



International Labour Organization

iTrack Evaluation

ILO EVALUATION

Evaluation Title: Independent Cluster Evaluation of: Tackling Child Labour among Syrian refugees and their host communities Lebanon and Jordan; Combating the Worst Forms of Child Labour among Syrian Refugees and Host Communities Lebanon; Pilot Project for the Elimination of Child Labour among Refugees and Host Communities Jordan; Reducing worst forms of child labour among children affected by the crisis in Syria

○

○ ILO TC/SYMBOL: *RAB/15/01/DAN; LBN/16/01/NOR; JOR/16/52/CAN; SYR/16/01/RBS*

○ Type of Evaluation: Independent Cluster

○ Countries: Lebanon, Jordan, Syria

○ Date of the evaluation: April – June 2018

○ Name of consultant: Vera Chiodi

○ ILO Administrative Office: ILO Beirut / Amman / Damascus

○ ILO Technical Backstopping Office: ILO Beirut

○ Evaluation Manager: Nathalie Bavitch

○ Key Words: Decent Work; working conditions; children; refugees; international labour standards.

This evaluation has been conducted according to ILO's evaluation policies and procedures. It has not been professionally edited, but has undergone quality control by the ILO Evaluation Office

Independent Cluster Evaluation of:

Lebanon and Jordan

Project Name: Tackling child labour among Syrian refugees and their host communities in Jordan and Lebanon

Project TC Code: RAB/15/01/DAN

Project end date: December 2017

Donor: DANIDA

Budget: USD 665,423.7

Type of Evaluation Required: Final Internal Evaluation

Lebanon

Project Name: Combating the Worst Forms of Child Labour among Syrian Refugees and Host Communities in Lebanon

Project TC Code: LBN/17/02/NOR

Project end date: September 2018

Donor: Norway

Budget: USD 715,732.6

Type of Evaluation Required: Mid-Term Independent Evaluation

Jordan

Project Name: Pilot project for the elimination of child labour among refugees and host communities in Jordan

Project TC Code: JOR/16/52/CAN

Project end date: September 2017

Donor: Canada

Budget: USD 263,973

Type of Evaluation Required: Final Self Evaluation

Syria

Project Name: Reducing worst forms of child labour among children affected by the crisis in Syria

Project TC Code: SYR/16/01/RBS

Project end date: August 2019

Donor: RBSA

Budget: USD 941,740

Type of Evaluation required: Final independent Evaluation

Note: This project was included in the scope of the evaluation as a progress review, since it's a regional cluster evaluation.

Table of contents

| | |
|--|----|
| Acknowledgements..... | 5 |
| List of acronyms | 6 |
| Executive Summary: | 7 |
| 1 The Context of Child labour in Jordan, Lebanon and Syria | 13 |
| Background: Child Labor Context in Jordan, Lebanon and Syria | 13 |
| 2 Description of the Projects by Country..... | 14 |
| 3 Background of the Evaluation | 20 |
| Technical Design..... | 21 |
| Proposed Evaluation Method | 22 |
| 4 Purpose and Scope of the Evaluation | 23 |
| 4.1 Justification | 23 |
| 4.2 Purpose..... | 23 |
| 4.3 Scope..... | 24 |
| 5 Methodology and Limitations..... | 24 |
| 5.1 Evaluation Methods and Techniques..... | 24 |
| 5.2 Limitations | 26 |
| 6 Findings..... | 27 |
| 6.1 Project Design | 27 |
| 6.2 Project’s Objectives, Clarity and Realism | 31 |
| 6.3 Validity of Project Design | 33 |
| 6.4 Integration of Gender Issues | 37 |
| 7 Effectiveness: Main Results and Achievement of Objectives..... | 38 |
| 7.1 Challenges to Implementation..... | 38 |
| 7.2 Stakeholder Engagement..... | 40 |
| 7.3 Main Results Achieved..... | 43 |
| 7.4 Achievement of Objectives..... | 46 |
| 8 Efficiency - Allocated Resources & Results Obtained..... | 53 |
| 9 Potential Impact..... | 55 |
| 10 Sustainability | 57 |
| 11 Conclusions..... | 60 |
| 12 Recommendations, Lessons Learned, and Emerging Good Practices..... | 64 |
| 12.1 Recommendations..... | 64 |
| 12.2 Lessons Learned..... | 66 |
| 12.3 Emerging Good Practices..... | 67 |
| Annex 1: Lessons Learned and Good Practices | 68 |
| Annex 2: References | 72 |
| Annex 3 Terms of Reference..... | 74 |
| Annex 4: Evaluation Criteria for ILO’s Strategic Direction on Child Labor in Jordan, Lebanon and Syria, and for each project..... | 81 |
| Annex 5: List of Persons Interviewed | 87 |
| Annex 6: Key Achievements and Impacts..... | 90 |

Acknowledgements

This report describes in detail the *Regional Independent Evaluation of ILO's Child Labour Interventions and Recommendations for Future Regional Direction on Child Labour*. The evaluation was conducted by Vera Chiodi. The evaluator would like to express sincere thanks to all parties involved in this evaluation for their support and valuable contributions, and also thank the excellent collaboration of Vanessa Mallari.

List of acronyms

| | |
|--------------------|--|
| CLUSTER EVALUATION | Multi Country Evaluation |
| ROAS | Regional Office for Arab States |
| UNCT | United Nations Country Team |
| ILO | International Labour Organization |
| CLU | Child Labour Unit |
| CLM | Child Labour Monitoring |
| ESDC | Employment and Social Development Canada |
| IA | Implementing Agency |
| MOE | Minister of Education |
| MOL | Minister of Labour |
| MOSD | Minister of Social Development |
| NAP | National Action Plan |
| RDPP | Regional Development and Protection Programme |
| SCREAM | Supporting Children's Rights through Education, Arts and Media |
| WFCL | Worst forms of Child labour |
| GSF | General Security Forces |
| ISF | Internal Security Forces (of Mount Lebanon) |
| FU | Farmers' Union |

Executive Summary:

A- Project Background

The Arab region has witnessed several armed conflicts and population displacement in recent years, which is believed to have brought a new wave of child labor (CL). In Jordan and Lebanon, the recent years have shown an increase in child labor not only among Syrian refugees, but also within the host communities. For this reason, a comprehensive evaluation of the interventions in the region that fight child labor is necessary. The evaluation covers four initiatives (ongoing as well as completed) within the region, and assesses the ILO's strategic position in each case. The evaluation will however not incorporate the impact of each project, given that a quantitative analysis has not been undertaken.

B- Evaluation Background

The Evaluation took place from April 16th to June 30th 2018. The Lebanon Mission took place during the week of April 23rd 2018. The Jordan mission took place during the week of April 29th 2018. The interview calls with Syria took place during the week of May 7th.

The purpose of this evaluation is to assess both the extent to which each project achieved its **objectives**, with eventual unexpected positive and negative results, and the relevance **and effectiveness of ILO's portfolio** and strategy on combating child labor, specifically in Jordan, Lebanon and Syria.

Scope of the Evaluation:

The evaluation of each of the projects aims to identify the lessons learnt and good practices for accountability and learning purposes. It assesses the emerging impact of the interventions on child labour in each country and the region as a whole considering strengths and weaknesses, opportunities and challenges that have affected the achievement of each project objective. The evaluation will also develop recommendations for the future regional direction on child labour.

The strategic assessment of ILO's portfolio and strategy on compacting child labour in Jordan, Lebanon and Syria considers the relevance of the interventions in all three countries to status of child labour and defines main gaps. This element of the assessment also considers the different intervention models, of each of the projects listed above, and define the impact of these models and their applicability in other countries in the region. Aspects of regional complementarity and integration among different interventions was also assessed and analyzed.

Evaluation Methodology

The following methods were employed in the evaluation:

1. **Documentation review** (of documents provided by ILO and identified by the team itself).
2. **Stakeholder consultations and beneficiary/community group interviews**
3. **Direct observation**
4. **Contribution Analysis** to independently assess the development effectiveness. The main type of interview was the Key Informant Interviews (KIIs).

Conclusions:

Project Design

For all projects, there was an urgent **need for effective M&E practices**, robust quantitative and qualitative indicators, and rigorous impact evaluation, supplemented with relevant follow-up and pre-and post-training tests to evaluate the actual impact of trainings on individuals' knowledge and capacities. Follow-up should be conducted preferably by an independent or external evaluator.

Since there **was no detailed eligibility criteria** list to select beneficiaries, the validity of results is impaired by the fact that unobservable might have driven people's participation. If this is true, the project is just an acceleration of outcomes that participants would have achieved anyway.

The implementation of a **holistic approach** will develop systemic change in order to address child labor by combining direct services with advocacy, awareness raising and capacity building

Effectiveness and Efficiency

Almost all **the project outputs were delivered in a satisfactory way**, so, all the three projects have been rated as highly effective in achieving the stated outputs and outcomes.

One of the common weaknesses amongst the three projects was the **limited time frame**, which prevent from the development of a fully comprehensive model for child labor intervention, and **budgets**, which prevented the development of education, protection and livelihood projects that effectively address the needs of the children and their families. The ILO projects in Jordan and Lebanon have also been **highly effective in establishing solid relationships** with the different national stakeholders.

Potential Impact

Due to lack of sufficient data collection, interventions have fallen victim to the **'snake biting its own tail' logic**: NGO's and International Organizations, due to time and

budget constraint, cannot conduct effective data collection and this prevent them from correctly measuring impact and, therefore, conducting better interventions.

An important measurement of impact of interventions is through **behavioral and attitudinal change**. For example, following interventions in Lebanon, the internal security forces and general security forces adopted a more humanistic approach towards children, which went from viewing them as criminals to viewing them as children that required protection. This was achieved both through the designated impact of the interventions as well as through informal discussions with key stakeholders such as the GS.

One of the most concrete outcomes achieved has been a **widespread awareness** amongst the general public that they are all agents of change and have a role to play in the fight against child labor.

The ability of the projects to progress towards their intended impact was **highly dependent on the effective engagement of all relevant stakeholders** in addressing Child labor. All three projects focused on engaging stakeholders on multiple levels.

Relevance:

Both in the **Canadian-funded project in Jordan project** and in the **RDPP project in Jordan**, the ILO procedures for project planning, monitoring, reporting and evaluation for technical cooperation projects were used efficiently throughout the project cycle. In the first project, reporting to donors was in accordance with the agreed reporting schedule, and also regular field mission by the National Program Manager allowed monitoring and implementation of eventual corrective actions. Finally, despite the presence of a pre-project database for the educational project implemented through the project, the ILO did not have access to it. In the second project, detailed monitoring and evaluation processes were implemented within all capacity building activities.

Concerning the RDPP project in Lebanon, different stakeholders implemented their own monitoring and evaluation systems. M&E consists of collecting detailed information on the number trainings and capacity building activities conducted in a log framework, even if more robust indicators are required to assess effectiveness of trainings.

Regarding the Norwegian-funded project in Lebanon project, continuous visits to field sites to monitor progress partially compensated for the lack of more robust M&E system.

Sustainability:

Sustainability of the ILO's interventions in Lebanon and Jordan has been difficult to measure due to the **lack of baseline surveys and robust indicators**.

A comprehensive approach, by working across multiple levels and sectors is one of the most.

To avoid rebound affect, follow-up activities should be complementary to ensure the economic empowerment of families and the successful reintegration of children into their communities.

The OSH and CL manuals developed through the RDPP project in Jordan ensured the successful implementation not only at the policy level, but also addressing child labor on the ground.

Lessons Learned, Recommendations, and Emerging Good Practices

Recommendations for Jordan and Lebanon

1. Priority level: High. Addressed to: ILO/National stakeholders/other NGO's.
In order to implement impactful interventions, policy interventions and direct interventions should be interlinked. Stand-alone interventions achieve only a minimal impact, and if they are not linked to a system, they fail to achieve sustainable results. Alternatively, interventions focusing solely on policy may lack impact on direct action on the ground. **It is important to ensure that mechanisms are put in place to, for example, ensure the livelihoods of families of children withdrawn from child labor. Additionally, a formal strategy to drive attitudinal and behavioral change amongst parents of child laborers is essential in eradicating child labor practices.**

2. Priority level: Medium. Addressed to: ILO/ Policymakers/ national stakeholders/ other NGOs
A comprehensive platform should be developed incorporating the monitoring and evaluation of the different NGOs addressing child labor, in order to help them share experiences, best practices, data collection tools and information. **Provide a platform for discussion of what is working and what needs improvement amongst key stakeholders is essential for long-term success.** This should include continuous dialogue on different aspects of the project amongst donors, development partners, technical specialists, and social workers etc. to ensure successful implementation. One specific recommendation emerging from the Norwegian-funded project in Lebanon project was the importance of developing a mapping of all the donors and other relevant institutions. Although this is currently happening under the Child Labor Monitoring and Referral Systems, a centralized platform, which unifies all relevant information, would be critical in consolidating national efforts addressing CL.

3. Priority level: Medium. Addressed to: ILO/ Policymakers/ national stakeholders/ other NGOs
For instance, it is essential to adopt a long-term outlook with respect to the Syrian refugee crisis and its wider economic and social implications on child labor. Beyond CL interventions, support systems need to be planned and implemented once the refugee children reach the age of 18. It is necessary for the ILO to begin long-term planning in order to address the future impact of the Syrian refugee crisis. The ILO can take a leading role in addressing the long-term planning for the Syrian refugee crisis in the region.

Specific Recommendations by Country

Lebanon

4. Priority level: High. Addressed to: National stakeholders.

The Syrian crisis began in 2012, so the National Action Plan implemented as early as 2013, and was subsequently updated in 2016 to be extended to 2020. However, the NAP **should be consistently adapted** to the evolving circumstances of Syrian refugee crisis taking into account its impact on the Lebanese economy.

Jordan

5. Priority level: Medium. Addressed to: national stakeholders / NGOs.

One important recommendation is to **generate more awareness** amongst adults and the parliament, and further SCREAM trainings within social centers and vulnerable neighborhoods in Amman. Trainings should incite attitudinal changes, as the most common strategy for families was for the mother to stay home and the children to work.

Syria

6. Priority level: Medium. Addressed to: ILO.

The ILO should work faster in **establishing a presence** in Syria, and increase general preparedness with respect to the emergency situation at the highest level. To date, the Syrian office only has one staff member and should thus be reinforced with support and technical staff. In the subsequent phases of its presence in Syria, the ILO should aim to act **more independently** from the partnerships and expand its own activities to target the livelihood needs of families of working children. The ILO can play an important role in developing capacities across a number of these organizations. **Technical support** should then immediately be given on the field and in close collaboration with national partners to fully understand the situation on the ground and the scale of the support needed.

Lessons Learned

1. **Budgetary allocations should take into account all factors affecting the achievement of project's objectives.** For the Canadian-funded project in Jordan project, the commitment of withdrawn children from intervention projects was limited in some cases as schools were far from residential areas. Budgetary allocations should have taken into account the transportation costs to ensure that beneficiaries had access to the project as well as alternative sources of income for vulnerable families. **The ability to be flexible** is essential in developing impactful interventions. Although the RDPP had a more limited budget in comparison to the Norwegian-funded project in Lebanon, its ability

to adapt to changes that arose during the course of operations contributed to its success. The ability to adjust operations is particularly important in light of rapidly changing political and social environments. One of the important lessons learned from the RDPP project, was that when working on multi-regional interventions, countries should work very closely to exploit any synergies in operations as well as challenges faced at the regional level.

2. **Projects should include both upstream and downstream activities.** Whilst capacity building is important, upstream interventions (as awareness campaigns and trainings) should not be the only focus. It is not efficient to rely solely upon spillover effects from upstream to downstream. Additionally, sustainable elimination of child labor can only be achieved through the involvement of families and the local community. The participation of these actors should be essential components in Child Labor withdrawal interventions. Moreover, guidance and support regarding direct interventions should be closely linked to capacity building efforts of the ILO. Lack of integration between upstream and downstream interventions is impeding to correctly anticipate unbalances in the delivery of services: for instance, in Lebanon, too much attention is paid to Syrians in child labor efforts and not enough on Lebanese children. Interventions should be careful to ensure **equitable impact**, in order to protect the most vulnerable children and families, whilst preventing and societal divisions arising.

Emerging Good Practices

1. Conducting regional trainings and knowledge sharing activities through active communication activities is a useful strategy that emerged from the RDPP project, such as the SCREAM training rolled out through GAM to the Children's podium in Jordan. It allows for the exploitation of cultural and linguistic similarities, whilst establishing a set of best practices. For RDPP trainings conducted in Egypt, trainees learned the best practices and employed them in their own country strategies. A strategic communication project aimed at attitude and behavioral change is essential for child labor interventions in achieving long-term impact. For example, the RDPP project adopted a multi-pronged approach, which involved traditional and social media, local leaders and champions. In both Jordan and Lebanon, the project received strong media coverage, raising awareness amongst the general public on the dangers and risks of child labor. The measurement of the effect of media coverage on the attitudes of the general public would have to be measured to be able to fully evaluate the effect of the intervention.
2. The development of a formalized agreement can provide an effective solution for child labor as it provides a reliable source of income for families, conditional on withdrawing their children from work. This was demonstrated by the agreement with the Farmers' Union in Lebanon.

1 The Context of Child labour in Jordan, Lebanon and Syria

Background: Child Labor Context in Jordan, Lebanon and Syria

The Arab region has witnessed several armed conflicts and population displacement in recent years, which is believed to have brought a new wave of child labour (CL). The ILO Global Estimates 2017 confirm that in the region covered by the ILO Regional Office for Arab States (ILO ROAS)¹ 3% of children aged 5 to 17 years old are involved in child labour, with half of them involved in hazardous forms.

Even though countries such as Jordan and Lebanon have shown historically a lower percentage of children involved in CL compared to the poorest countries of the Arab region such as Sudan and Yemen, armed conflict and displacement played a large role in leading more and more children to work, often in hazardous conditions. In Jordan and Lebanon, the recent years have shown an increase in child labour not only among Syrian refugees, but also within host communities.

Lebanon experienced a rise in child labour, especially in the agricultural sector, which comprises high risks of hazardous work.² According to the Baseline Survey 2016 conducted by UNICEF and the Lebanese Ministry of Social Affairs, the percentage of Syrian children engaged in child labour is 6.7%. However, this rise is witnessed not only among Syrian children but also among Lebanese ones: in fact, the number of Lebanese working children has tripled from 2009 to 2016, with a percentage increase from 1.9% to 6%.³

According to the Jordan Response Plan for the Syria Crisis 2017-2019, Jordan is host to 1.2 million Syrian refugees, which represent 13% of the total population. Since 2014, an increasing number of children are starting to work to support their families, especially due to the deteriorating living conditions and the decrease in World Food Programme (WFP) vouchers. According to the National Child Labour Survey 2016, Syrian children constitute 14.6% of the working child population in Jordan. However, while the rate of child labour among Jordanian children is 1.6%, it is as high as 3% among Syrian children (2.5% in hazardous work and 0.5% in non-hazardous child labour).⁴

After seven years of ongoing conflict, Syria faces a wide-scale humanitarian crisis, with 13.1 million people in need of humanitarian assistance. The education system is suffering a big damage, with more than 2.8 million children out of school. A high number of teachers have lost their lives or left their posts, and at least 25% of schools

¹ The ILO Regional Office for Arab States in Beirut (ILO ROAS) covers the following 12 countries: Bahrain, Iraq, Jordan, Kuwait, Lebanon, Occupied Palestinian Territory, Oman, Qatar, Saudi Arabia, Syria, United Arab Emirates and Yemen. (Source: www.ilo.org/beirut)

² ILO (2017)

³ UNICEF (2016).

⁴ Several stakeholders in Jordan indicated that these figures might under-estimate the true extent of child labour, especially among refugee children. Possible reasons for under-reporting might be related to the survey methodology and/or fear of deportation.

are damaged, destroyed, used for military purpose or as shelters for the displaced. Children are one of the vulnerable groups most affected by the crisis. They are victims of explosive hazards, military recruitment, torture, detention, abduction, sexual violence, and attacks on schools and hospitals. In the absence of recent surveys, the current rate of child labour in Syria cannot be estimated, but 82% of surveyed communities report the occurrence of child labour and hazardous work such as begging and scavenging for scrap metal.⁵ Children are also found working in agriculture, street vending, car washing, metal work, carpentry, smuggling goods, collecting oil waste, household work, fetching water, collecting food from rubbish tips or fields and funerary work.⁶ They are found in all types of work: paid, unpaid, self-organized and employed.

2 Description of the Projects by Country

The four projects included in this evaluation for three countries have reached levels of implementation for which an evaluation is required (with the exception of the Syrian project), as the ILO evaluation policy states. Due to the similarity of strategic objectives, it was proposed to carry out one cluster evaluation of the four projects.

