



Support for effective and inclusive trade unions in Bangladesh

ILO DC/SYMBOL: BGD/23/01/DEU

Type of Evaluation: Project

Evaluation timing: Final

Evaluation nature: Independent

Project countries: Bangladesh

P&B Outcome(s): Output 2.2 Increased institutional, technical, representational and policy impact capacities of workers' organizations

SDG(s): SDG 5: Gender equality, SDG 8: Decent work and economic growth

Date when the evaluation was completed by the evaluator: [Click here to enter a date.](#)

Date when evaluation was approved by EVAL: Aug. 4, 2025

ILO Administrative Office: CO-Dhaka

ILO Technical Office(s): Labour Law and Social Dialogue, NORMES, ACTRAV

Joint evaluation agencies: n/a

Project duration: May 2023-April 2025

Donor and budget: GIZ, \$1,101,292

Name of consultant(s): Chris Morris- Team Leader, Zakia Haque- National Consultant

Name of Evaluation Manager: Zhou Jie

Evaluation Office oversight: Naomi Asukai, ILO Evaluation Office. Pamornrat Pringsulaka, ILO Regional Office

Evaluation budget: US\$ 21,867

Key Words: [Social Dialogue](#), [Collective Bargaining](#), [Gender Equality](#), [Youth Empowerment](#), [Trade Union Capacity Building](#)

This evaluation has been conducted according to ILO's evaluation policies and procedures. It has not been professionally edited, but has undergone quality control by the ILO Evaluation Office.

Table of Contents

Table of Contents	1
Acknowledgements	2
List of Acronyms	3
Executive Summary	5
Executive Summary	5
1. Background and Project Description	10
1.1 Background	10
1.2 Project Description	11
2. Evaluation Background	13
2.1 Purpose, Scope, and Clients of the Evaluation	13
2.2 Evaluation Criteria and Questions	13
2.3 Methodology	14
2.4 Norms, standards and ethical safeguards	16
2.5 Limitations and Potential Sources of Bias.....	16
3. Findings.....	17
3.1 Relevance and Strategic Fit	17
3.2 Coherence	22
3.3 Effectiveness.....	26
3.4 Efficiency	34
3.5 Impact Orientation	35
3.6 Sustainability.....	39
4.1 Conclusions.....	41
4.2 Recommendations.....	43
4.3 Lessons Learned	46
4.4 Emerging Good Practices.....	46
Annex 1: Evaluation TOR	47
Annex 2: Evaluation Matrix.....	65
Annex 3: List of Interviews Conducted	71
Annex 4: List of documents consulted.....	73
Annex 5: Lessons learnt and Good practices	74
Annex 6: Interview Guides.....	80

Acknowledgements

We would like to express sincere gratitude to all the stakeholders who participated in the evaluation including project partners, trade union leaders, master trainers, and ILO Officials. Their viewpoints, stories, recommendations were of vital importance to the understanding the implementation of the project and we thank them for sharing their experiences with us.

We are also appreciative of the support of the Evaluation Manager, Zhou Jie and Regional Evaluation Officer, Pamornrat Pringsulaka oversight and feedback on the inception and final reports. Additionally, the support of the ILO project team and officials at BILS and WRC in preparing documents for review, arranging the logistics of the data collection mission, and contacting relevant stakeholders, was invaluable.

Chris Morris

chrisjohnmorris@gmail.com

Zakia Haque

zakiahaque@creativepathwaysbd.org

March 2025

List of Acronyms

A.I.	Artificial Intelligence
BILS	Bangladesh Institute of Labour Studies
CSO	Civil Society Organisation
DWCP	Decent Work Country Programme
EPZ	Export Processing Zones
FGD	Focus Group Discussion
FPRW	Fundamental Principles and Rights at Work
GIZ	Deutsche Gesellschaft für Internationale Zusammenarbeit
IBC	IndustriALL Bangladesh Council
ILC	International Labour Conference
ILO	International Labour Organization
ITUC	International Trade Union Congress
KII	Key Informant Interview
LAWC	Labour Administration and Working Conditions
M&E	Monitoring and Evaluation
NCCWE	National Coordination Committee for Workers Education
OPD	Organisation of Persons with Disabilities
RMG	Ready Made Garments
ROAP	Regional Office for Asia and the Pacific
SDG	Social Development Goals
TOR	Terms of Reference
ToT	Training of Trainers
WRC	Workers Resource Centre

List of Tables and Figures

List of Tables and Diagrams

Interview Sample	16
Project Outputs- planned vs achieved	27

Executive Summary

Executive Summary

Project Background

The Support for Effective and Inclusive Trade Unions in Bangladesh project was designed to respond to the identified needs of trade union federations to address gaps in opportunities leadership for younger members, particularly women. Bangladesh has been rated by the International Trade Union Confederation (ITUC) as one of the ten most restrictive countries for rights to collective bargaining and freedom of association for workers. The trade union movement in Bangladesh is fractured and highly politicised and weaknesses in the union movement include weak internal governance, rigid and often exclusionary leadership and seniority structures, lack of economic independence and management capacities, limited awareness of national and international labour laws and rights, lack of attention to issues faced by women workers and persons with disabilities, and a focus on only the formal sector.

The project aims to respond to these challenges by increasing the capacities of trade unions in Bangladesh to actively engage in labour reforms and advance the decent work agenda. It is specifically focused on training and empowering the next generation of trade union leaders, particularly women and youth at both the federation and enterprise levels.

The overall goal of the project is 'Improved democratic and representative trade union capacity for sustainable and effective tripartite social dialogue.' The project aims to achieve this through two outcomes:

- Outcome 1: Inclusive and effective trade union organisations through increased number of women and youth leaders.
- Outcome 2: Improved collective bargaining capacity of trade unions through social dialogues.

The project has two implementing partners, the Bangladesh Institute of Labour Studies (BILS) and the Workers Resource Centre (WRC).

Current Situation of the Project

The project, which is funded by GIZ, was initially scheduled for run from May 2023 until December 2024. During this period significant external disruptions in the run-up to and during the January 2024 general election and the removal of the government in August 2024 hampered project implementation. As a result, GIZ agreed to a four month no-cost extension until April 2025. As of the time of data collection (February 2025), 90% of the project activities had been completed, with the remaining scheduled for completion before the end of the project.

Purpose, scope and clients of the evaluation

This was a final evaluation. It covered the entirety of the project from inception to completion. The evaluation had both summative elements, with the goal of assessing progress towards achieving programme objective and formative elements, with a focus on identifying good practices, lessons learned, and avenues for future collaboration and support.

The main primary clients of the evaluation will be the management team of the project, the ILO country office in Dhaka and the technical backstopping units of ACTRAV, Labour Law and Social Dialogue, NORMES, the Decent Work Team (DWT) in New Delhi, GIZ, and the trade unions in

Bangladesh. Secondary users will include and other programme staff and project managers within the ILO implementing similar projects.

Methodology

The evaluation utilised a mixed methods approach, relying mainly on qualitative data collection, that was triangulated with quantitative data the programme had collected through its monitoring processes. Methods included a desk review, key informant interviews (KIIs), and focus group discussions (FGDs). The evaluation team consisted of a team leader, who conducted remote data collection, and a national consultant who conducted in-person KIIs and FGDs. Evaluation participants included ILO staff, representatives of BILS and the WRC, trade union members who had participated in training, and a representative of the donor.

A total of 47 individuals participated in the evaluation in (24 women, 23 men) participated in the evaluation in 22 individual KIIs, 2 group KIIs and 4 FGDs.

Category	Women	Men	Total
BILS Officials	2	3	5
WRC Officials	3	4	7
Trainees	16	13	29
Donor Representatives	1	0	1
ILO Officials	2	3	5
Grand Total	24	23	47

Table 1: Interview Sample

Sampling was mainly purposive. Suggestions for interviews were made by the ILO team. The evaluation team randomly selected some additional trainees to contact for interviews.

The main limitations to the evaluation were the unavailability of some interviewees, particularly those who do not live in Dhaka, some language limitations in interviews with the Team Leader, and the remote nature of some of the data collection. These were mitigated to a large extent by the National Consultant being able to support with interpretation, in-person interviews, and though phone calls to participants who do not live in Dhaka.

Findings

The Support for Effective and Inclusive Trade Unions in Bangladesh project has made important progress towards strengthening the voice of youth and women within the Bangladesh trade union movement. The evaluation found the project to have addressed important gaps in the trade union movement. The long-term commitment of trade union leaders, their members, and the organisations to continue the progress of the project is needed. The project is the initial step in this process but should the gains of the project be retained and ongoing work continued, the seeds of this project can lead to significant change in the future.

Relevance and Strategic Fit

Key Finding 1: The project has addressed a key need of trade unions to train and empower the next generation of leaders.

Key Finding 2: The limited resources and logistical capacities of trade unions have affected the overall relevance of the project, restricting the ability of newly trained leaders to effectively apply their newly acquired skills.

Key Finding 3: There are mixed results on incorporating the ILO's cross-cutting themes into the project.

The gaps in leadership of the younger generation were acknowledged by several trade union leaders at the national and enterprise level during the evaluation. The evaluation found that active consultation of key trade union leaders had supported the development of a relevant project that aligned with their priorities.

The ILO and BILS have made attempts to bridge logistic gap through offering a trade union corner where trade unions can access IT and other office equipment on a rotating basis for both practicing IT skills and conducting office and promotional work. While this is an important facility, trainees still have challenges in accessing necessary equipment, particularly those not located near to the BILS offices in Dhaka.

Of the ILO's cross-cutting themes, the project has focused on Improving capacities to participate in social dialogue and addressing gender inequality within the trade union movement. The project was not designed to address disability inclusion or the just transition to environmental sustainability. Although the project supports strengthening the trade union movement's capacities in collective bargaining, the project activities did not explicitly focus on strengthening awareness of international labour standards.

Coherence

Key Finding 4: The project has ensured synergies within the ILO's Labour Administration and Working Conditions cluster.

Key Finding 5: The logic of the project is essentially sound when considering the project as an initial step-in longer-term process of empowering younger trade union leaders but lacked a theory of change.

Synergies with other projects in the ILO's Labour Administration and Working conditions cluster include Better Work Bangladesh providing additional training for approximately 50% of the Master Trainers and the work will be continued as part of funding the ILO has received from the European Union and the Governments of Nether-lands, Sweden, and Denmark, and a separate project supported by Global Affairs Canada.

The logic of the project focuses on expanding the capacities of the younger generation to become involved in both the day-to-day management of trade unions and in leadership in policy dialogues and collective bargaining, with the overall theory that this will increase the capacities of trade unions to represent workers in Bangladesh. This appears to be sound logic, however, it would have been useful to have produced a theory of change that maps out the project's contribution to the ILO's overall work in the Labour Administration and Working Conditions cluster and how more long-term change would be achieved. This would also help the measurement and understanding of change over time.

Effectiveness

Key Finding 6: The project is on track to achieve its planned outputs by the end of April 2025, following a no-cost extension due to external political developments beyond the ILO's control. Progress has been made to achieving the overall objectives but the short duration of the project, means these results should be viewed as an initial step in the process.

Key Finding 7: The four training modules developed under the project were widely recognized as a key factor in its success.

Key Finding 8: The monitoring framework of the project was limited, and consideration needs to be given to measuring actual change and impact.

By the time of the evaluation, the project had achieved over 90% of its targets and should complete all by the end of the project in April 2025. The project has exceeded its targets in some areas, such as the development of 32 action plans at the enterprise level. The project's duration was originally only 18 months, extended to 24 with a no-cost extension. As such, progress in achieving the overall objectives is the first step in a longer-term process. Achievements have been made but longer-term support will be needed to consolidate these.

The four training modules offered by BILS and the WRC were a key enabler of the project's achievements. Stakeholders found the modules to be highly relevant to the needs of trade unions and their members, contributing to improved capacity and awareness on industrial relations, leadership, gender inclusivity, and trade union management. Other enablers included the attention to gender equality and the inclusion of youth, strong partners, the enthusiasm of the trainees, the willingness of the senior leadership to accept the need for increased involvement of a new generation of leaders, and the involvement of partners in the design of the project.

A key challenge of the project faced include the limited approach to monitoring the change the project brought about, and this hampers learning opportunities and the ability of the ILO and its partners to understand change over multiple interventions in the longer-term. Other challenges included some trade union leaders being less open to the idea of change, difficulties in including trade union members from more rural locations, limited adherence to trainee selection criteria, and the lack of attention to disability inclusion.

Efficiency

Key Finding 9: Project partners believed that sufficient resources have been allocated for the delivery of the project.

Key Finding 10: The development of partner based steering committees was an effective approach to ensuring the project was implemented efficiently.

Key Finding 11: The limited time frame for the project reduces the overall efficiency of the approach.

The partners in the project have used the funding effectively and most stakeholders believed it was sufficient to complete the agreed outputs. The ease of availability of technical support from the ILO was also highlighted as being an important resource for the partners. The efficiency is also enhanced by the development of partner based steering committees to oversee the individual activities of each partner. This helped build ownership of the project from the partner's members and ensure effective implementation. The main concern for efficiency was the limited project timeframe. Several stakeholders indicated that more in-depth training and increased support and monitoring would have improved the outcomes of the project, but that there was not sufficient time in the project to allow for this.

Impact Orientation

Key Finding 12: Identifying impact in an 18-month project is challenging, however, it is possible to identify some positive areas of change.

Key Finding 13: The project has achieved important accomplishments with regards to gender equality and youth empowerment.

The evaluation identified changes related to gains in the confidence and engagement of young leaders, a strengthening of the administrative capacities of trade unions, and greater awareness among trade union leaders of the need to include youth and women in trade union leadership. Many changes will require further work to have long-lasting impact and sustainability.

The project's achievements related to gender equality and youth empowerment includes the development of Women and Youth Committees and there is some anecdotal evidence of improved involvement of the newly trained leaders in policy discussions and setting. However, developing measures of the actual changes in the level of influence of the newly trained leaders is important to understand the level of impact this work will have.

Sustainability

Key Finding 14: Action plans developed by trade unions provide strong potential for sustainability but support in implementation and monitoring of the action plans will be needed if the gains of the project are to be sustained.

Key Finding 15: The approach of training a new generation of leaders of trade unions should help sustainability so long as senior leaders continue to recognise the importance of empowering this generation.

The sustainability of the project is very much dependent on the continued commitment of the senior leadership of the trade union movement to empowering change and a turnover of leadership for younger members, as well as ongoing support from key stakeholders including BILs, the WRC, the ILO, and GIZ. The ILO will continue to support similar work in ongoing funding from European Governments and Global Affairs Canada. This will be needed to consolidate the gains of the project. As an example, a key success of the project has been the development of action plans by national and sector level federations. However, the length of the project meant follow up has not yet been possible. Programming support and monitoring of the implementation of the action plans will be needed to ensure long-term sustainability.

Recommendations

1. Strengthen the monitoring framework in future interventions.
2. Develop a theory of change.
3. Follow up of action plans.
4. Ensure future interventions include a focus on disability inclusion.
5. Provide continued support through training to the project's trainees.
6. Expand the reach of activities to more remote locations and the informal sector.
7. Identify ways to improve the availability of office space and equipment within trade unions.
8. Ensure the Youth and Women's Committees continue to be supported and are given meaningful opportunities to engage in policy platforms.
9. Develop gender equality and disability inclusion policies at all levels of the trade union movement.
10. Strengthen adherence with the selection criteria for trainees

Lessons Learned

1. Monitoring frameworks are important to understanding the achievements of the project.
2. There is real appetite for involvement by the new generation of youth and women leaders that can be harnessed for positive change by the trade union movement in the future.
3. Short project timeframes limit the depth of the training offered.

Good Practices

1. Project steering committees led by the project partners help support ownership of the project.
2. The joint development of the project that included the ILO, BILS, WRC, and other members of the trade union membership helped ensure the project was highly relevant to the needs of the trade union movement in Bangladesh.

1. Background and Project Description

1.1 Background

Bangladesh has experienced a sustained period of economic growth since 1991 with strong improvements in human development index indicators including literacy, life expectancy and per capita food consumption. It is estimated that more than 15 million people have moved out of poverty since 1992¹. However, this growth has also been coupled with rising inequality and poor working conditions for millions of workers in both the formal and informal sectors. Bangladesh is particularly vulnerable to the impacts of automation and artificial intelligence (A.I.). One report estimated that 60% of Bangladesh's workforce are employed in industries where employment is at high risk from automation². The ILO has estimated that 5.38 million jobs are at risk by 2041 in five key areas of Bangladesh's manufacturing and service sectors³.

The right to freedom of association and collective bargaining is recognised as one of the fundamental employment rights and was included in one of the four original fundamental principles enshrined in the [ILO Declaration of the Principles and Rights at Work](#) (FPRW), adopted by the International Labour Conference (ILC) in 1998⁴.

Freedom of association allows for the rights of workers and employers to form and join organisations and chose who and how to defend their occupation interests. Collective bargaining is the process through which workers and employers discuss and agree their relationships, particularly the negotiation of terms and conditions of work and employment.

The ILO has two fundamental conventions related to the freedom of association and collective bargaining, the Freedom of Association and Protection of the Right to Organize Convention, 1948 (No.

¹ <https://www.worldbank.org/en/country/bangladesh/overview>

² <https://www.elibrary.imf.org/view/journals/002/2022/072/article-A005-en.xml>

³ [https://industryinsiderbd.com/impact-of-automation-on-the-economy-and-labor-force/#:~:text=The%20International%20Labour%20Organisation%20\(ILO,the%20industries%20and%20services%20sector.](https://industryinsiderbd.com/impact-of-automation-on-the-economy-and-labor-force/#:~:text=The%20International%20Labour%20Organisation%20(ILO,the%20industries%20and%20services%20sector.)

⁴ The four original fundamental rights and principles were freedom of association and the effective recognition of the right to collective bargaining; b) the elimination of all forms of forced or compulsory labour; c) the effective abolition of child labour; and d) the elimination of discrimination in respect of employment and occupation. In 2022, the ILC added a safe and healthy working environment as a fifth principle and right.

87) and the Right to Organize and Collective Bargaining Convention, 1949 (No. 98). Bangladesh ratified both conventions in 1972 and freedom of association and the right to collective bargaining are both recognised under the Bangladesh constitution and within the Labour Act. Despite this, the International Trade Union Congress (ITUC) rated Bangladesh in the worse 10 countries where labour rights are not guaranteed. Challenges to freedom of association include, undue or excessive privileges granted to certain organisations, restrictions on the right to elect representatives and self-administer in full freedom, limits on certain categories of workers from forming unions, and several barriers to the establishment of organisations. Restrictions on the right of collective bargaining include restrictions on the principle of free and voluntary bargaining, limitations or bans on collective bargaining in certain sectors, the regulation and undue interference of the authorities in the management of strike action, and restrictions on the right to strike in certain circumstances or sections, including the export processing zones (EPZ)⁵.

The trade union movement itself suffers from significant weaknesses and capacity gaps. Trade unions are often politicised and align with the political parties, reflecting the broader political divisions and tensions within Bangladesh. Weaknesses in the union movement include weak internal governance, rigid and often exclusionary leadership and seniority structures, lack of economic independence and management capacities, limited awareness of national and international labour laws and rights, lack of attention to issues faced by women workers and persons with disabilities, and a focus on only the formal sector. Training the next generation of leaders and increasing the inclusiveness of senior leadership is critically important, especially given the challenges that will be faced related to automation, with the shrinkage of the workforce potentially impacting trade union membership numbers.

