



International
Labour
Organization

► Evaluation Office



i-eval Discovery



Final Independent Cluster Project Evaluation: Improved access to skills and employment opportunities in Lebanon

ILO DC/SYMBOL: LEB/16/08/CEF and LBN/18/04/ITA

Type of Evaluation: Clustered

Evaluation timing: Final

Evaluation nature: Independent

Project countries: Lebanon

P&B Outcome(s): Outcome 5 - Skills and lifelong learning to facilitate access to and transitions in the labour market

SDG(s): 4 and 8

Date when the evaluation was completed by the evaluator: 31 March 2023

Date when evaluation was approved by EVAL: [Click here to enter a date.](#)

ILO Administrative Office: ILO Regional Office for Arab States (ROAS)

ILO Technical Office(s): ILO Regional Office for Arab States (ROAS)

Joint evaluation agencies:

Project duration: UNICEF: January 2017 to March 2023 – AICS: January 2019 to March

Donor and budget: UNICEF: USD 3,069,020 – AICS: USD 583,653

Name of consultant(s): Rafael Munoz-Sevilla

Name of Evaluation Manager: Narendra Nadh Choudary, Bollepalli

Evaluation Office oversight: Naomi Asukai

Evaluation budget: USD 23,030

Key Words: [Education and training, vocational training, skills training, youth, youth employment, decent work](#)

Contents

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS.....3

LIST OF ACRONYMS 4

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY 6

1. BACKGROUND AND PROJECTS’ DESCRIPTION.....12

2. INTRODUCTION TO THE EVALUATION.....15

3. METHODOLOGY..... 17

4. FINDINGS19

 4.1. Relevance & Strategic Fit.....19

 4.2. Validity of the Project Design.....25

 4.3. Project progress and effectiveness.....32

 4.3. Efficiency..... 53

 4.4. Impact Orientation..... 57

 4.5. Sustainability.....58

5. LESSONS LEARNED AND GOOD PRACTICES 60

6. CONCLUSIONS.....63

7. RECOMMENDATIONS67

 ANNEX 1: Lessons Learned Templates..... 71

 ANNEX 2: Good Practices Templates..... 76

 ANNEX 3: Terms of Reference80

 ANNEX 4: Evaluation Matrix96

 ANNEX 5: Evaluation Questions.....108

 ANNEX 6: List of Documents Reviewed..... 110

 ANNEX 7: List of Persons Interviewed 112

Index of tables

Table 1. Interviewees per type of institution.....	18
Table 2. Projects' alignment with the ILO P&B.....	19
Table 3. Output 1 indicators.....	32
Table 4. Activity 1.1 indicators.....	32
Table 5. Activity 1.2 Indicators.....	33
Table 6. Activity 1.3 Indicators.....	34
Table 7. Activity 1.6 indicators.....	34
Table 8. Output 2 indicators.....	35
Table 9. Activity 2.1 indicators.....	36
Table 10. Activity 2.2 indicators.....	36
Table 11. Activity 2.3 indicators.....	37
Table 12. Activity 2.4 indicators.....	38
Table 13. Activity 2.5 indicators.....	38
Table 14. output 3 indicators.....	39
Table 15. Output 1 indicators.....	41
Table 16. Activity 1.1 indicators.....	41
Table 17. Activity 1.2 indicators.....	42
Table 18. Activity 1.3 indicators.....	42
Table 19. Activity 1.4 indicators.....	43
Table 20. Output 2 indicators.....	44
Table 21. Activity 2.1 indicators.....	45
Table 22. Activity 2.2 indicators.....	46
Table 23. Activity 2.3 indicators.....	46
Table 24. UNICEF-AICS budget and expenses.....	53
Table 25. UNICEF project budget and expenses.....	53
Table 26. AICS project budget and expenses.....	54

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

The Final Independent Cluster Project Evaluation: *Improved access to skills and employment opportunities in Lebanon* was conducted between January and March 2023. Rafael Muñoz Sevilla, independent evaluator, conducted the evaluation in collaboration with the project team and stakeholders. Mr. Muñoz would like to express sincere thanks to all parties involved in this study for their support and valuable contributions.

LIST OF ACRONYMS

AA	Administrative assistant
AICS	Italian Agency for Development Cooperation
ALI	Association of Lebanese Industrialists
CBT	Competency-based training
CEDRE	Economic Conference for Development through Reforms with the Private sector
CGTL	General Confederation of Lebanese Trade Unions
CPD	Country programme document
CPOs	Country Programme Objectives
CTA	Chief technical adviser
DACUM	Developing a curriculum approach
DAC	Development assistance criteria
DGTVET	Ministry of Education Directorate General of TVET
DWCP	Decent Work Country Programme
ETF	European Training Foundation
EU	European Union
FAO	Food and Agriculture Organization
FENASOL	National Federation of Worker and Employee Trade Unions in Lebanon
FGD	Focus group discussion
GIZ	Gesellschaft für Internationale Zusammenarbeit (German Agency for International Cooperation)
IECD	European Institute for Cooperation and Development
ILO	International Labour Organization
ILO-ROAS	ILO Regional Office for Arab States
ILS	International Labour Standards
ITC-ILO	International training Center of the ILO
LCRP	Lebanon Crisis Response Plan
LMA	Labour market Assessments
M&E	Monitoring and evaluation
MEHE	Ministry of Education and Higher Education
MOA	Ministry of Agriculture
MOL	Ministry of Labour
MOSA	Ministry of Social Affairs
NGO	Non-governmental organization

NEO	National Employment Office
NO	National Officer
NSF	National Strategic Framework for Technical and Vocational Education and Training
OJT	On the Job Training
OSH	Occupational safety and health
P&B	ILO Programme and Budget
RF	Results Frameworks
ROAS	Regional Office Arab States
SABs	School Advisory Boards
SDG	Sustainable Development Goal
SDO	Skills development officer
SDWG	Skills Development Working Group
SMEs	Small and Medium Enterprises
TOR	Terms of reference
TOT	Training of trainers
TREE	Training for Rural Economic Empowerment
TVET	Technical vocational education and training
UNDP	United Nations Development Programme
UNEG	United Nations Evaluation Group
UNESCO	United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization
UNFPA	United Nations Population Fund
UNICEF	United Nations International Children's Fund
UNHCR	United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees
UNRWA	United Nations Relief and Works Agency for Palestine Refugees in the Near East
WBL	Work-based learning

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

Project Background

The TVET system in Lebanon does not meet the needs of the labor market, and Syrian youth in Lebanon have limited access to TVET. NGOs offer vocational training, but there are few post-training services to help graduates find employment. The government launched the National Strategic Framework for TVET in 2018 to address these issues, but economic and political crises since 2019 have hindered its implementation. Against this backdrop, the ILO in Lebanon has implemented two projects funded by: a) UNICEF (hereafter the UNICEF Project) and, b) the Italian Agency for Development Cooperation (hereafter the AICS Project)

Project Description

The ILO projects aim to improve the availability and quality of labour market information; develop competency-based training programs relevant to labour market demand; and provide post-training services and market-based skills training for vulnerable Lebanese and refugees to enhance their employability.

Background to the evaluation

ILO considers evaluation as an integral part of the implementation of development cooperation activities. A cluster final evaluation was conducted for two projects implemented by the ILO and funded by UNICEF (*Towards improved formal and non-formal TVET in Lebanon*); and the Italian Agency for Development Cooperation -AICS- (*Improved access to employment opportunities for Lebanese and refugee graduates from skills training*). This cluster final evaluation was conducted to examine the relevance, coherence, effectiveness, efficiency, sustainability, and potential impact of the two projects and to provide recommendations for future similar projects. This evaluation also identified lessons learned and good practices.

Methodology

The evaluation set out to answer a list of specific questions organized according to the thematic criteria as defined in the Terms of Reference (Annex 1). The evaluator addressed the evaluation questions, including the integration of the ILO cross-cutting issues (gender equality and non-discrimination, international labour standards and social dialogue) (Annex 3) using multiple sources of evidence, combining primary qualitative data with secondary quantitative data. Qualitative data were obtained from key informant interviews and focus group discussions. Quantitative data were obtained from the performance reporting data presented by the ILO in the progress reports to UNICEF and AICS, as well as from other secondary sources. Data collection methods and stakeholder perspectives were triangulated to bolster the credibility and validity of the results.

Relevance and strategic fit

The evaluation concluded that the ILO skills projects in Lebanon are highly relevant. The projects are fully aligned with broader ILO policies and strategies, as defined in the ILO Programme and Budget, as well as in the ILO-Lebanon Decent Work Country Programme 2017-2020. The ILO projects are also aligned with the Sustainable Development Goals 4 and 8.

In addition, the projects largely respond to the needs of the beneficiaries. These projects aim to strengthen the employability of job seekers based on labour market needs and to provide post-training support to improve the chances of youths acquiring jobs. Moreover, in the current context of prolonged and multi-faceted crises, skills/vocational training has a significant potential for enhancing employability amidst the Lebanese and Syrian youth.

Coherence and validity of the design

Both the UNICEF and AICS project designs were found to be solid. In addition, the projects complement each other and are aligned and complementary with on-going national efforts as well as with ILO initiatives aiming at enhancing the quality and relevance of technical vocational education and training (TVET). The ILO's cross-cutting policy drivers were adequately integrated into the design and implementation of both projects. However, achieving the projects' objective of *improved employability and access of vulnerable Lebanese and refugee graduates from skills training to the labour market through improved formal and non-*

formal TVET in Lebanon should be understood as a strategic goal that involves a substantial dedication of time and resources (both technical and financial).

Project progress and Effectiveness

The skills projects proved effective in achieving the expected results. The ILO provided extensive capacity building to Project partners' through training sessions (2017 to 2019); the Skills Academy Lebanon (2020-2021); as well as through coaching and mentoring. The projects did significant contributions to improve the availability and quality of labour market information. The ILO and partner NGOs conducted seven community-based assessments. Also, four national sectoral labour market studies were conducted by the ILO in collaboration with the National Employment Office (NEO). Additionally, in collaboration with the Association of Lebanese Industrialists the ILO developed an on-line skills anticipation questionnaire for regular anticipation of labour market needs. Moreover the projects provided technical and financial support to conduct two tracer studies.

Furthermore, in collaboration with the project partners the ILO developed competency-based curricula for ten occupations. These curricula were applied in skills training programmes by partner NGOs. Moreover, the ILO implemented a work-based learning (WBL) pilot with three UNICEF partners.

The projects also contributed to improving the institutional capacities for the provision of post-training services to vocational training graduates. In this regard, the ILO provided training and coaching to project partners that offer skills training and post-training services. In addition, the ILO elaborated a proposal for the reform of the NEO, conducted a review of the existing referral mechanism in the TVET sector, and developed a mapping of training and post training service providers and a blueprint for an improved referral system.

Additionally, the ILO and UNICEF provided technical assistance to several Ministries in the elaboration of the National Strategic Framework (NSF) for TVET (2018–2022) as well as in the preparation of the NSF 2023-2027

The projects were faced with multiple external challenges beyond their control. The COVID-19 pandemic, as well as the socio-political crisis in the country affected and disrupted the projects implementation. A significant internal factor that caused additional challenges for the project management and implementation was the insufficient human capacity to undertake the set activities. Nevertheless, the ILO demonstrated a significant level of flexibility to adapt to the highly challenging implementation context.

Efficiency of resource use

The results that have been achieved to date justify the expenses of the ILO skills projects. Overall, all project activities delivered good value for money. Moreover, given the complexity of the projects, the large number of institutions involved and the insufficient project staff, the evaluator is of the opinion that the projects could not have achieved the same results at a lower cost.

Impact orientation

The UNICEF-ILO partnership was instrumental in the development of the NSF. The importance of having such framework for TVET in Lebanon lies in that it provides a roadmap for developing and implementing policies and programs that are aligned with the country's economic and social goals. In addition, such a framework can (potentially) help ensure that TVET programs will be responsive to labour market demands.

The ILO projects also facilitated partnerships between key stakeholders to promote collaboration and cooperation in the TVET sector. This has the potential to contribute to strengthening the governance as well as the quality and relevance of TVET.

In addition, the ILO projects made important contributions to aligning TVET programs with market needs and promoted increased private sector involvement in providing internships, apprenticeships, and other workplace-based learning opportunities for students. This, in turn, can potentially increase employment opportunities for TVET graduates.

Additionally, the ILO provided support for the development of skills assessment and certification systems. If implemented, such system can ensure that the skills and knowledge acquired through TVET programs are recognized and valued by employers, thereby enabling graduates to secure quality jobs.

Moreover, the ILO projects contributed to delivering market-relevant skills training, including WBL, to vulnerable youth and adults in the agriculture, construction, hospitality, craft, and health sectors, although it was not possible for the evaluation to measure the eventual positive changes in the lives of the ultimate project beneficiaries.

Sustainability

Overall the ILO laid the foundations for sustainability, to some extent, through high quality technical assistance in policy development, governance, capacity building, labour market information, curricula development, harmonization of skills training approaches, promotion of WBL schemes, etc. Nevertheless, the projects' timeframe is an important barrier for sustainability. In this regard, national efforts towards skills development will depend on continued technical and financial support. Without on-going and continued ILO commitment, the sustainability of project outcomes is not likely in the mid-term.

Lessons Learned

1. *Availability of appropriate staff levels is key to project performance.*

The ILO skills projects in Lebanon require a sufficient level of technical human resources due to their complexity and involvement with multiple stakeholders in a challenging environment. However, the shortage of human resources assigned to the projects has overburdened the project staff. The lesson learned is that future interventions would benefit from having a continued sufficient number of staff.

2. *Implementation schedules.*

Improving the quality and relevance of TVET in Lebanon requires comprehensive and elaborate strategies involving partnerships and collaboration with various stakeholders. However, the prevailing political, institutional, and economic conditions in Lebanon make achieving these goals in the short term unfeasible. The lesson learned is that in order to ensure the sustainability of ILO interventions, an integrated and long-term strategy needs to be developed with durable commitment from the ILO, the donor community, the national government, and other partners. A long-term implementation timeline is also necessary.

3. *Flexibility to adapt to a changing and challenging context*

The evaluation learned that in order to achieve a strong engagement strategy that is sustainable in the mid-term, the ILO should adopt an integrated approach that combines responses to immediate and urgent needs with mid-term development assistance. By addressing pressing needs in the short term, the ILO can create a foundation for sustainability in the future.

4. *Continuing engagement of ILO constituents (MOL, employers and workers' organizations) in developing the TVET sector*

Ongoing collaboration, coordination, and advocacy by ILO constituents (Ministry of Labour, employers, and workers' organizations) has been and remains crucial for enhancing the quality and relevance of the TVET system in Lebanon. The lesson learned is that the continued engagement of ILO constituents is instrumental in ensuring that TVET programs are aligned with the requirements of the labour market and facilitate opportunities for decent work. In addition, the ILO constituents have an important role to play in the governance of the TVET system in Lebanon.

Good practices

1. *Combining ILO and UNICEF's comparative advantages*

The ILO and UNICEF combined their comparative advantage in the TVET sector in Lebanon. Together, UNICEF and ILO offer a substantial and in-depth experience with implementing skills development projects on the ground in Lebanon as well as in the broader Arab States region. Due to the complementary mandates and expertise the ILO and UNICEF have managed to leverage their respective strengths to provide comprehensive and complementary support to the TVET system in Lebanon.

2. *Building on ILO experiences and resources*

Successful implementation of the skills projects builds on previous ILO experiences, programs, and resources, as well as collaboration and coordination with key stakeholders. Participation from stakeholders has also been a critical element in the ILO skills projects, which have involved and closely worked with various institutions such as government agencies, NGOs, UN agencies, and employers. Additionally,

tapping into the existing expertise and resources of the ILO, including regional, HQ, and ITC specialists, through coordination and collaboration, has been crucial in providing effective technical assistance to project partners.

3. ILO's integrated approach to Skills development

The ILO skills projects were designed and implemented to provide an integrated approach on skills development. Integrated approaches to support TVET development are crucial for meeting industry demands, enhancing employability, supporting economic growth, responding to changing needs, and encouraging lifelong learning. However, in the current Lebanese context, these approaches will take time to be fully developed and consolidated.

Recommendations

Recommendation 1: Maintain support to national efforts towards skills development and lifelong learning

It is recommended that the ILO and the donor community continue to provide technical and financial assistance to the Government and key private actors (employers, unions, NGOs) for the improvement of the quality and relevance of the Lebanon's TVET systems as well as access for Lebanese and refugee youth to the labour market.

Addressed to	Priority	Implementation	Level of resources
ILO (ROAS and HQ) and the donor community	High	Short-term	High

Recommendation 2: Design a long-term integrated strategy/programme on skills development and lifelong learning for Lebanon

The ILO RO should design an integrated and all-encompassing long-term programme on skills training and lifelong learning for Lebanon. Such a programme should tap into on the knowledge and expertise that was generated through past and on-going "skills projects". Some priority interventions for this programme are suggested below (recommendations 3 to 10)

Addressed to	Priority	Implementation	Level of resources
ILO (ROAS and HQ) and national Partners	High	Mid-term	Low

Recommendation 3: Improved governance of the TVET system

It is recommended that the ILO continue to strengthen the capacity of the DGTvet managers and staff, to ensure that TVET programs are well-managed, coordinated, and responsive to labour market needs. It is also essential for the ILO to continue promoting collaboration and partnerships among the DGTvet, private sector employers, industry associations, unions, and the Ministry of Labour.

Addressed to	Priority	Implementation	Level of resources
ILO, DGTvet, Employers (ALI) and workers' organizations (CGTL, FENASOL)	Medium	Mid-term	Medium

Recommendation 4: Support the development of institutional capacities of social partners

It is recommended that the ILO supports the institutional capacity building of Lebanese social partners, particularly workers' organizations, to enable them to engage more effectively in skills development.

Addressed to	Priority	Implementation	Level of resources
ILO, Employers (ALI) and workers' organizations (CGTL, FENASOL)	Medium	Mid-term	Medium

Recommendation 5: Expanded access to vocational training

It is recommended that the ILO continues to provide technical and financial support to expand access to vocational training, especially among vulnerable populations. This may include: a) promoting awareness and advocacy campaigns to change negative attitudes and stereotypes towards vulnerable populations and to raise awareness about the importance of inclusive TVET; b) providing support for infrastructure, electricity, equipment, and materials to ensure that schools are operational; and c) facilitating accessibility for students by providing scholarships, educational materials, transportation, meals, etc.

Addressed to	Priority	Implementation	Level of resources
ILO, DGTJET, MoA, MoSA, NEO, NGOs	High	Short-term	High

Recommendation 6: Enhanced TVET quality and relevance

The ILO should continue working with TVET providers (including NGOs) and the private sector to further develop/update labour market studies and skills assessments; competency-based curricula; tracer studies; and employer satisfaction surveys to ensure that the skills programmes are up-to-date and relevant to current industry needs. It is also important to continue supporting the alignment and standardization of non-formal training programs, as well as the development of a quality assurance system that includes standards, assessment tools, and procedures for monitoring and evaluating TVET programs.

Addressed to	Priority	Implementation	Level of resources
ILO, DGTJET, MoA, MoSA, NEO, NGOs, ALI	High	Mid-term	High

Recommendation 7: Continued development of Work-Based Learning/apprenticeships schemes.

In the short term, the ILO should promote public-private partnerships to create on-the-job training opportunities and apprenticeships. In the mid-term, the ILO should continue to provide technical assistance to the Ministry of Labour, DGTJET, unions, and employers in the development of a national framework for quality apprenticeships.

Addressed to	Priority	Implementation	Level of resources
ILO, DGTJET, MoA, NGOs, ALI, MOL, CGTL, FENASOL	High	Short-term Mid-term	Medium

Recommendation 8: Strengthened support to school-to-work transition

This can be achieved by providing technical and financial support for various initiatives, including the development and integration of core employability skills into competency-based training programs; the strengthening of career guidance and counselling services for students; the provision of employment, entrepreneurship, and livelihood training, as well as post-training support for students; and further support for the establishment of a comprehensive, cross-sectoral referral services network.

Addressed to	Priority	Implementation	Level of resources
ILO, TVET providers (public and private)	High	Short-term	High

Recommendation 9: Technical support to SMEs: enterprise development, enhanced productivity competitiveness, employment creation and transition to formality.

The ILO should provide technical assistance to Small and Medium Enterprises (SMEs) in Lebanon through capacity-building and mentoring programmes that focus on improved business management, enterprise development, productivity improvement, competitiveness enhancement and employment creation. Moreover, the ILO can provide advisory services and support on how to reduce informality and facilitate a transition of businesses to formality.

Addressed to	Priority	Implementation	Level of resources
ILO, Employers' organizations and SMEs	Medium	Mid-term	Medium

Recommendation 10: Mainstream gender approaches

In future skills development initiatives it is recommended for the ILO and the national partners to conduct a gender-based analysis to identify the specific needs and challenges faced by women in accessing and participating in TVET programs; develop gender-sensitive curricula; encourage gender balance in training; provide gender-sensitive support services (i.e. childcare, transportation, counselling services) to enable women to participate in the TVET programs without additional barriers. It is also important to monitor and evaluate gender outcomes of the TVET programs to measure their impact on women's empowerment and gender equality.

Addressed to	Priority	Implementation	Level of resources
ILO, Employers' organizations and SMEs	High	Mid-term	Medium

Recommendation 11: A repository of ILO products

It is recommended that an organized repository be created for the products that have been developed by ILO skills projects in Lebanon. This repository should include various materials such as labour market studies, methodological approaches, competency-based curricula, and training materials.

Addressed to	Priority	Implementation	Level of resources
ILO Skills Projects	High	Short-term	Low

1. BACKGROUND AND PROJECTS' DESCRIPTION

1.1. Context¹

As of October 2021, the Government of Lebanon estimated that the country hosts 1.5 million Syrians who have fled the conflict in Syria, including 844,056 registered as refugees with UNHCR², along with 257,000 Palestinian refugees. These populations live across all governorates in Lebanon (Lebanon Crisis Response Plan 2022-2023). In addition to the protracted Syria Crisis, Lebanon has further faced an unprecedented and multifaceted economic, financial, social and health crisis since 2019. As a consequence, vulnerable populations, including displaced Syrians, vulnerable Lebanese, Palestinian Refugees from Syria and Palestine Refugees in Lebanon have been deeply affected by a sharp increase in poverty, gaps in critical supply chains and limitations on access to food, healthcare, education and other basic services.

The Lebanese labour market faces a number of challenges, many of which can be addressed through a better understanding of the dynamics of the labour market; a clearer profile of the supply and demand sides of the market; and access to informed career guidance and counselling services. The Technical and Vocational Education and Training (TVET) system in Lebanon is not responsive to the labour market needs, and there is a need to improve its institutional and management capacity at all levels. Syrian youth in Lebanon show low access rates to secondary education, and particularly TVET, which is of critical concern. There are many NGOs offering vocational and skills training, but only few livelihoods partners in Lebanon are providing post-training follow-up services, such as employment services. As a result, the majority of graduates from skills training programme do not possess the necessary competencies and qualifications required to access the labour market³.

The Government of Lebanon launched the National Strategic Framework (NSF) for Technical and Vocational Education and Training in 2018 for the period 2018-2022⁴. The NSF reflects the government's commitment to promote a TVET system that provides the competencies and skills required in the labour market to enhance access to decent work and meet the skills demand for economic growth. The main strategic goals of the NSF are to expand access to TVET, enhance its quality and market-relevance, and improve TVET governance, including through greater engagement of employers.

Since 2019, however, Lebanon has been struggling to cope with a prolonged economic and financial crisis, the outbreak of COVID-19, and the Beirut blast, causing major disruptions in the implementation of the NSF. Whereas the implementation of the NSF was derailed, several skills initiatives emerged to serve the direct needs of the affected population including in the areas of healthcare and reconstruction, as well as to meet the urgent needs of TVET students and schools.

In the light of the current challenges in Lebanon, the ILO and UNICEF organised a roundtable discussion in December 2021, in collaboration with other development partners and social partners, to discuss their respective skills interventions in the country, develop recommendations for upgrading the NSF, and enhance coordination mechanisms between development partners.

¹ Based on the terms of reference and the project documents

² UNHCR: United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees

³ AICS UNICEF Project Document/Concept Note based on Problem Tree and Situational Analysis

⁴ https://www.ilo.org/beirut/publications/WCMS_633487/lang--en/index.htm

The workshop served to take stock of new skills initiatives emerged to address the direct needs of the affected population including in the areas of healthcare and reconstruction, as well as to meet the urgent needs of TVET students and schools. The report highlighted the need to revisit the NSF to ensure better alignment with national priorities, including measures for crisis response, and rapidly changing labour market demand and improved coordination to better respond to the crisis. In addition, it concluded with a set of recommendations to be considered in the review and key interventions in response to the current crisis.

In addition, the ILO and UNICEF, in collaboration with the German Agency for International Cooperation (GIZ) coordinated with Ministry of Education Directorate General of TVET (DGTVET) for the upgrade or update of the NSF in 2022 for 2023-2030. The review takes into consideration the priority emergency needs of DGTVET for the short term and development goals for the medium-long term. A working group was formed involving DGTVET, UNICEF, ILO, GIZ, and the European Institute for Cooperation and Development (IECD) and has been meeting on a weekly basis since April towards its development. Analysis work is in progress, however, given the complexity of the process involving a consensus among stakeholders involved, it is anticipated that work would be completed and disseminated by the end of the first quarter of 2023.

1.2. Projects' description

Against this backdrop, the ILO in Lebanon has implemented two projects funded by: a) UNICEF (hereafter the UNICEF Project) and, b) the Italian Agency for Development Cooperation (hereafter the AICS Project)

1. Towards improved formal and non-formal TVET in Lebanon (UNICEF Project)

The joint partnership between ILO and UNICEF aimed to improve the formal and non-formal technical and vocational education and training in Lebanon in order to respond to the youth needs within the current socio-economic context.

Overall objective:

The overall objective of the first project is "*TVET curricula and standards for youth are relevant to identified labour market needs*".

Immediate objectives:

- a. *Strengthened capacity of vocational training providers (NGOs) to prioritise training programme based on market needs.*
- b. *Competency based training programmes relevant to labour market demand developed and initiated.*

2. Improved access to employment opportunities for Lebanese and refugee graduates from skills training (AICS Project)

The project aims to strengthen the employability of job seekers based on market needs and provide post-training support to graduates in order to improve their chances of acquiring jobs. The project is the second phase of the ILO project "Improved and market-based provision of vocational training for Lebanese and refugees" which was also implemented with funding from Italian Agency for Development Cooperation.

Overall objective:

The overall objective of the project is *“to improve the access to employment of Lebanese and refugees graduates through market responsive skills training”*.

Immediate objective:

“Lebanese and refugee graduates from skills training have obtained the necessary employability to access the labour market”.

Output 1: *Improved institutional capacities for the provision of post-training services for Lebanese and refugee graduates from accelerated skills training .*

Output 2: *Improved institutional capacities for the design of market-based skills training for Lebanese and refugees.*

Coordination between the projects

Both projects that are the subject of this cluster evaluation were implemented in a coordinated manner by one team to create synergy and cost efficiency. The activities were designed and implemented to complement each other. This also means that the project team worked with mostly the same stakeholders.

2. INTRODUCTION TO THE EVALUATION

ILO considers evaluation as an integral part of the implementation of development cooperation activities. Provisions are made in all projects in accordance with ILO evaluation policy and based on the nature of the project and the specific requirements agreed upon at the time of the project design and during the project as per established procedures.

A cluster final evaluation was conducted for two projects (hereafter the ILO Skills Projects) implemented by the ILO and funded by UNICEF (*Towards improved formal and non-formal TVET in Lebanon*) and the Italian Agency for Development Cooperation -AICS- (*Improved access to employment opportunities for Lebanese and refugee graduates from skills training*). While each project has different deliverables with different implementation period, both of them have aimed to contribute to improve skilling and employment opportunities in Lebanon.

The project documents state that a final evaluation will be conducted to assess the progress towards the results, identify the main difficulties/constraints, assess the impact of the programme for the targeted populations, and analyse the lessons learned and practical recommendations to improve future similar programmes.

2.1. Purpose and Objectives

In general, as specified in the Terms of reference, this cluster final evaluation was conducted to examine the relevance, coherence, effectiveness, efficiency, sustainability, and potential impact of the two projects and to provide recommendations for future similar projects, particularly in the area of vocational training, skill development and economic opportunities. This evaluation also identified as lessons learned and good practices.