Table 1: Brief summary for each project

| Name | Country | Duration | Budget |
|--|--------------------|-----------------|----------------|
| Tackling Child Labour among Syrian refugees and their host communities | Jordan and Lebanon | 30 months | € 600,000 |
| Pilot Project for the Elimination of Child Labour among Refugees and Host Communities | Jordan | 18 months | USD263,973.01 |
| Combating the Worst Forms of Child Labour among Syrian Refugees and Host Communities | Lebanon | 12 months | USD 715,732.60 |
| Reducing worst forms of child labour amongst Internally Displaced and Host Communities | Syria | 3 years | USD 4.000.000 |

Tackling Child Labour among Syrian refugees and their host communities in Jordan and Lebanon (2016-2017)

⁵ ILO and UNICEF (2012).

⁶ Ibid.

The project's objective is to contribute to the elimination of child labour, especially its worst forms, among Syrian refugees and host communities in Jordan and Lebanon.

The project has two immediate objectives⁷:

Immediate Objective 1. By the end of the project, consensus has been achieved among policymakers and other stakeholders on granting refugees of working age access to certain sectors of the labour market and/or engaging them in other socio-economic activities, with a view to prevent and eliminate child labour.

Immediate Objective 2. By the end of the project, partners' capacities to address child labour have improved.

In order to achieve these objectives, the proposed project focused on capacity building and policy dialogue with Government ministries and departments. This strategic approach is based on the ILO's experience in achieving sustainable results in the elimination of child labour through national ownership and dedicated action; it further builds on what has been achieved in both countries through joint ILO/Government efforts. Moreover, the project worked with social partners and service providers, who have been previously involved in action against child labour, but whose capacity needs further strengthening in the face of the refugee crisis.

In Jordan, the project contributed to link Jordan's regular national systems, structures and projects on child labour to national and international efforts around the Syrian response. To this end, the project will build on the ILO project "Moving towards a child labour free Jordan"⁸.

In Lebanon, the project integrated with existing national policy frameworks and mechanisms, such as the National Steering Committee Against Child Labour (NSC), its secretariat and main governmental focal point for child labour, the Child Labour Unit (CLU) at Ministry of Labour and the National Action Plan for the Elimination of the Worst Forms of Child Labour (NAP) by the end of 2016⁹. This was subsequently revised in 2016 in order to account for Syrian refugees and later extended to 2020.

The budget for this project is € 600,000¹⁰. The project duration at the signature of the contract was 18 Months; however it was extended 3 times to 30 Months: 1 June 2015-30 December 2017.

Pilot Project for the Elimination of Child Labour among Refugees and Host Communities in Jordan (2016-2017)

⁷ ILO Development Cooperation Final Progress Report (FPR), "Tackling Child Labour among Syrian refugees and their host communities in Jordan and Lebanon".

⁸ ILO Project Document, "Tackling child labour among Syrian refugees and their host communities in Jordan and Lebanon"

⁹ Ibid

¹⁰ Ibid

The ultimate goal of this project is to facilitate the development of a sustainable model for the prevention of child labour and the withdrawal of existing child labourers. The successfully tested model will be replicated in other areas of Jordan and elsewhere in the Middle East.

The project has two immediate objectives¹¹:

Immediate Objective 1. Rehabilitate 700 children (boys and girls), out of which 400 vulnerable ones, protected from early entry to labour market.

Immediate Objective 2. Sensitize the newly targeted working children and their siblings regarding the problem of child labour & provision of services to 300 families in coordination with other UN and local organizations.

The established ILO procedures for project planning, monitoring, reporting and evaluation for technical cooperation projects, was used throughout the project cycle in both Jordan and Lebanon. In Jordan, a dedicated National Officer was selected to oversee the project, supervised by the ILO Regional Office in Beirut. An overall annual work plan for the project was prepared with detailed country specific work plans. The National Officer undertook regular field missions to project sites, to monitor project implementation. The NPO reports to the partners and ROAS backstopping project officer on progress achieved, problems faced and proposed corrective action based on ILO established procedures. This included reporting on indicators as established in the project-monitoring plan¹². In Lebanon, an international child labour consultant was technically responsible for the project and worked with a part-time project assistant. A project officer was backstopping the project for both Lebanon and Jordan.

With regards the role of the ILO and its project partners, in Jordan, initial planning meetings with key partners, MOSD and its newly created CLU, the general education unit within MOE, in addition to the new actors on top Juvenile Police were carried out at the early stage of implementation.

To this end, the project started to initiate preliminary steps in direct action with working children and their families, providing them with a wide range of services including education, vocational training, social counselling, medical help, recreational activities and legal advice. During this short time frame, 12 months, the project was able to identify more than 1000 children as the targeted group of beneficiaries. To date, more than 947 vulnerable children and 300 of their families were approached in the two selected geographical locations, East Amman & Irbid governorate, where CL is prominent as revealed by the last NCLS 2016.

¹¹ ILO Technical Cooperation Final Progress Report (FPR), "Pilot Project for the Elimination of Child Labour among Refugees and Host Communities in Jordan"

¹² ILO Project Document, "Tackling child labour among Syrian refugees and their host communities in Jordan and Lebanon"

In Jordan, the ILO strategy has been primarily development-focused in its support of refugees and host communities, aiming to preserve social and economic stability at the national level. Given that the multi-faceted nature of the crisis cuts across many of the ILO interventions in the country new initiatives complement existing country projects, which already focus on expanding decent work opportunities, addressing child labour, extending social protection and enhancing employment for youth¹³.

The project's overall budget is of US\$263,973.01, over a lifespan of 18 months in total¹⁴.

Combating the Worst Forms of Child Labour among Syrian Refugees and Host Communities in Lebanon (2016-2017)

The project aims at enhancing the protection of boys and girls aged 14 to 18 years old and leading to the withdrawal of those 5-13 years old from the worst forms of child labour in Lebanon.

This project falls within the ILO Child Labour Programme in Lebanon started in 2000, with the Ministry of Labour (MoL) as the main partner since the inception of the project. Moreover, it falls within the ILO's effort to support the Lebanese Government to develop a National Action Plan (NAP) for the Elimination of the Worst Forms of Child Labour in Lebanon by end of 2016¹⁵.

With respect to the role of the ILO and other project partners, this project's success was in its mobilization of all traditional partners such as the MOL in addition to new ones in the fight against child labour (such as the GS and ISF). This also ensured that child labour is mainstreamed into main governmental institutions, therefore having greater impact on the ground. It was important to keep ILO's major governmental partner, MOL, on board, as this gave credibility to the other governmental security agencies as ISF and GS. It was important that this work was part of a government strategy led by MOL and not a stand-alone intervention by an UN Agency. This set the ground for an official relationship with these security forces in combating the WFCL. Subsequently, consecutive meetings were held between ILO, MOL and GS on the one hand and ISF on the other, nurturing a long-term trustful relationship, leading to training and sensitization of their relevant personnel on issue of WFCL and action needed to be taken in line with their respective mandates. As such, the partners of the project were one of the main reasons for its success, especially in terms of their feeling of ownership, commitment to the cause and the project outcomes and their interaction amongst each other, which developed throughout the project.

With respect to the implementation arrangements, Institutional arrangements amongst the partners was starting to be developed under the first phase of the project but in a rather informal way and mainly through MOL and some meetings were being

13 Ibid

14 Funding agreement between the ILO and the Government of Canada, 2016.

15 ILO, "Executive Summary to the Norway Project"

held at MOL in addition to ILO. More efforts at institutionalizing this coordination was planned for the second phase. However, coordination amongst the partners was taking place informally all the time as the partners were in many workshops and sensitization meetings together and getting to know each other, not by institution only but by face and name and contact info.

The project has three immediate outcomes¹⁶:

Outcome 1. By the end of the project, knowledge on child labour of key actors and the general public has been strengthened.

Outcome 2. By the end of the project, partners' capacities to address exploitative forms of child labour have improved.

Outcome 3. By the end of the project, integrated and effective responses to fight child labour, especially its worst forms, are in place.

The project leverages its activities mainly on three components¹⁷:

- 1) Capacity building: It aims at supporting and enhancing the capacities of the key government institutions that play essential role in eliminating the WFCL in Lebanon, especially working on the streets, in Agriculture, in small establishments and in the services sector as these were the main priority intervention areas of the NAP.
- 2) Direct services: Direct educational, psychosocial, nutritional services and livelihood opportunities.
- 3) Advocacy: Awareness raising campaigns, and sensitization of policy makers, municipal authorities, employers, media and intermediaries using children. Awareness raising material will be disseminated at large.

The overall budget for this project is US\$ 715,732.60, over a period of 12 months¹⁸.

Reducing worst forms of child labour amongst Internally Displaced and Host Communities in Syria

The overall project objective is to reduce Worst Forms of Child Labour among vulnerable communities in Syria through an integrated and systemic approach combining the humanitarian response and existing national systems.

The project has four main immediate outcomes¹⁹:

¹⁶ ILO Technical Cooperation Final Progress Report (FPR), "Combating the Worst Forms of Child Labour among Syrian Refugees and Host Communities in Lebanon"

¹⁷ ILO, "Executive Summary to the Norway Project"

¹⁸ Specific Agreement between the Norwegian Ministry of Foreign Affairs and the ILO, 2016

¹⁹ ILO Concept Note "Reducing worst forms of child labour amongst Internally Displaced and Host Communities in Syria"

Outcome 1. To enhance the information available for planning and project interventions

Outcome 2. To integrate child labour in humanitarian interventions

Outcome 3. To enhance local capacity to prevent and address child labour

Outcome 4. To enhance vocational training opportunities for youth and parents of child laborers as an exit point from child labour

ILO plans to have a phased approach in its interventions as follows²⁰:

- **Phase 1 (0-3 months):** Immediate technical support to actors on the ground
- **Phase 2 (4-6 months):** Partnering with UN agencies in specific interventions in their projects for which resources are already available, in addition to providing continued technical support to actors on the ground
- **Phase 3 (6 -30 months):** Fully-fledged child labour project addressing multiple aspects and factors of child labour

Institutional arrangements amongst the partners was starting to be developed under the first phase of the project but in a rather informal way and mainly through MOL and some meetings were being held at MOL in addition to ILO. More efforts at institutionalizing this coordination was planned for the second phase. However, coordination amongst the partners was taking place informally all the time as the partners were in many workshops and sensitization meetings together and getting to know each other, not by institution only but by face and name and contact info.

This project follows the rationale behind the ILO-implemented project “the National Programme on the Elimination of the Worst Forms of Child Labour (WFCL) in Syria” during 2008-2001, falling within the Decent Work Country Programme in Syria, implemented in collaboration with the Ministry of Social Affairs and Labour (MOSAL), the General Federation of Trade Unions and the Federation of Chambers of Industry. This proposed intervention in Syria also falls under the ILO’s Integrated Strategy on the Fundamental Principles and Rights at Work 2016-2020 and its Strategy on Crisis and Fragile Situations.

The indicative budget of this project is USD 4 million over a period of three years.

²⁰ Ibid

3 Background of the Evaluation

A Cluster evaluation is a systematic assessment of the contributions made by United Nations Entity for fighting Child Labour (ILO) to the development of results and effectiveness at the country level, related to its three core mandates on normative, project and coordination work.

Commissioned by the Regional Office of Arab States (ROAS), this cluster evaluation is a formative forward-looking evaluation to support the ROAS's and national stakeholders' strategic learning and decision-making. The evaluations also used a secondary summative backward-looking perspective, to support enhanced accountability to develop effectiveness and learning from experience. As per priority of ILO, this cluster evaluation was gender-responsive.

The evaluation was carried out in adherence with the ILO Evaluation Framework and Strategy, the ILO evaluation policy guidelines, the UN System Evaluation Norms and Standards. UNEG ethical guidelines will be followed throughout the evaluation.

The Cluster evaluation is seen as an opportunity for learning and critical reflection for the ROAS. The purposes of the cluster evaluation can be summarized as follows:

- Inform decision making and learning to improve the design of ILO interventions in the region
- Contribute to accountability for effectiveness development at the multi-country level
- Assess the extent to which each project achieved its objectives and unexpected positive and negative results, assessing its emerging impact
- Assess the relevance and effectiveness of ILO's portfolio and strategy on compacting child labour in Jordan, Lebanon and Syria.

The scope of this cluster evaluation is the entirety of ILO's portfolio, namely projects and operations including regional or global project activities in the country as well as relevant 'non-project' activities. The Cluster evaluation covers ongoing and completed initiatives and assesses the strategic position of ILO. The evaluation is not considering impact (as defined by UNEG), because a quantitative analysis was not undertaken.

The primary use for the Cluster evaluation results includes the following:

- Learning and improved decision-making to support the development of new projects
- Accountability for the development effectiveness of ROAS' future regional direction
- Capacity development and mobilization of national stakeholders to advance children's well-being and empowerment
- Evidence-based lobbying and advocacy amongst various stakeholders

The primary intended users of this Cluster evaluation are:

- ILO staff

- Relevant staff in target ministries, local government and targeted governmental institutions
- Participating Civil Society Organizations (CSOs)
- Targeted beneficiary communities and groups, right holders
- Relevant staff members in UN-agencies who are involved as partners and/or work on child labour in general.
- UN-agency Regional Offices and Headquarters

Apart from the mentioned audience, media, research institutes and other development partners may also benefit from the cluster evaluation findings.

The following mode of employment of Cluster evaluation results by the primary audience is foreseen:

- Learning and improved decision-making to support the development of new projects;
- Accountability for effectiveness development of the ROAS future regional direction;
- Capacity building and mobilization of national stakeholders to advance children's well-being and children's empowerment.
- Evidence-based lobby and advocacy with various stakeholders

The Cluster evaluation applies four of the Development Assistance Committee (DAC)²¹ evaluation criteria (relevance, effectiveness, efficiency and sustainability) and it will apply Human Rights and Gender Equality as additional criteria.

During the Inception Workshops, the team has discussed how the evaluation process ensures the participation of stakeholders at all stages, and how to prioritize the prospect interviewees, with a particular emphasis on right holders and their representatives.

Technical Design

ILO works with partners from various backgrounds, including from government, NGOs and CSOs, networks UN Agencies and research institutes. Some of the partners are involved in creating specific changes, whereas others' role is much broader and aimed at covering a number of areas.

During the evaluation phase, the evaluator analyzed stakeholders through mapping relationships and power dynamics. Particular attention will be paid to participation of right holders, in particular children and vulnerable and marginalized groups.

A number of mechanisms leading to change, in relation to various stakeholders, are at the basis of this evaluation. Changes are created by supporting local organization (CSOs) coordination, technical support, capacity building and leading multiple stakeholder groups to combine forces and/or to develop alliances. Enhancing the capacity of relevant organizations and institutions is a major part of the project. With regard to government, ILO provides policy makers with evidence and policy advice

²¹ Glossary of Evaluation and Results Based Management (RBM) Terms, OECD (2000)

The role of civil society is particularly important, since it represents a direct link with the population. Moreover, it contributes to raising awareness and strengthening capacity of various stakeholders, and come up with new approaches. Specifically, civil society, including partners of ILO, has a twofold role. First of all, it functions as a watchdog and signal whenever government body or other duty bearer do not comply with expectations, and ensure that all human rights are properly observed. Moreover, it advocates for improvement and share findings with other stakeholders, such as the public, and other right holders, who can then join the effort for improvement. Secondly, it raises awareness on human rights principles of duty bearers and right holders (with a specific focus on vulnerable groups).

ILO has produced guidance notes, manuals and guidelines, which have proven useful for many stakeholders. The ILO plays an important role as knowledge hub within the UN and other development partners, and also with government. The ILO acts as a central focal point, through which information and resources are shared and accessed by a wide range of partners. The ILO is the leading UN agency working on Child labour with an extensive global programme (International Programme for the Elimination of Child Labour), also bringing in accumulated experience and knowledge of CL within a range of sectors including agriculture, working street children, industries and supply chains.

Proposed Evaluation Method

The evaluation team proceeded logically and in a structured manner to derive conclusions and, finally, recommendations. The assessment process started from the needs identified in the context analysis, followed by the collection of data to compare findings of the situation analysis with the achievements of ILO and their partners, the remaining gaps and other findings.

This body of information allowed the evaluation team to come up with a set of conclusions. Whereas the finding section of the report was confined to a selection from what was actually found in data collection, in the conclusion section the team explains the meaning of the findings for ILO's previous, current and future involvement and position. Based on these conclusions, recommendations will be developed and agreed upon with ILO. A mix of the following methods was used:

- Documentation review (of documents provided by ILO and identified by the team itself)
- Stakeholder consultations and beneficiary/community group interviews
- Direct observation
- Contribution Analysis to independently assess the development effectiveness

The ILO's Middle East office has made available an impressive body of information, which is very useful and contributes to easy evaluability, but it is too large to enable full reading within the time frame of the evaluation. The team therefore conducted a sampling through a document analysis, to ensure the most relevant documents are studied.

Though an effort was made to include quantitative data as much as possible, the evaluation had mainly a qualitative character. Information was gathered from

secondary sources, including but not limiting to reports, assessments and analyses from ILO. Furthermore, reports, strategies, policies and action plans from partners were studied to obtain information. Documents from other development actors in the Middle East region, including surveys and assessments, were used as far as they were relevant for the involvement of ILO in the region since 2014.

To obtain primary information, interviews were conducted within a broad range of key stakeholders, selected from the stakeholders' groups. Part of the interviews took place in Beirut, another part in Amman, and the remaining ones in Paris via Skype with Syrian respondents. Through a balanced document and stakeholder selection in consultation with ILO, the evaluator tried to cover as many stakeholders as possible from various backgrounds. It was ensured that all six ILO's criteria will receive similar attention.

All information collected from the interviews was treated as confidential, and respondents were informed about the confidentiality at the onset of each interview. Information was used solely for facilitation of the analysis. Respondents are not quoted in the report without their permission.

Reliability of statements in interviews may at times be sub-optimal since partners tend to give socially acceptable or convenient replies. Moreover, a number of staff members in partners' organizations and Government may have left their job, taking with them a part of the institutional memory. Using multiple sources of information from various backgrounds should also minimize these issues.

4 Purpose and Scope of the Evaluation

4.1 Justification

Given the overlapping nature of child labor within the region, particularly in light of the spillover effects of the Syrian refugee crisis into the neighboring regions of Jordan and Lebanon, a Multi Country Evaluation is essential in evaluating the ILO response.

For the ILO, evaluation is a critical component in the implementation of technical cooperation. As such, the evaluation of ILO projects has a strong focus on utility for the purpose of organizational learning and planning for all stakeholders and partners. From a strategic perspective, the cluster evaluation should facilitate knowledge-sharing and provide insights into individual project-level achievements. At the same time, it can help in identifying regional complementarities and progress towards strategic objectives beyond projects and specific countries. Additionally, not only it maximizes efficiency of resources by combining various project evaluations into one, but it can provide a richer outlook into effective child labor interventions in the region through a comparative perspective.

4.2 Purpose

The Cluster Evaluation has been commissioned by the Regional Office of Arab States,

and will serve as useful tool for both ROAS and a number of national stakeholders, in supporting strategic learning and informing forward-looking policy decisions for future interventions on child labor. Secondly, the evaluations will provide a backward-looking perspective, encouraging learning through experience while enhancing accountability for development effectiveness. As a priority of the ILO, the cluster evaluation will also aim at considering the capacity for each of the projects to respond to gender issues in relation to child labor interventions. The precise purpose of the cluster evaluation may be summarized as follows:

1. Inform decision-making and learning to improve the design of current and future ILO interventions in the region
2. Contribute to the accountability for development effectiveness at the multi-country level

This Cluster Evaluation will aim to provide all stakeholders with the relevant information necessary to assess work plans, strategies, objectives, partnership arrangements and potential resources, providing regional and country-specific recommendations for future policy interventions.

4.3 Scope

The evaluation will cover the four ongoing and completed initiatives within the region, and assess the ILO's strategic position in each case. The evaluation will not however incorporate the impact of each project, given that a quantitative analysis has not been undertaken.

The evaluation will provide an overview of the entire lifespan for the RDPP project, the Pilot Project in Jordan, and the Combating Worst Forms of CL in Lebanon project up until completion. This will incorporate an evaluation of the initial project design, implementation, recommendations and lessons learned, emerging good practices as well as the sustainability, replicability and potential to be scaled up. For the ILO Project in Syria, which is currently in Phase 2, this will also provide a preliminary evaluation and outlook for the initial phases of the project, which will be used as the basis to inform subsequent phases of the intervention.

Through inception workshops, the ILO team will discuss how the evaluation process will engage relevant stakeholders at all stages of evaluation whilst prioritizing prospective interviewees, namely rights holders and their representatives

5 Methodology and Limitations

5.1 Evaluation Methods and Techniques

A Cluster Evaluation consists of a systematic assessment of the contributions made by

the United Nations Entity for fighting Child Labour (ILO) to development and effectiveness at the country level, in relation to its three core mandates on normative, project and coordination work.

The data collection used for the evaluation included a range of data sources (field information, institutional information systems, and financial records.) The cluster evaluation also incorporated participatory methods, in order to ensure that beneficiaries, children, individuals and groups who are vulnerable or discriminated against are included.

