

Evaluation Office





Strengthening Capacity of Somali Trade Unions to promote decent employment, peace and resilience in Somalia - Final evaluation

DC Symbol: SOM/18/02/ITA

Type of Evaluation: Project

Evaluation timing: Final

Evaluation nature: Independent

Project countries: Somalia

P&B outcome(s): 1, 1.2, 3.1, 4 and 4.2

SDG(s): 8 and 16

Date of the evaluation: November - December 2021

Date when the evaluation was completed by the evaluator: 31 December 2021

ILO Administrative Office: CO-Addis Ababa

ILO Technical Office(s): ILO -DWT Cairo and HQ Geneva

Project duration: July 2019 – December 2021

Donor and budget: Italian Agency for Development Cooperation (AICS)- US\$ 852,547

Name of consultant(s): Edwin Ochieng Okul, PhD. – Team leader & Ahmed Abdinur Abdikadir –

team member

Name of Evaluation Manager: David Dorkenoo

Evaluation Office oversight: Naomi Asukai

Key Words: Decent Work; Peace; Resilience; Social Partners; Tripartite

This evaluation has been conducted according to ILO's evaluation policies and procedures. It has not been professionally edited, but has undergone quality control by the ILO Evaluation Office.

Table of Contents

Executive Summary	4
1.Background	12
1.1 The Project Objectives	12
1.2 Project Management	13
2. The Evaluation Background	14
2.1 Purpose of the Evaluation	14
2.2 Scope of the Evaluation	14
2.3 Evaluation Clients	14
2.4 Objectives of the Evaluation	14
2.5 Evaluation Criteria and Questions	15
2.6 Dates, events and operation sequence of the evaluation	17
3.0 Methodology	18
3.1 The overall approach	18
3.2 Description and rational for stakeholder participation	20
3.3 Data Collection	23
3.4 Data Analysis	24
3.5 Data Validation Workshop	24
3.6 Data protection measures	24
3.7 Risks, limitations and potential bias	25
3.8 Norms, standards and ethical safeguards	25
4 Findings	26
4.1 Relevance and strategic fit	26
4.2 Validity of design	26
4.3 Project effectiveness	27
4.4 Efficiency of Resource Use	30
4.5 Organisational Management Arrangements	31
4.6 Orientation to impact and sustainability	32
4.7 Gender equality and non-discrimination	32

5 Conclusions	35
6 Lessons learned	37
7. Good practices	38
8. Recommendations	39
Annexes	41
1.Terms of Reference (ToR)	41
2.Evaluation questions matrix	58
3. Lessons learned	65
4. Good Practice	69
5. Evaluation schedule	71
6. Documents reviewed	72
7. List of people interviewed	73

Executive Summary

Project Background

The project 'Occupation and Decent Work for Peace and Resilience in Somalia' was implemented by ILO and funded by the Italian Agency for International Cooperation (AICS). It addressed challenges for social dialogue in Somalia that stem from the skills gaps in the area of social dialogue among union leaders and the weak institutional capacity, especially of unions, to undertake effective organization, recruitment and retention of workers; and difficulties in organizing marginalized and vulnerable groups of workers, including informal economy workers and underemployed workers in industries. There is also inadequate capacity of the trade unions to effectively engage policy issues such as national employment, labour law reform, constitutional review process and other labour related policies/laws. Coupled with is widespread decent work deficits and gender disparity in representation and treatment in employment. This is besides the challenge of integrating and mainstreaming women, youth and workers with disabilities in trade union movement, social dialogue mechanisms and activities.

Evaluation background

The evaluation covered the entire project duration, from May 2019 to October 2021. Within this timeline, the evaluation assessed project outcomes at all levels: including all result areas, implementing partners and project stakeholders. The evaluation in particular sought to assess the impact and relevance of the project's intervention on the capacity building of trade unions in Somalia. Its objectives included to establish the relevance of the project design and implementation strategy, assess the extent to which the project has achieved its stated objectives and expected results and identify unexpected positive and negative results of the project. It also sought to assess the level of implementation efficiency, the extent to which the project outcomes will be sustainable and analyse the project impact at institutional level as well at the level of the final beneficiaries. The evaluation's other objectives were also to identify lessons learned and potential good practices and provide recommendations to project stakeholders.

Besides specific questions, the evaluation was guided by such criteria as Relevance and strategic fit, Validity of design, Project effectiveness, Efficiency of Resource Use, Organisational Management Arrangements and Orientation to impact and sustainability.

Evaluation methodology

The evaluation employed a robust approach appropriate for the scope of the project, resources, and audience and had three key approaches: a theory-based evaluation approach, a process evaluation approach and an impact evaluation approach. The methodology was participatory, engaging different stakeholders in meaningful and appropriate ways to ensure inclusion, reflecting on and respecting stakeholder diversity. It adopted both qualitative and quantitative methods to collect and analyse data from both primary and secondary sources. The evaluation collected information from beneficiaries,

stakeholders who have project responsibilities, including representatives of the ILO Country Office, Project Management Team Members, Technical Backstopping Members, Implementing Partners and Government Lead agencies (Ministry of Labour and Social Affairs and Ministry of Woman and Human Rights Development). Triangulation (of important findings) was adopted, and the data collection methods included but was not limited to a survey, desk review and key informant interviews / structured individual interviews. Content analysis and other appropriate quantitative and qualitative data analysis procedures were used to analyse the data generated from the documents, FGDs and KIIs.

The evaluation was carried out in adherence with the relevant parts of the ILO Evaluation Framework and Strategy; ILO Policy Guidelines for Evaluation: Principles, Rationale, Planning and Managing for Evaluations and UNEG Principles. In particular, this evaluation followed the ILO policy guidelines for results-based evaluation; and the ILO EVAL Policy Guidelines Checklist 3 "Preparing the inception report"; Checklist 4 "Validating methodologies"; Checklist 5 "Preparing the evaluation report" and Checklist "6 Rating the quality of evaluation report"

Evaluation findings

Relevance and strategic fit

The project activities addressed the priority needs of the beneficiaries (trade unions, and by extension, the Somali workers). It addressed the skills gaps in the area of social dialogue among union leaders and the weak institutional capacity, especially of unions, to undertake effective organization, recruitment and retention of workers. It also sought to address the difficulties in organizing marginalized and vulnerable groups of workers, including informal economy workers and underemployed workers in industries. The trade unions lacked capacity to effectively engage policy issues such as national employment, labour law reform, constitutional review process and other labour related policies/laws and the project aimed to change this. Also targeted for redress was the widespread decent work deficits and gender disparity in representation and treatment in employment.

The project was well aligned with the social pillar of the country's National Development Plan (NDP 2017-2019). It was implemented in orientation with the United Nations Sustainable Development Framework which informs a team approach on the part of all UN agencies in delivery to support the efforts of the country. It was also consistent with and promoted FESTU's engagement with ILO under ILO's Transitional Support Plan for Somalia (decent work, labour rights, social protection and freedom of association human rights, safety of employees, international conventions, decent employment creation, strengthening tripartism and social dialogue, and institutional capacity building).

Validity of design

A pre-implementation needs assessment was carried out to establish the prevailing status of the trade unions and capacity of government institutions which informed the project design. Key government ministries were identified and engaged to partner with in implementing the project, leading to the

achievement of major milestones including development of key policies such as the National Employment Policy through the project team and the Ministry of Labour.

The recruitment of workers into trade unions as a major strategy led to an increase in union membership which gave rise to an increase in FESTU's earnings from member contributions. This pool of resources also facilitated technical growth and expansion of the union in line with the project's exit strategy of empowering FESTU and its affiliate unions to achieve sustainability after completion of the project.

By leveraging the worker reach of trade unions, the government acquired useful statistical research on Living Standard Index of the population that informed government projects aimed at social protection and economic empowerment.

Project progress and effectiveness

Achievement of Outcomes.

1. Trade Unions are capable to undertake advocacy and training support to workers and contribute to development policies.

The project supported FESTU to establish regional secretariat offices in Garowe, Baidoa, Galkayo, Beledweyne, and Dhusamareb. The offices were equipped with state of the art furniture and office equipment to enable them host trade union meetings and trainings. The secretariats served as regional hubs for coordinating and processing labour market issues across the country, while promoting tripartite social dialogue. Presence of these secretariats at the regional level improved the operational effectiveness of the trade unions and enhanced the ability of FESTU to work with local trade unions. The National Trade Union Secretariat conducted recruitment of new members into the labour unions increasing trade union membership from 48,000 to 162,300 members across the 12 affiliated unions of FESTU, representing a 238% increase. Training sessions organized for trade union members attracted new members. By joining the trade unions, workers were able to benefit from the collective push for decent working conditions.

The policy advocacy conducted through engagement with FESTU included the Sexual Offences Bill, Occupational Health and Safety Policy, and lobbying for the Information Bill through the Journalist Union. FESTU spearheaded the process that led to development and adoption of the Employment policy. Similarly, Trade Union members from FESTU attended the Glasgow Forum on Climate Change which helped them provide input for the government to draft a National Environment Policy and climate law. FESTU also conducted three workshops on environmental and climate change in collaboration with the government under the CORE 26 forum. FESTU also collaborated with the Puntland government in drafting the TVET Policy, Pension Policy, and amending some articles in the Puntland constitution policy. This contributed to the ratification of six outstanding ILO conventions which played a key role in worker protection. FESTU also successfully lobbied the federal government of Somalia to support the public

sector workers by allowing them to work from home without deduction or withdrawal of their salaries and allowances during the early months of COVID-19 outbreak.

2. Trade Union members of FESTU have developed plans for promoting rights at workplaces

In collaboration with FESTU, the Ministry of Labour and Social Affairs and the Somali Chamber of Commerce and Industry, the project conducted 6 tripartite trainings in which more than 840 members benefitted. The trainings raised awareness on decent work, skills development for future of work, Occupational Health and Safety Management.

Through support from the National Trade Union Secretariat, the 12 affiliated trade unions and their regional structures gained knowledge and expertise on key labour issues such as freedom of association, collective bargaining, union organizing, social protection, workers' education on ILS as well as defence of human and labour rights. These helped to "establish a gender sensitive tripartite social dialogue mechanism to address key labour market issues to create gender sensitive Union movement." The tripartite arrangement included representative from the working women and men, with FESTU commitment to supporting ILO led or implemented initiatives. Other organizations, for instance SIMAD University, which was part of the SIYB and WE Check phases of the project using the trainings as the dominant form of transformation of the organization. After undergoing the WE Check process, the university opened a Women Enterprises Development department and also introduced Aisha Scholarship at the university to attract and retain more female students.

Trade unions are now playing an important role in protecting the rights of workers, thereby contributing to sustainable growth and development. At enterprise level, the trade unions have been able to secure improved working conditions for the employees/workers.

3. Tripartite Policy Dialogues organized on different dimensions of Decent Work - where Trade Unions participate actively in terms of providing evidence and workers' aspirations

Active participation of Trade Unions in Tripartite Policy Dialogues were organized to discuss the different dimensions of decent work resulted in drafting of a revised Labour Code in line with International Labour Standards and renewal of collective bargaining agreements between FESTU unions and employers. Workers gained knowledge and skills which led to improvement in their terms of work, increased wages and improved working conditions.

4. A Committee of Women Trade Unions established to regularly review situation of women in the labour market and in trade union movement and make efforts for addressing their challenges

The project oversaw establishment of a Committee of Women Trade Union which collaborated with the National Women Committee in advocating for policies and addressing the critical gender gaps and parities in the sector. The union successfully pushed for enactment of the Sexual Offences Bill that protects women against abuse at the workplace. The committee ensured that 30% of all activities

organized by the unions were allocated to women, helping them to contribute meaningfully towards policy implementation. In Garowe, members participated in amending the Social Policy to protect vulnerable groups. During the project's cycle, the number of women in leadership positions increased from 10% to 30%, represented by one woman in leadership position of each committee. The project activities ensured that at least 30% of participants in each training or meeting were women and in line with the principle of equal participation, women were encouraged to share ideas during workers' seminars and give suggestions aimed at improving worker welfare. Their views were incorporated into the meeting outcome documents and reports, reflecting FESTU's Gender Policy.

Efficiency of resource use

Resources were utilized efficiently with consideration for value for money with activities planned in advance and budgets utilized according to approved plans and within budget ceilings. The project implementers were for instance required to account for previous expenditure by submitting the accounting documents before subsequent disbursements were made. There was a resource monitoring team comprised of the leadership of ICFTU Africa, International Confederation of Free Trade Unions, and the CGIL from Italy.

There were however reports of bureaucratic bottlenecks, with the ILO. For instance, after the finance and administrative assistant moved on from the project in 2020, it took about six months to recruit their replacements. The Finance unit was also reported to cause delays in disbursement of funds. This necessitated a request for a no-cost extension by the implementing partners. Furthermore, the COVID-19 pandemic led to an increase in operational expenses resulting in the need to pay rent for project premises which was not envisioned at the start of the project. The pandemic also curtailed the ability of the project coordinator to visit FESTU's office to review the financial documents as required. A steering committee reviewed deviations and adopted new strategies including enlisting support from donor partners to help sustain the project.

Organization management arrangements

Preceding the start of the project, the steering committee formulated a Terms of Reference for the tripartite arrangement, bringing together all the key actors including donor partner organization, the ILO and their counterparts, and trade union organization in Italy. ILO's role in the project was execution and facilitation of activities, with FESTU implementing the project in consultation with ICFTU Africa and CGIL Italy. From the beginning, the project had clear roles for ILO and project partners. FESTU, through a focal person in Mogadishu monitored day to day operations, reviewed reports and conducted direct site visits. The Italian Agency for International Cooperation also had a representative monitoring implementation. Nonetheless, the COVID-19 outbreak necessitated a change in agreement with FESTU taking over management of most project activities from ILO. The ILO's failure to provide administrative and finance support staff to oversee adherence to the standard of ILO financial rules posed a challenge to implementers who had to spend much time reviewing ILO standards throughout project implementation in order to ensure compliance. Numerous non-state actors played a part in the project implementation with adequate interaction with the government. The project enlisted government participation through the Ministry of Labour in seminars, and during the opening and closing ceremonies of the project. UN

agencies such as UNIDO, UNICEF, IOM and UN Women also came on board to offer support. The UNEP even proposed to have the FESTU lead a proposed project which they later awarded to the government due to the enormity of the project scale, demonstrating the level of trust and networking that the project had generated with various partners.

Orientation to impact and sustainability

The increased enrolment of workers in trade unions has enabled workers to benefit from the collective push for decent working conditions in the country. The tripartite/bipartite agreements and social dialogues further emboldened workers and created awareness of their rights. Through training, workers acquired collective bargaining skills that improved their working terms and conditions which together with better policies ensured work security and stability in earnings. Moving forward there is nonetheless need for trade unions to be properly managed and for them to use technology for registering members to ensure longevity in their data base.

The project also equipped Secretariat offices in different regions of the country with state-of-the art furniture and modern equipment that will be used for a long time without being worn out. Even so, the systems set-up (regional secretariats, social dialogue platforms and government-chamber of commerce-trade union dialogue platforms) are all still nascent and will necessitate extra support to be able to growth and remain sustainable in the future. The upgrade of trade union facilities increased union membership which could serve as a long-term resource generating facility through which organization activities are carried out.

The workplace educators trained by FESTU on active learning and participation techniques enabled them conduct active trade union trainings. Additionally, the educators were trained on organizational techniques and resource mobilization, enabling them to be independent in carrying out their activities without reliance on donors. The project further impressed on educators to form training departments and create a training center which will ensure continuity in capacity building of union workers.

Nonetheless, future projects should leverage on other ILO programs under the Transitional Support Plan for Somalia to continue nurturing the enabling environment for inclusiveness and job rich growth.

