



# ILO EVALUATION

<b>Evaluation Title:</b>	COVID-19 Socio-Economic Recovery for Returning Migrants and Host Communities in North West Cambodia
<b>ILO TC/SYMBOL:</b>	KHM/21/02/NZL
<b>Type of Evaluation:</b>	Mid-Term Evaluation
<b>Country:</b>	Cambodia
<b>Date of the evaluation:</b>	December 2022
<b>Name of consultant(s):</b>	Augustus Osei Asare
<b>ILO Administrative Office:</b>	ILO Country Office for Thailand, Cambodia and Lao Peoples Democratic Republic
<b>ILO Technical Backstopping Office:</b>	Bangkok
<b>Date project ends:</b>	August 2023
<b>Donor: country and budget US\$</b>	Government of New Zealand's Ministry of Foreign Affairs and Trade (MFAT) NZD 4,500,000 (USD 3,237,561)
<b>Evaluation Focal Person:</b>	Eav Kong, Project Manager
<b>Key Words:</b>	Employment Creation, Marginalized Groups; Poverty Alleviation; Employment Intensive Approaches; external and internal returning migrants; local entrepreneurs; Vocational Technical Educational Training (TVET).

This evaluation has been conducted according to ILO's evaluation policies and procedures. It has not been professionally edited, but has undergone quality control by the ILO Project Team.

## Table of Contents

Acronyms.....	iii
1. Executive Summary.....	1
2. Introduction and Background.....	5
3. Project background.....	5
3.1 Project Description.....	5
3.2 Project Context .....	5
3.3 Program Strategy.....	7
3.4 Program Management .....	7
4. Independent Mid-Term Evaluation .....	7
4.1 Evaluation Purpose.....	7
4.2 Evaluation Methodology .....	7
4.3 Limitations of the Evaluation.....	9
5. Key Evaluation Findings .....	10
5.1 Relevance .....	10
5.2 Project Effectiveness .....	13
5.3 Efficiency of Resource Use.....	20
5.4 Impact Orientation .....	24
5.5 Sustainability.....	26
5.6 Summary of Key Findings.....	27
6. Key Lessons Learned .....	28
7. Key Conclusions and Recommendations.....	29
7.1 Key Conclusions .....	30
7.2 Key Recommendations.....	30
Annex 1 – Evaluation Terms of Reference.....	32
Annex 2: Evaluation criteria and questions .....	38
Annex 3: In-Country Mission Schedule .....	41
Annex 4 - List of People Met (In-Person and Virtual) .....	44
Annex 5 – Documents Consulted and Reviewed .....	45
Annex 6: Summary of Evaluation Matrix Status based on Project’s Results Framework .....	46

## Acronyms

ADB	Asian Development Bank
ASC	Activity Steering Committee
BIT	Battambang Institute of Technology
CBED- SBO	Community-Based Enterprise Development - Small Business Operators
CO	Country Office
COVID-19	Coronavirus Disease
DWCP	Decent Work Country Programme
EHT	École d'Hôtellerie et de Tourisme Paul Dubrule
EIIP	Employment-Intensive Investment Programme
EVAL	EVALUATION (ILO Evaluation office)
FGD	Focus Group Discussion
GDP	Gross Domestic Product
GN	Guidance Note
HQ	Headquarters
ITI	Industrial Technical Institute
ILO	International Labour Organisation
IRIS	Integrated Resource Information System
KIIs	Key Informant Interviews
M&E	Monitoring and Evaluation
MFAT	Ministry of Foreign Affairs and Trade
Mol	Ministry of Interior
MoLVT	Ministry of Labour and Vocational Training
MoT	Ministry of Tourism
MRD	Ministry of Rural Development
MSMEs	Micro Small and Medium Enterprises
MTE	Mid Term Evaluation
NPIA	National Polytechnic Institute of Angkor
NPIC	National Polytechnic Institute of Cambodia
NVIB	National Vocation Institute of Battambang
OSH	Occupational Safety and Health
PSE	Pour un Sourire d' Enfant
RF	Results Framework
RGC	Royal Government of Cambodia
ROAP	Regional Office for Asia-Pacific
SDGs	Sustainable Development Goals
SMEs	Small and Medium Enterprises
TA	Technical Assistance
ToR	Terms of Reference
TVET	Technical Vocation Education and Training
UNDAF	United Nations Development Assistance Framework
UNDP	United Nations Development Programme
USD	United States Dollar
WASH	Water Sanitation and Hygiene
WBS	Work Breakdown System

# 1. Executive Summary

## **Background and Context**

The COVID-19 socio-economic recovery for returning migrants and host communities in North West Cambodia Project hereafter referred to as '*the Project*' is funded by the Government of New Zealand's (GoNZ) Ministry of Foreign Affairs and Trade (MFAT) and implemented by the International Labour Organization (ILO) through the Ministry of Interior and the Ministry of Labour and Vocational Training. The project's main focus is to mitigate the economic impact of the COVID-19 pandemic to remittance-dependent migrants and vulnerable households in communities within Siem Reap and Battambang Provinces. This is to be realised through the creation of short to medium term jobs through the application of employment intensive approaches (EIAs) in infrastructure works, institutional capacity development and providing skills to these remittance-dependent migrants and vulnerable households.

The Project is being managed through a developed logic and Results framework with an overall goal of "COVID 19 socio-economic recovery for returning migrants and host communities in North West Cambodia". The goal statement is supported by a medium-term outcome: '***Paid employment schemes in construction and maintenance of social and economic infrastructure in remittance-dependent communities.***' Two short-term outcomes to be realised from the project with related outputs are:

Immediate Outcome (1): Vulnerable households provided short-term employment with two outputs namely  
(i) Labour-intensive construction/rehabilitation of rural village infrastructure;  
(ii) Improved local capacity to safely implement inclusive and sustainable public works; and

Immediate Outcome (2): Returning migrants and workers access TVET programmes; with two outputs:  
(iii) Development and delivery of online/blended vocational training; and  
(iv) Capacity building of public and private TVET institutions in developing and delivering blended training.

**Project Strategy:** The project strategy is targeted on COVID-19 recovery interventions that provide short-term income support through the participation of the most vulnerable and affected groups in employment intensive cash for work activities in infrastructure works, as well as through reskilling and upskilling. Another element of the Project's strategy is assisting vulnerable Micro, Small and Medium Enterprises (MSMEs) affected by COVID-19 to reinforce and improve their capacities.

**Evaluation Scope:** The primary purpose of the mid-term evaluation was to evaluate the achievement and progress of the Project against its objectives and targets. Furthermore, it provides the opportunity to identify the lessons learned and make recommendations that will guide the implementation of possible extension of the current project phase or future projects.

**Evaluation Methodology:** The evaluation applied mixed-methods, analysing both quantitative and qualitative data through desk reviews; an in-country mission from 25 November to 4 December 2022; interviews and group discussions with key informants and stakeholders from the Project, Mol, MoLVT, MFAT and other relevant RGC agencies; synthesis and analysis of other secondary data sources available through the Project and integrated gender equality and other non-discrimination issues as a cross-cutting concern throughout its methodology and all deliverables. In addressing the ILO evaluation criteria, the evaluation focused on the following key questions:

**Relevance:** The extent to which the objectives of the project remain relevant to current government development ambitions; equally, how the project contributes to the development goals of the UN and ILO, and finally the needs of people in Cambodia;

**Effectiveness:** Assess the effectiveness of the project implementation strategy in terms of timely delivery of the infrastructure works, employment generation, and the development and conduct of training; progress of outputs so far on infrastructure works, job creation and training delivery - and projections of outputs until the scheduled end date of the project;

**Efficiency:** The ability to mobilise project resources, logistical support and timely commencement of project activities; the efficiency of team, size and composition, mobilisation, adequacy of competencies of TA team members; the extent to which the project has managed to build effective working relations with relevant counterpart organisations at central and local levels; whether the contracting modalities, choice

of technology and work methods resulted in timely, cost-efficient and quality works and training delivery; **Impact and sustainability:** How the project infrastructure works contributed to climate resilience; the impact from improved local roads on connectivity, travel time and costs, and reliability during the rainy season and more extreme weather conditions, how and the number of households that benefited from (i) the jobs offered through the infrastructure works, (ii) improved access and (iii) the vocational training opportunities.

### **Main Findings and Conclusions**

**Relevance and Strategic Fit:** The overall strategic direction of the project outlined in key planning, implantation and management documents is consistent with the strategies and priorities affirmed by the RGC, the UN and the ILO. The project reinforces the RGC's efforts to mitigate the adverse impact of COVID-19, rehabilitate/maintain its rural infrastructure and enhance skills development of remittance-dependent migrants and vulnerable households in communities.

**Project Progress and Effectiveness:** The Project is effective in that planned activities were implemented and results were on schedule in some cases. However, achievement was not equally distributed across the results framework with some under-achievement in key areas, often due to external and extenuating circumstances outside the control of the Project.

**Efficiency of Resource Use:** The Project's resources were found to be allocated strategically and their utilisation to be fairly efficient, transparent and prudent to achieve defined outcomes. However, the project was delayed during the start phase due to COVID-19 related lockdowns and travel restrictions across the country in 2021 affecting the preparations for the infrastructure component. The difficulty of initially accessing ILO's IRIS as a fundamental tool for processing procurement and other administrative tasks in ILO operations also resulted in delays of all procurement including the preparation of purchase orders for goods and services which had to be processed at the ILO offices in Phnom Penh and Bangkok. The project now has full access to IRIS and staff has been trained in its use. This has resulted in streamlining administrative and finance processes and increased efficiency and timeliness of operations and in particular the preparation of civil work tenders.

**Effectiveness of Management Arrangements:** Overall the project team has sufficient skills and experience to implement and achieve desired outcomes. The management arrangement of the project was found to have been quite effective including the hosting of the ILO project team in the two COVID-19 affected provinces of Siem Reap and Battambang Provinces; having in place a PSC comprising key stakeholders in each province; and having technical backstopping support from the ILO Country Director the EIIP Senior Specialist and the Skills and Employability Specialist respectively (in ILO CO and ROAP in Bangkok). The Project monitoring and evaluation (M&E) system is in place and was found to be working fairly well, and has been producing and disseminating regular reporting of physical progress at work sites, quarterly, and bi-annual project progress reports on a regular and timely basis. At the works site level, daily muster rolls are prepared by the Community Maintenance Group (CMG) leader and civil work contractor site supervisors, weekly site progress reports are prepared by CMG leader (assisted by the ILO site technician) and civil work contractor's supervisors, monthly report are submitted by the ILO project engineer and consolidated by the Project Manager. Templates of the Muster roll, Daily and weekly report and Monthly reports are in place and being used. The team has also been sharing relevant information with relevant national partners in a fairly effective manner through various fora including workshops, and the ILO website among others. However, the project's M&E system and its RF will need to be updated to include baseline data and mainstreaming of the project's M&E system with that of RGC's outcome-based approach, should the project be extended.

**Impact Orientation and Sustainability:** The ILO team has so far provided significant inputs towards impact and sustainability by way of employment creation, skills development and capacity building (through training, seminars, workshops and study tours, among others). Notwithstanding the short-term employment and training nature of project design (which was meant to be the case) some of its elements that needed attention and were reviewed to create the potential for promoting sustainability included: (i) Continued capacity building of MoI and MoLVT to adopt developed systems and apply employment-intensive methods in infrastructure works, as well as skills training for future employability; (ii) The continued political will of the Cambodian Government in support of project ideals and (iii) *Stakeholder involvement* at all levels for ownership.

## **Key Conclusions**

The Project has a sound rationale and internal consistency of project inputs, outputs and outcomes, management structure and processes to successfully complete the project. At the operational level the main challenges have been the external human and natural factors leading to delays. Key lesson learned is that in times of crisis, such as during the lockdowns in 2021, it is also important for the ILO's Administrative and Finance to reassess some practices to allow for timely delivery of project mobilisation activities. The Project has the systems, processes and resilience to adapt to mainstream into government systems but it requires additional time to complete these activities.

The overall strategic intent and focus of the Project remains valid. The Project was designed with the intention not only to provide short-term employment through rural infrastructure and skills development but also to strengthen the institutional arrangements around which skills development and rural infrastructure works are prioritised, planned and supported. The approach remains consistent with RGC's priorities.

The Project has made solid progress towards the achievement of key outputs and outcomes. The initial design presented clear and tangible outputs linked to defined outcomes. Progress was sound despite a number of key implementation challenges.

The project resources were allocated strategically and effectively to achieve defined outputs and outcomes.

Management arrangements were sound. The management structure was appropriate for the scope of work. Much of the decision-making power and leadership was vested in the Project Manager's role. The abrupt resignation of the former Project Manager momentarily stalled the progress momentum. It is expected that the procurement hiccups caused by the late access to IRIS is not likely to be repeated.

The Project is well positioned to provide short to medium term solutions. Consistent and conscientious review of current project strategies, policies, documents and approaches to work are actively encouraged so as to ensure the gains made are continued and that the project retains its flexible and responsive nature to meet the developing priorities of the RGC.

## **Key Recommendations**

The following are the key recommendations:

1. Employment-intensive programs such as this Project can support rural population's economic recovery from impact of sudden pandemics (e.g., COVID-19) and to be used in a regular development context to improve skills and livelihoods in a post-pandemic scenario. In this context, this project is a highly suitable platform to continue into a possible Phase 2 - to support Cambodia's economic recovery through the application of Employment Intensive Approaches (EIA) work methods and Local Resource-Based Technology<sup>1</sup> (LRBT) that generate new employment and income earning opportunities as well as skills for vulnerable and returning migrant women and men across Cambodia.
2. Green/digital transformation and Blended TVET Transformation including eRPL is very new in Cambodia. As capacity development support is a long-term process which cannot be realised in the current Project phase of less than 2 years of effective implementation, it is imperative that the Skills and capacity development component is continued to ensure that the relevant ministries and TVET institutions have sufficient capacity to continue functioning without further external support.
3. The readily available New Zealand donor-funding as well as the application of ILO's well-established approaches and procedures contributed to the smooth running of the project. In a possible Phase 2, it is suggested that some targeted technical assistance be provided to promote more preventive maintenance on already improved commune roads. This type of work produces more medium to long-

---

<sup>1</sup> **Local Resource Based Technology (LRBT)**- Comprises work methods and technologies where the use of local resources and local labour is favoured. This approach is to employ as many people as possible from the vicinity of the project. Local capacities and materials are used to the greatest possible, but without adversely affecting the costs, duration and quality of the works. Appropriate light equipment is used for support activities and works carried out with the above resources.

term employment and also protects past investments. In terms of managing a rural road network, it is also the best use of available funds.

4. As there appears to be no road inventory and condition assessment data to ascertain the conditions of the road network of the communes, it would be useful in future support to the Mol and PDRD to introduce a road asset management system.
5. The Project, Mol/PDRD and MoLVT to consider strategies to further strengthen the governance arrangements of the Project through the two established PSCs in the two Project regions.
6. The project should in future projects, promote project impact prospects of interventions through: support to Mol towards enhancing impact of project activities (e.g. by integrating and strengthening linkages with private sector actors; supporting artisanship development; promoting sustainable linkages with financial service providers; institutionalising training of EIA methods through the TVETs,) so as to create longer term work opportunities and promote sustainable livelihoods and undertaking relevant impact studies.
7. The project has proven that EIIP approaches remain relevant in times of crisis. The experience also shows that there is still high interest in local employment opportunities among poor households in rural areas. The mainstay and often the only employer in rural areas is agriculture, however such jobs are highly seasonal and only for short periods. Most other jobs are located in urban areas or overseas. The conclusion would therefore be that this type of EIA work continues to be relevant both in times of crisis as well as in “normal” years. It is also important to bear in mind that crisis years are more frequent in Cambodia than elsewhere.

## 2. Introduction and Background

This report outlines the approach and methodology in conducting an internal Mid-Term Evaluation (MTE) of the project on COVID-19 socio-economic recovery for returning migrants and host communities in North West Cambodia hereafter referred to as 'the Project'. The Project is being managed by the ILO through the Ministry of Interior (MoI), the Ministry of Labour and Vocational Training (MOLVT) and funded by New Zealand's Ministry of Foreign Affairs and Trade (MFAT). The current phase of the project originally covered the period from 1<sup>st</sup> April 2021 to 31 March 2023 but has now been extended by five months with no cost changes to 31 August 2023.

The project's main focus is to mitigate the economic impact of the COVID-19 pandemic to remittance-dependent migrants and vulnerable households in communities within Siem Reap and Battambang provinces. This is to be realised from the creation of short to medium term jobs through the application of EIA in infrastructure works and providing skills to these remittance-dependent migrants and vulnerable households in communities.

The main purpose of this mid-term evaluation is to promote accountability to the ILO, key Government of Cambodia stakeholders, the Government of New Zealand's Ministry of Foreign Affairs and Trade (MFAT) and to enhance learning within the ILO and key stakeholders. The findings will be used to improve the design for possible project continuity beyond the current phase and implementation of similar projects in the future.

## 3. Project background

### 3.1 Project Description

The COVID-19 pandemic has had an immediate and sudden impact on all countries. Cambodia has been no exception. Although the effect has been relatively limited compared to other countries, the socio-economic impact of COVID-19 outbreak has been significant, with a disproportionate negative impact on the returning migrant workers, the poor, and vulnerable households in rural communities. The Project was formulated to provide much needed immediate employment opportunities and value-add to complement other interventions for COVID-19 economic recovery.