During the period of project implementation, Bangladesh went through a period of political upheaval. A general election that was held in January 2024. While elections in Bangladesh have previously led to disruptions that cause delays to project implementation, unrest linked to this election was longer than usual and thus had greater than expected delays. Following the re-election of the ruling party and a period of calm, a series of protests against the 14-year rule of Prime Minister Sheikh Hasina and the Awami League led by students broke out in July 2024, initially as a result of the reinstatement of the quota system that gave preference to veterans of the independence war and their families in government jobs and university placements. The protests morphed into more general grievances with the democratic backsliding that had taken place and culminated in the resignation of Sheikh Hasina and her cabinet, and the installation of a caretaker government led by Muhammad Yunus. The twin political upheavals created unforeseen delays in project implementation as the security situation prevented activities from being implemented.

1.2 Project Description

The project aims to increase the capacities of trade unions in Bangladesh to actively engage in labour reforms and advance the decent work agenda. It is specifically focused on training and empowering the next generation of trade union leaders, particularly women and youth at both the federation and enterprise levels.

The project is funded by the Government of Germany through Deutsche Gesellschaft für Internationale Zusammenarbeit (GIZ). It was originally designed to run from May 2023 until

⁵ https://ituc-csi.org/spip.php?page=legal_info&cc=BGD&lang=en

December 2024 but has been granted a three month no-cost extension until April 2025. It has a budget of 999,914.40 EURO.

The overall development objective of the project is: 'Improved democratic and representative trade union capacity for sustainable and effective tripartite social dialogue.' The project aims to achieve this through two outcomes:

- **Outcome 1:** Inclusive and effective trade union organisations through increased number of women and youth leaders.
- **Outcome 2:** Improved collective bargaining capacity of trade unions through social dialogues.

The project is designed to build on previous work by the ILO and GIZ. This includes the ongoing GIZ - Friedrich-Ebert-Stiftung (FES) project "Higher Education and Leadership Development for Sustainable Textiles in Bangladesh (HELD)" which has been working through the Academy of Work in developing the capacity of young trade union leaders, as well as the ILO implemented Promoting Social Dialogue and Harmonious Relations in Bangladesh project and the Support for effective and inclusive trade unions in Bangladesh.

Current Status of the Programme

Originally designed as a 20-month intervention, the project was granted a four month no-cost extension until April 2025. Project implementation experienced some delays from the political upheaval that took place in August/September 2024, as well as before the general election in January 2024. The project team expects that all activities will be completed by the end of April 2025.

Programme Management

The ILO Country Office Dhaka utilises a cluster approach to implement the Decent Work Country Programme (DWCP) for 2022-26. The project has been embedded in two cluster programmes, the Labour Administration and Working Conditions (LAWC) clusters. Under the guidance of a Programme Manager, the project is managed by a National Officer for Trade Unions, with support from a National Officer Learning Coordinator (NoA) and an Admin/Finance Officer. The project team also includes a Training Focal Point and a Monitoring and Evaluation Officer.

There are two implementing partners responsible for delivering several aspects of the project. These are the Bangladesh Institute of Labour Studies (BILS) and the Workers Resource Centre (WRC). Implementation agreements detailing activities and outputs were signed with both partners.

BILS was established in 1995. The mission of BILS is to support the trade union movement in Bangladesh to act as the social partner and vanguard for decent work. BILS is the only labour institute in Bangladesh and has 12 national trade union federations as affiliates. It provides capacity building and training to trade unions, conducts advocacy and lobbying, undertakes research, and organises networking opportunities for trade unions.

The WRC is a joint platform of the National Coordination Committee for Workers Education (NCCWE) and the IndustriALL Bangladesh Council (IBC). It was launched in 2018. It provides a one-stop support centre for workers and provides training, education, and information on labour related issues, including grievance management, social dialogue, and collective bargaining. Its membership includes national and sectoral trade union federations under the umbrella of the NCCWE and IBC.

2. Evaluation Background

2.1 Purpose, Scope, and Clients of the Evaluation

Purpose and Objectives

This was a final evaluation and thus had a focus on accountability in assessing the progress towards achieving programme objectives. Given the ILO will continue to work closely with trade unions in Bangladesh, the evaluation also had a significant lesson learning focus, identifying good practices, lessons learned, and avenues for future collaboration and support.

Scope

The evaluation covered the period of implementation from the inception of the programme in April 2023 until the time of the data collection. It also considered the feasibility of the workplan for the remaining two months of the project after the evaluation.

Evaluation Clients/Users

The main primary clients of the evaluation will be the management team of the project, the ILO country office in Dhaka and the technical backstopping units of ACTRAV, Labour Law and Social Dialogue, NORMES, the Decent Work Team (DWT) in New Delhi, and GIZ. The trade unions in Bangladesh will also be primary clients of the evaluation. Secondary users will include and other programme staff and project managers within the ILO implementing similar projects.

2.2 Evaluation Criteria and Questions

The evaluation considered the progress of the project through defined criteria based on the OECD/DAC criteria. The selected criteria were relevance and validity of design, coherence, effectiveness, efficiency (including effectiveness of management arrangements), orientation towards impact, and sustainability.

The [ILO's policy guidelines for results-based evaluation](#) require the cross-cutting themes of gender equality and non-discrimination, disability inclusion, promotion of international labour standards, tripartism, social dialogue, as well as the just transition to environmentally sustainable economies to be assessed in evaluations. These were considered within the evaluation questions and during the implementation of the evaluation.

1. Relevance and Validity of Design

- To what extent has the project aligned with, and supported national development plans and priorities of trade unions?
- To what extent have the project objectives and interventions responded to the needs of beneficiaries including women, youth and persons with disabilities?
- To what extent has the project integrated the cross-cutting themes (international labour standards, non-discrimination, social dialogue, tripartism and just transition) in the design?

2. Coherence

- To what extent has the project built on previous experience of the ILO in Bangladesh, and relevant local and international experiences?
- To what extent has the project built the synergy with other work of the Labour Administration and Working Conditions cluster at ILO Dhaka and the Decent Work Country Programme Bangladesh (2022-26), SDGs and UNSDCF 2022-26?

- To what extent have the project interventions added values to the existing efforts in strengthening inclusive organization of trade unions and building unions' capacity of carrying out effective collective bargaining in Bangladesh?
- To what extent have the different components of the project interventions complemented each other towards achieving the project objectives?

3. Effectiveness

- To what extent has the project progressed towards its planned objectives? Are the activities having the desired results?
- What were the main internal and external factors that influenced the achievement or non-achievement of results?
- How effectively did the project monitor performance and results? What were the systems put in place to track progress and risks?

4. Efficiency

- Were the available technical and financial resources adequate to fulfil the project plans?
- Were the management arrangements (roles and responsibilities assigned for ILO staff and key stakeholders) sufficient to support the project implementation?

5. Impact Orientation

- To what extent has the project created evidence-based positive changes and transformative changes towards achieving the project ultimate objective i.e. improved democratic and representative trade union capacity for sustainable and effective tripartite social dialogue?
- To what extent has the project strengthened the inclusiveness and representation of trade unions and capacity of trade unions in carrying out effective collective bargaining?
- To what extent has the project effectively contributed to promoting women and youth leadership including through promotion of international labour standards, gender equality and disability inclusion, social dialogue and tripartism, and just transition?
- What impact has the project had in the process of social dialogue facilitation among the beneficiaries of the project?

6. Sustainability

- Has the project developed and implemented an exit strategy?
- Are the project interventions leading to replicable results?
- Will the project counterpart continue with the training and capacity building activities at various levels and how will the activities of the project still be relevant for the ILO CO Dhaka's engagement with TUs?

2.3 Methodology

Methods

As a summative exercise with formative elements, the evaluation utilised an approach that supported both accountability and lessons learning. To ensure the use of the evaluation by key stakeholders, the approach also needed to ensure participation and ownership. The evaluation was framed within the principles of democratic evaluation that ensured the views of all relevant stakeholders, particularly those with traditionally less agency were included in the findings of the evaluation.

The evaluation relied primarily on qualitative methods, although incorporated quantitative data from the project's monitoring systems. This included desk research, key informant interviews (KIIs), focus group discussions (FGDs). The evaluation tried to ensure the broad participation of key stakeholders to allow for the triangulation of evidence collected from different sources. The evaluation was conducted by a team of two evaluators, a Team Leader who conducted remote data collection via Zoom and Teams, and a National Consultant who conducted in-person data collection and supported the Team Leader during remote data collection.

Inception Period

- Dek Review

During the inception period project documentation such as the project document, progress reports, previous evaluations, and other project documents were reviewed. The project team shared various documents related to the project. Additional documents such as various international framework documents, the ILO's NORMEX webpage, and Bangladesh national policy documents were also reviewed to serve as reference points throughout the evaluation. These documents served as a basis to introduce the evaluation team to the project and help the design of the evaluation, as well as being a data source to triangulated against findings during data collection. As such the documents were revisited regularly during the data collection period. A list of the documents reviewed for the evaluation can be found at annex 4.

- Inception period briefings with key project staff

During the inception phase the evaluation team spoke to the Senior Programme Officer and project focal point, the Training Focal Point, and the Monitoring and Evaluation Officer for the LAWC Cluster. This allowed an opportunity for the project to be introduced and the evaluation team to gain a broader understanding of the documents. The desk review and briefings supported the development of the inception report. This included the evaluation matrix that set out the questions the evaluation would consider. This can be found at annex 2.

Data Collection

The evaluation used both in-person and remote data collection approaches. The Team Leader conducted remote interviews with key stakeholders who were comfortable conducting the interview in English. The National Consultant supported during many of these calls with occasional interpretation where needed. The National Consultant conducted both in-person and phone KIIs and FGDs. The in-person KIIs and FGDs were held at BILS and WRC. Phone calls were utilised to reach stakeholders who were not able to travel to Dhaka for an interview.

The KIIs and FGDs were semi-structured. Interview guides were developed during the inception period but were flexible enough to allow for the following up of interesting points and supporting the stakeholders to share additional information they believed to be relevant. FGDs were conducted with 5 or 6 individuals. Informed consent was taken at the start of each KII and FGD, with the participants promised their statements would be kept anonymous and any quotes used in the report could not be traced back to one individual.

Sampling

Sampling was purposive, and based on involvement in the project, availability, and logistical concerns. A list of proposed stakeholders was originally shared by the ILO's project team. This was reviewed by the evaluation team. Additional project participants who had participated in training were randomly selected by the evaluation team.

The in-person data collection was conducted in Dhaka. BILs and WRC both have national centres that are utilised by the project participants and thus it was believed stakeholders would find this comfortable and convenient. For stakeholders who were not based in Dhaka and unable to travel for the evaluation, phone calls and Zoom calls were conducted by the National Consultant.

A total of 47 individuals (24 women and 23 men) participated in the evaluation in 22 individual KIIs, 2 group KIIs and 4 FGDs. This included 26 participants in KIIs and 21 participants in FGDs. 5 BILS officers (2 women and 3 men), 7 WRC officers (3 women and 4 men), 29 individuals who had been trained during the project (Master Trainers and others) (16 women and 13 men), 1 donor representative (1 women), and 5 ILO Officials (2 women and 3 men) participated in KIIs and FGDs.

Category	Women	Men	Total
BILS Officials	2	3	5
WRC Officials	3	4	7
Trainees	16	13	29
Donor Representatives	1	0	1
ILO Officials	2	3	5
Grand Total	24	23	47

Table 1: Interview Sample

Data Analysis, Reporting, and Feedback Workshops

Following the data collection period, data collected from KIIs and FGDs was reviewed and triangulated with the data from the desk review. A draft report was then compiled and following initial feedback from the ILO was distributed to external stakeholders. A presentation of the findings was made to ILO, BILS, WRC, and GIZ stakeholders in April 2025, and final modifications made to the report following the workshop.

2.4 Norms, standards and ethical safeguards

The evaluation was conducted in line with ILO’s Policy Guidelines for Results-Based Evaluation: Principles, Rationale, Planning, and Managing for Evaluations (2020). The evaluation also adhered to the UN Norms and Standards (2016), paying attention to the 10 norms laid out in the guidance. The evaluation was conducted independently with impartiality ensured by recruiting an evaluator not previously involved with implementing the project.

All KIIs and FGDs began with an explanation of the evaluation and informed verbal consent, including explaining the confidentiality of responses, was asked from participants. Data in the report has been anonymized to ensure confidentiality. Participants in FGDs were asked to respect the confidentiality of other participants.

2.5 Limitations and Potential Sources of Bias

Although the evaluation made every effort to avoid limitations and sources of bias, there are some limitations which were identified:

- Need to conduct remote interviews

The Team Leader was not able to travel to Bangladesh and conducted interviews remotely. The Team Leader is experienced in this type of data collection, but there is the potential for the loss of non-verbal cues and nuance with remote data collection. The recruitment of the National Consultant to conduct in-person interviews largely mitigated this concern.

- Language

Although many of the stakeholders spoke English, fluency levels varied and some of the Team Leader's interviews required support from the National Consultant in interpretation. While the Team Leader is experienced in conducting interviews through interpretation and the National Consultant speaks both Bangla and English fluently, there is still the potential that for some nuances to have been missed. Comparison of data among multiple interviews helped to mitigate this concern.

- Participation of stakeholders from outside Dhaka

It has initially been hoped that it would be possible to facilitate stakeholders from outside Dhaka traveling to WRC and BILS for KIIs and FGDs. This did not prove possible for many of the proposed interviewees. To ensure the evaluation included the voice of participants from other communities, the National Consultant conducted various phone and Zoom interviews. This helped mitigate this concern as much as possible.

3. Findings

3.1 Relevance and Strategic Fit

Key Findings- Relevance and Strategic Fit

Key Finding 1: The project has addressed a key need of trade unions to train and empower the next generation of leaders. This need appears to have been acknowledged by several trade union leaders at the national and enterprise level. Active consultation of key trade union leaders supported the development of a relevant project that aligned with their priorities.

Key Finding 2: The limited resources and logistical capacities of trade unions have affected the overall relevance of the project, restricting the ability of newly trained leaders to effectively apply their newly acquired skills.

Key Finding 3: There are mixed results on incorporating the ILO's cross-cutting themes into the project. Improving capacities to participate in social dialogue is a clear goal of the project. The project has also addressed gender inequality within the trade union movement. The project was not designed to address disability inclusion or the just transition to environmental sustainability. Although the project supports strengthening the trade union movement's capacities in collective bargaining, the project activities did not explicitly focus on strengthening awareness of international labour standards.

Evaluation Questions

- To what extent has the project aligned with, and supported national development plans and priorities of trade unions?
- To what extent have the project objectives and interventions responded to the needs of beneficiaries including women, youth and persons with disabilities?

- To what extent has the project integrated the cross-cutting themes (international labour standards, non-discrimination, social dialogue, tripartism and just transition) in the design?

Relevance to Trade Union Needs

The evaluation identified the project to have been relevant to the needs and priorities of trade unions. The project addresses the generational and gendered gap in leadership faced by trade unions in Bangladesh. Project stakeholders were broadly supportive of the project and believed that it has addressed challenges the movement is facing. Stakeholders informed the evaluation team that the trade union movement is facing problems of shrinking numbers and a lack of younger members taking on organising activities. As such, the project was timely in addressing this gap:

“Trade unions have many challenges. We have lost membership as the formal sector is shrinking. In many cases there are informal workers in the formal sector. The lack of trained organisers to undertake organising programmes is a problem. It was very important to train women and young people. We want women to be able to organise other women and this was helped through this project.” (Project Partner)

The project was also credited with having addressed the challenges of limited office administration capacities among trade union members. This gap was reported to make it difficult for trade unions to organise campaigns, manage and collect membership dues, and maintain members lists. One stakeholder reported that a common attitude before the project was that this element of trade union management was not important so long as the trade union had numbers and mobilisation campaigns but that since the project has been implemented, trade unions have come to recognise the importance of improved administration and management and are now requesting more support on this. Stakeholders made regular reference to the inclusion of training on IT skills as being particularly relevant for office management.

The success of the project in being relevant to the needs of the trade union movement was strengthened by the selection of the four key topics for training. These were Gender and Inclusiveness Issues, Leadership Skills, Trade Union Management, and Industrial Relations. The project also designed a toolkit on collective bargaining and conducted training for the Master Trainers. The 4 modules were held up as being relevant to the needs of the trade unions:

“These 4 trainings were arranged for the success of the Trade union. They are all connected. One topic is incomplete without the other one. These topics are so basic that it is necessary for all kinds of offices. Not only trade unions but we can utilize these skills in any place.” (Master Trainer)

Challenges to relevance to the trade unions

The primary challenge to the project's relevance did not stem from the lack of alignment between the project's key topics and the needs of trade unions. Instead, it was largely due to practical barriers that hindered trainees from effectively applying the skills they acquired.

A significant issue raised by trainees and stakeholders was the limited office logistical capacities, particularly the lack of IT equipment, which restricted their ability to utilize their newly developed skills. In response, BILS and the WRC have attempted to mitigate this challenge by offering rotational office space where trainees from various trade unions can conduct administrative work.

However, a key concern remains: if trainees are unable to consistently apply their skills in their respective trade unions, there is a risk that their capacities will diminish over time as learned knowledge fades. Addressing this gap is crucial to ensuring the long-term impact and sustainability of the training program

The evaluation team found that, in general, trade union leadership recognizes the importance of training the next generation of leaders. However, while many senior leaders support this initiative, some remain hesitant about change.

The WRC encountered challenges in encouraging members to nominate younger participants for workshops instead of senior representatives. This highlights an opportunity to further engage and raise awareness among trade union leaders on the long-term benefits of youth participation.

While progress has been made, continued efforts to promote the inclusion of young leaders remain essential, reinforcing the relevance of this initiative and its role in fostering sustainable leadership within trade unions.

Relevance to National Development Plans

The project was designed and partly implemented prior to the removal of the previous government from office. As such, it was designed while development plans and objectives of the previous government were in place. These most notably include the 8th Five Year Development Plan (2020-2025), as well as the National Action Plan (NAP) on the Labour Sector of Bangladesh (2021-2026) and the Government of Bangladesh GB Roadmap on the Labour Sector of Bangladesh (2021-2026).

The 8th Five Year Development Plan does not explicitly reference trade unions or workers organisations. However, certain elements of the Plan are relevant to the project. In particular, the Plan identifies the wage gap disparities between men and women as being a challenge for economic growth. Within the five strategic objectives for women's empowerment and gender equality, the plan includes areas to work on that are highly relevant to trade unions, and would be enhanced by increased participation from women in key policy debates and bargaining. These include addressing decent work gaps in the working environment related to OSH and sexual and gender-based violence and harassment, an increase in participation and decision making for women, including building the confidence and capacities to raise their voice in public spaces, and the increased representation of women in the leadership of public institutions.

The Plan also addresses youth development. Most notably relevant is the objective to provide development training and ensure participation of youth in decision making process at all levels of society and the nation. The Plan also addresses the need for Bangladesh to meet its commitments to under the SDGs for decent work for youth.

The NAP and Roadmap were developed with the support of the ILO to respond to the complaint against the Government of Bangladesh concerning non-observance by Bangladesh on three key ILO conventions, the Labour Inspection Convention, 1947 (No. 81), the Freedom of Association and Protection of the Right to Organise Convention, 1948 (No. 87), and the Right to Organise and Collective Bargaining Convention, 1949 (No. 98). The project itself does not directly address specific elements of the NAP and Roadmap or issues related to the complaint but it is designed to sit within the ILO's cluster that has provided support to Bangladesh on addressing the complaint.