The purpose of this evaluation is to:

- Assess to what extent the projects collectively contributed to overarching P&B outcome 5, and to respective Country Programme Outcomes in Lebanon;
- Determine if the projects have achieved their stated objectives and explain why/why not;
- Provide recommendations on how to build on the achievements and the possible avenues/intended objectives and results of future relevant projects or phases;
- Document lessons learned, success stories, and good practices in order to maximize the experiences gained.
- Document the value for money and added value for UN agencies to work together towards one common plan

Specifically, the evaluation examined and addressed the evaluation criteria and questions as detailed in Annex 5.

2.2. Scope of the evaluation

The evaluation looked at the project activities, outputs and outcomes within the wider context of the country and UN interventions. Geographical coverage was nationwide and in line with the project's scope. The evaluation took into consideration the duration of projects up to January 2023.

2.3. Clients

The primary clients of this evaluation are the ILO Regional Office for Arab States (ROAS), ILO constituents in Lebanon, other government entities⁵, UN and Non-Governmental Organizations (NGO), and the donors (UNICEF and the Italian Agency for Development Cooperation). Secondary clients include other project stakeholders and units within the ILO that may indirectly benefit from the knowledge generated by the evaluation.

2.4. Evaluation Criteria and Evaluation Questions (EQs)

Following the TOR, the evaluation addressed the general areas of focus (evaluation criteria) and specific questions, as detailed in Annex 5.

⁵For example, DGTVET, MoA, MoSA, NEO, NVTC, etc.,

3. METHODOLOGY

The evaluation set out to answer a list of specific questions organized according to the thematic criteria as defined in the Terms of Reference. The evaluator addressed the evaluation questions using multiple sources of evidence, combining primary qualitative data with secondary quantitative data. Qualitative data were obtained from key informant interviews and focus group discussions. Quantitative data were obtained from the performance reporting data presented by the ILO in the Progress Reports to UNICEF and the AICS; as well as from other secondary sources. Data collection methods and stakeholder perspectives were triangulated to bolster the credibility and validity of the results.

Additionally, the evaluation incorporated the ILO cross-cutting themes, including gender equality and non-discrimination, international labour standards, and social dialogue (as per the terms of reference). The evaluation framework included questions related to these themes. Additionally, a gender-sensitive approach was used to ensure that the needs and experiences of both women and men were adequately captured during the evaluation. Furthermore, the evaluation included tripartite stakeholders in the process to ensure their perspectives and experiences were taken into account.

3.1. Evaluation Schedule.

The evaluation was conducted between January and March 2023. The evaluator reviewed project documents, developed data collection instruments, and prepared for the fieldwork during the month of January. Also, meetings with the evaluator manager and the project team were conducted during that month. Fieldwork was conducted in Lebanon from February 20 to March 3. The evaluation report was written in March 2023.

3.2. Evaluation methods and techniques

a. Comprehensive document review

The evaluator reviewed a variety of documents related to the projects. Examples include project documents, technical progress reports, and other key documents produced by the projects. Additionally, the Evaluator analysed other documentary evidence that has direct relevance for the purposes of the evaluation and that has been produced by the ILO, other individuals or agencies for purposes other than those of the evaluation. Annex 6 shows the complete list of documents that were reviewed.

b. Key Project Informant Interviews and Focus Group Discussions

The evaluator conducted a series of interviews and focus group discussions (FGDs) with 64 key informants (30 women and 34 men). The sampling considered representatives from all key stakeholders: ILO (project staff, ILO officials in Beirut, and the International Training Centre); donors, NGOs, Government institutions, employers and workers' organizations, UN Agencies and other development partners. Gender representation was dependent on purposive interviews and FGDs– the people involved in the project according to their position, organization, roles, and responsibilities. A complete list of participants appears in Annex 7.

Table 1. Interviewees per type of institution

Stakeholder Type	Sample Size		
	M	F	Total
Sex			
ILO	6	3	9
Donors	1	3	4
Government Institutions	12	18	30
Employers' Organizations	1	--	1
Workers' Organizations	1	--	2
NGOs	6	4	10
UN Agencies	5	2	7
Other development partners	2	--	2
TOTAL	34	30	64

The evaluator used qualitative data analysis methods to categorize, triangulate, synthesize, and summarize the raw data captured from the interviews and focus groups. The results of the data analysis provided tangible blocks of information, which the evaluator used to write the evaluation report. The data analysis is consistent with the evaluation questions in the terms of reference.

c. Evaluation debriefing

At the end of data collection stage in Lebanon, the evaluator presented preliminary findings to the project staff and ILO specialists, to discuss and refine the findings and fill information gaps.

3.3. Limitations

The findings for this evaluation are based on information collected from background documents and from key informant interviews and focus group discussions. The accuracy of the evaluation findings is founded on the integrity of information provided to the evaluator from these sources and the ability of the evaluator to triangulate this information.

The amount of information to be reviewed and analysed was vast. The considerable quantity of documentation, some of which was received after the field mission, represented a challenge to the evaluator. In addition, a monitoring plan for the projects was not available so the evaluator had to rely on the data included in the progress reports to assess the quantitative results at the outcome and output levels.

Despite these limitations, the evaluator considers that the interviews and focus groups that were conducted provided a solid representation of the views of key stakeholders and beneficiaries. Moreover, the evaluator obtained information and data based on multiple documents and used retrospective approaches to establish the analytical basis of the evaluation.

4. FINDINGS

4.1. Relevance & Strategic Fit

The current section analyses the relevance and strategic fit of the ILO skills projects in Lebanon related to the ILO policies and strategies (P&B and DWCP) as well as the Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs); and the needs of the beneficiaries and the ILO constituents. The section also studies the projects' relevance in relation to the current political, economic and financial context in Lebanon; and, the extent to which they are positioned within the overall Decent Work agenda in the country.

4.1.1. Alignment with broader ILO policies and strategies: P&B and DWCP

The evaluation concluded that the ILO skills projects in Lebanon are fully aligned with broader ILO policies and strategies, as defined in the ILO Programme and Budget (P&B), as well as in the ILO-Lebanon Decent Work Country Programme (DWCP) 2017-2020 and the Country Programme Objectives (CPOs). This conclusion is based on the following:

- ILO-Lebanon Decent Work Country Programme 2017-2020

Throughout the world, Decent Work Country Programmes have been established as the main vehicle for delivery of ILO support to countries. DWCPs define, in agreement with the national constituents, the priority areas for ILO technical support in a country⁶.

The ILO Decent Work Country Programme (2017–2020) for Lebanon currently in force aims to: i) improve labour governance, in accordance with international labour standards; ii) develop policies to enhance productive employment opportunities, with a focus on youth employment; and, iii) improve social security provision and extend social protection to vulnerable groups.

Moreover, the skills projects contribute to the ILO's Country Programme Objective (CPO) LBN 103 *Improved employability of Syrian Refugees and Lebanese citizens to access Decent Work*.

- ILO Programme and Budget (P&B)

The Programme and Budget of the ILO sets out the strategic objectives and expected outcomes for the Organization's work in the biennium and is approved every two years by the International Labour Conference⁷.

The ILO skills projects in Lebanon are aligned with and contribute to the following P&B outcomes:

Table 2. Projects' alignment with the ILO P&B

Projects' alignment with the ILO P&B	
P&B for the biennium 2022–23	Outcome 5: Skills and lifelong learning to facilitate access to and transitions in the labour market
P&B for the biennium 2020-21	Outcome 5: Skills and lifelong learning to facilitate access to and transitions in the labour market
P&B for the biennium 2018-19	Outcome 5: Decent work in the rural economy

Source: ILO : <https://www.ilo.org/global/about-the-ilo/how-the-ilo-works/programme-and-budget/lang--en/index.htm>

⁶ Source ILO : <https://www.ilo.org/global/about-the-ilo/how-the-ilo-works/organigramme/program/dwcp/lang--en/index.htm>

⁷Source: ILO: <https://www.ilo.org/global/about-the-ilo/how-the-ilo-works/programme-and-budget/lang--en/index.htm>

4.1.2. Alignment with the Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs)

The ILO projects are also aligned with the SDGs, more precisely to Goal 4. Quality Education: target 4.4 *By 2030, substantially increase the number of youths and adults who have relevant skills, including technical and vocational skills, for employment, decent jobs and entrepreneurship*; and Goal 8. Decent Work and Economic Growth: target 8.6 *By 2020, substantially reduce the proportion of youth not in employment, education or training*.

4.1.3. Relevance in view of the needs of beneficiaries

Document review (UNESCO⁸, ETF⁹, ILO, etc.) as well as interviews reveal that TVET in Lebanon is facing difficulty in attracting students, and the sector suffers from a poor reputation, as there is an overall lack of decent job opportunities for TVET graduates.

While the labour market demands a skilled workforce, the Lebanese educational system does not provide youth with the skills necessary to smoothly transition into the labour market. In this regard, many interviewees have underlined the mismatch between the skills offered by the formal and non-formal TVET systems, and those demanded by the market.

Most TVET curricula remain outdated and are not based on the competencies and life skills demanded by the labour market. The scarcity of accurate and reliable information on the current and future needs of the labour market hinders the capacity of the TVET system in responding to these demands and adapting the training programmes accordingly¹⁰. In addition, the lack of involvement of the private sector/employers in the TVET system, along with the absence of work-based learning, internship, and apprenticeship modalities, contributes to making such programmes either obsolete or unfit to meet the market demands¹¹.

In addition, numerous NGOs offer vocational and skills training as part of the Lebanon Crisis Response Plan (LCRP). For example, in 2017, 30 livelihoods partners trained some 26,000 students. Only 12% of the graduates were reported to have accessed gainful employment afterwards¹². This can to some extent be attributed to the fact that the training programmes are not based on up to date market needs analysis. Moreover, only a few NGOs provide post-training follow-up services, and there is no collaboration among them or with the National Employment Office (NEO) which negatively impacts the effectiveness of service provision.

Interviewees and document review confirmed that the ILO projects largely responded to the needs of youth, including both Lebanese and Syrian refugees. The projects aim to strengthen their employability by providing relevant vocational training based on market needs, as well as post-training support to improve their chances of acquiring jobs.

⁸ UNESCO: United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization

⁹ ETF: European Training Foundation

¹⁰ Source: State of Skills Lebanon. International Labour Organization. Undated

¹¹ Based on: Reviewing life and work skills for youth in Lebanon. UNESCO, 2018.

¹² Source: AICS Project Document

4.1.4. Alignment with tripartite constituents' objectives and needs

Interviews with representatives from the Ministry of Labour (MOL) and workers and employers' organizations confirmed that the ILO skills projects are largely aligned with the constituents' objectives and needs in terms of enhancing the relevance and quality of TVET.

There is consensus among key informants that ILO constituents (governments, employers and unions) have key roles in the development and governance of vocational training systems that respond both to the needs of the Lebanese youth (including refugees) and the labour market. However, as underlined in the NSF 2018-2022, in the absence of a national TVET policy that would systematically engage social partners, the communication among government agencies, unions and employers has remained weak.

Moreover, TVET governance is highly centralized under the DGTVET, with little involvement from the social partners¹³. In this regard, there is no mechanism in place to engage employers' organizations and trade unions in the steering, design, implementation and financing of the skills system¹⁴.

In this context, the ILO managed to establish a broad partnership and encourage cooperation among public authorities, employers, unions, training institutions, and NGOs, in order to promote a better adjustment of the TVET system to the needs of Lebanese society and the labour market.

The ILO also ensured the participation and contributions of the MOL and the social partners in many of the projects' activities. For example (please refer to the effectiveness section for more details) the ILO supported the participation of constituents (and other stakeholders) in several capacity building activities; the elaboration of community and national labour market assessments; the formulation of a code of conduct for employers; the signature of the *Tripartite On the Job Training (OJT) agreement*; and the implementation of activities related to work-based learning (WBL) initiatives.

In addition, the ILO supported the DGTVET's School Advisory Boards (SABs) which bring together the private sector and the public vocational training schools, with the objective of creating links between schools and the world of work.

Moreover, the ILO and UNICEF provided technical assistance to the Ministry of Labour and other line ministries (Education, Social Affairs, and Agriculture) in the elaboration of the NSF 2018–2022.

4.1.5. Relevance of the projects in relation to the political, economic and financial context.

Over the last 3 years, Lebanon has experienced acute crises that have added to the country's long-lasting political instability, refugee crises and economic depression, depriving the country of a stable development for over a decade. The country's deep economic and financial crisis has been exacerbated by the COVID-19 pandemic, and the devastating explosion in the Beirut port in

¹³ Source: VET governance ETF partner profile: Lebanon. European Training Foundation, 2018

¹⁴ Source: State of Skills Lebanon. International Labour Organization. Undated

August 2020, leading to a fast deterioration of the socio-economic situation among both Lebanese people and refugees¹⁵.

According to the United Nations Development Programme (UNDP)¹⁶ the youth in Lebanon have been severely impacted by the economic crisis. Back in 2018, the youth (15-24 years old) unemployment rate stood at 23%, which is double the national unemployment rate of 11.4%. Following the multiple crises and based on a follow-up from the same survey, youth unemployment increased significantly in 2022 to 47.8%, compared to a national high unemployment rate of 29.6%.

As reported by the ILO¹⁷, prior to the crises, half of all employed young people in Lebanon were working in sectors that were at high risk of job losses, while almost a quarter of all young people were not in employment, education or training. The disruptions in education and training and limited prospects for work are expected to increase labour inactivity and NEET¹⁸ rates (rates of those not in employment, education or training) even further.

Against this backdrop, based on document review and interviews with key stakeholders, the evaluation found that the ILO skills projects were not only relevant at their inception and during implementation, but their relevance has even increased in view of the current complex political, economic, and financial context in Lebanon.

Several stakeholders consulted by the evaluator underlined that overcoming the country's multi-faceted crisis demands, among others, the re-activation of economic growth; an increase in the productivity of the economy; and the creation of employment, in particular for youth. This in turn requires the provision of vocational training opportunities for youth.

Also, as stated in the LCRP 2022-2023: *within the current context, supporting and protecting people's livelihoods, and investing in decent employment, while boosting economic recovery and market systems, has become even more vital.*

Accordingly, the LCRP 2022-2023 "livelihoods sector" includes amidst its three key priorities (outcomes) the *improvement of the workforce employability*. In this regard, the livelihoods sector focuses on bridging the gap in the labour market through two main outputs aimed at: a) expanding beneficiaries' skills needed in the Lebanese labour market through marketable and soft skills training; as well as, b) career guidance, job matching and work-based learning opportunities.

In addition, key informants concurred that in the current context of crisis, skills/vocational training has a significant potential for enhancing employability amidst Lebanese youth, especially the vulnerable populations. However, the informants agreed that in order to do so, it is necessary - even urgent - to continue increasing the quality of skills/vocational training as well as its ability to adapt/respond to the labour market needs.

¹⁵ Lebanon education, training and employment developments, 2021. European Training Foundation, 2021

¹⁶ <https://www.undp.org/arab-states/blog/lebanons-youth-barriers-growth-and-unfolding-opportunities>

¹⁷ https://www.ilo.org/beirut/media-centre/news/WCMS_848388/lang-en/index.htm

¹⁸ NEET: not in employment, education or training

4.1.6. ILO's work within the overall Decent Work agenda in Lebanon

Through the UNICEF/AICS skills projects the ILO has been actively involved in promoting vocational training and skills development in Lebanon, especially in the context of the current crisis.

Through document review and interviews with key stakeholders, the evaluation found that the Lebanese government has been supportive of the ILO's efforts in vocational training and skills development. The ILO has been working closely with several government agencies, including the Ministry of Labour /NEO, the Ministry of Agriculture (MOA), DGTVET, and the Ministry of Social Affairs (MOSA), to develop policies and initiatives that aim at improving of the quality and relevance of TVET. The final goal of these efforts is to promote decent work opportunities for both Lebanese and Syrian refugees. The following is a summary of the current development processes, to which the ILO projects have contributed.

In 2018 the Ministry of Education and Higher Education (MEHE) presented the National Strategic Framework for Technical and Vocational Education and Training 2018–2022. This framework was developed with the support of UNICEF and the ILO. The Strategic Framework confirms the Government of Lebanon's commitment to promote a TVET system that provides youth and adult workers with the competencies and skills required to access decent work, and that allows businesses to recruit the workforce they need for growth. This commitment is articulated in the Strategic Framework, which outlines three main strategic axes: (i) expanded access and service delivery; (ii) enhanced quality and relevance of TVET provision; and (iii) improved TVET governance and systems. Moreover, in 2022, the ILO and UNICEF, in collaboration with GIZ, coordinated with DGTVET for the update of the NSF for 2023-2030.

In addition, the ILO, jointly with UNICEF, UNDP, and UNFPA¹⁹, brought together key stakeholders in the country (including representatives of the Prime Minister, Ministry of Education and Higher Education, Ministry of Youth and Sports, Ministry of Labour, Ministry of Agriculture, Association of Lebanese Industrialists (ALI), and the General Confederation of Lebanese Trade Unions (CGTL), and supported their collaboration and engagement in the MENA Regional High-Level Meeting on Young People's Learning, Skilling, Social Inclusion and Transition to Decent Work (May 2022). As a result, government representatives made a series of "national commitments" to address learning bottlenecks in decent work transition in Lebanon, through a participatory and consultative process with the UN agencies.

The ILO's work in vocational training is also highly valued by NGOs, UN agencies and development partners in Lebanon. The ILO has been working closely with a wide range of NGOs in Lebanon, to promote vocational training and skills development. NGOs have been partnering with the ILO to develop programs and initiatives that target vulnerable groups such as youth, and refugees.

Moreover, the ILO has been working closely with UN agencies such as FAO²⁰ and UNICEF, to develop joint programs and initiatives that promote skills development and decent work opportunities for refugees and host communities. Development agencies such as the European

¹⁹ UNFPA: United Nations Population Fund

²⁰ FAO: Food and Agriculture Organization

Union, the World Bank, and GIZ have also supported the ILO's efforts in vocational training and skills development in Lebanon.

In addition, in 2021, the ILO, UNICEF, and the World Bank formed the Skills Development Working Group (SDWG) in Lebanon, which includes various development partners such as EU, KFW²¹, USAID²², AFD²³, IECD, ETF, GIZ, and AICS. The SDWG aims to promote coordination amidst partners; jointly address key challenges in skills; and to provide strategic guidance to the Government of Lebanon and civil society actors.

Overall, the ILO's work related to improving vocational training, skilling, and employment opportunities is a key component of the Decent Work agenda in Lebanon. Interviews with key stakeholders demonstrate that the ILO's work in vocational training and skills development in Lebanon is highly valued by government institutions, UN agencies, development partners, and NGOs. Moreover, the ILO is perceived as a key leading actor and the organization's efforts are seen as critical for improving the quality and relevance of TVET, as well as for promoting decent work opportunities and improving the livelihoods of vulnerable groups in Lebanon.

²¹ Kreditanstalt für Wiederaufbau

²² U.S. Agency for International Development

²³ Agence Française de Développement

4.2. Validity of the Project Design

This section of the evaluation examines and analyses the coherence and validity of the project design; the complementarity amidst the UNICEF and AICS projects; the projects' complementarity and fit with other ongoing local efforts and ILO programmes and projects in the country; the Projects' Monitoring and Evaluation (M&E) framework; and whether the ILO cross cutting policy drivers have been and are taken into consideration in the design

4.2.1. Projects' design logic and coherence and use of evidence based approaches

As part of the initial document review phase of the evaluation, the evaluator carefully reviewed the projects' strategy (please refer to the following section below) and the accompanying Results Frameworks (RF) on which the projects are based. Further, both the strategy and the RF's relevance were discussed with key stakeholders during the evaluation data collection phase.

Both the UNICEF and AICS designs were found to be solid. The situation analysis contained in the project documents is comprehensive and rigorous, which provides a clear understanding of both the context in which the projects are implemented, as well as of the situation/the problems they intended to address. In addition, the internal logic of both projects is sound, and based on a thorough problem/context analysis.

In addition, the strategy and the proposed interventions logically address the identified challenges and needs, which corroborates the use of evidence-based approaches in project design. Moreover, the evaluation found that overall, there is a strong causal argument put forward between the projects' objectives and outcomes/outputs.

However, both the evaluators and the key stakeholders who were interviewed agreed that achieving the projects' objective of *improved employability and access of vulnerable Lebanese and refugee graduates from skills training to the labour market through improved formal and non-formal TVET in Lebanon* should be understood as a strategic goal that involves a substantial dedication of time and resources (both technical and financial).

Nonetheless, in line with what some stakeholders confirmed, the evaluator noted that the human resources that were assigned for the projects' implementation (namely: 1 Project Coordinator (CTA), 1 Skills Development Officer (SDO), 1 National Officer (NO) and 1 Administrative Assistant (AA)) were scarce, especially for projects of such complexity. The understaffing became even worse upon the successive resignation of several project CTAs and SDOs (please refer to the Effectiveness section for further details) which eventually left the project in the hands of the National Officer, who only had the support of an administrative assistant, as well as backstopping support from the Senior Skills and Employability Specialist at ILO ROAS

In terms of financial resources, interviews with stakeholders considered that the budget allocation to the projects was adequate. Apropos the allocated time for the duration of the projects, there is broad agreement among the consulted stakeholders that improving the quality and relevance of the Lebanese TVET system requires complex systemic interventions, processes and transformations that will need more time than what was initially foreseen for the projects' implementation (i.e. 5 years, 2017–2022).

Likewise, there is widespread agreement among key stakeholders that the achievement of this strategic goal would require profound transformations of the Lebanese TVET system which in turn necessitate a favourable enabling environment; that is, the existence of some fundamental (pre) existing conditions such as: a certain degree of political and institutional stability; a high amount of political commitment to the project, institutional leadership within the Government; as well as continuing budget support (from both the Government and the development partners).

Political and institutional stability is chronically fragile in Lebanon and it has proven to be the case during the projects' implementation. Moreover, the extent of the Government's political and financial commitment and support to the ILO projects' objectives were unknown at the time that this evaluation was being conducted.

There is indeed a consensus among informants that vocational training remains an important part of the education system in Lebanon, to help building a skilled and competitive workforce as well as to bridge the gap between education and employment. Informants also conveyed to the evaluator that Lebanon faces noteworthy challenges in this regard (please refer to the Relevance and the Effectiveness sections for further details). While it is important to support the quality and relevance of the TVET system, it is equally important to consider the particular context in which these systems operate.

4.2.2. Complementarity amidst projects designs

The evaluation's analysis of the project documents and the respective technical progress reports as well as the interviews that were conducted with the different stakeholders, has confirmed that the projects' strategies and intervention logic foundations are based on the following "building blocks": 1) improved institutional capacities and availability and quality of labour market information; 2) competency based training programmes relevant to labour market demand developed and initiated; and 3) improved institutional capacities for the provision of post-training services for Lebanese and refugee graduates from accelerated skills training. In this regard, the projects strategy was found to be sound.

In addition, and based on documentary review and interviews with key stakeholders, the evaluator acknowledges that both the UNICEF and AICS project's interventions under each "building block", separately and jointly, complement and support each other. The projects were found to be complementary and there aren't any indications of duplications of effort or activities.

4.2.3. Complementarity and fit with other ongoing local efforts and ILO programmes and projects in the country

Through document review and interviews the evaluation has found that the ILO skills projects build on previous TVET/employment interventions. Moreover, the projects are aligned and complement ongoing local efforts as well as UN and ILO initiatives in the country that aim at enhancing the quality and relevance of TVET provision.

- National efforts

The ILO projects are aligned with the Government of Lebanon's "Vision for Stabilization, Growth and Employment" (2018) which was presented at the *Economic Conference for Development through Reforms with the Private sector* (CEDRE). In addition, building on CEDRE, in January 2019

the Government of Lebanon announced its Economic Vision, which aims to grow the Gross Domestic Product and create jobs, including through education²⁴.

The Projects are also aligned with and support the strategic plans of the Ministries with responsibilities related to the formal vocational training system, in particular the Ministry of Education and Higher Education, the Ministry of Labour, the Ministry of Agriculture and the Ministry of Social Affairs. Moreover, the ILO projects played a key role in the development of the NSF for TVET 2018-2022 and contribute to its strategic priorities.

- International efforts

The ILO projects contribute to UNICEF's priorities in Lebanon as defined in the 2017-2020 Country programme document (CPD) as well as in the draft CPD 2023-2025. In addition, the ILO projects support the United Nations Strategic Framework-Lebanon 2017-2020; and complement other UN Agencies' initiatives in the country, for example, FAO's project "*Upgrading the Technical Agriculture Education System in Lebanon*" or UNHCR and IECED support to the National Vocational Training Centre of the Ministry of Labour. Moreover, the ILO projects are part of the UN Inter-Agency Lebanon Crisis Response Plan and contribute to achieving outcomes and targets set under the LCRP Livelihoods Sector.

The ILO projects further align with on-going initiatives from bilateral cooperation agencies, such as, for example, the GIZ's "*Improving the Quality and Attractiveness of TVET in Lebanon (QuA-VET)*" and "Technical Assistance for More Practice Oriented VTE in Lebanon (ProVTE)"

- ILO regional and national initiatives

The ILO skills projects draw from and build on the recommendations from the regional ILO and UNICEF *Consultation on Technical and Vocational Education and Training* in May 2016. In addition, the projects are aligned and contribute to the ILO's Strategy in Response to the Syrian Refugee Crisis²⁵. The ILO's response to the Syrian refugee crisis in Lebanon focuses on employment and decent work deficits and includes among its priorities the support to enhanced access to employment opportunities and livelihoods by promoting a market-driven approach to skills development and TVET.

Moreover, the projects build on previous ILO interventions that were funded by AICS such as "*Enabling job resilience and protecting Decent Work Conditions in Rural communities affected by Syrian Refugees crisis in Northern Lebanon*"; "*Skills development, employment services and local economic recovery for the construction sector in South Lebanon*"; and "*Improved and market-based provision of vocational training for Lebanese and refugees*" as well as FAO-ILO-AVSI project "*Upgrading the Agriculture Education System in Lebanon*".

Past ILO's interventions also include the *Skills development, employment services and local economic recovery for the construction sector in South Lebanon*, and joint interventions with UNRWA²⁶ to improve the employability of Palestinian refugees and support to the National Employment Office of the Ministry of Labour on strengthening their services.

²⁴ Source: State of Skills – Lebanon. International Labour Organization (undated)

²⁵ http://www.ilo.org/wcmsp5/groups/public/---dgreports/---exrel/documents/publication/wcms_357159.pdf

²⁶ United Nations Relief and Works Agency for Palestine Refugees in the Near East

In addition, the ILO skills projects closely coordinated and collaborated with other on-going ILO initiatives such as the "Partnership for improving prospects for forcibly displaced persons and host communities (PROSPECTS)" and the "SKILL-UP Programme: Upgrading skills for the changing world of work" (please refer to the Effectiveness section for further details).

4.2.4. Projects' Monitoring and Evaluation (M&E) framework

M&E framework

The ILO did not develop a monitoring and evaluation plan for the skills projects. The project team was responsible for preparing the progress reports on the projects and delivering them to UNICEF and AICS as donors. These reports detail all the activities and products developed during the reporting period. However, the reports do not take into account the expected changes at the results/objective levels that could potentially result from the different interventions.

According to several informants, such shortcomings in project monitoring are largely due to the limited staff structure, including the absence of a project monitoring and evaluation officer position.

Indicators

Both the UNICEF and AICS projects developed Results Frameworks, which showcase key indicators under their corresponding outputs and key activities.

Overall, based on the document review and stakeholder interviews, the evaluator found that while some indicators are well defined, others may benefit from a review to ensure that there is a logical fit between the indicators and the respective outputs/activities for which they intend to provide evidence of achievement. This implies that in order to ensure that the indicators are appropriate and meaningful, the following needs to be considered; 1) indicators have to include a clear definition of what is being measured; 2) indicators actually have to measure the intended results; and 3) indicators must be SMART (Specific, Measurable, Achievable, Relevant and Time-bound).

As an example, the AICS Outcome "*Employability rate of Lebanese and Syrian graduates from skills training improved by obtaining gainful employment*" comes with accompanying indicators. However, the first indicator, which measures the increase in the "*% of employability rate of skills training graduates*," is not specific enough. It lacks a clear definition of "*employability rate*," as well as a target percentage to be achieved. Furthermore, there is no specified timeline for achieving this indicator - will it be by the end of the project or after a cohort of trainees finish training?