Conclusions

The "Occupation and Decent Work for Peace and Resilience in Somalia" project was generally successful and the objectives were largely met. Most of the beneficiaries embraced the increased role in policy dialogues and constitutional reform process as the actions emboldened workers' activism.

There were key achievements in the thematic areas including membership growth, strengthened institutional capacity, amplified workers' voice, advocacy for decent work agenda in Somalia and in the international community, more understanding of International Labour Standard (ILS), enhanced respect for labour rights, Capacity building for Trade Union workers and Gender and inclusiveness. Overall, the project participants gained confidence in occupation and decent work concepts and participation skills.

Lessons learned

- 1) The local ownership of project during implementation is important. Project activities to be carried out by the ILO were handed over to FESTU due to logistical complications and restrictions arising from the outbreak of COVID-19. Due to knowledge of the local dynamics, FESTU was able to effectively implement project activities on behalf of ILO.
- 2) Without government support, implementation of projects is not easy in Somalia. The project had the total support of the government as evidenced by their participation in and support for the various strategic project interventions and policies.
- 3) The engagement and links with other agencies are critical to increase outreach and impact on occupation and decent work empowerment of workers in Somalia. The project demonstrated the importance of leveraging partnerships with non-state actors in implementing activities. Good cooperation between FESTU and non-state agencies in Somalia elicited support from UNIDO, UNICEF, and IOM which enhanced outreach and impact of the project.

Good Practices

- 1) Existence and strong presence of the union (FESTU) in Baidoa empowered teachers to propose improvements in the education sector that led to a review of the curriculum by the Ministry of Education. This shows that direct work of the union in the field can produce tangible results.
- 2) Training and policy advocacy by unions on gender-based violence empowered women to call out injustices and created awareness on victim rights. This was particularly important in Somalia where cultural inferiority and discrimination is the reality for women.

Recommendations

1. Although this project contributed a lot towards levelling the playing field for Trade Unions in Somalia, the project's scope was modest compared to the monumental national challenge facing Somali workers-employers' relationship. Given the complexity of the Somalia context, many hurdles still abound. These include political interference, harassment from both state and non-state actors, workers' apathy and non-involvement of all employers in enterprise-level participation. These issues require a longer duration of project cycle, beyond the two years that was the timeline of this project.

Responsible	Priority	Time Implication	Resource implication
ILO/Employers/State actors (MOSLA & MOL)	High	April 2022 – December 2022	Low/no cost extension

2. Policy making in Somalia remains largely prescriptive and driven by powerful external influences, leaving little room for the workers and trade unions to make significant contributions. Workers that attended training and understand the labour rights concept should be supported by the government

through deliberate policies to continue spreading information to co-workers at the workplace and during interactions at trade union meetings in order to increase awareness.

Responsible	Priority	Time Implication	Resource implication
ILO/Employers/MOSLA	High	April 2022 – December 2022	Low/no cost
& MOL			extension

3. For this project, the implementing partners did not receive adequate training of financial management. This led to delays in preparation of financial reports and disbursement of subsequent tranches of funds. The ILO should train personnel from the implementing partners on management of a large pool of project funds. Similarly, the ILO should train partners on ILO financial policies and procurement compliance and possibly assign an ILO technical observer to monitor adherence to financial guidelines.

Responsible	Priority	Time Implication	Resource implication
ILO/FESTU/MOSLA	High	April 2022 – December	Low/no cost extension
& MOL		2022	

4. The union's capacity in six core domains i.e. governance, leadership & program development, monitoring & evaluation, human resources, financial management, procurement and supply chain should be improved through further capacity building. Established structures such as the regional secretariats, social dialogue platforms and government-chamber of commerce-trade union dialogue platforms should be monitored by FESTU and relevant state agencies to ensure improved growth and sustainability.

Responsible	Priority	Time Implication	Resource implication
ILO/FESTU/MOSLA	High	April 2022 – December 2022	Low/no cost
& MOL			extension

5. Government and private sector should facilitate labour union workers to occupy executive positions in federal and state level governance structures and take part in implementing rectified conventions and amplify the union's voice and objectives in governance. This includes lobbying the Somali government to rectify more conventions and empower justice service providers in the Supreme Court and district courts to provide workers with effective legal representation.

Responsible	Priority	Time Implication	Resource implication
ILO/Private	Moderate	April 2022 – December 2022	Low/no cost
sector/MOSLA &			extension
MOL			

1.Background

The ILO implemented the project titled 'Occupation and Decent Work for Peace and Resilience in Somalia' funded by the Italian Agency for International Cooperation (AICS) with a budget of US\$ 852,546.59

. The project took place against the backdrop of a war ravage trade union movement, a weak social dialogue and an ineffective labour administration and governance systems in Somalia. The country has a weak history of independent tripartite structures. The industrial relations framework is also underdeveloped to support a robust social dialogue system. The weak social dialogue mechanisms undermine the role of employers' and workers' organizations in the country's socio-economic and political processes.

The project was funded by the Italian Agency for International Cooperation (AICS). Once the steering committee agreed on the project activities, outputs, and work plan, they submitted the budget after which monies were dispersed in tranches of 30%. A team comprising the leadership of International Trade Union Confederation, Africa Regional Organisation (ITUC-Africa) and the CGIL from Italy monitored the disbursement and use of funding for project activities.

In this regard, the project has informed achieved several milestones. There was 206% increase in union membership recruitment across 12 affiliated unions as a result of the project's mobilization efforts. Additionally, the project led to establishment and development of a union website (FESTU'S) facilitating dissemination of vital information concerning union activities and the progress of the project. The project contributed towards building the capacity of the national partner (FESTU) through establishment of 5 functional offices and a centre for conducting training to leaders and members of FESTU. The project further supported the development of key national policies and laws for Somalia. It also established a women trade union committee that addresses critical gender gaps and parities in the sector.

1.1 The Project Objectives

The main challenges for social dialogue in Somalia stem from the skills gaps in the area of social dialogue among union leaders and the weak institutional capacity, especially of unions, to undertake effective organization, recruitment and retention of workers; and difficulties in organizing marginalized and vulnerable groups of workers, including informal economy workers and underemployed workers in industries. There is also inadequate capacity of the trade unions to effectively engage policy issues such as national employment, labour law reform, constitutional review process and other labour related policies/laws. Coupled with is widespread decent work deficits and gender disparity in representation and treatment in employment. This is besides the challenge of integrating and mainstreaming women, youth and workers with disabilities in trade union movement, social dialogue mechanisms and activities.

Against this background the Project worked on three streams namely:

- (i) Establishing institutional capacity of trade unions;
- (ii) Capacity development of trade unions; and

(iii) Establishing a gender sensitive tripartite Social Dialogue mechanism to address key labour market issues with a focus to create gender-responsive trade union movement.

For institutional capacity development, Turkish National Trade Union Centre have supported the Federation of Somali Trade Unions (FESTU) by equipping its secretariat with state-of-the-art furniture and office equipment.

However, there is still a need for FESTU to rehabilitate and/or establish new Regional Secretariats/offices to facilitate its operations and those of its affiliated trade unions in all the Federal Member States. The Project would not get into brick-and-mortar but assessed the situation in each Federal Member State and identified soft-areas to support FESTU and its affiliates to enhance their presence on the ground by supporting them to establish functional Regional Secretariats. Similarly, the Project supported establishing a 'Training Unit' within FESTU's national centre which is being used for organizing training and educational activities and other capacity development activities for trade unions and other interested tripartite stakeholders. Lastly, the Project supported provision of 1-2 Technical Personnel, to be permanently based in FESTU – at least for one year – to help FESTU respond to the technical inputs by Government and other stakeholders.

1.2 Project Management

For implementing the project, ILO has engaged one National Project Coordinator based in its Mogadishu Office. In the first quarter of the project around 30% project activities were retained for the direct implementation of ILO however, the implementation responsibility of the all-project activities was transferred to FESTU due to its improved capacity and logistical/transport difficulties created by the COVID19, which limited ILO staff movements. FESTU was also supported by provision of a full-time Project Coordinator by ILO. The coordinator was based in Mogadishu and coordinated implementation of all project activities.

2. The Evaluation Background

2.1 Purpose of the Evaluation

The main purpose of this independent endline evaluation is to provide an independent assessment of the project achievement in terms of accountability, learning, planning, and building knowledge.

2.2 Scope of the Evaluation

The evaluation covered the entire project duration, from May 2019 to October 2021 (until the moment of the data collection phase)). Within this timeline, the evaluation assessed project outcomes at all levels: including all result areas, implementing partners and project stakeholders. The evaluation in particular sought to assess the impact and relevance of the project's intervention on the capacity building of trade unions in Somalia. The evaluation also assessed the project management and activity implementation with a view to addressing the results achieved, the partnership FESTU established, as well as issues of capacity development for FESTU. The evaluation also helps in identifying and establishing good practice for future engagement.

The evaluation integrates gender equality and non-discrimination as a crosscutting concern throughout its deliverables and process, with special attention to women workers. This is addressed in line with EVAL guidance note n° 4 and Guidance Note n° 7 to ensure stakeholder participation. Furthermore, it paid attention to issues related to social dialogue and international labour standards and fair transition to environment. Moreover, the impact of the COVID-19 in the completion of the project was taken into account.

2.3 Evaluation Clients

The primary clients of the evaluation are the, the government, social partners including FETSU, The donor, ILO as well as other relevant stakeholders. The Office and stakeholders involved in the execution of the project would use, as appropriate, the evaluation findings and lessons learnt.

2.4 Objectives of the Evaluation

- a) Establish the relevance of the project design and implementation strategy in relation to the ILO, UN and national development frameworks (i.e. SDGs and UNSDCF) and beneficiaries' needs;
- b) Assess the extent to which the project has achieved its stated objectives and expected results, while identifying the supporting factors and constraints that have led to them, including strategies and implementation modalities chosen, partnership arrangements;
- c) Identify unexpected positive and negative results of the project
- d) Assess the level of implementation efficiency of the project.
- e) Assess the extent to which the project outcomes will be sustainable;

- f) Analyse the project impact at institutional level as well at the level of the final beneficiaries (the long-term effects produced by the project directly, indirectly, intended, unintended, positive and negative).
- g) Identify lessons learned and potential good practices, especially regarding models of interventions that can be applied further;
- h) Provide recommendations to project stakeholders to promote sustainability and support further development of the project outcomes

2.5 Evaluation Criteria and Questions

In line with the results-based approach applied by the ILO, the evaluation focussed on identifying and analysing results through addressing key questions related to the evaluation criteria and the achievement of the outcomes/ objectives of the project using the indicators in the logical framework of the project. The evaluator examined the following key issues; Relevance and strategic fit, Validity of design, Project effectiveness, Efficiency of Resource Use, Organisational Management Arrangements and Orientation to impact and sustainability.

The evaluation also integrates gender equality and non-discrimination as a crosscutting concern throughout its deliverables and process, with special attention to women workers. It is addressed in line with EVAL guidance note n° 4 and Guidance Note n° 7 to ensure stakeholder participation. Furthermore, it paid attention to issues related to social dialogue and international labour standards and fair transition to environment.

Relevance and strategic fit

- Is the project relevant to the achievements of Somalia DWCP as well as other relevant sub-regional, regional and global commitments such as the UN Cooperation Framework, SDGs targets and Abidjan Declaration and ILOs strategic Objectives (Programme & Budget 2018-19 and 2020-21)?
- To what extent was the project relevant to ILO DWCP of Somalia and United Nations Sustainable Development Cooperation Framework for Somalia?
- Was the project relevant to achieve the targets set in the Decent Work Agenda for Africa (DWAA)?
- To what extent does the project complement and fit with other on-going Italian Government initiatives and other ILO and UN projects in the country?
- Have the ILO constituencies (government, employers' and workers' organizations) involved in the planning of the project?
- Within the context of ILO goal of gender equality, disability inclusion and other non-discrimination issues as well as national level policies in this regard, to what extent did the project design take into account:
 - i. Specific gender equality and non-discrimination concerns relevant to the project context;
 - ii. Concerns relating to inclusion of people with disabilities?

Validity of design

- Does the project have a clear theory of change that outlines the causality?
- Has the design clearly defined achievable outcomes and outputs?
- Has the project planning included a useful monitoring and evaluation framework including outcomes indicators with baselines and targets?
- Did the project design include an exit strategy and a strategy for sustainability?
- Was the implementation approach valid and realistic? Has the project adequately taken into account the risks of blockage?
- Has the project addressed gender and disability inclusion related issues in the project document?

Project effectiveness

To what extent have the expected outputs and outcomes been achieved or are likely to be achieved in relation to its results framework or operational objectives? In which area does the project have the greatest achievements so far? Why and what have been the supporting factors?

- To what extent can the identified results be attributed to the outputs developed by the Project intervention? Are there any unintended results of the project?
- To what extend is the COVID-19 Pandemic influencing project results and effectiveness and how the project has addressed this influence and is ready to adapt to changes for at least some time from nowon?
- Has the quantity and quality of these outputs been satisfactory?
- How do the stakeholders perceive them?
- Do the benefits accrue equitably to women and men?
- Do observed innovations, if any, have potential for replication?
- Within its overall objectives and strategies, what specific measures were taken by the project to address issues relating to:
 - i. Gender equality and non-discrimination?
 - ii. Inclusion of people with disabilities?

Efficiency of Resource Use

- How efficiently have resources (human resources, time, expertise, funds etc.) been allocated and used to provide the necessary support and to achieve the broader project objectives?
- To what extent have the disbursements and project expenditures in line with expected budgetary plans? Why?
- Was the intervention economically worthwhile, given possible alternative uses of the available resources? Should the resources allocated to the intervention have been used for another, more worthwhile, purpose?
- To what extent did the project leverage partnerships (with constituents, national institutions and other UN/ Development agencies) that enhanced project relevance and contributed to priority SDG targets and indicators?

- To what extent did the project budget factor-in the cost of specific activities, outputs and outcomes to address:
 - i. Gender equality and non-discrimination?
 - ii. Inclusion of people with disabilities?

Organisational Management Arrangements

- Was the management and governance arrangement of the project adequate? Was there a clear understanding of roles and responsibilities by all parties involved?
- How effectively did the project management monitor project performance and results? Was a monitoring & evaluation system in place and how effective was it? Was relevant information systematically collected and collated? Was the data disaggregated by sex (and by other relevant characteristics if relevant)?
- Did the project receive adequate administrative, technical and if needed political support from the implementing organizations and national partners?
- Were all relevant stakeholders involved in an appropriate and sufficient manner?
- Does ILO administrative and financial rules and regulations facilitate effective implementation of project activities?

Orientation to impact and sustainability

- To what extent there is evidence of positive changes in the life of the ultimate project beneficiaries?
- What other concrete steps have been or should have been taken to ensure sustainability?
- Identify and discuss gaps in the sustainability strategy and how the stakeholders, including other ILO projects support, could address these, taking into consideration potential changes in the country due to the COVID 19 pandemic
- What were the intervention's long-term effects in terms of reducing/exacerbating;
 - i. Gender inequalities and gender based discrimination?
 - ii. Inequalities and exclusion faced by people with disabilities?

2.6 Dates, events and operation sequence of the evaluation

The consultants commenced the evaluation upon entering into a contract with ILO and preparation of budgets and logistics on 3rd November, 2021. This was followed by a virtual briefing with evaluation manager. Desk review of project and related documents then commenced culminating in the production of an Inception report, including evaluation matrix and Evaluation instruments designed based on the desk review by 12th November.

Consultations with Project staff/management in Somalia which included consultations with ILO and FESTU, with stakeholders and beneficiaries of the project were carried out between 15th November and 31st December, 2021.

