



International
Labour
Organization

► Evaluation Office



i-eval Discovery



Creating Decent Work Opportunities for Somali Internally Displaced People (IDPs), Returnees and Host Communities through Employment Intensive Infrastructure Improvements

QUICK FACTS

Countries: Federal Republic of Somalia

Evaluation date: 30 October 2023

Evaluation type: External

Evaluation timing: Mid-term

Administrative Office: Addis Abeba

Technical Office: Addis Abeba

Evaluation manager: Pacome Dessero

Evaluation consultants: Sten Toft Petersen, International Consultant and Mohamed Bille Ali, National Consultant

DC Symbol: SOM/19/01/DEU

Donor(s) & budget: Germany/KfW 9.900.099 USD

Key Words: [Use themes as provided in i-eval Discovery](#) EIIP, decent work, skills, employment, livelihood, women at work, capacity building

BACKGROUND & CONTEXT

Summary of the project purpose, logic and structure	The “Creating Decent Work Opportunities for Somali Internally Displaced People (IDPs), Returnees and Host communities through Employment-intensive Infrastructure Improvement” is a four-year (Dec 2019 – Dec 2023) project funded by Germany/KfW in Somalia. The ILO implements the project in close cooperation with the federal, state and district-level government institutions, including the federal and Southwest State Ministries of Public Works, Reconstruction and Housing, Labour and Social Development, Planning, Investment and Economic Development and Baidoa District Authority. The overall objective of the project is to increase the socio-economic development of the target IDPs, returnees and host communities in Baidoa District, whereas the immediate objective is to improve access to basic economic and social services, transport and employment opportunities through the construction and maintenance of key infrastructure assets. The immediate objective is improved and sustainable access to basic economic and social services, transport and employment opportunities. The project has the following two mutually reinforcing components: 1. Infrastructure development and creation of employment opportunities to the target groups through the use of ILO’s employment intensive investment approach. 2. Capacity building of the Ministry of Public Works at State level and Baidoa district authority with focus on institutional, technical and managerial aspects of infrastructure development and maintenance (planning, design, implementation, supervision/monitoring and evaluation) using employment intensive methodology, contractors and casual labourers.
Present situation of the project	There are a number of objective reasons for the delay in implementation (by March 2023 the project is 18 months behind schedule) and from this the lesser achievement of project objectives. Firstly, did the COVID-19 pandemic delay the implementation because of the regulations for movement which limited the staff in reaching out to potential implementing partners and beneficiaries. Secondly has the security situation in the country complicated the implementation due to imposed restrictions on movement. Most of the delays were beyond the reach of the project management.
Purpose, scope and clients of the evaluation	The main purposes of the MTE are to fulfil the accountability to the donor and to the tripartite constituents, to serve internal organizational learning and develop actionable Recommendation. This mid-term evaluation reviews the project design, implementation, effectiveness, efficiency, relevance, and sustainability and make actionable recommendations for the remaining period of the project towards delivering improving delivery and sustainability of outcomes.

	The evaluation covers the period of implementation of the project from its start in December 2019 until March 2023 covering key outputs and outcomes (including unexpected results).
Methodology of evaluation	The Evaluation Team conducted a participatory, theory-based evaluation to answer the questions raised in the Terms of Reference. After a desk review of relevant documents interviews were conducted with key informants and focus group discussions conducted with beneficiaries. No Theory of Change is in place. The MTE faced limitations by the fact that due to the UN Security Protocol no field visits could be conducted by the International Consultant
MAIN FINDINGS & CONCLUSIONS	<u>Relevance and strategic fit</u> The project is well aligned to the end beneficiaries' immediate needs as it gives them some income to survive. The improved roads and walkways will provide better access to healthcare and social facilities as well as improve business opportunities for the people living in the attached areas and by this contribute to improving livelihood in the areas of direct intervention and beyond. <u>Coherence</u> The Somalia DWCP 2023-2025, signed 9. June 2023, a first-generation DWCP for the Federal Republic of Somalia outlines the policy direction, strategies, and anticipated results through prioritised work areas during this period that will contribute to the country's attainment of Decent Work. The current project has a leading role in realizing the priorities set out in the DWCP. <u>Effectiveness of project implementation and management arrangements</u> The PD talks about the project as a "forum for social dialogue". The MTE was informed that the cooperation with MoLSA both at federal and state level in relation to the current project has been limited. The social partners have not been a part of the project development and implementation. The evaluation finds it a missed opportunity that social partners have not been involved in the project implementation. The engagement of community leaders through the Community Umbrella System (CUS) in the selection of beneficiaries has according to various informants proven to have had a positive impact beyond what could be expected. The tension between the target groups is less and the selection of workers most in need has been received positively in the community. <u>Efficiency of resource use</u> The MTE finds that under the given circumstances and the challenges the project has been confronted with by the security situation in Somalia and the pandemic the project has managed the available resources in a responsible and strategical way. <u>Sustainability</u>

The project is foreseen to have a second phase, it is therefore not relevant to consider an exit strategy at this point.