The second indicator, "*% of obtaining gainful employment of skills training graduates increased*," is also ambiguous. The meaning of "*gainful employment*" (in the formal labour market? decent work?) is unclear, and there is no indication of when the project expects trainees to access employment - will it be at the end of the project or, for example, 6 months after graduation? Finally, the expected percentage of students who will access employment is unknown.

In addition, these indicators present measurement challenges since they rely on robust follow-up procedures by training providers and/or the conduct of a tracer studies to track participants' progress, beyond the duration of the current project. To the evaluator's knowledge these procedures are not in place neither are tracer studies (for the current projects) being conducted.

Under UNICEF Activity 1.1, one indicator simply reads "*# of NGOs supported with coaching, training, etc.*" This indicator is not specific enough as it fails to provide details on the number of NGOs, the type of training or coaching, and the expected outcomes of such training and coaching in terms of enhanced capacities to conduct labour market assessments. This makes it too abstract for an indicator. Another indicator, "*Improved knowledge and skills based on the training provided to the NGOs,*" raises several questions. What does "*improved knowledge*" refer to, and *how much* does the project expect to increase it? Furthermore, what is the expected outcome of this knowledge, and *how should it be applied*? Also, to the evaluator's knowledge there are no mechanisms or procedures in place to measure these dimensions.

There are additional examples to consider, such as under UNICEF Activity 2.1, which includes indicators for measuring progress. However, the first indicator, "*CBT TOT, occupational safety, etc. package is designed and available,*" appears to describe an activity rather than an indicator of achievement.

The second indicator, "*# of organizations and participants trained*", simply reports the number of individuals and organizations participating in the training program. Having organizations and individuals in the same indicator may be confusing (is the project targeting individuals or organizations?). Additionally, the indicator does not offer any insight into the level of knowledge, skills, or competencies that the participants are expected to acquire or enhance and eventually apply in their jobs or operations. Moreover, the number of participants/organizations is not specified. In other words, indicators related to the effectiveness and applicability of the trainings are missing.

Similarly, in the case of the AICS project some of the indicators are also formulated as activities rather than an indicator, this is a measurable value or parameter used to assess progress towards achieving a project expected outcome. For example: "*A referral network for post-training follow up services at the NEO and livelihood sector established*"; "*A staff development plan (SDP) to build the capacity of NEO and career orientation centres at DGT VET staff developed*" or, "*A mapping of post-training providers outside and within livelihood sector conducted*"

Other indicators are imprecise, as they do not specify which group or institutions are being targeted. For example, in the UNICEF project, "*# of trained organizations and participants in capacity building*" and "*# of organizations supported and # of participants trained*" do not provide enough information to determine the specific audience of the project.

Baselines and milestones

Baseline information exists for most AICS indicators, as reflected in the Results Framework, and these baselines describe the situation at the start of the project, which, in principle, should allow for comparison of results. However, this is not the case for the UNICEF project, as baselines were not defined.

However, milestones were not defined for either project. Milestones are commonly intended to provide a clear sense of the timeframe for achieving the identified targets for each indicator, as well as the progress made towards achieving the identified goals.

Data disaggregation

Data is not disaggregated to support performance reporting on areas of special interest for the ILO projects and/or the implementing agencies and the donors. Such areas of interest include, for example, beneficiaries (which are specified in the AICS project indicators but not in UNICEF's) such as NGOs, government agencies, employers, unions, etc. In addition, indicators (in both projects) are not gender-disaggregated.

Means of verification

Means of verification are included in the results frameworks of both projects. However, as mentioned before, there are some shortcomings in the formulation of certain indicators. Some means of verification are considered sufficient for collecting data and information to measure progress and achievement of some of the projects' indicators, such as the "*# of NGOs supported with coaching, training, etc.*" However, as described earlier, the projects did not foresee or implement relevant mechanisms or procedures to collect information and fully measure indicators, such as "*Improved knowledge and skills based on the training provided to the NGOs*" or "*% of obtaining gainful employment of skills training graduates increased*".

Assumptions/risks

Both projects' results frameworks include assumptions, although the UNICEF project only includes them at the output level, not at the key activities level. Overall, these assumptions (UNICEF and AICS') adequately describe the conditions or circumstances that are considered necessary for the projects to succeed. On the other hand, some risks or external factors could not be foreseen when the project was designed, for example the COVID-19 pandemic or the Lebanese economic and institutional crises.

4.2.5. Integration of ILO cross-cutting policy drivers

The ILO's cross-cutting policy drivers were adequately integrated into the design and implementation of both projects.

- International Labour Standards (ILS)

The evaluation found that there is adequate integration of the continuum of International Labour Standards in the ILO projects, particularly in relation to ILO Recommendation 195 (2004) on Human Resources Development. This recommendation serves as a reference for both the UNICEF and AICS projects as it places people at the centre of economic and social development. Furthermore, Recommendation 195 aims to guide governments, employers, and workers in implementing effective education, training, and lifelong learning policies and programs.

- Gender equality and non-discrimination

Overall, both projects prioritized inclusiveness by targeting women, youth and refugees. In addition, the NSF 2018-2022, which was formulated with the support of ILO and UNICEF, aims to create an inclusive TVET system that offers equal opportunities to all, particularly youth, vulnerable populations, women, minorities, and persons with disabilities. However, the projects did not *explicitly* integrate specific and systematized gender equality and non-discrimination *strategies* in their design and implementation.

- *Tripartism and Social Dialogue*

The International Labour Organization is the only UN agency that follows a tripartite structure, which means that it includes representatives from three distinct groups or 'tripartite partners': governments, employers, and workers. The ILO skills projects successfully convened the Lebanese tripartite constituents for social dialogue and consensus building around Technical and Vocational Education and Training. Regarding this issue, key stakeholders consulted widely agree that social dialogue in TVET is crucial for ensuring that the needs of all stakeholders are taken into account, and that relevant policies are effectively implemented. In this context and in order to enhance the TVET system's response to the labour market needs, the ILO fostered social dialogue, collaboration and partnership among public authorities, employers, unions, NGOs, and training institutions. However, some informants opined that the role and participation of ILO Constituents (MOL, employers and unions) should be reinforced in current/future ILO interventions in the TVET sector.

4.3. Project progress and effectiveness

This section aims to provide an overview of the main results achieved; the challenges encountered in the implementation of the ILO skills projects in Lebanon, and the projects' contributions to the ILO Programme & Budget. At the end of the section, the evaluation explores the projects' response to emerging needs in Lebanon, as well as the projects' influence on policies, training procedures, training content, resources, etc.

4.3.1. Main results achieved

UNICEF Project

Output 1: Improved availability and quality of labour market information

The ILO provided extensive capacity building to project partners' through training sessions (2017 to 2019); the Skills Academy Lebanon²⁷ (2020-2021); as well as through coaching and mentoring. In addition, the ILO and partner NGOs conducted seven community-based assessments. Also, four national sectoral labour market studies were conducted by the project in collaboration with the National Employment Office. Moreover UNICEF with the support of the ILO conducted a tracer study targeting graduates from Agriculture Baccalaureate Technique and short-term courses.

Looking at the indicator set for this output, the project proved very effective in producing labour market studies, both at the national/sectorial level and at the local level.

Table 3. Output 1 indicators

Indicators	Targets	Actuals (Jan. 2023)	Targets/Actuals
1.1. At least 3 sectorial nation-wide and 7 local level labour market assessments conducted to identify new occupations in line with labour market skills demand.	3 Sectorial/national studies 7 Local studies	4 sectorial nation-wide labour market studies and 7 local assessments conducted	110%

Source: Project Management

Activity 1.1 Support TVET providers (NGOs and key stakeholders) through training, coaching and follow-up to conduct, analyse and validate LMA at local level

It is not possible to assess effectiveness of this activity based solely on the indicators, as these did not define specific targets. However, based on the information gathered (as reflected below), the evaluator considers that the project was effective in providing training and coaching to private TVET providers in conducting, analysing, and validating labour market assessments (LMA) at the local level.

Table 4. Activity 1.1 indicators

Indicators	Targets	Actuals (Jan. 2023)	Targets/Actuals
# of NGOs supported with coaching, training, etc	Not defined	18 NGOs trained of which 10 NGOs supported with coaching and follow-up	--
Improved knowledge and skills based on the training provided to the NGOs	Not defined	The ILO overall evaluation training courses scored on average 4 on a scale from 0 to 5	--

Source: Project Management

²⁷ Skills Academy Lebanon was a customized online training package for capacity development of stakeholders in the technical and vocational education and training (TVET) sector.

- Capacity building

From 2017 to 2019, over 35 organizations (government institutions, NGOs, UN agencies and others involved in the delivery of technical and vocational training) participated in a tailored training package that was organized in collaboration with the ILO International Training Centre (ITC-ILO) to improve the quality of labour market information. In addition, ITC-ILO organized complementary training in skills anticipation, entrepreneurship, and sectoral approaches to skills development for project partners (for example NGOs, UNICEF).

- Skills Academy - customised, online training package and coaching services

During 2020-2021, the Project, in partnership with the ITC-ILO and with contributions from both AICS and UNICEF, delivered a comprehensive and customised online training package (7 e-learning courses) – *Skills Academy Lebanon*.

A total of 174 participants from 35 organizations registered to Skills Academy across the seven courses. 58% of the registered participants enrolled in at least 1 course (65% women) with an overall 74% completion rate (65% women); and 75 participants completed training across the seven courses (60% women).

- Coaching

In addition, some participants in the Skills Academy were offered three tailor-made coaching and mentoring sessions on 1) *Modern technologies for skills anticipation and matching* (16 participants; 8 men, 8 women); 2) *employers' satisfaction surveys* (15 participants, 7 women, 8 men); and, 3) *career guidance and apprenticeship* (11 participants; 7 women, 4 men).

- 7 community based assessments using the ILO TREE (Training for Rural Economic Empowerment) methodology.

The Project provided training to 44 participants from 16 NGOs (UNICEF partners) in the ILO's *Training for Rural Economic Empowerment* (TREE) methodology. In addition, the project provided technical support to these NGOs related to the implementation of the ILO TREE methodology. As a result, in 2019 UNICEF partners (NGOs) conducted seven community-based assessments in rural regions. Such assessments identify skills gaps and needs and recommend relevant training opportunities for skills development and business improvement.

Activity 1.2 Support NEO in designing and implementing sectorial LMA at the national level

The project proved very effective in designing and implementing sectorial LMA at the national level.

Table 5. Activity 1.2 Indicators

Indicators	Targets	Actuals (Jan. 2023)	Targets/Actuals
At least 3 sectors identified in consultations with key stakeholders and analysed	3 Sectors	7 sectors identified. 4 selected and analysed	133%

Source: Project Management

At the national level, the project partnered with the National Employment Office (NEO) and key project partners (Unions, line ministries, NGOs, INGOs, academia, UN agencies and other development agencies) and in 2018-2019 produced four sectoral labour market studies, respectively in healthcare, public infrastructure and printing and packaging, and in the craft sector (covering 6 sub-sectors).

In view of the dissemination in 2020, results were compiled in briefs summarizing key findings and policy recommendations. In addition, in September 2022, the project finished three updated sectoral briefs, summarising the results of the labour market assessment in the respective sectors, to reflect the impact of the current multifaceted crisis in the country on the surveyed sectors.

Activity 1.3 Support NGOs (VT providers) and NEO in designing and running tracer studies for graduates and employers’ satisfaction surveys.

Although indicator 1.3.1 did not specify targets in terms of the number of NGOs supported for designing and implementing tracer studies, based on the available information, the evaluator considers the project to be effective in this aspect. Furthermore, a tracer study was conducted as planned.

Table 6. Activity 1.3 Indicators

Indicators	Targets	Actuals (Jan. 2023)	Targets/Actuals
1.3.1. # of NGOs & NEO supported for designing and running tracers studies	Not defined	10 NGOs partnering with UNICEF, NEO, DGTVE and UNICEF trained on designing and running tracer studies	--
1.3.2. Tracers studies available	1	1	100%

Source: Project management

The ILO provided technical support and training to UNICEF, 10 partnering NGOs, NEO and DGTVE in designing and conducting tracer studies. As a result, in 2019-20 UNICEF with the support of the ILO conducted a tracer study among graduates from agricultural TVET programmes (please refer to AICS output 2 below for further information). On the other hand, while the project provided coaching in designing employers’ satisfaction surveys, the evaluator couldn’t gather any evidence of such surveys being conducted.

Activity 1.4 Support the analysis, validation and dissemination of labour market assessment findings at local, sectorial, and national levels.

Looking at the indicators, the project proved very effective analysing, validating and disseminating labour market assessment findings at local, sectorial, and national levels

Table 7. Activity 1.6 indicators

Indicators	Targets	Actuals (Jan. 2023)	Targets/Actuals
1.4.1. Labour market assessment on national and community levels conducted & available	3 Sectorial/national studies 7 Local studies	4 national labour market assessments conducted and available out of which 3 are published and available online on the project webpage	110%

		7 local community assessment conducted and available online on the project webpage	
1.4.2. # of validation workshops	One for each study	12 validation workshops (one for each study)	100%

Source: Project management

The project published both the local and sectorial (national) labour market assessments, including the sectoral briefs as described above. In addition, the project elaborated the *Synthesis of the crisis impact on the Lebanese labour market and potential business, employment and training opportunities*²⁸. These reports were shared with local NGOs partnering with UNICEF and ILO, the LCRP livelihoods sector working group and the public at large.

Output 2: Competency-based training programme relevant to labour market demand developed and initiated.

Through capacity building and the development of labour market studies the project established a basis to design and deliver relevant formal and non-formal competency-based training programmes in line with market demands and towards enhanced employability of youth.

The project contributed to build the capacity of project partners on Competency-Based Training (CBT), Work-Based Learning (WBL), Management of Vocational Training Centres (MVTC). Furthermore, in collaboration with NGOs, MOA, MOSA, ALI²⁹, and DGT VET, the project developed competency-based curricula for ten occupations. So far 3 curricula have been validated by DGT VET (ILO and UNICEF are in the process of accrediting the remaining curricula with DGT VET). In addition, these curricula were applied in skills training programmes developed under the ILO Skill-up Project as well as by some UNICEF-Partner NGOs. Moreover, the project implemented a WBL pilot with three UNICEF partners.

In summary, the evaluation concluded that the project was effective in designing and piloting CBT programmes.

Table 8. Output 2 indicators

Indicators	Targets	Actuals (Jan. 2023)	Targets/Actuals
2.1. At least 10 occupation standards identified in demand analysed, updated and/or created	10	14	140%

Source: Project management

Activity 2.1 Design and implement ToT on CBT, OSH, learning methods and assessment and certification of CBT

Although the indicator below did not define targets in terms of the number of organisations and participants trained, the evidence collected by the evaluator suggest that the project was effective in providing training related to competency-based training.

²⁸ https://www.ilo.org/beirut/publications/WCMS_848390/lang--en/index.htm

²⁹ ALI: Association of Lebanese Industrialists

Table 9. Activity 2.1 indicators

Indicators	Targets	Actuals (Jan. 2023)	Targets/Actuals
2.1. CBT TOT, occupational safety, etc. package is designed and available. # of organisations and participants trained	CBT TOT, occupational safety, etc. package delivered	102 participants from 22 organizations trained and certified on CBT CBT and WBL manuals for practitioners developed Code of conduct for employers including OSH developed	100%

Source: Project management

The project delivered a Training of Trainers (ToT) package, complemented with technical and coaching support, to 102 officers from 22 NGOs (Vocational Training providers) in order to strengthen their technical capacity in designing, delivering, monitoring, assessing and certifying CBT programmes.

In addition, the Project, through the Skills Academy offered TVET partners three training courses and demand-based coaching in: 1) Quality apprenticeship/WBL and engagement of social partners in skills development; 2) E-lab on digital TVET; and 3) Career guidance and employment services.

Moreover, the project mainstreamed Occupational Safety and Health (OSH) into the Code of conduct for employers and provided OSH training as part of the training on labour law.

Activity 2.2 Analyse the institutional and management functions of selected training providers and strengthen their capacities

The project conducted the MOA functional review as planned. In addition, although the project did not set targets in terms of the number of participants in capacity building activities, through document review and interviews with key stakeholders, the evaluator concluded that the project was effective in providing training related to the development of quality standards and the management of vocational training centres.

Table 10. Activity 2.2 indicators

Indicators	Targets	Actuals (Jan. 2023)	Targets/Actuals
2.2.1. Functional analysis completed & report available	1	Functional review of MOA developed and submitted	100%
2.2.2. # of trained organisations and participants in capacity building	Not defined	13 officers (8 men, 5 women) from 4 NGOs/private provider and DGTVE trained on development of quality standards 46 officers trained in MVTC 3 officers (1 man, 2 women) from government institution trained on sectoral approach and engagement of private sector in skills governance	--

Source: Project management

In 2017 the Project conducted a functional review for the Education and Extension Service department of the Ministry of Agriculture. The review was completed and validated in by the

MOA in 2018. A final report, containing recommendations and actions for adjustments at the organizational, institutional and individual levels, was submitted to the Ministry in early 2019.

In addition, training on MVTC was organized in June 2018 in collaboration with ILO-ITC. 35 participants (18 Men, 17 women) included Government institutions (DGTVET, NEO, MOSA, NVTC) UNICEF partner NGOs and social partners were trained. Further training on MVTC was provided as part of the Skills Academy to 11 (9 men, 2 women) participants. In addition, a training manual on MVTC is under development by the ILO (according to the project management the manual is expected to be finished by the end of the first quarter of 2023)

Additionally, 13 officers (8 men, 5 women) from 4 NGOs/private providers and DGTVET were trained on development of quality standards. Moreover, at the time of this evaluation, the project, in collaboration of a technical working group formed at the DGTVET was developing quality assurance standards, accreditation, testing and certification processes for TVET providers offering non-formal vocational training. This work builds on a review of the current practices and recommendations conducted under the ILO PROSPECTS and Skill-Up projects.

Furthermore the ILO developed a quality standard self-assessment tool. The tool was (at the time this evaluation was being conducted) being piloted by 4 private TVET providers for finalization and validation by DGTVET. The pilot was completed during the first quarter of 2023. The ILO also provided capacity building to the technical working group and private TVET providers involved in the pilot.

Activity 2.3 Develop a CBT manual for Lebanon and standards, life skills and rights at work

The project elaborated a Regional manual on competency-based training for the Arab States³⁰ as planned.

Table 11. Activity 2.3 indicators

Indicators	Targets	Actuals (Jan. 2023)	Targets/Actuals
CBT manual and standard life skills package is developed and completed	1	CBT including life skills developed and disseminated	100%

Source: Project management

The Manual was disseminated amidst TVET developers, administrators and instructors in the region. In addition (please refer to the AICS key results section below) the ILO delivered training (face-to-face in 2018 and on-line in 2021) on the Lebanese labour law; developed a Mobile App on rights at work; and conducted awareness raising sessions on rights and responsibilities at work (through the ILO Skill-Up Project).

³⁰ https://www.ilo.org/beirut/publications/WCMS_757836/lang-en/index.htm

Activity 2.4 Upgrade selected competency standards involving private sector using the DACUM Approach

The project largely exceeded the target set in terms of the number of competencies updated.

Table 12. Activity 2.4 indicators

Indicators	Targets	Actuals (Jan. 2023)	Targets/Actuals
2.4.1. At least 7 standards of selected competencies upgraded	7	14 competency standards developed/upgraded	200%

Source: Project management

The project, in cooperation with ITC-ILO and the national partners, updated competency standards for ten occupations. These included: Irrigation System Installer; Solar System Technician; Solar System Installer; Ecotourism Local Guide; Elderly home caregiver; Home Appliances Repairer; Dairy producer (in small factories and home-based), machine operator, public water network installer, and green economy (in partnership with UNICEF).

Moreover, the ILO, ITC-ILO and UNICEF in collaboration with MOSA developed four occupational standards for the crafts sector: glass making, pottery, shoemaking, and food processing (mouneh). In addition, in July 2022 the Project agreed with UNICEF to develop an additional occupational standard and curricula for machine operator – an occupation identified in high demand by ALI.

Activity 2.5 Support the design of CBT curricula, training materials and test questions

The project proved very effective in developing CBT curricula and providing training on the Developing a Curriculum (DACUM) and WBL approaches.

Table 13. Activity 2.5 indicators

Indicators	Targets	Actuals (Jan. 2023)	Targets/Actuals
2.5.1. CBT curricula, training materials and test questions are designed and available.	7	10	140%
# of organisations supported and # of participants trained	Not defined	17 organizations (15 NGOs, MOSA, UNICEF) supported and 41 participants trained	--

Source: Project management

In 2020, the Project, delivered a training package on the DACUM approach to 15 participants (9 men, 6 women) from government organisations and NGOs government institutions (DGT VET, NEO, MOA, NVTC, MOSA); NGOs; and UN agencies (UNICEF, ILO, UNRWA). In addition, the ILO provided training to project partners related to WBL and On the Job Training (OJT)

The project, with support from ITC-ILO, completed competency-based curricula for eight occupations including: Food processing - Mouneh (craft), Irrigation System Installer, Solar System Technician, Solar System Installer, Ecotourism Local Guide, Elderly home caregiver, Home Appliances Repairer, Dairy producer (in small factories and home-based).

In addition, since November 2022 the project in collaboration with ALI is developing a competency-based curriculum for machine operator (expected to be completed during the first

quarter of 2023). The ILO also provided technical support to UNICEF in developing curricula in the green economy sector.

So far 3 curricula (food processing, solar system installer, elderly home care) have been validated by DGT VET. As agreed among ILO and UNICEF, the accreditation process of the remaining curricula will be monitored by UNICEF. In addition, according to the project management, 5 NGOs are applying the developed curricula in skills training programmes under the ILO Skill-up Project as well as the ILO-UNICEF-partnership.

Furthermore, in 2020 in close coordination with UNICEF and the Ministry of Labour, the Project developed a code of conduct for employers as well as a tripartite OJT agreement aiming at improving WBL practices among UNICEF partners. In addition, the project elaborated a guide on WBL for NGOs that provide non-formal market-based skills training. This guide aims at standardizing a common approach amidst UNICEF partners and others offering WBL services. Finally, 32 officers (28 women, 17 men) from NGOs and UN agencies received training and coaching on designing and implementing WBL tools and competency-based curricula.

Moreover, the project supported the implementation of a WBL pilot with three UNICEF partners. This involved the development of WBL training materials and assessment tools relevant to three occupations (plumbing for sewage network, irrigation installation, agriculture nursery). It also included providing extensive technical support to 3 NGOs (18 participants) for the implementation of the pilot.

Output 3: Monitoring and Evaluation

The project's Monitoring and Evaluation component includes ILO support to the development of the NSF 2018-2022; its Actions Plans; and the Educational Management Information System (EMIS) for DGT VET; as well as the development of a registry of craft-persons for MOSA.

Table 14. output 3 indicators

Indicators	Targets	Actuals (Jan. 2023)	Targets/Actuals
3.1. Strategy paper and roadmap developed and disseminated	Strategy paper and roadmap developed and disseminated	NSF strategy and roadmap (2018-2022) Education Management Information System to DGTVE (EMIS) 3 National Commitments for Lebanon announced at the High Level Meeting on youth transition NSF new strategy (2023-2027) MOSA strategy for craft sector – prototype registry	100%

Source: Project management

Support to the development of the National TVET Strategic Framework

In 2017 the ILO and UNICEF provided technical assistance to the ministries of Education and Higher Education, Social Affairs, Labour, and Agriculture in the elaboration of the National Strategic Framework for Technical and Vocational Education and Training (2018–2022).

The TVET strategic Framework was the culmination of a year-long collaboration of the project with the four key ministries, social partners, private sector institutions, NGOs and others. The resulting 2018-2022 National Strategic Framework aims to unify national efforts to reform TVET and support the growth of decent jobs in the Lebanese economy³¹. The European Union, the European Training Foundation, the GIZ and the IECD also provided contributions and inputs to the NSF 2018-2022. In addition, building on the NSF and with ILO/UNICEF support action plans for the implementation of the NSF for each of the five Government institutions was developed.

Educational Management Information System

The ILO provided technical assistance to develop an Educational Management Information System (EMIS) system that was piloted in 35 DGTVET schools. However, as result of the economic crisis in the country, the EMIS implementation was deferred, as DGTVET wasn't able to secure appropriate infrastructure to host and roll-out the system in TVET schools. The provision of necessary infrastructure equipment is under negotiation between DGTVET and UNICEF. According to the project team the EMIS will be transferred to UNICEF upon project completion.

Registry for crafts persons with MOSA

In 2021, the project collaborated with UNICEF and the ITC-ILO to start developing a registry for craftspeople. However, progress was hindered by the Ministry's limited responsiveness, as it was occupied with addressing social needs arising from the economic crisis. Although work resumed in June 2022, it was put on hold again when the Director General was replaced. As a result, the ILO and UNICEF decided in November 2022 that the ILO would supply a prototype registry and submit it to UNICEF for follow-up action. The ILO delivered the prototype to UNICEF in January 2023.

³¹ Source: ILO: https://www.ilo.org/beirut/media-centre/news/WCMS_633480/lang--en/index.htm

Output 1: Improved institutional capacities for the provision of post-training services for Lebanese and refugee graduates from accelerated skills training.

The project contributed to improve the institutional capacities for the provision of post-training services to vocational training graduates. In this regard, the ILO provided training and coaching to NGOs that offer skills training and post-training services, as well as training on career guidance (through the Skills Academy) to NEO, DGT VET and IECD career guidance centres, NGOs, UN agencies, and trade unions. In addition, the project elaborated a proposal for the reform of the NEO, conducted a review of the existing referral mechanism in the TVET sector and developed a mapping of training and post training service providers and a blueprint for an improved referral system. Moreover, the project conducted awareness rising sessions on rights and responsibilities at work for vocational training graduates; developed an online training programme on the Lebanese labour law to NGOs and VT trainees; and created a Mobile App on rights at work.

The level of achievement of the targets defined by the indicators associated with Output 1 is satisfactory. In the case of indicator number 1.2, the results exceeded the targets set, as shown in the following table.

Table 15. Output 1 indicators

Indicators	Targets	Actuals (Jan. 2023)	Targets/Actuals
1.1. A framework for referral network of post-training follow up services designed	1	Framework designed	100%
1.2. Capacity of # staff of NEO, DG-TVET and NGOs on post-training services, career guidance and labour market need assessment enhanced	40	55	125%

Source: Project Management

1.1. Train and coach NGOs providing skills training and post-training services

ILO/ITC developed a coaching and mentoring plan to support the NGOs' staff for the delivery of post training services. However, as shown in the table below, the number of NGO staff trained by the project is below the set target.

Table 16. Activity 1.1 indicators

Indicators	Targets	Actuals (Jan. 2023)	Targets/Actuals
1.1.1. Coaching and mentoring plan to support the NGOs' staff for the delivery of post training services developed	1	1	100%
1.1.2. # of staff of # NGOs on post-training follow-up services trained, coached and mentored	20	11	55%

Source: Project Management

Eleven participants (7 women, 4 men) received coaching on career guidance, employment and job placement, and apprenticeship. However, as explained by the project management team, the training on referral to self-employment opportunities was delayed and has not yet been conducted. This delay explains why the target has not been fully achieved yet.

1.2. Support staff capacity development of National Employment Office (NEO) and the career guidance centres of public technical schools in the provision of employment services

Looking at the indicators, the project proved very effective in providing training on career guidance and employment services to NEO, DGTVET, IECD, UN Agencies and NGOs.

Table 17. Activity 1.2 indicators

Indicators	Targets	Actuals (Jan. 2023)	Targets/Actuals
1.2.1. A staff development plan (SDP) to build the capacity of NEO and career orientation centers at DGTVET staff developed	1	1	100%
1.2.2. # of staff of NEO and DGTVET and other stakeholders (NGOs) trained on career guidance and employment services	25	41	164%

Source: Project Management

The ILO, in coordination with MOL, NEO, DGTVET, and the IECD identified capacity needs of the staff in relevant departments/centres and delivered a capacity development programme on career guidance as part of the Skills Academy.