The impact of the change in government on the priorities towards decent work, tripartism, and the rights to collective bargaining and freedom of association are not yet clear. The tripartite committee is negotiating the revision of the Bangladesh Labour Act (2006) but the final result of this is not apparent. The focus of the project on youth empowerment is timely considering the protests that culminated in the change in government were led by the youth movement and the leaders are keen to ensure that youth have a seat at the table in defining the future direction of Bangladesh. Stakeholders informed the evaluation team this dynamic could be seen to an extent in the trade union movement and thus the project complemented this. The examples so far though as very anecdotal and it remains to be seen if this development will be sustained.

Youth and Women's Participation

The project was primarily aimed at empowering youth and women trade union members to become leaders in the trade union movement. As such, a selection criterion for trainees was initially 35 years and under, with 50% of trainees being women. Challenges in identifying sufficient numbers of trainees within the age bracket meant the criterion was extended to 40 years. BILS has been able to ensure that those it trained were below 40 but ensuring members nominate participants who match the criteria has remained a challenge for WRC during the project. Project stakeholders reported that members had continued to nominate older and more senior participants. This was reported to be a reflection of some of the entrenched attitudes towards seniority within the trade union movement in Bangladesh. While the goal of the project of empowering the new generation has undoubtedly been well received among many trade union leaders, given large number of trade unions and fragmented nature of the movement, there still remains considerable work needed to be done to orientate more leaders to the need to empower younger members.

"We could have made it better. As our goal is that youth should also be there, because we have to prepare for them. I feel that there was fault in that. We could have been more careful and sincere during the selection process. I will say from my organisation the four people that I have suggested were not proper. Afterward I felt that maybe it could have been changes. Yes my organization has decided for it, but when I think from my side I felt that some better selection could have been done for the interest of my organization. So there I felt there was a gap." (Project Partner)

The project logical framework does not include disaggregated targets for men and women. The implementation agreements with the partners state for BILS that 'conduct training for national TU federations [at least 03 members (preferably 02 female)] from each federation', and for the WRC, 'trained master trainers conduct training for Thirty (30) enterprise level executive committees (preferably existing and potential female leaders.)' The project was not able to fully achieve this, although significant numbers of women were trained. For WRC, 41% of Master Trainers and 46% of grassroots trade union members trained in the project have been women. BILS ensured 51% of participants in the training of trainer's programme were women.

Stakeholders informed the evaluation team that identifying women to participate in the project was at times challenging. Despite women being the majority in several key sectors in Bangladesh, participation in trade unions has been limited. As such, BILS were unable to meet the two out of three target and WRC's participation rate was below 50%, although the project did manage to achieve relatively significant raw numbers of women's participation.

Simply monitoring participation though does not provide the full story as to whether a project is gender transformative. Both the content of the project and the end result in terms of significant influence on policy making are also key to understanding this. The inclusion of key topics related to

gender equality was important in ensuring the project had a strong focus on gender equality. Several evaluation participants highlighted the importance of the inclusion of gender equality as one of the four key topics. It was though noted by some stakeholders that it is important that men attend training on gender equality as well as women if meaningful change is to be enacted and this was not always the case in the project. The master trainers who joined the Gender and Inclusiveness Issues training from WRC mentioned that most participants of that training were women. A total of 25 master trainers received the modular training on Gender and Inclusiveness Issues and of these 20 were women and only 5 were men. Even where men attended, the decision by the trade union to send them was sometimes driven by women not being available rather than a recognition that gender training is needed by both women and men. One male master trainer reflected:

“There were only 3 or 4 male participants as my co-trainees in this module. There were no female members in our federation who had the master trainer competency that’s why they sent me. If a senior level female master trainer were available, then my federation would have nominated her for this module.” (Master Trainer)

It is also not fully clear how effective the project has been in ensuring the participation of women and youth in policy discussion. This is because the monitoring system does not effectively capture this. The logical framework includes an indicator to measure participation, which had it been collected and measured would have provided important information. However, the indicator which calls for identifying the number of youth and women in trade union committees that are actively engaged at the policy level influencing process has not been collected. Instead, the ILO has reported on the formation of the Women’s Committee within the NCCWE and a Youth Committee at the WRC. While these are successful achievements, it is not yet clear what influence this committee has on policy discussion and there is only some anecdotal evidence women and youth have yet been able to influence policy discussions. Stronger measurement of this is needed in future interventions.

Other Cross-Cutting Themes

- Disability Inclusion

The project has not addressed disability inclusion and some stakeholders identified this as a missed opportunity. Some trade union members who spoke to the evaluation team indicated an interest in receiving training on disability inclusion and ensuring persons with disabilities were more actively involved in future interventions. The project has not engaged organisations of persons with disabilities and the ILO should consider doing this in future projects. While there is an inherent tension in developing projects that work with organisations outside of the ILO’s traditional tripartite constituents, involving persons with disabilities as part of a tripartite plus approach is critical if the ILO is to meet its obligations under the United Nations Disability Inclusion Strategy, which are operationalised in the ILO’s Disability Inclusion Policy and Strategy (2022). The ILO’s Disability Inclusion Team within the Gender, Equality, Diversity, and Inclusion branch have developed guidance on the inclusion of organisations of persons with disabilities in the project cycle and this should be considered in future work with trade unions.

- Just Transition to Sustainable Development

The project has addressed the just transition to sustainable development in only a very limited way. BILS have developed case study on the implications of climate change and the status of a just transition within the informal economy (including rickshaw pullers, transport workers, and the platform economy) that is scheduled for formal dissemination before April 20, 2025. Several project participants did inform the evaluation team that climate change and the impact this has on workers should

be included as a topic in future training. This project did not prioritise the just transition though as the greater focus was on the four modules developed for training the Master Trainers.

- International Labour Standards

The project has not explicitly focused on international labour standards, but the goals of the project are relevant to various ILO conventions, particularly the Freedom of Association and Protection of the Right to Organise Convention, 1948 (No. 87), and the Right to Organise and Collective Bargaining Convention, 1949 (No. 98). The focus on gender equality including gender-based violence, also links closely to the Violence and Harassment Convention, 2019 (No.190). More direct training on international labour standards for the youth and women leaders trained in this project, could be considered in future interventions.

3.2 Coherence

Key Findings- Coherence

Key Finding 4: The project has ensured synergies within the ILO's Labour Administration and Working Conditions cluster.

Key Finding 5: The logic of the project is essentially sound when considering the project as an initial step-in longer-term process of empowering younger trade union leaders. However, it would have been useful to have produced a theory of change that maps out the project's contribution to the ILO's overall work in the Labour Administration and Working Conditions cluster and how more long-term change would be achieved.

Evaluation Questions

- To what extent has the project built on previous experience of the ILO in Bangladesh, and relevant local and international experiences?
- To what extent has the project built the synergy with other work of the Labour Administration and Working Conditions cluster at ILO Dhaka and the Decent Work Country Programme Bangladesh (2022-26), SDGs and UNSDCF 2022-26?
- To what extent have the project interventions added values to the existing efforts in strengthening inclusive organization of trade unions and building unions' capacity of carrying out effective collective bargaining in Bangladesh?
- To what extent have the different components of the project interventions complemented each other towards achieving the project objectives?

Building on previous actions

The focus of the project on empowering youth and women within the trade union movement is fairly innovative for the ILO's actions in Bangladesh, and in this sense does not directly continue previous interventions by the ILO. However, the project does build on previous actions to support workers' organisations and gender and youth empowerment more generally.

The ILO has partnered with BILS and WRC in previous projects, including a focus on capacity building. The development of the WRC as a joint partnership of the NCCWE and the IBC, was facilitated by the ILO. This project has been able to build on those partnerships. The high level of involvement of the partners in developing the project's activities has helped strengthen synergies with previous work.

Previous actions have included focusing on gender equality and women's empowerment. The Promoting Social Dialogue and Harmonious Industrial Relations in Bangladesh project, implemented between 2016 and 2022 included providing support to the Women's Committee of the WRC. Although the Improving Working Conditions in the Ready-Made Garment Sector Programme Phase 2 (RMGP II) (2017-2023) did not include a focus on youth in its initial design, the programme did adapt to include youth in its awareness campaigns. This project thought has taken a more explicit approach on the empowerment of youth and women in trade union leadership.

The project is also structured within the ILO's technical support to Bangladesh to respond to the Complaint concerning non-observance by Bangladesh of the Labour Inspection Convention, 1947 (No. 81), the Freedom of Association and Protection of the Right to Organise Convention, 1948 (No. 87), and the Right to Organise and Collective Bargaining Convention, 1949 (No. 98), made under article 26 of the ILO Constitution by several delegates to the 108th Session (2019) of the International Labour Conference. The Government of Bangladesh responded to a request by the ILO's Director-General to address the complaint through the development of a time-bound road map, known as the Government of Bangladesh GB Roadmap on the Labour Sector of Bangladesh (2021-2026). This project in itself is not part of the specific response to the complaint but is designed within the overall context of the technical support given to Bangladesh concerning this complaint. Long-term it would be hoped the newer generation of leaders can influence the policy discussions, although this goal will require continued attention to their empowerment within the trade union leadership.

The project is housed within a \$45 million portfolio for the LAWC cluster. The actions of this project will be continued as part of funding the ILO has received from the European Union and the Governments of Netherlands, Sweden, and Denmark, and a separate project supported by Global Affairs Canada. These projects include support for the organisational strengthening of employers and workers organisations. Synergies with ongoing projects can also be identified. A concrete example of this was the coordination with Better Work. Better Work provided additional training to 52 of the Master Trainers on facilitation and support them to provide training sessions at 20 unionised factories on the four modules designed and implemented in the Support for effective and inclusive trade unions in Bangladesh project.

Alignment with policy documents and strategic plans

The project was found to align with the goals of key ILO plans including the Decent Work Country Programme (DWCP) for Bangladesh for 2022-26 and the Programme and Budget (P&B) for the 2024-25 biennium.

DWCP and UNSDCF

The ILO Country Office in Bangladesh organises its programme delivery through clusters. The project is embedded within the Labour Administration and Working Conditions cluster. This approach helps support the identification of synergies with other projects. The project is aligned with two outputs within two of the four outcomes of the DWCP. The focus on increasing the capacities of the trade union movement contributes to Output 3.3: 'Improved capacity of ILO social partners and strengthened or new social dialogue institutions and processes for effective social dialogue and tripartism, including for collective bargaining', which is within DWCP Priority 3, 'International Labour Standards and rights at work promoted, labour market governance strengthened, and social dialogue enhanced.' The project's focus on increasing opportunities for women to have a voice within the trade union movement aligns with Output 4.4, 'Increased women's voice, representation, and leadership in the world of work, including within ILO constituents' institutions and organizations and at

enterprise level', which is within DWCP Strategic Priority 4, 'Gender equality and ending gender-based violence: empowering women and girls.'

The ILO's DWCPs are required to align with the country's UNSDCF and as such, the project also supports priorities with the UNSDCF. The UNSDCF priorities of Transformative, Participatory and Inclusive Governance and Gender Equality and Ending Gender-Based Violence: Empowering Women and Girls are of particular relevance.

P&B

The project contributes to Output 2.2 of the P&B, 'Increased institutional, technical, representational and policy impact capacities of workers' organizations'. The P&B 2024-25 states that the ILO will support workers' organisations in 'identifying gaps in governance, institutional/organizational strength, service provision and representativeness through a gender- and youth-sensitive lens' and 'developing strategies and action plans that reflect the workforce diversity'. The project's focus on promoting opportunities for youth and women to play critical roles in policy development and trade union management clearly aligns with this goal. The project also aligns with Output 2.3, 'Increased capacity of Member States to make social dialogue more influential and labour relations institutions and processes more effective', and in particular, the goal of the ILO to support constituents in 'addressing constraints faced by excluded and under-represented groups of employers and workers. Outcome 5, 'Gender equality and equality of treatment and opportunities for all' is also relevant to the project. The project's focus on enhancing opportunities for women to participate in trade union policy making and governance aligns with the stated priorities of the ILO's P&B to support constituents to 'strengthening their capacity to increase the representation of women and marginalized groups in decision-making processes at all levels'.

SDGs

Bangladesh has highlighted its commitment to contributing to the achievement of the SDGs in key documents, including the Bangladesh Vision 2041 and Perspective Plan 2021-2041 and the Bangladesh 8th Five Year Plan 2021-2025. The most relevant SDGs are SDG 5, Gender equality and women's empowerment and SDG 8, Promote sustained, inclusive and sustainable economic growth, full and productive employment and decent work for all. Within these goals, the most relevant targets are Targets 5.5, Ensure women's full and effective participation and equal opportunities for leadership at all levels of decision-making in political, economic and public life and 8.8, Protect labour rights and promote safe and secure working environments for all workers, including migrant workers, in particular women migrants, and those in precarious employment. The focus within the project on the empowerment of women to be active in policy making within trade unions and the promotion of freedom of association and collective bargaining ensure relevance to these targets. The project document also states the project will contribute to SDG 4 Ensure inclusive and equitable quality education and promote lifelong learning opportunities for all. This is a much more indirect contribution though than SDG 5 and 8.

Coordination among different actors

The project has supported coordination among key stakeholders. Both WRC and BILS reported good collaboration in the running of the project. The WRC in itself brought together trade unions affiliated to NCCWE and IBC. This was achieved prior to this project but is linked to previous support given by the ILO, and this project helps continue this collaboration. The project involved both federations that were affiliated to the NCCWE, as well as those not affiliated to the NCCWE but who are affiliated to the ITUC.

It was also noted by ILO staff that the collaboration with GIZ was a positive partnership between two entities that are often competitors in the space related to activities on labour rights. The positive collaboration between the ILO and GIZ in both this project and work being conducted on injury compensation schemes was identified as a positive good practice that should be replicated in future interventions.

Coherence of the project design

The project is built around two outcomes, increasing the number of women and youth in trade union leadership to improve the inclusivity of the trade union movement and improving the collective bargaining capacity of trade union through social dialogue. Although built around the two outcomes, the project can also be explained through focusing on the different levels that are addressed, specifically the focus on strengthening the national level, the sectoral level, and the enterprise level. BILS and WRC have been tasked with providing capacity building to different levels. BILS has provided training to national level affiliates and WRC to labour federations and enterprise level trade unions. Supporting different levels of the trade union movement in Bangladesh helps ensure the project is able to have a wider reach. The overall goals of the project will require women and youth to be empowered at all levels if change is to be sustainable. Utilising the four modules to target the different levels helps provide continuity through the project.

The flow of activities and outputs to contribute to outcome 1 is clearer than for outcome 2. The project clearly focuses on identifying and training women and youth leaders to address gaps in inclusivity in the trade union movement. There are some challenges with the measurement of the outcome but the overall approach to addressing the identified issue appears well thought out and designed within both the project document and the implementation of the project.

There is more of a jump between the activities and overall objective in outcome 2. The outcome seeks to improve the collective bargaining capacity of the trade union through social dialogues. The vehicles for doing this in the project are policy dialogues and the development of a collective bargaining handbook. It appears clear that the project has supported increased levels of social dialogue. The project has conducted several policy dialogues that have been organised by the WRC, the NCCWE, and the IBC. Stakeholders reported that the policy dialogue had included the active involvement of different groups including government, employers and academia, as well as the trade unions. It was reported that the newly trained young leaders had gained exposure and confidence through organising the policy dialogues, and were the more able to pursue social dialogue with other stakeholders. The project has also developed a collective bargaining handbook and provided training on it to 26 Master Trainers (40% women) who have disseminated key points from the training to 32 enterprise-level trade unions.

There is a though an assumption that these activities will lead to stronger results in collective bargaining, and it is not clear yet if this is the case or not. It is hoped that collective bargaining capacities have increased through the training on the handbook. However, there has not been follow-up to support the Master Trainers to understand how much knowledge has increased and what additional support is needed. The project does not include targets for collective bargaining agreements. The length of the project would have made it difficult to include targets on collective bargaining agreements. At the moment, is not clear how much the project trainees are or will be involved in collective bargaining and whether the policy dialogues have contributed to an enabling environment where employers and workers are willing and able to enter into collective bargaining processes. One project partner stakeholder did suggest that trainees have been involved in negotiating annual salary increases with their employers but more detailed measurement of this is needed. Additional work from the ILO, BILS, and WRC will be needed to understand whether the project's gains will ultimately

lead to improvements in collective bargaining, and identifying what additional support might be needed by the project's trainees.

Unfortunately, the project did not produce the theory of change that the project document commits to. This would help clarify the linkages between the different levels of the project more clearly, including providing documentation on how the different aspects of the project complement each other. It would also give greater clarity in the pathways of change that are expected to lead to improvements in collective bargaining. The LAWC cluster has developed an overall theory of change that outlines how the ILO will support Bangladesh to fulfil its commitments in the Government of Bangladesh Roadmap and National Action Plan (2021-2026) and ensure that workers enjoy decent work through improved policies and laws, accountable, gender-responsive and inclusive labour market institutions and sustainable business practices. This includes outcomes to strengthen social dialogue mechanisms and enhance the capacities of the social partners. This theory of change was designed in 2024, so after the design of the GIZ project. For future projects, it would be advisable to develop a project level theory of change that demonstrates how the project will contribute to the overall cluster theory of change.

3.3 Effectiveness

Key Findings- Effectiveness

Key Finding 6: The project is on track to achieve its planned outputs by the end of April 2025, following a no-cost extension due to external political developments beyond the ILO's control. Notably, the project has exceeded its targets in some areas, such as the development of 32 action plans at the enterprise level. While progress has been made towards achieving the overall objectives, the short project duration means these results should be viewed as an initial step rather than a final achievement.

Key Finding 7: The four training modules developed under the project were widely recognized as a key factor in its success. Stakeholders found the modules to be highly relevant to the needs of trade unions and their members, contributing to improved capacity and awareness on industrial relations, leadership, gender inclusivity, and trade union management.

Key Finding 8: The monitoring framework of the project was limited, and consideration needs to be given to measuring actual change and impact. This hampers assessment of how effectively the project has met its overall objectives.

Evaluation Questions

- To what extent has the project progressed towards its planned objectives? Are the activities having the desired results?
- What were the main internal and external factors that influenced the achievement or non-achievement of results?
- How effectively did the project monitor performance and results? What were the systems put in place to track progress and risks?

The ILO, BILS, and WRC reported to the evaluation team that the project is on-track to achieve the indicators in the project document by the end of April 2025. The no-cost extension agreed with GIZ has allowed for the achievement of the project activities.

The outcome and output indicators reported by the ILO as achieved by the project as of December 2024 are included in the table below.