Comprehensive Documentation review

The documentation review began during the inception phase of evaluation, with the stated purpose to

- Get an overview of the ILO project, including major achievements and constraints
- Collate relevant policy documents, strategic plans, project documents, analytical tools and reports as well as previous evaluations, reviews of studies of relevance to this evaluation;
- Assess the regional context in relation to child labor and relate this to the design and design and implementation of the ILO project

The Regional Office for Arab States has provided an impressive amount of information, including highly valuable information for the cluster evaluation, but for which a full assessment is beyond the time frame and scope of the present evaluation. As such, a sampling through a document analysis was conducted to ensure that the most relevant and representative documents are included in the current evaluation. Remaining documents are then used on an ad hoc basis, when more specific information is required.

The evaluation consists primarily of qualitative analysis; however, efforts were made to incorporate quantitative data whenever possible. Information for this analysis was collected from secondary sources, including reports, assessments and analyses, as well as the ILO's strategies, policies and action plans from partners to obtain further insights. Documents from other development actors in Arab States, such as surveys and assessments also provide a useful source of information regarding the involvement of the ILO within the region since 2014.

Stakeholder consultations and beneficiary/ community group interviews

In order to obtain primary sources of information for the evaluation, interviews have been conducted. In consultation with the ILO, the evaluation has aimed at covering a diverse range of relevant stakeholders from various backgrounds. Additionally, as much as possible, the interviews have aimed to cover the ILO criteria areas in a

balanced manner.

Interviews were conducted in person in Beirut and Amman, with the remaining interviews from Paris through Skype with respondents in Syria. A set of questionnaires providing the basis for interviews, were tested and adapted where necessary. The primary format for the interviews consisted of Key Informant Interviews (KIIs), or one-on-one with key stakeholders. Additionally, focus group discussions (FGDs) have also been part of the evaluation wherever partners and beneficiaries of a similar background were available, allowing for the coverage of a larger group within a shorter time frame.

Information collected through the interviews has been treated confidentially and has only been used for the purposes of the present analysis and evaluation. Respondents were informed that their responses would remain confidential at the onset of the interview, and that they would not be quoted in the report without their permission.

Evaluation Schedule

The Evaluation took place between April 16th and June 30th 2018. The Lebanon Mission took place during the week of April 23rd 2018. The Jordan mission took place during the week of April 29th 2018. The interview calls with Syria took place during the week of May 7th.

5.2 Limitations

One of the general limitations of this evaluation is that findings have been based primarily on information collected from background documents and on interviews with stakeholders and project staff. The accuracy of the evaluation findings is therefore determined by the integrity of information provided to the evaluators from these sources and the ability of them to triangulate this information.

The cluster evaluation interviews were conducted in consideration of the limitations of such types of analyses. For example, interview statements may not fully reflect the true nature of the situation if the interviewee feels compelled to give socially acceptable or convenient replies. Additionally, interview candidates no longer employed in a given institution or project, may have also taken with them institutional memory, and may therefore provide an accurate picture of the current system. By remaining aware of these limitations, and collecting multiple sources of information from various backgrounds whenever possible, this has helped to minimize these issues.

Additionally, following the interviews, evaluators found that it would have been more beneficial to send the evaluation questions to the interviewees in advance, and, given that these were very lengthy, give those two hours two respond in order to respect the agenda. This would have allowed the interviewees the time to reflect and provide more detailed and valuable responses. Additionally, if interviewees had been asked to sign a Memorandum of Understanding or provided informed consent regarding the

confidentiality of the interviews in advance, there may have been better turnout and fewer absences, improving the quality of the responses and capacity for evaluation.

Finally, the considerable quantity of documentation, some of which received just before or after the field missions, represented a challenge to the team.

6 Findings

6.1 Project Design

The present section examines the Projects’ design and internal logic; the relevance of the indicators and means of verification and the indicators’ usefulness in monitoring and measuring outcomes. It also assesses whether the projects’ objectives were clear, realistic and likely to be achieved within the established time.

Project Design and Internal Logic

RDPP

The RDPP project conducted through a joint ILO project in Jordan and Lebanon consisted of ‘capacity building’, advocacy and training on occupational safety and health. ILO procedures for project planning, monitoring, reporting and evaluation for technical cooperation projects were used throughout the project cycle in both Jordan and Lebanon. For both of them, a National officer oversaw the project, supervised by the ILO Regional Office in Beirut.

An international child labor consultant was responsible for the project, along with a part-time project assistant. A project officer was responsible for backstopping the project in both Lebanon and Jordan. According to the final ILO report, these management and institutional arrangements were adequate.

Table 2: Breakdown of RDPP Project Budget across both Countries

| Budget | Jordan | Lebanon | Total |
|------------|---------|---------|---------|
| USD | 381,111 | 272,484 | 653,595 |
| EURO | 349,860 | 250,140 | 600,000 |
| Percentage | 58,31% | 41,69% | |

Lebanon

Most of the interventions conducted through the RDPP project in Lebanon consisted of capacity building at the policy level. The budget in Lebanon did not account for direct interventions for children, and, thus it tackled issues on the ‘policy side’ rather than through operational policies. However, through the execution of systematic and complementary activities, the project was designed to address the worse forms of CL

in the context of the Syrian crisis.

The project was implemented within the framework and priorities of the National Action Plan for the Elimination of the Worst Forms of Child Labor by 2020 where child labor in agriculture and on the streets is priority sectors for intervention.

Jordan

The ILO project in Jordan has been designed to be part of a comprehensive response to child labor, building upon existing systems in place in addressing child labor amongst refugees and host communities. In particular, through the RDPP project, ILO has engaged in enhancing access to employment opportunities and livelihoods in host communities, in the context of the Syrian crisis.

Norwegian-funded project in Lebanon

The Norway project is comprehensive and multi-sectoral approach, adopting both upstream and downstream measures in addressing child labor. There are 3 major components of the project:

- 1) Capacity building:** the project focused on enhancing the capacities of key government institutions to eliminate the WFCL (street work, agriculture and small establishments in the services sector).
- 2) Direct services:** direct educational, psychosocial, nutritional and livelihood services were provided to beneficiaries. Beneficiaries of the projects will come from 2 major rehabilitation centers working with street children, in Kahale Mount Lebanon, and Ouzai in the Southern suburb of Beirut. A third rehabilitation center will also be established in Nabbatiye, South Lebanon.
- 3) Advocacy:** advocacy on the dangers of child labor held through awareness campaigns and sensitization activities aimed at reaching policy makers, municipal authorities, employers, media and other intermediaries.

Canadian-funded project in Jordan

In Jordan, too many efforts had focused on perfecting a 'national model' through upstream or 'top-down' approaches, this called for more 'bottom-up' approaches, focusing on direct interventions for addressing child labor. This project has aimed at 'bridging' this gap by implementing a direct intervention approach which takes into account and operates within the framework of pre-existing national systems and structures.

ILO Project in Syria

In order to support efforts against child labor in Syria, the ILO undertook two missions to Damascus in 2016. From the outcomes of these missions and discussions amongst

government agencies, UN's and NGO's partners, the need for the development of a concept note for engagement in Syria has been raised. The concept note outlines the following 3 phases of ILO's engagement in Syria:

- **Phase 1 (0-3 months):** Immediate technical support to actors on the ground
- **Phase 2 (4-6 months):** Build partnerships with UN agencies in specific interventions in project for which resources are already available, in addition to continued technical support
- **Phase 3 (6-30 months):** Fully-fledged child labor project addressing multiple aspects and factors of CL.

The ILO project will progressively develop increasing levels of engagement and impact through the 3 phases of development. In the initial phases (1 and 2), the project will rely on partnerships and the provide technical support, however by the third phase, as the ILO's commitment and understanding of the specific needs of the country increase, it will progress into a fully-fledged CL project. This process is realistic in the implementation, as it provides the time to develop relevant capacities, networks and institutional arrangements before attempting to implement a full-scale project. This also allows for greater flexibility, adapting to any of the evolution changes in the political and social contexts which is particularly advantageous in times of crisis.

The primary purpose of the mission was to develop the capacity of key stakeholders for addressing CL in Syria, namely NGO partners, labor inspectors, case managers and MOE staff. The secondary purpose was to obtain inputs from other UN partners regarding the development of the proposal for Phase 3 engagement in Syria.

In early 2017, a concept note was produced on reducing the WFCL, which was subsequently accepted by the Syrian government. Through extensive follow up discussions, UNICEF was tasked as the Lead organization for the Child Protection Sub cluster. Subsequent to these discussions, an ILO office was established within the UNICEF compound, and an ILO national coordinator supported through an international consultant was recruited in Damascus.

The ILO is in ongoing discussions with the Syrian government, UNICEF, and other UN agencies to initiate a mapping exercise of current UN, government and NGO interventions on CL with the potential to be mainstreamed. The ILO has provided ongoing technical assistance to UNICEF to frame TVET interventions through a comprehensive plan.

Overall, for both the Jordan and Lebanon projects, the evaluation team agrees on the relevance of the project design. The target population and the consequent activities are adequate to generate consciousness on the gravity of the phenomenon of massive CL among Syrian refugees and to create and reinforce the capacity building of the different partners. The same can be argued for the Syrian case, despite the fact that the interventions are not yet there being deployed. However, regarding the internal logic, this evaluation finds that the causal relationship between inputs and both intermediate objectives and outputs is inadequate. For instance, the underlying

theory of change of the project is to participate to the reduction of child labor among Syrian refugees: nevertheless, without direct interventions and in the absence of robust spill-over effects the expected impact will not be observed and the objectives will only be partially reached.

The evaluation team agrees that, formally, the internal logic of the country projects presents weaknesses. However, the intervention strategies are clear and based on the overall ILO approach.

Relevance of Indicators

RDPP – Jordan

The ILO procedures for programming planning, monitoring, reporting and evaluation of technical cooperation projects, was used efficiently all throughout the project cycle. Reporting to the donor was in accordance with the reporting schedule and format agreed on with the donor that included a semi-annual report, a financial report shared on a yearly basis and due every 31st of May of each year, as well as a final report due after the end of the project.

As part of the RDPP project, detailed monitoring and evaluation processes (such as pre-and post-assessment of capacity building and awareness raising activities) were implemented within all capacity building activities.

RDPP-Lebanon

A number of different stakeholders conducted their own monitoring and evaluation systems, namely the American University of Beirut in relation to the study, the General Security (through systematized internal evaluation), and the Farmers Union (through an internal registry for contracted agricultural work) and BEYOND association (through internal evaluation systems). The database for BEYOND currently has information for 1000 children on gender, age, family composition and status on CL etc. Additionally, progress reports were sent to RDPP followed by discussions with partners to ensure appropriate reporting of status for the project.

M&E consists of collecting detailed information on the number trainings and capacity building activities conducted in a log framework. However, in order to make a more thorough analysis, more robust indicators are required to assess how effective the trainings were. The evaluation finds that for both Jordan and Lebanon RDPP the body of indicators is weak. Further information on the number of people attending the trainings, how much they learned from the trainings, number of drop-outs, future job applications related to trainings etc. would provide a more accurate picture of the impact of the project. As donors demand them, there is a strong incentive to collect more robust indicators.

Norwegian- funded project in Lebanon

Although a more robust M&E system was not in place for this project, continuous visits to field sites were conducted by a project consultant to monitor progress. Additionally, meetings were held with partners to monitor progress, discuss challenges and achievement of objectives. Additionally, progress reports were provided by NGO's such as BEYOND and consultants working directly with the children as in Home of Hope. Again the evaluation team finds that the system of indicators is very weak in order to monitor individual progress and potential impact.

Canadian-funded project in Jordan

The ILO procedures for programming planning, monitoring, reporting and evaluation of technical cooperation projects, were used efficiently throughout the project cycle. Reporting to the donor was in accordance with the reporting schedule agreed upon with the donor that included a quarterly progress report, a semi-annual update and a no cost extension report for 2 months. The ILO through ROAS Administration and Financial Unit submitted detailed financial reports on a biannual basis.

The National Program Manager conducted regular field missions in the two project sites to monitor project implementation, followed up by an update to the backstop at ROAS on progress achieved; problems faced and proposed corrective action. This included reporting on indicators as established in the project-monitoring plan.

The educational project implemented through the project has a pre-project database, with socioeconomic information on children and their families. However, the ILO did not have access to this database. Additionally, both implementing agencies both have their own database in paper form, containing basic information such as name, age, schooling, working hours etc.

This evaluation finds that it remains impossible to identify and measure the causal relationship between inputs and both intermediate objectives and outputs because the body of indicators is weak. For instance, the underlying theory of change of the project is to participate to the reduction of child labor among Syrian refugees: nevertheless, lacking a rigorous data collection system is translated to the fact that: (1) the expected outputs and impacts will not be measured and (2) the objectives will only be partially reached.

6.2 Project's Objectives, Clarity and Realism

RDPP

The project's objective was clearly stated as to contribute to the elimination of child labor, especially in its worst forms among Syrian refugees and host communities in Jordan and Lebanon.

In order to achieve these objectives in a realistic manner, the focus of RDPP project was on capacity building and policy dialogue with Government ministries and departments. This strategy was developed based upon ILO's past experiences in achieving sustainable results at reducing child labor through "national ownership and dedicated action", thus further building upon previous ILO and national government operations in both countries. The project also involved social partners and service providers in setting out the objectives, outputs and design for the project, drawing on their understanding of CL concerns and addressing their specific needs.

Norwegian-funded project in Lebanon

The project was clear and realistic in its objective of tackling the worst forms of child labor particularly by targeting the most relevant sectors: agriculture and street work. However, as there were fewer direct interventions, the project was more limited in its impact. If given a higher budget and extended time period, stronger engagement from more partners would be required, particularly to train NGO's to address the issue of CL.

Canadian-funded project in Jordan

The ultimate goal of the project was to facilitate the development of a sustainable model for prevention of child labor in addition to the withdrawal of existing cases of child labor. This model would then be modified and replicated in other regions in Jordan and elsewhere in the Middle East. With this objective, the project initiated preliminary direct action measures, working directly with children and families to provide a wide range of services in education, vocational training, social counseling, medical help, recreational activities and legal advice.

Although the project's objective was clear, the realism was limited due to budgetary and time constraints. Planning did not fully take into account the length of time that the Government of Jordan procedure for approvals (JORISS) would take, leading to a 5-month delay and a shortened timeframe for project implementation. Additionally, the non-formal education project that is provided for the working children and is enacted by the MOE takes up to 24 months to accomplish and obtain proper accreditation from the MOE.

ILO Project in Syria

The overall objective of the ILO project in Syria will be to reduce the worst forms of CL among vulnerable communities in Syria, through an integrated and systematic approach combining humanitarian response and existing national systems.

The key milestones for the Proposed ILO Project in Syria include:

1. Children involved in the worst forms of child labor (WFCL) withdrawn and rehabilitated, and children at risk prevented from entering into WFCL
2. National and local capacity to address child labor enhanced
3. Vocational training opportunities for youth and parents of child laborers as an exit point from child labor

6.3 Validity of Project Design

This sub-section analyses whether the project design assisted or hindered the achievement of the goal; the impact of external factors and assumptions and it also examines if institutional arrangements were taken into account. This section also assesses the potential of the project to be replicated or scaled up.

As a whole, the projects' design, internal logic and indicators at country-level present several weaknesses. Overall, the projects focused primarily upon higher-level interventions at the national level, relying primarily upon spill-over effects. Additionally, many of the interventions focused either on education components or livelihood provisions without effectively combining both. For all projects, there was an urgent need for effective M&E practices including robust quantitative and qualitative indicators, and rigorous impact evaluation, supplemented with relevant follow-up and pre-and post-training tests to evaluate the actual impact of trainings on individuals' knowledge and capacities. All the same, for each of the interventions, the strategies and objectives were clear and the project components were well defined.

In the evaluators' opinion, which is supported by documentary evidence and qualitative information gathered among key stakeholders, the likelihood of achieving the projects' goals largely depends on: a) ongoing support and commitment by key political actors b) the enabling environment (external factors and institutional arrangements and commitment).

RDPP

Lebanon

Although the RDPP project in Lebanon focused less upon direct forms of intervention, this did not undermine the achievement of the project's goals. Instead, the project was considered more realistic and clear in terms of its objectives, allowing for a stronger focus to be placed on capacity building and advocacy. Dedicating resources to these activities, such as developing specialized courses and tools, allowed them to have a greater impact in meeting the project's goal of tackling the WFCL. The RDPP project in Lebanon was also able to achieve greater flexibility in adapting to changes over the course of operations of the project. This increased the efficiency and relevance of the project.

The project was integrated with existing national policy frameworks, including the 'National Steering Committee Against Child Labour (NSC), its secretariat, and main governmental focal point for child labor, the Child Labor Unit (CLU) at the Ministry of Labor, and the National Action Plan for the Elimination of WFCL.

Nevertheless, it remained somewhat limited in terms of its scope and impact. One of the major shortcomings was its limited capacity to reach subnational areas of the country, where child labor is equally prominent as it did not fully account for support required for direct services. Moreover, the project design did not fully take into account the Syrian refugee crisis due to the lack of shelters to absorb children from Syrian and Lebanese communities. For example, in the Kahale center, there was only sufficient capacity for 100 children. Poor logistics and transport problems deriving from lack of sufficient funds meant that training sessions were not fully attended by all relevant personnel.

There were no major external changes during the project that required significant modifications in the operation. The capacity to be scaled up was limited due to the specificity of the nature of Child labor and key stakeholders involved. However, components such as SCREAM have a strong potential to be scaled up.

Jordan

The RDPP project was linked to Jordan's pre-existing national systems and structures dealing with CL, as well as national and international efforts surrounding the Syrian response. As a result, the project was designed to contribute to the development of a firm national infrastructure to enhance the capacities of major governmental and non-governmental organizations in dealing with CL concerns amongst both Jordanian and Syrian children. The intervention was very much focused on the national level with a more limited focus on the local and municipal level. Additionally, there was limited integration of projects at the regional level.

The project will contribute to linking Jordan's regular national systems, structures and projects on child labor to national and international efforts around the Syrian response. To this end, the project upgraded the TOR to national CL database that was officially adopted by the MOL in late December 2017.

Norwegian-funded project in Lebanon

In the first phase of the project, institutional arrangements amongst partners were developed rather informally, mainly through meetings held at the MOL. Coordination amongst partners was generally informal, as they attended the same workshops and sensitization meetings. However, further efforts at better institutionalizing coordination is planned for the second phase.

A major challenge with respect to the validity of the project design was that the need was greater than what the available services could provide, particularly in the

agricultural sector.

In general, the planned projects' objectives, means of action and outcomes were considered realistic given the limited time and budgetary constraints. The focus on sensitization training and awareness was therefore meant to expand outreach amongst the widest population possible.

In comparison to the RDPP project, the Norwegian project adopted a more comprehensive approach, addressing CL by linking policies to capacity building and direct interventions. The Norwegian model was more limited in terms of its flexibility to circumstantial changes over the course of their operations. This was a limiting factor as flexibility is necessary to maximize impact, particularly in light of the rapidly evolving social and political environment.

The project's ability to mobilize key governmental actors such as the Ministry of Labor was highly relevant in light of the worsening situation in Lebanon since as a result of the high influx of Syrian refugees in Lebanon, a greater strain in terms of resources has been placed within Lebanon in dealing with Child labour issues. The project was highly relevant with respect to the National Policy Framework on Child Labor, the National Action Plan for the Elimination of the WFCL in Lebanon.

Although the project was responsive to the needs of the beneficiaries and mobilized relevant stakeholders, one limitation was its limited geographical outreach, as it was limited in its capacity to reach some subnational areas affected by CL. Nevertheless, in light of its budget, it was able to reach critical areas including Beirut, Tripoli and South Lebanon with some interventions in the Beqaa Valley. Additionally, in terms of work with the Farmers Union and GS and child labour in agriculture, its geographical outreach included Tripoli, Akkar, Baalbeck, Chtoura for Beqaa and Nabbattiye for South Lebanon.

The project has strong potential and capacity to be scaled up, given that it has made substantial investments in the provision of services and centers, as well in terms of capacity building and training of staff on different forms of child labor. The project also showed capacity for addressing regional specificities. For example, Kahale and Ouzai centres were mainly for street children and trained a lot on that sector, Nabbattiye for agriculture and small industrial workshops, Zahle which was partially supported in agriculture, Tripoli for street children and those in small workshops and urban setting forms of work. The project therefore shows good potential to be scaled up given further considerations of regional specificities of tackling Child labor across different levels and sectors.

Canadian-funded project in Jordan

The ILO procedures for programming planning, monitoring, reporting and evaluation for technical cooperation projects were used efficiently all throughout the project cycle. The initial planning and engagement of key partners was organized from the

early phases. The project established a clear work plan to meet all outcomes, however the ILO did not communicate the concept note as initially planned.

