized that the research and studies would have better informed all activities, including the capacity building activities, domestic workers activities, developing TIP indicators and national guidelines, and the support to TVET centers and shelters to serve victims and potential victims of TIP.

The counterpart key role also stems from its wide reach to different governmental institutions and non-governmental entities as it is an umbrella coordinating between more than 30 institutes and organizations including the General Federation of Non-Governmental Organizations which in turn coordinates thousands of active NGOs in the country. This wide level of reach and coordination offered the project to capacitate various types of groups beside governmental staff, including NGOs.

Additionally, the committee is a key partner of other UN agencies and bi-lateral organizations as the International Organization for Migration (IOM), the United Nations Organization on Drugs and Crime (UNODC) and the European Union. Interviews with programmatic staff from both IOM and UNODC highlighted that the committee is a partner in their activities to build the capacity of governmental staff in Egypt to combat human trafficking and support victim's protection.

Finding 3: The project adopted a recognized international and national approach which responds to the beneficiaries' needs

As per the project document and the interview with the project manager, it is clear that the project does not implement activities which targets directly victims or potential victims of human trafficking. The activities of the project rather capacitate the staff of entities and institutions which play this role. The project manager clarified that this guides the capacitated staff to focus on the victims when serving them. This approach is positively received by the participants in the trainings and the awareness raising sessions as responses from the follow up survey showed.

The project also responded to the needs of the project beneficiaries as it developed the trade unions and employers' manual based on the beneficiaries' feedback and needs.

The results show that the victim-centered approach shifted the participants' understanding and analysis of the needs and preferences of victims and potential victims of TIP. The participants realized after the training that the safety of victims if referred to protection services might not be guaranteed. This is usually explained by their lack of trust in the governmental entities and the lack of interest of the TIP victim to get support due to fear. There is no particular evidence that the mistrust and fear are addressed in the trainings nor the awareness raising sessions. In interviews with the head of the General Federation of NGOS and MoSS, it was discussed that mainstreaming this approach in the trainings motivated participants, especially NGOs staff, to review their work in relation to protecting and serving TIP victims.

It is important to mention that the victim-centered, trauma- and survivor-informed approach of the project is in line with the TIP Office's prioritized recommendations for Egypt, specifically the recommendation related to increasing efforts to ensure authorities do not inappropriately penalize trafficking victims solely for unlawful acts committed as a direct result of being trafficked, such as immigration irregularities or prostitution offenses.³

The approach is also in line with the proposed solution to combat forms of human trafficking as highlighted in Egypt National Strategy to combat human trafficking, as well as the Palermo Protocol⁴, as well as with the ILO Conventions C.29 (Forced Labour Convention), C.105 (Abolition of Forced Labour Convention) and C.182 (Worst Forms of Child Labour Convention), ratified by Egypt.

Finding 4: The project fits and complements the UN-SDGs and other UN development frameworks

The project contributes to the achievement of several Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs), including Goal 3 "Good Health and Wellbeing" as it targets health and social workers who deal directly with victims of TIP, offering health and psychosocial services especially in shelters.

³ [2023 TIP REPORT RELEASE - U.S. Embassy in Egypt \(usembassy.gov\)](https://usembassy.gov/2023-tip-report-release/)

⁴ A United Nations (UN) protocol to prevent, suppress and punish trafficking in human beings , especially women and children, supplementing the UN Convention against Transnational Organized Crime and its Protocols . Source: [Protocol to Prevent, Suppress and Punish Trafficking in Persons Especially Women and Children, supplementing the United Nations Convention against Transnational Organized Crime | OHCHR](#)

It also contributes to achieving, Goal 8 “Decent Work and Economic Growth” by raising the awareness of employers and trade unions on the international labour standards related to labour hours, vacations, health and occupation in the workplace and other standards which guarantee the rights of the workers. The project’s manager also confirmed that raising awareness related to the international labour standards is a core theme of all capacity building provided to the project’s beneficiaries and recipients.

The activities of the project specifically contribute to target 8.7 which take immediate and effective measures to eradicate forced labour, end modern slavery and human trafficking and secure the prohibition and elimination of the worst forms of child labour, including recruitment and use of child soldiers, and by 2025 end child labour in all its forms. This is translated in the activities to capacitate labour inspectors which result in guaranteeing that the decent aspects of work are followed in all workplaces. In addition, the project contributes to Goal 10 “Reduced Inequalities” specifically by seeking to regulate domestic work through voluntary contacts.

The project design and activities also align with SDG 16, “Peace, justice and strong institutions especially” and target 16.2 to end abuse, exploitation, trafficking and all forms of violence and torture against children.

9.2 Coherence

This criterion evaluates the coherence between paths of change drawn by the project and if the gaps in combating human trafficking will be bridged by these paths. It also looks at the assumptions that guided the design of activities.

Finding 5: The project was initially designed based on valid identified gaps, however, the governmental counterpart had a change in their priorities due to contextual changes

The project document highlighted four gaps in combating human trafficking in Egypt. These gaps were used as a base to design the project outcomes, outputs and activities. While the gaps as discussed here are considered valid, the priority of addressing them has changed due to several reasons. The most important, as highlighted by the chairperson of NCCPIM&TP, is that the project started in the direct follow-up period of COVID-19 which created economic and social pressures on multiple potential victims of TIP. Hence, the necessity of re-ordering the priorities, especially that the Prime minister, in a recent meeting with the committee, emphasized the necessity to provide economic disadvantaged with support to alleviate poverty. As these groups are potential victims for traffickers, the chairperson emphasized the importance to capacitate national institutions to achieve this goal.

The interviews with national entities such as MoL and MoSS, trade unions and FEI, confirmed the same trend, emphasizing that capacity building and awareness raising activities should fill the gap in operationalizing the NRM. In the interviews, the preference was to prioritize addressing economic hurdles of potential or actual victims of trafficking, so that they avoid being trafficked.

Mostly, the first identified gap was the absence of an effective victim identification system, clear TIP indicators, and referral mechanism to support the first liners successfully and accurately identify cases. This gap causes at times victims to be convicted for unlawful acts traffickers force them to commit, will ultimately be bridged by the coordinated efforts of the committee and the continuous offering of capacity building, and technical expertise on TIP indicators for case identification.

This gap was confirmed during the discussions with representatives of the entities interviewed for this evaluation, including the representative of the Ministry of Labour (MoL) who manages the labour inspection department. It was highlighted that this gap exists due to lack of awareness of the trafficking law in Egypt. This was also confirmed in the follow up exercise with the labour inspectors who highlighted that the trainings clarified their role in the referral system, although they are still to receive guidance and forms to apply during their inspections. The interviewed representative from MoL clarified that the trainings were the first step to capacitate the inspectors to identify cases of human trafficking for prosecutors to proceed and enforce the law.

The following gaps are identified thanks to interviews with the NCCPIM&TIP, governmental entities, FEI, trade unions as valid but of higher priorities, requiring actions to narrow :

- *The exclusion of domestic workers (DW) from Egypt's labor law, which makes them highly vulnerable to Forced Labor (FL), as well as to physical, sexual, and psychological abuse.*

The chairperson of the NCCPIM&TIP emphasized that this gap should be of higher importance as many women and girls could be potential victims of human trafficking due to the nature of their work. It was emphasized in this interview that guiding women and girls towards other economic activities might be better.

- *The lack of assistance services provided to victims of TIP, in particular the lack of specialized shelters, limited number of places there, the lack of adequately trained staff to receive victims of TIP in unspecialized shelters, lack of mid-term or long-term options for victims who continue to need assistance, inadequate funding, and exclusion of male and non-Egyptian victims from the existing services.*

This specific gap is highly confirmed by two representatives from the Ministry of Social Solidarity (MoSS). One of them joined the international visit to the Netherlands organized by the project. The MoSS representative highlighted that the visit informed current efforts of Egypt to establish a new shelter for TIP victims.

- *The lack of socio-economic reintegration services for victims of TIP.*

All interviews with NCCPIM&TIP, ministries, workers and employers' organization, national councils and religious leaders conveyed the conviction that the major root cause of TIP is the lack of decent work, and many trafficked victims are at risk of being re-trafficked due to inability to find work which secure livelihood of victims or potential ones. Thus, this particular gap is of high priority to address.

Despite re-shifting the priority of certain gaps, there is still the challenge of lack of data, especially on the number of victims or potential victims of TIP, their profiles and the skills they need. As the project manager highlighted, the fourth gap would have been better addressed if quality data were available. The partial availability of data was also confirmed by the baseline study conducted by the project, which recommended increasing accessibility and quality of data.

Finding 6: Though the Egyptian counterpart confirmed that the project's theory of change is valid and responds to the identified gaps, its pathway for change is considered challenging to follow

Initially, the project document introduced a theory of change focusing on five paths of change: 1) improving the national victims' identification system and NRM, (2) building the capacity of relevant stakeholders while strengthening the cooperation concerning victim identification and

referral, (3) improving the coverage and enforcement of the relevant legislation for the prevention of TIP, including amendment of the labor law and drafting a law covering DW, underpinned by the ratification of C.189 and P.29, (4) raising awareness of the population on how to identify victims of TIP and the existing services, and (5) providing comprehensive assistance and socio-economic reintegration services for identified victims to experience faster physical, psychological and social recovery, and to build resilience against being re-trafficked.

These paths are confirmed as valid by the chairperson of the NCCPIM&TIP as combating TIP requires enhancing collaboration and coordination between multiple partners, including governmental and non-governmental organizations. However, the committee confirmed that, given the economic situation in the country, hard interventions targeting enhancing the financial resilience of the targeted cases are more of priority, compared to studies and knowledge production. However, the committee perceives the project budget as insufficient to cover all economic empowerment interventions. Some of the evaluation respondents recommended to focus on paths 2, 3 and 5. The project management still insisted that the five pathways of change are relevant and valid, insisting that a more fluid and effective collaboration with the government counterparts will enable the attainment of the desired changes.

Finding 7: The theory of change neglected the impact of social factors

While the project's ToC is centered around institutional capacity building to combat TIP, the social factors which serve as main catalysts for TIP, such as economic vulnerability or social and gender exclusion, were not considered. The discussion with representatives from the different ministries, NCCM, NGOs and trade unions revealed their conviction that the phenomenon has social dimensions. The representative of the trade unions explained that many families justify contractual marriages of their daughters or encouraging irregular migration of young men because of their need to change their social and economic status. Thus, the socio-economic services should reach all family members of potential victims of TIP with specific focus to combat irregular migration.

Finding 8: The socio-economic pillar of the ToC complements the work of ILO and other UN agencies to combat TIP.

The interview with IOM Egypt highlighted the focus of its activities on providing protection services to victims of human trafficking. This is usually conducted through the capacity building of the staff of MoSS shelters which host the victims of HT or introducing international best practices to support victims to Egyptian counterparts such as NCCPIM&TIP.

The organization also works with the NCCPIM&TIP, as well as other national entities such as the National council for Women (NCW), the National council for Childhood and Motherhood (NCCM) and the National Council for Human Rights (NCHR), to enhance the mechanisms of recording and reporting human trafficking cases. These efforts are funded through an EU-funded project to enhance the protection offered to HT victims. Thus, the efforts by the combating human trafficking project by the ILO complement the IOM efforts along with other UN agencies such as the UNODC, which focuses on improving prosecution efforts. The combating human trafficking project of the ILO also complements thematically the efforts of the UNODC through enhancing the role of the labour inspectors. The inspectors are the main players in identifying cases of forced labour, worst forms of child labour and sexual exploitation. As highlighted in the interview with UNODC, the combined efforts should enhance the reporting of TIP cases once the NRM is operationalized.

At the same time, the HT project complements the work of two other projects in ILO Egypt: ACCEL Egypt, which works to end child labour, and Better Work Egypt, which focuses on applying the international labour standards and make sure factories abide by them in the textile and garment industry in Egypt. The interviews with the two projects' management revealed that the joint activities between the projects, which offered capacity building workshops to trade unions, employers and labour inspectors, led to expanding the geographical outreach of the HT project while offering participants a wider understanding of human trafficking as a crime. The interview with ACCEL Egypt explained that the complementarity of efforts assisted in creating a mutual opportunity for learning for both projects, as well as maximizing project resources.

