



ILO EVALUATION

- **Evaluation Title:** **Independent Final Evaluation of The Way Forward After the Revolution – Decent Work for Women in Egypt and Tunisia**

- **ILO TC/SYMBOL:** **RAF/12/01/FIN**

- **Type of Evaluation :** **Final**

- **Country(ies) :** **Egypt and Tunisia**

- **Date of the evaluation:** **April-June 2018**

- **Name of consultant(s):** **Nahla Hassan**

- **ILO Administrative Office:** **Cairo**

- **ILO Technical Backstopping Office:** **Employment Department in Geneva**

- **Other agencies involved in joint evaluation:** **N/A**

- **Date project ends:** **31st March 2018**

- **Donor country and budget:** **US\$ 3,808,747**

- **Evaluation Manager:** **Marwa Salah-Abdou**

- **Key Words:** *Egypt, Tunisia, Decent Work for women, women entrepreneurship, women representation, women in business, employer organization and worker organization.*

This evaluation has been conducted according to ILO's evaluation policies and procedures. It has not been professionally edited, but has undergone quality control by the ILO Evaluation Office

List of Acronyms

ACTRAV	Bureau for Workers' Activities
ACTEMP	Bureau for Employers' Activities
CSO	Civil Society Organisation
CNFCE	Chambre nationales des Femmes Chefs d'Entreprise
EDLC	Egyptian Democratic Labour Congress
EFITU	Egyptian Federation of Independent Trade Unions
ETUF	Egyptian Trade Union Federation
FEI	Federation of Egyptian Industries
ILO	International Labour Organisation
MOM	Minister of Manpower
MOMM	Ministry of Man Power and Migration
NCW	National Council for Women
NGO	Non-governmental Organisation
UGTT	Union Générale des Travailleurs tunisiens
UTICA	Union Tunisienne de l'Industrie, du Commerce et de l'Artisanat
WED	Women Entrepreneurship Development

Table of Contents

List of Acronyms.....	2
I. EXECUTIVE SUMMARY	4
II. BACKGROUND.....	9
III. Project Description.....	9
IV. EVALUATION OBJECTIVES & PURPOSE	13
V. EVALUATION METHODOLOGY	15
VI. EVALUATION FINDINGS.....	18
6.1 RELEVANCE	18
6.1.1 <i>Appropriateness of Project Design</i>	18
6.1.2 <i>Coherence of Results Framework</i>	19
6.2 PROJECT EFFECTIVENESS	20
6.2.1 <i>Progress Towards Expected Results</i>	20
6.2.2 <i>Effectiveness of Implementation Strategies</i>	22
6.2.3 <i>Effectiveness of Capacity building Activities</i>	24
6.2.4 <i>Effectiveness of Business Development Initiatives</i>	25
6.3 PROJECT EFFICIENCY	26
6.3.1 <i>Administration and finance:</i>	26
6.3.2 <i>Efficiency of Human Resource Management</i>	26
6.3.3 <i>Technical quality assurance and support:</i>	27
6.3.4 <i>Partnerships with other public or development partners relevant initiatives:</i>	28
VII. Impact and Sustainability.....	29
7.4.1 PROJECT OUTCOMES.....	29
7.4.2 POTENTIAL FOR SUSTAINABILITY	31
VIII. CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS.....	32
IX. LESSONS-LEARNED AND GOOD PRACTICES	35
ANNEX 1 Terms of Reference.....	36
ANNEX 2 Results and M&E framework.....	44
ANNEX 3 Field Work Schedule	47
ANNEX 4 Lessons Learned and Best Practices	52

I. EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

Background and Context

The Way Forward after the revolution was designed and started its implementation at a time of major changes in Egypt and Tunisia. The project was timely and relevant to the needs and priorities of both countries. The project aimed to prioritise gender in discussions and actions in both countries thus integrating equality and equity in discussions around women and their rights in all aspects of society.

Project Description

The Way Forward After the Revolution is an ILO implemented project. The project responded to a demand among constituents for supporting the promotion of gender at the work place and strengthening of women economic empowerment.

The project had an approved budget of €2,500,000 that was complemented by an additional financial contribution of € 622,023 in 2016. The total project budget was hence increased to US\$ 3,808,747. It started on 1st June 2012 and ran until 31st of March 2018

The project has four immediate objectives as follows:

1. Sensitizing social partners and a wider audience on gender issues and inequalities in the world of work
2. Increasing the capacity of and institutional setting for females to equip them with necessary skills to engage in social dialogue and collective bargaining processes for advancing gender equality, non-discrimination, and increased female representation in trade unions
3. Increasing women's skills to enhance their employability
4. Capacity building for labour market institutions to better serve women and increase women's access to these institutions.

Purpose, scope and clients of the evaluation

According to the TORs, the stated **purpose** of this evaluation is:

1. Give an independent assessment of progress the results achieved by to date of the project across all the outcomes; assessing performance as per the foreseen targets and indicators of achievement at output and outcome levels as well as strategies and implementation modalities chosen; partnership arrangements, constraints and opportunities in implementing the project
2. Provide recommendations for Phase II of the project.
3. Document lessons learned and good practices in order to maximize the experience gained.

Methodology of evaluation

The scope of the final evaluation includes a review and assessment of all activities carried out under the project agreement/contract. All activities that have been implemented from project launch through the time of evaluation fieldwork were considered. The evaluation assessed the positive and negative changes produced by the project – intended and unintended, direct and indirect, as well as any changes in the

social and economic environment in the country – as reported by respondents. Performance was assessed based on the OECD-DAC Criteria. More specifically and as specified in the terms of reference the evaluation assessed: relevance and validity of project design; project progress and effectiveness; efficiency; impact orientation and sustainability of the project; and effectiveness of management arrangements.

Evaluation Findings

Relevance

The project responded to the needs of governments in Egypt and Tunisia although it chose to do so in a challenging context after the revolutions in both countries. The project strived to work both at the policy and implementation levels. This was a direct response to the requirements and priorities of the governments of Egypt and Tunisia. There was an urgent need in 2013-2014 to deliver on job creation and hence the focus on working on cooperatives in Egypt and rendering support to women entrepreneurs in Tunisia fits well with the priorities of the governments of both countries.

The final evaluation concurs with the findings of the mid-term evaluation related to the coherence of the results framework as written (how the project has overcome this will be discussed in the following sections of this report). As presented in the project documents, the results framework is ambitious and difficult to measure due to the way in which some of the objectives are formulated. The phrasing of objectives is general and broad and the selected outputs (some read more like objectives) do not always reflect a causality.

Effectiveness

The project achieved/partially achieved the majority of its objectives (as presented in the results framework). However, the outcomes and results of the project are more than what is presented through the project's results framework. The project's results are strategic and will be long lasting in some cases. The project worked both at the policy level through its first two objectives, the implementation level through objective 3 and on the strengthening of the knowledge base related to women and work through objective 4. It is noted that an even distribution of targets and achievements was not required in the project document. This flexibility allowed the project to work on what was possible in each of the two targeted countries. This was perhaps one of the most successful implementation strategies of the project which enabled it to navigate the challenges and changing contexts especially in Egypt.

The Way Forward after the Revolution strategy of complimenting the work of the ILO in Cairo was effective in engaging the FEI. The project supported the establishment of the Women in Business Unit at FEI. This helped the FEI review their structure, role and work. The project helped raise awareness of the strategic partners of the ILO.

In Tunisia the project was able to use the opportunity of the presence of a strong tripartism and the strong role of the three partners/constituents. According to project management, in Tunisia there were many champions for gender equality and the project worked well with them. Moreover, due to the relatively enabling environment in Tunisia, the project formed a Project Advisory Committee (PAC) composed on all relevant stakeholders. This was an effective strategy to ensure coordination, complementarity and engagement of all relevant stakeholders in Tunisia. This increased knowledge about project activities on all levels and supported the objectives and approaches of the project.

The project adopted a strong component for capacity building of a wide range of stakeholders and beneficiaries. This was an effective strategy focusing on improving skills, increasing knowledge and building a strong advocacy platform for women's issues. By June 2017, the project's capacity building activities had reached 705 government officials and employers' and workers' representatives.

Capacity building for labour inspectors in Tunisia and women in workers' organizations in Egypt serve as an initial seed that requires further attention. Interviewed beneficiaries on these streams explained that they require additional support to be able to capitalize on the knowledge and skills acquired to improve the situation of other women and play a more active role within their institutions. In Egypt, the training on role of trade unions in achieving gender equality was also delivered to men workers but with a lower percentage of participation.

One of the key interventions of the project in Egypt and Tunisia was the support to women themselves through the establishment and development of Cooperatives. The project managed to establish three cooperatives in Upper Egypt and the Red Sea and supported a fourth cooperative in Upper Egypt.

It was noted that the membership of some cooperatives includes men, and some are women only cooperatives. Whereas this in of itself does not raise concern, the position of women within the mixed cooperatives require some attention from the project. Collaboration and coordination between men and women is highly required and improves the overall standing of women. It is important to ensure however, that women possess a voice within these cooperatives especially in decision making and management of the entire process. This has been an ongoing concern for the project during all stages and some steps were taken to try to address it.

"Do No Harm" is an established sound development practice. Accordingly, in addition to the trainings offered by the project, a closer attention could have been afforded to empowering women and ensuring that they also understand their rights concerning their finances and how to negotiate with male relatives to ensure that they have the ability to manage their resources in an independent and freeway.

Efficiency

The project implemented workplans in a timely fashion and had sound and efficient financial management systems. The outputs of the project justify the costs and the distribution of administrative costs vs project activities is efficient. Project staff were committed and dedicated to the work which enabled the project to implement its activities and deliverables in a timely fashion. The cost and no-cost extensions were useful in allowing the project to continue its activities and follow-up on the various activities, however at certain times some staff members chose to leave the project (which is normal).

Impact and Sustainability

The final evaluation is a good opportunity to review project outcomes, achievements and potential for sustainability of results. The results of the Way Forward after the Revolution have been numerous especially at the strategic level. The project worked systematically with trade unions in Egypt and Tunisia to promote the development of a quota for women in the various bodies of each trade union. All interviewed stakeholders in the two countries expressed satisfaction with project interventions. Workers' and employers' association in both countries were satisfied with the communication and involvement of the project and requested additional support to ensure sustainability and continuation of activities developed through the project. Government representatives interviewed in Egypt and Tunisia appreciated the engagement of the project with the various stakeholders and believed that the project has established

sound strategic relationships with all relevant stakeholders. They praised the well-maintained communication efforts of the project and requested the continuation of activities during the second phase of the project.

Many of the results that the project has supported or achieved are likely to be sustained. These include the established women quotas in EDLC and UGTT which will lead to increased representation of women within these two institutions. In addition, the improved research capacities and dissemination of ILO technical guidelines are likely to have a far-reaching effect on the outcomes of future research on gender and other topics in Egypt and Tunisia.

Main Recommendations and Follow-Up

Recommendation 1: It is recommended that the project management and M&E team uses a three levelled approach (Goal, objectives, outputs,) and develop appropriate indicators for each level to ensure an ease of project management and monitoring. It is a high priority recommendation that Phase II of the project revises the results-framework for the project to ensure logic, coherence and accurate representation of project achievement as soon as possible. Additional funds may be allocated for a consultant to conduct a review of the logical framework. *(Project Management, High Priority, immediate implementation; Medium financial resources required)*

Recommendation 2: Multi-country implementation models are an excellent opportunity for exchange, learning and building solidarity around women's issues and labour rights. It is recommended that the project management and ILO offices capitalises on this opportunity by increasing exchanges and learning between Egypt and Tunisia through more structured study tours, internships and other innovative models. This is a high priority recommendation that will not add extra recourses and need to be considered over the life of the project. *(Project Management, ILO Offices; High Priority, Medium- and Long-Term implementation; Low financial resources implications)*

Recommendation 3: The project team in Tunisia should follow-up the work already conducted with the labour inspectors by providing follow-up training and TOT to the Ministry of Social Affairs in Tunisia. It would also be useful to support the ministry in revising its administrative forms and procedures to ensure the inclusion of gender specific indicators and increase the development of gender data. These activities should be reflected in the workplan of Phase II of the project and budgeted from within the capacity building activities already planned.