A total of 41 participants (28 women, 13 men) completed the Skills Academy course on career guidance. This included 16 staff from NEO and 9 staff from DGTVET and IECD career guidance centres. The remaining participants included staff from NGOs, UN agencies, and trade unions.

1.3.: Set up a referral network to post-training follow-up services for skills training graduates

The project developed a mapping of training and post-training service providers and designed a blueprint for a referral system.

Table 18. Activity 1.3 indicators

Indicators	Targets	Actuals (Jan. 2023)	Targets/Actuals
1.3.1. A mapping of post-training service providers conducted	1	1	100%
1.3.2. Toolkit for referrals customized	1	1	100%
1.3.3. # of consultation meetings to reform NEO	4	4	100%

Source: Project Management

In addition, in 2020 the Project, in coordination with MOL and NEO, developed a proposal for the reform of the National Employment Office. NEO is by law the only organization mandated to provide employment services to Lebanese job seekers. However, due to its lack of capacity and outreach, many NGOs are already partially providing these services to students seeking employment.

Under the proposed reform, NEO would take on a supervisory role for employment services in the country. This would enable other entities, including NGOs, to offer employment services under the oversight of NEO. This proposal was submitted to the Council of Ministries in 2021. However, due to the frequent changes in government and government staff over the recent years, the reform has not been approved yet.

However, in mid-May 2022, the Cabinet approved the Ministry of Labour's action plan (2022-2025) which aims at enhancing employment and job opportunities as well as at improving TVET quality. The action plan also contains specific interventions aimed at improving NEO services. Furthermore, additional assistance for NEO reform and improved services is being contemplated in a new ILO EU-funded project on job and livelihood opportunities.

In parallel the ILO also coordinated with the LCRP livelihoods sector to review the existing referral mechanism in the TVET sector, the *Referral Information Management System (RIMS)*³². In addition, the project conducted an extensive mapping of existing post-training services. Moreover, in 2020 as part of the project, the guide “*Towards a referral network for training and post-training support services: A mapping of training and post training service providers*” was published by the ILO in 2022. This mapping provides a roadmap of current employment and skills provision services in the country to help local organizations navigate and maximise support offered to vulnerable groups. In the longer term, it aims to develop a comprehensive, cross-sector referral services network to further facilitate partnership and collaboration among training and post-training service providers³³.

1.4.: Raise awareness of training graduates on their rights and responsibilities as workers as well as other relevant provision of the Lebanese labour law such as occupations available to them.

The project proved effective in elaborating training materials on the Lebanese Labour Law, as well as in providing orientation and awareness-raising among NGO officers and TVET trainees. However, the number of students reached by the project was lower than expected

Table 19. Activity 1.4 indicators

Indicators	Targets	Actuals (Jan. 2023)	Targets/Actuals
1.4.1. A guide on labour law regulations updated and online user-friendly information developed	1	App launched in February 2023. Guide on labour laws in English and Arabic developed	100%
1.4.2. # of officers from NGOS and skills training graduates received online orientation program on right and responsibilities at work as per Lebanese labour law	500 graduates 30 officers	237 graduates 69 (23 officers and 46 trainees)	47,7% 230%

Source: Project Management

In 2021 the ILO conducted awareness rising sessions on rights and responsibilities at work in collaboration with the “Skill-up” project, in which 73 skills training graduates (47 women, 26 men) participated. In addition, the ILO delivered an online training programme on the Lebanese labour law to 69 NGOs officers and TVET trainees (43 women, 26 men). In addition, so far 237 graduates (26% of women; 10% of refugees) benefited from orientation/awareness sessions on rights at work delivered by ILO with support from an implementing partner (using Norway Project funds)

³² The RIMS was developed by Danish Refugee Council (DRC) Lebanon in response to the need for more accountable, timely and effective multi-sector referral processes

³³ Source: Towards a referral network for training and post-training support services: A mapping of training and post training service providers. International Labour Organization, 2022. https://www.ilo.org/beirut/publications/WCMS_861815/lang-en/index.htm

Moreover, in collaboration with the MOL, ALI, the National Federation of Worker and Employee Trade Unions in Lebanon (FENASOL) and the General Confederation of Lebanese Workers (CGTL), the project developed a Web/Mobile App on rights at work³⁴. The App contains: 1) a user-friendly guide on rights at work, 2) an online training programme covering various regulations related to the labour law (such as employment contracts, rights and responsibilities at work, benefits from national social security fund, protection measures and means, etc.), and 3) frequently-asked questions related to key aspects of the labour law and other employment related regulations.

Output 2: Improved institutional capacities to design market responsive skills training for Lebanese and refugees

This output complements the UNICEF project activities related to capacity building, labour market studies, and development of competency-based programmes (please refer to the previous section detailing the key results achieved under the UNICEF project).

As reflected in the table below, the targets set for both, the training activities and the design of competency-based programmes were largely surpassed.

Table 20. Output 2 indicators

Indicators	Targets	Actuals (Jan. 2023)	Targets/Actuals
2.1. Capacity of # Staff of skills development service providers for the design of market-based skills training courses improved	20	35	175%
2.2. # of competency-based market-driven skills training program designed	5	10	200%

Source: Project management

In addition, in February 2022, the ILO initiated collaboration with ALI to identify occupations in demand and potential training opportunities in targeted, strategic sectors, to better understand labour market dynamics as well as skills demands and skilling needs in Lebanon. An implementation agreement with ALI was signed in October 2022 to support the assessment of labour market needs in selected sectors and other activities aiming to strengthen the linkages between training institutes and employers and standardize operating procedures in skills training delivery.

Moreover, the ILO and ALI developed an on-line skills anticipation questionnaire for regular anticipation of labour market needs. The questionnaire has been tested in the plastic sector and a survey report was produced. The ILO and ALI updated the questionnaire for 5 new sectors. According to the project management, analysis will take place in the second quarter of 2023 (independently from the current project as it ended on March 31, 2023).

Also, as part of the abovementioned implementation agreement, ALI and ILO are working together to: a) finalize a Memorandum of Understanding between ALI and the Ministry of Education for collaboration and cooperation on quality and market relevant TVET education in agro-food processing; b) support setting up quality assurance standards including testing and certification process for TVET providers offering non-formal vocational training; and c) support

³⁴ See: www.houkouki-fi-al-3amal.com

the development of occupational standards as well as competency-based curricula for machine operator. These activities were completed during the first quarter of 2023.

2.1.: NGOs providing skills training receive coaching and mentoring on issues related to modalities for skills training, labour market assessments and competency-based curricula development.

Based on the indicators below, the project proved effective in providing training, coaching and mentoring on labour market assessments and competency-based curricula development.

Table 21. Activity 2.1 indicators

Indicators	Targets	Actuals (Jan. 2023)	Targets/Actuals
2.1.1. # of NGOs' staff and other stakeholders trained and coached on Labour Market Assessment	25	29	116%
2.1.2. # of NGOs' staff and other stakeholders trained and coached on the development of Competency-Based Training (CBT)	25	47	188%

Source: Project management

This activity was jointly conducted with the UNICEF Project. The ILO, in close collaboration with ITC, provided training and coaching and mentoring sessions, on labour market assessments and competency-based curricula development to NGOs that are implementing skills training projects. In addition, NGO officers, in-company trainers, and instructors benefited from training and coaching on designing competency-based and work-based training programmes.

Twenty-nine participants (17 women, 12 men) were trained on labour market assessments. Coaching sessions included 16 participants (8 men, 8 women) on modern technologies for skills anticipation and matching, and 15 participants (7 women, 8 men) on the elaboration of employers' satisfaction surveys.

In addition, 47 NGO staff and other stakeholders (27 women, 20 men) participated in training on various subjects. Of these, 28 (19 women, 9 men) received training on quality apprenticeship and engaging social partners in skills development; 27 (11 women, 16 men) were trained on digital competency-based training; and 16 (7 men, 9 women) NGO officers, in-company trainers, and instructors participated in training and coaching sessions on designing competency-based and work-based training programmes.

Moreover, in order to enhance the quality and relevance of skills training provided by NGOs, the ILO through its Skill-Up project and the UNICEF project is supporting DGT VET to improve the current quality assurance system and the accreditation process for TVET private providers that currently provide non-formal vocational training as well as to improve the testing and certification practices by TVET private providers in Lebanon. In addition, the ILO provided training and guidance to relevant stakeholders including DGT VET, private sector (ALI), and NGOs delivering skills training.

2.2.: Conduct a tracer study on the graduates from skills training funded by AICS in 2018

As expected, the project delivered a tracer study on the graduates from skills training funded by AICS in 2018

Table 22. Activity 2.2 indicators

Indicators	Targets	Actuals (Jan. 2023)	Targets/Actuals
2.2.1. A tracer study on the graduates from 2018 skills training programs under AICS funded project conducted	1 tracer report	1	100%

Source: Project management

In 2018 AICS funded the implementation of a one-year programme to improve access to employment opportunities for Lebanese and refugee graduates. The *accelerated skills training programmes* consisted of theoretical and practical courses combined with paid internship within private companies, cooperatives and local public institutions. The ILO provided support to programme stakeholders through capacity building and guidance on non-formal market-based skills training. A total of 1,436 vulnerable persons living in Lebanon received a certificate after completing the training and internship.

Two years after the finalization of the project, the ILO conducted a tracer study aiming at assessing the outcomes of the vocational training programme in terms of graduates' appreciation of the training, employment and income trajectories, relevance between skills learned and jobs obtained, and, more generally, the enabling and disabling factors to participation in the labour market among the population of graduates³⁵.

The study was disseminated through the ILO's website³⁶ and shared with the LCRP livelihoods sector working group in May 2022. The study was also presented to international development agencies members of the Skills Development Working Group.

2.3.: Contribute to improving the market relevance of skills training implemented by NGOs as part of the Lebanon Crisis Response Plan.

The project achieved the targets set under the indicators as planned.

Table 23. Activity 2.3 indicators

Indicators	Targets	Actuals (Jan. 2023)	Targets/Actuals
2.3.1. Guidance on occupations in demand based on at least 3 sectors surveyed by ILO provided to LCRP partners and other NGOs	At least one guidance note on occupations in demand	1 sector surveyed/ 1 guidance note	100%
2.3.2. # of workshops to establish collaboration between private sector (ALI, CCIA, and others) and support to LCRP LWP conducted.	At least 2 workshops	2 workshops	100%

Source: Project management

³⁵ Source: Improved access to employment opportunities for Lebanese and refugee graduates from skills training project tracer study of graduates: AICS-supported skills training programmes. International Labour Organization, 2022.

³⁶ https://www.ilo.org/beirut/publications/WCMS_846546/lang--en/index.htm

The ILO developed labour market assessments at the national and local levels (please refer to the previous section detailing the key results achieved under the UNICEF project) that provide an overview of sectors and workforce affected by the multifaceted crisis in the country with recommendations on potential business and training opportunities in response to the crisis.

With support from the joint ILO-UNICEF programme, the ILO also completed updating three sector studies in healthcare, printing and packaging, and public infrastructure, in September 2022. In addition, the project elaborated a consolidated report³⁷ on findings of these sector studies which the project team expects to publish and disseminate during the first quarter of 2023.

Moreover, the ILO compiled skill practices and lessons that were shared by the NGOs participating in the Skills Academy, as well as from pilot initiatives on market-based skills training that were implemented by a group of NGOs in partnership with the ILO and UNICEF. These inputs served as the basis to develop a guide on workplace-based learning³⁸ to further guide NGOs in designing market relevant programme and ensure private sector engagement in these activities.

4.3.2. Unintended results

By conducting document review and interviews with key stakeholders, the evaluator was able to identify (positive) unintended results that arose from the ILO skills projects (both UNICEF and AICS).

Skills Development Working Group

In 2021 ILO, UNICEF, and the World Bank initiated the Skills Development Working Group, bringing together key development partners in Lebanon (such as the EU, KFW, USAID, AFD, IECD, ETF and GIZ) to promote interagency coordination in skills development. The SDWG plays a critical role in addressing some of the key challenges in the skills development agenda in Lebanon, including issues around equity and access, quality, relevance, and efficiency. As such, the SDWG serves as a platform to coordinate strategic investments; to provide support in knowledge management; as well as strategic guidance on skills development to the Government of Lebanon and civil society actors.

National Strategic Framework 2023-2030

In 2022 the ILO and UNICEF, in collaboration with GIZ coordinated with DGT VET to update the NSF for 2023-2027. The review process took into consideration the priority emergency needs of DGT VET for the short term and the development goals for the medium-long term. A working group was formed in April 2022, involving DGT VET, UNICEF, ILO, GIZ, and IECD and has been meeting on a weekly basis since then. Consultation meetings were held with various stakeholders to collect inputs. A draft proposal for the NSF 2023-2027 was prepared and is currently (March 2023) being reviewed by the DGT VET.

³⁷ [Community-based Market Assessment for Skills Development and Economic Empowerment - Summary Report \(ilo.org\)](https://www.ilo.org/public/lebanon/working-groups/skills-development-working-group/summary-report)

³⁸ <https://www.unicef.org/lebanon/reports/work-based-learning-technical-and-vocational-education-and-training>

MENA Regional High-Level Meeting on Young People

In addition, the ILO, jointly with UNICEF, UNDP, and UNFPA, brought together key national stakeholders (including representatives of the Prime Minister, Ministry of Education and Higher Education, Ministry of Youth and Sports, Ministry of Labour, Ministry of Agriculture, Association of Lebanese Industrialists, and the General Confederation of Lebanese Trade Unions, and supported their collaboration and engagement in the MENA Regional High-Level Meeting on Young People's Learning, Skilling, Social Inclusion and Transition to Decent Work (May 2022).

As a result, government representatives made a series of "national commitments" to address learning bottlenecks in the decent work transition in Lebanon, through a participatory and consultative process with the UN agencies. The four UN agencies (ILO, UNICEF, UNDP, and UNFPA) will follow-up and support the Government in implementing these commitments.

4.3.2. Main Challenges

Document review and interviews with key stakeholders and the Project team have confirmed that several internal and external factors have negatively affected the implementation of the Skills projects.

The projects faced with multiple external challenges beyond their control, but which affected and disrupted the projects implementation. Since October 2019, Lebanon's economic, social and security situation has rapidly deteriorated. Lebanon is currently facing a "triple crisis" caused by the economic meltdown, the global COVID-19 pandemic and the Beirut blast on August 4th 2022, which devastated the capital³⁹.

The COVID-19 pandemic and the socio-political crisis in the country also provoked an important shift in focus amongst project partners, including line Ministries, as well as Workers and Employers' organizations, towards more immediate and pressing priorities, to sustain the country's economic stability and mitigate the negative impact on businesses and workers. Furthermore, following changes in Ministries and relevant management positions due to the 2019 and 2022 elections, the project team had to engage new Ministers and their advisory teams and seek endorsement for the ongoing project work.

These factors combined created an exceptionally challenging context for the project implementation, and contributed to delays in several activities, particularly workshops, meetings, consultations and field-work. This in turn led to the delayed delivery of capacity building activities, or, for example the development and dissemination of local and sector/national assessments and the development of CBT curricula.

A significant internal factor that caused additional challenges for the project management and implementation was the *insufficient human capacity to undertake the set activities. This was caused by the cost-effectiveness strategy adopted by the project, which had led to sharing of several*

³⁹ Synthesis of the crisis impact on the Lebanese labour market and potential business, employment and training opportunities. ILO/UNICEF (undated)

positions, such as the Chief Technical Advisor (CTA), National Project Coordinator (NPC) and Administrative Assistant (AA), with two other projects⁴⁰.

In addition, between 2017 and 2021, the project was subsequently headed by four different CTAs, all of them resigning after relatively short periods of time. In the same period the project subsequently hired two SDOs, each of them resigning after a year of contribution to the project

Since September 2021 (but also during previous prolonged periods of time in between changes in management) the project management duties have been assumed *de facto* by the Project's National Officer, with the support of an administrative assistant. This has negatively impacted the already overworked project staff and contributed further to delays in project implementation.

Nevertheless, through interviews and document review the evaluator learned that the ILO projects demonstrated a significant level of flexibility to adapt to the highly challenging implementation context. The project management adopted several measures to address these challenges and managed to minimize their (negative) impact on project implementation. Examples of such measures are:

- Backstopping project staff through internal technical support: Due to the afore mentioned challenges and gaps in project staffing, the ILO Senior Skills and Employability Specialist of the Decent Work Team at the Regional Office; the ILO HQ Skills and Employability Branch staff; and the ILO/ITC Skills Development/TVET Programme Officer stepped up to provide extensive technical support to backstop the National Project Officer. This implied a significant effort and time investment by ILO specialists in supporting the planning and technical oversight of several project activities.
- Close collaboration with UNICEF and other stakeholders for creating a shared understanding of the project's constraints, and for developing alternative plans when required by the rapidly changing circumstances. The project management worked closely with UNICEF and stakeholders, to ensure the continuity of project interventions, as well to respond to the project partners needs in a timely manner.
- Building on existing UN partnerships to expedite engagement and collaboration with the project. For instance, UNICEF, ILO, and FAO collaborated to finalize the MOA's action plan concerning the NSF. Moreover, UNICEF and ILO jointly developed the EMIS with DGTVE, and supported the development of curricula. They also made combined efforts to ensure MOSA's active involvement in the craft sector related activities of the projects. Additionally, the ILO closely worked with UNICEF and the Ministry of Labour to design and implement the code of conduct for employers and the OJT agreement.
- Considering alternative training solutions to meet both the planned and newly emerging capacity development needs: the ILO/ITC provided technical assistance to ensure that the trainings were carried out to make up for the delays in 2019. In 2020, the project aimed to expand its outreach to gain support from the ITC in acquiring key expertise for relevant training and technical assistance, especially for the coaching and pilot of WBL related activities. ILO/ITC also provided technical support in developing occupational standards and competency-based curricula, the creation of a registry for crafts-persons, and the establishment of the Skills Academy Lebanon to enhance the capacity of partners in the TVET

⁴⁰ Independent cluster evaluation of improved and market-based provision of vocational training for Lebanese citizens and refugees. 2018

sector.

- Adapting methodologies and activities in particular for the elaboration of labour market assessments, which was necessary in order to comply with COVID 19 restrictions and lockdown measures. In addition, in the context of the pandemic, the project adopted alternative on-line training solutions.
- The project proposed revised work plans and prioritized activities, along with the re-allocation of funds, to address the delays while ensuring that the project objectives and partners' needs were met.

4.3.3. Synergies with and operation through local organizations

According to interviews conducted with key stakeholders and NGOs, synergies with and operation through local organizations played an important role in contributing to the sustainability of ILO skills projects in Lebanon. Here are some ways in which this happened:

- a) Local ownership: by involving local organizations in the design and implementation of labour market studies, competency-based programmes or work-based learning initiatives, they developed a sense of ownership and responsibility for the project's success. In turn, this increased their motivation to sustain the projects' results.
- b) Increased community engagement: Partnering with local organizations helped the ILO to build stronger relationships with the local communities. This contributed to ensure that TVET programs were well-received and supported by local stakeholders.
- c) Local expertise: Local organizations brought their own expertise and skills to the ILO projects, which complemented the ILO's technical capacity. This resulted in more effective and efficient project implementation and enhanced the project's overall sustainability.
- d) Capacity building: Through capacity building to local organizations, the ILO strengthened the capacity of these organizations. This contributed to strengthen the TVET ecosystem in Lebanon, with local organizations taking on a greater role in delivering and sustaining skills development and thus, contributing to its sustainability

4.3.4. Contributions to the ILO Programme & Budget

According to the document review and interviews with key stakeholders, the Skills projects in Lebanon contribute to the ILO P&B Outcome 5: *Skills and lifelong learning to facilitate access to and transitions in the labour market*. In particular to Output 5.1 *Increased capacity of the ILO constituents to identify current skills mismatches and anticipate future skill needs* and output 5.3. *Increased capacity of the ILO constituents to design and deliver innovative, flexible and inclusive learning options, encompassing work-based learning and quality apprenticeships*.

The skills projects made significant contributions to enhancing the capacity of ILO constituents in improving the relevance and quality of TVET programs in Lebanon (output 5.1.), particularly, in areas such as skills anticipation, competency-based training, and work-based learning.

Also, through the Skills Academy the skills projects contributed to reinforce the capacities of the project partners in the areas of work-based learning and apprenticeships. Moreover, the skills

projects engaged with the private sector to promote quality work-based learning and apprenticeship opportunities (output 5.3)

4.3.5. *Projects' response to emerging needs in the context of COVID-19 pandemic and in regards of the ongoing financial crisis and political uncertainty in the country*

The ILO's skills projects made some valuable contributions in addressing the emerging challenges posed by the COVID-19 pandemic as well as the ongoing financial crisis and political uncertainty in the country.

For example, the ILO played a significant role in the development of the NSF 2018-2022, and is currently supporting the drafting of the NSF for 2023-2030. These frameworks serve as crucial policy instruments that can enhance the quality and relevance of TVET in Lebanon, (potentially) leading to increased employment opportunities for young people, as well as a stronger labour market and overall national economy. Furthermore, the ILO contributed to ensure the NSF's alignment with the necessities of the COVID-19 context.

Additionally, the ILO-UNICEF project elaborated the *Synthesis of the crisis impact on the Lebanese labour market and potential business, employment and training opportunities*. This report presents an overview of the sectors and workers impacted by the multiple crises in Lebanon in addition to a synthesis of the potential business and training opportunities that are recommended in response to this crisis. The publication builds onto the afore-mentioned project-supported sectoral studies (healthcare, public infrastructure, printing and packaging, and craft) and the *ILO Rapid Diagnostic Assessment of Employment Impacts under COVID-19 in Lebanon*⁴¹. In addition, the ILO-UNICEF project and the ILO Skill-up project developed training programmes in elderly home care giving, including post-COVID-19 care; food processing; and solar energy system installer.

Also, to answer the MEHE's request for assistance in supporting the mechanical skills training sector in Lebanon, the ILO, through the PROSPECTS and Skill-up projects, equipped six TVET schools with solar energy systems. This effort aimed to enable the institutions to remain operational and offered training to their students on solar panel installation and maintenance (using the curriculum developed under the ILO-UNICEF project). The initiative also aimed to improve their skills and employment prospects, amidst the multifaceted crisis faced by the nation.

4.3.6. *Projects' influence in policies, training procedures, training content, resources, etc.*

The ILO Skills projects have made valuable contributions to policy development, the improvement and harmonization of training contents and procedures, and the coordination of strategic investments in the TVET sector.

At the policy level, the ILO played a key role in the development of both the NSF 2018-2022 and the (draft) NSF 2023-2030. In addition, the ILO developed a proposal for the reform of the National Employment Office. Furthermore, the ILO conducted a functional review for the Education and Extension Service department of the Ministry of Agriculture.

⁴¹ ILO Rapid Diagnostic Assessment of Employment Impacts under COVID-19 in Lebanon
https://www.ilo.org/emppolicy/pubs/WCMS_754666/lang-en/index.htm

The NSFs are designed to improve the quality and relevance of TVET programs in Lebanon, which, in turn, have the potential to increase the skills and employability of the workforce and support economic growth. In addition, if the NEO reform is successfully implemented, it could enhance employment services and improve coordination with other service providers, including NGOs. Moreover, the final report resulting from the MOA-EES review was used by the Ministry of Agriculture and FAO to inform the development of the MOA's Lebanon National Agriculture Strategy (NAS) for 2020-2025.

As for the training content and procedures, the projects provided extensive training, coaching and mentoring to a wide range of TVET stakeholders, for example, on labour market assessments and competency-based curricula development. As a result, in collaboration with NEO and UNICEF partner NGOs, the ILO was able to produce several local and national/sectoral Labour Market Assessments. These studies served to inform the development of 10 CBT Programmes.

According to the project management and from interviews with NGO representatives, the evaluation found that several NGO's (UNICEF partners) adopted the CBT approach in their trainings. In addition, the ILO is in the process of developing quality assurance standards, accreditation, testing and certification processes for TVET providers offering non-formal vocational training.

The project also promoted the harmonization of approaches in designing and implementing work-based learning programs. Additionally, through capacity building and engagement with the private sector, the ILO contributed to strengthening the capacities of several School Advisory Boards in the management of vocational training centres.

Moreover, through both the UNICEF and the AICS Project, the ILO is establishing a referral network to further facilitate partnership and collaboration among training and post-training service providers.

Finally, the SDWG, established by the ILO, UNICEF and the World Bank, provides strategic guidance on skills development and facilitates the coordination of strategic investments by development partners in the TVET sector.

4.3. Efficiency

4.3.1. Allocation of resources

The total budget of the UNICEF Project (including addenda) amounts to 3,082,202,98 USD. As detailed in the table below, by April 2023, the project had executed or had committed 3,051,129.10 USD. Also in April 2023, the AICS project had either executed or committed a total of 573,098.29 USD from the project's overall budget of 583,653.75 USD, as outlined in the table below.

From document review and interviews with key stakeholders, the evaluator concluded that these amounts correspond to the actual execution of the activities and the confirmed achievement of the expected products under both projects (as detailed in the Effectiveness section).

Table 24. UNICEF-AICS budget and expenses

UNICEF – AICS Projects: Budget and expenses (in USD) 04 April 2023				
Project	Budget	Actuals	Encumbrances	Balances
UNICEF	3,082,202.98	3,012,860.38	41,234.04	31,073.88
AICS	583,653.75	549,597.75	23,500.54	10,555.46

Source: Project Management

The tables below detail the expenses per project (outputs/activities). From the cross - analysis of the effectiveness and the financial information provided by the project management, the evaluation deduced that the level of budget execution (broken down by outputs and activities) is consistent with the initial allocation of resources and with the results achieved. In this regard, the evaluation concludes that there was an efficient use of financial resources.

Table 25. UNICEF project budget and expenses

UNICEF Project: Budget and expenses (in USD) 04 April 2023				
Outputs/activities	Budget	Actuals	Encumbrances	Balances
Output 1: Improved availability and quality of labour market information	587,911.21	586,002.79	1,908.40	0.02
Activity 1.1: support NGOs (VT providers) through training, coaching & follow-up to conduct, analyse & validate LM assessment at local level	155,036.85	154,128.45	908.40	0.00
Activity 1.2: support NEO in designing and implementing sectorial labour market assessments at the national level	210,099.98	210,099.98	0.00	0.00
Activity 1.3: support NGOs (VT providers) and NEO in designing and running tracer studies for graduates and employers satisfaction surveys	10,842.06	10,842.06	0.00	0.00
Activity 1.4: support the analysis, validation & dissemination of labour market assessment findings at local, sectorial, and national levels	211,932.32	210,932.30	1,000.00	0.02
Output 2: Competency based training programmes relevant to labour market demand developed and initiated	564,296.33	539,157.18	23,841.85	1,297.30
Activity 2.1: Design and implement ToT on CBT, occupational safety and health, learning methods and assessment and certification of CBT	177,685.02	170,606.61	7,078.41	0.00
Activity 2.2: Analyse the institutional and	130,660.36	124,360.36	6,300.00	0.00

management functions of selected training providers and strengthen capacities				
Activity 2.3: Develop a CBT manual for Lebanon and standard life skills and rights @ work	22,750.00	22,750.00	0.00	0.00
Activity 2.4: upgrade selected competency standards involving private sector using DACUM approach	108,170.55	102,488.08	4,913.44	769.03
Activity 2.5: support the design of CBT curricula, training materials and test questions	125,030.40	118,952.13	5,550.00	528.27
Activity 2.6: explore possible international accreditation of CBT in construction	0	0	0	0
Output 3: Baseline: TVET mapping, strategy & roadmap	342,122.73	333,032.08	4,550.00	4540.65
Financial Administration, Operating Costs and M&E	1,359,489.51	1,350,038.38	10,933.79	1,482.67
Programme Support Costs and Provision for Cost Increase	228,383.19	204,629.95	0.00	23,753.24
TOTALS	3,082,202.97	3,012,860.38	41,234.04	31,073.88

Source: Project Management

In addition, budget execution rates were good; reported at nearly 100% (to both the UNICEF and the AICS projects) by early April 2023 which is considerable in view of the many challenges that the project has faced.