9.3 Effectiveness

The findings look at the progress of the project, the effect of the project's activities factors contributing to the progress.

Finding 9: The project exceeded planned targets in capacity building as the counterpart considered these targets a priority, however, many activities, with focus on research were canceled or delayed.

Despite the repeated changes in the governmental counterpart's priority agenda, affecting the project activities since its launch, **the project is on track to achieve its planned targets** especially under outcome (1). As shown in Annex (3), the project has exceeded the planned target in relation to the number of trainings for certain groups to address protection issues. For example, the project managed to exceed the planned number of TIP victims identified under protection victim support to reach **1,641** cases identified, compared to the targeted **100** cases, this is according to results from **194** survey conducted with first liner trainees supported by the project. However, other trainings such as the NCW and MOSS case workers trainings are still delayed. For the detailed percentages on the achieved targets as of December 31st, 2023, please refer to annex 3.

The project managed to replace the canceled activities, mainly related to the studies, to ensure reaching the project's ultimate goal. For example, the team added the activities titled "Conducting a regional conference on sharing best practices and experiences in the provision of integrated protection systems for victims of trafficking", replacing several activities initially planned such as Activitiy 1,2, and sub-interventions under activity #4.

A main reason for progress is the doubling of the number of trainings conducted under the protection theme. As explained by the project manager, the focus of NCCPIM&TIP is to conduct training for various groups which expanded the target groups of the project reaching new groups such as religious leaders. The chairperson of NCCPIM&TIP emphasized that the capacity building of other groups beside the governmental staff is also a priority in the current period to increase the societal awareness on the forms of human trafficking. These groups include religious leaders, rural women leaders (Raedat Refeyat) and media personnel . This expansion was included in the recommendation provided by the baseline study conducted by the project to include NGOs active in combating TIP and hot line operators of the national councils which receive reports on potential TIP victims or by victims themselves in the capacity building activities . The three councils are the National Council for Women (NCW), the National Council for Childhood and Motherhood (NCCM) and the National Council for Human Rights (NCHR).

Under outcome 1, the project reached or exceeded social workers, NCCM and rural women awareness sessions targets. The project also completed activities and exceeded its target in terms of the number of MoSS members responsible for the shelters, NCCPIM&TIP staff and Administrative Control Authority members, visiting selected shelters in the Netherlands.

At the same time, there are trainings and awareness raising sessions in progress with the following target groups: health workers, religious leaders, Labour inspectors, Media professionals, employers' organizations.

Finding 10: The project effectively supported its partners with technical assistance

The project assisted its counterparts and other national entities through various technical inputs which will lead to enhancing the context of protecting and supporting victims or potential victims of TIP. These efforts are well recognized by the Egyptian counterparts and considered timely. This included:

- Providing inputs to the voluntary DW contract regulating the relationship between employers and domestic workers until new labour laws covering domestic work are adopted. The inputs were guided by the convention 189 and its recommendations.
- The project team engaged in the first process of drafting the domestic worker's law led by the Ministry of Social Solidarity (MoSS). In coordination with the ILO HQ, Cairo office provided comments to MoSS on the law to better align it with the International Labour Standards (ILS).
- The project led lobbying activities such as for Egypt's ratification of P. 29: The ILO has approached the MoL and NCCPIM&TIP to explore the ratification of P. 29.
- Additionally, the project is in the process of working with labour inspectors on how to operationalize their role in the national referral mechanism. This will enable inspectors to identify and refer possible trafficking victims during inspections. Hence, NCCPIM&TIP will be able to produce statistics on forced labour cases for the first time.
- The MoL shared the draft labour law with the ILO for comments, the project team included comments regarding forced labour, the need to include a definition of forced labour and worst forms of child labour stated in conventions 29 and 182. As well as the need to outline and provide details of the consequences or punishment that will be enforced for perpetrators of forced labour.

Finding 11: The project introduces policy makers to international best practices which contribute to building their capacity to identify and refer cases of TIP.

The project offered and is planning multiple activities to introduce policy makers and governmental executives, including the staff in the NCCPIM&TIP, to international best practices to combat TIP and reintegrate the victims. This includes the field visit to the Netherlands which was conducted in the second year of the project, the planned Regional Conference on sharing best practices and experiences in the provision of integrated protection systems for victims of trafficking and the translation of the "Global guide on the prevention of FL through lifelong learning and skills development approaches" and "Global guide on the Economic Reintegration of Victims of FL through skills and lifelong learning" along with the training delivered by the ILO-ITC (International Training Center) on the same topics.

As clarified in an interview with one of the MoSS staff, it was highlighted that the learning will be useful during the process of establishing a new TIP shelter in Egypt. The NCCPIM&TIP interviews highlighted that the regional conference would provide exchange of experiences and learnings which will better inform national actions toward combating TIP; especially that several national policy makers will be invited.

Finding 12: Research studies, originally planned to inform other project's activities, were not considered by the government counterpart as a priority in the current situation, hence, the studies were canceled upon NCCPIM&TIP request.

The initial design of the project included several activities to conduct studies and research in the field of human trafficking. These studies would have enhanced the body of knowledge around the subject, contribute to the gaps in knowledge and potentially provided further data.

The quality and management of data is a crucial obstacle as highlighted in the baseline study which recommended data collection standardization in relation to TIP. In an interview with IOM, it was shared that there was an effort by an EU project to synchronize the databases of the three hotlines that receive reports of HT. However, the three entities which operate the hotlines (NCW, NCCM and NCHR) resisted the idea explaining that each has its own set of data which is used for multiple purposes not only human trafficking.

The lack of data is a major challenge faced by all active organizations in combating human trafficking as revealed in interviews with IOM and UNDOC.

The studies and research work would have better informed several other activities of the project and enhanced the final deliverables. In the interview with the project counterpart, the NCCPIM&TIP, they stated that the priorities were shifted, replacing knowledge production and research with activities addressing the socio-economic root causes of TIP in Egypt, which is primarily, the spread of poverty.⁵ The chairperson of the committee emphasized that given the current social and economic situation in Egypt, research work on HT is not the most urgent priority.

Finding 13: ILO involvement in combating TIP presented an added value

As discussed in several interviews, the involvement of the ILO through this project in combating HT provided a crucial added value. First, the Ministry of labour highlighted the benefits of the advanced training of labour inspectors. Second, the Ministry of social solidarity confirmed that the re-integration activities fill an important gap in serving the victims of TIP. Third, the NCCPIM&TIP confirmed the importance of the interventions on lobbying for DW rights as well as on the visibility of the NRM. Interviews with the IOM and UNODC clarified that the ILO involvement added a new angle through focusing on forced labour and ILS.

The project allowed ILO and NCCPIM&TIP to reach a wide range of target groups. This expanded the usual network of NCCPIM&TIP to include trade unions, employers, religious

⁵ These challenges are:

- Critical international political situation due to the armed conflicts in areas surrounding Egypt,
- New forms of TIP through electronic platforms;
- Lack of protection of DW;
- Difficulties in using quantitative indicators;
- Lack of public awareness of the different forms of HT.

leaders, labour inspectors and labor attaches. The ILO in this project is also expanding its groundwork through working with rural women leaders (Raedat Refeyat) . These are front liners in combating human trafficking. The NCCPIM&TIP interviews highlighted the expansion of work to these groups as a positive action in combating TIP.

A major value added of ILO, is the angle of economic reintegration through working with TVET centers. This area of work is not usually targeted by other international organization in Egypt active in combating human trafficking. If planned properly and systematically, this contribution will help solving a root cause of human trafficking which is lack of access to income generation activities as highlighted in many interviews.

Finding 14: The project addressed indirectly cross-cutting themes such as gender equality and non-discrimination.

The project does not have a clear output that directly addresses gender inequality or social discrimination. However, several of its outputs and activities contribute to changing gender dynamics and reducing social discrimination.

None of the interviews conducted with representatives of governmental or non-governmental institutes nor the feedback received in the follow up exercise revealed specific discussions about gender inequalities or social discrimination. An impeded assumption in many responses to the follow up exercise is that youth from marginalized communities is a primary target of illegal migration exposing them to human traffickers. Rural women leaders (Raedat Refeyat) in the follow-up exercise referred to family exploitation of their girls exposing them to contractual marriages. The responses of the rural women leaders (Raedat Refeyat) indicated that women or girls who report to hot lines or are placed in the shelters are socially risky and stigmatized.

Additionally, the results of the follow up survey revealed that the rural women leaders (Raedat Refeyat) played an impactful role in their communities, strengthening women's contribution to awareness raising related to the topic. The survey's results confirmed that the rural women leaders (Raedat Refeyat) delivered 2 to 4 awareness sessions monthly with a minimum of 50 participants per session in their local communities in Alexandria. One of the RRs explained that after the awareness session she did several sessions in different districts of Alexandria where she talked with homeless children and convinced them to go to the police. **The women leaders** also conducted door knocking campaigns in their communities.

Though the project does not have a gender strategy, its contribution towards this goal is embedded in its activities. First, the project targeted rural women leaders (Raedat Refeyat) who are working closely with the MoSS about HT. Several awareness-raising sessions targeted rural women leaders (Raedat Refyat). This group has direct access to families especially women and girls in rural areas who are vulnerable and at risk of human trafficking. A member of the technical secretariat of the NCCPIM&TIP elaborated that rural women leaders (Raedat Refyat) can influence the understanding of the public on the negative effects of TIP.

Additionally, the project targets enhancing the work conditions of domestic workers. In Egypt, most of the domestic workers are women who work long hours and do not have social or health security.⁶ These kinds of jobs are usually handed off to lower-income women and other

⁶ [Nermine El Saadany](#) (2021). Egyptian Women & Labor Force: Challenges and Opportunities, [Egyptian Women & Labor Force: Challenges and Opportunities | Wilson Center](#)

marginalized groups who perform paid domestic labor, often in dire conditions.⁷ Working in isolation behind closed doors, they are particularly vulnerable to exploitation and often not covered by labor laws. In Egypt, for example, Article 4 of the labor law (Law 12/2013) explicitly excludes domestic workers from its scope of regulation, singling them out as an “exception” because of “the strong relations that grow between the servant and the employer.” In framing this relationship as a personal and private bond rather than a conventional labor relationship, the law insinuates that domestic work is not “proper work”. The MoL is currently drafting a new law for domestic work.

The project organized a consultation in cooperation with UN-Women and the MoSS to identify need gaps and prioritizing lobbying to advance the labour rights of domestic workers. The ILO is currently working on the messages of the awareness raising campaign. These activities contribute indirectly to reducing gender inequalities.

9.4 Efficiency

This criterion assesses the efficient use of resources available for the project and actions taken to assert accountability.

Finding 15: The project resources (financial, human, technical support) are allocated strategically and sufficiently to achieve its outputs/outcomes

Despite the multitude of activities, stakeholders and the diversity between capacity building, workshops to influence policy making, awareness raising and conducting international visits, it is believed that the project resources are well allocated as per the project team. Nevertheless, the interview with the NCCPIM&TIP revealed that financial resources would have been better allocated to increase the number of capacity building trainings and workshops especially in other governorates. The committee is well aware that the scope of the project is Cairo and Alexandria, but multiple forms of HT occur in governorates with high rural population. An immediate action was taken by the project to accommodate participants from outside Cairo and Alexandria, which contributed to reaching multiple groups.

Finding 16: The timeline of the project is not followed due to extended time needed to acquire security clearance and delays caused by NCCPIM&TIP’s close involvement in the project implementation.

The interview with the committee revealed their awareness of this delay factor and how it affects the implementation of several activities. However, the interviewed members of the technical secretariat in the NCCPIM&TIP explained that they worked closely with the project manager to bypass this obstacle though it was difficult to receive clearance for certain studies and research activities. The interviews with other UN agencies as IOM and UNODC revealed that similar delays occurred while coordinating activities with the committee.