The implementation was hindered due to delays in delivering interventions: the Ministry of Planning's new system for monitoring and registering new project contributed to these delays these, particularly with the number of projects related to the Syrian crisis. As a result, the Education Drop-Out project (requiring two years to complete three cycles) could not be completed.

Regarding the withdrawal of CL through the FCPS implementing agency, the enrollment in the project only reached 250 children despite the prevalence of over 1000 cases of child labor in Irbid. The target that was set for the FCPS by the ESDC project was 250 (100W 150 P) taking into account limited budget of \$50,000 and limited timeframe for implementation of less than 12m, their achievement was high as they were still able to reach targeted numbers. Vulnerability assessment framework (VAF) was not used by the ILO in terms of targeting.

According to FSPS, the enrolment is so low, because the project relies heavily on self-selection, which requires approval from the parents, the employer and the child. Parents and employers are often resistant, as CL may provide an important source of income, and children are often hesitant to go to school due to prevalence of bullying episodes and difficulty of re-integration in an academic setting.

The wider objective of the project to put in place a replicable model for direct interventions against Child Labor was not possible due to the limited budget and time constraints. At the end of the project in December 2017, only one cycle of the three rehabilitation and withdrawal cycles had been achieved. In order to build a comprehensive and effective model for replication entailing the withdrawal and rehabilitation of vulnerable children, a full cycle would require approximately 3 years to complete. Fundraising is currently underway, in order to compliment this initial phase of the project.

ILO Project in Syria

Overall, ILO's presence in Syria has been well designed in conjunction with the ILO Head in Jordan and with ongoing revisions and consultations. Key partners have been consulted in order to ensure that the design of the interventions is appropriate with respect to the conditions on the ground. Additionally, it aims at providing a good balance between high level and direct interventions. The project strategy will consist of 3 major components: skills development, targeted beneficiaries, and improved knowledge base. Additionally, the scope of the project will be limited to 3 locations: Damascus, Homs, and a final one which is yet to be determined.

In Syria, the ILO will focus primarily on the WFCL as per the ILO Convention 182, which Syria has ratified. Interventions will therefore focus primarily on children in hazardous work and those associated with armed forces groups.

The ILO intervention will build upon the existing interventions. Furthermore, it will take into account the current priorities identified in the NAP draft to Eliminate Child Labor currently endorsed by the MOSA and MOL. The intervention will aim to contribute to the 'Early Recovery and Livelihoods Sector' and the 'Education Sector'.

The ability to respond to the actual needs of beneficiaries, the ILO project in Syria will focus on targeting children in hazardous work, particularly those associated with armed groups, constituting one of the WFCL. In addition to preventive measures, these children require protection, support for reintegration and alternatives following withdrawal. Building the capacity for child protection actors in implementing the skills development and reintegration programs will be a priority for this project.

6.4 Integration of Gender Issues

Jordan

In Jordan, gender issues were not addressed specifically through interventions. There were however, female labor inspectors and female participants in trainings. Within the ESDC project there were specific services that took into account gender specifications in education, recreational and counseling services.

Lebanon

In Lebanon, the RDPP project's capacity to address gender issues was limited. Although there were generally an equal number of females present during the training, specific trainings addressing gender issues in relation to CL were very limited. The trainings noted that as female CL is more associated with household chores, policies should be channeled through the parents. Additionally, as male CL is more associated with work on the streets and on the field, their policies should be channeled through the Ministry of Labor as well.

Trainings also attempted to differentiate between the problems faced by girls and boys, namely cultural and social perceptions, treatments regarding education and domestic work, and physical and health aspects. However, the project still failed to fully address the psychological differences between boys and girls with respect to Child labor concerns. For example, girls may underestimate their capacity in succeeding in mathematics relative to boys.

The NGO BEYOND, which was a key partner in the RDPP initiative, implemented the same interventions for boys and girls. They attempted to address gender issues through gender based violence projects. For 'Home of Hope', interventions were separated by gender, with some classes involving a mix of boys and girls.

Syria

In Syria, through the UNICEF interventions, care will be taken to address gender-

specific risks facing boys which are more linked to hazardous work on the streets including child soldiers and girls which are more linked to through sexual exploitation and marriage.

7 Effectiveness: Main Results and Achievement of Objectives

This section examines the major challenges to implementation, as well as the stakeholders' engagements with the projects in each country; the main results achieved; and assesses whether the projects have achieved/are on track to attaining their immediate objectives.

7.1 Challenges to Implementation

RDPP

Jordan

In Jordan, the mechanism that initially had been planned for the intervention was firstly for labor inspectors to open the case for a child, the MoL would then have referred the child to the MoSD, which would then have attempted to provide livelihoods for the parents and education for the children. The main ministries represented by the NFCL underwent several capacity building activities and staff were fully aware of CL concerns. However, one of the major challenges was the delays in the operationalization of the electronic database that links the 3 ministries, as well as the realization of the new updated version of the CLDB that came in late 2017.

One of the major issues with respect to the implementation of the RDPP project in Jordan was that the Jordan government does not recognize the country office. Additionally, the country office does not have its own country director, but works rather under the larger umbrella of the UNDP. Whilst this generated delays at the administrative level regarding financial procedures, it did not impede activities or outputs.

Lebanon

One of the main gaps in the ILO strategy was the burdensome legislation process (such as the degree 8987) which is a highly time consuming process and requires time to review new pieces of law. This should be accounted for in the scheduling process in order to prevent any delays in interventions.

Another challenge to implementation was that certain activities required longer time than initially planned. Additionally, regional activities required certain administrative

and technical preparations that had not been properly accounted for in the planning schedule.

There was also a lack of consistency between upstream and downstream level interventions; Most of the interventions implemented were 'upstream' and consisted of capacity building and advocacy at higher levels. The project therefore lacked more direct action, specifically targeting the removal of children from harmful conditions, but also in developing income generating activities for the families.

An extended National Action Plan for the period of 2016-2020 had been developed in 2016, which contained a separate chapter concerning Syrian refugees. However, the Ministry of Labor failed to send the updated action plan to the ILO. The updated plan would have been an essential tool to convince donors, providing greater access to financial resources and conducting more reporting on planned activities.

Canadian-funded project in Jordan

As already mentioned, there have been a number of delays in the delivery of interventions. The project underwent a 5-month delay as a result of the long process of approval by the Government of Jordan. This was partially a result of the new system for monitoring and registering for new projects which calls for longer approval times.

There was a lack of consistency in communication between relevant actors (ILO, NGO's etc.) The ILO should have ideally built upon the existing platform of coordination represented by the NFCL and officially adopted by the government in 2011. THE ILO through the RDPP project assisted in building the capacities not only of the main partners but additionally new ones as in the case of the Juvenile police and 18 service providers in the Amman, Zarka and Irbid.

Another major challenge to implementation was cultural constraints and attitudes of parents, particularly regarding the education of girls. As a result, in most cases girls' educations ended early with early marriage and high dropout rates, particularly amongst Syrian families.

Norwegian-funded project in Lebanon

One of the major challenges faced with respect to implementation was a political and high-level establishment resistance to develop centers for Syrian refugee children in informal settlements or Lebanese neighborhoods. This required addressing the Ministry of Labor and other high-level personalities in various security establishments, to convince them that these centers would not be a place for potential gangs, but would be built to support and rehabilitate children targeted by them.

Another problem of implementation was the ability to involve major security forces in order to protect children, particularly from the worst forms of child labour. Institutions such as 'Home of Hope' were targeted by gangsters trying to exploit them for prostitution and drug dealing. To tackle this issue, maintaining support from the MoL

was essential in giving credibility to the governmental security agencies, namely the ISF and GS.

The ability to gauge the levels of commitment of people at different levels of the project was another challenge. The ability to support and maintain field persons dealing directly with children often took a lot of effort, particularly with respect to ISF, GS, and the Farmers Union. Additionally, although the project worked in depth with workers in agriculture, it conducted less work with employers, which is of particular importance given the precarious situation of the Lebanese industries.

One shortcoming in implementation was the absence of an effective monitoring system amongst the vast number of beneficiary children receiving aid from number of different NGO's and funders. As a result, it was impossible to identify ILO children amongst the wider beneficiary children population with other NGO's and funders. Although this could not have been implemented under a single project due to budgetary constraints, this would require engagement and cost sharing with other donors in order to fully support the case, especially for severe cases involving Syrian refugees.

Canadian-funded project in Jordan

One of the major gaps in implementation was a delay in the operationalization of the National Child Labor Database (CLDB), which subsequently limited access of service providers to the CLDB. Under the RDPP project, an IT consultant was recruited to upgrade the system. The latter will extend referrals to service providers beyond the MoL, MoE and MoSD, facilitating access for NGOs and other partners.

ILO Project in Syria

Although the ILO was present in Syria prior to it, the office was closed during the crisis. The ILO is therefore in the process of re-establishing its presence in Syria. As a result, the logistic capacities remain relatively low in comparison to the high demand for CL trainings. The ILO currently only has one staff member in the country. Additionally, there is greater demand for more sufficient technical support from the ILO.

7.2 Stakeholder Engagement

RDPP Project

Jordan

In Jordan, the key actors include: MoE, MoL and MoSD, (including National Aid Fund and Zakat fund), social partners, the police, social workers and street leaders.

In Jordan, advocacy fora were held with a number of parties and Government's partners: the Workers Relation Committee under Jordanian Parliament for Irbid, East Amman and Zarka governates. The project involved the engagement of the three ministries (Ministry of Labor, Ministry of Social Affairs, and Ministry of Education) in putting in place a monitoring system in order to make an electronic database recording all CL information.

In Jordan, linkage between NGO's and nationals is relatively low, and the effectiveness of livelihood projects were limited due to fragile networks between the MOL, ILO and the NGO's. In order to further address this issue, the ILO and MOL could take the lead in reinforcing communication and coordination networks between these actors.

The private sector was a key partner in eliminating and preventing CL in the labor market, with particular emphasis on CSR for both small and large enterprises. A survey conducted in 2016 showed that there was no knowledge on CL in the private sector. In response, the ILO conducted trainings with enterprises to discuss the dangers of it. Subsequently, a number of enterprises were approached and have had their awareness raised on channeling apart of their CSR into CL projects. Subsequently, they have provided funds to poor families and a report was published on the duties of employers as part of the CSR mandate.

Lebanon

In Lebanon, key actors include the Child Labor Unit at the Ministry of Labor, and its related committee within the Ministry of Interior and Municipalities, Municipal police, Association of Lebanese industrialists, general confederation of Lebanese Workers (CGLT) and grassroots NGOs.

The members of the Child Protection in Emergency Working Groups and relevant personnel of the Ministry of Social Affairs Social Development Centers oriented themselves towards provision of services for Lebanese and Syrian child workers, and coordination of efforts to generate multiplier effects. There was a need for a more open dialogue with the MoL.

Norwegian-funded project in Lebanon Project

According to the Final ILO report, the project operated in high complementarity amongst partners, using their roles and responsibilities to maximize the impact on the ground in quantity and quality.

The project involved effective mobilization and engagement of key government actors. Key partners involved were the Ministry of Labor and its CLU, the Directorate of Inspection, the General Security and the Internal Security Forces of Mount Lebanon. Through the development of these relations, one of the most important outcomes was a change in perspective, which went from considering street children as thieves or gangsters to treating as them as victims entitled to governmental protection.

Engagement with social partners, notably workers' and employers' organizations was critical in successful implementation, as they were actively engaged with various components of the project. For example, employers were sensitized at the beginning of the project and subsequently mobilized to contribute financially to children centers. The private sector has also been mobilized by organizations such as Home of Hope, BEYOND and the Chamber of Commerce and Agriculture who are waiting for proposals especially for the National Choir Against Child Labor

Canadian-funded project in Jordan

The successful implementation of the project was closely linked to the successful engagement of 2 implementing agencies, namely the Ruwwad Al-Tanmia in East Amman and the Family and Child Protection Society (FCPS) in Irbid. Both agencies had their own established networks, and showed strong commitment in identifying the targeted groups of vulnerable children.

Following the approval of the project, key partners were involved from the very onset of the project and throughout its implementation, such as the 2 IA staff, the MoSD and its Child Labor Unit, the Minister of Education and its General Education Unit.

The Directorate of Education, Labor and Social development participated in the execution of awareness campaigns, raising awareness of the services provided through the project. Additionally, several local schools were targeted to ensure school retention within targeted communities.

ILO Project in Syria

The ILO will also engage with public institutions providing services to vulnerable communities in schools, education directorates, social services and labor directorates. The ILO Project in Syria will engage with the MOSA and MOL, the Syrian Commission for Family Affairs and Population to strengthen the political response.

The ILO will work with UNICEF in addressing child labor. The central component of UNICEF's project is its Multi Service Platforms (MSPs) offering multi-disciplinary support to children. The ILO will therefore aim to take advantage of UNICEF's existing platforms in Syria, notably their experience, network and local institutional arrangements. The WFP aims to develop a link between their school feeding project and CL interventions as an effective strategy for withdrawing children from CL. Partnership with the WFP, provides an opportunity for both agencies to address child labor through systematic integration into the school feeding project. Collaboration with the UNDP in Syria will provide the opportunity to develop interventions, improving the country's economic and social recovery.

There should be strong coordination and continuous contact amongst different international organizations engaged in Syria. By conducting workshops, convening a number of different actors and UN agencies, they can make use of a platform for sharing key networks and experience. As the ILO intervention in Syria relies on close

collaboration with other UN agencies and partners such as the WFP and UNICEF and UNHCR, it should ensure that there is ongoing communication, strong coordination and a clear identification of the roles for all partners.

7.3 Main Results Achieved

RDPP

Jordan

The RDPP project in Jordan contributed to expanding the knowledge base on child labor in the country, in particular on the most hazardous forms. The project contributed to the development of the first OSH manual providing scientific indicators for fieldworkers to assess the occupational and health hazards children face in working environments. The manual was targeted at labor inspectors, the MoSD, MoH employers, families, communities and leaders.

The project developed the capacities of around 26 NGOs through a comprehensive set of trainings on how to integrate child labor concerns into their mandates (See Table 3). This contributes to the creation of a platform of service providers, facilitating the translation of the National Framework on CL adopted by the Government.

Table 3: Number of capacitated staff through intervention

| Trainees | Content | Numbers |
|--|---|----------------|
| Social workers, Juvenile police | New Juvenile law no. 32, Child labour concerns and SCREAM modules | 120 |
| Minister of Education staff | Recently upgraded MOE manual on means of decreasing dropout rates and prevention and remedial actions | 60 |
| NGOs in Amman, Zarka, Irbid | Integration of CL into mandate through strategic planning and network building. | 26 |
| Ministries of Labour, Education and Social Development | National CL Database, IT system | 3 Ministries |
| OSH Staff | Trainings on the OSH and CL manual | 26 |

Lebanon

The project developed an in-depth study on CL in agriculture amongst Syrian refugees in the Beqaa Valley, led by ILO in partnership with FAO and UNICEF, and executed by A.U.B. Through the development of scientific studies in the agricultural sector the groundwork for future research and ongoing policy discussions have been set. The study was the first of its kind within the region, along with the trainings and accompanying course materials such as the 'Guide for Practitioners' in Arabic.

At policy level, the project implemented interventions targeting child labor in agriculture. One of the most important results was the development of a Memo issued by General Security in 2016, prohibiting CL in agriculture under the age of 16. This Memo was particularly impactful in targeting Syrian refugee children. and in addressing the powerful employer organization or the ‘shawish’, who were involved in using children in bonded and forced forms of labor. Cooperation with the Farmers Union to develop the Memo was an effective means to disseminate critical messages on the risks of child labor in agriculture.

The RDPP project implemented an ILO SCREAM project in Arabic and adapted it to the local context. This one with a particular emphasis on music, included the development of a National Choir against Child Labor, based on the Egyptian experience witnessed during the trainings. The choir was a highly effective means of psychosocial treatment for children, a majority of which (60%) where Syrian. Their performance at the Presidential Palace on National Child Day on March 20th 2018 was a symbolic demonstration of the projects’ achievements.

Norwegian-funded project in Lebanon

One of the main results of the project was in the development of the centers for children referred to by the ISF, GS, MoL and other NGOs, including the Kahale Home of Hope day and Night Centre, Ouzai Day Centre, and Zahle Community Centre against Child Labor

Through the activities supporting and extending the services of Child centers as well as the establishment of new centers the number of children withdrawn and prevented from entering labor was higher than expected (Table 4).

Table 4: Project Targets of Norwegian-funded project in Lebanon

| | Target | Results |
|-------------------------------------|---------------|---|
| Children Working in WFCL | 500 | 100 children withdrawn from WFCL on the streets by Home of Hope 150 withdrawn from work on the streets by BEYOND Ouzai 150 withdrawn from WFCL in agriculture and construction in Beqaa 35 withdrawn from WFCL through GS referrals to MOL |
| Children Prevented from WFCL | 3000 | 500 prevented through BEYOND Association centers in Beqaa and Ouzai |

Canadian-funded project in Jordan

During the 12-month time frame, the project was able to identify over 1000 children

from the targeted group of beneficiaries. Over 947 vulnerable children and 300 of their families were approached from two selected geographical locations where CL is most prominent- East Amman and Irbid governorate. From the early phase of implementation, several well-structured advocacy campaigns by the NGO's Ruwwad Al-Tanmia in East Amman and Family and Child Protection Society in Irbid, the project succeeded in reaching the target group, of which 50% were Syrian refugees.

Children identified through the project were mainstreamed into different education projects, in collaboration with the Ministry of Education (See Table 5).

Table 5: Educational Program and Beneficiaries for Canadian-funded project in Jordan Project

| Program | Number of beneficiaries | Percentage | Means of verification |
|---|--------------------------------|-------------------|------------------------------|
| 1 st Grade (6-8 yrs) | 40 | 5% | No excel sheet |
| Remedial Education Program (9-12 yrs) | 154 | 28% | No excel sheet |
| Education drop outs Program (13-18 yrs) | 183 | 67% | No excel sheet |

Engagement of over 20 schools and lectures on services were given to local communities to sensitize them on the importance of education as a long-term investment. These communities then became active participants in the project, with over 610 students receiving counseling services.

With the collaboration of the MoE, two new dropout centers for girls in Eastern Amman were established to absorb the homebound and dropout girls referred from field surveys undertaken by RUWWAD. At the early phase of implementation, professional counseling was provided for these children, to address some of the cultural barriers leading them to be kept out of school to do household chores

Capacity building was conducted for MoE counselors and staff within the two IAs, with the incorporation of the updated MoE manual on decreasing school drop out rate. This facilitated the ability to reach 610 vulnerable children, providing them with necessary protection and psychosocial counseling services

Regarding the project's capacity to address CL linked to the Syrian refugee crisis, 350 families, were selected from a database from the NAF and international agencies. Through active advocacy with humanitarian agencies, the project facilitated access to livelihood services with NGOs such as UNDP, DVV, and Save the Children.

ILO Project in Syria

As of now, the ILO's engagement in Syria has been in the initial phase of implementation (Phase 1 and 2). As such, its interventions have consisted primarily of

technical support through the facilitation of trainings and seminars in cooperation with UNICEF. This has included trainings for Labor Inspectors and Case Managers, for staff of the MSP (Multi Service Platform) and CFS (Child Friendly Spaces), as well as trainings on the Toolkit on CL in Emergencies for the UN and other NGO partners.

The ILO also conducted a series of meetings with UN partners in Syria,, including staff members from UNICEF, UNDP, UNHCR, the Child Protection Sub-Sector Working Group, and the WFP. These meetings were essential in developing and strengthening cooperation with these agencies.

Moreover, they were essential in gaining feedback for the Phase 3 proposal for ILO's intervention in Syria, and served as an initial step in the ILO's objective to promote multi-sectoral coordination on CL.

7.4 Achievement of Objectives

RDPP – Jordan and Lebanon

The following is an outline of the achievements made with respect to each of the project's targeted outcomes or objectives.

Outcome 1: Building of consensus among policymakers and other stakeholders to grant refugees of working age access to certain sectors of the labor market and engage them in other socio-economic activities in efforts to prevent and eliminate child labor

1. *Expand knowledge base on the worst forms of child labor and the link with the labor market participation*

In Jordan, the project contributed in expanding the knowledge base on child labor by publishing two reports and an OSH manual. One report was published on youth participation in the labor force, and the second was an analytical report on CSR. Over 29 corporations across diverse fields were briefed on issues of child labor and its consequences. Both OSH and CL manuals were the first of their kind at the regional level.

In Lebanon, the American University of Beirut is currently conducting a high-quality study led by the ILO on child labor in agriculture amongst Syrian refugees in the Beqaa valley, with financial support of FAO and Unicef. This document will be an important tool in developing policies and pragmatic actions against child labor amongst Syrian refugees.

2. *Engage key actors at the national and district level on measures to improve the socio-economic conditions of refugee children through granting adult refugees access to the labor market*

In Jordan, 11 advocacy forums were held amongst different parties including government partners and the workers' relations committee under the Jordanian parliament. The latter was led by the youth committee capacitated through the RDPP project. These forums addressed child labor concerns and means of improving the socio-economic conditions for Jordanian and Syrian refugees.