Outcome Indicator	Target	Progress
Outcome 1: Inclusive and effective trade union organizations through increased number of women and youth leaders		
1.1 Number of trade union position papers and guidelines on national policies and strategies	3	7 (2 out of 7 are planned for dissemination in April before the end of the project)
1.2 Number of youth and women in trade union committees to implement trade unions' strategic plans who are actively engaged at the policy level influencing process	24	Not reported on per se but the ILO reported the formation of a dedicated women committee within the NCCWE and a youth committee at BILS.
Output 1.1: Improved internal administration processes and related capacity among young and female trade union federation employees		
1.1.1 Percentage of training beneficiaries that indicate use of the knowledge learnt, with disaggregated data by gender and age	>85%	36% certain (56% male, 37% female, 7% missing) and 63% training beneficiaries likely (53% male, 43% female, 4% missing) that they use their learning. (Conference of trainee evaluation). 127 participants (41% women) have been trained.
1.1.2 No. of new and improved administrative processes/management systems for TU federations	3	Not assessed. Instead, the ILO has reported that 14 national federations have developed improvement action plans.
Output 1.2: Increased awareness and knowledge of young and female trade union leaders on industrial relations, management, leadership skills, and gender and inclusiveness issues		
1.2.1 Percentage of trade unionists with improved thematic and leadership capacities, with disaggregated data by gender and age	>80% self-identified improvement	ToT organised but the percentage for this indicator is not reported on.
1.2.2 No. of gender responsive and inclusive action plan(s) for TU federations operations developed	4	32

1.2.3 No. of Women Leadership Policy Group meetings with tripartite constituents on education and industry sector-specific issues of female students and workers/ in trade unions	6	9 (2 of the 9 pending but should be completed before the end of the project)
Output 1.3: Increased awareness and capacity of young and female trade union members and leaders on trade union roles, leadership, and influencing agenda		
1.3.1 No. youth camps and networks for young and female trade union leaders established	3	2 (two originally planned camps were merged into one event)
1.3.2 Percentage of trade unionists with an improved understanding of trade unions movements, including achievements, challenges and opportunities, with disaggregated data by gender and age	>80% self-identified improvement	94% (54% male, 40% female) Age group: 25% from 18-29 ages; 28% from 30-35 ages; 23% from 36-45 ages; + remaining from 45+ 390 grassroots trained union members (46% women) have been trained
Outcome 2: Improved collective bargaining capacity of trade unions through social dialogues		
2.1 No. of training programmes established by TU federations on collective bargaining and social dialogue	1	32 enterprise level trade union committees received training on trade union management, industrial relations, leadership skills, the collective bargaining toolkit and gender and inclusiveness issues (GBVH). 127 participants (41% women) received training of trainer programmes and 390 (46% women) grassroot trade union members received training on the same topics
2.2 Number of innovative and comprehensive collective bargaining tools developed by trade unions in relevance to the local and global labour governance and labour market context	1	1
Output 2.1: Increased participation and engagement of trade unions, including women and youth, in platforms for policy dialogues		

2.1.1 No. of thematic policy briefs in partnership with academia and research organizations developed, by topic	3	3 (2 out of 3 are being finalised and will be disseminated before the end of the project)
2.1.2 Number of case studies reflecting the experience of youth and women trade union leaders	3	3
2.1.3 No of policy discussions and dialogues held in partnership with academia and research organizations	4	4

Table 2: Project Outputs- planned vs achieved

As the table demonstrates, the project has achieved (or in a few cases will achieve) the output indicators. In a number of indicators, including the position papers and action plans, the project has overachieved its targets. There are some indicators where reporting doesn't align with the original indicators.

In terms of assessing progress towards objectives, there are some challenges on the monitoring of these figures. This is discussed in the section below. Overall, stakeholders reported to the evaluation team that they believed there had been positive progress towards the project outcomes, but the short timeline of the project means that the achievements are generally shorter-term and can be seen as laying the foundation for future work by the ILO on this sector. The evaluation team were able to identify intermediate progress in the first outcome which has a focus on increased participation of women and youth in trade union governance and decision making. Stakeholders reported examples of individuals trained through this project participating in key decision fora:

“The direct beneficiaries are starting to participate in the policy dialogues. The nature of the training has set in motion the empowerment of the younger people which has led to them raising their voices in these meetings.” (ILO Official)

There was a clear belief among stakeholders that the project had contributed to a changing attitude among senior trade union leaders about the need to empower the new generation. While the change in attitudes is not universal among senior trade union leaders and other factors also contributed to this, not least the fact the movement to change the government was led by student protestors, it was felt the project had also contributed to this objective. Linked to this, gains in confidence and involvement of youth and women leaders were identified by project participants.

As noted above, the connection to improved collective bargaining capacities in outcome 2 is less clear based on the indicators developed for the project. While the targets for policy dialogue and the development of policy briefs have been achieved, the project did not set outcome targets to measure how effectively participants are contributing to collective bargaining activities in their workplaces. The only outcome indicator is a self-reported reflection on the level of knowledge a participant has (the second indicator for the outcome is actually an output indicator). Further reflections on the monitoring system are included below.

Enabling Factors

There are several key strengths of the project the evaluation was able to identify that have enabled its achievements. These include strong partnerships, the modules that have been developed, the

involvement of the trade unions and project partners in the development of the project, the enthusiasm to participate in the project of the youth membership of the trade unions, and the ability of the project to ensure many different trade unions participate in the project.

- Strong partnerships

The implementing partners of the project were identified as being a strong element of the project. Both project partners are well established and experienced in delivering activities. The ILO has conducted capacity building work with both BILS and WRC in other projects. As such, the ILO did not need to provide grant management capacity building during this intervention. The connections WRC and BILS have to different trade union actors in Bangladesh allowed the project to reach a broad audience.

- Four modules

The training was designed around four key topics, gender and inclusiveness issues, industrial relations, trade union management, and leadership skills. The project also developed and offered training on a collective bargaining handbook. These modules were seen as highly relevant to the needs of the participants and well developed.

“One reason (for success) is the 4 modules. As now a major goal of the federation or union is to engage the youth and new leaders with the Trade Union Movement, these four relevant and timely modules worked amazing in their grooming.” (Project Partner Officer)

“These 4 trainings were arranged for the success of the Trade union. They are all connected. One topic is incomplete without the other one. These topics are so basic that it is necessary for all kinds of offices. Not only trade unions but we can utilize these skills in any place.” (Master Trainer)

- Involvement of the partners in the design of the project

The design process for the project and the individual activities was identified as a key strength. As noted by several key stakeholders, the project was not prescribed by the ILO and then given to the partners, but was developed in partnership with BILS and WRC, who were able to involve their members in consultations. As a result, the project has experienced strong ownership from BILS, WRC, and their members, and the topics addressed are considered very relevant to the project needs. The flexibility of the GIZ in the design and implementation of the project was also identified by stakeholders as a key strength that helped support the input of a broad range of stakeholders into the project.

- Enthusiasm of trainees

The project has trained over 100 master trainers with the goal of ensuring they can disseminate knowledge among their organisations and provide support in management, leadership, and policy design. As might be expected, not all trainers have continued in a trainer capacity and some have left their organisations, but this appears to be a low number, and most of the trainers have shown enthusiasm for continuing the work. The project has come at a time of significant socio-political upheaval in Bangladesh, led by a youth movement and the work of the project to strengthen the youth leadership in the trade unions has dovetailed effectively with this. As noted above, results from this are starting to be seen in the involvement of youth leaders in policy fora.

- ILO support

Feedback given to the evaluation team on the support the ILO has given for the project was universally positive. The project team were seen as highly accessible and responsive. The technical support provided to the different events were identified as good quality and timely.

“For this project ILO Dhaka has good very young staff who are very active. The project has been supported by these and they are very good... They have been very professional.”
(Project Partner Officer)

- Willingness of senior leadership to embrace change

Stakeholders shared with the evaluation team that there were positive results in trade unions that had senior leadership that are willing to embrace change and support the involvement of a new generation of leaders. This was not universal, and the same issue was also identified as a barrier to change below. Overall, it appeared that there was more openness to embrace this change than negative attitudes but as the evaluation did not conduct a full survey of unions, it is not possible to be completely confident in this finding. What is clear is that positive results were found where trade unions were willing to give opportunities to younger leaders:

“We get and give opportunities to young leaders so that they can work for trade unions and develop the workers of the country. Small or big, we try to practice democracy within the organization. We work in collaboration with all members. Our federation follows different customs. We get work and updates through central committee meetings. Our senior leaders go through detailed processes to go with majority favored decisions.” (Master Trainer)

- Development of Action Plans

The project has supported the development of 32 enterprise level action plans and 14 national level action plans. A workshop is planned in April for the federations who have developed the national level action plans to discuss strategic alignment and consider follow-up and implementation. The development of the action plans is a considerable achievement that should help the sustainability of the project should they be implemented. The limited opportunities to conduct follow-up of the enterprise level action plans is listed as a barrier to achievement below and was raised by various stakeholders as being a potential concern.

- Consideration of gender equality

The inclusion of issues related to gender equality has been an important achievement in the project. There are clear challenges to achieving gender transformative goals, including the patriarchal nature of society, the high level of male domination in the trade union movement, and lack of opportunities afforded to women workers. This was evident in some of the challenges the project faced in identifying sufficient numbers of women trade union members to receive training. However, the project has made a specific effort to ensure gender responsiveness was built into the project. The inclusion of gender and inclusiveness as one of the four modules has helped raise awareness of gender equality among the trainees. The modules were chosen by the trade union movement and thus can be considered to reflect their identification of their needs. This suggests a promising awareness of the need to address gender equality.

It was noted by some stakeholders that there should have been a greater effort to ensure men as well as women participated in the module on gender equality. While some men did participate, stakeholders believed that there needed to be a stronger emphasis on orientating men to issues related to gender equality. The benefits of this were demonstrated by one male master trainer who had utilised the skills he had acquired from the gender module in his daily work:

“I work in the RMG sector. I work here as a trainer too. I work here as a Safety Manager. I take training in Health and Safety issues. So, when I train on these matters, I have to orient them on different things and gender is related to all those areas. When I talk to them about Grievance Mechanism, they do not know many kinds of grievances. So, I use my lessons from the Gender module to comprehend many issues in this training.” (Master Trainer)

It was also noted that specific gender policies need to be developed. Stakeholders at the WRC identified a gap in terms of the existence of a gender policy:

“As an organization, WRC should have gender policy and inclusiveness. We have a Women's Committee but not policy.” (Project Partner)

Barriers to Achievement

While the project has been successful in achieving most of its outputs, the evaluation identified some challenges that have reduced the achievement of the overall outcomes. These include the short time frame of the project limiting the depth of the training, the limited administrative and logistical capacities of the trade union offices, limited follow-up of action plans, overall gendered make-up of union membership, reluctance of some union members to change, and limited involvement of more rurally based stakeholders and unions.

- Timeframe of the project

The most regularly raised concern of stakeholders about an otherwise highly regarded project, was the length of the project. While two significant context challenges occurred, a general election that caused longer disruption than usual elections, and the protests and fall of the Bangladesh government, the concern over the length of the project should be separated from this. Even without these delays, the project had ambitious goals for a year and a half project.

Many of the trainees mentioned that they believed the training they received should be more in-depth. The trainees see the training they have received so far as the first step in the process but more support is needed:

“Actually, a good training does not take place within such a short time. There were many matters which needed detailed orientation and discussion. But it was finished in a rush. If the training was for 6 to 7 days, then it could cover the topics properly. If we talk about Labour law or Leadership skills development, then these are all interconnected. One comes after another. Therefore, the training could be long term.” (Master Trainer)

- Limited follow-up of action plans

The project has been successful in supporting 32 enterprise level trade unions to develop action plans for implementing the key learnings from the modules. However, the project has limited scope to conduct follow-up and provide on-going support for the action plans. This is closely linked to the concern over the timeframe of the project.

- Reluctance of some union members to change

The evaluation team heard from several stakeholders who identified the willingness of senior leadership of trade unions to endorse the need for youth and women membership as being a key enabler of the project. However, there were also indications that this positive attitude was not universal and some of the master trainers identified negative attitudes towards their participation in the unions as being a barrier to implementing what they had learned:

“If we show our skills, many seniors taunt us by saying, “We are very ambitious and want to climb the ladder faster.” Due to this mindset, we lose many opportunities to teach and share knowledge.” (Master Trainer)

- Challenges for participants from more remote locations, particularly women, to attend training

Training participants informed the evaluation team that the lack of a residency option for the training created difficulties for some participants to attend. In particular, women who needed to travel a significant distance did not feel comfortable in attending the training and having to travel back for several hours each day to their homes, often at night. The ILO, BILS, and WRC will need to consider how to mitigate this concern to allow for a broader geographical scope of trainees in future, potentially either offering a residential course or providing training in different locations to allow workers from more remote locations to attend.

- Lack of disability inclusion

The lack of attention to disability inclusion is a gap in the project. When asked about disability inclusion, some master trainers and project partners suggested that training on disability would be valuable for them, and allow the trade unions to consider how to include persons with disabilities in future organising activities. One ILO staff member also reflected that if given the opportunity to start the project again, they would ensure there was attention to disability inclusion. Identifying organisations of persons with disabilities who work on labour rights, coordinating with the Disability Inclusion team in GEDI, and including specific outputs on disability inclusion in future projects would help bridge this gap.

Monitoring Structures

The evaluation found that there were gaps in the monitoring structures that limited understanding of how effectively the Master Trainers and the trade unions are utilising the gains they have made from the project. Measurement of outcomes and thus impact was in particular a challenge.

The project document states, that ‘The Theory of Change, including its narrative will be developed during inception phase in close collaboration with GIZ’. This was not completed. A project results framework that included a series of outcome and output indicators was developed. The implementation agreements with BILS and WRC also includes quantitative targets under activities assigned to them.

The ILO has to date tracked many, but not all of the indicators. An update of progress to December 2024 was shared with the evaluation team, which forms the basis of the detail provided above in table 2. There are two indicators for each outcome in the results framework. Three of the indicators though are output rather than outcome indicators. They provide quantitative figures on the number of trainings undertaken and tools developed, but do not measure change the tools or training has contributed to. The one indicator that is an outcome indicator is 1.2, ‘Number of youth and women in trade union committees to implement trade unions’ strategic plans who are actively engaged at the policy level influencing process’. The update provided by the ILO for the project up to December 2024, however does not measure this. The update instead provides details of a dedicated Women Committee formed within the NCCWE. A 14-member Women’s Committee has been established within the WRC, comprising 7 members from NCCWE and 7 members from IBC. The hierarchy of the committee maintains one Chair, one Vice-Chair, and twelve general members. The committee serves a fixed term of six months. At the end of each term, the Chair and Vice-Chair are selected or elected

on a rotational basis among the members. While this is a significant achievement, it would also have been useful for the project to measure the original indicator to understand the level of influence women and youth leaders have having within trade unions.

There are output indicators that provide some details of the change the project is working towards. These include output 1.1.1 Percentage of training beneficiaries that indicate use of the knowledge learnt, with disaggregated data by gender and age, output 1.1.2 No. of new and improved administrative processes/management systems for TU federations (although this indicator has not been measured this way), 1.2.1 Percentage of trade unionists with improved thematic and leadership capacities, with disaggregated data by gender and age, and 1.3.2 Percentage of trade unionists with an improved understanding of trade unions movements, including achievements, challenges and opportunities, with disaggregated data by gender and age. The ILO's update provided self-report numbers on improved knowledge for outputs 1.1.1 and 1.3.2. These two indicators though don't measure how capacity gains from the project are actually put into use though.

Part of the challenge the project faced in monitoring and evaluation is linked to its short timeframe. The length of the project makes it difficult to fully document what changes have taken place, as many of the actions will take time to have an impact. Stakeholders also identified that the ambition of the project meant resources had to be focused on implementing activities and allowed little leeway for conducting follow-up on project outputs such as the trade union action plans and the activities of the Master Trainers:

“We are training master trainers. Only giving training is not enough. We need to do a follow up. We need to connect them with real beneficiaries, where they will reapply their learnings. We want to create a youth and women leadership in the movement so we need enough time to nurture them.” (Project Partner)

3.4 Efficiency

Key Findings- Efficiency

Key Finding 9: Project partners believed that sufficient resources have been allocated for the delivery of the project.

Key Finding 10: The development of partner based steering committees was an effective approach to ensuring the project was implemented efficiently.

Key Finding 11: The limited time frame for the project reduces the overall efficiency of the approach.

Evaluation Questions

- Were the available technical and financial resources adequate to fulfil the project plans?
- Were the management arrangements (roles and responsibilities assigned for ILO staff and key stakeholders) sufficient to support the project implementation?

Technical and Financial Resources

The project has an overall budget of USD 1,101,292. The budget allocated 42% to outcome 1, 11% to outcome 2, 35% to project management, and 12% to programme support costs. BILS was allocated

\$195,880 (18%) and WRC was allocated \$233,021 (21%)⁶. As of February 25, 2025, over 90% of the funds had either been utilised or committed under encumbrances. It is expected that the vast majority of the budget will be utilised by the end of the project.

The large majority of representatives of the project partners, although not all, believed the financial resources allocated had been sufficient to implement the necessary activities.

“For us, the funds were sufficient. I don’t think we can make use of more project funding if it had been given to us. The funds were accurately calculated.” (Project Partner)

Stakeholders noted the volunteer nature of the trade union movement and that the partners have policies to try not to damage this mentality during their programmes. As such, activities are organised on tight budgets where the focus is on the learning itself and does not encourage attendance just for the sake of being in a luxury hotel:

“We have a principle not to destroy the volunteer nature of the trade union movement. We don’t want to organize things in fancy hotels or provide high salaries. We don’t compare themselves to other organisation in terms of salaries. The money was fine, but the time was not enough.” (Project Partner)

As noted in the effectiveness section, the technical resources provided by the ILO was considered effective in meeting the needs of the project partners. While the design of the training was conducted by the project partners, stakeholders reported that the ILO had provided valuable technical support both in the design of the modules and in the training needs assessment conducted to help the design. An example of this was improvements in attention to gender equality in the needs assessment. This was initially missing from the original design and amended with the ILO’s feedback.

Partner-based steering committees

Each of the two implementing partners set up project steering committees of senior personnel from different trade unions to oversee the implementation of the project. This approach appears to have been effective in helping to maintain strong ownership of the project by key trade union leaders.

The two implementing partners also reported that strong communication between them had helped the smooth running of the project.

Timeframe of the project

The short timeframe of the project was identified by several stakeholders as being a challenge to the overall achievement of the project’s goals. This reduced the efficiency of the project has limited the time available to go into depth in training and conduct follow up with trainees and with the enterprises and national federations that developed actions plans.

“I was trained under the Gender based Violence module in Cox’s Bazar. It was a 3-day training session. But the time should increase. For these kinds of subjects, 3 days are not enough. Also, when we trained workers in Dhaka for 2 days, it was even shorter. It was difficult for us to cover the whole topic in 2 days.” (Master Trainer)

3.5 Impact Orientation

Key Findings- Impact Orientation

⁶ The Implementation Agreements are in Bangladesh Taka. The evaluation team utilised the exchange as of the date of writing the report and thus the percentages may vary slightly when exact exchanges rates are applied.

Key Finding 12: Identifying impact in an 18-month project is challenging, however, it is possible to identify some positive areas of change. Changes identified by stakeholders include gains in the confidence and engagement of young leaders, a strengthening of the administrative capacities of trade unions, and greater awareness among trade union leaders of the need to include youth and women in trade union leadership.

Key Finding 13: The project has achieved important accomplishments with regards to gender equality and youth empowerment, notably the development of Women and Youth Committees. However, developing measures of the actual changes in the level of influence of the newly trained leaders is important to understand the level of impact this work will have.

Evaluation Questions:

- To what extent has the project created evidence-based positive changes and transformative changes towards achieving the project ultimate objective i.e. improved democratic and representative trade union capacity for sustainable and effective tripartite social dialogue?
- To what extent has the project strengthened the inclusiveness and representation of trade unions and capacity of trade unions in carrying out effective collective bargaining?
- To what extent has the project effectively contributed to promoting women and youth leadership including through promotion of international labour standards, gender equality and disability inclusion, social dialogue and tripartism, and just transition?
- What impact has the project had in the process of social dialogue facilitation among the beneficiaries of the project?