(Project Team in Tunisia; Medium Priority, immediate implementation; Low financial resources required)

Recommendation 4: The project team in Tunisia is advised to support the development of a general understanding and synthesize of violence against women in the workplace and consider the advocacy of integrating elements to address within the work of all social partners during the life of the project. This is not likely to require additional resources just a reformulation of existing workplans. *(Project Team in Tunisia; Medium Priority, immediate implementation; Low financial resources required)*

Recommendation 5: The project team in Tunisia should continue to advocate for the adoption of maternity benefits during the life of the project through advocacy and lobbying to ensure the buy-in of all relevant stakeholders in Tunisia. This is not likely to require additional resources just a reformulation of existing workplans. *(Project Team in Tunisia; Medium Priority, immediate implementation; Low financial resources required)*

Recommendation 6: The project team in Egypt is advised to build stronger and more formal relationship with NCW to ensure consistency with national approaches during the life of the project. This is not likely to require additional resources just a reformulation of existing workplans. *(Project Team in Egypt, High Priority, Immediate to Medium-Term implementation, Low financial resources required)*

Recommendation 7: Provide support, through phase 2 or other ILO projects, to the cooperatives in Upper Egypt to ensure sustainability and continuity of intervention. This may require adjustment of budgets and coordination between the different ILO staff members working on similar issues. *(Project Team in Egypt, Medium Priority, Medium- and Long-term implementation, Medium financial resources required)*

Recommendation 8: The project team should strengthen and institutionalize the HR academy within FEI to ensure its continuity. This will require the team to dedicate time and resources to working with FEI. It is also recommended that a strategic plan for workers organizations in Egypt be developed and ensure that work plans are in place that lead to the implementation of this vision. *(Project Team in Egypt, Medium Priority, Medium- and Long-term implementation, Medium financial resources required)*

Recommendation 9: The ILO management in Cairo should increase the relevance of the multi-country model by increasing exchange and learning between the different countries. This should be adopted as a strategy for all multi-country or regional projects and adequate resources should be developed from the conceptualization phases of any project. *(ILO Management Team in Cairo, Medium Priority, Medium- and Long-term implementation, Medium financial resources required)*

II. BACKGROUND

Tunisia and Egypt, despite their differences, have a number of striking similarities on gender related issues – especially regarding the situation for women in the labour market. Regardless of this advancement in the education sector, job creation in the two countries has been rather slow in recent years. The double hit of the global economic crisis and recent revolutions greatly affected women’s employment in Egypt and Tunisia. In addition, the informal sector, which has in recent years grown to represent 30 per cent and 34 per cent of Tunisia and Egypt’s GDP respectively. Also, although entrepreneurship can provide an alternative path to job creation, female entrepreneurship is fairly rare in the two countries. Another general problem is the lack of transparent labour market information.

In response to the changes in Egypt and Tunisia, the International Labour Organisation (ILO) designed and implemented the “Way Forward After the Revolution: Decent Work for Women in Egypt and Tunisia” project. The project started in June 2012 but initiated its activities in January 2013 and was completed (after 5 extensions, including one cost extension) on 31st of March 2018. The project aimed at strengthening women’s position to participate in the labour market in Tunisia and Egypt.

The project was funded by the Ministry of Foreign Affairs of Finland with a budget of USD 3,808,747. The project underwent an independent mid-term evaluation in December 2014. As per ILO guidelines, the project underwent a final independent evaluation. This is the report of findings of the final independent evaluation which was implemented in May 2018.

III. Project Description

The Way Forward After the Revolution is an ILO implemented project. The project responded to a demand among constituents for supporting the promotion of gender at the work place and strengthening of women economic empowerment. The later was implemented through women’s entrepreneurship development, advocating for, and promoting, women’s participation in social dialogue processes and increased involvement of women in trade union structures, including in the leadership of such structures. International labour standards, especially those concerning gender equality was promoted while at the same time women were skilled (on a pilot basis) to increase their chances to enter labour markets and/or occupy better jobs. The results framework is shown in Table 1 below.

The project had an approved budget of €2,500,000 that was complemented by an additional financial contribution of € 622,023 in 2016. The total project budget was hence increased to US\$ 3,808,747. It started on 1st June 2012 and ran until 31st of March 2018.

The project has four immediate objectives as follows:

1. Sensitizing social partners and a wider audience on gender issues and inequalities in the world of work
2. Increasing the capacity of and institutional setting for females to equip them with necessary skills to engage in social dialogue and collective bargaining processes for advancing gender equality, non-discrimination, and increased female representation in trade unions
3. Increasing women’s skills to enhance their employability
4. Capacity building for labour market institutions to better serve women and increase women’s access to these institutions.

Table 1: Results Framework of the project

Objective	Outputs	Indicators
<p>Immediate Objective 1: Social partners in Egypt and Tunisia are in a stronger position to support an increase of women participation in the labour force, enhance their position to defend their rights and participate effectively in social dialogue.</p>	<p>Output 1.1: Built capacity on gender related issues in the government, trade unions and employer’s organizations (including gender audits of these three institutions, training seminars, study tours, dissemination of relevant information, etc.) for women and men</p> <p>Output 1.2 Increased women’s participation in trade unions and employers’ organizations</p> <p>Output 1.3 Increased knowledge of women and the wider public on women’s rights at work</p> <p>Output 1.4 Government officials and labour officers acquire skills to promote and implement international labour standards related to gender equality</p> <p>Output 1.5 Business women and business associations develop services to promote women entrepreneurship and gender equality</p> <p>Output 1.6 Trade unions and government officials advance gender equality within their organizations and in the workplace</p> <p>Output 1.7. Advocacy and awareness campaigns undertaken by social partners on gender equality and women’s work</p>	<p>- % of female participation within trade unions and employers’ organisations at management level and within total membership</p> <p>- Number of changes or new services introduced in the government institutions, trade unions, and employers’ organisations which benefited from the project activities</p> <p>- Number of senior officials and members of employers’ or workers’ organisations trained</p>
<p>Immediate Objective 2. Labour market institutions at the national, regional and local level are better equipped to assist women</p>	<p>Output 2.1. Local WED platforms created and enabled with ILO WED tools</p> <p>Output 2.2 Improved legal environment for women who participate in labour markets</p> <p>Output 2.3 Improved employment policies to reflect the challenges women face in labour markets and increased number of women profiting from employment policies</p> <p>Output 2.4 Relevant ministries and social partners promote and implement the recommendations of the completed WED assessments- in particular access of women’s entrepreneurs to finance is facilitated to trigger inclusive growth</p>	<p>Tripartite recommendations for reform of the policy and legislative environment concerning women’s rights in the labour market are formulated</p>

	Output 2.5 Governmental organisations and/or the private sector undergo internal reforms based on the results of the Participatory Gender Audits (PGA)	
Immediate Objective 3. Women are better equipped to participate in labour markets and find a decent job	<p>Output 3.1 Increased awareness on women rights and career options</p> <p>Output 3.2 Increased entrepreneurial skills for women (250 beneficiaries in each country)</p> <p>Output 3.3 Skills for women improved to facilitate their access to the job market</p> <p>Output 3.4 Modern skills for women improved through increased offers for women in ICT and language knowledge (500 beneficiaries in each country)</p> <p>Output 3.5 Innovative women entrepreneurship projects supported</p> <p>Output 3.6. Up-scale the development of the handicrafts and agricultural women producer groups in Egypt</p> <p>Output 3.7. The National WED action plan piloted in selected regions in Tunisia</p>	<p>Number of women targeted for employment trainings (entrepreneurship and vocational)</p> <p>% of those that are self-employed or who found wage employment</p>
Immediate Objective 4. Capacity building for the national agencies for statistics and other relevant stakeholders (e.g. employment observatories) to produce timely and accurate gender disaggregated data on labour markets and evaluate the impact of employment policies on women's labour market participation	<p>Output 4.1 Capacity building on labour market indicators (2 relevant institutions in each country) with a special focus on gender relevant indicators</p> <p>Output 4.2 Training and technical assistance in conducting surveys, analysing data, and writing reports (statistical agencies in each country) with a special focus on gender relevant statistics</p> <p>Output 4.3 Gender mainstreamed in selected thematic reports</p> <p>Output 4.4 Gender research undertaken in new thematic areas</p> <p>Output 4.5. Knowledge acquired on the impact and solutions of investing in the care economy</p> <p>Output 4.6. Knowledge acquired on the scope and forms of violence at work in Egypt and solutions proposed</p>	<p>Number of government and social partner experts with improved capacity to generate and analyse gender-sensitive data</p> <p>The national knowledge base on gender-sensitive issues is improved with new reports /sections of existing reports produced to tackle women economic empowerment</p> <p>40</p>

The project objectives are founded on the conviction that improving women's labour market position and increasing participation in decent work is a prerequisite for sustained equality, inclusion and democratization in Tunisia and Egypt. The project benefited from the technical backstopping of ILO international experts, within the ILO Cairo team, and technical support from HQs, or at the ITC in Turin.

IV. EVALUATION OBJECTIVES & PURPOSE

According to the TORs, the stated **purpose** of this evaluation is:

1. Give an independent assessment of progress the results achieved by to date of the project across all the outcomes; assessing performance as per the foreseen targets and indicators of achievement at output and outcome levels as well as strategies and implementation modalities chosen; partnership arrangements, constraints and opportunities in implementing the project
2. Provide recommendations for phase II of the project.
3. Document lessons learned and good practices in order to maximize the experience gained

The evaluation **scope** considers the entire project intervention as part of the ILO's wider programme in Egypt and North Africa, from the start of the project to March 2018.

The field work for the evaluation include Cairo, Aswan and Tunis. According to the project documents, project activities took place in two governorates of Egypt Aswan and Red Sea. Due to limitation in time available for the evaluation, it was decided in consultation with project team and evaluation manager that a selection of Aswan will provide a thorough overview of project field activities.

In addition, the **objectives** of this evaluation are to examine and asses the following:

Development effectiveness: The extent to which the development intervention's objectives and intended results are being achieved;

Resource Efficiency: The extent with which resources are economically converted into results, considering potential alternative more cost-effective strategies;

Preliminary Impact: Positive and negative, intended and unintended long-term effects;

Relevance: The extent to which the intervention has met beneficiary requirements, has adapted to the local context as well as to global ILO and donors' policies;

Sustainability: the likelihood of continued long-term positive effects of the project;

Partnerships: The extent to which the project has built synergies with other relevant initiatives by national stakeholders, civil society, and development partners;

Lessons learned: key positive and negative lessons learned through the implementation in view of the upscaling of the project or its replication in other contexts;

Good practice: Specific intervention models that may be verified as constituting good practice for replication and upscaling, on account of their relevance, effectiveness and efficiency;



Policy change: The extent to which the project promotes policy change, in terms of legislative and regulatory action, institutional changes, and public resource allocation.

The **clients** of the evaluation are primarily ILO management (the ILO DWT/CO Cairo, Regional Office for Africa) overseeing the implementation of the project, the key stakeholders involved in the project, and the donor.

The **evaluation questions** are organized using the results-based framework and are intended to provide an assessment of the relevance, effectiveness, efficiency, impact and potential sustainability of the project's interventions. The evaluation questions as stated in the TORs are as follows:

Relevance and validity of design

- How relevant are the project's expected results to the development priorities of the Governments of Egypt and Tunisia, and ILO? How is it integrated within the overall national efforts to achieve decent work for women?
- Is the results framework of the project coherent? (i.e.: do outputs causally link to outcomes, which in turn contribute to the broader development objective of the project? Is the results framework realistic? Do the project's indicators and targets logically fit with the results chain?)
- How well the project complements and fits with other on-going ILO programmes and projects in the countries?
- Has the project document adequately taken into account key risks for the achievement of results? What internal and external factors have influenced the ability of the ILO to meet projected targets, and these been foreseen? Have there been adequate mitigation/corrective measures taken?
- Has the project carried out a proper consultation and involvement of tripartite constituents during planning, implementation and monitoring? How gender issues have been addressed in the project document?

Project efficiency

Project management: Did the project make use of its resources in an efficient manner?