In Lebanon, 3 discussion forums were held in Akkar, Beqaa and Beirut including municipal members, employers, workers' organizations and relevant NGOs. One of the most important outcomes of this initiative was that the General Secretary would give Farmers Unions special season work permits for the recruitment of Syrian agricultural workers, provided that they do not allow children under 16 years old to work (particularly in agriculture, in line with Decree 8987). As a result, 440 permits were issued, of which 90% were in agriculture and 10% in construction.

3. *Raising awareness of parliamentarians, national officials, on the dangers and risks of child labor and what needs to be done to stop its worst forms through the working children's podium*

In Jordan, a fully operational Children's Podium was developed, with over 15 meetings conducted. The National Forum took place in March 2017, which gave excellent visibility to the RDPP project through the number of participants representing different national and international bodies and media coverage reaching over 12 local and 2 international media channels. Additionally, a documentary video about the National Forum and its preparation were published and circulated amongst key partners. A short video on SCREAM and the regional TOT workshops were also produced in March 2016. TwoTV interviews and two radio interviews with the students that participated in SCREAM trainings were conducted in September 2016. Articles, interviews, videos and social media covered advocacy meetings, the National Forum and other initiatives.

In Lebanon, awareness rising through the Children's Podium and SCREAM results exceeded expectations. It reached 4 ministers, 15 parliamentarians, and 18 other national officials. Additionally, the National Choir Against Child Labor which was a part of the SCREAM project was selected as 'good practice' by the Presidential Palace giving child labor the highest national platform.

4. *Municipal authorities and employers are aware of the hazards of child labor and understand their responsibilities in prevention*

In Jordan, at least 100 officials from the Greater Amman Municipality, GAM Zarka and Irbid were sensitized on issues of Child Labor. Additionally, for the Corporate Social Responsibility Unit, 40 employers were reached during the months of March-April 2016 through capacity building exercises. Furthermore, 20 shop owners were approached in preparation for the National Forum on CSR, which underlined the importance of including child labor concerns directly into CSR Mandates.

Outcome 2: By the end of the project, partners' capacities to address child labor have improved

1. *Output-The capacity of key national institutions and mechanisms to prevent child labor is enhanced*

In Jordan, IT capacity building efforts to update national CL were carried out that included 15 officials from the Ministry of Labor Education and Social Development receiving 'Super Users' training in addition to 90 normal IT users' training to cover staff from different regions. The aim was to enable users to support and use the system effectively to capture, analyze and process CL cases. This developed the capacity for 120 MOSD social workers, through the incorporation of the ILO manual and newly formulated by-laws. 60 MOE school counselors were trained on retaining children from early evasion. 60 juvenile police and NAF staff on the new Juvenile LawNo.32, and SCREAM. 60 labor inspectors representing the MOL and MOH were trained on OSH manual and CL.

In Lebanon,, One training took place in Egypt, on how to tend to the working street children at governmental and non-governmental level as well as private sector contributions. A team came from Egypt to train the police, social workers and managers of youth centers in Mount Lebanon on how to treat street children. Capacity building on how to carry out occupational safety and health visits at work sites and assess working conditions for children and adults was conducted.

2. *Capacity of Employers' and Workers' organizations and their members to address the worst forms of child labor have been enhanced*

In Jordan, 20 employers attended the NGO trainings held in Amman, Irbid, and Zarka. Additionally, 40 employers have undergone 'awareness raising' on different aspects of child labor and how to employ CSR to eradicate child labor in Jordan.

In Lebanon, 40 Lebanese employers were sensitized on child labor and its link with CSR. An agreement was reached with 24 employers to provide refurbishing centers: Home of Hope, Centre for Street Children, Ouzai Day Centre for street children, and Nabbattiye Center for working children. With the Norwegian project, 30 employers from the Farmers Union received information on the new Memo issued by the General Security, prohibiting the use of children in agriculture under 16.

3. *Capacity of local NGOs to develop services for children at risk of or involved in child labour has been enhanced*

In Jordan, a total of 26 local NGOs were selected through an assessment exercise in early 2016, and were fully trained on Child Labor in 3 rounds. Round 1 consisted of definitions, legal and policy frameworks. Round 2 consisted of networking and proposal writing. Round 3 consisted of advocating for CL in a consolidated management model. Two of the NGOs participating were then selected to implement the 'direct intervention model' in two concentrated areas through the

Canadian-funded project in Jordan.

In Lebanon, 3 NGOs were trained in Egypt regarding working street children, 5 individuals were involved in training in Beirut for Internal Security Forces on how to tend to and develop an appropriate referral system for working street children (IRC, Home of Hope, War Child Holland, Makhzoumi and BEYOND). 3 NGOs from Beqaa were involved in training of Farmers' Union and child labor in agriculture. Training manuals were developed including one for agriculture and child labor, one specifically for social workers, and one for literacy and numeracy projects. These trainings were fundamental, and was the first time that NGOs received trainings on specialized forms of child labor.

4. *Capacity of the police, labor inspectors, social workers and community leaders to respond to child labor has been strengthened*

In Jordan, trainings were given on the new role of MOSD counsellors within the New Juvenile Law to 110 MoSD counselors and the juvenile police. 60 MoE counsellors received training on preventive measures from the MoE manual (from the USDOL funded project on Child Labor in Jordan). 105 MoL labor inspectors, MoE and MoSD staff were trained on the new electronic national child labor database (also funded by the USDOL project, and the RDPP).

In Lebanon, a total of 103 staff members were trained throughout the course of the project. One of the trainings was on how to tend to the working street children, and how to coordinate a referral system to appropriate services. 25 internal security forces and 3 MOSA attended this training. 12 Ministry of Labor inspectors received training on occupational safety and health at the A.U.B Faculty of Health Sciences. 32 social workers from BEYOND were trained on the New Guide for Social Workers. Lastly, 30 community leaders, municipal police, and NGO monitors attended training on child labor in agriculture, using materials from the New Guide of the RDPP project.

Norwegian-funded project in Lebanon

The following is an outline of the achievements made with respect to each of the project's targeted outcomes or objectives.

Immediate Objective 1: By the end of the project, knowledge of the key actors and the general public regarding child labor has been strengthened.

1. National and regional media institutions sensitized on WFCL and its effective and ethical coverage.
2. Awareness events of at risk children, those working in WFCL, their families and public at large are organized to raise awareness on the harms and dangers of such work through SCREAM Productions.

The project received media coverage from over 12 national and regional TV, radio

institutions and newspapers. Further awareness raising activities were conducted through a play produced through the SCREAM project during ILO's visit to Beqaa valley, as well as a film produced on the National Choir against Child Labor. These activities contributed to raising awareness on child labour concerns amongst the general public.

Link to play: www.ilo.org/beirut/media-centre/news/WCMS_550477/lang--en/index.htm

Link to film: www.ilo.org/beirut/media-centre/multimedia/WCMS_613962/lang--en/index.htm

Immediate Objective 2: By the end of the project, partners' capacities to address exploitative forms of child labor have improved.

1. Capacity building workshop organized to enhance capacity of grassroots NGO's staff to respond to child labor.
2. The capacity of the Association of Lebanese Industrialists and relevant corporations to address the issues confronting children engaged in WFCL has been enhanced.
3. Capacity building workshop organized to enhance capacity of the Farmers' Union and relevant members of CGTL to address child labor in agriculture.
4. The capacities of the Internal Security Forces to combat the phenomenon of working street children will be enhanced.
5. The capacities of the General Security Forces to combat child labor in agriculture will be enhanced.
6. Capacity building workshop organized to enhance capacity of the Child Labor unit at MOL to effectively deal with child labor at the national level.

There were 57 capacity building workshops organized for BEYOND centers⁷ from Home of Hope, and 5 from the MOSA. Trainings were given to 43 members from the Association of Lebanese Industrialists, taking action against WFCL, with a particular emphasis on supply chains and CSR. Through the project, 50 members of the Farmers' Union and other agricultural unions were sensitized.

Additionally, 17 members from the Internal Security Forces received trainings on how to address the problem of working street children, 12 of which came from ISF Mount Lebanon. Staff from 4 different NGOs with centers for working street children were trained to develop and coordinate a referral system amongst the different centers. Several workshops scheduled with the Internal Security Forces had to be postponed to the next phase of the project due to institutional changes in the directorate. The establishment of an 'official unit' was postponed due to lack of sufficient funds.

Following capacity building activities with the MoL the Human Rights Trafficking Organization and emigration unit of the Directorate of the General Services was tasked with the 'Combating Child Labor Unit'. General Security Staff received trainings on the WFCL and the new memo. This led to further commitment by the government,

notably high-level officials such as Brigadier Ali Ahmad of GS Directorate of Emigration.

The CLU director received trainings on child labor in agriculture and on the streets, through workshops and other innovative learning approaches such as the study tour in Cairo. The study tour with the NGO 'Hope Village', which has over 20 years of experience with street children, involved learning from other countries' experiences.

Immediate Objective 3: By the end of the project, integrated and effective responses to fight child labor, especially its worst forms are in place.

1. Children involved or at risk of being involved in the WFCL are provided with initial integrated support through a community center against child labor
2. Children involved in work on the streets of Beirut were withdrawn and provided with initial integrated support through two community centers against child labor.
3. Vulnerable households have access to livelihood opportunities in Beqaa community center against child labor in agriculture

One major output was the establishment of the Nabattiye Centre for Children on October 9th, 2017. The Centre has the capacity to absorb 150 children, providing them with educational, recreational, nutritional services. With ILO's support, two community centers the Kahale and BEYOND Ouzai Center were refurbished and capacitated. The ILO provided logistical and capacitive support to the Kahale centre, improving the quality of its services and establishing a CLM Referral system. The ILO provided financial support to BEYOND Ouzai Center, which transferred to a more suitable location.

Through the project, 30 livelihood opportunities were provided for girls and boys of vulnerable households between the ages of 15-18 years. Although these were small-scale projects (\$500), such as sewing machines, manicure or pedicure kits they have proved successful for beneficiaries.

Canadian-funded project in Jordan

The following is an outline of the achievements made with respect to each of the project's targeted outcomes or objectives.

Immediate Objective 1: Rehabilitate 700 children (boys and girls), out of which 300 vulnerable children protected from early entry to labor market.

The project assisted two local grassroots organizations in building an effective model of direct interventions. Individual and group counseling was provided to former child laborers and dropouts, and psychosocial counseling to help build self-awareness amongst former child laborers. Monitoring mechanisms were established at the workplace, in schools and for families to ensure sustainability of withdrawals.

Immediate Objective 2: Sensitize the newly targeted working children and their siblings regarding the problem of child labor & provision of services to 300 families in coordination with other UN and local organizations.

Community mobilization activities and workshops were held for children and families incorporating SCREAM modules. The project educated 350 parents on the dangers of child labor, and on alternative sources of income through referral system for job placement, career opportunities and vocational training courses.

ILO Project in Syria

The future milestones and planned outputs of the ILO Project in Syria include:

1. Children involved in the worst forms of child labor (WFCL) withdrawn and rehabilitated, and children at risk prevented from entering into WFCL

To achieve this objective, the ILO will work in collaboration with UNICEF on rehabilitating three of its MSP Centers in Homs, Damascus and one other location. Through MSP, children will be provided multi-sectoral, holistic direct services. Young children will be provided with formal education, and non-formal activities through ILO's SCREAM. Children above 15 working in hazardous apprenticeships will receive an integrated support package including OSH awareness, learning content and certifications. This intervention will directly approach employers to improve working conditions. Vocational training, networking, civic engagement and entrepreneurship will also be provided. Finally, parents will also be sensitized on the dangerous of CL.

2. National and local capacity to address child labor enhanced

The MSP staff and other staff working in the two target locations will be trained to identify and address the WFCL, as well as viable referral pathways and solutions for children involved in or at risk of the WFCL.

In two select locations, the ILO will implement the CLM System to engage a wide group of stakeholders. Large-scale capacity building will be conducted for local government partners, social workers, labor inspectors, teachers, counsellors, employers and organizations, trade unions, health workers and religious and community leaders. Advocacy and awareness raising projects through community outreach will be essential in gaining the support of the wider community.

Capacity building for government counterparts and UN agencies will be conducted on the WFCL. Additionally, the "Child Labor in Emergencies" toolkit developed by the ILO Global Child Labor Task Force will be contextualized and rolled out through these trainings.

Tools for linking CL with livelihood and school feeding interventions will be developed by building on existing interventions with the WFP. To develop better data on CL, household data collection processes by other UN agencies will be reviewed to improve

their capacity for conducting CL assessments.

3. Vocational training opportunities for youth and parents of CL as an exit point of child labor

To provide a sustainable alternative path upon withdrawal, an assessment will be conducted to identify potential sectors and occupations for children engaged in CL and their families. Current TVET Centers will be assessed regarding their needs, capacities, infrastructure etc. Surveys from customers and establishments will be conducted providing information on demand and future needs. This will form the basis for designing future CL projects linked to MSP centers and other skills and livelihoods training. By engaging key stakeholders and beneficiaries, this will lay the foundations for a TVET strategy to be developed in post-conflict Syria. This is essential in addressing the long-term requirements of rebuilding a sustainable future following the crisis.

8 Efficiency – Allocated Resources & Results Obtained

Overall, the projects carried out in Jordan and Lebanon – as the project in Syria is not yet in the implementation phase – have shown great contributions to the national child labor reduction objectives and to the ILO’s decent work outcomes.

All the three projects have been rated as highly effective in reaching the set outputs and outcomes, meaning that almost all outputs were delivered successfully with almost all output indicators targets being met. Moreover, outputs delivery was successfully translated into achievement of the majority (60% to 80%) of immediate objectives, which contributed to long-term development outcomes. This means that the system that was implemented for monitoring was efficient to reach the initial goals planned *ex ante* (as an example, “x” workshops were indicated as a target for the planned foregone activities, and at the end of the project, “x” workshops were effectively delivered). However the level and power of detecting efficiency regarding the monitoring of activities are both weak (for more detail, refer to the previous section on the relevance of indicators).

Concerning efficiency in the use of material, human and financial resources, the three projects have been rated very efficient, meaning that the majority (60 to 80%) of outputs were of expected quality and delivered within the budget and the schedule set out in the original implementation plan. With the available budget, the projects have certainly contributed greatly towards the development goal and have been considered very successful given the narrow time frame and the several resource constraints.

The joint Lebanon-Jordan project was successful in establishing a firm infrastructure, especially in terms of generating awareness and enhancing the capacities of major relevant government bodies and non-governmental organizations, especially in terms

of prevention of ex-child laborers, for both Syrian refugees and host communities. Overall, the capacitated staff amounted to 380 people, which is beyond the set target and can be considered as a great achievement given the humble budget of the project.

One of the important lessons coming out of the RDPP project is that in order to have optimal impact, policy interventions and direct service interventions have to be linked to each other. As this project focuses on interventions at the government and policy level, its activities have only a limited impact.

In this sense, the three projects can be seen as complementary in their contribution to the child labor education outcomes, as the two projects operating in Lebanon and in Jordan focus on direct interventions targeting at-risk, working children (and in some cases ex-child laborers) and their families.

In Lebanon, the milestone of the project was the establishment and requalification of community centers to provide at risk children with recreation and educational services, in order to raise awareness in the whole community against child labor. A substantial part of the budget for this project was devoted to hiring and training of staff for the community center. This efficient management of human resources can be seen as the key factor to the project' success as the project invested heavily in ensuring the availability of appropriate services and centers with specialized staff to deal with different types of child labor, therefore complementing all efforts carried out at the governmental level. There were highly effective synergies between the Lebanon project and the ILO's SCREAM project operational in the country, resulting in a more efficient use of funds.

The resources allocated to the project in Jordan allowed provision of not only direct services to at-risk and ex-child laborers, but also to enhance participation of their households into productive livelihood opportunities. In fact, one of the lessons learnt from previous projects in the region has been that combatting child labor can only be effective if the interventions appropriately take into account the role of the family and the community. Support to the family and engagement with the community should be integral parts of any withdrawal projects.

Even though a substantial part of these three projects' budget has been spent on human resources and on training staff, recruiting and keeping competent and highly-specialized personnel has been key for the success of both capacity building and direct education services activities, and the level of competency of the recruited staff has helped to change the perception on child labor of the stakeholders involved.

The ILO teams in Jordan and Lebanon have also been effective in establishing relationships with the different national stakeholders. In Jordan, the project was able to establish a strong coordination link between the three main partners: The Ministry of Labor (MoL), the Ministry of Education (MoE), and the Ministry of Social Development (MoSD). Similarly, in Lebanon there were serious and effective mobilization and engagement efforts of key governmental actors needed for the effective implementation of the project.

Despite the projects' success in terms of effectiveness, efficiency and partnership, one recognized weakness common to all three projects is the limited time frame. In fact, this poses challenges to building a comprehensive model that can have positive externalities over other aspects of targeted children's lives. Children engaged in child labor have special needs and therefore require specialized programming; support should be holistic (meeting all the needs of the child), long-term and flexible. Long-term funding is required to develop effective education, protection and livelihoods projects that effectively address the needs of their families.

Overall, the evaluation finds that the total budget allocated to the global project of reducing CL among Syrian refugees in the region was limited. Additionally, time constraints were severe in some cases. Given those conditions, the delivery of activities was outstanding.

9 Potential Impact

This section evaluates how the projects progressed towards the realization of intended impact and how this was reflected in general.

RDPP

Jordan

Before the intervention, there was a lack of communication between government ministries. Following the intervention, efforts were made to implement an electronic database documenting CL cases, but the infrastructure did not support it. The ILO conducted computer systems training which will soon be implemented to include service providers and other NGOs.

There was a strong level of coordination with the private sector to develop CSR. A survey in 2016 among enterprises in the private sector showed limited knowledge of national legislation on child labor. The private sector participated in ILO trainings so they can be aware of conditions for safety of working children. Although the private sector received training to increase awareness about child labor there were no concrete donations made through the CSR funds.

In Jordan, trainings have had a direct impact on the effectiveness of officials working on ground to tackle child labor. Additionally, the implementation of the National Framework on Combating Child Labor has improved the understanding of the policy framework and referral mechanisms, whilst consolidating commitment of key actors through the electronic systems.

Government officials, NGO staff and the municipality were mobilized in a collaborative and inclusive manner, through interest and ownership, this action is expected to have

important implications in maintaining the sustainability of the project. As human and institutional capacities have been developed through it, this has been essential in ensuring that the National Framework on Combating Child Labor can fully function and gather further momentum. The RDPP project played an important role in linking the humanitarian response to the Syrian refugee crisis with the national systems of allocation and budgets from the MoL, MoSD and MoE.

Lebanon

Through the project, the development of strong relationships with new partners such as the General Security and the Farmers Union, was critical in addressing the worst forms of child labor. Additionally, earning the strong support through advocacy efforts was essential in ensuring the mobilization of the General security to take an active role in combating CL.

Another important impact was behavioral and attitudinal change of key actors. Following the intervention, the ISF and GS adopted a more humanistic approach towards children. The perceptions of children changed from viewing them as criminals to viewing them as children that required protection. The farmers changed their attitudes towards hiring children, recognizing that they were less productive than adults.

The mobilization of other UN organizations in the context of the project was an important impact, as they are key in providing technical and financial support, generating further multiplier effects from the initial resources provided from the RDPP. The Children's podium was also very impactful, serving as an important advocacy tool for children, family members, policy makers and local community members.

Canadian-funded project in Jordan

Due to time constraints, the project was unable to pursue the completion of the education dropout project. Regardless, the project was able to surpass target for vulnerable children. The services provided through the project identified children out of education and working in hazardous conditions, removed them, and mainstreamed them to either formal or informal educational and pre-vocational or vocational training. Through the project, children were provided with counseling and art therapy, health services and educational activities, to improve their health and well-being.

The project's wider impact lay in its capacity to develop a strong infrastructure for future interventions- through a comprehensive model, which developed capacities of NGOs to adopt an inclusive and holistic approach, involving children, parents, employers and the community at large. However, with respect to concrete results in reducing child labor, this was limited as a result of delays and limited budget and time.

Norwegian-Funded Project in Lebanon

One of the major factors in the project's success was its ability to mobilize key governmental actors such as the MoL, the GS and ISF in committing to action against Child Labor.

Additionally, through high visibility, the issue has become increasingly mainstreamed amongst the general public and main governmental institutions, resulting in more widespread impetus to take action against child labor on the ground. The project was widely covered by media institutions and observed by high-level policy makers. At least 3000 individuals were exposed to the campaign in comparison to the target of 1000.

The project also had an important impact with respect to the children targeted through the project, particularly with regards to the SCREAM initiatives. Many of the children withdrawn from WFCL under the project, were in extremely precarious situations, with over 50% in bonded labor. Changes in the children were however, visible through time, as they began to feel greater trust, protection and personal security. Through the SCREAM project, not only did they develop numeracy and literary skills, but it also allowed them to develop greater confidence.