About 2,500 work opportunities and 60,000 workdays are expected to be created by the project through the implementation of employment-intensive rural infrastructure works involving water, sanitation, hygiene (WASH) facilities, flood protection, drainage, access roads, etc. This work is also expected to improve local community livelihoods and climate resilience. In addition, Technical and Vocational Education and Training (TVET) training (in-person and online), is being developed and delivered to trainee beneficiaries in line with the labour market demands for the relevant construction skills and in other sectors. The project's anticipated 3,000 trainee beneficiaries is expected to boost the future employability of the labour force of returning migrants and workers from vulnerable households.

The project covers Kaos Kralo and Rukhah Kiri districts in Battambang Province and Puok and Angkor Chum districts in Siem Reap Province. The main target beneficiaries include (i) external and internal returning migrants; (ii) families of returning migrants; (iii) vulnerable households who have lost their work income; and (v) local entrepreneurs involved in infrastructure works.

### 3.2 Project Context

Although the COVID-19 pandemic impact has been limited in Cambodia, the country is facing an unprecedented socio-economic crisis. The ADB estimated that more than 390,000 workers lost their jobs in 2020 and more than 100,000 legal migrant workers returned from Thailand (49 percent women). A significant portion of returning migrants are from Siem Reap and Battambang Provinces, which were also badly affected by floods in October 2019. These provinces are also receiving numerous returning internal migrants who lost their jobs in the hospitality, construction and garment sectors (45,000 in hospitality<sup>1</sup>,



150,000 in garments<sup>2</sup> and 90,000 in construction). These three sectors represent 55 percent of the GDP of Cambodia. Those who remain employed have furthermore encountered declines in income - 56.4 percent for those in the hospitality sector, 36.8 percent for the construction sector and 29.8 percent for the garment sector.<sup>3</sup> Many households in Siem Reap and Battambang provinces depend on remittances from their internal or external migrant household members, putting even more pressure on provinces with one of the highest levels of poverty (28.8 percent and 24.8 percent in Siem Reap and Battambang, respectively<sup>7</sup>). Unemployment and poverty are also expected to rise, affecting certain groups more so than others.

Informality continues to affect the majority of workers and limits their opportunities to access decent work and learning opportunities. Technological advancements, climate change, migration, demographic change and many other changes not only imply that today's skills may not match the jobs of tomorrow but also that newly acquired skills quickly become obsolete. Skills recognition and utilisation across borders for migrants and returning migrants is thus particularly crucial.

The COVID-19 pandemic has revealed the vulnerability and necessity of skills and lifelong learning systems, including Technical and Vocational Education and Training (TVET) providers that were forced to close. In a short span of time, TVET systems were challenged to move to virtual and blended learning modalities, which in many cases were not well designed or implemented<sup>2</sup>. To tackle these challenges, ILO and the Ministry of Labour and Vocational Training (MoLVT) have been cooperating since the beginning of the COVID-19 crisis to support the digital transformation of TVET at both policy and operational levels. Returning migrants to Siem Reap and Battambang Provinces enter into a fragile socio-economic environment<sup>3</sup>. The UN estimates that poverty in Cambodia will almost double to about 17.6 percent and unemployment will rise nearly seven-fold<sup>4</sup> – developments that will more significantly affect the two targeted provinces.

While many retrenched workers are returning to their homes in rural areas, these communities face additional livelihood challenges such as a lack of potable water, sanitation and drainage, and road connections and irrigation structures in poor condition. These conditions are aggravated during the rainy season when the prevailing flat terrain is flooded. The Project area is affected by cyclical patterns of torrential rain during which villages and infrastructure are inundated by surface water. Creating jobs through infrastructure development, as well as climate-proofing these and existing assets and facilities, will also have a long-term impact that improves the living conditions of rural households.

The above-summarised challenges within the socio-economic landscape of Cambodia and many others as outlined in the Project's implementation plan, call for strategically targeted recovery interventions that provide short-term income support through the participation of the most vulnerable and affected groups in cash for work activities in infrastructure works, as well as through reskilling and upskilling. Assisting vulnerable MSMEs affected by COVID-19 to reinforce and improve their coping strategies is another element of the project's strategy. Earlier ILO projects have demonstrated the benefits of supporting crisis-affected communities. The COVID-19 pandemic makes it even more important to provide such support to mitigate the risks of poor and vulnerable people reverting to undesirable coping strategies that may disrupt social cohesion. Underpinning the importance of national policies, strategies and commitments is the alignment to international standards and outcomes, such as the Sustainable Development Goals (SDG's).

---

<sup>2</sup> The difficulty for young people, students, women and most vulnerable workers to access online education (more than 60,000 TVET students had to stop their education) and safe working conditions during the COVID-19 19 demonstrated the urgency of increased attention by Cambodian institutions and international development partners in boosting digitisation and implementing occupational safety and health standards.

<sup>3</sup> Cambodia is considered a major country of origin for migrants, with over 700,000 living abroad in 2019 (UNDESA).  
[https://www.ilo.org/wcmsp5/groups/public/---asia/---ro-bangkok/---sro-bangkok/documents/briefingnote/wcms\\_752836.pdf](https://www.ilo.org/wcmsp5/groups/public/---asia/---ro-bangkok/---sro-bangkok/documents/briefingnote/wcms_752836.pdf)

<sup>4</sup> UNDP, October 2020

### 3.3 Program Strategy

The project strategy targets COVID-19 recovery interventions that provide short-term income support through the participation of the most vulnerable and affected groups in employment intensive cash for work activities in infrastructure works and long-term support through reskilling and upskilling. Another element of the Project's strategy is assisting vulnerable MSMEs affected by COVID-19 to reinforce and improve their capacities.

### 3.4 Program Management

The Project is managed by an experienced International ILO Project Manager responsible for overall management and technical implementation. He is supported by a National Skills Development Coordinator and his Assistant, two national engineers, two national technicians, a financial and administration assistant, who are all technically qualified, committed to project work and with a high team work spirit.

## 4. Independent Mid-Term Evaluation

### 4.1 Evaluation Purpose

The purpose of this mid-term evaluation was to review progress against the expected project deliverables and outcomes and to propose any course of correction for the project's final year. In so doing, it identified the achievements, good practices and lessons learned from the project.

The evaluation applied ILO's evaluation criteria looking at project relevance, effectiveness, efficiency, impact and sustainability. It identified and assessed significant contributions and potential impact (social, economic, and environmental) of the project as per the results framework. The following areas of achievements and impact were explored:

- (i) generation of new job opportunities with decent conditions of employment, resulting from the infrastructure works (improved livelihoods, OSH, conditions of employment, wages, etc.)
- (ii) all-weather access for rural communities to social services including schools and health care as well as markets and other economic activities (travel time and costs, regularity, climate resilience, etc.)
- (iii) Improved vocational skills and employability resulting from the project training component.

The evaluation also provides forward-looking recommendations that identify good practices in the context of rural infrastructure works, skills development and green jobs creation. It outlines approaches that seem to work well with government, private sector and local communities, what can be done better and any insights to overcoming particular challenges.

While this project was conceived as an emergency response to the negative impact of the COVID-19 pandemic, it was worth exploring how ILO support of this nature can be used in a regular development context to improve skills and livelihoods in a post-pandemic scenario. In this context, it was useful assessing the overall needs for this type of support and how it can best be provided in the future. Finally, it was worthwhile exploring whether there are particular activities that would benefit from further attention in future Projects.

### 4.2 Evaluation Methodology

The evaluation applied mixed-methods, analysing both quantitative and qualitative data through desk reviews; an in-country mission; interviews and group discussions with key informants and stakeholders from the Project, ILO, MFAT, MoI, MoLVT, MFAT and other relevant RGC agencies; synthesis and analysis of other secondary data sources available through the Project and integrated gender equality and other non-discrimination issues as a cross-cutting concern throughout its methodology and all deliverables. The evaluation adhered to ILO Guidelines for the completion of evaluation. In addressing the ILO

evaluation guidelines, the evaluation focused on the following key evaluation criteria and questions as outlined in Table 1 below:

*Table 1: Key Evaluation Questions and Criteria*

Evaluation Criteria	Primary Questions	Summary of Key Evaluation Questions
<b>Relevance and Strategic Fit</b>	Is the Project doing the right thing?	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. To what extent do project goals remain relevant to current government development ambitions? Equally, how does the project contribute to the development goals of the UN and the ILO, and finally the needs of people in Cambodia?</li> <li>2. What was the rationale for channelling this support through the ILO, its comparative advance in rural infrastructure works, job creation and skills development in Cambodia;</li> <li>3. Is the project able to reach out to the intended project beneficiaries such as retrenched migrant workers and vulnerable households in terms of offering new job opportunities and skills development?</li> <li>4. Does the chosen type of infrastructure development work meet the concerns of local communities in terms of improving livelihoods and climate resilience?</li> <li>5. Is there potential for doing more of the same, both in terms of infrastructure works, job creation and skills development?</li> <li>6. Is there the need for continued support applying a similar approach to increase job opportunities and improve employability among workers from rural households;</li> </ol>
<b>Effectiveness</b>	Are the Project's outcomes / outputs being achieved?	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>7. How effective are the project implementation strategies in achieving the Project targets in terms of timely delivery of the infrastructure works, employment generation, and the development and conduct of training; What are the good practices and lessons to be learned from the Project approach and strategies? What are the key lessons learned and recommendations for the design of possible future roads support.</li> <li>8. Is the project progress on schedule regarding infrastructure works, job creation and training delivery - and projections of outputs until the scheduled end date of the project?</li> <li>9. How appropriate are the criteria of selection of infrastructure, work content and methods, and applied design standards?</li> <li>10. How have the project infrastructure works and TVET training contributed to climate resilience;</li> <li>11. How effective are local civil works contractors in implementing rural road works? Are they implementing rural road works according to contractual standards? How has the Project contributed towards increased contractor capacity, employment and income of local communities for rehabilitation and maintenance of rural roads?</li> <li>12. How effectively has the Project strengthened GoC capacity for integrating social safeguards measures in rural road works, including occupational safety and health measures? What are the good practices and lessons learned from the Project's approach? What have been the main challenges?</li> <li>13. To what extent has the Project contributed to gender and disability and social inclusion and opportunities/gaps? How can the Project promote gender and disability and social inclusion more effectively?</li> </ol>

<b>Efficiency of resource usage</b>	How well are resources used?	14. How well have project resources including logistical support been mobilised for timely commencement of project activities; 15. How efficient is the project team in terms of size and composition, mobilisation, adequacy of competencies of TA team members and use of international versus locally recruited personnel? 16. To what extent has the project managed to build effective working relations with relevant counterpart organisations at central and local levels; 17. Have the contracting modalities, choice of technology and work methods resulted in timely, cost-efficient and quality works and training delivery? 18. How has the project been benefiting from the joint cooperation with other ILO skills development support activities?
<b>Sustainability</b>	Will the benefits of the Project last?	19. To what extent do the net benefits of the intervention continue or are likely to continue. 20. To what extent is the Project promoting decent work for both men and women in the target communities, including men and women with disability, maximising sustainability, and promoting accountability and transparency? 21. Are the products (improved rural roads) climate resilient? To what extent do they withstand the effects of weather-related events and disasters such as flood, storm surge and droughts including future events?
<b>Impact</b>	What difference does the Project make?	22. How has the project infrastructure works contributed to climate resilience? 23. What has been the impact from improved local roads on connectivity, travel time and costs, and reliability during the rainy season and more extreme weather conditions, and how this affects rural households; 24. How many households have benefited from the project in terms of (i) the jobs offered through the infrastructure works, (ii) improved access and (iii) the vocational training opportunities; 25. To what extent have the workers and other trainees improved their employability as a result of project support?

### 4.3 Limitations of the Evaluation

There are limitations in all evaluations and reviews in terms of time and resources. The Project has been operating since April 2021 for the past 20 months with fairly good progress made regarding the delivery of key outputs.

Questions and information requests were carefully considered so as not to cause offence or embarrassment to the government. The evaluator consulted with the Project team and ILO prior to meetings with senior RGC officials. Some key limitations noted for this mid-term evaluation included:

- **Time and Resources:** the rigour of the data gathering analysis was constrained to some degree by the time available. The evaluation was not in a position to meet with all key stakeholders, particularly for follow-up meetings and discussions. However, the evaluation worked closely with the ILO to identify and select key stakeholders to meet with during the in-country mission.
- **Access to work sites:** Travel to the field locations was impeded by time constraints.
- **Judgements:** the time limitations meant that professional judgements needed to be employed to interpret stakeholder perspectives, particularly regarding reliance on previous knowledge and experience with similar projects.
- **Attribution:** The Project works in a fluid and dynamic environment (particularly for capacity development and institutional strengthening) and many factors have influenced the performance and operational efficiency. Defining and identifying specific areas of attribution remain challenging at best.

## 5. Key Evaluation Findings

The scope of the evaluation required that the analysis consider perceptions derived through interviews, as well as tangible data and information, across a range of stakeholders. This approach relied upon considerable investment in document review, of project documents (including relevant technical documents, manuals and guidelines), progress reports and briefing notes. Other relevant documents reviewed included training reports, project budgets, expenditure, results framework, work plans, procurement documents, etc.

The data analysis involved the triangulation of information between different data sources. Both qualitative and quantitative data were reviewed to assess the overall performance against the evaluation questions. The following findings were arrived at following the document review, collation and analysis from interviews and group discussions. The evaluation findings are organised in accordance with answering the evaluation questions under the key headings: relevance, effectiveness, efficiency of resource use, impact orientation, and sustainability.

### 5.1 Relevance

***KEQ1:** To what extent do the goals of the project remain relevant to current government development ambitions? Equally, how does the project contribute to the development goals of UN and the ILO, and finally the needs of people in Cambodia?*

The evaluation findings reveal that the project remain relevant to current government, UN and the ILO development priorities as outlined below:

**National Development Strategies and Priorities** - The Project has positively responded to the COVID-19 socio-economic crisis and has supported the RGC in implementing national strategies that coped with the crisis and recover from the associated socio-economic shocks. In particular, the Project has responded and contributed to the implementation of (i) the Rectangular Strategy IV<sup>5</sup>; (ii) National Strategic Development Plan 2019-2023; (iii) National Employment Policy 2015-2025; (iv) National TVET Policy 2017-2025; (v) Industrial Development Policy 2015-2025; (vi) National Policy on Youth Development and (viii) Social Protection Policy Framework (SPPF) 2016-2025<sup>6</sup>.

**Sustainable Development Goals** - The Project is in line with the majority of the seventeen (17) United Nations Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs). It dovetails perfectly into the following goals:

- SDG 1: End poverty in all its forms everywhere.
- SDG 4: Quality Education: Ensure inclusive and equitable quality education and promote lifelong learning opportunities.
- SDG 5: Achieve gender equality and empower all women and girls.
- SDG8: Promote sustained, inclusive and sustainable economic growth, full and productive employment and decent work for all.
- SDG 9: Build resilient infrastructure, promote inclusive and sustainable industrialization and foster innovation.
- SDG 13: to increase climate resilience and adaptation; and
- SDG17: to strengthen the means of implementation and revitalise the Global Partnership for Sustainable Development.

---

<sup>5</sup> The main driving force for Cambodia's national development is its "Rectangular Strategy" (The Rectangular Strategy for Growth, Employment, Equity and Efficiency in Cambodia), launched in 1998, and which has continued up to the present in four phases, each of which parallels with the term of office of the Legislature of the National Assembly or five years. For its part, Phase 4 of the strategy was adopted in 2018, immediately after the new government was formed, and will end in 2022.

<sup>6</sup> To further address low-incomes and financial vulnerability in Cambodia, the Government has approved the National Social Protection Policy Framework 2016-2025 (SPPF). The SPPF has two pillars: social assistance and social security. The framework defines social assistance as help for the poor and vulnerable.

**ILO global Programme and Budget 2020-2021** - This project contributes to the achievement of two ILO global outcomes - Outcome 3: Economic, social and environmental transitions for full, productive and freely chosen employment and decent work for all; and Outcome 5: Skills and lifelong learning to facilitate access to and transitions in the labour market.

### **ILO's Cambodia Decent Work Country Program 2019-2023**

The Project also more specifically contributes to the implementation of priority one (1) and all related outcomes of the ILO Cambodia 2019-2023 Decent Work Country Programme (DWCP). Priority 1: More women, men, youth and vulnerable groups in Cambodia have access to decent and productive work as a result of increased economic diversification, productivity, competitiveness and development of the digital economy. It further specifically contributes to the ILO Country Programme Outcome KHM 202 "Enhanced employability of men and women through improved and expanded gender-responsive skills development and employment services."

**ILO international conventions** - The project activities also contribute to the aim of ILO Convention 122 to provide productive work for all who are available for and seeking employment. Within the framework of the ILO Decent Work Agenda, the project also promotes several conventions and recommendations regulating issues such as minimum age (C138), equal opportunities and treatment (C100, C111 and C159), human resources development (C142), workers with family responsibilities (C156), protection of wages (C095 and C131), occupational safety and health (C119, C148, C155, C161, C162 and C167), employment injury benefits (C121), labour clauses in public contracts (C094), and finally the recent Recommendation 205 Employment and decent work for peace and resilience.