- Has the project put in place adequate monitoring arrangements? Has there been timely troubleshooting? Has the project responded to shifting needs and priorities? If a need for a change to the scope and strategy of the project had arisen, has this been formally completed? Was this gender sensitive?
- How adequate can be considered the project staffing (sufficient, under/over staffed)?
- Has the project designed and kept up to date a comprehensive workplan? Has the project allocated its resources against the realisation of its different outputs? Has it kept track of its financial expenditures? Has the project adequately completed financial revision requirements?
- How well has the project communicated with its target final beneficiaries, direct beneficiaries and intermediaries, government and social partner stakeholders, and the general public?
- Was the project able to deliver services and activities in a timely manner?

Technical quality assurance and support:



- Has there been evidence of efficient collaboration between the project and the backstopping specialists assigned to it?
- Was there complementarity between the project and other ILO projects/interventions in the two countries?
- Have ILO global and regional resources (manuals, technical guidelines etc) been adequately made use of?

Administration and finance:

- Has the project suffered from significant delays in executing administrative procedures (issuing individual or company contracts, procuring goods etc)? Where has been the bottleneck?

Partnerships with other public or development partners relevant initiatives:

- Is there evidence of sufficient coordination? Joint programming? Joint activities?

Project effectiveness against planned outputs

- To what extent the project outputs have been achieved (a percentage of achievement should be provided) against the indicators and targets?
- What is the perception of the key stakeholders of the achieved results? How do key project stakeholders/partners at senior level rate the quality of the key CB and technical assistance provided?
- Do the benefits accrue equally to men and women?
- Provide an analysis on the reasons for achievement or failure of the project outputs.
- Did the project produced results that were not initially foreseen in the project document but contributed to attain its immediate objectives?
- What have been the main outcome-level results achieved by the project against the set indicators and targets?
- Are there expected results for which there is no sufficient evidence of achievement?

Impact and sustainability

- Has the project contributed to knowledge development at regional or global among the ILO or beyond?
- What have been unintended positive and negative effects of the project?
- How effective has the project been in promoting local ownership?
- How likely are the results achieved to be sustained?

Lessons learned and good practices

- What good practices and lessons learned can be evidenced with a view to future replication in other projects or in the project's second phase?

V. EVALUATION METHODOLOGY

The scope of the final evaluation includes a review and assessment of all activities carried out under the project agreement/contract. All activities that have been implemented from project launch through the time of evaluation fieldwork were considered. The evaluation assessed the positive and negative changes produced by the project – intended and



unintended, direct and indirect, as well as any changes in the social and economic environment in the country – as reported by respondents. Performance was assessed based on the OECD-DAC Criteria. More specifically and as specified in the terms of reference the evaluation assessed: relevance and validity of project design; project progress and effectiveness; efficiency; impact orientation and sustainability of the project; and effectiveness of management arrangements.

In addition to a **thorough review of project documents** including project document, progress reports, M&E data, and other relevant documentation, different **stakeholders** provided different types of information:

- **Key informant interviews** were conducted with project managers, to collect information about activities and outputs, the number of beneficiaries, the employed staff, cooperation with key institutions, collection of monitoring data and reporting, as well as any implementation challenges.
- **Focus group discussions** conducted with the project staff informed the team, from another perspective, about the provided services.
- **Focus group discussions or individual interviews** with beneficiaries completed information about the project activities and, to the extent possible, impact to date.

Interview participants were selected based on a set of criteria agreed with ILO during the Inception Phase and presented for discussion before the field mission. Interviews followed protocols and questionnaires presented and agreed upon during the Inception Phase.

Verification and triangulation of data were done through correlation of data obtained from (a) different (groups of) stakeholders, as well as (b) through the different methods employed.

The evaluation fieldwork was qualitative and participatory in nature. Qualitative information was obtained through field visits, interviews and focus groups as appropriate. The participatory nature of the evaluation should contribute to the sense of ownership among stakeholders.

Quantitative data was drawn from project documents including status reports, Technical Progress Reports (TPRs) and Data Tracking Tables, the interim evaluation report, and other reports.

The following principles were applied during the evaluation process:

1. Methods of data collection and stakeholder perspectives will be triangulated to the greatest extent possible.
2. Gender and cultural sensitivity will be integrated in the evaluation approach.
3. Although a consistent approach will be followed in each project site to ensure grounds for a good qualitative analysis, the evaluation will incorporate a degree of flexibility to maintain a sense of ownership of the stakeholders. Additional questions may be posed that are not included in the TOR, while ensuring that key information requirements are met.



Document Review: The evaluator reviewed the following documents before conducting any interviews or field visits.

- Project Document
- Letters of Extension(s)
- Technical progress reports and comments
- Reports on specific project activities
- Training materials
- Strategic framework, M&E, and performance indicators
- Work plans

Interviews with key informants: Interviews were conducted with key program stakeholders (Please See Annex 2 for list of field work schedule)

Fieldwork in Cairo, Aswan and Tunis: The evaluator met and interviewed the project team in Cairo as well as a wide range of project stakeholders in Egypt and Tunisia. The selection of key stakeholders was conducted in close collaboration with the project team. All effort was made to ensure that the evaluator is seeing and visiting places where successes have occurred as well as challenges.

The exact itinerary was determined by the evaluator. Meetings were scheduled in advance of the field visits by the project staff, coordinated by the designated project staff, in accordance with the evaluator's requests.

Following initial discussions with project staff it was noted that Aswan governorate will be an appropriate location to visit as many of the project activities took place in this governorate.

Stakeholder debriefings: The evaluator conducted two debriefing meetings with project staff and ILO management in Cairo to present and discuss initial findings. This meeting served as a validation exercise where feedback on findings was collected to support the report writing process. In addition, two stakeholders' meetings were conducted in Tunis and Cairo with the project partners in both countries.

VI. EVALUATION FINDINGS

6.1 RELEVANCE

6.1.1 *Appropriateness of Project Design*

The Way Forward after the revolution was designed and started its implementation at a time of major changes in Egypt and Tunisia. The project was timely and relevant to the needs and priorities of both countries. The project aimed to prioritise gender in discussions and actions in both countries thus integrating equality and equity in discussions around women and their rights in all aspects of society.

The expected results of the project are also well suited to the objectives and priorities of the International Labour Organisation (ILO). The project theory of change focuses on advancing the rights of women at work which is inherent in the objectives and priorities of the ILO's decent work agenda globally, regionally and in Egypt and Tunisia. The ILO has been addressing gender issues for many years. With the advent of the Arab Spring in 2011, the ILO developed a North Africa Strategy to respond to the events unfolding in the region. The Strategy includes references to gender, social dialogue and youth employment. Gender and youth employment were and continue to be a priority for governments, donors and international organisations in North Africa. The Way Forward after the Revolution embodies several elements of the ILO North Africa Strategy with its focus on strengthening the work of social partners, integrating concepts of equality and representation and women employability, the project is relevant and well suited to the context of its design and implementation in Egypt and Tunisia especially until the end of 2014.

The project is relevant for the work of ACTRAV and ACTEMP in Egypt and Tunisia. For Egypt, the project meets the objectives of ACTRAV due to the nature of the project which promotes inclusivity as a strategy and provision of support to all trade unions. The project also focused on ACTRAV second objective which is the promotion of unity. The project supported the development of joint positions vis a vis women and labour laws in Egypt amongst the three biggest unions. In Tunisia, the advancement of the position of women and inclusion of a quota for women in UGTT is within the objectives of ACTRAV and sits well with the overall ILO strategy.

Concerning employers, the Way Forward after the Revolution is relevant to the objectives of ACTEMP as it aims to promote and improve the work of employers' organizations. The project focused on improving the position of women within FEI and through its work with CNFCE. The project also supported the establishment of learning academies in the two countries, thus increasing the services that the employers' organizations are providing to their constituents in both countries.

The Way Forward after the Revolution has complemented the work of other gender-focused projects in Egypt. According to the program unit in ILO Cairo office, gender is always a cross-cutting theme in all projects especially those focusing on youth employment. As such, the Way Forward for Women was a good opportunity to have within the office a project with a specific women employment and gender to complement the work of other projects in Egypt. The project's focus on improving the work conditions of women and the positioning of women within social partner institutions complemented the work of other ILO supported projects in



Egypt focusing on social dialogue and women employment. The activities of the Way Forward complemented the work of other projects especially concerning the establishment of Cooperatives in Upper Egypt and the Red Sea governorates as well as the improvement of the work modalities of FEI and trade unions by synthesizing them on gender and gender-sensitive policies.

The project responded to the needs of governments in Egypt and Tunisia although it chose to do so in a challenging context after the revolutions in both countries. The project strived to work both at the policy and implementation levels. This was a direct response to the requirements and priorities of the governments of Egypt and Tunisia. There was an urgent need in 2013-2014 to deliver on job creation and hence the focus on working on cooperatives in Egypt and rendering support to women entrepreneurs in Tunisia fits well with the priorities of the governments of both countries.

6.1.2 Coherence of Results Framework

The mid-term review of the Way Forward after the revolution concluded that *“On the surface, “The Way Forward” appears to have weak internal coherence, due to its seemingly divergent targets and approaches in the respective countries. Internally, however, the project actions and objectives are compactly interlaced, although they operate in two distinctly different contexts.”*¹

The mid-term evaluation recommended that the project focus on generating data to prove the fulfilment of the objectives (often referred to in the mid-term evaluation as specific objectives). The mid-term makes reference to specific objective 2.2 calling it “elusive” and “grand policy” warning that in the absence of accurate data it could “form a challenge going into the final months of the project.”²

The final evaluation concurs with the findings of the mid-term evaluation related to the coherence of the results framework as written (how the project has overcome this will be discussed in the following sections of this report). As presented in the project documents, the results framework is ambitious and difficult to measure due to the way in which some of the objectives are formulated. The phrasing of objectives is general and broad and the selected outputs (some read more like objectives) do not always reflect a causality.

For example, immediate objective 2 is written more like an output or expected result “labour market intuitions are better equipped” it is not clear what better equipped means. It could be better equipped programmatically, better equipped financially, better equipped structurally, legally...etc? Outputs 2.1 and 2.4 focus on the development and publication of Women Entrepreneurship Development (WED) studies. Outputs 2.2 and 2.3 are related to the improvement in the employment and labour policies in general. Output 2.5 focuses on improvements in working conditions within institutions and companies because of undergoing gender audits. The selected indicator for the achievement of this results focuses on the development of policy recommendations for the improved legal environment for women whereas the target of this indicator goes back to specifically address the possible outcomes of the WED studies.

¹ Evaluation: “The Way Forward” after the Revolution - Decent Work for Women in Egypt and Tunisia. ILO Evaluations: Evaluation Summary P.2

² Ibid. P. 5



A review of the entire results framework indicates that Immediate objective 3, its outputs, indicators and targets are coherent and well developed. The remaining two immediate objectives (1 and 4) could have used a revision to reflect the actual work carried out by the project.

It is also worth pointing out that immediate objective 2 focusing on WED studies and immediate objective 4 focusing on increasing the knowledge base through capacity building and research are very well connected and should have been merged at mid-term. It is difficult to understand whether the activities and outputs developed and implemented by the project as part of the WED research and subsequent publication and advocacy is part of immediate objective 2 or 4.

The broadness and apparent lack of cohesion in the results framework was discussed with project management during the final evaluation. It was noted that although the results framework was broad, it allowed the project to navigate and adapt to the changing contexts in both Egypt and Tunisia. At so many levels, the broadness of the results framework allowed the project to continue its activities in a logical and coherent way. As noted by the mid-term evaluation, and the findings of the final evaluation concurs, although the results framework as written could indicate a lack of coherence, the implementation of the project itself was coherent, complimentary and well designed.

As the project had five extensions including one cost extension (some short to avoid a gap), it would have been advised to revise the project’s results framework to facilitate project monitoring and management and more importantly to reflect the work and achievements of the project in a cohesive and consistent manner.

The project’s results framework did not specify targets for each country. Rather it chose holistic objectives, outputs and indicators. The contexts in Egypt and Tunisia are different. In Tunisia the project had an enabling environment where working on policy issues was supported and needed. Whereas work at the implementation level was less needed or relevant in Tunisia. The situation in Egypt is the complete opposite.