The character of this project is only partly targeted on long term, sustainable contribution to the SDG. The primary beneficiaries have an immediate benefit of the project from the income they have from the work assignment.

Impact orientation

The MTE finds that the project has contributed to improve the socio-economic situation for the selected individuals' direct beneficiaries of the employment opportunities in the short-term. It is however too early to call to what extent there will be an impact on the overall socio-economic development in the target communities.

The infrastructure improvement will for the communities have a positive not measurable impact on the access to social- and health services.

Cross-cutting concerns

The project aims at securing that 30% of beneficiaries are women. The Somali stakeholders together with the ILO at an early stage found that the target was too optimistic. No amendments to the target were agreed, however. Many women found the work offered at the construction sites too physically hard and less attractive to them.

RECOMMENDATIONS, LESSONS LEARNED AND GOOD PRACTICES

Main findings & Conclusions

The projects infrastructure construction activities are well received, and the local authorities express their satisfaction with the progress and the improved access to social and medical facilities for the IDPs living in the areas where roads are constructed. It is too early to say to what extent the improved roads and markets will lead to measurable improvement for micro and small businesses in the area.

Recommendations

- 1) The ILO is recommended to ensure that the employers (Chamber of Commerce and Industry) and the workers (Federation of Somalian Trade Unions) and also ACTRAV and ACTEMP are integrated into the project activities where relevant.
- 2) The Project Team is recommended to secure full reporting on the gender balance in all activities. Even in cases where there are 100% male participation this should be reported. As this project has a strong commitment to include women and youth it is utmost important that data are available for possible needed adjustments to the project activities to make them more inclusive.
- 3) An Outcome Harvesting workshop should be conducted and based on the discussions of realistic Outcomes and changes to be expected a ToC should be developed.
- 4) The ILO is recommended to conduct a gender analysis and in this include an investigation into the push and pull factors for women's engagement with the construction sector incl. understanding of possible employment possibilities in related sectors.

- 5) The ILO is recommended to take action to secure that the PSC is operational as per its ToR. take benefit of its outreach to its constituents and secure their active involvement in the governance of the project. The EO (Chamber of Commerce) and the trade union federation should be invited to join the PSC or as a minimum the TWG.
- 6) The ILO Project Team is recommended to offer to contractors participating in a bidding process but not winning that they can be advised by the expert how to improve their offers so that they improve their chances for winning future contracts.
- 7) The ILO Project Team is recommended to establish a tracer study on the career path of the workers engaged with the construction work within the current project to see if there is an (unexpected) impact on their longer- term employment situation.
- 8) The project partners are recommended to consider including maintenance and cleaning of roads build under phase one in a possible phase two this to secure longer term maintenance and increase the number of jobs attractive to women.
- 9) The project is recommended to strengthen the contractors/employer's compliance with their contractual obligation to conduct safety training on "day one" of the employment. It should be tested by the Project Team and/or the TPM if the workers understand the potential hazards and how to use PPE. Also, the Contractors must secure that required PPE of good standard is provided to the workers.
- 10) The ILO Project Management is recommended urgently to take action to secure that the workers involved with the project are covered by a workplace accident insurance.
- 11) The ILO is recommended to take action to secure that new technical staff and new partners are introduced to fundamental principles, ideas and the nature of the ILO this to ensure that all who have influence on the progress of the project understands the political background for the intervention from an ILO point of view.

**Main lessons
learned and
good practices**

Emerging Good Practises

The project has chosen a very inclusive approach when selecting potential beneficiaries who are going to be contracted for work (Cash for Work) in the construction activities. The engagement of community leaders through the Community Umbrella System in the selection of beneficiaries has according to various informants proven to have had a positive impact beyond what could be expected. The tension between the target groups is less and the selection of workers most in need has been received positively in the community.

Lesson Learned

This project has due to objective reasons (COVID-19 and security situation) been very much dependent on remote management both towards staff and implementation sites. With staff based in different countries and no presence of staff at implementation site. It has proven complicated to run a full project remotely. It has been a challenge for all stakeholders.