Due to delays, shortage of funds, and a limited time frame, they did not manage to achieve more concrete results in reducing CL. The number of children prevented from entering child labor (at least 2000) was less than the initial target of 3000. The project succeeded in building a good infrastructure, which sets the foundations for more direct interventions at a later stage.

ILO Project in Syria

In addition to the immediate benefits that the direct services will have for beneficiaries and their families, this will also serve as a 'demonstration effect', and encourage further action on the part of the Syrian government other UN agencies, NGO partners and donors. This should therefore increase the potential of the project to be replicated and scaled up through future interventions.

10 Sustainability

This section assesses the likelihood that achievements made by the project will continue following its completion, or the probability for long-term results. The analysis is structured around some general considerations and then focuses on the sustainability prospects by project

RDPP

In Lebanon as in Jordan, the sustainability of the project is difficult to assess in the

absence of a baseline survey and solid indicators.

For Lebanon and Jordan, sustainability may be undermined due to the short time frame and limited budget for direct interventions. Although the efforts in addressing child labor in Jordan were focused on systems and capacity building, there has been a call for more direct services to withdraw and rehabilitate children. This will require more equitable funds, involving the Government and wider humanitarian and donor community.

One of the most concrete outcomes achieved through this project was widespread awareness amongst the general public, children, parents, government officials, NGOs etc. that they are all agents of change and have a role to play in the fight against child labor

Jordan

According to the final ILO RDPP report, the sustainability of results is highly likely in Jordan, given that sufficient funds and the time frame are taken into effect. RDPP adapted a 'dual-track' approach to tackle child labor, by advocating for policy reforms within refugee host communities in addition to capacity building for the government, civil society, municipalities and employer institutions.

The project was important in establishing a solid infrastructure for raising awareness and enhancing capacities of a number of different stakeholders including government partners. On the other hand, the links that have been created with other agencies such as UNICEF, the UNHCR etc. have created an important foundation for the continuation of future interventions.

Sustainability of the project has also been ensured by linking the current project to the wider network of projects and systems currently in place. For example, by training NGO's and social workers in the field (agriculture and on the streets), this ensures increased effectiveness across a number of service providers.

Lebanon

An important indicator of sustainability was the addition of 'Child Labor' into the mandate of the General Security and its Department for Human Rights and Human Trafficking. Additionally, the Memo prohibiting child labor in agriculture was an essential political commitment, leading to longer-term impact.

Farmers' Unions, including a number of employers of agricultural workers are now abiding by this new memo. This has also had important implications for dealing with the Syrian refugee crisis, with 440 seasonal work permits already provided for Syrian agricultural workers.

The Code of Conduct drafted by the Ministry of Interior for the police in addressing working street children was also an important preliminary step, which should

subsequently be followed up to ensure official adoption by the ISF. However, the number of labor inspectors is very low, which could limit sustenance. The Ministries require more funds to conduct further trainings of labor inspectors.

The sustainability of efforts through the project may be undermined as a result of high ministerial turnover in Lebanon. Although many high-level political officials were reached through the project, there is a high level of turnover, which may result in a change in priorities and approaches to CL. Ongoing trainings and advocacy efforts within the ministries must therefore be conducted in order to maintain the momentum achieved through the project.

Canadian- Jordan Project

To ensure the sustainability of outcomes for children withdrawn from child labor and those at risk as either potential dropouts or dropouts were targeted in collaboration with a well-established network.

The commitment and continuation of 300 out of the 377 children withdrawn through the project was considered satisfactory in light of the reasons for withdrawal, namely the lack of economic alternatives for the most vulnerable families. Most of the former child laborers enrolled in the project indicated that they were optimistic about their future despite the precarious circumstances they faced.

The well-established network within the 2 Implementing Agencies in East Amman and Irbid are a strong indicator of the sustainability of the project. The ongoing involvement of a number of partners including the MOL, MOSD, the MOE the Municipality of Irbid are essential in maintaining the services provided under the context of the project.

Moreover, through advocacy activities, 350 vulnerable families were registered at the National Aid fund, including Syrian refugees at international agencies. Further networking is underway to ensure that continual provision of services beyond the context of the project.

Regarding the two-year education project implemented through the project, an exit strategy is currently underway in order to provide services to prevent re-insertion of withdrawn children into child labor. Aside from these time constraints, the sustainability of the project is considered 'likely'. However, long-term funding is required in order to develop sustainable education projects, protection of children and provision of livelihoods for vulnerable families.

Norwegian-funded project in Lebanon Project

An important factor in the sustainability of the project was that in complement to

withdrawal of children from WFCL, efforts were made to ensure the economic empowerment and reintegration of children into their communities.

Children withdrawn from WFCL were followed up through rehabilitation projects. In particular, BEYOND implemented an effective system to ensure sustainability. This involved raising awareness amongst parents, as well as through the provision of new income-generating projects for families. Additionally, some withdrawn children volunteered at BEYOND centers to help children who were in their place. The volunteers were withdrawn, rehabilitated, and remained out of hazardous work-setting a good example for other children and showing sustainable results.

Sustainability was also reflected in the institutions. Child labor became institutionalized in the General Security's Department of Human Rights, with trafficking of persons becoming part of their mandate. By introducing child labour into institutions' mandates, this established a firm national commitment to reducing child labour.

Sustainability may be weakened as a result of the Syrian refugee crisis, resulting in deteriorating socio-economic conditions for Lebanese, Syrians and Palestinian refugees. Additionally, as the project intervention in Lebanon targeted Syrian refugees, this limited access for Lebanese and Palestinian children to CL interventions.

11 Conclusions

*The following chapter presents a synthesis of the conclusions drawn from the findings analysis and is organized in correspondence with the evaluation sections: **Project Design; Effectiveness and Efficiency; Impact; and Sustainability.***

Project Design

1. For all projects, there was an urgent need for effective monitoring practices as stipulated by the project documents and log frames, robust quantitative and qualitative indicators, and rigorous impact evaluation. Although the ILO has collected data on its interventions, such as number of trainings conducted, and number of awareness campaigns - these are not sufficient to measure impact of an intervention. This information should be supplemented with relevant follow-ups and pre- and post-training tests to evaluate the actual impact of trainings on individuals' knowledge and capacities.
2. The mission may have been more efficient in achieving reliable responses if respondents received the questions in advance and provided informed consent with the understanding that their interview would remain confidential. This may also give them further time to reflect upon the

questions, providing more accurate responses.

3. There was no detailed eligibility criteria list to select beneficiaries. As a result, participation in the project may be explained by unobservable characteristics of beneficiaries (for example, motivation). Hence, the impact of the project may be associated purely to self-selection and not the intervention being powerful. Potentially, the beneficiaries would have reached the same outcome, even in the absence of the project. As such, the project was simply an 'acceleration' of the achieved outcome. In order to overcome this problem, there is a need for more a transparent eligibility criteria list.
4. By implementing a holistic approach to addressing child labor by combining direct services with advocacy, awareness raising and capacity building, this will develop systemic change in the way child labor is addressed.

Effectiveness and Efficiency

1. All the three projects have been rated as highly effective in achieving the stated outputs and outcomes. This implies that almost all project outputs were delivered with a high quality of intervention since almost all output indicators targets were met. Moreover, output delivery was successfully translated into achievement of the majority (60% to 80%) of the immediate objectives, which contributed to long-term outcomes.
2. One of the common weaknesses amongst the three projects was the limited time frame and budgets. Due to timing constraints, a fully comprehensive model for child labor intervention could not be developed. However, children engaged in child labor require specialized programming and holistic support, which is both long-term and flexible. Long-term funding is therefore required to develop education, protection and livelihood projects that effectively address the needs of the children and their families.
3. The ILO projects in Jordan and Lebanon have also been effective in establishing solid relationships with the different national stakeholders. In Jordan, a strong coordination link was established between the three main partners: The Ministry of Labour, the Ministry of Education, and the Ministry of Social Development. In Lebanon, there were also effective mobilization and engagement efforts of key governmental actors such as the CLU of the Ministry of Labor, the General Security (GS) and the Internal Security Forces (ISF).
4. A successful model for child labor interventions is to establish, as in the Lebanese case, the Children's Centers near agricultural fields, where child labor is particularly prominent. This is because proximity to the community provides better access to services and therefore a better chance for

eliminating child labor practices.

5. There is a need, in particular in Jordan, for more effective coordination between ministries as well as a single national policy regarding CL interventions. Due to lack of effective coordination mechanisms, there are many small NGO interventions spread throughout the country that lack any single unifying entity. As a result, the ILO and other organizations have become recipients of only small amounts of funds, given that each donor has their own priorities and cannot unite all funds into a single unique project.

Potential Impact

1. Due to lack of sufficient data collection, interventions have fallen victim to the *'snake biting its own tail'* logic. As NGO's or international organizations face limited time and budget constraints, this may prevent them from conducting effective data collection for interventions. However, as NGO's are unable to effectively measure the impact of interventions, this prevents them from conducting better interventions.
2. An important measure of the impact of interventions is the behavioral and attitudinal change. For example, following the interventions in Lebanon, the ISF and GS adopted a more humanistic approach towards children, which went from viewing them as criminals to viewing them as children that required protection.
3. One of the most concrete outcomes achieved through these interventions has been a widespread awareness amongst the general public, children, parents, government officials, NGOs etc. that they are all agents of change and have a role to play in the fight against child labour.
4. The ability of the projects to progress towards their intended impact was highly dependent on the effective engagement of all relevant stakeholders in addressing child labor. All three projects focused on engaging stakeholders on multiple levels. This involved key government actors such as the Ministries of Education, Labor, and Social Development to address policy making at the higher level. In Jordan, engagement of the private sector was also critical as part of the Corporate Social Responsibility mandate. The engagement of families, communities, NGOs, social partners, workers and employers' associations and the general public were also essential across all projects.

Sustainability

1. Sustainability of the ILO's interventions in Lebanon and Jordan have been

difficult to measure due to the lack of baseline surveys and robust indicators.

2. One of the most effective means of addressing child labor in a sustainable manner is through a comprehensive approach. This can be achieved by working across multiple levels and sectors in addressing child labor. For example, by regulating agricultural policy on the legislative level, ensuring effective labor inspection, and ensuring rights of displaced children.
3. An important factor in ensuring the sustainability of child labor interventions is that in addition to withdrawal of children from child labor, follow-up activities should be implemented to ensure the economic empowerment of families and successful reintegration of children into their communities.
4. Even with the correct policies and legislations in place at the policy level, impact on the ground may be minimal without the corresponding tools and mechanisms for direct intervention. The OSH and CL manuals developed through the RDPP project in Jordan were key tools in ensuring the successful implementation of policies addressing child labor. They provided key information in identifying child labor and served as guidance tools for inspectors in various scenarios and contexts related to child labor in practice.

12 Recommendations, Lessons Learned, and Emerging Good Practices

The evaluation identified some of the general lessons learned from ILOILO interventions, drawn from both the challenges faced as well as the positive results obtained. This section, enlists the most relevant lessons learned, general and country specific recommendations, as well as emerging good practices, so they can be taken into consideration when designing future projects.

12.1 Recommendations

Joint Recommendations for Jordan and Lebanon

1. **In order to implement impactful interventions, policy interventions and direct interventions should be interlinked.** Stand-alone interventions achieve only a minimal impact, and if they are not linked to a system, they fail to achieve sustainable results. Alternatively, interventions focusing solely on policy may lack impact on direct action on the ground. **It is important to ensure that mechanisms are put in place to, for example, ensure the livelihoods of families of children withdrawn from child labor.** This is particularly relevant for the parents who are dependent on the income generated by their children. For example, through the Norway Lebanon project, livelihood opportunities were provided for girls and boys between the ages of 15-18 years. This involved small-scale projects (\$500), such as sewing machines, manicure or pedicure kits they have proved successful for beneficiaries. **Additionally, a formal strategy to drive attitudinal and behavioral change amongst parents of child laborers is essential in eradicating child labor practices.** This is particularly important for Syrian refugee children, whose absorption into facility centers have been principally hindered by their parents, who were primarily responsible for sending them on the streets to work.
Priority level: High. Addressed to: ILO/National stakeholders/other NGO's.
2. **A comprehensive platform should be developed** incorporating the monitoring and evaluation of the different NGOs addressing child labor, in order to help them share experiences, best practices, data collection tools and information. **Provide a platform for discussion of what is working and what needs improvement amongst key stakeholders is essential for long-term success.** This should include continuous dialogue on different aspects of the project amongst donors, development partners, technical specialists, and social workers etc. to ensure successful implementation. One specific recommendation emerging from the Norwegian-funded project in Lebanon project was the importance of developing a mapping of all the donors and

Additional comments regarding the recommendation #1

The Virtuous Cycle of Needs and Social Interventions

The ILO's interventions provide a good illustration of the paradox of the 'multiplier effect' or the 'virtuous circle of needs'. Interventions are powerful and can have considerable impact. For example, because children participate in interventions, they obtain preliminary benefits, which create a new set of needs for them and their siblings and parents, through a 'snowball effect'. For example, a child is withdrawn from work; this generates further needs for their family to discover an alternative source of income and to increase the parent's employability. This cumulative impact of interventions means that interventions will not succeed if they are fragmented in implementation. A 'Theory of Change' perspective should therefore be adapted which considers how one change can drive a series of changes through a 'snowball effect'. As such, an inclusive and multi-sectoral approach is required to engage all relevant actors in the implementation of a project. For example, not only should child withdrawal be addressed in CL interventions, but families' livelihoods and economic remuneration should also be accounted for.

Trade-off between Intensity and Breadth in Social Interventions

With respect to social interventions, there is an important trade-off between 'intensity' versus 'breadth'. Although breadth has traditionally been favored over intensity, intensive interventions can have important demonstrative effects. By demonstrating a deep, integrated impact in one specific area, this may be more effective than implementing numerous weaker interventions with minimal impact. In this respect developing an integrated set of interventions within a geographically defined zone, addressing all aspects and sectors within a population, will be ideal. This could subsequently be used as a 'pilot', which would be modified to ensure maximum impact within a variety of contexts.

other relevant institutions. Although this is currently happening under the Child Labor Monitoring and Referral Systems, a centralized platform, which unifies all relevant information, would be critical in consolidating national efforts addressing CL.

Priority level: Medium. Addressed to: ILO/ Policymakers/ national stakeholders/ other NGOs

3. **It is essential to adopt a long-term outlook with respect to the Syrian refugee crisis and its wider economic and social implications on child labor.** Beyond CL interventions, support systems need to be planned and implemented once the refugee children reach the age of 18. Broader political considerations with respect to their integration and assimilation into national communities should therefore be considered in the long term. It is necessary for the ILO to begin long-term planning in order to address the future impact of the Syrian refugee crisis. Although a number of interventions have been put in place to address child labor amongst Syrian refugees, once these children reach the age of 18, and then the integration of this population of refugees within the Lebanese economy needs to be considered. The ILO can take a leading role in addressing the long-term planning for the Syrian refugee crisis in the region.

Priority level: Medium. Addressed to: ILO/ Policymakers/ national stakeholders/ other NGOs

Specific Recommendations by Country

Lebanon

4. The Syrian crisis began in 2012, so the National Action Plan implemented as

early as 2013, and was subsequently updated in 2016 to be extended to 2020. However, the NAP should be consistently adapted to the evolving circumstances of Syrian refugee crisis taking into account its impact on the Lebanese economy.

Priority level: High. Addressed to: National stakeholders.

Jordan

5. One important recommendation is to generate more awareness amongst adults and the parliament, and further SCREAM trainings within social centers and vulnerable neighborhoods in Amman. Trainings should incite attitudinal changes, as the most common strategy for families was for the mother to stay home and the children to work.

Priority level: Medium. Addressed to: national stakeholders / NGOs

Syria

6. The ILO should work faster in **establishing a presence** in Syria, and increase general preparedness with respect to the emergency situation at the highest level. To date, the Syrian office only has one staff member and should thus be reinforced with support and technical staff. In the subsequent phases of its presence in Syria, the ILO should aim to act **more independently** from the partnerships and expand its own activities to target the livelihood needs of families of working children. The ILO can play an important role in developing capacities across a number of these organizations. **Technical support** should then immediately be given on the field and in close collaboration with national partners to fully understand the situation on the ground and the scale of the support needed. Lack of knowledge and experience in dealing with CL remains a major gap in implementation for CL interventions in Syria. Technical support is a priority for staff of NGOs, employer organizations and relevant governmental institutions to develop their capacity to appropriately address issues of CL.

Priority level: Medium. Addressed to: ILO.

12.2 Lessons Learned

1. **Budgetary allocations should take into account all factors affecting the achievement of project's objectives.** For the Canadian-funded project in Jordan project, the commitment of withdrawn children from intervention projects was limited in some cases as schools were far from residential areas. Budgetary allocations should have taken into account the transportation costs to ensure that beneficiaries had access to the project as well as alternative sources of income for vulnerable families. **The ability to be flexible** is essential in developing impactful interventions. Although the RDPP had a more limited budget in comparison to the Norwegian-funded project in Lebanon, its ability to adapt to changes that arose during the course of operations contributed to

its success. The ability to adjust operations is particularly important in light of rapidly changing political and social environments. One of the important lessons learned from the RDPP project, was that when working on multi-regional interventions, countries should work very closely to exploit any synergies in operations as well as challenges faced at the regional level.

2. **Projects should include both upstream and downstream activities.** Whilst capacity building is important, upstream interventions (as awareness campaigns and trainings) should not be the only focus. It is not efficient to rely solely upon spillover effects from upstream to downstream. Additionally, sustainable elimination of child labor can only be achieved through the involvement of families and the local community. The participation of these actors should be essential components in Child Labor withdrawal interventions. Moreover, guidance and support regarding direct interventions should be closely linked to capacity building efforts of the ILO. Lack of integration between upstream and downstream interventions is impeding to correctly anticipate unbalances in the delivery of services: for instance, in Lebanon, too much attention is paid to Syrians in child labor efforts and not enough on Lebanese children. Interventions should be careful to ensure **equitable impact**, in order to protect the most vulnerable children and families, whilst preventing and societal divisions arising.

12.3 Emerging Good Practices

1. Conducting regional trainings and knowledge sharing activities through active communication activities is a useful strategy that emerged from the RDPP project, such as the SCREAM training rolled out through GAM to the Children's podium in Jordan. It allows for the exploitation of cultural and linguistic similarities, whilst establishing a set of best practices. For RDPP trainings conducted in Egypt, trainees learned the best practices and employed them in their own country strategies. A strategic communication project aimed at attitude and behavioral change is essential for child labor interventions in achieving long-term impact. For example, the RDPP project adopted a multi-pronged approach, which involved traditional and social media, local leaders and champions. In both Jordan and Lebanon, the project received strong media coverage, raising awareness amongst the general public on the dangers and risks of child labor. The measurement of the effect of media coverage on the attitudes of the general public would have to be measured to be able to fully evaluate the effect of the intervention.
2. The development of a formalized agreement can provide an effective solution for child labor as it provides a reliable source of income for families, conditional on withdrawing their children from work. This was demonstrated by the agreement with the Farmers' Union in Lebanon.