6.2 PROJECT EFFECTIVENESS

6.2.1 Progress Towards Expected Results

The project developed indicators only for the objectives. It is not always clear whether these indicators are outcome or output level indicators. It is worth pointing out that not all indicators are developed using the standard “SAMRT” approach i.e. specific, available, measurable, relevant and time bound. Table 2 provides an overview of the objectives and the selected indicators with an assessment of achievement.³

Table 2: Progress Towards Indicators

Indicator	Progress	Rational for Assessment
-----------	----------	-------------------------

³ This is an assessment of the indicators as presented in the results framework. As previously discussed, the way in which the objectives and the indicators are formulated make it difficult to capture the achievements of the project. However, the actual outcomes of the project are discussed thoroughly I section 6.4 of this report.



<p>Immediate Objective 1: Social partners in Egypt and Tunisia are in a stronger position to support an increase of women participation in the labour force, enhance their position to defend their rights and participate effectively in social dialogue.</p>		
<p>% of female participation within trade unions and employers' organisations at management level and within total membership</p> <p>Target: 30%</p>	<p>Partially Achieved</p>	<p>Quota adopted within one trade union in Egypt and one trade union in Tunisia. Advocacy work with employers' organisations was initiated but no quota was adopted by FEI or UTICA</p>
<p>Number of changes or new services introduced in the government institutions, trade unions, and employers' organisations which benefited from the project activities</p> <p>Target: 5-7</p>	<p>Achieved</p>	<p>2 HR Academies (1 in Tunisia and 1 in Egypt); EDLC Strategy paper (new change); UTICA quota (new change); Women in Business Unit (new service)</p>
<p>Number of senior officials and members of employers' or workers' organisations trained</p> <p>Target 200-300</p>	<p>Achieved</p>	
<p>Immediate Objective 2: Labour market institutions at the national, regional and local level are better equipped to assist women</p> <p>Tripartite</p>		
<p>Tripartite recommendations for reform of the policy and legislative environment concerning women's rights in the labour market are formulated</p>	<p>Not Achieved</p>	<p>Ground work conducted in the form of the WED studies. According to the project team WED studies included recommendations adopted by the Ministry of Women Affairs in Tunisia and were used as a reference in Egypt for the development of the Women Empowerment strategy and others.</p> <p>While this is noted by the evaluation, the indicator specifically focuses on improvement in the policy and legislative environment affecting women and formulated by the three constituents. This does not apply to the WED studies in both countries (recommendations formulated by government in Egypt and by government and employers only in Tunisia) or the maternity benefits in Tunisia (<i>nor UTICA nor CNFCE attended</i>)</p>



		<i>the tripartite meeting although invited)</i> ⁴
Immediate Objective 3. Women are better equipped to participate in labour markets and find a decent job		
Number of women targeted for employment trainings (entrepreneurship and vocational) Overall Target: 1200->1500 with the extended period Output 3.3 sets the target of 250 women in each country	Partially Achieved	40 women benefited from this training in Tunisia and women engaged 1 cooperatives benefited from employment trainings in Egypt. It is deemed that the indicator was partially achieved because not 250 women were reached in Tunisia as specified in output 3.3
% of those that are self-employed or who found wage employment Target 60%	Cannot be assessed with precision.	According to the project “Most targeted women became self-employed/members of coops with access to a source of revenues.”
Immediate Objective 4. Capacity building for the national agencies for statistics and other relevant stakeholders (e.g. employment observatories) to produce timely and accurate gender disaggregated data on labour markets and evaluate the impact of employment policies on women’s labour market participation		
Number of government and social partner experts with improved capacity to generate and analyse gender-sensitive data Target: 40	Achieved	According to the project “50 (mostly those trained on WED assessment methodology including from Gov. and social partners and research team.
The national knowledge base on gender-sensitive issues is improved with new reports /sections of existing reports produced to tackle women economic empowerment Target: 4	Achieved	2 WED studies; Violence study in Egypt; Maternity Study in Tunisia, study on participation of women in UTICA and study on participation of women in trade unions in Tunisia.

6.2.2 Effectiveness of Implementation Strategies

The project worked both at the policy level through its first two objectives, the implementation level through objective 3 and on the strengthening of the knowledge base related to women and work through objective 4. It is noted that an even distribution of targets

⁴ The project team explained that although a consensus was not necessarily reached, the recommendations were shared and discussed with all partners including both social partners in specific events, meetings and missions.



and achievements was not required in the project document. This flexibility allowed the project to work on what was possible in each of the two targeted countries. This was perhaps one of the most successful implementation strategies of the project which enabled it to navigate the challenges and changing contexts especially in Egypt.

The project officially started in Egypt in January 2013 in a highly volatile political context culminating in massive political changes in June 2013. It is worth noting that Egypt experienced a period of curfew which started in August 2013 and continued until late 2013. This fluid political situation was accompanied by changes in government making it very difficult for the project to systematically work on the policy level in Egypt before 2015 when the situation in the country was more stable. Furthermore, the priorities of the Ministry of Manpower and Migration in Egypt did directly coincide with the objectives of the project. According to project management, MOMM was keen on working with female-headed households and less interested in the wake of the economic crisis following the revolution in Egypt to work on strengthening the operating environment for women's work. In addition, the inception of the project was not suited for collaboration with other women-centred agencies in Egypt such as the National Council of Women (NCW) as it was also a time of many changes within NCW itself.

In response to this situation, the project focused on working on the implementation (objective 3) by engaging in the establishment of cooperatives and training of women within these cooperatives. The project supported the establishment of three cooperatives in Egypt and supported the establishment of a fourth in collaboration with another ILO project in the country. Other challenges experienced by the project in Egypt include the legislative vacuum related to freedom of association and union formation which existed prior to the inception of the project and was concluded by the issuance of law no 123 of year 2017 in December of the same year.

The work in a tripartite fashion in Egypt was very challenging for a number of reasons. On the one hand the ILO Cairo office between 2013 and 2015 had ceased collaboration with the Egyptian Trade Union Federation (ETUF). There was a high level of contention between employers' and workers organisations in the years following the revolution in Egypt. It is worth pointing out that the Federation of Egyptian Industries (FEI) only started collaborating with the ILO in 2014 and required time for the organizations to build trust and partnership. Last but not least the polarisation around independent trade unions was very high and it was hard in the midst of all these changes and conflicts to work in a tripartite approach in Egypt. Hence, the project managed to engage with each social partner independently using gender as a less contentious issues to bring the different stakeholders around a topic that they can agree upon. This proved a successful implementation strategy as the project managed to engage with employers, workers and government represented by NCW in specific activities aiming to bridge the gap in understanding and collaboration between the ILO and the social partners. This strategic decision is applauded by the evaluation which concludes that the development of strategic partnerships with the social partners is the cornerstone for future work on perhaps more difficult topics in the future. A third, and perhaps less evident, challenge that the project experienced in Egypt is the state of the civil society organisations (CSOs). The mid-term evaluation, and the final evaluation concurs, recognised the innovation of the project in working with CSOs in Egypt. Engaging CSOs to promote gender equality and increase female labour force participation is a sound development practice that could lead to sustained results if and when designed and implemented with sustainability in mind.



The Way Forward after the Revolution strategy of complimenting the work of the ILO in Cairo was effective in engaging the FEI. The project supported the establishment of the Women in Business Unit at FEI. This helped the FEI review their structure, role and work. The project helped raise awareness of the strategic partners of the ILO.

According to project management, in Tunisia there were many champions for gender equality and the project worked well with them. Moreover, due to the relatively enabling environment in Tunisia, the project formed a Project Advisory Committee (PAC) composed on all relevant stakeholders. This was an effective strategy to ensure coordination, complementarity and engagement of all relevant stakeholders in Tunisia. This increased knowledge about project activities on all levels and supported the objectives and approaches of the project.

6.2.3 Effectiveness of Capacity building Activities

The project adopted a strong component for capacity building of a wide range of stakeholders and beneficiaries. This was an effective strategy focusing on improving skills, increasing knowledge and building a strong advocacy platform for women's issues. By June 2017, the project's capacity building activities had reached 705 government officials and employers' and workers' representatives.

The project support to the employers' organisations in Egypt and Tunisia resulted in the establishment of training academies which has a double outcome in increasing the services offered by the employers' organisations to their constituents as well as fill an important knowledge and capacity gap for the beneficiaries (labour laws and gender in Egypt, women in management and other topics in Tunisia). The project also provided gender training to labour inspectors in Tunisia which increased knowledge and awareness about gender issues in the work place.

A second stream of capacity building focused on improving the skills and knowledge of women themselves. This was done through the specialised trainings for workers' organisations including leadership trainings in Egypt resulting in several women deciding to run for elections. In addition, the systemised business trainings for the cooperatives has improved the skills of many women and enabled them to engage in the labour market.

The trainings and capacity building offered by the project as part of the development of the WED studies in both countries introduced ILO methods and methodologies to national research entities thus increasing the capacity of agencies to improve their skills. Trained entities in Egypt and Tunisia explained that the trainings were very useful and introduced new methods that they had never used before. The two entities in both countries had positive views of the process although they believed that the WED process overall was too long and in Tunisia, the research team believed that a capacity building in French language would have been more effective especially in light of the high technical nature of the training.

Capacity building for labour inspectors in Tunisia and women in workers' organizations in Egypt serve as an initial seed that requires further attention. Interviewed beneficiaries on these streams explained that they require additional support to be able to capitalize on the knowledge and skills acquired to improve the situation of other women and play a more active role within their institutions. In Egypt, the training on role of trade unions in achieving gender equality was also delivered to men workers but with a lower percentage of participation.



6.2.4 Effectiveness of Business Development Initiatives

One of the key interventions of the project in Egypt and Tunisia was the support to women themselves through the establishment and development of Cooperatives. The project managed to establish three cooperatives in Upper Egypt and the Red Sea and supported a fourth cooperative in Upper Egypt.

The establishment and registration of cooperatives is a complicated process in Egypt. Project management explained that it was not easy to work in Upper Egypt as the project did not have sign a memorandum of cooperation or understanding with national government entities in Egypt. Accordingly, the project had to maintain a low profile due to security concerns as well as the discussions around foreign funding and NGO work in Egypt as a whole. The project adapted to this difficult context by partnering with a local NGO in Aswan which proved to be an effective strategy to implement project activities. However, daily follow-up with NGOs in upper Egypt was also challenging due their capacity and in keeping open channels of communication and in creating linkages and synergies with other entities working with the women.

The gradual approach developed by the project during the development, establishment and support to the cooperatives is effective and has resulted in the establishment and formal registration of the cooperatives in Egypt. The project started off by working with an Aswan based NGO and later increased the capacity building of the members of the cooperatives through business skills training, marketing, product development and others. All these trainings were well-received and highly appreciated by the participants who were interviewed during this evaluation.

It was noted that the membership of some cooperatives includes men, and some are women only cooperatives. Whereas this in of itself does not raise concern, the position of women within the mixed cooperatives require some attention from the project. Collaboration and coordination between men and women is highly required and improves the overall standing of women. It is important to ensure however, that women possess a voice within these cooperatives especially in decision making and management of the entire process.

“Do No Harm” is an established sound development practice. Accordingly, in addition to the trainings offered by the project, a closer attention could have been afforded to empowering women and ensuring that they also understand their rights concerning their finances and how to negotiate with male relatives to ensure that they have the ability to manage their resources in an independent and freeway.

The project team explained that that throughout the design and implementation of this component, women’s voice and empowerment has been a major concern for the project management, that was addressed as follows:

- several meetings and focus group discussions were held with local leaders in order to highlight the importance of women’s participation in activities and in decision-making,
- women’s participation was a requirement in all activities, raised in all training workshops, missions, meetings, etc.
- the diversification of the production including the installation of drying facilities was done for creating opportunities in which women can be more involved compared to work in plantations.



-contacts were initiated with the Ministry of Agriculture at the governorate level to allow for the modification of the cooperative board composition in order to include four women in this board, which was achieved after significant efforts.

This reality reflected the imbalanced gender power relations in the agricultural sector, including the lack of access of women to land ownership as well the risk of having highly productive activities quickly affected by male-domination.