***KEQ 2: What was the rationale for channelling this support through the ILO, its comparative advance in rural infrastructure works, job creation and skills development in Cambodia***

Evidence from reviewed documents indicates that the rationale for MFAT channelling its support to RGC through the ILO was attributed to ILO's comparative advantage in rural infrastructure works, job creation and skills development in Cambodia. Since 1993, the ILO has provided continuous development support to the RGC and social partners to promote Decent Work. The ILO's significant skills development portfolio and its Employment Intensive Investment Programme (the ILO's largest development cooperation programme in the country), have constituted important pillars of this partnership.

The documents reviewed also shows that the ILO offers unmatched expertise and knowledge about the world of work, acquired over a century of responding to the needs for Decent Work, livelihoods and dignity. It is the only tripartite United Nations agency, bringing together representatives of governments, employers and workers organisations to jointly shape policies and programmes. The ILO is thus in a unique position to promote dialogue among these stakeholders, which is necessary for the level of engagement required to achieve the outlined results in the realm of skills development and employment-intensive infrastructure development in Cambodia. Its ability to mobilise government agencies, sector business associations and individual businesses, as well as TVET institutions and training providers, makes the ILO well-placed to work on critical aspects of livelihood promotion and improvement of essential community infrastructure using employment-intensive approaches, skills training and enterprise development.

***KEQ 3: Is the project able to reach out to the intended project beneficiaries such as retrenched migrant workers and vulnerable households in terms of offering new job opportunities and skills development?***

The project has been able to substantially reach out to the intended project beneficiaries such as retrenched migrant workers and vulnerable households in terms of offering new job opportunities and skills development. Of the targeted 500 community members, a total of 525 (130 on construction-related and 395 on CMG) have been trained and employed for the CMG contracts and small civil work contracts. The project has performed equally well with respect to immediate Outcome 2, namely; 'Returning migrants and workers access TVET programmes. Online national Learning Management System (LMS) of one partner TVET school has been developed while same for the other six selected TVET schools are in the development process. It is expected that those six LMS will be ready by January 2023. The national



harmonized digital TVET platform concept is endorsed by DGTNET. The seven TVET schools also received funding and technical support for developing green and blended TVET including eRPL packages and training is being delivered to 3000 target beneficiaries.

***KEQ 4:** Does the chosen type of infrastructure development work meet the concerns of local communities in terms of improving livelihoods and climate resilience?*

Interviewed district and commune administration officials confirmed that the Project has carried out extensive consultations with the district and commune authorities to identify infrastructure works for the implementation. Most commune offices have prioritised their infrastructure needs with rural road improvements being the highest demand in each of the communes as these communities were seriously affected by road infrastructure damaged during the floods in October 2021. Through field appraisals conducted in consultation with the communes, the Project has therefore selected rural road rehabilitation, road maintenance, and the improvement of drainage structures as the highest priority amongst the proposed infrastructure. The project has classified the selected infrastructures into three types, i) improvement of drainage structure on existing roads at sections with missing or insufficient drainage structures, ii) rural road maintenance work, and iii) rural road rehabilitation. The project improves such infrastructure, as well as climate proofs such assets and facilities. The application of employment-intensive methods in executing this work, provides productive employment and income generation thereby also mitigating recent job losses resulting from the economic impact of the COVID-19 pandemic. In parallel, the project supports the Ministry of Labour and Vocational Training (MOLVT) to further improve skills and lifelong learning systems. Blended (online and face to face) TVET training are being developed and upgraded in related construction skills and other sectors in demand by the labour market.

***KEQ 5:** Is there potential for doing more of the same, both in terms of infrastructure works, job creation and skills development?*

All interviewed stakeholders indicate that the Project has performed well and needs to continue beyond this short-term crises' resolution phase because:

- ✓ With just under one year of operations (capital works and training effectively commenced in June 2022 due to COVID-19 lockdowns), not much significant net impact is achieved.
- ✓ There is still huge infrastructure and training backlogs that would benefit from further support.

There is a huge potential for doing more of the same by continuing the works in the two Project Provinces as well as expanding into other Provinces. With the current mandate of the PDRDs, it is logical that this collaboration continues, thereby benefiting from the extensive technical know-how and local knowledge found in these departments. In addition, the Government has established a new technical capacity in the Community Support Office of the Planning and Investment Divisions, primarily focusing on supporting infrastructure development at the commune level. The combined institutional capacity of the PDRDs, the Community Support Offices and district administrations provide a solid institutional framework in which technical assistance can be provided to community infrastructure works.

The long and solid ongoing technical assistance from ILO to support skills development in Cambodia at the policy and operational level has facilitated the implementation of project interventions. The holistic and practical step-by-step measures in the transformation of digital TVET are a promising strategy to move the TVET sector forward and to adapt the TVET sector to a changing world of work.

Peer-to-peer support between TVET schools involved in the project on the transformation of digital and green TVET is a workable way for the creation of changes among those TVET schools compared to the purely online coaching or training sessions.

Employment-intensive public works programmes have been used in Cambodia to provide vulnerable households with alternative income in several past crises. The interest in these alternative job opportunities appears to be dependent on the conditions offered and as such concurs with earlier studies carried out by the ILO in Cambodia and elsewhere. Wage rates paid by the Project have been perceived as fair regarding

the nature of the work to be performed and at a rate that supports essential expenditure in a household.

Applying local resource-based approaches and employment-intensive work methods in rural infrastructure works to create jobs for vulnerable communities and returning migrants is well appreciated. The project has paid attention to selecting rural infrastructure that can be implemented by labour instead of using heavy equipment to maximise employment. Still, with the extensive experience of past programmes applying this approach, there is a solid evidence base for continuity of this project where these approaches are feasible in Cambodia.

Long term employment creation can be achieved by the Commune authorities by establishing systems and procedures in the implementation of a national rural road maintenance system of continuous maintenance presence using community-based maintenance groups (CMGs) in the application of labour-based approaches.

***KEQ 6: Is there the need for continued support applying a similar approach to increase job opportunities and improve employability among workers from rural households?***

Evidence on the ground indicates that technical support to the Commune authorities is still needed as there appears to be no overall road inventory and condition assessment data to ascertain the conditions of the road network of the communes. Technical support is further required to apply the same project principles and strategies of EIAs and LRBTs in establishing systems and procedures for the implementation of rural roads and other rural infrastructure such as:

- ✓ Expanding rural road rehabilitation and drainage improvement works in other districts and provinces
- ✓ Supporting the establishment and operation of a national rural roads maintenance management system – has potential for long-term employment creation and skills development.
- ✓ Rural water supply,
- ✓ Sanitation,
- ✓ Irrigation,
- ✓ Community forestry and
- ✓ Waste management.

## 5.2 Project Effectiveness

***KEQ 7: How effective are the project implementation strategies in achieving Project targets in terms of timely delivery of infrastructure works, employment generation, and the development and conduct of training; What are the good practices and lessons to be learned from the Project approach and strategies? What are the key lessons learned and recommendations for the design of possible future roads support?***

The project's strategy has been effective in providing short-term income support through the participation of the most vulnerable COVID-19 affected groups in employment intensive infrastructure works, as well as through reskilling and upskilling. It has been achieving some progress of outputs regarding infrastructure works, job creation and training delivery. Projections indicate that the outputs will be fully achieved by the anticipated end date of the project.

The core implementation strategies in achieving Project targets have been the use of Employment Intensive Investment Programme (EIIP) approaches that link investments in infrastructure with decent work and local economic development, including LRBT and Decent Work Principles (DWP) to rehabilitate and maintain public infrastructure, complemented by training of private sector contractors and capacity building of public institutions. Sustainable asset creation and emphasis of decent work are key in distinguishing EIIP from traditional cash for work projects. The use of LRBT has proven effective in previous EIIP works in Cambodia.



Decent work principles is at the core of the Project's implementation of works that deliver a fair income, a safe workplace for the workers and equality of opportunity and treatment for all women and men. The project has prepared and adapted a comprehensive Environmental and Social Safeguards Framework (ESSF) from other EIIP projects including Occupational Safety and Health measures.

COVID-19 adaptations to the Occupational Safety and Health (OSH) measures have been affected by the project's preparation guidelines for the COVID-19 measures and included in the civil works contracts. This helps to increase the understanding amongst workers of the virus and its transmission, maintaining a minimum distance between workers at all times, the provision of protective equipment and the implementation of hygiene procedures.

The project is contributing to green works, preserving and restoring the environment through activities such as retaining wall construction preventing erosion of road slopes, rehabilitating roads to proper engineering standards, construction of road drainage structures that manage floodwater close to local roads, planting trees along the improved roads, and planting grass/turfing to protect roads from slope erosion.

The project has an equal-opportunity approach for women participation as well as for men, who are engaged in the infrastructure work. The project advocates with the contractors for employing women in the workforce. The project aims to employ a minimum of 30% women, and although without a set project target (quota), also promoting the employment of people with disabilities.

The Project's Capacity building strategy for local contractors, seeks to train company directors, engineers, and site supervisors on LRBT approaches in how to effectively manage a large labour work force, decent work principles including social, environmental, health and safety aspects including COVID-19 measures and how to prepare bids for the LRBT works. The training certificate is a prerequisite to participate in tenders in this project. Successful contractors receive further mentoring during project implementation.

Prior to the commencement of construction, an orientation is conducted by the project as part of community mobilisation to ensure that both contractors and workers have a good understanding of their roles and responsibilities (as outlined in the employment contracts). Particularly, issues of OSH, worker protection and general working conditions are addressed.

The above strategies have been adapted to the evolving Cambodian context and incorporated into project manuals, guidelines, conditions of contracts and specifications for effective and timely delivery of the infrastructure works, employment generation, and the development and conduct of training.

The good practices put in place are effective planning, design, award and contract management systems and procedures that ensure prompt payments to contractors and workers.

***KEQ 8: Is the Project progress on schedule regarding infrastructure works, job creation and training delivery - and projections of outputs until the scheduled end date of the project?***

The analysis of the effectiveness relating to capacity of the Project to achieve its expected results is mapped over the anticipated results and targets described in the Project results framework and associated Project workplan. The analysis also draws upon consultations and discussions with the relevant Project team members and stakeholders involved in the implementation of project activities. The Project has made steady progress towards the achievement of defined key outcomes and outputs regarding infrastructure works, job creation and training delivery.

The project was delayed during the start phase due to COVID-19 related lockdowns and travel restrictions across the country in 2021 affecting the preparations for the infrastructure component, as well as initial teething problems with civil works procurement through the ILO IRIS system. The Project implementation strategies have been fairly effective in achieving some Project targets in terms of delivery of the infrastructure works, employment generation, and the development and conduct of training. The findings

from the analysis are as summarised below and also provided in detail in Annex 6. It is important to note that the Table in Annex 6 has been prepared as the Project's self-assessment but discussed and verified with the evaluation consultant.

The project's achievement in terms of infrastructure works, job creation and training delivery as of 31 October 2022 is as follows:

*Table 2: Summary of Project Achievements as of 31 October 2022*

Output Target	Achievement
<b>Output 1.1: Labour-intensive construction/rehabilitation of basic rural village infrastructure</b>	
<b>Output 1.2: Improved local capacity to safely implement inclusive and sustainable public works</b>	
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>✓ Not less than 35 basic infrastructure schemes installed or improved in the two clusters of around 10 - 15 communities each (one cluster in Battambang Province and one cluster in Siem Reap Province).</li> <li>✓ About 60,000 workdays of short-term employment provided across the targeted villages in Battambang and Siem Reap Provinces</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>✓ 39 km road maintenance are being implemented, and 10 km roads contracts are in process. 24.6 km road rehabilitation contracts have been awarded. Implementation will commence in Dec 2022. 58 culverts construction are in progress in both provinces.</li> <li>✓ 8,217 WDs (13.7%) of direct short-term employment have so far been generated. About 60% of workdays created are women for community road maintenance contracts which exceeds the Project's target of 30% participation. For small civil works contracts, about 15% of women WDs have been generated.</li> </ul>
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>✓ Total cash injections in the villages through the Activity's infrastructure works will be about US\$ 1.3 million, of which about US\$ 0.45 million are wage transfers.</li> <li>✓ Approximately USD 1.3 million will be available for the infrastructure capital works and will be injected into the local economy.</li> <li>✓ Approximately 2,500 poor vulnerable households most affected by the coronavirus pandemic including people with disabilities benefiting from short-term employment opportunities.</li> <li>✓ 100 local SMEs of villages targeted for infrastructure works have received training and coaching on enterprise management.</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>✓ Total wage paid to workers is USD 69,845 (15.5%) which has been injected into the communities to boost local economic development.</li> <li>✓ USD 334,701 (25.7%) of capital works have been awarded to 14 SMEs.</li> <li>✓ 9,900 households benefited from the infrastructure works in 4 districts</li> </ul>
<b>Output 2.1: Development and delivery of online/blended vocational training; and</b>	
<b>Output 2.2: Capacity building of public and private TVET institutions in developing and delivering blended training.</b>	
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>✓ 20 online and blended vocational training certified curricula modules including participant and trainers' guidelines have been developed for selected occupations of the construction sector (e.g., carpentry, masonry, plumbing) and other selected priority sectors/occupations.</li> <li>✓ Expected 3,000 returning migrants, workers and students have accessed certified online and blended modular vocational training and recognition of prior learning programmes.</li> <li>✓ Up to 500 community members from the targeted communities have received training on construction-related skills.</li> <li>✓ About (20) trainees from DGTNET management received coaching and capacity building.</li> <li>✓ About (40) TVET trainers participated TOT and assess modular online and blended vocational training</li> <li>✓ About 10 TVET teachers have been trained to deliver and assess on the job certified training construction</li> <li>✓ About (10) trainers and facilitators have been trained on the implementation of gender-sensitive blended learning</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>✓ 21 online and green TVET modular in hospitality and construction sectors have been in the process of blending and greening and are expected to complete by January 2023.</li> <li>✓ 7 TVET schools received funding and technical support are developing green and blended TVET including eRPL packages and to deliver to planned 3000 target beneficiaries soon.</li> <li>✓ 130 community members from the targeted communities have received training on construction-related skills. 395 community members have been trained and employed for the CMG contracts and small civil work contracts.</li> <li>✓ 30 trainers and curriculum developers have been receiving training on blended, green TVET including eRPL.</li> <li>✓ TVET teachers from NVIB and NPIA backstopped on the development of on-the-job training module</li> <li>✓ 10 TVET teachers, local trainers and facilitators trained on CBED Tool.</li> </ul>

The project has accelerated progress after the easing of COVID-19 restrictions and there are sound indications that the awarded civil works contracts will be completed by the Project's completion date of 31 August 2023.

***KEQ 9: How appropriate are the criteria for selection of infrastructure, work content and methods, and applied design standards?***

The interviewed provincial, district and commune authorities all confirmed that the Project selects infrastructure works based on commune authorities' prioritised lists from which field appraisals are conducted in collaboration with the commune officials. Based on priorities of the communes, the selected projects are predominantly rural road rehabilitation, road maintenance, and the improvement of drainage structures.

For identification of rural roads for rehabilitation, there are many proposals which have been proposed to be included in the project. Some road sections require new construction and some existing roads are in such a poor condition that traffic can hardly pass during the rainy season. All selected rural roads are considered high priority by the participating communes. The work content for the rehabilitation and construction works include i) bush and grass clearing from the road formation and disposal to a safe place, ii) earthwork construction including levelling works, fill and compact road embankments in layers, sloping and forming camber, iii) side drain construction (earth side drain and concrete side drain) where needed, iv) construction of drainage structures such as culverts, construction of retaining walls, v) gravel wearing course, vi) planting grass (turfing) on roadside slopes and planting trees on the road shoulders. There are 24.6 km of rural roads selected for rehabilitation.

The common design for the drainage structures is a reinforced concrete pipe culvert including reinforced concrete headwalls, wing walls and aprons. The size of the culvert varies between diameter 60cm to 100cm of single row or double rows depending on the catchment areas and the surrounding terrain conditions.

The above contract packaging of work contents is appropriate as they are of a size that allow trained locally-based small scale contractors to qualify for such contracts which ultimately enable these SMEs to grow in capacity and sustain themselves.

Detailed designs and cost estimates are prepared by the field engineers for each of the selected roads, through field surveys, preparation of strip maps showing the location of each activity along the road, preparation of standard drawings, calculation of quantities, calculation of unit rates for each work activity, preparation of Bill of Quantities (BoQs) and specifications. Furthermore, environmental and social safeguard requirements are assessed and incorporated into the contracts. So far, six contracts for small civil works (culvert constructions) are in progress of implementation and five (5) contracts for large civil work (rural road rehabilitations) have been prepared and awarded to selected contractors.

***KEQ 10: How have the project infrastructure works and TVET training contributed to climate resilience?***

The project infrastructure works and TVET training on digital and green transformation have contributed to climate resilience as follows:

**Infrastructure works:** The Project designs and construction of the roadworks are climate-resilient that remain stable and accessible – even when exposed to heavy rains. With Cambodia's terrain being relatively flat with low-lying sections, designs and construction of the rural roads ensure that road levels traversing low-lying terrain prone to flooding, are adequately raised on embankments and fitted with adequate drainage structures such as culverts, head/retaining walls and side drains: Proper subgrade/base and gravel pavement layers are provided to provide an all-weather surface. Furthermore, within some large villages, concrete paving is provided which also prevents dust pollution within the

community. The embankment slopes of the road are usually stabilised using grassing/turf, head/retaining walls constructed to retain and avoid soil slides and erosion that can block the road, leading to further flooding and causing injury to road users.