Table 26. AICS project budget and expenses

AICS Project: Budget and expenses (in USD) 04 April 2023				
Outputs/activities	Budget	Actuals	Encumbrances	Balances
Output 1. Improved Institutional Capacities for the provision of post-training services for Lebanese and Refugee graduates from accelerated skills training	214,220.14	208,874.41	0.00	5,345.73
1.1 Train and coach NGOs providing skills training in post-training services	103,701.37	98,355.64	0.00	5,345.73
1.2 Support staff capacity development of National Employment Office (NEO) and the career guidance centres of public technical schools in the provision of employment services	38,349.42	38,349.42	0.00	0.00
1.3. Set up a referral network to post-training follow-up services for skills training graduates	35,100.00	35,100.00	0.00	0.00
1.4. Raise awareness of training graduates on their rights and responsibilities as workers as well as other relevant provision of the Lebanese labour law	37,069.35	37,069.35	0.00	0.00
Output 2. Improved institutional capacities for the design of market-based skills training for Lebanese and refugees.	171,362.74	170,020.70	210.00	1,132.04
2.1. NGOs providing skills training receive coaching and mentoring in issues relating to modalities for skills training, labour market assessments (LMA) and competency-based curricula development	91,114.59	89,772.55	210.00	1,132.04
2.2. Conduct a tracer study on the graduates from skills training funded by AICS in 2018	40,248.15	40,248.15	0.00	0.00
2.3. Contribute to improving the market relevance of skills training implemented by	40.000	40.000	0	0

NGOs as part of the Lebanon Crisis Response Plan (LCRP)				
Financial Administration, Operating Costs and M&E	130,924.06	107,474.56	23,290.54	158.96
Programme Support Costs and Provision for Cost Increase	67,146.81	63,228.08	0.00	3,918.73
TOTALS	583,653.75	549,597.75	23,500.54	10,555.46

Source: Project Management

Regarding the human resources allocated to the projects, the funding of key positions such as the Chief Technical Advisor, the National Project Coordinator and the Administrative Assistant was shared with two other projects, which reduced the personnel costs.

4.3.2. Complementarities with other projects

From document review and interviews with key stakeholders, the evaluation found that synergies among the Projects and also with other ILO on-going initiatives (e.g. Skill-up, PROSPECTS, FAO project) contributed to reduce the staff and administrative costs, which in turn contributed to improve the project's efficiency.

4.3.3. Resources mobilization

Regarding the projects' role in resource mobilization from interviews with the project management the evaluator learned that the Skill-up Project (phase III) funded by Norway, as well as a new EU funded project on job and livelihood opportunities build on and provide continuity to the UNICEF/AICS projects.

The terms of reference also require the evaluation to identify ways in which the ILO can improve its resource mobilization strategies, taking into account the country's specific circumstances. According to several testimonies, resource mobilization is becoming a challenge in Lebanon, as there are not at present many donors willing to invest in the current context of instability. In addition, improving resource mobilization strategies can be a complex task that requires a detailed understanding of the local context and the specific challenges faced by the ILO in Lebanon. Here are some potential strategies that emerged from interviews with key stakeholders:

- Engage in more strategic partnerships: The ILO could collaborate with key stakeholders, such as local NGOs, and private sector organizations, to develop joint initiatives and leverage resources.
- Diversify funding sources: The ILO could explore alternative funding sources beyond traditional donors. For example, South-Korea, Canada, Australia and the Persian Gulf Countries.
- Develop tailored messaging: The ILO could communicate more effectively (which implies availability of budget and dedicated personnel) about positive results and outcomes from its work on TVET in Lebanon, highlighting the impact and benefits of its interventions, and through tailoring its messages to match with the priorities and concerns of different donor groups.

- Strengthen monitoring and evaluation: The ILO could invest (including on M&E staff) in better tracking and reporting of results, showcasing the effectiveness of its interventions and building donor confidence in its ability to deliver impact.
- Increase visibility: The ILO could increase the visibility of its work in TVET in Lebanon, for example by organizing public events, engaging with media outlets, and leveraging social media channels, to raise awareness of its work and attract more support.

It's worth noting that these are just a few potential strategies that arose during the course of this evaluation and that any specific approach would need to be tailored to the context and needs of Lebanon. The ILO would need to work closely with local partners and stakeholders to identify the most effective strategies to improve resource mobilization in the country.

4.3.4. Additional impressions of Efficiency

Overall, the evaluation, based on the opinions of key stakeholders, considers that all project activities delivered good value for money. Moreover, given the complexity of the project, the large number of institutions involved and the insufficient project staff, the evaluator also shares the opinion of several stakeholders consulted, on the fact that the projects could not have achieved the same results at a lower cost.

4.4. Impact Orientation

The impact section relates to the likely contribution of the projects' initiatives to the stated objectives of the interventions; the realization of skilling and decent work opportunities in Lebanon, as well as eventual positive changes in the lives of the ultimate project beneficiaries.

The UNICEF-ILO partnership was instrumental in the development of the National Strategic Framework for TVET, although the “triple crises” put on hold the intended reforms in all sectors, including the TVET sector⁴². Nevertheless, key informants who were interviewed by the evaluator underlined that the importance of having a national strategic framework for TVET in Lebanon lies in that it provides a roadmap for developing and implementing policies and programs that are aligned with the country's economic and social goals.

In addition, such a framework can (potentially) help ensure that TVET programs will be responsive to labour market demands, promoting inclusive growth and employment, and enhancing the competitiveness of the country's economy. Moreover, it can (potentially) facilitate coordination and collaboration among different stakeholders, and address a mismatch between the skills and competencies of the workforce and the needs of the labour market, while enhancing the quality of TVET programs and promoting lifelong learning.

The ILO skills projects also facilitated partnerships between key stakeholders, including government agencies, private vocational training providers and employers in order to promote collaboration and cooperation in the TVET sector. This has the potential to ensure that all stakeholders will work together towards the common goal of improving the quality and relevance of TVET.

The technical assistance provided by the ILO, for example, in developing an EMIS or in delivering training to SABs, along with strengthened partnerships and improved coordination among government agencies, educational institutions, and the private sector, has the potential to contribute to strengthening the governance of the TVET system.

The ILO projects also made important contributions to aligning TVET programs with market needs. Addressing the skills needs of the labour market is crucial to ensure that the skills being taught align with the current and most likely future needs of the labour market. This, in turn, can potentially increase employment opportunities for TVET graduates.

In addition, the ILO promoted increased private sector involvement. The private sector plays a significant role in improving the relevance and quality of the TVET system, by providing internships, apprenticeships, and other workplace-based learning opportunities for students. Employers also contributed to labour market assessments and have a role to play in curricula development to further help to ensure that training programs are aligned with labour market needs.

Through the skills projects, the ILO also provided support for the development of skills assessment and certification systems. A robust system for assessing and certifying the skills of TVET graduates, if implemented, can ensure that the skills and knowledge acquired through

⁴² Source: Lebanon Country Assessment and Priorities (CAP). Towards improved skills and lifelong learning. ILO-UNICEF (undated)

TVET programs are recognized and valued by employers, thereby enabling graduates to secure quality jobs.

Moreover, the ILO projects contributed to delivering market-relevant skills training, including WBL, to an estimated 20,000 vulnerable youth and adults (Lebanese and non-Lebanese) in the agriculture, construction, hospitality, craft, and health sectors⁴³. However, it was not possible for the evaluation to measure the eventual positive changes in the lives of the ultimate project beneficiaries since the ILO projects do not have any indicators or monitoring/information systems that would allow for such verification.

4.5. Sustainability

This section includes an assessment of the overall sustainability as well as of the sustainability of the main projects' components.

4.6.1. Overall considerations on the projects' sustainability

Issues related to the sustainability of the Projects' outcomes were not considered in the design phase and the projects did not have sustainability plans. However, overall the ILO laid the foundations for sustainability, to some extent, through high quality technical assistance in policy development, governance, capacity building, labour market information, curricula development, harmonization of skills training approaches, promotion of WBL schemes, etc.

Moreover, the ILO managed to put into motion a broad variety of partners (MOL, MEHE, MOA, MOSA; employers; NGOs, UN and International agencies; etc.) in support of the projects activities and objectives. In addition, the skills Projects established complementarity and synergies with other ILO projects and initiatives that could help contribute to sustainability.

However, the projects' timeframe is an important barrier for sustainability. Increasing the country's capacities to further develop the quality and relevance of the TVET system and put in place enabling environments to effectively tackle the employment crisis requires long-term processes that cannot possibly be compressed in the short-term timeline of the current ILO UNICEF/AICS projects.

In this regard, there is consensus among the project stakeholders who were interviewed by the evaluator that national efforts towards skills development will depend on continued technical and financial support. Without on-going and continued ILO commitment, the sustainability of project outcomes is not likely in the mid-term.

4.6.2. Sustainability of the results of the main projects components

Capacity building

The ILO-skills projects developed an intense training activity. According to the opinions of project stakeholders who were interviewed by the evaluator, the training courses were highly relevant and of a high quality, contributing to strengthening the skills development capacities of the participating institutions. However, it is difficult to verify at this point to what degree the projects'

⁴³ Source: Lebanon Country Assessment and Priorities (CAP). Towards improved skills and lifelong learning. ILO-UNICEF (undated)

capacity building interventions will lead to sustainable results, as well as to determine to what extent institutions that received training can effectively apply the knowledge and skills they have acquired in their day-to-day operations.

On the one hand, one limiting factor for measuring such sustainability is that the ILO projects do not have any indicators or monitoring/information systems that would allow for the verification of the effective application of this knowledge. On the other hand, numerous representatives of public institutions declared to the evaluator that in the current challenging context, where Ministries and schools are hardly functional, it is simply not possible to apply the competencies and knowledge that have been acquired through training.

On their part, some of the NGO representatives who were interviewed stated that they use the tools acquired through training to some extent, although they experience difficulties in doing so, due to both the challenging context and the high turnover of personnel in their organizations.

Labour market studies and curricula development

Overall, the majority of key stakeholders who were interviewed by the evaluator did highly value the relevance, quality, and usefulness of the labour market studies that were undertaken, as well as the training curricula that were developed by the ILO projects. However, it remains unclear to the evaluator the extent to which the results of these studies and the curricula developed will be further used/implemented after the ILO skills projects end (sustainability).

In addition, the majority of the informants expressed that the studies and curricula were developed before or around 2019 (although 3 sectoral studies were updated in 2022) prior to multiple crises in Lebanon, and thus some of these labour market studies and curricula may have become outdated. Therefore, these informants consider it necessary to continue conducting labour market studies in order to have up to date data to work with, as well as to develop training programmes that respond more appropriately to the current reality of the country.

Work-based learning/apprenticeships

Interviewed project stakeholders, from the public as well as the private sector, highly value the progress made by the ILO in terms of promoting WBL/apprenticeships. The vast majority considers also that in the current context of Lebanon, these training modalities remain particularly relevant, and therefore, it is in their view necessary to redouble efforts to continue developing WBL/apprenticeships in a sustainable way.

Post-training services

While the ILO skills projects took some important steps towards developing post-training services, most interviewees opined that in the future, additional efforts will be necessary in order to support the school-to-work transition for TVET graduates. Such efforts should include, for example, the integration of core employability skills into competency-based training programs; the strengthening of career guidance and counselling services for students; the provision of employment, entrepreneurship, and livelihood training, as well as post-training support for students; in addition to further support for the establishment of a comprehensive, cross-sectoral referral services network.

5. LESSONS LEARNED AND GOOD PRACTICES

The evaluation identified some lessons learned and good practices which were driven by some of the faced challenges as well as the obtained positive results. In this section the evaluator lists the ones that are the most relevant, so they can be taken into consideration in current and/or future interventions.

5.1. Lessons Learned

1. Availability of appropriate staff levels is key to project performance.

The evaluation learned that the ILO skills projects in Lebanon, which are complex interventions requiring attention to various dimensions, as well as partnering with multiple stakeholders, necessitate a sufficient level of technical human resources. This is particularly pertinent in an environment where many challenges are prevalent. Due to a shortage of human resources assigned to the projects, further exacerbated by the respective resignation of various subsequent CTAs and SDOs, the project staff has been considerably overburdened with the amount of work that needed to be done. Although mitigating efforts by the project led to bringing in ILO-expertise (ILO Regional and HQ Specialists as well as ITC experts) when this was deemed necessary, it would be advantageous for future interventions to have greater access to a continued sufficient amount of staff for this type of projects.

2. Implementation schedules.

Improving the relevance and quality of TVET in Lebanon requires multifaceted, complementary and elaborate strategies and interventions. This involves solid partnerships and continued collaboration with various stakeholders, and implementing systemic changes, which in turn, require extended processes and implementation schedules. Considering the prevailing political, institutional, and economic conditions in Lebanon, achieving these objectives in the short term is not feasible. Therefore, the lesson learned is that in order to ensure the sustainability of ILO interventions, a complementary, integrated and long-term strategy needs to be developed. This requires durable commitment from the ILO, the donor community as well as the national government and other national partners, along with a long-term implementation timeline.

3. Flexibility to adapt to a changing and challenging context

Engaging stakeholders in skills development is a particularly difficult task in a fragile and multiple emergency crises context, such as the current context in Lebanon. Therefore, the ILO should prioritize more flexibility in future interventions, to ensure that the projects can adapt to changing circumstances and emerging needs and opportunities. Furthermore, in such unpredictable and rapidly changing contexts, the ILO must consider the institutional capacities and urgent needs of stakeholders and provide its partners with the necessary support to address the causes and consequences of the crises effectively.

The evaluation learned that in order to achieve a strong engagement strategy that is sustainable in the mid-term, the ILO should adopt an integrated approach that combines responses to immediate and urgent needs with mid-term development assistance. By addressing pressing needs in the short term, the ILO can create a foundation for sustainability in the future.

4. *Continuing engagement of ILO constituents (MOL, employers and workers' organizations) in developing the TVET sector*

An important lesson learned of the evaluation is that ongoing collaboration, coordination, and advocacy by ILO constituents (Ministry of Labour, employers, and workers' organizations) has been and remains crucial for enhancing the quality and relevance of the TVET system in Lebanon. The continued engagement of ILO constituents is instrumental in ensuring that TVET programs are aligned with the requirements of the labour market and facilitate opportunities for decent work.

Through collaboration, ILO constituents can participate in identifying the skills needed in the labour market as well as in designing TVET programs that meet these requirements. Tripartite cooperation can also ensure that TVET programs are relevant and inclusive for all, including women, youth, and vulnerable populations.

Employers can provide input on industry needs, facilitate partnerships between industry and education, provide support for work-based learning and on the job training, encouraging investment in TVET, and participating in job placement services. Trade unions can also play a valuable role by representing the interests of workers, advocating for high-quality training, promoting lifelong learning, supporting workers' rights, and providing support for workers' professional development.

In addition, the ILO constituents have an important role to play in the governance of the TVET system in Lebanon. This includes collaborating, coordinating, and advocating to ensure that the TVET system is effectively managed and the quality of TVET programs is strengthened.

Furthermore, ILO constituents can be instrumental in advocating for policy and institutional changes that foster the development of the TVET sector in Lebanon. They can also campaign for increased investments in TVET as well as for public-private partnerships that elevate the quality and relevance of TVET programs.

5.2. Good practices

1. *Combining ILO and UNICEF's comparative advantages*

The ILO and UNICEF combined their comparative advantage in the TVET sector in Lebanon. Together, UNICEF and ILO offer a substantial and in-depth experience with implementing skills development projects on the ground in Lebanon as well as in the broader Arab States region. Due to the complementary mandates and expertise the ILO and UNICEF have managed to leverage their respective strengths to provide comprehensive and complementary support to the TVET system in Lebanon.

The ILO's comparative advantage lies in its expertise and experience in promoting skills development as a means to enhance employability and productivity; its strong engagement with social partners; as well as its global presence and experience in working with different stakeholders to promote skills development and lifelong learning. Additionally, ILO has wide-ranging experience in working with governments to improve policy frameworks and governance of TVET systems.

UNICEF has extensive experience in supporting education and training programs for youth, including marginalized groups such as refugees; in designing and implementing training programs that promote social inclusion and gender equality; as well as in working with local communities and civil society organizations to support the development of TVET programs.

2. Building on ILO experiences and resources

Successful implementation of the skills projects builds on previous ILO experiences, programs, and resources, as well as collaboration and coordination with key stakeholders. Participation from stakeholders has also been a critical element in ILO skills projects, which have involved and closely worked with various institutions such as government agencies, NGOs, UN agencies, and employers. These entities have had significant roles in the implementation of the project and are jointly responsible for its success. This form of collaboration and coordination is essential for maximizing the impact of skills development models. Additionally, tapping into the existing expertise and resources of the ILO, including regional, HQ, and ITC specialists, through coordination and collaboration, has been crucial in providing effective technical assistance to project partners.

3. ILO's integrated approach to Skills development

The ILO skills projects were designed and implemented to provide an integrated approach on skills development. This included, for example, strengthening the TVET system based on improved quality of labour market information; developing and implementing competency-based training programmes and work based learning in partnership with the private sector; and promoting career guidance and employment services, and post training support.

Integrated approaches to support TVET development are crucial for meeting industry demands, enhancing employability, supporting economic growth, responding to changing needs, and encouraging lifelong learning. However, in the current Lebanese context, these approaches will take time to be fully developed and consolidated.

6. CONCLUSIONS

The following chapter presents a synthesis of the conclusions drawn from the analysis of the findings and is organized in correspondence with the evaluation sections: Relevance and strategic fit; Coherence and validity of the design; Project progress and effectiveness; Efficiency of resource use; Impact orientation; and Sustainability.

Relevance and strategic fit

The evaluation concluded that the ILO skills projects that were reviewed are highly relevant. The ILO projects in Lebanon are fully aligned with broader ILO policies and strategies, as defined in the ILO P&B, as well as in the ILO-Lebanon DWCP 2017-2020. The ILO projects are also aligned with the SDGs, more precisely to Goal 4. Quality Education and Goal 8. Decent Work and Economic Growth.

The ILO skills projects in Lebanon largely respond to the needs of the beneficiaries, as these projects address issues that are critical for youth (both Lebanese and Syrian refugees). The projects aim to strengthen the employability of job seekers based on labour market needs and to provide post-training support in order to improve the chances of the youths acquiring jobs.

Moreover, in the current context of prolonged and multi-faceted crises, skills/vocational training has a significant potential for enhancing employability amidst the Lebanese and Syrian youth. However, in order to do so it is necessary, even urgent, to provide on-going support to increasing training accessibility, the quality of skills/vocational training as well as the ability to respond to the labour market needs.

In addition, the evaluation found that the ILO is considered by key stakeholders (including government institutions, UN agencies, development partners, and NGOs) a leading actor in improving the quality and relevance of TVET, promoting decent work opportunities, and enhancing the livelihoods of vulnerable groups in Lebanon.

Coherence and validity of the design

Both the UNICEF and AICS project designs were found to be solid. Also, the internal logic of both projects is sound and based on a thorough problem/context analysis and strategy. Furthermore, the proposed interventions logically address the identified challenges and needs. In addition, the ILO's cross-cutting policy drivers were adequately integrated into the design and implementation of both projects.

On the other hand, the ILO did not develop a monitoring and evaluation plan for the skills projects. Both the UNICEF and AICS projects developed Results Frameworks, which showcase key indicators under their corresponding outputs and key activities. However, the evaluator found that while some indicators are well defined, others may benefit from a review to ensure that there is a logical fit between the indicators and the respective outputs/activities for which they intend to provide evidence of achievement.

The ILO Projects build on previous TVET/employment interventions and complement each other. In addition, the skills projects are aligned and complementary with on-going local efforts as well

as with UN and ILO initiatives in the country aiming at enhancing the quality and relevance of TVET provision.

However, the evaluation concluded that achieving the projects' objective of *improved employability and access of vulnerable Lebanese and refugee graduates from skills training to the labour market through improved formal and non-formal TVET in Lebanon* should be understood as a strategic goal that involves a substantial dedication of time and resources (both technical and financial). Moreover, the evaluator noted that the human resources that were assigned for the projects' implementation were scarce, especially for projects of such complexity.

Project progress and Effectiveness

Overall, the ILO skills projects proved effective in achieving the expected results. The projects did significant contributions to improve the availability and quality of labour market information. The ILO provided extensive capacity building to project partners' through training sessions, the Skills Academy Lebanon, as well as through coaching and mentoring. In addition, the ILO and partner NGOs conducted seven community-based assessments. Also, four national sectoral labour market studies were conducted by the ILO in collaboration with NEO. Additionally, in collaboration with ALI the ILO developed an on-line skills anticipation questionnaire for regular anticipation of labour market needs. Moreover the projects provided technical and financial support to conduct two tracer studies.

The ILO also contributed to building the capacity of project partners on CBT, WBL, MVTC. Furthermore, in collaboration with the project partners the ILO developed competency-based curricula for ten occupations. These curricula were applied in skills training programmes by partner NGOs. Moreover, the ILO implemented a WBL pilot with three UNICEF partners (NGOs).

The projects also contributed to improving the institutional capacities for the provision of post-training services to vocational training graduates. In this regard, the ILO provided training and coaching to project partners that offer skills training and post-training services. In addition, the ILO elaborated a proposal for the reform of the NEO, conducted a review of the existing referral mechanism in the TVET sector, and developed a mapping of training and post training service providers and a blueprint for an improved referral system.

Additionally, the ILO and UNICEF provided technical assistance to several Ministries in the elaboration of the NSF 2018–2022 as well as in the preparation of the NSF 2023-2030

The projects were faced with multiple external challenges beyond their control. The COVID-19 pandemic, as well as the socio-political crisis in the country, affected and disrupted the projects implementation.

A significant internal factor that caused additional challenges for the project management and implementation was the insufficient human capacity to undertake the set activities. This was caused by the cost-effectiveness strategy adopted by the project, which had led to sharing of several positions with two other projects. In addition, the projects experienced serious staff turnover with CTA and SDO's resignations in 2017, 2018, 2020 and 2021. Nevertheless, the evaluator concluded that the ILO projects demonstrated a significant level of flexibility to adapt to the highly challenging implementation context.

Efficiency of resource use

The evaluation concluded that the results that have been achieved to date justify the expenses of the ILO skills projects. The budgetary implementation is consistent with the projects' performance and in line with the achievement of expected outputs/results. In addition, budget execution rates were good, reported at nearly 100% (to both the UNICEF and the AICS projects) by end January 2023 which is considerable in view of the many challenges that the projects had faced. Also, synergies between the UNICEF-AICS Projects and with other ILO on-going initiatives contributed to reduce the staff and administrative costs.

Overall, the evaluation concluded that all project activities delivered good value for money. Moreover, given the complexity of the projects, the large number of institutions involved and the insufficient project staff, the evaluator is of the opinion that the projects could not have achieved the same results at a lower cost.

Impact orientation

The UNICEF-ILO partnership was instrumental in the development of the NSF, although the "triple crises" put on hold its intended reforms. Nevertheless, the importance of having a NSF for TVET in Lebanon lies in that it provides a roadmap for developing and implementing policies and programs that are aligned with the country's economic and social goals. In addition, such a framework can (potentially) help ensure that TVET programs will be responsive to labour market demands, promoting inclusive growth and employment, and enhancing the competitiveness of the country's economy.

The ILO projects facilitated partnerships between key stakeholders (including government agencies, private vocational training providers, and employers) to promote collaboration and cooperation in the TVET sector. This has the potential contribute to strengthening the governance as well as the quality and relevance of TVET.

In addition, the ILO projects made important contributions to aligning TVET programs with market needs and promoted increased private sector involvement in providing internships, apprenticeships, and other workplace-based learning opportunities for students. This, in turn, can potentially increase employment opportunities for TVET graduates.

In addition, the ILO provided support for the development of skills assessment and certification systems. If implemented, such system can ensure that the skills and knowledge acquired through TVET programs are recognized and valued by employers, thereby enabling graduates to secure quality jobs.

Moreover, the ILO projects contributed to delivering market-relevant skills training, including WBL, to vulnerable youth and adults in the agriculture, construction, hospitality, craft, and health sectors. However, it was not possible to measure the eventual positive changes in the lives of the ultimate project beneficiaries since the ILO projects do not have any indicators or monitoring/information systems that would allow for such verification.

Sustainability

Issues related to the sustainability of the projects' outcomes were not considered in the design phase and the projects did not have sustainability plans. However, overall the ILO laid the

foundations for sustainability, to some extent, through high quality technical assistance in policy development, governance, capacity building, labour market information, curricula development, harmonization of skills training approaches, promotion of WBL schemes, etc.

Nevertheless, the projects' timeframe is an important barrier for sustainability. Increasing the country's capacities to further develop the quality and relevance of the TVET system and put in place enabling environments to effectively tackle the employment crisis requires long-term processes that cannot possibly be compressed in the short-term timeline of the current ILO UNICEF/AICS projects.

In this regard, national efforts towards skills development will depend on continued technical and financial support. Without on-going and continued ILO commitment, the sustainability of project outcomes is not likely in the mid-term.

7. RECOMMENDATIONS

The following recommendations are based on the findings and flow from the lessons learned and the conclusions. The recommendations could be useful for the ILO if the organisation's intention is to pursue further initiatives to support skills development/TVET in Lebanon.

Recommendation 1: Maintain support to national efforts towards skills development and lifelong learning

It is recommended that the ILO and donor community continue to provide technical and financial assistance to the Government and key private actors (employers, unions, NGOs) for the improvement of the quality and relevance of the Lebanon's TVET systems as well as access for Lebanese and refugee youth to the labour market.

Addressed to	Priority	Implementation	Level of resources
ILO (ROAS and HQ) and the donor community	High	Short-term	High

Recommendation 2: Design a long-term integrated strategy/programme on skills development and lifelong learning for Lebanon

The ILO RO should design an integrated and all-encompassing long-term programme on skills training and lifelong learning for Lebanon. Such a programme should tap into on the knowledge and expertise that was generated through past and on-going "skills projects". Some priority interventions for this programme are suggested below (recommendations 3 to 10)

In addition, the ILO should develop a funding plan for the long-term programme. Also, funding agreements should make sure that the staffing provisions (both technical, M&E and communications personnel) are appropriate to carry out complex projects in challenging contexts with maximum effectiveness. Moreover, a comprehensive Monitoring and Evaluation Plans should be put in place. Finally, it is recommended that the ILO develops a sustainability plan and a clear exit strategy for the long term programme.

Addressed to	Priority	Implementation	Level of resources
ILO (ROAS and HQ) and national Partners	High	Mid-term	Low

Recommendation 3: Improved governance of the TVET system

It is recommended that the ILO continue to strengthen the capacity of the DGTvet managers and staff, to ensure that TVET programs are well-managed, coordinated, and responsive to labour market needs. Additionally, technical and financial support is needed to incorporate digital technologies that can automate essential services within the DGTvet, thereby enhancing efficiency, while establishing a robust information management system.

It is essential for the ILO to continue promoting collaboration and partnerships among the DGTvet, private sector employers, industry associations, unions, and the Ministry of Labour. This will help ensure that TVET programs align with the skill needs of the labour market, and graduates possess the necessary skills and knowledge required by employers.

Furthermore, promoting the establishment of tripartite sector skills bodies, providing assistance to School Advisory Board members and fostering public-private partnerships are additional ways in which this collaboration can be achieved.

Addressed to	Priority	Implementation	Level of resources
ILO, DGTVET, Employers (ALI) and workers' organizations (CGTL, FENASOL)	Medium	Mid-term	Medium

Recommendation 4: Support the development of institutional capacities of social partners

It is recommended that the ILO supports the institutional capacity building of Lebanese social partners, particularly workers' organizations, to enable them to engage more effectively in skills development. This can be achieved by assessing the needs and priorities related to skills development of workers' and employers' organizations, identifying comprehensive and tailored technical and financial support, and implementing capacity-building plans that allow for greater involvement in updating and reforming skills development systems.

Addressed to	Priority	Implementation	Level of resources
ILO, Employers (ALI) and workers' organizations (CGTL, FENASOL)	Medium	Mid-term	Medium

Recommendation 5: Expanded access to vocational training

It is recommended that the ILO continues to provide technical and financial support to expand access to vocational training, especially among vulnerable populations. This may include: a) promoting awareness and advocacy campaigns to change negative attitudes and stereotypes towards vulnerable populations and to raise awareness about the importance of inclusive TVET; b) providing support for infrastructure, electricity, equipment, and materials to ensure that schools are operational; and c) facilitating accessibility for students by providing scholarships, educational materials, transportation, meals, etc.