The committee explained the requests for changes in activities in light of the government incline towards enhancing services rather than conducting research and studies. The project services and activities, as per the government priorities, should better serve alleviating economic conditions of potential victims of trafficking.

⁷ Nada Wahba (2022). Improving the Conditions of Domestic Workers in Egypt

The interviews with IOM and UNODC emphasized the involvement of the committee in organizing and supervising the proceedings of all capacity building activities. The same high involvement is also highlighted by the project manager and in many of the interviews conducted as part of this evaluation. As the chairperson of the committee usually attends the opening of most of the trainings and awareness sessions, this may lead to changes in scheduled activities. A fact that was not denied by the secretariat of the committee, though they consider this high-profile representation is considered necessary.

Finding 17: The changes in the project timelines affected the delivery rate of the project

Due to the repeated revisions of activities and changes, the project has spent around 30% (403,898.78 USD out of 1.5 million USD) of the allocated budget. In addition, the start date of the project shifted by a year due to delays in security clearance. As discussed with the project manager and the NCCPIM&TIP, the delayed activities and the newly requested ones are of high interest to several national entities and will increase the capacity of staff in these entities to protect victims of HT. Thus, they highly recommend a project extension to allow these activities to be planned and conducted.

Finding 18: The collaboration with UN agencies and ILO projects combined financial and human support which maximized resources, facilitated implementation and avoided duplications.

Both IOM and UNODC offer capacity building support to different first liners such as social workers, labour inspectors, criminal justice practitioners, national council, media professionals and civil society. Development partners also support awareness raising on TIP through funding media campaigns, besides delivery of direct assistance to TIP victims including financial support, in kind and food vouchers, legal assistance, education, livelihood activities and resettlement.

As discussed in interviews with the project manager, two of ILO projects and UN agencies (IOM, UN-Women and UNODC) organized joint activities with the project especially in its first year. This led to increasing the diverse technical inputs, emphasizing the ILO value to the efforts to combat human trafficking while combining financial resources to reach multiple target groups. The project manager explained that this allowed extended collaboration with other projects in the ILO, mainstreaming TIP in their implementation, as well as with other UN agencies where mutual technical knowledge was shared extensively such as mainstreaming ILS and FL.

This mutual collaboration also covered other shortages in the project staff due to the changes in the project assistant position. The same approach of collaboration was applied while holding joint activities with other ILO projects such as ACCEL Africa and Better Work. In the interviews with both projects, it was highlighted that the HT project introduced a crucial component to the training events in relation to combatting trafficking in persons, its forms and indicators, as well as referrals of VoTs.

Finding 19: The project established and applied accountability, management and learning as a reliable monitoring and evaluation system during implementation

The project introduced several efforts to test the assumptions of the project and to closely monitor its progress. The project allocated resources to hire an M&E advisor and assigned several tasks to the project assistant to assist in monitoring exercises. This led to creating a solid but revolving results-based framework clarifying all steps of monitoring and evaluation. Additionally, the project conducted a baseline study which confirmed the assumptions and gaps which the project aims to address.

Most importantly, the project created a crucial monitoring exercise to follow up with participants of the awareness raising and capacity building sessions and workshops. This is something the ILO only does amongst other UN agencies, in an attempt to overcome the lack of data on TIP. The follow up collected data on the impacts of the trainings and the actions taken by participants, informing adjustments to the design of such activities.

The follow up surveys ensured that the project received direct feedback and comments on the progress of the learning of the targeted groups. The project manager confirmed that the results are shared with the national counterpart to guarantee the full learning cycle.

9.5 Impact Orientation

The evaluation assesses the impact created by the project's activities.

Finding 20: The capacity building offered to multiple target groups enhanced their knowledge of forms of TIP

Both results of the follow up survey and evaluation interviews with governmental and non-governmental entities highlighted the impacts of the project training and awareness-raising activities on their participants' perception and understanding of human trafficking and how to identify, reach-out and support its victims. Indeed, trainees from various groups stated that, before the training, their main understanding of human trafficking was limited to organ trafficking, and that their understanding changed after the training, when they started to better identify human tracking cases in their communities. Participants added that after the training they were also able to differentiate between work irregularities and minor violations to the labour law, domestic violence and human trafficking cases. The participants from different entities who participated in the capacity building activities also carried forward the knowledge gained in their workplaces.

Further impact is expected through implementing the planned activities in the last year of the project precisely the: a) the capacitating of Technical and Vocational Education and Training (TVET) centers and NGOs to conduct VT programs for victims of TIP in line with a victim-centered, trauma- and survivor-informed approach and, b) the services to be provided to TIP victims. Both activities will equip service providers, victims and potential victims of TIP with better accessibility to information, services and skills.

Additionally, the project managed to reach multiple active players in combating TIP outside Cairo. These included trainings offered to trade union members and the rural women leaders (Raedat Refeyat). This expanded outreach is deemed necessary as revealed in the discussion with the governmental counterpart as cases of TIP increase in rural areas especially in upper Egypt.

Finding 21: Follow-up actions taken by some of the participants in the capacity-building sessions improved awareness of TIP forms and necessary actions to report cases.

The interviews with representatives from the entities trained under the capacity building component of the project revealed that some participants planned or even took follow-up actions after their training. The head of the NGOs Federation explained that an NGO is mobilizing funds and resources to establish a shelter for victims of TIP. Some of the religious leaders who attended the training held specific sessions that presented the crime and its contradiction to religious beliefs. A journalist who writes for a widely read newspaper in Egypt shared that he

wrote an article presenting the legislations that criminalize human trafficking. All interviews confirmed that capacity building is crucial to learning about the legislation but follow-up actions in collaboration with the project will confirm the learnings.

Members of the General Federation of NGOs mentioned that they established a Union for Irregular Migration and Human Trafficking and organized awareness sessions to approximately 1,000 young people. Another example is of a journalist, member of the Journalists committee, and Rapporteur of the Freedoms Committee at the Journalists Syndicate who extended the knowledge acquired from the training to 1,000+ youth through seminars and media channels. Also, the deputy of the General Federation of NGOs in Alexandria conducted six awareness sessions following the training, targeting over 900 youth.

A successful positive result was also revealed in the interview with the Better Work project of the ILO which is the training of the compliance and HR staff of certain employers' organizations on combatting human trafficking. As a result of the trainings attended by employers which focused on prevention of human trafficking in company human resources policies, three of the attendees worked within their companies to change internal policies to mainstream obligations and penalties against human trafficking. The three companies work in the textile and garment industries employing hundreds of workers.

Finding 22: The activities of the project will contribute to changing the stigma of DW

The project will also impact the perceptions around domestic work enhancing the conditions of domestic workers. This started by the introduced contribution to provide feedback on the voluntary contract to be in line with convention 189 and its recommendations, the awareness raising campaign and will be one of the points to be discussed in the regional activity planned. The project has also distributed the DW's voluntary contract, developed by NCCPIM&TIP, in the rural women leaders' (Raedat Refeyat) trainings as well as the trade unions trainings.

9.6 Sustainability

This criterion assesses the actions taken by the project to sustain its results.

Finding 23: The project is on track of sustaining its effects through knowledge production and dissemination

A set of activities are planned in 2024, to finalize and publish knowledge materials including:

- ▶ Finalize and publish a manual for trade unions to raise their awareness on trafficking in persons and to be able to cascade the knowledge to other workers in different sectors.
- ▶ Finalize and publish a manual for labour attaches to help them in their day-to-day work of identifying and referring victims of trafficking in the different countries they are posted in.
- ▶ Finalize and publish a manual for employers to raise their awareness on trafficking in persons and to be able to cascade the knowledge to others.
- ▶ Finalize and publish a training manual for labour inspectors.

In addition, it is planned to develop an annex to the employers' manual, a Q&A manual combining all the relevant anti-trafficking laws for employers to be able to protect their businesses. These materials will enrich the body of knowledge in Arabic and disseminate knowledge around combating and preventing HT.

Another aspect of sustainability is the training for trainers (ToT) provided for the labour inspectors. This ToT raised their capacity to guide their colleagues and mentor them. Those inspectors who received advanced training are full time employees and will continue their training and mentoring roles inside the ministry.

Finding 24: Though the project original design lacks an exit strategy, it is proceeding with actions to sustain its results

The design of the project along with the reviewed activities lay the grounds for sustainability. Currently, the project does not have an exit strategy however, as clarified in the interview with NCCPIM&TIP, they are open to discuss the follow ups after the conclusion of the project. The delay in drafting an exit strategy is caused by the multiple delays and changes faced by the project at the beginning. The potential exit strategy includes handing over structured materials to be used in future capacity building activities, translated international guidelines, built capacities of hundreds of governmental staff, workers and employers on identifying and referring to TIP victims.

On the other hand, for future project's design, it is essential to **embed several sustainability measures in the project with a clear exit strategy, adopted and implemented since the start of the project**, to ensure the continuation of the gains and benefits created through the project's delivery. This includes the below potential measures:

- ▶ Establish and strengthen a multistakeholders working groups composed of different entities, trained and capacitated by the project, to continue with the follow up on cases identification and referrals, after the project's closure. This medium should carry on knowledge and experience sharing through regular meetings, to discuss any challenges, with the staff already supported during the project's implementation and extend necessary support. This working group should be supervised and headed by one part to ensure ownership and accountability.
- ▶ Strengthen the civil society capacity to enhance access to basic services to TIP cases, after the project's closure, to ensure extended support, beyond the project's duration.

10. Conclusions

Relevance and Coherence

The Combating Human Trafficking in Egypt project has clear relevance to national interests and objectives of the country to combat the different forms of trafficking in persons. There is a rising need to capacitate service provision entities as shelters of TIP, organizing awareness raising campaigns and providing vocational education to potential victims of TIP. This led to changing the priorities of gaps to address. The project was designed based on four gaps: a) the absence of an effective victim identification system and referral mechanism, b) the domestic workers (DW) are excluded from Egypt's labor law, c) lack of assistance services provided to victims of TIP, in particular lack of specialized shelters, and d) the lack of socio-economic reintegration services for victims of TIP. Mostly, the last three of these gaps were of more relevance than the first one. These gaps in particular aim to enhance services and their accessibility; thus, the project was successful in selecting the victim-approach and the trauma centered approach. Adopting this approach allowed the participants in the trainings and the awareness raising sessions to highlight challenges in referring victims to services which included lack of trust in the governmental procedures, fear of social stigma and lack of confidence in securing the privacy of victims.

This changes in priority of gaps affected the pathways of change planned by the project theory of change. The implementation of the project activities revealed several challenges to the pathways of change and assumptions of the theory of change. The first is the national focus on provision of direct social and economic services to potential victims as a mean to reduce cases of TIP. This led to interrupting or changing the paths seeking to operationalize the NRM to enhance the referring procedures. These changes in priorities, along with the clear focus of the counterpart on delivering training and awareness raising to various groups, require revisiting the developed theory of change.

Effectiveness

The project has exceeded its targets in relation to capacity building offered to certain groups and in progress in relation to other groups. Several of the activities planned to achieve Outcome (2) are still to start. This outcome focuses on enhancing services of shelters, economic reintegration through capacitating staff of TVET centers along with capacitating social workers, health workers and NGO staff when dealing with TIP victims.

The participants either in trainings or awareness raising sessions shared knowledge acquired in the sessions or planning actions which should further raise the awareness of different forms of human trafficking. These continued efforts will allow increased momentum in the society and potentially assist in defining new solutions, especially if the activities of the project hosted more participants from wider geographical locations than Cairo and Alexandria which are the main scope of the project.

Efficiency

The project activities were delayed for two main reasons; first is the extended time to acquire security clearances to conduct planned studies and the second was the repeated rescheduling of activities to be held when NCCPIM&TIP staff are free because they must be involved in all activities. Nevertheless, the project was successful in compensating this delay by collaborating in activities with other UN agencies or ILO projects besides brainstorming with the national counterpart on developing new activities which should achieve the project's objectives. However, implementing these activities would require a new timeline to implement them using the remaining budget.

The project is playing a crucial role in mobilizing joint human and technical resources of ILO projects and other UN agencies contributing to the envisioned ONE UN VISION⁸. The three organizations are open to extending the collaboration in order to maximize the impact of their work.