The Project implements maintenance projects using community and LRBT approaches. The continuous presence of the Community Maintenance Groups (CMGs) in undertaking preventive maintenance works on the rehabilitated roads through removal of obstructions (e.g., fallen trees and other debris, cleaning of side drains and cross drainage structures etc.), ensures that the road drainage system efficiently functions at all times and thus minimises road damages, flooding and associated negative environmental impacts.

**In the skill development component**, the Project is working to increase the climate resilience in the TVET sector. Implementation agreements have been contracted with TVET schools both in construction and tourism sectors. The TVET schools are working on a blended curriculum, and have introduced the necessary digital skills to the existing conventional TVET training packages. Consequently, this will be an integral part to reduce environmental impact. For example, reducing the use of paper through digital learning content and examination/assessment. In addition, through the green elements, it can be a prerequisite to prepare the young Cambodian workforce for a green economy which is less impactful for the environment. On the green transformation of the TVET system in Cambodia, three major policy dimensions that will create long-term positive impacts to climate resilience are:

- Formation and/or adaptation of greener TVET policies and strategies;
- The update of the TVET system with state-of-the-art teaching and green learning models;
- The capacity building of actors involved in TVET service delivery including TVET school managers, teachers, trainers and assessors to develop skills for green jobs.

Upon request of the Ministry of Labour and Vocational Training (MoLVT) and the Ministry of Tourism (MoT), the ILO is providing technical and funding support to the green transformation of the TVET system in Cambodia. The main objective is to increase relevance of TVET and skills development to the needs of the labour market brought about by the greening of the economy.

The ILO has developed a practical tool for greening TVET and skills development and this provides the basis for subsequent piloting and coaching programmes which is designed to support ILO's constituents and TVET stakeholders to green their national TVET system at the macro, meso and micro levels.

A national TVET green core team has been created and trained in Cambodia from March to June 2022 as part of a global programme. It included 12 staff from 9 national public and private institutions, including DGTNET, NCTP, Ministry of Tourism, Ministry of Environment, social partners and managers from major TVET schools in Phnom Penh, Siem Reap and Battambang provinces.

The green core team is receiving additional coaching so they can help steer the implementation of TVET digital transformation. To support implementation, the ILO is providing support not only at the macro but also at the meso level. The members of the green core team have been increased to twenty-six (26) by adding those who are the implementers at the meso level and other relevant stakeholders such as climate change and green economy departments of Ministry of Environment. Eleven (11) TVET teachers, assessors and curriculum developers from eight (8) public and private TVET schools have been provided with the opportunity to take part in a one-year coaching on how to green their curricula and deliver those curricula to their students. Additional financial resources have also been allocated and made available to TVET institutions to design and deliver green and blended TVET modular training to young people, migrant workers, and people with disabilities. Collaboration among ILO projects helps vulnerable groups, especially those affected by the impact of COVID-19 and woman migrant returnees access training opportunities. The programme, through its TVET partner schools, has also been greening the Recognition of Prior Learning (RPL) assessment packages with the intention to provide green skills recognition for those who have gained green skills through their working experiences but have not received formal TVET training.

In addition to the harmonisation of the green TVET learning management system, the ILO in close collaboration with its partners also plans to scale up support at the broader level. In the first phase, only the construction and hospitality sectors are covered but going forward more occupations and sectors will be prioritised. In the medium term, it is also planned that higher TVET levels will be digitalized and greened in addition to the currently piloted levels – Cambodia Qualification Framework (CQF) 1 and 2.

Additional financial resources will be required to realise this. It is estimated that, to expand the green transformation to cover two more sectors and two more levels (CQF3 and CQF4), extra funding in the region of USD 1,400,000 will be needed.

The expansion of green TVET coverage will directly benefit at least 8,000 young Cambodians, migrant workers (including women) and vulnerable groups helping them to gain better access to TVET opportunities that improve their employability.

**KEQ 11: How effective are local civil works contractors in implementing rural infrastructure works? Are they implementing rural infrastructure works according to contractual standards? How has the Project contributed towards increased contractor capacity, employment and income of local communities for rehabilitation and maintenance of rural infrastructure works?**

The trained local civil works contractors are effectively implementing rural infrastructure works according to contractual standards. The Project's training and award of civil works contracts have contributed towards increased contractor capacity, employment and income of local communities for rehabilitation and maintenance of rural infrastructure. Findings during the evaluation indicate strong compliance from contractors at the sites (as assessed by respondents).

**Box 1: Contractors' experiences with the Project**

Interviewed Project contractors and their supervisors, when asked their views on the Project's training and contract implementation support, provided the following responses:

**Quality and effectiveness of the training received:**

- *"The quality of the training has been very good. Before training, I could not complete pricing and submission of bid document by myself, but after the training, I can fully cost the works by assessing all resource inputs and submit my own bid".*
- *"After training, I know about Occupational Safety and Health (OSH) measures and how to organize and work with communities including recruitment"*
- *"When working for other clients, no training on OSH is provided and OSH is not enforced on sites. However, on the ILO contracts, training on OSH and COVID-19 are provided and compliance are enforced on sites"*
- *"After training, I know how to give out daily tasks to workers, calculate unit rates including labour, materials and plant and transport inputs"*

**Contractor's invoice payment for works done on government contracts compared to payment on the ILO project.**

- *"On government awarded contracts, you have to pre-finance the works and complete at least 50 percent of the scope of works before you can put in an invoice claim for completed works. It takes one to three weeks from the date of submission of invoice to receive payment. On the other hand, for ILO's contracts, there is no ceiling to the scope of works for a certificate. Works done can be measured monthly and payment effected by the Project between three (3) working days to one week of submitting and invoice".*

Since project inception in April 2021 up to 31 October 2022, three (3) contracts were successfully completed on time and within budget and eleven (11) contracts are currently on-going. No contracts have been terminated for non-compliance/performance and on-going contractors are effectively working in compliance with technical specifications and standards.

The Project effects prompt payments to contractors' invoices for completed works between three working days to one week from the date of submission of invoice, which ensures good cash flow among contractors

without affecting their physical progress/outputs as small-scale contractors have low levels of disposable cash to continuously pre-finance the works. Prompt contractor payments normally result in contractors' ability to pay their workers promptly. This avoids conflict and social unrest between contractors, workers and their families.

The Project's technical, financial, environmental and social safeguards training including OSH skills and COVID-19 as well as continuous business mentoring and field compliance requirements monitoring, have adequately supported contractors' compliance.

***KEQ: 12: How effectively has the Project strengthened RGC capacity for integrating social safeguards measures in rural infrastructure works, including occupational safety and health measures? What are the good practices and lessons learned from the Project's approach? What have been the main challenges?***

The development of guidelines for the Environmental and Social Safeguard Framework (ESSF), including occupational safety and health measures in accordance with the Cambodian legal and regulatory frameworks, has been done and completed. Guidelines for the ESSF and COVID-19 have been included in the technical specifications of the civil work contracts, and they are also reviewed during contractor training.

The Project has developed systems and guidelines/documents that would eventually strengthen RGC's capacity in social and environmental compliance.

An ESSF framework explains the environmental and social safeguard processes to be followed in employment-intensive projects through design and construction to operation and maintenance. The ILO project engineers monitor the implementation of the ESSF and support coordination between the contractors, local authorities, communities and workers.

***KEQ 13: To what extent has the Project contributed to gender and disability and social inclusion and opportunities/gaps? How can the Project promote gender and disability and social inclusion more effectively?***

The Project did not specifically set gender and disability quotas in its results framework to guard implementation compliance but has integrated employment of women in social and environmental safeguards measures aiming at 30 percent of women participation in the rural infrastructure works, including OSH measures and the developed systems and guidelines/documents that would strengthen RGC capacity in social and environmental compliance. The Project actually achieved about 60% women on road maintenance works and about 15% on culvert contracts. For road rehabilitation it is expected to achieve 30% of women participation. However, it appears that not much has been done by the Project to promote participation of Peoples Living with Disabilities (PLWD). So far there was only one worker with disability who has worked for road maintenance in Siem Reap. The project aims to set a quota of 2% for people with disabilities on road rehabilitation contract works which are starting in December 2022.

Further strategies recommended for enhancing future projects' gender and disability Inclusion include:

1. **Establishment of Gender/disability target/quota in the Project document** – to ensure promotion of optimum participation of women and disability in the project, a minimum quota or target (e.g., 30% women participation and 2% disability participation) should be set in future project documents, covering all stages of project cycle management. It may be more ideal to set different targets for different types of work. It is known that it is easier to secure high female participation in routine maintenance.
2. **Flexible working hours** –Further review/refine the use of productivity/task-based system of remuneration to encourage women and disability participation, allowing them to complete their assigned task and then return home to undertake other household or farming activities.



3. **Increased advocacy on Women and Disability Participation** – the project must have a more robust advocacy strategy to socialise stakeholders and awareness raising in community meetings in the promotion of women and disability participation. There are a lot of amputees in Cambodia due to mines and uxos from past wars. Past experience shows that most amputees are able bodied, strong and highly committed.
4. **Collaboration with other Development Partners** - Collaboration with other gender and disability promotion agencies e.g., UN Women and Disability agencies in joint activities can enhance gender and disability inclusion in the Project.

### 5.3 Efficiency of Resource Use

#### *KEQ 14: How well have project resources including logistical support been mobilised for timely commencement of project activities?*

The Project's resources were allocated strategically and for the most part effectively to achieve defined outcomes.

The ILO budget for the Project is USD 3,237,561. According to Project reports, project expenditure is at 26.2% (as of 30 November 2022), which appears to be an under-expenditure. However, as can be seen from Table 3 below which provides a summary of the project expenditure breakdown, more than 30% of the total project cost is for civil works for which design and procurement were delayed by one year by the by COVID-19 lockdown and travel restrictions. The civil works rehabilitation contracts have now been fully designed, contracts prepared and awarded. The total expenditure and commitments of USD 1,047,904 (80% of total civil works budget seems to concur with the assurance by the Project that the rehabilitated contracts will be executed and completed by the end of the project on 31 August 2023. Similarly, actual and committed staff costs is USD 625,315 (77% of budget) and consultancy contracts for development and delivery of online/blended vocational training have been awarded and implementation have commenced.

*Table 3: Summary of the Project expenditure breakdown*

Item #	Activity	Totals						
		Budget	Actuals	% Spent	Commitments	Actual + commitments	% of Budget	Balances
01	Labour-intensive construction/rehabilitation of basic rural village infrastructure	1,314,603	109,235	8.3%	938,669	1,047,905	80%	266,698
02	Development and delivery of online/blended vocational training	605,823	39,976	6.6%	418,107	458,083	76%	147,741
03.01	Staff costs	809,535	440,137	54.4%	185,178	625,315	77%	184,220
03.02	Operational costs	220,925	148,200	67.1%	28,334	176,535	80%	44,390
04	Programme support cost	229,857	95,881	41.7%	0	95,882	42%	133,975
	<b>Totals</b>	<b>3,180,743</b>	<b>833,429</b>	<b>26.2%</b>	<b>1,570,289</b>	<b>2,403,718</b>	<b>76%</b>	<b>777,025</b>

All Project vehicles (2 No.) and motorcycles (4 No.) for supervision as well as all office equipment have been fully procured under Operational Costs, and are in use.

Three project offices have been established - two offices in Siem Reap and one office in Battambang. All project offices have been equipped with the office furniture, IT equipment and internet facilities. One office space is provided by PDRD in Battambang, one in Siem Reap is provided by the Provincial Department of Labour and Vocational Training while the third one is provided by the Provincial Governor's office. This 'embedded' staff approach is very positive for skills transfer and ultimate sustainability of the Project.

For the civil works contracts, expenditure is within the planned budget, which demonstrates effective contracts management and the efficient use of resources. Analysis indicates that the average costs are competitive with national and international cost ranges for rural road works including the drainage works. From the site visits and observation, the scope of works under the maintenance contracts appears to be more than pure 'routine/labour only' maintenance but rather resembling 'sectional improvement' involving materials and plant cost inputs, as well as routine maintenance. As such, the average cost per kilometre above USD5,000 is very reasonable. The capital works in Table 4 provides a snapshot of rehabilitation, drainage structures and maintenance works with associated costs and employment creation data.

Table 4: Summary of capital works with associated costs and employment creation data

General information							No of workers			No of WDs			Completion %	Current status
Project Name	Province	Contact Number	Qty- Km/No	Contractors/Community group	Contract amount-US\$	Duration of contract	Total unit last month	New worker this month	Total	Total unit last month	This month	Total	Women %	
<b>A- Culvert construction (small civil work contracts)</b>														
Culvert construction in Kaos Krals, Hlab and Preah Phos Communes	Battambang	RFQ-01-2022-BTB	10	Kong Meng Construction Co Ltd	23,732	June-31 Dec 22	42		42	642		642	10%	100%
Culvert construction in Preah Chik, Muk Reah and Batak Communes		RFQ-02-2022-BTB	8	Kong Meng Construction Co Ltd	19,744	June-31 Dec 22	33		33	347		347	9%	60%
Culvert construction in Duan Ba and Chhna Meas Communes		RFQ-06-2022-BTB	7	Kong Meng Construction Co Ltd	22,836	June-31 Dec 22	43		43	604		604	5%	95%
Culvert construction in Kook Doung and Sra Khvay Communes	Siem Reap	RFQ-03-2022-SRP	14	AMLO Construction Development Co., Ltd	37,955	June-30 Nov 22	27		27	444		444	10%	30%
Culvert construction in Kdei Ran and Yeang Commune		RFQ-04-2022-SRP	12	AMLO Construction Development Co., Ltd	30,572	June-31 Dec 22	46		46	673		673	15%	40%
Culvert construction in Prey Chruk Commune		RFQ-05-2022-SRP	7	AMRL Construction company	29,164	June-31 Dec 22	71		71	1079		1079	18%	90%
<b>Total culvert construction contracts</b>			<b>58</b>		<b>164,953</b>		<b>262</b>	<b>-</b>	<b>262</b>	<b>3,789</b>	<b>-</b>	<b>3,789</b>		
<b>B-Community road maintenance contracts</b>														
Community road maintenance, Tuol Lieb and Prey Phneas village, Koa Krals district	Battambang	CMG-03-2022-BTB	5.2	CMG-Tuol Lieb-Prey Phneas	20,553	1 Sept-31 Dec 22	15	2	17	271	360	631	53%	67%
Community road maintenance Prey Phneas village, Koa Krals district		CMG-04-2022-BTB	4.1	CMG-Prey Phneas	20,006	1 Sept-31 Dec 22	17		17	316	407	723	65%	62%
Community road maintenance Sra Sdok, commune, Rukh Kiri district		CMG-07-2022-BTB	4	CMG-Preah Angkor	19,636	15 Sept to 15 Jan 2023	17		17	77	385	462	50%	49%
Community road maintenance Muk Reah commune, Rukh Kiri district		CMG-08-2022-BTB	3.6	CMG-Toul Svay	19,682	15 Sept to 15 Jan 2023	17		17	113	374	487	46%	54%
Community road maintenance, Keteys village, Pook district	Siem Reap	CMG-01-2022-SRP	4.2	CMG-Keteys	20,386	18 August-31 Dec 22	16		16	328	328	656	63%	69%
Community road maintenance, Phiang village, Pook district		CMG-02-2022-SRP	5.7	CMG-Phiang	22,125	18 August-31 Dec 22	17		17	426	377	803	35%	82%
Community road maintenance, Duan Kaev commune, Pook district		CMG-05-2022-SRP	6	CMG-Duan Kaev	21,911	15 Sept to 15 Jan 2023		15	15	309	309	66%	28%	Work in progress
Community road maintenance, Yeang commune, Pook Angkor Chhu district		CMG-06-2022-SRP	5	CMG-Yeang	26,377	15 Sept to 15 Jan 2023		17	17	357	357	23%	31%	Work in progress

**KEQ 15: How efficient is the project team in terms of size and composition, mobilisation, adequacy of competencies of TA team members and use of international versus locally recruited personnel?**

The Project is overseen by an experienced International Project Manager (PM) and is staffed with a professional, competent and committed team with high team spirit. The PM is supported by two National Field Engineers and two Technicians who are in charge of the field works operations within the infrastructure component in the two Project provinces. A National Skills Development Coordinator and his assistant, also support the PM in all skills development activities in collaboration with Project partners - DGT VET, local authorities, employers' and workers' organisations, TVET institutions and others. A Finance and Administration officer and two Drivers support the technical and skills development team and it is also evident from field observations that there is good administrative and financial support from the



ILO Country Coordination office. Short-term consultants are appropriately engaged through collaboration contracts, to provide specialised short-term inputs as and when required.

The backstopping support provided from the ILO-Decent Work Country Office and ROAP offices, have been excellent in providing technical and administrative support and guidance to the Project in delivering within quality and cost. It is imperative that the Project team critically appraise and review performance and discuss key project constraints as well as provide possible remedies for the remaining project timeframe.

The abrupt departure of the former PM after only about six months at post, the delay in recruitment of one field technician, support staff and the imminent departure of the current National Skills Development Coordinator in November 2022, are key disruptions affecting efficient service delivery. Project implementation was further exacerbated by the delayed access to ILO IRIS which is a fundamental tool for processing procurement and other administrative tasks. All Project procurement including the preparation of purchase orders for goods and services had to be processed at the ILO offices in Phnom Penh and Bangkok.

***KEQ 16: To what extent has the project managed to build effective working relations with relevant counterpart organisations at central and local levels?***

The Project has established a Project Steering Committee (PSC) in each of the two project provinces to guide high level coordination.