6.3 PROJECT EFFICIENCY

6.3.1 Administration and finance:

The project encountered many challenges and difficulties in implementation resulting from the changes in the operating environment and the context in which it was operating. Nonetheless, the project is commended for not experiencing significant delays in implementation or delivery of activities. All delays noted during the evaluation are normal and are normal in light of the context. Rather, the flexibility of the implementation strategies and the ability of the project to adapt to challenges has enabled it to complete activities and deliverables in a timely fashion. The project had some acceptable delays in finalising some research projects undertaken by partners. However, this is typical of research projects especially in the context of Egypt where approvals for data collection can take an unpredicted period.

The project implemented workplans in a timely fashion and had sound and efficient financial management systems. The outputs of the project justify the costs and the distribution of administrative costs vs project activities is efficient.

6.3.2 Efficiency of Human Resource Management

The Way Forward After the Revolution was a multi-country project implemented in Egypt and Tunisia. The project was managed by a Chief Technical Advisor (CTA) and one national officer in Tunisia. A project assistant was also part of the project team in Egypt. In addition, a National Officer (NO) position was created in 2017 and to provide support to a second project funded by the Embassy of the Netherlands in Cairo. The objectives of the Dutch-funded project were complimentary to those of the Way Forward After the revolution. Accordingly, the NO position provided support to both projects thus increasing the number of staff working on the objectives of the Way Forward with no additional financial costs to the project.

Project staff were committed and dedicated to the work which enabled the project to implement its activities and deliverables in a timely fashion. The cost and no-cost extensions were useful in allowing the project to continue its activities and follow-up on the various activities, however at certain times some staff members chose to leave the project (which is normal). Staff turnover is reasonable and acceptable and indicates a well-established work relation within the project. There were some periods when some positions were vacant (especially in Tunisia). However, this does not seem to have affected the implementation of the project although it did create a vacuum and discontinuation of some activities which some stakeholders mentioned.

The project could be considered slightly understaffed. The project did not start with a full team in Egypt. The CTA carried out many responsibilities herself and national officer in Egypt joined the team in 2017. This has placed a huge burden on the team, although it did not affect implementation per se. The staffing of the project is the same as any single-country project,



i.e. CTA, project coordinator, admin assistant, etc. A certain complexity might come from the fact that there is no country office in Tunisia (the ILO cannot have offices everywhere) and that there thus is no core admin and finance team in Tunis. If the Cairo core team was not involved in the project operations in Tunisia, it would have been done by the Algiers team (with the same layers of complexity).

Staff mobility is not surprising over a period of 5 years. The staff turnover overall was not particularly high. In Egypt, one person left but the project was not affected at all. A problem occurred in Tunisia due the unsuccessful/long recruitment process for the replacement of staff, partly because the staff grades which were not attractive compared to new projects and local scale (this was corrected in the second phase).

The project could have used the support of a CSO expert to limit the challenges that were encountered by the project in working with CSOs in Egypt. This would have supported the sustainability efforts of the project and enabled the project to focus on more rigorous capacity building for CSOs engaged with the project. The project team explained that the ILO structure does not include CSO specialists. Cooperatives fall under the area of the ENTREPRISES specialist and this work was supported by the ENTERPRISE Specialist for North Africa (who left in April 2018.) Nonetheless, the absence of a CSO expert within the structure of the ILO is all the more reason to resort to the expertise of consultants and area experts to help navigate the difficulty of working with CSOs (such as CEFD for this project or others in the future).

Lastly, project did not have a staff member dedicated to monitoring and evaluation. The project maintained a monitoring system for the results framework and reporting was conducted regularly and in a timely fashion with support from the programme unit in ILO Cairo office. According to the project team, this is because the M&E is an independent function, and as for similar ILO projects, this function is filled by the Programming Unit and the presence of a Senior Administrator who fulfilled this role during the implementation period. Most ILO projects do not have indeed an M & E except in case of large projects or if this is a precondition for the donor. In addition, the strong cooperation with the specialists have ensured the quality and pertinence of interventions. However, M&E is a core function of any project and should be independent of project management and implementation to allow for regular review and assessment of project interventions which was rather absent from this project.

6.3.3 Technical quality assurance and support:

The project team received adequate and efficient support from ILO specialists in Cairo. The project coordinated and communicated effectively and efficiently with the workers' and employers' specialists in Cairo. In addition, the project coordinated its activities with the Social Protection specialist in Cairo, ENTREPRISES specialist (who left in April 2018) and the OSH Specialist based in Algiers (ex. GBV at work).

The project also collaborated and enjoyed the support of the gender specialist in Lebanon and received support from the technical departments in Geneva including from the Gender Equality and Diversity Branch and the Women's Entrepreneurship Development programmes in ENTREPRISES. However, due to the multi-country nature of the project a gender specialist



for the sub-region would have rendered more complementarity with other ILO activities in Tunisia. This is not to suggest that the project did not collaborate with other projects in Tunisia. In fact, according to project management collaboration with other projects in Tunisia occurred on many occasions, similarly to other projects (financial literacy manual and TOT, new projects building on the WED- recommendation, support to new project documents on youth and women entrepreneurship). However, the presence of a gender specialist for North Africa would have advanced the gender responsiveness of the office interventions in Tunisia as a whole, including for example for having a more gender responsive Decent Work Country Programmes (However, this is beyond the scope of the project and of this evaluation).

The ILO global and regional resources especially the technical guidelines were adequately used in the implementation of the project. This is especially the case in the design and implementation of the WED studies in both Egypt and Tunisia. Stakeholders engaged in the WED process were particularly satisfied with being introduced to the technical guidelines of the ILO and believed that many of the methodologies introduced through the WED process will enable them to improve their research processes in the future. One of the stakeholders in Tunisia explained that prior to the work of the Way Forward After the Revolution, Tunisia did not have a research agency specialised in conducting and producing gender-specific research which was a gap in knowledge and hence it affected planning in general. The building of the capacities of research institutions in both countries is an efficient way to promote the technical guidelines of the ILO and enable a wider use of these guidelines beyond the project itself.

6.3.4 Partnerships with other public or development partners relevant initiatives:

The project's partnership approaches were efficient and effective. The project partnered with a wide range of stakeholders. Some are the typical ILO partners, and in some cases the project developed new partnerships with relevant stakeholders.

In Egypt, the project worked well and strengthened the partnership with social partners as previously discussed. In addition, the project started and nurtured a working relationship with NCW which would allow for further development of this partnership in the future. The project also worked with various CSOs and business-service providers such as the Industrial Modernisation Center (IMC) to improve the business skills of newly established Cooperatives in Upper Egypt and the Red Sea.

In Tunisia, the project-maintained sound working relationships with the ILO social partners from government, workers and employers' associations. The project also worked with the women at the grass-root level by providing training and capacity development for women working in the medicinal and aromatic plants production.

Throughout its activities with the different stakeholders, the project maintained sound communication at all levels. Meetings and follow-up were carried out in a timely and consistent manner. The establishment of the PAC in Tunisia helped maintain the channels of communication with the project and amongst the stakeholders. Establishing a PAC in Egypt was challenging and proved to be counter-productive due to the political context at the beginning of the project. Hence, individual communication approaches were maintained with all stakeholders to build trust and ensure timely delivery of activities.

The project also focused on increasing collaboration with other UN agencies and with the UN Global Compact, UNFPA, UN WOMEN in Egypt including through the UN GTG. According to



project management the exchanges and collaboration with UN Women and NCW did not translate widely in the current phase (although there are still good punctual examples like the joint press conference with UN Women on the International Women Day 2016), they laid the ground for the major partnership under the second phase (for NCW) and for a new joint project with UN WOMEN, largely built on the exchanges with UN Women that happened during the implementation of the project.

In Tunisia, the project, UN Women and other organizations collaborated in jointly supporting the rural women empowerment strategy of the Ministry of Women Affairs and the plan of action on Women Entrepreneurship Development.

VII. Impact and Sustainability

7.4.1 PROJECT OUTCOMES

The final evaluation is a good opportunity to review project outcomes, achievements and potential for sustainability of results. The results of the Way Forward after the Revolution have been numerous especially at the strategic level. The project worked systematically with trade unions in Egypt and Tunisia to promote the development of a quota for women in the various bodies of each trade union.

In Egypt, and as a direct result of the project activities and interventions, during the general assembly of EDLC, the union has endorsed the establishment of a quota for women which will eventually lead to better representation of women inside the trade union. Furthermore, although ETUF did not adopt a quota, yet discussions with women members of ETUF reveal that as a direct result of the project they believe that they can play a more active role within the union. They explained that they have nominated themselves in the union elections and hope that they can play a much more pronounced role in the future including the lobbying for a women quota inside ETUF.

An unintended outcome of the project, as expressed by interviewed Egyptian unionists during this evaluation, has been an evident rapprochement between some independent and government-supported trade unions in Egypt. Members of ETUF and EDLC interviewed explained that the activities of the project helped them understand the position of each other and develop a common view towards gender equality and women's employability and role within the community. "if we want to work on rights, we must work on all rights" explained a female trade unionist from Egypt. The three Egyptian unions involved in the project, ETUF, EDLC and EFITU also developed a joint position paper on how to support women and women's participation in the labour market.

In Tunisia, one of the biggest and most acclaimed outcome of the project has been the reform of the UGTT statutes which was supported by the project, and the introduction of a quota of 2 seats for women in the higher executive council which was adopted at the general assembly of the UGTT in January 2017. The project supported this outcome through the formulation of the reform agenda and an awareness campaign covering the trade unionists at governorate level, in order to develop the communication strategy for the final stages of adoption. This resulted in the fact that for the first time in the history of the UGTT, a woman finally joined the UGTT Executive Office as Assistant Secretary General for International Relations and two other women joined the thematic committees. It is expected that once the entire reform agenda is implemented at least 3000 women will join different positions within the UGTT.



At the level of employers' organisations, the Way Forward After the Revolution improved the services offered by the associations in Egypt and Tunisia. In Egypt, the project supported the establishment of the Women and Business Unit within the FEI and the establishment of the Gender and HR Academy within the FEI. In Tunisia, the project supported significant changes within the CNFCE (creation of an academy for women entrepreneurs, training of businesswomen provided by the CNFCE through the Academy of Women Entrepreneurs). The project also supported the CNFCE in conducting a strategic planning workshop with the participation of 30 businesswomen to define the way forward for the organization from 2017. The purpose of the workshop was to discuss the situation of the CNFCE its objectives, results and activities for 2017 and future. In addition, 250 labour inspectors in Tunisia were sensitized on gender equality issues and trained on mainstreaming gender in their work through a regional series of training workshops.

The evaluation of the Women Entrepreneurship Development Framework (WED) in Egypt and Tunisia has been published and disseminated. 650 people were trained in different ILO tools on gender equality and WED in both countries (including on professional skills for rural women: Get-Ahead, MyCoop, financial literacy). 50 women were supported in the regions of Tekelsa, Enchaa and Oued Laabid in Tunisia for the enhancement of their production of aromatic and medicinal plants and their marketing skills. In Upper Egypt, through the integrated support that the three cooperatives created in the Bedouin handicrafts and in the medicinal and aromatic plants sectors with the support of the project have been receiving, their production, marketing, and management capacity have been developed.

This support included help with organization, administrative procedures, management, building advanced technical skills, developing branding, packaging, provision access to fairs and exhibitions). The project during the coming phase will continue providing limited but targeted supported to them to help addressing remaining challenges: getting final registration for the Red Sea cooperatives (constraints linked to security considerations by the Government because of the border areas covered); and establishing a smooth and continuous business and production process.

The project invested many resources in building the capacities of different stakeholders on a variety of topics and issues. However, the outcomes of these capacity building efforts are not apparent in project documents. It is not clear to what extent has the membership in the cooperatives impacted the lives of women (financially and otherwise), it is also hard to establish what were the general and specific outcomes of the Gender and HR Academy in Egypt beyond what was recounted by a limited number of academy participants interviewed during this evaluation, the outcomes of the CNFCE supported academy in Tunisia, or how the labour inspectors have started to change their work approaches as a result of the training. This is not to suggest that these activities have not resulted in concrete outcomes, rather that the monitoring system of the project needs to regularly and systematically collect this data to indicate the impact of these interventions.