Addressed to	Priority	Implementation	Level of resources
ILO, DGTVET, MOA, MOSA, NEO, NGOs	High	Short-term	High

Recommendation 6: Enhanced TVET quality and relevance

The ILO should continue working with TVET providers (including NGOs) and the private sector to further develop/update labour market studies and skills assessments; competency-based curricula; tracer studies; and employer satisfaction surveys to ensure that the skills programmes are up-to-date and relevant to current industry needs. It is also important to continue supporting the alignment and standardization of non-formal training programs, as well as the development of a quality assurance system that includes standards, assessment tools, and procedures for monitoring and evaluating TVET programs.

Addressed to	Priority	Implementation	Level of resources
ILO, DGTVET, MOA, MOSA, NEO, NGOs, ALI	High	Mid-term	High

Recommendation 7: Continued development of Work-Based Learning/apprenticeships schemes.

In the short term, the ILO should promote further public-private partnerships to create on-the-job training opportunities and apprenticeships. These can provide practical work experience for upskilling and reskilling unemployed vulnerable groups, and lead to improved employability. In the mid-term, the ILO should continue to provide technical assistance to the Ministry of Labour, DGTVET, unions, and employers in the development of a national framework for quality apprenticeships.

Addressed to	Priority	Implementation	Level of resources
ILO, DGTVET, MoA, NGOs, ALI, MOL, CGTL, FENASOL	High	Short-term Mid-term	Medium

Recommendation 8: Strengthened support to school-to-work transition

This can be achieved by providing technical and financial support for various initiatives, including the development and integration of core employability skills into competency-based training programs; the strengthening of career guidance and counselling services for students; the provision of employment, entrepreneurship, and livelihood training, as well as post-training support for students; and further support for the establishment of a comprehensive, cross-sectoral referral services network.

Addressed to	Priority	Implementation	Level of resources
ILO, TVET providers (public and private)	High	Short-term	High

Recommendation 9: Technical support to SMEs: enterprise development, enhanced productivity competitiveness, employment creation and transition to formality.

The ILO should provide technical assistance to Small and Medium Enterprises (SMEs) in Lebanon through capacity-building and mentoring programmes that focus on improved business management, enterprise development, productivity improvement, competitiveness enhancement and employment creation. In addition, the ILO can help SMEs access new markets, for example, through market research as well as capacity building and coaching. Moreover, the ILO can provide advisory services and support on how to reduce informality and facilitate a transition of businesses to formality, as a way to create more sustainable and decent jobs.

Addressed to	Priority	Implementation	Level of resources
ILO, Employers' organizations and SMEs	Medium	Mid-term	Medium

Recommendation 10: Mainstream gender approaches

In future skills development initiatives it is recommended for the ILO and the national partners to conduct a gender-based analysis to identify the specific needs and challenges faced by women in accessing and participating in TVET programs; develop gender-sensitive curricula; encourage gender balance in training; provide gender-sensitive support services (i.e. childcare, transportation, counselling services) to enable women to participate in the TVET programs without additional barriers. It is also important to monitor and evaluate gender outcomes of the TVET programs to measure their impact on women's empowerment and gender equality.

Addressed to	Priority	Implementation	Level of resources
ILO, Employers' organizations and SMEs	High	Mid-term	Medium

Recommendation 11: A repository of ILO products

It is recommended that an organized repository be created for the products that have been developed by ILO skills projects in Lebanon. This repository should include various materials such as labour market studies, methodological approaches, competency-based curricula, and training materials. The purpose of this repository is to encourage the sharing of information and to facilitate the development of common approaches to skills development among TVET actors in Lebanon.

Addressed to	Priority	Implementation	Level of resources
ILO Skills Projects	High	Short-term	Low

ANNEX 1: Lessons Learned Templates



Improved access to skills and employment opportunities in Lebanon

Project DC/SYMBOL:LEB/16/08/CEF and LBN/18/04/ITA

Name of Evaluator: Rafael Munoz-Sevilla

Date: March 31, 2023

The following lesson learned has been identified during the course of the evaluation. Further text explaining the lesson may be included in the full evaluation report.

LESSON LEARNED ELEMENT	1
Brief description of lessons learned (link to specific action or task)	The ILO's skills projects in Lebanon require a sufficient level of technical human resources due to their complexity and involvement with multiple stakeholders in a challenging environment. The lesson learned is that future interventions would benefit from having a continued sufficient amount of staff.
Context and any related preconditions	The insufficient human capacity to undertake the set activities was caused by the cost-effectiveness strategy adopted by the project, which had led to sharing of several positions with two other projects. In addition, the projects experienced serious staff turnover
Targeted users /Beneficiaries	ILO ROs and HQ. Project Management Teams
Challenges /negative lessons -Causal factors	The shortage of human resources assigned to the projects has overburdened the project staff. This was a significant internal factor that caused challenges for the project management and implementation.
Success / Positive Issues -Causal factors	The ILO projects demonstrated a significant level of flexibility to adapt to the highly challenging implementation context. The project management adopted several measures to address these challenges and managed to minimize their (negative) impact on project implementation. Examples of such measures are: Backstopping project staff through internal technical support; Close collaboration with UNICEF and other stakeholders; Building on existing UN partnerships; Considering alternative training solutions; Adapting methodologies, activities and work-plans
ILO Administrative Issues (staff, resources, design, implementation)	



Improved access to skills and employment opportunities in Lebanon

Project DC/SYMBOL:LEB/16/08/CEF and LBN/18/04/ITA

Name of Evaluator: Rafael Munoz-Sevilla

Date: March 31, 2023

The following lesson learned has been identified during the course of the evaluation. Further text explaining the lesson may be included in the full evaluation report.

LESSON LEARNED ELEMENT	2
Brief description of lessons learned (link to specific action or task)	In order to ensure the sustainability of ILO interventions, an integrated and long-term strategy needs to be developed with durable commitment from the ILO, the donor community, the national government, and other partners. A long-term implementation timeline is also necessary.
Context and any related preconditions	Since October 2019, Lebanon's economic, social and security situation has rapidly deteriorated. Lebanon is currently facing a "triple crisis" caused by the economic meltdown, the global COVID-19 pandemic and the Beirut blast on August 4th 2022, which devastated the capital.
Targeted users /Beneficiaries	ILO ROAS and HQ. Project Management Teams.
Challenges /negative lessons -Causal factors	Improving the relevance and quality of TVET in Lebanon requires multifaceted, complementary and elaborate strategies and interventions. This involves solid partnerships and continued collaboration with various stakeholders, and implementing systemic changes, which in the current context, require extended processes and implementation schedules.
Success / Positive Issues -Causal factors	The ILO skills projects were designed to provide an integrated approach on skills development. In addition, the ILO collaborated and coordinated with a wide range of key stakeholders and development partners (Government, employers and workers, UN Agencies, NGOs, development partners)
ILO Administrative Issues (staff, resources, design, implementation)	



Improved access to skills and employment opportunities in Lebanon

Project DC/SYMBOL:LEB/16/08/CEF and LBN/18/04/ITA

Name of Evaluator: Rafael Munoz-Sevilla

Date: March 31, 2023

The following lesson learned has been identified during the course of the evaluation. Further text explaining the lesson may be included in the full evaluation report.

LESSON LEARNED ELEMENT	3
Brief description of lessons learned (link to specific action or task)	The evaluation learned that in order to achieve a strong engagement strategy that is sustainable in the mid-term, the ILO should adopt an integrated approach that combines responses to immediate and urgent needs with mid-term development assistance.
Context and any related preconditions	Since October 2019, Lebanon's economic, social and security situation has rapidly deteriorated. Lebanon is currently facing a "triple crisis" caused by the economic meltdown, the global COVID-19 pandemic and the Beirut blast on August 4th 2022, which devastated the capital.
Targeted users /Beneficiaries	ILO ROAS and HQ. Project Management Teams
Challenges /negative lessons -Causal factors	These factors combined created an exceptionally challenging context that demands short-term emergency interventions along with mid-term development programmes.
Success / Positive Issues -Causal factors	The ILO skills projects were designed to provide an integrated approach on skills development. In addition, the ILO collaborated and coordinated with a wide range of key stakeholders and development partners (Government, employers and workers, UN Agencies, NGOs, development partners)
ILO Administrative Issues (staff, resources, design, implementation)	



Improved access to skills and employment opportunities in Lebanon

Project DC/SYMBOL:LEB/16/08/CEF and LBN/18/04/ITA

Name of Evaluator: Rafael Munoz-Sevilla

Date: March 31, 2023

The following lesson learned has been identified during the course of the evaluation. Further text explaining the lesson may be included in the full evaluation report.

LESSON LEARNED ELEMENT	4
Brief description of lessons learned (link to specific action or task)	The continued engagement of ILO constituents is instrumental in ensuring that TVET programs are aligned with the requirements of the labour market and facilitate opportunities for decent work. In addition, the ILO constituents have an important role to play in the governance of the TVET system in Lebanon.
Context and any related preconditions	Ongoing collaboration, coordination, and advocacy by ILO constituents (Ministry of Labour, employers, and workers' organizations) has been and remains crucial for enhancing the quality and relevance of the TVET system in Lebanon.
Targeted users /Beneficiaries	ILO ROAS and HQ. Project Management and Teams
Challenges /negative lessons -Causal factors	ILO Constituents involvement in the skills projects has been, so far, relatively limited.
Success / Positive Issues -Causal factors	Through collaboration, ILO constituents can participate in identifying the skills needed in the labour market as well as in designing TVET programs that meet these requirements. Tripartite cooperation can also ensure that TVET programs are relevant and inclusive for all, including women, youth, and vulnerable populations. In addition, the ILO constituents have an important role to play in the governance of the TVET system in Lebanon.
ILO Administrative Issues (staff, resources, design, implementation)	

ANNEX 2: Good Practices Templates



Improved access to skills and employment opportunities in Lebanon

Project DC/SYMBOL:LEB/16/08/CEF and LBN/18/04/ITA

Name of Evaluator: Rafael Munoz-Sevilla

Date: March 31, 2023

The following emerging good practice has been identified during the course of the evaluation. Further text can be found in the full evaluation report.

GOOD PRACTICE ELEMENT	1
Brief summary of the good practice (link to project goal or specific deliverable, background, purpose, etc.)	The ILO and UNICEF combined their comparative advantage in the TVET sector in Lebanon. Together, UNICEF and ILO offer a substantial and in-depth experience with implementing skills development projects on the ground in Lebanon as well as in the broader Arab States region.
Relevant conditions and Context: limitations or advice in terms of applicability and replicability	Since 2016 the ILO and UNICEF have combined their efforts and technical expertise in order to provide a comprehensive and coordinated set of skills reform initiatives in Lebanon. These initiatives focus on areas such as policy development, skills assessment and forecasting, system improvement, and other strategic interventions aimed at delivering relevant and inclusive skills. This collaboration can be further replicated/developed/scaled-up in Lebanon and/or in other countries region
Establish a clear cause- effect relationship	Due to the complementary mandates and expertise the ILO and UNICEF have managed to leverage their respective strengths to provide comprehensive and complementary support to the TVET system in Lebanon.
Indicate measurable impact and targeted beneficiaries	This collaboration has impacted the TVET reform process in the country where both agencies have complemented each other's work and leveraged their financial and technical resources to ensure effective results contributing to improve the TVET quality and relevance.
Potential for replication and by whom	The ILO and UNICEF (as well as other UN Agencies in the country) can continue building on this relationship and synergies
Upward links to higher ILO Goals (DWCPs, Country Programme Outcomes or ILO's Strategic Programme Framework)	CPOs DWCP P&B
Other documents or relevant comments	



Improved access to skills and employment opportunities in Lebanon

Project DC/SYMBOL: LEB/16/08/CEF and LBN/18/04/ITA

Name of Evaluator: Rafael Munoz-Sevilla

Date: March 31, 2023

The following emerging good practice has been identified during the course of the evaluation. Further text can be found in the full evaluation report.

GOOD PRACTICE ELEMENT	2
Brief summary of the good practice (link to project goal or specific deliverable, background, purpose, etc.)	Successful implementation of the skills projects builds on previous ILO experiences, programs, and resources, as well as collaboration and coordination with key stakeholders.
Relevant conditions and Context: limitations or advice in terms of applicability and replicability	The skills projects build on previous TVET/e-employment interventions in Lebanon. In addition, these projects were managed and implemented with the participation and support of a considerable amount of national stakeholders, development partners and ILO experts. Furthermore, at various points, the skills projects were able to link to other ILO projects.
Establish a clear cause- effect relationship	This was possible thanks to a very good articulation between ILO efforts and national priorities in the countries and the high quality of ILO staff and its coordination with national partners. Additionally, the standard of support offered by ILO at HQ and RO levels was high and based on substantial prior experience.
Indicate measurable impact and targeted beneficiaries	This type of collaboration and coordination is essential to enhancing skills development/youth employment interventions' effectiveness, efficiency, impact and sustainability.
Potential for replication and by whom	This good practice is replicable by any project team.
Upward links to higher ILO Goals (DWCPs, Country Programme Outcomes or ILO's Strategic Programme Framework)	DWCP P&B
Other documents or relevant comments	



Improved access to skills and employment opportunities in Lebanon

Project DC/SYMBOL:LEB/16/08/CEF and LBN/18/04/ITA

Name of Evaluator: Rafael Munoz-Sevilla

Date: March 31, 2023

The following emerging good practice has been identified during the course of the evaluation. Further text can be found in the full evaluation report.

GOOD PRACTICE ELEMENT	3
Brief summary of the good practice (link to project goal or specific deliverable, background, purpose, etc.)	The ILO skills projects were designed and implemented to provide an integrated approach on skills development. This included, for example, strengthening the TVET system based on improved quality of labour market information; developing and implementing competency-based training programmes and work based learning in partnership with the private sector; and promoting career guidance and employment services, and post training support.
Relevant conditions and Context: limitations or advice in terms of applicability and replicability	Such integrated approach to skills development has potential to be replicated and scaled-up. However, in the current Lebanese context, this approach will take time to be fully developed and consolidated and should be understood as a strategic goal that involves a substantial dedication of time and resources.
Establish a clear cause- effect relationship	Integrated approaches to support TVET development are crucial for meeting industry demands, enhancing employability, supporting economic growth, responding to changing needs, and encouraging lifelong learning.
Indicate measurable impact and targeted beneficiaries	The ILO skills project contributed to improve the TVET quality and relevance in Lebanon. Moreover, integrated approaches to skills development/youth employment interventions' are essential to boost future interventions' effectiveness, efficiency, impact and sustainability.
Potential for replication and by whom	ILO ROAS and Project Management Teams
Upward links to higher ILO Goals (DWCPs, Country Programme Outcomes or ILO's Strategic Programme Framework)	DWCP P&B
Other documents or relevant comments	

ANNEX 3: Terms of Reference



INTERNATIONAL LABOUR ORGANIZATION
TECHNICAL COOPERATION

**Terms of Reference (ToR) for Final Independent Cluster Project Evaluation in
Improved access to skills and employment opportunities in Lebanon**

KEY FACTS	
TC Symbol:	1. LEB/16/08/CEF 2. LBN/18/04/ITA
Countries:	Lebanon
Project Title:	1. Towards improved formal and non-formal Technical and Vocational Education and Training (TVET) in Lebanon 2. Improved access to employment opportunities for Lebanese and refugee graduates from skills training
Duration:	1. Six years 2. Three years
Start Date:	1. 01 January 2017 2. 01 January 2020
End Date:	1. 31 December 2022 2. 31 December 2022
Donor:	1. UNICEF 2. Italian Agency for Development Cooperation (AICS)
Budget:	1. USD 3,069,020 2. USD 583,653
Administrative unit:	Regional Office for the Arab States (ROAS)
Technical backstopping unit:	1. Regional Office for the Arab States (ROAS) SYNDICAT 2. SKILLS
Collaborating ILO units:	1. Skills and Employability Branch (SKILLS) 2. DWT-Beirut; ACTRAV; ACT/EMP
ILO P&B Outcome(s)	For both the projects: Outcome 5 - Skills and lifelong learning to facilitate access to and transitions in the labour market
Evaluation requirements:	Final Independent Evaluation
Timing of evaluation:	October – December 2022

List of Abbreviations

AICS - Italian Agency for Development Cooperation

CPO - Country Programme Outcome

DWCP - Decent Work Country Programme

DWT - Decent Work Team

EM - Evaluation Manager

ETE - End Term Evaluation

EVAL - ILO Evaluation Unit

ILO - International Labour Organization

IPs – Implementing Partners

LGBTQI- Lesbian, gay, bisexual, transgender, queer and intersex persons

M&E - Monitoring and Evaluation

P&B - Programme & Budget

ROAS – Regional Office for the Arab States

TPR - Technical Progress Report

TVET - Technical and Vocational Education and Training

VFM - Value for Money

1. Background

As of October 2021, the Government of Lebanon (GoL) estimated that the country hosts 1.5 million Syrians who have fled the conflict in Syria, including 844,056 registered as refugees with UNHCR, along with 257,000 Palestinian refugees. These populations live across all governorates in Lebanon (Lebanon Crisis Response Plan 2022-2023). In addition to the protracted Syria Crisis, Lebanon has further faced an unprecedented and multifaceted economic, financial, social and health crisis since 2019. As a consequence, vulnerable populations, including displaced Syrians, vulnerable Lebanese, Palestinian Refugees from Syria (PRS) and Palestine Refugees in Lebanon (PRL) have been deeply affected by a sharp increase in poverty, gaps in critical supply chains and limitations on access to food, healthcare, education and other basic services.

The Lebanese labour market faces a number of challenges, many of which can be addressed through a better understanding of the dynamics of the labour market; a clearer profile of the supply and demand sides of the market; and access to informed career guidance and counselling services. The Technical and Vocational Education and Training (TVET) system in Lebanon is not responsive to the labour market needs, and there is a need to improve its institutional and management capacity at all levels. Syrian youth in Lebanon show low access rates to secondary education, and particularly TVET, which is of critical concern. There are many NGOs offering vocational and skills training, but only few livelihoods partners in Lebanon are providing post-training follow-up services, such as employment services. As a result, the majority of graduates from skills training programme do not possess the necessary competencies and qualifications required to access the labour market⁴⁴.

The Government of Lebanon launched the National Strategic Framework (NSF) for Technical and Vocational Education and Training (TVET) in 2018 for the period 2018-2022⁴⁵. The NSF reflects the government's commitment to promote a TVET system that provides the competencies and skills required in the labour market to enhance access to decent work and meet the skills demand for economic growth. The main strategic goals of the NSF are to expand access to TVET, enhance its quality and market-relevance, and improve TVET governance, including through greater engagement of employers.

Since 2019, however, Lebanon has been struggling to cope with a prolonged economic and financial crisis, the outbreak of COVID-19, and the Beirut blast, causing major disruptions in the implementation of the NSF. Whereas the implementation of the NSF was derailed, several skills initiatives emerged to serve the direct needs of the affected population including in the areas of healthcare and reconstruction, as well as to meet the urgent needs of TVET students and schools.

In the light of the current challenges in Lebanon, the ILO and UNICEF organised a roundtable discussion in December 2021, in collaboration with other development partners and social partners, to discuss their respective skills interventions in the country, develop recommendations for upgrading the NSF, and enhance coordination mechanisms between development partners. The workshop served to take stock of new skills initiatives emerged to address the direct needs of the affected population including in the areas of healthcare and

⁴⁴ AICS UNICEF Project Document/Concept Note based on Problem Tree and Situational Analysis

⁴⁵ https://www.ilo.org/beirut/publications/WCMS_633487/lang--en/index.htm

reconstruction, as well as to meet the urgent needs of TVET students and schools. The report highlighted the need to revisit the NSF to ensure better alignment with national priorities, including measures for crisis response, and rapidly changing labour market demand and improved coordination to better respond to the crisis. In addition, it concluded with a set of recommendations to be considered in the review and key interventions in response to the current crisis.

Projects Background

I. Towards improved formal and non-formal TVET in Lebanon

The joint partnership between ILO and UNICEF aimed to improve the formal and non-formal technical and vocational education and training in Lebanon in order to respond to the youth needs within the current socio-economic context.

Overall objective:

The overall objective of the first project is 'TVET curricula and standards for youth are relevant to identified labour market needs'

Immediate objectives:

- a. Strengthened capacity of vocational training providers (NGOs) to prioritise training programme based on market needs
- b. Competency based training programmes relevant to labour market demand developed and initiated

Beyond the work plan, the project also made efforts to strengthen skills coordination and policy dialogue in the country among stakeholders, including government, the private sector, civic society, workers and youth.

II. Improved access to employment opportunities for Lebanese and refugee graduates from skills training

The project has been built on the ILO's previous interventions including: post-crisis skills development in South Lebanon, and joint interventions with UNRWA to improve the employability of Palestinian refugees and support to the National Employment Office of the Ministry of Labour on strengthening their services. Moreover, the project design has taken into consideration lessons learned drawn from evaluations of the first phase of the ILO-AICS collaboration to improve skills training⁴⁶ as well as other past projects in Lebanon⁴⁷.

⁴⁶ Independent Final Cluster Evaluation 'Improved and Market-based provision of vocational training for Lebanese and refugees', Awny Amer & Ahmed Amin, Draft report, ILO July 2018

⁴⁷ Final evaluation of ILO's component in the MDG-F program 'Conflict prevention and peace building in north Lebanon', Ziad Moussa, ILO May 2009. Independent evaluation of 'Supporting local socio-economic recovery and development in war-affected areas of south Lebanon (phase II)', Kerry Abbott, ILO December 2011. Report of the independent final evaluation of the project 'Local socio-economic recovery in war-affected areas of south Lebanon', Hala Dakhil and Roel Hakemoeler, ILO January 2009. Independent Final Evaluation of 'Enhancing local employment, skills and enterprises in Nahrel Bared', Ziad Moussa, ILO March 2011. Final independent evaluation project of 'Empowerment of youth at risk through job creation programme in areas of tension in Lebanon', Wael Zakkar, ILO September 2013. Independent final evaluation of 'Skills development, employment services and local economic recovery for the construction sector in south Lebanon', Wolfgang Schwegler-Rohmeis and Khalil Asmar, ILO March/April 2011. Final evaluation of the joint programme 'Conflict prevention and peace building in north Lebanon', Carlos Carravilla and Nasser Yassin, ILO.

The project targeted vulnerable groups in Lebanon, including women and youth – Lebanese host communities and refugees alike, predominantly in rural areas. These vulnerable groups are the recipients of on-the-job training and benefit from upgraded skills training programmes offered by skills training providers.

Overall objective:

The core problem that the project attempted to address is that in Lebanon the majority of graduates from accelerated skills training do not possess the employability skills required to access the labour market. The overall objective of the project is to improve the access to employment of Lebanese and refugees graduates through market responsive skills training.

Immediate objective:

‘Lebanese and refugee graduates from skills training have obtained the necessary employability to access the labour market’.

The above outcome addresses the identified core problem that Lebanese and refugee graduates from skills training do not have the level of employability skills they would need in order to secure gainful employment, which includes market responsive training curricula that respond to identified labour market needs and the provision of post-training services to the graduates. The outcome is expected by delivering the following two outputs:

- Output 1: Improved institutional capacities for the provision of post-training services for Lebanese and refugee graduates from accelerated skills training.
- Output 2: Improved institutional capacities for the design of market-based skills training for Lebanese and refugees.

The project’s activities are designed to lead to improved provision of post-training support services and more market-relevant skills training to Lebanese and refugees. It is expected these activities will increase their employability and thus ultimately their access to the labour market.

Coordination between the projects:

Both the projects which are subject of this cluster evaluation have been implemented in a coordinated manner by one team to bring synergy and make it cost efficient. The activities have been designed and implemented to complement each other. This would also mean that the project team coordinated with mostly the same stakeholders (Refer Annex 2 for the indicative list).

2. Evaluation background

ILO considers evaluation as an integral part of the implementation of development cooperation activities. Provisions are made in all projects in accordance with ILO evaluation policy and based on the nature of the project and the specific requirements agreed upon at the time of the project design and during the project as per established procedures.

A cluster final evaluation is to be conducted for two projects. While each project has different deliverables with different implementation period, both of them have aimed to contribute to improve skilling and employment opportunities in Lebanon. Both of the projects contribute directly to Programme and Budget (P&B) Outcome 5 - Skills and lifelong learning to facilitate

access to and transitions in the labour market. -. Besides, both the projects are aligned with ILO Country Programme Outcome (CPO) LBN103: *“Improved productive employment and decent work opportunities through the promotion of sustainable enterprises and by strengthening the employability of vulnerable group”*. Moreover, both the projects are linked with Sustainable Development Goals 4 (Quality Education) and 8 (Decent Work & Economic Growth).

The project documents state that a final evaluation will be conducted to assess the progress towards the results, identify the main difficulties/constraints, assess the impact of the programme for the targeted populations, and analyse the lessons learned and practical recommendations to improve future similar programmes.

3. Evaluation Purpose and objectives

The cluster final evaluation will be conducted to examine the relevance, coherence, effectiveness, efficiency, sustainability, and potential impact of the two projects and provide recommendations for future similar projects, particularly in the area of vocational training, skill development and economic opportunities. This evaluation will also identify strengths and weaknesses in the projects’ design, strategy, and implementation as well as lessons learned and good practices.

The purpose of this evaluation is to:

- Assess to what extent the projects collectively contributed to overarching P&B outcome 5, and to respective Country Programme Outcomes in Lebanon;
- Determine if the projects have achieved their stated objectives and explain why/why not;
- Provide recommendations on how to build on the achievements and the possible avenues/intended objectives and results of future relevant projects or phases;
- Document lessons learned, success stories, and good practices in order to maximize the experiences gained.
- Document the value for money and added value for UN agencies to work together towards one common plan

Specifically, the evaluation will examine the following aspects:

- ✓ **Changes in context and review of assumptions (relevance):** Is the projects’ design adequate to address the problems at hand? Were the project objectives and design relevant given the political, economic, and financial context? How have ILO’s works in improving vocational training, skilling and employment opportunities been perceived and positioned within the overall Decent Work in Lebanon.
- ✓ **Results in terms of outcomes and outputs achieved (effectiveness):** How have the projects contributed towards projects’ goals? To what extent did they contribute to the ILO’s Programme & Budget, Country Programme Outcomes, and more largely SDGs? Did the projects reach the expected number of targeted groups? Are the beneficiaries (nationals, refugees, Govt., NGOs, etc.,) satisfied with the quality and delivery of services? If not, in what way did the services not meet with expectations and why? What concrete improvements and changes have taken place as a direct result of the projects?
- ✓ **Use of resources in achievement of projected performance (efficiency):** How have the resources been used to fulfil the project performance in an efficient manner with respect to cost, time and management staff?
- ✓ **Assessment of impact (impact):** To what extent have the projects contributed in improving vocational training, and skilling and employment opportunities? How could the project impact have been improved?

- ✓ **Sustainability:** Will the project's effects remain over time? Will the project's activities/services continue to be provided after the funds have completely been expended?

The evaluation will comply with ILO evaluation policy, which is based on the United Nations Evaluation Norms and Standards and the UNEG ethical guidelines will be followed.

4. Scope of Evaluation

The evaluation will look at the project activities, outputs and outcomes to date within the wider context of the country and UN interventions. The geographical coverage is to be across the country, aligned with the scope of the projects. The evaluation should take into consideration the entire duration of projects, existing resources and political and environmental constraints. As cross-cutting themes, the evaluation will also take specific note of integration of gender mainstreaming⁴⁸, disability inclusion, International Labour Standard, social dialogue⁴⁹, and environmental sustainability as well as contribution to SDGs, COVID-19 response⁵⁰, and other crises.

5. Clients of Evaluation

The primary clients of this evaluation are ILO ROAS, ILO constituents in Lebanon, other government entities⁵¹, UN and NGO partners, and the donors (UNICEF and AICS). Secondary clients include other project stakeholders and units within the ILO that may indirectly benefit from the knowledge generated by the evaluation.

6. Evaluation Criteria and Questions

The evaluation utilizes the standard ILO framework and follows the OECD/DAC evaluation criteria, as follows:

Relevance and strategic fit

- ❖ How do the two projects contribute to the ILO's P&B objectives, CPOs, and SDGs?
- ❖ Are the projects relevant to the felt needs of the beneficiaries?
- ❖ Are the project objectives aligned with tripartite constituents' objectives and needs? What measures were taken to ensure alignment?
- ❖ Were the project objectives and design relevant given the political, economic, and financial context? How have ILO's works in improving vocational training, skilling and employment opportunities been perceived and positioned within the overall Decent Work in Lebanon.