The project has also coordinated with the Mol and PDRD offices in both provinces on the selection of works, ensuring that the Project's infrastructure works are not overlapping with other development programmes. The project shares progress reports with the provincial governments monthly. The Project has supported trained SME contractors to access finance and insurance cover for their workers. The Project's trained SME contractors tend to work independently and their workers are not represented by a core workers' organisation or group. Moving forward into the Project, there is scope in accordance with the ILO's tripartite mandate with employer and worker organisations, for further engagement/consultation with Cambodian Trade Unions and Employers' Associations to secure coordination support for project implementation.

The project coordinates with the local authorities in the participating districts and communes for project selection, recruiting workers, project monitoring, resolving any issues that arise during the implementation of the works and sharing project updates and progress reports.

In consultation with the relevant government departments (Provincial Department for Rural Development, Provincial Department of Labour and Vocational Training, Provincial Department of Planning and Investment in both provinces), and local authorities in the four project districts, the project has secured approval for a minimum daily wage for unskilled worker of US\$ 8.5/workday which is paid on all contracts including the community-based contracts for routine road maintenance and civil work contracts.

***KEQ 17: Have the contracting modalities, choice of technology and work methods resulted in timely, cost-efficient and quality works and training delivery?***

The Project classifies the proposed infrastructure works into three categories and the contracts modality are also set into three types of contracts:

1. Road maintenance – Is implemented through community contracts. The contract is directed and awarded to the local community. Each contract value is approximately USD 19,000 - 30,000.
2. Small civil works – is implemented by selected local contractors through Request for Quotation (RFQ) – Informal competitive bidding. Each contract size USD 20,000 - USD 40,000.

3. Large civil works are implemented by qualified local contractors through competitive bidding. The rural road rehabilitation contracts are packaged within the range of USD 150,000 to USD 200,000 to allow medium size and above companies to bid for the work.

The Project uses contract templates specifically designed for civil works that are appropriate for the type of work included in the EIIP. The Procurement unit in ILO headquarters has made modifications to the labour clauses to fit project activities and specific requirements of the local resource-based project approach, employment generation, including labour standards and recruitment etc. In addition, the project has prepared an Environmental and Social Safeguard Framework (ESSF) and COVID-19 Guidelines for inclusion in the technical specifications of the civil works contracts. Procurement of the infrastructure works follows prevailing ILO procurement procedures. The contracts for the infrastructure work are divided into different contract modalities depending on the nature of the infrastructure works and the contract amount.

Community contracts modality for routine road maintenance and road surface repair covers activities such as bush clearing, grass cutting, cleaning and reshaping roadside drains, cleaning road drainage structures, repairing road shoulders and side slopes, pothole patching and repairs to gravel road surfaces.

The project has carried out road condition surveys, road inventories and bill of quantities and prepared community agreements for the road maintenance works. The road maintenance contracts have then been awarded directly to Community Maintenance Groups (CMG). Each group of the CMG consists of 15-17 CMG members led by a CMG leader and the duration of the contract is between 4 - 5 months.

Routine road maintenance is an important operation to keep roads in good condition, prolong road life and allow open traffic in all seasons. Road selection for inclusion in the routine maintenance activities should be, and are, roads in a maintainable/reasonable condition (fair condition) while failed roads without any geometry and in poor condition are considered for rehabilitation.

EIA/LRBT and execution of works using private sector trained SMEs are the choice of technology and work methods. Labour for execution of the works is recruited from the villages in the vicinity of the worksites and therefore within walking distance from their homes. The Project has developed a Labour Selection Guideline for selection of labour for Community Contracts for Routine Maintenance. The road maintenance works are supervised by a Community Maintenance Group Leader. In consultation with local authorities, the Project has identified qualified candidates with sufficient literacy levels and who are well-respected in the community to be the Group Leaders. With more than one qualified candidate, a ballot process was applied. The local authorities were encouraged to propose women candidates for the Group Leader positions. The selected Group Leaders and the Project engineers in coordination with the local authorities, identified and selected the group members. Based on pre-set criteria, the labour who were assessed with the highest-scoring was selected. The local authorities and the Group Leaders were instructed to target more than 30% of women workers to participate in the road maintenance works, in compliance with the Project's set quota for women participation.

The selection of labour for civil works contracts are undertaken by the local construction firms who implement these larger works contracts. The Project assists the contractors and coordinates with local authorities when recruiting the labour. The recruitment of labour complies with the pre-set selection criteria including meeting the women participation criteria. Should the availability of the labour be more than required by the project, a rotation method or balloting method for the labour recruitment is applied. The above ensures cost-effectiveness and timely delivery.

#### ***KEQ 18: How has the project been benefiting from the joint cooperation with other ILO skills development support activities?***

The transformation of digital and green TVET provisions including blended recognition of prior learning (eRPL) is in progress. With the collaboration from the International Training Centre of the ILO, (ILO-ITC), step-by-step greening and blending TVET programmes have been completely carried out for all TVET

stakeholders, particularly the selected public and non-public partner TVET institutions. The coaching programme on eRPL started in November 2022. Interviewed ministries and TVET officials are very thankful for the financial and technical support to green/digital and blended TVET transformation including eRPL. During COVID-19, all TVET schools could not operate and had to close for a year. With the project's introduced blended learning, TVETs are able to operate both in-person and virtually. The eRPL has been very relevant to Cambodia as most of the migrant workers have very good working experience but do not have formal certificates of qualifications. Through the Project's eRPL, these migrant workers are able to be tested theoretically and practically and issued with certificates – thus having a tremendous impact on increased employability.

Funding support has also been mobilised from other ILO programmes and made available to 7 selected partner TVET institutions who are taking the lead in the digital and green TVET transformation. It is planned that through the collaboration with the seven (7) institutions, 3,000 workers will have benefited from the programme in terms of skilling, reskilling and upskilling by the end of the Project (the Project estimates that this might be achieved four months beyond the current completion date of 31 August 2023). The project has committed to secure the participation of women and returning migrants as well as potentially migrating workers. The proportion of women was planned to reach at least 50 percent of the agreed number of total beneficiaries whereas 50 percent of the entire beneficiary group will be the returning migrant workers and potentially migrating workers.

In a nutshell, the Project has been collaborating with ILO-ITC:

- ✓ In the implementation of TVET blending and RPL blending programme into MoT
- ✓ Upscaling the transformation of digital and green TVET as peer-to-peer learning
- ✓ Providing technical support to the seven (7) selected TVET schools to undergo the processes of digital and green TVET transformation.
- ✓ In supporting TVET schools to green works and introduced basic digital skills into their existing training packages.
- ✓ In providing support to DGTNET's TVET schools to accredit newly developed TVET programmes which will be scaled up in the near future to all TVET schools nationwide. Funding support to DGTNET to initiate the standardisation of the blended TVET and green TVET curriculum and packages produced by the partner TVET institutions.
- ✓ In harmonisation of the digital platforms with learning management systems for the TVET schools.

Furthermore, with the technical support from the enterprise team of the ILO office in Cambodia and ROAP, the Project has been providing capacity development to MSMEs to improve their management of their businesses through the provision of training and coaching sessions on community-based enterprise development tools for small business operators (CBED-SBO).

## 5.4 Impact Orientation

### *KEQ 19: To what extent do the net benefits of the intervention continue or are likely to continue?*

Based on the desk review of available documents and consultations with Project stakeholders, a number of positive impacts are starting to emerge.

Interviewed respondents in the ministries and communities indicate that the Project's interventions in the project areas are benefitting them as follows:

- 160,400 people from Project areas have improved access to year-round motorable roads (covering a total roads length of 73.4 km - 48.8 km routine road maintenance and 24.6 km road rehabilitation).
- Improvement in travel time (no studies have been conducted yet).
- Reduced costs of transport
- Easy access to markets to sell farm produce and buy essential household items

- Better access in transporting children to schools as there is no more flooding of the improved roads.
- Approximately 8,217 WDs worker days of employment created since June 2022 to October 2022
- Wages paid - US\$ 69,845 from June 2022 to October 2022.
- 21 online and green TVET modular in hospitality and construction sectors have been in the process of blending and greening and are expected to complete by January 2023.
- 7 TVET schools received funding and technical support are developing green and blended TVET including eRPL packages and to deliver to planned 3000 target beneficiaries soon.
- 130 community members from the targeted communities have received training on construction-related skills. 395 community members have been trained and employed for the CMG contracts and small civil work contracts.
- 30 trainers and curriculum developers have been receiving training on blended, green TVET including eRPL.
- TVET teachers from NVIB and NPIA backstopped on the development of on-the-job training module
- 10 TVET teachers, local trainers and facilitators trained on CBED Tool. 14 local SMEs of villages targeted for infrastructure works have received training and coaching on enterprise management. Training on CBED tool to 100 SMEs owners is in progress.

The benefits of the Project's intervention will continue as all planned rehabilitation works and training are implemented. It however, appears to be too early to tell of the full net benefits of the civil works and training as works have only been effective since June 2022 (about five months).

**KEQ 20: To what extent is the Project promoting decent work for both men and women in the target communities, including men and women with disability, maximising sustainability, and promoting accountability and transparency?**

Analysis of documents and reports indicate that key principles of decent work are integrated into the Project design and applied during implementation to promote decent work in project activities. Key aspects of decent work that are promoted and strengthened by the Project are as follows:

- Contractors and their staff have been trained in decent work and relevant clauses have been incorporated and applied in contract documents.
- The Project has improved the capacity of contractors to provide gender and disability inclusion and strengthened monitoring and compliance of these safeguards.
- Collaboration with key stakeholders to secure fair wages for workers, promote gender equality and disability inclusion, although more efforts are required especially on disability inclusion.
- Establishing OSH provisions for the rehabilitation, structures and maintenance works.
- Regular compliance monitoring of OSH provisions in the road rehabilitation and maintenance works.

**Box 2: Conditions of work**

Interviewed workers indicated that they were very happy with the working conditions on the sites and made the following remarks:

- *Satisfied with the wages paid which they say are paid promptly every two weeks.*
- *Daily task work given them are reasonable*
- *Female workers indicated that there is no discrimination against women regarding wages (equal pay) and the task works are suitable for women.*
- *They are provided with OSH facilities such as potable drinking water, personal protective equipment, toilets etc.*
- *In case of minor injuries, there are first aid kits on site to administer immediate treatment. There have been no major accidents but should it happen, there is supervision vehicle to take the injured person to the nearest clinic.*
- *The workers requested the Project to continue as they prefer to work in their communities than to migrate to other countries for work. It also enables their children to attend school and for them to stay with their*

**KEQ 21: Are the products (improved rural infrastructure) climate resilient? To what extent do they withstand the effects of weather-related events and disasters such as floods and droughts or other future events?**

The designs of the infrastructure works and construction are climate-resilient that seeks to keep the infrastructure in a stable and accessible condition – also during times with heavy rains. Designs include raising embankment levels above past flood levels, installing adequate drainage systems, including culverts and side-drains to divert water from the infrastructure. Road pavements are constructed to established engineering standards that cater for prevailing traffic and also perform well in wet weather. Finally, side slopes of the roads are stabilised using grass/turf and retaining walls constructed to retain and minimise soil erosion. These designs have proved to be highly resistant to flooding during extreme weather. Routine Maintenance through community maintenance groups (CMG) ensures a continuous maintenance presence to attend to repairs of any emerging damages and thus avoiding any major damages to the roads.

Additional impact studies and capturing of stories of significant changes are encouraged for the Project to build upon the tentative gains derived in the past 20 months of operations. Strategies going forward into the project should include the introduction of case study methodologies to document and provide further evidence of the development of individual changes in capacity in key trainee beneficiaries.

## 5.5 Sustainability

**KEQ 22: How has the project infrastructure works contributed to climate resilience?**

Same as KEQ 21.

**KEQ 23: What has been the impact from improved local roads on connectivity, travel time and costs, and reliability during the rainy season and more extreme weather conditions, and how has this affected rural households?**

Sectional improvement of roads and installation of drainage structures have improved connectivity in those project areas and reduced travel time and costs. However, the full impact of the improved rural roads is too early to tell as full road rehabilitation works are yet to start in December 2022 (delayed due to earlier COVID-19 related lockdowns). There are assurances from the Project team that the rehabilitation works to commence in December 2022, will be completed by the Projects completion date of 31 August 2023. Meanwhile, there is a huge scope of works for rural roads and other infrastructure in the two project provinces and other provinces as depicted in Box 3.

### Box 3: Rural Access Roads

A World Bank report indicates that “the total length of Cambodia’s road network is 63,072 km, of which 74 percent account for rural roads. The road network was largely destroyed during the long period of unrest in the 1970s and 1980s. With the advent of peace, Cambodia’s initial focus was on reconstruction of the primary and secondary road network, followed by critical provincial and rural links to the main road network.

- “With 79 percent of the population living in rural areas, it will be important to improve rural road accessibility to help ensure inclusive economic development and address the remaining urban-rural gap in access to services. Although maintenance allocations have increased for national and provincial roads over the last decade, budget allocations for rural road maintenance have been marginal compared to the needs. This especially affects the maintenance of lower volume rural roads, which often remain in poor condition, making it more difficult for the rural population to access economic and social opportunities”.

**Source: The World Bank Report PIDA2772: Cambodia Road Connectivity Improvement, 24-Mar-2020.**

The Governor of Kampong Thom Province, a province nearby the two project provinces approached the Evaluator during his mission in Siem Reap and requested ILO to extend the project to its province as there is huge infrastructure backlog despite his Province’s huge capacity in agricultural production of rice.



The expansion of the scope of works and duration into a possible Phase 2 period would allow for consolidation of gains and meaningful impact to be realised. Impact surveys could be conducted during a proposed Phase 2.

**KEQ 24: How many households have benefited from the project in terms of (i) the jobs offered through the infrastructure works, (ii) improved access and (iii) the vocational training opportunities?**

9,900 households benefited from the infrastructure works in four (4) districts while 3,000 households have benefited from skills development. In addition, not less than 300 workers have received on-the-job training which is delivered by two TVET schools based in Battambang and Siem Reap provinces. More importantly, there will be more youth and workers to benefit from the project when the green and digital TVET packages developed and standardized under the support of the project and other ILO programmes have scaled up nationally.

**KEQ 25: To what extent have the workers and other trainees improved their employability as a result of project support?**

So far fourteen (14) civil work contractors- their engineers, supervisors and skilled workers received LRBT technical training and on-the-job training to manage and supervise their civil works contracts. Their unskilled workers (262) received on the job training on OSH and masonry training. Eight (8) Community Maintenance Group (CMG) leaders received on-the-job training to manage the community road maintenance works. Their unskilled workers (133 workers) receive on-the-job training on road maintenance, OSH and masonry works.

Interviewed staff of ministries and TVETs are very thankful for support to green/digital and blended TVET transformation including eRPL. During covid-19, all TVET schools could not operate as it was impossible to provide in-person training and had to close for a year. With the project's introduced blended learning, TVETs are able to operate both in-person and virtually.

The ILO-introduced Recognition of Prior Learning (eRPL) has been relevant to Cambodia as most of the 3,000 targeted migrant workers have very good working experience but do not have formal certificates of qualifications. Through the Project's eRPL, these migrant workers are able to be tested theoretically and practically and issued with certificates – thus having a tremendous impact on their increased employability. The green works digital TVET qualifications are also a means of boosting graduates' employability.

## 5.6 Summary of Key Findings

The following are the summary of key findings of the evaluation:

*Table 5: Summary of Key Evaluation Findings*

Criteria	
<b>Relevance and Strategic Fit</b>	<b>Key Findings</b>
<b>Validity of Project Design</b>	The Project design is comprehensive and detailed that retains a high level of relevance and validity. Development objectives and outcomes remain relevant and implementation and management arrangements are aligned to RGC approaches, policies and priorities. It is important for the Project to continue reviewing progress and engagement to ensure its implementation and management arrangements remain relevant and appropriate, particularly in light of any extension beyond the current phase or replication of the Project to other regions of the country.

<b>Effectiveness</b>	The Project is effective in that planned activities were implemented and results were on schedule in some cases. However, achievement was not equally distributed across the results framework with some under achievement in key areas, often due to external and extenuating circumstances outside its control. Overall, the project team has sufficient skills and experience to implement and achieve desired outputs. The management arrangement of the project was found to have been effective including the hosting of the ILO project team in two most COVID-19 affected provinces; having in place a PSC comprising key stakeholders in each province; and having easy access to both the administrative and technical backstopping support from the ILO Administrative Office, Country Director, the EIIP Senior Specialists and the and the Specialist in Skills and Employability respectively (in the ILO CO and ROAP in Bangkok). The Project monitoring and evaluation (M&E) system is in place and was found to be working well, producing and disseminating quarterly, bi-annual project progress reports on a regular and timely basis. The team has also been sharing relevant information with relevant national partners in a fairly effective manner through various fora including community meetings and workshops. However, the project's M&E system and its RF will need to be updated to include baseline data, milestones and mainstreaming of the project's M&E system with that of RGC's outcome-based approach, should the project be extended with the view of mainstreaming it into the RGC (Mol) system.
<b>Efficiency of Resource Use</b>	The Project's resources were found to be allocated strategically and their utilisation to be efficient, transparent and prudent to achieve defined outcomes. However, the project was delayed during the start phase due to COVID-19 related lockdowns and travel restrictions across the country in 2021 affecting the preparations for the infrastructure component. The difficulty of initially accessing ILO's IRIS as a fundamental tool for processing procurement and other administrative tasks in ILO operations also resulted in delays of all procurement including the preparation of purchase orders for goods and services which had to be processed at the ILO offices in Phnom Penh and Bangkok. The recent IRIS training has however, improved the situation and thus streamlined financial and administrative processes and accelerated work progress.
<b>Impact Orientation and Sustainability</b>	The ILO team has so far provided significant inputs towards impact and sustainability by way of employment creation, skills development and capacity building (through training, seminars, workshops and study tours, among others). Notwithstanding the short-term employment and training nature of project design (which was meant to be the case) some of its elements that needed attention and were reviewed to create the potential for promoting sustainability included: (i) Continued capacity building of Mol and MoLVT to adopt developed systems and apply employment-intensive methods in infrastructure works, as well as skills training for future employability; (ii) The continued political will of the Cambodian Government in support of project ideals and (iii) <i>Stakeholder involvement</i> at all levels for ownership.