All interviewed stakeholders in the two countries expressed satisfaction with project interventions. Workers' and employers' association in both countries were satisfied with the communication and involvement of the project and requested additional support to ensure sustainability and continuation of activities developed through the project.

UGTT in Tunisia requested the development of a holistic strategy for interventions. This request is not surprising in light of the structure of the ILO activities in Tunisia. The apparent perception of UGTT about an absence of a holistic strategy concerning workers' association



could be attributed to limited coordination amongst the different projects operating from Tunisia. This may explain why UGTT expressed the need for a strategy for ILO engagement in Tunisia.

Participants in the Gender and Human Resources Academy in Egypt spoke at length about the value added of the academy and its impact on their work. Interviewed beneficiaries believed that the academy helped them improve their work and understand labour laws in a more effective and clear manner. They expressed their desire for more training focused on labour laws and explained that some of their perceptions in relation to women employment and gender in general has been altered as a result of the training.

Government representatives interviewed in Egypt and Tunisia appreciated the engagement of the project with the various stakeholders and believed that the project has established sound strategic relationships with all relevant stakeholders. They praised the well-maintained communication efforts of the project and requested the continuation of activities during the second phase of the project.

7.4.2 POTENTIAL FOR SUSTAINABILITY

The Way Forward After the Revolution did not develop an exit strategy and/or a sustainability plan. This could be due to the fact that the project designed phase II. According to the project team, the decision of a second phase has informally been communicated by the Finnish Government quite in advance (before the cost extension) and there was then no need for an exit strategy. However, in terms of sustainability, the project has tried to develop sustainability plan with the different partners.

Nonetheless, there are many results that the project has supported or achieved that are likely to be sustained. These include the established women quotas in EDLC and UGTT which will lead to increased representation of women within these two institutions. In addition, the improved research capacities and dissemination of ILO technical guidelines are likely to have a far-reaching effect on the outcomes of future research on gender and other topics in Egypt and Tunisia.

The noted outcomes of the Gender and HR Academy in Egypt, in terms of improved understanding of the role of human resources, a better understanding of labour laws and encouragement of women employment are also likely to be sustained as private sector employees become more aware of the importance of these issues in improving staff satisfaction, limiting staff turnover and ultimately increasing production and profitability.

Discussions with FEI and CNFCE indicate that both organisations are interested in continuing the activities of the academies. Both explained that even if the ILO discontinues its funding for these academies, they will try to mobilise resources from other donors or sources to continue the activities of the academies as they found them to be useful and effective.

In terms of improvement in the legal and policy environments, the project needs to focus on building a stronger support network within Egypt and Tunisia within government for the advancement of efforts related to ending violence against women, maternity & paternity leave; and other policy issues that the project addressed. This could be done by increasing the local ownership of the issues. In Egypt, this could be done through the development of a protocol of cooperation with NCW to ensure that the findings of the WED and other legislative amendments required are integrated within the National Strategy on Women in Egypt. While



in Tunisia, a strategy for advocacy needs to be designed to ensure that relevant parties continue to work on maternity benefits.

VIII. CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

The project is relevant for the context it was conceptualised in. The project was timely and complemented other activities of the ILO in Egypt and Tunisia. This complementarity and building on existing partnerships made the project relevant for the ILO strategies as well as the needs of the stakeholders in both countries. The final evaluation concurs with the findings of the mid-term evaluation related to the coherence of the results framework as written. As presented in the project documents, the results framework is ambitious and difficult to measure due to the way in which some of the objectives are formulated. The phrasing of objectives is general and broad and the selected outputs (some read more like objectives) do not always reflect a causality.

The project is considered effective in general. The project adopted a strong component for capacity building of a wide range of stakeholders and beneficiaries. This was an effective strategy focusing on improving skills, increasing knowledge and building a strong advocacy platform for women's issues. By June 2017, the project's capacity building activities had reached 705 government officials and employers' and workers' representatives.

All interviewed stakeholders in the two countries expressed satisfaction with project interventions. Workers' and employers' association in both countries were satisfied with the communication and involvement of the project and requested additional support to ensure sustainability and continuation of activities developed through the project.

Overall this evaluation concludes that the project was relevant, effective and efficient and has resulted in advancement of the ILO agenda and the priorities of the different stakeholders.

Recommendation 1: It is recommended that the project management and M&E team uses a three levelled approach (Goal, objectives, outputs,) and develop appropriate indicators for each level to ensure an ease of project management and monitoring. It is a high priority recommendation that Phase II of the project revises the results-framework for the project to ensure logic, coherence and accurate representation of project achievement as soon as possible. Additional funds may be allocated for a consultant to conduct a review of the logical framework. *(Project Management, High Priority, immediate implementation; Medium financial resources required)*

Recommendation 2: Multi-country implementation models are an excellent opportunity for exchange, learning and building solidarity around women's issues and labour rights. It is recommended that the project management and ILO offices capitalises on this opportunity by increasing exchanges and learning between Egypt and Tunisia through more structured study tours, internships and other innovative models. This is a high priority recommendation that will not add extra recourses and need to be considered over the life of the project. *(Project Management, ILO Offices; High Priority, Medium- and Long-Term implementation; Low financial resources implications)*

Recommendation 3: The project team in Tunisia should follow-up the work already conducted with the labour inspectors by providing follow-up training and TOT to the Ministry of Social



Affairs in Tunisia. It would also be useful to support the ministry in revising its administrative forms and procedures to ensure the inclusion of gender specific indicators and increase the development of gender data. These activities should be reflected in the workplan of Phase II of the project and budgeted from within the capacity building activities already planned.

(Project Team in Tunisia; Medium Priority, immediate implementation; Low financial resources required)

Recommendation 4: The project team in Tunisia is advised to support the development of a general understanding and synthesize of violence against women in the workplace and consider the advocacy of integrating elements to address within the work of all social partners during the life of the project. This is not likely to require additional resources just a reformulation of existing workplans. ***(Project Team in Tunisia; Medium Priority, immediate implementation; Low financial resources required)***

Recommendation 5: The project team in Tunisia should continue to advocate for the adoption of maternity benefits during the life of the project through advocacy and lobbying to ensure the buy-in of all relevant stakeholders in Tunisia. This is not likely to require additional resources just a reformulation of existing workplans. ***(Project Team in Tunisia; Medium Priority, immediate implementation; Low financial resources required)***

Recommendation 6: The project team in Egypt is advised to build stronger and more formal relationship with NCW to ensure consistency with national approaches during the life of the project. This is not likely to require additional resources just a reformulation of existing workplans. ***(Project Team in Egypt, High Priority, Immediate to Medium-Term implementation, Low financial resources required)***

Recommendation 7: Provide support, through phase 2 or other ILO projects, to the cooperatives in Upper Egypt to ensure sustainability and continuity of intervention. This may require adjustment of budgets and coordination between the different ILO staff members working on similar issues. ***(Project Team in Egypt, Medium Priority, Medium- and Long-term implementation, Medium financial resources required)***

Recommendation 8: The project team should strengthen and institutionalize the HR academy within FEI to ensure its continuity. This will require the team to dedicate time and resources to working with FEI. It is also recommended that a strategic plan for workers organizations in Egypt be developed and ensure that work plans are in place that lead to the implementation of this vision. ***(Project Team in Egypt, Medium Priority, Medium- and Long-term implementation, Medium financial resources required)***

Recommendation 9: The ILO management in Cairo should increase the relevance of the multi-country model by increasing exchange and learning between the different countries. This should be adopted as a strategy for all multi-country or regional projects and adequate resources should be developed from the conceptualization phases of any project. ***(ILO Management Team in Cairo, Medium Priority, Medium- and Long-term implementation, Medium financial resources required)***





IX. LESSONS-LEARNED AND GOOD PRACTICES

9.1 GOOD PRACTICES

Good Practice 1: Flexibility of implementation strategies leads to the ability of projects to meet its targets and at times overachieve. This requires the adequate development of relationships amongst the different stakeholders.

Good practice 2: Gender is an enabling topic that if and when used in a none-political way can serve as way to bring together conflicting partners. This enables the building of relations and trust amongst them and paves the way for tackling more contentious issues.

9.2 LESSONS LEARNED

Lesson Learned 1: Monitoring and Evaluation is a core function of any project. The presence of a dedicated officer focusing on this function enables the regular management and adjustment of project interventions leading to more effective implementation strategies and approaches. Using times of change (cost and no cost extensions) as an opportunity to revise logical frameworks and results framework would allow projects to better present outcomes and achievements.

Lesson Learned 2: Multi-Country projects presents a myriad of opportunities for learning, capacity development and building of solidarity amongst like-minded institutions and individuals which could help advance the cause of women employment at the regional level. This opportunity should be capitalised upon in an innovative manner and ensure maximum outcome.

More details on good practices and lessons learnt are provided in the annex 4.

ANNEX 1 Terms of Reference

1. Evaluation Terms of Reference

Final Independent Evaluation of RAF/12/01/FIN

Title of projects being evaluated	The Way Forward After the Revolution - Decent Work for Women in Egypt and Tunisia
TC Code	RAF/12/01/FIN
Administrative Unit responsible for administrating the project	ILO Country Office in Cairo
Technical Unit(s) responsible for backstopping the project	DWT Cairo (Enterprise and skills specialists)
Type of evaluation	Final independent evaluation
Donor	FINLAND

BACKGROUND

Tunisia and Egypt, despite their differences, have a number of striking similarities on gender related issues – especially regarding the situation for women in the labour market. Regardless of this advancement in the education sector, job creation in the two countries has been rather slow in recent years. The double hit of the global economic crisis and recent revolutions greatly affected women’s employment in Egypt and Tunisia. In addition, the informal sector, which has in recent years grown to represent 30 per cent and 34 per cent of Tunisia and Egypt’s GDP respectively. Also, although entrepreneurship can provide an alternative path to job creation, female entrepreneurship is fairly rare in the two countries. Another general problem is the lack of transparent labour market information.

ILO project under review has responded to a demand among constituents for support in promoting gender equality and non-discrimination in the world of work as well as in women economic empowerment including through women’s entrepreneurship development, advocating for, and promoting, women’s participation in social dialogue processes and increased involvement of women in trade union structures, including in the leadership of such structures. International labour standards, especially those concerning gender equality was promoted while at the same time women were skilled (on a pilot basis) to increase their chances to enter labour markets and/or occupy better jobs.

The project has been approved for a budget of USD 3,808,747. It has started on 1st June 2012, and is due to run until 31st March 2018. The project aims at strengthening women’s position to participate in the labour market in Tunisia and Egypt. To achieve this, a four-pronged intervention logic has been applied: (i) Sensitizing social partners and a wider audience on



gender issues and inequalities in the world of work (ii) Increasing the capacity of and institutional setting for females to equip them with necessary skills to engage in social dialogue and collective bargaining processes for advancing gender equality, non-discrimination, and increased female representation in trade unions (iii) Increasing women's skills to enhance their employability (iv) Capacity building for labour market institutions to better serve women and increase women's access to these institutions. The intervention logic is founded on the conviction that improving women's labour market position and increasing participation in decent work is a prerequisite for sustained equality, inclusion and democratization in Tunisia and Egypt. The project benefited from the technical backstopping of ILO international experts, within the ILO Cairo team, at HQs, or at the ITC in Turin.

The results framework⁵ against which the achievements of this project will be evaluated is annexed. This project should be further appraised as part of ILO's wider programme in Egypt and North Africa. In implementing its projects, ILO attempts to ensure coordination, synergies, exchanges of experience and information.

An independent mid-term evaluation was conducted to this project and a final evaluation needs be conducted for the above project. The independent evaluation will be conducted by an external consultant, who will report to the evaluation manager appointed for this purpose at ILO Cairo.