Annex 1: Lessons Learned and Good Practices

Lesson Learned 1

- **Project Title:**
Tackling Child Labour among Syrian refugees and their host communities in Jordan and Lebanon (2016-2017) ; Pilot Project for the Elimination of Child Labour among Refugees and Host Communities in Jordan (2016-2017) ; Combating the Worst Forms of Child Labour among Syrian Refugees and Host Communities in Lebanon (2016-2017) ; Reducing worst forms of child labour amongst Internally Displaced and Host Communities in Syria
- **Project TC SYMBOL:** *RAB/15/01/DAN; JOR/16/02/CAN; LBN/16/01/NOR; SYR/16/01/RBS*

Name of Evaluator: Vera Chiodi

Date: May 2018

| LL Element Budgetary allocations should be flexible and take into account all factors affecting the achievement of project's objectives | |
|--|--|
| Brief description of lesson learned (link to specific action or task) | The ability to be flexible is essential in developing impactful interventions. Although the RDPP had a more limited budget in comparison to the Norwegian-funded project in Lebanon, its ability to adapt to changes that arose during the course of operations contributed to its success. The ability to adjust operations is particularly important in light of rapidly changing political and social environments. |
| Context and any related preconditions | --- |
| Targeted users / Beneficiaries | Both the implementing agencies and the funders. |
| Challenges /negative lessons - Causal factors | Lack of communication and/or lack of anticipation of contextual events. Difficulty for anticipating and managing threats. |
| Success / Positive Issues - Causal factors | The ability to be flexible in response to a rapidly changing political and social context is another important success factor for developing successful interventions. This was demonstrated in particular by the RDPP project, which despite its more limited budget was highly responsive to changes that arose during the course of its operations. |
| ILO Administrative Issues (staff, resources, design, implementation) | One important lesson learned on the administrative and resource level, is that budgetary allocations should take into account all factors affecting the achievement of a project's objectives. For example, for the Canadian-funded project in Jordan, more resources were required to take into account the transportation costs and alternative sources of income for vulnerable families. One of the important lessons learned from the RDPP project, was that when working on multi-regional interventions, countries should work very closely to exploit any synergies in operations as well as challenges faced at the regional level. |

Lesson Learned 2

- **Project Title:**
Tackling Child Labour among Syrian refugees and their host communities in Jordan and Lebanon (2016-2017) ; Pilot Project for the Elimination of Child Labour among Refugees and Host Communities in Jordan (2016-2017) ; Combating the Worst Forms of Child Labour among Syrian

Refugees and Host Communities in Lebanon (2016-2017) ; Reducing worst forms of child labour amongst Internally Displaced and Host Communities in Syria

- Project TC SYMBOL: RAB/15/01/DAN; JOR/16/02/CAN; LBN/16/01/NOR; SYR/16/01/RBS

Name of Evaluator: Vera Chiodi

Date: May 2018

| LL Element | Projects should include both upstream and downstream activities. |
|--|---|
| Brief description of lesson learned (link to specific action or task) | In general, one of the lessons learned that was particularly important with respect to these projects was the importance of implementing both upstream or high-level interventions as well as direct interventions. In order to be able to fully meet the overall goal of reducing child labour within the region, it is necessary not only to develop the correct policies and trainings necessary, but equally to develop direct interventions on the ground. By adopting a holistic approach to addressing child labor by combining direct services with advocacy, awareness raising and capacity building, this will develop systemic change in the way child labor is addressed. |
| Context and any related preconditions | One of the positive success factors in achieving sustainable results in the elimination of child labour, is by involving a number of different actors including families, the local community, employers, business and the municipal police. The participation of these actors is an essential component in Child Labour withdrawal interventions. |
| Targeted users / Beneficiaries | With respect to the targeted users and beneficiaries of the project, one of the important lessons learned was the importance of developing a more transparent and detailed eligibility criteria list to select beneficiaries in order to avoid problems of self-selection bias, in which the impact of the project may be associated purely to self-selection and not the intervention being powerful. |
| Challenges /negative lessons - Causal factors | One of the main challenges faced was the lack of effective monitoring practices, which limited the capacity to measure the impact of the interventions. This can be done by implementing more effective monitoring practices and logistical frameworks, more robust quantitative and qualitative indicators, as well as more robust impact evaluation. |
| Success / Positive Issues - Causal factors | The theory of change of the project will be reinforced. Outcomes and impacts will therefore arise sooner. |
| ILO Administrative Issues (staff, resources, design, implementation) | In Lebanon, too much attention is paid to Syrians in child labor efforts and not enough on Lebanese children. Interventions should be careful to ensure equitable impact , in order to protect the most vulnerable children and families, whilst preventing and societal divisions arising. |

Emerging Good Practice 1

- Project Title:
Tackling Child Labour among Syrian refugees and their host communities in Jordan and Lebanon (2016-2017) ; Pilot Project for the Elimination of Child Labour among Refugees and Host Communities in Jordan (2016-2017) ; Combating the Worst Forms of Child Labour among Syrian

Refugees and Host Communities in Lebanon (2016-2017) ; Reducing worst forms of child labour amongst Internally Displaced and Host Communities in Syria

- **Project TC SYMBOL: RAB/15/01/DAN; JOR/16/02/CAN; LBN/16/01/NOR; SYR/16/01/RBS**

Name of Evaluator: Vera Chiodi

Date: May 2018

| GP Element | Conducting regional trainings and knowledge sharing activities through active communication activities |
|---|--|
| Brief summary of the good practice (link to project goal or specific deliverable, background, purpose, etc.) | One of the important lessons learned with respect to regional interventions, is that countries should work together to exploit existing synergies and challenges faced at the regional level. This was particularly important with respect to the RDPP project in Lebanon and Jordan, in which countries benefited from regional trainings and knowledge sharing activities. |
| Relevant conditions and Context: limitations or advice in terms of applicability and replicability | The ability of the projects to progress towards their intended impact was dependent on the engagement of relevant stakeholders at multiple levels. This involved key government actors such as the Ministries of Education, Labour, and Social Development to address policy making at the higher level. In Jordan, engagement of the private sector was also critical as part of the Corporate Social Responsibility mandate. |
| Establish a clear cause-effect relationship | ----- |
| Indicate measurable impact and targeted beneficiaries | One important measure of the impact of interventions is the behavioral and attitudinal change across key stakeholders in addressing child labour. The sustainability of the ILO's interventions in Lebanon and Jordan has been difficult to measure due to the lack of baseline surveys and robust indicators. |
| Potential for replication and by whom | The emerging good practice of conducting regional training and knowledge sharing activities has a strong potential for replication by the ILO for CL interventions across a number of different regions, allowing for the exploitation of cultural and linguistic similarities. |
| Upward links to higher ILO Goals (DWCPs, Country Programme Outcomes or ILO's Strategic Programme Framework) | ----- |
| Other documents or relevant comments | --- |

Emerging Good Practice 2

- **Project Title: Tackling Child Labour among Syrian refugees and their host communities in Jordan and Lebanon (2016-2017) ; Pilot Project for the Elimination of Child Labour among Refugees and Host Communities in Jordan (2016-2017) ; Combating the Worst Forms of Child Labour among Syrian Refugees and Host Communities in Lebanon (2016-2017) ; Reducing worst forms of child labour amongst Internally Displaced and Host Communities in Syria**

- Project Project TC SYMBOL: RAB/15/01/DAN; JOR/16/02/CAN; LBN/16/01/NOR; SYR/16/01/RBS

Name of Evaluator: Vera Chiodi

Date: May 2018

| GP Element | The development of a formalized agreement can be effective |
|---|---|
| Brief summary of the good practice (link to project goal or specific deliverable, background, purpose, etc.) | Additionally, the development of formalized agreements can be an effective solution for eliminating child labour in the long-term. This was illustrated by the formal agreement with the Farmer's Union in Lebanon, which provided a reliable source of income for families conditional on withdrawing their children from work. |
| Relevant conditions and Context: limitations or advice in terms of applicability and replicability | The engagement of families, communities, NGOs, social partners, workers and employers associations such as the Farmers' Union in Lebanon, and the general public were also essential across all projects. |
| Establish a clear cause-effect relationship | ----- |
| Indicate measurable impact and targeted beneficiaries | One important measure of the impact of interventions is the behavioral and attitudinal change across key stakeholders in addressing child labour. For example, following the interventions in Lebanon, the ISF and GS adopted a more humanistic approach towards children, which went from viewing them as criminals to viewing them as children that required protection. However, the sustainability of the ILO's interventions in Lebanon and Jordan has been difficult to measure due to the lack of baseline surveys and robust indicators. |
| Potential for replication and by whom | The emerging good practice of the development of a formalized agreement with civil society or unions has a strong potential for replication by the ILO for CL interventions across a number of different regions, allowing for the exploitation of cultural and linguistic similarities. |
| Upward links to higher ILO Goals (DWCPs, Country Programme Outcomes or ILO's Strategic Programme Framework) | ---- |
| Other documents or relevant comments | ----- |

Annex 2: References

Canadian-funded project in Jordan Project

- ILO. (2016). *Funding arrangement between the ILO and the Government of Canada*.
- ILO. (2016). *ILO Technical Progress Report- Pilot Project for the Elimination of Child Labour among Refugees and Host Communities in Jordan*
- ILO. (2017). *Pilot Project for the Elimination of Child Labour among Refugees and Host Communities in Jordan. ILO's Technical Cooperation Final Progress Report (FPR)*.

RDPP Project

- ILO. (2017). *Tackling Child Labour among Syrian refugees and their host communities in Jordan and Lebanon. Development Cooperation Final Progress Report (FPR)*. Geneva: International Labour Organization.
- ILO. (2017). *Tackling Child Labour among Syrian refugees and their host communities in Jordan and Lebanon. Development Cooperation Final Compiled Report (FPR)*. Geneva: International Labour Organization.
- ILO. (2016). *Project Document Template- Tackling Child Labour among Syrian refugees and their host communities in Jordan and Lebanon*. Geneva: International Labour Organization.

Norwegian-funded project in Lebanon Project

- ILO. (2016). *ILO Executive Summary to the Norway Project*.
- ILO. (2016). *ILO Logistical Framework Report to the Norwegian-funded project in Lebanon Project*
- ILO. (2016). *Specific Agreement between the Norwegian Ministry of Foreign Affairs and the ILO*.
- ILO. (2016) *Project Implementation Plan- Combating The Worst Forms of Child Labour among Syria Refugees and Host Communities*
- ILO (2016). *Technical Cooperation Final Progress Report- Combating the Worst Forms of Child Labour among Syrian Refugees and Host Communities in Lebanon*
- ILO (2016) *Final Logistical Framework- Combating The Worst Forms of Child Labour among Syria Refugees and Host Communities*
- ILO. (2016). *Combating the Worst Forms of Child Labour among Syrian Refugees and Host Communities in Lebanon. ILO's Technical Cooperation Final Progress Report (FPR)*.
- ILO. (2016). *Cooperating Partners for Project- Combating the Worst Forms of Child Labour among Syrian Refugees and Host Communities in Lebanon*.

- Republic of Lebanon, *National Action Plan to Eliminate the Worst Form of Child Labour in Lebanon by 2020*

Syria

- UNICEF (2016) *UNICEF Syria Country Office, Guidance Note on Multiservice Platforms in Syria 2016*
- ILO (2016). ILO Concept Note “*Reducing the Worst Forms of Child Labour Among Internally displaced and Host Communities in Syria*”
- ILO (2016). *Mission Report: Mission to Beirut and Damascus*
- ILO (2017). *ILO Proposal in support of SYR103- RBSA Proposal*

General

- ILO. (2017). *Global estimates of child labour: Results and trends, 2012-2016*. Geneva: International Labour Organization.
- ILO. (2017). *ILO Evaluations Sub-questions Matrix*
- ILO, UNDP, UNHCR. (2015). *Finding a Future: Enhancing Sustainable Livelihoods for Syrian Refugees in Jordan*
- UNICEF. (2016). *Baseline Survey 2016 Presentation*. Retrieved from data.unhcr.org/syrianrefugees/download.php?id=11355
- UNICEF, I. a. (2012). *National Study on Worst Forms of Child Labour in Syria*. Geneva : International Labour Organization .

Annex 3 Terms of Reference

**International Labour Organization (ILO)
Regional Office for Arab States (ROAS)**

TERMS OF REFERENCE

**Regional Independent Cluster evaluation of ILO's Child Labour Interventions
And
Recommendations for Future Regional Direction on Child Labour**

Feb-April 2018

Regional Background

The global estimates for 2016 indicate that about 3% of the children aged between 5 and 17 in the Arab States region are involved in child labor. Half of these children are working in hazardous environment²². In absolute numbers, there are 1.2 million children in the Arab states that are child laborers of which 616 thousand are involved in hazardous activities²³.

The Syrian crisis resulted in a large influx of refugees to Jordan and Lebanon. Jordan hosts about 700,000 registered refugees²⁴, the majority of them live in host communities outside the camps. On the other hand, Lebanon hosts about one million Syrian refugees²⁵.

Child labor is one of the significant labor and child protection issues that has affected the children of Syria since the beginning of the conflict. As per the Syria Humanitarian Response Plan, it has now become a widespread issue affecting all parts of the country. While displacement, loss of livelihoods and breadwinners, extensive damage to schools and the weakening of the education system and the lack of labor monitoring have contributed to child labor among communities directly affected by the conflict, a large number of children have been pushed into child labor due to economic hardships and lack of household income.

Protecting vulnerable populations in situations of conflict and disaster have been defined as one of the policy priorities to reduce child labor²⁶. These fragile situations – characterized by income shocks, a breakdown in formal and family social support networks, displacement and disruptions in basic services provision – create an elevated risk of child labor and modern slavery²⁷. Child labor is used as a coping mechanism due to the dire economic situation of many households both among the host communities and Syrian refugees. Given that over half of the Syrian refugee population are children, there is an urgent need to enhance responses to child labor among emergency-affected populations but additionally prevention and protection should be systematically included during all phases of humanitarian action.

²² ILO, 2017, Global Estimates of Child Labour and Modern Slavery.

²³ ILO, 2017, Global Estimates of Child Labour and Modern Slavery.

²⁴ <http://data.unhcr.org/syrianrefugees/country.php?id=107>.

²⁵ <http://data.unhcr.org/syrianrefugees/country.php?id=122>.

²⁶ ILO, 2017, Global Estimates of Child Labour and Modern Slavery.

²⁷ ILO, 2017, Global Estimates of Child Labour and Modern Slavery.

The refugee children often start working before the age of 12 where they are involved in hazardous work and have very limited opportunity to enjoy their right to an education. Child labor has nearly doubled in Jordan between 2007 and 2016. The latest estimates indicate that there are about 70,000 children involved in child labor in Jordan²⁸. The highest ratio of child labor to child population falls within Syrian nationals, the majority of which are in hazardous work²⁹. A study assessing the profile and magnitude of street-based children (SBC) in Lebanon found out that about three quarters of SBCs are Syrian nationals³⁰.

Against this backdrop of increased prevalence of child labor, particularly in its worst forms amongst Syrian refugees and host communities in both Jordan and Lebanon, ILO has been working through a number of complementary interventions on a holistic approach that integrates the humanitarian response with the national systems and the medium to long term development goals. Furthermore, ILO is providing specific technical expertise in Syria to develop holistic and sustainable solutions to child labor, not only building on what has been achieved through the humanitarian response but also through additional interventions linking child labor to livelihoods, education, labor inspection and child protection.

Projects Background

Tackling child labor among Syrian refugees and their host communities in Jordan and Lebanon (Implemented as two projects)

This project is funded by RDPP (Regional Development and Protection Program) and aims to strengthen the legal and policy framework to combat child labor in both countries in light of the Syrian crisis. Consequently, it builds on achievements of previous ILO interventions to eliminate child labor while attempting to bridge the gap between the national Child Labor systems and the response to the Syrian crisis. In order to achieve this objective, this eighteen-month project focused on capacity-building and policy dialogue with Government ministries and departments, in line with ILO's past and on-going interventions on child labor in the two countries. The project has two broad objectives:

- By the end of the project, consensus has been achieved among policymakers and other stakeholders on granting refugees of working age access to certain sectors of the labor market and/or engaging them in other socio-economic activities, with a view to preventing and eliminating child labor.
- By the end of the project, partners' capacities to address child labor have improved.

Pilot project for the elimination of child labor among refugees and host communities in Jordan

Funded by the Canadian Government, the project's ultimate goal is to facilitate the development of a sustainable model for the prevention of child labor and the withdrawal of existing child laborers. The successfully tested model will be replicated in other areas in the Middle East. The project has the following outcomes.

- Children are protected from early entry to labor market or withdrawal from the Worst Forms of Child Labor (WFCL).
- Comprehensive services are provided to selected families in Coordination with other United Nations and local organizations.

Combating the Worst Forms of Child Labor among Syrian Refugees and Host Communities in Lebanon

The project aims to enhance protection of boys and girls aged 4 to 18 and withdrawal of those aged 5 to 13 from WFCL in Lebanon. Funded by the Government of Norway, the project works closely with

²⁸ ILO and Centre for Strategic Studies, National Child Labour Survey of 2016 in Jordan, 2016.

²⁹ ILO and Centre for Strategic Studies, National Child Labour Survey of 2016 in Jordan, 2016.

³⁰ ILO and the Consultation and Research Institute, Children Living and Working in the Streets in Lebanon: Profile and Magnitude, 2015.

the Ministry of Labor and the National Steering Committee (NSC) to combat child labor. The project also integrates previous and ongoing interventions with the response to the Syrian crisis which is part of the National Action Plan for the Elimination of the Worst Forms of Child labor launched by Ex-Lebanese President in 2013 developed by NSC which is chaired by Minister of Labor. The project has the following outcomes.

- By the end of the project, knowledge on child labor of key actors and the general public has been strengthened.
- By the end of the project, partners' capacities to address exploitative forms of child labor have been improved.
- By the end of the project, integrated and effective responses to fight child labor, especially its worst forms are in place.

Reducing Worst Forms of Child Labor in Syria

The project focus on providing immediate technical support to ILO and its partners and better integrating child labor programming in their response through collaborative efforts between ILO and them, while supporting preparatory activities for a larger ILO's intervention in Syria.

Purpose, Objective and Scope of the Evaluation

The purpose of this evaluation is twofold. The first is assessing the extent to which each project achieved its objectives and unexpected positive and negative results, assessing its emerging impact. The second is a strategic assessment of the relevance and effectiveness of ILO's portfolio and strategy on compacting child labor in Jordan, Lebanon and Syria.

It will assess the emerging impact of the interventions on child labor in each country and the region as a whole considering strengths and weaknesses, opportunities and challenges that have affected the achievement of each project objective. The evaluation will also develop recommendations for the future regional direction on child labor.

The strategic assessment of ILO's portfolio and strategy on compacting child labor in Jordan, Lebanon and Syria will consider the relevance of the interventions in all three countries to status of child labor and will define main gaps that were not addressed. labor in the three countries.

The evaluation should be carried out in adherence with the ILO policy guidelines for results-based evaluation available at http://www.ilo.org/eval/Evaluationpolicy/WCMS_168289/lang--en/index.htm and with specific ILO Guidelines and Notes, and the OECD/DAC Evaluation Quality Standard.

Evaluation Criteria and Questions

The evaluation of the projects included within the scope of this assignment should follow OECD DAC Criteria for Evaluating Development Assistance³¹ and ILO Policy Guidelines for Results-Based Evaluation³².

- Relevance and strategic fit of the intervention: The extent to which the objectives of a development intervention are consistent with beneficiaries' requirements, country needs, global priorities and partners' and donors' policies. The extent to which the approach is strategic and the ILO uses its comparative advantage.
- Validity of intervention design: The extent to which the design is logical and coherent.
- Intervention progress and effectiveness: The extent to which the intervention's immediate objectives were achieved, or are expected to be achieved, taking into account their relative importance.
- Efficiency of resource use: A measure of how economically resources/inputs (funds, expertise, time, etc.) are converted to results.

³¹ <http://www.oecd.org/dac/evaluation/daccriteriaforevaluatingdevelopmentassistance.htm>

³² http://www.ilo.org/eval/Evaluationpolicy/WCMS_168289/lang--en/index.htm

- Effectiveness of management arrangements: The extent to which management capabilities and arrangements put in place support the achievement of results.
- Impact orientation and sustainability of the intervention: The strategic orientation of the project towards making a significant contribution to broader, long-term, sustainable development changes. The likelihood that the results of the intervention are durable and can be maintained or even scaled up and replicated by intervention partners after major assistance has been completed.

Annex 1 includes the proposed analytical framework with evaluation questions under each dimension. A more detailed framework of questions and sub-questions will be developed by the evaluator during the inception phase and in agreement with the evaluation manager.

The evaluation of ILO's regional direction and its strategic fit to the child labour deficiencies in Jordan, Lebanon and Syria will follow the same criteria. Annex 2 includes proposed analytical framework with evaluation questions under each dimension. A more detailed framework of questions and sub-questions will be developed by the evaluator during the inspection phase and in agreement with the evaluation manager.

Although Annexes 1 and 2 include an extensive list of questions, the evaluator is expected to focus on the strategic elements that will help her/him define aspects of regional complementarity and integration, relevance of the strategy to the regional child labor context and gaps that were not addressed. The evaluator is expected to provide recommendations to enhance the strategic relevance of ILO's portfolio on child labor in the three countries.

Methodology

The evaluation will comply with ILO policy guidelines for results-based evaluation. Given that this is an independent evaluation, the final methodology of the evaluation will be determined by the evaluator in consultation with the evaluation manager.

The methodology will include:

- Review of documents. The evaluator will review relevant documents on each of the projects and on ILO's strategic direction in relation to child labor. The evaluator is also expected to review latest studies and research conducted defining and measuring child labor in Jordan, Syria and Lebanon. The evaluation manager will provide the evaluator with the relevant documents upon signature of contract.
- Internal meetings and interviews. The evaluator will conduct internal meetings with the evaluation manager and ILO technical specialist, in person or remotely. The purpose of these internal meetings is to brief the evaluator on ILO's evaluation guidelines and assist the evaluator in updating the evaluation methodology and other components of the inception report.
- Development of inception report. Upon completion of the internal meetings and interviews and the review of relevant documents, the evaluator will draft the inception report.
- Preparation for field mission. The consultant will work closely with the evaluation manager to develop the schedule of the field mission. The evaluation manager will provide the evaluator will a list of interviewees and assist in facilitating the scheduling of the meetings during the field mission.
- Interviews – field mission. The evaluator will meet relevant project staff, partners and stakeholders in person or remotely. The evaluator is expected to spend 15 days in Jordan and Lebanon. Stakeholders include the following:
 - a) Project staff/consultants that have been active in ILO in Jordan;
 - b) ILO ROAS DWT Director, RPU, and Senior Specialists in Gender, Child Labor, etc.;
 - c) ILO Headquarters technical departments;
 - d) National counterparts (government/ministries such as MoL, Internal Security Forces, General Security Forces, social partners, IPs, etc.);
 - e) Non-governmental institutions such as Beyond Association, Home of Hope, etc.