Impact and Sustainability

The project seeded actions towards sustainability especially through developing several manuals which could be used in future trainings, updating the labour inspector's procedural manual to include trafficking law no. 64, 2010. In addition, the project contributed to building a pool of advanced labour inspectors who can train and guide their peers. Despite the fact that these actions of sustainability are woven into the project activities, a clear systematic plan of sustainability or an exit strategy is not in place to sustain the results.

⁸ The ILO and the UN System [The ILO and the UN system | International Labour Organization](#)

Ultimately, the project emphasized the added value and role of the ILO and the project donor in supporting activities of combating human trafficking. The project offers new areas of work for the ILO in capacitating new target groups and in eliminating discrimination in a critical labour occupation which is domestic work. This impact on enhancing the situation of domestic work will expand if further activities of the project address the stigma around this occupation.

11. Lessons Learnt & Good Practices

Lessons Learnt

Lesson Learnt (1): *Addressing economic causes of human trafficking through offering TVET training for potential victims of TIP.*

Since 2016, the Egyptian economy has encountered notable instability, affecting the government's developmental goals and expectations. The Egyptian pound's repeated devaluation, combined with challenges from international incidents like the COVID-19 pandemic and the conflict between Russia and Ukraine, all affected negatively the Egyptian economy. These hurdles expose youth and women to various forms of exploitation especially in workplaces. This, combined to lack of knowledge of the public of forms of human trafficking and reporting channels, raises the necessity to address economic root causes which jeopardize youth and women safety exposing them to risks of falling victims to human trafficking.

Lesson Learnt (2): *Reaching to institutions and organizations in governorates other than Cairo and Alexandria provide higher potential to reach TIP victims or potential victims with enhanced services.*

Though confirmed data sources in Egypt are rare in relation to number of TIP victims and their geographical distribution, there is an assumption that cases of TIP exist in other governorates than Cairo and Alexandria. Following Cairo, Giza and Alexandria, the other governorates include Aswan, Dakhliya, Qualubiya, Assiut, Gharbiya, Minia, Menoufia, Kafr El Sheikh, Matruh, Al-Sharkia, Port Said and Behira. This necessitates capacitating governmental staff and service providers in these governorates. Thus, an important lesson learnt emerging from the project is to include participants from national institutions, NGOs, private sector, and trade unions from these governorates in the trainings offered by the ILO's project in the field of combating TIP. There is usually limited financial and human resources available to capacitate governmental staff and service providers in governorates on combating human trafficking.

This approach expands the outreach to public in several governorates but will necessitate allocation of resources for trainings outside major cities as Cairo and Alexandria.

Good Practices

Good Practice (1): *Building a pool of advanced trained governmental staff*

The project trained labour inspectors, MoSS staff and other governmental staff who can mentor their colleagues on identifying and reporting cases of human trafficking. The project adopted this method with labour inspectors in the Ministry of Labour.

The inspectors play an important role in reporting cases of forced labour through their mandate monitoring labour rights in companies and factories. Their role in reporting cases of forced labour will progress once the NRM of TIP Cases is activated.

This practice should be prepared by a training hosting a large number of inspectors, then a selection process should be followed to recruit the most advanced participants to attend the training of trainers, who will be provided by mentorship skills in addition to advanced knowledge.

Good Practice (2): *Strengthening the capacity of governmental staff extends to assisting in developing visual formats of national documents. The project developed a mind map of the National Referral System (NRM) for human trafficking.*

National documents and policies are usually long, which poses an obstacle to following their procedures. It is important to summarize and simplify the training materials, so that it is more effectively understood and used by its target audiences. The combating Human Trafficking in Egypt project produced a visualized mind map of the NRM of victims of TIP, issued and distributed in multiple trainings.

12. Recommendations

Recommendation (1): Re-assess the project's theory of change for future design

It is highly recommended that the ILO and the NCCPIM&TIP re-assess the desired objective/goal for future responses tackling HT in Egypt. The future projects' theory of change should aim to include a comprehensive response tracking financial and social barriers facing HT cases, in addition to strengthening the capacity of governmental and civil actors to combat human trafficking.

Addressed to	Priority	Resource	Timing
ILO Project team NCCPIM&TIP	High	Medium	long-term

Recommendation (2): Provide awareness and information related to TIP shelters

It is highly recommended that ILO and NCCPIM&TIP collect more information around how the TIP shelters are operating, to be disseminated to NGOs, rural women leaders (Raedat Refeyat), media professionals and religious leaders along other groups, to support with the cases referral. This will assist in seeding trust in the governmental entities before referring the victims to them, emphasizing that shelters usually keep confidential the identities of the people that refer TIP victim cases and the victims themselves for security reasons.

Addressed to	Priority	Resource	Timing
ILO Project team NCCPIM&TIP	High	Medium	Short-term

Recommendation (3): Host participants from governorates outside Cairo and Alexandria

It is highly recommended that the project allocates resources to reach increasing numbers from targeted groups from governorates other than Cairo and Alexandria which are the scope of the project. This geographical expansion will allow hosting rural women leaders (Raedat Refeyat), religious leaders and others.

Addressed to	Priority	Resource	Timing
ILO Project team	High	Medium	Short-term

Donor			
-------	--	--	--

Recommendation (4): Organize follow up training with the rural women leaders (Raedat Refeyat)

It is recommended that the project along with NCCPIM&TIP organize a follow up training with the rural women leaders (Raedat Refeyat). This follow-up will be a suitable opportunity to discuss psychological support for victims of TIP; a subject that was highly requested for further elaboration by the respondents to the follow TIP survey. This follow-up should be held after the development and printing of the directory of services to TIP victims which could be disseminated within during the training.

Addressed to	Priority	Resource	Timing
ILO Project team NCCPIM&TIP	Medium	Medium	Short-term

Recommendation (5): Plan intensive follow-up actions and tracking progress with participants of trainings and awareness raising sessions, for at least one year after the capacity building

It is recommended to plan and budget for an intensive follow up actions with the capacity building targets, for at least one year after the training's completion, while offering quarterly in-person gatherings, to reflect on technical challenges from the field, so the project's team is able to provide them with sufficient support. This intensive follow up and in-person reflections will enable the participants to communicate their needs whether detailed manuals, brochures and/or other means to support them performing their role.

Addressed to	Priority	Resource	Timing
ILO Project team NCCPIM&TIP NCCPIM&TIP	Medium	Medium	Short-term

Recommendation (6): Messages of awareness raising campaigns should challenge negative stigma against domestic workers

It is highly recommended that the planned awareness campaigns include messages to challenge the stigma around domestic work. The messages should emphasize how domestic work is a main source of income for many families and the workers should be offered decent work conditions.

Addressed to	Priority	Resource	Timing
ILO Project team NCCPIM&TIP	High	Medium	Short-term

Recommendation (7): Establish a steering committee of UN agencies and international organizations working to combat human trafficking

Building on the successful results of the joint collaboration with UN agencies active in combating human trafficking as IOM and UNOD, it is highly recommended that the project advocates for establishing a joint committee. The committee may include international organizations working in the same field. to discuss allocation of resources, navigate discussions with NCCPIM&TIP and align activities to ensure non-duplication. The committee can play an important role in advocating for enhancing data collection and accessibility.

Addressed to	Priority	Resource	Timing
ILO Project team UN agencies	Medium	Medium	Short-term

Recommendation (8): Approve a no cost extension

It is highly recommended to the project's donor to approve a no cost extension to continue its activities and emphasize the established relationship with NCCPIM&TIP. The usage of the non-spent budget should be allocated to activities of capacity building especially to social workers and mental health workers from the shelters run by the MoSS to well-equip them to provide psychosocial support and rehabilitation for the victims of TIP using a victim-centered, trauma- and survivor-informed approach. The no-cost extension will also allow the implementation of activities in relation to providing support for TVET centers and NGOs to conduct VT programs for victims of TIP in line with a victim-centered, trauma- and survivor-informed approach.

Addressed to	Priority	Resource	Timing
Donor	High	Medium	Short-term

Recommendation (9): Extend the project's partnerships

For future projects, it is highly recommended for the ILO to multiply the government counterparts beside the NCCPIM&TIP. The selected partners could include national research centers which are mandated by collecting data, developing studies and other types of knowledge as the National Center for Social and Criminology Research. Collaboration could also be established with the Ministry of Labour and the Ministry of Social Solidarity.

Addressed to	Priority	Resource	Timing
ILO	High	Low	Short-term

Recommendation (10): Develop an Exit Strategy

It is highly recommended that the project designs an exit strategy highlighting different steps to sustain the project results. This may include steps such as publishing all developed knowledge materials, the directory of organizations and institutions that can provide services to victims of TIP, the visuals of the BRM are published on the ILO Egypt website or on a newly adopted platform in addition to organizing dissemination events for these manuals. The event can be held

in parallel to the regional conference or separately. The wide dissemination online and offline will guarantee more exposure of the efforts and circulation of knowledge.

Addressed to	Priority	Resource	Timing
ILO Project team	Low	Medium	Short-term

12. Annexes

Annex I: Terms of Reference

Internal Mid-term Evaluation

Combating Human Trafficking in Egypt

Project code	EGY/20/06/USA
Project Title	Combating Human Trafficking in Egypt
Duration	15 June 2021 – 15 June 2024 (36 Months)
Location	Egypt
Funding Amount	USD 1,500,000.00
Type of evaluation	Internal Mid-Term
Evaluation Manager	Noha Hassan

Background

The mid-term assessment is taking place halfway through the project's implementation. It will evaluate the ongoing progress and performance of the project, aiming to use its conclusions and recommendations to guide the second phase of the project. The assessment will aim to: analyze implementation strategies towards achieving the project objectives; review the institutional capacity for project implementation; assess the implementation of the project to date; examine the likelihood of the project achieving its objectives; and review strategies for sustainability of project's results.

The methods of the evaluation will include: a review of progress technical reports and wider relevant documentation; meetings with the NCCPIM & TIP and national tripartite partners in Cairo, as well as local partners in the governorates of Greater Cairo and Alexandria; internal consultation of the project team with ILO experts from FUNDAMENTALS, ILO Cairo Office, and project managers from other ILO projects on TIP; and a stakeholders' workshop to analyze preliminary findings.

The main review questions will include:

Does the project design address the needs that were identified? Does the design need to be modified in the second half of the project?

How appropriate and useful are the indicators described in the RPM in assessing the project's progress? If necessary, how should the indicators be modified to be more useful? Are the means of verification for the indicators appropriate?

Is the project making sufficient progress towards its planned objectives? Will the project be likely to achieve its planned objectives upon completion? What are the main constraints, problems, and areas in need of further attention?

Has the project been appropriately responsive to the needs of the beneficiaries?

Are activities implemented in a cost-effective way?

What are the lessons learned from the various pillars of the project that can improve the remaining activities of the project?

Following the assessment, the mid-term evaluation report will be prepared and shared with the ILO Cairo Office, ILO HQ and the USDOS TIP.

ILO Development Cooperation project

The "Combating Human Trafficking in Egypt" is a three-year (15 June 2021 – 15 June 2024) project funded by the United States Department of State office to monitor and combat trafficking in persons (TIP). The project aims at improving the national victim identification system and referral mechanism (NRM), and at strengthening relevant stakeholders' capacity and cooperation with respect to victim identification and referral, in order for victims to be more likely identified, rescued and referred for assistance services, and perpetrators prosecuted and arrested. Additionally, the project aims to improve coverage and enforcement of relevant legislation for the prevention of TIP, including amendment of the

labour law and drafting a law covering domestic work, underpinned by the ratification of

C.189 and P.29, so that the vulnerable population, in particular Egyptian and foreign domestic workers, is less likely to fall victim to trafficking. In addition, the project will raise public awareness on how to identify victims of trafficking and the services available, so that victims of TIP are more likely to be identified and receive needed assistance, while traffickers are more likely to be prosecuted. Finally, the project will provide comprehensive assistance and socio-economic reintegration services for identified victims, so that they are more likely to experience faster physical, psychological and social recovery, and build resilience against being re-trafficked.