The evaluation found that as a result of the short-term nature of the project and the limitations of the monitoring framework, that it is difficult to identify impact at this stage. The project needs to be viewed through the lens of a longer-term approach to empowering youth and women in the trade union movement, and future interventions should have a more robust approach to identifying the level of change that has occurred within the trade union movement. Several stakeholders referred to the project as an initial step or foundational process that lays the groundwork for more work in the future. It is though possible to identify some changes, particularly within outcome 1, that if they are sustained can lead to positive impact in the future.

Changes identified include:

- The creation of a talent pool

The project has trained a significant number of young leaders who should be able to support the running of their trade unions, deliver training to other trade union members, and participate in policy level discussions and strategy setting. While the creation of the talent pool in itself does not necessarily mean change has been achieved, it does provide a solid foundation for future work to consolidate the gains of this project.

“The biggest contribution of this project is it has created a talent pool of youth leaders. The gap of youth participation in the trade union movement has started to cover up with this pool. Leaders, Master trainers, Youth groups whatever you call them. But they can be a great asset for the trade union movement.” (Project partner)

- Increased confidence and voice

Several project participants reported an increase in self-confidence. This has allowed individuals who have been trained to raise voice in different discussions:

“If I answer it from my viewpoint, then I was always drowned in my typical work in a specific area. I would always work with the existing knowledge and skills I had. But due to this training, the dimension of my knowledge has increased. The development in my skills is visible to me very clearly. I was not able to speak publicly so well, I could not communicate with a variety of people so well, I could not draft a keynote on programs but now I can. Personally, I developed my confidence. In the same way other trainers also developed themselves.” (Master Trainer)

More senior members of trade unions including representatives of BILS and WRC had also noted this change:

“One significant thing is- these young people were so hesitant to speak up publicly but through this camp they had transformed into active leaders. During our debate competitions, they were super vocal and active speakers. They can now easily manage the courage to do bargaining and give speeches on something. This capacity has been developed.” (Project Partner)

- Strengthening of the administrative capacities of trade unions

The training of youth and women leaders has provided the trade unions with a group of individuals who have enhanced knowledge on how to manage administration of the trade unions, a topic that has often been overlooked as important in the past by the leadership. One of the training modules was specifically focused on trade union management. One of the project participants described how they hope the training will help them in their role managing the organisational work of the trade union

“After this training I became the General Joint Secretary at our Federation. I am hopeful that I will be able to take up the responsibilities of our organization later which is a positive outcome for me.... After the trainings I was able to overcome those lacking that I previously had. From my place what I can say is that the amount of lackings I had when I needed expertise to do organisational work...These modules and all the documentation of this was previously arranged a bit haphazardly. But when we provided the trainings, we were able to clarify how we could do it part by part.” (Master Trainer)

It was reported to the evaluation team by senior leaders that the training had helped the participants become more efficient in the delivery of organisational campaigns. The ability to design and produce promotion banners for trade union events utilising newly acquired I.T. skills was regularly provided as an example.

What is not fully clear though is how effectively the project participants will be able to utilise these capacities and what longer-term change this can lead to. The project has not measured the impact in terms of expanding the membership of trade unions or collecting and processing more union dues. Several project participants indicated that they needed more training, particularly in I.T. skills to be able to utilise their capacities more effectively, which links back to the concern over the length of the project. The lack of administrative hardware such as computers at several trade unions has also impacted the potential change. To try to mitigate this challenge, the project supported BILS in acquiring the necessary materials for a trade union corner that allows 10 unions at a time to access

IT equipment. This can either be used to practice newly acquired skills or for real-time work as needed.

- Attitude changes towards the inclusion of youth and women leaders

As reported in the effectiveness section, stakeholders also reported a change in senior leadership towards making space for the next generation of leaders to participate in union policy development. However, the level of impact this will have is not clear. Developing stronger measures of change is needed to understand what level of influence the trainees genuinely have in their organisations is needed. Without this, it is hard to fully understand the level of change that has occurred.

- Development of action plans

Simply the process of developing action plans can be identified as a positive change from past practices. Trade union leadership have traditionally been resistant to change, and thus persuading leadership of the need to make adjustments in their operations is an important step. The project did only set the target of 4 trade union federations developing action plans at the enterprise level and significant progress was not expected, and so 32 federations developing action plans is a considerable achievement. There does remain though the need to ensure the trade unions have the necessary support to implement the action plans if true change is to be achieved. The change in the approach to measuring indicator 1.1.2 No. of new and improved administrative processes/management systems for TU federations reduces the opportunity to understand what the impact has been. Instead of measuring how many management systems have been put in place, the ILO has reported the number of action plans developed by national federations (14). In order to understand the long-term impact, the ILO and its partners will need to measure the implementation of the action plans, at both the national and enterprise level federations, and collect details on what new processes and systems have been introduced.

Collective bargaining and social dialogue

As previously identified, the project did not set indicators linked to collective bargaining agreements, and so the achievement of this outcome is difficult to assess. It appears that the project has been able to make progress in strengthening the capacities of the newer generation of leaders to participate in social dialogue. Stakeholders identified examples of the increased confidence of these leaders being demonstrated during project activities such as the policy dialogues. More research is needed to understand how broadly the position papers and dialogues are shared and acted on, and what impact this has on policy development in Bangladesh though.

There were also some examples of improved capacities in social dialogue being utilised at the grassroots level. Several of the master trainers reported they had been able to raise issues and concerns at their enterprises with middle and senior level management as a result of the training they had received in the project. This had occurred both directly from their interactions with factory management and through the training of other union members and workers on the modules they had been trained in.

A collective bargaining toolkit was developed and training given to grassroots trade union members. As noted, there has not been sufficient time in the project to translate this into work on collective bargaining agreements. While one example of trainees participating in collective bargaining was shared with the evaluation team, more systematic work to translate the initial training and improved abilities in social dialogue into collective bargaining is needed. There is also a need to measure the

capacity gains, which was not part of this project. As such, the actual impact on the capacities of trade unions to conduct collective bargaining are currently unclear.

Gender equality and women's empowerment

The development of Women and Youth Committees has the potential to lead to significant change, if they are empowered to participate in meaningful policy dialogue. Under outcome indicator 1.2, the ILO has reported the formation of a dedicated 14 member Women's Committee within the NCCWE and the formation of a 45 member Youth Committee at BILS. The Women's Committee has equal representation from the NCCWE and IBC. Stakeholders identified the developments as positive. As with other changes from the project, the impact of the Committees is not clear yet. It will be important to continue to support them and ensure their views are elevated at policy level discussions as well as making sure the existence of such committees isn't used as an excuse to then ignore youth and women's issues in other committees and policy making bodies. However, as a stepping stone to getting influence for women and youth leaders, the recognition by senior leadership of the need to form these committees and the participation from different federations is an important achievement with the potential for bringing future gains.

As noted above, the project has not measured the actual level of influence newly trained women and youth leaders have achieved in their organisations and in policy dialogues. Developing a suitable measure in future interventions should be considered a priority.

3.6 Sustainability

Key Findings- Sustainability

Key Finding 14: Action plans developed by trade unions provide strong potential for sustainability but support in implementation and monitoring of the action plans will be needed if the gains of the project are to be sustained.

Key Finding 15: The approach of training a new generation of leaders of trade unions should help sustainability so long as senior leaders continue to recognise the importance of empowering this generation.

Evaluation Questions

- Has the project developed and implemented an exit strategy?
- Are the project interventions leading to replicable results?
- Will the project counterpart continue with the training and capacity building activities at various levels and how will the activities of the project still be relevant for the ILO CO Dhaka's engagement with TUs?

The evaluation found that several achievements of the project have potential for sustainability, but continuing support and follow-up will be needed in certain areas to ensure the gains of the project are not lost.

Exit Strategy

The project has not formalised an exit strategy but the placement of the project within the overall cluster and the fact that the ILO can provide continuation in other ongoing projects, allows for longer-term planning. The project has planned some planning activities that will contribute to

sustainability and exit planning, but the ILO and project partners need to consider similar activities in other areas of the project.

Action Plans

The development of action plans is undoubtedly a strong achievement of the project. Action plans have been developed in 14 national federations and 32 enterprise level trade unions.

Implementation of the action plans is critical for ensuring the gains of the project are retained. Master trainers who spoke to the evaluation team highlighted the belief that completing the action plans was important, but that they needed continuing support to help ensure the action plans were implemented. This includes continued advocacy with senior leadership to ensure priority is given to them, support for additional training, and support in following up and monitoring the action plans.

The project will conduct a two-day workshop in April 2025 for the 14 national federations to discuss the implementation of the plans and identify synergies and strategic alignments. Hopefully the workshop will lead to a consolidated action plan with key responsibilities for the ILO, BILS, WRC, and the national federations identified that will help support the implementation of the action plans for the individual federations. A similar workshop is not planned at the enterprise level but the ILO should consider if this is possible, either under this project or in other activities. Without support for implementation and monitoring, it would be unlikely that the action plans will be sustainable.

Workshop to Discuss Project Gains and Achievements

One of the challenges in identifying changes and impact of the project was that many key stakeholders are unable to articulate what the changes are. While all stakeholders spoke positively of the project and believed it had led to important achievements, the specific changes were often harder for them to identify. To address this, stakeholders suggested holding a workshop with the trade union members who had participated in the project. This would allow for discussion of what the achievements had been and would help shape future activities to consolidate the gains:

“To my knowledge, all these indicators were achieved. But BILS and WRC do not have direct interference in implementation. Those are the duties of the associate organizations. Now see, WRC has 26 members; the structures of these organizations are not the same, their needs are different, and their organogram is different. For example, some have the capacity to give much effort, whereas some do not have that. Therefore, on average, we think it also benefits the organization as well as the participants individually. I can suggest you could do an evaluation meeting with all the organizations to identify the evidence-based indicators that will reflect what has been done, what could not be done, and what should be done. From my position, what 27 organizations could do is very difficult to say. I think this is also not right. A day-long session would be better. We could collect a number of cases for our future guidelines.” (Project Partner)

Empowerment of youth and women leaders

The empowerment of youth and women leaders offers the potential for long-term impact. The project has begun a process of engaging a new generation of leadership for the trade union. The knowledge the trainees learned during the project should be retained so long as they are able to utilise it in their day-to-day work. While some of the trainees will naturally leave their enterprises or decide not to pursue leadership roles, it is hoped that a substantial number will utilise their newly acquired skills and continue to engage in leadership opportunities. Various participants indicated a willingness to continue the work but also needing the support of the ILO and the project partners:

“In Gazipur, we do monthly meetings where we sit with those we can reach at home and share our knowledge. Tomorrow is Friday; we will sit in our new office. Those members who hold leadership positions will benefit from my teachings and experiences, which will enhance their ability to assert their rights. To conduct the sessions or meetings, we need some logistical support, which could be provided by the ILO or BILS, as our organization doesn't have the ability to help us.” (Master Trainer)

The sustainability of these achievements will though depend on various factors. There needs to be a genuine willingness of senior leaders to hand over responsibilities and a degree of power to the newer generation. Although the evaluation learned of acceptance of the need to train youth and women, it is not fully clear how much this will translate into reality. This highlights the importance of developing a measurement of the level to which the trainees are involved in genuine policy discussion and influencing, and ensuring this measurement is utilised to monitor progress.

Additionally, conducting follow-up both with the master trainers and also the factory level workers the master trainers have trained, in order to understand how effectively the training messages and giving additional training and support for action plans, is probably necessary to ensure continuing sustainability:

We trained union leaders and those leaders shared the knowledge with their factory workers or community, but there's no follow-up mechanism to collect their feedback. There should be a way of assessing if the field level workers are actually getting the message or not, or else the continuous sharing flow will be stopped. The outcome will be limited.
(Project Partner)

Provision of necessary office logistics

One of the challenges reported to the evaluation team by trainees, was the lack of office infrastructure to allow them to practice skills they have acquired and utilise them in the work environment. Many trade unions do not have the resources to provide office space or computers that are needed for effective trade union management. BILS has attempted to address this by offering office space for 10 trade union representatives on a rotating basis. This has the potential to strengthen sustainability. However, more provision is probably needed, including identifying how to provide these types of facilities in locations outside of Dhaka or other large urban areas.

Ongoing work of BILS and WRC

By selecting established and well-capacitated partners, the ILO has helped contribute to sustainability. Both partners have the grant management capacities and existing resources to be able to continue supporting interventions in future. BILS and the WRC will need to take the lead in ensuring the implementation of action plans, providing the necessary support to their members where relevant. Although all organisations are dependent on the availability of funding, and it was suggested that WRC was probably a little bit too dependent on the ILO, the long-term ability of the organisations to continue as going concerns does not appear in doubt.

4. Conclusions, Recommendations, Lessons Learned and Emergent Good Practices

4.1 Conclusions

Overall, the evaluation found the project has made important progress towards strengthening the voice of youth and women within the Bangladesh trade union movement. The project is the initial

step in a longer-term process of strengthening the capacities of the youth and women trade union members but should the gains of the project be retained and additional support provided by the ILO, GIZ, the project partners, and other key stakeholders, the seeds of this project can lead to significant change in the future.

Relevance

The project was found to be relevant to the needs of the trade union movement. It addressed a key gap that had been identified, that of the need to capacitate and empower a new generation of leaders. The collaborative design of the project by key members of the trade union movement helped to strengthen the project's relevance. The four modules in training developed for the youth and women leaders addressed key needs of federations, including weak management approaches and a lack of awareness of gender equality and inclusion. The main limitation on relevance identified by the evaluation was the limited office administrative and logistical space and equipment within the individual trade unions that inhibited the newly trained officers from utilising their skills.

The project demonstrated mixed attention to the ILO's cross-cutting themes. The empowerment of women leaders and greater knowledge within the movement about gender equality was built into the project. A key target of the project was to increase the involvement of women and youth in policy discussions and decision making. The project is also designed to improve social dialogue by enhancing the capacities of trade union youth and women members to engage in social dialogue initiatives. Policy dialogues included in the project design supported this need. However, the project has not addressed disability inclusion and paid very limited attention to the just transition to environmental sustainability. The project did not explicitly address international labour standards, although the project is designed within the overall framework of the ILO's support to Bangladesh to respond to the complaints concerning ILO conventions C.80, C.87, and C98.

Coherence

The logic of the project is essentially sound, although the activities of this project should only be considered a first stepping stone to achieving the long-term objectives. A theory of change was not designed for the project and this does hamper some clarity on the connections between certain activities, outputs and outcomes. Developing a theory of change that demonstrates how the project contributes to the ILO's LAWC cluster's overall theory of change would help strengthen clarity on how long-term change can be achieved.

The project has ensured synergies with the other actions of the ILO's LAWC cluster. A clear example of this is the training of several of the project's Master Trainers by the Better Work project. There are also good connections to overall goals of GIZ in Bangladesh.

Effectiveness

The project has been effective at achieving its planned output indicators, with the caveat that due to the political unrest a short no-cost extension was needed. The achievement of the overall objectives of the project is less clear and needs to be viewed within the context of the short timeframe of the project. Progress appears to have been made towards the objectives but continued support beyond the lifespan of this project will be needed to ensure full achievement of the goals.

The project has some key enabling factors. These include the development of the four key modules that were relevant to the needs of the trainees, the willingness of some, if not all, of the senior leadership of the trade union membership to embrace the need for the empowerment of youth and women leaders, the focus on gender equality, the strength of the two project partners, and the

technical support provided by the ILO. The barriers to achievement include challenges faced by participants from more remote locations to access training, the lack of follow-up on action plans of the enterprises, and the short-time frame of the project. Although the willingness of senior leaders to embrace the project's goals was a strength of the project, some trainees did report some leaders still being reluctant for change, thus demonstrating the need for continued work in this area. There are gaps in the monitoring framework of the project that also hamper effectiveness. A stronger focus on monitoring of change is needed to fully understand the project's progress towards achieving its goals.

Efficiency

There appears to have been an efficient use of resources in the project. Most, although not all, of the representatives of the project partners reported the funds were sufficient for the project. In addition, the technical support provided by the ILO and GIZ was considered important for achieving the project's goals. The short length of the project does harm efficiency in certain ways. Project stakeholders reported that more in-depth training was needed and this could not be provided in the short timeframe. There was also limited opportunity for providing follow up support on action plans to federations.

Impact

Identifying impact in an 20-month foundational project is challenging (extended to 24 through a no-cost extension). The project should be viewed as an initial stepping stone towards achieving stronger leadership and management of the trade union movement through the increased input and voice of a new generation of leaders. As such, if the ILO, GIZ, and the project partners are able to continue to provide support to the trade union movement, and the current leadership of the trade unions are willing to continue to pass power over to new leaders, then significant impact can be achieved. However, if continued support is not available or when it actually comes to more significant involvement of youth and women, the entrenched leadership is not prepared to allow substantial inputs, then the overall impact of the project will be much more minimal.

The evaluation was able to identify some initial changes that may contribute to further impact in future. These included increased confidence of the youth and women leaders to participate in social dialogue and policy discussion platforms, the willingness of senior leadership to recognise the need for reform, and an improvement in the administrative capacities of the trade unions.

Sustainability

Sustainability is very closely linked to the question of long-term impact raised above. The project has undertaken various actions that support sustainability in continuing support is given. The development of action plans at 32 enterprise level trade unions and 15 national federations is perhaps the clearest example of this. The significant pool of trainers is another important achievement that should help sustainability. The pool is large enough that even with natural levels of turn-over and drop-out, there will still be sufficient numbers to continue to provide training. The key stakeholders of the project will need to identify ways to broaden the reach of the project in future interventions. This should include the inclusion of stakeholders who do not live near Dhaka or other large urban areas, as well as considering how to include workers in the informal sector.

4.2 Recommendations

Recommendations	Addressed	Priority and	Resource
-----------------	-----------	--------------	----------

	To	Timeframe	Implications
<p>1. Strengthen the monitoring framework in future interventions.</p> <p>Particular focus should be given to ensuring that indicators that measure outcomes and change are collected and analysed. Within this project, the indicator that was designed to measure the meaningful involvement of new leaders in policy discussions was not collected. This should be prioritised in future.</p>	ILO BILS WRC	High Ongoing in new projects	Potentially some additional funds would be needed for monitoring staff.
<p>2. Develop a theory of change.</p> <p>The project document specified a theory of change would be developed, but this was not actioned. Developing a theory of change for interventions of this size that show how they fit within the larger ILO LAWCC cluster's work would support the understanding of changes the project is hoping to achieve and the measurement of that change described above.</p>	ILO, with input from project partners	Medium Ongoing	Staff time
<p>3. Follow up of action plans.</p> <p>The development of 32 action plans at the enterprise level and 15 at the national federation level is a significant achievement of this project but to ensure the project supports meaningful change, follow up support and monitoring to help the trade unions implement the action plans and understand what impact they are having is needed and should be included in future interventions.</p>	BILS and WRC with technical support from the ILO.	High ASAP	Staff time and travel costs
<p>4. Ensure future interventions include a focus on disability inclusion.</p> <p>Several stakeholders expressed an interest in improving the capacities of trade unions on disability inclusion. This was completely missing from this project but opportunities for future actions, including the inclusion of organisations of persons with disabilities in the design and implementation of projects should be acted on.</p>	ILO, BILS, and WRC	Medium Ongoing	Staff time Budget for activities and outputs
<p>5. Provide continued support through training to the project's trainees. A collaborative consultation should be undertaken to understand key needs and reach a consensus on the priorities.</p> <p>Most trainees who spoke to the evaluation believe they need more training to provide effective support to their trade unions. This included refresher and follow-up training, as well as</p>	BILS and WRC with technical support from the ILO.	High ASAP	Staff time, consultancy and training costs.