A debriefing and virtual presentation of preliminary findings was held in January and a Draft evaluation report submitted to the Evaluation Manger for quality & completeness review by 15th January, 2022. The draft was circulated to key stakeholders up to 31st January. The consultant then consolidated comments of stakeholders and sent to evaluation team leader before finalizing the report by 18th February, 2022.

3.0 Methodology

3.1 The overall approach

The evaluator employed a robust evaluation approach appropriate for the scope of the project, resources, and audience. Evidence was gathered from both primary (interviews, focus groups discussion, observation, etc.) and secondary (project documents, records, and baseline and midterm data, MIS etc.) sources using qualitative and quantitative data.

Due to the onset of the COVID-19 pandemic and its impact on the world of work, this evaluation was conducted in the context of criteria and approaches outlined in the ILO internal guide: Implications of COVID-19 on evaluations in the ILO: An internal Guide on adapting to the situation (version March 25, 2020).

The evaluation was conducted by an international experienced consultant virtually (home-based) and a national consultant with logistic support of the ILO country office (project team and others). The evaluation was carried out in adherence with the relevant parts of the ILO Evaluation Framework and Strategy; ILO Policy Guidelines for Evaluation: Principles, Rationale, Planning and Managing for Evaluations and UNEG Principles.

The evaluator also assessed the overall effects of the intervention — intended and unintended, long-term and short-term, positive and negative; together with the project's targets and its strengths and weaknesses in the application of right-based approach, participation and inclusion. It assessed the project against the evaluation criteria of Relevance and strategic fit, Validity of design, Project effectiveness, Efficiency of Resource Use, Organisational Management Arrangements and Orientation to impact and sustainability.

The evaluation had three key approaches: a theory-based evaluation approach, a process evaluation approach and an impact evaluation approach.

Theory-based evaluation: This entailed elaborating and testing the project theory of change through a structured contribution analysis to assess the contribution the intervention is making to change. Working within the project logic, the focus was on the problem addressed, activities carried out to date, and with attention to the targets, so as to exploit their contribution to longer term desired outcomes and sustainable change. The contribution analysis allowed an assessment of other non-project explanations for change, to investigate the extent to which non-project activities may have contributed to observed change.

Process evaluation: Supplementing the theory-based evaluation, the consultant conducted a process evaluation to assess the project delivery. This included;

a) <u>Content evaluation</u> to assess what it is the project delivered, compared to what it meant to deliver as set out in the original planning documentation;

- b) <u>Implementation evaluation</u> to assess the extent to which the project delivered activities as originally intended, [whether the project delivered the quantity and quality of activities initially planned; whether the activities and services have been used for the optimal effect; whether the project implementation remained on track or went off-track during the implementation period and whether management arrangements facilitated the delivery process to the extent possible], and
- c) Other implementation topographies to assess the key drivers and barriers to delivery (including the management arrangements) that have positive and negative effects (intended and unintended) on the performance of the programme.

Impact evaluation: This helped establish changes in outcome that may be a direct contribution of the project. Any baseline data collected (situation) prior to program implementation that is available was compared to the end of project data (situation). Unlike general evaluations, which can answer many types of questions, the impact evaluation was structured around one particular type of question: What is the impact (or causal effect) of the project on the outcomes of interest? the "so what?" question.

This basic question incorporated an important causal dimension: the impact of the project, that is, the effect on outcomes that the project has directly caused.

Broadly speaking, the evaluation addressed one type of question;

a) Cause-and-effect questions – These examined outcomes and assessed what difference the intervention made in outcomes.

To ensure the evaluation was an opportunity for learning, the relevant project staff, partners and beneficiaries were involved as much as possible in the exercise. To guarantee an active and meaningful participation of program stakeholders in the evaluation, the evaluation employed a collaborative and participatory approach using a mix of methods. The methodology was thus participatory, engaging different stakeholders in meaningful and appropriate ways to ensure inclusion, reflecting on and respecting stakeholder diversity (especially gender, age, role, position, disability) as a minimum. The consultant worked with ILO teams to gather, documents, and analyze the data collected to date, including internal reports and regular program monitoring data.

The evaluation team employed a rigorous approach suitable for the scope of the project, available resources and intended audience. For that reason, the evaluation adopted both qualitative and quantitative methods to collect and analyse data from both primary and secondary sources. Triangulation (of important findings) was adopted and the data collection methods included but was not limited to a survey, desk review and key informant interviews / structured individual interviews. Content analysis and other appropriate quantitative and qualitative data analysis procedures were used to analyse the data generated from documents, FGDs and KIIs.

The evaluation was undertaken in three basic steps: conceptualization, collection of data, data analysis and reporting. It is mainly during the first phase that the individual aspects of implementation were decided. The collection phase was crucial for gathering reliable information. The analysis and dissemination was important in converting the evaluation into a knowledge and information asset for ILO.

Phase 1: Concept and instrument development; preparation of data collection tools. Literature/document reviews were undertaken after an induction meeting with the Evaluation Manager to ensure understanding of the background and intricacies in the project area. The key objectives and the target population were agreed during the inception meeting, and the sample of those to be reached selected and the tools prepared. The respondent stakeholders were then mobilized by the project team in readiness for data collection.

Phase 2: Data collection. In this phase, the consultant readied the instruments for the evaluation implementation (necessary tools), to ensure high participation. Interviews and discussions were conducted with selected respondents/participants. The evaluation data collection thus involved a desk review and consultations with beneficiaries, ILO staff and other key stakeholders.

Phase 3: Data analysis and dissemination. Appropriate technical approaches were relied on for proper data coding, analysis and interpretation. There was first a draft report for review and input by the Evaluation manger, ILO project team and stakeholders. A dissemination workshop was held bringing together various project stakeholders. There then followed the production of a final evaluation report, summarizing the evaluation implementation, analysis, findings and proposed recommendations.

Recommendations, emerging from the evaluation, are strongly linked to the findings of the evaluation and provide clear guidance to all stakeholders on how they can address them, indicating in each one to whom is directed, priority, resources required and timeframe (long, medium or short).

The evaluation was carried out in adherence with the relevant parts of the ILO Evaluation Framework and Strategy; ILO Policy Guidelines for Evaluation: Principles, Rationale, Planning and Managing for Evaluations and UNEG Principles.

In particular, this evaluation followed the ILO policy guidelines for results-based evaluation; and the ILO EVAL Policy Guidelines Checklist 3 "Preparing the inception report"; Checklist 4 "Validating methodologies"; Checklist 5 "Preparing the evaluation report" and Checklist "6 Rating the quality of evaluation report"

3.2 Description and rational for stakeholder participation

The evaluation targeted the tripartite constituency of the Somali government, Federation of Somali Trade Unions (FESTU) and Somali Employers Federation. The three (Government, Employers and Workers), are primary stakeholders in the project. This project specifically supported targeted actions to strengthen the capacity of trade unions. The Somali workers who are members of the trade unions are thus also key

participants in this evaluation. The other key participants in the evaluation were ILO, FESTU and the Italian Cooperation that provided the implementation and oversight mechanism. Equally key was the ILO National Project Coordinator even though the majority of activities will be implemented through implementing partners. Equally important was the technical backstopping team represented by the Workers' Specialist in CO-Addis Ababa.

Unfortunately, the evaluation did not receive insights from the donor. Efforts to reach the Italian Cooperation were fruitless as all attempts made through email to secure an interview with a relevant representative were unsuccessful. For that reason, this evaluation report does not contain the views or perspectives of the donor.

The evaluation integrated a gender lens in understanding the core concepts of social dialogue, in the design of research methods, processes and tools and in the research intake. Engendering the evaluation helped unpack how power relations is manifested in narratives of woman-hood, their aspirations and resilience strategies in an unstable socio-economic and political environment as found in Somalia.

The evaluation also considered engendering factors in the design and the interview guide questions were for instance overt about different experiences of men and women. The data collection tools were thus free from gender stereotypes or bias. The evaluation also ensured representative sampling with gender and other intersecting inequalities considered. It also considered gender balanced observations to include places dominated by men and places dominated by women

4.3 Sampling

An initial mapping of the respondents was done to facilitate decision on the number to be reached and the selection procedures. The selection has ensured equal representation of the respondents as much as possible.

Sample Size

The target population comprised the beneficiaries, stakeholders who have project responsibilities, including representatives of the ILO Country Office, Project Management Team Members, Technical Backstopping Members, the Donor, Implementing Partners and Government Lead agencies (Ministry of Labour and Social Affairs and Ministry of Woman and Human Rights Development), and direct project beneficiaries.

Sampling Procedure

The sampling procedure for key informants was purposive and was done in consultation with ILO project staff working on the programme. This is a form of non-probability sampling in which only those individuals with adequate information on the programme were included in the sampling framework.

The consultant employed a judgmental sampling approach for the KIIs and FGDs. The sample size depended on the quality of information obtained and interviewing continued until points of information saturation. This technique was preferred since there was diversity among categories of respondents in terms of their attributes. In this case, the number of interviewees depended on the quality of information

21 | Page

obtained. Efforts were made to obtain rich data where diverse perspectives were captured and triangulated.

Judgmental sampling is most effective in situations where there are only a restricted number of people in a population with qualities perceived to be desirable for the evaluation. This is a form of non-probability sampling in which only those individuals with adequate information on the project, are reachable and willing to participate in the evaluation will be included in the sampling framework. Subsequently, only those that the project team suggests were reached during the evaluation. The consultant therefore picked key informants and participants for the focus group discussions purposively; only those with adequate knowledge about the project implementation, which would permit an in-depth analysis as possible, were selected.

Whereas the consultant required to select a representative sample of the target population, some of the potential respondents were not available. Consequently, instead of "sampling" people for the interviews, the consultant called almost everyone on lists of stakeholder groups until a representative sample was reached. The evaluator ensured that opinions and perceptions of women, and other vulnerable groups are equally reflected in the interviews and that gender-specific questions were included.

The sampling process took into consideration the gender equality and inclusion dimensions as much as possible. The samples, especially for the trade unions and tripartite partners, ensured no more than 75% of either gender made up the sample. Deliberate effort to include persons with disabilities in the group discussions was made. The FGDs were also mixed, made up of the three categories (tripartite) of stakeholders.

Sample Frame

		Tools			
Respondents reached	Sample	KIIs		FGDs	
		М	W	M	W
1. ILO Country Office	2	2	0		
2. Technical Backstopping Members	2	1	0		
3. Implementing Partners – FESTU	3	3	0		
4. Regional Trade Unions and other tripartite stakeholders	28	4	0	18	9
5. Government Lead agencies					
a. Ministry of Labour and Social Affairs	1	1	0		
b. Ministry of Woman and Human Rights Development.	1	1	0		
TOTAL	38	14	0	18	9

3.3 Data Collection

The current COVID-19 pandemic restricts mobility for country and field visits to international consultants. In line with these restrictions, the evaluation data collection methodology combined remote/virtual (evaluation team leader) and fieldwork data collection (national consultant). The team leader /consultant worked virtually (home-based) with support of a national research assistant for fieldwork in the project areas. While the consultant utilized various research techniques and methods (in-depth and key informant interviews/discussions, group discussion meetings and documents and literature reviews) in collecting the required data, a large part of primary data collection was done remotely, using various methods and tools e.g., virtual meetings and interviews (mainly telephone, WhatsApp video and Skype/Zoom to have a personal touch) with the project stakeholders. The availability of internet connectivity greatly determined the use of these interactive and semi-interactive voice responses.

Data collection Techniques/Methodologies and Tools

The evaluator applied a variety of evaluation techniques – desk review, meetings with stakeholders, focus group discussions, and observation during the field visits as applicable. Triangulation of sources and techniques was central to the evaluation. This required enhanced engagement and collaboration with the project team in terms of organizing the contact with stakeholders.

Document Review

Besides helping in the development of the data collection tools, relevant literature and existing project documents were examined to build into primary information from the meetings and interviews with key stakeholders. There was special emphasis on the various technical backstopping reports and relevant program documents including the intervention guides, Annual and semi-annual reports provided by the project management and Field and Technical Backstopping offices. The desk review revealed a number of initial findings that in turn pointed to additional or fine-tuned evaluation questions.

Key Informant Interviews (KIIs) and Meetings

KIIs and discussions were held by the consultants with respondents including the ILO Country Office, Project Management Team Members, Technical Backstopping Members, Implementing Partners –FESTU and Government Lead agencies (Ministry of Labour and Social Affairs and Ministry of Woman and Human Rights Development).

Focus Group Discussions (FGDs)

The consult made use of focus group discussions to dialogue with the project beneficiaries to provide the overall findings on beneficiary involvement in the project implementation as well as the potential impact of the intervention. These were the direct beneficiaries to understand their feeling about the project results and approach adopted by the project. The project team provided the list of interviewees and the discussants.

The stakeholders were asked for consent to participate in the interviews and discussions. A standard consent statement was read out to participants in seeking their consent. Where the consultants needed to record any of the interviews/discussions, permission was sought from the participants.

3.4 Data Analysis

Open-ended responses from key informant interviews and focus group discussion, literature, and program documents reviewed were recorded appropriately for further processing. Responses were coded and analyzed for themes and compared. The qualitative data was transcribed fully in line with the evaluation objectives, scope, and questions. The data obtained from KIIs and FGDs was coded by identifying and labelling (coding) items of data with similarities in themes, certainty, and according to objectives and emerging themes using Atlas-ti software. The content analysis was augmented with constant comparative analysis. Information from the desk review interviews and discussion was integrated using question by method matrices to facilitate comparisons and identify common trends and themes.

Triangulation: In this evaluation, the consultants utilized a combination of several research methods to get a wide view of the project, and thus triangulation was a significant tool. Triangulation facilitated the validation of data through cross verification from two or more sources.

3.5 Data Validation Workshop

A stakeholders' workshop was organized to discuss initial findings and complete data gaps with key stakeholders, ILO staff and representatives of the development partners. The workshop was logistically supported by the project and programmatically managed by the evaluation team. The objective of this validation workshop was to validate and refine the data and findings outlined in the evaluation report by the relevant project team and stakeholders. This exercise was critical to review the draft evaluation report and provide comments/feedback to further improve the Report.

Participants included the consultants, ILO project team, representatives of the ILO Country Office, Project Management Members, Technical Backstopping Members, Implementing Partners — FESTU and Government Lead agencies (Ministry of Labour and Social Affairs and Ministry of Woman and Human Rights Development). Due to the COVID-19 challenges, the evaluation team leader conducted it virtually. The consultants refined and completed the data gaps and findings based on the comments/feedback to further improve the Report

3.6 Data protection measures

The consultants acknowledge that in the course of undertaking work with ILO, they had access to or were entrusted with confidential information regarding ILO's affairs, products, strategies, proposals and projects information. The consultants at all times endeavoured to keep confidential information acquired in relation to personal data of ILO beneficiaries, and shall not disclose such information except with prior written consent of ILO. The consultant used best judgement to ensure any person to whom they disclose

confidential information to (including employees and agents) complied with this agreement. Upon termination of the consultancy agreement, the consultant shall return to ILO all confidential information which have been provided by or on behalf of ILO and destroy any copies of such documents.

3.7 Risks, limitations and potential bias

The Covid-19 situation remained the greatest risk to the execution of the evaluation. Due to the onset of the COVID-19 pandemic and its impact on the world of work, this evaluation was conducted in the context of criteria and approaches outlined in the ILO internal guide: Implications of COVID-19 on evaluations in the ILO: An internal Guide on adapting to the situation (version March 25, 2020). The consultant mitigated this risk by observing the WHO and Somali government advisories and conducted meetings and interviews remotely (Skype/Phone/Zoom) and as appropriate.

The basis of this evaluation was self-reports by stakeholders in the project for Key Informant Interviews and facilitated Focused Group Discussions. For that reason, the evaluators corroborated responses and the validity of responses was assessed. Self-report being retrospective tests on respondent's memories that might or might not be relied upon. Where there was limited information, this was addressed through use of multiple data collection and analysis approaches to enable an in-depth understanding of the evaluation questions. Project documents were for instance examined where information gaps existed in the stakeholders' responses.