The overall objective of the project is to improve the capacity of the Egyptian Government to combat human trafficking by strengthening the national identification and referral mechanisms (NRM) and providing assistance and reintegration services for identified victims. The project has the following two outcomes:

Outcome 1. An effective victim identification system and a national referral mechanism (NRM) are in place and operational

Output 1.1: Strengthened National Victim Identification system

Output 1.2: Improved awareness and quality of the National Victim Referral Mechanism

Output 1.3. Increased capacity of the relevant stakeholders for identification and referral of victims of human trafficking

Output 1.4. Improved awareness of the importance of legislation relevant to the prevention of human trafficking

Output 1.5. Increased awareness among the population, especially those considered vulnerable to human trafficking, on how to spot the signs of human trafficking and where to look for help

Outcome 2. Improved comprehensive assistance and reintegration services for identified victims using a victim-centered, trauma-informed, and survivor-informed approach

Output 2.1. The number and quality of assistance services for victims of human trafficking are increased

Output 2.2. Socio-economic reintegration of identified victims is facilitated. Output 2.3. Strengthened support for Egyptian victims of human trafficking abroad

Project management arrangement

The project is managed by a project team in Cairo, Egypt, who comprises of a project manager, Monitoring and evaluation consultant and project assistant (however, this position has not been filled for more than 6 months since start of project implementation). The project management team is responsible for the administrative, operational, and technical supervision and implementation of the project interventions. Moreover, the project is supported by ILO Office in Cairo, Egypt for issues related to the technical and administration

areas. Additional technical backstopping is also provided by Jean-Marie Karabo, Programme and Operations Specialist at FUNDAMENTALS, HQ, and Coen Kompier, ILS Specialist in Cairo, Egypt.

Key results achieved by the project by the end of September (as reported)

413 individuals from different organizations such as NGOs staff, labour inspectors, MoSS, NCCM, Trade unions, employers, media personnel, health workers and labour attaches trained.

The project delivered 8 awareness sessions to 569 Raedat Refeyat (Social women leaders) from Greater Cairo, Lower and Upper Egypt.

Domestic workers' draft law review: the project team in coordination with the ILO HQ and Cairo office provided comments to MoSS for the law to be better in line with the International Labour Standards (ILS).

Review of the voluntary domestic workers' contract: The ILO provided feedback on the voluntary domestic workers contract produced by NCCPIM&TIP to MoSS to make it better in line with convention 189 and its recommendations.

A policy recommendation was presented to the Ministry of Manpower to enforce in the national labour inspection the trafficking in persons law no. 64/2010. This will enable them to refer and track any possible trafficking in persons crimes during their inspections.

The Egyptian government is considering ratifying P. 29 on Forced Labour based on the project team's lobbying.

Recommendations have been drafted by labour inspectors to enhance cooperation with law enforcement to reduce challenges that hinder their work together.

As a result of the lobbying by the project team, the labour inspectors that have been trained under the project introduced in the latest update to their procedural manual the Anti-Trafficking Law no. 64 of 2010, as part of the relevant laws they should be using during their inspections.

Evaluation background

The ILO considers evaluation as an integral part of the implementation of development cooperation activities. The evaluation in the ILO is for the purpose of accountability, learning, implementation improvement and building knowledge. It should be conducted in the context of criteria and approaches for international development assistance as established by the OECD/DAC Evaluation Quality Standard; and the UNEG Code of Conduct for Evaluation in the UN System.

This evaluation will be carried out by an independent national consultant following the ILO evaluation procedures. An Evaluation Manager from the project team is designated to ~~oversee~~ and manage the evaluation process.

The project will follow the ILO Policy on Evaluation for Technical Cooperation projects and the Development Cooperation Internal Governance Manual.

This evaluation will follow the [ILO policy guidelines for results-based evaluations Principles, rationale, planning and managing for evaluations](#) 4th ed; and the ILO EVAL Policy Guidelines Checklist 4.6. "Preparing the inception report"; Checklist 4.3. "Data collection method"; and Checklist 4.2. "Preparing the evaluation report". The evaluation will also follow the OECD-DAC framework and principles for evaluation. For all practical purposes, this ToR and ILO Evaluation policies and guidelines define the overall scope of this evaluation. Recommendations should be strongly linked to the findings of the evaluation and should provide clear guidance to stakeholders on how they can address them.

Evaluation purpose, scope and clients

Purpose. This mid-term evaluation will review the project, effectiveness, efficiency, relevance and sustainability and make

actionable recommendations for the remaining period of the project towards delivering improving delivery and sustainability of outcomes.

The specific objectives of the evaluation are to:

- ▶ Establish the relevance and coherence of the project design and implementation strategy in relation to the national development frameworks, beneficiary needs and ILO and UN policy frameworks and the SDGs.
- ▶ Analyse the implementation strategies regarding their potential effectiveness in achieving the project outcomes, identifying factors affecting project implementation (positively and negatively).
- ▶ Identify unexpected positive and negative results of the project.
- ▶ Assess the extent to which the project outcomes will be sustainable
- ▶ Assess the project immediate and potential long-term impact, with special consideration on the results on capacities of the relevant institutions and target beneficiaries.
- ▶ Identify lessons learned and potential good practices for the key stakeholders.
- ▶ Provide strategic and actionable recommendations for the different key stakeholders to improve implementation of the project activities and attainment of project objectives.

Scope of the evaluation:

This mid-term evaluation will focus on the project's implementation as of July 2021. It is expected to review and assess all the results and key outputs that have been produced in this period. Geographically, the project implementation is notably focused on Greater Cairo and Alexandria. The evaluation will ensure that ILO's cross-cutting themes -gender equality and non-discrimination (e.g. people with disabilities), social dialogue, international labour standards and fair transition to environmental issues – are taken into consideration as per the EVAL guidance note n° 4 and Guidance Note n° 7 to ensure stakeholder participation.

Clients of the evaluation.

The primary users of the evaluation are ILO Cairo Office, ILO HQ and the USDOS TIP.

Evaluation criteria and questions

The evaluation will cover the following evaluation criteria (in line with the DAC criteria, UNEG guidelines and ILO evaluation policy guidelines):

- ▶ Relevance and strategic fit;
- ▶ Coherence
- ▶ Effectiveness of project implementation and management arrangements;
- ▶ Efficiency of resource use
- ▶ Sustainability;
- ▶ Impact orientation.

In line with the results-based approach applied by the ILO, the evaluation will focus on identifying and analysing results through addressing key questions related to the evaluation criteria and the achievement of the outcomes/ objectives of the project using the mainly, but not only, indicators in the logical framework of the project. The list of questions presented below should be reviewed and adjusted during the preparation of the Inception report. Any adjustment should be approved as part of the approval of the inception report.

Key Evaluation Questions

The evaluation team shall examine the following key issues:

Ref	Evaluation criteria	Definition
1	Relevance and strategic fit	To what extent are the project objectives aligned to beneficiaries needs, policy frameworks and strategies at national level? To what extent has the project fit in and compliment with the draft Decent Work Country Programme (DWCP), ILO Country Programme Outcomes (CPOs), UN Strategic Common Framework (UNSCF) and SDGs? Has the project addressed the cross-cutting themes(gender equality and non-discrimination -e.g. people with disabilities-, social dialogue, international labour standards and fair transition to environmental issues in the project document? To what level the ILO partners have participated in the planning and implementation of the project?
2	Coherence	Was the project theory of change valid and realistic? Has the theory of change adequately integrated effectively external positive and negative factors (risks and assumptions)? Has the project complemented other government, UN, NGOs, etc. intervention in the project themes?
3	Effectiveness	To what extent have the project objectives been achieved or are expected to be achieved by the end of the project? Have unexpected positive and negative results took place? What were the main internal and external factors that influenced the achievement or non-achievement of results? How far is the management and governance arrangement responsive to achieve project results? Is there a clear understanding of roles and responsibilities by all parties involved? Is the project receiving the necessary administrative, technical and - if needed - policy support from the ILO COs and specialists in the field and the responsible technical units in headquarters? What measures were put in place to identify potential/perceived conflicts? What strategy was adopted to promote conflict-sensitive programming during the implementation?

4	Efficiency	Have resources (financial, human, technical support, etc.) been allocated strategically and sufficient to achieve the project outputs/outcomes? Were the project's activities/operations programmatically and financially in line with the schedule of activities as defined by the project team and work plans? If not, what are the factors that hinder timely delivery and what are the counter measures taken to address these issues? Did the project establish and applied for accountability, management and learning a reliable monitoring and evaluation system and risk register during the implementation? Has it integrated key stakeholders as implementers and users?
5	Impact orientation	To what extent are the project supported tools, methodologies, and new or improved policies will be institutionalized? What gaps should be addressed?? Can the project's approach or parts of it, and results be replicated or amplified by national partners or other actors (i.e., ILO constituents) considering the country institutional and financial dimensions?
6	Sustainability	Has the project initiated an exit strategy, embedded in the overall delivery, to allow continuation of relevant results? What measures and actions have been put in place to ensure ownership at local regional and national level? Is the process for handover of the structures clear to all parties and has the responsible authority allocated budget for maintenance?

7. Cross cutting themes Within the project's thematic area, what were the facilitating and limiting factors in project's contribution/potential contribution to gender equality and non-discrimination?

Has the project taken into account tripartism, social dialogue, international labour standards and a fair transition to environmental sustainability in its design and implementation?

Approach and Methodology

The approach to the mid-term evaluation will be interactive, consultative, and transparent with mix methods. The evaluator(s) will use a combination of secondary and primary data collection methods including documents review, key interviews with the project stakeholders, observations, and a workshop discussion. In line with the specific objectives of the mid-term evaluation, the evaluation approach sought to

- ▶ Maximise the use of existing secondary documents and data.
- ▶ Undertake carefully structured interviews on the more sensitive issues.
- ▶ Facilitate a stakeholder workshop with project stakeholders to obtain feedback and validate project, challenges, and results.
- ▶ Apply triangulation of sources and techniques.
- ▶ Ensure an interactive process of synthesis and development of potential options for improving the project delivery, the Results Framework, and related Action Plans.

Inception phase

Desk review and briefing interviews

A desk review will analyse project and other documentation including the Theory of change logframe, implementation plan, annual reports, project deliverables and other relevant documents. The desk review will suggest a number of initial findings that in turn may point to additional or fine-tuned evaluation questions.

Three briefing interviews will be organized: a methodological one with the evaluation manager, one on the project management to plan the data collection phase with the project team, and one with the donor to clarify the expectations on the evaluation.

This will be reflected in the Inception report that will translate the TORs in an operational workplan. The Inception report will be reviewed and approved by the evaluation manager prior to the data collection phase.

Data collection phase

Interviews with ILO, NCCPIMTIP, and project stakeholders and field visits

The evaluators will meet all relevant stakeholders face-to-face, virtually and /or in field visits. An indicative list of persons to be interviewed will be developed by the evaluators in consultation with the evaluation manager as part of the inception report. This will include but not limited to:

- ILO project team in Cairo and backstopping in HQ
- USDOS TIP
- Government Partners at NCCPIMTIP, Ministry of Social Solidarity, Ministry of Labour, National council for Childhood and Motherhood, National council of Human Rights
- Sample of trained first liners, such as: Ministry of Social Solidarity, Labour Inspectors, National council for Childhood and Motherhood, National council of Human Rights, OASIS clinics, NGOs, Media, Employers and Trade Unions
- Sample of RRs received awareness raising sessions.
- Service providers of CB activities
- Other development partners (IOM and UNODC)
- Development of the evaluation report

Draft Report

After the data collection phase, the evaluator(s) will develop a draft evaluation report (see Deliverables below for the report outline its content) in line with EVAL Checklist 4.2.

The total length of the report should be a maximum of 30 pages for the main report, excluding annexes and executive summary. The report should be sent as one complete document. Photos, if appropriate to be included, should be inserted using lower resolution to keep overall file size low.