## 6. Key Lessons Learned

The evaluation also considered a number of key lessons learned. The following provides an outline of the key lessons identified:

1. Notwithstanding the short-term employment nature of project design (which was meant to be the case), this approach still has a role to play in "normal" non-crisis times for providing rural infrastructure. If there is a continuous programme of this nature – it would be easier to scale up when responding to crisis situations – which occur on a rather frequent basis in Cambodia.
2. The Cambodian Government recognises the economic challenges facing vulnerable households as a result of the COVID-19 pandemic and is already implementing alleviating measures similar to those in this project. Many of these are based on ongoing programmes including public works schemes improving rural infrastructure works. Still, the magnitude of required support has justified both the complementary effect of the Project in terms of additional employment and income generation, infrastructure improvements and skills development.
3. The context and implementing environment of the project are well described in the project document and remain relevant. Discussions with local authorities confirm that improved and climate-resilient infrastructure remains a priority in rural communities. On-going programmes also confirm this and that the needs remain higher than the supply.
4. Past ILO support for rural development was carried out in close collaboration with the PDRD. With the current mandate of the PDRD and Mol, it is logical that this collaboration continues, thereby benefiting

from the extensive technical know-how and local knowledge found in these departments. In addition, the Government has established a new technical capacity in the Community Support Office of the Planning and Investment Divisions, primarily focusing on supporting infrastructure development at the commune level.

5. The combined institutional capacity of the PDRDs, the Community Support Offices and district administrations provide a solid institutional framework through which relevant support can be channelled to community infrastructure works and new rural employment opportunities. The long and solid ongoing technical assistance from ILO to support skills development in Cambodia at the policy and operational level has facilitated the implementation of project interventions. The holistic and practical step-by-step measures in the transformation of digital TVET are a promising strategy to move the TVET sector forward and to adapt the TVET sector to a changing world of work.
6. Employment-intensive public works programmes have been used in Cambodia to provide vulnerable households with alternative income in several past crises. The interest in these alternative job opportunities appears strong when decent work conditions are offered and as such concurs with earlier studies carried out by the ILO in Cambodia and elsewhere. Wage rates need to be perceived as fair regarding the nature of the work to be performed and at a rate that supports essential expenditure in a household. The joint findings of the Project and the Department of Labour in Siem Reap regarding appropriate wage rates are therefore important and guides the rate offered by the ILO project.
7. Applying local resource-based approaches and employment-intensive work methods in rural infrastructure works to create jobs for vulnerable communities and returning migrants is well appreciated.
8. Experience from the start-up phase of this and other recent projects, clearly show the importance of recruiting admin and finance as soon as possible and providing proper access to financial management systems in order to secure the timely preparation of necessary logistics arrangements including procurement of equipment to equip the office and other support facilities.
9. Rural road infrastructure plays a major part in local adaptation to climate change. Rural roads need to be constructed to withstand increasing intensities of rainfall and flooding. Rural roads need to be built to sound standards with designs that withstand the local impacts of climate change. This means that additional investments in rural roads will be needed to help vulnerable communities to withstand the potential impact of future crises.
10. Climate change adaptation measures and climate resilient solutions are being integrated into rural roads planning and design. Structures such as bridges, culverts, side surface drains, mitre drains, retaining walls, catchwater drains, scour checks and gabion protection works are increasingly important, and can be constructed and maintained using local resource-based approaches.
11. Environmental surveys and community consultations are useful prior to construction/rehabilitation works to identify potential environmental risks and provide effective mitigation measures to avoid negative impacts from the roadworks. Organising regular compliance checks are important during work implementation to ensure contractors are following appropriate environmental procedures.
12. A community-based Routine Maintenance system, using locally-based Community Maintenance Groups, is an effective approach that provides a continuous maintenance presence on rural roads that is able to timely respond to damages thereby maintaining good climate resilience and prolonging the lifetime of the roads. Locally-based commercial contractors are useful when there is a need for major works.

## 7. Key Conclusions and Recommendations

The conclusions provided below are an effort to summarise the overall relevance, effectiveness and level of satisfaction of the Project based on the findings and evidence provided. It is not definitive or judgemental but does provide a professional sound assessment of progress under the Project. The recommendations provided should be viewed in light of the findings and used to help guide implementation and management into completion and possible future phases.



## 7.1 Key Conclusions

The Project has a sound rationale and internal consistency of project inputs, outputs and outcomes, management structure and processes to successfully complete the project. At the operational level the main challenges have been the external human and natural factors leading to delays. The Project has built on previous ILO and other development partners' interventions to further refine appropriate systems, processes and resilience that should continue to be mainstreamed into government systems but it requires additional time to complete these activities.

Lessons from the exploration of mitigation measures against externally imposed delays have been learnt and addressed and should therefore not be a hindrance to the Project's successful and timely completion. Having overcome these, a possible extension beyond the current phase or replication to other regions would be in a position to minimise such risks.

The overall strategic intent and focus of the Project remains valid. The Project was designed with the intention not only to provide short-term employment through rural infrastructure but also to strengthen the institutional arrangements around which rural roads are prioritised, planned and supported. The approach remains consistent with RGC's priorities.

The Project has made solid progress towards the achievement of key outputs and outcomes. The initial design presented clear and tangible outputs linked to defined outcomes. Progress was sound despite a number of key implementation challenges. The project effectiveness presented good progress towards the achievement of outputs. The project resources were allocated strategically for the most part effectively to achieve defined outputs and outcomes.

As indicated in the report, management arrangements were sound. The management structure was appropriate for the scope of work. Much of the decision-making power and leadership was vested in the Project team. The abrupt resignation of the former Project Manager momentarily stalled the progress momentum. It is expected that the procurement hiccups caused by the delayed access to ILO IRIS will not be repeated.

The Project is well positioned to provide short to medium term solutions. Consistent and conscientious review of current project's strategies, policies, documents and approaches to work are actively encouraged so as to ensure the gains made are continued and the project retains its flexible and responsive nature to meet the developing priorities of the RGC.

## 7.2 Key Recommendations

The Table below provides the evaluation's key recommendations:

*Table 6: Key Recommendations*

Criteria	Key Recommendations
Relevance	<p><b><u>Recommendation 1:</u></b> Employment-intensive programmes such as this Project can support rural population's economic recovery from the economic impact of sudden pandemics (e.g., COVID-19) and can also be used in a regular development context to improve skills and livelihoods in a post pandemic scenario. In this context, this project is a highly suitable platform to continue into a possible Phase 2 - to support economic recovery through the application of EIA work methods and LRBT that generate new employment and income earning opportunities as well as upgrading skills for vulnerable and returning migrant women and men across Cambodia.</p> <p><b><u>Recommendation 2:</u></b> Green/digital transformation and blended TVET Transformation including eRPL is new in Cambodia. As capacity development support is a long-term process which cannot be realised in the current Project of less than 2 years of effective implementation, it is imperative that the skills and capacity development component is continued to ensure that relevant ministries and TVET institutions build sufficient capacity to continue functioning without further external support.</p>

Effectiveness	<p><b>Recommendation 3:</b> The readily available New Zealand donor-funding as well as the application of ILO's well-established approaches and procedures contributed to the smooth running of the project.</p> <p><b>Recommendation 4:</b> As there appears to be no road inventory and condition assessment data to ascertain the conditions of the road network of the communes, it would be useful in future support to the Mol and PDRD to introduce a road asset management system.</p> <p><b>Recommendation 5:</b> The Project and Mol/PDRD to consider strategies to further strengthen the governance arrangements through the established two PSCs in the two Project provinces.</p>
Efficiency (Resources and Management)	<p><b>Recommendation 6:</b> The Project should further provide continued support to Mol towards enhancing efficiency of project activities (e.g. by integrating and strengthening linkages with private sector actors; supporting artisanship development; promoting sustainable linkages with financial service providers; institutionalising training of EIA through the TVETs, build on past ILO efforts to explore the viability of integrating and mainstreaming EIA training into higher institutions of learnings) so as to create longer term work opportunities and promote sustainable livelihoods and undertaking relevant impact studies.</p>
Impact and Sustainability	<p><b>Recommendation 7:</b> Provision of requisite technical support to Mol in developing and operationalising appropriate mechanisms for knowledge transfer to implementing staff and in formulating a comprehensive project sustainability and exit strategy. In the Skills component this is a continuous process. For the infrastructure component, it would demand additional resources, however some of this could be explored in a future phase.</p>

## Annex 1 – Evaluation Terms of Reference

for the internal mid-term evaluation of

Project KHM/21/02/NZL - COVID-19 socio-economic recovery for returning migrants and host communities in North West Cambodia

Project Title	COVID-19 socio-economic recovery for returning migrants and host communities in North West Cambodia
TC project code	KHM/21/02/NZL
Donors	Ministry of Foreign Affairs and Trade, New Zealand
Total approved budget	NZD\$ 4,500,000 (US\$ 3.24 million)
ILO Administrative unit	ILO Country Office for Thailand, Cambodia and Lao PDR
ILO Technical Units	ILO Decent Work Technical Support Team for East and South East Asia and the Pacific (DWT-Bangkok)
Period of evaluation	October to December 2022
Evaluation focal person	Eav Kong, Project Manager
TOR preparation date	October 2022

### Project summary

The project addresses pressing needs to create jobs and provide skills development in remittance-dependent communities - targeting returned migrants and vulnerable households – to mitigate the economic impact of the COVID-19 pandemic. More than 2,500 job opportunities and 60,000 workdays will be created through employment-intensive rural infrastructure works, thereby improving livelihoods and climate resilience. Simultaneously, blended TVET training will be developed and upgraded in related construction skills and other sectors in demand by the labour market. Targeting 3,000 beneficiaries, the project will increase the future employability of returning migrants and job seekers from vulnerable households.

The project covers Kaos Kralo and Rukhah Kiri districts in Battambang Province and Puok and Angkor Chum districts in Siem Reap Province. The main target beneficiaries include (i) external and internal returning migrants; (ii) families of returning migrants; (iii) vulnerable households who have lost their work income; and (v) local entrepreneurs involved in infrastructure works.

### Achievements to date

The project is currently in its second year, with a revised completion date in August 2023.

**Infrastructure works:** The project has worked closely with district and commune authorities to identify and select high priority infrastructure works. Since the involved districts are located in flood prone areas, local communities prioritised rehabilitation and maintenance of local access roads and the improvement of drainage systems, thereby building resilience against future floods and securing all-weather road access. The identified works are located on local access roads which are under the responsibility of the commune administrations. Due to limited financial and technical resources, the condition of these roads varies greatly with the poorest ones lacking key drainage structures and built to levels below typical flood levels.

Climate resilience measures are therefore high on the agenda for communities in the project area, in particular in terms of being able to access basic services such as schools and health services as well as

local markets during the rainy season. Through detailed field surveys, the project has identified the necessary works and prepared detailed designs for climate proofing such infrastructure.

The construction works include measures such as raising the levels of road embankments, adding more cross-drainage structures, adding gravel surface seals and protecting side slopes from erosion. Equally, the maintenance works also includes flood protection measures such as drainage clearing and erosion protection works, besides protecting existing infrastructure assets.

Smaller repair and routine maintenance works rely on contracts with community groups while more comprehensive improvement works are awarded to local construction firms.

**Employment generation:** Through the use of employment-intensive work methods the project is able to increase the number of job opportunities. Special efforts are made to reach out and offer employment to vulnerable households and adhering to Decent Work principles (including minimum wages, equal pay for work of equal value, occupational safety and health, social inclusion and COVID-19 prevention measures).

**Training:** Vocational training is being developed to improve skills and strengthen employability of workers in construction and other sectors in demand by the labour market. The project also works closely with other on-going ILO support to TVET training in Cambodia. Technical support is at present being provided to local TVET institutions to deliver accredited vocational training in selected trades.

## Scope of evaluation

The purpose of this mid-term evaluation is to review progress against the expected project deliverables and outcomes and to propose any course of correction for the project's final year. In so doing it will identify the achievements, good practices and lessons learned from the project.

The evaluation will apply OECD/DAC criteria looking at effectiveness, efficiency and impact/sustainability. It will identify and assess significant contributions and potential impact (social, economic, and environmental) of the project as per the Theory of Change and its results framework. The following areas of achievements and impact will be explored:

- (iv) generation of new job opportunities with decent conditions of employment, resulting from the infrastructure works (improved livelihoods, OSH, conditions of employment, wages, etc.)
- (v) all-weather access for rural communities to social services including schools and health care as well as markets and other economic activities (travel time and costs, regularity, climate resilience, etc.)
- (vi) Improved vocational skills and employability resulting from the project training component.

The evaluation will also provide forward-looking recommendations to identify good practices in the context of rural infrastructure works, skills development and green jobs creation. What approaches seems to work well with government, private sector and local communities? What can be done better? Are there any insights to overcoming particular challenges?

While this project was conceived as an emergency response to the negative impact of the COVID-19 pandemic, it is worth exploring how ILO support of this nature can be used in a regular development context to improve skills and livelihoods in a post pandemic scenario. In this context, it would be useful to assess the overall needs for this type of support and how it can best be provided in the future. Finally, it is worthwhile to explore whether there are particular activities that would benefit from further attention in future programmes.

## Evaluation criteria and questions

Below are proposed evaluation criteria and questions. The evaluation questions may be modified by the evaluator for a more detailed analytical framework with sub-questions. Equally, the evaluator may discover additional criteria that may be relevant to this exercise.

### Relevance

- a) Briefly, do the goals of the project remain relevant to current government development ambitions? Equally, how does the project contribute to the development goals of UN and the ILO, and finally the needs of people in Cambodia?
- b) Rationale for channelling this support through the ILO, its comparative advance in rural infrastructure works, job creation and skills development in Cambodia;
- c) Is the project able to reach out to the intended project beneficiaries such as retrenched migrant workers and vulnerable households in terms of offering new job opportunities and skills development?
- d) Does the chosen type of infrastructure development work meet the concerns of local communities in terms of improving livelihoods and climate resilience?
- e) Is there potential for doing more of the same, both in terms infrastructure works, job creation and skills development? Assess the need for continued support applying a similar approach to increase job opportunities and improve employability among workers from rural households;

### Effectiveness

- f) Assess the effectiveness of the project implementation strategy in terms of timely delivery of the infrastructure works, employment generation, and the development and conduct of training;
- g) Assess progress of outputs so far on infrastructure works, job creation and training delivery - and projections of outputs until the scheduled end date of the project;
- h) Appropriateness of selection of infrastructure, work content and methods, and applied design standards;
- i) How the project infrastructure works and TVET training contributes to climate resilience;
- j) The extent to which the project has managed to build partnerships with other related development programmes and thereby achieved synergy effects.

### Efficiency

- k) Ability to mobilise project resources, logistical support and timely commencement of project activities;
- l) Efficiency of team, size and composition, mobilisation, adequacy of competencies of TA team members and use of international versus locally recruited personnel;
- m) The extent to which the project has managed to build effective working relations with relevant counterpart organisations at central and local levels;
- n) Have the contracting modalities, choice of technology and work methods resulted in timely, cost-efficient and quality works and training delivery?
- o) Assess how the project is benefiting from the joint cooperation with other ILO skills development support activities.

### Impact and sustainability

- p) Assess how the project infrastructure works contribute to climate resilience;
- q) The impact from improved local roads on connectivity, travel time and costs, and reliability during the rainy season and more extreme weather conditions, and how this affects rural households;

- r) Assess how and the number of households that benefit from (i) the jobs offered through the infrastructure works, (ii) improved access and (iii) the vocational training opportunities;
- s) The extent to which workers and other trainees are improving their employability as a result of project support;

## **Methodology**

The evaluation will apply mixed-methods, analysing both quantitative and qualitative data through desk reviews, key informant interviews and field visits, and will integrate gender equality other non-discrimination issues as a cross-cutting concern throughout its methodology and all deliverables.

### **Desk review**

- Project documents (including relevant technical notes, manuals and guidelines), progress reports, DWCP country reports and briefing notes.
- Other relevant documents e.g. missions, workshop and training reports, project budgets, expenditure, logical framework, quantitative and qualitative surveys/assessment, work plans, procurement documents, etc.

**Interviews and consultations with key stakeholders and partners:** The evaluator will need to conduct interviews with relevant partners including:

- Provincial and commune staff involved in the project,
- Local contractors and community groups undertaking roadworks,
- Collaborating TVET institutions,
- Embassy staff responsible for supporting the project,
- Technical staff responsible for backstopping the project (HQ and at ILO's Decent Work Team for Asia and the Pacific),
- Staff from the ILO Country Office responsible for providing administrative support to the project,
- Current and available past project staff,
- ILO constituents and private sector i.e. contractors,
- Project beneficiaries.