3.8 Norms, standards and ethical safeguards

The evaluation was carried out in adherence with the relevant parts of the ILO Evaluation Framework and Strategy; ILO Policy Guidelines for Evaluation: Principles, Rationale, Planning and Managing for Evaluations and UNEG Principles.

The evaluation was conducted following UN evaluation standards and norms and the Glossary of key terms in evaluation and results-based management developed by the OECD's Development Assistance Committee (DAC).

It also integrated gender equality and non-discrimination as a crosscutting concern throughout its deliverables and process, with special attention to women workers. It was conducted in line with EVAL guidance note n° 4 and Guidance Note n° 7 to ensure stakeholder participation. Furthermore, it paid attention to issues related to social dialogue and international labour standards and fair transition to environment.

The evaluation was also carried out in accordance with good practices for ensuring ethical data collection and accountability to participant communities.

4 Findings

4.1 Relevance and strategic fit

The project activities were relevant as they addressed the priority needs for capacity building of the beneficiaries (trade unions, and by extension, the Somali workers) through trainings on labour rights, human rights, conventions and advocacy. The project was well aligned with the social pillar of the country's National Development Plan (NDP 2017-2019). This was evident in the increase in union membership aligned with the employment agenda of the Federal government of Somalia to guarantee protection of workers' rights and access to fair income based on the decent work agenda. The project's relevance is further underscored by its focus on improving the capacity of trade unions in the country, and in strengthening tripartite constituency of the federal government, Somali Chamber of Commerce and the Federation of Somali Trade Unions (FESTU), with a focus on intense educational program, advocacy, and partnership in terms of dialogue with authorities.

Further, the project recognized the Somali Chamber of Commerce and Industries for strategic collaboration with a view to contributing towards "Somali Decent Work" programme. This aligned with the United Nations Sustainable Development Framework whose outcome entails coherence across agency sectors in reinforcing links across the SDGs in order to manage trade-offs arising across the economic, social and environmental dimensions of sustainable development.

Establishment of a women' committees at the national level and decentralized in some of the federal member states for promotion of gender inclusivity increased advocacy for the rights of women at the work place. This fits with the pillar of promotion of workers' rights as stipulated in ILO's Decent Work Agenda. In addition, this project was aligned with and promoted FESTU's engagement with ILO under ILO's Transitional Support Plan through creation of employment, strengthening tripartism, social dialogue, and capacity building for institutions in line with programme and budget outcomes.

4.2 Validity of design

At the onset of this project, a pre-implementation needs assessment was carried out to establish the prevailing status of the trade unions and capacity of government institutions. This consultative process informed the project design. The design identified the Ministry of Labour and the Ministry of International and Social Affairs as the key government ministries to partner with in implementing the project. This approach was useful as it led to achievement of major milestones including development of key policies such as the National Employment Policy through the project team and the Ministry of Labour.

Further, the project identified recruitment of workers into trade unions as a major strategy. As was envisioned in the project design was increase in union membership which led to increase in FESTU's earnings from member contributions. This pool of resources facilitated infrastructural and technical growth and expansion of the union in line with the project's exit strategy of empowering FESTU and its affiliate unions to achieve sustainability after completion of the project.

Additionally, by leveraging the worker reach of trade unions, the government acquired useful statistical research on Living Standard Index of the population that informed government projects aimed at social protection and economic empowerment. These achievements indicated alignment of the project with the UN system pillars of human rights and economic development.

4.3 Project effectiveness

The project interventions achieved the planned intermediate objectives. Specific organizational goals achieved were; membership growth, strengthening institutional capacity, amplifying workers' voices, advocacy for decent work agenda in Somalia, promoting workers' understanding of International Labour Standards (ILS), and enhanced respect for labour rights.

Foremost, the National Trade Union Secretariat conducted recruitment of new members into the labour unions. As a result, trade union membership increased from 48,000 to 162,300 members across the 12 affiliated unions of FESTU, representing a 238% increase according to information in the evaluation ToR and verified by a project document similarly titled (*Project Achievements*). Training sessions organized for trade union members attracted new members. By joining the trade unions, workers were able to benefit from the collective push for decent working conditions. Teachers and Nurses Unions which were previously functioning in isolation were incorporated into the umbrella union, giving FESTU a national outlook.

By supporting FESTU to establish regional secretariat offices in Garowe, Baidoa, Galkayo, Beledweyne, and Dhusamareb, the project opened the doors for the Turkish National Trade Union Centre to equip the newly established offices with state-of-the-art furniture and office equipment to enable them host trade union meetings and trainings. The secretariats served as regional hubs for coordinating and processing labour market issues across the country, while promoting tripartite social dialogue. Presence of these secretariats at the regional level improved the operational effectiveness of the trade unions and enhanced the ability of FESTU to work with local trade unions in delivering targeted demand-driven capacity building services to workers across the Federal Republic of Somalia. The secretariats also provided a platform for Union officials to train members on key labour issues such as freedom of association, collective bargaining, union organizing, social protection, international labour standards, and defence of human and labour rights.

One of the outputs of the project was to "establish a gender sensitive tripartite social dialogue mechanism to address key labour market issues to create gender sensitive Union movement." In line with this output, the project engaged two technical experts on Labour issues to work with FESTU in providing technical inputs to the affiliated trade unions to support labour matters. A project accountant and project assistant were recruited to help in preparation of *reports*. This gave the trade unions technical backing with the secretariat providing professional guidance on all aspects of labour market, tripartism, social dialogue and policy engagement on national employment, labour law reform, constitutional review process and other labour related policies/laws.

Creation of a training unit further enhanced FESTUS's technical capacity to offer quality training courses and resources to support trade unions capacity development needs and ensure sustainable policy engagement. As a result, participation of trade union representatives in national and international dialogue platforms was enhanced. Moreover, Tripartite Seminars and Policy Dialogues on key areas of decent work for peace & resilience were organized at Federal and Regional levels. FESTU successfully conducted tripartite leadership forums, organized a national training workshop, convened a tripartite national forum and conducted 2 seminars on youth employment.

Additionally, 21 Workplace improvement Plans across eight enterprises were developed by workers and employers in enterprises. These plans created an atmosphere of dialogue while providing protection of workers at the work places. They further boosted worker morale, improved occupational health and safety, and in some instances, the dialogues led to tripartite agreements resulting to increase in workers' salaries.. By supporting social dialogue, the project has helped reduce workers and employers' distrust and misperception, especially at enterprise and federal level with direct engagement from the Somali Chamber of Commerce. The mistrust and misperception between tripartite stakeholders also reduced. The tripartite stakeholders jointly formulated important policies and worked together to rectify important conventions and achieve national interest.

Active participation of Trade Unions in 10 Tripartite Policy Dialogues organized to discuss the different dimensions of decent work resulted in drafting of a revised Labour Code in line with International Labour Standards and renewal of collective bargaining agreements between FESTU unions and employers. The deliberations facilitated payment of salaries for workers affected by COVID-19, advocacy of expanded social protection floor and ratification and reporting of ILO conventions 144, 190, 155, 97, 143 and 181. Through sustained social dialogue, trade unions are now playing an important role in protecting the rights of workers, thereby contributing to sustainable growth and development. At enterprise level, the trade unions have been able to secure improved working conditions for the employees/workers. In recent development at the Aden Ade International Airport workers demonstrated peacefully and voiced out their grievances and demanded for respect of their rights to a living wage leading to improved working condition by their employer.

Further, the project laid the foundation for establishment of the United Nations Cooperation Framework between the UN and the government. Policy advocacy conducted through engagement with FESTU included the Sexual Offences Bill, Occupational Health and Safety Policy, and lobbying for the Information Bill through the Journalist Union. FESTU spearheaded the process that led to development and adoption of the Employment policy. Similarly, Trade Union members from FESTU attended the Glasgow Forum on Climate Change which helped them provide input for the government to draft a National Environment Policy and climate law. FESTU also conducted three workshops on environmental and climate change in collaboration with the government under the CORE 26 forum.

As well as conducting policy advocacy in Somalia, FESTU also collaborated with the Puntland government in drafting the TVET Policy, Pension Policy, and amending some articles in the Puntland constitution policy. This contributed to the ratification of six outstanding ILO conventions which played a key role in worker protection.

By way of capacity building of union workers, the ILO in collaboration with FESTU, the Ministry of Labour and Social Affairs and the Somali Chamber of Commerce and Industry conducted 6 tripartite trainings in which more than 840 members benefitted. The trainings raised awareness on decent work, skills development for future of work, Occupational Health and Safety Management, ratification of ILO conventions, and emerging policy initiatives on labour market and employability in Somalia. Additional training and sensitization was carried out across 95 Radio programs and TV shows as envisaged under Output 2.2. The aired shows sensitized workers on ILO R205 convention and the role and space for trade unions in promoting peace, dialogue and development in the country. These programs widened the engagements of workers and the public on labour market issues and helped them identify gaps in laws and policies.

Key thematic areas in which workers were trained were; Fundamental rights at work, workplace safety and security, child protection, fundamental freedom of expression, collective bargaining, and international labour standards and conventions. Skills gained by workers through the trainings increased work place productivity. Moreover, there was improved safety of workers at the work place and reduction in incidences of harassment and abuse.

As a result of the project activities, workers gained knowledge and skills which led to improvement in their terms of work, increased wages and improved working conditions. Additionally, the workers created networks and cross-learning platforms that enhanced their interactions with trade unionists and workers across the country and increased their level of involvement in decision-making. This expanded their circle of employment opportunities and improved social dialogue between employers, employees, and the government, promoting tripartism. Workers cultivated amiable labor management relations at enterprise level and within their respective trade unions, helping them nurture the culture and practice of internal democracy, accountability and transparency.

Unintended results of the project

The project saw increased role in policy dialogues on key areas of decent work for peace and resilience. This amplification of the voice of workers on social justice emboldened workers' activism in decrying electoral violence and agitating for peaceful and inclusive elections, which was over and above the initially planned outcomes. FESTU carried a set of activities on promoting human rights, democracy and peace specially during the elections. These helped reduce fear of violence and manipulation of Somalia's emerging democracy.

Effects of the COVID-19 pandemic on project effectiveness

The COVID-19 pandemic led to loss of lives and livelihoods. Workers who fell sick were unable to get the required care and compensation for lost incomes. Many workers lost their jobs and consequent income as a result of downsizing and closure of businesses. This limited the ability of union members to remit money meant for facilitating local FESTU's activities.

Moreover, movement restrictions imposed by the government to curb the spread of COVID-19 hindered staff mobility within and outside the project area, curtailing execution of project activities. For example, a workshop that had been prepared enlisting participation of local and international trade organizations was cancelled due to COVID-19 travel restrictions. In light of this, meetings had to be held virtually. Some of the project activities which were initially allocated to ILO were passed over to FESTU to avoid delays in implementation. The project steering committee incorporated two additional technical staff to provide backstopping. The Covid-19 pandemic exposed the soft underbelly of workers' social protection, with most workers lacking the required social safety nets to cushion them in the event of an economic shock such as that occasioned by the pandemic.

In response to the COVID-19 impact, FESTU and affiliated unions took measures to cushion workers from the social and economic shocks. They ensured that workers followed and implemented the Covid-19 protocols meant to protect workers' health and safety and negotiated compensation for workers who lost their jobs during downsizing and business closure. FESTU also produced a report on the workplace impact of COVID-19 on vulnerable Somali workers which informed an appeal to the ILO and AICS for allocation of some of the project funds to cover the additional institutional costs arising due to Covid-19.

At policy influencing level, FESTU successfully lobbied the federal government of Somalia to support the public sector workers by allowing them to work from home without deduction or withdrawal of their salaries and allowances during the early months of COVID-19 outbreak. They further disseminated information concerning the rights of trade union workers which prevented exploitation by employers during the pandemic.

4.4 Efficiency of Resource Use

Resources were utilized efficiently with consideration for value for money. Activities were planned in advance and budgets utilized according to approved plans and within budget ceilings. Structures and regular meetings with the Implementing Partners were established at the onset of the project. Once the steering committee agreed on the project activities, outputs, and work plan, they submitted the budget after which monies were dispersed in tranches of 30%. The project implementers were required to account for previous expenditure by submitting the accounting documents in order for subsequent disbursements to be made. This two-way disbursement process often caused delays and was consequently changed from the implementing agreement to grant agreements with the project steering committee releasing large amounts of funds which hastened implementation of activities.

The resource monitoring team comprised of the leadership of ITUC-Africa, and the CGIL from Italy. ITUC-Africa personnel provided technical advisory by using technical material from the ILO to design tools for

informing the technical approach. The reporting obligation entailed the trade union worker organizations commenting on periodic reports prepared by the government, before sending them to the ILO under the ILO supervisory system. The union, through FESTU project coordinators, commented on the decent work country program and took part in the elaboration process for the Cooperation Framework under the United Nations. Through enhanced technical and financial capacity of the unions, they were able to lobby the authorities to ratify seven ILO conventions. However, there were report of bureaucratic bottlenecks, with the Finance unit reported to deliberately cause delays in disbursement of funds. This necessitated request for a no-cost extension by the implementing partners,

An unforeseen situation arose with the outbreak of COVID-19 where increase in operational expenses resulted in the requirement to pay rent for project premises which was not envisioned at the start of the project. The steering committee, which was mandated to review deviations and adopt new strategy or deviation enlisted support from donor partners to help sustain the project. The pandemic also curtailed the ability of the project coordinator to visit FESTU's office to review the financial documents.

4.5 Organisational Management Arrangements

Prior to commencement of the project, the steering committee formulated a Terms of Reference for the tripartite arrangement bringing together all the key actors including donor partner organization, the ILO and their counterparts, and trade union organization in Italy. The ILO then assessed conventions and gaps which informed formulation of roles for each party; ILO, government, and trade unions.

The ILO's role in the project was execution and facilitation of activities, with FESTU implementing the project in consultation with ITUC Africa and CGIL Italy. Project implementers were in charge of report writing and documenting usage of funds. The finance department verified the reports and released funds. ILO draft concepts were reviewed by FESTU's project coordinator, two technical experts and the ITUC-Africa. The different working groups reported to the UN residents' coordination unit under the UN project framework.

Initially, the project had clear roles for ILO and project partners. FESTUS had a focal person in Mogadishu who monitored day to day operations, reviewed reports and conducted direct site visits. The Italian Agency for International Cooperation also had a representative monitoring implementation. However, the COVID-19 outbreak necessitated a change in agreement with FESTU taking over management of most project activities from the ILO. ILO's failure to provide administrative and finance support staff to oversee adherence to the standard of ILO financial rules posed a challenge to implementers who had to spend much time reviewing ILO standards throughout project implementation in order to ensure compliance. While the early resignation may have had some impact on the project implementation, this was not significant since the implementation responsibility of the all-project activities had earlier been transferred to FESTU with the approval of the project steering Committee (PSC). The decision to transfer all the project implementation was arrived due to improved capacity of the national partner (FESTU) and logistical/transport difficulties created by the COVID19 which limited ILO staff movements. Nonetheless,

the absence of an ILO staff on the ground considerably delayed the data collection phase of the evaluation since mobilization of participants was slowed.

With regard to networking, many non-state actors played a part in the project implementation. There was adequate interaction of ILO constituents with the government and the Employers Federation. The project enlisted government participation through the Ministry of Labour in seminars, and during the opening and closing ceremonies of the project. The second phase of the project helped engineer the United Nations Cooperation Framework. Because of the project's key role in Somalia, several UN agencies such as UNIDO, UNICEF, IOM and UN Women came on board to offer support. The UNEP even proposed to have the FESTU lead a proposed project which they later awarded to the government due to the enormity of the project scale. This gesture demonstrated the level of trust and networking that the project had generated with various partners.