Coherence and validity of the design

- ❖ Are the project strategies and structures coherent and logical (what are logical correlations between the overall objective, outcomes, and outputs)?
- ❖ To what extent are the two evaluated projects harmonised and complementary? Are there any duplication of effort and activities?
- ❖ Have the projects applied an evidence-based approach in formulating and implementing the activities?

⁴⁸ https://www.ilo.org/wcmsp5/groups/public/---ed_mas/---eval/documents/publication/wcms_746716.pdf

⁴⁹ https://www.ilo.org/wcmsp5/groups/public/---ed_mas/---eval/documents/publication/wcms_746717.pdf

⁵⁰ https://www.ilo.org/wcmsp5/groups/public/---ed_mas/---eval/documents/publication/wcms_757541.pdf

⁵¹ For example, DGTVET, MoA, MoSA, NEO, NVTC, etc.,

- ❖ Do the projects make use of a M&E framework? How appropriate and useful are the indicators in assessing the projects' progress? If necessary, how should they be modified to be more useful? Are indicators gender sensitive? Are the means of verification for the indicators appropriate? Are the assumptions for each objective and output realistic?
- ❖ To what extent did the project designs take into account: Specific gender equality and non-discrimination concerns, including inclusion of people with disabilities, relevant to the project context as well as International Labour Standards and Social Dialogue?
- ❖ How well do the project designs take into account local efforts already underway to address the respective issues in Lebanon? How well the projects complement and fit with other ongoing ILO programmes and projects in the country?. Does the projects' design fill an existing gap that other ongoing interventions have failed to address?

Project progress and effectiveness

- ❖ What progress have the projects made so far towards achieving the overall objectives and outcomes? (analysis of achievements and challenges by outcome is required) In cases where challenges have been faced, what intermediate results can be reported towards reaching the outcomes?
- ❖ What, if any, unintended results of the projects have been identified or perceived?
- ❖ To what extent did synergies with and operation through local organizations help to ensure the sustainability of the impact of the projects i.e., through vocational training, skilling, economic opportunities?
- ❖ To what extent did the projects contribute to the intended results of ILO Programme & Budget, 2018-19, 2019-20, 2020-21 and 2022-23 (particularly in year 2022)?
- ❖ Examine the systems, networks, processes that are in place towards influencing policies, training procedures, training content, resources, etc.,
- ❖ To what extent did the projects respond emerging needs in terms of COVID-19 pandemic? Did the pandemic hinder or reverse the progresses that had been made? To what extent did the projects respond emerging needs in terms of ongoing financial crisis and political uncertainty in the country? Did the situation hinder or reverse the progresses that had been made?

Efficiency of resource use

- ❖ To what extent have project activities been cost-effective? Have resources (funds, human resources, time, expertise etc.) been allocated strategically to achieve outcomes? To what extent can the project results justify the time, financial and human resources invested in the projects?
- ❖ To what extent have the projects been able to build on other ILO or non-ILO initiatives either nationally or regionally, in particular with regard to the creation of synergies in cost sharing?
- ❖ How could the efficiency of the projects be improved?
- ❖ Are there particular activities which have delivered high value for money?
- ❖ What was the role of the projects in resource mobilization? Given the country's context, what can ILO do differently in resource mobilization?

Impact orientation

- ❖ What is the likely contribution of the project initiatives to the stated objectives of the intervention; at all the stages and interventions of the JP and not only at outcome level?
- ❖ How did projects contribute realization of skilling and decent work opportunities in Lebanon? To what extent there is evidence of positive changes in the life of the ultimate project beneficiaries?

Sustainability

- ❖ Are the results achieved by the projects likely to be sustainable? What measures have been considered to ensure that the key components of the project are sustainable beyond the life of the projects? How will activities and/or management structures be financed when the project ends?
- ❖ To what extent was sustainability of impact taken into account during the design of the project?
- ❖ To what extent are national partners able and willing to continue with the project? How effectively has the project built national ownership? In what ways are results anchored in national institutions and to what extent can the local partners maintain them financially at end of project?

Lessons learned

- ❖ What lessons learned and good practices can be learned from the project that can be applied to similar future projects?
- ❖ If it were possible, what could have been implemented differently for greater relevance, sustainability, efficiency, effectiveness and impact?

7. Methodology

This cluster evaluation is summative, and mainly relies on the qualitative and participatory approaches to respond to the evaluation questions and fulfil the purpose. It consists of,

- **Desk review of existing documents:** The evaluator will conduct systematic analysis of existing documents and obtain existing qualitative and quantitative evidence prior to primary data collection. The desk review also facilitate assessment of the situation and available data to plan the evaluation and develop the inception report.
- **Key information interviews:** Individual interviews will be conducted with a pre-agreed list of stakeholders who have in-depth exposure and understanding of the projects and their context. Project specific interview guide(s) will be developed during the inception phase to stimulate a discussion on concerned evaluation questions.
- **Focus Group Discussion:** Small group discussions are conducted to explore views and opinions of direct and indirect beneficiaries related with projects and their results. Focus group discussion also serves to triangulate information and data that have been collected with other methods.
- **Observation of programme activities** at provincial and national (to be determined based upon scheduling of activities, scope of the activities)
- **Preliminary finding briefing:** Upon completion of primary data collection, the evaluator will present preliminary findings to ILO and selected stakeholders for validation. The evaluator will also collect further insight from the group to feed them into the final report.

The data and information should be collected, presented and analysed with appropriate gender disaggregation even if project design did not take gender into account.

To the extent possible, the data collection, analysis and presentation should be responsive to and include issues relating to ILO's normative work, social dialogue, diversity and non-discrimination, including disability issues.

The methodology should clearly state the limitations of the chosen evaluation methods, including those related to representation of specific group of stakeholders.

The detail approach and methodology, including the work plan should be part of the inception report. Criteria for selecting key informants for interviews, survey, or selected areas/units for in-depth assessment must be elaborated in the inception report.

Sampling: A purposive sampling approach will be used, collecting data from key programme stakeholders. To ensure a diverse set of voices are heard, data collection must obtain a balanced perspective from women and men beneficiaries and tripartite plus stakeholders, as well as of marginalized groups such as refugees, irregular migrants, low skilled aspirants, ethnic minorities and LGBTQI+ persons. The final list of respondents to be interviewed will be determined during inception.

A more detailed methodology for the assignment will be elaborated by the evaluator on the basis of this TOR, in consultation with the ILO Evaluation Manager and key stakeholders.

8. Work Assignments

a) Kick-off meeting

The evaluator will have an initial consultation with the Evaluation Manager, National Project Coordinators, relevant ILO specialists and support staff, Evaluation Team in ROAS. The objective of the consultation is to reach a common understanding regarding the status of the project(s), the priority assessment questions, available data sources and data collection instruments and an outline of the final assessment report. The following topics will be covered: status of logistical arrangements, project background and materials, key evaluation questions and priorities, outline of the inception and final report.

b) Desk Review

The evaluator will review project background materials before conducting any interviews. Documents to review include but not limited to ILO Programme and Budget, Project Documents, Technical Progress Reports, Workplans, Workshop Reports, monitoring visit reports, publications related to the project, Donor review reports (if any) etc., In addition, the consultant to review and analyse the data from the tracer studies and evaluation surveys conducted previously by UNICEF. This secondary data analysis could provide evidence that possible help to make judgements around impact criteria of the project(s).

c) Inception Report

The evaluator will draft an Inception Report, which should describe, provide reflection and fine-tuning of the following issues:

- Project background
- Purpose, scope and beneficiaries of the evaluation
- Evaluation matrix, including criteria, questions, indicators, data source, and data collection methods
- Methodology and instruments
- Main deliverables
- Management arrangements and work plan.

d) Primary Data Collection (Individual Interviews and Focus Group Discussions)

Following the approval of inception report, the evaluator will physically visit Lebanon and will have face-to-face meetings with project staff, constituents/stakeholders. Individual or group interviews will be conducted with the following:

- 1) Project staff/consultants that have been active;
- 2) ILO ROAS DWT Director, and Senior Specialists in Skills and Employment at regional HQ backstopping specialists when available;
- 3) Interviews with national counterparts (government, public institutions, social partners, IPs, Training institutions, Employers, NGOs, INGOs, UN agencies, etc.);
- 4) Focus group discussions with direct and indirect beneficiaries; This may include, if practical, conducting focus group discussions with beneficiaries, (e.g., those received skills training, employment guidance) and the project team will help in randomly identifying the beneficiaries from the beneficiary lists available with partners/employment centers and in mobilizing beneficiaries for such group discussions. If need be, translation support will be provided to the Evaluator.

e) Debriefing

Upon completion of data collection, the evaluator will provide a briefing of preliminary findings to the Project teams, ILO DWT, ROAS, and major stakeholders to validate findings.

f) Final Report

The final report will follow the format below and be in a range of **35-40 pages** in length, excluding the annexes:

1. Title page
2. Table of Contents, including List of Appendices, Tables
3. List of Acronyms or Abbreviations
4. Executive Summary with key findings, conclusions and recommendations
5. Background and Project Description
6. Purpose of Evaluation
7. Evaluation Methodology and Evaluation Questions
8. Key evaluation findings (organized by evaluation criteria)
9. A table presenting the key results (i.e., figures and qualitative results) achieved per objective (expected and unexpected)
10. Clearly identified conclusions and recommendations (identifying which stakeholders are responsible and the time and resource implications of the recommendations)
11. Lessons Learned (in prescribed template)
12. Potential good practices (in prescribed template)
13. Annexes (list of interviews, TORs, list of documents consulted, etc.)

The quality of the report will be assessed against the EVAL Checklists 4.2, 4.3, 4.4⁵². The deliverables will be submitted in the English language and structured according to the templates provided by the ILO.

The Evaluation Manager will review the final version and submit it to ILO Evaluation Office (EVAL) for their final approval. Once approved, the evaluation report, good practices, and lessons learned will be uploaded and stored at [ILO i-eval Discovery](#) as to provide easy access to all development partners, to reach target audiences and to maximize the benefits of the evaluation.

⁵² Link to Checklists can be found here: <https://www.ilo.org/eval/Evaluationguidance/lang--en/index.htm>

9. Evaluation Timeframe

The duration of this contract is for 30 working days between September - December 2022. The following table describe the tentative timeline and the expected level of effort by the evaluator:

Stage	Responsible Person	Timeline	# of working days
Preparation and finalization of TOR	Evaluation manager (EM) with support of project team (s) and key stakeholders	By 06 Sept. 2022	
- Call for expression of interest - Identification of independent consultant - Entering contract and preparation of budgets and logistics	EM Project Team	By 18 Sept. 2022	
Initial briefing with evaluator	EM; Project Team(s), relevant staff at ROAS	By 4 th week of September 2022	1
- Document review and analysis - Articulating the end term evaluation (ETE) approach and methodology - Developing instruments for the ETE - Compilation of the document review, analysis and drafting of inception report - Submission of draft inception report	Evaluator	By 15 th October 2022	6
Finalization of inception report after feedback from the EM, Project Teams, etc.	Evaluator	By 3 rd week of October 2022	1
- Country level consultations - Stakeholder interviewing: including interviews, group discussions and compilation of findings, and preliminary analysis - Triangulation of initial results from multiple sources, preparation and conduct validation workshop with project stakeholders to present findings, conclusions and recommendations	Evaluator	By 2 nd week of November 2022	13
Development and submission of draft evaluation report with all annexures	Evaluator	By 1 st week of December 2022	7
- EM and REO to review the draft evaluation report to ensure the prescribed quality standards - EM to circulate draft report to key stakeholders for comments and factual check; - Consolidate comments on draft report and send to the Evaluator	EM; Project Team; Stakeholders	By 3 rd week of December 2022	
Finalize the evaluation report, reflecting stakeholders' comments, providing explanations on if comments were not included	Evaluator	By end of December 2022	2
Final report approval	ILO Evaluation Office	By 2 nd week of January 2022	
Total no. of working days for the			30

Stage	Responsible Person	Timeline	# of working days
Evaluator			

10. Deliverables

The main outputs of the evaluation consist of the following deliverables:

- Deliverable 1: Inception Report
- Deliverable 2: Draft evaluation report
- Deliverable 3: Stakeholder briefing and PowerPoint Presentation (PPP)
- Deliverable 4: Second Draft report (and with a separate comments log register, indicating the rationale for accepting/not accepting the comments/feedback)
- Deliverable 5: Final evaluation report with separate template for executive summary and templates for lessons learned and good practices duly filled in (as per ILO's standard procedure, the report will be considered final after quality review by EVAL. Comments will have to be integrated)

11. Management Arrangement

- **Evaluation Manager:** The evaluation will be managed by ILO certified Evaluation Manager who has no prior involvement in the project(s). For this exercise, the evaluation manager is Narendra Nadh Choudary Bollepalli, Technical Officer for Monitoring and Evaluation, ILO Country Office Kathmandu (bollepalli@ilo.org). He is responsible for the overall management of the evaluation and in particular to:
 - Develop the evaluation TOR with inputs from key stakeholders;
 - Develop the expression of interest and select the independent evaluator;
 - Brief the evaluator on ILO evaluation policies and procedures;
 - Coordinate with the programme team on the development of the field mission schedule;
 - Circulate the inception report for comments by key stakeholders;
 - Coordinate with the programme team on organizing the debriefing meeting with the programme team;
 - Circulate the first draft of the evaluation report for comments by key stakeholders;
 - Ensure the final version of the evaluation report meets ILO requirements and the information needs of key stakeholders.

Mr. Hideyuki Tsuruoka, Regional Evaluation Officer, ROAS (tsuruoka@ilo.org) will do quality assurance of the report and EVAL, Geneva will give approval of the final evaluation report.

- *Evaluator (External consultant):* - will be recruited through competitive process. The evaluator reports to the evaluation manager.

Project Staff: The project team(s) will manage the administrative and contractual arrangements for the assignment, provide logistical support for the field missions and cover all of the costs associated with the assignment. During the evaluation, the project team (s) will provide full cooperation and answer all questions as candidly as possible. The project staff are responsible for the following specific tasks:

- Provide inputs on the TOR for the evaluation;
- Provide project documentation to the evaluator;
- Prepare a list of recommended interviewees;

- Schedule meetings for field visits and coordinate in-country logistical arrangements (e.g. flight and hotel reservations, local transportation, interpretation, etc.).
- Participate in interviews and provide inputs as requested;
- Organize and participate in the debriefing meeting;
- Review and provide comments on the draft evaluation report;
- Provide a management response to the final recommendations of the evaluation.

Key Stakeholders: Stakeholders will be engaged throughout the evaluation process, including providing inputs to the terms of reference, participating in interviews during the field work, contributing to the validation of the preliminary findings and commenting on the draft evaluation report. This includes but is not limited to Donors, the ILO Specialists, the ILO Evaluation Office, tripartite constituents and implementing partners (if any) at national and other programme partners. In addition, the donor (UNICEF/AICS) will be provided with an opportunity to review the evaluator’s CV, before final selection and participate in the field visits during the evaluation as appropriate.

12. Legal and Ethical Matters

- This evaluation will comply with ILO evaluation guidelines and UN Norms and Standards.
- The ToR is accompanied by the code of conduct for carrying out the evaluation “Code of conduct for evaluation in the ILO” (See Annex 1). The selected consultant will sign the Code of Conduct form along with the contract.
- UNEG ethical guidelines will be followed throughout the evaluation.
- The consultant will not have any links to project management or any other conflict of interest that would interfere with the independence of the evaluation

13. Qualification

Selection of the Evaluator (Consultant) will be based on the strength of their expressions of interest in the assignment and interviews with a shortlist of candidates. The selected evaluator will possess the following experience and qualifications:

- An advanced degree in a relevant field with a minimum of 7 years of relevant professional experience, including completion of independent evaluations for development projects of a similar size, scope and complexity.
- Strong thematic expertise in skills, vocational training, employment related work and an understanding of the ILO’s tripartite culture, and knowledge of the Lebanon context.
- High professional standards and principles of integrity in accordance with ILO Evaluation Policy and United Nations Evaluation Group Norms and Standards.
- Proven expertise on evaluation methods, and the ILO approach.
- Full command of English. Command of the national language (Arabic) would be an advantage.
- The consultant should not have any links to project management or any other conflict of interest that would interfere with the independence of the evaluation.
- Previous experience in evaluations for UN agencies is preferred, particularly ILO.

ANNEX 1: EVALUATION POLICIES AND GUIDELINES

ILO policy guidelines for results-based evaluation: Principles, rationale, planning and managing for evaluations, 4th ed. https://www.ilo.org/wcmsp5/groups/public/---ed_mas/---eval/documents/publication/wcms_721381.pdf

Code of conduct form (To be signed by the evaluators)

http://www.ilo.org/eval/Evaluationguidance/WCMS_206205/lang--en/index.htm

Checklist No. 3: Writing the inception report

http://www.ilo.org/eval/Evaluationguidance/WCMS_165972/lang--en/index.htm

Checklist 5: preparing the evaluation report

http://www.ilo.org/eval/Evaluationguidance/WCMS_165967/lang--en/index.htm

Checklist 6: rating the quality of evaluation report

http://www.ilo.org/eval/Evaluationguidance/WCMS_165968/lang--en/index.htm

Template for lessons learnt and Emerging Good Practices

https://www.ilo.org/wcmsp5/groups/public/---ed_mas/---eval/documents/publication/wcms_746820.pdf

https://www.ilo.org/wcmsp5/groups/public/---ed_mas/---eval/documents/publication/wcms_746821.pdf

Guidance note 7: Stakeholders participation in the ILO evaluation

http://www.ilo.org/eval/Evaluationguidance/WCMS_165986/lang--en/index.htm

Guidance note 4: Integrating gender equality in the monitoring and evaluation of projects

http://www.ilo.org/eval/Evaluationguidance/WCMS_165986/lang--en/index.htm

EVAL's Guidance Note 3.2 Adaptive evaluation methods to the ILO's normative and tripartite mandate, which includes [evaluation](#) questions for evaluations to be responsive to the ILO's normative and tripartite mandate.

Template for evaluation title page

Word file will be provided to the Evaluator as an attachment

Template for evaluation summary

https://www.ilo.org/wcmsp5/groups/public/---ed_mas/---eval/documents/publication/wcms_746822.pdf

https://www.ilo.org/wcmsp5/groups/public/---ed_mas/---eval/documents/publication/wcms_746822.pdf

UNEG Ethical Guidelines for Evaluation

<http://www.unevaluation.org/document/download/548>

Annex 2: List of key stakeholders (to be finalized in consultation with the project teams)

Organization	Name
--------------	------

Organization	Name
ILO Regional Office for Arab States, Lebanon	- Deputy Regional Director, Director DWT Arab States, RO-Arab States/DWT-Beirut - Senior Employment and Skills Development Specialist, DWT Team - Employers Specialist, DWT Team - National Project Coordinator - ILO colleagues from other relevant projects
ILO HQ	Skills and Employability Branch (SKILLS) - Patrick Daru, Head of Operations, SKILLS
UNICEF	- Ms. Amal Obeid (Adolescent and Youth programme Specialist) - Mr. Alexander Schein (Regional ADAP specialist) - Mr. Ralph Badaan (National Project Officer) - MS. Abeer Abou Zaki (National Youth Officer) and/or Ms. Josianne Makhoul (National Officer)
AICS	- Mr. Corrado Di Dio (Programme Officer) - Ms. Antonella Ardito (Programme officer) - Ms. Alessandra Piermattei (Director)
Ministry of Labour (MoL)	- Dr. Iman Khazaal (Chief of labour department) - Ms. Joumana Haymour (Chief of labour inspection and OSH) - Ms. Mariam Akoum (Chief of VT department)
National Employment Office	- Mr. Elie Berberi (Director General) - Mr. Georges Fadel (Chief of studies and programme department) - Ms. Hanadi Mekdache (Chief of employment and VT department)
Ministry of Education and Higher Education - DGT VET	- Dr. Hanadi Berri (Director General) - Mr. Tony Rached (Chief of VT department) - Mr. Ghassan Cheaito (Chief of curricula department) - Other relevant officials from DGT VET
Ministry of Social Affairs	Director General Department of craft
Core NGOs / Training providers, with whom project teams engaged	- At least 12 NGOs are involved with the two projects. The Evaluator to interview sampled NGO representatives
Ministry of Agriculture	Department of Extension and education services (3 persons)
Trade Unions	- CGTL: President Bechara el Asmar - FENASOL: President Castro Abdallah
Employers	- Association of Lebanese Industrialists - Mr. Talal Hijazi (Director), - Ms. Hiba Chami (Project coordinator), - Mr. Ahmad Jaber (Board member) - Representative from Chamber of Commerce
UN agencies	FAO, UNESCO, WB, UNDP
ITC ILO	3 persons
Other Agencies	(e.g., GIZ, IECD)
	Few beneficiaries of both the projects

ANNEX 4: Evaluation Matrix

Criteria/Evaluation Questions	Indicators/sub-questions	Data sources	Methods	Key Informants
Relevance and Strategic Fit				
1) How do the two projects contribute to the ILO's P&B objectives, CPOs, and SDGs?	1.1 Extent to which the project supports the outcomes outlined in the P&B, DWCP/CPOs as well as the SDGs.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ ILO P&Bs, DWCP; SDG ▪ ILO and Project Team 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Document review ▪ Interviews/FG ▪ Evaluation debriefing 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Project team ▪ ILO (HQ, RO, CO, ITC)
2) Are the projects relevant to the felt needs of the beneficiaries?	2.1. Extent to which the project responds to the beneficiaries' needs. 2.2. Extent to which the project design is based on a sound context analysis. 2.3. Beneficiaries participation in the project's design phase	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Context/background documentation ▪ Development policies/plans ▪ ILO and Project Team ▪ Project partners and stakeholders 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Document review ▪ Interviews/FG ▪ Evaluation debriefing 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Project team ▪ ILO (HQ, RO, CO, ITC) ▪ Donors (UNICEF-AICS) ▪ National Partners and constituents ▪ NGOs / Training providers
3) Are the project objectives aligned with tripartite constituents' objectives and needs? What measures were taken to ensure alignment?	3.1. Extent to which the project objectives respond to the constituents' needs. 3.2. Extent to which the project design is based on a sound context analysis. 3.3. Constituents participation in the project's design phase	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Project document ▪ Mid-term evaluation ▪ Project partners and stakeholders ▪ Constituents ▪ ILO and Project Team 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Document review ▪ Interviews/FG ▪ Evaluation debriefing 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Project team ▪ ILO (HQ, RO, CO, ITC) ▪ Donors (UNICEF-AICS) ▪ National Partners and constituents
4) Were the project objectives and design relevant given the political, economic, and financial context? How have ILO's works in improving vocational training, skilling and employment opportunities been perceived and positioned within the overall Decent Work in Lebanon. ?	4.1. Extent to which the project design is based on a sound context analysis. 4.2. Extent to which the project responds to the beneficiaries' needs 4.3. Extent to which the project is coherent with the Governments' objectives and National Development Frameworks. 4.4. Extent to which the project complements and fits with the DWCP as well as other on-going ILO programmes and projects in the countries.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Project document ▪ Mid-term evaluation ▪ ILO and Project Team ▪ Project partners and stakeholders 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Document review ▪ Interviews/FG ▪ Evaluation debriefing 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Project team ▪ ILO (HQ, RO, CO, ITC) ▪ Donors (UNICEF-AICS) ▪ National Partners and constituents ▪ NGOs / Training providers ▪ UN agencies ▪ Other agencies

Criteria/Evaluation Questions	Indicators/sub-questions	Data sources	Methods	Key Informants
Coherence and validity of the design				
5) Are the project strategies and structures coherent and logical (what are logical correlations between the overall objective, outcomes, and outputs)?	5.1. Clarity of conceptualisation 5.2. Quality of description and alignment of Activities, Outcomes/Outputs, indicators, Objectives in the Prodoc and the Logframe 5.3. Usefulness of project indicators and means of verification	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Project document ▪ Mid-term evaluation ▪ Project partners and stakeholders 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Document review ▪ Interviews/FG ▪ Evaluation debriefing 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Project team ▪ ILO (HQ, RO, CO, ITC) ▪ Donors (UNICEF-AICS) ▪ National Partners and constituents ▪ NGOs / Training providers
6) To what extent are the two evaluated projects harmonised and complementary? Are there any duplication of effort and activities?	6.2. Clarity of conceptualisation 6.3. Appropriateness of methodology 6.4. Clear and effective organisation and complementarities	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Project document ▪ Mid-term evaluation ▪ Projects' products/deliverables ▪ Project partners and stakeholders 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Document review ▪ Interviews/FG ▪ Evaluation debriefing 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Project team ▪ ILO (HQ, RO, CO, ITC) ▪ Donors (UNICEF-AICS) ▪ National Partners and constituents ▪ NGOs / Training providers ▪ UN agencies ▪ Other agencies
7) Have the projects applied an evidence-based approach in formulating and implementing the activities?	7.1. Extent to which the project design is based on a sound context analysis. 7.2. Quality of description and alignment of Activities, Outcomes/Outputs, indicators, Objectives in the Action Plan and the Logframe 7.3. Quality of project indicators and means of verification	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Project document ▪ Mid-term evaluation ▪ Progress reports ▪ Projects' products/deliverables ▪ Project partners and stakeholders 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Document review ▪ Interviews/FG ▪ Evaluation debriefing 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Project team ▪ ILO (HQ, RO, CO, ITC) ▪ Donors (UNICEF-AICS) ▪ National Partners and constituents

<p>8) Do the projects make use of a M&E framework? How appropriate and useful are the indicators in assessing the projects' progress? If necessary, how should they be modified to be more useful? Are indicators gender sensitive? Are the means of verification for the indicators appropriate? Are the assumptions for each objective and output realistic?</p>	<p>8.1. Extent to which a performant M&E system and a knowledge sharing, and communication strategy are in place. 8.2. Inclusion of Gender equality and non-discrimination concerns 8.3. Quality of project indicators and means of verification. 8.4. Realism of Assumptions and risks</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Project document ▪ M&E Plan ▪ Mid-term evaluation ▪ Progress reports ▪ ILO and Project Team ▪ Project partners and stakeholders 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Document review ▪ Interviews/FG ▪ Evaluation debriefing 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Project team ▪ ILO (HQ, RO, CO, ITC) ▪ Donors (UNICEF-AICS) ▪ National Partners and constituents
<p>9) To what extent did the project designs take into account: Specific gender equality and non-discrimination concerns, including inclusion of people with disabilities, relevant to the project context as well as International Labour Standards and Social Dialogue?</p>	<p>9.1. Extent to which the project design is based on a sound context analysis. 9.2. Extent to which a problem analysis identified differential impacts on men and women and on vulnerable groups (like people with disabilities and others as relevant) 9.3. Inclusion of Gender equality and non-discrimination concerns</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Project document ▪ M&E Plan ▪ Mid-term evaluation ▪ Progress reports ▪ ILO and Project Team ▪ Project partners and stakeholders 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Document review ▪ Interviews/FG ▪ Evaluation debriefing 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Project team ▪ ILO (HQ, RO, CO, ITC) ▪ Donors (UNICEF-AICS) ▪ National Partners and constituents ▪ NGOs / Training providers ▪ UN agencies ▪ Other agencies
<p>10) How well do the project designs take into account local efforts already underway to address the respective issues in Lebanon? How well the projects complement and fit with other ongoing ILO programmes and projects in the country? Does the projects' design fill an existing gap that other ongoing interventions have failed to address?</p>	<p>10.1. Extent to which the project design is based on a sound context analysis. 10.2. Clear and effective organisation and complementarities 10.3. Extent to which the project complements and fits with other ongoing efforts and projects in the country. 10.4. Project adjustments to changes (context, priorities...)</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Project document ▪ M&E Plan ▪ Mid-term evaluation ▪ Progress reports ▪ ILO and Project Team ▪ Project partners and stakeholders 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Document review ▪ Interviews/FG ▪ Evaluation debriefing 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Project team ▪ ILO (HQ, RO, CO, ITC) ▪ Donors (UNICEF-AICS) ▪ National Partners and constituents ▪ NGOs / Training providers ▪ UN agencies ▪ Other agencies