- f) Academic institutions such as the American University of Beirut;
- g) Direct and indirect beneficiaries (example Farmers Unions, etc.);
- h) Consultants who were involved in main components of the projects;
- i) Other international agencies working in relevant fields.
- Debriefing session. The evaluator will present the key findings to the relevant stakeholders and ILO staff in person or remotely. The purpose of the debriefing session is to confirm the findings and start formulating recommendations. The evaluation manager will invite the relevant attendees to the debriefing session.
- Drafting the evaluation report. The evaluator will draft the evaluation report based on the outline agreed upon in the inception report. The evaluation manager will share the draft report with relevant ILO staff, partners and stakeholders will consolidate their feedback. The evaluator will thereafter, amend the evaluation report and submit a final version to the evaluation manager.

The overall level of effort is expected to be 35 person-days divided as follows:

| Task | Person-day |
|----------------------------------|------------|
| Review of documents | 6 |
| Internal meetings and interviews | 2 |
| Development of inception report | 1 |
| Preparation for field mission | 1 |
| Interviews – field mission | 15 |
| Debriefing session | 1 |
| Draft report | 6 |
| Final report | 3 |
| Total | 35 |

Main Deliverables

The main outputs of this evaluation assignment are:

- a. Inception report.
- b. Draft evaluation report.
- c. Final evaluation report.

All deliverables will be submitted in the English language.

The inception report: upon the review of the relevant documents and initial discussion with the evaluation manager the inception report will include:

- Background on child labor in the region,
- Background on each project
- Elaborate evaluation methodology including an updated evaluation framework (criteria, questions and sub-questions), and data collection instruments,
- Management arrangements and work plan,
- List of persons and institutions to be interviewed,
- Proposed outline of the final report.

The draft evaluation report: summarizing the key valuation findings against each of the evaluation criteria for each project in a matrix format. Gap analysis of the strategic direction and recommendations for ILO's portfolio. Below is a suggested outline of the report:

- Cover page,
- Table of contents,
- Acronyms,
- Executive summary, including key findings, conclusions and recommendations,
- Background on child labor in the region,
- Background on each project,
- Purpose and scope of the evaluation,
- Methodology and limitations,
- Summary of findings at the project level,
- Presentation of findings at the strategic level,
- Conclusions and recommendations,
- Lessons Learned and Good Practices,
- Annexes

The final evaluation report: incorporating comments received from the ILO and other key stakeholders.

The final evaluation report should not be longer than 30 pages excluding annexes. The quality of the report will be assessed against ILO evaluation guidelines.

Management Arrangements and Work plan

Timeframe

The work will start in February 2018 and will extend over 10 weeks.

Proposed evaluation plan (tentative)

| Task | Responsibility | End by |
|--|-----------------|------------|
| Draft mission itinerary and list of key informants to be interviewed in each country | Project manager | Start date |
| Provide the evaluator with all relevant documents | Project manager | Start date |
| Brief evaluator on ILO evaluation policy | Project manager | Week 1 |
| Inception report submitted to evaluation manager | Evaluator | Week 2 |
| Evaluation mission (Jordan and Lebanon) | Evaluator | Week 4-5 |
| Debriefing session (in person or remotely) | Evaluator | Week 6 |
| Draft report and submission to evaluation manager | Evaluator | Week 7 |
| Sharing the draft report for all concerned for comments | Project manager | Week 7 |
| Sending consolidated comments on the draft report with the evaluator | Project manager | Week 8 |
| Submission of the final report | Evaluator | Week 9 |
| Approval of the final report | Project manager | Week 10 |

Assignment management

The evaluation will be managed by Ms. Nathalie Bavitch, the Regional M&E Officer at ROAS.

Evaluator profile

It is expected that this assignment will be implemented by one evaluator with relevant experience and qualifications. The list below includes the minimum qualifications of the evaluator.

- University degree in a relevant field with a minimum of 5 years of professional experience in conducting evaluations or impact assessments for projects.
- Proven experience in child labor issues.
- Extensive knowledge of qualitative and quantitative research methods.
- Knowledge of ILO mandate and UN evaluation methodologies and experience in conducting evaluations for the ILO or other UN agencies.
- Excellent analytical and communication skills.
- Excellent report writing skills in English.
- Ability to speak English and Arabic.
- Experience in participative evaluation techniques is an asset.

Legal and Ethical Matters

This evaluation will comply with ILO evaluation guidelines and UN Norms and Standards.

These ToRs will be accompanied by the code of conduct for carrying out the evaluation “Code of conduct for evaluation in the ILO” (See attached documents).

UNEG ethical guidelines will be followed through-out the evaluation.

The consultant will not have any links to project management or any other conflict of interest that would interfere with the independence of the evaluation.

Relevant Documents

To be added.

Annex 4: Evaluation Criteria for ILO's Strategic Direction on Child Labor in Jordan, Lebanon and Syria, and for each project

| | |
|---|--|
| <p><u>Relevance and strategic fit of the intervention:</u></p> <p>The extent to which the objectives of a development intervention are consistent with beneficiaries' requirements, country needs, global priorities and partners' and donors' policies.</p> <p>The extent to which the approach is strategic and the ILO uses its comparative advantage.</p> | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Examine whether ILO's strategy on child labor in the region and examine whether the projects responded to the real needs of the beneficiaries and stakeholders, including specific target groups, gender-related needs, and sub-national areas. ○ Assess whether the problems and needs that gave rise to the strategy and projects still exist or have changed. How did the projects take the Syria crisis impact on child labor into consideration during its implementation? ○ Did the strategy address the different needs and roles, constraints, access to resources of the target groups, with specific reference to the strategy of mainstreaming and thus the relevant partners, especially in government? ○ Assess the validity of the project approach and strategies and its potential to be replicated and scaled-up. ○ How does the ILO's strategic direction on child labor in the region as well as each project's objectives fit under the ILO Jordan and Lebanon Decent Work Country Programs and broader development frameworks (UNDAF) as well as United Nations Country Team (UNCT) programming documents? ○ How do the projects' objectives respond to donor priorities in targeted countries? ○ Are the projects' objectives aligned with tripartite constituent's objectives and needs? <p style="text-align: center;">What are the gaps that the ILO strategy and interventions on child labor did not address?</p> |
|---|--|

Validity of intervention design:

The extent to which the design is logical and coherent.

- Was the projects' designs realistic and adequate to meet the project objectives? Was the design of ILO's interventions realistic and adequate to meet the strategic objectives? To what extent was the projects' designs, as well as the regional strategy, adequate and effective in addressing the needs of ultimate beneficiaries and the capacities of the project partners and partners in the region?
- To what extent did the projects' design as well as design of ILO's interventions take into consideration the gender needs of target groups and beneficiaries?
- Were the planned projects' objectives, means of action and outcomes, relevant, coherent and realistic to the situation on the ground? Did they address gender needs and interests? What are the gaps that were not addressed?
- Were the capacities of various project's partners taken into account in the project's strategy and means of action? Did the projects' design adequately plan for an effective participation of local governments in the management of the project?
- Which risks and assumptions were identified and managed? To what extent have they affected the projects and ILO's regional strategy on child labor?
- Were the planned monitoring and evaluation arrangements adequate? Were the targeted indicator values realistic and can they be tracked?
- Were there sufficient activities to enhance synergy and integration between the different projects in the region?
- Were there sufficient activities to enhance learning across the project portfolio and definition of implementation models that could be duplicated in other countries?

Donor question: Could the projects have benefited from a more strategic regional implementation? Were there any missed opportunities resulting from this?

| | |
|---|---|
| <p><u>Intervention progress and effectiveness:</u></p> <p>The extent to which the intervention’s immediate objectives were achieved, or are expected to be achieved, taking into account their relative importance.</p> | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ To what extent did the projects achieve their intended objectives? ○ What have been major factors influencing the achievement or non-achievement of the projects’ and strategy objectives? ○ Examine the effectiveness of projects’ institutional framework, their management arrangement and coordination mechanism with other relevant ILO projects, and with other implementing partners ○ Examine the extent that the projects and regional portfolio have adjusted/modified their strategy to respond to changing situation on the ground or challenges faced. ○ To what extent were the identified risks and key assumptions relevant in the country situation? To what extent the mitigation strategies were effective in addressing the risks during the implementation of the project? ○ How has the projects contributed to and benefitted from tripartism? ○ To what extent the projects managed the practice of knowledge management and lessons dissemination and visibility effort on project branding? <p>Donor question: Is there an added value from some of the activities that were seen and implemented from a regional perspective?</p> |
| <p><u>Efficiency of resource use:</u></p> <p>A measure of how economically resources/inputs (funds, expertise, time, etc.) are converted to results.</p> | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Have the projects, as well as the ILO strategy to combat child labor in the region, been implemented in the most efficient way vis-à-vis their financial and human resources? <p>Have activities been implemented in a cost-efficient manner and have project objectives been achieved on-time and with planned budget?</p> |
| <p><u>Effectiveness of management arrangements:</u></p> <p>The extent to which management capabilities and arrangements put in place support the achievement of results.</p> | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Did the projects and interventions receive adequate and timely technical support from relevant technical and administrative/management support from the Country Offices and ROAS? If not, how that could be improved? ○ How well did the projects manage their finances? How well did the ILO manage the finances of the projects on child labor in the three countries? This should include budget forecasts, delivery monitoring, actions |

| | |
|--|---|
| | <p>taken for improving the delivery, budget revision and financial reporting. Did the ILO explore mechanisms to enhance synergies between the different projects to improve the financial management of the projects?</p> <p>How effective was the monitoring mechanism set up for the respective projects? How effective was the monitoring mechanism set up for the ILO's strategy on combating child labor in the region? How were the regional specialists, project steering committee, partners and donors involved in monitoring? Were any significant corrective actions recommended and follow-up actions taken following monitoring missions? Did the M&E system in place allow to collect sex-disaggregated data, monitor results and prepare regular progress reports?</p> |
| <p><u>Impact orientation:</u></p> <p>The strategic orientation of the project towards making a significant contribution to broader, long-term, sustainable development changes.</p> | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ What has happened as a result of the projects? To what extent did the projects make their contribution to broader and longer term crisis response and decent work goal in the respective countries? ○ Donor question: Have the projects been successful in protecting children subjected to or in danger of being subjected to WCL? Approximately, how many children have been removed from child labor or prevented from entering it? (<i>this question could be incorporated into the field work interviews with implementing partners</i>). ○ What real difference did the projects make to the ultimate beneficiaries, capacity of local authorities, and to gender equality? ○ What changes have been observed in relation to the objectives of the interventions? How have women, men, the poor, different ethnic groups experienced these changes? ○ To what extent can observed changes be attributed to the interventions? ○ Are there unintended impacts (including consideration of different segments of society)? ○ What interventions and approaches have been more central to achieve the projects' impact? <p>What are key contextual features for these (e.g. gender, poverty, ethnicity etc.)?</p> |
| <p><u>Sustainability of the intervention</u></p> <p>The likelihood that the results of the intervention are durable and can be maintained or even scaled up and replicated by intervention partners after major assistance has been completed.</p> | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ To what extent are the projects' changes, benefits and impacts realized likely to be sustained and to continue after the projects have ended? ○ What are the major factors which will have or will influence the continuity of the projects' benefits at a country level and regional level? |

Annex 5: List of Persons Interviewed

LEBANON STAKEHOLDERS

| Organisation | Persons Interviewed | Position |
|--|------------------------|--|
| ILO | Rabia Jalloul | Senior Program Officer/ National Project Coordinator |
| | Dina Hasrouny | Program Assistant |
| | Hayat Osseiran | Consultant on Child Labor project |
| | Nader Keyrouz | Statistics Specialist |
| | Mari Schlanbusch | Gender Specialist |
| | Torsten Schackel | International Labor Standards Specialist |
| | Mustapha Said | Workers Specialist |
| | Maestro Sehaab | Led choir |
| | Nathalie Bavitch | Regional M&E Officer |
| | Lars Johansen | Chief Regional Programming Unit |
| | Frank Hagemann | Deputy Regional Director |
| | Joumana Karame | Program Officer |
| Samantha Cheikha | Program Assistant | |
| Ministry of Labour and its Child Labour Unit | Nazha Shalita | Head of Unit |
| Internal Security Forces | Ahmad Abou Daher | Colonel |
| General Security Forces | Talaal Youssef | Colonel |
| American University of Beirut | Rana Tabbarra | Author |
| | Rima Habib | Principal Investigator |
| Donor | Government of Norway | |
| Home of Hope | Raghida Assal | General Director |
| Beyond | Joe Awad with children | President |
| | Leila Assi | Head of CL Department |
| Hope Village | Abla El Badri | Secretary General |

| | | |
|--------|------------------|---|
| UNICEF | Carlos Bohorquez | Child protection specialist |
| FAO | Facen Adada | National Coordinator on social protection and child labor |

JORDAN STAKEHOLDERS

| Organization | Persons Interviewed | Position |
|---|-----------------------------|------------------------------------|
| ILO | Htun Hlaing | Chief Technical Advisor |
| | Laetitia Weibel Roberts | Program Officer / M&E |
| | Nihayat Dabdoub | Project Manager |
| | | |
| Regional Development and Protection Programme | Vincenzo Schiano Lomoriello | Donor RDPP |
| Ruwwad Al Tanmia | Samar Doddin | Director |
| | Maysoon Al Amarneh | M&E Expert |
| | Tarek Fakhri | Focal point & Project manager |
| Family and children Protection Society | Kazem Kifarri | Head of FCPS |
| Ministry of Interior | Luma Abu Joudeh | Juvenile Police |
| | Ayman AlQurran | |
| Chamber of Commerce | Lana Bin Hani | Focal Point of Child Labor |
| Ministry of Education | Mahmoud Misha | Focal Point |
| | Taghreed Badawi | Head of the counselling department |
| Ministry of Social Development | Ahmad Sheidat | Focal Point |
| Ministry of Labor | Faten Masri | IT Programmer |
| | Haifa Darwish/Rasha Zayadin | OSH Inspectors |

| | | |
|--------------------|-----------------|-----------------------------------|
| Amman Municipality | Nancy Abu Hiana | Head of the Social Programs - GAM |
| | Children podium | |

Syria STAKEHOLDERS (REMOTE)

| Organisation | Persons Interviewed | Position |
|--------------|------------------------|---|
| ILO | Leena Rammah | Project Manager |
| | Insaf Nizam | Geneva Focal point |
| | Peter Matz | Consultant |
| UNESCO | Fida Bashour | Project Manager |
| UNICEF | Kehkashan Beenish Khan | Child Protection Subsector Coordinator |
| | Mohamad Kanawati | Youth and Adolescent Development Specialist |
| MOSAL | Reem Al Kuatly | Assistant of Head of International Cooperation and Planning |
| WFP | Mona Al Sheikh | Head of Nutrition and School Meals |
| | Mohammad Jasser | Program Policy Officer |
| | Haitham AL Ashkar | School Meals Program, Livelihood |

Annex 6: Key Achievements and Impacts

| Key Results | | |
|--|--|---|
| Lebanon | Jordan | Syria |
| <p>1. <u>Norway Lebanon Project</u> Combating the Worst Forms of Child Labor among Syrian Refugees and Host Communities in Lebanon</p> | <p>2. <u>Canadian Jordan Project</u> Pilot Project for the Elimination of Child Labor among Refugees and Host Communities in Jordan</p> | <p>3. <u>ILO Project in Syria</u> Reducing worst forms of child labor amongst Internally Displaced and Host Communities in Syria</p> |
| <p>Objective 1: Knowledge on child labor of key actors and the general public has been strengthened The project received media coverage from over 12 national and regional TV, radio institutions and newspapers</p> | <p>Objective 1: Rehabilitate 700 children (boys and girls), out of which 300 vulnerable children protected from early entry to labour market The project assisted two local grassroots organizations in starting to build an effective model of direct interventions. Individual and group counselling was provided to former child labourers and dropouts, and psycho-social counselling to help build self-awareness amongst former child labourers. Monitoring mechanisms were established at the workplace, in schools and for families to ensure sustainability of withdrawals.</p> | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ As of now, the ILO's engagement in Syria has been in the initial phase of implementation (Phase 1 and 2) its interventions have included technical support through the facilitation of trainings and seminars in cooperation with UNICEF. |

| | | |
|---|--|--|
| <p>Objective 2: Partners’ capacities to address exploitative forms of child labor have improved</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ There were 57 capacity building workshops organized. Trainings were given to 43 members from the Association of Lebanese Industrialists, taking action against WFCL, with a particular emphasis on supply chains and CSR. 50 members of the Farmers Union and other agricultural unions were sensitized. ○ Following capacity building activities with the MoL, the Human Rights Trafficking organization and emigration unit of the Directorate of the General Services was tasked with the ‘Combating Child Labor Unit’. This led to further commitment by the government, notably high-level officials. ○ The CLU director received trainings on child labor in agriculture and on the streets, through workshops and other innovative learning approaches such as the study tour in Cairo. | <p>Objective 2: Sensitize the newly targeted working children, their sibling regarding the problem of child labour & provision of services to 300 families in coordination with other UN and local organizations</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Community mobilization activities and workshops were held for children and families incorporating SCREAM modules. The project educated 350 parents on the dangers of child labour, and on alternative sources of income through referral system for job placement, career opportunities and vocational training courses. | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ The ILO also conducted a series of meetings with UN partners in Syria. These trainings and meetings were essential in gaining feedback for the Phase 3 proposal and served as an initial step in the ILO’s objective to promote multi-sectoral coordination on Child labour. |
| <p>Objective 3: integrated and effective responses to fight child labor, especially its worst forms are in place</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ One major output was the establishment of the Nabattiye Centre for Children on 9th October 2017 ○ 30 livelihood opportunities were provided for girls and boys between the ages of 15-18 years from | | |

vulnerable households. Although these were small-scale projects (\$500), such as sewing machines, manicure or pedicure kits they have proved successful for beneficiaries.

4. RDPP

Tackling Child Labor among Syrian refugees and their host communities in Jordan and Lebanon

Outcome 1: Building of consensus among policymakers and other stakeholders to grant refugees of working age access to certain sectors of the labor market and engage them in other socio-economic activities in efforts to prevent and eliminate child labor.

Objective 1: Expand knowledge base on the worst forms of child labor and the link with the labor market participation.

- In Jordan, over 29 corporations across diverse fields were briefed.
- In Lebanon, the American University of Beirut conducted a high-quality study led by the ILO, on child labor in agriculture amongst Syrian refugees in the Beqaa valley, with financial support of FAO and Unicef.

Objective 2: Parliamentarians, national officials, have their awareness raised on the dangers and risks of child labor and what needs to be done to stop its worst forms through the working children’s podium

- In Jordan, a fully operational Children’s Podium was developed, with over 15 meetings conducted. A short video on SCREAM and the regional TOT workshops were produced in March 2016. Two TV interviews and two radio interviews with participating students in SCREAM trainings conducted in September 2016.
- In Lebanon, with respect to awareness raising through the Children’s Podium and SCREAM results exceeded expectations. This reached 4 ministers, 15 parliamentarians, and 18 other national officials. The National Choir Against Child Labor which was part of the SCREAM project.

Objective 3: Municipal authorities and employers are aware of the hazards of child labor and understand their responsibilities in prevention.

- In Jordan, at least 90 officials from the Greater Amman Municipality, GAM Zarka and Irbid were sensitized. For the Corporate Social Responsibility Unit, 40 employers were reached.

Outcome 2: By the end of the project, partners' capacities to address child labor have improved

Output 1: The capacity of key national institutions and mechanisms to prevent child labor is enhanced

- In Jordan, IT capacity building efforts were carried out including 15 officials from the Ministry of Labor, Education and Social Development receiving 'Super Users' training and 90 normal IT users training to cover staff from different regions.
- In Lebanon, one training took place in Egypt on how to attend to working street children at the governmental and non-governmental level as well as private sector contributions.

Output 2: Capacity of Employer's and Workers' organizations and their members have been enhanced

- In Jordan, 20 employers attended the NGO trainings and 40 employers have undergone 'awareness raising'
- In Lebanon, 40 Lebanese employers were sensitized on child labor and its link with CSR. An agreement was reached with 24 employers to provide refurbishing centers

Output 3: Capacity of local NGOs to develop services for children at risk of or involved in child labor has been enhanced

- In Jordan, 26 local NGOs were fully trained on Child Labor in 3 rounds.
- In Lebanon, 3 NGOs were trained in Egypt on working street children, 5 individuals were involved in training in Beirut for Internal Security Force. 3 NGOs were involved in training of Farmers union and child labor in agriculture. Training manuals were also developed.