The evaluation manager, after a methodological review, will circulate the draft report to the key stakeholders, including ILO and the donor for their review on factual errors and clarifications and forward the consolidated comments to the evaluators.

Final report

The evaluator(s) will finalize and submit the final report to the evaluation manager in line with EVAL Checklist 4.2. The report should address all comments and/or provide explanations why comments were not considered. The quality of the report will be assessed against ILO/EVAL's Checklist 4. 7..

The evaluation manager will review the final version and submit to the RSMEQ, and after his approval, will be submitted to EVAL/ILO for final review and approval.

The evaluation report will be distributed by ILO Country Office to the key stakeholders to enhance learning and uploaded in the ILO-EVAL e-discovery website for public use to provide easy access to all development partners, to reach target audiences and to maximize the benefits of the evaluation.

Deliverables

Inception report (with detailed work plan and data collection instruments) following ILOEVAL Checklist 4.6., the report should include:

Description of the evaluation methodology and instruments to be used in sampling, data collection and analysis and the data collection plan mentioned above;

Guide questions for the interviews;

Agenda for the stakeholders' workshop;

The proposed report outline.

A draft and a final versions of evaluation report in English (maximum 30 pages plus annexes) as per the following proposed structure:

Cover page with key project and evaluation data

Executive Summary

Acronyms

Description of the project

Purpose, scope and clients of the evaluation

Methodology and limitations

Clearly identified findings for each criterion or per objective

Conclusions

Recommendations (i.e., for the different key stakeholders)

Lessons learned and good practices

Annexes:

TOR

List of people interviewed

Documents reviewed

Data Table on Project targets as per Project logical framework targets

-ILO EVAL templates for each Lesson learned and good practice identified

ILO template for the Executive summary completed.

A brief presentation on the outcome of the evaluation to the ILO Country Office Director (one hour)

All reports, including drafts, will be written in English. Ownership of data from the evaluation rests jointly with the ILO and the evaluator(s). The copyright of the evaluation report will rest exclusively with the ILO. Use of the data for publication and other presentations can only be made with the written agreement of the

ILO. Key stakeholders can make appropriate use of the evaluation report in line with the original purpose and with appropriate acknowledgement.

Assignment administration and management arrangements

To ensure independence of all deliverables, all submissions will be made through an evaluation manager, Mr. Noha Hassan, (noha.abd.hassan@gmail.com). The consultant will report to the evaluation manager under the technical support of the regional M&E Officer.

The work plan table below highlights the main activities, time frame and the workdays.

Phases	Tasks	Responsible Person	No of days Consultant	Dates
Development of ToRs	Draft the ToRs	Evaluation Manager	0	14-27 September 2023
	Comments by stakeholders	Evaluation Manager	0	1-12 October 2023
	Integration of comments	Evaluation Manager	0	15-19 October 2023
Call for EoL	Evaluation Manager	Evaluation Manager	0	22 October – 2 November 2023
Selection and contracting of the consultant	Evaluation Manager	Evaluation Manager	0	5-16 November 2023
Briefing	Initial meeting and methodological briefing	Evaluation Manager	0.5	20 November 2023
	Desk Review Preliminary interviews with the project CTA and the donor Inception report	National Consultant	5.5	21-28 November 2023

Inceptionphase	Review and Approval of inception report	Evaluation Manager	0	29-30 November 2023
Field data collection	In-country and virtual consultations Field visits	National consultant	09	3-14 December 2023
	Interviews with projects staff, partners, and beneficiaries			
	Stakeholders workshop for sharing of preliminary findings	National consultant	1	19 December 2023
Draft reporting	Draft report	National consultant	5	20-28 December 2023

	Review by Evaluation Manager	Evaluation Manager	0	31 December 2023
	Circulate draft report to stakeholders for comments	Evaluation Manager	0	1-8 Jan 2024
	Consolidate comments of stakeholders and send to the evaluator	Evaluation Manager	0	9 Jan 2024
	Integration of comments	National consultant	2	10-18 Jan 2024
Final report	Review of final report and approval by EVAL	Senior Regional M&E	0	21 Jan -29 Jan 2024
TOTAL			23	

The budget of the evaluation includes:

The budget allocated to this evaluation is entirely covered by the project and its execution is under the control of the evaluation manager for the recruitment of consultant, field missions, organizing workshops and consultation meetings with stakeholders.

For the national consultant

Consultancy costs for the national consultant, 23 days.

DSA fees as per ILO travel policy

To this are added the costs dedicated to the logistics for the field missions and organization of the stakeholder's workshop.

Evaluators' qualification

Individual consultant and companies are eligible to apply for the evaluation. The evaluation

/evaluation team will be selected on the basis of proven evaluation experience and meeting the following independence criteria:

National consultant

A BA degree in Social Sciences, Development studies, Economics or related graduate qualifications

A minimum of 5 years of professional experience in evaluating international country development initiatives, including UN or international organizations projects, in Egypt, and/or quantitative and qualitative social research (preferable including employment and/or employment-intensive infrastructure projects).

A good understanding of ILO mandate and tripartite structure is an added advantage

Have no previous or current involvement – or offers of prospective employment – with the ILO project or programme being evaluated

Have no personal links to the people involved in managing the project/programme

Fluent in spoken and written English and Arabic languages and based in Cairo

ANNEX 1 - RELEVANT ILO EVALUATION GUIDELINES AND STANDARD TEMPLATES

ANNEXES

1.- Code of conduct form (To be signed by the evaluators)

[Microsoft Word - Evaluators_code%20of%20conduct_Final_EVAL_7.11.18.doc \(ilo.org\)](#)

CHECKLIST 4.8 WRITING THE INCEPTION REPORT X Date: Feb 2021, v. 3 (v.1 -2012)

[wcms_746817.pdf \(ilo.org\)](#)

2.-Checklist 4.2: Preparing the evaluation report [wcms_746808.pdf \(ilo.org\)](#)

Template for evaluation title page http://www.ilo.org/eval/Evaluationguidance/WCMS_166357/lang--en/index.htm

3.-Checklist 4.4: Preparing the Evaluation Report Summary X Date: April 2021, v.2 (v.1 2012) [wcms_746811.pdf \(ilo.org\)](#)

4.-Template 4.1: Lessons learned X DATE: MARCH 2021 A) [wcms_746820.pdf \(ilo.org\)](#) B) [wcms_746730.pdf \(ilo.org\)](#)

5.-Template 4.2: Emerging good practices X DATE: MARCH 2021 [wcms_746821.pdf \(ilo.org\)](#)

6.-Template for evaluation title page http://www.ilo.org/eval/Evaluationguidance/WCMS_166357/lang--en/index.htm

7.-Template for evaluation summary <http://www.ilo.org/legacy/english/edmas/eval/template-summary-en.doc>

8.- EVAL's Protocol on collecting evaluative evidence on the ILO's COVID-19 response measures through decentralized evaluation

https://login.ilo.org/adfs/ls/wia?wa=wsignin1.0&wtrealm=urn%3ailo%3aintranet%3asharepoint&wctx=https%3a%2f%2fintranet.ilo.org%2fcollaborate%2feval%2f_layouts%2f15%2fAuthenticate.aspx%3fSource%3d%252Fcollaborate%252Feval%252FPublishingImages%252FPages%252Fdefault%252FProtocol%2520for%2520decentralized%2520evaluations%2520%252D%2520Draft%2520%252D%2520Operating%2520procedures%2520%252D%2520No%252E2%252Epdf&client-request-id=f8975b84-20e7-470b-100c-0080010000d7

9.- Guidance Note 3.1: Integrating gender equality in monitoring and evaluation, Date: June 2020 v.3 (v.1 - 2013) [wcms_746716.pdf \(ilo.org\)](https://www.ilo.org/wcms_746716.pdf)

10.- Guidance Note 3.2: Adapting evaluation methods to the ILO's normative and tripartite mandate Date: June 2020 (v.1 [wcms_746717.pdf \(ilo.org\)](https://www.ilo.org/wcms_746717.pdf))

11.- CHECKLIST 4.8 WRITING THE INCEPTION REPORT X Date: Feb 2021, v. 3 (v.1 -2012)

12.- SDG related reference materials [Evaluation & SDGs \(Evaluation Office\) \(ilo.ch\)](https://www.ilo.org/eval/Evaluationguidance/WCMS_165968/lang--en/index.htm)

13.- Rating the quality of evaluation report
http://www.ilo.org/eval/Evaluationguidance/WCMS_165968/lang--en/index.htm

14.- Guidance note 7: Stakeholders participation in the ILO evaluation

https://www.ilo.org/global/docs/WCMS_165982/lang--en/index.htm

15.- UNEG Ethical Guidelines for Evaluation <http://www.unevaluation.org/document/download/548>

Annex II: Evaluation Matrix

Evaluation Questions	Measure(s) or Indicator(s)	Data source	Data collection methods	Stakeholders /Informants	Analysis and assessment
Relevance and strategic fit					
1. To what extent has the project fit in and compliment with the draft Decent Work Country Programme (DWCP), ILO Country Programme Outcomes (CPOs), UN Strategic Common Framework (UNSCF) and SDGs?	➤ Project objectives are aligned with Decent Work Country Programme (DWCP), ILO Country Programme Outcomes (CPOs), UN Strategic Common Framework (UNSCF) and SDGs	➤ Project documents ➤ National documentation	➤ Desk Review ➤ Key Informant Interviews	➤ Project manager	➤ Document Analysis ➤ Discourse Analysis ➤ Descriptive
2. To what extent are the project objectives aligned to beneficiaries' needs, policy frameworks and strategies at National level?	➤ Project objective are aligned with national/institutional/sectorial priorities. ➤ Objectives aligned with identified needs in baseline study	➤ Project documents ➤ National documentation ➤ National/international statistics ➤ Baseline study	➤ Desk Review ➤ Key Informant Interviews ➤ Focus group discussions (FGDs)	➤ Project manager ➤ Partner organizations ➤ National institutions	➤ Document Analysis ➤ Discourse Analysis ➤ Descriptive Statistics
3. To what extent has the project fit in and compliment with the draft Decent Work Country Programme (DWCP), ILO Country Programme Outcomes (CPOs), UN Strategic	➤ Alignment with national/institutional/sectorial priorities, donor priorities and the SDGs. ➤ Alignment with DWCP, CPO, UNSDCF	➤ Project documents ➤ National documentation ➤ Agenda 2030 ➤ Interviews	➤ Desk Review ➤ Key Informant Interviews ➤ Focus group discussion	➤ Project manager ➤ Partner organizations ➤ National institutions	➤ Document Analysis ➤ Discourse Analysis ➤ Descriptive Statistics

Common Framework (UNSCF) and SDGs?

ns
(FGDs)