<p>additional topics. Additional topics suggested included just transition, grievance mechanisms, OSH, English language, advanced IT, labour law, machinery automation, and collective bargaining. More advanced training than the training offered in this project was suggested as well.</p>			
<p>6. Expand the reach of activities to more remote locations and the informal sector. The provision of training in Dhaka, lack of residential courses, particularly for women, and focus on formalised sectors were identified as barriers to broadening the reach of the project. Future interventions should identify ways to provide training for participants from rural locations, as well workers in the informal sector.</p>	<p>BILS and WRC with technical support from the ILO.</p>	<p>Medium Ongoing</p>	<p>Staff time and travel costs</p>
<p>7. Identify ways to improve the availability of office space and equipment within trade unions. Trainees shared that they are unable to utilise their skills because of a lack of office space and the necessary IT and other office equipment. BILS has tried to provide office space on a rotating basis. Future interventions should assess if there are other innovative ways to support trade unions with this capacity.</p>	<p>ILO, BILS, and WRC</p>	<p>Medium Ongoing</p>	<p>Costs of provision of office equipment and space.</p>
<p>8. Ensure the Youth and Women’s Committees continue to be supported and are given meaningful opportunities to engage in policy platforms. The development of the Youth and Women’s Committees are successful achievements of the project, but they will need continued support to ensure they are able to have meaningful impact on policy discussions. Future interventions should include activities to strengthen their capacities and work with the federations to ensure the Committees are given space to be actively involved in decision and policy making.</p>	<p>BILS and WRC with technical support from the ILO.</p>	<p>Medium Ongoing</p>	<p>Staff time and activity costs</p>
<p>9. Develop gender equality and disability inclusion policies at all levels of the trade union movement. To further the positive gains made by the project on gender equality and to address the gaps in disability inclusion, support should be given to the trade union movement at all levels to develop formal gender equality and disability inclusion policies.</p>	<p>ILO, BILS, and WRC</p>	<p>Medium Ongoing</p>	<p>Staff time</p>

<p>10. Strengthen adherence with the selection criteria for trainees</p> <p>The project had a selection criterion of trainees being under 40. This was to ensure a newer generation of leaders attended the training. This was not followed by all federations. Some nominated older and more senior leaders. Continued awareness raising with these federations is needed and future projects should try to ensure a stronger adherence to set selection criteria.</p>	<p>BILS, and WRC</p>	<p>Medium Ongoing</p>	<p>Staff time</p>
---	----------------------	-----------------------	-------------------

4.3 Lessons Learned

More detailed descriptions of the lessons learned are contained in annex 5.

1. Monitoring frameworks are important to understanding the achievements of the project. While the project appears to have had many successful achievements, it was notable that many stakeholders struggled to articulate exactly what the change had been. A stronger monitoring framework that measured outcomes more clearly can help address this concern.
2. There is real appetite for involvement by the new generation of youth and women leaders that can be harnessed for positive change by the trade union movement in the future. The evaluation identified strong enthusiasm from several youth and women leaders to be more actively involved in the leadership of the trade union movement. This provides a strong base for future intervention by the ILO, GIZ, BILS, and WRC, and if followed up may provide important opportunities for change.
3. Short project timeframes limit the depth of the training offered. Many trainees believed the training to have been basic and only a first step in developing their capacities. The short time frame of the project meant that modules had to be short in order to complete the activities. A longer project would allow for more in-depth training.

4.4 Emerging Good Practices

More detailed descriptions of the emerging good practices are contained in annex 5.

3. Project steering committees led by the project partners help support ownership of the project. BILS and WRC both developed their own project steering committees that included representatives from several of their member organisations. This appears to have strengthened the ownership of the project from the members and helped ensure their support in implementation of activities and awareness of the change the project was attempting to achieve.
4. The joint development of the project that included the ILO, BILS, WRC, and other members of the trade union membership helped ensure the project was highly relevant to the needs of the trade union movement in Bangladesh. The activities were not imposed on the partners from the ILO but designed in a collaborative manner that strengthened ownership from BILS and WRC and ensured a high level of participation from their members.



Terms of Reference

Support for effective and inclusive trade unions in Bangladesh

Final independent evaluation

1. Key facts

Title of project being evaluated	Support for effective and inclusive trade unions in Bangladesh
Project DC Code	BGD/23/01/DEU
Type of evaluation (e.g. independent, internal)	Independent
Timing of evaluation (e.g. midterm, final)	Final
Donor	Germany, Deutsche Gesellschaft für Internationale Zusammenarbeit (GIZ)
Administrative Unit in the ILO responsible for administrating the project	CO-Dhaka
Technical Unit(s) in the ILO responsible for backstopping the project	Labour Law and Social Dialogue, NORMES ACTRAV Decent Work Team (DWT) in New Delhi
P&B outcome (s) under evaluation	Output 2.2 Increased institutional, technical, representational and policy impact capacities of workers' organizations
SDG(s) under evaluation	SDG 4: Quality education SDG 5: Gender equality SDG 8: Decent work and economic growth
Budget	999,914.40 EURO

Evaluation dates	-December 2024 - April 2025
------------------	-----------------------------

2. Background information

Project background and context

Bangladesh faces a critical juncture as it nears graduation from Least Developed Country (LDC) status in 2026. To achieve sustainable growth and inclusive human development, the country must prioritize quality labour market governance institutions aligned with International Labour Standards. Effective trade unions play a crucial role in this process. Despite progress since the Rana Plaza tragedy in 2013, challenges persist, including limited Freedom of Association (FoA) and Collective Bargaining (CB) rights, weak tripartite institutions, and gaps in social protection. Addressing these issues requires a time-bound roadmap, as outlined by the ILO Governing Body (GB), in response to a complaint made by several workers' organizations in 2019 on non-observance of Conventions 81, 87 and 98 by the Government of Bangladesh (GoB). As a result, the GoB has committed to labour sector reform through the development of the ILO GB Roadmap (2021-2026) and GoB National Action Plan for the Labour Sector (2021-2026). Additionally, the Covid-19 pandemic and technological changes underscore the need for adaptable skills and stronger worker representation.

The project "[Support of effective and inclusive trade unions in Bangladesh](#)" is a targeted response by ILO and worker's organisations to build capacity of trade unions to effectively participate in labour reforms and support decent work as expressed in national development frameworks, including the 8th Five Year Plan (FYP), EU National Action Plan (2021-2026), GB Roadmap (2021-2026), and the UN Sustainable Development Cooperation Framework 2022-2026 (UNSDCF) in support of LDC graduation and achieving the Sustainable Development Goals 2030 (SDG) targets.

The project extends and contributes to the ongoing GIZ - Friedrich-Ebert-Stiftung (FES) project "Higher Education and Leadership Development for Sustainable Textiles in Bangladesh (HELD)" which has been working through the Academy of Work in developing the capacity of young trade union leaders. Specifically, the project aims to build on the progress, and opportunities emerging from the "HELD" initiative to revitalize the trade unions as capable, relevant, democratic, and representative actors for a changing workforce in Bangladesh.

The project builds on the achievements of the project "[Promoting Social Dialogue and Harmonious Industrial Relations in Bangladesh Ready-Made Garment Industry](#)" implemented by ILO Dhaka until March 2023, which established a Workers Resource Centre (WRC) in Dhaka with equal and active engagement of both National Coordination Committee for Workers Education (NCCWE) and IndustriALL Bangladesh Council (IBC).

Project strategies

The project ambition is to contribute to the following overall development objective:

Improved democratic and representative trade union capacity for sustainable and effective tripartite social dialogue

Accordingly, this project does this by supporting two overall outcomes:

- **Outcome 1:** Inclusive and effective trade union organisations through increased number of women and youth leaders
- **Outcome 2:** Improved collective bargaining capacity of trade unions through social dialogues

The project seeks to increase the young leadership capacity of the trade unions through a gender inclusive approach in following areas:

- **Administrative and communication support for trade unions**, including training on office management, financial management, basic IT skills (including email communication), and soft skills including communication skills
- **Capacity building for enterprise-level trade union leaders**, with particular emphasis on current and future female leaders of trade union Executive Committees, to strengthen their capacity on industrial relations, trade union management, leadership skills, and gender and inclusiveness issues, including GBVH.
- **Youth camps and network organization for young and female trade union leaders**, to develop and support knowledge and experience sharing.
- **Establishing public platforms for policy discussion** to formulate thematic policy briefs, foster a wide networking, and increase awareness and knowledge of trade unions and university students on national and global policy issues.

The project aims to address cross-cutting issues in particular gender mainstreaming and disability inclusion with an aim to achieve women's economic empowerment and gender equality in the World of Work.

Project stakeholders

The project works directly with trade unions as key stakeholders, focused on supporting youth and women trade union members and leaders, including National Coordination Committee for Workers Education (NCCWE), trade union federations and Trade Unions Solidarity Support Organizations (TUSSO), individual trade unions and workers on enterprise level, and academia and think tanks.

Project alignment with the DWCP, P&B, CPO & SDG

The project aims to contribute to the achievements of key national development frameworks in Bangladesh such as the 8th five-year plan of the GoB (2021-25), National Women's Development Policy (2011), the GB Roadmap on the Labour Sector of Bangladesh (2021-26) among others. It aligns with the ILO's Programme and Budget (P&B) (2022-23), Decent Work Country Programme (DWCP) (2022-26), and Country Programme Outcomes (CPO's). The project directly and indirectly contributes to SDG 4 (quality education), SDG 5 (gender equality) and SDG 8 (decent work and economic growth).

Project management arrangements

According to the cluster-approach adopted by the ILO Dhaka Office for implementation of the Decent Work Country Programme (2022-26), the project has been embedded in cluster two, Labour Administration and Working Conditions cluster. The Workers Resource Centre (WRC) and the Bangladesh Institute of Labour Studies (BILS) were identified as implementing partners.

The project is managed by a National Officer for Trade Unions (NoB) based in Dhaka, working together with a National Officer Learning Coordinator (NoA) and an Admin/finance Officer (NoB, 50% cost

shared). The National Officer for Trade Unions has the overall responsibility for the project implementation, supervised by the Programme Manager of the Labour Administration cluster.

A single, overarching ILO Project Advisory Committee was not established. Instead, two implementing partners, the Bangladesh Institute of Labour Studies (BILS) and the Workers Resource Centre (WRC), each set up their own oversight mechanisms. BILS created a five-member Project Steering Committee (PSC) to oversee project implementation, while WRC formed a seven-member Project Implementation and Sustainability Subcommittee to monitor the progress of the implementation.

Key progress

According to the Progress Report (July 2023 – April 2024), the project has completed following key activities:

- Project Steering Committee (PSC): BILS, a project implementing partner, has established a five-member Project Steering Committee to provide strategic guidance for their part.
- Training of Trainers (ToT) Program: Conducted a ToT program for 102 emerging leaders (41 female) selected from 26 sectoral (15 IBC affiliates) and national (11 NCCWE affiliates) trade union federations.
- Capacity Building Needs Assessment: Identified office management, financial management, soft skills (including communication skills), and basic IT skills as key capacity-building needs after eight capacity needs assessment workshops with 45 participants from 15 national trade union federations.
- Policy Group Meetings: Held two policy group meetings to redefine the strategic workplan for 2024, bringing together national and sectoral women leaders.
- Research Pool Formation: Selected 14 youth and female trade union leaders to form a research pool.
- Development of Training Modules: Developed training modules for 30 enterprise level trade union committees covering trade union management, industrial relations, leadership skills, and gender and inclusiveness issues (GBVH).
- Master Trainer Initiative: Selected 102 trainers from 26 sectoral (IBC) and national (NCCWE) trade union federations, all signatories of the WRC, to conduct training sessions for enterprise-level trade union committees.
- WRC Women Committee Activities: Held three internal policy dialogues to discuss the enablers and challenges of women's leadership growth within the trade union space.

The project faced significant challenges in achieving timely delivery. The first disruption occurred due to the pre- and post-national election shutdowns from late 2023 to January 2024. Additionally, the "Anti-Discrimination Student Movement," which began as a peaceful protest in early July 2024, rapidly escalated into a nationwide crisis, causing widespread unrest and ongoing political instability.

Due to these impacts on project delivery, a four-month no-cost extension has been requested and approved by the donor. Consequently, the project will now conclude on 30 April 2025, extending its total duration to 24 months. **Mid-term evaluation**

Given the short duration of the project, the ILO and GIZ agreed on a waiver of the mid-term evaluation. This allows the efforts of the project team to concentrate on the project implementation and a more comprehensive and in-depth final evaluation.

3. Purpose, objectives, and scope of the evaluation

The purpose of this final independent evaluation is to promote accountability, learning and building knowledge. It will cover the entire project implementation period May 2023-April 2025 (24 months). The overall objective is to assess the effectiveness (achievements vis-à-vis the intended objectives/outcomes and the outputs), effectiveness of management arrangements, relevance, validity of design, coherence, efficiency, orientation towards impact, sustainability, and ILO cross-cutting themes. Furthermore, the evaluation must be forward looking means based on national context and scenario of trade unions in Bangladesh, what worked well and what did not, lessons and challenges, sustainability issue etc., the evaluation should suggest actionable recommendations for future project.

The evaluation will need to address all relevant cross-cutting drivers for ILO's work which includes gender equality and non-discrimination, disability inclusion, promotion of international labour standards, tripartism, social dialogue, as well as the just transition to environmentally sustainable economies.

The evaluation will integrate gender equality and disability as cross-cutting concerns throughout the methodology, deliverables and final report of the evaluation. To the extent available, the evaluators should review secondary data and information disaggregated by sex, gender, ethnicity and people living with a disability. It is important to assess the relevance and effectiveness of the project's strategy related to gender equality and the inclusion of people living with a disability. All this information should be included in the Inception Report and draft and final Evaluation report.

The final evaluation will be carried out from December 2024 to April 2025. The geographical scope of the project is limited to Bangladesh. It will be conducted in compliance with the OECD/DAC Evaluation Quality Standard, UNEG Evaluation's Norms and Standards and with the principles for project evaluation set forth in the ILO Policy Guidelines for Evaluation: Principles, Rationale, Planning and Managing for Evaluations, 4th edition (Aug 2020).

The final evaluation will be managed by an independent evaluation manager and will be conducted by an evaluation team composed of an international evaluator and a national evaluator. Key stakeholders will be consulted throughout the evaluation process.

The primary users of this evaluation are trade unions. Other key stakeholders including ILO HQ, ILO Dhaka, and donor agency.

4. Evaluation criteria and questions (including Cross-cutting issues/ issues of special interest to the ILO)

The evaluation will examine project implementation against the hereunder criteria (as defined in the ILO Policy Guidelines for results-based evaluation, 2020) by addressing the following questions. The evaluator will develop a more detailed analytic framework of questions and sub-questions in the inception report to carry out the evaluation.

Relevance and validity of design

- To what extent has the project aligned with, and supported national development plans and priorities of trade unions?
- To what extent have the project objectives and interventions responded to the needs of beneficiaries?
- To what extent has the project integrated the cross-cutting themes (international labour standards, non-discrimination, social dialogue, tripartism and just transition) in the design?
- To what extent was the project linked to the UNSDCF, DWCP in Bangladesh, and P&B Outcomes of the ILO?

Coherence

- To what extent has the project built on previous experience of the ILO in Bangladesh, and relevant local and international experiences?
- To what extent has the project built the synergy with other work of the Labour Administration and Working Conditions cluster at ILO Dhaka and the Decent Work Country Programme Bangladesh (2022-26), SDGs and UNSDCF 2022-26?
- To what extent have the project interventions added values to the existing efforts in strengthening inclusive organization of trade unions and building unions' capacity of carrying out effective collective bargaining in Bangladesh?
- To what extent have the different components of the project interventions complemented each other towards achieving the project objectives?

Effectiveness

- To what extent the project progress towards its planned objectives? Are the activities having the desired results?
- To what extent has the project effectively contributed to promoting women and youth leadership through promotion of international labour standards, gender equality and disability inclusion, social dialogue and tripartism, and just transition?
- What were the main internal and external factors that influenced the achievement or non-achievement of results?
- How effectively did the project monitor performance and results? What were the systems put in place to track progress and risks?

Efficiency

- Were the available technical and financial resources adequate to fulfil the project plans?
- Were the management arrangements (roles and responsibilities assigned for ILO staff and key stakeholders) sufficient to support the project implementation?
- Are resources allocated strategically to provide the necessary support and to achieve the broader project objectives?

Orientation towards impact

- To what extent has the project created evidence-based positive changes and transformative changes towards achieving the project ultimate objective i.e. improved democratic and representative trade union capacity for sustainable and effective tripartite social dialogue?

- To what extent has the project strengthened the inclusiveness and representation of trade unions and capacity of trade unions in carrying out effective collective bargaining?
- How has the project contributed to the ILO's cross-cutting issues? What impact the project had in the process of social dialogue facilitation among the beneficiaries of the project.

Sustainability

- Has the project developed and implemented any exit strategy?
- Are the project interventions leading to replicable results?
- Will the project counterpart continue with the training and capacity building activities at various levels and how will the activities of the project will still relevant for the ILO CO Dhaka's engagement with TUs

The evaluator may adapt the evaluation criteria and questions, but any fundamental changes should be agreed between the evaluation manager and the evaluator, and reflected in the inception report.

5. Methodology

The final independent evaluation will comply with evaluation norms and standards and follow ethical safeguards, all as specified in ILO's evaluation procedures. The ILO adheres to the United Nations Evaluation Group (UNEG) evaluation norms and standards as well as to the OECD/DAC Evaluation Quality Standards. The evaluation is an independent evaluation, and the final methodology and evaluation questions will be determined by the consultant in consultation with the Evaluation Manager. These will be described in the inception report. The inception report will also include the work plan.

Evaluation approach

The evaluation adopts an **outcome-based** and **contribution analysis approach** that assesses the progress towards outcomes envisaged and provides a systematic way of understanding an intervention's contribution to observed outcomes or impacts.

The evaluation will apply a mixture of methods, including triangulation to increase the validity and rigor of the evaluation findings, engaging with tripartite constituents, stakeholders and partners of the project, as much as feasible, at all levels during the data collection and reporting phases. Both quantitative and qualitative methodologies need to be used. While quantitative methods can help understand the impact of the activities, qualitative methods will help understand how the activities were undertaken. These should help capture the project's contribution to the achievement of expected and unexpected outcomes.

The evaluation methods will include:

- **Desk review:** desk review of all relevant documents: project document and its logical framework, funding agreement, relevant minute sheets, implementation plan, training reports, progress reports, other relevant documents, and studies. Along with the logical framework, it should include examining the project's Theory of Change, as applicable, with particular attention to the assumptions, risks and mitigation strategies. The logical connection

between the levels of results and their alignment with the ILO's strategic objectives and outcomes at global and national levels as well as with the relevant SDGs will also be highlighted.

- **Meetings with the project staff:** the evaluator will meet the project staff to reach a common understanding for the evaluation process in the ILO Country Office for Bangladesh. These will include the programme manager, and the national officers at CO-Dhaka.
- **Meetings with backstopping units and the donor:** the evaluator will meet with the technical backstopping units in the ILO NORMES Department, Bureau of Workers Activities (ACTRAV), Decent Work Team (DWT) in New Delhi, as well as the donor agency GIZ. These can be realized through remote calls.
- **Field visits, collection of data, and interview with stakeholders:** the evaluator will meet, in addition to the project staff, with the key partners of the project on the national, local and enterprise levels. The evaluator will meet with a few project beneficiaries and organize focus group discussions with them.