4.6 Orientation to impact and sustainability

FESTU trained workplace educators on active learning and participation techniques which enabled them conduct active trade union trainings. Additionally, the educators were trained on organizational techniques and resource mobilization, enabling them to be independent in carrying out their activities without reliance on donors. The project further impressed on educators to form training departments and create a training center. These developments will ensure continuity in capacity building of union workers. Further, upgrade of trade union facilities increased union membership and could serve as a long-term resource generating facility through which organization activities are carried out.

Moreover, increased enrolment of workers in trade unions enabled workers to benefit from the collective push for decent working conditions in the country. The tripartite /bipartite agreements and social dialogues further emboldened workers and created awareness of their rights. Through training, workers acquired collective bargaining skills that improved their working terms and conditions and ensured work security and stability in earnings. Moving forward there is need for trade unions to be properly managed and for them to use technology for registering members to ensure longevity in their data base.

The project also equipped Secretariat offices in different regions of the country with state-of-the art furniture and modern equipment that will be used for a long time without wear. However, the structures that were set-up (regional secretariats, social dialogue platforms and government-chamber of commerce-trade union dialogue platforms) are all still nascent and will require additional support to be able to growth and remain sustainable in the future. Future projects ought to leverage on other ILO programs under the Transitional Support Plan for Somalia to continue nurturing the enabling environment for inclusiveness and job rich growth.

4.7 Gender equality and non-discrimination

According to the federal government and state constitutions, women should account for 30% of government positions. However, the rate of employment of women in the civil service and other institutions remains quite low. The project made deliberate efforts to target more women during the

project activities, resulting in women accounting for at least 30% of participants in each training or meeting. 63% of women and youth were integrated and mainstreamed in trade union and social dialogue activities. During the project's cycle, the number of women in leadership positions increased from 10% to 30%, represented by one woman in leadership position of each committee i.e. the project committee, affiliate, and the Nurses Union. The project empowered women and young workers and they were included in the project implementation and in FESTU's decision-making bodies.

In line with the principle of equal participation, women were encouraged to share ideas during workers' seminars and give suggestions aimed at improving worker welfare. Their views were incorporated into the meeting outcome documents and reports, reflecting FESTU's Gender Policy. The gender policy informed structuring of discussions and response on gender pay gap, discrimination against women workers and gender-based violence. The trade unions' Gender policy and interventions were aligned with convention 190 which the Somalia has ratified. The policy is helping to structure discussions and response on gender pay gap, discrimination against women workers and gender-based violence. The project advocated gender equality pay at the work places with female workers receiving equal pay as male workers for equal work done. Domestication of this convention and its translation to law will increase awareness on gender issues on a national scale.

Further, the project oversaw establishment of a Committee of Women Trade Union which collaborated with the National Women Committee in advocating for policies and addressing the critical gender gaps and parities in the sector. The union successfully pushed for enactment of the Sexual Offences Bill that protects women against abuse at the workplace. The committee ensured that 30% of all activities organized by the unions were allocated to women helping them to contribute meaningfully towards policy implementation. In Garowe, members participated in amending the Social Policy to protect vulnerable groups.

In order to promote the rights of women at the workplace, FESTU and its affiliate members arranged for the establishment of separate dressing rooms for female workers as opposed to the existing same rooms for both genders. Moreover, they laid plans for according priority to women and other vulnerable groups during the hiring process. They further lobbied for specialised services for female workers and promotion of a violence-free work place environment.

At member states level, Puntland which is one of the progressive states put in place a law to abolish FGM. Moreover, the project fought against workplace sexual and physical harassment of women. Also of importance was the ratification of convention 190 on workplace violence and harassment, making Somalia the only country to have ratified this convention in the East African region. However, other harmful practices such as early marriage of girls and Convention 182 on child labor had not been ratified. It remains to be seen whether domestication of the convention will address these social vices.

With regard to disability inclusion, 4% of the participants in project activities were people with disabilities. In line with FESTU's disability policy, deliberate efforts were made to accommodate persons with disabilities and mainstream disability sensitive trade union approaches into FESTU project activities. On an industrial scale, there is still need for a legal framework and enforcement of laws that cater for needs of people with disabilities at the workplace.

5 Conclusions

Relevance and strategic fit

Besides addressing the priority needs of the beneficiaries (trade unions, and by extension, the Somali workers), the project is generally relevant to the achievements of Somalia DWCP as well as other relevant sub-regional, regional and global commitments such as the UN Cooperation Framework, SDGs targets and Abidjan Declaration and ILOs strategic Objectives (Programme & Budget 2018-19 and 2020-21). The project was well aligned with the social pillar of the country's National Development Plan (NDP 2017-2019). The evaluation has further established that the ILO constituencies (government, employers' and workers' organizations) were meaningfully involved in the planning of the project. As well, the project is relevant to ILO DWCP of Somalia and United Nations Sustainable Development Cooperation Framework for Somalia and to achieve the targets set in the Decent Work Agenda for Africa (DWAA). This is besides complementing other ILO and UN projects in the country.

Within the context of ILO goal of gender equality, disability inclusion and other non-discrimination issues as well as national level policies in this regard, the project design took into account specific gender equality and non-discrimination concerns relevant to the project context as well as concerns relating to inclusion of people with disabilities.

Validity of design

The project had a clear theory of change that outlines the causality with the design clearly defining achievable outcomes and outputs and its planning included a useful monitoring and evaluation framework including outcomes indicators with baselines and targets. Moreover, the project design included an exit strategy and a strategy for sustainability. Key government ministries were identified and engaged to partner with in implementing the project, leading to the achievement of major milestones including development of key policies such as the National Employment Policy through the project team and the Ministry of Labour. This made the implementation approach valid and realistic with the project adequately taking into account the various implementation risks. As well, the project addressed gender and disability inclusion related issues in the project document.

Project effectiveness

To a large extent, the expected outputs and outcomes been achieved in relation to its results framework and operational objectives. Specifically, the project supported FESTU to establish regional secretariat offices and the National Trade Union Secretariat conducted recruitment of new members into the labour unions increasing trade union membership. Through engagement with FESTU, the project conducted policy advocacy in collaboration with FESTU, and in collaboration with the Ministry of Labour and Social Affairs and the Somali Chamber of Commerce and Industry, conducted tripartite trainings in which more than 840 members benefitted. Through support from the National Trade Union Secretariat, the 12 affiliated trade unions and their regional structures gained knowledge and expertise on key labour issues such as freedom of association, collective bargaining, union organizing, social protection, workers' education on ILS as well as defense of human and labour rights. As well, active participation of Trade

Unions in Tripartite Policy Dialogues were organized to discuss the different dimensions of decent work resulted in drafting of a revised Labour Code in line with International Labour Standards. The project oversaw establishment of a Committee of Women Trade Union which collaborated with the National Women Committee in advocating for policies and addressing the critical gender gaps and parities in the sector. During the project's cycle, the number of women in leadership positions increased.

Efficiency of Resource Use

Project resources (human resources, time, expertise, funds etc.) were efficiently allocated and used to provide the necessary support and to achieve the broader project objectives. Although the disbursements and project expenditures were largely in line with expected budgetary plans, there were occasional delays in disbursement. For instance, after the finance and administrative assistant moved on from the project in 2020, it took about six months to recruit their replacements. Furthermore, the COVID-19 pandemic led to an increase in operational expenses resulting in the need to pay rent for project premises which was not envisioned at the start of the project. The intervention was therefore economically worthwhile, given possible alternative uses of the available resources. To a considerable extent, the project leveraged partnerships (with constituents, national institutions and other UN/ Development agencies) that enhanced project relevance and contributed to priority SDG targets and indicators.

Organisational Management Arrangements

The management and governance arrangement of the project was adequate with clear understanding of roles and responsibilities by all parties involved. ILO's role in the project was execution and facilitation of activities, with FESTU implementing the project in consultation with ICFTU Africa and CGIL Italy. The project management effectively monitor project performance and results although the monitoring & evaluation system in place was not the most effective. The project received adequate administrative, technical and - if needed - political support from the ILO and national partners with all relevant stakeholders being involved in an appropriate and sufficient manner. Some aspects of ILO administrative and financial rules and regulations nonetheless did not facilitate effective implementation of project activities as there were reported delays.

Orientation to impact and sustainability

There is evidence of positive changes in the life of the ultimate project beneficiaries as seen in the way tripartite/bipartite agreements and social dialogues emboldened workers and created awareness of their rights. The project took concrete steps to ensure sustainability with potential long-term effects in terms of reducing/exacerbating gender inequalities and gender based discrimination and inequalities and exclusion faced by people with disabilities.

6 Lessons learned

The following were the major lessons learned from the project:

- The importance of local ownership of project during implementation. Project activities that were
 to be carried out by the ILO were handed over to FESTU due to logistical complications and
 restrictions arising from the outbreak of COVID-19. In spite of the activity overload, the
 implementing partners applied themselves fully and ensured that the project's objectives were
 attained.
- 2. The engagement and links with other agencies to increase outreach and impact on occupation and decent work empowerment of workers in Somalia. The project has therefore developed a resource base on educators who can be utilized post the project.
- 3. The importance of labour unions in promoting worker welfare and defending their collective interests. Workers belonging to the trade unions benefitted from FESTU's lobbying of the federal government of Somalia to support the public sector workers by allowing them to work from home without deduction or withdrawal of their salaries and allowances during the early months of COVID-19 outbreak.
- 4. Without government support, implementation of projects is not easy in Somalia. The project had the total support of the government as evidenced by their participation in and support for the various strategic project interventions and policies this shows local ownership and much needed encouragement for the key stakeholders taking much interest in project interventions.

7. Good practices

- 1. Empowerment of the Teachers' Union under FESTU was evident through teachers in Baidoa who undertook a review of the Somali school curriculum. They identified fundamental flaws and informed the Ministry of Education who then reviewed the entire curriculum. The Teachers' Association also advocated for provision of a contract and fixed salary for teachers in private schools which was duly implemented by the Ministry of Education of South West. This shows that direct work of the union in the field can produce tangible results.
- 2. Training and policy advocacy by unions to curb gender-based violence has empowered women to call out injustices and created awareness on victim rights. Ayan saw a post on her friend's Facebook wall showing a photo of a 3-year-old rape victim. She reached out to the individual who had posted the photo and persuaded him to remove it because millions of users might see the little girl's picture which would increase the family's agony. She then lobbied for the little girl to obtain justice by having the perpetrator arrested and charged. This was particularly important in Somalia where cultural inferiority and discrimination is the reality for women

8. Recommendations

1. Although this project contributed a lot towards levelling the playing field for Trade Unions in Somalia, the project's scope was modest compared to the monumental national challenge facing Somali workers-employers' relationship. Given the complexity of the Somalia context, many hurdles still abound. These include political interference, harassment from both state and non-state actors, workers' apathy and non-involvement of all employers in enterprise-level participation. These issues require a longer duration of project cycle, beyond the two years that was the timeline of this project.

Responsible	Priority	Time Implication	Resource implication
ILO/Employers/State actors (MOSLA &	High	April 2022 – December 2022	Low/no cost extension
MOL)			

2. Policy making in Somalia remains largely prescriptive and driven by powerful external influences, leaving little room for the workers and trade unions to make significant contributions. Workers that attended training and understand the labour rights concept should be supported by the government through deliberate policies to continue spreading information to co-workers at the work place and during interactions at trade union meetings in order to increase awareness.

Responsible	Priority	Time Implication	Resource implication
ILO/Employers/MOSLA	High	April 2022 – December 2022	Low/no cost
& MOL			extension

3. For this project, the implementing partners did not receive adequate training of financial management. This led to delays in preparation of financial reports and disbursement of subsequent tranches of funds. The ILO should train personnel from the implementing partners on management of a large pool of project funds. Similarly, the ILO should train partners on ILO financial policies and procurement compliance and possibly assign an ILO technical observer to monitor adherence to financial guidelines.

Responsible	Priority	Time Implication	Resource implication
ILO/FESTU/MOSLA	High	April 2022 – December	Low/no cost
& MOL		2022	extension

6. The union's capacity in six core domains i.e. governance, leadership & program development, monitoring & evaluation, human resources, financial management, procurement and supply chain should be improved through further capacity building. Established structures such as the regional secretariats, social dialogue platforms and government-chamber of commerce-trade union dialogue

platforms should be monitored by FESTU and relevant state agencies to ensure improved growth and sustainability.

Responsible	Priority	Time Implication	Resource implication
ILO/FESTU/MOSLA	High	April 2022 – December 2022	Low/no cost
& MOL			extension

4. Government and private sector should facilitate labour union workers to occupy executive positions in federal and state level governance structures and take part in implementing rectified conventions and amplify the union's voice and objectives in governance. This includes lobbying the Somali government to rectify more conventions and empower justice service providers in the Supreme Court and district courts to provide workers with effective legal representation.

Responsible	Priority	Time Implication	Resource implication
ILO/Private	Moderate	April 2022 – December 2022	Low/no cost
sector/MOSLA &			extension
MOL			

Annexes

1.Terms of Reference (ToR)

Project Name	Occupation and Decent Work for Peace and
	Resilience in Somalia
Project Code	SOM/18/02/ITA
Geographic Coverage	Somalia
Administrative Unit in	ILO Country Office for Djibouti, Ethiopia, South
Charge of the project	Sudan, Sudan and Somalia
Implementing Partner	Federation of Somali Trade Unions (FESTU)
Project Donor	Italian Agency for Development Cooperation (AICS)
Project Duration	May 2019-July 2021
Project budget	Euro 750,241 (US\$ 852,547)
Evaluation timeframe	July-August 2021
Evaluation manager	David Dorkenoo

1. Background

The ILO is implementing the Project titled 'Occupation & Decent Work for Peace and Resilience in Somalia' funded by the **Italian Agency for International Cooperation** (AICS). The project is taking place against the backdrop of a weak social dialogue in Somalia. The country has a weak history of independent tripartite structures. The industrial relations framework is also under-developed to support a robust social dialogue. The weak social dialogue framework undermines the role of employers' and workers' organizations in the country's socio-economic and political processes.

The key social dialogue challenges in Somalia emanate from skills gaps in the area of social dialogue among union leaders and weak institutional capacity particularly of the trade unions to undertake effective membership organization, recruitment and retention; and difficulties in organizing the marginalized and vulnerable groups of workers such as the workers in the informal economy and the under-employed workers in the industries. There is also inadequate capacity of the trade unions to effectively engage policy issues such as national employment, labour law reform, constitutional review process and other labour related policies/laws. Coupled with this is also the decent work deficit of gender disparity in representation and treatment in employment. This is besides the challenge of integrating and mainstreaming women and the youth in trade union and social dialogue activities.

The Project works on three streams, i.e.,

- (iv) establishing institutional capacity of trade unions;
- (v) capacity development of training unions; and
- (vi) **initiate a tripartite Social Dialogue** on key labour market issues with a focus to <u>create gender-responsive trade union movement</u>.

For <u>Institutional Capacity Development</u>, the FESTU is already being supported by Turkish Trade Union partners for establishing a **National Trade Union Secretariat** which includes a building as well as all equipment. However, there is still a need to have Regional Secretariats/offices for Trade Unions in all Member States. The Project would not get into brick-and-mortar but assessed the situation in each State and identified soft-areas to support the Regional Trade Unions to enhance their presence on-ground by establishing their Secretariats. Similarly, the *Project supported establishing a 'Training Unit'* within FESTU's national centre to undertake a series of trainings and other capacity development activities for Regional Trade Unions and other tripartite stakeholders. Lastly, the *Project supported provision of 1-2 Technical Personnel*, to be permanently based in FESTU – at least for one year – to help FESTU respond to the technical inputs by Government and other stakeholders.