**Field visits:** The evaluator will select field visit locations to observe on-going and completed work sites and to meet with community leaders and project beneficiaries. Meetings with beneficiaries should aim to secure an equal number of women and men.

The evaluator will develop systematic data collection tools (i.e. checklists, guides and/or questionnaires as part of the inception report to guide the interviews, capture qualitative and quantitative data and ensure objectivity and consistency in interviews. This will also help the evaluator identify knowledge gaps that need to be verified and validated through the interviews.

The evaluator will present preliminary findings in a workshop for project partners before leaving Cambodia. Participation from the donor and ILO can be secured through teleconferencing the workshop or arranging a separate teleconference after the in-country briefing event. This will help in validating findings when preparing the draft report. Upon completion of the draft report the evaluator will take part in a teleconference to provide a debriefing to the donor and the ILO on the evaluation findings, conclusions, recommendations as well as the evaluation process.

## **Deliverables**

The evaluation comprises the following deliverables, which will be submitted in electronic version compatible with Word for Windows:

- (i) A brief inception report (following ILO inception report and methodological guidelines),
- (ii) The preliminary findings as a PowerPoint presentation,
- (iii) Draft Evaluation Report (following standard ILO format),
- (iv) A final evaluation report and standalone evaluation summary.<sup>7</sup>

**The inception report should**

- Provide a brief project description and explain the theory of change underlying the project;
- Briefly describe the methodology proposed for the assignment;
- Set out in some detail the data required to answer some evaluation questions, selection criteria of respondents for interviews, identification of field visits, etc.;
- Present any tools to be used for interviews and field visits etc.;
- Detail the work plan for the evaluation, showing the phases in the evaluation, key activities, deliverables and milestones.

**Draft evaluation report:** A draft report for comments will be prepared according to the outline described below. It will be shared with all relevant stakeholders before arriving at a final version that integrates the comments.

**Final evaluation report and stand-alone evaluation summary:** The report will be prepared following [ILO guidelines for evaluation reports](#).<sup>8</sup> The evaluator will incorporate inputs and comments from key stakeholders to finalize the evaluation report. The report should not exceed 30 pages excluding annexes. The structure is outlined below:

- Cover page
- Table of contents
- Executive summary with key findings, conclusions and recommendations, as well as any lessons learned or good practices
- Acronyms
- Description of the project
- Purpose, scope and clients of evaluation
- Methodology
- Findings (organized by the main evaluation criteria)
- Conclusions and Recommendations
- Lessons learned and good practices
- Annexes including ToR, questionnaires, list of documents reviewed, list of key informant interviews, focus group discussions, etc.

**Management of evaluation**

The mid-term evaluation will be carried out by an international consultant who will be responsible for the deliverables in this ToR. He/she will be supported by the project team and will be required to ensure the quality of data (validity, reliability, consistency, and accuracy) throughout the evaluation.

The Evaluation will be supported by ILO's Regional Evaluation Officer in Bangkok, who will provide quality control throughout the evaluation process.

The evaluation contract will be administratively managed by the ILO Country Office for Thailand, Cambodia and Laos.

Logistical support will be provided by the project. The project team will also assist in organising in-country meetings and field visits, and ensure that all relevant documentation is up-to-date and accessible.

---

<sup>7</sup> The template is available at: <http://www.ilo.org/legacy/english/edmas/eval/template-summary-en.doc>

<sup>8</sup> See report guidelines at: [http://www.ilo.org/eval/Evaluationguidance/WCMS\\_165967/lang--en/index.htm](http://www.ilo.org/eval/Evaluationguidance/WCMS_165967/lang--en/index.htm)

## Timeframe

The evaluation is planned to take place between late October and December 2022, based on the provisional workplan as shown in the table below. The evaluator may wish to re-allocate days for different activities of the evaluation as long as the overall number of days remains unchanged. The total work days is 26.

Task/deliverables	Workdays	Tentative deadline
<b>Inception Phase</b>		
Desk review and initial discussion with project team and specialists	3	
Drafting of inception report	3	
Circulation of inception report and receipt of comments		20 Oct 2022
Final Inception Report	1	1 Nov 2022
<b>Field mission</b>		
Field visits and interviews/ meetings with key stakeholders and beneficiaries	7	3 Nov 2022
Preliminary findings workshop	2	15 Nov 2022
<b>Report writing</b>		
Draft evaluation report	6	
Presentation of findings	1	25 Nov 2022
Circulation of draft evaluation report (1 week for comments)	--	
Finalize evaluation report and summary sheet	3	15 Dec 2022

## Competencies of the evaluator

- No previous involvement in the design and delivery of the project;
- University degree in civil engineering with minimum 10 years of experience in implementing rural infrastructure works and vocational skills development;
- Extensive experience in the planning and implementation of labour-based infrastructure development programmes;
- Past experience in the evaluation of rural development projects;
- Experience in the application of results-based management principles, theory of change and logical framework analysis for programming;
- Ability to bring gender and non-discrimination dimensions into the evaluation, including in data collection analysis and writing;
- Demonstrate an understanding of ILO mandates and decent work agenda;
- Excellent analytical and communication skills;
- Fluency in spoken and written English;
- Flexible and responsive to changes and demands, client-oriented and open to feedback.



## Annex 2: Evaluation criteria and questions

Evaluation Criteria	Primary Questions	Secondary Key Questions
<b>Relevance and Strategic Fit</b>	Is the Project doing the right thing?	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. To what extent do the goals of the project remain relevant to current government development ambitions? Equally, how does the project contribute to the development goals of the UN and the ILO, and finally the needs of people in Cambodia?</li> <li>2. What was the rationale for channelling this support through the ILO, its comparative advance in rural infrastructure works, job creation and skills development in Cambodia;</li> <li>3. Is the project able to reach out to the intended project beneficiaries such as retrenched migrant workers and vulnerable households in terms of offering new job opportunities and skills development?</li> <li>4. Does the chosen type of infrastructure development work meet the concerns of local communities in terms of improving livelihoods and climate resilience?</li> <li>5. Is there potential for doing more of the same, both in terms infrastructure works, job creation and skills development?</li> <li>6. Is there the need for continued support applying a similar approach to increase job opportunities and improve employability among workers from rural households;</li> </ol>

<b>Effectiveness</b>	Are the Project's outcomes/ outputs being achieved?	<p>7. How effective are the project implementation strategies in achieving the Project targets in terms of timely delivery of the infrastructure works, employment generation, and the development and conduct of training; What are the good practices and lessons to be learned from the Project approach and strategies? What are the key lessons learned and recommendations for the design of possible future roads support.</p> <p>8. Is the achieving progress of outputs on schedule regarding infrastructure works, job creation and training delivery - and projections of outputs until the scheduled end date of the project?</p> <p>9. How appropriate are the criteria of selection of infrastructure, work content and methods, and applied design standards?</p> <p>10. How have the project infrastructure works and TVET training contributed to climate resilience;</p> <p>11. How effective are local civil works contractors in implementing rural road works? Are they implementing rural road works according to contractual standards? How has the Project contributed towards increased contractor capacity, employment and income of local communities for rehabilitation and maintenance of rural roads?</p> <p>12. How effectively has the Project strengthened GoC capacity for integrating social safeguards measures in rural road works, including occupational safety and health measures? What are the good practices and lessons learned from the Project's approach? What have been the main challenges?</p> <p>13. To what extent has the Project contributed to gender and disability and social inclusion and opportunities/gaps? How can the Project promote gender and disability and social inclusion more effectively?</p>
<b>Efficiency of resource usage</b>	How well are resources used?	<p>14. How well have project resources including logistical support been mobilised for timely commencement of project activities;</p> <p>15. How efficient is the project team in terms of size and composition, mobilisation, adequacy of competencies of TA team members and use of international versus locally recruited personnel?</p> <p>16. To what extent has the project managed to build effective working relations with relevant counterpart organisations at central and local levels;</p> <p>17. Have the contracting modalities, choice of technology and work methods resulted in timely, cost-efficient and quality works and training delivery?</p> <p>18. How has the project been benefiting from the joint cooperation with other ILO skills development support activities?</p>

<b>Sustainability</b>	Will the benefits of the Project last?	<p>19. To what extent do the net benefits of the intervention continue or are likely to continue.</p> <p>20. To what extent is the Project promoting decent work for both men and women in the target communities, including men and women with disability, maximising sustainability, and promoting accountability and transparency?</p> <p>21. Are the products (improved rural roads) climate resilient? To what extent do they withstand the effects of weather-related events and disasters such as flood, storm surge and droughts including future events?</p>
<b>Impact</b>	What difference does the Project make?	<p>22. How has the project infrastructure works contributed to climate resilience?</p> <p>23. What has been the impact from improved local roads on connectivity, travel time and costs, and reliability during the rainy season and more extreme weather conditions, and how this affects rural households;</p> <p>24. How many households have benefited from the project in terms of (i) the jobs offered through the infrastructure works, (ii) improved access and (iii) the vocational training opportunities;</p> <p>25. To what extent have the workers and other trainees improved their employability as a result of project support?</p>

## Annex 3: In-Country Mission Schedule

### Program for Evaluation Consultant's (Augustus Osei Asare) Stakeholder Interviews: 25/11 – 07/12/2022

DATE	STAKEHOLDER MEETING	NAME OF REPRESENTATIVE TO BE INTERVIEWED	Designation/ Topic	TIME	VENUE	ILO Focal point /Remarks
Sunday-27 November	Key Project International and National Staff:	Eav Kong, Chheng Soaleng, Keo Sovannchan Phearum, Tuy Lalin, Nhep Sophara, Tourk Otdom, Som Roun and Heng Bunmanut	Project staff of the ILO_NZL project	9:00 am	ILO project office in Siem Reap for the staff based in Sem Reap, others will be met on Zoom	Eav Kong
	Contractors' meeting	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Mr Am Lo</li> <li>Mr Ky Pouk</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Director of Am Lo Construction Co.</li> <li>Director of AMRL company</li> </ul>	11:30 am	ILO project office in Siem Reap	Tuy Lalin
Monday 28, November	TVET School (NPIC, a TVET school based in Phnom Penh)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Mr. Muong Phasy Deputy Director and Mr. Hin Chandara, Head of short course training</li> </ul>	Capacity building on blended and green TVET transformation Development and delivery of blended and green TVET training packages to youths, workers including returning migrant workers	8:30 am	Virtual Zoom link: <a href="https://ilo-org.zoom.us/j/98425615832">https://ilo-org.zoom.us/j/98425615832</a>	Chheng Saoleng
	ILO-Phnom Penh	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Mr Finn Koh, SOCPRO CTA</li> </ul>	OIC, ILO-Phnom Penh	10:45 am	Virtual On Zoom: <a href="https://ilo-org.zoom.us/j/97528825113">https://ilo-org.zoom.us/j/97528825113</a>	Eav Kong Courtesy call
	TVET school National Polytechnic Institute of Angkor (NPIA)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Mr. Rath Ratanak, Deputy director of NPIA and his relevant staff</li> </ul>	Capacity building on blended and green TVET transformation Development and delivery of blended and green TVET training packages to youths, students returning migrant workers	2:00 pm	Face to face 60 Road, Krong Siem Reap, Cambodia	Chheng Saoleng (Mr. Kong will accompany the consultant)
	Project Consultant	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Ms. Eng Saloth, CBED (enterprise) consultant</li> </ul>	Design and delivery of community-based enterprise development for small business owners (for Covid 19 acceleration)	6:30 pm	Virtual Zoom link: <a href="https://ilo-org.zoom.us/j/95923022221">https://ilo-org.zoom.us/j/95923022221</a>	Tourk Sovannotdom
Tuesday 29, November	MoLVT Staff	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>H.E Thorng Samon (Deputy Director of General Directorate of TVET)</li> </ul>	Contribution of ILO (NZL project) to the green and digital	8:30 am	Virtual Zoom link:	Chheng Saoleng

			transformation of green and digital TVET		<a href="https://ilo-org.zoom.us/j/92457762632">https://ilo-org.zoom.us/j/92457762632</a>	
	Mol Staff (Provincial Governor office, Siem Reap)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Mr Tip Piseth</li> </ul>	Director of the Provincial Department of Planning and Investment	10:30 am	Office of the Planning and Investment department, Provincial Governor office, Siem Reap	Eav Kong
	TVET School École d'Hôtellerie et de Tourisme Paul Dubrule (EHT)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Meeting 1: EHT management (Director, deputy direct, and Projects &amp; Communications Manager)</li> <li>Meeting 2: Teachers and students currently undertaking blended learning</li> </ul>	<p>Capacity building on blended and green TVET transformation</p> <p>Development and delivery of blended and green TVET training packages</p>	2:00 pm	Face to face EHT, La Glacière, National Road 6, Siem Reap-Angkor, Cambodia	Chheng Soleng (Mr. Kong will accompany the consultant)
	MoT (Ministry of Tourism)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>H.E TRY Chhiv and his colleague (Director of NCTP &amp; Advisor to MoT) &amp; his colleagues</li> </ul>	Contribution of ILO (NZL project) to the green and digital transformation of green and digital TVET	16:00 pm – 17:30 pm	Virtual Zoom link: <a href="https://ilo-org.zoom.us/j/97767623311">https://ilo-org.zoom.us/j/97767623311</a>	Chheng Saoleng
Wednesday, 30 Nov	Project Sites to be visited in Siem Reap	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Meeting with Mr Sin Chan Thol and</li> <li>Ms Tim Sokunthy</li> <li>Ms Duch Malin</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Governor of Pouk district</li> <li>Chief of Prey Chuk commune</li> <li>Chief of Yeang commune</li> </ul>	9:30 am	meeting at the Office of Yeang commune	Tuy Lalin
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Visit completed culvert construction contracts</li> <li>Visit community road routine maintenance contracts</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>ILO Project staff-Mr Tuy Lalin, Mr Som Suom, Mr Eav Kong</li> </ul>	After the meeting	Sites tour to get an insight into the work progress and approach	Tuy Lalin
Thursday, 1 Dec	Project site visit, Battambang	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Visit completed culvert construction contracts</li> <li>Visit community road routine maintenance contracts</li> </ul>	ILO Project staff-Mr Nhep Sophara, Mr Som Ruom, Mr Eav Kong	Thursday 6:30 am - depart Siem Reap for BTB	Sites tour to get an insight into the work progress and approach	Nhep Sophara
Friday, 2 Dec Friday 2 Dec	Project site visit, Battambang	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Meeting with Mr Van Thol</li> <li>Meeting with Mr Seng Savuth</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Director of PDRD Battambang</li> <li>Head of road division, Battambang</li> </ul>	Friday 8:30 am-09:30 am	Meeting at the office of DRPD Battambang	Nhep Sophara
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Meeting with NVIB's director: Mr. Heng Ngounhort</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Capacity building on blended and green TVET transformation</li> </ul>	10:00 am – 11:30 am	Meeting face-to-face at the National Vocation Institute of Battambang (NVIB)	Nhep Sophara

			<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Development and delivery of blended and green TVET training packages to youths, students returning migrant workers</li> <li>On-the-job skills training</li> </ul>			
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Lunch and Depart to Siem Reap</li> </ul>		11:30-14:30		
	Wrap-up/ Debriefing Meeting	All project staff (KHM-21-02-NZL)		14:30 pm	ILO project office in Siem Reap and on Zoom for staff outside Siem Reap	Eav Kong
	ILO- Country Office for Debriefing	Graeme Buckley	DWT/CO Director DWT-Bangkok	4:00 pm Bangkok time	On Zoom	Eav Kong
Monday 6 Dec	ILO Backstopping	Mr Bjorn Johannessen	EIIP – Sr Engineer-EIIP-DWT Bangkok	2:00 pm BKK time	On Zoom	Eav Kong
		Mr Julien Magnat	Spec in Skills and Employability, DWT Bangkok	4:00 pm BKK time	On Zoom	Eav Kong
Tuesday 7 Dec	MFAT Staff	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Mr Matthew Allen,</li> <li>Ms Natthanun (Nan) Patcharapunchai,</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>First Secretary, New Zealand Embassy Bangkok</li> <li>Development Programme Coordinator, New Zealand Embassy Bangkok</li> </ul>	2:00 pm BKK time	On Zoom	Eav Kong