Criteria/Evaluation Questions	Indicators/sub-questions	Data sources	Methods	Key Informants
Project progress and effectiveness				
11) What progress have the projects made so far towards achieving the overall objectives and outcomes? (analysis of achievements and challenges by outcome is required) In cases where challenges have been faced, what intermediate results can be reported towards reaching the outcomes?	11.1. Timely delivery of activities 11.2. Delivery of project outputs 11.3. Main results achieved by the project. 12.3. Main challenges faced by the project.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Project document ▪ Mid-term evaluation ▪ Progress reports ▪ Projects' products/deliverables ▪ ILO and Project Team ▪ Project partners and stakeholders 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Document review ▪ Interviews/FG ▪ Evaluation debriefing 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Project team ▪ ILO (HQ, RO, CO, ITC) ▪ Donors (UNICEF-AICS) ▪ National Partners and constituents ▪ NGOs / Training providers
12) What, if any, unintended results of the projects have been identified or perceived?	12.1. Have the assumptions required to translate project results into the project purpose been realised? If not, why and how did this affect the project? 12.2. If there were unforeseen results, why, the extent, impact and implications for all stakeholders?	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Project document ▪ Mid-term evaluation ▪ Progress reports ▪ Projects' products/deliverables ▪ ILO and Project Team ▪ Project partners and stakeholders 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Document review ▪ Interviews/FG ▪ Evaluation debriefing 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Project team ▪ ILO (HQ, RO, CO, ITC) ▪ Donors (UNICEF-AICS) ▪ National Partners and constituents ▪ NGOs / Training providers
13) To what extent did synergies with and operation through local organizations help to ensure the sustainability of the impact of the projects i.e., through vocational training, skilling, economic opportunities?	13.1. Participatory approach and inclusion of national/local stakeholders in project planning, monitoring and implementation 13.2. Extent to which the intervention strategy is appropriate and is it proving effective in meeting the project's objectives. 13.3. Extent to which project worked strategically with all key stakeholders and partners to achieve project goals and objectives 13.4. Extent of the collaboration with constituents and other national counterparts to sustain project results.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Project document ▪ Mid-term evaluation ▪ Progress reports ▪ Projects' products/deliverables ▪ ILO and Project Team ▪ Project partners and stakeholders 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Document review ▪ Interviews/FG ▪ Evaluation debriefing 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Project team ▪ ILO (HQ, RO, CO, ITC) ▪ Donors (UNICEF-AICS) ▪ National Partners and constituents ▪ NGOs / Training providers ▪ UN agencies ▪ Other agencies
14) To what extent did the projects contribute to the intended results of ILO Programme & Budget, 2018-19, 2019-20, 2020-21 and 2022-23 (particularly in year 2022)?	14.1. Extent to which the project supports the P&B outcomes: 2018-19, 2019-20, 2020-21 and 2022-23 (particularly in year 2022)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ ILO P&Bs ▪ ILO and Project Team 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Document review ▪ Interviews/FG ▪ Evaluation debriefing 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Project team ▪ ILO (HQ, RO, CO, ITC)

<p>15) Examine the systems, networks, processes that are in place towards influencing policies, training procedures, training content, resources, etc.,</p>	<p>15.1. Extent to which the systems, networks, processes that are in place influence policies, training procedures, training content, resources, etc.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Project document ▪ Mid-term evaluation ▪ Progress reports ▪ Projects' products/deliverables ▪ ILO and Project Team ▪ Project partners and stakeholders 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Document review ▪ Interviews/FG ▪ Evaluation debriefing 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Project team ▪ ILO (HQ, RO, CO, ITC) ▪ Donors (UNICEF-AICS) ▪ National Partners and constituents ▪ NGOs / Training providers ▪ UN agencies ▪ Other agencies
<p>16) To what extent did the projects respond emerging needs in terms of COVID-19 pandemic? Did the pandemic hinder or reverse the progresses that had been made? To what extent did the projects respond emerging needs in terms of ongoing financial crisis and political uncertainty in the country? Did the situation hinder or reverse the progresses that had been made?</p>	<p>15.2. Extent to which the ILO intervention provided a timely and relevant response to constituents' needs and priorities in the COVID-19 context</p> <p>15.3. Extent to which the project adapted its approach to respond to the Covid-19 crisis</p> <p>15.4. Extent to which the COVID-19 affected project implementation</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Project document ▪ Mid-term evaluation ▪ Progress reports ▪ Projects' products/deliverables ▪ ILO and Project Team ▪ Project partners and stakeholders 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Document review ▪ Interviews/FG ▪ Evaluation debriefing 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Project team ▪ ILO (HQ, RO, CO, ITC) ▪ Donors (UNICEF-AICS) ▪ National Partners and constituents ▪ NGOs / Training providers ▪ UN agencies ▪ Other agencies

Criteria/Evaluation Questions	Indicators/sub-questions	Data sources	Methods	Key Informants
Efficiency of resource use				
17) To what extent have project activities been cost-effective? Have resources (funds, human resources, time, expertise etc.) been allocated strategically to achieve outcomes? To what extent can the project results justify the time, financial and human resources invested in the projects?	17.1. Timely delivery of activities 17.2. Delivery of project outputs 17.3. Quality and quantity of outputs delivered 17.4. How efficient was the organisation, management, implementation of the project? 17.5. How effectively has the project leveraged relevant resources 17.6. How well has the project coordinated and collaborated with other skills training-focused interventions supported by the ILO/other organizations?	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Project document ▪ Mid-term evaluation ▪ Progress reports ▪ Projects' products/deliverables ▪ ILO and Project Team ▪ Financial reports ▪ Project partners and stakeholders 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Document review ▪ Interviews/FG ▪ Evaluation debriefing 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Project team ▪ ILO (HQ, RO, CO, ITC) ▪ Donors (UNICEF-AICS) ▪ National Partners and constituents ▪ NGOs / Training providers ▪ UN agencies ▪ Other agencies
18) To what extent have the projects been able to build on other ILO or non-ILO initiatives either nationally or regionally, in particular with regard to the creation of synergies in cost sharing?	18.1. How well has the project coordinated and collaborated with other skills training-focused interventions supported by the ILO/other organizations? 18.2. How effectively has the project leveraged relevant resources?	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Mid-term evaluation ▪ Progress reports ▪ Projects' products/deliverables ▪ ILO and Project Team ▪ UN Agencies/Other Agencies (international, bi-lateral, etc.) 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Document review ▪ Interviews/FG ▪ Evaluation debriefing 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Project team ▪ ILO (HQ, RO, CO, ITC) ▪ Donors (UNICEF-AICS) ▪ National Partners and constituents ▪ NGOs / Training providers ▪ UN agencies ▪ Other agencies

<p>19) How could the efficiency of the projects be improved?</p>	<p>19.1. Timely delivery of activities 19.2. Delivery of project outputs 19.3. Quality and quantity of outputs delivered 19.4. How efficient was the organisation, management, implementation of the project? 19.5. How effectively has the project leveraged relevant resources? 19.6. How well has the project coordinated and collaborated with other skills training-focused interventions supported by the ILO/other organizations? 19.7. How effectively has the project leveraged relevant resources?</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Project document ▪ Mid-term evaluation ▪ Progress reports ▪ Projects' products/deliverables ▪ ILO and Project Team ▪ Financial reports ▪ Project partners and stakeholders 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Document review ▪ Interviews/FG ▪ Evaluation debriefing 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Project team ▪ ILO (HQ, RO, CO, ITC) ▪ Donors (UNICEF-AICS) ▪ National Partners and constituents ▪ NGOs / Training providers ▪ UN agencies ▪ Other agencies
<p>20) Are there particular activities which have delivered high value for money?</p>	<p>20.1. Timely delivery of activities 20.2. Delivery of project outputs 20.3. Quality and quantity of outputs delivered</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Mid-term evaluation ▪ Progress reports ▪ Projects' products/deliverables ▪ ILO and Project Team ▪ Financial reports ▪ Project partners and stakeholders 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Document review ▪ Interviews/FG ▪ Evaluation debriefing 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Project team ▪ ILO (HQ, RO, CO, ITC) ▪ Donors (UNICEF-AICS) ▪ National Partners and constituents ▪ NGOs / Training providers ▪ UN agencies ▪ Other agencies

<p>21) What was the role of the projects in resource mobilization? Given the country's context, what can ILO do differently in resource mobilization?</p>	<p>21.1. Timely delivery of activities 21.2. Delivery of project outputs 21.3. Quality and quantity of outputs delivered 21.4. How efficient was the organisation, management, implementation of the project? 21.5. How effectively has the project leveraged relevant resources 21.6. How well has the project coordinated and collaborated with other skills training-focused interventions supported by the ILO/other organizations? 21.7. How effectively has the project leveraged relevant resources?</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Mid-term evaluation ▪ Progress reports ▪ Projects' products/deliverables ▪ ILO and Project Team ▪ Financial reports ▪ Project partners and stakeholders 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Document review ▪ Interviews/FG ▪ Evaluation debriefing 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Project team ▪ ILO (HQ, RO, CO, ITC) ▪ Donors (UNICEF-AICS) ▪ National Partners and constituents ▪ NGOs / Training providers ▪ UN agencies ▪ Other agencies
---	---	--	---	---

Criteria/Evaluation Questions	Indicators/sub-questions	Data sources	Methods	Key Informants
Impact orientation				
<p>22) What is the likely contribution of the project initiatives to the stated objectives of the intervention; at all the stages and interventions of the JP and not only at outcome level?</p>	<p>22.1. Extent to which the projects contributed to strengthened capacity of vocational training providers (NGOs) to prioritise training programme based on market needs.</p> <p>22.2. Extent to which the projects contributed to develop and implement competency based training programmes relevant to labour market demand.</p> <p>22.3. Extent to which the projects contributed to TVET curricula and standards for youth being relevant to identified labour market needs.</p> <p>22.4. Extent to which the projects contributed to strengthen skills coordination and policy dialogue in the country among stakeholders, including government, the private sector, civic society, workers and youth.</p> <p>22.5. Extent to which the projects contributed to improved institutional capacities for the provision of post-training services for Lebanese and refugee graduates from accelerated skills training</p> <p>22.6. Extent to which the projects contributed to improved institutional capacities for the design of market-based skills training for Lebanese and refugees</p> <p>22.7. Extent to which the projects contributed to Lebanese and refugee graduates from skills training obtaining the necessary employability to access the labour market</p> <p>22.8. Extent to which the projects contributed to improve the access to employment of Lebanese and refugees graduates through market responsive skills training</p> <p>22.9. Extent to which project-supported initiatives have been institutionalized or have the potential to be institutionalized and/or replicated, , by partners and/or external organizations</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Mid-term evaluation ▪ Progress reports ▪ Projects' products/deliverables ▪ ILO and Project Team ▪ Project partners and stakeholders 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Document review ▪ Interviews/FG ▪ Evaluation debriefing 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Project team ▪ ILO (HQ, RO, CO, ITC) ▪ Donors (UNICEF-AICS) ▪ National Partners and constituents ▪ NGOs / Training providers ▪ UN agencies ▪ Other agencies

<p>23) How did projects contribute realization of skilling and decent work opportunities in Lebanon? To what extent there is evidence of positive changes in the life of the ultimate project beneficiaries?</p>	<p>23.1. Extent to which the projects improved the formal and non-formal technical and vocational education and training in Lebanon 23.2. Extent to which the projects responded to the youth needs within the current socio-economic context. 23.3. Extent to which the projects contributed to the realization of skilling and decent work opportunities in Lebanon</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Mid-term evaluation ▪ Progress reports ▪ Projects' products/deliverables ▪ ILO and Project Team ▪ Project partners and stakeholders 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Document review ▪ Interviews/FG ▪ Evaluation debriefing 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Project team ▪ ILO (HQ, RO, CO, ITC) ▪ Donors (UNICEF-AICS) ▪ National Partners and constituents ▪ NGOs / Training providers ▪ UN agencies ▪ Other agencies
--	---	---	---	---

Criteria/Evaluation Questions	Indicators/sub-questions	Data sources	Methods	Key Informants
Sustainability				
<p>24) Are the results achieved by the projects likely to be sustainable? What measures have been considered to ensure that the key components of the project are sustainable beyond the life of the projects? How will activities and/or management structures be financed when the project ends?</p>	<p>Development of/or progress towards the development of a sustainability strategy by the ILO project, and the extent of the collaboration with constituents and other national counterparts to sustain project results during the recovery stage (and beyond).</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Project document ▪ Sustainability Plan ▪ Mid-term evaluation ▪ Progress reports ▪ Projects' products/deliverables ▪ ILO and Project Team ▪ Project partners and stakeholders 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Document review ▪ Interviews/FG ▪ Evaluation debriefing 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Project team ▪ ILO (HQ, RO, CO, ITC) ▪ Donors (UNICEF-AICS) ▪ National Partners and constituents ▪ NGOs / Training providers ▪ UN agencies ▪ Other agencies
<p>25) To what extent was sustainability of impact taken into account during the design of the project?</p>	<p>Development of/or progress towards the development of a sustainability strategy by the ILO project, and the extent of the collaboration with constituents and other national counterparts to sustain project results during the recovery stage (and beyond).</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Project document ▪ Sustainability Plan ▪ Mid-term evaluation ▪ Progress reports ▪ Projects' products/deliverables ▪ ILO and Project Team ▪ Project partners and stakeholders 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Document review ▪ Interviews/FG ▪ Evaluation debriefing 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Project team ▪ ILO (HQ, RO, CO, ITC) ▪ Donors (UNICEF-AICS) ▪ National Partners and constituents ▪ NGOs / Training providers ▪ UN agencies ▪ Other agencies

<p>26) To what extent are national partners able and willing to continue with the project? How effectively has the project built national ownership? In what ways are results anchored in national institutions and to what extent can the local partners maintain them financially at end of project?</p>	<p>26.1. Participatory approach and inclusion of national/local stakeholders in project planning, monitoring and implementation 26.2. National/local ownership of the projects' objectives and outcomes/outputs 26.3. Identification by stakeholders of actions to improve sustainability, specifically of what is needed to generate sustainable results in the particular thematic areas that the project addresses. 26.4. Extent to which the national and local stakeholders have sufficient institutional, technical and financial capacities to maintain/scale-up the projects' results Financial commitments at local and country level</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Sustainability Plan ▪ Mid-term evaluation ▪ National/local/sectoral development strategies/plans ▪ Progress reports ▪ Projects' products/deliverables ▪ ILO and Project Team ▪ Project partners and stakeholders 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Document review ▪ Interviews/FG ▪ Evaluation debriefing 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Project team ▪ ILO (HQ, RO, CO, ITC) ▪ Donors (UNICEF-AICS) ▪ National Partners and constituents ▪ NGOs / Training providers ▪ UN agencies ▪ Other agencies
--	--	--	---	---

Criteria/Evaluation Questions	Indicators/sub-questions	Data sources	Methods	Key Informants
Lessons learned				
27) What lessons learned and good practices can be learned from the project that can be applied to similar future projects?	27.1. Key lessons learned from project experience in VET and youth employment 27.2. Further issues that are worth documenting from project experience as a basis for replication and/or scaling-up	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Progress reports ▪ Projects' products/deliverables ▪ ILO and Project Team ▪ Project partners and stakeholders 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Document review ▪ Interviews/FG ▪ Evaluation debriefing 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Project team ▪ ILO (HQ, RO, CO, ITC) ▪ Donors (UNICEF-AICS) ▪ National Partners and constituents ▪ NGOs / Training providers ▪ UN agencies ▪ Other agencies
28) If it were possible, what could have been implemented differently for greater relevance, sustainability, efficiency, effectiveness and impact?	28.1. Key lessons learned from project experience in VET and youth employment	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Project document ▪ Progress reports ▪ Projects' products/deliverables ▪ ILO and Project Team ▪ Project partners and stakeholders 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Document review ▪ Interviews/FG ▪ Evaluation debriefing 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Project team ▪ ILO (HQ, RO, CO, ITC) ▪ Donors (UNICEF-AICS) ▪ National Partners and constituents ▪ NGOs / Training providers ▪ UN agencies ▪ Other agencies

ANNEX 5: Evaluation Questions

Evaluation criteria and questions	
Criteria	Questions
Relevance and strategic fit	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. How do the two projects contribute to the ILO's P&B objectives, CPOs, and SDGs? 2. Are the projects relevant to the felt needs of the beneficiaries? 3. Are the project objectives aligned with tripartite constituents' objectives and needs? What measures were taken to ensure alignment? 4. Were the project objectives and design relevant given the political, economic, and financial context? How have ILO's works in improving vocational training, skilling and employment opportunities been perceived and positioned within the overall Decent Work in Lebanon.
Coherence and validity of the design	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 5. Are the project strategies and structures coherent and logical (what are logical correlations between the overall objective, outcomes, and outputs)? 6. To what extent are the two evaluated projects harmonised and complementary? Are there any duplication of effort and activities? 7. Have the projects applied an evidence-based approach in formulating and implementing the activities? 8. Do the projects make use of a M&E framework? How appropriate and useful are the indicators in assessing the projects' progress? If necessary, how should they be modified to be more useful? Are indicators gender sensitive? Are the means of verification for the indicators appropriate? Are the assumptions for each objective and output realistic? 9. To what extent did the project designs take into account: Specific gender equality and non-discrimination concerns, including inclusion of people with disabilities, relevant to the project context as well as International Labour Standards and Social Dialogue? 10. How well do the project designs take into account local efforts already underway to address the respective issues in Lebanon? How well the projects complement and fit with other ongoing ILO programmes and projects in the country?. Does the projects' design fill an existing gap that other ongoing interventions have failed to address?
Project progress and effectiveness	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 11. What progress have the projects made so far towards achieving the overall objectives and outcomes? (analysis of achievements and challenges by outcome is required) In cases where challenges have been faced, what intermediate results can be reported towards reaching the outcomes? 12. What, if any, unintended results of the projects have been identified or perceived? 13. To what extent did synergies with and operation through local organizations help to ensure the sustainability of the impact of the projects i.e., through vocational training, skilling, economic opportunities? 14. To what extent did the projects contribute to the intended results of ILO

	<p>Programme & Budget, 2018-19, 2019-20, 2020-21 and 2022-23 (particularly in year 2022)?</p> <p>15. Examine the systems, networks, processes that are in place towards influencing policies, training procedures, training content, resources, etc.,</p> <p>16. To what extent did the projects respond emerging needs in terms of COVID-19 pandemic? Did the pandemic hinder or reverse the progresses that had been made? To what extent did the projects respond emerging needs in terms of ongoing financial crisis and political uncertainty in the country? Did the situation hinder or reverse the progresses that had been made?</p>
Efficiency of resource use	<p>17. To what extent have project activities been cost-effective? Have resources (funds, human resources, time, expertise etc.) been allocated strategically to achieve outcomes? To what extent can the project results justify the time, financial and human resources invested in the projects?</p> <p>18. To what extent have the projects been able to build on other ILO or non-ILO initiatives either nationally or regionally, in particular with regard to the creation of synergies in cost sharing?</p> <p>19. How could the efficiency of the projects be improved?</p> <p>20. Are there particular activities which have delivered high value for money?</p> <p>21. What was the role of the projects in resource mobilization? Given the country's context, what can ILO do differently in resource mobilization?</p>
Impact orientation	<p>22. What is the likely contribution of the project initiatives to the stated objectives of the intervention; at all the stages and interventions of the JP and not only at outcome level?</p> <p>23. How did projects contribute realization of skilling and decent work opportunities in Lebanon? To what extent there is evidence of positive changes in the life of the ultimate project beneficiaries?</p>
Sustainability	<p>24. Are the results achieved by the projects likely to be sustainable? What measures have been considered to ensure that the key components of the project are sustainable beyond the life of the projects? How will activities and/or management structures be financed when the project ends?</p> <p>25. To what extent was sustainability of impact taken into account during the design of the project?</p> <p>26. To what extent are national partners able and willing to continue with the project? How effectively has the project built national ownership? In what ways are results anchored in national institutions and to what extent can the local partners maintain them financially at end of project?</p>
Lessons learned	<p>27. What lessons learned and good practices can be learned from the project that can be applied to similar future projects?</p> <p>28. If it were possible, what could have been implemented differently for greater relevance, sustainability, efficiency, effectiveness and impact?</p>

ANNEX 6: List of Documents Reviewed

- ILO-UNICEF Project document, logframes and work-plans
- ILO-AICS Project document, logframes and work-plans
- ILO-UNICEF progress reports from January 2017 to October 2022
- ILO-AICS progress reports from January 2020 to October 2022
- Independent cluster evaluation of improved and market-based provision of vocational training for Lebanese citizens and refugees. June 2018
- How the ILO works. Decent Work Country Programmes (DWCPs). <https://www.ilo.org/global/about-the-ilo/how-the-ilo-works/organigramme/program/dwcp/lang--en/index.htm>
- ILO Decent Work Country Programme (2017–2020) for Lebanon
- ILO Programme and Budget for the biennium 2018-19
- ILO Programme and Budget for the biennium 2020-21
- ILO Programme and Budget for the biennium 2022–23
- How the ILO works. Programme and budget. <https://www.ilo.org/global/about-the-ilo/how-the-ilo-works/programme-and-budget/lang--en/index.htm>
- ILO and UNICEF launch reports on labour market needs to improve skills training and employment prospects in Lebanon. https://www.ilo.org/beirut/media-centre/news/WCMS_848388/lang--en/index.htm
- Lebanon Crisis Response Plan 2022-2023
- National Strategic Framework for Technical and Vocational Education and Training in Lebanon, 2018-2022. Ministry of Education and Higher Education. Beirut, 2018
- State of Skills Lebanon. International Labour Organization. Undated
- Reviewing life and work skills for youth in Lebanon. UNESCO, 2018
- VET governance ETF partner profile: Lebanon. European Training Foundation, 2018
- Lebanon education, training and employment developments, 2021. European Training Foundation, 2021
- Lebanon's youth: Barriers for growth and unfolding opportunities. UNDP. <https://www.undp.org/arab-states/blog/lebanons-youth-barriers-growth-and-unfolding-opportunities>
- ILO's Strategy in Response to the Syrian Refugee Crisis 2018
- United Nations Strategic Framework-Lebanon 2017–2020
- Government of Lebanon's "Vision for Stabilization, Growth and Employment" 2018
- Synthesis of the crisis impact on the Lebanese labour market and potential business, employment and training opportunities. ILO 2018
- Competency-Based Training (CBT): An Introductory Manual for Practitioners. ILO 2020

- Lebanon: Better technical and vocational education and training for higher youth employment. https://www.ilo.org/beirut/media-centre/news/WCMS_633480/lang--en/index.htm
- Rights & Responsibilities at Work. <https://www.houkouki-fi-al-jamal.com/>
- Improved access to employment opportunities for Lebanese and refugee graduates from skills training project tracer study of graduates: AICS-supported skills training programmes. International Labour Organization, 2022.
- Community-based Market Assessment for Skills Development and Economic Empowerment - Summary Report. ILO 2022
- Work-Based Learning in Technical and Vocational Education and Training. An implementation manual for practitioners In Lebanon and Arab Countries. ILO 2022
- ILO Rapid Diagnostic Assessment of Employment Impacts under COVID-19 in Lebanon. ILO 2020
- Lebanon Country Assessment and Priorities (CAP). Towards improved skills and lifelong learning. ILO-UNICEF (undated)
- Enhance the capacity of the moa for evidence-based planning through pilot tracer studies. FAO and ILO. 2021.
- Towards a referral network for training and post-training support services: A mapping of training and post training service providers. ILO 2022
- Improved access to employment opportunities for Lebanese and refugee graduates from skills training project tracer study of graduates: AICS-supported skills training programmes. ILO 2022

ANNEX 7: List of Persons Interviewed

Name	Institution	Position
Peter Rademaker	ILO-ROAS	Deputy Regional Director
Rania Hokayem	ILO-ROAS	Project Manager
Kishore Singh	ILO ROAS	Senior Skills and Employability Specialist
Hideyuki Tsuruoka	ILO ROAS	Regional Monitoring & Evaluation Officer
Joumana Karame	ILO ROAS	Senior Programme Officer
Mustafa Said	ILO ROAS	Senior Specialist, Workers' Activities
Jad Yassin	ILO ROAS	National Officer Employment
Zeina Mezher	ILO-ROAS	Labour migration. Work in freedom programme
Stefano Merante	ILO-ITC	Skills Development / TVET Programme
Hanadi Berri	Ministry of Education and Higher Education- DGT VET	Director General
Diana Hammoud	Ministry of Education and Higher Education- DGT VET	Focal Point
Houssam Hajj	Ministry of Education and Higher Education- DGT VET	Focal Point
Oussama Ghneim	Ministry of Education and Higher Education- DGT VET	Training Department
Joseph Atme	Ministry of Education and Higher Education- DGT VET	Technical School of Tourism
Issam Abi Nader	Ministry of Education and Higher Education- DGT VET	Higher Industrial Technical Institute
Mayada El Haji	Ministry of Education and Higher Education- DGT VET	Bednayeel Technical Institute
Marwan El Dayeh	Ministry of Education and Higher Education- DGT VET	Bekaa Training Institute
George Makdessi	Ministry of Education and Higher Education- DGT VET	Technical Institute Dekwaneh
Antoinette Khanfour	Ministry of Education and Higher Education- DGT VET	Technical Institute Dekwaneh
François Gerdi	Ministry of Education and Higher Education- DGT VET	Technical Institute Dekwaneh
Ziad Saneh	Ministry of Education and Higher Education- DGT VET	Akkar Training Centre
Lara Merhi	Ministry of Education and Higher Education- DGT VET	Technical School of Tourism
Hassan Lameh	Ministry of Education and Higher Education- DGT VET	DGT VET Office
Antoine Nakhle	Ministry of Education and Higher Education- DGT VET	Technical Institute Dekwaneh

Fatima Halbawi	Ministry of Agriculture	Chief of the education and extension services department
Hayfa Jaafar	Ministry of Agriculture	Chief of the education and training department
Sonia el Abiad	Ministry of Agriculture	Head of the North Lebanon Department
Najwa Bdeir	Ministry of Social Affairs	Head of the Handicraft Department
Zeina Naous	Ministry of Social Affairs	Handicraft Department
Iman Khazaal	Ministry of Labour	Chief of the Migration Department
Joumana Haymour	Ministry of Labour	Chief of the labour inspection department
Mariam Akoum	Ministry of Labour	Chief of the vocational training department
Elie Berbari	National Employment Office (MOL)	Director General
Lina Sadek	National Employment Office (MOL)	Head of the Lebanese migration unit
Nour Dib	National Employment Office (MOL)	Head of the employment policies and programmes department
Suzane Massoud	National Employment Office (MOL)	Unit of statistics
Chris Yessayan	National Employment Office (MOL)	Head of the technical specifications unit
Racha Sleiman	National Employment Office (MOL)	Head of central employment department
George Fadel	National Employment Office (MOL)	Head of the programmes and studies department
Castro Abdallah	National Federation of Worker and Employee Trade Unions in Lebanon (FENASOL)	President
Talal Hijazi	Association of Lebanese Industrialists (ALI)	Director General
Rudy Dao	AVSI	Field coordinator
Sarah Khalil	AVSI	Project coordinator
Luigi Cavallito	COSV	Project manager
Abbas Sibai	COSV	Consultant
Antonio Saleh	Rene Mouawad Foundation (RMF)	Project Officer
Hiba Fattouh	Rene Mouawad Foundation (RMF)	Project Officer
Ahmad Ibrahim	Lebrelief	Development manager
Nicole Chedrawi	Akkar network for development (AND)	Project Officer
Manal Hassoun	The LEE Experience	Chief executive officer
Tarek Alam	Safadi Foundation	Project manager

Antonella Ardito	AICS	Director Assistant
Giorgia Varisco	UNICEF	Chief of the youth department
Amal Obeid	UNICEF	Adolescent youth programme specialist
Ralph Badaan	UNICEF	National Officer
Abir Abul Khoudoud	FAO	Project Manager. Productive sector development programme
Valeria Moro	UNRWA	Youth & Skills programs
Ahmad Zareini	UNRWA	Registrar and student counselor / CG Counselor
Mohamad Hajaj	UNRWA	Innovation Lab
Mohammad Mansour	UNRWA	ESC Outreach officer-south
Wissam Abi Issa	UNRWA	Registrar and student counselor / CG Counselor
Adel Abu Salem	UNRWA	STC / SVTI -mechanic
Mohamed Anas Sabee	GIZ	Team leader TVET for all Lebanon
David El Chabab	IECD	Programme Manager