Project Achievements

The project has reported made the following achievements:

Increase in membership recruitment: FESTU progressively has achieved a remarkable progress by increasing its membership from 72,000 members in 2018 to 148,520 members (57,235 paying membership fees and 91,285 book membership) in 2019. This represents a growth of 206% across 12 affiliated unions. As of 30 April 2021, FESTU membership recruitment drive has achieved a record high of 158, 820 members in 12 unions.

Established & developed website for FESTU: FESTU has reactivated its website where press releases and other vital information on its activities and the project are regularly updated. The website is used as system/tool to record information for the national partner (FESTU).

Capacity Building: The project had contributed to the capacity of the national partner (FESTU) by establishing 5 functional offices and training centre. The training centre is used in training leaders and members of FESTU.

Polices/Laws: The project had also supported the development of the following key national policies and laws for Somalia: Occupational Health and Safety Policy; National Environmental Policy; Sexual offences Bill (SOB); Environment Law; Preparations of the UN Sustainable Development Cooperation Framework; Access to information Bill and National Development Plan. The project also established women trade union committee to address the critical gender gaps and parities in the sector.

Project Management:

For implementing the project, ILO has engaged one National Project Coordinator based in its Mogadishu Office. In the first quarter of the project around 30% project activities were retained for the direct implementation of ILO however, the implementation responsibility of the all-project activities were transferred to FESTU due to its improved capacity and logistical/transport difficulties created by the COVID19 which limited ILO staff movements. FESTU was also supported by provision of a full-time Project Coordinator to help in implementing all project activities.

2. Objectives of the Evaluation

i) **Establish the relevance** of the project design and implementation strategy in relation to the ILO, UN and national development frameworks (i.e. SDGs and UNDAF) and beneficiaries' needs;

- j) Assess the extent to which the project has achieved its stated objectives and expected results, while identifying the supporting factors and constraints that have led to them, including strategies and implementation modalities chosen, partnership arrangements;
- k) Identify unexpected positive and negative results of the project
- 1) Assess the level of implementation efficiency of the project.
- m) Assess the extent to which the project outcomes will be sustainable;
- n) Analyse the project impact at institutional level as well at the level of the final beneficiaries (the long-term effects produced by the project directly, indirectly, intended, unintended, positive and negative).
- o) Identify lessons learned and potential good practices, especially regarding models of interventions that can be applied further;
- p) Provide recommendations to project stakeholders to promote sustainability and support further development of the project outcomes

3. Scope of the Evaluation

The evaluation will cover the entire project duration, from May 2019 to July 2021. Within this period, the evaluation will assess project outcomes at all levels: including all result areas, implementing partners and project stakeholders. The evaluation will in particular seek to assess the impact and relevance of the project's intervention on the capacity building of trade unions in Somalia. The evaluation will assess the project management and activity implementation with a view to addressing the results achieved, the partnerships established, as well as issues of capacity development for FESTU. The evaluation will also help into establishing good practice for future engagement.

The evaluation will integrate gender equality and non-discrimination as a crosscutting concern throughout its deliverables and process, with special attention to women workers. It should be addressed in line with EVAL guidance note n° 4 and Guidance Note n° 7 to ensure stakeholder participation. Furthermore, it should pay attention to issues related to social dialogue and international labour standards and fair transition to environment. Moreover, the impact of the COVID19 in the completion of the project will be taken into account.

Due to the onset of the COVID-19 pandemic and its impact on the world of work, this evaluation will be conducted in the context of criteria and approaches outlined in the ILO internal guide: Implications of COVID-19 on evaluations in the ILO: An internal Guide on adapting to the situation (version March 25, 2020)

The evaluation will be conducted by an international experienced consultant virtually (home-based) with logistic support of the ILO country office (project team and others)

The evaluation should be carried out in adherence with the relevant parts of the ILO Evaluation Framework and Strategy; ILO Policy Guidelines for Evaluation: Principles, Rationale, Planning and Managing for Evaluations and UNEG Principles.

4. Evaluation Criteria and Questions

Key Evaluation Questions

In line with the results-based approach applied by the ILO, the evaluation will focus on identifying and analysing results through addressing key questions related to the evaluation criteria and the achievement of the outcomes/ objectives of the project using the indicators in the logical framework of the project. The evaluator shall examine the following key issues:

Relevance and strategic fit

- Is the project relevant to the achievements of Somalia DWCP as well as other relevant sub-regional, regional and global commitments such as the UN Cooperation Framework, SDGs targets and Abidjan Declaration and ILOs strategic Objectives (Programme & Budget 2018-19 and 2020-21)?
- To what extent was the project relevant to ILO DWCP of Somalia and United Nations Sustainable Development Cooperation Framework for Somalia?
- Was the project relevant to achieve the targets set in the Decent Work Agenda for Africa (DWAA)?
- To what extent does the project complement and fit with other on-going Italian Government initiatives and other ILO and UN projects in the country?
- Have the ILO constituencies (government, employers' and workers' organizations) involved in the planning of the project?
- Within the context of ILO goal of gender equality, disability inclusion and other non-discrimination issues as well as national level policies in this regard, to what extent did the project design take into account:
 - i. Specific gender equality and non-discrimination concerns relevant to the project context;
 - ii. Concerns relating to inclusion of people with disabilities?

Validity of design

• Does the project have a clear theory of change that outlines the causality?

- Has the design clearly defined achievable outcomes and outputs?
- Has the project planning included a useful monitoring and evaluation framework including outcomes indicators with baselines and targets?
- Did the project design include an exit strategy and a strategy for sustainability?
- Was the implementation approach valid and realistic? Has the project adequately taken into account the risks of blockage?
- Has the project addressed gender and disability inclusion related issues in the project document?

Project effectiveness

- To what extent have the expected outputs and outcomes been achieved or are likely to be achieved in relation to its results framework or operational objectives? In which area does the project have the greatest achievements so far? Why and what have been the supporting factors?
- To what extent can the identified results be attributed to the outputs developed by the Project intervention? Are there any unintended results of the project?
- To what extend is the COVID-19 Pandemic influencing project results and effectiveness and how the project has addressed this influence and is ready to adapt to changes for at least some time from now-on?
- Has the quantity and quality of these outputs been satisfactory?
- How do the stakeholders perceive them?
- Do the benefits accrue equitably to women and men?
- Do observed innovations, if any, have potential for replication?
- Within its overall objectives and strategies, what specific measures were taken by the project to address issues relating to:
 - i. Gender equality and non-discrimination?
 - ii. Inclusion of people with disabilities?

Efficiency of Resource Use

- How efficiently have resources (human resources, time, expertise, funds etc.) been allocated and used to provide the necessary support and to achieve the broader project objectives?
- To what extent have the disbursements and project expenditures in line with expected budgetary plans? Why?

- Was the intervention economically worthwhile, given possible alternative uses of the available resources? Should the resources allocated to the intervention have been used for another, more worthwhile, purpose?
- To what extent did the project leverage partnerships (with constituents, national institutions and other UN/ Development agencies) that enhanced project relevance and contributed to priority SDG targets and indicators?
- To what extent did the project budget factor-in the cost of specific activities, outputs and outcomes to address:
 - i. Gender equality and non-discrimination?
 - ii. Inclusion of people with disabilities?

Organisational Management Arrangements

- Was the management and governance arrangement of the project adequate?
 Was there a clear understanding of roles and responsibilities by all parties involved?
- How effectively did the project management monitor project performance and results? Was a monitoring & evaluation system in place and how effective was it? Was relevant information systematically collected and collated? Was the data disaggregated by sex (and by other relevant characteristics if relevant)?
- Did the project receive adequate administrative, technical and if needed political support from the implementing organizations and national partners?
- Were all relevant stakeholders involved in an appropriate and sufficient manner?
- Does ILO administrative and financial rules and regulations facilitate effective implementation of project activities?

Orientation to impact and sustainability

- To what extent there is evidence of positive changes in the life of the ultimate project beneficiaries?
- What other concrete steps have been or should have been taken to ensure sustainability?
- Identify and discuss gaps in the sustainability strategy and how the stakeholders, including other ILO projects support, could address these, taking into consideration potential changes in the country due to the COVID 19 pandemic

- What were the intervention's long-term effects in terms of reducing/exacerbating;
 - i. Gender inequalities and gender based discrimination?
 - ii. Inequalities and exclusion faced by people with disabilities?

5. Methodology

The evaluation will be carried out through a desk review, field visit and development of an evaluation report. The independent Evaluation Consultant will review inputs by all ILO staff and other stakeholders involved in the project, from project staff, constituents and a range of partners, including the donor.

Desk review

A desk review will analyse project and other documentation including the approved Project document. The Evaluation Consultant will also review various technical backstopping reports and relevant program documents including the intervention guides, Annual and semi-annual reports provided by the project management and Field and Technical Backstopping offices. The desk review will suggest a number of initial findings that in turn may point to additional or fine-tuned evaluation questions. This will guide the final evaluation instrument, which should be finalized in consultation with the evaluation manager. The evaluator will review the documents before conducting any interview.

Interviews with ILO Staff

The evaluation consultant will undertake group and/or individual discussions with project staff in Somalia Considering the joint implementation modality of the program, the evaluation team will also meet with both relevant ILO staff. After the desk review and initial briefing by the project team, the consultant will develop an inception report, outlining the key findings of the desk review, the evaluation framework and questions, list of stakeholders to be interviewed, a work plan and customised interview schedules for different categories of stakeholders that will be used during primary data collection.

Interviews with key stakeholders in Somalia

Evaluation team will interview the key stakeholders including those representing the steering committee of the project and other important stakeholders including FESTU and AICS. The evaluation manager and the project management unit will furnish the list of all stakeholders to the evaluation team. The evaluation consultant will select respondents based on proper sampling technique from the list.

Interviews with the project participants

Evaluation team will also meet with the project participants including direct beneficiaries to understand their feeling about the project results and approach adopted by the project. The project team will provide the list of interviewees.

De-briefing

After the data collection and before producing the first draft report, the Evaluation Consultant will present initial findings at a virtual workshop to a group including the ILO Country Director or his representative and other ILO Staff, project management team, Project Steering Committee, AICS and FESTU, and the donor.

6. Main Deliverables

- 1. Inception report (with detailed work plan and data collection instruments following EVAL Checklist 3 see annex)
- 2. A concise draft and final Evaluation Reports (maximum 30 pages plus annexes and following EVAL Checklists 5 and 6 -see Annex) as per the following proposed structure:
 - i. Cover page with key project and evaluation data (using ILO EVAL template)
 - ii. Executive Summary
- iii. Acronyms
- iv. Description of the project
- v. Purpose, scope and clients of the evaluation
- vi. Methodology and limitations
- vii. Clearly identified findings for each criterion
- viii. Conclusions
- ix. Recommendations
- x. Lessons learned and good practices (briefly in the main report and a detailed in ILO EVAL template, annexed to the report)
- xi. Annexes:
 - TOR
 - Evaluation questions matrix
 - Data Table on Project Progress in achieving its targets by indicators with comments
 - Evaluation schedule
 - Documents reviewed
 - List of people interviewed
 - Lessons learned and good practices (using ILO-EVAL template
 - Any other relevant documents

7. Management Arrangement and Work Plan

All draft and final outputs, including supporting documents, analytical reports and raw data should be provided to the evaluation manager in electronic version compatible with Word for Windows.

For this evaluation, the final report and submission procedure will be as follows:

- a. The Evaluation Consultant will submit a draft evaluation report to the Evaluation Manager
- After reviewing compliance with the TORs and accuracy, the Evaluation Manager will forward to all key stakeholders, including the project and the donor, for comment and factual check;
- c. The Evaluation Manager will consolidate the comments and send these to the Evaluation Consultant;
- d. The Evaluation Consultant will finalize the report, incorporating any comments deemed appropriate and providing a brief note explaining why any comments might not have been incorporated. He/she will submit the final report to the Evaluation Manager;
- e. The Evaluation Manager will forward the report to the Regional evaluation officer and then shared, for last review and approval, with EVAL. Feedback from EVAL on corrections is required before approval could take place.
- f. Once approved, EVAL publishes the report in i-eval Discovery and informs PARDEV and/or the ILO responsible official for the submission of the approved report to the key stakeholders, including the donor.

Resources

The following resources are required:

- a. International Consultant fees for 24 work days
- b. Virtual stakeholders workshop (if feasible)
- c. Communication and interpretation costs

Management arrangements, work plan & time frame

Evaluation Manager

The evaluation consultant will report to the evaluation manager (*Mr. David Dorkenoo: dorkenoo@ilo.org*), EVAL certified evaluation manager not linked with the project. The evaluator should discuss any technical and methodological matters with the evaluation manager should issues arise. The evaluation will be carried out with full

logistical support and services of the Project Team with the administrative support of the ILO Office in Addis Ababa.

Work plan & Time Frame

The total duration of the evaluation process is estimated to **24 working day**s for the Evaluation Consultant i.e. from **10 July to 21 August 2021**.

Phase	Task	Responsible Person	Number of evalautor working days	Timing
1.	Preparation of TOR	Evaluation Manager	0	14 – 18 June
2.	 Circulation of draft TORs among stakeholders Identification of independent international evaluator Entering contracts and preparation of budgets and logistics 	Evaluation Manager	0	21 June – 9 July
3.	 Telephone briefing with evaluation managers Desk review of project and related documents Inception report , including evaluation matrix Evaluation instruments designed based on desk review 	Evaluation Consultant	5	10 – 14 July
4.	 Consultations with Project staff/management in Somalia Consultations with ILO and FESTU 	Evaluation Consultant with the support of	10	15 – 24 July

	 Consultations with stakeholders and beneficiaries of the project Debriefing and virtual presentation of preliminary findings in Somalia 	Project Team		
5.	Draft evaluation report submitted to Evaluation Manger for quality & completeness review	Evaluation Consultant	7	25 July– 3 August
6.	 Circulate draft evaluation report to key stakeholders Consolidate comments of stakeholders and send to evaluation team leader 	Evaluation Manager	0	4 -13 August
7.	• Finalize the report. Provide explanation on comments that were not included	Evaluation Consultant	2	14 – 21 August
8.	• Approval of report by EVAL	EVAL	0	16 – 20 August
9.	 Final report submitted to the donor through ILO Addis Stakeholders through the ILO Addis 	ILO Addis	0	23 – 27 August

Qualifications

The required qualifications required are listed below:

- Master degree in Social Sciences and related fields
- A minimum of 5 years of professional experience, specifically in the area of evaluation of international development initiatives and development organizations preferable including decent work and labour relations in similar contexts to Somalia.