Stakeholder validation: at the end of the fieldwork the evaluator will organize a debriefing meeting for the key stakeholders to present and discuss the preliminary findings and the lessons learned. The meeting will be in English with interpretation to Bengali, if possible, and virtual participation is to be enabled.

The evaluation team should develop the final evaluation methodology in consultation with the evaluation manager. The methods should be selected for their rigor and their ability to produce empirical evidence to meet the evaluation criteria, answer the evaluation questions and meet the objectives of the evaluation. The methodology will clearly state the limitations of the chosen evaluation methods including those related to representation of specific group of stakeholders.

During the data collection process, the evaluation team will compare and cross-validate data from different sources (project staff, project partners and beneficiaries) to verify their accuracy, and different methodologies (review documentary, field visits and interviews) that will complement each other.

The evaluation team will ensure that views and perceptions of diverse groups of stakeholders (women, youth, people with disabilities, union representatives at various levels) are appropriately reflected in databases, interviews, and that gender-specific questions are included in the questionnaires. The data and information will be collected, presented and analysed with appropriate gender disaggregation. The data collection analysis and presentation will be responsive to and include issues relating to the ILO's normative work social dialogue diversity and non-discrimination including disability issues.

The evaluator may adapt the methodology, but any changes should be agreed between the evaluation manager and the evaluator and reflected in the inception report.

An indicative list of persons to be interviewed (representing all stakeholders involved) will be prepared by the project team in consultation with the Evaluation Manager. The project will provide logistical support in the organization of these interviews.

Evaluation steps

- **Inception phase:** the evaluation team will carry out desk review and prepare the inception report.

- **Data collection:** the evaluation team will set the detailed schedule for data collection including consultations with stakeholders, with the logistical support by the project team. The evaluation team will carry out the field visits, stakeholder interviews, focus group discussions and other data collection activities as planned. A stakeholder debriefing meeting will be organized at the end of the field visits.
- **Submission of the draft of the report:** the lead evaluator will submit the first draft of the report to the evaluation manager, who will ensure its quality. If of quality, the evaluation manager will circulate it to the project manager, country team backstopping units, the donor, the key national partners, and relevant stakeholders for comment
- **Collection of feedback on the draft report:** the evaluation manager will collect the feedback on the first draft, consolidate and submit it to the evaluator.
- **Submission of the final report:** the lead evaluator will incorporate the feedback as appropriate and send the final report to the evaluation manager.
- **Quality of the report:** the evaluation manager, the regional evaluation officer, and ILO Evaluation Office will ensure the quality of the report.
- **Dissemination:** the evaluation report will be submitted to the key stakeholders by the CO and uploaded in the EVAL public repository of evaluation reports (e-discovery).

6. Main deliverables

1) Deliverable 1: Inception report

Upon the review of available documents and an initial discussion with the project management and the donor, an inception report will be developed. The inception report will:

- Describe the conceptual framework that will be used to undertake the evaluation.
- Elaborate the methodology proposed in the TOR with changes as required.
- Set out the matrix of evaluation questions, detailing the data required to answer the evaluation questions, data sources by specific evaluation questions, (emphasizing triangulation as much as possible) data collection methods, and purposive sampling
- Selection criteria for individuals for interviews (Including both women and men).
- Detail the work plan for the evaluation, indicating the phases in the evaluation, their key deliverables and milestones.
- Set out the list of key stakeholders to be interviewed and the tools to be used for interviews and discussions.
- Set out the agenda for the stakeholder's workshop/ meeting.
- Set out outline for the final evaluation report.
- Interview guides and other data collection tools

2) Deliverable 2: Stakeholder workshop

Upon completion of the data collection phase (desk review, field visits, meetings and interviews), preliminary findings will be shared in a stakeholder workshop with the key stakeholders mainly trade unions. The workshop can be organized virtually, face-to-face (if conditions allow) in Dhaka, or in a hybrid modality. The evaluator will set the agenda for the meeting. The workshop will be technically organized by the evaluation team with the logistic support of the project team.

3) Deliverable 3: Draft evaluation report

A first draft of the evaluation report that will have to be written in English, answers the questions related to the evaluation criteria, including the recommendations, lessons learned, good practices, technical recommendations for the key stakeholders. It will follow the structure presented below and the relevant ILO guidelines [wcms_746808.pdf \(ilo.org\)](#) for guidance on the structure and content. This draft should include

- Cover page with key project and evaluation data (using EVAL's template)
- Executive summary
- Acronyms and abbreviations
- Background on the project and its logic
- Purpose, scope and clients of evaluation
- Methodology and limitations
- Findings (this section's content should be organized around evaluation criterion and questions), including a table showing output and outcome level results through indicators and targets planned and achieved and comments on each one.
- Conclusions
- Recommendations (i.e. for the different key stakeholders and project partners), indicating per each one priority, timeframe and level of resources required. Suggested: maximum 8 recommendations in total).
- Lessons learned and good practices. Template for lessons learned is [wcms_746820.pdf \(ilo.org\)](#) and for good practices [wcms_746821.pdf \(ilo.org\)](#). The guidance template can be found at [wcms_746730.pdf \(ilo.org\)](#)
- Annexes:
 - TOR
 - Evaluation matrix (questions and indicators)
 - List of persons consulted
 - Schedule of work (briefings, data collection, interviews, field visits, workshop/s)
 - Documents consulted
 - Evaluation matrix
 - Data collection tools
 - Logical framework analysis matrix
 - Lessons learned
 - Emerging good practices

4) Deliverable 4: Final evaluation report and separate executive summary

The final evaluation report, incorporating written comments collected by the Evaluation Manager, shall be written in English, be about 35 pages maximum (excluding annexes and executive summary), and include a cover page.

A separate executive summary, following ILO EVAL's template, will be submitted by the evaluator/team. Ideally, the summary shall be written in English and Bengali to facilitate wide dissemination.

7. Management arrangements and work plan (including timeframe)

Evaluation Manager: The evaluation will be managed by Ms ZHOU Jie (zhoujie@ilo.org), ILO officer based in Beijing, China who has no prior involvement in the project, and oversight by Pamornrat Pringsulaka, Monitoring and evaluation officer, RO Asia and the Pacific.

The evaluation manager is responsible for completing the following specific tasks:

- Brief the evaluator(s) on ILO evaluation policies and procedures.
- Initial coordination with the project team on the development of the data collection process and the preliminary results workshop.
- Ensure the quality of all deliverables, along with the regional evaluation officer
- Circulate the first draft of the evaluation report to the key stakeholders requesting written comments within specified timelines.
- Consolidate the received written comments received into a master evaluation report and send it to the evaluation team.
- Liaise with the project staff whenever their engagement is needed to fulfil the above requirements; and
- Ensure the final version of the evaluation report addresses the stakeholders' comments (or an explanation why any has not been addressed) and meets ILO requirements.

The project team (Programme Manager and National Officers) will have the following responsibilities:

- Provide all necessary information, documents and contact lists available.
- Facilitate the scheduling of meetings with key stakeholders when necessary.
- Attend evaluation meetings and provide clarifications and feedback as required.

Proposed work plan

The evaluation is expected to be carried out from December 2024 to April 2025. The number of workdays needed for the completion of the work is estimated to be 21 days for the lead international consultant and the national consultant respectively.

	Task	Responsible	Number of working days		Dates (tentative, to be determined in consultation with the Project Team)
			Lead consultant	National consultant	
1	Briefing of evaluation consultants with the evaluation manager, and project team	Evaluation Manager, Project Manager and team members, Consultants,	0	0	20 December 2024
2	Desk review and documents review, preparation of inception report	Consultant	5	3	10 January 2025
9	Comments on inception report, approval and finalisation	Evaluation Manager Consultant	0		17 January 2025
4	Data collection phase (fieldwork as per agreed itinerary, interviews)	Consultant	4	6	20 January – 7 February 2025
5	Post-fieldwork debriefing/stakeholder workshop (virtual)	Consultant Evaluation Manager	2 (includes preparation time)	2	14 February 2025
6	Report writing (full draft with annexes) submitted to the evaluation manager for review;	Consultant	7	7	28 February 2025
7	Circulating the draft report for comments from stakeholders	Evaluation Manager			3 – 17 March 2025
8	Consolidate feedback from stakeholders and send feedback to the consultant.	Evaluation Manager			24 March 2025
9	Consultant prepares Final Evaluation Report and separate Evaluation Summary and submits to ILO	Consultant	3	3	31 March 2025
10	Evaluation manager approves the evaluation report at its level and submit to the Regional EVAL	Evaluation manager			7 April 2025

	Task	Responsible	Number of working days Lead consultant	Number of working days National consultant	Dates (tentative, to be determined in consultation with the Project Team)
17	EVAL provides final approval	Evaluation Manager			14 April 2025
	TOTAL		21	21	

8. Profile of the evaluation team

Independent Evaluation team

The evaluation will be conducted by an evaluation team of 2 consultants, an international team leader and a national consultant. The evaluation team leader will be responsible for the report. Given the ongoing anti-quota movement in Bangladesh, the international consultant (outside of Bangladesh) will work remotely without requirement of traveling to Bangladesh. The national consultant will carry out field data collection missions under safe and appropriate conditions and with the guidance and support of the international consultant.

International consultant (Team leader)

Responsibilities	Qualifications
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Design, plan and conduct the evaluation, in accordance with the ILO’s guidelines, specifications and timeline - Conduct evaluation and deliver all deliverables under this TOR - Desk review of project documents and other related documents - Develop evaluation instrument and draft inception report - Organize and schedule all necessary stakeholder consultations, in coordination /consultation with ILO and partners - Participate in briefings and discussions virtually in line with the work outlined in the TOR - Facilitate stakeholders’ workshop/debriefing with the project and key stakeholders - Identify lessons learned and good practices which will be annexed to the report - Draft evaluation report - Finalize evaluation report - Draft stand-alone evaluation summary as per standard ILO format - Supervise the other team member, i.e. national consultant (to be contracted separately by the ILO) and ensure quality assurance for her/his deliverables 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Master’s Degree with minimum 8 years of experience in project /program evaluation. - Evaluation expertise in social dialogue/collective bargaining field and previous proven skills and experience in undertaking evaluations of similar projects, preferably in Asia. - Experience in using the Theory of change / logical framework approach on evaluation. - Background in Human Rights Based Approach programming and Results Based Management will be an advantage. - In-depth knowledge of the local context, national policies in terms of development and existing national and international support programs. - Extensive knowledge of, and experience in applying, qualitative and quantitative research methodologies. - Knowledge of ILO’s roles and mandate and its tripartite structure as well as UN evaluation norms and its programming is desirable.

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Good knowledge of ILO's cross-cutting issues - Excellent analytical skills and communication skills. - Demonstrated excellent report writing and oral skills in English
--	---

Team member (national consultant)

Responsibilities	Qualifications
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Desk review of project documents and other related documents - Assist the team leader in developing evaluation instrument and drafting inception report - Take the lead in carrying out field visits in Bangladesh and interviews with key stakeholders and provide data collected to the team leader - Provide verbal interpretation (English/Bengali) for the team leader during the evaluation interviews and meetings whenever needed - Assist the team leader in facilitating stakeholder workshop/debriefing - Contribute to the drafting of the evaluation report under the guidance of the team leader 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Based in Bangladesh - University degree in social sciences or related graduate qualifications. - A minimum of 5 years of professional experience in evaluating social development projects initiatives or related social research; as team member (i.e., data collection and analysis, on the area of industrial relations will be an added advantage); - Proven experience with logical framework approaches and other strategic planning approaches, M&E methods and approaches (including quantitative, qualitative and participatory), information analysis and report writing. - Fluency in written and spoken English and good knowledge of Bengali required. - Knowledge and experience of the UN System an advantage. - Understanding of the development context of the Project Country is an advantage. - Good knowledge of ILO's cross-cutting issues - Excellent communication and interview skills.

	<ul style="list-style-type: none">- Demonstrated ability to deliver quality results within strict deadlines.
--	--

9. Legal and ethical matters

The [ILO Code of Conduct](#) for independent evaluators applies to all evaluation team members. The principles behind the Code of Conduct are fully consistent with the Standards of Conduct for the International Civil Service to which all UN staff is bound. UN staff is also subject to any UNEG member specific staff rules and procedures for the procurement of services.

The selected consultant evaluators and team members shall sign and return a copy of the code of conduct with their contract.

The evaluation will comply with the UN norms and Standards.

The consultant(s) should not have any links to project management, or any other conflict of interest that would interfere with the independence of the evaluation.

All data and information received from the ILO for the purpose of this assignment will be treated confidentially and are only to be used in connection with the execution of these Terms of Reference. All intellectual property rights arising from the execution of these Terms of Reference are assigned to the ILO. Use of the data for publication and other presentation can only be made with the agreement of ILO. Key stakeholders can make appropriate use of the evaluation report in line with the original purpose and with appropriate acknowledgement.

Annex – Relevant ILO evaluation policies and guidelines

[ILO Policy Guidelines for evaluation: Principles, rationale, planning and managing for evaluations](#)

Guidance notes:

[3.1 Integrating gender equality in monitoring & evaluation of projects](#)

[3.2 Adapting evaluation methods to the ILO's normative and tripartite mandate](#)

[4.3 Data collection methods](#)

[4.5 Stakeholder engagement](#)

Checklists:

[4.2 Preparing the evaluation report](#)

[4.3 Filing in the evaluation title page](#)

[4.4 Writing the evaluation report summary](#)

[4.8 Writing the inception report](#)

Templates:

[3.1 ILO Code of conduct: Agreement for evaluators \(To be signed by the evaluators\)](#)

[4.1 Lessons learned](#)

[4.2 Good practices](#)

[4.3 Evaluation summary](#)

[4.4 Evaluation title page](#)

Annex 2: Evaluation Matrix

Question	Secondary Lines of Enquiry (if applicable)	Indicators	Data Sources	Method	Analysis and assessment
Relevance and Strategic Fit					
To what extent has the project aligned with, and supported national development plans and priorities of trade unions?	How effectively were trade unions consulted during the design of the project? Has there been any role for the Ministry of Labour and employers' representatives?	Alignment with stated trade union priorities Alignment with national development plans	Project documents National policy documents ILO staff Trade union leaders Government officials/Employers representatives (if relevant)	Document review KIIs	Thematic analysis and triangulation of interview data showing relevance to various stakeholder needs. Qualitative Content Analysis of relevant national and donor policy documents.
To what extent have the project objectives and interventions responded to the needs of beneficiaries including women, youth and persons with disabilities?	How were needs assessed? Was this inclusive of different groups of beneficiaries?	Evidence of needs assessment or consultation with beneficiaries during the design of the project.	Project documents Trade union leaders and members	Document review KIIs FGDs	Thematic analysis of interview data
To what extent has the project integrated the cross-cutting themes (international labour standards, non-discrimination, social dialogue, tripartism and just transition) in the design?	Has the project effectively engaged relevant departments and backstoppers within the ILO (CO, DWT-Delhi and Geneva)?	Evidence of the consideration of each theme in the design of the project.	Project documents ILO and partner staff	Document review KIIs	Qualitative Content Analysis of relevant project documents
Coherence					
To what extent has the project built on previous experience of the ILO in Bangladesh, and	Did the project utilise previous evaluation findings?	Evidence of aligning with previous	Project documents ILO and partner staff	Document review KIIs	Thematic analysis of interview data Qualitative Content

relevant local and international experiences?	Were experiences from elsewhere in the ILO utilised effectively? Did the project leverage the experiences of the partner organisations during design and implementation?	evaluation recommendations.			Analysis of relevant project documents
To what extent has the project built the synergy with other work of the Labour Administration and Working Conditions cluster at ILO Dhaka and the Decent Work Country Programme Bangladesh (2022-26), SDGs and UNSDCF 2022-26?	Are references to these documents included in project design and reporting?	References to relevant documents in project proposal and progress reports.	Project documents	Document review	Qualitative Content Analysis of relevant project documents
To what extent have the project interventions added values to the existing efforts in strengthening inclusive organization of trade unions and building unions' capacity of carrying out effective collective bargaining in Bangladesh?	What other initiatives exist? What processes for ensuring coordination and reduction of duplication of efforts have been undertaken?	Examples of synergies with other initiatives	Project documents ILO and partner staff Trade union leaders	Document review KIIs	Thematic analysis of interview data
To what extent have the different components of the project interventions complemented each other towards achieving the project objectives?	Is the theory of change valid? Do the different outputs contribute coherently to the outcomes and overall objective?	Theory of change Examples of inter-connectiveness of results	Project documents	Document review	Qualitative Content Analysis of relevant programme documents
Effectiveness					
To what extent has the project progressed towards its planned objectives? Are the	What progress has been made towards the increased number of women and youth leaders in trade	Planned vs actual results?	Project documents ILO and partner staff	Document review KIIs	Thematic analysis of interview data

activities having the desired results?	unions and improved collective bargaining capacity of trade unions through social dialogue? Are the activities and outputs contributed to effectively to these outcomes?	Examples of output and outcome indicators being achieved.	Trade union members	FGDs	
What were the main internal and external factors that influenced the achievement or non-achievement of results?	What are the strengths and weaknesses of the project? How has the project responded to the political changes in Bangladesh during project implementation?	Evidence of response to context changes Evidence of adaptive management in the project and responding to opportunities	Project documents ILO and partner staff	Document review KIIs	Thematic analysis of interview data
How effectively did the project monitor performance and results? What were the systems put in place to track progress and risks?	What M&E system exists? How is it used by the project? Do the project partners understand their roles and responsibilities for monitoring progress?	Evidence the M&E plan was developed and updated regularly Evidence project partners understand it. Evidence a project risk register was developed and updated regularly	Project documents ILO and partner staff	Document review KIIs	Thematic analysis of interview data
Efficiency					
Were the available technical and financial resources adequate to fulfil the project plans?	Are resources allocated strategically to provide the necessary support and to achieve the broader project objectives? Do project partners believe they had sufficient funds to implement their activities? Was the project able to effectively leverage the broader resources of the ILO?	Review of use of budget and resources Examples of utilisation of other resources	Project documents ILO and partner staff	Document review KIIs	Thematic analysis of interview data