EVALUATION PURPOSE, CLIENTS AND SCOPE

PURPOSE

The evaluation is conducted as per ILO evaluation policy at the end of the project, with the following purpose:

- Give an independent assessment of progress the results achieved by to date of the project across all the outcomes; assessing performance as per the foreseen targets and indicators of achievement at output and outcome levels as well as strategies and implementation modalities chosen; partnership arrangements, constraints and opportunities in implementing the project
- Provide recommendations for Phase II of the project
- Document lessons learned and good practices in order to maximize the experience gained

CLIENTS

This exercise is destined primarily to ILO management (the ILO DWT/CO Cairo, Regional Office for Africa) overseeing the implementation of the project, the key stakeholders involved, and the donor.

SCOPE

The evaluation will consider the entire project intervention as part of the ILO's wider programme in Egypt and North Africa, from the start of the project to March 2018. In preparing its inception report, the evaluator, in consultation with the evaluator manager, may

⁵ Revised version of November 2016



determine whether a sample of localised interventions may be appropriate and sufficient for the evaluation of the project's local involvement. Gender dimension is an important cross-cutting concern throughout the methodology and all deliverables, such as the final report of the evaluation.

EVALUATION CRITERIA AND QUESTIONS

The evaluation will be based on the following OECD/DAC principles and concepts:

- Development effectiveness: The extent to which the development intervention's objectives and intended results are being achieved;
- Resource Efficiency: The extent with which resources are economically converted into results, considering potential alternative more cost-effective strategies;
- Preliminary Impact: Positive and negative, intended and unintended long-term effects;
- Relevance: The extent to which the intervention has met beneficiary requirements, has adapted to the local context as well as to global ILO and donors' policies;
- Sustainability: the likelihood of continued long-term positive effects of the project;
- Partnerships: The extent to which the project has built synergies with other relevant initiatives by national stakeholders, civil society, and development partners;
- Lessons learned : key positive and negative lessons learned through the implementation in view of the upscaling of the project or its replication in other contexts;
- Good practice: Specific intervention models that may be verified as constituting good practice for replication and upscaling, on account of their relevance, effectiveness and efficiency;
- Policy change: The extent to which the project promotes policy change, in terms of legislative and regulatory action, institutional changes, and public resource allocation.

More specifically, the evaluation will answer the key questions below. The narrative will be structured around these specific questions and each question will be addressed. The evaluation questions will be revised and further questions be proposed during the inception phase by the consultant.

Relevance and validity of design

- How relevant are the project's expected results to the development priorities of the Governments of Egypt and Tunisia, and ILO? How is it integrated within the overall national efforts to achieve decent work for women?
- Is the results framework of the project coherent? (i.e.: do outputs causally link to outcomes, which in turn contribute to the broader development objective of the project? Is the results framework realistic? Do the project's indicators and targets logically fit with the results chain?)
- How well the project complements and fits with other on-going ILO programmes and projects in the countries?
- Has the project document adequately taken into account key risks for the achievement of results? What internal and external factors have influenced the ability of the ILO to meet projected targets, and these been foreseen? Have there been adequate mitigation/corrective measures taken?



- Has the project carried out a proper consultation and involvement of tripartite constituents during planning, implementation and monitoring? How gender issues have been addressed in the project document?
- Has the project contributed to knowledge development at regional or global among the ILO or beyond?
- How do key project stakeholders/partners at senior level rate the quality of the key CB and technical assistance provided?
- What have been the main outcome-level results achieved by the project against the set indicators and targets?
- Are there expected results for which there is no sufficient evidence of achievement?
- What have been unintended positive and negative effects of the project?

Project efficiency

- **Project management:** Did the project make use of its resources in an efficient manner?
 - Has the project put in place adequate monitoring arrangements? Has there been timely troubleshooting? Has the project responded to shifting needs and priorities? If a need for a change to the scope and strategy of the project had arisen, has this been formally completed? Was this gender-sensitive?
 - How adequate can be considered the project staffing (sufficient, under/over staffed)?
 - Has the project designed and kept up to date a comprehensive workplan? Has the project *allocated* its resources against the realisation of its different outputs? Has it kept track of its financial expenditures? Has the project adequately completed financial revision requirements?
 - How well has the project communicated with its target final beneficiaries, direct beneficiaries and intermediaries, government and social partner stakeholders, and the general public?
 - Was the project able to deliver services and activities in a timely manner?
- **Technical quality assurance and support:**
 - Has there been evidence of efficient collaboration between the project and the backstopping specialists assigned to it?
 - Was there complementarity between the project and other ILO projects/interventions in the two countries?
 - Have ILO global and regional resources (manuals, technical guidelines etc) been adequately made use of?
- **Administration and finance :**
 - Has the project suffered from significant delays in executing administrative procedures (issuing individual or company contracts, procuring goods etc)? Where has been the bottleneck?
- **Partnerships** with other public or development partners relevant initiatives: Is there evidence of sufficient coordination? Joint programming? Joint activities?

Project effectiveness against planned outputs

- To what extent the project outputs have been achieved (a percentage of achievement should be provided) against the indicators and targets?



- What is the perception of the key stakeholders of the achieved results?
- Do the benefits accrue equally to men and women?
- Provide an analysis on the reasons for achievement or failure of the project outputs.
- Did the project produced results that were not initially foreseen in the project document but contributed to attain its immediate objectives?

Impact and sustainability

- How effective has the project been in promoting local ownership?
- How likely are the results achieved to be sustained?

Lessons learned and good practices

- What good practices and lessons learned can be evidenced with a view to future replication in other projects or in the project's second phase?

Evaluation Methodology

The evaluation will include multiple methods to analyse both quantitative and qualitative data. The evaluation questions will be answered by the evaluator through a desk review of the project documentation (project document, work plans, progress reports, previous evaluations, publications produced and documented deliverables,..., etc), direct bilateral meetings with key stakeholders, participatory focus group sessions and Skype interviews. The evaluation will take place mostly in Cairo, with a one visit to Tunis. The evaluation will comprise the following key steps:

Step 1: Desk review of all relevant documents and preparation of inception report (also see below) for clearance by the evaluation manager.

Step 2: On-site interviews with stakeholders, meetings and focus group discussions with project staff, project beneficiaries, social partners and other key stakeholders. This will include a 10-day site visit to Cairo and Tunis.

Step 3: A debriefing meeting will be led by the evaluator to present and discuss the preliminary findings and conclusions of the evaluation with the project team and ILO Cairo management. This will allow addressing factual errors, clarifying ambiguities or issues of misunderstanding or misinterpretation.

Step 4: The evaluation first draft will be submitted to the evaluation manager, who will share this with key stakeholders, ILO management and the project team. Comments received will be provided to the evaluator for consideration, no later than 1 week after reception of the first draft. The evaluator will present clearly (with a comments log or using track-changes mode on MS Word) how the comments have been addressed in the revised draft. The final draft will be reviewed by the Regional Evaluation Focal person and approved EVAL.

Key stakeholders and sources of information:

ILO
ILO Project Staff based in Cairo
Decent Work Team Specialists;
Project managers of other relevant projects



ILO Director and Programme staff in Cairo

Government:

National Council for Women, Egypt
Ministry of Women and Family Affairs, Tunisia

Social Partners:

Independent trade unions, Egypt
Federation of Egyptian Industrialists, Egypt
Tunisia General Labour Union (UGTT)
National Chamber of Women Entrepreneurs (CNFCE), Tunisia
Tunisia Union of Industry, Trade, and Handicrafts

Others:

NGOs (implementing partners)

Main deliverables

The expected deliverables are:

- a) An inception report, including workplan and evaluation methodology to be submitted in line with the quality and format standards stipulated in EVAL checklist No. 3:

http://www.ilo.org/wcmsp5/groups/public/---ed_mas/---eval/documents/publication/wcms_165972.pdf

- b) A draft evaluation report structured as follows:

- Cover page with key project and evaluation data
- Executive Summary
- Acronyms
- Description of the project
- Purpose, scope and clients of the evaluation
- Methodology
- Clearly identified findings for each criterion
- Conclusions
- Recommendations
- Lessons learned and good practices (Using the ILO Template – see annex)
- Annexes
 - List of persons met and consulted
 - List of meetings conducted

Basically, the draft evaluation report has to be submitted in line with the quality and format standards stipulated in EVAL checklist No. 5:

http://www.ilo.org/wcmsp5/groups/public/---ed_mas/---eval/documents/publication/wcms_165967.pdf

- c) The final evaluation report is also to be submitted in line with the quality and format standards stipulated in EVAL checklist No. 5 as mentioned above.
- d) In addition to the evaluation report, the evaluator will prepare and submit an evaluation summary using the ILO Evaluation Summary template (see annex).



All drafts and final outputs, including supporting documents, analytical reports and raw data should be provided in electronic version compatible with the software Microsoft Word for Windows. Ownership of the data from the evaluation rests solely with the ILO. The copyright of the evaluation report will rest exclusively with the ILO. Use of the data for publication and other presentation can only be made with the agreement of the ILO. Key stakeholders can make appropriate use of the evaluation report in line with the original purpose and with appropriate acknowledgement.

Management arrangements

The evaluator will report to the evaluation manager (Ms. Marwa Salah-Abdou, abdou@ilo.org) and should discuss any technical and methodological matters with the evaluation manager should issues arise. The project team will provide administrative and logistical support as required and including: provision of project documentation, logistics for the field missions, facilitation of contacts and organization of workshops.

Time frame and payment

It is expected that the work will be carried out over a period of 6 weeks, according to the below timetable. Comments on the evaluator’s reports will be provided no later than 5 full working days following their submission to the evaluation manager.

Time flow Chart

	April			May			June		
Recruiting									
Selecting consultant	x	x							
Signing Contract		x	x						
Inception									
Documentation submitted to evaluator		x							
Desk review and initial discussions with eval. manager and project team			x						
Submission and review of inception report				x					
Evaluation work									
Interviews, field visits etc.				x	x				
Initial findings submitted and revised, stakeholders meeting						x	x		
Submission of draft eval report							x		
Review and finalisation								x	

ANNEX 2 Results and M&E framework

XBTC Logical Framework : *The way forward after the revolution - decent work for women in Egypt and Tunisia*

Note: The items in blue are outputs for the extended period

Objectives (or outcomes), outputs, activities	Indicator of achievement	Overall Target
Immediate Objective 1: Social partners in Egypt and Tunisia are in a stronger position to support an increase of women participation in the labour force, enhance their position to defend their rights and participate effectively in social dialogue.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - % of female participation within trade unions and employers organisations at management level and within total membership - Number of changes or new services introduced in the government institutions, trade unions, and employers' organisations which benefited from the project activities - Number of senior officials and members of employers' or workers' organisations trained 	<p>30%</p> <p>5--> 7 with the extended period</p> <p>200 --> 300 with the extended period</p>
Output 1.1: Built capacity on gender related issues in the government, trade unions and employer's organizations (including gender audits of these three institutions, training seminars, study tours, dissemination of relevant information, etc.) for women and men		
Output 1.2 Increased women's participation in trade unions and employers organizations		
Output 1.3 Increased knowledge of women and the wider public on women's rights at work		
Output 1.4 Government officials and labour officers acquire skills to promote and implement international labour standards related to gender equality		
Output 1.5 Business women and business associations develop services to promote women entrepreneurship and gender equality		
Output 1.6 Trade unions and government officials advance gender equality within their organizations and in the workplace		

Output 1.7. Advocacy and awareness campaigns undertaken by social partners on gender equality and women's work		
Immediate Objective 2. Labour market institutions at the national, regional and local level are better equipped to assist women	Tripartite recommendations for reform of the policy and legislative environment concerning women's rights in the labour market are formulated	Recommendations of the Legislative reviews and Assessment of the Women Entrepreneurship Development Framework provided and validated in tripartite meetings the two countries With extended period: These Recommendations promoted and implemented in the two countries
Output 2.1. Local WED platforms created and enabled with ILO WED tools		
Output 2.2 Improved legal environment for women who participate in labour markets		
Output 2.3 Improved employment policies to reflect the challenges women face in labour markets and increased number of women profiting from employment policies		
Output 2.4. Relevant ministries and social partners promote and implement the recommendations of the completed WED assessments- in particular access of women's entrepreneurs to finance is facilitated to trigger inclusive growth		
Output 2.5. Governmental organisations and/or the private sector undergo internal reforms based on the results of the Participatory Gender Audits (PGA)		
Immediate Objective 3. Women are better equipped to participate in labour markets and find a decent job	Number of women targeted for employment trainings (entrepreneurship and vocational)	1200->1500 with the extended period
	% of those that are self-employed or who found wage employment	60%
Output 3.1 Increased awareness on women rights and career options		
Output 3.2 Increased entrepreneurial skills for women (250 beneficiaries in each country)		
Output 3.3 Skills for women improved to facilitate their access to the job market		