- Demonstrated understanding of labour related issues will be an asset.
- Knowledge and experience in working in Somalia or similar countries, preferable in the sub-region will be an asset
- Knowledge and experience of the UN System in general and, if possible with ILO in particular.
- Ability to produce well written, analytical reports in English essential
- Language skills: fluency in English, and knowledge of Somali is an advantage.
- Familiarity with ICT tools that can be used for regular data collection

Relevant documents and tools on the ILO Evaluation Policy

1. Code of conduct form (To be signed by the evaluator)

http://www.ilo.org/eval/Evaluationguidance/WCMS_206205/lang--en/index.htm

2. Checklist No. 3 Writing the inception report

http://www.ilo.org/eval/Evaluationguidance/WCMS_165972/lang--en/index.htm

3. Checklist 5 Preparing the evaluation report

http://www.ilo.org/eval/Evaluationguidance/WCMS_165967/lang--en/index.htm

4. Checklist 6 Rating the quality of evaluation report

http://www.ilo.org/eval/Evaluationguidance/WCMS_165968/lang--en/index.htm

5. Template for lessons learned and Emerging Good Practices

http://www.ilo.org/eval/Evaluationguidance/WCMS_206158/lang--en/index.htm http://www.ilo.org/eval/Evaluationguidance/WCMS_206159/lang--en/index.htm

6. Guidance note 7 Stakeholders participation in the ILO evaluation

http://www.ilo.org/eval/Evaluationguidance/WCMS_165982/lang--en/index.htm

7. Guidance note 4 Integrating gender equality in M&E of projects

http://www.ilo.org/eval/Evaluationguidance/WCMS_165986/lang--en/index.htm

8. Template for evaluation title page

http://www.ilo.org/eval/Evaluationguidance/WCMS_166357/lang--en/index.htm

9. Template for evaluation summary:

http://www.ilo.org/legacy/english/edmas/eval/template-summary-en.doc

Logframe matrix

Intervention logic	Objectively verifiable indicators of achievement	Sources and means of verification	Assumptions
OVERALL OBJECTIVES Capacity of trade unions built to contribute to a more peaceful, inclusive, cohesive and sustainable Somali society	By end of the project, one Federal and at least 5 constituent Trade Unions would be able to understand basic concepts of Decent Employment, nexus of employment, gender parity, peace and resilience and there is a plan to participate effectively in Policy Dialogues for sustainable national development.	Progress Reports, Evaluation Reports Media scan	The political will and commitment of the Somali Government to uphold and respect the rights to freedom of association and collective bargaining, thereby promoting an environment conducive to trade unions to operate freely;
			provided that will enable Somalia to promote employment and decent work in its post-war reconstruction and disaster management recovery effort;

Intervention logic	Objectively verifiable indicators of achievement	Sources and means of verification	Assumptions
EXPECTED RESULTS			
Institutional capacity of the most representative Trade Union in Somalia developed to further build capacities of young Trade Union representatives;	By end of the project, one National and at least 5 constituent Trade Unions are capable to undertake advocacy and training support to workers and contribute to development policies.	Project Evaluation Reports Communication material Physical observation	Meaningful social dialogue between government, trade unions and employers Freedom of association to advocate for labour rights in Somalia:
Capacity of constituent Trade Unions enhanced on key areas of Decent Work promotion in Somalia including Gender parity; and	'At least five Trade Union members of FESTU have developed plans for promoting rights at workplaces – including focus on gender diversity	Project Evaluation reports	3. Socio-political environment that enables workers' organisations to raise issues of concern;
3) Improved capacity of trade unions in contributing towards Policy development at National, Regional and Enterprise levels – through effective Social Dialogue process	3. By end of the project, at least 5 Tripartite Policy Dialogues organized on different dimensions of Decent Work - where Trade Unions participate actively in terms of providing evidence and workers' inspirations.	 Project Evaluation reports Policy Dialogue reports 	4. Availability of resources to strengthen and capacitate workers and their representative organisations in Somalia;
PROJECT OUTPUTS		Project Evaluation Reports;	Continued Support from the International Community for job
1.1 Secretariats for Trade Unions strengthened – both at National and FMS levels;	By end of the project, one Federal and at least five constituent Trade Unions have operational Secretariats	Trade Union Reports	creation, peacebuilding, democratisation and labour rights
		Physical verification	2. Commitment of FESTU and
1.2 Enhanced internal capacity of			affiliated unions to
FESTU to impart thematic	,		maintain their stance for trade union
trainings for Trade Union	to impart training courses, Seminars and		freedom and independence despite
representatives	workplace-based learning events and advocacy	Technical Reports by	the difficult situation and challenges.

Intervention logic	Objectively verifiable indicators of achievement	Sources and means of verification	Assumptions
1.3 Technical capacity of FESTU enhanced to assess and analyse Labour Market situation 1.4 Technical capacity to establish a women trade union committee	for human and labour rights 1.3 Federal Trade Union has at least one Technical Expert to respond to technical questions and provide quality inputs to Labour market related matters. 1.4 Committee of women trade union members established to enhance	Trade Unions	3. Employers allowing workers to be unionised and capacitated;
2.1 Training courses, seminars and workplace-based study circles organized for young Trade Unions representatives on ways to create employment and protect workers against exploitation;	600 members of Trade Unions attend training courses organized jointly by ILO and FESTU Training Unit on various thematic areas related to Decent Work, Peace and Resilience	Training reports Lists of participants	
2.2 Trade Union representatives supported to participate in TV Talk Shows and Radio Programmes to disseminate knowledge on decent work for peace and resilience to deepen trade unions' contribution to curbing the menace of conflict and disaster	At least 20 Radio Programmes and TV Talk shows organized to highlight employment creation, rights at workplace and protection of workers against exploitation.	Reports of media products	

Intervention logic	Objectively verifiable indicators of achievement	Sources and means of verification	Assumptions
Tripartite Seminars and Policy Dialogues organized on key areas of decent work for peace & resilience — at Federal and Regional levels;	At least 5 tripartite Trainings and Policy Dialogues organized on different dimensions of Decent Work, Peace and Resilience.	Training and Policy dialogue reports Project Evaluation	
3.2 Bilateral dialogue platforms established at Enterprise-level to promote workplace-based cooperation among workers and management	At least 10 Workplace Improvement Plans developed jointly by workers and employers in 10 Enterprises.	Reports List of Workplace Improvement Plans	
ACTIVITIES (OUTPUT-1.1)	ACTIVITIES (OUTPUT-2.1)	ACTIVITIES (OUTPUT 3.1)	
Needs assessment for constituent Trade Unions in FMS level; Provision of equipment and other support to strengthen Secretariat for Trade Unions; ACTIVITIES (OUTPUT-1.2) Establish Training Unit within FESTU; Support 'Training of Trainers' and enable Training Unit Staff to develop quality training	 Conduct at least 3 workshops in Mogadishu, Garowe, Baidoa, Kismayo, Dhusamareb and Beledweyne on the theme "The Role of Trade Unions in Implementing Recommendation No. 205 on Employment and Decent Work for Peace and Resilience: The case of Somalia" for 100-150 participants Carry out 1-2 Trade Union Leadership Seminars on National Employment Policy for 50-75 participants Carry out workers organising action under the theme Building Workers' Power through Membership Recruitment and Organizing for 30 participants 	1. Conduct tripartite Le R205 on employmen resilience with gover organisations for 30 2. Organise a national t Reforms and Employ dedicated to trade u initiated labour law r 3. Convene Tripartite-p Integration and Dece	radership Forum on implementing and decent work for peace and rement, employers and workers' participants araining workshop on Labour Law rement Relations, which exclusively nions to contribute government reforms for 30 participants alus National Forum on Labour Market ent Work for Migrant Returnees, IDPs es for 35 participants are promotion of youth employment in
courses (curricula, organizing, implementing etc); 5. Facilitate FESTU to attend Conferences and Seminars (national and international) to raise voice and advocacy 6. Facilitate Women TU Committee	4. Conduct workshop on Role of Trade Unions in the Prevention and Eradication of Child Labour in Somalia for 30 participants ACTIVITIES (OUPUT 2.2) 5. Hold radio and TV-Talk shows to sensitize workers and the public about the ILO R205 and the ILO's flagship program on jobs for peace and	workplaces across th workplace-based ed ACTRAV Training Ma Implementing the ILG	study circle programs at various the country to conduct cost-effective fucational programs using the ILO nual on the Role Trade Unions in O Recommendation No. 205 for Peace the expertise of trained trainers for 30

Intervention logic	Objectively verifiable indicators of achievement	Sources and means of verification	Assumptions
ACTIVITIES (OUTPUT- 1.3) 7. Engage one Technical Expert on Labour issues for 12 months to work with FESTU 8. Facilitate FESTU's contacts with national Labour experts	Carry out 6 activities on enhancing workers role in the National Constitutional Review Process for 180 participants		logues at Enterprise level to establish joint committees and develop nent Plans;

2.Evaluation questions matrix

Evaluation criteria	Key questions	Data source	Data collection methods/tools	Methods of data analysis	Indicators/success stds
	1. Is the project relevant to the achievements of Somalia DWCP as well as other relevant subregional, regional and global commitments such as the UN Cooperation Framework, SDGs targets and Abidjan Declaration and ILOs strategic Objectives (Programme & Budget 2018-19 and 2020-21)?	●Interviews ●FGDs ●Project document ●Reports	•KIIs •FGDs •Documents review	 Thematic analysis Labeling (coding) Comparative analysis Triangulation 	•Respondent perceptions, level of achievement of objectives and outcomes
Relevance and strategic	2. To what extent was the project relevant to ILO DWCP of Somalia and United Nations Sustainable Development Cooperation Framework for Somalia?	●Interviews ●FGDs ●Project document ●Monitoring reports	•KIIs •FGDs •FGDs •Documents review	Thematic analysis Labeling (coding) Comparative analysis Triangulation	•Respondent perceptions, project design
fit	3. Was the project relevant to achieve the targets set in the Decent Work Agenda for Africa (DWAA)?	InterviewsFGDsProjectdocumentPMPsReports	•KIIs •Documents review	•As above	 Respondent perceptions, level of achievement of objectives and outcomes
	4. To what extent does the project complement and fit with other on-going Italian Government initiatives and other ILO and UN projects in the country? 5. Have the ILO constituencies (government, employers' and workers' organizations) involved in the planning of the project?	●Interviews ●FGDs ●Project document ●Reports		•As above	•Respondent perceptions, level of achievement of objectives and outcomes

Evaluation criteria	Key questions	Data source	Data collection methods/tools	Methods of data analysis	Indicators/success stds
	6. Within the context of ILO goal of gender equality, disability inclusion and other non-discrimination issues as well as national level policies in this regard, to what extent did the project design take into account: i. Specific gender equality and non-discrimination concerns relevant to the project context; ii. Concerns relating to inclusion of people with				
	disabilities? 1. Does the project have a clear theory of change that outlines the causality? 2. Has the design clearly defined achievable outcomes and outputs?	•Interviews •Project document •Reports •Interviews •Project document •Reports	Documents review Klls Documents review Klls	•-do-	Respondent perceptions, project design and project delivery Respondent perceptions, project design and project delivery
Validity of design	3. Has the project planning included a useful monitoring and evaluation framework including outcomes indicators with baselines and targets?	●Interviews ●Project document ●Reports	◆Documents review ◆Klls	•-do-	Respondent perceptions, project design and project delivery
	4. Did the project design include an exit strategy and a strategy for sustainability?	•Interviews •Project document •Reports	◆Documents review ◆KIIs	•-do-	 Respondent perceptions, project design and project delivery
	5. Was the implementation approach valid and realistic? Has the project adequately taken into account the risks of blockage?	●Interviews ●Project document ●Reports	◆Documents review ◆Klls	•-do-	Respondent perceptions, project design and project delivery

Evaluation criteria	Key questions	Data source	Data collection methods/tools	Methods of data analysis	Indicators/success stds
	6. Has the project addressed gender and disability inclusion related issues in the project document?	•Interviews •Project document •Reports	•Documents review •KIIs	•-do-	•Respondent perceptions, project design and project delivery
	1.To what extent have the project objectives and their related outcomes and outputs been achieved according to the work plan or are likely to be achieved, addressing needs of men and women?	•Interviews •FGDs •Project document •Project reports	Documents review KIIs	 Thematic analysis Labeling (coding) Comparative analysis Triangulation Simple descriptive statistics 	 Monitoring reports with disaggregated data on achievements available Training reports Training and certification records
Project effectiveness	2. Has the project successfully built or strengthened an enabling environment (systems, policies, people's attitudes, etc.)?	•Interviews •FGDs •PMPs and reports	•KIIs •FGDs •Documents review	Thematic analysisLabeling (coding)Comparative analysisTriangulation	 Respondent perceptions, # and outcomes of cases of an enabling environment
effectiveffess	3. Which have been the main contributing and challenging factors towards project's success in attaining its targets?	●Interviews ●PMPs	KIIs Documents review	Thematic analysis Comparative analysis Triangulation	Respondent perceptions, # and outcomes of cases of challenges the project
	4. What, if any, unintended results of the project have been identified or perceived?	•Interviews •Project document	•KIIs •Documents review	As above	•Respondent perceptions, cases of unintended results
	5. To what extend has the COVID-19 Pandemic influenced project results and effectiveness and how the project have addressed this influence to adapt to changes?	•Interviews •Project document	●Documents review ●KIIs	As above	•Respondent perceptions
Effectiveness of management arrangements	7. In the management and governance arrangement of the project, there is a clear understanding of roles	•Interviews •Project documents	•Documents review •KIIs	Thematic analysisLabeling (coding)Comparative analysisTriangulation	•Respondent perceptions

Evaluation criteria	Key questions	Data source	Data collection methods/tools	Methods of data analysis	Indicators/success stds
	and responsibilities by all parties involved?				
	8. Is a monitoring and evaluation strategy in place and useful for management, learning and accountability? Is relevant information systematically collected and collated (disaggregated by sex and by other relevant characteristics)?	•Interviews •Project documents	•Documents review •KIIs	 Thematic analysis Labeling (coding) Comparative analysis Triangulation 	•Respondent perceptions,
	9. Has the project created good relationship and cooperation with the different relevant national, regional and local level government authorities and other relevant stakeholders to implement the project?	●Interviews ●Project documents		 Thematic analysis Labeling (coding) Comparative analysis Triangulation 	•Respondent perceptions,
Efficiency of resource use	1. How efficiently have resources (human resources, time, expertise, funds etc.) been allocated and used to provide the necessary support and to achieve the broader project objectives?	●Interviews ●Project document	●Documents review ●KIIs	•As above	 Project expenditure and delivery trends, project work plans and budget revisions
	2. Are the available technical and financial resources adequate to fulfil the project plans? If not, what other kind of resources may be required?	InterviewsProject documentPMPs	•KIIs •Documents review	As above	 Project expenditure and delivery trends, project work plans and budget revisions, procurement timelines
	3. To what extent are the	•Interviews	∙KIIs	•As above	●Periodic reports, joint

Evaluation criteria		Key questions	Data source	Data collection methods/tools	Methods of data analysis	Indicators/success stds
	ac ar ar ex wi ac th or su	roject's ativities/operations and the disbursements and project apenditures in line with the schedule of ativities as defined by the project team and a siginal (and absequent) work ans?	Project documents	•Documents review		workshops, and consultative meetings, and minutes of meetings/decisions
	4. Do	oes the regular onitoring of the roject allow for djustments and daptation of the work an based on what orks and what does ot work?	●Interviews ●Project document ●Reports	•Documents review •KIIs	As above	Monitoring Plan is included in the project document, reports submitted on time and accepted
	5. Ho ac 19	ow the project ddressed the COVID- with the existing sources?	•Interviews •Project document	•KIIs •Documents review	As above	•Respondent perceptions, project performance
	6. Ho	ow has the ILO pordinated project aplementation with their relevant projects and programmes?	●Interviews ●FGDs ●Work plans	●FGDs ●KIIs ●Documents review	•As above	 Respondent perceptions, project coordination trends in comparison with planned activities
Impact orientation and	te in de im fo	ow is intended long- rm impact expressed relation to the esign, aplementation and illow-up of the roject?	●Interviews ●Project doc,	●Documents ●KIIs	•As above	 Respondent perceptions, , project design
sustainability	2. To th ta be pr	o what extent have be men and women rget population enefited from the roject outputs and ork towards	●Interviews ●Project document	•KIIs •Documents review	•As above	 Respondent perceptions, gender responsiveness