4. Has the project addressed the cross-cutting themes (gender equality and non-discrimination - e.g. people with disabilities, social dialogue, international labour standards and fair transition to environmental issues in the project document?	➤ Measures of mainstreaming cross-cutting issues considered ➤ Perceptions of stakeholders and partners on mainstreaming cross cutting issues	➤ Project documents ➤ Interviews	➤ Desk Review ➤ Interviews ➤ Focus group discussions (FGDs)	➤ Project manager	➤ Document Analysis ➤ Discourse Analysis
5. To what level the ILO partners have participated in the planning and implementation of the project?	➤ Partner organizations confirm ownership of the project objectives and results	➤ Project documents ➤ Interviews	➤ Desk Review ➤ Interviews	➤ Project manager ➤ Partner organizations	➤ Document Analysis ➤ Discourse Analysis
Coherence (internal and external)					
6. Was the project theory of change valid and realistic? Has the theory of change adequately integrated effectively external positive and negative factors (risks and assumptions)?	➤ Theory of change with clear and coherent vertical and horizontal intervention logic ➤ Baseline report/assessment on implementation risks and limitations	➤ Project document ➤ Interviews	➤ Desk Review ➤ Interviews	➤ Project manager ➤ Partner organizations	➤ Document Analysis ➤ Discourse Analysis
7. Has the project complemented other	Complementarity measures are considered and applied	➤ Project document ➤ Interviews	➤ Desk Review	➤ Project manager	➤ Document Analysis

government, UN, NGOs, etc intervention in the project themes?			➤ Interview s	➤ Partner organizations ➤ UN agencies	➤ Discourse Analysis
8. To what extent did the project build on the comparative advantage of the ILO in the field of human trafficking?	➤ Thematic scope of the Project expands further the expertise of the ILO ➤ Alignment with ILO strategies and documents	➤ Project documents ➤ ILO strategies & documents ➤ interviews	➤ Desk Review ➤ Interview s	➤ Project manager ➤ Partner organizations ➤ UN agencies	➤ Document Analysis ➤ Discourse Analysis
Effectiveness					
9. To what extent have the project objectives been achieved or are expected to be achieved by the end of the project?	➤ Achieved results VS. planned results ➤ Enhancement of measures to combat human trafficking ➤ % of trainees who report changes in knowledge, attitudes, or practices of beneficiaries	➤ Project documents ➤ National standards and norms ➤ International reports ➤ National/international datasets ➤ Interviews ➤ Follow up exercises with beneficiaries	➤ Desk Review ➤ Interview s	➤ Project manager ➤ Partner organizations ➤ Beneficiaries	➤ Document Analysis ➤ Discourse Analysis
10. Have unexpected positive and negative results took place?	➤ Project results are monitored and analysed	➤ Project documents ➤ Interviews ➤ National/international datasets ➤ Follow up exercises results	➤ Desk Review ➤ Interview s ➤ FGDs	➤ Project manager ➤ Partner organizations ➤ Beneficiaries	➤ Document Analysis ➤ Discourse Analysis
11. What were the main internal and external factors that influenced the achievement or non-	➤ Context analysis is conducted	➤ Project documents ➤ Interviews	➤ Desk Review ➤ Interview s	➤ Project manager ➤ Partner organizations	➤ Document Analysis

achievement of results? 12. How far is the management and governance arrangement responsive to achieve project results? Is there a clear understanding of roles and responsibilities by all parties involved?	Resource plans are designed and reviewed	➤ Project documents ➤ Interviews	➤ Desk Review ➤ Interviews	➤ Project manager ➤ Partner organizations	➤ Document Analysis
13. Is the project receiving the necessary administrative, technical and - if needed - policy support from the ILO Cos and specialists in the field and the responsible technical units in headquarters?	Regular meetings and supports are offered by the country office	▪ Project documents ▪ Interviews	➤ Desk Review ➤ Interviews	➤ Project manager ➤ Partner organizations	Document Analysis
14. What measures were put in place to identify potential/perceived conflicts? What strategy was adopted to promote conflict-sensitive programming during the implementation?	Regular reviews with partners to review project documents	➤ Project documents ➤ Interviews	➤ Desk Review ➤ Interviews	➤ Project manager ➤ Partner organizations	Document Analysis
Efficiency					
15. Have resources (financial, human, technical support, etc.)	➤ Chronogram implementation of is	➤ Project documents ➤ Interviews	➤ Desk Review ➤ Interviews	➤ Project manager	Document Analysis

been allocated strategically and sufficient to achieve the project outputs/outcomes?	➤ Timely financial execution ➤ Timely delivery of funds	➤ Partner organizations
16. Were the project's activities/operations programmatically and financially in line with the schedule of activities as defined by the project team and work plans? If not, what are the factors that hinder timely delivery and what are the counter measures taken to address these issues?	➤ Yearly plans are followed or reviewed ➤ Project documents ➤ Interviews ➤ Desk Review ➤ Interview s	➤ Project manager ➤ Partner organizations - Document Analysis
17. Did the project establish and applied for accountability, management and learning a reliable monitoring and evaluation system and risk register during the Implementation? Has it integrated key stakeholders as implementers and users?	MEL system is developed and followed ➤ Project documents ➤ Interviews ➤ Desk Review ➤ Interview s	➤ Project manager ➤ MEL consultant of the project ➤ Partner organizations - Document Analysis
Impact orientation		
18. To what extent are the project supported	Institutionalization of results are planned with partners ➤ Project documents	➤ Desk Review ➤ Project manager - Document Analysis

tools, methodologies, and new or improved policies will be institutionalized? What gaps should be addressed?		➤ Interviews	➤ Interviews	➤ Partner organizations	
19. Can the project's approach or parts of it, and results be replicated or amplified by national partners or other actors (i.e., ILO constituents) considering the country institutional and financial dimensions?	Consultation with partners, in ILO or with UN agencies to mainstream results achieved	➤ Project documents ➤ Interviews	➤ Desk Review ➤ Interviews	➤ Project manager ➤ Partner organizations	Document Analysis
Sustainability					
20. Has the project initiated an exit strategy, embedded in the overall delivery, to allow continuation of relevant results? What measures and actions have been put in place to ensure ownership at local regional and national level? Is the process for handover of the structures clear to all parties and has the responsible authority allocated budget for maintenance?	▪ Exit strategies are discussed and planned with partners	➤ Project documents ➤ Interviews	➤ Desk Review ➤ Interviews	➤ Project manager ➤ Partner organizations	Document Analysis

21. To which extent are the results of the intervention likely to have a long term, sustainable positive contribution to the SDG and relevant targets (Explicitly or implicitly)?	Outcome measured results are	➤ Project documents ➤ Interviews	➤ Desk Review ➤ Interviews ➤ FGDs	➤ Project manager ➤ Partner organizations ➤ Beneficiaries	Document Analysis
Cross cutting themes					
22. Within the project's thematic area, what were the facilitating and limiting factors in project's contribution/potential contribution to gender equality and non-discrimination?	Facilitating and limiting factors are systematically identified	➤ Project documents ➤ Interviews	➤ Desk Review ➤ Interviews	➤ Project manager ➤ Partner organizations	Document Analysis
23. Has the project taken into account tripartism, social dialogue, international labour standards and a fair transition to environmental sustainability in its design and implementation?	Participation of governmental entities, workers', and employers' organizations in the design of the project	➤ Project documents ➤ Interviews	➤ Desk Review ➤ Interviews	➤ Project manager ➤ Partner organizations	Document Analysis

Annex III: Data Table on project progress (targets vs achievements)

The following table shows the project progress against those Common Performance Indicators (CPIs).

Indicators	ILO Target	US office to monitor and combat TIP	ILO Actual (31 December 2023)	Percentage of achievement
Number of trainings to be conducted under protection	34	10	21	210%
Number of trained people under protection	890	409	525	128%
Unique awareness material designed/adapted for a given population	7	7	15	229%
Times the awareness material broadcasted	not stated	123	27	22%
People reached with awareness material	not stated	106000	795689	751%
People took action as a result of the awareness material	not stated	50	363 (Data source RR follow-up survey. Out of 397 surveyed RR, 363 shared the knowledge with their colleagues/communities)	726%
Number of TIP victims identified under protection victim support	not stated	100	1641 (Results from 194 survey conducted with first liner trainees supported by the project. Self-reported data by the trainees)	1641%
Number of TIP victims referred under protection victim support	not stated	100	48 (Results from 194 survey conducted with first liner trainees)	48%

			supported by the project. Self-reported data by the trainees)	
--	--	--	---	--

The following tables show the project progress against Results Monitoring Plan (RMP) individuals' indicators.

Target group	Target	Achieved	Percentage of achievement
Social workers (MoSS) trained	50	52	104.00%
Local NGOs trained	50	45	90.00%
NCCM trained	50	50	100.00%
Trade Unionists trained	120	118	98.33%
Number of MoSS members responsible for the shelters, NCCPIM&TIP staff and Administrative Control Authority members, visited selected shelters in the Netherlands.	2	4	200.00%
RRs awareness sessions	9	569	100%
Labour attaches awareness sessions	10	27	100%

Indicators In progress

Target group	Target	Achieved	Percentage of achievement
Health workers trained	50	27	54.00%

⁹ No target was set for the RR awareness sessions. All nominated RRs by NCCPIMTIP were targeted and supported by the project.

¹⁰ No target was set for the labour attaches awareness sessions. All selected labour attaches were targeted by the project.

Religious leaders trained	50	29	58.00%
Labour inspectors trained	50	1811	36.00%
Media professionals trained	50	3912	78.00%
Employers' organizations trained	120	104	86.67%
Number of newly appointed Egyptian labour attaches to the diplomatic missions abroad trained on protecting the rights of Egyptian migrants and potential VoTs.	78	2513	32.05%
Number of Egyptian and Foreigner diplomatic and consular personnel attended anti-trafficking awareness session on victim identification guidelines.	40	47	85%

Underachieved Indicators

Target group	Target	Achieved	Percentage of achievement
Hotline operators trained	50	0	0.00%
NCW trained	50	0	0.00%
NCHR trained	50	0	0.00%

¹¹ The labour inspectors training was replaced with TOT, which explains the small number of attendees.

¹² Two media training were conducted, the media officer turns out and engagements are low.

¹³ Labour attaches raining was conducted, and they already travelled. The project trained the persons that will travel and not the substituOn tes.

Number of labor inspectors and law enforcement officers (office of the prosecutor general and administrative control authority) trained	100	27	27%
Number of case workers from MoSS trained on psychosocial support and rehabilitation for the victims of TIP.	48	0	0%
Number of individuals attended the TOT on "Global guide on the prevention of FL through lifelong learning and skills development approaches" and "Global guide on the Economic Reintegration of Victims of FLM through skills and lifelong learning"	120	0	0%
Number of Egyptian partners trained by the International Training Center at the ILO	25	0	0%
Number of TVET and NGO staff trained on the upgraded training material and life-coaching activities for victims of TIP in line with a victim-centred, trauma- and survivor-informed approach.	120	0	0%
Number of TVET and NGO staff trained on the upgraded training material and life-coaching activities once back in Egypt using a victim-centred, trauma- and survivor-informed approach.	120	0	0%
Number of Regional Conferences on sharing best practices and experiences in the provision of integrated protection systems for victims of trafficking	1	0	0%

Annex IV: Evaluation schedule

	Task	Submission Date
1	Methodological meeting	6 December 2023
2	Desk review	11 December- 20 December 2023
3	Inception report- draft submission	24 December 2023
4	Review and approval of inception report	21 January- 5 February 2024
5	Data collection	27 February- 25 March 2024
7	Draft writing/submission	6 April 2024
8	Draft report review, circulation, comments	8 May 2024
9	Final Report	15 November 2024

Annex V: Bibliography

Project Documents Reviewed for the MTE

1. Monitoring, Evaluation and Learning (MEL) Plan For Combating Human Trafficking in Egypt (S-SJTIP-21-GR-3013). August 2022
2. ILO Combating Human Trafficking in Egypt project trainings' follow-up, April 2023
3. Follow up tool for awareness sessions
4. Follow up tool for trainings
5. Training beneficiaries survey findings. 2023
6. Baseline Report
7. Donor Visit Final Nov 2022
8. Guidance Note for Implementation-EGY-20-06-USA-TIP Award
9. ILO Trafficking project baseline tools
10. ILO_SFOP0007385_Egypt_Full Proposal
11. Project working document - NCCPIM & TIP
12. July- September 2021
13. October- December 2021
14. Quarterly Report **Jul – Sep 2023 / Q3**
15. Quarterly Report Jan- March 2022
16. Quarterly Report April- June 2022
17. Quarterly Report July- September 2022
18. Quarterly Report October- December 2022
19. Rural_women_leaflet_Sep2022_final
20. دليل تدريب نقابات العمال على مكافحة الاتجار بالبشر
21. Results Performance Monitoring Plan
22. Trainees followup survey database
23. Training Tracking sheet updated
24. Trainings and Awareness Sessions Database

Other Resources Reviewed:

1. ILO (International Labour Organization-2020). ILO Policy Guidelines for Results-based Evaluation. Principles, rationale, planning and managing for evaluations”, 4th edition.
2. OECD (Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development (2021). Applying Evaluation Criteria Thoughtfully
3. [Nermine El Saadany](#) (2021). Egyptian Women & Labor Force: Challenges and Opportunities, [Egyptian Women & Labor Force: Challenges and Opportunities | Wilson Center](#)
4. Nada Wahba (2022). Improving the Conditions of Domestic Workers in Egypt
5. Third National Strategy on Combating and Preventing Trafficking in Persons for the period (2022-2026- [The Launch of The Third National Strategy on Combating and Preventing Trafficking in Persons \(2022-2026\) | NCCPIM&TIP \(nccpimandtip.gov.eg\)](#)
6. United Nations (UN) protocol to prevent, suppress and punish trafficking in human beings , especially women and children, supplementing the UN Convention against Transnational Organized Crime and its Protocols . Source: [Protocol to Prevent, Suppress and Punish Trafficking in Persons Especially Women and Children, supplementing the United Nations Convention against Transnational Organized Crime | OHCHR](#)

Annex VI: List of people consulted for the MTE

	Interviewee	Type of data collection	Method of data collection	Date	Contact
1	Project Manager	Interview	Phone Call	6 March 2024	ragaby@ilo.org
2	Project MEL consultant	Interview	Virtual	6 March 2024	noha.abd.hassan@gmail.com
3	Amina Abdel Maksoud IOM	Interview	Virtual	10 March	abdelmaksoud@iom.int
4	Merna Ashraf UNODC	Interview	Virtual	3 March 2024	merna.ashraf@un.org
5	Marwa Salah ILO ACCEL project	Interview	Virtual	4 March 2024	abdou@ilo.org
6	Ibrahim Abouzaid ILO BETTERWORK project	Interview	Virtual	10 March 2024	abouzaidi@ilo.org
7	Jean McAnerney	Interview	Virtual	8 March 2024	mcanerneykj@state.gov
8	Ambassadors/ Naela Gabr Head NCCPIM & TIP-	Interview	In-Person	17 March 2024	
9	Ambassadors/ naela gabr Chairperson NCCPIM & TIP-	Interview	In-Person	17 March 2024	
10	Salma Elelimi Technical Secretariat - Counter Trafficking Unit	Interview	In-Person	17 March 2024	salmaelelimi@gmail.com +201223466564

	Interviewee	Type of data collection	Method of data collection	Date	Contact
	National Coordinating Committee for Combating and Preventing Illegal Migration and Trafficking In Persons (NCCPIM&TIP)				
11	Reem zahrane	Interview	In-Person	17 March 2024	reemzahrane@yahoo.com
10	Ramadan GALAL EGYPTIAN FEDERATION INDUSTRIES	Interview	Phone	20 March 2024	01001498579
11	Abdel fattah Agriculture trade union	Interview	Phone	20 March 2024	01002212981
12	Rabab nabhan Human resources and compliance director Tie company	Interview	Phone	20 March 2024	01222666629
14	Dr. Talaat Abdel kawi Ngo union	Interview	In Person	25 March 2024	
15	El Sayed El sharkawy General manager Labour inspection department Ministry of labour	Interview	In Person	25 March 2024	
16	Hussein Ismail The general department for social defense Moss	Interview	In Person	25 March 2024	

	Interviewee	Type of data collection	Method of data collection	Date	Contact
17	Mohamed Youseef Abdel Rahman Head of the fast intervention programme in MOSS	Interview	In Person	25 March 2024	
18	Dr. Mahmoud el Hawart	Interview	In Person	25 March 2024	
19	Dr. Ramy atta Professor of press and representative of the church	Interview	In Person	25 March 2024	
20	Ali Ramadan National Council for Motherhood and Childhood Deputy Manager of the child hot line	Interview	In Person	25 March 2024	

ANNEX VII – Lessons Learned

Project DC/SYMBOL: **EGY/20/06/USA**

Name of Evaluator: **Doaa Abdelaal**

Date: **30 September 2024.**

The following lesson learned has been identified during the course of the evaluation. Further text explaining the lesson may be included in the full evaluation report.

LESSON LEARNED ELEMENT	Addressing economic cause of human trafficking through offering technical and vocational education and training (TVET) training for potential victims of Trafficking in Person (TIP)
Brief description of lessons learned (link to specific action or task)	This lesson learnt is related to the activities of the project which target working with TVET centers on reintegration of victims of TIP or increasing the capacity of potential victims to enter labour market.
Context and any related preconditions	Since 2016, the Egyptian economy has encountered notable instability, affecting the government's developmental goals and expectations. The Egyptian pound's repeated devaluation, combined with challenges from international incidents like the COVID-19 pandemic and the conflict between Russia and Ukraine, all affected negatively the Egyptian economy. These hurdles expose youth and women to various forms of exploitation especially in workplaces. This is combined by lack of knowledge between the public of forms of human trafficking and reporting channels. In this fluid and challenging context, it is essential to address economic root causes which jeopardize youth and women safety exposing them to risks of falling victims of human trafficking is key to combating human trafficking.

Targeted users /Beneficiaries	Main beneficiaries are the national centers of TVET and eventually the victims or potential victims of TIP
Challenges /negative lessons - Causal factors	This approach can be faced by challenges as: National TVET centers lack capacity to respond to the needs of victims of TIP or potential victims in terms of accruing skills secure livelihood. Preference of potential victims to resort to known types of work as domestic work that expose may expose them to forms of human trafficking rather than learning new skills.
Success / Positive Issues - Causal factors	This lesson is highly recognized by the national counterpart as it assists in Egypt's goals of asserting decent work concepts in the labour market
ILO Administrative Issues (staff, resources, design, implementation)	The ILO staff should track the skills need in the labour market in Egypt to assist the TVET centers in developing vocational skills programmes However, there are factors which may lead to successful implementation of this approach: - Designing activities which capacitate national TVET centers to specifically service re-integration of victims of TIP. Organizing campaigns which reach to potential victims of TIP or victims themselves encouraging them to join the specialized trainings targeting their reintegration social and economically.
LESSON LEARNED ELEMENT	Reaching to institutions and organizations in governorates other than Cairo and Alexandria provide higher potential to reach TIP victims or potential victims with enhanced services.
Brief description of lessons learned (link to specific action or task)	There are multiple players in combating human trafficking who reside outside Cairo and Alexandria governorates. The project played a crucial role in mapping them and reaching out in include in its capacity building activities and awareness raising. This includes Raedat Refeyat (The rural women leaders) who are usually conduct a door-to-door awareness raising campaigns in rural communities and can mainstream knowledge about forms of TIP in their awareness raising discussions.

Context and any related preconditions	Though confirmed data sources in Egypt are rare in relation to number of TIP victims and their geographical distribution, there is an assumption that cases of TIP exist in other governorates than Cairo and Alexandria. Following Cairo, Giza and Alexandria, the other governorates include Aswan, Dakhliya, Qalyubia, Assiut, Gharbiya, Minia, Menoufia, Kafer El Sheikh, Matruh, Al-Sharkia, Port Said and Behira. This necessitates capacitating governmental staff and service providers in these governorates. Thus, an important lesson learnt emerging from the project is to include participants from national institutions, NGOs, private sector and trade unions from these governorates in the trainings offered by the ILO's project in the field of combating TIP. There is usually limited financial and human resources available to capacitate governmental staff and service providers in governorates on combating human trafficking. This approach expands the outreach to public in several governorates but will necessitate allocation of resources for trainings outside major cities as Cairo and Alexandria. Therefore, the ILO is encouraged to mobilize resources for trainings to host those potential participants or better to hold the trainings in these governorates.
Targeted users /Beneficiaries	Mainly ILO staff who can integrate this lesson in activities of programmes and projects.
Challenges /negative lessons - Causal factors	The reach out and inclusion of several players from several governorates requires allocation of financial and human resources
Success / Positive Issues - Causal factors	The ability of targeted groups outside Cairo and Alexandria governorates to reach to higher number of potential victims of TIP especially in rural areas.

ILO Administrative Issues (staff, resources, design, implementation)	The ILO staff should track the skills need in the labour market in Egypt to assist the TVET centers in developing vocational skills programmes
---	--

ANNEX VIII – Good Practices

Project DC/SYMBOL: **EGY/20/06/USA**

Name of Evaluator: **Doaa Abdelaal**

Date: **30 September 2024.**

The following emerging good practice has been identified during the course of the evaluation. Further text can be found in the full evaluation report.

GOOD PRACTICE ELEMENT	Building a pool of advanced trained governmental staff to train and mentor other governmental employs in the field of combating Trafficking in Person (TIP)
Brief summary of the good practice (link to project goal or specific deliverable, background, purpose, etc.)	Labour inspectors play an important role in reporting cases of forced labour through their mandate of monitoring labour rights in companies and factories. Their role in reporting cases of forced labour will progress once the national referral mechanisms (NRM) of TIP Cases Is activated. This aligns with a main objective of the project which is to improve the capacity of the Egyptian Government to combat human trafficking by strengthening the national identification and NRM. The project trained labour inspectors, Ministry of Social Solidarity (MoSS) staff and other governmental staff who can mentor their colleagues on identifying and reporting cases of human trafficking. The project adopted this method with labour inspectors in the Ministry of Labour who inspect the operations of companies and factories including their commitment to international labour standards and report cases of forced labour.

	This is in line with the overall objective of the project is to improve the capacity of the Egyptian Government to combat human trafficking by strengthening the national identification and referral mechanisms (NRM) and providing assistance and reintegration services for identified victims.
Relevant conditions and Context: limitations or advice in terms of applicability and replicability	The Ministry of Labour is a key counterpart for the ILO in Egypt which increase potential for replicating this approach during future collaborations. It is essential to coordinate with other UN agencies and international organization active in in managing projects in the field of combating human trafficking as the UNODC to synchronize efforts with the ministry and the labour inspectors.
Establish a clear cause- effect relationship	As Ministry of Labour plays an important role in reporting cases of forced labour, it is essential that the labour inspectors who are part of its staff and monitor labour rights in companies and factories have a solid mentoring mechanism throughout the process especially that the labour inspection is still progressing in implementing the articles of the HT law.
Indicate measurable impact and targeted beneficiaries	This method will enhance the reporting and protection process of victims or potential victims of TIP. The main targeted beneficiary is the Ministry of Labour.
Potential for replication and by whom	High potentiality to be replicated by the Government of Egypt through the NCCPM&TIP This practice should be proceeded by a training which host a large number of inspectors, following that training a selection process should be followed to recruit the most advanced participants to attend the training of trainers, they should be provided by mentorship skills in addition to advanced knowledge. Currently, a pool if 13 labour inspectors re trained,
Upward links to higher ILO Goals (DWCPs, Country Programme Outcomes or ILO's Strategic Programme Framework)	Of high relevance to ILO's Strategic Programme Framework

Other documents or relevant comments	This approach contributes towards achieving the SDG 8 in relation to decent work
GOOD PRACTICE ELEMENT	Strengthening the capacity of governmental staff extends to assisting in developing visual formats of national documents. The project developed a mind map of the National Referral System (NRM) for human trafficking.
Brief summary of the good practice (link to project goal or specific deliverable, background, purpose, etc.)	National documents and policies are usually long reading which pose an obstacle to following its procedures. The bisexualization of the materials assists in conveying messages in concise versions. It is important to include target groups of the visualization in designing the end result, so the final material is clear and usable. The combating Human Trafficking in Egypt project produced a visualized mind map of the NRM of victims of TIP is issued and distributed in multiple trainings.
Relevant conditions and Context: limitations or advice in terms of applicability and replicability	This approach will achieve its best results when target groups are involved in developing the visualization
Establish a clear cause-effectrelationship	National documents and policies are usually long read which pose an obstacle to following its procedures. The visualization of the materials assists in conveying messages in concise versions.
Indicate measurable impact and targeted beneficiaries	This method will enhance the usability of the national documents by the governmental staff in the governmental entities which are mandated by reporting cases of trafficking in persons.
Potential for replication and by whom	This method has high potentiality of replicability as it facilitates the application of referring cases of TIP or similar referral systems to ensure mainstreaming of human rights.

Upward links to higher ILO Goals (DWCPs, Country Programme Outcomes or ILO's Strategic Programme Framework)	Of high relevance to ILO's Strategic Programme Framework
Other documents or relevant comments	This method contributes towards achieving the SDG 8 in relation to decent work