Output 3.4 Modern skills for women improved through increased offers for women in ICT and language knowledge (500 beneficiaries in each country)		
Output 3.5 Innovative women entrepreneurship projects supported		
Output 3.6. Up-scale the development of the handicrafts and agricultural women producer groups in Egypt		
Output 3.7. The National WED action plan piloted in selected regions in Tunisia		
Immediate Objective 4. Capacity building for the national agencies for statistics and other relevant stakeholders (eg. employment observatories) to produce timely and accurate gender disaggregated data on labour markets and evaluate the impact of employment policies on women’s labour market participation	Number of government and social partner experts with improved capacity to generate and analyse gender-sensitive data	40
	The national knowledge base on gender-sensitive issues is improved with new reports /sections of existing reports produced to tackle women economic empowerment	2 (4 with the extended period)
Output 4.1 Capacity building on labour market indicators (2 relevant institutions in each country) with a special focus on gender relevant indicators		
Output 4.2 Training and technical assistance in conducting surveys , analyzing data, and writing reports (statistical agencies in each country) with a special focus on gender relevant statistics		
Output 4.3 Gender mainstreamed in selected thematic reports		
Output 4.4 Gender research undertaken in new thematic areas		
Output 4.5. Knowledge acquired on the impact and solutions of investing in the care economy		
Output 4.6. Knowledge acquired on the scope and forms of violence at work in Egypt and solutions proposed		

N.B. The full implementation plan including key activities per output and budget allocation will also be made available to the evaluator.



ANNEX 3 Field Work Schedule

Mission Programme

“The Way forward after the Revolution: Decent Work for Women in Egypt and Tunisia”

Final Independent Evaluation

13 to 25 May 2018

Egypt: 13- 19 May 2018

Time	Activity	Location	Status
Sunday, 13 May 2018			
08: 30	Meeting with Samia Archella, Project Coordinator	ILO Office, Small meeting room	Conf.
09:30	Meeting with Ereny Latif, Programme Assistant	ILO Office, Small meeting room	Conf.
10:00	Meeting with Wafaa Abdel Kader, ILO Workers Activities Specialist	ILO Office	Conf.
11:00	Meeting with Eric Oechslin, ILO Employers Specialist	ILO Office	Conf.
13:00	Meeting with Tarek Tawfik, Deputy Chairman, FEI	FEI	Conf.
13:30	Focus Group with FEI HR and Gender Academy	FEI	Conf.
14:30	Meeting with Dr. Fatma Al Razzaz	FEI	Conf.



15:00	Meeting with Hebatallah Hesham, Coordinator of the Women in Business Unit	FEI	Conf.
16:00	Meeting with Mr. Peter Van Rooij, Director, ILO Cairo	ILO Office	Conf
Monday, 14 May 2018			
09:30	Meeting with Shaymaa Naiim, Head of the Planning Unit, National Council for Women	NCW Nasr City	Conf
12:00	Meeting with Heba Shehata, Programme Assistant		Conf
	Lunch Break		
14:30	Meeting with Luca Fedi, Employment Specialist	ILO office	Conf
15:30	Meeting with Mona Ezzat, Trainer	ILO office	Conf
16:30	Meeting with Mohamed El Fouly Secretary General, UN Global Compact Network Egypt	UNCGE or Pyramisa Hotel	TBC
	Travel to Aswan on MS 90L 14MAY CAIASW 2215 2340	Hotel room booked for two nights at.....	
Tuesday 15 May 2018			
10:00	Meeting with Souhir ElMasry, former head of CEFD	Center for Egyptian Family Development (CEFD) أسوان كورنيش النيل الجزيرة خلف مصنع كوكا كولا، عمارة إستديو محمد منصور،	Conf.



		الدور الثالث (Pronounced AlGozairah) Sohair El Masry: 0128-380-5380	
10:30-12:00	Focus group with Cooperatives beneficiaries	CEFD Focal point/ coordinator Fathy Attallah: 0128-722-3232	Conf.
Wednesday 16 May 2018			
	Back from Aswan on MS 91K 16MAY ASWCAI 0505 0630		Conf.
10:00	Meeting with Pascal Annycke, ILO Social Protection Specialist	ILO Office	Conf
11:30	Meeting with Dr. Magued Osman, Chairman of Baseera	Baseera Mohandessin	Conf.
12:30	Lunch break		
13:30	Meeting with Yasmine El Essawy, Senior Programme Officer	ILO Office	Conf
15:00	Meeting with Ahmed Rizk, EDA	EDA Mohandessin, Gameet El Dewal El Arabeya	Conf
Thursday 17 May 2018			
10:00	Meeting with Mongia Hadfi, former project coordinator in Tunisia.	ALO Dokki, Mesaha square	Conf.
11:30	EDLC		TBC



Tunisia: 20- 25 May 2018

Time	Activity	Location	Status
Sunday 20 May 2018			
	Travel to Tunis		
Monday 21 May 2018			
11:00	Meeting with Hayet Ben Ismail, Ministry of Social Affairs.	Ministère des Affaires sociales	Conf.
14:00	Meeting with Karim Mejri, Numu Consulting	Numu Consulting Imm. Lira - Les Jardins du Lac Av. de la Bourse 1053 Tunis - Tunisia Tel. : + 216 70 015 494 Mob.: +216 29 323 373	Conf.
15:30	Meeting with Imen Houimel, Ministry of Women Affairs	Ministère des Affaires de la femme	Conf.
Tuesday 22 May 2018			
09:00	Meeting with Nawel Tounsi ILO Focal Point in Tunisia and Former Project Coordinator	ILO Tunis Office	TBC
12:00	Meeting Leila Belkhiria Jaber Présidente Chambre Nationale Des Femmes Chefs D'entreprises	CNFCE Cité Administrative - Lot n°7 Cité El Khadhra 1003 Tunis - TUNISIE	Conf.



Time	Activity	Location	Status
14:00	Meeting with Samir Cheffi, UGTT		TBC
Wednesday 23 May 2018			
TBD	Debrief with Team in Cairo		
Thursday 24 May 2018			
TBD	Stakeholders Debrief with Tunisian stakeholders above		
Friday 25 May 2018			
	Return to Cairo		

ANNEX 4 Lessons Learned and Best Practices

ILO Emerging Good Practice Template

Project Title: The Way Forward After the Revolution - Decent Work for Women in Egypt and Tunisia
Project TC/SYMBOL: RAF/12/01/FIN

Name of Evaluator: Nahla Hassan

Date: June 2018

The following emerging good practice has been identified during the course of the evaluation. Further text can be found in the full evaluation report.

GP Element	Text
Brief summary of the good practice (link to project goal or specific deliverable, background, purpose, etc.)	Flexibility of implementation strategies leads to the ability of projects to meet its targets and at times overachieve. This requires the adequate development of relationships amongst the different stakeholders. It also requires adaptability of interventions to suit the context.
Relevant conditions and Context: limitations or advice in terms of applicability and replicability	This is a good practice in post-conflict and fragile states as the developments on the ground can be challenging and require high level of adaptability and flexibility to ensure the ability to deliver results.
Establish a clear cause-effect relationship	Conditions in Egypt made it important for the project to keep a low profile and not sign an MOU with government, resulting in timely project achievements
Indicate measurable impact and targeted beneficiaries	Establishment of three cooperatives in Egypt



Potential for replication and by whom	Can be replicated in post-conflict or fragile states
Upward links to higher ILO Goals (DWCPs, Country Programme Outcomes or ILO's Strategic Programme Framework)	
Other documents or relevant comments	

ILO Emerging Good Practice Template	
Project Title: The Way Forward After the Revolution - Decent Work for Women in Egypt and Tunisia	
Project TC/SYMBOL: RAF/12/01/FIN	
Name of Evaluator: Nahla Hassan	
Date: June 2018	
The following emerging good practice has been identified during the course of the evaluation. Further text can be found in the full evaluation report.	
GP Element	Text
Brief summary of the good practice (link to project goal or specific deliverable, background, purpose, etc.)	Gender is an enabling topic that if and when used in a none-political way can serve as way to bring together conflicting partners. This enables the building of relations and trust amongst them and paves the way for tackling more contentious issues.
Relevant conditions and Context: limitations or	In contexts when social partners are not in agreement and the situation of unions is highly polarized, it is a good



advice in terms of applicability and replicability	practice to focus on working on a none-political topic to bridge the gap between the different social partners and encourage them to adopt joint positions
Establish a clear cause-effect relationship	Focusing on gender allowed the rapprochement between independent and formal unions in Egypt. It allowed for better understanding amongst them.
Indicate measurable impact and targeted beneficiaries	Adoption of a position paper related to gender
Potential for replication and by whom	Can be replicated in situations where social partners are not working well together
Upward links to higher ILO Goals (DWCPs, Country Programme Outcomes or ILO's Strategic Programme Framework)	
Other documents or relevant comments	

ILO Lesson Learned Template

Project Title: The Way Forward After the Revolution; Decent Work for Women in Egypt and Tunisia
Project TC/SYMBOL: RAF/12/01/FIN

Name of Evaluator: Nahla Hassan

Date: June 2018

The following lesson learned has been identified during the course of the evaluation. Further text explaining the lesson may be included in the full evaluation report.



LL Element	Text
Brief description of lesson learned (link to specific action or task)	<p>Monitoring and Evaluation is a core function of any project. The presence of a dedicated officer focusing on this function enables the regular management and adjustment of project interventions leading to more effective implementation strategies and approaches.</p> <p>Using times of change (cost and no cost extensions) as an opportunity to revise logical frameworks and results framework would allow projects to better present outcomes and achievements.</p> <p>A revised M&E framework allows for the adequate presentation of project achievements</p>
Context and any related preconditions	<p>This is a requirement in all projects. A revision of the M&E framework and presence of a dedicated M&E officer per project is sound development practice.</p>
Targeted users / Beneficiaries	<p>Project Management</p>
Challenges /negative lessons - Causal factors	<p>If the project reports only on the M&E framework as written, it shows limited achievements. Although in reality the project has achieved very impressive and strategic outcomes and results that are sustainable. However, the M&E framework does not easily capture this.</p>



Success / Positive Issues - Causal factors	The project tried to adjust the situation by including many details in its narrative reports and also by tweaking some of the results to fit the objectives and targets. The project implementation was coherent, but the M&E framework could be improved.
ILO Administrative Issues (staff, resources, design, implementation)	Staffing Resources Design

ILO Lesson Learned Template

Project Title: The Way Forward After the Revolution; Decent Work for Women in Egypt and Tunisia
Project TC/SYMBOL: RAF/12/01/FIN

Name of Evaluator: Nahla Hassan

Date: June 2018

The following lesson learned has been identified during the course of the evaluation. Further text explaining the lesson may be included in the full evaluation report.

LL Element

Text



Brief description of lesson learned (link to specific action or task)	Multi-Country projects present a myriad of opportunities for learning, capacity development and building of solidarity amongst like-minded institutions and individuals which could help advance the cause of women employment at the regional level. This opportunity should be capitalized upon in an innovative manner and ensure maximum outcome.
Context and any related preconditions	Many ILO projects use a multi-country model/approach. Finding innovative manners to capitalize on the possibility of creating linkages between social partners and other stakeholders at regional and global levels would advance the overall objectives of the ILO.
Targeted users / Beneficiaries	ILO management/Social partners
Challenges /negative lessons - Causal factors	Lost opportunity for learning and engagement as activities were only focused on attending some events. These events were not multi-country joint events. For example, Egypt research entity was invited to attend the launch of a research in Tunisia. A joint training or discussion of opportunities and challenges would have been more beneficial



Success / Positive Issues - Causal factors	Stakeholders in both countries are aware of the activities of the other. Some initial contacts were established.
ILO Administrative Issues (staff, resources, design, implementation)	Resources Design Implementation