	Was the length of the project in alignment with the ambitions for activities, outputs and outcomes?				
Were the management arrangements (roles and responsibilities assigned for ILO staff and key stakeholders) sufficient to support the project implementation?	Did the project partners have the sufficient capacities to implement the project? Were roles and responsibilities among the ILO team clear and understood?	Evidence of clear understanding of roles	Project documents ILO and partner staff	Document review KIIs	Thematic analysis of interview data
Impact Orientation					
To what extent has the project created evidence-based positive changes and transformative changes towards achieving the project ultimate objective i.e. improved democratic and representative trade union capacity for sustainable and effective tripartite social dialogue?	Has the project been able to effectively measure changes? Is there evidence of attitude changes within trade unions in the role of women and youth leaders? Is there evidence the project has advanced social dialogue at either the enterprise or national level?	Examples of training being utilised in day-to-day work Evidence the trade unions are more open to youth and women leadership and there is meaningful participation.	Trade union members	KIIs FGDs	Thematic analysis of interview data
To what extent has the project strengthened the inclusiveness and representation of trade unions and capacity of trade unions in carrying out effective collective bargaining?	Have CBAs been negotiated? Is there evidence of greater diversity in meaningful decision-making processes within the trade unions? Do trade union members have a better understanding of how to undertake collective bargaining?	Examples of CBAs being agreed? Evidence the processes for negotiating the CBAs has been inclusive.	Project and other documentation Trade union members	Document review KIIs FGDs	Thematic analysis of interview data
To what extent has the project effectively contributed to promoting women and youth leadership including through	Can improvements in the involvement of women and youth in influencing policy decisions be	Concrete examples of women and youth influencing policy decisions	Trade union members (specifically trainees)	KIIs FGDs	Thematic analysis of interview data

promotion of international labour standards, gender equality and disability inclusion, and just transition?	identified? Have they been involved in collective bargaining? Are the examples of the empowerment of persons with disabilities in trade unions? Did the project consider issues of just transition? Have beneficiaries improved their understanding of ILS and are they utilising this in their work?	Examples of persons with disabilities being involved in activities Examples of use of ILS in day to day work			
What impact has the project had in the process of social dialogue facilitation among the beneficiaries of the project?	What involvement of the other tripartite constituents can be identified and has this contributed to gains in social dialogue? Do the trainees have examples of utilising social dialogue skills in the workplace?	Examples of social dialogue being used by beneficiaries.	Trade union members (specifically trainees)	KIIs FGDs	Thematic analysis of interview data
Sustainability					
Has the project developed and implemented an exit strategy?	Was the project of sufficient length to achieve its goals?	Existence of an exit/sustainability strategy	Project documents ILO and partner staff	Document review KIIs	Qualitative Content Analysis of relevant project documents
Are the project interventions leading to replicable results?	Have the methodologies of the project been replicated in any projects both within the ILO or elsewhere?	Examples of replication	ILO and partner staff	KIIs	Thematic analysis of interview data
Will the project counterpart continue with the training and capacity building activities at various levels and how will the activities of the project still be relevant for the ILO CO	What are the key enablers/barriers the project partners have in ensuring they continue the activities?	Existence of plans by project partners for continued activities? Examples of opportunities for ILO to	ILO and partner staff	KIIs	Thematic analysis of interview data

Dhaka's engagement with TUs?	Are the emerging good practices and lessons learned being used in other projects?	continue to engage with TUs.			
------------------------------	---	------------------------------	--	--	--

Annex 3: List of Interviews Conducted

Name	Position	Organisation	Gender (M/W)
Neeran Ramjuthan	Program Manager, LAWC	ILO	M
Linnea Strand	Operations and Program Officer	ILO	W
Md Jamil Ansar	Senior Program Officer + BGD/23/01/DEU focal	ILO	M
Shipra Chowdhury	Training Focal	ILO	W
Mokther Hossain	M&E Officer	ILO	M
Afia Rashid	Education and Youth Advisor	GIZ	W
Syed Sultan Uddin Ahmmed	Executive Director	BILS	M
Kohinoor Mahmood	Director (Programme & Information)	BILS	W
Naimul Ahsan Jewel	Chair - BILS Project Steering Committee	BILS	M
Nasrin Akter Dina Member	BILS Project Steering Committee	BILS	W
Ashis Acharjee	BILS Project Coordinator	BILS	M
S.M. Ahasan Habib Bulbul	Chairperson	WRC	M
Shahadat Hossain	Vice Chairperson	WRC	M
Shakil Akter Chowdhury	Convenor – WRC Project Implementation & Sustainability Sub-committee	WRC	M
Shamim Ara	Member – WRC Board of Trustees	WRC	W
Rafiqul Alam	Manager - WRC	WRC	M
Sima Akhter	Chair	WRC Women Committee	W
Rabeya Akhter	Vice Chair	WRC Women Committee	W

Rubina Akter Rubi	Training of Trainers (ToT) on Gender and Inclusiveness Issues	Bangladesh Garment and Industrial Workers Federation	F
Asaduzzaman	Training of Trainers (ToT) on Leadership Skills	Bangladesh Free Trade Union Congress	M
Shamrat Hosen		BAWF	M
M.A Salam		Garments Sromik Jot Bangladesh	M
Tomiza Khatun	Training of Trainers (ToT) on Trade Union Management	Bangladesh Independent Garment Workers Union Federation	W
Rukhsana Afroj Asha	Training of Trainers (ToT) on Industrial Relations	Socialist Labour Front	W
MD.Sumon Howlader		FGW	M
Tamanna Binta Alamgir	Training of Trainers (ToT) on (i) TU Office Management; (ii) TU Financial Management; (iii) Basic IT Skills; and (iv) Soft Skills including Communication (better organizing)	General Secretary, Beauty Parlour Sramik Union, Jatrabari, Dhaka	W
Ashraful Islam		Office Secretary & Joint General Secretary, Bangladesh Sarak Paribahan Sramik League & Mukto Garments Sramik Federation	M
Ripa Akter		President (Gazipur District), Jatiyo Sramik Jote	W
Taneha		Organizing Secretary, Garments Sramik Jote Bangladesh	W
Majharul Islam Nahid		Member, Bangladesh Sramik Federation (BSF)	M
Maruf Hossien		Member, Bangladesh Labour Federation (BLF)	M
Sumaya Sammi		Domestic Worker, Member, BJSF	W
Jaysmin Akter		BJSJ	F
Shahriar Nafiz		JSF	M
Jahanara Begum		BTUC	F
Rukshana Afroz Asha		Counsellor, CC	W
Youth camp attendees	FGD		Zakia

Annex 4: List of documents consulted

Documents reviewed include:

- The PRODOC
- Progress reports presented to GiZ
- Implementation Agreements with BILS and WRC
- Bangladesh DWCP
- An update on the status of the logframe as of December 2024
- An informal update from the project partners as of February 2025
- Evaluation reports of previous interventions
- The LAWC MEL strategy
- Various documents produced by BILS and WRC during the project such as policy briefs, event reports, the collective bargaining toolkit, and joint position papers
- ILO Declaration of the Principles and Rights at Work (1998)
- The Programme and Budget 2024-25
- The Eight Five Year Plan of the Government of Bangladesh (2020-2025)
- The National Action Plan (NAP) on the Labour Sector of Bangladesh (2021-2026)
- Government of Bangladesh Roadmap on the Labour Sector of Bangladesh (2021-2026).

Support for effective and inclusive trade unions in Bangladesh

Independent Evaluation

Project DC/SYMBOL: BGD/23/01/DEU

Name of Evaluator: Chris Morris

Date: 31 January 2024

The following lesson learned has been identified during the course of the evaluation. Further text explaining the lesson may be included in the full evaluation report.

LESSON LEARNED ELEMENT	TEXT
Brief description of lessons learned (link to specific action or task)	Monitoring frameworks are important to understanding the achievements of the project.
Context and any related preconditions	The project has a logic framework with set indicators. Most of the indicators are output rather than outcome.
Targeted users / Beneficiaries	ILO, BILS, and the WRC.
Challenges /negative lessons - Causal factors	While the project appears to have had many successful achievements, it was notable that many stakeholders struggled to articulate exactly what the change had been. A stronger monitoring framework that measured outcomes more clearly can help address this concern.
Success / Positive Issues - Causal factors	Interviews with stakeholder suggested they believed the project had led to positive change and
ILO Administrative Issues (staff, resources, design, implementation)	Increased resources on M&E staff and M&E training for partners should be considered in projects.

Support for effective and inclusive trade unions in Bangladesh

Independent Evaluation

Project DC/SYMBOL: BGD/23/01/DEU

Name of Evaluator: Chris Morris

Date: 31 January 2024

The following lesson learned has been identified during the course of the evaluation. Further text explaining the lesson may be included in the full evaluation report.

LESSON LEARNED ELEMENT	TEXT
Brief description of lessons learned (link to specific action or task)	There is real appetite for involvement by the new generation of youth and women leaders that can be harnessed for positive change by the trade union movement in the future.
Context and any related preconditions	The evaluation identified strong enthusiasm from several youth and women leaders to be more actively involved in the leadership of the trade union movement.
Targeted users / Beneficiaries	This provides a strong base for future intervention by the ILO, GIZ, BILS, and WRC, and if followed up may provide important opportunities for change. The ultimate beneficiaries would be the trade union federations, their members, and workers overall.
Challenges /negative lessons - Causal factors	The work requires continuing support. The project has been an initial stepping stone, but action from BILS, the WRC, and the trade union leadership, and support from organisations such as ILO and GIZ is not continued, the gains of the project will be lost.
Success / Positive Issues - Causal factors	Success was based both on the enthusiasm of the younger generation who received training to participate in trade union management and leadership roles and the willingness of the existing leadership to support the training of new leadership and create space for their participation in policy dialogue and decision making.
ILO Administrative Issues (staff, resources, design, implementation)	

Support for effective and inclusive trade unions in Bangladesh

Independent Evaluation

Project DC/SYMBOL: BGD/23/01/DEU

Name of Evaluator: Chris Morris

Date: 31 January 2024

The following lesson learned has been identified during the course of the evaluation. Further text explaining the lesson may be included in the full evaluation report.

LESSON LEARNED ELEMENT	TEXT
Brief description of lessons learned (link to specific action or task)	Short project timeframes limit the depth of the training offered.
Context and any related preconditions	The project had an initial timeframe of 18 months, which was extended to 24 months with a no-cost extension.
Targeted users / Beneficiaries	ILO and project partners developing proposals and donors.
Challenges /negative lessons - Causal factors	Many trainees believed the training to have been basic and only a first step in developing their capacities. The short time frame of the project meant that modules had to be short in order to complete the activities. A longer project would allow for more in-depth training.
Success / Positive Issues - Causal factors	The modules included in the training were seen as highly relevant and there is a desire from the participants to be afforded the opportunity to go into greater detail and learn more.
ILO Administrative Issues (staff, resources, design, implementation)	This would require increased training budgets in projects and longer timeframes. Providing opportunities for on-the-job training to practice new skills and

Support for effective and inclusive trade unions in Bangladesh

Independent Evaluation

Project DC/SYMBOL: BGD/23/01/DEU

Name of Evaluator: Chris Morris

Date: 31 January 2024

The following emerging good practice has been identified during the course of the evaluation. Further text can be found in the full evaluation report.

GOOD PRACTICE ELEMENT	TEXT
Brief summary of the good practice (link to project goal or specific deliverable, background, purpose, etc.)	<p>Project steering committees led by the project partners help support ownership of the project.</p>
Relevant conditions and Context: limitations or advice in terms of applicability and replicability	<p>BILS and WRC both developed their own project steering committees that included representatives from several of their member organisations.</p> <p>It was suggested that this approach enhanced participation more than a traditional steering committee led by the ILO and donor representatives for the entire project. It helped to keep the partners individually focused on their elements of the project.</p>
Establish a clear cause-effect relationship	<p>This appears to have strengthened the ownership of the project from the members and helped ensure their support in implementation of activities and awareness of the change the project was attempting to achieve.</p>
Indicate measurable impact and targeted beneficiaries	<p>Measurement of impact is challenging with such a good practice, but stakeholders reported the steering committees had helped strengthen ownership of the project.</p>
Potential for replication and by whom	<p>This would be particularly replicable in where project implementation partners are federations or umbrella organisations representing diverse membership.</p>
Upward links to higher ILO Goals (DWCPs, Country Programme Outcomes or ILO’s Strategic Programme Framework)	<p>The project supports both Output 3.3 in strengthening trade union capacities on social dialogue and tripartism and Output 4.4, in increasing women’s representation and voice in decision and policy making processes of the Bangladesh DWCP 2022-2026.</p>
Other documents or relevant comments	

Support for effective and inclusive trade unions in Bangladesh

Independent Evaluation

Project DC/SYMBOL: BGD/23/01/DEU

Name of Evaluator: Chris Morris

Date: 31 January 2024

The following emerging good practice has been identified during the course of the evaluation. Further text can be found in the full evaluation report.

GOOD PRACTICE ELEMENT	TEXT
Brief summary of the good practice (link to project goal or specific deliverable, background, purpose, etc.)	The joint development of the project that included the ILO, BILS, WRC, and other members of the trade union membership helped ensure the project was highly relevant to the needs of the trade union movement in Bangladesh.
Relevant conditions and Context: limitations or advice in terms of applicability and replicability	The activities were not imposed on the partners from the ILO but designed in a collaborative manner that strengthened ownership from BILS and WRC and ensured a high level of participation from their members.
Establish a clear cause-effect relationship	The project had strong support from trade union federations and members, which can be aligned with the project responding to identified needs.
Indicate measurable impact and targeted beneficiaries	Trade unions have been willing to send members to participate in training. Although there were some concerns with a few trade unions not adhering to the selection criteria with regard to the age of participants, in general most trade unions did actively support the engagement of younger members and support the goal of empowering them in leadership opportunities.
Potential for replication and by whom	Applicable in the development of most projects but particularly those that require the active participation of a large number of beneficiary organisations.
Upward links to higher ILO Goals (DWCPs, Country Programme Outcomes or ILO's Strategic Programme Framework)	The project supports both Output 3.3 in strengthening trade union capacities on social dialogue and tripartism and Output 4.4, in increasing women's representation and voice in decision and policy making processes of the Bangladesh DWCP 2022-2026.

**Other documents or
relevant comments**

Annex 6: Interview Guides

Interview Guide For Senior Management of Partner Organisations

Informed consent:

My name is Chris/Zakia. I'm an independent evaluator conducting the final evaluation of the Support for effective and inclusive trade unions in Bangladesh implemented by the ILO, BILS, and the WRC and funded by GIZ. I'm speaking to you because you are a key stakeholder in this project, and your thoughts on its implementation to date and recommendations for future activities. We've also speaking to other key stakeholders who have been part of the project's work and will use the information from interviews to produce a report with key findings, lessons learned and recommendations. We will ensure that all the information you share today is anonymized. We may use quotes for the interviews in the report but will ensure they cannot be traced back to you. If you say anything which you want removed from the notes and not shared, please let me know. Are you happy to continue with the interview?

Questions

1. Can you give a brief introduction to your organisation, its mandate and vision, and your role in the organisation?
2. Please describe the involvement of BILS/WRC in the project?
3. Did the ILO consult you in the design of the project?
4. Were you happy with the initial design of the project? Were there areas that could have been improved?
5. What are the main challenges facing the trade union in Bangladesh?
6. Do you think the project has addressed these? Can you give concrete examples please?
7. What do you think have been the main achievements of the project?
8. Do you think the project has led to any changes (including in attitudes of leadership, practices in managing the trade unions, empowerment of youth and women etc)
9. Please give some concrete examples of the above.
10. Have persons with disabilities been involved in the project? Could you explain how please?
11. Has the project led to any improvements in social dialogue or collective bargaining? Could you give concrete examples?
12. How do you monitor the progress of the project? How do you coordinate with the ILO on this?
13. What follow up do you do with the recipients of the training and the trade unions? Are there ways of identifying how much they are utilising the training?
14. Do you follow up with the trade unions on the action plans they developed?
15. Have you been happy with the support of the ILO? What improvements could have been made?
16. Have you been given sufficient resources to implement the project?
17. What plans do you have for continuing the activities after the project has ended? Has a sustainability plan been developed?
18. Do you have any recommendations for the ILO for future projects?

Interview Guide For Women's Committee of WRC Members

Informed consent:

My name is Chris/Zakia. I'm an independent evaluator conducting the final evaluation of the Support for effective and inclusive trade unions in Bangladesh implemented by the ILO, BILS, and the WRC and funded by GIZ. I'm speaking to you because you are a key stakeholder in this project, and your thoughts on its implementation to date and recommendations for future activities. We've also speaking to other key stakeholders who have been part of the project's work and will use the information from interviews to produce a report with key findings, lessons learned and recommendations. We will ensure that all the information you share today is anonymized. We may use quotes for the interviews in the report but will ensure they cannot be traced back to you. If you say anything which you want removed from the notes and not shared, please let me know. Are you happy to continue with the interview?

Questions

1. Can you give a brief introduction to the Women's Committee of the WRC? What is its mandate and vision? What activities does it undertake etc?
2. What are the main challenges facing women workers with regards to joining, participating in, and being part of the leadership of trade unions in Bangladesh?
3. What involvement in the ILO project have you had?
4. Were you involved in the design of the project?
5. Has the project helped to address some of the challenges you have listed above? Could you explain how with concrete examples?
6. Have persons with disabilities been involved in the project? Could you explain how please?
7. What do you think have been the main achievements of the project?
8. Do you think the project has led to any changes (including in attitudes of leadership, practices in managing the trade unions, empowerment of women, youth etc)
9. Please give some concrete examples of the above.
10. Do you think the changes described above will be long lasting? What support is needed to ensure the changes remain?
11. Have you been happy with the support of ILO during the project? What could have been improved?
12. Do you have any recommendations for the ILO for future projects?

Interview Guide For Training of Trainer recipients

Informed consent:

My name is Chris/Zakia. I'm an independent evaluator conducting the final evaluation of the Support for effective and inclusive trade unions in Bangladesh implemented by the ILO, BILS, and the WRC and funded by GIZ. I'm speaking to you because you are a key stakeholder in this project, and your thoughts on its implementation to date and recommendations for future activities. We've also speaking to other key stakeholders who have been part of the project's work and will use the information from interviews to produce a report with key findings, lessons learned and recommendations. We will ensure that all the information you share today is anonymized. We may use quotes for the interviews in the report but will ensure they cannot be traced back to you. If you say anything

which you want removed from the notes and not shared, please let me know. Are you happy to continue with the interview?

Questions

1. Could you introduce yourself please? (including background, trade union, role in the trade union etc)
2. How did you come to be involved in the project?
3. What training have you received from the project?
4. What did you learn during the training?
5. Where you happy with the training? How could it be improved?
6. What are you hoping the project will achieve in your trade union? What changes do you hope are made?
7. Have you found it possible to conduct training for others in your trade union with the information you received?
8. What barriers (if any) are there to passing on the training to others?
9. Has your trade union been able to utilise the training in its day-to-day work? If yes, can you give concrete examples of how this has been done?
10. What barriers (if any) are there to your trade union utilising the training in its day-to-day work?
11. What are the main challenges facing trade union in Bangladesh?
12. Has the project addressed any of these challenges? If yes, how? Please give examples.
13. Have you (or your organisation) developed an action plan for using the training in the future? If so, can you explain what is in the action plan? How do you check it is being implemented?
14. Do you have any recommendations for future projects?

Interview Guide For Enterprise level trade unions

Informed consent:

My name is Chris/Zakia. I'm an independent evaluator conducting the final evaluation of the Support for effective and inclusive trade unions in Bangladesh implemented by the ILO, BILS, and the WRC and funded by GIZ. I'm speaking to you because you are a key stakeholder in this project, and your thoughts on its implementation to date and recommendations for future activities. We've also speaking to other key stakeholders who have been part of the project's work and will use the information from interviews to produce a report with key findings, lessons learned and recommendations. We will ensure that all the information you share today is anonymized. We may use quotes for the interviews in the report but will ensure they cannot be traced back to you. If you say anything which you want removed from the notes and not shared, please let me know. Are you happy to continue with the interview?

1. Could you introduce yourself please? (including background, trade union, role in the trade union etc)
2. How did you come to be involved in the project?
3. What training have you received from the project?
4. What did you learn during the training?

5. What are you hoping the project will achieve in your trade union? What changes do you hope are made?
6. Have you been able to utilise the training in your day-to-day work? If yes, can you give concrete examples of how you have done so?
7. Where you happy with the training? How could it be improved?
8. What are the main challenges facing trade union in Bangladesh?
9. Has the project addressed any of these challenges? If yes, how? Please give examples.
10. Have you (or your organisation) developed an action plan for using the training in the future? If so, can you explain what is in the action plan? How do you check it is being implemented?
11. What barriers (if any) are there to your trade union implementing the action plan?
12. Do you have any recommendations for future projects?