## Annex 4 - List of People Met (In-Person and Virtual)

Name	Organization	Position
Mr. Mathew Allen	MFAT - New Zealand Embassy	First Secretary
Ms. Naththanun Patcharapunchai	MFAT - New Zealand Embassy	Development Programme Coordinator
H.E Thorng Samon	MOLVT	Deputy Director - General Directorate of TVET
H.E Try Chhiv	MoT (Ministry of Tourism)	Director of NCTP & Advisor to MoT
Mr. Graeme Buckley	ILO – DWT, Cambodia, Thailand, Lao	Director, DWT Country Director
Mr Bjorn Johannessen	ILO - ROAP	EIIP DWT Senior Specialist
Mr. Julien Magnat	ILO - ROAP	Specialist in Skills and Employability
Mr Finn Koh,	ILO - SOCPRO	CTA and OIC, ILO-Phnom Penh
Mr. Tip Piseth	Mol - Provincial Department of Planning and Investment	Director
Mr. Finn Koh,	International Labour Organization	SOCPRO CTA and ILO-OIC
Mr. Eav Kong	ILO - KHM/21/02/NZL Project	Project Manager
Mr. Chheng Soaleng	ILO - KHM/21/02/NZL Project	National Skills Development Coordinator
Mr. Keo S. Phearum	ILO - KHM/21/02/NZL Project	
Mr. Tourk Sovanotdom	ILO - KHM/21/02/NZL Project	Assistant Skills Development Coordinator
Mr. Tuy Lalin	ILO - KHM/21/02/NZL Project	Field Engineer – Siem Reap
Mr. Nhep Sophara	ILO - KHM/21/02/NZL Project	Field Engineer – Battambang
Mr. Som Roun	ILO - KHM/21/02/NZL Project	Technician - Battambang
Mr. Heng Bunmanut	ILO - KHM/21/02/NZL Project	
Mr. Am Lo	Am Lo Construction Co. Ltd.	Contractor, Managing Director,
Mr. Ky Pouk	AMRL Construction Co. Ltd.	Contractor, Managing Director,
Mr. Muong Phasy	TVET- NPIC	Deputy Director,
Mr. Hin Chandara	TVET - NPIC	Head of short course training,
Mr. Rath Ratanak	TVET - NPIA	Deputy director
Ms. Eng Saloth,	ILO- Enterprises (CBED)	Project Consultant
Mr. Enrique Blanco	TVET - EHT	Projects and Communications Manager
Mr. Poy Seyla	TVET - EHT	Hospitality Tutor
Ms. Kont Soung	TVET - EHT	Tourist Student
Mr. Van Thol	PDRD	Director, Battambang
Mr. Seng Saavath	PDRD	Head of Roads Division, Battambang
Mr. Hem Sovann	PDRD	Deputy Director, Battambang
Mr. Roth Ratanak	TVET- NPIA	Director
Mrs. Seng Kannica	TVET - NPIA	Deputy Director
Mr Muong Phasy	TVET - NPIC	Deputy Director
Mr. Hin Chandara	TVET - NPIC	Head of Short Course Training
Mr. Heng Ngoun Hort	TVET - NVIB	Director
Mr. Sok Kun	TVET - NVIB	Deputy Director
Mr. Neang Lyvuth	TVET - NVIB	Deputy Director
Mr. Sean Leam	TVET - NVIB	Deputy Head of Construction Department
Khean Piseth	TVET - NVIB	Technical Instructor
Mr. Bin Rorth	Mol	Provincial Engineer
Mr Sin Chan Thol	Pouk district	Governor
Ms. Tim Sokunthy	Prey Chuk Commune	Chief of Commune
Ms. Duch Malin	Yeang commune	Chief of Commune
Mr. Chen Samon	Doun Ba Commune	Chief of Commune
Mrs. Muth Sochea	Doun Ba Commune	First Deputy of Commune
Mrs. Mean Sophea	Doun Ba Commune	Commune Assistant
Mr. Duch Oudom	Toul Lieb Commune	CMG Team Leader
Mrs. Mey Somin	Toul Lieb Commune	CMG Member
Mrs. Nov Sakhorn	Toul Lieb Commune	CMG Member
Mrs. Ham Hen	Toul Lieb Commune	CMG Member

## Annex 5 – Documents Consulted and Reviewed

No	Name of Document
1	KHM/21/02/NZL Implementation Plan
2	KHM/21/02/NZL Annual Report: April 2021 – April 2022
3	KHM/21/02/NZL Quarterly Progress Report: June – October 2021
4	KHM/21/02/NZL Quarterly Progress Report: May – November 2022
5	KHM/21/02/NZL Project Brief
6	Technical Manual - Labour-Based Road Construction Methods, MRD
7	Labour Based Technical Manual – Volumes 1,2,3
8	Labour Based Training (LBT) Manual
9	Standard Culvert Design
10	Pre-bid Training Materials
11	Labour Mobilization Training Materials
12	Call for proposal “Blended TVET, Online Recognition Prior Learning (eRPL) and Green TVET”. Finding Innovations to Digital and Green Transformation of TVET system in Cambodia - Applicant’s Guideline.
13	Green transformation of TVET: A summary note on the support of ILO in the transformation of green TVET in Cambodia
14	Social & Environmental Safeguards Framework, Cambodia, October 2022
15	Procedures for identification and selection of Labour to implement the EIIP infrastructure
16	COVID-19 Guidelines, Cambodia. October 2022
17	Project Visibility Materials
18	KHM/21/02/NZL Sample Road Rehabilitation Contract
19	KHM/21/02/NZL Sample Culverts Contract
20	KHM/21/02/NZL Sample CMG Routine Maintenance Contract

### Relevant ILO evaluation guidelines and standard templates

- 2.1 Code of conduct form (Reviewed and acknowledged by the evaluator)  
[http://www.ilo.org/eval/Evaluationguidance/WCMS\\_206205/lang--en/index.htm](http://www.ilo.org/eval/Evaluationguidance/WCMS_206205/lang--en/index.htm)
- 2.2 Checklist 3 Writing the inception report  
[http://www.ilo.org/eval/Evaluationguidance/WCMS\\_165972/lang--en/index.htm](http://www.ilo.org/eval/Evaluationguidance/WCMS_165972/lang--en/index.htm)
- 2.3. Checklist 5 Preparing the evaluation report  
[http://www.ilo.org/eval/Evaluationguidance/WCMS\\_165967/lang--en/index.htm](http://www.ilo.org/eval/Evaluationguidance/WCMS_165967/lang--en/index.htm)
- 2.4 Checklist 6 Rating the quality of evaluation report  
[http://www.ilo.org/eval/Evaluationguidance/WCMS\\_165968/lang--en/index.htm](http://www.ilo.org/eval/Evaluationguidance/WCMS_165968/lang--en/index.htm)
- 2.5 Template for lessons learnt and Emerging Good Practices  
[http://www.ilo.org/eval/Evaluationguidance/WCMS\\_206158/lang--en/index.htm](http://www.ilo.org/eval/Evaluationguidance/WCMS_206158/lang--en/index.htm)  
[http://www.ilo.org/eval/Evaluationguidance/WCMS\\_206159/lang--en/index.htm](http://www.ilo.org/eval/Evaluationguidance/WCMS_206159/lang--en/index.htm)
- 2.6 Guidance note 7 Stakeholders participation in the ILO evaluation  
[http://www.ilo.org/eval/Evaluationguidance/WCMS\\_165986/lang--en/index.htm](http://www.ilo.org/eval/Evaluationguidance/WCMS_165986/lang--en/index.htm)
- 2.7 Guidance note 4 Integrating gender equality in M&E of projects  
[http://www.ilo.org/eval/Evaluationguidance/WCMS\\_165986/lang--en/index.htm](http://www.ilo.org/eval/Evaluationguidance/WCMS_165986/lang--en/index.htm)
- 2.8: Template for evaluation title page  
[http://www.ilo.org/eval/Evaluationguidance/WCMS\\_166357/lang--en/index.htm](http://www.ilo.org/eval/Evaluationguidance/WCMS_166357/lang--en/index.htm)
- 2.9 Template for evaluation summary:  
<http://www.ilo.org/legacy/english/edmas/eval/template-summary-en.doc>

## Annex 6: Summary of Evaluation Matrix Status based on Project's Results Framework

DESCRIPTION	KEY PERFORMANCE INDICATORS	PROGRESS STATUS AS AT 31 OCTOBER 2022	REASONS FOR NON-ACHIEVEMENT / REMARKS
<b>Short-term Outcome 1:</b> Vulnerable households provided short-term employment	A. Extent to which the wage transfers through the employment-intensive infrastructure investments have compensated for the loss of remittances and contributed to short-term socioeconomic recovery	In progress: The project applies a Local Resource-Based approach to implement the infrastructure improvement projects. A total of <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- 8 community road maintenance contracts are in progress- about 50% completed. There is about 50% of the contract amount compensates for the labour wage. Two other community maintenance contracts are being process of contracts award.</li> <li>- 4 culverts construction contracts are in progress, about 60% completed- There is about 30% of the contract amount compensates for the labour wage.</li> <li>- 4 road rehabilitation contracts have been awarded to local construction companies. The work will be started in mid of Dec 2022.</li> </ul>	Delays in civil works awards and Project implementation as a result of: <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. Mandatory nationwide COVID-19 pandemic lockdown (full and partial) for about one year.</li> <li>2. Late project upstart and access to ILO's IRIS to process rehabilitation contracts</li> </ol>
	B. Time and cost savings, and other socio-economic benefits related to the improved or constructed infrastructure	In progress: The selected rural infrastructures are rural road improvements. The completed roads contribute to time and cost savings by providing good access for traffic and transports. A total of 74 km of roads (49 km road for routine road maintenance and spot improvement and 25 km of roads for rehabilitation) and 58 culverts have been selected and are being implemented.	
	C. Extent to which the increased employability (through skills training) is expected to contribute to the longer-term socioeconomic recovery	In progress: 6 civil work contractors- their engineers, supervisors and skilled workers received LRBT training and on-the-job training to manage and supervise the project. Their unskilled workers (262) receive on the job training on OSH and masonry training. 8 Community Maintenance Group (CMG) leaders receive on-the-job training to manage the community road maintenance contracts. Their unskilled workers (133 workers) receive training on the job training on OSH and masonry training	
	D. Number and percentage of constructed or improved infrastructure for which a self-sustainable village-level operation &	Most of the selected infrastructure contracts (as mentioned in B) works are in progress. The road maintenance system and approach have been developed and are being used for community maintenance	

	maintenance (O&M) system has been established and operationalized	contracts. The commune authorities will take over the completed infrastructures and continue maintaining the assets.	
<b>Output 1.1.</b> Labour-intensive construction/rehabilitation of basic rural village infrastructure	About 60,000 workdays of short-term employment provided across the targeted villages in Battambang and Siem Reap Provinces, benefiting approximately 2,500 of the poor vulnerable households that have been most affected by the coronavirus pandemic. Total cash injections in the villages through the project's employment-intensive investments will be about USD 1 million.	8,217 WDs (13.7%) of direct short-term employment have been created. 395 (15.8%) skilled/unskilled workers have been employed for the CMG contracts and small civil work contracts. About 60 % of WDs created are women for community road maintenance contracts while about 15% of women WDs are generated for small civil work contracts. Total wages paid to workers is USD 69,845 (15.5%) which has been injected in the communities to boost local economic development.	Delays in civil works awards and Project implementation as a result of: 1. Mandatory nationwide COVID-19 pandemic lockdown (full and partial) for about one year. 2. Late project up start and access to ILO's IRIS to process rehabilitation contracts
	Not less than 35 basic infrastructure schemes installed or improved in the two clusters of around 10 - 15 communities each (one cluster in Battambang Province and one cluster in Siem Reap Province)	In progress: – The project covers 4 districts and 20 communes (10 communes in Battambang and 10 communes in Siem Reap provinces). – In total 58 culverts (33 culverts in Siem Reap province and 25 culvert in Battambang province) have been selected and the works are in progress. – 49 km of roads in both provinces has been selected for routine road maintenance and road surface repair. The work is in progress – 25 km of roads in both provinces has been selected for rehabilitation. Contracts are being awarded to contracts	The basic infrastructure will fully be achieved within the time frame
<b>Output 1.2</b> Improved local capacity to safely implement inclusive and sustainable public works.	Agencies represented in the Provincial Rural Development Committees (PRDCs) in Battambang and Siem Reap Province have demonstrated their hands-on ability to efficiently and effectively plan and deliver investments in basic village infrastructure using employment-intensive work methods and technologies, applying an inclusive community participation model.	The project coordinates with the Provincial Department of Rural Development (PDRD) and the Provincial Department of Planning and Investment. 2 technical staffs(engineers) in each province of the provincial departments are involved in project selection, surveying and monitoring of the infrastructure contracts and receiving the on-the-job training on LRBT approach and contract management. The project has awarded road routine maintenance contracts to Community Maintenance Group (CMG) leaders who have been appointed by the commune authorities to implement road routine contracts. The appointed CMG leaders have received the on-the-job training on LRBT, OSH and supervision to supervise the CMG contracts. The commune authority will take over the completed infrastructures from the project and continue maintaining the	The Provincial Rural Development Committees (PRDCs) do not exist anymore in all provinces. The PRDCs have been integrated into all provincial departments in each province including PDRD, Planning and Investment Department. The project hence coordinates directly with the PDRD and the Provincial Department of Planning and Investment

		assets. The commune authority will be encouraged to allocate the annual budget from the central government for maintenance by using the current CMG approach.	
DESCRIPTION	KEY PERFORMANCE INDICATORS	PROGRESS STATUS AS AT 31/10/2022	Reasons For Non-Achievement / REMARKS
<b>Short-term Outcome 2:</b> Returning migrants and workers access TVET programmes	A. Extent to which the online National Online Learning Management system managed to provide certified modular learning packages to the vulnerable population of Cambodia	In progress: LMS of 1 partner TVET school developed while the other 6 selected TVET schools are in the development process. It is expected that those 6 LMS will be ready by January 2023.  National harmonized digital TVET platform concept endorsed by DGTNET. Implementing Agreement is in the process.	
	B. Number of occupations for which have been developed certified modular online/blended learning and recognition of prior learning programmes	Training packages in 13 selected occupations (21 qualification certificates) have been in the process of blending and greening. It is expected that by January 2023, those newly certified modular will be delivered to students, youth, and workers...	
	C. Extent to which people who completed online/blended certified training programmes increased their employability	N/A Youths, workers, and other students have been and will be taking the programs. Those programs will end by the end of 2023.	Delay in the implementation resulted in the late engagement of selected TVET schools that are mainly responsible to develop and deliver the training to target beneficiaries. Transformation of digital and green TVET programs is normally time-consuming. More time is needed when the stakeholders are quite new to the green and digital TVET.
	D. Extent to which local MSMEs improved their productivity and contribution to the socio-economic recovery.	100 MSMEs have been receiving capacity-building support.  The results of the improvement of productivity of those MSMEs will be reported later.	
<b>Output 2.1</b> Development and delivery of online/blended	E. One (1) online national Learning Management System (LMS) platform has been updated, strengthened and piloted with DGTNET.	National harmonized digital TVET platform concept endorsed by DGTNET. Implementing the Agreement is in process.	The complexity of the harmonized platform and the lack of local experts in this area may slow down the progress of the work.

vocational training	F. No less than 20 online and blended vocational training certified curricula modules including participant and trainers' guidelines have been developed for selected occupations of the construction sector (e.g., carpentry, masonry, plumbing) and other selected priority sectors/occupations.	21 online and green TVET modular in hospitality and construction sectors have been in the process of blending and greening and are expected to complete by January 2023.	
	G. No less than 3,000 returning migrants, workers and students will have accessed certified online and blended modular vocational training and recognition of prior learning programmes	3,000 returning migrants, workers and students have already been set in the agreement with all the partner TVET schools that have entered the agreement with the ILO.	
	H. About 300-500 community members from the targeted communities will have received training on construction-related skills	<p>Training modules have been prepared, one of the two partner TVET schools is delivering the on-the-job training.</p> <p>One of the two agreed TVET schools is delivering on-the-job training.</p>	The achievement of the set targets will depend on the nature of the infrastructure projects. There is a delay from one partner school (NPJA) to send their teachers for the provision of on-the-job training due to outnumber of students at their institutes and the lack of teachers.
	I. No less than 100 local MSMEs of villages targeted for infrastructure works will have received training and coaching on enterprise management.	<p>A master trainer, who will be responsible for the delivery of community-based enterprise management (CBED) training to 10 local trainers and facilitators and 100 MSME owners, has been engaged.</p> <p>Training Materials which is based on CBED tools for small business owners updated by the master trainer with the support from the ILO enterprise team.</p> <p>The selection of 100 MSME owners from Battambang and Siem Reap provinces is in progress.</p> <p>By the end of November 2022, 50 MSME owners have received training on enterprise management (CBED).</p>	



<b>Output 2.2</b> Capacity building of public and private TVET institutions in developing and delivering blended training	J. No less than twenty (20) twenty trainees from DGTJET management, other relevant ministries, employers' organisations and TVET school managers have received coaching and capacity building to design, develop, supervise, and assess online and blended modular vocational training programmes	37 management staff of DGTJET, TVET schools, employer's association and Worker's Union have been receiving training and participating in coaching programme on digital and green TVET including eRPL and TVET centre management.	
	K. No less than forty (40) TVET trainers and private sector representatives participated to a Training of Trainers, allowing them to train TVET teachers to deliver, facilitate and assess modular online and blended vocational training and recognition of prior learning programmes; All modules will include green and gender-responsive competencies and can be used to skills, upskill, or reskill targeted beneficiaries.	13 Teacher, trainers and curriculum developers has received training on blended TVET while other 30 trainers and curriculum developers have been receiving training on blended, green TVET including eRPL.	
	L. No less than 10 TVET teachers have been trained to deliver and assess on the job certified training construction modular programmes delivered to workers involved in infrastructure works.	5 TVET teachers from NVIB has been engaged and backstopped in the provision of on-the-job training.  5 other TVET teachers from NPIA will be part of the on-the-job training.	There is a delay from NPIA to send their teachers for the provision of on-the-job training due to outnumber of students at their institutes and the lack of teachers.
	M. No less than ten (10) trainers and facilitators have been trained on the implementation of gender-sensitive blended learning and support packages on entrepreneurship and business revival, including additional supports such as online peer-to-peer learning, practical skills, mentoring and awareness of rights and equality.	10 local trainers and facilitators were selected and received training of trainers on how to support MSMEs using gender-sensitive and CBED tools.  Refresher training will be organized to improved their capacity and connect them to online resources with regard to MSME support.	