Evaluation criteria		Key questions	Data source	Data collection methods/tools	Methods of data analysis	Indicators/success stds
		outcomes? Has the project changed or is likely to change their lives in any meaningful way?				
	3.	Is the programme strategy and programme management steering towards impact and sustainability? Has the project stating implementing an exit	•Interviews •FGDs •Project doc.	•KIIs •Documents review	•As above	 Respondent perceptions, project management structure
	4.	strategy? Has the project started building the capacity of people and national institutions or strengthened an enabling environment (laws, systems, policies, people's skills, attitudes, curriculums and trainings etc.) in order to contribute to systemic change that will continue to make a difference after the project is finalised (e.g. KPLC/Strathmore training)?	•Interviews •FGDs •Project document	•KIIs Documents review	•As above	•Respondent perceptions, institutional change, changes in behaviour, policy changes promoted
	5.		•Interviews •FGDs •Project doc.	•KIIs •FGDs •Documents	•As above	 Respondent perceptions, sustainabil ity plans

Evaluation criteria		Key questions	Data source	Data collection methods/tools	Methods of data analysis	Indicators/success stds
	6.	How has the sustainability approach of the project been affected by the Covid19 situation in context of the national responses and how has the project and stakeholders responded in moving forward the project results appropriation?	●Interviews ●Project document	•KIIs •Documents review	As above	•Respondent perceptions, gender marker data assigned to the project

3. Lessons learned

ILO Lesson Learned Template

Project Title: Occupation and Decent Work for Peace and Resilience in Somalia

Project TC/SYMBOL: SOM/18/02/ITA

Name of Evaluator: Edwin Okul Date: Feb,2022

LL Element	Text
Brief description of lesson learned (link to specific action or task)	Without government support, implementation of projects is not easy in Somalia. The project had the total support of the government as evidenced by their participation in and support for the various strategic project interventions and policies – this shows local ownership and much needed encouragement for the key stakeholders taking much interest in project interventions.
Context and any related preconditions	The project is being implemented in a challenging context. Somalia state is fragile, its institutions are weak, and development work is often exposed to challenges relating to violence, and institutional incapacity.
Targeted users / Beneficiaries	The donor, ILO, the government, partners as well as other relevant stakeholders, Technical Officers, Monitoring and Evaluation Officers.
Challenges /negative lessons - Causal factors	The COVID-19 pandemic breakout, besides the insecurity and violence in some of the project locations has been the greatest challenge leading to delays to kick-start the project. As well, the project components are rather broad to be implemented under the small team of project technical officer and project officer; there was a prolonged period without an M &E officer in the project .
Success / Positive Issues - Causal factors	There is strong ownership and support by the key stakeholders as seen by involvement in the relevant government ministries. There is also an elaborate and structured ILO administrative policies and procedures, which allow for transparency in decisions regarding use of resources against agreed project actions.
ILO Administrative Issues (staff, resources, design, implementation)	ILO has an administrative office in Somali which has increased the efficiency of management. However, in some instance these procedures contributed to the delayed delivery of activities.

ILO Lesson Learned Template

Project Title: Occupation and Decent Work for Peace and Resilience in Somalia

Project TC/SYMBOL: SOM/18/02/ITA

Name of Evaluator: Edwin Okul Date: Feb,2022

LL Element	Text
Brief description of lesson learned (link to specific action or task)	The importance of local ownership of project during implementation. Project activities that were to be carried out by the ILO were handed over to FESTU. In spite of the activity overload, the implementing partners applied themselves fully and ensured that the project's objectives were attained.
Context and any related preconditions	Somalia presented logistical complications and restrictions arising from the outbreak of COVID-19. This made it difficult for ILO staff to be physically present to oversee the implementation of the project activities
Targeted users / Beneficiaries	The donor, ILO, the government, partners as well as other relevant stakeholders, Technical Officers, Monitoring and Evaluation Officers.
Challenges /negative lessons - Causal factors	The Trade unions existing in Somali are not yet fully strategic to deliver the services effectively; because most of them had very weak capacities and track record of working workers.
Success / Positive Issues - Causal factors	Besides supporting the implementation, as a member of ILO's tripartite constituency for Somalia, FESTU continued to champion for decent work for all Somalis and will continue to engage social dialogue with social partners without comprising fundamental workers' rights as well as the space of trade unions in this important discourse.
ILO Administrative Issues (staff, resources, design, implementation)	There were structures encompassed in institutional arrangements which ensured policy and strategic guidance guaranteeing successful delivery of the project and FESTU had a direct interest in the project. The project was originally designed to be directly implemented by the ILO with an oversight mechanism comprising of the ILO, FESTU and the Italian Cooperation.

ILO Lesson Learned Template

Project Title: Occupation and Decent Work for Peace and Resilience in Somalia

Project TC/SYMBOL: SOM/18/02/ITA

Name of Evaluator: Edwin Okul Date: Feb,2022

LL Element	Text
Brief description of lesson learned (link to specific action or task)	The engagement and links with other agencies to increase outreach and impact on occupation and decent work empowerment of workers in Somalia. The project has therefore developed a resource base on educators who can be utilized post the project.
Context and any related preconditions	There are low levels of capacity among agencies, mainly due to lack of advocacy and outreach skills, lack of access to capital, and lack of networks for support and advocacy.
Targeted users / Beneficiaries	The donor, ILO, the government, partners as well as other relevant stakeholders, Technical Officers, Monitoring and Evaluation Officers.
Challenges /negative lessons - Causal factors	A number of factors, including the physical and political environment to encumber worker's participation in the tripartite arrangements unless addressed. Economic realities which reinforce them and restrict worker's access to training and the institutions which require proficient trainers, ought to be addressed.
Success / Positive Issues - Causal factors	The workplace educators trained on active learning and participation techniques which enables them to conduct active trade union trainings. They have been trained on organizational techniques and resource mobilization, enabling them to be independent in carrying out their activities without reliance on donors.
ILO Administrative Issues (staff, resources, design, implementation)	The existence of project partners led by FESTU, government, Trade unions and the educators worked well in guiding the project implementation and components with the aim of ensuring realisation of benefits to the target groups.

ILO Lesson Learned Template

Project Title: Occupation and Decent Work for Peace and Resilience in Somalia

Project TC/SYMBOL: SOM/18/02/ITA

Name of Evaluator: Edwin Okul Date: Feb,2022

LL Element	Text
Brief description of lesson learned (link to specific action or task)	The importance of labour unions in promoting worker welfare and defending their collective interests. Workers belonging to the trade unions benefitted from FESTU's lobbying of the federal government of Somalia to recognise workers' shared needs and wellbeing.
Context and any related preconditions	There emerged unforeseen social pressure and life stresses and as a result of lobbying by trade unions, the Federal government provided support the public sector workers by allowing them to work from home without deduction or withdrawal of their salaries and allowances during the early months of COVID-19 outbreak.
Targeted users / Beneficiaries	The Trade Unions, ILO, the government, associates as well as other relevant stakeholders.
Challenges /negative lessons - Causal factors	The relationship between Government and Workers were not very friendly at the beginning of this Project. Unforeseen community burden and life stresses resulting from COVID-19 outbreak and the attendant economic difficulties.
Success / Positive Issues - Causal factors	With the positive mediation and dialogue prompted by the project, the Government and Trade Unions gradually opened up to each other and after initial positive signals, the relationship got warmer with each passing day.
ILO Administrative Issues (staff, resources, design, implementation)	The existence of project partners led by FESTU, government, Trade unions and the educators worked well in guiding the project implementation and components with the aim of ensuring realisation of benefits to the target groups.

4. Good Practice

ILO Emerging Good Practice Template

Project Title: Occupation and Decent Work for Peace and Resilience in Somalia

Project TC/SYMBOL: SOM/18/02/ITA

Name of Evaluator: Edwin Okul Date: Feb,2022

GP Element	Text
Brief summary of the good practice (link to project goal or specific deliverable, background, purpose, etc.)	Empowerment of the Teachers' Union under FESTU was evident through teachers in Baidoa who undertook a review of the Somali school curriculum. They identified fundamental flaws and informed the Ministry of Education who then reviewed the entire curriculum. The Teachers' Association also advocated for provision of a contract and fixed salary for teachers in private schools which was duly implemented by the Ministry of Education of South West. This was a sustainable strategy for continued support for trade unions beyond the
Relevant conditions and Context: limitations or advice in terms of applicability and replicability	While there may have been trade unions representing teachers, these lacked coherent, competency-based skills development and empowerment strategy for the members. There were fundamental flaws in the curriculum yet the teachers were incapable of engaging the Ministry of Education with a view to reviewing it. At the same time, most teachers in the private sector worked without contracts or fixed salaries but lacked the appropriate and proficient platform on which to present their grievances.
Establish a clear cause-effect relationship	An empowered trade union capable of addressing the workers' plight depends on amicable partnerships between the main stakeholders. The empowerment of local trade unions approach is generating knowledge and is building local capacities in the trade union movement. The project also aimed at enabling and increasing collaboration between the tripartite stakeholders
Indicate measurable impact and targeted beneficiaries	The trade unions have been facilitated to better organize themselves so that they can launch different initiatives to boost the trade union movement in various locations across the country.
Potential for replication and by whom	The trade unions that have been trained and empowered can replicate the trainings to selected trade unions depending on their needs. This could be replicated in every socio-economic empowerment intervention, worldwide, and in future phases of the project if there are suitable resources to allow a multi-level approach.
Upward links to higher ILO Goals (DWCPs, Country Programme Outcomes or ILO's Strategic Programme Framework)	The project aligns with all the four key priorities of the previous DWCP of Somalia and is contributing to the National Development Plan (NDP-9) priorities.
Other documents or relevant comments	Ensuring both a coherent approach to capacity building strategy is of critical importance.

ILO Emerging Good Practice Template

Project Title: Occupation and Decent Work for Peace and Resilience in Somalia

Project TC/SYMBOL: SOM/18/02/ITA

Name of Evaluator: Edwin Okul Date: Feb,2022

GP Element	Text
Brief summary of the good practice (link	Training and policy advocacy by unions to curb gender-based violence has
to project goal or specific deliverable,	empowered women to call out injustices and created awareness on victim rights.
background, purpose, etc.)	Ayan saw a post on her friend's Facebook wall showing a photo of a 3-year-old rape
	victim. She reached out to the individual who had posted the photo and persuaded
	him to remove it because millions of users might see the little girl's picture which
	would increase the family's agony. She then lobbied for the little girl to obtain
	justice by having the perpetrator arrested and charged.
Relevant conditions and Context:	The project is addressing barriers to women's participation and success in the
limitations or advice in terms of	various facets of the social, economic and political arena. The role of women's
applicability and replicability	participation in economic, leadership and politics is often ignored, with employment
	rate of women in the civil service and other institutions being low.
Establish a clear cause-effect relationship	Deliberate efforts to target more women during the project activities ensured that
	women and youth were integrated and mainstreamed in trade union and social
	dialogue activities. FESTU's Gender Policy informed structuring of discussions and
	response on discrimination against women workers and gender-based violence.
Indicate measurable impact and targeted	The project advocated gender equality pay at the work places with female workers
beneficiaries	receiving equal pay as male workers for equal work done.
	Domestication of Convention 190, which the Somalia has ratified, and its translation
	to law will increase awareness on gender issues on a national scale.
	The project oversaw the establishment of a Committee of Women Trade Union
	which collaborated with the National Women Committee in advocating for policies
	and addressing the critical gender gaps and parities in the sector. The union
	successfully pushed for enactment of the Sexual Offences Bill that protects women
	against abuse at the workplace.
	FESTU laid plans for according priority to women and other vulnerable groups
	during the hiring process. They further lobbied for specialised services for female
	workers and promotion of a violence-free work place environment.
Potential for replication and by whom	FESTU needs to push for Convention 182 on child labor to be ratified and
	domestication of the convention to address this social vice.
Upward links to higher ILO Goals (DWCPs,	The project aligns with all the four key priorities of the previous DWCP of Somalia
Country Programme Outcomes or ILO's	and is contributing to the National Development Plan (NDP-9) priorities.
Strategic Programme Framework)	
Other documents or relevant comments	Employment opportunities, particularly in the formal sector, are highly
	differentiated by gender

5. Evaluation schedule

No		Activities	Responsible	Timeline
1	AA	Virtual briefing with evaluation manager Desk review of project related documents and development of the Inception report and approval by the Evaluation manager	• Consultant	1 - 12 Nov, 2021
2	A	Consultations with stakeholders	• Consultants with logistical support by the Project	15 Nov- 1 Dec
3	>	Draft evaluation report based on desk review and consultations from field visits	 Consultant 	31 Dec
4	A	Presentation of preliminary findings to the project team, government partners and other stakeholders	• Consultant with logistical support by the Project	15 Jan, 2022
5	AA	Circulate draft evaluation report to key stakeholders Consolidate comments of stakeholders and send to consultant leader	• Evaluation manager	15 -31 Jan, 2022
6	A	Incorporate comments and inputs including explanations if comments were not included	Consultants	4 – 16 Feb
7	>	Approval of report by EVAL	• EVAL	20 Feb
8	>	Official submission to CO for dissemination and management response	• EVAL	25 Feb

6. Documents reviewed

- 1. Relevant documents and tools on the ILO Evaluation Policy
- 2. Project Activity/ Implementation reports
- 3. Progress Reports
- 4. Project Document
- 5. FESTU Gender Policy
- 6. FESTU Position Paper # 5
- 7. FESTU Position Paper on Climate

7. List of people interviewed

Key Informant Interviews

	Name	Office	Position
1	Omar Osman Faruk	Federation for Somali trade Unions (FESTU)	Secretary General (SG)
2	Muhammed Musse	Federation for Somali trade Unions (FESTU)	Officer Administrator
3	Alexio Musindo	ILO CO Addis Ababa	Director
4	Henry Danso	ILO	Head of office, Mogadishu-Somalia
5	Kabu Mban	ILO	Workers' Education Specialist
6	Abdiribah Mohamed Abdiwahid	ILO	National Project Coordinator

Focus Group Discussions

S/No	ff Name
1	Huyen Maday Mahamed
	Majida Hassan Mohamed Saida Brahim machamed
2	Majida Massan Mohamed
3	Saida Mohim machamed
4	Abdirehmen Mosellim ABShir
5	
6	Juneyring Alon Sigat ABDIRISACK MADLIN BULLE
7	
8	
9	

Prepared by: Ahmed Abditedir

Date: 15-16/17/2021

Signature: Com

Focus Group Discussions (FGD

Region/ District Name: Bancolis

FGD Category: FGSTU Bandir'

S/No	Name
1, 2,	Abmed Hassan monamond.
2	Faisal mohamond vage
3	Hameli mohamed yazin
4	Araon Cal Nodix
5	Abdirahmen Sh. Mohemed Mcham ed
6	
7	
8	
9	

Prepared by: Ahmed	
Date: 12-13/12/2021	
Signature:	S

Focus Group Discussions

Region/ District Name: Gayous

FGD Category: FESTU Garage

S/No	Name
1	Ismahan Marahim
2	Abditiation Bashir Osman
3	Abdehakim Bashir Osman
4	Shirace Some Him
5	Monamed Mohamoud Hossam
6	
7	
8	
9	

Prepared by: Ahmed Abdikediv

Date: 19-20/12/2071

Signature: Com

Focus Group Discussions (FGD

Region/ District Name: Dhasemereb
FGD Category: FESTU Dhusemereb

S/No	Name
1	Cal Cepdo dason
2	Hbdirohin Abdullahi Nus
3	A youn maxamud XISS.
4	can di weli sersi.
5	det & Bragn Arened,
6	Massamed Muss Massamul
7	
8	
9	

 Prepared by:
 Ahmed

 Date:
 23-12-8021

 Signature:
 Signature:

Focus Group Discussions (

Region/ District Name: Gayow &

FGD Category: FESTU Garage

S/No	Name
1	Langhan Hoo hom
2	Ahmed Osman Said
3	Abdilhakim Bashir Osman
4	Shinuca Song Him
5	Mohamed Mohamoud Hosson
6	
7	
8	
9	

Prepared by: Ahmed Abdikediv

Date: 19-20/12/2021

Signature: